



Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street
San Francisco, CA 94105

Meeting Minutes

Metropolitan Transportation Commission

Scott Haggerty, Chair Alfredo Pedroza, Vice Chair

Wednesday, December 16, 2020

9:45 AM

Board Room - 1st Floor (REMOTE)

Call Remote Meeting to Order

1. Roll Call / Confirm Quorum

- Present:** 15 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering, and Commissioner Worth
- Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Schaaf, and Commissioner Slocum

Non-Voting Commissioners Present: Commissioner Giacomini and Commissioner Stracner
Non-Voting Commissioner Absent: Commissioner El-Tawansy

2. Chair's Report (Haggerty)

2a. [21-0018](#) Committee Assignments for New Commissioners

Action: Commission Approval

Upon the motion by Commissioner Liccardo and the second by Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, the Commission unanimously approved the new Committee assignments. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye:** 15 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth
- Absent:** 3 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

2b. [21-0019](#) Appointment of an Ad-hoc Nominating Committee

Action: Commission Approval

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci and the second by Commissioner Mackenzie, the Commission unanimously appointed Commissioner Spering, Commissioner Worth, and Commissioner Papan with Commissioner Spering to serve as Chair. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 15 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

2c. [21-0017](#) Report from Executive Committee Meeting: Request for Approval of Executive Director's salary increase.

Action: Commission Approval

The following members of the public were called to speak: Blaire Beekman and Roland Lebrun.

Upon the motion by Commission Vice Chair Pedroza and the second by Commissioner Worth, the Commission unanimously approved the Executive Committee's recommendation for the Executive Director's salary increase of 1.1% in accordance with the current CPI. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 15 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

2d. [21-0004](#) MTC Resolution No. 4445 - Resolution of Appreciation for Adrienne Weil on the occasion of her retirement from MTC.

Action: Commission Approval

David Pilpel was called to speak.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Spering and the second by Commissioner Mackenzie, the Commission unanimously adopted MTC Resolution No. 4445. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 15 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 3 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

3. Policy Advisory Council Report (Randi Kinman)

Randi Kinman gave her report.

Blaire Beekman was called to speak.

4. Executive Director’s Report (McMillan)

Therese McMillan gave her report.

Roland Lebrun was called to speak.

[21-0117](#) Executive Director’s Report

5. Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Josefowitz left during agenda item 5.

6. Consent Calendar:

Blaire Beekman was called to speak.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Glover and the second by Commissioner Papan, the Consent Calendar was unanimously approved by the following vote:

Aye: 14 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 4 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

6a. [20-1691](#) Minutes of the November 20, 2020 meeting

Action: Commission Approval

6b. [20-1692](#) Monthly Report of Transit Operator Statistics

Action: Information

Administration Committee

6c. [20-1470](#) MTC Resolution No. 4173, Revised - Reauthorization of MTC Investment Policy

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Brian Mayhew

- 6d. [20-1450](#) MTC Resolution No. 4265, Revised - MTC Debt Policy Issuance and Management
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Brian Mayhew
- 6e. [20-1239](#) MTC Resolution No. 4436 - Establishment of an Internal Revenue Code (IRC) Section 115 Post-Employment Benefits Trust with Public Agency Retirement Services (PARS); and Authorization of Related Contract(s) with PARS
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Brian Mayhew

Programming and Allocations Committee

- 6f. [20-1606](#) MTC Resolution, 4108, Revised. Revisions to the Transportation Development Act (TDA) Article 3 Policies and Procedures to add quick builds and separated bikeways as eligible projects and make other minor changes.
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Cheryl Chi
- 6g. [20-0750](#) MTC Resolution No. 4375, Revised. 2019 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Amendment 2019-47.
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Adam Crenshaw
- 6h. [20-1481](#) MTC Resolution Nos. Revised, 4430, Revised and 4431, Revised. Allocation of \$5.7 million in FY2020-21 Transportation Development Act (TDA) and State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to Santa Rosa to support transit operations.
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Cheryl Chi
- 6i. [20-1607](#) MTC Resolution, 4440. Allocation of \$43 million of State Transit Assistance-State of Good Repair (STA-SGR) funds to MTC and operators for projects approved by the State Department of Transportation (Caltrans).
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Cheryl Chi

- 6j. [20-1629](#) MTC Resolution No. 4272, Revised. FY2016-17 through FY2019-20 Transit Capital Priorities program revisions.
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Craig Bosman
- 6k. [20-1633](#) MTC Resolution No. 4273, Revised. Transit Performance Initiative - Investment Program: Semi-Annual Report, Scope Modifications for SFMTA Round 1 Award, and Reprogramming of VTA FY2018 Award.
Action: Commission Approval
Presenter: Anne Spevack
- 6l. [20-1688](#) MTC Resolution No. 4412, Revised. Regional Measure 3 (RM3) Letter of No Prejudice. Recommendation of RM3 Letter of No Prejudice to the Transportation Authority of Marin for the US-101 Marin-Sonoma Narrows project.
Action: Kenneth Kao
Presenter: Commission Approval

Joint MTC ABAG Legislation Committee

- 6m. [21-0020](#) MTC Resolution No. 3931, Revised - Policy Advisory Council Term Extension
Action: MTC Commission Approval
Presenter: Marti Paschal

Committee Reports

7. Programming and Allocations Committee (Chair Josefowitz)

- 7a. [20-1630](#) MTC Resolution No. 3738, Revised. Revisions to Attachment B of the BART Car Replacement Funding Exchange and Reserve Account, authorizing a disbursement of up to \$161 million and revising a condition on the previous authorization.

A request for authorization to disburse up to \$161 million from the Exchange Account to BART for their railcar procurement project, consistent with the policies of the BART Car Replacement Funding Exchange and Reserve Account agreement and MTC Resolution No. 4302, Exchange Account Supplemental, which committed up to \$179 million for railcar procurements associated with BART's Transbay Corridor Core Capacity Program, and to revise the condition related to FTA financing on the previous authorization of withdrawal of up to \$220 million for replacement cars.

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Craig Bosman

Commissioner Ahn left before the motion for agenda item 7.

The motion and second for agenda items 7a, 7b, 7c, and 7d were made as a single item with Commissioner Papan abstaining for agenda item 7a.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci and the second by Commissioner Liccardo, the Commission adopted MTC Resolution No. 3738, Revised. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye:** 12 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth
- Absent:** 5 - Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum
- Abstain:** 1 - Commissioner Papan

7b. [20-1634](#) MTC Resolution No. 3801, Revised. Regional Measure 2 Program Amendments

A summary of public comments received and recommendation to reassign a total of approximately \$663,000 in RM2 funds:

- Modify scope of Transit Commuter Benefits Promotion project (RM2 project #35) to include transit recovery strategies identified by the Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force;
- Modify scope of Regional Express Lanes Network (RM2 project #38) to include operational improvements;
- Redirect \$225,000 in unused funds from Dumbarton Rail (RM2 project #4) to Dumbarton Forward suite of bus projects (under RM2 project #29); and
- Redirect \$438,000 in savings from Regional Rail Master Plan to RM2 project #35 for transit recovery strategies identified by the Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force.

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Anne Spevack

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci and the second by Commissioner Liccardo, the Commission unanimously adopted MTC Resolution No. 3801, Revised. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 14 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 4 - Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

7c. [20-1609](#) MTC Resolution No. 4095, Revised.

Rescission of \$4.8 million in Regional Measure 2 (RM2) funds from the I-80 Express Lanes project, and allocation of \$4.8 million in RM2 funds for the environmental and preliminary engineering phase of various Bay Bridge Forward 2020 projects.

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Kenneth Kao

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci and the second by Commissioner Liccardo, the Commission unanimously adopted MTC Resolution No. 4095, Revised. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 13 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 5 - Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

7d. [20-1643](#) Proposed Principles for Redirecting Funding to Transit Operations for COVID-19 Emergency Response and Upcoming Opportunity Concepts for Discussion

As Bay Area public transit operators continue to face financial uncertainty brought on by the COVID-19 pandemic, MTC staff propose several principles to apply when considering shifting funds normally assigned to other transportation expenditures, to transit operations. Additionally, staff will provide information on a near-term opportunity that the Committee and Commission will have to shift funds normally directed towards transit capital state-of-good-repair expenditure, to transit operations.

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Theresa Romell

Written public comment was received from Roland Lebrun.

The following members of the public were called to speak: Roland Lebrun, Maddy Grace Webbon, Blaire Beekman, Kevin Ma, Richard Marcantonio of Public Advocates, Emily Wheeler of Public Advocates, John Courtney of ATU Local 365, Carol Taylor, David Pilpel, Shane Weinstein of ATU, Robert Estrada, Ken Bukowski, Bonnie Lockhart, and Roger Marengo.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci and the second by Commissioner Liccardo, the Commission unanimously adopted the Proposed Principles for Redirecting Funding to Transit Operations for COVID-19 Emergency Response. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 13 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 5 - Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

8. Operations Committee (Vice Chair Connolly)

- 8a. [20-1695](#) Next Generation Clipper® (C2) System Integrator Contract Change Order - Next Generation Clipper System Integration with Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) and San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) with Exercise of Open Payments Option: Cubic Transportation Systems, Inc. (Cubic) (\$13,600,000)

Request for approval of a Change Order to (1) implement the Tri Reader 4 (TR4), Cubic's next-generation Clipper card reader, on BART and SFMTA equipment and (2) exercise the Open Payments Option to implement system-wide open payments.

Action: Commission Approval

Presenter: Jason Weinstein

Aleta Dupree was called to speak.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Connolly and the second by Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, the Commission unanimously approved the Contract Change Order with Cubic. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 13 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 5 - Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

9. Joint MTC ABAG Legislation Committee (Vice Chair Mackenzie)

- 9a. [20-1701](#) Proposed Final 2021 Joint Advocacy Program

Proposed Final 2021 Joint Advocacy Program for MTC and ABAG, expressing the agencies' state and federal legislative priorities.

Action: ABAG Executive Board Approval
MTC Commission Approval

Presenter: Rebecca Long

Blaire Beekman was called to speak.

Upon the motion by Commissioner Mackenzie and the second by Commissioner Rabbitt, the Commission unanimously adopted the Proposed Final 2021 Joint Advocacy Program. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 13 - Commission Chair Haggerty, Commission Vice Chair Pedroza, Commissioner Abe Koga, Commissioner Connolly, Commissioner Dutra-Vernaci, Commissioner Glover, Commissioner Liccardo, Commissioner Mackenzie, Commissioner Papan, Commissioner Ronen, Commissioner Rabbitt, Commissioner Spering and Commissioner Worth

Absent: 5 - Commissioner Ahn, Commissioner Chavez, Commissioner Josefowitz, Commissioner Schaaf and Commissioner Slocum

10. Public Comment / Other Business

Written public comments were received from Rodney Fong of SF Chamber of Commerce, and Patrick Traughber.

The following members of the public were called to speak: Blaire Beekman, Roland Lebrun, and Ken Bukowski.

10. [21-0111](#) Written Public Comment Received

11. Adjournment / Next Meetings:

The next meeting of the Metropolitan Transportation Commission is scheduled to be held on Wednesday, January 27, 2021 at the Bay Area Metro Center, 375 Beale Street, San Francisco, CA 94105 (remotely and by webcast as appropriate depending on the status of any shelter in place orders).