

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE**

2 **MONDAY, AUGUST 26TH, 2024, 9:30 AM**

3
4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD MORNING. I'D LIKE TO CALL THE ORDER
6 OF THE MEETING OF THE REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE. THIS
7 COMMITTEE IS MEETING WITH THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
8 COMMISSION THIS MORNING. WE WILL HAVE COMMISSIONERS WITH US.
9 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE M.T.C. WEBSITE. MEMBERS
10 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND
11 FEATURE OR STAR 9 AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
12 TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST
13 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
14 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBERS'
15 PARTICIPATION TODAY. WILL THE CLERK CALL THE ROLL OF THE
16 SELECT COMMITTEE FIRST, IF YOU WOULD, PLEASE?

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. CHAIR SPERING. CHAIR
19 SPERING.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ARANTES. MEMBER CANEPA.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE. >CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND: MEMBER JOHN-
2 BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. MEMBER JOSEFOWITZ.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** HE'S HERE IN THE BUILDING.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** HE'S HERE BUT ROAMING. MEMBER
7 LAWRENCE IS ABSENT. LET'S SEE. ABSENT FOR ROLL CALL. MEMBER
8 LEON. LEE MEMBER LINDSAY. MEMBER MAHAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER MILEY
9 IS ABSENT. MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS.

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER RABBITT IS ABSENT. MEMBER WU
14 IS ABSENT. MR. WUNDERMAN IS HERE. AND WE DO HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE REQUEST FOR REMOTE
17 PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B. 429 FROM COMMITTEE MEMBER CINDY
18 CHAVEZ. DO YOU WANT TO --

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES, THANK YOU. I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE
21 REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449 BECAUSE OF AN ILLNESS. THERE IS ONE
22 PERSON OVER 18 IN THE ROOM WHO IS MY STAFF AND THAT IS ALEC.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. HOPE YOU FEEL BETTER.

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WILL THE CLERK TAKE THE ROLL OF THE
4 COMMISSION, PLEASE?

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** I WILL. THANK YOU, CHAIR. JUST TO
7 NOTE THAT WE DO HAVE MEMBER LAWRENCE, MEMBER MOHTASHEMI AS
8 PANELISTS. THEY JUST WILL NOT COUNT TOWARDS THE ROLL. FOR THE
9 COMMISSION ROLL CALL. CHAIR PEDROZA IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR
10 JOSEFOWITZ. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
11 CANEPA.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** COMMISSIONER FLEMMING IS ABSENCE.
18 COMMISSIONER GLOVER IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT.
19 COMMISSIONER MILEY IS HERE. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS.
20 COMMISSIONER RABBITT IS ABSENCE. NONVOTING MEMBER SCHAAF IS
21 ABSENT. WE DO NOT HAVE A QUORUM WITH THE COMMISSION.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. FIRST, I JUST HAVE A FEW
24 OPENING COMMENTS. I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE THAT HAS REACHED
25 OUT TO ME AND I'VE BEEN MEETING WITH AS MANY OF THE TRANSIT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 OPERATORS, INTERESTED PARTIES, AND MANY INDIVIDUALS ON THIS
2 ISSUE. THE ONE THING THAT, YOU KNOW, AS I TALKED TO ALL OF
3 THESE VARIOUS GROUPS, I ASK IF ADDRESSING THIS FISCAL CLIFF IS
4 IMPORTANT AND ALMOST TO THE PERSON ANSWERS YES. NOW, WHEN YOU
5 ASK THE NEXT QUESTION IS, HOW DO WE GET THERE, THAT'S WHERE
6 THERE'S A LOT OF CERTAINLY VARIED OPINIONS ON WHAT WE SHOULD
7 DO OR HOW WE SHOULD DO IT. BUT I DO WANT TO THANK EVERYONE
8 THAT HAS TAKEN THE TIME TO MEET WITH ME AS I TRAVELED
9 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. I JUST WANT TO TOUCH ON SOME OF THE
10 THEMES THAT I HEARD THAT REALLY HAVE BEEN -- THIS COMMON
11 THREAD HAS BEEN THROUGH MOST OF THE MEETINGS I HAD IS DEMAND
12 FOR REFORM AND ACCOUNTABILITY HAS TO BE PART OF THIS MEASURE.
13 ELECTED OFFICIALS WANT TO TRUST THE NUMBERS AND NOT FEEL THAT
14 THEY ARE INVESTING IN A BALLOONING PROBLEM, EVEN CALLED FOR AN
15 INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT. DESIRE FOR A TRUE PARTNERSHIP WITH AN
16 UNDERSTANDING THAT MORE FINDING WILL BE COUPLED WITH THE
17 EFFICIENCIES BY OPERATORS. STRONG SENTIMENT AROUND SALES TAX
18 AND COUNTIES DON'T WANT TO EXPORT THEIR REVENUES TO FUND LOCAL
19 SERVICES OUTSIDE THEIR COUNTIES. THE -- WHAT HAPPENS, YOU
20 KNOW, AS TIME GOES ON, THE URGENCY SEEMS TO START TO FADE BUT
21 THIS IS A VERY SERIOUS CRISIS THAT FACES THIS REGION AND
22 SOMETHING THAT WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PUBLIC
23 UNDERSTANDS WHAT'S AT STAKE HERE. AND I THINK OUR ELECTED
24 OFFICIALS AND ALL THE VARIOUS LEGISLATORS, ELECTED OFFICIALS
25 AND INTEREST GROUPS NEED TO COME TOGETHER TO TRY TO HELP SOLVE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THIS I THINK LOOMING PROBLEM THAT IS HEADED IN OUR FUTURE. I
2 WANT TO CALL ATTENTION TO THE INFORMATION REQUESTED BY THE
3 COMMITTEE. [PHONE CALL] WHO IS THAT FOR, DAVID?

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THAT'S FOR YOU. THE ATTACHMENT ONE HAS FOR
6 BART AND CALTRAIN. AND ATTACHMENT TWO FROM THE DRAFT 2025
7 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM. ATTACHMENT THREE ARE FACTS
8 TIPS ON TRANSIT, TRANSPORTATION, FARE INTEGRATIONS, TRANSIT
9 PRIORITY, AND ACCESSIBILITY. ATTACHMENT 4 IS A HIGH-LEVEL
10 OVERVIEW OF TRANSIT 2050. M.T.C.'S LONG TRANSIT PLAN WHICH
11 WILL FEED INTO THE UPDATE TO THE PLAN BARRIER 2050. ATTACHMENT
12 5 SUM ADVISES M.T.C.'S SURVEY RESULTS. I'LL ADD MY REQUEST
13 M.T.C. STAFF CONDUCTED A BRIEF OUTLINE SURVEY OVER THE LAST
14 MONTH THAT OVER 1,600 BAY AREA RESIDENTS COMPLETED. ALMOST 70%
15 OF THOSE THAT TOOK TIME TO COMPLETE THE SURVEY WERE FREQUENT
16 TRANSIT RIDERS, WHICH MADE PROBABLY A GOOD AUDIENCE TO HEAR
17 FROM -- ON THIS SUBJECT AND EVEN IF NOT REPRESENTED, EVERYONE
18 IN THE REGION. AND THIS IS THE GROUP THAT RODE ALL THROUGH THE
19 PANDEMIC, THIS GROUP RODE TRANSIT. THEY'RE TRANSIT DEPENDENT
20 OR PEOPLE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF TRANSIT. FREQUENCY AND EXPANDED
21 SERVICE TO MORE PLACES WERE THE TOP IMPROVEMENTS THEY'RE
22 LOOKING FOR, FOLLOWED BY IMPROVED SAFETY. OVER 10% OF THOSE
23 WHO RESPONDED NOTE THAT -- HAVE A DISABILITY THAT AFFECTS
24 THEIR MOBILITY AND THAT THE SURVEY COLLECTED FEEDBACK ON THEIR
25 TOP CONCERNS. THERE ARE MORE DETAILS IN ATTACHMENT 5 OF MY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 REPORT. BACK TO THE FOCUS ON TODAY'S MEETING BASED ON THE
2 INPUT LAST MONTH BASED ON WHAT I HEARD. WE CREATED TWO
3 SCENARIOS AND WE NEED YOUR FEEDBACK ON THEM TODAY. IT'S
4 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT THAT WE HEAR FROM YOU ON THESE SCENARIOS
5 THAT WE'RE PRESENTING. THERE'S GOING TO BE PLENTY OPPORTUNITY
6 FOR CHANGE, MODIFICATIONS. THIS IS VERY FLUID PROCESS THAT
7 WE'RE GOING THROUGH. WE SNOWED THESE SCENARIOS TO THE REVENUE
8 MEASURE EXECUTIVE GROUP ON FRIDAY. THIS IS A GROUP OF TRANSIT
9 AGENCY LEADERS THAT ARE PLAYING AN ADVISORY ROLE TO THE
10 PROCESS AND THEY WERE FOCUSED ON FINDING THAT COMMON WAY
11 FORWARD. OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR CHAIRS THIS GROUP ANDY WAS
12 THERE AND HE'S GOING TO HAVE A COUPLE COMMENTS IN A MINUTE. I
13 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE COMMITTEE THAT GIVES STAFF AND
14 GIVE US TIME TO REALLY LOOK AT YOUR CONCERNS, WHAT YOU LIKE US
15 TO LOOK AT. THERE WILL BE PLENTY OF TIME TO SAY NO. AS A
16 MATTER OF FACT, YOU WILL HAVE A YEAR TO SAY NO. WE'RE HOPING
17 TO TRY AND FIND A SOLUTION THAT ADDRESSES THIS BE PRO. I WANT
18 TO -- THIS PROBLEM. I WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE, I HATE TO USE
19 THE WORD FINANCIAL CLIFF, THE FINANCIAL CHALLENGES THAT THE
20 OPERATORS HAVE WHICH IS NOT GOING AWAY, AND SO THAT REALLY
21 NEEDS TO BE OUR FOCUS. SO WE HAVE TO FIND A BALANCE BETWEEN
22 SOLVING THIS PROBLEM AND BRINGING THE REFORM THAT'S NEEDED
23 FORWARD AND SOMETHING THAT THE VOTERS CAN SUPPORT. JUST A VERY
24 DELICATE BALANCE THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH AS WE GO FORWARD. I
25 JUST REALLY ASK THAT EVERYONE HAS A LITTLE PATIENCE AS WE GO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THROUGH THIS PROCESS, GIVE US YOUR OPINION, TELL US WHAT YOU
2 THINK WE NEED TO CHANGE, WHAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS, WHICH WILL
3 BE VERY HELPFUL AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS. THE LAST THING
4 I WANT TO SAY BEFORE I HAND IT OVER TO ANDY, I ASKED OUR STAFF
5 TO ANALYZE HOW MUCH FLEXIBILITY CAN WE GET IN A MEASURE THAT
6 WE GIVE TO THE LEGISLATURE? YOU KNOW, SOME PEOPLE DON'T WANT
7 SALES TAX. SOME DON'T WANT PROPERTY TAX. SOME DON'T WANT
8 PARCEL TAX OR PAYROLL TAX. THERE'S A LOT OF VARIETY HERE. WE
9 NEED TO HAVE AS MUCH LATITUDE AS WE CAN BECAUSE POLLING A YEAR
10 FROM NOW IS GOING TO BE A HECK OF A LOT DIFFERENT THAN IT IS
11 TODAY. THIS PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION I THINK IS GOING TO MAKE A
12 BIG DIFFERENCE, YOU KNOW. WE MAY HAVE SOMEONE IN THE WHITE
13 HOUSE THAT'S VERY FAMILIAR WITH THIS REGION AND UNDERSTANDS
14 THE IMPORTANCE OF WHAT WE'RE GOING THROUGH. AND SO THERE'S A
15 LOT OF THINGS THAT ARE GOING TO BE IN PLAY AND WE NEED TO HAVE
16 AS MUCH FLEXIBILITY TO REALLY ADDRESS THE CONCERNS AND ISSUES
17 THAT ALL OF YOU HAVE AND SO I JUST URGE YOU TO BE PATIENT.
18 LET'S FIND SOMETHING WE CAN SEND TO THE LEGISLATURE AND WE CAN
19 ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND WITH THAT I
20 WILL HAND IT OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ANDY, WHO HAD
21 GREAT FEEDBACK.

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. ANDREW FREMIER,
24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AT M.T.C. I -- THE TRANSPORTATION
25 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AGENCIES AS WELL AS ALL THE GENERAL



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 MANAGERS BIG AND SMALL AND WE TRY TO MEET BEFORE THIS MEETING
2 AND GO OVER THE INFORMATION THAT YOU'RE GOING TO BE TALKING
3 ABOUT SO THAT PEOPLE ARE ALL SINGING FROM THE SAME SHEET OF
4 MUSIC AND HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO GIVE US ANY INPUT AS THEY SEE
5 FIT. FRIDAY WAS OUR MEETING AND I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
6 THE REFRAIN WAS POSITIVE. I THINK PEOPLE WERE VERY FREE ABOUT
7 WHAT THEY HAD TO SAY. THE MOST COMMON REFRAIN, THOUGH, WAS
8 REALLY A LOT OF GRATITUDE FOR CHAIR SPERING BEATING THE
9 PAVEMENT. I KNOW ALIX AND I HAVE BEEN TRYING TO KEEP UP WITH
10 HIM. I DON'T KNOW HOW HE'S DOING IT. BUT HE'S BEEN GOING TO
11 SPEAK WITH ALL OF THE VARIOUS STAKEHOLDERS WHETHER THEY'RE
12 PART OF PUBLIC AGENCIES OR ADVOCACY GROUPS. HE'S TALKED A LOT
13 TO LOCAL LEGISLATURES, HE'S BEEN UP IN SAN FRANCISCO AND EVEN
14 SOME OF THE FEDERAL PARTICIPANTS REALLY TRYING TO FIND OUT AND
15 LISTEN IN TERMS OF WHAT KINDS OF CONCERNS THEY HAVE. I DO
16 THINK THERE WAS A SENSE THAT MOST OF THE PEOPLE AT THE DAIS
17 FELT THE SCENARIOS RESPOND TO MANY OF THE PROBLEMS THAT HAVE
18 BEEN EXPRESSED IN THE PAST FEW MONTHS. FOR INSTANCE, THE
19 SCENARIOS BOTH HAVE AN IMMEDIATE AND INTENSE FOCUS TO SUPPORT
20 SUSTAINING TRANSIT SERVICE IN THE REGION, AT LEAST IN THE
21 FIRST SERVICE YEARS. I DON'T THINK IT'S A SURPRISE THERE'S A
22 LOT OF LINGERING CONCERNS. TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ACKNOWLEDGING
23 THEIR DEFICITS ARE ACTUALLY MOVING IN THE WRONG DIRECTION AND
24 THEY'RE CONCERNED THAT SCENARIO ONE DOESN'T ADEQUATELY ADDRESS
25 THE FUNDING GAP. AND EVEN SCENARIO TWO LEAVES GAPS FOR MOST OF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THE OTHER PLAYERS IN THE PICTURE. THERE'S ALSO A CONCERN THAT
2 BOTH SCENARIOS REDUCE THE DEDICATED FUNDING TO OPERATORS AT
3 CERTAIN POINTS IN TIME AND DON'T REALLY OUTLINE HOW THE
4 OPERATORS ARE EXPECTED TO MAKE UP THAT GAP. FOLLOWING DOWN THE
5 CONCERN LINE, IT'S, AGAIN, NOTHING NEW, BUT THE REVENUE
6 MECHANISM MAY BE A SALES TAX THAT COMPETES WITH THEIR OWN
7 RENEWALS AND OTHER COUNTYWIDE NEEDS. THERE IS DIFFERENT
8 INTERPRETATIONS OF THE DIFFERENT MULTIFUNDING AGREEMENTS AND
9 COUNTY CONTRIBUTIONS FOR BART AND CALTRAIN AND THIS AFFECTS, I
10 THINK, THE LOCAL BUSES IN PARTICULAR, IN THE EAST BAY AS WELL.
11 AND THEN, THE QUESTION OF WHETHER OR NOT FIVE COUNTIES SHOULD
12 BE PART OF SCENARIO ONE. AND SO THIS QUESTION ABOUT OPTING IN,
13 I THINK, IS A PLACE THAT WE KNOW WE WILL BE TALKING ABOUT OVER
14 THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS AND STUART IS GOING TO PROVIDE SOME
15 MORE DETAILS TO THAT IN HIS ITEM. ONE LAST POINT OF
16 RECOGNITION THAT I HAD IS THAT, YOU KNOW, OUR GOAL IS TO
17 REALLY TRY TO GET TO THIS FINISH LINE IN THE SCHEDULE YOU PUT
18 OUT BECAUSE IT'S IMPORTANT, AND WE LEARNED THIS LESSON BOTH IN
19 1031 THE FIRST TIME AROUND AND FRANKLY IN THE HOUSING MEASURE
20 THAT WE NEED TO SPEND A LOT OF TIME TO EDUCATE THE PUBLIC IF
21 WE ACTUALLY WANT TO GET TO THE FINISH LINE OF A POSITIVE VOTE.
22 AND WE'RE ALSO GOING TO HAVE TO CONTINUE TO FIND OTHER REVENUE
23 SOURCES THROUGH STATE AND FEDERAL OPPORTUNITIES IF AT ALL
24 AVAILABLE BECAUSE THE FUNDING LANDSCAPE WILL CHANGE OVER THE
25 LIFE OF THIS. AND SO THE SOONER WE CAN GET UNDER WAY IN THAT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 SPACE THE BETTER SUCCESS THAT WE WILL HAVE. FINALLY, I WOULD
2 SAY THERE IS A SENSE OF URGENCY GROWING AROUND THE TRANSIT
3 AGENCIES, IN PARTICULAR, AS WE MOVE IN THE LAST QUARTER OF THE
4 YEAR KNOWING THAT NEXT YEAR IS REALLY THE FINAL SHOT TO PASS
5 LEGISLATION FOR A MEASURE IN NOVEMBER OF '26. THE OPERATORS
6 NEED A SOLUTION THEY CAN COUNT ON SO THEY CAN MOVE FORWARD
7 PROPERLY. AND YOU'VE HEARD THAT FROM THEM IN THE PAST. THE
8 REAL HARD DECISION FOR M.T.C. HAS -- TO MAKE AROUND THE
9 HOUSING BOND THIS MONTH IS ALSO A CHALLENGE FOR US GOING
10 FORWARD, AS CHAIR SPERING HAS MENTIONED, WE NOW HAVE TO
11 DISCUSS THE OPPORTUNITIES OF MOVING FORWARD IN BOTH PATHS AND
12 WHAT THE RIGHT SCHEDULE IT IS. YOU WILL ALSO SEE CONTINUED
13 DISCUSSIONS AROUND VOTERS' APPETITE FOR NEW TAXES, AND WE DO
14 SEE THAT THE PATH FORWARD IS REALLY GETTING THE COMMITTEE
15 BEHIND A RECOMMENDATION SO THAT WE CAN START TO WORK ON THOSE
16 AS STRONG CHAMPIONS AND AS A REGION THAT'S UNITED. SO THAT'S
17 MY REPORT, CHAIR SPERING AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS
18 IF THERE ARE SOME.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ANY QUESTIONS? OKAY. ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU,
21 ANDY. THE NEXT ITEM IS THE MINUTES FROM OUR JULY 29 MEETING.
22 CONSENT CALENDAR FOR THE COMMITTEE. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO
23 ACCEPT?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** DID YOU GET THE MOVERS OF THE MOTION?

5 OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON --

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN

8 CORRESPONDENCE WITH THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE

9 BOARDROOM WISHING TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM NOR IN ZOOM WITH

10 THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** IF THERE ARE NO FURTHER COMMENTS FROM THE

13 COMMITTEE, THEN WE'LL TAKE A ROLL, PLEASE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WITH THE MOTION BY CANEPA AND

16 SECOND BY NOACK. CHAIR SPERING.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ARANTES. ARKANSAS YES.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT.
2 MEMBER JOSEFOWITZ. MEMBER LEON. MEMBER MAHAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER
3 MOULTON-PETERS.

4

5 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER RABBITT IS ABSENT. MEMBER
8 WU.

9

10 **ELLEN WU:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ITEM PASSES.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** LET'S MOVE TO ITEM NUMBER FOUR. OH, I'M
15 SORRY. ADINA, YOU HAVE YOUR HANDS RAISED.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** I AM GOING TO BE THERE SHORTLY.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND ITEM 4-A, STUART, I WANT TO THANK YOU
20 FOR ALL OF THE WORK YOU ARE DOING BEHIND THE SCENES AND
21 MEETINGS I HAVE BEEN GOING TO. THE RIGHT GUY AT THE RIGHT TIME
22 FOR THE RIGHT ISSUES. I REALLY WANT TO APPRECIATE ALL YOUR
23 HARD WORK. STUART, HAND IT OVER TO YOU.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I'M JUST FOLLOWING YOUR LEAD.
2 I'D LIKE TO REVIEW THE REMAINING TIMELINE. AND AT THE
3 SEPTEMBER MEETING IN FOUR WEEKS, WE WILL SEE IF WE CAN NARROW
4 DOWN TO ONE SCENARIO. ALSO, I WANT TO ASK IF WE CAN BRING UP
5 THE SLIDE DECK AT THIS TIME. SO AFTER THE SEPTEMBER MEETING,
6 WE HAVE ANOTHER FOUR WEEKS TO FINALIZE A PROPOSAL THAT CAN
7 ACHIEVE SOME CONSENSUS SUPPORT AT OUR FINAL MEETING ON OCTOBER
8 21. SO THIS IS COMING UP VERY QUICKLY IN EIGHT WEEKS. IT WILL
9 BE A SPRINT AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE ENCOURAGING YOU TO BE TODAY
10 CREATIVE, BOLD, A VERY OPEN ABOUT CONCERNS AND IDEAS BECAUSE
11 WE NEED TO START BRINGING THIS TOGETHER. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE GOT
12 FOUR QUESTIONS TO FOCUS ON TODAY. AND I REALLY WANT TO
13 EMPHASIZE QUESTION THREE. ARE THERE CHANGES TO THE SCENARIOS
14 THAT COULD BUILD REGIONAL CONSENSUS? WE'VE DONE OUR BEST TO
15 PUT OUT A STRONG FIRST DRAFT. BUT WE ACKNOWLEDGE IS JUST
16 VERSION ONE. I DO BELIEVE WE CAN HAVE A GREAT VERSION BY
17 OCTOBER. BEFORE REVIEWING THE SCENARIOS, LET'S LOOK BACK AT
18 THE PRIMARY FACTORS WE USED IN DESIGNING THEM. NEXT SLIDE. THE
19 FIRST FUNDAMENTAL ISSUE WE'RE SOLVING FOR IS THAT POSTPANDEMIC
20 REMOTE WORK TRENDS HAVE REALLY REDUCED TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. WE
21 KNOW THAT THE COMMUTE FOCUSED OPERATORS ARE LOSING THE MOST
22 REVENUES. AND MUNI HAVE ALSO TAKEN A BIG HIT AS OTHER FUNDING
23 SOURCES FOR THEM HAVE DECLINED. AND WHILE THERE ARE HUGE NEEDS
24 NOW, WE ALSO KNOW THERE ARE VARIOUS WAYS TO SUSTAIN, EXPAND,
25 AND ACTUALLY IMPROVE THE SERVICE WE HAVE OUT TODAY. WE'RE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 SEEING SOME OF THAT WITH MUNI IN THEIR TRANSIT PRIORITY LANES.
2 AND THAT FIRST NUMBER OF SUBBULLETS THERE SHOW SOME OF THEM
3 AND ONE OF THEM IS DEFINITELY BUILDING RIDERSHIP WITH
4 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN IS ONE --
5 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IS ONE OF THE THINGS WE
6 THINK NEEDS TO HAPPEN. NEXT SLIDE. FUNDING FOR ELEMENTS OF
7 THAT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ARE INCLUDED IN BOTH
8 SCENARIOS. IN OUR SLIDES, WE'LL REFER TO THESE FOR KIND OF A
9 SHORTHAND AS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. THE CHAIR'S REPORT
10 INCLUDES MORE DETAILS ON THE MAIN ELEMENTS THAT ARE PICTURED
11 HERE, BUT THEY INCLUDE FARE INTEGRATION, TRANSIT PRIORITY,
12 MAPPING, WAY FINDING AND ACCESSIBILITY. NEXT SLIDE. THE THIRD
13 KEY FACTOR WE'RE DESIGNING FOR ARE THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
14 NEEDS. THIS IS ESPECIALLY TRUE IN SCENARIO ONE BECAUSE IT
15 PROPOSES A HALF CENT SALES TAX, AND WE ARE EXTREMELY COGNIZANT
16 THAT LOCAL SALES TAX BEGINS TO EXPIRE IN EIGHT YEARS.
17 FURTHERMORE, IN JUST -- BY 2028, WE'VE HEARD THAT SAM MATEO
18 AND CONTRA COSTA MAY CONSIDER EARLY RENEWALS OF THOSE MEASURES
19 AND WITH THOSE THREE FACTORS, LET'S GET A HIGH-LEVEL VIEW OF
20 BOTH OF THE SCENARIOS. NEXT SLIDE. SO SCENARIO ONE ON THE
21 LEFT, WE'RE CALLING THE CORE TRANSIT FRAMEWORK. AND IT'S
22 PROPOSED AS A 30-YEAR HALF CENT SALES TAX AS A BASE, IT
23 INCLUDES THE COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO,
24 AND IS A MATEO. IT WOULD BE OPT IN FOR THE OTHER FIVE COUNTIES
25 WITH SOME REQUIREMENTS THAT I'LL GO INTO DETAILS LATER. IN THE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 FOUR BASE COUNTIES IT WOULD GENERATE \$540 MILLION PER YEAR.
2 AND IF ALL NINE OPTED IN, IT WOULD BE APPROXIMATELY \$1
3 BILLION. SCENARIO TWO, WE'RE CALLING GO BIG, AND THIS IS ALSO
4 FOR 30 YEARS. IT STARTS WITH ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES, AND
5 IT WOULD GENERATE ABOUT \$1.5 BILLION A YEAR THROUGH EITHER A
6 PER SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX OR PAYROLL TAX. NOW, BEFORE WE DIVE
7 EVEN DEEPER, I WANT TO PROVIDE JUST A LITTLE MORE CONTEXT.
8 NEXT SLIDE. THE FIRST THING THAT THESE ARE INITIAL POLICY
9 FRAMEWORKS. WE EXPECT SOME UNDERLYING FINANCIAL FIGURES. MAY
10 STILL GET UPDATED. IDEALLY, THE DISCUSSION TODAY CAN REALLY
11 FOCUS ON IMPROVING THE UNDERLYING CONCEPTS AND THE POTENTIAL
12 CHANGES THAT WE CAN SEE IN THE FRAMEWORKS. THE OTHER CONTEXT
13 IS THAT THE MEASURE, AS WE KNOW, CAN'T BE THE ONLY SOLUTION.
14 NEXT SLIDE. NOW, WE SHOWED THIS SLIDE AT THE LAST MEETING, BUT
15 IT JUST BEARS REPEATING. THIS MEASURE CAN MAKE REALLY
16 MEANINGFUL CONTRIBUTIONS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT AS IT SHIFTS TO
17 THIS POSTPANDEMIC BUSINESS MODEL. FOR EXAMPLE, IN SCENARIO
18 ONE, IT WOULD COVER FARE REVENUE LOSSES SINCE 2019. SCENARIO
19 TWO PROVIDES EVEN MORE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. BUT NEITHER WILL
20 FULLY ADDRESS THE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING CHALLENGES WE HAVE AS
21 A REGION AND WE'LL CONTINUE WORKING TOGETHER ON THAT. SO WITH
22 THAT, NOW WE CAN GET INTO THE DETAILS. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE'RE
23 CALLING THIS ONE, THE CORE TRANSIT SCENARIO, SCENARIO ONE, AND
24 YOU CAN SEE IN BLUE ARE THE BASELINE COUNTIES. NOW, THIS ONE
25 STARTS WITH 10% OFF THE TOP FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FOR ALL



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 30 YEARS TO SUPPORT RIDERSHIP GROWTH. AND FOR THE REMAINING
2 90%, WHAT WE'VE DONE IS INTRODUCE A TEMPORAL ELEMENT. AND THIS
3 IS TO TRY TO HELP THREAD THE NEEDLE BETWEEN THESE IMMEDIATE
4 AND URGENT NEEDS THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING, AND THEN
5 THE LONGER TERM NEEDS TO SUPPORT OUR COUNTY PRIORITIES. AND AS
6 I MENTIONED, NO COUNTY HAS A SALES TAX THAT EXPIRES BEFORE
7 2034, AND SO WHAT THAT ALLOWS US TO DO IN THIS SCENARIO IS
8 DURING THESE FIRST EIGHT YEARS, THE 90% OF FUNDS, AFTER
9 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WOULD ALL BE USED TO OFFSET THE LOSS
10 OF FARE REVENUES. THIS WOULD MITIGATE SERVICE IMPACTS AT BART,
11 CALTRAIN, A.C. TRANSIT AND MUNI, PLUS FUNDING FOR THE SMALL
12 OPERATORS IN ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES. AS WE'LL SOON
13 SEE WITH MUNI AT THIS FUNDING LEVEL, MUNI WILL STILL HAVE A
14 PRETTY SIGNIFICANT GAP. NOW, IN YEARS NINE TO 15, WHEN SOME OF
15 THOSE COUNTY SALES TAXES START TO EXPIRE, THE LEVEL FOR
16 TRANSIT FUNDING WOULD BE REDUCED, LEAVING 50% OF THE FUNDS FOR
17 COUNTY FLEX. I'LL JUST REMIND FOLKS, COUNTY FLEX IS VERY
18 FLEXIBLE, AND SO THAT COULD GO TOWARDS TRANSIT FUNDING. AND
19 STARTING IN YEAR 16, 90% OF IT IS COUNTY FLEX. LET'S GO TO THE
20 NEXT SLIDE AND DIG IN A LITTLE DEEPER TO IT. THESE FIRST EIGHT
21 YEARS, WE FEEL, CAN BE AN IMPORTANT RUNWAY FOR AGENCIES TO
22 BUILD THEIR FARE REVENUE AS WELL AS OTHER SOURCES OF FUNDS.
23 WE'VE HEARD FROM MANY CORNERS THAT THERE SHOULD BE A REVIEW
24 PARTWAY THROUGH THIS PERIOD SO IF, BY CHANCE, LESS FUNDS ARE
25 NEEDED, THERE COULD BE A PARTIAL REDUCTION IN OPERATING



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 SUPPORT. AS MENTIONED, WE DON'T KNOW WHO IS GOING TO BE IN THE
2 WHITE HOUSE. WE DON'T KNOW WHAT SUPPORT WE ARE GOING TO GET
3 FROM THE STATE, SO THAT KIND OF REVIEW IS BEING PROPOSED AT
4 YEAR FIVE. IN YEARS NINE TO 15, 40% OF THE FUNDS WILL BE
5 DIRECTED TO TRANSIT, AND 50% TO COUNTY FLEX. AND I WANTED TO
6 POINT OUT AT THIS TIME THERE WILL BE NO DEDICATED FUNDS FROM
7 MUNI FROM THAT TRANSIT POT. BUT, LIKE WITH ALL COUNTIES, S.F.
8 COULD USE THEIR COUNTY FLEX TO SUPPORT TRANSIT. IN IN CASE, IT
9 WOULD BE ABOUT \$50 MILLION A YEAR FROM MUNI. FINALLY, IN YEARS
10 16 TO 30 WHEN ALL OF THE 90% FLOWS TO COUNTY FLEX, TRANSIT
11 SERVICE REMAINS AN ELIGIBLE EXPENSE. NOW, THESE ARE A LOT OF
12 WORDS ON THE PAGE AND I KNOW THERE'S A LOT OF VISUAL LEARNER'S
13 OUT THERE. SO IF WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, YOU'RE THE ONES TO
14 REALLY APPRECIATE THIS. AND SO THE GREEN AREA HERE SHOWS HOW
15 90% OF THE FUNDING IN THE FIRST EIGHT YEARS SUPPORT TRANSIT
16 SERVICE. THAT LITTLE BLUE BAR AT THE BOTTOM THAT GOES ACROSS
17 IS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND THAT EXTENDS FOR ALL 30 YEARS.
18 AND YOU CAN SEE WHERE THAT TRANSIT FUNDING TAPERS DOWN IN
19 YEARS NINE TO 15. AND AT THAT POINT, THE YELLOW COUNTY FLEX
20 KICKS IN. AND THEN, AFTER YEAR 15 AND YEAR 16, IT ALL 90% GOES
21 TO COUNTY FLEX. AND SO WHAT I WANT TO DO NOW IS TAKE YOU
22 THROUGH HOW THIS WOULD IMPACT EACH OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS.
23 NEXT SLIDE. SO THESE FOUR BARS REPRESENT THE TYPE OF
24 SHORTFALLS WE'VE BEEN DISCUSSING. SO LET ME DESCRIBE THE BARS
25 FIRST AND THEN WE'LL GO INTO OTHER PARTS OF THE GRAPH. THE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 ADJUSTED FARES IS IN GREEN, AND THAT IS NEW. AND THAT IS THE
2 FARE LOSSES. I JUST WANT TO DESCRIBE THE FARE LOSSES SINCE THE
3 PANDEMIC CALCULATED AS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN WHAT HAPPENED IN
4 F.Y. 2019 AND THEN F.Y. '24 OR '25 BUDGETED, SLIGHTLY
5 DIFFERENT FOR EACH AGENCIES, BUT BASICALLY IT'S THE FARE
6 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN 2019 AND 2024 OR 2025. WE'VE ADDED A 2%
7 UPWARDS ADJUSTMENT FACTOR. NOW, THIS ADJUSTED FARES IS WHAT
8 WE'RE GOING TO BE WORKING TO SOLVE FOR IN SCENARIO ONE. THE
9 OPERATOR SHORTFALLS ON THE RIGHT REPRESENT THE FORECASTS FOR
10 FISCAL YEAR 2026, 2027, SO WHEN THIS MEASURE WOULD START. AND
11 THIS IS BASED ON THE MOST RECENT INFORMATION PROVIDED TO
12 M.T.C. A LOT OF IT JUST IN THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS. SINCE
13 WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE THESE ADJUSTED FARES, BART WOULD RECEIVE
14 ALMOST THEIR -- THAT FULL BAR. IT WILL RECEIVE ABOUT \$300
15 MILLION PER YEAR AS REPRESENTED BY, YOU CAN SEE, THAT
16 HORIZONTAL DASH LINE. SO EVEN WITH THIS \$300 MILLION, BART
17 WILL BE EXPECTING AN \$85 MILLION GAP IN 2026-2027. NOW, BART'S
18 FUNDING WOULD DECREASE IN YEARS NINE TO 15 TO APPROXIMATELY
19 \$160 MILLION, AND YOU CAN SEE THAT LOWER DASHED LINE. FOR
20 THOSE OF YOU WITH GOOD EYESIGHT, THAT IS SUPPOSED TO SAY NINE
21 TO 15 BUT IT IS SUPPOSED TO SAY NINE TO 16 THERE. PLEASE
22 EXCUSE US ON THAT. NEXT SLIDE. A.C. TRANSIT WOULD RECEIVE \$30
23 MILLION IN THE FIRST EIGHT YEARS. THAT WILL GO DOWN TO
24 APPROXIMATELY \$20 MILLION THROUGH YEAR 15. NEXT SLIDE.
25 CALTRAIN WOULD RECEIVE \$70 MILLION IN THE FIRST YEARS GOING



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 DOWN TO \$40 MILLION. NEXT SLIDE. AND MUNI WOULD RECEIVE \$90
2 MILLION IN THE FIRST EIGHT YEARS. NOW, IT DOESN'T QUITE MEET
3 THAT ADJUSTED FARES AND THAT'S BECAUSE MUNI WOULD BE
4 GENERATING ABOUT \$100 MILLION A YEAR. AND SO THIS \$90 MILLION
5 THAT THEY RECEIVE REPRESENTS 90% OF THE FUNDING THAT SAN
6 FRANCISCO WOULD GENERATE. THE OTHER GOES TO TRANSIT
7 TRANSFORMATION. THIS DOESN'T OFFSET ALL OF THEIR FARE LOSS.
8 AND THE REASON WE DIDN'T GIVE THEM THE EXTRA 25 IS THIS
9 SCENARIO ASSUMES MUNI WOULD NOT BE RECEIVING ANY FUNDING FROM
10 ANY OF THE OTHER COUNTIES. I'D ALSO LIKE TO POINT OUT HOW
11 INSUFFICIENT THIS 90% IS IN COVERING THEIR PROJECTED
12 SHORTFALL, LEAVING A NEARLY \$200 MILLION GAP IF NO OTHER
13 FUNDING WAS OBTAINED IN THE INTERVENING COUPLE OF YEARS. SO WE
14 ALL KNOW MUNI CARRIES OVER 400,000 PEOPLE A DAY AND
15 MAINTAINING MUNI IS CRITICAL TO MOBILITY, CLIMATE, AND
16 ECONOMICALS, NOT JUST FOR SAN FRANCISCO BUT THE REGION, AND SO
17 WHILE CLEARLY THIS MEASURE WOULD BE IMPORTANT, ADDITIONAL
18 SOLUTIONS WILL BE NEEDED. NEXT SLIDE. THIS FINAL SLIDE FOR
19 SCENARIO ONE SHOWS THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDING BY COUNTY. AND
20 YOU COULD SEE HOW RELATIVE, IT'S ALL THE SAME PROPORTIONALLY,
21 RIGHT? SO 50% OVER OF THE LIFE OF THE MEASURE, FOR EXAMPLE,
22 GOES TO COUNTY FLEX. OF COURSE, THERE ARE FIVE OTHER COUNTIES,
23 AND THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION NEEDS IN
24 THOSE AS WELL. SO WE ARE PROPOSING OPT-IN PROVISIONS THAT WE
25 HOPE CAN BE SIMPLE AND CLEAR ENOUGH THAT OTHER COUNTIES JOIN



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 US AND HELP BUILD A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT CAN GENERATE THAT \$1
2 BILLION PER YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. AND WE'LL DESCRIBE THOSE HERE.
3 THERE ARE REALLY JUST TWO COMMITMENTS TO OPT IN. THE FIRST IS
4 SUPPORTING TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AT 10% ANNUALLY. AND THE
5 SECOND IS THAT THE COUNTIES WOULD NEED TO HELP FILL THE
6 TRANSIT OPERATING GAPS IN THEIR COUNTIES. WE'VE SEEN HOW
7 PROJECTIONS ARE CHANGING QUICKLY. SO INSTEAD OF A PRESCRIBED
8 FORMULA, THE LEVEL OF OPERATING SUPPORT TO HELP CLOSE THOSE
9 GAPS WOULD BE SUBJECT TO DISCUSSIONS AND AN AGREEMENT WITH
10 M.T.C. AND THIS WOULD TAKE INTO ACCOUNT EXISTING CONTRACTUAL
11 AGREEMENTS THAT MAY EXIST FOR OPERATORS WITH MULTI-COUNTIES.
12 NOW, ALL OF THE REMAINING FUNDS WOULD BE A SUBVENGES TO A
13 COUNTY FOR ANY TRANSPORTATION PRIORITY INCLUDING THINGS LIKE
14 LOCAL ROAD REPAIRS. AS LONG AS THAT FUNDING IS ALIGNED WITH
15 PLAN BAY AREA 2050+. NOW, A LOT OF PEOPLE AT THE EXECUTIVE
16 GROUP ASKED ABOUT TIMING TO OPT IN. SO I'M GOING TO DO THAT IN
17 A LITTLE MORE DETAIL NOW. WE KNOW THAT IF THIS SCENARIO WAS
18 ADOPTED IN OCTOBER AND PASSED IN NOVEMBER BY THE FULL
19 COMMISSION, COUNTIES WOULD NEED TIME TO CONSIDER OPTING IN. WE
20 BELIEVE IT IS VITAL, HOWEVER, THAT BY THE TIME THE AUTHORIZING
21 LEGISLATION IS FINALIZED -- SO THAT WOULD BE SOMEWHERE IN THE
22 MIDDLE OF NEXT, IN THE MIDDLE OF 2025, WE'D REALLY NEED TO
23 INCLUDE ALL OF THE COUNTIES THAT WOULD WANT TO OPT IN BY THAT
24 TIME SO IT'S CLEARLY LAID OUT IN THE LEGISLATION. NOW, AFTER
25 THE LEGISLATION HAS PASSED, THE FOUR BASE COUNTIES AND ANY OF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THE OPT-IN COUNTIES WOULD DEVELOP EXPENDITURE PLANS FOR THEIR
2 COUNTY FLEX FUNDS. WE DON'T HAVE A PARTICULAR DEADLINE IN MIND
3 FOR THOSE YET. WE'RE OPEN TO SUGGESTIONS, BUT I WOULD IMAGINE
4 IT'S SOMEWHERE IN EARLY 2026. AND THAT'S JUST IMPORTANT
5 BECAUSE IT WOULD LEAVE TIME TO DEVELOP, REALLY, CLEAR AND
6 COMPELLING COMMUNICATIONS ABOUT THE MEASURE BEFORE IT GOES TO
7 THE VOTERS. ALL RIGHT. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS IS
8 SCENARIO TWO. WE'RE CALLING GO BIG FRAMEWORK, AS I MENTIONED
9 BEFORE, AND THIS SCENARIO CALLS FOR VOICES FOR PUBLIC
10 TRANSPORTATION AND SENATOR WIENER'S OFFICE FOR REVENUE OVER
11 THE LIFE OF THE MEASURE. THE COMMONALITIES IN THE DIFFERENT
12 REQUESTS WE GOT WERE AT LEAST \$1.5 BILLION A YEAR. IDEALLY
13 FROM A PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCE. COVERING ALL NINE COUNTIES.
14 AND AN AIM TO SUSTAIN 2023 TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS AT A
15 MINIMUM. SO IF YOU GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, YOU'LL SEE THAT WE
16 TRIED TO KEEP THE STRUCTURE SIMPLE WITH SIMILAR TYPES OF
17 FUNDING CATEGORIES AS SCENARIO ONE WITH JUST ONE KIND OF
18 WRINKLE HERE AND THAT'S FOR THE FIRST CATEGORY, TRANSIT
19 TRANSPORTATION. IN THIS -- TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. IN THIS
20 PROPOSAL WE'RE ASKING 10% WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED AT THE REGIONAL
21 LEVEL. THE NEXT 10% IS FOR COUNTIES TO SPEND AT THEIR
22 DISCRETION. SO WE ARE CALLING THIS POT COUNTY TRANSIT
23 TRANSFORMATION. NOW, 50% OR \$750 MILLION IS FOR TRANSIT
24 SERVICE AND THAT LEAVES 30% FOR COUNTY FLEX. AND NOW, BEFORE
25 WE GO ON TO SOME OF THE DETAIL AND GRAPHS THAT ARE COMING UP,



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 I WANTED TO JUST POINT OUT THAT THREE OUT OF THESE FOUR KIND
2 OF POTS STAY CONSTANT OVER THE 30 YEARS. SO THERE'S A REAL
3 SIMPLICITY OF THOSE THREE POTS. THAT'S THE REGIONAL
4 TRANSFORMATION, THE COUNTY TRANSFORMATION AND COUNTY FLEX. BUT
5 WE HAD TO TAILOR THAT \$750 MILLION, THE 50% FOR TRANSIT, SO IT
6 FOCUSES ON SUSTAINING TRANSIT IN THE FIRST DECADE. BUT THEN,
7 WE'LL ADD MORE FLEXIBILITY TO HOW THAT TRANSIT MONEY IS SPENT
8 IN THE NEXT TWO DECADES. AND WE DID THIS SO THAT EACH COUNTY
9 CAN BE ASSURED SUBSTANTIAL TRANSIT BENEFITS EVEN IF THEIR
10 COUNTY ISN'T FACING SIGNIFICANT SHORTFALLS FOR THEIR
11 OPERATORS. SO LET'S LOOK REAL QUICKLY AT HOW WE WOULD GENERATE
12 FUNDS FOR THIS MEASURE, POTENTIALLY. NEXT SLIDE. OH, ACTUALLY,
13 THIS SLIDE IS AN ILLUSTRATIVE PROJECT LIST OF WHAT CAN BE IN
14 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FUNDS. EVERYTHING FROM TRANSIT
15 PRIORITY LANES TO A HUGE RANGE OF CAPITAL PROJECTS LIKE THE
16 SMART EXTENSION NORTH OR BART SILICON VALLEY. NEXT SLIDE. NOW,
17 WE'LL GET TO THE FUNDING SOURCES. AS PER LAST MONTH'S
18 DISCUSSION, WE IDENTIFIED TWO SOURCES THAT WERE BOTH MORE
19 PROGRESSIVE THAN SALES TAX AND ARE ALSO POTENTIALLY VIABLE AT
20 THE BALLOT. AND WE BACKED INTO THE TAX LEVEL REQUIRED FOR EACH
21 OF THESE TO GENERATE \$1.5 MILLION. SO PROPOSED HERE IS A
22 PAYROLL TAX OF .54%, AND THAT'S DENOTED BY THE BLUE BARS AND
23 HOW MUCH THEY WOULD RAISE IN EACH COUNTY. AND THEN A 28 CENT
24 PER SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX ASSIGNED ON BUILDING AREA AND
25 THAT'S IN ORANGE. AND NOW YOU CAN SEE THAT BOTH SANTA CLARA



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COUNTY AND SAN FRANCISCO RAISED CONSIDERABLY MORE FROM THESE
2 SOURCES THAN THEY DO FROM SALES TAXES. AND FOR THIS SCENARIO,
3 WE USED THE PARCEL TAX. JUST TO CHOOSE ONE. AND BEFORE WE GO
4 INTO THOSE DETAILS, WE SHOULD KNOW THERE WERE REALLY JUST A
5 LOT OF OBSTACLES AS WE FACED AS WE TRIED TO OPTIMIZE FOR THOSE
6 2023 SERVICE LEVELS AND MAINTAINING THEM FOR ALL OF THE YEARS.
7 BUT REALLY, THE LARGEST ONE IS THAT DOING SO WOULD REQUIRE A
8 LARGE TRANSFER OF FUNDING FROM OTHER COUNTIES TO SAN
9 FRANCISCO, GIVEN THE SIZE OF MUNI SHORTFALLS AND S.F.'S
10 PORTION OF CALTRAIN AND GOLDEN GATE. AND WE HEARD QUITE LOUD
11 AND CLEAR THAT SUCH A TRANSFER IS JUST A NONSTARTER FOR THE
12 SCALE THAT'S NEEDED. SO WE WORKED REALLY HARD TO PROPOSE A
13 CREATIVE SOLUTION. AND IT'S ABOUT WHAT I AM GOING TO SHOW IS
14 ONE OF 15 IDEAS THAT WE TRIED, AND WE ARE TOTALLY OPEN TO
15 OTHER WAYS TO ADJUST THIS SCENARIO AND MEET OUR TRANSPORTATION
16 NEEDS AND ALSO BUILD THE CONSENSUS SUPPORT THAT'S NEEDED FOR
17 THIS HIGHER LEVEL OF FUNDING. NEXT SLIDE. SO NOW WE ARE GOING
18 TO TAKE A LOOK AT HOW THIS TRANSIT POT WOULD BE SPENT IN THIS
19 VERSION OF THE SCENARIO. IT, FIRST OF ALL, FUNDS ALL OF THE
20 AGENCIES WITH RECORDED FUNDING GAPS SO THIS NOW INCLUDES
21 GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT AND SMALL OPERATORS ALL ACROSS THE REGION.
22 AS YOU CAN SEE, IT ALSO INTRODUCES A TEMPORAL ELEMENT. IN THIS
23 CASE, FOR THE FIRST DECADE, THIS WOULD SUPPORT THE OPERATOR-
24 REPORTED FUNDING GAPS FOR F.Y. '26 AND '27. THIS IS NOT THE
25 ONES WE GOT WITHIN THE LAST WEEK OR TWO. THIS WILL ADD UP



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 EXACTLY TO \$750 MILLION. UNFORTUNATELY, SOME OF THESE
2 SHORTFALLS ARE NOW EXPECTED TO BE SOMEWHAT LARGER. AND THEN IN
3 YEARS 11 TO 30, WE WOULD FUND UP TO 50% OF THE TRANSIT
4 SHORTFALLS FOR -- FOR BART AND MUNI. IT WOULD EACH BE A LITTLE
5 BIT LOWER. BUT OUR GOAL WOULD BE TO FUND ABOUT 50% OF THE
6 TRANSIT SHORTFALLS ONGOING THROUGHOUT THE 30 YEARS. WE ALSO
7 WANTED THIS TRANSIT FUNDING COMPONENT OF THE MEASURE TO BE
8 GUARANTEED AT \$750 MILLION AS WAS REQUESTED. THIS DOESN'T
9 HAPPEN HERE. AS YOU CAN SEE, THE BLUE BARS REPRESENT \$750
10 MILLION. THAT'S YEARS ONE TO 10. THE ORANGE BARS ARE OBVIOUSLY
11 JUST VISUALLY MUCH LOWER. SO ON THE NEXT SLIDE, WE OFFER A
12 CREATIVE SOLUTION. AND THE ORANGE BARS ARE THERE BECAUSE
13 WITHOUT THEM BEING LOWER THAN BLUE, WE WOULD HAVE TO TRANSFER
14 FUNDS TO SAN FRANCISCO, JUST TO REITERATE. SO GO TO THE NEXT
15 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO TO ENSURE EVERY COUNTY RECEIVES AT LEAST 75%
16 IN BENEFIT, RELATIVE TO ITS CONTRIBUTIONS, WE CREATED NEW
17 EXPENDITURE CATEGORY CALLED COUNTY TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS. THIS
18 FUNDING IS ONLY FOR YEARS 11 THROUGH 30 AND IT COMPLEMENTS THE
19 GUARANTEED OPERATING FUNDS ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE. NOW, THESE
20 WOULD BE ABLE TO BE USED FOR ANY PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION PURPOSE
21 IN THE COUNTY. WHETHER IT'S OPERATING OR CAPITAL PROGRAMS. THE
22 COUNTY TRANSIT IMPROVEMENT DOLLARS WOULD, LIKE I SAID, ENABLE
23 US TO CONTINUE FUNDING IN TOTAL AT \$750 MILLION PER YEAR, AND
24 WE JUST THINK THAT HAVING ALL THE COUNTIES GET BENEFIT IS
25 NECESSARY FOR POLITICAL VIABILITY. NOW, YOU'LL NOTICE, IF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 YOU'RE LOOKING FOR A SAN FRANCISCO BAR, IT'S NOT THERE. THEY
2 WOULD ALREADY BE RECEIVING \$60 MILLION IN THE PREVIOUS SLIDE
3 FOR OPERATIONS. FOR THE 11 THROUGH 30 TIME FRAME. IN THE NEXT
4 SLIDE, YOU'LL SEE THEY ALSO GET \$69 MILLION IN COUNTY FLEX AND
5 COUNTY TRANSFORMATION FUNDS. AND, AGAIN, THAT'S TO ALLOW US TO
6 KIND OF HIT THAT 75% BENEFIT LEVEL FOR ALL COUNTIES. SO NOW,
7 LUCKILY, WE'RE OUT OF THE TEMPORAL LAND AND BACK INTO THE VERY
8 SIMPLE CONCEPT OF THESE ARE WHAT COUNTIES WOULD RECEIVE IN ALL
9 OF THE YEARS. THIS IS THE ANNUAL COUNTY FLEX AND THE ANNUAL
10 COUNTY TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FUNDING THAT WOULD FLOW AS A
11 SUBVENTION. AS SAID BEFORE, EXTREMELY FLEXIBLE FUNDS. SO LET'S
12 GO -- WE JUST HAVE TWO MORE SLIDES LEFT. THANK YOU FOR BEARING
13 FOR THIS LONG PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE WERE ASKED
14 TO PROVIDE AN ALTERNATIVE FRAMEWORK. THIS IS FOR THEM PURSUING
15 THEIR OWN SEPARATE MEASURES. SUCH WOULD REQUIRE CERTAIN TAXES
16 AND M.T.C. COULD PLAY A SUPPORTING ROLE IN THAT LEGISLATIVE
17 EFFORT. ONE DOWNSIDE OF THIS APPROACH IS THAT IT SEEMS
18 UNLIKELY TRANSIT AGENCIES ON THEIR OWN WOULD INCLUDE FUNDING
19 TO ADVANCE TRANSFORMATION AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. ANOTHER
20 DOWNSIDE IS THAT THE PATH COULD PRESENT VOTERS WITH MULTIPLE
21 MEASURES ON THE SAME BALLOT. YOU KNOW, FOR EXAMPLE, IN SAN
22 FRANCISCO, THERE COULD BE A VOTE ON CALTRAIN, S.F., MUNI ALL
23 AT THE SAME TIME. AND THAT SAID, IF IT'S PURSUED, THERE ARE
24 OBVIOUSLY ABILITIES TO TRY TO COORDINATE BETWEEN THE AGENCIES
25 SO THAT KIND OF PILE-UP DOESN'T HAPPEN. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THE FINAL SLIDE. AND SO THERE ARE MANY POSSIBLE FUNDING
2 SOURCES FOR SEPARATE MEASURES. IT CAN BE PARCEL TAXES,
3 PROPERTY TAXES, OTHER -- THAT THE AGENCIES MAY CONSIDER. THIS
4 SIDE, WE JUST WANT TO ILLUSTRATE SALES TAX RATES, BECAUSE
5 PEOPLE ARE SO FAMILIAR WITH WHAT THEY ARE IN TRANSPORTATION.
6 ON THE LEFT ARE THE RATES THAT WOULD BE NEEDED TO CLOSE THE
7 ADJUSTED FARE GAP. NOW, THAT'S THE FARE GAP THAT WE'RE TRYING
8 TO REACH IN SCENARIO ONE. ON THE RIGHT IS WHAT IT WOULD TAKE
9 TO REACH THE MOST RECENT OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALL NUMBERS.
10 AND AS YOU CAN SEE, BART WOULD NEED NEARLY HALF A CENT IF IT
11 WAS TO REACH THAT, AND MUNI WOULD BE OVER 1.4%. SO WITH THAT,
12 I'LL TURN IT BACK TO CHAIR SPERING AND I, ALONG WITH M.T.C.
13 TEAM, ARE AVAILABLE FOR CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. AND WE'LL JUST
14 RETURN TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE, WHICH IS JUST THE QUESTIONS
15 FOR COMMITTEE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU.

16

17 >>CHAIR, JIM SPERING: THANK YOU, STUART. AS WE EMBARKED ON
18 THIS, WE WERE CONCENTRATING ON BART, MUNI, AND CALTRAIN
19 TRANSIT. AS WE'RE GATHERING INFORMATION, WE'RE CLEARING SEEING
20 WHERE SOME OF THE SHORTFALLS ARE. MUNI IS A PROBLEM THAT WE
21 CONTINUE TO TRY AND RESOLVE. I DON'T -- I WANT EVERYONE TO
22 KNOW, WE ARE NOT TAKING THAT SHORTFALL LIGHTLY BECAUSE WE
23 UNDERSTAND THE IMPACT. THE OTHER IS TO HAVE A THREE-COUNTY
24 MEASURE. STAFF, THERE WASN'T ENOUGH TIME TO INCLUDE THIS. AT
25 THE NEXT MEETING, YOU'LL SEE THAT. SO THAT WILL BE PRESENTED,



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT REQUEST WAS MADE. THE SEBASTIAN, COME UP HERE AND SIT UP
2 HERE SO YOU CAN BE PART OF THIS CONVERSATION. HE -- ALICIA IS
3 NOT WITH US TODAY. SHE HAD SOME ISSUES THAT SHE WANTED TO MAKE
4 SURE GETS ADDRESSED. SEBASTIAN, YOU CAN PARTICIPATE IN THE
5 DISCUSSION. YOU DON'T NEED TO START OFF. WE WANT TO HEAR YOUR
6 COMMENTS. WE'LL START WITH COMMITTEE FIRST AND THEN WE'LL TAKE
7 PUBLIC COMMENTS AND IF STAFF CAN GIVE ME AN IDEA HOW MANY
8 PEOPLE -- NOT RIGHT NOW -- HOW MANY PEOPLE WE'LL SPEAK AND
9 WE'LL DETERMINE WHAT THAT TIME FRAME IS. BRINGING IT BACK TO
10 THE COMMITTEE, WHO WANTS TO KICK IT OFF? DAVID.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YOU KNOW, I JUST -- THANK YOU,
13 SEBASTIAN, FOR BEING HERE. YOU KNOW, WE DID RECEIVE SOME
14 CORRESPONDENCE FROM ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE. CAN YOU TALK ABOUT
15 THE CORRESPONDENCE SENT BY SPUR?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** SURE. HAPPY TO, COMMISSIONER CANEPA. SO I'D START OFF
18 BY EMPHASIZING SOME COMMENTS THAT CHAIR SPERING MADE WHICH IS
19 ONE OF THE MAJOR CHALLENGES WE'RE FACING AT THIS POINT IS
20 SIMPLY UNCERTAINTY. WE GOT A VERY SIGNAL ELECTION COMING UP IN
21 A FEW MONTHS. IT'S GOING TO BE DIFFICULT TO DO POLLING IN
22 ADVANCE OF THAT AND KNOW HOW THE MOOD IN THE BAY AREA IS
23 SETTLING OUT. GIVEN THAT SPUR HAS, AS MANY OF YOU HEARD OF
24 OVER THE YEARS, CONCERNS ABOUT TRANSIT. WE WANT TO SEE TRANSIT
25 SUSTAINED AND REFORMED, BUT WE REALLY WANT TRANSIT TO BE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THERE. AND THAT IS FAR AND AWAY OUR OVERRIDING CONCERN. AND SO
2 GIVEN THAT, I THINK WE ARE AT A POINT WHERE WE FEEL STRONGLY
3 THAT WE SHOULD BE POTENTIALLY PURSUING SORT OF A DUAL
4 APPROACH. ONE IS WORKING WITHIN THIS PROCESS TO COME UP WITH
5 THE BEST CONSENSUS REGIONAL APPROACH WE CAN. SPUR IS A
6 REGIONAL ORGANIZATION, AND WE BELIEVE IN THIS PROCESS AND WE
7 BELIEVE WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO COME UP WITH SOMETHING
8 THAT'S GOING TO REALLY BEAR OUT IN THE POLLING. BUT WE ALSO
9 THINK WE SHOULD BE TRYING TO MITIGATE RISK AND WORKING TO MAKE
10 SURE THAT INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES OR SUBREGIONAL COUNTIES
11 OR GROUPS HAVE WHATEVER AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION THEY NEED TO
12 GO FORWARD SO THAT IF WE'RE AT A POINT IN EARLY '26 OR LATE
13 '25 WHERE THE POLL JUST SUGGESTS THAT A REGIONAL APPROACH
14 ISN'T GOING TO BEAR OUT, WE HAVE SOME OPTIONS THERE. SO THAT
15 WOULD BE, I THINK, PROBABLY OUR BIGGEST COMMENT. BEYOND THAT,
16 WANT TO EMPHASIZE, AS I SAID, REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK OF
17 M.T.C. STAFF AND CHAIR SPERING TO PUT THESE SCENARIOS
18 TOGETHER. OBVIOUSLY, THERE IS A TREMENDOUS NUMBER OF
19 CONSIDERATIONS THAT GO INTO THIS, AND IT'S VERY HARD TO COME
20 UP WITH SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO PLEASE EVERYONE. I THINK
21 THAT IT'S A HUGE STEP FORWARD TO JUST HAVE SPECIFICS WRITTEN
22 DOWN SO WE CAN TALK ABOUT THEM. WITHIN THE CONTEXT OF SCENARIO
23 ONE, I THINK OUR BIGGEST SINGLE COMMENT WOULD BE, WE REALLY DO
24 WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE IS A PATH TO PROVIDING MUNI WITH
25 ROBUST NEAR-TERM SUPPORT. ALICIA VERY MUCH UNDERSTANDS AND



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 APPRECIATES THE CONCERNS AROUND MUNI FUNDAMENTALLY BEING A
2 LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCY AND THE DESIRE FROM OTHER COUNTIES TO NOT
3 SEE THEIR FUNDS TRANSFERRING TO MUNI. THAT BEING SAID, MUNI IS
4 ALSO 50% OF THE TRANSIT RIDERS IN THE REGION. SO WHETHER IT'S
5 WITHIN THIS MEASURE OR SOME OTHER MECHANISM IN PARALLEL, IT'S
6 JUST REALLY IMPORTANT TO TRANSIT CUSTOMERS THAT MUNI BE ABLE
7 TO BE SUSTAINED. WITH SCENARIO TWO, THERE'S A LOT TO LIKE
8 THERE. IT OBVIOUSLY PROVIDES ROBUST FUNDING FOR TRANSIT
9 OPERATIONS AND TRANSFORMATION. AT THE SAME TIME, BEFORE WE GET
10 TO THE VOTERS, WE GOT TO GET THROUGH THE LEGISLATURE. THERE
11 ARE QUESTIONS HOW FUNDING GETS DISTRIBUTED. SOME OF THE MOST
12 RECENT ADDITIONS TO THE PACKET BEGIN TO ADD SOME COLOR TO
13 THAT. THERE'S ALSO JUST BIG, DIFFICULT CONSIDERATIONS AROUND
14 FUNDING SOURCES. SO BE EXCITED TO HEAR WHAT SOME OTHER FOLKS
15 ON THE COMMITTEE HAVE TO SAY AND KEEP WORKING ON THIS EFFORT,
16 BUT WE DO THINK THERE WILL NEED TO BE SOME REFINEMENTS BEFORE
17 WE SETTLE.

18

19 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** STUART, THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. I'M
22 JUST CURIOUS ON THE FOUR-COUNTY MEASURE THAT WAS PROPOSED.
23 THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING, FOR THE CONSIDERATION ON LOOKING AT
24 A THREE-COUNTY MEASURE. YOU KNOW, AS YOU KNOW, THERE'S AN
25 AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO COUNTY,



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY RELATIVE TO CALTRAIN. AND SO MY
2 QUESTION TO YOU IS -- IS CLEARLY THIS. AND THERE IS BART IN
3 THOSE AREAS. HOW DO WE LAND ON THE FOUR COUNTIES CONSIDERING
4 THAT, YOU KNOW, SANTA CLARA COUNTY AS WELL AS SAN MATEO COUNTY
5 AND THESE OTHER COUNTIES HAVE BART? WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT,
6 AND AS THE CHAIR HAS SAID, I JUST WANT TO BE REALLY
7 TRANSPARENT. WE ARE LOOKING AT SORT OF, HOW DO WE FUND
8 CALTRAIN? WHILE YOU HAVE TWO ENTITIES, YOU HAVE SAN FRANCISCO
9 COUNTY AND THEN YOU HAVE SAN MATEO COUNTY, SANTA CLARA COUNTY,
10 WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS THAT THERE MAY NOT BE A
11 CONTRIBUTION MOVING FORWARD BECAUSE THEY ARE NOT PART OF THIS
12 FOUR-COUNTY MEASURE. CAN YOU SPEAK A LITTLE TO THAT, STUART?

13

14 **STUART COHEN:** I CAN. HAPPY TO HAVE ANYBODY HELP ME OUT WITH
15 THAT. YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT TO REITERATE, THIS IS VERSION ONE
16 AND LIKE I SAID, WE'LL BRING TO A THREE COUNTY TO THE NEXT
17 ONE, AS CHAIR SPERING MENTIONED. I THINK THERE IS JUST A
18 STRONG FEELING THAT, FIRST OF ALL, THERE'S -- BART'S BEING
19 EXTENDED DOWN THERE. AND THE BART V.T.A. AGREEMENT IS KIND OF
20 VERY COMPREHENSIVE AND ACTUALLY QUITE COSTLY TO V.T.A. AND I
21 THINK WE JUST HAD TO TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT SOMEWHAT AND IN A
22 BECOMES ONE OF THE FACTORS. THERE'S ALSO SIGNIFICANTLY MORE
23 RIDERS AND SERVICE PROVIDED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, AND SO THAT
24 WAS JUST ONE OF THE OTHER FACTORS. AND I THINK THERE ARE
25 OTHERS THAT MAY BE OPEN TO ANY OTHERS.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. I GUESS I WOULD JUST ADD, AS CHAIR
3 SPERING NOTED, THERE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS WE COULD HAVE LOOKED
4 AT THIS. S.B. 1031 LOOKED AT NINE COUNTIES. I THINK WE FELT
5 THE CORE NEED FOR TRANSIT WAS IN THE FOUR COUNTIES. SO THAT'S
6 WHY WE BROUGHT FORWARD SCENARIO ONE. IN SLIDE 17 WE DO HAVE
7 KIND OF A DISCUSSION ABOUT COUNTIES THAT OPT IN AND HOW THEY
8 WOULD CONTRIBUTE TO MULTI-COUNTY OPERATORS.

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** AND AS WE GET INTO THE NORTH BAY WITH GOLDEN
11 GATE AND SONOMA, WE KIND OF INCLUDED PROVISIONS AROUND THAT
12 FOR FURTHER CONSIDERATION.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I ALSO WANT TO ADD, WE STARTED ON THIS
15 PROCESS, THE FOUR AGENCIES, WE LOOKED AT WHERE BART, MUNI,
16 CALTRAIN, TRANSIT. AND WE KNOW CALTRAIN IS FORCING A SHORTFALL
17 IN THE FUTURE. SO WE WERE JUST TRYING TO COVER ALL OF THOSE
18 OPERATIONS AND IF THERE IS A FUNDING SOURCE THAT CALTRAIN
19 DOESN'T NEED ANY REVENUE, THAT NEEDS TO COME FORWARD. WE NEED
20 TO UNDERSTAND THAT. THAT CERTAINLY COULD CHANGE SOME OF THIS,
21 TOO. WE WERE FOCUSING ON THOSE FOUR AGENCIES. WE WANT TO MAKE
22 SURE THERE IS A FUNDING SOURCE FOR THE SMALL OPERATORS. SO
23 THAT WAS HOW WE WERE TRYING TO SOLVE THIS PROBLEM. AND SAN
24 MATEO DOES HAVE BART AND WITH CALTRAIN'S SHORTFALL. AND SO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT WAS SORT OF THE LOGIC THAT WE WERE USING INITIALLY GOING
2 INTO THIS.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** AND I AGREE WITH YOU 100%. YOU KNOW, WHAT I
5 WOULD JUST ASK STAFF AS YOU MOVE FORWARD IS MAYBE TO LOOK AT -
6 - WE TALKED ABOUT THREE COUNTY, FOUR COUNTY AND POTENTIALLY
7 FIVE COUNTY. I JUST WANT TO ENSURE THAT CALTRAIN, AS YOU DO,
8 JIM, YOU KNOW, IS PROTECTED BUT AT THE SAME TIME I WANT TO
9 MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE EVERYONE IN THE CALTRAIN, YOU KNOW,
10 J.P.A. CONTRIBUTING AS WELL. YOU KNOW, THIS IS A VERY TAXING,
11 NO PUN INTENDED, ENVIRONMENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YES.

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** AND, YOU KNOW, WITH INFLATION, THERE ARE A LOT
16 OF CHALLENGES OUT THERE. PEOPLE JUST TRYING TO MAKE IT DAY BY
17 DAY. AND SO, YOU KNOW, WHEN I LOOK AT A REGIONAL MEASURE, I
18 LOOK AT US DOING THIS ALTOGETHER, RIGHT? OPTION TWO LOOKS
19 BETTER TO ME THAN OPTION ONE, TO BE QUITE FRANK WITH YOU. AND
20 SO WHEN I LOOK AT A REGIONAL MEASURE AND I LOOK AT M.T.C. AND
21 OUR ROLE IN THE REGION, I LOOK AT IN A -- FROM A REGIONAL
22 PERSPECTIVE. YOU KNOW, I GUESS MY QUESTION IS FOR COUNTY
23 COUNSEL AND I'LL CONCLUDE WITH THIS. THIS WILL REQUIRE ACTION
24 FROM EACH OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, CORRECT, IF THIS
25 MEASURE WAS PUT FORWARD, KATHLEEN?



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YEAH, THE EXACT MECHANISM HAS NOT BEEN DRAWN
3 OUT YET. BUT THAT SEEMS LIKE A LIKELY SCENARIO.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** WHAT I WOULD SUGGEST ON THIS MEASURE IS REALLY
6 MAKING SURE THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, WHETHER IT'S SAN
7 FRANCISCO OR SAN MATEO COUNTY, BUT EACH BOARD HAS THE
8 AUTHORITY TO APPROVE THE MEASURE THAT WE FINALLY LAND ON. I
9 WAS TAUGHT THIS ABOUT 24 YEARS AGO, LOCAL GOVERNMENT IS
10 EXTREMELY, EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR
11 CONSTITUENTS AND EVERYONE KNOWS SORT OF HOW WE MOVE FORWARD.
12 HAVING THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FROM EACH COUNTY AND WEIGHING
13 IN ON THIS ISSUE IS GOING TO BE CRITICAL FOR THAT. I THANK
14 YOU, MR. CHAIR, FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. I THINK THEY
17 ARE VERY IMPORTANT AS WE TRY AND PUT THIS FRAMEWORK TOGETHER.
18 I JUST WANT TO CAUTION EVERYONE, THERE'S PLENTY OF TIME TO SAY
19 NO. YOU WILL HAVE A WHOLE YEAR TO DO THAT. THIS WILL STILL GO
20 TO THE LEGISLATURE AND SOME OF YOUR ISSUES CAN BE HEARD THERE.
21 I WILL BRING IT BACK TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

22

23 **SUE NOACK:** WHEN I LOOKED AT SCENARIO ONE AND TWO -- FIRST OF
24 ALL, A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK DONE HERE. THANK YOU.
25 SCENARIO TWO HAS PARCEL TAX, PAYROLL TAX. SCENARIO ONE, SALES



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TAX MEASURE. WHY THE DIFFERENT MEASURES FOR THE DIFFERENT
2 SCENARIOS?

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** SO IN PART SCENARIO TWO WAS A REQUEST FROM
5 VARIOUS GROUPS TO HAVE PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCES AND SALES
6 TAX OBVIOUSLY DOESN'T ADDRESS THAT. WE WENT THROUGH THE SEVEN
7 POSSIBLE AND PAYROLL SEEMED TO BE THE MOST POLITICALLY VIABLE.
8 AND WITH SALES TAX, YOU KNOW, I THINK AS YOU KNOW IT'S BEEN
9 KIND OF THE PUBLIC AND OTHERS UNDERSTAND IT AS A WAY THAT
10 CALIFORNIA HAS BEEN FUNDING TRANSPORTATION. AND WE'VE SEEN
11 THAT IT CAN WIN AT THE BALLOT BOX. NOW, THINGS ARE ABSOLUTELY
12 GETTING HARDER WITH A BIGGER ANTI-TAX ENVIRONMENT, BUT WE DO
13 BELIEVE THAT SALES TAX, YOU KNOW, HAS A VIABLE PATH,
14 POTENTIALLY.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** I GUESS I MENTIONED THIS TO JIM AND A COUPLE OTHER
17 PEOPLE ON THE SALES TAX ISSUE. NOT ONLY ARE THESE OTHER
18 MEASURES COMING UP, CONTRA COSTA, OBVIOUSLY, BUT A LOT OF
19 CITIES ARE FACING DEFICITS GOING FORWARD BECAUSE OF UNFUNDED
20 PENSION LIABILITY AND THE PENSION INCREASES THAT ARE COMING
21 OVER THE NEXT, SORT OF PEAKING IN 2034 FOR MOST CITIES AND
22 SALES TAX MEASURE IS A -- IS A LIKELY TOOL TO ADDRESS THOSE
23 KIND OF DEFICITS. SO MY CONCERN FROM A LOT OF CITY ELECTED
24 OFFICIALS WILL BE, THIS COULD TAKE AWAY THAT POSSIBILITY AS
25 WELL AS THOSE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. SO, YOU KNOW, I



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WOULD LIKE TO LOOK AT SORT OF THE PARCEL TAX OPTION IN THE
2 SCENARIO ONE AS WELL AS SCENARIO TWO. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, I
3 PREFER, TWO, AS WELL. WHEN WE'VE BEEN WORKING ON -- ON PLAN
4 BAY AREA 2050 AND TALKING ABOUT OUR GOALS BEING A, YOU KNOW,
5 REGIONAL, WORLD-CLASS REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM, IT'S REALLY
6 KIND OF HARD TO DO THAT IF WE'RE DOING A SORT OF LITTLE
7 PATCHING OF THE FISCAL CLIFF IN YEARS ONE THROUGH EIGHT AND
8 THEN THIS SMALL AMOUNT OF TRANSFORMATIONAL DOLLARS. AND I
9 DON'T THINK THAT GETS TO OUR GOAL OF CREATING A REGIONAL
10 WORLD-CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM. I THINK THAT MISSES IT IN ONE. AND
11 SO, YOU KNOW, I'D BE SUPPORTIVE OF TWO. EITHER WAY, CONTRA
12 COSTA IS IN THERE. SO THAT'S JUST THE SORT OF MY IMPRESSION ON
13 WHAT OUR GOAL IS AND WHAT SUITS OUR GOALS THE BEST OF THEM.
14 THE OTHER -- THE OTHER THING THAT I THINK IS CONCERNING, THE
15 NO NECESSARILY TO ME BUT I THINK THE PUBLIC WILL BE THOSE TIME
16 FRAMES. YOU KNOW, SAYING THAT IN YEAR EIGHT THE AMOUNT THAT'S
17 GOING TO TRANSIT WILL DROP DRAMATICALLY. I JUST WONDER IF THE
18 PUBLIC WILL REALLY BELIEVE THAT. IF THEY THINK WE'RE TAKING
19 CARE OF THE SITUATION NOW AND IN YEAR NINE THAT FISCAL CLIFF
20 IS OCCURRING AGAIN, ARE WE REALLY -- ARE WE REALLY GOING TO
21 REDUCE IT TO 50% AND SAY TO OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS, SEE YOU,
22 GUYS, GOOD LUCK TO GET RESOURCES. I THINK THE PUBLIC MAY HAVE
23 A HARDER TIME BELIEVING THAT. THOSE ARE JUST A COUPLE OF MY
24 CONCERNS. I APPRECIATE BOTH OF THE SCENARIOS AND THEIR
25 STRUCTURE AND THE THOUGHT PROCESS BEHIND IT. BUT THAT -- THOSE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 ARE A COUPLE OF MY, JUST CONCERNS, BETWEEN SCENARIOS ONE AND
2 TWO.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ON THAT ONE SLIDE, THERE WAS A NOTE AT THE
5 TOP. GENERATE THE \$1.5 BILLION IT WOULD TAKE A 3/4 CENT SALES
6 TAX. THAT'S THE EQUIVALENT. I WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE
7 UNDERSTANDS THAT PIECE. DAVID. --

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. APOLOGIZE GETTING HERE LATE. DAVID RABBITT
10 I ALLOWED FOR ONE AND IT TOOK TWO. IF I TOOK THE TRAIN I WOULD
11 HAVE TO TAKE THE FERRY AND THEN THE LAST HALF MILE AS WELL. I
12 HAVE A QUESTION REGARDING THE -- I WAS SURPRISED TO SEE THE 28
13 CENT SPARE FOOT PARCEL TAX AS OPPOSED TO WHAT WE TYPICALLY DO
14 IS THE PER \$100,000 OF ASSESSED VALUE. WHAT WAS THE THINKING
15 BEHIND THAT?

16

17 **STUART COHEN:** YEAH. I'LL LET ANYONE WITH LEGAL BACKGROUND TO
18 ANSWER. THE AD VALOREM OPERATING, THAT'S WHY WE WERE GOING
19 WITH A PARCEL TAX, IS THAT CORRECT FOR THE LAWYERS IN HERE? I
20 GOT HEAD SHAKING YES.

21

22 **DAVID RABBITT THAT WAS THE EQUIVALENT IN LARGE TERMS THAT WAS**
23 **THE EQUIVALENT OF THE SAME ASSESSED VALUE PER \$100,000**
24 **PREVIOUSLY? I KNOW --**

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 >>**STUART COHEN:** LET ME CLARIFY. WITHIN THIS PROCESS, WE HADN'T
2 TRIED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH AN AD HAVE A -- VALOREM PROPERTY
3 TAX. PARCEL TAX WILL BE THE PARCEL TAX OF ANY TYPE. SQUARE
4 FOOT SEEMED LIKE THE MOST EQUITABLE. THERE'S PER LOT AND OTHER
5 KIND OF MECHANISMS WE LOOKED INTO IT.

6

7 **DAVID RABBITT:** AND BUILDING AREA IS LIVABLE STRUCTURES?

8

9 **STUART COHEN:** WE'LL COME BACK WITH AN ANSWER TO THAT.

10

11 **DAVID RABBITT:** THAT'S A FLAT AMOUNT NO MATTER HOW MUCH OF A
12 MANSION OR A SHACK YOU HAVE. AND I CAN TELL YOU FROM MY --
13 JUST A QUICK MATH ON MY OWN PROPERTY TAX. THAT WOULD INCREASE
14 MY PROPERTY TAX BY 20%. SO IT'S NOT A SMALL NUMBER. 3/4 OF A
15 CENT SALES TAX IS NOT A SMALL NUMBER. SAME CONCERN I MENTION
16 WOULD GO WITH BOTH.

17

18 **STUART COHEN:** AND COMMISSIONER RABBITT, I THINK YOU WERE
19 REFERRING TO STORAGE TYPE STRUCTURES, OTHER KIND OF THINGS.
20 BUT IT'S NOT JUST RESIDENTIAL. IT'S CERTAINLY FOR COMMERCIAL,
21 YOU KNOW, INDUSTRIAL PROPERTIES. IT'S PER SQUARE FOOT ON ALL
22 OF THAT. I JUST DON'T KNOW ABOUT THE OUTBACK BUILDING KIND OF
23 THINGS. YES, IT'S ON ALL STRUCTURES. YEAH.

24

25 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. NICK AND THEN MANNY.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I ALSO WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER
3 SPERING, STAFF. THIS IS A VERY COMPLICATED THING WE ARE TRYING
4 TO DO. AND IT'S TAKING A HUGE AMOUNT OF WORK. AND, YOU KNOW, I
5 THINK PART OF THAT LEADS ME TO THINK WE SHOULD TRY AND NOT
6 MAKE IT MORE COMPLICATED THAN WE NEED TO, BECAUSE WE ONLY HAVE
7 ONE COMMISSIONER SPERING. AND ALSO, JUST BECAUSE, YOU KNOW,
8 SOMETIMES -- COMPLEXITY CAN SOLVE PROBLEMS BUT COMPLEXITY ADDS
9 NEW PROBLEMS THAT WOULD NEED TO BE SOLVED AND MAKES THINGS A
10 LOT MORE COMPLICATED AND MUCH MORE DIFFICULT TO SUCCEED. SO I
11 WANT TO FOCUS ON -- ON SCENARIO ONE AND THEN OF THE UNNAMED
12 SCENARIO THREE WHICH IS SORT OF THE INSTEAD OF ONE SINGLE
13 MEASURE, WHAT HAPPENS IF THERE IS A COORDINATED STRATEGY OF
14 OPERATOR-LED LOCAL MEASURES? BECAUSE THAT SEEMS LIKE THE THING
15 THAT IS MOST -- THAT'S THE MOST STRAIGHTFORWARD WAY OF SOLVING
16 THE PROBLEM THAT IS IMMEDIATELY BEFORE US. IT DOESN'T SOLVE
17 ALL OF OUR TRANSPORTATION PROBLEMS. IT DOESN'T CREATE THE
18 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT I THINK MANY OF US MIGHT DREAM OF
19 IN THE FUTURE. BUT IT ALSO DOESN'T PRECLUDE US OF BEING ABLE
20 TO DO THAT IN THE FUTURE. AND CERTAINLY IF WE SHOOT THE MOON
21 AND WE FAIL AND WE DON'T SORT OF -- TO USE A CARD ANALOGY,
22 LAND EVERYONE WITH THE SORT OF QUEEN OF SPADES AND HEARTS AND
23 WHATEVER, WE'LL BE LEFT WITH SORT OF MASSIVE SERVICE CUTS FOR
24 BART AND MUNI AND A.C. TRANSIT AND CALTRAIN AND GOLDEN GATE
25 AND OTHERS. AND WE'LL PROBABLY BE IN A REALLY DIFFICULT SPOT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TO RECOVER FROM THAT. SO THAT'S KIND OF THE FRAME FOR ME. SO
2 LOOKING AT SCENARIO ONE, YOU KNOW, I THINK IT DOESN'T WORK FOR
3 MUNI. AND I THINK WHAT I WOULD -- IT DOESN'T WORK FOR MUNI. I
4 JUST WANT TO REFLECT NOT JUST A DOLLAR NUMBER HOW IT DOESN'T
5 WORK FOR MUNI. THAT SCENARIO ONE WOULD LEAVE MUNI TO CUT 20
6 LINES, WHICH WOULD RESULT IN ABOUT 150,000 PASSENGERS NOT
7 BEING -- REDUCTION OF 150,000 DAILY RIDERS. THAT'S ABOUT THE
8 SAME NUMBER OF RIDERS THAT TAKE BART EVERY DAY. SO THAT IS A
9 HUGE NUMBER THAT WE WOULD LOSE ON THE SCENARIO ONE, I THINK
10 THE OTHER CHALLENGE -- THIS IS AN IMPROVEMENT ON YOUR
11 PRESENTATION COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS ONE ON FRIDAY, WE CAN'T
12 JUST BE LOOKING, ESPECIALLY FOR MUNI, AT LOST REVENUE BASED ON
13 FARE REVENUE. MUNI HAS LARGE REVENUE. IT HAS LARGE -- A LOT OF
14 SUPPORT FROM SAN FRANCISCO'S GENERAL FUND, WHICH IS REALLY,
15 REALLY STRUGGLING BECAUSE OF WORK FROM HOME. MORE SO THAN MANY
16 OTHER PLACES IN THE REGION. AND SO I WOULD REALLY LIKE US TO
17 SEE -- I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE WHAT A, NOT JUST, OKAY,
18 WE'RE HERE TO TALK ABOUT A REGIONAL MEASURE SO WE ARE ONLY
19 GOING TO TALK ABOUT MEASURES, BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE
20 WHAT THE PLAN LOOKS LIKE TO NOT HAVE MUNI FALL OFF THIS CLIFF.
21 AND YOU HAD A SLIDE RIGHT AT THE BEGINNING WHICH HAD LOTS OF
22 BUBBLES AND THERE WAS ONLY ONE WHICH WAS THE REGIONAL MEASURE.
23 ONLY ONE WHICH WAS A MEASURE. AND THERE'S ALL THESE OTHER
24 BUBBLES AND WE KIND OF WAVED OUR HANDS AT THEM. BUT I THINK,
25 YOU KNOW, STAFF REALLY NEEDS TO WORK WITH MUNI. AND I KNOW



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS GOING THROUGH ITS OWN PROCESS RIGHT NOW
2 AS WELL. BUT I THINK THERE'S JUST -- WE CAN'T JUST SAY LIKE,
3 OKAY, THE ONLY THING WE'RE GOING TO DO IS \$90 MILLION A YEAR
4 FROM MUNI AND EVERYTHING ELSE WE WILL CLOSE OUR EYES AND IT
5 WILL BE SOMEBODY ELSE'S PROBLEM. THERE NEEDS TO BE A
6 COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY. AND IT PROBABLY NEEDS TO BE MUNI-LED.
7 BUT IT NEEDS TO BE SORT OF REALLY COMPREHENSIVE. BECAUSE
8 OTHERWISE I DON'T THINK, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, IT'S NOT A HUGE
9 AMOUNT WITH THE WAY WE'RE APPROACHING THEM. SO MY SECOND
10 COMMENT IS ABOUT BART. I DON'T THINK THAT OPTION ONE REALLY
11 WORKS FOR BART. IT'S SORT OF SIMILAR TO WHAT COMMISSIONER
12 NOACK SAID. BART IS NOT GOING TO NEED THIS MONEY FOR FIVE
13 YEARS. IT'S NOT GOING TO NEED THIS MONEY FOR NINE YEARS. IT
14 JUST NEEDS THIS MONEY. AS A PERMANENT OR SEMI-PERMANENT
15 SOURCE. LIKE, WORK FROM HOME -- WORK FROM HOME IS JUST NOT
16 GOING AWAY. AND THAT HAS THE BIGGEST IMPACT ON A SYSTEM LIKE
17 BART. AND WE ARE NOT GOING TO -- THERE'S NO WORLD WHERE FIVE
18 YEARS FROM NOW WE'RE ALL JUST BACK IN THE OFFICE FIVE DAYS A
19 LOOK COMING ALONG LIKE THE PANDEMIC NEVER HAPPENED. AND SO I
20 THINK IT IS -- I DON'T THINK IT MAKES SENSE TO PUT FORWARD A
21 MEASURE THAT IS PRIMARILY DESIGNED TO SAVE BART TO JUST LIKE
22 POSTPONE BART'S PROBLEMS. AND THEN END UP IN A SITUATION FIVE
23 YEARS FROM NOW, 10 YEARS FROM NOW WHERE WE HAVE THIS
24 TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX SITTING THERE WHICH THEN MAKES IT
25 MORE DIFFICULT FOR BART TO GO RAISE ANOTHER -- GOING TO STUFF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT'S NOT GOING FOR BART WHICH IS MORE DIFFICULT FOR BART TO
2 GO OUT AND SOLVE ITS PROBLEMS. SO I REALLY DON'T LIKE THIS --
3 AND I ALSO THINK VOTERS ARE GOING TO SEE STRAIGHT THROUGH IT,
4 AS COMMISSIONER NOACK SAID, AND I THINK IT'S A VERY
5 COMPLICATED THING TO SELL. WHAT ARE YOU DOING FOR THIS
6 MEASURE? WELL, FOR THE FIRST TV YEARS -- FIVE YEARS WE'RE
7 DOING THIS. DON'T WORRY, IN 10 YEARS -- I MEAN, THAT JUST
8 DOESN'T REALLY WORK. SO I THINK WE NEED TO JUST COMMIT. YOU
9 KNOW, WE NEED TO ACKNOWLEDGE THIS PROBLEM IS A PERMANENT OR
10 LIKE FOR THE FORESEEABLE FUTURE PROBLEM. AND MAYBE IT'S, YOU
11 KNOW, MAYBE WE ONLY DO A 15-YEAR MEASURE IF THAT'S LIKE HOW
12 MUCH WE CAN ALL TOLERATE AS A REGION. BUT NOT DO LIKE A 40-
13 YEAR MEASURE WHICH AFTER 15 YEARS GOES OFF AND DOES SOMETHING
14 DIFFERENT AND LEAVES BART IN AN EVEN WORSE SITUATION. AND
15 THEN, THE LAST THING IS, I REALLY DON'T UNDERSTAND THE VALUE
16 OF THE OPT-IN APPROACH. IT'S GOING TO BE TOUGH ENOUGH TO PASS
17 A MEASURE IN FOUR COUNTIES THAT IS FOCUSED ON SAVING BART, A
18 TRANSIT OPERATOR, THOSE COUNTIES SHARE AND WE DO SHARE IT,
19 COMMISSIONER CANEPA. AND WE KNOW FROM CONVERSATIONS WITH SAN
20 MATEO, THAT'S LIKE A FRAUGHT RELATIONSHIP, RIGHT? THIS IS NOT
21 LIKE, WE'RE ALL HOLDING HANDS AND SKIPPING OFF INTO THE
22 RAINBOWS. LIKE, IT'S COMPLICATED, OKAY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP
23 THAT'S EXISTED PREVIOUSLY IS PROBABLY GOING TO HAVE TO, I
24 THINK, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO REVISIT IT FOR A NEW MOMENT IN
25 TIME. THE RELATIONSHIP WAS NEGOTIATED PRE-PANDEMIC. VERY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 DIFFERENT RIDERSHIP. VERY DIFFERENT NEEDS FOR BART. AND GOING
2 FORWARD, SAN FRANCISCO, CONTRA COSTA, ALAMEDA ARE
3 RENEGOTIATING THEIR RELATIONSHIP WITH BART, TO A CERTAIN
4 EXTENT, LOOKING LIKE WE HAVE TO TAX OURSELVES MORE AND I THINK
5 IT'S APPROPRIATE FOR SAN MATEO TO ALSO RELOOK AT ITS
6 RELATIONSHIP WITH BART. ADDING SORT OF LIKE NAPA COUNTY TO THE
7 MIX OR SONOMA COUNTY TO THE MIX, AS MUCH AS I LOVE THOSE
8 COUNTIES AND WE SHOULD BE FINDING SOLUTIONS TO THEIR PROBLEMS,
9 IT DOESN'T NATURALLY FIT WITHIN WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO HERE
10 IN SCENARIO ONE WHICH IS A SORT OF BART, MAYBE CALTRAIN-
11 FOCUSED MEASURE. AND IT'S ESPECIALLY CONCERNING BECAUSE THE
12 SORT OF THE INCENTIVES FOR THOSE COUNTIES TO OPT IN ARE MUCH
13 GREATER IF THEY DON'T HAVE THE VOTES TO PASS THEIR OWN
14 MEASURES. BUT THEN, IF THEY DON'T HAVE THE VOTES TO PASS THEIR
15 OWN MEASURES, THAT'S JUST GOING TO SUPPRESS THE VOTES FOR OUR
16 MEASURE AND MAKE THIS SCENARIO ONE LESS LIKELY TO PASS. AND I
17 THINK WE NEED -- YOU KNOW, WE NEED TO BE THINKING -- I THINK
18 WE COULD BE LOOKING AT LIKE A SCENARIO ONE WHICH IF THERE IS
19 ONE -- I AM NOT NEARLY AS FAMILIAR WITH NORTH BAY NEEDS. I
20 KNOW, OBVIOUSLY, SMART IS A HUGE NEED. GOLDEN STATE IS A --
21 GOLDEN GATE IS A BIG ISSUE. LET'S THINK IN SCENARIO ONE, LET'S
22 THINK ABOUT TWO MEASURES. LIKE A SCENARIO ONE FOR THE FULL
23 COUNTIES. AND SCENARIO 1HAND B MEASURE FOR WHAT THE NORTH BAY
24 COUNTIES WANT TO PUT TOGETHER. SO I HOPE -- I HOPE SCENARIO
25 ONE SORT OF ITERATES ON THAT CAN REINCORPORATE THESE COMMENTS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BECAUSE I THINK OTHERWISE WE ARE -- WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE
2 DELIVERING A SET SOLUTIONS THAT WOULD REALLY SOLVE THE
3 PROBLEMS THAT WE ARE TRYING TO ADDRESS. I ALSO HOPE THAT WE
4 CAN LOOK AT A SCENARIO THREE MEASURE, I CAN LOOK AT OPERATOR-
5 LED LOCAL MEASURES. THIS DOESN'T SOLVE A LOT OF PROBLEMS
6 EITHER. JUST AS SCENARIO ONE DOESN'T SOLVE ALL OUR PROBLEMS.
7 BUT I THINK THERE IS A CERTAIN SORT OF CLARITY TO IT. IT'S
8 JUST A SLIGHTLY MORE -- SLIGHTLY SIMPLE -- AGAIN, IT'S AN EVEN
9 SIMPLER PROCESS IN MANY INSTANCES. I THINK IT IS DIFFICULT FOR
10 M.T.C. TO -- TO SORT OF NECESSARILY BE THE ONLY -- LIKE, TAKE
11 THE POSITION IT HAS TAKEN ON A REGIONAL MEASURE ON A SORT OF -
12 - A SET OF COORDINATED OPERATOR-LED LOCAL MEASURES, AND I
13 THINK YOU ACKNOWLEDGED THAT IN YOUR SLIDE. SO I REALLY HOPE WE
14 CAN GET BART AND MUNI AND CALTRAIN AND A.C. TRANSIT, MAYBE, TO
15 KIND OF LIKE ALSO HELP LEAD THIS EFFORT. NOT JUST BY HAVING
16 ONE OF ME SITTING ON THIS DAIS OR A HANDFUL OF US, NOT HAVING
17 JEFF AND POWERS AND OTHERS SITTING AND MICHELLE SITTING ON
18 THE, LIKE, EXECUTIVE DAIS. BUT REALLY KIND OF LIKE SORT OF
19 WORKING -- SORT OF HAND IN GLOVE WITH M.T.C. STAFF TO PUT
20 FORWARD THAT SCENARIO THREE. AND WHAT IS THE LEGISLATIVE
21 AUTHORIZATION THAT WE ARE GOING TO NEED? WHAT IS THE -- HOW
22 ARE WE GOING TO COORDINATE THIS? A WHOLE BUNCH OF QUESTIONS I
23 THINK NEED TO BE ANSWERED. BUT WHICH CAN PUT THAT SCENARIO ON
24 THE TABLE. I THINK THERE IS -- I HAVEN'T SERVED ON M.T.C. AS
25 LONG AS SPERING, BUT EVERYBODY I AM A REGIONALIST, AND I ALSO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT NOT EVERYBODY IN THIS REGION IS. AND HAVING
2 M.T.C. AT THE CENTER OF A MEASURE IS VERY APPEALING FOR SOME,
3 BUT IT IS VERY UNAPPEALING FOR OTHERS. AND SO -- AND THERE ARE
4 DIFFERENT MOMENTS IN TIME WHEN REGIONALISM IS MORE APPEALING
5 AND THERE ARE DIFFERENT MOMENTS IN TIME WHEN REGIONALISM IS
6 LESS APPEALING. AND SO I THINK IT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT FOR
7 US TO HAVE A SCENARIO THREE, ALSO, TO ADDRESS THAT ISSUE,
8 WHERE IT'S NOT NECESSARILY CLEAR THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE GOING
9 INTO AN ELECTION CYCLE WHERE EVERYBODY IS AT SORT OF PEAK
10 ENTHUSIASM FOR M.T.C. AND FOR REGIONALISM. AND I WOULDN'T WANT
11 THAT TO BE THE THING THAT GETS IN THE WAY OF US BEING ABLE TO
12 SAVE OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. WHO'S IN ON YOUR COORDINATED
15 MEASURE? WHAT COUNTIES ARE WE TALKING ABOUT?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK FOR -- FOR MUNI, ALL NINE.
18 NO. FOR MUNI, IT'S OBVIOUSLY I THINK SAN FRANCISCO IS IN ON
19 IT. I THINK FOR BART I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE A FOUR-COUNTY
20 -- ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, SAN FRANCISCO.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THOSE WOULD BE THE FOUR CORE
23 COUNTIES?

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THOSE ARE THE FOUR CORE COUNTIES.
2 SANTA CLARA, SAN FRANCISCO -- AND I IT THINK WE SHOULD TRY TO
3 FIGURE THAT OUT AS WELL. LET'S COME ONE A PROPOSAL. AND I
4 WOULD -- CALTRAIN'S NUMBERS ARE SMALLER. IT'S NOT THE SYSTEM
5 IS LESS IMPORTANT. ITS NUMBERS ARE SMALLER. THAT'S THE
6 WEALTHIEST BIT OF OUR REGION. FROM, YOU KNOW -- FROM SAN
7 FRANCISCO TO SAN JOSE. THERE'S JUST A LOT OF ECONOMIC ACTIVITY
8 THAT GOES ALONG THERE. THERE'S WEALTH. THE PROPORTION OF THAT
9 IS SMALLER. IT'S ALSO POSSIBLE THAT SANTA CLARA DOESN'T WANT
10 TO JOIN BUT SENDS SOME MONEY FROM THE SALES TAX. I THINK WE
11 GOT TO MAKE SURE -- THAT'S MORE DIFFICULT FOR BART. THE
12 NUMBERS ARE A LOT BIGGER. THERE'S NOT AS MUCH MONEY LYING
13 AROUND. FOR CALTRAIN I THINK WE CAN BE CREATIVE.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** FOR ALL INTENTS AND PURPOSES, OPTION ONE
16 IS A FORM OF YOUR COORDINATED MEASURE. WE JUST NEED TO DROP
17 OUT THE OPT-IN AND START WORKING WITH THOSE FOUR COUNTIES.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK AS A VERSION OF THAT. I
20 THINK THEY'RE QUITE SIMILAR.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND I -- I DO WANT TO SAY ONE OF THE
23 REASONS WE HAD THE OPT IN IS WE FELT ALL THE COUNTIES NEED TO
24 PARTICIPATE IN THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN. AND SO IN
25 SOME FORM AND SO THIS WOULD BE -- A COUNTY LIKE SOLANO WANTED



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TO OPT IN, THAT WOULD HELP DEAL WITH THEIR TRANSIT OPERATORS
2 AND SOME LOCAL NEEDS. BUT WE WOULD POLL THOSE COUNTIES. IF
3 THERE ARE ONLY AT 10%, YOU WOULD NOT INCLUDE THEM, BECAUSE
4 IT'S GOING TO DRAG THE THING DOWN. AND SO THERE'S GOT TO BE
5 SOME TRUTH FINDING AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS. BUT I THINK
6 THIS FOUR-COUNTY APPROACH IS CERTAINLY WORTHWHILE PURSUING AND
7 GETTING ALL OF THOSE PEOPLE IN THE ROOM AND HAVING THOSE
8 CONVERSATIONS. AGAIN, YOU KNOW, MUNI IS SOMETHING WE'RE REALLY
9 STRUGGLING WITH AND WE'RE TRYING TO FIND A SOLUTION. YOU HEAR
10 COUNTIES AND IF ANYBODY WANTS TO COMMENT, THEY'RE SAYING,
11 YOU'RE ASKING ME TO TAX MY RESIDENTS AND YOU ARE GOING TO SEND
12 THE MONEY TO SAN FRANCISCO. YOU KNOW, THOSE ARE THE THINGS
13 WE'RE HEARING AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE STRUGGLING WITH. THIS IS
14 NOT AN EASY SOLUTION FOR US. BUT I WILL TELL YOU THAT MUNI, WE
15 HAVE TO DEAL WITH THAT ISSUE IN SOME FASHION.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT,
18 COMMISSIONER SPERING. THERE ARE LOTS OF THINGS WE CAN DRAW ON.
19 I AM NOT GOING TO BRING BACK THE DISCUSSION. THERE ARE LOTS OF
20 THINGS TO DRAW ON TO TRY AND MAKE THAT -- MAKE THIS WORK.
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY, MANNY, YOU'RE UP.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **MANNY LEON:** THAT'S A GREAT TRANSITION BECAUSE MY INITIAL
2 COMMENTS -- AND I'LL ASK TO RESERVE THE RIGHT TO COMMENT
3 LATER. HOW MUCH ARE THE VOTERS WILLING TO SUPPORT, TO YOUR
4 POINT, MR. CHAIR, WHAT YOUR COMMENT WAS? AND WE'VE KIND OF
5 SPOKE AT ALL THESE HEARINGS, THE ALLIANCE -- AS REPRESENTATIVE
6 FOR THE ALLIANCE FOR JOBS, WHAT WILL GET TO THE FINISH LINE?
7 WHAT WILL BE PUT IN A MEASURE THAT WILL BE SUCCESSFUL AND THAT
8 THE VOTERS WILL VOTE ON? SO WITH THAT, WE THINK THAT SCENARIO
9 ONE IS A GOOD STARTING POINT. OBVIOUSLY, THERE'S A LOT OF WORK
10 TO DO ON THIS, BUT IT IS A GOOD STARTING POINT. WE FEEL THAT
11 IT IS. UNDER THE HAT OR UNDER THE PERSPECTIVE OF LOOKING AT
12 WHAT THE VOTERS WILL SUPPORT, WE THINK REFORMS AND
13 ACCOUNTABILITY WILL BE VERY IMPORTANT IN WHATEVER GETS BUILT
14 OUT. YOU KNOW, AND ALSO JUST WHAT COMMISSIONER NOACK SAID.
15 MAYBE IT'S NOT FLUSHED OUT YET. IS THIS KIND OF SLIDING SCALE
16 OVER THE YEARS, WHAT HAPPENS IF THE RIDERSHIP DOES NOT COME
17 BACK OR THE NUMBERS DON'T COME BACK? WHAT DOES THAT MEAN? AND,
18 AGAIN, MAYBE IT'S NOT BUILT OUT BUT THAT'S SOMETHING WE WOULD
19 WANT TO SEE BUILT OUT IS, DO -- DO THOSE COUNTY FLEX FUNDS
20 STILL REMAIN COUNTY FLEX FUNDS? AND SO, AGAIN, YOU KNOW, WE
21 WANT TO BE PARTNERS IN HELP BUILDING OUT SCENARIO ONE IF
22 THAT'S THE WILL OF THE COMMITTEE. WE DO HAVE ONE CONCERN I
23 THINK I SAW IN THE OPT-IN PROVISION, YOU KNOW, REQUIRING THE
24 TRANSIT COMPONENT. IF YOU OPT IN YOU HAVE TO PROVIDE FUNDING
25 FOR OPERATING DEFICITS FOR YOUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. THAT MAY NOT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BE A PRIORITY FOR THAT COUNTY IN PUTTING TOGETHER A MEASURE.
2 SO TO PUT THAT IN AS A RESTRICTION MIGHT BE A DETERRENT OR IT
3 MIGHT BE SOMETHING GOOD. THOSE ARE SOME OF THE THINGS WE WOULD
4 LIKE TO SEE AND WILLING TO WORK ON MOVING FORWARD.

5

6 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GOOD COMMENTS. ADINA. AND THEN STEPHANIE.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** FIRST, I WANT TO EXPRESS A LOT OF THANKS FOR THE
9 LEADERSHIP OF CHAIR SPERING AND THE HARD WORK OF STAFF AND
10 CONSULTANTS IN TRYING TO ASSEMBLE ALL OF THE INPUT IN PUTTING
11 TOGETHER VARIOUS DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR US TO START WITH. IN
12 TERMS OF -- AND REALLY ADDRESSING, NOT ONLY THE MAJOR
13 CHALLENGES, BUT THE OPPORTUNITIES THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED UP
14 OVER THE YEARS FOR THE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT IS
15 REALLY SO ESSENTIAL FOR OUR REGION, FOR OUR ECONOMY, FOR
16 CLIMATE, HOUSING, AND SO ON. SO WITH THAT I WANT -- WITH
17 REGARD TO OPTION ONE, AS PART OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
18 TRANSPORTATION AND SUPPORTING PUBLIC TRANSIT AND SUPPORTING
19 WELL COORDINATED CONVENIENT TRANSIT, OPTION ONE JUST LEAVES A
20 LOT TO BE DESIRED FOR THOSE GOALS. AS SEVERAL PEOPLE
21 MENTIONED, IT'S FAIRLY CATASTROPHIC FOR MUNI IN TERMS OF, I
22 BELIEVE, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR HAD MENTIONED THAT WOULD
23 REQUIRE CUTS OF ABOUT 40% OF THE SERVICE. 150,000 RIDERS. AND
24 THE AMOUNT OF FUNDING ALSO RELATED TO BART WOULD LEAVE LIKELY
25 CUTS AS WELL GIVEN HOW MUCH LESS THAT IS FOR THE AMOUNT THAT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BART NEEDS TO RUN THIS SERVICE. SO IF WE ARE SAYING, IF WE ARE
2 GOING OUT TO VOTERS AND SAYING, WILL YOU PLEASE RAISE YOUR OWN
3 TAXES? WILL YOU RAISE YOUR OWN TAXES AND HAVE SERVICE CUTS?
4 THAT SEEMS LIKE A REALLY CHALLENGING SITUATION TO GO OUT AND
5 TRY AND SELL TO VOTERS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S COME OUT OF
6 THE WORK WITH M.T.C. HAS BEEN IMPROVING CONVENIENCE, HAVING
7 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. THE OPTION ONE TALKS ABOUT TRANSIT
8 TRANSPORTATION. BUT AS BILL CHURCHILL SAID IN THE GENERAL
9 MANAGER MEETING ON FRIDAY, THE CORE OF A TRANSFORMED AND WELL
10 CONVENIENT SERVICE IS SERVICE. YOU CAN'T HAVE A BETTER
11 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IF YOUR BUS AND YOUR TRAIN COMES ON IN AN
12 HOUR. AND THEREFORE, HAVING THAT SERVICE AND HAVING THAT
13 SERVICE BE, YOU KNOW, AROUND THE REGION IS THE FUNDAMENTAL
14 BASELINE OF IMPROVING THAT SERVICE AND IN THAT OPT IN MODEL,
15 IT ALSO SAYS FOR AGENCIES THAT DON'T OPT IN THERE WOULD BE
16 PAYMENT INTO THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BUT IT WOULD COME OUT
17 OF THE MONEY THEY SEE FOR SERVICE. THAT SEEMS -- HOW CAN WE BE
18 TAKING MONEY OUT OF LOCAL SERVICE TO PAY FOR COORDINATION? WE
19 HAVE TO HAVE BETTER SERVICE AND THEN COORDINATE ON TOP OF
20 THAT. I THINK ASKING PEOPLE TO RAISE THEIR TAXES, NOT GET, YOU
21 KNOW, HAVE CUTS, NOT GET A COORDINATED SYSTEM, YOU KNOW, THAT
22 SEEMS LIKE A REALLY DIFFICULT SCENARIO. WHAT WE NEED TO
23 CONFIDENTIALLY TELL SERVICE, YOU WILL GET MAINTAINED SERVICE
24 AND IMPROVED SERVICE, EVEN THAT DOESN'T GET US AS FAR AS WE
25 WOULD PROBABLY EVENTUALLY WANT TO GO. AND I COMPLETELY AGREE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT WE DON'T NEED HE HAD -- NEED TO GET TO A FULLY WORLD-
2 CLASS SERVICE IN ONE STEP. IF THINGS GET WORSE IT WILL BE HARD
3 FOR VOTERS TO STEP IN AGAIN AND AGAIN AND AGAIN. BUT IF WE
4 HAVE SOMETHING THAT GETS BETTER AND OPTION TWO MAINTAINS
5 SERVICE, IT PROVIDES A SWATH OF FUNDING, THE M.T.C. AND
6 TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS REALLY NICE PLAN
7 FOR BETTER CONNECTED SERVICE AND FASTER AND MORE FREQUENT
8 SERVICE ALL AROUND THE REGION AND THIS IS ENABLING MONEY TO GO
9 INTO THAT -- THOSE IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL. AND SO I THINK THAT
10 IS THE OPTION THAT GETS US TOWARDS SOMETHING THAT IS BETTER
11 AND WITHIN THAT, THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO MAKE TWEAKS TO
12 ADDRESS SOME OF THE QUESTIONS THAT WOULD ARISE. I THINK ONE OF
13 THE QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS HAS TO DO WITH HOW LONG WILL THE
14 WHOLE REGION SUPPORT MUNI GIVEN THAT SAN FRANCISCO IS
15 ESSENTIAL TO OUR REGIONAL ECONOMY BUT ALSO PUTTING IN MONEY
16 FROM, YOU KNOW, SO FAR AWAY IS GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE? IS
17 THERE AN OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE SUPPORT FOR MUNI TO PREVENT CUTS
18 IN THE SHORTER TERM AND THEN HAVE A -- YOU KNOW, LONGER TERM
19 WHERE MUNI -- SUPPORT FOR MUNI STEPS BACK AND WE HAVE OTHER
20 SOLUTIONS FOR MUNI FURTHERING -- FURTHER ALONG? ONE OF THE
21 THINGS I WAS GLAD TO HEAR FROM THE VERY BEGINNING OF THE
22 DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW MUCH FLEXIBILITY WE CAN GET ON REVENUE
23 MECHANISMS, THIS IS SOMETHING WHERE THERE'S A LOT OF DIFFERENT
24 OPINIONS AND AS WELL WE HAVE OTHER REGIONS THAT HAVE DONE WELL
25 WITH MULTIPLE REVENUE MECHANISMS ON A BALLOT WHICH WE CAN'T DO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THIS YEAR BUT IF WE WERE ABLE TO IN PARALLEL AND SEPARATE
2 LEGISLATION TO SUCCEED, THAT MIGHT OPEN UP THE SPACE FOR SOME
3 MIX AND MATCH AND COMPROMISES AND DIFFERENT KINDS OF SOLUTIONS
4 SO THAT'S ANOTHER SPACE TO POTENTIALLY LOOK FOR POTENTIAL
5 OPTIONS. AND I THINK ANOTHER THING TO LOOK AT IN TERMS OF --
6 WE ARE LOOKING IN THE LONGER TERM, DEPENDING ON WHERE THINGS
7 GO NATIONALLY, MAYBE IN THE MEDIUM AND LONGER TERM WE MIGHT
8 HAVE NATIONAL FUNDING, WE MIGHT HAVE STATE FUNDING, BUT WE
9 CAN'T COUNT ON IT. LIKE, WE CAN'T GO OUT TO VOTERS AND SAY,
10 HEY, TAX YOURSELVES AND WE'RE EXPECTING OTHER PEOPLE TO COME
11 TO THE RESCUE. BUT WE COULD SAY, THERE MIGHT BE OTHER THINGS
12 THAT HAPPEN LATER, SO LET'S PUT A MID-STREAM CHECK. AND THAT
13 IS SOMETHING THAT VARIOUS DIFFERENT LOCAL MEASURES DO INCLUDE
14 WITH AN ABILITY TO REVIEW WHAT IS HAPPENING AT MID-STREAM FOR
15 WHAT THOSE NEEDS ARE THAT MANY YEARS DOWN THE ROAD. SO I AM
16 GOING TO MAKE ONE POINT ON OPTION THREE AND BE DONE HERE. I
17 THINK OPTION THREE FEELS LIKE HUNGER GAMES TO ME WHERE WE HAVE
18 -- IN SAN FRANCISCO, A SAN FRANCISCO VOTER LOOKING AT A BALLOT
19 AND HAVING BART AND MUNI AND CALTRAIN ALL SAYING, VOTE FOR ME,
20 AND IN ALAMEDA COUNTY SAYING BART OR A.C. TRANSIT, VOTE FOR
21 ME. AND IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY SAYING, OKAY, WE NEED TO DO
22 ANOTHER BALLOT MEASURE TO PUT MONEY IN FOR BART SILICON VALLEY
23 AND OH, PUT MONEY IN SEPARATELY FOR CALTRAIN. THAT SEEMS
24 CONFUSING AND DIFFICULT FOR VOTERS. IT MAYBE IF WE CANNOT
25 AGREE TO WORK TOGETHER AS A REGION, THAT MAY BE WHAT HAPPENS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BUT IT SEEMS HIGHLY UNDESIRABLE TO ME AND, THEREFORE, WORKING
2 ON CREATIVE -- CREATE A VARIANCE ON OPTION TWO TO BE ABLE TO
3 MAKE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM BETTER AND BEING ABLE TO, YOU KNOW,
4 WHEN IT IS FEASIBLE POLL TEST WITH VOTERS TO SEE HOW THEY WANT
5 THE SYSTEM TO GET BETTER. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY, THANK YOU, ADINA. BEFORE WE GO,
8 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ SAID M.T.C. MAY NOT BE THE RIGHT
9 PERSON. I AM HEARING A LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM PEOPLE, YOU KNOW,
10 M.T.C. IS NOT THE GREATEST PERSON -- GROUP TO ADDRESSING THIS.
11 BUT ONE THING I DID HEAR IS THEY HAVE NO LESS CONFIDENCE IN
12 THE OPERATORS THAN THEY DO US. AND I MEAN, I AM HEARING THAT
13 ACROSS THE BOARD. THEY'RE THINKING THE NUMBERS THEY ARE GIVING
14 US ARE BOGUS. THEY THINK ACCOUNTABILITY, THEY NEED TO MAKE
15 CHANGE BEFORE WE EVEN CONSIDER. I MEAN, THE LIST GOES ON AND
16 ON. IT'S COMFORTING TO KNOW THERE'S ONE GROUP THEY TRUST LESS
17 THAN US. AND SO WITH THAT, STEPHANIE.

18

19 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JIM, THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** JIM, YOU'RE NEXT. SORRY. GO AHEAD,
22 STEPHANIE.

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY. JIM SPERING, THANK YOU FOR
25 BEING OUT ON THE FRONT LINES AND HEARING ALL THIS DIRECTLY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 FROM EVERYONE. THANK YOU TO OUR STAFF AND TO MY FELLOW
2 COMMISSIONERS, A LOT OF GOOD COMMENTARY. I JUST WANT TO START
3 BY APPRECIATING WHAT AN INCREDIBLE ASSET TRANSIT IN THE BAY
4 AREA IS. IT'S THE REASON WE DON'T LOOK SO MUCH LIKE LOS
5 ANGELES WHERE I GREW UP BECAUSE WE HAD TRANSIT AND WE WERE
6 COMMITTED TO IT. I THINK -- I AM GOING TO ALIGN MY COMMENTS
7 WITH COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. TRANSIT IS CHANGING. AND I THINK
8 FAIR BOX -- FARE BOX RECOVERY IS A MAJOR SOURCE OF FUNDING.
9 THOSE DAYS ARE OVER. SO I DO THINK WHATEVER PLANS WE MAKE WILL
10 BE FOR THE LONG TERM. I WANT TO ASK OUR STAFF A COUPLE OF
11 QUESTIONS JUST ON THE TIMING OF THE CORE FUNDING ISSUE. WHAT
12 WAS IT ABOUT EIGHT YEARS, GOING OUT EIGHT AS OPPOSED TO 10,
13 WHICH IS WHAT A LOT OF MEASURES USUALLY DO, BEFORE YOU START
14 SHIFTING THE FUNDING BUCKETS?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. IT WAS REALLY CONSTRUCTED AROUND WHEN THE
17 FIRST SALES TAXES START NEEDING TO BE RE-AUTHORIZED IN CONTRA
18 COSTA AND SAN MATEO.

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THAT'S WHAT I THOUGHT. IT WAS -- AND
21 THEN THE 30-YEAR FUNDING HORIZON, I THINK I SAID AT OUR LAST
22 MEETING, LOOKS MORE LIKE A CAPITAL R.M.-4 RATHER THAN DEALING
23 WITH A TRANSIT SHORTFALL. SO I WANT TO UNDERSTAND 30 YEARS
24 JUST HOW YOU PICKED THAT AS OPPOSED TO SOMETHING SHORTER?

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **STUART COHEN:** WELL, THE SHORTER BECOMES PROBLEMATIC, DEPENDING
2 ON THE FUNDING SOURCE. BUT WE HEARD, YOU KNOW, FOR SALES TAX,
3 IN PARTICULAR, THE COUNTIES WOULD BE EXTREMELY CONCERNED IF WE
4 DID A 10-YEAR MEASURE BASED ON SALES TAX THAT THEY'RE TRYING
5 TO RENEW AS EARLY GOING TO THE BALLOT IN 2028, POTENTIALLY IN
6 SAN MATEO AND CONTRA COSTA. AND SO THIS WOULD MAKE IT HARDER
7 IF THEY WOULD HAVE PASSED ONE IN 2026. SO BY EXTENDING IT, WE
8 SAID, IF YOURS DIDN'T RENEW -- LET'S SAY THAT THIS MEASURE
9 PASSED, THE CORE TRANSIT NETWORK, BUT THEY WEREN'T ABLE TO
10 RENEW, THEY WOULD KNOW AT LEAST IN 2034, WHEN THEIRS EXPIRES,
11 THERE IS A NEW INFUSION OF FUNDS. THAT'S WHAT KIND OF WHAT
12 NECESSITATED THE 30 YEARS. OVERALL ON THE 30 YEARS, IT'S KIND
13 OF THE AVERAGE OF WHAT A LOT OF THE MORE RECENT SALES TAXES GO
14 FOR. THERE WAS A SENSE THAT -- THERE ARE SOME THAT ARE 20 OR
15 25, BUT VOTERS ARE READY TO DO 30. THEY DON'T DISTINGUISH SO
16 MUCH. I'LL JUST ALSO SAY EVEN MORE RECENTLY, THERE'S BEEN A
17 MOVE IN SOME COUNTIES THAT HAS PASSED TO NOT HAVE AN
18 EXPIRATION. AND MAYBE THE FARE REVENUE MODEL GOES AWAY, THAT'S
19 SOMETHING THAT CAN BE LOOKED AT. BUT BASICALLY, THE
20 TERMINOLOGY OF UNTIL REPEALED BY VOTERS REPLACES THE TIME
21 FRAME, AND IT TURNS OUT TO BE RELATIVELY POPULAR AS WELL.

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS OKAY --**

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 >>**STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS**: OKAY. THANK YOU, STUART. I
2 APPRECIATE THAT. AS I LOOK AT THE NORTH BAY SMART ISSUE,
3 THINKING ABOUT THE OPT IN, CAN WE DO AN OPT IN TO SEE IF WE
4 CAN FUND SMART AND A BUNCH OF OTHER GOODIES THAT WAY AND IF IT
5 DOESN'T PASS, THEN SMART GOES AND DOES ITS OWN THING? IT'S
6 INTERESTING WHICH ONE COMES BEFORE THE OTHER. I WANT TO
7 RESPOND TO SOMETHING, NICK, YOU SAID ABOUT MUNI AND THE --
8 MUNI HAS COMMUTE TRIPS AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT
9 SAN FRANCISCO IS DENSE. BUT PEOPLE COME IN FROM THE REVENUES
10 THAT IS THE WORKFORCE COMMUTING INTO DOWNTOWN. SO THOSE AREN'T
11 REALLY LOCAL TRIPS. THOSE ARE COMMUTE LINES. I THINK WE COULD
12 HOLD THOSE DIFFERENTLY WITH MUNI THAN WE DO SOME OF THEIR
13 LOCAL SERVICE. AND MAYBE FIND A WAY TO BRING MUNI MORE INTO
14 THE FOUR-COUNTY SOLUTION FOR SUPPORT. SO I WANT TO OFFER THAT
15 UP, AS SOMEONE WHO'S LIVED IN THE CITY AND SEEN THE DIFFERENCE
16 IN THE COMMUTE PATTERNS. AND THEN, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
17 BART AND OUR OTHER COMMUTE PROVIDERS ARE REALLY FACING A
18 SYSTEMIC CHANGE. AS I SAID WHEN I STARTED, THAT'S NOT COMING
19 BACK, I DON'T THINK. AND I THINK YOU ARE RIGHT, NICK. AND I
20 THINK WE JUST HAVE TO PLAN FOR THAT AND WE HAVE TO LOOK AWAY
21 FROM FARE BOX RECOVERY FOR SOMETHING AND -- SO MUCH AND INTO
22 TRANSIT AS A SERVICE AND FIGURE OUT HOW TO PAY FOR IT IN THE
23 REGION. I DO THINK CLARITY TO VOTERS IS ESSENTIAL, AND OPTION
24 TWO IS NOT CLEAR IN THE AGGREGATE TO ME, SO I DON'T KNOW HOW I
25 WOULD SELL THAT EXCEPT MORE ON AN INDIVIDUAL BASIS IN SOME



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WAY. AND THEN, FINALLY, I JUST WANT TO SAY SOMETHING ABOUT
2 CHANGE MANAGEMENT. AND I SAID THIS BEFORE. IF WE'RE TRYING TO
3 BECOME A REGION, I APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK, AGAIN, AS
4 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ SAID, SOME PEOPLE ARE FOR THAT. SOME
5 PEOPLE ARE NOT. BUT IT IS A PROCESS TO TRANSITION FROM
6 LOCALITIES TO A REGION AND YOU CAN'T GET THERE ALL IN ONE FELL
7 SWOOP. YOU HAVE TO DO IT OVER TIME. AND SOMETIMES THE WAY YOU
8 DO IT, I'VE SEEN IN MY COUNTY, IS YOU AGREE ON STANDARDS THAT
9 ALL THE AGENCIES ARE GOING TO USE AND THEN YOU TIE THE FUNDING
10 TO FOLLOWING THOSE STANDARDS BUT YOU DON'T FORCE POLITICAL
11 CONSOLIDATION AND YOU MAY NOT FORCE CONSOLIDATION INTO ONE
12 MEASURE EITHER BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW THAT ONE SIZE FITS ALL
13 REALLY WORKS FOR US. SO I AM GOING TO SAY I'M MORE FOR THE
14 CORE TRANSIT FUNDING RIGHT NOW, BUT I'M OPEN TO LOOKING AT
15 WHAT INDIVIDUALIZED OPTIONS FOR OPTION TWO COULD LOOK LIKE.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. JIM WUNDERMAN. JIM, WE SEE THE
18 HANDS THAT ARE RAISED AND WE'LL BE GETTING TO YOU IN JUST A
19 MINUTE SO WE DEFINITELY SEE YOU. THANK YOU, JIM.

20

21 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. THANK A LOT OF GOOD,
22 INCITE. COMMENTS -- INCITEFUL COMMENTS AND APPRECIATE ALL THE
23 WORK YOU'RE DOING AND THE M.T.C. TEAM AND STUART. YOU'RE
24 WRESTLING WITH QUITE A BEAR HERE. I FEEL FOR THE AGENCIES WHO
25 ARE, YOU KNOW, STRUGGLING AND SEE THE FUTURE AND IT LOOKS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 PRETTY DISASTROUS. THERE'S NO QUESTION ABOUT IT. I COMMENT
2 THIS AS SOMEONE THAT'S BEEN A TRANSIT ADVOCATE, WHO WORKS FOR
3 THE GROUP, WHO CREATED BART, CREATED WETA. HAS BEEN A
4 SUPPORTER OF I THINK EVERY TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT'S HIT
5 THE BALLOT IN ALL THE YEARS, CERTAINLY I'VE BEEN AT BAY AREA
6 COUNCIL, AND I THINK BEFORE THAT. BUT, YOU KNOW, I AM HERE
7 REPRESENTING THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY. I THINK THAT'S WHY YOU
8 ASKED ME TO SERVE. AND A LOT OF THE FOLKS HERE, A LOT OF YOU
9 REPRESENT CITIES AND COUNTIES, THE PUBLIC THROUGH PUBLIC
10 JURISDICTIONS AND FOLKS IN LABOR AND SO FORTH. BUT I
11 SPECIFICALLY AM HERE TO -- AND SPENT A LOT OF MY TIME THINKING
12 ABOUT BUSINESS. WHAT I WILL SAY, I THINK I SAID IN THE LAST
13 MEETING, SO I JUST WANT TO START OFF BY SAYING, I LIKE TO SEE
14 US SOLVE THIS PROBLEM. YOU KNOW, I WANT OUR COMMUNITY TO BE
15 PARTY TO BUILDING A CONSENSUS THAT'S A SMART AND ACHIEVABLE
16 CONSENSUS TO DO IT. IT'S A -- WE'RE FACING SERIOUS ISSUES IN
17 THE FUTURE THAT AFFECT EVERYBODY IF WE DON'T DO THAT. SO I
18 HOPE WE CAN GET THERE. YOU KNOW, THAT SAID, WHAT I SAID IN THE
19 LAST MEETING WAS BASED ON MY EXPERIENCE AND POLLING THAT WAS
20 SHOWED BY E.M.C. AND SO FORTH. THE SALES TAX IS THE MOST
21 VIABLE WAY TO GET THE PUBLIC ONBOARD. IT TESTS BETTER. IT'S
22 BEEN A BETTER EXPERIENCE, AND I THINK THERE'S A LIKELY -- I
23 DON'T KNOW LIKELY IS THE RIGHT WORD, BUT THE MOST LIKELY PATH
24 TO SUCCESS, I BELIEVE, IS THROUGH THAT. YOU KNOW, IT'S A VERY
25 DEFUSED WAY OF GETTING MONEY. BUSINESS PAYS ITS FARE SHARE OF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT TAX. ALMOST 40%. WEALTHIER PEOPLE PAY A LOT MORE SALES
2 TAX THAN PEOPLE OF LOWER INCOME. SO THERE'S MORE -- THERE'S
3 MORE EQUITY IN IT THAN I BELIEVE IT'S GIVEN CREDIT FOR. I SAID
4 THAT IN THE LAST MEETING, AND I'LL MAINTAIN IT. THE -- WHAT
5 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ SAID ABOUT THE TIMING OF THE REGIONAL
6 MEASURE AND WHICH CAN BE SUCCESSFUL, I THINK THERE'S A LOT TO
7 THAT, UNFORTUNATELY. WE'RE REGIONALISTS AT THE CORE. THAT'S
8 THE WHOLE REGION OUR ORGANIZATION EXISTS. AND WE WORKED WITH
9 HIM AND OTHERS ON A MAJOR REGIONAL MEASURE AND THERE WAS A LOT
10 OF ENTHUSIASM AROUND THAT MEASURE. WE NEVER GOT TO THE DEBATE
11 THAT WE'RE KIND OF HAVING HERE ABOUT HOW TO PAY FOR IT. WE
12 ASSUMED IT WAS A SALES TAX. WE POLLED A SALES TAX. WE THOUGHT
13 WE WERE IN EARSHOT OF MAKING IT WITH A SALES TAX, BUT OTHER
14 FOLKS HERE RAISED THE ISSUES AROUND SALES TAX, EQUITY, AND SO
15 FORTH, THAT WE NEVER GOT TO THAT DEBATE WHEN THE PANDEMIC HIT
16 AND THE MEASURE WAS PUT ASIDE BACK AT THAT TIME. I DON'T KNOW
17 HOW IT WOULD TURN OUT. THE SCENARIO ONE -- I HEAR THE POINTS,
18 THE CONFUSION OF STUART AROUND EIGHT YEARS OF THIS AND SO MANY
19 YEARS OF THAT AND WE'LL FLEX. IT DOESN'T SOUND EASY TO EXPLAIN
20 TO PEOPLE IN A WAY THEY CAN TAKE IT IN AND POINTED BY A NUMBER
21 OF FOLKS HERE. IT DOESN'T SOLVE ALL OF THE PROBLEMS. I THINK
22 ADINA SAID WE'RE GOING TO ASK THE VOTERS TO SPEND MORE MONEY
23 AND NOT SOLVE THE PROBLEM. I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE A HOLE
24 TO DO THAT, ESPECIALLY UNDER THE CIRCUMSTANCES WE'RE FACING
25 NOW AND PEOPLE, AS MANNY SAID, PEOPLE ARE FEELING REALLY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 PUSHED. IN ALL OF THE POLLING WE SEE SAYS IT. IT WAS POINTED
2 OUT MAYBE WE'LL HEAD INTO A DIFFERENT TIME. WE GOT -- WE GOT A
3 DIFFERENT KIND OF PRESIDENTIAL RACE THAN WHAT WE EXPECTED WITH
4 A DIFFERENT KIND OF CANDIDATE AT THE TOP OF THE TICKET. THAT
5 COULD LEAD TO DIFFERENT OPPORTUNITIES. TALKED ABOUT THAT IN
6 THE LAST TURN AS WELL. SO MAYBE THINGS WILL BE DIFFERENT IN
7 THE FUTURE. I HOPE THEY ARE DIFFERENT IN THE FUTURE BECAUSE
8 THE PUBLIC -- THE PUBLIC HAS TO ACCEPT RESPONSIBILITY FOR
9 INVESTING IN AND MAINTAINING AND IMPROVING COMMON
10 INFRASTRUCTURE AND FACILITIES. THEY ARE NECESSARY FOR SOCIETY.
11 AND SO IT'S JUST A REALLY DANGEROUS THING WHEN YOU GET WHERE
12 NOBODY WANTS TO FUND ANYTHING. HOWEVER, IT IS WHAT IT IS.
13 THERE IS A LACK OF CONFIDENT. IT'S BORNE OUT IN POLLING. IT'S
14 BORNE OUT ANTIDOTALLY IN CONVERSATION WITH MEMBERS OF THE
15 PUBLIC. WE HEAR IT ALL THE TIME. I HEAR IT FROM MY MEMBERS ALL
16 THE TIME. SO IT'S TOUGH. ONE OF THE THINGS WHEN I TALK TO MY
17 MEMBERS ABOUT THIS, ONE OF THE THINGS THEY OFTEN SAY IS
18 SOMETHING THAT NONE -- NOBODY HERE EVER SAYS. SO I'LL SAY IT.
19 THEY SAY, WELL, WHAT ARE THEY DOING TO SAVE MONEY? WHAT ARE
20 THEY DOING TO REDUCE COSTS? BECAUSE IN BUSINESS, THAT'S WHAT
21 YOU DO WHEN YOUR CUSTOMERS ARE NOT DOING WHAT YOU HOPE THEY
22 DO. THEY'RE NOT WILLING TO PAY THE PRICE OR THERE'S LESS OF
23 THEM. IN THE PANDEMIC, MY ORGANIZATION, A SMALL ORGANIZATION,
24 WE HAD SOME PRESSURE ON US LIKE I THINK MOST FOLKS DID. PART
25 OF OUR SOLUTION WAS TO SAVE MONEY. I HAD TO BE ABLE TO EXPLAIN



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TO MY BOARD WHAT WE WERE GOING TO DO TO SAVE MONEY. I DIDN'T
2 WANNA BECAUSE IT ACTUALLY MEANT CUTTING OUT POSITIONS AND
3 REDUCING THINGS I DIDN'T WANT TO REDUCE, BUT IT ALSO ENABLED
4 US TO RAISE DUES A LITTLE BIT AND THERE WAS A BALANCE. SO WHEN
5 WE ASKED THE COMPANIES TO MUTT IN -- PUT IN A LITTLE BIT MORE
6 WE WERE ABLE TO SAY WE WERE TIGHTENING OUR BELTS. BUT THERE'S
7 NO DISCUSSION OF THIS. WE'RE ON A REVENUE -- TRANSPORTATION
8 REVENUE TASK FORCE. I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT WOULD SIT WITH THE
9 PUBLIC IF WE ASKED THEM, BUT MY INSTINCT IS THAT WE SHOULD BE
10 REALLY -- WE COLLECTIVELY AND SINGULARLY, THE AGENCIES SHOULD
11 BE REALLY LOOKING AT THIS POINT WITH HOW TO REDUCE THEIR
12 COSTS. THE OTHER THING THAT COMES UP A LOT AND IT WAS STATED -
13 - I THINK JIM SPERING STATED THIS AS A HIGH PRIORITY. I ALWAYS
14 STATE IT AS A TOP PRIORITY BECAUSE IT COMES UP IN OUR POLLING
15 IS SAFETY. WE DISCUSSED THIS ISSUE A LOT AND SAFETY ISSUES
16 KEEP ARISING. THERE AREN'T TOO MANY DAYS OR WEEKS THAT GO BY
17 WHEN THERE ISN'T SOME REALLY HORRIFIC EVENT THAT HAPPENS WHERE
18 PASSENGERS OR CREW ARE AFFECTED. AND I THINK IF -- I DON'T
19 KNOW WHAT WE MEAN WHEN WE TALK ABOUT TRANSPORTATION -- BEING
20 TRANSFORMATIONAL, BUT THE MAIN TRANSFORMATION I THINK THE
21 PUBLIC WANTS TO SEE IS IMPROVEMENTS IN SAFETY. AND IF WE'RE
22 GOING TO DO A MEASURE OF ANY KIND, I THINK WE HAVE TO BE CLEAR
23 THAT WE MEAN THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE VERY CREATIVE AND VERY
24 INDUSTRIOUS ON THIS SYSTEM. I HEAR PEOPLE SAY THEY DON'T WANT
25 TO USE TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY'RE AFRAID OF IT. SO I THINK THAT'S



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 AN IMPORTANT -- THAT SHOULD BE AN IMPORTANT AND STIPULATED
2 ELEMENT OF WHAT WE DO. I KNOW IT'S NEVER BEEN PART OF A
3 MEASURE BEFORE, BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK THESE ARE THE TIMES
4 THAT WE'RE IN. FINALLY, THERE'S AN ISSUE OF PEOPLE WHO DRIVE
5 CARS AND NEED TO DRIVE A CAR, CHOOSE TO DRIVE A CAR, MUST
6 DRIVE A CAR OR A TRUCK FOR THEIR LIFE. IF WE'RE GOING TO DO A
7 BIG MEASURE IN THE REGION, WHICH I HOPE WE DO. MAYBE WE WON'T
8 DO IT FOR A WHILE, BUT IF WE DO ONE AND WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO
9 GET THE PUBLIC BEHIND A BIG MEASURE AND WE'RE COMPLETELY
10 IGNORING 80% OF TRIP-DOERS WHO USE THEIR VEHICLE, I JUST THINK
11 IT'S A FOOL'S ERRAND. THERE NEEDS TO BE A COMING TOGETHER OF
12 INTERESTS, AND WE WANT PEOPLE OUT OF THE CARS. WE NEED TO
13 PROVIDE A BETTER TRANSPORTATION SCENARIO. BUT ON A REGIONAL
14 BASIS, WE HAVE TO -- WE HAVE TO GET PRETTY REALISTIC ABOUT
15 THIS. MAYBE IN SAN FRANCISCO WE HAVE A VERY HIGH USAGE OF MASS
16 TRANSIT PER CAPITA, MAYBE IT'S A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT. I DOUBT
17 THAT IT'S ENTIRELY DIFFERENT, BUT THAT MIGHT BE THE OUTLIER ON
18 THAT. FOR THE REST OF THE REGION, YOU'RE DEALING WITH A LOT OF
19 DRIVERS WHO ARE ALREADY THINK THEY'RE PAYING A LOT AND NOT
20 GETTING A RETURN ON THE GAS TAX THAT THEY PAY AND EVERYTHING
21 ELSE IN LIFE. SO I THINK WE NEED A DOSE OF REALISM AROUND THAT
22 AND OUR -- FRANKLY, OUR SYSTEM NEEDS IMPROVEMENT. YOU GO
23 AROUND THE REGION AND THERE'S AREAS THAT HAVE BEEN FRUSTRATING
24 FOR DECADES. AND IF WE'RE GOING TO SPEND A LOT OF MONEY, AN
25 OPPORTUNITY TO DO SOMETHING ABOUT THEM AND WE'RE GOING TO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 IGNORE THAT BECAUSE THERE'S A SHORTFALL IN OPERATIONS. I THINK
2 WE NEED TO ADDRESS IT. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT -- AND I THINK -- I'M
3 CURIOUS, CONCERNED ABOUT THE THIRD OPTION WITH NICK -- WHAT
4 NICK POINTED OUT, WHICH MAYBE IT'S A BETTER TIME -- MAYBE THE
5 PUBLIC COULD RELATE BETTER TO A REQUEST FROM BART OR A REQUEST
6 FROM MUNI OR A REQUEST FROM V.T.A. OR A.C. OR SOMEBODY ELSE.
7 BECAUSE IT'S A LITTLE CLOSER TO HOME. AND THEY CAN UNDERSTAND
8 A LITTLE BETTER WHAT THE MEETING IS TO THEM. AT A DIFFERENT
9 TIME, I THINK YOU CAN -- I THINK WE COULD SELL THE PUBLIC ON A
10 BIG TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, AND I HOPE WE DO. I THINK WE NEED
11 ONE. I'M JUST NOT SURE IT'S THE TIME. I REGRET HAVING TO SAY
12 THAT. BUT IT'S SO COMPLICATED. AND AS WE SAID -- AS AT LEAST I
13 SAID LAST WEEK AND I SAW SUPERVISOR CANEPA QUOTED SAYING THE
14 SAME THING IS, THE PUBLIC DOESN'T AGREE THAT WE NEED THIS
15 MONEY FOR TRANSIT. AND WE, GOING AROUND THE ROOM, DOESN'T
16 SOUND LIKE WE AGREE WITH EACH OTHER. SO THIS IS -- SO HOW DO
17 WE EXPECT THE VOTERS TO COME ALONG WHEN WE REALLY DON'T HAVE A
18 CONSENSUS? FINALLY THING I'LL SAY, A PAYROLL TAX, IN THE BAY
19 AREA WITH WHAT'S GOING ON IN BUSINESS, I HOPE YOU GUYS ARE
20 NOTICING WHAT'S HAPPENING AS OUR COMPANIES ARE EITHER LEAVING
21 OUR REGION OR GROWING THEIR FACILITIES ELSEWHERE BECAUSE IT'S
22 SO DARN EXPENSIVE TO BE HERE. A PAYROLL TAX IS A COMPLETE
23 NONSTARTER, YOU KNOW, FOR THIS ORGANIZATION, I CAN PROMISE YOU
24 THAT. AND I THINK A PARCEL TAX IS CLOSE. WE SUPPORT IT, WE
25 DROVE A PARCEL TAX BACK IN 2016, A \$12 PER PARCEL TAX IN ALL



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 NINE COUNTIES. THE FIRST ONE DONE TO FUND A RESILIENCY AROUND
2 THE SHORELINE TO REPLACE -- TO IMPROVE WETLANDS, WHICH
3 LEVERAGED A LOT OF FEDERAL MONEY AND OTHER MONEY AND THERE'S A
4 LOT OF PROJECTS GOING ON. WE WERE VERY PROUD TO HAVE WORKED
5 WITH SPUR AND SBLG ON THAT MEASURE. IT TOOK A LOT OF THINKING.
6 SENATOR FEINSTEIN. WE CHECKED -- WE THOUGHT \$12, WHICH RAISED
7 A TOTAL OF \$500 MILLION, WAS INSUFFICIENT. BUT WHEN WE CHECKED
8 OUT \$15 AND \$20 AND \$25, THE PUBLIC STARTED TO GO AWAY. WE
9 NEEDED 2/3. WE GOT 70%. SO WE PASSED -- I AM NOT AGAINST A
10 PARCEL TAX. WE WERE THERE TO SUPPORT THE HOUSING MEASURE THAT
11 DIDN'T QUITE MAKE IT. YOU KNOW, AND I THINK THE HOUSING
12 COMMUNITY, THE NONPROFIT HOUSING COMMUNITY HAS THEIR EYE ON
13 DOING THIS AGAIN AND HAS THE PARCEL TAX AS -- IN THEIR FOCUS.
14 SO I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE DISCUSSIONS AROUND THAT ARE, BUT
15 THERE'S DEFINITELY A DEMAND FOR THAT SOURCE OF FUNDS. AND
16 MAYBE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING, IT'S A MORE APPROPRIATE FUNDING
17 SOURCE. I DON'T KNOW. BUT FOR IN AMOUNT OF MONEY, AS
18 SUPERVISOR RABBITT SAID, IT WILL BE A MATERIAL INCREASE IN
19 PEOPLE'S PROPERTY TAXES. IT'S NOT \$12 A YEAR, WHICH WE ARE ALL
20 PAYING IF YOU OWN A PROPERTY. IT'S A LOT MORE. AND SO FORTH.
21 SO THAT'S MY COMMENTS. I HOPE WE'RE ABLE TO FIGURE OUT SOME
22 PATH TO THIS, BECAUSE IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. WE'LL TRY TO DO
23 OUR BEST TO BE PART OF IT. THANK YOU.
24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALLEN, I'LL GO TO YOU IN A SECOND. WE WERE
2 ASKED TO DEAL WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF, THE SHORTFALL. THAT'S
3 WHAT WE'VE BEEN FOCUSING ON. AND I MET WITH PROBABLY 20, 30
4 GROUPS, INDIVIDUALS, AND I ASK THEM WHAT'S IMPORTANT AND WHAT
5 THEY SAY IS SAFETY, CLEANLINESS, FREQUENCY. THAT'S THE ORDER
6 THEY GIVE IT TO ME. IT HAS TO BE SAFE. THE PERCEPTION IT'S NOT
7 SAFE IS A SERIOUS PROBLEM THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. I
8 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS. IT'S WHAT WE'RE HEARING IN THE
9 REGION, TOO, BUT I JUST DON'T KNOW THIS COMMITTEE HAS ENOUGH
10 TIME TO DO THIS BIG MEASURE THAT WE NEED TO IF HE CUSS ON THE
11 CHALLENGE THAT'S AHEAD OF IT THAT WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH. IF WE
12 HAVE A CATASTROPHIC FAILURE IN THE PUBLIC TRANSIT, THAT IS
13 GOING TO BE VERY DIFFICULT TO RECOVER FROM. AND I JUST LIKE TO
14 REMIND EVERYONE, THIS IS KIND OF STEP ONE. YOU KNOW, WHATEVER
15 WE DO HERE, THE BIG PROBLEM DOESN'T GO AWAY AND IT'S GOING TO
16 HAVE TO BE ADDRESSED THROUGH A MEASURE LIKE JIM'S TALKING
17 ABOUT, A LARGE MEASURE THAT WE CAN BUILD A CONSENSUS. I JUST
18 HOPE WE CAN AT LEAST COME UP WITH SOMETHING TO DEAL WITH THE
19 IMMEDIATE PROBLEMS AT THE -- THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE
20 DEALING WITH, STEP ONE, STEP TWO CAN BE A BIGGER ISSUE.

21

22 **JIM WUNDERMAN:** CHRIS KELLY FROM HERCULES CAUTIONED ME NOT TO
23 TALK ABOUT RELIABILITY. IN THE SPIRIT OF WHAT YOU SAID AND SHE
24 SAID, RELIABILITY IS REALLY IMPORTANT.

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** FREQUENT SERVICE AND RELIABILITY. THAT'S
2 CORRECT. ELLEN AND ALICIA, AIL GO TO YOU AND RAAVAN.

3

4 **ELLEN WU:** WE HEARD A LOT OF ARGUMENTS. I WILL REITERATE SOME.
5 I THINK THE CORE TRANSIT IN SCENARIO ONE, I'M NOT SURE THE
6 TITLE, CORE TRANSIT, IS ACCURATE IN WHAT IT'S ACTUALLY TRYING
7 TO ACHIEVE SINCE THERE WILL BE SERVICE REDUCTIONS AS A RESULT
8 OF THOSE. AND WHILE ASKING VOTERS TO, YOU KNOW, TAX THEMSELVES
9 AND SEE A REDUCTION. ALSO THINK THERE IS AN ANALYSIS WE SHOULD
10 THINK ABOUT IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO MEET OUR PLAN BAY
11 AREA 2050 GOALS IN SCENARIO ONE GIVEN THE SERVICE CUTS, WHICH,
12 YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD REALLY TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AS WELL AS
13 ALL THE OTHER ELEMENTS OF THIS. SCENARIO TWO, GO BIG, SOUNDS
14 LIKE IT'S A REACH BUT I THINK IT'S ACTUALLY A SCENARIO THAT
15 MANY OF US HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT AND THINKING ABOUT AND WHEN
16 WE THINK ABOUT NEEDS OF THE REGION IS APPROPRIATE FOR. IT WILL
17 INCREASE THE SERVICE LEVELS. IT WILL IMPROVE THE SYSTEM WITH
18 PROGRESSIVE REVENUE. AND WITH ALL DUE RESPECT TO MR.
19 WUNDERMAN, THERE IS ACTUALLY A DEFINITION OF REGRESSIVE AND
20 PROGRESSIVE TAXES AND A SALES TAX, BY ALL EXPERT ACCOUNTS, IS
21 A REGRESSIVE REVENUE TAX THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE PAY MORE OF
22 AND TAKE THE BURDEN OF. SO DEFINITELY WANT TO JUST GET THAT
23 OUT THERE. AND ALSO, THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF DIFFERENT
24 POLLING AROUND DIFFERENT REVENUE MECHANISMS, AND IN ONE OF OUR
25 POLLS, THE SALES TAX DID WORSE THAN OTHER PROGRESSIVE TAXES.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 SO WE ALL USE INFORMATION AND DATA THE WAY WE WANT TO USE IT,
2 BUT I THINK THERE ARE CERTAIN FACTS THAT I JUST WANTED TO MAKE
3 SURE TO PUT ON THE TABLE.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ALICIA. GO AHEAD.

6

7 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** FIRST, I WANT TO THANK OF THE STAFF THAT
8 WORKED ON THE SCENARIOS. THEY HEARD FROM EVERYONE AT OUR LAST
9 MEETING. WHILE WE APPRECIATE THE DIRECTION THIS COMMITTEE HAS
10 TAKEN TO ESTABLISH THE REVENUE MODEL FIRST AND THEN DISCUSS
11 POLICY, IN LIGHT OF RECENT EVENTS, OUR OFFICE MUST INSIST ON
12 THE IMPORTANCE OF FOREGROUNDING GOVERNANCE TRANSFORMATION AND
13 ENHANCE COORDINATION IN THESE CONVERSATIONS. THE RECENT ERRORS
14 WITH THE BAHFA BOND REQUIRES US TO TAKE A HOLISTIC LOOK AT ALL
15 ENTITIES INVOLVED IN PUBLIC TRANSIT. ALL YOU KNOW THE COST OF
16 THE MEASURE WAS LISTED AS \$670 MILLION WHEN IT WOULD ACTUALLY
17 BE \$910 MILLION AFTER INTEREST. THIS LED TO LAWSUITS AND
18 RESULTED IN POLLING THE TRANSFORMATIVE -- PULLING THE
19 TRANSFORMATIVE HOUSING MEASURE FROM THE BALLOT, WHICH MANY
20 RELIED ON TO MEET THEIR HOUSING GOALS. WE CANNOT ASK VOTERS TO
21 BACK ANY TYPE OF REVENUE MEASURES WHEN THE ENTITIES MOST
22 RESPONSIBLE FOR RECEIVING AND EXPANDING THOSE FUNDS HAVE
23 SHAKEN PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THEIR ABILITY TO DO SO. AT THIS
24 TIME, WE CANNOT ENDORSE EITHER OPTION, BUT WE WILL REMIND
25 EVERYONE THAT FREMONT, HEYWARD, NEWARK AND MUNI, CITIES IN OUR



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 DISTRICT, ALONG WITH THE CITY OF ALAMEDA, ALBANY, AND SAN
2 LEANDRO, ALL HAVE THE HIGHEST SALES TAX RATES IN CALIFORNIA AT
3 10.75%. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, ALICIA. RAYAN.

6

7 **RAYAN MOHTASHEMI:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. APPRECIATE THE
8 OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND THANK YOU, AGAIN, TO
9 STUART AND ALL OF THE STAFF FOR ENGAGING ON THIS TOPIC ALONG
10 WITH ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND APOLOGIZE FOR ANY
11 BACKGROUND NOISE YOU MIGHT HEAR AS I SPEAK. SO JUST WANTED TO
12 PROVIDE A FEW COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF SENATOR WIENER REGARDING
13 THE QUESTIONS FOR COMMITTEE DISCUSSION. IN TERMS OF THE
14 QUESTIONS ON THE SCENARIOS, IT'S CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, IS A
15 GOOD-FAITH EFFORT TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE OF TRANSIT, OPERATING
16 DEFICITS, AND A NEED FOR TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS. IN THE
17 FRAMEWORK OF MANY POLITICAL AND OTHER FEASIBILITY CONSTRAINTS
18 THAT EXIST, SENATOR WIENER DEFINITELY WANTS TO STRESS A NEED
19 FOR LONG-TERM SUSTAINABLE FUNDING FOR BART AS WELL AS
20 ESPECIALLY IN THE NEAR TERM A REGIONAL MEASURE COVERING THE
21 BULK OF MUNI SHORTFALL IS IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF AVOIDING
22 POTENTIALLY CONFLICTING TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURES THAT
23 COULD ERODE SUPPORT FOR EACH OTHER AT THE BALLOT AT THE SAME
24 TIME AS MUNI'S SHORTFALL CERTAINLY ISN'T GOING AWAY AND WE
25 APPRECIATE CHAIR SPERING -- ISN'T GOING AWAY JUST BECAUSE OF



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 REGIONAL MEASURE DOESN'T FULLY COVER THAT SHORTFALL IN THE
2 NEAR TERM. THERE WOULD STILL BE A NEED TO COVER THAT DEFICIT
3 IN SOME OTHER TERM. SO PERHAPS A WAY TO KIND OF ADDRESS THAT
4 ISSUE WOULD BE A NEAR-TERM INCREASE IN OPERATION SUPPORT FOR
5 MUNI OVER THE LONGER TERM IN A FAIR AND EQUITABLE WAY IN A
6 REVENUE MEASURE. SO JUST TRYING TO THINK OF CREATIVE WAYS TO
7 ADDRESS SOME OF THE FEEDBACK THAT WE ALL HEARD ACROSS THE
8 REGION ABOUT HOW TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE SAN FRANCISCO-
9 CENTERED OPERATING SHORTFALLS WHILE ENSURING FAIRNESS AND
10 EQUITIABILITY AROUND THE REGION AND AT THE VERY LEAST LOOKING
11 AT THE PANDEMIC REVENUE IMPACTS ON OTHER REVENUE SOURCES OTHER
12 THAN FARE REVENUES. SAN FRANCISCO HAS HAD GENERAL FUND IMPACTS
13 DUE TO COVID AS WELL AS PARKING REVENUES, AND I APPRECIATE THE
14 SLIDES FOR TAKING THAT INTO ACCOUNT AND NOTING THAT, BUT THERE
15 ARE OTHER REVENUE SOURCES THAT HAVE BEEN IMPACTED FROM THE
16 PANDEMIC. SO IN THINKING ABOUT WHAT THE PANDEMIC IMPACTS ARE
17 THAT THE MEASURE IS ADDRESSING, WE SHOULD ALSO TAKE INTO
18 ACCOUNT THOSE OTHER IMPACTS. SO I APPRECIATE THIS OPPORTUNITY
19 TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK AND HOPE TO CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANKS FOR THOSE COMMENTS. JAMES.

22

23 **JAMES LINDSAY:** IT'S A COMPLEX ISSUE. STUART, THANK YOU FOR
24 GETTING ALL THE SCENARIOS WOUND UP AND PEOPLE TALKING ABOUT
25 HOW OR HOW THEY WON'T SUPPORT DIFFERENT ITEMS. BUT IT'S GOING



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TO BE A TOUGH SCENARIO TO GET THROUGH NO MATTER WHAT WE DO,
2 AND WE JUST GOT TO COALESCE BEHIND THE SCENARIO THAT WILL BEST
3 FIT US. I KNOW IN RESPONSE TO MR. WUNDERMAN, I KNOW THERE HAVE
4 BEEN AGENCIES THAT HAVE CUT BACK, AND MY MEMBERS HAVE TAKEN
5 ANYWHERE FROM \$4,000 TO \$10,000 TO CUTS IN PAY FROM THOSE COST
6 SAVING MEASURES THAT THE AGENCIES PUT ON THEM. ALONG WITH THE
7 PUBLIC THAT HAS TO DEAL WITH THE AMOUNT OF SERVICE THAT IS CUT
8 IN THOSE AREAS. WHEN YOU GET INTO SAFETY, I GET MESSAGES JUST
9 ABOUT EVERY DAY SOMEWHERE IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA WHERE AN
10 OPERATOR HAS BEEN BRUTALLY ATTACKED IF NOT STABBED. I JUST HAD
11 ONE ABOUT A WEEK AND A HALF AGO IN SAN DIEGO WHERE A MEMBER
12 WAS HOSPITALIZED FOR ABOUT A WEEK AND A HALF, MULTIPLE
13 SURGERIES, BECAUSE HE WAS STABBED. SO SAFETY IS DEFINITELY AN
14 ISSUE AND WHY TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVEN'T SPENT THE MONEY TO PUT
15 BARRIERS IN, TO MAKE IT SAFER FOR THOSE OPERATORS, I'M NOT
16 SURE. BUT WE CAN PROBABLY CONSIDER THAT COST SAVING AS WELL BY
17 NOT PROTECTING THEIR EMPLOYEES. BUT THIS IS A COMPLICATED
18 SITUATION. I'M NOT SURE IF I UNDERSTOOD SENATOR HOBBS'
19 CONSOLIDATION PROCESS. YOU ARE GOING TO HAVE A BUNCH OF
20 FEDERAL PROBLEMS WITH 13-C ISSUES TRYING TO CONSOLIDATE, IF
21 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT AGENCIES. THAT'S JUST GOING TO
22 COMPLICATE THIS EVEN WORSE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, JAMES. YEAH, CONSOLIDATION HAS
25 TO BE DEALT SEPARATELY BECAUSE I MEAN, I AM HEARING IT ACROSS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THIS REGION NOT TO BRING THAT ISSUE INTO THIS PROBLEM WE'RE
2 TRYING TO SOLVE. I MEAN, IF WE DIDN'T LEARN ANYTHING FROM
3 1031, THAT'S THE ISSUE WE DID LEARN. I MEAN, THERE WAS A LOT
4 OF PUSHBACK ON THAT. BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO BE
5 ADDRESSED AND TALKED ABOUT AND I APPRECIATE THE SENATOR, YOU
6 KNOW, LOOKING INTO IT. THERE'S SOME PLACES THAT I THINK IT IS
7 APPROPRIATE. JOHN? AND THEN, MANNY, AGAIN. GO AHEAD, JOHN.

8

9 **JOHN ARANTES:** I THINK ONE OF THE AREAS WE CAN AGREE ON IS
10 SCENARIO ONE AND TWO BY GOING A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF YEARS AND
11 THEN PUTTING THE MONEYS INTO THE COUNTIES DO NOT SOLVE THE
12 PROBLEM. AND WHO KNOWS WHAT WILL HAPPEN IN 10 YEARS? AM I
13 RIGHT? IF WE PROCEED FORWARD WITH THAT PLAN, IT WILL MAKE IT
14 ALMOST IMPOSSIBLE FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES AND FOR US, M.T.C., TO
15 GO BACK AND TRY TO GET MORE MONEY AGAIN. AM I RIGHT? SO THESE
16 MONEYS ARE NEEDED FOR THE LIFETIME OF THE MEASURE TO BE FOR
17 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. MAKE IT SHORTER IF YOU NEED TO. THAT
18 MIGHT BE A SOLUTION AND THEN GO BACK AGAIN, OR JUST MAKE IT
19 FOR THE ALL LIFE. THE OTHER THING IS WE'RE TRYING TO REDUCE
20 THE COST OF PUBLIC RIDING. PEOPLE WILL START USING THE SYSTEM
21 MORE IF YOU HAVE THE SAME FARE. REDUCING POLLUTION, REDUCING
22 CARS. PEOPLE START SAVING MONEY BY SAVING BY NOT SPENDING ON
23 FUEL AND ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF. BUT I THINK IT IS A PROBLEM
24 THAT WE KEEP INCREASING THE SALES TAX AND THAT DOES AFFECT THE
25 ABILITY OF LOW-INCOME PEOPLE TO LIVE THEIR LIVES WITH THE HIGH



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 IMPACT OF INFLATION AND SOME OF THE FUTURE CHALLENGES THAT
2 MIGHT BE COMING IN THE FUTURE IF WE DO HAPPEN TO HIT A
3 RECESSION, THINGS LIKE THAT. SO THE FAIR THING TO DO IS MORE
4 TO GO INTO A PAYROLL TAX. BUT, OF COURSE, IF WE GO THAT WAY,
5 THEN WE GET CHALLENGES FROM CERTAIN GROUPS THAT I THINK THEY
6 MIGHT BE SHORTSIGHTED FOR WHATEVER REASONS THEY CHOOSE TO DO
7 SO. THAT WILL CAUSE IT TO FAIL. THEN, WE WILL BE IN THE WORST
8 PLACE AGAIN. AM I RIGHT? LABOR HAS WORKED REALLY HARD TO GET
9 FUNDS FROM THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, HAS WORKED VERY HARD TO GET
10 FUNDS FROM THE STATE. WE HAVE DONE OUR PART. WE HAVE PUT OUR
11 ENERGY AND OUR MEMBERS WALKING AND FIGHTING FOR TRYING TO SAVE
12 PUBLIC TRANSIT. COMPANIES, CITIES, PEOPLE ARE THE BENEFICIARY
13 OF A BETTER TRANSIT SYSTEMS THROUGH THE BAY AREA, THE NINE
14 COUNTIES. I THINK THE NINE COUNTIES IS THE BEST OPTION OUT
15 THERE, AM I RIGHT? LET'S FIX THIS PROBLEM. BUT AT THE SAME
16 TIME, WE MUST UNDERSTAND THAT MIGHT FAIL. THEN, WE WILL BE IN
17 A BAD PLACE AGAIN. MAYBE THE IDEA BEING MAYBE TWO, THREE
18 OPTIONS AND POLL AND SEE WHAT POLLS THE BEST. BUT LET'S FIX
19 THE PROBLEMS WITH OPTION ONE, LET'S FIX THE PROBLEM WITH
20 OPTION TWO, AND LET'S LOOK AT WHAT OPTION THREE LOOKS LIKE.
21 BECAUSE I DO UNDERSTAND THE ISSUE IN SAN FRANCISCO. YOU GOT TO
22 TAKE CARE OF ALL THESE AGENCIES, AND THAT CAN BE A LITTLE BIT
23 OF A NIGHTMARE, AM I RIGHT? THIS PROBLEM WAS EASY, IT WOULD
24 HAVE BEEN SOLVED BY NOW. AND EVERYBODY SAID GREAT THINGS.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COMMISSIONER NICK, I REALLY AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE STUFF YOU
2 SAID. VERY INCITEFUL, BY THE WAY.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** MANNY.

5

6 **MANNY LEON:** I WAS ONE OF THE EARLIER SPEAKERS. POINT OF
7 CLARIFICATION, MR. CHAIR, WERE WE GOING DOWN THE LIST TALKING
8 ABOUT SCENARIO, ONE, TWO, THREE, FOUR, OR ARE THEY MAKING --
9 POINT OF CLARIFICATION. HOW ARE WE WORKING THROUGH THIS? OKAY.
10 WITH THAT MEANS -- [LAUGHTER]

11

12 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ASK YOUR QUESTION AGAIN. I DON'T KNOW IF I
13 UNDERSTOOD.

14

15 **MANNY LEON:** LOOKING AT THE POWERPOINT. QUESTION ONE, TWO,
16 THREE. WHAT'S YOUR IMPRESSION OF SCENARIO ONE AND TWO. I
17 REALLY ONLY REFERRED TO SCENARIO ONE. ARE WE GOING DOWN THAT
18 LIST BECAUSE I HEARD MEMBERS TALK ABOUT SCENARIO TWO AND THREE
19 AS WELL, OR ARE WE GOING TO NUMBER TWO NEXT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** NO, IT'S NOT SEQUENTIAL. JUST COMMENT ON ALL OF THIS.
22 WE HAVE ANOTHER AGENDA ITEM.

23

24 **MANNY LEON:** THAT'S GOOD. I APPRECIATE IT. AGAIN, FROM THE LENS
25 OF A SUCCESSFUL MEASURE, AND I HEARD A LOT OF THINGS TODAY. I



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WANT TO ECHO A LOT OF THE COMMENTS THAT MR. WUNDERMAN SAID
2 BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, IN LOOKING AT THIS, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS GOING
3 TO GET TO THE FINISH LINE AND MAYBE IT IS A PARTNERSHIP WITH
4 ALL ENTITIES, INCLUDING THE VOTERS, INCLUDING THE STATE,
5 INCLUDING THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT? WHAT I MEAN BY THAT IS,
6 EVERYBODY WILL HAVE TO FEEL A LITTLE BIT OF PAIN. MAYBE. MAYBE
7 THAT'S THE WAY TO GO. THERE IS A CERTAIN TAX IN SCENARIO ONE,
8 THE SALES TAX, AND THAT GENERATES A CERTAIN AMOUNT. AND
9 THERE'S ENOUGH IN A PROPOSAL THAT THE VOTERS WILL WANT TO VOTE
10 FOR IT. AND THEN, THERE'S ACCOUNTABILITY AND REFORM. THAT
11 SEEMS TO RESONATE WELL WITH THE VOTERS AS WELL. AND THERE'S A
12 LITTLE MORE PAIN THERE. AND THEN, IT'S GOING TO OUR PARTNERS
13 IN SAYING, HEY, EVERYBODY IS FEELING THE PAIN HERE. HOW CAN --
14 HOW CAN YOU WORK WITH US TO KIND OF CARRY OUT AND FINISH KIND
15 OF FILLING IN -- KIND OF COMPLETING THAT -- THAT FUNDING GAP,
16 IF YOU WILL? AND SO WITH THAT BEING SAID, I JUST -- MAYBE IT'S
17 MULTI-PRONGED IN SAYING EVERYBODY FEELS A LITTLE PAIN AND
18 EVERYBODY DOES THE HARD WORK AND COMES UP WITH, YOU KNOW, AN
19 OVERALL SOLUTION THAT MIGHT MOVE FORWARD AND PASS. AND WITH
20 THAT BEING SAID, SCENARIO NUMBER TWO I WOULD SAY, WE'RE NOT
21 VERY WARM ON THAT. WE THINK THAT THAT SOMEWHAT LOOKS LIKE
22 1031. AND SO WE WOULD WANT TO SEE MORE BUILD OUT OF SCENARIO
23 ONE VARY AS YOU SAY SCENARIO TWO.
24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** LET ME TAKE CINDY AND THEN, I'LL COME TO
2 YOU. CINDY, I SEE YOUR HAND. I APPRECIATE YOUR PATIENCE.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NO, THANK YOU. IT'S BEEN REALLY WONDERFUL TO
5 HEAR FROM ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES. COLLEAGUES, THE REASON I AM
6 NOT WITH YOU, I HAVE BEEN COUGHING. I DON'T HAVE COVID BUT IT
7 SCARES EVERYBODY WHEN I'M SITTING NEXT TO THEM SO I DON'T WANT
8 TO FRIGHTEN YOU. LET ME -- LET ME START WITH THE DIFFERENT --
9 JUST A DIFFERENT KIND OF -- SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE.
10 FIRST, I WANTED TO SAY TO THE STAFF HOW MUCH I APPRECIATED THE
11 BACKGROUND INFORMATION YOU GAVE AROUND CURRENT FUNDING FOR A
12 NUMBER OF OUR TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. THAT WAS REALLY HELPFUL
13 WHAT YOU PUT IN THE BINDER. SECOND IS THAT EITHER ONE --
14 SCENARIO ONE OR SCENARIO TWO HAVE SOME BUILT IN CHALLENGES TO
15 THEM, JUST TO BE CAPTAIN OBVIOUS FOR A MOMENT. BUT I JUST WANT
16 TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT SOME THINGS THAT I THINK NEED TO BE
17 CONSIDERED AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH EITHER OF THESE OPTIONS OR
18 EVEN THE THIRD OPTION, AS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ STARTED TO
19 OUTLINE. ONE IS, I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE
20 UNDERSTAND THE USAGE OF CURRENT FUNDING BY THE AGENCIES THAT
21 ARE USING THEIR SALES TAX IN A PARTICULAR WAY AND WHAT THEY
22 WOULD BE USING THAT SALES TAX FOR IN THE FUTURE. AND I THINK
23 ONE POINT IS A NUMBER OF PEOPLE TALKED ABOUT WHAT VOTERS ARE
24 INTERESTED OR AREN'T INTERESTED IN, I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT
25 THING IS WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT WHAT WE WANT TO SPEND MONEY ON,



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WHAT WE DON'T WANT TO SPEND MONEY ON, AND THEN HAVE A
2 CONVERSATION WITH THE VOTERS OF -- AND I KNOW THIS IS IRRATIVE
3 BUT WE NEED TO SAY, THIS IS WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH.
4 SOME AGENCIES, AND I'LL USE V.T.A. AS AN EXAMPLE, HAVE BEEN IN
5 THE SITUATION WHAT OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN. HOW WE
6 RAISED MONEY TO BE ABLE TO BUILD UP SERVICES HAS BEEN VERY
7 CHALLENGING. WHERE V.T.A. IS RIGHT NOW, HOPEFULLY WITH BART
8 COMING IN TO OUR COMMUNITY IS REALLY BUILDING UP THAT BACKBONE
9 SO PEOPLE CAN GET FROM POINT A TO POINT B AND GET TO THESE
10 REGIONAL NODES OF TRANSPORTATION. SO WE'RE IN A TRYING TO
11 BUILD BACK WHERE WE WERE IN 1990 TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE
12 RIGHT LEVEL OF BUS SERVICE TO BE ABLE TO CONNECT TO ALL OF
13 THESE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION OPPORTUNITIES. SO THAT'S NUMBER
14 ONE. NUMBER TWO IS THAT I DO THINK EACH AGENCY WILL NEED
15 FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF HOW THEY SPEND THEIR LOCAL DOLLARS. I
16 THINK FLEXIBILITY SHOULD BE BUILT IN WITH MINIMAL STANDARDS
17 FOR THAT EXCEPT THAT WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO EXPLAIN TO OUR
18 VOTERS WHY WE'RE REQUESTING THE MONEY WE ARE AND WHAT WE'RE
19 GOING TO BE USING THAT MONEY FOR BECAUSE I THINK ABSENT THAT,
20 SOMETHING THAT FEELS TOO COOKIE CUTTER AND WON'T GIVE THE
21 VOTERS AND THE COMMUNITIES IN EACH OF THEIR AREAS THE
22 OPPORTUNITY TO UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE WOULD BE SPENDING
23 MONEY ON AND THEN THE LAST THING I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE IS THAT
24 -- AND I HEARD DAVID CANEPA'S CONCERN OVER THE CONCERN OVER
25 SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND YOU AND I CAN ARM WRESTLE A LITTLE BIT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 LATER BUT I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, WE BOTH -- OUR AGENCIES HAVE
2 VERY DIFFERENT RELATIONSHIPS WITH THE SURROUNDED PARTNERS. SO
3 FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE A CONTRACTUAL RELATIONSHIP WITH BART THAT
4 LAYS OUT BOTH OUR PARTNERSHIP AND OUR FUNDING PARTNERSHIP. AND
5 THEN TODAY, ANY CHANGE OF RESOURCES WERE TO BE CONTRIBUTED AT
6 ALL, WE'D HAVE TO RESTRUCTURE THAT CONTRACT. WE HAVE A SIMILAR
7 SITUATION WITH CALTRAIN. AS YOU KNOW, SUPERVISOR CANEPA, THAT
8 THESE ARE CONTRACTUAL RELATIONSHIPS SO IT WOULD BE INFLUENCED
9 BY WHAT RESOURCES COME IN AND COME OUT. NOT TO SAY THERE IS A
10 GOOD TO BAD TO THAT. ONLY TO ACKNOWLEDGE THERE IS A FRAMEWORK
11 THAT WE'RE ALREADY ENGAGED IN THAT WOULD REQUIRE A MUCH HIGHER
12 LEVEL OF DETAIL IN TERMS OF HOW WE -- HOW WE PARTNER IN THE
13 FUTURE. I AM VERY OPTIMISTIC, HONESTLY. I WANT TO SAY, I KNOW
14 PUTTING PAPER TO PEN MEANS IT'S A PINATA THAT EVERYONE CAN
15 TAKE A WHACK AT. I AM MORE HOPEFUL THAN AT OUR LAST MEETING
16 BECAUSE WE ARE GETTING DOWN TO THE DETAILS AND BEING ABLE TO
17 TALK THROUGH THOSE AREAS THAT WE HAVE CONFLICT OR CONCERNS. SO
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU, CINDY. GINA. YOU'VE BEEN
21 PATIENT, GINA.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THE CONVERSATION HAS BEEN GREAT. GREATLY APPRECIATED.
24 THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR ALL THEIR HARD WORK AND EFFORT HERE. I



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 DON'T THINK THERE'S A QUESTION. WE ALL WANT TRANSIT TO WORK.
2 WE WANT IT TO SURVIVE, BE HEALTHY, SAFE, RELIABLE, CLEAN.
3
4 **GINA PAPAN:** IF WE'RE GOING TO THE PUBLIC, WE'RE GOING TO THE
5 LEGISLATURE HERE, WE DO NEED TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT WHAT JIM
6 SAID THERE. WE'RE NOT SEEING FROM THE OPERATORS -- AND I AM
7 SURE THEY ARE DOING THIS, AS MENTIONED BY OUR FRIENDS IN LABOR
8 HERE. WHAT IS THEIR SUSTAINABILITY PLAN? I DON'T THINK THE
9 PUBLIC IS GOING TO OR THE LEGISLATURE IS GOING TO BE EXCITED
10 ABOUT ANY TYPE OF A MEASURE HOWEVER WE PRESENT IT UNLESS THEY
11 KNOW THAT THERE'S A BUILT-IN PLAN FOR EACH OF THESE OPERATORS,
12 THAT THEY'RE GOING TO GO, HAVE SOME MORE ACCOUNTABILITY AND
13 THE PUBLIC CAN SEE THE RESULTS ALONG THOSE. AND I JUST -- I'M
14 NOT SEEING THAT HERE. WE DON'T MENTION IN ANY OF THESE
15 SCENARIOS, AS JIM SAID, THE SAFETY, THE CLEANLINESS. THAT'S
16 WHAT THE PUBLIC WANTS. I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE ALL WANT HERE.
17 IF YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT A FOUR-COUNTY MEASURE HERE. SAN MATEO
18 COUNTY HAS BEEN HELD OR FELT FAIRLY TREATED. BART DOESN'T FEEL
19 FAIRLY TREATED HERE IN THIS COUNTY. WE DON'T HAVE
20 REPRESENTATION. SO EITHER TALK ABOUT THAT, TOO, SO THERE IS
21 SOME ACCOUNTABILITY. BECAUSE WE TALK REGIONALISM HERE. AND WE
22 DON'T SEE IT. OR DO AWAY WITH THE BART BOARD. I KNOW. BIG
23 BOMBSHELL THERE. BUT SANTA CLARA, TOO, YOU'RE DEALING WITH
24 THAT SAME AGENCY. AND I DO BELIEVE WHAT NICK SAID HERE. EVEN
25 WHAT WE DO HERE, I DON'T THINK THAT'S GOING TO FIX THE MATTER.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE AN ONGOING SHORTFALL FINANCIAL
2 CLIFF AND THAT'S FOUGHT GOING -- AND THAT'S NOT GOING TO LOOK
3 GOOD TO ANYONE. SO THAT'S WHY I SAY, IF YOU HAVE THIS, IF WE
4 CAN GET SOME SORT OF SUSTAINABILITY HERE, WHICH WAS MENTIONED
5 EARLIER, UNDERLYING FINANCIAL FIGURES, THERE SEEMED TO BE A
6 LOT OF UNCERTAINTY THERE. AND THAT'S CONCERNING. SO WE NEED
7 MORE CLARIFICATION IN HOW WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. AND TO BE EVEN
8 MORE DIFFICULT WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT CALTRAIN, THERE'S AN
9 AGREEMENT BETWEEN THREE COUNTIES. AND IF YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT
10 ONE SCENARIO THAT ONLY HAS FOUR COUNTIES, THAT'S NOT GOING TO
11 WORK. AND I GET WHERE SANTA CLARA IS. BUT SOMEHOW WE HAVE TO
12 WORK ON THE NUANCE HERE THAT SAN MATEO AND SAN FRANCISCO
13 AREN'T JUST PAYING TO KEEP THEM SUSTAINABLE. I DON'T HAVE THE
14 ANSWERS, SORRY, BUT THAT'S REALITY THAT NEEDS TO BE PUT INTO
15 PLAY HERE. YOU CAN'T JUST DO THE FOUR WHEN YOU'RE TALKING
16 ABOUT CALTRAIN. WE NEED THE THREE-PARTNER AGENCIES OR COUNTIES
17 INVOLVED THERE. SO I THINK THESE CONVERSATIONS ARE GREAT. I
18 GET A TAD BIT CONCERNED WHEN EVERYBODY TALKS ABOUT POLLING,
19 BECAUSE WE DON'T SEE THE QUESTION YOU'RE ASKING. AND I KNOW
20 FOR A FACT POLLING CAN BE TWISTED, TURNED, AND OH, GREAT. THE
21 PUBLIC AGREES WITH THIS BECAUSE WE ASKED THE QUESTION THIS
22 WAY. SO LET'S BE CONCERNED THAT WE'RE NOT SKEWING THE DATA TO
23 GET TO A POINT WHICH MAY FAIL. WE WANT SUCCESS. WE DO. I'M ALL
24 ON BOARD FOR SUCCESS HERE, BUT WE NEED TO BE A LOT MORE
25 TRANSPARENT, AND THE OPERATORS NEED TO HELP US WITH THAT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 TRANSPARENCY. WE'RE FIVE YEARS INTO THE RECOVERY PLAN. WE ALL
2 KNOW WHERE THAT 10% IS GOING TO GO. AND I'M SORRY IT'S NOT
3 EVEN DONE YET, BUT THE TRANSPORTATION CORE ELEMENTS HERE, THAT
4 NEEDS TO BE BUILT INTO WHAT THEY DO, TOO, BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT
5 THE PUBLIC WANTS TO SEE. SO WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT
6 DIRECTION HERE, BUT I CAUTION, DON'T MOVE SO FAST THAT WE
7 DON'T PROVIDE THE PUBLIC WITH THE TRANSPARENCY TO GET THEM ON
8 BOARD. BECAUSE WE WANT EVERYONE HERE TO BE SUCCESSFUL AND
9 HAPPY, BUT THE PUBLIC IS THE DECIDING FACTOR. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I WANT TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENTS BUT, GINA,
12 I AGREE WITH WHAT YOU HAVE SAID ABOUT THE ACCOUNTABILITY. I
13 JUST DON'T WANT THAT TO BE SOMETHING TO STOP US FROM MOVING
14 FORWARD BECAUSE THAT CAN BE BUILT IN. WE GOT TIME TO MAKE SURE
15 THOSE ASSURANCES ARE IN THIS. SO WE HAVE TO HAVE A FRAMEWORK
16 THAT WE CAN TRY AND MOVE FORWARD.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THE FRAME IS STATIONARY HERE. IT HAS TO BE IN THAT
19 CONVERSATION.

20

21 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I HEARD YOU. I HEARD YOU.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN OKAY. THANK YOU.**

24

25 **>>CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WITH THAT, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE 13 IN THE BOARDROOM AND 10
3 AND GROWING ONLINE. WE'RE AT 11.

4

5 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** GIVE EVERYBODY ONE MINUTE. ATTORNEY, CAN
6 WE ANNOUNCE -- HAVE YOUR NAME IN AND WE ARE NOT TAKING ANY
7 MORE -- AT WHAT POINT CAN WE DO THAT?

8

9 **KATHLEEN KANE:** IF YOU CAN SUBMIT A BLUE CARD TO BE INCLUDED IN
10 THE SPEAKER'S LIST, AFTER THAT POINT THE CHAIR HAS THE
11 DISCRETION AS A MATTER OF MEETING MANAGEMENT TO MOVE FORWARD.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. SO THREE MINUTES, IF YOU CAN, TRY
14 NOT TO REPEAT SAME THING. SAY YOU AGREE SO WE CAN GET THROUGH
15 THIS QUICKLY AND KEEP AS MANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS HERE. ONE
16 MINUTE. ONE MINUTE. ONE MINUTE. SO WITH THAT, LET'S PROCEED.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE. THOSE THAT
19 HAVE BEEN PROVIDED AS HANDOUTS AS WELL AS ADDED TO THE ONLINE
20 AGENDA. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE INCLUDES FROM ALICIA JOHN-
21 BAPTISTE OF SPUR. VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THE MAYOR
22 WITH THE CITY OF OAKLAND. MIDPENISULA REGIONAL OPEN SPACE
23 DISTRICT, EXCUSE ME. AS WELL AS A NUMBER OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS.
24 BEN KAY, SARAH B, LEANN C. SHANNON R. ZAFARALAA. ODIN O.
25 ELLIOTT S. MICHAEL G. STEPHANIE B. AND ALICE D.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** SO ANYONE IN THE ROOM, PLEASE TURN IN YOUR
3 CARD.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** FIRST PUBLIC SPEAKER IS WARREN
6 CUSHMAN. IF YOU CAN LINE UP AS I CALL THE REMAINING NAMES.
7 CLAUDIA BURGOS. SARAH GREENWALD.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** CAN I GET A MIC, PLEASE?

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** JEFF. KATHLEEN MOORE. ABE DAVIES.
12 AND I'LL CALL THE REMAINING NAMES ONCE YOU ARE --

13

14 **SPEAKER:** ALL RIGHT. HELLO, EVERYONE. THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN
15 FROM COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING IN HAYWARD.
16 FIRST, CAN WE JUST AGREE NOT TO GO WITH ACCOUNTABLE SCENARIO?
17 THAT IS JUST NOT WORKABLE. THE IDEA OF HAVING EVERY AGENCY
18 GOING, WHO KNOWS WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO GO, HOW IT'S ALL GOING
19 TO WORK OUT, THAT'S JUST FRIGHTENING, FRANKLY. WITH REGARD TO
20 THE FIRST SCENARIO, I DO HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT IT. FIRST OF ALL,
21 IT'S NOT A NINE-COUNTY MEASURE, WHICH IS WHAT MY CONSTITUENTS
22 NEED. WE HAVE PARA-TRANSIT, WAY FINDING, ACCESSIBILITY, OTHER
23 CONCERNS THAT NEED TO BE DEALT WITH AND THE SNARE I-ONE JUST
24 DOESN'T MEET THAT NEED. SO I AM IN FAVOR OF SCENARIO TWO.
25 LET'S GO BIG. AND LET'S MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** CAN YOU USE BOTH SPEAKERS, MICROPHONES? SO
3 IF YOU WANT TO HEAR YOUR NAME AND LINE UP, THAT'S FINE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. CLAUDIA WITH A.C. TRANSIT. JUST WANT TO
6 HIGHLIGHT SOME OF THE KEY POINTS THAT WAS IN THE LETTER FROM
7 OUR GENERAL MANAGER. A.C. TRANSIT, WE'RE FACING \$146 MILLION
8 FISCAL CLIFF BEGINNING NEXT FISCAL YEAR. ALTHOUGH WE DO NOT
9 REALIZE SIGNIFICANT FARE BOX REVENUES, WE STILL FACE DRACONIAN
10 SERVICE REDUCTIONS IF ADDITIONAL REVENUES ARE NOT REALIZED.
11 INFLATION DRIVEN OPERATING EXPENSES CONTINUE TO INCREASE. WE
12 HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR FROM OUR RIDERS THAT RELY ON SAFETY,
13 RELIABILITY AND MORE SERVICE LEVELS. WE URGE M.T.C. STAFF TO
14 EXPLORE A SCENARIO TO USE NOT ONLY FARE BOX REVENUE LOSSES BUT
15 ALSO REVENUE EXPENSES TO DETERMINE HOW FUNDS ARE DISTRIBUTED.
16 WE BELIEVE ADDITIONAL POLLING IS NEEDED AND WE URGE THE
17 COMMITTEE TO SOLVE FURTHER ISSUES THAT INCLUDES RIDERSHIP,
18 EQUITY AND OPERATING COSTS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** JEFF, I WILL HAVE YOU A LITTLE EXTRA TIME
21 BECAUSE THIS MUNI ISSUE IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. WAS TRYING TO FIGURE IT OUT HOW TO CUT IT
24 ALL DOWN. THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING, FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP.
25 SECONDLY, I WANT TO EMPHASIZE IN SAN FRANCISCO WE ARE FULLY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COMMITTED TO THE TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN IN MAKING THE
2 ENTIRE REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM FEEL LIKE ONE INTEGRATED SYSTEM
3 FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE. SINCE THE BEGINNING OF COVID WE ADDED
4 24 MILES OF NEW TRANSIT-ONLY LANES FOR MUNI. WE COMPLETED
5 NEARLY 100 MILES OF TRANSIT PRIORITIZATION TREATMENTS AND WE
6 MADE THE SYSTEM MORE RELIABLE. WE INVESTED SIGNIFICANTLY IN
7 SAFETY. AS A RESULT OF ALL OF THAT, OUR CUSTOMER APPROVAL
8 RATINGS ARE NOW HIGHER THAN THEY HAVE BEEN SINCE WE STARTED
9 COLLECTING DATA IN 2001. WE'VE ALSO SUCCEEDED IN CUTTING OUR
10 REPORTED CRIME RATE BY OVER 3/4. WHILE WE STILL HAVE
11 ADDITIONAL WORK TO DO, WE KNOW THE SOLUTION FOR TRANSIT IS
12 MAKING SURE THAT IT IS FAST, FREQUENT, RELIABLE, SAFE, AND
13 CLEAN, AS MANY OF YOU HAVE ALREADY SAID. THIRDLY, WE ARE ALSO
14 COMMITTED TO DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO BOTH GENERATE SAVINGS
15 AND GENERATE NEW LOCAL REVENUE. WE HAVE CUT 12 MUNI LINES THAT
16 DON'T EXIST, THAT USED TO BEFORE COVID. WE HAVE ACHIEVED OVER
17 \$50 MILLION IN SALARY SAVINGS AND \$50 MILLION IN NONSALARY
18 COST SAVINGS. WE ARE ALSO COMMITTED TO IMPROVING FARE
19 COMPLIANCE. IT HAS DROPPED FROM 88% TO 80%, AND WE NEED TO
20 BRING THAT UP AGAIN, AND WE ARE DOUBLING OUR TRANSIT FARE
21 INSPECTORS. IN ADDITION TO LOOKING AT A WHOLE VARIETY OF
22 ADDITIONAL REVENUE SOURCES THROUGH OUR MUNI WORKING GROUP THAT
23 IS A PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE CONTROLLERS OFFICE, US, THE
24 SUPERVISOR'S OFFICE AND THE MAYOR'S OFFICE. THE FOURTH POINT I
25 WANT TO MAKE, MUNI IS FUNDED IN UNIQUE WAYS. OUR THREE PRIMARY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 LOCAL SOURCES OF REVENUE ARE GENERAL FUND, PARKING, TAXES AND
2 FEES AND FARES. FARES ARE OUR LOWEST SOURCE OF REVENUE. TWICE
3 AS MUCH FUNDING COMES FROM OUR PARKING TAXES AS COMES FROM
4 TRANSIT FARES, AND WE HAVE LOST MORE IN PARKING REVENUE THAN
5 WE HAVE IN FARE REVENUE. SO IT'S VERY IMPORTANT AS THE REGION
6 CONSIDERS HOW ON EARTH DO WE MAKE MUNI WHOLE THAT WE CONSIDER
7 ALL OF MUNI'S FUNDING SOURCES. FINALLY, I WANT TO EMPHASIZE
8 WHAT'S ALREADY BEEN SAID HERE. SCENARIO ONE LEAVES A MASSIVE
9 FUNDING GAP FOR MUNI. ABOUT 20% OF OUR SERVICE OR ABOUT 20
10 LINES WOULD NEED TO BE CUT. THAT CARRY OVER 100,000 RIDERS
11 EVERY SINGLE DAY. NEARLY THE SAME AMOUNT OF RIDERSHIP AS THE
12 ENTIRE BART SYSTEM. SO WE ARE EAGER TO PARTNER WITH STAFF. WE
13 WANT TO THANK STUART AND STAFF HERE WHO'VE BEEN WORKING WITH
14 US IN ORDER TO FIGURE OUT WHAT IS RIGHT PACKAGE OF SOLUTIONS
15 THAT FEELS FAIR FOR THE ENTIRE REGION AND SOLVES THE CRITICAL
16 ISSUES IN THE CORE OF THE REGION. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

17

18 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, JEFF, FOR BEING BRIEF. I FELT
19 IT WAS VERY IMPORTANT AS THE GENERAL MANAGER OF MUNI, A MAJOR
20 OPERATOR THAT WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH. WE ARE BACK TO OUR ONE
21 MINUTE. GO AHEAD AND PROCEED.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS SARAH GREENWALD. I THINK THERE WAS
24 CONFUSION. REPRESENTING 350 BAY AREA. SO I JUST WANT TO STATE
25 A COUPLE GUIDELINES, IF YOU WILL, SIMPLY BECAUSE YOU'VE ALL



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 MENTIONED AND COMPLAINED ABOUT THE COMPLICATION. THE MEASURES
2 OR MEASURE MUST BE SUFFICIENT, PROGRESSIVE, THEY MUST PAY FOR
3 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION ONLY AND MUST REDUCE EMISSIONS OF ALL
4 THE BAY AREA COUNTIES. THAT LAST ONE IS THE MOST IMPORTANT.
5 BUT I'LL START WITH SUFFICIENT. MUST OFFER VOTERS AND TRANSIT
6 -- TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS WORTH VOTING FOR. WITH NO SERVICE
7 CUTS, I WOULD SAY, IS THE GOAL.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. YOUR ONE MINUTE IS UP. SO THANK YOU.
10 AND I APOLOGIZE BECAUSE OF THE NUMBER OF SPEAKERS AND THE TIME
11 FRAME THAT WE HAVE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** ARE YOU GOING TO SAY THE NAMES?

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** IF THAT HELPS WE'LL TAKE KATHLEEN
16 MOORE NEXT AND THEN ABE DAVIES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I AM A PRIEST AT ST. JOHN'S EPISCOPAL CHURCH
19 IN OAKLAND. WE'RE A FOUNDING MEMBER CONGREGATION OF GENESIS.
20 AND WHAT WE'RE DOING TODAY IS ABOUT ALL OF US AND ABOUT OUR
21 SHARED VALUES OF JUSTICE AND LOVE FOR ALL PEOPLE. WE BELIEVE
22 THAT GOD'S PRESENCE IS WITH THE PEOPLE. WE BELIEVE THAT ALL
23 PEOPLE DESERVE TO HAVE THEIR BASIC NEED MET, ESPECIALLY IN A
24 REGION THAT MOST DEFINITELY HAS ENOUGH FOR EVERYONE. WE
25 BELIEVE THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WORKERS WHO ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR SO MUCH OF THE ABUNDANCE AND
2 COMFORT OF THE CORPORATE ELITE OF THE BAY AREA DESERVE TO HAVE
3 SAFE, EASY, AND FUNDED ACCESS TO TRANSPORTATION. THIS SELECT
4 COMMITTEE CAN BE ON THEIR SIDE, CAN CONSIDER THEM IN DRAFTING
5 THIS MEASURE. YOU CAN CHOOSE TO GO BIG, TO REVEAL, SHARE, AND
6 CELEBRATE THE TRUE ABUNDANCE OF THIS REGION. YOU DON'T HAVE TO
7 BE IN DIFFERENT. YOU CAN CHOOSE TO BE PROPHETIC. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. WHO'S NEXT?

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER WILL BE ABBY
12 FOLLOWED BY LAUREL, RICHARD MARC ANTONIO, SARAH BLAINE, CAROL
13 TAYLOR, JONATHAN COLE, AND THEN OUR LAST TWO IN-PERSON
14 SPEAKERS THAT I HAVE CARDS FOR, IF ALL CAN LINE UP AS WELL,
15 WILL BE CHARLIE LEVERY AND BOB.

16

17 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. ANNOUNCE THE NEXT ONE SO EVERYBODY
18 KNOWS. THANK YOU. GO AHEAD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M A RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND I WORK FOR
21 TRANSFORM, A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
22 COALITION. I'M ALSO A FREQUENT RIDER OF MUNI AND BART. I
23 STRONGLY SUPPORT THE GO BIG SCENARIO. SCENARIO TWO, WHICH IS
24 SUPPORTED BY LABOR AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS. IT'S THE ONLY
25 SCENARIO THAT ACHIEVES THE NEED. IT'S THE ONLY SCENARIO THAT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 ADDRESSES THE FISCAL CLIFF FULLY AND FUNDED BY A PROGRESSIVE
2 REVENUE SOURCE AND SUPPORTS REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
3 TRANSFORMATION AND SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS. I ALSO JUST WANT TO
4 MENTION THAT M.T.C. POLLING DID NOT SHOW A SALES TAX AS THE
5 WINNING SCENARIO. SO I WANT TO PUT THAT OUT THERE. AND I KEEP
6 HEARING PEOPLE SAY THEY WANT RELIABILITY AND TRANSFORMATION
7 AND YOU CAN'T GET THAT WITH SCENARIO ONE. THE MAIN PURPOSE OF
8 THIS IS TO FILL THE FUNDING GAP, AND SCENARIO TWO DOES THAT. I
9 JUST WANT TO SAY, LET'S BE REAL. SCENARIO THREE IS A NO GO.
10 MULTIPLE MEASURES IS MULTIPLE POINTS OF FAILURES. I WANT TO
11 SAY AS A YOUNG PERSON, I AM LOOKING TOWARDS YOU TO BE HELPFUL,
12 OPTIMISTIC. OUR SOCIETY IN THE NEXT GENERATION IS DEPENDING ON
13 ALL OF YOU GUYS TO FIND A SOLUTION. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** NEXT WE'LL HAVE LAUREL.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND ALSO VOICES FOR PUBLIC
20 TRANSIT AND PERSONALLY LIVE IN OAKLAND. SO IN ALAMEDA COUNTY.
21 AND DON'T HAVE A CAR AND RELY ON A.C. TRANSIT, BART, MUNI,
22 OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE REGION. I THINK IT'S CLEAR THAT
23 SCENARIO ONE DOESN'T WORK BECAUSE IT'S NOT ENOUGH FUNDING FOR
24 TRANSIT. AND THAT IT CAN'T -- WE CAN'T -- THE REGION CANNOT
25 PASS MORE THAN HALF A CENT SALES TAX, ESPECIALLY IN ALAMEDA



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COUNTY, WHICH HAS THE HIGHEST SALES TAX IN CALIFORNIA. WE NEED
2 TO FIND A PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCE THAT HAS TO BE A
3 COMPONENT OF THE MEASURE IN ORDER TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM WE'RE
4 TRYING TO SOLVE WHICH IS ENOUGH FUNDING TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT.
5 THERE'S NEVER ENOUGH OPERATING FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. THERE HAS
6 NOT BEEN ENOUGH FOR OPERATING FUNDING IN THIS REGION. THIS
7 CANNOT HAPPEN AND WE CAN'T RELY ON A MEMBER OF THE STATE TASK
8 FORCE. WE CANNOT RELY ON THE STATE OR THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT
9 TO RESCUE US. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD MARC
12 ANTONIO.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, SELECT COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND CHAIR. I'M
15 RICHARD MARC ANTONIO WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND A MEMBER OF THE
16 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I'M ALSO PROUD
17 THAT PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND THE VOICES COALITION WERE INVITED TO
18 AND DID SIGN ON TO THE LABOR PRINCIPLES AND I'D LIKE TO
19 SUGGEST, WITH ALL DUE RESPECT TO THE GREAT WORK YOU DID,
20 RENAMING THE GO BIG SCENARIO THE LABOR COMMUNITY SCENARIO
21 BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE THE VOTERS ARE. THAT'S WHERE THE TRANSIT
22 RIDERS AND WORKERS ARE AND THAT'S WHO THIS MEASURE NEEDS TO --
23 NEEDS TO SUPPORT AND NOT BURDEN WITH REGRESSIVE TAXATION. AND
24 THAT'S WHO'S GOING TO PASS THIS MEASURE, BOTH IN THE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 LEGISLATURE, THE AUTHORIZING BILL, AND AT THE BALLOT. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS SARAH BLAINE.

7 SARAH BLAINE: HI. THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK. I'M SARAH
8 BLAINE. A MEMBER OF GENESIS. ALSO, A MEMBER OF ST. JOHN'S
9 EPISCOPAL CHURCH. RESEARCH MOORE IS MY PRIEST. I STRONGLY
10 SUPPORT A SCENARIO THAT FULLY FUNDS PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION,
11 FULLY FUNDS OPERATION AND MAKING THE SYSTEM WORK TOGETHER. I
12 OWN A HOUSE IN OAKLAND. MY NEIGHBORHOOD IS WALKABLE AND HAS
13 GOOD PUBLIC TRANSIT ACCESS. AS I AGE, THESE FEATURES MAKE MY
14 HOUSE WORTH MORE TO ME. IT WOULD BE WORTH IT FOR ME TO PAY AN
15 ADDITIONAL PARCEL TAX. ALSO, THE FACT THERE AS I AGE, MY
16 PROPERTY TAXES KEPT ARTIFICIALLY LOW BY PROPOSITION 13. I
17 THINK THIS IS -- YOU HAVE A WONDERFUL OPPORTUNITY HERE TO
18 CREATE A RELIABLE, PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCE TO -- FOR PUBLIC
19 TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. AND WE WILL KEEP SHOWING UP AND KEEP
20 PUSHING FOR A BIG, COMPLETE SOLUTION. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS CAROL TAYLOR.

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CAROL TAYLOR:** HELLO. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS CAROL TAYLOR. I'M
2 WITH GENESIS. AND PART OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WE
3 HAVE SOME THINGS WE'D LIKE TO HAVE YOU PICK UP ON THE WAY OUT.
4 THIS IS RIGHT HERE, I HOPE YOU'LL ENJOY IT. I'M CONCERNED BY
5 THE FLEXIBILITY -- THE COUNTY FLEX FUNDS, AND I UNDERSTAND
6 COMING FROM SONOMA, I KNOW EVERY COUNTY HAS A DIFFERENT NEED,
7 BUT IT SEEMS AS THOUGH I WAS TOLD THAT HIGHWAY INTERCHANGES
8 COULD BE PART OF THAT. IT CAN BE USED FOR ROADS. YES, I'M FOR
9 ROAD REPAIR, BUT IT LOOKS LIKE THERE'S -- I'M EXCITED ABOUT
10 THE IDEA OF DEDICATED OPERATIONS FUNDING AND THIS LOOKS LIKE -
11 - CAN BE USED FOR OTHER THINGS. I THINK THE DESCRIPTION IN OUR
12 NOTES SAY TRANSIT IS ONLY ONE OPTION FOR THIS FLEX FUNDING.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** TIME.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JONATHAN COLE.

19

20 **JONATHAN COLE:** THANK YOU. I'M JONATHAN COLE WITH CLIMATE
21 ACTION CALIFORNIA. TRANSIT'S VITAL FOR PROVIDING EQUITY
22 MOBILITY, BUT IT'S ALSO CRUCIAL FOR BEING CALIFORNIA'S CLIMATE
23 GOALS. MEETING OUR CLIMATE GOALS WILL REQUIRE A SIGNIFICANT
24 MODE SWITCH TO TRANSIT AND A REDUCTION FOR VEHICLES MILES
25 TRAVELED. SCENARIO TWO WILL PROVIDE THE SCOPE AND AMBITION



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THAT ARE NEEDED TO BUILD RIDERSHIP AND PROMOTE A SIGNIFICANT
2 SHIFT TO TRANSIT IN ORDER TO MEET THE CLIMATE CHALLENGES OF
3 THIS MOMENT. WE DO RECOGNIZE THAT DEVELOPING AND PASSING THIS
4 MEASURE IS A HUGE POLITICAL CHALLENGE. WE URGE, HOWEVER, THAT
5 AS THE COMMITTEE CONTINUES TO REFINE AND DELIBERATE THAT YOU
6 KEEP IN MIND THE IMPORTANCE OF AMBITIOUS, TRANSFORMATIVE
7 MEASURES TO ACHIEVING CALIFORNIA'S CLIMATE GOALS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLIE LAVORY.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, FOR YOUR PUBLIC SERVICE. CHARLIE FOR THE
14 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. ALSO THE OPERATING ENGINEERS UNION. I
15 WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR WORK AND ESPECIALLY SPERING FOR
16 YOUR YEOMAN'S WORK AND PUTTING THIS TOGETHER. I WANT TO SPEAK
17 IN SUPPORT OF PURSUING SCENARIO ONE AND GROWING THAT SCENARIO
18 OUT WITH MEETING THE NEEDS OF THOSE AGENCIES WITH THE GREATEST
19 AND MOST URGENT NEED BECAUSE IT'S LESS COMPLEX. IT HAS AN
20 ELEMENT OF COMMON SENSE. IT SEEMS MORE VIABLE AT THE BALLOT
21 BOX. WE'RE HEARING THAT THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF IS AROUND
22 MUNI, TRANSIT. LET'S BUILD IT AROUND THOSE COUNTIES. AND
23 FUNDING SHOULD COME WITH OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY WITH THE
24 GOAL TO MAXIMIZING THE IMPACT AND EFFECTIVENESS -- AND
25 EFFECTIVENESS OF THE FUNDING. IT'S NOT REALISTIC TO GET



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COUNTIES ON BOARD WHO EITHER DON'T REQUIRE THE SAME LEVEL OF
2 OPERATING SUBSIDY OR WHO WILL -- RENEWING THEIR OWN REVENUE
3 MEASURES. THANKS.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND THE LAST SPEAKER CARD FOR IN-
6 PERSON SPEAKER FOR THIS ITEM THAT I HAVE IS BOB ALLEN.

7

8 **BOB ALLEN:** THANKS, MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. A COUPLE THINGS.
9 I THINK FOLKS HAVE MENTIONED REPEATEDLY THIS WILL BE A HARD
10 CAMPAIGN TO WIN AND JIM SPERING SAID, REALLY, FAILURE IS NOT
11 AN OPTION. IT'S A HARD THING FOR ALL FOLKS WHO CAMPAIGN AND
12 ELECTED OFFICIALS. IT WILL BE HARD TO EXPLAIN WHAT THE BAY
13 AREA TO EXPLAIN. IT WILL BE HARD TO TELL PEOPLE AND HAVE AN
14 HONEST CONVERSATION AND SAY, WE'RE KIND OF GIVING UP ON
15 CLIMATE GOALS. WE CAN STOP THE FACADE OF DOING PLANT BARRIERS
16 IF WE DON'T DO SOMETHING SIGNIFICANT. AND SO IT'S GOING TO
17 REQUIRE A CAMPAIGN. IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE A CAMPAIGN TO WIN
18 OVER PEOPLE WHO DRIVE, TO REALIZE TRAFFIC IS GOING TO GET
19 WORSE, AFFORDABILITY WILL BE WORSE. FOLKS, YOUNG FOLKS, FOLKS
20 WHO RELY ON TRANSIT RIGHT NOW. AND IF WE REALLY ARE CONCERNED
21 ABOUT SAFETY, SAFETY OF THE WORKERS AND THE RIDERS, THE BEST
22 THING WE DO IS GET PEOPLE BACK ON TRANSIT. CRIME HAS GONE DOWN
23 IN THE BAY AREA. THERE WERE CONCERNS ABOUT IT, THAT'S TRUE.
24 THE BEST SAFETY IS TO GET TRANSIT RUNNING AND TO GET TRANSIT
25 RIDERS BACK.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, BOB. [APPLAUSE]

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ARE YOU READY TO BEGIN WITH THE
5 ZOOM CALLERS? ZOOM SPEAKERS. WE'LL BEGIN WITH CARTER AND THEN
6 FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

7

8 **CARTER LAVIN:** I'M AN OAKLAND RESIDENT WITH THE VOICES OF
9 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. STRONG SUPPORTER OF OPTION TWO, THE GO
10 BIG PLAN. FOR ALL THE REASONS PEOPLE HAVE BEEN STATING,
11 FUNDAMENTALLY, AS JUST TO SPEAK PERSONALLY, AS A PERSON WHO'S
12 GOING TO DO A LOT OF OUTREACH IN OUR COMMUNITY ABOUT GETTING
13 PEOPLE ONBOARD WITH WHATEVER MEASURE IT IS, OPTION TWO IS THE
14 ONLY WAY I WILL REASONABLY TALK TO VOTERS AND SAY, HERE IS
15 THIS INFORMATION. ANYTHING ELSE WILL GET YOU LAUGHED AT. AT
16 SOMEONE THAT'S GOING TO COUNTY FAIRS, ON BART STATIONS, ON THE
17 STREET, THINGS LIKE THAT, I WILL TELL YOU OPTION TWO IS THE
18 ONLY WAY TO GO. ONE, IT SOLVES AS MUCH OF THE PROBLEM WE
19 POSSIBLY CAN. WE CAN'T SAY, HEY, RAISE YOUR TAXES AND GET
20 WORSE TRANSIT. THAT GETS YOU LAUGHED OUT OF A ROOM. SO
21 STRONGLY ENCOURAGING OPTION TWO. THANK YOU, STAFFERS, FOR ALL
22 THE WORK YOU PUT IN ALL THIS.

23

24 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
2 VINAY PIMPLE FOLLOWED BY HARRY. YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU
3 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

4
5 **VINAY PIMPLE:** THANK YOU, STAFF, FOR ALL YOUR WORK. IF YOU
6 EXCLUSIVELY LIMIT THIS TO PUBLIC TRANSIT, EXCLUDING 80% OF THE
7 PEOPLE, YOU ARE REALLY NARROWING YOUR MARGIN FOR ERROR ON A
8 VERY DIFFICULT MEASURE TO PRACTICALLY NOTHING. SECOND, WE TALK
9 ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY. WHY NOT HAVE -- FUNDING? I JUST DON'T
10 HEAR ABOUT THAT AT ALL. INSTEAD, WHAT I HEAR IS -- HEAR IS WE
11 KNOW THAT BART IS NOT GOING TO RECOVER PASSENGERS, BUT WE
12 STILL NEED TO RUN THOSE TRAINS. I'M LIKE, WHY? MAYBE YOU NEED
13 SOME OTHER SERVICE. SO PLEASE, STAY FLEXIBLE. THINK ABOUT WHAT
14 TECHNOLOGIES MAY RESHAPE THINGS. KEEP IT AS FLEXIBLE AS
15 POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT PUBLIC COMMENT
18 IS FROM HARRY MILL FOLLOWED BY APRIL.

19

20 **HARRY NEIL:** I AM A TRANSIT ADVOCATE, PART OF THE CITIZENS
21 ADVISORY COMMITTEE. THOUGH I AM SPEAKING ON MY OWN BEHALF
22 TODAY. I WOULD LIKE TO MENTION THAT SOMETHING THAT
23 COMMISSIONER JIM WUNDERMAN MENTIONED IS THE IMPORTANCE OF BELT
24 TIGHTENING ALONG WITH RAISING FUNDS TO CLOSE THE DEFICIT. BUT
25 IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT BART IS ACTUALLY ONE OF THE MOST



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 EFFICIENT COMPANIES. IT'S LESS THAN HALF OF NEW YORK'S M.T.A.
2 AND LESS THAN A THIRD OF LOS ANGELES' HEAVY RAIL.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** 15 SECONDS.

5

6 **HARRY NEIL:** IN SEATTLE, THEY HAD MULTIPLE SMALL TAXES IN ONE
7 MEASURE INSTEAD OF ONE LARGER ONE. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT MAY
8 NOT BE AVAILABLE IN CALIFORNIA. WE SHOULD WORK WITH
9 LEGISLATIVE PARTNERS TO ENABLE TO DO THAT, IF POSSIBLE. THANK
10 YOU

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS APRIL. YES.

13

14 **APRIL BEYERSDORF:** I AM A BAY AREA COLLEGE STUDENT AND I AM
15 PART OF THE GENERATION THAT WILL BEAR THE BURDEN OF CLIMATE
16 CHANGE. SCENARIO ONE RELIES ON COUNTIES TO OPT WHICH IS
17 COUNTERPRODUCTIVE TO IMPROVING TRANSIT. THREE KEEPS THE
18 AGENCIES FRAGMENTED, CONFUSING FOR THE PUBLIC AND VULNERABLE.
19 ONLY VULNERABLE TWO WILL PROPERLY FUND TRANSIT SO PEOPLE CAN
20 BENEFIT FROM THE WORLD-CLASS TRANSIT WE NEED TO GET OUR CARS
21 OFF OF THE ROAD AND CLEAN OUR AIR. I HOPE YOU WILL TAKE INTO
22 ACCOUNT THE CLIMATE-FOCUSED CONCERNS OF ME AND MY GENERATION
23 AND SUPPORT SCENARIO TWO. GO BIG. FUND WITH A THE PROGRESSIVE
24 TAX RATHER THAN A SALES TAX SO FUNDING INFRASTRUCTURE DOES NOT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 FALL ON THE MOST HEAVILY ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
5 WENDY COLLINS FOLLOWED BY MARJORIE.

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. WITH SUSTAINABLE MARIN. A MEMBER OF
8 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I SUPPORT OPTION TWO AS THE BEST
9 SCENARIO TO WORK ON AND TO IMPROVE. I THINK WE NEED TO BE
10 REGIONAL IN OUR APPROACH. I THINK THE PARCEL TAX IS THE BETTER
11 CHOICE. ALTHOUGH I REALLY AM STILL DISAPPOINTED THAT INCOME
12 TAX WAS NOT EVALUATED. I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT THING TO
13 LOOK AT IS DEVELOPING A CONNECTIVITY BETWEEN THE DIFFERENT
14 SYSTEMS AND ENOUGH FREQUENCY AND LATER NIGHT SERVICE SO THOSE
15 OF US WHO DO WANT TO TRAVEL REGIONALLY AND WANT TO COME INTO
16 THE CITY TO GO TO EVENTS CAN ACTUALLY GET HOME AFTERWARDS.
17 THIS IS PROBABLY -- FOR THOSE WHO ARE LOOKING FOR NEW TRANSIT
18 RIDERS, THAT'S PROBABLY THE BIGGEST IMPEDIMENTS IS THE LACK OF
19 FREQUENCY CONNECTIVITY AND LATE-NIGHT SERVICE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
22 MARJORIE ALVORD FOLLOWED BY PETER STRAUS.

23

24 **MARJORIE ALVORD:** WITH GENESIS AND 350 BAY AREA, BOTH PART OF
25 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MANY THANKS TO M.T.C. STAFF FOR ALL



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 YOUR WORK. I SUPPORT THE GO BIG SCENARIO, TOO. THE ONLY
2 SCENARIO THAT ADDRESSES FISCAL SHORTFALLS, SUPPORTS REGIONAL
3 TRANSFORMATION AND DOES NOT RELY ON SALES TAX. I HAVE BEEN
4 WISHING FOR BETTER BAYWIDE TRANSIT SINCE I COMMUTED FROM
5 NORTHERN ALAMEDA COUNTY TO SAN JOSE IN THE 1980'S. ONE OF THE
6 REASONS I PREFER TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT TO DIFFERENT COUNTIES
7 IS FOR SAFETY. OUR HIGHWAYS ARE DANGEROUS. TENS OF THOUSANDS
8 OF PEOPLE DIE IN CAR CRASHES EACH YEAR. PLEASE, WE NEED A
9 REGIONAL MEASURE THAT MEASURES UP. WE NEED A REGIONWIDE
10 MEASURE. AND WE NEED TO SUPPORT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FOR
11 SAFETY. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
14 PETER STRAUSS FOLLOWED BY DYLAN FABRI. PETER, GO AHEAD AND
15 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **PETER STRAUS:** FOR SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND ALSO PART
18 OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AS MOST OTHER SPEAKERS
19 THIS MORNING, I STRONGLY SUPPORT OPTION TWO. THOUGH, IT
20 PROBABLY DOES NEED SOME REFINEMENT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE IN
21 THE BAY AREA CAN BUY INTO IT. BUT OPTION ONE IS THE FRAMEWORK
22 FOR AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION, FAILS TO SUPPORT PROGRESSIVE
23 INFORMATION. IT IS INSUFFICIENT TO BE ABLE TO SOLVE THE
24 PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE FACING. IT ABSOLUTELY FAILS TO WORK FOR
25 SAN FRANCISCO AND I BELIEVE IT WOULD FAIL AT THE BALLOT BOX.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WE NEED TO REMEMBER OUR GOAL IS TO SURVIVE AND THRIVE AND ONLY
2 OPTION TWO HAS THE POTENTIAL TO WORK ACCEPTABLY FOR ALL NINE
3 COUNTIES AND OFFER A FRAMEWORK THAT VOTERS CAN SUPPORT BY
4 SUPPORTING SUSTAINING AND GROWING TRANSIT OPTIONS. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
7 DYLAN FABRIS FOLLOWED BY SOPHIA DEWITT.

8

9 **DYLAN FABRIS:** PART OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. THANK YOU
10 TO M.T.C. STAFF FOR LISTENING AND PUTTING THESE SCENARIOS
11 TOGETHER. AS THE MEMBERS SUPPORTED NONPROFIT ADVOCATING ON
12 BEHALF OF THE HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF DAILY RIDERS FROM
13 ACROSS THE BAY WHO TAKE TRANSIT IN SAN FRANCISCO, WE STRONGLY
14 SUPPORT SCENARIO TWO. SCENARIO TWO IS THE ONE THAT ADDRESSES
15 THE FISCAL CLIFF WHICH SHOULD BE THE TOP PRIORITY. GOING DOWN
16 THE PATH OF 30% REDUCTION IN SERVICES IS UNACCEPTABLE. THEY
17 ARE WORKING TO FIX THE FUNDING LOCALLY BUT WE NEED A REGIONAL
18 MEASURE THAT CAN SUPPORT MUNI AND REGIONWIDE TRANSIT. OPTION
19 TWO IS NOT OVERLY COMPLICATED. POLLING SHOWS THAT PEOPLE WANT
20 TO GROW TRANSIT SERVICE. AND OPTION TWO IS THE ONE THAT ALLOWS
21 US TO CAMPAIGN ON THAT PROMISE. OPTION TWO IS FAIR FOR TRANSIT
22 RIDERS, TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND TAXPAYERS REGIONWIDE AND I URGE
23 THIS COMMITTEE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THAT OPTION. THANK YOU.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
2 SOPHIA DEWITT AND THEN DAVID SORRELL. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
3 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

4
5 **SOPHIA DEWITT:** CHIEF PROGRAM OFFICER AT EAST BAY HOUSING
6 ORGANIZATIONS AND A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
7 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. ON BEHALF OF EBHOLE AND ALSO MYSELF
8 AS A TRANSIT-DEPENDENT RIDER IN THE BAY AREA THAT FREQUENTLY
9 USES BART AND A.C. TRANSIT, I'M STRONGLY IN SUPPORT OF
10 SCENARIO TWO. AS THE ONE OPTION THAT WILL PROVIDE ENOUGH
11 FUNDING TO AVERT THE FISCAL CLIFF FOR TRANSIT AND ALSO HELP TO
12 LOOK AT EXPANSION FOR TRANSIT. IT ALSO RELIES ON A PROGRESSIVE
13 TAX MEASURE, WHICH IS THE ONLY WAY THAT IS FAIR SO THAT THE
14 IMPROVEMENTS AND SUSTAINING OF TRANSIT DOES NOT FALL
15 EXCLUSIVELY ON LOWER INCOME PEOPLE IN OUR REGION. THANK YOU SO
16 MUCH AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO ENGAGE WITH M.T.C.
17 AROUND THIS PROCESS.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
20 DAVID FOLLOWED BY JORDAN GRIMES. DAVID, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
21 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

22

23 **DAVID SORRELL:** THANK YOU, SUPERVISORS. PAST PRESIDENT OF THE
24 ASSOCIATION FOR COMMUTER TRANSPORTATION WITH THE NORTH CAL
25 CHAPTER. I AM SPEAKING BOTH AS A RECHT TIFF -- REPRESENTATIVE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BUT ALSO A COMMUTER. OPTION TWO WILL BE THE PATH OF LEAST
2 ANNOYANCE. NOT JUST MAKING SURE THE LIGHTS ARE KEPT ON. I DO
3 WANT TO CALL ATTENTION AS WELL TO CONNECTED SERVICES THAT HAVE
4 A MEGA-REGIONAL LEVEL OF SERVICE. SAN FRANCISCO, THE -- FOR
5 EXAMPLE, THE EXPRESS PARTNERS WITH FOUR TRANSIT AGENCIES IN
6 TWO DIFFERENT COUNTIES, ALAMEDA AND SANTA CLARA COUNTIES, FOR
7 SERVICES THAT DELIVER OUR -- MANY OF THE EMPLOYEES TO THEIR
8 FINAL DESTINATIONS AS A T.D.M. STRATEGY. FUNDING HAS BEEN CUT
9 BECAUSE OF BAY AREA -- BECAUSE OF THE COMMITMENT TO MOVE AWAY
10 TOWARDS GRANT FUNDING FOR THOSE PARTICULAR PROGRAMS AND A NEED
11 TO BACKFILL SOME OF THOSE FUNDING MECHANISMS FOR THE FUTURE.
12 SO I WOULD LIKE FOR US TO CONTINUE THAT MECHANISM. THANK YOU
13 FOR YOUR TIME.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES
16 FOLLOWED BY HOWARD WONG. JORDAN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
17 YOU HAVE A MINUTE.

18

19 **JORDAN GRIMES:** JORDAN GRIMES, STATE AND RESILIENT REGIONAL
20 MANAGER, LIFE-LONG CALTRAIN RIDER. WE'RE HERE TODAY IN STRONG
21 SUPPORT OF THE GO BIG PLAN, SCENARIO TWO. FUNDAMENTALLY TO US,
22 SCENARIO TWO IS THE ONLY FEASIBLE SCENARIO. SCENARIO ONE WILL
23 NOT PROVIDE ENOUGH FUNDING TO SUPPORT THE SYSTEM WE NEED AND
24 WE DON'T BELIEVE THE MULTI-MEASURE APPROACH OF SCENARIO THREE
25 IS VIABLE. TO MEET ALL OF THE REGION'S GOALS AND NEEDS FROM



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 AFFORDABILITY TO CLIMATE, WE HAVE TO HAVE A ROBUST TRANSIT
2 SYSTEM THAT IS FAST, FREQUENT, CONVENIENT AND AFFORDABLE. AND
3 SNARE QUO TWO IS THE ONLY ONE -- AND SCENARIO TWO IS THE ONLY
4 ONE THAT WILL PROVIDE THE FUNDING LEVEL THAT WILL ACTUALLY
5 ALLOW US TO REALIZE THAT. ANYTHING OTHER THAN SCENARIO TWO,
6 IMPORTANTLY, IMPERILS ALL OF THE REGIONAL PROGRESS SO MANY OF
7 US HAVE FOUGHT FOR OVER THE LAST DECADE FROM PLAN BAY AREA TO
8 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. WE KNOW THIS IS GOING TO BE A
9 HARD FIGHT BUT SOMETHING WE ARE READY TO SUIT UP WITH YOU.
10 THANK YOU SO MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
13 HOWARD WONG FOLLOWED BY CELL PHONE LAST THREE DIGITS 3993.
14 HOWARD, GO AHEAD. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

15

16 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY
17 COUNCIL. I THINK A CONSISTENT SIMILAR MESSAGE OF A COORDINATED
18 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION NETWORK TO IMPROVE EVERYONE'S LIVES
19 AND BUILD ALL THE REGION'S ECONOMIES IS A VERY CONSISTENT
20 MESSAGE WITH TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. THE NINE-COUNTY APPROACH
21 CONTINUE TO BUILD AND ADVERTISE PUBLIC SAFETY, RELIABILITY. IF
22 I COULD WAVE A MAGIC WAND, I WOULD PUT FORWARD A MULTIPLE
23 FUNDING MEASURES. SMALLER PAYROLL TAXES, PARCEL TAXES.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** TIME PLEASE. THANK YOU. OUR NEXT
2 SPEAKER IS CELL PHONE LAST FOUR DIGITS 3993 FOLLOWED BY SHANE
3 WEINSTEIN.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS SAL
6 CRUZ, A MEMBER LOCAL 3993 AND I WORK AT BAY AREA RAPID
7 TRANSIT, BART. I'M HERE TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF THE GO BIG
8 SCENARIO. MEMBERS AT BART WORK TIRELESSLY TO ENSURE BART
9 PASSENGERS TRAVEL SAFELY AND EFFICIENTLY THROUGHOUT THE BAY
10 AREA. MOST OF THE CAREER EMPLOYEES WHO DEDICATED THEIR LIVES
11 TO PUBLIC SERVICE AT THE PUBLIC TRANSIT. APPRECIATE STAFF'S
12 WORK IN PRESENTING A FRAMEWORK BASED ON THE LABOR, COMMUNITY,
13 TRANSIT PRINCIPLES THAT OUR LOCAL AND MANY OTHERS ENDORSED.
14 ANALYSIS SHOWS THE GO BIG ANALYSIS WILL PREVENT LAYOFFS,
15 IMPROVE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE, AND -- THANK YOU FOR
16 YOUR TIME.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
19 SHANE WEINSTEIN FOLLOWED BY JORDAN MOLDOW.

20

21 **SHANE WEINSTEIN:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** SHANE, ARE YOU THERE?

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **SHANE WEINSTEIN:** PRESIDENT OF 181575. I REPRESENT ALL THE BUS
2 OPERATORS AT GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT AS WELL AS PETALUMA TRANSIT.
3 I AM CALLING TODAY TO SUPPORT THE GO BIG SCENARIO. IT'S THE
4 ONLY ONE THAT WILL PREVENT MAJOR SERVICE CUTS AND LAYOFFS.
5 IT'S THE ONLY ONE THAT'S GOING TO FUND TRANSFORMATION
6 IMPROVEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, AND IT'S THE ONLY ONE
7 THAT'S NOT GOING TO UNFAIRLY OVERTAX WORKING PEOPLE. NOT ONLY
8 IS THE SCENARIO THAT ACHIEVES OUR GOALS, BUT IT'S THE ONLY ONE
9 THAT WILL WIN OVER VOTER SUPPORT. OUR MEMBERS, TOGETHER WITH
10 THE MEMBERS OF MANY OTHER UNIONS, COMMUNITY RIDER GROUPS, HAVE
11 COLLECTIVE POWER TO WHEN BOTH IN THE LEGISLATURE IN 2025 AND
12 AT THE BALLOT BOX IN 2026. THERE IS MORE TO BE DONE TO PERFECT
13 THE SCENARIO, AND OUR MEMBERS ARE COMMITTED TO DOING THAT WORK
14 WITH YOU. I URGE YOU TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE NINE-COUNTY \$1.5
15 BILLION SCENARIO. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
18 JORDAN MOLDOW FOLLOWED BY MATT HETTICH. EXCUSE ME.

19

20 **JORDAN MOLDOW:** RESIDENT OF SAN JOSE AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY.
21 I'M A RIDER OF CALTRAIN, BART, MUNI AND ALSO BAY WHEELS FOR
22 LAST MILE CONNECTIONS. WITH THE TRANSIT BAY COALITIONS AND
23 VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION CALLING FOR OPTION ONE TO NOT
24 BE CONSIDERED AND CALLING FOR A BOLD OPTION. I WANT MY TAXES
25 TO PAY FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT AND ONLY PUBLIC TRANSIT, NOT ROADWAY



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 EXPANSION. WE NEED AN OPTION THAT CAN BE SOLD TO VOTERS.
2 OPTION ONE IS NOT VIABLE. DOESN'T SOLVE PROBLEMS THAT RIDERS
3 FACE. WE NEED TO BE BOLD AND WE NEED TO IMPROVE TRANSIT AND
4 CREATE A RELIABLE SOURCE OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT FOR THE NEXT
5 MULTIPLE DECADES, NOT JUST EIGHT YEARS. THIS MEASURE HELPS CAR
6 DRIVERS, TOO. BECAUSE IT GETS THOSE WHO ARE WILLING AND ABLE
7 TO DRIVE -- WILLING AND ABLE TO TAKE TRANSIT OUT OF TRAFFIC
8 AND INTO TRANSIT. THE COMMISSIONER TODAY WHO HAD TO DRIVE
9 COULD HAVE TAKEN TRANSIT AND THAT WOULD HAVE REDUCED TRAFFIC
10 FOR THE OTHER DRIVERS ON THE ROAD. SO OPTION TWO HELPS
11 EVERYONE. PLEASE ITERATE ON THIS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS MATT
14 HETTICH FOLLOWED BY AIDAN JONES. MATT, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
15 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **MATT HETTICH:** I'M MATT. I'M A FIELD REP WITH THE TRANSPORT
18 WORKERS UNION, T.W.U., AND SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF SCENARIO
19 TWO. T.W.U. MEMBERS WORK EVERY DAY KEEPING THE SYSTEM RUNNING.
20 IT INCLUDES LIGHT RAIL, BUS, CABLE OPERATORS AS WELL AS OTHER
21 CLASS AND CRAFT OF WORKERS WHO ENSURE THE MUNI SYSTEM OPERATES
22 SAFELY AND SMOOTHLY FOR ALL RIDERS. WE APPRECIATE STAFF
23 WORKING TO PRESENT A FRAMEWORK THAT'S INCLUSIVE OF THE
24 PRINCIPLES CHAMPIONED BY TRANSIT WORKERS, AS PROVIDED THROUGH
25 THEIR UNIONS. THE T.W.U. AND MANY OTHER LABOR GROUPS HAVE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 WORKED COLLECTIVELY TO DEVELOP A SET OF LABOR PRINCIPLES AND
2 T.W.U. STANDS BEHIND IT. SCENARIO TWO PREVENTS MAJOR SERVICE
3 CUTS AND LAYOFFS, A TOP PRIORITY FOR MEMBERS. IT WILL FUND
4 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS IN THE BAY AREA AND THE ONLY
5 OPTION THAT WON'T OVERLY TAX WORKING THROUGH THROUGH A
6 REGRESSIVE TAX IS REAL. REGRESSIVE TAXES EXISTS. OPTION TWO
7 ACHIEVES THIS THROUGH COMMUNITY ALLIES AND CAN WIN IN THE
8 LEGISLATURE AND AT THE BALLOT BOX. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
11 AIDAN JONES FOLLOWED BY ZAFARALI AHMED. AIDAN, GO AHEAD AND
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. AIDAN, ARE YOU THERE?
13 GOING TO KEEP GOING. ZAFARALI AHMED, YOU'RE UP NEXT. YOU HAVE
14 ONE MINUTE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **ZAFARALI AHMED:** I USE TRANSPORTATION EVERY DAY. I AM FOR
17 VOICES WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHO ARE CALLING FOR THE GO
18 BIG SCENARIO. I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY IN SUCH A WEALTHY AREA WE
19 HAVE LIMITED PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. FOR EXAMPLE, WHY CAN'T YOU
20 CROSS THE BARTON BRIDGE ON THE WEEKEND? ANY CUT TO TRANSIT OR
21 BART WOULD BE CATASTROPHIC ON MY MOBILITY AND WOULD FORCE ME
22 TO DRIVE WHEN I DO NOT WANT TO. IN THE AGE OF CLIMATE CHANGE,
23 WHY DO WE SPEND SO MUCH ON CONGESTED HIGHWAYS AND HAVE TO BEG
24 FOR TRANSIT FUNDING? I AM LOOKING TO YOU FOR LEADERSHIP TO



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 FUND TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSIT. TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSIT TO MEET
2 CLIMATE AND MOBILITY GOALS IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER WILL BE
5 AIDAN JONES FOLLOWED BY OUR LAST ZOOM SPEAKER ZACH. AIDAN, IF
6 YOU'RE THERE, UH-UH MUTE YOURSELF AND YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.
7 OKAY. WE'LL GO TO OUR NEXT SPEAKER, ZACH.

8

9 **ZACH:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M A TRANSIT RIDER IN SAN
10 FRANCISCO. PART OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
11 COALITION. I DON'T OWN A CAR AND PUBLIC TRANSIT IS CRITICAL
12 FOR ME TO GET AROUND THE CITY AND THE REGION. I STRONGLY
13 ENCOURAGE YOU TO PURSUE SCENARIO TWO, GO BIG SCENARIO. THAT'S
14 THE ONLY PATH FORWARD THAT ACTUALLY ENCOURAGES, ADDRESSES THE
15 FISCAL CLIFF AND WILL SUPPORT THE SERVICE THAT RIDERS NEED.
16 WHAT RIDERS NEED IS LONG-TERM, STABLE TRANSIT FUNDING, NOT
17 JUST A STOPGAP THAT WILL CREATE A NEW FISCAL CLIFF IN A FEW
18 YEARS. AS YOU GO FORWARD, I ASK YOU CONSIDER TWO IMPORTANT
19 PRINCIPLES. FIRST, PRIORITIZE CLIMATE-NEUTRAL INFRASTRUCTURE.
20 THERE MUST BE ZERO HIGHWAY EXPANSION IN THE FUTURE AND HELP
21 PEOPLE GET TO TRANSIT. SECOND AND ANY SNARE JOE, THERE MUST BE
22 PROGRESSIVE REVENUE RESOURCES. RELYING ONLY ON SALES TAX WILL
23 BE A NONSTARTER FOR VOTERS AND CERTAINLY WITH THE
24 ORGANIZATIONS AND LABOR AND GROUPS YOU NEED TO PASS THIS
25 MEASURE. REALLY APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT STAFF AND THE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 COMMITTEE HAVE PUT INTO THIS AND ALL YOUR EFFORTS IN FINDING
2 SOLUTIONS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AIDAN, I SEE YOU WENT ON
5 ANOTHER DEVICE. CAN YOU PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT?

6

7 **AIDAN JONES:** HI, MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
8 WORK ON THIS MEASURE. I AM A MEMBER OF SAN FRANCISCO AND DON'T
9 OWN A CAR. SO I RELY ON TRANSIT TO GET TO WHERE I NEED TO GO.
10 CURRENTLY MUNI AND BART ARE HAVING FINANCIAL DEFICITS IF NOT
11 ADDRESSED WILL LIKELY EVENTUALLY RESULT IN BOTH AGENCIES BEING
12 GUTTED TO THE POINT OF BEING UNUSABLE. TO HELP PREVENT THIS
13 FUTURE FROM OCCURRING, I ENCOURAGE YOU TO SUPPORT THE GO BIG
14 FRAMEWORK OR OPTION TWO. THIS SCENARIO IS THE ONLY ONE THAT
15 SOLVES THE OPERATIONS DEFICIT AND ESTABLISHES MUCH-NEEDED
16 REGIONAL SUPPORT BETWEEN AGENCIES. IT -- THANK YOU FOR YOUR
17 TIME.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC
20 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. VERY GOOD. SO STAFF, YOU WANT TO
23 TELL US WHAT YOU THINK OUR NEXT STEPS WERE? WE HEARD A LOT OF
24 OPTIONS. OPTION ONE, TWO. OPTION THREE, WE HAVE TO MOBILIZE



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 FAIRLY QUICKLY HERE. HOPEFULLY WE CAN DO THAT. BUT WHAT ARE
2 OUR NEXT STEPS HERE? WITH WHAT YOU HEARD TODAY?

3

4 **STUART COHEN:** WE HEARD GREAT INPUT. VERY VARIED. WE'LL COME
5 BACK AND TRY TO ITERATE ON, REALLY, BOTH OF THE SCENARIOS AND
6 DO THE BEST WE CAN TO INCORPORATE THOSE. AND WE'LL ALSO, I
7 THINK, MEET WITH THE AGENCIES THAT MIGHT BE DOING THE SEPARATE
8 MEASURES AND SEE WHAT THAT MIGHT LOOK LIKE. GO A LITTLE BIT
9 MORE IN DEPTH TO THAT, AS SUGGESTED BY COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ
10 AND OTHERS. SO I THINK REALLY THAT'S THE NEXT STEPS. WE GOT
11 ANOTHER AGENDA ITEM. AND SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE GET TO THAT
12 AS WELL.

13

14 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. WHY DON'T WE GO TO THAT RIGHT NOW?

15

16 **STUART COHEN:** SURE. SO THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. SO IN
17 CONTRAST TO THE LAST ITEM WHERE WE PROVIDED SCENARIOS TO GET
18 IDEAS ABOUT FUNDING, IN THIS ITEM, WE'RE ASKING FOR INPUT
19 ABOUT WHAT POLICY TOPICS OUTSIDE OF FUNDING YOU WOULD LIKE US
20 TO BRING FORWARD FOR THE COMMITTEE TO EXPLORE NEXT MONTH. AND
21 WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS SOMETHING THAT WILL REQUIRE A
22 LEGISLATIVE CHANGE. THAT CAN BE INCORPORATED INTO THE ENABLING
23 LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE OR AT LEAST
24 PURSUED IN PARALLEL LEGISLATION. IF COMMITTEE MEMBERS ALSO
25 FEEL VERY STRONGLY ABOUT TOPICS THAT WE ABSOLUTELY SHOULD NOT



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 INCLUDE IN THE LEGISLATION, WE'D LIKE TO HEAR THAT, TOO. AND
2 NOW A NUMBER OF YOU MENTIONED THE IMPORTANCE OF IMPROVEMENTS
3 TO TRANSIT BEING MADE IN ADVANCE OF VOTERS BEING ASKED TO VOTE
4 ON A MEASURE. THINGS LIKE SAFETY AND CLEANLINESS, WE STRONGLY
5 SUPPORT THAT, BUT LET'S FOCUS RIGHT NOW ON THE KIND OF
6 POLICIES THAT WOULD REQUIRE LEGISLATION. AND CHAIR SPERING,
7 GIVEN WE'RE LATE ON TIME, AT YOUR DISCRETION, WE CAN ASK
8 COMMITTEE MEMBERS TO SUBMIT THEIR IDEAS AND SUGGESTIONS VIA
9 EMAIL OR IN MEETINGS WITH STAFF. WE'D STILL NEED TO CALL FOR
10 PUBLIC COMMENT HERE TODAY. AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK TO
11 YOU, CHAIR SPERING.

12

13 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. COMMITTEE MEMBERS, IS THERE ANYTHING
14 ANYONE NEEDS TO BRING UP RIGHT NOW? WE WILL TAKE THESE --
15 WE'LL SHARE THEM WITH ALL OF THE COMMITTEE AS WE GET THE
16 COMMENTS FROM YOU. ELLEN, DO YOU WANT TO --

17

18 **ELLEN WU:** I THINK YOU MIGHT BE EXPLORING THIS ALREADY, JUST
19 THE IDEA OF THE CHANGING THE WORD COUNT FOR BALLOT MEASURES. I
20 THINK YOU'RE ALREADY LOOKING INTO THAT. BE INTERESTING TO HEAR
21 WHAT YOU ALL FOUND.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND IT WOULD BE GOOD IF EVERYONE THINKS
24 ABOUT THIS ACCOUNTABILITY PIECE. HOW CAN WE BUILD INTO THE
25 LEGISLATION THE ACCOUNTABILITY THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS AND, YOU



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 KNOW, BRINGING THE TRANSFORMATIONAL RECOMMENDATION FROM THE
2 BLUE RIBBON, HOW DO WE ACTUALLY BRING THOSE INTO THIS PROCESS
3 AS TO WHAT WE SEND TO THE LEGISLATURE? GO AHEAD, DAVID.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** ONE OF THE THINGS I'M INTERESTED IN IS THIS
6 ISSUE AROUND CALTRAIN AND CONSOLIDATION AND JUST WHAT DOES
7 THAT LOOK LIKE? I THINK WE HEARD FROM OTHERS WHO ARE CONCERNED
8 ABOUT POTENTIAL CONSOLIDATION. DOES THAT -- DOES THAT -- IS
9 THAT REQUIRED IN THE LANGUAGE? I THINK FOR ME, UNDERSTANDING
10 WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE, YOU KNOW, IS CRITICAL. ESPECIALLY AROUND
11 ISSUES AROUND CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION. WE HAVE MANY GOOD
12 MEMORIES OF JUST PEOPLE WHO ARE VERY DISCOURAGED AT THAT
13 LANGUAGE -- LANGUAGE BEING ADDED, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE
14 GET OUT AHEAD OF THAT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** WELL, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING, WE WERE NOT
17 GOING TO BE INCLUDING ANY LANGUAGE ABOUT CONSOLIDATION. THAT
18 ISSUE OUGHT TO BE DEALT WITH SEPARATELY. 1031, WE HEARD ACROSS
19 THE BOARD THAT WOULD KILL ANY MEASURE. CONSOLIDATION IS
20 IMPORTANT. BUT I WOULD CAUTION THAT WE INCLUDE IT INTO THIS
21 MEASURE THAT WE'RE BRINGING FORWARD. BUT SUBMIT THOSE
22 COMMENTS. IF YOU THINK IT'S SOMETHING THAT SHOULD BE INCLUDED,
23 THOSE COMMENTS.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** ALICIA'S OFFICES ARE RAISING THEIR HAND.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALICIA, GO AHEAD.

3

4 **ALICIA LAWRENCE:** YES, THANK YOU. OUR OFFICE JUST WANTS TO
5 RESTATE THAT FOR US, THE CONSOLIDATION PIECE IS NOT OFF THE
6 TABLE. AND WE FEEL VERY STRONGLY THAT PUBLIC SENTIMENT IS
7 SUPPORTIVE OF ANALYZING CONSOLIDATION AND ANALYZING
8 TRANSFORMATIVE GOVERNANCE, ESPECIALLY IN RELATION TO OUR
9 PREVIOUS COMMENTS REGARDING THE BAHFA BOND. WE CAN'T SHY AWAY
10 FROM ANY UNCOMFORTABLE CONVERSATION ON WHETHER RIDERS ARE BEST
11 SERVED BY LESS THAN 27 AGENCIES. THAT'S NOT BEST TO SAY RIDERS
12 ARE BEST SERVED BY A SINGLE AGENCY. WE WILL BE WILLING TO
13 ENGAGE IN A CONVERSATION IN ORDER TO DELIVER THE SYSTEM WE ALL
14 AGREE BAY AREA RIDERS DESERVE. SAFE, EQUITABLE, INCLUSIVE,
15 FREQUENT, AFFORDABLE, ACCESSIBLE, AND RELIABLE. AND OUR OFFICE
16 IS AWARE OF THE FEDERAL ISSUES RELATED TO RAIL, BUT I WANT TO
17 RESTATE, AN ASSESSMENT IS ONLY AN EXAMINATION OF
18 POSSIBILITIES. IT'S NOT A MANDATE. WE FEEL VERY STRONGLY THAT
19 THE PUBLIC DESERVES RAN ANALYSIS OF -- AN ANALYSIS OF WHETHER
20 THEIR TAX DOLLARS MIGHT BE BETTER SERVED OF WHETHER SERVICE
21 WOULD BE IMPROVED. AGAIN, WE THINK THE PUBLIC ALSO SUPPORTS
22 THOSE IDEAS. SO I WILL STOP MY COMMENTS THERE. BUT JUST WANT
23 TO RESTATE THAT FOR US IN OUR OFFICE IS ABSOLUTELY PART OF
24 THIS CONVERSATION IN REGARDS TO THIS MEASURE. WE CAN'T ASK



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 PEOPLE KEEP PUMPING MONEY INTO A SYSTEM IF WE DON'T OFFER SOME
2 FORM OF TRANSFORMATIVE GOVERNANCE.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU, ALICIA. AGAIN, I JUST WANT TO
5 REMIND EVERYONE, WE'RE TRYING TO FIND A BALANCE BETWEEN
6 SOLVING THE PROBLEM, GETTING SOMETHING ACROSS THE FINISH LINE
7 THAT THE VOTERS WILL SUPPORT. SO IT'S VERY DELICATE. SO AS WE
8 MOVE FORWARD, WE'RE GOING TO REALLY FOCUS ON SOMETHING THAT WE
9 CAN GET APPROVED AND REALLY ADDRESSES THIS SHORTFALL THAT WE
10 WERE ASKED TO LOOK AT. AND SO PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR POLICY
11 COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS. ACCOUNTABILITY. HOW DO WE IMPLEMENT
12 THE BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS? I THINK THERE'S A LOT OF
13 PIECES TO THIS. AND IF YOU HAVE COMMENTS ABOUT GOVERNANCE,
14 WE'D LIKE TO HEAR THAT, TOO. YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT
17 ACCOUNTABILITY. WHAT DO PEOPLE MEAN ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY?
18 SOMETIMES THAT MEANS REDUCTION IN COSTS. YOU START REDUCING
19 STAFF, YOU START REDUCING SAFETY, YOU START REDUCING
20 RELIABILITY, CLEANLINESS, YOU KNOW, ALL THOSE THINGS START
21 GOING DOWN THE DRAIN SO THAT WORD ACCOUNTABILITY SEEMS TO COME
22 OUT ALL THE TIME BUT WHAT DOES THAT MEAN? AND NOW YOU'RE GOING
23 TO START SHACKLING THE OPERATORS AND GET STUCK AND NOT ABLE TO
24 DO WHAT IT IS. IF WE CAN BE A LITTLE MORE EXPLICIT, WHAT DOES



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THE WORD -- WHAT'S THE DEFINITION, THE USE OF THAT WORD,
2 ACCOUNTABILITY?

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** AND THAT'S A VERY GOOD QUESTION. YOU KNOW,
5 I'M HEARING THAT EVERYWHERE. WE RAISE THIS MONEY FOR THE
6 TRANSIT OPERATORS, HOW DO WE KNOW THE MONEY IS GOING TO BE
7 USED THE WAY THAT, YOU KNOW, THE INTENT OF THE MEASURE? AND SO
8 THAT'S THE ACCOUNTABILITY PIECE. THE PUN WANTS -- THE PUBLIC
9 WANTS TO KNOW AND PEOPLE I TALKED TO THROUGHOUT THE REGION, IF
10 WE ALLOCATE MONEY FOR THAT PROBLEM, WE WANT TO KNOW HOW THAT
11 MONEY WILL BE SPENT AND WE CAN'T ACCOUNTABILITY FOR THAT
12 MONEY. SO WHAT -- AND THE BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS ARE
13 GOING TO HAVE SOME IMPLEMENTATION. YOU ARE NOT GOING TO GET A
14 MEASURE ACROSS THE FINISH LINE IF YOU ONLY TALK ABOUT TRANSIT
15 SHORTFALL. PUBLIC DOESN'T SUPPORT THAT, BUT THEY WANT
16 ACCOUNTABILITY. IF THEY KNOW THEY'RE GOING TO GET CHANGE AND
17 THE OPERATORS ARE GOING TO RESPOND TO THOSE CHANGES THAT THE
18 PUBLIC IS DEMANDING. IT REALLY IS A PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN THE
19 PUBLIC AND THE TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT WE GIVE THEM A BETTER
20 SERVICE. THAT REALLY IS WHAT IT IS. BUT YOU KNOW, YOU COULD
21 ASK 10 PEOPLE AND THEY'LL GIVE YOU 10 DEFINITIONS OF
22 ACCOUNTABILITY. FROM OUR PERSPECTIVE, IT'S, HOW DO WE CHANGE
23 THIS SYSTEM AND MAKE IT MORE SEAMLESS? THAT THE OPERATORS ARE
24 IN AGREEMENT THAT WE TRY AND IMPROVE THE SYSTEM?

25



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **JOHN ARANTES:** UNLESS PEOPLE WALK IN WITH THESE WILD IDEAS AND
2 SAY, YOU FAILED.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** YOU'RE RIGHT. WE AGREE. THAT'S WHY THE
5 RECOMMENDATIONS HAVE TO BE REAL CLEAR. RIGHT NOW WE'RE JUST
6 FOCUSING ON A FRAMEWORK THAT WE CAN BRING FORWARD TO DEAL WITH
7 THE PROBLEM. BUT ALL THE DETAILS OF WHAT THE EXPECTATION IS
8 AND WHAT THAT ACCOUNTABILITY, THE SAFETY, ALL THOSE THINGS
9 THAT EVERYBODY'S TALKING ABOUT, WE REALLY HAVE TO TALK ABOUT
10 THAT DETAIL OF THAT. HOW DO WE DELIVER IT? IT'S GOING TO BE A
11 BIG CHALLENGE TO THIS PROCESS. OKAY. WITH THAT, DID YOU NEED
12 ANYTHING ELSE? YOU GOT ENOUGH DIRECTION, ENOUGH -- YOU HEARD
13 ENOUGH? AND YOU'RE GOING TO BRING FORTH THAT ONE SOLUTION THAT
14 EVERYBODY LIKES. YEAH, WE ARE. WE ARE GOING TO DO PUBLIC
15 COMMENT. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE WE GOT THAT ISSUE ON AND
16 EITHER POLICY CHANGE, WHICH IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT, BECAUSE
17 POLICY CHANGES IS WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE SUBMITTING TO THE
18 LEGISLATURE AND THAT'S GOING TO BE PART OF THAT PROCESS.
19 PUBLIC COMMENTS, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO YOU HAVE?

20

21 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** I HAVE ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND ONE
22 IN THE ZOOM SPACE. WE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FOR
23 THIS PARTICULAR AGENDA ITEM.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY. LET'S HEAR FROM THOSE TWO. YOU GOT
2 ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE'LL START WITH THE BOARDROOM. DON
5 CECIL, IF YOU CAN GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM, YOU'LL
6 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

7

8 **DON CECIL:** GOOD MORNING. DON CECIL. SAN MATEO ECONOMIC
9 DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION. THANK YOU. I'M COMPELLED TO SAY THAT
10 THE CONCEPT OF CONSOLIDATION GOT YOU TO WHERE YOU ARE TODAY.
11 AND IT WOULD BE UNFORTUNATE IF THE SENATOR DECIDES NOT TO
12 PARTICIPATE IN THIS SOLUTION BUT CONSOLIDATION DOES NOT BELONG
13 IN YOUR POLICY. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO OUR ZOOM
16 SPACE, HARRY NEIL, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE
17 MINUTE.

18

19 **HARRY NEIL:** HELLO, AGAIN. IT'S ME, AGAIN. SO ON THE TOPIC OF
20 CONSOLIDATION, I THINK IT IS CERTAINLY SOMETHING TO LOOK INTO,
21 BUT ON THE BACK END, ON THE OPERATING END, IT MIGHT NOT BE AS
22 NECESSARY AS HAVING THE FRONT END, THE CONSUMER FACING BE AS
23 INTEGRATED AS POSSIBLE. IN SOME OTHER CITIES WHERE THEY HAVE,
24 YOU KNOW, CERTAIN PARTS OF THEIR -- OF THEIR OPERATIONS
25 OUTSOURCED TO DIFFERENT PRIVATE OPERATORS AND SOME PUBLIC,



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 THIS IS MOSTLY IN EUROPE, I THINK, ON THE FRONT END TO THE
2 RIDER, IT ALL LOOKS THE SAME. BUT ON THE BACK END, THERE IS
3 LOTS OF DIFFERENCE. THAT KIND OF IMAGE CONSOLIDATION COULD BE
4 USEFUL IF THE OPERATING CONSOLIDATION MAY BE MORE DIFFICULT. I
5 THINK IT'S SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND CHAIR SPERING, WE
8 HAVE ONE MORE VIRTUAL HAND. ADAM HALL, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
9 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

10

11 **ADAM HALL:** I'M ADAM HALL WITH SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY. AND
12 27 AGENCIES IS JUST TOO MANY AGENCIES TO HAVE IF YOU EVER WANT
13 PEOPLE TO COME TO CONSENSUS OR AGREE ON ANYTHING. IT'S ONE OF
14 THE REASONS WHY OUR CLIPPER SYSTEM IS SUCH A MASSIVE MESS, AND
15 IT IS A HEAVY DETERRENT FOR PEOPLE THAT HAVE TO COMMUTE ACROSS
16 TWO OR THREE COUNTIES TO GET TO WORK EVERY DAY, WHICH IS A LOT
17 OF MODERN WORKERS. AND VERY DISTRESSED TO FIND THAT
18 CONSOLIDATION IS THIS TOPIC NOBODY THINKS THEY CAN TALK ABOUT
19 AND EVERYBODY WANTS TO SAY IT'S JUST INAPPROPRIATE WHEN IT IS
20 THE NUMBER ONE PUBLIC TRANSIT NEED WE HAVE IN THE SAN
21 FRANCISCO BAY AREA TODAY.

22

23 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** THANK YOU.

24



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC
2 COMMENT FOR THIS AGENDA ITEM.

3

4 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** COMMITTEE MEMBERS, ANY URGENT COMMENTS? I
5 WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR PARTICIPATING. IT HAS BEEN A LONG
6 MEETING. A LOT OF -- A LOT OF GOOD COMMENTS. WE HAVE A LOT TO
7 WORK ON. SO WE'LL TRY AND BRING A FRAMEWORK FORWARD THAT BECK
8 KIND OF FINE TUNE. WE HAVE TWO MONTHS LEFT TO TRY AND COME UP
9 WITH A RECOMMENDATION, HOPEFULLY WE'LL GET THERE. WITH THAT
10 DOES STAFF HAVE ANY FINAL COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS?

11

12 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE HAVE ONE GENERAL SPEAKER. THAT WAS ON THE H-
13 B POLICY.

14

15 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** ALL RIGHT. GIVE US THAT.

16

17 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE DID RECEIVE A NUMBER OF WRITTEN
18 CORRESPONDENCE FOR GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. THOSE RECEIVED AS
19 OF THE 5:00 P.M. DEADLINE YESTERDAY HAVE BEEN PROVIDED AS
20 HANDOUTS AS WELL AS ADDED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA. CORRESPONDENCE
21 WAS RECEIVED FROM COMMUNITY MEMBERS HOWARD M., MICHAEL C.,
22 KNICK W., AND BILL H. IN A JOINT WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FROM
23 THEALAL TRANSPORT WORKERS UNION OF AMERICA, SMART, IBW LOCAL
24 6, AND UNITED AUTO WORKERS LOCAL 4811. I HAVE ONE SPEAKER CARD
25 FOR THE -- FOR THE BOARDROOM AND TWO RAISED HANDS IN ZOOM.



AUGUST 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY.

3

4 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE'LL START WITH OUR BOARDROOM
5 SPEAKER, CHANCE. IF YOU APPROACH THE PODIUM, YOU WILL HAVE ONE
6 MINUTE.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** I DON'T SEE ANYONE GETTING UP. SO GO TO
9 THE ZOOM.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** OKAY. WE'LL MOVE TO OUR ZOOM
12 SPEAKERS. HARRY NEIL, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
13 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

14

15 **HARRY NEIL:** HELLO. IT'S ME ONCE AGAIN. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY ONE
16 OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS, PROBABLY THE MOST IMPORTANT
17 ANYTHING FOR IMPROVING TRANSIT TODAY IS MAKING SURE THAT THE
18 LAND USE IS THERE. A LOT OF SERVICES HAVE FUNCTIONAL IF NOT
19 AMAZING FREQUENCY, BUT THE LAND USE IS JUST TERRIBLE. AND A
20 LOT OF THIS HAS TO DO WITH LARGE EMPLOYMENT CENTERS HAVING
21 SUCH HUGE PECULIARITIES AROUND THEM. -- HUGE PARKING LOTS
22 AROUND THEM. I WOULD LIKE TO OFFER THAT IT WOULD BE IDEAL TO
23 EXPLORE PARTIAL REDEVELOPMENT OF THESE -- THESE EMPLOYMENT
24 CENTERS, SPECIFICALLY, THEIR LARGE PARKING LOTS. PARCEL --
25 PARTIAL REDEVELOPMENT TO NOT ONLY ADDRESS THE HOUSING CRISIS



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 BUT MAKE THE PROPERTIES THAT HAVE BEEN VERY DIFFICULT TO
2 MAINTAIN BECAUSE OF WORK FROM HOME MAKE THEM MORE VIBRANT AND
3 VALUABLE TO THE EMPLOYERS AND SUCH. A GOOD PLACE TO EXPLORE
4 THIS, ESPECIALLY, WOULD BE NORTH SAN JOSE AROUND THE V.T.A.
5 LIGHT RAIL. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND OUR LAST RAISED HAND
8 IS FROM JORDAN MOLDOW. GO AHEAD, JORDAN, UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU
9 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

10

11 **JORDAN MOLDOW:** THANK YOU. FROM THE CITY OF SAN JOSE. I JUST
12 WANT TO TELL YOU THAT THE WEEK WITHOUT DRIVING, WHICH IS A
13 NATIONAL CAMPAIGN, IS COMING UP BETWEEN SEPTEMBER 30 AND
14 OCTOBER 6. AND I WANTED TO CALL ON MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION
15 TO CONSIDER TAKING A PLEDGE AS PART OF THE CAMPAIGN. THE WEEK
16 WITHOUT DRIVING CHALLENGE PROVIDES AN OPPORTUNITY FOR
17 DECISIONMAKERS TO EXPERIENCE AND EMPATHIZE WITH THE
18 EXPERIENCES OF THE MANY AMERICANS WHO CANNOT DRIVE, WHICH
19 INCLUDES THE ELDERLY, TEENAGERS, PEOPLE WITH VARIOUS
20 DISABILITIES THAT PREVENT THEM FROM DRIVING, AND THOSE WHO
21 JUST CAN'T AFFORD TO DRIVE. SO IF YOU COULD TAKE A PLEDGE FOR
22 THE WEEK OR JUST EVEN JUST A SINGLE DAY, YOU KNOW, THAT REALLY
23 HELPS UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, WHAT WOULD I DO IF I COULDN'T
24 DRIVE AND I THINK THAT'S VERY RELEVANT WITH ALL THE
25 CONVERSATIONS THAT ARE HAPPENING IN THIS COMMITTEE WITH



AUGUST 26, 2024

1 REGARDS TO WHAT'S GOING TO BE THE FUTURE OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
2 SYSTEM, WHICH MANY PEOPLE RELY ON IF THEY CAN'T DRIVE. THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. AND THAT CONCLUDES
6 PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, JIM SPERING:** OKAY, THANK YOU, FOR THE THIRD TIME. DOES
9 ANYBODY HAVE ANY FINAL COMMENTS? OKAY. SO WITH THAT WE'RE
10 ADJOURNED. I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR THE COMMENTS. THIS HAS
11 BEEN VERY HELPFUL. I THINK WE'RE GETTING A LITTLE CLARITY AS
12 TO WHAT OUR NEXT STEPS ARE SO THANK YOU. SO WITH THAT THIS
13 MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

14



NTT

Broadcasting Government