

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **MONDAY, DECEMBER 9TH, 2024, 2:05 PM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. MY

6 NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN

7 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ALONG WITH IN THIS CASE J OUR VICE

8 CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS SPECIAL MEETING TO ORDER AND

9 REMIND EVERYONE THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITES.

10 ITEM ONE ROLL CALL.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER ABE-

17 KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?



1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY? FLEMING?

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SHE'S IN THE BUILDING.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIACOPINI?

13

14 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KAPLAN?

21

22 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN ABSENT. MILEY?

25



1 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

4

5 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

8

9 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

16

17 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF? SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. ITEM TWO,
2 FAMILIAR FACE, MR. RENTSCHLER. YOU CAN LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE,
3 PLEASE? [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE
4 FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR
5 WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH
6 LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU RANDI. NICE TO SEE YOU IN
9 THE BUILDING AGAIN. PROCEEDING TO ITEM THREE WHICH IS THE
10 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
13 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
14 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
15 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
16 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
17 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND I THINK WE'RE
20 GOING TO EARN IT TODAY. PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR CHAIRPERSON'S
21 REPORT. UNDER 4A PART OF THE DUTIES AS CHAIR IS ACKNOWLEDGING
22 COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE PROVIDED GREAT SERVICE. AND TODAY,
23 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI IS LEAVING US. AND TO MARK THIS
24 SOMBER OCCASION, WE ARE OBLIGATED TO CONSIDER RESOLUTION 4679
25 AND I'M GOING TO READ A COUPLE WHEREAS. WHEREAS AFTER SERVING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 13 YEARS AS A MEMBER OF THE CITY COUNCIL, CAROL IN 2012 MADE
2 HISTORY BY BECOMING THE FIRST WOMAN TO BE LOOKED MAYOR OF THE
3 CITY OF UNION CITY A POSITION TO WHICH SHE TWICE SUBSEQUENTLY
4 WAS REELECTED TO. WHEREAS CAROLE'S DEEP EAST BAY ROOTS INCLUDE
5 BEING THIRD GENERATION RESIDENT OF UNION CITY. HE GRADUATED
6 JAMES LOGAN HIGH SCHOOL AND CAL STATE HAYWARD, AS WELL AS
7 OWNER FOR NEARLY 40 YEARS A UNION CITY INCOME TAX BUSINESS AND
8 MEMBER OF THE UNION CITY CHAMBER OF COMMERCE AND LION'S CLUB
9 OF UNION CITY IN 199 JIM WAS STILL ON THE COMMISSION THEN WON
10 THE CITY UNION CITY ALL AMERICAN CITY DESIGNATION BOW STOWED
11 BY THE NATIONAL -- DEEPLY ENGAGED WITH ISSUES AROUND
12 TRANSPORTATION LAND USE PLANNING AFFORDABLE HOUSING MTC
13 ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION STRONG ADVOCATE FOR
14 THE QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY PROJECT ACCESS MOBILITY IMPROVEMENTS
15 DUMBARTON CORRIDOR UNION CITY BART STATION AND SUPPORTER OF
16 EXPRESS LANES START PILOT PROGRAM 880 CORRIDOR, MTC STAFF
17 THANK YOU FOR THE YEARS OF SERVICE TO THE AGENCY AND PEOPLE
18 AROUND THE REGION. I'LL NOTE PART OF BEING CHAIR YOU WORK
19 CLOSELY WITH COMMISSIONERS AND REGIONALISM WE HAVE TO MAKE
20 TOUGH DECISIONS, CAROL WAS ONE OF THOSE COMMISSIONERS THAT WAS
21 VERY LOGICAL AND COMMON SENSE, UNDERSTOOD THAT IT WHEN WE HAD
22 CHAOTIC CONVERSATIONS YOU COULD BE COUNTED ON. THANK YOU FOR
23 YOUR SURFACE HAVE MADE A DIFFERENCE AT THIS COMMISSION AND IN
24 THE REGION. WE UNFORTUNATELY HAVE TO ACCEPT THESE RESOLUTIONS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION FOR RESOLUTION 4679 FIRST BY
2 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

3

4 **SUE NOACK:** SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER NOACK. ANY
7 BELIEVE COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
10 THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS
11 APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO CALL ROLL
14 CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLL CALL VOTE. CHAIR PEDROZA?

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT.
21 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANN?



1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA WAS AN AYE. THANK YOU. DUTRA-
5 VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KAPLAN?

18

19 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?



1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROAN IS ABSENT. SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

25 PRESENT.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NOW WE GOAT PRESENT CAROL A WONDERFUL
3 PROCLAMATION. AND THEN CAROL CAN SAY A FEW WORDS. DO WE NEED A
4 PICTURE OR ANYTHING?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES, PLEASE.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'M AHEAD OF SCHEDULE. SO, I
9 APOLOGIZE.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** MY GOODNESS. THIS IS THE SECOND GOODBYE I
12 HAVE HAD TO SAY, LAST WEEK WAS MY GOODBYE AT ALAMEDA CTC, THAT
13 MEETING WASN'T JUST ME THERE. THERE WERE 12 OTHER
14 COMMISSIONERS STEPPING DOWN FROM ALAMEDA CTC. THERE ARE GOING
15 TO BE SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS LEAVING OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF
16 MONTHS. WHAT I WANT TO SAY IS ALFREDO AND NICK, I CAME IN 2016
17 AND I BELIEVE THERE WERE SEVEN OF US NEW ONES AT THAT TIME AND
18 I BELIEVE ALFRED OH NICK, AND I ARE THE LAST THREE OF THAT
19 GROUP. TO MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, I LOVE COMING TO THESE
20 MEETINGS HERE WE MAY NOT HAVE ALWAYS AGREED BUT WE KNEW HOW TO
21 RESPECTFULLY DISAGREE AND GET ISSUES TAKEN CARE OF. THAT'S NOT
22 ALWAYS THE CASE AT OUR OWN LOCAL BODIES. I APPRECIATE THAT. I
23 APPRECIATE YOU ALL OF THE WORK WE HAVE DONE. AND I MUST SAY
24 THAT THE REASON I EVEN WANTED TO GET ON THE METROPOLITAN
25 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION FROM THE VERY BEGINNING WAS BECAUSE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 OF THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR. SO I'M GRATEFUL THAT AS I LEAVE WE
2 D BETWEEN ALAMEDA COUNTY AND SAN MATEO COUNTY, COME TO AN
3 AGREEMENT ABOUT THE WAY THE REGIONAL MEASURE \$330 MILLION
4 SHOULD BE SPLIT UP. SO, I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S HARD WORK.
5 AND, REALLY, I'M TALKING ABOUT FELLOW COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF,
6 REALLY, BECAUSE WE ALL KNOW WHAT THE PUBLIC SEES IS NOT
7 NECESSARILY WHAT IT TAKES TO MAKE SOMETHING HAPPEN. ANDY,
8 ALIX, REBECCA, KATHLEEN, KIMBERLY, WHERE IS GEORGIA? SHE'S OUT
9 THERE SOMEWHERE. EVERYBODY I JUST CAN'T THANK YOU ENOUGH. THE
10 TRIPS TO WASHINGTON DC AND SACRAMENTO WITH YOU FOLKS YOU
11 REALLY SAW THE PROFESSIONALISM. I WAS BLOWN AWAY UNTIL YOU
12 START TALKING TO PEOPLE YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT THEIR BACKGROUNDS
13 ARE, AND WHEN YOU SEE THEM AT WORK IT'S LIKE OH MY GOODNESS.
14 AND JASON, THERE YOU GO, FIRST MET JUST BEFORE I WAS COMING ON
15 TO THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND JASON WAS AN
16 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION COMMISSIONER HIMSELF
17 CHANGING OF THE GUARD HE WAS GOING OUT THE DOOR AND I WAS
18 COMING IN THE DOOR AND I'LL NEVER FORGET JASON'S WORDS TO ME
19 HE SAYS CAROL YOU GOT AN ISSUE, JUST ASK ROSY. [LAUGHTER] AND
20 FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO DON'T KNOW WHO ROSY WAS, SHE IS RETIRED
21 AND HAS MOVED ON HERSELF AS A STAFF PERSON AND THIS PROBABLY
22 WON'T BE THE LAST TIME YOU SEE ME BECAUSE SHOULD THERE BE
23 OTHER ISSUES REGARDING FUNDING FOR UNION CITIES, BART STATION,
24 AND BART ON CORRIDOR. I WILL PROBABLY COME AND HANG OUT IN THE
25 AUDIENCE BECAUSE AS WE KNOW THERE ARE FOLKS THAT AREN'T



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 NECESSARILY IN ALIGNMENT WITH THE PLANS WE HAVE. SO IF NEED BE
2 I'LL BE HERE TO CORRECT ANY MISINFORMATION AND LEND MY SUPPORT
3 FOR WHAT WE HAVE GOT GOING ON THANK YOU, AGAIN, EVERYBODY, AND
4 I'M SO THRILLED THIS LAST MEETING THAT I'M ABLE TO PARTICIPATE
5 THIS IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT WORK AS WE TRY TO MOVE THE
6 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, CAROL.

9 [APPLAUSE] ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO OPEN UP TO ANY
10 COMMISSIONERS WHO WISH TO SAY A FEW WORDS. I THINK
11 COMMISSIONER SPERING WANTED TO.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CAROL, I WOULD BE REMISS IF I DIDN'T POINT
14 OUT THAT YOU HAVE BEEN A STRONG ADVOCATE FOR YOUR CONSTITUENTS
15 AND YOU NEVER LOST SITE OF YOUR ROLE BOTH ON THE ALAMEDA
16 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AND MTC. BUT I WANT TO PERSONALLY
17 THANK YOU FOR YOUR SUPPORT ON THIS MEASURE THAT WE'RE
18 NAVIGATING THROUGH TODAY. THAT'S A RESPONSIBILITY THAT THIS
19 COMMISSION HAS. IT'S A REGIONAL PROBLEM AND WE HAVE TO FIND
20 REGIONAL SOLUTIONS AND YOU HAVE BEEN A GREAT PARTNER IN
21 HELPING US GET TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY. I WANT TO PERSONALLY
22 THANK YOU. AND LASTLY, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR
23 SUPPORT ON THE NORTH BAY PROJECTS. THE ONES WE HAVE COME TO
24 YOU AND NEEDED YOUR SUPPORT YOU HAVE ALWAYS BEEN THERE AND I
25 WANTED TO THANK YOU FOR THAT.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
3 PAPAN THEN VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** CAROL YOU HAVE BEEN FABULOUS FROM DAY ONE AND YOU
6 HAVE BEEN SO WELCOMING I DIDN'T ALWAYS TAKE YOUR ADVICE
7 [LAUGHTER] BUT GETTING THINGS DONE HERE AT MTC YOU HAVE BEEN A
8 REAL PARTNER, DUMBARTON CORRIDOR WORKING JURISDICTIONALLY
9 CONNECTING US BOTH IT'S BEEN A REAL PLEASURE ALWAYS THE
10 CONVERSATION MOVING FORWARD. AND THAT'S PART OF WHAT HAPPENS
11 HERE, GET THE FACTS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT'S HAPPENING IN
12 ANOTHER JURISDICTION AND COMMUNICATING WHAT'S HAPPENING IN
13 YOUR JURISDICTION. AND I REALLY AM PROUD OF WHAT WE HAVE DONE
14 AND THERE IS MUCH TO DO ON THAT CROSS BAY CONNECTION HERE.
15 ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES TO THE VALLEY AND THAT WHOLE
16 CONNECTION. BUT IT'S BEEN A REAL PLEASURE, MY FRIEND. I LOOK
17 FORWARD, TO AGAIN, WORKING WITH YOU IN THE FUTURE. BECAUSE
18 WE'RE GOING TO NEED YOUR INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE AND ALSO THE
19 GREAT BRINGING UP TO DATE THE WORK YOU HAVE ALREADY DONE AND
20 EXPANDING ON THAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR EVERYTHING.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN THEN
23 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND I'LL WORK MY WAY DOWN THE HORN.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR
2 COLLABORATION I REMEMBER I FIRST JOINED THE COMMISSION YOU
3 WERE ONE OF THE FIRST TO WELCOME ME AND OFFER SOME TIME TO
4 MEET AND I WILL ALWAYS BE GRATEFUL FOR YOU AND YOUR WILLING
5 AND WARMTH AND YOUR WELCOMING SPIRIT THANK YOU FOR ALL YOU
6 HAVE DONE YOU HAVE BEEN SUCH A FIERCE FIGHTER FOR ALAMEDA
7 COUNTY AND ALSO UNDERSTANDING THE REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE AND I
8 APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT ON MANY OF THE PROJECTS THAT AFFECT
9 ALL OF US. THANK YOU, AGAIN, I WISH YOU WELL AND DEFINITELY
10 HOPE THAT WE CAN CONTINUE TO LEAN ON YOU FOR YOUR EXPERIENCE
11 AND LEADERSHIP.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I ALSO WANT TO EXPRESS HOW MUCH I
14 HAVE ENJOYED WORKING TOGETHER. WE HAVE BEEN ONE OF THOSE TWO
15 PEOPLE WHO HAVE DONE THE DISAGREEING THAT YOU WERE TALKING
16 ABOUT [LAUGHTER] BUT I HAVE ALWAYS REALLY APPRECIATED HOW WE
17 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DISAGREE IN A REALLY RESPECTFUL WAY. AND I
18 DON'T THINK THE POINT IS FOR US TO AGREE EVERYTHING. AND I
19 THINK YOU HAVE TAUGHT ME A LOT ABOUT HOW TO DO THAT AND I
20 REALLY APPRECIATE THAT, AND PERSONAL GROWTH THROUGH THAT. I
21 WISH YOU ALL THE BEST IN THE FUTURE AND HOPE WE CAN FIND
22 CONTINUE TO FIND WAYS TO WORK TOGETHER IN THE FUTURE.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** VICE CHAIR NOACK COMMISSIONER WALTON,
25 PETERS, THEN GLOVER.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** TOO MANY ON, TOO MANY OFF. WE HAVEN'T WORKED THAT
3 LONG TOGETHER ON MTC. BUT LIKE MARGARET SAID, I GOT HERE IT
4 WAS DAUNTING DIDN'T KNOW ANYBODY HERE EXCEPT FOR FEDERAL, YOU
5 WERE SO WELCOMING AND KIND TO ME YOU'RE MY WALK INTO BART
6 BUDDY. I'M GOING TO MISS YOU ON THAT AND JUST APPRECIATE ALL
7 YOUR WORK AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN STAY IN TOUCH.

8

9 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I'M GOING TO JOIN THE CHORUS. THANK
10 YOU FOR MAKING US ALL FEEL WELCOME IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE TO
11 SERVE AS YOUR VICE CHAIR I ADMIRE YOUR PROFESSIONALISM AND THE
12 WAY YOU SIZE UP THE ISSUES IN YOUR COOL HEAD SORTING THEM
13 THROUGH SO WE'LL MISS YOU COME BACK AND DON'T BE A STRANGER.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER, THEN CANEPA.

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** -- SPELL DUTRA-VERNACI; I HAD TROUBLE WITH
18 THAT IN THE BEGINNING AND STILL HAVING TROUBLE. CAROL YOU HAVE
19 BEEN JUST A WONDERFUL PERSON TO WORK WITH. I THINK ONE OF THE
20 THINGS YOU POINTED OUT EARLIER IS SOMETIMES WE CAN BE
21 PAROCHIAL ABOUT OUR ISSUES BUT BEING ABLE TO WORK THROUGH
22 THOSE ISSUES COMING UP HAVING LIVELY DISCUSSIONS, AND COMING
23 UP WITH A SOLUTION THAT IF YOU HAD NOT PUT SOME OF THOSE
24 THINGS ON THE TABLE WE MAY NOT HAVE COME UP WITH THE BEST
25 SOLUTION. SO, I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU FOR COULD YOU AND



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 ALWAYS LOOKING AT THINGS FROM A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE WHEN
2 TRYING TO FIND SOLUTIONS. IT'S BEEN WONDERFUL.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. CAROL, I'M GOING TO MISS OUR LUNCHESES
7 TOGETHER. I REALLY LEARNED A LOT FROM YOU. I THINK LONGEVITY
8 SPEAKS VOLUMES. AND YOU KNOW BEFORE YOU WERE ON THIS
9 COMMISSION, WE HAD MET EACH OTHER THROUGH UNION CITY, I THINK
10 IT WAS ACTUALLY A WATER FESTIVAL. AND YOU ARE TRULY THE
11 EMBODIMENT OF A PUBLIC SERVANT. I THINK WHEN WE -- THERE IS
12 THREE TYPES OF PEOPLE THAT DO THIS WORK. YOU'RE THE TYPE OF
13 PERSON WHO REALLY SERVES THEIR CONSTITUENTS, THAT'S TRULY A
14 PUBLIC SERVANT. SO, I REALLY, REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
15 EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE ON THIS COMMISSION, BUT JUST AS A
16 PUBLIC SERVANT, HOW MANY YEARS IS IT, CAROL? IS IT 24?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** ACTUALLY 36.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** FOR MANY OF YOU OUT THERE, THAT'S JUST
21 PHENOMENAL. LONGEVITY SPEAKS VOLUMES AND THANK YOU CAROL FOR
22 YOUR SERVICE.

23



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET'S GET AWAY FROM TELLING HOW OLD WE
2 ARE AND HOW MANY YEARS OF SERVICE WE HAVE HAD. COMMISSIONER
3 KAPLAN?

4

5 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANT TO APPRECIATE MY
6 NEIGHBORING COMMISSIONER WE ALSO SERVED ON THE ALAMEDA COUNTY
7 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IN THE HEART OF THE BAY REGION AND
8 IT'S BEEN SUCH AN INSPIRATION TO SERVE WITH YOU AND WISH YOU
9 ALL THE VERY BEST. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. SO, CAROL, WE CAN KEEP
12 GOING AND GOING AND GOING. BUT WE DO HAVE SOME BUSINESS BEFORE
13 THE COMMISSION. SO, I'LL JUST SAY IT AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
14 SERVICE. AND I THINK WHAT EVERYONE SAID IS SO APPROPRIATE. AND
15 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A LITTLE RECEPTION AT THE HUB CAFE FOR A
16 WELFARE TOAST AFTER THIS MEETING NOT THAT THAT SHOULD MOTIVATE
17 US TO FINISH BUT I THINK WELL DESERVED CAROL. THANK YOU. WE
18 HAVE ACCEPTED THAT MOTION WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM FIVE,
19 ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? DON'T SEE ANY. PROCEED TO ITEM 6A
20 DRAFT REPORT TO THE LEGISLATOR ON THE TRANSPORTATION REGIONAL
21 MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY SB
22 WILL BE THE ACTION ITEM. WEE NOW MOVING INTO THE MAIN TOPIC.
23 THERE ARE TWO ITEMS, THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, THE
24 CORE TOPIC OF THIS MEETING TODAY. I WANT TO THANK
25 COMMISSIONERS FOR MAKING ROOM IN THEIR SCHEDULES AROUND THIS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TIME TO ATTEND AN EXTRA COMMISSION MEETING BUT IT IS THE TASK
2 THAT REQUIRES THIS TYPE OF ATTENTION. ING IT JUST WASN'T
3 COMMISSIONER SPERING BEING CHAIR, IT'S THE AMOUNT OF WORK AND
4 CALLS I GOT FROM COMMISSIONERS THAT MET WITH COMMISSIONER
5 SPERING, AND WHAT WAS OUT IN THE COMMUNITY JIM YOU DID A LOT
6 OF WORK GOING OUT THERE, AND PROVIDING THIS OUTCOME THAT WE'RE
7 GOING TO TAKE TODAY THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE. THE COMMITTEE
8 HAS EXPLORED AN ARRAY OF POTENTIAL FUNDING FRAMEWORKS POLICY
9 OPTIONS TO ACHIEVE CONSENSUS ON A FUTURE TRANSPORTATION
10 MEASURE. WASN'T AN EASY TASK SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS WAS MADE
11 WE'RE GOING HEAR ABOUT THAT IN A BIT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER WHO WILL PRESENT INFORMATION
13 ON THE ITEM DRAFT REPORT TO THE LEGISLATOR ON THE
14 TRANSPORTATION REGIONAL MEASURE. ALSO UNDERSCORE THIS WAS PART
15 OF OUR COMMITMENT TO SENATOR WIENER WHEN THERE WAS ACTIVE
16 DISCUSSIONS AROUND 1031 AND OUR COMMITMENT TO HAVE THIS
17 DISCUSSION AS MTC WHICH IS THE RIGHT BODY TO HAVE THIS
18 DISCUSSION, AND I STILL BELIEVE THAT NOW THAT NOW. I'LL TURN
19 IT OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA AND VICE CHAIR
22 JOSEFOWITZ, AND COMMISSIONERS. I WANT TO TAKE OPPORTUNITY TO
23 PRESENT THIS ITEM TODAY AS IT REPRESENTS CULMINATION OF A
24 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK THAT CHAIR PEDROZA WAS JUST TALKING
25 ABOUT A LOT OF YOU CONTRIBUTED TO THIS WORK BUT ESPECIALLY



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TRAVELING JIM SPERING HE WAS WONDERFUL AS A CHAIR AND REALLY
2 WENT AROUND THE REGION. IN HIS LEADERSHIP OF THE SELECT
3 COMMITTEE CHAIR SPERING CONTINUALLY EMPHASIZED THREE CORE
4 GOALS THAT A TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE MUST ACHIEVE
5 PREVENT MAJOR TRANSIT SERVICE CUTS, ADVANCE CUSTOMER FOCUSED
6 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PRIORITIES FROM THE BAY AREA
7 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND GARNER BOTH LEGISLATOR AND OF
8 COURSE VOTER SUPPORT. SO AS WE SIT HERE TODAY, WE PUT IN A LOT
9 OF HOURS AT THE SELECT COMMITTEE. I ALSO WANT TO THANK THE
10 EXECUTIVE WORKING GROUP MADE UP OF TRANSPORTATION OPERATORS
11 AND TRANSIT LEADERS TO REALLY HELP US UNDERSTAND AND SUPPORT
12 THIS WORK. WE ARE MUCH FURTHER ALONG IN REALLY UNDERSTANDING
13 WHAT OUR OPTIONS ARE FOR ACHIEVING THE THREE CORE GOALS. AND
14 WHILE THIS STAGE OF THE PROCESS TO STABILIZE THE REGIONAL
15 TRANSIT SYSTEM IS WINDING DOWN IT'S THE BEGINNING OF A NEW
16 CHAPTER IF THERE IS GOING TO BE A REVENUE MEASURE IN 2026
17 WHICH I CERTAINLY THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE THEN IT NEEDS TO BE
18 ENACTED NEXT YEAR SO THERE IS A LOT OF WORK AHEAD FOR US. THE
19 DRAFT REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE SELECT COMMITTEE WORK IS
20 ATTACHED IN YOUR PACKET WILL BE FINALIZED FOR REVIEW AND
21 FINALIZED NEXT WEEK FOR APPROVAL AND REVIEW DECEMBER 18TH
22 COMMISSIONER MEETING FACILITATOR REBECCA AND THERESA ROMMEL. I
23 WANT TO APPRECIATE THE WORK IN SYNTHESIZING THE SELECT
24 COMMITTEE'S WORK INTO THIS DRAFT REPORT. THE REPORT INCLUDES
25 FIVE KEY COMPONENTS THE BACKGROUND ON THE IMPORTANT WORK



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PUBLIC TRANSIT'S LOOMING CRISIS IN THE BAY AREA, KEY FACTORS
2 CONSIDERED IN DESIGNING A REVIEW MEASURE SCENARIO SUMMARY OF
3 EXISTING OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT AND SELECT COMMITTEE
4 RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTC AND FINALLY PLACEHOLDER FOR COMMISSION
5 CONSIDERATION AND ACTION THAT WILL BE CONSIDERED IN THE NEXT
6 ITEM ON THIS AGENDA. WE WELCOME FEEDBACK AND ANY QUESTIONS YOU
7 MAY HAVE RIGHT NOW AND OF COURSE WE'LL INCORPORATE WHATEVER
8 COMMENTS YOU MIGHT WANT US TO DO IN THE NEXT WEEK. BUT AS
9 MENTIONED WE WANT TO GET THIS ON TO THE DECEMBER 18TH
10 COMMISSION MEETING WHICH MEANS TIME SHORT. THANK YOU. HAPPY TO
11 TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
14 AS YOU MENTIONED THE REPORT IS ATTACHED. COMMISSIONERS DO YOU
15 HAVE QUESTIONS OF OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR? I DON'T SEE ANY.
16 PUBLIC COMMENT? JUST GIVE US A SECOND.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** TWO MINUTES.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO EVERYONE MY NAME IS WARREN CUSHMAN I'M EMPLOYED
23 AT COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING AT HAYWARD. I
24 STAND HERE TODAY TO EXPRESS CONCERNS AROUND HOW ALL OF THIS
25 AFFECTS AC TRANSIT. FIRST OF ALL, AC TRANSIT IS A DIFFERENT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 KIND OF AGENCY THAN SOME OF THE OTHER AGENCIES. MOST OF THE
2 RIDERSHIP AT AC TRANSIT ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR OR PEOPLE WITH
3 DISABILITIES. THE SUGGESTION THAT MTC IS MOVING FORWARD WITH
4 AROUND THE MEASURE DOES NOT GO NEARLY FAR ENOUGH IN TERMS OF
5 MEETING THE NEED OF THE RIDER. MY CONCERN IS SCENARIO 1A THAT
6 IS THE PRIMARY SCENARIO DOESN'T ADDRESS THE TRANSIT
7 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN NEEDS, THE PARATRANSIT NEEDS, OR
8 EVEN AC TRANSIT'S NEEDS MOVING FORWARD. PLEASE CONSIDER IF
9 WE'RE GOING TO GO WITH SCENARIO 1A, SUPPORTING AC TRANSIT,
10 PLEASE LOOK AT A FUNDING BALANCE THAT LOOKS AT THE EQUITY OF
11 AC TRANSIT AND, PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT THE RIDERS ARE MADE
12 WHOLE IN THAT WAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AGAIN. I APPRECIATE
13 BEING A PART OF THIS PROCESS FROM THE COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVE.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE IS ANOTHER RAISED HAND OF
18 THAT -- THAT'S JUST PUT THEIR HAND DOWN. NEVER MIND. NOTHING
19 RECEIVED IN WRITING BY THE WAY.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU BACK TO THE COMMISSION.

22 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH, JUST NEED CLARIFICATION HERE. SO IS THIS
25 WHERE YOU WOULD LIKE US TO BRING UP --



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THE NEXT ITEM COMMISSIONER PAPAN WE'RE
3 GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE PROPOSAL GET INTO SPECIFICS AND POLICY
4 PROVISIONS.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** NOT THE CORRECT ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** JUST INFORMATIONAL ITEM EAGER TO JUMP
9 TO 6B THIS IS ENDORSEMENT OF PROPOSED TRANSPORTATION REGIONAL
10 MEASURE FRAMEWORK AND POLICY PROVISIONS FOR POLLING I WANT TO
11 UNDERSCORE THAT AT THIS POINT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO
12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER.

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THIS AS WE CONSIDER THIS ITEM I WANT TO SET
15 THE TABLE WITH A BIT OF CONTEXT, TALKING ABOUT TODAY A NEW
16 SUBJECT SINCE COVID-19 HIT IN 2020 THE COMMISSION HAS BEEN
17 ACTIVELY WORKING TO ASSIST BAY AREA OPERATORS IN TRANSITIONING
18 TO A NEW BUSINESS MODEL WORKING SUCCESSFULLY WITH THE BAY AREA
19 CONGRESSIONAL DELEGATION AND OTHER METRO AREAS IN THE NATION
20 TO SECURE \$4 BILLION IN TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING RELIEF WE
21 STOOD UP THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE TO ENSURE
22 WE TURN THE CRISIS INTO A COMMUNITY LIFT UP TO THE MOST VITAL
23 CUSTOMER-FACING REFORMS NEEDED TO TRANSFORM OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM
24 INTO A UNIFIED CUSTOMER FRIENDLY ONE THAT MORE PEOPLE CHOOSE
25 TO RIDE TRAVEL PATTERNS HAVE CHANGED PERMANENTLY AND UPENDED



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THE TRANSIT'S CURRENT BUSINESS MODEL WE'RE COMMITTED TO
2 ASSISTING THE TRANSITION TO A NEW MODEL. TRANSIT WILL HAVE
3 SIGNIFICANT IMPACT TO THE BAY AREA ECONOMY AND IN PARTICULAR
4 TRAFFIC. IT'S FOUNDATIONAL TO OUR HOUSING AFFORDABILITY
5 STRATEGIES AND AS WE KNOW, DRAMATIC CUTS IN SERVICE FOR BART
6 CRITICALLY AFFECT OUR CLIMATE GOALS. IMPORTANT FOR THIS
7 COMMISSION TO RECOGNIZE TODAY'S ACTIONS ARE INTENDED TO
8 ADVANCE THE MOST VIABLE FRAMEWORKS TO THE LEGISLATURE AND GIVE
9 STAFF DIRECTION ON HOW TO DEVICE POLLING TO GIVE BEST
10 INFORMATION FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF A MEASURE IN THE NEXT YEAR.
11 THIS MEASURE WILL NEED TO INCLUDE BOTH REVENUE AND POLICY
12 ITEMS DESIGNED TO MEET THREE KEY OBJECTIVES OF KEEPING TRANSIT
13 MOVING, IMPROVING THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND GETTING THE
14 MEASURE PASSED BY THE VOTERS. OUR GOAL IS TO BRING BACK THE
15 POLLING RESULTS THAT CONFIRM, THAT INFORM THE SPECIFIC
16 FRAMEWORK THAT THIS COMMISSION COULD CONSIDER SUPPORTING GOING
17 FORWARD. AND I'LL NOW TURN IT OVER TO ALIX TO WALK THROUGH THE
18 PRESENTATION THAT PROVIDES THE BACKGROUND AND FEEDBACK WE
19 RECEIVED OVER THE SUMMER AND THE FALL. ALIX?

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU, ANDY. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS.
22 AGAIN, THIS PRESENTATION PROVIDES A SYNTHESIS OF THE WORK OF
23 THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE IT SEEKS
24 THE COMMISSION APPROVAL OF SEVERAL RELATED POLICY PROVISIONS
25 AND SEEKS COMMISSION APPROVAL FOR POLLING RELATED TO FUNDING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 FRAMEWORK AND POLICY ITEMS. NEXT SLIDE. AS YOU KNOW, MTC
2 CONVENED THE SELECT COMMITTEE TO HELP BAY AREA LEADERS AND
3 STAKEHOLDERS REACH CONSENSUS A POTENTIAL 2026 TRANSPORTATION
4 REVENUE MEASURE. MEMBERS MET MONTHLY FROM JUNE TO OCTOBER TO
5 CONSIDER OPTIONS AND ALTERNATIVES AND BUILD CONSENSUS FOR A
6 MEASURE THAT COULD BE ON THE BALLOT IN 2026. EVEN THOUGH THE
7 SELECT COMMITTEE DID NOT REACH CONSENSUS ON ONE SINGULAR PATH
8 FORWARD THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND PROCESS SIGNIFICANTLY
9 ADVANCED THE COLLECTIVE UNDERSTANDING OF THE CHALLENGE FACING
10 BAY AREA PUBLIC TRANSIT, THE OPPORTUNITIES AND TRADE-OFFS OF
11 DIFFERENT REVENUE MEASURE OPTIONS AND POINTED TO A SUBSETS OF
12 FRAMEWORK WITH THE GREATEST CHANCE OF ACHIEVING CORE
13 OBJECTIVES AND GENERATING THE SUPPORT NEEDED TO SUCCEED IN THE
14 LEGISLATURE AND AT THE BALLOT. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE DIVE INTO
15 WHAT THE COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED, IT'S IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER THE
16 CONTEXT OF THE FUNDING CRISIS FACING BAY AREA TRANSIT. WHICH
17 IS REALLY THE CORE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE WITH THE
18 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. BASED ON SURVEYS, MTC HAS
19 CONDUCTED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE BAY AREA COUNCIL, OVER HALF
20 OF BAY AREA EMPLOYERS HAVE THEIR STAFF COMING INTO THE OFFICE
21 TWO TO THROUGH DAYS PER WEEK WITH ONE QUARTER COMING IN 4 TO 5
22 DAYS A WEEK. THE SHARE OF EMPLOYERS WHO ARE FULLY REMOTE HAS
23 SETTLED AROUND 12%. NEXT SLIDE. THIS CHANGE IN COMMUTING HAS
24 BEEN THE DRIVING SOURCE CAUSING THE DOWNTURN IN TRANSIT
25 RIDERSHIP IN THE REGION. AND WHILE WE HAVE BEEN ON AN UPWARD



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TREND SINCE THE NADAR OF 2020, RIDERSHIP OVERALL IS 2/3 OF
2 WHAT IT WAS PRECOVID. THERE CONTINUES TO BE GREAT DEAL OF
3 VARIATION BY OPERATOR WITH SYSTEMS THAT HISTORICALLY SERVE
4 LOCAL TRIPS RATHER THAN REGIONAL COMMUTE TRIPS RECOVERING MUCH
5 MORE QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE. THIS CHALLENGE TO TRANSIT IS NOT
6 JUST ABOUT MOBILITY. THE BAY AREA'S CLIMATE GOALS ALSO DEPEND
7 ON TRANSIT. THE CHART AT THE RIGHT SHOWS WHAT WOULD HAPPEN IF
8 BART'S WORST-CASE SCENARIO SERVICE CUTS WERE ENACTED, SUCH
9 CUTTING SERVICE TO ONE-HOUR HEADWAYS. IN SHORT, THE BAY AREA
10 WOULD MISS OUR CLIMATE TARGETS BY ONE HALF -- BY HALF. NEXT
11 SLIDE. TRANSIT IS ALSO FOUNDATIONAL TO OUR HOUSING STRATEGY.
12 OUR REGION HAS BEEN TAKING HUGE STRIDES TO ADDRESS OUR HOUSING
13 CRISIS WITH CITIES AND COUNTIES PLANNING ZONING FOR MORE
14 HOUSING MUCH OF IT AROUND TRANSIT SO WE AVOID FURTHER CLOGGING
15 OUR HIGHWAYS AND REDUCE OUR IMPACTS ON CLIMATE CHANGE IN
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THE NUMBER OF HOMES WITHIN ONE HALF MILE
17 OF A B.A.R.T. STATION IS PROJECTED TO MORE THAN DOUBLE WITH
18 NEARLY 70% OF THAT PROJECTED TO BE AFFORDABLE. LOCATING
19 AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT NOT ONLY HELPS BOOST TRANSIT
20 RIDERSHIP IT ALSO GREATLY LOWERS TRANSPORTATION COST FOR LOW-
21 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS BY MAKING IT EASIER TO DRIVE LESS. NEXT
22 SLIDE. AND LET'S NOT FORGET THAT TRANSIT IMPROVES MOBILITY FOR
23 EVERYONE IN THE REGION NOT JUST THOSE WHO RIDE IT. SEVERE CUTS
24 TO TRANSIT WILL MAKE TRAFFIC MUCH WORSE THAN IT IS TODAY. THE
25 BAY AREA'S \$1 TRILLION ECONOMY DEPENDS ON A WELL FUNCTIONING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TRANSIT SYSTEM. IF JUST HALF OF BART RIDERS SHIFTED TO DRIVING
2 DELAYS ON BAY AREA HIGHWAYS WOULD GROW EXPONENTIALLY
3 ESPECIALLY IN THE BAY BRIDGE CORRIDOR SHOWN HERE. FOR EXAMPLE,
4 BART FOUND THAT FOR A DAILY CAR COMMUTER TRAVELER FROM WALNUT
5 CREEK TO SAN FRANCISCO, IF HALF OF CURRENT BART RIDERS SHIFTED
6 TO DRIVING THAT TRIP WOULD TAKE AN EXTRA SIX HOURS PER WEEK.
7 NEXT SLIDE. GIVEN HOUSE FUNDAMENTAL TRANSIT IS TO OUR GOAL,
8 IT'S NOT SURPRISING THAT IT'S HISTORICALLY BEEN FUNDED FROM
9 MANY LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT. AS SHOWN ON THE LEFT, BEFORE COVID,
10 COUNTY AND LOCAL SOURCES CONTRIBUTED NEARLY HALF OF THE
11 FUNDING PIE AND FARES CONSTITUTED MORE THAN A QUARTER OF THE
12 OVERALL FUNDING MIX. WITH THE PANDEMIC FARES EVAPORATED, AND
13 CONGRESS, LEGISLATURE AND MTC STEPPED UP TO BACK FILL POWER
14 THAT LOSS WITH VARIOUS ONE-TIME INFUSIONS OF FUNDING THAT
15 TOTAL OVER \$4.5 BILLION. OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS WE HAVE SEEN
16 NEW OPERATING FUNDING COME ONLINE FROM LOCAL AND REGIONAL
17 LEVELS TO FARE INCREASES NEW VOTER APPROVED MEASURES AND
18 RECENT BRIDGE TOLL INCREASE AT THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE. NEXT
19 SLIDE. AS WE THINK ABOUT THE FUTURE AND WHAT OUR POST-PANDEMIC
20 ERA FINANCIAL MODEL WILL LOOK LIKE IT'S IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER
21 THAT ADDRESSING TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING CHALLENGES WILL NEED
22 TO TAP INTO MULTIPLE NEW SOURCES NOT JUST ONE. A REGIONAL
23 MEASURE -- A REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE WON'T ELIMINATE THE NEED
24 FOR INCREASED INVESTMENT AT THE LOCAL LEVEL BY OPERATORS AS
25 WELL AS ADVOCACY FOR NEW OPERATING FUNDING SUPPORT FROM THE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT CONTEXT
2 OF THE IMPORTANCE OF PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR THE BAY AREA, LET'S
3 PIVOT TO THE SPECIFICS OF WHAT THE SELECT COMMITTEE EXPLORED.
4 NEXT SLIDE. THE COMMITTEE EXAMINED WHAT PROBLEM THE MEASURE IS
5 TRYING TO SOLVE WHEN IT COMES TO TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING.
6 THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES TWO DISTINCT APPROACHES. THE LIGHT BLUE
7 BARS ON THE RIGHT ILLUSTRATE OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS THAT
8 WERE PROVIDED TO MTC BY THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. THESE ARE THE
9 ESTIMATED DEFICITS OPERATORS FORECAST IN 2027, COMPRISED OF
10 THE GAP BETWEEN OPERATING COSTS AND OPERATING REVENUES AND
11 THEY NOW TOTAL OVER 900 MILLION REGION-WIDE. THE DARK BLUE
12 BARS ON THE LEFT SHOW LOWER AMOUNTS AND THEY DENOTE EACH
13 OPERATOR'S GAP IN FARE REVENUE COLLECTED BEFORE THE PANDEMIC
14 IN 2019 AND WHAT IS BEING COLLECTED NOW PLUS 2% ANNUAL
15 ESCALATION FACTOR. THEY CALL THESE ADJUSTED FARES AND IT
16 TOTALS ABOUT 440 MILLION PER YEAR REGION-WIDE. ADJUSTED FARES
17 MEASURE THE FINANCIAL IMPACT OF LOSS OF RIDERSHIP POST-
18 PANDEMIC AND ARE EASY TO MEASURE AND VERIFY OPERATOR REPORTED
19 SHORTFALLS INCORPORATE RISING COST AND SUCH RAISE OTHER
20 QUESTIONS INCLUDING HOW TO VERIFY STANDARDIZED ACROSS
21 DIFFERENT OPERATORS. SAID THAT OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS
22 ARE LIKELY TO BE CLOSER TO THE ACTUAL OPERATING DEFICIT THAN
23 THE REGION'S TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL FACE SINCE THEY ENCOMPASS
24 THE COMPLETE BUDGET PICTURE A MEASURE THAT FUNDS ONLY ADJUSTED
25 FARE LOSS WOULD STILL REQUIRE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MAKE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 DIFFICULT DECISIONS ABOUT HOW TO BALANCE THEIR BUDGETS GOING
2 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT CONTEXT, LET'S MOVE TO FEEDBACK
3 PROVIDED BY THE SELECT COMMITTEE. IN THE FINAL MEETING,
4 COMMITTEE MEMBERS WERE ASKED TO SCORE KEY COMPONENT WAS A
5 POTENTIAL MEASURE ON A 1 TO 5 SCALE OF GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT.
6 ON GEOGRAPHY, THERE WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR A MEASURE TO
7 PLACED ON THE BALLOT IN AT LEAST THE FOUR COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,
8 CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN MATEO BUT LETTING THE
9 OTHER FIVE OPT IN. THIS, AS COMPARED TO REQUIRING A MEASURE TO
10 INCLUDE ALL NINE COUNTIES. AS WHAT WAS CONSIDERED AN SB1031.
11 ON DURATION, THE SELECT COMMITTEE SLIGHTLY PREFERRED TEN
12 YEARS, BUT THERE WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR A TEN-YEAR
13 MEASURE AMONG COMMISSIONERS REPRESENTING THE FOUR COUNTIES OF
14 ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN MATEO. SANTA
15 CLARA COMMISSIONERS, ON THE OTHER HAND, PREFERRED A 30 YEAR
16 MEASURE. COMMITTEE MEMBERS OVERALL HAD A SLIGHT PREFERENCE FOR
17 TARGETING ADJUSTED FARES OVER OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS.
18 COMMISSIONERS, BUSINESS COMMUNITY, AND CONSTRUCTION LABOR
19 REPRESENTATIVES STRONGLY PREFER ADJUSTED FARES, WHEREAS
20 TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND TRANSIT LABOR REPRESENTATIVE IT IS FAVOR
21 OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. WITH RESPECT TO FUND SOURCE,
22 SALES TAX WAS PREFERRED OVER PARCEL TAX AND PAYROLL TAX. BUT
23 THERE WAS A LOT OF INTEREST IF A MEASURE WITH MULTIPLE SOURCES
24 AS A WAY TO GAIN MORE REVENUE, BUT SPREAD THE TAX BURDEN MORE
25 BROADLY. ALTHOUGH NOT SPECIFICALLY QUERIED IN THE GRADIENTS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 EXERCISE, THE BUSINESS AND BUSINESS TRADE REPRESENTATIVES
2 EXPRESSED STRONG PREFERENCE FOR A MULTI-MODAL MEASURE THAT
3 INCLUDED SUBSTANTIAL CAPITAL INVESTMENT. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE
4 FINAL MEETING, THE COMMITTEE RECEIVED A PRESENTATION ON FOUR
5 VARIATIONS OF A POTENTIAL MEASURE, BUILDING ON WHAT HAD BEEN
6 PRESENTED IN SEPTEMBER. THE FOUR OPTIONS VARIED IN TERMS OF
7 FUNDING SOURCE, DURATION, TRANSIT FUNDING LEVEL AND OVERALL
8 SCOPE. WITH THE TOP TWO OPTIONS SCENARIO 1 AND 1A FUNDED BY
9 HALF CENT SALES TAX, WHEREAS HYBRID WOULD BE FUNDED BY A
10 COMBINATION OF A HALF CENT SALES TAX AND EITHER A PAYROLL TAX
11 OR A PARCEL TAX. NEXT SLIDE. THE COMMITTEE ALSO RECEIVED A
12 PRESENTATION ON A COMPROMISED PROPOSAL SUMMARIZED HERE THAT
13 WAS DEVELOPED BY THE SAN FRANCISCO MTA COMPRISED OF A VARIABLE
14 RATE SALES OR PARCEL TAX IN THE FIVE COUNTIES SERVED BY BART.
15 IN THIS FRAMEWORK, THE RATE -- IN THIS FRAMEWORK, THE RATE IN
16 SAN FRANCISCO WOULD BE HIGHER THAN THE OTHER FIVE COUNTIES AND
17 THE RATE IN SANTA CLARA WOULD BE THE LOWEST OF ALL COUNTIES
18 REFLECTING THE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF NEED. THAT MEASURE HAD A
19 MINIMUM OF FIVE COUNTIES ALLOWING THE NORTH BAY TO OPT IN. THE
20 GOAL WAS TO COMFORT FULL OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. NEXT
21 SLIDE. SO, THAT CONCLUDES THE RECAP. NOW LET'S MOVE INTO THE
22 PROPOSED NEXT STEPS. THE SELECT COMMITTEE RECOMMEND THAT ALL
23 FOUR OPTIONS, PLUS THE FRAMEWORK DEVELOPED BY SFMTA BE FURTHER
24 EXPLORED AND POLLED. HOWEVER, GIVEN THE TIMING AND THE NEED TO
25 PREPARE FOR THE NEXT LEGISLATIVE SESSION, SELECT COMMITTEE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 CHAIR SPERING REQUESTED THAT STAFF REVIEW THE FEEDBACK
2 RECEIVED TO DATE AND PROVIDE OUR BEST THINKING AS TO THE TWO
3 OPTIONS TO BRING BEFORE THE COMMISSION FOR FURTHER
4 CONSIDERATION AND POLLING. IN ANALYZING THE RESULT FROM THE
5 GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT EXERCISE AND BASED ON ALL INPUT
6 RECEIVED, WE BELIEVE TWO OPTIONS, SCENARIO 1A AND HYBRID WITH
7 A PARCEL TAX STAND ABOVE THE REST AS HAVING THE GREATEST
8 CHANCE OF ACHIEVING THE CORE OBJECT IS AND GENERATING THE
9 CONSENSUS NEEDED TO SUCCEED IN THE LEGISLATURE AND ITS BALLOT.
10 BEFORE EXPLAINING EACH OPTION I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THESE
11 PROPOSALS DO NOT YET RESOLVE ALL CONCERNS ESPECIALLY THOSE
12 RAISED BY SEVERAL SAN MATEO COUNTIES ELECTED OFFICIALS. WE
13 TAKE THESE CONCERNS SERIOUSLY AND AGREE THAT THE NEGOTIATIONS
14 REGARDING HOW MUCH FUNDING SHOULD BE PROVIDED TO SPECIFIC
15 OPERATORS FROM EACH COUNTY WOULD BENEFIT FROM AN INDEPENDENT
16 THIRD-PARTY REVIEW AND ARE PREPARED TO SUPPORT SUCH AN
17 INDEPENDENT REVIEW EFFORT. NEXT SLIDE. SCENARIO 1A IS A TEN-
18 YEAR HALF CENT SALES TAX EMERGENCY MEASURE FOCUSED ON
19 STABILIZING TRANSIT. AS SHOWN ON THE MAP SCENARIO 1A IS
20 PROPOSED ONLY FOR THE COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN
21 MATEO, AND SAN FRANCISCO, WHICH HAVE THE HIGHEST TRANSIT USAGE
22 AND FACE THE MAJOR FUNDING GAPS. IT FOCUSES ON THE CORE NEED
23 FOR MORE TRANSIT FUNDING TO AVERT MAJOR CUTS AND INVEST IN
24 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. SANTA CLARA SHOWN HERE IN GREEN, WOULD
25 BE GIVEN THE OPTION TO PARTICIPATE WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 IF THEY CHOOSE NOT TO, THEY WILL STILL BE FUNDING THEIR SHARE
2 OF BART'S OPERATING COSTS, THROUGH THE VTA BART AGREEMENT, AND
3 THEY WOULD BE EXPECTED TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO COVER THEIR SHARE
4 OF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND CALTRAIN OPERATING NEEDS. IT'S
5 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED CORRESPONDENCE,
6 INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT D, FROM OUR THREE SANTA CLARA COUNTY
7 COMMISSIONERS AND VTA'S GENERAL MANAGER INDICATING THEIR
8 SUPPORT FOR PROVIDING THIS FUNDING FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
9 AND CALTRANS AND DOING SO THROUGH THEIR OWN SALES TAX MEASURE
10 THAT WOULD ALSO PLACED ON THE BALLOT RATHER THAN JOINING A
11 REGIONAL MEASURE. OVERALL THIS FRAMEWORK WOULD PROVIDE
12 ADDITIONAL 505 MILLION ANNUALLY TO MAKE UP FOR LOST FARE
13 REVENUE FOR BART, CALTRAIN, AC TRANSIT, AND MUNI. NEXT SLIDE.
14 THIS SLIDE PROVIDES A SNAPSHOT OF THE FINANCIALS IN SCENARIO
15 1A. ON THE LEFT ARE ANNUAL FIGURES WHILE THE RIGHT SIDE
16 SUMMARIZES THE AMOUNTS BY OPERATOR OVER TEN YEARS. IN ADDITION
17 TO THE ROUGHLY 4.3 BILLION TO SUPPORT BART, CALTRAIN, AND
18 MUNI, THIS SCENARIO ALSO MAKES MEANINGFUL INVESTMENT IN LOCAL
19 TRANSIT, INCLUDING 300 MILLION FOR AC TRANSIT, 200 MILLION FOR
20 SAMTRANS, AND SAN MATEO FEEDER SERVICES AND OVER 140 MILLION
21 FOR EAST BAY, FEEDER BUS, AND SMALL OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE.
22 THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THE HYBRID SCENARIO. IT HAS A 30-YEAR
23 DURATION AND PROVIDES HIGHER TRANSIT FUNDING LEVELS AIMED AT
24 SUSTAINING CURRENT SERVICE LEVELS. IT TARGETS OPERATOR
25 REPORTED DEFICITS, NOT JUST FARE LOSSES. THAT HIGHER FUNDING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 LEVEL DEMANDS A HIGHER TAX SO THIS OPTION PROPOSES TWO FUNDING
2 SOURCES. ONE HALF CENT SALES TAX PAIRED WITH A \$0.09 PER
3 BUILDING SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX. UNLIKE SCENARIO 1A WHICH IS
4 PROPOSED TO BE FIVE COUNTIES, AT MOST, THIS FRAMEWORK COULD
5 INCLUDE ALL NINE. I WANT TO NOTE THAT WHILE SANTA CLARA IS
6 SHOWN AS OPT IN ON THIS SLIDE WE DO NOT THINK THIS OPTION
7 MAKES SENSE TO PURSUE UNLESS SANTA CLARA OFFICIALS SUPPORT IT.
8 THAT'S BECAUSE IN OUR GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENTS EXERCISE ONLY
9 SANTA CLARA COUNTY COMMISSIONERS FAVORED A 30-YEAR MEASURE. --
10 APPARENTLY I NEED MORE WATER. SORRY ABOUT THAT. ANOTHER
11 IMPORTANT FEATURE OF THE HYBRID IS THAT TO PROVIDES FUNDING
12 FOR OTHER TYPES OF TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS SUCH AS ROADWAY
13 AND BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN PROJECTS. ESPECIALLY STARTING IN
14 YEAR 15, WHEN 90% OF THE SALES TAX WOULD BECOME AVAILABLE FOR
15 COUNTY FLEX. THESE FUNDS COULD BE SPENT ON ANY COUNTY PRIORITY
16 ALIGNED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND PROJECTS WOULD BE SELECTED
17 BY THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE
18 HELPS TO ILLUSTRATE THE TEMPORAL GEOGRAPHIC AND REVENUE SOURCE
19 MECHANICS OF THE HYBRID. START FROM THIS BOTTOM, THE GREEN
20 AREAS IN THE CHART ARE DEDICATED TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS
21 COVERING 90% OF OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS FOR THE FIRST
22 EIGHT YEARS, 65% OF THE SHORTFALLS IN YEARS 9 TO 15, THEN
23 HOLDING CONSTANT AT 300 MILLION REGION-WIDE IN YEAR 16 TO 30.
24 THE MIDDLE SECTION SHOWN IN ORANGE COMPRISES 61% OF THE 30
25 YEAR TOTAL FOR COUNTY FLEX LOCALLY DEVELOPED PRIORITIES



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 SELECTED BY THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. THE BLUE
2 PORTION AT THE TOP SHOWS DEDICATED 10% OF SALES TAX REVENUE
3 APPROXIMATELY 100 MILLION DEDICATED TO TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
4 EACH YEAR THROUGH THE 30-YEAR PERIOD. SALES TAX FOR TRANSIT
5 OPERATIONS FLOWS TO OPERATORS THAT SERVE THE COUNTY WHERE THE
6 SALES TAX IS GENERATED. ALSO, TRANSIT OPERATING EXPENDITURES
7 FROM SALES TAXES IN THE FOUR COUNTIES WHERE TRANSIT NEEDS ARE
8 GREATEST TAPER DOWN IN YEAR NINE AS MORE FUNDS ARE AVAILABLE
9 FOR COUNTY FLEX. FOR SANTA CLARA AND THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES,
10 90% OF THE SALES TAX WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED AS COUNTY FLEX
11 THROUGHOUT THE 30-YEAR PERIOD. FOR PARCEL TAX, 60% WOULD BE
12 TREATED AS FLEXIBLE REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING ALLOCATED BASED
13 ON NEED WITH REMAINING OF 40% OF PARCEL TAX DISTRIBUTED BACK
14 TO COUNTIES ON RETURN TO SOURCE BASIS FOR FLEXIBLE PRIORITIES.
15 NEXT SLIDE. WITH THE OVERALL ARCHITECTURE OF THE HYBRID
16 EXPLAIN, I'M SURE YOU ALL GOT WHAT I JUST SAID [LAUGHTER] THIS
17 SLIDE PROVIDES A QUICK VISUAL OF FUNDING ALLOCATIONS UNDER THE
18 HYBRID FRAMEWORK. IF ALL NINE COUNTIES CHOSE TO PARTICIPATE
19 THE MEASURE WOULD GENERATE \$1.5 BILLION PER YEAR AND ALMOST 30
20 BILLION IN NEW REVENUE FOR COUNTY FLEX OVER 30 YEARS. BETWEEN
21 9.4 TO \$10 BILLION WOULD BE DEDICATED TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN
22 THE FIRST FIVE YEARS OF THE MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE
23 RECAPS THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S ACTION ON POLICY PROVISIONS TO
24 INCLUDE IN THE LEGISLATION. IT'S THE SECOND PAGE OF ATTACHMENT
25 C IN YOUR PACKET. THE COMMITTEE UNANIMOUSLY AGREED ON THESE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 ITEMS, INCLUDING STRENGTHENING TRANSIT AGENCY ACCOUNTABILITY
2 BY REQUIRING OVERSIGHT OVER TRANSIT AGENCY FINANCIAL
3 INFORMATION AND CONDITIONING FUND FROM THIS MEASURE ON
4 AGENCY'S COMPLYING WITH POLICIES AIMED TO IMPROVE THE TRANSIT
5 RIDER EXPERIENCE. IT ALSO INCLUDES KEEPING TRANSIT AGENCY
6 CONSOLIDATION OUT OF THE LEGISLATION WHILE ACKNOWLEDGING IT IS
7 A TOPIC WORTHY OF FURTHER STUDY. IT ALSO LOOKS AT INVESTING
8 10% OF REVENUE FROM THE MEASURE AND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND
9 ENSURING THE MEASURE CAN BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT VIA CITIZEN
10 INITIATIVE SO THAT IT CAN BE APPROVED IF SUPPORTED BY THE
11 MAJORITY OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED BOTH
12 FRAMEWORKS PROVIDE FOR 10% OF THE FUNDS FROM A SALES TAX ON GO
13 TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND THE SELECT COMMITTEE
14 ENDORSED THIS. BASED ON FEEDBACK WE'RE PROPOSING THAT HALF OF
15 THOSE FUNDS GO TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PRIORITIES IN
16 EACH COUNTY IN PROPORTION TO THE SHARE OF SALES TAX GENERATED.
17 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS ILLUSTRATIVE INVESTMENTS IN THE
18 FOUR PRIORITY AREAS OF REGIONAL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION RANGING
19 FROM TRANSIT FARE COORDINATION, MAPPING AND WAYFINDING,
20 TRANSIT PRIORITY, AND ACCESSIBILITY AND PARATRANSIT. NEXT
21 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THE TIMELINE. WE HAVE ARRIVED AT
22 DECEMBER 9TH AND YOU ARE BEING ASKED TO TAKE ACTION ON POLICY
23 PROVISIONS AND FRAMEWORK OPTIONS FOR ENABLING LEGISLATION
24 SUBJECT TO REFINEMENT POLLING WHICH WOULD BEGIN IN JANUARY WE
25 ANTICIPATE POLLING RESULTS BY EARLY FOLLOW AND WILL RETURN TO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THE COMMISSION IN FEBRUARY WITH RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATION ON
2 SPONSORSHIP FOR TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE ENABLING
3 LEGISLATION. WE'RE COMMITTED TO ONGOING COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT
4 THROUGHOUT THE NEXT YEAR. UNDER LEGISLATIVE ENGAGEMENT WE HAVE
5 BEEN KEEPING LEGISLATORS INFORMED ABOUT THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S
6 WORK AND ARE PLANNING TO BRIEF THE BAY AREA DELEGATION AFTER
7 TODAY'S MEETING. WE EXPECT THE BILL TO BE INTRODUCED BY LATE
8 FEBRUARY AND WE HAVE NOTE THAT SOME TRANSIT AGENCIES MAY
9 INTRODUCE PLAN B LEGISLATION OF THEIR OWN AS FALL-BACK
10 STRATEGY. THE RED DOT ON THE LOWER RIGHT SHOWS OUR TARGET MID-
11 SEPTEMBER IS THE DATE WHEN WE NEED TO HAVE THE BILL REACH THE
12 GOVERNOR'S DESK, IF NOT BEFORE, WHICH IS JUST TEN MONTHS FROM
13 NOW. NEXT SLIDE. ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE ARRIVED AT THE ACTION
14 BEFORE YOU TODAY, FOR CONSIDERATION, WHICH IS THREE FOLD.
15 WE'RE ASKING THAT YOU ENDORSE KEY POLICY PROVISIONS, INCLUDED
16 AS ATTACHMENT C, AND AS SHOWN ON SLIDE 21, AND ASK THAT THOSE
17 POLICY PROVISION QUESTIONS BE INCLUDED IN THE POLL. WE'RE
18 ASKING YOU, ALSO, TO ENDORSE SCENARIO 1A AND THE HYBRID
19 FRAMEWORK FOR POLLING AND ADDITIONAL REFINEMENT AND ALSO
20 PERMIT COORDINATION ON POLLING ON VARIABLE RATE OPTION IF
21 THERE IS INTEREST BY PARTNERS TO ENSURE COMPARABILITY OF POLL
22 RESULTS. AND FINALLY WE'RE ASKING FOR DIRECTION TO RETURN BY
23 FEBRUARY OF EARLY NEXT YEAR WITH POLLING RESULTS AND
24 SPONSORSHIP CONSIDERATIONS FOR TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE
25 ENABLING LEGISLATION. THAT CONCLUDES MY VERY LONG



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PRESENTATION. BUT I SEE THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING'S HEAD IS
2 NOT ON THE TABLE SO HE TOLD ME IF HIS HEAD WAS ON THE TABLE
3 THAT WAS A BAD SIGN. [LAUGHTER] I'M GLAD IT'S NOT. THANK YOU.
4 I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO CHAIR PEDROZA.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. TO OUR CHIEF DEPUTY
7 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ALIX BOCKELMAN, YOU KNOW. LOOK FOR ANYONE
8 THAT WANT'S TO PARTICIPATE, SOME HAVE ALREADY TAKEN YOUR BLUE
9 CARDS YOU CAN DO THAT WHILE WE HAVE DISCUSSION ALSO TO ANYONE
10 THAT WANT'S TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND.
11 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

12

13 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS OR A FEW
14 QUESTIONS. SO WITH THE POLLING OF THE TWO SCENARIOS, WILL
15 THERE BE ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY IN THAT POLLING SO IF THIS SUPPORT
16 FOR AN ASPECT OF ONE SCENARIO THAT ISN'T IN THAT SCENARIO, BUT
17 WAS IN ANOTHER -- IN THE OTHER SCENARIO, IT WILL GET A SENSE
18 OF THAT?

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK WE ARE TRYING TO BUILD IN FLEXIBILITY
21 SO WE CAN LEARN FROM THE POLLING. I KNOW REBECCA IS CLOSEST TO
22 CONVERSATIONS ON POLLING. SO I'LL SEE IF SHE WANTS TO ADD TO
23 THAT?

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, ALIX. ONE OF THE THINGS WE WANT TO DO
2 IN THE POLL IS DO A SPLIT SAMPLE WHERE WE ACTUALLY ASK WHAT
3 WOULD BE AKIN TO A BALLOT QUESTION IN POTENTIALLY THREE
4 DIFFERENT WAYS. SCENARIO 1A HYBRID AND POTENTIALLY VARIABLE
5 RATE IDEA. I THINK AFTER ASKING THAT INITIAL QUESTION WE WANT
6 TO POTENTIALLY TEASE OUT WHAT ASPECTS OF THIS DID YOU LIKE OR
7 NOT LIKE. BUT, YOU KNOW, WITH THE SPLIT SAMPLE, THERE IS SOME
8 CONSTRAINTS AND HOW MUCH YOU CAN LEARN. CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW,
9 IF WE FEEL WE NEED TO, AS THIS EFFORT GOES FORWARD, THERE
10 COULD BE A SUBSEQUENT POLL, THAT WE DO THINK WE'LL -- WHAT
11 WE'RE TESTING FOR HERE IS VIABILITY. WE'RE NOT TRYING TO
12 PREDICT EXACTLY WHERE VOTERS WILL BE IN NOVEMBER 2026. RIGHT?
13 BUT BY DOING THE SPLIT SAMPLE WE'LL GET A SENSE OF THE
14 RELATIVE SUPPORT FOR THE DIFFERENT STRUCTURES.

15

16 **NATHAN MILEY:** YEAH BECAUSE FOR INSTANCE, WITH SCENARIO 1A,
17 IT'S A SALES TAX, AND IN THE HYBRID, IT'S TWO POSSIBLE REVENUE
18 SOURCES. SO, SO WHAT I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN KNOW, FOR
19 INSTANCE, WITH SCENARIO 1A, IF FOLKS JUST LAND ON A SALES TAX,
20 OR WOULD THEY BE MORE COMFORTABLE WITH, YOU KNOW, MULTIPLE
21 FUNDING STREAMS? JUST AS AN EXAMPLE?

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. YEAH, I THINK THAT'S THE
24 KIND OF THING WE COULD ASK AS A FOLLOW-UP, RIGHT? WOULD YOU BE
25 MORE IN FAVOR OF THIS IF IT WERE ONLY SALES TAX, WOULD YOU BE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MORE IN FAVOR IF IT INCLUDED OTHER TYPES OF EXPENDITURES I
2 THINK WE CAN TRYING AS BEST WE CAN TO TEASE THAT OUT.

3

4 **NATHAN MILEY:** A FEW MORE QUESTIONS. SO, THE POLL, WILL IT ALSO
5 ASK IF VOTERS WOULD BE INTERESTED IN A HIGHER EXPENDITURE
6 PLAN, FOR INSTANCE, IT'S OPPOSED TO THE AMOUNT THAT'S BEING
7 SUGGESTED IF THEY WOULD BE OPEN TO MORE?

8

9 **REBECCA LONG:** COMMISSIONER MILEY, ARE YOU ASKING MORE THAN THE
10 HYBRID? OR --

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** MORE MONEY FOR TRANSIT.

13

14 **REBECCA LONG:** RIGHT. THE HYBRID SCENARIO IS THE LARGER
15 CONTRIBUTION. UNDER A NINE COUNTY SCENARIO IT WOULD BE 1.5
16 BILLION OR EVEN UNDER A SMALLER SCENARIO BECAUSE IT'S BOTH
17 HALF CENT SALES TAX AND PARCEL TAX IT DOES PROVIDE GREATER
18 LEVEL OF FUNDING TO TRANSIT. AT THIS TIME WE FEEL THAT'S THE
19 BIGGEST CONTRAST ON THE SIZE OF THE REVENUE GENERATED.

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** I SEE BECAUSE PEOPLE -- I DON'T WANT TO SPEAK TO
22 MY PREFERENCE, BUT IN LIKE TEN YEARS, BUT MORE MONEY, SO WOULD
23 WE BE ABLE TO DETERMINE THAT?

24

25 **REBECCA LONG:** POTENTIALLY AS A FOLLOW UP TO SCENARIO 1A. YES.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** AND WITH THAT SCENARIO 1A WITH THE PROPOSED
3 FUNDING STRATEGIES, HOW WILL THAT BE TEASED OUT? BECAUSE MAYBE
4 WE'RE VERY SENSITIVE, SOME OF US, TO AC TRANSIT, SO FOLKS FEEL
5 THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE OF AN EQUITY LENS RELATIVE TO THAT.
6 WILL THAT GET TEASED OUT IN THE POLLING?

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** YOU KNOW, I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF
9 CONVERSATION IN DRAFTING HAPPENING OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS AND
10 WE HAVE COMMITTED TO THE CORE OPERATORS THAT FACE DEFICITS
11 THAT WE WANT TO COLLABORATE WITH THEM. I DON'T THINK I CAN
12 SPEAK TO THAT SPECIFIC QUESTION RIGHT NOW. BUT WE KNOW THAT
13 SOME OPERATORS HAVE PARTICULAR QUESTIONS THAT THEY'RE
14 INTERESTED IN AND TO THE EXTENT THAT WE CAN WE'RE OPEN TO
15 PUTTING THOSE IN THE POLLS.

16

17 **NATHAN MILEY:** BECAUSE ONCE AGAIN YOU KNOW THERE'S A LETTER
18 FROM ACTC IN HERE THAT WAS SENT BY THE CHAIR. I KNOW ACTC
19 MAYBE OUR LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE TOOK UP THIS BUT THE FULL
20 COMMISSION DIDN'T TAKE IT UP. SO THERE IS NO GUARANTEES,
21 ALAMEDA COUNTY, SPEAKING AS A GOVERNMENT, BUT ALAMEDA COUNTY
22 IN ON TOTALITY YOU KNOW WOULD FEEL COMFORTABLE WITH CERTAIN
23 DIRECTIONS. SO I THINK THE MORE INFORMATION WE GET FROM A POLL
24 THE BETTER OFF WE WILL BE IN TERMS OF DECIDING AT LEAST THE
25 COUNTY AS A GOVERNMENT THEN ACTC REPRESENTING ALL OF US IN



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 ALAMEDA COUNTY, HOW WE FEEL ABOUT A PARTICULAR MEASURE,
2 INITIATIVE. THE OTHER THING I WANT TO JUST ASK IS, YOU FOLKS
3 KNOW ALL THE DIFFERENT FUNDING STREAMS THAT MTC IS RESPONSIBLE
4 FOR. LET'S SUPPOSE THE BALLOT MEASURE FAILS. HAVE WE EXAMINED
5 A BACKUP SCENARIO IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, IT'S COLOR OF MONEY,
6 MAYBE MOVING MONEY FROM ONE TYPE OF THING, TAKING THAT, LET'S
7 SAY, OUT OF CAPITAL, AND PUTTING IT INTO OPERATIONS? HAVE WE
8 KIND OF LOOKED AT ALL OTHER TYPES OF POSSIBILITIES? AND WOULD
9 THAT BE SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE POLLED, AS WELL?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH, I DON'T THINK THAT WE WOULD BE POLLING
12 ON ANY, SORT OF, BACKUP STRATEGY. YOU KNOW, THE AMOUNT THAT'S
13 NEEDED AT, YOU KNOW, OVER 500 MILLION A YEAR, UP TO OVER 900
14 MILLION A YEAR, MTC DOESN'T REALLY HAVE MONEY AT THAT LEVEL
15 TO, YOU KNOW, BE A BACKUP STRATEGY. I THINK YOU ALL HAVE SEEN
16 RECENTLY, IN CONVERSATIONS, YOU KNOW, YOU ARE TAKING SOME HARD
17 ACTION AND WILL CONTINUE TO DO THAT THIS MONTH ON BRIDGES
18 STRATEGIES WHERE YOU'RE LOOKING AT REDIRECTING SOME FUNDS THAT
19 TOTAL 300 MILLION. AND I THINK THAT'S A HARD CONVERSATION. AND
20 THAT'S REALLY LOOKED TO AS, SORT OF, A BRIDGE SHORT-TERM. I
21 THINK DOING SOMETHING ON AN ONGOING BASIS, YOU KNOW -- SO,
22 AGAIN, I THINK WE HAVE LOOKED AT SHORT-TERM STRATEGIES. I
23 THINK A LONGER TERM STRATEGY, I'M NOT SURE THERE IS ENOUGH
24 MONEY, BUT WE CAN CERTAINLY COME BACK WITH A LOT MORE
25 INFORMATION FOR ON YOU THAT.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'LL ADD TOO, YOU KNOW COMMISSIONER
3 MILEY, WHEN THE FISCAL CLIFF FIRST HAPPENED ONE OF THE
4 DISCUSSIONS WE HAD WERE HOW DO YOU PROVIDE BRIDGE FUNDING THEN
5 HOW DO YOU PROVIDE SUSTAINABLE FUNDING THAT ALLOWS OPERATORS
6 TO MAKE SOME OF THESE DECISIONS THAT THEY NEEDED TO MAKE BASED
7 OFF OF PREDICTABLE FUNDING RIGHT. BACK TO THE TIME WHERE WE
8 WERE PUTTING EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE BECAUSE WE HAD TO, AND
9 THE STATE CAME IN WITH FUNDING THEN WE HAD TO MAKE TOUGH
10 DECISIONS FOR THE STATE, WHAT ARE YOU GOING TO PUT IN AS WELL.
11 BRING THAT BACK FOR YOUR QUESTIONS AS WELL.

12

13 **NATHAN MILEY:** I HATE TO BRIDGE THAT BACK UP BUT THE POINT
14 BASED ON THE PRIOR ELECTION AND EVEN WITH PROP FIVE NOT
15 RECEIVING SUPPORT, IF WE CAN'T COUNT ON THAT WE'RE GOING TO
16 GET THE VOTERS TO SUPPORT THIS AT 2/3.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU KNOW LOOK, I THINK SCENARIO
19 PLANNING IS ALWAYS GOING TO BE NEEDED. AND I THINK WHAT I SEE
20 HERE, A PATHWAY TO LOOK AT POLLING TO GAUGE PUBLIC SENTIMENT
21 BECAUSE PART OF THIS WE COULD HAVE A SOLUTION BUT IF THERE IS
22 NO PUBLIC APPETITE IT MIGHT LEAD US TO THE SAME DISCUSSION
23 IT'S MEANINGFUL PROGRESS FORWARD BEING FULLY AWARE OF WHAT THE
24 OUTCOMES MIGHT BE. YOU HAVE HIT IT ON THE HEAD COMMISSIONER
25 MILEY. THE OTHER WAY AROUND. COMMISSION EARLY MAHAN.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **MATT MAHAN:** I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR HEADING
3 UP THE COMMISSION, THE TASK FORCE -- WHAT DO WE ULTIMATELY
4 CALL IT?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SELECT COMMITTEE.

7

8 **MATT MAHAN:** COMMISSIONER MILEY, YOU DID A FANTASTIC JOB JUST
9 SO GRATEFUL TO YOU FOR THE SHUTTLE DIPLOMACY MAKING YOUR WAY
10 ALL OVER THE BAY AND TALKING WITH EACH OF US TAKING OUR UNIQUE
11 CIRCUMSTANCES SERIOUSLY AND HELPING US CRAFT POTENTIAL OPTIONS
12 FOR MOVING FORWARD. I WANT TO REITERATE WHAT WAS MENTIONED IN
13 THE STAFF PRESENTATION, WE ALL HAD A LOT OF CONVERSATION SO I
14 WON'T GO LONG BUT VERY MUCH COMMITTED TO DOING OUR PART TO
15 ENSURE THAT THE LARGER REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEM BENEFIT ALL OF US
16 AND CAN MAINTAIN SERVICE LEVELS WE WILL CERTAINLY DO OUR FAIR
17 SHARE OUR UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES HAVING FACED DIRE FISCAL CLIFFS
18 20 PLUS YEARS AGO WE HAVE GONE THROUGH THE PROCESS OF PASSING
19 MULTIPLE REFER NEW MEASURES ACTUALLY HAVE FOUR IN PLACE TO
20 FUND OUR TRANSIT COUNTY TO THE TUNE OF NEARLY A BILLION
21 DOLLARS A YEAR WE'RE LOOKING AT NOT FACING A MAJOR CLIFF, WHEN
22 IT COMES TO LOCAL BUS AND LIGHT RAIL RIGHT NOW IS NEEDING TO
23 RENEW SIZABLE MEASURES OVER THE COMING YEARS AND THAT
24 FLEXIBILITY ALLOWING SANTA CLARA TO DO WHAT WE HAVE TO DO TO
25 MAINTAIN SERVICE LEVELS SHOULD WE FAIL TO RENEW ANY OF THOSE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MEASURES WE WOULD SUDDENLY FACE A VERY SIGNIFICANT CLIFF
2 OURSELVES SO WE BELIEVE THAT THE ABILITY TO KIND OF COORDINATE
3 WITH AND BE A GOOD PARTNER BUT MAKE SURE THAT WE RENEW A 30
4 YEAR SALES TAX MEASURE THAT GENERATES A COUPLE HUNDRED MILLION
5 DOLLARS A YEAR FOR TRANSIT IN THE SOUTH BAY WILL ALSO PUT US
6 IN THE BEST POSITION TOO THROUGH OUR -- THROUGH LACK OF A
7 BETTER TERM, BILATERAL AGREEMENTS OUR CONTRACTS WITH BART AND
8 CALTRAIN DO OUR FAIR SHARE TO BE A GOOD PARTNER JUST WANTED
9 FOLKS TO UNDERSTAND OUR UNIQUE PERSPECTIVE AND WHY WE FEEL
10 STRONGLY ABOUT HAVING THE OPT IN OPPORTUNITY OR OPT OUT WHICH
11 IS BECAUSE WE WILL BE DEFAULT OUT EITHER WAY HAVE TO MOVE
12 FORWARD OUR OWN MEASURE THAT WILL ALMOST CERTAINLY BE A
13 RENEWAL OF LONG-TERM SALES TAX MEASURE AND DON'T THINK WE HAVE
14 A WHOLE LOT OF FLEXIBILITY AROUND THAT WE JUST HAVE TO DO THAT
15 ACTUALLY DO IT FOR THREE DIFFERENT SALES TAX MEASURES AND IN
16 THE NEXT COUPLE OF DECADES WORK OUT FOR US THE PRINCIPLE OF
17 FLEXIBILITY AND INDEPENDENT JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT
18 APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S SENSITIVITY TO THE POSITION WE'RE IN
19 AND WANTED TO REITERATE THAT POINT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR AND THANK YOU TO EVERYONE WHO
24 HAS PARTICIPATED IN THIS PROCESS. SAN MATEO COUNTY HAS
25 PARTICIPATED THROUGH THE AND NO SURPRISE WE HAVE ASKED MANY,



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MANY TIMES IT'S BEEN SPELLED OUT IN OUR LETTER FROM CCAG HERE
2 FOR THE OPT OUT OPTION WHICH IS NOT PRESENT IN ANY OF THE
3 SCENARIOS, FOR THE SAME REASONS THAT MAYOR MAHAN SAID, WE HAVE
4 EXISTING MEASURES. WE HAVE AN EXISTING CONTRACT WITH CALTRAIN,
5 WHICH WE STAND BY, AND HOPEFULLY THE OTHER COUNTIES ALSO STAND
6 BY IN WHATEVER SHORTFALL THEY MAY HAVE. WE ARE PAYING BART,
7 REGULARLY. THEY HAVE A SURCHARGE ON TICKETS OUT OF OUR COUNTY.
8 AGAIN, WE HAVE PARTICIPATED IN THIS PROCESS WE'RE NOT
9 PRESENTING ANY SURPRISES BUT WE'RE NOT SEEING ANY OF THE
10 REQUESTED ACCOMMODATIONS IN WHAT'S PRESENTED HERE. OUR VOTER
11 APPROVAL WOULD NOT BE REALLY SOMETHING I THINK SAN MATEO
12 COUNTY COULD CONSIDER AT THIS POINT IN TIME. WE AGAIN WILL
13 KEEP PARTICIPATING HERE. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW AS FAR AS
14 POLLING GOES, HOW IS POLLING GOING TO BE DIFFERENT THAN
15 PREVIOUS POLLING? BECAUSE RIGHT NOW I CAN TELL YOU PUBLIC
16 TRANSPORTATION IS IMPORTANT. CLEANLINESS IS IMPORTANT. PUBLIC
17 SAFETY IS IMPORTANT. THE SAME QUESTIONS. SO, HOW WILL THIS
18 POLLING BE DIFFERENT? HOW WILL THIS POLLING BE DONE IN MY
19 COUNTY? BECAUSE PREVIOUS POLLING DONE IN MY COUNTY, FOR
20 ANOTHER REGIONAL MEASURE, WAS, HOW DO YOU FEEL ABOUT BART TO
21 SAN JOSE. WELL, IF YOU ASK MY RESIDENTS THAT, WHICH YOU DID,
22 PREVIOUSLY, THEY THOUGHT IT WOULD HAPPEN IN SAN MATEO COUNTY,
23 NOT IN EAST BAY. SO I'M A LITTLE SENSITIVE TO HOW QUESTIONS
24 WILL BE ASKED. I UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE. I REALLY DO, OF
25 GETTING APPROPRIATE INFORMATION SO YOU CAN TELL ME HOW THIS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 POLLING BEING PROPOSED HERE WITH THE SCENARIOS HERE WILL BE
2 DIFFERENT FROM PREVIOUS POINTS?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, BECAUSE HE WAS
5 CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE, I'M GIVE GOING TO GIVE TIME TO
6 ADDRESS. IF THAT'S ALL RIGHT.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WE HAVE MADE COMMITMENT TO EACH ONE OF THE
9 COUNTIES THAT WE'RE GOING TO WORK DIRECTLY WITH THEM ON THE
10 POLLING QUESTIONS AND WHAT ARE THE LOCAL CONCERNS THEY HAVE
11 WHAT THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN THE POLL. SO WE HAVE TRAVELED
12 AROUND. I'M ASSUMING IT'S GOING TO BE WITH STAKEHOLDERS BUT
13 DEFINITELY WITH THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES THEY'RE GOING
14 TO HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW THE POLL AND HAVE INPUT ON
15 WHAT'S BEING ASKED THEIR COUNTY.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. BUT I DO HAVE A
18 PROBLEM WITH THE STAKEHOLDERS HERE BECAUSE WE AS ELECTED ARE
19 NOT PART OF THAT. THAT'S WHERE THINGS CAN KIND OF GO SIDEWAYS
20 HERE. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO THAT. I REALLY DO LOOK FORWARD
21 HERE. AND I THINK THE BEST POINT YOU HAVE HERE, THE
22 LEGISLATURE WOULD APPRECIATE IS AN INDEPENDENT THIRD PARTY
23 REVIEW. BECAUSE IT'S IMPORTANT FOR EVERYONE TO KNOW HOW THE
24 BAILOUT MONEY WAS SPENT, WHAT USE IT WAS PUT TO HERE, AND IF
25 YOU'RE GETTING ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN THE FUTURE, HOW THAT'S



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTED. BECAUSE I DO AGREE, THE PUBLIC IS
2 INTERESTED IN THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ASPECT OF IT. SO, THE
3 GENERAL QUESTIONS, WHICH COME UP IN ALL OF OUR POLLS -- I'M
4 NOT EVEN SURE THOSE SHOULD BE ASKED, BECAUSE WE KNOW WHAT THE
5 RESULTS ARE GOING TO BE [LAUGHTER] AND THE IMPACT, WE NEED TO
6 MAKE SURE WHAT'S PRESENTED HERE REFLECTS WHAT EACH COUNTY HAS
7 DONE HERE. SO, AGAIN, SAN MATEO COUNTY, AT THE VERY LEAST, IS
8 AND HAS ASKED FOR AN OPT OUT OPTION. SO, YOU CAN'T SUPPORT
9 SOMETHING, EVEN THE POLL, UNLESS THAT TYPE OF INFORMATION IS
10 HERE. AND WE HAVE SPELLED OUT OTHER ASPECTS OF THAT. SO, AND
11 TO BE CLEAR FOR THE PUBLIC, WE HAVE, THROUGH THE, SHOWN OUR
12 CONCERNS. THE ONE THING, I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING ON,
13 IS AN INDEPENDENT REVIEW. BECAUSE WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT'S
14 HAPPENING IN ORDER TO REALLY IMPACT TRANSFORMATION. AND I LOVE
15 THE ACCOUNTABILITY PART OF WHAT YOU PRESENTED. BUT THAT NEEDS
16 TO BE INCLUDED IN ANYTHING THAT MOVES FORWARD. SO, I -- TELL
17 ME HOW WE CAN MAKE THIS WORK FOR MY COUNTY, ONE ASPECT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO GO TO
20 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** JUST WANT TO RESPOND. THE TWO REQUESTS I GOT
23 FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY, ONE IS THEY WANT TO BE INVOLVED IN THE
24 POLLING, WE AGREED TO THAT. THE OTHER IS INDEPENDENT REVIEW
25 WORKING WITH EACH OF THE FOUR COUNTIES SO WE'RE GOING TO DO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THAT, THE VERY QUESTION YOU'RE ASKING ARE VERY APPROPRIATE AND
2 I THINK HOPEFULLY THROUGH THAT REVIEW WE'LL BE ABLE TO ANSWER
3 MANY OF THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU'RE ASKING FOR.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** CLEARLY EXPRESSED TO COMMISSIONER SPERING AND HIS
6 LEADERSHIP HERE IS WE DO -- WE'LL PARTICIPATE IN THE CALTRAIN
7 OBLIGATION, WE ARE, AGAIN, PAYING INTO BART HERE, BUT I'M NOT
8 SEEING THE OPT OUT PRESENTED TO SAN MATEO COUNTY. WE DO HAVE
9 EXISTING MEASURES. WE CLEARLY SAID THAT, AND THAT IS KIND OF A
10 DO-OR-DIE FOR OUR COUNTY. BECAUSE WE HAVE INFRASTRUCTURE
11 NEEDS. WE HAVE -- WE NEED THAT FLEXIBILITY. SO, THANK YOU TO
12 COMMISSIONER SPERING. BUT THAT IS ONE KEY ELEMENT THAT IS MISS
13 SAID.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. VICE
16 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ THEN I'LL KEEP WORKING MY WAY DOWN.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DID I HEAR,
19 REBECCA, YOU SAY THAT YOU'RE GOING TO PULL THE VARIABLE RATE
20 MEASURE AS WELL AS HYBRID 1A? FOR MY COLLEAGUES, THE VARIABLE
21 RATE IS -- THERE MIGHT BE A DIFFERENT SALES TAX RATE IN SAN
22 FRANCISCO, DIFFERENT SALES TAX IN ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA AND
23 DIFFERENT SALES TAX RATE IN SAN MATEO, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE
24 DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES PROVIDING DIFFERENT LEVELS OF
25 SERVICE IN ALL OF OUR DIFFERENT COUNTIES.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR
3 JOSEFOWITZ. YES, WE'RE ASKING THE COMMISSION, YOU KNOW, IN ALL
4 OF THIS POLLING, FOR YOUR SUPPORT TODAY TO POLL THE VARIABLE
5 RATE -- EXCUSE ME -- PULL 1A, HYBRID, AND WE'RE IN
6 CONVERSATIONS WITH SFMTA ABOUT THE VARIABLE RATE AND WE'RE
7 VERY OPEN SHOULD THE COMMISSION APPROVE IT TO INCLUDE IN THAT
8 POLL AS WELL.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO TRY
11 TO CONTINUE WORKING ON THE VARIABLE RATE AND INCLUDE IT IN THE
12 POLLING. I THINK IF -- BECAUSE I THINK THAT COULD PROVIDE THE
13 SORT OF REALLY NEEDED FLEXIBILITY TO ULTIMATELY BE ABLE TO
14 CRAFT SOME TYPE OF CONSENSUS AMONGST THE COUNTIES. BECAUSE,
15 YOU KNOW, NONE OF THE MEASURES FOR INSTANCE, WILL ADDRESS
16 SFMTA'S G SO FOR SAN FRANCISCO IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT AS
17 WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS ALL OF THE TRANSIT -- YOU KNOW, ALL OF
18 OUR FISCAL CLIFFS, THAT WE HAVE THE OPTION OF GOING HIGHER AND
19 BE ABLE TO RAISE MORE MONEY IN SAN FRANCISCO, SO THAT'S THE
20 POTENTIAL THIS WE DON'T HAVE TO RUN TWO MEASURES AT THE SAME
21 TIME AND SIMILARLY MAYBE FOR MY COLLEAGUES IN SAN MATEO IT
22 MIGHT BE EASIER FOR THEM TO THINK ABOUT OPTING IN IF THE TAX
23 RATE IN LOWER IN SAN MATEO. AND, SO, AND OTHER -- YOU KNOW,
24 JUST, SORT OF, GENERALLY, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S INCLUDED IN
25 WHATEVER WE'RE DOING. BUT I THINK THAT IS REALLY, REALLY



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 IMPORTANT TO DO AND RETAIN THAT FLEXIBILITY AND I THINK IT
2 ALSO INVOLVES CONTINUING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DO THAT FROM A
3 LEGAL PERSPECTIVE AND ALL THE OTHER ISSUES. AND I THINK
4 SPEAKING TO LEGISLATORS, THERE WOULD PROBABLY -- YOU KNOW,
5 THERE MIGHT BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO INCLUDE IN THE ENABLING
6 LEGISLATION THE RIGHT TYPE OF PROVISIONS, WHICH WOULD ALLOW US
7 -- WHICH WOULD CREATE EVEN MORE -- WHICH WOULD ENABLE US TO
8 HAVE, SORT OF, WITH EVEN MORE CERTAINTY, THE MULTI-RATE
9 MEASURE. AND, THEN, I THINK THE -- THE -- THE OTHER THING I
10 WANTED TO RAISE IS ABOUT THE HYBRID OPTION. YOU KNOW, YOU
11 MENTIONED THAT YOU WOULD ONLY MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS IF SANTA
12 CLARA WAS EXCITED ABOUT IT. I'M NOT -- I DON'T KNOW IF SANTA
13 CLARA -- [LAUGHTER] I DON'T KNOW EXACTLY WHAT THE TERM YOU
14 USED, ALIX, BUT, I --

15

16 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I DON'T KNOW -- EXCITING --

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN HEARING
19 FROM MY COLLEAGUES FROM SANTA CLARA WHETHER THEY SUPPORT --
20 FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I JUST DON'T SEE THIS EVER PASSING OR
21 EVEN GETTING OUT OF THE LEGISLATURE. I MEAN, IT'S SO COMPLEX
22 AND REQUIRES EVERYBODY TO HAVE SUCH A -- YOU KNOW, TO HAVE SO
23 MUCH FAITH IN OUR INSTITUTIONS SO THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT THIS IS
24 ALL GOING TO PAN OUT THE WAY WE SAID IT IS OVER THE NEXT FEW
25 YEARS WITH MONEY COMING HERE FIRST, HERE SECOND, HERE THIRD,



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 AND OH NOT IF IT HAPPENS THIS WAY NOW. AND I THINK WE ARE -- I
2 THINK WE'RE AT A STAGE WHERE WE HAVE -- HAVING BEEN LED
3 THROUGH A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THIS, WHERE I THINK, FROM
4 MY PERSPECTIVE, WE'RE AT A STAGE WHERE WE WOULD DO OURSELVES A
5 SERVICE TO FOCUS ON THE SIMPLEST OPTIONS WE HAVE BEFORE US,
6 WHICH I THINK HAVE BEEN ALSO THE ONES WHICH HAVE GENERATED THE
7 MOST, SORT OF, MOST -- WHICH HAVE GENERATED THE MOST SUPPORT,
8 BECAUSE IT'S CLEAREST FROM THOSE OPTIONS WHAT EVERYBODY'S
9 GETTING AND WHAT EVERYBODY'S GIVEN. AND WHEN YOU ADD -- I
10 THINK IT'S BEEN -- ADDING THE COMPLEXITY HAS BEEN VERY WELL
11 INTENTIONED BUT I THINK IT'S JUST BEEN DIFFICULT ONCE YOU
12 START DOING -- FOR EVERYTHING TO START GETTING ON BOARD WITH
13 THAT BECAUSE IT MUDDIES THE WATER GIVEN WHAT PEOPLE ARE
14 GETTING. AND AT THE SAME TIME A BIT OF DISTRACTION FOR US WE
15 DON'T HAVE A LOT OF TIME LEFT WE NEED TO START SAYING, OKAY
16 LET'S START COALESCING AROUND SOMETHING THAT WE CAN REALLY
17 DRIVE FORWARD THROUGH THE LEGISLATURE AND THEN ON TO THE
18 BALLOT AND HAVING THIS, SORT OF, I THINK -- THE HYBRID OPTION
19 WHICH WAS WELL INTENTIONED AND I UNDERSTAND WHY IT'S HAPPENED,
20 AND I THINK IT'S GOOD THAT IT'S COME THIS FAR BUT I PERSONALLY
21 DON'T THINK IT MAKES SENSE TO TAKE IT ANY FURTHER AND I THINK
22 WE NEED TO START TRYING TO PICK SOMETHING THAT WE CAN REALLY
23 DRIVE A CONSENSUS AROUND FIGURE OUT WHO IS IN, OUT, AND HOW WE
24 ACTUALLY GET THIS MOVING FORWARD.
25



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, NICK. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
2 VERNACI?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. SO, MY QUESTION IS
5 REGARDING THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. BECAUSE THE ONE MEASURE
6 SAYS JUST COUNTIES, AND THE OTHER MEASURE IS SANTA CLARA
7 AGREES. IN TERMS OF APOLOGY ARE ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES
8 GOING TO BE POLLED WHAT'S THAT STRUCTURE GOING TO LOOK LIKE.

9

10 **REBECCA LONG:** YES SCENARIO 1A WE WOULD POLL IN THE FIVE
11 COUNTIES AND HYBRID POLL IN ALL NINE.

12

13 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WELL, IN TERMS OF
14 COMMENTS, THEN, I FIRST WANT TO THANK THOSE COMMISSIONERS THAT
15 WERE ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE, BECAUSE THIS IS OBVIOUSLY A LOT
16 OF WORK AND THERE WAS A LOT OF DISAGREEMENT, IT SOUNDS LIKE.
17 BECAUSE EVEN UP HERE TODAY, WE'RE HEARING PEOPLE WITH THEIR
18 OWN THOUGHTS AND HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO COME TO AN AGREEMENT.
19 SO, I DO AGREE THAT THE FLEXIBILITY OF THIS POLLING IS JUST SO
20 IMPORTANT. BECAUSE WE HAVE GOT THE ISSUES OF WHAT'S THE
21 APPROPRIATE THERE AMOUNT. WHAT'S THE APPROPRIATE MEASURE
22 LENGTH. WE'RE HEARING SANTA CLARA COUNTY SAYING THEY NEED 30
23 YEARS, BUT AS I THINK ABOUT ALL OF IT AND WHERE THIS ENDS UP
24 GOING TO BE VOTED ON. I THINK COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ JUST
25 SAID IT, WE NEED SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO BE SIMPLE BECAUSE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 BOTTOM LINE IS WE'RE SELF-HELP AND IF WE CAN'T COME UP WITH
2 SOMETHING WE CAN GET AT THIS .2/3 OF THE PEOPLE TO AGREE TO
3 THEN WE'RE RIGHT WHERE WE ARE NOW WHICH IS NOWHERE FOR
4 ADDITIONAL DOLLARS FOR TRANSPORTATION. SO, I THANK ALL OF THIS
5 HARD WORK THAT'S HAPPENING, AND LOOK FORWARD TO SEE WHAT THE
6 FINAL PRODUCT ENDS UP BEING. BUT, CERTAINLY, WHATEVER ENDS UP
7 HAPPENING, I'LL BE SUPPORTIVE. BECAUSE I KNOW WE NEED IT.
8 THANK YOU, CHAIR.

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. FIRST LET ME SAY I'M IN
11 FAVOR OF THE MEASURE BEFORE US TODAY. I DO HAVE SOME
12 QUESTIONS, IN PARTICULAR. ONE, YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT
13 THOSE COUNTIES THAT HAVE EXPRESSED THAT THEY'RE INTERESTED IN
14 OPTING IN? AND WHAT THOSE CONVERSATIONS LOOK LIKE? THE
15 MEASURE, AS IT SITS RIGHT NOW, YOU'RE LOOKING AT POTENTIALLY,
16 WHAT? IT'S A FOUR COUNTY MEASURE WITH THE EXCEPTION OF SANTA
17 CLARA COUNTY, BUT YOU HAVE, AMONGST THE OTHER COUNTIES, HAVE
18 YOU, SORT OF, GAUGED OR GOT A TEMPERATURE OF THOSE WHO WANT TO
19 OPT IN?

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA, NOT DIRECTLY. ALTHOUGH I
22 WILL SAY THAT IN THE NORTH BAY, SONOMA-MARIN, YOU KNOW, SEE
23 WHERE A HALF CENT SALES TAX IS SIMILAR TO WHAT THEY TALKED
24 ABOUT, WITH SMART, BUT SMART'S IMPORTANT THEY'RE STILL
25 INTRIGUED BUT HAVE NOT COMMITTED. NAPA HAS SHOWN INTEREST IN



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS SOLANO HAS SHOWN INTEREST IN HIGHWAY
2 ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS POTHOLES AND THINGS LIKE THAT AND SAFETY
3 IMPROVEMENTS. I THINK THERE IS STILL AN INTEREST IN LEARNING
4 HOW NEXT STEPS PROGRESS BUT NOBODY HAS COMMITTED TO ANYTHING.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** THE REASON I MENTION THAT IS WE HAVE TALKED
7 ABOUT REGIONALISM TODAY AND HOW REGIONALISM IS IMPORTANT. I
8 THINK THAT MANTRA, I KNOW WHEN I HAVE BEEN ON THE BOARD HAS
9 REALLY BEEN, SORT OF, EXPRESSED UPON US. I THINK AS WE MOVE
10 FORWARD, THAT REALLY NEEDS TO, SORT OF, RESONATE. THERE REALLY
11 NEEDS TO BE COUNTIES OUTSIDE OF THE FOUR COUNTIES THAT STEP UP
12 AND STEP IN. AND THAT'S CLEARLY, IF WE'RE LOOKING AT A TRULY
13 REGIONAL MEASURE, THAT'S IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE
14 THINGS THAT I'M CURIOUS TO -- AND MAYBE YOU COULD TALK ABOUT
15 IT. FIRST OF ALL, LET ME THANK YOU AND YOUR STAFF FOR REALLY,
16 SORT OF, DIGGING IN AND TALKING ABOUT LOOKING AT FINANCIAL,
17 SORT OF, FINANCIAL INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT, YOU CAN SPEAK TO
18 THAT A LITTLE AMONGST THE AGENCIES AND WHAT THAT -- WHAT THAT
19 LOOKS LIKE -- WHAT WOULD THAT LOOKS LIKE TO YOU IN TERMS OF
20 THE FINANCIAL CONSULTANT, INDEPENDENT THIRD PARTY REVIEW? CAN
21 YOU JUST -- WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE TO YOU? RELATIVE TO
22 CALTRAIN, RELATIVE TO BART?

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** OKAY. I THINK I'LL DEFER THAT A BIT TO ALIX
25 WHO HAS BEEN DOING THE DIGGING. THE POINT IS WHAT WE WANT TO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 GET A HANDLE ON IS, SORT OF, THE NUANCES OF ALL THE DIFFERENT
2 FINANCIAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO A COMPLEX SYSTEM OF HOW TRANSIT IS
3 SUPPORTING THE REGION BECAUSE WE KNOW IT'S DIFFERENT IN EACH
4 COUNTY AND TRYING TO GET SOME INDEPENDENCE INTO THAT LOOK SO
5 WE HAVE VALIDITY TO THE NUMBERS THAT ARE SHOWING BECAUSE
6 THERE'S CONCERN THAT PEOPLE HAVE CREATED THEIR NUMBERS IN
7 DIFFERENT WAYS SO WE'RE HOPING THIS WILL SHED SOME LIGHT INTO
8 THAT FROM A VERY INDEPENDENT SOURCE. MAYBE YOU CAN ADD ON TO
9 THAT ALIX?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK YOU SAID MOST OF IT. I MEAN ONE
12 COMPONENT IS MAKING SURE EVERYONE REALLY AGREES WITH WHAT
13 WE'RE SOLVING FOR OBVIOUSLY THESE OPTIONS SOLVE TWO DIFFERENT
14 THINGS WITH FARE LOSS WE CAN AT LEAST MAKE SURE WE VAL TATE
15 THOSE NUMBERS LOOK AT OPERATOR REPORTED LOSSES SOMETHING WE
16 CAN MAKE SURE PEOPLE UNDERSTAND WITH MORE CERTAINTY WHAT'S THE
17 DIFFERENCE AND SIMILAR ABOUT ASSUMPTIONS THAT OPERATORS ARE
18 MAKING AND THEIR RESERVES AND ALL SORTS OF THINGS
19 CONTRIBUTIONS, LOCAL CONTRIBUTIONS BY THE COUNTIES, MAKING
20 SURE EVERYONE UNDERSTANDS WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE AMONG THE
21 COUNTIES THAT ARE CONTRIBUTING TO BART AND CALTRAIN AND TO
22 HAVE ASSESSMENT OF WHAT'S MOST EQUITABLE OR CAN BE AGREED UPON
23 IN AT LEAST SHORT-TERM TO ADDRESS THE EMERGENCY SITUATION WE
24 HAVE. THAT'S WHAT WE WOULD BE LOOKING FOR. AND THE OTHER THING
25 WE HAVE THOUGHT ABOUT IN BRINGING ON AN INDEPENDENT THIRD



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PARTY WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THE COUNTIES LOOK AT THE SCOPE AND
2 THEY AGREE THIS IS A GOOD SCOPE SO WE WANT TO START WITH
3 SOMETHING THAT EVERYONE AGREES THIS IS WHAT WE SHOULD BE
4 LOOKING AT AND THERE IS INDEPENDENCE IN WHATEVER CONSULTANT WE
5 BRING ON BOARD.

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. FINALLY, YOU CAN TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT
8 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION WORK, WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE, AND
9 WHAT EACH COUNTY IS SPECIALLY RESPONSIBLE FOR? IN TERMS OF
10 FUNDING?

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SO, RIGHT NOW ON -- YOU KNOW, IN -- BOTH
13 VERSIONS, I THINK IT'S A 10% CONTRIBUTION BY THE COUNTIES
14 BASED ON THEIR SALES TAX OF WHAT WILL BE THE EQUIVALENT OF
15 THEIR SALES TAX GENERATIONS. SO, FOR THE -- FOR THE SCENARIO
16 1A -- I'M DOING THIS FROM MEMORY HERE, WHICH IS DANGEROUS --
17 IT'S ABOUT 56 MILLION A YEAR, 10%, AND THEN HYBRID IT'S MORE
18 LIKE 100 MILLION AND IT WOULD BASICALLY BE A CONTRIBUTION THAT
19 WOULD BE EQUIVALENT TO THE 10% GENERATIONS IN THE COUNTY. AND
20 YOU KNOW, I THINK FOR THOSE COUNTIES THAT DON'T OPT IN, I
21 THINK THE IDEA IS THAT THERE WOULD BE SOME OTHER WAY FOR THEM
22 TO CONTRIBUTE SO THAT EVERYONE IS REALLY MAKING SURE THAT
23 THEY'RE CONTRIBUTING TO THIS ENHANCEMENT TO RIDER EXPERIENCE.
24 AND I THINK TO DATE WE HAVE REALLY FOCUSED ON, YOU KNOW,
25 MAKING SURE THAT FARE INTEGRATION, I THINK COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 USED TO CALL IT, SORT OF, ONE TICKET. YOU KNOW, SO SOMEONE CAN
2 JUST BUY A TICKET AND MOVE THROUGHOUT THE SYSTEM. AND YOU
3 KNOW, LOOKING AT TRANSIT PRIORITY REALLY SPEEDING YOU KNOW THE
4 EXPERIENCE, MAKING SURE IT'S MORE COMPETITIVE DRIVING, MAYBE
5 AND WAYFINDING, ACCESSIBILITY. I THINK ONE OF THE COMPONENTS
6 BEFORE YOU IS REALLY THAT 50% OF THAT -- 10% -- SO HALF OF IT,
7 5%, WOULD BE FOR LOCAL PRIORITIES IN THE COUNTY. AND IF YOU
8 THINK ABOUT TRANSIT PRIORITY, IN PARTICULAR, I THINK THAT'S
9 ONE THAT EACH COUNTY REALLY KNOWS KIND OF WHAT THEY NEED TO DO
10 TO, SORT OF, SPEED UP THEIR, AND IMPROVE THE SYSTEM, OF THE
11 BUS SYSTEMS, OFTEN, FOR THIS RIDERS. HOPEFUL THEY ANSWERS YOUR
12 QUESTION.

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** AND SO, FINAL QUESTION TO ADD TO THAT, SO YOU'RE
15 BASICALLY SAYING THAT EACH COUNTY IS RESPONSIBLE FOR THIS --
16 FOR FUNDING THE TRANSIT WORK, CORRECT?

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YES THAT'S CORRECT. ALL NINE COUNTIES
19 REGARDLESS OF THE MEASURE.

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER AHN, THEN BACK TO
24 COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **EDDIE AHN:** ARE? 1A IN MY MIND IS MAKE THE BEST OF WHAT'S NOT A
2 GREAT SITUATION. SFMTA ALONE THEIR PROJECTED ANNUAL DEFICIT IS
3 THREE MONDAY MILLION A YEAR OPTIMISTICALLY RAISES 88 MILLION
4 SO IT'S A THIRD OF ESSENTIALLY THE ANNUAL DEFICIT SO BUILDING
5 ON COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS ONE THING I WOULD SAY TO
6 CONSIDER MAY BE BALANCING ESSENTIALLY MULTIPLE MEASURES IN
7 2026 THERE IS GO BOND SFMTA IS CONSIDERING FOR CAPITAL NEEDS
8 AND IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL AS AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND, WE HAVE
9 WONDERED ABOUT THE QUESTION THIS IS STAFF -- WE DIDN'T GET
10 WHAT WE WANTED IN THE LEGISLATIVE SESSION PART OF THE
11 CHALLENGE WAS MAYBE WE HAVE ANOTHER YEAR TO FIGURE THIS OUT,
12 WHAT ARE WE COMMUNICATING TO THE PUBLIC ABOUT TIMELINE RIGHT
13 NOW.

14

15 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THIS IS AN URGENT AND A REAL PROBLEM AND IT'S
16 COMING TO US SOON SO I'LL LET REBECCA ANSWER MORE DIRECTLY.

17

18 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER AHN. I THINK WE WILL TEST
19 SOME OF THE DIFFERENT ARGUMENTS TO SEE HOW THEY RESONATE AND
20 IT WILL BE INTERESTING TO FIND OUT WHAT DO VOTERS KNOW ABOUT
21 THIS ALREADY HOW MUCH THEY HAVE HEARD ABOUT IT. HOW CONCERNED
22 THEY ARE. WE'LL INCLUDE QUESTIONS OF THAT NATURE.

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** JUST FRAMING AROUND URGENCY TIMELINE IS KEY AT THIS
25 POINT TO FORCE GOOD POLICY DECISION.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK THANK YOU FOR THE
5 LEADERSHIP TRYING TO FIGURE ALL THIS OUT ALWAYS GO BACK TO THE
6 BIGGER PICTURE THERE IS A LOT OF HISTORY REGARDING WHO FUNDED
7 TRANSIT LOCAL TRANSIT BAY AREA AND WHO DIDN'T THE TRUTH OF THE
8 MATTER IS THE STATE DIDN'T AND WE ALL DECIDED TO TAKE IT UPON
9 OURSELVES DO IT AND IT COMPLICATES MATTERS NOW THAT WE'RE
10 TRYING TO AND I KNOW WE COMMITTED TO WHATEVER THAT NUMBER WAS
11 TO FUND LOCALLY GOING FORWARD IT SEEMS TO ME MAYBE A LITTLE
12 OUT THERE BUT HISTORICALLY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE KIND OF LIKE
13 TAX RETAILERS WHERE THE STATE IS TAX WHOLESALER, CERTAINLY
14 PASSED TAXES FOR THINGS THAT AREN'T NECESSARILY DON'T GO
15 THROUGH THESE PROCESSES OF HAVING TO GO THROUGH REALLY FINE
16 TUNE WHETHER IT'S SOMEONE WILL ACCEPT TEN VERSUS 30 OR 25 OR
17 WHETHER THERE'S SOMETHING FOR ROADS IT'S ALL PUBLIC TRANSIT,
18 TODAY POLLING DICTATES EVERYTHING. I TRUST OUR POLLSTER, AND
19 STAFF, BUT WE HAVE A LOT QUESTIONS WE KNOW SOME OF THE
20 ANSWERS, HISTORICALLY WHAT THEY HAVE BEEN I WONDER TOO SHIFT
21 TOWARDS ASKING WHAT WE KNOW WHERE SUPPORT ALREADY LIES. I KNOW
22 IN MY COUNTY THERE ARE CERTAIN THINGS PEOPLE WILL BE LOOKING
23 FOR CAPITAL PROJECTS, FOR INSTANCE, LOOKING FOR SALES TAX OVER
24 THE OTHER TWO. THE QUICKER WE COULD DISMISS AND GET TO THOSE
25 THINGS THE PEOPLE CAN SUPPORT THE BETTER WE CAN PUT EVERYTHING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TOGETHER. I KNOW YOU KNOW THAT. I'M LISTENING TO THESE TWO
2 SCENARIOS WITH ALL THESE DIFFERENT CRITERIA, MAN, I DON'T KNOW
3 HOW YOU PULL THAT AND KEEP SOMEONE'S ATTENTION AND GET THE
4 ACCURACY GOING FORWARD. I THINK WE NEED TO HONE IN ON REALLY
5 KNOW FROM THE POLLING WE HAVE DONE WHICH FROM WHAT I HAVE SEEN
6 WON'T NECESSARILY CHANGE TOO MUCH, IN FACT IT MAY ONLY GO IN A
7 DIFFERENT DIRECTION, THAT WE CAN REALLY HONE IN ON THOSE KIND
8 OF CRITERIA AND REALLY GO AFTER WHAT PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO
9 SUPPORT AND THEN GO BACK TO OUR PARTNERS AT THE STATE AND ASK
10 THEM TO PICK UP THE THINGS THAT PEOPLE WON'T PAY FOR. I WAS
11 INVOLVED WITH A MEASURE LIKE THAT, A SCHOOL BOND MEASURE AND
12 THERE WERE THINGS THAT PEOPLE WOULDN'T -- POLLING WASN'T HIGH
13 ENOUGH FOR THE SCHOOL GARDEN AND OTHERS THINGS WE HAD TO FUND
14 THAT THROUGH ANOTHER MECHANISM AND I THINK WE'RE IN THAT SAME
15 KIND OF BOAT TODAY.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RABBITT.
18 COMMISSIONER NOACK?

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR ALL HIS HARD
21 WORK ON THIS. I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY MILES HE RACKED UP ON
22 TRANSIT DOING THIS, I KNOW IT'S CONSIDERABLE, FREQUENT FLYER
23 MILES SHOULD BE AWARDED. A COUPLE ITEMS I WANT TO TALK ABOUT,
24 OPT IN OPT OUT THING, I APPRECIATE SANTA CLARA BEING FORTH
25 RIGHT ABOUT OPTING IN AND PUTTING THIS FAIR SHARE IN. AND AS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MAYOR MAHAN SAID, THEY HAVE GOT FOUR MEASURES TO GET PASSED.
2 WHAT HAPPENS IN THOSE OPT IN SCENARIOS IF THEY DON'T PASS, HOW
3 DOES THAT OBLIGATION GET MET IN WHAT THEIR OBLIGATION IS TO,
4 YOU KNOW, THE CONTRIBUTION TO CALTRAIN AND SO ON AND SO FORTH?
5 THAT WOULD BE MY 50 QUESTION. THEN IT GOES TO THE BROADER
6 QUESTION FOR ANY COUNTY THAT IS NOT OPTING IN BUT NEEDS TO
7 PRODUCE 10% OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. HOW DO WE, SORT OF,
8 MAKE SURE THAT THAT ACTUALLY HAPPENS? AND, SO, THOSE COUNTIES
9 THAT ARE IN THE MEASURE, AND HAVE NO CHOICE ABOUT CONTRIBUTING
10 THEIR 10%, ARE NOT FUNDING -- ARE NOT THE ONLY ONES FUNDING
11 IT.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I WANT TO GIVE FOLKS FROM SANTA CLARA
14 COUNTY OPPORTUNITY TO OPINE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. I'LL SAY A WORD ON IT THEN COMMISSIONER ABE-
17 KOGA MAY HAVE MORE TO ADD. I WOULD JUST SAY THAT OUR VIEW IS
18 THAT OUR BEST CHANCE OF HAVING THE RESOURCES WE NEED TO DO OUR
19 FAIR SHARE IS TO RENEW EXISTING MEASURES THAT VOTERS ARE
20 FAMILIAR WITH PREVIOUSLY SUPPORTED UNDERSTAND THE VALUE AND WE
21 CAN GO BACK TO FRAME IT AS RENEWAL OF COMMITMENT THAT OUR
22 COMMUNITY'S ALREADY MADE AND THOSE ARE SUBSTANTIAL IF WE HAVE
23 FLEXIBILITY TO FOCUS ON GETTING THAT DONE HAVE POTENTIALLY IF
24 NECESSARY A COUPLE OF BYTES AT THE APPLE AND CERTAINLY HOPE
25 THAT'S NOT THE CASE WE'LL DO EVERYTHING WE CAN TO AND THIS IS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PART OF WHY WE WANT THIS FLEXIBILITY TO PICK THE RIGHT
2 TRIALING AND BE DATA DRIVEN BASED ON WHEN WE'RE HEARING FROM
3 VOTERS IN THE MEANTIME CONTINUE TO MEET OUR CONTRACTUAL
4 OBLIGATIONS TO BART CALTRAIN THE BEST OF THE REGION LOOKS AT
5 REVISITING REUPPING THOSE WILL BE A SEAT AT THE TABLE AND
6 READY TO DO OUR PART. WE FEEL RENEWAL IS OUR BEST PATH.
7 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? I DON'T KNOW IF I MISSED ANYTHING?

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I SEE NODDING HEADS FROM SANTA CLARA.
10 IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS CONSENSUSES. COMMISSIONER, DO YOU WANT
11 TO ADD ANYTHING?

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WAS HOPING TO RESPOND TO THE VICE CHAIR.
14 OH WE'LL COME BACK. OKAY.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FINISH WITH YOU, SCHAFF, MOULTON-
17 PETERS.

18

19 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO COMMENT I THINK A TEN-YEAR
20 MEASURE IS MORE LIKELY TO BE SUCCESSFUL. AS A LOT OF PEOPLE
21 HAVE POINTED OUT NEEDING TO GO TO THE STATE ON SOME THINGS IS
22 GOING TO BE IMPORTANT AND I DON'T THINK A LOT OF PEOPLE WILL
23 SUPPORT A 30 YEAR MEASURE THAT THEY'RE THINKING THAT LIKELY IT
24 WILL BE A SUPPORT THE ENTIRE TIME FOR TRANSIT NOT JUST THE
25 FIRST 15 YEARS. SO, THAT'S JUST, YOU KNOW, MY OPINION ON THAT.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 I AGREE A VARIABLE RATE SHOULD BE LOOKED AT, CONSIDERED. SOME
2 COUNTIES HAVE MEASURES GOING IN THAT THEY COULD CONTRIBUTE
3 PART, ADDITION TO THE TRANSFORMATION, SO I'M NOT -- CERTAINLY
4 SFMTA IS AN ISSUE I THINK THE VARIABLE RATE PIECE IS AN
5 IMPORTANT PIECE. THIRD PARTY AUDIT, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S
6 GOING TO BE IMPORTANT TO GET VOTERS BEHIND THIS MEASURE IS
7 BELIEVING THAT THE LOSSES TRULY EXIST, AND FROM SOLELY FARE
8 LOSSES FROM THE PANDEMIC AND NOT FROM STRUCTURAL FINANCIAL
9 ISSUES THAT MAY BE CAUSING. AS WE ALL KNOW WE SEE PLENTY OF
10 ARTICLES IN THE PAPER ON THAT. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE SPEND
11 SOME TIME OVER THE NEXT YEAR LOOK AT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES WHAT
12 THEY'RE DOING THEMSELVES TO ADDRESS THIS SITUATION AND NOT
13 JUST US BAILING THEM OUT, WHAT THEY SAY THEIR LOSS IS LOOKING
14 AT HOW THEY'RE SPENDING MONEY IN THE FUTURE AND KNOWING WHAT
15 SITUATION IS CURRENTLY IN ORDER TO DO THAT SO I THINK THAT'S
16 SUPER IMPORTANT. YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT FOR
17 THE CORE COUNTIES TO BE INVOLVED, CONTRA COSTA, AS WELL, HAS
18 TWO SALES TAX MEASURES, TWO PARCEL TAX MEASURES, AND A
19 SURCHARGE THAT GO TOWARD BART. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, I DON'T KNOW
20 WHY ANY CAN'T THAT'S NOT A CORE BART COUNTY SHOULD BE ABLE TO
21 OPT OUT. CONTRA COSTA IS NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO OPT OUT, BART
22 WOULDN'T EXIST IF CONTRA COSTA OR ALAMEDA OPTED OUT. I DON'T
23 THINK THAT MAKES SENSE FROM A BART PERSPECTIVE. AND IT'S SUPER
24 IMPORTANT FOR THIS MAJOR REGIONAL SYSTEM TO FUNCTION. THAT'S
25 ALSO VERY IMPORTANT TO ME.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR
5 YOUR LEADERSHIP AND HARD WORK AND REALLY GOING AND LISTENING
6 TO ALL OF US AND UNDERSTANDING OUR NEEDS THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
7 I WANT TO GO BACK TO THE VICE CHAIR'S QUESTION ABOUT THE
8 HYBRID OPTION AND WHAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY THINKS -- [LAUGHTER]
9 AND ACTUALLY WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THAT EITHER AS THE
10 MAYOR STATED OUR POSITION IS TO OPT IN BUT THROUGH OUR OWN
11 PARALLEL MEASURE AND THE HYBRID WOULD NOT DO THAT AND
12 PERSONALLY I HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT THIS AND ALSO IN
13 CONJUNCTION WITH THE HOUSING MEASURE AND BAHFA DIDN'T GO
14 FORWARD AND I BELIEVE WE NEED TO BE THINKING WHAT'S NEXT FOR
15 HOUSING, AND I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE THAT OPTION AND FLEXIBILITY
16 IN OUR COUNTY TO POTENTIALLY PURSUE SOMETHING LIKE HOUSING
17 BOND MEASURE ON OUR OWN IF WE NEED TO AND MY CONCERN WITH THE
18 PARCEL TAXES COULD CONFLICT WITH THAT I GUESS I'M TRYING TO
19 LOOK AT BOTH HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION AT THE SAME TIME AND
20 HAVING AS MUCH FLEXIBILITY TO ME IN THAT REGARD WOULD JUST
21 QUESTION IN TERMS OF MOVING FORWARD WITH POLLING. I KNOW THAT
22 I SEE THE OTHER AGENCIES ARE PLANNING TO POLL OR HAVE BEEN --
23 HOW ARE WE -- ARE WE PLANNING TO COORDINATE OR GOING TO BE
24 LOOKING AT ASKING DIFFERENT QUESTIONS HOW DOES THAT
25 INFORMATION INFORM OUR NEXT STEPS?



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA YES WE'RE COORDINATING
3 WITH THEM CLOSELY I'M WORKING WITH THE LEGISLATIVE STAFF FROM
4 THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES BART'S ALREADY DONE A RECENT POLL BUT
5 YES WE'RE IN CLOSE COORDINATION AND WANT TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF
6 THE MAXIMUM INFORMATION WE CAN LEARN WITH THE PUBLIC RESOURCES
7 AVAILABLE SO WE'RE NOT DUPLICATING.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** CALTRAIN WITH ELECTRIFICATION IS PRETTY
10 POPULAR RIGHT NOW IF THOSE NUMBERS WERE MORE FAVORABLE THEN
11 PERHAPS THE REGIONAL MEASURE WOULD CONSIDER LOOKING AT THAT
12 AND GOING DOING MORE INDIVIDUALIZED MEASURES TO SUPPORT
13 CERTAIN SYSTEMS.

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** MY UNDERSTANDING OBVIOUSLY IS WHAT'S ON THE
16 TABLE FOR SCENARIO 1A DOES FUND CALTRAIN SO WE WOULD WANT TO
17 BE INCLUDING SAN MATEO COUNTY AND CALTRAIN RELATED QUESTIONS
18 IN THE MEASURE TO UNDERSTAND HOW THAT AFFECTS THE MEASURE.
19 CALTRAIN HAS STATED THEIR LEADERSHIP HAS STATED THAT THEY
20 PREFER BEING PART OF THE REGIONAL MEASURE BUT THEY'RE ALSO
21 WANTING AS A BACKUP PLAN TO TEST GO IT ALONE MEASURE.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** MAY I ADDRESS --



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GO AHEAD.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** SAN MATEO COUNTY IS COMMITTED TO THE EXISTING
5 AGREEMENT WITH CALTRAIN AND OUR FAIR SHARE WHAT HAPPENS AS
6 PART OF SAN MATEO COUNTY KEEP IN MIND WHAT'S BEEN HAPPENING WE
7 HAVE BEEN PAYING INTO THE SYSTEM WE HAVE THE SURCHARGE IN
8 ADDITION TO THAT WE HAVE BEEN HANDED A BILL FOR \$10 MILLION
9 FOR THE FARE GATES SO AGAIN WE'RE WILLING TO DO OUR FAIR SHARE
10 WE DO BELIEVE IN THE SYSTEM WIDE THING OR ASPECTS OF THIS BUT
11 TO PRESENT TO OUR LEGISLATORS OR OUR COUNTY SOMETHING THAT SAN
12 MATEO COUNTY HAS NO CONTROL OVER OR HOW THE INVESTMENTS ARE
13 MADE AND THE RETURN TO SOURCE, IT'S DOOMED AT THIS POINT. AND
14 I DON'T WANT IT TO BE DOOMED. I REALLY WANT SUCCESS HERE, BUT
15 TO NON-OFFER SAN MATEO COUNTY THE OPT OUT SO THAT WE CAN
16 PARTICIPATE IN THE TRANSFORMATION, AND ALL THOSE DIFFERENT
17 ASPECTS IN SUCH A WAY THAT OUR RESIDENTS FEEL THEY ARE MAKING
18 A DIFFERENT IN GETTING A RETURN TO SOURCE, THAT'S JUST NOT
19 GOING TO MAKE IT LEGISLATIVELY OR WITHIN OUR REGION. AND WE --
20 I'M LOOKING FOR SUCCESS HERE.

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** BUT WHY WOULDN'T THAT NOT BE THE CASE FOR EVERY
23 COUNTY THEN WHY WOULD THAN DIFFERENT FROM CONTRA COSTA ALAMEDA
24 WE HAVE A SALES TAX PARCEL TAX SURCHARGE WHY WOULD YOU GUYS
25 HAVE OPT IN AND NOT US?



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL FOR ONE REASON WE DON'T HAVE A SAY ON WHAT
3 HAPPENS AT BART AND AGAIN ARE YOU GETTING EXTRA \$10 MILLION
4 PRICE TAG FOR FARE GATES?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** TWO SALES TAX TWO PERSON SURCHARGE.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION THERE IS
9 GOING TO BE PLENTY OF TIME I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION THAT'S
10 WHAT IT'S ABOUT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, MOULTON PETERS AND
11 FLEMING.

12

13 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** I WANT TO PUT A RED FLAG IN YOU DON'T
14 NECESSARILY HAVE TO RESPOND TO ME NOW BUT WANT TO BE MINDFUL
15 OF TIME, WANT TO PUT A FLAG SINCE OAKLAND ISN'T HERE TODAY,
16 THE CITY OF OAKLAND IS SERIOUSLY CONSIDERING PUTTING A \$0.50
17 SALES TAX ON THE SPECIAL ELECTION IN APRIL AND I KNOW THERE
18 ARE STATE RULES THAT CAP SALES TAX RATES AND I THINK OAKLAND
19 IS ALREADY UP JUST \$0.50 SHYING OF WHAT THE LEGAL CAP IS. SO,
20 I WANTED TO JUST MAKE YOU AWARE OF THAT IF YOU HAVEN'T READ
21 ABOUT THAT IN THE NEWS. SO, THAT IS -- THAT IS A VERY ACTIVE
22 DISCUSSION. AND SO TO THE EXTENT THAT THAT MIGHT IMPACT, THIS
23 I WANTED TO BRING IT TO YOUR ATTENTION. THE -- I SOMETIMES
24 WORRY THAT THIS BODY IS LOSING ITS REGIONAL SPIRIT. I DO WANT
25 TO SAY, TO THE EXTENT THAT SOME PEOPLE GO IT ALONE, WE STILL



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 CAN COORDINATE CAMPAIGNS. WE STILL CAN SHOW A UNIFIED
2 STRATEGIC FRONT. SO, I JUST WANT TO HOPE THAT TO THE EXTENT
3 THAT IT MAKES SENSE TO GO IT ALONE, THAT WE DO PRESENT IT AS A
4 UNIFIED CAMPAIGN. AND THAT, I APPRECIATE THAT THAT CAN LOOK
5 THAT WAY. I ALSO WANT TO JUST KEEP MY APPRECIATION ON JIM
6 SPERING. WE CAN NEVER LOVE JIM SPERING ENOUGH. BUT I WAS A
7 LITTLE SURPRISED TO SEE THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT WERE NOT AS
8 AGREEABLE AS SOME OF OUR PAST ATTEMPTS HAVE BEEN. SO, I JUST
9 WANT TO APPRECIATE, THIS LOOKS LIKE A VERY HARD PROCESS. AND I
10 JUST REALLY WANT TO APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S WORK AND GETTING TO
11 WHERE WE ARE TODAY. AND THEN THE LAST, JUST KIND OF BUILDING
12 ON WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA JUST SAID ABOUT, YOU KNOW, IT'S
13 MY JOB TO TALK ABOUT HOUSING, I HAVE BEEN DOING THAT SINCE
14 2015, I'M NOT GOING TO STOP NOW. IT SOUNDS LIKE THE IDEA OF
15 RAISING FUNDS FOR TO CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS SEEMS TO NOT HAVE
16 MADE IT ON TO THE RECOMMENDED PATH. I DON'T THINK WE DID THIS
17 WHEN WE WERE POLLING THE BAHFA MEASURE BEFORE. BUT I HOPE AS
18 WE GO FORWARD, CERTAINLY IN OAKLAND, WE ACTUALLY SAW HIGHER
19 VOTER APPROVAL RATINGS FOR A COMBINED AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND
20 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE MEASURE THAT WAS MEASURE KK. AND
21 THEN WE RENEWED IT WITH VERY, VERY HIGH RATES OF APPROVAL AT
22 THE POLLS. AND, SO, I HOPE AS WE DON'T LOSE OUR COMMITMENTS TO
23 GO BACK AND TRY AND CONTINUE TO SOLVE OUR HOUSING CRISIS, THAT
24 WE LOOK MAYBE THERE AT THE OPPORTUNITY TO INCLUDE THE CAPITAL
25 FOR TRANSPORTATION, AS WELL. SO, THANK YOU. NO NEED TO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 RESPOND. OR YOU CAN RESPOND TO ME OFFLINE. BUT JUST WANTED TO
2 FLAG THOSE THINGS. AND, OF COURSE, GIVE APPRECIATION TO
3 EVERYONE WHO WAS ON THE FLOOD COMMITTEE.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.
6 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS THEN COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CHIME IN FOR
9 SMALL MARIN COUNTY. BUT I'M GOING TO SAY THIS YEAR WE
10 CELEBRATE 60 YEARS OF MARIN TRANSIT, MARIN COUNTY THAT'S
11 SINGLE LOCAL PROVIDER WE FUND 50% OF THEIR OPERATION WITH OUR
12 LOCAL HALF CENT SALES TAX IN MARIN COUNTY. WE ARE SUPPORTIVE
13 OF A MEASURE TO GO FORWARD. I HAVE ALWAYS SUPPORTED A 10-YEAR
14 MEASURE JUST TRYING TO GET CLOSER TO THE PROBLEM AT HAND BUT
15 I'M SYMPATHETIC TO OTHER ORGANIZATIONS THAT MAY NEED CAPITAL
16 PROJECTS TO GET THE VOTES THAT THEY NEED TO PASS IT. I WANT TO
17 JUST SAY THAT MARIN WOULD BENEFIT. SMART IS IN THE PRIMARY
18 POSITION TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT -- HOW TO RENEW THEIR SALES
19 TAX WHICH IS CRUCIAL TO THEIR OPERATION AND THEY HAVE BECOME
20 THE LARGEST CARRIER, IF I'M NOT WRONG, DAVID, IN SONOMA COUNTY
21 FOR LOCAL TRANSIT. THEIR SUCCESS IS IMPORTANT. THEY MAY HAVE
22 ORGANIZED OPPOSITION TO A SINGLE CAMPAIGN AND THEY WOULD RUN
23 AND THERE MAY BE BENEFIT TO BEING PART OF A LARGER MEASURE SO
24 THESE ARE ALL ITEMS THAT ARE UNDER DISCUSSION AND I WANT TO
25 PUT THEM ON THE TABLE BECAUSE I APPRECIATE THE MAYOR AND



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 COMMISSIONER BEING CLEAR WHAT THE DISCUSSIONS HAVE BEEN IN
2 SANTA CHAIR CAN'T AND TO COMMISSIONER NOACK I WOULD LOVE TO
3 UNDERSTAND MORE WHAT THE CHALLENGES ARE IN SAN MATEO COUNTIES
4 SPECIFICALLY BECAUSE WE ALL HAVE CHALLENGES TRYING TO WORK
5 WITH EXISTING FUNDING MECHANISMS WE HAVE WHILE WE'RE
6 COORDINATE TOGETHER AND I THINK THERE'S VALUE WORKING TOGETHER
7 ON TRANSIT THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA SO I ENCOURAGE US TO KEEP
8 TALKING ABOUT ALL OF THIS. I WOULD SUPPORT THE VARIABLE RATE
9 ON BEHALF OF SAN FRANCISCO, MTA, THIRD PARTY AUDIT, IT'S FINE
10 WITH ME. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE
11 POLLING AND THAT WE NEED TO GIVE EACH COUNTY AN OPPORTUNITY,
12 AS, JIM, YOU HAVE OFFERED TO WEIGH IN ON THE POLLING. BUT I
13 THINK WE REALLY NEED TO FIND A WAY TO LINK ARMS AND TO DO THIS
14 TOGETHER. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S HOW WE'RE GOING TO BE
15 SUCCESSFUL AND I'M NOT SURE HOW SUCCESSFUL WE'RE ALL GOING TO
16 BE IF WE EACH GO IT ALONE. SO, TWO CENTS FROM A SMALL COUNTY.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER FLEMING AND
19 KAPLAN.

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS MORE OR LESS
22 SUMMED UP WHAT I WANTED TO SAY THERE IS ONE THING THAT SONOMA
23 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION THAT OUR DIRECTOR THERE HAS FLAGGED FOR
24 US THAT YOU DON'T NEED TO RESPOND TO NOW I THINK AUTO REALLY
25 IMPORTANT FOR MANY OF US WHO MAY NOT BE PARTICIPATING IN THE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MEASURE THAT'S HOW IT COMES DOWN WHICH IS TO UNDERSTAND HOW
2 OBAG REALLY DISTRACTING -- BUT ANYWAY HOW OBAG IS GOING TO BE
3 ALLOCATED NOT KICKING THE CAN TOO FAR DOWN THE ROAD ON THAT
4 COUNT SO IF THAT'S SOMETHING THAT YOU CAN COME BACK TO US WHEN
5 WE GET MORE INFORMATION TO PUT THIS ON THE BALLOT THAT WOULD
6 BE APPRECIATED ALSO WHAT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF SAID ABOUT NOT
7 LOSING HOUSING IN THE CONVERSATION.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER KAPLAN.

10

11 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. IT'S BEEN GREAT HEARING
12 EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS SO FAR I THINK THIS IS INCREDIBLY
13 IMPORTANT WE HAVE ONE COMMUTE SHED THAT IMPACTS ONE ANOTHER
14 AND OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEMS REALLY ARE THE CIRCULATORY
15 SYSTEM OF THE WHOLE REGIONAL ADVISORY WORKING GROUP CAN'T BE
16 DECIDED UP IN THIS PIECE 2% BELONGS TO MARIN 10% TO ALAMEDA OR
17 THINGS LIKE THAT THEY REALLY ARE ESSENTIAL FOR THE FUNCTIONING
18 OF OUR REGION AS A WHOLE I HOPE WE WORK TOWARDS REGIONAL UNITY
19 TO GET THIS DONE IN AN EFFECTIVE WAY. I'M ALSO ON THE BOARD OF
20 THE ALAMEDA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WHICH DID SEND SOME
21 RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDING RECOMMENDING TEN YEARS. WE FELT THAT
22 WOULD BE EASIER LIFT IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO INTERVENE IN
23 THIS PARTICULAR MOMENT ALSO WANT TO SUPPORT SIGNATURE
24 GATHERING METHOD THEREFORE NEEDING 50% OF THE VOTE RATHER THAN
25 2/3 OF THE VOTE WOULD SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASE OUR ABILITY TO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PASS IT. ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT ALAMEDA COUNTY HAS BEEN
2 MAKING LESS DEMANDS THAN OTHERS ON THIS BUT ALREADY HAS A FULL
3 CENT SALES TAX AS WELL AS SEVERAL OTHER LOCAL FUNDING
4 MECHANISMS THAT HAVE BEEN PUT INTO PLACE. AND ALSO TO HIGH
5 LIGHT THE IMPORTANCE OF AC TRANSIT, WHICH HAS A VERY HIGH
6 HELVE OF SERVICE FOR WORKING CLASS AND LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND
7 HAS VERY GOOD COST EFFECTIVENESS PER RIDER AND NEEDS
8 ADDITIONAL FUNDING MORE THAN THE 30 PER YEAR IN THE DRAFT. AND
9 SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT IS CAPTURED AND THE NEEDS OF
10 AC TRANSIT ARE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT. IN TERMS OF HOW WE CAN GROW
11 THE PIE, OR BAKE MORE PIE, OR HARSH HARVEST THE LEMONS AND
12 TURN THEM INTO LEMON MER-I THINK PIE, DEPENDING ON WHAT
13 METAPHOR YOU PREFER, I THINK WE COULD LOOK AT AN ITEM WHERE
14 THE SALES TAX 1% IN SAN FRANCISCO AND HALF A PERCENT OTHERWISE
15 ELSEWHERE AND ALSO THOSE WHO HAVE MENTION HOUSING WHICH CAME
16 UP THE JOINT MTC ABAG DISCUSSION ON THIS IN THE MEASURE WE DID
17 IN ALAMEDA COUNTY INCLUDE SOME FUNDING FOR TRANSIT ORIENTED
18 DEVELOPMENT AND THERE IS ABILITY TO GROW THE PIE HERE WE COULD
19 INCLUDE SOME MONEY FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN TRANSIT ORIENTED
20 DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS THAT WOULD SERVE MULTIPLE GOALS IF WE
21 INCLUDED SOME HOUSING IN THIS HOUSING AT TRANSIT HUBS WOULD
22 STABILIZE THOSE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND PROVIDE MORE CUSTOMERS
23 AND MORE INCOME FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE LONG RUN
24 WOULD SUPPORT OUR PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREA AND RHNA PROCESS
25 IF WEEKEND INCLUDE SOME FUNDING SPECIFICALLY FOR AFFORDABLE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 HOUSING AS PART OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT PROJECT I
2 BELIEVE IT WOULD INCREASE VOTER SUPPORT FOR THE MEASURE
3 OVERALL AS WE HAVE SEEN IN SEVERAL POLLS INCLUDING THE RECENT
4 ONE BY BART THE HOUSING POLLED HIGHER THAN THE TRANSIT IN
5 TERMS OF THINGS PEOPLE WERE WILLING TO SPEND MONEY FOR AND
6 THEN THE OTHER OPTIONS TO THE PIE IN ADDITION TO POTENTIALLY
7 LOOKING AT TAX AT A DIFFERENT RATE IN DIFFERENT PLACES WOULD
8 BE OF COURSE TO DO BOTH A SALES TAX AND POTENTIAL PARCEL TAX
9 AND EVEN IF WE'RE LOOKING AT TEN YEARS WE COULD DO THAT AND
10 THEN FINALLY I UNDERSTAND THE COUNTIES THAT HAVE SALES TAX
11 THAT ARE EXPIRING SOON ARE ESPECIALLY CONCERNED IN TERMS OF
12 NOT WANTING SOMETHING THAT MIGHT CONFLICT WITH THEIR ABILITY
13 TO GO BACK TO THEIR VOTERS AND WE'RE ALL LIVING THROUGH THIS
14 PERIOD OF INTENSE CHANGE AND I DID WANT TO INQUIRE IF WE'RE
15 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO LOOK INTO THE LEGALITY OR OPTION TO
16 POTENTIALLY DO A MEASURE THAT CREATES A NEW REGIONAL FUND FOR
17 TEN YEARS WHILE SIMULTANEOUSLY EXTENDING THE LOCAL COUNTY
18 EXISTING MEASURES FOR TEN MORE YEARS SO THOSE COUNTIES WHO ARE
19 FACING IMMINENT NEED TO REAPPROVE WOULD HAVE MORE TIME PRIOR
20 TO THAT HAPPENING. THANK YOU SO MUCH PLEASURE TO BE PART OF
21 THE CONVERSATION.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS THANK YOU FOR
24 PROVIDING YOUR QUESTIONS, YOUR DIALOGUE, YOUR THOUGHTS. I WANT
25 TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN WE'RE GOING TO BRING IT BACK



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TO THE COMMISSION. I WANT TO LEAVE US WITH THIS THOUGHT FOR A
2 SECOND AS WE LISTEN TO PUBLIC COMMENT. WHEN 1031 WAS HAPPENING
3 A LOT OF THIS DISCUSSION HERE WAS WE'RE GRABBING ON BY THE
4 BUMPER, WE WANT TO BE IN THE CAR MAKING THIS. WE'RE IN THE CAR
5 MAKING IT. AND WE'RE DRIVING IT. AND I JUST WANT TO CAUTION
6 US, WE CAN'T LET THE PERFECT GET IN THE WAY OF PROGRESS AND
7 THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE ALWAYS HEARD. BUT I THINK THIS
8 COMMISSION HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE FORWARD SOMETHING THAT
9 WE CAN CONTINUE TO WORK ON AS WE GET NEW INFORMATION AND THERE
10 IS ALWAYS GOING TO BE REASONS TO SAY NO. BUT THERE IS
11 INCREDIBLE REASON TO SAY YES KNOWING THERE IS GOING TO BE
12 MULTIPLE OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE COMMISSION AND OTHER BODIES TO
13 HAVE A CONVERSATION. SO WE'RE GOING TO PUBLIC COMMENT I
14 BELIEVE WE HAVE MULTIPLE FOLKS IN THE ROOM AND THEN ONLINE. IS
15 THAT CORRECT? OKAY. LET'S START WITH THOSE IN THE ROOM.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. BEFORE WE DO THAT, I'LL READ INTO
18 THE RECORD THE CORRESPONDENCE WE RECEIVED IN WRITING. FROM --
19 THERE WAS A JOINT LETTER FROM BAY AREA COUNCIL CALIFORNIA
20 ALLIANCE FOR JOBS AND SPUR, BOB POWERS OF BART, BARBARA JUE,
21 ADAM RACK OF CCAG, MICHAEL HURSH OF AC TRANSIT, APRIL CHAN OF
22 SAMTRANS, VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, COLLIN TOMA OF
23 DISABILITIES SERVICES LEGAL CENTER, TILLY CHANG SFCTA, AND
24 JOINT LABOR COALITION. SO, OUR FIRST BLUE SPEAKER CARD IS FROM



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MICHAEL HURSH FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN, CYRUS HALL, AND ABBI
2 RAMEN DAVIES.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I KNOW WE HAVE OVER 30 SPEAKS I'LL
5 REMIND THIS IS NOT GOING TO BE THE ONLY TIME FOR FOLKS TO
6 PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. APPRECIATE YOU UNDERSTANDING THIS AND
7 AGAIN WE ARE GOING TO CONTINUE TO MAKE SURE PEOPLE CAN
8 COMMUNICATE THROUGH THE COMMISSION THROUGH DIFFERENT FORUMS.
9 THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

10

11 **MICHAEL HURSH:** A MINUTE?

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

14

15 **MICHAEL HURSH:** MIKE HURSH, AC TRANSIT. AS MENTIONED YOU HAVE A
16 LETTER IN YOUR PACKAGE BOTTOM LINE IS SCENARIOS PROPOSED
17 LEAVES AC TRANSIT SHORT WE'RE BEING FISCALLY SMART WHAT YOU
18 HAVE IN FRONT OF YOU IS FUNDAMENTALLY FLAWED WE ARE PROPOSING
19 TO TAKE PACKS PAYER DOLLARS BEING DISTRIBUTED WITHOUT EQUITY
20 ANALYSIS SYSTEMS HAVE HOST RIDERSHIP WE'RE LOOKING FOR MONEY
21 TO PAY FOR PHANTOM RIDERS. AS GENERAL MANAGER I STEPPED DOWN
22 SATURDAY IN 32 YEARS I HAVE WORKED FOR THREE OF THE LARGEST
23 SYSTEMS TWO WITH RAIL BUT A THERE SPENT ON BUS GOES A HELL OF
24 A LOT FURTHER THAN A DOLLAR SPENT OF RAIL. WE ARE IGNORING
25 THAT BASIC PRINCIPLE. THERE IS NO REGARD TO SERVICE COST PER



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 HOUR OR PASSENGER COST PER HOUR. SCENARIOS DON'T ACCOMPLISH
2 ONE OF THE CORE GOALS YOU HEARD FROM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
3 FREMIER TONIGHT WHICH IS TO AVOID SERVICE DISRUPTION. I DON'T
4 HAVE A TIMER HERE. I'M URGING THE COMMISSION WHATEVER YOU
5 DECIDE TO FORGE SHOULD COME WITH ADDITIONAL DIRECTION THAT
6 TITLE SIX OR SIMILAR EQUITY ANALYSIS BE A REQUIREMENT OF THE
7 LEGISLATION.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **MICHAEL HURSH:** POLLING MUST INCLUDE --

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU CAN WRAP UP, PLEASE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** EXCUSE ME?

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU CAN WRAP UP; GO AHEAD.

18

19 **MICHAEL HURSH:** POLLING MUST INCLUDE QUESTIONS THAT ALLOW
20 PUBLIC TO WEIGH IN ON A WEALTH OR BUSINESS TAX WHICH HAS BEEN
21 TOO QUICKLY DISMISSED. I HAVE MORE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR
22 SPERING, BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, AND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, IT'S
23 BEEN A BLAST. I'M STAYING ON AS A SENIOR ADVISOR; SO YOU'RE
24 NOT DONE WITH ME.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** [LAUGHTER] ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, SIR.
2 NEXT SPEAKER.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ADINA LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY CYRUS HALL.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. ADINA LEVIN.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE MIC.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. ADINA LEVIN. I SERVE ON THE
11 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND WILL REPORT ON WHAT WE HAD SAID
12 WHICH WAS SUPPORTING SOMETHING CLOSER TO THE HYBRID OPTION
13 BECAUSE WE WANT TO SEE THE TRANSIT SERVICE MAINTAIN AND
14 IMPROVED AND COORDINATED, AND THAT DID THE BEST JOB AT THAT.
15 WANTED AS AN INDIVIDUAL TO SUPPORT WHAT GENERAL MANAGER HURSH
16 AND REBECCA KAPLAN HAD MENTIONED IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT THE
17 REVENUE OPTIONS TO DO THE BEST AS WE CAN TO MAINTAIN AND
18 IMPROVE AND COORDINATE THE SYSTEM AND KEEPING THOSE OPTIONS ON
19 THE TABLE WITH ENOUGH MONEY TO DO THAT. THAT'S SOMETHING --
20 IT'S GOING TO BE HARD TO GET VOTERS TO VOTE ON SOMETHING WHERE
21 THE SYSTEM SHRINKS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CYRUS HALL, FOLLOWED ABBY RAMEN DAVIES.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS CYRUS HALL.
3 I LIVE HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I RIDE MUNI AND BART REGULARLY.
4 I AM A CAMPAIGN MANAGER FOR PROP L. WHICH FAILED. POLLING
5 SHOWS A REGIONAL MEASURE CAN PASS BUT ONLY AS A CITIZENS'
6 INITIATIVE. I ENCOURAGE ALL STAKEHOLDERS TO RECOGNIZE IF THAT
7 INITIATIVE IS NOT INTERESTING OR EXCITING PER GROUND GAME
8 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET SUPPORT YOU NEED TO RUN GROUND GAME
9 USING LOS OF FARES LEAVES SFMTA WITH A MASSIVE GAP, LEAD TO
10 CUTS YOU WILL NOT GET SAN FRANCISCO GROUND GAME KEEP IN MIND
11 AS MOVE FORWARD. MULTIPLE MEASURES ON THE SAME BALLOT IN SAN
12 FRANCISCO ARE LIKELY TO FAIL. ON POLLING, I ENCOURAGE MTC TO
13 WORK WITH SACRAMENTO TO LOOK AT SFMTA AND OPERATOR OPTION OF
14 DIFFERENT TAX RATES MIGHT BE VITAL TO SOLVING THIS MEASURE AND
15 THE REGIONAL MEASURE TO AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING TRANSIT MEASURE
16 COMBINED.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT ABBY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS ABBY DAVIS FROM TRANSFORM MEMBERS OF
21 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, JUST WANT TO THANK MTC AND
22 STAFF FOR THIS HARD WORK NOVEMBER 5TH MADE IT VERY CLEAR NO
23 HELP IS COMING AND THE CALIFORNIA BUDGET IS GOING TO BE
24 STRESSED AS WELL IT'S UP TO US TO SAVE OURSELVES SALES TAX
25 PUTTING PRESSURE ON WORKING PEOPLE AND FAMILIES THEY'RE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 ALREADY FEELING THE PRESSURE IN THEIR POCKETS WE PAY
2 PROGRESSIVE SOURCE WE HAVE REPEATEDLY STATED WE'RE IN CRISIS
3 YET SOME HAVE CALLED FOR HIGHWAYS TO BE IN THIS MEASURE NOT
4 ONLY IS THAT DETRIMENTAL TO OUR CLIMATE GOALS BUT NOT FOCUS OF
5 THIS MEASURE AND THERE ARE OTHER BUCKETS FOR FUNDING. WE'RE
6 ALSO VOTERS AND PART OF THE COMMUNITY IF YOU WANT TO GET
7 SOMETHING YOU WANT PEOPLE TO AGREE WITH TO GET 2/3 OR 50% HOW
8 DO YOU EXPECT TO DO THAT IF YOU'RE GOING TO INCREASE TAXES AND
9 DECREASE SERVICE? THANK YOU SO MUCH.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WARREN CUSHMAN, FOLLOWED BY MARY LYNNE,
12 SAY CLAUDINE, AND SARA BLAINE AND JONATHON COLE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** ARE WE ON? I THINK WE ARE. HI, EVERYONE. THIS IS
15 WARREN CUSHMAN, COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING
16 SUPPORTING PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND SENIORS. WE WANT TO
17 MAKE SURE WE HAVE A TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT IS
18 ROBUST. WE WANT TO SUPPORT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. THAT ENDEAVOR,
19 FRANKLY THE HYBRID SCENARIO DOES THAT BETTER. EVEN IF WE GO TO
20 1A OR THE VARIABLE RATE PIECE, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE SUPPORT
21 AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE, PARATRANSIT AND WAYFINDING. AS FAR AS AC
22 TRANSIT, I SUPPORT DIRECTOR -- OUR EXECUTIVE -- GENERAL
23 MANAGER HURSH. GENERAL MANAGER HURSH HIT IT RIGHT WE NEED
24 EQUITY ANALYSIS WE NEED TO REALLY LOOK AT THE RIDERS, PEOPLE
25 WITH DISABILITIES, SENIORS, AS WELL AS PEOPLE OF COLOR. WE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 HAVE GOT TO MAKE SURE THAT AC TRANSIT GETS ITS NEEDS MET.

2 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MARE LIM.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS MARY LIM I AM FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY
7 DIRECT OFFICER GENESIS OF FAITH AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION AND
8 MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I TAKE TRANSIT AND
9 HAVE RAISED AN ENTHUSIASTIC TRANSIT RIDER OUR MAJOR
10 ORGANIZATIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENT WAS IN 2014 WHEN WE WERE PART OF
11 A LARGE BROAD BASED GRASSROOTS GROUP THAT WAS SUCCESSFUL IN
12 PASSING MEASURE BB WITH YES VOTE IN OUR COUNTY WE ARE WELL
13 VERSED AND HAVE NOT STOPPED IN TEN YEARS TALKING TO VOTERS
14 ABOUT TRANSIT EQUITY STANDING UP FOR PEOPLE IN OUR REGION,
15 YOUTH, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, ELDERS, THE WORKING POOR.
16 BECAUSE THEY RELY ON A HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT SYSTEM OUR VOTERS
17 WANT THIS MEASURE FUNDED WITH PROGRESSIVE SOURCES TO ENSURE
18 THAT THE BURDEN OF PAYING FOR IMPROVED TRANSPORTATION DOES NOT
19 FALL ON THOSE HEAVILY -- WHO ARE WITH THE LEAST RESOURCES.
20 GENESIS LEADERS WERE THE GROUP THAT CALLED OUT THE SPECIAL
21 COMMITTEE FOR PUSHING CORPORATE INTEREST.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOUR TIME.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CLAUDINE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS CLAUDINE TONG. I AM A
5 MEMBER OF GENESIS AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I HAVE
6 BEEN A BUS AND BART RIDER ALL MY LIFE I REMEMBER WHEN MUNI AND
7 AC TRANSIT RAN FREQUENTLY AND RELIABLY. PLEASE REMEMBER THAT
8 PUBLIC TRANSIT IS NOT MERELY A NICE ALTERNATIVE TO DRIVING
9 CARS. MANY IF NOT MOST BART RIDERS ARE ABLE TO DRIVE THIS CARS
10 WHEN NECESSARY, MOST AC TRANSIT RIDERS DO NOT HAVE THAT
11 ALTERNATIVE. THE BUS IS OUR ONLY TRANSPORTATION. IT MEANS THE
12 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN KEEPING A JOB AND A ROOF OVER OUR HEADS.
13 THE BUS IS AN ESSENTIAL SERVICE FOR THOSE WHO ARE UNABLE TO
14 DRIVE DUE TO AGE OR DISABILITY. IT IS A MATTER OF JUSTICE.
15 PEOPLE WITH RESOURCES CAN AND SHOULD FUND PUBLIC
16 TRANSPORTATION WHICH ULTIMATELY BENEFITS ALL OF US IN THE LONG
17 RUN. I SUPPORT THE FUNDING MEASURES THAT COMMISSION ARE KAPLAN
18 BROUGHT FORTH. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS SARA BLAINE FOLLOWED BY
21 JONATHON COAL, MANNY LEONE AND SARA GREENWALD.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M A MEMBER OF ST. JOHN'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH IN
24 OAKLAND OUR CHURCH IS A MEMBER OF GENESIS INTERFACE SOCIAL
25 JUSTICE ORGANIZATION PROJECT GENESIS ALSO PART OF VOICES FOR



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I'M HERE TO URGE MTC TO PRODUCE A
2 MEASURE THAT PROVIDES ADEQUATE FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT
3 SERVICE MAINTAINED AND MEASURE ALSO NEEDS TO RAISE REVENUE TO
4 ADDRESS THE CURRENT OPERATOR SHORTFALLS THE FUNDING NEEDS TO
5 BE RELIABLE AND PROGRESSIVE COST OF PUBLIC TRANSIT SHOULD BE
6 BORNE BY EVERYONE WHO BENEFITS FROM THE GLORIES OF THE BAY
7 AREA HERE NOT FALL DISPROPORTIONATELY ON THOSE WHO CAN AT
8 LEAST AFFORD IT AND OWN A HOME IN OAKLAND WITH EXCELLENT
9 PUBLIC TRANSIT ACCESS BY AC TRANSIT I HAVE EXCELLENT PUBLIC
10 TRANSIT NEAR WHERE I LIVE PROPERTY TAX IS A FINE INVESTMENT
11 FOR ME AND THE PUBLIC GOOD. I ENCOURAGE EXPLORING OTHER
12 OPTIONS BESIDES SALES TAX. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JONATHON COLE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AMAZON THAN COLE WITH CLIMATE ACTION CALIFORNIA, AND
17 I WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION AND ESPECIALLY COMMISSIONER
18 SPERING AND SELECT COMMITTEE FOR ALL THEIR WORK ON THIS
19 COMPLICATED HERCULEAN TASK AND JUST TO ADD ANOTHER
20 COMPLICATION I'M HERE TO REMIND US THAT WE ARE IN A CLIMATE
21 CRISIS AND THAT ONE OF THE IMPORTANT EFFECTS OF THIS FUNDING
22 SHOULD BE A REDUCTION OF OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. THE
23 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION HAVE PUT FORWARD A PROPOSAL
24 THAT ALL PROJECTS FUNDED UNDER THIS KIND OF INITIATIVE BE
25 CLIMATE NEUTRAL AND THAT WAS NOT FORWARDED FROM THE SELECT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 COMMITTEE TO THE FULL COMMISSION. BUT WE STILL CONTINUE TO
2 SUPPORT THAT. IF, HOWEVER, THAT'S NOT POSSIBLE, WE WOULD
3 PROPOSES THAT THE COMMISSION CONSIDER LANGUAGE THAT THE NET
4 EFFECT OF FUNDING WITHIN ANY COUNTY BE CLIMATE EMISSIONS
5 REDUCTION. AND THAT BE FRONT LOADED. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MANNY LEONE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION MANNY
10 LEONE ON BEHALF OF THE CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS I'LL BE
11 SHORT TODAY I WANT TO POINT TO THE COALITION LETTER AND JOINT
12 LETTER WE DRAFTED AND SUBMITTED TO THE PUBLIC FILE ASKED
13 LOOKING AT POLLING RESEARCH MOVING FORWARD LOOK AT HIGH-LEVEL
14 PRINCIPLES REFERENCE IN THE LETTER REFORMS TO TRANSIT
15 ACCOUNTABILITY OF TRANSIT MULTI-MODAL OPTIONS FOR MULTI-MODAL
16 EXPENDITURES AS WELL AS FLEX LOOKING AT DIFFERENT REVENUE
17 SOURCES INCLUDING SALES TAX I'LL CONCLUDE MY PRESENTATION.
18 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TAKE CARE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SARAH GREENWALD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI. 350 BAY AREA IS AWARE -- WELL, BEING MINDFUL OF
23 THE CLIMATE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE BENEFIT OF PUBLIC TRANSIT
24 WHICH REDUCES EXHAUST EMISSIONS THAT MAKE UP A SIGNIFICANT
25 PART OF THE EXCLUSION THAT WORSENS THE CLIMATE CRISIS AND



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 EXPOSES US ALL ESPECIALLY THOSE NEAR THE HIGHWAYS AND TRAFFIC
2 TO A MAELSTROM OF DEADLY ILLNESSES INCLUDING ASTHMA AND HEART
3 DISEASE AND CANCER YOU ALL KNOW WE LOOK FORWARD TO SUPPORTING
4 THE MEASURE HELPING IN SIGNATURE GATHERING EFFORT AND HELPING
5 PERSUADE VOTERS TO PASS IT IF IT'S A MEASURE THAT IS EQUITABLY
6 FUNDED FAIRLY DISTRIBUTED AND SUFFICIENT TO HELP BAY AREA
7 RESIDENTS MAKE MORE TRIPS VIA TRANSIT TO LEAD US AWAY FROM THE
8 GASOLINE CARS AS YOU KNOW WE MUST MOVE AND I'M SURE YOU ALL
9 KNOW THIS AND AGREE WITH IT AS DO VOTERS AND THIS TRANSITION
10 WILL ESPECIALLY BE PAINFUL IN THIS AREA BECAUSE THE BAY AREA
11 IS CAR ADDICTED SO PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO MAKE FEWER AND
12 FEWER TRIPS IN THEIR CARS UNLESS WE PROVIDE REALISTIC
13 ALTERNATIVE AND WITH THAT IS YOUR TASK --

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. VALERIE LANCY.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MTC. I SEE THIS IS A PROCESS THAT'S
18 COMPLETELY FULL OF MISALIGNED INCENTIVES. VOTERS DON'T
19 NECESSARILY CARE THAT EVERY PENNY THEY CONTRIBUTE TO
20 GOVERNMENT STAYS WITHIN THEIR COUNTY BOUNDARIES PEOPLE'S LIVES
21 DON'T FIT WITHIN A CAN'T BOUNDARY BUT THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
22 ARGUING ABOUT MIN MAX FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITIES WITHIN A
23 GIVEN BOUNDARY BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT THE PEOPLE WHO ARE PUT ON
24 THE MTC CARE B I THINK WE HAVE SEEN WITH THE PACKET TODAY THIS
25 WOULD BE AN ABSOLUTE DISASTER FOR OUR ENTIRE REGION IF TRANSIT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 RIDERSHIP DROPS AND PEOPLE MOVE ON MASS TO CAR RIDERSHIP WE
2 CANNOT PLAY A BRINKMANSHIP WITH THIS AND I THINK THERE IS
3 GOING TO HAVE TO BE CHANGE IN OUR SOME SYSTEMS AND PEOPLE ARE
4 BEHAVING IN ORDER TO FACILITATE THAT. I'M SORRY I'M VERY
5 FRUSTRATED WITH THIS. BRINKMANSHIP JUST ISN'T GOING TO WORK.
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NOW WE'LL MOVE TO THE ZOOM
9 SPACE OF THE FIRST IS PUBLIC ADVOCATE TRANSIT DEPARTMENT.
10 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. OKAY. WE'LL MOVE TO
11 THE NEXT SPEAKER. EMILY WHEELER. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
12 THERE WE GO.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HELLO.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS EMILY, AND I WORK FOR PUBLIC ADVOCATES
19 AND WE'RE A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. ALSO
20 I'M A LIFE-LONG BAY AREA PUBLIC TRANSIT RIDER I THINK MTC
21 STAFF DID A GOOD JOB OUTLINING THE SCALE OF THE PROBLEM I'M
22 BAFFLED A YEAR LATER WE'RE POISED ONCE AGAIN TO FUMBLE THE
23 BALL. WE NEED FUNDING TO IMPROVE TRANSIT SERVICE ACROSS THE
24 REGION, INCLUDING EQUITY ANALYSIS. SCENARIO 1A IS A LOSING
25 PROPOSITION, TRANSIT ACROSS ALL NINE COUNTIES NEED A



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 SUSTAINABLE SOURCE OF FUNDING THAT PRIORITIZES TRANSIT
2 OPERATIONS TO AVOID TRANSIT DEATH SPIRAL. TAKE A BOLD STANCE
3 AND DEMAND A MEASURE THAT MEETS THE NEEDS OF BAY AREA
4 RESIDENTS AND MOVES OUR CLIMATE GOALS. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PUBLIC ADVOCATES TRANSIT
7 DEPARTMENT. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI THIS IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES VOICES FOR PUBLIC
10 TRANSPORTATION. I AGREE WE NEED MANY SOURCES OF FUNDING FOR
11 TRANSIT FEDERAL FUNDING IS OFF THE TABLE ANY TIME SOON AND I'M
12 ABOUT TO LEAVE FOR TOMORROW STATE TASK FORCE MEETING IN CLOVE
13 US, NOT PUTTING FUNDING OPTIONS ON THE TABLE. SCENARIO 1A IS
14 UNADEQUATE AND INEQUITABLE. WITH CURRENT FY 2023/2024
15 RIDERSHIP DATA SCENARIO 1A CALTRAIN IS OVER \$9 A TRIP,
16 [INDISCERNIBLE] \$6 A TRIP AC TRANSIT AND \$0.75 A ONE THERE
17 MUNI \$0.58 A TRIP COMMUNITY AC TRANSIT SERVE LOW-INCOME RIDERS
18 [INDISCERNIBLE] FORCED TO MAKE CUTS WITH LOOKING AT PAST
19 REGIONAL MEASURE SCENARIO 1A IS NOT A WINNING PROPOSITION.
20 [INDISCERNIBLE] SCENARIO 1A IS NOT --

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ANTHONY WITH TRANSBAY
23 COALITION.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. AS PART OF THE MEMBER ORG OF THE VOICES FOR
2 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION I EXPECTED TO BE VOLUNTEERING
3 IN 2026 TO HELP PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT TO SAVE TRANSIT
4 AGENCIES I RELY ON UNFORTUNATELY ONE OF THOSE IS AC TRANSIT
5 AND TO SEE A MEASURE BEING ASKED TO TAX MYSELF 30% TO CUT AC
6 TRANSIT I DON'T KNOW IF I CAN ADVOCATE FOR THAT. LEADING TO
7 BIZARRE FOCUS ON INTERCOUNTY BENEFITS REALLY IF THE STATE IS
8 GOING TO DECLARE A CONSISTENCY NET BAY AREA AS THEY SHOULD WE
9 SHOULD DISTRIBUTE MONEY EQUITABLY AND DROPPING THIS
10 CONSIDERATION OF SHORTFALLS AS THE REASON MONEY NEEDS TO BE
11 GIVEN OUT. IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS MAIN SUPPORT FOR THIS
12 SCENARIO 1A AND I THINK WE SHOULD BE POLLING DETAILS,
13 INCLUDING OPTION WHERE THAT BECOMES BIGGER AND INCLUDES A
14 PARCEL TAX ELEMENT THAT RESULTS IN TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS RATHER
15 THAN TRANSIT CUTS. I HOPE THAT POLLING WILL STUDY BOTH A
16 LARGER TEN-YEAR MEASURE AND THE IMPACTS, INCLUDING WHETHER
17 VOTERS SUPPORT SOMETHING THAT IS GOOD OR AT LEAST SOMETHING
18 THAT LEADS TO CUTS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COLLIN TOMA.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M COLLIN TOMA, CHANGE ADVOCATE WITH
23 DISABILITIES SERVICES. I DO HAVE MORE COMMENTS DETAILED IN MY
24 SUBMISSION. BUT WANTED TO TOUCH ON I HAVE SERIOUS CONCERNS
25 THAT IF THE COUNTIES ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE MEASURE IT COULD



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 NEGATIVELY AFFECT OUR TRANSIT IN THE AREA. IN MY THREE AND A
2 HALF YEARS AT DSLC IT'S BEEN CHALLENGING TO FIND RIDES FOR
3 CONSUMERS AND CLIENT AND THE REST OF THE BAY AREA THEY CAN GET
4 COVERED THROUGH MEDICAL OFTEN HAVE TO PAY SEVERAL HUNDRED
5 DOLLARS TO GET TO MEGA TRIPS IN THE BAY AREA MAKING IT
6 UNAFFORDABLE FOR THEM. NAPA COUNTIES AND ISSUES SUCH AS
7 INTEGRATE SERVICE IN THE AREAS FINALLY ALL OF THE COUNTIES ARE
8 QUICKLY AGEING AND STRATEGIES MEETING CHALLENGES. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SOPHIA DEWITT.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** REVEREND SOPHIA DEWITT, CHIEF PROGRAM OFFICER WITH
13 EAST BAY HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS AND MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
14 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. GOOD PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS
15 ESSENTIAL FOR THE BAY AREA'S CLIMATE GOALS ESSENTIAL FOR
16 MEETING OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING OBLIGATIONS AS TRANSIT IS
17 SOMETHING THAT HELPS MAKE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS
18 COMPETITIVE FOR FUNDING. BUT ANY TRANSIT MEASURE NEEDS TO
19 IMPROVE AND INCREASE TRANSIT AND NOT ASK VOTERS TO TAX
20 THEMSELVES MORE FOR SERVICE CUTS. THAT IS UNACCEPTABLE. THE
21 FUNDING SOURCE NEEDS TO BE PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCE SO WE'RE
22 NOT FUNDING THE MEASURE ON THE BACKS OF MOST LOW-INCOME PEOPLE
23 IN OUR REGION AND WE NEED TO HAVE AN EQUITY ANALYSIS IN THE
24 MEASURE SO THAT WE MAKE SURE WE'RE BEING EQUITABLE AND ASKING
25 EVERYONE TO BUY-IN. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MARJORIE ALVORD.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M ALAMEDA COUNTY RESIDENT GENESIS AND 350 BAY
5 AREA MEMBER, AC TRANSIT BART, SFMTA RIDER AND I WOULD LOVE
6 MORE FREQUENT AND BROADER TRANSIT SERVICE I GO SAN JOSE A LOT.
7 I'M DISCOURAGED THAT PROPOSALS ARE GETTING FURTHER AWAY FROM
8 ANYTHING I WANT TO VOTE FOR YOU SHOULD AT LEAST AUTHORIZE A
9 POLL QUESTION OF FUNDING THAT DOES NOT INCLUDE SALES TAX ALSO
10 SHOULD RECOGNIZE I THINK EMPHASIS FOR ROBUST PUBLIC TRANSIT
11 FOR SURVIVING CLIMATE CHANGE AND AUTHORIZE A POLL QUESTION ON
12 THAT ALSO. THERE NEEDS TO BE EQUITABLE ANALYSIS THANK YOU VERY
13 MUCH GENERAL MANAGER HURSH FOR YOUR GREAT COMMENTS THERE NEEDS
14 TO BE MORE SIMPLICITY SEEMS REACHING SCENES US IS GETTING WAY
15 TOO COMPLICATED. THANK VERY EVERYONE FOR YOUR WORK LET'S KEEP
16 IT SIMPLE LET'S GET THERE THANKS SO MUCH FOR LISTENING TO MY
17 CONCERNS. THANK YOU. BYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MAKAYLA.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MAKAYLA PATRICK. GOVERNMENT AND COMMUNITY
22 AFFAIRS OFFICER AT SAMTRANS WE APPRECIATE THE EFFORT MTC HAS
23 PUT INTO DEVELOPING A POTENTIAL FUNDING MEASURE TO SUSTAIN THE
24 BAY AREA'S TRANSIT AND WE'RE HAPPY TO HEAR FROM THE
25 PRESENTATION TODAY THAT MTC STAFF SUPPORTS OUR STRONG



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 RECOMMENDATION FOR INDEPENDENT THIRD PARTY REVIEW OF EACH
2 AGENCY'S BUDGET DEFICITS AND FAIR SHARE CALCULATIONS THIS WILL
3 ENSURE ALL AGENCIES OPERATE FROM A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD ON
4 FRIDAY OUR GENERAL MANAGER AND CEO APRIL CHAN ALSO SUBMITTED A
5 FOLLOW UP LETTER THAT PROVIDES RELEVANT BUDGET CONTACTS FOR
6 SAMTRANS FINALLY IF SAN MATEO COUNTY IS TO PARTICIPATE IN A
7 REGIONAL MEASURE IT MUST HAVE SUPPORT OF OUR COUNTIES ELECTED
8 LEADERS AND SOLUTIONS FOR US AND INCLUDING US, MUST INVOLVE
9 US.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. HARRY NEIL.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS HARRY NEIL. I'M A TRANSIT ADVOCATE IN
14 SANTA CLARA COUNTY I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS MY SUPPORT FOR WHAT
15 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF SAID ABOUT LINKING POTENTIALLY A HOUSING
16 AND TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. THERE IS A LOT OF TALK ABOUT
17 IMPROVING RIDER EXPERIENCE ONE WAY TO DO THAT IS MAKING SURE
18 THAT STATIONS HAVE ADEQUATE TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT. I
19 KNOW HERE IN SAN JOSE THERE IS LIMITED IF ANY TOD OUTSIDE OF
20 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE AND THE SMALLER CITIES DOWNTOWNS MAKING SURE
21 THAT THAT IS A BAY AREA WIDE FOCUS MEANS THAT WE CAN MEET OUR
22 HOUSING GOALS EVEN EXCEED THEM AND MAKE SURE OUR TRANSIT IS
23 USEFUL AND PLEASANT TO USE. PLEASE JUST MAKE SURE THAT
24 WHATEVER WE DO, WE DO IT TOGETHER. WE CAN HAVE ALL THE DEBATES



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THAT WE NEED NOW, BUT ONCE WE OVER, I DON'T WANT TO HEAR
2 ANYONE GRUMBLING. JUST DO IT. PLEASE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALETA DUPREE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR. ALETA DUPREE, FOR
7 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER, WITH TEAM FOLDS. APPRECIATE THE WORK
8 YOU'RE DOING AND I LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR ACTION TODAY NO
9 PROPOSAL IS PERFECT BUT WE HAVE TWO PROPOSALS HERE THAT WE CAN
10 WORK WITH AND I'M FINE WITH EITHER OF THEM. NOW IS NOT THE
11 TIME TO NITPICK. I COME TO YOU WITH A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE. I
12 KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE WHEN TRANSIT DOESN'T WORK BECAUSE I GREW
13 UP AND LIVED THROUGH THE DAYS OF THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY IN
14 THE 1970S AND EARLY '80S WITH DOCTOR FIT I AND BROKEN LIGHTS
15 AND ALL KINDS OF OTHER PROBLEMS AND IT TOOK A STRONG
16 LEADERSHIP, THE WORK WE'RE DOING TODAY IS GOING TO HELP KEEP
17 OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT FROM SLIDING TO WHERE IT WAS IN NEW YORK
18 IN THE '70S. I ASK YOU TO TAKE SOMETHING TODAY. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ZACK LIP TON.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COMMISSIONERS GOOD AFTERNOON THANK YOU FOR YOUR
23 WORK. ZACK LIP TON I'M A TRANSIT RIDER IN SAN FRANCISCO RELY
24 ON TRANSIT TO TRAVEL THROUGHOUT THE ENTIRE REGION FUNDAMENTAL
25 PRINCIPLE HERE IS WE MUST MAINTAIN AND EXPAND ON EXISTING



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 SERVICE LEVELS MEASURE LIKE SCENARIO 1A THAT DOESN'T DO THAT
2 IS A FAILURE IT'S YOUR JOB HERE TO COME UP WITH A MEASURE THAT
3 MEETS BASIC MINIMUM STANDARD BECAUSE VOTERS ARE NOT GOING TO
4 SUPPORT A MEASURE THAT IT WOULD ALSO BE SHORTSIGHTED IF YOU GO
5 AHEAD WITH A MEASURE THAT CUTS SERVICE. I REALLY HATE KNOCKING
6 ON STRANGERS DOORS BUT I WILL DO IT BECAUSE TRANSIT IS
7 IMPORTANT TO ME BUT CAN'T GO ASK VOTERS TO SAVE TRANSIT IF
8 IT'S A MEASURE THAT SLASHES SERVICE HYBRID CITIZEN'S
9 INITIATIVE WITH FLEXIBLE RATES IS THE BEST WAY FORWARD. THANK
10 YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS.

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES, THANK YOU. WENDY KALLINS. I SERVE ON THE
15 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPRESENTING MARIN COUNTY. AND I WANT
16 TO SPEAK UP FOR THE HYBRID VERSION. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
17 THAT THE RECOMMENDATION TO THE LEGISLATURE GIVE THE NORTH BAY
18 THE OPTION OF JOINING IN WITH THE URBAN COUNTIES OR THOSE
19 SEPARATELY BUT CONCURRENTLY BOTH COUNTY DO HAVE INTERCOUNTY
20 TRANSIT NEEDS PARTICULARLY EAST WEST CORRIDOR AND TWO OF THOSE
21 ARE AMONG THE MOST CONGESTED CORRIDORS IN THE BAY AREA HIGHWAY
22 37 AND RICHMOND BRIDGE SO THE NORTH BAY CAN'T BE TOTALLY
23 DIVORCE UNDERSTAND FROM THE OTHER COUNTY BENEFITS OF GOING TO
24 ALONE SO THAT OPTION HAS TO REMAIN OPEN ALSO WANT TO PUT IN A
25 BID FOR THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE OPTION I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 AVAILABLE IN EITHER SCENARIO AND I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU WOULD
2 POLL ON THAT BUT GIVEN THAT YOU KNOW YOU'RE LOOKING FOR
3 SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO PASS, 2/3 MIGHT NOT BE AN OPTION.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ERIN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HELLO?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE CAN HEAR YOU.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** ALL RIGHT GREAT. I WAS IN SAN FRANCISCO, I WORK IN
13 REDWOOD CITY AND I HAVE MANY FAMILY AND FRIENDS IN SAN JOSE I
14 TAKE TRANSIT AND MY BIKE WHEN TRAVELING AROUND THE BAY AREA
15 MOST OFTEN TRIPS ARE MULTI-MODAL OR REQUIRE TRANSFERRING
16 BETWEEN AGENCIES FOR EXAMPLE, MUNI TO BART CALTRAIN TO MUNI,
17 BART TO AC TRANSIT, BART OR MUNI OR AC TRANSIT TO THE FERRY.
18 I'M HERE TO REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT ANY CUTS TO SERVICE TO
19 ANY OF THE 27 PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL PULL PEOPLE LIKE ME
20 OFF OF TRANSIT AND PUT US BACK INTO OUR CARS. SORRY. AND WILL
21 PUT US BACK INTO OUR CARS. FURTHERMORE, HIGHWAY WIDENING
22 CANNOT BE PART OF THIS MEASURE. THIS IS A RIDICULOUS WASTE OF
23 TAXPAYER DOLLARS. I WOULD -- I AGREE WITH -- ALMOST EVERYONE
24 WHO HAS PUBLIC COMMENTED. I WOULD HAPPILY KNOCK ON DOORS FOR
25 THIS MEASURE. I WOULD VOLUNTEER A LOT OF MY TIME, BUT IT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 CANNOT HAVE HIGHWAY WIDENING AND NEEDS TO FULLY FUND TRANSIT.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. BRIAN CULBERTSON? BRIAN, OKAY.

5 AIDEN JONES.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI, GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS AIDEN
8 JONES. I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I USE MUNI, BART, AC TRANSIT,
9 SAMTRANS, CALTRAIN, I RELY ON TRANSIT, I DON'T OWN A CAR, I'M
10 A TARGET OF THIS KIND OF MEASURE SOMEONE WHO REALLY USES
11 REGIONAL ASPECT OF BAY AREA TRANSIT IN ORDER FOR TRANSIT
12 FUNDING MEASURE TO SUCCEED VOTERS WANT TO SEE FUNDING THAT
13 BOTH MAINTAINS AND ALSO IMPROVES THE SERVICE WE HAVE TODAY.
14 SO, I WANT TO IMPLORER THAT WHATEVER DECISION ENDS UP BEING
15 MADE THAT, THAT'S THE MAIN FOCUS HERE. CYRUS HALL MENTIONED
16 THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE I THINK THIS'S ALSO IMPORTANT TO
17 CONSIDER. BECAUSE I THINK 2/3 MIGHT BE TOO MUCH OF AN ASK
18 HERE. I CAMPAIGN FOR PROP L IN S. IF I HAVE KNOCKED ON MANY
19 HUNDREDS OF PEOPLE'S DOORS I'LL DO IT AGAIN BUT IT'S GOING TO
20 BE DIFFICULT IF I CAN'T PROMISE BETTER SERVICE AT THE END OF
21 IT. THANK YOU FOR YOU'RE TIME.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CARTER.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS CARTER I'M AT TRANSBAY COALITION MEMBER
2 OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WE AGREE WITH ALL THE
3 POINTS FROM OTHER SPEAKERS ABOUT THE NEED FOR TRANSFORMATIONAL
4 TRANSIT FUNDING, MTC COMMISSIONERS ARE WHERE ARE YOU GOING
5 NEXT AFTER THIS MEETING WHERE ARE YOU GOING WHY OR WHY NOT
6 WHICH OF THE MEASURES ARE YOU TAKING THAT WOULD MAKE IT EASY
7 FOR US TO TAKE TRANSIT TO GET WHERE YOU'RE TRYING TO GO NEXT?
8 WOULD YOUR FAMILY OR FRIENDS VOTE FOR THIS, CAN YOU TAKE
9 TRANSIT WHERE THEY WANT TO GO NOW WOULD THAT CHANGE WOULD THEY
10 VOTE FOR THIS WOULD YOU VOTE FOR THIS IF IT MEANS RAISING
11 TAXES AND CUTTING TRANSIT? I THINK YOU KNOW THE ANSWER TO THIS
12 AND YEE ENCOURAGE YOU TO DO SOMETHING THAT ACTUALLY PREVENTS
13 TRANSIT CUTS.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CODY VAUGHN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. HELLO MY NAME IS CODY VAUGHN, AND I LIVE IN
18 SAN FRANCISCO'S MISSION DISTRICT. I REGULARLY RELY ON MUNI,
19 BART, AND CALTRAIN. I URGE THE COMMISSION TO PURSUE A BOLD
20 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT EMPHASIZES COORDINATION
21 AND TRANSFORMATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS. VOTERS WON'T SUPPORT A
22 SMALL TEN-YEAR MEASURE THAT JUST KEEPS TRANSIT AFLOAT. THEY
23 WANT BETTER SERVICE AND A SEAMLESS NETWORK. WHILE THE HYBRID
24 SCENARIO IS MORE AMBITIOUS THAN SCENARIO 1A IT'S JUST A
25 STARTING POINT WE NEED A TRULY REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE THAT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 ENSURES SCHEDULES, FARES, AND ACCOUNTABILITY TO DELIVER FASTER
2 MORE FREQUENT TRANSIT THAT MEETS NEEDS OF RIDERS ACROSS THE
3 BAY AREA ADDITIONALLY A SUPPORT INCLUDING INITIATIVE PROVISION
4 TO ENSURE GREATER TRANSPARENCY AND PUBLIC TRUST IN THE
5 PROCESS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ROBERT'S IPHONE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. BOB
10 ALLEN WITH URBAN HABITAT AND VPT. I DON'T EVEN KNOW WHERE TO
11 BEGIN THE MEASURE DOES NOT -- WELL, 1A DOES NOT MEET THE
12 MOMENT DOESN'T MEET IN TERMS OF THE SIZE OF THE MEASURE OR
13 WHAT WE NEED TO MEET THE MOMENT IN TERMS OF OPERATOR NEEDS
14 IT'S DISAPPOINTING TO NOT SEE MORE SUPPORT FROM ALL OF THE
15 REGIONAL ACTORS BUT ALSO ELECTED OFFICIALS FROM THE CORPORATE
16 COMMUNITY THAT BENEFITTED GREATLY FROM THE TRANSIT INVESTMENT
17 OVER THE YEARS AND WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THEM TAKE MORE OF A
18 LEAD ROLE IN SAYING THEY'RE GOING TO SUPPORT SOMETHING THAT
19 ALLOWED THEM TO PROFIT OVER THE BOOM TIMES AND WE ALL OUGHT TO
20 -- THIS IS A HIGHLY UNLIKELY TO BE FEDERAL FUNDING -- IT'S
21 KIND OF EMBARRASSING TO HAVE AC TRANSIT GM HAVE TO SPEAK ONE
22 MINUTE BEFORE AND LIKE THE REST OF US, I THINK WE COULD DO A
23 BETTER JOB THERE. WE KNOW THIS IS TOUGHER. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAMELA CAMPOS?



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **DAVID CAMPOS:** HI. MY NAME IS PAMELA CAMPOS, I AM CHAIR OF MTC
3 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND TO REITERATE, THE VOTE AT THE
4 LAST POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING REGARDING THE TRANSIT
5 MEASURE FOR COUNCIL WITH TWO MEMBERS PRESENT, VOTED IN FAVOR
6 OF THE FOLLOWING MOTION 19 AYES THREE NOS, THE POLICY ADVISORY
7 COUNCIL SUPPORTS THE HYBRID SCENARIO BECAUSE THE HYBRID
8 SCENARIO REFLECTS OUR HIGHER LEVEL OF EXPECTATIONS IN
9 RELATION, WHILE THERE REMAIN GAPS THAT NEED TO BE FILLED
10 SUPPORT CONTINUES REQUIRES ALL COUNTIES TO PARTICIPATE AND
11 MEET ALL RESIDENTS.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUSANA.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON SUSANA WITH ALL HOME ON BEHALF OF THE
16 BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION'S LEADERSHIP TEAM THANK YOU
17 MTC COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR WORK TODAY WE KNOW THAT BUILDING A
18 RESILIENT AND SUCCESSFUL BAY AREA WHERE EVERYONE CAN THRIVE
19 INCLUDES BOTH ENSURING WE HAVE ENOUGH AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR
20 OUR REGION AND ALSO ROBUST CONNECTED TRANSIT SYSTEM WE
21 RECOGNIZE THOSE WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT AND HOUSING INSECURE
22 ARE THE SAME BAY AREA RESIDENTS WE NEED HOUSING AND
23 TRANSPORTATION TO SERVE RESIDENTS IN MOST NEED THE HOUSING
24 COMMUNITY IS SUPPORTIVE OF THE MEASURE AND RECOGNIZES THE NEED
25 FOR BOTH REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION, WE WANT TO WORK TO ENSURE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THESE MEASURES ARE NOT IN COMPETITION BUT ARE COMPLEMENTARY OF
2 EACH REGARDING TIMING AND REVENUE SOURCE BY STAYING CLOSE TO
3 COMMUNICATION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK AND LOOK FORWARD TO
4 WORKING IN COLLABORATION TOGETHER.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOWARD.

7

8 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG THE PAST POLLING ASSUME THAT VOTERS
9 WANT A VISION FOR TRANSPORTATION FUTURE AND THAT ENTAILS I
10 THINK SEVERAL CRITERIA THAT THERE WILL BE A GREATER MOBILITY
11 OPTIONS FOR ALL THE AREAS OF THE NINE COUNTIES THAT THERE WILL
12 BE LARGE GAINS AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND THUS REACH MORE
13 VOTERS THAT THERE WILL BE GREATER TRANSIT EQUITY FOR OUR
14 GROWING SENIOR AND DISABLED AND ISOLATED COMMUNITY THAT VISION
15 INCLUDES RELIABLE SAFETY MODERN NEW TECHNICAL TECHNOLOGY AND
16 TRANSIT IN EVERY PART OF OUR REGION. SO, IRRESPECTIVE OF WHAT
17 WE WANT VOTERS TO VOTE, IF WE DON'T HAVE THAT VISION, PEOPLE
18 WON'T BE INSPIRED. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PETER?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** PETER VAN DYKE RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO. I'M GOING
23 TO TRY TO TEAR THROUGH THIS BUT LISTENING TO ALL THE
24 DISCUSSION OVER THE LAST HOUR REGARDING TWO PATHS FORWARD,
25 CONSIDERATION BASED AS A RESIDENT I SEE MOTIVATION FOR VARIOUS



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 STAKEHOLDERS IN THE BAY AREA AND CONCERNS WHERE THE SUPPORT
2 ACROSS EVERYTHING MAKES SENSE BUT I CAN'T HELP BUT FEEL LIKE
3 WE'RE HAVING DISCUSSION INSTEAD OF FINDING WAYS TO THRIVE,
4 OPPOSED TO TRYING TO ATTEMPT TO BE AMBITIOUS. ONE OF THE
5 COMMISSIONERS NOTES TOWARDS THE END OF THE DISCUSSION HAVE TO
6 DO WITH BRINGING INFRASTRUCTURE EXPANSION PART OF THE
7 PROPOSALS IN THIS CASE HOUSING, MORE BROADLY THESE THINGS PUT
8 TOWARDS A WEAKNESS BOTH PROPOSALS WILL ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE
9 FUNDING SHORTFALLS DON'T DO A GOOD JOB OF PROVIDING TANGIBLE
10 EXPANSION.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PETER AND LILLY.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON PETER STRAUSS FROM SAN
15 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND ALSO VOICES FOR PUBLIC
16 TRANSPORTATION. I ASK THAT YOU NOT ENDORSE 1A BECAUSE IT'S
17 BASED SOLELY ON FAREBOX LOSSES AND DOES NOT REFLECT LOSS OF
18 GENERAL FUND AND OTHER REVENUES TO SFMTA IT UNDERMINES MUNI BY
19 PROVIDING A LEVEL OF MUNI SPENDING THAT IS SO INADEQUATE THAT
20 WILL BE VIRTUALLY IMPOSSIBLE TO LOCAL SOURCES TO MAKE UP
21 DEFICIT AND BECAUSE IT ASSUMES THAT SALES TAX AS REVENUE
22 SOURCE IT CANNOT GENERATE THE REVENUES THE REGION AND SAN
23 FRANCISCO NEEDS IT'S IMPORTANT TO THE REGION NOT ONLY BECAUSE
24 SAN FRANCISCO PROVIDES REGIONAL RESIDENTS BUT BECAUSE A
25 MEASURE THAT SHRINKS WILL NOT BE WELL-RECEIVED BY SAN



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 FRANCISCO VOTERS AND WITHOUT STRONG SAN FRANCISCO VOTER
2 SUPPORT A REGIONAL MEASURE WILL FAIL I SUPPORT FLEXIBLE
3 ENABLING LEGISLATION BASED ON ADEQUATE INEQUITABLE MULTIPLE
4 SOURCE THAT WILL BE WORTHY OF CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE AND EARN
5 VOTER SUPPORT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. IAN GRIFFITHS.

8

9 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GOOD AFTERNOON IAN GRIFFITHS SAN FRANCISCO
10 RESIDENT AND TRANSIT RIDER. YOU HAVE HEARD FROM OTHERS TODAY
11 THAT IT IS A LOSING PROPOSITION TO PROPOSE RAISING TAXES TO
12 REDUCE SERVICE. IF WE CHOOSE THAT PATH, WE CAN GUARANTEE TO
13 FAIL. PLEASE SUPPORT AN OPTION THAT KEEPS OUR FLEXIBILITY,
14 THAT DOESN'T, YOU KNOW, CONSTRAIN AND TIE OUR HANDS MOVING
15 FORWARD. WE CAN ALWAYS CHOOSE TO HAVE -- IF WE GIVE OURSELVES
16 THE FLEXIBILITY TO CONTINUE TO ADJUST THE SIZE OF THE MEASURE
17 AND REFINE IT AS WE DO MORE POLLING, WE CAN DO THAT IF WE HAVE
18 ENABLING LEGISLATION THAT IS BROAD AND THAT ALLOWS US TO HAVE
19 EXPANSIVE VISION. BUT THE WORST THING WE CAN DO NOW IS SUPPORT
20 AN OPTION THAT CON STRAINS OUR ABILITY. AND THAT'S EXACTLY
21 WHAT 1A DOES. SO PLEASE DO NOT SUPPORT THAT OPTION.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ALEXANDER MALDONADO.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. ALEXANDER MALDONADO. I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO. I
2 WAS A VOLUNTEER ON SAN FRANCISCO PROP L CAMPAIGN PAST ELECTION
3 CYCLE. I'M GRATEFUL FOR THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO SHOWED UP TO
4 SAY WHAT I WANTED TO SAY. I DON'T KNOW IF I HAVE TOO MUCH TO
5 ADD. I WANTED TO ADD THE ANECDOTE OF EXPLAINING WHAT PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT FUNDING MEANS I CANNOT MANY DOING THAT WITH A STRAIGHT
7 FACE THAT WOULD RESULT IN SERVICE CUT, I WANT TO MAKE CHEER
8 THAT I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A HARD TIME MARSHALLING
9 PUBLIC SUPPORT, CAMPAIGN SUPPORT FOR MAKING THAT HAPPEN AND
10 ALSO ENSURE THAT THE COMMISSION APPROVES OPTION FOR CITIZEN
11 INITIATED BALLOT SUPPORT ACTUALLY WE CAN PASS WITH THE
12 MAJORITY SUPPORT NOT SUPER MAJORITY SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BINE CULBERTSON DO YOU WANT TO GIVE IT A
15 TRY?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS BRIAN, I AM A TRANSIT EXTENT RIDER IN
22 OAKLAND, TRYING TO SURVIVE OUR CLIMATE CRISIS. SURVEYS ARE
23 CLEAR THAT MAJORITY OF RIDERS WANT TO SUPPORT A TRANSIT
24 MEASURE THAT INCREASES TRANSIT SERVICE THAT'S AFFORDABLE TO
25 THEM BUT THEY'RE SKEPTICAL OF ANOTHER SALES TAX IN ALAMEDA



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 WHICH ALREADY HAS THE HIGHEST SALES TAX IN CALIFORNIA. NEW
2 YORK HAS A 0.6% MULTI-COUNTY PROGRESSIVE PAYROLL TAX TO FUND
3 THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEM WHICH ATTRACTS BUSINESSES TO NEW YORK.
4 BAY AREA SHOULD ALSO FUND OUR TRANSIT LIKE NEW YORK CITY.
5 PLEASE CRAFT A MEASURE FOR BAY AREA VOTERS, NOT FOR BAY AREA
6 COUNCIL'S CONSERVATIVE BUSINESS LOBBY. PLEASE POLL FOR A
7 SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX AND A PAYROLL TAX, BOTH OF WHICH
8 DEMONSTRATE MORE VOTER SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CAROL TAYLOR?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAROL TAYLOR, GENESIS, WHICH IS CONNECTED WITH
13 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I AM A PERSON WHOSE HAD TO
14 TURN DOWN JOBS BECAUSE OF LACK OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.
15 SOMETHING THAT AS A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE OPTION, I KEEP -- THE
16 POLLING WILL LET US KNOW IF WE MEET THAT LOWER THRESHOLD. SO
17 WE MIGHT THINK THE BEST WAY TO COMBINE OUR EFFORTS. TO
18 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT, I HAVE NOT HEARD ANY RIDERS AND VERY FEW
19 COMMISSIONERS IN THE FOUR COUNTIES WANT A ONE. I HAVE NEVER
20 HEARD ANY RIDERS SUPPORT IT, WHICH TO ME MEANS THAT WE SHOULD
21 JUST GO AHEAD WITH THE HYBRID OPTION. SO, THE HYBRID OPTION,
22 CHECKING UP IF YOU NEED THE LOWER CITIZEN'S THRESHOLD AND IF
23 WE CAN USE THE PAYROLL AND PARCEL TAXES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THAT'S YOUR TIME.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I THEREIN ARE STILL A FEW MORE
3 SPEAKERS ONLINE. IF YOU DO WANT TO PARTICIPATE, IF YOU CAN
4 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AT THIS MOMENT IN TIME. THIS WILL BE
5 THE LAST OPPORTUNITY IN THIS MEETING TO PROVIDE PUBLIC
6 COMMENT. THERE WILL BE OTHER MEETINGS. BUT IT SOUND LIKE THAT
7 NUMBER KEEPS INCREASING. I WANT TO MAKE SURE IF THERE IS
8 ANYONE ELSE OUT THERE VIRTUALLY, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, THEN
9 WE'RE GOING TO STOP THAT ABILITY TO PARTICIPATE JUST FOR THIS
10 MEETING. SO, PLEASE CONTINUE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. PAMELA CAMPOS, YOU
13 RAISED YOUR HAND AGAIN?

14

15 **DAVID CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO HEAR THE MOTION --

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU HAVE ALREADY GIVEN COMMENT. SO, WE'RE
18 GOING TO MOVE ON. ADRIAN BRANDT.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU. I REALLY AGREE WITH THE MAJORITY OF
21 THE PRIOR SPEAKERS. WE DO NEED SOMETHING REGIONAL. WE NEED
22 SOMETHING THAT IMPROVES TRANSIT. AND SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE
23 REALLY CAN GET BEHIND. I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL TO
24 GET A CITIZEN BALLOT MEASURE THAT CAN PASS, AS A NORMAL
25 MAJORITY. I THINK A SUPER MAJORITY IS VERY UNLIKELY AND LIKELY



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TO FAIL. SO, YOU KNOW, OVERALL, I JUST SEE A LOT OF VERY
2 DISAPPOINTING, I GUESS, RESOURCE GUARDING, VERY PROVINCIAL,
3 LOOKING AT DIFFERENT AGENCIES, SORT OF, JUSTIFYING OR COUNTIES
4 JUSTIFYING. YOU KNOW, THEIR REASONS FOR HAVING OBJECTION. AND
5 IF YOU LOOK AT ALL THE HIGH FUNCTIONING URBAN AREAS THAT HAVE
6 FANTASTIC TRANSIT ACROSS MOST OF EUROPE, THEY HAVE SOLVED THIS
7 PROBLEM. AND IT'S NOT GOING TO BE EASY, BUT WE NEED TO HAVE A
8 REGIONAL APPROACH INSTEAD OF HAVING ALL THESE DIFFERENT
9 FIEFDOMS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JEFF?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** JEFF SMITH SAN MATEO COUNTY RESIDENT I WANT TO VOICE
18 AS A COMMUNITY ORGANIZER WHO HAS DONE MANY CITIZEN'S
19 INITIATIVES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND IN SAN MATEO COUNTY,
20 AND SUCCEEDED AND WATCHED OUR COUNTIES PASS MANY REGRESSIVE
21 SALES FORMS, I WANT TO EMPHASIZE, PEOPLE WANT PUBLIC SERVICES
22 AND THEY WANT PROGRESSIVE FUNDING. DESPITE OUR REPRESENTATIVES
23 NOT ACKNOWLEDGING THIS, IT IS POPULAR. AND THE MORE
24 PROGRESSIVE IT IS, THE MORE WE CAN GET FROM A REGIONAL
25 MEASURE. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. FRAN?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS FRANZ, I'M A RESIDENT OF CONTRA COSTA,
5 DEPENDANT ON PUBLIC TRANSIT AS WELL AS MY BIKE AND WALKING. I
6 HAVE SERIOUS CONCERNS ABOUT SCENARIO 1A AGREEING WITH THE
7 PREVIOUS SPEAKERS BEFORE ME THAT THIS MEASURE WILL NOT DO
8 ENOUGH TO EXCITE VOTERS NOR DO ENOUGH TO EXCITE ADVOCATES ON
9 THE GROUND FIGHTING AGAINST THIS INITIATIVE TO PASS I THINK
10 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE MOVE TO THE VOTERS WITH A
11 MEASURE THAT WILL BRING TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGE THAT WILL
12 INCREASE FREQUENCY AND CREATE BETTER RIDERSHIP EXPERIENCE FOR
13 RIDERS. RATHER THAN LETTING TRANSIT RIDERS SLIP AWAY AND FIND
14 ANY MEANS OF GETTING TO THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JEREMY LEVINE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONERS THANK YOU FOR THE REALLY THOUGHTFUL
19 DISCUSSION JEREMY LEVINE HERE REPRESENTING THE HOUSING
20 LEADERSHIP COUNCIL OF SAN MATEO COUNTY HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS
21 SUPPORT A STRONG REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE THAT IMPROVE SERVICE
22 IN THE LONG RUN BECAUSE MANY OF THE RESIDENTS AFFORDABLE
23 HOUSING ARE DEPENDENT ON TRANSIT OFTEN RESIDENTS OF AFFORDABLE
24 HOUSING ARE DEPENDENT ON TRANSIT THAT MOVES BETWEEN COUNTIES
25 AND SO THIS PIECE BY PIECE MEASURE WILL NOT AS EFFECTIVELY



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 MEET THE NEEDS OF THE MOST VULNERABLE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY
2 AREA WHO DEPEND MOST ON TRANSIT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
3 CONSIDERATION.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CAROL TAYLOR. I SEE YOUR HAND
6 BUT WE HAVE ALREADY CALLED UPON YOU FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. SO, WE
7 ARE -- JORDAN GRIMES IS OUR FINAL SPEAKER.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YES, GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU VERY
10 MUCH FOR YOUR TIME. MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES. I AM THE STATE
11 AND REGIONAL RESILIENCE MANAGER ECHOING THE CHORUS OF OTHERS
12 CALLING FOR A ROBUST MEASURE TO CREATE THE FREQUENCY AND
13 EFFICIENCY TO FULLY TRANSFORM THE WAY PUBLIC THINKS ABOUT
14 TRANSIT. I JUST SPENT THE WEEKEND IN VANCOUVER WHERE THE SKY
15 TRAINS ON EVERY 2 TO 3 MINUTES IT'S ROBUST INCREDIBLE SYSTEM
16 THAT THE PUBLIC TRULY RELIES ON AND THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE
17 SHOULD BE STRIVING FOR AND IT'S NOT SOMETHING THAT WE CAN GET
18 TO WITH THIS MEASURE WE HAVE TO MOVE FORWARD AND WE HAVE TO
19 WORK TOGETHER MOVING FORWARD SEPARATELY WILL NOT GET A
20 STATEMENT WE NEED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. SO AT THIS
25 POINT I WANT TO BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION I WANT TO



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THANK THE COMMISSIONERS I KNOW THAT WE HAVE ALL TALKED ABOUT
2 THIS AT LENGTH THERE'S BEEN MULTIPLE MEETINGS DISCUSSIONS
3 AROUND THIS AND I WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER SPERING
4 WHO DID CHAIR THE AD-HOC GROUP ALL THE ABOVE GROUPS YOU DID A
5 LOT GYM TO BRING TO US THIS POINT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE
8 SOME COMMENTS THEN I'M GOING TO MOVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION
9 TO KIND OF SPEED UP THE PROCESS HERE THIS ISSUE DID NOT JUST
10 FALL ON US RECENTLY WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS SINCE 2020
11 THIS IS WHERE THE TWO TRANCHES OF AARPA MONEY THAT WE HAVE HAD
12 SO IT'S A PROBLEM THAT'S FACING THIS REGION, IT DOESN'T
13 NECESSARILY HAVE TO BE TODAY OR MANY OF THE THINGS THAT YOU'RE
14 ASKING FOR MANY OPTIONS YOU WANT TO LOOK AT YOU NEED DATA TO
15 INFORM DO YOU NEED A REFINEMENT ON THE FINANCIAL STUFF ALL OF
16 THAT WILL TAKE PLACE PLENTY OF TIME FOR YOU TO SAY NO WE'RE
17 NOT IN OR WE DON'T SUPPORT AND SO I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT
18 EVERYONE UNDERSTANDING THIS IS A FIRST STEP OF A LONG JOURNEY
19 I SEE SENATOR WIENER'S REPRESENTATIVE HERE IN THE ROOM AND
20 HE'S HEARD A LOT OF THESE COMMENTS SO THEY'RE GOING TO
21 CONSIDER A LOT WHAT THEY HEARD TODAY HAS BEEN LOST IN A LOT OF
22 THE DISCUSSION WHEN'S AT STAKE IT'S A MAJOR METROPOLITAN AREA
23 IN THIS COUNTRY AND MAJOR METROPOLITAN AREA IN THE STATE OF
24 CALIFORNIA, FAILING TRANSIT SYSTEM IMPACTS IT'S A RIP THEY
25 WILL GOES THROUGH ALMOST EVERY ASPECT AND EVERY SECTOR IN THE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 TRANSIT DEPENDENT SECTOR THE COMMENTS ABOUT THE BUS SERVICE
2 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT GREENHOUSE GAS, THE LIST GOES ON AND ON,
3 THE RIPPLE EFFECT THROUGH ALL OF OUR COMMUNITIES SO IT'S VERY
4 IMPORTANT THAT THIS METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION AT
5 LEAST ATTEMPT TO TRY TO ADDRESS THIS PROBLEM AS I TRAVEL
6 THROUGH THE REGION I HEARD A LOT OF SUPPORT FOR THE TEN-YEAR
7 MEASURE FOCUSING ON TRANSIT ONLY MAKES YOUR TRANSIT FULLY
8 FUNDED. THE POLL OF THE TWO SCENARIOS THE REASON WHY I THINK
9 YOU HAVE GOT TO DO BOTH IS WE HAVE TO KEEP THE FAITH WITH THE
10 ADVOCATES WE HAVE BEEN MEETING WITH PEOPLE FOR OVER A YEAR ON
11 THESE ISSUES THEY HAVE ASKED FOR THIS GO BIG OPTION AND IT AT
12 LEAST HAS TO BE POLLED AND AT LEAST HAS TO BE CONSIDERED I
13 THINK IT WOULD BE A TRAGEDY FOR US TO SAY NO WE'RE GOING TO
14 DISMISS IT AT THIS STAGE LET THE POLLING HELP DETERMINE WHAT
15 GETS SORTED OUT AND THE POLLING REALLY IS GOING TO HELP US
16 DETERMINE WHAT IS OUR NEXT STEP IT MAY NOT EVEN BE WHAT WE'RE
17 LOOKING AT TODAY BECAUSE WE HAVE TO GET SOMETHING THAT WE CAN
18 GET ACROSS THE FINISH LINE WE SAID FROM THE BEGINNING WE WANT
19 TO ADDRESS THE SHORTFALL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND GET VOTER
20 SUPPORT IT'S BEEN VERY DIFFICULT BALANCING ALL THREE OF THOSE
21 AND FOR THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES COMMISSIONER SAN MATEO THEY
22 HAVE TO BE POLLED AND WE CAN'T LET THEM DRAG DOWN DEALING WITH
23 THIS EMERGENCY BUT IF THE SUPPORT IS THERE I THINK THEY NEED
24 TO BE IN I KNOW IN MY COUNTY THERE'S AN INTEREST IN BEING IN
25 BUT ALL OF THE BAY COUNTIES I HAVE TALKED TO ALL AGREE THAT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 THEY KNOW THEY HAVE ANNE OBLIGATION FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
2 IN SOME FASHION OR ANOTHER SO THAT'S GOING TO BE PART OF --
3 WE'RE NOT PRECLUDING THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE I CAN'T STRESS
4 ENOUGH HOW IMPORTANT IT IS AT LEAST TAKE THE FIRST STEP LET'S
5 GET DATA LET'S GET INFORMATION LET'S DO SOME OF THIS
6 REFINEMENT AND EVERYBODY ASKING FOR AND THEN RECONVENE AND
7 REALLY PUT TOGETHER A PACKAGE THAT THIS WHOLE COMMISSION CAN
8 SUPPORT AND MOVE FORWARD TO ADDRESS THIS PROBLEM WE HAVE DONE
9 A TERRIBLE JOB OF ARTICULATING THE PROBLEM THAT'S IN FRONT OF
10 US BECAUSE IT'S A MAJOR PROBLEM FOR THIS REGION TO HAVE A
11 FAILING OR SCALING BACK TRANSIT SERVICES AND THE ECONOMIC
12 IMPACT WILL BE FELT IN EVERY COMMUNITY IN THIS REGION. I URGE
13 WE TAKE THIS FIRST STEP PLENTY EVER TIME TO REFINE AND WITH
14 THAT MR. CHAIRMAN, I MOVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO PLEASE
15 GO FORWARD WITH THE POLLING AND AT LEAST THIS FRAMEWORK THAT
16 THE COMMITTEE HAS WORKED REAL HARD TO PUT TOGETHER, A
17 FRAMEWORK THAT WE CAN AT LEAST MODIFY AS WE GO ALONG AND
18 ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF THE COUNTY. AND YOU KNOW, I -- AND SAN
19 MATEO AND SANTA CLARA, WE ARE VERY SENSITIVE TO WHAT YOU'RE
20 SAYING. YOU KNOW, I WANT TO COMMEND SANTA CHAIR. THEY STEPPED
21 UP, THEY PUT IT IN WRITING, THEY MADE THESE COMMITMENTS, AND
22 THEY SAID THEY'RE GOING TO COORDINATE WITH OUR MEASURE. I
23 MEAN, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU COULD ASK THEM TO DO MUCH MORE. AND
24 MILLIONS AND MILLIONS OF DOLLARS THEY'RE PUTTING INTO THE
25 SYSTEM CURRENTLY TODAY. AND SO I THINK THOSE ARE



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 CONSIDERATIONS. BUT SAN MATEO, WE'RE GOING TO ADDRESS YOU'RE
2 NEEDS WE'RE GOING TO MAKE SURE FAIR WE INDIVIDUALS THERE
3 AREN'T GOING TO BE ANY DONOR COUNTIES I SAY TO MY FELLOW
4 COMMISSIONERS, WITH THAT MR. CHAIR I MOVE THE STAFF
5 RECOMMENDATION.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I HEARD MOTION BY SPERING SECOND BY
10 GLOVER. WAS THAT GLOVER OR CANEPA?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** I SECONDED IT.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PERFECT. WE HAVE MOTION BY SPERING,
15 SECOND BY CANEPA? DISCUSSION? VICE CHAIR?

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** IS THAT POLLING ALSO THE VARIABLE?

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CLARIFYING QUESTION.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** I GET IT. THIS IS POLLING. AS YOU CAN SEE, CROSS
22 TABS WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY. SO JUST
23 WANT TO MAKE SURE THE INDEPENDENT THIRD PARTY REVIEW IS IN
24 THERE. AND, AGAIN, I HAVE CONCERNS BECAUSE OF WHAT WAS WRITTEN
25 BY MY COUNTY REPRESENTATIVES HERE, AS TO IS THE FOCUS JUST



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 GOING TO BE ON THE TWO SCENARIOS? OR HOW FAR ARE WE GOING TO -
2 - I MEAN, THE INFORMATION IS KEY. BECAUSE WE UNDERSTAND THE
3 PROBLEM. SO, IS IT JUST GOING TO BE HEAVILY ON THE TWO
4 SCENARIOS? OR -- AND I -- AND COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID,
5 YOU'RE GOING TO WORK WITH THE COUNTY. SO I'M HOPING WE HAVE
6 SOME FLEXIBILITY THAT'S WHAT I'M ASKING FOR.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH. COMMISSIONER, WE HAVE BUILT THAT
9 FLEXIBILITY AND WE'RE ADDRESSING CONCERNS BUT IT'S IMPORTANT
10 THAT WE TRY AND MOVE FORWARD AND FIND SOMETHING THAT WE ALL
11 CAN SUPPORT SO WE'RE GOING TO ADDRESS YOUR CONCERNS AND AS I
12 SAID YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO TELL US WHAT
13 QUESTIONS YOU NEED OR WANT ASKED.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

18

19 **NATHAN MILEY:** A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FROM STAFF, WITH AN EXTENT
20 OR TWO. IN TERMS OF THE TIMELINE, WHEN WILL THE POLLING BE
21 ACCOMPLISHED?

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YEAH.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** SO WE'RE PLANNING TO GO OUT IN THE FIELD IN
3 EARLY JANUARY AND THEN WE DON'T EXPECT TO HAVE FULL RESULTS
4 BACK UNTIL THE END OF JANUARY OR EARLY FEBRUARY, SO THEN WE
5 WOULD BE COMING BACK TO THE COMMISSION IN FEBRUARY WITH
6 RESULTS AND A RECOMMENDATION RELATED TO THE LEGISLATION.

7

8 **NATHAN MILEY:** THAT'S WHEN WE WILL HAVE ANOTHER SHOT AT THAT?

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** BECAUSE I DO THINK I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER
13 SPERING, I MEAN KEEPING MY POWDER DRY BECAUSE I DO THINK THIS
14 IS AN ITERATIVE PROCESS, WE NEED TO HEAR FROM THE POLLING GET
15 ALL THE DATA I MEAN WE HAVE HEARD A LOT FROM THE PUBLIC QUITE
16 FRANKLY THERE IS A LOT OF, WHAT PEOPLE ARE SAYING IT'S
17 COMPETING AND I TEND TO BE OP MIST AND SEE THE GLASS HALF FULL
18 AS OPPOSED TO HALF EMPTY BUT I DON'T WANT TO GO DOWN THAT ROAD
19 AND BE PREMATURE. AND MY OPTIMISM AT THE MOMENT, IF I CAN ASK
20 STAFF A QUESTION WITH CITIZEN INITIATIVE WE DON'T HAVE ANY
21 ROLE TO PLAY CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE, RIGHT?

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, ONE OF THE REASONS WHY WE'RE
24 TALKING ABOUT CITIZEN INITIATIVE NEEDING TO BE SOMETHING THAT
25 THE COMMISSION PROVIDES DIRECTION ON IS BECAUSE UNDER CURRENT



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 LAW, THERE IS NO MULTI-COUNTY TRANSPORTATION U TRANSPORTATION
2 AGENCY THAT'S A DISTRICT MTC IS NOT STRUCTURED AS A DISTRICT
3 IN CURRENT LAW IF IT WERE A FOUR COUNTY OR A5 COUNTY MEASURE
4 LET'S SAY THERE WOULD THIS STATUTE WOULD NEED TO CONSTITUTE
5 SOMETHING AS A DISTRICT SO THAT THE VOTERS OF THAT DISTRICT
6 COULD THEN PETITION A MEASURE ON TO THE BALLOT AND WE HAVE HAD
7 QUITE A LOT OF CONVERSATIONS WITH LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL THE
8 OTHER PIECE IS THE STATUTE CAN SPECIFY WHAT THE MEASURE IS FOR
9 AND PROVIDE THOSE KIND OF GUARDRAILS AND POINT OF
10 CLARIFICATION WHAT THE REVENUE MECHANISM IS SO THE PROPOSAL
11 THAT YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT MTC COULD NOT BE INVOLVED RIGHT
12 IN THE SIGNATURE GATHERING ANY OF THAT BUT THERE WOULD BE
13 STRUCTURE THAT FOR THE CITIZEN'S TO INITIATIVE TO PUT ON THE
14 BALLOT DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

15

16 **NATHAN MILEY:** KIND OF INTERESTED IN HEARING MORE ABOUT THAT,
17 ALAMEDA COUNTY WE HAVE BEEN SUE ON A COUPLE OF INITIATIVES
18 THAT WERE AT LEAST I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN SEEING HOW WE
19 CAN ACHIEVE THAT AND NOT LIMITED IN OUR LEGAL EXPOSURE. I'M
20 DONE.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER MILEY. ANY
23 OTHER COMMISSIONERS? MOULTON-PETERS?

24



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JUST BRIEFLY. I WANT TO COME BACK IN
2 TO SAY I'M SUPPORTING THE POLLING OF BOTH, OF ALL THE OPTIONS.
3 AND I DID THINK THE TITLE SIX EQUITY ANALYSIS THAT WAS
4 SUGGESTED WOULD BE USEFUL MOST ARE TRANSIT RIDERS WHO ARE
5 TRANSIT DEPENDENT I THINK IT'S USEFUL TO DO THAT WANT TO GET
6 THAT ON THE RECORD.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION ON THE FLOOR BY SPERING SECOND
9 BY CAN PAMPHLET COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** JUST READY.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU'RE READY. APPRECIATE IT. MY
14 COLLEAGUE FROM SONOMA IS READY. I LIKE IT. ROLL CALL.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:**

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

22

23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KAPLAN?



1

2 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN? MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** ABSTAIN.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE MOTION PASSES WITH 15 AYES ONE

25 ABSTENTION.



DECEMBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT COMMISSIONERS THANK YOU VERY
3 MUCH FOR YOUR DIALOGUE AND AGAIN THANK YOU TO COMMISSIONER
4 SPERING FOR ALL YOUR LEADERSHIP. AND TO ALL THE COMMISSIONERS.
5 YOU ALL PUT A LOT OF TIME AND ENERGY ON IT. TO OUR STAFF,
6 THANK YOU FOR HOARDING THIS TOGETHER. AND IT'S A LOT OF WORK
7 FOR A VERY IMPORTANT TASK. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO
8 PROCEED TO ITEM SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF
11 CORRESPONDENCE FROM THE MAYOR OF UNION CITY, CAROL DUTRA-
12 VERNACI, THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND WAS
13 DISTRIBUTED TO EACH OF YOU. THERE ARE NO HAND RAISED IN THE
14 ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM IN THE
15 BOARDROOM.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO
18 ITEM EIGHT. ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING FOR THE COMMISSION
19 IS GOING TO BE WEDNESDAY SEPTEMBER 18TH. PLEASE JOIN US AT THE
20 HUB CAFE FOR A FAREWELL TO COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. THANK
21 YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]

22



NTT

Broadcasting Government