

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN**
2 **SUBCOMMITTEE**

3 **MONDAY, JUNE 12TH, 2023, 1:00 PM**
4
5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE
7 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
8 SUBCOMMITTEE TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE WEB
9 SITE, AS SIMULTANEOUSLY AT REMOTE LOCATIONS, MEMBERS OF THE
10 PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE
11 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON
12 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. AND TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES
13 WILL BE CALLED ON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE
14 NUMBER. FOR AGENDA ITEM NUMBER ONE IS TO CALL THE MEETING TO
15 ORDER, AND DO ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM BUT AS A PREP STEP
16 FOR THIS, THERE WAS A MEMBER WHO HAD NOT ATTENDED FOR MANY
17 MONTHS AND WAS GOING TO BE NO LONGER ATTENDING AS OF WHEN WE
18 WERE RECRUITING MORE PEOPLE, BUT GIVEN THE FACT THAT THEY'RE
19 STILL NOT HERE, WE WOULD LIKE TO OFFICIALLY REQUEST THAT
20 MONICA MALLON BE REMOVED FROM THE BODY WHICH WOULD GIVE US A
21 QUORUM AND ALLOW US TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS MEETING. IS THAT
22 CORRECT?
23



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH. YOU GOT IT. IT'S NOT A REQUEST, YOU
2 AS CHAIR HAVE THE ABILITY TO REMOVE HER DUE ONGOING
3 ABSENTEEISM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GREAT. DUE TO ONGOING REPEATING --
6 REPEATED NOT ATTENDING THE MEETING DESPITE NUMEROUS REQUESTS
7 AND REMINDERS. OKAY. SO WITH THAT CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL AND
8 CONFIRM THE QUORUM BASED WHAT WE HAVE JUST TALKED ABOUT.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND THE NEW QUORUM NUMBER IS SEVEN. SO,
11 CHAIR LEVIN?

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR KALLINS?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER ALLEN IS EXCUSED. MEMBER CUSHMAN?

20

21 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS IS EXCUSED. GLAZER IS
24 EXCUSED. GOYAL?

25



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER PIERCE IS EXCUSED. MR. STANKE?

4

5 **BRIAN STANKE:** MEMBER STANKE IS HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. AND OUR ALTERNATE ELDRED?

8

9 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. AND SCOTT? TERRY, YOU HAVE TO

12 UN--

13

14 **TERRY SCOTT:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. AND WE WILL BE USING THE

17 ALTERNATES TO VOTE TODAY.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. MOVING AHEAD IS THE

20 APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 13TH, 2023, AND MAY

21 8TH, 2023. MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.

22

23 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** MOTION, GRIFFITHS TO APPROVE.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** SECOND, WENDI KALLINS.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I WANTED TO CONFIRM DID WE GET THE MINUTES FROM TWO
9 MEETINGS AGO?

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THEY'RE INCLUDED.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** IN THE PACKET?

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** UH-HUH THAT'S WHY THERE ARE TWO SETS AND
16 NOT JUST THE MAY 1ST.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** DO WE NEED TO APPROVE BOTH OF THEM.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THEY'RE BOTH ON HERE FOR APPROVAL AND
23 INCLUDED IN THE PACKET.

24



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** I MEAN DO WE HAVE TO HAVE TWO
2 SEPARATE MOTIONS?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO UNLESS YOU WANT TO PULL ONE AND
5 DISCUSS IT SEPARATELY. LEVIN?

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CUSHMAN?

14

15 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCHE GROSS IS EXCUSED. GLAZER
18 EXCUSED, GOYAL?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKER SON IS ABSENT. ALLOW IS ABSENT.
23 LOPER IS EXCUSED, PIERCE IS EXCUSED. MEMBER STANKE?

24

25 **BRIAN STANKE:** AYE.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

7

8 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
11 MEMBERS.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. AND BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE
14 SUBSTANTIVE ITEM, I THINK POSSIBLY BECAUSE OF SCHEDULES, THERE
15 WASN'T AHOLD THE DATE ON OUR CALENDARS AND I THINK IS OF THE
16 ATTENDANCE WAS RELATED TO THE LACK OF THE HOLD THE DATE
17 BECAUSE PEOPLE DIDN'T REALIZE THIS WAS HAPPENING. AND STAFF
18 HAVING THE HOLD THE DATE IS HELPFUL TO MAKE SURE IT'S ON THE
19 CALENDARS. WE DIDN'T HOLD THE DATE ON OUR CALENDARS AND I
20 SUSPECT LACK OF ATTENDANCE OR PLANNING AHEAD OF TIME TO ATTEND
21 REMOTELY WAS DUE TO NOT HAVING AHOLD THE DATE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SO, FOR SCHEDULING THE SAVE THE DATES
24 HAVE BEEN SENT OUT AND SENT OUT EVERY MONTH BUT CALENDAR HOLDS
25 ARE NOT SENT OUT IN THE E-MAIL. THE REMINDER FOR JULY AND



JUNE 12, 2023

1 REMAINDER OF THE YEAR HAVE BEEN SENT OUT. I WILL SEND OUT
2 REQUESTS AS WELL AS E-MAIL THAT POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR
3 KINMAN SENT OUT REGARDING THE ATTENDANCE.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ITEM FOUR TRANSIT
6 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ACCESSIBILITY ITEM WHERE WE WILL
7 GET AN INFORMATION ITEM WITH DRENNEN SHELTON, MAUREEN DEVLIN,
8 AND ALISON EDWARDS, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PATIENCE AND
9 PUTTING UP WITH OUR ATTENDANCE ISSUES.

10

11 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** CHAIR LEVIN, JUST ONE MORE PIECE OF
12 HOUSEKEEPING, CHARLES LAVREY WHO REPLACED RICH HEDGES ON THE
13 COUNCIL IS ANOTHER MEMBER WHO CAN ATTEND AND YOU WOULD SIMPLY
14 HAVE TO RECOGNIZE HIS REPLACEMENT OF THE COUNCILMEMBER HEDGES
15 ON THIS BODY AND THEN WE CAN UPGRADE THEM AS A ZOOM PANELIST.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** DIDN'T DO THE REMOTE LOCATIONS?

18

19 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** WE COULD DO THAT AT THE NEXT MEETING.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE ADDITION
22 OF MEMBER LAVREY POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AS REPLACEMENT FOR
23 SORELY MISSED RICH HEDGES. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR AND
24 I'M GOING TO BE PAYING CLOSE ATTENTION WHILE GETTING A DRINK
25 IN THE USING AUDIO IN THE OTHER ROOM.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **MELANIE CHOY:** MELANIE CHOY FUNDING POLICY PROGRAMS SECTION AT
3 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION STEPPING IN FOR DRENNEN
4 WHO COULD NOT BE HERE TODAY BUT JOINED BY MY COLLEAGUES ALISON
5 EDWARDS AND MAUREEN DEVLIN ON THIS ITEM. TODAY WE WANTED TO
6 PROVIDE UPDATE ON THE FIVE ACTION ITEMS ASSOCIATED WITH THE
7 ACCESSIBILITY OUTCOMES IN THE ACTION PLAN AND I'LL RECAP THE
8 ACTIONS QUICKLY FOR A BRIEF UPDATE AND HAND IT OVER TO ALLISON
9 AFTERWARDS. THE FIRST ACTION ITEM IN THE TRANSIT
10 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IS FOCUSED ON DESIGNATED A MOBILITY
11 MANAGER TO COORDINATE RIDES AND FUNCTION AS A LIAISON BETWEEN
12 TRANSIT AGENCY IN EACH COUNTY. I'M GOING TO READ THROUGH ALL
13 THE ACTIONS TO PROVIDE CONTEXT ON SOME OF THESE, THEN WE ALSO
14 HAVE ACTION NUMBER 22 WHICH IS TO FUND ADDITIONAL SUBREGIONAL
15 ONE SEAT PARATRANSIT RIDE PILOTS AND ALSO DEVELOP COST SHARING
16 POLICIES FOR CROSS JURISDICTIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS. THIRD
17 PROJECT IN THIS ACCESSIBILITY PROGRAM IS ACTION 23 WHICH IS
18 THE INTEGRATION OF ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICES ON CLIPPER NEXT
19 GENERATION AND THIS ONE MAUREEN WILL PROVIDE DETAIL ON. THEN
20 WE HAVE ACTION 24 WHICH IS IDENTIFY KEY PARATRANSIT CHALLENGES
21 AND RECOMMENDED CHANGES AND WE ARE COUPLING THIS WITH THE
22 COORDINATED PLAN UPDATE THAT IS SCHEDULED TO BE PRESENTED
23 LATER THIS YEAR THROUGH AT THE MTC COMMISSION. AND THEN THE
24 LAST ACTION IN THE ACCESSIBILITY OUTCOME PROGRAM IS ACTION 25
25 WHICH IS ADOPT STANDARDIZED ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PROGRAMS



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THAT BENEFIT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND THIS IS ADA
2 PARATRANSIT AND CLIPPER ACCESS, WHICH WAS FORMERLY THE RTC
3 PROGRAM. AND ALLISON WILL PRESENT MORE DETAIL ON THE CLIPPER
4 ACCESS PROGRAM AS WELL. IN TERMS OF SOME UPDATES ON WHAT WE'RE
5 DOING, DRENNAN IS LEADING A LOT OF THIS EFFORT AND ONE OF THE
6 ACTIONS THAT SHE IS FOCUSED ON IS ACTION 25, THE
7 STANDARDIZATION OF ADA PARATRANSIT ELIGIBLE PRACTICES ACROSS
8 THE REGION. AND THE GOAL FOR THIS ACTION IS TO MAKE THE
9 ELIGIBILITY PROCESS MORE STANDARD AND THEREBY MAKING -- BEING
10 MORE EQUITABLE IN DETERMINING ADA PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY. THE
11 TRANSIT AGENCIES AIM TO ADDRESS INCONSISTENCY IN THE PROCESS
12 ACROSS THE REGION AND ALSO TO INCREASE ACCURACY OF THE
13 ELIGIBILITY PROCESS AND SAFEGUARDING ADA PARATRANSIT FOR THOSE
14 WHO NEED THE SERVICE. IN TERMS OF PROGRESS SO FAR THERE HAS
15 BEEN REGULAR UPDATES TO THE REC TEE AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
16 AND SO THE PROGRESS SO FAR HAS BEEN RESEARCH FINDINGS OF THE
17 RANGE OF PROCESSES OUR RANGE OF PROCESSES THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
18 USE BUT WE HAVE ALSO PRESENTED SUMMARIES OF THE BEST PRACTICES
19 FROM ACROSS THE COUNTRY TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE.
20 DRENNAN IS WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND ALSO
21 PARATRANSIT STAFF TO DEVELOP A SLATE OF CHANGES TO THE
22 ELIGIBILITY PROCESS. AND A PREVIEW OF THE TYPES OF
23 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT YOU WILL LIKELY SEE ARE -- I'M JUST GOING
24 TO NAME A FEW -- IS ONE CREATING A STANDARD APPLICATION FORM
25 REGARDLESS OF THE AGENCY, AND, SO, EVERY AGENCY WILL COLLECT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THE SAME INFORMATION FROM EVERY APPLICANT. ANOTHER
2 RECOMMENDATION THAT YOU WILL LIKELY SEE WILL BE APPLICATIONS
3 WILL BE POSTED ONLINE GIVING WIDER ACCESS POWER THOSE WHO WANT
4 TO APPLY FOR PARATRANSIT. A THIRD AREA THAT YOU MIGHT SEE IS
5 WE'RE WORKING THROUGH RAMIFICATIONS OF LENGTHENING ELIGIBLE
6 WINDOW FOR 3 TO 5 YEARS, THIS WILL SAVE MONEY FOR AGENCIES AND
7 KNOW LESSEN RECERTIFICATION PROCESS BURDEN ON RIDERS AND THEN
8 A FOURTH ONE MAY BE RECOMMENDATION IDENTIFIED WHERE MTC CAN BE
9 OF ASSISTANCE IN OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES RELATED ACCESSING
10 PROFESSIONAL VERIFICATION SERVICES, ADEQUATE TRAINING TO
11 ELIGIBILITY WORKERS AND ALSO TRANSLATION SERVICES FOR
12 ELIGIBILITY DOCUMENTS. AND THEN FIFTH ONE LASTLY THERE MAY BE
13 RECOMMENDATION THAT DOVE TAIL NICELY WITH ANOTHER OF THE
14 ACTION TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ACTION, WHICH IS DESIGNATION
15 OF MOBILITY MANAGER IN EACH COUNTY AND THAT WAS ACTION ITEM 21
16 AND THIS WOULD BE INTEGRATED FOR RIDER EDUCATION AND ACCESS TO
17 OTHER MOBILITY OPTIONS WITHIN THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS, AND
18 THIS PROVIDES KEY INFORMATION ABOUT SERVICES THAT ARE IN SOME
19 CASES CHEAPER AND FASTER FOR CUSTOMERS. THE PROCESS HAVE
20 EXPRESSED OPTIMISM THAT WE WILL HAVE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WILL
21 IMPROVE THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS FOR ON YOU RIDERS FOR RIDERS
22 AND OUR AGENCIES AND WE WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THIS EFFORT IS
23 FOCUSED ON THE PROCESS NOT NECESSARILY STANDARDS AND TRYING TO
24 MAKE THE PROCESS MORE CONSISTENT THROUGHOUT THE AGENCIES AND



JUNE 12, 2023

1 WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO MAUREEN FOR UPDATES
2 REGARDING ACTION 25 AND 23:

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** DO YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

5

6 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I HAVE A CLARIFYING QUESTION, IT ALREADY IS THE
7 CASE THAT IF YOU ARE ELIGIBLE IN ONE COUNTY THE OTHER COUNTIES
8 RECOGNIZE YOUR ELIGIBILITY. HAS THAT BEEN STANDARDIZED OR A
9 SEPARATE ISSUE THAT WOULD BE ADDRESSED?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THAT IS THE STANDARD THAT YOU GET CERTIFIED IN ONE
12 COUNTY BUT THERE IS DIFFERENCES, SO, YOU KNOW, GIVING REAL
13 EXAMPLES. IF YOU ARE IN SANTA CLAIR COUNTY YOU MIGHT GO
14 THROUGH A DIFFERENT PROCESS THAN SOMEONE GOING THROUGH IN
15 SONOMA. RIGHT?

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** LOOKING FOR THE UPDATE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:**

20

21 **ALISON EDWARDS:** ALLISON EDWARDS CLIPPER STAFF. THIS HAS TO DO
22 WITH ACTION ITEM 25 AND CONTRACT WITH TRANSITE AS ELIGIBILITY
23 VERIFIER FOR THE RTC PROGRAM. APPLICANTS ARE VERIFIED FOR
24 ELIGIBILITY AGAINST PROGRAM GUIDELINES BY AN ELIGIBILITY
25 VERIFIER FOR THOSE RESPONSIBLE FOR MANAGING DAY-TO-DAY



JUNE 12, 2023

1 OPERATIONS AND CUSTOMER SERVICE FOR THE PROGRAM. THE CONTRACT
2 WE HAVE WITH OUR CURRENT ELIGIBILITY VERIFIER ENDS AUGUST
3 31ST. WE CONDUCTED A PROCUREMENT FOR A NEW VERIFIER IN
4 DECEMBER OF 2022 AND TRANSITE WAS SELECTED AND THE CLIPPER
5 EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVED THIS CONTRACT AT OUR MARCH 27TH
6 MEETING. A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF TRANSITE SCOPE OF WORK THEY WILL
7 MANAGE DAY-TO-DAY OPERATIONS AND CUSTOMER SERVICE FOR THE RTC
8 PROGRAM INCLUDING DATA ENTRY FOR APPLICATIONS, VERIFYING
9 ELIGIBILITY OF APPLICANTS, NOTIFYING APPLICANTS WHO DO NOT
10 QUALIFY FOR THE PROGRAM, ORDER OTHER CARDS FOR APPROVED
11 APPLICANTS, PARTICIPATING IN THE APPEALS PROCESS FOR
12 APPLICANTS THAT HAVE BEEN DENIED. COLLECTING FEES FOR
13 REPLACEMENT CARDS, MAINTAINING THE SECURITY OF ALL PERSONALLY
14 IDENTIFIABLE AND OTHER CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, AND
15 GENERATING REPORTS FOR THE PROGRAM. WE FELT THEY HAD A STRONG
16 PROPOSAL, ESPECIALLY AS IT RELATES TO THEIR EXPERIENCE WORKING
17 WITH THE CALIFORNIA VA HEALTH CARE SYSTEM, WHICH HAS A SIMILAR
18 CUSTOMER POPULATION TO THE RTC PROGRAM. THEY'RE ALSO A LOCAL
19 BUSINESS AND HAVE EXPERIENCE WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES IN
20 THE REGION, WHICH WE FELT GAVE THEM A PRETTY STRONG FOUNDATION
21 OF BOTH PUBLIC TRANSIT AND CLIPPER. WE WILL HAVE A TWO MONTH
22 OVERLAP PERIOD IN JULY AND AUGUST WHERE COUNTER VERIFIER WILL
23 CONTINUE THEIR SCOPE OF WORK WHILE WE TRAIN TRANSITE TO
24 OVERTAKE OPERATIONS ON SEPTEMBER 1ST. THOSE ARE MY REPUBLICAN
25 DATES RELATED TO THE CONTRACT. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY QUESTIONS ON THAT ITEM? RAVE

3

4 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES. THIS IS WARREN. I DO HAVE MORE OF A
5 COMMENT THAN A QUESTION. THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF DIFFICULTIES
6 AROUND THIS WHOLE ISSUE OF CLIPPER AND GETTING NEEDS MET IN
7 TERMS OF PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IN TERMS OF WHEN CARDS
8 EXPIRE, AND ALL KINDS OF PROCESSES THAT RELATE TO THE CLIPPER
9 PROCESS. SO, I DO HOPE THAT, A, THAT AS WE MOVE INTO THIS NEW
10 CONTRACT WE'RE GOING SEE A MAJOR IMPROVEMENT, AND, B, I HOPE
11 THAT WE WILL BE TROUBLESHOOTING SOME OF THESE PROBLEMS THAT
12 COME UP. ONE OF THE PROBLEM THAT I'M FACING RIGHT NOW, IS SOME
13 OF MY COLLEAGUES, AND EVEN CLOSE ASSOCIATES ARE RUNNING INTO
14 EXPIRED CLIPPER CARDS WHERE WE HAVE TO INVENT ALL KINDS OF NEW
15 WHEELS TO GET NEW CLIPPER CARDS. THAT'S ONE OF THE SYSTEMS
16 THAT NEEDS TO BE LOOKED AT. HOPEFULLY WE'LL SEE SOME
17 IMPROVEMENTS AND WE'LL HAVE A TRANSITIONAL PERIOD WHICH WILL
18 ASSIST PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IN MEETING THESE NEEDS. THANK
19 YOU.

20

21 **ALISON EDWARDS:** THANK YOU WARREN FOR THAT COMMENT. WE ARE
22 AWARE OF THE ISSUES THAT A LOT OF CUSTOMERS HAVE WITH
23 EXPIRATION AS IT RELATES TO THEIR RTC CARD AND WE'RE HAVING
24 CONVERSATIONS CURRENTLY ABOUT HOW TO BEST RESOLVE THOSE
25 ISSUES.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. LET'S SEE. ARE THERE ANY MORE UPDATE
3 ITEMS THAT YOU HAVE? OR ARE THOSE ALL THE UPDATE ITEMS?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** NO BUT NOW I GET TO TELL YOU ABOUT A CONTRACT FOR
6 TRAPEZE WHICH IS PARATRANSIT YOU HAVE A MEMO WHICH WAS
7 PRESENTED TO THE CLIPPER BOARD AND THAT'S PART OF THE SOLUTION
8 THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT. ITEM 23, THE ISSUE HAS BEEN
9 HISTORICALLY THAT CLIPPER TRANSIT AGENCIES PROVIDE PARATRANSIT
10 SERVICE BUT THE CLIPPER WAS NOT AVAILABLE ON THE VEHICLES
11 LARGELY IN PART BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MANY PARATRANSIT, GET
12 CALLS AND CLIPPER EQUIPMENT WAS VERY EXPENSIVE WE HAVE
13 OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE FAIR PAYMENT BE MADE THROUGH WHAT WE CALL
14 BACK OFFICE SYSTEM OR API SO THIS ALLOWS US TO ADD PARATRANSIT
15 SERVICES INTO THE CLIPPER FAMILY OF FARE PAYMENT AND SO THE
16 MEMO THAT YOU HAVE IN YOUR PACKET IS EXPLAINING TO CLIPPER
17 EXECUTIVE BOARD A NEED FOR FUNDING TO SUPPORT THE
18 IMPLEMENTATION OF A DESIGN FOR API PROJECT WITH TRAPEZE
19 ACTUALLY AT 13 OF THE AGENCIES THAT ARE PROVIDING PARATRANSIT
20 SERVICES TO EXECUTION OF THIS CONTRACT THE IMPLEMENTATION WILL
21 MEAN THAT PARATRANSIT USERS THROUGHOUT THE REGION WILL BE ABLE
22 TO CALL ORDER THEIR TRIP TO PROVIDE CLIPPER CARD NUMBER THEN
23 THEY WILL NOT NEED TO CARRY THEIR CARD ON THEIR PARATRANSIT
24 TRIP. THEIR CARD VALUE WILL BE DEDUCTED BASED ON THE
25 PARATRANSIT SERVICE, A GREAT OPPORTUNITY, WITH TRAPEZE BROUGHT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 ALL THE PARATRANSIT AGENCIES TOGETHER TALKING ABOUT THE NEED
2 FOR A REGIONAL SOLUTION.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A QUESTION SO SINCE THIS IS A
5 REQUIREMENT OF DEVELOPING AN API AND PROBABLY NOT SOMETHING
6 THAT CAN BE DONE IN FIVE MINUTES OR LESS IS THERE ANY THOUGHT
7 AS TO EXPECTATION THAT, SORT OF, THING GIVEN CLIPPER HAS A
8 RELEASE DATE NEXT SUMMER.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH CUBIC AND TRAPEZE ABOUT
11 THESE APIS FOR THE LAST 18 MONTHS, CUBIC HAS GIVEN US CLOSE TO
12 FINAL DESIGN DOCUMENTS AND WE EXPECT THAT AT THE POINT WHEN
13 THE TRAPEZE CONTRACT IS EXECUTED THIS SUMMER DESIGN DOCUMENTS
14 WILL BE AVAILABLE AND TRAPEZE WILL BE ABLE TO START WORK. IN
15 THE MEMO THERE IS A PILOT PROPOSED AT SFMTA THAT WILL HAPPEN
16 IN 202024 DURING CUSTOMER TRANSITION, SFMTA IS SO COMPLICATE
17 IF IT WORKS THERE IT WILL WORK ANYWHERE AND WILL ROLL OUT
18 AMONG TRAPEZE AGENCIES.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THE EXPLANATION YOU GAVE IN THE REPORT
21 HELPED ME DECIPHER WHAT WAS IN THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANY
22 OTHER QUESTIONS? I HAVE ONE MORE BUT WANT TO TAKE EVERYBODY
23 ELSE.

24



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** THIS IS WARREN, I DO HAVE -- I'LL STICK WITH
2 THIS PARTICULAR, ARE THE TRAPEZE ON ALL OF THIS PARATRANSIT
3 COORDINATION PIECE RIGHT NOW. I WANT TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS
4 ABOUT THIS. YOU KNOW, THERE IS SO MUCH TO DO AROUND
5 PARATRANSIT, SO MANY ASPECTS OF PARATRANSIT TO HAVE TO BEING
6 LOOKED AT, AND I WANT TO FIRST SAY THAT I'M GLAD THAT MTC IS
7 BEGINNING TO GRAPPLE WITH ALL OF THIS. BUT I DO THINK THAT WE
8 NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT AS WE MOVE FORWARD THROUGH THE PROCESS,
9 WE FIRST -- L WE DO TWO THINGS AT ONCE. WE CERTAINLY PLAN FOR
10 THE FUTURE, WE TRY AND PROVE FOR THE FUTURE, BUT WE ALSO NEED
11 TO THINK ABOUT THE PRESENT, AND I'M JUST NOT SURE, AS WE TALK
12 ABOUT CLIPPER 2.0 AND THE TRAPEZE ELEMENT ROLLING OUT IN THE
13 NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS, WE ALSO NEED TO THINK ABOUT HOW WE'RE
14 GOING TO DEAL WITH SOME OF THESE PRESENT SITUATIONS WITH
15 REGARD TO THE PARATRANSIT AGENCIES TALKING TO EACH OTHER, I
16 THINK THAT'S HELPFUL. WE HAD THIS WITH THE PANDEMIC WITH THE
17 DIFFERENT OPERATORS TALKING TO EACH OTHER. THE FACT
18 PARATRANSIT AGENCIES TON DO THAT IS HELPFUL. I THINK ONE OF
19 THE MISSING PIECES THOUGH IS THE INPUT FROM THE DISABILITY
20 COMMUNITY AROUND ALL OF THIS, AND, SO, TO THAT END, I THINK
21 WITH NUMBER 24, WHICH IS MUCH MORE OF A LONG-TERM COORDINATED
22 EFFORT, AND THE WHOLE SYSTEM BEING LOOKED AT, ONE OF THE
23 THINGS I HOPE HAPPENS IS A STRONG OUTREACH COMPONENT AND A
24 STRONG EFFORT BY MTC TO REALLY GET INTO THE DISABILITY
25 COMMUNITY AND DIALOGUE WITH THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY ABOUT HOW



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THIS -- HOW SOLUTIONS THAT WE MIGHT HAVE MIGHT IMPROVE THE
2 SYSTEMS. THERE ARE SOLUTIONS OUT THERE THAT AREN'T BEING
3 TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF ON DEMAND PARATRANSIT, SAME DAY
4 SERVICE. OTHER SOLUTIONS THAT I THINK FOLKS ARE ANXIOUS TO
5 TALK ABOUT. SO, I HOPE THAT, AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH ALL OF
6 THESE EFFORTS, THAT WE REALLY PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES WITHIN
7 THIS MATRIX FOR THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY TO REALLY NOT ONLY
8 INTERACT, BUT HAVE SOME THOUGHT THAT SOME OF WHAT MIGHT BE
9 SAID WILL ACTUALLY CARRY FORWARD TO IMPLEMENTATION. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SO, ONE OF MY QUESTIONS IS, ARE THERE ANY
12 CURRENT PLANS TO DO, AS MEMBER CUSHMAN HAS RECOMMENDED? AND IF
13 SO CAN YOU SHARE THAT?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** FAIR QUESTION. FROM THE CLIPPER PERSPECTIVE, WE ARE
16 REALLY MANAGING FARE PAYMENT AND WHILE WE WORK WITH THE
17 PARATRANSIT AGENCIES PROVIDING PARATRANSIT SERVICE, THE WORK
18 THEY DO WHETHER PROVIDING ON DEMAND SAME DAY TRIPS, I KNOW A
19 LOT OF THE TRIPS ARE IMPORTANT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I SUSPECT THAT MEMBER CUSHMAN WAS ALSO
22 TALKING ABOUT THINGS LIKE, IN ADDITION TO THE CLIPPER, THE '22
23 AND '24, ALSO THE BROADER SET OF PARATRANSIT COORDINATION.
24 WARREN WERE YOU TALKING ABOUT THE BROADER SET OR CLIPPER
25 SPECIFICALLY



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** ONE LEADS TO ANOTHER BUT ESSENTIALLY THE COMMENTS ARE
3 REALLY ABOUT THE BROADER SET AND HOW THAT BROADER SET FEEDS
4 INTO CLIPPER, AND I WANT TO HEAR FROM STAFF ABOUT WHAT I SAID
5 EARLIER, WHAT'S THE PROCESS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES TO
6 HAVE THAT INTERPLAY AND CONNECT AND FEEL LIKE THEY'RE BEING
7 HEARD. THAT WAS MY THOUGHT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S FAIR. IN SOME WAYS I'M NOT THE BEST PERSON TO
10 GIVE THE COMMITTEE RESPONSE THAT THE COMMITTEE IS ASKING FOR.
11 WHAT I CAN SAY IS THAT, YOU KNOW, MTC WORKS WITH SEVERAL
12 COMMITTEES INCLUDING THE SUBCOMMITTEE WITH THE BAY PAC, WHICH
13 IS AN ACCESSIBILITY COMMITTEE, THERE IS ALSO A BART
14 ACCESSIBILITY COMMITTEE AND TEA REGULATE AND SOLICIT FEEDBACK.
15 I ACKNOWLEDGE IT SOUNDS LIKE THERE IS MORE WORK WE CAN DO
16 WORKING DIRECTLY WITH THE COMMUNITY ABOUT SERVICES AND HOW WE
17 COULD IMPROVE OUR SERVICES. I WILL ACKNOWLEDGE THAT AND KIND
18 OF MOVE ON. I THINK MTC GENERALLY IS LOOKING FOR ACTION STEPS
19 THERE ARE FOUR TOTAL, RIGHT? THEY ARE A PACKAGE OF HOW THE
20 REGION CAN BE PROVIDING THE SAME SERVICES PROVIDING THE SAME
21 ELIGIBILITY ACROSS PROGRAMS EITHER DISCOUNT PROGRAM WITHIN
22 FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT AND CLIPPER VERSUS ADA PARATRANSIT WHICH
23 IS NOT PART OF FIXED ROUTE AND HAS DIFFERENT SET OF LAWS SO
24 IT'S COMPLICATE WE'RE TRYING TO STANDARDIZE AND GET INPUT FROM
25 THE COMMUNITY AND I THINK SOMETIMES I FEEL LIKE IT'S HARD TO



JUNE 12, 2023

1 GET ALL THE VOICES TOGETHER AND I'LL GO BACK TO THAT WE NEED
2 TO DO A LITTLE BIT MORE POSSIBLY BASED ON THAT COMMENT WE ARE
3 LOOKING AT HOW THERE CAN BE A UNIFORM PLATFORM MAPPING
4 SERVICES AND CREATING TRIPS, SORT OF, A ONE TRIP PILOT FOR
5 EXAMPLE, OR CONSIDERING BOOKING SOFTWARE SOLUTION THAT IS
6 ACTUALLY THE SAME ACROSS AGENCIES BECAUSE WHILE YOU'RE LOOKING
7 AT THE MEMO HERE FOR TRAPEZE IT'S NOT ONLY PARATRANSIT BOOKING
8 SOFTWARE IN THE REGION. SO THIS IS ALL PART OF THE PROCESS.

9

10 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH, RELATED TO THAT, I THINK IT WOULD
11 BE HELPFUL TO BRING BACK TO -- I THINK THIS CAME TO THIS
12 COMMITTEE BECAUSE IT GOT BUMPED FROM AN EQUITY AND ACCESS
13 SUBCOMMITTEE WHERE IT WAS ORIGINALLY SCHEDULED, SO IF IT CAN
14 BE BROUGHT TO THE APPROPRIATE COMMITTEE, LIKE, WHAT'S THE
15 PROCESS OF DOING THAT OUTREACH TO DISABILITY COMMUNITIES ABOUT
16 THE SET OF ITEMS NOT JUST THE CLIPPER ONE, I THINK THAT WOULD
17 BE HELPFUL AND GIVE PEOPLE WITH THAT KNOWLEDGE THE ABILITY TO
18 GIVE FEEDBACK ON WHAT THAT PLAN IS, AS WELL. AND RELATED
19 QUESTION TO THAT IS MTC STAFF WORKING WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER
20 WICKS STAFF? I KNOW THERE WAS THE A.B. 540 BILL THAT SHE
21 TURNED INTO A TWO-YEAR BILL ABOUT CHANGES TO THE, THE CTSA
22 LAWS, AND I'M WONDERING IF MTC IS WORKING AND PERHAPS BRINGING
23 ANY OF THAT ITS LEARNING OR PLANNING TO LEARN UNDER ITS PILOT
24 TO THAT LEGISLATIVE DEVELOPMENT?

25



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **MELANIE CHOY:** I'LL CHIME IN ON THIS, MELANIE CHOY, MTC STAFF.
2 IN TERMS OF ADDRESSING ALL OF THESE ISSUES WE HAVE ISSUED THIS
3 BODY OF WORK UNDER NELSON NYGAARD'S CONTRACT. DRENNEN HAS BEEN
4 PRESENTING TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE AND THE
5 REASON IT'S BEING PRESENTED HERE IS THAT PERIODICALLY WE WANT
6 TO MAKE SURE THE LINKAGE BETWEEN ALL ACTION PLAN WORK IS
7 BROUGHT TO THIS BODY TO TIE EVERYTHING TOGETHER BUT DRENNAN
8 DOES REPORT AND INTERACT WITH THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
9 SUBCOMMITTEE, TO HAVE TIMELY DIALOGUE WITH THE EQUITY AND
10 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IN CERTAIN FEEDBACK AND PERSPECTIVES AND
11 PROGRESS ON THIS SET OF PROJECTS. ONE OF THE THINGS IN TERMS
12 OF THIS WORK PROGRAM IS THAT THERE IS A LOT BEING DONE HERE,
13 AND WE'RE STAGING IT SO THAT ACTION 25 IS THE ONE THAT WE ARE
14 FOCUSED ON. IT IS -- THE FEEDBACK THAT WE HAVE RECEIVED, AND
15 THAT DRENNEN HAS RECEIVED HAS BEEN QUITE ROBUST, AND THAT'S
16 THE THING WALKING INTO THIS THAT THEY'RE ADVANCING OTHER
17 ELEMENTS BUT IN TERMS OF THE WORK COMING OUT OF 25 THERE ARE
18 LINKAGES SUCH AS THE MOBILITY MANAGER AND TO THE DEGREE
19 RECOMMENDATIONS CALL OUT THE LINKAGES I THINK YOU WILL SEE IN
20 THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT ARE FORTHCOMING TO THE EQUITY AND
21 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IN THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS. IN TERMS OF
22 COMMENT ON INPUT, DRENNEN HAS DONE A SIGNIFICANT WORK WITH
23 NELSON NYGAARD IN TERMS OF CONSIDERING REACHING OUT TO THE
24 AGENCIES, AS WELL AS TRYING TO PULL IN AND BUILD IN THAT TIME
25 TO REACH OUT TO A LOT OF THE -- I DO NOT KNOW EXACTLY WHICH



JUNE 12, 2023

1 GROUPS BUT PROBABLY INCLUDES PTCS AND SOME OTHER GROUPS AS
2 WELL, BUT BECAUSE THE WORK IS -- THERE HAS BEEN QUITE A BIT OF
3 INPUT, I THINK THAT THAT PROCESS OR THE TIMELINE FOR THAT
4 INPUT MAYBE HASN'T COME YET. IT'S FORTHCOMING. THE
5 RECOMMENDATIONS TOOK A LITTLE BIT LONGER, BUT PLANNING TO GO
6 OUT WITH THOSE SHORTLY. IN TERMS OF THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
7 SUBCOMMITTEE NEXT MONTHS WE WILL LOOP BACK WITH DRENNEN AND
8 SHE CAN PROVIDE AN UPDATE IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE ADDITIONAL
9 INPUT AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR SEEKING INPUT FROM THE COMMUNITY.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR
12 QUESTIONS ABOUT THESE ITEMS FROM FOLKS THIS BODY OR IN THE
13 ROOM OR ON REMOTE PARTICIPATION? IF NOT DO WE HAVE ANY
14 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM THROUGH PUBLIC COMMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
18 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON
19 THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO MTC STAFF FOR
22 COMING IN AND PRESENTING THE UPDATE, AND I HAVE A -- AND ONE
23 QUESTION HERE, IS THE CLIPPER TWO IS GOING TO HAVE OPEN
24 PAYMENT, ARE THERE PEOPLE THAT YOU USE THE PARATRANSIT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 SERVICES THAT WOULD WANT TO PAY WITH A CREDIT CARD AND WILL IT
2 WORK WITH THOSE PAYMENT METHODS TOO?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES. I'M TRYING TO THINK IF I CAN TECHNICALLY
5 DESCRIBE THIS. OPEN PAYMENT METHOD YES THEY COULD PROVIDE
6 THEIR CREDIT CARD NUMBER IN LIEU OF THEIR CLIPPER CARD NUMBER
7 WHEN THEY ARE BOOKING THERE ARE PARATRANSIT TRIP.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. NOW MOVING TO ITEM FIVE, TWIT
10 2050 DRAFT GOALS AND NETWORK DEFINITION WHERE WE WILL GET AN
11 UPDATE FROM KARA FROM MTC, AND ANDY OF AC TRANSIT TO HEAR AN
12 EAGERLY ANTICIPATED ITEM TO HEAR ABOUT THE DRAFT GOALS AND
13 NETWORK DEFINITION FOR TRANSIT 2050 PLUS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR LEVIN AND WE ALSO
16 HAVE DAVE VAUTIN HERE ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR THE REGIONAL
17 MAJOR PLANS REGION NAN PLANNING PROGRAM. GREAT. THANK YOU. WE
18 HAVE A PRESENTATION FOR YOU TODAY. SO IF WE COULD PULL THAT
19 UP? FANTASTIC I'M GOING TO GET STARTED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO
20 TODAY WE'RE GOING TO START WITH A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF TRANSIT
21 2050 PLUS. AND THEN REALLY FOCUS IN MORE DETAIL AND TASKS
22 SINCE WE CAME TO THIS COMMITTEE IN MARCH OF THIS YEAR,
23 SPECIFICALLY DEVELOPMENT OF A DRAFT PROBLEM STATEMENT DRAFT
24 THE GOALS AND DESIRED OUTCOMES AND INITIAL DRAFT NETWORK
25 DEFINITION. PLEASED TO INTRODUCE OUR COPROJECT MANAGER ANDY



JUNE 12, 2023

1 WHO IS WITH US TODAY HE'S GOING TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF OUR
2 WORK WITH OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM WHICH CONSISTS OF STAFF
3 FROM THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AND TELL YOU MORE ABOUT THE
4 STATEMENT GOALS AND OUTCOMES IN NETWORK DEFINITION. AN
5 OVERVIEW OF WHAT'S COMING NEXT, AND THEN WE'LL HAVE
6 OPPORTUNITY FOR QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
7 ALL RIGHT. SO, I WANT TO START WITH TALKING ABOUT THE TRANSIT
8 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, ACTION INCOME 18 INCLUDED
9 DEVELOPMENT OF A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN FOR THE BAY AREA. AND
10 MTC BEGAN WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS LAST YEAR IN 2022
11 TO DEVELOP AN INITIAL APPROACH AND SCOPE. THEN IN THE FALL OF
12 2022, MTC STAFF PROPOSED APPLYING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING
13 APPROACH TO THE FORTHCOMING PLANNED BAY AREA UPDATE, PLANNED
14 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. THIS FORTHCOMING PLANNED BAY AREA UPDATE,
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS A LIMITED AND FOCUSED UPDATE OF,
16 FOR THE MOST PART, OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGIES FOR
17 HOUSING, THE ENVIRONMENT, THE ECONOMY, AND FOR TRANSPORTATION,
18 EXCEPT FOR THE PLANS SIX TRANSIT RELATED STRATEGIES. AND SO
19 WHEN WE'RE PROPOSING IS THAT UNDER TRANSIT 2050 PLUS, WE WILL
20 DO A MUCH MORE COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE OF THE FIXED TRANSIT
21 RELATED STRATEGIES USING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING APPROACH
22 THAT WILL ENABLE US TO ADDRESS THE SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT NEEDS
23 AND CHALLENGES IN THE REGION. AND, AGAIN, THE PLANNING HORIZON
24 FOR BOTH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND FOR TRANSIT 2050 PLUS
25 IS 2025 THROUGH 2050. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHEN WE CAME TO YOU



JUNE 12, 2023

1 IN MARCH WE PROVIDED A PRELIMINARY OVERVIEW OF THE WORK. I
2 WANT TO PROVIDE A QUICK REMINDER OF THAT. IN 2023, SO, THE
3 SPRING -- OR STARTING IN THE SPRING, WE WORKED -- WE DEVELOPED
4 DRAFT GOALS, OUTCOMES AND NETWORK DEFINITION WHICH WE'RE
5 PRESENTING TO YOU TODAY. OUR NEXT STEP IS TO MOVE FORWARD THEN
6 WITH USING THAT AS A FRAMEWORK TO EXPLORE NEEDS, GAPS, AND
7 OPPORTUNITIES. AT THE SAME TIME OUR CONSULTANT THAT WE'RE
8 GOING TO BE RECOMMENDING AND THAT IS GOING TO THE ADMIN
9 COMMITTEE ON WEDNESDAY WILL BE STARTING WITH THE PERFORMANCE
10 ASSESSMENT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA AND TRANSIT 2050 PLUS. AND
11 MOST OF OUR LARGE PROJECTS IN PLANNED BAY AREA ARE TRANSIT
12 PROJECTS, SO THAT'S ONE OF THE MAIN REASONS WHY THE CONSULTANT
13 THAT WE'RE HIGHER FOR TRANSIT 50 PLUS IS GOING TO BE
14 CONDUCTING THE PERFORMANCE, THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE
15 ASSESSMENT. SO, THAT WORK WILL START THEN THIS SUMMER ONCE WE
16 GET OUR CONSULTANT UNDER CONTRACT. WE'LL THEN MOVE INTO THE
17 NEXT STEP OF DEVELOPING TRANSIT NETWORK CONCEPTS AND WE'LL USE
18 THE RESULTS OF THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IN TERMS OF
19 UNDERSTANDING, ESPECIALLY FOR LARGE MAJOR TRANSIT INVESTMENTS,
20 USING THAT TO INFORM DEVELOPMENT OF THOSE TRANSIT NETWORK
21 CONCEPTS. THEN MOVING INTO THE SPRING OF 2024, WE'LL ALSO BE
22 DOING AN ASSESSMENT, A SIMILAR ASSESSMENT, NOT JUST FOR
23 PROJECTS, BUT FOR THOSE INDIVIDUAL NETWORK CONCEPTS USING THAT
24 INFORMATION TO RECOMMEND A DRAFT FINAL TRANSIT NETWORK CONCEPT
25 THAT WILL THEN COME BACK AND BE REVIEWED. WE'LL GET INPUT ON



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THAT AND THEN HAVE A FINAL RECOMMENDED NETWORK CONCEPT THAT
2 ESSENTIALLY WILL COMPRISE THE STRATEGIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA
3 2050 PLUS AND THEN WILL BE FOLDED INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IN SUMMER OF 2024. THEN THE NEXT
5 STEP FOR TRANSIT 25 PLUS AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS KIND OF
6 MAKES ITS WAY THROUGH THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROCESS, IN 2025, TO
7 DEVELOP A SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT SO THAT WILL DOCUMENT OUR
8 PROCESS FOR DEVELOPING TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND TRANSIT 2050
9 PLUS IT WILL ALSO PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLORE SOME
10 IMPLEMENTATION, OTHER ADDITIONAL IDEAS, INVESTMENTS,
11 PRIORITIES, THAT MAY NOT HAVE FIT WITHIN THE ANTICIPATED
12 REVENUE ENVELOPE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. SO, WITH THAT,
13 I'M GOING ON TURN IT OVER TO ANDY TO GIVE YOU THE REST OF THE
14 UPDATE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CARE A HAPPY TO BE HERE. IF YOU CAN GO TO
17 THE NEXT SLIDE. I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT
18 TEAM FOR 2050 PLUS. SO, I STARTED ON THIS ABOUT TWO MONTHS
19 AGO, AND WE HAD 8:00 PMT MEMBERS BETWEEN THE SEVEN ALLERGY BAY
20 AREA AGENCIES, AND THEN ONE FROM THE SMALL TRANSIT OPERATORS.
21 WITHIN THE LAST TWO MONTHS WE CAN EXPANDED BEYOND WHAT'S
22 LISTED ON THE SLIDE HERE. WE HAVE SEVEN REPRESENTATIVES FROM
23 THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM ALSO HAVE FOUR FROM THE SMALL
24 TRANSIT OPERATORS AS WELL. WE HAVE ACCOMPLISHED A LOT OVER THE
25 LAST SIX WEEKS. THIS WAS REALLY -- WE HAD AN IN-PERSON WORKING



JUNE 12, 2023

1 SESSION HERE AT THE MTC OFFICES, ON MAY 3RD, AND THAT'S WHY WE
2 STARTED PROGRESS ON MAKING SURE WE WERE DRAFTING OUR DRAFT
3 PROBLEM STATEMENT, MADE A LOT OF PROGRESS THERE, SAME WITH THE
4 GOALS, OUTCOMES, AND NETWORK DEFINITION ALL OF THESE WILL GO
5 OVER ON SUBSEQUENT SLIDES. AND THE TEAM HAD A BIG PART IN THE
6 OUR CONSULTANT SELECTION AND AS KARA MENTIONED COMING TO THE
7 MTC ADMIN COMMITTEE ON WEDNESDAY. SO, IN ADDITION HAVING THIS
8 GROUP DOING OUR IN-PERSON WORKING SESSION MAY 3RD WE ALSO HAVE
9 REGULAR MEETINGS EVERY OTHER THURSDAY. WE'RE EXPANDING THE
10 LENGTH OF THOSE BECAUSE OF JUST THE GREAT FEEDBACK THAT WE GET
11 FROM THEM IN EVERYTHING THAT WE'RE DEVELOPING HERE, AND I SEE
12 IT AS MY ROLE TO MAKE SURE WE'RE REPRESENTING ALL OF THE
13 TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE BAY AREA, NOT JUST THE LARGE ONES MAKE
14 WE HAVE DONE A GOOD JOB MAKING SURE WE HAVE IT RIGHT FOLKS IN
15 THE PMT, AND I'M HAPPY WITH THE GROUP WE HAVE AT SFMTA, LIZ
16 DYSON WHO IS THE LONG RANGE TRANSIT COORDINATOR PLANNING
17 MANAGER, FROM GOLDEN GATE, AND WE HAVE DAVID DAVEN PORT WHO IS
18 THE PRINCIPLE PLANNER FROM BART WE HAVE HANNAH, WHO IS
19 STRATEGIC PLANNING POLICY GROUP MANAGER AND ALTERNATE ALSO
20 FROM BART WE HAVE JUMANA, WHO IS THE MANAGER OF ACCESS
21 PROGRAMS FROM CALTRAIN WE HAVE DEPUTY OF POLICY AND
22 DEVELOPMENT FROM VTA JAY TYREE SERVICE PLANNING AND
23 SCHEDULING, SAMTRANS. WE HAVE MILLIE TOLSON ACTING PLANNING
24 DIRECTOR, WE HAVE AC TRANSIT MY HOME AGENCY, ROCKET, WHOSE IS
25 THE DIRECTOR OF SERVICE DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING FROM MARIN



JUNE 12, 2023

1 TRANSIT, WE HAVE KATHLEEN SULLIVAN DIRECTOR OF PLANNING FROM
2 AT THE VINE AND NAPA WE HAVE REBECCA SHANK, PROGRAM MANAGER OF
3 PUBLIC TRANSIT FROM COUNTY CONNECTION MALLORY DIRECTOR OF
4 PLANNING MARKETING AND INNOVATION THEN OUR NEWEST MEMBER TRI
5 DELTA TRANSIT, TONE TRAN WHO IS THE CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER SO
6 AGAIN REALLY ACCOMPLISHED SPREAD OUT GROUP AND THEY HAVE
7 HELPED US DEVELOP A PROBLEM STATEMENT GOALS AND OUTCOMES
8 NETWORK DEFINITION AND CONSULTANT SELECTION AS WELL. WE'LL GO
9 OVER -- WE HAVE SPENT OUR BIWEEKLY MEETINGS GOING OVER
10 FEEDBACK ON OUTPUTS AND DELIVERABLES WE WILL BE TALKING MORE
11 ABOUT CONSULTANT ORDERS AS WE GET TO THAT POINT IN
12 COORDINATION WITH TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF AS NEEDED. NEXT
13 SLIDE. THIS TALKS A LITTLE BIT ABOUT WHAT WE HAVE ACCOMPLISHED
14 -- CAN YOU HIT FORWARD ON A COUPLE OF THESE? GO BACK ONE?
15 THAT'S INTERESTING. ELECTRIC,

16

17 **SPEAKER:** ONE GOAL. VERY FOCUSED.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THERE IS THE TWO PAGE GOAL DOCUMENT THAT ACTUALLY HAS
20 THE GOALS AND THE MEASURES.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'LL SAY THIS AHEAD OF TIME, THIS SLIDE, VERY
23 SIMPLISTIC SLIDE IS THE PRESENTATION OF THE GOALS AND PROBLEM
24 STATEMENTS WE HAVE, THE FULL PROBLEM STATEMENT, FULL GOALS
25 LISTED SO PLEASE TAKE A LOOK AT THOSE WHEN YOU GET A CHANCE.



JUNE 12, 2023

1 BUT THE FOUR GOALS THAT WE HAVE, GOAL ONE DEVELOP AN
2 INTEGRATED WELL CONNECTED TRANSIT NETWORK THE ONE THING YOU
3 SEE LISTED UP THERE. WE HAVE CONNECTED ELEMENTS OF THE PROBLEM
4 STATEMENT WITH THAT, WITH THE HELP OF THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT
5 TEAM SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT
6 WE DEVELOPED AND SOME OF KEY THINGS THAT THE PMT HELPED ADD TO
7 THAT WAS MAKING SURE THAT OUR PROBLEM STATEMENT WAS ONE VERY
8 RIDER FOCUSED, AND, IN ADDITION THAT, WE WANTED TO MAKE SURE
9 THAT WE WEREN'T FOCUSING THE FULL PROBLEM STATEMENT ON THE
10 COVID-19 PANDEMIC. OBVIOUSLY THAT IS A HUGE ELEMENT OF A LOSS
11 OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, BUT FRANK HE, IT'S A LOSS OF TRANSIT
12 RIDERSHIP STARTED WELL BEFORE THAT THROUGH 2021. OBVIOUSLY
13 COVID EXACERBATED THAT BUT IF WE'RE NOT DISCUSSING THAT WE'RE
14 MISSING THE FULL PICTURE THERE. THAT IS PART OF OUR PROBLEM
15 STATEMENT, THAT ELEMENT, AND AGAIN MAKING SURE IT'S VERY RIDER
16 FOCUSED SO THE GOAL COME FROM THAT AGAIN DEVELOP AN INTEGRATED
17 WELL CONNECTED TRANSIT NETWORK. OUR SECOND GOAL WHICH YOU WILL
18 SEE WITH THE HAND OUT RECOVER AND GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND
19 MODE SHARE. THIRD GOAL IMPROVE RELIABILITY AND AVERAGE TRAVEL
20 SPEED OF TRANSIT SERVICE, AND THEN THE FOURTH GO REDUCING
21 THOSE BARRIERS TO TRANSIT, AND WE KNOW THAT WITH THE WAY THAT
22 THE BAY AREA IS DEVELOPED AND CERTAIN LOW DENSITY AREAS, IT'S
23 HARD TO BE ALWAYS COMPETITIVE WITH THE AUTOMOBILE IN CERTAIN
24 LOCATIONS. BUT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE EVEN IN THOSE AREAS THAT
25 WE ARE SERVING THE BEST WE CAN, DISADVANTAGED AND VULNERABLE



JUNE 12, 2023

1 POPULATIONS. APOLOGIES THIS SLIDE DID NOT COME THROUGH IN THE
2 WAY WE INTENDED BUT YOU SHOULD HAVE THE INFORMATION YOU NEED
3 IN THE SUBSEQUENT MEMOS. IF WE COULD LET'S GO TO THE NEXT
4 SLIDE. THE THIRD ELEMENT THAT I MENTIONED THAT WE TALKED ABOUT
5 WITH OUR IN-PERSON WORKING SESSION ON MAY 3RD IS THE TRANSIT
6 NETWORK DEFINITION. SO, THIS IS ALL ABOUT WHAT ARE THE TYPES
7 OF SERVICES, TYPES OF ROUTES THAT WOULD BE INCORPORATED WITHIN
8 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS. NOW BECAUSE THIS IS PART OF PLANNED BAY
9 AREA 2050 PLUS WE'RE CONSIDERING EVERYTHING BUT FROM A
10 PLANNING PERSPECTIVE WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT IS THE BOTTOM THREE
11 THINGS ON THE SLIDE, HIGH CAPACITY LOCAL SERVICE, VTA, RAIL
12 LINES, AC TRANSIT TEMPLE LINE THOSE TYPES OF ROUTES, THE
13 REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICES, RAIL, FERRY, EXPRESS BUS, AND THEN
14 INTER-REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE. SO THIS MIGHT BE LESS ALONG
15 THE LINES OF WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT ACE MAKE MAJOR CHANGES TO
16 THE WAY THEIR SCHEDULE WORKS BUT WE CERTAINLY HAVE TO
17 INCORPORATE THEM IN THE WAY WE THINK ABOUT A CONNECTED
18 NETWORK. WE HAVE AT THE TOP COMMUNITY -- LOCAL AND COMMUNITY
19 TRANSIT SERVICES, AND WE BELIEVE FROM A PLANNING PERSPECTIVE.
20 THAT LOCAL AGENCIES WILL UNDERSTAND HOW TO PLAN THEIR LOCAL
21 SERVICE BETTER THAN US AT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
22 COMMISSION OR ME AT A HIGHER LEVEL WOULD BUT OF COURSE IT WILL
23 BE INCORPORATED WITH A PLAN FROM A FUNDING PERSPECTIVE. NEXT
24 SLIDE. ALL NEXT STEPS ARE THERE. GREAT. I WAS WORRIED. JUNE
25 AND JULY, THAT'S IT. WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON IN SHORT-TERM IS



JUNE 12, 2023

1 REFINING FINALIZING DRAFT PROBLEM STATEMENT, GOALS AND
2 OUTCOMES, IT SAYS PURPOSE STATEMENT SHOULD BE PROBLEM
3 STATEMENT. WE'RE LOOKING AT FOUR AVENUES FOR THAT IN SHORT-
4 TERM SO I PRESENTED TO THE LARGE AGENCY GMS GM'S LAST WEEK AT
5 THEIR MEETINGS WE'RE OBVIOUSLY PRESENTING HERE TODAY WE'RE
6 PRESENTING AT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON WEDNESDAY SO
7 THOSE ARE THE KIND OF FOUR AVENUES THAT WE'RE WORKING, PROBLEM
8 STATEMENT GOALS, OUTCOMES AND TRANSIT NETWORK DEFINITIONS THEN
9 OF COURSE WE TALKED ABOUT THE COMPLETING CONSULTANT SELECTION
10 EXECUTING THE INITIAL TASK ORDERS AND THEN JULY THROUGH
11 SEPTEMBER WE CONDUCT OUR FIRST ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT
12 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND TRANSIT 2050 PLUS THIS IS GOING
13 TO INCLUDE PROBABLY AROUND IN ORDER OF ABOUT 15 POP-UPS
14 THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTIES AND IN ADDITION SURVEY THEN WE
15 ALSO PARTNER WITH DRENNEN SHELTON AT MTC BASED ON HER FEEDBACK
16 SHE IS WORKING ON THE TRANSPORTATION HUMAN SERVICES
17 COORDINATED PLAN SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT DUPLICATING
18 THAT WORK AND OUTREACH WITH PARATRANSIT GROUPS COORDINATING
19 COUNCILS, LIGHTHOUSE FOR THE BLIND, INDEPENDENT LIVING
20 RESOURCE CENTERS, WE'RE GOING TO BE WORKING CLOSELY WITH
21 DRENNEN SHELTON WE MET WITH HER ALREADY, AND WE'LL CONDUCT
22 ANALYSIS ON OUR EXISTING CONDITIONS NEEDS AND GAPS ANALYSIS
23 I'M EXCITED TO WORK ON THIS WITH THE CONSULTANT AND BEGIN THE
24 WORK ON THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND THEN THE LAST
25 POINT, LISTED THROUGH NOVEMBER, NOVEMBER, DEVELOPING A TRANSIT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 NETWORK CONCEPT ADVANCE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. SO I'M
2 EXCITED TO BE PART OF THIS TEAM I'M EXCITED TO WORK WITH TAR
3 KARA AND DAVE. I THINK I'LL TURN IT BACK TO ADINA

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE SOME QUESTIONS BUT WE'LL WANT TO
6 TAKE QUESTIONS FROM OTHER MEMBERS. IF PEOPLE ARE STILL
7 CONTEMPLATING -- OKAY. SURE. SO, FIRST OF ALL, IT'S VERY
8 EXCITING TO HEAR ABOUT THIS MOVING FORWARD, AND IN PARTICULAR,
9 ALSO HAVING THE MTC STAFF WORKING CLOSELY WITH THE KEY PEOPLE
10 AT THE DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES WHOSE JOB IT IS TO ALSO DO
11 THIS SO THAT THERE IS A CONVERSATION ABOUT HOW TO DO THIS AND
12 NOT, OH, HERE'S A LITTLE TEAM OF PEOPLE WORKING ON IT AT MTC,
13 AND PEOPLE AT TRANSIT AGENCIES GOING OH, WHAT'S THAT. SEEMS
14 LIKE IT'S HAPPENING ON AN IN A MUCH BETTER WAY. SO IT'S GREAT.
15 GLAD TO HEAR IT. ONE QUESTION I HAD IN TERMS OF THE
16 CATEGORIZATION OF THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF SERVICES, IF YOU WANT
17 TO BRING THAT SLIDE BACK, IS THIS --

18

19 **SPEAKER:** SLIDE SEVEN.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. SO, DOES THIS INCLUDE A
22 CONSIDERATION OF HOW TO USE SOME OF THE LOCAL TRANSIT AS
23 FEEDER CONNECTIONS TO MORE OF THE REGIONAL AND SUBREGIONAL
24 BACK LINES

25



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HOPEFULLY THIS GETS TO YOUR QUESTION, IF NOT KARA CAN
2 TAKE OVER. WE HAD AN ADDITIONAL CATEGORY WE CALLED IT
3 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT LOCAL AND IT REALLY COVERED THE IDEA OF
4 WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. THAT WOULD BE A PART OF TRANSIT
5 2050, AND TRANSIT 2050 PLUS AND THE WAY WE THINK ABOUT THE
6 SYSTEM, AND THOSE INCORPORATED INTO CATEGORIES SPECIFICALLY
7 WITH THE EXISTING SYSTEM, GTFIS PLUS GOING INTO THE 511 SYSTEM.
8 SO IT WOULD BE ALL ENCOMPASSING. WHAT WE DETERMINED IS OUR
9 ABLE TO FIGURE OUT WHAT ROUTES MEET THAT CRITERIA WAS BOTH TOO
10 COMPLICATE AND MAYBE NOT AS NECESSARY AT LEAST WHAT WE WOULD
11 LIKE IT TO BE -- I SAW YOUR EYES LIFT THERE. NOT IN THE SAME
12 WAY, WHAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE TRANSIT DEFINITION NETWORK
13 RIGHT NOW IN HIGH CAPACITY LOCAL TRANSIT WE'RE NOT TRYING TO
14 GET INTO EVERY NITTY-GRITTY SAYING THAT LIKE THIS ROUTE JUST
15 HAS ENOUGH RIDERSHIP TO QUALIFY OR IT HAD MAYBE A BUNCH OF
16 ROUTES IN SAN FRANCISCO AND THEN SOMETHING IN NAPA WOULDN'T
17 QUALIFY BECAUSE IT DIDN'T HAVE THAT KIND OF RIDERSHIP WE ARE
18 THINKING ABOUT THE CONNECTED NETWORK AND TEMPO OR LIKELY RAIL
19 IN SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN JOSE OR EVEN CCR IN SAMTRANS, IS
20 DISQUALIFYING LIKE THAT, NOT RAPID BUT, SOME OF THE ELEMENTS
21 OF RAPID BUS BUT IT'S SUCH A TRUNK LINE WE WOULD BE REMISS NOT
22 TO CONSIDER IT AS PART OF THIS PLAN AS WELL:

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I'M GOING TO TURN THAT INTO A COMMENT
25 BECAUSE I THINK IT MAY TAKE MULTIPLE ITERATIONS TO GET TO



JUNE 12, 2023

1 SOMETHING THAT IS GOOD BUT I THINK THAT THE DISCUSSION ABOUT
2 THAT TOPIC SHOULD NOT BE WHETHER, IT SHOULD BE HOW. IN
3 CONVERSATIONS WITH COMMUNITY MEMBERS IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE
4 REGION THAT ARE NOT NECESSARILY IN THE DENSE PARTS SAN
5 FRANCISCO WHERE YOU HAVE TWO MINUTE SERVICE ANYWAY BUT IN
6 SUNNYVALE MOUNTAIN VIEW PEOPLE WILL SAY MY PROBLEM IS THE LAST
7 MILE SERVICE HOW DO WE GET SOME LOCAL BUS SERVICE TO BE
8 EFFECTIVELY SERVING THAT LAST MILE PURPOSE. AND.

9

10 **GERRY GLASER:** WHO IS ON THIS BODY BUT NOT ABLE TO MAKE IT
11 TODAY HAS THIS ANECDOTE WHERE HE WAS TRYING TO GET TO THIS
12 MEETING AND HIS BUS HAD A TWO MINUTE OFFSET IN THE DIRECTION
13 OF THE FERRY SO THERE WAS NO WAY FOR HIM TO MAKE THE FOR
14 CONNECTION. IF WE GO THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS
15 WITHOUT ANY EFFORT AT ALL IN IMPROVING THOSE FIRST LAST MILE
16 CONNECTIONS I THINK WOULD BEING A HUGE LOSS. AND I DO
17 UNDERSTAND, OKAY, WHAT IS OUR GRAND SCHEME STANDARD FIRST TIME
18 AROUND MIGHT BE OVERKILL AND HAVING SOMEONE SAY THOU SHALT
19 PICK THE LOCAL BUS FOR THE THING THAT SERVICES THE FEEDER
20 SERVICE IS PROBABLY OVERKILL AT THIS POINT, BUT DOING SOME
21 LEVEL OF FIRST PASS AND IDENTIFYING WHICH LOCAL ROUTES MIGHT
22 MEET THOSE CRITERIA AND ALSO MAKES ELIGIBLE AS FUNDING WE'RE
23 LOOKING TO BRING IN FUNDING THROUGH THE PLANNED BAY AREA CYCLE
24 TO BE ABLE TO RUN IT FREQUENTLY ENOUGH TO SERVE THAT ROLE I
25 THINK WOULD BE REALLY POWERFUL SO I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THAT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 COMMENT. >DAVE VAUTIN: IF I MAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR, A COUPLE
2 OF THOUGHTS HOW THIS IS BROUGHT UP TO CLARIFY -- I WISH WE HAD
3 THE DIAGRAM ON THE SCREEN HERE -- BUT CLARIFICATION EVERY
4 SINGLE ROUTE IN THE REGION WILL BE IN THE TRANSIT EXIST PLUS,
5 WE THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE THAT THE PLANNING WORK DONE ON THOSE
6 BE DONE BY THE LOCAL OPERATOR AND SUBMITTED FOR CONSIDERATION
7 AS PART OF THE NETWORK CONCEPT IN THIS PLAN. WE THINK AS ANDY
8 WAS SAYING CORRECTLY, IT'S APPROPRIATE FOR US TO BE PLANNING
9 ALL THE LOCAL ROUTES IN THE REGION BUT SOME KEY ROUTES MERIT
10 ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS AND THAT'S WHAT THIS MATERIAL ON THE RIGHT
11 SIDE IS SAYING. THE OTHER THING I THINK IS IMPORTANT TO POINT
12 OUT IS THAT PHOTO AT THE BOTTOM SAYS WE SEE THIS DEFINITION
13 FOR PLANNING PURPOSES ONLY. DIFFERENT TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
14 ACTION PLAN EFFORTS MAY VERY CORRECTLY INVEST IN, SAY, SIGNAGE
15 OR OTHER SORTS OF IMPROVEMENTS ON THE LOCAL COMMUNITY SERVICES
16 BUT FOR THE PURPOSES OF LONG RANGE PLAN WE BELIEVE FOCUSING
17 ENERGIES ON THE THREE LIGHTER CATEGORIES THERE WHERE THERE IS
18 OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT NEEDS AND GAPS AND OPPORTUNITY. SO I
19 WANT TO UNDERSCORE THOSE TWO POINTS IN WHAT WE'RE PUTTING
20 FORWARD TODAY.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO THIS IS ACTUALLY GETTING TO WHAT
23 MY NEXT COMMENT WAS GOING TO BE, WHICH IS IN TERMS OF, LIKE,
24 AT THE MTC WORKSHOP ON APRIL 26TH AND 27th, WHICH I DON'T KNOW
25 WHETHER THE NEW PROJECT LEAD WAS ON BOARD AT THAT TIME, BUT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THE COMMISSION WAS GIVING FEEDBACK ON THE TRANSIT
2 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND ONE OF THE THINGS THEY WERE
3 EXTREMELY EAGER TO SEE WAS ACCELERATION OF THINGS THAT MIGHT
4 BE DOABLE IN A SHORTER AMOUNT OF TIME. AND OBVIOUSLY, THE
5 HISTORICAL POINT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS, YOU KNOW, AS
6 YOU HAVE WITH THE YEAR NUMBER THAT'S FAR OFF INTO THE FUTURE
7 IS WE'RE DOING OUR LONG RANGE PLAN WE NOT GOING TO BE THINKING
8 ABOUT SHORT-TERM IMPLICATIONS THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN THE
9 LONG TERM. ESPECIALLY AS THE RECOVERY OF TRANSIT FROM IMPACTS
10 OF COVID AND THE PERCEPTION OF RIDERS OF THE CONVENIENCE OF
11 SYSTEM HAS SUCH AN IMPORTANT IMPACT ON VOTER SUPPORT FOR
12 FUNDING, THE POTENTIAL IDENTIFYING OF SHORT-TERM OPPORTUNITIES
13 IS REALLY POWERFUL AND POLITICALLY SALIENT. AND AS MTC STAFF
14 IS GOING OUT WITH AGENCY STAFF AT POP-UPS AND SESSIONS AND
15 HEARING WHAT PEOPLE HAVE TO SAY, I WOULD HOPE AND REALLY
16 ENCOURAGE THAT THERE BE SOME WAY TO CATCH THE SUGGESTIONS THAT
17 WERE MADE BY PEOPLE THAT COULD BE THINGS THAT WERE ACHIEVABLE
18 IN THE SHORT-TERM ALSO. AND MAYBE IT'S SOMETHING THAT A LOCAL
19 AGENCY JUST DOES, OR A LOCAL AGENCY CAN DO IN SOME WAY THAT
20 MTC CAN FIGURE OUT HOW TO SUPPORT. AND I'LL GIVE, LIKE, ONE
21 RANDOM EXAMPLE OF THAT ALL COMES TOGETHER, SAMTRANS AND VTA
22 ARE BOTH DOING BUS STOP PLANS AND ONE OF THINGS THEY TALK
23 ABOUT IS HAVING RHYME SIGNS AT THE BUS STOPS. SOMETIMES YOU
24 HAVE BUS STOPS THAT ARE HUBS THAT HAVE MULTIPLE AGENCIES, SO
25 HAVING HUB SIGNAGE THAT HAS MULTIPLE AGENCIES ON IT AND THAT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 ALSO INCLUDES THE TIMING OF SOMETHING THAT CAN SERVE AS A
2 LOCAL CONNECTOR OR A LOCAL ALTERNATE WOULD BE KIND OF
3 POWERFUL. SO I'M AT REDWOOD CITY AND TRYING TO FIGURE OUT IS
4 THE NEXT TRAIN IF AN HOUR BUT THE NEXT BUS IS IN FIVE MINUTES,
5 I WANT TO KNOW THAT ON ONE SIGN AS OPPOSED TO HAVING TO GO TO
6 THREE SIGNS WHICH I CURRENTLY NEED TO DO. AND, SO, THE
7 SUGGESTIONS IS LOOKING AT WAYS OF COLLECTING FEEDBACK FOR
8 THINGS THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE DONE SOONER INCLUDING THINGS
9 THAT HELP WITH THOSE FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECTIONS WEAVING
10 IN THOSE LOCAL SERVICES THAT ARE NOT GOING TO BE CERTAINLY NOT
11 SYSTEMATICALLY GOVERNED AND TREATED, BUT THERE STILL MIGHT BE
12 SOME RELEVANT THINGS TO DO.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THERE IS A LOT TO SPEAK TO THERE. I THINK TWO THINGS
15 THAT I WANTED TO TOUCH UPON QUICKLY ARE HAVING TO DO WITH THE
16 PUBLIC OUTREACH AND THE POP-UPS THERE WILL DEFINITELY BE THOSE
17 OPPORTUNITIES FOR OPEN-ENDED DISCUSSION AND FEEDBACK. ALSO
18 FROM A SHORTER TERM PERSPECTIVE, THERE IS ALSO THE TRANSIT
19 PRIORITY PROJECT THAT IS NOW UNDERWAY, SETUP FAIRLY SIMILAR TO
20 THE WAY THIS IS SETUP, THERE IS THE OPERATOR SIDE, THAT'S MIKA
21 FROM AC TRANSIT AND JOEL SCHAFFER FROM MTC, SO THAT DOES
22 TRANSIT PRIORITY COVER SOME OF THE SHORTER TERM NEEDS, AND
23 THEY HAVE SPOKEN WITH -- I DON'T WANT TO STEP OUT OF TURN HERE
24 BUT THEY HAVE SPOKEN WITH MOST OF THE OPERATORS AT THIS POINT,
25 AND THAT EFFORT HAS GOTTEN UNDERWAY.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ONE MORE THING THEN OPEN TO MORE PEOPLE
3 BEFORE I COME BACK AND HAVE SOME MORE DISCUSSION. SINCE
4 THERE'S GOING TO BE A MASSIVE EFFORT TO GET PEOPLE TO MAKE
5 COMMENT THOSE PERTAIN TO A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE, IT WOULD
6 BE QUITE FRUSTRATING FOR PEOPLE SHOWING UP AND FOR ADVOCATES
7 ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO SHOW UP HONESTLY, IF THINGS THEY HAVE TO
8 SAY MOSTLY ARE NOT GOING TO BEAR FRUIT FOR ANOTHER 15 YEARS
9 AND SO HAVING SEMI STRUCTURED WAY OF CAPTURING THINGS AND
10 ENABLING THEM TO BE IMPLEMENTED.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** TO RESPOND QUICKLY, THAT'S GREAT FEEDBACK, IS
13 SOMETHING WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO DO WE ARE INVITING ALL OF THE
14 LOCAL OPERATORS TO ATTEND THE EVENTS AS WELL.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES WHERE SOMEBODY LIKE
17 DEPEND ON THE BUS AND THEY SAY OH YES THAT'S A GREAT
18 DISCUSSION WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO DO IN 20 YEARS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M A BUS SCHEDULER AT HART AT HEART, AND I THINK OF
21 THINGS THREE MONTHS AHEAD OF TIME.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WENDI, ANNE OLIVIA WILL GO AHEAD.

24



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I'LL BE BRIEF. I WANT TO ECHO
2 SOMETHING ADINA SAID AROUND THOSE TIMES MATCHING UP. SO, IT IS
3 THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN ME TAKING OR NOT TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT
4 AND THE REASON THAT I EVENTUALLY HAD TO GET A CAR WAS FIVE
5 MINUTE LAG IN THE MIDDLE OF THE NIGHT IN THE WRONG DIRECTION
6 THAT LEFT ME STANDING OUTSIDE IN JUST OUTSIDE BETWEEN 2 AND 3
7 OR 3 AND 4 IN THE MORNING. SO, IT'S ALSO WHETHER OR NOT I CAN
8 GET TO OUR MEETINGS IN A REASONABLE AMOUNT OF TIME AND OFTEN
9 WHY I CAN'T. SO, JUST REALLY, IT ISN'T AN AFTERTHOUGHT, AND I
10 KNOW YOU'RE NOT SCHEDULING THE LOCAL BUS ROUTES, BUT HAVING
11 SOME KIND OF REQUIREMENT OR SOMETHING IN THERE, WE STARTED
12 LATE. SO, I'LL JUST -- IT'S -- IT IS THE REASON SOME OF US CAN
13 OR CANNOT TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SO, THAT'S ALL.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** SHOULD I GO.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GO AHEAD.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** NOT WANTING TO PILE IT ON, I'LL PILE
20 IT ON. THIS IS THE CRUX OF THE MATTER IS THE DIFFICULTY IN
21 MAKING THOSE CONNECTIONS AND, SO, I RECOGNIZE THAT YOU CAN'T
22 DO THE SCHEDULING, THAT THAT HAS TO COME FROM LOCAL, BUT YOU
23 CAN CREATE POLICIES AND MAYBE SOME CARROTS AND STICKS IN ORDER
24 TO -- AND SOME GUIDELINES ON WHAT IS NECESSARY IN MAKING THOSE
25 CONNECTIONS. JUST A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES SIMILAR TO WHAT OTHER



JUNE 12, 2023

1 PEOPLE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT. IF I WANT TO GO TO OAK, I TAKE
2 40 BUS TO OAKLAND FROM MARIN COUNTY, I GET TO BART FIVE
3 MINUTES AFTER THE BUS HAS -- THE TRAIN HAS LEFT WHEN I COME
4 BACK THERE I FIVE MINUTES AFTER THE BUS HAS LEFT SO IT'S NOT
5 SO BAD GOING TOWARDS OAKLAND, BECAUSE THEY GOT ABOUT 15 MINUTE
6 HEADWAYS COMING BACK. WHEN I CALLED GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT ASKING
7 ABOUT THAT THE RESPONSE WAS INTERESTING BECAUSE FIRST THE
8 RESPONSE WAS THAT WE COOPERATE OUR BUSES BASED ON INTERNAL TO
9 THE TRANSIT CENTER, AND THEN I MENTION WHEN I SAID IT'S THE
10 SHUTTLE TO BART AND THEY GO NO IT'S NOT I'M LIKE OKAY IT ENDS
11 AT BART I THINK IT'S A SHUTTLE TO BART SO ANOTHER EXAMPLE IS
12 WHEN SMART FIRST SOLD SIDES, AND SAID THERE WAS GOING TO BE A
13 CONNECTOR BUS SO WE'RE IN TRANSIT VERY DILIGENTLY PUT TOGETHER
14 A PLAN TO PROVIDE THOSE BUSES AT THAT TIME SMART SAID WOULDN'T
15 YOU KNOW WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO THAT I THINK THAT IS STARTING
16 TO CHANGE WITH THE NEW GENERAL MANAGERS ACTUALLY KNOW HOW TO
17 RUN TRANSIT. THERE ARE KIND OF THINGS THAT HAPPEN THAT YOU
18 HAVE TO COORDINATE TIME WITH THAT TRAIN AND IF YOU ARE RUNNING
19 A TRAIN YOU HAVE TO HAVE SOME SYSTEM WHERE PEOPLE WITH GET
20 FROM THAT STATION TO WHERE THEY'RE GOING AND THE THIRD THING I
21 WOULD BRING UP IS I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU CAN INCORPORATE IT IN
22 HERE BUT THERE IS STILL THE OPPORTUNITY FOR BIKE CONNECTIONS
23 DOING THAT FIRST AND LAST AND GETTING BIKE SHARES AT MORE
24 STATIONS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. IT
25 GETS HARDER WHEN YOU'RE OUT IN THE SUBURBS WHERE I LIVE AND I



JUNE 12, 2023

1 RECOGNIZE THAT. IF IT GOES ALL OUT TO FAIRFAX AND WHO IS GOING
2 TO GET IT BACK TO SAN RAFAEL. I THINK THESE ARE OF KIND OF
3 QUESTIONS THAT YOU DO NEED TO ANSWER IN YOUR PLANNING
4 PROCESSES.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY RESPONSE BEFORE WE GO TO ADDITIONAL
7 PEOPLE?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T THINK I HAVE A SPECIFIC RESPONSE TO THAT
10 OTHER THAN I DO NOT DISAGREE WITH YOU THAT COORDINATING
11 SCHEDULES IS A CRITICAL THING TO DO AND CERTAINLY I JOKED
12 ABOUT THAT EARLIER COMING FROM A SCHEDULING BACKGROUND I DID
13 THAT ALL THE TIME IN CHICAGO WITH TRAIN ACKNOWLEDGE TO BUS
14 CONNECTIONS AND I DON'T WANT TO SAY COORDINATING SCHEDULES IS
15 EASIER SAID THAN DONE BUT I AGREE WITH YOU.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, WENDI KALLINS:** IT IS EASIER SAID THAN DONE THIS IS
18 THE MOST DIFFICULT PART OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING DO IS
19 COORDINATING SCHEDULES AND THAT'S WHY IT BECOMES SO IMPORTANT
20 BECAUSE IT ISN'T EASY.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AND WE HAVE -- I'M HAVING TROUBLE WITH
23 RESTRAINT SO I'M GOING TO FAIL RIGHT NOW. WE HAVE SOME
24 SYSTEMIC PROBLEMS HERE IN THAT WE HAVE TYPICALLY IN OUR
25 REGION, IT'S NOT UNIQUELY BAY AREA, BUT IT'S, YOU KNOW,



JUNE 12, 2023

1 DEFINITELY IN THE BAY AREA WHERE WE THINK ABOUT REGIONAL
2 SERVICES AS THINGS THAT ARE FOR AFFLUENT WHITE COLLAR
3 COMMUTERS AND THINK ABOUT COMMUTERS LOCAL TRANSIT LOW-INCOME
4 TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE AND SO SOMETIMES EVEN COMING FROM
5 TRANSIT BOARD MEMBERS AND TRANSIT STAFF SAYING WE DON'T NEED
6 TO DO THAT BECAUSE IT WONT BE THE SAME PEOPLE USING WHEN
7 CALTRANS JUST DID THEIR GO PAST DONATION PROGRAM MAKING
8 CALTRAIN AVAILABLE FOR FREE THEY FOUND OUT THAT IT WAS USED BY
9 PEOPLE WHOSE JOB TITLES INCLUDED GROUNDS KEEPER, DRIVER,
10 HOUSEKEEPING, CASHIER, CAREGIVER, HEALTH, SOMETHING THAT WAS
11 DONE BY COMMUTE.ORG, BUT THE POINT IS THAT WE ARE MISSING
12 PEOPLE THAT DON'T TAKE ADVANTAGE OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR
13 REASONS OF AFFORDABILITY. THERE IS AN EQUITY POINT TO DOING
14 THIS LIKE IN ADDITION HAVING A SYSTEMIC THEORY CAL THING. WE
15 CAN'T BOIL THE OCEAN AND GET IT ALL DONE IN ONE GO AROUND
16 COMPLETELY BUT THERE'S BEEN SO MANY YEARS WHERE SOMEBODY SAYS
17 WHAT ABOUT THE CASHIER AND IT'S LIKE NO THE CASHIER WILL NEVER
18 USE THE TRAIN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOING TO TRIPLE THE THIRD, YOU KNOW, THE COMMENTS
21 I HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT THIS TRANSIT NETWORK DEFINITION, I
22 KNOW THE REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT HOLE TRANSIT, HAS BEEN
23 DEFINITION OUT THERE THAT'S GOING AWAY, I THINK IT GETS TO A
24 DIFFERENT POINT IN THE WAY WE'RE SETTING UP THIS DEFINITION
25 AND HOW IT DOESN'T WORK TO ADDRESS THE PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE



JUNE 12, 2023

1 HEARING FROM THE BOARD MEMBERS THAT, WE'RE HEARING FROM THE
2 PUBLIC. WE'RE CATEGORIZING LINES SO WE CAN FUND THEM AS
3 INDIVIDUAL THINGS. I KNOW WE WENT THROUGH THIS WHOLE
4 EXPERIENCE WITH THE LAST PLANNED BAY AREA, HOW DO YOU MEASURE,
5 AND IT'S BASED ON MEASURING PROJECTS SO YOU CAN PICK WHICH
6 ONES FUND. WHAT'S NOT ON HERE THAT WE CAN ARGUING ABOUT THESE
7 FOUR CATEGORIES IS ANY, SORT OF, CONNECTIONS OR HUBS. AND YOU
8 CAN TELL ME, IF IT'S MTC, OR IF IT'S AC TRANSIT, WHO IS IN
9 CHARGE OF MAKING THOSE CONNECTIONS AND THOSE HUBS WORK? AND
10 RIGHT NOW I DON'T THINK IT'S ANYBODY, AND WE ARE ALL LIVING
11 THAT. SO WE HAVE TO -- WE CAN ARGUE ABOUT THESE FOUR OR FIVE
12 LEVELS, BUT WE NEED TO START LOOKING AT MEASURING AND
13 REQUIRING PERFORMANCE ON CONNECTIONS AND THE HUBS, ESPECIALLY
14 WITH THE ENEMY, OTHERWISE KNOWN AS OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS.
15 [LAUGHTER] I MEAN, I DON'T DO -- I GO THROUGH A REGIONAL
16 TRANSIT HUB EVERY DAY, WELL, MULTIPLE TIMES PER WEEK, WHERE
17 THERE ARE SIGNS FOR THE OTHER PROVIDERS ARE NOT PUT UP,
18 THEY'RE NOT ON THE SAME SYSTEM, BECAUSE THEY'RE THE OPPONENTS,
19 NOT THE SAME TEAM. AND, LIKE, WE'RE NOT GOING TO SOLVE THIS
20 PROBLEM. LUANN SAID SHE BOUGHT A CAR WE HAVE BEEN HAVING
21 DECLINING LEADERSHIP FOR A DECADE LIKE THESE ARE PROBLEMS THAT
22 ARE IMPACTING US, WHETHER THE LOW-INCOME RIDERS THAT DON'T GET
23 THE REGIONAL RIDERS WHO DON'T USE THE LOCAL TRANSIT BECAUSE
24 THE CONNECTION DISAPPOINT WORK. SO ONE TAKES REGIONAL TRENDS,



JUNE 12, 2023

1 SO WE ARE DRIVING A CAR, GETTING AN E-BIKE, FINDING AN UBER
2 BECAUSE THE CONNECTIONS AREN'T WORKING.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I'M GLAD YOU BROUGHT THAT UP THOSE ARE COMPONENTS
5 WE'RE WORKING ACTIVELY ON IN THE DEFINITION, HUBS, WHERE THOSE
6 KEY LOCATIONS WHERE YOU NEED TO TRANSFER EFFECTIVELY AND
7 EFFICIENTLY TRANSFER BETWEEN SERVICES IN ORDER TO MAKE THE
8 NETWORK ACTUALLY FUNCTION AS A NETWORK AND ONE OF THE THINGS
9 WE'RE BUILDING ON, THIS WAS INCLUDED IN STRATEGY T-THREE, THE
10 SEAMLESS MOBILITY STRATEGY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND IT'S A
11 BIT BURIED IN ONE OF THE TECHNICAL DOCUMENTS OF PLANNED BAY
12 AREA 2050 BUT THERE WERE 15 HUB LOCATIONS IDENTIFIED AS PART
13 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHERE THERE NEEDS TO BE EITHER THREE
14 MINUTE TRANSFER TIME OR FIVE MINUTE TRANSFER TIME BETWEEN
15 DIFFERENT TYPES OF TRANSIT. WE HAVE INITIAL FRAMEWORK FROM
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE'RE STARTING WITH AND LOOKING AT
17 OPERATORS TO IDENTIFY WHAT ARE THE OTHER LOCATIONS THAT WE'LL
18 THEN INCORPORATE INTO THE NETWORK DEFINITION AND USE AS PARTS
19 OF OUR NEEDS GAPS AND OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS, LIKE OKAY IF YOU
20 WANT TO AN EFFECTIVE TRANSIT NETWORK THAT PEOPLE USE TO GET
21 FROM POINT A TO POINT B ACROSS MULTIPLE OPERATORS YOU'RE GOING
22 TO BE NEED EFFICIENT EFFECTIVE TRANSFERS AT THESE LOCATIONS.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HUB WAS THE WRONG WORD I USED. THERE IS THE 15 HUBS
25 BUT THERE IS ALSO THE HUNDREDS OF CONNECTIONS. IT MAY BE A



JUNE 12, 2023

1 LIGHT RIDERSHIP BUS ROUTE, TO A LIGHT RIDERSHIP REGIONAL ROUTE
2 BUT IT'S IMPORTANT CONNECTION THAT MAKES THE TRIP, SOMEONE
3 ELSE'S TRIP POSSIBLE OR NOT.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** AND THE LEVEL COORDINATION, WE'RE WORKING WITH THE
6 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND WITH FOLKS ON MAPPING
7 AND WAYFINDING AND TRANSIT PRIORITY TO MAKE SURE ALL OF THESE
8 THINGS SYNC UP TOGETHER TOO. JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT AS
9 WELL.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** TERRY, GO AHEAD. SHE JUST CALLED ON YOU.

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** TER CAN YOU HEAR ME? MY COMMENTS AND QUESTION
14 BASICALLY WRITE TO THE MULTIPLE TRANSIT SYSTEMS WE HAVE, IN,
15 AND IT WAS REFERENCED THAT THERE WAS SOME REFERENCE OF
16 UTILIZING THE COMBINATION OF RAIL, FERRY, EXPRESS BUSES,
17 SHUTTLES, ET CETERA. SMALL -- MY COUNTY IN, NAPA IS THE
18 SWITZERLAND OF THE BAY AREA. A VERY SMALL NUMBER OF RESIDENTS
19 -- BUT A RELATIVELY LARGE NUMBER OF VISITORS WE HAVE LESS THAN
20 138,000 RESIDENTS AND OVER FOUR AND A HALF MILLION VISITORS A
21 YEAR. SO, AND IT OCCURS AT INFREQUENT TIMES IT'S NOT A STEADY
22 STREAM ALTHOUGH CERTAINLY DURING THE SUMMER THERE ARE MORE
23 VISITORS TO THE WINE COUNTRY AND SO FORTH. FOR EXAMPLE, LAST
24 WEEK WE HAD A MUSIC FESTIVAL, WE HAD 140,000 VISITORS IN THREE
25 DAYS TO A COUNTY THAT HAS 137,000 RESIDENTS. THE



JUNE 12, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION REQUIREMENT, I WISH THAT WE COULD UTILIZE BUSES
2 MORE EFFECTIVELY, WE HAVE A RAILROAD HERE THAT IS PRETTY MUCH
3 PRIVATELY UTILIZED BY THE NAPA WINE TRAIN, BUT IT'S GETTING IN
4 AND OUT OF THE COUNTY, AND PARTICULARLY FOR THESE HIGH
5 ATTENDANCE EVENTS, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE BETTER COORDINATION OF
6 RAIL, FERRY, EXPRESS BUSES, AND ON REGULAR TRACK TRAFFIC THAT
7 WE HAVE WHICH IS BASELY IN AND OUT INGRESS EGRESS TO THE
8 COUNTY. WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO BETTER INTEGRATE THOSE SERVICES.
9 WE DON'T HAVE BART. WE DON'T HAVE, REALLY, A LOT OF REGULAR
10 BUS SERVICE IN AND OUT. WE HAVE INTERNAL BUS SERVICE BUT THAT
11 IS ONLY FOR THIS SMALL NUMBER OF RESIDENTS, AND IN MANY CASES
12 WE'RE USING BUS WHERE IS WE COULD BE USING SHUTTLES THAT WOULD
13 MUCH BETTER SERVE OUR COMMUNITY. BECAUSE MANY TIMES THE BUSES
14 HERE ARE NOT HALF EMPTY OR, YOU KNOW, TWO THIRDS EMPTY, AND IN
15 MANY CASES WE HAVE FOUR PASSENGER BUSES WITH TWO OR THREE OR
16 PERHAPS NO ONE IN TEM. AS FAR AS -- AND I APPRECIATE THE
17 CONCERN OF THE INTERCONNECTIONS. BECAUSE FOR ME TO COME TO A
18 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING, AND GET THERE ON TIME,
19 BASICALLY I HAVE TO GET TO SAN FRANCISCO. THE EASIEST WAY IS
20 TO TAKE THE FERRY FROM VALLEJO, AND THEN TO GET TO THE POINT
21 CITY, THAT I HAVE GOT A 15 TO 20 MINUTE WALK TO THE MTC
22 BUILDING, BUT I RIDE AN HOUR AND A HALF FOR THE MEETING,
23 BECAUSE THE TIMING JUST DOESN'T CONNECT. AND ALSO WE HAVE, YOU
24 KNOW, WE HAVE A LOT OF COMMUTERS THAT UTILIZE VALLEJO, NOT
25 NECESSARILY ALL IN NAPA, BUT THE TAKING -- IF YOU ARRIVE, FOR



JUNE 12, 2023

1 EXAMPLE, AT THE PARKING AREA, IF YOU ARRIVE THERE AFTER 8:30
2 THERE IS VIRTUAL HE NO PARKING AVAILABLE, BECAUSE ALL THE
3 DAILY COMMUTERS HAVE UTILIZED THOSE PARKING SPACES. FIDUCIARY
4 ME TO ATTEND SOME OF OUR MEETINGS I HAVE MY WIFE DROP ME OFF
5 AT THE FERRY BUILDING AND THEN COME BACK AND PICK ME UP AFTER
6 WARDS BECAUSE IT'S TOO DIFFICULT TO PARK. THOSE ARE ISSUES
7 THAT I THINK MANY OF THE COMMUNITIES ARE EXPERIENCING, AND
8 THERE NEEDS TO BE -- THERE NEEDS TO BE WAYS TO UTILIZE -- WE
9 HAVE SO MUCH VEHICLE TRAFFIC, THAT'S VIRTUALLY THE WAY
10 EVERYONE COMES INTO THIS COUNTY, THEY HAVE FEW TRAINS THAT
11 COME IN AND OUT BUS LINES IN AND OUT, IT'S BASICALLY VEHICULAR
12 TRAFFIC. AND IN A COUNTY OF 130,000 RESIDENTS, WE HAVE COMMUTE
13 HOURS ON HIGHWAY 12 -- OR HIGHWAY 29, RATHER, AND THE
14 SILVERADO TRAIL. 20 YEARS AGO, THAT DIDN'T EXIST. 20 YEARS AGO
15 WE DIDN'T HAVE FOUR AND A HALF MILLION VISITORS EACH YEAR,
16 PRIMARILY DURING THE SUMMER. ASSOCIATION AT ANY RATE, I THINK
17 THAT CERTAINLY ISSUES INCLUDE AFFORDABILITY WHEN WE'RE TALKING
18 ABOUT LOCAL TRANSIT AND CONNECTIONS, BUT THEY'RE ALSO
19 INTERCONNECTIONS BETWEEN THOSE SYSTEMS AND THAT'S WHY I
20 EAGERLY LOOK FORWARD TO THE CREATION OF A NETWORK MANAGEMENT
21 OFFICE AND BETTER COORDINATION BETWEEN THE INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT
22 SYSTEMS. BUT, YOU KNOW, THAT SAID, IT'S OUR PROBLEMS HERE ARE
23 RELATIVELY SMALL, PARTICULARLY IN TERMS OF A NUMBER OF PEOPLE
24 AND NUMBER OF PEOPLE USING THE TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAN IN THE
25 OTHER BAY AREA COUNTIES. BUT IT IS -- WE NEED THAT, BETWEEN



JUNE 12, 2023

1 SOME OF THE LARGER RESIDENTIAL COMMUNITIES, WE NEED BETTER
2 INTERCONNECTION OF THOSE SYSTEMS, AND I AGREE WITH THE
3 PREVIOUS COMMENTS OF ADINA AND OTHERS TO THAT EFFECT. THAT'S
4 IT.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ASSOCIATION INCLUDING MAKING, HAVING THE
7 USE CASES VISITORS BEING CONSIDERED IN THE NEEDS TO MAKE THE
8 CONNECTIONS. AND IF STAFF HAS COMMENTS THAT WE WELCOME AND IAN
9 HAS SOME STUFF TO SAY BEFORE WE GO BACK TO ANNE OLIVIA AND ME.
10 I WANT IT SAY TERRY MAKES A GREAT POINT. WHILE NAPA IS
11 CERTAINLY UNIQUE IN TERMS OF THE VISITOR TO POPULATION RATIO,
12 THE LEVEL OF VARIABILITY, WHICH I DON'T THINK IS A WORD, IS NOT
13 UNCOMMON TO THE BAY AREA, AND I THINK IT ALSO SPEAKS TO THE
14 IMPORTANCE OF OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM FOR TRANSIT 2050
15 PLUS AND MAKING SURE WE DON'T JUST HAVE -- EXCUSE ME -- THE
16 LARGE OPERATORS COVERED WITHIN THE BAY AREA BUT WE HAVE
17 REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE SMALL OPERATORS AS WELL, AND SPECIFIC
18 LEAVE WE DO FOR NAPA, WITH REBECCA, THE PROGRAM MANAGER OF
19 TRANSIT ARE BUYING BECAUSE I KNOW THAT'S A HARDWORKING AGENCY
20 YOU HAVE THE VALLEJO FERRY, ROUTE THAT GOES ALL THE WAY DOWN
21 TO EL CERRITO DEL NORTE BART STATION HAVING THOSE
22 PERSPECTIVES, NETWORK GOALS, PROBLEM STATEMENTS DEFINITIONS,
23 ALL TASK ORDERS GOING FORWARD THAT WE ARE GETTING FEEDBACK
24 FROM EVERYBODY INVOLVED. SO I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU SAID THERE
25 TERRY.



JUNE 12, 2023

1

2 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GLAD THIS PROJECT IS MOVING FORWARD. I WAS
5 INTERESTED TO HEAR STAFF PEOPLE WORKING ON THIS SO I DON'T
6 THINK IT WAS A WASTE OF TIME. I CAME BACK FROM SWITZERLAND
7 WITH A DELEGATION, A NUMBER OF BAY AREA LEADERS INCLUDING
8 SEVERAL PEOPLE ON THAT LIST. IT WAS A FANTASTIC EXPERIENCE WE
9 WERE LEARNING FROM THE SWISS ON HOW THEY DONATION WIDE AND
10 REGIONAL AND LOCAL PLANNING TO REALLY RESULT IN A TRULY
11 INTEGRATED SYSTEM AT AN EVEN LARGER SCALE THAT WE'RE WORKING
12 AT IN THE BAY AREA, AND IT'S COMPLICATE AND THERE IS A LOT OF
13 ENTITIES INVOLVED BUT THERE IS THIS COMMITMENT TO THE PROCESS
14 AND THE ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT THAT DOES LEAD TO -- THAT TYPE OF
15 APPROACH DOES LEAD TO EXTREMELY GOOD OUTCOMES IN TERMS OF
16 RIDERSHIP AND OVER TIME MORE AND MORE INVESTMENT FROM THE
17 PUBLIC AND INCOMPETENCE OF BALLOT MEASURES AFTER BALLOT
18 MEASURE AGREEING ON FUND MORE AND MORE SO I'M THRILLED TO KNOW
19 THAT THE TEAM IS WORKING ON THIS AND I'LL SAY I THINK MOVING
20 TO THE COMMENT ON NETWORK DEFINITION, YOU HAVE, SORT OF,
21 COMBINATION OF TOP DOWN BOTTOM-UP PLANNING GOING ON AND I'M
22 WORRIED ABOUT THE BLANKET DEFINITION OF HOLE SERVICE HERE THAT
23 WE'RE NOT NECESSARY HE HAVING TWO THINGS MEET IN THE RIGHT
24 SPOT, FOR EXAMPLE, THE WAY THAT YOU DESIGNED THE REGIONALLY
25 SIGNIFICANT NETWORK OR THE NEXT TIER UP TO SAY THAT IT WILL



JUNE 12, 2023

1 INCLUDE REGIONAL SIGNIFICANT WOULD INCLUDE THE TEMPLE LINE BUT
2 WHAT OTHER AC TRANSIT LINES WOULD BE INCLUDED THERE IS A WHOLE
3 BUNCH OF EAST WEST LINES THAT ARE IMPORTANT FOR CONNECTIVITY.
4 SOME OF WHICH WERE CUT, ASHBY LINE CONNECTING ASHBY BART
5 STATION TO IMPORTANT HEALTH CARE CENTERS, IT'S AN IMPORTANT
6 CONNECTION, HAVING IDENTIFIED HUBS WOULD BE HELPFUL TO KNOW
7 WHICH LOCAL ROUTES MAYBE SHOULD BE GIVEN AN EXTRA LEVEL OF
8 SCRUTINY FROM THE REGIONAL GROUP AND NOT REFERRING REGIONAL
9 DECISIONS TO EACH LOCAL AGENCY TO IDENTIFY. SO I AGREE WITH
10 THESE OTHER COMMENTS AROUND THAT BEING THAT POTENTIAL NEED FOR
11 -- ESPECIALLY IF YOU MOVE INTO NETWORK CONCEPTS PHASE. FOR
12 EXISTING NETWORK MAYBE THOSE DEFINITIONS ARE FINE BUT MOVING
13 TO THE CONCEPTS FOR FUTURE IDENTIFYING ROUTES WOULD BENEFIT
14 FROM SIGNIFICANTLY ADDITIONAL LOCAL SERVICE IN THE FUTURE
15 BECAUSE THEY SERVE AN IMPORTANT FUNCTION JUST CONTINUES TO GET
16 OVERLOOKED IF THOSE ROUTES ARE LEFT UP TO THE, SORT OF,
17 DECISION OF WHAT LEVEL OF LOCAL SERVICE SEEMS APPROPRIATE
18 BECAUSE I THINK THERE'S A NUMBER OF EXAMPLES, PLANNED BAY AREA
19 THESE ARE LOCAL ROUTES THAT CONNECT TENS OF THOUSANDS OF
20 PEOPLE I'M THINKING ANOTHER EXAMPLE, 24th STREET IN SAN
21 FRANCISCO, CONNECTION SERVED 48 IT GOES TO 24th AND BART
22 STATION AND ALL THE WAY TO THE ENTIRE WESTERN PART OF SAN
23 FRANCISCO AND THAT ROUTE DOESN'T RUN FREQUENTLY AND THERE IS A
24 LOT OF PEOPLE IN WESTERN SAN FRANCISCO THAT HAVE TO GO
25 DOWNTOWN TO GET TO BART. THAT'S A MISSION AROUND THE NETWORK



JUNE 12, 2023

1 DEFINITION THAT I THINK YOU WILL CONTINUE TO LOOK AT
2 ESPECIALLY AS WE MOVE INTO THE NETWORK DEFINITION PHASE AND
3 ALLOWING FOR THAT ITERATIVE PROCESS OF NOT JUST THE LOCAL
4 AGENCIES IDENTIFYING WHICH LOCAL ROUTES THEY WANT TO NOMINATE
5 BUT ALSO MAYBE HAVING SOME THROUGH THE CONSULTANT'S
6 RECOMMENDATIONS OKAY THESE ARE MAYBE A SET OF LOCAL ROUTES
7 THAT CONNECT TO THE SIGNIFICANT HUBS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE WANT
8 TO ALSO ADD MAYBE FROM A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE, TO THE PRIORITY
9 CORRIDORS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. I THINK YOU DEFINITELY BRING UP A GREAT POINT
12 THERE. AND IT SPEAKS TO, WELL, ONE, OUR DEFINITIONS ARE STILL
13 IN DRAFT PHASE AND THESE ARE THINGS WITH OUR PROJECT
14 MANAGEMENT TEAM AT THE OPERATOR LEVEL AND ALSO THINKING ABOUT
15 THE TOP DOWN BOTTOM-UP APPROACH WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE STRIKE
16 THE BALANCE AND NOT MISS ANYTHING IN THE MIDDLE. I THINK WE'RE
17 DEFINITELY MAKING SURE WE STRIKE THE RIGHT BALANCE WITH THOSE
18 ROUTES BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT SOMETHING THAT'S CRITICAL TO A
19 NETWORK TO NOT BE INCLUDED IN THE PLAN.

20

21 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GREAT. I'LL GO THROUGH MY OTHER THREE COMMENTS.
22 ONE IS ON THE PROBLEM STATEMENT. YOU KNOW, I READ THIS PROBLEM
23 STATEMENT, AND YOU MENTIONED THERE HAVE BEEN EFFORTS TO MAKE
24 IT RIDER CENTRIC. IT COULD BE A LOT MORE RIDER CENTRIC. IT
25 FEELS OPERATOR CENTRIC. THE FIRST LINE LITERALLY SAYS MANY OF



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT OPERATORS EXPERIENCE DECLINE IN
2 RIDERSHIP. TO ME, THIS COULD BE A MUCH SIM-- ESPECIALLY IF
3 WE'RE BRINGING THIS TO THE PUBLIC FOR FEEDBACK, IT'S LIKE DOES
4 THIS MAKE SENSE TO YOU? I THINK A TRANSLATION INTO FEWER AND
5 FEWER PEOPLE ARE TAKING TRANSIT. MANY PEOPLE FIND IT TAKES TOO
6 LONG TO TAKE TRANSIT TO PLACES. THERE COULD BE A FILTER ON ALL
7 OF THE CONTENT THAT'S IN HERE, BUT PHRASING IT IN A WAY THAT
8 FITS ACTUALLY -- BECAUSE IT'S VERY WONKY RIGHT NOW. SO, I JUST
9 THINK THAT WOULD BE A MORE ACCESSIBLE PROBLEM STATEMENT THAT
10 MIGHT ACTUALLY HELP THE PROJECT TEAM REMAIN FOCUSED ON THE
11 RIDER. I THINK AT THE END OF THE DAY NOT ENOUGH PEOPLE ARE
12 TAKING TRANSIT, RIDERSHIP IS LOW AND TRANSIT ISN'T COMPETITIVE
13 WITH DRIVING AND WE NEED TO MAKE TRANSIT COMMITMENT WITH
14 DRIVING. AND I THINK THAT'S NOT COMING THROUGH SUPER CLEARLY
15 RIGHT NOW IN THE PROBLEM STATEMENT. AND THEN ON THE GOALS,
16 GENERALLY, LIKE THE GOALS. AND I JUST HAD ONE MAIN COMMENT,
17 WHICH WAS ON THE DESIRED OUTCOMES, WHICH, YOU KNOW, AND I HAVE
18 BEEN LOOKING AT A FEW CONNECTED NETWORK PLANS OR SERVICE
19 VISIONS FROM OTHER PLACES AND OUTCOME ASSOCIATED WITH THE
20 FIRST GOAL, IS I LIKE ACCESSIBILITY TO JOBS, AND I LIKE
21 ACCESSIBILITY TO REGIONAL DESTINATIONS BUT JUST TO SHARE THE
22 OVERALL POPULATION THAT HAS ACCESS TO HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT. I
23 THINK THAT'S A DISTINCT OUTCOME. LIKE SINGAPORE LITERALLY
24 THEIR GOAL WAS, 90% OF SINGAPOREANS WILL HAVE ACCESS TO
25 TRANSIT LINE WITHIN TEN MINUTE WALK THAT COMES EVERY TEN



JUNE 12, 2023

1 MINUTES OR FIVE MINUTES OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT TO ME THAT
2 SHOULD BE THE OUTCOME, OR THE METRIC OF THE GOAL OF
3 ACCESSIBILITY. AND LASTLY, I HAD A QUESTION ON THE
4 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT. WHICH WAS IS THAT GOING TO -- I AM GLAD
5 TO ABOUT THE REPORT I'M GLAD THE PURPOSE WILL BE TAKING ON
6 WHAT THE PLANNED BAY AREA, ALLOWING TO THINK BEYOND FUNDING WE
7 HAVE IDENTIFIED BEING, A QUESTION AND ALSO A RECOMMENDATION. I
8 THINK IT WOULD BE MOST VALUABLE, IN ADDITION, TO IDENTIFY THE
9 SERVICE NEEDS, YOU KNOW, IDENTIFY ANY INSTITUTIONAL
10 CHALLENGES, THERE WOULD BE IN REALIZING, YOU KNOW, IF WE'RE
11 PAINTING THIS OPERATIONAL NETWORK OF A VISION, WITH THESE
12 PRESS BUS LINES DON'T EXIST RIGHT NOW AND MANY CROSS EXISTING
13 AGENCY BOUNDARIES THOSE LINES CALLING OUT IN THE SUPPLEMENTAL
14 REPORT MAYBE WOULD BENEFIT FROM HAVING A REGIONAL EXPRESS BUS
15 OPERATOR THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL THING TO INCLUDE, THOSE TYPES
16 OF RECOMMENDATIONS MIGHT BE PART OF THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT
17 FOCUS ON THE VISION AND COST ASSOCIATED RATHER THAN
18 INSTITUTIONAL WAYS OF GETTING THOSE THINGS IMPLEMENTED. >DAVE
19 VAUTIN: HAPPY TO TAKE THAT QUESTION. I THINK WE TALKED ABOUT
20 THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT TASK IN MARSH BUT THAT'S THE PRIMARY
21 GOAL OF THE SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT IS TO IDENTIFY IMPLEMENTATION
22 ACTION, FINANCIAL BARRIERS, POLITICAL BARRIERS, INSTITUTIONAL
23 BARRIERS AND IMPLEMENTATION. SO THAT IS ACTUALLY THE MAIN
24 GOAL. IT'S ALSO A SPACE WHERE WE CAN ACKNOWLEDGE AND INCLUDE
25 IMPROVEMENTS BEYOND THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED ENVELOPE



JUNE 12, 2023

1 AVAILABLE. I WOULD NOTE THE FISCALLY STRAINED ENVELOPE
2 CONTAINS ANTICIPATED REVENUE SOURCES WHICH INCLUDE REGIONAL
3 TRANSPORTATION MEASURES, ROADWAY PRICING, PARKING PRICING AND
4 A VARIETY OF SOURCES SO THAT ENVELOPE IS QUITE ROBUST EARLIER.
5 I WANT TO GIVE A QUICK RESPONSE TO YOUR COMMENT ABOUT THE HUBS
6 AND HOLE ROUTES AND MORE ON THAT. ONE THING, MAYBE PRIORITY
7 ADDING MORE HOLE ROUTES TO THAT REGIONAL PRIORITY. I WANT TO
8 SAY FROM THE PROJECT TEAM AND WORKING CLOSELY WITH OPERATORS
9 WE BELIEVE THAT WE'RE NEUTRAL ON THE MATTER OF WHETHER
10 REGIONAL OR LOCAL ROUTES ARE OUR TOP PRIORITY. OUR TOP
11 PRIORITY IS TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF THE PLAN, WHICH INCLUDE
12 THINGS LIKE GROWING RIDERSHIP, EXPANDING ACCESS TO TRANSIT,
13 AND, SO, WHATEVER PLANNING TECHNIQUE IS USED TO IDENTIFY
14 POTENTIAL IMPROVEMENTS, WE WANT TO GET TO THOSE GOALS SO AS WE
15 STUDY NETWORK CONCEPTS WE MIGHT LOOK AT INVEST MORE IN LOCAL,
16 AND LESS IN REGIONAL AND ONES INVEST MORE IN REGIONAL AND LESS
17 IN LOCAL. SO WE CAN UNDERSTAND HOW THAT BALANCE OF SERVICE
18 GETS THOSE GOALS AND MAYBE THOSE APPROACHES IS BETTER FOR
19 RIDERSHIP, SO JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT A SERVICE OR LINE
20 IS PART OF THOSE LATTER CATEGORIES ON THERE WHERE WE'RE GOING
21 TO BE DOING MORE ANALYSIS, IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT WE'RE DOING
22 THAT THE EXPENSE ROUTES THAT ARE NOT IN THAT SET. IN FACT,
23 WE'RE WORKING WITH OPERATORS TO COLLECT DATA FOR ALL THOSE
24 LOCAL LINES ON IMPROVEMENTS. THIS IS A 12 MONTH PROJECT WE'RE
25 AT THIS POINT WE HAVE TO HAVE PRIORITIZED TERMS OF PLANNING



JUNE 12, 2023

1 FOR THEM, DIFFERENT ROUTES IN THE REGION OBVIOUSLY THERE IS 12
2 MONTHS WE THINK WE CAN GET THROUGH LARGE NUMBER OF HIGHEST
3 RIDERSHIP TRUNK LINES PROVIDING CONNECTIVITY THROUGHOUT THE
4 REGION WHETHER THOSE ARE RAPID, BRT, LIGHT RAIL, HEAVY RAIL,
5 EXPRESS SERVICES ET CETERA, THOSE LOCAL SERVICES WILL BE IN
6 BETTER SHAPE. A NUMBER OF ROUTES FOR AC, MUNI AND DIFFERENT
7 OPERATORS WILL BE PART OF THE REGIONAL DEFINITION MAYBE NOT
8 EVERY ONE THAT CONNECTS ALL PARTS OF THE CITY WE TRUST THAT
9 OPERATOR PARTNERS HAVE KNOWLEDGE ABOUT BUSES ON 24th IN THE
10 MISSION AIR DISTRICT THEY CAN TELL US WHAT, SORT OF, FREQUENCY
11 IMPROVEMENTS THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE AND WE CAN ADD VALUE AS A
12 PROJECT TEAM IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT VRT AND RAPID BUS LINES IN
13 PARTICULAR?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES. I DEFINITELY IMPLY THE TEMPO WAS THE BEGINNING
16 AND END OF THAT JUST BECAUSE I LIVE NEAR IT.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** LET'S SEE. YEAH. I'LL ANNE OLIVIA.

19

20 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I REALIZE THERE IS LIMITED TIME TO BE
21 EVALUATING EVERYTHING. I HAVE SOME FEAR AROUND CONCENTRATING
22 ONLY ON HEAVILY USED LINES. THERE IS A LOT OF ROUTES THAT
23 WOULD BE UTILIZED MORE HEAVILY IF IT WERE RELIABLE AND SAFE
24 AND CONSISTENT ESPECIALLY TAKING INTO CONSIDERATION HOURS. I
25 WOULD USE THE FERRY SO OFTEN BUT IT NEVER RUNS, AND YOU KNOW,



JUNE 12, 2023

1 YOU CAN TAKE IT FOR A COUPLE OF HOURS IN THE MORNING, AND THEN
2 A COUPLE OF HOURS LATER IN THE DAY BUT I CAN'T GO TO OUR
3 MEETINGS ON IT EVEN THOUGH THAT WOULD BE SUPER CONVENIENT FOR
4 ME, BECAUSE I CAN'T GET BACK. I HAVE TO WAIT A COUPLE HOURS TO
5 DO THAT. AND I CAN'T. OR, IF I GO OVER IN THE EVENING, IT JUST
6 STOPS. LIKE, I CAN'T EVEN GO TO DINNER AND STILL TAKE THE
7 FERRY BACK. ASSOCIATION IF I TAKE THE FERRY IN, THEN ALL OF A
8 SUDDEN I HAVE TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET AROUND AND GET BACK,
9 WHICH ISN'T EASY TO DO AT ALL. AND I HAVE A GOOD JOB. I HAVE A
10 GOOD INCOME. BUT TRYING TO NAVIGATE THIS STUFF IS EXPENSIVE
11 AND COMPLICATE, AND THE LACK OF -- LIKE, BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE
12 ALL OF THE OPTION IN ONE PLACE, LIKE, MAYBE THERE IS A WAY FOR
13 ME TO DO MY COMMUTING, AND I WOULD LOVE TO DO THAT BECAUSE I
14 ACTUALLY HATE DRIVING, UNLESS IT'S ROAD TRIPS IN THE COUNTRY.
15 THEN I LOVE IT. BUT IN THE CITY, I DON'T WANT TO DO IT. AND I
16 DON'T WANT TO PARK AND I DON'T WANT PEOPLE TO BREAK INTO MY
17 CAR, AND I DON'T WANT ALL OF THOSE THINGS. PARKING TICKETS,
18 ALL THAT STUFF. BUT THERE ISN'T A WAY FOR ME TO FIGURE OUT HOW
19 TO DO IT, AND HALF THE TIME I END UP IN SOME SITUATION WHERE I
20 HAVE TO WALK. AND I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE EVER BEEN IN A
21 SITUATION WHERE YOU HAVE TO WALK AND YOU DON'T WANT TO,
22 WHETHER YOU'RE PHYSICALLY NOT UP FOR IT, OR BECAUSE THE
23 DISTANCE IS STUPID, OR IT DOESN'T FEEL SAFE. BUT, A LOT OF --
24 BECAUSE OF THE TIMING AND BECAUSE OF THE LACK OF COMMUNICATION
25 AND BECAUSE THINGS JUST STOP RUNNING AT NIGHT, THERE IS A LOT



JUNE 12, 2023

1 OF US WHO WOULD USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IF IT RAN LATER, IF
2 IT WAS MORE CONSISTENT, IF THE TIMING HAPPENED, IF WE COULD
3 FIGURE OUT HOW TO NAVIGATE BETWEEN ALL THE DIFFERENT TRANSIT
4 AGENCIES, AND WE CAN'T. I'M NOT STUPID. [LAUGHTER] I MEAN,
5 LIKE, I AM AN INTELLIGENT HUMAN BEING. AND I CAN'T FIGURE IT
6 OUT. NOT ALL OF THE ROUTES SHOW UP ON GOOGLE MAPS WHICH IS
7 WHAT A LOT OF PEOPLE USE FOR NAVIGATING. IT DOESN'T SHOW THE
8 OPTIONS FOR ALL THE DIFFERENT TRANSIT, LIKE, ALL THE DIFFERENT
9 CONNECTIONS THAT YOU CAN DO. AND I JUST DISH WOULD LIKE TO SEE
10 THERE BE SOME KIND OF EVALUATION OF TIME LIMITATIONS, LIKE WE
11 MAY HAVE A FERRY THAT GOES FROM HERE TO THERE BUT IF IT ONLY
12 RUNS FOR A COUPLE OF HOURS IN THE MORNING AND AFTERNOON IT'S
13 NOT A TRANSPORTATION METHOD FOR ANYBODY WHO DOESN'T HAVE A 9
14 TO 5. AND BECAUSE IT'S NOT THERE, THEN I HAVE TO GO ALL THE
15 WAY ACROSS THE BRIDGE AND THEN SOMETIMES GO ALL THE WAY DOWN.
16 AND IT'S A LOT OF VEHICLE MILES ADDED, BECAUSE THERE ISN'T
17 CONSISTENT SERVICE ALL OVER THE PACE. SO, THANK YOU. I AM
18 EXCITED THIS IS GOING FORWARD. I REALLY HOPE THOSE THINGS ARE
19 TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION AND WE LEARN TO PLAY WELL WITH EACH
20 OTHER AND SO WE DO HAVE MORE CONSOLIDATED ACCESS OF
21 INFORMATION FOR RIDERS AND THAT THERE IS ATTENTION PAID TO
22 PEOPLE WHO AREN'T RIDERS BUT WOULD LIKE TO BE.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** UH-HUH.

25



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** YOU MAKE A LOT OF GREAT POINTS THERE, AND I DON'T
2 HAVE THE SHORT-TERM MEMORY TO ADDRESS EVERYTHING YOU SAID. BUT
3 I DO WANT TO ADD, THE EXAMPLE YOU GAVE WITH FERRIES, CERTAIN
4 ROUTES WHETHER HIGH RIDERSHIP OR NOT, WHAT FERRIES AND COULD
5 BE EXPRESS BUSES STILL FIT WITHIN OUR DEFINITION OF REGIONAL
6 SERVICE AND WOULD BE COVERED UNDER TRANSIT 2050 PLUS.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** AND THE POINT ABOUT HOW HISTORICALLY THEY
9 HAVE BEEN CONCEIVED OF AS COMMUTE SERVICES AND THEREFORE
10 FOCUSING ON THE SERVICE HOURS FOR WHITE COLLAR COMMUTERS AND
11 THEREFORE YOU HAVE EXTREME HE INFREQUENT OR NO SERVICE IN THE
12 EVENING, YOU KNOW, THE DUMBARTON BUS DOESN'T RUN ON THE
13 WEEKENDS, BECAUSE IF YOUR GOAL IS ALLEVIATING CONGESTION FOR
14 DRIVERS, THEN THERE IS NO POINT IN BUS ON THE WEEKENDS,
15 WHEREAS IF YOUR GOAL IS TO SERVE PEOPLE WHO HAVE NO OR FEWER
16 CARS THEN OF COURSE YOU WANT TO HAVE A BUS OVER THAT BRIDGE ON
17 THE WEEKEND. THEN THERE IS NO BUS AT ALL ANYMORE ON THE 92
18 BRIDGE. AND IF AC TRANSIT SAYS WE DON'T WANT TO DO THIS, LIKE,
19 THIS GOES TO IAN'S -- I THINK A COUPLE OF GENERALIZED POINTS
20 HERE ARE LOOKING AT SPAN OF SERVICE AS MOVING BEYOND THE WHITE
21 COLOR COMMUTE FOCUS THAT TRANSIT NEEDS TO DO IN GENERAL AND
22 THAT BAY AREA TRANSIT NEEDS TO DO ESPECIALLY TO MOVE TO THE
23 POST-PANDEMIC ERA, AND LOOKING INCLUDING AT THE INSTITUTIONAL
24 QUESTIONS IF YOU HAVE SOME ROUTES THAT DON'T RUN BECAUSE THERE
25 IS NO OWNER, AND LOOKING AT THE FUNDING TO SAYING IF WE



JUNE 12, 2023

1 COULDN'T MAKE THAT CONNECTION BECAUSE OF FUNDING LET'S LOOK AT
2 A REGIONAL MEASURE A POT OF FUNDING TO MAKE THAT CONNECTION. A
3 TOPIC I WOULD LIKE TO ADD IN THERE THAT WAS MISSING FROM THE
4 METRICS IS HOMES AND HOUSING. BECAUSE MTC IS A TRANSIT
5 ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, THAT KEYS OFF IT MAKES TENANT
6 PROTECTIONS PRESERVATION AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION
7 POLICIES AND INCENTIVES TO BE TIED ON TO THE TRANSIT NETWORK
8 AND IT APPLIES ONLY TO A TEENY TINY FRACTION OF THE TRANSIT
9 NETWORK BECAUSE OUR OVERALL TRANSIT NETWORK HASN'T BEEN
10 SUFFICIENTLY ROBUST AND RELIABLE. SO, I THINK, LIKE, SHOWING
11 IN THE GOALS AND METRICS HOW IT RELATES TO THE HOUSING GOALS
12 OF THE TENANT -- ALL THOSE DIFFERENT HOUSING GOALS AND WHAT
13 THE OUTCOMES WOULD -- MIGHT BE, I THINK WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL
14 AND MIGHT BE HELPFUL, ALSO, IN TERMS OF EVALUATING DIFFERENT
15 OPTIONS IF THEY HAVE DIFFERENT IMPLICATIONS FOR THE HOUSING
16 RELATED GOALS IN TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. SO THAT'S A
17 TOPIC IN AND OF ITSELF THAT YOU MIGHT BE HEARING FROM SOME
18 MORE PEOPLE. CAN I PLEASE SEE MY NOTES, WENDI? THANK YOU.
19 [LAUGHTER] THE OTHER POINT THAT I WANTED TO ELEVATE, A FEW
20 OTHER PEOPLE TALKED ABOUT IF TERMS OF THE FIRST AND LAST MILE.
21 MTC IS STARTING TO THINK ABOUT BIKESHARE AND MOBILITY AS PART
22 OF THE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. SO I'M WONDERING WHEN AND
23 WHERE IN THIS OVERALL PROCESS WILL WE BE THINKING ABOUT THE
24 MICRO ABILITY, FOR FIRST AND LAST MILE OPTIONS THAT STARTS TO
25 CONNECT IN TERMS OF THE HUBS AND IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING AND



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THE ACTIVE GOALS. I THINK IN THE INTEREST OF NOT HAVING DAVE'S
2 HEAD EXPLODE WITH THE LEVEL OF OCEAN BOILING. [LAUGHTER] ALSO
3 THINKING ABOUT, LIKE, YOU KNOW, IAN JUST COMING BACK FROM
4 SWITZERLAND WHERE THEY HAVE GOTTEN INTO THE THING SINCE '80s
5 AND '90S HAVE SEVERAL DECADES OF PROGRESS THIS IS HOPEFULLY
6 NOT THE \$0.01 ONLY LAST TIME WE WILL DO THIS. SO THINKING
7 ABOUT HOW DOES THIS BECOME A CYCLE LIKE THIS COME BACK IN TWO
8 YEARS AND FOUR YEARS LIKE NOT IN A DECADE. LET'S SEE. HOMES,
9 HOUSING GOALS, FIRST AND LAST MILE. I WANT TO CONNECT THE SPAN
10 OF SERVICE QUESTIONS THAT ANNE OLIVIA WAS MAKING TO SAFETY.
11 BECAUSE LIKE THE POLLING ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY JUMPS
12 OUT, PEOPLE SAY NOT TAKING TRANSIT BECAUSE OF MY SAFETY
13 CONCERNS, LIKE ANNE OLIVIA WAS SAYING I ADOPT LIKE TAKE THE
14 BUS LATE I'M AT THE BART STATION, I NEED A BUS TO COME HOME
15 LATE AT NIGHT, AND THE BUS IS AN HOUR, I DO NOT FEEL SAFE
16 STANDING OUT THERE IN THE DARK. SO I THINK IT YOU CONNECTS TO
17 HELPING PEOPLE WITH THE SAFETY THING. OKAY. ARE WE GOING TO
18 LOSE QUORUM? IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NOBODY IN AM BOARDROOM AND
21 HAVEN'T RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN KNOW PUBLIC COMMENTS. THERE ARE
22 TWO PEOPLE ONLINE.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** TWO MINUTES.

25



JUNE 12, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VEDA YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** VEDA FLOREZ. I'M ON THE MARIN ADVISORY COUNCIL, I
4 REPRESENT THE SENIOR POPULATION, ONE OF THE DRAWBACKS FOR THE
5 SENIOR COMMUNITY, THEY DON'T LIKE TO STAY OUT LATE HOWEVER
6 THEY WOULD WANT TO ADDRESS THE LAST AND FIRST MILE ISSUE THAT
7 BECOMES A BIG BARRIER TO PARTICIPATION IN THE COMMUNITY FOR
8 THE SENIORS AND JUST HOPEFULLY WE CAN PUT THAT DOWN ON PAPER
9 TO ADDRESS WITHIN THE NEXT 20 YEARS BECAUSE THE SMART TRAIN
10 HAS A NEW PILOT PROGRAM ON DEMAND FOR SANTA ROSA AREA SO AS
11 THEY CONTINUE WITH THEIR PILOT PROGRAM PERHAPS WE CAN LEARN
12 FROM WHAT'S HAPPENING THERE. AND I WANT TO LIFT UP ANNE
13 OLIVIA'S COMMENT BECAUSE I ALSO HAVE BEEN ABANDONED, AND I
14 FELT ABANDONED WHEN THE BUS DIDN'T ARRIVE AND I HAD TO WALK IN
15 HIGH HEELS LATE AT NIGHT IN THE DARK, AND MIND YOU I LIVE IN
16 MARIN COUNTY SO IT'S PRETTY STAVE BUT THERE ARE MANY OTHER
17 PARTS IN THE COMMUNITY THAT ARE A SAFE SPACE SO THAT SAFETY
18 ISSUE DOES BECOME WHAT WE NEED TO LOOK AT TO PROVIDE FUNDING
19 TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR TAPS HAVE PROPER LIGHTING AND THE
20 INFORMATION NEEDED IT'S A CERTAIN SPACE OF CLEANLINESS THAT'S
21 A BIG ISSUE ESPECIALLY WHEN I LIVED IN NAPA, I COMMUTED INTO
22 SAN FRANCISCO I TOOK VALLEJO FERRY BUT DIDN'T REALIZE THERE
23 WAS A BUS THAT I COULD PICK UP DOWNTOWN NAPA THAT WOULD TAKE
24 ME TO THE FERRY SO THERE HAS TO BE PROPER OUTREACH THAT SHOWS
25 THE PUBLIC THAT YOU CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THESE OPPORTUNITIES



JUNE 12, 2023

1 AND THEY ARE SAFE THEY'RE CLEAR AND IT'S ADVISABLE EVEN FOR
2 CHILDREN TO RIDE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS GO
5 AHEAD YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS DYLAN, I WORK AT SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS
8 AND I HAD A QUESTION FOR STAFF IF THEY'RE ABLE TO RESPOND
9 WHETHER OR NOT YOU'LL BE WORKING WITH CALTRANS OR ANY OTHER
10 LOCAL DEPARTMENTS OR AGENCIES TO DEAL WITH ROAD MANAGEMENT,
11 THERE HAVE BEEN TIMES OF DELAYS OVER TRANSBAY SERVICE OVER THE
12 BAY BRIDGE DUE TO CAR CRASHES AND THINGS LIKE THAT CURIOUS IF
13 THERE IS ANY, SORT OF, PLAN TO WORK ON THINGS LIKE BUS LANES
14 AND ROADS THINGS LIKE THAT AS PART OF THIS PLAN?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THE FOCUS IS ON LONGER RANGE PLANNING BUT WE WILL BE
17 CONSIDERING THE NEED FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS IN KEY
18 CORRIDORS, AND AS ANDY MENTIONED THERE ARE STAFF BOTH ON THE
19 TRANSIT OPERATOR SIDE AND ON THE MTC SIDE THAT ARE WORKING ON
20 IMPLEMENTING TRANSIT PRIORITY INVESTMENTS AND POLICIES IN THE
21 NEAR-TERM IN, AS AN IMPLEMENTATION ACTION FOR TRANSIT
22 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SPEAKING OF DYLAN, DYLAN WILL HENCE FORTH
25 BE REPLACING BENITA, AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL BE PARTICIPATING IN



JUNE 12, 2023

1 THESE MEETINGS. THANK YOU. WE'RE ABOUT TO LOSE QUORUM TRYING
2 TO MAKE THEIR TRANSIT CONNECTIONS. DO WE HAVE ANY ITEMS OF NEW
3 BUSINESS, WHICH IS ITEM NUMBER SIX OR ANY PUBLIC COMMENT AS
4 PEOPLE ARE STARTING TO WALK OUT THAT DOOR BEFORE WE LOSE
5 QUORUM IN THE NEXT TEN SECONDS.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
8 ON AGENDA ITEM SIX OR SEVEN NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO
9 SPEAK ON EITHER OF THESE ITEMS AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE
10 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR AGENDA ITEMS 6 AND 7.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE ARE NOW
13 AT AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, ADJOURNMENT UNTIL THE NEXT MEETING.
14 HOPEFULLY OUR NEXT MEETING WE'LL BE ABLE TO MEET QUORUM. AND
15 THANKS VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR BRINGING FORWARD THIS. OUR
16 SYSTEM IS NOT REALLY WORKING ALONG THESE LINES, WE CAN MAKE IT
17 BETTER.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE'RE ADJOURNED TERRY AND ANNE OLIVIA.
22 THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

23

24

25



NTT

Broadcasting Government