



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



JUNE 26, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD

MONDAY, JUNE 26TH, 2023, 1:30 PM

ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR: AGENDA ITEM ONE, CALL TO ORDER THE ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM THE QUORUM. SO, MADAM CLERK, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YOU CAN CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER.

ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR: MEETING IS CALLED TO ORDER, MA'AM.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND THEY WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IF ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON ANY ITEM, FILL OUT A BLUE SPEAKER CARD AND HAND IT TO THE CLERK. THANK YOU. ROLL CALL. CHAIR POWERS?

ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR CHAN?



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RUBY HUERTA FOR CHURCHILL?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CUMMINS?

9

10 **EDDY CUMINS:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR CHURCHILL?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT?

17

18 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

21

22 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT MADAM CLERK. THAT US
6 TO AGENDA ITEM TWO, THE CONSENT CALENDAR, ACTION ITEM. IS
7 THERE A MOTION AND SECOND FOR THE ACTION ITEM OF THE CONSENT
8 CALENDAR?

9

10 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** MOVE APPROVAL, HURSH.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** SECOND BY CHAN.

13

14 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** MOTION BY HURSH AND SECOND BY CHAN.
15 MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER VIRTUAL OR IN THE ROOM?

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NO ONE WITH HANDS RAISED, AND
18 NO ONE IN THE ROOM WITH A SPEAKER CARD.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. MADAM CLERK, PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL
21 CALL, PLEASE?

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHAIR POWERS?

24

25 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** YES.



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RUBY HUERTA FOR MEMBER CHURCHILL?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CUMMINS?

11

12 **EDDY CUMINS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT?

15

16 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

19

20 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

23

24 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** AYE.

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR TUMLIN?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES AYE ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK THAT BRINGS US TO
8 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE. THIS, COMMISSIONERS, IS AN ACTION
9 ITEM, AS WELL. AND IT'S AN AMENDMENT FOR OUTREACH FOR FISCAL
10 YEAR 2023, 2024. THIS IS FOR THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. WE
11 HAVE TALKED ABOUT THAT SEVERAL TIMES UP AT THIS BOARD, AND
12 THIS IS AN AMENDMENT TO THE TUNE OF 200,000 TO DO THE OUTREACH
13 ASSOCIATED WITH CLIPPER START. SO, WITH THAT, I WILL TURN THIS
14 OVER TO MISS HALE FROM THE CLIPPER TWO EXECUTIVE TEAM. MISS
15 HALE?

16

17 **LYSA HALE:** THANK YOU CHAIRMAN POWERS. I'M HERE TO TALK TO YOU
18 ABOUT THE AMENDMENT FOR OUTREACH TO CLIPPER START GENERALLY
19 THERE ARE TWO FACETS OF MARKETING ADVERTISING OUTREACH THIS
20 BOARD APPROVED THE ADVERTISING PORTION OF THE NEXT CLIPPER
21 START MARKETING PROGRAM AMENDMENT FOR OUTREACH PORTION OF THIS
22 CONTRACT AMENDMENT WILL COVER IN-PERSON OUTREACH EVENTS AS
23 WELL AS PARTNERSHIPS WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS WITH
24 SPECIFIC GOAL OF INCREASING PARTICIPATION IN THE PROGRAM.
25 STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS THAT THE BOARD APPROVE A CONTRACT



JUNE 26, 2023

1 AMENDMENT WITH CARIBOU PUBLIC RELATION IF AN AMOUNT NOT TO
2 EXCEED \$200,000.

3

4 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION
5 MISS HALE. AGAIN, THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. SO WE'LL NEED A
6 MOTION AND A SECOND FOR THIS ITEM.

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** MULLIGAN. I'LL MOVE IT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** BEE HAVE A MOTION FROM MULLIGAN, MADAM
13 CLERK, AND A SECOND FROM CUMMINS. THANK YOU FOR THAT. MADAM
14 CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT VIRTUALLY OR IN THE ROOM?

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS ONE PERSON WITH THE HAND
17 RAISED, ALETA DUPREE, AND A SECOND ONE, ADINA LEVIN. I AM
18 GOING TO PUT THE TIMER UP. ALETA DUPREE?

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES MADAM CLERK.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YEAH.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND
25 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. THIS IS



JUNE 26, 2023

1 VERY IMPORTANT. WE'RE SEEING A LOT OF WORK CAN CLIPPER START,
2 AND THERE WAS AN A RESOLUTION PASSED AT THE MOST RECENT BART
3 BOARD MEETING, IF I'M CORRECT, THAT DECREASED CLIPPER START TO
4 50% OUTREACH IS ESSENTIAL BECAUSE I HAVE SEEN MANY PROGRAMS
5 THAT ARE UNDER SUBSCRIBED AND IT'S BECAUSE PEOPLE DIDN'T KNOW
6 ABOUT THEM. I WOULD SAY AS PART OF THIS OUTREACH, WE DON'T
7 WANT TO RISK CANNIBALIZING OTHER DISOBEDIENT PROGRAMS. SO, I'M
8 ALL IN FAVOR OF CLIPPER START, AND I WANT US TO GET AS MANY
9 PEOPLE AS POSSIBLE INTO CLIPPER START TO QUALIFY. BUT THERE
10 MAY BE SOME WHO ARE ON CLIPPER START, OR WHO COULD QUALIFY FOR
11 CLIPPER START, WHO COULD ALSO QUALIFY FOR SOME OF THE RTC
12 DISCOUNT PROGRAMS. AS CLIPPER START WILL GET YOU 50% ON BART.
13 YES, IT RHYMES. BUT RTC WILL GET YOU 62 AND A HALF PERCENT ON
14 BART SO HOW CAN WE MAKE SURE THAT OUR OUTREACH FOR CLIPPER
15 PROGRAM AT-LARGE CAN REACH AS MANY COMMUNITIES AS POSSIBLE
16 BECAUSE WE WANT TO GET AS MANY PEOPLE AS WE CAN ON TO THE
17 BUSES AND TRAINS AND YES WE'RE SEEING SOMETHING SIMILAR IN NEW
18 YORK CALLED FARE FAIRS. WHICH RHYMES. AND WE WANT TO GET THE
19 WORD OUT TO CLIPPER START, AND I THINK THIS FIRM IS GOING TO
20 DO A GOOD JOB WITH THAT, BUT AS WE GO THROUGH THE PROCESS OF
21 EVALUATING THESE CLIPPER START APPLICATIONS, WE HAVE TO MAKE
22 SURE THIS OUTREACH WILL ALSO YIELD THOSE WHO WOULD QUALIFY FOR
23 OTHER DISCOUNTS. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ADINA LEVIN.



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY
3 COUNCIL, AND CHAIR THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE
4 THAT HEARD THE INFORMATION ABOUT THE CURRENT STEP AND EFFORTS
5 TO EXPAND THE ADOPTION OF CLIPPER START. THE SENSE OF THE
6 COMMITTEE IS THAT THIS IS A REALLY GOOD PROGRAM BUT THE
7 ADOPTION HAS BEEN REALLY A TINY FRACTION OF THE ELIGIBLE
8 POTENTIAL ELIGIBLE SO GETTING THE WORD OUT IS IMPORTANT AND
9 ALSO THE OTHER STEPS BEING TAKEN INCLUDING MAKING IT EASIER TO
10 QUALIFY, TAKING A NO WRONG DOOR APPROACH THAT THE PREVIOUS
11 SPEAKER MENTIONED WHERE IF YOU QUALIFY FOR ANYTHING RELEVANT
12 IT MAKES IT EASY TO GO AHEAD WITH WHATEVER DISCOUNTS THAT YOU
13 MAY BE ENTITLED TO, DUE TO INCOME ABILITY AND SO ON. SO,
14 THANKS VERY MUCH FOR TAKING STEPS TO INCREASE ADOPTION OF THIS
15 NEW PROGRAM.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE SPEAKERS
18 ONLINE.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
21 COMMISSIONERS, WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. IS THERE
22 DISCUSSION, COMMENTS, ADVICE, FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS? MISS
23 GONOT?

24



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A QUICK QUESTION. VTA IS
2 JOINING CLIPPER SMART INTO THIS PROGRAM, SO, IS THERE A -- I
3 THINK WE'RE -- AS FAR AS I KNOW WE HAVE SAID YES THAT WE'RE
4 GOING TO BE JOINING IT -- IS THERE SOME EFFORTS IN THIS
5 CONTRACT THAT DEFINE MARKETING IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY? OR ARE
6 THOSE EFFORTS THAT WOULD HAPPEN, AND ALSO HOW DO THEY
7 COORDINATE -- I JUST DON'T HAVE THE CONTRACT -- HOW THEY
8 COORDINATE WITH EXISTING MARKETING PROGRAMS?

9

10 **LYSA HALE:** YES. ACTUALLY WE WORKED WITH ALL OF THE TRANSIT
11 AGENCIES IN THE REGION WHO ARE PARTICIPATING AND THEY HAVE ALL
12 BEEN VERY SUPPORT OF THE PROGRAM PROVIDING SPACE ON THEIR
13 VEHICLES, SPACE IN STATIONS, WHAT YOU HAVE SO WE'RE LOOKING
14 FORWARD TO HAVING THEM TO CONTINUE SUPPORTING US IN THAT WAY.
15 BUT WE ALSO REACH OUT, CALTRAIN IS A REALLY GOOD EXAMPLE. WE
16 HAVE DONE A LOT OF COLLABORATIVE MARKETING WITH THEM, WHERE
17 THEY HAVE DONE THEIR OWN. THEY HAVE PURCHASED THEIR OWN
18 ADVERTISING TO COMPLEMENT WHAT WE'RE DOING WITH OUR
19 ADVERTISING. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE TRANSIT OPERATORS DO
20 THAT IN THE FUTURE. WE ACTUALLY JUST FINISHED DOING A CAMPAIGN
21 WITH VTA TO PROMOTE OUR MOBILE PROGRAM, AND I WORKED VERY
22 CLOSELY WITH VTA STAFF ON THAT. SO HOPE TO DO THAT WITH THIS
23 PROGRAM, AS WELL.

24



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THANKS. BECAUSE WE HAVE IT'S OF TABLING AS
2 WELL AND WORK WITH CBOS SO ANY COORDINATING THAT WOULD BE
3 GREAT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU CAROLYN. ANY OTHER
6 COMMENTS? RUBY?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** IF WE WANT TO ADD TO THE LIST OF 200 CBOS AS WE
9 EXPANDS PARTNERSHIPS IN COMMUNITIES WHO WOULD BE THE
10 APPROPRIATE PERSON? IS IT CARIBOU? OR CLIPPER STAFF?

11

12 **LYSA HALE:** THAT WOULD BE ME.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. OTHER COMMENTS? ADVICE, FROM
17 COMMITTEE MEMBERS? NOT SEEING ANY. MADAM CLERK I'M GOING TO
18 TURN THIS BACK OVER TO YOU FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. POWERS?

21

22 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RUBY FOR CHURCHILL?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CUMMINS?

8

9 **EDDY CUMINS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BOCKELMAN FOR PREMIER?

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT?

16

17 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

20

21 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** DIANA FOR TUMLIN?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** YES.



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
3 PRESENT.

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. I THINK THAT
6 MOVES US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR WHICH COMES TO US IN TWO
7 PARTS, 4A AND 4B, THESE ARE BOTH INFORMATIONAL ITEMS. THE
8 FIRST IS CLIPPER TWO. AND IT'S AN UPDATE ON SCHEDULE
9 IMPLEMENTATION AND WHERE WE ARE WITH DEPLOYMENT. SO, JASON,
10 I'M GOING TURN THIS OVER TO YOU. AGAIN, COMMISSIONERS THIS IS
11 AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM FOR THE BOARD.

12

13 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. JASON WEINSTEIN,
14 CLIPPER STAFF. COULD WE BRING UP THE SLIDES, BROADCASTING
15 TEAM? THANK YOU. AS WE REQUESTED AT THE MAY BOARD MEETING WE
16 HAVE MORE DETAILED VERSION OF THE SCHEDULE THAT WAS CURRENTLY
17 EXCUSE ME -- AT THE TOP OF ATTACHMENT A TO YOUR ITEM. BUT
18 BEFORE I GET THERE, I WANT TO REMIND THE BOARD OF ALL MOVING
19 PARTS THAT WE'RE MANAGING AND AS YOU CAN SEE ALL CONTRACTS
20 HERE, WE'RE TRYING TO BRING TOGETHER ALL THESE DIFFERENT
21 MOVING PARTS TO LAND ON A DIME WITH EVERY READY FOR THE START
22 OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION. THIS GOES BEYOND MANAGING CLIPPER OUR
23 SYSTEM INTEGRATOR. WE'RE ALSO -- EXCUSE ME -- CUBIC -- THANK
24 YOU. WE'RE ALSO MANAGING FARE MEDIA SUPPLIER, PAYMENT
25 PROCESSOR AND CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. EQUIPMENT BEING



JUNE 26, 2023

1 INSTALLED AT ALL THE OPERATORS AND OF COURSE WE NEED TO
2 PROPERLY REACH OUT TO THE RIDING PUBLIC. SO, ALL OF THESE
3 PIECES NEED TO COME TOGETHER FOR OUR PLANNED SUMMER 2024 START
4 OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION. AND THIS GRAPHIC IS THE SCHEDULE THAT
5 IS SHOWN AT THE TOP OF ATTACHMENT A, JUST MADE LARGER FOR THIS
6 PRESENTATION. NOW, I'M GOING TO PROVIDE SOME MORE DETAILS AND
7 I'M GOING TO START WITH THIS SLIDE GOING INTO MORE DETAIL
8 ABOUT THE TOP LINE, WHICH IS THE EQUIPMENT INSTALLATION YOU
9 CAN SEE CIRCLED IN RED. WE HAVE WRAPPED UP INSTALLATION OF
10 PLATFORM EQUIPMENT AT FERRY TERMS CALTRAIN SMART, AC TRANSIT,
11 BART, AND OTHER LOCATIONS, WE'RE MORE THAN HALFWAY THROUGH THE
12 REGION VEHICLE INSTALLATIONS AND HAVE COMPLETED INSTALLATION
13 AT MULTIPLE OPERATORS AND WE'RE ENGINEER COMPLETION OF SWAP
14 OUT OF EQUIPMENT AT RETAIN TAILERS. YOU SEE AT THE BOTTOM OF
15 THE CHART BEHIND THE SCENES ITEM, WHICH IS GETTING ALL DEVICES
16 CERTIFIED BY THE PAYMENT SYSTEM TO ACCEPT DEBIT AND CREDIT
17 CARD, COORDINATING WITH OUR SOFTWARE TESTING WHICH YOU CAN SEE
18 ON THE SLIDE ON THE BOTTOM LINE AND THE SECOND LINE NOW
19 CIRCLED IN RED FOCUSED ON THE SOFTWARE TESTING PILOTS ENSURING
20 THAT THE ENTIRE PILOT SYSTEM IS WORKING TOGETHER PRIOR TO
21 ROLLING OUT TO THE PUBLIC. THE LIGHT BLUE LINES ARE THE BEHIND
22 THE SCENES ACTIVITIES HERE, EXCEPT TO OPERATOR STAFF,
23 OBVIOUSLY, THEY'RE INVOLVED. AND THE DARK BLUE LINE REPRESENT
24 SOFTWARE RELEASES THE PUBLIC WILL START TO SEE. WE'RE NEARING
25 OUR FIRST PHASE OF SYSTEM INTEGRATION TESTING AND WILL SOON



JUNE 26, 2023

1 START SECOND PHASE TESTING WE'RE ALSO INTO THE FARE GATE
2 VENDOR TESTING AND HOPING TO GET THE PILOT OUT BY THE END OF
3 THIS SUMMER LOOKING FORWARD TO BRIDGING ALL PIECES TOGETHER AT
4 THE BEGINNING OF 2024, AND STARTING WITH VERY LIMITED GROUP
5 EXPANDING THAT NUMBER AS WE GET CLOSER TO THE START OF
6 TRANSITION. PUBLIC OUTREACH WILL BE DONE TO INFORM THE PUBLIC
7 AND LISA WHO JUST SPOKE FOR MY STAFF WILL BE GOING TO PRESENT
8 A CURRENT OUTREACH PLAN NEXT MONTH. LET ME GO BACK HERE. OUR
9 TOP ROUTE TO ACHIEVING THIS SCHEDULE YOU SEE HERE IS
10 COMPLETION OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE MODIFICATIONS,
11 ALLOWING FOR END TO END TESTING OF ENTIRE SYSTEMS WITH ALL THE
12 NEW TRANSFER RULES PRIOR TO CUSTOMER TRANSITION. COMPLETION OF
13 ALL THE HARDWARE INSTALLATION IN ALL AND ALL LOCATIONS
14 INCLUDING INSTALLATION PROJECTS TANGENTIALLY RELATED LIKE CAD
15 EVO, VENDOR CHANGES OR NETWORK UPGRADES. COORDINATION OF THE
16 VARIOUS PROJECT COMPONENTS IN TIMING WITH MULTIPLE CONTRACTORS
17 FOR VARIOUS PARTS OF THE SYSTEM. IN SUMMARY, STILL ON TRACK TO
18 MAKE THE SUMMER FOR THE START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION IN 2024.
19 WE'RE CAREFULLY MANAGING THIS LARGE MULTI-VENDOR PROJECT.
20 WE'RE EVALUATING RISK AND TRADEOFFS FOR MITIGATION AND WILL
21 UPDATE THE BOARD OF ANY MOVING PARTS THAT CAUSE PROBLEM OR
22 CHANGE FROM US COUNTER PLAN. IN TERMS OF A FINER POINT ON THE
23 EQUIPMENT DEPLOYMENT, WE HAVE A FEW REMAINING PLATFORMS JUST
24 LIKE EIGHT OUT OF 660 -- EVEN THOUGH I SAID THEY WERE ALL
25 DONE. A COUPLE CAME UP THAT ORIGINALLY WEREN'T THERE BEFORE.



JUNE 26, 2023

1 WE EXPECT TO COMPLETE THOSE SHORTLY. WE REPLACED ABOUT 55% OF
2 THE BUS FLEET AND THAT WILL CONTINUE INTO EARLY 2024. AND WE
3 HAVE DONE ABOUT 70% OF THE RETAIL LOCATION INSTALLATIONS. SO,
4 THAT IS MY REPORT. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

5

6 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT REPORT, JASON.
7 BEFORE WE GO TO COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS, MADAM
8 CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. WE HAVE TWO WITH THEIR HANDS
11 RAISED. ALETA DUPREE. I WILL START THE TIMER WHEN YOU START TO
12 SPEAK.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
15 RECORD, SHE AND HER. IT LOOKS LIKE THE AUDIO IN THE ROOM IS
16 FADING OUT A BIT. I HOPE YOU ALL CAN HEAR ME. THERE ARE LOTS
17 OF MOVING PIECES. KIND OF LIKE TRYING TO MANAGE ALL THE TRAINS
18 COMING INTO 67 TRACKS AT GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL WHICH IS
19 LOCATED IN NEW YORK CITY. I THINK THAT THERE SHOULD BE A
20 SPECIAL FOCUS WITH INSTALLATION OF CLIPPER EQUIPMENT ON
21 VEHICLES THAT HAVE ZONE CHANGES, ESPECIALLY THE TRANSBAY BUSES
22 OF AC TRANSIT. BECAUSE THESE OLD DEVICES, THE SCREENS ARE
23 REALLY STARTING TO GET BURN-IN AND DIMMING. IT'S HARD FOR A
24 CUSTOMER TO SEE WHAT THE FARE IS GOING TO BE IF YOU'RE MAKING
25 A CHOICE BETWEEN GOING TRANSBAY OR GOING LOCAL WHEN YOU ARE



JUNE 26, 2023

1 HEADED TOWARDS SAN FRANCISCO. AND IF THE TIMING OF THE TAP OF
2 THE CARD OR PHONE ISN'T RIGHT, IT COULD END UP GETTING CHARGED
3 TO TRANSBAY FARE BECAUSE OF THE LEG FACTOR INVOLVED. SO I
4 THINK WE OUGHT TO PRIORITIZE AC TRANSIT IN GETTING THIS
5 EQUIPMENT DONE. I HAVE SEEN THE NEW READERS ON MUNI. HAVE USED
6 MUNI A GOOD BIT THE LAST FEW DAYS SO THAT MAKES IT EASY FOR ME
7 TO SEE THE EXPIRATION DATE THAT I GET WITH THE TWO HOURS ON A
8 MUNI FARE. LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING ALL THIS TOGETHER AND
9 HEARING MORE ABOUT THIS PILOT TRANSITION WE CAN HAVE A TASTE
10 OF CLIPPER TWO GOING FORWARD.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ADINA LEVIN.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. ADINA LEVIN. GLAD TO SEE THIS
15 PROGRAM MOVING FORWARD, AND TO SEE THE BEGINNING OF THINKING
16 ABOUT THE MARKETING AND HOW TO PUBLICIZE THIS AS IT ROLLS OUT.
17 BECAUSE WHAT'S ROLLING OUT IS NOT ONLY A BACK END CHANGE IN
18 HOW THE TECHNOLOGY WORKS, IT'S ROLLING OUT WITH SOME FEATURES
19 THAT WILL BE REAL BENEFITS FOR TRANSIT RIDERS, FOR REGULAR
20 TRANSIT RIDERS WILL BE VERY PLEASED TO SEE THAT THERE WILL BE
21 FREE TRANSFERS WHICH WILL HELP PEOPLE WHO ARE TAKING TRANSIT
22 ACROSS OUR DIFFERENT 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO, PUBLICIZING THAT
23 AS AN INCREASED CONVENIENCE AND AFFORDABILITY IS SOMETHING
24 THAT RIDERS ARE GOING TO BE REALLY HAPPY ABOUT AND CAN HELP
25 MOTIVATE PEOPLE TO TAKE TRIPS. FOR, YOU KNOW, LARGELY FOR



JUNE 26, 2023

1 EXISTING RIDERS, AND FOR NEW RIDERS, THE OPEN PAYMENT, THE
2 ABILITY TO PAY WITH A CREDIT CARD AND A DEBIT CARD OPENS UP A
3 WEALTH OF MARKETING OPPORTUNITIES FOR PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT HAVE
4 BEEN REGULAR TRANSIT RIDERS, BUT WHO WILL BE OPEN TO IMPULSE
5 TRIPS. SO, YOU KNOW, COME OUT ON THE WEEKEND, GO A MUSIC
6 FESTIVAL. YOU DON'T NEED TO FUSS WITH ANY MACHINES. YOU DON'T
7 NEEDS TO THINK ABOUT ANYTHING. JUST USE YOUR CREDIT OR DEBIT
8 CARD. JUST COME OUT AND HEAR MUSIC. FOR PEOPLE COMING OFF OF
9 AN AIRPLANE, YOU CAN HAVE AN AFFORDABLE AND CONVENIENT TRIP TO
10 YOUR DESTINATION BY USING YOUR CREDIT CARD AND DEBIT CARD. SO
11 THERE IS A RANGE OF MARKETING OPPORTUNITIES WHERE THERE IS
12 OPPORTUNITY FOR THE AGENCIES TO WORK WITH MTC TO PROMOTE THIS
13 AND HELP INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND INCREASE HAPPINESS AND TRANSIT
14 USERS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE IS NO MORE PUBLIC
17 SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK.
20 COMMISSIONERS, COMMITTEE MEMBERS, COMMENTS FOR JASON AND THE
21 TEAM? I AM NOT SEEING ANY. BUT YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET OFF
22 THAT EASY, JASON. I'M JUST BEING RESPECTFUL HERE. ANYBODY?
23 OKAY. HEY, JUST A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS, JASON, FOR -- NOT
24 NECESSARY YOU DON'T NEED TO ANSWER THEM, BUT, YOU KNOW, AS I
25 LOOKED AT THIS AND AS YOU AND I TALKED, IT'S A LITTLE BIT TOO



JUNE 26, 2023

1 WIDE OPEN FOR ME AS THE CHAIR OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE HERE.
2 EVEN IF I -- WHEN YOU WERE TALKING AND GOING THROUGH YOUR --
3 YOU KNOW, YOUR SCHEDULE HERE, THERE IS NO DATES ON THERE. I
4 MEAN, YOUR INCREMENTS ARE SIX MONTHS. AND I KNOW WE KNOW IT A
5 LOT CLOSER THAN THAT. AND, SO, JUST KNOW I HAVE ASKED THE BART
6 TEAM TO DO A DEEP DIVE INTO THE SCHEDULE, AND I'LL BE WORKING
7 WITH YOU AND THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC TO, YOU KNOW, TRY
8 TO NAVIGATE THIS CALENDAR AND THE SCHEDULE. AND NOTHING -- I'M
9 NOT SHARING ANYTHING YOU DON'T KNOW. JUST A PERFECT EXAMPLE,
10 PHASE TWO, YOU KNOW, YOU HAD A LINE TODAY, IN PHASE TWO, NO
11 DATE. WHEN DOES PHASE TWO START?

12

13 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** BROADCASTING TEAM, COULD YOU ROLL THE SLIDES
14 BACK UP, PLEASE? CAN YOU -- OKAY. I'M TRYING -- COULD YOU PUT
15 IT ON THE -- I THINK IT'S THIS ONE. YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
16 RIGHT. SO, ALL OF THIS IS GOING TO BE OCCURRING RIGHT AROUND
17 THE BEGINNING OF THE YEAR. TIER TWO, IF THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE
18 REFERRING TO, CHAIR POWERS, AT THE --

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** BEGINNING OF THE --

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** OH PHASE TWO OF THE TESTING. YES. SO, THAT
23 SHOULD -- FOR USER ACCEPTANCE TESTING SHOULD BE WITHIN THE
24 NEXT -- THIS SUMMER, ESSENTIALLY.

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** EVEN THAT, THIS SUMMER IS A LITTLE BIT
2 TOO WIDE OPEN FOR THIS CHAIR OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD.
3 SO, THAT'S WHAT KIND OF -- YOU JUST MADE MINORITY HERE, JASON.
4 A LITTLE BIT MORE SPECIFICITY. BECAUSE I KNOW WHAT COMES IN
5 FROM YOUR RELATIONSHIP WITH CUBIC IS A CRITICAL PATH SCHEDULE
6 ON A MONTHLY BASIS. SO THOSE DATES AND THOSE DATA POINTS ARE
7 OUT THERE FOR THIS COMMITTEE TO KEEP AN EYE ON.

8

9 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** OKAY. UNDERSTOOD.

10

11 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OTHER COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, ADVICE FOR
12 JASON AND THE TEAM? ALIX? MISS BOCKELMAN?

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CHAIR POWERS I WOULD NOTE THAT ATTACHMENT A
15 HAS MORE DETAIL ON THE NEAR-TERM UPCOMING ACTIVITIES I TAKE
16 YOUR POINT LATER IT DOESN'T HAVE THAT DETAIL BUT FOR USER
17 TESTING IT SAYS JUNE THROUGH AUGUST. THINK YOU'RE LOOKING FOR
18 MORE SPECIFIC DATES.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** YEAH. WE'LL BE PROVIDING THOSE DATES TO
21 MTC. YEAH.

22

23 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** OKAY BUT I WANTED TO NOTE THERE WAS SOME
24 ADDITIONAL DETAIL BUT IT DOESN'T GO VERY FAR OUT. IT GOES A
25 FEW MONTHS OUT.



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** NOT LIKELY WE WOULD BE ABLE TO SAY IT'S JUNE
3 12TH. THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF FLEXIBILITY THERE. YES WE DO
4 HAVE A VERY DETAILED CRYSTAL PATH SCHEDULED BEHIND THIS AND WE
5 COULD CERTAINLY ASSIGN DATES TO EVERYTHING. BUT WE'RE JUST
6 TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE SOMETHING THAT IS REASONABLE
7 ENOUGH OVER A PERIOD OF TIME AND ISN'T HAVING TO CHANGE EVERY
8 MONTH.

9

10 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU. AND
11 APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. THANKS, MISS BOCKELMAN. OTHER
12 COMMENTS? OKAY. NOT SEEING ANY. MADAM CLERK, I THINK WE'RE
13 GOING TO MOVE TO -- THIS WOULD BE AGENDA ITEM 4B, IF I RECALL.
14 AND THIS WOULD BE AN UPDATE ON OUR EXISTING CLIPPER SYSTEM
15 THAT'S OUT THERE RIGHT NOW. AND I'M TURNING THIS OVER TO
16 EDWARD. ARE YOU GOING TO ROLL US THROUGH THIS UPDATE?

17

18 **EDWARD MENG:** YES, SIR.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** COPY THAT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **EDWARD MENG:** COULD WE GET THE SLIDES UP, PLEASE? I'LL BE
23 PRESENTING THE OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE UPDATE GOING
24 FORWARD. AS JASON HAD DISCUSSED AT LAST MONTH'S CLIPPER
25 MEETING WE THOUGHT WE WOULD PUT TOGETHER A SET OF SLIDES THAT



JUNE 26, 2023

1 GAVE INSIGHT AND ANALYSIS OF CLIPPER DATA BY COMPARING CURRENT
2 TRENDS OF STATISTICS WITH DATA THAT, IN PARTICULAR, IN THESE
3 SETS OF SLIDES, DATA THAT WAS COLLECTED DURING THE PANDEMIC.
4 BOTH COMPARING MAY 2023, WHICH WAS OUR MOST RECENT MONTH'S
5 WORTH OF DATA, WITH DATA FROM MAY 2021, AND MAY 2022, WHEN WE
6 WERE KIND OF IN THE HEART OF THE PANDEMIC IN MAY 2021, AND
7 THEN A YEAR AGO. WE DIDN'T REALLY CHANGE THE CONTENT THAT WE
8 REPORT IN THE MEMO. THAT PROVIDES A LOT OF INFORMATION AND
9 STATISTICS ON TRANSITION -- EXCUSE ME -- INFORMATION AND
10 STATISTICS ON TRANSACTIONS AND REVENUE, MOBILE CLIPPER CARD
11 USAGE, CUSTOMER SERVICE STAFFING LEVELS, AND QUARTERLY FARE
12 CHANGES. WE HAVEN'T MODIFIED MUCH BECAUSE THESE METRICS ARE
13 VERY MUCH SHOW THE KEY PERFORMANCE AND OPERATION OF THE
14 CLIPPER SYSTEM. BUT WE JUST KIND OF WANTED TO GIVE A DIFFERENT
15 VIEW OF IT AND TO SEE KIND OF WHAT KIND OF INSIDES AND
16 ANALYSIS THAT THE CLIPPER DATA CAN SHOW. AS I MENTIONED WITH
17 THE QUARTERLY FARE CHANGES, WE ARE REQUESTING THAT CUBIC -- WE
18 ARE REMINDING THE BOARD THAT CUBIC HAS REQUESTED FOR QUARTERLY
19 FARE CHANGES. THE DEADLINE FOR THIS TIME IS IN OCTOBER 1ST FOR
20 A JANUARY 1ST DECEMBER 31ST FARE CHANGE. SO, LET'S GET INTO
21 THE DATAS AND TRENDS FOR SOME OF THE KEY METRICS OF THE
22 SYSTEM. I WANTED TO DISCUSS THE FORMAT OF THESE SLIDES, WHICH
23 IF YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? A LOT OF THESE SLIDES
24 ON THE LEFT IS THE COMPARISON OF THE DATA FROM BETWEEN MAY
25 2022 AND MAY 2021, AND THEN ON THE RIGHT IS THE DIFFERENCE IN



JUNE 26, 2023

1 MAY 2021 VERSUS THE LAST FULL MONTH OF DATA THAT WE HAD WHICH
2 IS MAY 2023. SO IS THE DARK BLUE BARS ON THIS CHART SHOW THE
3 HEAVY RIDERSHIP AND OTHER MODES GIVEN DECREASE IN RIDERSHIP
4 FOR RAIL AND FERRY IN THE HEIGHT OF THE PANDEMIC, THE RAIL AND
5 FERRY RIDERSHIP IS INCREASING AT A HIGHER RATE THAN BUS
6 RIDERSHIP OVERALL, BOTH HIGHER THAN THE OVERALL CLIPPER
7 AVERAGE AS WELL AS YOU CAN SEE KIND OF THE LARGER SIGNIFICANT
8 JUMP IN LAST MONTH VERSUS THE MONTH OF THE YEAR PRIOR. NEXT
9 SLIDE PLEASE. I APOLOGIZE FOR THE MISLABELING OF THIS SLIDE.
10 THE TITLE IS INACCURATE. WE DO WANT TO SAY THAT RIDERSHIP
11 RECOVERY HAS OCCURRED MORE QUICKLY WITH ADULTS AND WITH YOUTH
12 THAN WITH SENIORS OR WITH RTC. SO, YOU CAN SEE BOTH YOUTH AND
13 ADULT RIDERSHIP HAVE NEARLY DOUBLED FROM MAY 2021 TO MAY 2023.
14 SENIOR RIDERSHIP IS ONLY HALF OF WHAT IT WAS BACK THEN, AND
15 THAT RTC RIDERSHIP HAS DECLINED PRECIPITOUSLY. SO, THAT'S KIND
16 OF THE INSIGHT THAT WE SEE INTO THE CLIPPER DATA. NEXT SLIDE,
17 PLEASE. THANK YOU. SO, THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN
18 WEEKDAY AND WEEKEND RIDERSHIP. WITH THE BLUE BAR REPRESENTING
19 RELATIVE GROWTH BETWEEN 2021 AND 2022. THE ORANGE BAR SHOWS
20 THE DIFFERENCE IN RELATIVE GROWTH BETWEEN 2021 AND 2023. SO,
21 WEEKDAY RIDERSHIP HAS GROWN MUCH MORE SUBSTANTIALLY THAN
22 WEEKEND RIDERSHIP, BUT YOU CAN SEE, AT LEAST BY 2023, THAT
23 WEEKEND GROWTH HAS ALSO RECOVERED FROM MAY 2021. NEXT SLIDE.
24 ALL RIGHT. SO, THIS -- THESE CHARTS SHOW THE PERCENTAGE CHANGE
25 IN SETTLED REVENUE GROWTH BETWEEN THE THREE, KIND OF, TOUCH



JUNE 26, 2023

1 POINTS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT, MAY 2021, MAY 2022, AND MAY
2 2023. SO, AS YOU CAN SEE MOST AGENCY -- MOST -- THE REGION HAS
3 SETTLED OVER A LITTLE OVER 100% OF THE REVENUE IN MAY 2022
4 WITH THE PRIOR YEAR AND THAT HAS GROWN SINCE BUT OF COURSE THE
5 COMPARISON IS FOR MAY 2021 IT DID HAPPEN TO BE A YEAR THAT HAD
6 A MONTH OF LOW REVENUE SETTLEMENT BECAUSE IT WAS IN THE MIDDLE
7 OF THE PANDEMIC. WE KNOW REVENUE IS OBVIOUSLY EXTREMELY
8 IMPORTANT METRICS FOR THE AGENCY SO WE ARE CONTINUING TO
9 MONITOR REVENUE GROWTH AS WE GET MORE DATA AND LOOK AT OVERALL
10 REGION'S REVENUE COLLECTION AND COMPARE WITH SOME PRE-PANDEMIC
11 STATISTICS AS WELL SEE HOW THE REGION IS RECOVERING FROM THE
12 PANDEMIC. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THANK YOU. SO, WESTERN THE FIRST
13 YEAR, WHAT WE'RE SEEING FROM THE DATA IS THAT RAIL AND FERRY
14 SERVICES HAD A HIGHER RATE OF RIDERSHIP RETURN THAN BUS
15 AGENCIES. HOWEVER, I THINK WE CAN SEE FROM THE SECOND CHART ON
16 THE RIGHT, THAT BUS RIDERSHIP IS NOW CONTINUING TO GROW, AND
17 NOW, KIND OF, OUTPACES RAIL AND -- RAIL AND FERRY RIDERSHIP.
18 SO, IT LOOKS TO BE DATA SHOWING THAT RIDERSHIP IS GOING FOR
19 ALL SYSTEMS AND ALL MODES THAT RAIL CAME BACK SOONER THAN BUS
20 RIDERS DID AND BUS RIDERS LARGELY CAME BACK WITHIN THE LAST
21 YEAR. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THEN THINK THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE
22 PERCENTAGE OF RAIL -- WELL, IT DEPENDS -- IT'S THE RAIL AND
23 FOR AGENCIES VERSUS THE BUS AND MULTI-MODAL AGENCIES. RAIL AND
24 FERRY CUSTOMERS ARE MORE INCLINED TO PAY FERRIES USING A
25 CLIPPER CARD WHETHER OR NOT THAT'S BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, FROM THE



JUNE 26, 2023

1 PRIOR SLIDES, RAIL AND FERRY CUSTOMERS RETURNED EARLIER THAN
2 BUS RIDERS AND HAVE HAD MORE OPPORTUNITIES TO BECOME FAMILIAR
3 WITH THE MOBILE APP AND THE MOBILE CARD WHICH WAS RELEASED IN
4 THE MIDDLE OF THE PANDEMIC. IT COULD BE JUST IN GENERAL THAT
5 THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF RAIL AND FERRY RIDERS ARE MORE INCLINED AS
6 WELL TO BE USING A CLIPPER MOBILE CARD THAN THE OVERALL
7 POPULATION. SO, LET'S SEE. THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
8 THANKS. AND, SO, THIS, AS A RESULT OF LAST MONTH'S QUESTION
9 FROM THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, WE HAVE OUR CLIPPER FACT OF
10 THE MONTH. WHAT THAT REQUEST WAS FROM THE BOARD WAS A
11 COMPARISON OF ONGOING COST RELATED TO THE MAINTAINING BOTH
12 PHYSICAL AND MOBILE CARDS BASED ON OUR KIND OF CURRENT COST
13 AND CURRENT CONTRACTS. SO, BASED ON THE CURRENT TERMS OF THE
14 CLIPPER CONTRACT, OVER THE FIRST QUARTER OF 2023, THE AVERAGE
15 ONGOING MONTHLY COST OF MOBILE CARDS TURNED OUT TO BE AROUND
16 \$0.43 PER CARD, WHILE THE AVERAGE ONGOING MONTHLY COST ON THE
17 PHYSICAL CARD NOT THATCH DIFFERENT AT AROUND \$0.49 PER CARD. I
18 DO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THIS NUMBER DOES NOT INCLUDE THE
19 ACTUAL PHYSICAL COST OF THE PLASTIC OF THE PHYSICAL CARDS. AND
20 THAT VARIES BASED ON THE COST OF RAW MATERIALS. WE ALSO WOULD
21 LIKE TO REMIND THE BOARD THAT THE PHYSICAL ADULT CARD STILL
22 COST \$3. \$THREE SUBSIDIZES THE COST OF FREE CARDS FOR ALL OF
23 OUR DISCOUNT PROGRAMS, YOUTH, SENIOR, CLIPPER START, CLIPPER
24 RTC WHILE WE'RE CURRENTLY CONTINUING TO WAIVE THE COST OF
25 LOADING A MOBILE CARD ON TO YOUR PHONE OF CHOICE, A POLICY



JUNE 26, 2023

1 WHICH WE PLAN TO CONTINUE INDEFINITELY. WE, AS STAFF CONTINUE
2 TO MONITOR THE MOBILE CARD COST POLICY -- SORRY -- WE'LL
3 CONTINUE TO MONITOR THE MOBILE CARD VERSUS PLASTIC CARD COST
4 BOTH TO OUR NEW SYSTEM INTEGRATOR CONTRACT AS WELL AS TO OUR
5 CUSTOMER SERVICE AND OUR CARD DISTRIBUTION PROVIDERS. SO THESE
6 COSTS ARE KIND OF A SNAPSHOT IN TIME FOR RIGHT NOW, AND THEY
7 IT WILL LIKELY BE CHANGING AS WE SWITCH TO DIFFERENT CONTRACTS
8 IN THE FUTURE. BUT WE WILL CONTINUE TO KEEP YOU ALL UPDATED ON
9 THESE COSTS AS WE CONTINUE TO REPORT BACK TO THIS GROUP. SO, I
10 BELIEVE WE'LL PLAN TO CONTINUE TO REPORT THESE ANALYSIS AND
11 INSIGHTS INTO CLIPPER DATAS AND TRENDS GOING FORWARD AND ARE
12 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM THIS BOARD. AND
13 WITH THAT, THAT CONCLUDES MY PREPARED REMARKS. THANK YOU

14

15 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, EDWARD. AGAIN, MADAM
16 CLERK, WE ARE ON AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM HERE. LET'S CHECK IN
17 WITH THE PUBLIC. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM BEFORE WE GO
18 TO COMMISSIONERS?

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO
21 ONE WITH A HAND RAISED, AND NO ONE WITH PUBLIC SPEAKER CARDS
22 WITHIN THE BUILDING.

23

24 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. COMMENTS, QUESTIONS? CAROLYN?

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YEAH. I HAVE A QUESTION. LET ME MAKE SURE
2 FIRST CLARIFY SOMETHING. WHEN YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT, FOR
3 EXAMPLE, NEW OR RETURNING RIDERS YOU WERE SAYING SOMETHING
4 ABOUT THE RAIL AND FERRY RETURNING FASTER. BUT YOU'RE TALKING
5 ABOUT RETURNING FASTER FOR THE USE OF THE CLIPPER CARD,
6 CORRECT? NOT RIDERSHIP, IN GENERAL. RIGHT? IT WAS BASED
7 SPECIFICALLY ON CLIPPER CARDS.

8

9 **EDWARD MENG:** CORRECT FOR ALL CLIPPER DATA.

10

11 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THE 43 VERSUS \$0.49 I HAVE A QUESTION ON
12 THAT. WHAT ARE WE -- HOW DO WE LOOK AT WHAT'S DRIVING --
13 BECAUSE I WOULD THINK THE COST OF THE MOBILE SYSTEM SHOULD GO
14 DOWN OVER TIME, BUT IT -- IF WE HAVE MORE USERS, BUT I DON'T
15 KNOW THAT. AND I WAS CURIOUS WHAT DRIVERS WE HAVE. BECAUSE I
16 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE CONTRACT IS, AS TO HOW THEY GET -- IS IT
17 PAY PER PERSON? THERE IS SOME FIXED COST? WHAT'S VARIABLE IN
18 THAT IN TERMS OF THE SUPPLIER AND YOU SAID SOMETHING ABOUT IT
19 COULD CHANGE WHEN WE SWITCH TO DIFFERENT CONTRACTORS IN THE
20 FUTURE. AND I JUST WAS WONDERING WHICH PIECES DO WE SWITCH?
21 LIKE, WHAT CONTRACTS WOULD BE SWITCHED?

22

23 **EDWARD MENG:** ALL OF OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE AND CARDS
24 DISTRIBUTION IS HANDLED BY OUR C1 CONTRACTOR WHICH IS CUBIC.
25 IN THE FUTURE CARD DISTRIBUTION WILL BE HANDLED BY A DIFFERENT



JUNE 26, 2023

1 CONTRACTOR AND OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE OPERATOR WILL BE WSP. AND,
2 SO, WHEN WE LOOKED AT THE ONGOING COST WE LOOKED AT BOTH THE
3 COST OF, BASICALLY, MAKING SURE THAT THE CARDS ARE, YOU KNOW,
4 THEY STAY IN THE SYSTEM, THE COST OF CUSTOMER SERVICE, AND
5 THAT'S A PROXY -- WE HAVE A PROXY FOR THE COST OF CUSTOMER
6 SERVICE TO THAT RELATES TO THE KIND OF NUMBER OF ACTIVE CARD
7 HOLDERS, AND THE CARD DISTRIBUTION COST, WHICH IS A LINE ITEM
8 IN THE CURRENT CUBIC CONTRACT THAT, OBVIOUSLY, IS NOT IN A
9 FUTURE CUBIC CONTRACT. IN TERMS OF THE MOBILE COST, WE DO
10 THINK THAT AS WE GET A KIND OF GREATER CRITICAL MASS OF MOBILE
11 CARD USERS, THAT THOSE COSTS WILL GO DOWN, AND I THINK THE
12 COST RELATE TO A LOT OF -- THERE IS BASICALLY A LOT OF
13 DIFFERENT FACTORS IN PLAY, WHICH CONTRIBUTE TO THE COST,
14 INCLUDING A LOT OF MORE OR LESS FEES TO OUR MOBILE PROVIDING
15 PARTNERS FOR GOOGLE AND APPLE.

16
17 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** SO WILL THE CUSTOMER SERVICE NOW OR IN THE
18 FUTURE, DO THEY ANSWER QUESTIONS ABOUT THE MOBILE PASS OR JUST
19 THE PLASTIC CARD?

20
21 **EDWARD MENG:** RIGHT NOW THEY WILL BE ANSWERING QUESTIONS ABOUT
22 THE MOBILE CARD. RIGHT NOW IT'S KIND OF FLOATING IN THE ETHER.
23 THEY DO ANSWER QUESTIONS BUT THEY'RE NOT PARTICULARLY REQUIRED
24 TO BECAUSE THE MOBILE CARD IS PART OF A DIFFERENT CONTRACT.



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** OKAY.

2

3 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** I'M GOING DO A FOLLOW UP ON THAT.

4 OBVIOUS FOLLOW UP IF YOU WERE CAROLYN AND I'M NOT SO SHE CAN

5 DO WHATEVER SHE WANTS. WHY COULD THEY IF A QUESTION CAME IN ON

6 MOBILE COULD THEY ANSWER THAT?

7

8 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ABSOLUTELY. IF THERE IS QUESTIONS THAT COME

9 UP WITH RESPECT TO QUESTIONS ON MOBILE CARDS ON PHONES THEY

10 CAN ANSWER IT.

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** COPY THAT. I JUST WANTED TO SUPPORT YOU

13 ON THE QUESTIONING CAROLYN.

14

15 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** GOING TO JASON DIRECTLY, BUT THAT'S NOT

16 EVERYBODY.

17

18 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OTHER COMMENTS? RUBY?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION, THANK YOU. ON THE CUSTOMER SERVICE

21 UPDATE YOU HAVE 35CSRS TAKING CALLS AND 43 TOTAL. ARE YOU

22 FULLY STAFFED NOW. I KNOW THAT WAS AN ISSUE A YEAR AGO WITH

23 STAFFING. WHEN ARE YOU CONSIDERED FULLY STAFFED?

24



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I DON'T KNOW WHAT IT IS ACTUAL NUMBER IS FOR
2 FULLY STAFFED BUT I DO KNOW THAT WE HAVE OVER THE LAST SIX
3 MONTHS OR SO RESOLVED THOSE ISSUES WITH CUSTOMER SERVICE ALL
4 CUSTOMER SERVICE WITH KPIS CUBIC HAS BEEN MAKING 99.13% OF
5 CALLS.

6

7 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** RUBY DID YOU GET AN ANSWER? ALIX
8 BOCKELMAN, MTC?

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ONE OF THE
11 QUESTIONS I HAD IN TRYING TO PUT INTO CONTEXT WAS
12 UNDERSTANDING WHAT PERCENTAGE OF TRIPS ARE USING A CLIPPER
13 CARD IS THAT IN HERE SOMEWHERE? IT GOES TO POINT IN ABOUT THE
14 FACT THAT SOME OF THE TRENDS YOU'RE SEEING ARE RELATED TO
15 CLIPPER, TRANSIT OVERALL, I FOUND THIS A LITTLE BIT
16 COMPLICATED FOR ME.

17

18 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THAT'S A FAIR STATEMENT, MEMBER BOCKELMAN.

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** [LAUGHTER]

21

22 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** RIGHT. BECAUSE OVERALL AS WE HAVE MENTIONED
23 TO DO THIS GROUP BEFORE CLIPPER IS ABOUT 50% OF ALL FARE
24 PAYMENT AND THAT VARIES BY OPERATOR IT CAN BE AS LOW AS 20 OR
25 30% IT'S HIGH ON BART AND SOME OF THE FERRY, AND KUDOS TO



JUNE 26, 2023

1 COUNTY CONNECTION, UP TO 80% FOR THE BUS OPERATOR. SO ROCK ON
2 THERE. YEAH IT CAN BE A LITTLE BIT CHALLENGING OBVIOUSLY WITH
3 RESPECT TO THE FACT THAT WE DON'T HAVE CONTINUITY AMONGST THE
4 VARIOUS OPERATING TYPES. AND IT MIGHT BE A LITTLE BIT, YOU
5 KNOW, CHALLENGING TO TAKE THIS OR THAT FROM IT.

6

7 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** YES. OF COURSE, ALIX.

8

9 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** JUST A FOLLOW UP, FOR A FUTURE PRESENTATION IF
10 YOU COULD ADD THAT AT THE BEGINNING OR IF THERE ARE CHANGES IN
11 -- I DON'T KNOW HOW OFTEN WE GET THAT DATA, BUT CHANGES IN THE
12 PERCENTAGE OF TRIPS, LIKE, KIND OF PRECOVID AND NOW, THAT ARE
13 ON CLIPPER, OR IF THERE ARE ANY SIGNIFICANT CHANGES IN THAT BY
14 MODES? BECAUSE I THINK THAT -- ANYWAYS, I THINK THAT IT COULD
15 BE HELPFUL AT THE BEGINNING.

16

17 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THAT'S GREAT ADVICE. YES WE CAN CERTAINLY SET
18 THE STAGE BY PROVIDING CONTEXT OF VARIOUS --

19

20 **EDWARD MENG:** AND I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON CHAIR MEMBER HUERTA'S
21 QUESTION, 99.31% OF ALL CALLS WERE ANSWERED WITHIN THREE
22 MINUTES AND IT IS 100 -- SORRY -- 99.31% OF CALLS WERE
23 ANSWERED WITHIN THREE MINUTES.

24



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. VERY DETAILED, EDWARD, ON THAT
2 NUMBER.

3

4 **EDWARD MENG:** [LAUGHTER] JUST OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD.

5

6 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THE ACCURACY THERE. OTHER
7 COMMENTS? NOT SEEING ANY. ARE YOU GOOD CAROLYN?

8

9 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** YEAH, CAN I ASK SOMETHING REAL QUICK,
10 BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW THIS. I KNOW. IS THE BAY PASS CONSIDERED
11 ALSO A CLIPPER CARD? OR DOES IT GET -- ARE THOSE TRIPS
12 CONSIDERED DIFFERENTLY RIGHT NOW?

13

14 **EDWARD MENG:** RIGHT NOW THE RIDERSHIP COUNTS AS A CLIPPER RIDE
15 WHEN YOU USE THE BAY PASS BECAUSE IT'S ON THE CLIPPER CARD.

16

17 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THAT'S WHAT I WANTED TO KNOW. THANKS. SO
18 WE'RE GETTING THOSE NUMBERS INCORPORATED INTO HERE. THANKS.

19

20 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** JUST ONE COMMENT FOR JASON. JUST SO
21 YOU'RE TRACKING, I DIRECTED BART STAFF THIS MORNING TO DEVELOP
22 A PLAN FOR ME TO MOVE AWAY FROM DISPENSING MAG STRIPED TICKETS
23 AT SFO. SO, JUST KNOW THAT THAT'S THE DIRECTION BART IS MOVING
24 IN.

25



JUNE 26, 2023

1 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** OKAY. YEAH. I SAY THAT WITH HESITATION.
2 BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY WE'RE NOT OUT OF THE WOODS WITH REGARD TO
3 THE CARD SPY ISSUES WE HAVE BEEN HAVING, AND I KNOW -- I
4 UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, WE WORKED VERY CLOSELY WITH BART STAFF
5 IN TERMS OF HOW THEY'RE MOVING WITH RESPECT TO THE NEW GATE
6 PROJECT AND THE FACT THAT THOSE GATES DON'T TAKE MAG STRIPE.
7 SO WE'RE FULLY EMBRACING THAT AND ALSO WORKING TO PUSH VENDORS
8 TO MAKE SURE WE GET CARDS TODAY AND TOMORROW

9

10 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** I SUGGEST YOU DOUBLING DOWN ON THE
11 VENDORS TO GET SUPPLIED CARDS.

12

13 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** GOT IT.

14

15 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. ANY OTHER -- I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER
16 COMMENTS HERE, MADAM CLERK. THAT BRINGS US TO AN END OF FOUR.
17 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR, AND I BELIEVE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE
18 IS OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. AND, JASON, ARE YOU GOING
19 TO BE PROVIDING AN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT HERE?

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CAROL IS ONLINE.

22

23 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SHE HAS BEEN LISTENING IN. BUT I THINK WE'RE
24 GOING TO PASS UNLESS CAROL YOU WANT TO COME ON AND SAY
25 SOMETHING?



JUNE 26, 2023

1

2 **CAROL KUESTER:** NOTHING TO ADD. WE HAVE FOLLOW UP ITEMS BUT I
3 HAVE NO EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT FOR TODAY. THANKS.

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. AND THANKS FOR JOINING US
6 VIRTUALLY, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR KUESTER. THAT'S APPRECIATED.
7 OKAY. MADAM CLERK, I THINK THAT MOVES US THROUGH AGENDA ITEM
8 NUMBER FIVE. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY
9 OTHER BUSINESS?

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
12 ALETA DUPREE. I WILL GET THE TIMER READY. YOU CAN UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANKS, AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA DUPREE, FOR
16 THE RECORD SHE AND HER. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS TODAY. HOW DO WE
17 BUILD THE BEST CLIPPER WE CAN? AND WE'RE DOING A LOT OF GOOD
18 WORK, AND WE CERTAINLY WANT TO MOVE AWAY FROM PAPER TICKETS ON
19 ALL OUR AGENCIES NOT JUST BART BUT HOW DO WE DRIVE PEOPLE TO
20 USE PRODUCTS OTHER THAN CLIPPER, AND THAT CUTS BOTH WAYS. WE
21 WANT TO MOVE AWAY FROM PAPER TICKET THAT IS EASILY DAMAGED AND
22 CAUSE ALL KINDS OF CUSTOMER SERVICE AND MAINTENANCE PROBLEMS
23 AND CASH PROCESSING IS VERY EXPENSIVE. JUST THE THAT PEOPLE
24 DON'T THINK ABOUT WHAT IT IS. BUT, YET, BEING ABLE TO MOVE
25 INTO ANOTHER PAYMENT CHANNEL, WHICH IS THE OPEN PAYMENTS.



JUNE 26, 2023

1 BECAUSE I HAVE DONE SO A NUMBER OF TIMES ON THE CAPITAL CARD
2 IN THE LAST MONTH, AS A PART OF A TAP TO PAY PILOT PROGRAM.
3 AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT'S INDEPENDENT, CAPITAL CARD IS NOT
4 PART OF CLIPPER LOGISTICS HAVE NOT ALLOWED IT TO BE SUCH
5 BECAUSE IT SPANS DIFFERENT AREAS, WORKS WITH AMTRAK, AND ALL
6 KINDS OF OTHER COMPLICATED THINGS. BUT, WE WANT TO MAKE
7 CLIPPER AS USER FRIENDLY AS POSSIBLE. AND IT IS. BUT WE STILL
8 HAVE SOME PAIN POINTS, SUCH AS WITH THE AIRPORT, THAT MAYBE
9 CLIPPER CAN HAVE A LIMITED USE RFID TICKET THAT CAN BE A
10 SUBSTITUTE TO HAVING MAG STRIPE TICKETS AT THE AIRPORT.
11 CHICAGO HAS SUCH LIMITED USE TICKETS BECAUSE NOT EVERYBODY
12 WANTS TO GET A PLASTIC CARD, THOSE COST QUITE A BIT TO MAKE. I
13 DID GET A NEW RTC CLIPPER CARD WHICH I PICKED UP AT THE BART
14 OFFICE AT LAKE MERRITT THAT WILL GET ME FOR ANOTHER FIVE YEARS
15 CERTAINLY WE WANT TO MAKE THE PROCESS EASIER FOR THOSE WHO
16 ESPECIALLY NEED TO GET RTC CARDS BECAUSE CLIPPER IS A PROGRAM
17 THAT HELPS PEOPLE IN MANY WAYS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE IS NO MORE HANDS RAISED
20 FOR PUBLIC SPEAKING.

21

22 **ROBERT POWERS, CHAIR:** OKAY. THEN WE ARE GOING TO CLOSE AGENDA
23 ITEM NUMBER SIX, MADAM CLERK. AND AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SEVEN IS
24 THE NEXT MEETING IS GOING TO BE HELD ON THE 24th OF JULY. AND



JUNE 26, 2023

1 WE'LL MAKE SURE THAT IT IS NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC, AND WITH
2 THAT, THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANKS MADAM CLERK.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

5

6



Broadcasting Government