

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL**

2 **MONDAY, APRIL 28<sup>TH</sup>, 2025, 11:30 AM**

3

4

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING OF THE  
7 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS  
8 BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS  
9 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD  
10 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I WILL CALL  
11 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES  
12 WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE  
13 NUMBER. SO, WITH THAT, MADAM CLERK, PLEASE WALK US THROUGH THE  
14 ROLL CALL AND SEE IF WE HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. CHAIR POWERS?

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER BOUCHARD IS ABSENT. MEMBER  
25 CHURCHILL?



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FREMIER? GONOT?

5

6 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** KATHLEEN?

9

10 **KELLEY JACKSON:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** KIRSCHBAUM WILL COME LATER. MEMBER

13 MURPHY? IS ABSENT. MEMBER WHELAN?

14

15 **NANCY WHELAN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. LET'S

20 MOVE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO, OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, INCLUDED IN

21 THE PACKAGE, IT INCLUDES ITEMS NUMBER 2A AND 2B. LET ME SEE IF

22 I HAVE A MOTION ON THE DAIS HERE TO MOVE THE CONSENT.

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** SO MOVED, MULLIGAN.

25



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **BILL CHURCHILL:** SECOND CHURCHILL.

2

3 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ALL RIGHT WE HAVE A MENTION BY MULLIGAN  
4 AND A SECOND BY CHURCHILL. LET'S CHECK IN WITH THE PUBLIC  
5 WHETHER IT'S IN THE ROOM HERE OR VIRTUAL, ON THE CONSENT  
6 ITEMS. OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK. COMMISSION  
7 COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTARY, CONCERNS, EPIPHANIES ON THE CONSENT  
8 CALENDAR? I'M NOT SEEING ANY. OKAY. WITH THAT, WOULD ALL THOSE  
9 IN FAVOR OF THE MOTION ACKNOWLEDGE BY SITUATION AYE? OPPOSED?  
10 MADAM CLERK FOR THE RECORD, CONSENT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE, NOW, ONE PUBLIC  
13 SPEAKER ONLINE. DO YOU WANT TO --

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ABSOLUTELY. LET'S DROP BACK AND WE'LL  
16 PROVIDE TWO MINUTES FOR OUR PUBLIC SPEAKER.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** OKAY. ADINA LEVIN, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES  
19 TO SPEAK. ADINA, CAN YOU HEAR US?

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** AHA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE POP-UP -- THE  
22 UNMUTE POP-UP JUST POPPED UP. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY  
23 AREA. AND I DID SEND A NOTE WITH A COUPLE OF FAIRLY FINE GRAIN  
24 COMMENTS ON THE WORKPLAN PROGRESS UPDATE. THE TOPIC THAT I  
25 WANTED TO ELEVATE THE MOST, THOUGH, IS SOMETHING THAT HAS BEEN



APRIL 28, 2025

1 -- THAT IS ON THE TOPIC OF FUNDING AND THE LONG-STANDING  
2 COMMITMENT IN WORKING TOGETHER ON COLLABORATIVELY PROVIDING  
3 THE FUNDING TO CONTINUE TO EXECUTE ON THE BENEFICIAL TRANSIT  
4 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT IS MAKING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM  
5 EASIER TO USE AND HELPING TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. THERE HAS,  
6 VERY RECENTLY, BEEN POSTED A LETTER SIGNED BY ONE OF THE  
7 AGENCIES THAT'S PARTICIPATING IN REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
8 AND A COUPLE OF OTHER ENTITIES IN SAN MATEO COUNTY PROPOSING  
9 NOT TO FUND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AS PART OF A REGIONAL  
10 FUNDING MEASURE. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE MANY DIFFERENT ITEMS, AND  
11 THERE IS A VERY COMPLEX NEGOTIATION GOING ON WITH MULTIPLE  
12 COUNTIES AROUND THE REGION, AND IT IS UNDERSTANDABLE THAT  
13 THERE IS A LOT TO DISCUSS AND TO NEGOTIATE. AND THAT SAID,  
14 THERE HAS BEEN, OVER THE LAST FIVE YEARS, REALLY BROAD  
15 CONSENSUS AT THIS BODY AND AGREEMENT AT THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT  
16 BOARDS, INCLUDING BOARDS THAT SIGNED THE LETTER ABOUT THE  
17 IMPORTANCE OF TRANSIT COORDINATION AND KEEPING THIS PROCESS  
18 GOING TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND DO THINGS THAT ARE POPULAR  
19 WITH THE PUBLIC. SO, WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE COMMITMENT TO THAT  
20 PRINCIPLE IN THE WORKPLAN. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE PUBLIC COMMENTS. WHY  
25 DON'T WE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO AND WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ITEM NUMBER THREE. AND THIS IS OUR CLIPPER START PILOT UPDATE.  
2 AND THIS IS AN UPDATE ON OUR CLIPPER START PILOT AND OUR  
3 PROPOSED TRANSITION TO AN ONGOING FARE PRODUCT. AND WE'LL HAVE  
4 THALIA L AND LISA FROM MTC. THALIA, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

5

6 **THALIA LENG:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YES.

9

10 **THALIA LENG:** HELLO EVERYONE MY NAME IS THALIA L AND I HELP  
11 MANAGE START PROGRAM AS WELL AS OTHER FARE INITIATIVES AT  
12 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION R MTC. HERE WE GO.  
13 TODAY I'LL PROVIDE OVERVIEW OF THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM TALK  
14 ABOUT ONGOING IMPROVEMENTS DIG INTO FUNDING OPERATIONS DISCUSS  
15 OUR RECOMMENDATIONS AND OUR ASK FOR TODAY AND TALK ABOUT  
16 TIMELINE AND NEXT STEPS. THERE WE GO. MOST OF YOU ARE FAMILIAR  
17 WITH THE FRAMEWORK OF THE PROGRAM IT WAS A PILOT LAUNCHED IN  
18 JULY 2020 AND SINCE JANUARY 2024 THERE HAS BEEN A 50% DISCOUNT  
19 OFFERED BY ALL OPERATORS ON CLIPPER THIS DISCOUNT IS  
20 SUBSIDIZED JOINTLY BY MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCIES AND OPERATORS  
21 AND IN TERMS OF ELIGIBILITY ADULT RIDERS AGE 19 THROUGH 64 AT  
22 OR BELOW THE 200% FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL ARE ELIGIBLE AND  
23 DISCOUNT IS APPLIED AT SINGLE ADULT FARE. SO THIS GIVES A  
24 BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE CLIPPER START PILOT ESSENTIALLY WORKING  
25 ON THE PROGRAM FOR OVER A DECADE WITH MULTIPLE PHASES OF WORK,



APRIL 28, 2025

1 INCLUDING INITIAL STAGES OF MOVING FROM CONCEPT TO REALITY AND  
2 PROGRAM FRAMEWORK ROLL OUT AND EVALUATION AND WORKING ON  
3 TARGET MARKETING AND INCREASED REACH LEADING TO CHANGE IN  
4 JANUARY 2024 WHEN THE LAST OPERATOR JOINED AND DISCOUNT AT 50%  
5 ACROSS ALL OPERATORS ALL OF THESE PHASES BRING US TO WHERE WE  
6 ARE CURRENTLY WITH THE PROPOSAL TO TRANSITION. SO WHY IS NOW  
7 THE TIME TO TRANSITION THE PILOT TO AN ONGOING FARE PRODUCT  
8 SINCE 2024 THERE HAVE BEEN FACTORS THAT THE TIME IS RIGHT WITH  
9 GOALS AND PILOTS SPECIFICALLY WE'RE MAKING TRANSIT MORE  
10 AFFORDABLE TO INDIVIDUALS EARNING A LOW-INCOME AND WE HAVE  
11 SEEN THIS THROUGH INCREASED ENROLLMENT AND SINCE JANUARY 2024  
12 WE RECOGNIZE WE STILL NEED TO INCREASE ENROLLMENT AND REDUCE  
13 BARRIERS THIS NUMBER CONTINUES TO RISE. NEXT CLIPPER START IS  
14 FINANCIALLY VIABLE AND ADMINISTRATIVELY FEASIBLE WE HAVE A  
15 STABLE FUNDING STREAM TO REIMBURSE OPERATORS AND  
16 ADMINISTRATIVE TEAM IN PLACE TO RUN THE PROGRAM MOVING TOWARDS  
17 A CONSISTENT REGIONAL STANDARD FARE DISCOUNT AND TODAY ALL  
18 OPERATORS ARE PARTICIPATING WITH THE 50% DISCOUNT AND  
19 ADDITIONAL CLIPPER START COORDINATION WITH MTC MEANS BASED  
20 INITIATIVES AND I'LL GET INTO LATER AND CONSISTENCY PROMOTION  
21 AND ENROLLMENT ACROSS PROGRAMS. AS OF FEBRUARY THERE HAVE BEEN  
22 OVER 50,000 ENROLLEES 6 MILLION TRIPS TAKEN WITH 1.6 MILLION  
23 TRANSFERS ALL METRICS INCREASE SIGNIFICANTLY IN 2024 NEARLY  
24 DOUBLING WHAT WE SAW IN 2024 AND DOUBLING AND SEE PARTICIPANTS  
25 JOINING EACH MONTH. IN TERMS OF CONTINUAL IMPROVEMENTS TO



APRIL 28, 2025

1 CLIPPER START PARTICULARLY AS WE FORMALIZE THE PROGRAM AFTER  
2 JUNE I WANT TO ZOOM OUT TO HIGHER LEVEL WORK THAT'S BEEN  
3 UNDERWAY AT MTC, THE MEANS BASED COLLABORATIVE, MBC SEEKS TO  
4 CONTINUALLY ADDRESS BARRIERS ENHANCE AWARENESS AND EXPAND  
5 ENROLLMENT COORDINATE PROMOTION EFFORTS FOR MTC AND MEANS  
6 BASED INITIATIVE PROGRAMS AND FOR STATE ROUTE 37. SOME OF THE  
7 SPECIFIC IMPROVEMENTS WE'RE WORKING ON INCLUDE PERFORMANCE  
8 TRACKING WE CONDUCT SAID AN INITIAL EVALUATION IN 2023 FOR THE  
9 502 YEARS OF THE PILOT THAT ARE NOW UNDERTAKING A SECOND  
10 EVALUATION TO THE PROGRAM OFFERING DETAILS ON PERFORMANCE  
11 METRICS AND FOCUS ON CHANGES TO THE PROGRAM SINCE JULY 2023,  
12 CUSTOMER SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS WORKING TO STREAMLINE  
13 ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION AND IMPROVE CUSTOMER SERVICE  
14 SPECIFICALLY THROUGH VERIFIER CUSTOMER SERVICE CONTRACT WE  
15 HAVE UP FOR RENEWAL THIS YEAR LEVERAGING TECHNOLOGIES AND  
16 UPCOMING TRANSITION TO NEXGEN CLIPPER WE'RE UNLOCKING AND  
17 MAXIMIZING TECHNOLOGY ENABLING OPPORTUNITIES FOR CLIPPER WITH  
18 CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY OR CDT TO PILOT AUTOMATING  
19 INCOME ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION. IN ADDITION CONTINUALLY  
20 WORKING TO MARKET CLIPPER START INCREASE AWARENESS, PRODUCT  
21 MARKETING CAMPAIGNS AND SOCIAL MEDIA ADS DIGITAL ADS TRANSIT  
22 SHELTER AND MAILINGS. AS PART OF MBC WE'RE STARTING TO  
23 COORDINATE WITH HUMAN SERVICES AGENCIES TO PROMOTE CLIPPER  
24 START. WE HAVE A VENDOR NETWORK OF RETAILERS AND WE'RE WORKING  
25 TO EXPAND THIS. SO IN TERMS OF FUNDING, MTC RESOLUTION 4321



APRIL 28, 2025

1 PRIORITIZES UP TO \$8 MILLION A YEAR IN STA FUNDS FOR CLIPPER  
2 START AND LC TOP FUNDS AS AVAILABLE. LC TOP IS LOW CARBON  
3 TRANSIT OPERATOR PROGRAM FUNDS. THE FUNDING IS USED FOR  
4 OPERATIONAL AND OPERATOR FARE SUBSIDY EXPENSES OUR  
5 REIMBURSEMENT TO OPERATORS OR HALF OF THE 50% DISCOUNT ARE  
6 EXPECTED TO BE APRIL 4 MILLION OVER THE FISCAL YEAR AND WE  
7 HAVE \$1.5 MILLION A YEAR IN OPERATIONAL COSTS INCLUDING  
8 CUSTOMER SERVICE PARTICIPANT VERIFICATION AND COMMUNICATION  
9 COSTS THIS PREDICTABLE ADMINISTRATIVE COST PROVIDES A  
10 FINANCIALLY VIABLE PATH FOR MTC TO CONTINUE REIMBURSEMENT TO  
11 TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR THE 50% DISCOUNT WE WOULD LIKE TO KEEP  
12 THE CURRENT MODEL, WITH GENEROUS UP FRONT ALLOCATIONS BASED ON  
13 THE PROJECTIONS FOR THE NEXT YEAR, OFFERING REIMBURSEMENT  
14 APPROACH BASED ON TRIPS TAKEN. FOR THE REIMBURSEMENT STRUCTURE  
15 OUR NEXT STEPS WILL BE TO INSTITUTIONALIZE THE REIMBURSEMENT  
16 OF OPERATORS THROUGH A SUPPLEMENTAL MASTER FUNDING AGREEMENT  
17 PROPOSED RECOMMENDATION FOR TODAY IS ENDORSEMENT OF THE  
18 ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION TO ADOPT A NEW RESOLUTION FOR CLIPPER  
19 START, TRANSITIONING CLIPPER START PILOT TO ONGOING FARE  
20 PRODUCT AND SECOND INSTITUTIONALIZING MTC'S FARE SUBSIDY  
21 APPROACH TO OPERATORS IN ESSENCE NOTHING ELSE CHANGES FROM THE  
22 CURRENT FRAMEWORK AND CLIPPER BUSINESS RULES AND USER  
23 EXPERIENCES REMAIN CONSISTENT. THE CUSTOMER WILL SEE NO  
24 CHANGES IN TERMS OF THEIR EXPERIENCE. WE HAVE PRESENTED AND  
25 TALKED TO MANY FOLKS IN THE FARE PROGRAM WORKING GROUP AND THE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 RNM CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP AND AFTER FOOD WE'RE HEADED TO THE  
2 RNM COMMITTEE MAY 9TH, GROWING AND TESTING FRAMEWORK AS WELL  
3 AS PROGRAM OPERATIONS AND ABILITY TO REIMBURSE OPERATORS.  
4 TODAY MTC IS READY TO TRANSITION THE CLIPPER START PILOT TO AN  
5 ONGOING FARE PRODUCT IN A WAY THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH THE  
6 PILOT'S PROGRAM BUSINESS RULES AND USER EXPERIENCE. WE  
7 APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THE VERY THOUGHTFUL AND  
10 DETAILED WALK THROUGH OF THE PROGRAM THALIA. MADAM CLERK,  
11 BEFORE WE PROCEED, I WOULD JUST LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE OUR  
12 PARTNER, OUR SFMTA DIRECTOR HAS JOINED US HERE AT THE DAIS FOR  
13 THE ATTENDANCE LOG.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES.

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** SO, BEFORE WE GO TO COMMISSIONER  
18 COMMENTARY WE HAVE AN ACTION ITEM IN FRONT OF US. IS THAT THE  
19 CASE THALIA?

20

21 **THALIA LENG:** YES.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** BEFORE I GET TO -- SEE IF THERE IS A  
24 MOTION AND SECOND, AND DISCUSSION HERE, LET'S CHECK IN WITH  
25 THE PUBLIC, WHETHER IT'S VIRTUAL OR IN-PERSON HERE.



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS ONLINE. ALETA  
3 DUPREE, YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO  
4 SPEAK.

5

6 **ALETA DUPREE:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR BOB POWERS AND  
7 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM  
8 FOLDS. WELCOME TO THE BART ROOM. I SPENT A LOT OF TIME IN THE  
9 BART ROOM IT'S A FAVORITE PLACE OF MINE. THANK YOU FOR BEING  
10 HERE. I'M IN SUPPORT. I HAVE NEVER HEARD THE TERM ENDORSEMENT  
11 HERE BEFORE I GUESS IT'S A TYPE OF APPROVAL AND BEFORE WE GET  
12 THIS TO THE COMMISSION. THIS WILL GIVE CERTAINTY TO THE  
13 PROGRAM THAT STARTED OUT AS A PILOT. AND PEOPLE WANT TO HAVE  
14 CONFIDENCE IN THE FUTURE OF PROGRAM, WHEN YOU GET A DISCOUNT  
15 THAT YOU ENJOY, YOU GET USED TO IT. NOBODY WANTS TO SEE THAT  
16 PULLED. THIS PROGRAM AMONG OTHER PROGRAMS IS FINANCIALLY  
17 VIABLE AND JUSTIFIED. BECAUSE IT IS BRINGING MORE PEOPLE TO  
18 THE SYSTEM. AND SOME OF THESE MAY BE PEOPLE WHO ARE MAKING  
19 CHANGES AND IT'S ENOUGH TO SAY WELL, I'M GOING LEAVE MY CAR AT  
20 HOME, OR POSSIBLY SELL OR GIVE AWAY MY CAR. I GAVE AWAY MY CAR  
21 ABOUT 15 YEARS AGO AND STARTED USING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.  
22 THE NUMBERS ARE EVIDENT. THE NUMBERS DON'T LIE. I DO ADMONISH  
23 YOU ALL TO TAKE THIS BACK TO YOUR GOVERNING AGENCIES THAT, AS  
24 GOOD AS THIS PROGRAM IS, THAT IF SOMEBODY QUALIFIES FOR  
25 GREATER DISCOUNT, THEY SHOULD THEN BE ABLE TO OBTAIN THAT



APRIL 28, 2025

1 GREATER DISCOUNT, SUCH AS BART HAVING 62 AND A HALF%. BECAUSE  
2 THIS IS A COMPLEMENTARY PROGRAM. IT'S ONLY PART OF SEVERAL  
3 THAT HELPS PEOPLE TO ACCESS THE SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.  
6 YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES, ADINA LEVIN. AND I AM THE CHAIR OF THE  
9 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP AND SERVE  
10 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND WITH THOSE HATS, I WANT TO  
11 REPORT THAT THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP WAS VERY SUPPORTIVE OF  
12 MOVING IN THIS DIRECTION TO MAKE THIS AN ONGOING PROGRAM, AND,  
13 ALSO, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL HAS BEEN SO, OVER TIME I SEE  
14 ON THE SLIDE THAT THIS INITIAL STUDY WAS 2015 SO, THERE HAS  
15 BEEN, REALLY, ROBUST RESEARCH AND PRACTICE, AND THIS IS REALLY  
16 WELCOME TO SEE GOING FORWARD. A COUPLE OF SPECIFIC COMMENTS.  
17 GLAD TO SEE THOSE ADVISORY BODIES HAVE BEEN SUPPORTIVE OF  
18 MAKING PROGRESS ON STREAMLINING THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS AND  
19 IMPROVING THE CONVENIENCE FOR PEOPLE TO QUALIFY FOR BENEFITS  
20 TO WHICH THEY ARE ENTITLED. OVERTIME -- ONE THING THAT MAY BE  
21 IMPLIED ON THE SLIDES BUT IS NOT CLEARLY SPEND OUT AND SHOULD  
22 BE ARE ADDRESSING THE ISSUE WHERE WITH CLIPPER2, PEOPLE WILL  
23 BE ABLE TO PAY FOR TRANSIT WITH A DEBIT CARD, OR A PREPAID  
24 CARD, IN ADDITION TO A CREDIT CARD. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT CAN  
25 BE QUITE HELPFUL FOR PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOME DISCOUNTS,



APRIL 28, 2025

1 INCLUDING PEOPLE WHO USE PREPAID OR BENEFIT CARDS. AND THAT IS  
2 SOMETHING THAT WILL NOT BE AVAILABLE AT FIRST SHIP OF  
3 CLIPPER2, BUT IS SOMETHING THAT IS TECHNICALLY POSSIBLE TO DO.  
4 AND STAFF HAS MENTIONED THIS IS SOMETHING THAT THEY ARE  
5 WORKING ON, AND THIS SHOULD BE CLEARLY SPELLED OUT AS A GOAL  
6 FOR THE PROGRAM TO MAKE OPEN PAYMENT WORK WITH INCOME  
7 DISCOUNTS AS WELL AS OTHER DISCOUNTS TO WHICH PEOPLE ARE  
8 ENTITLED. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.  
13 AND THANK YOU TO THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS. OKAY. LET ME CHECK AND  
14 SEE IF I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO ENDORSE THE TRANSITION  
15 OF THE CLIPPER START FROM A PILOT TO AN ONGOING FARE DISCOUNT  
16 PROGRAM FIRST.

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'LL MOVE.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MOTION FROM FREMIER SECOND FROM  
23 MULLIGAN. LET'S SEE IF WE HAVE PUBLIC DISCUSSION HERE FROM  
24 COMMISSIONERS. TO MY RIGHT, NANCY. ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO TO  
25 BILL. DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING, NANCY?



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **NANCY WHELAN:** I HAVE A QUESTION. YEAH. YOU MENTIONED THE FACT  
3 THAT THERE ARE CASH PAYERS WHO NEED TO CONVERT TO CLIPPER AND  
4 I KNOW THAT'S A HUGE ISSUE FOR OUR RIDERS AND I'M WONDERING IF  
5 YOU COULD TALK MORE ABOUT WHAT PROGRESS HAS BEEN MADE ON THAT.  
6 I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL FOR OUR RIDERS.

7

8 **THALIA LENG:** YES I'LL ASK LISA TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION BECAUSE  
9 SHE HAS A LOT OF KNOWLEDGE ON THAT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE AWARE OF AGENCIES THAT HAVE LOWER UPTAKE OF  
12 CLIPPER AND I THINK USING NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER MARKETING  
13 ADVERTISING OUTREACH THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING IS GOING TO  
14 ALSO HELP BRING PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT NECESSARILY BE USING  
15 CLIPPER RIGHT NOW AT THE SAME TIME WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO  
16 WORK WITH AGENCIES WHO ARE DOING OUTREACH ABOUT CLIPPER START  
17 AND GOING TO BE SUPPLEMENTING THE PROGRAM THAT THEY'RE DOING  
18 AND WORKING WITH THEM IN PARTNERSHIP SO THAT HOPEFULLY IF  
19 WE'RE GETTING THE WORD OUT TO THEM ON HOPEFUL ABOUT THE  
20 DISCOUNT FOR CLIPPER.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** BILL CHURCHILL COUNTY CONNECTION.

23

24 **BILL CHURCHILL:** CHURCH THALIA THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION  
25 VERY INFORMATIVE APPRECIATE IT. I WANTED TO PREFACE WITH THE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 STATEMENT FIRST COUNTY CONNECTION IS STRONGLY SUPPORTIVE OF  
2 THIS EFFORT WE ALREADY HAVE BEGUN OUR TITLE SIX ANALYSIS WE'RE  
3 SCHEDULED TO TAKE THAT BEFORE OUR BOARD IN JUNE. THE QUESTION,  
4 I THINK THE APPLICATION PROCESS IS STILL A BARRIER AND WE SEE  
5 IT'S A BARRIER WHITE SPREAD THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, AND WE  
6 WOULD LIKE THAT BARRIER TO GO AWAY HOWEVER IF THE BARRIERS  
7 COME DOWN IT BECOMES THAT MUCH EASIER HAS STAFF PUT INTO  
8 THOUGHT OR ANALYSIS INTO WHAT THE INCREMENTAL INCREASE IN  
9 RIDERSHIP WOULD BE AND THEN HOW WOULD WE AS A REGION PAY FOR  
10 THAT?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. PROBABLY ON A LOT OF  
13 PEOPLE'S MIND AS THE PROGRAM GROWS HOW DO WE CONTINUE TO  
14 SUSTAIN IT AND WE HAVE DONE HOMEWORK TO SEE THE FUND THAT'S  
15 EXPECTED TO SUSTAIN CLIPPER START FOR SEVERAL YEARS AT THE  
16 CURRENT ENROLLMENT RATES AND IN FISCAL VIABILITY AND  
17 ADDITIONAL FUNDING RESOURCES WILL NEED TO BE ASSESSED AS  
18 CLIPPER START CONTINUES BUT AS IT STANDS TODAY AT GROWTH  
19 ENROLLMENT RATES WE HAVE PROJECTED AND CONTINUE TO BE ABLE TO  
20 CONTINUE OUR COMMITMENT FOR SEVERAL YEARS WE WILL NEED TO  
21 ASSESS THAT AS THINGS CHANGE AS THE PICTURE CHANGES OVER TIME.  
22 BUT WE CAN COMMIT TO SEVERAL YEARS TO BE FINANCIAL  
23 SUSTAINABLE.

24

25 **BILL CHURCHILL:** GREAT. THANK YOU.



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS BILL. COMING DOWN. NOT SEEING --  
3 APRIL?

4

5 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO ECHO WHAT BILL AND  
6 NANCY ALREADY SAID. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT PROGRAM. MY  
7 TRANSIT -- MY AGENCY IS VERY SUPPORTIVE OF IT. I ORIGINALLY  
8 WAS GOING TO ASK A QUESTION ABOUT POSSIBLY, MAYBE EVEN  
9 LOWERING THE BARRIER IN TERMS OF COMING TO THE PROGRAM. BUT I  
10 RECOGNIZE THAT IT HAS BEEN -- THE USAGE HAS GONE UP AND THE  
11 AMOUNT OF FUNDING IS SOMEWHAT FIXED IN TERMS OF REIMBURSING  
12 THE AGENCIES. BUT IN THE BAY AREA, I -- YOU KNOW, BESIDES, I  
13 WOULD JUST SAY FROM SAN FRANCISCO DOWN TO THE PENINSULA, IN  
14 THE BAY AREA IN GENERAL THE COST OF LIVING IS REALLY HIGH. SO  
15 IT'S STILL, IN MY OPINION, A BARRIER. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK  
16 THAT, YOU KNOW, TO THE EXTENT THAT, ESPECIALLY WE WERE TALKING  
17 ABOUT THE REGIONAL MEASURE, THERE IS FUNDING POSSIBLY THINK  
18 ABOUT HOW WE CAN REALLY HELP TO SUPPLEMENT THIS BECAUSE  
19 OTHERWISE IT'S COMING FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCY RIGHT NOW. HALF  
20 OF THE DISCOUNT IS GOING TO APPLY TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES SO  
21 THAT'S SOMETHING I WANT IS MTC TO REALLY CONSIDER HOW THAT CAN  
22 BE, YOU KNOW, THAT THAT'S PROBABLY ONE OF THE TOP, HOPEFULLY  
23 IS TOP PRIORITIES.

24



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS. CAROLYN AND THEN JEFF, KATHLEEN  
2 JULIE DENIS, ALL.

3

4 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** IN PROCESS I NOTICED THE RECOMMENDATION IS  
5 ENDORSE THE TRANSITION IS THE COMMISSION THAT VOTES ON THE  
6 PROGRAM.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** TO THE COMMITTEE ON MAY 9TH THEN TO THE COMMISSION  
9 FIRST.

10

11 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** ONE OF THE QUESTIONS I HAVE IS, I KNOW IT'S  
12 GOING TO BE ONGOING FARE PRODUCT AND I SEE WHAT THE REVENUE IS  
13 RIGHT NOW, I REALLY DON'T KNOW WHAT THE EXPENDITURES ARE.  
14 LIKE, I WOULD HAVE LIKED A LONGER TERM, MAYBE, AT LEAST FIVE  
15 YEARS, OR TEN YEARS, WHAT THIS MIGHT COST. SO, TO MAKE THAT  
16 DECISION ABOUT WHETHER WE SHOULD KEEP IT AS ONGOING FARE  
17 PRODUCT WITHOUT ANY NUMBERS EVEN THOUGH I REALLY LIKE THE  
18 PROGRAM, I WISH WE HAD A LITTLE BIT MORE NUMBERS AROUND THAT  
19 IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE DOING TO MAKE THAT DECISION TO SAY THIS  
20 SHOULD BE ONGOING AND UNDERSTANDING WHAT WE'RE GOING DO SO  
21 THAT'S A CONCERN OF MINE RIGHT NOW. ALSO THERE IS SOME  
22 DISCUSSION RIGHT NOW ABOUT SOME OF THE CONCERNS THAT YOU HAD  
23 ON ONGOING IMPROVEMENT SO WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO BRING ON  
24 RENEWING CUSTOMER SERVICE CONTRACT TO ACTUALLY HAVE SOMEONE  
25 THERE IN-PERSON OR AT LEAST TALK ON THE PHONE TO. AWARENESS



APRIL 28, 2025

1 CAMPAIGNS AND THOSE ARE COST ELEMENTS AS WELL, IS THAT GOING  
2 TO STAY UNDER ONE AND A HALF MILLION A YEAR? IS IT GOING TO GO  
3 HIGHER? THOSE ARE THINGS I'M CURIOUS ABOUT. NOT JUST THAT, YOU  
4 HAVE THE FARE SUBSIDY. I'M JUST -- AND I JUST WANT TO GET SOME  
5 BETTER SENSE OF WHAT THAT COST ELEMENT IS BEFORE SAYING, YEAH,  
6 LET'S GO FULL FORCE AHEAD. BECAUSE NOW, YOU KNOW, WE'RE DOING  
7 AN PER SE UNFUNDED MANDATE IN THE FUTURE. SO I WANT TO MAKE  
8 SURE THAT WE'RE COMFORTABLE DOING THAT. AND I DON'T KNOW IF WE  
9 CAN GET ANYTHING DONE LIKE THAT BEFORE. OTHER THAN THAT, THE  
10 PROGRAM IS GOOD. I KNOW VTA JOINED ABOUT A YEAR AGO, DO YOU  
11 KNOW WHAT USE OF IT IS? OR IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY? OR HAVE THEY  
12 REGISTERED MANY PEOPLE FOR IT?

13

14 **THALIA LENG:** I CAN GET THOSE NUMBERS. YEAH.

15

16 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THANKS.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** KATHLEEN AND THEN JULIE.

19

20 **KELLEY JACKSON:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION OF COURSE AC  
21 TRANSIT SUPPORTS THE PROGRAM, COULD YOU GO BACK TO SLIDE NINE,  
22 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THE ONGOING IMPROVEMENTS BECAUSE YOU  
23 MENTIONED THEREABOUT EXPANDING THE CONTRACTS WITH CBOS AND WE  
24 WOULD LOVE TO WORK WITH YOU ON THAT. WE KNOW MANY CBOS IN OUR  
25 AREA AND THIS IS A CRYING NEED. AND THE SAME THING ON THE LAST



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ONE ABOUT EXPANDING THE VENDOR NETWORK. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT  
2 WE HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT IN OUR SERVICE AREA THAT THAT PEOPLE  
3 STILL NEED MORE ACCESS TO THE NETWORK. SO, ARE THANK YOU FOR  
4 THE PRESENTATION, AND WE'LL LOOK TO SEE HOW WE CAN HELP YOU IN  
5 THIS AREA.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. SFMTA, JULIE  
8 KIRSCHBAUM.

9

10 **JULIE KIRSCHBAUM:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND FOR THIS,  
11 WHO. I'M VERY SUPPORTIVE OF IT, I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN  
12 SEEING AT LEAST SOME ADDITIONAL INCOME THRESHOLDS COSTED OUT.  
13 NOT NECESSARILY FOR THE UPCOMING YEAR AND WHAT WE'RE ENDORSING  
14 TODAY, BUT AS WE THINK MORE ABOUT THE TRANSFORMATION WORK.  
15 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL IS EXTREMELY LOW. AND, YOU  
16 KNOW, \$30,000 FOR AN INDIVIDUAL, \$60,000 FOR A FAMILY OF FOUR.  
17 SO, LOOKING AT OTHER INCOME THRESHOLDS, AT LEAST FROM A COST  
18 BENEFIT STRATEGY WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. I WOULD ALSO -- I  
19 WOULD LOVE TO KNOW A LITTLE BIT MORE, BECAUSE IT'S PREDATED ME  
20 ON THE NAME CLIPPER START. TO ME, IT DOESN'T INDICATE TO  
21 ANYBODY ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM THAT IT'S A MEANS BASED  
22 SINGLE FARE RIDE. AND WE WANT -- WE WERE REALLY EXCITED, A FEW  
23 MONTHS AGO, WE ACTUALLY PASSED A KEY MILESTONE WHERE WE HAD  
24 MORE PEOPLE SIGNED UP FOR CLIPPER START THAN WE DO FOR OUR  
25 MONTHLY LIFELINE PASS WHICH HAS A SIMILAR INCOME THRESHOLD. WE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 THINK THAT A SINGLE-USE DISCOUNT IS INCREDIBLY VALUABLE TO HOW  
2 PEOPLE ARE MOVING AROUND TODAY. BUT I JUST THINK MOST PEOPLE,  
3 UNLESS SOMEBODY HAS HAND-HELD THEM INTO REGISTERING FOR THE  
4 PROGRAM, THEY HAVE NO IDEA WHAT THE PROGRAM DOES.

5

6 **LYSA HALE:** YEAH, HI. LYSA HALE WITH MTC STAFF. WE CONDUCTED A  
7 NUMBER OF FOCUS GROUPS WITH PEOPLE WHO WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR  
8 THE PROGRAM AS PART OF OUR PLANNING PROCESS. AND WE LOOKED AT  
9 A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT NAMES. AND CLIPPER START WAS  
10 RESOUNDINGLY THE FAVORITE OF THE PEOPLE WHO PARTICIPATED IN  
11 OUR FOCUS GROUPS. IT GAVE PEOPLE A SENSE THAT THEY ALREADY  
12 KNEW WHAT CLIPPER WAS, OR MANY OF THEM KNEW WHAT CLIPPER WAS  
13 ALREADY, AND THE IDEA OF START INDICATED A FRESH START TO  
14 THEM. THAT WAS WHAT WE HEARD FROM NUMEROUS PEOPLE. WE DID FIVE  
15 FOCUS GROUPS. WE INCLUDED A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT  
16 REPRESENTATIONS, AND THAT WAS THE FEEDBACK WE GOT. SO THAT'S  
17 HOW WE ENDED UP WITH THE NAME. SO, I JUST WANTED TO ADDRESS  
18 THAT.

19

20 **JULIE KIRSCHBAUM:** I WOULD RECOMMEND MAYBE A TAG LINE TO GO  
21 ALONG WITH IT, MAKING TRANSIT AFFORDABLE, OR SOMETHING FOR  
22 PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT ALREADY REGULAR CLIPPER USERS OR REGULAR  
23 TRANSIT USERS SO TO INDICATE SOMETHING ABOUT MEANS BASED.

24



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **LYSA HALE:** YEAH IF I CAN ADDRESS THAT ALL OF OUR ADVERTISING  
2 THE LARGE HEADLINE ON ALL OF OUR ADVERTISING IS "SAVE 50% ON  
3 TRANSIT."

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY THANK YOU FOR THAT. DENIS MULLIGAN,  
6 GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. I WANT TO THANK ALL  
9 STAFF IT'S A FANTASTIC PROGRAM. GOLDEN GATE STRONGLY SUPPORTS  
10 THIS ALSO APPRECIATIVE THAT MTC IS PAYING PART OF THE COST IF  
11 YOU THINK ABOUT FROM A POLICY PERSPECTIVE IF WE OFFER ONE  
12 DISCOUNT FARE IT SHOULD BE MEANS FOR DECADES OFFERING  
13 DISCOUNTS TO SENIORS AND YOUTH MANY WHO MIGHT BE QUITE WEALTH  
14 WE DON'T QUIBBLE ABOUT HOW DO WE SUBSIDIZE THAT WEALTHY PERSON  
15 GETTING BACK THE FARE REVENUE IF THERE IS ONE PROGRAM MOVING  
16 FORWARD THIS MAKES THE MOST SENSE THIS IS IT. KUDOS FOR  
17 BRINGING THIS FORWARD TODAY. MONEY IS ALWAYS AN ISSUE, SENIORS  
18 AND YOUTH, RIDERSHIP IN AREAS THERE ARE QUITE WEALTHY AND YET  
19 GETTING THE DISCOUNT WE DON'T QUIBBLE ABOUT MTC AND NICKELS.  
20 SUPPORTIVE OF THIS IN FUTURE YEARS AND DISCOUNT FARE PRODUCTS.  
21 I WOULD ASK SO WE GET GREATER MARKET PENETRATION IT WOULD BE  
22 GREAT IF YOU COULD REPORT BACK ON EFFORTS AND IT WOULD BE  
23 GREAT AT A FUTURE MEETING IF YOU COULD REPORT BACK. 51,400  
24 PEOPLE IN THE PROGRAM WHAT PERCENTAGE RIDING TRANSIT TODAY ARE  
25 ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM IS IT 1% MARKET PENETRATION? IT WOULD



APRIL 28, 2025

1 BE GREAT TON IF CURRENT TRANSIT RIDERS ARE LOW-INCOME WHAT  
2 PERCENTAGE ARE ACTUALLY IN THE PROGRAM, IF WE MEASURE THAT  
3 OVER TIME IT WILL HELP US FOCUS OUR EFFORTS AND OUR CBOS  
4 GETTING THE MOST BANG FOR THEIR BUCK.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS AND  
7 QUESTIONS, DENIS. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ENDORSE THE  
8 TRANSITION FROM THE CLIPPER START FROM PILOT TO ONGOING FARE  
9 DISCOUNT PROGRAM. I HAD A COUPLE, BEFORE WE GET TO THE VOTE  
10 HERE, THALIA, JUST A COUPLE OBSERVATIONS. FROM WHAT I HEAR  
11 FROM PEOPLE I WANT TO SUMMARIZE A LITTLE BIT. I THINK THERE IS  
12 AN APPETITE ON THE BOARD HERE FOR YOU, AT THE APPROPRIATE  
13 TIME, TO BRING BACK SOME BUSINESS ANALYTICS OF THIS PROGRAM.  
14 RIGHT? WITH A THEME THAT KIND OF WORKED ITS WAY DOWN HERE, I  
15 DON'T THINK THAT'S UNREASONABLE. I KNOW THERE IS MONEYS THERE  
16 FOR THE NEXT FORESEEABLE TWO OR THREE YEARS. AND OUR LIVES ARE  
17 FUNDAMENTALLY GOING TO CHANGE, THERE IS A LOT OF MOVING PARTS  
18 IN THE NEXT 20-, 30 MONTHS; RIGHT. I THINK COMING BACK WITH  
19 SOME BUSINESS ANALYTICS, AS PART OF THAT, I THINK IT'S  
20 PROBABLY YOUR NEXT STEP ANYWAY. RIGHT? AS THIS MOVES FORWARD.  
21 SO, HOPEFULLY YOU COULD DO THAT FOR US. AND I KNOW MULLIGAN  
22 FROM GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE MENTIONED A FEW THINGS AS WELL. AND IT  
23 WOULD BE GOOD FOR ME, THALIA, JUST FOR ME, IN THE MEETINGS  
24 THAT I'M IN, AND OTHER GENERAL MANAGERS UP HERE, SO IF WE'RE  
25 AT 51,000 -- AND THIS DOESN'T HAVE ANYTHING TO DO WITH THIS



APRIL 28, 2025

1 VOTE, BUT SAY I'M IN A MEETING WITH FEDERAL ELECTED OFFICIALS  
2 AND I SAY, I NEED YOUR HELP, WE'RE AT 51,000 -- WHAT NUMBER  
3 SHOULD WE USE? WHAT NUMBER DO WE WANT TO BE AT, AT THE END OF  
4 THE YEAR? I DON'T KNOW; IS IT -- CERTAINLY I DON'T THINK -- I  
5 WAS GOING TO SAY 102 -- YOU KNOW, 102,000 [INDISCERNIBLE]  
6 THAT'S FAIRLY PROBABLY PRETTY AGGRESSIVE. DO WE WANT TO BE AT  
7 80,000? YOU KNOW? [INDISCERNIBLE] DO WE WANT -- YOU GO TO HELP  
8 US GET THE WORD OUT, WE WANT TO BE AT 80- WHAT'S THE VISION  
9 THERE? IF YOU CAN HELP ME? OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS, WHETHER IN  
10 SACRAMENTO OR WASHINGTON VERY MUCH HAVE A VESTED INTEREST IN  
11 THE SUCCESS OF THIS PROGRAM. SO, IT WOULD BE GOOD FOR ME TO  
12 KNOW THAT. TELL US, HOW YOU THINK, THALIA, BECAUSE WE COULD BE  
13 HELPFUL THERE. OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND -- OH,  
14 DIRECTOR CHOY. ARE YOU GOING TO VOTE ON THIS?

15

16 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU. IN TERMS OF THINGS YOU'RE FACING IN  
17 YOUR WORK IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING COMPONENT. ONE OF THE THINGS  
18 THAT WE HAVE BEEN MINDFUL OF IS HOW MUCH MONEY WE HAVE AND HOW  
19 MUCH IT CAN TAKE US WE WILL PRESENT ANALYTICS BUT & WE ARE  
20 CONFIDENT WE HAVE A RUNWAY IN THIS PROGRAM. BUT IT'S A DOUBLE-  
21 EDGED SWORD. WE'RE LOOKING TO GROW THE RIDERSHIP AND IN  
22 EFFORTS TO AMP UP AND DO OUTREACH AND MARKETING WE WILL BE  
23 GROWING RIDERSHIP SO WITH THAT COMES ADDITIONAL SUBSIDIES SO  
24 WE'RE TRYING TO MAKE THAT BALANCE STRIKE THAT BALANCE IN  
25 MAKING SURE THE MONEY IS THERE AS WE INCREASE ALL OF OUR



APRIL 28, 2025

1 OUTREACH EFFORTS. OTHER THING WE'RE LOOKING TOWARDS IS WE'RE  
2 TRYING TO GROW NEW RIDERSHIP NOT JUST IT'S A SUBSIDY FOR RIDES  
3 ALREADY TAKEN AND WE'RE JUST SUBSIDIZING. OUR INTEREST IS  
4 REALLY TO INCREASE ACCESS AND INCREASE CAPACITY FOR FOLKS. AND  
5 SO WE'RE THINKING ABOUT ALL OF THAT. AND JUST TO CLOSE THE  
6 LOOP IN TERMS OF OUR OWN FINANCIAL ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT,  
7 I THINK THAT'S ALSO A COMPONENT OF THE FINANCES. WE'RE LOOKING  
8 AT THAT AS WELL AND ALL CONTRACTS THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO RENEW  
9 AND CONTINUE TO SUPPORT THE PROGRAM. THE PROGRAM COSTS REALLY  
10 ARE FOCUSED ON THE ELIGIBILITY VERIFIER AND DIRECT COST  
11 RELATED TO THE PROGRAM. SO, I WANTED TO AT LEAST MAKE SURE WE  
12 CLOSE THE LOOP AND RECOGNIZE THAT FUNDING IS AN IMPORTANT PART  
13 OF THIS CONVERSATION, ASIDE FROM HOW WE STRUCTURE AND SET UP  
14 THE PROGRAM.

15

16 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU, DIRECTOR CHOY, FOR THOSE  
17 CLARIFYING REMARKS. VERY HELPFUL. MADAM CLERK, COULD WE GO TO  
18 THE VOTE, PLEASE? OR, ACTUALLY, AM I CALLING THE VOTE HERE?  
19 ALL IN FAVOR OF ENDORSING THE TRANSITION OF CLIPPER START FROM  
20 PILOT TO AN ONGOING FARE DISCOUNT PROGRAM OFFER TO CLIPPER.  
21 PLEASE SUPPORT BY STATING AYE. [AYES] IS THERE ANY OPPOSITION?  
22 I'M NOT SEEING ANY. MADAM CLERK, FOR THE RECORD, ITEM PASSES  
23 UNANIMOUSLY. THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE THOUGHTFUL AND  
24 THOROUGH PRESENTATION. TO DIRECTOR CHOY. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM  
25 3B, OUR CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT UPDATE. AND THIS IS AN UPDATE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ON THE PILOT PROGRAM. AND WE HAVE BILL BACON FROM MTC AND RYAN  
2 REEVES FROM BART COPRESENTING THIS -- THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL  
3 ITEM FOR THE COMMISSIONERS HERE. SO, BILL, AND RYAN, AS YOU  
4 GET SETTLED IN, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

5

6 **WILLIAM BACON:** GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR POWERS. THANK YOU. MY  
7 NAME IS BILL BACON WITH REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STAFF HERE  
8 AT MTC, AND I AM JOINED BY RYAN REEVES WHO IS THE CLIPPER BAY  
9 PASS PROJECT MANAGER BASED AT BART. WE'RE HERE TODAY TO  
10 PROVIDE THE COUNCIL WITH UPDATE ON THE ONGOING PROGRESS  
11 PILOTING THE BAY PASS PROGRAM ACROSS THE BAY AREA. TRANSIT  
12 AGENCIES AND MTC JOINTLY LAUNCHED THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT  
13 PROGRAM IN 2022 THROUGH A PUBLICLY FUNDED RESEARCH TRIAL AT  
14 EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMUNITIES.  
15 THE FIRST PHASE OF THE PILOT WRAPPING UP IN JUNE. PHASE TWO,  
16 WAS LAUNCHED LAST YEAR WHEN WE BEGAN SELLING CLIPPER BAY  
17 PASSES TO EMPLOYERS AND INSTITUTIONS AND TRANSPORTATION  
18 MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATIONS HOUSING COMMUNITIES AND OTHER  
19 ORGANIZATIONS THE OVERARCHING GOAL OF THE CLIPPER BAY PASS  
20 PILOT IS TO DEMONSTRATE AN UNLIMITED TRANSIT PASS COVERING ALL  
21 OPERATORS ON THE CLIPPER SYSTEM CAN GROW RIDERSHIP, IMPROVE  
22 MOBILITY FOR USERS OF CLIPPER BAY PASS, AND BE DELIVERABLE AND  
23 FINANCIALLY SUSTAINABLE WAY THAT'S DELIVERABLE TO OPERATORS IN  
24 THE REGION. CONTINUING TO FACE SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL  
25 CHALLENGES POSING EXISTENTIAL THREAT TO DELIVERING SERVICE FOR



APRIL 28, 2025

1 THE PUBLIC, OUR HOPE IS THE BAY PASS PROGRAM WILL PROVIDE  
2 OPERATORS AND PEOPLE ON TO TRANSIT MORE OFTEN AND DEMONSTRATE  
3 HOW WORKING TOGETHER IMPROVES OUTCOMES FOR THE PUBLIC. BEFORE  
4 I TURN THE SLIDES OVER TO RYAN FOR THE BULK OF TODAY'S  
5 PRESENTATION I WILL FOCUS ON PHASE ONE BAY PASS PILOT, PHASE  
6 ONE PILOT BEGAN IN AUGUST 2022 BY OFFERING CLIPPER BAY PASS, A  
7 QUARTER OF THE STUDENT BODIES OF EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS.  
8 ENDING THIS JUNE. RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL PROGRAM LOOKING  
9 FORWARD TO BRINGING OUR PHASE ONE EVALUATION REPORT TO THIS  
10 COUNCIL IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS WE'LL DISCUSS FINDINGS FROM THE  
11 FIRST PHASE IN DETAIL. DETAILED ANALYSIS USING QUALITATIVE AND  
12 QUANTITATIVE DATA TO REPORT ON IMPACTS OF CLIPPER BAY PASS ON  
13 A VARIETY OF MEASURES ACROSS PHASE ONE PARTICIPANTS. FINALLY,  
14 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO TRANSITION OUR EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION  
15 PARTNERS FROM THE FIRST PHASE INTO FULL CLIPPER BAY PASS  
16 CUSTOMERS WHERE ALL ENROLLED STUDENTS WILL BE PROVIDED A  
17 CLIPPER BAY PASS. RYAN WILL SPEAK MORE TO THIS, BUT SAN  
18 FRANCISCO STATE UNIVERSITY AND UC BERKELEY STUDENTS HAVE BOTH  
19 SUPPORTED USING EXISTING AND NEWLY INCREASED STUDENT FEES TO  
20 EXPAND BAY PASS TO THEIR ENTIRE CAMPUS COMMUNITIES. WE'RE  
21 WORKING TO EXPAND THE CORPORATE PASS IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF  
22 YEARS. AND IN SONOMA COUNTY, WE'RE WORKING WITH SMART AND  
23 LOCAL AGENCIES TO EXPLORE GRANT OPPORTUNITIES TO EXPAND THE  
24 CLIPPER BAY PASS PROGRAM TO SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE. I'LL  
25 NOW TURN THE SLIDES OVER TO RYAN.



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **RYAN REEVES:** THANKS, BILL. SO WE HAVE MOVED INTO PHASE TWO OF  
3 THE PILOT WHERE WE ARE SELLING BAY PASS PRODUCT TO  
4 INSTITUTIONS, AND THIS PRODUCT IS FULLY FUNDED BY EMPLOYERS.  
5 WE HAVE AGREEMENTS WITH ALL OPERATORS TO OFFER THIS THROUGH  
6 SUMMER OF 2027 TO UP TO 80,000 PEOPLE. WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND  
7 IMPACTS TO TRAVEL BEHAVIOR AND GENERATING NEW RIDERS AND  
8 GROWING RIDERSHIP. DATA AND EVALUATION FROM THE PILOT WILL  
9 HELP TO INFORM POST PILOT PROGRAM THAT MAY BE DEVELOPED AFTER  
10 2027. SO, FOR THIS PHASE WE'RE ON TRACK WITH 11 ORGANIZATIONS  
11 IN CONTRACT JUST UNDER 40,000 PEOPLE AND WE HAVE FIVE PENDING  
12 CONTRACTS WE'RE EXCITED THAT UC BERKELEY WILL BE GIVING ACCESS  
13 TO CLIPPER BAY PASS TO MORE THAN 45,000 STUDENTS FOR TWO YEARS  
14 BEGINNING AUGUST OF THIS YEAR REFERENDUM TO INCREASE STUDENT  
15 FEES TO PURCHASE THE PASS AND VOTE PASSED BY 90%. WE CONTINUE  
16 TO HAVE INTEREST FROM ORGANIZATIONS AND ARE BRINGING CONTRACTS  
17 ONLINE ON A ROLLING BASIS TO MANAGE FINANCIAL RISK WE ARE  
18 BRINGING ON TWO CONTRA COSTA CUSTOMERS THIS SUMMER AND STILL  
19 LOOKING TO CONTINUE RECRUITING IN THE NORTH BAY. SO, WE HAVE  
20 SEEN MORE THAN 2 MILLION TRIPS TAKEN IN JUST THE FIRST YEAR OF  
21 THIS PAID PHASE OF BAY PASS AND MANY OF THOSE HAVE BEEN ON  
22 OPERATORS LIKE BART AC TRANSIT AND MUNI BUT HAVE SEEN A WIDE  
23 RANGE OF TRIPS ACROSS TRANSIT OPERATORS WE HAVE DONE SURVEYS  
24 WITH PEOPLE WHO HAVE RECEIVED BAY PASS AND CONTINUE TO HEAR  
25 FROM EMPLOYEES AND STUDENTS ABOUT HOW IMPACTFUL THE PASS HAS



APRIL 28, 2025

1 BEEN IN TERMS OF MAKING IT EASIER TO GET AROUND MORE  
2 AFFORDABLE AND SIMPLER TO CHOOSE TRANSIT. SO, INCLUDING OUR  
3 PENDING CONTRACTS WE HAVE OVER 80,000 EXPENSE FOR PHASE TWO,  
4 PAID VERSION OF THE PILOT PROGRAM WE HAVE A RANGE OF CUSTOMERS  
5 ACROSS THE BAY AREA REPRESENTING HEALTH CARE CITY GOVERNMENT  
6 TECHNOLOGY AFFORDABLE HOUSING EDUCATION AND SOCIAL SERVICES.  
7 WITH OUR PRICING APPROACH WE CONTINUE TO REMAIN REVENUE  
8 NEUTRAL ACROSS ALL OF OUR CONTRACTS. SO, THIS SLIDE OUTLINES  
9 THE AGREEMENTS BETWEEN TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC RELATED TO  
10 REVENUES. SO, JUST A QUICK RECAP. OPERATORS ARE REIMBURSED FOR  
11 TRIPS BASED ON ACTUAL PASSENGER USAGE AT A RATE EQUAL TO A  
12 FULL ADULT CLIPPER FARE. IN THE EVENT REVENUE ARE INSUFFICIENT  
13 TO REIMBURSE OPERATORS, WE HAVE A \$5 MILLION BACKSTOP SET  
14 ASIDE. IN THE EVENT THAT MORE REVENUES ARE COLLECTED THAN  
15 NEEDED TO REIMBURSE TRIPS, WE HAVE AGREED THAT UP TO \$1  
16 MILLION CAN BE AVAILABLE TO REIMBURSE MTC FOR PILOT OPERATIONS  
17 AND MANAGEMENT, AND ANY ADDITIONAL NET REVENUES CAN BE  
18 ALLOCATED TO TRANSIT OPERATORS BASED ON OPERATOR'S SHARE  
19 OVERALL OF PHASE TWO RIDERSHIP. WE'LL BE WORKING WITH  
20 OPERATORS OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS TO UNDERSTAND OPTIONS FOR  
21 HOW TO APPROACH THIS REVENUE BALANCE FROM OUR EXISTING  
22 CONTRACTS. FINALLY, AS THIS SLIDE RECAPS OUR APPROACH TO  
23 PRICING THE BAY PASS PRODUCT, WHICH WE SHARED AT THE LAST  
24 MEETING, WE'RE PRICING AT A REVENUE NEUTRAL OR POSITIVE LEVEL  
25 TO ALIGN WITH THE AGREEMENT. WE CUSTOMIZED THE YEAR ONE PRICE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ACCORDING TO -- FOR EVERY POTENTIAL CUSTOMER, PRIMARILY BASED  
2 ON THE EMPLOYER OR INSTITUTIONAL LOCATION AND HOW OFTEN ARE  
3 EMPLOYEES ARE ON-SITE. WITH DATA GATHERED IN FIRST YEAR, WE'RE  
4 ABLE TO RESET A SECOND YEAR CONTRACT PRICE CLOSER TO ACTUAL  
5 USAGE IF WE PRICED TOO HIGH OR TOO LOW IN YEAR ONE. LAST YEAR,  
6 THE PROGRAM SOLD \$9 MILLION OF PASSES, AND THE PROGRAM HAS  
7 BEEN REIMBURSING OPERATORS EVERY SIX MONTHS FOR ALL RIDES  
8 TAKEN. WE'RE STARTING A CONTRACT NEXT MONTH WITH CONSULTANT  
9 PRICING STUDY TO REVIEW VARIOUS APPROACHES TO PRICING FOR BAY  
10 PASS AND OTHER BUSINESS PROCESSES FOR THE PROGRAM. WITH THAT  
11 BILL AND I ARE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT RYAN AND BILL FOR A  
14 VERY THOUGHTFUL PRESENTATION. MADAM CLERK, BEFORE WE GO TO  
15 PUBLIC COMMENT I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE OUT TO THE PUBLIC WE'RE  
16 JOINED BY CASEY FRONSON REPRESENTING CALTRAIN ON THIS BOARD  
17 HERE. LET'S CHECK IN WITH MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC EITHER  
18 VIRTUALLY OR IN-PERSON.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS ONLINE, ALETA  
21 DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANKS CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR  
24 THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. VERY IMPORTANT AND  
25 VERY EXCITING WORK EXPANSION OF THIS PROGRAM WHICH I HAVE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ALWAYS HAD CONFIDENCE IN WILL BUILD RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE FOR  
2 OUR COLLECTIVE SYSTEM. WHEN I SAW THE CHART, AT FIRST I WAS A  
3 LITTLE SURPRISED THAT MUNI HAD THE BIGGEST SHARE OF IT, BUT I  
4 SEE THAT'S BASED ON SAN FRANCISCO STATE UNIVERSITY. SO, WITH  
5 THE UPCOMING EXPANSION OF UC BERKELEY, THAT SHOULD BRING MORE  
6 FARES INTO BART AND AC TRANSIT. HOPEFULLY OTHER UNIVERSITIES  
7 AND COMMUNITY COLLEGES TO GET SEW THIS. SOME MIGHT SAY TO ME,  
8 WHY DO YOU SPEAK ON THIS. IT DOESN'T APPLY TO YOU. WELL, SOME  
9 DAY IT COULD. THIS IS A TEMPLATE THAT COULD LEAD TO A FULLY  
10 PUBLICLY AVAILABLE PRODUCT. BECAUSE, FOR ME, I OFTEN AM MAKING  
11 CHOICES BETWEEN WHICH SYSTEM TO USE, WHICH IS VERY PREVALENT  
12 FOR ME IN STAYING IN EMERYVILLE, WHERE I CAN CHOOSE A BUS OR  
13 BART AND HAVE A FREE EMERY GO ROUND. THAT CAN CAUSE A  
14 DISPARITY IN COSTS ACROSS THE BAY PENDING ON WHICH COMBINATION  
15 OF THESE SYSTEMS I USE. SO, I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO US  
16 EXPANDING THIS, ESPECIALLY IF WE CAN GET IN THE SOUTH BAY AND  
17 GET LOTS OF PEOPLE ON CALTRAIN, USE THE NICE ELECTRIC RAIL  
18 SYSTEM. SO, ANYWAY, I LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR DISCUSSION AND  
19 EXPANDING THE PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA  
22 LEVIN. YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. ADINA LEVIN WITH HATS AS CHAIR OF THE  
25 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP SERVING ON



APRIL 28, 2025

1 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, REPORTING THAT THE SUCCESS AND  
2 EXPANSION OF BAY PASS IS VIEWED VERY FAVORABLY AND CELEBRATED  
3 BY THE ADVISORY BODIES, FOCUSING ON THESE ISSUES. PEOPLE ARE  
4 REALLY GLAD TO SEE HOW THIS HELPS INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP  
5 FOR VARIOUS DIFFERENT POPULATIONS, INCLUDING THE STUDENTS,  
6 RESIDENTS IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PROVIDING INCREASED  
7 CONVENIENCE FOR PEOPLE THAT ARE EMPLOYEES AT VARIOUS DIFFERENT  
8 WORKPLACES. SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, IT'S REALLY GOOD TO SEE THOSE  
9 PLACES WHERE IT IS POPULAR AND EXPANDING. IN SAN MATEO COUNTY,  
10 THERE IS AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING MONTH EVENT ON MAY 28TH THAT IS  
11 FOCUSING ON THE TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT AT KEY  
12 CROSSING AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMUNITY WHERE RESIDENTS HAVE  
13 ACCESS TO BAY PASS AND THIS IS A POPULAR OFFERING THAT REALLY  
14 IMPROVES MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE WHO PREVIOUSLY HAD ACCESS TO ONLY  
15 LOCAL TRIPS AND NOW HAVE GREATER MOBILITY BY USING AGENCIES,  
16 INCLUDING BART AND CALTRAIN. THE EMPLOYERS THAT ARE JOINING  
17 THE PROGRAM, BECAUSE HAVING A MULTI-AGENCY PASS MEETS MORE OF  
18 THEIR EMPLOYEE'S NEEDS THAN A SINGLE AGENCY PASS WITH, FOR  
19 EXAMPLE, THE CITY OF MENLO PARK AS AN EARLY CUSTOMER, AND PA  
20 CITY OF PALO ALTO HAVING JUST RECENTLY JOINED. SO, THANK YOU  
21 VERY MUCH FOR THIS UPDATE. IT'S REALLY GREAT TO SEE THIS  
22 PROGRAM SUCCEED AND EXPAND.  
23



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
2 IN THE ROOM AND WITH THERE IS NO OTHER SPEAKERS ONLINE. THANK  
3 YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. AGAIN WE'RE  
6 ON AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM HERE. COMMENT, EPIPHANIES, CONCERNS  
7 FOR EITHER RYAN OR BILL OR AS A REGION ON THE TOPIC? NO. NOT  
8 SEEING ANY HERE. CAROLYN AND THEN WE'LL GO TO SFMTA AND THEN  
9 AC TRANSIT.

10

11 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I WAS CURIOUS, NOTICED THERE IS NOBODY FOR  
12 BAY PASS, FOR TWO -- FOR PHASE TWO, IT'S CALLED, IN SANTA  
13 CLARA COUNTY. IS THERE DIFFICULTY BECAUSE WE HAVE OUR OWN  
14 PASS? OR -- I KNOW WITH SAN JOSE STATE, YOU'RE CONSIDERING  
15 CONTINUING TO TALK TO THEM. AND WE HAVE A RELATIVELY LOW-COST  
16 FOR OURS. SO, BUT I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT WHAT THAT MIGHT BE  
17 ABOUT. AND DO WE -- I MEAN, IN -- AND THE LAST THING IS, SAME  
18 AS ON THE OTHER ONE, THE OTHER ITEM IS JUST TRYING TO  
19 UNDERSTAND THE COST FOR BAY PASS TWO THAT WE'RE SEEING RIGHT  
20 NOW, AND, SORT OF, THE NUMBERS, THE BALANCES AND STUFF.  
21 BECAUSE -- I LOOK AT THE CLIPPER REPORT THAT I GET, BUT IT'S  
22 NOT -- YOU CAN'T BREAK IT OUT OR ANYTHING. BAY PASS COSTS, AND  
23 ON WHAT WE'RE DOING. THOSE TYPES OF THINGS AND THEN GOING  
24 FORWARD, AND THE FUND SOURCES. THANKS.

25



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU MEMBER GONOT. PALO ALTO IS IN CITY OF  
2 SANTA CLARA.

3

4 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YES SOMETIMES THEY FORGET THEY'RE NOT ON THE  
5 PENINSULA.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES. THEY ARE DOING THAT.

8

9 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE DO HAVE ONE CUSTOMER IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY.  
10 BUT YOUR POINT IS WELL TAKEN, AND WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE MORE  
11 CUSTOMERS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION  
12 WHERE WE DON'T HAVE THE REPRESENTATION RIGHT NOW. AS A  
13 REMINDER THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT THAT GOVERNS THIS PILOT  
14 PROGRAM DOES SPELL OUT SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS FOR HOW  
15 ORGANIZATIONS CAN JOIN THE PROGRAM IN THE CALTRAIN CORRIDOR  
16 AND IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. SO, WOO ORGANIZATIONS HAVE TO BE  
17 EXISTING CUSTOMERS OR CHOOSE TO JOIN THE VTA SMART PASS  
18 PROGRAM IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. IF THEY'RE NOT ALREADY  
19 PARTNERS, BEFORE THEY CAN BECOME BAY PASS CUSTOMERS. IT'S KIND  
20 OF A TWO-STEP PROCESS FOR EMPLOYERS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND  
21 IT DOES FRANKLY PRESENT SOME FRICTION AT TIMES WITH EMPLOYERS  
22 BECAUSE IF THEY HAVE NOT HAD A VTA SMART PASS IN THE PAST AND  
23 THEY'RE INTERESTED IN GETTING BAY PASS PROGRAM THEY HAVE HEARD  
24 ABOUT WE COMMUNICATE TO THEM THERE IS AN ADDITIONAL PROCESS  
25 THEY HAVE TO GO THROUGH. WE WORK CLOSELY WITH YOUR STAFF AT



APRIL 28, 2025

1 VTA AND WE HAVE A NUMBER OF PROMISING LEADS RIGHT NOW IN SANTA  
2 CLARA COUNTY BUT I'LL BE HONEST THE REQUIREMENT IN THE  
3 PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT DOES CREATE FRICTION IN BOTH THE  
4 PENINSULA AND IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY FOR -- [INDISCERNIBLE]

5

6 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** BUT IF WE WOULD GO, SAY SOMETHING OPENED UP  
7 MORE, LIKE A MARKET MORE LIKE ONLY CONNECTED TO BART, SO, THAT  
8 ACTUALLY COULD HAVE BEEN A BUSINESS THAT MAY NOT HAVE SEEN A  
9 NEED FOR VTA, BUT WOULD SEE A NEED FOR THAT CONNECTION TO OUR  
10 LIGHT RAIL OR WHATEVER. BECAUSE OTHERWISE WE DON'T SERVE THEM  
11 WITH A WHOLE LOT MORE. THAT MIGHT, SORT OF, BE SOMETHING  
12 DEPENDING ON WHERE THE MARKETS COMING -- I WE HAVE A HUGE  
13 AMOUNT OF PEOPLE THAT JUST STAY WITHIN THE COUNTY AND TRAVEL  
14 WITHIN THE COUNTY BUT IT'S A BIT DIFFERENT I'M GOING TO TALK  
15 ABOUT SOME OF THE SURVEYS WE'RE DOING AND WHAT WE'RE GETTING.  
16 AND I'LL SPEAK IN TERMS OF THE FINANCE PROGRAM. WE'LL BRING  
17 FORWARD MORE INFORMATION IN OUR NEXT UPDATE.

18

19 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I WAS JUST HOPING TO GET SOME MORE.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** SFMTA JULIE KIRSCHBAUM THEN KATHLEEN  
22 KELLY FROM AC TRANSIT.

23

24 **JULIE KIRSCHBAUM:** I'M INCREDIBLY EXCITED ABOUT THIS PROGRAM  
25 AND WANT TO SEE IT CONTINUE. I UNDERSTAND, TO GET SO MANY



APRIL 28, 2025

1 OPERATORS ON BOARD, THAT REIMBURSE AT THE ADULT SINGLE RIDE  
2 FARE IS CERTAINLY THE MOST ROBUST FOR THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. I  
3 ALSO THINK IT'S A HUGE BARRIER TO EXPANDING THE PROGRAM. FOR  
4 EXAMPLE, A LOT OF THESE UNIVERSITIES WOULD, YOU KNOW, VERY  
5 WERE POTENTIALLY BE CLIPPER START ELIGIBLE. SO, I JUST THINK,  
6 AS WE GET MORE EXPERIENCE WITH THE PROGRAM, THE MORE  
7 SOPHISTICATED WE CAN BE ABOUT THE COSTING, THE MORE WE'RE  
8 GOING TO REMOVE BARRIERS TO ENTRY. AND I JUST THINK,  
9 ULTIMATELY GETTING THE MAJOR EMPLOYERS IN THE BAY AREA ON TO  
10 THIS PROGRAM, WILL HAVE FAR GREATER BENEFITS TO ALL OF US THAN  
11 JUST THESE SMALLER SCALE USES. I JUST REALLY WANT TO CONTINUE  
12 TO PUSH US ON THE COSTING OF THIS PROGRAM. WHEN WE TALK TO  
13 MAJOR EMPLOYERS IN SAN FRANCISCO, THEY, THEY'RE -- THEY SEE  
14 REGIONAL TRANSIT AS A HUGE BENEFIT. A LOT OF THEM, JUST A MUNI  
15 PASS IS NOT APPEALING, BECAUSE OF WHERE THE RIDERS ARE COMING  
16 FROM. AND THEY HAVE SOPHISTICATED DATA ON WHERE THE RIDERS ARE  
17 ACKNOWLEDGE FROM, SO INCORPORATING THAT INTO THE COSTING, I  
18 THINK WILL MAKE THE PROGRAM BETTER IN THE FUTURE.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. KATHLEEN KELLY AND THEN WE'LL  
21 GO OVER TO KC FROM CALTRAIN.

22

23 **KELLEY JACKSON:** I AM -- TO SEE THE PROGRAM. LIKewise I'M GLAD  
24 TO SEE THE PROGRAM EXPANDING. I THINK I WOULD LIKE TO SET UP A  
25 MEETING WITH SOME OF YOU GUYS AT AC TRANSIT STAFF, JUST TO



APRIL 28, 2025

1 UNDERSTAND A LITTLE BETTER HOW THIS WORKS WITH OUR ONGOING  
2 EASY PASS PROGRAM AND NOW THAT -- IS PART OF THIS PROGRAM,  
3 THAT'S A PROGRAM WE HAD 20 YEARS OR SOMETHING. IN FACT, IF  
4 MEMORY SERVES ME, ALIX BOCKELMAN, THAT'S HOW FIRST MET HER  
5 WHEN SHE WAS A STUDENT ORGANIZING FOR THE EASY PASS PROGRAM  
6 WITH AC TRANSIT. I WANT TO SEE HOW LONG-TERM THAT'S GOING TO  
7 AFFECT FINANCE. I'LL REACH OUT AND SET UP A MEETING.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. KC FROM CAL --

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI EVERYBODY. WE HAVE WORKED A LOT WITH YOU AND  
12 REALLY APPRECIATE THE STATEMENTS TO TRY TO MAKE THIS REVENUE  
13 NEUTRAL OR POSITIVE FOR OPERATORS. CALTRAIN HAS HAD THE GO  
14 PASS PROGRAM FOR 20 YEARS. IT'S A THIRD OF THE OPERATING  
15 BUDGET. IT WAS HALF DURING THE PANDEMIC SO HOWEVER THIS  
16 CONTINUES TO CHANGE WE WANT IT TO BE A GOOD PROGRAM FOR  
17 EVERYONE SO WE WANT TO KEEP WORKING WITH YOU AS WE GET TO  
18 OTHER ITERATIONS OF THIS. THANKS.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. OTHER COMMENT FROM FOLKS? I  
21 JUST WANTED TO ECHO MANY OF THE COMMENTS HERE, BILL AND RYAN.  
22 I WANT TO FIRST START BY THANKING THE UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA  
23 AT BERKELEY. AND THEM AS AN AGENCY, OR AS AN ENTITY, AND THEN  
24 THE STUDENT BODY, RIGHT, FOR ELECTING TO DO THIS AND PASSING  
25 THAT MEASURE. I THINK THAT'S VERY TELLING, YOU KNOW, ON WHERE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 THIS PROGRAM AND THE UPSIDE OF THIS PROGRAM, AND I KNOW A LOT  
2 OF US, YOU KNOW, WE'RE PROVIDING INFORMATION AND FACTS AND  
3 THAT TO SUPPORT THAT. SO, THANK YOU FOR ALL THAT YOU HAVE DONE  
4 THERE, AND THANKS TO THE UNIVERSITY OF CAL BERKELEY FOR  
5 GETTING THIS THING PASSED. I THINK IT'S HUGE. AND I THINK IT'S  
6 GOING TO BE A BIT OF MOMENTUM SWING. BOOM, ON BOARD, SO  
7 CONTINUE DOING WHAT YOU'RE DOING, AND I TOO WOULD LIKE TO SEE  
8 AT SOME POINT IN THE FUTURE, AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME, BILL AND  
9 RYAN, COME BACK WITH MORE BUSINESS ANALYTICS ON THE PROGRAM,  
10 AS THE OUT-YEARS COME UPON US. SO, THANK YOU FOR KEEPING US  
11 ALL POSTED ON THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT UPDATE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MADAM CLERK WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE ITEM  
14 NUMBER 3B. AND WE'RE GOING TO OPEN ITEM NUMBER -- WE'RE GOING  
15 TO OPEN ITEM NUMBER 3C WHICH IS OUR 2023, 2024 REGIONAL  
16 TRANSIT PASSENGER SNAPSHOT SURVEY UPDATE. A BIT OF A LONG  
17 PHRASE THERE. REGIONAL TRANSIT PASSENGER SNAPSHOT SURVEY  
18 UPDATE. AND THIS IS AN UPDATE ON THE '23/'24 SURVEY THAT WENT  
19 OUT. AND, DAVE, ARE YOU RUNNING POINT ON THIS? WHO IS RUNNING  
20 POINT ON THIS?

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** MY COLLEAGUE SHIMON WILL PRESENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** DAVE WILL WALK THROUGH THE INFORMATIONAL  
25 ITEM THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **SHIMON ISRAEL:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR POWERS AND COUNCIL

3 MEMBERS. I'M SHIMON ISRAEL WITH THE MTC REGIONAL PLANNING

4 PROGRAM. HERE TO DESCRIBE OUR TRANSIT PASSENGER SURVEY PROGRAM

5 I'LL START WITH WHY WE COLLECT OUR OWN DATA. YOU CAN'T RELY ON

6 OFF THE SHELF PRODUCTS. I'LL EXPLAIN OUR PROGRAM SUMMARIZE

7 FINDINGS FROM THE POST-PANDEMIC SNAPSHOT SURVEY COMPLETED IN

8 2024 AND FINISH WITH DESCRIPTION OF POTENTIAL UPCOMING WORK.

9 NO EXISTING DATA SOURCE CAN FULLY ADDRESS ALL QUESTIONS WE

10 HAVE ABOUT PEOPLE'S TRAVEL. THIS IS WHY MTC CONDUCTS ITS OWN

11 DATA COLLECTION. THIS WILL FOCUS ON THE SECOND ITEM ON THE

12 LEFT, THE MTC TRANSIT PASSENGER SURVEYS. DATA WE COLLECT ARE

13 USED FOR NEAR AND LONG-TERM DECISIONS, INCLUDING MANY OPERATOR

14 LEVEL PLANNING TASKS TO HELP US REFINE OUR REGIONAL TRAVEL

15 MODELS AND ARE USED IN OUR REGIONAL PLANS AND EQUITY ANALYSIS,

16 INCLUDING TITLE SIX REQUIREMENTS FOR OPERATORS. THIS TIMELINE

17 REPRESENTS OUR ONGOING TRANSIT PASSENGER SURVEY PRECOVID. THIS

18 PROGRAM INCLUDES 25 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT OR TDA

19 FUNDING OPERATORS SURVEYED IN ROTATION. EACH OPERATOR IS

20 SURVEYED ONCE IN A 5 TO 7 YEAR PERIOD. AND THE REASON WHY

21 SURVEYING IS DISTRIBUTED OVER MULTIPLE YEARS IS IT COLLECTS

22 DETAILED TRIP DATA AT THE ROUTE 11 WITH A HIGH SAMPLE RATE AND

23 REQUIRES SIGNIFICANT BUDGET AND PROJECT OVERSIGHT. SOME

24 OPERATORS WERE SURVEYED MULTIPLE TIMES PRECOVID AND SOLID

25 ICONS REPRESENT MOST RECENT INSTANCE. THIS CHART SHOWS



APRIL 28, 2025

1 PANDEMIC RELATED RIDERSHIP DECLINES WITH REBOUND THAT'S NOT  
2 UNIFORM ACROSS OPERATORS NOR WITHIN OPERATORS ACROSS ROUTES. A  
3 RIDER AND TRIP CHARACTERISTICS MAY HAVE CHANGED AND MAY BE  
4 REBASED LINED POST-PANDEMIC. THE ONGOING TRANSIT PASSENGER  
5 SURVEY DESCRIBED IN THE PREVIOUS SLIDE, PAUSED DURING COVID.  
6 WHEN IT CAME TIME TO RESUME WE DISCUSSED AN APPROACH WITH  
7 EXECUTIVE STAFF PURSUING TWO DIFFERENT TRANSIT PASSENGER  
8 SURVEYS IN PARALLEL. ONE, THE RESUMPTION OF THE DETAILED 5 TO  
9 7 YEAR ONGOING PROGRAM, AND THEN, ALSO, ONE TIME ONE YEAR  
10 POST-PANDEMIC REGIONAL SNAPSHOT SURVEY WITH SIMPLIFIED  
11 INSTRUMENT APPROACH TO GET BASELINE DETAILS. THIS IS THE  
12 CONTOURS OF THE SNAPSHOT SURVEY. ALL BY TWO OPERATORS IN OUR  
13 USUALLY SAMPLING UNIVERSITY OF 25 WERE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE  
14 GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT ACE HAD COMPETING SURVEYS ALREADY IN THE  
15 FIELD SURVEY ADMINISTERED VIA PAPER WITH QR CODE WEB OPTION  
16 AND COLLECTED 16 AND A HALF THOUSAND SURVEYS REGION-WIDE DATA  
17 REPORTABLE DOWN TO OPERATOR AND MODE LEVEL MULTI-MODAL  
18 OPERATOR PRESIDENCY VARIABLES IN RED ARE REPORTED IN THE  
19 PRESENTATION I'M GOING TO PAUSE TO GIVE FOLKS A CHANCE TO LOOK  
20 AT VARIABLES COLLECTED. OKAY. OKAY. SO THIS IS A QUICK  
21 COMPARISON BETWEEN TWO SURVEYS DESCRIBED SNAPSHOT SURVEY AGAIN  
22 IS THE ONE YEAR ENTIRE REGION SIMPLIFIED APPROACH AND ONGOING  
23 SURVEYS 5 TO 7 YEARS, MUCH MORE DETAILED ROUTE 11 DATA  
24 COLLECTION. SNAPSHOT SURVEY FOR THE ENTIRE REGION'S DATA  
25 COLLECTION COST IS \$900,000 FUNDED WITH TDA PLANNING OR STATE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 FUNDS AND ONGOING SURVEY AVERAGES COST OF ABOUT \$600,000 A  
2 YEAR AND PART OF THAT PAID FOR BY OPERATORS WHO CONTRIBUTE 20%  
3 OF THE COST. THAT FUNDING IS FEDERAL AND MTC STAFF IS CLOSE TO  
4 TRACKING THE DYNAMIC FEDERAL ENVIRONMENT AND WILL WORK WITH  
5 OPERATORS AS NEEDED AS CONDITIONS MAY EVOLVE. SO, THIS SLIDE  
6 SUMMARIZES HIGH-LEVEL CHANGES PRE AND POST-PANDEMIC. POST-  
7 PANDEMIC RIDERS, LOW-INCOME, BEFORE COVID, HIGH INCOME RIDERS  
8 STILL A SIZABLE GROUP. SHARE OF WHITE RIDERS HAS DECLINED  
9 REGION-WIDE. WORK HAS DECLINED IN BOTH AGGREGATE AND SHARE OF  
10 TRANSIT TRAVEL, AND SHARES OF NON-WORK TRIPS HAVE INCREASED  
11 CONSEQUENTLY. TRANSIT TRANSFORM WITHIN SAN FRANCISCO CONTINUES  
12 TO BE ONE OF THE STRONGER AT THIS TIME MARKETS AS DOES EAST  
13 BAY TO SAN FRANCISCO COMPARED TO MANY COUNTY TO COUNTY OR  
14 GROUP TO COUNTY GROUP TRAVEL PATTERNS. AND ADDITIONAL  
15 GEOGRAPHIC ANALYSIS ARE PLANNED, ALL UP TO THIS PRESENTATION,  
16 POTENTIALLY IN PUBLIC-FACING DASHBOARDS, WHICH I'LL TALK ABOUT  
17 MORE AT THE END. SO, THE REST OF THIS SLIDE DECK LOOKS AT  
18 RESULTS FROM THE POST-PANDEMIC SNAPSHOT SURVEY IT GIVES KIND  
19 OF A STATE OF CURRENT CONDITIONS. IN GENERAL, THE TRANSIT  
20 RIDING PUBLIC IS LESS WHITE AND ASIAN THAN THE BACKGROUND  
21 POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA BUT MORE BLACK AND HISPANIC.  
22 TRANSIT RIDERS ALSO SKEW LOW-INCOME AND ARE FOUR TIMES MORE  
23 LIKELY TO BE IN POVERTY THAN THE BACKGROUND REGIONAL  
24 POPULATION. WE ASKED FOLKS THE QUESTION WHO HAVE VEHICLES AS  
25 ALTERNATIVE TO THEIR TRANSIT TRIP 65 OF 2/3 OF PEOPLE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 INDICATED NOT HAVING A VEHICLE AVAILABLE IN LIEU. ASKED ABOUT  
2 SPECIAL DISABILITY QUESTION TRANSPORTATION LIMITING DISABILITY  
3 ABOUT 8% OF RIDERS INDICATED HAVING THAT DISABILITY. THIS  
4 LOOKS DEEPER IN MODE BY RACE AND INCOME LOCAL BUS IS LEAST  
5 WHITE MODE FERRY IS WHITEST TRANSBAY BUS SIMILAR TO RAIL IN  
6 TERMS OF INCOME BUS RAIL FERRY HAVE HIGH INCOME RIDER HAVING  
7 HIGHEST REMAINDER THESE SUMMARIZE DON'T INCLUDE GOLDEN GATE  
8 TRANSIT FOR FERRY JUST WETA AND IF WE HAD INCLUDED GOLDEN GATE  
9 YOU MIGHT EXPECT A DEEPER SCALE BY RACE ETHNICITY AND INCOME.  
10 SO, WORK IS AT TRIP END WHERE ABOUT HALF OF ALL TRANSIT TRIPS  
11 WITHIN THE BAY AREA IS DOWN FROM 60% PRECOVID AND CONSEQUENCE  
12 OTHER PURPOSE NOW ACCOUNT FOR LARGER SHARE OF TRIPS AND IN THE  
13 PAST. THE QUESTION ABOUT FREQUENCY OF USE FOR INDIVIDUALS AND  
14 ABOUT 3/5THS OR 58% OF PASSENGERS USE TRANSIT FIVE-PLUS DAYS A  
15 WEEK. MANY OPERATORS HAVE A HIGH SHARE OF DAILY CUSTOMERS. WE  
16 ALSO FOLLOWED UP WITH THE QUESTION, DO YOU PLAN TO USE PUBLIC  
17 TRANSIT MORE OR LESS IN THE NEXT YEAR OR SO. AN OPTIMISTIC  
18 NINE OUT OF TEN RIDERS INDICATED THEY WOULD LIKELY USE IT THE  
19 SAME OR MORE IN THE COMING YEAR. THIS SLIDE CROSSES AUTO  
20 AVAILABILITY BY INCOME AND TRANSIT MODE. IN EACH CASE RESULTS  
21 ARE FOR PEOPLE INDICATING NO THAT THEY DID NOT HAVE A CAR  
22 AVAILABLE TO REPLACE THEIR TRIP ON TRANSIT. WE RESERVE TO  
23 THESE FOLKS AS THE TRANSIT RELIANT POPULATION. THEY INCLUDE  
24 MANY HIGH INCOME RIDERS. THERE IS A LOT OF AVAILABLE, AUTO  
25 AVAILABILITY VARIATION ACROSS TRANSIT MODES WITH LOCAL BUS



APRIL 28, 2025

1 HAVING HIGHEST RIDE-SHARE RIDERS OUT OF VEHICLE AND FERRY  
2 HAVING THE LOWEST SHARE OF TRANSIT RELIANT POPULATION. WE  
3 ASKED, THERE ARE MANY TYPES OF DISABILITY BUT WE ASKED THE  
4 TRANSPORTATION LIMITING DISABILITY QUESTIONS SPECIFICALLY WE  
5 ASKED DO YOU HAVE DISABILITY THAT LIMITS YOUR ABILITY TO TRAP  
6 8% OF TRANSIT RIDERS INDICATED YES. THERE IS SOME VARIATION  
7 ACROSS MODES AND TIME OF DAY BUS CARRIES LARGER SHARE OF FOLKS  
8 TODAY OF TRANSPORTATION RELATED DISABILITY THAN OTHER MODES  
9 AND DURING THE MIDDAY PERIOD THE SHARE OF DISABLED RIDERS IS  
10 GREATER. WE KNOW THAT SAFETY HAS COME UP AS A BIG TOPIC FOR  
11 TRANSIT. WE ASKED PASSENGERS HOW SAFE THEY FEEL. WE USED A  
12 FIVE POINT SCALE OF FIVE BEING SAFEST. OVERALL OVER HALF OF  
13 PASSENGERS FEEL SAFE OR VERY SAFE ON TRANSIT, AND ONLY ONE IN  
14 TEN FEELS UNSAFE OR VERY SAFE. WE SEE DIFFERENCES REPORTED BY  
15 MODE AS THEY WERE RIDING, THE SURVEY IS BAY AREA WIDE, SAFETY  
16 ON TRANSIT BUT WE SEE DIFFERENCES BASED ON THE MODE REPORTED  
17 WHEN THEY WERE INTERESTED. ALL QUITE CLOSE BETWEEN 3 AND 4 FOR  
18 THE TABLE ON THE RIGHT NOTEWORTHY THESE ARE WEIGHTED AVERAGES  
19 BASED ON RIDERSHIP SO OVERALL SCORE IS HEAVILY WEIGHTED DOWN  
20 BY THE RAIL AND LOCAL BUS RIDERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA. SO, THE  
21 FINAL ITEM WE ASKED PASSENGERS ABOUT DESIRED IMPROVEMENTS  
22 LISTED BY R IN ORDER BY TOP RATED TO LOWEST RATED AMONGST  
23 CHOICES AND THEN SAFETY DONE AND FREQUENCY WAS THE MOST  
24 PRIORITIZED ESPECIALLY AMONG HIGH YOUTH RIDERS. IMPORTANT TO  
25 NORTH BAY TRANSIT AND SFA FERRY RIDERS, AND THEN BART AND MUNI



APRIL 28, 2025

1 RIDERS RATING CLEANER STATIONS AND VEHICLES BEING VERY  
2 IMPORTANT WITH BART AND MUNI RIDERS RANKING THIS EVEN HIGHER.  
3 WORKING ON ADDITIONAL COMPARISONS WITH PRE-PANDEMIC DATA AND  
4 PRODUCING ONLINE INTERACTIVE DASHBOARDS FOR PEOPLE TO DO THEIR  
5 FRAMING FOR SUMMER AND FALL PERIOD 2025 CONTINUING ONGOING  
6 TRANSIT DATA COLLECTION THAT STARTED PRECOVID SCHEDULE FOR  
7 ONGOING SURVEY WORK BY OPERATORS ACCESSIBLE IN THE LINK ON THE  
8 WEB SITE FINALLY SECTIONS WORKING BETTER UNDERSTANDING  
9 CUSTOMER SATISFACTION AND RIDER EXPERIENCE SOME OF WHICH I  
10 THINK MAY BE DISCUSSED IN THE NEXT PRESENTATION. THAT  
11 CONCLUDES THE PRESENTATION

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THE WALK THROUGH OF  
14 THE DATA SET HERE ON THE SURVEY SNAPSHOT SURVEY RESULTS. MADAM  
15 CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER IN THE ROOM OR VIRTUAL ON THE  
16 ITEM?

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE VIRTUAL. ADINA LEVIN. YOU  
19 MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. AND A  
22 COUPLE OF QUICK POINTS. FIRST OF ALL, I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO  
23 THE ADDITIONAL PUBLICATION OF THE DATA AND DEMONSTRATE OF THIS  
24 VERY ROBUST AND USEFUL INFORMATION. AND, SECOND, GLAD TO SEE  
25 THE MENTION OF INCREASED COORDINATION ON SURVEYS. YOU KNOW,



APRIL 28, 2025

1 THIS IS A JOINT INITIATIVE, AND THERE ALSO ARE STILL MANY  
2 AGENCY SPECIFIC SURVEYS. YOU KNOW, MANY OF WHICH HAVE  
3 QUESTIONS IN COMMON WITH EACH OTHER. AND IT SEEMS LIKE THERE  
4 MIGHT BE SOME OPPORTUNITIES TO GAIN LEVERAGE BY STANDARDIZING  
5 AND HAVING MORE COORDINATION AND COLLABORATION AMONGST THE  
6 RANGE OF CUSTOMER SURVEYS THAT ARE DONE BY BAY AREA TRANSIT  
7 AGENCIES. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
10 ONLINE.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. WE WILL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
13 THIS ITEM, MADAM CLERK. COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTS. WE'LL START  
14 LEFT TO RIGHT THIS TIME. DENIS MULLIGAN GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. THE SPEAKER  
17 THAT JUST SPOKE GOLDEN GATE'S SURVEILLANCE LAST TIME, SURVEYED  
18 NON-TRANSIT RIDERS WE LOOKED AT EVERYONE TRAVELLING IN THE  
19 CORRIDOR, NORTH BAY REDWOOD EMPIRE INTO SAN FRANCISCO SO WE  
20 COULD CONTINUE TO CHIP AWAY, AND TRANSIT TRIPS IN THE  
21 CORRIDOR.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT DENIS. JULIE  
24 KIRSCHBAUM SFMTA THEN KATHLEEN.

25



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **JULIE KIRSCHBAUM:** I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT TO THANK SHIMON AND  
2 HIS TEAM PARTICULARLY FOR MAKING THE RAW DATA AVAILABLE BOTH  
3 FOR SFMTA AND OUR COUNTY PARTNERS TO DO MORE DETAILED ANALYSIS  
4 AND ALSO FOR BEING A THOUGHT PARTNER AND FUNDER ON OUR TITLE  
5 SIX SURVEY. WE'RE VERY, VERY GRATEFUL FOR THE MULTI-YEAR  
6 RELATIONSHIP.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS KATHLEEN KELLY. AC TRANSIT.

9

10 **KELLEY JACKSON:** I WANT TO LIKE AT SLIDE 15 IT'S NOT A SURPRISE  
11 THE DESIRED TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS. BECAUSE WE TALK A LOT ABOUT  
12 DIFFERENT FARE PROGRAMS, THINGS TO MAKE IT ACCESSIBLE, LOW-  
13 INCOME, HOW TO MAKE TRANSFERS EASIER, ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF.  
14 AND YET EVERY TIME WE DO A SURVEY LIKE THIS, IT'S FREQUENCY  
15 THAT REALLY GETS PEOPLE TO RIDE. AND THAT'S WHY IT'S SO  
16 CRITICAL THAT WE FIND THE FUNDING IN THE BAY AREA TO BE ABLE  
17 TO KEEP THE TRANSIT OPERATORS GOING TO CONTINUE THAT  
18 FREQUENCY. BECAUSE ONCE WE LOSE THAT, IT DOESN'T MATTER WHAT  
19 WE DO WITH THE OTHER PROGRAMS. THANKS.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** APRIL? APRIL CHAN, SAMTRANS.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE  
24 PRESENTATION. JUST A COUPLE OF QUICK QUESTIONS AND MAYBE ONE



APRIL 28, 2025

1 COMMENT. SO, YOU -- MAYBE YOU SAID IT, BUT I MISSED IT. WAS  
2 THIS SURVEY CONDUCTED BY TELEPHONE OR IN-PERSON?

3

4 **SHIMON ISRAEL:** I WENT THROUGH THIS QUICKLY. BUT IT WAS IN-  
5 PERSON INTERCEPTED BY PAPER THAT WAS DISTRIBUTED OR ALSO QR  
6 CODE WEB OPTION.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** GREAT. SIMILAR TO WHAT JULIE ASKED FOR,  
9 IF EACH ONE OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY WANTED A BREAK DOWN OF  
10 THEIR, YOU KNOW, IN TERMS OF DATA IN THEIR AREA, THAT WOULD BE  
11 GREAT. AND MAYBE THE COMMENT -- AND I'M SURE THAT MAYBE YOU'RE  
12 ALREADY THINKING ABOUT THIS, IS HOW THIS WILL BE USED  
13 ESPECIALLY BY SOME OF THE STAFF WORKING ON, YOU KNOW, HOW WE  
14 CAN -- EITHER IN THE, SORT OF, THE CUSTOMER SERVICE, OR THE  
15 TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY, HOW THIS INFORMATION CAN POTENTIALLY USE  
16 IN THOSE, ADMINISTRATE REGIONAL STAFF WORKING GROUP. SO, THANK  
17 YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. MOVING  
20 DOWN. BILL CHURCHILL COUNTY CONNECTION.

21

22 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ALSO, ONCE  
23 AGAIN, SIMILAR TO MY COLLEAGUES, THANK YOU FOR MAKING IT  
24 AVAILABLE. IT'S ALWAYS USEFUL, ESPECIALLY THE COLLABORATION.  
25 AS WE HAVE BEEN DOING, COLLABORATION NOT JUST IN SURVEYS, BUT



APRIL 28, 2025

1 ALSO IN PRESENTATIONS AND MARKETING, IT HAS BEEN ENORMOUSLY  
2 VALUABLE. I WANT TO THANK KATHLEEN FOR HER COMMENT. FREQUENCY  
3 IS KING. AND WE HAVE BEEN CONDUCTING SURVEYS, AS I HAVE BEEN  
4 AT MY AGENCY NEARLY 30 YEARS, EVERY SINGLE TIME IT COMES UP AS  
5 KING. AND, SO, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT  
6 PUBLICLY, ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE HEADED INTO THIS FISCAL CLIFF.  
7 AND WE NEED TO RECOGNIZE THAT, TO HOLD THE FREQUENCY IS WHAT  
8 REALLY IS THE MOST TRANSFORMATIVE THING THAT COULD HAPPEN  
9 WITHIN OUR REGION. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. OKAY. I JUST WANTED TO ECHO  
12 THE COMMENTS HERE, AN -- DECK, BART AS AN AGENCY IS FAIRLY  
13 WELL PLUGGED IN WITH DATA COLLECTION AT MTC'S GOING SO SHARING  
14 THAT DATA EVEN THE RAW DATA IS HELPFUL. THANK YOU FOR THAT  
15 MADAM CLERK WE'LL CLOSE OUT AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE. MADAM  
16 CLERK WE'RE GOING TO DEFER AGENDA ITEM 3D TO A FUTURE MEETING,  
17 AND BETWEEN YOU AND THE DIRECTOR OF NETWORK MANAGEMENT, I'M  
18 SURE WE COULD FIGURE OUT WHICH BOARD MEETING TO PLACE THAT ON.  
19 AND WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR, WHICH IS  
20 OUR DIRECTORS REPORT. AND DIRECTOR CHOY, YOU HAVE THE FLOOR.

21

22 **MELANIE CHOY:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ONE THING I DID WANT TO  
23 HIGHLIGHT IN TERMS OF THE ITEM 3D, TO RECOGNIZE IS THAT WE  
24 HAVE ENGAGED WITH PERKINS EASTMAN, KPMG TEAM TO CONDUCT THE  
25 TWO-YEAR RNM FRAMEWORK REVIEW. AND YOU AND YOUR STAFF, AS WELL



APRIL 28, 2025

1 AS OTHER RNM STAKEHOLDERS HAVE BEEN INVITED TO COMPLETE AN  
2 ONLINE SURVEY SO THAT SHOULD BE IN YOUR INBOX, OR SOMEONE'S  
3 INBOX AND WE WOULD GREATLY APPRECIATE YOUR PARTICIPATION, YOUR  
4 AGENCY'S PARTICIPATION, YOUR STAFF'S PARTICIPATION. THE AND I  
5 THINK THE SURVEYS ARE DUE AT THE END OF THE WEEK. I WANTED TO  
6 PUT IN A PLUG TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THAT WE HAVE A SURVEY OUT  
7 THERE FOR THE RNM ASSESSMENT. IN TERMS OF MY OTHER UPDATES I  
8 WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THAT UNDER THE LEADERSHIP OF MTC  
9 COMMISSION CHAIR SUE NOACK AND VICE CHAIR STEPHANIE MOULTON-  
10 PETERS, IN MARCH, THE MTC COMMISSION APPOINTED NEW -- THE NEW  
11 RNM COMMITTEE CHAIR, ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE REPRESENTING SAN  
12 FRANCISCO AND VICE CHAIR CANDACE ANDERSEN REPRESENTING CONTRA  
13 COSTA COUNTY. SO IT'S QUITE EXCITING THAT WE'LL BE WORKING  
14 WITH THE TWO OF THEM IN THE UPCOMING WORK LINKED WITH THE WORK  
15 OF THIS BODY. ADDITIONALLY IN YOUR PACKET, WE NORMALLY DON'T  
16 PRESENT ON IT BUT IN YOUR PACKET THIS MONTH WAS A QUARTERLY  
17 PROGRESS REPORT ON THE SUITE OF THE WORKPLAN ITSELF BUT ALSO  
18 THE WORKPLAN IN TERMS OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
19 ELEMENTS. AND WE HAVE BEEN INCLUDING THIS REGULARLY AND WE  
20 DON'T REPORT ON THE SPECIFIC ITEMS, BUT AS ADINA CALLED OUT  
21 EARLIER IN THE COMMENT, IN HER COMMENTS, THERE IS A LOT OF  
22 WORK THAT'S BEING DONE. AND, SO, I WANTED TO RECOGNIZE THAT  
23 THESE LITTLE PIECES AROUND THE PROGRESS THAT WE ARE MAKING, WE  
24 ARE MAKING PROGRESS, AND WE ARE WORKING TOWARDS ADVANCING A  
25 LOT OF THESE ACTIONS. AND MAYBE THE LAST THING I WILL



APRIL 28, 2025

1 HIGHLIGHT IS WHILE THE RNM IS FOCUSED ON THE CUSTOMER-FACING  
2 PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS THAT ARE IN THE ACTION PLAN ITSELF, OR  
3 THAT ARE BEING PRESENTED TO YOU AS PART OF THE WORKPLAN THAT  
4 WE HAVE AGREED UPON, WE ARE NOT WORKING IN A VACUUM, AND WHILE  
5 EACH OF YOU IMPORTANTLY MANAGE YOUR OWN SYSTEMS, OUR WORK  
6 COLLECTIVELY, HERE AT -- IN THE RNM LOOKS AT HOW THE ENTIRE  
7 SYSTEM IS WORKING TOGETHER. AND, SO, WHAT WE'RE DOING IS WE'RE  
8 DOING OUR BEST TO TRACK THE LINKAGES OF THE THINGS THAT WE'RE  
9 WORKING ON WITH A LOT OF OTHER EFFORTS THAT ARE EITHER BEING  
10 LED BY YOUR AGENCIES, THE STATE, SUCH AS THE STATE TRANSIT  
11 TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE, BUT OTHER REGIONAL EFFORTS SUCH AS  
12 THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AND FIGURING OUT WHERE  
13 THERE ARE SYNERGIES BETWEEN OUR WORK AND THOSE EFFORTS AND  
14 THAT IS ONE REASON WHY THE PRESENTATION FROM THE REGION -- THE  
15 PLANNING -- THE MTC'S REGIONAL PLANNING AND POLICY SECTION,  
16 WHY WE BROUGHT THAT HERE IN TERMS OF REALLY TRYING TO SOLIDIFY  
17 AND FULLY DRAW AND CONNECT THE DOTS BETWEEN ALL THE WORK  
18 THAT'S BEING DONE IN THE REGION. AND SO I JUST WANTED TO  
19 HIGHLIGHT THAT WE'RE CONSTANTLY THINKING THROUGH HOW TO MAKE  
20 LINKAGES OF OUR WORK WITH THE WORK THAT EVERYONE ELSE IS DOING  
21 IN THE REGION. AND MAYBE LASTLY, I WILL HIGHLIGHT THAT I  
22 RECENTLY TOOK A PERMANENT VACATION TO NEW YORK, AND I FOUND IT  
23 QUITE INSPIRATIONAL IN TERMS OF EAST COAST IN OUR OWN BACKYARD  
24 WITH OUR OWN PARTNERS AND WITH THEY HAVE FIGURED OUT HOW TO DO  
25 IT FOR THEMSELVES AND NOT THAT WE NEED TO COPY AND DO WHAT NEW



APRIL 28, 2025

1 YORK IS DOING, BUT I THINK FOR ME, THE THREAD THERE WAS THAT  
2 THEY HAVE A UNIQUE CULTURE AND UNIQUE WAY OF HOW TRANSIT  
3 INTERACTS FOR NEW YORK, AND WE ARE VERY MUCH DOING THE SAME  
4 THING FOR OUR OWN UNIQUE CULTURE AND LANDSCAPE HERE IN SAN  
5 FRANCISCO. SO WHAT WORKS FOR THEM MAY NOT WORK HERE BUT THERE  
6 ARE A LOT OF SYNERGIES AND IT'S QUITE INSPIRATIONAL, BECAUSE  
7 ON THE STREETS YOU SEE WALKING, BIKING, VEHICLES, SCOOTER,  
8 VEHICLES ALL COEXISTING NOT WITHOUT CONFLICT INTO THEY HAVE  
9 FIGURED OUT HOW TO DO THAT AS WELL, AND WE'RE WORKING ON THAT  
10 TOGETHER HERE. THE OTHER THING I DID WAS GO TO THE TRANSIT  
11 MUSEUM AND THE TRANSIT MUSEUM HAD A LOT OF EXTENSIVE  
12 INFORMATION. BUT WITH WHAT WAS MORE EYE-OPENING WAS THE AMOUNT  
13 OF SCHOOL CHILDREN VISITING THE MUSEUM. AND THE KEY THING IF  
14 THAT, FOR ME, IS THOSE ARE POTENTIALLY OUR FUTURE LEADERS IN  
15 THE INDUSTRY, AND, SO THEY'RE DEVELOPING BOTH THE ON STREETS  
16 ACTIVE WORK, BUT ALSO FOSTERING THE FUTURE GENERATIONS. I JUST  
17 WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THOSE TWO INSPIRATIONAL THINGS ON MY  
18 PERSONAL TRIP.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU, DIRECTOR CHOY. MADAM CLERK,  
21 COMMENTS ON DIRECTOR CHOY'S REPORT?

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES, WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER. ADINA LEVIN,  
24 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

25



APRIL 28, 2025

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
2 CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP AND, ALSO, REPRESENTING SEAMLESS BAY  
3 AREA, AND WANTED TO ELEVATE WHAT DIRECTOR CHOY HAD SAID ABOUT  
4 THE IMPORTANCE OF COMMUNICATION. WITH THE WORKPLAN PROGRESS.  
5 AND THEN THE GOALS AND METRICS THAT ARE BEING DEVELOPED,  
6 HAVING THAT PROGRESS COMMUNICATED CLEARLY INCLUDING WITH  
7 RESPECT TO GOALS AND WITH RESPECT TO OUTCOMES FOR RIDERS AND  
8 THE GENERAL PUBLIC IS ABSOLUTELY OF CRITICAL IMPORTANCE FOR  
9 THE SUPPORT OF POLICY MAKERS WHO NEED TO BE COMING TOGETHER IN  
10 THE COMING MONTHS TO AGREE ON CONTINUING TO PROVIDE FUNDING TO  
11 MOVE FORWARD WITH THESE VERY BENEFICIAL ACTIONS TO INCREASE  
12 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF PUBLIC  
13 TRANSPORTATION. AND THEN, AS WELL, TO BE ABLE TO COMMUNICATE  
14 TO THE PUBLIC ABOUT WHAT'S BEING ACHIEVED, ABOUT HOW THE  
15 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IS NOT JUST CONTENT WITH THE  
16 STATUTES QUO, BUT HOW THINGS ARE IMPROVING AND DOING A BETTER  
17 JOB OF PROVIDING CONVENIENT SERVICE TO RIDERS. SO, ELEVATING  
18 AND YOU KNOW, CONTINUING TO WORK ON DOING AND IMPROVING THAT  
19 COMMUNICATION IS ESSENTIAL. AND, LASTLY, I'LL DO A LITTLE  
20 PERSONAL ANECDOTE, ON EAST COAST, WHICH IS I LIVED IN THE  
21 BOSTON AREA FOR QUITE A WHILE AND YOU KNOW USING TRANSIT IS  
22 NOT JUST INHERENTLY CULTURAL IT'S HAVING IT AVAILABLE SO IT'S  
23 NOT A CAR NOT ONLY THE RIGHT TOOL FOR THE JOB.  
24  
25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS ONLINE.



APRIL 28, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS ON THE DIRECTOR'S  
3 REPORT. NOT SEEING ANY. MADAM CLERK WE'LL CLOSE OUT AGENDA  
4 ITEM NUMBER FOUR. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
5 ANY MATERIAL THAT'S NOT ON THE AGENDA AND IF WE RECEIVED ANY  
6 OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WASN'T IN MAIL OUT. SO MADAM CLERK.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ALETA DUPREE, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO  
9 SPEAK.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE  
12 FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. WISH I COULD BE  
13 THERE WITH YOU TODAY ESPECIALLY IN THE BART ROOM WHICH I ENJOY  
14 VERY MUCH. NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS COMPLICATED. THAT'S WHY WE DO  
15 THINGS THAT WE DO. JOHN FORD KENNEDY SAID WE DO THINGS NOT  
16 BECAUSE THEY'RE EASY BUT BECAUSE THEY'RE HARD. I'M OFTEN  
17 FINDING MYSELF DOING THE SAME THING. THESE PROGRAM THAT WE  
18 TALKED ABOUT TODAY, WHILE NOT DIRECTLY AFFECTING, CAN AFTER  
19 POSSIBILITIES FOR PROGRAMS THAT WILL AFFECT AND BENEFIT ME.  
20 AND I AM LOOKING FORWARD TO THE CONTINUATION. WAYFINDING WORK.  
21 I'M SURE WE'LL GET BACK TO THAT. AND AS I TALK ABOUT A LOT AND  
22 SHOW PEOPLE PICTURES OF THE SIGNAGE IN THE GRAND CENTRAL  
23 SUBWAY STATION IN NEW YORK CITY. AND I DO TALK ABOUT THE  
24 DISCOUNTS A LOT. AS I HAVE MENTIONED EARLIER, ABOUT PROMOTING  
25 THE RTC DISCOUNT, AND I HAVE NOTICED MORE AND MORE ON THE BART



APRIL 28, 2025

1 TRAIN, THAT THERE ARE SIGNS MENTIONING THE 62 AND A HALF%  
2 DISCOUNT ON BART. FOR SENIOR AND DISABLED. HOW CAN WE ALL  
3 ENSURE, AS WE GO OUR NETWORK, THAT WE WILL KEEP THOSE  
4 DISCOUNTS IN PLACE. ESPECIALLY IN THE FINANCIAL CHALLENGES.  
5 AND I ADVOCATE FOR THOSE. I ASK FOR YOU TO TAKE THAT BACK TO  
6 YOUR BOARDS, TO ENSURE THAT WE CONTINUE TO BRING PEOPLE INTO  
7 THE NETWORK. THANK YOU

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
10 ONLINE. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ROOM AND NOTHING WAS RECEIVED  
11 IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY THANK YOU. WE'LL CLOSE AGENDA ITEM  
14 NUMBER FIVE. BRING US TO THE LAST AGENDA ITEM OF THE AFTERNOON  
15 AND FOR THIS MEETING, AND THIS IS ADJOURNMENT AND THE NEXT  
16 MEETING. SO, WE ARE ALL SET FOR THE NEXT MEETING OF THE  
17 NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL. IT WILL BE MONDAY, MAY 19TH, 2025.  
18 AND WE WILL BE AT MTC'S HEADQUARTERS. SO, WITH THAT, THIS  
19 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

20



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*