

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 24, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
FRIDAY, MAY 24TH, 2024, 10:00 AM

CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: CALL TO ORDER THE M.T.C. POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE M.T.C. WEBSITE. M.T.C. COUNCILMEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM AND WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. AND DUE TO REMOTE M.T.C. COUNCILMEMBER PARTICIPATION TODAY, A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. I ALSO WANT TO ADDRESS THAT DUE TO AN EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION INCIDENT MEMBERS ARE PREVENTED FROM ATTENDING TODAY'S MEETING IN PERSON. TODAY'S AGENDA CONSISTS SOLELY OF INFORMATIONAL ITEMS. NO DECISIONS, VOTES, OR SUBSTANTIVE POLICY DISCUSSIONS WILL TAKE PLACE DURING THIS MEETING. THE PURPOSE IS TO REVIEW -- I'M SORRY -- TO RECEIVE UPDATES AND REVIEW INFORMATIONAL MATERIALS ONLY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE WELCOMED TO ATTEND AND OBSERVE TODAY'S PROCEEDINGS. SINCE NO ACTION ITEMS ARE ON THE AGENDA, WITH THAT SAID, LET'S PROCEED WITH TODAY'S INFORMATIONAL MEETING. WILL THE CLERK CALL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM?



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR CAMPOS.

2

3 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** PRESENT.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER BENITEZ IS ON THEIR WAY. MEMBER
10 ELDRED ON THEIR WAY. MEMBER ESUF.

11

12 **ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER FITZGERALD. GOODWIN.

15

16 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** PRESENT.

17

18 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KINMAN. MEMBER KINMAN IS EXCUSED.
21 MEMBER LEVIN.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. MEMBER LIEU. MEMBER LIEU IS NOT
2 HERE. MEMBER ORANTES. YEA. RANDI, WE CAN'T -- I SEE RANDI BUT
3 SHE'S STILL ABSENT. MEMBER PARKER. MEMBER PARKER IS ON THEIR
4 WAY. MEMBER PIERCE IS EXCUSED. MEMBER PIMPLE.

5

6 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE. RHOADS

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER RHOADS.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SO NOW A.B. 449 MEMBERS CAN PARTICIPATE.
11 THAT INCLUDES RANDI AND ROLAND, BUT CHAIR CAMPOS HAS TO SAY
12 SOMETHING FIRST.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. SO WE HAVE TWO REQUESTS FOR REMOTE
15 PARTICIPATION UNDER A.B. 2449. FROM EMPTY SEAT COUNCILMEMBERS
16 ROLAND WONG AND RANDI KINMAN. MEMBER ROLAND WONG.

17

18 **ROLAND WONG:** YES. THIS IS ROLAND. I AM REQUESTING TO
19 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER A.B. 2449 JUST CAUSE BECAUSE OF AN
20 ILLNESS THAT PREVENTS ME FROM ATTENDING IN PERSON. THERE ARE
21 NO OTHER PERSONS OVER 18 IN THE ROOM. I WILL UPDATE THE CHAIR
22 IF THE SITUATION ABOUT WHO IS IN THE ROOM. YEAH. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER KINMAN.

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE UNDER
2 A.B. 2449 BECAUSE OF A NEED RELATED TO CAREGIVING THAT
3 REQUIRES ME TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY. THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT
4 IN THE ROOM OVER 18. IF SOMEONE DOES MAGICALLY APPEAR IN THE
5 ROOM WHO IS OVER THE AGE OF 18 I WILL UPDATE THE CHAIR AND THE
6 CLERK IF THAT SITUATION CHANGES.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. YOUR REQUESTS ARE
9 NOTED. WE ARE ADDING EMPTY SEAT COUNCILMEMBERS ROLAND WONG AND
10 RANDI KINMAN AS PRESENT. NEXT, WE HAVE AGENDA ITEM 2, OUR
11 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. IF THE CLERK COULD PLEASE READ THE
12 ANNOUNCEMENT.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, MAKING THE
15 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
16 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDANCE UP TO
17 A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS
18 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
19 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. AND WE DO HAVE A
20 QUORUM NOW.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AWESOME. THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE'LL MOVE
23 US ON TO THE NEXT ITEM WHICH IS OUR CHAIR'S REPORT. I JUST
24 WANT TO REMIND OUR GROUP THAT WE DID GET A LITTLE BIT OF A
25 LATE START AND WE'VE GOT SOME IMPORTANT AGENDA ITEMS TO



MAY 24, 2024

1 DISCUSS. SO A QUICK REMINDER THAT TODAY'S AGENDA IS
2 INFORMATION ITEMS, NO DECISIONS OR VOTES. SO THE IF YOU WERE
3 IS -- PURPOSE TO --

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE CAN TAKE VOTES. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AWESOME. WELL, I WILL JUST REMIND OUR
8 TEAM THAT IF WE CAN KEEP OUR MESSAGES SUCCINCT SO WE CAN MAKE
9 SURE WE HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO GO THROUGH ALL OF OUR AGENDA ITEMS
10 AND WE CAN ALL HAVE A CHANCE TO PROVIDE COMMENT AND HAVE THAT
11 INCREDIBLE DISCOURSE WHEN WE GET A CHANCE TO PARTICIPATE. I
12 ALSO JUST WANT TO SHARE AN EARLIER EQUITY AND ACCESS
13 SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING, THERE WAS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THE CHAIR
14 TO SELECT TWO COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVES TO THE CARE COMMUNITY
15 ADVISORY WORKING GROUP, AND SO FOR THE RECORD I'D LIKE TO STAY
16 THAT COUNCILMEMBERS DIANA BENITEZ AND CARINA LIEU WERE
17 SELECTED FOR THAT. I'D ASK IF THERE ARE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS AT
18 THIS TIME.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO ROOM CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED
21 ON THIS ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ON ZOOM
22 WISHING TO SPEAK.

23



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AND AGENDA ITEM-A, APPROVAL OF THE APRIL
2 26 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE
3 THE APRIL 26, 2024, MEETING MINUTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TERRY THE SECOND.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. DID I HEAR FIRST FROM
12 COUNCILMEMBER SCOTT AND A SECOND BY -- THANK YOU.
13 COUNCILMEMBER WONG.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. THERE WAS NO ROOM CORRESPONDENCE
16 AND NO ONE IN THE ROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. CHAIR CAMPOS.

17

18 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NOW WILL THE -- THANK YOU.
19 WILL THE CLERK CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE?

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR CAMPOS.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES.



MAY 24, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER BORDEN.

3

4 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** YES.

5

6 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER ELDRED IS ON THEIR WAY. MEMBER

9 ESUF.

10

11 **ILAF ESUF:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER FITZGERALD IS EX-CLUED.

14

15 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

16

17 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER HANKERSON.

20

21 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER KALLINS. MEMBER

24 KALLINS IS EXCUSED. MEMBER KINMAN.

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LIEU. MEMBER LIEU IS
6 ABSENT. MEMBER ORANTES.

7

8 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** ABSTAIN.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN. MEMBER PARKER IS ON THEIR WAY.
11 MEMBER PIERCE. MEMBER PIERCE IS EXCUSED. MEMBER PIMPLE.

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

14

15 **JEFF RHOADS:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG.

20

21 **HOWARD WONG:** YES.

22

23 **ROLAND WONG:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT PASSED.



MAY 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** NEXT WE HAVE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 5.
3 PUBLIC COMMENT/BUSINESS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS
4 ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO ROOM CORRESPONDENCE
7 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM
8 WISHING TO SPEAK AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM
9 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

10

11 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** ONE MINUTE, PLEASE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE, GO AHEAD AND
14 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **ALETA DUPREE:** THANK YOU. WALKING THROUGH THE NEIGHBORHOOD.
17 SHOULD BE IN THE ROOM SOON. SO HOW DO WE REACH OUT THE BEST WE
18 CAN? I CAN ONLY SHARE WITH YOU MY EXPERIENCES. COMMITTEE WORK
19 IS REALLY AT THE HEART OF ADVANCING THE CAUSE OF BEST PUBLIC
20 TRANSPORTATION WE CAN HAVE IN OUR BAY AREA. OUR BELOVED BAY
21 AREA. AND SO I CAN ONLY BRING YOU MY EXPERIENCES. AND I ASK OF
22 YOU TO SHARE OF YOURS. I'VE BEEN TESTING OUT CLIPPER TWO, AND
23 THERE ARE SOME CHALLENGES GOING FORWARD WITH THAT. I RODE BART
24 TODAY. I JUST GOT OFF AN AIRPLANE. I'LL PROBABLY USE MUNI. SO



MAY 24, 2024

1 I ASK THAT YOU REACH OUT TO SENIOR STAFF AND BOARD ABOUT SOME
2 EXPERIENCES, BUILDING A BETTER SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, ALETA. AND THERE ARE NO OTHER
5 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THIS BRINGS US TO OUR
8 NEXT AGENDA ITEM 6-A WHICH IS THE PLAN BAY AREA 2050+DRAFT
9 BLUEPRINT AND KEY FINDINGS. WE WILL BE HEARING THIS ITEM WHICH
10 WILL BE PRESENTED FOR INFORMATION FROM CHIRAG RABARI.

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CAMPOS, AND GOOD MORNING,
13 MEMBERS OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I'M PROJECT MANAGER
14 FOR PLAN BAY AREA 2050+ AND IT'S MY PLEASURE TO REPRESENT THE
15 BROADER PLAN BAY AREA TEAM AND SHARE WITH YOU TODAY THE KEY
16 FINDINGS AND OUTCOMES OF OUR ANALYSIS OF THE PLAN BAY AREA
17 2050+ DRAFT BLUEPRINT. NEXT SLIDE. FOLLOWING OUR LAST PLAN BAY
18 AREA UPDATE IN JANUARY, THE M.T.C. AND ABAG COMMITTEE REVISED
19 GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER STUDY AND WE SPENT THE LAST SEVERAL
20 MONTHS DOING SOME DEEP TECHNICAL WORK, DEVELOPING THE ANALYSIS
21 OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PERFORMANCE AND EQUITY OUTCOMES THAT WE
22 ARE LASER FOCUSED ON IN THIS PRESENTATION TODAY. ANALYTICALLY
23 SPEAKING, THIS IS ONE OF THE MAJOR MILESTONES FOR THE LONG-
24 RANGE PLAN, AND WHAT WE ARE SHARING IS AN EARLY PREVIEW OF OUR
25 DRAFT RESULTS. WE ANTICIPATE BROADER PUBLIC RELEASE OF THESE



MAY 24, 2024

1 OUTCOMES IN EARLY JUNE. ALONG WITH THE TRANSIT 2050+DRAFT
2 NETWORK AND STRATEGY RECOMMENDATIONS, WHICH WILL BE COMING TO
3 THIS BODY EARLY THIS SUMMER, THESE OUTCOMES ARE REALLY WHAT'S
4 GOING TO DRIVE THE NEXT ROUND OF PARTNER AND PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
5 THAT'S GOING TO BE TAKING PLACE IN THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS. WE
6 WILL HAVE PLANNED UPDATES TO THE POLICY AND ADVISORY COUNCIL
7 LATER ON IN THE PRESENTATION. IN TERMS OF TIME, WE'RE REALLY
8 FOCUSED ON THE PROCESS, SOME OF THE PRECISE DATES MAY -- MAY
9 SHIFT TO ALLOW FOR SCHEDULE ADJUSTMENTS. I WOULD ALSO JUST
10 NOTE THAT, YOU KNOW, WE ARE SHARING THIS DRAFT BLUEPRINT
11 OUTCOMES WHICH WILL HELP US MOVE INTO THE SECOND ROUND OF
12 ENGAGEMENT, WHICH WILL HELP US IDENTIFY FINAL BLUEPRINT
13 STRATEGY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR ACTION BY OUR POLICY BOARDS, AND
14 THEN WE WILL COME BACK, AGAIN, WITH THE OUTCOMES OF THE FINAL
15 BLUEPRINT, YOU KNOW, LIKELY IN EARLY 2025, AND THAT IS WHAT IS
16 SUBSEQUENTLY ADVANCED TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE. NEXT YEAR.
17 OKAY. NEXT SLIDE. A QUICK REFRESHER. WE WILL HAVE ALL OF OUR
18 FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING REQUIREMENTS, INCLUDING IT MUST
19 MEET OR EXCEED A GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGET. IT
20 MUST PLAN FOR HOUSING -- SUFFICIENT HOUSING AT ALL INCOME
21 LEVELS, AND ITS TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT MUST BE FISCALLY
22 CONSTRAINED AND RELY ON REASONABLY ANTICIPATED REVENUES. FOR
23 THIS PLAN, WE ARE LEVERAGING THE VISION AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES
24 FROM THE PREVIOUS PLAN, WHICH IS A BAY AREA THAT IS
25 AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE, HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL



MAY 24, 2024

1 BY THE YEAR 2050. AND THE IMPORTANT THING ABOUT THOSE GUIDING
2 PRINCIPLES FOR THE PURPOSES OF THIS PRESENTATION IS THAT THOSE
3 PRINCIPLES GUIDE THE EVALUATION QUESTIONS AND THE QUANTITATIVE
4 METRICS THAT WE LOOK AT, ENGAGING OUR PERFORMANCE IN MEETING
5 CRITICAL REGIONAL GOALS. OUR STARTING POINT FOR THIS PLAN HAS
6 BEEN THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ECONOMY,
7 AND THE ENVIRONMENT, AS WELL AS THE PREVIOUS PLAN'S DIVISION
8 INTO 11 ELEMENTS AND 35 STRATEGIES. THERE HAVE BEEN THREE CORE
9 PRIORITIES THAT WE'VE BEEN FOCUSED ON FOR THIS PLAN UPDATE.
10 UPDATING OUR PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS TO ALIGN WITH THE REGION'S
11 POST-COVID REALITY, LEANING ON IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS TO
12 INFORM STRATEGY REFINEMENTS, AND TRYING TO ENHANCE OUR PUBLIC
13 COMMUNICATIONS AROUND WHAT THE PLAN IS, WHO WE ARE, AND WHAT
14 WE DO. NEXT SLIDE. SO THERE HAVE BEEN QUITE A FEW UPDATES TO
15 DRAFT THE ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE PREPARING TO RELEASE. ALTHOUGH
16 WE HAVE A TIGHT FOCUS ON OUTCOMES IN THIS PRESENTATION, WE DID
17 WANT TO QUICKLY ACKNOWLEDGE ALL THE WORK THAT WENT INTO
18 INFORMING THESE OUTCOMES. AND HOW THEY RELATE TO VARIOUS
19 UPDATES THAT WE HAVE PROVIDED TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
20 OVER THE LAST NINE MONTHS OR SO. SO WE'VE UPDATED BASELINE
21 DATA TO ALIGN WITH POST-COVID TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS.
22 INCORPORATE LOCAL ZONING AND LAND USE UPDATES SUCH AS HOUSING
23 ELEMENT UPDATES AND PIPELINE PROJECTS AS WELL AS EQUITY
24 PRIORITY COMMUNITY UPDATES. AND WE SHARED UPDATES ON TRANSIT
25 IN JANUARY AS WELL AS E.P.C.'S IN APRIL. WE UPDATED OUR



MAY 24, 2024

1 PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS, INCLUDING A REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST OF
2 POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSING. AS WELL AS OUR FINANCIAL NEEDS
3 AND REVENUE FORECASTS. AND ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HYBRID WORK. AND
4 FINALLY, WE UPDATED OUR STRATEGIES TO REFLECT PUBLIC POLICIES
5 AND INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED OVER A 25-YEAR PERIOD
6 AS WELL AS REVISED GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. AND ALL THIS
7 INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE ON PLANBAYAREA.ORG. THESE WILL BE
8 RELEASED NEXT MONTH. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS, YOU
9 KNOW, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT'S GROWTH PATTERN, BREAKING DOWN THE
10 SHARE OF OVERALL REGIONAL GROWTH BY COUNTY. JOB GROWTH IS
11 SHOWN ON THE LEFT WITH THE COUNTY -- WITH COUNTY SHARES OF
12 FUTURE GROWTH REPRESENTED BY THE SIZE OF THE CIRCLE AND THE
13 FIGURE OF THE CIRCLE AND THE SAME DATA IS SHOWN FOR HOUSEHOLD
14 GROWTH ON THE RIGHT. FOCUSING ON HOUSEHOLDS, NEARLY NINE IN 10
15 OF THE REGION'S APPROXIMATELY 900,000 NEW HOUSEHOLDS ARE
16 PROJECTED TO LIVE IN THE PLAN'S GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WHICH ARE
17 PLACES CLOSE TO TRANSIT TARGETED FOR INVESTMENT AND SAFE
18 STREETS, OPEN PLACES AND AMENITIES AND AREAS OF THE REGION
19 WITH THE STRONGEST HOUSING MARKETS INCLUDING SILICON VALLEY,
20 SAN FRANCISCO AND PARTS OF THE EAST BAY ARE EXPECTED TO
21 EXPERIENCE THE STRONGEST FUTURE GROWTH. MODEST INCREASES ARE
22 EXPECTED IN THE NORTH BAY TO MEET ONGOING DEMAND. ALTHOUGH,
23 AGAIN, MOST GROWTH IS EXPECTED TO BE FOCUSED ELSEWHERE IN THE
24 REGION. SHIFTING TO JOBS, IT IS IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT WHEN
25 CONSIDERING THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE 1.3 MILLION NEW JOBS



MAY 24, 2024

1 EXPECTED IN THE REGION BETWEEN NOW AND 2050, THAT OVERALL
2 MEMBER AND THE SHARES ASSOCIATED WITH IT ARE BASED UPON THE
3 PHYSICAL LOCATION OF AN EMPLOYER. IT DOES NOT ACCOUNT FOR THE
4 SHARE OF JOBS AT A LOCATION THAT ARE PERFORMED FULLY OR
5 PARTIALLY REMOTELY. SO WITH THAT SAID, SIMILAR TO HOUSING, THE
6 JOB GROWTH PATTERN IS RELATIVELY CONCENTRATED WITH OVER 2/3 OF
7 THE REGION'S NEW JOBS ANTICIPATED TO BE LOCATED WITHIN THE
8 PLAN'S GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. THE MAP FURTHER SHOWS THAT
9 EMPLOYER-BASED JOB GROWTH IS FAIRLY SIGNIFICANTLY CONCENTRATED
10 IN SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY, TO
11 A LESSER AMOUNT IN ALAMEDA AND MORE MODEST GROWTH IN THE NORTH
12 BAY. SEVERAL FACTORS HAVE EMPLOYER-BASED JOBS IN THE SILICON
13 VALLEY AND PENINSULA. HISTORICALLY HIGH OFFICE VACANCIES IN
14 LOCATIONS THAT ARE ATTRACTED TO HIGH-GROWTH AGENCIES ARE --
15 INDUSTRIES ARE CONTRIBUTING TO LESS SPILLOVER OVER THE REST OF
16 THE REGION AND POST-PANDEMIC CHANGES AND WORKPLACE DESIGN
17 ENABLE MORE NEW JOBS TO FIT INTO EXISTING AVAILABLE OFFICE
18 SPACE. BUT IN TERMS OF THE BROADER CONTEXT, SIMILAR TO TODAY,
19 ROUGHLY ONE IN FOUR JOBS ARE EXPECTED TO BE WORK FROM HOME IN
20 2050, CONTRIBUTING TO HIGHER POPULATIONS AND ACTIVITY LEVELS
21 IN HOUSING RICH COMMUNITIES COMPARED TO THE PRE-COVID PERIOD
22 ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. SO NOW HONING IN ON SOME OF THE
23 KEY METRICS BY THE -- OUR GUIDING PRINCIPLES, WE DO SEE THAT
24 BAY AREA HOUSING COSTS ARE PROJECTED TO DECLINE. THE SHARE OF
25 HOUSEHOLD INCOME SPENT ON HOUSING DECLINED SIGNIFICANTLY



MAY 24, 2024

1 BETWEEN 2023 AND 2050, ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WITH THE FEWEST
2 MEANS TO AFFORD BAY AREA HOMES. BY OVER 10% FOR ALL HOUSEHOLDS
3 AND OVER 40% FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. THIS IS SIMILAR TO THE
4 RESULTS THAT WE SAW IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN AND A DRAMATIC
5 IMPROVEMENT OVER THE FIRST TWO ITERATIONS OF PLAN BAY AREA.
6 AND STRATEGIES LIKE STRENGTHENING RENTER PROTECTIONS,
7 PRESERVING AND BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND PROVIDING
8 MORTGAGE AND RENTAL ASSISTANCE AS WELL AS THE IMPLEMENTATION
9 OF GUARANTEED INCOME ALL MAKE A VERY LARGE DIFFERENCE. THE BAY
10 AREA WILL ALSO PRODUCE AND PRESERVE MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
11 WITH DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES RESULTING IN NEARLY ONE
12 QUARTER OF THE REGIONAL HOUSING STOCK BEING PERMANENTLY
13 AFFORDABLE BY 2050 FROM 130,000 HOUSING UNITS IN 2023 TO
14 NEARLY ONE MILLION HOUSING UNITS IN 2050. AND OBVIOUSLY, THE
15 PLAN DIRECTS HUNDREDS OF BILLIONS OF DOLLARS TOWARDS THE
16 PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING, WHICH HAS A
17 LARGE IMPACT BUT SO DO STRATEGIES SUCH AS THE REUSE OF PUBLIC
18 LAND FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AS WELL AS MINIMUM AFFORDABILITY
19 REQUIREMENTS FOR MAJOR HOUSING PROJECTS. AS WE'VE DISCUSSED IN
20 PREVIOUS UPDATES, ADDITIONAL MEASURES ARE GOING TO BE NEEDED
21 TO STEM THE SIGNIFICANT INCREASES IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING
22 DEVELOPMENT COSTS AND A KEY FOCUS AREA FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
23 WILL BE TO REFINE OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION STRATEGIES
24 TO INTEGRATE COST REDUCTION APPROACHES SO WE CAN MAKE THE BEST
25 OUT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING WITH



MAY 24, 2024

1 STAFF AT THE BAY HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY TO DEVELOP AND
2 QUANTIFY THESE MEASURES FOR FUTURE INTEGRATIONS SO WE WILL
3 REPORT BACK ON THAT IN THE COMING MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE. THE
4 DRAFT BLUEPRINT FINDINGS ALSO REVEAL A MORE CONNECTED BAY AREA
5 IN 2050, BUT THERE IS AN IMPORTANT CAVEAT TO NOTE WHICH IS THE
6 DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID NOT CONTAIN SIGNIFICANT TRANSPORTATION
7 EXPANSION OR ENHANCEMENT INVESTMENTS, WHICH WILL BE IDENTIFIED
8 THROUGH TRANSIT 2050+AS WELL AS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PROCESS SO
9 ALL THE CONNECTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS WERE DRIVEN BY POLICY OR
10 LAND USE SHIFTS LEVERAGING THE REGION'S EXISTING
11 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. WE DO SEE THAT BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL
12 BE ABLE TO ACCESS THEIR DESTINATIONS MORE EASILY BY ASSESSING
13 THE NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS WITHIN A HALF MILE OF FREQUENT
14 TRANSIT. WE SEE AN INCREASE OF APPROXIMATELY 5% IN THE OVERALL
15 NUMBER OF TOTAL HOUSEHOLDS NEAR FREQUENT TRANSIT AND EVEN
16 LARGER INCREASES FOR THE NUMBER OF LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS
17 WITHIN A HALF MILE OF FREQUENT TRANSIT FROM JUST UNDER HALF TO
18 NEARLY 2/3. WE ALSO LOOK AT THE RELIABILITY OF OUR
19 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AS A WHOLE, INCLUDING IN TERMS OF PEAK
20 HOUR MORNING TRAVEL TIMES ON KEY FREEWAY CORRIDORS AS WELL AS
21 CROWDING ON TRANSIT DURING THE MORNING PEAK. IT'S A BIT OF A
22 MORE MIXED PICTURE HERE. YOU KNOW, GIVEN THE SIGNIFICANT
23 POPULATION GROWTH THAT WE ARE ANTICIPATING, THERE ARE SLIGHT
24 INCREASES THAT WE MIGHT SEE ON CERTAIN FREEWAY TRAVEL
25 CORRIDORS BUT, YOU KNOW, THE STRATEGIES AND THE PLAN DO



MAY 24, 2024

1 MITIGATE HOW BAD THINGS COULD BE IN THE ABSENCE OF CERTAIN
2 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES, SUCH AS PRICING.
3 WITH RESPECT TO TRANSIT, YOU KNOW, THERE IS -- WE DO SEE
4 CROWDING INCREASES, PARTICULARLY ON CERTAIN TRANS BAY
5 CORRIDORS, BUT PART OF THAT IS JUST A REFLECTION OF HOW MUCH
6 LOWER OUR BASELINE TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS ARE TODAY. AGAIN, AS
7 WELL AS THE INCREASE IN POPULATION. SO INVESTMENT PRIORITIES
8 IDENTIFIED THROUGH TRANSIT 2050+AND THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
9 PROCESS MAY HELP ALLEVIATE SOME OF THOSE CONDITIONS. KEY AREA
10 FOCUS FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WILL BE TO IDENTIFY COST-
11 EFFECTIVE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS THAT WILL HAVE MOBILITY,
12 ACCESS, RELIABILITY BENEFITS WHILE ALSO ALIGNING WITH OUR MORE
13 LIMITED TRANSPORTATION REVENUES AND HELPING TO REDUCE G.H.G.
14 WE WILL ALSO LOOK AT FURTHER OPTIMIZING THE PRICING STRATEGIES
15 IN THE PLAN TO BETTER DEMAND -- MANAGE DEMAND ON THE ROADWAYS.
16 NEXT SLIDE. IN TERMS OF A MORE DIVERSE AREA, WE SEE THAT
17 HOUSEHOLDS WITH LOWER INCOMES ARE ABLE TO ACCESS A WIDER RANGE
18 OF HOUSING OPTIONS REGIONWIDE WITH THE SHARE OF LOW-INCOME
19 HOUSEHOLDS INCREASING BY ROUGHLY 10% ACROSS HIGH-RESOURCE
20 AREAS, TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, AND COMBINED TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH-
21 RESOURCE AREAS. DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AND GROWTH
22 GEOGRAPHIES ENCOURAGE DIVERSITY IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING
23 LOCATIONS AND HELP CREATE MORE MIXED INCOME COMMUNITIES,
24 HELPING TO COUNTERACT PAST EXCLUSIONARY PRACTICES. IN TERMS OF
25 WHETHER BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE ABLE TO STAY IN PLACE, IT



MAY 24, 2024

1 DOES DEPEND. IT'S A BIT OF A COMPLICATED METRIC TO EVALUATE,
2 BUT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DOES EXPAND RENTER PROTECTIONS AND
3 PRESERVE AT-RISK AFFORDABLE HOUSING. HOWEVER, SOME LOW-INCOME
4 RESIDENTS MAY CHOOSE TO RELOCATE TO NEW HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES,
5 INCLUDING HOMEOWNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES, AND WE DO SEE THE
6 HOMEOWNERSHIP RATE FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS INCREASING BY 11%
7 TO NEARLY HALF OF ALL LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS BY 2050. AND I
8 THINK THE TAKEAWAY HERE IS THAT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES
9 DO DEMONSTRATE SUCCESS IN ACCELERATING UPWARD MOBILITY AND
10 EXPANDING ACCESS OPPORTUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT
11 BLUEPRINT FINDINGS ALSO SHOW US AN OPTIMISTIC FUTURE WHEN IT
12 COMES TO THE OVERALL HEALTH OF THE BAY AREA'S ENVIRONMENT. THE
13 DRAFT BLUEPRINT MAKES SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENTS ACROSS ALL
14 ELEMENTS THAT CONTRIBUTE TO CHANGES IN COMMUTE MODE SHARE. WE
15 SEE A DECREASE IN AUTO TRIPS WHILE ALSO SEEING AN INCREASE IN
16 TRANSIT AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION TRIPS. INVESTMENTS IN
17 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE AS WELL AS MORE DENSE
18 AND WALKABLE NEIGHBORHOODS HELP TO CONTRIBUTE TO THIS SHIFT,
19 BUT THE TRANSIT FIGURE IS IMPORTANT TO FLAG OUR CURRENT 2023
20 BASELINE COMMUTE MODE SHARE OF 6% IS QUITE LOW AND SPEAKS TO
21 THE PERSISTENCE OF REMOTE WORK AND THE GENERAL DYNAMIC WHERE
22 PEOPLE HAVE NOT BEEN RETURNING TO TRANSIT AND WE -- IN THE
23 EXACTED NUMBERS. IN TERMS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS, WE SEE THAT
24 ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT SUCCEED IN
25 PROTECTING COMMUNITIES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE. THE PLAN'S ADAPT



MAY 24, 2024

1 TO SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY INCORPORATES A LARGE PORTFOLIO OF
2 GREEN AND GRAY INVESTMENTS TO ACHIEVE OVER 100,000 ACRES OF
3 MARSH RESTORATION IN THE REGION. WE HAVE MAJOR INVESTMENTS IN
4 PRESERVING HABITAT AND CREATING NEW PARKS, TO INCREASE
5 PRESERVED LANDS BY 30 ACRES PER 1,000 RESIDENTS. WE ALSO HAVE
6 INVESTMENTS IN VULNERABLE ECOSYSTEMS WITH OVER TWO MILLION
7 ACRES PROTECTED. IN TERMS OF FOCUSED AREAS FOR THE FINAL
8 BLUEPRINT, WE WANT TO FURTHER REDUCE THAT AUTO MODE COMMUTE
9 MODE SHARE WITH A PARTICULAR FOCUS OF GETTING PEOPLE BACK ON
10 TRANSIT. WE WILL ALSO BE INTEGRATING -- UPDATED COST
11 ASSUMPTIONS WITH RESPECT TO SEA LEVEL RISE PROJECTS, AND WE'VE
12 ALSO BEEN INVESTIGATING THE INCORPORATION OF ACCESSIBILITY
13 UPGRADES INTO OUR ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES WITH THE SPECIFIC
14 FOCUS ON BUILDING AND FACILITY UPGRADES FOR PARKS AND OPEN
15 SPACE. AGAIN, WE WILL BE RETURNING TO THE POLICY ADVISORY
16 COUNCIL IN THE COMING MONTHS TO DISCUSS THOSE UPDATES FURTHER.
17 NEXT SLIDE. SO SPECIFICALLY WITH RESPECT TO THE PLAN'S
18 STATUTORILY REQUIRED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS
19 TARGET, THE PREVIOUS PLAN MET AND EXCEEDED THE REQUIREMENT TO
20 REDUCE PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BIFF 19 -- BY 19%
21 FROM 2005 LEVELS FOR LIGHT-DUTY CARS AND TRUCKS. REANALYZING
22 THE SAME STRATEGIES UNDER UPDATED PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS HAS A
23 MODERATE GAP OF THREE POINTS. ALTHOUGH THERE ARE HIGHER WORK
24 FROM HOME LEVELS AS WELL AS THE COMMUTE STRATEGY THAT ARE
25 HELPING A LITTLE BIT, THE SIGNIFICANTLY LESS -- LESS TRANSIT



MAY 24, 2024

1 USE AS WELL AS LOWER POPULATION GROWTH ARE HURTING OUR
2 ACHIEVEMENT OF THAT TARGET. THAT LOWER POPULATION GROWTH CAN
3 BE A LITTLE BIT COUNTERINTUITIVE BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO
4 REMEMBER THAT THE G.H.G. CALCULATION'S DONE ON A PER CAPITA
5 BASIS. SO ALL THINGS EQUAL HAVING MORE POPULATION IN A -- YOU
6 KNOW, FOCUSED GROWTH PATTERN IN LOW V.M.T. LOCATIONS DOES HELP
7 US WITH THAT G.H.G. CALCULATION. OUR DRAFT ANALYSIS DOES
8 SUGGEST THAT THE GAP WILL REMAIN THE SAME FOR THE DRAFT PLAN
9 BAY AREA 2050 + BLUEPRINT. ALTHOUGH THERE IS CHURNING
10 HAPPENING BENEATH THAT CHANGE. PUSHING US AWAY FROM THAT
11 TARGET ARE THE TIGHTER TRANSPORTATION FISCAL CONSTRAINT AS
12 WELL AS THE FACT THAT WE DON'T YET HAVE SIGNIFICANT
13 TRANSPORTATION EXPANSION PROJECTS INCORPORATED INTO THE PLAN.
14 BUT WE DID EXPAND THE SCOPE AND INVESTMENT -- ITS INVESTMENTS
15 LEVELS IN OUR CLEAN VEHICLE STRATEGIES WHICH HAVE HELPED US
16 AVOID LOSING FURTHER GROUND. SO IN TERMS OF THE FOCUS FOR THE
17 FINAL BLUEPRINT, WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW BEST TO CLOSE THAT
18 G.H.G. GAP THROUGH TARGETED INVESTMENTS IN EQUITABLE
19 STRATEGIES. BUT I DO WANT TO FLAG THAT THE CALIFORNIA AIR
20 RESOURCES BOARD DOES HAVE FINAL APPROVAL OVER THE
21 METHODOLOGIES AND ASSUMPTIONS THAT WE USE TO QUANTIFY OUR
22 G.H.G. IMPACTS AND THEY COULD REJECT OUR APPROACH, WHICH WOULD
23 -- WHICH COULD REQUIRE US TO HAVE TO CHANGE COURSE. NEXT
24 SLIDE. IN TERMS OF HOW TO CLOSE THAT GAP, THIS IS AN
25 INTEGRATED LONG-RANGE PLAN SINCE WE ADOPTED S.B. 375.



MAY 24, 2024

1 [INAUDIBLE] BUT THE FACT THIS IS NOW THE FOURTH TIME GOING
2 THROUGH THE PROCESS MAKES -- DOES MAKE THINGS A LITTLE BIT
3 HARDER. A LOT OF THE LOW-HANGING FRUIT FROM POLICY PERSPECTIVE
4 IS GONE. AND SQUEEZING MORE G.H.G. OUT OF STRATEGIES THAT WE
5 HAVE, YOU KNOW, USED IN PLAN AFTER PLAN ISN'T ALWAYS FEASIBLE.
6 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE LESS MONEY AND THERE ARE ALWAYS TRADEOFFS
7 AND DOWNSIDES INTO LEANING ANY SINGLE APPROACH. SO IN TERMS OF
8 THE OPTIONS TO CLOSE THE GAP, WE HAVE TO CONSIDER HOW MUCH
9 ADDITIONAL G.H.G. WE CAN FEASIBLY SQUEEZE OUT OF ANY SINGLE
10 POLICY LEVER, HOW MUCH IT WILL COST, HOW MUCH PUBLIC AND
11 POLITICAL SUPPORT THE APPROACH HAS AS WELL AS CONCERNS ABOUT
12 EQUITY. SO IN TERMS OF THE OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE ON THE TABLE,
13 THE THINGS WE ARE CONSIDERING FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ARE, YOU
14 KNOW, LOOKING AT OUR HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS AND POTENTIALLY DE-
15 EMPHASIZING INVESTMENTS THAT INCREASE ROADWAY CAPACITY AND
16 LEAD TO HIGHER LEVELS OF V.M.T. AND G.H.G. AGAIN, TAKING A
17 LOOK AT OUR PRICING STRATEGIES WITH RESPECT TO TOLLING AND
18 FEES AND PARKING RATES. PURSUING THE TYPES OF TRANSIT SERVICE
19 AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE ENHANCEMENTS THAT ARE GOING TO GET
20 PEOPLE BACK ONTO TRANSIT, BECAUSE AS WE DISCUSSED ON THE
21 PREVIOUS SLIDE, THE FACT THERE ARE -- PEOPLE NOT TAKING
22 TRANSIT IS REALLY HURTING US. AND THEN, THERE ARE ALSO TRANSIT
23 EXPANSION INVESTMENTS, WHICH CAN BE, YOU KNOW, SMALLER SCALE
24 SUCH AS B.R.T. INVESTMENTS AS WELL AS MUCH LARGER MEGA-
25 PROJECTS. AGAIN, EACH OF THOSE HAVE DIFFERENT CONSIDERATIONS



MAY 24, 2024

1 WITH RESPECT TO HOW MUCH G.H.G., THEY CAN DRIVE G.H.G.
2 REDUCTION, THEY CAN DRIVE HOW MUCH THEY CAN COST AND WHETHER
3 THERE ARE EQUITY CONCERNS ON THEM. NEXT SLIDE. SO COMING BACK
4 TO OUR GUIDING PRINCIPLES, IN TERMS OF WHETHER THE BAY AREA
5 ECONOMY WILL THRIVE. YES, WE DO SEE THAT THE REGION -- GROSS
6 REGIONAL PROJECT -- GROSS REGIONAL PRODUCT IS PROJECTED TO
7 GROW BY 66% OVER THE NEXT THREE DECADES FROM 127,000 DOLLARS
8 ON A PER CAPITA BASIS TO OVER \$00,000 -- \$200,000. ECONOMIC
9 STRATEGIES SUCH AS GUARANTEED BASIC INCOME AS WELL AS SUPPORT
10 FOR FIRST-TIME HOMEOWNERSHIP DO ENSURE THAT THE BENEFITS OF
11 THAT GROWTH ARE FELT MORE BROADLY. WE ALSO ANTICIPATE THAT THE
12 REGION'S DOWNTOWNS WILL RECOVER FROM THE PANDEMIC WITH CENTRAL
13 AREAS OF SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, AND OAKLAND SEEING A FULL
14 RECOVERY SPURRED BY A MORE EFFICIENT USE OF OFFICE SPACE AS
15 WELL AS A MORE BALANCED MIX OF COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL LAND
16 USES. NEXT SLIDE. SO IN TERMS OF WHAT'S COMING NEXT, I DO WANT
17 TO QUICKLY ACKNOWLEDGE SOME, YOU KNOW, MINOR SCHEDULE
18 ADJUSTMENTS. THIS MAY HAPPEN IN THE LATE SUMMER, EARLY FALL
19 PERIOD INSTEAD OF STARTING IN JULY WHICH WE WERE ORIGINALLY
20 ANTICIPATING. BUT THE GOALS AND TOUCH POINTS ARE EXPECTED TO
21 REMAIN THE SAME. YOU KNOW, WE WANT TO SHARE THE OUTCOMES THAT
22 WE SHARED WITH YOU TODAY AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK
23 IN A WILL BE COMING IN THE COMING MONTHS. AND WE WANT TO
24 IDENTIFY EARLY PRIORITIES FOR IMPLEMENTATION. IN TERMS OF THE
25 TOUCH POINTS THAT WE'VE EYE DEPARTMENT FIND, WE ARE HOPING --



MAY 24, 2024

1 IDENTIFIED, WE'RE HOPING TO HOLD POP-UP TABLING EVENTS ACROSS
2 THE NINE COUNTIES. IDEALLY TWO EVENTS PER COUNTY, EVENTS THAT
3 ARE FREE AND OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. WE'RE PROPOSING AN ONLINE
4 ACTIVITY TO ALLOW TIME-FLEXIBLE PARTICIPATION. WE WILL BE
5 PERSUING PARTNERSHIPS WITH C.B.O.'S THAT WORK WITH E.P.C.-
6 SERVING ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS TRIBAL AND NATIVE AMERICAN
7 COMMUNITIES. WE WILL HAVE DEDICATED ENGAGEMENT OPPORTUNITIES
8 FOR OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING WORKSHOPS,
9 WEBINARS, AND OFFICE HOURS. AND THERE ALSO BE A FORMAL PUBLIC
10 COMMENT PERIOD. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, THERE MAY BE, YOU KNOW,
11 A ONE TO TWO-MONTH SHIFT IN TERMS OF SOME OF THESE -- SOME OF
12 THESE DATES, BUT, YOU KNOW, ESSENTIALLY IN TERMS OF THE
13 PROCESS, WE WILL BE RELEASING THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PERFORMANCE
14 AND EQUITY OUTCOMES NEXT MONTH. WE WILL BE COMING BACK TO YOU
15 ALL WITH THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK AND STRATEGIES, WHICH
16 WILL THEN LEAD INTO US KICKING OFF THE SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC
17 AND PARTNER ENGAGEMENT, WHICH WILL TAKE PLACE OVER ROUGHLY
18 TWO-MONTH PERIOD. WE WILL PRESENT OUR FINAL BLUEPRINT
19 RECOMMENDATIONS TO GET SOME EARLY FEEDBACK ON, YOU KNOW, THE
20 DIRECTIONS THAT IS GOING. AND EVENTUALLY, WE'LL GET COMMISSION
21 AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVAL FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
22 STRATEGIES, GEOGRAPHIES, WHICH WILL ENCOMPASS THE
23 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST AND TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. AND
24 THEN, WE WILL COME BACK TO KICK OFF THE PROCESS. AGAIN,
25 ANTICIPATING COMING BACK TO THIS BODY SEVERAL TIMES TO DISCUSS



MAY 24, 2024

1 OF THESE ISSUES. NEXT SLIDE. SO THAT CONCLUDES THE
2 PRESENTATION, AND I THINK, YOU KNOW, THERE WERE A COUPLE
3 DISCUSSION QUESTIONS THAT WE WERE HOPING TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK
4 ON, INCLUDING, YOU KNOW, HOW YOU ALL FEEL ABOUT SOME OF THE
5 POLICY OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE PROPOSED IN TERMS OF HELPING TO
6 CLOSE THE PLAN'S G.H.G. GAP, INCLUDING SOME OF THE TRADEOFFS
7 BETWEEN THOSE DIFFERENT APPROACHES. AND WE WERE ALSO CURIOUS
8 SOME OF YOUR THOUGHTS AND IDEAS WITH RESPECT TO GOALS AND
9 TOUCHPOINTS FOR THE ENGAGEMENT THAT WILL BE COMING, YOU KNOW,
10 LATER THIS SUMMER AND IN THE FALL. AND WITH THAT, THANK YOU
11 VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME THIS MORNING AND HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
12 QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. LET'S START OFF ON MY LEFT-
15 HAND SIDE AND WE'LL JUST WORK OUR WAY AROUND THE ROOM. SO IF
16 YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS TO -- AND TO ANSWER THE
17 SPECIFIC DISCUSSION QUESTIONS THAT WE HAVE HERE. LET'S START
18 OFF WITH COUNCILMEMBER PIMPLE.

19

20 **VINAY PIMPLE:** CAN I COME BACK AFTERWARDS?

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES. COUNCILMEMBER RHOADS.

23

24 **JEFF RHOADS:** I FIND IT A BIT HARD TO SUPPORT THE NOTION THAT
25 HOUSING COSTS WILL DECLINE IN THE REGION. BASED, REALLY, ON MY



MAY 24, 2024

1 OWN EXPERIENCE DEALING WITH THE COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH
2 DEVELOPMENT AND OTHER FACTORS SUCH AS ADDITIONAL ENERGY
3 REGULATIONS, OTHER THINGS THAT RESULT IN INCREASING THE COST
4 OF HOUSING PRODUCTION. I'M SKEPTICAL ABOUT THE STRATEGIES AND
5 THEIR IMPACT ON MISSING MIDDLE HOUSING. I THINK WE PROBABLY
6 SHOULD LOOK MORE REALISTICALLY AT MARKET-DRIVEN APPROACHES.
7 FOR EXAMPLE, I UNDERSTAND THAT SACRAMENTO HAS BEEN VERY
8 EFFECTIVE AT PRODUCING ADDITIONAL HOUSING BY NOT PLACING
9 AFFORDABILITY LIMITATIONS ON MARKET RATE HOUSING WITH THE NET
10 RESULT BEING MORE HOUSING AVAILABLE AND DOWNWARD PRESSURE ON
11 EXISTING HOUSING STOCK. I'M REALLY QUITE SKEPTICAL. I THINK
12 THESE THINGS ARE REACH AT BEST AND HIGHLY UNLIKELY BASED UPON
13 AN UNDERSTANDING OF MARKET REALITIES AND MOTIVATION OF
14 LANDOWNERS. I THINK THAT THIS DOESN'T SEEM REALISTIC TO ME.
15 WITH THAT I GUESS I'LL PASS AND MOVE ON.

16

17 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I'LL FOLLOW UP WITH THE SAME THING. I FIND MYSELF
20 WRITING HOW THROUGHOUT THE PRESENTATION AND THE NOTES. AND I
21 DO SEE THAT YOU WILL BE ANSWERING THOSE QUESTIONS LATER IN THE
22 PROJECT. SO I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT.

23

24 **GERRY GLASER:** MY NAME PLATE SAYS I REPRESENT SENIORS. I DON'T
25 FEEL LIKE A SENIOR BUT I REPRESENT SENIORS. AND THE COMMENT



MAY 24, 2024

1 I'LL MAKE RIGHT NOW WILL PROVE THAT I AM SENIOR. WHEN I MOVED
2 TO THE BAY AREA, WE LIVED IN SARATOGA, AND I WOULD OFTEN DRIVE
3 UP TO SUNNYVALE OR CUPERTINO. AND DRIVE THROUGH THE ORCHARDS
4 AND THE FARMS. THEY ARE NOT THERE ANYMORE. NONE OF THAT IS
5 THERE ANYMORE. THE POINT THAT I WANT TO MAKE WITH THAT -- AND
6 A SECOND FOLLOW-UP, WHICH I WAS ALSO ON A COMMITTEE THAT
7 LOOKED AT DEVELOPING OF SOMETHING I JUST FOUND OUT IS CALLED
8 THE SOUTH BAY HIGHWAY, HIGHWAY 237. WHEN IT WAS KIND OF A
9 CLUNKY ROAD THAT NOBODY TOOK AND THE ROADWAY GOT DEVELOPED. I
10 DON'T LIKE ROADWAYS AND I DON'T LIKE CARS. I'M AN E.V. DRIVER.
11 HAVE BEEN SINCE 1998. BUT I STILL DON'T LIKE THE IDEA WE'RE
12 RELYING ON THAT. BUT ONCE THE TRANSIT AND THE TRANSPORTATION
13 WAS THERE, THAT ENTIRE CORRIDOR GOT DEVELOPED. SO IT'S NOT A
14 QUESTION OF THE DEVELOPMENT IS OCCURRING HERE. WE CAN MAKE THE
15 DEVELOPMENT OCCUR IN VARIOUS PLACES. AND ONE OF THE THINGS I
16 WAS DISAPPOINTED ABOUT COMING FROM THE NORTH BAY NOW, I USED
17 TO BE A SOUTH BAY AREA, IN THE NORTH BAY, NOT LOOKING FOR THE
18 OPPORTUNITY UP THERE. IN FACT, THERE'S EXPLICIT DE-EMPHASIS IN
19 THE NORTH BAY. IT'S A LAND OPPORTUNITY. IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY
20 FOR HOUSING AND AN OPPORTUNITY FOR JOBS. IT'S CLOSE TO THE BAY
21 AREA. SO WE WILL BUILD THE AREA UP EVEN MORE. IT SEEMED TO ME
22 IN MUCH OF THE ANALYSIS IN 2050 IS RESPONDING TO THE DIRECTION
23 THAT WE'RE GOING AS A RESULT OF INERTIA AS OPPOSED TO THE
24 DIRECTION WE WANT TO PUT IN PLACE TO MAKE OUR REGION MORE
25 VITAL AND CONTINUE TO BE VITAL. THAT MEANS WE NEED TO MAKE



MAY 24, 2024

1 CHANGES. WE ARE GOING TO TALK ABOUT 1031 LATER ON. WE NEED TO
2 MAKE CHANGES. WE CAN'T JUST RESPOND TO THE THINGS THAT ARE
3 HAPPENING. WE NEED TO LOOK AND SAY, IF I WAS A DEVELOPER --
4 AND I MEAN A DEVELOPER -- I SPENT MY LIFE AS AN ASSISTANT
5 ANALYSIS, ASSISTANT DEVELOPER. I'M GOING TO DEVELOP A SYSTEM
6 THAT NEVER EXISTED BEFORE. WHAT DO I WANT IT TO DO? HOW DO I
7 WANT IT TO LOOK? HOW CAN I MAKE THAT HAPPEN? AND I DON'T SEE
8 THAT HERE. I SEE US LOOKING AT WHAT THE INERTIA IS SO FAR. AND
9 EMPHASIZING THAT INERTIA. IN THE CASE OF THE CARS, I AM HOPING
10 WE CAN DO BETTER ON THAT. AND MY LAST POINT SO I CAN KEEP IT
11 SHORT, AS I CONTINUE TO BE DUBIOUS THAT OUR PLAN THAT TOLLING
12 THE HIGHWAYS WILL ACHIEVE WHAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE, I HAVE NO
13 PROBLEM TOLLING THE HIGHWAYS. I HAVE NOT SEEN ANY PROOF
14 ANYPLACE THAT THIS WILL BE A SUSTAINABLE -- SUSTAINABLE IN THE
15 SENSE IT WILL MAKE THE CHANGE WE WANT AND THE STEP THAT WE
16 WANT TO A CHANGE THAT WILL BE PERMANENT. WE NEED SOMETHING
17 ELSE. I THINK EMPHASIZING ON THE TOLLING IS GOING TO TAKE US
18 IN THE WRONG PLACE. A RECENT BOOK I READ ON POLICY TALKS ABOUT
19 THIS AND SAYS IF YOU DON'T TAKE YOUR POINT, NOT THE FROG
20 THING. YOU CAN'T JUST KEEP RAISING THE TEMPERATURE ON THE
21 WATER. THEY WOULD THINK THE WATER IS BOILING IMMEDIATELY. IN
22 FACT, NOW CHANGE THE WAY PEOPLE THINK ABOUT THINGS. TODAY WAS
23 A GREAT EXAMPLE. BART WAS CROWDED. WHY? THE BRIDGE WAS SHUT
24 DOWN. OKAY. IT FORCED A CHANGE IN HOW WE THINK. SO BART WAS
25 CROWDED. THERE WAS STANDING ROOM ON BART TODAY. THOSE ARE



MAY 24, 2024

1 THINGS I'D LOOK FOR. SO THE UPDATE ON 2050, I DON'T THINK IT
2 GOES FAR ENOUGH IN LOOKING AT THE CHANGE THAT WE WANT TO MAKE
3 THAT MAYBE ISN'T THE ONE IS OBVIOUS. THANKS.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TERRY AND THEN GABE.

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** WELL, FIRST, I'D LIKE TO SHARE SOME OF THE
8 SKEPTICISM THAT HAS BEEN PROVIDED THUS FAR, BUT ALSO, I'D LIKE
9 TO THANK THE STAFF FOR WHAT I THINK IS A VERY PROGRESSIVE
10 APPROACH TO TRYING TO GET FROM WHERE WE ARE TO WHERE WE WANT
11 TO BE. MY CONCERN IS PRIMARILY IN THE AREA OF GOVERNMENTAL
12 PROCESS IN THE LOCAL COMMUNITIES THAT THIS DEVELOPMENT NEEDS
13 TO TAKE PLACE IN. NOW, IT'S BEEN A -- IT'S BEEN, OH, GOSH, 30,
14 40 YEARS SINCE I LIVED IN ONE OF THESE DEVELOPMENT AREAS OR
15 COUNTIES, IF YOU WILL, LIKE SANTA CLARA, ALAMEDA. BUT I KNOW
16 IN COUNTY GOVERNMENT IN THE NORTH BAY, AT LEAST IN THE COUNTY
17 OF NAPA, IS A VERY, VERY SLOW PROCESS. IT TAKES A LOT TO GET A
18 PROJECT THROUGH AND APPROVED. AND THEN, IT IS THE ISSUE OF
19 BUILDING MATERIALS, TIME TO BUILD, ETC. IN MY EXPERIENCE, IT
20 HAS ALWAYS TAKEN LONGER FOR THE PROCESS TO TAKE PLACE AND
21 LONGER FOR THE BUILDING TO TAKE PLACE. AND SO I -- I APPLAUD
22 THE GOALS AND I APPLAUD THE DIRECTION THAT WE'RE GOING IN. I
23 JUST DON'T SEE THE INFRASTRUCTURE BEING ABLE TO GET IT DONE
24 ANYWHERE NEAR THE TIME FRAME THAT WE'RE TRYING TO. AND I SAW
25 SOME POSITIVE THINGS IN TERMS OF TRYING TO EXPEDITE BY



MAY 24, 2024

1 WITHHOLDING OR ELIMINATING SOME OF THE RESTRICTIONS THAT LOCAL
2 GOVERNMENTS IMPOSE ON ANY KIND OF FUTURE DEVELOPMENT. AND I
3 AGREE WITH THE PREVIOUS COUNCILMEMBERS IN THERE'S PLENTY OF
4 MARKET RATE HOUSING AVAILABLE AND IT'S MUCH EASIER TO GET DONE
5 AND TO GET APPROVED. BUT WHERE WE NEED AND WHAT WE ARE HURTING
6 AT IS LOW-INCOME HOUSING, ENTRY-LEVEL HOUSING, AND THAT IS NOT
7 AS PROFITABLE TO DEVELOPERS AS MARKET-RATE HOUSING, AND SO
8 THEY DON'T TO DO THAT. THE RETURN IS NOT HIGH ENOUGH. THE
9 R.O.I. DOESN'T JUSTIFY IT IN THEIR MINDS. AND SO I THINK WE
10 NEED MORE PROFESSIONALS WHO ARE ATTUNED AND ARE ABLE TO WORK
11 THROUGH THE SYSTEM IN A MORE EFFICIENT AND TIMELY MANNER TO
12 GET THE MARKET RATE HOUSING IN A WE NEED. AND WE NEED IT
13 THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTIES. AND I SEE THAT THE PRIMARY --
14 THE GREATEST DEVELOPMENT IS GOING TO TAKE PLACE IN SANTA CLARA
15 AND ALAMEDA. OKAY. THAT'S FINE. I AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUE FROM
16 MARIN THAT THERE IS A LOT MORE AVAILABLE LAND THERE, AND
17 THERE'S SOMEWHAT -- US IN NAPA ARE VERY HANDICAPPED AS WELL
18 BECAUSE OF A NUMBER OF THE LAND USE DECISIONS THAT PROTECT THE
19 AGRICULTURE AND I BELIEVE IN THAT BECAUSE WE NEED IT. BUT
20 BOTTOM LINE IS, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE TALK ABOUT IN THE
21 NORTH BAY, AT LEAST IN NAPA, IS NOT FOLLOWING THE PATH OF
22 SANTA CLARA AND THE ELIMINATION OF THE FARMS AND THE RURAL
23 LANDSCAPE THAT USED TO EXIST THERE. SO I THINK YOU'RE
24 PROPOSING TO GO IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. I'D LIKE TO SEE MORE -
25 - MORE MEANINGFUL METHODS OF GETTING THERE IN THE TIME FRAME



MAY 24, 2024

1 IN A WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. I HAVE NO DOUBT THAT WE CAN GET
2 THERE, BUT I THINK IT'S GOING TO TAKE A HECK OF A LOT LONGER
3 THAN WE'RE ORIGINALLY PROJECTING HERE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. GABE AND THEN ADINA.

6

7 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** THANK YOU AND THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION
8 AND ALSO, THANK YOU TO THE TWO DISCUSSION COMMENTS THAT YOU
9 THREW UP THERE. IT'S GOOD TO ACTUALLY KNOW WHAT STAFF IS
10 SEEKING FROM THE COUNCIL. SO I'LL TRY AND COMMENT ON THOSE
11 TWO. SO IN TERMS OF NUMBER ONE AND FILLING IN THE G.H.G. GAP
12 AND THERE WAS A SLIDE WITH ALL THE OPTIONS THERE IN TERMS OF
13 HIGH-IMPACT OR EQUITY CONCERNS AND COST AND WHATNOT, IT SEEMS
14 THAT TOLLING OPTIONS COULD BE HIGH-IMPACT, BUT THE EQUITY
15 CONCERNS ARE CONCERNING, TO PUT IT FLAT. BUT IF TOLLING IS
16 MORE FEASIBLE THAN WE'VE ALREADY HAD DISCUSSIONS HERE AT THIS
17 COUNCIL AS TO WHICH TOLLING OPTIONS MIGHT BE PREFERABLE, FROM
18 MYSELF I HEARD THAT EXPRESS LANE CONVERSIONS COULD BE MOST
19 IMPACTFUL AND HIT THE MOST BOXES, POSSIBLY. BUT IT -- IN TERMS
20 OF GAP CLOSURES ON G.H.G.'S, IT SEEMS LIKE TRANSIT SERVICE
21 ENHANCEMENTS ARE THE MOST DESIRABLE AT ALL, LEAST COSTLY ON
22 PUBLIC DOLLARS COMPARED TO TRANSIT EXPANSION. BUT THE QUESTION
23 THERE IS, WHERE DO THE PUBLIC DOLLARS COME FROM? HOW MUCH ARE
24 WE LOOKING FOR, AND HOW FEASIBLE IS IT TO GET THOSE DOLLARS?
25 SO, YES, IN A PERFECT WORLD IT SOUNDS LIKE TRANSIT SERVICE



MAY 24, 2024

1 ENHANCEMENTS, BUT I DON'T KNOW HOW FEASIBLE THAT IS. ON NUMBER
2 TWO, THOUGHTS ON -- FROM COUNCILMEMBERS REGARDING TOUCHPOINTS
3 FOR THIS SUMMER'S ENGAGEMENT. I WAS CURIOUS IF Y'ALL ARE
4 INCORPORATING SOME OF THE FEEDBACK THIS COUNCIL HAS PROVIDED
5 IN THE PAST IN TERMS OF TYPES OF EVENTS AND PLACES TO HIT. SO
6 FLEA MARKETS, GAS STATIONS, FARMER MARKETS, FREE EVENTS
7 OPPOSED TO EVENTS THAT YOU HAVE TO PAY IN, EVENTS ON WEEKLY OR
8 NIGHTLY BASIS SO HOPEFULLY STAFF HAVE INCORPORATED THOSE --
9 THAT FEEDBACK FROM COUNCIL INTO HOW THEY'RE GOING TO ATTEND,
10 WHAT EVENTS THEY'RE GOING TO ATTEND THIS SUMMER. AND THEN, I
11 THINK, YOU KNOW, I'LL LEAVE IT TO STAFF ON THIS TO BE THE
12 EXPERTS HERE, BUT MY HOPE IS THAT WHEN WE'RE PRESENTING AT
13 THESE EVENTS DURING THE SUMMER THAT WE'RE REALLY JUST TRYING
14 TO GET THE CORE OF WHAT FEEDBACK WILL ACTUALLY BE USED FROM
15 THE FOLKS WHO ARE ATTENDING AND REALLY GETTING DOWN TO WHAT
16 THE CONTEXT IS OF THAT FEEDBACK WITHOUT GETTING TOO COMPLEX
17 AND TO P.B.A., P.B.A.-PLUS, BLUEPRINTS, IT'S PRETTY COMPLEX
18 FOR ANYONE TO UNDERSTAND. HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE SOME STRATEGIES
19 AS TO HOW TO REALLY ENGAGE FOLKS AND MAKE SURE THEIR VOICES
20 ARE HEARD. GIVING US EXAMPLES WHEN WE HEARD THIS FEEDBACK,
21 HERE'S HOW IT'S BEEN INCORPORATED IN THE PAST. SO THAT'S HOW I
22 WOULD ANSWER THOSE TWO. THANKS.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WANT TO PICK UP
25 WHAT GABRIEL WAS TALKING ABOUT CONNECTING THE OUTREACH AND THE



MAY 24, 2024

1 POLICIES. LET ME ASK A REALLY NARROW PROCESS QUESTION AND
2 WE'LL ASK TO -- IF YOU CAN BRING UP THE SLIDE 7 AND 8 WITH THE
3 TRANSPORTATION METRICS THAT I WILL THEN ASK A QUESTION ABOUT.
4 IN TERMS OF THE OUTREACH BEING IN THE LATE SUMMER, INTO EARLY
5 FALL, DOES THAT INCLUDE BOTH THE OVERALL PLAN BAY AREA AND THE
6 TRANSIT 2050+?

7

8 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YES. THERE WILL BE BOTH OF THOSE EFFORTS.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO WITH REGARD TO THE ABILITY TO SCALE THE
11 OUTREACH, I AM WONDERING IF -- AND THIS MAY NOT BE ANSWERABLE,
12 BUT I'M WONDERING WHETHER THE EXTENDED TIMELINE ON THE
13 OUTREACH MIGHT ALSO POSITIVELY DOVETAIL WITH THE EXTENDED
14 TIMELINE ON -- THERE'S THE CARE GRANT FUNDING SOURCE, WHICH IS
15 ABLE TO ADDRESS REGIONAL ISSUES AS WELL AS THE HYPERLOCAL
16 COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS THAT THEY DID PREVIOUSLY.
17 SO IF THAT IS AVAILABLE IN TIME TO HIT SOME OF THIS PROCESS
18 THAT COULD POSSIBLY HELP EXPAND THE SCOPE OF THE OUTREACH BY
19 FUNDING ORGANIZATIONS THAT WANT TO HELP WITH SOME OF THE
20 OUTREACH. AND LET'S SEE. ON THE TRANSPORTATION METRICS, THE --
21 AND I THINK IF I UNDERSTOOD CORRECTLY THAT THE HOUSEHOLDS
22 WITHIN HALF A MILE OF FREQUENT TRANSIT, THAT DOES NOT INCLUDE
23 THE OUTCOMES OF TRANSIT 2050+. AND IF YOU KIND OF FLIP TO THE
24 NEXT ONE WHERE THE SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS WITH LOW INCOME IN
25 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND OVERALL ALSO DOESN'T INCLUDE THE 2050+.



MAY 24, 2024

1 SO I AM HOPING THAT THAT LENS WILL BE AVAILABLE IN WHAT IS
2 BEING PROVIDED FOR PEOPLE TO GIVE FEEDBACK ON, IN TERMS OF,
3 ARE THERE STRATEGIES THAT CAN TURN UP THAT DIAL AND PUT MORE
4 PEOPLE, INCLUDING MORE, YOU KNOW, LOW-INCOME PEOPLE WITHIN
5 ACCESS TO TRANSIT, WHICH ALSO HELPS TO REDUCE THE HOUSEHOLD
6 COST OF LIVING AND INCREASES THE EFFECTIVENESS OF OUR
7 AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRATEGIES AND NOT ONLY -- AND TO PROVIDE
8 THAT IN A WAY THAT US TECHNICAL WONKS CAN UNDERSTAND AND ALSO
9 SOMEHOW WITH THE GRAPHICS REALLY SHOW IN A WAY THAT AN
10 ORDINARY PERSON CAN UNDERSTAND. HERE'S HOW -- IF WE MADE THIS
11 DECISION VERSUS THAT DECISION, HERE'S HOW THIS WOULD HELP MY
12 COMMUNITY HAVE MORE ACCESS TO FREQUENT TRANSIT AND HAVE MORE
13 ACCESS AMONGST, YOU KNOW, LOWER-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS TO THOSE
14 SUSTAINABLE AND COST-EFFECTIVE TRANSPORTATION. LIKE, THAT
15 WOULD MAKE THE OUTREACH TO BE MORE HELPFUL AND MORE EFFECTIVE.
16 AND, YOU KNOW, THESE ARE ALSO THE POINTS I'M MAKING ON A
17 POLICY PERSPECTIVE WE'RE LOOKING FOR OPPORTUNITIES TO TURN
18 THOSE DIALS AND INCREASING THE PEOPLE WITH THE ACCESS TO
19 TRANSIT AND SUSTAINABLE AND AFFORDABLE TRANSPORTATION WOULD BE
20 THE POLICY DIRECTIONS THAT WILL BE HELPFUL TO GO THROUGH THAT
21 PROCESS. AND THEN I GUESS MY TWO QUESTIONS ABOUT GOING INTO
22 THE HOW IS -- IT WAS SAID REALLY QUICKLY AND IF YOU CAN KIND
23 OF SAY IT AGAIN, LIKE, WHAT GOES INTO THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT
24 HOUSING COSTS MIGHT DECLINE? AND THEN, SECONDLY -- AND THIS
25 MAY BE A MORE FINE-GRAIN QUESTION THAN A ANSWERABLE. -- THAN



MAY 24, 2024

1 ANSWERABLE. I THINK THE DOWNTOWN WILL RECOVER BASED ON LONGER
2 TERM CHANGING IN LAND USE, LIKE, I THINK IS QUITE PLAUSIBLE
3 AND, DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING FINER GRAINED ABOUT THE TIMING OF
4 THAT, WHICH ALSO HAS INTERESTING INTERACTIONS ON THE POLICY
5 CHOICES IN S.B. 1031?

6

7 **CHIRAG RABARI:** TO YOUR FIRST QUESTION ON THE HOUSING COST, I
8 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO CLARIFY, THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE ARE
9 LOOKING INTO FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. THERE IS CURRENTLY NO
10 ASSUMPTION THAT, LIKE, AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT COSTS
11 ARE GOING TO SIGNIFICANTLY DECLINE. I MEAN, I THINK, YOU KNOW,
12 OUR PLAN HAS SOMETHING LIKE A \$1 MILLION PER UNIT ESTIMATE
13 CURRENTLY, BUT WHAT WE ARE EVALUATING IN CONCERT WITH OUR
14 STAFF FROM THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, WHICH WHAT
15 WITH A -- WHAT ARE SOME IMPLEMENTABLE, FEASIBLE SOLUTIONS THAT
16 CAN HELP DRIVE THOSE COSTS DOWN AND DELIVER MORE UNITS ON A
17 COST-EFFECTIVE BASIS? AND THEN, YOU ARE -- THE SECOND
18 QUESTION, APOLOGIES, ADINA.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING FINER GRAIN THAN DOWNTOWN
21 RECOVER BEFORE 2050? NO IS A REASONABLE ANSWER.

22

23 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I THINK IN TERMS OF THE TIMING -- YEAH.

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DAVE VAUTIN, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS.
2 WE DEVELOP OUR FORECAST OVER THE 25-YEAR HORIZON SO WE CAN'T
3 SPEAK TO QUANTIFIABLE DATA POINT AT THIS MOMENT. I WILL SAY WE
4 ANTICIPATE THAT WE HAVE A DECADE OR SO FOR THE REAL ESTATE
5 MARKET TO RECALIBRATE. SO IT MAY BE A NUMBER OF YEARS FOR
6 OFFICE SPACES IN SAN FRANCISCO OR SILICON VALLEY ARE, YOU
7 KNOW, SHIFT AND ALSO THE VACANCY RATES ADJUST. WHAT THIS
8 ANALYSIS SHOWS, WE DO BELIEVE THAT IT'S GOING TO BE MORE COST-
9 EFFECTIVE FOR FOLKS TO SHRINK THEIR FOOTPRINT BUT HAVE THE
10 SAME NUMBER -- SIMILAR NUMBER OF WORKERS IN THE SPACE AND
11 ULTIMATELY KIND OF OPTIMIZE EXISTING OFFICE SPACE RATHER THAN
12 BUILDING NEW OFFICE SPACE. SO WHILE OUR ANALYSIS DOES INDICATE
13 THERE IS A POTENTIAL FOR SOME NEW OFFICE CONSTRUCTION,
14 PARTICULARLY IN THE LATER DECADES OF THE PLAN, WHAT WE MAY SEE
15 IN THE -- OVER THE NEXT DECADE OR SO IS REALLY A SLOW BUT
16 HOPEFULLY MEANINGFUL SHIFT OF OPTIMIZING EXISTING OFFICE USES.
17 BUT IT MAY BE -- IT MAY BE A WHILE.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANKS. IT DOES ADDRESS THE QUESTION THAT I
20 WAS ASKING. SO THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL GO TO HOWARD AND
23 THEN DWAYNE.

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU. THE BAY AREA I THINK IS KIND OF
2 DIFFERENT FROM MUCH OF THE WORLD. WHAT WE DO HERE ACTUALLY
3 COULD BE A VERY GOOD CASE STUDY FOR THE REST OF THE COUNTRY
4 AND THE WORLD. WE'RE A LOT DIFFERENT, I THINK, FROM OTHER --
5 OTHER JURISDICTIONS. WE HAVE SUCH RAPID CHANGE. 2050 IS A LONG
6 WAYS AWAY. IN CONTEXT OF THE BAY AREA IS A LONG, LONG TIME.
7 FROM 2019 TO CURRENTLY 2024, FIVE YEARS, LOOK AT THE DRAMATIC
8 CHANGE THAT WE'VE HAD IN OUR AREA. SO A BAY AREA PLAN FOR 25
9 YEARS HAS TO BE, YOU KNOW, GEARED TO HAVE A LOT OF FEEDBACK, A
10 LOT OF CHECKPOINTS WHERE YOU RE-EVALUATE AND CHANGE THAT PLAN.
11 IT'S NOT GOING TO BE STATIC BECAUSE OUR FIVE YEARS THAT WE'VE
12 JUST SEEN HASN'T BEEN STATIC. AND ALL THESE ISSUES OF
13 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, GROWTH, ALL THESE ARE SO INTERRELATED
14 WHERE IF YOU EMPHASIZE ONE THING OR DIRECT SOMETHING IN
15 ANOTHER DIRECTION IT COULD CHANGE SOMETHING DRAMATICALLY. WORK
16 AT HOME IS -- IS THAT REALLY GOING TO CHANGE OR IS IT GOING TO
17 -- YOU COULD EVEN ACCELERATE IT IF YOU WANTED TO, RIGHT? IF
18 YOU SAY, LET'S EMPHASIZE TECHNOLOGY AND ARTIFICIAL
19 INTELLIGENCE, THEN, YOUR JOB CENTERS MAY GROW IN THE SENSE
20 THAT A BUSINESS WOULD HEADQUARTER IN ONE PLACE, BUT ITS
21 WORKERS COULD THEN DISPERSE AND YOU WOULD ACTUALLY HAVE
22 POPULATION HIGHER IN THE SUBURBS OR IN THE QUIETER
23 NEIGHBORHOODS OF A CITY AND THE DOWNTOWNS WITH LESS ACTUAL
24 WORKERS. AND THEN, THEY START TRANSFORMING INTO NEIGHBORHOODS,
25 JUST DIFFERENT NEIGHBORHOODS. AND YOU KNOW, HOW DO YOU -- HOW



MAY 24, 2024

1 DO YOU DECIDE WHAT YOU WANT TO DO? YOU KNOW, IT'S REALLY
2 DIFFICULT TO SAY. I THINK AN AREA PLAN REALLY NEEDS TO START
3 LOOKING AT A WHOLE SERIES OF BEST PRACTICES AND CASE STUDIES,
4 THAT IT'S NOT JUST THE PLANNING, BUT YOU HAVE TO LOOK AT WHERE
5 IN THE WORLD DO YOU WANT TO GO? DO YOU LOOK AT PARIS AND THE
6 WAY IT'S KIND OF REINVIGORATED STREETS? DO YOU LOOK AT
7 BARCELONA WHERE NEIGHBORHOODS HAVE BECOME KIND OF SELF-
8 CONTAINED, VIBRANT, WHAT THEY CALL 15-MINUTE WALKING CITIES,
9 NEIGHBORHOODS? YOU KNOW, 25 YEARS IS JUST A LONG TIME, AND IT
10 HAS TO BE A FRAME THAT'S AN INSTRUMENT THAT HAS A LOT OF, YOU
11 KNOW, RE -- YOU KNOW, MEANS OF CHANGE CONSTANTLY EVERY TWO
12 YEARS BECAUSE I THINK THE GOAL, YOU KNOW, FOR INSTANCE,
13 AFFORDABILITY. WHAT IS AFFORDABILITY? RIGHT NOW PEOPLE WITH
14 ZERO SALARY OR, YOU KNOW, 20% OF AREA MEDIAN INCOME CAN'T FIND
15 HOUSING AND THEY ARE BEING DISPLACED. SO ANYWAY, IT'S A
16 COMPLEX THING. I THINK IT SHOULD BE -- AREA PLAN SHOULD BE
17 REALLY DYNAMIC.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** IF THERE ARE NO QUESTIONS, DWAYNE, AND
20 THEN ZACK.

21

22 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I JUST HAVE A COUPLE COMMENTS. THANK YOU FOR
23 THE PRESENTATION. ONE OF MY COMMENTS IS, I'M LOOKING AT -- IT
24 SAYS TOTAL NEW JOBS, 2023 TO 2050, 1.3 MILLION. I GUESS IT'S
25 KIND OF LIKE A QUESTION AS WELL. LIKE, ARE THESE RECYCLED



MAY 24, 2024

1 JOBS, PEOPLE RETIRED AND THERE IS A NEW PERSON FILLING THAT
2 ROLE? ARE THESE ACTUALLY NEW INDUSTRIES AND NEW JOBS THAT ARE
3 GOING TO BE MADE? AND THEN, MY SECOND COMMENT IS ABOUT THE
4 GROWTH IN THE NEW HOUSEHOLDS. WHERE I LIVE IN SOLANO COUNTY,
5 THERE ARE ACRES -- THERE WERE ACRES AND ACRES AND ACRES OF
6 RURAL FARMS AND LAND THAT DIDN'T HAVE, IT WAS USED FOR RURAL
7 THINGS LIKE GROWING FRUIT, MAYBE -- I EVEN HAD A FLOWER SEED
8 FARM IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD. BUT NOW ALL OF THOSE RURAL AREAS ARE
9 NEW NEIGHBORHOODS. LIKE, IF YOU TAKE A RIDE DOWN LEISURE TOWN
10 ROAD WHERE I LIVE, WHERE YOU SAW RURAL AREAS, NOW YOU SEE
11 HOUSES. WHAT I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, AFTER LIVING IN ALAMEDA
12 COUNTY AND UNDERSTAND IT'S GOING TO GROW BY 23%, WHERE IS IT
13 GOING TO GROW? LIKE, ALL THE NEW AFFORDABLE HOUSING COVERS
14 PECULIARITIES -- PARKING LOTS. LIKE, IT'S LIKE WHEN YOU WALK
15 IN OAKLAND, EVERY BLOCK IS A BUILDING. SO IT'S LIKE, THERE'S
16 NO PLACE ELSE TO BUILD ANYTHING, NOT UNLESS YOU'RE GOING TO
17 TEAR SOME STUFF DOWN. THOSE ARE MY ONLY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS.
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WITH RESPECT TO THE JOBS QUESTION, I THINK THE
21 BEST WAY TO UNDERSTAND IT IS, THESE ARE NEW JOBS, RIGHT? WE
22 HAVE X MILLION NUMBER OF JOBS IN THE REGION TODAY. AND BY
23 2050, IT WILL BE, YOU KNOW, THAT NUMBER PLUS 1.3 MILLION. TO
24 THE -- YOU KNOW, THE COMMENT ON THE HOUSEHOLD GROWTH, I THINK,
25 YOU KNOW, IT IS IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT THESE -- WE HAVE



MAY 24, 2024

1 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN THAT ARE VERY MUCH FOCUSED ON HELPING
2 US ACHIEVE THE GOAL OF, YOU KNOW, FOCUSING OUR GROWTH IN, YOU
3 KNOW, A LONG EXISTING TRANSPORTATION CORRIDOR AND NOT GROWING
4 IN, YOU KNOW, OUR MORE RURAL AREAS THAT ARE OUTSIDE OF URBAN
5 GROWTH BOUNDARIES, FOR EXAMPLE. AND YOU KNOW, THE PLAN -- IF
6 THE PLAN WERE TO BE IMPLEMENTED, WE THINK THAT IT WOULD
7 SUCCEED IN CONCENTRATING THAT GROWTH IN, YOU KNOW, THESE AREAS
8 THAT WE IDENTIFY AS GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, SO PLACES THAT ARE
9 CLOSE TO TRANSIT, PLACES THAT DO HAVE GOOD TRANSPORTATION
10 ACCESS AND WOULD ENABLE US TO, AGAIN, PROTECT THE REGION'S,
11 YOU KNOW, OPEN SPACES AND GREEN AREAS.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. ON THE POLICY THING, DE-
14 EMPHASIZING INVESTMENTS AND CAPACITY AND V.M.T. FEELS LIKE A
15 BOTTOM LIKE. LIKE, IT'S THE ONLY THING THAT INCREASES FISCAL
16 CAPACITY AND REDUCES G.H.G. AND I FEEL LIKE THAT JUST SETS US
17 -- WITHOUT THAT, LIKE, WE'RE WORKING FROM REALLY NEGATIVE
18 PLACE ON ACHIEVING OUR G.H.G. AND EQUITY AND TRANSPORTATION
19 GOALS.

20

21 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** I WANT TO CAUTION IN THE OUTREACH, AND YOU
22 HEARD FROM OTHER MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY BODY, LIKE, I -- I
23 BELIEVE IN THIS PLAN AND I BELIEVE IN THE EXPERTISE OF M.T.C.
24 STAFF THAT WORK SO HARD ON THIS. I ALSO JUST WANT TO CAUTION
25 THAT THIS PRESENTATION COMES OFF A LITTLE BIT AS, LIKE, TRUST



MAY 24, 2024

1 US, THINGS WILL GET BETTER. AND WE HAVE A LOT OF ACCESS TO YOU
2 AND YOUR INSIGHTS AND WE STILL HAVE SKEPTICISM. LIKE, WHAT'S
3 IT GOING TO FEEL LIKE FOR THE PUBLIC THAT DOESN'T HAVE ANY
4 INTERFACE AND TRUST IN M.T.C. STAFF GETTING THAT SAME MESSAGE?
5 LIKE, JUST TRUST US THAT WE WILL SOLVE OUR HOUSING CRISIS.
6 TRUST US THAT WE'LL FIX TRANSPORTATION. I WOULD WANT TO JUST
7 SUGGEST KIND OF AN ALTERNATIVE FRAMING WITH THAT BASELINE
8 WHICH IS, STARTING WITH, HERE ARE OUR GOALS. OUR GOALS FOR
9 2050 IS TO ADDRESS AFFORDABLE HOUSING, HAVE IT ON THE SLIDE.
10 HELP US GET THERE? WHAT DO YOU WANT TO SEE TO ADVANCE OUR
11 G.H.G. GOALS? WHAT WOULD MAKE THE DIFFERENCE FOR YOU FOR
12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING? AND I THINK WE CAN GET A LOT OF THE SAME
13 STRATEGIES THAT ARE ALREADY IN PLAN BAY AREA BUT RESTRUCTURING
14 THAT RATHER THAN, LIKE, M.T.C. -- STARTING WITH, LIKE, M.T.C.
15 IS A VISION, HELP US GET THERE RATHER THAN, IT'S GOING TO
16 HAPPEN, TRUST US. I THINK MAKES A REALLY BIG DIFFERENCE TO
17 THIS BODY AND TO -- TO THE OUTREACH WE'RE DOING AND GETTING
18 PUBLIC SUPPORT. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND OLIVIA AND THEN WILLIAM.

21

22 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION FROM WHAT I
23 SAW. A CLARIFICATION ON SOMETHING THAT DWAYNE ASKED BEFORE.
24 YOU THINK THERE'S GOING TO BE 1.3 MILLION JOBS IN ADDITION OR,
25 LIKE, ABOVE THE NUMBER WE HAVE NOW? LIKE, I WORK IN HOUSING



MAY 24, 2024

1 FINANCE FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY, AFFORDABLE HOUSING CONSTRUCTION. I
2 KNOW THAT ONE OF OUR BONDS FUNDED APPROXIMATELY 5,000 NEW JOBS
3 LAST YEAR IN CONSTRUCTION, WHICH IS REALLY AWESOME. BUT THE
4 PEOPLE WHO FILLED THOSE JOBS HAD OTHER CONSTRUCTION JOBS
5 BEFORE THEY MOVED INTO OUR CONSTRUCTION JOBS BUT CONSTRUCTION
6 IS FINITE SO IT ENDED. SO IN ONE WAY THAT'S 5,000 NEW JOBS. IN
7 ANOTHER WAY IT'S JUST CONTINUING TO EMPLOY 5,000 PEOPLE WHOSE
8 JOBS ARE CYCLICAL, SO JUST CURIOUS.

9

10 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO, YEAH, THE JOBS FIGURE CAN ACCOUNT FOR,
11 LIKE, PART-TIME JOBS, YOU KNOW, LIKE GIG WORK, YOU KNOW, FOLKS
12 WHO HAVE MULTIPLE JOBS. IT'S NOT THE BEST WAY TO THINK ABOUT
13 IT IN TERMS OF, LIKE, ONE JOB, ONE PERSON. IT'S JUST BASICALLY
14 THE TOTAL NUMBER OF, YOU KNOW, JOBS THAT ARE OUT THERE.

15

16 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** GOT IT. THANK YOU. THAT WAS HELPFUL. AND
17 THEN, I WAS HOPING YOU COULD -- OH, YEAH. AND THEN THE HOUSING
18 COST ASSUMPTION. I LOVE THE CONCEPT THAT A THIRD OR A QUARTER
19 OF OUR HOUSING IS GOING TO BE PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE IN A
20 FORESEEABLE FUTURE. LIKE, THAT IS SUCH A BEAUTIFUL VISION AND
21 I HOPE THAT THAT HAPPENS. BUT THAT WILL ONLY HAPPEN IF WE
22 REQUIRE IT. ABSOLUTELY ONLY HAPPEN IF WE REQUIRE IT. THE
23 CREATION OF MARKET RATE HOUSING HAS NOT PUT DOWNWARD PRESSURE
24 ANYWHERE IN OUR REGION AT ALL. IN FACT, IT'S DONE THE
25 OPPOSITE. SO I -- I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE STRATEGIES AND THE



MAY 24, 2024

1 ASSUMPTIONS GOING INTO THIS. IT COULD HELP INFORM OUR WORK.
2 AND THIS IS, LIKE, THIS IS ONE OF MY BIG PASSIONS. SO I WOULD
3 LOVE TO SEE SOME OF THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT ARE GOING INTO THAT.
4 AND ESPECIALLY WITH CONSTRUCTION COSTS, BECAUSE THEY ARE GOING
5 UP. THEY ARE NOT GOING DOWN. AND BECAUSE DEVELOPERS CAN'T
6 RECOUP THEIR INVESTMENT THROUGH THE COLLECTION OF RENT IN
7 HOUSING THAT HAS, SAY, 55-YEAR CONVENANCE ON IT THAT KEEPS IT
8 PERMANENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING, IT REQUIRES MORE PUBLIC SUPPORT
9 LIKE, BUILD THIS THING AND INSTEAD OF MAKING A PROFIT, WE'RE
10 GOING TO GIVE YOU SOME MONEY TO OFFSET THAT PROFIT. AND THAT'S
11 USUALLY HOW THAT WORKS. SO THE CREATION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING
12 UNITS IS MORE EXPENSIVE BECAUSE WE'VE DECIDED WE ARE NOT GOING
13 TO EXTRACT THAT MONEY FROM LOW-INCOME NEIGHBORS, RIGHT? SO
14 WE'RE LIKE, OKAY. AND THAT MAKES -- THAT MAKES TOTAL SENSE TO
15 ME AND IT SEEMS PERFECTLY REASONABLE AND PRO-SOCIAL. BUT I
16 DON'T -- I WOULD LOVE TO, ALSO, SEE THE ASSUMPTIONS WHERE THAT
17 CONSTRUCTION COST GOES DOWN BECAUSE THAT WOULD BE REALLY COOL
18 AND SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT FROM THE MODELING WE'RE USING. AGAIN,
19 IF THAT COULD INFORM MY WORK, THEN I WOULD LOVE TO SEE IT. AND
20 IF THERE'S ANY WAY WE CAN PARTICIPATE IN THOSE STUDIES OR WAYS
21 TO LOOK AT BRINGING COSTS DOWN, LIKE, WE DEFINITELY HAVE IDEAS
22 BECAUSE WE'RE IN IT ALL DAY AND I LOVE VOLUNTEERING SO -- IF
23 YOU COULD GO TO SLIDE 11, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND THAT IS
24 LOOKING AT -- YEAH, THIS ONE. SO I JUST -- I WANT TO TAKE A
25 SECOND AND RUN THROUGH THESE FOUR THINGS AND LOOK AT WHO



MAY 24, 2024

1 BENEFITS AND WHO DOESN'T FROM THESE DIFFERENT POTENTIAL POLICY
2 LEVERS. SO HIGHWAYS AND ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS. IF WE DON'T --
3 DRIVING AROUND, I SEE WHERE ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS ARE HAPPENING
4 AND WHERE THEY'RE NOT. AND IN OAKLAND, YOU'LL HAVE ROADWAY
5 IMPROVEMENTS RIGHT UP THROUGH THE POINT OF GENTRIFICATION AND
6 THEN THEY'LL STOP, RIGHT? INTERNATIONAL IS A REALLY GOOD
7 VISIBLE EXAMPLE OF THAT. THE ROADS AROUND THE LAKE ARE REALLY
8 GOOD EXAMPLES OF THAT. ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS COME WHEN WE
9 DISPLACE OUR NEIGHBORS AND WE BRING IN PEOPLE WITH MORE TAX
10 DOLLARS. AND WHEN WE LOOK AT THE DISTRIBUTION OF WHERE ROADWAY
11 IMPROVEMENTS GO AND OVERLAY IT WITH THINGS LIKE, WHO HAS
12 INSURANCE, WHO HAS CAR INSURANCE, AND WHAT KIND OF CARS DO
13 THEY HAVE, HOW MUCH CAN THEY ABSORB IN DAMAGE FROM POTHOLES SO
14 LARGE THAT SOMETIMES PEOPLE PLANT TREES IN THEM? THAT'S REAL.
15 THAT HAPPENED IN MY NEIGHBORHOOD. THEN, YOU'LL ALSO SEE THAT
16 PEOPLE WITH LOWER LEVELS OF INSURANCE OR HIGHLY LESS INSURED
17 FOLKS ARE LESS LIKELY TO HAVE CAR INSURANCE THAT WILL COVER A
18 RENTAL CAR WHEN THEIR CAR GETS DAMAGED FROM DAMAGED ROADS. SO
19 PEOPLE WITH NICER CARS AND BETTER INSURANCE GET BETTER ROADS
20 AND PEOPLE WITH LESS HIGH-QUALITY CARS AND WORSE TO NO
21 INSURANCE DON'T GET THE ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS THAT THEY
22 ACTUALLY NEED MORE BECAUSE IF THEY CAN'T GET TO WORK BECAUSE
23 THEY DON'T HAVE THE OPTION OF WORKING REMOTELY, THEY LOSE
24 THEIR JOBS. THAT STRATEGY HAS SOME CONCERN FOR ME. PRICING,
25 ESPECIALLY WITH INCREASED TOLLING AND MILEAGE-BASED ANYTHING



MAY 24, 2024

1 WHICH MEANS YOU'RE WEALTHY ENOUGH TO LIVE IN THIS NEIGHBORHOOD
2 SO YOU CAN TAKE BART AND YOU CAN WALK TO WORK AND YOU CAN RIDE
3 A BIKE BECAUSE YOU'RE BOTH PHYSICALLY ABLE TO AND YOU CAN
4 AFFORD AN ELECTRIC BIKE AND ALL THOSE KINDS OF THINGS, LIKE,
5 MILE-BASED FEES AND TOLLING, THEY ARE REALLY REGRESSIVE.
6 PARKING. LIKE, I'D LOVE TO SEE MOTORCYCLE PARKING, FOR SURE.
7 BUT, LIKE -- LIKE, I WAS AN HOUR LATE TODAY AND I LEFT ON TIME
8 TO BE 15 MINUTES EARLY. IT TOOK ME TWO HOURS TO TAKE THE BUS
9 HERE FROM OAKLAND. TWO HOURS. THE FIRST TWO JUST DID NOT COME
10 AND THEN THE NEXT ONE I WAS IN FOREVER. SO SORRY I'M LATE. BUT
11 I'M REALLY TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IF I CAN SWITCH TO PUBLIC
12 TRANSIT. LIKE, I AM TRYING. MY BARRIER TO PUBLIC
13 TRANSPORTATION IS NOT THE COST OF DRIVING. IT'S THE
14 INEFFICIENCY OF PUBLIC TRANSIT AND HOW DANGEROUS IT IS TO GET
15 TO AND FROM THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT AND THE FACT THAT THE
16 CONNECTIONS DON'T WORK AT ALL. IF I WANT TO TAKE IT AT NIGHT
17 OR IF I HAVE A LIFE THAT REQUIRES ME TO NOT GO HOME AT 5:00
18 BECAUSE THAT'S REAL, THEN, IT'S NOT SAFE OR IT WILL TAKE ME
19 HOURS TO GET ANYWHERE. SO LIKE, I'M GOING TO HAVE TO LEAVE
20 EARLY TODAY BECAUSE I CAN'T BE LATE FOR MY NEXT WORK MEETING
21 AND APPARENTLY HAVE TO BUDGE TWO HOURS FOR IT AND NOT 45
22 MINUTES. SO THAT'S PART OF THE TRANSIT SERVICE AND CUSTOMER
23 EXPERIENCE PIECE THERE. I JUST THINK THAT THE -- I HAVE TO GET
24 MY NOTES BACK UP HERE BECAUSE I GET ALL EXCITED. IT'S TRUE.
25 AND I HAVE VERY GOOD PASSWORDS ON MY COMPUTER. LOOKING AT



MAY 24, 2024

1 THESE FIRST TWO PIECES, IT REALLY FEELS LIKE WE'RE EXTRACTING
2 THE QUALITY OF LIFE FROM ONE GIVEN PEOPLE AND GIVING IT TO
3 ANOTHER GROUP OF PEOPLE, WELL-INTENTIONED POLICY BUT, LIKE,
4 JUST REALLY HAVING TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT AND I'M NOT MAKING THAT
5 TRANSITION. I'M TRYING TO HARD TO MAKE THE TRANSITION TO
6 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, BUT I'M NOT, LIKE, IT'S NOT WORKING.
7 AND ON THE TRANSIT EXPANSION, WHICH I LOVE. LIKE, THIS WOULD
8 HELP ADDRESS A LOT OF ISSUES FOR ME. THERE ARE TWO PIECES I'D
9 LOVE FOLKS TO TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AND ONE IS STAFFING
10 LEVELS. YESTERDAY, I WAS IN THE BART STATION AND I MISSED MY
11 BART BUT IT WAS BECAUSE THERE WAS A MAN IN A WHEELCHAIR WHO
12 WAS STUCK. HE WAS TRYING OGET -- TRYING TO GET THROUGH THE
13 WHEELCHAIR ACCESS THING AND HE COULDN'T REACH THE PLACE TO DO
14 HIS CLIPPER CARD BECAUSE HE DIDN'T HAVE AN ARM THAT WOULD
15 EXTEND FULL LENGTH AND THERE WERE NO STAFF THERE. LIKE, THERE
16 WAS NO STAFF ANYWHERE. AND ALL OF A SUDDEN I WAS LIKE, WAIT A
17 MINUTE. THERE'S NO SECURITY. THERE'S NO STAFF IN ANY OF THESE
18 BOOTHS. THERE WERE NO STAFF IN THE NEXT TWO BOOTHS EITHER. AND
19 THIS GUY WAS JUST STUCK. AND SO WHEN WE LOOK AT TRANSIT
20 EXPANSION, I'D ALSO REALLY ENCOURAGE US TO LOOK AT APPROPRIATE
21 STAFFING LEVELS, WHICH CAN ALSO ADDRESS SOME OF THOSE CONCERNS
22 AROUND SAFETY AND WHATNOT. AND THE OTHER PART IS TRIP
23 PLANNING. I LISTENED TO THE WAY FINDING MEETING AND IN MY
24 HEAD, TRIP PLANNING AND WAY FINDING SHOULD BE CONNECTED
25 SOMEHOW AND THEY'RE NOT, BUT THAT IS -- IT'S HOW WE FIND OUR



MAY 24, 2024

1 WAY IS THROUGH THE TRIP PLANNING TOOLS AND THE LACK OF
2 INTEGRATION OF FERRIES AND THINGS LIKE THAT INTO THOSE TOOLS
3 IS JUST REALLY ABSURD. SO LIKE -- I REALLY LOVE WHAT YOU'RE
4 GOING FOR AND I HAVE SO MUCH RESPECT FOR YOU AND I AM AN
5 ANNOYINGLY ENTHUSIASTIC PERSON ABOUT A LOT OF THESE THINGS AND
6 SO I HOPE THEY'RE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION BECAUSE I SEE YOU
7 GUYS LISTEN ALL THE TIME TO US AND I'M SO VERY GRATEFUL FOR
8 THAT. YOU ARE A WONDERFUL STAFF. AND I GUESS THE LAST PIECE
9 WOULD BE ON ENGAGEMENT. AND THERE'S A MODEL THAT WAS USED BY
10 OAKLAND THAT I LOVED A LOT AND IT INVOLVED NEIGHBORHOOD
11 LIAISONS. LIKE, THEY ACTUALLY WENT NEIGHBORHOOD BY
12 NEIGHBORHOOD AND GAVE ONE INDIVIDUAL A STIPEND TO GO AND KNOCK
13 ON THEIR NEIGHBOR'S DOORS AND TELL THEM WHAT WAS GOING ON AND
14 THEN BRING THEM BACK TO, LIKE, KIND OF LARGER REGIONAL
15 MEETINGS AND AN INDIVIDUAL COLLECTED THAT INFORMATION AND THEN
16 BROUGHT THEM BACK TO THE STAFF. AND IT WAS REALLY SUCCESSFUL
17 BECAUSE NEIGHBORS WERE TAKING TO THEIR OWN NEIGHBORS ABOUT
18 WHAT WAS GOING ON AND THEY WERE MORE WILLING TO BE -- DOORS
19 WERE MORE WILLING TO BE OPENED TO THEIR NEIGHBORS. THEY'RE
20 HAVING THE STAFF LEVEL CAPACITY TO ACTUALLY GO DOOR-TO-DOOR IS
21 NOT A REALISTIC THING. BUT THERE WAS A LOT OF FOLKS IN THE
22 BART STATION YESTERDAY HANDING OUT FLIERS. I IMAGINE IT MAY BE
23 WORTHWHILE TO REALLY GET MESSAGES OUT TO LOOK AT SOME OF THAT
24 NEIGHBORHOOD LIAISON LEVEL APPROACH AND I'D BE HAPPY TO



MAY 24, 2024

1 CONNECT YOU WITH THE CITY STAFF WHO ORGANIZED THAT. SO THAT
2 WAS A LOT OF WORDS. THANKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WILLIAM AND THEN DIANA.

5

6 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** YES. EXCUSE ME. THANK YOU, MR. RABARI, FOR
7 THAT INFORMATION. YOU'VE BEEN HERE FOR A FEW TIMES. I
8 APPRECIATE THE INFORMATION. THERE IS A LOT OF INFORMATION
9 HERE. AND I KNOW YOU HAVE THESE GUIDING QUESTIONS, BUT THERE'S
10 JUST SO MUCH INFORMATION TO CONCENTRATE ON THOSE TWO GUIDING
11 QUESTIONS. I AGREE WITH MY COUNCILMEMBERS REGARDING THE
12 ASSUMPTIONS AROUND HOUSING COST REDUCTION, ESPECIALLY WITH
13 LABOR COSTS, AND UNLESS WE HAVE SOME KIND OF LONG-TERM LABOR
14 AGREEMENT, THE HOW WE REDUCE COSTS IS A VITAL QUESTION. ALSO,
15 THE ASSUMPTIONS AROUND HOUSEHOLDS WITH HOUSING COSTS BURDENS.
16 AND I KNOW I MENTIONED THIS BEFORE IN OUR LAST MEETING. THIS
17 AMERICAN COMMUNITY SURVEY, I JUST DON'T -- ON THE GROUND, I
18 DON'T SEE IT. I DON'T SEE HOUSING COST BURDEN BEING REDUCED,
19 ESPECIALLY WITH WAGES BEING STAGNANT, ARE NOT GOING UP, WHAT'S
20 THE CHANGE? I THINK THE CHANGE -- THE SURVEY SAYS THAT LOW-
21 INCOME FAMILIES ARE MOVING OUT OF THE REGION. BUT THAT'S AN
22 ALARMING NOTION TO, YOU KNOW, BASE THESE ASSUMPTIONS ON THAT
23 FAMILIES ARE JUST GOING TO BE PUSHED OUT OF, YOU KNOW, OF OUR
24 REGION BECAUSE THEY CAN'T AFFORD IT. AND YOU LOOK AT THE
25 BLUEPRINT GROWTH PATTERN, YOU SEE THAT 43% OF JOB GROWTH, 27%



MAY 24, 2024

1 OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH IS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. HOW WILL THOSE
2 LOW-INCOME FAMILIES BENEFIT FROM THESE HIGH-RESOURCE AND
3 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS? WILL THEY HAVE TO RELOCATE OR COMMUTE? AND
4 SO, LIKE I SAID, IT'S JUST AN ALARMING NOTION. I DID WANT TO
5 COMMENT ON THE ENGAGEMENT TOUCHPOINTS. ARE WE GOING TO HAVE
6 SPECIFIC NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS THAT WE PLAN TO ENGAGE BASED ON
7 THE DEMOGRAPHICS FROM OUR PREVIOUS OUTREACH, BECAUSE THERE
8 WERE SOME ANALYSIS, I'M SURE, THAT SHOWED CERTAIN FAMILIES
9 WERE NOT REACHED, AND SO ARE WE GOING TO HAVE SOME NUMBERS AND
10 SOME GOALS TO INCREASE THOSE NUMBERS? AND I'M THINKING MAYBE,
11 YOU KNOW, IT'S BEEN A YEAR SINCE PUBLIC SEEN THESE -- THIS
12 INFORMATION. AND SO MAYBE WE NEED SOME KIND OF WIND-UP OR
13 REMINDER OR MEDIA BLITZ OR SOMETHING TO GET PEOPLE BACK INTO
14 FAMILIARITY WITH THIS INFORMATION. MAYBE A NONCONFERENCE OR
15 SOMETHING WHERE PEOPLE CAN DECIDE, THIS IS WHAT I WANT TO
16 HEAR? THIS IS WHAT I WANT TO SEE. AND THEN, WE CAN ANSWER
17 THOSE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS TO THE PUBLIC. AS FAR AS THE G.H.G.
18 GAP, I KNOW WE HAVE PREDICTIONS THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE'S GOING
19 TO BE AN INCREASE OR -- OR WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS. ARE WE
20 OFFERING ANY INCENTIVES TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN? BECAUSE THAT'S A
21 BIG ASSUMPTION THAT PEOPLE ARE GOING TO WORK FROM HOME. THERE
22 ARE ORGANIZATIONS ASKING EMPLOYEES TO COME BACK TO WORK NOW
23 AND SORT OF DEMANDING IT. AND SO TO MAKE THAT ASSUMPTION THAT
24 THOSE LEVELS ARE GOING TO INCREASE, I -- I MEAN, UNLESS WE'RE
25 OFFERING SOME INCENTIVES, I DON'T SEE HOW THAT'S GOING TO



MAY 24, 2024

1 HAPPEN. AND THE POTENTIAL OPTIONS THAT WE OFFER, THOSE FOUR
2 OPTIONS, HAVE WE LOOKED AT JUST TRYING TO HAVE SOME KIND OF
3 COMBINATION OF THE FOUR TO MAYBE YIELD SOME BETTER RESULTS?
4 BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE THERE'S AN EITHER/OR AND MAYBE WE NEED
5 SOME COMBINATION. OF THOSE POTENTIAL OPTIONS AND THEN WE CAN,
6 YOU KNOW, HAVE BETTER RESULTS. SO THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. THANK
7 YOU. OR QUESTIONS.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WOULD YOU LIKE -- STAFF WOULD
10 LIKE TO ADDRESS ANY OF THOSE QUESTIONS?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SURE, BRIEFLY. TO YOUR LAST POINT, I THINK IT'S
13 CERTAINLY POSSIBLE AND PLAUSIBLE WE MAY NEED TO TAKE AN ALL-
14 OF-THE-ABOVE APPROACH. I THINK IT'S JUST A MATTER OF, YOU
15 KNOW, WHERE -- WHERE IS THE POLICY CONSENSUS, YOU KNOW,
16 AMONGST THE PUBLIC AS WELL AS, YOU KNOW, BODIES SUCH AS
17 YOURSELVES AND THE ELECTED OFFICIALS? BUT IN ORDER TO HIT THAT
18 TARGET, YOU KNOW, IT MAY NOT JUST BE ANY SINGLE POLICY LEVER
19 THAT GETS US THERE. I THINK, YOU KNOW, TO YOUR QUESTION ON
20 ENGAGEMENT, I THINK I SAW LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ, OUR ASSISTANT
21 PUBLIC DIRECTOR OF ENGAGEMENT HAD HER HAND RAISED. CAN YOU
22 JUMP IN?

23

24 **LESLIE LARA-ENRIQUEZ:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, COUNCILMEMBERS.
25 APOLOGIES I AM NOT THERE. I HAVE A COLD. TALK ABOUT INCREASING



MAY 24, 2024

1 OUR PARTICIPATION NUMBERS FROM THE LAST ROUND. SO WE
2 DEFINITELY -- WE DEFINITELY AIM EVERY TIME WE GO OUT FOR
3 ENGAGEMENT TO INCREASE THE REACH OF OUR ENGAGEMENT FROM WHAT
4 WE DID THE LAST TIME. BUT OUR -- OUR WORK AND OUR STRATEGY IS
5 REALLY GROUNDED BY OUR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN AND -- AND
6 THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN BASICALLY DIRECTS US TO
7 PRIORITIZE REACHING THOSE WHO HAVE HISTORICALLY BEEN LEFT OUT
8 OF THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS. THEREFORE, WE DESIGN OUR
9 STRATEGY AND ALLOCATE OUR RESOURCES WITH THAT IN MIND. AND SO
10 MOST OF THE RESOURCES ARE SPENT IN OUR PARTNERSHIPS WITH
11 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS WHICH ALLOWS US TO HAVE THE MOST
12 MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT WITH THE COMMUNITIES THAT ARE MOST
13 AFFECTED OR THAT HAVE HISTORICALLY NOT BEEN AT THE TABLE. BUT
14 WE DO -- EVERY TIME WE DO -- WE DO A BLITZ OF DIGITAL
15 PROMOTION WHEN WE'RE DOING ENGAGEMENT OR WHEN WE'RE GEARING UP
16 FOR ENGAGEMENT. WE ADVERTISE ONLINE. WE DO PRESS RELEASES. WE
17 DO EMAIL OUTREACH. WE REACH OUT TO OUR PARTNERS ACROSS THE
18 REGION. SO WE ALSO DO SPEND A LOT OF RESOURCES ADVERTISING OUR
19 ACTIVITIES SO THAT FOLKS ARE AWARE THAT WE ARE DOING
20 ENGAGEMENT AND THEY COME TO OUR WEBSITE TO PARTICIPATE. I WILL
21 ALSO ADD THAT OUR MOST EFFECTIVE FORM OF ENGAGEMENT GIVEN THE
22 POST-PANDEMIC REALITIES IS -- CONTINUES TO BE ONLINE
23 ENGAGEMENT. AS AN EXAMPLE. LAST TIME -- FOR THE LAST ROUND, WE
24 DID DO -- OUR PARTICIPATION WAS MUCH -- FOUR TIMES HIGHER
25 ONLINE THAN IT WAS IN PERSON. AND WHEN WE'RE DOING OUR ONLINE



MAY 24, 2024

1 ENGAGEMENT, WHEN WE'RE DOING OUR, YOU KNOW, PROMOTIONAL
2 BLITZES, WE -- WE DO WORK WITH A CONSULTANT WHO IS ABLE TO
3 HELP TARGET OUR MESSAGE SO THAT, YOU KNOW, WE CHECK IN EVERY
4 WEEK AND WE SEE WHO WE ARE NOT REACHING AND HOW DO WE NEED TO
5 ADJUST OUR STRATEGIES SO THAT WE MAKE SURE THAT FOLKS WHO ARE
6 NOT RESPONDING TO THE SURVEY OR WHATEVER IT MAY BE ONLINE ARE
7 GETTING THE INFORMATION AND WE ALWAYS DO CHECK IN TO MAKE SURE
8 WE'RE REACHING FOLKS. BUT I WILL SAY, IN ADDITION -- JUST TO
9 RESPOND TO SOME OF THE EARLIER COMMENTS, WE DO TAKE TO HEART
10 ALL OF YOUR COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR ENGAGEMENT. WE'RE
11 DEFINITELY NOT GOING TO BE DOING ANY MORE PAID ACTIVITIES. OUR
12 STAFF HAS BEEN WORKING REALLY HARD IN RESEARCHING EVENTS AND
13 LOCATIONS THAT MAKE SENSE FOR ENGAGEMENT FOR THE NEXT ROUND OF
14 ENGAGEMENT. WE'VE REACHED OUT TO YOU ALL SEVERAL WEEKS BACK
15 FOR YOUR IDEAS ON EVENTS. WE'VE REACHED OUT TO OUR PARTNERS.
16 SPECIFICALLY, OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS, TO IDENTIFY EVENTS WITHIN
17 THEIR SERVICE AREAS. AND WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO RESEARCH
18 LOCATIONS AND EVENTS THROUGH THE END OF -- THROUGH THE FALL SO
19 THAT WE MAKE SURE WE IDENTIFY THE BEST LOCATIONS TO REACH THE
20 MOST PEOPLE WHEN WE'RE OUT IN PERSON. ANOTHER THING TO NOTE
21 FROM LAST -- FROM LAST ROUND TO THIS ONE IS WE ARE AUGMENTING
22 OUR C.B.O. ENGAGEMENT TO ENSURE WE ARE REACHING NATIVE
23 AMERICAN RESIDENTS, SO WE'VE IDENTIFIED SEVERAL C.B.O.
24 ORGANIZATIONS AND WE ARE HOPING TO PARTNER WITH THEM. THEY
25 WILL BE INTEGRATED INTO OUR OVERALL C.B.O. ENGAGEMENT



MAY 24, 2024

1 STRATEGY. AND LASTLY, I WILL REPORT THAT I HAVE BEEN
2 COORDINATING CLOSELY WITH THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE CARE
3 PROGRAM TO GET THAT PROGRAM OFF THE GROUND AND TO ENSURE THAT
4 OUR ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES STAY COORDINATED.

5

6 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE'LL MOVE ON TO
7 DIANA AND THEN GABRIELA AND THEN CIRCLE BACK.

8

9 **DIANA BENITEZ:** THANK YOU. A LOT OF FOLKS HAVE SAID A LOT WHAT
10 I'M THINKING. IT'S KIND OF NEW. WANTING TO MAKE SURE WHEN WE
11 DO THE ENGAGEMENT THAT THIS INFORMATION IS ACCESSIBLE SO THAT
12 RESIDENTS CAN UNDERSTAND THESE BIG IDEAS AND PROVIDE THEIR
13 FEEDBACK AND ALSO HEARKENING BACK TO WHAT ONE OF MY PREVIOUS
14 COUNCILMEMBERS SAID, MAKING SURE THAT THESE ASSUMPTIONS ARE
15 FRAMED A BIT. AND I KNOW WE DON'T WANT TO GIVE FOLKS TOO MUCH
16 INFORMATION AND INUNDATE THEM BUT ALSO MAKING SURE, LIKE,
17 PRETTY MUCH EVERYONE HAS BROUGHT UP THE CONCERN ABOUT THE
18 HOUSING COSTS AND LIKE -- HOW DID YOU GET THOSE NUMBERS? AND
19 SO JUST MAKING SURE WE PROVIDE FOLKS WITH ENOUGH INFORMATION
20 SO THEY'RE NOT LIKE, I DON'T TRUST THIS INITIAL THING YOU'RE
21 SAYING SO I CAN'T GIVE YOU ANY OTHER FEEDBACK. SO JUST MAKING
22 SURE THAT THAT FRAMING IS THERE. AND THEN, I REALLY LOVE THE
23 PARTNERSHIP WITH THE C.B.O.'S AND ORGANIZATIONS AND I THINK I
24 WOULD ALSO JUST ENCOURAGE AND I THINK MOST OF THE C.B.O.'S ARE
25 ALREADY GOING TO DO THIS BUT BECAUSE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT



MAY 24, 2024

1 THINGS THAT FOLKS AREN'T GOING TO SEE IMMEDIATELY, MAKING SURE
2 THAT WE'RE ALSO CONNECTING FOLKS TO RESOURCES THEY CAN USE IN
3 THE PRESENT DAY. SO MAKING SURE -- I KNOW, LIKE, CLIPPER START
4 IS GOING TO BE KICKING OFF IN SOME PLACES LIKE HE KNOW IT IS
5 IN MARIN AND OTHER PLACES SO MAKING SURE FOLKS AREN'T JUST
6 SAYING, OH, YOU'RE ASKING ME FOR FEEDBACK FOR SOMETHING THAT
7 MAY OR MAY NOT HAPPEN 20 YEARS FROM NOW. LIKE, WE CONNECT THEM
8 WITH WHAT THEY NEED TODAY. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA.

11

12 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** MINE WAS -- I JUST WANTED CLARIFICATION ON
13 THIS -- THIS SLIDE WITH THE MAP -- THE GROWTH PATTERNS. IS
14 ANYTHING LIKE THIS GOING TO BE SHARED DURING ENGAGEMENT, DO
15 YOU KNOW?

16

17 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I THINK WE'RE STILL TRYING TO FOCUS EXACTLY HOW
18 WE WANT TO GO OUT. WE DO WANT TO SHARE INFORMATION ABOUT THE
19 GROWTH PATTERN, BUT I THINK WE -- WE WANTED, AGAIN, TO BE
20 ACCESSIBLE, UNDERSTANDABLE AND MEANINGFUL SO WE'RE STILL
21 EVALUATING THE BEST WAY TO DO THAT FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

22

23 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** I ASK BECAUSE I THINK REACTIONS TO SOME OF
24 THIS -- I HAD SIMILAR REACTIONS. LIKE, LAUGHING INTERNALLY,
25 NOT AT -- LAUGHING AT THE CONTENT IN THE SENSE LIKE, THIS DOES



MAY 24, 2024

1 NOT FEEL REALISTIC. FOR HOW -- LIKE, THINGS ARE SO HARD RIGHT
2 NOW FOR PEOPLE AND, LIKE, TO SEE 43% -- TO ME, WHAT I SEE, 43%
3 OF GROWTH IN SANTA CLARA IN JOBS MEANS MORE TRAFFIC TO ME.
4 JUST INSTANTLY THAT'S WHAT I THINK. AND THEN WHEN -- WHEN
5 ALREADY THAT'S SUCH AN EXPENSIVE PLACE TO LIVE, IT MAKES ME
6 WONDER HOW THE HECK DO WE GET COST TO GO DOWN WHEN ALL WE HEAR
7 FROM POLITICIANS AND DECISIONMAKERS AND DEVELOPERS WHO ARE
8 ENGAGED IN -- AND HOUSING PROVIDERS, THEY CALL THEMSELVES,
9 IT'S LIKE, THAT -- IT'S JUST GETTING MORE AND MORE EXPENSIVE
10 TO GET HOUSING. LIKE, THERE IS A -- TO ME, THERE IS A
11 DISCONNECT IN THE NARRATIVE FOR HOW IT ACTUALLY FEELS AND THE
12 EXPERIENCE -- THE LIVED EXPERIENCES. SO I GUESS THAT GOES BACK
13 TO KIND OF WHAT ZACK HAD BROUGHT UP. LIKE, THE REFRAMING OF
14 THE NARRATIVE, BECAUSE WE DO WANT TO WORK TOWARDS WHAT CAN BE
15 AND NOT JUST STAY STUCK IN LIKE HOW CHALLENGING AND HARD
16 THINGS ARE NOW. SO THIS IS GREAT FOR VISIONING. BUT I THINK,
17 THEN, THE REACTIONS PEOPLE HAVE TO SOME OF THIS DATA IS
18 INFORMING AS WELL. SO WHILE SOME OF THIS CAN BE COMPLEX THERE
19 WILL BE QUESTIONS AND REACTIONS THAT WILL REALLY BE INFORMING.
20 AND TO NOT -- YEAH, THERE WON'T ALWAYS BE THE BEST REACTIONS.
21 I THINK TO BE ABLE TO HEAR LIKE, THAT'S ACTUALLY NOT REALISTIC
22 BECAUSE MY LIVED EXPERIENCE NOW, LIKE, WHAT ANNE OLIVIA
23 SHARED, ALL OF THAT IS SUCH GREAT QUALITATIVE DATA THAT I'M
24 EXCITED FOR YOUR OUTREACH TO REALLY BRING OUT, ESPECIALLY
25 HEARING YOU, LESLIE, RESTATE THAT THE PRIORITY OF YOUR



MAY 24, 2024

1 ENGAGEMENT -- AND CORRECT ME IF I'M WRONG BUT I HEARD YOU SAY
2 THE PRIORITY OF THE ENGAGEMENT IS WITH -- FOR COMMUNITIES WHO
3 HAVE BEEN LEFT OUT OF THESE CONVERSATIONS, THESE DECISIONS,
4 TYPICALLY, HISTORICALLY. SO A LOT OF THIS SYSTEM HAS NOT
5 WORKED FOR THOSE COMMUNITIES SO MUCH THAT I'M EXCITED THAT
6 THEIR VOICES AND THEIR EXPERIENCES WILL BE PRIORITIZED. SO
7 THAT WOULD BE, I GUESS, MY CONTRIBUTION TO YOUR QUESTION
8 NUMBER TWO FOR OUR DISCUSSION. AND THE OTHER QUESTION I HAD
9 WAS: WITH RELATION TO KEY FINDING FOR MORE AFFORDABLE BAY
10 AREA, THAT SLIDE, I THINK IT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL TO -- ADINA
11 ALSO ASKED THE QUESTION LIKE, WHAT ARE THE MEASURES THAT WOULD
12 -- THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT THAT WOULD EQUATE HOUSING COST
13 DECLINE? YOU HAD MENTIONED IN YOUR PRESENTATION RENTER
14 PROTECTIONS AS ONE OF THEM. LIKE, THAT STOOD OUT TO ME BECAUSE
15 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT MY BACKGROUND IS IN. BUT I THINK THINGS
16 LIKE THAT WOULD -- THAT SEEMS IN THE MOMENT MORE TANGIBLE --
17 NOT MORE TANGIBLE BUT, LIKE, THAT COULD REALLY AFFECT
18 SOMEONE'S DAILY LIFE NOW IF -- AS A MEASURE. JUST AS AN
19 EXAMPLE, RENTER PROTECTIONS. AND TO INCLUDE THAT IN -- IN HOW
20 WE WOULD SEE HOUSING COSTS DECLINE. BECAUSE THE NARRATIVE IS
21 THAT IT WON'T AND THE REALITY FOR A LOT OF FOLKS IS THAT IT'S
22 JUST GONE UP AND UP, MAKING IT LESS ATTAINABLE. SO I
23 APPRECIATE YOUR LIFTING SPECIFICALLY RENTER PROTECTIONS. AND I
24 FEEL LIKE AS A BODY WE COULD SAY IT LOUDER FOR THE PEOPLE IN
25 THE BACK BECAUSE THERE'S A LOT OF PUSH AGAINST THOSE KIND OF



MAY 24, 2024

1 MEASURES EVEN THOUGH THOSE HAVE VERY REAL IMMEDIATE IMPACTS ON
2 MANY PEOPLE. SO THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. VINAY AND THEN WE'LL HEAR
5 FROM OUR FOLKS ONLINE.

6

7 **VINAY PIMPLE:** OH, YEAH. SO THANKS FOR ALLOWING ME TO SPEAK. I
8 APPRECIATE THAT. SO I DO WANT TO SAY A FEW THINGS THAT I THINK
9 SOMETIMES WE MAYBE DON'T DISCUSS AS MUCH HERE. ONE OF THE KEY
10 THINGS I DO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT
11 G.H.G. AND PUBLIC TRANSIT AND STUFF LIKE THAT AND I DON'T KNOW
12 IF FOLKS ARE QUITE AWARE HOW SPARSELY POPULATED THE BAY AREA
13 IS. AND I WANT TO JUST THROW OUT SOME NUMBERS. I THINK, LIKE,
14 SAY, FOR EXAMPLE, THE POPULATION DENSITY OF THE BAY AREA IS
15 VERY COMPARABLE. IN FACT, THE BAY AREA IS COMPARABLE TO THE
16 POPULATION DENSITY OF THE COUNTRY OF ENGLAND. IT'S VERY
17 COMPARABLE TO THE POPULATION DENSITY OF THE STATE OF NEW
18 JERSEY. SO IF YOU THINK -- IF YOU JUST DO CALCULATIONS, IF
19 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT A FAMILY OF FOUR -- YOU KNOW, FOR A
20 FAMILY OF FOUR IN THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE ABOUT AN ACRE AND A
21 HALF TO TWO ACRES. THAT'S A LOT OF SPACE. OBVIOUSLY, IF YOU GO
22 TO PLACES LIKE NAPA COUNTY, IT'S 10 TO 12 ACRES. SONOMA
23 COUNTY, SIX TO EIGHT ACRES. SO, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE -- A
24 COUPLE OF THINGS HERE. ONE IS, YES, WE ARE MORE SPARSELY
25 POPULATED PLACE. AND ALSO, ONE OF THE OTHER THINGS. JUST SO



MAY 24, 2024

1 FOLKS KNOW, NO CALIFORNIA, THE MOST DENSELY POPULATED COUNTIES
2 IS OBVIOUSLY SAN FRANCISCO. THE SECOND MOST DENSELY POPULATED
3 COUNTY IS ORANGE COUNTY IN SOCAL. SUPPOSED TO BE A REALLY
4 SUBURBAN COUNTY. WHY? BECAUSE ORANGE COUNTY IS THE ONLY OTHER
5 COUNTY WHERE MORE THAN HALF THE AREA OF THE COUNTY IS ACTUALLY
6 INCORPORATED CITIES. HUGE PARTS OF THE BAY AREA ARE
7 UNINCORPORATED, WHICH MEANS THAT THE DEVELOPMENT THERE IS
8 CLOSE TO ZERO. NOT ZERO BUT REALLY MINIMAL. AND SO A BIG PART
9 OF WHAT IS HAPPENING HERE IS THAT WE ARE CHOOSING NOT TO
10 DEVELOP FOR HOUSING LARGE PARTS OF THE BAY AREA. AND YOU KNOW,
11 IF WE DO DEVELOP THOSE HOUSING, IF YOU ARE SAYING YOU'RE
12 SERIOUS ABOUT HOUSING AND WE DEVELOP THOSE AREAS THEN, YES,
13 YOU GET PUSHBACK FROM THE ENVIRONMENTALISTS. YOU'RE ALSO GOING
14 TO INCREASE G.H.G.'S IF WE GO THERE. THAT'S THE FASTEST ROUTE.
15 IF YOU TAKE THE SLOW ROUTE, WHICH IS THE ROUTE WE HAVE BEEN
16 TAKING, YOU JUST PILE ON THE HOUSING IN THE ALREADY
17 COMPARATIVELY DENSELY POPULATED AREAS. AND SO THEN, THERE'S
18 THE OTHER KIND OF PUSHBACK WHERE SOMEONE SAYS, WELL,
19 IMMEDIATELY, SHE THINKS OF MORE JOBS, SHE THINKS ABOUT
20 INCREASE IN TRAFFIC. THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT HAPPENS, YOU KNOW.
21 AND FOLKS SAY DEVELOPERS DON'T WANT TO BUILD CHEAP -- YOU
22 KNOW, LESS FANCY HOUSING DOES ACTUALLY -- THAT'S ACTUALLY NOT
23 THE CASE FROM MY CONVERSATIONS WITH THEM. THEY'RE HAPPY TO
24 BUILD THESE HOMES. WHAT HAPPENS IS THE POLITICIANS DON'T WANT
25 THEM TO BUILD MORE THAN A CERTAIN NUMBER OF UNITS BECAUSE THEY



MAY 24, 2024

1 GET PUSHBACK FROM THE PEOPLE IN THE AREA THAT WE DO NOT MORE
2 THAN A CERTAIN NUMBER OF UNITS. AND SO IF THEY ARE GOING TO
3 BUILD ONLY A CERTAIN NUMBER OF UNITS, THE PROJECTS MAKE SENSE
4 ONLY IF THEY ARE 1,500 SQUARE FOOT UNITS, OR 1,700 SQUARE FOOT
5 UNITS. AND THAT'S HOW LUXURY CONDOS GET BUILT AND YOU ALMOST
6 HAVE NO PLACE FOR CONDOS. AND SO ONE OF THE EASIEST WAYS TO DO
7 THAT IS, OF COURSE, HAVE THE SAME -- IS THE CHANGE -- THE
8 ZONING BYRIGHTS THAT WE HAVE TO INCLUDE HOUSING THAT CAN BE
9 AFFORDABLE TO PEOPLE WHO ARE MEDIUM INCOME, IF WE DID THAT,
10 YOU WOULD AUTOMATICALLY SEE A MASSIVE INCREASE IN ENTRY-LEVEL
11 HOUSING. THE OTHER THING I -- SO -- I MEAN, I JUST WANT TO LAY
12 OUT SOME OF THESE THINGS BECAUSE WE ARE RIGHT, OUR DENSITY --
13 PARTS ARE DENSE ENOUGH WHERE WE THINK WE CAN DO REALLY GOOD
14 WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION BUT ALSO WE ARE NOT QUITE THERE,
15 LIKE, THE PLACE WHERE I GREW UP, BOMBAY, FOR EXAMPLE, HAS
16 TWICE THE POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA BUT ITS POPULATION
17 DENSITY IS LITERALLY 60 TIMES. THAT'S 6-0 TIMES THE POPULATION
18 DENSITY IN THE BAY AREA. SO THE OTHER THING I DO WANT TO POINT
19 OUT IS THE HOUSING. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY
20 DISAPPOINTS ME IN THE WHOLE HOUSING DEBATE AND POLICIES THAT
21 WE WRITE UP IS THAT EVERYTHING, EVERY SINGLE PRETTY MUCH DIME
22 WE ARE SPENDING IS IN RENTAL HOUSING. RENTAL HOUSING I DON'T
23 THINK IS SUPER HELPFUL FOR PEOPLE. AMERICANS ARE NOT A SAVING
24 PEOPLE. IF THEY LIVE IN RENTAL HOUSING THAT MEANS IF YOU LOSE
25 YOUR HOUSING YOU ARE LIKE ONE PAYCHECK FROM BEING HOMELESS.



MAY 24, 2024

1 THAT'S NOT A GOOD THING. WE SHOULD BE FOCUSING MORE ON WAYS TO
2 INCREASE HOMEOWNERSHIP. WE ARE NOT DOING ANYTHING ABOUT THAT.
3 AND ALSO, WHAT HAPPENS IS, YOU KNOW, WE SAY WE WANT IT TO BE
4 AFFORDABLE FOR AREA. THE BAY AREA IS WAY -- HAS A WAY BETTER
5 CLIMATE THAN MOST PLACES IN AMERICA. IT IS WAY MORE BEAUTIFUL
6 IN TERMS OF NATURAL BEAUTY THAN MOST OF THE PLACES IN AMERICA.
7 IF YOU MAKE IT DESIRABLE AND IF YOU MAKE IT AFFORDABLE AND IF
8 YOU MAKE THE POINT OF ENTRY MINIMAL TO NONEXISTENT, WHICH WE
9 DO WHEN WE CATER TO, YOU KNOW, PUT ALL OF OUR EGGS IN
10 SUBSIDIZING AND MAKING AFFORDABLE RENTAL HOUSING, COST TO
11 ENTRY BECOMES ZERO. AND THERE'S ALWAYS GOING TO BE WAY MORE
12 PEOPLE WANTING TO MOVE TO THE BAY AREA THAN WE CAN EVER
13 ACCOMMODATE BECAUSE OF ALL THE OTHER ADVANTAGES THAT WE HAVE.
14 SO I THINK JUST FROM A PRAGMATIC POINT OF VIEW, WE SHOULD MAKE
15 IT AFFORDABLE FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE WILLING TO INVEST IN THE BAY
16 AREA AND THAT INVESTMENT COMES THROUGH THINGS LIKE, YOU KNOW,
17 PEOPLE WHO WANT TO BUY A HOME. YOU DON'T BUY A HOME IN THE
18 FIRST SIX MONTHS, YOU KNOW. SO WE SHOULD TRY TO MAKE IT
19 AFFORDABLE AND A BETTER PLACE FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE INVESTING IN
20 THE BAY AREA RATHER THAN, YOU KNOW, PUTTING ALL OF THE
21 RESOURCES INTO RENTAL HOUSING. THERE ARE A LOT OF OTHER THINGS
22 ABOUT HOUSING POLICIES THAT WE PUSH THAT REALLY I FIND
23 DISCONCERTING BECAUSE I'M A LAWYER AND I KNOW WHAT THE LAW IS
24 AND I THINK WE'RE VIOLATING ALL KINDS OF FAIR HOUSING LAWS
25 BECAUSE THE LAWS THAT WE PUSH REALLY INCREASE RACIAL



MAY 24, 2024

1 SEGREGATION. THEY FAVOR ONE RACE OVER THE OTHER. RENT CONTROL,
2 FOR EXAMPLE, THE SAN FRANCISCO RENT BOARD STUDY MANY YEARS AGO
3 SHOWED THAT IN MARKET RATE HOUSING HAD 54% WHITES, 46%
4 NONWHITES. RENT CONTROL HOUSING HAD 72% WHITES AND ONLY 28%
5 NONWHITES. SO A LOT OF THESE POLICIES ADVANTAGE ONE RACE OVER
6 THE OTHER. THE FOUR CITIES WITH THE STRICTEST RENT CONTROL
7 WERE IN THE TOP FIVE MOST SEGREGATED CITIES IN THE BAY AREA.
8 THESE ARE ALSO SOME OF THE FEW CITIES WHERE THE PERCENTAGE
9 STAYED THE SAME, THE PERCENTAGE OF WHITES IN THE BAY AREA AS A
10 WHOLE HAD DROPPED A LOT. SO THERE ARE REALLY PRETTY MAJOR
11 VIOLATIONS OF THE FAIR HOUSING LAWS AND THERE ARE CERTAIN
12 REASONS, MAINLY THAT JUDGES DON'T RULE ON THE BASIS OF WHAT
13 THE LAW IS, THAT THESE ARE NOT BEING CHALLENGED. BUT THESE ARE
14 VIOLATIONS AND I THINK JUST HELPING RENTAL HOUSING AT THE
15 EXPENSE OF PEOPLE ACTUALLY TRYING TO BUILD THEIR OWN HOME,
16 BRING FINANCIAL STABILITY TO THEIR OWN LIVES, WHICH IS REALLY
17 WHAT WE SHOULD BE GOING FOR AND WE ARE SPENDING ALL THIS MONEY
18 ON OTHER STUFF. SO THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NOW WE'LL HEAR FROM OUR
21 COUNCILMEMBERS JOINING ONLINE. WE'LL START WITH ILAF AND THEN
22 RANDI AND THEN ROLAND.

23

24 **ILAF ESUF:** I JUST WANT -- I JUST HAVE A COUPLE THOUGHTS.
25 SIMILAR TO WHAT OTHER COUNCILMEMBERS SAID, TO THE INFORMATION



MAY 24, 2024

1 ON THE POWERPOINT SEEMS LIKE THE IDEAL SCENARIO BUT I'M NOT
2 SURE IF IT FEELS AS REALISTIC GIVEN CURRENT CIRCUMSTANCES. SO
3 I'M WONDERING IF THERE CAN BE A VERSION OF, THIS IS WHAT WE
4 HOPE WILL HAPPEN, HERE IS A SCENARIO B OF WHAT WE MIGHT SEE.
5 BECAUSE I DO THINK IF WE PUT THIS CURRENT VERSION IN FRONT OF
6 PEOPLE IT MIGHT LEAD TO ANOTHER DISTRESS IF ALL OF THESE
7 POINTS AREN'T HIT. AND THE OTHER POINTS I WANTED TO MAKES WAS
8 CURIOUS FOR SLIDE 12 WHERE IT'S TALKING ABOUT THE ECONOMY. IF
9 WE'RE TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION THAT SOME AREAS MIGHT NOT HAVE
10 INNOVATIVE POLICIES LIKE INCOME OR IF THAT'S A FIXED COMPONENT
11 THAT'S GOING INTO THE ANALYSIS. AND THEN MY SECOND QUESTION
12 WAS FOR THE REGION'S RECOVERY FROM THE PANDEMIC, WHAT ARE WE
13 ENVISIONING FOR SMALLER CITIES? SO AREAS LIKE RICHMOND OR
14 HERCULES, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT DO HAVE ACCESS TO TRANSIT BUT
15 MIGHT NOT HAVE A BUS LANE DOWNTOWN AT THE MOMENT, HOW ARE WE
16 SEEING THE IMPACT THERE?

17

18 **CHIRAG RABARI:** TO ANSWER ONE OF THE EARLIER QUESTIONS WITH
19 REGARDS TO, YOU KNOW, THE ECONOMY AND THE GUARANTEED INCOME.
20 SO THE GUARANTEED INCOME IS ONE OF THE ADOPTED STRATEGIES THAT
21 IS INCLUDED IN THE PLAN. SO YOU KNOW, THE ASSUMPTION IS THERE,
22 YES -- IS, YES, THAT'S A FIXED COMPONENT OF THE ANALYSIS
23 BECAUSE IT WAS PART OF THAT SUITE OF STRATEGIES THAT WAS, YOU
24 KNOW, APPROVED EARLIER -- EARLIER IN THE YEAR. I THINK WITH
25 RESPECT TO THE QUESTION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, RECOVERY FOR, YOU



MAY 24, 2024

1 KNOW, SMALLER -- SMALLER CITIES, I THINK WHAT WE DO SEE IS
2 THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE IMPROVEMENTS, YOU KNOW, ACROSS MANY
3 DISTRICTS REGIONWIDE. A LOT OF THAT IS DUE TO THE POPULATION
4 GROWTH THAT WE SEE FROM TODAY'S LEVELS. AS WELL AS THE
5 INCREASE IN JOBS. BUT IT IS A MIXED PICTURE. I THINK YOU ARE
6 CERTAINLY GOING TO SEE A DIFFERENT STORY IN AREAS OF THE
7 REGION THAT, YOU KNOW, ARE ATTRACTIVE TO, YOU KNOW, THESE
8 HIGH-GROWTH INDUSTRIES THAT MAYBE HAVE A LOT OF OFFICE SPACE
9 AND CAPACITY THAT CAN BE ABSORBED. SO IT'S NOT A CONSISTENT
10 PICTURE THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND I THINK IT'S CERTAINLY
11 SOMETHING THAT COULD BE, YOU KNOW, CONSIDERED FURTHER IN TERMS
12 OF WHAT TYPES OF APPROACHES MIGHT BE BEST CALIBRATED FOR
13 DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, ILAF. RANDI.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. BACK ON WHAT ZACK SAID. FIRST OF ALL,
18 I REALLY APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION, BUT THERE IS -- THERE IS
19 VERY MUCH A TRUST US TYPE OF ATTITUDE FLOWING THROUGH. I THINK
20 THIS COMES ABOUT BECAUSE YOU GUYS ARE HIT DEEP IN REVIEWING
21 THIS FOR THE UMPTEENTH TIME AND REALIGNING IT FOR THE
22 UMPTEENTH TIME AND SO IT'S SOMETHING SO FAMILIAR TO YOU AND
23 IT'S NOT FAMILIAR TO ANYBODY THAT YOU'RE GOING TO BE TALKING
24 TO. SO RECRUITING THEM TO ACTUALLY BE PART OF THE BUILDING OF
25 A SCENARIO IS GOING TO BE IN YOUR BEST INTEREST, EVEN IF



MAY 24, 2024

1 THEY'RE TELLING YOU THINGS THAT YOU ARE ALREADY PLANNING ON
2 DOING. IT'S ALWAYS BETTER TO BE ASKING FOR THEIR ASSISTANCE
3 THAN IT IS TO BE SAYING, THIS IS WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO. AND
4 EVEN PRESENTING THAT THIS IS WHAT WE THINK WE ARE GOING TO DO,
5 WHAT DO YOU THINK, IT CAN BE DONE THAT WAY. I JUST WANT TO
6 DOUBLE DOWN ON WHAT ZACK SAID THERE. I DO WANT TO -- THIS IS
7 KIND OF -- I HAVE NO WAY OF PHRASING THIS IN A WAY -- IN A
8 MANNER THAT'S NOT SNARKY. I WANT TO KNOW WHEN DOWNTOWN SAN
9 JOSE WAS ROBUST AND WHAT METRIC YOU'RE MEASURING THAT BECAUSE
10 THERE HAS NEVER BEEN A TIME WHEN I'VE LIVED HERE FOR DECADES
11 WHEN ANYBODY THOUGHT THAT DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE WAS A ROBUSTLY
12 FUNCTIONING DOWNTOWN. THERE'S EITHER NOT ENOUGH JOBS OR
13 THERE'S NOT ENOUGH PEOPLE LIVING DOWN HERE BUT IT HAS NEVER
14 FUNCTIONED AS AN INTEGRATED -- YEAH, WE HAVE FESTIVALS DOWN
15 HERE AND A BUNCH OF PEOPLE JAM INTO DOWNTOWN AND THEN THEY
16 LEAVE. BUT LAST NIGHT WAS A REALLY GOOD EXAMPLE. WE HAD
17 GRADUATION FOR ONE OF MY COLLEGES. WE FILLED AN AUDITORIUM. WE
18 HAVE AN EVENT GOING ON. EVERYTHING BROKE UP. AND THERE WAS NOT
19 A BODY IN SIGHT AFTER, YOU KNOW, 9:30, 10:00, NOR WOULD THERE
20 HAVE BEEN ON A THURSDAY NIGHT. NOR WOULD THERE HAVE BEEN MUCH
21 WANDERING AROUND. YOU DON'T SEE THE HUSTLE AND BUSTLE OF A
22 DOWNTOWN AS YOU SEE IN OTHER TRUE DOWNTOWNS. AND THERE'S NO
23 COHESIVENESS. AND I WILL TELL YOU WHY AND I WILL TELL YOU WHY
24 WE'RE FAILING OUR G.H.G. GOALS. SAN JOSE HAS A TENDENCY TO --
25 WHEN THINGS ARE TIGHT TO DISAVOW THEIR POLICIES FOR -- THAT



MAY 24, 2024

1 ARE THE -- THE SISTER POLICIES TO -- TO MAKING A COHESIVE SET
2 OF POLICIES THAT WILL ACHIEVE EVERYTHING, TO BALANCE OUR
3 HOUSING, TO BALANCE OUR JOBS IN A CERTAIN AREA, AND TO CREATE
4 GREEN SPACE IN A CERTAIN AREA, TO CREATE A BICYCLE NETWORK, TO
5 CREATE THE AMENITIES WHERE PEOPLE CAN REALLY WALK TO SOMEPLACE
6 WITHIN 15 MINUTES AND WHERE EVERYBODY FEELS COMFORTABLE
7 BECAUSE -- THROW OUT THE POLICIES. IN ORDER TO GAIN HOUSING,
8 THEY THROW THEM OUT. AND IN THIS CASE, I THINK WHAT WE DO NOT
9 CONCENTRATE ENOUGH ARE THE SISTER POLICIES. IT DOESN'T DO US
10 ANY GOOD TO TALK ABOUT HOUSING AND TO TALK ABOUT JOB GROWTH IF
11 WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT HOW TO MAINTAIN THE GOALS OF
12 EVERYTHING ELSE THAT GOES ALONG WITH IT. SO I HAVE GREAT
13 CONCERNS ABOUT THAT. IF YOU'RE NOT GOING TO BE BUILDING OR
14 MAINTAINING OPEN SPACE WITHIN MILES OF A PLACE, THEN PEOPLE
15 ARE GOING TO BE GETTING IN THEIR CARS AND GO SOMEPLACE. PEOPLE
16 CAN'T GET GROCERIES, THEY'RE GOING TO GET IN THEIR CAR. SO I
17 JUST WANT US TO BE REALLY AWARE OF THAT, THAT WE'RE NOT PAYING
18 AS MUCH ATTENTION TO THE NEEDS THAT WOULD FILL THIS GAP HERE.
19 SO THAT CONCERNS ME. AND FOR THE MAPS THAT SHOW THE GROWTH
20 PATTERNS OR THE PROJECTED GROWTH PATTERNS, YOU MAY BE ABLE TO
21 DO THAT IN OTHER COUNTIES, BUT YOU GET A LOT OF HARD-HEADED
22 PEOPLE DOWN HERE WHO ARE GOING TO SEE THAT AS -- THEY SEE A
23 LOT OF HOUSING BEING BUILT OR APPROVED DOWN HERE AND NOTHING
24 TO SHOW FOR IT. OUR HOMELESS NUMBERS ARE GROWING. THE HOUSING
25 THAT'S BEING BUILT ISN'T ADDRESSING THAT. AND IN FACT, IT'S



MAY 24, 2024

1 JUST MAKING IT WORSE AS FAR AS I CAN SEE. AND SO I JUST WANT -
2 - I JUST WANT US TO BE AWARE OF THE FACT THAT -- THAT HOUSING
3 AND JOB GROWTH ARE NOT OUR ONLY TWO GOALS THAT WE SHOULD BE
4 LOOKING AT HERE. AND THAT WE'RE KIND OF STABBING OURSELVES IN
5 THE FOOT AND WE WON'T MAKE IT ANYWHERE. SO OKAY. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, RANDI. ROLAND.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF. ROLAND. YOU
10 HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

12 **ROLAND WONG:** IS IT OKAY NOW?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YEP. GOOD TO GO.

15

16 **ROLAND WONG:** OKAY. SORRY. YES -- YEAH, I DON'T OFTEN SPEAK
17 BECAUSE SOMETIMES I DON'T KNOW WHAT TO SAY. BUT IT'S RELATED
18 TO TRANSPORTATION. RECENTLY, I HAD TO GO FOR, LIKE, A MEDICAL
19 APPOINTMENT AND REALIZING IT'S IN REDWOOD CITY AND I LIVE IN
20 THE EAST BAY IN HAYWARD SO -- AND I RELY ON, YOU KNOW, PUBLIC
21 TRANSIT. SO IT WAS A PRETTY ROUGH WAY OF, YOU KNOW, THE
22 ROUNDABOUT OF GETTING -- GETTING THERE FROM HAYWARD. LET'S
23 SEE. I WAS TRYING TO USE THE TRIP PLANNERS OF ALL DIFFERENT
24 AGENCIES. YOU KNOW, IT'S ALMOST LIKE FIVE DIFFERENT AGENCIES.
25 A.C. TRANSIT, UNION CITY, EMPIRE BRIDGE. YOU KNOW, A BUS. AND



MAY 24, 2024

1 THEN, YOU KNOW, EITHER HAD TO TAKE CAL TRAIN AND THEN SAM
2 TRANS AND THEN READY WHEELS, PARATRANSIT. AND IT WAS JUST SO
3 HARD TO PLAN. AND MANY OF THESE AGENCIES SOMETIMES, DEPENDING
4 ON THE TIME OF DAY, YOU KNOW -- YOU KNOW, LIKE CAL TRANS DON'T
5 RUN. SOMETIMES IT'S LIKE 45 MINUTES TO 60-MINUTE INTERVALS. SO
6 IF YOU MISS THE TRAIN, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE UP THE CREEK, YOU
7 KNOW, AND TRYING TO GET ANOTHER CONNECTION -- IN TRYING TO GET
8 ANOTHER CORRECTION AND TRYING TO USE THE PARATRANSIT
9 INTERCOUNTY SERVICE OR PROGRAM, IT JUST DIDN'T SEEM TO WORK
10 OUT, YOU KNOW, BECAUSE I -- YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE TO RELY ON ONE
11 AND THEN THE OTHER AND MAKING SURE THAT IT'S ON TIME. SO IT
12 WAS PRETTY STRESSFUL. SO WHAT I END UP DOING INSTEAD OF DOING
13 FROM THE EAST BAY DIRECTLY AND HAVING NOT TO TRAVEL BART, YOU
14 KNOW, LOOP FROM HAYWARD TO MILLBRAE AND THEN TRANSFERRING. SO
15 WHAT I DO TO EASE MY STRESS LEVEL [LAUGHTER] IS TAKING A.C.
16 TRANSIT AND THEN BART FROM HAYWARD TO MILLBRAE AND THEN TAKING
17 READY WHEELS, YOU KNOW, FROM MILLBRAE BOX STATION SO I'M JUST
18 SHARING MY EXPERIENCE AND HOW WE COULD IMPROVE THE SERVICE,
19 YOU KNOW, AND TRYING TO CONNECT EVERYTHING TOGETHER SO THAT,
20 YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WHO RELY ON, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT, YOU KNOW,
21 THAT YOU DON'T HAVE TO GO THROUGH SO MANY, YOU KNOW, AGENCIES,
22 YOU KNOW, TO KEEP ON TRANSFERRING, YOU KNOW. IT WAS JUST A
23 LITTLE BIT TOO MUCH. AND YOU KNOW, UNFORTUNATELY, IT WAS JUST
24 THE -- BASICALLY THE DOCTOR I NEEDED TO GO, YOU KNOW, HE ONLY
25 PRACTICES IN REDWOOD CITY. AND MAYBE I HAVE A DIFFERENT OPTION



MAY 24, 2024

1 BUT -- BUT ANYWAY, IT'S JUST -- I'M JUST SHARING MY EXPERIENCE
2 AND I DON'T WANT TO SOUND I'M COMPLAINING. AND IT'S -- YOU
3 KNOW, IT'S -- IT'S ALL THROUGH EXPERIENCE AND, YOU KNOW, I
4 JUST KIND OF LIKE TO SEE HOW WE CAN IMPROVE SOME OF THESE
5 THINGS SO PEOPLE COULD RELY -- AT LEAST A BETTER SERVICE.
6 THAT'S BASICALLY MY COMMENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
7 LISTENING.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER HANDS
10 ONLINE THAT I MISSED?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ONLY FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. SO WE'LL FINISH UP WITH THE CHAIR.
15 VICE CHAIR BALDINI.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANKS
18 FOR THE PRESENTATION. COUPLE THINGS THAT COME TO MIND, I LIKE
19 THE IDEA OF OWNERSHIP. ONE OF THE VEHICLES WE GET TO WHERE
20 WE'RE GOING, ETC., ETC., I HAVE A CONCERN ABOUT INTEREST
21 RATES. ON -- I THINK THE EMPLOYMENT, THE MIX HAS CHANGED
22 DRASTICALLY IN 50 YEARS WHILE WE WERE BUILDING NUCLEAR
23 SUBMARINES ON MAYOR ISLAND, EMPLOYING 39,000 BLUE-COLLAR JOBS
24 THAT HAD THE MONEY TO BUY HOUSES AND THINGS LIKE THAT. THAT'S
25 JUST ONE FACILITY. AND THEN YOU HAD UPRIVER, PIPE MILL, AND SO



MAY 24, 2024

1 ON AND SO FORTH. AND NOW EVERY CITY, EVERY COUNTY WANTS CLEAN
2 JOBS. AND WHAT WE'VE DONE IS JUST MOVE THE G.H.G. PROBLEM
3 SOMEPLACE ELSE. WE HAVEN'T SOLVED IT. WE JUST MOVED IT. FOR
4 INSTANCE, I'VE BEEN IN THE WINE BUSINESS. THE CROP REPORT,
5 NAPA VALLEY AND SONOMA COUNTY CAME OUT. THE TOTAL TONNAGE
6 WHICH IS SMALL WHEN IT COMES TO CALIFORNIA RESULTED IN
7 PROBABLY 22 -- EXCUSE ME -- 16,000 TRUCKLOADS JUST TO GET IT
8 TO THE WINERY OR PROCESSING AND WINE IS PROBABLY THE ONLY
9 MANUFACTURED THING THAT WE PRODUCE HERE IN THE BAY AREA. WHEN
10 YOU CONSIDER IT FROM START TO FINISH. THAT ALSO RESULTED IN
11 THE NECESSITY FOR 282 MILLION BOTTLES THAT USED TO BE PRODUCED
12 HERE LOCALLY BUT, NO, NOT IN OUR BACK-YARDS. WE MOVED IT TO
13 CHINA. AND SO NOW WE'RE WAITING FOR A SHIP, 13,000 CONTAINER
14 UNITS, 13,000 TRUCKS THAT ARE GOING TO DELIVER TO THE WINERY.
15 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ELECTRICITY. WE USED TO BE ONE OF THE
16 LARGEST PRODUCERS IN THE WORLD OF COPPER. NOW IT HAS TO COME
17 FROM SOMEPLACE ELSE AT A FACILITY THAT THEY DON'T CARE ABOUT
18 THEIR LABOR, THEY DON'T CARE ABOUT THEIR POLLUTION. THEY DON'T
19 CARE ABOUT ANYTHING. BUT WE GET IT FROM THERE RATHER THAN
20 SOLVING THE PROBLEM. YOU GO INTO STEEL, BOX PORT, EVERYTHING
21 ELSE, NOT IN OUR BACKYARDS. WITH THAT HIGH-PAYING JOBS THAT
22 COULD AFFORD THE HOUSING THAT WAS AVAILABLE TO THEM IN NAPA.
23 SO BACK TO THE NORTH -- NORTH COAST OR THE NORTH BAY, THERE'S
24 NO CONNECTIVITY TO ANYTHING UP THERE. SO AN AREA WHICH HAS
25 PLUS LAND, IF YOU WILL, THERE IS NO TRANSPORTATION. AGAIN,



MAY 24, 2024

1 WE'VE ELIMINATED -- ONE TIME A CRUST PLATFORM FERRY TO
2 ELECTRIC TRAIN CONNECTION IN SAUSALITO, BUT I DON'T KNOW IF
3 ANYTHING WILL COME BACK TO THAT TO SOME EXTENT. AGAIN, THE
4 TRUST THAT'S BEEN MENTIONED BY MY COLLEAGUES BEFORE. AND I
5 WANT TO SEE THE PLAN AND HOW IT'S GOING TO WORK, BUT IT -- YOU
6 KNOW, AGAIN, GREENHOUSE CARS, THAT 16-YEAR-OLD KID STILL WANTS
7 HIS OWN CAR. AS I WAS STOPPED ON THE BRIDGE TODAY, THERE WAS A
8 -- REMNANTS AND THE TIRES THAT SOMEBODY WAS PLAYING OUT IN THE
9 MIDDLE OF THE BAY BRIDGE. YOU KNOW, SO THAT'S STILL GOING TO
10 BE ASPIRATIONAL. GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS. THE MONEY
11 SPENT ON THE I-80, THAT COULD BE USED TO CONNECT THE REST OF
12 THE BAY AREA. SO WE COULD USE THAT. DWAYNE, MY COLLEAGUE, IN
13 SOLANO, REQUEST, WE'RE JUST PUTTING IT FARTHER OUT THERE. WE
14 FOUND IN NAPA COUNTY THROUGH A REPORT -- I SIT ON A CITIZENS
15 ADVISORY COMMITTEE UP THERE. MOST OF OUR TRAFFIC WAS GENERATED
16 BY WHOLE FOODS OF SHOPPING CENTER. THE OTHER PART OF IT WAS
17 THE FOLKS COMING IN TO TASTE THE WINE AND, AGAIN, THERE'S NO
18 WAY OF GETTING THERE. AND THE OTHERS, IT'S THAT HOUSEHOLD THAT
19 THEY DON'T WANT TO LIVE IN NAPA. THEY WANT TO LIVE IN SOLANO
20 COUNTY BECAUSE SOMEBODY ELSE IS COMMUTING FROM SACRAMENTO AND
21 SOMEONE ELSE IS COMMUTING TO NAPA. SO IT'S THAT -- IT'S THAT
22 CHOICE. SO WE'RE NOT ADDRESSING THAT, BUT WE PROBABLY COULD
23 THROUGH A CONNECTED NETWORK TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THANK YOU.
24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU FOR THIS ITEM. WE HAD SOME
2 GREAT CONVERSATION AND LOOK FORWARD TO REVISITING THIS ITEM IN
3 THE FUTURE AND SEEING HOW OUR COUNCILMEMBERS' SUGGESTIONS AND
4 FEEDBACK GETS IMPLEMENTED. A LOT OF MY THOUGHTS HAVE BEEN
5 SHARED AND I'LL JUST REITERATE MY BIGGEST QUESTION WHEN I WAS
6 REVIEWING THE MATERIAL WAS, HOW DOES HOUSING BECOME CHEAPER
7 OVER TIME? AND THIS IS VERY REAL FOR ME AND MY GENERATION. I
8 WANT TO CONTINUE LIVING IN THE BAY AREA. THIS IS WHERE MY
9 FAMILY IS. AND I'M CURIOUS ABOUT WHAT THOSE SPECIFIC PUBLIC
10 POLICIES AND WHAT IMPLEMENTATION IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE TO MAKE
11 SURE THAT WE ARE DELIVERING ON OUR BELIEF THAT WE CAN MAKE
12 HOUSING BECOME CHEAPER. GUARANTEED BASIC INCOME IS A POLICY
13 THAT'S PROVEN TO WORK, BUT IF WE DON'T FIND A WAY TO MAKE THAT
14 HAPPENING IN EVERY COUNTY, I'M NOT SURE HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET
15 THERE. SO I HOPE THAT WHEN WE SEE THIS AGAIN WE GET ANSWERS TO
16 THOSE QUESTIONS. AND JUST A QUICK QUESTION. THE FUNDING FOR
17 SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS IS ANTICIPATED TO COME FROM A
18 SUCCESSFUL REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE, AND ARE THERE, LIKE,
19 BACKUP REVENUE SOURCES IF -- IF THAT DOESN'T PASS?

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS, CHAIR
22 CAMPOS. I THINK ONE THING THAT IS IMPORTANT TO -- TO NOTE WITH
23 RESPECT TO THE PLAN'S HOUSING ELEMENT, IT IS A VISIONARY
24 ELEMENT. OVER THE COURSE OF MULTIPLE PLAN CYCLES, WHAT WE
25 FOUND IS OUR PLANS WERE NOT MAKING PROGRESS TOWARDS



MAY 24, 2024

1 AFFORDABILITY. SO IN THE LAST PLAN, PLAN BAY AREA 2050, THERE
2 WAS A LOT OF INTEREST IN FIGURING OUT WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO
3 ACHIEVE AN AFFORDABLE REGION FOR EVERYONE THAT LIVES HERE,
4 INCLUDING LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS, INCLUDING, YOU KNOW, THE
5 UNHOUSED? AND WHAT THAT LED TO WAS THAT, YOU KNOW, A
6 QUANTIFICATION OF THE COST TO PRESERVE ALL AT-RISK AFFORDABLE
7 HOUSING UNITS, A QUANTIFICATION OF THE COST TO PRODUCE THE
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEEDED AT ALL INCOME LEVELS. SO WHEN
9 CONSIDERING THE, YOU KNOW, THE POLICIES AND THE STRATEGIES AND
10 THE PLAN FOR HOUSING, IT'S REALLY, WHAT WOULD IT TAKE TO
11 ACHIEVE THAT GOAL IN THE FUTURE? AND, YOU KNOW, THE COST --
12 THE ANSWER IS THAT IT WOULD TAKE A LOT OF MONEY, YOU KNOW,
13 SOMETHING ON THE ORDER OF \$500 BILLION. SO WHEN WE'RE TALKING
14 ABOUT THE OUTCOMES AND PLAN IN TERMS OF IMPROVED AFFORDABILITY
15 IT'S -- WHAT IF WE WERE TO DIRECT \$500 BILLION-PLUS TOWARDS,
16 YOU KNOW, AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION, AFFORDABLE HOUSING
17 PRESERVATION, ALONG WITH OTHER SUPPLEMENTARY POLICIES, SUCH AS
18 INCLUSIONARY HOUSING REQUIREMENTS, RENTER PROTECTIONS, RENT
19 CONTROL, AND SO FORTH? IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, HOW THAT WOULD
20 BE PAID FOR, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF MONEY WE
21 WOULD ANTICIPATE THAT WOULD COME FROM EXISTING REVENUE
22 SOURCES. MAYBE SOMETHING ON THE ORDER OF \$150 BILLION, BUT THE
23 REST WOULD HAVE TO COME FROM SOME MIX OF NEW REVENUE SOURCES.
24 AND IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PLAN, WE DON'T -- WE DON'T
25 NECESSARILY IDENTIFY WHAT THOSE SOURCES ARE. WE'RE SORT OF



MAY 24, 2024

1 SAYING IT SHOULD BE SOME MIX OF FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL,
2 LOCAL DOLLARS THAT ARE GOING TO HELP FILL THAT GAP. AND I
3 THINK, YOU KNOW, THE VERY IMPORTANT WORK THAT -- WORD I HEARD
4 YOU USE WAS "IMPLEMENTATION", RIGHT? I THINK WHAT WE'RE
5 SHOWING WITH THESE POLICIES AND THESE INVESTMENTS, THESE ARE
6 THE TYPES -- THIS IS THE TYPE OF FUTURE THAT WE CAN ACHIEVE.
7 WE CAN GET THERE IF WE IMPLEMENT THESE POLICIES AND
8 INVESTMENTS. THE IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION THEN IS
9 IMPLEMENTATION, RIGHT? LIKE, WHAT -- WHAT DO WE NEED TO DO IN
10 THE NEXT YEAR OR TWO YEARS OR FIVE YEARS IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE
11 THIS -- THIS VISION 25, 30 YEARS IN THE FUTURE? SO I THINK
12 THAT'S REALLY THE FOCUS OF THE FINAL PHASE OF THE PLAN, THE
13 LAST YEAR OF THE PLANNING PROCESS IS REALLY GOING TO BE
14 LOOKING AT DEVELOPING A DETAILED IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, REALLY
15 TRYING TO ASSESS, WHAT ARE THE ACTUAL BARRIERS THAT EXIST TO
16 IMPLEMENT THESE POLICIES? WHAT TYPES OF, YOU KNOW, FUNDING
17 MEASURES WOULD NEED TO BE PUSHED FORWARD? YOU KNOW, THE LAST
18 PLAN, ONE OF THE MAJOR IMPLEMENTATION ACTION ITEMS WAS TO PUT
19 A REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE ON BALLOT AND HOPEFULLY THAT
20 HAPPENS THIS -- THIS YEAR AND WE HAVE SOME SUCCESS, BUT THAT
21 WILL JUST BE, YOU KNOW, ONE STEP AMONG MANY OVER THE COURSE
22 OF, YOU KNOW, A GENERATION IN ORDER TO REALLY FILL THAT GAP.
23 SO HOPEFULLY THAT ADDRESSES SOME OF YOUR -- YOUR QUESTIONS AND
24 CONCERNS.
25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES. THANK YOU FOR THAT. AND TO THE
2 POINT OF IMPLEMENTATION, I THINK WHAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY
3 IMPORTANT FOR THIS PLAN TO COME TO FRUITION IS WHAT HAPPENS
4 LOCALLY. WE REALLY NEED THE BUY-IN FROM ALL OF OUR BAY AREA
5 TOWNS, CITIES, COUNTIES TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE ADDRESSING A
6 PROBLEM THAT IS REGIONAL BECAUSE REGIONALLY WE HAVE A HOUSING
7 CRISIS, WE HAVE A LACK OF CONNECTED TRANSPORTATION,
8 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND SO WE NEED TO BE WORKING TOGETHER TO
9 ADDRESS THOSE NEEDS. AND I KNOW THAT WE, ON THIS COUNCIL, SEE
10 IT, I HEAR IT, I FEEL IT IN THE CONVERSATIONS WE HAVE AND WE
11 NEED TO TAKE THAT ENERGY BACK TO THE COMMUNITIES THAT WE
12 REPRESENT AND MAKE SURE THAT COMMUNITY MEMBERS, ELECTED
13 OFFICIALS, LEADERS ARE ALSO WORKING TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THIS
14 BECAUSE I THINK LOCALLY IS WHERE WE KEEP RUNNING INTO THOSE
15 ISSUES WHERE WE THINK REALLY WONDERFULLY, A BEAUTIFUL VISION
16 FOR OUR REGION AND THEN ONE COUNTY CAN'T GET ONBOARD OR, ETC.,
17 AND WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE WE ARE REALLY WORKING
18 TOGETHER. ESPECIALLY BECAUSE LOCAL MUNICIPALITIES HAVE THE
19 LOCAL CONTROL OVER THEIR ZONING AND LAND USE. AND THAT'S, YOU
20 KNOW, WHERE I REALLY THINK ABOUT HOW WE CAN BE TRANSFORMATIVE
21 IN ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING CRISIS. ONE EXAMPLE THAT I HAVE
22 HEARD RECENTLY IS FARM WORKER HOUSING AND GIVEN THAT A LOT OF
23 THEIR TIME IS SPENT WORKING IN AGRICULTURAL ZONED LAND, WHAT
24 CAN WE DO TO ALLOW FOR WORKER HOUSING THAT'S ON THAT
25 AGRICULTURAL LAND THAT DOESN'T HAVE TO GO THROUGH SO MANY



MAY 24, 2024

1 HOOPS AND RED TAPE TO COME TO FRUITION BECAUSE WE SAW NOT TOO
2 LONG AGO IN ONE OF OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES HOW IMPACTFUL IT IS
3 FOR OUR FARM WORKERS NOT HAVE DIGNIFIED HOUSING THAT THEY CAN
4 AFFORD AND ACCESS. AND SO WE ALL KNOW HOW DIRE THE SITUATION
5 IS. ANOTHER FOCUS I SAW WAS IN JOBS. AND I'M VERY CONCERNED TO
6 HEAR THAT THE DATA IS JUST IN GENERAL JOBS AND IT DOESN'T
7 MATTER ONE JOB TO PERSON BECAUSE WE REALLY SHOULD BE STRIVING
8 FOR ONE JOB TO BE SUFFICIENT FOR EACH INDIVIDUAL TO BE ABLE TO
9 HOUSE THEMSELVES IN THE COMMUNITY THAT THEY'RE WORKING IN. IF
10 -- I THINK THE SILICON VALLEY AND THE BAY AREA WITH OUR WEALTH
11 THAT WE BRING TO NOT JUST THE STATE BUT THE WORLD THAT WE HAVE
12 THE CAPACITY TO MAKE THIS A REALITY. BUT RIGHT NOW THE REALITY
13 IS THAT THOSE IN-PERSON JOBS, WHICH COME ON A SPECTRUM OF IN-
14 OFFICE WORK OR HEALTH CARE, MAIL CARRIERS, FAST FOOD, I'VE
15 HEARD FROM FOLKS IN MY GENERATION THAT THOSE AREN'T THE KIND
16 OF JOBS THAT THEY WANT. AND SO WE REALLY NEED TO BE THINKING
17 ABOUT HOW WE'RE MAKING LIFE OVERALL BETTER FOR INDIVIDUALS,
18 MAKING HOUSING MORE AFFORDABLE SO THAT PEOPLE HAVE MORE
19 FREEDOM TO CHOOSE JOBS SO PEOPLE DON'T HAVE TO BE TIED DOWN TO
20 THREE DIFFERENT JOBS JUST TO MAKE A LIVING. AND WE ALSO WANT
21 TO MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE ARE STAYING IN THIS COMMUNITY AND NOT
22 MOVING AWAY TO A PLACE WHERE IT'S CHEAPER TO AFFORD THE COST
23 OF LIVING. MAYBE THEY CAN EARN A LITTLE MORE INCOME. AND SO I
24 THINK THAT THE MAIN STICKING POINT THAT I HEARD BROUGHT UP
25 FROM OTHER COUNCILMEMBERS THAT I THINK PLAN BAY AREA 2050+



MAY 24, 2024

1 REALLY NEEDS FOR IT TO BE SUCCESSFUL IS THE COMMUNICATION
2 CAMPAIGN ABOUT HOW WE ALL BENEFIT FROM THIS, NOT JUST HOW
3 REGION'S GOING TO BENEFIT OR ONE AREA BUT REALLY HOW BUILDING
4 HOUSING IN SANTA CLARA IS GOING TO BENEFIT PEOPLE IN SONOMA,
5 HOW BUILDING TRANSIT IN MARIN IS GOING TO BENEFIT PEOPLE IN
6 NAPA. AND X, Y, AND Z. BECAUSE WE JUST HEARD FROM EACH OF OUR
7 COUNCILMEMBERS THAT WE ALL HAVE DIVERSE NEEDS AND THAT'S
8 DEPENDENT ON WHAT COMMUNITY WE LIVE IN OR WHAT INDIVIDUAL
9 ABILITIES WE HAVE. AND THAT JUST MEANS THAT WE HAVE A NEED FOR
10 ALL OF OUR COMMUNITIES TO BE ROBUST COMMUNITIES WITH ENOUGH
11 HOUSING, WITH ENOUGH JOBS, WITH ENOUGH COMMUNITY SERVICES SO
12 THAT WE CAN REMAIN LOCALLY IF WE WANT BUT ALSO HAVE THAT
13 FREEDOM TO TRAVEL REGIONALLY TO MEET OUR NEEDS THROUGHOUT THE
14 BAY AREA. SO THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR LISTENING TO ALL OUR
15 COMMENTS AND I LOOK FORWARD TO OUR NEXT CONVERSATION. MOVING
16 US ALONG FOR --

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU. IS
21 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. THERE IS THERE ARE TWO HANDS RAISED
24 IN ZOOM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.



MAY 24, 2024

1 FIRST IS CHRISTINE FITZGERALD FOLLOWED BY WARREN CUSHMAN. YOU
2 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **CHRIS FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. SO REALLY QUICKLY,
5 TOUCHED ON MANY BOOKS ON THE IMPORTANCE OF -- ON THE
6 IMPORTANCE OF BEING ABLE TO HAVE FARMLAND AVAILABLE FOR FOLKS
7 AND DEFINITELY MAKING SURE THAT THE HOUSING, THE FOLKS THAT DO
8 THESE JOBS HAVE COMFORTABLE, AFFORDABLE PLACES TO LIVE THAT
9 ARE CLEAN AND EFFICIENT. SAME THING THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA.
10 WE'RE LOOKING AT HOUSING FOR LOW INCOME AND SEVERELY LOW-
11 INCOME FOLKS. WE NEED TO LOOK AT TURNKEY PROGRAMS. WE NEED TO
12 LOOK AT DIVERSIFYING THE PROCESS AND MAKING IT MORE EQUITABLE
13 FOR ALL.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. NEXT UP IS WARREN
16 CUSHMAN. WARREN, GO AHEAD, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I CAN HEAR YOU NOW. I WILL START THE
21 TIME.

22

23 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** SO, HELLO, MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL. THIS IS
24 WARREN CUSHMAN DOING IT REMOTELY TODAY. COMMUNITY RESOURCES
25 FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING. FIRST ALL, I WANT TO AGREE WITH THE



MAY 24, 2024

1 CHAIR. I THINK THAT ALL POLITICS IS LOCAL. I THINK THAT
2 EVERYBODY NEEDS TO COME TO THE TABLE WHEN IT COMES TO
3 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. I THINK THAT ELECTED OFFICIALS, COMMUNITY
4 ACTIVISTS, EVERYONE INVOLVED NEEDS TO COME TOGETHER AND POLICY
5 MAKE AROUND THIS ISSUE. THERE ARE VERY DIFFICULT, THORNY
6 ISSUES INVOLVED. IF WE TAKE THINGS LIKE TENANT PROTECTIONS.
7 WE'RE FACING TENANT PROTECTIONS RIGHT HERE IN ALAMEDA COUNTY
8 RIGHT NOW. I WAS JUST AT A MEETING LAST NIGHT AROUND IT. VERY
9 IMPACTFUL STORIES. THAT IS A HODGEPODGE ISSUE --

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** 10 SECONDS.

12

13 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** REALLY NEEDS TO BE DEALT WITH. LET'S KEEP IT
14 GOING. LET'S PUT THE BAHFA HOUSING ON YOUR AGENDA.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF
17 THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT ITEM IS AGENDA
20 ITEM 6-B. WE WILL BE HEARING FROM REBECCA LONG TO PRESENT THIS
21 ITEM FOR INFORMATION AND JUST SO WE ALL KNOW THAT WE DO WANT
22 TO GO THROUGH THIS ITEM QUICKLY BECAUSE WE HAVE REBECCA UNTIL
23 1:15. SO IF WE WANT TO GET ALL OUR QUESTIONS ANSWERED, LET'S
24 TRY TO GET OUR COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS IN QUICKLY. THANK YOU.

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CAMPOS. GOOD AFTERNOON, POLICY
2 ADVISORY COUNCIL. SO THERE'S A COUPLE OF ATTACHMENTS ON THIS
3 ITEM IN YOUR AGENDA. QUITE A LOT OF ACTIVITY HAS BEEN GOING ON
4 WITH THIS BILL IN THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS INCLUDING THIS
5 MORNING. THE BILL DID PASS THE SENATE FLOOR BY A VOTE OF 26-
6 10. THERE WAS ONE NO VOTE FROM THE BAY AREA FROM SENATOR
7 CORTESE. AND NOW IT MOVES ONTO THE ASSEMBLY AND ITS FIRST STOP
8 THERE IS ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE. ALSO THIS WEEK,
9 SEEMS LIKE MORE THAN TWO DAYS AGO, THE COMMISSION HAD A ROBUST
10 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE BILL. SIGNIFICANT AMENDMENTS WERE MADE
11 LAST WEEK AND YOU'LL SEE IN YOUR PACKET THERE'S KIND OF A
12 SUMMARY SHEET THAT HIGHLIGHTS SOME OF THOSE AMENDS AND THEN
13 THERE'S A TABLE THAT HAS MORE DETAILS WITH SPECIFIC CROSS-
14 REFERENCES. THE COMMISSION RAISED A NUMBER OF CONCERNS WITH
15 THE AMENDMENTS THAT WERE MADE AND, AS YOU KNOW, M.T.C. IS THE
16 BILL'S SPONSOR BUT WE ARE NOT NECESSARILY HAVING A SAY IN ALL
17 THE AMENDMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE. AND SO, YOU KNOW, SOME OF
18 THE ONES THAT WERE ESPECIALLY CONCERNING, INCLUDE --
19 INCREASING THE RETURN TO SOURCE TO 90% IN YEAR SIX AND IN
20 PERPETUITY AFTER THAT. THIS DOES UNDERMINE THE ABILITY TO
21 FULLY SOLVE THE FISCAL CLIFF. SO THAT IS A CONCERN. A
22 ADDITIONALLY, THE BILL MANDATES A CAPITAL PROJECT TO OUR LONG-
23 RANGE PLAN AND THAT'S VERY UNUSUAL. SO YOU JUST HEARD THE
24 PRESENTATION FROM CHIRAG ABOUT PLAN BAY AREA 2050+. THE BILL
25 NOW SAYS THAT M.T.C. MUST ADD SMART TO CLOVERDALE TO THE



MAY 24, 2024

1 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN BY APRIL OF NEXT YEAR. AND THIS
2 PROJECT, YOU KNOW, IS NOT CURRENTLY IN THE PLAN. IT IS A QUITE
3 EXPENSIVE PROJECT AND, YOU KNOW, STAFF HAVE REVIEWED IT
4 PREVIOUSLY. I'LL JUST LEAVE IT THERE. IT'S NOT CURRENTLY IN
5 THE PLAN AND THE BILL WOULD MANDATE THAT IT BE ADDED. SO THAT
6 WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS BROUGHT UP AT THE COMMISSION
7 DISCUSSION. AND LET'S SEE. ADDITIONALLY, THE BILL NOW REQUIRES
8 A MAJORITY OF THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES TO APPROVE A
9 BALLOT EXPENDITURE PLAN BEFORE THE COMMISSION CAN PUT A
10 MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. AND SO IT'S KIND OF STRUCTURED TO SAY,
11 A MAJORITY OF THOSE COUNTIES WHERE IT WILL APPEAR HAVE TO
12 APPROVE IT, AND A MAJORITY OF THE POPULATION THAT'S
13 REPRESENTED. SO YOU'D KIND OF HAVE A DOUBLE MAJORITY BEFORE
14 THE COMMISSION COULD PROCEED WITH THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.
15 THE BILL ALSO DEFERS MARIN AND SONOMA FROM ANY MEASURE IN
16 2026. THEY COULD NOT BE PART OF A MEASURE UNTIL 2028, AND THE
17 RATIONALE THERE IS LOOKING AT THE SMART SALES TAX WHICH IS SET
18 TO EXPIRE IN 2029. AND THEN IF SMART -- MARIN AND SONOMA ARE
19 BROUGHT INTO A TAX IN 2028 AND THEY WERE NOT SUCCESSFUL
20 RENEWING THE SMART SALES TAX, THE REGIONAL MEASURE WOULD HAVE
21 TO BACKFILL FOR THE SMART SALES TAX, WHICH WOULD BE SUBJECT TO
22 THE RETURN-TO-SOURCE. SO FUNDING GOING TO MARIN AND SONOMA TO
23 BACKFILL FOR THE SMART SALES TAX WOULD BE COUNTED TOWARDS
24 THEIR 90% RETURN-TO-SOURCE. SO ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S BEEN
25 SAID ABOUT THIS BILL PREVIOUSLY IS THAT IT'S QUITE COMPLEX. I



MAY 24, 2024

1 THINK IT'S EVEN MORE COMPLEX NOW. YOU KNOW, YOU NEED -- YOU
2 NEED EXTENSIVE DIAGRAM AND SPREADSHEETS TO FOLLOW THE NUMBERS.
3 BUT YOU KNOW, TOP LINE, AGAIN, IS THE CONCERN THAT IN TERMS OF
4 THE COMMISSION'S -- ONE OF THE COMMISSION'S CORE GOALS OF
5 ADDRESSING THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF, YOU KNOW, IT WON'T FULLY
6 DO THAT WITH THIS CURRENT STRUCTURE. AND I THINK I WILL JUST
7 LEAVE IT THERE. AGAIN, WE ARE GLAD THAT IT IS IN THE ASSEMBLY,
8 BUT THERE'S A LOT OF WORK TO BE DONE. ANOTHER THING THAT WAS
9 SHARED AT THE COMMISSION MEETING LAST WEEK IS JUST AN INTEREST
10 IN COMING BACK TO THE COMMISSION SOON TO, YOU KNOW, REALLY
11 REVISIT KIND OF A RETURN TO WHAT ARE WE TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN
12 THIS BILL? ARE THERE AMENDMENTS THAT COULD BE MADE TO THIS
13 BILL THAT WOULD STILL WARRANT THE COMMISSION BEING IN SUPPORT
14 OF IT? SHOULD THERE BE A NEW BILL? I THINK ALL CARDS ARE ON
15 THE TABLE AND, YOU KNOW, THERE'S JUST A LOT OF CONCERN RIGHT
16 NOW. SO WITH THAT I WILL CLOSE AND SEE WHAT QUESTIONS OR
17 COMMENTS FOLKS HAVE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. A GENTLE REMINDER, WE HAVE 30
20 MINUTES FOR A WONDERFUL AND ROBUST CONVERSATION. AND I WILL
21 START TO MY RIGHT WITH DIANA AND THEN WILLIAM.

22

23 **DIANA BENITEZ THANK YOU. I HAVE NO COMMENTS.**

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 >>**WILLIAM GOODWIN:** THANK YOU. I NOTICE THERE ARE 40 OR 50
2 ORGANIZATIONS THAT SUPPORT THIS BILL IF AMENDED AND I'M
3 WONDERING IF THERE IS SOME ALIGNMENT ACROSS THESE
4 ORGANIZATIONS WITH THEIR REQUEST FOR AMENDMENTS THAT WE COULD
5 GET ONBOARD AND PUSH THROUGH AND GET AMENDED IN THIS BILL SO
6 WE GET THEIR SUPPORT BECAUSE IT FEELS LIKE LOW-HANGING FRUIT.
7 AND THESE ARE REALLY INFLUENTIAL ORGANIZATIONS IN OUR REGION.
8 AND ALSO I'M WONDERING IF THE AMENDMENTS THAT THEY ARE
9 REQUESTING ALIGN WITH THE AMENDMENTS THAT THE SENATORS PUT IN
10 BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE A DISCONNECT THERE. AND MAYBE, YOU KNOW,
11 THERE'S SOME WORK THAT THOSE ORGANIZATIONS CAN DO WITH THOSE
12 SENATORS IF WE GET THEM TO SUPPORT THE BILL. LEONG

13

14 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COUNCILMEMBER GOODWIN. I THINK THOSE
15 CLIMATE ORIENTED AND THAT WOULD INCLUDE TRANSFORM AS WELL AS -
16 - JUST A NUMBER OF OTHERS THAT BY NAME YOU CAN TELL THEY'RE
17 CLIMATE-ORIENTED, ONE OF THE CONCERNS HAS BEEN THE IDEA THAT
18 AS WRITTEN RIGHT NOW THE BILL IS FAIRLY OPEN AS TO WHAT TYPES
19 OF PROJECTS COULD BE FUNDED FROM THE CONNECTIVITY PROGRAM
20 WHICH IS THE CAPITAL PROGRAM AND SO THERE'S BEEN A CONCERN
21 THAT POTENTIALLY HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS COULD BE INCLUDED
22 IN THAT. AS YOU KNOW FROM THE LAST PRESENTATION, RIGHT, IT'S
23 GOING TO BE VERY HARD TO ACHIEVE THE REGION'S GREENHOUSE GAS
24 EMISSIONS. SO ADVOCATES WHO ARE REALLY FOCUSED ON CLIMATE
25 CHANGE SAID THEY'D LIKE TO SEE A RESTRICTION ON ANY KIND OF



MAY 24, 2024

1 HIGHWAY WIDENING. YOU KNOW, THOSE CONVERSATIONS HAVE BEEN
2 CONTINUING. WE DID BRING FORWARD A SUGGESTED KIND OF
3 COMPROMISE SEVERAL MONTHS AGO TO THE COMMISSION AND THAT ITEM
4 WAS DEFERRED. BUT I -- I AM SEEING SOME, YOU KNOW, ENCOURAGING
5 DIALOGUE ON THAT FRONT THAT, YOU KNOW, IF THIS BILL IS GOING
6 TO CONTINUE I THINK THERE COULD BE ROOM FOR COMPROMISE THAT
7 BRINGS FOLKS ONBOARD. SO STAY TUNED ON THAT. ONE OF THE OTHER
8 SOURCES OF, I THINK, SOME CONCERN IF AMENDED WAS THE
9 CONSOLIDATION LANGUAGE AND THAT IS THE TRANSIT AGENCY
10 CONSOLIDATION AND THAT HAS BEEN AMENDED TO SOFTEN IT SOMEWHAT
11 TO ADD ENHANCED COORDINATION AS KIND OF SOMETHING THAT'S BEING
12 STUDIED ON PAR WITH TRANSIT AGENCY CONSOLIDATION. SO HOPEFULLY
13 THAT, YOU KNOW, COULD ALSO EVEN POTENTIALLY BRING SOME
14 ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE OPPOSED AND LESS AMENDED -- UNLESS
15 AMENDED OF SUPPORT. SO SOME OF THE AREAS OF MOVEMENT I THINK
16 ARE ENCOURAGING, BUT THE MOST RECENT AMENDMENTS, I DON'T THINK
17 GET -- GET YOU THERE QUITE GET.

18

19 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ZACK AND THEN DWAYNE.

22

23 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS CAUSE FOR OPTIMISM.
24 EVEN IF IT'S A LITTLE DIRE RIGHT NOW, I THINK THERE IS LIKE WE
25 WANT LIKE THE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMUNITY, TRANSIT ADVOCATES,



MAY 24, 2024

1 LABOR, LIKE, WE WANT ALL THIS TO MOVE FORWARD. WITH A SMALL
2 POT OF MONEY AT THE END OF THE DAY AND A LOT OF BIG GOALS. AND
3 SO, LIKE, I AM OPTIMISTIC, LIKE, THROUGH THE DISCUSSIONS,
4 THROUGH THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION WE CAN GET TO YES ON THE
5 HIGHWAYS VERSUS, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT PIECES AND THOSE
6 CONSIDERATIONS BUT IT'S HARD AND WE ARE ON A TIGHT TIMELINE. I
7 THINK, LIKE, MY CONCERN IS THE RISK. IF IT FAILS, EVERYBODY
8 LOSES. I HOPE EVERYBODY IN THE DISCUSSION, INCLUDING MY OWN,
9 LIKE, ORGANIZATION AND OTHERS, ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. AND TRY TO
10 GET TO YES. SO I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK REBECCA AND STAFF
11 DOING INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF WORK Y'ALL HAVE DONE AND STAFF HAVE
12 DONE ON THIS. IT'S, LIKE, I SEE A THIRD OF IT AND IT'S
13 IMPRESSIVE. AND THEN, REBECCA, I JUST HAD ONE QUESTION WHICH
14 IS -- ON WEDNESDAY, THEY TALKED ABOUT A SPECIAL MEETING IN
15 ADVANCE OF THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE, IS THAT HAPPENING AND DO
16 YOU HAVE A DATE, YET, FOR THAT?

17

18 **REBECCA LONG IT'S STILL UNDER -- REBECCA LONG:** IT'S STILL
19 UNDER DISCUSSION. BUT THE TIME IS T.B.D. OF COURSE, IT WILL BE
20 POSTED CONSISTENT OF THE BROWN ACT SO STAY TUNED.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. DWAYNE, ANY COMMENTS,
23 QUESTIONS.

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU. I DON'T HAVE ANY COMMENTS. THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** CHARLEY AND THEN HOWARD.

5

6 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** NO QUESTIONS, COMMENTS.

7

8 **HOWARD WONG:** I THINK THE BROADER VISION NEEDS TO BE STRESSED.
9 I THINK THERE ARE SOME M.T.C. COMMISSIONERS OPPOSE BASED ON
10 SOME OF THEIR CONSTITUENTS' OPPOSITION TO VARIOUS PARTS OF
11 CONSOLIDATION OR INTEGRATION. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY CONCERN ABOUT
12 PERCENTAGE OF FUNDS GOING TO THEIR PARTICULAR COUNTIES BUT,
13 AGAIN, THE OVERALL VISION HAS TO BE, YOU KNOW, EMPHASIZED. AND
14 PART OF THE WAY OF DOING THAT I THINK IS THE, AGAIN, LOOKING
15 AT BEST PRACTICES AND MODELS AROUND THE WORLD. I THINK THAT WE
16 ALL RECOGNIZE THAT MUCH OF THE BAY AREA HAS TRANSIT DEFICIT
17 THAT THE OVERALL TRANSIT MODAL SHARE OF THE BAY AREA IS 5%. WE
18 KNOW THAT THE CORE CITIES ARE DOING -- HAVE DONE WELL OVER THE
19 DECADES. SAN FRANCISCO, TRADITIONALLY, HAS ABOUT 24%, 25%
20 TRANSIT MODAL SHARE, BUT THAT'S NOT TRUE OF MANY PARTS OF OUR
21 AREA. HOWEVER, IN IT THE WORLD, IT WE -- IF WE LOOK AT REGIONS
22 THAT HAVE ACHIEVED 25%, 30%, 40% TRANSIT MODAL SHARE, THE
23 BENEFITS TO THE ENTIRE AREA ECONOMICALLY, HOUSING, EQUITY,
24 ACCESSIBILITY ARE VERY GOOD. AND I THINK THAT KIND OF
25 EMPHASIS, A VISION, AND YOU KNOW, MANY OF THE REGIONS' LEADERS



MAY 24, 2024

1 ARE PRETTY VISIONARY. THEY'RE, YOU KNOW, HAVE ACHIEVED
2 LEADERSHIP POSITIONS BECAUSE THEY RECOGNIZE THE OVERALL GOOD
3 OF WHAT THEY DO -- WHAT THEIR DECISION-MAKING IS AND HOW IT
4 AFFECTS THEIR CITY AND THE REGION, YOU KNOW, IS GOOD FOR THEIR
5 LEGACY AND THE LEGACY OF, YOU KNOW, THE M.T.C. BODY AND
6 OTHERS. THERE'S ROOM, I THINK, FOR THE M.T.C. COMMISSIONERS TO
7 COME TOGETHER. I THINK IF YOU LOOK AT ALL THE PARTS OF THE
8 WORLD WHERE REGIONAL TRANSIT, REGIONAL HOUSING, GOOD PUBLIC
9 POLICY HAS BEEN ACHIEVED, IT HAS BEEN THROUGH GOOD, SMART
10 LEADERSHIP WHO HAVE COMPROMISED TO SOME DEGREE BUT ALSO HAVE
11 FOUND THE PATHWAYS TO ACHIEVE GOOD FOR ALL. SO, YOU KNOW, KEEP
12 UP THE WORK, KEEP UP THE PRESSURE, AND WE ALL, I THINK, NEED
13 TO, YOU KNOW, CONTINUE COMMUNICATIONS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ADINA AND THEN GABE.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** WANTED TO ECHO WHAT SOME OTHER COLLEAGUES HAVE
18 SAID IN TERMS OF THANKING STAFF FOR THE REALLY HARD AND
19 SOMETIMES THANKLESS WORK ON THIS WHICH IS REALLY IMPORTANT
20 LIKE FROM THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION THAT WE HAD ON PLAN BAY
21 AREA 2050+. WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR GOALS
22 WITHOUT IMPROVED TRANSIT, AND THERE ARE PROBABLY SOME THINGS
23 WE CAN TWEAK TO DO EVEN BETTER ON THAT. SO, YOU KNOW, I DO
24 HOPE TO SEE WORK ON ADDRESSING THE CHALLENGES AND GETTING TO
25 YES, INCLUDING, LIKE, BECAUSE WE DEPEND ON THE PUBLIC



MAY 24, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION TO ACHIEVE THESE GOALS, HELPING OUR VARIOUS
2 DIFFERENT LEADERS, INCLUDING IN SOME OF OUR LOCALITIES THAT
3 ARE HAVING HEARTBURN ABOUT THIS TO THINK ABOUT, WELL, WHAT'S
4 OUR ALTERNATIVE? LIKE, IF WE'RE BRINGING BART TO SAN JOSE,
5 LIKE, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN IF BART DOES NOT RUN? WE'RE
6 INVESTING IN CALTRAIN, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN? WHAT HAPPENS IF WE
7 DON'T HAVE THE FUNDING OR WHAT HAPPENS -- LIKE, HOW WOULD WE
8 POSSIBLY COBBLE IT TOGETHER OUT OF A MILLION LOCAL SOURCES?
9 REALLY, PEOPLE ARE ON THE HOOK FOR COMING UP WITH A SOLUTION
10 THIS WAY OR SOME OTHER WAY. AND THE OTHER COMMENT I WANTED TO
11 MAKE THAT CONNECTED ANOTHER LITTLE PIECE IN THE PLAN BAY AREA
12 2050+ AND SOME OF THE KNOBS AND DIALS ON S.B. 1031 HAS TO DO
13 WITH THE PACE OF DOWNTOWN RECOVERY. BECAUSE IF YOU LOOK AT
14 TRANSIT AGENCIES FACING THE FISCAL CLIFF, THERE IS MORE THAN
15 ONE KIND OF PROBLEM. THERE'S A REGIONAL SERVICES THAT, YOU
16 KNOW, SEEING SLOW RECOVERY, LIKE BART'S RIDERSHIP WENT UP BY
17 6% IN THE LAST YEAR. AND SO THERE'S THIS GRADUAL RECOVERY ON
18 THOSE REGIONAL SERVICES. AND THEN YOU HAVE MUNI, WHICH IS
19 REALLY IMPACTED BY THE SAN FRANCISCO ECONOMY AND ITS BUDGET IS
20 LIKE A LARGE PART OF THE BUDGET COMES FROM THE CITY BUDGET AND
21 THEIR CITY BUDGET IS GOING TO BE A BIG MESS, LIKE, RELATING TO
22 THAT DOWNTOWN RECOVERY THAT WOULD HAPPEN OVER A CERTAIN AMOUNT
23 OF TIME. SO LOOKING AT, LIKE, WHAT'S THE AMOUNT OF TIME WHERE
24 MAYBE SAN FRANCISCO WOULD BE ABLE TO STAND ON ITS OWN AS ONE
25 QUESTION AND WHAT KIND OF SUPPORT IS NEEDED FOR OUR REGIONAL



MAY 24, 2024

1 SERVICES TO RECOVER IS ANOTHER KIND OF QUESTION. AND GETTING
2 EVERYONE WHO'S PART OF THE REGION IS DEPENDENT ON THE REGIONAL
3 SERVICES TO THINK ABOUT HOW TO ACHIEVE THAT BY HOOK OR BY
4 CROOK IS A REALLY MAJOR POLITICAL AND PROCESS CHALLENGE BEFORE
5 ONE AND ALL. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. GABE AND THEN TERRY.

8

9 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE ADDED
10 ATTACHMENTS TO THIS. I THINK THAT WAS ONE OF OUR REQUESTS LAST
11 TIME AROUND IS HAVING MORE CONTEXT AND INFORMATION. SO I'M
12 SURE YOU GUYS CREATED THIS ON A DIME SO THANK YOU FOR DOING
13 THAT. I NOTICED THAT ONE OF THE AMENDMENTS WAS TO ADD A
14 REQUIREMENT THAT A MAJORITY OF COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES
15 HAD TO VOTE TO SUPPORT THE REGIONAL MEASURE BEFORE IT'S PLACED
16 ON THE BALLOT. AND WHEN I LOOKED AT ALL THE YEA OR NAY
17 SUPPORTS ON ONE OF THE ATTACHMENTS, I NOTICED THAT SANTA CLARA
18 V.T.A. IS OPPOSING THE MEASURE. SO DOES THAT MEAN AS OF NOW
19 THE MEASURE WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT?

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** UNDER THAT STRUCTURE OF THE MAJORITY OF THE
22 COUNTIES, IF IT'S A SEVEN-COUNTY MEASURE, AN OPPOSITION BY
23 V.T.A. WOULD NOT BLOCK THE MEASURE. THEY REPRESENT I WANT TO
24 SAY OVER 25% OF THE POPULATION, BUT, YOU KNOW, IT WOULD NEED
25 TO BE SUPPORTED BY A MAJORITY OF THE POPULATION AND A MAJORITY



MAY 24, 2024

1 OF THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. SO I GUESS THE ANSWER TO YOUR
2 QUESTION IS NO.

3

4 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** OKAY. AND SAM TRANSES IN SONOMA COUNTY AND
5 CALTRAIN IS OPPOSING IT UNLESS IT'S AMENDED?

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT'S RIGHT.

8

9 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** KIND OF WHAT COUNCILMEMBER GOODWIN SAID
10 BEFORE. IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL IF IT WOULD BE A TABLE OR SMALL
11 DESCRIPTION OR SHORT DESCRIPTION STATING WHAT SOME OF THE
12 REQUESTS FOR AMENDMENTS ARE. YOU CAN -- WHAT YOU WERE SAYING
13 BEFORE IN TERMS OF THE MAJORITY OF CLIMATE ORGANIZATIONS
14 WANTING X. THERE'S A VARIETY OF HOUSING ORGANIZATIONS. IT
15 COULD BE GOOD TO KNOW WHAT THEY ARE LOOKING FOR. WOULD BE GOOD
16 TO KNOW WHAT SOME OF THE GOVERNMENTAL AGENCIES ARE LOOKING
17 FOR. BART IS CURRENTLY ONLY SAYING THEY'LL SUPPORT IT IF IT'S
18 AMENDED. IT WOULD BE GOOD TO KNOW -- JUST CURIOUS WHAT ALL
19 THESE AGENCIES ARE REALLY HOPING FOR AT THE END OF THE DAY.
20 THE ONLY OTHER QUESTION I HAD LEFT, ONE OF THE AMENDMENTS
21 STATED REGIONAL FUNDS SHOULD NOT SUPPLANT ANY LOCAL, REGIONAL,
22 OR STATE FUNDING. SO DOES THAT MEAN A PROJECT THAT RECEIVES
23 FUNDING ASSOCIATED WITH THIS BILL CAN'T RECEIVED ANY
24 ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR FEDERAL, STATE, OR LOCAL SOURCES?

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **REC REBECCA LONG:** --

2

3 **REBECCA LONG:** OUR CONCERN IS THAT A RECIPIENT OF FUNDING FROM
4 THE MEASURE THAT NONE OF THE FUNDING THAT IS CURRENTLY GOING
5 TO THAT RECIPIENT CAN BE REPLACED BY THE REGIONAL MEASURE. AND
6 SO IT ESSENTIALLY WOULD FREEZE IN TIME. HOWEVER, M.T.C. IS
7 DISTRIBUTING ANY REGIONAL, STATE, OR FEDERAL FUNDING AT THE
8 TIME THE MEASURE PASSES WHICH IS HUGEY PROBLEMATIC.

9

10 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** YEAH. OKAY. I GOT CONFUSED OF SUPPLANT VERSUS
11 REPLACE THERE BUT OKAY. THAT'S ALL THE QUESTIONS I HAD THERE.
12 THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TERRY.

15

16 **TERRY SCOTT:** FIRST OF ALL, I'D LIKE TO THANK STAFF FOR
17 PROVIDING THE BIG PICTURE HERE. AND I THINK THAT THERE IS --
18 WITH THE DETAILED AMENDMENTS AND SO FORTH, WE CAN GET BURIED
19 IN DETAILS AND NOT REALLY UNDERSTAND THE OVERALL PROCESS AND
20 THE PROGRESS THAT'S BEING MADE PROCEDURAL TO DO SO. I DON'T
21 HAVE ANY REAL QUESTIONS AT THIS POINT. I THINK I'LL MAKE ONE
22 COMMENT. I THINK TO ACCOMPLISH THE AMENDMENTS AND SATISFY THE
23 MAJORITY OF ORGANIZATIONS AND REPRESENTATIVES AT THE STATE
24 LEVEL IS GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF POLITICAL SAUSAGE MAKING
25 BETWEEN NOW AND THEN AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING THE EVENTUAL



MAY 24, 2024

1 PRODUCT WITH NOT WHO IS NECESSARILY SPENDING TOO MUCH TIME IN
2 HOW IT GOT THERE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TERRY AND THEN JEFF. -- GERRY
5 AND THEN JEFF.

6

7 **GERRY GLASER:** I UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGE THAT YOU HAVE. I
8 MENTIONED THIS IN THE PREVIOUS MEETINGS, I THOUGHT THAT -- OF
9 THE THINGS THAT HAVE COME BEFORE US, THIS IS THE MOST
10 IMPORTANT THING IN THE TIME THAT I'VE BEEN ON THE COUNCIL. AND
11 PROBABLY IS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS IN THE BAY AREA
12 FOR THE NEXT 20 YEARS IF WE DON'T RATIONALIZE THIS DISTRICT
13 ISSUE. I WAS DISAPPOINTED TO FIND THAT SONOMA COUNTY OPPOSED
14 FOR THAT AMENDMENT AND IN FACT, I'M ON THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
15 FOR SGTA. AND WE NEGLECTED TO HAVE MEETINGS FOR THE LAST TWO
16 MONTHS WHICH IS VERY UNUSUAL SO NEVER GOT A CHANCE TO DIG INTO
17 THIS. I CONTACTED STAFF THIS MORNING WHEN I SENT OUT THE NOTES
18 SENT OUT TO US IF THE AMENDMENTS WOULD CHANGE SCTA'S POSITION
19 AND THE ANSWER WAS, THERE IS A MEETING ON THE 10th TO FIND OUT
20 OF THIS MONTH. THIRD THING -- MY NUMBERS HERE. MY THIRD THING
21 HERE, THE CLOVERDALE BIT IS A BIT BIZARRE. I CAN SEE THE LOOK
22 ON YOUR FACE WHEN YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IT. EXTENSION OF SMART.
23 SMART IS PROBABLY ONE OF THE BEST THINGS THAT'S HAPPENED IN
24 SONOMA COUNTY AS FAR AS TRANSIT. IT'S CONSISTENTLY WORKING.
25 THEIR NEW MANAGER IS BRILLIANT IN THE THINGS HE'S BROUGHT



MAY 24, 2024

1 FORWARD. BRINGING SMART ALL THE WAY UP TO HEALDSBURG MAKES
2 SENSE. CLOVERDALE WITH A POPULATION OF ABOUT 7,000, 8,000
3 PEOPLE. SO MANY MILES BEYOND WHERE IT'S NOT AS MUCH AN
4 EXTENSION OF THE BAY AREA AS I THINK THE OTHER AREAS. REALLY
5 SEEMS A STRANGE ADDITION. AND I'M HOPING WITH THE HIGH COST
6 THAT WILL BRING IN SOMEBODY COULD SPEAK AND GET A LITTLE MORE
7 SENSE. BUT SMART ITSELF I THINK IS A REALLY GREAT EXAMPLE OF
8 THE KIND OF CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT THAT WE WANT TO HAVE
9 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. I'D LIKE TO SEE MORE LIKE THAT. I'D
10 LIKE TO SEE SMART SAY, WE HAVE TO GO TO VALLEJO, THAT WOULD
11 MAKE MORE SENSE THAN GOING TO CLOVERDALE. PROBABLY MORE
12 EXPENSIVE AS WELL. AND LASTLY THE ONE THING I DID READ OUT OF
13 YOUR NOTES ONE THING LEFT IN, CONSOLIDATION IS STILL THERE AS
14 -- I THINK AS A STUDY, THIS IS -- THE FUNDING EVERYBODY ELSE
15 IS FOCUSED ON THE FUNDING. THE STUDY ITSELF IS IMPORTANT.
16 UNDERSTANDING WHERE WE SHOULD BE GOING. THAT PART HAS TO BE
17 MAINTAINED. AND CONSOLIDATION AS AN OPTION. FROM MY POINT OF
18 VIEW, A PREFERRED OPTION. NEEDS TO BE OUTLINED AND UNDERSTOOD.
19 THOSE ARE THE POINTS I HAVE SO FAR. EVERYBODY, THANK YOU. THIS
20 IS REALLY IMPORTANT STUFF. WE REALLY SHOULD FOCUS ON IT.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. JEFF AND THEN JOHNNY.

23

24 **JEFF RHOADS:** WELL, THIS IS REALLY AN EXCELLENT EXAMPLE OF
25 SAUSAGE MAKING, ISN'T IT? REBECCA, YOUR SUMMARY IS REALLY



MAY 24, 2024

1 HELPFUL. I GUESS I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. THE FIRST OF
2 WHICH IS, WILL THE ASSEMBLY'S VERSION, IS THE ASSEMBLY WORKING
3 ON THIS VERSION OR ARE THEY DOING A SECOND ONE? AND THEN, IF
4 THAT'S THE CASE, IT SEEMS IT'S GOING TO BE A LOT OF HORSE
5 TRADING IN ORDER TO RESOLVE THE DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN THE
6 SENATE BILL AND THE ASSEMBLY BILL. SO I GUESS THAT'S ONE
7 QUESTION. THE OTHER, I GUESS, I GOT IS -- IT ISN'T CLEAR TO ME
8 WHETHER OR NOT CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS CAN INCLUDE ACTIVE
9 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS OTHER THAN THE REFERENCE TO SAFE
10 ROUTES TO SCHOOLS. SO I'M CURIOUS AS TO WHETHER OR NOT THAT'S
11 THE CASE. AND AT THE END OF THE DAY, THIS IS TOUGH. BECAUSE
12 EVERYBODY'S INTERESTS ARE SO DIFFERENT. IT WILL BE AMAZING TO
13 SEE WHAT ACTUALLY COMES OUT OF THIS. SO ANYWAY, SHARE WITH US
14 YOUR -- YOUR ANSWERS TO A COUPLE OF THOSE QUESTIONS, I'D
15 APPRECIATE IT.

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, ABSOLUTELY, COUNCILMEMBER RHOADS. THE
18 WAY THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS WORKS IN SACRAMENTO, THE BILL
19 MOVES FROM THE HOUSE OF ORIGIN TO THE SECOND HOUSE IN THAT
20 SAME FORMAT AND SO THE ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE WILL
21 BE RECEIVING THE BILL IN ITS CURRENT FORM, UNLESS IT'S AMENDED
22 AGAIN, BEFORE IT GOES THERE. AND SO ANY SUBSTANTIVE CHANGES
23 ARE MADE TO THAT VERSION. A NEW GILL COULD BE -- BILL COULD
24 BE, THE TERM IS GUT AND AMEND. YOU TAKE ANOTHER BILL, YOU
25 BASICALLY TAKE LANGUAGE OUT OF IT, PUT NEW LANGUAGE INTO IT.



MAY 24, 2024

1 SO THAT'S ONE SCENARIO WHERE THE ASSEMBLY MIGHT SAY, OKAY, WE
2 THINK THIS IS IMPORTANT. WE'RE GOING TO START FROM SCRATCH AND
3 NOT USE THIS SAME VEHICLE BUT WE ANTICIPATE THIS IS THE BILL
4 THAT WILL BE, YOU KNOW, CONTINUE TO BE AMENDED AND THEN
5 CHANGES MADE IN THE ASSEMBLY HAVE TO GO BACK TO THE SENATE FOR
6 CONCURRENCE. SO THAT IS HOW THAT WORKS. AND THEN ON YOUR
7 QUESTION ABOUT THE ELIGIBILITY FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION, YOU
8 KNOW, THE -- THE LANGUAGE IS FAIRLY BROAD IN THAT SECTION. SO
9 IT'S PARAGRAPH 3 AND SECTION 6653.4. [LAUGHTER] IT SAYS THAT
10 IT INCLUDES HIGHWAY, TRANSIT, AND RAIL MOBILITY PROJECTS THAT
11 CLOSE GAPS -- EXCUSE ME -- AND RELIEVE BOTTLE NECKS IN THE
12 EXISTING TRANSPORTATION NETWORK IN A NEUTRAL MANNER, ACTIVE
13 PROJECT AND SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO
14 GRADE SEPARATIONS. SO YEAH, IT'S INTENDED TO REALLY BE
15 INCLUSIVE OF ANY CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT ARE CONSISTENT WITH
16 PLAN BAY AREA.

17

18 **GERRY GLASER:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. JOHNNY AND THEN VINAY.

21

22 **JOHNNY PARKER:** THANK YOU. I THINK YOU ALREADY ANSWERED ABOUT
23 THE VOTE GOING TO THE SENATE FLOOR THAT'S COMING UP PRETTY
24 SOON. I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT FOR -- FOR ONE OF THE
25 AMENDMENTS WHERE IT SAYS CONSOLIDATION AND/OR ENHANCED



MAY 24, 2024

1 COORDINATION, ARE WE THINKING THAT MORE PEOPLE -- MORE
2 ENTITIES WILL PUSH TOWARDS THE ENHANCED COORDINATION?

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU. SO WHEN THE COMMISSION BROUGHT
5 FORWARD IN JANUARY, I THINK IT WAS, SORT OF THE QUESTION
6 ABOUT, SHOULD CONSOLIDATION BE PART OF THE DISCUSSION AS IT
7 RELATES TO THIS BILL, THE COMMISSION'S DIRECTION AT THAT TIME
8 WAS, WE REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON COORDINATION. AND THEN AS WE
9 ALL KNOW, RIGHT, THE BILL WAS AMENDED TO REQUIRE A
10 CONSOLIDATION STUDY. I THINK WHAT A LOT OF THE TRANSIT
11 AGENCIES WHO'VE OPPOSED THE BILL, THEIR PRIMARY CONCERN IS
12 THAT CONSOLIDATION STUDY. ONE OF THE REASONS WHY THE BILL GOT
13 AMENDED TO ENHANCE COORDINATION WAS DEFINITELY IN RESPONSE TO
14 THE CONCERNS THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE MADE. I THINK IF
15 CHOOSING BETWEEN CONSOLIDATION OR ENHANCED COORDINATION,
16 CERTAINLY TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR THE MOST PART ARE IN FAVOR OF
17 ENHANCED COORDINATION. BUT, YOU KNOW, AS I READ THE BILL, IT'S
18 A LITTLE BIT AMBIGUOUS ABOUT WHETHER THE STUDY NEEDS TO
19 EXAMINE BOTH BECAUSE IT DOES SAY "OR." ANALYZE THE IMPACT OF
20 CONSOLIDATION OR COORDINATION UNDER THESE SCENARIOS. THERE IS
21 ONE PLACE WHERE IT SAYS "AND", SO IT'S A LITTLE BIT UNCLEAR,
22 BUT HOPEFULLY THAT ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. VINAY.

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO SAY THAT I'M STILL KIND
2 OF SURPRISED INSTEAD OF HAVING A MORE BROAD LANGUAGE, HAVING
3 SPECIFICS ONLY WHERE, YOU KNOW, THAT THOSE SPECIFICS ARE
4 ESSENTIAL TO GET THE VOTES TO GET IT PASSED, YOU ONLY KEEP
5 THOSE SPECIFICS AND LEAVE MOST OF THE OTHER THINGS BROAD. THIS
6 BILL IS JUST PUTTING IN A LOT OF SPECIFICS THAT WILL LOSE A
7 BUNCH OF VOTES. I DON'T KNOW HOW HELPFUL THAT IS AND WHY IT'S
8 BEING DONE THAT WAY BY THE BILL MAKERS. ALSO, ABOUT THE 90%
9 RETURN TO SOURCE, I JUST FEEL LIKE 90%, WHY EVEN PASS THE
10 REGIONAL MEASURE? IT'S ALMOST DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. I MEAN, I DO
11 KNOW WE NEED A MEASURE, OF COURSE, BUT THEN WHY CALL IT A
12 REGIONAL MEASURE? BUT ALSO, WHICH 90% DOES THE -- DO CAPITAL
13 PROJECTS, HOW ARE THEY COUNTED IN THE 90%? IS THE SMART
14 EXTENSION TO CLOVERDALE GOING TO BE UNDER THE 90%? AND IN
15 TERMS OF CONSOLIDATION, I JUST FEEL LIKE -- I MEAN, I KNOW
16 THERE'S A LOT OF OPPOSITION TO CONSOLIDATION. I DON'T THINK
17 PERSONALLY CONSOLIDATION IS A GOOD IDEA EITHER. BUT MAYBE THEY
18 SHOULD REALLY PUSH. BY WE I MEAN THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
19 AND OTHER FOLKS DO HAVE MORE FROM THE ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK
20 SO THAT WHEN WE ARE TALKING ABOUT COORDINATION, ETC., YOU
21 KNOW, WE LOOK AT, WHAT ARE THE DESIRED OUTCOMES FROM
22 CONSOLIDATION? I'M SO -- TURN THOSE OUTCOMES INTO AN
23 ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK. BECAUSE ULTIMATELY WHAT WE'RE
24 INTERESTED IN, IF IT'S BY ONE AGENCY OR BY 15 AGENCIES, IT
25 DOESN'T MATTER SO LONG AS WE HAVE THOSE OUTCOMES. SO WHY NOT



MAY 24, 2024

1 CREATE THAT ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK AND MAKE IT SOLID SO
2 THAT, YOU KNOW, THIS CONSOLIDATION DOES NOT BECOME AS DIVISIVE
3 AN ISSUE AS IT HAS BECOME? THANK YOU.

4

5 **REBECCA LONG:** THERE ARE ONE OR TWO QUESTIONS IN THERE THAT I
6 CAN ANSWER. SO AS AMENDED RIGHT NOW, THE 90% RETURN TO SOURCE
7 IS SORT OF AN OVERLAY TO THE EXPENDITURE PLAN STRUCTURE WHICH
8 STILL INCLUDED THE CONNECTIVITY PROGRAM THAT HAS A CAPITAL
9 COMPONENT. SO, YOU KNOW, EACH COUNTY WOULD BE GETTING -- WELL,
10 THE CONNECTIVITY PROGRAM IS ALREADY A FORMULA-BASED PROGRAM.
11 SO IT'S 15% OF THE TOTAL. SO A COUNTY WOULD BASICALLY GET
12 THEIR 15% SHARE OF THEIR CONTRIBUTIONS FOR THE CONNECTIVITY
13 PROGRAM. AND THEN, YOU ASKED ABOUT SMART TO CLOVERDALE, IS
14 THAT PART OF THE 90%? THAT PROVISION IS JUST SPECIFIC TO THE
15 PLAN. SO IT DOESN'T SAY HOW SMART TO CLOVERDALE WOULD BE
16 FUNDED. IT DOESN'T MANDATE THAT SMART TO CLOVERDALE BE
17 MANDATED FROM THE REGIONAL MEASURE. IT SAYS WE JUST HAVE TO
18 ADD SMART TO CLOVERDALE IN THE REGIONAL PLAN NEXT YEAR. BUT
19 THE SMART TO CLOVERDALE -- WELL, THE -- EXCUSE ME -- THE SMART
20 BACKFILL FOR THE QUARTER CENTS SALES TAX, IF THAT FAILS, THAT
21 BACKFILL WOULD BE CREDITED TOWARD THE 90% FOR THOSE COUNTIES.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. DO WE HAVE ANY HANDS RAISED
24 ONLINE?

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NONE FOR THE MEMBERS PARTICIPATING AND
2 THERE'S ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL HEAR FROM VICE
5 CHAIR BALDINI NOW.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE AND
8 PERSEVERANCE. I KNOW YOU HAVE A TIME CLOCK. I AGREE WITH A LOT
9 HAS BEEN SAID, PARTICULARLY BY MY ASSOCIATE, VINAY, AS FAR AS
10 ACCOUNTABILITY FRAMEWORK. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE CONSOLIDATION. I
11 KNOW IT'S HARD FOR ELECTED OFFICIALS TO TELL THEIR
12 CONSTITUENTS THAT WE'RE CUTTING JOBS, THAT IT'S NOT ABOUT
13 THAT. I'VE BEEN THROUGH THREE MAJOR CORPORATE CONSOLIDATIONS.
14 IT'S ABOUT TEAM WORK. IT'S ABOUT SITTING DOWN WITH ONE ANOTHER
15 AND LOOKING AT PROCESS. IT IS DOABLE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. IF THERE'S ANY PUBLIC
18 COMMENT, WE'LL HEAR FROM THAT NOW.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. WARREN CUSHMAN, YOU ARE UP FIRST.
21 YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. I WILL SAY 15 WHEN YOU HAVE 15 SECONDS
22 LEFT. WARREN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I CAN HEAR YOU NOW.

2

3 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I REALLY APPRECIATE
4 THIS PROCESS. I URGE EVERYONE ON THE COUNCIL TO CONNECT WITH
5 THEIR ELECTED OFFICIALS, BECAUSE THE ELECTEDS ON THE M.T.C.
6 AND THE ELECTEDS IN THE LEGISLATURE IS WHERE IT'S AT AND I
7 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO RELATE TO THEM AND FIND OUT WHAT THEIR
8 CONCERNS ARE. GETTING TO YES IS IMPORTANT FOR PEOPLE WITH
9 DISABILITIES. WE NEED TO GET THERE. THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT
10 PROCESS. THERE ARE A LOT OF NEEDS INVOLVED. BUT WE NEED TO
11 SUPPORT THE PROCESS AND GET THERE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU, WARREN. NEXT UP -- THAT'S ALL
14 THE SPEAKERS WE HAVE FOR ZOOM. NEXT WE HAVE IN HOUSE. IT WILL
15 BE ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD, ALETA. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **ALETA DUPREE:** THANK YOU. TO CHAIR CAMPOS, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
18 RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I'VE BEEN SPEAKING ABOUT
19 THIS BILL IN A LOT OF PLACES. IT'S REALLY COMPLICATED BUT IT'S
20 ESSENTIAL AND I'M THINKING MORE ABOUT THE FUNDING PART OF IT
21 RIGHT NOW. CONSOLIDATION IS COMPLICATED AND I DON'T HAVE A
22 REAL CLEAR POSITION ON IT YET. I JUST REMEMBER IT TOOK REALLY
23 64 YEARS TO CONSOLIDATE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN NEW YORK CITY
24 FROM 1904 TO 1968. AND THERE'S STILL MORE THAT COULD BE DONE,
25 PERHAPS, THAN YOU'RE CROSSING STATE LINES. HOW DO WE DO IT



MAY 24, 2024

1 HERE? I HOPE FOR A PUBLIC THAT WOULD BE WILLING TO TAX
2 THEMSELVES SMALL AMOUNTS. IT COSTS A LOT LESS THAN HAVING A
3 CAR. THANKS.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. I REALLY --

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE
8 COMMENTS FROM EVERYONE ON THE COUNCIL AND MY -- MY ONLY
9 QUESTION IS, THERE'S A LOT OF US WHO WANT TO SEE THIS PASS. SO
10 OURSELVES AS COUNCILMEMBERS, WHAT CAN WE DO TO HELP SAVE IT?
11 WHAT'S WITHIN OUR POWER?

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. SO YOU KNOW, EACH OF YOU ARE
14 ON THE COUNCIL AND YOU'RE ADVISING M.T.C., BUT EACH OF YOU ARE
15 INDIVIDUALS WITH YOUR VARIOUS AFFILIATIONS AND SO I THINK,
16 REALLY, THE MOST EFFECTIVE THING FOR YOU TO DO IS TO REACH OUT
17 AS INDIVIDUALS. YOU KNOW, WITH THOSE RELATIONSHIPS THAT YOU
18 HAVE, WITH MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATURE, WITH THE COMMISSION.
19 AGAIN, THE NEXT PLACE THIS IS GOING IS THE ASSEMBLY
20 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE SO YOU CAN LOOK AT THE ROSTER FOR
21 THAT. MAYBE YOU KNOW SOME OF THOSE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS. BUT, YOU
22 KNOW, OBVIOUSLY ALL THE INPUT AND QUESTIONS THAT YOU'VE ASKED
23 TODAY HELP INFORM STAFF AND HOW WE AS M.T.C. STAFF WORK ON
24 THIS BUT YOUR, YOU KNOW, POTENTIAL OPPORTUNITIES TO INFLUENCE
25 THE BILL REALLY COME AS INDIVIDUALS.



MAY 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND WITH THAT WE WILL
3 MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM. THANK YOU, REBECCA, SO MUCH
4 FOR YOUR TIME AND YOUR -- YEAH, BEING HERE WITH US. [APPLAUSE]
5 AGENDA ITEM 6 IS OUR STAFF LIAISON REPORT. WE HAVE KY-NAM
6 MILLER TO PRESENT THIS ITEM FOR INFORMATION.

7

8 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANKS, CHAIR CAMPOS. I'LL KEEP IT BRIEF. NOT
9 TOO MUCH MORE TO ADD BEYOND THE WRITTEN REPORT EXCEPT TO GIVE
10 YOU THE SAVE THE DATE WHICH IS WEDNESDAY, JULY 31, WHICH IS
11 THE DAY THAT OVER -- WELL, RIGHT NOW WE HAVE 300 HIGH SCHOOL
12 STUDENTS WHO APPLIED FOR THE PROGRAM. WE PARTICIPATE WELL OVER
13 200 TO BE ULTIMATELY PARTICIPATING. SO A CHANCE TO MEET THIS
14 RECORD NUMBER OF HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS AS THEY COME AND MAKE
15 THEIR CAPSTONE PRESENTATION FOR THE SUMMER ACADEMY. WE'RE
16 HAVING CONSTRUCTION HERE ON THE GROUND FLOOR SO PROBABLY WON'T
17 BE ACTUALLY IN THIS BUILDING BUT WE'RE LOOKING FOR A SITE
18 NEARBY BUT SAVE THE DATE AND I'LL SHARE MORE DETAILS AS THEY
19 BECOME AVAILABLE. THANKS.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** WHAT TIME WAS THAT, JULY 31?

22

23 **KY-NAM MILLER:** IT WILL BE FROM 12:00 TO 3:00. SO, YEAH, COME
24 FROM LUNCH. STAY FOR THE CAPSTONE PRESENTATION. HAVE SOME ICE
25 CREAM.



MAY 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
6 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
7 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE NEXT HAVE THE SUBCOMMITTEE
10 REPORTS. DO WE HAVE CHRISTINE FITZGERALD, OUR POLICY ADVISORY
11 -- EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. CHAIR.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT WILL BE VICE CHAIR PARKER.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** VICE CHAIR PARKER TO PRESENT THIS. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **JOHNNY PARKER:** I DON'T HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD SO THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
21 FOR THIS ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE ON
24 THIS ITEM. SALUTE.

25



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AND NEXT IS THE REPORT.

2

3 **HOWARD WONG:** THERE WAS A CEREMONY LAST WEEK AT THE SAN
4 FRANCISCO SALES FORCE CENTER ANNOUNCING THE RECEIPT OF \$3.4
5 BILLION IN FEDERAL FUNDING FOR THE EXTENSION OF CALTRAIN TO
6 THE SALES FORCE TRANSIT CENTER. AS YOU KNOW, THE TRANSIT
7 CENTER WILL BE A REGIONAL HUB THAT WILL BE THE HEARTBEAT OF 11
8 TRANSIT AGENCIES. 12 SAN FRANCISCO COMMUNITY LINES. SOMEDAY
9 HOPEFULLY IT WILL BE DETERMINED OF ALSO HIGH-SPEED RAIL. SO I
10 THINK IT'S A PRETTY -- PRETTY GOOD MILESTONE FOR THE REGION.
11 THE DOWNTOWN TRANSIT EXTENSION WILL NOW HAVE ABOUT 2/3 OF ITS
12 REQUIRED FUNDING. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE I MAY HAVE
15 MISSED? VICE CHAIR.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU. IF YOU'RE UP IN NAPA FOR
18 WINE TESTING OR BOTTLE ROCK TRANSIT, THE TRANSPORTATION
19 AUTHORITY IS FREE THIS WEEKEND. SO COME ON UP AND ENJOY SOME
20 MUSIC AND SOMETHING TO SIP. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. HEARING NO OTHER FOLKS WHO
23 WANT TO SHARE, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24



MAY 24, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE'S NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
2 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM OR THE
3 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

4

5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM IS THE BUSINESS.
6 MEMBERS OF THE M.T.C. COUNCIL MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR
7 DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA. SO ANYBODY -- VICE
8 CHAIR BALDINI.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** I WOULD -- ON -- ON HOWARD'S
11 COMMENT ABOUT THE PORTAL PROJECT, I'D LIKE TO HEAR A LITTLE
12 BIT MORE ABOUT THAT. AS AN EXAMPLE, WHAT'S INVOLVED? DWELL
13 TIME AT FOUR STREET. OPERATIONALLY THE DEGREE OF CURVATURES,
14 HOW IS TWO TRACKS GOING TO HANDLE EVERYTHING AND WHEN IS IT
15 GOING TO CONNECT TO BART? IT WILL BE INTERESTING JUST TO GET A
16 QUICK LOOK INTO IT OR WHERE DO WE SPEND \$3.4 BILLION SOMEPLACE
17 ELSE BUT IT WOULD LOOK LIKE -- LIKE TO KNOW ABOUT HOW THAT
18 DECISION WAS MADE AND WHERE IT'S GOING. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. SEEING NO OTHER HANDS RAISED
21 FOR THIS ITEM, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
24 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
25 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.



MAY 24, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY, THANK YOU. I WILL ADJOURN THIS
3 MEETING. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE M.T.C. POLICY ADVISORY
4 COUNCIL WILL BE HELD ON FRIDAY, JUNE 28, 2024, AT 10:00 A.M.
5 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER. THAT IS OUR LAST FRIDAY MEETING,
6 IS THAT CORRECT, AND THEN IN JULY WE'LL START MEETING ON
7 TUESDAYS. PLEASE NOTE THAT THE -- THAT WAS ON HERE ALREADY.
8 THANK YOU. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO
9 THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

10

11 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I PROPOSE WE TAKE A 10-MINUTE BREAK. SO SEE YOU
12 BACK HERE IN 10 MINUTES.

13



NTT

Broadcasting Government