

METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript

1

PLANNING COMMITTEE

2

FRIDAY, JANUARY 9, 2026, 9:40 AM

3

4

5 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** AT THIS TIME. I WOULD LIKE TO ORDER
6 THIS MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE THIS MEETING IS
7 BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC ABAG WEB SITES MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
8 PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED
9 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I'LL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
10 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
11 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE
12 WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE
13 MEMBER PARTICIPATION TODAY. WILL THE CLERK CALL THE ROLL AND
14 CONFIRM A QUORUM?

15

16 **BOARD CLERK:** WILL DO. CHAIR AHN IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR BURT?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** HERE.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** ANDERSEN?

21

22 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

23

24 **BOARD CLERK:** CANEPA?

25

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

2

3 **BOARD CLERK:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

4

5 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

6

7 **BOARD CLERK:** GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING. WE'LL LOOP BACK.

8 COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

9

10 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE.

11

12 **BOARD CLERK:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MASHBURN?

13

14 **MITCH MASHBURN:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** WE HAVE ONE REQUEST FOR REMOTE
17 PARTICIPATION UNDER SB707 FROM COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI. WOULD
18 YOU LIKE TO MAKE YOUR STATEMENT?

19

20 **DOREEN M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. I'M REQUESTING PARTICIPATION
21 VIA TELECONFERENCING AND REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER JUST CAUSE
22 PER GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54953C. THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN
23 THE ROOM OVER 18 WITH ME.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED AND WE'RE

1 MAKING -- OR MARKING YOU AS PRESENT. SO, AT THIS TIME, THOSE
2 WHO ARE ABLE, WOULD YOU JOIN ME FOR THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE?
3 [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF
4 THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT
5 STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND
6 JUSTICE FOR ALL."

7

8 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** AND WOULD THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE
9 MTC COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

10

11 **BOARD CLERK:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I'M MAKING THE
12 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
13 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO
14 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY THIS AMOUNT IS PROVIDED
15 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS
16 ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM IS
19 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH INCLUDES AGENDA ITEM 5A, APPROVAL
20 OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES FROM DECEMBER 12TH,
21 2025. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES
22 AND THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SECOND. OH GOOD. THANKS.

25

1 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** GREAT. ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION
2 BY MEMBER MASHBURN, SECOND BY MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE. ARE THERE
3 ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THE ITEM?
4 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? ALL RIGHT.

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
7 THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.
8 I SEE AN ABAG MEMBER, CAROLE FIFE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
9 WOULD YOU LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

10

11 **CAROLE FIFE:** NO. I JUST WANTED TO BE RECOGNIZED THAT I WAS
12 HERE.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** GREAT. WELCOME. OKAY. WILL THE
15 CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

16

17 **BOARD CLERK:** WILL DO. CHAIR AHN IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR BURT?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** HERE.

20

21 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. ANDERSEN?

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

24

25 **BOARD CLERK:** CANEPA?

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

3

4 **BOARD CLERK:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

7

8 **BOARD CLERK:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

9

10 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE. MAHAN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
11 MASHBURN? MASH I'M HERE AS WELL.

12

13 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
14 MEMBERS PRESENT.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** OKAY. I'LL NOW TURN THE MEETING
17 OVER TO ABAG VICE CHAIR ROMERO.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD
20 MORNING, EVERYONE. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE
21 ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING TO ORDER. VOICE VOTE
22 WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS TODAY. ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

23

24 **BOARD CLERK:** SUPERVISOR CARLSON?

25

1 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE.

2

3 **BOARD CLERK:** COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

6

7 **BOARD CLERK:** SUPERVISOR RABBITT? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

8 IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** PRESENT.

11

12 **BOARD CLERK:** SILVA?

13

14 **CINDY SILVA:** HERE.

15

16 **BOARD CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

17

18 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HERE.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** ACTUALLY, THAT WAS THE ROLL CALL.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** THE ROLL CALL.

25

1 **BOARD CLERK:** OH I'M SORRY.

2

3 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** IT'S OKAY.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** IT'S ON VERY RARE OCCASION
6 THAT IS A CLERK EVER MAKES MISTAKES. A SPECIAL DAY. [LAUGHTER]
7 TUTU GENERAL COUNSEL FOR CATCHING THAT. NEXT ITEM IS THE ABAG
8 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. FRED, WOULD YOU PLEASE PROVIDE
9 THIS?

10

11 **BOARD CLERK:** YES, SIR. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE
12 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF ABAG IN ATTENDANCE AT
13 THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF
14 \$150 AND THAT THE PER DIEM SHALL BE PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF
15 CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO
16 COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. ITEM NUMBER NINE,
19 THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. WE HAVE TWO
20 ITEMS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. ARE THERE ANY -- WELL, ACTUALLY
21 -- ARE THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

22

23 **BOARD CLERK:** ON THIS ITEM, NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED, NO
24 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
25 THANK YOU.

1

2 **PAT EKLUND:** I'LL MOVE IT. -- I'LL SECOND.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** MOTION BY ECKLUND SECOND BY
5 WILLIAMS. ROLL CALL VOTE?

6

7 **BOARD CLERK:** SUPERVISOR CARLSON?

8

9 **KEN CARLSON:** YES.

10

11 **BOARD CLERK:** ECKLUND?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES.

14

15 **BOARD CLERK:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS? IS ABSENT. ROMERO?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** YES.

18

19 **BOARD CLERK:** SILVA?

20

21 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

22

23 **BOARD CLERK:** WILLIAMS?

24

25 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

1

2 **BOARD CLERK:** ON THIS ITEM, ALL MEMBERS PRESENT VOTED YES.

3 THANK YOU.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. I'LL PASS THE
6 GAVEL BACK TO THE VICE CHAIR.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** OOPS. SORRY. SKIPPED A PAGE. OKAY.

9 THANK YOU. THIS IS AN INFORMATION -- AGENDA ITEM 10A, HOW
10 TRAVEL HAS CHANGED PRE AND POST-PANDEMIC PATTERNS FROM TRAVEL
11 DIARY SURVEYS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. FLAVIA TSANG WILL
12 PROVIDE THE REPORT.

13

14 **FLAVIA TSANG:** HI. MY NAME IS FLAVIA TSANG. I'M WITH MTC'S
15 REGIONAL PLANNING SECTION. TODAY -- CAN YOU HEAR ME BETTER?
16 OKAY. TODAY I'LL BE SHARING WHAT YOU ARE SEEING HOW TRAVEL HAS
17 CHANGED BEFORE AND AFTER THE PANDEMIC DRAWING ON FINDINGS FROM
18 OUR TRAVEL DIARY SURVEYS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. BEFORE DIVING
19 BOOT RESULTS, I WANT TO BRIEFLY EXPLAIN WHY MTC CONDUCTS
20 TRAVEL DIARY SURVEYS. TRAVEL DIARY SURVEYS ARE OUR
21 FOUNDATIONAL DATA SOURCE FOR UNDERSTANDING TRAVEL BEHAVIOR,
22 WHO IS TRAVELING, WHY THEY TRAVEL, WHERE THEY GO, AND WHEN
23 TRIPS OCCUR AND HOW PEOPLE GET AROUND. WHILE SO-CALLED BIG
24 DATA CAN TELL US A LOT ABOUT WHERE AND WHEN TRAVEL HAPPENS, IT
25 FALLS SHORT WHEN IT COMES TO EXPLAINING WHY PEOPLE TRAVEL AND

1 WHO THEY ARE. TRAVEL DIARY SURVEYS UNIQUELY PROVIDE THE
2 DEMOGRAPHIC DETAIL AND BEHAVIORAL CONTEXT THAT ARE ESSENTIAL
3 FOR EQUITY FOCUS ANALYSIS AND LONG RANGE PLANNING. THE DATA IS
4 USED TO INFORM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ MODELING BASELINE AMONG
5 OTHER REGIONAL AND COUNTY LEVEL STUDIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
6 SO, ARE THE PUBLIC RE-BRANDED OUR TRAVEL DIARY SURVEY AS THE
7 BAY AREA TRAVEL STUDY. IN THIS SURVEY PARTICIPANTS USED A
8 SMART PHONE APP FOR SEVEN DAYS TO RECORD THEIR TRAVEL. THE APP
9 CAPTURED DETAILED GPS TRACES, BUT WE CALL IT TRAVEL DIARY
10 BECAUSE THE KEY DETAILS LIKE TRIP PURPOSE AND TRAVEL MODE ARE
11 REPORTED DIRECTLY BY THE PARTICIPANTS, NOT JUST INFERRED FROM
12 THE LOCATION DATA. THIS IS A LARGE REGIONAL SAMPLE. IN 2023,
13 WE SENT OUT OVER 700,000 INVITATIONS REACHING ROUGHLY ONE IN
14 FOUR BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS. THE DATA ARE THEN EXPANDED TO MATCH
15 THE CENSUS BUREAU'S AMERICAN COMMUNITIES SURVEY AND ENSURING
16 THE RESULTS ARE REPRESENTATIVE OF THE REGION'S POPULATION.
17 ALTOGETHER IN 2023, WE COLLECTED DATA FROM MORE THAN 8,000
18 HOUSEHOLDS REPRESENTING ABOUT 1500 -- I MEAN 15,000 ADULTS AND
19 92,000 TRAVEL SURVEYS. THE 2019 SURVEY USED A VERY SIMILAR
20 APPROACH, BUT IT WAS A LITTLE SMALLER, ABOUT 2/3 THE SIZE OF
21 2023, SIMPLY BECAUSE OF BUDGET DIFFERENCES. BUT THAT
22 CONSISTENCY IN METHOD ALLOWS US TO MAKE DIRECT COMPARISON
23 BETWEEN 2019 AND 2023, WHICH IS THE FOCUS OF TODAY'S
24 PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. BEFORE WE DIVE IN, I WANT TO
25 BRIEFLY ACKNOWLEDGE THE TIMING. THESE 2023 RESULTS ARE ONLY

1 COMING OUT IN 2026 BECAUSE WE RAN INTO A FEW UNEXPECTED
2 HURDLES, INCLUDING HIGHER THAN EXPECTED RESPONSE RATES THAT
3 LED TO LENGTHY NEGOTIATIONS WITH THE CONSULTANTS AND OUR
4 PARTNERS, AS WELL AS TECHNICAL CHARGES RELATED TO UPDATED
5 DEFINITION THAT Affected THE WEIGHTING AND EXPANSION
6 METHODOLOGY. FOR THE NEXT SURVEY CYCLE, WE ARE SETTING ASIDE
7 CONTINGENCY BUDGET TO MANAGE THE UNCERTAINTY IN RESPONSE RATE,
8 AND, ALSO, TIGHTENING OUR CONTRACTUAL LANGUAGE WITH OUR
9 CONSULTANT TO CLARIFY EXPECTATION. INTERNALLY, WE ARE ALSO
10 BUILDING REUSABLE DATA PROCESSING TOOLS SO STAFF CAN PRODUCE
11 RESULTS MORE QUICKLY IN THE NEXT CYCLE WHILE MAINTAINING
12 QUALITY STANDARDS. YOU MAY ALSO NOTE A VERY SMALL DIFFERENCE
13 IN THE RESULT COMPARED TO THE EARLY PREVIEW SHARED WITH THE
14 RNM COUNCIL. THESE REFLECT FINAL DATA REWEIGHTING AND QUALITY
15 CHECKS AND THEY DO NOT CHANGE THE KEY FINDINGS. WITH THAT
16 CONTEXT TODAY'S PRESENTATION COMPARES 2019 AND 2023. AND THIS
17 SLIDE IS A QUICK REMINDER OF HOW TRAVEL HAS EVOLVED OVER THAT
18 PERIOD. BRIDGE TRAFFIC HAS RECOVERED TO ABOUT 90% OF PRE-
19 PANDEMIC LEVELS AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP HAS CONTINUED TO
20 RECOVER. BUT EVEN IN 2025, IT REMAINS MUCH CLOSER TO 2023
21 LEVELS THAN 2019. SO, IN SHORT, WE ARE STILL OPERATING IN A
22 POST-PANDEMIC TRAVEL LANDSCAPE THAT LOOKED VERY DIFFERENT FROM
23 WHAT WE SAW BEFORE COVID. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ONE OF THE
24 CLEAREST TRENDS FROM OUR SURVEYS IS THAT PEOPLE IN THE BAY
25 AREA ARE TAKING FEWER TRIPS THAN THEY DID BEFORE THE PANDEMIC.

1 ON THE LEFT, YOU CAN SEE THAT IN 2019 ADULTS LIVING IN THE BAY
2 AREA MADE ABOUT 4.9 TRIPS PER DAY ON AVERAGE. BY 2023, THAT
3 DROPPED TO 3.7 TRIPS PER DAY, ROUGHLY 20% -- 5% DECLINE. ON
4 THE RIGHT, TRIP DISTANCES ALSO APPEAR SLIGHTLY SHORTER, THOUGH
5 THE OVERLAPPING CONFIDENCE IN THE INTERVALS SHOWN IN THE CHART
6 MEANS THAT THE DIFFERENCES SHOULD BE INTERPRETED CAUTIOUSLY.
7 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THAT THE DECLINE IN TRIP
8 MAKING IS BROAD BASED ACROSS INCOME GROUPS. FIRST LOOK AT THE
9 -- FIRST, LOOK AT DAILY TRIPS, ALL-PURPOSE ON THE LEFT. WE SEE
10 THAT AVERAGE TRIP MAKING DECLINE FOR EVERY INCOME GROUPS
11 BETWEEN 2019 AND 2023. AND ON THE RIGHT, WE'RE LOOKING AT
12 AVERAGE WORK TRIPS PER ADULT, AND THAT INCLUDES BOTH WORKERS
13 AND NON-WORKERS. AND ADULTS IN LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLD ARE MORE
14 LIKELY TO BE LOW-INCOME WORKERS WHICH MEANS MANY MAKE ZERO
15 WORK TRIPS, BUT EVEN WITH THAT CONTEXT, THE DECLINE FROM 2019
16 TO 2023 IS LARGER AMOUNT HIGHER INCOME ADULTS, AND THIS LIKELY
17 REFLECTS GREATER FLEXIBILITY FOR REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK IN
18 HIGH INCOME OCCUPATIONS, WHICH BRINGS US TO THE NEXT SLIDE.
19 SO, IN 2019 ABOUT 64% OF WORKERS WORK FULLY ON-SITE. BY 2023
20 THAT SHARE DROPPED SHARPLY WITH ONLY 46% WORKING FULLY ON-SITE
21 AND THAT REPRESENTS A MAJOR STRUCTURAL CHANGE IN HOW THE
22 REGION FUNCTIONS TODAY. AND THAT SHIFT TOWARD HYBRID AND
23 REMOTE WORK ISN'T CONFINED TO ONE PART OF THE REGION. IT'S
24 HAPPENING ALL ACROSS. THIS CHART SHOWS THE SHARE OF WORKERS
25 WHO WORK-FROM-HOME MORE THAN TWO DAYS PER WEEK AND IN 2019

1 THOSE SHARE WERE GENERALLY BETWEEN 22 TO 23% ACROSS OUR
2 COUNTY. BY 2023 THEY HAVE GROWN DRAMATICALLY. BUT WHAT'S
3 REMARKABLE IN THIS CHART IS THAT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, HYBRID
4 AND REMOTE WORK WERE MORE COMMON IN THE REGIONS, IN THE
5 REGION'S LESS URBANIZED COUNTY. BY 2023, THAT PATTERN HAD
6 REVERSED. THE HIGHEST WORK-FROM-HOME RATES ARE NOW IN SAN
7 FRANCISCO AND SAN MATEO. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS
8 HOW REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK PATTERNS HAPPEN ACROSS DIFFERENT
9 GROUPS. ON THE LEFT, WE SHOW THE SHARE OF WORKER WHO IS WORK-
10 FROM-HOME MORE THAN TWO DAYS PER WEEK BY HOUSEHOLD INCOME. BY
11 2023, REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK HAVE BECOME FAR MORE COMMON AMONG
12 HIGH INCOME WORKERS. ON THE RIGHT, WE SEE LARGE DIFFERENCES BY
13 EMPLOYMENT STATUS. SELF-EMPLOYED WORKERS AND FULL-TIME
14 EMPLOYEES ARE MUCH MORE LIKELY TO WORK REMOTELY IN A HYBRID
15 ARRANGEMENT THAN PART-TIME WORKERS. NOTABLY AMONG FULL-TIME
16 WORKERS THE SHARE WORKING FROM HOME MORE THAN TWO DAYS PER
17 WEEK MORE THAN DOUBLED BETWEEN 2019 AND 2023. TAKEN TOGETHER,
18 THESE PATTERNS SHOW THAT REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK IS NOT EVENLY
19 DISTRIBUTED ACROSS THE WORKFORCE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. GIVEN
20 THESE SHIFTS IN HOW OFTEN PEOPLE TRAVEL AND WHERE THEY WORK, A
21 NATURAL QUESTION IS HOW TRAVEL MODES HAVE CHANGED. THIS SLIDE
22 SHOWS MODE SHARE FOR ALL DAILY TRIPS COMPARING 2019 AND 2023.
23 OVERALL, MOST HAVE BEEN REMARKABLY STABLE, DRIVE ALONE AND
24 DRIVE WITH OTHERS REMAIN DOMINANT MODES WITH ONLY VERY SMALL
25 CHANGES SINCE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. TRANSIT SHARE IS ALSO

1 LARGELY UNCHANGED IN THIS AGGREGATE VIEW. ONE NOTABLE
2 EXCEPTION IS WALKING. THE SHARE OF TRIPS MADE ON FOOT INCREASE
3 FROM 14% IN 2019 TO 17% TO 2023. WHILE THIS MAY SEEM MODEST,
4 IT IS A MEANINGFUL SHIFT GIVEN THE OVERALL STABILITIES ACROSS
5 OTHER MODES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE BREAKS SHARE DOWN
6 BY WORK ARRANGEMENT AND SHOWS HOW DAILY TRAVEL DIFFERS FOR
7 PEOPLE WHO COMMUTE VERSUS THOSE WHO WORK-FROM-HOME. AMONG
8 FULL-TIME WORKERS WHO WENT TO WORK IN 2023, DRIVE ALONE
9 DOMINATES ACCOUNTING FOR ABOUT HALF OF ALL DAILY TRIPS.
10 TRANSIT REPRESENTS ABOUT 7% OF TRIPS, A SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER
11 SHARE THAN THOSE WHO WORKED FROM HOME. IN CONTRAST, FOR FULL-
12 TIME WORKERS WHO WORK-FROM-HOME FOR MOST OF THE DAY, WE SEE
13 FAR FEWER DRIVE ALONE TRIPS AND A MUCH HIGHER SHARE OF DRIVERS
14 WITH OTHERS AND WALKING. THOSE DIFFERENCES HIGHLIGHT HOW WORK
15 ARRANGEMENTS SHAPE NOT JUST WHETHER PEOPLE TRAVEL BUT HOW THEY
16 TRAVEL AS REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK PERSISTS THEY CONTINUE TO
17 RESHAPE MORE CHOICE ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
18 TRANSIT USE IS STRONGLY RELATED TO INCOME. ADULT IN-HOUSE HOLD
19 EARNING LESS THAN 50,000 A YEAR HAVE THE HIGHEST TRANSIT MODE
20 SHARE IN BOTH YEARS. IN 2023, TRANSIT ACCOUNTED FOR ABOUT 8%
21 OF TRIPS MADE BY ADULTS IN HOUSEHOLD EARNING LESS THAN
22 \$50,000, ROUGHLY DOUBLE THE SHARE AMONG HIGHER INCOME
23 HOUSEHOLDS. THE KEY TAKEAWAY HERE IS THAT TRANSIT CONTINUES TO
24 PLAY A DISPROPORTIONATELY IMPORTANT ROLE FOR LOW-INCOME
25 RESIDENTS. EVEN AS OVERALL TRAVEL PATTERNS SHIFT, TRANSIT

1 REMAIN A CRITICAL PART OF THE DAILY TRAVEL. SO FAR WE HAVE
2 SPENT A LOT OF TIME TALKING ABOUT HYBRID AND REMOTE WORK AND
3 WHAT IS MEANS FOR TRAVEL THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE DECLINE IN
4 TRAVEL GOES BEYOND COMMUTING ON THE LEVERAGE AVERAGE DAILY
5 TRIPS FOR ERR ANDES AND SCHOOL ARE LOWER IN 2023 ACROSS ALL
6 INCOME GROUPS. ALTHOUGH THE DECLINE IS ONLY STATISTICALLY
7 SIGNIFICANT FOR THE LOWEST INCOME GROUP. ON THE RIGHT WE SEE
8 SIMILAR PATTERN FOR SHOPPING, MALES, AND SOCIAL TRIPS WHICH
9 STATISTICALLY SIGNIFICANT DECLINES CONCENTRATED AMONG HIGH
10 INCOME GROUPS. OVERALL THIS TELLS US THAT POST-PANDEMIC
11 REDUCTION IN TRAVEL REFLECTS BROADER SHIFTS IN DAILY ROUTINE
12 NOT JUST CHANGES IN WORK ARRANGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND
13 ANOTHER PIECE OF THE STORY IS WHAT IS REPLAYING SOME OF THOSE
14 IN-PERSON TRIPS. BETWEEN 2019 AND 2023 DELIVERY ROWS
15 DRAMATICALLY BOTH FOR PACKAGES AND FOOD AND GROCERIES. THE
16 CHART SHOWS PACKAGE DELIVERY THINGS LIKE ONLINE SHOPPING
17 PARCEL DROP-OFFS, ET CETERA, BETWEEN 2019 AND 2023 THE SHARE
18 OF HOUSEHOLD RECEIVING A PACKAGE DELIVERY ON MONDAY THROUGH
19 THURSDAY ROSE SHARPLY ACROSS ALL INCOME GROUPS FOR THE HIGH
20 INCOME GROUPS IT WENT FROM 64% TO 88% BUT EVENT FOR LOW-INCOME
21 HOUSEHOLDS IT INCREASED SUBSTANTIALLY FROM 45% TO 64%. THE
22 CHART SHOWS FOOD AND GROCERY DELIVERY WHICH GREW EVEN LARGER
23 AUTOMATICALLY INCREASING TO ROUGHLY THREE TIMES ITS PRE-
24 PANDEMIC LEVELS ACROSS ALL INCOME GROUPS. SO, WHILE PEOPLE ARE
25 MAKING FEWER TRIPS TO STORES OR RESTAURANTS, THEY ARE STILL

1 GENERATING TRAVEL, IT'S JUST BEING MADE BY DELIVERY DRIVERS
2 INSTEAD. NEXT SLIDE. HIGHLIGHTING SOME OF THE FINDINGS THAT WE
3 FIND MOST INTERESTING IN THIS PRE AND POST-PANDEMIC COMPARISON
4 FIRST BAY AREA RESIDENTS ARE TAKING FEWER TRIPS OVERALL THAT
5 REDUCTION IS BROAD BASED AND SHOWS UP CONSISTENTLY ACROSS ALL
6 INCOME GROUPS. SECOND, TRANSIT USE REMAINS STRONGLY INCOME
7 RELATED. LOWER INCOME RESIDENTS CONTINUE TO RELY ON TRANSIT
8 MORE THAN OTHER GROUPS AND ROUGHLY SIMILAR LEVEL BEFORE AND
9 AFTER THE PANDEMIC. THIRD, WORK-FROM-HOME ARRANGEMENTS MATTER.
10 WORKER WHO IS WORK-FROM-HOME TAKE MORE WALKING TRIPS THAN
11 THOSE WHO COMMUTE. AND THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE WORKING REMOTELY
12 OR IN HYBRID ARRANGEMENTS HAS GROWN SUBSTANTIALLY. FINALLY,
13 THESE SHIFTS IN TRAVEL BEHAVIOR COINCIDE WITH A SHARP INCREASE
14 IN ONLINE SHOPPING AND DELIVERY, WHICH HELPS EXPLAIN SOME OF
15 THE DECLINE IN-PERSON TRIPS. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS, WE'RE
16 DEVELOPING AN INTERACTIVE DASHBOARD THAT MAKES IT EASY FOR
17 STAFF, PARTNER AGENCIES, AND THE PUBLIC TO EXPLORE TRAVEL
18 TRENDS IN THIS DATA SET. AND WE ALSO ARE PLANNING AHEAD FOR
19 THE NEXT ROUND OF DATA COLLECTION IN 2026 THAT WILL ALLOW US
20 TO KEEP TRACKING HOW TRAVEL BEHAVIOR CONTINUES TO EVOLVE,
21 WHERE WHETHER SOME OF THE POST-PANDEMIC SHIFTS WE'RE SEEING
22 HOLD STEADY OR BEGIN TO CHANGE AGAIN. THANK YOU. AND I'LL BE
23 HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS.
24
25 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. COLLEAGUES, QUESTIONS?

1 YES, DIRECTOR WILLIAMS?

2

3 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU. WELL, FIRST AND FOREMOST, I WANT TO
4 THANK STAFF FOR THIS HARD WORK AND DEDICATION IN PUTTING THIS
5 DATA TOGETHER FOR US TO REVIEW. I DID HAVE A QUESTION ON, IN
6 THE PACKET IS NUMBER EIGHT, MAYBE IT'S SLIDE EIGHT THAT WE'RE
7 LOOKING AT FOR THE REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK GROWTH. AND I WAS
8 LOOKING AT WHERE MARIN, NAPA, SONOMA, AND SOLANO, FOR THE
9 AGGREGATE, WOULD USE COMBINED AS ONE. HOWEVER, MARIN AND NAPA,
10 SONOMA COUNTIES, I DO BELIEVE -- AND THIS IS MY THOUGHT
11 PROCESS, HAS A HIGHER WAGE EARNERS THAN SOLANO COUNTY
12 THEMSELVES, AND SOLANO COUNTY TENDS TO BE MORE OF A BLUE-
13 COLLAR COMMUNITY. WE KNOW THAT WE HAVE A LARGE COMMUTING BASE.
14 AND, SO, MY CONCERN IS THAT THE DATA MAY BE, IN REFERENCE TO
15 HIGHLIGHTING SOLANO COUNTY, THE DATA COULD BE SKEWED BECAUSE
16 THEY ARE -- WE ARE PART OF THIS GENERAL POOL VERSUS BEING
17 REVIEWED INDIVIDUALLY AS SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO. ALTHOUGH I
18 UNDERSTAND THEY'RE A MUCH LARGER COUNTY, BUT TAKING INTO
19 ACCOUNT THAT WE ARE CONSIDERED A HIGH COMMUTE COUNTY, I JUST
20 THOUGHT WE SHOULD HAVE BEEN LOOKED AT IN AGGREGATE
21 INDEPENDENTLY, VERSUS IN THE GROUP. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF
22 THERE'S A -- MY QUESTION THEN NOW IS, WHY WERE WE PUT IN THIS
23 GROUPING BASED ON INCOME AND THOSE TYPE OF DIFFERENT -- I
24 DON'T KNOW WHAT YOUR CRITERIA'S WERE.

25

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, DAVE VAUTIN, PLANNING
2 DIRECTOR. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE THE QUESTION SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.
3 SO, THE BAY AREA SURVEY HAS FIXED SAMPLE SIZE FOR THIS
4 PARTICULAR CHART WE SUMMARIZE THE FOUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES IN
5 AGGREGATE BECAUSE THE BARS THE MARGIN OF ERROR WILL BE TOO
6 LARGE IF WE SPLIT THAT OUT BY COUNTY HOWEVER WE HAVE OTHER
7 DATA SETS THAT WE USE FOR PLANNING AS WELL INCLUDING AMERICAN
8 COMMUNITY SURVEY WHICH ALLOWS TO LOOK AT SPECIFIC INDICATORS
9 LIKE WORK-FROM-HOME OUT OF COUNTY SPECIFIC LEVEL I THINK THE
10 INTENT WITH THIS PRESENTATION IS WHERE WE HAVE SOME ABILITY TO
11 DIVE DEEPER ON DEMOGRAPHICS OTHER THINGS WITH THIS DATA SET WE
12 CERTAINLY ARE AWARE THAT THERE ARE DIFFERENCES WITHIN THOSE
13 FOUR COUNTIES ON THE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS THIS CHARGE JUST
14 ONE LENS ON THAT.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION BECAUSE I WAS
17 CONCERNED BUT IT MAKES THE WAY YOU HAVE EXPLAINED IT. THANK
18 YOU, CHAIR.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER ECKLUND?

21

22 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST, I WANT TO SAY HAPPY
23 NEW YEAR TO EVERYBODY, 2026, AND THE OTHER THING I WANT TO
24 SHARE WITH YOU A VERY PERSONAL THING, MY MOM IS GOING TO BE
25 TURNING 99 YEARS ON TUESDAY SO I JUST WANTED TO LET YOU ALL

1 KNOW THAT AND SO SHE IS IN HOSPICE BUT SHE'S STRONG SHE DIED
2 FOR A MINUTE ON NOVEMBER 21ST AND CAME BACK TWO DAYS LATER SO
3 HOSPICE CAN'T BELIEVE HOW STRONG SHE IS SO THAT'S WHAT THEY
4 SAID ON MONDAY ANYWAY SO ANYWAY IT'S JUST A PERSONAL THING
5 THAT'S WHAT I HAVE BEEN DEALING WITH A LOT FIRST OF ALL, THANK
6 YOU VERY MUCH FOR AN OUTSTANDING PRESENTATION, YOU PRESENTED
7 IT VERY, REALLY CLEAR, SO IT RAISES A LOT OF QUESTIONS IN MY
8 MIND, BUT THAT'S BECAUSE YOU GET A GOOD PRESENTATION. SO, I
9 WANT TO GO BACK TO HOW WE GOT THE PEOPLE TO BE ENGAGED IN
10 THIS. AND HOW WERE THE HOUSEHOLDS CHOSEN? SO, WHEN YOU GOT THE
11 RESPONSES, DID WE MAKE SURE THAT IT WAS EVENLY DISTRIBUTED
12 BETWEEN ALL THE COUNTIES? SO, WHAT WAS THE CRITERIA FOR
13 CHOOSING THE ONES THAT PARTICIPATED? OR DID WE DO THEM ALL?

14

15 **FLAVIA TSANG:** IN THE SURVEY WE USED WHAT WE CALL ADDRESS BASED
16 SAMPLING APPROACH SO WE RANDOMLY SELECT HOUSEHOLD ACROSS THE
17 REGION BUT THEN WE HAVE DIFFERENT QUOTAS FOR DIFFERENT
18 COUNTIES BECAUSE WE HAVE SOME PROJECT PARTNERS THAT PAY FOR
19 ADDITIONAL SAMPLES FOR THE COUNTIES. BUT, OVERALL, BUT THEN
20 OVERALL ONCE THE COUNTY QUOTA IS DETERMINED, AND THEN THE
21 SELECTION IS RANDOM, WE DRAW FROM AN ADDRESS LIST AND SEND
22 THEM MAILINGS AND POSTCARDS TO REMIND THEM TO PARTICIPATE.

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** SO, IF WE SENT OUT SEVEN -- 100,000 INVITATIONS
25 WAS THAT EVENLY DISTRIBUTED BETWEEN ALL THE COUNTIES?

1

2 **FLAVIA TSANG:** THE PART THAT MTC PAY FOR USE EVENLY DISTRIBUTED
3 ACROSS COUNTIES BUT THEN WE HAVE COUNTY PARTNERS THAT PAY FOR
4 ADDITIONAL SAMPLES SO THEY GOT ADDITIONAL SAMPLES.

5

6 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. AND, SO, HOW DID YOU SELECT THEM? WAS IT
7 BASED ON A RAN -- AN EVEN DISTRIBUTION BETWEEN INCOMES? HOW
8 MANY PERCENTAGES REGION-WIDE?

9

10 **FLAVIA TSANG:** RIGHT. I WOULD SAY THAT -- SO, WE DRAW --
11 ACTUALLY, WE WORK WITH A CONSULTANT AND THEY HELP US PURCHASE
12 AN ADDRESS LIST OF ALL THE HOUSEHOLDS IN THE REGION AND THEN
13 WE DRAW RANDOMLY FROM THEM AND THEN OF COURSE SOME OF THEM
14 WILL RESPOND AND MANY OF THEM DON'T. AND THEN ONCE WE HAVE THE
15 COMPLETED RECORDS WE TAKE THE DATA AND APPLY WHAT WE CALL A
16 WEIGHTING PROCESS TO EXPAND THE DATA ACCORDING TO CENSUS DATA.
17 SO, ACCORDING TO A NUMBER OF KEY -- WHAT WE THINK ARE KEY
18 DIMENSIONS, THINGS LIKE AGE. SO, WE LOOK AT THE CENSUS DATA
19 AND THEN TRY TO MATCH THINGS LIKE AGE, INCOME, VEHICLE
20 OWNERSHIPS, RACE, ETHNICITY, A NUMBER OF KEY DIMENSIONS,
21 EDUCATION LEVELS, HOUSEHOLD SIZE, AND HOUSE -- YEAH.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **FLAVIA TSANG:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** ON PAGE SIX, YOU GOT ME THINKING ABOUT THIS --
3 HAVE WE TALKED TO THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO ABOUT WHETHER THEY
4 HAVE EVALUATED THE EFFECT OF THIS CHANGE, DRAMATIC CHANGE
5 ACTUALLY, HAVE A LOT LESS PEOPLE COME INTO WORK, ESPECIALLY IN
6 THE HIGHER INCOME WHERE THEY HAVE A LOT MORE FLUIDITY, LIKE
7 MONEY, SO HAVE WE TALKED TO THEM ABOUT THE IMPACT IT HAS HAD
8 ON SAN FRANCISCO? ARE WE -- WE HAVE? GOOD.

9

10 **FLAVIA TSANG:** SFCTA, THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY IS
11 ACTUALLY A PROJECT PARTNER, SO THEY HAVE ACCESS TO THIS DATA
12 AND THEY HAVE ANALYZED IT, AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THEY HAVE
13 PUBLISHED A REPORT CALLED A DOWNTOWN STUDY BASED ON THIS DATA
14 SET.

15

16 **PAT ECKLUND:** GREAT. I'LL LOOK FOR THAT ON THE WEB SITE THEN.
17 BECAUSE I'M IMAGINING IT HAD A SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON THEIR
18 INCOME SO THEY PROBABLY MAKE SOME CHANGES. AND I THINK MY LAST
19 QUESTION IS ON PAGE 14. SO, WITH THAT DRAMATIC CHANGE, HOW CAN
20 WE USE THIS INFORMATION TO EVALUATE THE IMPACT ON
21 ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS, LIKE REDUCTION AND, YOU KNOW, EMISSIONS
22 AND STUFF LIKE THAT, AND THE INCREASE IN THE DELIVERY OF
23 DRIVERS. IF -- WHAT I SEE WITH THE AMAZON TRUCKS IS THAT THEY
24 DON'T TURN THE TRUCKS OFF WHEN THEY ACTUALLY DELIVER THE
25 PACKAGES. SO, THEY'RE IDLING. AND I HAVEN'T SEEN TOO MANY

1 ELECTRIC AMAZON TRUCKS. SO, HAVE WE DONE AN EVALUATION AS TO
2 WHETHER OR NOT THE INCREASE IN 35 DELIVERY TRUCKS IS ACTUALLY
3 INCREASING THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OR NOT?

4

5 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DIRECTOR THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION YOU KNOW
6 CERTAINLY IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S AN EMERGING POLICY ISSUE. WE
7 HAVE NOT DONE AN ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS OF THAT YET BUT
8 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IN DRAFT FORM INCLUDES IMPLEMENTATION
9 ACTION TO UPDATE THE GOODS MOVEMENT PLAN FOR THE BAY AREA. AND
10 THAT PLAN, WHEN DEVELOPED BACK IN THE 20 TENS OBVIOUSLY
11 FOCUSED A LOT ON CONTAINERS COMING INTO THE PORT OF OAKLAND
12 AND FREIGHT RAIL AND ALL OF THAT, BUT THESE LOCALIZED
13 DELIVERIES AND THE GOODS MOVEMENT AT THE LOCAL SCALE, AS THIS
14 CHART SHOWS, HAS JUST TRANSFORMED IN THE PAST DECADE SO WHEN
15 WE UPDATE THAT GOODS MOVEMENT PLAN, INTEGRATING THIS DIVING IN
16 MUCH MORE AND REALLY ASKING THE QUESTION, IS THIS A NET
17 ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFIT AS PEOPLE ARE TAKING FEWER TRIPS TO THE
18 GROCERY STORE? OR IS THIS AN ENVIRONMENTAL ADVERSE IMPACT IS
19 GOING TO BE KEY.

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** HAVE WE REACHED OUT TO AMAZON TO SEE IF THEY
22 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN DOING A PILOT OF HAVING ELECTRIC
23 DELIVERY TRUCKS? THEY HAVE SOME? I HAVEN'T SEEN ANY IN MARIN
24 YET.

25

1 **SPEAKER:** WE HAVE GOT THEM. IT'S A PILOT P.

2

3 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW MORE ABOUT THAT
4 IF WE COULD GET SOME INFORMATION THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER --

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION AND GREAT
9 ANSWERS. APPRECIATE IT.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER EZZY
12 ASHCRAFT?

13

14 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU. EXCELLENT PRESENTATION.
15 THANK YOU. AND THE RESULTS ARE FASCINATING. I HAVE A QUESTION
16 ON THE GRAPH THAT IS ON PAGE FOUR THAT THE -- THAT TRANSIT IS
17 UP SINCE 2023, BUT BELOW 2019 LEVELS. AND I MAY NOT BE READING
18 THIS CORRECTLY, BUT DOES THAT SHOW THAT THERE WAS A DECLINE IN
19 2024, AND THEN IT WAS INCREASED AGAIN IN THE TRANSIT AND TOLL
20 PLAZA VOLUMES INCREASED AGAIN IN 2024 -- OR IN 2025? AND IF
21 SO, WHY IS THAT?

22

23 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, WHAT I WOULD SAY IS THESE TRENDS ARE ANNUAL
24 AND CYCLICAL, RIGHT, SO THERE ARE DIPS IN TRENDS EACH YEAR SO
25 WE TRY TO COMPARE TRENDS YEAR OVER YEAR AND WHEN IT COMES TO

1 TRANSIT IN GENERAL WE SEE YEAR OVER YEAR GAINS WHEN YOU
2 COMPARE CALENDAR MONTH VERSUS CALENDAR MONTH. I CAN'T SPEAK
3 EXACTLY TO SOME OF THE ROOT CAUSES OF SPECIFIC MONTHS YEAH YOU
4 SEE HERE THE COMPARISON.

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU AND KNOW THIS I WANT TO JUST
7 NOTE THIS IS NOT CAMPAIGNING JUST IN INTEREST OF HAVING
8 FACTUAL INFORMATION, I HAVE NO DOUBT THAT THIS IS ACCURATE
9 INFORMATION, BUT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT IN HERE HOW TRANSIT
10 RIDERSHIP IS STILL BELOW 2019 LEVELS, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
11 TO CONSIDER CONTEXT, I MEAN WE'RE STILL TALKING ABOUT MOVING
12 HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE AROUND THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE I
13 WOULDN'T WANT PEOPLE, SAY, AS WE'RE GOING INTO A BALLOT
14 MEASURE INTO NOVEMBER TO THINK THAT, WELL, GOSH, WHY WOULD WE
15 NEED THIS IF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS DOWN. I MEAN, IT'S STILL
16 VERY SIGNIFICANT FOR MOVING FOLKS AROUND THE BAY AREA. SO,
17 JUST SOMETHING TO KEEP IN MIND. AND THEN VERY INTERESTING
18 INFORMATION ABOUT HOW FOLKS WHO ARE WORKING FROM HOME ARE
19 MAKING MORE WALKING TRIPS. I THINK THAT'S GREAT. AND THERE IS
20 PROBABLY A NUMBER OF REASONS FOR THAT AND I THINK IT
21 UNDERSCORES THE IMPORTANCE FOR ALL OF US OF COMPLETE STREETS
22 AND HOW WE NEED TO PLAN FOR EVERY USER AND THEIR SAFETY. SO,
23 ANYWAY, THANK YOU FOR PUTTING ALL THIS GREAT INFORMATION
24 TOGETHER.

25

1 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THIS IS REALLY AN IMPORTANT,
4 IMPORTANT DOCUMENT. I REMEMBER IT WAS ABOUT TEN YEARS AGO, I
5 WAS TALK WITH A REAL ESTATE INVESTMENT TRUST ON SHOPPING
6 CENTERS AND WHAT BLEW MY MIND AT THE TIME WAS, THE USE, THAT
7 THEY WERE TALKING ABOUT CHANGE -- I THINK I WAS ON THE CITY
8 COUNCIL AT THE TIME -- BUT THE USE WAS GOING FROM
9 ENTERTAINMENT FROM COMMERCE, SO YOU KNOW GOING FROM THE JC
10 PENNEY'S AND THE MACY'S OF THE WORLD AND I THINK WHEN MOST OF
11 US DO, SHOPPING ONLINE IS CONVENIENT IT'S SO EASY, YOU THINK
12 ABOUT UBER EATS, OR DOOR DASH, WE REALLY THINK ABOUT THE
13 CONVENiences OF MODERN DAY LIFE. SO, WHEN I LOOK AT, SORT OF,
14 THE KEY FINDINGS THAT YOU HAVE PUT FORWARD, IT REALLY, SORT
15 OF, REFLECTS ON, I THINK ONE OF THE KEY FINDINGS IS ON THIS
16 ISSUE AROUND ITEM TWO, THAT, YOU KNOW, AROUND LOW-INCOME
17 RESIDENTS RELYING ON TRANSIT. AND AS YOU KNOW, WITH SOME OF
18 THESE SHARED SERVICES, THERE ARE COSTS THAT MAYBE PEOPLE CAN'T
19 AFFORD. RIGHT? SO, PAYING THESE EXTRA FEES ON FOOD SERVICE.
20 SO, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE DOCUMENT BEFORE US, THE
21 QUESTION IS, YOU KNOW, HOW DO YOU TAKE THIS DATA AND AGGREGATE
22 IT TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS EXECUTION ON
23 WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO IMPLEMENT MOVING FORWARD. I MEAN, I THINK
24 ONE THING THAT'S REALLY BECOME CLEAR TO ME, YOU KNOW, DURING
25 COVID WE WERE ALL, SORT OF, TALKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, EVERYONE

1 IS GOING TO GET BACK TO WORK AFTER, YOU KNOW, COVID. AND I
2 THINK WHAT IT'S ACTUALLY SHOWED US IS THAT PEOPLE WITH
3 DIFFERENT SKILL SETS, WHETHER, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE AN ATTORNEY,
4 WHETHER YOU'RE IN PROJECT MANAGEMENT, RIGHT NOW, THEY DON'T
5 REALLY NEED TO BE IN THE OFFICE. WHAT THEY CAN DO IS THEY CAN
6 USE, WHETHER IT'S SLACK OR DISCORD, THERE IS JUST DIFFERENT
7 TECHNOLOGY TOOLS THAT THEY CAN ACCOMPLISH THEIR JOB. WHICH, IN
8 THE PAST, THEY DIDN'T NEED TO USE. AND, SO, I THINK, TO ME, I,
9 SORT OF, THINK ABOUT, WELL, WHAT IS THE -- WHAT IS THE FUTURE?
10 IS THE FUTURE THAT EVERYONE IS GOING TO GO BACK TO WORK FIVE
11 DAYS A WEEK? OR WHAT IS THAT, SORT OF, NORMAL. AND I THINK
12 JUST AS AN ORGANIZATION, I THINK WHAT STAFF HAS BEEN ABLE TO
13 DO IS TO REALLY THINK ABOUT TRANSIT IN A PROACTIVE WAY. RIGHT?
14 AND, SORT OF, ADDRESSING NUMBER TWO, THAT KEY FINDING. AND
15 WITH THAT IS, CLEARLY, LOOKING AT PROGRAMS, SUCH AS BAY PASS,
16 OR LOOKING AT PROGRAMS THAT ARE REALLY GOING TO HELP THE MOST
17 VULNERABLE. AND, SO, WE'RE IN A MARKET, I -- YOU KNOW, AND
18 EVERYTHING IS, SORT OF, MARKET-DRIVEN IN WAYS WHERE, I DON'T
19 KNOW IF WE'RE GOING TO GET BACK TO PEOPLE GOING TO WORK FIVE
20 DAYS A WEEK. BECAUSE OF THE TECHNOLOGIES. BUT THAT DOESN'T
21 RELIEVE US OF OUR RESPONSIBILITY TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ABLE TO
22 TAKE PEOPLE WHO MAY BE WORKING IN A LUMBER YARD OR MAY NEED TO
23 TAKE TRANSIT TO GET TO THEIR JOB OR WHETHER IT'S WORKING AS A
24 BARISTA OR WHATEVER, I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW, ONE
25 OF THE THINGS I DIDN'T SEE IN THIS, AND I THINK WHEN WE LOOK

1 AT, YOU KNOW, PLANNING, AND I KNOW YOU'RE LOOKING AT THIS, IS
2 THIS ISSUE AROUND THE HALF MILE. RIGHT? AND, SO, WHAT I SEE
3 AROUND HALF MILE, WE HAVE DONE THAT THROUGH, YOU KNOW, WE WENT
4 THROUGH OUR BIKESHARE PROGRAM, AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES, THOSE,
5 SORT OF, TOOLS, WHAT I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING IS
6 SEEING IF THAT HAS ANY IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP. BECAUSE I'LL GIVE
7 AN EXAMPLE, YOU KNOW, I TAKE BART HERE, RIGHT? I CAN'T TAKE
8 SAMTRANS, SOMETIMES I RUN LATE. BUT I MAY TAKE A WAYMO. SO,
9 JUST KIND OF UNDERSTANDING THAT DATA AND HOW THAT TECHNOLOGY
10 WORKS, I THINK WOULD BE HELPFUL. BUT, OVERALL, THIS IS JUST A
11 GREAT REPORT. AND I WOULD JUST CHALLENGE STAFF, WE HAVE THIS
12 REPORT, BUT WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO TO -- TO EXECUTE AND, SORT
13 OF, TIMES THAT ARE CHANGING AND MAY NOT BE GOING BACK. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

17

18 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU ALSO GREAT REPORT I JOINED
19 MY COLLEAGUES IN THANKING YOU FOR IT. DAVE I'M GLAD YOU
20 MENTIONED WHEN YOU LOOK GOING FORWARD FOR PLAN BAY AREA WE'RE
21 GOING TO LOOK AT OUR DELIVERY AND FREIGHT MODEL AND OPEN IT UP
22 TO THESE LOCAL TRIPS BECAUSE THAT WAS ONE OF MY QUESTIONS AS
23 WE ARE SEEING NOT ONLY MORE LOCAL WALKING TRIPS BUT MORE LOCAL
24 TRIPS IN GENERAL WITH FAIRLY HIGH STAY AT HOME POPULATION
25 WORK-FROM-HOME POPULATION SO I WONDERED IF THERE IS A WAY THAT

1 WE CAN CAPTURE MORE ABOUT LOCAL TRIPS BECAUSE THEY ARE CAUSING
2 CONGESTION IN OUR [INDISCERNIBLE] -- WE WELCOME IT. IT'S GOOD
3 FOR RETAIL AND COMMERCIAL, BUT IS THERE A WAY WE CAN CAPTURE
4 LOCAL TRIPS IN ALL MODES IN OUR NEXT GO ROUND THAT WE DO?

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** A COUPLE THOUGHTS I MEAN THIS LATEST UPDATE WE
7 HAVE DONE WITH PLANNED BAY AREA HAS CONTINUED TO LEAN INTO
8 SERVING LOCAL TRIPS WITH ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS FOR
9 EXAMPLE, I THINK THERE IS MORE WE CAN DO IN TERMS OF LOCAL OR
10 GOODS RELATED TRIPS IN THE NEXT CYCLE AS WELL BUT GIVEN THAT
11 WE'RE SEEING THESE TRENDS CONTINUE WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2060
12 STARTING LATER THIS YEAR, I THINK THERE IS A REAL OPPORTUNITY
13 TO CONTINUE ASKING THE QUESTION ARE WE MAKING THE RIGHT TYPES
14 OF TRANSIT INVESTMENTS DO WE HAVE THE RIGHT BALANCE BETWEEN
15 LONGER DISTANCE REGIONAL SERVING INVESTMENTS VERSUS LOCAL BUS
16 FREQUENCY AND LOCAL BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN INVESTMENTS. YOU KNOW,
17 THE PLAN INCLUDES A MASSIVE INVESTMENT OF THOUSANDS OF MILES
18 OF NEW ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, TO SERVE THOSE VERY LOCAL TRIPS,
19 ESPECIALLY THE WALKING TRIPS THAT ARE WHERE WE'RE SEEING THE
20 MOST GROWTH. BUT THERE IS -- I THINK THERE IS CONTINUED
21 OPPORTUNITY, AS WE LAUNCH INTO THIS MAJOR PLANNED UPDATE WHERE
22 IT'S CLEARLY OPERATING IN THIS POST-PANDEMIC CONTEXT.

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GOOD BECAUSE I THINK THAT WE DO THE
25 GLOBAL LOOK THEN BECAUSE CHANGE HAS HAPPENED THE GRANULAR LOOK

1 IS NEEDED TO LOOK AT OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES. I WANT TO SECOND
2 COMMISSIONER WILLIAMS INTEREST IN COUNTY BY COUNTY DATA AS WE
3 GET THAT I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT AND THEN JUST FINALLY I
4 WONDERED GOING FORWARD IF IT'S POSSIBLE TO USE OUR CELL PHONE
5 DATA AND STREET LIGHT DATA TO CORROBORATE WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN
6 THESE SURVEYS. SURVEYS ARE GREAT, THEY HAVE OPT IN, WE
7 OBVIOUSLY HAD ABUNDANT RESPONSE BUT PEOPLE TEND TO UNDERREPORT
8 THEIR TRIPS SO I'M WONDERING IF WE CAN USE CONFIRMATION
9 THROUGH OTHER DATA SOURCES GOING FORWARD. ANYWAY. THOSE ARE MY
10 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

11

12 **FLAVIA TSANG:** THIS DATA SET WHEN WE COLLECT THEM IS BASED ON
13 SMART PHONE APP. SO, THE RESPONDENTS ASKED TO INSTALL THE
14 SMART PHONE APP AND THEN TRACK TRAVEL FOR SEVEN DAYS. SO, THE
15 APP ACTUALLY INFER WHETHER THEY LEAVE THE HOUSE OR NOT,
16 WHETHER THEY'RE MOVING OR NOT. SO, IT ADDRESSED SOME OF THE
17 TRADITIONAL SURVEY METHOD WHERE PEOPLE UNDERREPORT A LOT OF
18 THE SHORTER TRIPS AND SOME WALKING TRIPS.

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. I DIDN'T KNOW THAT. THANK YOU
21 FOR CLARIFYING THAT.

22

23 **DAVE VAUTIN:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS WITH THE COUNTY
24 QUESTION AS IT COMES UP A COUPLE OF TIMES WE'RE GOING TO BE
25 PUBLISHING AN ONLINE DASHBOARD WHICH WILL ALLOW FOLKS TO SEE

1 THINGS AT COUNTY SCALE TODAY'S PRESENTATION WE AGGREGATED
2 THOSE COUNTIES BECAUSE IF WE LISTED THEM INDIVIDUALLY THE
3 MARGINS OF ERROR WOULD BE TOO HIGH TO HAVE CONFIDENCE YOU
4 WOULD SEE BLANK ROWS FOR ALL FOUR IN COUNTIES WHICH WE FELT
5 WOULD NOT BE HELPFUL BETTER SHOW SYNTHESIS HERE BUT WHEN
6 MARGIN OF ERROR IS SMALL ENOUGH WE HAVE ABILITY TO BREAK DOWN
7 BY COUNTY AND THAT'S ONE THING THE ONLINE DASHBOARD CAN ASSIST
8 WITH.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** -- [INDISCERNIBLE]

11

12 **DAVE VAUTIN:** IT WILL BE PUBLISHED THIS WINTER SO WE'RE HAPPY
13 TO SEND THAT OUT TO YOU WHEN IT'S READY.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

18

19 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THIS
20 REPORT. IT'S REALLY HELPFUL TO SEE THIS DATA I THINK IT'S
21 CONFIRMED SOME OF THE SUSPICIONS THAT MANY OF US HAVE HAD BUT
22 FOR ME IT'S INSTRUCTIVE TO SAY THAT ACTUALLY WHAT WE'RE
23 WORKING WITH IS A SET OF NET LOSS OF TRIPS NOT SHIFT IN MODE
24 SHARE SO IT'S SUPER HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND. ONE QUESTION, ONE
25 COMMENT, YOU SAY YOU CONDUCTED A SURVEY FOR 2025 AS WELL? I

1 THINK I SAW THAT AT THE VERY BEGINNING? NO.

2

3 **FLAVIA TSANG:** NO. BUT WE'RE PLANNING TO COLLECT DATA THIS YEAR
4 IN 2026.

5

6 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO BUILD ON SOME
7 COMMENT FROM VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS I THINK WHERE WE HAVE
8 SEEN SOME OF THE DATA IN SAN FRANCISCO SOME OF MUNI'S GREATEST
9 SUCCESS HAS BEEN IN THEIR ABILITY TO TRANSITION SERVICE TO
10 WHERE DEMAND EXISTS MORE NEIGHBORHOOD TO NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICE
11 RATHER THAN COMMUTE SERVICE IT'S JUST BEEN WHERE MOST OF THE
12 RIDERSHIP HAS BEEN WHICH HAS BEEN, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE THE
13 BENEFIT OF BEING A DENSE ENVIRONMENT, AND SO WE CAN MAKE
14 THESE SHIFTS AND SEE THAT PLAY OUT. BUT I DO THINK THAT AS
15 WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE 2060 ANALYSIS, AND AS WE'RE ALSO
16 THINKING ABOUT WE HAVE A POTENTIAL REGIONAL MEASURE TO KIND OF
17 DEAL WITH THE IMMEDIATE FISCAL CRISIS IN FRONT OF US, WE DO
18 NEED TO BE THINKING DEEPLY ABOUT WHAT IS THE BUSINESS PLAN FOR
19 TRANSIT GOING FORWARD, GIVEN WHAT IS MORE AND MORE LOOKING
20 LIKE PERMANENT SHIFTS IN DEMAND. SO, I'LL BE SUPER CURIOUS TO
21 UNDERSTAND HOW YOU'RE APPROACHING THAT THROUGH PLANNED BAY
22 AREA. I THINK IT'S ON US TO BE KIND OF TRYING TO ENGAGE IN
23 THAT AS CREATIVELY AS POSSIBLE AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO, JUST
24 WANTED TO PUT MY EMPHASIS ON THAT AS WELL. THANK YOU.

25

1 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** SO, I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS. I'M REALLY
4 INTRIGUED BY THE APP AND WHO DID YOU RECRUIT, OR HOW DID YOU
5 RECRUIT PEOPLE TO DOWNLOAD THE APP AND ALLOW US TO TRACK THEIR
6 ACTIVITIES AND, SORT OF, FOLLOW UP TO THAT, WILL WE BE USING
7 THAT SAME TYPE OF APP IN 2025? OR FOR THE 2025 DATA GOING
8 FORWARD?

9

10 **FLAVIA TSANG:** YEAH, SO, YES, THIS SURVEY IS USING ADDRESSED
11 BASED SAMPLING METHOD SO WHAT I MEAN BY THAT IS WE WORK WITH A
12 CONSULTANT AND THEY HELP US TO PURCHASE AN ADDRESS LIST, AND
13 OUR APPROACH IS THAT WE DRAW RANDOMLY FROM THAT AND SEND THEM
14 MAILINGS AND POSTCARDS TO ENCOURAGE THEM TO PARTICIPATE. SO,
15 THEY WILL GET A LINK, A QR CODE IN THE -- ON THE POSTCARD AND
16 THEN THEY SCAN IT AND IF THEY CHOOSE TO INSTALL IT, THEN WE
17 CAN GET DATA FROM THEM. AND INCENTIVES ARE INVOLVED AS WELL.
18 THE.

19

20 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YEAH ASSUMING THERE IS A GIFT CARD OR
21 MOTIVATE TO IT I WAS CURIOUS IF THERE IS BIAS TOWARD PEOPLE
22 WHO WERE MORE TRANSIT FRIENDLY BECAUSE THEY'RE MORE AWARE OF
23 IT AS OPENED TO SOMEONE WHO MIGHT LESS FREQUENTLY BE UTILIZING
24 TRANSIT. I DON'T KNOW IF THE DATA WHEN THEY SIGN UP FOR THE
25 APP YOU HAVE SOME BASIC DEMOGRAPHIC DATA TALKING ABOUT -- YOU

1 MUST, OBVIOUSLY, BECAUSE YOU HAVE THEIR INCOME LEVEL, YOU HAVE
2 THEIR PROFESSIONS, THAT, SORT OF, THING, AND IS THERE ALSO
3 QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW REGULARLY DO YOU UTILIZE TRANSIT, THAT,
4 SORT OF, THING?

5

6 **FLAVIA TSANG:** RIGHT. YEAH, SO OBVIOUSLY WE LOOK AT THE DATA
7 UNWEIGHTED DATA TO SEE WHAT THE TRENDS ARE BUT THEN WE HAVE
8 AGAIN WE APPLY A WEIGHTING PROCESS TO MAKE SURE THAT THE --
9 THE DATA IS EXPANDED ACCORDING TO KEY DIMENSIONS IN THE CENSUS
10 DATA, THINGS LIKE, WE KNOW THAT -- WE USE IT TO MATCH THINGS
11 LIKE AGE, INCOME, VEHICLE OWNERSHIP, HOUSEHOLD SIZE, BY GENDER
12 DISTRIBUTION AND ALL OF THAT TO MAKE SURE THE DATA IS
13 REPRESENTATIVE OF THE REGION.

14

15 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AGAIN, RECOGNIZING SOME -- YOU KNOW, IF YOU
16 WERE TO OFFER IT TO PAT'S MOTHER, OR MILE 95-YEAR-OLD FATHER,
17 THEY WOULDN'T WANT TO UTILIZE AN APP [LAUGHTER] MUCH LESS HOW
18 TO USE A QR CODE SO ARE YOU FINDING THAT YOU ARE GETTING A
19 MUCH YOUNGER DEMOGRAPHIC THAT IS PARTICIPATING AS OPPOSED TO
20 SOME OF THE OLDER WORKING INDIVIDUALS WHO ARE COMMUTING?

21

22 **FLAVIA TSANG:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION I SHOULD HAVE SAID
23 THAT IN ADDITION TO THE SMART PHONE APP PEOPLE CAN ALSO CHOOSE
24 TO PARTICIPATE VIA BROWSER OR THERE IS ALSO A CALL CENTER THAT
25 WILL HELP PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE A PHONE TO PARTICIPATE

1 IN THE SURVEY.

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** OKAY THANK YOU.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, AGAIN. THANK YOU FOR ADDRESSING THE
8 DELAY AND THE ISSUES AND REALLY MOVING FORWARD TO ADDRESS ALL
9 THOSE THINGS. BECAUSE THAT IS GREAT. MY ONE QUESTION WOULD BE,
10 IS THERE ANY WAY TO USE THE CLIPPER INFORMATION IN THIS
11 PROCESS? HOPE THAT THE -- I DIDN'T MEAN TO UPSET YOU -- YOU
12 WENT -- [LAUGHTER] I WAS JUST CURIOUS IF IT MIGHT AGE YOU
13 MOVING FORWARD?

14

15 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, ONE OF THE THINGS -- COMMISSIONER PAPAN, ONE
16 OF THE THINGS THAT MAKES THIS DATA SET BOTH INTERESTING AND
17 VERY USEFUL, IT'S NOT JUST TARGETING TRANSIT. IN FACT TRANSIT
18 IS JUST A SMALL SLIVER OF TRIPS IN THE REGION. WE HAVE A WHOLE
19 ON-BOARD TRANSIT SURVEY WE DO IT WITH THE OPERATORS WE FOCUS
20 IN ON TRANSIT RIDERS. WITH THIS SURVEY, WHEN WE'RE TRYING TO
21 GET AT IS THE FULL UNIVERSE OF TRIPS TAKEN AND NOT TAKEN DUE
22 TO WORK-FROM-HOME. SO EVERYTHING PEOPLE ARE DOING FROM DRIVING
23 TO WALKING, TRANSIT, ALL OF THAT. SO I THINK THAT'S MAYBE ONE
24 KEY DIFFERENTIATOR. UNLIKE CLIPPER WHICH IS SERVING THE
25 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AUDIENCE THIS IS ABOUT EVERYBODY IN THE BAY

1 AREA.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** MASHBURN?

6

7 **MITCH MASHBURN:** PERFECT SEGUE WOO WE TALK ABOUT EVERYBODY IN
8 THE BAY AREA WE'RE TALKING ABOUT INDIVIDUALS AND COMMUTERS.

9 BUT IS THERE A STUDY OR DOES THIS STUDY IN SOME FASHION -- I
10 DIDN'T CAPTURE, I DIDN'T HEAR -- ADDRESS COMMERCE? BECAUSE IF
11 THERE IS A DECREASE IN FOLKS MAKING TRIPS LOCALLY, FOR THE
12 PURPOSES OF PURCHASING GOODS AND BUYING GOODS BUT FROM IS
13 CORRESPOND SUGGEST INCREASE IN THE NUMBER OF AMAZON TRUCKS ON
14 THE ROAD THEN THAT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO SEE AND TO KNOW.

15 BECAUSE THOSE IMPACTS TO TRAFFIC, THOSE IMPACTS TO WEAR AND
16 TEAR ON OUR ROADS TO SYSTEMS AND BRIDGES ARE GOING TO MATTER.

17 AND IF WE AREN'T MEASURING THOSE INCREASES IN COMMERCE AND
18 COMMERCIAL TRAFFIC, WHO IS? AND HOW DO WE FIND OUT THAT
19 INFORMATION?

20

21 **DAVE VAUTIN:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN, SO THIS SURVEY IS ALL
22 ABOUT THE PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA AND THEIR TRIPS. YOU KNOW,
23 THE BROADER ISSUE OF BUSINESS IMPACTS, COMMERCE, IS NOT
24 SPECIFICALLY ADDRESSED HERE, BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD
25 LIKE TO DO MORE ON. THE DATA AVAILABLE ON COMMERCIAL ACTIVITY

1 IS MORE SPARSE, AND, ALSO, SOMETIMES HARDER TO GET. RIGHT?
2 MANY OF THE DATA SETS THINKING ABOUT THESE BUSINESSES ARE THAT
3 ENGAGING IN DELIVERY, THAT'S PROPRIETARY INFORMATION THEY'RE
4 NOT KEEN TO SHARE. [LAUGHTER] BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN WE AREN'T
5 INTERESTED IN BETTER UNDERSTANDING THAT. WE HAVE THINGS LIKE
6 TRUCK COUNTS BUT THOSE ARE NOT AS ROBUST IN TERMS OF
7 UNDERSTANDING THE WHY IN THE WAY THAT THIS DATA IS ABLE TO
8 UNDERSTAND THE WHY BEHIND AN INDIVIDUAL'S TRIP AND WHY THEY
9 CHOSE DIFFERENT MODES SO I THINK THAT'S GROWTH AREA WE WOULD
10 LIKE TO WORK ON MORE IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS. MASH MAYBE
11 BRING THAT UP BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS COME UP AS
12 PINT OF INTEREST FOR LOCAL RESIDENTS IN OUR AREA AS WE HAVE
13 INSTITUTED THE EXPRESS LANE AND THE CHARGE FOR THE EXPRESS
14 LANE AND WHETHER IT AFFECTS JUST COMMUTERS OR IT AFFECTS
15 COMMERCE AS WELL AND THEIR ABILITY TO UTILIZE THAT. SO, FOR
16 FUTURE, MIGHT BE SOMETHING THAT WE LOOK AT.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER SILVA?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I THINK IT'S ON.

21

22 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT AND
23 THE ANALYSIS, AND THANK YOU FOR EXPLAINING WHY IT'S A THREE-
24 YEAR GAP BETWEEN JANUARY OF '23 AND JANUARY OF '26. IN THE
25 BEST OF ALL WORLDS, WHAT SHOULD HAVE THE TIME FRAME HAVE BEEN

1 WHEN WE'RE SEEING THIS 2023 DATA VERSUS THREE YEARS LATER.

2

3 **DAVE VAUTIN:** FIRST OF ALL, TO CLARIFY, THE DATA WAS COLLECTED
4 AT THE VERY END OF 2023, THE FALL. BUT THAT'S TWO YEARS LONGER
5 THAN WE WOULD LIKE. THE U.S. CENSUS BUREAU GETS DATA OUT
6 WITHIN JUST OVER A YEAR AFTER DATA COLLECTION. I THINK WE
7 WOULD LIKE TO WORK THIS TWO-YEAR GAP IN THE DATA COLLECTION TO
8 HAVE RESULTS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO NARROW DOWN IN THE NEXT
9 CYCLE. THERE IS A COMPLEX DATA COLLECTION EFFORT. I WANT TO
10 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WHILE THIS REPORT-OUT WITH THE FULL -- AND
11 THEN THE DASHBOARD THAT INCLUDES BROADER SUITE OF METRICS IS
12 COMING OUT IN JANUARY 2026, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE ALREADY BEEN
13 GLEANING INSIGHTS AND LEVERAGING THIS DATA IN 2025. IT WAS
14 ABLE TO BE LEVERAGED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ TRAVELING
15 MODELING SO WE WERE ALREADY ABLE TO LEVERAGE FOR THAT LAST
16 YEAR BUT GOING FORWARD WE WOULD LIKE TO SHRINK THAT TWO YEAR
17 TO A YEAR.

18

19 **CINDY SILVA:** TO SUMMARIZE WHAT I THINK YOU JUST SAID TO ME
20 THANK YOU FOR THE ANSWER THAT DATA RELATED TO THE AMOUNT OF
21 WORK-FROM-HOME VERSUS FULL-TIME IN THE OFFICE IS REFLECTIVE OF
22 LATE 2023 NOT EARLY 2023.

23

24 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YES ALL DATA SHOWN IS LATE 2023.

25

1 **FLAVIA TSANG:** OFFICIALLY THE SURVEY ACTUALLY CLOSED IN JANUARY
2 2024 BUT WE'RE CALLING 2023 SURVEY BECAUSE MOST DATA WAS
3 COLLECTED END OF 2023.

4

5 **CINDY SILVA:** WHAT WAS THE TIME OF FRAME OF COLLECTION? TWO
6 MONTHS.

7

8 **FLAVIA TSANG:** WE DID PILOT IN THE SPRING OF 2023 THEN BULK OF
9 DATA COLLECTION WAS DONE IN SEPTEMBER TO DECEMBER IN 2023.

10

11 **CINDY SILVA:** IS THERE ANYTHING IN THIS SURVEY WHERE YOU DIDN'T
12 NEED TO DO A TRAVEL DIARY, WHICH IS A LONGER PROCESS? AS
13 OPPOSED TO A PHONE, OR, IN ONE WEEK, COLLECT AS MUCH DATA THAT
14 IS POSSIBLE, THAT'S STATISTICALLY VALID FOR CERTAIN QUESTIONS?
15 IS THERE ANY OF THOSE QUESTIONS IN HERE BECAUSE IT FEELS LIKE
16 THERE ARE A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS THAT REQUIRE PEOPLE TO TELL
17 YOU WHAT'S IN HAVE DONE, YOU KNOW, NIELSEN SURVEYS FROM 50
18 YEARS AGO, WHAT ARE YOU WATCHING ON TV, HAD YOU TO DO A DIARY
19 THEN THEY PLUGGED INTO AND THEY WERE ABLE TO SEE WHAT YOU WERE
20 DOING. I DON'T KNOW IF THEY COULD SEE NOW? IS THIS PART OF
21 THIS DOABLE IN A FASTER TURN AROUND TIME FRAME SO THAT YOU
22 HAVE FRESHER DATA?

23

24 **FLAVIA TSANG:** THAT'S A VERY GOOD QUESTION. PART OF THE REASON
25 THAT THIS SUR -- WELL, WE'RE ALWAYS LOOKING FOR WAYS TO CUT

1 DOWN THE LENGTHS OF THE SURVEYS. BUT PART OF THE REASON WHY
2 THIS SURVEY IS SO LONG IS BECAUSE ONE OF THE MAIN REASONS WHY
3 WE'RE COLLECTING THIS DATA IS TO INFORM THE TRAVEL MODEL,
4 WHICH IS VERY DATA HUNGRY, AND WE NEED LOTS OF DETAILED
5 INFORMATION.

6

7 **CINDY SILVA:** I'M NOT SAYING NOT DO IT. WHAT IF YOU WANTED TO
8 GATHER A SNAPSHOT FASTER? YOU HAVE THOUGHT ABOUT IT? AND IT'S
9 REALLY A QUESTION FOR LOOKING AT WHAT YOU ARE DOING OVER TIME.

10

11 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH, I THINK WHAT I WOULD SAY IS THIS DATA SET
12 IS INTENDED TO BE VERY ROBUST ONCE EVERY THREE-YEAR EFFORT. WE
13 DO WANT TO REDUCE THE LAG. IN TERMS OF UNDERSTANDING THINGS
14 MORE MONTH TO MONTH OR EVEN KIND OF HAVE A CLOSER PULSE ON
15 WHAT'S GOING ON, THIS IS WHY WE HAVE OTHER DATA SETS THAT ARE
16 NOT AS COMPLEX, RIGHT? SOME ARE FREELY AVAILABLE COLLECTED BY
17 THE STATE, FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS, WE LEVERAGE THOSE, RIGHT? THIS
18 IS AN ADDITIONAL TOOL IN OUR TOOLBOX, RIGHT, THAT COMPLEMENTS
19 THOSE, THAT HELPS US UNDERSTAND THE, AS I SAID, THE WHY BEHIND
20 THE TRENDS RATHER THAN TOP LINE NUMBERS LIKE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
21 LIKE WE SHOWED ON THE SLIDE.

22

23 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU. AND INTERESTING QUESTIONS ABOUT AMAZON
24 DELIVERY.

25

1 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANKS. IT'S CLEAR THAT THERE IS A
2 LOT OF INTEREST IN TRYING TO HAVE DATA THAT'S GOING TO ALLOW
3 US TO UNDERSTAND THE TRENDS. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WE ALL KNOW
4 THAT WE'RE ON A CERTAIN TREND LINE, PRECOVID, AND THEN RADICAL
5 DISRUPTION IN COVID, AND THEN THIS SURVEY OCCURRED IN KIND OF
6 THAT RECOVERY PERIOD, AND WE'RE STILL ON A TRANSITION, BUT A
7 MORE CLOSER TO A NEW NORMAL. SO THAT'S WHERE THE 2026 DATA
8 WILL BE PARTICULARLY INFORMATIVE. DAVE, YOU MENTIONED THAT A
9 NUMBER OF OTHER DATA SET SOURCES, AND THEN WE HAD REFERENCE TO
10 STREET LIGHT AND WE HAVE REPLICA, WHICH ARE VERY REALTIME
11 COLLECTION OF EXTREMELY VALUABLE DATA, INCLUDING A LOT OF
12 ORIGIN TO DESTINATION DATA, AND OTHERWISE. HOW WOULD WE SEE
13 HOW THESE COMPLEMENTARY BUT NOT IDENTICAL DATA SETS, IN THE
14 AGGREGATE, GIVE US A MORE COMPLETE PICTURE? I WOULD REALLY
15 LIKE TO SEE THE UPDATES EARLY NEXT YEAR FROM OTHER DATA SETS
16 THAT WE HAVE, EVEN IF WE DON'T YET HAVE THE RESULTS FROM THE -
17 - THIS NEXT SURVEY IN 2026. AND REALLY LOOK AT HOW THEY KNIT
18 TOGETHER AND GIVE US A MORE COMPLETE PICTURE. IS THERE A PLAN
19 TO MERGE THEM TO SOME DEGREE? OR AT LEAST PRESENT THEM IN
20 PARALLEL EVEN IF THEY CAN'T BE TRULY MERGED?

21
22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WELL LET ME GIVE A QUICK RESPONSE, AND I THINK
23 FLAVIA CAN ADD MORE ON THE DATA SETS WE'RE REFERENCING. AS
24 MENTIONED, WE TRACK A LOT OF DIFFERENT TRENDS, WE, IN OVER THE
25 PAST FEW YEARS WITH THE ADMISSION AND THE ABAG BOARD, WE HAVE

1 BEEN SO MUCH IN THE WEEDS OF DOING LONG RANGE PLANS AND
2 TACKLING TRANSIT CRISIS THAT WE HAVEN'T SHARED THE CORE DATA
3 AND PERFORMANCE WORK THAT WE DO. AND WE ACTUALLY USED TO BRING
4 REGULARLY TO THE COMMISSION. WE'RE PLANNING ON BRINGING UPDATE
5 ON THE VITAL SIGNS INITIATIVE THIS SPRING WHICH WILL LOOK AT A
6 SUITE OF NEW INDICATORS THAT ARE BEING UPDATED, LOOK AT TREND
7 LINES AT THE SAME TIME THAT COME FROM A VARIETY OF SOURCES I
8 THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY WHEN THE SURVEY COMES BACK TO YOU
9 ALL IN 2027 WITH RESULTS HOPEFULLY WHERE WE CAN LOOK AT THOSE
10 CROSS COMPARE SO A FEW OPPORTUNITIES I THINK WE WOULD LIKE TO
11 BRING FORWARD TO THIS COMMITTEE SOME MORE DATA AND UPDATES ON
12 DATA LEARNING THIS YEAR THERE HASN'T BEEN ENOUGH CAPACITY IN
13 THE PAST COUPLE OF YEARS SO WE WILL TAKE THAT FEEDBACK AND
14 INTEGRATE IT. THE FLAVIA?

15

16 **FLAVIA TSANG:** I WANT TO ADD ON BIG DATA IS COMPLEX, AND I
17 THINK WHEN THOSE STREET LIGHT DATA FIRST STARTED THEY HAD VAST
18 VOLUME OF DATA FROM MOBILE PHONE FROM KIND OF TRACKING PEOPLE
19 WHEN THEY ARE USING APPS LIKE CANDY CRUSH OR GAMES OR WEATHER
20 APP OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT, BUT BIG DATA LANDSCAPE HAS CHANGED
21 A LOT. I THINK IN 2020, COMPANIES LIKE APPLE AND GOOGLE, THEY
22 HAVE PUSHED OUT MORE STRINGENT POLICY, PRIVACY POLICY, SO,
23 LIKE THE USER MOBILE USERS THEY ARE MUCH MORE AWARE OF THE
24 FACT THEY'RE BEING TRACKED AND A LOT OF THEM HAS TURNED THAT
25 OFF. SO, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT NOW THE STREET LIGHT DATA,

1 THE MOBILE PHONE WHAT THEY CALL LOCATION BASED DATA ARE KIND
2 OF DRIED UP WHAT THEY RELY ON MORE NOW IS WHAT WE CALL
3 CONNECTED VEHICLE DATA, WHICH I WOULD CAUTION THAT PEOPLE WHO
4 OWN CONNECTED VEHICLES TEND TO BE HIGH INCOME AND MAYBE THERE
5 WOULD BE ANOTHER BIAS TO THAT WE HAVEN'T YET UNDERSTOOD SO
6 YEAH IF WE DO COMPARE OUR DATA WITH STREET LIGHT, WE SHOULD BE
7 VERY CAUTIOUS AND THINK ABOUT ALL THESE FACTORS.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** YEAH, AND YOU NOTE ON COMPANIES
10 LIKE GOOGLE, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THEY NOW HAVE OPEN DATA
11 SETS THAT THEY'RE PROVIDING THAT ARE ALSO COMPLEMENTARY. SO,
12 IT'S STILL, FOR ME, A QUESTION OF HOW WILL WE GET THESE
13 DIFFERENT SOURCES OF DATA, IF NOT MERGED, AT LEAST PRESENTED
14 SO THAT WE CAN LOOK AT THEM IN PARALLEL AND TRY TO DO SOME
15 INTERPRETATION, AS WELL AS EMPLOYMENT DATA. I MEAN, WE HAVE
16 REGIONALLY HAVE GONE THROUGH PEAKS AND VALLEYS IN EMPLOYMENT,
17 AND THAT'S AN OVERLAY THAT WOULD AFFECT NUMBERS OF TRIPS NOT
18 NECESSARILY PROPORTIONS. ALTHOUGH, WE KNOW THAT TRANSIT USE
19 GOES UP WHEN CONGESTION GOES UP, SO THERE IS CORRELATION THERE
20 TO SOME DEGREE. OKAY. COMMISSIONER ROMERO.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** YES, THANKS. WE KNOW THAT
23 NATIONALLY -- AND WE'RE ALL COMPLAINING ABOUT POLLS -- IS THAT
24 POLLS ARE BECOMING LESS AND LESS ACCURATE BECAUSE OF THE
25 INABILITY OF POLLSTERS TO ACTUALLY GET FOLKS TO PARTICIPATE IN

1 THOSE POLLS, VARIOUS REASONS. WE HAVE WHAT'S SEVEN HELPED
2 50,000 FOLKS WERE MAILED THIS OPPORTUNITY SOME FOLKS OPT IN
3 SOME FOLKS OPTED OUT AND WE KNOW THAT POLLSTERS ARE USING
4 THESE REALLY COMPLEX STATISTICAL MODELING, I GUESS IT'S TO
5 MAKE UP FOR THE FACT THEY'RE NOT GETTING THESE REPRESENTATIVE
6 SAMPLES, ARE WE RUNNING INTO THAT SAME PROBLEM? THIS WAS IN
7 2023 BUT DO WE THINK WE'RE RUNNING INTO THAT SAME THING AND DO
8 WE PROPOSE -- OR ARE WE GOING TO POSSIBLY ADDRESS THAT ISSUE?
9 AND COULD YOU REMIND ME AGAIN, HOW THIS OPT-IN PIECE WORKS?

10

11 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, THE SITUATION -- OBVIOUSLY, JUST GETTING
12 PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THESE, SORT OF, THINGS WITH
13 CHALLENGES SIMILAR BETWEEN POLLING AND SURVEYS THE DIFFERENCE
14 IS UNLIKE A POLL WHERE YOU NEED TO GET SOMEONE ON THE PHONE
15 AND ASK THEM A BUNCH OF QUESTIONS WE'RE BASICALLY YOU KNOW,
16 FOR MANY FOLKS WHO PARTICIPATED THEY'RE DOWNLOADING THIS APP
17 AND INSTEAD OF SITTING IN THE BACKGROUND TRACKING THEN WE ASK
18 THEM QUESTIONS ON A REGULAR BASIS THAT HAS HELPED US CAPTURE
19 SOME OF THE UNDERREPORTING THAT HISTORICALLY HAPPENED WITH
20 TRAVEL DIARIES SO YOU CAN IMAGINE YOU ARE FILLING OUT A PAPER
21 TRAVEL DIARY BACK IN THE DAY YOU MIGHT FORGET TO WRITE DOWN
22 THAT WALKING TRIP YOU TOOK TO THE WALGREENS ON THE CORNER OR
23 COFFEE SHOP OR TRIPS YOU TOOK WITH YOUR DOG TO THE PARK NOW
24 DAYS WE'RE ABLE TO UPDATE WITH THE APP-BASED APPROACH KIND OF
25 CAPTURE THOSE SO TECHNOLOGY I THINK IS HELPING US IT DOESN'T

1 SOLVE ALL THE CHALLENGES IN THIS SPACE BUT IT HELPFUL TO DEAL
2 WITH THAT. WE DO HAVE TO DEAL WITH SITUATIONS WHERE DIFFERENT
3 DEMOGRAPHICS REPORT AT DIFFERENT LEVELS THAT'S WHERE WEIGHTING
4 AND CALIBRATION TO MATCH CENSUS DATA IS IMPORTANT. SO LONG
5 WINDED WAY OF SAYING YES WE HAVE THE SAME CHALLENGES AS
6 POLLING IN TERMS OF GETTING PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE BUT
7 TECHNOLOGY HELPS US WITH MAYBE SOME OF THE REPORTING GAPS OR
8 THINGS LIKE THAT, THAT USED TO HAPPEN.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** THANKS I'M GLAD YOUR ANSWER
11 WASN'T YOU'RE MOVING TO PREDICTION MARKETS. [LAUGHTER] THANK
12 YOU.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?

15

16 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** ADDING A QUICK FOOTNOTE. THANK YOU MISS
17 TSANG FOR TALKING ABOUT THE BIG DATA AND HOW WE CAN'T JUST
18 CAPTURE EVERYTHING FROM EVERYONE'S CELL PHONES AND TO BE CLEAR
19 IT WASN'T THAT APPLE AND GOOGLE AND OTHERS CAME FORWARD AND
20 SAID WE WANT TO RESPECT YOUR PRIVACY SO WE'RE NOT GOING TO
21 JUST COLLECT EVERYTHING IT WAS GOVERNMENT THAT TOLD THEM YOU
22 HAVE TO DO THIS BUT THERE IS A BALANCE TO BE ACHIEVED WE WOULD
23 LOVE TO GET AS MUCH DATA AS POSSIBLE BUT AT THE SAME TIME NO
24 ONE OF US REALLY SHOULD WANT OUR MOVEMENT OR EVERY MOVE. WHERE
25 WE ARE@ANY GIVEN TIME THAT SHOULD MOST DEFINITELY BE OPT IN

1 NOT JUST OPEN TO WHOEVER IS OPEN TO CAPTURE THAT SO I APPLAUD
2 THESE EFFORTS FOR LOOKING AT ALL THE DIFFERENT WAYS TO GATHER
3 DATA I THINK WE'RE GOING TO GET MORE SOPHISTICATED AS TIME
4 GOES ON AND JUST FOR THOSE OF US WHO ARE ELECTED LEADERS OF
5 CITIES AND COUNTIES YOU KNOW IT INFORMS THE KINDS OF DECISIONS
6 WE MAKE I'M ALWAYS TRYING TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO SHOP LOCAL
7 AND I KEEP DOING THAT BUT ALSO HAVE TO HAVE YOUR EYES WIDE
8 OPEN TO SOMETIMES WE NEED TO BE FLEXIBLE AND PIVOT AND LEARN
9 HOW TO DEAL WITH NEW MODELS AS WE HAVE BEEN DOING EVER SINCE
10 THE PANDEMIC AND PROBABLY BEFORE BUT THANK YOU I KNOW WE'LL
11 ACHIEVE THAT BALANCE AND GET USEFUL INFORMATION. THANK YOU.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** I'LL NOTE AN EXTENSIVE SET OF
14 QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSIONS. IT JUST SHOWS IS THE HUNGER THAT WE
15 ALL HAVE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT'S REALLY GOING ON ARE MEMBERS OF
16 THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **BOARD CLERK:** YES THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED
19 ON THIS ITEM THERE ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM AND
20 ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.
21 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** DO WE NORMALLY -- TWO MINUTES.

24

25 **BOARD CLERK:** TWO MINUTES. FIRST UP WARREN CUSHMAN. I'LL TELL

1 YOU WHEN YOU HAVE 15 SECONDS LEFT.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** ARE YOU READY?

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** READY.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE BOARD AND COMMISSION MY NAME IS
8 WARREN CUSHMAN COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING I
9 JUST WANT TO, AS WE TALK ABOUT DATA AND DATA GATHERING I WANT
10 TO GIVE YOU A VIGNETTE OF THE LIFE OF MOST OF US IN OUR
11 DISABILITY COMMUNITY. MOST PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES ARE
12 UNEMPLOYED, SOME ARE BETWEEN 60 AND 70% OF PEOPLE WITH
13 DISABILITIES HAVE NO JOBS. SO, THAT OBVIOUSLY, IS GOING TO
14 COLOR HOW WE LIVE, IT'S GOING TO COLOR HOW WE SHOP, WHAT
15 TRANSIT WE TAKE, YOU KNOW, PRETTY MUCH ALL OUR LIFE DECISIONS,
16 OUR INCOME LEVELS. SO, YOU KNOW, I JUST -- I THINK THAT'S
17 REALLY USEFUL TO THINK ABOUT FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. YOU
18 KNOW, WE FACE CHALLENGES THAT SOME FOLKS MAY NOT FACE BECAUSE
19 OF THE REALITY OF OUR EMPLOYMENT. AND, ALSO IN TERMS OF THE
20 DATA, I JUST WANT TO SAY I FOUND THIS DATA VERY INTERESTING. I
21 LEARNED A LOT, AND HOPEFULLY IN THE NEXT TIME AROUND THERE
22 WILL BE MORE SPECIFIC VIGNETTES AROUND PEOPLE WITH
23 DISABILITIES. THANK YOU.

24

25 **BOARD CLERK:** NEXT UP WILL BE ROLAND LEBRUN FOLLOWED BY ALETA

1 DUPREE. ROLAND, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO
2 MINUTES.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES, GOOD MORNING CHAIR BURT. HAPPY NEW YEAR. AND YOU
5 STOLE MY THUNDER BECAUSE I'M GOING TO FOCUS ON SLIDE FOUR BUT
6 GOING TO USE A DIFFERENT DATA ANALYSIS IS WONDERFUL BUT I'M
7 QUESTIONING THE DATA I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT NORTHBOUND 101 TO
8 SILICON VALLEY INSTEAD OF BRIDGES. JUST SOUTH OF GILROY DAILY
9 IS 80,000 VEHICLES BY THE TIME YOU REACH NORTH MORGAN HILL
10 SPECIFICALLY COMRAN, WE HAVE 142,000 VEHICLES BY THE TIME YOU
11 REACH ALAN ROCK IN SOUTH SAN JOSE 101 WIDENS SIX LANE IN EACH
12 DIRECTION CARRYING OVER 200,000 VEHICLES THAT'S MORE THAN THE
13 ENTIRE BART SYSTEM RIDERSHIP. THEN WE REACH THE 280, 6080
14 INTERCHANGE AND AT THIS POINT IN TIME APPROXIMATELY OVER
15 50,000 VEHICLES SPLIT EITHER TOWARD THE 6080 CORRIDOR WHICH IS
16 FREMONT MILPITAS, I PERSONALLY USED TO DRIVE ALL THE WAY TO
17 ALAMEDA, THE OTHER HALF STARTS HEADING TOWARDS THE CORRIDOR
18 WHICH IS APPLE AND -- THAT DOESN'T TELL US WHERE THE PARK
19 ALIGNMENT NEEDS TO GO I IN CLOSING I'M GOING LEAVE EXAMPLES OF
20 PEOPLE COMPLETELY MISSING FROM YOUR DATABASE PEOPLE NEED
21 SERVICE INDUSTRIES PEOPLE RETAIL IN CONSTRUCTION I KNOW PEOPLE
22 WHO WORK ON CONSTRUCTION IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD WHO LIVE IN LOS
23 BARONS, THEY COMMUTE AN HOUR ENFORCE EACH WAY THEY LEAVE AT
24 4:00 IN THE MORNING ARRIVE IN SAN JOSE AROUND 6:00 THEN HAVE
25 BREAKFAST OR SLEEP IN THEIR CAR THEY WILL BE AT SEVEN IN THE

1 MORNING.

2

3 **BOARD CLERK:** ALETA DUPREE YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR GOOD MORNING ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
6 RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. VERY GOOD PRESENTATION.
7 THANK YOU FOR THAT BRINGS OUT A LOT I FIND IT BEST TO USE
8 STATEMENTS MY TRAVEL PATTERNS DEPEND ON WHERE I'M@HOME I DO
9 GET A LOT OF DELIVERY BUT FOR THINGS WHERE IT DOESN'T MATTER
10 WHO PICKS OUT THINGS IN CANS AND BOXES, I DO LIKE TO GO PICK
11 OUT MEAT AND SEAFOOD AND PRODUCE AT THE SUPERMARKET MYSELF
12 PRE-PANDEMIC IN THE BAY AREA I USED TO BUY MONTHLY PASSES I
13 DON'T DO THAT ANYMORE BUT I THINK SOME OF THAT IS MORE THAT I
14 DON'T OFTEN STAY IN THE BAY AREA AS I USED TO, AND I HOPE WE
15 CAN MOVE AWAY FROM PERIOD PASSES ANYWAY BECAUSE THE ONLY
16 PEOPLE WHO BENEFIT FROM PERIOD PASSES ARE PEOPLE WHO CAN FRONT
17 THE MONEY SO WE'RE BETTER OFF WITH FARE CAPPING SLASH
18 ACCUMULATOR BUT I USE MANY DIFFERENT MODES MOSTLY TRANSIT A
19 LOT OF RAIL, BART, CALTRAIN, BUSES, I HAVE USED WAYMO, 40 --
20 FOUR-ZERO TIMES, IN ABOUT THE LAST TWO YEARS, ALL -- ALMOST
21 ALL OF THEM IN SAN FRANCISCO, BUT ALSO TWO OF THEM IN LOS
22 ANGELES. THAT HELPS ME WHEN I HAVE WHAT I CALL DOG-LEG TYPE OF
23 TRIPS WHICH INVOLVE TRANSFERS ON LINES THAT DON'T RUN VERY
24 OFTEN. IF I CAN'T GET A STRAIGHT LINE TRIP ON TRANSIT, THAT'S
25 MY PREFERRED MODE. ARE PEOPLE GOING TO COME BACK TO WORK IN-

1 PERSON? IT'S HARD TO SAY. I KNOW IN NEW YORK THEY ARE. I KNOW
2 THE SUBWAY IS UP TO 85% RECOVERY. SO, HOW CAN WE GET PEOPLE
3 OUT ON THE ROAD AGAIN AND TAKING TRANSIT? THANK YOU.

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC SPEAKERS FOR
6 THIS ITEM.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES THIS
9 ITEM.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** OKAY. THIS IS FOR THE ABAG
12 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. THIS IS AN ADJOURNMENT NOTICE. OUR
13 NEXT MEETING WILL BE HELD FRIDAY FEBRUARY 13TH.

14

15 **BOARD CLERK:** GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** OH FORGIVE ME. I THINK
18 THAT'S WHY PAT WAS NUDGING ME. [LAUGHTER] NUDGE DIDN'T WORK.
19 OKAY. IT'S AT THE BEGINNING OF THE YEAR WE'RE ALL ALLOWED A
20 FEW. [LAUGHTER] LET'S MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER
21 BUSINESS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR KEEPING US ON THE STRAIGHT
22 AND NARROW. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
25 THIS ITEM. THERE WAS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK

1 UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE
2 PUBLIC IN ZOOM THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK AROUND GENERAL PUBLIC
3 COMMENCEMENT. FIRST UP WILL BE ALETA DUPREE. ALETA?

4

5 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** TWO MINUTES.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER
8 WITH TEAM FOLDS. AS I SPEAK GENERALLY, WHAT IS THIS ABOUT
9 PLANNING? PLANNING ISN'T EASY. IT CAN BE CONCEPTUAL, ABSTRACT,
10 ESOTERIC, AND I AM MORE INTO TANGIBLE THINGS, SO, I DO LIKE
11 DISCUSSING PHILOSOPHY ON ZOOM WITH FRIEND AROUND THE COUNTRY.
12 BUT I HOPE THAT PLANNING WILL BE BOLD, IT WILL BE ABOUT
13 STAYING THE COURSE. WE HAVE A SHORT SECOND AVENUE SUBWAY LINE
14 IN NEW YORK CITY THAT I HAVE USED. IT GETS A LOT OF TRAFFIC,
15 AND THEY'RE GOING TO EXTEND IT, BUT THE ORIGINAL PLAN FOR A
16 SECOND AVENUE SUBWAY LINE GOES BACK TO THE 1920S. AND I HEAR
17 ALL KIND OF PLANS, WHETHER IT BE FOR NEW ELECTRIC BUSES, NEW
18 RAIL EXTENSIONS, NEW RAIL EQUIPMENT AND ALL KIND OF OTHER
19 THINGS. AND THEN PEOPLE GET COLD FEET, AND THEY PUNT. AND I
20 CAN UNDERSTAND THE PANDEMIC. IT'S JUST ONE OF THOSE ONE IN A
21 CENTURY TYPE OF UNFORTUNATE SITUATIONS. AND, YES, SUBWAY
22 EXTENSIONS WERE PUNTED BECAUSE OF WORLD WAR II AND THE GREAT
23 DEPRESSION, AND I HOPE WE DON'T HAVE ANOTHER PANDEMIC. TYPE OF
24 SITUATION THAT WE'RE STILL DEALING W BUT HOW DO WE BE BOLD IN
25 OUR MANNING? PEOPLE ASK ME, SAY, YOU TALK ABOUT NEW YORK ALL

1 THE TIME, WHAT'S THIS SUBWAY YOU TALK ABOUT? WELL, IT'S A
2 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. IT HAS TRAINS. MY RESOURCE FOR PLANNING
3 OFTEN IS THE NEW YORK TRANSIT MUSEUM WHICH IS THE REAL SUBWAY
4 STATION. I ASK THEY NOT GET COLD FEET IN OUR PLANNING.

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST SPEAKER WILL BE ROLAND
7 LEBRUN.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO CLOSE OFF VERY BREAST
10 LEAVE ON SOME THOUGHTS ABOUT THE, YOU KNOW, THE MEGA COMMUTERS
11 I GUESS. I HAVE OBSERVED THIS PHENOMENON, ACTUALLY IN SAN
12 FRANCISCO, BACK IN THE DAYS WHEN I HAD TO DRIVE TO THE CIVIC
13 CENTER REALLY EARLY IN THE MORNING BECAUSE I COULDN'T USE
14 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND I ALSO OBSERVED PEOPLE WHO RAN VERY
15 EARLY AND THEN THEY WERE SLEEPING IN THEIR CARS AND THEN THEIR
16 ALARM WENT OFF AND THEY WENT OFF TO WORK, AND I DON'T KNOW
17 WHAT INDUSTRIES WERE IN BUT THERE WERE DEFINITELY SOME
18 CONSTRUCTION WORKERS AND YOU KNOW THEY HAD SOME EQUIPMENT WITH
19 THEM, AND FOR SOME REASON THEY COULDN'T TAKE PUBLIC
20 TRANSPORTATION. BUT REASON WE HAVE GOT TO LOOK AT WHY THESE
21 PEOPLE LIVE WHERE THEY LIVE IN SILICON VALLEY RIGHT NOW YOU
22 NEED HOUSEHOLD INCOME IN EXCESS OF HALF MILLION DOLLARS TO BE
23 ABLE TO AFFORD, THESE PEOPLE IN THE SERVICE INDUSTRIES ARE NOT
24 ABLE TO AFFORD TO DO THIS AND WE HAVE GOT TO SOMEHOW
25 ACCOMMODATE THEM YOU KNOW THEY WANT TO HAVE A NICE HOUSE MAYBE

1 A SMALL HOME EITHER THE FRONT OR BACK OF BOTH YOU KNOW WHEN
2 THEY CAN RAISE THEIR FAMILIES THEY DON'T WANT TO BE COOPED UP
3 INTO AN APARTMENT SOME OF THEM ARE SINGLE IT'S NOT AN ISSUE
4 WITH THAT AND THE ISSUE IS THAT BECAUSE THEY LIVE OUTSIDE THE
5 NINE BAY AREA, THEY'RE COMPLETE MISSING FROM OUR SURVEYS AND
6 EVERYTHING ELSE WE DO WE HAVE TO GOT TO UNDERSTAND THAT THE
7 MEGAREGION IS A LOT BIGGER THAN NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES IT'S 14
8 COUNTIES TOGETHER IF WE DON'T INCLUDE SACRAMENTO I HOPE IT
9 STARTS LOOKING AT THAT SOONER RATHER THAN LATER. THANK YOU.

10

11 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC SPEAKERS WISHING TO
12 SPEAK UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO, ABAG AC:** OKAY WITH THAT NOW I CAN GO
15 INTO ADJOURNMENT OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE OUR NEXT
16 MEETING WILL BE FEBRUARY 14TH, 9:40 IN THESE CHAMBERS ANY
17 CHANGES TO THAT WILL BE DULY NOTED TO THE PUBLIC THIS MEETING
18 IS NOW ADJOURNED HAPPENED BACK TO THE VICE CHAIR OF THE
19 MEETING.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE
22 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD FRIDAY FEBRUARY 14TH 9:40
23 IN THESE CHAMBERS THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.

24 [ADJOURNED]