



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



October 19, 2020

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE

MONDAY, OCTOBER 19, 2020, 1:30 PM

JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR: GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JIM HARTNETT. I AM THE CHAIR OF THE FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION TASK FORCE. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. MADAM CLERK, IF WE COULD GET THE BROADCAST TEAM TO ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING



October 19, 2020

1 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE
2 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT
3 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN
4 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE
5 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS
6 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
7 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
8 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
9 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
10 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
11 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
12 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

13

14 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MADAM CLERK IF YOU COULD CALL
15 THE ROLL PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOING BY LAST NAME. MEMBER HARTNETT?

18

19 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER HURSCH.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] AC TRANSIT ON BEHALF OF MICHAEL
24 HURSH.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER FERNANDEZ?

2

3 **FRANKLIN WONG:** ATTENDING ON BEHALF OF MEMBER HERNANDEZ.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MILLER?

6

7 **KATE MILLER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MULLIGAN?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER POWERS?

14

15 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER RAMACIER?

18

19 **RICK RAMACIER:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER RANNELLS?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER TREE?



October 19, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER TUMLIN?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

9

10 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO CALL ON RICK
11 RAMACIER, CHAIR OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TO MAKE A BRIEF
12 ANNOUNCEMENT.

13

14 **RICK RAMACIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR, I WANT TO NOTE TO THE GROUP,
15 TODAY'S AGENDA LOOKS PRETTY MEATY. AND AFTER THIS MEETING
16 WE'LL CONVENE THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD. THERE ARE TWO ITEMS
17 ON THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TODAY BOTH INFORMATION ITEMS
18 THAT SHOULD BE BRIEF, AND SECONDLY RELATIVE TO THIS MEETING
19 IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING AND MARTHA CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG WITH
20 THIS UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THIS GROUP CAN GO BEYOND THE 2:30
21 TIME THAT IS SET FOR THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD IF THERE IS A
22 DISCUSSION THAT'S HAPPENING THAT'S IMPORTANT AND THE BOARD CAN
23 CONVENE AFTER THIS FINISHES. AFTER 2:30 AND IF THAT'S THE CASE
24 I WILL MAKE SURE TO GET YOU OUT BY 3:00. THANK YOU.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO THE
2 FOR INTRODUCTORY REMARKS FOR THE GENERAL TOPIC UNTIL AGENDA
3 ITEM FOUR. AS YOU KNOW WE ARE A ONE SUBJECT TASK FORCE. SO MY
4 COMMENTS WILL BE ADDRESSED TO THAT ONE SUBJECT. THAT BRINGS US
5 TO AGENDA ITEM THREE, THE CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH IS THE
6 MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT
7 CALENDAR?

8

9 **ROBERT POWERS:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO MOVED MCMILLAN.

12

13 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE ANY MEMBERS
14 OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS
17 RAISED. AND NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

18

19 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL ON THE ITEM, PLEASE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

22

23 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MADAM CLERK THAT GETS
24 US TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, THE FIRST IS THE POLICY ADVISORY
25 COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE



October 19, 2020

1 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT. BEFORE THAT
2 IS ADDRESSED, AND ITEM 5A THE PROJECT UPDATE, I WOULD LIKE TO
3 MAKE SOME OPENING COMMENTS. FIRST, THERE WAS AN OVERWHELMING
4 AMOUNT OF INFORMATION, I THINK, PROVIDED TO ALL OF US IN
5 CONNECTION WITH THESE ITEMS, AND THERE IS A LOT TO PROCESS,
6 AND I WANT TO ENSURE THE MEMBERS OF THE TASK FORCE THAT THIS
7 IS GOT THE ONLY TIME THAT YOU WILL HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO
8 COMMENT ON THE PROJECT UPDATE, AND THE STATUS, AND TO GIVE
9 COMMENTS AND DIRECTION. WE WILL HAVE ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITIES,
10 BUT THIS IS THE INITIAL CUT ON THINGS. YOU KNOW, I WOULD HAVE
11 TO SAY THIS IS A GREAT UPDATE ON THE PROJECT, AND I'M GLAD TO
12 SEE THAT SO MUCH PROGRESS HAS BEEN MADE. I REALLY APPRECIATE
13 ALL THE WORK OF THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND THE STAFF
14 WORKING GROUP FOR ALL THE EFFORTS THIS THEY HAVE MADE TO DATE.
15 IT'S A REALLY GREAT START FOR A MACRO LEVEL UNDERSTANDING OF
16 HOW AND WHERE PEOPLE ARE TRAVELING IN THE BAY AREA. I'M
17 LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THE TEAM BUILD ON THIS, AND COMPLETE
18 MORE ANALYSIS ON EXISTING CONDITIONS, ESPECIALLY WITH REGARD
19 TO MORE DETAIL ON TRANSIT SPECIFIC TRAVEL AND REVENUE
20 ANALYSIS. I PERSONALLY, AS PART OF THIS, WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE
21 BASICS OF THE EXISTING FARE STRUCTURES IN THE REGION
22 DOCUMENTED SO THAT WE CAN UNDERSTAND ALL THE EXISTING FARE
23 PRODUCTS THAT ARE USED IN THE REGION, THE DIFFERENCES IN
24 PRICING STRUCTURES BETWEEN OPERATORS AND WHICH OPERATORS OFFER
25 TRANSIT DISCOUNTS AND WHICH DON'T. AND, YOU KNOW, SIMILAR



October 19, 2020

1 INFORMATION. I THINK THIS WILL GIVE US A FULLER PICTURE OF OUR
2 EXISTING PRE PANDEMIC BASELINE AND WE CAN USE THIS FOR
3 THOUGHTFUL ALTERNATIVES. I AM INTERESTED TODAY AND IN THE
4 FUTURE TO HEAR FROM ALL OF ON YOU THAT. BUT, YOU KNOW, FOR
5 EXAMPLE, THE FINDING FROM TODAY'S PRESENTATION, THAT THE VAST
6 MAJORITY OF OUR DAILY MORNING CLIPPER CARD USERS WERE USING
7 JUST A SINGLE OPERATOR FOR THEIR COMMUTE IS REALLY VERY
8 INTERESTING. WHEN WE ARE DEVELOPING FARE COORDINATION AND
9 INTEGRATION ALTERNATIVES TO ANALYZE, I THINK IT WILL BE
10 IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT HOW MANY PEOPLE COULD POTENTIALLY BE
11 SERVED BY THE OPTION AND UNDERSTAND WHAT THE MARKET
12 PENETRATION COULD BE. SO THAT WE CAN ACHIEVE THE GOAL OF
13 GROWING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, A GOAL THAT WE ALL SHARE. I'M
14 PERSONALLY ALSO LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THE ANALYSIS ON
15 BARRIERS TO TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, AND HOPE THIS CAN BE INFORMED
16 BY THE USER RESEARCH SO WE CAN UNDERSTAND, FROM THE
17 PERSPECTIVE OF OUR RIDERS, AND NON-RIDERS, HOW FARES STACK UP
18 RELATIVE TO OTHER BARRIERS, THINKING MORE BROADLY ABOUT NEXT
19 STEPS, I WOULD URGE THE TEAM TO NOT PUT THE CART BEFORE THE
20 HORSE WHEN IT COMES TO IDENTIFYING ANNE ALTERNATIVES. WE
21 SHOULD LET THE DATA AND RESEARCH FROM THE FIRST PHASE OF THE
22 PROJECT DRIVE THE ALTERNATIVE CONVERSATION AND ANALYSIS THAT
23 COMES IN THE NEXT PART OF THE PROJECT. REALLY APPRECIATE THE
24 GOOD WORK OF THE TEAM, AND THE WORKING GROUP, AND REALLY LOOK
25 FORWARD TO THE PRESENTATION AND TO OUR NEXT MEETINGS AS WE



October 19, 2020

1 CONSIDER THAT. WITH THIS, I WOULD LIKE TO CALL ON ADINA LEVIN
2 TO PRESENT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND
3 INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
4 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT AT THIS TIME.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CAN YOU HEAR
7 ME?

8

9 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN:** EXCELLENT. ALL RIGHT. SO THE STAFF REPORT IS VERY
12 MEATY AND SUBSTANTIVE. SO I WILL BE VERY SHORT IN THAT THE
13 SUBCOMMITTEE REVIEWED THE PRESENTATION AND WAS EXTREMELY
14 APPRECIATIVE OF THE ROBUST JOB THAT THE TEAM WAS DOING IN
15 DOING USER RESEARCH AS WELL AS LOOKING AT REGIONS AROUND THE
16 U.S. AND AROUND THE WORLD FOR BEST PRACTICES, AND GAVE MANY
17 SUGGESTIONS ABOUT DOING THE RESEARCH WITH THE VARIOUS
18 COMMUNITIES THAT PEOPLE ON THAT GROUP WERE CONNECTED TO, AND
19 SEVERAL SUGGESTIONS FOR PLACES TO COMPARE TO. AND WITH THAT, I
20 WILL END THE SUMMARY OF THAT MEETING.

21

22 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DOES ANYONE HAVE ANY
23 QUESTIONS? MADAM CLERK, DO YOU SEE ANYONE?

24



October 19, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO COMMITTEE MEMBERS WITH THEIR
2 HANDS RAISED. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED
3 AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR GETTING TO THE
6 POINT ON THE VERBAL AND WRITTEN REPORT OF THE PACKET. THAT
7 BRINGS US TO PROJECT UPDATE IN ITEM 5A, THE PRESENTERS WILL BE
8 BILL BACON OF MTC AND MIKE EISEMAN OF BART, OUR COPROJECT
9 MANAGERS.

10

11 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** MIKE EISEMAN FROM BART. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

12

13 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** YES.

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WELL, TO GET US STARTED
16 HERE TODAY, WE'LL PRESENT A SUMMARY OF SOME OF THE WORK
17 DEVELOPED TO DATE, AND ASK FOR YOUR INPUT AND DIRECTION. AS
18 THE CHAIR MENTIONED, THERE IS A LOT OF MATERIAL IN YOUR
19 PACKET. WE'RE GOING TO PLAN A CALL OUT OF HIGHLIGHTS WE'RE
20 GOING TO TAKE 25 MINUTES TO DO THAT. HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS
21 OR CLARIFICATION AS WE MOVE THROUGH BUT WE HOPE TO MOVE
22 DISCUSSION TO THE END HOPING FOR 30 MINUTES ON THAT. MOVE TO
23 SLIDE TWO OF THE PRESENTATION. SO, WE'RE GOING TO -- THIS
24 SLIDE HERE LAYS OUT ALL OF THE SEVEN SCOPE ELEMENTS OF OUR
25 PROJECT. TODAY WE'RE GOING TO PRESENT INFORMATION ON TWO OF



October 19, 2020

1 THOSE FROM OUR EXISTING CONDITIONS AND BACKGROUND RESEARCH. WE
2 PRESENT INITIAL FINDINGS OF OUR TRAVEL MARKET ANALYSIS AS WELL
3 AS PEER AGENCY PRACTICES RELEVANT TO THE BAY AREA AND THEN ON
4 OUR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND USER RESEARCH WE PRESENT
5 FINDINGS FROM OUR INITIAL PILOT RESEARCH NARRATIVE WORKSHOP.
6 MOVING TO SLIDE THREE, PLEASE. TO GIVE A PREVIEW OF WHAT COMES
7 NEXT AFTER THIS MEETING, FOLLOWING TODAY'S DISCUSSION, WE WILL
8 CONTINUE TO DEVELOP THE WORK ON EACH OF THESE SCOPE ITEMS WITH
9 THE GOAL OF HAVING HIGH LEVEL FARE INTEGRATION EXAMPLES
10 SCENARIOS FOR YOU TO REACT BY DECEMBER. BASED ON FEEDBACK OF
11 THE SCENARIOS WE LOOK TO POLICY ALTERNATIVES FOR ANALYSIS IN
12 THE NEXT QUARTER CALENDAR YEAR. SLIDE FOUR PLEASE. TO BE CLEAR
13 ON OUR ASK OF YOU FOR TODAY, FIRST, WE ARE -- WILL ASK YOU TO
14 GIVE YOUR FEEDBACK ON WHETHER THESE FINDINGS RESONATE WITH YOU
15 ON YOUR AGENCY'S PERSPECTIVE OR WHETHER WE'RE OFF TRACK AND
16 INSIGHT YOU DRAW FROM THE INFORMATION PRESENTED AND NEXT STEPS
17 WHETHER THEY'RE RIGHT TO YOU OR HOW CAN WE ADJUST. MOVE
18 FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ACTUALLY ONE MORE. SO,
19 BEGINNING WITH OUR TRAVEL MARKET ANALYSIS. SO, OUR REGION HAS
20 OVER 8 MILLION PEOPLE, WITH 4 MILLION JOBS IN NINE COUNTIES,
21 AND BEFORE COVID-19 THERE WERE 27 MILLION DAILY TRIPS BY ALL
22 MODES AND 1.8 MILLION TRANSIT TRIPS. OUR MARKET ANALYSIS TO
23 DATE HAS FOCUSED ON A SNAPSHOT IN TIME BEFORE THE COVID-19
24 PANDEMIC. WE THINK WE CAN LEARN A LOT FROM THAT VIEW BUT OF
25 COURSE WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE HOW RADICALLY THE PANDEMIC HAS



October 19, 2020

1 CHANGED TRAVEL PATTERNS AND HOW THE PACE AND SHAPE OF RECOVERY
2 IS UNKNOWN WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO RECKON WITH THAT UNCERTAINTY
3 AS WE MOVE FORWARD. MOVING TO SLIDE SEVEN PLEASE. WE HAVE A
4 GRAPHIC HERE THAT GIVES AN OVERVIEW OF THE FULL MARKET
5 ANALYSIS, WHAT WE HAVE FOR YOU TO DATE ARE SOME EARLY INSIGHTS
6 FOR THE FULL ANALYSIS WHICH IS STILL IN PROGRESS. ON SLIDE
7 EIGHT PLEASE, WE JUST HAVE A LISTING HERE OF THE DATA SOURCES
8 WE'RE CONSIDERING AND CONSULTING. TODAY'S PRESENTATION
9 FOCUSING ON EARLY INSIGHTS FROM THE NATIONAL HOUSEHOLD TRAVEL
10 SURVEY WITH SOME ADDITIONAL PERSPECTIVE ON THE AMP PROVIDED BY
11 A SNAPSHOT OF CLIPPER DATA. AND MOVING TO SLIDE NINE PLEASE.
12 TO BEGIN WITH, OUR ANALYSIS CONSIDERS TRAVEL PATTERNS AT THE
13 COUNTY LEVEL. WE THINK THAT'S HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND OVERWHELM
14 FLOW OF TRIPS AT THE LARGE SCALE REGION. THERE ARE IMPORTANT
15 TRANSIT GEOGRAPHIES BELOW THAT LEVEL. THOSE DISTINCTIONS ARE
16 COMING BUT TODAY WE'RE FOCUSED ON COUNTIES. SLIDE TEN PLEASE.
17 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN OUR FROM COVID SNAPSHOT 6 TO SEVEN
18 PERCENT OF TRIPS IN OUR REGION WERE MADE ON TRANSIT. WE SERVE
19 1.8 MILLION TRANSIT TRIPS A DAY A MILLION USE CLIPPER. TRIPS
20 ORIGINATING IN SAN FRANCISCO ON TRANSIT. 4.7 MILLION TRIPS BY
21 ALL MODES CROSS COUNTY BOUNDARIES OF THOSE 16 PERCENT USE
22 TRANSIT. HIGHER TRANSIT MODE SHARE FOR INTER-COUNTY TRIPS THAN
23 INTRA-COUNTY TRAVEL DRIVEN BY THE SAN FRANCISCO COMMUTE. NEXT
24 SLIDE PLEASE. INITIAL FINDINGS ON ENTER COUNT TRANSIT TRIPS.
25 FIVE COUNTIES PROVIDE HALF OF ALL COUNTY TRIPS FOR ADJACENT



October 19, 2020

1 COUNTIES 63 PERCENT OF ALL ENTER COUNTY TRANSIT TRIPS TWO
2 THIRDS FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY AND SAN FRANCISCO MAKING UP 1/3 OF
3 ALL COUNTY TRANSIT TRAVEL. OTHER MARKETS HERE SMALLER TRAVEL
4 DEMAND WITH MODE SHARES BETWEEN 7 AND 17 PERCENT WE KNOW THE
5 DIFFERENCES IN MODE SHARE CAN BE EXPLAINED BY DIFFERENCE IN
6 TRANSIT LAND USE AND SYSTEM CAPACITY BUT WE'LL BE
7 INVESTIGATING WHETHER FARE BARRIERS PLAY A ROLE. SLIDE 12
8 PLEASE. MOST INTERCOUNTY TRANSIT TRIPS BEGIN OR ENDS IN ONE OF
9 THE FIVE LARGEST COUNTIES LARGEST SHARE IN SAN FRANCISCO.
10 COMBINE SAN FRANCISCO AND ALAMEDA COUNTIES ACCOUNT FOR MORE
11 THAN HALF THE TOTAL. THE PATTERN SUGGESTS THAT IMPROVED
12 INTEGRATION OR COORDINATION BETWEEN JUST A FEW OPERATORS COULD
13 IMPACT USER EXPERIENCE FOR A LARGE SHARE OF ENTER COUNTY
14 TRANSIT RIDERS. SLIDE 13 PLEASE. THE SO WE HAVE AN INTEGRATED
15 REGIONAL ECONOMY BUT RIGHT NOW TRANSIT IS NOT -- OR EXCUSE ME
16 -- PRE COVID, TRANSIT WAS NOT PLAYING A BIGGER ROLE FOR WORK
17 TRAVEL IN MANY MARKETS OUR SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS WORKERS AND PLACE
18 OF EMPLOYMENT. GRAPH FOR EACH COUNTY SHARE OF PEOPLE WORKING
19 IN THAT COUNTY WHO COMMUTE IN FROM ELSEWHERE, FOR EXAMPLE, A
20 THIRD OF PEOPLE WHO WORK IN ALAMEDA COUNTY COMMUTE IN FROM
21 ANOTHER COUNTY AND THREE PERCENT TAKE TRANSIT. AGAIN, HERE IS
22 SAN FRANCISCO AS OUR OUTLIER 45 PERCENT COMMUTE IN, 20 PERCENT
23 COMMUTE ON TRANSIT. PARDON ME -- COMMUTE IN ON TRANSIT, BY
24 CONTRAST SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH OVER A MILLION OF JOBS TWO
25 PERCENT OF WORKERS COMMUTING IN BY TRANSIT, AND OF COURSE



October 19, 2020

1 BARC, SILICON VALLEY COULD SHIFT THAT PICTURE. ON SLIDE 14,
2 PLEASE. CLIPPER DATA CAPTURES THE MORNING PEAK WE SEE 92
3 PERCENT OF PEAK TRANSIT TRIPS REQUIRE ONE OPERATOR. EIGHT
4 PERCENT USE TWO AND VERY FEW USE TWO OR THREE OR MORE. NOTE
5 AGAIN WE'RE LOOKING AT A SINGLE MORNING PERIOD. MANY MORE
6 CLIPPER CARD HOLDERS APPROXIMATELY 40 PERCENT DO USE MORE THAN
7 ONE TRANSIT OPERATOR OVER THE COURSE OF A MONTH. ON SLIDE 15,
8 THIS IS JUST A LOOK AT CLIPPER E FIRST DATA TO ACCESS KEY
9 AGENCY PAIRS. HIGHLIGHTING THE TOP TEN USE CASE DURING A
10 TYPICAL MORNING PERIOD MOST ARE SING AGENCY, TWO STAND OUT
11 10,000 TRIPS BETWEEN THEM. THAT'S BART TO MUNI AND AC TRANSIT.
12 BOTH AGENCY PAIRS HAVE SOME DEGREE OF FARE INTEGRATION
13 ALREADY. ON SLIDE 16, WE HIGHLIGHT SAN FRANCISCO AND ALAMEDA
14 COUNTY MARKETS. WE SAID A FAIR AMOUNT ABOUT THOSE ALREADY SO
15 I'LL SKIP THIS IN INTEREST OF TIME. ON SLIDE 17. HIGHLIGHT
16 HIGH VOLUME TRAVEL MARKETS WITH LOW MODE SHARE. ALAMEDA CAN
17 SANTA CLARA CONTRA COSTA LOW MODE SHARE. SAN FRANCISCO SAN
18 MATEO MARKET SERVED BY CALTRAIN SAMTRANS BART HAS HIGHER MODE
19 SHARE BUT TEN PERCENT DIFFERENCE. STUDY WILL INVESTIGATE
20 WHETHER FARE INTEGRATION PLAYS A ROLE. BASED ON INITIAL
21 FINDINGS NEXT STEPS SUMMARIZED HERE. WE'LL EXPLORE IN DETAIL
22 MARKET, AND FARE MARKET DEMAND. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO BILL TO
23 TALK ABOUT CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE.
24



October 19, 2020

1 **WILLIAM BACON:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A REMINDER, MY NAME IS
2 BILL BACON MTC STAFF. I'M GOING TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE
3 RESEARCH WORK AND THE EARLY INSIGHTS WE'RE USING FROM THE
4 RESEARCH ACTIVITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FIRST OFF THE PROJECT
5 TEAM ACKNOWLEDGES THE DELIVER OF TRANSIT SERVICE IN THE BAY
6 AREA -- EXCUSE ME -- I'M ON THE WRONG NOTE HERE. SORRY. THE
7 USER RESEARCH IS A KEY COMPONENT OF OUR SCOPE OF WORK, AND THE
8 PROJECT BUDGET AND THE TEAM BELIEVES GROUNDING OUR PROJECT
9 RESEARCH IS IMPORTANT TO LEARNING INSIGHTS TO LEARN HOW THE
10 PUBLICS PERCEIVES VALUE OF TRANSIT, FARE EXPERIENCE AND THE
11 POLICY AND TRANSIT SYSTEM AS A WHOLE. THE TEAM CONDUCTED OUR
12 FIRST PILOT USER RESEARCH ACTIVITY IN THE FORM OF A NARRATIVE
13 WORKSHOP. THIS PILOT WAS INTENDED AS PROOF OF CONCEPT FOR 100
14 PERCENT OR LOW ZOOM BASED RESEARCH ACTIVITY GIVEN THE
15 RESTRICTIONS OF THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC IT'S PLACED ON OUR WORK.
16 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE MOST IMPORTANT ASPECT OF OUR REMOTE
17 USER RESEARCH STRATEGY IS THE RECRUITMENT OF DIVERSE POOL OF
18 TRANSIT USERS AND NON-USERS THAT THE TEAM CAN CALL UPON TO
19 PARTICIPATE IN RESEARCH TASK OVER THE COURSE OF THE PROJECT.
20 TO ACCOMPLISH THIS THE TEAM HAS BEEN BUILDING UP A DATABASE
21 THAT CONSISTS OF 400 INDIVIDUALS WHO RESPONDED TO A TWO PAGE
22 SURVEY THAT COMMUNITY PARTNERS HAVE HELPED TO DISTRIBUTE. OUR
23 GOAL IS TO BUILD THE DATABASE UP TO AROUND A THOUSAND
24 INDIVIDUALS. AS MENTIONED OUR FIRST PILOT RESEARCH USER
25 ACTIVITY WAS THE WORKSHOP THAT BROUGHT TOGETHER A DOZEN PEOPLE



October 19, 2020

1 WHERE THEY WERE SPLIT INTO SMALL GROUPS TO LISTEN TO THE USER
2 STORIES ABOUT USING TRANSIT AND HOW FARE POLICY MIGHT HAVE
3 SHAPED THEIR USER EXPERIENCE. GO BACK TO THE LAST SLIDE. THANK
4 YOU. ALL TOGETHER, THROUGH OUR INITIAL WORKSHOP WE HEARD OVER
5 80 STORIES WHICH WE HAVE GROUPED INTO FINDINGS AND THEMES. GO
6 TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO IN THE INTEREST OF TIME, I'M
7 GOING MOVE THROUGH THIS SLIDE AND THE NEXT ONE TALKING ABOUT
8 THE 11 CATEGORIES AND ADVANCE TO SLIDE 24 I WANT TO DISCUSS
9 THE EIGHT MAIN THEMES THAT WE HEARD FROM OUR INITIAL USER
10 RESEARCH. AS YOU CAN SEE DETAILED HERE, WE HAVE GROUPED THE 80
11 DIFFERENT STORIES WE HEARD INTO EIGHT MAIN THEME CATEGORIES.
12 THESE ARE CATEGORIES THAT SORT OF WERE WOVEN BETWEEN THE
13 STORIES. SO EACH PARTICIPANT SPOKE FOR ABOUT 45 MINUTES ABOUT
14 EACH QUESTIONS IN THE INITIAL USER RESEARCH ACTIVITY WE HEARD
15 RICH AND DEEP STORIES ABOUT THEIR EXPERIENCES USING TRANSIT
16 AND PAYING FOR TRANSIT. YOU CAN SEE THE STORIES HERE, THE
17 STRESS OF RIDING THE SYSTEM, HOW CUSTOMERS ARE GOOD AT
18 RELATING, YOU KNOW, THEIR EXPERIENCES HERE TO OTHER REGIONS,
19 AND WHEN THEY TRAVEL TO OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY OR WORLD OR
20 EVEN WITHIN THE STATE, THEY UNDERSTAND THE BENCHMARK OUR
21 SYSTEMS AGAINST THOSE. INDIVIDUAL, THE NEGATIVE EXPERIENCES
22 CAN SHAPE THEIR PERCEPTIONS OF TRANSIT OVERALL, ALTHOUGH I'LL
23 NOTE THAT PEOPLE GENERALLY PERCEIVE TRANSIT AS A GOOD SYSTEM
24 IN THE REGION. THERE WERE SOME MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, I THINK,
25 WHO PERCEIVED CERTAIN FARES AS UNFAIR. THERE ARE OTHERS WHO



October 19, 2020

1 GENERALLY PERCEIVE TRANSIT TO BE A GOOD DEAL. SO A BIT OF A
2 MIX THERE, BUT I THINK IT REALLY DIFFERS BASED ON THE TYPE OF
3 TRIP. SOME CUSTOMERS OCCASIONALLY REGRET TAKING TRANSIT
4 BECAUSE THEY FELT THAT THEY OVER PAID DUE TO A LACK OF CLEAR
5 INFORMATION. AND SOMETIMES FARES INFLUENCE HOW PEOPLE THINK
6 ABOUT TRANSIT IN OUR REGION AND THEY PERCEIVE THE DISTANCES
7 THEY CAN TRAVEL BASED ON THE PRICE THAT THEY'RE PAYING. AND
8 FINALLY, THE GENERALLY THE PUBLIC WAS VERY UNDERSTANDING OF
9 HOW THE PANDEMIC HAS SHAPED TRANSIT AND HAS TOTALLY UPENDED
10 THE WAY AGENCIES ARE ABLE TO DELIVER SERVICE AND THEY WERE
11 VERY UNDERSTANDING OF THAT. NEXT SLIDE. LOOKING AHEAD, THE
12 PROJECT TEAM WILL BE HOSTING MORE NARRATIVE WORKSHOPS IN THE
13 COMING WEEKS, AS WELL AS ONE-ON-ONE INTERVIEWS. THEN
14 EVENTUALLY, ONCE WE HAVE ALTERNATIVES DEVELOPED FROM DETAILED
15 ANALYSIS, WE PLAN TO TEST THOSE ALTERNATIVES FROM A USER
16 RESEARCH PERSPECTIVE THROUGH TIGHTENING ALTERNATIVES FOR USERS
17 WHO REPRESENT THE DIVERSE COMMUNITY OF THE BAY AREA. NEXT
18 SLIDE PLEASE. IN THIS NEXT SECTION OF THE PRESENTATION WE'RE
19 GOING TO FOCUS ON THE PROJECT TEAM'S ANALYSIS OF HOW OTHER
20 REGIONS BOTH WITHIN THE U.S. AND OUTSIDE THE COUNTRY APPROACH
21 FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION. THESE ARE NOT SO MUCH BEST
22 PRACTICES RATHER AN INVENTORY TO APPROACHES TO FARE
23 INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION THAT MAY HOLD LESSONS FOR THIS
24 PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE. FIRST OFF THE PROJECT TEAM ACKNOWLEDGES
25 THAT THE TRANSIT SERVICE IN THE BAY AREA IS COMPLEX AND UNIQUE



October 19, 2020

1 GIVEN THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS THAT WE HAVE AND THE DIVERSE
2 TRANSIT MODES WE OFFER ACROSS THE VAST GEOGRAPHIC LANDSCAPE
3 WITH DIFFERENT LAND USES AND DENSITIES. REGIONS OFFERED IN
4 THIS WORK ALL OFFER DIFFERENT LEVELS OF FARE COORDINATION AND
5 INTEGRATION AND ACHIEVE IT THROUGH DIFFERENT IMPLEMENTATION
6 APPROACHES. OUR GOAL IS TO FIRST UNDERSTAND HOW TRANSIT CAN
7 EFFECTIVELY BE INTEGRATED ACROSS MULTIPLE OPERATORS OR
8 GEOGRAPHY IN THESE OTHER REGIONS AND SECOND HOW THESE PEER
9 REGIONS HAVE ACHIEVED VARIOUS DEGREES OF FARE COORDINATION
10 THROUGH DEFENDANT GOVERNMENT APPROACHES. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE
11 PROJECT EXAMINES SIX DIFFERENT REGIONS INCLUDING THREE WITHIN
12 THE U.S., ON THIS SLIDE AND THREE OUTSIDE OF U.S. EACH COLUMN
13 DESCRIBES THE REGION AND KEY TYPES OF FARE POLICIES IN THE
14 REGION AS WELL AS APPROACH TO ACHIEVING INTEGRATION AND WHY WE
15 INCLUDED THEM INCLUDING THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS INCLUDED
16 WITHIN THAT REGION. YOU CAN SEE THE THREE U.S. EXAMPLES ARE
17 THE WASHINGTON, D.C. REGION, THAT IS LED BY THE WASHINGTON
18 METROPOLITAN TRANSIT AUTHORITY. LOS ANGELES COUNTY, LARGEST
19 OPERATOR BEING LA METRO AND SEATTLE AND PUGET SOUND BEING
20 TRANSIT FROM A FARE COORDINATION PERSPECTIVE. THE COLUMNS ON
21 THE SLIDE NOTE THE DIFFERENT SORT OF TYPES OF FARES THAT THE
22 REGION OFFERS WHETHER IT'S A DISTANCE BASED OR FLAT FARE POD
23 MODEL WHETHER THEY INCLUDE PEAK OR OFF PEAK PRICING AND HOW
24 THE REGION HAS APPROACHED INTEGRATION WHETHER BILATERAL WHERE
25 AGENCIES FORM AN AGREEMENT WITH EACH OTHER FOR PASSENGERS



October 19, 2020

1 TRANSFERRING BETWEEN THEIR SYSTEMS OR IS THERE SOME TYPE OF
2 OVERARCHING REGIONAL APPROACH WHERE THERE IS A PASS OR
3 REGIONAL FARE STRUCTURE THAT APPLIES TO MULTIPLE AGENCIES. AND
4 WE'LL GET TO THAT MORE IN THE COMING SLIDES. BUT THAT'S ONE OF
5 THE KEY DIFFERENCES WE HAVE SEEN ACROSS THE SIX REGIONS IN
6 TERMS OF HOW THEY APPROACH INTEGRATION IS IT MORE A UNILATERAL
7 APPROACH TO REDUCE FRICTION OR A BROADER REGIONAL STRATEGY.
8 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE OTHER THREE REGIONS ROUNDING OUT THE
9 SIX THAT WE EXAMINED ARE TRANSPORT THROUGH SOUTH WALES WHICH
10 COVERS THE ENTIRE STATE OF SOUTH WALES BUT FOCUSED MOSTLY IN
11 THE CITY METROPOLITAN AREA. IN THE REGION IN CANADA, AND THE
12 REGION IN SWITZERLAND YOU CAN SEE THE SAME COLUMN FROM THE
13 PERVIOUS SLIDE, THE APPROACHES TO INTEGRATION. NEXT SLIDE.
14 THIS SLIDE OFFERS SOME REALLY INTERESTING WAY OF THINKING
15 ABOUT THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN EACH AGENCY. STARTING TOWARDS
16 THE TOP, WITH HOW ARE TRIPS PRICED ON THE SCALE YOU CAN SEE
17 THE AGENCIES TO THE LEFT OFFER OVER ARCHING INSTRUCT FOR FARE
18 POLICY WITH ALL MODES AND GEOGRAPHIES WITHIN THE REGION. ZVV
19 THE AGENCY TO THE LEFT IS IN ZURICH IT'S A SINGLE FARE POLICY
20 THAT APPLIED TO ALL MODES ACROSS THE AREA. IF YOU MOVE TO THE
21 RIGHT ACROSS THE SCALE THE STRUCTURE BECOMES LESS CONSISTENT
22 ACROSS THE REGION AND BECOMES MORE OF AN APPROACH TO FARE
23 INTEGRATION AND FARE POLICY THAT IS BASED ON REDUCING BARRIERS
24 TO TRANSFER BETWEEN SYSTEMS. INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES TO END SET
25 THEIR OWN FARES AND HAVE THEIR OWN FARE POLICIES AND



October 19, 2020

1 STRUCTURES BUT FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE THE IMPACT OF TRANSFER
2 BETWEEN THOSE SYSTEMS BECOMES LESS OF A BARRIER. NEXT REGIONAL
3 EXTENT OF INTEGRATION IT DOESN'T INCLUDE ALL AGENCIES WITH ONE
4 SET OF RULES NOR IS IT FOCUSED ON A SINGLE LARGE AGENCY THAT
5 HAS NUMEROUS AGREEMENTS WITH OTHER SMALLER AGENCIES. YOU CAN
6 SEE ON THE SCALE AGENCIES ON THE LEFT LIKE SEATTLE, HAVE FARE
7 POLICIES THAT APPLY TO A VARIETY OF OPERATORS ACROSS THE
8 ENTIRE REGION AND TO THE RIGHT FOCUS PRIMARILY ON A SINGLE
9 LARGE OPERATOR HAVING LOTS OF AGREEMENTS WITH OTHER TYPICALLY
10 SMALLER AGENCIES. AND FINALLY THE THIRD SCALE HERE, IS HOW ARE
11 INTEGRATION AND PRICING DECISIONS MADE. THIS IS FOCUSED ON A
12 GOVERNANCE APPROACH AND HOW ARE THE AGENCIES IMPLEMENTING FARE
13 COORDINATION, INTEGRATION IN THEIR REGIONS. STARTING LEFT,
14 THIS REPRESENTS A MORE CENTRALIZED APPROACH WHERE THERE IS
15 REALLY ONE AGENCY OR GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENT THAT IS RESPONSIBLE
16 FOR STANDARDIZING AND COORDINATING FARE POLICY ACROSS THE
17 REGION. SO YOU CAN SEE THAT IN SYDNEY AND MONTREAL. IF YOU
18 MOVE TOWARDS THE CENTER THIS IS ZURICH AND THIS REPRESENTS A
19 MORE COLLABORATIVE APPROACH WHERE MULTIPLE AGENCIES WORK
20 TOGETHER AND ZURICH HAS A TRANSIT OR NETWORK MANAGER TYPE
21 ENTITY WITH 40 PLUS OPERATORS AND THEY WORK TOGETHER ON
22 POLICY. AND TO THE RIGHT, AGAIN, IT REPRESENTS A MORE
23 AGREEMENT BASED APPROACH WHERE INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES HAVE COME
24 TOGETHER TO CREATE BILATERAL OR MULTI-LATERAL AGREEMENTS TO
25 BRING A CONSISTENT FARE PRODUCT OR POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE



October 19, 2020

1 PLEASE. THERE IS A LOT OF DETAIL ON THIS SLIDE BUT THE MAIN
2 THEME THAT'S BEING EXPLORED HERE IS HOW ARE TRANSIT FARE
3 PRESIDE IN THE INTEGRATION USED IN THESE REGIONS. ON THE
4 COLUMN TO THE FAR LEFT, THE INFORMATION IN EACH OF THE FIRST
5 CELLS IN THE LEFT COLUMN. SOME OR ALL MODES FIT INTO AN
6 OVERARCHING PRICING MODEL IN THE EXAMPLE IN THAT ROW ALL OF
7 THE TRANSIT MODES OFFERED IN THAT REGION ARE INCLUDED IN THEIR
8 FARE INTEGRATION APPROACH. SO YOU CAN SEE IN THE NAP, ON THE
9 RIGHT, WHICH IS FROM ZURICH IT REPRESENTS A ZONE BASED SYSTEM
10 THAT IS NOT SORT OF CONCENTRIC CIRCLES OR A LINEAR ZONE BASED
11 SYSTEM BUT REALLY A ZONE BASED SYSTEM THAT COVERS A NON---
12 SORT OF -- NOT CONCENTRIC REGION. YOU CAN SEE IN THE COLUMNS
13 ON THE LEFT, DIFFERING LEVELS OF INTEGRATION. DOES THE FARE
14 POLICY APPLY TO SOME OF THE MODES? OR IS IT MORE INDIVIDUAL.
15 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SORRY. IT HAD ADVANCED WITHOUT ME
16 ASKING. CAN WE CONTINUE BACK TO SLIDE 32? ON THIS SLIDE WE'RE
17 REALLY TRYING -- OKAY. ON SLIDE 32, ON THIS SLIDE WE'RE REALLY
18 TRYING TO GET AT WHAT SCALE DOES THE INTEGRATION APPROACH AND
19 WHY? IS IT FOCUSED ACROSS THE WHOLE GEOGRAPHIC AREA OR JUST
20 SPECIFIC AGENCY PAIRS THROUGH BILATERAL AGREEMENTS. AGAIN YOU
21 CAN SEE DIFFERENT EXAMPLES CALLED OUT HERE. IF WE CAN GO
22 FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 33. AND ON THIS FINAL SLIDE
23 HERE, IT'S HOW IS THE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION IMPLEMENTED
24 AND MAINTAINED? SO WHAT ARE THE VARIOUS GOVERNANCE MODELS
25 USED. IS THERE ESSENTIAL COORDINATION, IS THERE ALLIANCE OR IS



October 19, 2020

1 IT BASED ON BILATERAL AGREEMENTS. FORWARD ONE SLIDE. A COUPLE
2 OF KEY THEMES EMERGE WHICH ARE REPRESENTED ON THE HORIZONTAL
3 AND VERTICAL AXIS. INTEGRATION BASED ON CUSTOMER FARES
4 TRANSFERRING SHOWS ON THE LEFT, AND THE SINGLE STRUCTURE FOR
5 MULTIPLE MODES AND SYSTEMS APPEAR TO THE RIGHT. UP THE MATRIX
6 IT BECOMES MORE CENTRALIZED AND AS YOU GO TOWARDS THE BOTTOM
7 IT'S BASED ON BILATERAL OR MULTI-LATERAL AGREEMENTS. BOTH
8 ACROSS THE U.S. AND OUTSIDE THE COUNTRY TRANSIT OPERATORS IN
9 REGIONS ARE SIMILAR TO THE BAY AREA WITH MULTIPLE AND BROAD
10 GEOGRAPHIC REGIONS TO SERVE, HAVE ADVANCED FARE COORDINATION
11 INTEGRATION IN A VARIETY OF WAYS. IT'S NOT NECESSARILY THROUGH
12 SOME TYPE OF CENTRALIZED APPROACH AND IT'S NOT ALWAYS THROUGH
13 BILATERAL AGREEMENTS. THERE REALLY IS A BROAD RANGE AND WAY IN
14 BETWEEN WHERE SOME AGENCIES THAT HAVE A VERY CENTRALIZED
15 SYSTEM, STILL BASE THAT ON REDUCING BARRIERS TO TRANSFERS. SO,
16 I THINK WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO DOCUMENT HERE, THROUGH THIS
17 WORK, HOW VARIED FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION APPROACHES
18 HAVE BEEN AROUND THE WORLD. GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO
19 IN CLOSING HERE WE WANTED TO KEEP OUR PRESENTATION BRIEF TO
20 ALLOW FOR ROBUST DISCUSSION FROM THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS. WE
21 CAN GO FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE. WE CAN GO FORWARD ONE MORE
22 SLIDE. THANK YOU. AS WE CONCLUDE OUR PRESENTATION, WE WANT TO
23 THANK YOU -- SORRY -- CAN WE GO BACK TO 35? AS WE CONCLUDE, WE
24 WANT TO THANK YOU, AS WE HAVE KNOWN, FROM A LOT OF
25 INFORMATION, TODAY WE HAVE GONE OVER -- I'M SORRY -- CAN WE GO



October 19, 2020

1 FORWARD ONE MORE? THANK YOU. TODAY WE HAVE GONE OVER OUR
2 INITIAL PROJECT WORK RELATED TO HOW PEOPLE TRAVEL IN THE
3 REGION AND HOW FARE POLICY MAY CREATE FRICTION IN CERTAIN
4 TRAVEL MARKETS WE HAVE DETAILED USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES AND
5 PROVIDED OVERVIEW OF HOW SIX REGIONS IN THE U.S. OUTSIDE OF
6 THE COUNTRY HAVE APPROACHED FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION.
7 GO FORWARD ONE MORE SLIDE. THE DATE OF THE NEXT FARE
8 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MEETING HAS RECENTLY BEEN MOVED FROM
9 DECEMBER 7TH FROM DECEMBER 21ST TO ACCOUNT FOR THE HOLIDAYS WE
10 WILL BRING TOGETHER A HIGH LEVEL SCENARIO TO HELP WITH
11 ALTERNATIVES IN 2021. THESE SCENARIOS WILL DIFFER BASED ON
12 POLICY GOALS FROM EACH SCENARIO WHICH WILL GROW INTO AN
13 ALTERNATIVE TO PRIORITIZE. WE'LL LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING TO
14 THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ALL THE WORK THAT WILL INFORM
15 THE ALTERNATIVES WHICH WILL PROVIDE DETAILED USER RESEARCH AND
16 ANALYSIS. I WANT TO NOTE THAT AS THIS PROJECT IS ONGOING THE
17 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE IS ALSO MEETING AND
18 THERE MAY BE OPPORTUNITY FOR YOU AS THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK
19 FORCE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE FROM THIS WORK TO THE BLUE RIBBON
20 RECOVERY TASK FORCE IN 2021. WHEN THIS WAS STOOD UP, A POLICY
21 MAKER FORUM WAS INTENDED TO BE ESTABLISHED FOR MEMBERS TO
22 LEARN ABOUT THE PROJECT BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC IT HAS NOT
23 MOVED FORWARD AND WON'T DO SO UNTIL WE HAVE MORE DISCUSSION
24 WITH THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ALTHOUGH WE FORESEE
25 NEEDING TO ENGAGE WITH POLICY MAKERS TO SOME DEGREE BEFORE THE



October 19, 2020

1 PROJECT WRAPS UP. THANK YOU FOR YOUR INTEREST IN THIS WORK AND
2 WE APPRECIATE YOUR FEEDBACK AND GUIDANCE AS THE OWNERS OF THIS
3 PROJECT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH BILL AND MIKE. YOU
6 KNOW, REALLY GOOD PRESENTATION WITH HIGHLIGHTS OF TONS OF
7 INFORMATION THAT WE HAVE RECENTLY BEEN PROVIDED. A LOT OF WORK
8 BY THE PROJECT TEAM, MANAGEMENT TEAM, AND THE CONSULTANTS. AS
9 I SAID AT THE OUTSET, THIS IS NOT THE ONLY TIME WE'LL BE ABLE
10 TO PROVIDE INPUT AND REACTION TO WHAT WE HEARD, BUT THIS IS
11 OUR FIRST OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO. I THINK IT WAS TEED UP EARLIER
12 ON, WE DON'T NEED TO BE CONFINED TO THIS, THAT THERE IS A
13 DESIRE TO GET YOUR REACTION TO THE FINDINGS THAT WERE EVIDENT
14 IN THE REPORT, AND WHETHER OR NOT YOU THINK THE FINDINGS BASED
15 UPON YOUR OWN INFORMATION OR GUT FEELING ARE ON TRACK OR OFF
16 TRACK. ANY OTHER INSIGHTS THAT YOU MIGHT HAVE AS TO WHAT WAS
17 PRESENTED AND ANY THOUGHTS YOU MIGHT HAVE ON NEXT STEPS. SO
18 I'M GOING TO CALL ON THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS TO COMMENT AS
19 DESIRED. MADAM CLERK, I WON'T BE ABLE TO SEE EVERYBODY, SO IF
20 YOU CAN CALL ON PEOPLE IN THE ORDER THAT YOU SEE THEM, PLEASE?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. MEMBER TREE, YOU ARE UP FIRST. GO
23 AHEAD.

24



October 19, 2020

1 **MICHAEL TREE:** ALL RIGHT. WELL, I ENJOYED THE PRESENTATION. I
2 HAD A QUICK QUESTION. I THINK I WROTE DOWN 92 PERCENT OF THE
3 COMMUTERS IN THE AM ARE ONLY USING ONE OPERATOR. I WONDER HOW
4 THAT MIGHT VARY AS YOU GET INTO THE SMALLER OPERATORS WHO ARE
5 OFTEN FEEDER SYSTEMS INTO BART AND TO THE LARGE OPERATORS?

6

7 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** BILL OR MIKE?

8

9 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK, TO START OFF WITH, I THINK WE HAVE
10 SOME MORE WORK TO DO DIGGING INTO THE DETAILS OF THE SMALL
11 OPERATORS SO STAY TUNED FOR MORE INFORMATION ON THAT. I WILL
12 HIGHLIGHT THAT THESE ARE, THE DATA WE PRESENTED 92 PERCENT WAS
13 CLIPPER ONLY, TO THE EXTENT THAT FOLKS ARE PAYING CASH FARE
14 THAT IS NOT YET REFLECTED AS WELL. FOR THE SMALLER OPERATOR
15 LEVEL DETAIL WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO COME BACK NEXT TIME WITH
16 MORE INFORMATION ON THAT.

17

18 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** GREAT QUESTION.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP WE HAVE MEMBER TUMLIN FOLLOWED BY
21 MILLER AND RAMACIER. THE.

22

23 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION. AND I
24 THINK CONSISTENT WITH MY OWN UNDERSTANDING OF THE DATA. IT IS
25 GOOD TO SEE DOCUMENTED THE INTERDEPENDENCY BETWEEN



October 19, 2020

1 PARTICULARLY SAN FRANCISCO AND ALAMEDA COUNTIES AND THE
2 RELATIONSHIP AMONG MUNI, BART AND AC TRANSIT. THE QUESTIONS I
3 HAVE FOR YOU I DON'T NEED AN ANSWER NOW BUT WOULD LOVE SOME
4 THINKING AS WE THINK ABOUT NEXT STEPS AND EXPLORE CASE STUDIES
5 AROUND THE WORLD. IT IS VERY USEFUL TO UNDERSTAND HOW
6 DIFFERENT REGIONS FUND THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEMS. AND PARTICULARLY
7 HOW DIFFERENT REGIONS SMOOTH OUT THE ROUGH EDGES OF FARES THAT
8 INVOLVE TRANSFERS. WHO PAYS FOR THAT? SECONDLY, I THINK IT'S
9 ALSO USEFUL TO LOOK AT TO WHAT DEGREE OUR DIFFERENT REGIONS
10 USING PAST PROGRAMS, SO UNIVERSAL PAST PROGRAMS, EITHER
11 THROUGH THEIR SCHOOL OR UNIVERSITY OR MAJOR EMPLOYER OR
12 NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATIONS, AND HOW OUR PAST PROGRAMS,
13 UNIVERSAL PAST PROGRAMS ARE DEVELOPED IN A WAY THAT IS MULTI-
14 AGENCY, AND FAIR TO EASE OF THOSE AGENCIES, INCLUDING DEALING
15 WITH THE PARTICULAR TOPIC OF "ARE THOSE PAST PROGRAMS PRICED
16 ON AN ACTUAL OR MARGINAL COST BASIS?" AND ARE THOSE PAST
17 PROGRAMS SOMEHOW SUBSIDIZED BY THE REGION? THESE ARE KEY
18 QUESTIONS FOR OUR REGION AS WE TRY TO MOVE FORWARD, WE NEED TO
19 UNDERSTAND. PARTICULARLY COMPARED TO EUROPEAN EXAMPLES OF
20 WHERE THE BULK OF THEIR FUNDING COMES FROM STATE AND FEDERAL
21 SOURCES, WHEREAS WE ARE LARGELY SELF-FUNDED AT THE MOST MICRO
22 LEVEL. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** GREAT QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MILLER.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I AM WONDERING IF
4 RESEARCH STUDIES WERE DONE LINKING THE TRANSFER, AND INCOME
5 WITH THE RIDERS. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE EQUITY IN OUR
6 APPROACH. I SUSPECT THAT PEOPLE WHO ARE TRANSFERRING ARE
7 PROBABLY NOT THE HIGHEST INCOME LEVELS IN OUR COMMUTERS. THE
8 OTHER QUESTION I HAVE IS IN YOUR RESEARCH ON FARE
9 IMPLEMENTATION AROUND THE COUNTRY, WHETHER YOU EVER CAME
10 ACROSS A SYSTEM THAT WENT FROM ZONE TO FLAT FARES? AND IF SO,
11 WHAT UNDER THE IMPLICATIONS? HOW DID THEY IDENTIFY THE CHARGE
12 RATE OR DID THEY IDENTIFY OTHER SUBSIDIES TO HELP WITH THAT
13 TRANSITION? AND THOSE ARE MY QUESTIONS.

14

15 **WILLIAM BACON:** I CAN TACKLE THAT. THANK YOU KATE FOR YOUR
16 QUESTION. WITH USERS, LOOKING AT THE CLIPPER DATA WE DON'T
17 NECESSARILY KNOW THE INCOME OF THE INDIVIDUAL CARD HOLDERS
18 ALTHOUGH THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT WILL HELP AS THE
19 PROJECT MOVES FORWARD WITH THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM LAUNCHING
20 WE WILL BE ABLE TO TELL IF A CLIPPER START CARD IS USED
21 TRANSFERRING BETWEEN SYSTEMS OR NOT. SO AT LEAST THAT WILL
22 PROVIDE INFORMATION ABOUT WHETHER THE CUSTOMER QUALIFIES FOR
23 THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. AND THEN SECONDLY, IN OUR USER
24 RESEARCH TASKS, WE ARE MAKING A VERY CONSCIOUS EFFORT TO HAVE
25 THIS REPRESENTATIVE AS A SAMPLE OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS AS



October 19, 2020

1 POSSIBLE. IN BUILDING UP THE DATABASE AS MENTIONED ABOUT A
2 THOUSAND INDIVIDUALS WE DO ASK PEOPLE TO PROVIDE INCOME AND A
3 VARIETY OF OTHER DEMOGRAPHIC AND SORT OF EXPERIENTIAL
4 CHARACTERISTIC LIKE EXPERIENCE OF HOMELESSNESS IT'S IMPORTANT
5 TO REPRESENT A DIVERSE GROUP OF THE BAY AREA. WITH THAT I
6 THINK WE CAN DIG INTO MORE TO HOW LOW INCOME PEOPLE TRANSFER
7 OR DON'T TRANSFER BETWEEN SYSTEMS AND THEIR EXPERIENCES WITH
8 THAT. AND TO YOUR SECOND QUESTION ABOUT MOVING FROM A ZONED
9 BASE SYSTEM TO A FLAT BASE FARE MODEL. I DON'T KNOW OFF THE
10 TOP OF MY HEAD HOW MANY EXAMPLES WE LOOKED AT TO APPLY ACROSS
11 THE BOARD TO ALL MODES. THERE ARE MANY COUNTRIES AROUND THE
12 REGION AND WORLD THAT HAVE A FLAT BASE, FOR EXAMPLE, A LOCAL
13 BUS TRIP BUT APPLY SOME OTHER FARE POLICY OR METHODOLOGY TO
14 LONGER TRIPS, MORE REGIONAL TRIPS, OR, YOU KNOW, FERRY OR RAIL
15 SERVICES. SO, WE CAN LOOK A LITTLE BIT MORE AT THAT, BUT I
16 THINK GENERALLY THE MESSAGE WE HAVE SEEN FROM OUR RESEARCH IS
17 THAT FLAT FARES TEND TO BE CONFINED TO VERY LOCAL TRIPS, AND,
18 YOU KNOW, MOST FREQUENTLY ON BUSES, BUT AT TIMES, ON RAIL
19 SERVICE, BUT WITHIN A SMALL GEOGRAPHIC AREA.

20

21 **KATE MILLER:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND MEMBER RAMACIER?

24



October 19, 2020

1 **RICK RAMACIER:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR AND MIKE AND BILL THANK YOU
2 FOR THE PRESENTATION. I HAVE A COMMENT THAT EXTENDS MICHAEL
3 TREE'S COMMENTS AND THEN TWO QUESTIONS THAT CAN BE ANSWERED
4 LATER ON AS YOU PROCEED FURTHER INTO THE RESEARCH. THE COMMENT
5 IS -- AND IT MIGHT BE A SOFT REQUEST. ONE OF THE THINGS WE
6 STRUGGLE WITH THROUGH THE YEARS WITH COUNTY CONNECTION TO BART
7 WE MAY OFFER A DEEP DISCOUNT FOR PASSENGERS COMING OFF BART
8 AND ON TO A COUNTY CONNECTION BUS THROUGH A VARIETY OF MEANS
9 FROM OLD FASHIONED TICKETS NOW, NOW IT'S THROUGH CLIPPER. BUT
10 WHAT WE COULDN'T DO AND WE HAVE NOT BEEN ABLE TO GET TO IS
11 OFFERING A DISCOUNT TO FOLKS TO BOARD A BART TRAIN. COMING
12 FROM THE STATION THEY DON'T ALWAYS GET ON BART THERE IS A LOT
13 OF OPPORTUNITIES FOR OTHER PEOPLE TO GO PLACES ADJACENT TO THE
14 BART STATION. IF THERE IS A WAY TO GET AT THAT, IF YOU FIND
15 EXAMPLES ELSEWHERE THAT HAVE GOTTEN AT THAT, THAT WOULD BE
16 REALLY GOOD. MY TWO QUICK QUESTIONS ARE, IN THE EXAMPLES
17 YOU'RE LOOKING AT, HOW DO THEY PROCESS FARE INCREASES IF ONE
18 OPERATOR HAS A BUSINESS NEED TO INCREASE FARES, HOW IS THAT
19 HANDLED MOVING FORWARD GIVEN THAT IN SOME OF THESE EXAMPLES
20 YOU STILL HAVE INDEPENDENT BOARDS THAT HAVE FIDUCIARY
21 RESPONSIBILITIES, AND THE SECOND QUESTION WOULD BE RELATIVE TO
22 THAT, HOW DO THEY PROCESS TITLE SIX. IN THE MOST COMMON
23 EXAMPLE THAT CONCERNS ME IS WE GET TO A POINT WHERE WE HAVE
24 INTEGRATIVE FARE STRUCTURE AND IT'S DECIDED BY THE BODY WHO
25 OVERSEES THE FARE STRUCTURE THAT IT'S TIME TO DO A FARE



October 19, 2020

1 CHANGE, AND WHO DOES THE TITLE SIX? MY UNDERSTANDING IS FTA
2 WOULD MAKE EVERY PARTNER IN THE FARE PROGRAM DO THEIR OWN
3 TITLE SIX WHICH LEANS TO THE POTENTIAL POSSIBILITY OF NINE OUT
4 OF TEN AGENCIES, AND I'M MAKING THIS UP, THEY HAVE NO PROBLEM
5 WITH TITLE SIX AND THE 10th ONE DOES FOR SOME REASON. WHAT
6 HAPPENS IN THOSE CASES? I THINK THOSE ARE THINGS WE SHOULD
7 REALLY HAVE AS MUCH KNOWLEDGE AS WE CAN POSSIBLY GET BEFORE WE
8 MAKE DECISIONS DOWN THE ROAD WHERE WE GO WITH THIS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MCMILLAN.

11

12 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS GREAT INFORMATION THAT CAN BE USED
13 FOR A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT STUDIES AND EVALUATIONS THAT WE'RE
14 DOING RIGHT NOW. BUT ONE QUESTION ON THE BART, IN GENERAL, WE
15 DON'T NEED TO GO THROUGH EACH ONE. BUT I WAS TRYING TO TRACK
16 WHEN THE INFORMATION WAS RELATED TO COMMUTERS OR COMMUTED
17 TRIPS VERSUS ALL TRIPS. AND THE REASON WHY I THINK THAT'S
18 HELPFUL, IT WOULD BE INTERESTING IF WE HAD THE INFORMATION AND
19 IT REFLECTS I THINK ON WHAT KATE AND RICK WERE SAYING, IF
20 THERE IS VERY DIFFERENT PATTERNS BETWEEN COMMUTE TRIPS VERSUS
21 LOCAL, OFTEN OFF PEAK TRIPS, AND THAT TENDS TO BE CENTERED
22 WITH LOWER INCOME RIDERS TO THE DEGREE THAT THE FARE POLICY IS
23 REFLECTIVE AT ALL AFFORDABILITY FOR DIFFERENT MARKETS. YOU
24 KNOW, THAT LEVEL OF INFORMATION WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND MAYBE
25 YOU HAVE IT AND I'M JUST NOT SEEING IT AS CLEARLY AS GOING



October 19, 2020

1 THROUGH THE, YOU KNOW, THE SLIDES QUICKLY, BUT THE
2 DISTINCTION, AGAIN, BETWEEN COMMUTER BEHAVIOR AND MAYBE MORE
3 LOCAL OFF-PEAK BEHAVIOR IS JUST A DIMENSION THAT COULD BE
4 HELPFUL IN THIS. SO JUST WANTED TO OFFER THAT.

5

6 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANKS THERESE. SLIDE 13 REFERS SPECIFICALLY
7 TO WORK TRIPS, 14 AND 15 FOCUS ON THE AM PEAK BUT NOT
8 SPECIFICALLY WORK TRIPS. I THINK CERTAINLY REGIONAL PATTERNS
9 DO DIFFER, FOR WORK AND NON-WORK TRIPS, AND I THINK BREAKING
10 OUT SOME OF THOSE DISTINCTIONS WILL BE HELPFUL IN OUR NEXT
11 PHASE OF ANALYSIS HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALTERNATE [INDISCERNIBLE]

14

15 **SPEAKER:** I ENJOYED ALL THE DATA YOU HAVE COLLECTED AND THE WAY
16 YOU PRESENTED T A QUICK COMMENT OR QUESTION, I GUESS WHEN YOU
17 WERE TALK BY THE TIME RESEARCH AND STUDIES YOU HAVE DONE
18 LOOKING INTO THE LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THE REGIONS AND
19 THE INTERNATIONAL, DID YOU LOOK INTO LIKE WHAT WAS THEIR
20 ADOPTION JOURNEY LOOK LIKE? OR PERIOD OF TIME, THE PAINS, AND
21 I GUESS THE LESSONS LEARNED, AND SUBSEQUENT TO THAT IS THE,
22 ARE THEY TRULY GAINING THE CORE OBJECTIVES AND BENEFITS OUT OF
23 THIS WHOLE TRIALIZATION, WHETHER IT'S BILATERAL, MULTI-LATERAL
24 TO CENTRALIZE GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE?

25



October 19, 2020

1 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. IT'S A REALLY
2 IMPORTANT QUESTION TO UNDERSTAND IN TERMS OF HOW THE AGENCIES
3 ACHIEVED THE PLACE THEY ARE IN COORDINATION, AND YOUR QUESTION
4 IS IT SUCCESSFUL IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP, AND WHAT ARE THE
5 TRENDS IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP. STARTING WITH THAT ONE,
6 GENERALLY THESE AGENCIES DO FAIRLY WELL. THE INTERNATIONAL
7 EXAMPLES, YOU KNOW, I THINK TO SPEAK TO MEMBER TUMLIN'S
8 COMMENT EARLIER, THEY HAVE A DIFFERENT FUNDING STRUCTURE AND
9 THERE HAVE OFTEN BEEN SIGNIFICANT CAPITAL EXPANSIONS THAT HAVE
10 HAPPENED FOR THOSE SYSTEMS THAT HELPED DRIVE RIDERSHIP GROWTH
11 FOR THE PERIOD THEY HAVE IN INTEGRATE THE STRUCTURE. BUT I
12 THINK WHAT IS INTERESTING, JUST AS DIVERSE AS THE APPROACHES
13 TO COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION HAS BEEN HOW THEY HAVE --
14 THEIR JOURNEYS TO ACHIEVING THAT. SOME HAVE VERY MUCH BEEN
15 DRIVEN BY A TOP DOWN APPROACH WHERE THERE HAS BEEN STATE OR
16 NATIONAL DIRECTIVE PROMOTING INTEGRATION. AN EXAMPLE OF THAT
17 WOULD BE IN SOUTH WALES AND AUSTRALIA WHERE THERE HAVE BEEN
18 STATE LEVEL DIRECTIVE TO INTEGRATE AND HAVE A CONSISTENT
19 POLICY ACROSS ALL TRANSIT MODES AROUND SYDNEY AND METROPOLITAN
20 AREA. THEY'RE ALL OFFERED BY ONE AGENCY BUT IN THE PAST HAD
21 DIFFERENT STRUCTURES FOR PRICE THAT MADE IT DIFFERENT FOR
22 USERS TO USE EACH MODE. SO NOW THERE IS A CONSISTENT MODE THAT
23 ALLOWS PEOPLE TO TRANSFER. SO THAT WAS TOP DOWN. I THINK A
24 DIFFERENT APPROACH WOULD BE IN SEATTLE WHERE I'LL SPEAK TO THE
25 PUGET PAST, WHICH WAS A PROJECT THAT WAS DRIVEN FROM THE



October 19, 2020

1 GROUND UP BY THE COMMUNITY, EMPLOYER, OPERATORS REALLY WANTING
2 TO OFFER TO CUSTOMERS, TO EMPLOYERS AND THOUSANDS OF EMPLOYEES
3 TO WORK ON ALL MODES IN THAT REGION AND NOT JUST ON A SPECIFIC
4 PRODUCT. THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS IN THE BAY AREA WE COULDN'T
5 CURRENTLY OFFER WE DON'T HAVE A SINGLE PASS OR PRODUCT THAT IS
6 AVAILABLE. WE HAVE CLIPPER WHICH OFFERS CASH VALUE WHICH IS A
7 PREMISE BENEFIT BUT THERE ISN'T A PASS OR PRODUCT. THAT AGAIN
8 SPEAKS TO THE DIFFERENT APPROACHES. SOME APPROACH IN AN
9 ORGANIC WAY. I THINK WE CAN DIG IN MORE AND SHARE INSIGHTS AS
10 THE WORK PROGRESSES. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MORE COMMITTEE MEMBERS WITH
13 THEIR HANDS RAISED AT THIS MOMENT.

14

15 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** OKAY BEFORE WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT, LAST
16 OPPORTUNITY, ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS OR THE ONES WHO HAVE
17 ALREADY COMMENTED WISH TO ADD ANYTHING FURTHER?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE MEMBER POWERS WITH HIS HAND RAISED.

20

21 **ROBERT POWERS:** TWO COMMENTS, NOT NECESSARILY TO BE ANSWERED
22 RIGHT NOW BY MR. BACON AND MR. EISEMAN AT SOME POINT THERE IS
23 A PHILOSOPHICAL QUESTION YOU HAVE TO ANSWER IT SEEMS TO ME
24 FROM LOOKING AT THE DATA THAT ALL THE DATA IS BASED ON PRE
25 COVID. YOU'RE LOOKING AT PRE COVID, AND WE'RE GOING TO USE



October 19, 2020

1 THIS DATA FOR BETTERMENTS, IMPROVEMENTS, DECISIONS THAT ARE
2 POST COVID, AND YOU KNOW, HOW DO YOU -- WHEN'S THE PLAN TO
3 BRIDGE THAT GAP? AND I HAVE HAD A COUPLE OF PHILOSOPHICAL
4 DISCUSSIONS WITH DR. TANG WHO HAPPENS TO WORK AT BART AND I
5 WOULD SAY IS PROBABLY THE BEST MODELER THIS SIDE OF THE
6 MISSISSIPPI RIVER, BUT AT SOME POINT, HOW DO YOU BRIDGE THAT
7 GAP? AND WHAT'S THE POST PROCESSING USED? BECAUSE YOU DON'T
8 WANT DATA SETS THAT, YOU KNOW, REALLY, OUR FUTURE IS NOT IN
9 THOSE DATA SETS, RIGHT? THAT'S ALL PRE COVID. WE ARE NOT GOING
10 BACK TO PRE COVID AT -- YOU KNOW, IT'S GOING TO BE A DIFFERENT
11 WORLD MOVING FORWARD. SO THAT'S ONE AREA, AND THEN THE OTHER
12 ONE IS ON THAT SLIDE 36, MR. EISEMAN, AND MR. BACON -- OR
13 MAYBE IT WAS 37. YOU DON'T NEED TO GO BACK TO IT NOW, BUT IT
14 CAUGHT ME AS YOU SAID, SOMEBODY SAID, WELL, WE KNOW HOW PEOPLE
15 ARE TRAVELING, BUT DO WE -- DO YOU THINK YOU HAVE A GOOD SENSE
16 ON WHERE, THE ONDS WHERE THEY'RE COMING FROM AND WHERE THEY'RE
17 GOING TO? I GET THAT YOU SAID -- YOU CHOSE THOSE WORDS VERY
18 CAREFULLY, IT SOUNDED, BUT HOW THEY'RE TRAVELING, THAT'S
19 DIFFERENT FROM WHERE THEY'RE COMING FROM AND WHERE THEY'RE
20 GOING TO. SO, JUST TWO COMMENTS, AND QUESTIONS FOR US TO --
21 YOU KNOW, AND YOU MIGHT NEED SOME HELP WITH THIS BOARD ON THAT
22 FIRST QUESTION AT SOME POINT. AND I DON'T KNOW, JIM, IF YOU
23 WANT TO TURN IT BACK OVER TO MR. BACON AND MR. EISEMAN, BUT I
24 DON'T NECESSARILY NEED A 30 MINUTE RESPONSE RIGHT NOW.
25



October 19, 2020

1 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE A 30 SECOND RESPONSE?

2

3 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WE'LL LEAVE THE FULL RESPONSE FOR ANOTHER
4 DAY. BUT JUST REALLY QUICKLY. YES. ABSOLUTELY, ALL OF THE DATA
5 PRESENTED IS PRE COVID. IT'S A REAL WEAKNESS AND TO BE TOTALLY
6 CANDID WITH YOU WE DON'T HAVE A PLAN FOR HOW TO RECONCILE THE
7 NEW REALITY. IT'S THE SAME QUESTION FACING ALL OF OUR DECISION
8 MAKING. THE ENORMOUS UNCERTAINTY IN THE POST COVID WORLD AND
9 HOW IT WILL CHANGE OVER TIME, CERTAINLY THAT'S A NEXT STEP
10 HERE IS TO SORT OF FORMULATE THE PATH FORWARD THERE, AND
11 DEFINITELY OPEN TO GUIDANCE FROM THIS GROUP AS TO HOW TO BEST
12 THINK ABOUT IT. WE DO -- WE HAVE PRETTY GOOD ODS FROM THE --
13 FROM THE NATIONAL HOUSEHOLD TRAVEL SURVEY. IT'S SUMMARIZED IN
14 A BUNCH OF DIFFERENT WAYS IN THE APPENDIX IN THIS PRESENTATION
15 AT THE COUNTY LEVEL THAT DATA GOES DOWN THROUGH SUBCOUNTY
16 LEVEL AS WELL. ALSO OUR NEXT STEP IS DIGGING INTO THE CLIPPER
17 DATA AND ON THE AGENCY LEVEL BOARDINGS AND LANDINGS TO GET
18 SOME MORE DETAIL ON THE ODS FOR THE KEY MARKETS.

19

20 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MADAM CLERK, ANYBODY ELSE?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MORE MEMBERS AND WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF
23 THE PUBLIC.

24



October 19, 2020

1 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** BASED ON BOB POWERS RESPONSE ON THE DATA.
2 I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO BE DATA-DRIVEN AND WE'RE GOING TO
3 HAVE TO BE CAREFUL ABOUT WHAT CONCLUSIONS WE DRAW FROM THE PRE
4 COVID DATA IN HOW WE BRIDGE THAT GAP THAT BOB TALKED ABOUT. I
5 HAVE TO BELIEVE THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME VALID LESSONS
6 LEARNED FROM THE PRE COVID DATA THAT ARE LIKELY TO BE
7 APPLICABLE, POST COVID, BUT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO
8 APPROACH THAT WITH SOME SENSITIVITY, I THINK. WITH THAT, THIS
9 IS A TIME FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEM 5A. AND WE ALREADY
10 HAVE TWO IN LINE. MADAM CLERK, YOU WOULD PLEASE CALL THE
11 PUBLIC?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE THEM?

14

15 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** UP TO TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ADINA YOU'RE FIRST UP. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
18 YOURSELF.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND I AM ON THE POLICY
21 ADVISORY COUNCIL SUBCOMMITTEE WORKING ON THIS, BUT SPEAKING
22 FOR MYSELF. FIRST OF ALL, I AM REALLY GLAD TO SEE THERE IS A
23 RANGE EVER OPTIONS BEING CONSIDERED, AND I THINK THAT THAT IS
24 GOOD, AND I HOPE THAT DOES FLOW THROUGH, SO AS A REGION WE CAN
25 REALLY THINK ABOUT WHAT THOSE CHOICES MAY BE. A COUPLE OF



October 19, 2020

1 OTHER ITEMS COMING FROM SOME OF THE PARTS OF THE REGION THAT I
2 KNOW BEST. SO SOME OF THE ISSUES ABOUT FARE INTEGRATION ARE
3 BEING LOOKED AT AS A MULTI-COUNTY. HOWEVER, LOOKING, EVEN AT
4 SAN MATEO COUNTY, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S BEEN REALLY
5 INTERESTING AND SOMEWHAT SURPRISING IN COMING FROM THE
6 SAMTRANS REIMAGINED SAMTRANS QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
7 RESEARCH WAS THAT ONE OF THE TOP PRIORITIES FOR SAMTRANS USERS
8 WAS WANTING BETTER SERVICE AND FARE COORDINATION WITH RAIL.
9 AND ALSO IN CALTRAIN EQUITY STUDY IT TALKS ABOUT HAVING
10 INTEGRATION, BETTER COORDINATION, WITH LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICE,
11 AS A KEY EQUITY MEASURE. BECAUSE LOW INCOME PEOPLE ARE MUCH
12 MORE LIKELY TO WANT TO TAKE LOCAL TRANSIT TO BE ABLE TO GET TO
13 THAT REGIONAL TRANSIT, AND SO I THINK IN ADDITION LOOKING AT
14 WHAT PEOPLE DO NOW, THERE ARE QUESTIONS AND EQUITY
15 CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT MAKING SOME OF THESE FARE INTEGRATION AND
16 A MORE INTEGRATED SYSTEM EASIER TO HELP WITH TRIPS THAT MAYBE
17 PEOPLE DON'T TAKE AT ALL OR WOULD TAKE MORE OF IN TERMS OF
18 INCREASING RIDERSHIP AS THE CHAIR MENTIONED AT THE BEGINNING.
19 SO, AND I'M ALSO GLAD TO SEE THAT THERE IS REALLY GOOD ROBUST
20 USER RESEARCH ENLIGHTENING IN TERMS OF PEOPLE TRAVELING.

21

22 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP RICH HEDGES.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I AM INTERESTED IN SEEING THE ISSUE OF FLAT
2 FARES ON THE PRESENTATION, WHICH I ASSUME IS A REGIONAL FARE.
3 BECAUSE LA HAS A REGIONAL FARE, AND IT HAD THAT. I THINK IT'S
4 IMPERATIVE TO HAVE A REGIONAL FARE. IT'S JUST SO MUCH EASIER
5 TO FIGURE YOUR DAILY COST OF TRIPS THAT WAY, AND I THINK IT
6 WOULD ENCOURAGE TRANSIT. THE OTHER ISSUE ON THE 90 PERCENT
7 THAT ARE SINGLE USERS, I THINK THAT'S A LITTLE OVERSTATED, ALL
8 I CAN TAKE THAT ON ARE MY EYES. I TAKE EITHER SAMTRANS OR
9 SHUTTLE TO CALTRAIN OR BART. I HAVE ACCESS TO BOTH. AND THEN
10 WHEN I GET OFF OF EITHER, I TAKE MUNI, AND I KNOW, ESPECIALLY
11 WITH CALTRAIN, NOT SO MUCH WITH BART, THERE IS A FLOOD OF
12 PEOPLE GOING TO THE T AND THE JUDAH, AND ALSO OUT THE OTHER
13 SIDE OF CALTRAIN TO THE 30, STOCKTON AND OTHER BUSES. SO, I
14 DON'T KNOW WHETHER SHUTTLES SHOW UP IN THIS -- IN THESE
15 NUMBERS, BUT SAMTRANS SHOULD. AND I THINK IT'S ACTUALLY A
16 LITTLE LESS THAN 92 PERCENT. I HAVE NOTHING TO BASE THAT ON,
17 OTHER THAN MY EYES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. WENDI FOLLOWED BY DAVID. WENDI GO
22 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES. THANK YOU. HI. I ALSO SERVE ON THE POLICY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR THIS COMMITTEE. I AM VICE CHAIR, BUT I'M



October 19, 2020

1 SPEAKING FOR MYSELF AT THE MOMENT. THANK YOU AGAIN FOR YOUR
2 ROBUST RESEARCH INTO THIS VERY COMPLICATED SUBJECT. I'M VERY
3 CURIOUS TO KNOW IF, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT THE
4 TRANSFERS TO DIFFERENT SYSTEMS, WHEN I'M THINKING OF A SAN
5 FRANCISCO SYSTEM OR ALAMEDA SYSTEM, THAT'S PROBABLY SOME OF
6 THE SYSTEMS THAT HAVE SOME OF THE MOST ROBUST LOCAL TRANSIT
7 SYSTEMS, AND I WONDER HOW MUCH THAT COMES INTO PLAY WHEN
8 YOU'RE LOOKING AT WHO IS TRANSFERRING, WHO IS NOT, AS WHETHER
9 THERE IS EVEN A DECENT TRANSFER AVAILABLE. I KNOW WE'RE
10 LOOKING AT FARE INTEGRATION RIGHT NOW, BUT SYSTEMS INTEGRATION
11 MIGHT BE PLAYING INTO THIS. SO, THAT'S SOMETHING I WOULD LIKE
12 TO GET MORE INFORMATION ON. AND I AM ALSO CURIOUS TO KNOW IF
13 THERE IS ANY WAY TO KNOW IF PEOPLE WERE USING PRIVATE ENTITIES
14 SUCH AS UBER, LYFT, OR A GOOGLE BUS IN THEIR TRANSITS, AND IN
15 THEIR TRANSFERS AND IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO FIND THAT OUT.
16 THANK YOU.

17

18 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. DAVID, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
21 AND IT WILL BE DAVID FOLLOWED BY ANNE OLIVIA.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. I'M SPEAKING NOT ON BEHALF
24 OF SEAMLESS BAY AREA BUT RATHER THROUGH TWO DIFFERENT LENSES.
25 THE ASSOCIATION FOR COMMUTER TRANSPORTATION, BUT ALSO MY DAY



October 19, 2020

1 JOB WITH THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA WHERE I OVERSEE OUR
2 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND OUR TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM. FIRST I
3 WANT TO THANK YOU FOR BEING FORWARD WITH THE RESEARCH AND
4 PUTTING UP SOME PRETTY GOOD EXAMPLES OF SEAMLESS INTEGRATIVE
5 FARES THAT'S GOING TO BE QUITE INTERESTING TO SEE HOW THIS
6 DEVELOPS AND MOVES OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS. BEING A USER
7 OF THE PUGET AS WELL AS SMART SYSTEM IN DIFFERENT FORMS OVER
8 THE YEARS, I CAN SAY THIS IS A HELPFUL TOOL TO AT LEAST STUDY
9 AT LEAST FROM A U.S. CONTEXT. COUPLE THINGS I HAVE NOTICED
10 WITH THE UNIVERSITY, IS THAT OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS, A
11 LOT OF OUR EMPLOYEES AND A LOT OF OUR STUDENTS HAVE STARTED TO
12 MOVE FURTHER AWAY FROM THE BERKELEY AREA. WE HAVE NOTICED TO
13 THE POINT WHERE THE ORIGIN LOCATIONS AT LEAST FROM THE
14 EMPLOYEES, ARE STARTING ALONG THE CONTRA COSTA AREA, GOING TO
15 BERKELEY. THE SOUTHERN MARIN COUNTY FROM AT LEAST SANTA -- YOU
16 KNOW -- NOT SANTA -- SAN RAFAEL, SAN FRANCISCO, AND ALONG
17 BART. WE HAVE NOTICED, ALSO, THAT A LOT OF FOLKS ARE DRIVING
18 TO OUR OFFICES, AND KNOWING THE FACT THAT TAKING ONE'S
19 PERSONAL CAR IS A LITTLE MORE COMPETITIVE THAN HAVING TO PAY
20 MULTIPLE FARES AT THE SAME TIME AND IT ADDRESSES
21 AFFORDABILITY, WHERE USING FARES AS AN INDICATOR VERSUS
22 PARKING OR TOLLS SIGNIFIES WHERE TRANSIT MAY BE A BETTER FIT,
23 HOWEVER THE COST DIDN'T JUSTIFY THE MEANS AND THEREFORE OUR
24 EMPLOYEES AND EVEN OUR STUDENTS WHO HAVE ARGUED, TIMES AND
25 TIME AGAIN, FOR INTEGRATED FARES, INCLUDING BART, BART TO AC



October 19, 2020

1 TRANSIT ADMITTING BART TO AC TRANSIT ARE LEFT OUT IN THE DUST
2 OF THE THINKING FROM A UNIVERSITY STANDPOINT, IT WOULD BE
3 HELPFUL TO CONTINUE THE RESEARCH INTO POSSIBLY LOOKING INTO
4 HOW AFFORDABILITY COMES INTO PLAY, ESPECIALLY WITH OUR
5 STUDENTS, AND MOST DEFINITELY WITH OUR ESSENTIAL EMPLOYEES AS
6 WE TRY TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET OUT OF THIS POST COVID
7 RECOVERY, WHERE FOLKS ARE GOING TO, YOU KNOW, LOOK AT TAKING
8 SOME FORM OF TRANSIT TO GET BACK INTO THE OFFICE. THANK YOU
9 FOR YOUR TIME. TAKE CARE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. ANNE OLIVIA FOLLOWED BY TIFFANY. GO
12 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **ANN OLIVIA-ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I AM A MEMBER OF THE POLICY
15 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND VICE CHAIR OF EQUITY AND ACCESS. AND I AM
16 ALSO SPEAKING FOR MYSELF TODAY. IT'S BEEN A GREAT
17 PRESENTATION, AND THERE IS A LOT OF INFORMATION IN THERE, AND
18 I KNOW THIS IS REALLY COMPLICATED, BUT I WOULD LIKE TO
19 REPRESENT A LITTLE BIT ABOUT WHAT MY HOUSEHOLD LOOKS LIKE WITH
20 EVERYONE BEING A TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDER, AND ME WISHING THEY
21 COULD BE, BUT NOT ABLE TO DO SO. ONE OF MY ROOMMATES, BECAUSE
22 OF THE COMPLICATION AND HOW VERY, VERY EXPENSIVE IT IS,
23 ACTUALLY WALKS ABOUT 45 MINUTES EACH DIRECTION, BECAUSE THE
24 BUS SYSTEM IS COMPLICATED FROM WHERE WE ARE, AND IT'S JUST
25 REALLY EXPENSIVE IN ORDER TO MAKE IT TO A MEDICAL APPOINTMENT



October 19, 2020

1 IN SAN FRANCISCO TWICE A WEEK, AND THE AMOUNT OF TIME THAT HE
2 HAS TO TRADE, BECAUSE THERE ISN'T AN AFFORDABLE WAY TO GET TO
3 HIS APPOINTMENTS IS -- I MEAN, IT'S A LITTLE HEARTBREAKING.
4 THERE ISN'T A GOOD WAY FOR ME TO GET FROM MY HOME EVEN TO THE
5 MTC MEETINGS IF I WANT TO TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. EACH
6 TIME I HAVE ATTEMPTED TO DO THAT, IT'S BEEN SO EXPENSIVE AND
7 SO COMPLICATED THAT I HAVE BEEN LATE FOR THOSE MEETINGS, WHICH
8 IS FRUSTRATING. AND I AM REALLY EXCITED BY THE THINGS THAT ARE
9 HAPPENING HERE. I JUST -- I WANT YOU TO KNOW THAT MORE OF US
10 WOULD TAKE CONNECTING RIDES IF THERE WAS A WAY TO KEEP THOSE
11 COSTS UNDER CONTROL. ALONG WITH SOME OF THE OTHER ISSUES THAT
12 WE ARE ATTEMPTING TO ADDRESS. AND I ALSO WOULD REALLY
13 ENCOURAGE LOOKING AT THAT REGIONAL FARE AND MAKING SURE THAT
14 THINGS LIKE THE FERRY IS INCLUDED. THAT IS A SOLUTION THAT
15 WOULD ACTUALLY WORK REALLY WELL FOR ME, BUT THEY DON'T RUN
16 VERY OFTEN IS THOSE FARES AREN'T INTEGRATED AND IT'S EXPENSIVE
17 TO TRY TO DO ANY OF THE STUFF THAT WE'RE DOING. THANK YOU FOR
18 YOUR LEADERSHIP IN THIS. WE KNOW IT'S COMPLICATED AND I REALLY
19 ENCOURAGE YOU TO CONTINUE EXAMINING AND LOOKING AT WAYS TO
20 CREATE A MORE COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL FARE SO THAT THOSE OF US
21 WHO CAN'T DO THOSE COMPLICATED TRANSFERS RIGHT NOW, DO HAVE
22 COST LIMITATIONS.

23

24 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR COMMENTS.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. NEXT UP IS TIFFANY. TIFFANY GO AHEAD
2 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS TIFFANY, AND I WORK FOR SAN JOSE STATE
5 UNIVERSITY IN THE TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT, AND I JUST WANTED
6 TO ECHO DAVE'S COMMENT EARLIER. YOU KNOW, YOU SAY THAT YOU ARE
7 COLLECTING DATA AND STORIES FROM RIDERS, AND I WANT TO SEE HOW
8 YOU'RE CONNECTING WITH, OR PARTNERS WITH UNIVERSES TO FIND
9 STUDENTS AND EMPLOYEES STORIES. BECAUSE THE SAME ISSUE WITH US
10 IS WE FIND THAT THE MAJORITY OF OUR EMPLOYEES DON'T LIVE IN
11 THE -- CLOSE TO THE CAMPUS, SO THEY'RE COMMUTING FROM FURTHER
12 DISTANCES AND OUR STUDENTS AS WELL. SO I WANT TO SEE IF YOU
13 HAVE PARTNERS WITH UNIVERSITIES? BECAUSE TO MY KNOWLEDGE, I
14 DON'T KNOW THAT YOU HAVE, FOR COLLECTING THE RIDER STORIES,
15 AND HOW PEOPLE TRAVEL. YOU MENTIONED THAT YOU ARE LOOKING AT
16 CLIPPER DATA AND ARE YOU LOOKING AT THAT SPECIFICALLY BY
17 COLLEGE CAMPUSES AS WELL, WE HAVE THE SMART PASS PROGRAM AND
18 WE MAKE UP SIGNIFICANT RIDERSHIP FOR VTA, SO JUST WANT TO SEE
19 IF YOU GUYS ARE TAKING A LOOK AT THAT. AND THEN ALSO WE DO
20 HAVE A SIGNIFICANT POTENTIAL RIDERSHIP FORCING STUDENTS TO
21 UTILIZE CALTRAIN BUT BECAUSE IT'S SO EXPENSIVE WE HAVE A LOT
22 OF STUDENTS THAT WILL DRIVE TO CAMPUS BECAUSE IT'S CHEAPER,
23 BUT WE HAVE A HUGE PARKING ISSUE AT OUR CAMPUS, ESPECIALLY
24 WITH BART STATIONS OPENING UP, YOU KNOW, FOR STUDENTS TO GET
25 TO THERE, AND CONNECT TO THE BART AND THEN MAKE TRANSFERS, I



October 19, 2020

1 THINK HAVING AN ANCHORED SYSTEM WOULD BENEFIT THEM AS WELL AS
2 BEING AFFORDABLE.

3

4 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND WE HAVE SEAMLESS BAY AREA. GO AHEAD
7 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS IAN GRIFFITHS
10 SEAMLESS BAY AREA ALSO A MEMBER OF THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE.
11 FIRST OF ALL THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION. THIS IS
12 REALLY EXCITING AND GREAT WORK. REALLY HAPPY TO SEE THE FOCUS
13 ON THE OTHER EXAMPLES, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO ALL OF THESE
14 DIFFERENT APPROACHES FROM THE AMBITIOUS MORE KIND OF VISIONARY
15 MODELS THAT ARE MORE DIFFERENT FROM HOW WE ARE IN THE BAY
16 AREA, TO THOSE MODELS THAT SEEM TO BE CLOSER. WE LOOK FORWARD
17 TO ALL OF THOSE BEING STUDIED IN A SERIES OF ALTERNATIVES IN
18 THE NEXT PHASE OF WORK TO REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW THEY PERFORM.
19 THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THEM TO US. I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT
20 ON, EVEN THE U.S. SYSTEMS THAT WERE PROFILED HERE, THEY'RE
21 STILL IN A STATE OF TRANSITION. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE
22 THAT, EVEN WASHINGTON, D.C. HAS ALREADY IDENTIFIED THE NEED TO
23 TRANSITION TO A MORE INTEGRATED REGIONAL SYSTEM, AND THEY HAVE
24 KICKED OFF A PROCESS TO IDENTIFY HOW TO GO FROM THIS
25 BILATERAL, MULTI-LATERAL APPROACH TOWARDS A MORE INTEGRATED



October 19, 2020

1 APPROACH. SO, I THINK WE SHOULDN'T CONSIDER EVEN THOSE
2 DOMESTIC EXAMPLES AS BEING AT THE STATE WHERE THEY CAN'T BE
3 IMPROVED UPON. AND MANY OF THOSE REGIONS ARE TAKING STEPS TO
4 MOVE IN THE INTEGRATED DIRECTION TO ACKNOWLEDGE, WHEN YOU LOOK
5 AT THE RIDERSHIP FIGURES, YOU SEE THAT THE MORE INTEGRATED
6 SYSTEMS ACTUALLY HAVE FAR HIGHER RIDERSHIP, AND ARE MORE
7 LIKELY TO BE ASSOCIATED WITH GROWTH IN RIDERSHIP OVER TIME
8 THAN THE ONES THAT ARE EXHIBITING THE MORE BILATERAL, MULTI-
9 LATERAL APPROACHES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
14 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

15

16 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM CLERK, THANK
17 YOU TO EVERYONE WHO PROVIDED PUBLIC COMMENT TODAY ON THIS
18 AGENDA ITEM 5.A, THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM SIX, WHICH IS
19 PUBLIC COMMENT ON OTHER BUSINESS. MADAM CLERK, DO WE HAVE
20 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THINGS OTHER THAN THE AGENDA ITEMS ALREADY
21 PRESENTED?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE DO. FROM ALETA DUPREE. ALETA, GO
24 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



October 19, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR JIM HARTNETT AND MEMBERS. ALETA
2 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. GOOD MEETING TODAY. I AM CERTAINLY
3 GOING TO SPEAK FROM A GENERAL HIGH LEVEL HERE. FARE
4 INTEGRATION IS REALLY IMPORTANT, AND IT TAKES LOTS OF
5 DIFFERENT SHAPES AND SIZES AND PATTERNS. AND I THINK THERE ARE
6 A NUMBER OF ELEMENTS, CERTAINLY, IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE
7 TECHNOLOGY. SO WE, AS AN AGENCY COMMUNITY, NEED TO ENSURE THAT
8 WE GET PEOPLE INVOLVED WITH CLIPPER, AND ESPECIALLY CLIPPER
9 START CAN HELP A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE OF MODEST MEANS, SUCH
10 AS MYSELF. AND, THE -- I SAW -- I AM A BIT AWARE OF THIS
11 PROGRAM IN LOS ANGELES CALLED THE "EASY TRANSIT PASS" NOT TO
12 BE CONFUSED WITH THE EASY PASS TOLL COLLECTION SYSTEM ON THE
13 EAST COAST. AND I THINK FOR ME IN THE LOS ANGELES AREA, I CAN
14 DO ALL THE 20 ODD AGENCIES FOR \$40 A MONTHS AND THERE ARE AT
15 THIS TIME PASSES THAT INVOLVE DIFFERENT ZONES FOR LONG
16 DISTANCE EXPRESS BUSES AND RAILROADS. THEY HAVE A RAILROAD
17 SYSTEM CALLED METROLINK. SO I DON'T KNOW WHAT THIS IS GOING TO
18 LOOK LIKE GOING FORWARD. CERTAINLY FARE CAPPING NEEDS TO BE
19 INVOLVED. AND BECAUSE PEOPLE OFTEN AGONIZE OVER WHAT FARE
20 PRODUCT TO BUY AT THE BEGINNING OF A MONTH. AND LASTLY ROLLING
21 PASSES AS OPPOSED TO CALENDAR PASSES NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED.
22 BECAUSE NOT EVERYBODY OPERATES ON A CYCLE THAT'S IN SYNC WITH
23 THE FIRST OF THE MONTH. THANK YOU.
24
25 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



October 19, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
3 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED, AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT WAS SUBMITTED
4 ON THIS ITEM.

5

6 **JIM HARTNETT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM CLERK. DOES
7 ANY MEMBER OF THE TASK FORCE HAVE ANY OTHER BUSINESSES THEY
8 WOULD LIKE TO BRING UP AT THIS TIME? SEEING NONE. THAT BRINGS
9 US TO ADJOURNMENT. OUR NEXT MEETING IS CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR
10 DECEMBER 7TH, AT 1:05 P.M., AND WE'LL BE REMOTE AND BY WEBCAST
11 AS APPROPRIATE. I THINK THAT WILL BRING US INTO OUR CLIPPER
12 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING. THANK YOU FOR ALL THE TASK FORCE
13 MEMBERS AND THEIR PARTICIPATION AND CONTRIBUTION TODAY. AND
14 THANK YOU TO STAFF, VERY MUCH, FOR AN EXCELLENT PRESENTATION.
15 THAT CONCLUDES OUR MEETING. [ADJOURNED]

16



Broadcasting Government