

1	POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
2	SUBCOMMITTEE
3	MONDAY, MAY 8^{TH} , 2023, 1:00 PM
4	
5	
6	CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GOOD AFTERNOON, EVERYONE. THE POLICY
7	ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE
8	MEETING IS CALLED TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON
9	THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO ARE PARTICIPATING
10	BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR
11	DIAL STAR NINE. I'LL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
12	TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED ON BY LAST FOUR DIGITS
13	OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. AGENDA ITEM 1, ROLL CALL FOR QUORUM.
14	
15	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAIR LEVIN?
16	
17	CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR KALLINS?
20	
21	V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER ALLEN?
24	
25	BOB ALLEN: HERE.



```
1
2
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER CUSHMAN?
3
   WARREN CUSHMAN: HERE.
4
5
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER DEUTCH-GROSS IS ABSENT. MEMBER
6
7
    GLASER IS ABSENT. MEMBER [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR GOYAL?
8
9
    SPEAKER: HERE MEMBER GRIFFIN?
10
    IAN GRIFFITHS: HERE.
11
12
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: HANKERSON IS ABSENT. MEMBER LIEU? IS
13
14
    ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER?
15
16
   EMILY LOPER: HERE.
17
18
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER MALLON? MEMBER MALLON IS ABSENT.
19
   MEMBER PETTY IS ABSENT. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT. MEMBER
    STANKE?
20
21
22
   BRIAN STANKE: HERE.
23
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE QUORUM WITHOUT THE ALTERNATES.
24
    THANK YOU.
25
```

MAY 8, 2023

1 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. SO, NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA IS 2 3 APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES FROM OUR LAST MEETING. ANY MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES? 4 5 IAN GRIFFITHS: GRIFFITHS MOVES. 6 7 8 SPEAKER: SO MOVED. 9 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GRIFFITHS MOVED. WARREN DO YOU WANT TO 10 11 SECOND? 12 13 SPEAKER: YES. 14 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MOTION BY GRIFFITHS, SECOND BY WARREN. 15 16 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: SOUNDS GOOD. ANY ONE -- ANYBODY ON THE 17 18 BODY WISHING TO SPEAK? ANY PUBLIC, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. ANYONE HERE BY PERSON, WHICH THERE IS NOT, YOU 19 WOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE PODIUM. 20 21 22 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE IS NOBODY ONLINE WITH THE HAND 23 RAISED AND THERE IS NOTHING IN WRITING. 24



```
CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: FANTASTIC. COULD YOU HELP US WITH THE ROLL
1
2
    CALL VOTE.
3
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR LEVIN?
4
5
    CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: YES.
6
7
8
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER -- VICE CHAIR KALLINS?
9
10
   V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: ABSTAIN.
11
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ABSTAIN. MEMBER ALLEN?
12
13
14
   BOB ALLEN: ABSTAIN.
15
16
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER CUSHMAN?
17
    WARREN CUSHMAN: AYE.
18
19
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER DEUTSCHE-GROSS TO IS ABSENT.
20
21
   MEMBER GLASER IS ABSENT. MEMBER [INDISCERNIBLE].
22
23
    SPEAKER: ABSTAIN.
24
    CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER GRIFFITHS?
25
```



1 2 IAN GRIFFITHS: YES. 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER HANKERSON IS ABSENT. MEMBER LIEU 4 5 IS ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER? 6 7 **EMILY LOPER: YES.** 8 9 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER MALLON? IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY IS ABSENT. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT. MEMBER STANKE? 10 11 BRIAN STANKE: YES. 12 13 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MAYBE AS THE ALTERNATE, ONLINE, MEMBER 14 15 ELDRED? 16 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: YES. 17 18 19 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. AND MEMBER SCOTT? 20 TERRY SCOTT: AYE. 21 22 23 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE SEVEN YES AND ABSTAINED. IT PASSED. MOTION PASSES. MOTION PASSES WITH SEVEN YES AND THREE 24 25 ABSTAIN.

MAY 8, 2023

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. EXCELLENT. SO WE'RE GOING MOVE 2 3 ON TO THE NEXT ITEM WHICH IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY COMMITTEE UPDATE, WHICH IS GOING TO BE 4 5 DISCUSSING THE SUCCESSOR SUBCOMMITTEE TO THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE WHICH MAYBE WILL BE 6 HOPEFULLY EASIER TO SAY. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM WHERE 7 8 MELANIE CHOY AND KY-NAM MILLER WILL PRESENT THE STAFF 9 PRESENTATION. THANKS.

10

1

KY-NAM MILLER: THANK YOU CHAIR LEVIN AND WILL MY FRIENDS ON 11 THE TECH STAFF PLEASE RUN THE SLIDES. AS THAT GETS ROLLING I 12 WANT TO SAY GOOD AFTERNOON TO CHAIR LEVIN AND VICE CHAIR 13 KALLINS AND MEMBERS OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 14 15 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE. MY NAME IS KY-NAM 16 MILLER AND I AM STAFF LIAISON TO THE COUNCIL JOINED THAT HAVE BEEN BY MY COLLEAGUE MELANIE CHOY FROM FUNDING POLICY AND 17 18 PROGRAMS WE'RE HERE TO BRIEF THE SUBCOMMITTEE ON THE ANTICIPATED CHANGES AND THINGS WILL REMAIN THE SAME AS THE NEW 19 SUCCESSOR BODY TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE THIS SUMMER. WE WELCOME 20 YOUR OUESTIONS THROUGHOUT THE PRESENTATION AND THESE PLANS ARE 21 22 NOT WRITTEN IN STONE AND ARE EAGER TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK. THE 23 AIM IS TO STAND UP THE NEW REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE WHICH WILL BE INFORMED BY A CUSTOMER ADVISE SURGERY 24 BODY. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AS A REMINDER AND 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

BACKGROUND, THIS BODY, THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN 1 2 SUBCOMMITTEE, TAP SUBCOMMITTEE ESTABLISHED LAST SEPTEMBER 2022 3 AND THE TAP ITSELF WAS SUCCESSOR TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE. THE 4 5 TAP WAS MEANT TO HAVE ITS TERM OVERLAP WITH THE LATEST POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WHICH BEGAN ITS FOUR YEAR TERM IN JANUARY 6 2022 AND ENDS ON DECEMBER 31ST, 2025. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OF 7 8 THE TRANSITION WILL OVERLAP BETWEEN THE TAP AND SUCCESSOR BODY WITH THE SAME SETS OF INDIVIDUALS REPRESENTING BOTH COUNCIL 9 10 AND NON-COUNCIL SLOTS. FLAGGING ON THIS PARTICULAR SLIDE, KNOWLEDGE, MR. DYLAN FEBRICE IS NOW REPRESENTING SAN FRANCISCO 11 TRANSIT RIDERS UNION INSTEAD OF GOYAL SO THE EXPECTATION WOULD 12 BE HE WOULD CONTINUE TO SERVE ON THIS NEW BODY AS WITH ALL OF 13 YOU WHO ARE CURRENTLY HERE TODAY, AND CURRENTLY LISTED ANNE 14 15 OLIVIA ELDRED COUNCIL MEMBER SHE WOULD REMAIN AN ALTERNATE AS 16 HER PREFERENCE THAT'S DIFFERENT FROM THE SLIDE AS INDICATED, JUST TO DESCRIBE THE SLIDE FOR THOSE WHO CANNOT SEE IT, IT'S A 17 CUBE WITH 20 DIFFERENT SLOTS IN IT, HALF OF THEM ARE DARK 18 COLORED SLOTS WHICH REPRESENT THE MEMBERS OF THE POLICY 19 ADVISORY COUNCIL WHO ARE NAMED ON TO IT, AND THE OTHER HALF 20 ARE DARK BLUE SLOTS, AND THOSE REPRESENT VARIOUS INTEREST 21 GROUPS WHO ARE OUTSIDE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, ROUGHLY 22 SPLIT THEMATICALLY BETWEEN POLICY, BUSINESS, YOUTH INTERESTS, 23 THE CITY DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATIONS AND DISABILITY 24 ADVOCATES. SO, IN TOTAL, AGAIN, THERE IS 20 ON THE CURRENT AND 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THE SUCCESSOR BODY, AND IT'S SPLIT EVENLY BETWEEN THE COUNCIL 1 AND NON-KNOW COUNCIL MEMBERS. THE 12050 IS THE PROPOSED 2 3 LEADERSHIP STRUCTURE IS FOR THE CHAIR FROM THE COUNCIL, FOR THIS NEW BODY TO BE COMING FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 4 5 AND SINCE THE NEW BODY IS GOING TO REPORT TO THE NEW REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE, RATHER THAN THE COUNCIL, WE 6 WOULD -- WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT THE VICE CHAIR BE TO ONE OF 7 8 THE MEMBERS WHO ARE NON-COUNCIL MEMBERS. ALL MEMBERS OF THE NEW BODY WILL VOTE TO ELECT LEADERSHIP REGARDLESS OF THEIR 9 10 APPOINTEE ORIGIN, COUNCIL MEMBERS WILL VOTE FOR THE CHAIR FROM THE COUNCIL AND VICE CHAIR FROM THE NON-COUNCIL AND THE 11 VARIOUS NON-COUNCIL MEMBERS WILL VOTE FOR THE CHAIR AND VICE 12 CHAIR. SO ELECTIONS FOR THIS NEW BODY WILL TAKE PLACE ONCE IT 13 IS ESTABLISHED. I'M SENSING SOME CURIOUS EYEBROWS SO IF YOU 14 15 HAVE ANY QUESTIONS ON WHAT I JUST DESCRIBED, PLEASE GO AHEAD, 16 OR YOU CAN ASK OUESTIONS LATER. YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. 17 FOR THAT, I'M GOING TO HAND IT OVER TO MY COLLEAGUE MELANIE WHO IS GOING TO DESCRIBE THE NEXT ANTICIPATED STEPS. 18

19

20 MELANIE CHOY: THANKS KY-NAM. MELANIE CHOY FUNDING POLICY AND 21 PROGRAM SECTION AT MTC. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS WE WANT TO GIVE 22 A HIGH-LEVEL SCHEDULE IN TERMS OF WHERE WE'RE HEADED. OF 23 COURSE, WE WANT TO HEAR YOUR FEEDBACK AND ALSO DISCUSSIONS 24 FROM THIS GROUP TODAY. IN TERMS OF THE OVERALL SCHEDULE FOR 25 STANDING UP THE RNM COMMITTEE, WHICH IS A COMMITTEE OF THE

MAY 8, 2023

COMMISSION, IT'S BEING -- IT'S OUR OPERATIONS COMMITTEE THAT'S 1 BEING RESTRUCTURED OR REPURPOSES INTO THE RNM COMMITTEE IS THE 2 3 CURRENT PLANS AND PROPOSAL PRESENTED TO OUR COMMISSION BACK IN MARCH. SO THE GOAL IS TO STAND THAT UP IN JULY OF THIS SUMMER, 4 5 AND THEN SEQUENTIAL, THIS COMMITTEE, AS KY-NAM INDICATED, IS DIRECTLY INTERFACING WITH THE RNM COMMITTEE, WHICH IS THE 6 SUBSET OF OUR COMMISSIONERS. AND SO, THEREAFTER, IN THE FALL 7 8 SOMETIME, WE WOULD TRANSITION INTO A VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER 9 COMMITTEE, DEPENDING ON WHAT NAME IS FORMALLY SELECTED. SO THAT'S THE OUTLOOK FOR THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS IN TERMS OF OUR 10 TRANSITION PERIOD. SO, WITH THAT, I THINK WE ARE HAPPY TO HEAR 11 YOUR FEEDBACK, COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, AND ANY OTHER THOUGHTS YOU 12 MAY V. 13

14

15 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: SO, IF I UNDERSTAND, THE OTHER
16 COMMITTEE DOESN'T START IN THE FALL, WILL THIS COMMITTEE MEET
17 ONE MORE TIME IN THE SUMMER?

18

19 KY-NAM MILLER: THE COMMITTEE WILL CONTINUE TO MEET AS NEEDED
20 AND SO AS DEFAULT WILL CONTINUE TO PERSIST UNTIL THE NEXT
21 SUCCESSOR BODY IS STOOD UP.

22

23 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: OKAY. THANKS.



SPEAKER: JUST ONE QUESTION ON RECRUITING THE YOUTH. IS THERE
 THOUGHT ABOUT HOW THAT WILL HAPPEN?

KY-NAM MILLER: INDEED, SO WE'RE GOING TO LOOK TO SEVERAL, KIND 4 5 OF, NETWORKS OF YOUTH. YOU KNOW, SOME OF THE PRIME FOLKS ARE THE SONOMA STATE STUDENTS AND CAL STATE SAN JOSE WHO ARE 6 PARTICIPATING IN THE BAY PASS PILOT. WE'RE ALSO GOING TO LOOK 7 8 THROUGH THE COLLEGE STUDENTS WHO HAVE GONE THROUGH THE MENTORSHIP PROGRAMS OVER THE SUMMER AS WELL AS THE HIGH SCHOOL 9 ACADEMY, THOSE ALUMNI ARE INVITED TO JOIN AND OF COURSE WE 10 WELCOME MEMBERS OF THIS BODY AND THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 11 TO SPREAD THE WORD. THEY GOING TO BE STAFF LEAD BUT ALSO 12 COUNCIL SUPPORTED EFFORT TO SPREAD THE WORD. SO IF YOU KNOW 13 YOUTHFUL PEOPLE WHO WOULD BE INTERESTED IN PARTICIPATING WE 14 WELCOME YOUR HELPING TO PUSH THAT MESSAGE OUT. 15

16

3

17 SPEAKER: A REAL SIMPLE QUESTION, WHAT'S CUT OFF ON YOUTH?

19 KY-NAM MILLER: THERE IS NOT A FORMAL CUT OFF. YOU KNOW, LIKE, 20 I WOULD SAY ROUGHLY ANYONE UP TO 30. I MEAN, YOU COULD BE IN 21 COMMUNITY COLLEGE.

22

23 SPEAKER: I'M TOO OLD?

MAY 8, 2023

KY-NAM MILLER: I THINK YOU HAVE A YOUTHFUL SPIRIT AND MAY BE 1 ONE WHO COULD PULL IT OFF REPRESENTING OLDER ADULTS AND YOUNG 2 3 ADULTS, LIKE THE PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING TO BE LIVING WITH THESE CHOICES FOR THE REST OF THEIR LIFE, AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT, I 4 5 THINK COLLEGE STUDENTS ARE IN AT THE PAST PROGRAM OR HOPING 6 THAT WE CAN FIND REPRESENTATIVES FROM THERE. 7 8 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ANY OTHER HANDS? 9 10 SPEAKER: I HAD MY HAND RAISED. SORRY. 11 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: I'M CURIOUS ABOUT THE DOWNWARD CUT OFF FOR 12 YOUTH. ARE YOU INTERESTED IN SPEAKING WITH HIGH SCHOOL 13 14 STUDENTS. 15 16 KY-NAM MILLER: AS MENTIONED WE'RE GOING TO BE SENDING OUT TO THE HIGH SCHOOL ACADEMY STUDENTS WHO I BELIEVE DIPPED DOWN AS 17 LOW AS 15. BUT THERE IS NO FORMAL CUT OFF IF THERE IS A 18 PARTICULAR PRECOCIOUS BETWEEN WHO APPLIES, WE WOULD CONSIDER 19 THAT. BUT THERE ARE ONLY TWO SLOTS SO WE WANT THE MOST 20 21 EFFECTIVE REPRESENTATIVE AS POSSIBLE WHO IS REASONABLY PARTICIPATE. AGAIN, THIS IS IN-PERSON. SO, I THINK THAT MIGHT 22 23 BE SOMETHING TO CONSIDER FOR WHO IS ABLE TO PARTICIPATE. 24



V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: IF YOU DO WANT TO HAVE HIGH SCHOOL
 AND COLLEGE STUDENTS, THE TIME OF DAY MAY MAKE A BIG
 DIFFERENCE, WHEN WE MEET.
 4

5 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: UH-HUH. AND, OR GEOGRAPHY. SO, SAN
6 FRANCISCO AS A PRETTY ACTIVE YOUTH COMMISSION, THAT'S ANOTHER
7 PLACE THAT COULD GET RECRUITED FROM. FINGERS CROSSED ON THE
8 BROWN ACT REFORM BILL THAT MIGHT HELP US GET MORE ACTIVE YOUTH
9 PARTICIPATION FROM PEOPLE, PLACES, NOT DIRECTLY IN SAN
10 FRANCISCO.

11

IAN GRIFFITHS: I HATE TO BRING UP SOMETHING THAT'S, SORT OF, 12 THE ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM HERE, BUT THIS IS NOT A VERY DIVERSE 13 GROUP, THE WAY I'M, SORT OF, SEEING IT RIGHT NOW, AND 14 15 PARTICULARLY RACIALLY AND RECOGNIZING THE VOICE OF THE 16 CUSTOMER, AND CUSTOMERS. I THINK -- I DON'T REMEMBER WHAT THE STATISTIC IS. BUT I THINK WELL OVER 50% OF TRANSIT RIDERS ARE 17 PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND AN EXTREMELY WHITE BODY, AND I'M WHITE, 18 SO I ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. WHAT EFFORTS -- ARE THERE GOING TO BE 19 MORE EFFORTS TO TRY TO GET A DIVERSE REPRESENTATION FROM 20 21 EITHER THE ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE CURRENTLY HERE OR OTHER MEMBERS THAT HAVE YET TO BE IDENTIFIED. I'M SURE YOU HAVE 22 TRIED I'M SURE THERE HAVE BEEN EFFORTS IT'S ALWAYS 23 CHALLENGING. IF WE'RE GOING TO CALL THIS THE VOICE OF THE 24



CUSTOMER COMMITTEE I FEEL WE MAY NEED TO PUT EXTRA EFFORT INTO
 HAVING IT MORE REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CUSTOMERS.

3

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: BEFORE WE HEAR FROM STAFF, I WANT TO CHIME 4 5 IN THAT THERE ARE A COUPLE OF SEATS THAT ARE COUNCIL MEMBER SEATS THAT ARE OPEN AND SO THAT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE 6 PEOPLE OF COLOR. THERE IS THE YOUTH AND STUDENT SEATS WHERE 7 8 THERE IS OPPORTUNITIES FOR PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND THERE MIGHT BE SOME OTHER CHANGES, SO, I THINK USING A STRONG AFFIRMATIVE 9 ACTION LENS FOR THE OPEN SEATS SEEMS LIKE A REALLY GOOD PLACE 10 TO START. ANY OTHER THOUGHTS FROM STAFF? 11

12

KY-NAM MILLER: I THINK WE'RE TAKING YOUR VIEWS TOTALLY INTO 13 ACCOUNT, AND I THINK THERE IS A STRONG BELIEF THAT THIS BODY 14 15 AND ALL OUR OTHER BODIES NEED TO REPRESENT THE PEOPLE OF THE 16 BAY AREA AND WE TRIED TO DO THAT IN THE WAY THAT CONFORMS WITH THE LIMITS OF CALIFORNIA LAW SO I THINK THAT TAKES PLACE IN 17 OUTREACH AND EDUCATION AND MAKING SURE THAT ALL POSSIBLE 18 CANDIDATES ARE HEARING ABOUT IT AND THEN WE MAKE 19 ACCOMMODATIONS TO ALLOW EVERYBODY TO ATTEND AS MUCH AS 20 21 POSSIBLE. THAT'S WHAT WE CAN DO.

22

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS ON THE
BOARD OR FROM MEMBERS ONLINE? ALL RIGHT. I'M NOT SEEING ANY.
IS THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC?

MAY 8, 2023

1 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. THERE IS ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER WITH A 2 3 HAND RAISED. IT'S CHRIS FITZGERALD. WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE TWO MINUTES? 4 5 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: YES. 6 7 8 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. FINGERS CROSSED. BROWN ACT CHANGES, PLEASE, MAKE SUGAR TO HAVE FULL REPRESENTATION, NOT 9 ONLY RACIALLY, UP-AND-DOWN THE LINE, AS FAR AS GEOGRAPHIC 10 CONSIDERATIONS. I KNOW THE STATE HAS BEEN NOTED. FANTASTIC. 11 PLEASE DON'T FORGET ALL OF US NON-PROFIT DOWN HERE IN THE BAY 12 AREA, PARDON ME IN THE SOUTH BAY, REPRESENTING PEOPLE WITH 13 14 DISABILITIES. THANKS. 15 16 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. 17 18 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: SO DOES STAFF HAVE THE FEEDBACK THAT'S 19 HELPFUL FOR THIS TOPIC BEFORE WE GO ON TO THE NEXT ITEM? 20 21 22 KY-NAM MILLER: INDEED WE'RE GRATEFUL FOR YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY. 23 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY AND I'M GOING TO DO SOMETHING THAT IS 24 BOTH OUT OF ORDER AND A LITTLE BIT EMBARRASSING. BECAUSE, IN 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



LOOKING, RETROACTIVELY AT THE MEETING MINUTES, I AM NOT SEEING
 IT IN THE PACKET, IN THE ONLINE PACKET. SO, IS THAT SOMETHING
 THAT WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO BRING BACK?

4

5 KY-NAM MILLER: I'LL WORK WITH MARTHA -- WALLY IS SUBSTITUTE
6 CLERKING TODAY. I'LL MAKE SURE THE MINUTES ARE REFLECTED BOTH
7 ONLINE AND E-MAILED, AS WELL.

8

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU. MOVING ON, IN ORDER, TO AGENDA 9 ITEM NUMBER FIVE WHICH IS THE CLIPPER START PILOT UPDATE. SO, 10 THIS IS THE EVALUATION RESULTS OF THE CLIPPER START MEANS 11 BASED TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNT PROGRAM AND PROPOSED 12 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EXTENDING THE PILOT PROGRAM BEYOND THE 13 CURRENT SUNSET DATE OF JUNE 2023. THIS ITEM IS BUMPING OVER TO 14 OUR SUBCOMMITTEE BECAUSE THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE 15 16 WAS NOT ABLE TO GET A QUORUM, SPEAKING OF THE VALUE OF THE BROWN ACT REFORM THAT WILL ENABLE MORE DIVERSE AND ROBUST 17 PARTICIPATION IN OUR SUBCOMMITTEES AND -- COMMITTEES. THIS IS 18 AN INFORMATION ITEM. JUDIS SANTOS AND MELANIE CHOY WILL 19 PRESENT THE ITEM. AND I WILL BE LISTENING ATTENTIVELY WHILE 20 21 GETTING A DRINK IN THE BACK ROOM. I'LL BE BACK IN A SECOND. 22

JUDIS SANTOS: GOOD AFTERNOON. AND COULD STAFF PLEASE PULL UP
THE PRESENTATION? PRETTY PLEASE.



1 SPEAKER: THERE YOU GO.

2

3 JUDIS SANTOS: THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON I'M JUDIS SANTOS, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR WITH MTC ABAG COLEADING THE EVALUATION OF 4 5 THE CLIPPER START PILOT WITH THERESE MCMILLAN WITH NELSON AND NYGAARD HERE TODAY WITH MELANIE CHOY ASSISTANT DIRECTOR WITH 6 MTC FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM SECTION AND LYSA HALE WHO COULDN'T 7 8 BE HERE TODAY SHE'S THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR THE OPERATIONS OF CLIPPER START AND PURPOSE OF THIS ITEM IS TO SHARE FINDINGS 9 LEARNINGS AND EVALUATION OF WHAT'S AHEAD FOR IN ORDER TO PUSH 10 THE ENVELOPE WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED FROM THE PAST TWO YEARS OF 11 THE PILOT NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE EVERYONE TO GET WHERE THEY 12 NEED TO GO WHETHER IT'S THEIR JOB, HEALTH CARE GROCERY STORE 13 TO SEE FRIENDS AND FAMILY, WE KNOW THERE ARE BARRIERS TO 14 15 TRANSIT RELATED TO FARES AND REACHING THE FINANCIALLY BURDENED 16 LIKE GETTING CLIPPER START INTO THE HANDS OF PEOPLE WHO CAN BENEFIT FROM IT. PEOPLE EARNING LOW-INCOME FROM DIVERSE 17 CULTURAL BACKGROUND OFFERING BENEFITS TO TRANSIT DISCOUNTS AND 18 TRANSIT SERVICE THAT'S ENTICING ENOUGH TO FOR THE CUSTOMER. 19 TRANSIT OPERATORS AND COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS IMPLEMENTED THE 20 PILOT LAUNCH DURING LOCKDOWN PERIOD OF THE PANDEMIC JULY 20TH 21 22 KNOW 20 CRITICAL TIME FOR OUR SOCIETY AND ESSENTIAL WORKERS WE 23 LEARNED MUCH ABOUT THE BARRIERS WHO WERE USING THE SYSTEM DURING THIS TIME WHILE KEEPING IN CHECK IMPROVING OUTREACH AND 24 25 OTHER STRATEGIES INCREASING RIDERSHIP AND CHECKING FINANCIAL

MAY 8, 2023

VIABILITY AND BUDGETARY ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE 1 PILOT IS CURRENTLY A THREE YEAR PROGRAM WITH GOALS BELOW. THE 2 3 21 PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATORS OFFERING 20% OR 50% DISCOUNT ON SINGLE RIDE FARES. MTC'S GOAL IS TO HAVE 100% 4 5 PARTICIPATION FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS ON THE CLIPPER SYSTEM. WHILE THE SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY HAS ITS 6 OWN LOW-INCOME DISCOUNT PROGRAMS MTC STAFF SEES VALUE FOR VTA 7 8 AND ITS CUSTOMERS TO HAVING THE AGENCY PARTICIPATE IN CLIPPER START. AS IT ALLOWS THE DISCOUNTS ON CONNECTING SYSTEMS 9 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. MTC STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH 10 VTA ON THEIR POTENTIAL PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM. NEXT 11 SLIDE. AN EVALUATION OF THE PILOT WAS A REOUIREMENT OF THE 12 ORIGINAL FRAMEWORK IN MTC RESOLUTION 4320 TO UNDERSTAND, LEARN 13 FROM, AND FURTHER IMPROVE UPON THE PROJECT'S GOALS. I WOULD 14 15 LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE CLIPPER START WORKING GROUP, MADE 16 UP OF PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF ARE ACTIVELY ENGAGING IN THIS WORK. AN EVALUATION TECHNICAL REPORT WITH 17 INFORMATION ON ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS WILL BE AVAILABLE AS WELL 18 AS A GRAPHIC EXECUTIVE SUMMARY. SIX OUTCOMES WERE IDENTIFIED 19 BY MTC AND THE WORKING GROUP, WHICH INCLUDE PROJECT 20 21 IMPLEMENTATION OUTCOMES LIKE AWARENESS AND MARKETING, CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, FINANCIAL VIABILITY, ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY, 22 AND CUSTOMER IMPACT OUTCOMES, LIKE AFFORDABILITY AND IMPROVE 23 THE ACCESS AND MOBILITY. OUTCOMES WERE MEASURED AND INFORMED 24 BY A MULTITUDE OF DATA SOURCES TO INCLUDE CLIPPER START TRIP 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY 8, 2023

DATA APPLICATION SURVEY PROGRAM USER SURVEY, FOCUS GROUPS, 1 GENERAL AWARENESS SURVEY, AND CBO CENTRAL AGENCY SURVEYS. ON 2 3 THE RIGHT SAMPLE OF KEY PROJECT OUTPUTS, MIDDLE COLUMN MEMBERS 2-YEAR PILOT DURATION, AND RIGHT FAR COLUMN MEMBERS FROM JULY 4 5 2020 TO MARCH 2023. INCLUDING APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED, PROGRAM ENROLLEES APPROVED FOR THE PROGRAM WITH APPROVAL RATE OF 87%, 6 ACTIVE PROGRAM USERS, WHICH ARE THOSE USING THE CARD, 75% OF 7 8 PROGRAM ENROLLEES, AND NUMBER OF TRIPS AND TRANSFERS. THE ESSENCE OF THE TABLE IS THE PILOT SO FAR AS OPERATIONALLY 9 DESIGNED IS WORKING ONCE THE USER GETS THE BENEFIT WITH 10 PARTICIPATION GETTING BETTER. AND THERE IS MUCH OPPORTUNITY TO 11 MAKE IT EVEN BETTER. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. KEY LEARNINGS INCLUDE 12 THE PROGRAM IS REACHING CRITICAL POPULATIONS PEOPLE WITH 13 HOUSEHOLD INCOMES LESS THAN 20K, 57%; WOMEN 59%; AND PEOPLE 14 15 IDENTIFYING AS ASIAN OR HISPANIC 62% A MAJORITY OF ENROLLEES. 16 PROPORTION OF APPLICANTS ARE BETWEEN 19 AND 35 WITH ENROLLMENT INCREASING FOR 19 TO 25 RANGE IN Q4 AND BEYOND. MOST RIDERS 17 TAKING MORE TRIPS, WITH AVERAGE PARTICIPANT TRIP FREQUENCY UP 18 TO 5.6 TRIPS PER WEEK. FOR INCREASE AFFORDABILITY, THE TRIP 19 RATE IS HIGHER THAN APPLICATION RATE FOR THOSE HOUSEHOLDS 20 INCOMES EARNING BETWEEN 5,000 TO 30,000 A YEAR AND LASTLY 21 UPTAKE, UPTAKE, UPTAKE CONTINUES TO BE A CHALLENGE. THERE IS 22 DETAIL ON THIS AREA AROUND DEMOGRAPHICS. HIGHLIGHTING 23 LEARNINGS, THE MAP ON THE RIGHT ILLUSTRATES NUMBER OF 24 APPLICATIONS BY ZIP CODE WITH DARKER AREAS SIGNIFYING BY MORE 25

MAY 8, 2023

THAN 100 APPROVED APPLICATIONS IN THAT AREA ZIP CODE AND 1 LIGHTER SHADES VARIATIONS OF LESS THAN 100 APPLICATIONS. LARGE 2 3 CONCENTRATION OF THE PROGRAM APPLICANTS LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO, 50%. MEANWHILE, PROPORTION APPLICANTS INCLUDING OAKLAND, SAN 4 5 JOSE, SAN LEANDRO BERKELEY, DALY CITY INCREASED. APPLICATION RATES RELATIVELY LOW IN SOME OF MTC EQUITY PRIORITY 6 COMMUNITIES INCLUDING SANTA ROSA FAIRFIELD VALLEJO AND CITIES 7 8 WITHIN CALTRAIN AND SAMTRANS SERVICE AREAS. ABOUT 40% OF CLIPPER START TRIPS HAVE BEEN TAKEN ON BART FOLLOWED BY 38% ON 9 MUNI. BETWEEN Q1 AND 8 PROPORTION OF TRIPS TAKEN DECREASED 10 FROM 61% TO 40%. IN THE SAME PERIOD PROPORTION OF MUNI 11 INCREASE FROM 32 TO 38%. AGENCIES THAT JOINED LATER ON, SUCH 12 AS AC TRANSIT, SAMTRANS, SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY, SMART AND 13 EAST BAY AGENCIES, NAPA VINE INCREASED THROUGH THE PILOT 14 15 PERIOD. ACROSS THE AGENCIES ALL OPERATORS HAD MORE THAN 50% OF 16 THEIR CLIPPER START RIDES, RIDERS EARNING LESS THAN 20K PER YEAR. PETALUMA, SANTA ROSA, NAPA VINE, AND SONOMA COUNTY 17 TRANSIT HAD THE HIGHEST PROPORTION OF RIDERS EARNING LESS THAN 18 20K WITH BART AND MUNI HAVING THE HIGHEST PROPORTION OF RIDERS 19 EARNING MORE THAN 20K. IN A NUTSHELL, MULTIPLE STRATEGIES CAN 20 21 BE UTILIZED TO INCREASE PARTICIPATION RATES WITH OPPORTUNITIES WITHIN ALL ELIGIBLE DEMOGRAPHICS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS 22 TABLE ILLUSTRATES STRATEGIES FROM THE EVALUATION TO IMPROVE 23 THE PROGRAM ALONG MTC'S STAFF RESPONSE TO STRATEGIES. 24 25 STRATEGIES FALL WITHIN THREE CATEGORIES, MARKETING,

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY 8, 2023

ELIGIBILITY, OR FARE POLICY TO ADDRESS DIFFERENT OUTCOMES SUCH 1 AS IF INCREASING PROGRAM UPTAKE, IMPROVING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE 2 AND/OR DECREASING PROGRAM COSTS. THE SEVEN STRATEGIES LISTED 3 ON THE LEFT WHICH I WILL DESCRIBE BRIEFLY THEN NELL ME TO WILL 4 5 REVIEW MTC STAFF ASSESSMENT AND RESPONSE TO THE STRATEGIES. AUTO ENROLLMENT THIS STRATEGY WOULD AUTOMATICALLY MAIL A 6 7 CLIPPER START CARD TO ADULTS WHO ALREADY OUALIFY FOR SOCIAL 8 SERVICE BENEFITS SUCH AS CAL-WORKS OR CAL-FRESH, ELIGIBILITY FOR PROGRAMS ALREADY CONSTITUTE ELIGIBILITY FOR CLIPPER START 9 SO THE STRATEGY WOULD ELIMINATE THE BURDEN OF APPLYING AND 10 11 PROVIDING DOCUMENTATION FOR THESE INDIVIDUALS SIMILAR TO THE ORCA PROGRAM IN KING COUNTY METRO MODEL IN WASHINGTON STATE 12 VERIFICATION OF ELIGIBILITY WOULD ELIMINATE BURDEN ON 13 INDIVIDUALS OF PROVIDING DOCUMENTATION DURING THE APPLICATION 14 PROCESS THIS STRATEGY WAS INCLUDED BECAUSE IT WAS IDENTIFIED 15 16 AS AN EXPLORATORY AREA. INCREASE IN ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD INCREASING NUMBER OF RIDERS ELIGIBLE FOR CLIPPER START WHICH 17 COULD INCREASE THE NUMBER OF CLIPPER START RIDERS THIS 18 STRATEGY WOULD INCREASE THE POOL OF ELIGIBLE RIDERS NOT 19 NECESSARILY INCREASE THE PERCENTAGE OF LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS 20 ENROLLED IN THE PROGRAM UNLESS OTHER STRATEGIES LIKE OUTREACH 21 22 AND MARKETING ARE DEPLOYED. CONSISTENT DISCOUNT ACROSS 23 AGENCIES MEANS THAT ALL PARTICIPATING AGENCIES WOULD OFFER THE SAME PERCENTAGE DISCOUNTS. CONSISTENT DISCOUNT WOULD BE 24 SIMPLER CREATING GREATER CUSTOMER UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROGRAM 25

MAY 8, 2023

AND MORE SEAMLESS. CURRENTLY TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN CHOOSE 1 BETWEEN 20% OR 50% DISCOUNT. CAP ACCUMULATORS ARE ALTERNATIVE 2 3 TO FIXED PRICE PASS PRODUCTS, BASED ON THRESHOLD NUMBER OF BOARDINGS VALUE OR FARES PAID WITHIN A DEFINED PERIOD OF TIME 4 5 MONTHLY, WEEKLY, OR DAILY FARE CAPS. CUSTOMER FOCUSED COLLECTIVE APPROACH, THREE ES ENGAGEMENT EDUCATION AND EQUITY 6 PARTNERSHIPS CALLS FOR AMPING UP THE COLLECTIVE MTC TRANSIT 7 8 OPERATOR OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT APPROACHES WITH CUSTOMER CULTURAL SPECIFIC AND DEMOGRAPHIC PREFERENCES AND BY GEOGRAPHY, 9 EDUCATION OF NOT ONLY TARGETED CUSTOMER BASED BUT TRANSIT 10 EMPLOYEES AND SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES COMMUNITY-BASED 11 ORGANIZATIONS BASED AND SERVING TARGETED POPULATIONS. CALLS 12 FOR LEVERAGING WHAT HAS BEEN SUCCESSFUL WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES 13 AND OTHER SECTORS LIKE PUBLIC HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES IN 14 15 REACHING THIS CUSTOMER BASE. MARKETING STRATEGY AND MATERIALS 16 REVIEW INVOLVES APPLYING WHAT WAS LEARNED THROUGH THE EVALUATION, TRANSFORMING, COURSE CORRECTING, AND GROUND 17 CHECKING OF CLARITY AND MESSAGING TO BE RECEPTIVE, CLEAR, AND 18 CONCISE. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MELANIE CHOY. 19

20

MELANIE CHOY: MELANIE CHOY FUNDING POLICY PROGRAMS AT MTC.
BASED ON CATEGORIES THAT JUDIS PROVIDED DESCRIPTIONS ON. MTC
CATEGORIZED EACH STRATEGY INTO THREE AREAS IN TERMS OF
RESPONSE IS. FIRST CATEGORY IS ACCEPT. SECOND CATEGORY IS
REJECT, AND THIRD CATEGORY OUTLINED IS TO FURTHER ASSESS. AND

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

MAY 8, 2023

UNDER THE ACCEPT CATEGORY, WE CAN READILY RECOMMEND ADVANCING 1 SOME OF THESE STRATEGIES AND THESE ARE THE CONSISTENT 2 3 DISCOUNT, THE CUSTOMER FOCUSED COLLECTIVE APPROACH, AND THEN THE MARKETING STRATEGY AND MATERIALS REVIEW. SO, ON THESE 4 5 THREE, IN PARTICULAR, MTC STAFF RECOMMEND ACCEPTING THE CONSULTANT'S RECOMMENDATION AND ADVANCING THESE STRATEGIES AND 6 WORKING TOWARDS THESE STRATEGIES WITHOUT FURTHER ASSESSMENT. 7 8 THE ONE STRATEGY THAT MTC RECOMMENDS REJECTING, SO THE SECOND CATEGORY WHICH IS REJECTING SOME OF THE STRATEGIES IS THE ONE 9 STRATEGY WE ARE RECOMMENDING TO REJECT FROM THE CONSULTANT 10 STRATEGY IS SELF-VERIFICATION. THIS STRATEGY SCORED LOWEST 11 BECAUSE OF A POTENTIAL CHANGE THROUGH THE VALUATION CLIPPER 12 START PARTICIPATION SURVEY. REASONS WE'RE PROPOSING TO REJECT 13 THIS ONE IS BECAUSE OF THE CUSTOMER FEEDBACK SECOND REASON IS 14 BECAUSE THE STRATEGY DOES NOT LINE WITH THE PROJECT GOALS FOR 15 16 FINANCIAL LIABILITY AND ALSO ADMINISTRATIVE FEASIBILITY. AND THIRD REASON THERE HASN'T BEEN MUCH INTEREST IN PURSUING FROM 17 OUR CLIPPER START WORKING GROUP DISCUSSIONS MADE UP OF AGENCY 18 STAFF AND TECHNICAL STAFF. AND LAST REASON IS LACK OF EVIDENCE 19 FROM OTHER REGIONS THAT THIS IS AN EFFECTIVE STRATEGY. UNDER 20 21 THE THIRD CATEGORY WE DO RECOMMEND ASSESSING SOME OF THESE STRATEGIES FURTHER, AND THESE STRATEGIES INCLUDE, FIRST, AUTO 22 ENROLL. SECOND STRATEGY IS INCREASING INCOME ELIGIBILITY AND 23 THIRD ONE WE RECOMMEND ASSISTING FURTHER IS FARE CAP 24 ACCUMULATOR. WE BELIEVE IT'S WORTH TAKING A DEEPER DIVE AND 25

MAY 8, 2023

LOOK INTO UNDERSTANDING THESE STRATEGIES BETTER. ALSO ENGAGING 1 2 ALL OF YOU FOLKS, AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF, AND 3 LOOKING AT THE BENEFITS, THE RISKS, THE FEASIBILITY OF ALL THESE CONCEPTS. SO IN THESE THREE AREAS WE PROPOSE EMBARKING 4 5 ON A FOCUS TECHNICAL ASSESSMENT ON THESE TOPICS FOLLOWING OR DURING THE RECOMMENDED EXTENSION OF THE PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE, 6 PLEASE. OVERALL, WE SEE OPPORTUNITIES FOR MAKING THE PROGRAM 7 8 BETTER BEFORE WE MOVE TO A PERMANENT PROGRAM. AND THE PROGRAM IS OFF TO A GREAT START. WE WANTED TO RECOGNIZE THAT THE ROLL 9 OUT WAS SMOOTH AND WE HAVE STOOD UP A SOLID FOUNDATION FOR THE 10 PROGRAM, A CENTRALIZED SYSTEM WAS STOOD UP AND IS WORKING 11 WELL. THE PROGRAM HAS RECEIVED OVERWHELMING AND WIDE RANGING 12 SUPPORT. ALSO, THE FIRST SEVERAL YEARS OF THE PROGRAM WAS 13 FOCUSED ON STANDING UP THE PROGRAM IN THE MIDST OF COVID. SO 14 THERE ARE A FEW CHALLENGES TO WORK THROUGH. BUT IN ADVANCING 15 16 THE PROGRAM, THE FUTURE SUCCESS IS BASED ON CONTINUAL 17 IMPROVEMENTS AND MAKING THINGS BETTER. SO, THE ONE AREA THAT WE HAVE STRUGGLED WITH IS GETTING THE PRODUCT INTO THE HANDS 18 OF THOSE WHO CAN USE IT. AND HOW TO GET IT, GET MORE PEOPLE TO 19 USE THE SYSTEM AND RECEIVE THE BENEFIT. AND, SO, ONE OF THE --20 21 FOR THESE REASONS, ONE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE ARE PROPOSING TODAY IS TO EXTEND THE PILOT PERIOD FOR ANOTHER TWO 22 YEARS. IT IS CURRENTLY A THREE YEAR PILOT THAT SUNSETS JUNE OF 23 2023. AND OUR PROPOSAL IS, DURING THIS PILOT PERIOD IS TO 24 FOCUS FROM STANDING UP THE FOUNDATION OF THE PROGRAM TO FOCUS 25

MAY 8, 2023

ON GETTING THE PRODUCT INTO THE HANDS OF THOSE WHO IT'S 1 INTENDED FOR AND ALSO FOLLOWING UP ON SOME OF THESE STRATEGIES 2 3 THAT WERE RECOMMENDED FROM THE EVALUATION. SO, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF FRAMEWORK COMPONENTS THAT WE ARE GOING TO RETAIN. 4 5 AND ON THIS SLIDE, WHAT WE HAVE LISTED ARE COMPONENTS OF THE ORIGINAL FRAMEWORK THAT WE INTEND TO KEEP, AND THESE INCLUDE 6 THE PROGRAM PARTICIPATION, THE DISCOUNT OPTIONS, CENTRAL 7 8 ADMINISTRATION, THE DISCOUNT BEING APPLIED TO A SINGLE TRIP FARE, THE ELIGIBILITY REOUIREMENTS AT 200% FEDERAL POVERTY 9 10 LEVEL. IN TERMS OF PROPOSED CHANGES, WE ARE PROPOSING TO MAKE A FEW CHANGES, AND THE ONE CHANGE IS TO EXTEND THE PILOT BY 11 TWO YEARS, AS WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED AS OUR 12 RECOMMENDATION. THE OTHER CHANGE THAT WE ARE PROPOSE SUGGEST 13 TO REVISE OUR SUBSIDY APPROACH TO THE PROGRAM. AND IN REVISING 14 15 THIS, WE ARE PROPOSING TO DO AN UPFRONT ONE TIME PAYMENT THAT 16 COVERS TWO YEARS OF THE PILOT EXTENSION. CURRENTLY IT IS A REIMBURSEMENT BASIS, AND I WILL GO INTO DETAILS ON THIS ASPECT 17 IN THE NEXT SLIDE. THE THIRD COMPONENT, WHICH IS NOT A CHANGE 18 TO THE PROGRAM, NECESSARILY, BUT WHAT WE WANT TO RECOGNIZE IS 19 THAT TITLE SIX -- YES, TITLE SIX REMAINS A TRANSIT AGENCY 20 21 RESPONSIBILITY. AND WHILE MTC AND THE OPERATORS ARE WORKING TOGETHER, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO DO IS ALSO 22 PLAY A SUPPORT ROLE TO THE OPERATORS IN ADDRESSING THE TITLE 23 SIX REQUIREMENTS TO THE PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. A LITTLE 24 BIT MORE ABOUT THIS ONE TIME IN THE FUNDING CONTRIBUTIONS TO 25

MAY 8, 2023

THE PROGRAM AND SUBSIDY APPROACHES. SO, THE CURRENT PROGRAM OF 1 2 CLIPPER START IS A REIMBURSEMENT BASED PROGRAM WHERE OPERATORS 3 ARE REIMBURSED IF ARE A PORTION OF THEIR LOST REVENUE FROM CLIPPER START TRIPS. ANNUALLY MTC SET ASIDE TWO FUND SOURCES, 4 5 LOW CARBON TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM FUNDS FROM THE STATE, 6 CAP-AND-TRADE FUNDS, AND THE SECOND SOURCE IS STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE FUNDING AND BOTH ARE TO FUND THE FARE SUBSIDY 7 8 OFFSETS, BUT IT ALSO PAYING PACE FOR THE DIRECT ADMINISTRATIVE COST FOR THE PROGRAM. AND THE CURRENT ESTIMATE IN TERMS OF 9 SUBSIDY REIMBURSEMENT IN TOTAL TO DATE HAS BEEN ABOUT 500,000 10 SINCE INCEPTION. IN TERMS OF DIRECT ADMINISTRATIVE COST IT'S 11 RANGING ABOUT A MILLION PER YEAR, THIS INCLUDES ELIGIBILITY 12 VERIFIER, OUTREACH MARKETING, CENTRALIZED SYSTEM MAINTENANCE, 13 AND OTHER COST TO DIRECTLY ADMINISTER OF PROGRAM. SO, IN TERMS 14 OF THE PILOT PERIOD EXTENSION, WHAT WE ARE PROPOSE SUGGEST A 15 16 CHANGE ON HOW WE HANDLE THESE SUBSIDY REIMBURSEMENTS TO 17 OPERATORS. AND WHEN THE ORIGINAL PROGRAM WAS ADOPTED, THERE WAS A CONCERN THAT THE FUNDING SET ASIDE FOR THE PROGRAM WOULD 18 DRY UP QUICKLY. AND THE THERE WERE ONLY A FLEW SELECT PROGRAMS 19 AROUND THE NATION THAT HAD PROGRAMS THAT WERE SIMILAR SO WE 20 21 DON'T HAVE MUCH DATA OR LEARNED EXPERIENCE SO WE PROCEEDED ON A SUBSIDY BASED PROGRAM NOW WE HAVE THREE YEARS OF EXPERIENCE 22 AND USING THIS INFORMATION WE'RE PROPOSING A ONE TIME UPFRONT 23 PAYMENT FOR THE ENTIRE PERIOD OF THE TWO YEAR EXTENSION BASED 24 ON THIS DATA OUR GOALS FOR MOVING THIS MODEL TO INCLUDE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY 8, 2023

INCENTIVIZING PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM AND CONSISTENCY IN 1 DISCOUNTS OFFERED. CURRENTLY THE REIMBURSEMENT RATE IS BASED 2 ON A 20% -- THE 20% DISCOUNT, AND WE ARE PROPOSING TO INCREASE 3 AT 50% DISCOUNT. AND THEN SECONDLY, WE'RE LOOKING TO MINIMIZE 4 5 THE FINANCIAL RISK FOR OPERATORS AND ADMINISTRATIVE -- AND REDUCE THE ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN FOR BOTH MTC AND TRANSIT 6 AGENCIES IN PROCESSING REIMBURSEMENTS. AND THEN, I WOULD LIKE 7 8 TO NOTE THAT THE FUNDING DISTRIBUTION STILL NEEDS TO BE WORKED OUT, BUT WHAT WE HAVE DONE IS OUTLINED KEY COMPONENTS OF THE 9 FORMULA. UNDER THIS PROPOSAL MTC WILL INCREASE THE 10 REIMBURSEMENT RATE, AS I INDICATED, UP TO 50%, OR A PORTION OF 11 THE 50% DISCOUNT. AND FOR THOSE WHO ADOPTED A 50% DISCOUNT 12 EARLY ON WE PROPOSE A ONE TIME BACK PAY TO THOSE OPERATORS. 13 THE SECOND AND THIRD COMPONENT WE WOULD LIKE TO RECOGNIZE IN 14 15 THE FORMULA IS A \$15,000 GUARANTEED MINIMUM REIMBURSEMENT TO 16 OPERATORS AND THE FOURTH COMPONENT OF THIS FORMULA WOULD INCLUDE A PERCENTAGE CUSHION IN CASE GROWTH IS HIGHER THAN THE 17 CURRENT RATE. SO, ALLOTTING FOR SOME INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP AND 18 USAGE. AND THEN THE LAST FACTOR IN THIS FORMULA WOULD BE A 19 BUFFER AMOUNT TO OFFSET ANY UNDERESTIMATIONS FROM ANY OF THE 20 21 FOUR CALCULATIONS THAT I HAVE ALREADY HIGHLIGHTED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, WITH THAT, THAT IS A SUMMARY OF PROPOSED CHANGES 22 WE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AS WELL AS ONE-TIME FARE PAYMENT SUBSIDY 23 CHANGE. STAFF RECOMMENDING EXTENDING THE PILOT PROGRAM FOR AN 24 ADDITIONAL TWO YEARS, TO JUNE 2025 AND DURING THE TWO YEAR 25

MAY 8, 2023

EXTENSION PERIOD MIRRORS STAFF IN PARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSIT 1 AGENCIES AND STAKEHOLDER INPUT WE WOULD LIKE TO IMPLEMENT 2 3 MARKETING OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES TO INCREASE THE PROGRAM USAGE WE WOULD ALSO LIKE TO ASSESS STRATEGIES TO 4 5 SIMPLIFY AND POTENTIALLY EXPAND ACCESS TO THE BENEFIT. AND THIRD THING IS TO INNOVATE AND DEPLOY DIFFERENT STRATEGIES TO 6 INCREASE THE REACH AND REMOVE BARRIERS AND TO MAKE IT EASIER 7 8 TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PROGRAM TO MEET THE PROGRAM GOALS. AND THEN THE LAST COMPONENT OF THIS RECOMMENDATION IS THE FARE 9 SUBSIDY MODIFICATIONS. AND WE ARE PROPOSING TO SUPPORT THE 10 APPROACH OF A ONE TIME ESTIMATED PAYMENT WITH MINIMUM 11 GUARANTEES. AND MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATOR STAFF WOULD 12 WORK TO FINALIZE THE FORMULA OF THIS, IN THE SUMMER OF 2023. 13 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND IN SUMMARY, JUST TO HIGHLIGHT THE 14 15 OVERALL SCHEDULE AND WHERE WE'RE AT, WE HAVE PRESENTED THIS INFORMATION IN MORE DETAIL, THE FORM, TO THE CLIPPER START 16 WORKING GROUP AND FARES WORKING GROUP, AND WE HAVE ITERATIVELY 17 DONE THAT A FEW TIMES. THE TWO WEEKS AGO WE WENT TO THE FARE 18 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE PRESENTED THE SAME INFORMATION AND 19 AFTER HEARING FEEDBACK FROM ALL OF YOU TODAY AND DISCUSSIONS 20 21 WE ARE PROPOSING TO TAKE A RECOMMENDATION TO OUR JUNE 22 COMMISSION MEETINGS FOR ACTION THEN THEREAFTER STAFF WILL BEGIN WORKING ON ADVANCING THE STRATEGIES WORKING ON THE 23 SUBSIDY IF APPROVED, AND THEN THEREAFTER ONE OF THE THINGS 24 THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO ALSO INCORPORATE IS IF AGENCIES ARE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY 8, 2023

INTERESTED IN MAKING A CHANGE FROM INCREASING THEIR DISCOUNT 1 FROM 20% TO 50%, WE ARE AIMING -- AND WE HAVE SET A GOAL --2 3 THAT IN JANUARY OF 2024, FOR AGENCIES TO INDICATE THEIR INTEREST IN INCREASING THEIR DISCOUNT SO THAT WE WOULD TURN 4 5 AND EFFECTUATE A 50% CHANGE FOR A NUMBER OF OPERATORS ALL AT ONCE IN JANUARY 2024 FOR THOSE AGENCIES THAT ARE INTERESTED IN 6 CHANGING THEIR DISCOUNT. AND THROUGH THE ALL OF THIS, TRANSIT 7 8 AGENCY BOARDS WILL NEED TO TAKE ACTIONS, RESPECTIVELY, DEPENDING ON WHAT ACTIONS THEY HAVE ALREADY TAKEN. SO THOSE 9 WILL BE VARIED. AND WITH THAT, THIS SUMMARIZES OUR 10 PRESENTATION, AND JUDIS AND I ARE AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY 11 12 OUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE. 13 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND ARE 14 15 THERE ANY OUESTIONS AND/OR COMMENTS FROM THIS BODY? I HAVE A 16 BUNCH, BUT I'LL GO LATER. SO, GUY, STEVE. 17 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]. 18 19 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GO AHEAD. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: I'M NOT PART OF EQUITY BUT I AM PART OF THIS, AND MY 23 ORIENTATION IS HOW DO WE GET MORE RIDERS, WHEN I READ THE PRESENTATION, I DIDN'T UNDERSTAND IT BUT WHEN YOU WENT THROUGH 24 IT, IT WAS CLEAR AND A LOT OF MY QUESTIONS WERE ANSWERED 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

THROUGH YOUR PRESENTATION. ON THE STAFF RESPONSE TO THE 1 DIFFERENT ELEMENTS, THE AUTO ENROLL, SOUNDS LAKE A GREAT IDEA. 2 3 YOU KNOW, AGAIN, MY ORIENTATION IS HOW TO GET MORE RIDERS. AND I HAVE SPOKEN WITH CLIPPER BEFORE, AND, LET'S NOT HAVE CHEATS, 4 5 I'M NOT WORRIED ABOUT CHEATS. I'M WORRIED ABOUT GETTING MORE RIDERS. IF PEOPLE AUTO ENROLL AND THEN CHEAT, OKAY FINE. WE'LL 6 GET MORE RIDERS. I PROBABLY HAVE LESS PROBLEM WITH SELF-7 8 VERIFICATION BUT I CONDITIONED THAT. THE RATIONAL FOR INCREASE IN ELIGIBILITY MORE RIDERS. TODAY I CAME IN ON SMART AND THE 9 FERRY. I SAW SOMETHING ON THE SMART FARE WHICH I HADN'T SEEN 10 BEFORE. SMART HAS A DAILY CAP AND IF YOU RODE SMART MULTIPLE 11 TIMES YOU WENT THE FULL-LENGTH BACK AND FORTH, AND STILL THE 12 DAILY CAP IS GOING FROM ONE END TO THE OTHER END, A FARE ONCE, 13 FARE CAP IS A GREAT IDEA FINDING WAYS TO IMPLEMENT FARE CAPS 14 AND SAY HEY IT'S NOT GOING TO COST ME ANYTHING TODAY BECAUSE 15 16 I'VE ALREADY GONE PAST MY CAP WE ALL DO THAT. I JUST CAME BACK FROM NEW YORK AND TRAVELED ON THE SUBWAY, I DON'T HAVE TO 17 WORRY ABOUT MY ZONE I GET ON THE SUBWAY GO WHEREVER I NEED TO 18 GO AND GET OFF THE SUBWAYS, MY COUNCIL WAS GOING TO PICK ME UP 19 IN HIS CAR, THE BRING TOLL \$17 FOR ME TO TAKE ALL THE TRANSIT 20 WAS \$5. A LOT BETTER TO TAKE TRANSIT. I'M WORKING ON GETTING 21 MORE PEOPLE. TITLE SIX, I WOULD LIKE YOU TO EXPLAIN, YOU USED 22 THE TERM OPERATORS MULTIPLE TIMES AS OPPOSED TO TRANSIT 23 DISTRICTS AND I KNOW WE'RE EXTENDING, I BELIEVE WE'RE 24 EXTENDING CLIPPER TO OPERATORS WHO ARE NOT TRANSIT DISTRICTS 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



SO THAT THEY CAN USE CLIPPER THE BIKES OR OTHER PLACES ARE WE 1 TALKING ABOUT EXTENDING THIS THERE AS WELL, ABOUT THE 2 3 ADMINISTRATIVE COST FOR EACH ONE OF THE REGIONAL ENTITY WHAT'S ADMINISTRATIVE COST BECAUSE THIS IS THROUGH CLIPPER SO COST TO 4 5 HANDLE THIS AND THE ADMINISTRATION COSTS WOULD HAVE BEEN ON THE REPORTING SIDE OUT TO GET THEIR PAYMENTS. IS THERE 6 SOMETHING BEYOND THAT? I THINK THAT'S THE END OF MY LIST OF 7 8 QUESTIONS, BY THE WAY OUR FIRST ITEM HERE, I HAD A WHOLE BUNCH OF POINTS THAT WERE ON THE APPENDIX, AND -- ANYWAY, I 9 APOLOGIZES. FOR SOME REASON I HAD THE MEETING AT 2:00. DID 10 SOMEONE SEND AN ANNOUNCEMENT OUT AT ONE TIME SAYING IT WAS AT 11 TWO? 12

13

14 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. CAN STAFF ADDRESS THE

15 QUESTIONS?

16

MELANIE CHOY: SURE. I CAN START TO ADDRESS THEM. I GOT MOST OF 17 THEM DOWN YOU MIGHT NEED TO REPEAT A FEW IF I DON'T TOUCH ON 18 SOME OF THEM AND JUDIS MIGHT NEED TO AS WELL. FIRST QUESTION 19 HAD TO DO WITH THE OPERATORS AND USE OF THE TERM OPERATORS, 20 21 AND HAD A NUMBER OF COMMENTS I TOOK NOTE ON, THE OPERATORS WE ARE FOCUSED ON TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THIS PROGRAM RECOGNIZE THAT 22 AS AN AGENCY OVERALL MTC THERE ARE A NUMBER OF PROGRAMS THAT 23 INCORPORATE DISCOUNTS AND THINK THERE IS ADDITIONAL 24 DISCUSSIONS REGARDING MAYBE JEN CLIPPER AND OTHER THINGS THAT 25

MAY 8, 2023

MIGHT EXPLORE MULTIPLE BUT AT THIS POINT IN THIS JUNCTURE WE 1 COORDINATING ON ALL OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES INTO THE MEANS-2 3 BASED CLIPPER START PROGRAM ON THE CLIPPER CARD UNDER THE CURRENT GENERATION OF CLIPPER. IN TERMS OF ADMIN COST, THERE 4 5 ARE A FEW THINGS HERE THAT WE DO FUND AND THERE IS ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION. SO PARTICIPANT WHAT IS THEY CURRENTLY DO IS WE 6 HAVE A SALESFORCE SYSTEM AND THAT'S UNDERLYING THIS ENTIRE 7 8 PROGRAM, ALL THE DATA AND PROCESSING OF APPLICATIONS IS DONE THROUGH THIS PORTAL. THERE ARE COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH THAT, 9 THERE IS ALSO ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION, AND BECAUSE OF THIS 10 INCOME ELIGIBILITY, THERE IS ALSO A PROCESS FOR THAT, AND WE 11 DON'T REOUIRE TAXES, NECESSARILY, BUT THERE IS A PROCESS WHERE 12 YOU HAVE TO GO THROUGH TO SUBMIT THE APPROPRIATE PAPERWORK. 13 14 GERRY GLASER: AND THE AGENCIES ARE THE ONES WHO PROCESS THAT? 15 16 MELANIE CHOY: NO. MTC THROUGH ELIGIBILITY VERIFIER. 17 18 GERRY GLASER: I WAS TALKING ABOUT THE OPERATIONAL 19 ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS AT THE AGENCY LEVEL. 20 21 MELANIE CHOY: AT AGENCY LEVELS, ONE OF THE THINGS WE EMBARKED 22 ON THIS PROGRAM IS THAT IT SHOULD BE CENTRALLY ADMINISTERED SO 23 THE CENTRAL ADMINISTRATION WOULD DO IT FOR COLLECTIVELY ALL 24 THE AGENCIES SO THAT WE HAVE COORDINATION. 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MAY 8, 2023

1 GERRY GLASER: WITH TITLE SIX, I WAS GOING TO POINT OUT, 2 3 PARTICIPATION IN SANTA ROSA AND NORTH BAY OUR HEADWAYS ARE ATROCIOUS, AND IF YOU DO A RATIO BETWEEN RIDERSHIP OVER THE 4 5 NUMBER OF VEHICLES AND THE PARTICIPATION THAT YOU GOT 6 APPLYING, YOU MIGHT FIND THAT'S THE REASON THAT YOU HAVE SO 7 FEW. 8 SPEAKER: WELL, FIRST -- OH. GO AHEAD. 9 10 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: IF STAFF IS -- THAT'S GOOD. OTHERWISE --11 CAN WE TAKE THAT ONE AT THE END? BECAUSE THAT'S PRETTY --12 THAT'S A GENERAL TOPIC BUT WORTHY OF ANSWERING, LET'S GO 13 QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS SPECIFICALLY ON THE AGENDA ITEM. WENDI? 14 15 16 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: YEAH. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT STRUCK ME, WHEN YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT THE POPULATIONS YOU REACHED, 17 THAT 62% ARE ASIAN OR HISPANIC, NOT BLACK. AND I'M CURIOUS 18 ABOUT THAT. IS THERE SOME ISSUES IN REACHING OUT? -- I'M GOING 19 TO DO THINGS ONE AT A TIME TO HELP YOU OUT -- SO IS THERE AN 20 21 ISSUE WITH REACHING THE BLACK POPULATION. 22 JUDIS SANTOS: THE REASON THOSE NUMBERS ARE PARTICULARLY HIGH 23 IS BECAUSE MOST OF THE APPLICATIONS, THE USAGE, IS COMING FROM 24

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



SAN FRANCISCO, MUNI, THAT'S WHY THERE IS A HIGH CONCENTRATION 1 2 PARTICULARLY ASIAN AND HISPANIC DEMOGRAPHICS. 3 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: WHAT AREAS WOULD INCREASE 4 5 PARTICIPATION FROM THE AFRICAN AMERICAN? 6 JUDIS SANTOS: WE SEE THERE IS OPPORTUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE 7 REGION TO INCREASE ALL DEMOGRAPHICS. BECAUSE THE RESULTS ARE 8 RELATIVELY LOW. SO, THERE IS MUCH OPPORTUNITY WITHIN ALL 9 10 GROUPS. 11 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: MY OTHER COMMENT, OR OUESTION, THEN 12 COMMENT IS, HAVE THERE BEEN DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHAT THE 13 OUTREACH AND INCENTIVES ARE GOING TO BE IN ORDER TO INCREASE 14 15 PARTICIPATION? AND THEN I'LL HAVE A COMMENT. 16 JUDIS SANTOS: SO, I THINK THAT WE HAVE LEARNED THROUGH THIS 17 18 TWO YEAR PILOT, UM, WE HAVE LEARNED ABOUT, THERE ARE CERTAIN THINGS THAT WORKED WELL IN THE BEGINNING AND THERE ARE SOME 19 STRATEGIES THAT ARE WANING OFF. AND THERE ARE DIFFERENT 20 21 STRATEGIES AND PREFERENCES BASED ON AGE AND, YOU KNOW, CULTURAL BACKGROUNDS. SO, YOU KNOW, SO, FOR EXAMPLE, YOU KNOW, 22 FOR THOSE THAT ARE UNDER 35, THEY LEARNED ABOUT THE PROGRAM 23 THROUGH TRANSIT BUS ADVERTISEMENTS, WORD OF MOUTH, E-MAIL, WEB 24 SITE. AND THOSE OVER 35 LEARNED THROUGH RADIO, TV, NEWSPAPERS, 25

MAY 8, 2023

SOCIAL SERVICE, PUBLIC HEALTH AGENCIES AND COMMUNITY-BASED 1 ORGANIZATIONS. SO THERE ARE OTHER STRATEGIES THAT HAVE WORKED 2 3 WELL THROUGHOUT THE PILOT LIKE USING THE WEB SITE. SO WHAT WE LEARNED FROM THIS PERIOD IS THAT WE CAN'T HAVE JUST, LIKE, A 4 5 ONE SIZE FITS ALL, BASED ON A PARTICULAR, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, ONE CATEGORY. IT HAS TO BE CUSTOMIZED BASED ON A 6 CERTAIN DEMOGRAPHIC THAT YOU ARE TARGETING, AS WELL AS A 7 8 GEOGRAPHY. SO THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE LEARNED. IT CAN'T GIVE JUST LIKE THE MULTI-LINGUAL BROCHURES AND DOING RADIO 9 ADVERTISEMENTS. IT HAS TO BE A COMBINATION OF DIFFERENT 10 STRATEGIES. 11 12 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: WHAT ABOUT MARKETING INCENTIVES? 13 14 15 JUDIS SANTOS: SO DO YOU -- CAN YOU -- WHAT DO YOU --16 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: TO BE SPECIFIC, YOU MENTIONED KING 17 18 COUNTY IS IN THERE. ARE YOU FAMILIAR WITH THEIR IN-MOTION PROGRAM? 19 20 JUDIS SANTOS: SO FOR THE KING COUNTY MODEL WE WERE REFERRING 21 TO MORE THAN AUTO ENROLLMENT. 22 23 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: I KNOW THEY HAVE MUCH MORE GOING ON. 24 THEY HAVE THE WHOLE PROGRAM WHICH IS VERY, VERY SUCCESSFUL. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1

3

MAY 8, 2023

2 JUDIS SANTOS: OKAY.

V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: THEY HAVE A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT 4 5 STRATEGIES THAT INCENTIVIZE PEOPLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE PROGRAM. IT IS A CUSTOMER BASED PROGRAM. SOME OF IT IS VERY 6 CUST -- LABOR INTENSIVE, PROBABLY WOULDN'T WORK WITH THIS 7 8 PARTICULAR PROGRAM. BUT, FOR INSTANCE, IF PEOPLE ENROLL IN THE PROGRAM, THEY IMMEDIATELY GET A PACKAGE OF TRANSIT GUIDES. AND 9 THEIR PROGRAM IS BOTH BICYCLE, PEDESTRIAN, AND TRANSIT. THEY 10 GET A BIKE MAP. BUT, YOU KNOW, THE FIRST AND LAST MILE HELPS. 11 SO GETTING SOME INFORMATION ABOUT HOW TO USE THE PROGRAM CAN 12 BE VERY HELPFUL FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE JUST STARTING OUT. USING 13 TRANSIT. SO THAT'S ONE THING THAT THEY DO. THEY ALSO HAVE SOME 14 15 INTERESTING CONTESTS THAT THEY USE. THEY, ALSO, WHEN THEY GIVE 16 OUT THE CARD, THE CARD COMES WITH FIVE FREE TRANSIT TRIPS, AND YOU'RE ALREADY OFFERING A DISCOUNT. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT WOULD 17 WORK FOR YOU. BUT YOU GET SOMETHING FOR ENROLLING SO THERE IS 18 SOME KIND OF A PRIZE THERE. AND THEN THE CONTEST ITSELF IS 19 ABOUT INCREASING THE NUMBER OF TRIPS. SO, YOU USE A CLIPPER 20 21 CARD THEN YOU CAN TRACK IF THEY'RE ACTUALLY INCREASING THE NUMBER OF TRIPS TO START WITH THE BASELINE OF WHAT THEY'RE 22 DOING NOW, AND SEEING OVER A PERIOD OF TIME IF THEY -- IT'S 23 LIKE, INCREASE BY TWO, SO ADD TWO MORE TRANSIT TRIPS A WEEK 24 AND THEN YOU GET THIS GREAT PRICE AT THE END. THEY HAVE DONE 25



THIS ALL OVER THE AREA AND NEIGHBORHOOD BY NEIGHBORHOOD. AND 1 THEY HAVE GOTTEN INCREDIBLE RESULTS MUCH MORE THAN I HAVE EVER 2 3 SEEN IN ANY KIND OF A TDM PROGRAM. 4 5 JUDIS SANTOS: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT WORD, DEFINITELY EXPLORING THAT KING COUNTY PROGRAM. THANK YOU. 6 7 8 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: BOB ALLEN? 9 BOB ALLEN: THIS IS A VERY HELPFUL UPDATE. I APPRECIATE THE 10 CONSIDERATION OF THE UPFRONT DOLLARS, EVERY OPERATOR IS 11 COUNTING EVERY DOLLAR RIGHT NOW, AND I'M SURE THAT WILL HELP 12 ALLEVIATE SOME CONCERNS, AND PEOPLE AT THE AGENCIES AND TITLE 13 SIX SUPPORT, BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING, REFERRING TO THE TITLE 14 SIX CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 SO THAT'S ONE LITTLE -- AROUND 15 16 THE USE OF FEDERAL FUNDS SO WE HAVE TO COMPLY WITH THAT USE. AND PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN AUTO ENROLL STRATEGY OR TACTICS 17 FROM MY OWN EXPERIENCE WORKING ON THE FREE USE PROGRAM WORKING 18 WITH CLIPPER AND SFMTA. WE SAT DOWN WITH HUMAN SERVICES AGENCY 19 IN SAN FRANCISCO TO TRY TO FIGURE OUT THE DIFFERENT 20 21 CONFIGURATIONS, TO GET THAT PASSED OUT THROUGH CLIPPER, AND IT WAS VERY DIFFICULT FOR MUNI TO DISTRIBUTE THROUGH CLIPPER 22 ORIGINALLY. AS WE ADD THINGS ON LIKE THE AUTO ENROLL FEATURE 23 HELPS THE PROGRAM TO BENEFIT. ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS EBB AND 24 FLOW, AND DOLLARS GOING OUT, ADDING AUTO-ENROLL -- IT'S A 25



STRATEGY THAT'S BEEN SUCCESSFUL WITH OTHER OPERATORS THAT 1 TALKED TO ACROSS THE COUNTRY AND I HOPE WE CONSIDER THAT. 2 3 THANK YOU. 4 5 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. ANY? 6 7 WARREN CUSHMAN: HI, THIS IS WARREN. I CAN GO ADINA? 8 9 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GO AHEAD. 10 WARREN CUSHMAN: HI. THIS IS WARREN, AND I WANT TO ASK MELANIE, 11 WHERE -- YOU KNOW, I LISTENED TO THE WHOLE PRESENTATION, AND I 12 REALLY DIDN'T GET A SENSE OF WHERE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES 13 FIT IN THIS WHOLE MATRIX. I HEARD A LITTLE BIT ABOUT ACCESS, 14 BUT I DON'T KNOW THAT I HEARD ACCESS IN TERMS OF ADA. AND I DO 15 16 HAVE SOME QUESTIONS AROUND SOME OF THE FEATURES THAT WE'RE DISCUSSING, PUTTING AUTO ENROLL IN SOME OF THE OTHER FEATURES. 17 BUT, AGAIN, AS I DO WITH JUST ABOUT EVERY ITEM, I JUST DON'T 18 SEE A -- I DO NOT SEE SOMETHING GLARING IN TERMS OF PEOPLE 19 WITH DISABILITIES. CAN YOU TALK ABOUT WHERE THAT PIECE IS? AND 20 IS THAT SOMETHING YOU'RE LOOKING AT AS THE PILOT MOVES FORWARD 21 OVER THE NEXT, TO, WHAT, 20, 25, ARE YOU LOOKING AT A STRONG 22 23 ROBUST ADDITION IN TERMS OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES? THANK YOU. 24

MAY 8, 2023

MELANIE CHOY: MELANIE CHOY WITH MTC. AND, WARREN, THANK YOU 1 FOR YOUR QUESTION. ONE OF THE THINGS IN TERMS OF THIS 2 3 DISCOUNT. THIS DISCOUNT IS FOCUSED ON AGENCY 19 THROUGH 64 THAT DO NOT CURRENTLY HAVE ADULTS IN LOW-INCOME, THAT 4 5 CURRENTLY DO NOT HAVE ACCESS TO DISCOUNT PROGRAMS. SO THERE ARE YOUTH PROGRAMS AND THEN THERE IS ALSO RTC PROGRAM. THE 6 ENTIRE ACTION PLAN WE HAVE A SET OF PROPOSALS WHERE WE'RE 7 8 TRYING TO INTEGRATE RTC AND PARATRANSIT INTO THE CLIPPER SYSTEM AND DOING SOME MORE SEAMLESS ADVANCEMENTS IN THAT AREA. 9 10 IN TERMS OF DISCOUNTS THAT ARE OFFERED, THERE ARE SOME ESTABLISHED DISCOUNTS UNDER RTC THAT, FOR MOST AGENCIES, I 11 THINK IT VARIES, THE EXACT PERCENTAGES VARY, BUT IT HOVERS 12 50%, DISCOUNT, CURRENTLY. FOR MANY FOLKS WHO DO QUALIFY. I 13 THINK THAT YOUR COMMENT REGARDING AUTO ENROLL IS AN IMPORTANT 14 ONE FOR US TO THINK THROUGH, IN TERMS OF AUTO ENROLL FOR ALL 15 16 OF OUR PROGRAMS AND HOW THAT IS APPROACHED YOUTH TO THIS LOW-INCOME GROUP AS WELL AS IN ANY OTHER CATEGORIES THAT MIGHT 17 HAVE THESE DISCOUNTS SO THAT'S GREAT COMMENT WE'LL TAKE INTO 18 CONSIDERATION WHEN WE LOOK AT THE AUTO ENROLL ASPECTS OF THIS 19 ASSESSMENT. DO YOU HAVE --20

21

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: JUST A FOLLOW UP. SO, THERE ARE
POPULATIONS OF PEOPLE -- YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY, THERE IS
CATEGORIES OF PEOPLE TO GET THE RTC DISCOUNT, SO, ARE WE
EXPECTING THAT THERE ARE GOING TO BE PEOPLE WHO HAVE



DISABILITIES WHO DO NOT QUALIFY FOR RTC, BUT DO QUALIFY FOR 1 2 CLIPPER START? 3 MELANIE CHOY: I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT. WE CAN LOOK 4 5 INTO IT. IS THAT --6 7 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: YEAH. I THINK THAT PROBABLY HELPS WITH 8 WARREN'S QUESTION. HE'S SAY WHERE DO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES FIT, AND SOME PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES THAT HAVE ACCESS TO THE 9 RTC DISCOUNT SO THE QUESTION IS, ARE THERE OTHER PEOPLE WITH 10 DISABILITIES THAT DO NOT QUALIFY. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE HOW I'M 11 SUPPLEMENTING THE OUESTION THAT WARREN ASKED? 12 13 MELANIE CHOY: SURE. I DON'T HAVE THE ANSWER, BUT I'LL FOLLOW 14 15 UP AND TALK TO OTHER STAFF IN TERMS OF THE REQUEST AND NEEDS 16 IN TERMS OF THE RTC PROGRAM AND WE CAN EVALUATE AND PULL THAT INTO THIS DISCUSSION, AS WELL, AS WE DO THIS FURTHER 17 ASSESSMENT. 18 19 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: NEXT OUESTION? 20 21 22 SPEAKER: I WAS ACTUALLY RELIANT ON CLIPPER START AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC WHEN I WAS BETWEEN JOBS. SO THANK 23 YOU FOR WORKING ON THIS PROGRAM WHICH I SUDDEN SO IMPORTANT TO 24 A LOT OF PEOPLE. I HAD A QUESTION AROUND THE INCOME 25

MAY 8, 2023

ELIGIBILITY. RIGHT NOW THAT'S SET AT 200% OF THE FEDERAL 1 POVERTY LEVEL, WHICH I BELIEVE IS ONLY ABOUT \$29,000 A YEAR 2 3 FOR AN INDIVIDUAL, WHICH I THINK JUST ISN'T IN LINE WITH THE COST OF LIVING HERE IN THE BAY AREA. SO, I'M CURIOUS YOUR 4 5 THINKING AROUND THAT. I KNOW THERE ARE SOME HIGHER LIMES THAT HAVE BEEN SET BASED ON AREA MEDIAN INCOME. I'M CURIOUS HOW ARE 6 THINKING ABOUT THIS I KNOW IT'S KIND OF IN THE YELLOW CATEGORY 7 8 ON THE CHART. JUST CURIOUS WHAT YOU'RE DOING TO KIND OF LOOK INTO THAT AND FIGURE OUT A MEMBER ACCEPTABLE RANGE FOR INCOME 9 10 ELIGIBLE.

11

JUDIS SANTOS: SO, THANK YOU FOR LIFTING THAT UP. WE HAD 12 CONDUCTED FOCUS GROUPS AND ONE OF THE STRATEGIES THAT WAS 13 TREMENDOUSLY POPULAR WAS LOOKING AT INCREASING THE FEDERAL 14 POVERTY LEVEL. WHAT WE -- WHEN WE IDENTIFIED IT AS A STRATEGY, 15 16 WE SAW THAT ADJUSTING THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL WOULD INTERFACE WITH OTHER GOALS AND FACTORS. FOR EXAMPLE. IF YOU 17 ADJUST IT TO 400, IT WILL IMPACT, FOR EXAMPLE, THE AUTO 18 ENROLLMENT IF IT'S NOT CAL-FRESH AND CAL-WORKS. ONE OF THE 19 THINGS WE'RE CURRENTLY DOING IS SCOPING OUT WHAT DOES THAT --20 21 WHAT DOES EACH OF THE STRATEGIES MEAN AND WHERE DO THEY INTERFACE, AND AFFECT EACH OTHER, AND WITH THAT, MELANIE, DO 22 YOU WANT TO TALK A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT WHAT THE SCOPE MAY 23 INCLUDE AND WHAT WE'RE LOOKING INTO AS FAR AS 200, 400, OR 24 25 OTHER?

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

1

MELANIE CHOY: SO THIS VERY QUESTION YOU HAVE IS THE REASON WHY 2 3 IT REQUIRES WHY WE'RE RECOMMENDING TO DO AN ADDITIONAL ASSESSMENT BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT TIED INTO THIS. ONE OF THE 4 5 PREMISES OF US ADOPTING A 200% FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL IN THIS EXISTING PROGRAM WAS BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT OF EXISTING 6 PROGRAMS AND DOCUMENTATION THAT COULD QUALIFY FOLKS EASILY 7 8 WITHIN THIS PROGRAM AND DEFER MANY OF THOSE PROGRAMS SO THE AUTO ENROLL MAKES IT OUICKER TO DO THE ELIGIBILITY 9 VERIFICATION PROCESS SHIFTING DIFFERENT THRESHOLDS WOULD 10 REQUIRE US A DIFFERENT SET OF PROCESSES AND EVALUATION AND 11 WOULD HELP US DETERMINE THE BENEFITS AND RISKS THERE'S 12 ADDITIONAL REVIEW ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS AND THOSE THINGS TO BE 13 14 FACTORED INTO THE ASSESSMENT AND I ALSO RECOGNIZE THE PROGRAMS 15 OTHER FOLKS ARE ROLLING OUT WITH DIFFERENT THRESHOLDS, IF 16 THERE IS DIFFERENT AGENCIES ADOPTING OTHER PERCENTAGES AND DIFFERENT ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS OR DIFFERENT THRESHOLDS 17 THAT WE WOULD INCLUDE THAT IN OUR ASSESSMENT AS WELL TO LOOK 18 AT WHAT THEIR PROCESS HAS BEEN, WHAT THEY HAVE WEIGHED AS PROS 19 AND CONS AND JUST ROLLING IT OUT. 20

MAY 8, 2023

21

SPEAKER: THANKS. YEAH. I LOVED HOW EASY IT WAS TO APPLY AND HAVE IT CONNECTED WITH, LIKE, CAL-FRESH. BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE GREAT TO HAVE THAT, AND, YOU KNOW, HIGHER THING, AS WELL. SO ENCOURAGE YOU TO LOOKING INTO THAT. THANK YOU.

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MAY 8, 2023

1	
2	EMILY LOPER: GREAT. THANK YOU. THANKS AGAIN FOR THE
3	PRESENTATION. SO, YOU NOTED ON THE KEY LEARNING SLIDE THAT THE
4	PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM SEEMS TO BE INCREASING TRANSIT
5	USAGE. IT SAYS THAT TRANSIT PARTICIPANT FREQUENCY IS UP TO 5.6
6	TRIPS PER WEEK. DO WE HAVE ANY SENSE OF WHAT THAT BASELINE WAS
7	BEFORE THEY PARTICIPATED IN THE PROGRAM? AND THEN I HAVE A
8	SECOND TWO-PART QUESTION.
9	
10	JUDIS SANTOS: WHEN LOOKING AT COMPARISONS THE EVALUATION AND
11	PILOT WAS LAUNCHED RIGHT WHEN THERE WERE
12	
13	EMILY LOPER: WHEN WE WERE IN LOCKDOWN.
14	
15	JUDIS SANTOS: YES. WE WERE IN LOCKDOWN. SO, WHAT WE'RE BASING
16	IT ON IS THE, LIKE SELF-REPORTING OF HOW MUCH THE INDIVIDUALS
17	TRAVELED AS WELL AS TO OUR FOCUS GROUPS. BUT WE KNOW WE'RE
18	GOING TO HAVE TO CONTINUE OUR EVALUATION TO LOOK AT WHAT THE -
19	- WHAT THE NEW BASELINE WOULD BE. BECAUSE I THINK COMPARING IT
20	TO, YOU KNOW, DURING THE LOCKDOWN POWERED, IS SOMETHING THAT
21	WE WOULD HAVE TO
22	
23	EMILY LOPER: YEAH. TO SEE WHETHER THEY'RE TRAVELING MORE
24	BECAUSE OF THE PARTICIPATION OF THE PROGRAM OR BECAUSE THEY'RE
25	JUST MOVING AROUND MORE NOW.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 2 JUDIS SANTOS: EXACTLY. 3 EMILY LOPER: AND THEN MY SECOND QUESTION WAS, ARE YOU TRACKING 4 5 THE TRAVEL PATTERNS OF THE USAGE SO THAT YOU CAN IDENTIFY, POTENTIALLY, CORRIDORS, SO YOU CAN INCREASE OUTREACH TO 6 7 INCREASE UPTAKE? OR --8 JUDIS SANTOS: YES. WE'RE LOOKING AT, LIKE, WHERE PEOPLE ARE 9 10 TRAVELING, WHO, PARTICULARLY, THE DEMOGRAPHICS. SO WE HAVE THAT INFORMATION BY OPERATOR. 11 12 EMILY LOPER: OKAY. SO LIKE SPECIFIC LINES, OR ORIGIN 13 14 DESTINATIONS? 15 16 JUDIS SANTOS: WE HAVE ORIGIN DESTINATIONS. BUT -- WE MAY HAVE 17 SPECIFIC LINES, BUT WE HAVE ORIGIN OF DESTINATION. 18 EMILY LOPER: OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU. 19 20 IAN GRIFFITHS: I WAS GOING TO ASK THE SAME. MY QUESTION IS THE 21 SAME AS EMILY'S, BUT I THINK KNOWING -- I THINK THE BAY PASS 22 RESULTS YOU HAVE BEEN SHARING AT OTHER MEETINGS HAVE BEEN 23 POWERFUL AND YOU HAD THIS CONTROLLED SAMPLE, BEING ABLE TO 24 SHOW HOW PEOPLE WHO PARTICIPATE ARE TRAVELING 35% MORE THAN 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MAY 8, 2023

PEOPLE WHO AREN'T. I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO 1 2 HAVE SOME KIND OF SIMILAR CONTROL, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WHO 3 QUALIFY THAT WHO AREN'T ENROLLED VERSUS PEOPLE WHO HAVE ENROLLED AND KNOWING WHAT PERCENTAGE THAT MIGHT BE FOR THIS 4 5 PROGRAM WOULD BE HELPFUL IF THERE IS SOME WAY GETTING THIS INFORMATION I THINK COULD HELP MAKE THE CASE FOR CONTINUING TO 6 FUND IT. THINKING ABOUT THE FUTURE OF THIS PROGRAM, I MEAN, 7 8 WHAT -- IS THERE A TARGET UPTAKE LEVEL THAT -- I'M JUST WONDERING, YOU ARE PROPOSING EXPANDING THE PROGRAM FOR TWO 9 YEARS. RIGHT NOW THE COST OF RUNNING IT OUTWEIGH THE TOTALLY 10 AMOUNT THAT'S BEING REIMBURSED TO RIDERS. I THINK A MILLION 11 DOLLARS PER YEAR TO ADMINISTER IT. AT WHAT POINT DO YOU ASSESS 12 THIS AND SAY, LIKE, MAYBE -- IS THERE A TARGET THRESHOLD THAT 13 YOU ARE TRYING TO GET TO AND IF YOU DON'T HIT THAT YOU WOULD 14 15 CONSIDER OTHER MEANS OF TRYING TO OFFER DISCOUNTS TO LOW-16 INCOME PEOPLE AND MAYBE DETERMINING THAT THIS PROGRAM IS NOT WORTH CONTINUING TO PURSUE. IS IT A -- YOU KNOW, 50% -- IS IT 17 80%, YOU KNOW, DISBURSEMENT VERSUS ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS IS 18 THERE SOME KIND OF THRESH TARGET THRESHOLD THERE ARE OTHER 19 MEANS OF REIMBURSING LOW-INCOME PEOPLE DESPITE EFFORTS, AND 20 21 TWO MORE YEARS LIKE UPTAKE IS LOW, WHETHER IT'S CONTINUING WORTH PUTTING MONEY INTO THE PROGRAM. 22

23

24 JUDIS SANTOS: HOW DO YOU DEFINE SUCCESS AND WE GRAPPLE WITH 25 THE QUESTION OF WHAT PERCENTAGE UPTAKE.

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

1

MAY 8, 2023

MELANIE CHOY: I WOULD SAY UPTAKE PERCENTAGE IS A MOVING TARGET 2 3 BECAUSE THIS IS ROLLED OUT DURING COVID AND THE TRAVEL PATTERNS ARE CHANGING WHILE WE DON'T NECESSARILY HAVE A 4 5 PROPOSED UPTAKE PERCENTAGE WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING IN TERMS OF WHAT DOES SUCCESS MEAN WE DON'T HAVE ANYTHING SPECIFIC BUT WE 6 DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT, WE'RE TRYING TO DO METRICS AND 7 8 EVALUATION LOOKING AT OUTCOMES AND FIGURES AND REALLY ASSESS SUGGEST INCREASING OPPORTUNITY INCREASING THE ACCESS TO, JUST 9 10 A NUMBER OF QUALITY OF LIFE METRICS. AND, SO, IN THE INITIAL TERM AND TIME PERIOD, WE ARE LOOKING TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF 11 -- AND PERHAPS MAYBE JUDIS CAN GIVE NUMBERS IN TERMS OF 12 POSSIBLY A GOAL WE HAVE, BUT TO INCREASE UPTAKE AND INCREASE 13 USAGE AND THE OTHER FACTOR I THINK WILL ALSO BE IMPORTANT IS 14 15 THE ROLL OUT TO THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER BECAUSE THAT WILL 16 ALLOW US TO ALSO EMPLOY A LOT OF, A FEW OTHER DIFFERENT STRATEGIES THAT CAN THEN ALSO HELP INCREASE USAGE SO OUR TIME 17 PERIOD IN THE NEXT TWO YEARS IS REALLY TO TRY TO FOCUS ON HOW 18 CAN WE REALLY INCREASE THAT, KIND OF -- YOU KNOW, MOVE THAT 19 BASELINE TO HAVE A HIGHER, EVEN, STARTING POINT AND BASE LEVEL 20 21 TO GO WITH -- IT'S NOT A VERY SPECIFIC ANSWER, BUT WE'RE LOOKING FOR REALLY INCREASED USAGE. AND AT SOME JUNCTURE, WE 22 WOULD PROBABLY ASK THE OUESTIONS YOU'RE ALSO ASKING IF THESE 23 STRATEGIES THAT WE'LL BE WORKING THROUGH AND TRYING OUT ARE 24 NOT GETTING US TO A HIGHER USAGE. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

MAY 8, 2023

JUDIS SANTOS: TO ADD ON THAT, THE ORIGINAL GOALS OF THE 2 3 CLIPPER START PILOT WERE DEVELOPED PRECOVID. SO IF YOU LOOK AT THE GOALS, YOU KNOW, WERE THEY ATTAINED. YOU KNOW, GOING DOWN 4 5 THE LIST, AND YES, THEY WERE ATTAINED. HOWEVER, THE BIGGEST CHALLENGE IS GETTING THE BENEFIT INTO THE HANDS EVER PEOPLE 6 7 THAT WE REALLY NEED TO TRANSFORM, LIKE OUR MARKETING 8 ENGAGEMENT THAT'S OUR FIRST PRIORITY. AND AS WITH THE VARIETY 9 STRATEGIES, WE'RE LOOKING AT THOSE STRATEGIES TO FURTHER BUILD UPON. YOU KNOW, THE MARKETING, OUTREACH, ENGAGEMENT, TO GET 10 PEOPLE SIGNED UP IS OUR PRIMARY. AND THEN ALSO REVISIT OUR 11 GOALS AND PERHAPS ESTABLISH NEW GOALS AND METRICS BASED ON THE 12 CURRENT ENVIRONMENT. 13 14 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: SO, FIRST OF ALL, HAVEN'T HEARD ANY OF THE 15 16 MEMBERS ON THE ZOOM, SO DOES ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, OR TERRY SCOTT OR OTHERS HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? 17 18 19 TERRY SCOTT: NOT AT THIS POINT. 20 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. 21 22

23 SPEAKER: HE SAID NO.

MAY 8, 2023

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: I WASN'T READY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT YET.
 THERE ARE STILL SOME PEOPLE WHO HAVEN'T SPOKEN YET. I'LL GO TO
 BRIAN, THEN ME, AND THEN PEOPLE WHO HAVE A SECOND COMMENT.

4

5 BRIAN STANKE: THANK YOU. I HAVE SEVERAL OUESTIONS. I'LL GO BY SLIDE. ON THE INITIAL ONES, SORT OF, BUILDING ON WHAT IAN WAS 6 ASKING ABOUT, IT SOUNDS LIKE THERE WASN'T, IN 2020, NUMERIC 7 8 GOALS FOR, YOU KNOW, THE ENROLLEES, THE ACTIVE PROGRAM USERS. I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY BENEFICIAL TO LOOK AT, AS PART OF 9 10 THE EXTENSION, ARE THERE GOALS EITHER NUMERICAL, OR AS A PERCENTAGE OF THE ELIGIBLE POPULATION IN THE BAY AREA, OR 11 ELIGIBLE POPULATION IN THE BAY AREA THAT'S BEING SERVED BY THE 12 ENROLLED AGENCIES, WHICH I UNDERSTAND IS CHANGING NUMBER. BUT 13 THOSE, SORT OF, GOALS AND METRICS, SORT OF, ARE WE COULD 14 15 SUCCESSFUL IN OUR OUTREACH. AND THEN ON SLIDE SIX, I WAS 16 CONFUSED ABOUT THESE STRATEGIES. FIRST IT DOESN'T SAY WHERE THEY'RE FROM. BUT, SECONDLY, THE CONSISTENT DISCOUNT IS MARKED 17 AND STAFF ACCEPTS. BUT THE STAFF IS NOT IMPLEMENTING AS PART 18 OF THE TWO YEAR EXTENSION. SO, THAT SEEMS LIKE A COST DICTION 19 THERE. LIKE, IS IT STAFF WANTS TO DO IT AFTER 2025? WITH 20 21 CLIPPER TWO? OR, BECAUSE WE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND IT'S STILL THE 20% OR 50%. IT'S UP TO EACH AGENCY. IT'S 22 INCONSISTENT BETWEEN AGENCIES. AND GOING BACK TO OUR PREVIOUS 23 INARTICULATION OF FARE INTEGRATION, EVEN IF IT'S NOT AS GOOD, 24 IF IT'S 30 OR 35%, RATHER THAN 50%, HAVING A ONE PERCENTAGE 25

MAY 8, 2023

OFF THAT NO MATTER WHERE YOU GO, IT DOESN'T CHANGE BY
OPERATOR, SEEMS IMPORTANT. ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE TRIPS WHERE
LOW-INCOME PEOPLE NEED TO TRANSFER BETWEEN OPERATORS. YOU
KNOW, DO YOU WANT TO HAVE AN LIST OF OPERATORS WHICH DISCOUNT,
HOW MUCH YOUR RIDE COSTS. WHY IS IT ACCEPTED BUT NOT
IMPLEMENTED?

7

8 MELANIE CHOY: TO ADDRESS THE CONSISTENT DISCOUNT. WHEN THIS PROGRAM KICKED OFF IT WAS PRE-PANDEMIC. MUCH OF THE FARE 9 INTEGRATION POLICY STUDY WORK. SO WHAT WE EMBARKED ON WAS A 10 VOLUNTARY PROGRAM. AND THIS IS AN OPT-IN PROGRAM. OPERATORS, 11 TRANSIT AGENCIES CAN CHOOSE TO PARTICIPATE, AND THEN THEY CAN 12 ALSO CHOOSE WHICH DISCOUNT TO OFFER. AND AT THAT TIME WHEN WE 13 HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS, AND ACTUALLY IT'S VERY SIMILAR TO NOW, 14 THERE IS FINANCIAL PRESSURES ON THESE AGENCIES AND BACK THEN 15 16 IT WAS THE SAME SITUATION. SO TO ENCOURAGE AND PROVIDE OPTIONS FOR JUST PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM, WE LANDED ON THE MOST -17 - TO PERCENTAGE DISCOUNTS. SO ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE LOOKING 18 IN THIS EXTENSION PERIOD WHICH IS HENCE THE PROPOSING ONE TIME 19 UP FRONT SUBSIDY AND INCREASING THE MTC CONTRIBUTION TO THE 20 21 REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION SHARE IS TO ENCOURAGE THE 50%. I MEAN THIS PROGRAM CONTINUES TO BE VOLUNTARY BASED. ON THE PERIOD 22 TRYING TO WORK TOWARDS A COLLABORATIVE PROCESS TO GET TO A 23 PLACE WHERE AGENCIES WOULD CONSIDER 15%, AND DOING 55%, BASED 24 ON THE REASONS YOU HAVE INDICATED JUST FOR CONSISTENCY REASONS 25



AND THIS HAS BEEN OUR APPROACH FOR THIS PROGRAM AT THIS
 JUNCTURE. SO WE HAVE HAD THOSE DISCUSSIONS AND WE'RE FOCUSED
 ON INCENTIVIZING THAT CONSISTENCY TO 50%.

4

5 BRIAN STANKE: IF THAT'S THE CASE, WE'RE STILL OPERATE FIGURE A WORLD WHERE IT'S CUSTOMER FOCUSED, BUT THE CUSTOMER IS THE 6 OPERATOR. AND IT'S NOT THE RIDE ERR. BECAUSE THE OPERATOR CAN 7 8 SAY YES OR NO. SO, JUST YOU POSSIBLY WANT TO UPDATE THE SLIDE TO SAY YOU'RE NOT DOING IT RIGHT THEN YOU'RE DOING IT. ON THE 9 ADMINISTRATIVE COST QUESTION SLIDE EIGHT I'M WONDERING, THE 10 BREAK DOWN, DAY-TO-DAY, RUNNING OF THE ELIGIBILITY 11 VERIFICATION PART OF IT AND MARKETING AND OUTREACH. RIGHT NOW 12 IT LOOKS LIKE YOU ARE SPENDING TWICE AS MUCH ON OVERHEAD AS 13 YOU ARE ON FARES. BUT IS THAT THE OVERHEAD OF RUNNING THE 14 PROGRAM OR IS THAT THE OUTREACH THAT WILL GO EVEN MORE BECAUSE 15 16 IT COSTS THAT MUCH TO PULL PEOPLE IN? I THINK HAVING MORE INFORMATION ON THAT, WOULD BE HELPFUL. 17

18

JUDIS SANTOS: THAT DETAILED INFORMATION IS IN THE TECHNICAL
REPORT THAT WILL BE MADE AVAILABLE AT THE END OF MAY. BUT JUST
TO BROADLY -- IT IS MAJORITY MADE UP OF ELIGIBILITY
VERIFICATION AND MARKETING OUTREACH AND THEN THEREABOUTS,
THEY'RE ABOUT THE SAME. SO I DON'T WANT TO SAY SPECIFICALLY,
BUT THEY'RE RELATIVELY THE SAME.



1 BRIAN STANKE: OKAY.

2

3 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: UH-HUH.

4

5 BRIAN STANKE: THAT'S IT FOR MY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

6

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. THANKS. AND ANNE OLIVIA WAS HAVING 7 8 SOME TECHNICAL ISSUES AND SHE WILL SPEAK UP WHEN SHE IS ABLE TO TALK. A FEW THINGS BEFORE A FEW THINGS BEFORE GOING TO THE 9 10 SECOND COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS, I WANT TO ECHO WHAT OTHER PEOPLE SAID IN TERMS OF SUPPORTING THE AUTO ENROLLMENT, 11 ANYTHING THAT MAKES IT MORE CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE TO SIGN UP 12 FOR BENEFITS THAT PEOPLE ARE ELIGIBLE FOR IS GOOD, AND, AS 13 CONVENIENCE, WITH REGARD TO VTA, WOULD WANT TO EXPRESS STRONG 14 15 SUPPORT FOR VTA TO BE JOINING, ESPECIALLY SINCE WE'RE GOING TO 16 THE FREE AND REDUCED COST TRANSFERS NEXT YEAR, AND SAYING, 17 HEY, YOU KNOW, A PERSON WITH LOW-INCOME, IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO GET YOUR DISCOUNT AS YOU TRANSFER FROM VTA TO BART, YOU 18 HAVE TO SIGN UP IN TWO PLACES, THAT'S JUST CRUEL. WE SHOULD 19 NOT DO THAT. AND AS WE'RE HAVING MORE CONNECTIONS, PROGRAMS, 20 WOULD HOPE THAT VTA WOULD BE SUPPORTIVE AND WOULD ALSO WONDER 21 IF STAFF KNOWS WHERE THIS IS ACKNOWLEDGE, AND VTA THROUGH 22 THEIR COMMITTEE PROCESS IN ORDER TO HAVE THEM TO BE ENCOURAGED 23 TO SUPPORT JOINING THIS PROGRAM. SPEAKING OF EASE OF USE AND 24 ACCUMULATORS. SO, PAY AS YOU GO, IT HAS POTENTIAL TO BE REALLY 25

MAY 8, 2023

GOOD FOR FARE EQUITY, YOU KNOW, LIKE, COMPARED TO, FOR 1 2 EXAMPLE, DISCOUNT FEE, A PASS WHERE YOU NEED TO HAVE \$100 AT 3 THE BEGINNING OF THE MONTH, AS OPPOSED TO PAYING AS YOU GO AND GETTING YOUR DISCOUNT AS A CAP, THAT SEEMS VERY GOOD, ONE 4 5 OUESTION, I WONDER IF IT'S BEING CONSIDERED IS A MULTI-AGENCY CAP. BECAUSE I'M TRYING TO THINK ABOUT, YOU KNOW, BEING IN SAN 6 FRANCISCO OR EAST BAY AND USING SFMTA AND BART AND TRYING TO 7 8 REMEMBER WHERE ARE YOU CLOSE TO YOUR CAP ON MUNI AND BART THAT, JUST MAKES MY HEAD HURT. THAT SEEMS LIKE NOT A GOOD SET 9 OF THINKING THAT WE WANT TO BE IMPOSING UPON PEOPLE. AND, SO, 10 LOOKING INTO A MULTI-AGENCY CAP, THAT WILL CERTAINLY HAVE MORE 11 FINANCIAL CHANGES FOR THE AGENCIES, BUT IF WHAT WE'RE TRYING 12 TO DO IS MAKING THE SYSTEM AFFORDABLE, ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE 13 THAT NEED THE AFFORDABILITY, I WOULD ENCOURAGE CONSIDERING 14 15 THAT MULTI-AGENCY CAP. THE -- LET'S SEE -- AND SPEAKING OF 16 ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO AFFORDABILITY, ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE HEADING INTO DOING PLANNING FOR A POTENTIAL REGIONAL TRANSIT 17 FUNDING MEASURE, WHERE WE HEAR FROM, YOU KNOW, VOTERS THAT 18 AFFORDABILITY IS, AT LEAST, YOU KNOW, PART OF THE PICTURE IN 19 TERMS OF WHAT PEOPLE NEED AND WHAT WOULD HELP INCREASE 20 21 RIDERSHIP, IT WOULD BE REALLY GOOD TO BE ANALYZING, IN ADDITION TO THE DISCOUNT PROGRAM, EVERYDAY LOW FARES. SO, 22 DURING THE REGIONAL FARE STUDY, IT WAS ANALYZED, WELL, WHAT 23 WOULD THE BENEFIT BE OF STANDARDIZING THE LOCAL FARE. BUT WHEN 24 25 THAT WAS ANALYZED, THAT WAS ASSESSED TO BE AN EQUITY PROBLEM,

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY 8, 2023

BECAUSE WITHOUT ANY NEW MONEY COMING INTO THE SYSTEM, IF YOU 1 2 WANT TO KEEP YOUR REVENUE CONSTANT FOR THE AGENCY, THEN EITHER 3 STANDARDIZING THE LOCAL FARE, MAKING IT LOWER, IT MAKES IT HARDER FINANCIALLY IF YOU MAKE IT HIGHER THEN IT'S FINANCIALLY 4 5 HARMFUL TO LOW-INCOME TRANSIT RIDERS BUT IN THE CONTEXT OF A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE IF THERE WAS A FUNDING COME IN TO 6 HELP GET TO EVERYDAY LOW FARE LEVEL THAT WOULD OBVIOUSLY 7 8 GREATLY REDUCE THE ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS AND YOU KNOW HELP WITH THE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND MOBILITY BENEFITS AND THERE WAS A 9 SIDE BENEFIT IN HAVING STANDARDIZED LOCAL FARE THAT ENABLED 10 MOST EASY TO USE WAYFINDING BECAUSE THE SIGNAGE CAN FOCUS ON 11 THE DESTINATION WHERE SOMEONE IS TRYING TO GO AS OPPOSED TO 12 THE SIGNAGE FOCUSING ON WHICH AGENCY IS IT BECAUSE YOUR PASS 13 OR FARE MIGHT NOT BE ANY GOOD ON AGENCY X OR Y, BUT IF THE 14 15 AGENCY IS ALL THE SAME THEN THERE DOESN'T NEED TO BE THAT THE 16 WAYFINDING CAN BE FOCUSED. THIS IS OBVIOUSLY NOT SOMETHING DIRECTLY IN THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM BUT IS EXTREMELY TIMELY 17 BECAUSE THE ANALYSIS FOR THE REGIONAL MEASURE IS GOING TO BE 18 HAPPENING IN COMING MONTHS SO. THAT'S SOMETHING, WITH A VOICE, 19 TRANSIT ADVOCACY HAT ON WITH VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION 20 21 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT VOICES IS INTERESTED IN EXPLORING. LET'S SEE, WHAT ELSE? BACK UP ON THE METRICS, IT -- IN THE 22 DETAIL, DO YOU HAVE, YOU KNOW, WHAT PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE IN 23 THE BAY AREA WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR CLIPPER START? IS THAT A 24 25 NUMBER THAT YOU HAVE?

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 JUDIS SANTOS: YES. IT'S BASED ON THE 2021 ACS, 1.6 MILLION. 2 3 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. OUT OF THAT 1.6 MILLION PEOPLE DO 4 5 YOU HAVE A SENSE OF HOW MANY LOW-INCOME PEOPLE USE TRANSIT, 6 GENERALLY? 7 8 JUDIS SANTOS: WE DON'T CURRENTLY HAVE THAT NUMBER FOR -- WE CURRENTLY DON'T HAVE THAT NUMBER. 9 10 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: OKAY. SO, IN THE INTEREST OF KIND OF 11 UNDERSTANDING WHERE Y'ALL ARE, THAT MIGHT BE USEFUL TO KNOW. 12 LIKE WHAT PERCENTAGE OF TRANSIT USERS ARE ELIGIBLE AND THEN 13 ALSO WHAT PERCENTAGE OF ELIGIBLE PEOPLE USE OTHER PROGRAMS 14 LIKE CAL-FRESH. LET'S SEE, IF I HAVE ANY OTHER -- I GUESS ONE 15 16 LAST THING IS ALSO MORE POINTING TO THINGS THAT WE MIGHT BE 17 DOING LATER. LIKE, I REALLY LIKE THE IDEA OF SAYING, OKAY, IF YOU HAVE A DISCOUNT PROGRAM FOR TRANSIT, CAN THIS BE EXTENDED 18 TO BIKESHARE OR SOME OTHER MOBILE PROGRAM, AND AS THE -- THIS 19 COMMITTEE TRANSITIONED INTO A VOICE OF THE CUSTOMER AND WE'RE 20 21 LOOKING AT HOW TO POTENTIALLY EXPAND OVER TIME, THE SCOPE OF THINGS THAT APPLY TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND REGIONAL 22 COORDINATION, THAT COULD LOGICALLY FIT. AND SO HOPEFULLY THAT 23 WILL BE SOMETHING THAT WE'LL BE KIND OF THINKING ABOUT IN THE 24 25 FUTURE. AND, SIMILARLY, THE TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT

MAY 8, 2023

1 TYPE APPROACHES THAT WENDI WAS RAISING, THIS ALSO WOULD BE A 2 LOGICAL THING TO THINK ABOUT EXPANDING INTO HAVING A MULTI-3 AGENCY APPROACH TO THE TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS AND 4 BENEFITS. YOU KNOW? THAT ARE HELPFUL TO LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND 5 THAT ARE MORE BROADLY HELPFUL. I THINK THAT WAS IT. BACK TO 6 WENDI -- NO. NO. ANNE OLIVIA HAS NOT SPOKEN YET AND ANNE 7 OLIVIA IS BACK. SO LET'S TAKE ANNE OLIVIA FIRST.

8

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. MY COMPUTER REBOOTED SIZE BUT 9 NOW MY CAMERA WORKS. SO THAT'S EXCITING. I REALLY APPRECIATE 10 THIS PRESENTATION. IT DOES -- IT MAKES WHAT I READ MAKE SO 11 MUCH MORE SENSE AND IT'S REALLY THOUGHTFULLY LAID OUT. I ALSO 12 REALLY APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION THAT HAS BEEN HAPPENING 13 AMONG THIS BODY. AND, SO, AS OPPOSED ON TO REITERATING SOME 14 15 VERY SHARED CONCERNS THAT OTHER FOLKS HAVE BROUGHT UP, 16 ESPECIALLY AROUND AFFORDABILITY AND ACCESSIBILITY AND THOSE 17 KIND OF THINGS, THERE IS JUST ONE OTHER THING THAT I WANT TO ADD HERE, AND APOLOGIES IF YOU COVERED IT WHILE MY COMPUTER 18 RESTARTED -- AND THAT WAS THE RECOMMENDATION TO REJECT THE 19 ABILITY TO SELF-CERTIFY. AND I REALLY THINK THAT WE SHOULD 20 21 ALLOW THAT. SO, IN, LIKE, MY PREVIOUS JOB WAS, AS THE HOMELESS SERVICES LIAISON FOR PART IN EAST COUNTY, ALAMEDA COUNTY, AND 22 ONE OF THE BIG, BIG, BIG ISSUES THAT WE HAD WAS GETTING THE 23 STUFF TOGETHER THAT ALLOWED PEOPLE TO CERTIFY. AND IT -- IT 24 WAS UNBELIEVABLE BARRIERS FOR SOME PEOPLE. AND MOST -- I MEAN 25

MAY 8, 2023

SOME PEOPLE ARE GOING TO CHEAT, BUT THEY'RE GOING TO FIND WAYS 1 TO CHEAT ON ANYTHING THAT YOU DO. SO, MOSTLY PEOPLE DON'T LIKE 2 3 TO SAY I NEED EXTRA ASSISTANCE. MOSTLY PEOPLE DON'T LIKE TO SAY I AM LOW-INCOME. LIKE, THEY DON'T LIKE DOING IT, BECAUSE 4 5 IT FEELS BAD, AND THE INCOME LEVELS ARE SO ABSURDLY LOW. LIKE, THE HEALTH COMMITTEE MET THIS MORNING, AND THE NUMBER THAT 6 THEY PUT OUT WAS SOMETHING, LIKE -- IT WAS, LIKE, \$45 AN HOUR 7 8 IS LIKE WHAT YOU NEED TO BE MAKING RIGHT NOW TO AFFORD AN APARTMENT. AND, SO, LIKE, IF PEOPLE WITH JUST SAY, YES, I NEED 9 THIS, I THINK THAT WE WOULD GET MORE RIDERS AND A HIGHER USE. 10 AND I THINK THE LEVEL OF CHEATING WOULDN'T, LIKE, I -- IF THE 11 PEOPLE WHO ARE CHEATING ARE THE PEOPLE WHO ACTUALLY NEED HELP 12 BECAUSE THEIR EXPENSES ARE HIGHER OR THEY'RE SUPPORTING FOUR 13 PEOPLE AND THEY DON'T QUALIFY AS PEOPLE THEY'RE SUPPORTING 14 15 BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT RELATED OR THEY CAN'T CLAIM THEM ON THEIR 16 TAXES OR WHATEVER, I DON'T THINK THAT'S A NEGATIVE THING. AND I STILL THINK THAT NUMBER WON'T BE VERY HIGH. BUT THE PEOPLE 17 WHO CAN'T ACCESS A PROGRAM BECAUSE OF DOCUMENTATION 18 REQUIREMENTS, I DO THINK THAT NUMBER IS HIGH. BECAUSE IT'S 19 CONSISTENT HE HIGH IN OTHER AREAS THAT WE WORK. AND, SO, I 20 WOULD JUST REALLY ENCOURAGE US TO LOOK AT A WAY TO BE MORE 21 INCLUSIVE OF FOLKS WITH NEED, AS OPPOSED TO LESS INCLUSIVE IN 22 A -- IN SOMETHING THAT JUST REOUIRES A LOT MORE STAFF SUPPORT. 23 SO, THAT'S THE MAIN THING I WANTED TO ADD THERE. 24

25

MAY 8, 2023

V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: SO, FIRST A OUESTION. AND THIS IS 1 KIND OF CONTINUING ON THE THREAD THAT WE'RE ON ALREADY. YOU 2 3 HAVE GOT 14 AGENCIES THAT WENT FOR 20%. ONLY SEVEN WENT FOR 50%. ARE WE GOING TO LOSE THOSE 14 AGENCIES IF IT'S 4 5 UNIVERSALLY 50%? I SEE SOMEBODY SHAKING THEIR HEAD NO BACK 6 THERE. [LAUGHTER] COY 7 8 MELANIE CHOY: LET ME CHIME INTO IN TERMS OF PULLING THINGS TOGETHER. 9 10 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: I HAVE ANOTHER THEN YOU CAN TIE IT 11 ALL TOGETHER. 12 13 MELANIE CHOY: BRIAN ASKED THE QUESTION IN TERMS OF 50%, MANY 14 OF THE AGENCIES AND ALSO VTA -- SO VTA, WE HAVE ALSO BEEN 15 16 TALKING TO VTA AND HAVING DISCUSSIONS AND THEY'RE CONTEMPLATING THIS. IN TERMS OF THE 50%, A LOT OF AGENCIES 17 HAVE ALREADY EXPRESSED INTEREST IN OUR PLANNING TO MOVE TO 18 50%. AND SO THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF INTEREST AND TRANSIT 19 AGENCIES IN TERMS OF THEM TAKING A DISCOUNT CHANGE THEY NEED 20 TO GO THROUGH THEIR OWN PROCESS, TAKE ACTIONS TO THEIR BOARDS 21 22 SO WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC NUMBER OF WHICH AGENCIES ARE 23 OFFICIALLY GOING TO 50% BUT WE HAVE INDICATION THAT MANY OF THEM WILL BE MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION. 24

25

MAY 8, 2023

V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: SO, HERE IS ANOTHER IDEA TO THROW 1 2 INTO THE NEXT BEFORE YOU WRAP IT ALL TOGETHER, WHICH IS 3 KEEPING A TWO-TIER SYSTEM, NOT FOR THE OPERATORS, BUT FOR THE CUSTOMERS. A 50% DISCOUNT GOES TO THOSE AT 200% OF POVERTY AND 4 5 NEED TO BE VERIFIED. HOWEVER, ANOTHER DISCOUNT, EITHER 20 OR EVEN MAYBE 30% IS NOT VERIFIED, AND THAT COULD BE OPEN TO 400% 6 OR JUST ANYBODY WHO WANTS TO APPLY. IF YOU ARE REALLY TRYING 7 8 TO GET MORE TRANSIT USERS, THAT'S THE WAY TO GO, IS TO OPEN THIS UP TO ANYBODY WHO WANTS TO PARTICIPATE. YOU MIGHT STILL 9 WANT TO HAVE SOME KIND OF AN INCOME CAP THAT WOULD BE SELF-10 VERIFIED THAT WOULD SAVE YOU ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS. BUT OF 11 COURSE, YOU WOULD HAVE THE TWO-TIER SYSTEM AND WOULD HAVE TO 12 BUILD THAT INTO YOUR PROGRAM. THAT'S MY SUGGESTION. I'M ALL 13 FOR WHAT ADINA SAID ABOUT OVERALL, LET'S JUST HAVE SOME 14 15 UNIVERSAL FARES, BUT HOPEFULLY WE'LL GET THAT TO THAT SOME 16 DAY, AS WELL AS MORE FREQUENCY.

17

CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: WANTED TO CHIME IN ON THE TOPIC BEFORE 18 GERRY I'M NOT SEEING ANYBODY ELSE OTHER THAN GERRY. SO THAT 19 WILL BE THE END OF THE COMMENT. WHAT OLIVIA SAID GENERATED 20 21 ANOTHER THOUGHT ABOUT SO I'M REALLY UNCOMFORTABLE WITH CIVIL CERTIFICATION WHERE SOME UNETHICAL PERSON WHO MAKES \$100,000 A 22 YEAR, GOES ON THE WEB SITE AND GO, HAHA HA, I MAKE \$35,000 A 23 YEAR, I CAN MAKE HALF OFF ON BART. I'M NOT COMFORTABLE WITH 24 PEOPLE OPENING THE DOOR TO BE UNETHICAL LIKE THAT BUT IF 25

MAY 8, 2023

SOMEONE, GETTING SERVICES FOR UNHOUSED PEOPLE LIKE HAVING 1 2 EXTRA, LIKE GIVING SOMEBODY ACCESS BECAUSE OF A DOCUMENTATION 3 REQUIREMENT LIKE ALLOWING MORE DOCUMENTATION FLEXIBILITY WHEN SOMEBODY IS ALREADY GETTING OTHER SERVICE THAT IS COMMONLY 4 5 USED BY VERY LOW-INCOME PEOPLE I'M WONDERING IF THERE'S POSSIBILITY TO BE FLEXIBLE IN THOSE CONTEXT. LIKE, SOMEBODY 6 WHO NEEDS FOOD ASSISTANCE IS PROBABLY NOT CHEATING, THEY 7 8 PROBABLY JUST DON'T HAVE ENOUGH DOCUMENTATION. SO, GERRY? 9

GERRY GLASER: IT'S NOT NICE TO DISAGREE WITH THE CHAIR, BUT I 10 DO AGREE WITH ANNE OLIVIA, WE CAN AFFORD THE CHEATS, AND I 11 THINK SHE'S RIGHT ABOUT ATTITUDES AND I'M GOING TO REPEAT A 12 BUNCH OF THINGS BECAUSE THEY'RE WORTH REPEATING. IAN YOU BLOW 13 ME AWAY ABSOLUTELY RIGHT ABOUT ATTITUDES I'M GOING TO REPEAT 14 15 THE PROGRAMS, I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE RATIO GOING TO BE, OR HOW 16 YOU STATE IT BUT SOMETHING THAT'S MEASURABLE, 50% OF THE WAY, 100% OF THE WAY, WE WENT 200% OF THE WAY THEREFORE WE WANT TO 17 GO FURTHER IT'S A NUMBER OF SOME STATISTIC MIGHT BE BASED ON 18 RATIO OR A NUMBER. THAT WAS OF THE FIRSTS COMMENT I HEARD. 19 SECOND COMMENT I HEARD WAS THE OPERATORS AREN'T GOING TO LIKE 20 21 THIS BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE MAKING AS MUCH MONEY AND I LOOKED AT THE BALANCE SHEET FOR SONOMA COUNTY BUS AUTHORITY 22 AND FOUND \$35 PER TRIP PER PASSENGER, AND I KNOW SOME 23 PASSENGERS DON'T PAY ANYTHING LIKE THAT SO WE'RE GOING HAVE A 24 TREMENDOUS GAP. THERE IS ONLY TWO AGENCIES THAT I KNOW OF THAT 25

MAY 8, 2023

COME CLOSE TO FARES FOR PACE FOR THE AGENCY SO US LOOKING AT 1 2 FARES BASED ON THE PROGRAM AND SAYING LET'S DO THIS IN THE 3 PROGRAM BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT THEM TO LOSE TOO MUCH IN THE FARES IT'S NOT GOING TO MAKE A DIFFERENCES IN THE ENDS THE 4 5 POINT IS TO GET RIDERS TO MAKE TRANSPORTATION IF OUR COMMUNITIES COMPELLING AND THAT'S GOING TO TAKE INVESTMENT. I 6 DON'T KNOW WHERE WE GET MONEY FROM BUT WE'RE NEVER GOING TO 7 8 GET IT FROM FARES. NOT TODAY. YOUR POINT, THE CHAIR'S POINT ON THE MULTIPLE AGENCIES. DO THEY HAVE TO SIGN UP WITH EACH OF 9 THE AGENCIES WHERE THEY'RE GETTING THE DISCOUNTS IF THEY SIGN 10 UP ONE TIME FOR ANY AGENCY THEY HAVE AND HAVE THE DISCOUNTS 11 THEY WOULD NOT HAVE USER THEIR CLIPPER CARD AND LAST POINT ON 12 STATISTICS I DON'T KNOW IF YOU SEND OUT A NEW CLIPPER CARD TO 13 THEM OR USE THE CLIPPER CARD THEY MIGHT HAVE HAD BEFORE IF YOU 14 15 CAN UPGRADE THE CLIPPER CARD THAT YOU HAVE, THEN WE HAVE A 16 DATABASE THAT SAYS, BY THE WAY OVER THE LAST FOUR YEARS YOU HAVE USED YOUR CLIPPER CARD TRAVELED THIS MUCH AND YOU'RE 17 USING YOUR CLIPPER CARD THIS TIME AND TRAVELING MORE CAN WE 18 GATHER STATISTICS THE WAY WE USE THE SYSTEM TODAY I'M HOPING 19 CLIPPER HAS HISTORY THEY CAN TAP. I'M AN IT GUY AND THAT KIND 20 21 OF DATA IS REALLY USEFUL. SO THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. BASICALLY, I HEARD EVERYBODY HERE MAKE REALLY POSITIVE SUGGESTIONS AND 22 POINTS. AND WENDI, YOURS, AS WELL. THE ONLY REASON I JUMP IN 23 AT THE END IS TO SAY, YEAH, WE ALL AGREE. SO, I HAVE BEEN ON 24 PLANNING COMMISSIONS AND WHEN FIVE PEOPLE STAND UP AS OPPOSED 25



TO ONE PERSON STANDING UP SAYING WE HAVE TO DO SOMETHING. I'M 1 2 GOING TO BE THE FIFTH PERSON. 3 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS 4 5 ON THIS ITEM? 6 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I DON'T KNOW WHY I'M NOT ABLE TO HEAR 7 8 YOU. HOPEFULLY YOU ARE ABLE TO HEAR ME. 9 10 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GIVE HER THE FULL TIME. THANK YOU. 11 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. STARTING OVER, I GUESS I 12 WOULD HAVE TO AGREE WITH ANY NUMBER OF PEOPLE AROUND THE 13 TABLE. LET'S NOT HAVE PEOPLE HAVE TO GO THROUGH HOOPS TO APPLY 14 15 TO THIS. HAVING DONE THIS, MYSELF, ANY NUMBER OF TIMES TO 16 PROVE, OH, GEE, I USE A WHEELCHAIR, OH GEE, I HAVE GLAUCOMA, THAT SEEMS VERY DEGRADING. AND AS I'M SURE AS OTHERS HAVE 17 SAID, FOLKS IN DIFFERENT ARENAS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A CERTAIN 18 -- OH, GOD, HERE WE GO, AGAIN. LET'S MAKE THIS A POSSIBILITY 19 FOR ANYONE TO SIGN UP. AND FAREBOX RECOVERY, YOU'RE NEVER 20 GOING TO GET FAREBOX RECOVERY, SO YOU MAY AS WELL TAKE THAT 21 COMPLETELY OFF THE TABLE. LOOK TO IMPROVING OR CONNECTING, I 22 SHOULD SAY, PARATRANSIT WITH ALL OF THIS, THAT WOULD BE A 23 TREMENDOUS HELP, AND ONE LAST THING, SINCE I DO SIT ON THE 24 25 COMMITTEE FOR TRANSPORTATION MOBILITY ACCESS FOR SANTA CLARA

MAY 8, 2023

1	COUNTY WHICH IS THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW,
2	ADVISORY COMMITTEE, FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITY, I WOULD
3	ENCOURAGE TALKING TO THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS, VTA, BOARD OF
4	DIRECTORS, AND ALL THE DIFFERENT COMMITTEES THAT ARE THROUGH
5	VTA. THANK YOU.
6	
7	CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU. ANY MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS?
8	
9	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS AND
10	THERE WAS NOTHING IN WRITING. THANK YOU.
11	
12	CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: ALL RIGHT. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM SIX, NOW
13	BUSINESS WHAT?
14	
15	KY-NAM MILLER: STAFF GENERALLY RESPOND TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. BUT
16	THAT'S THE CHAIR'S PREROGATIVE.
17	
18	MELANIE CHOY: I WANTED TO SAY A FEW COMMENTS IN TERMS OF A
19	CLOSING ITEM. MELANIE CHOY MTC WANTED TO THANK EVERYONE FOR
20	THE COMMENTS YOU HAVE GIVEN US A LOT OF THINGS TO THINK
21	THROUGH IN ADDITION TO THE COMMENTS WE HAVE RECEIVED IN OUR
22	OTHER PRESENTATIONS THE OTHER ASPECT I KNOW OF WANT TO
23	HIGHLIGHT THAT BECAUSE WE HAVE THREE FARE PILOT PROGRAMS START
24	PASS AND NO-COST REDUCED FARE TRANSFER PILOT ONE OF THE THINGS
25	WE ARE LOOKING TO DO IN CONVERSATIONS TO COORDINATE TOGETHER

MAY 8, 2023

AND BE INTERTWINED DOING THINGS IN A MORE COHESIVE MANNER 1 LOOKING FORWARD SO I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THAT WE ARE THINKING 2 3 ABOUT THESE THINGS KEEPING IN THE BACK OF OUR MINDS AS WE ADVANCE THIS PROGRAM EACH ONE OF THESE HAS INITIATED THEIR OWN 4 5 KIND OF MANNER DOWN THE ROAD THERE IS OPPORTUNITY GIVEN ADVANCEMENT AND CHANGES IN CLIPPER NEXGEN ALL THESE OTHER 6 THINGS THERE WILL BE ADDITIONAL OPPORTUNITIES WHAT WE'RE 7 8 WORKING WITH IN MAKING THIS PROGRAM IN FRONT OF US FOR THE NEXT TWO YEARS MUCH MORE ROBUST I THE TO HIGHLIGHT WE'RE 9 LOOKING FOR OPPORTUNITIES IN THE FUTURE TO ENTERTAIN MANY OF 10 THESE COMMENTS AS WELL AS INTEGRATE THEM AS WE GO THROUGHOUT 11 THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS. THANK YOU. 12

13

14 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 15 SIX, WHICH IS NEW BUSINESS WHERE MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE 16 MAY BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO A 17 FUTURE AGENDA. ANYONE HAVE TOP THOUGHTS ABOUT TOPICS FOR 18 FUTURE AGENDAS? IN THE ROOM?

19

20 WARREN CUSHMAN: YES. THIS IS WARREN. YOU KNOW, I HAVE BEEN
21 TRYING TO PROCESS THIS WHOLE PIECE AROUND THE NETWORK
22 MANAGEMENT AS WE'RE MOVING INTO THAT PHASE OF DISCUSSION AND
23 MOVING FORWARD. AND I'M TRYING TO LINK THE IDEA OF WHAT WE DO
24 WITH THAT CONCEPT. AND I HAVE AN OVERARCHING COMMENT WHICH IS
25 THAT, AS WE MOVE FORWARD, AND AS WE AGENDAIZE THINGS AND THINK

MAY 8, 2023

ABOUT WHAT KINDS OF THINGS WE OUGHT THINK ABOUT, I HOPE WE DO 1 IT IN A WAY THAT HAS A STRONG IMPACT IN THE ARENA OF NETWORK 2 3 MANAGEMENT AROUND, AND THE WHOLE YOU KNOW, WE STARTED WITH THE TASK FORCE, A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO, AND SO WE'RE GOING THROUGH 4 5 THIS PROCESS GENERATING ALL KINDS OF IDEAS. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE LINEAR ALLEY MOVING IN THE RIGHT 6 DIRECTION. SO, I HAVE SOME THOUGHTS AT SOME POINT ABOUT HOW WE 7 8 DO THAT FROM A DISABILITY PERSPECTIVE WITH REGARD TO WAYFINDING AND PARATRANSIT AND ACCESS AND MAKING SURE THAT WE 9 HAVE THE PUBLIC SYSTEM AND THE PRIVATE, AND THE PARATRANSIT 10 SYSTEM INTERPLAYING BACK AND FORTH, THAT WE HAVE THE -- THINGS 11 SOMETIMES CAN BE SILOED. I WANT TO DEAL WITH THOSE SILOS. SO 12 THOSE ARE THE KIND OF THINGS I WANT TO ADDRESS AS WE PLAN FOR 13 FUTURE AGENDAS. THANK YOU. 14

15

16 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: GREAT. THANKS. I WANT TO BUILD ON WHAT 17 WARREN SAID, BECAUSE ONE SUGGESTION THAT HAS COME FORWARD, ESPECIALLY FROM PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES HAS BEEN 18 INCORPORATING, UNDER NETWORK MANAGEMENT ACCESSIBILITY 19 STANDARDS OF FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT. BECAUSE IN THE 20 21 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, THERE ARE SOME ACCESSIBILITY AND ITEMS THAT ARE REALLY FOCUSING ON THE PARATRANSIT SYSTEM AND 22 THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF DISCUSSION ABOUT ACCESSIBILITY OF 23 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING IN PARTICULAR, BUT MAPPING AND 24 25 WAYFINDING IS ONLY ONE ELEMENT OF ACCESSIBILITY AND, AND I

MAY 8, 2023

HAVE JUST BEEN RECENTLY PAYING ATTENTION TO THE BETTER BUS 1 2 STOP PROGRAMS FOR VTA AND FOR SAMTRANS AND FOR SAMTRANS THEY 3 WERE DOING TWO DIFFERENT OUTREACH PROCESSES ONE ABOUT BETTER BUS STOPS FOR GENERAL POPULATION, AND ANOTHER -- AND A 4 5 SPECIFIC THING ABOUT ACCESSIBILITY, AND THEY WEREN'T LINKED TOGETHER. AND THE AGENCIES, THEMSELVES, WERE DOING THINGS THAT 6 WERE SEPARATE FROM EACH OTHER AND THIS JUST SEEMS LICK A RIPE 7 8 OPPORTUNITY FOR STANDARDS FOR ACCESSIBILITY REGARDLESS OF WHICH COLOR OF TRANSIT VEHICLE ONE MAY HAPPEN TO BE USING. 9

10

GERRY GLASER: FOLLOWING BOTH EVER YOU, AND I WAS WONDERING IF 11 IN SOME PLACE WE COULD HAVE A WORKING SESSION. I WROTE A BUNCH 12 OF COMMENTS DOWN WHEN WE START TALKING ABOUT REGIONAL NETWORK 13 MANAGEMENT AND START MOVING TOWARDS THAT. WHEN THE COMMISSION 14 15 HAD AN OFFSITE, WE TENDED THAT, AND THE FIRST QUESTION I ASKED 16 WHEN I JOINED THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WAS, WHY ARE THERE 27 TRANSIT DISTRICTS AND IT DOESN'T WORK. THE QUESTION THEN 17 IS, IF YOU REPLACE THAT, HOW DO YOU REPLACE IT? HOW DO YOU DO 18 THAT OVER TIME? THE FARE INTEGRATION WAS ONE PART OF THAT. BUT 19 THERE IS A WHOLE BUNCH OF ELEMENTS THAT GO ALONG WITH IT AND 20 HOW DO YOU DO IT IF SUCH A WAY THAT THE TRANSIT DISTRICTS WANT 21 TO DO IT SO WE CAN GET TO SOMETHING THAT MAKES SOME SENSE. AND 22 I WROTE A NOTE TO MYSELF AND HAVE HERE IN FRONT OF ME EVERY 23 TIME I SIT DOWN ANY OF THESE MEETINGS. WE HAVE A TRANSIT 24 SYSTEM THAT'S ADVISED FOR THE 20th CENTURY, 2023 AND THE 21st 25

MAY 8, 2023

CENTURY, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE COMING TOGETHER TO TALK ABOUT
 WHAT WE THINK THE 21st CENTURY TRANSIT SYSTEM LOOKS LIKE FOR
 THE BAY AREA AND SEE IF WE ALL AGREE, WE DON'T HAVE THE FORM
 NECESSARILY THIS KIND OF CHAMBER TO DO THAT BUT MAYBE THERE IS
 SOME FORUM WHERE WE COULD PUT THAT TOGETHER.

6

7 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: WENDY?

8

V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: PIGGYBACKING ON THAT. THE INFORMATION 9 I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO HAVE IS, HOW DO WE INCREASE FREQUENCY 10 TO THE POINT OF ATTRACTING NEW RIDERS? WE KNOW AFFORDABILITY 11 IS IMPORTANT TO LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, FOR MIDDLE INCOME THAT'S 12 CROPPING UP WITH HOUSING AND NOW WITH TRANSIT IT'S FREQUENCY 13 BEING ABLE TO EASILY GET FROM ONE PLACE TO ANOTHER CAN AT 14 15 LEAST COMPETE WITH THE AUTOMOBILE IT MAKES IT MORE ATTRACTIVE 16 I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE, WHAT THAT COSTS, AND YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE TO GET THAT INFORMATION. AND I'M GUESSING 17 THE PEOPLE IN NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE PROBABLY WOULD WANT 18 TO GET THAT INFORMATION TOO. 19

20

21 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: AND I'M GOING TO MAKE IT --

22

23 GERRY GLASER: WENDI, IS IT IMPOLITE FOR ME TO DO THIS? YOU'RE 24 ABSOLUTELY RIGHT. AND SOMEBODY SAID THIS ONE DAY, AND I GO,



YEAH, THAT'S RIGHT. AND THE ANSWER WAS, WHEN YOU DON'T NEED A 1 2 SCHEDULE, YOU HAVE THE FREQUENCY THAT'S REQUIRED. 3 V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS: WE HAVE ALL BEEN TO EUROPE AND KNOW 4 5 WHAT THAT'S LIKE. 6 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: I'LL MAKE A SUGGEST AND THEN SEE IF 7 8 ANYBODY HAS MORE IDEAS THEN MOVE TO GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT AND BEING COMPLETED WITH THIS MEETING BECAUSE THERE IS PLANNING 9 FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE AND THE BROAD 10 TOPIC COMING TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IN OUR NEXT 11 MEETING AND THERE IS GOING TO BE ANALYSIS AND OUTREACH ON THAT 12 OVER THE NEXT SIX MONTHS OR SO. THAT SEEMS EXTREMELY RELATED 13 AND MIGHT BE GOOD TO GET SOME OF THE SPECIFICS OF THIS 14 15 ANALYSIS TO THIS COMMITTEE FOR FEEDBACK ON THE OPTIONS AND THE 16 SPECIFICALLY THE SERVICE OPTIONS THAT WE ARE, AS A REGION, CONSIDERING FUNDING. ANY OTHER ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS? DO WE 17 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR LEVIN, TERRY SCOTT HAS HIS HAND UP. 20 21 22 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: EXCELLENT. GREAT. 23 TERRY SCOTT: THANK YOU. TERRY SCOTT, NAPA. THE ONE THING I 24 WOULD LIKE TO DO OR LIKE TO SEE HAPPEN IS, IS THERE AN 25

MAY 8, 2023

EFFECTIVE MANNER OF EXPEDITING THE PROCESS OF SELECTING EITHER 1 A NETWORK MANAGER OR THE GROUP THAT WILL SERVE IN THAT 2 3 CAPACITY? AND I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THAT, BECAUSE THIS IS SOMETHING WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT FOR THREE YEARS. AND MY 4 5 UNDERSTANDING IS, ONLY RECENTLY, HAVE WE ACTUALLY HAD A JOB DESCRIPTION FOR THE NETWORK MANAGER POSITION. AND THAT'S, 6 OBVIOUSLY, VERY NECESSARY IN ORDER TO IDENTIFY NOT ONLY THE 7 8 POSITION AND ITS RESPONSIBILITIES, BUT THE CHARACTERISTICS OF OUALIFICATIONS OF POTENTIAL INCUMBENTS AND POTENTIAL MEMBERS 9 OF THAT GROUP, IF IT'S MORE THAN JUST THE MANAGER, HIS OR 10 HERSELF. BASICALLY, I THINK THAT WE NEED TO MOVE ON THIS MORE 11 OUICKLY THAN WE HAVE. IT'S FRUSTRATING. I FIND IT FRUSTRATING 12 WHEN WE HAVE 27 DIFFERENT AGENCIES THAT ARE PULLING IN 13 DIFFERENT DIRECTIONS, IT WOULD BE VERY DIFFICULT FOR AN 14 INDIVIDUAL OR A SMALL GROUP TO PULL THEM TOGETHER AND OBTAIN 15 16 THE COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION NECESSARY TO MAKE ALL OF THEM MORE EFFECTIVE AND MORE SERVICEABLE IN GENERAL. 17

18

19 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT IN GENERAL 20 BEYOND MEMBERS OF THIS BODY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON AGENDA ITEM 21 NUMBER SIX?

22

23 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHRIS, DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT ON FOR
24 ITEM SIX OR SEVEN?

25



CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: CAN YOU HEAR ME?
 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: YES.

4

5 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I AGREE WITH A LOT OF WHAT'S SAID. MY OPINION IS, A LOT OF WHAT WE DO ON ALL 6 OF THESE VARIOUS COMMITTEES WHERE WE'RE TRYING TO WRESTLE THE 7 8 THING TO THE GROUND, THE IS THE ISSUE ON HOW DO WE MAKE A COHESIVE TOOLING. AN ANALOGY WOULD BE LIKE FOOTBALL, WHERE YOU 9 HAVE A BALL AND YOU'RE TRYING TO MOVE IT DOWN THE FIELD. SO, 10 YOU HAVE A SERIES OF RULES AND REGULATIONS AND UNDERSTANDINGS 11 AND ALL OF US ARE A TEAM AND WE'RE MOVING THE FOOTBALL DOWN 12 THE FIELD. YOU ALSO HAVE TO LOOK AT THE LONGEVITY OF EACH 13 INDIVIDUAL AROUND THAT TABLE. FOR INSTANCE, SOMEONE WHO IS IN 14 15 THEIR 20S NOW, LATER ON DOWN THE ROAD, THEY'RE GOING TO BE IN 16 THEIR 30'S, 40'S, AND KEEP GOING. SO DEFINITELY LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN MAKE THE SYSTEM INTO ONE SEAMLESS -- I'M GOING TO 17 BORROW YOUR NAME, SEAMLESS BAY AREA IN ORDER TO MOVE THAT 18 PERSON FROM ONE PLACE TO ANOTHER, JUST LIKE YOU DO THE 19 FOOTBALL. LET'S SEE IF WE CAN'T GET PAST THE SILOS AND COME UP 20 21 WITH VERY MEANINGFUL SOLUTIONS FOR THE STEPS AND, AGAIN, CONSIDER YOUR POINT OF VIEW, BUT ALSO CONSIDER OTHER PEOPLE'S 22 POINT OF VIEW TOO. THANK YOU. 23



CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: THANKS, ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT? IF NOT, 1 GENDER ITEM NUMBER SEVEN IS PUBLIC COMMENT FOR GENERAL PUBLIC 2 3 COMMENT FOR ITEMS UNDER -- NOT ON THE AGENDA. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THINGS THAT ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA. 4 5 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS AND NO HAND 6 7 RAISED AND NOTHING IN WRITING. 8 9 CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN: WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM EIGHT ADJOURNMENT TO OUR NEXT MEETING AT A DATE AND TIME TO BE 10 NOTICED. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED] 11

12

