

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 25TH, 2023, 9:40 AM**

3

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WELCOME TO THE METROPOLITAN

6 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE

7 MEETING, THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.

8 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING REMOTELY

9 SHOULD USE THE ZOOM RAISE HAND FEATURE, AND MYSELF OR THE

10 CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

11 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR

12 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. DUE TO PARTICIPATION FROM REMOTE

13 LOCATIONS, A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN ON ALL ACTION ITEMS.

14 WILL THE CLERK CALL ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM IS PRESENT?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN IS ABSENT. CHAVEZ?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. FLEMING?

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIACOPINI?

12

13 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS IS ABSENT.

20 NOACK?

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** HERE AT GREGORY LANE PLEASANT HILL.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING?

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. WOULD GENERAL COUNSEL LIKE
16 TO DO THE PUBLIC MEETING THING FOR ZOOM PURPOSES.

17

18 **KATHLEEN KANE:** JUST NOTING FOR THE PUBLIC THIS IS A LIMITED
19 PUBLIC FORUM AND COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEMS SHOULD RELATE TO
20 AGENDA ITEMS COMMENTS ON GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT SHOULD RELATE
21 TO MATTERS WITHIN THE SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION OF THIS
22 BODY.

23



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM TWO CHAIR'S
2 REPORT. NOTHING. AGENDA ITEM THREE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
3 REPORT. RANDI KINMAN.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. RANDI KINMAN
6 WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. WE DID MEET ON SEPTEMBER
7 22ND IN OUR NEW SCHEDULING SESSION ON FRIDAY MORNING. THE
8 COUNCIL RECEIVED A PRESENTATION. AND YOU HAVE A REPORT IN YOUR
9 PACKET ON THE DRAFT GOALS AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES EXPENDITURE
10 PRIORITIES OF REVENUE OPTIONS FOR POTENTIAL REGIONAL MEASURE.
11 AND THAT ALWAYS BRINGS UP A HUGE AMOUNT OF CONVERSATION STAFF
12 IS GOING TO RETURN IN OCTOBER WITH THE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
13 EFFORTS THAT HAVE GONE OUT FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS.
14 THE COUNCIL ALSO HAD A DETAILED CONVERSATION ABOUT THE NEXGEN
15 BAY AREA FREEWAY STUDIES, AND YOU WILL SEE A LIST OF CONCERNS
16 THAT WE HAD. AT THE VERY BOTTOM OF THAT PARAGRAPH, MEMBERS
17 PROVIDED SUGGESTIONS INCLUDING PROPOSAL IT MAKE 20 MILES FIRST
18 20 MILES TRAVELED FREE IN ORDER NOT CONGEST AND POLLUTE LOCAL
19 NEIGHBORHOODS EVERYBODY KNOWS MOST OF OUR BAY AREA FREEWAYS
20 WERE BUILT THROUGH NEIGHBORHOODS. NEIGHBORHOODS WEREN'T
21 DEVELOPED AROUND FREEWAYS. SO FOR MOST OF YOU THE MOST
22 ECONOMICAL AND LEAST DESTRUCTIVE WAY OF GETTING THROUGH OUR
23 CITIES IN AN ENVIRONMENTALLY SAFE WAY OF GETTING THROUGH OUR
24 CITIES IS TO HOP ON THE FREEWAY, TRAVEL TWO MILES AND HOP OFF.
25 AND I, PERSONALLY, CAN GET HALFWAY ACROSS MY CITY IN FIVE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 MINUTES AS OPPOSED OF TAKING 30 MINUTES OF WINDING THROUGH.
2 WHICH ALLOWS ME TO TRANSPORT PEOPLE TO HOSPITALS VERY EASILY.
3 AFTER THAT, WE HAD OUR EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING.
4 THEY HAD A PRESENTATION ON THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING,
5 PRESENTATIONS THAT WILL BE -- PROTOTYPES WILL BE DEPLOYED IN
6 EL CERRITO AND SANTA ROSA. WE ARE REQUESTING THAT THINGS LIKE
7 THIS THAT ARE GOING TO BE REGIONAL MEASURES BE MOCKED UP IN A
8 MANNER THAT WE CAN SEE THEM IN OTHER AREAS. IT'S A LITTLE
9 DIFFICULT, ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE DISABLED, TO TRAVEL
10 ACROSS COUNTIES TO SEE HOW THESE MOCK-UPS AND FORMATS ARE
11 ACTUALLY GOING TO WORK IN ACTION. SO I'M HOPING STAFF COMES
12 BACK WITH SOME SUGGESTIONS ON THAT. LOOKING FORWARD, OUR
13 FRIDAY MEETING WILL BE ROUND ONE OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
14 PLUS ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS AND THE ADVOCACY PLAN WITH MTC AND
15 ABAG. AND PRIOR TO THE MEETING I'M GOING TO BE SWEARING IN
16 FOUR OF OUR NEW INCOMING MEMBERS THAT YOU AUTHORIZED LAST
17 MONTH. AND I THINK WE'RE ALL GOING TO BE REALLY HAPPY TO SEE
18 THEM COME ON BOARD. THEY'RE A COMBINATION OF EAGER AND
19 EDUCATED AND CONFUSED ABOUT HOW MUCH MATERIAL THERE IS TO
20 ABSORB IN THIS PHASE OF JUST A FEW SHORT WEEKS THEY'RE GOING
21 TO BE ON-BOARDED BY STAFF AT 8:00 IN THE MORNING THEY WILL
22 RECEIVE TRAINING THEN THEY WILL GET SWORN IN, HAVE THEIR FIRST
23 MEETING AND FOR SOME OF THEM THEY WILL STICK AROUND FOR OUR
24 SECOND MEETING OF THE DAY, WHICH WILL BE THE FIRST MEETING OF
25 THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP WHICH



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 WAS OUR FORMER TRANSIT TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN
2 SUBCOMMITTEE. AND THAT'S THE SUBCOMMITTEE THAT REPORTS AS A
3 GROUP THAT IS HALF OF OUR COUNCIL MEMBERS AND HALF OF
4 COMMITTEE MEMBERS FROM OUTSIDE GROUPS AND AGENCIES. AND THAT
5 IS MY REPORT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, RANDI. IS
8 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I
11 SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM AND
12 NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM FOR THIS ITEM.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, RANDI. ALWAYS A GREAT REPORT HERE. THE
17 COMMENTS THAT RAND MENTIONED AS FAR AS THE COMMITTEES,
18 ESPECIALLY TO THE FREEWAY ISSUES, I THINK ARE REALLY
19 IMPORTANT. DO THOSE EVER GET DOCUMENTED IN THE PROPOSALS THAT
20 MOVE THROUGH ALL OF OUR OTHER COMMITTEES?

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** DEFINITELY. MAYBE RANDI WANTS TO ANSWER. I'M
23 SORRY. WE DEFINITELY DOCUMENT THE COMMENTS AND THE INPUT FROM
24 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AS WELL AS THE OUTREACH WE'RE
25 DOING WITH RESPECT TO THAT STUDY AND OTHER STUDIES. THE WE'LL



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 BE BRINGING YOU A REPORT ON ENGAGEMENT FROM PLANNED BAY AREA
2 MORE GENERALLY WITH OUR INPUT FROM ADVISORS AND TO THE
3 PLANNING COMMITTEE NEXT MONTH AND THERE WILL BE SPECIFICALLY
4 WITH RESPECT TO THE NEXGEN FREEWAY IN FUTURE MONTHS.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THERE IS A LOT OF CONVERSATION ON THE NEXGEN
7 FREEWAY. AND THE POINT SHE MENTIONED I HADN'T EVEN THOUGHT OF.
8 I APPRECIATE ALL OF THAT. I THINK WE NEED TO BE CLEAR THAT
9 THIS IS AN ONGOING PROCESS. BECAUSE A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE
10 THINKING, RIGHT AWAY, TOLL ROADS AND EVERYTHING ELSE ARE
11 HAPPENING, LIKE, NOW. SO WE NEED TO BE VERY CAREFUL AS TO THE
12 INPUT.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN:** WHAT YOU WILL SEE IN THE DOCUMENTS THAT
19 EVENTUALLY REACH YOU OR EITHER CHANGES IN THE DOCUMENTS
20 THEMSELVES REFLECT THE INPUT AND THAT'S THE BEAUTY OF HAVING
21 US AROUND IS IT WILL REFLECT THE INPUT THAT WE HAVE REQUESTED
22 OR MADE. AND IF INPUT HASN'T BEEN RESOLVED TO WHAT WE FEEL IS
23 APPROPRIATE OR ADEQUATE, YOU WILL HEAR ABOUT IT. YOU WILL HEAR
24 ABOUT IT THROUGH THE REPORTS THAT COME TO YOU. YOU WILL HEAR
25 ABOUT IT FROM YOUR COMMITTEE MEMBERS. AND THE FACT THAT YOU



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 DON'T HEAR ABOUT IT IS A REALLY GOOD INDICATION THAT WE WORK
2 REALLY WELL WITH STAFF TO RESOLVE SOME OF THESE PROBLEMS. A
3 LOT OF THEM ARE JUST THINGS THAT, WHEN YOU THROW 30 PEOPLE IN
4 A ROOM, AND YOU HAD SIX PEOPLE WORKING ON A PROJECT, THE NEXT
5 30 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO THINK OF THINGS THAT THE SIX PEOPLE
6 THAT WERE WORKING ON IT JUST DIDN'T THINK OF.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NO
9 OTHER COMMENTS? WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, THE EXECUTIVE
10 DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR, VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND
13 MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
14 I'LL GO THROUGH THIS QUICKLY BECAUSE WE HAVE A FEW THINGS ON
15 THE AGENDA REMAINING. A COUPLE OF AWARDS CALTRANS BESTOWED
16 UPON MTC EXCELLENCE IN THE PUBLIC AWARENESS CAMPAIGNS CATEGORY
17 FOR THE ALL ABOARD BAY AREA TRANSIT CAMPAIGN, WHICH WAS REALLY
18 A DIRECT REFLECTION FROM WORK THAT THE BLUE RIBBON PANEL GAVE.
19 WE ALSO RECEIVED AN AWARD AT THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
20 AUTHORITY ALONG WITH THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION.
21 THE AWARD WAS GIVEN OUT IN THE PARK ON THE TRANSBAY PARK AREA,
22 IN BEAUTIFUL SAN FRANCISCO. WE HAD DAVID CHIU PRESENT. SENATOR
23 SCOTT WIENER WAS ALSO THERE. WE WERE ALSO WELCOMED BY THERESE
24 MCMILLAN, AND STEVE HEMINGER, SO IT WAS A NICE EVENT. THE
25 AWARD WAS RECEIVED AND TAKEN BY OUR ABAG PRESIDENT JESSE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ARREQUIN AND DIRECTOR KATE HARTLEY, IT WAS A HOUSING HEROES
2 AWARD AND IT REALLY DOES REPRESENT A LOT OF GOOD WORK THAT
3 WE'RE DOING IN THAT SPACE AND PARTNERSHIP. MOVING LEGISLATURE
4 RELATIVE TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING THEY MOVED A.B. 1319 SUCCESSFUL
5 YOU THROUGH THE CLEAN UP MODIFICATIONS FOR BAHFA'S ENABLING
6 LEGISLATION IT PROVIDES CLARITY IN IMPLEMENTATION WITH THE
7 THREE P MANDATE. LEGISLATURE PASSED THE CONSTITUTIONAL
8 AMENDMENT TO MOVE FORWARD ACA-1 WHICH IF APPROVED BY THE
9 VOTERS LOWERS VOTER APPROVAL THRESHOLD FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING
10 BONDS LIKE BAHFA IS PROPOSING. GOOD NEWS ACROSS STATE OF
11 CALIFORNIA FOR THOSE MOVES. FINALLY, I WAS INVITED TO A FERRY
12 TOUR OCTOBER 11TH THAT WAS SPONSORED BY BAY AREA COUNCIL WETA
13 IT WAS DESIGNED TO REALLY SHOW THE VISION FOR RAPID ELECTRIC
14 EMISSION FREE FERRY PROGRAM IT WAS INTENDED TO GO UP-AND-DOWN
15 THE WATERFRONT FROM OYSTER POINT TO THE PRESIDIO IT WAS A NICE
16 TO SEE ALL THE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT HAPPENING IN THAT PART OF
17 SAN FRANCISCO FROM CANDLESTICK POINT ALL THE WAY THROUGH
18 MISSION BAY SO THAT WAS A GOOD EVENT AS WELL. HAPPY TO TAKE
19 QUESTIONS

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ANY QUESTIONS OR PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
25 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** TERRIFIC. AND MAYBE THE BAY AREA
3 COUNCIL WOULD LIKE TO INVITE SOME OF US ON THOSE FANCY FERRY
4 TOURS. CONSENT CALENDAR INCLUDES 6A THROUGH 6G DO I HAVE A
5 MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT:** RABBITT.

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOTION AND SECOND. COMMENTS?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO THEN WE WILL -- ANY COMMISSIONER
18 COMMENT OR CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR
21 JOSEFOWITZ?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT.

13 COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS IS ABSENT. NOACK?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? SPERING?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
17 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, THERE'S A
20 LITTLE BIT OF, SORT OF, MOVING AROUND, SORT OF, MOVING PIECES
21 FOR THE AGENDA, AND WE HAVE A NUMBER OF FOLKS FROM OUR TRANSIT
22 AGENCIES HERE. AND UNFORTUNATELY, THEY HAVE A MEETING THAT
23 THEY HAVE TO GET TO AT 1115. SO WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ITEM 7A,
24 THEN NINE, THEN MOVE BACK TO 7B.

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** C.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SIX B? I THINK 7B. 7B. THAT'S THE
4 CONSENT CALENDAR, I THINK.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. SO, PROGRAMMING AND
9 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, OVER TO
10 YOU.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON
13 OCTOBER 11TH AND REFERRED SIX ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR
14 APPROVAL AND FOUR YOU ALREADY VOTED ON. 7A MTC RESOLUTIONS
15 4537 REVISED AND 4130 REVISED MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY
16 IN TRANSIT INNER CITY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM FRAMEWORK THE
17 COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED APPROVAL OF THIS ITEM WITH SPECIFIC
18 DIRECTION TO STAFF DETAILED IN THE COMMISSION'S UPDATED MEMO
19 ATTACHED TO THIS ITEM. THERESA IS GOING ON ENLIGHTEN US. ROCK.

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YOU HAVE AN UPDATE IN YOUR MATERIAL. AT THE
22 OCTOBER 11TH PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING
23 THERE WAS A MOTION TO APPROVE STAFF'S PROPOSAL TO THE
24 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WITH SPECIFICS, THE COMMITTEE MOVES
25 THAT IN ADDITION TO APPROVING THE TIRCP COMMITMENTS TO THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 BART CORE CAPACITY BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO PROJECT
2 REMAINING FUNDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$45 MILLION SHOULD BE SET
3 ASIDE IN THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS RESERVE SUBJECT TO DISCUSSIONS
4 TODAY. STAFF ARE DIRECTED TO FOLLOW UP TO BETTER UNDERSTAND
5 THE FUNDING REQUESTS AND PLAN FOR THE VALLEY LINK PROJECT
6 FURTHER IN ADDITION TO ADOPTING STAGE GATE POLICIES AND
7 PROCEDURES THE COMMITTEE ASKED THAT WE USE UPCOMING
8 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETINGS FOR MORE IN-
9 DEPTH DISCUSSIONS ABOUT OUR REGION'S MEGA PROJECTS AND COST
10 TRENDS FOR CAPITAL PROJECTS NATION-WIDE, AND HEAR OPERATIONS
11 WHO STAND TO RECEIVE SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING
12 PRIOR TO ADOPTION HAVING FOR FINAL STAGES OF FUNDS IN RESPONSE
13 TO THIS MOTION STAFF PROPOSES THE FOLLOWING VALLEY LINKS
14 REQUEST TO COMMIT \$15 MILLION OF THE REMAINING \$45 MILLION OF
15 TRANSPIRE TIRCP FUNDS TO THEIR PROJECT STAFF PROPOSES WORKING
16 WITH COMMISSIONERS DUTRA-VERNACI AS WELL AS STAFF FROM VALLEY
17 LINK RAIL ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY TO BETTER
18 UNDERSTAND THE PROJECTS COST AND CONTINUE TO IDENTIFY FUNDING
19 STUDENTS FOR THAT PROJECT ALSO CONTINUE TO AGENDAIZE
20 PRESENTATIONS FROM THE REGION'S MEGA PROJECT SPONSORS AND
21 SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS FUTURE PROGRAMMING ALLOCATION COMMITTEE
22 MEETINGS AND LASTLY WE'LL CONTINUE TO AGENDAIZE OPERATOR
23 PRESENTATIONS RELATED TO EMERGENCY CREATING FUNDING PROVIDING
24 COMMISSIONERS OPPORTUNITY TO LEARN ABOUT OPERATOR PLANS AND



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 DISCUSS CONCERNS. WE WILL HAVE SFMTA DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER
2 MIKE FROM BART AS WELL AS TUMLIN.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WOULD LIKE US TO GET STARTED AND MAKE A MOTION
5 TO APPROVE MTC RESOLUTION 4537 REVISED AND 4130 REVISED.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MOTION AND SECOND. DO I HAVE
12 COMMENTS? PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** THERESE I'M CONFUSED HERE AS TO THE 45 MILLION
15 REMAINING, HAS STAFF RECOMMENDED HOW WE'RE TO PROCEED ON THAT
16 OR IS THAT STILL GOING TO BE UP FOR CONVERSATION.

17

18 **THERESA ROMMELL:** STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS SET THOSE FUNDING
19 ADDS FOR OPERATING RESERVE I THINK THE DISCUSSION LATER TODAY
20 CAN DETERMINE WHETHER IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO INFORM USE THOSE
21 FOR OPERATIONS OR TAKE THEM OUT OF RESERVE.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** WE'LL SAVE THAT FOR 9A.

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** 9A IS AN INFORMATION ITEM WE'LL BE
2 TAKING UP THE ALLOCATION OF THE TRANSIT IN A FUTURE MEETING.
3 OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN-
6 HOUSE AND ONE REMOTELY. I'LL CALL ON CHARLES LAVERY FIRST. MR.
7 LAVERY, YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES. BEAR WITH ME, I'LL START
8 THIS CLOCK FOR YOU.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND COMMISSIONERS.
11 CHARLIE L, WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ALSO WITH THE
12 OPERATING ENGINEERS UNION. I'M ASKING THE MTC TO DELIVER ON
13 ITS COMMITMENT TO REVISIT THE PORTAL FOR MOVEMENT TO A HIGHER
14 PRIORITY LEVEL. IT'S A TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECT FOR THE REGION
15 THAT'S BEEN OVER THIRD YEARS IN THE MAKING. PHASE ONE OF THE
16 TRANSIT CENTER, THE TRANSIT CENTER GENERATED THOUSANDS OF JOBS
17 FOR THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS. THE PORTAL WILL DO LIKEWISE. THE
18 PROJECT AND ITS CONNECTION WILL NOT ONLY REVITALIZE DOWNTOWN
19 SAN FRANCISCO, BUT ALL THOSE EMBARKATION CITIES UP-AND-DOWN
20 THE PENINSULA AND UP-AND-DOWN THE STATE. THE PROJECT IS AN
21 IMPORTANT JUNCTURE WITH THE FTA AND SIG PROCESS IN THE FPG
22 ENGINEERING PHASE, THE CAMPAIGN IN CONTINUED SUPPORT AS A
23 PRIORITY AND BIL FRAMEWORK IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT WE'RE
24 URGING MTC STAFF TO ENDORSE THE PORTAL FOR MEGA CONSIDERATION



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 FRAMEWORK IN NOVEMBER TO LEVERAGE THE FEDERAL DOLLARS COMING
2 INTO THE REGION AND STATE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ESMERELDA RODRIGUEZ.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING TO THE MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. MY
9 NAME IS ESMERELDA, AND I AM SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF MY BOSS
10 COUNCIL MEMBER TORRES IN SAN JOSE, HE WOULD LIKE THE
11 COMMISSION TO KNOW HE'S IN SUPPORT OF MTC AR'S STAFF
12 RECOMMENDATION TO COMMIT \$770 MILLION OF TRANSIT INNER CITY
13 CAPITAL PROGRAM FUNDS CAPACITY PROGRAM TRANSIT OPERATIONS
14 FUNDING RESERVE TO THE BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO
15 PROGRAM COMMUNITY MEMBERS PARTNERS AND LABOR REPRESENTATIVES
16 AND SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATES HAVE BEEN IN SUPPORT OF THE VTA
17 BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO PROJECT, TODAY'S ACTION WILL
18 HELP VTA SECURE NECESSARY FUNDING TO MOVE THIS PROJECT
19 FORWARD. MTC THROUGH VARIOUS PROGRAMS AND POLICIES ENDORSES
20 ENDEAVORS AIMED AT REORIENTING CITY AND COUNTY PLANNING AROUND
21 CORE PRINCIPLES OF SUSTAINABILITY ACCESSIBLE HOUSING AND
22 TRANSIT FOR ALL. VTA BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO ALIGNS
23 WITH OBJECTIVES AND PLAYS A PIVOT ROLE FOR SUBSTANTIAL GROWTH
24 AND CONNECTIVITY. IN ORDER TO PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY FOR
25 RESIDENTS TO ACCESS ESSENTIAL DESTINATIONS SUCH AS SCHOOL,



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 WORK, MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS WITHOUT RELYING ON AUTOMOBILES AND
2 TO ADVANCE THE TRANSPORTATION OBJECTIVES OF SILICON VALLEY AND
3 THE BROADER REGION WE URGE TO YOU VOTE YES ON STAFF
4 RECOMMENDATION FOR THIS ITEM. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO
5 PROVIDE COMMENTS ON THIS CRITICAL FUNDING.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE IS ONE ADDITIONAL HAND
10 RAISED FROM LATINA COALITION OF SILICON VALLEY. UNMUTE
11 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** BUENOS DAIS TO MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS
14 TATIANA I AM A COMMUNITY ORGANIZER THROUGH THE LATINA
15 COALITION OF SILICON VALLEY PROVIDING COMMENT TO SUPPORT MTC
16 STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO COMMIT \$750 MILLION OF TIRCP FUNDS
17 TO THE BART CORE CAPACITY PROGRAM TRANSIT OPERATION FUNDING
18 SERVICE I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT THE INTERSECTION OF
19 SUPPORTING TRANSPORTATION INITIATIVES AS AN ENVIRONMENTAL
20 ISSUE. DURING SHELTER-IN-PLACE WE EXPERIENCED REMOVAL OF A
21 MASS NUMBER OF VEHICLES FROM THE ROAD IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF
22 AIR WE'RE HAVING HERE IN SAN JOSE. I BELIEVE THE SOUTH BAY
23 RESIDENTS HAVE EXPRESSED SUPPORT TO BRINGING BART TO SILICON
24 VALLEY IN MULTIPLE WAYS BY VOTING TO TAX THEMSELVES THROUGH
25 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND MANY PUBLIC MEETINGS OVER THE YEARS.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
2 COMMENT ON THIS CRITICAL FUNDING.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED, MR.
7 CHAIR.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENT FROM THE
10 COMMISSIONERS? NO? OKAY. WELL, LET'S DO A ROLL CALL VOTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR
13 JOSEFOWITZ?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI IN.

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

17

18 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS IS ABSENT. NOACK?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

12

13 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

20 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YOU KNOW, I WANT TO ASK STAFF, AS WE

25 ALLOCATE THESE DOLLARS, WHAT TYPE OF COOPERATION ARE WE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 GETTING FROM THESE OPERATORS ON THESE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
2 PROCESS? ARE THEY COOPERATIVE? OR ARE THEY HELPING US MOVE
3 THAT ISSUE FORWARD? ARE THEY PUTTING OBSTACLES IN OUR WAY?
4 WHAT'S THE STATUS OF THAT? AT SOME POINT, YOU KNOW I REALLY
5 THINK THAT WE NEED TO HAVE A HIGH-LEVEL OF COOPERATION
6 MOVEMENT OF THAT ISSUE FORWARD. WHERE ARE WE WITH THAT?

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** ANDREW FREMIER, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. WE
9 ARE STRUGGLING TO GET IT SET UP. WE ARE MEETING REGULARLY TO
10 MAKE SURE WE ESTABLISH A GOOD EFFECTIVE WORK PLAN THAT WORKS
11 FOR BOTH PARTIES AND I EXPECT THAT WE'LL GET GOOD COOPERATION.
12 I THINK WE'RE GETTING GOOD INPUT FOR VARIOUS OTHER MEETINGS
13 WE'RE HAVING IN THAT SPACE, AND I AM CONFIDENT WE'LL BE COMING
14 FORWARD IN NOVEMBER WITH PROGRESS IF NOT WE WILL LET YOU KNOW.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WE NEED TO START SCRUTINIZING SOME OF THESE
17 ACTIONS THAT WE'RE TAKE FIGURE WE'RE NOT GETTING THAT
18 COOPERATION. I WANT TO BE ON RECORD, THAT, CERTAINLY, IS MY
19 POSITION.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. SO, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO
22 AGENDA ITEM 9A.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** 7B. WE'RE GOING TO DO 7B?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WAS GOING TO MOVE TO 9A IF THAT'S
2 OKAY.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. SORRY I MISSED THAT, CHAIR.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MY MISTAKE. BECAUSE WE HAVE A WHOLE
7 BUNCH OF -- A GAGGLE, A MURDER -- I DON'T KNOW THE COLLECTIVE
8 NOUN OF TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS IN THE ROOM AND WE WANT TO
9 MAKE SURE WE HEAR FROM THEM. AGENDA 9A REGIONAL SHORT-TERM
10 TRANSIT PLAN OUTLINE AND DISTRIBUTION EMERGENCY OPERATING
11 FUNDING. ALIX AND THERESA GIVE AN INFORMATIONAL REPORT THEN
12 WE'LL HEAR FROM THE GENERAL MANAGER OF BART -- NOT -- BUT
13 [INDISCERNIBLE]

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, I'M THERESA
16 ROMMELL, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR BEFORE TURNING IT OVER TO
17 THERESA ROMMEL TO WALK THROUGH THE PRESENTATION I WANT TO
18 PROVIDE STAGE SETTING REMARKS. YOU HAVE A VERY IMPORTANT TASK
19 WITH PROVIDING THREE YEAR SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL TRANSIT PLAN BY
20 THE END OF THIS CAL CAR YEAR THIS, IS AN INFORMATION ITEM TIED
21 CLOSELY TO THE ACTION THAT YOU JUST TOOK ON THE MAJOR PROJECT
22 ADVANCEMENT POLICY AS WELL AS THE STATE TIRCP TRANSIT INNER
23 CITY RAIL PROGRAM FUNDS REALLY BOTH ITEMS ARE POSSIBLE DUE TO
24 A LOT OF ADVOCACY THAT MANY OF YOU DID AS WELL AS PARTNERS AS
25 WELL AS CHAMPIONING BAY AREA DELEGATION REALLY SECURED THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 STATE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL IN THIS
2 YEAR'S BUDGET NEGOTIATION. TOTAL TRANSIT FUNDING THROUGH THE
3 STATE BUDGET WAS 1.1 BILLION FOR THE BAY AREA. IN THE ITEM YOU
4 JUST APPROVED, 725 MILLION IS COMMITTED TO TWO REGIONAL
5 TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS THAT WILL LEVERAGE OVER 6 BILLION IN
6 FOLLOWER FUNDS. AND AS PART OF THE ITEM THAT YOU JUST TOOK
7 ACTION ON, AND YOU TALKED ABOUT, 45 MILLION WAS PUT IN A
8 RESERVE FOR TRANSIT OPERATING TO BE DISCUSSED ALONG WITH
9 ANOTHER 400 MILLION IN STATE FUNDING, AND, ALSO, WITH A
10 COMMITMENT FROM STAFF TO PROVIDE A MORE FULL PICTURE OF THE
11 TRANSIT OPERATING NEED. AS YOU WILL SEE IN A MINUTE, BECAUSE
12 THE NEED IS SO SIGNIFICANT, THIS ITEM ALSO RECOMMENDS THAT THE
13 COMMISSION CONSIDER AUGMENTING THE STATE FUNDING WITH REGIONAL
14 FUNDS TO ADDRESS THE SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT NEED. THERESA ROMMEL
15 AND HER TEAM HAVE WORKED DILIGENTLY WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS
16 TO UNDERSTAND THE ACTIONS THAT THEY HAVE TAKEN TOWARD
17 FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY TO MAKE SURE THEY UNDERSTAND THE
18 BUDGET ELEMENTS AND THE FORECASTS FOR THOSE, AND TO REALLY
19 STANDARDIZE THE NEED ACROSS OPERATORS. ALL OF WHICH ARE
20 PREREQUISITE STEPS TO THE COMMISSION BEING ABLE TO APPROVE A
21 DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS BY THE END OF THE YEAR. AND, AS YOU
22 KNOW, WE'RE FORTUNATE TO BE JOINED BY EXECUTIVES FROM SEVERAL
23 OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TODAY, AND WITH THAT I'M GOING TO
24 TURN IT OVER TO THERESA, IF WE CAN PULL UP THE SLIDE DECK?
25 THANKS.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANKS ALIX, AND YES THERE IS A SLIDE DECK.

3 WE CAN GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS SIMPLY A

4 TIMELINE OF ACTIONS THAT NEED TO BE TAKEN BY THE END OF THE

5 YEAR. TODAY'S PRESENTATION, AS NOTED, IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY.

6 WE HOPE TO MAKE SOME REFINEMENTS TO THE STAFF PROPOSAL AND

7 COME BACK IN NOVEMBER WITH A FINAL DISTRIBUTION AND ASK YOU TO

8 APPROVE THAT. THEN WE WOULD COME BACK IN DECEMBER WITH A

9 SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN THAT HAS TO BE SUBMITTED TO THE

10 STATE, CALSTA BY THE END OF THE YEAR. THAT'S THE PROPOSED

11 TIMELINE FOR THIS ITEM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. JUST AS A

12 REMINDER, IN TERMS OF THE STATE BUDGET, MTC RECEIVED ABOUT 770

13 MILLION IN TIRCP FUNDS FROM THE STATE GENERAL FUND, AND ABOUT

14 400 MILLION IN NEW PROGRAM FUNDS FROM A ZERO-EMISSIONS CAPITAL

15 PROGRAM. SO, ALTOGETHER ABOUT 1.1 BILLION. BOTH FUND SOURCE,

16 BOTH TIRCP AND ZERO EMISSION FUNDING IS FLEXIBLE FOR USE ON

17 EITHER CAPITAL OR OPERATIONS. BUT THEY DO COME WITH SOME

18 REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE SPELLED OUT IN SB125, WHICH I'LL GET TO

19 IN JUST A MOMENT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. EARLIER THIS MONTH, AND

20 JUST ACCOUNTED ON TODAY, WE PRESENTED THE STAFF PROPOSAL FOR

21 THE FUNDING COMING FROM THE STATE FOR THE TIRCP WE ASKED TO

22 YOU RECOMMIT THE BULK OF FUNDING TO TWO PROJECTS B.A.R.T. TO

23 SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO AND BART CORE CAPACITY WHICH TOGETHER

24 LEVERAGED BETWEEN 6 AND \$8 BILLION IN FEDERAL FUNDING FOR THE

25 REGION AND ALSO HOLD IN BALANCE THE BALANCE OF 45 MILLION IN



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 RESERVE FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS SUBJECT TO DISCUSSION
2 SURROUNDING THIS CURRENT ITEM. NEXT SLIDE. AS I NOTED, THE
3 STATE FUNDING DID COME TO US THROUGH REQUIREMENTS OF THE
4 BUDGET TRAILER BILL, SB125 FIRST IS THE SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL
5 PLAN WHICH YOU WILL BE ASKED TO APPROVE IN DECEMBER. AND THAT
6 PLAN ASKS US FOR WHAT OUR REGIONAL STRATEGY WOULD BE FOR USING
7 SB125 FUNDING FOR CAPITAL VERSUS OPERATING, WE'LL HAVE TO
8 JUSTIFY THE USES OF THE FUNDING. IDENTIFICATION OF REGIONAL
9 FUNDING CONTRIBUTION TO ADDRESS THE FUNDING GAP, WHICH WE'LL
10 TALK ABOUT A LITTLE BIT MORE, AND THEY WANT US TO SHOW US WHAT
11 THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDING WILL BE AND ALSO DESCRIBE THE
12 BENEFITS OF THOSE FUNDS. IN ADDITION TO THAT SHORT-TERM
13 FINANCIAL PLAN WE WILL BE FACILITATING THE PROVISION OF
14 REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATOR DATA TO THE STATE THEY HAVE
15 REQUESTED INFORMATION AS WELL AND THEN BY JUNE OF 2026, WE
16 WILL NEED TO SUBMIT A LONG-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN WHICH WOULD
17 SEEK TO DEMONSTRATE HOW WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE RIDERSHIP
18 RECOVERY AND ALSO PROVIDE FIVE-YEAR FORECAST OF OPERATING
19 FUNDING REQUIREMENTS. NEXT. WE HAVE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF
20 FUNDING TO DISTRIBUTE WE DEVELOP SOME PRINCIPLES TO HELP US
21 GUIDE THROUGH THE PROCESS WHILE THESE ARE NOT NECESSARILY IN
22 PRIORITY ORDER FIRST THREE ARE REALLY MOST IMPORTANT ONES IN
23 OUR VIEW NUMBER ONE WE WANT TO USE STATE AND REGIONAL FUNDING
24 FOR TRANSIT, TRANSIT OPERATIONS FOR THE MOST DIRE SHORTFALLS
25 IT'S REALLY SPACE DISTRIBUTION WE WANT TO PRIORITIZE HIGH



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 RIDERSHIP AGENCIES AND THOSE THAT HAVE LARGE PERCENTAGE OF
2 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS AND THIRD INCENTIVE ACCOUNTABILITY OF
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO IMPROVE COORDINATION AND CUSTOMER
4 EXPERIENCE. NEXT PRINCIPLE PRESERVING FLEXIBILITY WE KNOW
5 THINGS CAN CHANGE QUICKLY WE WANT TO BE ABLE ALLOWED TO ADJUST
6 DISTRIBUTION AS CIRCUMSTANCES CHANGE, ENSURE CONSISTENCY AND
7 LEVEL OF FOOTING ACROSS OPERATOR SHORTFALL FORECAST AND LASTLY
8 MINIMIZE IMPACT TO NON-OPERATOR PROGRAMS LIKE STATE OF GOOD
9 REPAIR. NEXT SLIDE. EARLIER IN THE YEAR AHEAD OF STATE BUDGET
10 DISCUSSIONS TRANSIT OPERATORS PUT TOGETHER ESTIMATES OF THEIR
11 TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS WHICH TOTALLED \$2.7 BILLION OVER
12 THE FIVE-YEAR PERIOD. FIRST THREE YEARS IS HIGHLIGHTED IN THE
13 BLACK BOX THERE, WILL BE THE FOCUS OF INFORMATION THAT WE HAVE
14 TO PROVIDE TO THE STATE. AND THOSE YEARS TOTAL ABOUT \$1.1
15 BILLION IN SHORTFALL. NEXT SLIDE. SO, BEFORE WE GET INTO THE
16 WORK DONE ON THE SHORTFALLS, WE WANTED TO PROVIDE CONTEXT ON
17 WHAT OPERATORS HAVE BEEN DOING TO HELP SUSTAIN THEMSELVES
18 FINANCIALLY AND EXTEND THE LIFE OF THE FEDERAL COVID RECEIVE
19 FUNDS. ON THE LEFT WE HAVE THE THREE LARGEST OPERATORS IN THE
20 REGION, AND SOME OF THE PRIMARY THINGS THEY HAVE BEEN DOING TO
21 CONTAIN COST. AND ON THE RIGHT, WE ATTEMPTED TO CHART -- IF
22 OPERATOR HIS DONE NOTHING TO CONTROL COSTS AND ADOPTED
23 BUSINESS AS USUAL APPROACH THE SHORTFALLS WOULD HAVE BEEN
24 HIGHER THAN THEY ARE TODAY GREATER THAN FIVE BILLED IS WHAT WE
25 ESTIMATE THEM TO BE RATHER THAN 2.7 BILLION THAT OPERATORS HAD



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 FORECAST AND THE APPROXIMATELY 2 BILLION THAT WE ARE
2 FORECASTING USING OUR STANDARDIZED APPROACH. NEXT SLIDE.
3 SIMILARLY, WE WANTED TO REMIND YOU THAT THE OPERATORS HAVE
4 ALSO BEEN INVOLVED IN EFFORTS TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE
5 AND GROW RIDERSHIP. THIS SLIDE PROVIDES INFORMATION ON SOME OF
6 THOSE EFFORTS INCLUDING SAFETY AND SECURITY, SERVICE
7 REDESIGNS, SYSTEMS IMPROVEMENTS, EQUITY FOCUS. AND I WOULD
8 HIGHLIGHT THE FACT THAT OPERATORS NOW -- ALL OPERATORS ARE
9 PROVIDING A 50% FARE DISCOUNT FOR LOW-INCOME RIDERS THROUGH
10 THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. FUNDING FOR ESSENTIAL SERVICES,
11 HELPING US TO KIND OF CULTIVATE WHAT THOSE NEW FUNDING SOURCES
12 MIGHT BE, AND THEN IN GENERAL, REGIONAL COORDINATION, AS WE
13 KNOW THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT HAS BEEN SET UP, AS WELL.
14 NEXT SLIDE. SO, MOVING INTO THE SHORTFALLS OVER THE LAST
15 SEVERAL MONTHS WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH OPERATORS TO TRY TO
16 UNDERSTAND THEIR SHORTFALL FORECAST AND FACTORS OR ASSUMPTIONS
17 THAT THOSE FORECASTS WERE BUILT ON. IN ADDITION TO BETTER
18 UNDERSTANDING WHAT OPERATORS HAD ASSUMED, WE WORKED WITH THEM
19 TO BUILD A CON ACCEPTS US ON SEVERAL FACTORS TO BE USED TO
20 STANDARDIZE THE FORECAST AND ENSURE THAT OPERATORS WERE ON
21 SIMILAR FOOTING. AND, ALSO, TRY TO BRING THE SHORTFALLS DOWN
22 TO MANAGEABLE LEVEL. FOR EXAMPLE, ALL OPERATORS WERE HELD TO A
23 2022 BASELINE SERVICE TO ADHERE TO THE SB125 REQUIREMENTS,
24 WHEREAS THE PREVIOUS FORECAST ASSUMED INCREASE SERVICE LEVELS,
25 AND IN FACT, THE 2022 SERVICE LEVELS REPRESENT 1 MILLION FEWER



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 SERVICE HOURS PER YEAR THAN THE REGION HAS TODAY. BUT IF WE
2 WANT TO BE ABLE TO AFFORD THAT LEVEL OF ADDITIONAL SERVICE,
3 WE'LL HAVE TO MARSHALL NEW FUNDS TO COVER INCREASE COST OF
4 THAT. ANOTHER EXAMPLE IS WORK WITH OPERATORS TO LIMIT
5 DEFERRABLE OPERATING CAPITAL TRANSFERS IF THERE WAS A WAY TO
6 TRANSFER TO BE PUSHED OUT A FEW YEARS WE ASKED THEM TO DO
7 THAT. ALTHOUGH NOT REALLY STANDARDIZATION IF AN OPERATOR
8 TYPICALLY APPLIES LOCAL FUNDING SOURCE TO ITS OPERATING BUDGET
9 WE INSISTED THEY MAINTAIN THAT CONTRIBUTION OVER THE FORECAST
10 PERIOD AND DID NOT BACK IT OUT. AND I'LL NOTE HERE WHILE WE
11 DIDN'T -- WHILE WE GET THIS QUESTION A LOT ABOUT RIDERSHIP
12 WHILE WE DIDN'T STANDARDIZE RIDERSHIP GIVEN THERE ARE VALID
13 REASONS WHY RIDERSHIP RETURNED, ASSUMPTIONS WOULD DIFFER FROM
14 OPERATOR TO OPERATOR. WE WILL BE TRACKING THIS TO SEE IF
15 OPERATORS ARE BEATING THOSE EXPECTS OR FALLING SHORT OF THEM.
16 NEXT SLIDE. RESULTS OF THE STANDARDIZATION WORK IS THAT THE
17 SHORTFALL OF FISCAL YEAR 2026 WAS REDUCED FROM 1.1 BILLION IN
18 THE OPERATOR SHORTFALL FORECAST TO JUST UNDER 800 MILLION FOR
19 THOSE THREE YEARS. THERE IS REALLY NO SHORTFALL IN THE CURRENT
20 FISCAL YEAR BUT FISCAL YEAR 2025 SHORTFALL RAMPS UP. BECAUSE
21 THINGS CAN CHANGE WE INTEND FOR THIS FRAMEWORK TO BE ADAPTABLE
22 TO CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES AND WE PLAN TO REASSESS THE NEEDS
23 AGAIN PRIOR TO FISCAL YEAR 2025. OUR PLAN IS THAT WE WOULD
24 LIKELY CONFIRM PROPOSED AMOUNTS FOR FISCAL YEAR '25 IN FISCAL
25 YEAR '24, THE CURRENT YEAR, AND THEN REVISIT THE CURRENT YEAR



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 '26 NUMBERS IN 2025 PRIOR TO THE DISTRIBUTION OF ANY FUNDS.
2 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WHAT THE SHORTFALLS LOOK LIKE WHEN WE
3 APPLY AVAILABLE FUNDS IS THAT THE STATE MONEY, WHILE IT IS A
4 VERY WELCOME DOWN PAYMENT, IT DOES NOT TAKE CARE OF THE ENTIRE
5 FUNDING NEED. THIS, ALSO, BY THE WAY ASSUMES THAT 45 MILLION
6 IN TRANSIT OPERATING RESERVE IS ACTUALLY APPLIED TO THESE
7 SHORTFALLS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, EARLIER THIS YEAR, COMMISSION
8 LEADERSHIP WORKED VERY HARD IN SACRAMENTO TO ACQUIRE STATE
9 FUNDING TO ADDRESS THE OPERATING SHORTFALL AND ALSO TALKED
10 ABOUT THE NEED TO MAKE TRADE-OFFS AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL TO
11 HELP CLOSE THE FUNDING GAP. IN ALIGNMENT WITH TRADE-OFFS WE
12 ESTIMATE \$300 MILLION COULD BE REDIRECTED TO FUND OPERATIONS
13 FROM EXISTING RESOURCES. THE FIRST FUND SOURCE ON THE LIST IS
14 UNPROGRAMMED FTA FORMULA FUNDS IN THE AMOUNT OF \$125 MILLION.
15 SO, YOU HEARD EARLIER AT THE BAIFA MEETING ABOUT THE BART CAR
16 REPLACEMENT PROJECT. AS WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO TAKE FUNDS FROM
17 OUR FTA FORMULA PROGRAM TO APPLY TO THOSE BART CARS ON A PAY
18 GO BASIS, WE HAVE BEEN DOING SO. AND WE WERE GOING TO USE
19 THESE DOLLARS TO DO JUST THAT AS WELL AND REDUCE THE FINANCING
20 NEED. SINCE THESE FUNDS ARE UNPROGRAMMED AT THE MOMENT, WE
21 WOULD PROPOSE TO SET THEM ASIDE FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS
22 SHORTFALL, BECAUSE IT DOESN'T REQUIRE US TO DEPROGRAM ANY
23 EXISTING FUNDS. THE NEXT ITEM ON OUR BRIDGE TOLLS, 20 TO 30
24 MILLION WE THINK CAN BE MADE AVAILABLE. AND THESE ARE
25 ESSENTIALLY REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDS THAT HAD BEEN



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 DESIGNATED FOR EXPRESS BUS FUNDING OPERATIONS FUNDING, BUT
2 BECAUSE OF THE LITIGATION SURROUNDING RM3, THOSE FUNDS WENT
3 INTO AN ESCROW, BUT THEY ARE AVAILABLE AND WE COULD USE THEM
4 FOR THIS PURPOSE. THE NEXT FUND SOURCE IS STATE TRANSIT
5 ASSISTANCE POPULATION BASED FUNDING. STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE
6 HAS ACTUALLY BEEN GROWING OVER THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS IN A
7 ROBUST WAY. IT IS THE SALES TAX ON DIESEL FUELS. AND WE
8 ANTICIPATE THAT OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS, WE COULD PROBABLY
9 SHAVE ABOUT 20 TO 30 MILLION OFF OF THE STATE TRANSIT
10 ASSISTANCE POPULATION BASED FUNDS. TYPICALLY THOSE FUNDS GO TO
11 SUPPORT THE REGIONAL TRANSIT PROGRAMS AND REGIONAL PROGRAMS
12 LIKE CLIPPER, AND OUR CLIPPER START PROGRAM. AND SURFACE
13 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, OR STP, CMAQ, ARE I ARRANGED FROM 8 TO
14 150 MILLION COULD BE MADE AVAILABLE, THESE FUNDS ARE TYPICALLY
15 SPLIT BETWEEN COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND THEY GO TO
16 FUND COUNTY PRIORITIES. AND THEY ALSO ARE SPLIT 50% FOR
17 REGIONAL PROJECTS, AS WELL. A LOT OF THESE FUNDS GO TO FUND
18 PROJECTS LIKE BIKE PED AND OTHER COUNTY PRIORITIES AND AS I
19 MENTIONED OTHER COUNTY PROGRAMS. I WANT TO STRESS THAT THE
20 FINAL REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION WILL DEPEND ON THE CHANGING NATURE
21 OF SHORTFALLS OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS AS WELL AS IS
22 BEING OF CONTINUED ADVOCACY FOR STATE FUNDING. THIS IS
23 PROPOSED HOW WE COME UP TO \$300 MILLION BUT OUR HOPE IS THAT
24 THESE FUNDS ARE LAST DOLLAR IN AND THAT WE WILL FIND
25 ADDITIONAL STATE RESOURCES TO COVER THIS GAP. NEXT SLIDE. SO,



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THIS SLIDE BUILDS OFF OF THE PRIOR SLIDE IN THAT IT ADDS IN
2 THAT 300 MILLION IN REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION IN THE LAST TWO
3 ROWS. IF WE ASSUME THAT THE REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION TOTALS 300
4 MILLION WE CAN ADDRESS ALL BUT 44 MILLION OF THE SHORTFALL
5 THROUGH FISCAL YEAR '26. I WANT TO STRESS, AGAIN, THAT THE 44
6 MILLION IS NEEDED JUST TO COVER THE STANDARDIZED SHORTFALL
7 BASED ON A 2022 SERVICE LEVEL. IF OPERATORS ARE RESTORING
8 SERVICE TO RESPOND TO A DEMAND THEY WILL FACE EVEN LARGER
9 SHORTFALLS AND WE WILL NEED ADDITIONAL REVENUE, LOWER COST, OR
10 SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER FARE REVENUE TO ADDRESS THAT GAP. NEXT
11 SLIDE. AS NOTED EARLIER, ONE OF OUR PRINCIPLES RELATED TO
12 USING THIS FUNDING TO INCENTIVIZE ACCOUNTABILITY OF TRANSIT
13 OPERATORS TO IMPROVE COORDINATION AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. MTC
14 PROPOSES TO COLLABORATE WITH OPERATORS ON ENHANCEMENTS THAT
15 SHOULD BE IMPLEMENTED TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND
16 EFFICIENCY. SOME OF THESE ENHANCEMENTS MAY SPAN ALL OPERATORS,
17 SUCH AS THE DELIVERY OF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PLAN
18 IMPROVEMENTS, AND OTHER ENHANCEMENTS MAY BE SPECIFIC TO
19 CERTAIN OPERATORS. WE WOULD PROPOSE TO TIE THE FUNDING
20 DISTRIBUTION TO PROGRESS MILESTONES ON ENHANCEMENTS AND STAFF
21 ARE LOOKING AT WHAT POTENTIAL MIGHT EXIST TO PROVIDE FUNDING
22 ASSISTANCE WITH IMPLEMENTATION ENHANCEMENTS WE PLAN TO COME
23 BACK TO YOU IN NOVEMBER ON ADDITIONAL SPECIFICS ON TYPES OF
24 ENHANCEMENTS WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE SO MORE DETAILS TO COME AS
25 WE HAVE CONVERSATIONS WITH OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THIS IS A REMINDER, AGAIN, OF THE TIMELINE INVOLVED. AGAIN,
2 TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS JUST FOR INFORMATION. WE HAVE A FEW
3 REFINEMENTS TO MAKE BEFORE WE BRING THIS BACK TO YOU IN
4 NOVEMBER FOR APPROVAL, AND THEN, AGAIN, ANOTHER APPROVAL
5 ACTION IN DECEMBER, BEFORE WE SUBMIT TO THE STATE. NEXT SLIDE.
6 AND, LASTLY, WE REALIZE THAT ANOTHER IMPORTANT PART OF THE
7 TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING DISCUSSION IS RELATED TO A
8 POTENTIAL FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. A REGIONAL
9 MEASURE SUCH AS SALES TAX OR ANOTHER SOURCE WE ANTICIPATE
10 COULD GENERATE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF MONEY AND WORK IS
11 UNDERWAY NOW TO EXPLORE HOW THOSE FUNDS MIGHT BE SECURED AS
12 EARLY AS 2026. AND THOSE NEW REVENUES COULD SUPPLEMENT THE
13 FUNDS DISCUSSED TODAY AND HELP US TO SUSTAIN OPERATIONS BEYOND
14 THAT 2022 BASELINE SERVICE LEVEL. THERE WILL BE A FULL
15 BRIEFING ON THE POTENTIAL MEASURE AT THE NOVEMBER LEGISLATION
16 COMMITTEE MEETING. SO, THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. WE DO
17 HAVE A PRESENTATION FROM THE OPERATORS. SO, IF IT'S YOUR WISH
18 TO GO STRAIGHT TO THAT? OR I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS
19 FIRST. I THINK WE SHOULD -- I THINK THERE IS A TIME
20 CONSTRAINT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** GOING TO THE OPERATORS. THANK YOU
23 VERY MUCH FOR THAT PRESENTATION.

24

25 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CAN WE BRING UP THE SECOND PRESENTATION DECK?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AS THE DECK IS COMING UP,
3 I'M NOT THE GENERAL MANAGER OF BART I'M THE DEPUTY GENERAL
4 MANAGER MICHAEL JONES. POWERS SENDS HIS REGARDS HE IS IN
5 WASHINGTON ADVOCATING AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL WITH SEVERAL
6 DIRECTORS TRAVELING BACK THIS MORNING SO HE SENT ME ON HIS
7 BEHALF. SECONDLY BEFORE WE GET STARTED I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
8 APPROVING THE RAIL CAR FINANCING ITEM AT YOUR PREVIOUS
9 MEETING. THAT HAS BEEN, AS STAFF FROM MTC HAS INDICATED THAT
10 HAS BEEN A LONG ONGOING COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIP, AND IT'S
11 RESULTED IN TANGIBLE DELIVERY. WE HAVE 611 RAIL CARS ON OUR
12 PROPERTY TODAY. AND AS YOU WILL SEE LATER IN MY PRESENTATION,
13 WE ARE RUNNING ALL NEW CARS, ALL THE NEW LEGACY FLEET ARE
14 PARKED WITH THE EXCEPTION OF SPECIAL EVENTS, OR ARE ALREADY
15 RESERVED SO THAT'S DIRECT RESULT OF PARTNERSHIP. I HAVE FOUR
16 BRIEF SLIDES THAT I WILL SHARE WITH YOU, IF YOU CAN SKIP TO
17 THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? I WOULD LIKE TO START BY PROVIDING
18 CONTEXT ON BART'S POST-PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP AND THE DIRECT
19 CORRELATION THAT IT CONTINUES TO HAVE WITH SAN FRANCISCO'S
20 OFFICE OCCUPANCY. THE GRAPH HIGHLIGHTS HOW CLOSELY BART'S
21 OVERALL RIDERSHIP MATCHES DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO'S RETURN TO
22 THE OFFICE. UNTIL SAN FRANCISCO FULLY REBOUNDS, BART RIDERSHIP
23 WILL LIKELY NOT RETURN TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS. ON A POSITIVE
24 NOTE WE CONTINUE TO SEE RIDERSHIP RECOVERY ON WEEKDAYS AND
25 WEEKENDS WHICH PROMPTED SERVICE CHANGES. WE'LL CONTINUE TO SEE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THAT STATIONS SERVING LOW-INCOME AND MINORITY RIDERS CONTINUE
2 TO BE UTILIZED POST-PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS YOU ALL
3 ARE AWARE PRE-PANDEMIC BART WAS HIGHLY SELF-SUFFICIENT WITH
4 2/3 OF REVENUE COMING FROM FARE COLLECTION. LOW RIDERSHIP HAS
5 HAD SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON FINANCIAL OUTLOOK AT RIDERSHIP
6 SUFFERED IN '20 AND 2021 BART WAS FORTUNATE TO RECEIVE 1.6
7 BILLION IN FEDERAL ASSISTANCE WHICH WE WERE ABLE TO UTILIZE
8 THOSE REVENUE, THE FUNDING WILL BE EXHAUSTED IN FISCAL '25
9 LEAVING ANNUAL DEFICIT FOR SEVERAL FISCAL YEARS. THESE
10 PROJECTIONS DON'T CONTEMPLATE POTENTIAL SB125 ALLOCATIONS FOR
11 THE PROPOSED BY REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION JUST DISCUSSED BY MTC
12 STAFF. IF THE COMMISSION ADOPTS STAFF'S APPROACH, BART WILL BE
13 ABLE TO BALANCE FY 2025 AND WILL BE IN STRIKING DISTANCE TO
14 BALANCE 2026. WE ARE EXTREMELY GRATEFUL TO THE STATE AND MTC'S
15 EFFORTS TO HELP BART CLOSE OUR SHORT-TERM FUNDING GAP AND HOPE
16 THE COMMISSION VOTES TO ADOPT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IN
17 NOVEMBER. WE WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH MTC AND OTHERS TO
18 IDENTIFY AND SECURE LONG-TERM FUNDING SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE
19 PLEASE. SO, OVER THE LAST 18 MONTHS, BART HAS BEEN MAKING
20 SIGNIFICANT ENHANCEMENTS TO POSITIVELY IMPACT THE CUSTOMER
21 EXPERIENCE AND TO ATTEMPT TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. TO DO THAT,
22 WE'RE FOCUSED ON SIX TARGET AREAS LISTED ON THE NEXT TWO
23 SLIDES AND WE'LL START HERE WITH SERVICE. SINCE WE'RE STARTING
24 FULL SERVICE IN AUGUST OF 2021, WE HAVE CONTINUED TO
25 STRATEGICALLY HIRE TRAIN OPERATOR, STATION AGENTS, CLEANING



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 STAFF AND OTHER FRONT LINE EMPLOYEES TO ENSURE BASE STAFFING
2 LEVELS TO DELIVER ON TIME AND RELIABLE SERVICE. IN SEPTEMBER
3 OF THIS YEAR WE ADJUSTED OUR SCHEDULE TO MATCH THE DEMAND AND
4 INCREASE EVENING AND WEEKEND SERVICE HEADWAYS BY 50%. WE ALSO
5 WERE ABLE TO DEPLOY ALL NEW FLEET OF THE FUTURE TRAIN CARS TO
6 MATCH THAT SCHEDULE. IN MARCH OF 2023 WE MODIFIED OUR BART'S
7 POLICE DEPARTMENT STAFFING DEPLOYMENT TO MAXIMIZE PERSONALLY
8 ON TRAINS AND WE CONTINUE TO RELY ON HEAVY POLICING STAFF TO
9 MANAGE CHARGES TO DON'T REQUIRE A SWORN OFFICER RESPONSE. THIS
10 ALLOWS SWORN PERSONALLY TO FOCUS ON MORE SERIOUS INFRACTIONS.
11 WE HAVE BOOSTED RECRUITING AND RETENTION INCENTIVES TO FILL
12 CRITICAL OFFICER STAFFING VACANCIES. WE HAVE DOUBLED OUR RATE
13 OF DEEP CLEANING ON TRAINS AND HAVE ADDED 66% MORE STAFF TO
14 KEEP STATIONS CLEAN. WE HAVE CONTINUED TO DEPLOY ELEVATOR
15 ATTENDANCE IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO STATIONS AS WELL AS
16 RESTROOM ATTENDANCE IN HIGHLY USED AREA. LAST SLIDE PLEASE. WE
17 ARE EXCITED WE WERE RECENTLY AWARDED A CONTRACT TO COMPLETE A
18 SYSTEM WIDE REPLACEMENT OF FARE GATES, INSTALLED IN OUR WEST
19 OAKLAND STATION IN DECEMBER OF 2023. THE ENTIRE SYSTEM WILL BE
20 COMPLETED IN 2025. CONTINUING FOCUS ON REGIONAL COORDINATION
21 EFFORTS, BART WITH MTC IS COLEADING THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT
22 AND JOINING WITH THE REGION IN INCREASING THE CLIPPER START
23 DISCOUNT TO 50% FOR ELIGIBLE PASSENGERS. LASTLY WE'RE ABOUT
24 HALFWAY THROUGH OUR MEASURE RR PROGRAM TO REVIEW AND RENEW
25 BART INFRASTRUCTURE INCLUDING ADDITIONAL RAIL CARS, NEW



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 TRACKS, ESCALATORS, ELEVATORS AND OTHER CRITICAL
2 INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS. THAT CONCLUDES MY COMMENTS AND I'M
3 HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS OR TURN IT OVER TO MR. TUMLIN

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR
6 COMING. LET'S GO TO MR. TUMLIN.

7

8 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING
9 COMMISSIONERS. THE MY NAME IS JEFFREY TUMLIN, EXECUTIVE
10 DIRECTOR OF SFMTA, WE OVERSEE THE STREETS OF SAN FRANCISCO AND
11 ALSO MUNI WHICH CARRIES 47% OF THE REGION'S TRANSIT RIDERSHIP.
12 NEXT SLIDE.

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YOU CAN BRING THE SAME DECK BACK UP, PLEASE?

15

16 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I WANT TO THANK ALIX BOCKELMAN, AND THERESA
17 ROMMEL OF YOUR STAFF WHO HAVE MADE SENSE OF TRANSIT
18 STRUCTURING. NEXT SLIDE. FROM THE BEGINNING OF COVID, WE HAVE
19 BEEN LISTENING TO OUR RIDERS AND THEY HAVE --

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

22

23 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THERE WE GO. AND THEY HAVE TOLD US VERY
24 CLEARLY WHAT THEY NEED, AND SINCE THAT TIME, WE HAVE BEEN
25 LASER FOCUSED ON MAKING MUNI FAST, FREQUENT, RELIABLE, SAFE,



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 AND CLEAN. AND, SO, THROUGH THE COVID WE HAVE BEEN MAKING
2 PRETTY MASSIVE CHANGES IN INVESTMENTS TO THE SYSTEM, EVEN AS
3 WE HAD TO CONTRACT THE SYSTEM DRAMATICALLY. OVER THE LAST
4 THREE YEARS, WE HAVE BUILT OVER 20 MILES OF NEW TRANSIT ONLY
5 LANES AND MADE IMPROVEMENTS TO THE OVER 90 MILES OF TRANSIT
6 PRIORITY TREATMENT THROUGHOUT THE FACILITY WHICH HAS INCREASED
7 TRANSIT SPEED FROM 10 TO 30%, AND IMPROVED RELIABILITY BY 15
8 TO 25%. WE HAVE REBUILT THE SYSTEM OVER A DOZEN TIMES. THAT'S
9 SOMETHING THAT A TRANSIT AGENCY TYPICALLY DOES ONCE A DECADE.
10 WE'RE NOW DOING EVERY 4 TO 6 MONTHS TO RESPOND TO DRAMATICALLY
11 CHANGING TRAVEL PATTERNS. WE MADE A VERY STRATEGIC DECISION TO
12 NOT TAKE OUR LIMITED CAPITAL MONEY AND SHIFT IT INTO
13 OPERATIONS AND INSTEAD DOUBLE DOWN ON ADDRESSING DEFERRED
14 MAINTENANCE PARTICULARLY IN THE SUBWAY WHERE WE HAVE SUCCEEDED
15 IN REDUCING MAJOR DELAYS IN THE SUBWAY BY 60%. WE HAVE
16 CONTINUED TO INVEST IN CUSTOMER INFORMATION KNOWING THAT GIVEN
17 ALL THE CHANGES IN THE SYSTEM, WE NEEDED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
18 WERE DELIVERING ACCURATE INFORMATION TO OUR CUSTOMERS ABOUT
19 WHAT WAS HAPPENING. WE TOOK ALL OF THE MAJOR INVESTMENT WE
20 MADE IN STERILIZING THE SYSTEM EARLY IN COVID AND HAVE SHIFT
21 THAT INTO MAKING OUR STATIONS AND OUR VEHICLES CLEANER THAN
22 THEY HAVE BEEN IN THE 30 YEARS THAT I HAVE LIVED IN SAN
23 FRANCISCO. I HAVE BEEN TAKING MUNI EVERY WEEK. AND OF COURSE
24 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO RESPOND TO THE NUMBER ONE CONCERN WE
25 HAVE HEARD FROM OUR PASSENGERS PARTICULARLY WOMEN AND ASIAN



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 AMERICANS WHICH IS ABOUT PERSONAL CONCERN ABOUT SECURITY BY
2 EXPANDING OUR TRANSIT AMBASSADORS EXPANDING OUR TRANSIT FARE
3 INSPECTOR PROGRAM, AND MAKING CAMERAS ON OUR VEHICLES MAKING
4 EFFICIENT AND MORE EFFECTIVE INCLUDING OUR RELATIONSHIP WITH
5 SAN FRANCISCO POLICE DEPARTMENT, AND DISTRICT ATTORNEY'S
6 OFFICE. NEXT SLIDE. RESULT OF ALL OF THIS, DESPITE THE FACT
7 WE'RE STILL NOT OPERATING A DOZEN MUNI LINES THE SYSTEM IS
8 MUCH DIMINISHED FROM 2019, OUR RIDERS HAVE NOTICED
9 IMPROVEMENTS AND THEY ARE HAPPIER THAN THEY HAVE BEEN IN A
10 DECADE, SOMETHING WE DID NOT THINK WAS POSSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE
11 PLEASE. AND THE RESULT IS, WE'RE STARTING TO SEE SIGNIFICANT
12 IMPROVEMENTS IN RIDERSHIP. BUT THE RIDERSHIP DATA IS DEEPLY
13 DIVERGENT OVERALL TRANSIT RIDERSHIP RECOVERY IS AT 69% BUT
14 WEEKEND AND MIDDAY RIDERSHIP IS SIGNIFICANT HE BETTER.
15 MOREOVER OUR RAIL SYSTEM RIDERSHIP TRACKS EXACTLY WITH BART'S.
16 JAY CHURCH RIDERSHIP IS ONLY AT 48% OF PRECOVID RIDERSHIP
17 BECAUSE IT WAS HIGHLY DEPENDENT ON CARRYING WHITE COLLAR
18 COMMUTERS TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. HOWEVER ALL CHANGES WE
19 HAVE BEEN MAKE OUTSIDE OF DOWNTOWN -- NEXT SLIDE PLEASE -- IS
20 PRODUCING THE HIGHEST RIDERSHIP GAINS THAT WE KNOW OF ANY
21 SYSTEM IN THE COUNTRY. WE HAVE THE TWO TRANSIT LINES WITH WHAT
22 WE BELIEVE TO BE IS THE HIGHEST RATE OF PRECOVID RIDERSHIP
23 GROWTH OF ANY PLACE IN THE COUNTRY, THE 22 FILLMORE, AND THE
24 49 VAN NESS. AS YOU KNOW, THE VAN NESS BUS WAY OPENED A YEAR
25 AGO. IT IS GETTING US OVER 140% OF PRECOVID RIDERSHIP,



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 DEPENDING ON THE DAY OF THE WEEK. AND, ON THE 22 FILLMORE,
2 WHERE WE HAVE IMPROVED SPEED AND FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY,
3 THANKS IN PART TO 16th STREET, AND REROUTING FILLMORE, AT
4 HOSPITALS IS AT 130% OF PRECOVID RIDERSHIP. WE DID NOT THINK
5 THAT SUCH RIDERSHIP GAINS WERE ANYWHERE IN THE REALM OF
6 POSSIBILITY BUT DEMONSTRATES FOCUSED MAKING TRANSIT FAST
7 FREQUENT RELIABLE CLEAN AND SAFE PAYS OFF. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE
8 NOT OUT OF THE WOODS, SAN FRANCISCO AS YOU ALL KNOW FACES THE
9 GREATEST RATES OF WORK-FROM-HOME OF ANY CITY IN THE WORLD AND
10 IT'S IMPACTING RAIL RIDERSHIP AND COMMUTE RIDERSHIP FOR ALL
11 MAJOR AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA YET WE'RE STARTING TO SEE
12 CHANGES. YES, WORK-FROM-HOME IS GOING TO BE LONG LASTING AND
13 PERMANENT. BUT WHAT IS HAPPENING RIGHT NOW IS COMPANIES ARE
14 SHRINKING THEIR FOOTPRINTS TO JUST THE SPACE THAT THEY NEED.
15 AND THE RESULT OF THAT IS WE'RE SEEING COMMERCIAL RENTS
16 PLUMMETING. WHICH IS EXACTLY THE SIGN THAT WE LOOK FOR, FOR
17 THE TRANSITION OF A CLASSIC SAN FRANCISCO BUST ECONOMY INTO
18 THE NEXT BOOM ECONOMY. NEW BUSINESSES ARE FORMING, THEY'RE
19 LEASING NEW SPACE AT RATES WE HAVEN'T SEEN IN 20 YEARS. AND
20 WE'RE STARTING TO SEE AN INCREASE IN ACTIVITY IN THE DOWNTOWN.
21 THAT SAID, THE RECOVERY IS GOING TO TAKE A WHILE, AND OUR
22 DEFICITS WILL CONTINUE FOR QUITE SOMETIME. THANKS TO THE MONEY
23 THAT'S BEEN ALLOCATED FROM THE STATE, WE WILL ALSO BE ABLE TO
24 PUSH OUT THE NEED FOR DRAMATIC MUNI SERVICE CUTS INTO EARLY
25 CALENDAR YEAR 2026. WE ARE VERY, VERY GRATEFUL FOR THIS, AND



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 IT BUYS US THE TIME WE NEED TO BOTH LOOK AT DOWNTOWN RECOVERY,
2 BUT ALSO TO IDENTIFY NEW ADDITIONAL SUSTAINABLE SOURCES OF
3 FUNDING AS WELL AS TO CONTINUE OUR EFFORTS AT MAKING MUNI MORE
4 EFFICIENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I KNOW WE
7 HAVE TWO OTHER GENERAL MANAGERS HERE THAT, SO DENIS AND I
8 MICHELLE IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO COME UP, IF YOU HAVE A FEW
9 WORDS. I KNOW YOU WANTED TO CONTRIBUTE.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS DENIS MULLIGAN, WITH
12 THE GOLDEN GATE ON HIGHWAY TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT. I WANT TO
13 THANK STAFF AND THE COMMISSION FOR YOUR TIRELESS EFFORTS IN
14 ASSISTING TRANSIT AGENCIES AS WE NAVIGATE THE LONG TAIL OF THE
15 PANDEMIC. NONE OF US COULD HAVE ENVISIONED IN FEBRUARY 2020
16 WHAT WE WERE ABOUT TO ENCOUNTER. IT HAS TURNED OUR WORLD
17 UPSIDE DOWN. WE WOULD NOT BE HERE WITHOUT THE ASSISTANCE OF
18 THE CARES ACT, WITH CRSSA, AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN AND NOW WITH
19 THE SB125 MONEY, AND, HOPEFULLY, ANOTHER REGIONAL MEASURE. I
20 WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR EFFORTS. STAFF HAS DONE A FABULOUS
21 JOB IN PRESENTING CONSIDERATIONS. AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
22 THERE ARE LIMITATIONS TO STANDARDIZATION THAT IMPACT GOLDEN
23 GATE SPECIFICALLY IN A VERY NEGATIVE WAY. BEFORE THE PANDEMIC
24 BRIDGE TOLLS AND TRANSIT FARES ARE THE TWO LARGEST SOURCE OF
25 REVENUES. TODAY BRIDGE TOLLS AND TRANSIT FARES ARE DOWN \$1



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 MILLION EACH WEEK COMPARED TO THE SAME WEEK PRE-PANDEMIC.
2 SPECIFICALLY, LAST WEEK WE WERE DOWN \$970,000 IN REVENUE
3 COMING IN THE DOOR. THAT -- THOSE A RATHER DIFFICULT
4 CHALLENGES TO NAVIGATE WE HAVE GREATLY REDUCED OUR COSTS WE
5 HAVE GREATLY REDUCE OUR COSTS DURING THE PANDEMIC WE HAVE NOT
6 BETTER HEAD IN THE SAND WE OFFER LESS COMMUTE SERVICE,
7 SIGNIFICANTLY LESS THAN BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. WE HAVE
8 MAINTAINED THE REGIONAL MOBILITY IN THE CORRIDOR FROM SANTA
9 ROSA TO SAN FRANCISCO, AND FROM ACROSS RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL
10 BRIDGE CORRIDOR, THE ONLY EAST WEST CORRIDOR IN THE WHOLE BAY.
11 WE HAVE MAINTAINED THAT SERVICE. WE HAVE SLASHED SERVICE AND
12 STAFF TODAY. WE HAVE DONE EVERYTHING WE CAN DO TO REDUCE COST.
13 AS CUSTOMERS COME BACK AND CONTINUE TO ADD SERVICE. YOUR
14 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR CAN ATTEST TO THAT, AS ONE OF MY HAPPY
15 CUSTOMERS. WE ADDED TWO FERRY TRIPS OUT OF LARKSPUR THIS
16 MONTH. WE'RE STAFFING BACK UP. BUT YOUR ASSUMPTIONS AS STAFF
17 ELOQUENTLY AND TRANSPARENTLY HIGHLIGHTED GOES BACK IN TIME
18 CONSISTENT WITH THE LEGISLATURES ALLOCATING THE MONEY TO YOU
19 FROM, TO THE POINT WHERE WE HAD LITTLE SERVICE OUT THERE. SO,
20 ALL SERVICE ADDED IN THE LAST YEAR IS NOT ACCOUNTED OR
21 CONTEMPLATED IN THIS IF THIS FUNDING PACKAGE GOES FORWARD,
22 WHICH IT PROBABLY WILL, WE'LL HAVE CHALLENGES WITH THE
23 STANDARDIZATION. BECAUSE WE WON'T HAVE THE MONEY THAT WE HAVE
24 BEEN SPENDING INCLUDED IN THE CALCULATIONS. ALSO, WE ARE A
25 BRIDGE DISTRICT. WE SPEND THE BULK OF OUR MONEY ON TRANSIT.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ALSO, BUT WE ARE A BRIDGE DISTRICT, AND FOR STATE LAW, OUR
2 FIRST CALL ON TOLL DOLLARS IS THE BRIDGE. IF WE HAVE
3 INADEQUATE BRIDGE RESOURCES, BRIDGE TOLLS, WE CUT TRANSIT
4 FIRST. IN THE DARKEST DAYS OF THE PANDEMIC, WE ISSUED LAY OFF
5 NOTICES. WE SINCE RESCINDED THEM WHEN FEDERAL FUNDS CAME
6 THROUGH. BUT ISSUED THEM TO A THIRD OF OUR BUS STAFF, 40% OF
7 OUR FERRY STAFF AND NONE OF OUR BRIDGE STAFF. BECAUSE BY STATE
8 LAW WE HAVE TO PROTECT THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE FOR FUTURE
9 GENERATIONS. WE HAVE TO HAVE STAFF OUT THERE TO PREVENT PEOPLE
10 FROM HURTING THEMSELVES, AND WE NEED TO MAINTAIN THE BRIDGE.
11 AND SO ASSUMPTIONS THAT THE BRIDGE TOLLS WILL CONTINUE TO
12 GROW, GOING TO TRANSIT OVER THE NEXT THREE YEARS IS NOT
13 REFLECTIVE OF THE REALITY WE LIVE IN. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
14 THAT THE PRESENTATION WAS FANTASTIC. YOUR EFFORTS HAVE BEEN
15 TIRELESS. THEY HAVE BEEN GREAT FOR US. I JUST WANT TO
16 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT STANDARDIZATION IMPACTS US ALL DIFFERENTLY
17 BASED ON HOW WE'RE ALL FUNDED AND HOW WE ARE IMPACTED BY
18 CUTTING SERVICE AND NOW ADDING IT BACK. THANK YOU IN ADVANCE
19 FOR ANY CONSIDERATION YOU HAVE, AND I'LL STICK AROUND FOR ANY
20 QUESTIONS THAT YOU MIGHT HAVE FOR ME.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MICHELLE
25 BOUCHARD, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF CALTRAIN. I WANT TO ECHO



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 GRATITUDE FOR THERESA AND ALIX AND WORKING SEVERAL HOURS WITH
2 OUR STAFF FOR SOME OF THE UNIQUE FINANCIAL UNDERPINNINGS THAT
3 DRIVE COSTS HERE AT CALTRAIN. I WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION
4 FOR TAKING UP THIS IMPORTANT ITEM. CALTRAIN IS THE REGIONAL
5 RAIL SERVICE THAT PROVIDES A GAMUT OF TYPES OF SERVICES FOR
6 PEOPLE GETTING TO WORK, SCHOOL, SPECIAL EVENTS, ANY, SORT OF,
7 FAMILY GATHERING. AND WE ARE PART OF THE BAY AREA CORE TRANSIT
8 LANDSCAPE. AND WE ARE REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO, IN LESS THAN
9 A YEAR, PROVIDING BETTER SERVICE THROUGH OUR ELECTRIFICATION
10 PROGRAM SINCE WE LAUNCHED IN SEPTEMBER 2024 THANKS SO MUCH TO
11 SUPPORT OF FUNDERS AT EVERY LEVEL AND PARTICULARLY SUPPORT OF
12 MTC THROUGH THE OUR PROCESS. DURING THE PANDEMIC CALTRAIN
13 RIDERSHIP WAS DRASTICALLY IMPACTED AND WE DO REMAIN WELL BELOW
14 OUR PRE-PANDEMIC SERVICE LEVELS -- SORRY -- NOT SERVICE LEVELS
15 -- RIDERSHIP LEVELS. WE'RE TRACKING CLOSELY WITH BART. WE ARE
16 HIGHLY DEPENDENT ON OFFICE OCCUPANCY ALL OVER THE CALTRAIN
17 CORRIDOR. AND, SO, WE REALLY HAVE TAKEN SOME STEPS DURING THE
18 PANDEMIC, NOT ONLY TO RECAST OURSELVES, BUT, ALSO, TO PROVIDE
19 MUCH MORE EFFICIENT AND COST EFFECTIVE SERVICE. SOME OF THESE
20 INCLUDE REDESIGNING OUR SERVICE TO PROVIDE MORE OFFER PEAK
21 WEEKEND AND LESS PEAK SERVICE THAT PROVIDES FOR MORE COST
22 EFFECTIVE SERVICE AS A RESULT WE ARE SEEING RIDERSHIP GROWTH
23 IN THOSE OFF PEAK TIMES OF THE DAY AND ON WEEKENDS.
24 ADDITIONALLY WE HAVE REDUCED OUR TRAIN SIZES TO BE MORE
25 EFFICIENT IN TERMS OF OUR MECHANICAL DOLLARS. RIGHT NOW WE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO SHIFT SOME OF OUR ELECTRIFICATION FUNDING
2 BECAUSE OF GRANTS WE RECEIVED TO COVER SOME OF THE FISCAL
3 CLIFFS THAT WOULD HAVE IMPACTED SERVICE STARTING THIS YEAR. AS
4 YOU SAW IN THE PRESENTATION, OUR FISCAL CLIFF BEGINS IN FISCAL
5 '26. WHILE IT'S \$33 MILLION, THAT SEEMS A BIT LOWER THAN SOME
6 OF OUR SISTER AGENCIES IT'S A CRITICAL 20% OF CALTRANS'S
7 BUDGET. SO, WHAT WE DO KNOW IS THAT CLOSING THE GAP IS GOING
8 TO BE DIFFICULT. WE'RE GOING NEED TO BE CREATIVE. IT'S
9 CHALLENGING BECAUSE THE NEEDS DO OUTWEIGH THE AVAILABLE
10 RESOURCES. SO, AS YOU CONSIDER THIS ITEM TODAY, WE'RE VERY
11 SUPPORTIVE OF THE ACTIONS THAT WILL PROVIDE CERTAINTY FOR
12 OPERATORS, PARTICULARLY OURSELVES WHO WILL BE SEEKING FUNDING
13 IN THE THIRD YEAR OF THIS PLAN. AND, SO, WE LOOK FORWARD TO
14 KNOWING IT THE CONVERSATION WITH STAFF AND THE COMMISSION, BUT
15 THIS CERTAINTY WILL HELP TO INFORM OUR DECISIONS AS WE MUFF
16 FORWARD WITH LAUNCH OF ELECTRIFICATION AND FIGURING OUT HOW
17 BEST TO SERVE OUR CUSTOMERS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AC TRANSIT IS
20 IN THE HOUSE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS
23 GABRIELA ON BEHALF OF OUR GENERAL MANAGER MICHAEL HURSCH WHO
24 WAS NOT ABLE TO ATTEND IN-PERSON BECAUSE WE HAVE I BOARD
25 MEETING TODAY. I WANT TO EXPRESS APPRECIATION TO STAFF FOR ALL



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 YOUR WORK ON THIS EFFORT. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY WITH
2 MTC ON PROPOSALS AND WE APPRECIATE THEIR ATTEMPT TO FAIRLY
3 COMPARE PROJECTIONS ACROSS TRANSIT AGENCIES HOWEVER SIMILAR TO
4 GENERAL MANAGER MULLIGAN'S REMARKS WE WANT TO STATE THAT THE
5 RECOMMENDED ALLOCATION -- ALTHOUGH WE RECOGNIZE TODAY IS NOT
6 AN ACTION ITEM -- FOR AC TRANSIT IS SIGNIFICANTLY LESS THAN WE
7 NEED TO PROTECT OUR PROJECTED DEFICIT OUR ASSUMPTIONS
8 INCREASED ESTIMATED REVENUES AND DECREASED ESTIMATED EXPENSES
9 PRODUCING LOWER PROJECTED DEFICITS THAN ORIGINAL ESTIMATES AS
10 NOTED IN THE PRESENTATION I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE
11 TRANSPARENCY STAFF INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION, OUR PROJECTED
12 DEFICIT THROUGH FISCAL YEAR '25, '26 TOTALS 55 MILLION WHEN
13 USING AC TRANSIT'S NUMBERS, WHEN USING MTC STAFF NUMBERS, THAT
14 DEFICIT DROPS TO \$33 MILLION. WE WANT TO EMPHASIZE OUR
15 ORIGINAL DEFICITS ARE WHAT WE EXPECT WILL HAPPEN. AS MTC
16 CONTINUES TO WORK WITH OPERATORS IN THE REGION, WE'RE URGE THE
17 COMMISSION TO CONTINUE TO WORK ON A DISTRIBUTION METHODOLOGY
18 THAT CONSIDERS RIDERSHIP, EQUITY, AND THE OVERALL BENEFIT TO
19 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA. WE ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT
20 THAT THE PROJECT -- THE RECOMMENDED ALLOCATION WOULD ONLY
21 SUSTAIN AC TRANSIT AT OUR CURRENT LEVELS WHICH ARE 85% OF PRE-
22 PANDEMIC LEVELS. THOSE ARE LEVELS THAT NEITHER WE NOR OUR
23 RIDERS FEEL ARE ACCEPTABLE IN THE LONG-TERM. DESPITE THE 85%
24 LEVEL, WE ARE LOOKING AT, CURRENTLY, WE ARE PROVIDE -- AT 72%
25 OF OUR RIDERS HAVE RETURNED TO OUR SYSTEM, AND PERHAPS IT'S



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 BECAUSE 65% OF OUR RIDERS ARE LOW-INCOME, 75% ARE PEOPLE OF
2 COLOR, AND SO ULTIMATELY WE REMAIN CONCERNED THAT THE REDUCED
3 SERVICE LEVELS ARE IMPACTING THOSE MOST VULNERABLE IN
4 COMMUNITIES BUT WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THE
5 COMMISSION AND STAFF ON OUR COLLABORATIVE EFFORT MOVING
6 FORWARD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU TO ALL THE TRADITIONAL
9 AGENCY GENERAL MANAGERS AND REP WHO IS HAVE COME, AND THOSE
10 REALLY INTERESTING PRESENTATIONS. I AM DEFINITELY TAKING THE
11 VAN NESS AND THE 22 FILLMORE, AT LEAST 50% MORE THAN I WAS
12 PRE-PANDEMIC. SO VALIDATING THAT WITH ONE EXPERIENCE. THIS IS
13 AN INFORMATION ITEM. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** I HAVE OTHER QUESTIONS LATER, BUT WHILE WE HAVE
16 THE OPERATORS HERE, THE METHODOLOGY THAT'S BEEN DESCRIBE THE,
17 A LOT OF IT LINKS TO BART AND OFFICE OCCUPANCY. THE
18 OPPORTUNITIES ARE GOLDEN HERE AS TO, I HAVE SEEN NO REFERENCE
19 TO AIRPORTS, WHICH ARE, I THINK SFO IS BACK TO POST-PANDEMIC.
20 AND, AGAIN, 43,000 PEOPLE WORK THERE, AND WE STILL SEEM TO --
21 AND YOU HAVE APEX COMING TO TOWN. THE OPPORTUNITY TO PICK UP
22 SOME OF THIS FUNDING SEEMS TO BE GREAT. ARE THESE TRANSIT
23 OPERATORS ADDRESSING THAT RIGHT NOW? I KNOW THERE IS STILL A
24 GAP BETWEEN, LIKE, CALTRAIN AND BART SCHEDULES. IS EVERYBODY
25 GOING TO WAIT UNTIL AFTER THIS HAPPENS? CAN YOU GUYS PLEASE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ANSWER THAT RIGHT NOW? BECAUSE HUGE OPPORTUNITY IS RIGHT AT
2 THE DOORSTEP. ARE OPERATIONS GOING TO BE MODIFIED TO
3 ACCOMMODATE THESE SPECIAL EVENTS AND TRAVEL, IN PARTICULAR?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK ON NEAR-TERM SCHEDULE CHANGES I WOULD
6 LIKE TO DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER JONES OR GENERAL MANAGER
7 BOUCHARD ON THAT SPECIFIC QUESTION.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** GOOD. THEY'RE BOTH HERE. LET'S HAVE IT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING AGAIN COMMISSIONERS. BART HAS ROBUST
12 SERVICE IN AND OUT OF SFO NOW. WE HAVE THE YELLOW LINE THAT'S
13 GOING INTO SFO EVERY TEN MINUTES AND RED LINE GOING THROUGH
14 MILLBRAE GOING ON 20 MINUTE HEADWAY WE HAVE ROBUST SERVICE
15 THAT CAN ACCOMMODATE APEC AND TO TRAVEL TO DOWNTOWN SAN
16 FRANCISCO.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** BUT I'M HEARING THROUGH CALTRAIN -- THERE SEEMS TO
19 BE A SCHEDULING GAP I HOPE YOU CAN WORK OUT BEFORE THESE BIG
20 HUGE EVENTS, AND THE HOLIDAYS, IN PARTICULAR.

21

22 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** A COUPLE OF THINGS IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE
23 TO SERVE CROWDS AS WE'RE INVOLVED IN THE REGION-WIDE EFFORT TO
24 UNDERSTAND WHAT EACH BRINGS TO OUR SYSTEMS, WE BELIEVE WE WILL
25 BE ABLE TO REACT TO THAT IN TERMS OF CONNECTION BETWEEN BART



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 AND CALTRAIN AT MILLBRAE WE HAVE A TEAM OF PEOPLE THAT. WE ARE
2 WORKING TOGETHER IN OUR AGENCIES TO TRY AND FIGURE OUT HOW WE
3 CAN OPTIMIZE THAT. WE ARE ALSO LOOKING AT, AGAIN, ONCE
4 ELECTRIFICATION LAUNCHES, I REALIZE THIS ISN'T IN THE TIME
5 FRAME YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT, BUT ONCE ELECTRIFICATION LAUNCHES
6 WE WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO BE SYNCED UP. BUT WE ARE
7 INVESTIGATING ANY NEAR-TERM TWEAKS THAT WE COULD DO TO
8 BASICALLY MAKE OF THE TRANSFER TIMES AS OPTIMAL AS THEY CAN
9 BE.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** AGAIN REGIONAL MANAGER WOULD HELP A LOT ON THIS I
12 HOPE YOU CAN WORK THAT OUT QUICKLY HERE. ANOTHER ASPECT, REAL
13 -- BART, YOU STILL -- THE CLEANLINESS, WE'RE SEEING IT. THANK
14 YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S GREAT. CRIME IS STILL CAUTION PEOPLE A
15 GREAT DEAL OF PTSD. AND PEOPLE STILL DON'T FEEL SAFE ON THE
16 TRAINS. YOU MAY BE HEADED IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, AS FAR AS
17 VISIBILITY, BUT IT'S JUST ONCE SOMEBODY HEARS ABOUT SOMEBODY
18 GETTING MUGGED, AND WE HEAR IT ALL THE TIME, YOU REALLY --
19 THAT FOCUS NEEDS TO BE EMPHASIZED MORE SO IN ORDER TO INCREASE
20 YOUR RIDERSHIP. BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE JUST NOT GOING TO GET ON
21 THE TRAINS UNLESS THAT HAPPENS. SO, LOOK FORWARD TO THAT. AND
22 THE FARE GATES. 2025. YOU'RE LOSING 15 MILLION A YEAR YOU TOLD
23 US, AS FARE EVASIONS AND STILL FALLING OFF A CLIFF. IS THERE
24 ANY WAY TO EXPEDITE THESE FARE GATES? AND WILL YOU BE TRACKING
25 THEM? YOU'RE STARTING IN OAKLAND. WILL THAT -- CAN YOU TRACK



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THE RESULTS FROM THOSE? AND HOW QUICKLY CAN WE MAKE THIS
2 HAPPEN?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY. I'LL START WITH THE FARE GATES FIRST. AS
5 I INDICATED, AND AS YOU INDICATED, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, YOU
6 KNOW, 2025 IS LESS THAN TWO YEARS AWAY. SO OVER 700 FARE
7 GATES, WE THINK THAT'S PRETTY AGGRESSIVE AS IT RELATES TO ALL
8 THE COMPLEXITIES AT EACH STATION. BUT, SPECIFICALLY TO YOUR
9 QUESTION, THE PILOT INSTALL AT WEST OAKLAND WILL INFORM THE
10 NEXT EIGHT STATIONS AND WE'LL BE GOING TO OUR BOARD AFTER WE
11 DO THE PILOT IN DECEMBER AND HAVE A PLAN TO ROLL OUT THE NEXT
12 EIGHT STATIONS. AND WE WILL, OBVIOUSLY, TAKE OUR LESSONS
13 LEARNED FROM THOSE FIRST NINE STATIONS, AND IF WE CAN SPEED UP
14 THE SCHEDULE, WE WILL SPEED UP THE SCHEDULE. BUT WE REALLY
15 THINK 2025 WITH 700 SOME ODD STATIONS AND 50 STATIONS FARE
16 GATES IS A AN AGGRESSIVE TIMELINE.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** SO IS \$30.02 YEARS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I WOULDN'T DISAGREE WITH THAT COMMISSIONER. WE JUST
21 HIRED A NEW CHIEF OF POLICE 27 YEAR VETERAN CONNECTED TO
22 OAKLAND, ORINDA RESIDENT HAS BEEN IN THE BAY AREA ENTIRE LIFE
23 WE UNDERSTAND THAT CRIME IS A CHALLENGE. THERE WAS A SHOOTING
24 IN THE MISSION STATION PLAZA THAT DIDN'T INVOLVE ANY BART
25 DIDN'T ANY TRANSIT IT WAS A DRIVE-BY SHOOTING. WE UNDERSTAND



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THE CHALLENGES WE NEED TO GET BETTER BUT THERE IS AN ELEMENT
2 OF THE RIDERS THAT WE SERVE IN THE AREA THAT'S PART OF THAT.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** FINAL QUESTION FOR YOU BUSINESSES WITHIN THE
5 STATIONS LOST OPPORTUNITY AT THIS POINT IN TIME AND WE'RE
6 TALKING WITH WORKING WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO AID IN THOSE
7 ENDEAVORS AS EASY AS BRINGING IN A SEES CANDY CART. I'M NOT
8 ASKING FOR INSTITUTIONAL OR INFRASTRUCTURE CHANGES HERE BUT
9 LONG OVERDUE AS TO IMPROVING THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. AND, SO,
10 I LOOK FORWARD TO TALKING TO YOU. AND LET'S GET MOVING IN THE
11 RIGHT DIRECTION THERE. IT IS LOST REVENUE, WHICH YOU CAN LEAST
12 AFFORD AT THIS POINT IN TIME. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO THAT
13 DISCUSSION.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** NOTED. I DON'T WANT TO GET AHEAD OF MYSELF. WE OWE
16 THE BART BOARD UPDATE ON THE RETAIN STRATEGY IN DECEMBER.
17 WE'RE THINKING ABOUT IT AND IF YOU WANT TO SEE THE SEES CART
18 GET INTO THE STATION --

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** WHEN YOU TALK REGIONALLY IT DELAYS THINGS FOREVER
21 YOU SHOULD DO PILOT PROGRAMS LOCALLY WORKING WITH LOCAL
22 JURISDICTIONS IT'S QUICKER, FASTER, AND YOU WILL REAP THE
23 BENEFITS A LOT SOONER. YOU HAVE GOTTEN INTO TROUBLE IN THE
24 PAST JUST TRYING TO DO REGIONAL.

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
4 VERNACI, DID YOU HAVE YOUR LIGHT ON?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** IT WAS. IT WENT OFF ON ITS OWN, OR I
7 TOUCHED IT, EITHER ONE. IN ANY WAYS, YES NO QUESTIONS, REALLY
8 JUST COMMENTS. AS I WAS LISTENING TO THE PRESENTATION SAYS, I
9 THINK WE WOULD ALL AGREE WE HEARD YOU SAYING THAT THE
10 STANDARDIZATION THAT OUR STAFF HAS PRESENTED IS NOT A FAIR
11 REPRESENTATION IN YOUR OWN MIND SO I'M GLAD THAT YOU WILL
12 CONTINUE TO WORK WITH STAFF TO ADJUST THOSE NUMBERS SO WE HAVE
13 A TRUE PICTURE, BUT WHAT THE BOTTOM LINE IS. WE KNOW WE DON'T
14 HAVE THE FUNDING THAT THE AGENCIES NEED. AND ARE ASKING FOR.
15 BUT THAT BEING SAID, I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT CONVERSATION TO
16 CONTINUE ABOUT IS FINANCING TO GET THE RIDERSHIP BACK. AND AS
17 YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT, AND THE COMMISSIONER BEFORE ME JUST
18 ALLUDED TO AS YOU WERE SPEAKING, AND I WAS TRYING TO THINK
19 ABOUT WHAT DO WE DO, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CAME TO
20 MY MIND AS WELL, BECAUSE ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO BECOME MORE
21 EFFICIENT AND WORK TOGETHER IS GOING TO IMPROVE THE RIDER
22 EXPERIENCE AND SAVE US SOME DOLLARS. AND JUST A COMMENT, OFF
23 TOPIC A HAIR, AS FAR AS BART GOES AND THE RIDERSHIP AND SAFETY
24 AND WHAT HAVE YOU, I RIDE BART TO MY ALAMEDA CTC MEETINGS AS
25 WELL AS TO MY MTC MEETINGS. SO, LAST WEEK GOING UP TO ALAMEDA



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 CTC, THERE WAS A PERSON ON THE TRAIN THAT WAS APPEARING TO BE
2 IN SOME KIND OF CRISIS, JUST SCREAMING ON THE PHONE AND MAKE
3 EVERYBODY FEEL VERY UNCOMFORTABLE, AND WHEN I GOT TO MY
4 ALAMEDA CTC MEETING, I DID ASK MY COLLEAGUE, A BART DIRECTOR,
5 WHAT TO DO. I WASN'T SURE WHAT TO DO, WHERE TO CALL, OR WHAT
6 YOU HAVE. SO SHE REMINDED ME, AND I DOWNLOADED IT IMMEDIATELY,
7 THAT BART DOES HAVE THE BART WATCH APP, SO THAT YOU CAN JUST
8 BE ON YOUR PHONE RIGHT THEN AND GIVE THEM THE TRAIN NUMBER AND
9 EVERYTHING ELSE TO HELP TAKE CARE OF THOSE SITUATIONS. SO, I
10 THINK THAT GOES A LONG WAY FOR SAFETY. BECAUSE IT WAS A FAIRLY
11 FULL CAR, AND ALL OF US STARTED JUST LOOKING AROUND AT EACH
12 OTHER, I THINK ALL THINKING THE SAME THING, WHAT DO WE DO. SO
13 I'M JUST USING THIS AS A COMMERCIAL TO REMIND FOLKS THAT THERE
14 IS THE BART WATCH APP TO USE, BECAUSE IT WOULD HAVE HELPED
15 THAT EXPERIENCE BE A LITTLE BIT MORE PLEASANT. BUT THAT BEING
16 SAID, I DO APPRECIATE STAFF'S HARD WORK AND THE TIME SPENT BY
17 THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES TO COME AND LET US HEAR FROM YOU
18 DIRECTLY. SO, THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
21 FLEMING?

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER
24 DUTRA-VERNACI. AND I WOULD JUST ADD TO THAT POINT, I HOPE WITH
25 BART WATCH, THAT THEY'RE CONNECTED TO, WHAT WE HAVE IN SONOMA



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 COUNTY, A MOBILE RESPONSE TEAM OR SOME OTHER MENTAL HEALTH,
2 AND I KNOW SAN FRANCISCO HAS A CRISIS TEAM AS WELL, EACH
3 THOUGH IT'S NOT EVERYTHING IS A LAW-ENFORCEMENT RESPONSE TO A
4 MENTAL HEALTH CRISIS, I THINK THAT MAKES EVERYBODY FEEL SAFER
5 WHEN THEY UNDERSTAND IT'S A MEDICAL ISSUE, AS WELL. I WANTED
6 TO ADD, THIS IS JUST A COMPLIMENT REALLY, AND AN OBSERVATION.
7 IT WAS MENTIONED BY THE DIRECTOR OF GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE. I'M IN
8 SANTA ROSA BUT A FEW OCCASIONS I HAD TO BE IN SAN FRANCISCO,
9 AND I RODE FULTON FIVE, AND YOUR BUS WAS IMPECCABLY CLEAN,
10 EASY TO USE WITH MY CLIPPER. MY DAUGHTER LOVED IT. IT WAS
11 EFFICIENT, FAST, IT WAS THE EASIEST WAY TO GET AROUND, AND
12 NOBODY BUT ME PAID. NOT NOBODY. BUT IT WAS RARE FOR -- I MEAN,
13 I WAS ON THIS FOR QUITE A WHILE, AND I SAW VERY FEW PEOPLE
14 PAY. SO I JUST WANT TO POINT OUT THAT YOU ALL ARE KNOCKING IT
15 OUT OF THE PARK. I WENT TO DINNER LATER THAT NIGHT WITH
16 FRIENDS OF FRIEND WHO LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO WHO RIDE THE BUS
17 ALL THE TIME AND THEY TALKED ABOUT NOT PAYING. THESE ARE
18 PEOPLE WHO ARE MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES, WHO ARE CIVICALLY MINDED,
19 WHO ARE SOCIAL WORKERS, WHO WORK IN CORRECTIONS, WORK IN
20 SCHOOLS, AND THEY TALK ABOUT THE RELIEF OF GETTING A TICKET
21 AND PAYING IT BECAUSE THEY KNEW THEY NEEDED TO BUT IT'S
22 SOMETHING NOT BEING ENFORCED REGULARLY. I WANT TO THANK YOU
23 FOR ALL YOUR EFFORTS TO MAKE THE SYSTEM SOMETHING I CAN'T WAIT
24 TO RIDE AGAIN, AND TO LET YOU KNOW THAT PEOPLE NEED TO BE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 COMPELLED IN SOME WAY TO COMPENSATE YOU FOR THE GREAT WORK
2 YOU'RE DOING. SO, THANK YOU.

3

4 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** IF I MAY ADDRESS THAT. WE UNDERSTAND THE
5 IMPORTANCE OF ALL OUR PASSENGERS PAYING AND WE KEEP CAREFUL
6 TRACK OF COMPLIANCE DATA. SOMETHING HOWEVER I WANT TO MAKE
7 SURE EVERYONE UNDERSTANDS IS SAN FRANCISCO'S RIDERSHIP GROWTH
8 HAS BEEN LARGELY THROUGH OUR SPECIAL PASS PROGRAMS, WHICH THE
9 CURRENT VERSION OF CLIPPER DOES NOT ACCOMMODATE. SO, UNIQUELY,
10 ON MUNI, WE HAVE HAD TO DEVELOP OUR OWN APP IN ORDER TO OFFER
11 OUR SPECIAL PASS PROGRAMS. AND FOR ANY EVENT AT CHASE OR ANY
12 MAJOR CONCERT IN GOLDEN GATE PARK, FOR STUDENTS AT USF AND
13 OTHER PROGRAMS, THEY DO NOT NEED TO TAG. IF THEY'RE
14 TRANSFERRING YOU DO NOT NEED TO TAG. MOST CUSTOMERS DO NOT
15 ACTUALLY NEED TO TAG THEIR CLIPPER CARD. JUST BECAUSE SOMEBODY
16 IS NOT TAGGING IT DOESN'T MEAN THEY'RE NOT PAYING. THAT SAID,
17 WE DO KNOW BECAUSE WE TRACK IT DIFFERENCE BETWEEN REVENUE AND
18 RIDERSHIP AND ARE EXPANDING OUR TRANSIT FARE INSPECTOR PROGRAM
19 TO MAKE SURE WE OPTIMIZE THAT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT.

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** SO YOU'RE TELLING ME BECAUSE I WAS AT A
22 CONCERT IN GOLDEN GATE PARK, I DIDN'T NEED TO PAY.

23

24 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** IF YOU ARE GOING TO OUTSIDE LANDS --

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HARDEN PARK IS FREE?

2

3 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HARDEN PARK IS NOT FREE. THEY DIDN'T WRITE THE
4 BIG CHECK. BUT FOR OUTSIDE LANDS WE STRUCK A DEAL WITH ANOTHER
5 PLANET THAT OUTSIDE LANDS WRISTBAND IS AN ALL DAY MUNI PASS,
6 PAID FOR THROUGH YOUR TICKET. IF YOU GO TO A GAME AT CHASE,
7 YOUR TICKET TO THE GAME THAT'S YOUR MUNI TICKET.

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** UNDERSTOOD. THAT'S HELPFUL INFORMATION. I
10 IMAGINED WITH A CONCERT LIKE THAT, WHERE THEY'RE NOT
11 ACCOMMODATING YOU YOU'RE GOING TO GET UPTICK ON PEOPLE NOT
12 ACCUSTOMED TO PAYING THE RIDERSHIP OF THINGS.

13

14 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THAT'S RIGHT. WE KNOW WE NEED TO MOVE THE
15 NEEDLE ON THAT. THERE ARE RUMORS OUT THERE THAT THEY'RE NOT
16 TAGGING AND NOT PAYING, AND I WANTED TO MAKE SURE WE CORRECT
17 THAT FOR THE RECORD.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** FOR THE RECORD, LET IT STAND. THANK YOU. [
20 LAUGHTER]

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AND THANK YOU FOR PAYING. [
23 LAUGHTER] COMMISSIONER -- [LAUGHTER] -- COMMISSIONER ABE-
24 KOGA?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. THANK YOU VERY MUCH
2 FOR THE PRESENTATIONS BY STAFF AND THE OPERATORS. I HAVE A FEW
3 QUESTIONS. I'LL TRY TO KEEP IT SHORT. AND THE ANSWERS DON'T
4 HAVE TO BE TODAY, YOU CAN FOLLOW UP LATER, IS FINE. I WAS
5 LISTENING TO THE OPERATOR'S PRESENTATIONS, AND I DON'T KNOW IF
6 ANYONE CAN ANSWER THIS, BUT I HEARD SOME OPERATORS TALK ABOUT
7 OFFICE COMMUTES ARE ACKNOWLEDGE BACK. AND ARE THESE NUMBERS
8 BASED ON THAT? OR ARE THEY BASED ON WHAT I KEEP READING AND
9 HEARING ABOUT A 30% REDUCTION IN COMMUTES?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SURE.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK THE SERVICE LEVELS, IF YOU ARE
16 SPEAKING TO THE STANDARDIZE NEED NUMBERS ARE BASED ON HOLDING
17 SERVICE LEVELS AT FY '22 LEVELS -- SORRY -- I SHOULD HAVE LET
18 HER ANSWER -- BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT THE STATE BUDGET
19 REQUIREMENTS SAY. BUT IN TERMS OF OFFICE -- RETURN TO WORK,
20 THE RIDERSHIP NUMBERS ARE NOT STANDARDIZED, BECAUSE WE DO
21 RECOGNIZE THAT EACH SYSTEM FACES DIFFERENT CONSTRAINTS.
22 THERESE SAID A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT AND THAT'S SOMETHING
23 WE'LL BE MONITORING IN TERMS OF -- SO, I THINK OPERATORS HAVE
24 MADE DIFFERENT ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HOW MUCH THEY THINK PEOPLE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ARE RETURNING TO THE OFFICE. I'M NOT SURE IF THAT ANSWERS YOUR
2 QUESTION. BUT WE CAN TAKE MORE OFFLINE.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES. MY QUESTION REALLY WAS THAT IF ANYONE
5 IS THINKING THAT OFFICE COMMUTES ARE GOING TO RETURN, I DON'T
6 THINK WE SHOULD BE THINKING THAT ANYMORE. THE WORLD IS
7 CHANGING. SO, I HOPE THAT THESE NUMBERS ARE BASED ON SOME KIND
8 OF ASSUMPTION? I DON'T KNOW WHAT NA IS. I'M HEARING 30%, BUT
9 SOME REDUCTION IN OFFICE COMMUTE IS HAPPENING. SO, I HEAR IT,
10 IT SOUND -- YOU KNOW, PROMISING THAT WE'RE SHIFTING THE
11 SERVICE LEVELS TO MORE NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICE, OR, YOU KNOW,
12 WEEKEND, THAT KIND OF -- THAT MAKES ALTHOUGH OF SENSE TO ME,
13 BUT I DID HEAR SOMEONE SAY, YOU KNOW, RETURN OF OFFICE
14 COMMUTES, AND I JUST DON'T THINK THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN. SO I
15 DON'T WANT US TO HAVE THAT ASSUMPTION -- DON'T USE THAT AS AN
16 ASSUMPTION. SO THAT WAS, I GUESS, COMMENT QUESTION.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SHOULD WE ASK THE GENERAL MANAGERS
19 IF THEY WANT TO TALK ABOUT THEIR PARTICULAR PROJECTIONS?

20

21 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I WILL START SINCE I'M ALSO HEAD OF THE SFMTA.
22 WE ARE VERY CLEAR THAT WHAT HAPPENED DURING COVID HAS MADE
23 RATHER PERMANENT CHANGES IN MUTE PATTERNS IN OFFICE. HOWEVER
24 IN SAN FRANCISCO THERE IS NO SCENARIO IN WHICH MILLIONS OF
25 SQUARE FEET OF DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO OFFICE SPACE JUST SITS



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 EMPTY. SO WHILE INDIVIDUAL COMPANIES, THE TOTAL NUMBER OF
2 COMMUTERS MAY BE SIGNIFICANT HE LOWER THAN IT WAS IN 2018,
3 WHAT THOSE COMPANIES ARE DOING IS DRAMATICALLY SHRINKING THEIR
4 FOOTPRINTS IN THEIR OFFICE LEASES. THAT IN TURN IS PRODUCING
5 60 TO 80% REDUCTION IN COMMERCIAL RENTS. WHAT THAT IS THEN
6 DOING IS SPARKING A NEW FRENZY OF PEOPLE WHO WERE PUSHED OUT
7 OF DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO IN THE LAST TWO ECONOMIC CYCLES
8 COMING BACK INTO THE CITY. SO WHILE WORK-FROM-HOME IS A
9 PERMANENT THING, THE IMPACT OF IT IS A DRAMATIC CHANGE IN WHO
10 IS LEASING SPACE. WE KNOW THAT THE VOLUME OF SPACE IS
11 SIGNIFICANT. AND, SO, IT WILL TAKE AT LEAST ONE FULL ECONOMIC
12 CYCLE, AND POTENTIALLY TWO UNDER OUR CURRENT ESTIMATES FOR ALL
13 THAT SPACE TO BE RELEASED. WHICH IS WHY WE ARE WATCHING THE
14 NUMBERS VERY CAREFULLY IN ORDER TO UNDERSTAND WHAT IS THE
15 TIMELINE FOR REOCCUPATION OF ALL THAT SPACE, AND THEN, WHAT IN
16 TURN DOES THAT HAVE IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP IMPACT.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SO THEN THE OTHER CHANGE THAT SEEMS TO BE
19 HAPPENING, AS THE POTENTIAL CONVERSION OF OFFICE OR COMMERCIAL
20 TO HOUSING, WHICH IS WHERE WE WEAR OUR OTHER HAT, WE WANT --
21 SO IS THAT BEING MONITORED AND FACTORED IN.

22

23 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YES BUT ALSO GENERATING RIDERSHIP IN A
24 DIFFERENT WAY. AS WE'RE WATCHING CAREFULLY THE PROCESS WILL BE
25 SLOW BECAUSE OF EXPENSE INVOLVED NO CONVERSION. WE AT SPUR



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 HAVE LOOKED VERY CAREFULLY HAVE LOOKED AT WHAT ARE THE
2 BUILDINGS THAT ARE SUSCEPTIBLE TO THAT KIND OF CONVERSION AND
3 THERE IS NOT AS MUCH IN A CITY THAT HAS SUCH A LARGE VOLUME OF
4 BIG FLOOR PLAY OFFICE THAT WAS DEVELOPED IN THE '80s.

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WHILE YOU'RE UP HERE, CAN
7 I ASK, LOOKING AT THE FIVE-YEAR FINANCIAL OUTLOOK, WHAT IS THE
8 CAUSE FOR THE -- IT LOOKS LIKE '25, '26, YOU HAVE A LARGE DROP
9 AND THEN IT DOESN'T ACTUALLY COME -- IN REVENUE, AND IT
10 DOESN'T COME BACK, AT LEAST ON THIS CHART.

11

12 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YEAH. THAT'S RIGHT. THAT IS OUR FISCAL CLIFF
13 BEING PUSHED OUT JUST OVER A YEAR.

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SO IT'S A LOSS OF FEDERAL FUNDING IN '25,
16 '26?

17

18 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** FEDERAL FUNDING DRIES UP NEXT YEAR, WHAT THE
19 NEW MONEY FROM THE STATE DOES IS REFRESHES THAT PUSHING OUT
20 OUR FISCAL -- WHAT WE'RE ACTUALLY CALLING A FISCAL TROUGH INTO
21 CALENDAR YEAR '26. SO, OUR PRESUMPTION IS THAT WE CLOSE THE
22 REMAINING GAP AT THE BALLOT IN NOVEMBER OF 2026, AND SO WHEN
23 WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS ADDITIONAL FUND TO CLOSE THAT LAST
24 REMAINING YEAR OF GAP, SO THAT WE DON'T HAVE TO CUT MUNI
25 SERVICE IN ORDER TO BALANCE OUR BOOKS.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANOTHER QUESTION/COMMENT
3 THAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN REMINDED ME OF, THAT I THINK WE'RE
4 LOOKING FOR -- THANK YOU MR. TUMLIN -- EXCITED ABOUT THE SUPER
5 BOWL WORLD CUP COMING IN 2026, I'M ASSUMING FOLKS ARE PLANNING
6 FOR THAT BECAUSE THAT COULD BE OPPORTUNITY FOR RIDERSHIP AND
7 REVENUE INCREASE, WOULD LOVE TO HEAR ABOUT SOME PLANS ON THAT
8 AT SOME POINT. AND THE OTHER ONE -- I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT --
9 WE TALKED ABOUT NETWORK MANAGEMENT, AND ONE OF THE INITIATIVES
10 IS FARE INTEGRATION. AND I GUESS I HAVE BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT
11 THAT. BECAUSE, GIVEN THE DIFFERENCES IN FARES, THERE SEEMS TO
12 BE A POTENTIAL NEED TO CLOSE A GAP OF, YOU KNOW, OF SOME
13 OPERATORS CHANGING MORE THAN OTHERS ARE IN LIGHT OF WHAT WE'RE
14 DOING, WHAT'S HAPPENING, ARE WE REVISITING THAT ISSUE?
15 PERSONALLY, I DON'T THINK IT'S REALLY -- IT'S PROBABLY
16 CONTROVERSIAL TO SAY, I DON'T THINK IT'S NECESSARY TO DO IN
17 LIGHT OF WHAT I HAVE SEEN IN MY TRIP TO JAPAN, FOR INSTANCE.
18 [LAUGHTER] BUT SINCE WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH THIS, ARE WE
19 REVISITING THE IDEA OF FARE INTEGRATION? BECAUSE IT DOESN'T
20 SEEM TO MAKE A LOT OF SENSE TO ME. BECAUSE IT SOUNDED LIKE
21 THAT WAS ALSO GOING TO NEED ANOTHER SOURCE OF REVENUE TO MAKE
22 IT HAPPEN.

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? WE DID GIVE A BRIEFING TO
25 THE FRIDAY COMMITTEES LAST MONTH TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. I THINK AT THIS STAGE, YOU KNOW, WE
2 THINK THAT SOME OF THE PILOTS AND POLICIES AROUND FARE
3 INTEGRATION SHOW A LOT OF POTENTIAL TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP
4 WHICH BOTH CAN HELP WITH GENERATING MORE FARE REVENUE, BUT
5 ALSO, OBVIOUSLY IMPORTANTLY MEET OUR CLIMATE GOALS. THE
6 CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT HAS SHOWN A LOT OF, YOU KNOW,
7 SIGNIFICANT POTENTIAL THERE. WE ALSO ARE LOOKING AT MOVING
8 FORWARD WITH A FREE AND REDUCED FARE TRANSFER. SO, AGAIN, IF
9 WE ARE GROWING RIDERSHIP, AND IT'S POTENTIAL -- WE'RE
10 DEFINITELY LOOKING AT DOING THIS IN A REVENUE NEUTRAL WAY, IF
11 NOT REVENUE POSITIVE WAY OVER TIME, BUT WE'RE DOING PILOTS TO
12 KIND OF ASSESS THAT, THE EARLY DAYS SHOWS THAT PEOPLE LOVE IT
13 AND ARE ACTUALLY RIDING TRANSIT MORE. I THINK THOSE SORT OF
14 INTEGRATION OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE SAW THROUGH THE BUSINESS
15 CASE THAT WE WORKED WITH OPERATORS ON, I THINK WE WANT TO KEEP
16 MOVING ON THOSE. AND SINCE MR. TUMLIN IS HERE, HE IS VERY KEEN
17 ON US TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE GOOD PERFORMANCE METRICS ON THAT
18 AND WILL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE THAT TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AS
19 WELL AS YOU ALL AS POLICY MAKERS.

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I APPRECIATE THAT, BUT MY CONCERN IS WE'RE
22 STILL SUBSIDIZING RIDERSHIP WE'RE IN THIS FISCAL CLIFF
23 SITUATION THAT BECOMES AN ISSUE, AND THE PILOT COST MONEY WE
24 HAD TO PUT IN UP FRONT AND THAT'S MY CONCERN IS HOW LANGUAGE
25 BEER GOING TO HAVE TO SUBSIDIZE BEFORE WE START SEEING REVENUE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 PLUS. SO. AND SORRY, A COUPLE MORE QUESTIONS. AS WE TALKED
2 ABOUT POTENTIALLY SHIFTING REGIONAL FUNDS -- AND YOU COULD GET
3 BACK TO ME LATER -- BUT WHAT WOULD THE TRADE-OFFS BE? I ALSO
4 WANT TO BE SURE THAT WE HAVE EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF THE
5 FUNDS. I DEFINITELY UNDERSTAND THE NEED, BUT IN MY MIND I HAVE
6 BEEN QUESTIONING, WHAT ARE THE OPERATORS THAT ARE FINANCIALLY
7 SOLVENT RIGHT NOW, AND YOU KNOW, I'LL SAY WITH VTA, WHAT WE
8 HAVE DONE, WE HAVE HAD TO MAKE CUTS AND CHANGES TO STAY THAT
9 WAY, BUT WILL THIS FUNDING IF WE SHIFTED, BE AT THE EXPENSE OF
10 OTHER OPERATORS AND THEIR OPPORTUNITIES FOR CAPITAL
11 IMPROVEMENTS OR WHATEVER, SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS, DOWN THE ROAD?
12 SO, I WOULD LOVE TO GET MORE INFORMATION ON THAT BEFORE WE
13 MAKE THESE DECISIONS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN RESPOND. DO YOU WANT US TO RESPOND NOW
16 ON THAT QUESTION? OR?

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES IF YOU HAVE A QUICK ANSWER.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** QUICKLY BEFORE -- I WANT TO SAY
21 THANK YOU VERY MUCH MR. TUMLIN, I KNOW YOU HAVE AN IMPORTANT
22 MEETING TO GET TO, AND WE CAN MAKE SURE IF THERE ARE QUESTIONS
23 FROM OTHER COMMISSIONERS, WE'LL MAKE SURE YOU HAVE OPPORTUNITY
24 TO ANSWER THEM. I KNOW MR. MULLIGAN YOU NEED TO LEAVE SOON
25 TOO. JUST TRYING TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY GETS TO SPEAK.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THE CONTRIBUTION SPOKEN ABOUT IN THIS
3 PRESENTATION DOES CARRY SIGNIFICANT TRADE-OFFS I THINK THEY'RE
4 MOST OPPORTUNITY COSTS RELEVANT TO WHAT WE COULD BE SPENDING
5 FUND ON WHICH INCLUDES THINGS LIKE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR WHICH
6 WOULD DEFINITELY IMPACT OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND
7 ALSO, CITIES AND COUNTIES WHO ARE INTERESTED IN, YOU KNOW,
8 OBAG FUND FOR BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN IMPROVEMENTS. WE WOULD
9 BASICALLY BE TAKING THOSE FUNDS OUT OF PLAY SO WE WOULD BE
10 REDUCING THE POOL OF FUND THAT WE HAVE TO DISTRIBUTE TO THOSE
11 TRADITIONAL PROGRAMS.

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I WANT TO ADD ONE MORE
14 IMPORTANT POINT. YOU KNOW, WHEN I STARTED THIS ITEM, I THINK
15 IT WAS VERY IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT THE STATE DID PROVIDE \$1.1
16 BILLION TO THE REGION. WHAT WE FELT WAS REALLY IMPORTANT TO
17 CONTINUE OUR COMMITMENT TO OUR TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT
18 ARE MOVING FORWARD, IN BRIEFING SOME OF OUR BAY AREA
19 DELEGATION THEY'RE INTERESTED IN LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN ADDRESS
20 THE TRANSIT OPERATING. WE SEE THIS AS A PACKAGE WE'RE TRYING
21 TO ADVANCE TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS AS WELL AS SUPPORT THE
22 TRANSIT OPERATING NEEDS. I POINT THAT OUT BECAUSE THERE ARE
23 DIFFERENT NEEDS THROUGHOUT THE REGION SOME MORE CAPITAL IN
24 NATURE AND SOME MORE INTENSELY OPERATING IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE WHOLE PICTURE
2 BECAUSE THAT'S IMPORTANT AS WELL.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
7 RABBITT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANKS TO STAFF FOR THE
10 WORK. I APPRECIATE IT. AND APPRECIATE THE OPERATORS BEING HERE
11 AS WELL, AND THANK YOU FOR BEING NIMBLE IN THESE UNCHARTERED
12 TIMES WE'RE IN. I KNOW I'M NOT ALONE UP HERE BUT MANY OF US
13 WEAR MANY DIFFERENT HATS. SONOMA COUNTY TRANSIT, SMART, AND I
14 AM ON THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HIGHWAY TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT.
15 THEY ACTUALLY MADE ME FINANCE CHAIR AT THE START OF THE
16 PANDEMIC. LUCKY ME, RIGHT? WHEN WE STARTED TO LOSE REVENUE. IT
17 WAS RIGHT WHEN THINGS STARTED PLUMMETING. I TOOK OVER ON THE
18 FINANCE CHAIR. THE WAY THE BRIDGE DISTRICT ALLOCATES REVENUE
19 WITH THE BRIDGE BEING PRIORITY, BUS AND FERRY OPERATIONS WERE
20 QUICKLY, FOR LACK OF A BETTER WORD, RIGHT SIZED, TO MEET
21 CUSTOMER DEMAND AND THE DISTRICT IS NOT IN THE HABIT AND HAS
22 NEVER BEEN IN THE HABIT OF RUNNING EMPTY BUSES OR BOATS
23 BECAUSE IT DOESN'T MAKE FINANCIAL SENSE. AND ALTHOUGH IN
24 HINDSIGHT, THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN RESULTED IN A BETTER
25 ALLOCATION TODAY, WHICH IS IRONIC. SO, I THINK, YOU KNOW, TO



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THE EXTENT POSSIBLE, I HOPE WE CAN WORK WITH THE CONFINES OF
2 SB125 TO NOT PENALIZE AN AGENCY FOR DOING THE FISCALLY PRUDENT
3 THING AT THE TIME. I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE TAKE
4 THAT TO HEART AS WE GO FORWARD. BECAUSE THERE'S JUST A
5 FAIRNESS AND EQUITY ISSUE WITH THAT, IN MY MIND. SO,
6 APPRECIATE THAT.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENT. I'M
9 GOING TO GO TO COMMISSIONER NOACK WHO HAS HAD A HAND UP FOR A
10 WHILE THEN COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** FOLLOW UP ON ONE OF THE SAFETY ISSUES. I LOVE THE
13 BART WATCH ON THE APP, BUT I HAD AN INCIDENT A COUPLE OF YEARS
14 AGO NOW, ON BART, AND NOBODY HAD THE APP ON THEIR PHONE. IT
15 HAPPENED ON THE TRAIN, AND THERE WAS NO PHONE NUMBERS. I SEE
16 NOT NEW CARS, THAT THERE IS VERY SMALL NUMBERS FOR EMERGENCY
17 CONTACT, BUT I WOULD SAY IN A PRIVATE BART TRAIN NOBODY IS
18 GOING SEE THOSE AND PEOPLE GETTING ON BART FROM THE AIRPORT
19 DON'T HAVE THE BART APP. SO WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO HAVE IT MORE
20 VISIBLE, A NUMBER, FOR PEOPLE TO CALL WHEN THERE IS AN
21 EMERGENCY ON THE BART TRAIN. I'M GOING MAKE THAT NO. I ENDED
22 UP HAVING TO CALL DEBRA ALAN ONE OF THE BART DIRECTORS WHEN WE
23 HAD THE EMERGENCY IN THE BART CAR THAT DAY. GOING BACK TO THE
24 OTHER ISSUES THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, THE ONE THING I THINK
25 WE NEED TO PAY ATTENTION TO, AND COMMISSIONER RABBITT



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 MENTIONED IT AS WELL, IS THE SMALLER OPERATORS BECAUSE THERE
2 IS SOME WATER FALL SCENARIO ON SOME OF THIS FISCAL CRISIS, AS
3 WELL. SOME OF THE BUS TRANSIT OPERATOR IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY
4 GET FEEDER FEES FROM BART AND THOSE, MY UNDERSTANDING IS, ARE
5 BEING CUT. YET THEY REPRESENT 25 AND 30% OF THOSE TRANSIT
6 OPERATORS' BUDGETS. IN LOOKING AT THIS, WE HAVE TO NOT JUST
7 LOOK AT THE BIG OPERATORS, BUT, ALSO THE SMALL OPERATORS. AND
8 IT MAY BE A SMALL THERE AMOUNT BUT IT CAN BE A SIGNIFICANT
9 AMOUNT OF BUDGET. SO I WANT MAKE SURE WE'RE KEEPING AN EYE ON
10 IT. I WANT TO THANK ALL THE OPERATORS IN THE PRESENTATION
11 THERE IS WORK GETTING DONE. I LOVE THE GATES, THE NEW GATES
12 COMING IN. I'M VERY EXCITED TO SEE THAT. I THINK THAT WILL
13 MAKE A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE, AND HOPEFULLY PEOPLE WILL FEEL
14 SAFER GETTING BACK TO TRANSIT. I LOOK FORWARD TO USING MUNI
15 AND SOME OF THE BUSS IN SAN FRANCISCO THAT I HAVEN'T HAD
16 OPPORTUNITY TO DO. SO, THANK YOU. AND THOSE ARE MY TWO POINTS
17 I WANTED TO BRING UP.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO YOU WANT TO
20 ADDRESS THE, SORT OF -- WELL, THERESA, DO YOU WANT TO TALK TO
21 TALK ABOUT SMALL OPERATORS AND SAFETY?

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES I WANT TO ADDRESS SMALL OPERATORS. STAFF
24 IS CURRENTLY WORKING TO REFINE THE SMALL OPERATOR SHORTFALL
25 NEED ACROSS THE REGION. WE WANTED TO START WITH THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 STANDARDIZATION METHODOLOGY KIND OF WITH A LIMITED GROUP WE
2 CAN D THAT WITH THE LARGE OPERATORS THEN EXPANDED THAT TO
3 SMALL OPERATORS WE HAVE GATHERED THAT INFORMATION WE HAVE A
4 PLACE HOLDER IN THE MATRIX THAT YOU SAW WE ANTICIPATE THE NEED
5 TO FALL WITHIN THAT, AND SECONDLY ON THE FEEDER SERVICE
6 OPERATORS, WE ARE DEFINITELY WORKING CLOSELY WITH THOSE
7 OPERATORS TO, HOPEFULLY, NEGOTIATE, YOU KNOW, A SATISFACTORY
8 OUTCOME FOR AT LEAST A COUPLE OF YEARS AND MY PREFERENCE IS
9 THERE IS A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT IS SUCCESSFUL, THAT FEEDER
10 SERVICE COULD BECOME MORE OPERATIONALIZED WITHIN THAT REVENUE,
11 AS OPPOSED TO HAVING THESE ONE-OFF AGREEMENTS BETWEEN
12 OPERATORS.

13

14 **SUE NOACK:** I THINK SOME OF THE FEEDER SYSTEMS, LIKE THE ONES
15 IN CONTRA COSTA HAVE RECOVERED 85%, AND STANDARDIZED GOING
16 BACK A YEAR TRYING TO MEET THE DEMAND AND A LOT OF IT BEING
17 FEEDING BART AND THAT CONCERNS ME AS WELL IS HOW THOSE THINGS
18 ARE INTEGRATED IF FEEDER SERVICE ARE CUT DOES THAT IMPACT BART
19 AND VICE-VERSA. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE KEEP AN EYE ON THAT.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU MICHAEL DO YOU WANT TO?
22 NO. CANEPA?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU THERESE AND YOUR STAFF THIS IS VERY
25 DIFFICULT WORK. MY QUESTION IS, AND I GUESS IT'S FOR THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 OPERATORS, YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT -- DO THEY REPORT
2 TO YOU QUARTERLY ON FINANCIALS? YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT
3 ABOUT -- AND THE RIDERSHIP, HOW DO THEY COMMUNICATE WITH YOU
4 AND YOUR TEAM? HOW ARE WE -- YOU KNOW, HOW ARE WE ASSESSING
5 AND EVALUATING?

6

7 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SO, RIDERSHIP IS SOMETHING OPERATORS DO HAVE
8 TO REPORT TO THE NATIONAL TRANSIT DATABASE SO WE DO HAVE
9 INFORMATION FROM THAT ON SEVERAL FACTORS. WE ALSO MEET ALMOST
10 WEEKLY WITH THE OPERATORS THROUGH OUR FORUM THAT WAS SET UP AT
11 THE TIME THAT THE PANDEMIC REALLY HIT. WE ARE IN CONSTANT
12 CONTACT WITH THAT, AND I THINK EXERCISES FROM THE FEDERAL
13 COVID RECEIVE TIMES TO NOW THE STATE BUDGET HAS US EVALUATING
14 OPERATOR FINANCES ON ALMOST A QUARTERLY BASIS I WOULD SAY. WE
15 HAVE BEEN IN CLOSE CONTACT SINCE THE PANDEMIC STARTED AND WE
16 INTEND TO CONTINUE THAT. WE WILL HAVE TO BE PUTTING
17 INFORMATION TOGETHER FOR THE SHORT RANGE TRANSIT PLAN THAT IS
18 GOING TO THE STATE. SO, WE'LL HAVE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AT
19 THAT TIME, AND WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THEM ON AN
20 ONGOING BASIS.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** ONE OF THE THINGS I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS, YOU
23 KNOW, WE'RE LOOKING AT DOING A BALLOT MEASURE IN 2026. IF WE
24 DON'T HAVE SUCCESS WITH THE BALLOT MEASURE, OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM
25 WILL BE DRAMATICALLY CHANGED. DO THEY RUN THROUGH SCENARIOS,



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 PLANNING? I WOULD REALLY JUST LIKE TO UNDERSTAND, IN A DEEPER
2 LEVEL, YOU KNOW, HOW TRANSIT WOULD OPERATE IF THEY DON'T
3 RECEIVE THE FUNDING. RIGHT NOW, MOVING FORWARD, WE DIDN'T GET
4 EVERYTHING WE WANTED FROM SACRAMENTO. WE DID GET SOMETHING
5 THAT STOPS A LITTLE BIT OF THE BLEEDING, BUT I'M JUST -- YOU
6 KNOW, CURIOUS IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, THE TRANSIT OPERATORS HOW
7 ARE THEY PLANNING? WHAT ARE THEY THINKING? DO WE HAVE ANY
8 INSIGHT INTO THAT?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. SO, OUR PERSPECTIVE IS
11 SPECIFICALLY WITH RAILROAD. IT'S A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF FIXED
12 COST. 70% OF OUR COST TO FIX. YOU KNOW, IT COSTS THE SAME
13 AMOUNT OF ELECTRICITY TO RUN A CAR WITH ZERO PASSENGERS AS
14 WITH 200 PASSENGERS. IF WE HAVE ZERO TRAINS WE STILL HAVE TO
15 MAINTAIN THE ASSETS THAT ARE IN THE FIVE COUNTY IN THE BAY
16 AREA. SO, DIRECTLY TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, WE ARE ALL IN LINE
17 WITH MTC AND OUR REGIONAL PARTNERS ON MAKING THIS REGIONAL
18 MEASURE SUCCESSFUL. IF THAT REGIONAL MANNER MEASURE IS NOT
19 SUCCESSFUL WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PIVOT AND TALK ABOUT THINGS
20 WE DON'T WANT TO TALK ABOUT MOST CANDID ANSWER I CAN GIVE
21 RIGHT NOW OUR EGGS ARE IN THE REGIONAL BASKET AND WE'RE TRYING
22 TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE SO WE CAN SUPPORT ADDITIONAL
23 FUNDING.

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** IN A DEEPER DIVE AS A COMMISSIONER, I KNOW
2 YOU'RE DIFFERENT -- EVERY OPERATOR MAY BE DIFFERENT IN HOW
3 THEY OPERATE, BUT REALLY AROUND UNDERSTANDING THAT IN GREATER
4 DEPTH WOULD BE HELPFUL. THERESA I WANT TO PIVOT HERE, WE
5 TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE OBAG FUNDING. YOU CAN TALK A
6 LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT? AND THEN, IS STAFF THINKING ABOUT, IS
7 THERE ANY FLEXIBILITY? AND WHAT IS THAT NUMBER, POTENTIALLY
8 LOOK LIKE? BECAUSE, LIKE, WHEN YOU SAY OBAG FUNDING, WHAT IS
9 THE REDUCTION IN OBAG FUNDING? IS THERE A REDUCTION?

10

11 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES IF WE WERE TO REDIRECT THE SPC, CMAQ
12 FUND, WE WOULD LIKELY TAKE THEM FROM A FUTURE YEAR ADVANCE
13 FUTURE YEARS WORTH FUNDING AND I THINK WE HAD APPROXIMATELY A
14 YEARS'S WORTH OF FUNDING ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM IS
15 TYPICALLY FOUR YEAR PROGRAM AND THOSE FUNDS ARE SPLIT BETWEEN
16 COUNTIES AND THE REGION SO YOU WOULD ESSENTIALLY REDUCED BY
17 25% IN THE NEXT OBAG CYCLE SO WE WOULD TAKE A YEAR'S WORTH OF
18 FUNDING AND PUT TOWARD THE TRANSIT OPERATING PROJECT.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** I UNDERSTAND WE'RE IN A DIRE SITUATION, TRYING
21 TO SEE OUTSIDE THOSE DOLLARS, AND FLEXIBILITY BECAUSE I GET
22 CONCERNED ABOUT INVESTMENTS IN INFRASTRUCTURE, IN MY
23 EXPERIENCE IN 15 YEARS AS AN ELECTED OFFICIAL, ONCE YOU FALL
24 BEHIND IT'S HARD TO CATCH UP. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND
25 FROM STAFF IS WHAT CREATIVE WAYS WE'RE LOOKING AT, MAYBE NOT



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 TO FUND IT AT 25%, BUT MAYBE THERE'S ADDITIONAL DOLLARS WE CAN
2 LOOK AT IN FUNDING SOMETHING. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S
3 IMPORTANT. I KNOW -- AND I'M GOING TO BE PAROCHIAL HERE, AND
4 I'LL CLOSE WITH THIS, WE HAVE A SITE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, THE
5 HOMELESS STEPH CURRY ATHERTON, AND SO WE HAVE REALLY BEEN
6 DEALING WITH A LOT OF ISSUES, YOU WOULD THINK THEY WOULD BE
7 ABLE TO FUND IT, BUT THE CITY, IRONICALLY IS DEPENDENT ON --
8 YEAH, IT'S A STORY FOR ANOTHER DAY, BUT IF WE COULD LOOK AT,
9 SORT OF, AREAS THAT ARE MAYBE PRIORITIZED IN THE COUNTY, AND
10 SEE WHAT WE CAN DO TO FUND IT. I DON'T KNOW. THE REASON I SAY
11 THAT IS BECAUSE I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. I KNOW THERE ARE OTHER
12 COLLEAGUES HERE THAT MIGHT HAVE PROJECTS, INFRASTRUCTURE
13 PROJECTS THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO THEM. SO, WITH THAT, THANK YOU
14 MR. PRESIDENT -- MR. CHAIR.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MR. PRESIDENT?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** [LAUGHTER]

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I LOVE IT. [LAUGHTER] COMMISSIONER
21 CHAVEZ?

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK --

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** JUST CLARIFICATION ON THAT LAST QUESTION THERE. IS
2 THIS FROM OBAG THREE OR FOUR THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT FUNDING TO
3 REDIRECT?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I'LL JUMP IN. THE CURRENT MENU THAT YOU HAVE
6 WOULD NOT DEPROGRAM ANY PROJECTS. IT WOULD BE LOOKING AT THE
7 NEXT CYCLE OF OBAG NOT THE CURRENT ONE WHICH HAS FUNDING FOR
8 MANY PROJECTS THAT NEED TO ADVANCE. AND I KNOW THE COUNTIES
9 AND JURISDICTIONS ARE WORKING VERY HARD ON THAT.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK -- SO, FUTURE, NOT CURRENT?

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** FUTURE, NOT CURRENT.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** SO I THINK WE'RE STILL WORRIED ABOUT THE
16 CONTINGENCY LIST.

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT'S RELATED TO THE CURRENT OBAG CYCLE.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK MY
23 COLLEAGUES FOR THEIR GOOD QUESTIONS. AND I WANT TO SAY TO
24 STAFF, I THINK AS OFTEN AS WE CAN HAVE THE OPERATORS PRESENT,
25 YOU KNOW, I THINK IS JUST REALLY CRITICAL. AND I THINK ALL OF



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 US UNDERSTAND, OR HOPE WE DO, THE BOARDS THAT WE SIT ON, BUT
2 UNDERSTAND THE BOARDS THAT WE DON'T SOMEWHAT LESS. I DO WANT
3 TO JUST ACKNOWLEDGE A COUPLE OF THINGS. ONE, I THINK THE
4 POINT, ALIX, THAT YOU RAISED ABOUT THE PACKAGE THAT'S REALLY
5 BEEN DEVELOPED HERE AND HOW LINKED IT IS, IN TERMS OF US
6 MAINTAINING PROGRESS, IN TERMS OF THE HEALTH AND VITALITY OF
7 THE SYSTEMS, AND YET MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE FUNDED IN A WAY
8 THAT ALLOWS US TO MOVE FORWARD, IS REALLY AN EXCELLENT POINT,
9 AND ONE THAT I'LL TRY TO KEEP IN MIND AS WE CONTINUE TO HAVE
10 THESE DISCUSSIONS. AND I ALSO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT, BECAUSE EACH.
11 BOARDS ARE SO DIFFERENT THAT ALL OF OUR BOARDS RESPONDED
12 DIFFERENTLY TO THE CRISIS. SOME REDUCE SERVICES, SOME INCREASE
13 SERVICES TO TRY TO RESPOND, SOME SHIFTED SERVICES. AND THAT --
14 THAT IT IS TRUE THAT BY CHOOSING ANY POINT IN TIME, WE WERE
15 GOING TO DISADVANTAGE SOME ORGANIZATION. AND SO FOR GOLDEN
16 GATE, YOU KNOW, TAKING THE LEADERSHIP OF BEING SO QUICK AND SO
17 RESPONSIVE ENDS UP BEING PROBLEMATIC. I THINK CALTRAIN IS
18 FEELING VERY. SAME WAY. SO ONE POINT I WOULD LIKE TO BRING UP
19 FOR ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES IS THAT, GIVEN HOW DYNAMIC THE
20 ECONOMY FEELS LIKE IT'S GOING TO STAY, THAT AS YOU ARE WALKING
21 US THROUGH THE FINAL PRODUCT, UNDERSTANDING THE PROCESS BY
22 WHICH REEXAMINATION WILL HAPPEN IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT.
23 BECAUSE I THINK YOU, THE STAFF OF MTC, WANT IT MAKE SURE YOU
24 HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY TO BE ABLE TO RESPOND TO THE EMERGING
25 CRISIS, AND I THINK THAT'S WHY YOU'RE BUILDING UP THE SAFETY



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ON THE 45 MILLION, AS AN EXAMPLE. AND I THINK THAT, IF, IN
2 FACT, WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE VOTERS IN 2025/2026, THAT WE
3 ALSO HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE REALLY THINKING ABOUT HOW
4 THE INVESTMENTS WE'RE MAKING IMPACT THE APPROACHES THAT WE'RE
5 GOING TO TAKE WITH THE VOTERS. AND THEN, SO, THAT IS ALL TO
6 SAY THAT IF WE COULD EXPLAIN HOW PROCESSES WILL BE EXAMINED,
7 AND, TWO, WHAT KINDS -- WHAT'S THE FRAMEWORK OF CHOICE THAT
8 WILL HAVE TO BE MADE DIFFERENT THAN TODAY WOULD BE IMPORTANT
9 FOR US TO UNDERSTAND AS A BOARD. APPROXIMATE THEN LASTLY, I
10 WOULD JUST SAY TO MY COLLEAGUES THAT, YOU KNOW, I HAVE BECOME
11 MORE AND MORE CONVINCED THAT IF WE WANT TO HAVE -- I ALWAYS
12 GET THE NAME WRONG OF THE NETWORK, OF THE NEXT NETWORK, OF THE
13 NEW --

14

15 **SPEAKER:** REGIONAL --

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THOUGHT YOU SAID ORIGINAL -- [LAUGHTER] A
18 LITTLE OG THROWING IN THAT. BUT IF WE ARE GOING TO MOVE IN
19 THAT DIRECTION, THAT -- THAT THE REALITY FOR US IS THAT WE'RE
20 GOING TO NEED THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO TAKE TRANSIT
21 MUCH MORE SERIOUSLY THAN THEY DO TODAY. AND IT'S GOT TO BE A
22 MUCH BIGGER PART OF THE BUDGET. AND ONE OF THE THINGS I
23 LEARNED, YOU KNOW, IN HANGING OUT WITH THIS BRILLIANT STAFF
24 THAT WE HAVE HERE IS HOW FEW LEGISLATIVE LEADERS ARE
25 PRIORITIZING TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS AT A



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 FEDERAL LEVEL, AND AT A STATE LEVEL. AND WE'RE BLESSED THAT
2 MANY OF THOSE ADVOCATES ARE FROM THIS REGION, BUT WE'RE GOING
3 TO HAVE TO THINK VERY, VERY DIFFERENTLY. BECAUSE I THINK, AS
4 COMMISSIONER CANEPA SAID, WHAT'S OUR BOTTOM LINE -- OUR BOTTOM
5 LINE IS THAT THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IF WE'RE GOING
6 TO DEAL WITH JOBS, CLIMATE CHANGE, AND EVEN AS WE THINK ABOUT
7 EMERGENCY OPERATIONS, THOSE INVESTMENTS ARE CRITICAL AND HAVE
8 BEEN IGNORED FOR A VERY LONG TIME, AND THE QUESTION IS, THIS
9 HAS TO CHANGED WHEN DO WE STOP GOING TO THE VOTERS AND GO BACK
10 TO THE WELL OF OUR OWN STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AND ASK
11 FOR THOSE CHANGES AND SOME REORGANIZATION. THAT IS A LONG WAY
12 OF SAYING THAT I HOPE, AS A BOARD THAT ONE OF THE BODIES OF
13 WORK IN ADDITION TO PREPARING FOR AN ELECTION, IS WE'RE ALSO
14 PREPARING FOR THE NEXT BIG FIGHT WHICH SHOULD BE THIS COMING
15 BUDGET CYCLE BECAUSE IF WE MISS IT WE'RE GOING TO CREATE MORE
16 SPACE FOR THAT TO BE IGNORED. ANYWAY, TO THE STAFF, IF WE'RE
17 GOING TO RESPOND TO THOSE QUESTIONS IN THE FINAL PRESENTATION
18 OF NOVEMBER, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, A COUPLE OF THOUGHTS THIS
21 IS RECOGNITION OF WHAT THIS ITEM IS, IN RESPONSE TO THE
22 REQUIREMENTS IN STATE LAW TO GET A SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN
23 TO THE STATE BY THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR. ON ONE OF THE
24 SLIDES WE SHOWED A TIME CLOCKS SAYING WE'LL BE READING AND
25 LOOKING AT ALL OF THESE. BECAUSE ONE THING FOR SURE IS THINGS



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 WILL CHANGE. SO, THERE ARE A LOT OF HARD CHOICES. WE WANT TO
2 MAKE SURE YOU'RE AWARE OF THOSE PRESSURES ARE. AND WE'LL BE
3 COMING BACK WITH WHAT KIND OF OPTIONS AND TRADE-OFFS WE HAVE
4 AS WE NEED THEM. AND AGREE 100% THAT WE ALSO NEED TO START
5 THINKING ABOUT OPTIONS THAT DON'T ASSUME A SUCCESSFUL REVENUE
6 MEASURE IN '26. AND, SO, THAT WILL BE WHAT WE'RE DOING. AND
7 HOPEFULLY WE WILL GET NETWORK MANAGEMENT IN REGIONAL
8 DISCUSSIONS. PART OF DISCUSSION IN THE NORTH BAY REQUIRES
9 LOOKING AT THE NORTH BAY DIFFERENTLY, AND THE SAME THING IS
10 TRUE IN THE EAST BAY IN TERMS OF ALL THE DIFFERENT OPERATORS
11 AND HOW WE CAN BE MORE EFFICIENT. SO WE EXPECT TO CONTINUE
12 HARD CONVERSATIONS IN THAT SPACE, AS WELL. AND WE WILL ALWAYS
13 BRING THOSE IDEAS AND OPTIONS FORWARD TO YOU FOR DISCUSSION
14 AND EVENTUAL DIRECTION. BUT THIS IS AN ACTION THAT'S REQUIRED
15 UNDER SB125. IT HAS TO BE DONE BY THE END OF THIS YEAR, AND
16 IT'S REALLY FOCUSED IN ON WHAT OUR COMMITMENT IS FOR THREE
17 YEARS. AND THEN IT IS ADJUSTABLE AS THE YEARS GO BY.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG, BUT AS WE MOVE FORWARD
22 HERE, AND I BELIEVE THE LEGISLATURE REALLY EMPHASIZED THE FACT
23 THAT THEY WANT ACCOUNTABILITY. AND I'M NOT SEEING THAT IN WHAT
24 WE APPEAR TO BE PRESENTING TO THE STATE. AND I THINK WE NEED
25 TO SOMEHOW BUILD THAT IN, IN ORDER TO REFLECT WHAT WE HEARD



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 FROM THE LEGISLATURE, IS THAT THEY JUST DON'T WANT STATUS QUO
2 HERE. SO, I JUST -- I'M STILL NOT SEEING THAT ASPECT OF IT,
3 AND I HOPE WE CAN BE A LOT CLEARER ON THAT GOING FORWARD SO
4 THAT THE STATE KNOWS THAT THERE IS A TRUE COMMITMENT HERE, AND
5 THIS IS IT. THIS IS WHAT'S HAPPENING IF THAT ACCOUNTABILITY IS
6 NOT THERE, WE'RE GOING TO LOOK BAD WHEN WE GO TO THE VOTERS
7 TOO.

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'LL LET ALIX ANSWER QUESTIONS IN DETAIL WE
10 AGREE WITH THAT AS WELL WE NEED TO BRING MORE INFORMATION
11 FORWARD ON ACCOUNTABILITY. I THINK YOU GOT A PREVIEW FROM SOME
12 OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS AND THE KINDS OF THINGS THEY'RE DOING
13 THE WORK PLAN FOR THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL IS
14 DESIGNED TO DEAL WITH BEING RESPONSIVE IN THAT SPACE.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I'M GOING TO WARN THAT MEETING WITH ONE ANOTHER
17 DOESN'T COUNT. [LAUGHTER] WE REALLY NEED RESULTS, BENCHMARKS,
18 AND WHEN THEY'RE GOING TO BE ACHIEVED. BECAUSE FOR DECADES WE
19 HAVE HAD MEETINGS. IT DOESN'T MEAN WE'RE GETTING ANYWHERE.

20 THANKS

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. REALLY ROBUST
23 DISCUSSION. AND, AGAIN, THANK YOU TO ALL THE TRANSIT OPERATORS
24 AND THEIR STAFF WHO CAME TODAY AND ALL THE OTHER WHO IS HAVE
25 BEEN WORKING ON THIS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT JUMPED OUT AT ME



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ABOUT THE PRESENTATION WAS THE MASSIVE EFFORTS THAT HAVE
2 ALREADY BEEN MADE BY OPERATORS TO RIGHT SIZE THEIR BUDGETS AND
3 TO IMPROVE THEIR SERVICE AND IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE.
4 THIS WAS THE FIRST TIME I HEARD THE NUMBER PUT TO THAT BUT
5 OVER TWO AND A HALF BILLED OF SAVINGS HAVE ALREADY BEEN MADE
6 BY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, WHICH IS JUST AN ENORMOUS NUMBER AND
7 PUTS INTO PERSPECTIVE HOW MUCH WORSE A SITUATION WE WOULD BE
8 IN IF THEY HADN'T ALL RESPONDED SO PROACTIVELY AND ALL THE
9 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THEIR OWN WAY AND WE HEARD FROM BART AND
10 MUNI TODAY THEY'RE MAKING INCREDIBLE EFFORTS TO IMPROVE
11 CUSTOMER SERVICE. AS I RIDE MUNI MUCH MORE FREQUENTLY THAN I
12 RIDE ANYTHING ELSE, AND IT'S ABSOLUTELY TRUE, YOU CAN SEE IT,
13 THAT'S ABSOLUTELY HOW PEOPLE ARE FEELING. IT ALSO REMINDS US,
14 THIS PRESENTATION, HOW MUCH MONEY WE NEED TO KEEP TRANSIT
15 SERVICE GOING AT LEVELS REDUCED IN 2022 LET ALONE LEVELS WHERE
16 WE NEED TO BE OVER TWO BILLED OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS OF
17 UNFUNDED NEED AND WE CAN'T TAKE OUR EYE OFF THE BALL EVEN WITH
18 THIS PLAN WE'RE GOING TO NEED EXTRA MONEY FROM THE STATE AND
19 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ SAYS, WE'RE
20 GOING TO NEED IT FROM DIFFERENT SOURCES. AND I WANT TO
21 APPLAUD, FOR INSTANCE, THE GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT DISTRICT FOR
22 CONTINUING TO RAISE TOLLS AND GENERATING MUCH NEEDED REVENUE
23 FOR THEIR DISTRICT THAT WAY. AND I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING
24 WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO ACKNOWLEDGE ABOUT THE FUTURE HERE. AND
25 I ALSO THOUGHT THAT COMMISSIONER CANEPA'S REQUEST WAS RIGHT ON



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ABOUT IT'S VERY -- IT CAN GET QUITE HEADY TO TALK ABOUT
2 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF SHORTFALLS. AND I THINK IT
3 WOULD BE HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT ACTUALLY MEANS IN
4 PRACTICE. YOU KNOW? WHAT ARE THE LINES -- HOW IS THAT GOING TO
5 TRANSLATE INTO SERVICE GETTING CUT AND KIDS NOT GETTING TO
6 SCHOOL AND TO PEOPLE NOT BEING ABLE TO GET TO THEIR JOBS OR
7 HOSPITALS. AND I THINK WE NEED TO -- I HOPE WE CAN KIND OF DO
8 THAT WORK NOW TO, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND THAT A LITTLE BIT BETTER
9 AND HELP US GIVE US THAT CONTEXT, BALLS KIND OF BUILD THAT IN
10 ON AN ONGOING BASIS SO WE'RE CONSTANTLY TRANSLATING THESE
11 NUMBERS INTO WHAT PEOPLE'S -- WHAT THE IMPACT WILL HAVE ON
12 PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITY. MY LAST POINT IS, I REALLY HOPE THAT
13 WE DON'T MOVE FORWARD WITH CUTTING STATE OF GOOD REPAIR
14 ALLOCATIONS TO FUND OPERATIONS. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT I HAVE
15 KIND OF BROUGHT UP BEFORE SEVERAL TIMES. I THINK WHAT WE HAVE
16 SEEN -- WHAT WE CONTINUE TO SEE HERE OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS,
17 BALLS EVERYWHERE ELSE IN THE COUNTRY, IS THE SURE FIRE WAY OF
18 MAKING SURE PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO COME BACK TO TRANSIT IS BY
19 NOT INVESTING IN STATE OF GOOD REPAIR WHICH MAKES TRANSIT LESS
20 RELIABLE, WHICH MAKES -- AND WHICH MAKES IT LESS FAST. AND I
21 KNOW THAT THE, SORT OF, THE FIRST LINE IN THE KIND OF HOW
22 WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE THE OPERATING SHORTFALL IS BY TAKING AWAY
23 FROM STATE OF GOOD REPAIR FUNDS AND I THINK THAT IS INCREDIBLY
24 SHORT-TERM THINKING AND RUNS VERY MUCH COUNTER TO THE GOALS OF
25 THE OVERALL EFFORT. AND, SO, I HOPE WE CAN KIND OF RETHINK



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 THAT. AND FIND A DIFFERENT WAY TO CLOSE THIS SHORTFALL. SO, I
2 THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE ENOUGH FOR THIS ITEM. WE HAVE HAD A
3 REALLY ROBUST DISCUSSION. THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR ALL THE
4 TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS, AND GENERAL --

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR, WE'LL NEED TO TAKE PUBLIC
7 COMMENT.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OH WE NEED IT TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT
10 FOR THIS. ABSOLUTELY.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH THAT, WE DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF
13 CORRESPOND THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA. IT WAS
14 SIGNED BY VARIOUS SIGNATURES. SO I WON'T READ ALL OF THEM.
15 I'LL MOVE ON TO OUR REMOTE -- OUR ZOOM. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD
16 YOU LIKE TO GIVE MR. CHAIR?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ONE MINUTE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE MINUTE. YOU GOT IT. THE FIRST SPEAKER,
21 LAST FOUR DIGITS ARE 0172. PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
22 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE AS SOON AS I ADJUST MY
23 CLOCK. HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MICHAEL SACKS, AND I AM A SAN FRANCISCO
3 RESIDENT, CAR OWNER, WALKER, TRANSIT RIDER, AND A BIKE RIDER
4 CALLING TO SAY IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT WE KEEP TRANSIT RUNNING FOR
5 PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON TRANSIT, FOR OUR CLIMATE GOALS AND OUR
6 REGION'S HOUSING GOALS. ALSO WE NEED MORE BUS LANES. WE NEED A
7 WAY TO BIKE AND WALK THE WESTERN SPAN OF THE BRIDGE WE NEED
8 MORE TRANSIT LINES AND MORE FREQUENT TRANSIT WE NEED DRIVEN
9 PRICING FOR BRIDGE TOLLS AND PARKING METER PRICES. WE NEED TO
10 BE MORE AGGRESSIVE WITH TRANSIT. IT'S FUNDING. YOU CAN FIX
11 THIS PROBLEM. I ENVISION A BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS THE
12 BEST IN NORTH AMERICA, AND FINALLY, BY BASELINING FISCAL YEAR
13 2022, MTC IS IGNORING ADDITIONAL SERVICE HOURS THAT HAVE BEEN
14 BROUGHT ONLINE IN RESPONSE TO TRANSIT GROWTH SINCE 2021 AND
15 2022. AND IT IS ARTIFICIALLY REPORTING SMALLER OPERATIONAL
16 SHORTFALL AND ACTUALLY THAT ACTUALLY EXIST.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS YOUR TIME. THANK YOU. THE NEXT
19 SPEAKER IS LAUREL PADGETT.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I'M LAUREL FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES. THIS SPRING WE
22 JOINED WITH ALL THE TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND AGENCIES WITH MTC IN
23 SACRAMENTO TO WIN THIS TRANSIT FUNDING WITH THE STATE TO
24 PREVENT THE FISCAL CLIFF AND TO ALLOW TRANSIT TO RECOVER AND
25 THIS PLAN DIFFERENT UNFORTUNATELY ACCOMPLISH THAT GOAL.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS RECOVERING; WE SEE IN THE DATA AND IN OUR
2 EXPERIENCES. BUT IN TRANSIT, THIS PROPOSAL WITH OTHER SMALL
3 FUNDINGS KIND OF PULLS THE RUG OUT FROM THAT RECOVERY BY
4 REDUCING SERVICE LEVELS BACK TO 2022, WHICH COULD BE
5 DEVASTATING TO RIDERS. WE ACKNOWLEDGE THE NEED FOR
6 STANDARDIZATION BUT MTC NEEDS TO DO THAT IN A WAY THAT TAKES
7 THE TRUE COST OF RUNNING SERVICE AND RETAINING AND HIRING
8 WORKERS INTO ACCOUNT. AS A PRINCIPLE UNDER FEDERAL RULES WE
9 NEED TO MAINTAIN OUR OPERATING SERVICE BEFORE EXPANSION AND
10 BEFORE PRIORITIZING EXPANDING BART WE NEED TO FIND NOW FUNDING
11 SOURCES FROM NON-TRANSIT SOURCES LIKE HIGHWAY SOURCES THAT CAN
12 BE SHIFTED TO TRANSIT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS AMY
15 THOMPSON FOLLOWED BY BOB ALAN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS AMY THOMPSON WITH TRANSFORM. I ECHO
18 COMMENTS OF LAUREL OF PUBLIC ADVOCATES. WE ARE ALSO ADVOCATING
19 FOR THE STATE FUNDING THIS YEAR AND WE'RE GRATEFUL TO MTC FOR
20 WORK BEING DONE TO UTILIZE ADDITIONAL FUND FOR TRANSIT
21 OPERATIONS. WE KNOW TRANSIT CUTS WILL LEAVE VULNERABLE LOW-
22 INCOME RIDERS AND FAMILIES ON THE CURVE AND WE APPRECIATE
23 AVOIDING SERVICE CUTS IS A TOP PRINCIPLE FOR THE FUNDING
24 ALLOCATION. WE ARE CONCERNED THAT REGIONALLY STANDARDIZED
25 SHORTFALL PRODUCTIONS HOLD TRANSIT AGENCY 2022 SERVICE LEVELS



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 WHICH IS 100,000 FEWER SERVICE HOURS THAN TODAY IT'S
2 IMPERATIVE THAT WE GIVE RIDERS A SYSTEM THEY CAN TRUST WE'RE
3 GOING TO VOTERS IN 2026 AND ASK THEY SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATION
4 IN THE MEANTIME WE NEED TO GIVE FREQUENT AND RELIABLE SERVICE.
5 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, AMY. NEXT UP IS BOB ALAN
8 FOLLOWED BY ANDREA HORBINSKI.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANKS COMMISSIONERS. I WANT TO ECHO AMY AND LAUREL'S
11 COMMENTS ABOUT WHAT WE NEED TO DO TO KEEP THE SYSTEM RUNNING
12 FOR THE RIDERS WHO DEPEND ON IT MOST BUT ALSO TO SEND A CLEAR
13 SIGNAL TO THE STATE THAT WE'RE GOING TO MAKE A REGIONAL
14 COMMITMENT AROUND TRANSIT OPERATIONS THAT GETS US A BRIDGE TO
15 REGIONAL MEASURES AND I HOPE WE CAN ADDRESS STATE AND BALANCES
16 IN TERMS OF TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING WE CAN'T DO THAT BY
17 BASING ASSUMPTIONS ON THE 2022 SERVICE LEVELS WE NEED TO WORK
18 TO FIGURE OUT A BETTER POINT IN TIME AND TO REGULATE THAT. I
19 DO THINK THIS PROPOSAL DOES INCLUDE SOME IMPORTANT SIGNALS TO
20 THE STATE THAT WE'RE GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION IN REFORMS
21 BUT IT DOESN'T IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING OVERALL. AND THEN THE
22 FINAL THING I WANT TO SAY IS I UNDERSTAND THE FRUSTRATION THAT
23 PEOPLE MAY HAVE WITH FARE EVASION. BUT, I WOULD ALSO SAY, IN
24 TREMENDOUS OF THE PROBLEM WE'RE FACING, IT'S ABOUT STRUCTURAL
25 IMBALANCE BETWEEN HIGHWAYS AND TRANSIT, WITHIN TRANSIT ITSELF



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET TO FIX THE SYSTEM BY FIXING FARE
2 EVASION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ANDREA HORBINSKI
5 FOLLOWED BY HOWARD WONG.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS ANDREA I AM A TRANSIT RIDER WHO LIVES
8 IN WEST CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. I RELY ON TRANSIT. I DON'T HAVE A
9 CAR. I NEVER V I WANT TO ECHO THE POINTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE
10 ALREADY AND ADD MY VOICE TO THEM PARTICULARLY ON THE NEED TO
11 BASE THE REPORTS ON FISCAL YEAR 2023, RATHER THAN 22, GIVEN
12 THE MASSIVE SERVICE INCREASES THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE PUT
13 IN PLACE WHICH HAVE BEEN GREAT, SHOUT OUT TO BART AND THE NEW
14 SCHEDULE. I ALSO WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT MTC NEEDS TO CONTINUE
15 TO LOOK FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING SOURCES BEYOND TRADITIONAL
16 PUBLIC AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FUNDS. WE NEED TO KEEP GOING
17 BACK TO THE STATE BEFORE THE 2026 BALLOT MEASURE TO PROVE TO
18 VOTERS THAT WE'RE DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN, AND THAT THE STATE
19 REALLY BELIEVES IN TRANSIT AND BELIEVES IN MEETING ITS CLIMATE
20 GOALS. AND, ALSO, TO SAY FINALLY THAT MTC NEEDS TO PROVIDE
21 NORMALIZE THE ESTIMATES IN LINE WITH SB125. SO, THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS HOWARD WONG.

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HOWARD WONG WITH POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, FOR GREATER
2 ACCOUNTABILITY MORE FORMAL COORDINATION COOPERATION NEEDS TO
3 EXIST BETWEEN NOT ONLY THE LEADERS OF THE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES
4 BUT ALSO THE 155 TRANSIT RELATED ORGANIZATIONS IN THE BAY
5 AREA. I THINK WE NEED TO CREATE A BAY AREA TRANSIT UNITED
6 NATION THAT CREATES A KIND OF SOCIAL COOPERATIVE GROUP THAT
7 CAN COMMUNICATE NOT ONLY WITHIN THE BAY AREA BUT OUTSIDE OTHER
8 CITIES AND COUNTRIES. I KNOW, LIKE SISTER CITY OR REGION
9 RELATIONSHIPS. THERE ALSO NEEDS TO BE MUCH MORE FINE GRAINED
10 COORDINATING TEAMS OF MAINTENANCE LINE OPERATORS, FINANCE,
11 PEOPLE WHO REALLY KNOW HOW THE SYSTEM WORKS AND RUN IT. AND
12 THEY SHOULD BE EMPOWERED TO REACH OUT TO OTHER CITIES AND
13 COUNTRIES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CYRUS HALL FOLLOWED
16 BY CODY VAUGHN.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS CYRUS, I LIVE
19 IN SAN FRANCISCO CALLING TO URGE MTC TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE
20 PLANNING AND REALLOCATION EVER REGIONAL FUNDS AND STATE MONEY
21 TO HELP OPERATORS MEET THEIR OPERATIONAL OBLIGATIONS. I CALL
22 MTC TO EXPAND THEIR FISCAL CLIFF PLANNING BY USING FY 2022
23 SERVICE HOUR BASELINES DEFICIT ADDS OPERATIONAL DEFICIT WHOLLY
24 INSUFFICIENT MTC UNTIL REQUIREMENTS OF SB125 GO ABOVE AND
25 BEYOND PRODUCING A PLAN THAT REPRESENTS THE REAL NEED OF THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 BAY AREA SUCH A PLAN SHOULD APPLY AS MTC STANDARDIZATION
2 PROCESS ACROSS AGENCIES THAT USE CURRENT AND FUTURE SERVICE
3 LEVELS PROJECTS AND IMPACTS OF LOSS IF WE FAIL TO FIND A
4 SOLUTION TO THIS CRISIS. ALSO URGE MTC TO CONTINUE WITH OTHER
5 TRANSIT FUNDING SOURCES EITHER PROJECTS IN THE PIPELINE OR VMT
6 ANALYSIS, EITHER NEUTRAL OR POSITIVE. COULD WE REALLOCATE
7 THOSE FOR TRANSIT? THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS CODY VAUGHN FOLLOWED BY
10 ADINA LEVIN.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS CODY VAUGHN. I AM A SAN FRANCISCO
17 RESIDENT. AND I AM A PASSIONATE, LIKE, TRANS-- PUBLIC
18 TRANSADVOCATE. AND I BELIEVE IN THE VITALITY OF OUR REGION AND
19 OUR COMMITMENT TO CLIMATE CHANGE GOALS AND OUR HOUSING
20 OBJECTIVES ARE INTRINSICALLY LINKED TO THE TRANSIT NETWORKS. I
21 URGE THE COMMISSION TO CONSIDER FUNDAMENTAL POINTS FIRSTLY
22 CONTINUING TO PRIORITIZE AND INVEST IN PUBLIC TRANSIT TO
23 ENSURE INVESTMENT IN OPERATION SECONDLY BASE STRATEGIES ON
24 STRATEGIES ON CURRENT DATA TO BOOST RIDERSHIP ALIGNING THE
25 UPCOMING REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURES IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT WE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ADDRESS THE ISSUE OF OPERATIONAL DEFICITS BUT SOME OF THE DATA
2 IS BASED ON OUTDATED FY 2022 SERVICE LEVELS, WHICH FAILS TO
3 ACCOUNT FOR THE RECENT SURGE IN RIDERSHIP IN SERVICE HOURS.
4 AND I JUST URGE YOU TO CONSIDER THAT. AND THANK YOU FOR ALL
5 THE WORK THAT YOU'RE DOING.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS A ADINA LEVIN,
8 FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN, POLICY
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL SPEAKING FOR MYSELF AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA
12 WANTING TO SUPPORT WHAT OTHERS HAVE SAID IN TERMS OF THANKING
13 MTC FOR WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES ON A STRATEGY TO KEEP
14 TRANSIT RUNNING AND URGE YOU TO WORK ON STRATEGIES THAT WILL
15 SUPPORT RATHER THAN GO IN THE OPPOSITE DIRECTION FOR
16 INITIATIVES TO REGROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. ON THE POINT OF
17 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE SUPPORTING EQUITY
18 GOALS, CLIMATE GOALS, HOUSING GOALS, AND THEREFORE, THE
19 STRATEGY OF THE REGION SHOULD BE SUPPORTING THOSE STRATEGIES
20 TO REGROW RIDERSHIP RATHER THAN HEADING BACKWARDS TOWARDS A
21 DEATH SPIRAL. AND ALSO URGING FINANCIAL STRATEGIES THAT WILL
22 HAVE A WINDOW THROUGH 2027 AFTER A POTENTIAL REGIONAL PUBLIC
23 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE. AND SEEKING ADDITIONAL SOURCES
24 OF FUNDING, INCLUDING HIGHWAY STATE SOURCE, FEDERAL SOURCES,
25 TO COMPLEMENT THE REGIONAL SELF-HELP PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME IS UP. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE
3 FOLLOWED BY AARON ECKHOUSE. AARON ECKHOUSE

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I'M VINAY PIMPLE, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, IN TERMS
6 OF ACCOUNTABILITY, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME KIND OF GOALS AND
7 TIMELINES ABOUT RIDERSHIP OR ABOUT PASSENGER MILES TRAVELED.
8 WITH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT, SO FAR, THE ONLY PROGRESS SEEMS
9 TO BE THE RENAMING OF COMMITTEES. I DON'T THINK THAT'S VERY
10 HELPFUL. WITH THE FISCAL ISSUE ABOUT THE DISPARATE,
11 PARTICULARLY IN FAIRNESS TO BART, AGENCIES THAT HAVE ALREADY
12 MADE CUTS BASELINES COULD BE MADE TO COMBINATION OF THE 2019-
13 2022 SERVICE LEVELS SO THAT IT'S NOT UNFAIR FOR THOSE WHO HAVE
14 BEEN PRUDENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS AARON ECKHOUSE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MY NAME IS AARON E FOR MYSELF PERSONALLY
19 HERE I HAVE LIVED CAR FREE IN THE BAY AREA FOR EIGHT YEARS NOW
20 DEPEND A LOT ON BART AND AC TRANSIT IN THAT TIME I WANT TO
21 CALL IN AND SAY HOW IMPORTANT FREQUENT AND RELIABLE TRANSIT
22 SERVICE IS TO ME AND I REALLY THINK IT'S -- I HOPE THAT WILL
23 BE A TOP PRIORITY FOR MTC ON THE POLICY DETAILS I AM SURE I
24 AGREE WITH ADINA. THANK YOU.

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** [LAUGHTER]

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS, MR.
6 CHAIR.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU TO EVERYBODY WHO CALLED
9 IN WHO ARE STRONG ADVOCATES FOR SECURING THIS MONEY FROM THE
10 STATE THAT'S GOING ALLOW US TO INVEST IN TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
11 7B? LET'S GO FOR IT.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL RIGHT. FOR AGENDA ITEM 7B MTC RESOLUTIONS
14 NUMBERS 4606, 4607, AND 4608, ALLOCATION OF 43.8 MILLION
15 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE CAPITAL FUND TO SONOMA COUNTY
16 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF MARIN,
17 AND SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. THE ITEM NO
18 YOUR PACKET PROVIDES UPDATE ON THE RECOMMENDED ALLOCATION
19 CONTINGENCIES OF RM3 CAPITAL FUNDS TO EVERYBODY I JUST SAID.
20 AND, AND -- LET ME SEE WHAT -- THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET -- I'M
21 SORRY. I'M GOING TO JUST -- FUND -- AND BASED ON SPECIFICITY
22 AROUND CONTINGENCY THAT SEEKS TO PROTECT RM3 INVESTMENT IN THE
23 EVENT THE PROPERTY IN QUESTION IS NOT USED FOR THE PROJECT.
24 STAFF ARE AVAILABLE FOR QUESTIONS. FIRST I'LL SEE IF THERE ARE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. IF NOT I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE
2 MTC RESOLUTION 4606, 4607 AND 4608.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN
5 SECONDED. NO COMMENTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE
8 PUBLIC. I DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE FROM ROLAND
9 LEBRUN THAT'S BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU TO ROLAND. ROLL CALL
12 VOTE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST BY CHAVEZ SECOND MAHAN. PEDROZA IS
15 ABSENT. JOSEFOWITZ?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

24

25 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS IS ABSENT.

15 NOACK?

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
7 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** COLLEAGUES, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE HARD WORK
10 THAT WENT INTO ITEMS 7A AND 7B, BY STAFF, AND I WANT TO SAY TO
11 MY COLLEAGUES THAT ALL OF US THAT ARE RECIPIENTS OF THIS MONEY
12 ARE GRATEFUL, AND FOR YOUR INGENUITY AND CREATIVITY
13 PARTICULARLY AT THIS CHALLENGING TIME TO KEEP THESE PROJECTS
14 GOING FORWARD, SO, THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** DITTO.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, JOINING MTC
19 PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE.
20 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HOPEFULLY THIS IS A LESS CONTROVERSIAL --

23

24 **SPEAKER:** [LAUGHTER]

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE
2 ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET OCTOBER 13TH AND REFERRED
3 ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. YOU KNOW, BEFORE I
4 MOVE THE RESOLUTION, I JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF. THERE HAS
5 BEEN A LOT OF CONTROVERSY ABOUT THIS ISSUE. THEY HAVE MADE A
6 LOT OF ADJUSTMENTS, MEETING SOME OF THE CONCERNS PEOPLE HAVE.
7 SO I THINK THE ACTION BEFORE US TODAY IS A VERY IMPORTANT
8 FIRST STEP, AND IT KIND OF REMINDS ME OF THE ONE WE ORIGINALLY
9 DID THE TLC PROGRAM THERE WAS A LOT OF PUSH BACK BUT AFTER
10 TIME PEOPLE SAID WHY HAVEN'T WE BEEN DOING THIS. SO, I THINK
11 THIS FALLS IN THAT SAME CATEGORY. SO, MTC RESOLUTION 4530
12 REVISED TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY REVISIONS AND
13 DISCUSSION ON COMPLIANCE IS AN AMENDMENT TO THE MTC RESOLUTION
14 4530 TO CLARIFY THE APPLICATION OF TLC POLICY ALLOCATIONS TO
15 CAPITAL FUNDING TO TRANSIT EXTENSION PROJECTS ADDS PART OF
16 THIS ITEM JOINT COMMITTEE HAD DISCUSSION ABOUT DEFINING
17 EXPECTATIONS FOR COMPLIANCE. STAFF WILL RETURN TO THE JOINT
18 COMMITTEE OVER THE UPCOMING MONTHS TO DISCUSS THESE AND OTHER
19 ISSUES IN MORE DETAIL. STAFF HAS COMMITTED TO HAVING
20 DISCUSSIONS ON THE POLICY REQUIREMENTS, AND HOW THEY INTERACT.
21 SO, I KNOW THERE ARE CONCERNS ABOUT PARKING, YOU KNOW, AND THE
22 DENSITY, AFFORDABILITY, THERE ARE MANY MORE BENEFITS. STAFF IS
23 GOING TO LOOK AT HOW WE CAN BALANCE THAT TO ACHIEVE THE
24 OBJECTIVES OF THIS POLICY. BASED ON THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION,
25 MR. CHAIRMAN, I WOULD MOVE MTC RESOLUTION 4530 REVISED TRANSIT



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ORIENTED COMMUNITY TLC POLICY REVISIONS AND DISCUSSION ON
2 COMPLIANCE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. SECONDED BY CANEPA. IS
7 THERE A STAFF PRESENTATION ON THIS?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** NO, THERE IS NOT.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** I HAVE A LIST OF QUESTIONS HERE. I BELIEVE, AS
14 COMMISSIONER SPERING NOTED, THERE ARE CONCERNS REGARDING THE
15 INTERCONNECTIVITY. IN OTHER WORDS, TRANSIT OPERATORS DON'T
16 NECESSARILY DO ZONING. SO, AFTER WE HAVE CONTEMPLATED THE
17 SUBSTANTIAL PORTION OF PLANNING WORK AND DETERMINED THE
18 LOCATIONS, I THINK THIS IS GOING TO IMPACT, SOMEWHAT,
19 DUMBARTON, AND WHAT HAPPENS THERE. SEEMS TO BE SOME OF THE
20 QUESTIONS ARE REALLY RELATED TO WILL THESE TRANSIT PROJECTS BE
21 UPHELD OR FUNDING QUESTIONABLE? YOU HAVE MULTIPLE LOCAL
22 JURISDICTIONS MOST OF WHOM I THINK THE GENERAL PLANS HAVE
23 ALREADY BEEN DEFINED, BUT IF THINGS CHANGE OR THEY DIDN'T
24 QUITE MEET THE STANDARDS ESTABLISHED BY OUR TOD -- OR TOC NOW,
25 WHAT'S HAPPENING THERE?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS -- ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE
3 DIRECTOR. THIS ITEM MAKES CLARIFICATIONS ON HOW THIS POLICY
4 APPLIES TO TRANSIT EXTENSIONS BASED ON A LOT OF COMMENTS THAT
5 WE HAD. MOSTLY THOSE REFINEMENTS FOCUSED ON NEED FOR
6 COMPLIANCE ON PROJECTS THAT ARE ALREADY IN THE PIPELINE THIS
7 IS SOMETHING WE HEARD FROM YOU NOT ONLY WITH THIS POLICY BUT
8 ALSO I THINK THROUGH THE MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY ET
9 CETERA, THAT'S WHERE WE NEED TO FOCUS MORE ENERGY THAT'S ONE
10 OF THE THINGS THAT MAKES CLARIFICATIONS ON THAT. IT ALSO DOES
11 ALLOW PROJECTS AT DIFFERENT PHASES TO AT LEAST STATE THEIR
12 UNDERSTANDING THAT THERE IS SUCH A POLICY WHEN THEY'RE IN THE
13 VERY EARLIEST PHASES, WHEN THEY'RE KIND OF IN THE PROJECT
14 DEVELOPMENT RIGHT OF WAY, THAT THEY NEED TO TAKE STEPS TO
15 COMPLY. AND, SO, THAT'S, SORT OF, WHAT'S BEFORE YOU TODAY. I
16 THINK SEPARATELY, AND I THINK CHAIR -- PLANNING CHAIR SPERING
17 MENTIONED, IS THE COMMITMENT TO COME BACK AND CONTINUE TO WORK
18 ON THE ABSOLUTE COMPLIANCE, MIGHT NOT BE THE RIGHT APPROACH,
19 MORE 85% TO BE DEFINED LATER. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT ANSWERS
20 YOUR QUESTION. I'M SURE.

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL PLANNING WILL ADD
23 APPROPRIATE COMMENTS AS YOU SEE FIT.

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** BEFORE YOU TRY TO SPEAK, MATT, I MEAN WE HAVE TO
2 RECOGNIZE SOMETHING LIKE SAMTRANS HAS TO GO THROUGH MULTIPLE
3 JURISDICTIONS THERE NEEDS TO BE FLEXIBILITY BUILT IN.

4

5 **MATT MALONEY:** THE ACTION BEFORE YOU TODAY IS NARROW, THE
6 AMENDMENT, IT DOES DEAL WITH THE QUESTION OF TRANSIT
7 EXTENSIONS. DEPENDING WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE DUMBARTON
8 CORRIDOR, THERE ARE MANY THINGS CONTEMPLATED IN THE CORRIDOR
9 FOR MANY YEARS WE COULD POTENTIALLY LOOK AT THE TRANSIT
10 EXTENSION BUT IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO CONSIDER THE SCOPE,
11 WHERE TRANSIT EXTENSIONS ARE, IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND
12 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WHO HAVE LAND USE AUTHORITY IT'S NOT
13 DIRECTED TO TRANSIT OPERATORS WE KNOW THAT'S A PARTNERSHIP IN
14 TERMS OF HOW TRANSIT OPERATORS AND LOCALS DEAL WITH WHAT THOSE
15 STATION AREAS ARE. BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK AS WE'RE LOOKING
16 FORWARD AND EXTENDING TRANSIT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE
17 THOSE STATION AREAS THAT HAVE THOSE DENSITY THRESHOLDS, THE
18 SAME ONES THAT ARE IN THE PLAN AND THAT HAVE, SORT OF, THOSE
19 AFFORDABLE HOUSING POLICIES AND, SORT OF, EVERYTHING ELSE
20 THAT'S BUILT INTO THE TOC POLICY. SO KIND OF LOOKING AHEAD, WE
21 COMMIT TO WORKING WITH THE OPERATORS AND THE LOCALS ON THOSE
22 QUESTIONS. IT'S ALSO IMPORTANT THAT WHEN WE COME UP WITH, SORT
23 OF, NEW TRANSIT PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE GOT TO GET THOSE
24 IN PLANNED BAY AREA TOO. SO WHEN WE LOOK AT THE DUMBARTON
25 CORRIDOR THERE MIGHT BE SOMETHING IN THE PLAN TODAY THAT MIGHT



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 LOOK DIFFERENT THAN WHAT'S BEING TALKED ABOUT NOW. THERE ARE
2 STEPS WE HAVE TO GO THROUGH TO MAKE SURE IT GETS ON THAT
3 REGIONAL LIST SO WE CAN MOVE AHEAD.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** I HOPE WE TREAD LIGHTLY. THE GOALS ARE GREAT.
6 THEY'RE WONDERFUL. SOMETIMES IN ORDER TO MAKE ALL THE
7 TRANSPORTATION OPERATIONS WORK APPROPRIATELY, YOU KNOW, THE
8 DEVELOPMENTS MIGHT BE THERE AROUND, BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE
9 THAT WE ENHANCE ACCESS TO TRANSPORTATION WHILE WE'RE DOING ALL
10 THE HOUSING AND DEVELOPMENTS AND STUFF. AND YOU DO HAVE
11 CERTAIN SMALL JURISDICTIONS THAT NEED AN ECONOMIC BALANCE. SO,
12 JUST OUT OF FAIRNESS, I HOPE WE DO BUILD IN SOME FLEXIBILITY
13 SO THAT IT REALLY WORKS AND IS SUSTAINABLE MOVING INTO THE
14 FUTURE. AND IT SOUND LIKE THAT IS BEING STILL DISCUSSED. SO, I
15 APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? NO.
18 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. SORRY. I COULDN'T MATCH THE LIGHT TO
19 THE COMMISSIONER.

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. THANK
22 YOU, STAFF. I HAD A FEW QUESTIONS. I WENT BACK TO MY CITY
23 STAFF TO GET INPUT, AND I BELIEVE THEY WROTE A LETTER IN
24 SEPTEMBER, AND IT WAS ACKNOWLEDGED, BUT IT SOUND LIKE THERE'S
25 SOME OUTSTANDING ISSUES THAT STILL NEED TO BE WORKED OUT. AND



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 SO, I GUESS MY QUESTION IS, AND IT'S ACTUALLY ABOUT THE
2 TIMELINE, AND WHEN THESE DECISIONS ARE GOING TO BE MADE. AND
3 IT'S -- I UNDERSTAND TODAY, IT SOUND LIKE WE'RE DOING THE
4 TRANSIT EXTENSIONS, BUT AS COMMISSIONER SPERING MENTIONED, I
5 THINK THE AREAS OF CONCERN ARE PARKING MAXIMUM, MINIMUM
6 COMMERCIAL OFFICE DENSITY AND IN TERMS OF FLEXIBILITY, I WANT
7 CLEAR -- I HAVE SEEN THE 85% VERSUS, I THINK IT'S, LIKE,
8 PROJECT OR CITY BY CITY SPECIFIC. FLEXIBILITY? WHICH WAY ARE
9 WE GOING? YOU CAN CLARIFY THAT?

10

11 **MATT MALONEY:** SURE. MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL
12 PLANNING. AT THE JOINT PLANNING COMMITTEE, AGAIN, I WANT TO
13 DISTINGUISH, WE TOOK AT ACTION A SMALL AMENDMENT TO THE
14 RESOLUTION WHICH IS BEFORE YOU TODAY ABOUT TRANSIT EXTENSION
15 FUNDING. BUT WE HAD ROBUST DISCUSSION ABOUT THE DEFINITION OF
16 COMPLIANCE. AND YOU KNOW, KIND OF THAT 100% PERFECTION
17 STANDARD VERSUS A LITTLE MORE FLEXIBILITY. WHAT WE HAVE HEARD
18 FROM THE JOINT COMMITTEE IS, I THINK, AN URGE FOR MORE
19 FLEXIBILITY. WE ARE HEARD FROM THE CITIES THAT PARKING AND
20 COMMERCIAL DENSITIES ARE THE TWO AREAS THAT HAVE SEEN THE MOST
21 CHALLENGING TO ACHIEVE. AT THE LAST MEETING WE TALKED ABOUT
22 85% TYPE OF STANDARD WE'RE STILL WORKING ON THE METHODOLOGY
23 FOR THAT. AS I SAID BEFORE TODAY I'M NOT READY TO PRESENT THAT
24 EXACT METHODOLOGY FOR YOU IT'S MORE OF A PRINCIPLE THAT WE'RE
25 LOOKING TO APPLY. AND AGAIN AS CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED, WE'RE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 GOING TO BE COMING BACK TO THIS GROUP ON AN ONGOING BASIS TO
2 TALK MORE ABOUT THE METHODOLOGY AND WHAT THAT ALL MEANS.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, YES. DEFINITELY FOR
5 FLEXIBILITY, I JUST WANTED TO -- AND I MENTIONED THIS BEFORE,
6 BUT, I THINK -- YOU KNOW, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CONSIDER
7 THE -- THAT CITIES ARE NOT ALL THE SAME. THERE IS NO ONE SIZE
8 FITS ALL. I THINK, FRANKLY, TO BE HONEST, THE LARGEST CITIES
9 HAVE MORE RESOURCES TO BE ABLE TO WORK ON THESE TYPE OF
10 INITIATIVES THAN A CITY A SIZE LIKE OURS DOES NOT HAVE THAT.
11 AND I THINK THE SMALL CITIES GOT AN EXEMPTION FROM THE TOC,
12 WHICH IS, TO ME, A QUESTION -- FRANKLY, THE QUESTION OF, WELL,
13 WHY DO SOME CITIES GET EXEMPTIONS AND NOT OTHERS. BUT, I DO
14 HOPE THAT IN LIGHT OF THE FACT THAT MOST CITIES IN THE BAY
15 AREA, PROBABLY MORE ON THE MEDIUM SIZE RANGE IF THEY HAVE TO
16 FOLLOW THE TOC POLICIES THAT, THAT THAT'S TAKEN INTO
17 CONSIDERATION, AND AGAIN APPRECIATE IN TERMS OF CONSIDERATION
18 OF SMALLER CITIES LIKE OURS, AND DENSITY THAT, WHEN YOU ARE IN
19 JOBS RICH CITY LIKE OURS WE DON'T REALLY KNOW WE'RE ACTUALLY
20 BEING DISCOURAGED, MORE OFFICE DEVELOPMENT SO I HOPE THAT'S
21 TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT. IN TERMS OF TRANSIT EXTENSION, I GUESS IN
22 THE SCENARIO I WAS THINKING, LIKE CALTRAIN RUNS THROUGH
23 SEVERAL CITIES IS THE EXPECT ANTICIPATION THAT EVERY CITY ON
24 THE CALTRAIN LINE ADOPT A TOC POLICIES IN ORDER TO RECEIVE
25 FUND SOMETHING OR NOT?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **MATT MALONEY:** THE ITEM BEFORE YOU TODAY IS TO CLARIFY HOW WE
3 ADDRESS REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING THAT GOES TO TRANSIT
4 OPERATORS. SO, THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY. IN TERMS
5 OF A TRANSIT EXTENSION. SO, THAT'S THE AMENDMENT THAT'S NOT
6 TOC TODAY IS TO CLARIFY THAT KIND OF BASED UPON PROJECT PHASE.
7 IN TERMS OF, IN YOUR EXAMPLE OF ALL THE STATIONS ALONG THE
8 CALTRAIN LINE, IT'S A CORNERSTONE OF THE TOC POLICY THAT'S
9 BEEN ADOPTED THAT ALL OF THOSE STATION AREAS AROUND THE
10 REGION, AND THERE IS 360 OR SO, AREAS AROUND THE REGION,
11 EXISTING AREAS, THAT WE LOOK TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO WORK TO
12 COMPLY WITH THE POLICY, BY 2026. NOW, WHAT COMPLIANCE MEANS
13 WAS THE SUBJECT OF, SORT OF, THAT LAST THING I TALKED ABOUT
14 WITH THE PERFECTION STANDARD VERSUS THE 85% AND STAFF IS GOING
15 TO CONTINUE COMING BACK ON THAT, AND WE DON'T HAVE SUBMITTALS
16 FROM THE CITIES YET IN TERMS OF WHAT THIS LOOKS LIKE FOR THEM
17 OVER THE UPCOMING MONTHS AND YEARS WE'RE GOING TO COME BACK TO
18 THE COMMITTEES TO TALK ABOUT WHAT SUBMITTALS LOOK LIKE HOW
19 CITIES ARE WORKING TO COMPLY AND HOW FAR WE'RE GETTING WE
20 DON'T HAVE A LOT OF DATA YET WE WANT CITIES TO BE ABLE TO
21 ACHIEVE THIS POLICY AND WE THINK THEY CAN.

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** IN TERMS OF OUR CITY'S COMMENTS, WILL THEY
24 GET A RESPONSE?

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **MATT MALONEY:** IF YOUR CITIES ARE COMMENTING ON THE
2 ADMINISTRATIVE GUIDANCE, AND I THINK A LOT OF THEM ARE, WE
3 HAVE BEEN THROUGH SEVERAL ROUNDS OF MISTER GUIDANCE AND ARE
4 RESPONDING TO CITIES DIRECTLY ON THEIR FEEDBACK AND WE HAVE
5 MADE A LOT OF MODIFICATIONS AND AUGMENTATIONS TO THE
6 ADMINISTRATIVE GUIDANCE IN RESPONSE TO THOSE COMMENTS.

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
11 FLEMING.

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** MY QUESTION GOES IN THE OPPOSITE DIRECTION.
14 I HAVE GREAT RESPECT FOR THE CHALLENGES IN SMALL AND MEDIUM
15 SIZE CITIES. I REPRESENT ONE. BUT I'M CURIOUS TON WHAT IF ANY
16 CONCERN DOES STAFF HAVE, AND WHAT ARE ANY PLANS TO DO IF
17 JURISDICTIONS WILLFULLY AND KNOWINGLY TRY TO EVADE THESE
18 RULES. IT'S LIKE WHEN I ENTITLE A PROJECT AND I ASK A
19 DEVELOPER TO DO SOMETHING, HE -- IT'S ALWAYS A HE -- THAT'S
20 WHY I'M SAYING IT'S A HE -- HE ALWAYS SAYS SURE I'LL DO IT,
21 BUT IF HE DOESN'T DO IT, WHAT CAN I DO? I HAVE ALREADY
22 ENTITLED THE PROJECT. MY CONCERN IS IN THE LONG RUN CITIES ARE
23 GOING TO ACT IN GOOD FAITH BUT WE KNOW SOME CITIES ARE PRETTY
24 OPPOSED AND THERE IS NOT THE POLITICAL WILL TO DO THIS AND WE
25 WANT NOT TO HOLD UP THE WHOLE THING OUT OF CONCERN THAT SOME



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 ARE NOT GOING TO BE GOOD ACTORS. BUT WHAT DO WE DO IN THE
2 HOPEFULLY UNLIKELY EVENT, THAT WE DO HAVE BAD ACTORS?

3

4 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK THAT IS GOING TO BE A CONSIDERATION OF
5 THE COMMISSION OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS. WHAT IS STATED
6 IN THE TOC POLICY IS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT THE NEXT ROUND OF
7 OBAG FOUR. AND THAT WAS TALKED ABOUT EARLIER IN THE CONTEXT OF
8 TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING. BUT THAT IS FUNDING THAT TYPICALLY
9 GOES TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS FOR SURFACE TRANSPORTATION
10 PROJECTS FOR ROADWAYS, FOR BIKE, PEDS, THE LIST GOES ON. IT'S
11 A HIGHLY DEPENDABLE SOURCE OF REVENUE AND IMPORTANT SOURCE OF
12 REVENUE FOR MANY LOCAL JURISDICTIONS OUT THERE. THE REVENUE IN
13 THE TOC RESOLUTION REALLY ASKS THE COMMISSION TO CONSIDER
14 CONDITIONING OBAG 4 MONEY ON THE ACHIEVEMENT OF THIS POLICY. I
15 THINK MOVING FORWARD WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO LOOK CLOSELY AT
16 WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE. BUT I THINK -- AND I'M TELLING YOU FROM
17 JUST TALKING TO ALL THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS OUT THERE, THEY'RE
18 TAKING THIS VERY SERIOUSLY, BY AND LARGE. AND THERE IS
19 CERTAINLY SOME ANXIETY AND CONCERN ABOUT THEIR ABILITY TO
20 ACHIEVE THIS. AND I THINK, ALSO, THAT'S WHY WE'RE TRYING TO BE
21 SORT OF CAREFUL IN CHARTING OUT OUR STANDARD VICINITY, WHETHER
22 IT'S GOING TO BE PERFECTION. BUT EVERY CITY IS DIFFERENT AND
23 THERE ARE CIRCUMSTANCES. IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG CONSIDERATION
24 FOR THE COMMISSION OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS AND FOR STAFF WE'RE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 GOING TO BRING BACK TO YOU INFORMATION TO SHOW YOU WHERE
2 JURISDICTIONS LAND ON THIS.

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO BE REALLY CLEAR, FOR
5 THE JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE SMALL BUT MIGHTY AND ARE
6 STRUGGLING, I THINK WE CAN SUPPORT THEM TO GET WHERE THEY NEED
7 TO GO I'M NOT CONCERNED ABOUT PEOPLE THAT ARE TRYING TO BUT
8 MIGHT NOT GET THERE AS A RESULT OF ALL THEIR BEST EFFORTS.
9 MAKING SURE WE PLAY THIS AS A TEAM SPORT. AND I HOPE WE CAN
10 COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS TO BRING EVERYONE ALONG.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MAYOR MAHAN?

13

14 **MATT MAHAN:** THANK YOU. JUST WANTED TO ADD MY VOICE FOR
15 FLEXIBILITY. I THINK I EXPRESSED THE LAST TIME THIS CAME
16 BEFORE THE COMMISSION, I WANT TO START BY SAYING THAT THE CITY
17 OF SAN JOSE, REALLY, I APPRECIATE, AND I KNOW OUR CITY TEAM
18 APPRECIATES THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT'S GONE IN TO DEVELOPING
19 THE TOC POLICY. AND I SUBMITTED A LETTER. I DON'T KNOW IF MY
20 COLLEAGUES HAD A CHANCE TO SEE IT, BUT IT WAS JUST KIND OF AN
21 INITIAL SUMMARY OF OUR COMPLIANCE WITH TOC POLICY NEAR DIRIDON
22 STATION NEAR ONE OF OUR MOST SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT HUB. AS YOU
23 CAN SEE IN THE LETTER WE'RE ALREADY FULLY IN COMPLIANCE WITH
24 11 THE 15 RETIREMENTS AND THE OTHER FOUR ARE IN PROGRESS. THIS
25 IS SOMETHING WE'RE COMMITTED TO. IN FACT WE'RE ONE OF THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 LARGEST CITIES IN THE COUNTRY, MAYBE THE LARGEST, TO FULLY
2 ELIMINATE PARKING MINIMUMS CITYWIDE. SO WE'RE MAKING
3 MEANINGFUL PROGRESS TOWARD THE PRINCIPLES HERE AND ARE VERY
4 ALIGNED. I DO THINK IN PRACTICE, THOUGH, IF WE WERE TO REQUIRE
5 PERFECTION, WE WOULD POTENTIALLY SIGNIFICANTLY HINDER OUR
6 ABILITY TO FACILITATE THE VERY INFILL DEVELOPMENT AND DENSITY
7 THAT WE WANT TO MAKE THE WHOLE SYSTEM WORK. IT'S A CHICKEN AND
8 EGG. IT'S A SEQUENCING ISSUE. AND I WANT TO PICK SPECIFICALLY
9 ON THE REQUIREMENT THAT I THINK MAY BE HARDEST FOR US WHICH
10 WOULD BE THE PARKING MAXIMUMS FOR COMMERCIAL, JUST TO PUT THIS
11 IN PERSPECTIVE. SO, WHAT IS STATED HERE IS .25 SPACES FOR A
12 THOUSAND SQUARE FEET. AND IN MANY PARTS OF THE CITY, AROUND
13 MANY OF OUR TRANSIT STATIONS, THIS WOULD BE PERFECTLY
14 FEASIBLE. TO PUT INTO PERSPECTIVE, FOR DOWNTOWN WHICH ISN'T
15 NEARLY AS DENSE OR WELL SERVED BY TRANSIT AS, SAY, DOWNTOWN
16 SAN FRANCISCO, AS AN EXAMPLE, WE'RE HEARING FROM PROPERTY
17 MANAGERS WHO HAVE, LITERALLY, MILLIONS OF SQUARE FEET OF
18 VACANT COMMERCIAL THAT THEY'RE TRYING TO GET AN EMPLOYEE INTO,
19 THAT THE EMPLOYERS ARE COMING TO THEM AND SAYING WE NEED THREE
20 PER THOUSAND. THAT'S ON A PRETTY BIG G EMPLOYERS AT ONE END OF
21 THE SPECTRUM PRETTY BIG GAP. WE CAN TELL FROM YOU A DATA POINT
22 ENTITLEMENT WE DID WITH ONE OF THE MOST PROGRESSIVE WELL-
23 RESOURCED COMPANIES IN THE WORLD, GOOGLE, THE LOWEST
24 COMMITMENT WE HAVE GOTTEN FROM COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT IS SIX,
25 THAT'S GOOGLE FUTURE CAMPUS RIGHT AT DIRIDON, LITERALLY



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 WALKING DISTANCE. YOU BASIC LEAVE CROSS THE STREET, AND THAT'S
2 .6, WHICH IS MORE THAN DOUBLE THE STANDARD WE'RE SETTING HERE.
3 SO, APPRECIATE WHERE WE WANT TO GO. I BELIEVE IN MANY PLACES
4 IT MAKES SENSE. IN SAN JOSE, I THINK WE WILL EVENTUALLY GET
5 THERE, EVEN IN OUR DOWNTOWN, EVEN AROUND THE DIRIDON AREA. BUT
6 I DO REALLY WORRY THAT IF WE'RE TOO AGGRESSIVE AND TRY TO
7 DEMAND PERFECTION, WE WILL ACTUALLY HAVE THE EFFECT OF PUSHING
8 DEVELOPMENT, THE PERIPHERY OF THE CITY, TO OTHER CITIES, SOUTH
9 COUNTY, TO THE CENTRAL VALLEY. AND I BELIEVE AT LEAST FOR
10 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE, WHICH DOESN'T HAVE THE SAME LEVELS OF
11 DENSITY AND FREQUENCY OF SERVICE, THAT WE WILL NEED TO MAKE IT
12 EASIER TO ACHIEVE THE DENSITY FIRST AND GET BART PHASE TWO TO
13 SILICON -- BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO COMPLETED. AND AS
14 WE HAVE THE DENSITY AND SERVICE LEVELS AND CONNECTIVITY
15 IMPROVING, THEN IT BECOMES A LOT EASIER TO PUSH DOWN ON THOSE
16 PARK MAXIMUM. I THINK THIS IS A SEQUENCING ISSUE IN CERTAIN
17 PLACE DOESN'T MEAN WE AREN'T FULLY COMMITTED TO GETTING THERE,
18 JUST POINT OUT WHY WE WOULD BE UNCOMFORTABLE WITH IT IN AN
19 APPROACH THAT DOESN'T GIVE US FLEXIBILITY TO GO ALL IN EVEN
20 ABOVE AND BEYOND ON SOME OF THESE WHILE HAVING TIME FOR
21 OTHERS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

24



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I APPRECIATE THE DATA FROM MAYOR MAHAN. THE
2 OTHER THING I WANTED TO ADD, IN THIS PARTICULAR AREA, ONE
3 THING COLLEAGUES THAT WE RAISED WITH STAFF IS THAT THERE WERE
4 ALSO, YOU KNOW, KIND OF HELD HOSTAGE, SO TO SPEAK, TO A
5 SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT RELATED TO THIS SITE WITH ONE OF OUR
6 LARGEST PARTNERS IN DO YOU WANT AND THAT'S WITH THE SAP
7 CENTER, AND TO SAY THIS OUT LOUD, WE HAVE HAD A LITIGIOUS
8 RELATIONSHIP, I -- I SAY ROWDY, BUT LITIGIOUS IS MORE
9 ACCURATE. IT HAS IMPACTED OUR BART PROGRAM IN TERMS OF CEQA
10 AND NEPA AND ALL OF THAT. I SAY THAT BECAUSE I THINK ONE THING
11 YOU ALL GET BORED OF HEARING AND AGGRAVATED IS WE'RE ALL SO
12 SPECIAL AND SO DIFFERENT -- AND WE ARE -- BUT IN ALL
13 SERIOUSNESS, I THINK RECOGNITION THE GOALS OF EACH OF OUR
14 RENALS AND THEN LOOKING AT THE VERY BEST WAY THAT THE POINT
15 SYSTEM CAN BE APPLIED TO PUSH US IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AND
16 NOT IMPEDE US FROM MEETING IT, BECAUSE THE OTHER THING THAT
17 OCCURRED TO ME SPEAKING WITH THE MAYOR EARLIER TODAY IS WE PUT
18 A HIGH-LEVEL OF EMPHASIS MAKING SURE WE'RE MEETING OUR RHNA
19 NUMBERS, AND, FRANKLY, HOW OUR REGIONS GET INVESTED IN BE
20 COULD IMPACT HOW PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO PUT MONEY IN AT
21 DIFFERENT LEVELS OF HOUSING INVESTMENT. I SAY THAT, MORE TO
22 SAY I THINK THE FRAMEWORK IS THE RIGHT DIRECTION, BUT MORE TO
23 SAY I ENCOURAGE STAFF TO THINK ABOUT HOW THE POINT STRUCTURE
24 CAN BE STRUCTURED IN A WAY THAT ENCOURAGES TO US MOVE IN THE
25 RIGHT DIRECTION BUT DOESN'T PENALIZE US FROM BEING IN



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE MARKET CYCLE, AND DOESN'T PENALIZE US
2 FROM TRYING TO ACHIEVE DIFFERENT GOALS AT THE SAME TIME, WHICH
3 COULD INCLUDE DENSITY IN SOME INSTANCES THAT ALSO IMPACTS
4 PARKING RATIOS. JUST AGAIN TO SAY TO STAFF, I KNOW WE'RE ALL
5 YOUR SPECIAL SNOW FLAKES. THANK YOU.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANT TO SAY BART IS EXEMPT FROM
8 ANY REQUIREMENTS AROUND THIS POLICY, REALTIME? I MEAN THAT'S -
9 - I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO SAY THAT BECAUSE THESE ARE ALL
10 LEGITIMATE. BENEFITTED FROM GOING DOWN TO VISIT, AND AMAZING
11 STUFF HAPPENING DOWN THERE THAT PROJECT NEEDS TO GO, BUT, LIKE
12 THIS IS -- I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY, MATT?

13

14 **MATT MALONEY:** THE EXTENSION MONEY, YES, THEY'RE IN THE
15 CONSTRUCTION PHASE, AND, SO, YES, EXTENSION MONEY TO THE
16 PROJECT SPONSOR ON THAT EXTENSION PROJECT, YES.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** IS EXEMPTED. YEAH. OKAY GOOD.
19 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES HERE. IN
22 REALITY SOMETIMES JUST DOESN'T MATCH WHAT WE'RE LOOKING TO
23 ACHIEVE. AND WE WANT TO ACHIEVE ALL THOSE GOALS HERE. I THINK
24 WE NEED TO NOT DISREGARD STUDIES DONE BY, LIKE, SAN FRANCISCO.
25 WE NEED PEOPLE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. PEOPLE ARE MORE LIKELY TO



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT TO AND FROM WORK. SO, HOUSING IN A
2 DIFFERENT AREA, IT'S THE CONNECTIVITY HERE. THE FLEXIBILITY IS
3 VERY, VERY IMPORTANT TO THE SUCCESS OF GETTING PEOPLE ON
4 TRANSIT AND, PLEASE, YOU HAVE TO NOTE THAT END OF THE LINE, OR
5 AN AIRPORT STOP, PEOPLE NEED TO PARK TO GET TO THE NEXT -- TO
6 GET ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, TO GET TO THE NEXT ASPECT OF IT. AND IF
7 THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES ARE NOT PROVIDING THE PARKING,
8 WHICH MANY OF THEM ARE NOT NOW, THEY'RE REQUIRING CITIES TO DO
9 THIS. IN MY JURISDICTION, THEY DID REQUIRE THE PARKING. BUT, I
10 MEAN, WE'RE HAVE TO PUT THESE PIECES TOGETHER HERE, AND THAT
11 FLEXIBILITY IS KEY TO THE SUCCESS OF ALL THE POLICIES. AND
12 EVERY PIECE HERE. AND YOU CANNOT COUNT ON THE TRANSPORTATION
13 AGENCIES TO REALLY PUT THE PIECES TOGETHER. THEY HAVE JUST ONE
14 GOAL, ONE GOAL ONLY. AND THEN THE JURISDICTIONS HAVE ANOTHER
15 REQUIREMENTS HERE. SO, PLEASE, IN REALITY IT'S SOMETIMES A
16 DIFFERENT THING. BUT WE DO WANT TO ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS. AND WE
17 JUST DON'T WANT TO MAKE IT IMPOSSIBLE. I THINK IS WHAT'S BEING
18 SAID HERE. SO, AGAIN, THE FLEXIBILITY AND SUCCESS OF
19 EVERYTHING DEPENDS ON JUST THAT. I THINK THE MAYOR PUT IT
20 WELL, FOR REALLY OVERACHIEVING ON TEN OUT OF WHATEVER, 15,
21 LET'S -- LET'S HELP PEOPLE ALONG, INSTEAD OF REALLY HOLDING
22 THINGS UP. THANK YOU.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. SHOULD WE GO TO PUBLIC
25 COMMENT?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. WOULD YOU LIKE TO STICK WITH ONE
3 MINUTE?

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HOW MANY WE GOT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RIGHT NOW YOU HAVE THREE.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** DO A MINUTE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST I DID RECEIVE A LETTER OF CORRESPOND
12 THAT'S BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA. IT WAS SIGNED BY
13 VARIOUS SIGNATURES. SO I WILL NOT READ THEM INTO THE RECORD.
14 OH, WE HAVE A LOT OF HANDS NOW. AARON ECKHOUSE IS OUR FIRST
15 SPEAKER. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS AARON ECKHOUSE. I'M THE
18 LOCAL AND REGIONAL POLICY PROGRAM DIRECTOR WITH CALIFORNIA
19 YIMBY. WE HAVE WORKED FROM THE BEGINNING WITH STAFF AND OTHER
20 ADVOCATES ON SHAPING THE TOC POLICY. WE'RE REALLY EXCITED FOR
21 OUR COORDINATED REGIONAL APPROACH TO TRANSIT ORIENTED
22 DEVELOPMENT. I THINK, UNFORTUNATELY, THE POLICY HAS BEEN AT
23 EVERY STEP ROLLED BACK AND WEAKENED, STARTING WITH THE
24 EXCLUSION OF ALL LAND THAT HAS AN EXISTING RESIDENTIAL USE,
25 INCLUDING OWNER OCCUPIED PROPERTIES WITH NO DISPLACEMENT



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 CONDITIONS. AND, UNFORTUNATELY, WE SEE THAT TREND CONTINUING.
2 YOU KNOW? IF LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE IN SHORT TAKING NECESSARY
3 ACTIONS, IF MTC IS NOT CAPABLE OF TAKING NECESSARY ACTIONS,
4 AND, YEAH, THEN YOU MAY NOT HAVE THE NECESSARY LEVERAGE TO DO
5 SO. I THINK THIS POINTS TO WHY STATE ACTION IS SO IMPORTANT SO
6 THAT CALIFORNIA CAN MEET ITS CLIMATE GOALS. THANKS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS WITTE TURNER
9 FOLLOWED BY JOANNA GOODMAN.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, WITTE TURNER SPEAKING
12 ON BEHALF OF THE HOUSING ACTION COALITION WE JOINED A
13 COALITION LETTER WITH SPUR IN THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND OTHERS.
14 WE WANT TO REEMPHASIZE POINTS IN OUR LETTER SPEAK BRIEFLY IN
15 CONCERN FOR THE CURRENT TOC PROPOSAL, NOT FULLY ADDRESSED.
16 DOESN'T MEET THE MOMENT OF OUR LARGER AFFORDABILITY CRISIS OUR
17 STATE IS FACING. THE PROPOSAL DOES NOT MEET THE MOMENT FOR THE
18 CLIMATE CRISIS WHICH IS DISHEARTENING, SO WE ASK THAT YOU
19 CHANGE THE PROPOSAL TO MORE ACCURATELY REFLECT THE NEEDS OF
20 THE CURRENT FUTURE CALIFORNIANS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS JOANNA GOODMAN.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JOANNA EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF URBAN
25 ENVIRONMENTALIST DIRECTOR OF YIMBY ACTION. MTC VOTED TO



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 UNANIMOUSLY SUPPORT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH CALLS FOR
2 32,000 HOMES PER YEAR IN TRANSIT-RICH AREAS THIS IS ONE OF THE
3 MOST IMPACTFUL CLIMATE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE ACTIONS WE CAN
4 TAKE LOCALLY. THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY IS THE
5 TOOL FOR ACHIEVING THIS GOAL. BY ELIMINATING THE FUNDING
6 CONDITIONING THAT MOTIVATES CITIES TO COMPLY WITH THIS POLICY
7 MTC IS SAYING NONE OF THIS MATTERS TOC POLICY REGIONAL
8 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS HOUSING AFFORDABILITY NEEDS OF BAY AREA
9 RESIDENTS AND DOING ONE OF THE MOST IMPACT OF THINGS WE CAN DO
10 TO LIMIT AND ADOPT CLIMATE CHANGE IS TO BUILD AFFORDABLE
11 HOUSING. IF WE DON'T HOLD OURSELVES ACCOUNTABLE AT
12 THE OUTSET WE WENT PURSUE CREATIVE SOLUTIONS WE NEED. PLEASE
13 REVERSE THE HARMFUL CHANGES. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ERIKA PINTO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ERIKA WITH SPUR. WE BELIEVE
18 THIS MISSES THE POINT IN A WAY THAT IS COMMON AT MTC. THE
19 POLICY BEFORE YOU TODAY MAKES A DIFFERENCE IF JURISDICTIONS
20 FOLLOW IT. A POLICY THAT NO ONE HAS A REASON TO FOLLOW IS
21 RIDICULOUS. [INDISCERNIBLE] PROGRESS TO MEET THE GOALS FOR THE
22 COMMUNITIES FOR THE EQUITY POLICY. WHILE VAGUE LANGUAGE ABOUT
23 CONDITIONING OBAG FUNDING THIS REPRESENTS A WATER DIRECTLY IN
24 FUNDING AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT PROJECTS. EXTENSION OF THE
25 TRANSIT PROJECT IS 10,000 YEARS WORTH OF OBAG FUNDING FOR --



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 [INDISCERNIBLE] WHY NOT TAKE ANOTHER MONTH TO GET IT RIGHT.
2 WHAT YOU ARE SEEING TODAY IS A COMPROMISE, BACK PEDALING --
3 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS IS NOT WHAT LEADERSHIP SHOULD LOOK LIKE -
4 - [INDISCERNIBLE] CHALLENGES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MISS PINTO. NEXT UP IS ADINA
7 LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY GRECIA AYON.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** ADINA LEVIN SERVING ON POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
10 REPRESENTING MYSELF AND ALSO SPEAKING AS A VOLUNTEER WITH
11 YIMBY ACTION AND LOCAL HOUSING ADVOCACY. I WANT TO SPEAK IN
12 FAVOR OF WHAT PEOPLE ARE SAYING FROM THE LETTER IN STRONG
13 SUPPORT OF HAVING THIS POLICY APPLY TO MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS.
14 FAIRLY RECENTLY ATHERTON DECIDED TO CLOSE A CALTRAIN STATION
15 AND THIS MAY BE PARTLY BECAUSE ATHERTON IS MORE RELUCTANT TO
16 HAVE HOUSING IN THAT CASE MAYBE THEY WANT LESS REGIONAL
17 TRANSIT STATIONS. WHAT HAPPENS TO RIDERSHIP IF WE DO NOT DO
18 LAND USE SUPPORTING TRANSIT. IN TERMS OF THE EXCEPTIONS.
19 PLEASE IMPLEMENT THIS WITH TRANSPARENCY SO COMMUNITY MEMBERS
20 CAN SUPPORT THE APPLICATION OF THESE GOOD POLICIES. THANK YOU
21 VERY MUCH.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS GRECIA. FOLLOWED BY
24 VINAY PIMPLE.

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE MY NAME IS GRECIA, I AM THE
2 HOUSING POLICY MANAGER AT TRANSFORM. AS MENTIONED DURING
3 TODAY'S DISCUSSION AT ITS OCTOBER 13TH MEETING THE PLANNING
4 COMMITTEE VOTED TO ELIMINATE INCENTIVE COMPLIANCE FOR THE
5 FUNDING FOR NEW TRANSIT EXTENSIONS. THIS ENDANGERS THE POLICY
6 AND INHIBITS GOAL AROUND EXPANDING FIXED RAIL TO ACCOMMODATE
7 HOUSING AND JOBS WHICH WE FED TO ACHIEVE OUR GOALS. WE URGE
8 YOU, THE COMMISSION AND STAFF TO RECONSIDER THIS CHANGE.
9 FLEXIBILITY IS VERY IMPORTANT AND WE URGE STAFF AND THE
10 COMMISSION TO CONSIDER AN EXEMPTION PROCESS THAT REQUIRES
11 JURISDICTIONS TO DEMONSTRATE DIFFICULTY IN ACHIEVING
12 COMPLIANCE AND PROVIDING MEANINGFUL ALTERNATIVES AS OPPOSED TO
13 85% THRESHOLD. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE
16 FOLLOWED BY JORDAN GRIMES.

17

18 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I'M VINAY PIMPLE WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY
19 COUNCIL I WOULD LIKE COMMEND STAFF FOR BEING WILLING TO
20 CONSIDER FLEXIBILITY. BECAUSE WE ALL LIVE IN THE BAY AREA. WE
21 SHARE SIMILAR VALUES AND ASSUMPTION THAT SOMEBODY IS NOT
22 COMPLYING BECAUSE THEY'RE ACTIVE BECAUSE THEY'RE ACTING OUT OF
23 BAD FAITH IS LIKELY TO BE INCORRECT IN MOST CASES. PEOPLE HAVE
24 DIVERSE NEEDS, DIFFERENT CONSTRAINTS. & SO, I YOU KEEP THE
25 FLEXIBILITY. YOU DON'T WANT THE FLEXIBILITY TO MAKE THE



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 PROCESS OPAQUE WHERE YOU DO NOT KNOW WHY SOMEBODY HAS GOT SOME
2 BREAKS OR NOT. SO PAY ATTENTION TO THAT TOO. THANK YOU VERY
3 MUCH.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JORDAN GRIMES OUR
6 FINAL SPEAKER.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON DIRECTORS. JORDAN GRIMES GREEN
9 ALLIANCE WE SUBMITTED A LETTER WITH THE BOARD COALITION OF
10 ORGANIZATIONS FROM ACROSS THE REGION BUT WE WANTED TO
11 EMPHASIZE OUR CONCERNS OVER PROPOSED POLICY CHANGES YEARS OF
12 HARD WORK ARE AT SERIOUS RISK OF BEING UNDERMINED OF THE
13 PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE POLICY IMPLEMENTATION. FUNDING MUST BE
14 CONDITIONED ON JURISDICTION COMPLIANCE OR IT WILL FAIL TO
15 ACHIEVE GOALS AROUND CLIMATE AFFORDABILITY. AND FAILURE IS NOT
16 AN OPTION FOR US. GIVE THIS PROGRAM TEETH TO RELY ON VOLUNTARY
17 COMPLIANCE HAS NOT AND WILL NOT WORK. DOUBLING DOWN ON YEARS
18 AND YEARS OF FAILED POLICY. THIS IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 NOT
19 1950 AND WE NEED TO ACT ACCORDINGLY. THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING
20 TIME TO SPEAK.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE MORE SPEAKER, JANE KRAEMER. GO
23 AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM. YOU WILL NEED TO PUSH THE
24 BUTTON. THANK YOU.

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** JUST A THOUGHT. IF THE PRICES FOR RENT GOES DOWN IN
2 SAN FRANCISCO, THE THOUGHT IS THAT SMALL ENTREPRENEURS, LOCAL
3 ENTREPRENEURS MIGHT FILL THOSE SPACES, AND IF THAT'S THE CASE,
4 WOULD YOU BE WILLING TO SUPPORT THAT PROCESS?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NO ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS, MR.
7 CHAIR.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALL FOR YOUR
10 COMMENTS. I AM ALSO DISAPPOINTED THAT THIS POLICY HAS MOVED IN
11 A, SORT OF, A DIRECTION WHERE WE ARE GOING TO BE BUILDING LESS
12 HOUSING AROUND TRANSIT. AND I'M DISAPPOINTED ABOUT SOME OF THE
13 PROJECTS WE'RE EXEMPTING BUT I UNDERSTAND IT AND I HAVE
14 SUPPORT IT. LET'S DO A ROLL CALL VOTE

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SURE. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SPERING.
17 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER CANEPA. CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE
18 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

23

24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN IS ABSENT. CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS IS ABSENT. NOACK?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? COMMISSIONER SPERING? SOME. THAO IS
17 ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIR, AS MATT SAID EARLIER, YOU KNOW,
20 AS THESE APPLICATIONS COME IN, IT'S GOING TO AFFORD THIS
21 COMMISSION THE OPPORTUNITY TOPPED EXACTLY HOW THIS POLICY WILL
22 IMPACT BOTH ELIGIBILITY, OUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE HOUSING,
23 DENSITY, AFFORDABILITY, ALL OF THINGS WE'RE LOOKING FOR. I
24 WANT TO ENCOURAGE MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS THAT, AS THEY
25 DEVELOP, YOU HAVE GOT TO BRING THEM FORWARD. DON'T COUNT ON



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 STAFF RAISING ALL THESE ISSUES. BECAUSE YOU DOLE WITH IT AT
2 YOUR LOCAL JURISDICTION AND I THINK THE COMMISSION HAS TO LOOK
3 AT IT WHERE WE CAN MAKE MODIFICATIONS. IF WE CAN GET HOUSING
4 AFFORDABILITY, GET THE DENSITIES BUT THERE IS A PARKING
5 REQUIREMENT THAT HAS TO BE ADJUSTED, WE SHOULD DO THAT. I WANT
6 TO ENCOURAGE MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS TO STAY ACTIVELY INVOLVED
7 IN THIS AS IT EVOLVES AND AS APPLICATIONS IN. STAFF HAS BEEN
8 MORE THAN WILLING TO LOOK AT HOW WE CAN ACHIEVE THOSE
9 OBJECTIVES AND I THINK THERE IS MANY OPPORTUNITIES TO DO THAT.
10 THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONER
13 SPERING FOR ALL OF YOUR WORK ON THIS POLICY AND ON THIS ISSUE
14 GOING BACK TO -- WHEN WAS THE FIRST ONE PASSED? TOC IN 19 --

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OH MY GOSH, BACK IN THE '90S. THANKS FOR
17 POINTING OUT HOW LONG I HAVE BEEN HERE. [LAUGHTER]

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. WE ARE MOVING ON TO ITEM TEN,
20 PUBLIC COMMENT. WE HAVE DONE NINE. FORTUNATELY. ITEM TEN,
21 PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
24 FOR THIS ITEM. THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HERE TO



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1 SPEAK. ROLAND WONG. GO AHEAD AND APPROACH. YOU HAVE ONE
2 MINUTE. I WILL SHARE MY SCREEN FOR YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF. MY NAME
5 IS ROLAND WONG, RECENTLY APPOINTED BY THE COMMISSION TO THE
6 MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THANK YOU FOR CONSIDERING ME TO
7 THE COUNCIL. MY GOAL IS SERVING TO VOICE COMMENTS CONCERNING
8 EQUITY AND ACCESS, FOR BASIS RESIDENTS AND BEYOND. THERE IS
9 LOTS TO LEARN AND IMPROVEMENTS. JUST, AGAIN, THANK YOU. AND I
10 APPRECIATE THIS OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU. NICE MEETING YOU ALL.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** WELCOME. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH
13 FOR YOUR SERVICE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MR. WONG.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY ITEM 11. ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT
20 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS
21 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 15TH. NOTE AGAIN THIS
22 IS THE THIRD WEDNESDAY OF THE MONTH DUE TO THE THANKSGIVING
23 HOLIDAY. ANY CHANGE TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO
24 THE PUBLIC. END OF MEETING. [ADJOURNED]

25



OCTOBER 25, 2023

1



NTT

Broadcasting Government