

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 28, 2022 9:35 AM**

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER FOR THE JOINT MTC AND THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, MY NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR JOINED BY VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ. PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU IT TEAM. COMMISSIONERS IF  
3 YOU ARE ATTENDING IN PERSON -- WHICH I BELIEVE OUR VICE CHAIR  
4 IS, MAKE SURE YOU FOLLOW PROTOCOL WHEN RAISING YOUR HAND, IF  
5 YOU WISH TO PARTICIPATE. SADLY THIS MEETING IS HELD IN MEMORY  
6 OF CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSIONER BOB ALVARADO. HE  
7 STEPPED DOWN EARLIER THIS YEAR AFTER 15 YEARS OF SERVICE,  
8 SERVING AS CHAIR, FOND MEMORIES OF CASA ORGANIZED BY MTC,  
9 LIVING UP TO THE CHALLENGE, WE REMEMBER BOB WITH MANY YEARS OF  
10 LEADERSHIP WITH THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA CARPENTERS REGIONAL  
11 COUNCIL, AND CRAFTING COMPROMISES RESOLVING DISPUTES AND HIS  
12 FRIENDLY PERSONALITY HE BROUGHT WORK IN THE ARENA. BOB'S WAS  
13 STRAIGHT FORWARD, A STRAIGHT SHOOTER WITH A DESIRE TO SOLVE  
14 PROBLEMS BEFORE ALL LEFT THE ROOM WAS SO REFRESHING. WE'RE ALL  
15 GOING TO HAVE FOND MEMORIES OF MR. BOB ALVARADO. SO, WE DO  
16 HAVE A BUSY AGENDA, BUT I DO WANT TO ALLOW FOR ANY  
17 COMMISSIONER COMMENT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

18

19 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. IF THERE WERE AN EMOJI  
20 THAT SAID DITTO, I WOULD PUT IT UP. WELL SAID, AND I COULDN'T  
21 HAVE SAID IT BETTER. THANK YOU FOR THOSE WONDERFUL WORDS ABOUT  
22 OUR BELOVED COMMISSIONER. HE WAS SUCH A GREAT LEADER, BOTH IN  
23 THE CARPENTERS AND ALL OF OUR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND CTC.  
24 IT WAS AN HONOR TO WORK WITH HIM.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER WORTH. I KNOW  
2 WE COULD ALL SHOWER HIM WITH ACCOLADES, WHICH ARE SO  
3 APPROPRIATE. WE'LL MAKE SURE THERE'S A PROPER TIME FOR THAT,  
4 AS WELL. AT THIS TIME WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO OUR NEXT ITEM  
5 ON THE AGENDA ROLL CALL.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

24

25 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY IS ABSENT.

7 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT.

12 COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

17

18 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

25 COMMISSIONER MILEY?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

13

14 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT.

17 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND I HAD FULL  
3 INTENTION OF BEING AT THE COMMISSION MEETING IN-PERSON, BUT  
4 THERE WAS AN UNFORTUNATE ACCIDENT ON THE BRIDGE. FOR THOSE WHO  
5 CAN'T ATTEND IN PERSON, WE WILL MAKE SURE TO TRY TO ATTEND  
6 COMMISSION MEETINGS IN PERSON TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** DESPITE MANY YEARS OF UNDERUSE THE  
9 BOARDROOM STILL LOOKS GOOD.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER] YOU HAVE IT ALL TO YOURSELF  
12 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE PLEDGE, IF  
13 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA COULD LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** PLEASE STAND AND JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE. [  
16 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE  
17 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT  
18 STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND  
19 JUSTICE FOR ALL." THANK YOU.

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, COMMISSIONER. SO,  
22 AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING MOVE TO OUR NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA,  
23 THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE  
2 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY  
3 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A  
4 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
5 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
6 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY.  
9 COMMISSIONER PAPAN? QUESTION? OKAY. I KNOW YOU WILL LATER. SO  
10 AT THIS POINT LET'S MOVE TO 4A, A JOINT MTC AND BAHFA CONSENT  
11 CALENDAR. COMMISSIONERS I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE  
12 MTC CONSENT CALENDAR.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** I JUST WANT TO KNOW SHOULD I HAVE PULLED SOMETHING  
15 AT THIS POINT?

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I THINK THE ITEMS  
18 YOU ARE REFERENCING -- 11A -- OR WAS THIS? WHICH ITEM?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** ACTUALLY, 4C.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY. LET'S MOVE 4C. I'LL NOTE  
23 COMMISSIONER PAPAN WISHES TO DISCUSS 4C.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** AND MOVE 4A AND 4B.





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE HAVE A MOTION FROM COMMISSIONER  
3 PAPAN TO MOVE THE BALANCE.

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND BY GLOVER.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY GLOVER. KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC  
8 COMMENT ON THESE ITEMS?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
11 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
12 ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL  
15 CALL VOTE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

17

18 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY IS HERE.

21 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

22

23 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

9 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. SPERING?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

5

6 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

9 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. I KNOW WE HAVE TO

12 APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR FOR BAHFA, AS WELL, SO, AT THIS

13 POINT I'M GOING TO ASK COMMISSIONER PAPAN TO ASK HER QUESTIONS

14 ON 4C AND I BELIEVE STAFF IS PREPARED AS WELL.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. 4C WEB DESIGN BAHFA DOORWAY HOUSING

17 PORTAL PILOT PROGRAM FOR A MILLION DOLLARS. I THINK IS EXTREME

18 HE IMPORTANT, AND A MILLION DOLLARS FOR A WEB SITE, A LITTLE

19 BIT OF EXPLANATION, I THINK WOULD BENEFIT US ALL. I THINK THIS

20 IS A GREAT PROGRAM. IF YOU WOULD INDULGE ME, I WOULD

21 APPRECIATE IT.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I'LL LOOK TO STAFF TO RESPOND.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, AND I  
2 DO USUAL WE HAVE BARRY ROEDER OF OUR BAHFA STAFF HERE, AND HE  
3 WILL BE ABLE TO MAKE A VERY BRIEF PRESENTATION ON THIS  
4 IMPORTANT PROJECT. SO, I BELIEVE I'LL TURN IT OVER TO BARRY,  
5 AND IF IT STAFF COULD BRING UP THE PRESENTATION?  
6

7 **BARRY ROEDER:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH DIRECTOR MCMILLAN AND  
8 CHAIR PEDROZA, AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN. YES, I'M BARRY ROEDER,  
9 THE BAHFA DOORWAY MANAGER, AND HAPPY TO BE HERE TODAY IN ORDER  
10 TO REQUEST THAT YOU AUTHORIZE OUR NEGOTIATIONS AND EXECUTION  
11 OF A CONTRACT WITH A VENDOR EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE EXYGY FOR UP  
12 TO \$1 MILLION FOR THE DOORWAY HOUSING PORTAL. THANK YOU FOR  
13 LOADING THE PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SOME OF YOU MAY  
14 BE FAMILIAR WITH THE CHALLENGES FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE SEEKING  
15 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THERE HAS, TO DATE, BEEN NO CENTRAL  
16 RESOURCE CERTAINLY AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL AND RESOURCES HAVE  
17 LIMITED AVAILABLE INFORMATION INFORMATION LIMITED IN  
18 ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA SO IF YOU FIND SOMETHING YOU DON'T KNOW  
19 IF IT APPLIES TO YOU, THEN SADLY, SOME, SORT OF, ANALOG, IF  
20 YOU WILL, EXPERIENCES OF A LONG PAPER APPLICATION CAN BE UP TO  
21 12 TO 15 PAGES BY DEVELOPMENT THAT ARE UNIQUE TO THAT  
22 DEVELOPMENT AND THEN YOU MIGHT HAVE TO WAIT FOR A LONG LINE TO  
23 SUBMIT IT THEN THERE IS AN OPAQUE PROCESS IN TERMS OF WHAT  
24 HAPPENED TO THAT APPLICATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS  
25 NEED, THE NEED I ACTUALLY, IN MY WORK, ALONG WITH DIRECTOR



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 KATE HARTLEY AT THE MAYOR'S OFFICE OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY  
2 DEVELOPMENT IN SAN FRANCISCO LAUNCHED IN EARLY 2016 THE DAHLIA  
3 HOUSING PORTAL AND IN SAN FRANCISCO WHAT THAT DID IS IT PUT  
4 ALL AFFORDABLE HOUSING LISTINGS IN ONE PLACE SO IT MADE IT  
5 MUCH EASIER TO FIND AND APPLY FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND  
6 NOTING WITH THE APPLICATION IF YOU DID IT ON YOUR PHONE WHICH  
7 THE SYSTEM IS DESIGNED DO DO IT WORKS ON ALL PLATFORMS IT CAN  
8 TAKE TEN MINUTES WE FOUND IT MUCH EASIER FOR USERS TO GET THIS  
9 NEED MET. YOU SEE ON SCREEN AN EXAMPLE FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY  
10 BECAUSE SAN FRANCISCO DESIGNED THIS WITH OPEN SOURCE CODE OPEN  
11 TO BE USED BY ANY JURISDICTION THAT NEEDS TO USE IT TO DATE  
12 THE CODE HIS ALSO BEEN USED BY THE CITY OF DETROIT  
13 INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH IN DEVELOPMENT BY CITY OF CHICAGO, USED  
14 NOW COUNTY OF SAN JOSE SAN MATEO COUNTY AND THE PROPOSITION IS  
15 USING THIS ALL IN ONE PLACE, TASK IS TO BUILD A REGIONAL  
16 HOUSING PORTFOLIO WHERE YOU CAN FIND OPPORTUNITIES ALL IN ONE  
17 PLACE THIS IS IN PROCESS. JUST A NOTE ABOUT IMPACT TO DATE,  
18 SAN FRANCISCO DAHLIA, THESE ARE THE NUMBERS, THE MOST ROBUST  
19 NUMBERS FROM SAN FRANCISCO. BUT THERE HAVE BEEN OVER A MILLION  
20 ONLINE APPLICATIONS TO DATE. 97% HAVE APPLIED ONLINE. THAT'S  
21 PROBABLY MY FAVORITE STATISTIC ON THIS ON SCREEN. THAT'S IS  
22 SOMEWHAT RADICAL VOLUME. PAPER APPLICATIONS ARE STILL  
23 AVAILABLE FOR THOSE THAT CHOOSE TO DO THAT, AND WE WILL ALWAYS  
24 KEEP THOSE AVAILABLE. THAT TELLS US, WITH THE 97% FIGURE, IS  
25 THAT, ONE THAT THE TECHNOLOGY WORKS, AND TWO, PEOPLE KNOW HOW



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 TO USE IT. THAT'S BECAUSE OF A RIGOROUS USER-FOCUSED TESTING  
2 PROCESS TO MAKE SURE THAT FOLKS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO HELP AND  
3 THE ONES THAT KNOW HOW TO USE THIS. IT'S NOT RANDOM TESTING  
4 WITH ANYBODY. IT'S FOLKS THAT WE'RE HOPING TO HELP GET HOUSED.  
5 COUPLE OF OTHER NOTES HERE 2.3 MILLION UNIQUE USERS TO DATE  
6 AND OVER 7 MILLION VISITS TO DATE ON THE SAN FRANCISCO HOUSING  
7 PORTAL ALONE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, DOORWAY IS TWO WEB SITES.  
8 IT'S THE USER/APPLICANT PORTAL, THE PLACE YOU GO TO FIND --  
9 AGAIN, FIND AND APPLY FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. BUT ALSO A SITE  
10 FOR PARTNERS. A QUICK GLANCE ON THIS SCREEN FOR PARTNERS THEY  
11 CAN SEE APPLICATIONS RECEIVED, THEY CAN TYPE IN ANY PAPER  
12 APPLICATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN FORWARDED TO THEM AFTER LOGGING  
13 FOR TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY AND THEY CAN USE THE  
14 SYSTEM ALL THE WAY UP TO LEASING UP. FOR INSTANCE, A LOTTERY  
15 HAPPENS THEY SEE THE ORDER OF DECISION ON THE APPLICATIONS,  
16 THEY CALL FOLKS IN THAT ORDER, AND LOG DECISIONS MADE ON  
17 APPLICATIONS, APPROVED, DECLINED, ET CETERA. INCREDIBLE DATA  
18 IN TERMS OF UNDERSTANDING PRACTICES OF OUR ESTEEMED  
19 PROFESSIONAL PARTNERS, DEVELOPERS, AND LEASING AGENTS, AND  
20 UNDERSTANDING THE NEED WE FACE IN TERMS OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING.  
21 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. JUST A NOTE, I MENTIONED THE IDEA OF  
22 ITERATION. OUR MOST ACTIVE PARTNERS ON THIS REGIONAL EFFORT --  
23 AND I SHOULD STEP BACK AND SAY I BEGAN THIS WORK WITH SOME  
24 REGIONAL COLLEAGUES, BACK IN 2018, SO, WE HAVE BEEN ADVANCING  
25 THIS EVEN BEFORE BAHFA, BUT OF COURSE DOORWAY IS HAPPY TO BE A



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 PART OF BAHFA'S WORK TODAY. THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, TOP OF THE  
2 LIST THERE, IMAGINE, THEIR PORTAL AND THE SAN MATEO COUNTY  
3 PORTAL WILL BE INTEGRATED AND THE DOORWAY PORTAL AT LAUNCH.  
4 THAT IS TO SAY THAT THOSE UNIQUELY BRANDED PORTALS WILL GO  
5 AWAY AND PART OF THE DOORWAY PORTAL WHICH IS VERY EXCITING  
6 MARIN COUNTY AND OAKLAND WILL ALSO BE INCLUDED IN LAUNCH WE'RE  
7 WORKING TO FIGURE OUT THE PARTICULARS ALAMEDA COUNTY WE HOPE  
8 TO HAVE LISTINGS AT LAUNCH AND WE'RE WORKING TO FIGURE OUT THE  
9 BEST WAY TO DO THIS AND MAINTAINING ORIGINAL BRANDING ET  
10 CETERA OR BEING PART OF A REGIONAL PLATFORM BUT THEY'RE  
11 CERTAINLY ONE OF OUR PARTNERS AND WE'RE HAPPY TO HAVE THAT.  
12 SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY SIMILAR CONVERSATIONS HAPPENING IN THE  
13 BEST WAY PARTNERING WITH EACH OTHER AND FINALLY ON THE LIST,  
14 SANTA CLARA COUNTY, CONTRA COSTA COUNTY ARE TARGETED FOR LATER  
15 INCLUSION IN 2024 AND NAPA, SOLANO, AND SONOMA WE HOPE TO  
16 INCLUDE LATER. THIS IS AN ITERATIVE PROCESS DATES AND ITEMS  
17 COULD CHANGE AS WE PROCEED BUT THIS IS TYPICAL FOR TECHNOLOGY  
18 PROJECTS TO DO THESE IN PIECES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A NOTE I  
19 MENTIONED DATA, ONE OF THE THINGS WE DISCOVERED ON THE SAN  
20 FRANCISCO TEAM, OF COURSE, OUR OBJECTIVE WAS TO BUILD  
21 SOMETHING THAT MADE IT EASIER TO FIND AND APPLY FOR AFFORDABLE  
22 HOUSING. AND BASED ON THE STATISTICS YOU SAW IN EARLIER SLIDES  
23 WE THOUGHT WE ACCOMPLISHED THAT. WHAT WE DIDN'T EXPECT IS THE  
24 INCREDIBLE AMOUNT OF DATA THAT THIS GENERATES AND OF COURSE  
25 SOME OF MY TECHNOLOGY, MY PRIVATE SECTOR TECHNOLOGY COLLEAGUES





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WOULD OF LAUGH AT ME AND SAY THIS IS HOW THINGS WORK AND GO.  
2 THERE IS IMMENSE DATA TO GO IN, IF FOLKS IN A JURISDICTION ARE  
3 LOOKING FOR THESE DEMOGRAPHICS THIS TYPE OF HOUSING, AND TYPE  
4 OF UNIT PLACED IN INCREDIBLY VALUABLE DATA AND TACKLING THE  
5 PROBLEM OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE BAY AREA. JUST WANT TO  
6 BRING THAT TO YOUR ATTENTION. WE BELIEVE DOORWAY HOUSING  
7 PORTAL IS A TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECT IN THE BAY AREA AND WILL  
8 COMPREHENSIVELY ADDRESS THE DIFFICULTY AND EQUITY IN FINDING  
9 HOUSING IN ORDER TO DO THIS WE NEED TO PARTNER WITH EXYGY, IN  
10 THE HOUSING PORTAL EXPERIENCE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
11 CONSIDERATION AND I'M CERTAINLY HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS  
12 THAT YOU HAVE

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** BARRY THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I HAVE  
15 NEVER SEEN SUCH A SUCCINCT PRESENTATION FOR OUR CONSENT  
16 CALENDAR. YOU NAILED THAT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** BARRY, THAT IS ABSOLUTELY AMAZING AND VERY  
19 EXCITING. TWO QUICK QUESTIONS HERE. BILINGUAL ASPECTS, IS THAT  
20 INCORPORATED INTO THIS APPLICATION PROCESS IN ANY WAY SHAPE OR  
21 FORM? AND SECONDARILY, THE INFORMATION IS SO EXCITING. IS  
22 THERE A LINK BETWEEN INCOME CERTIFICATION AND AFFORDABLE  
23 HOUSING ENROLLMENT IN OUR CLIPPER PROGRAM?

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **BARRY ROEDER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. TO  
2 ADDRESS YOUR FIRST QUESTION REGARDING BILINGUAL. THE SAN  
3 FRANCISCO SITE IS CURRENTLY OFFERED IN FOUR LANGUAGES IN THE  
4 CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO AND THAT'S BEEN DONE FOR THE  
5 CITY OF SAN JOSE, SAN MATEO COUNTY AND ALAMEDA COUNTY AND WE  
6 WILL DO THAT FOR THE REGIONAL PORTAL AVAILABLE IN FIVE  
7 LANGUAGES TO BEGIN WITH. WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT THAT. WITH REGARD  
8 TO YOUR QUESTION ABOUT CLIPPER THAT'S ONE THEY HAVEN'T  
9 CONSIDERED I WILL TELL YOU WE HAVE HAD INTERESTING  
10 CONVERSATIONS WITH COLLEAGUES AT BAHFA TO FIGURE OUT BEST  
11 ALIGNMENT IN OVERLAPPING THESE PILOT INITIATIVES AND TO WHAT  
12 DEGREE AN ELECTRIC PORTAL OF THIS SORT CAN MEET THOSE NEEDS  
13 WE'RE BALANCING BETWEEN, SORT OF, A ONE-STOP-SHOP, IF YOU  
14 MANAGE TO FIND US WE'RE GOING HELP YOU TO ANY OTHER HOUSING  
15 RESOURCES AND POTENTIALLY SOME RELATED THINGS AND TO WHAT  
16 DEGREE DO WE LOSE FOLKS IF WE PUT TOO MUCH IN THERE. BUT I CAN  
17 TELL YOU THAT'S A VERY INTERESTING QUESTION THEY WOULD LIKE TO  
18 DO FURTHER RESEARCH ON.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, BARRY, MOVE APPROVAL.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN FOR ITEM  
23 4C.

24

25 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** SECOND.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I HEARD COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA FOR A  
5 SECOND. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON 4C?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
8 WRITING, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND  
9 RAISED, BUT I DO HAVE A QUESTION, A CLARIFYING QUESTION, THIS  
10 MOTION AND SECOND IS FOR THE BAHFA --

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** 4C.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** -- AND 4C. BECAUSE BAHFA HAD TO TAKE A  
15 SEPARATE VOTE FOR THE FULL CONSENT CALENDAR.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** IF WE'RE ALLOWED TO PUT THIS ON THAT  
18 MOTION, I WOULD WELCOME THAT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KATHLEEN WOULD YOU, PLEASE, CONFIRM IF WE  
21 CAN DO THAT? SINCE 4C IS FOR AUTHORITY APPROVAL, ANYWAY.

22

23 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I WOULD HATE TO SAY IT, BUT WE PROBABLY  
24 SHOULDN'T COMBINE AGENDA ITEMS. JUST FOR CLARITY OF THE RECORD  
25 ON THIS. MY APOLOGIES.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COUNSEL. THE MOTION IS TO  
3 APPROVE 4C UNDER THE MTC CONSENT CALENDAR. THEN COME BACK FOR  
4 THE FULL MOTION FOR BAHFA CONSENT. MOTION BY PAPAN, SECOND BY  
5 ABE-KOGA. NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. ROLL CALL VOTE  
6 PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE UPON AHN?

19

20 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

6

7 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

9

10 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

13

14 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SCHAFF.

17 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
2 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S MOVE ON TO  
5 THE MOTION TO APPROVE THE BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. AND IF  
6 COMMISSIONER PAPAN WILL NOT VOTE FOR THIS ONE.

7

8 **AMY R. WORTH:** MOVE APPROVAL, WORTH.

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT  
13 ASSOCIATED WITH THE BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
16 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
17 ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE FIRST BY WORTH,  
20 SECOND BY GLOVER. LET'S DO ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

2

3 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

6

7 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

10

11 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

22

23 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN? YOU'RE ON MUTE.

17

18 **AMY R. WORTH:** SHE'S FROZEN.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

4

5 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

12

13 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

16 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. ITEM FIVE,

19 THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE

20 CLERK TO LIST ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT

21 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV) INTO THE

22 RECORD OR IF YOU'RE PHONING IN PLEASE DIAL STAR NINE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. WE HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF

25 CORRESPONDENCE FROM IAN GRIFFITHS OF SEAMLESS BAY AREA THAT



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA, AND DISTRIBUTED TO THE  
2 COMMISSION.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY.  
5 WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM SIX, ADJOURNMENT OF THE BAY  
6 AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. CONTINUING WITH THE BALANCE OF  
7 MTC. ITEM SEVEN, THIS IS THE CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. SOME OF  
8 YOU, MANY OF YOU MIGHT HAVE HEARD THE NEWS THAT OUR FEARLESS  
9 LEADER HAS DECIDED TO RETIRE. AND I'LL JUST SAY, THIS IS NOT  
10 THE MOMENT THAT WE'RE ALL GOING TO EMBRACE HER WITH THE  
11 WONDERFUL COMMENTS, WE'RE GOING TO MAKE SURE WE DO THIS THE  
12 RIGHT WAY AT THE RIGHT TIME BUT THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF PRESS  
13 AROUND IT SO I WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE IT AT OUR FIRST  
14 COMMISSION MEETING AS WE HAVE JUST HEARD. WE CAN'T BE MORE  
15 PROUD OF THERESE AND HER SERVICE TO THE COMMISSION IS TO THIS  
16 COMMISSION THAT HAS WORKED CLOSELY WITH THERESE TO EMBARKING  
17 ON DOING WHAT'S BEST FOR THE REGION AND DELIVERING OUTCOMES ON  
18 TIME. THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE AND JOINING MTC. YOU HAVE  
19 MADE A REAL DIFFERENCE. THANK YOU TO COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS  
20 OF THE PUBLIC I LOOK FORWARD TO OPPORTUNITY TO UPDATE ON THE  
21 RECRUITMENT STATUS THAT SHOULD BE COMING UP SHORTLY BUT NOTED  
22 SOME INFORMATION AND NOTIFICATIONS WILL BE COMING OUT ON THAT  
23 AS WELL. IT IS AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK TO THE FUTURE  
24 OF THIS REGION AND IT'S BEEN BUILT OFF SO MUCH GOOD WORK FROM  
25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS TO THE COMMISSION. BUT THERESE GOING BACK



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 TO YOU, THANK YOU FOR WHAT YOU HAVE DONE FOR US AND  
2 CHALLENGING US TO KEEP UP IN LEGACY OF DOING GOOD FOR THE  
3 REGION.

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. APPRECIATE IT.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AGAIN, WE'LL HAVE PLENTY OF  
8 OPPORTUNITIES TO SHOWER THERESE WITH PRAISE, AND ALSO  
9 REMINISCE ON THOSE GOOD TIMES. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO  
10 PROCEED TO ITEM EIGHT, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. I'M  
11 GOING TO CALL UPON RANDI KINMAN TO GIVE HER REPORT-OUT.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA, AND GOOD MORNING  
14 COMMISSIONERS. AS YOU KNOW, DUE TO BEHIND THE SCENES PROBLEMS  
15 STAFF SCHEDULING THE COUNT DIDN'T MEET UP IN AUGUST AT THE  
16 MEETINGS WE COVERED CHANGES ON CLIPPER, POTENTIAL REGIONAL  
17 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE FIRST INTRODUCTION TO NEW DIRECTORS,  
18 AND MET WITH EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE EMBEDDED STAFF  
19 WITH NEXGEN FREEWAY PROJECTS AND BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE  
20 BUSINESS CASE STUDY AND, APPROVED AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE ACTION  
21 PLAN, TAPS SAY COMBINATION OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBERS  
22 AND OUTSIDE REPRESENTATIVES IN THIS NEW BODY WE ALSO ADDED A  
23 PUBLIC SEAT FOR REPRESENTATION FROM THE DISABLED COMMUNITY TO  
24 ENSURE ACCESS DISCUSSIONS ACROSS THE BOARD. I WANT TO THANK  
25 KATE FOR OFFERING THE COUNCIL A NON-VOTING LIAISON SEAT FOR



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 THE ADVISORY BOARD TO ALLOW US TO MAINTAIN CONNECTIONS WITH  
2 THIS BODY AND SHOUT OUT TO MELANIE CHOY FOR THE FACILITATING  
3 OF TAPS. AS THE NAME POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL STATES WE REVIEW  
4 AND COMMENT ON POLICY DEVELOPMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION. AND I  
5 WANT TO BE CLEAR THIS IS NOT MEANT TO BE DISRESPECTFUL OF  
6 STAFF BECAUSE THEY DO AN INCREDIBLE JOB AND ARE ALWAYS WILLING  
7 TO HELP BUT WE'RE ASKING STAFF TO FOCUS ON DEVELOPMENT OF  
8 CUSTOMER-FACING ACTIVITIES. MTC IS NOT A CUSTOMER-FACING  
9 ENTITY OUTSIDE OF CERTAIN TYPES OF PLANNED BAY AREA OUTREACH  
10 WHERE THEY ARE JUST EXCELLENT BUT THAT'S WHERE THE POLICY  
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL DIGS IN, IN BETWEEN THE SKILL OF POLICY WONKS  
12 AND AGENCY AND THE GENERAL PUBLIC AND OUR PROJECTS TAKE ON  
13 STAKEHOLDERS WHO ARE OFTEN NEVER IN THE ROOM TRANSIT RIDERS  
14 DRIVERS, SENIORS, DISABLED, WHEN PROJECTS ARE IN DEVELOPMENT  
15 THE BENEFIT OF THAT SHOULD BE PROJECTS, PROGRAMS AND POLICIES  
16 THAT WOULD REVEAL TO THE GENERAL PUBLIC, HAVE THE BENEFIT OF  
17 OUTSIDE EYES. OUR GOAL IS TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PRESENTATIONS  
18 MTC DOES, WHEN THEY REACH THE GENERAL PUBLIC, ARE SUCCESSFUL.  
19 LATELY, HOWEVER, DUE TO RAPID PACE AND MISCOMMUNICATION WE  
20 HAVE NOT BEEN ON THE GROUND FLOOR LEVEL OF SOME PROJECTS THIS  
21 HAS LED TO CONVERSATIONS WHERE, HONESTLY AFTER 30 MINUTES OF  
22 DISCUSSION EITHER DID NOT UNDERSTAND THE CONCEPT OR HAVE A  
23 CLEAN GRASP ON WHY SOMETHING IS BEING PROPOSED. IN ONE CASE,  
24 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES WERE TARGETED FOR A FOCUS GROUP  
25 FOR A NEW AP BASED SYSTEM WITHOUT CONSULTING ANYBODY WHO WORKS



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 IN THOSE COMMUNITIES OR OUR EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE,  
2 INCLUDING US EARLIER RATHER THAN PRESENTING A BAKED PRODUCT  
3 WOULD HAVE RESULTED IN A SLIGHTLY MORE DIFFERENT PRODUCT. AT  
4 OUR RECENT MEETING, AFTER A 30 MINUTE DISCUSSION IT WAS CLEAR,  
5 WE, WHO ARE TRAINED IN INDUSTRY JARGON AND SUPPORTIVE DID NOT  
6 UNDERSTAND WHERE THERE WERE MULTIPLE INTERCONNECTING FACES TO  
7 CLIPPER. WHILE THE TWO DOZEN PEOPLE IN OUR REGION ARE ABLE TO  
8 CALL STAFF THAT'S NOT VIABLE WHEN THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE HAVE  
9 QUESTIONS. STAFF HAS REACHED OUT SO WE CAN FIX THIS MESSAGE.  
10 THESE LESSONS ARE A REMINDER THAT WE ARE A PROXY FOR PUBLIC  
11 OUTREACH AND CAN HELP A PROCESS BE MORE CLEAR FOR THE END USER  
12 AS MTC TAKES ON MORE OF THESE CUSTOMER FACES PROJECTS. I CAN  
13 THINK OF TWO AREAS WHERE EARLY INPUT WILL BE TO EVERYONE'S  
14 BENEFIT IN SEVERAL MONTHS WE'LL BE MEETING WITH THE BAY TRAIL  
15 GROUP AND HOPE TO HAVE DISCUSSIONS THAT EDUCATE OUR BODY ABOUT  
16 THE TRAIL AND ITS CURRENT CAPACITY BUT WE ALSO WANT TO MOVE  
17 FORWARD TO ENSURE THAT WE ARE DEVELOPING STANDARDS ACROSS THE  
18 BOARD THAT WILL CREATE A FULLY ACCESSIBLE TRAIL AND A WEB SITE  
19 THAT ALLOWS PEOPLE TO PLAN AROUND PERIODIC CLOSURES OR  
20 HAZARDS. WE CAN ALSO ADD VALUE TO THE BAHFA AT AN EARLY STAGE  
21 BY CONVENING MEETINGS THAT FOCUS ON DISABLED, SENIORS AND  
22 OTHERS WITH SPECIAL NEEDS WHEN DISCUSSING ACCESSIBLE HOUSING.  
23 ACCESS IS FAR BEYOND AN ADA COMPLIANT BATHROOM AND WE CAN HELP  
24 SET NEW STANDARDS THAT ADDRESS EXISTING AND FUTURE NEEDS. THE  
25 WAITING LIST FOR LOW-INCOME ASSISTED LIVING SENIOR HOUSING IS



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 YEARS, AND I KNOW FROM EXPERIENCE THAT THE SIX YEARS IT TOOK  
2 FOR MY MOTHER TO REACH THE TOP OF THE LIST IS TOO LONG. OUR  
3 HOMELESS POPULATION WITH RISING NUMBERS OF SENIORS AND  
4 DISABLED, ALONG WITH AGING BOOMERS NEED ADAPTABLE HOUSING AND  
5 WE'RE GLAD TO IDENTIFY THOSE NEEDS. CONVENING SENIORS AND  
6 DISABLED CARE TAKERS WILL ALLOW US TO DEVELOP SUPPORTIVE  
7 HOUSING THAT DOES NOT NEED RETROFITTING AND STILL ACCOMMODATES  
8 ABLE BODY RESIDENTS. WE LOOK FORWARD TO PARTICIPATING IN THAT  
9 PROCESS. FOR ALL OF THESE PUBLIC FACING THINGS WE HAVE HAD A  
10 PATH, AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH STAFF TO IDENTIFY  
11 ISSUES. MY BIG CONCERN, HOWEVER, IS WHAT FEELS LIKE A  
12 DIMINISHMENT OF THE PROMISE OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
13 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE WAS NOT FIRST TIME WE HEARD FROM THE  
14 PUBLIC REGARDING SYSTEMIC CHANGE NEEDED IN TRANSIT COVID WAS A  
15 CATALYST FOR CREATING TRANSFORMATIONAL PLANS. IN ORDER TO DO  
16 THAT, WE INCLUDED EVERYBODY, INCLUDING THE PUBLIC AT THE  
17 TABLE. YOU HAVE A LETTER IN YOUR PACKET FROM ADINA LEVIN, WHO  
18 IS THE COUNCIL'S CHAIR FOR THE TAP'S GROUP AND WHO SITS ON THE  
19 BUSINESS CASE STUDY COMMITTEE THAT OUTLINES THIS CLEARER THAN  
20 I CAN. BUT WE HAVE CONCERNS THAT WE'RE RECEIVING FROM THE  
21 GENERAL PUBLIC. I WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT THERE IS NO INTENT TO  
22 STALL PROJECTS IN THE PIPELINE, AND MY CONCERN IS IF THERE IS  
23 NO PLACE IN THE TIMELINE FOR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT, OTHER THAN TWO  
24 MINUTES AT A MEETING, WE WERE REPEATEDLY TOLD STAKEHOLDERS  
25 WERE CONSULTED ON ITEMS, BUT WHEN WE ASKED WHO THE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 STAKEHOLDERS WERE, THEY WERE DESCRIBED AS INTERNAL STAFF AND  
2 STAFF FROM TRANSIT AGENCIES. WE NEED TO ENSURE THAT THE PUBLIC  
3 STILL FEELS THAT THEY HAVE A SEAT. THIS ISN'T ABOUT DELAYING  
4 PROJECTS, IT'S ABOUT MAINTAINING THE PUBLIC SEAT AND ENSURING  
5 THAT THE WORD STAKEHOLDER INCLUDES MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. AND  
6 I WANT TO END THIS WITH A THANK YOU TO AWFUL YOU WHO APPOINTED  
7 PEOPLE THAT SURROUND THIS, THEY'RE AN INCREDIBLE GROUP AND ARE  
8 EAGER TO ENGAGE IN A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT ISSUES WHEN I ASKED  
9 VOLUNTEERS TO SIT AND REPRESENT AND WHO ARE FAMILIAR WITH  
10 STAFF THERE IS AN ABUNDANCE OF HANDS RAISED I CAN ASSURE YOU  
11 THIS HAS NEVER HAPPENED IN THE PAST AND THAT ENDS MY REPORT.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU RANDI. I SUPPORT THE EARLY  
14 INTERVENTION, THERE ARE BENEFITS TO EARLY DISCUSSION BUT I  
15 BELIEVE IT WILL BE OF BENEFIT AND APPROPRIATE TO BRING A  
16 MEETING WITH MYSELF AND OUR EXECUTIVE TEAM ON EXPECTATIONS OF  
17 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, WE NEED TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION  
18 AND I'LL MAKE SURE ALIX AND THERESE FOLLOW UP WITH YOU, AND  
19 MYSELF AND OUR VICE CHAIR TO MAKE SURE WE'RE MANAGING  
20 EXPECTATIONS AND COMMUNICATION AND EFFECTIVENESS. THANK YOU.

21

22 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONERS, ANY  
25 QUESTIONS ON RANDY'S REPORT? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. RANDI, THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT, AND  
3 ONE REQUEST I WOULD MAKE DURING THE MEETING, I WOULD BE VERY  
4 INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING WHAT OUR OUTREACH POLICY IS, AND  
5 THAT WAY, IN TERMS OF SETTING EXPECTATIONS, CHAIR PEDROZA, I  
6 THINK YOU RAISE A GOOD POINT, BOTH FOR OUR BOARD MEMBERS, FOR  
7 US, FOR OUR VOLUNTEER COMMITTEES, AND ALSO FOR OUR STAFF,  
8 BECAUSE I DO THINK THAT SOME OF THIS IS COMMUNICATION, SOME OF  
9 IT IS EXPECTATION, BUT SOME OF IT IS JUST CLARITY IN TERMS OF  
10 WHAT IS EXPECTED, IN TERMS OF WHAT, WHEN WE SAY OUTREACH, WHAT  
11 IS IT THAT WE MEAN SPECIFICALLY

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ABSOLUTELY. I YOU THINK THAT IS A GOOD  
14 ADDITION, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I KEEP FREEZING UP. I WANT TO THANK RANDI TOO,  
17 VERY MUCH. THE ISSUE OF STAKEHOLDERS, REALLY HELPING US  
18 UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY ARE AND WHO THEY ARE WITHIN OUR  
19 JURISDICTIONS WOULD BE EXTREMELY HELPFUL TO MANY OF US. SO, AS  
20 WE MOVE FORWARD, THANK YOU FOR ASSISTING US IN THAT PROCESS,  
21 AS WELL.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GOT IT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.  
24 I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS RAISED. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANY  
25 PUBLIC COMMENT ON RANDY'S REPORT-OUT?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, THERE CHAIR, WE DID RECEIVE ONE  
3 LETTER OF CORRESPOND FROM ADINA LEVIN, THE POLICY ADVISORY  
4 COUNCIL. AND THEN WE DO HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
5 THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO ALLOW?

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOT IT. FOR THE FIRST SPEAKER, IT'S  
10 ADINA LEVIN F YOU WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF,  
11 YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN, ON THE  
14 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND SHARING THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
15 PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE. I REALLY WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION AND  
16 STAFF FOR EXPANDING THE FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
17 SUBCOMMITTEE TO COVER THE SPECTRUM. TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN  
18 ITEMS. IT WILL BE VERY USEFUL AND HOPEFULLY IT WILL HELP US BE  
19 MORE USEFUL TO THE COMMISSION TO HAVE ONE PLACE FOR THE  
20 DIFFERENT INITIATIVES IN THAT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO  
21 COME FORWARD, AND GET THAT FEEDBACK THAT WE CAN PROVIDE TO THE  
22 COMMISSION, AND, SIMILARLY, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR THE  
23 COMMISSION TO HAVE A SINGLE PLACE TO BE ABLE TO SEE WHERE ALL  
24 OF THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT ACTION PLAN INITIATIVES ARE. RIGHT  
25 NOW THOSE ITEMS COME FORWARD TO MULTIPLE DIFFERENT COMMITTEES



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WITHIN MTC, AND I THINK IT WOULD HELP THE COMMISSION TO HAVE  
2 THAT BRINGING FORWARD TO ONE PLACE. AND THIS BRINGS ME TO  
3 SUPPORTING THE COMMENT THAT RANDI KINMAN WAS MAKING, WITH  
4 REGARD TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE. ONE OF THE KEY  
5 ELEMENTS IN A NETWORK MANAGEMENT ENTITY AND FUNCTION IS TO  
6 HAVE A PLACE TO BE ACCOUNTABLE FOR THE COORDINATION DECISIONS  
7 AND POLICIES REGARDING OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. AND, SO,  
8 HAVING THE PUBLIC, THE RIDERS, THE INSTITUTIONAL STAKEHOLDERS  
9 ARE CONSIDERED IN THAT ACCOUNTABILITY IS, IN DEFINING THAT  
10 ACCOUNTABILITY, IS VERY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS WARREN  
13 CUSHMAN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES,  
14 MR. CUSHMAN. MR. CUSHMAN, IF YOU ARE THERE?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. HELLO COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS WARREN  
17 CUSHMAN, AND I AM A MEMBER OF THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL OF THE  
18 BLIND. I AM A RIDER, AND I WILL BE INVOLVED WITH THE  
19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN FUTURE. I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENTS  
20 OF CHAIR KINMAN AND ADINA LEVIN. ALSO, I WANT TO TALK A LITTLE  
21 BIT ABOUT PARATRANSIT. THERE IS A LOT OF CONCERN AROUND  
22 PARATRANSIT AND HOW PARATRANSIT IS GOING TO WORK. THERE IS AN  
23 INVESTMENT FROM STAFF, FROM YOUR STAFF, AROUND PARATRANSIT,  
24 AND THERE ARE EXPECTATIONS AROUND THAT. I THINK MANAGING  
25 EXPECTATION IS A THING THAT WE SHOULD ALL BE THINKING ABOUT



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 AND CLARITY IS IMPORTANT. I WANT TO ECHO THAT, AS WELL. I WANT  
2 TO CLOSE WITH THE IDEA THAT I HAVE BEEN ATTENDING THE POLICY  
3 ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETINGS AS WELL AS THE SUBCOMMITTEE, EQUITY  
4 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, YOU REALLY DO HAVE A WIDE RANGE OF  
5 EXPERTS IN EQUITY AND ACCESS. WE CARRY EACH OTHER'S WATER IN  
6 THAT REALM. IT'S NICE TO BE ABLE, TO AS A DISABLED PERSON,  
7 HAVE FOLKS WHO REPRESENT EQUITY WHO CARRY OUR WATER AND VICE-  
8 VERSA. IT'S A SEAMLESS PROCESS IN TERMS OF FOLKS RESPECTING  
9 AND WORKING WITH ONE ANOTHER. AND I REALLY HOPE THAT, AS WE  
10 MOVE FORWARD, THAT THE REALM OF EQUITY AND ACCESS WILL  
11 ESSENTIALLY LIVE ON THE SAME PLAYING FIELD AT TRANSIT  
12 OPERATORS, OPERATES, AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS. THANK YOU VERY  
13 MUCH.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS  
16 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.  
19 MOVING TO ITEM NINE, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THERESE,  
20 TAKE IT AWAY

21

22 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I'LL OPEN WITH ANOTHER  
23 IMPORTANT RETIREMENT. LINDA LEE AS YOU ALL KNOW STARTED BACK  
24 IN JANUARY OF 1999 AS AN ASSISTANT PLANNER ANALYST HER LAST  
25 DAY IS SEPTEMBER 30TH AND SHE WORKED IN THE PROJECT DELIVERY



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 SECTION WE WILL MISS HER SUNNY DISPOSITION AND THE WORK THAT  
2 SHE DID FOR THE REGION. I HAVE A PRETTY LONG REPORT. SO I WILL  
3 ENCOURAGE YOU TO READ IT AND I'LL FOCUS ON A FEW THINGS. THE  
4 FIRST IS TO HIGHLIGHT, AGAIN, SOME WORK BY BAHFA. THE BAY AREA  
5 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY IN EARLY AUGUST WE CLOSED A FIRST  
6 EVER TRANSACTION FUNDING A \$5,000 GRANT A WELFARE TAX  
7 EXEMPTION PRESERVATION PROGRAM. IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT  
8 THAT, KATE IS AND CAN ANSWER THEM. WHAT'S IMPORTANT HERE IS  
9 THAT IT ENABLED NON-PROFIT EDEN HOUSING TO CONVERT ITS  
10 RECENTLY ACQUIRED 24 UNIT TERRACE APARTMENT COMPLEX IN ALAMEDA  
11 COUNTY, ASHLAND COMMUNITY, TO PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING.  
12 THERE HAS BEEN QUITE A CALL FOR A FOCUS ON ON THE GROUND  
13 PRESERVATION RELATED PROJECTS. AND THIS IS ONE OF THEM, AND,  
14 AGAIN, I THINK, ILLUSTRATED THE NEW TOOLS THAT BAHFA CAN BRING  
15 TO THE TABLE. ALSO WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT, I THINK, SOMETHING FOR  
16 ALL OF US TO BE QUITE PROUD OF, IN TERMS OF GETTING THINGS ON  
17 THE GROUND, WHICH WAS CLIPPER BAY PASS. AND IN PARTNERSHIP  
18 WITH OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES WHO PARTICIPATE IN THE CLIPPER FARE  
19 PAYMENT SYSTEMS WE LAUNCHED ON AUGUST 25TH, A TWO-YEAR PILOT  
20 PROGRAM TO STUDY THE IMPACT OF A SINGLE PASS THAT WILL PROVIDE  
21 CLOSE TO 50,000 BAY AREA RESIDENTS FREE ACCESS ON ALL BUS,  
22 RAIL, AND FERRY SERVICES IN THE NINE COUNTY REGION. WE  
23 LAUNCHED IT PRIMARILY WITH PARTICIPATING STUDENTS AT SAN  
24 FRANCISCO STATE UNIVERSITY, SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY,  
25 UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA BERKELEY, AND SANTA ROSA JUNIOR



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 COLLEGE. WE'LL ALSO BE EXPANDING TO INCLUDE RESIDENTS OF  
2 SELECT AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMUNITIES MANAGED BY MIDPEN  
3 HOUSING. AND AS A PERSONAL ANECDOTE ON THIS, THERE WAS A  
4 TRANSIT GM RIDE-ALONG THEY PARTICIPATED IN WITH SEVERAL OF OUR  
5 TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT HAPPENED ON SEPTEMBER 16TH WHERE WE  
6 RODE DIFFERENT SYSTEMS TOGETHER AND INVITED THE PUBLIC TO JOIN  
7 US, AND ONE OF THE BAY PAST STUDENTS WHO WENT TO SAN FRANCISCO  
8 STATE CAME UP TO ME AND WAS TALKING ABOUT THE PAST AND WHAT  
9 NOT, SO I WITNESSED FIRSTHAND SOMEONE WHO WAS REALLY  
10 EXPERIENCING THIS OPPORTUNITY. IT IS A PILOT. I THINK WE'RE  
11 GOING TO GET ENORMOUS INFORMATION OUT OF IT, BUT IT REPRESENTS  
12 A REAL STEP FORWARD IN OUR TRANSFORMATIVE TRANSPORTATION  
13 ACTION PLAN IN THE FARE REALM. SO SOMETHING, AGAIN, ALL OF US  
14 CAN BE EXCITED ABOUT. SECRETARY PETE BUTTIGIEG VISITED OUR  
15 REGION FOR A FEW DAYS, AND I WAS ABLE TO JOIN HIM, SPEAKER  
16 PELOSI AND OTHERS IN SAN FRANCISCO TO CELEBRATE THE NEAR  
17 COMPLETION SAN FRANCISCO'S MTA'S CENTRAL SUBWAY PROJECT. IT  
18 WAS QUITE AN EVENT DURING THE HEATWAVE, BUT WE MANAGED TO GET  
19 THROUGH IT, SO THAT WAS A GOOD THING. THE SECRETARY ALSO  
20 VISITED THE GOMENTUN STATION IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY AND  
21 OAKLAND COMMISSIONER CONGRESSWOMAN LEE LED A TOUR RECONNECTING  
22 THE MOBILITY IMPROVEMENTS AND LOOKING AT INTERSTATE 880 AND  
23 DISCUSSION ON THE VISIONS ATTACHED TO THAT CORRIDOR. THAT WAS  
24 EXCITING TO HAVE THE SECRETARY IN TOWN. WE ALSO WERE FEATURED  
25 ON A VIDEO THAT WAS PRODUCED BY THE WORLD CONGRESS IN LA THAT



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 HAPPENED LAST WEEKEND, AND AMONG OTHER -- YOU KNOW, IT WAS A  
2 FEATURE ON HOW WE RESPONDED TO THE COVID-19 CRISIS. AND THE  
3 REALLY UNPRECEDENTED COORDINATION THAT HAPPENED IN THE WAKE OF  
4 THAT CRISIS, AND THE GOOD THINGS COMING FROM THAT, IF YOU HAVE  
5 FIVE MINUTES, I WILL ENCOURAGE TO YOU WATCH THE VIDEO. IT IS -  
6 - THE LINK IS PROVIDED IN THE EXECUTIVE REPORT. AND IT'S  
7 SOMETHING THAT I THINK THAT REALLY HIGHLIGHTS THE CHALLENGE WE  
8 FACED AND THE UNIQUE WAYS THAT WE ADDRESSED IT. AND, THEN, WE  
9 ALSO CELEBRATED TOGETHER WITH BART, THEIR 50th ANNIVERSARY ON  
10 SEPTEMBER 10TH, COMMISSIONER AMY WORTH, AND COMMISSIONER  
11 GLOVER WERE ALSO THERE, AND IT REALLY, I THINK, WAS AN  
12 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY LIFT UP WHY TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT IN THE  
13 REGION. AND, YOU KNOW, KUDOS TO THE BART DIRECTORS AND STAFF  
14 FOR PUTTING ON A GREAT EVENT. AND ACKNOWLEDGING THAT DEPUTY  
15 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDREW FRIEMER AFTER SERVING AS YEARS AS  
16 VICE PRESIDENT, WAS APPOINTED PRESIDENT OF THE INTERNATIONAL  
17 BRIDGE TUNNEL TURNPIKE ASSOCIATION ON SEPTEMBER 22ND. THAT  
18 WILL BE A YEAR APPOINTMENT. SO, CONGRATULATIONS DUE THERE.  
19 WITH THAT, MR. CHAIR, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU ARE MUTED, MR. CHAIR.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, THERESE, FOR  
24 YOUR REPORT-OUT. COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? I DO NOT SEE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 ANY. KIMBERLY, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED  
2 WITH THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
6 ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CONGRATULATIONS TO ANDY FOR  
9 THAT LEADERSHIP MOMENT. MOVING TO OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM.  
10 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. PROCEEDING TO OUR NEXT  
11 ITEM. CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEMS EVEN A THROUGH E. COMMISSIONER  
12 PAPAN DO YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** I WISH TO PULL 11E.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE A COMMENT ON IT?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANT TO ASK STAFF IF WE'RE GOING TO INCORPORATE  
19 THE CITY JURISDICTIONS THAT WERE NOT PART OF THIS THE ONES  
20 THAT HAVE THEIR OWN PROGRAMS? OR IS THERE GOING TO BE SOME  
21 INCORPORATION.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** STAFF, IF YOU WISH TO CLARIFY, OR WE  
24 CAN PULL IT? STAFF.

25





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** A QUICK QUESTION. COMMISSIONER PAPAN, WE DID  
2 SEND A NOTE TO YOU ON THE SUBJECT. AND I THINK WE HAVE DONE  
3 EVERYTHING WE CAN DO ABOUT IT. MOST AGENCIES HAVE ALREADY DONE  
4 THEIRS. SO I DON'T KNOW WHETHER IT MAKES SENSE TO INCORPORATE  
5 IT OR NOT IF IT MAKES SENSE, BUT WE CAN COVER IT

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** HOPEFULLY WE CAN INCORPORATE IT.

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION TO APPROVE ITEMS 11A THROUGH  
10 11E?

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** ANN WILL MOVE.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT:** MOTION.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I HEARD SEVERAL. WE'LL GO WITH RABBIT  
17 AND ANN. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
20 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
21 ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION BY AHN SECOND BY RABBIT. ROLL  
24 CALL VOTE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

2

3 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? COMMISSIONER ABE-  
6 KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PHLEGM SOMETHING.

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

18

19 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

22

23 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

5

6 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
9 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. MOVING TO  
12 COMMITTEE REPORTS. UP FIRST IS PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS  
13 COMMITTEE. CHAIR RABBIT HAS SOME HEAVY LIFTING TO DO TODAY. HE  
14 HAS SOME ACTION ITEMS. GO AHEAD AND TAKE IT AWAY, COMMISSIONER  
15 RABBIT

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS  
18 COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING TO THE  
19 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL ITEM 12 A RESOLUTION 4444 REVISED 4510  
20 REVISED, 4513 REVISED, AND 4159 REVISED, THE TRANSIT CAPITAL  
21 PRIORITIES OR TCP POLICY AND PROGRAM FOR FISCAL YEAR '21, '22,  
22 FOR 23, 24, ANTICIPATING PROCESSING CRITERIA AND PROGRAMMING  
23 OF 42.3 MILLION IN THE TCP PROGRAM INCLUDING 40 MILLION IN FTA  
24 FORMULA REVENUE FUNDING FOR FISCAL YEAR 2021, 2022, THROUGH  
25 '23, '24 FOR TRANSIT STATE OF GOOD REPAIR CONSISTENT WITH THE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 TCP PROCESS AND CRITERIA AND ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING OF 2.3  
2 MILLION BRIDGE TOLLS CORRECTION TO THE BATA PROJECTS SAVINGS  
3 PROGRAM AND DISCUSSION OF THE FINANCE FUTURE FTA REVENUES. I  
4 MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4444 REVISED 4510  
5 REVISED, 4513 REVISED, AND 4169 REVISED.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GREAT. FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT.  
8 I'LL LOOK FOR A SECOND.

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY GLOVER. COMMISSIONERS ANY  
13 ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION? I DON'T SEE COMMISSIONERS  
14 WITH HAND RAISED. KIMBERLY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH 12  
15 A?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY RABBIT, SECOND BY  
22 GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

24

25 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

15 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

16

17 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

3

4 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

15

16 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

19 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT:** GREAT AGENDA ITEM 12 B MTC RESOLUTION 4505

22 REVISED REVISES THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM FOR OBAG THREE

23 INCLUDING PROGRAM BEING OF 103 MILLION IN OBAG THREE REGIONAL

24 PROGRAM FUNDS, AND I SO MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER

25 4505 REVISED.





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. LOOKING  
3 FOR A SECOND.

4

5 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND, WORTH.

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY WORTH. COMMISSIONERS ANY  
8 DIALOGUE OR QUESTIONS ON 12B? I DON'T SEE ANY. KIMBERLY, ANY  
9 PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH ITEM 12B?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
13 ON THIS ITEM.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. I'LL BRING IT BACK. FIRST  
16 BY RABBIT, SECOND BY WORTH. LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL CALL  
17 VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

24

25 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

10 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

23

24 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

2

3 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING? COMMISSIONER

6 SPERING? OKAY. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

7

8 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE MARKED COMMISSIONER

11 SPERING ABSENT FOR THIS ITEM. IT LOOKS LIKE HE IS FROZEN. WITH

12 THAT, THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGENDA ITEM 12 C MTC

15 RESOLUTIONS 4544 AND 4545 ADOPTS THE 2023 TRANSPORTATION

16 IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM OR THE TIP AND THE TRANSPORTATION AIR

17 QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND THE

18 2023 TIP. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4544 AND

19 4545.

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GREAT. FIRST BY RABBIT. I'M LOOKING

22 FOR A SECOND.

23

24 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY GLOVER. COMMISSIONERS ANY  
2 QUESTIONS? DIALOGUE? DON'T SEE ANY. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY  
3 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
4 THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
7 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
8 ON THIS ITEM.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY RABBIT. SECOND BY  
11 GLOVER. LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL CALL.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, YOU ARE MUTED BUT I

9 SEE YOU MOUTHING AYE. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY? IS

10 ABSENT --

11

12 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OH, THERE YOU ARE. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER

15 DUTRA-VERNACI?

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

24

25 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

3 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

4

5 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

16

17 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

20

21 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING? IS ABSENT.

24 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
4 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** AND THE LAST ITEM FROM THE PROGRAMMING AND  
7 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS AGENDA ITEM 12D, MTC RESOLUTIONS  
8 NUMBER 4504 REVISED, FISCAL YEAR 2022 '23 MTC FUND ESTIMATE.  
9 THIS UPDATES THE FISCAL YEAR 2022, 2023 FUND ESTIMATE TO  
10 INCORPORATE THE ACTUAL FISCAL YEAR 2021/2022 REVENUE FOR THE  
11 STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMS AND  
12 REVISES THE FISCAL 2022, 2023 REVENUE ESTIMATES ACCORDINGLY. I  
13 MOVE APPROVAL OF THE MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4504 REVISED.

14

15 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY RABBIT.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN, SECONDS.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** PAPAN SECONDS. ANY QUESTIONS,  
20 COMMENTS? KIMBERLY, HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT  
21 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
25 ON THIS ITEM.





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY RABBIT, SECOND BY PAPAN. ROLL  
3 CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

6

7 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

5

6 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IN.

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER IN.

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

21 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

9

10 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

13

14 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING IS ABSENT.

17 COMMISSIONER WORTH?

18

19 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

22 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. THANK

25 YOU, CHAIR RABBIT, FOR DOING A FINE JOB. I KNOW IT WAS A



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 PRODUCTIVE MEETING. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 13 MTC  
2 PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE.  
3 COMMISSIONER SPERING IS HAVING CONNECTION ISSUES. I'M HAPPY TO  
4 JUMP IN OR VICE CHAIR IF YOU WANT TO REPORT-OUT?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** GIVE ME JUST ONE MOMENT. HANG ON.

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** NO WORRIES. I KNOW WE PUT YOU ON THE  
9 SPOT COMMISSIONER AHN. THANK YOU FOR BEING ABLE AND WILLING.

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CHAIR PEDROZA, COMMISSIONER SPERING SAYS HE IS  
12 TRYING TO LOG BACK ON RIGHT NOW, JUST AN UPDATE.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY.

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** I CAN CARRY ON.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WHY DON'T YOU DO THAT. IF COMMISSIONER  
19 SPERING JUMPS ON YOU CAN PASS ON THE BATON.

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG  
22 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET SEPTEMBER 9TH, 2022 AND MTC  
23 PLANNING COMMITTEE FORWARDED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR  
24 APPROVAL: THIS IS ITEM 13A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4530,  
25 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICY, THE TOC POLICY. AS A



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 REMINDER THE TOC POLICY BEFORE US TODAY IS THE CULMINATION  
2 NEARLY TWO YEARS OF OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT WITH LOCAL  
3 JURISDICTIONS AND STAKEHOLDERS. IT REPRESENTS A MAJOR STEP  
4 FORWARD IN THE SUPPORT OF THE GOALS OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA  
5 2050 AND REDUCTION OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND PROVIDING  
6 HOUSING THAT IS AFFORDABLE FOR ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS. AND I'M  
7 GETTING SOME FEEDBACK. IS IT OKAY COMING THROUGH THE USED?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IT'S FINE.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** OKAY. AND THIS POLICY ESSENTIALLY SUPPORTS A  
14 CREATION OF COMMUNITIES AROUND TRANSIT STATIONS AND ALONG  
15 TRANSIT CORRIDORS AND NOT ONLY SUPPORTS TRANSIT RIDERSHIP BUT  
16 THAT ARE PLACES WHERE BAY AREA RESIDENTS, ALL INCOME LEVELS  
17 AND RACIAL AND ETHNIC BACKGROUNDS CAN LIVE AND WORK IN  
18 ACCESSIBLE AREAS INCLUDING EDUCATION AND CHILD CARE HEALTH  
19 CARE AND INCORPORATING FRAMEWORK ADDING IN PROTECTION AND  
20 PRESERVATION NOT INCLUDED IN THE ORIGINAL POLICY. I'LL PASS IT  
21 TO ALIX BOCKELMAN DEPUTY DIRECT FOR POLICY TO HIGHLIGHT THE  
22 SPECIFICS.

23



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER SPERING IS BACK. BEFORE  
2 WE MOVE ON, COMMISSIONER SPERING, WOULD YOU LIKE TO OFFER  
3 COMMENTS.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. MY COMPUTER PROSE FROZE UP. I HAD  
6 TO PULL THE PLUG. THIS HAS BEEN A LONG JOURNEY FOR ON YOU  
7 COMMITTEE. OUR STAFF WENT ABOVE AND BEYOND THE PUBLIC OUTREACH  
8 AND BEFORE THIS COMMISSION IS CONSENSUS THAT WE HAVE BEEN ABLE  
9 TO BUILD THROUGHOUT THE REGION I DON'T THINK ANYBODY IS HAPPY  
10 BUT WE HAVE DONE A GOOD JOB ADDRESSING CHALLENGES BEFORE US, I  
11 THINK SOME COMMUNITY IS GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE LOCAL  
12 ADJUSTMENTS IN THEIR ZONING AND PLANNING BUT THIS IS A BIG  
13 STEP FORWARD FOR THIS REGION ADDRESSING MANY OF THE ISSUES WE  
14 HAD IN 2050, AND ALSO THE BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS AND I  
15 REALLY SUPPORT THIS TOC POLICY, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT  
16 THAT WE MOVE IT FORWARD TODAY. HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE DISCUSSION  
17 TODAY. BUT I APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK THAT OUR STAFF DID,  
18 TREMENDOUS OUTREACH. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JIM. ALIX, TAKE IT AWAY.

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** GREAT. WELL, THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING AND VICE  
23 CHAIR AHN. JUST AS A REMINDER, FOR THE WHOLE COMMISSION, IN  
24 JULY, THE PLANNING COMMITTEE DEFERRED APPROVAL OF THE POLICY  
25 TO ALLOW STAFF TO FURTHER CONSIDER COMMITTEE FEEDBACK. IN



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 PARTICULAR, RELATED TO COMMERCIAL DENSITIES, WHERE THE  
2 POLICIES SHOULD APPLY, SPECIFICS RELATED TO HOUSING POLICY  
3 REQUIREMENTS, AS WELL AS THE POLICY'S IMPACT ON SMALLER  
4 COMMUNITIES. AND STAFF'S PRESENTATION TO THE PLANNING  
5 COMMITTEE IN SEPTEMBER FOCUSED ON THIS FEEDBACK AND  
6 HIGHLIGHTED SEVERAL POLICY REVISIONS. THE FIRST REVISION WERE  
7 ADJUSTMENTS FOR SMALLER JURISDICTIONS. TIER THREE  
8 JURISDICTIONS WITH A POPULATION OF 30,000 OR LESS, UNDER THE  
9 POLICY PROPOSED TODAY, MAY COMPLY WITH TIER FOUR RESIDENTIAL  
10 REQUIREMENTS. HOWEVER, TIER THREE COMMERCIAL DENSITIES AND  
11 PARKING REQUIREMENTS STILL APPLY FOR THOSE JURISDICTIONS. IN  
12 ADDITION, THE REQUIREMENT TO ELIMINATE PARKING MINIMUMS FOR  
13 TIER TWO WERE REMOVED FOR TIER LOCATIONS. NOTE, HOWEVER, THAT  
14 SOME TIER FOUR STATION AREAS SUBJECT TO THE TOC POLICY WILL  
15 NEED TO COMPLY WITH AB 2097, NOW THAT IT'S BEEN SIGNED INTO  
16 LAW. AND THAT STATE LAW DOES NOT ALLOW FOR PARKING MINIMUMS  
17 AROUND TRANSIT EXCEPT IN CERTAIN CASES. OOPS. SORRY. SECOND,  
18 POLICY -- THE SECONDARY REVISION WERE THAT POLICY REQUIREMENTS  
19 NOW APPLY TO ALL AREAS WITHIN A HALF MILE OF FIXED GUIDEWAY  
20 TRANSIT STOPS AND STATIONS. THE THIRD AREA OF POLICY REVISION  
21 WAS AROUND PARKING LOT REQUIREMENTS AND NOW PARKING  
22 REQUIREMENTS APPLY TO NEW OFFICE AND NEIGHBORHOODS SERVING  
23 COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT. THERE WAS ALSO CLARITY ADDED TO THE  
24 HOUSING POLICY MENU OPTIONS, AND THE STATE LAW SUNSET DATES.  
25 DONE ADDITIONAL HOUSING OPTION MENU OPTION WAS INCLUDED. IN



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 ADDITION TO POLICY MENU OPTIONS AND SUNSET DATES THE COMMITTEE  
2 DISCUSSED HOW NO NET LOSS AND RIGHT TO RETURN WERE INCLUDED.  
3 MANY OF YOU KNOW THIS IS STATE LAW AND APPLIES TO ALL  
4 JURISDICTIONS TODAY PROVIDING IMPORTANT PROTECTIONS FOR BAY  
5 AREA RESIDENTS THROUGH 2030. SHOULD A JURISDICTION CHOOSE THIS  
6 POLICY OPTION WITHIN THE TOC POLICY TO COMPLY, THE  
7 JURISDICTION WOULD NEED TO ADOPT THE NO NET LOSS AND RIGHT TO  
8 RETURN PROVISIONS IN LOCAL POLICY CURRENTLY OUTLINED SB 330  
9 AND SB EIGHT, WITHOUT A SUNSET DATE. SO THAT'S A REALLY  
10 IMPORTANT DISTINCTION. SO WHILE THERE WAS DISCUSSION ABOUT  
11 VARIOUS ELEMENTS OF THE TOC POLICY, INCLUDING THE MENU  
12 APPROACH THAT I JUST WENT THROUGH FOR PROTECTION, THE  
13 COMMITTEE DISCUSSION DISPLAYED SUPPORT FOR THE CHANGES  
14 OVERALL, AND HOW THIS POLICY WILL ADVANCE THE PLANNED BAY AREA  
15 2050 GOALS. AND JUST TO NOTE THAT THE COMMITTEE DID VOTE  
16 UNANIMOUSLY TO REFER THE RESOLUTION THAT YOU HAVE BEFORE YOU  
17 TODAY, MTC RESOLUTION 4530, THE TOC POLICY, TO THE COMMISSION  
18 FOR APPROVAL, AND WITH THAT, I WILL TURN IT BACK TO CHAIR  
19 SPERING.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, ALIX. LET'S SEE IF WE HAVE ANY  
22 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? GINA THEN MARGARET.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO STAFF, THEY  
25 REALLY WORKED HARD ON THIS. I REALIZE THAT. THE CIRCUMSTANCE





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 THAT I'M THIS IS THAT MANY OF OUR CITIES HAVE BEEN WORKING  
2 TIRELESSLY ON THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT, SOME OF THEM HAVE ALREADY  
3 SUBMITTED THOSE ELEMENTS AND GIVEN THE LAWS THAT ARE GOING TO  
4 BE -- HAVE BEEN SIGNED BY THE GOVERNOR, WILL BE SIGNED BY THE  
5 GOVERNOR IN THE NEXT DAY OR SO, IMPACTING THOSE HOUSING  
6 ELEMENTS THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING ON FOR YEARS NOW, I AM AT A  
7 DISADVANTAGE IN THAT THE ADDITION OF THE HALF MILE BRINGS IN A  
8 LOT OF DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS AND THAT WAS KIND OF WHAT  
9 SEPTEMBER CHANGE THERE, AND I HAVE TO COMMUNICATE WITH MY 20  
10 DIFFERENT CITIES HERE. MY CITY DOESN'T REALLY HAVE A PROBLEM.  
11 WE WILL BE ABLE TO ACCOMMODATE THIS, BUT, AS A REPRESENTATIVE  
12 FOR THE OTHER CITIES, I NEED TIME TO REALLY MAKE SURE THEY  
13 UNDERSTAND THE IMPACT OF THIS. AND I HAVE NOT HAD THAT MOVING  
14 FORWARD HERE. THE OUTREACH WAS EARLY ON, THIS YEAR, FOR MANY  
15 OF THE PLANNING DEVELOPERS AND CCAG. WE DID GET AN UPDATE IN  
16 MAY, BUT I DO NEED THAT ADDITIONAL TIME. I WOULD NOT BE ABLE  
17 TO -- I WOULD HAVE TO ABSTAIN AT THIS POINT IN TIME, BECAUSE I  
18 REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE THEY UNDERSTAND THIS. AND I  
19 APPRECIATE ALL THE E-MAILS I HAVE GOT FROM PEOPLE HERE. WE  
20 UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS HERE. AND WE ARE ABSOLUTELY  
21 TRYING TO MOVE FORWARD WITH ALL OF THIS, AND WE'LL WORK WITH  
22 STAFF ON REALLY GETTING THE UNDERSTANDING ACROSS TO OUR  
23 JURISDICTIONS. SO, I APOLOGIZE, BUT WE JUST HAVEN'T HAD THE  
24 OPPORTUNITY TO MEET WITH THE JURISDICTIONS TO GET A CONSENSUS  
25 ON THIS. AND WE ARE CONTINUING TO MOVE FORWARD HERE. ONE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 QUESTION, TOO, BECAUSE SOME OF THE JURISDICTIONS -- OR A LOT  
2 OF OUR JURISDICTIONS ARE BUILDING MADLY, AND THEY MAY NOT BE  
3 AT THE 30,000 RIGHT NOW, BUT WILL BE VERY SOON. SO REALLY  
4 HAVING THEM UNDERSTAND THE IMPACTS OF THIS POLICY, MOVING  
5 FORWARD, AS THEY APPROACH THAT, I THINK IS REALLY IMPORTANT.  
6 SO, MY APOLOGIES, AT THIS POINT, BUT I WOULD HAVE TO ABSTAIN,  
7 JUST BECAUSE I NEED TO COMMUNICATE THIS. AND I REALLY LOOK  
8 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH STAFF AND MESSAGING THAT TO THE  
9 VARIOUS CITIES THAT I REPRESENT. WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE. I  
10 APPRECIATE ALL OF THAT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO TO MARGARET, STAFF,  
13 ALIX, AND MATT, IF YOU COULD KEEP TRACK OF THE QUESTIONS. I  
14 WOULD LIKE TO GO TO COMMISSIONERS, GET QUESTIONS, AND HAVE YOU  
15 GUYS RESPOND TO THEM, IF YOU COULD. MARGARET?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR, AND THANK YOU TO STAFF  
18 FOR ALL OF YOUR HARD WORK ON THIS. I APPRECIATE THE TWO YEARS  
19 PUT INTO THIS. I ALSO AM AT A DISADVANTAGE, ONE, PERSONALLY,  
20 BECAUSE, FRANKLY, I'M NOT IN THE COMMITTEE THAT HAS BEEN  
21 LOOKING AT THIS IN DETAIL. THIS, REALLY WAS -- I HAVE HEARD  
22 ABOUT IT, I HAVE MET WITH CONSTITUENT GROUPS ABOUT IT, BUT TO  
23 BE FRANK, I HAVE NEVER HAD A CHANCE TO LOOK AT IT IN DETAIL  
24 UNTIL THIS PAST WEEK. AND I -- I THINK, IN THE FUTURE, I WOULD  
25 ASK -- ASK STAFF WAS VERY KIND TO GO OVER WITH ME, SOME OF MY



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 QUESTIONS IN THE LAST 24 HOURS, BUT, I WOULD REQUEST THAT, FOR  
2 THOSE OF US WHO ARE NOT ON THOSE COMMITTEES, WHEN THERE IS A  
3 MAJOR ITEM COMING, IF IT'S POSSIBLE TO GET A BRIEFING  
4 BEFOREHAND, THAT WOULD BE EXTREMELY HELPFUL. THE OTHER PART  
5 IS, I HAVE SIMILAR CONCERNS AS COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I CHECKED  
6 IN WITH MY OWN STAFF IN THE CITY OF MOUNTAIN VIEW, AND I  
7 RECEIVED THE LIST OF OUTREACH. I KNOW OUTREACH WAS DISCUSSED  
8 EARLIER IN THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, BUT, I THINK THE  
9 OUTREACH WAS EARLY ON. AND I CITIES -- IT SEEMS LIKE IT'S MORE  
10 -- IF THE CITIES HAD INTEREST IN THINGS THAT THEY WOULD NEED  
11 TO REACH OUT TO MTC STAFF, AND I DON'T KNOW WHAT HAPPENED, BUT  
12 OUR -- AND I'LL JUST SAY IN -- I THINK ALL CITIES ARE  
13 EXPERIENCING THIS -- LIKE, ESPECIALLY IN MOUNTAIN VIEW, WE  
14 HAVE SO MANY HOUSING PROJECTS THAT OUR STAFF IS WORKING ON,  
15 AND, YOU KNOW, WITH COVID, WE'RE SHORT STAFFED, AND IT'S JUST  
16 VERY CHALLENGING FOR MY STAFF TO TRY TO KEEP ON TOP OF ALL OF  
17 THIS. AND, MY UNDERSTANDING IS A MONTHLY BULLETIN WAS SENT  
18 OUT, AND EVEN THAT WAS VERY CHALLENGING, AND FOR OUR STAFF TO,  
19 AGAIN, KEEP ON TOP OF, AND, YOU KNOW, I APPRECIATE MTC STAFF,  
20 YOU KNOW, OUTREACH, BUT, I GUESS I'M ASKING FOR A LITTLE BIT  
21 MORE DIRECT OUTREACH. AND I KNOW THAT THERE ARE MANY DIFFERENT  
22 GROUPS AND STAKEHOLDERS INTERESTED AND INVOLVED, BUT IT'S  
23 REALLY, AT THE END OF THE DAY, THE CITIES THAT HAVE TO  
24 IMPLEMENT. SO, I WOULD ASK FOR, YOU KNOW, SPECIAL, OR EXTRA  
25 OUTREACH TO OUR CITIES. AND, THEN, I ALSO LOOKED AT THE LIST



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 OF GROUPS THAT WERE REACHED OUT TO, AND THERE WERE SEVERAL  
2 MISSING THAT I THINK WE'RE MISSING. AND I THINK THIS MIGHT BE  
3 THE CHALLENGE, SINCE WE'RE TRANSPORTATION, RIGHT NOW, WE'RE  
4 TRYING TO DO HOUSING, IT LOOKS LIKE A LOT OF THE OUTREACH WAS  
5 WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES, BUT, YOU KNOW, FRANKLY,  
6 LIKE, THEY DON'T DO HOUSING. SO, THERE IS REALLY A NEED TO  
7 REACH OUT TO GROUPS, LIKE, THE CITY MANAGER'S ASSOCIATION; MY  
8 CITY MANAGER WAS THE CHAIR OF IT, AND SHE TOLD ME SHE DIDN'T  
9 HEAR FROM OUR STAFF. I'M ON THE CITY'S ASSOCIATION OF SANTA  
10 CLARA COUNTY. I DON'T RECALL A REQUEST TO PRESENT TO US. AND,  
11 SO, I GUESS I DO FEEL THAT THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE OUTREACH,  
12 AND SPECIFICALLY WITH MY CITY, AS YOU ALL PROBABLY SHOULD  
13 KNOW, I THINK WE HAVE BEEN A LEADER IN HOUSING AND HOUSING  
14 DEVELOPMENT, AND ALTHOUGH IT LOOKS LIKE MOST OF THE  
15 REQUIREMENTS AND ELEMENTS WE CAN MEET; THERE IS STILL SEVERAL  
16 THAT NEED TO BE WORKED ON. I GUESS, IN PARTICULAR, MY CONCERN  
17 -- OR, I WAS CURIOUS WHY COMMERCIAL FARMS WERE INCLUDED.  
18 BECAUSE CITIES LIKE US, WHERE WE HAVE A JOBS/HOUSING  
19 IMBALANCE, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HOW TO CURTAIL, IN SOME REGARD  
20 CURTAIL OFFICE DEVELOPMENT SO WE DON'T HAVE TO CONTINUE TO  
21 HAVE THAT IMBALANCE. SO, PERHAPS -- I GUESS I'M JUST -- THAT'S  
22 THE QUESTION I HAVE IS, WHY DELVE INTO THE COMMERCIAL AREA.  
23 THAT IS MORE OF A CASE BY CASE BASIS, AND THERE ARE MANY  
24 CITIES LIKE OURS WHO ARE HAVING THE CHALLENGE OF THE  
25 JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE TO DEAL WITH. SO, WITH THAT, AND



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 FINALLY, AGAIN, I DON'T THINK THERE WAS DISCUSSION WITH THE 15  
2 CITIES THEY REPRESENT. SO I WOULD -- I ASKED IF WE COULD DEFER  
3 THIS ANOTHER MONTH OR TWO, TO HAVE THAT TIME TO DO THE  
4 OUTREACH. I KNOW FOLKS WANT TO GET IT GOING. SO, IF IT IS  
5 GOING TO BE VOTED ON TODAY, I DON'T -- I, TOO, WILL HAVE TO  
6 ABSTAIN FOR THOSE REASONS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. NICK?

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. SORRY. I MUTED  
11 THE WRONG ONE. THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST WANT TO SAY, I THINK  
12 THAT IT'S REALLY DIFFICULT TO DO THESE BIG REGIONAL POLICIES,  
13 AND GIVEN ALL THE KIND OF DIFFERENCES BETWEEN OUR COMMUNITIES.  
14 AND I THINK STAFF HAS DONE A REALLY GOOD JOB AT TRYING TO PUT  
15 SOMETHING TOGETHER WHICH REALLY RESPECTS THOSE DIFFERENCES BUT  
16 ALSO ACKNOWLEDGES OUR SHARED OBLIGATION TO THE REGION. AND I  
17 THINK THAT I ALSO WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR KIND  
18 OF WORKING THIS THROUGH, NOT JUST WITH MTC, BUT ALSO WITH THE  
19 ABAG. THIS IS A JOINT MTC ABAG PLANNING COMMITTEE, AND WE HAVE  
20 HAD A LOT OF GOOD ROBUST DISCUSSIONS THERE. I THINK A LOT OF  
21 PEOPLE ACKNOWLEDGE THEY'RE NOT GETTING EVERYTHING THAT I WANT  
22 OUT OF THIS POLICY, BUT THAT IT'S LANDED IN A REALLY GOOD  
23 PLACE. AND I THINK, ESPECIALLY, THE DECISION TO KIND OF PUT  
24 THIS ON PAUSE FOR A LITTLE BIT TO WORK OUT THE FINAL DETAILS  
25 OF, SORT OF, IS SOMETHING WHICH ENDED UP MAKING THIS POLICY



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 EVEN STRONGER AND MORE ROBUST. AND I THINK STAFF HAS ALSO DONE  
2 A VERY GOOD JOB GETTING US TO THIS PLACE. I AM VERY SUPPORTIVE  
3 OF THIS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS NOW.  
4 GIVE CLARITY TO THE REGION ABOUT WHERE THIS IS GOING TO BE, SO  
5 PEOPLE CAN START INCORPORATING IT INTO THEIR PLANNING AS  
6 QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. AND I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE JUST A  
7 CRITICAL ASPECT OF IMPLEMENTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2040, WHICH,  
8 REALLY, ALL OF THESE REQUIREMENTS, OR ALL OF THIS KIND OF  
9 POLICY IS VERY MUCH ROOTED IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF OUR  
10 COLLECTIVE PLAN.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. EDDIE, DID YOU HAVE  
13 YOUR HAND UP? OKAY. CAROL?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YEAH, THANK YOU, JIM. LISTENING TO  
16 COMMISSIONERS PAPAN AND ABE-KOGA ABOUT THE CONCERNS OF THEIR  
17 CITIES AND NOT HAVING HAD MORE COMPLETE DIALOGUE WITH THEM, AT  
18 THIS POINT IN TIME, AS MUCH AS I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A DECISION  
19 ONE WAY OR ANOTHER, I'M GOING TO ABSTAIN, BECAUSE AS YOU KNOW,  
20 I MISSED THE SEPTEMBER 9TH POLICY COMMITTEE MEETING. SO I  
21 DIDN'T HEAR WHAT THE CONVERSATION WAS. AND BACK IN JULY, I DID  
22 HAVE MY CONCERNS, AS SHARED BY SOME OF THE CITIES IN ALAMEDA  
23 COUNTY. SO, TO RESPECT THAT, SINCE I HAVEN'T HAD THE TIME  
24 SINCE SEPTEMBER 9TH AND NOW, TO HAVE A CONVERSATION ABOUT --  
25 WITH ANYBODY ABOUT THIS, I THINK THE PRUDENT THING FOR ME TO



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 DO AS I REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CITIES OF ALAMEDA COUNTY, WOULD  
2 BE TO ABSTAIN.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, CAROL. AMY?

5

6 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANTED TO PICK UP ON SOME  
7 OF THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN SHARED. FIRST OF ALL, AS YOU  
8 KNOW WHEN WE BEGAN THIS DISCUSSION LAST YEAR, THERE WAS A LOT  
9 OF CONCERN AND DESIRE ON THE PART OF THE COMMISSIONERS THAT  
10 MTCS AND ABAG STAFF, AND THE HOUSING STAFF, PLANNING STAFF,  
11 REACH OUT TO THE CITIES, TO THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY,  
12 THROUGH THE PARTNERSHIPS, THROUGH, HOWEVER WE DO IT. AND I AM  
13 REALLY APPRECIATIVE OF ALL OF THE EFFORTS THAT STAFF -- YOU  
14 KNOW THAT, WE EXPERIENCE IN OUR COUNTY, WE'RE ABLE TO, YOU  
15 KNOW, THE PLANNING STAFF FOR MTC CAME AND MET WITH ALL OF OUR  
16 PLANNING DIRECTORS, WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. AND I  
17 REALLY -- YOU KNOW, IT'S INTERESTING, IT POINTS TO HOW, IN THE  
18 NEW PROCESS MOVING FORWARD, IT -- THE TRANSPORTATION  
19 AUTHORITIES, THE MAYOR'S CONFERENCE HAVE MORE, REALLY,  
20 RESPONSIBILITY IN THIS WHOLE PROCESS AS WE WORK THROUGH THE  
21 REGION. ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF THE CONNECTION BETWEEN HOUSING,  
22 LAND USE, AND TRANSPORTATION RESOURCES. AND I REALLY, REALLY  
23 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT STAFF HAS WORKED HARD WITH THE  
24 COMMISSION, TO CRAFT A COMPROMISE. THESE POLICIES ARE ALWAYS  
25 CHALLENGING. BECAUSE THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, NOT EVERYTHING TO



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 EVERYONE, FOR MANY CITIES, FOR ALL OF US, THEY CAUSE A  
2 CHALLENGE, BUT, ALSO OPPORTUNITY. AND I THINK THAT THERE HAS  
3 BEEN A REAL EFFORT TO WORK, TO TRY TO FIND A COMPROMISE, TO  
4 FIND A SWEET SPOT THAT WE CAN MOVE FORWARD REGIONALLY TO, IN  
5 FACT, A MODE THAT REDUCES GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, PROVIDE  
6 SUPPORT TO OUR TRANSIT ENTERPRISES IN WHATEVER FORM THEY ARE.  
7 THE OTHER THING IS VERY CONSISTENT WITH THE URBAN GROWTH  
8 BOUNDARY INITIATIVES THAT ALL OF OUR COUNTIES HAVE TAKEN ON  
9 OVER THE LAST DECADES, RECOGNIZING THAT COMPACT DEVELOPMENT IS  
10 WHAT'S GOING BE HAPPENING IN THE FUTURE AS CITIES WORK TO  
11 ACHIEVE THEIR RHNA NUMBERS. SO, I WOULD CONCUR WITH OUR VICE  
12 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, AND WITH THE CHAIR OF THE PLANNING  
13 COMMITTEE, COMMISSIONER SPERING, TO SUPPORT THIS PLAN MOVE  
14 FORWARD WITH IT. SO, I WILL BE VOTING TO SUPPORT THE PLAN, AND  
15 I APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK EVERYONE HAS BEEN PUTTING INTO  
16 IT FOR QUITE SOMETIME.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, AMY. DAMON?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND, ALSO APPRECIATE THE  
21 WORK THAT'S GONE INTO THIS. AND, ALSO, CHANGES THAT HAVE  
22 OCCURRED OVER TIME, DUE TO INPUT. I GUESS ONE OF THE REMAINING  
23 QUESTIONS, AND MAYBE IT CAN BE ADDRESSED, IS, WHAT RESOURCES  
24 WILL MTC MAKE AVAILABLE TO HELP JURISDICTIONS COME INTO





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 COMPLIANCE BOTH FOR PDAS AND NON-PDAS? SO IF WE CAN MAYBE HAVE  
2 THAT PART OF THE DISCUSSION THIS MORNING, AS WELL? THANKS.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. THANK YOU. CINDY  
5 CHAVEZ. CINDY?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD JUST LIKE TO ASK  
8 THE STAFF IF THEY COULD RESPOND TO TWO ISSUES THAT CAME TO US.  
9 I THINK, IN A JOINT LETTER. ONE WAS THE ELIMINATING PARKING  
10 MINIMUMS WITHOUT THE BALANCE OF WHAT WOULD TAKE THOSE PARKING  
11 MINIMUM'S PLACE, AS HAVING IT EMBEDDED IN THE POLICY, AND THE  
12 OTHER IS THE -- THE ISSUE ABOUT TIER THREE JURISDICTIONS AND  
13 TIER -- WITH TIER FOUR REQUIREMENTS. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE  
14 I UNDERSTAND WHY THE COMPROMISE WAS MADE, WHAT WAS TRYING TO  
15 BE ACCOMPLISHED BY IT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, CINDY. I DON'T SEE -- AMY, YOU  
18 STILL HAVE YOUR HAND UP. AND DAMON? DO YOU GUYS WANT TO --

19

20 **AMY R. WORTH:** SORRY. I'LL TAKE IT DOWN.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER'S HANDS  
23 UP. MATT, AND ALIX, DO YOU WANT TO -- YOU KNOW, ONE QUESTION I  
24 WANTED TO ASK REAL QUICKLY IS THIS APPLIES TO SOME NEW



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 DEVELOPMENT. PROJECTS THAT ARE CURRENTLY IN PLANNING, IS THAT  
2 CONSIDERED NEW? OR IS THAT EXISTING?

3

4 **MATT MALONEY:** HI EVERYONE. MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL  
5 PLANNING FOR MTC AND ABAG. KARA, THE PROJECT MANAGER IS ALSO  
6 HERE WITH ME TODAY, SO, WE WILL WALK THROUGH SOME OF THESE  
7 QUESTIONS. SO, THE POLICY DOES APPLY TO NEW DEVELOPMENT, AND,  
8 REALLY, WHAT WE MEAN BY THAT IS REZONING. AND, YOU KNOW, ONE  
9 THING I WANTED TO CLARIFY, AND IT COVERS SOME OF THE QUESTIONS  
10 THAT WE HEARD TODAY IS THAT THE POLICY DOES NOT APPLY TO  
11 EXISTING PARCELS WHERE THERE ARE HOME -- I'M GETTING FEEDBACK.  
12 MAYBE IT'S GONE NOW. SO, I WANTED TO CLARIFY THAT, AGAIN, THE  
13 POLICY DOES NOT APPLY TO PARCELS WHERE THERE ARE EXISTING  
14 HOMES. SO, WE ARE TALKING ABOUT REZONING. COMMISSIONER PAPAN  
15 ASKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE MOVE TO THE HALF MILE STATION  
16 AREA, AND IT'S RIGHT THAT THAT DID OCCUR, POST THE LAST  
17 COMMITTEE. AND, SO, IN SOME PLACES THAT'S GOING TO ADD A  
18 LITTLE BIT OF YEE GRAPHIC AREA TO WHERE CITIES DO NEED TO  
19 COMPLY WITH THE POLICY. BUT, AGAIN, I THINK IT'S VERY  
20 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT NEW  
21 DEVELOPMENT, AND NOT PARCELS WITH EXISTING HOMES. COMMISSIONER  
22 ABE-KOGA HAD A FEW QUESTIONS, INCLUDING QUESTIONS ABOUT  
23 OUTREACH. WHEN WE WENT -- WE HAVE BEEN TO THE COMMITTEE  
24 NUMEROUS TIMES ON POLICY, AND POST ONE OF THE COMMITTEE  
25 MEETINGS, I THINK IN MAY OF 2021, OR EARLY 2022, WE WERE ASKED



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 BY THE COMMITTEE TO REALLY DO DEEPER OUTREACH ON THE TOC  
2 POLICY, AND IN FOLLOWING THAT, WE WENT OUT AND DID MORE  
3 OUTREACH. WE HIT ALL THE LOCAL PLANNING DIRECTORS, AT ALL THE  
4 MEETINGS, AND WE ALSO HIT A NUMBER OF ELECTED OFFICIALS. WE  
5 WENT TO SOME CITY COUNCIL MEETINGS WHEN WE WERE ASKED. WE ALSO  
6 WENT TO SOME OF THE CTA BOARD MEETINGS, BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE A  
7 LOT OF THE JURISDICTIONS OF ELECTED OFFICIALS WERE ASSEMBLED.  
8 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTIES FOR EXAMPLE, WE WENT TO SCRAP A SAN  
9 MATEO COUNTY --

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THIS IS ALFREDO. I THINK WE HAVE TOO  
12 MANY COMMISSIONERS THAT AREN'T MUTED. WE'RE GETTING FEEDBACK.  
13 I THINK THAT WOULD HELP.

14

15 **MATT MALONEY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WAS MENTIONING THE OUTREACH.  
16 I ALSO WANT TO MENTION, IN THE APRIL, TIME FRAME, WE DID A  
17 SURVEY THAT WENT OUT TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS SO WE'RE CLEARING  
18 THEM ABOUT THE POLICY AND SUBMITTING OUTREACH SO STAFF DID  
19 MAKE AN EFFORT TO REACH OUT TO BOTH ELECTED'S, AND LOCAL  
20 JURISDICTIONS IN TERMS OF COMMERCIAL OFFICE SANS, I THINK ONE  
21 THING WE SHOULD UNDERSCORE IS THE POLICY DOES NOT REQUIRE  
22 JURISDICTIONS TO ZONE ANY PARTICULAR WAY. BUT, ONE OF THE  
23 REASONS WHY WE ADD COMMERCIAL OFFICE INTO THE MIX, IS JUST  
24 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO CREATE, SORT OF, CENTERS OF ACTIVITIES  
25 AROUND THESE TRANSIT NODES. AND, OBVIOUSLY, HOUSING,



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 RESIDENTIAL, IS A BIG PART OF IT, BUT, ALSO, THE RESEARCH  
2 BEARS OUT THAT OFFICE DEVELOPMENT IS, SORT OF, JOBS ARE ALSO  
3 VERY IMPORTANT AROUND THESE TRANSIT NODES, AS WELL. SO, THAT'S  
4 WHY YOU SEE, SORT OF, RESIDENTIAL DENSITIES IN THE POLICY, AS  
5 WELL AS COMMERCIAL OFFICE FARMS, BOTH IN THERE. THERE WAS A  
6 QUESTION FROM CONNOLLY ABOUT RESOURCES THAT WE'RE GOING TO  
7 MAKE AVAILABLE TO COMPLY WITH THE POLICY. THAT'S A REALLY  
8 IMPORTANT QUESTION. AND ACTUALLY AT THE OCTOBER MEETING OF THE  
9 JOINT PLANNING AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE, WE'RE GOING  
10 TO TALK THROUGH OUR PLANS FOR HOW TO SPEND \$23 MILLION COMING  
11 OUT OF THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM IN TERMS OF THE PDA PLANNING AND  
12 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FUNDS. SO WE'RE GOING TO TALK  
13 SPECIFICALLY ABOUT THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THOSE FUNDS IN  
14 COMPLIANCE WITH THE TOC POLICY. IS, SO, OBVIOUSLY THERE IS A  
15 BIG RELATIONSHIP THERE. I THINK WE ALSO FORESEE BEING ABLE TO  
16 SUPPLEMENT SOME OF THOSE OBAG THREE FUNDS WITH FUNDS FROM REAP  
17 2.0, THAT ARE ALSO COMING THROUGH. SO, IN THE NEXT 3 TO 4  
18 YEARS, WE DO FORESEE HAVING CONSIDERABLE FUNDING RESOURCES  
19 FROM THE REGION TO EXPEND TO HELP JURISDICTIONS COMPLY.  
20 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ ASKED ABOUT THE TIER THREE/TIER FOUR  
21 REQUIREMENTS, AND THAT WAS A CHANGE THAT OCCURRED POST  
22 COMMITTEE. AND, YOU KNOW, THE WAY THE POLICY STATES, AT THIS  
23 POINT, IS THAT TIER THREE CITIES BELOW A POPULATION OF 30,000  
24 WOULD BE ABLE TO COMPLY WITH THE TIER FOUR RESIDENTIAL DENSITY  
25 REQUIREMENTS. SO, THAT PART OF THE POLICY. AND THAT REALLY



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 CAME ABOUT BASED ON COMMISSIONER AND BOARD MEMBER CONCERNS  
2 ABOUT SMALL CITIES NOT BEING ABLE TO COMPLY WITH THE POLICY.  
3 SO, THAT'S THE CHANGE THAT STAFF MADE TO RESPOND TO SOME OF  
4 THOSE COMMISSIONER CONCERNS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO  
5 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT IT'S ONLY THE RESIDENTIAL DENSITY  
6 REQUIREMENTS THAT COME INTO THAT IN TERMS OF TIER THREE CITIES  
7 BELOW 30,000. THOSE CITIES WOULD HAVE TO COMPLY WITH THE THREE  
8 PS POLICIES, THE PARKING REQUIREMENTS, AT THE TIER THREE  
9 LEVEL, AND THE COMMERCIAL OFFICE FARMS AT THE TIER THREE LEVEL,  
10 AS WELL.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. LET ME GO BACK TO, YOU KNOW, CINDY, TO  
13 YOUR QUESTIONS, WERE YOUR QUESTIONS ANSWERED?

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH. THANK YOU. JUST THE SECOND ONE AROUND  
16 PARKING MINIMUMS? AND WHAT I WAS ASKING IS THAT, IF WE'RE  
17 ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS, THEN WAS THERE A REASON WE  
18 DIDN'T JUST EMBED IN WHAT THE -- WHAT THE, YOU KNOW, IN  
19 EXCHANGE FOR NOT, YOU KNOW, FOR REMOVING THEM, THIS IS WHAT  
20 YOU HAVE TO DO, FROM A POLICY PERSPECTIVE?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** SO, I THINK I'M UNDERSTANDING YOUR QUESTION. THE  
23 PARKING MINIMUMS THERE, THERE IS NO MINIMUM PARKING  
24 REQUIREMENT ALLOWED FOR TIERS 1, 3 TIER THREE. TIER FOUR DOES  
25 ALLOW PARKING MINIMUMS. THE POLICY ALSO HAS, SORT OF, PARKING



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 MAXIMUMS IN THERE, AS WELL. SO, FOR TIER ONE THROUGH TIER  
2 FOUR, THERE ARE DIFFERENT MAXIMUM LEVELS, SO WE WOULD BE  
3 LOOKING FOR SORT OF A PARKING MAXIMUM THAT, FOR EXAMPLE, IN  
4 TIER 3, FOR RESIDENTIAL, PARKING MAXIMUM ONE SPACE PER UNIT OR  
5 LOWER. THERE ARE ALSO PARTS OF THE PARKING PART OF THE POLICY,  
6 THINGS THAT DEAL WITH THINGS LIKE BICYCLE PARKING, SOME  
7 REQUIREMENTS FOR BICYCLE PARKING, ALLOWANCE ON BUNDLED  
8 PARKING, ALLOWING FOR SORT OF PARKING DISTRICT, CITIES CAN  
9 ESTABLISH PARKING DISTRICTS THAT CAN TAKE PLACE WITH PARK  
10 REQUIREMENTS ON A SITE BY SITE LEVEL.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK, MATT, WHAT I WAS SPECIFICALLY ASKING  
13 WHETHER OR NOT THERE IS POLICY FRAMEWORK IN EXCHANGE FOR NO  
14 MINIMUMS. THIS IS KIND OF A MENU OF OPTIONS AS IT RELATES TO  
15 PARKING SPECIFICALLY. I THINK THE IDEA OF ALLOWING SHARED  
16 PARKING IS VERY INNOVATIVE, AND I THINK THAT'S GREAT, BUT I  
17 HAVE A CONCERN, AND IT HAS TO DO WITH BOTH THIS AND HOW CITIES  
18 ARE ADDRESSING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED BECAUSE POLICIES ARE NEW  
19 AND NOT DISTINCT, AND IN SOME INSTANCES WERE SEEING  
20 NEGOTIATIONS HAPPEN BETWEEN DEVELOPERS AND CITIES THAT,  
21 FRANKLY, SOMETIMES LEAVE OUT THE COMMITTEE AND ARE VERY  
22 INCONSISTENTLY APPLIED RIGHT NOW. I WAS LOOKING TO SEE IF  
23 WE'RE GOING TO BE OFFERING A FRAMEWORK OR A STRUCTURE AS PART  
24 OF THIS. AND JUST TO GO BACK TO TIER THREE JURISDICTION AND  
25 TIER FOUR, IT IS EXACTLY MY CONCERN THAT IT'S HOUSING THAT



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WE'RE LEAVING OUT, AND I DO THINK IT JUST REINFORCES THE  
2 CHALLENGES, THAT, AT LEAST I SEE FOR US IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY,  
3 WITH SOME CITIES BEING ABLE TO CONTINUE TO STAY OUT OF THE  
4 HOUSING, YOU KNOW, THE HOUSING BUSINESS, FOR LACK OF A BETTER  
5 WORD. BUT THANK YOU FOR THAT. THAT WAS VERY HELPFUL. AND THANK  
6 YOU CHAIR FOR LETTING ME JUMP BACK IN.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. CAROLE, DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT  
9 QUICKLY ON ANYTHING? OR CAN YOU WAIT?

10

11 **KARA VUICICH:** I CAN WAIT. I CAN ADD TO THE PARKING IF THERE IS  
12 INTEREST. BUT HAPPY TO DEFER TO YOU GUYS.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WE HAVE GINA AND THEN MARGARET.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO STAFF, I  
17 KNOW THEY WORKED DILIGENTLY ON THIS. AND, MATT, I APPRECIATE  
18 ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF THE HALF MILE ADDITION. IT'S NEW FOR US, SO  
19 WE APPRECIATE THAT. MY QUESTION IS TO, YOU MENTIONED THE  
20 ZONING, YOU HAVE ALREADY UPZONED AND SOME JURISDICTIONS HAVE  
21 SUBMITTED THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS ALREADY, HOW WILL THIS POLICY  
22 IMPACT THOSE ELEMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED? AND, IT'S  
23 ALSO, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE GOT NEW LAWS COMING RIGHT DOWN THE  
24 PIKE, AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ NOTED, PARKING, I THINK WE HAVE  
25 NO CONTROL OVER NOW, THE NEW LAW JUST PASSED ANYWAY. SO, IT'S



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 KIND OF AN OPEN-ENDED QUESTION HERE, THE IMPACT OF NEW  
2 LEGISLATION ON THIS ENTIRE POLICY, WHERE THAT -- WHAT POSITION  
3 THAT PUTS EVERYONE THIS IS ANOTHER REASON I JUST HAVE TO  
4 COMMUNICATE WITH MY JURISDICTIONS. I MEAN, I'M IN TIER TWO,  
5 AND WE HAVE NO PROBLEM WITH THAT. WE HAVE, I THINK, EXCEEDED  
6 THE ZONING REQUIREMENTS. BUT I DO HAVE 19 OTHER JURISDICTIONS  
7 THAT I NEED TO REALLY HAVE THEM UNDERSTAND THE IMPACTS AND HOW  
8 THEY CAN MOVE FORWARD HERE. I DO APPRECIATE THE COMMERCIAL  
9 ASPECT, BECAUSE WE HAVE THE OPPOSITE OF WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-  
10 KOGA HAS. WE HAVE THE HOUSING/JOBS IMBALANCE. WHICH WE'RE  
11 TRYING TO WORK OUT. SO, EVERY JURISDICTION IS SLIGHTLY  
12 DIFFERENT HERE. AND WE DO WANT TO WORK WITH THIS, AND WE DO  
13 WANT TO MAKE THIS SUCCEED, BUT I REALLY NEED TO TRY TO  
14 UNDERSTAND MORE SO, THE IMPACT OF NEW LEGISLATION, AND THOSE  
15 WHO HAVE ALREADY SUBMITTED THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS, IF YOU  
16 COULD CLARIFY SOME OF THAT FOR ME, I WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE  
17 IT.

18

19 **MATT MALONEY:** SURE, I CAN GIVE THAT A STAB. FOR THOSE  
20 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE ALREADY SUBMITTED HOUSING ELEMENTS,  
21 FIRST, THAT'S GREAT. WE ARE TRACKING THAT. AND FOR THE MOST  
22 PART MANY JURISDICTIONS HAVE SUBMITTED THEIR DRAFT ELEMENTS TO  
23 HCD, AND THAT'S NOT ACROSS THE BOARD. THERE ARE SOME  
24 JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE LAGGING IN TERMS OF THOSE DEADLINES.  
25 BUT GENERALLY SPEAKING, THAT'S WHERE WE ARE. WE HAVE HAD A





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 SMALL HANDFUL JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE AT THAT POINT APPROVAL IN  
2 HCD, BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE REZONING ON THE  
3 HOUSING THAT'S FIRST STEP PROCESS CERTAINLY KIND OF  
4 ESTABLISHING SOME OF THOSE SITES AND WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO  
5 BE, AND THE 2026 TIME FRAME FOR JURISDICTIONS TO ACTUALLY DO  
6 REZONING SO OUR THOUGHT ON THE TIME FRAME IT WORKS PRETTY WELL  
7 ACKNOWLEDGING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE PRETTY STRESSED WITH  
8 THIS WORK. IN TERMS OF THE STATE LEGISLATION, I THINK THAT'S A  
9 GREAT POINT. WE HAVE BEEN TRACKING ALL OF THAT. A.B. 2097,  
10 CERTAINLY JUST SIGNED, THAT IS A -- PROHIBITS A PUBLIC AGENCY  
11 FROM IMPOSING MINIMUM PARKING REQUIREMENTS WITHIN HALF MILE OF  
12 TRANSIT, AND THIS IS ACTUALLY A CIRCUMSTANCE WHERE THE LAW  
13 WOULD, IN SOME CASES GO EVEN FURTHER THAN OUR POLICY, AND AT  
14 SOME TIER FOUR LOCATIONS, STATE AGENCIES COULDN'T ESTABLISH  
15 PARK MINIMUMS AND OUR POLICY DOESN'T GO AS FAR AS THAT, AS FAR  
16 AS THE STATE LAW. BUT I THINK THERE ARE ALSO SITUATIONS WHERE  
17 MAYBE OUR POLICY DOES GO A LITTLE FURTHER THAN THE STATE LAW.  
18 THERE ARE SOME EXCEPTIONS BUILT INTO A.B. 2097 WHERE I THINK  
19 OUR TOC POLICY GOES FURTHER. SO IT'S A BIT NUANCED. BUT THAT'S  
20 AN EXAMPLE. I'M JUST TALKING ABOUT 2097, BUT THAT'S AN EXAMPLE  
21 OF SOME OF THE STATE BILLS THAT, OF COURSE, WE'RE TRACKING, AS  
22 WE MOVE FORWARD.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE, IF YOU AND KARA COULD HOLD YOUR  
25 COMMENTS. LET ME TAKE MARGARET THEN CAROL. AND THEN I WOULD



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 LIKE TO GET INTO PUBLIC COMMENTS THEN BRING IT BACK TO THE  
2 COMMISSION. MARGARET, GO AHEAD.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR FOR A SECOND BITE AT THE  
5 APPLE. I APPRECIATE STAFF'S RESPONSES. I THINK, IN LISTENING  
6 TO THIS CONVERSATION, THE ISSUE, FOR ME IS ABOUT FLEXIBILITY.  
7 SO IT'S INTERESTING TO HEAR COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAY THAT I HAVE  
8 THE OPPOSITE OF JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE. SO THAT'S WHAT WE'RE  
9 LOOKING FOR, FOR CITIES LIKE US THAT ARE GOING, TOO MANY JOBS,  
10 AND NOT ENOUGH HOUSING, TO BE ABLE TO BE EXEMPT FROM THE  
11 COMMERCIAL PIECE. OR, I GUESS THAT'S -- I KNOW THERE IS SOME  
12 FLEXIBILITY OF IT BEING BUILT IN, THERE IS MORE DETAILS TO  
13 FOLLOW, A FOLLOW-UP, I GUESS, OF THESE ELEMENTS, PARKING IS  
14 ANOTHER AREA OF CONCERN, BUT, I DIDN'T REALLY WANT TO TALK  
15 ABOUT PARKING TODAY. [LAUGHTER] SO, I GUESS, OVERALL, I  
16 APPRECIATE THE OUTREACH, BUT IT SOUNDS LIKE IT WAS DONE AT THE  
17 FRONT END, TAKING INPUT, BUT I DON'T THINK THE FINAL PRODUCT  
18 WAS SENT OUT TO EVERY -- TO ALL THE CITIES, OR, YOU KNOW, OUR  
19 CITIES DIDN'T HAVE MEETINGS ABOUT THE FINAL PRODUCT. IT SOUNDS  
20 LIKE THERE WERE CHANGES MADE EVEN IN THE LAST TWO WEEKS. AND,  
21 SO, THAT'S REALLY MY CONCERN IS THAT, I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY  
22 CITIES REALLY ARE AWARE OF WHAT WE ARE DISCUSSING TODAY. MINE  
23 CERTAINLY WASN'T. SO, THAT'S WHY, I GUESS, I'M ASKING FOR MORE  
24 TIME; I WOULD LIKE TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT THIS. BUT I HAVE  
25 HEARD A LARGER CITY IN COUNTER IS ABOUT 80% THERE. SO, MY



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 QUESTION IS, THEN, WHO IS AT 100%. AND I KNOW THIS IS A  
2 COMPROMISE, BUT THE REALITY IS, THE CITIES ARE GOING HAVE TO  
3 MEET THESE REQUIREMENTS. SO, YOU KNOW, AND IT DOESN'T SOUND  
4 LIKE, AT 80%, OR 70%, OR 90%, IF YOU ARE STAYING WE HAVE TO  
5 MEET 100%, AND NO ONE SEEMS TO BE ABLE TO DO THAT RIGHT NOW, I  
6 THINK THAT'S A REAL PROBLEM. THANKS.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CAROL, AND THEN GOING TO  
9 PUBLIC COMMENT. CAROL.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU, JIM. THE THING ABOUT ALAMEDA  
12 COUNTY AND VALLEY LINK COMING, AND NOW ACE IS NOW GOING TO BE  
13 COMING TO UNION CITY, AND THE REAL PLAN ANNOUNCEMENT, WE'RE A  
14 TIER THREE BECAUSE WE'RE A BART STATION BUT ONCE ACE SHOWS UP  
15 THEN IT'S TIER FOUR. SO HOW DO YOU EVEN IMPLEMENT THAT? WHERE  
16 WE'RE GOING TO BE? OR WHERE WE'RE AT RIGHT NOW?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MATT DID YOU WANT TO GIVE THAT A SHOT?

19

20 **MATT MALONEY:** I'LL GIVE IT A SHOT, UNION CITY, BY THE FACT  
21 THAT IT'S A BART STATION, IT WOULD BE TIER THREE. AND I  
22 BELIEVE, IF THERE IS, SORT OF, A FUTURE WHERE ACE COMES IN, IT  
23 WOULD NOT FALL TO TIER FOUR, IT WOULD REMAIN TIER THREE.

24

25 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** OKAY. THANK YOU.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RIGHT NOW THERE ARE TWO -- THREE. I'M SURE  
5 THE NUMBER WILL CLIMB.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** GIVE EVERYBODY TWO MINUTES AND LET'S GO  
8 AHEAD AND GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. BEFORE WE DO THAT, WOULD YOU LIKE ME  
11 TO READ INTO THE RECORD THE PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED IN  
12 WRITING?

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES I WOULD.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE WERE 13 LETTERS OF  
17 CORRESPONDENCE FROM AMY THOMPSON, ANITA LUZBRINK, THE BEATTY  
18 FAMILY, BILL KIRSCH, COALITION OF ORGANIZATIONS THAT'S LISTED  
19 IN THE HEAD AFFAIRS LETTER, DEBBIE NOTKIN, EDGARDO LABER,  
20 JEFFREY MORGAN, GORDON DOUGLAS, LINDA HENNIGAN, ROBERT MEIN,  
21 ROBERT RAYBURN, AND VICKI TRIPOLI. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO  
22 PUBLIC COMMENT; THERE ARE SIX. VINAY PIMPLE. IF YOU WOULD LIKE  
23 TO UNMUTE YOURSELF, MR. PIMPLE, YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE A SHORT POINT, AND  
2 THAT IS, YOU KNOW, AS TIME GOES ON, LIKE, NORMALLY, IT USED TO  
3 BE THAT PARKING IS LIKELY TO FAVOR THE WEALTHY, LACK OF  
4 PARKING, PARTICULARLY WHEN IT'S CLOSE TO TRANSIT FACILITIES,  
5 IN FAVOR, BUT GIVEN THE PRACTICE, FOR EXAMPLE, REMOTE WORKING,  
6 THE SO-CALLED LAPTOP CLASS, THAT MIGHT CHANGE, SO, ACTUALLY  
7 THE PEOPLE WHO CAN GET WITHOUT PARKING, MIGHT BE THE PEOPLE  
8 WHO HAVE TRYING TO INCOMES BECAUSE THEY DO NOT HAVE ON GO OUT  
9 AS MUCH, AND IF THEY HAVE TO GO OUT, THEY CAN AFFORD TO GET  
10 UBER. SO I DON'T KNOW WHERE EXACTLY THE SITUATION IS IN TERMS  
11 OF WHETHER THESE PARKING ISSUES -- LIKE, NORMALLY, I WOULD BE  
12 IN FAVOR OF ANYTHING THAT HARMS LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, BUT I JUST  
13 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PARKING RESTRICTIONS, THAT WE DON'T  
14 END UP ADVANTAGING PEOPLE WITH UPPER INCOMES, WHO CAN WORK-  
15 FROM-HOME, AND TAKE THEIR UBER WHEN THEY NEED TO, AND JUST  
16 DISFAVOR PEOPLE WHO NEED TO DRIVE TO GET TO WORK EVERY DAY.  
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MR. PIMPLE. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS  
20 HOWARD WONG. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU. HOWARD WONG. I'M A MEMBER OF THE  
23 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. FIRST I  
24 WANT TO SAY HOW IMPRESSED I AM WITH THE DISCUSSION AND  
25 DIALOGUE. I THINK STEPPING BACK, YEARS FROM NOW, I THINK YOU



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WOULD ALL BE PROUD, THE COMMISSIONERS, STAFF, ALL THE  
2 PARTNERSHIPS IN THIS PROCESS, IN ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS  
3 THAT WE ALL SEE BEFORE US. AS INCOME EQUALITY IS GROWING,  
4 WE'RE OBVIOUSLY SEEING THE DIRE CONSEQUENCES OF MORE  
5 HOMELESSNESS, PEOPLE DIFFICULTY AND MEETING THE NEEDS FOR  
6 THEIR FUTURES. I THINK THAT ONE SHOULD ALSO REMEMBER THAT  
7 WHATEVER DENSITY IS DESIRABLE, DESIGN QUALITY, URBAN DESIGN,  
8 OFTEN HAVE EVEN MORE A CONSEQUENCE IN HOW ONE CREATES LIVABLE  
9 COMMUNITIES. I THINK STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL SHOULD ALWAYS BE  
10 PRESSURED TO PARTICIPATE. CALIFORNIA IS ABOUT TO HAVE A 6  
11 MILLION POPULATION GROWTH IN ABOUT 30 YEARS. THIS'S LIKE  
12 BUILDING SEVEN CITIES THE SIZE OF SAN FRANCISCO. SO, IT'S NOT  
13 JUST ABOUT TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. I THINK WE NEED TO  
14 PUT THE PRESSURE ON THE STATE LEVEL AND THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT  
15 TO BUILD NEW CITIES AND TOWNS, AND ENSURE THAT THE TOCS ARE  
16 LIVABLE BY THE NATURE IN WHICH THEY ARE DESIGNED PLANNED.  
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JONATHON KASS. PLEASE UNMUTE  
20 YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS JONATHON KASS, TRANSPORTATION IS  
23 POLICY MANAGER AT SPUR. THE POLICY BEFORE YOU WILL SERVE AS A  
24 POWERFUL TOOL TO DELIVER A PILLAR OF OUR REGION'S GROWTH  
25 STRATEGY THAT IS FOCUSING GROWTH IN PLACES THAT ARE WELL



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 SERVED BY TRANSIT. YOUR GOALS AND COMMITMENTS TO THE RESIDENTS  
2 OF THE REGION DIRECTLY DEPEND ON LOCATING HOMES AND JOBS THAT  
3 CAN TRANSFORM COMMUNITIES INTO SAFE AND WALKABLE COMMUNITIES  
4 TO SUPPORT EXITING TRANSIT SERVICE. THE POLICY HAS  
5 SHORTCOMINGS AS ANY COMPROMISE BUT WE AGREE WITH WHAT  
6 COMMISSIONERS HAVE STATED THAT THIS POLICY IS A HUGE  
7 ACCOMPLISHMENT AND GETS THE JOB DONE. I WANT TO CLARIFY THAT  
8 THE FIRST -- THE FULL HALF-MILE RADIUS WHERE THE POLICY  
9 APPLIES WASN'T THE ORIGINAL POLICY PRESENTED NINE MONTHS AGO  
10 BACK IN JANUARY. THERE WAS A PERIOD WHERE ONLY THE PDA AREA  
11 WAS CONTEMPLATED BUT ULTIMATELY THE POLICY LANDED ON THE  
12 ORIGINAL HALF MILE RADIUS. I UNDERSTAND THE DELAY BUT IT HAS  
13 NEGATIVE CONSEQUENCES AS NOTED THERE IS ONGOING WORK TO  
14 PREPARE FOR REZONING AND HOUSING ELEMENTS AND FURTHER DELAY  
15 WILL MAKE COORDINATION RESULTING IMPOSSIBLE. RESULT WILL BE  
16 THAT THESE CHANGES ARE NOT INTEGRATED WITH OVERALL REZONING SO  
17 WHILE WELL INTENTIONED THIS WILL FORCE CITIES TO DO THIS IN A  
18 PIECEMEAL FASHION IF WE DELAY. SPUR WILL URGE YOU TO APPROVE  
19 THE POLICY TODAY SO JURISDICTIONS CAN GET TO WORK ON  
20 IMPLEMENTING THIS GREAT POLICY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS AMY WITH  
23 TRANSFORM. AMY ARE YOU THERE? WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE NEXT  
24 SPEAKER. KENNETH JAVIER ROSALES. ARE YOU THERE, MR. ROSALES.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS AMY. I JUST RECEIVED THE INVITATION TO  
2 UNMUTE. THERE MAY BE A DELAY THERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GO AHEAD.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS AMY THOMPSON I'M A TRANSPORTATION POLICY  
7 ANALYST WITH TRANSFORM CALLING IN STRONG SUPPORT OF PASSING  
8 THE TOC POLICY TODAY. THIS POLICY IS A TOOL THAT WE REALLY  
9 NEED TO IMPLEMENT AND TO WORK TOWARDS OUR PLANNED BAY AREA  
10 GOALS. IT INCORPORATES HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, AFFORDABLE  
11 HOUSING, PROTECTION, AND DEVELOPMENT, IS IT PRIORITIZES  
12 COMMUNITY TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS SUCH AS WALKING, BIKING, AND  
13 BUSSING. THIS IS REALLY PERSONALITY IN MAKE THE BAY AREA AN  
14 AFFORDABLE PLACE TO LIVE WITH EXCELLENT TRANSPORTATION  
15 OPTIONS, THAT DO NOT CONTRIBUTE TO THE CLIMATE CRISIS. AND I  
16 THINK THE TIME TO PASS THIS POLICY IS REALLY NOW. SO THAT WE  
17 CAN START TO STAND UP TO THESE GOALS THAT WE HAVE SET FOR  
18 OURSELVES, WE CAN INTEGRATE WITH THE HOUSING ELEMENTS THAT  
19 CITIES ARE ACTIVELY WORKING ON, AND MTC CAN SUPPORT CITIES IN  
20 IMPLEMENTING THESE POLICIES THAT REALLY DO, IN MANY WAYS,  
21 CENTER EQUITY AND GROWTH IN THE BAY AREA TO MAKE OUR TRANSIT  
22 STATIONS WALKABLE, AND AFFORDABLE, AND FULL OF ECONOMIC  
23 OPPORTUNITY. SO, I REALLY WANT TO THANK STAFF, AND THE  
24 COMMISSION, FOR THE WORK ON POLICY. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT IT,  
25 AND WE HOPE YOU WILL PASS IT TODAY, AND WE ARE CERTAINLY YOUR





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 PARTNER IN IMPLEMENTING IT AND MAKING THAT ALL CITIES CAN  
2 PROPERLY MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, AMY. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS  
5 KENNETH JAVIER ROSALES.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. KENNETH ROSALES PLANNING SENIOR  
8 ASSOCIATE SILICON VALLEY IN THE REGIONAL COLLECTION PART OF  
9 THIS EFFORT WE SUBMITTED A LETTER INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET WE  
10 SUPPORT THE POLICY TODAY ALSO WITH THE KEY AMENDMENTS OUTLINED  
11 IN OUR COALITION LETTER, DITTO WITH EVERYTHING AMY HAS  
12 MENTIONED. AND WE'RE THANKFUL FOR ALL THE WORK MTC STAFF AND  
13 THE COMMISSION HAS PUTS INTO REFINING THE TOC POLICY. WE THINK  
14 THERE ARE AREAS THAT CAN BE STRENGTHENED TO FURTHER MEET OUR  
15 GOALS WE BELIEVE THE 30,000 POPULATION CARVE OUTS SHOULD BE  
16 ELIMINATED ALL CITIES NEED TO PRODUCE FAIR SHARE OF HOUSING  
17 AND GIVING SMALL CITIES A PASS IN DOING WHAT'S RIGHT IN  
18 CREATING INCLUSIVE RACIALLY INTEGRATED COMMUNITIES DOES NOT  
19 MAKE SENSE, ESPECIALLY [INDISCERNIBLE] AND MAKING SURE HOUSING  
20 -- ROLLING OUT JURISDICTION -- DENSITY REQUIREMENTS  
21 [INDISCERNIBLE] WE WANT THE TOC PASSED TODAY REGARDLESS OF  
22 ELIMINATION BUT SINCE CARVE OUT WILL BE BAKED IN WE BELIEVE  
23 COMMISSIONERS SHOULD HAVE DELIBERATION ON THIS TOPIC SO THE  
24 PUBLIC WILL KNOW HOW THE CHANGE CAME UPON AT THE LAST MINUTE  
25 AND PROS AND CONS AND DISCUSSIONS YESTERDAY CARVE OUT IS THE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 FINAL DECISION. AND NO NET LOSS FOR DEMOLISHED HOMES BASELINE  
2 REQUIREMENT CONSIDERING JURISDICTIONS ALREADY DOING THIS TO  
3 STATE LAW AND FOR THE STATE TO PROTECT TENANTS AND DO AWAY  
4 WITH SUCH PROVISIONS AND CONTINUE TO MAKE THIS PREVENTION OF  
5 DISPLACEMENT BUSINESS AS USUAL IS PERMANENT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS LIANO ATENCIA.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME -- [INDISCERNIBLE]  
10 I'M WITH ENTERPRISE COMMUNITIES PARTNERS WE'RE AN AFFORDABLE  
11 HOUSING ORGANIZATION ENTERPRISE HAS BEEN ENGAGING WITH THE TOC  
12 POLICY FOR TWO YEARS NOW AND WU PARTICIPATED IN THE TECHNICAL  
13 ADVISORY COMMITTEE AS WELL AND WE ARE SPEAK STRONG FAVOR OF  
14 PASSING THE TOC POLICY TODAY AS MANY FOLKS AND COMMISSIONERS  
15 HAVE MENTIONED THIS POLICY IS NOT PERFECT, MANY COMPROMISES  
16 HAVE BEEN MADE SOME OF WHICH WE STILL HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT.  
17 SUCH AS THE SMALL CITIES EXEMPTION, AND THE IMPROVEMENTS THAT  
18 STILL HAVE NOT BEEN MADE TO THE THREE PS MENU. HOWEVER WE DO  
19 THINK THAT THIS POLICY OVERALL IS A CRITICAL STEP FORWARD FOR  
20 THE REGION THAT WE DIDN'T DELAY FURTHER. THESE POLICIES ARE  
21 OUR FIRST IMPLEMENTATION TOOL FOR PLANNED BAY AREA AND IT'S  
22 IMPERATIVE TO FURTHER OUR HOUSING CLIMATE AND CONNECTIVITY  
23 GOALS. CITIES NEED TO BEGIN THIS WORK TODAY TO ALIGN THE TOC  
24 POLICY WITH THE CURRENT HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATES. I WOULD LIKE  
25 TO THANK STAFF AND THE COMMISSION FOR ALL THE WORK THAT YOU



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 HAVE DONE TO GET THE POLICY THIS FAR AND AGAIN WE URGE TO YOU  
2 VOTE TO APPROVE THIS POLICY TODAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS LOUIS  
5 MIRANTE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M VICE PRESIDENT OF POLICY WITH THE BAY AREA  
8 COUNCIL. WE REPRESENT OVER 300 OF THE BAY AREA'S LARGEST  
9 EMPLOYERS. WE HAVE SENT LETTERS IN ON THIS POLICY BEFORE, ARE  
10 GENERALLY SUPPORTIVE THE DIRECTION OF THE POLICY TRYING TO GET  
11 HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT AND TRYING TO GET HOUSING IN OUR CORE  
12 AREAS. WE SHARE CONCERNS WITH SOME OF THE LIGHTER TOUCH  
13 TREATMENTS OF THE MORE WEALTHY AND EXCLUSIONARY AREAS IN THE  
14 BAY AREA. BUT WOULD ALSO LIKE TO SEE A DEEPER FOCUS ON  
15 PRODUCTION IN THIS POLICY. WHILE THE POLICY CURRENTLY DOES  
16 REQUIRE TWO PRODUCTION ELEMENTS, WE FEEL THAT A LOT OF THE  
17 PRODUCTION ELEMENTS IN THERE MIGHT ACTUALLY CHALLENGE  
18 PRODUCTION. AND WON'T PRODUCE THE HOUSING THAT CALIFORNIA AND  
19 OUR REGION NEEDS. WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO WORK WITH YOU ON  
20 REFINING THOSE, BUT ULTIMATELY, SUPPORT THE DIRECTION OF THE  
21 POLICY, IF WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE A LITTLE BIT MORE OF A  
22 PRODUCTION FOCUS IN IT. WE SENT A LETTER IN TO THAT REGARD  
23 WITH ABOUT A DOZEN ORGANIZATIONS BASED IN THE BAY AREA,  
24 INCLUDING HOUSING ACTION COALITION, AND THE BIA OF BAY AREA.  
25 THANK YOU.



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN  
3 GRIMES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.  
4 JORDAN GRIMES HAS PUT THEIR HAND DOWN. ARE YOU THERE?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. I DIDN'T MEAN TO CLICK UNMUTE. APOLOGIES. GOOD  
7 MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES I'M A  
8 RESILIENCE MANAGER WITH GREENBELT ALLIANCE. WANT TO CONCUR  
9 WITH COMMENTS OF PREVIOUS SPEAKERS AND SAY HOW EXCITED WE ARE  
10 THAT THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES WORK IS SO CLOSE TO THE  
11 FINISH LINE AFTER THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS OF HARD WORK ON PART  
12 OF STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS THIS IS BADLY NEEDED LEGISLATION  
13 AND POLICY AND COULD NOT BE COMING AT A BETTER TIME. WE HAVE  
14 SET SOME REALLY BOLD IMPORTANT GOALS IS NOW IS THE TIME TO  
15 IMPLEMENT THE POLICY TO ACHIEVE THEM. SO, WE STRONGLY SUPPORT  
16 MOVING FORWARD WITH THE POLICY TODAY. WE DO, HOWEVER, HAVE A  
17 FEW FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND ISSUES TO ADDRESS TO MAXIMIZE  
18 THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE PROGRAM TO ENSURE THAT FUTURE GOALS  
19 AREN'T JUST HOPED FOR BUT ARE ACTUALLY MET AND ACHIEVED. FIRST  
20 WE HAVE SERIOUS CONCERNS ABOUT THE CHANGES THAT EXEMPT CERTAIN  
21 TIER THREE JURISDICTIONS FROM THE DENSITY PROVISIONS AND WOULD  
22 URGE REVERSAL IN THAT CASE. CARVING OUT EXCLUSIONARY AND  
23 TRANSIT-RICH LOCALS, LIVE LAFAYETTE AND ORINDA WOULD BE A  
24 TRAGIC RETURN TO UGLY HISTORY AND INEQUITABLE POLICY IT'S  
25 IMPERATIVE EVERY LOCATE OF THE BAY AREA SHARES EFFORTS TO



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 ADDRESS HOUSING AND CLIMATE CRISIS ESPECIALLY THOSE WITH HIGH-  
2 RESOURCES REGARDLESS OF SIZE. WE NEED TO MEET THE CHALLENGES  
3 OF THE DAY TOGETHER OR WE WILL FAIL. SECOND WE WANT TO URGE  
4 THE ELIMINATION OF PARKING MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS IN TIER FOUR  
5 CITIES. THIS IS ESPECIALLY POIGNANT RIGHT NOW THIS PAST MONTH  
6 WE LIVED IN A HEATWAVE TURBO CHARGED BY CLIMATE CHANGE WE NEED  
7 TO RECOGNIZE POLICIES CURRENTLY IN PLACE AROUND PARK  
8 INCENTIVES AND DRIVING SINGLE CAR USAGE TO AN UNTENABLE  
9 DEGREE. WE NEED TO ENCOURAGE SUSTAINABLE MODES OF  
10 TRANSPORTATION IN ORDER TO MEET GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION  
11 TARGETS NECESSARY TO MEET THE TIDES OF RAPID WARMING AND OUR  
12 CLIMATE CHANGES. WE BELIEVE THE TOC POLICY IS A POWERFUL TOOL  
13 IN MEETING HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND CLIMATE RESILIENCE GOALS.  
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO FURTHER SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. THERESE. I WANT TO GIVE YOU AND  
19 KARA OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT. AND THEN I'LL MAKE MY COMMENTS.  
20 DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT?

21

22 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL, LET ME HAVE KARA GO FORWARD IF SHE HAS  
23 SPECIFICS THAT ARE RELEVANT.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **KARA VUICICH:** I WANTED TO ADD ONE POINT OF INFORMATION FOR  
2 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ REGARDING THE PARKING REQUIREMENTS AND THE  
3 TOC POLICY. WE DID HAVE MULTIPLE CONVERSATIONS WITH THE CITY  
4 OF SAN JOSE STAFF AROUND THIS, BECAUSE I KNOW THAT FOR SOME  
5 AREAS AROUND TRANSIT STATIONS, SAN JOSE HAS TAKEN A  
6 PERFORMANCE-BASED PARKING APPROACH. AND JUST WANT TO CLARIFY  
7 THAT THE POLICY DOES ALLOW FOR NEW DEVELOPMENT TO, SORT OF,  
8 MEET THE PARKING MAXIMUMS IN THE TOC POLICY, EITHER ON A PER  
9 PROJECT BASIS OR IF THE CITY HAS TAKEN THE APPROACH OF  
10 CREATING A PARKING DISTRICT TO TRY AND MANAGE PARKING RELATED  
11 TO NEW DEVELOPMENT, KIND OF IN A MORE COMPREHENSIVE WAY, THEN  
12 IT WILL ALLOW FOR THAT ALSO.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE?

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU. SO, MY -- YOU KNOW, MY  
17 OBSERVATION, ACTUALLY, NOW, IS BE REFLECTIVE OF WHAT WE HEARD  
18 IN THE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE URGENCY ATTACHED TO MOVING  
19 FORWARD. AND IT'S JUST A REMINDER THAT, IN ADOPTING THIS  
20 POLICY, THE COMMISSION WILL BE ESTABLISHING A MAJOR NEW  
21 BASELINE, BUT AT A POINT IN TIME, IN A VERY DYNAMIC  
22 ENVIRONMENT. SO, YOU KNOW, THE RECENT PASSAGE OF A.B. 2097 IS  
23 AN EXAMPLE, WHERE NOW WITH NEW STATE LAW, WE HAVE THE  
24 OPPORTUNITY TO COORDINATE THAT AND CLARIFY IN HOW IT'S  
25 ATTACHED TO THE TOC, THAT'S AN INTERESTING TIMING, BUT THE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 COMMISSION SHOULD ALSO REALIZE AND FEEL COMFORTABLE THAT GOING  
2 FORWARD IS A POLICY THAT CAN BE ADOPTED AND AMENDED IF NEEDED  
3 FOR ANY STATE OR FEDERAL LAWS OR CHANGES THAT HAPPEN. BUT,  
4 NOW, WHAT WE'RE REALLY ACCOMPLISHING IS THIS NEW BASELINE  
5 LIFTING THE FLOOR IN A WAY THAT ESTABLISHES A WAY TO GO  
6 FORWARD. SO, JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT OBSERVATION. THANK YOU,  
7 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, THERESE. AND YOU TOUCHED ON  
10 SOMETHING THAT I WANTED TO MENTION. WITH THE FUTURE CHANGES  
11 AND IMPLEMENTATIONS THIS COMMISSION IS GOING TO HAVE TO MEET  
12 SOME CONCERNS. THERE IS NOTHING PRESENTED TODAY THAT HAS NOT  
13 GONE THROUGH COMMITTEE OR HAD DEBATE. THERE IS NOTHING BEFORE  
14 YOU INTRODUCED IN THE LAST TWO WEEKS. THAT HADN'T BEEN THE  
15 CASE. AND THE COMMITTEE DID DELAY THIS A WHOLE MONTH TO HAVE  
16 THESE DISCUSSIONS. AND THE COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE CONCERN  
17 ABOUT THEIR JURISDICTIONS, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE CAN GO FORWARD  
18 TODAY WITH THIS POLICY, DIRECT STAFF TO MEET WITH THOSE  
19 JURISDICTIONS. AND COMMISSIONERS, YOU CAN SET THOSE MEETINGS  
20 UP. BUT I THINK IT'S -- IT'S NOT REALISTIC TO MEET WITH THESE  
21 JURISDICTIONS AND EXPECT CHANGES. WE HAVE BEEN DEALING WITH  
22 THIS OVER TWO YEARS. AND WE HAVE BUILT A CONSENSUS AND IF YOU  
23 START INTRODUCING MAJOR CHANGES, I THINK IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE  
24 THE WHOLE PROCESS ALL OVER AGAIN. THIS IS A GOOD STARTING  
25 POINT, AND I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT ONE AND IT INFORM WHAT IS



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WE HAVE BEEN SAYING THROUGH 2050, THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE,  
2 AND ALL THOSE THINGS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT AND WE HAVE  
3 BEEN AGREEING WITH IN CONSENSUS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE'RE  
4 MOVE FORWARD TODAY AND WE CAN TWEAK THESE THINGS AS WE GO  
5 ALONG IF WE'RE SEEING CHALLENGES THAT ARE NOT REALISTIC. WITH  
6 THAT SAID, MR. CHAIRMAN, I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC  
7 RESOLUTION 4530. AND THAT STAFF WILL UNDERSTAND IF THERE NEEDS  
8 TO BE ADDITIONAL OUTREACH TO MEET WITH JURISDICTIONS ON THIS  
9 NEW POLICY.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING?

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** ANN SECONDS.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** EDDIE, THANK YOU FOR FILLING IN FOR ME.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING, SECOND  
18 BY COMMISSIONER AHN. COMMISSIONER PAPAN I'M GOING TO ASK  
19 COMMENTS TO BE CONCISE.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I UNDERSTAND. FRUSTRATION. WHAT'S GOING  
22 TO HAPPEN WHEN THIS COMES BACK IN OCTOBER?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING TO CHANGE IT.

25





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION,  
2 COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** THERE HAS BEEN REALLY ROBUST CONVERSATION. I  
5 WANT TO THANK MATT AND KARA FOR, SORT OF, ANSWERING ALL OF MY  
6 QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S VERY, VERY CLEAR  
7 THAT WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS LEGISLATION. I SUPPORT  
8 IT. I THINK IT MAKES SENSE. I DO THINK, TO ALLEVIATE CONCERNS,  
9 I DO THINK THERE WAS A COMMUNITY INPUT. I DO THINK THERE WAS A  
10 PROCESS, AND THAT PROCESS, I THINK, IS A FAIR PROCESS, AN  
11 INCLUSIVE PROCESS, AND I THINK WHAT'S AT STAKE TODAY MAKING  
12 THIS DECISION, ESPECIALLY DEALING WITH THE JOB, WORKFORCE,  
13 IMBALANCE, I THINK IT'S CRITICAL TO MOVE THIS ITEM, AND I'M IN  
14 SUPPORT OF IT THANK YOU.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE HEARD THIS BEFORE IT WAS  
17 THOROUGHLY DISCUSSED AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL AND WE DO NEED TO  
18 MAKE A DECISION. THEY THINK'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT AT THIS POINT  
19 IN TIME. THERESE DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING IN TERMS OF TIMING? OR  
20 ALIX?

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK YOU MADE THE DISTINCTION HERE. I  
23 BELIEVE THE COMMISSION IS ABOUT, ARE WE ADOPTING THIS POLICY,  
24 AND THE NEW OUTREACH ON THE IMPLEMENTATION?

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YEP.

2

3 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** INCLUDING CLARIFYING THE RESOURCES THAT WE  
4 CAN BRING, WHICH WE WILL BE TALKING ABOUT IN OCTOBER.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH.

7

8 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO --

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YEAH. OKAY. THANK YOU, THERESE. AGAIN,  
11 WE HAVE FIRST BY SPERING, SECOND BY AHN. AND I'LL SAY, THIS IS  
12 A STARTING POINT. YOU KNOW? AS WE NEWPORT ISSUES OF CONCERN WE  
13 HAVE THE ABILITY TO ADDRESS THOSE. I APPRECIATE STAFF FOR YOUR  
14 TREMENDOUS SUPPORT FOR BRINGING THIS TO CONSENSUS, AND ALSO  
15 LISTENING TO COMMISSIONERS AND QUESTIONS WE HAD. LET'S PROCEED  
16 WITH A ROLL CALL VOTE. GO AHEAD, KIMBERLY

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** ABSTAIN.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIVE ME JUST ONE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ABSTAIN.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLLY?

18

19 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

22

23 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** ABSTAIN.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

9 COMMISSIONER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** ABSTAIN.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

22

23 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1

2 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

9

10 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
13 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. OR -- EXCUSE ME -- THE MOTION PASSES  
14 WITH 13 AYES, AND FIVE ABSTENTIONS.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT, SIR. -- THANK YOU KIMBERLY  
17 AND COMMISSIONERS MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE AND TO ALL WHO  
18 PARTICIPATED AND THE NUMEROUS PUBLIC COMMENTS WE GOT.  
19 PROCEEDING TO ITEM 14 JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG  
20 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, I DON'T BELIEVE VICE CHAIR LICCARDO IS  
21 HERE. I'LL FILL N THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG  
22 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET SEPTEMBER 9TH LEGISLATION REFERRED  
23 ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL, PROPOSITION 30 CLEAN  
24 CARS AND CLEAN AIR ACT INSTITUTES 1.75% TAX INCREASE ON  
25 PERSONAL INCOME ABOVE 2 MILLION RAISES FUNDS FOR EMISSION



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 VEHICLES AND 80% INFRASTRUCTURE, AND [INDISCERNIBLE]  
2 PREVENTION 20% ENDING JANUARY 2043 OR SOMETIME AFTER IF  
3 STATEWIDE EMISSIONS ARE REDUCED BY 80% FOR 1990 LEVELS FOR  
4 THREE CONSECUTIVE YEARS. I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE. DO WE  
5 HAVE A SECOND?

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND BY WORTH.

8

9 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONERS DID DIALOGUE OR  
10 QUESTIONS? COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

11

12 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I APPRECIATE THE PAPERWORK IN OUR STAFF  
13 REPORT ABOUT THIS. AND I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT I AM VERY  
14 CONCERNED UNDER THE ISSUES ITEM ABOUT UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES,  
15 MEANING THAT WE COULD BE UP AGAINST A WALL AT THE GAMUT, AND  
16 WE WOULD END UP HAVING MONEYS GOING TO THESE PROGRAMS, AND  
17 WHICH I UNDERSTAND OUR MISSION IS MTC ABAG, BUT I CANNOT  
18 SUPPORT SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO IMPACT OUR EDUCATION SYSTEM,  
19 POTENTIALLY, WITH THE TEACHERS AND WHAT HAVE YOU. SO, I'LL  
20 HAVE TO VOTE NO ON THIS.

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.  
23 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **GINA PAPAN:** SIMILARLY, MY JURISDICTION DISCUSSED THIS MATTER  
2 AND THE GOVERNOR'S OPPOSITION, AS WELL AS CTA. OUR CHAIR OF  
3 CCAG IS A CHAIR OF THE RESOURCES BOARD AND WE HAD CONCERNS  
4 ABOUT THIS SO WE WILL BE IN OPPOSITION OF THIS, AS WELL.

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I DON'T  
7 SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS AT THIS POINT IN TIME. KIMBERLY DO  
8 WE HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC  
9 COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, CHAIR. I RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF  
12 CORRESPONDENCE THAT'S ACTUALLY IN DEVELOPMENT FOR CCAG BOARD  
13 OF DIRECTORS. AND I SEE A NUMBER OF HANDS RAISED. HOW MUCH  
14 TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ONE MINUTE. WE STILL HAVE OTHER  
17 COMMITTEES BEFORE AND THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE HAS TO RECESS  
18 BACK. THANK YOU TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR YOUR  
19 UNDERSTANDING.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LET ME ADJUST MY CLOCK. WITH  
22 THAT, THE FIRST MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IS GRETCHEN NEWSOM.  
23 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** GRETCHEN NEWSOM ON BEHALF OF THE IBEW AND THE  
2 CALIFORNIA STATE ASSOCIATION OF ELECTRICAL WORKERS  
3 REPRESENTING OVER 1,000 ELECTRICIANS IN APPROVAL OF THE CLEAN  
4 CARS CLEANER INITIATIVE COALITION WE BELIEVE THIS WILL LIFT UP  
5 TO 0-EMISSIONS WITH EQUITY CLEANER AIR PROTECT THE LUNGS OF  
6 CHILDREN ASK SENIORS PROVIDES SUSTAINED GENERATIONAL  
7 INVESTMENT TO ACCELERATE TRANSITION AND CLEAN VEHICLES AND  
8 CREATES GREEN JOBS FOR BUILDING TRADES AND CONSTRUCTION  
9 WORKERS WITH SKILLED TRAINED WORKFORCE WE SUPPORT THE  
10 INITIATIVE WITH ENVIRONMENTAL PARTNERS AND ARE THIS PROTECTS  
11 OUR SCHOOL CHILDREN BY TRANSITIONING BUSES TO ZERO EMISSION  
12 VEHICLES, BUT IT ALSO PROTECTS OUR FUTURE BY LOWERING  
13 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND [INDISCERNIBLE] TEACHERS. THANK  
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS WOODY  
17 HASTINGS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** WOODSY HASTINGS WITH THE CLIMATE CENTER. SPEAKING IN  
20 STRONG SUPPORT OF THE RESOLUTION TO SUPPORT PROP 30. YOU KNOW,  
21 THE FIRST POINT, PROP 30 DOES NOT REDUCE IN ANY WAY FOUNDATION  
22 EDUCATION. IT'S ADDITIVE. AND AS THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER SAID,  
23 SOME FUNDS CAN GO TO SCHOOL BUSES WHICH HELPS SCHOOL DISTRICTS  
24 AFFORD CLEAN SCHOOL BUSES. IT'S NOT A CORPORATE GRAB. THIS  
25 PROPOSITION ORIGINATED WITH CLEAN AIR AND CLIMATE ACTIVISTS I





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 KNOW THAT BECAUSE I PARTICIPATED IN SOME OF THE EARLY MEETINGS  
2 BEFORE LYFT CAME ALONG TO HELP FUND IT. IT BENEFITS ALL  
3 CALIFORNIANS INCLUDING AND ESPECIALLY LOW-INCOME FOLKS. IT IS  
4 A TRUE CLIMATE INITIATIVE THAT HELPS FUND, BUILD ON AND  
5 SUPPORT THE GOVERNOR'S OWN POLICIES HE SHOULD BE IN STRONG  
6 SUPPORTS OF THE MEASURE. AND ONCE AGAIN WE SUPPORT THE  
7 MEASURE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS CALLER WITH  
10 DIGITS ENDING IN 9157. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE  
11 MINUTE. CALLER WITH THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF 9157, IF YOU  
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF, YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE OR I'M GOING AHEAD TO THE  
13 NEXT CALLER. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT GOULD. PLEASE UNMUTE  
14 YOURSELF. ROBERT GOULD. ARE YOU THERE?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. I DIDN'T SEE THE UNMUTE BUTTON. MY NAME IS DR.  
17 ROBERT GOULD. I AM PRESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO BAY PHYSICIANS  
18 FOR SOCIAL RESPONSIBILITY REPRESENTING HUNDREDS OF HEALTH  
19 PROFESSIONALS THROUGHOUT THE SAN FRANCISCO AND BAY AREA AND  
20 STRONGLY IN SUPPORT TO ENDORSING PROP 30. NOT REITERATING THE  
21 REMARKS I AGREE WITH FROM THE PREVIOUS TESTIFIERS ON WHAT WE  
22 WANT TO -- WE'RE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THE -- OUR CLIMATE  
23 CRISIS, THE IMPACT OF WILDFIRES ON ALL OUR PATIENTS AND  
24 COMMUNITIES HEALTH. WE THINK THAT THIS PROPOSITION STRONGLY  
25 SUPPORTS OUR NEED TO ELECTRIFY, PROVIDE EV VEHICLES, AND THAT



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 THE TAX PROVISIONS ARE VERY POSITIVE IN TERMS OF TAXING RICH  
2 PEOPLE IN ORDER TO SUPPORT AND OUR COMMUNITIES AND PROVIDE  
3 EQUITY IN THE VERY POSITIVE PARTS OF THIS INITIATIVE. SO,  
4 AGAIN, WANT TO GIVE OUR STRONG SUPPORT AND JOIN OUR COLLEAGUES  
5 IN THIS.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS JOEL  
8 KOPPEL. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS JOEL KOPPEL SPEAKING IN CAPACITY AS  
11 DIRECTOR OF SUSTAINABLE ENERGY SOLUTIONS FOR SAN FRANCISCO  
12 CALIFORNIA I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO COMMENTS OF GRETCHEN NEWSOM  
13 AND EXPRESS OUR EXTREME SUPPORT.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS OSCAR  
16 GARCIA. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OSCAR GARCIA CALIFORNIA  
19 ENVIRONMENTAL VOTERS BALLOT INITIATIVE COORDINATOR FOR  
20 PROPOSITION 30. HERE AT CALIFORNIA ENVIRONMENTAL VOTERS  
21 INITIATIVE BY THE 2035 MANDATE [INDISCERNIBLE] IN A FAIR AND  
22 EQUITABLE WAY -- IF YOU TRULY READ THE POLICY, YOU WILL SEE  
23 THAT THERE IS NO SPECIAL INTEREST CARVE-OUT FOR ANYTHING. ALL  
24 THE MONEYS RAISED BY THE 1% OF 35,000 CALIFORNIANS THAT CAN'T  
25 AFFORD IT BY RAISING TAX BY 1.75% TO GENERATE \$100 BILLION



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 OVER THE NEXT 20 YEARS TO GO 50% GOING TO LOW-INCOME  
2 COMMUNITIES AND IF YOU SAY THERE WERE SPECIAL INTEREST CARVE  
3 OUT IT WOULD BE TO LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES AND THIS IS EXACTLY  
4 WHY WE NEED THIS WE NEED TRANSITION TO GREEN CARS GREEN  
5 COMMUNITIES CLEANER AIR FOR ALL LIVES IN CALIFORNIA. WE  
6 SUPPORT THE PROPOSITION 30 BY CALIFORNIA VOTERS. THANK YOU  
7 VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS -- EXCUSE  
10 ME -- MY SCREEN JUST FROZE. AMY, WITH TRANSFORM? AMY PLEASE  
11 UNMUTE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AMY FROM TRANSFORM. TRANSFORM IS IN STRONG SUPPORT OF  
14 PROP 30. IT HAS A STRONG EQUITY FOCUS, 50% OF THE FUNDS FOR  
15 ELECTRIC CAR REBATES AND CHARGERS [INDISCERNIBLE] COMMUNITIES  
16 OF COLOR AND LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES AND [INDISCERNIBLE]  
17 DISPROPORTIONATE -- POLLUTION IN THE BAY AREA PROP 30 WILL  
18 RESULT IN BILLIONS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] PROBABLE TRANSIT SYSTEM  
19 AND WILL PAY FOR CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE AND HELP REDUCE  
20 [INDISCERNIBLE] COSTS BENEFIT MOST -- IN ADDITION 0 EMISSION  
21 VEHICLES ARE LESS EXPENSIVE FOR AGENCIES TO OPERATE AND  
22 MAINTAIN IN THE LONG RUN THERE IS ALSO DEDICATED FUNDING FOR  
23 MULTI-FAMILY DWELLING PROPERTIES WHICH WOULD ENSURE THAT THE  
24 RENTERS ARE BENEFITTING FROM THE FUNDING AND FINALLY THE FUNDS  
25 ARE ELIGIBLE FOR BIKE SHARING AND ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 INFRASTRUCTURE. AND TO SUBSIDIZE PUBLIC TRANSIT PASSES. SO WE  
2 STRONGLY SUPPORT PROP 30. THANKS.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS AUGISTINA  
5 ULLMAN.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** I WORK AT SPUR A BAY AREA NON-PROFIT PUBLIC POLICY  
8 ORGANIZATION. SPUR IS IN STRONG SUPPORT OF PROP 30. PROP 30  
9 WOULD PROVIDE THE LONG-TERM FUNDING NEEDED TO PUT US ON TRACK  
10 TO ZERO OUT TAILPIPE EMISSIONS FROM VEHICLES AND CATASTROPHIC  
11 WILDFIRES TWO LARGEST SOURCES OF CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND AIR  
12 POLLUTION THE MEASURE WOULD GENERATE TENS OF BILLIONS OF  
13 DOLLARS FOR PRIORITIES IDENTIFIED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,  
14 INCLUDING POTENTIALLY BILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT  
15 AGENCIES TRANSITIONING TO ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES AND FERRIES,  
16 SCHOOL DISTRICTS AND TRANSITIONING TO ZERO-EMISSIONS SCHOOL  
17 BUSES AND GOVERNMENTS TRANSITIONING COMPLEX FLEETS OF ON AND  
18 OFF ROAD VEHICLES TO ZERO EMISSION PROP 30 WILL CREATE HIGH  
19 PRIORITIES AND BRING CRITICAL INVESTMENT TO THE BAY AREA I  
20 URGE TO YOU TAKE A SUPPORT STANCE ON PROP 30. THANK YOU FOR  
21 YOUR TIME.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MS. ULLMAN. NEXT SPEAKER IS  
24 SANDRA LO. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M SANDRA LO A CITY  
2 COUNCILWOMAN IN THE CITY OF SONOMA, I WAS A PRIOR SCHOOL BOARD  
3 MEMBER AND I WORKED FOR THE CALIFORNIA TEACHER'S ASSOCIATION  
4 FOR 20 YEARS. I KNOW THAT PEOPLE ARE CONCERNED OR ARE CONFUSED  
5 ABOUT EDUCATION FUNDING. THIS IS NEW MONEY. THIS IS NOT MONEY  
6 THAT IS CURRENTLY IN THE STATE BUDGET. IF THIS WERE TO FAIL,  
7 THERE WOULD BE NO MORE MONEY FOR EDUCATION, AND THIS WILL NOT  
8 HARM CURRENT EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS. WHAT WILL HARM STUDENTS IS  
9 THE TERRIBLE AIR THAT THEY'RE EXPERIENCING. 90,000 STUDENTS,  
10 IN SIX DIFFERENT COUNTIES, WERE TAKEN OUT OF SCHOOL IN THE  
11 LAST MONTH BECAUSE OF FOREST FIRE AND BAD AIR. WE OWE IT TO  
12 OUR CHILDREN TO PROTECT THEIR ENVIRONMENT, AND I STRONGLY URGE  
13 TO YOU SUPPORT PROPOSITION 30. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, MRS. LO. THERE ARE NO  
16 ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, AND THANK YOU TO  
19 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR PARTICIPATING. WE HAVE A FIRST BY  
20 MYSELF, SECOND BY WORTH. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, DO YOU HAVE A  
21 QUESTION?

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** I JUST WANTED TO INFORM THE  
24 COMMISSION THAT THIS WAS SUPPORTED, BUT PROP -- BUT THAT ABAG  
25 AND THE BAY AREA QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT BOTH TOOK A



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 SUPPORT POSITION ON PROP 30 SO WILL BE JOINING OUR SIBLING  
2 REGIONAL AGENCIES.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. COMMISSIONER  
5 FLEMING THEN COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR THEIR  
10 CONCERNS. AS A PARENT OF A CHILD IN SCHOOL UP HERE IN THE  
11 PUBLIC SCHOOLS I CAN SAY FIRSTHAND HOW DIFFICULT THE AIR  
12 QUALITY CHALLENGES ARE, I SEE BUSES IDLING, AND I SEE CHILDREN  
13 MISSING SCHOOL DUE TO WILDFIRE SMOKE WHICH EXTENDS BEYOND  
14 NORTH BAY REGION. ONE OF THE CALLERS SWAYED ME, AND I WILL BE  
15 IN SUPPORT OF THIS MEASURE.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN? CLOSE  
18 US OUT AND THEN WE'LL DO ROLL CALL.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANT TO CLARIFY, THE DISCUSSION WITHIN OUR  
21 JURISDICTIONS OF THE DESIGNATION BY THE GOVERNOR AND  
22 LEGISLATURE AND THE MOUND OF WONDERFUL ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAMS  
23 THAT ARE COMING DOWN THE FUNDING RIGHT NOW THAT'S BEING SPENT  
24 ON THESE ITEMS NOT RELATED TO EDUCATION BUT THAT'S WHAT WE



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 WERE LOOKING AT AND A MEMBER OF THE AIR QUALITY BOARD AS WELL.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ON THE ITEM MOTION AND

5 SECOND BY COMMISSIONER WORTH. ROLL CALL.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I WAS TRYING TO PROMOTE COMMISSIONER

8 LICCARDO WHO IS IN THE AUDIENCE. I CAN'T FIND HIM TO PROMOTE

9 HIM. I'M GOING TO GO AHEAD WITH ROLL CALL COMMISSIONER

10 PEDROZA?

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

2

3 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** CANEPA?

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** NO.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JUST MARKING NO. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS IN THE AUDIENCE.

20 THANK YOU COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

25





SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **GINA PAPAN:** NO.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

12

13 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AN ENTHUSIASTIC AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** ABSTAIN.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

20

21 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH 14 AYES,  
24 TWO NAYS, ONE ABSTENTION, AND ONE ABSENT.

25



SEPTEMBER 28, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS FOR A ROBUST  
2 CONVERSATION. WE'RE GOING MOVE TO ITEM 15, PUBLIC COMMENT.  
3 THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ANY ITEMS  
4 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AT  
5 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD OR IF YOU'RE PHONING IN  
6 PLEASE DIAL STAR NINE. I'LL ALSO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS  
7 OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT PLEASE RAISE  
8 YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. GO AHEAD.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANKS. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING  
11 AND I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AT  
12 THIS TIME.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOVING TO ITEM 16 ADJOURNMENT, THE  
15 MEETING IS ADJOURNED IN MEMORY OF BOB ALVARADO, MTC  
16 COMMISSIONER. WE ARE ALL SADDENED BY HIS LOSS. THE NEXT  
17 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS  
18 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY OCTOBER 26TH. ANY CHANGES TO BE  
19 DULY NOTED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30



*Broadcasting Government*