

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



APRIL 10, 2026

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PLANNING COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, APRIL 10, 2026, 9:40 AM

CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC: OKAY I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEBSITES COMMITTEE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER ROLL CALL VOTE FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DO WE STILL NEED TO DO THAT WITHOUT COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI. TODAY WE'LL ACKNOWLEDGE THAT COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI HAS NOT JOINED YET. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO WHICH IS MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ROLL CALL CONFIRM ASIAN OF QUORUM PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

BOARD CLERK: CHAIR AHN?

CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC: HERE.

BOARD CLERK: VICE CHAIR BURT?

V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC: HERE.



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **BOARD CLERK:** ANDERSEN?

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** PRESENT AT 1516KAMALA STREET HONOLULU AS
4 NOTICED.

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CORZO?

7

8 **NOELIA CORZO:** HERE.

9

10 **BOARD CLERK:** ASHCRAFT?

11

12 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

13

14 **BOARD CLERK:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI NON-VOTING IS ABSENT.
15 COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

16

17 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE.

18

19 **BOARD CLERK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MASHBURN IS
20 ABSENT. WE HAVE QUORUM.

21

22 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** GREAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM THREE
23 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR AGENDA ITEM THREE A
24 INCLUDES AGENDA ITEM 3A WHICH IS APPROVAL OF THE MTC PLANNING
25 COMPLETELY MEETING MINUTES OF THE MARCH 13th 2026 MEETING. DO



APRIL 10, 2026

1 I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MTC PLANNING
2 COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

5

6 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** MOVED BY BURT.

7

8 **NOELIA CORZO:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** SECOND FROM CORZO. ANY OTHER COMMENT
11 FROM COMMISSIONERS? IF NOT LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY
12 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM

13

14 **BOARD CLERK:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM
15 AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS
16 ITEM.

17

18 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** PLEASE CALL THE VOTE.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** CHAIR AHN.

21

22 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** YES BURT.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** YES.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **BOARD CLERK:** ANDERSEN?

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** CORZO?

6

7 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

8

9 **BOARD CLERK:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

10

11 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** YES.

12

13 **BOARD CLERK:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

14

15 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

16

17 **BOARD CLERK:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MASHBURN IS ABSENT. MOTION

18 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** GREAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR

21 RAMOS.

22

23 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO

24 CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE.

25 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 COMMITTEE PARTICIPATION TODAY IF WE COULD PLEASE HAVE THE
2 CLERK MR. CASTRO CALL THE ROLL CONFIRM QUORUM.

3

4 **BOARD CLERK:** YES, MA'AM SUPERVISOR CARLTON.

5

6 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE.

7

8 **BOARD CLERK:** DUONG IS ABSENT. TELECONFERENCE LOCATION IS
9 CONNECTED. ECKLUND?

10

11 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

12

13 **BOARD CLERK:** FIFE? ABSENT. RABBITT? ABSENT RAMOS?

14

15 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** PRESENT.

16

17 **BOARD CLERK:** ROMERO?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** PRESENT.

20

21 **BOARD CLERK:** SILVA?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

24

25 **BOARD CLERK:** WILLIAMS?



APRIL 10, 2026

1

2 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HERE.

3

4 **BOARD CLERK:** AT THE SOLANO COUNTY POSTED LOCATION?

5

6 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THAT IS CORRECT 675 TEXAS CENTURY FAIRFIELD
7 CALIFORNIA.

8

9 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** PLEASE PROVIDE THE COMPENSATION
12 ANNOUNCEMENT.

13

14 **BOARD CLERK:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING
15 ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF ABAG IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS
16 MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$150 AND
17 THAT THE PER DIEM SHALL BE PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A
18 MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM.
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION
22 TODAY. ABAG MEET MEMBERS ONLY WE DO HAVE ONE ITEM UNDER
23 CONSENT APPROVAL OF OUR MINUTES FROM MARCH 13th. ARE THERE ANY
24 QUESTIONS OR CORRECTIONS? SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK FOR A MOTION.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** I'LL MOVE APPROVAL, ROMERO.

2

3 **PAT ECKLUND:** SECOND.

4

5 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** MOTION, ROMERO; SECOND, ECKLUND

6 ROLL CALL VOTE.

7

8 **BOARD CLERK:** IF WE COULD HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.

11

12 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS

13 ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO

14 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** CALL THE ROLL.

17

18 **BOARD CLERK:** ON THE MOTION, ROMERO; SECOND ECKLUND. CARLSON?

19

20 **KEN CARLSON:** YES.

21

22 **BOARD CLERK:** DUONG? ABSENT. ECKLUND?

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **BOARD CLERK:** FIFE IS ABSENT. RABBITT ABSENT RAMOS?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** YES.

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** ROMERO?

6

7 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** YES.

8

9 **BOARD CLERK:** SILVA IS ABSENT. WILLIAMS?

10

11 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

12

13 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

14 MEMBERS PRESENT.

15

16 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU WE'LL MOVE TO 8A THAT IS

17 TO RECEIVE THE VITAL SIGNS WEBSITE DATA UPDATES OVERVIEW OF

18 RECENT UPDATES TO MTC ABAG'S VITAL SIGNS PERFORMANCE

19 MONITORING AND PREVIEW OF FINDINGS FROM THE LATEST DATA

20 REFRESHES. WE HAVE ELLIOTT HUANG JOINING US TODAY. EXCELLENT.

21 GOOD MORNING. AND THANK YOU.

22

23 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS ELLIOTT

24 HUANG DATA SCIENTIST IN THE DATA STRATEGY ANALYTICS DEPARTMENT

25 PROJECT MANAGER OF THE VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM. TODAY I'LL BE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 PRESENTING THE VITAL SIGNS APRIL 2026 UPDATE. NEXT SLIDE
2 PLEASE. SO, I'LL FIRST TALK ABOUT THE OVERALL PURPOSE AND
3 GOALS OF THE VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM, PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT ON HOW
4 THIS PROGRAM HAS EVOLVED OVER TIME, AND CONTINUES TO EVOLVE.
5 THIS BACKGROUND INFORMATION WILL BE ESPECIALLY USEFUL FOR
6 THOSE WHO MAY NOT NECESSARILY BE AS FAMILIAR WITH VITAL SIGNS.
7 OF THE FROM THERE, I'LL SHARE SOME TECHNICAL BACKGROUND
8 IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE HAVE BEEN MAKING TO THE SITES, TALK ABOUT
9 WHY THAT'S IMPORTANT, AND FINALLY I'LL SHARE SOME INSIGHTS
10 ABOUT WHAT THE VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS ARE ACTUALLY TELLING US
11 ABOUT THE BAY AREA. SO, A LITTLE MORE ABOUT VITAL SIGNS. VITAL
12 SIGNS IS AN MTC ABAG WEBSITE THAT OFFERS DATA, VISUALIZATIONS
13 CONTEXTUALIZED NARRATIVES ON IMPORTANT TRENDS IN THE BAY AREA.
14 THERE IS FIVE KEY CATEGORIES HERE ON VITAL SIGNS, LAND AND
15 PEOPLE, TRANSPORTATION, THE ECONOMY, THE ENVIRONMENT, AND
16 EQUITY. VITAL SIGNS CONSISTS OF 41 INDICATORS ACROSS FIVE
17 CATEGORIES AND CONTAINS HUNDREDS OF CHARTS, MAPS, AND DATA
18 SETS. OVERALL, VITAL SIGNS HELPS US TRACK TRENDS AND MAKE
19 INFORMED DECISIONS TOWARDS ACHIEVING POLICY GOALS. NEXT SLIDE
20 PLEASE. A LITTLE HISTORY ABOUT VITAL SIGNS, LAUNCHED IN 2015
21 WITH CLOSE TIES TO PLANNED BAY AREA OVER TIME WE HAVE MADE
22 SOME IMPROVEMENTS TO THE SITE SUCH AS A VISUAL REDESIGN THAT
23 WAS LAUNCHED IN 2023 WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE DATA PIPELINE
24 OPTIMIZATION PHASE OF THE PROJECT THAT JUST MEANS WE'RE MAKING
25 IMPROVEMENTS TO THE SITE SUCH THAT THE DATA SETS ON VITAL



APRIL 10, 2026

1 SIGNS WILL ALWAYS BE UP-TO-DATE WHICH IS A CHALLENGE THAT THE
2 SITE HAS HAD HISTORICALLY. I'LL TALK MORE ABOUT THAT ON THE
3 NEXT SLIDE. ONE THING ABOUT WHAT THE FUTURE DEVELOPMENT OF
4 WHAT VITAL SIGNS LOOKS LIKE. THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY IN THE
5 FUTURE TO RETHINK AND POTENTIALLY CONSIDER NEW INDICATORS,
6 POTENTIALLY RETIRE LESS RELEVANT INDICATORS, AND CONTINUE TO
7 LOOK FOR WAYS TO INCORPORATE VITAL SIGNS INTO OTHER KEY DATA-
8 DRIVEN INITIATIVES ACROSS THE ORGANIZATION. AT A HIGH-LEVEL,
9 THE VITAL SIGNS PLATFORM IS NOT STATIC, IT EVOLVES OVER TIME,
10 AND WE'RE CONTINUING EVOLVE TO ENSURE THAT IT'S AN AUTOMATED
11 SYSTEM THAT CAN PROVIDE CURRENT ACCURATE AND RELEVANT
12 INFORMATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THIS IS A LITTLE BIT MORE
13 BEHIND THE SCENES LOOK OF THE DATA PIPELINE. AS I MENTIONED,
14 IT WAS A LITTLE BIT OF A HISTORICAL CHALLENGE TO KEEP THE
15 VITAL SIGNS DATA SETS UP-TO-DATE. THERE ARE HUNDREDS OF DATA
16 SETS ON THE SITE. HISTORICALLY, THE PROCESS TO UPDATE AND
17 MAINTAIN THOSE DATA SETS WAS A BIT SLOWLY AND HIGHLY MANUAL.
18 THE SOLUTION WE'RE IMPLEMENTED. HERE IS WHAT WE ARE CALLING
19 THE DATA PIPELINE; IT'S ESSENTIALLY AN AUTOMATED WORKLOAD TO
20 HELP US GRAB DATA FROM THE SOURCE, FROM WHATEVER VARIOUS DATA
21 SOURCES THAT VITAL SIGNS DEPLOYS FROM PROCESS THAT DATA AND TO
22 THE WEBSITE. I HAVE BEEN USING THE ANALOGY OF A TOYOTA
23 FACTORY. IT'S A DATA PIPELINE WITH STANDARDIZED PARTS
24 AUTOMATED PROCESSES AND A STREAMLINED PRODUCTION PROCESS THAT
25 CAN QUICKLY OUTPUT UPDATED VITAL SIGNS DATA SETS OFF THE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 ASSEMBLY LINE. SO BY END OF THE YEAR WE DO EXPECT ALL VITAL
2 SIGNS INDICATOR DATA SETS ON THE WEBSITE TO BE ON-BOARDED INTO
3 THE NEW DATA PIPELINE AND FROM THAT POINT MOVING FORWARD DATA
4 ON VITAL SIGNS WILL CONTINUOUSLY BE UP-TO-DATE. AND OF COURSE,
5 HAVING THE SITE UP-TO-DATE WITH DATA WILL MAKE THE SITE MORE
6 RELEVANT FOR USERS AND IMPROVE OUR ABILITY TO RELIABLY TRACK
7 PROGRESS ON REGIONAL PRIORITIES. A BIT BEHIND THE SCENES
8 THERE. IF WOE GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE WE'LL TALK A BIT MORE ABOUT
9 WHAT INDICATORS ARE ACTUALLY SHOWING US ABOUT TRENDS IN THE
10 BAY AREA. SO, NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WHAT ARE THE INDICATORS
11 TELLING US? WELL, AT A VERY HIGH-LEVEL, THE INDICATORS ARE
12 SHOWING US A LEVEL OF PRE-PANDEMIC/POST-PANDEMIC ADJUSTMENTS.
13 SOME INDICATORS ARE SHOWING NEW TRENDS. SOME INDICATORS ARE
14 CONTINUING OR EVEN ACCELERATING PRE-PANDEMIC TRENDS. ON THE
15 NEXT FEW SLIDES WE'LL GO INTO A BIT MORE DETAIL AND TALK
16 THROUGH SOME OF WHAT THE INDICATORS ARE TELLING US THEN WE'LL
17 GO THROUGH CATEGORY BY CATEGORY FOR THE VARIOUS VITAL SIGNS
18 INDICATOR CATEGORIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THE LAND AND
19 PEOPLE CATEGORIES WE'RE GOING TO SPOTLIGHT TWO INDICATORS
20 HERE, POPULATION AND HOUSING PRODUCTION. FOR POPULATION, WE DO
21 SEE ON THE CHART HERE, THERE WAS PANDEMIC DIP WHERE POPULATION
22 DROPS SLIGHTLY DURING THE PANDEMIC. WE ARE NOW SEEING A SLOW
23 BUT STEADY RECOVERY COMING OUT OF THE PANDEMIC WITH AROUND
24 50,000 RESIDENTS ADDED FROM 2022 TO 2025. ZOOMING OUT A BIT,
25 THE PATTERN WE SEE ON THIS CHART IS FAIRLY CANNOT WITH THE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 EBBS AND FLOWS OF POPULATION GROWTH IN THE BAY AREA OVER THE
2 PAST SEVERAL DECADES. FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE EARLY 2000s, DURING
3 THE DOT COM BOOM AND BUST, WE SAW SOME LEVEL OF SLOWER
4 POPULATION GROWTH FOLLOWED BY STRONGER LARGE POPULATION GROWTH
5 IN THE 20 TENS. AT THE SAME TIME DURING THE HOUSING PRODUCTION
6 INDICATOR WE SEE THAT HOUSING PRODUCTION HAS NEVER REALLY
7 QUITE KEPT UP WITH POPULATION GROWTH IN THE RECENT DECADES
8 THIS CONTRIBUTES TO THE HOUSING AFFORDABILITY CHALLENGES WE
9 FACE TODAY WHICH IS REALLY BACKLOG OF EXISTING NEEDS. NEXT
10 SLIDE. FOR THE TRANSPORTATION SPOTLIGHT WE START WITH THE
11 COMMUTE MODE SHARE INDICATOR THAT'S JUST AN INDICATOR THAT
12 SHOWS THE RELATIVE SHARE OF DIFFERENT TRAVEL MODES FOR WORK
13 COMMUTE BASED TRIPS. THROUGHOUT THE 2010'S COMMUTE MODE SHARE
14 WAS RELATIVELY STABLE WITH ACTUALLY EVEN SHOWING SLIGHT
15 DECREASE IN DRIVING OVER THE DECADE. DURING THE PANDEMIC WE
16 SAW A SHARP INCREASE IN WORKING FROM HOME WE SEE ON THE CHART
17 THAT SPIKED AROUND 2021. CURRENTLY, LEVELS ARE STABILIZING AT
18 AROUND 17% MODE SHARE AS OF 2024, WHICH IS THE LATEST
19 AVAILABLE DATA FROM THE U.S. CENSUS. TRANSIT PRE-PANDEMIC
20 HOVERED AROUND 12 TO 13% RELATIVELY STABLE. DROPPED DURING THE
21 PANDEMIC BUT NOW BACK UP AROUND 7.7% AGAIN AS OF 2024. NEXT
22 SLIDE PLEASE. HERE WE WILL LOOK AT TWO ADDITIONAL INDICATORS,
23 WE HAVE VMT VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND THEN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP.
24 FOR VMT THAT'S A PRETTY GOOD MEASURE OF GENERAL ACTIVITY
25 GENERAL DRIVING ACTIVITY IN THE REGION HERE WE'RE REPORTING



APRIL 10, 2026

1 VMT ON A PER CAPITA BASIS JUST TO ACCOUNT FOR POPULATION
2 CHANGES OVER TIME. WE SEE THAT VMT PER CAPITA IS DOWN 15% FROM
3 PRE-PANDEMIC AND IS NOW RELATIVELY STABLE WITH A SLIGHTLY
4 INCREASING TREND. TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, WE HAVE A -- WE HAD A
5 RELATIVELY STABLE TREND OVER THE PAST 20 YEARS, SOME NOISE TO
6 ACCOUNT FOR SEASONALITY AS SEEN IN THE CHART THERE WAS THE
7 NOTABLE PANDEMIC DIP AND SUBSEQUENT RECOVERY NOW WE'RE
8 CURRENTLY SITTING AT AROUND 70% OF PRE-PANDEMIC MONTHLY
9 RIDERSHIP. SO THAT'S COMPARING JANUARY 2026 TO JANUARY 2029.
10 JANUARY 2026 IS 70% OF PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS. OVERALL IT DOES
11 APPEAR THAT THE DIFFERENT TRANSPORTATION INDICATORS ARE
12 APPROACHING WHAT COULD BE CONSIDERED A NEW STEADY STATE AFTER
13 THE PANDEMIC SHOCK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO MOVING ON TO THE
14 ECONOMY INDICATORS. HERE WE'RE HIGHLIGHTING INCOME, INCOME
15 INEQUALITY AND HOME VALUES ALL OF WHICH ARE SHOWING AN
16 INCREASING TREND. HERE WE HAVE THE CHART OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME
17 BY PERCENTILE. WE SEE HERE THE 90th PERCENTILE IS AROUND 420K.
18 THE 90th PERCENTILE THAT TERM THAT JUST MEANS 90% OF
19 HOUSEHOLDS ARE MAKING LESS THAN 420K. 10% OF HOUSEHOLDS ARE
20 MAKING MORE THAN THAT. ANOTHER WAY I THINK TO THINK
21 PERCENTILES HIGHEST EARNING 10% 90th PERCENTILE LOWEST
22 HOUSEHOLD INCOME TOP TEN SO 10% HOUSEHOLDS SIT MAKE MORE THAN
23 THAT 19th AND 10th PERCENTILE NUMBERS ARE USEFUL FOR A NUMBER
24 OF REASONS BUT CAN ALSO BE USED TO QUANTIFY INCOME INEQUALITY
25 BY TAKING THE RATIO OF TWO VALUES OVER TIME WE'RE SEEING



APRIL 10, 2026

1 INCREASE IN INCOME INEQUALITY JUST IN A WAY TO QUANTIFY OVER
2 TIME WE CAN ALSO SEE INCOME INEQUALITY INCREASING IN THIS
3 CHART RED LINE INCREASING A LOT FASTER THAN BLUE LINE WHICH
4 REPRESENTS 10th PERCENTILE LINE OR EVEN 50th PERCENTILE LINE,
5 COMMONLY REFERRED TO AS THE MEDIAN RIGHT NOT MIDDLE 50%
6 HOUSEHOLD EARN LESS 50% MAKE MORE IN THE BAY AREA
7 2,024,137,000 HOME VALUES ANOTHER RELATED ECONOMIC INDICATOR
8 HERE WE'RE SEEING UPWARDS TREND AS OF 2025 MEDIAN TYPICAL HOME
9 VALUE 1.17 MILLION THAT'S UP 77% IN 2012. WITH THAT WE COULD
10 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE IS THE EQUITY INDICATORS JUST
11 A NOTE I'M SKIPPING THE ENVIRONMENT CATEGORY WE DON'T HAVE
12 UPDATES FOR THIS IMPORTANT TOPIC BUT AT THIS TIME WE HAVE THEM
13 SCHEDULED FOR LATER THIS YEAR. CONTINUING WITH THE EQUITY
14 INDICATORS SPOTLIGHT HERE IS JOBS BY WAGE LEVEL HERE WE SEE
15 THROUGHOUT DIFFERENT SUBREGIONS IN THE BAY AREA THE SHARE OF
16 MIDDLE WAGE JOBS IS SLOWLY DECLINING OVER TIME MEANING THAT
17 JOBS ARE INCREASINGLY BECOMING HIGH WAGE OR LOW WAGE. ANOTHER
18 EQUITY INDICATOR IS HOUSING AFFORDABILITY THE HEADLINE
19 STATISTIC HERE IS MORE THAN 40% OF RENTER HOUSEHOLDS ARE
20 CONSIDERED HOUSING COST BURDENED AND DEFINITION OF HOUSING
21 COST BURDEN IS IF THEY SPEND MORE THAN 30% OF THEIR GROSS
22 INCOME ON HOUSING SO TAKEAWAY HERE IS ALMOST HALF OF ALL
23 RENTERS ARE CONSIDERED HOUSING COST BURDENS IN THE BAY AREA SO
24 TO CONCLUDE THE INDICATOR REVIEW JUST WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THAT
25 THESE INDICATORS ADD MORE AND ARE AVAILABLE ON THE VITAL SIGNS



APRIL 10, 2026

1 WEBSITE AND DEFINITELY ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO GO CHECK THEM
2 OUT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF THE
3 WAYS THAT VITAL SIGNS IS BEING INTEGRATED INTO PROGRAMS ACROSS
4 THE ORGANIZATION, TWO TO HIGHLIGHT MAJOR INITIATIVES TO
5 HIGHLIGHT HERE PLANNED BAY AREA AND THE FEDERAL PERFORMANCE
6 PROGRAM. PLANNED BAY AREA VITAL SIGNS IS PLAYING A KEY ROLE IN
7 SUPPORTING THE TRACKING OF PERFORM METRICS LINED WITH THE
8 PLAN'S GOALS AND STRATEGIES. AS MENTIONED EARLIER VITAL SIGNS
9 HAS A CLOSE TIE WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND TO THAT END WE ARE
10 PLANNING A PLANNED BAY AREA SPECIFIC WEB PAGE ON VITAL SIGNS
11 THAT MORE SPECIFICALLY TRACKS THE EXACT METRICS IN THE PLAN TO
12 TRACK THE TRENDS TOWARDS ACHIEVING THE STRATEGIES AND GOALS OF
13 THE PLAN. SO, IT'S GOING TO BE A LITTLE BIT MORE OF AN
14 EXPLICIT TIE WITH VITAL SIGNS WITH THAT PBA SPECIFIC WEB PAGE.
15 ANOTHER PROGRAM WHERE VITAL SIGNS PLAYS A INTEGRATED ROLE IS
16 THE FEDERAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES PROGRAM THAT'S A STRATEGIC
17 DATA-DRIVEN APPROACH MAN DATED BY FHWA TO USE PERFORMANCE
18 MEASURES TO GUIDE TRANSPORTATION DECISION-MAKING. MANY OF THE
19 VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS OVERLAP WITH THE FEDERAL PERFORMANCE
20 MEASURES AND IN MANY WAYS VITAL SIGNS SIMPLIFIES THE REPORTING
21 PROCESS BECAUSE THE DATA IS TRACKED IN AUTOMATED FASHION ON
22 VITAL SIGNS. THESE ARE A COUPLE OF WAYS THAT VITAL SIGNS IS
23 INTEGRATED INTO MAJOR INITIATIVES THERE ARE OTHER PROJECTS
24 THAT LEVERAGE VITAL SIGNS DATA ON A SMALLER SCALE SOME NUMBER
25 OF MONTHS AGO I WAS RIDING THE ELEVATOR UP TO THE OFFICE AND



APRIL 10, 2026

1 BUMPED INTO AN MTC COLLEAGUE THE REALLY KNOW TOO WELL SO HAD
2 OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLAIN TO THEM WHAT I WAS WORKING ON AND
3 REALLY AN OPPORTUNITY TO GIVER THE VITAL SIGNS PITCH AS I WAS
4 TELLING HIM WHAT VITAL SIGNS WAS BEFORE I COULD EVEN FINISH
5 THE SENTENCE VITAL SIGNS CONTAINS HUNDREDS OF DATA SETS CHARTS
6 AND MAPS HE STOPPED ME AND SAID OH YEAH I HAVE USED THAT FOR
7 MY TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THAT TELLS ME THERE ARE USERS OUT
8 THERE WHO ARE MAYBE NOT DEEP INTEGRATION WITH THEIR PROJECT
9 BUT ARE GOING TO THE SITE TO GATHER INFORMATION COLLECT AD-HOC
10 METRICS FOR USE IN THEIR PROGRAM SO THAT'S A BIT SMALLER SCALE
11 BUT REALLY TESTAMENT TO THE FACT THAT WE DO HAVE AGENCY STAFF
12 WHO ARE NAVIGATING TO THE SITE AND LOOKING AT METRICS. MOVING
13 FORWARD A NUMBER OF PROGRAMS WE'RE EXPLORING INTEGRATION WITH
14 VITAL SIGNS, DATA-DRIVEN INITIATIVES ARE GOOD CANDIDATES FOR
15 THIS TYPE OF INTEGRATION REGIONAL NETWORK PERFORMANCE MEASURES
16 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES PROGRAM IS A
17 GOOD CANDIDATE, RHNA EPCS THESE ALL HAVE LARGE DATA-DRIVEN
18 NEED AND THE STRATEGY THERE IS TO LEVERAGE VITAL SIGNS OR AT
19 LEAST HAVE SOME LEVEL OF INTEGRATION BETWEEN THE TWO SO WE CAN
20 REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF DUPLICATED WORK TO PERFORM THE DATA
21 ANALYSIS AND THAT ADVANCES THE GOAL OF THE AGENCY'S OVERALL
22 GOAL OF OPERATIONAL EXCELLENCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. MOVING
23 FORWARD KEY PRIORITIES HERE, TOP PRIORITY IS TO FINISH THE
24 TRANSITION OF ALL OF THE VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS TO THE
25 AUTOMATED DATA PIPELINE THAT WILL LEAVE US IN A STATE WHERE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 ALL DATA ON VITAL SIGNS IS CONTINUOUSLY UP-TO-DATE THAT'S
2 GOING TO BE A VERY GREAT PLACE TO BE IN. ONCE WE REACH THAT
3 POINT, FROM THERE, WE CAN BE STRATEGIC ABOUT WHAT INDICATORS
4 WE WANT TO POTENTIALLY ADD OR REMOVE FROM VITAL SIGNS. OVER
5 TIME, YOU CAN IMAGINE THAT SOME INDICATORS MAY BECOME LESS OR
6 MORE RELATIVE OVER TIME AND THERE ARE CERTAINLY SOME
7 CATEGORIES ON VITAL SIGNS THAT COULD USE ADDITIONAL INDICATORS
8 FROM. THERE, ARE AS I MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY, JUST CONTINUING
9 INTEGRATE VITAL SIGNS INTO STRATEGIC DATA-DRIVEN INITIATIVES
10 ACROSS THE ORGANIZATION, REALLY REDUCING THAT REDUNDANT DATA
11 PREPARATION AND DATA ANALYSIS WORK AND IMPROVING OPERATIONAL
12 EXCELLENCE. SO THAT CONCLUDES THE MAIN BODY OF THE
13 PRESENTATION. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU ALL MAY
14 HAVE.

15

16 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND I
17 DEFINITELY APPRECIATE HEARING THAT OTHERS HAVE TOLD YOU THAT
18 THEY USE VITAL SIGNS, BECAUSE CERTAINLY YOU LOOK AT THIS
19 INFORMATION, AND DATA CAN BE DENSE AND, NO OFFENSE TO THE DATA
20 SCIENTISTS IN THE ROOM, A LITTLE BIT BORING, BUT WHEN YOU PUT
21 SOME STORIES BEHIND IT AND YOU'RE ABLE TO APPLY IT, IT
22 CERTAINLY DOES VERY MUCH IMPACT THE WORK THAT WE DO. AND I
23 THINK, YOU KNOW, WHEN YOU, ESPECIALLY THE -- MY KEY TAKEAWAY
24 HERE WAS SLIDE EIGHT WHEN YOU SAW THE IMPACTS THAT THE
25 PANDEMIC HAD ON VMT AND ON RIDERSHIP, THAT IT ABSOLUTELY PUTS



APRIL 10, 2026

1 INTO NUMBER WHAT IS WE HAVE EXPERIENCED AND WHY OUR TRANSIT
2 SYSTEMS ARE IN NEED OF AN INFLUX OF PEOPLE AND OF CAPITAL. SO,
3 THANK YOU FOR THAT. ANY QUESTIONS? OKAY. WE'LL GO WITH
4 DIRECTOR ECKLUND FIRST, THEN WE'LL GO TO --

5

6 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. DOES VITAL SIGNS
7 TRACK THE NUMBER OF RENTERS THAT ARE IN THE VARIOUS UNITS?

8

9 **ELLIOT HUANG:** GREAT QUESTION WE DON'T TRACK THAT EXPLICITLY AS
10 AN INDICATOR BUT THAT DATA IS AVAILABLE A LITTLE BIT
11 AGGREGATED IN SOME OF THE EXISTING INDICATORS THAT'S
12 ABSOLUTELY SOMETHING THAT CAN BE SURFACED IT'S JUST NOT A
13 FORMAL INDICATOR.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** IT'S IMPORTANT TO KNOW HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE
16 SHARING RENT IN A PARTICULAR APARTMENT FOR EXAMPLE, BECAUSE IT
17 SHOWS THE COST BURDEN THAT THEY'RE ALL PAYING. AND DO YOU KNOW
18 WHETHER IT'S LEGAL -- THAT THE OWNERS OF THE APARTMENTS HAS TO
19 KNOW THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT ARE LIVING IN AN APARTMENT OR -
20 - I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT QUESTION.

21

22 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** I THINK THAT'S BEYOND THE SCOPE OF
23 TODAY'S PRESENTATION.

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH MAYBE I CAN FIGURE THAT OUT LATER. I THINK



APRIL 10, 2026

1 THERE IS A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT ARE NECESSARILY TELLING THE
2 TRUTH ABOUT HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE LIVING IN AN APARTMENT BUT
3 ANYWAY IT JUST SHOWS THAT THE COST BURDEN IS PRETTY HIGH.

4

5 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER BURT?

6

7 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** THANK YOU. WELL, I JUST WANT TO SAY
8 THIS IS AN EXCITING PRESENTATION. AND IN TERMS OF DISCUSSING
9 WHAT KIND OF INDICATORS MIGHT BE MORE BENEFICIAL I HAVE TO
10 ACKNOWLEDGE, I HAVEN'T GONE THROUGH THE WHOLE WEBSITE, SO YOU
11 MAY HAVE SOME OF THIS ALREADY THERE, BUT FOR INSTANCE ON SLIDE
12 TWO WHICH, IS THE LAND AND PEOPLE SLOW AND STEADY POST-
13 PANDEMIC POPULATION GROWTH. AND I SEE THAT IN YOUR BULLET
14 BELOW THE GRAPH, YOU SAY THAT THE POPULATION GROWTH HAS BEEN
15 SLOW BUT STEADY OVER THE LAST FIVE YEARS OVER 50,000 RESIDENTS
16 -- FOUR YEARS, RIGHT? YEAH, FOUR YEARS, THAT'S ABOUT 12,000 A
17 YEAR, AND WITH THIS LAST YEAR, WE SHOWED DOWN A LITTLE BIT IN
18 HOUSING PRODUCTIONS, SLOWED BY 12% -- WELL, LAST YEAR, 2024 I
19 SHOULD SAY, BUT ALMOST 20,000 UNITS WHICH CORRELATES, I THINK
20 IT'S 2.6 RESIDENTS PER UNIT THAT IS THE WORKING AVERAGE. IS
21 THAT CORRECT? YEAH. SO, THAT'S ABOUT 50,000 RESIDENTS THAT
22 HOUSING PRODUCED IN 2024 WOULD PROVIDE FOR APPROXIMATELY
23 50,000 RESIDENTS, BUT AT 12,000 RESIDENT GROWTH. YOU'RE SAYING
24 THAT'S THE PATTERN WE HAVE BEEN ON IN THE LAST FIVE YEARS. SO,
25 THE GOOD NEWS IS, WE HAVE BEEN GROWING HOUSING ABOUT FOUR



APRIL 10, 2026

1 TIMES THE RATE THAT WE HAVE BEEN GROWING RESIDENTS OVER THAT
2 PERIOD. HOW MUCH OF OUR DEFICIT THAT HAS DIMINISHED IS THE
3 REMAINING BIG QUESTION. BECAUSE WE STILL HAVE A BIG DEFICIT.
4 BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO HAVE A GRAPH THAT
5 SHOWS THE CORRELATION BETWEEN HOUSING PRODUCTION AND
6 POPULATION GROWTH. AND THEN YOUR NOTE ON THE DEFINITION OF
7 COST BURDEN, OR RESIDENCE, THE ONE EXCEPTION TO THAT
8 DEFINITION -- AND I KNOW IT'S A WIDELY USED DEFINITION -- IS
9 IT APPLIES TO UPPER INCOME. SO, IF A FAMILY IS MAKING A HALF
10 MILLION DOLLARS A YEAR, AND THEY'RE SPENDING 30% OF THAT ON
11 HOUSING, THEY'RE DEFINED AS BEING COST BURDENED. BUT I WE WANT
12 PUT THEM IN THE CATEGORY. I THINK EVERYBODY BELOW THAT, IT'S A
13 REASONABLE INCLUSION. BUT I THINK THAT'S A REAL FALLACY. BUT I
14 LOOKED AT THE NUMBERS, AND IT'S NOT DOUBLE DIGITS OUT OF THAT,
15 THE TOTALITY OF WHO OUR COST BURDENED. SO IT'S ON THE MARGINS.
16 THE OTHER THING IS THAT WE HAVE THIS BIG DISPARATE BETWEEN HOW
17 THE GDP GROWTH IN THE REGION IS AFFECTING DIFFERENT INCOME
18 GROUPS. AND ONE THING THAT WE -- IS USEFUL TO SEE IS GDP
19 GROWTH VERSUS POPULATION GROWTH, WHICH DOESN'T ANSWER THE
20 QUESTION OF HOW THAT GDP IS DISTRIBUTED IN DIFFERENT INCOME
21 GROUPS. AND WHAT WE HAVE SEEN, AND I THINK YOU HAD, ON SLIDE
22 NINE, ON INCOME INEQUALITY THAT'S WHERE WE'RE SEEING FLAT
23 INCOME IN REALLY THAT BOTH THE 50th AND THE 10th PERCENTILE.
24 BUT THAT SLIDE IS NOT INFLATION ADJUSTED. IS IT?
25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THAT SLIDE IS ACTUALLY INFLATION ADJUSTED.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** OH IT IS THANK YOU. SO, WE HAVE
4 FLAT INCOME. I KNOW THERE WAS A STUDY OUT OF UC SANTA CRUZ A
5 FEW YEARS AGO THAT FOR SILICON VALLEY WE HAD, ACCORDING TO
6 THAT SMALL LABOR BASED INSTITUTE IT WAS, THE ASSERTION WAS THE
7 80% OF ALL RESIDENTS HAD SEEN A DECLINE IN REAL INCOME OVER
8 THE PREVIOUS 20 YEAR PERIOD, WHICH IS A SHOCKING NUMBER. SO
9 I'M REALLY INTERESTED IN SEEING THAT AS WELL. AND THEN LASTLY,
10 ON SLIDE SEVEN THE WORK-FROM-HOME, THE NOTE SAYS WORK-FROM-
11 HOME IS SETTLED AT 17% BUT ACTUALLY BOTH THE GRAPH AND I THINK
12 THE NUMBERS ARE IT'S -- IT'S NOT DECLINING AT THE RATE THAT IT
13 HAS SINCE 2021 TO OF 2023, BUT IT'S STILL DECLINING WHICH IS
14 AN IMPORTANT UNDERSTANDING FOR US TO BE TRACKING BECAUSE IT
15 INFLUENCES ALL OF OUR TRANSPORTATION OTHER AND NEEDS. SO,
16 LOOKING AT THAT, WHERE WE THINK WE'LL END UP ON WORK-FROM-
17 HOME, NOT WHERE WE WERE BEFORE COVID BUT NOT EVEN WHERE WE ARE
18 NOW IS AN IMPORTANT CONSIDERATION. SO THANKS FOR ALL THIS
19 DATA.

20

21 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** VICE PRESIDENT ROMERO. [LAUGHTER]
22 TRYING TO REMEMBER.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** SO I WANT TO PIGGYBACK ON
25 SOMETHING THAT DIRECTOR ECKLUND WAS TALKING ABOUT AND I WANT



APRIL 10, 2026

1 TO FOCUS A BIT MORE ON HOUSING AND HOUSING CONDITIONS AND HOW
2 WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO INTEGRATE THOSE INTO THIS MONEY. BY THE
3 WAY W I SEE YOUR TAKING NOTES. IT'S GOOD TO SEE YOU'RE STILL
4 AROUND. GOD YOU HAVE BEEN HERE, WHAT? 20 YEARS. IT'S BEEN A
5 WHILE NOW, YEAH IT'S GREAT. WE KIND OF USED TO BUMP INTO EACH
6 OTHER AT THE OLD OFFICE. SO -- [LAUGHTER] YEAH. SO I'M
7 WONDERING IF IT IS POSSIBLE TO INTEGRATE SEVERAL POTENTIAL
8 INDICATORS OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS. ONE IS EVICTIONS WHICH,
9 INDEED, WE HAVE TRIED TO TRACK, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO
10 DO SO ON THE HOUSING SIDE. WE DID SOME ANALYSIS, AND I THINK
11 IF WE CONTINUE THAT ANALYSIS AND DATA COLLECTION AND PUT IT
12 INTO THIS, I THINK THAT'S AN INDICATION OF HOW WELL WE'RE
13 DOING. IN THE PAST I HAVE GONE TO SITE AN SIGNS IN THE LAST 3
14 TO 4 YOURS I WAS LIKE OUT OF MIND OUT OF SITE EVEN THOUGH I
15 COULD IT'S VERY DENSE AMOUNT OF DATA JUST FORGOTTEN SO YOU
16 NEED TO REMIND US MORE OFTEN BUT WHAT ABOUT RENTAL UNITS
17 VERSUS SALE UNITS, HOMEOWNERSHIP UNITS I THINK THAT KIND OF
18 UNDERSTANDING THAT RELATIONSHIP IS IMPORTANT IS IT GOING UP OR
19 DOWN. THEN DO WE HAVE AN INDICATOR FOR HOMELESSNESS? IS IT
20 INCREASING? IS IT DECREASING. SO AGAIN THOSE ARE KIND OF MY
21 THREE QUESTIONS AROUND THE WHOLE DATA GATHERING AROUND
22 HOUSING. AND I ASSUME MOST OF THIS DATA, YOU ARE GETTING --
23 THE EVICTION DATA IS NOT IN THE AMERICAN COMMUNITY SURVEY BUT
24 I GUESS YOU COULD GET THE PIECES FROM THE AMERICAN COMMUNITY
25 SURVEY CORRECT?



APRIL 10, 2026

1

2 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THANKS FOR THE FEEDBACK THERE ARE CERTAINLY A
3 NUMBER OF HOUSING INDICATORS THAT ARE WORTHWHILE TO EXPLORE AS
4 NEW INDICATORS A LOT OF THAT DATA CAN COME FROM THE AMERICAN
5 COMMUNITY SURVEY AND THERE ARE SOME OTHER DATA SOURCES AS WELL
6 THAT WE COULD ACTIVELY EXPLORE. SO, I APPRECIATE THAT
7 FEEDBACK.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** JUST ONE OTHER COMMENT. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE
10 HAVE WITH THE VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM IS MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN
11 TRACK INFORMATION OVER A CONTINUOUS PERIOD OF TIME. AND SO
12 SOME OF THOSE DATA SETS THAT YOU DID MENTION, WHILE WE
13 RECOGNIZE IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE NEED TO COLLECT THOSE THE
14 CHALLENGE IS THAT INFORMATION ISN'T AVAILABLE IN A WAY FOR US
15 TO TELL A STORY THAT'S EFFECTIVE FOR OUR REGION. SO, WE DO
16 THINK ABOUT SPECIAL STUDIES OF DATA THAT WE CAN TAKE BE A LOOK
17 AT NOT ON BOARD INTO VITAL SIGNS MAYBE TAKE A DEEPER DIVE INTO
18 THAT INFORMATION MIGHT BE RELEVANT TO SOMETHING WE CAN SHARE
19 SOMETHING I DEFINITELY WANT TO PUT ON THE TABLE FOR EVERYONE
20 TO UNDERSTAND LIKE SOME INDICATORS ARE REALLY CHALLENGING TO
21 COLLECT BECAUSE IT'S NOT CONSISTENTLY AVAILABLE DATA THAT'S
22 ONE OF THE GROUND RULES OF VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM THAT THE
23 INFORMATION IS ACCESS AND I BELIEVE ON TREND BASE PERIOD OF
24 TIME. I WANTED TO ADD THAT COMMENT.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** THE CARLSON IF I MAY WE HAD
2 DISCUSSION ABOUT EVICTION DATA AND THE INFORMATION VALUABLE
3 INFORMATION ACTUALLY WAS PRODUCED BY MTC THERE WAS DISCUSSION
4 ABOUT PERHAPS TALKING TO OUR STATE LEGISLATORS TO SAY IS THERE
5 A WAY TO GET THE EVICTION DATA FROM THE VARIOUS COURTHOUSES
6 ACTUALLY PUT INTO A PUBLIC DATABASE THAT'S SOMETHING YOU ALL
7 CAN'T DO BUT YOU'RE TELLING US YOU WANT TO TRACK THAT MAYBE
8 SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO THINK ABOUT LEGISLATIVELY HOW WE CAN
9 ACTUALLY REQUIRE THAT.

10

11 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YEAH GOOD POINT FOR THOSE THAT
12 DON'T SIT ON THE BAHFA COMMITTEE THAT IS SOMETHING WE LOOKED
13 AT THROUGH THE BAHFA OF HAVING AN EVICTION STUDY WE RAN INTO
14 THE CHALLENGES OF NOT EVERY COUNTY COURTHOUSE OBTAINS
15 INFORMATION THE SAME WAY THAT WOULD BE USEFUL AS A RELIABLE
16 DATA SET. CERTAINLY THE MORE REASON WHY BAHFA NEEDS TO MAKE
17 MORE MONEY SO THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY TAKE THAT ON. SO THERE'S MY
18 PITCH. SEEING NO OTHER QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD, I'LL OPEN IT
19 UP FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

20

21 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
22 THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING
23 TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

24

25 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT IS AN



APRIL 10, 2026

1 INFORMATION ITEM, AND WE REALLY APPRECIATE THIS WORK. AND I
2 HIGHLY ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO GO AND LOOK AT THEIR PARTICULAR
3 COUNTY AND TO THE VITAL SIGNS. I THINK IT'S INCREDIBLY
4 INFORMATIVE. I CERTAINLY -- I -- I'LL SAY FOR NAPA COUNTY, YOU
5 CAN SEE THE TIPS IN HOUSING FROM OUR 2017 AND OUR 2020 FIRES
6 OF THE HOUSING STOCK THAT WAS LOST. SO THAT'S INCREDIBLY
7 VALUABLE DATA AS WE LOOK FORWARD THAT WE CAN LEARN DEFINITELY
8 FROM OUR PAST TRENDS.

9

10 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** MADAM CHAIR, I'M SORRY I DIDN'T GET MY
11 BUTTON PUSHED MAY I MAKE A COMMENT.

12

13 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YEAH.

14

15 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** REALLY QUICK, MY QUESTION IS DO WE HAVE
16 DATA OR COULD WE COLLECT DATA AS TO WHICH JURISDICTIONS HAVE
17 RENT CONTROL ORDINANCES? BECAUSE FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE CITY OF
18 ALAMEDA AND IN THE COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, THOSE ORDINANCES COVER
19 EVICTION PROCEDURES, AND ALSO HOW THEY ARE TRACKED. SO, BUT I
20 DON'T KNOW WHETHER OUR CITY AND COUNTY IS IN THE MINORITY OR
21 IF IT'S A THING ACROSS --

22

23 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YEAH I THINK WE COULD MAKE THAT AS
24 A REFERRAL TO STAFF I DON'T SEE THAT AS NECESSARY PART OF THE
25 VITAL SIGNS AS IT'S NOT DEALING WITH POLICY CONSIDERATIONS



APRIL 10, 2026

1 IT'S MORE ABOUT THE DATA.

2

3 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** NO YEAH THAT'S WHAT I MEANT THAT IF THE
4 QUESTION CAME UP OR IT WAS RAISED THAT EVICTION INFORMATION
5 WOULD BE HELPFUL I THINK THERE ARE SOME WAYS TO TRACK THIS I
6 COULD CERTAINLY PROVIDE THAT INFORMATION FROM OUR CITY BECAUSE
7 I KNOW HOW WE TRACK IT BECAUSE OF OUR RENT ORDINANCE AND THERE
8 MAY BE OTHERS. THAT'S ALL.

9

10 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** MADAM CHAIR ALSO DO COUNTIES TRACK THE NUMBER OF
13 HOMELESS?

14

15 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THEY DO THROUGH THE POINT IN TIME
16 COUNT THAT HAPPENS IN JANUARY AS DIRECTED BY HUD, BUT THAT IS,
17 I THINK, ALSO, WE COULD JUST GO AHEAD AND SAY TO STAFF, YOU
18 KNOW, AS WE LOOK AT FURTHER INTEGRATION AND WE CAN SEE IF WE
19 COULD FIND CONSISTENCY WITHIN THE PIT COUNT METHODOLOGY, I
20 KNOW IT DOES VARY FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY A LITTLE BIT. IT'S ALL
21 DONE IN THE SAME SPIRIT WITH THE SAME INTENTION BUT IT IS A
22 LITTLE DIFFERENT IN EACH COUNTY. AND CERTAINLY URBANIZED
23 AREAS, RURAL AREAS HAVE DIFFERENT DATA COLLECTION
24 METHODOLOGIES. BUT AS WE LOOK AT IMPROVING VITAL SIGNS HERE
25 THAT'S INFORMATION WE CAN TAKE BACK. THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANK



APRIL 10, 2026

1 YOU ELLIOTT REALLY, REALLY APPRECIATE IT. NOW I'LL PASS IT
2 OVER TO -- IT'S IMPORTANT I LET THE ENVIRONMENTAL ATTORNEY
3 HERE TAKE ON 8B.

4

5 **CHAIR EDDIE AHN, MTC PC:** THANK YOU CHAIR RAMOS, I BELIEVE THAT
6 BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 8B CALENVIROSCREEN UPDATE BEFORE I
7 TURN IT OVER TO KEARNEY IT MIGHT BE HELPFUL TO PROVIDE HALF A
8 MINUTE OF GROUNDING IN THIS DISCUSSION. IN THE LAST COMMISSION
9 MEETING YOU MIGHT REMEMBER THAT WE TALKED ABOUT
10 CALENVIROSCREEN AS AN ENVIRONMENTAL MAPPING TOOL HOW IT LEADS
11 TO SHAPING OF A LEGAL POLICY DEFINITION OF CAPITAL D, CAPITAL
12 C DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. I THINK FROM A BROADER STANDPOINT
13 MY HOPE TODAY BEING AN INFORMATION ONLY ITEM IS THAT WE CAN
14 BRING TO LIGHT THIS AS AN ISSUE AND FIGURE OUT HOW AS A
15 COMMITTEE HOW WE'RE GOING TO PROGRESS THIS OVER THE NEXT FEW
16 MONTHS. I SEE THIS AS A LONG STRUGGLE I WILL SAY GENERALLY THE
17 SCIENTIFIC UNIT BEHIND THIS TOOL IS OEHHA HOPING TO FLY AROUND
18 NEATH THE RADAR I CAN SHARE WHERE I PERSONALLY ATTENDED THEY
19 REFUSED TO TAKE ORAL PUBLIC COMMENT PART OF WHAT THEY HAVE
20 DONE IS CHANNEL ESSENTIALLY TO ALL PUBLIC COMMENT THROUGH
21 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT DOCKET SO IF YOU LOOK AT THAT IT'S NOW
22 AVAILABLE ONLINE OVER THE 50 LETTERS ACTUALLY COME FROM THE
23 BAY AREA, INCLUDING COALITIONS OF 100 PLUS COMMUNITY GROUPS
24 YOU WOULD RECOGNIZE, CANAL ALLIANCE, EL CONSILIO DE SAN MATEO,
25 YUCA, SPUR, CLIMATE RESILIENCE COMMUNITIES WEST OAKLAND



APRIL 10, 2026

1 ENVIRONMENTAL INDICATORS PROJECT MARIN COMMUNITY FOUNDATION
2 GREENBELT ALLIANCE YOU SHOULD GIVE A LITTLE FLAVOR ABOUT HOW
3 THIS IS AFFECTING ALL CORNERS OF THE BAY AREA REALIZE FORMAL
4 WE HAVE HAD SEVERAL CITY GOVERNMENTS COUNTY GOVERNMENTS WEIGH
5 IN ON THE RENT DOCKET AS CITY OF SAN RAFAEL COUNTY OF SAN
6 MATEO BOARD OF SUPERVISORS CONTRA COSTA BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,
7 ALSO TAKEN FORMAL VOTE ON THIS IN OTHER WORDS I SEE THIS AS
8 NOT A CONTROVERSIAL ISSUE BUT IT SHOULD BE AN ISSUE THAT
9 UNITES US. IT'S 2023 INDICATORS SUPER COMPLICATED HAVING DONE
10 TEN YEARS OF ADVOCACY TRYING TO IMPROVE ON THIS TOOL I WILL
11 SAY COMFORTABLY LIKE IT'S A SLIPPERY SLOPE I COULD SPEND HOURS
12 TALKING ABOUT THE INDICATORS. I WANT TO RECOGNIZE MAYOR DANIEL
13 LURIE FROM OUT OF SAN FRANCISCO HAS CHAMPIONED THIS ISSUE,
14 TALK ABOUT INDIVIDUAL SAN FRANCISCO COMMUNITIES THAT DO NEED
15 TO BE RECOGNIZED I MENTIONED THIS IS THE FIRST BUCKET OF
16 DISCUSSION I ANTICIPATE IT WILL TAKE THE MAJORITY OF OUR
17 DISCUSSION, MAYBE A THING WE CAN BE USEFUL WITH AS PRIMARILY
18 ELECTED OFFICIALS APPOINTEES HERE CHANNELING TOWARD A MORE
19 POLITICAL HEAVY DISCUSSION ON WHAT THIS TOOL INFLUENCES AND
20 HOW THE DECISION SHOULD BE SHAPED IN THE FUTURE FOR POLICY
21 EFFECTS SO ONE THING I WANT TO SHOUT OUT TO THE MTC THAT WAS
22 ALREADY DELIVERED AGAIN IN WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS TO CAL EPA
23 OEHHA TALKING ABOUT HOW THIS AFFECTS OUR OWN TRANSIT HOUSING
24 PROJECTS TO THE TUNE OF \$2.26 BILLION, 72% OF THE 3.15 BILLION
25 POT OF MONEY THAT GOES TO THE BAY AREA. FINALLY I WANT TO



APRIL 10, 2026

1 CONCLUDE THAT THIS EQUITY DEFINITION IS MORE THAN JUST ABOUT X
2 DOLLARS EVEN WHAT ELLIOTT SHARED JUST NOW ABOUT VITAL SIGNS
3 BEING INFLUENTIAL FOR OTHER PROGRAMS EVEN IF IT'S NOT DEEPLY
4 INTEGRATED. CALENVIROSCREEN ESSENTIALLY HAS EMBEDDED ITSELF IN
5 THE STATE GOVERNMENT NOW FOR THE LAST TEN YEARS AND I HAVE
6 HEARD THINGS LIKE WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT POLICY THAT'S WAY
7 BEYOND ITS INTENDED SB535 USE SO WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT
8 TURNOVER KEARNEY. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SET CONTEXT.

9

10 **KEARY SMITH:** THANK YOU FOR THE INTRODUCTION GOOD MORNING
11 COMMITTEE MEMBERS MY NAME IS KEARNEY SMITH, DIRECTOR OF DATA
12 STRATEGY ANALYTICS AT MTC TODAY I'LL BE PRESENTING OVERVIEW OF
13 CALENVIROSCREEN 5.0 UPDATES AND DISCUSS IMPLICATIONS FOR
14 EQUITY PLANNING AND STATE FUNDING ACROSS THE BAY AREA.
15 CALENVIROSCREEN IS CALIFORNIA'S PRIMARY TOOL FOR IDENTIFYING
16 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES UPDATES TO THIS TOOL HAVE
17 SIGNIFICANT IMPLICATIONS FOR COMMUNITIES ARE PRIORITIZED FOR
18 STATE INVESTMENTS THIS PRESENTATION TODAY SUMMARIZES ANALYSIS
19 OF RECENTLY CONDUCTED BY MTC STAFF THAT SUPPORTS THE FORMAL
20 COMMENT LETTER THAT WE SUBMITTED TO CALIFORNIA EPA AND OFFICE
21 OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH HAZARD ASSESSMENT THE TWO AGENCIES
22 RESPONSIBLE FOR CALENVIROSCREEN METHODOLOGY AND ITS DATA. NEXT
23 SLIDE. CALENVIROSCREEN IS A STATEWIDE ENVIRONMENTAL SCREENING
24 TOO WILL THAT IDENTIFIES DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES BASED ON
25 COMBINED MEASURES OF POLLUTION EXPOSURE AND POPULATION



APRIL 10, 2026

1 VULNERABILITY. THESE DESIGNATIONS ARE USED BY THE STATE TO
2 DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY AND SCORING FOR SEVERAL MAJOR FUNDING
3 PROGRAMS INCLUDING ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, THE TRANSIT
4 INTERCITY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM, AS WELL AS THE AFFORDABLE
5 HOUSING AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES PROGRAM. STAFF'S CONCERN
6 IS THAT CALENVIROSCREEN DOES NOT FULLY REFLECT THE TYPES OF
7 DISADVANTAGED EXPERIENCED IN THE BAY AREA AND HIGH COST
8 REGIONS LIKE OURS VULNERABILITY IS OFTEN DRIVEN BY HOUSING
9 COST BURDEN, HOUSING INSTABILITY, DISPLACEMENT PRESSURES,
10 LINGUISTIC ISOLATION AS WELL AS TRANSPORTATION COST BURDEN.
11 THESE FACTORS ARE NOT ADEQUATELY CAPTURED IN THE EXISTING
12 SCORING METHODOLOGY. LET'S SEE. NEXT SLIDE. CALENVIROSCREEN IS
13 BUILT AROUND TWO CORE COMPONENTS AS I MENTIONED EARLIER,
14 POLLUTION BURDEN -- SORRY -- POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS.
15 POLLUTION BURDEN INCLUDES 15 INDICATORS MEASURING EXPOSURE TO
16 ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS SUCH AS FINE PARTICULATES AIR POLLUTION
17 TRAFFIC IMPACTS HAZARDOUS WASTE SITES AND DRINKING WATER
18 CONTAMINANTS POLLUTION CHARACTERISTICS INCLUDE NINE INDICATORS
19 THAT MEASURE ACCEPTABILITY TO HARM SUCH AS POVERTY ASTHMA
20 PREVALENCE AS WELL AS DIABETES THESE TWO COMPONENTS COMBINE
21 USING FORMULA METHODOLOGY THAT PLACES GREATER WEIGHT ON
22 POLLUTION BURDEN THAN ON POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS. AS A
23 RESULT COMMUNITIES WITH HIGH SOCIO-ECONOMIC NEED MAY PLACE
24 LOWER POLLUTION CONCENTRATION LOWER THAN MIGHT BE EXPECTED WE
25 FOND THIS APPROACH DISADVANTAGED HIGH COST REGIONS LIKE BAY



APRIL 10, 2026

1 AREA WHERE VULNERABILITY IS DRIVEN PRIMARILY BY SOCIO-ECONOMIC
2 PRESSURES RATHER THAN CONCENTRATED INDUSTRIAL POLLUTION. NEXT
3 SLIDE. SO OUTCOMES OF THIS METHODOLOGY PRODUCE SIGNIFICANT
4 REGIONAL DISPARITIES ONLY 5.4% OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY
5 CENSUS TRACTS STATEWIDE ARE LOCATED WITHIN THE BAY AREA WITHIN
6 OUR REGION WE HAVE 6.9% OF CENSUS TRACTS DESIGNATED AS
7 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES THAT'S COMPARED TO ROUGHLY 29% FOR
8 THE REST OF THE STATE. WHAT THIS EFFECTIVELY MEANS THAT TRACT
9 OUTSIDE THE BAY AREA IS MORE THAN FOUR TIMES LIKELY TO BE
10 DESIGNATED AS DISADVANTAGED THESE RESULTS DO NOT ALIGN WITH
11 THE BAY AREA SHARE OF CALIFORNIA'S POPULATION OR CONCENTRATION
12 OF LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND RAISES CONCERNS ABOUT WHETHER THE
13 SCORING SYSTEM IS ADEQUATELY IDENTIFYING NEED IN HIGH COST
14 REGIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHILE THE BAY AREA DID SHOW A MODEST
15 NET INCREASE IN DISADVANTAGED CENSUS TRACTS UNDER
16 CALENVIROSCREEN 5.0 THE TOP LINE FIGURE OBSCURES MORE
17 CONSEQUENTIAL LOSSES. COMMISSIONER AHN MENTIONED THE LOSS OF
18 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES IN KEY NEIGHBORHOODS ACROSS THE
19 REGION AND I WANTED TO NAME A FEW THESE INCLUDE EAST PALO
20 ALTO, WEST OAKLAND, RICHMOND, SAN PABLO, AS WELL AS PITTSBURG,
21 BAY POINT AND PARTS EVER ARE SAN FRANCISCO. ALL OF THESE
22 COMMUNITIES LOST DISADVANTAGED DESIGNATIONS. THE MAP YOU SEE
23 HERE IS COMPARING 5.0 VERSUS 4.0, AND THE COLORS DESIGNATE THE
24 COMMUNITIES THAT WERE EITHER ENGAGED OR LOST. THESE ARE ALL
25 CENSUS TRACT GEOGRAPHIES SO WHEN YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE SIZE OF



APRIL 10, 2026

1 THESE TRACTS IT REALLY TELLS A STORY. SO, YOU CAN CLEARLY SEE
2 THE RED AREAS ON THIS MAP THAT HAVE BEEN LOST IN THIS ROUND OF
3 WORK. IN MANY CASES, CENSUS TRACT PER CENT I'LL SCORES
4 DECLINED BY 20 POINT OR MORE IN THIS UPDATE THIS DECLINE WAS
5 NOT DUE TO IMPROVEMENTS ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS OR
6 DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGE BUT AS A RESULT OF STATEWIDE RERANKING THE
7 HEAVIER WEIGHTING OF POLLUTION BURDEN RELATIVE TO POPULATION
8 CHARACTERISTICS AND NORMALIZATION AGAINST REGIONS WITH
9 SUBSTANTIALLY HIGHER POPULATION CONCENTRATIONS THESE
10 METHODOLOGICAL CHANGES RATHER THAN REDUCTIONS IN COMMUNITY
11 NEED EXPLAIN WHY MANY BAY AREA COMMUNITIES LOST DISADVANTAGED
12 STATUS. NEXT SLIDE. MTC HAS MAINTAINED AN EQUITY PRIORITY
13 COMMUNITIES FRAMEWORK SINCE 2009 THIS FRAMEWORK IDENTIFIES
14 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES USING EIGHT DEMOGRAPHIC INDICATORS
15 INCLUDING POVERTY, HOUSING COST BURDEN, LINGUISTIC ISOLATION,
16 SENIORS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND ZERO VEHICLE HOUSEHOLDS.
17 UNDER THIS FRAMEWORK THERE ARE 441 DISADVANTAGED CENSUS TRACTS
18 IN THE BAY AREA. BY COMPARISON, THE CALENVIROSCREEN UPDATE
19 ONLY IDENTIFIES 122 IN THE BAY AREA THAT'S UP FROM 4.0. MOST
20 CALENVIROSCREEN DESIGNATED TRACTS ARE ALSO IN EQUITY PRIORITY
21 COMMUNITIES THIS MAP SHOWS THE OVERLAP BETWEEN THOSE TWO.
22 THERE ARE 441 DISADVANTAGED TRACTS IN THE BAY AREA AND BY
23 COMPARISON ONLY 122 FOR THE BAY AREA. MANY EQUITY PRIORITY
24 COMMUNITIES ARE EXCLUDED FROM THE STATE'S DEFINITION WHICH
25 HIGHLIGHTS A FUNDAMENTAL MISMATCH BETWEEN THE STATE AND



APRIL 10, 2026

1 REGIONAL UNDERSTANDINGS OF DISADVANTAGE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE
2 THREE KEY CHALLENGES THAT WE WANT TO UNDERScore. FIRST,
3 CALENVIROSCREEN DOES NOT ADEQUATELY CAPTURE THE REALITIES OF
4 HIGH COST REGIONS LIKE THE BAY AREA, WHERE HOUSING
5 INSTABILITY, RENT BURDEN, DISPLACEMENT PRESSURE AND LINGUISTIC
6 ISOLATION ARE PRIMARY DRIVERS OF VULNERABLE SECOND LOSS OF
7 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY DESIGNATIONS HAS DIRECT CONSEQUENCE
8 FOR ACCESS TO CLIMATE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS
9 COMMUNITIES THAT LOSE DESIGNATION BECOME LESS COMPETITIVE ONLY
10 NEWLY OR NEWLY INELIGIBLE FOR KEY FUNDING PROGRAMS EVEN WHEN
11 UNDERLYING NEEDS REMAIN UNCHANGED IN THE BAY AREA ALONE AS OF
12 NOVEMBER 2024 APPROXIMATELY 2.6 BILLION IN IMPLEMENTED
13 CALIFORNIA CLIMATE INVESTMENT FUNDS HAVE BEEN SUPPORTING
14 PROJECTS BENEFITTING PRIORITY POPULATIONS IN THE BAY AREA THAT
15 REPRESENTS 72% OF THE REGION'S 3.15 BILLION IN TOTAL STATE
16 CLIMATE FUNDING THIS ILLUSTRATES THE SCALE OF RESOURCES TIED
17 TO THESE DESIGNATIONS SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO PAY ATTENTION
18 TO. THIRD, POLLUTION BURDENS IN THE BAY AREA ARE GENERALLY
19 MORE GEOGRAPHICALLY SPREAD RATHER THAN CONCENTRATED SO
20 STATEWIDE NORMALIZATION CAN REDUCE LOCAL PER CENT I'LL
21 RANKINGS EVEN WHEN UNDERLYING CONDITIONS AGAIN REMAIN
22 UNCHANGED. NEXT SLIDE. SO IN SUMMARY THE BAY AREA REMAINS
23 SIGNIFICANTLY UNDERREPRESENTED IN CALENVIROSCREEN 5.0, THE
24 LOSS OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY DESIGNATION REFLECT IT IS
25 METHODOLOGICAL CHOICES RATHER THAN CHANGES IN ACTUAL COMMUNITY



APRIL 10, 2026

1 NEED. STAFF IS NOT RECOMMENDING THAT CALENVIROSCREEN BE
2 ABANDONED INSTEAD WE RECOMMEND THAT THE CALIFORNIA
3 ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY USES AUTHORITY UNDER EXISTING
4 HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE REGULATIONS TO ALLOW CENSUS TRACTS TO
5 QUALIFY AS DISADVANTAGED BASED ON EITHER POLLUTION BURDEN OR
6 POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS. SO AN EITHER OR. WHILE THIS
7 APPROACH DOES NOT FULLY ALIGN WITH THE CURRENT EQUITY PRIORITY
8 COMMUNITIES IT WOULD REFLECT THE DIVERSE DRIVERS OF
9 VULNERABILITY ACROSS THE STATE WHILE PRESERVING THE PURPOSE OF
10 THE TOOL. THIS CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION REMARKS AND I WOULD
11 BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT THE COMMITTEE HAS. THANK
12 YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** YES, PLEASE, DIRECTOR ECKLUND.

15

16 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH I WORKED FOR US EPA AND
17 WORKED WITH CALENVIROSCREEN SO HOW HAS CAL EPA RESPONDED TO
18 THE THINKING THAT PERCENTILE EITHER POLLUTION BURDEN OR
19 POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS HOW ARE THEY RESPONDING TO THAT CAL
20 EPA?

21

22 **KEARY SMITH:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION I DID ATTEND THE
23 FEBRUARY WORKSHOP THAT COMMISSIONER AHN ATTENDED AS WELL THAT
24 WAS ONE WAS THE THINGS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT WHEN WE WERE
25 GIVING FEEDBACK I THINK THEY'RE COLLECTING FEEDBACK RIGHT NOW



APRIL 10, 2026

1 THAT'S WHAT THEY'RE DOING SEEM TO UNDERSTAND THE CHALLENGE BUT
2 ARE CONSTRAINED IN THEIR APPROACH THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE HEARD
3 THEM TELL US.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** SO WOULD IT BE HELPFUL FOR US TO ACTUALLY SEND A
6 LETTER MAYBE SETTING UP A MEETING WITH CAL EPA SO THAT WE HAVE
7 SOME DISCUSSION ABOUT THIS. THIS IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT I
8 REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR BRINGING IT TO OUR ATTENTION BUT I
9 THINK WE NEED TO TAKE SOME REAL ACTIVE ACTION NOT JUST LET THE
10 PUBLIC PROCESS WORK THE WAY IT NORMALLY DOES, MY HUMBLE
11 OPINION [LAUGHTER] BUT WHAT DO YOU THINK?

12

13 **KEARY SMITH:** I APPRECIATE THAT COMMENT AND WE HAVE SUBMITTED A
14 FORMAL COMMENT LETTER TO CAL EPA ABOUT IN AND STAFF ARE
15 ACTIVELY ENGAGED IN FOLLOWING UP ON THIS TOPIC SO IT'S ON OUR
16 FRONT OF MIND AND WE'RE DEFINITELY PAYING ATTENTION TO IT.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** WHY CAN'T WE ASK CAL EPA TO MAYBE COME TO ONE OF
19 OUR MEETINGS OR FOR US TO GO UP THERE AND SIT DOWN AND TALK
20 WITH THEM AS ELECTED OFFICIALS? I THINK THAT THE COMMENT
21 PROCESS IS GREAT, BUT I THINK WE NEED TO PUT A LITTLE BIT MORE
22 PRESSURE ON THEM, BASED ON MY EXPERIENCE IN THE PAST. ANDY
23 MIGHT HAVE SOME THOUGHTS TOO?

24

25 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DAVE VAUTIN PLANNING DIRECTOR I JUST WANT TO SAY



APRIL 10, 2026

1 ABSOLUTELY WE CAN CONSIDER NEXT STEPS. THE COMMENT PERIOD JUST
2 CLOSED TEN DAYS AGO SO THE LETTER HAS JUST GONE IN BUT THOSE
3 ARE CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, WE WANT TO HEAR FEEDBACK FROM THE
4 BROADER COMMUNITY AS WELL AS HOW TO PROCEED IN THE BROADER
5 SPACE BUT ACKNOWLEDGING THE LETTER HAS BEEN SUBMITTED AND
6 WE'RE EXPLORING OUR NEXT STEPS HERE IN APRIL.

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH MY HUMBLE OPINION IS THAT WE REALLY NEED TO
9 TAKE AN ACTIVE ROLE AND ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WHO HAVE ACTUALLY
10 WORKED WITH IT IN THE PAST THIS CHANGE IS PRETTY DRAMATIC. AND
11 SO I LOOK TO YOUR LEADERSHIP TO HELP US ACTUALLY SIT DOWN WITH
12 THEM AND HELP THEM TO UNDERSTAND HOW IMPORTANT THIS IS.

13

14 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** I HAVE VERY STRONG THOUGHTS ON THIS
15 YOU BUT I WOULD LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE OTHER COMMISSIONERS WHO
16 MIGHT HAVE COMMENTS AS WELL. I SEE COMMISSIONER CORZO IN THE
17 DOCK.

18

19 **NOELIA CORZO:** THANK YOU YES I'M GRATEFUL THAT THIS CAME BEFORE
20 US AND THAT WE ARE INFORMED I THINK THIS NEW CALENVIROSCREEN
21 ASSESSMENT HAS A LOT OF IMPACTS IN SAN MATEO COUNTY
22 SPECIFICALLY SEVERAL OF OUR COMMUNITIES THAT WERE PREVIOUSLY
23 INCLUDED ARE NOW UP FOR BEING TAKEN OUT OF IT. IT'S JUST -- I
24 THINK IT'S VERY DISCONNECTED FROM THE REALITY OF WHAT THESE
25 COMMUNITIES ARE EXPERIENCING. AND WE DINNER WE HAVE COUNTY



APRIL 10, 2026

1 DATA THAT IS CLEARLY PROVES THAT CERTAIN COMMUNITIES ARE
2 DISADVANTAGED EVEN ENVIRONMENTALLY, LIKE HIGHER -- SO, I'M
3 GLAD THAT THERE IS A PLAN TO ADVOCATE AND TO MAKE SOME
4 CHANGES. I'M HAPPY AND WILLING TO HELP IN WHATEVER WAY.
5 BECAUSE I'M PRETTY CONCERNED. LIKE, THIS LITERALLY, I THINK WE
6 ALL ARE AWARE THAT THIS LITERALLY MEANS THAT CERTAIN
7 COMMUNITIES WILL HAVE LESS CHANCES OF GETTING RESOURCES FROM
8 THE STATE. AND IT HAS NEGATIVE IMPACTS. AND SOME OF THE
9 COMMUNITIES HAVE NEVER EVEN BEEN GRANTED MONEY FROM THE STATE,
10 RIGHT? AND WE'RE JUST STARTING TO SEE TRACTION, SO TO KNOW
11 THAT THIS COULD MEAN THEY AREN'T EVEN ALLOWED TO APPLY, IS
12 CONCERNING TO ME. AND, SO, HAPPY TO SUPPORT IN WHATEVER WAY,
13 AS WELL.

14

15 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** OTHER COMMENTS OR THOUGHTS? YES,
16 PLEASE COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

17

18 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** THANK YOU. AND AS THE COMMITTEE CHAIR
19 NOTED, THIS IS A CONCERN FOR MAYOR LURIE IN SAN FRANCISCO AS
20 WELL. I WAS WONDERING, AND I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS A QUESTION
21 FOR YOU OR FOR STAFF, GIVEN THE, SORT OF, INTRINSIC LOGIC OF
22 TRYING TO SERVE PARTICULAR POPULATIONS, IT DOESN'T SEEM LIKE
23 WE SHOULD BE MISALIGNED ACTUALLY ON THIS AND I'M CURIOUS WHAT
24 IS THE TRADEOFF? OR WHAT IS SO CHALLENGING ABOUT A
25 REALIGNMENT?



APRIL 10, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** KEARY DO YOU WANT TO TAKE A CRACK AT
3 THAT FIRST AND ALSO I HAVE THOUGHTS.

4

5 **KEARY SMITH:** I APPRECIATE THAT COMMISSIONER AHN BUT I FEEL
6 LIKE I WANT TO DEFER TO YOU BASED ON YOUR EXPERIENCE. I DON'T
7 WANT TO WADE INTO THIS AREA RIGHT NOW.

8

9 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** [LAUGHTER] I HAVE A LOT OF THEORIES
10 BUT 23 INDICATOR TOOL BLENDS TOGETHER 23 INDICATORS AND IT
11 RANKS THEM STATEWIDE AND IN ESSENCE WHAT HAPPENED THROUGH
12 CYCLE OR ITERATION NOW OF CALENVIROSCREEN IS REGIONS OF THE
13 STATE UNFORTUNATELY ARE PITTED AGAINST EACH OTHER IN WAYS
14 WHERE WE CONSTANTLY SCRAMBLING TO GET TO THE TOP 25%, YOU
15 KNOW, SO-CALLED COMMUNITIES, DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES
16 DEFINITION. I THINK WHAT SEGUE INTO WHAT I THINK CAN BE DONE
17 IN TERMS OF POLITICAL DECISION MAKE AROUND THIS TOOL WHICH IS
18 HISTORICALLY WHAT HAS HAPPENED AT THE NEXT LEVEL IS CAL EPA
19 SECRETARY HAPPENED UNDER THE JARED BLUMENFIELD IN PARTICULAR
20 CAN THEN CHOOSE TO USE DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF CALENVIROSCREEN
21 BUT DON'T HAVE TO USE 5.0 EVEN THEY CAN DESIGNATE ESSENTIALLY
22 STITCH TOGETHER THEIR OWN VARIATIONS WHAT THEY CONSIDER TO BE
23 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY DEFINITION SO IN OTHER WORDS DOESN'T
24 HAVE TO ADHERE TO THE TOP 25% BUT REALIZE THERE IS HUGE STATE
25 GOVERNMENT INERTIA AROUND THE TOP 25% DESIGNATION, I HAVE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 THOUGHT EVEN AS NON-PROFIT COMMUNITIES IN CENTRAL VALLEY OR LA
2 OF COURSE THERE IS A LOT OF NEED THERE BUT HAVING WORKED UP-
3 AND-DOWN THE STATE AS FAR UP NORTH COAST THE HUMBOLDT REGION
4 IN CENTRAL COAST ALSO OBSERVED HOW CALENVIROSCREEN AFFECTS
5 OTHER REGIONS OF THE STATE TOO. I THINK THIS IS SYSTEMIC
6 SCIENCE MAPPING ISSUES I DO LIKE THE SUGGESTION OF BRINGING
7 CAL EPA SECRETARY PERHAPS BEFORE MTC. THE SECOND LEVEL I WANT
8 TO MTC STAFF TO CONSIDER HAVING THE BAY AREA CAUCUS TO WEIGH
9 IN HISTORICALLY MTC AND THE AIR DISTRICT HAVE BEEN STRONG
10 ADVOCATES DON'T GO THE BAY AREA CAUCUS TO WEIGH IN ON THIS
11 TOOL IN THE PAST I THINK GIVEN HOW WE HAVE SEEN TODAY WORSENS
12 THE MAP FOR THE BAY AREA IT MAKES STONES ME THAT THE BAY AREA
13 CAUCUS SHOULD BE ASKED THIS MEANS SENATOR BECKER AND WICKS
14 WHERE THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR SO YEAH I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT
15 FOR NOW. BURT?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, PAT BURT MTC PC:** YEAH THANK YOU I WANT TO HEAR YOUR
18 THOUGHTS BEFORE WEIGHING IN AND LAST ONE THAT YOU SHARED
19 REALLY ENLISTING THE LEGISLATIVE CAUCUS I THINK IS REALLY
20 IMPORTANT BECAUSE WE CAN TRY TO GET CAL EPA TO LISTEN BUT THEY
21 DO TEND TO BE LISTEN TO THE LEADING LEGISLATORS SO I THINK
22 THAT'S IMPORTANT AND THEN QUESTION TWO IN ADDITION TO REALLY
23 ADVOCATING THE CAL EPA THAT THEY USE STATUTORY DISCRETION IN
24 WAYS THAT WE WOULD ADVOCATE I WOULD HAVE QUESTIONS WHETHER
25 THERE NEEDS TO BE LEGISLATION THAT WOULD MOVE THIS IN THE



APRIL 10, 2026

1 RIGHT DIRECTION AND MAYBE THERE ISN'T BUT BASED ON WHAT CHAIR
2 AHN JUST SAID, BUT I WOULD CERTAINLY BE INTERESTED IN THAT.
3 THEN ONE LAST CONSIDERATION, AND I GO BACK IN TIME WE WERE
4 DISCUSSING THIS IN THE PREP MEETING, IN THE MID-1990S, WE HAD
5 THE STATE COMPARE RISK PROJECT THAT HAS BEEN LARGELY
6 FORGOTTEN, BUT I CHECKED ONLINE AND IT WAS THE GENESIS FOR THE
7 CALENVIROSCREEN. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT EMERGED THERE WAS
8 AN APPRECIATION THAT EVEN ETHNIC AND CULTURAL PATTERNS THAT
9 MAY OR MAY NOT ALIGN WITH A CENSUS TRACTS AND LOCATIONS HAVE
10 AN IMPACT ON ENVIRONMENTAL AND PUBLIC HEALTH RISK. AT THAT
11 TIME, AN EXAMPLE WAS WHAT WAS A FAIRLY NEW VIETNAMESE
12 IMMIGRANT POPULATION WHO WERE FISHING IN THE BAY FOR BASS AND
13 CONSUMING EXCEPTIONALLY HIGH AMOUNTS OF MERCURY AS A RESULT OF
14 CONSUMING BASS THAT WERE CONTAMINATED FROM THE BAY. AND THAT,
15 SORT OF, EXAMPLE, AND I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY CIRCUMSTANCES
16 THERE ARE LIKE THAT, BUT IT DOESN'T GET CAPTURED IN THE WAY
17 THAT WE -- TO MY KNOWLEDGE, IN THE WAY THAT WE LOOK AT THIS
18 TODAY. SO, I JUST WANTED TO ADD THAT DIMENSION FOR
19 CONSIDERATION. THANK YOU.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** CARLSON.

22

23 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** OTHER COMMENTS?

24

25 **V. CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO ABAG AC:** FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU STAFF



APRIL 10, 2026

1 FOR THAT PRESENTATION, AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK THE CHAIR WHO
2 HAS REALLY BEEN ACTIVE THROUGHOUT THE NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA
3 TALKING TO BOTH BASE GROUPS, AS WELL -- AND NOT AS HIS
4 CAPACITY HERE, BUT CAPACITY IN HIS FRONTLINE DEFENSE FUND IN
5 GETTING TOGETHER COMMUNITIES THAT ARE IMPACTED OR AFFECTED BY
6 THIS. AND, CERTAINLY, THE LETTERS THAT HAVE BEEN GENERATED AND
7 THE VAST NUMBERS OF FOLKS WHO HAVE ACTUALLY SENT KIND OF
8 COLLECTIVE LETTERS TO THE STATE, I THINK IS IMPORTANT. I TO
9 ALSO WANT TO APPOINTMENT OUT THAT I AGREE WITH ANDY, THANKS
10 FOR PUTTING THE LETTER TOGETHER WITH YOUR STAFF, WHERE THIS
11 DUAL APPROACH THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT WHICH ACTUALLY TAKES
12 IT OUT OF THE SCIENCE PIECE BECAUSE AS YOU SAY PERHAPS ADDING
13 ONE OR TWO PARAMETERS MAY WIND UP MOVING THE NEEDLE IN ONE
14 PLACE OR ANOTHER BUT REALLY THIS ABLE TO USE BOTH SCIENTIFIC
15 ANALYTICAL METHOD THAT CALENVIROSCREEN USES THEN THIS OTHERS
16 PATH OF KIND OF SOCIO-ECONOMIC PIECE, I THINK IS IMPORTANT.
17 SO, I TOTALLY ENDORSE THAT, AND I HOPE THAT IF WE, AS A
18 COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS, AS WE, AS MTC HAVE THE ABILITY TO
19 INFLUENCE OUR LEGISLATORS BECAUSE I THINK THAT MAYBE WOULD BE
20 WHERE WE NEED TO GO ON THIS EVEN THOUGH, IT'S INTERESTING, I
21 DIDN'T REALIZE UNDER THE HEALTH AND SAFETY CODE 39711 THAT CAL
22 EPA HAS AUTHORITY TO POTENTIALLY DESIGNATE THIS TO USE THIS
23 OTHER METHOD SO THAT'S HELPFUL. BUT AGAIN PERHAPS WANT TO LOOK
24 AT LEGISLATIVELY HOW WE APPROACH BOTH OUR ASSEMBLY MEN AND
25 SENATORS IN THE STATE TO SEE IF THERE IS A WAY IN THE NINE-



APRIL 10, 2026

1 COUNTY BAY AREA TO POTENTIALLY HAVE THAT BECOME MORE EXPLICIT.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** MAYBE ALSO -- OH YES, PLEASE, GO

5 AHEAD.

6

7 **CARROLL FIFE:** THANK YOU. IS THIS ON? IS THIS THING ON? I HAVE
8 A QUESTION FOR CLARITY. BECAUSE THE PRESENTATION STATES THAT
9 THE LOSS OF THIS DAC DESIGNATION IS DRIVEN BY METHODOLOGICAL
10 CHOICES. AND BECAUSE I REPRESENT ONE OF THE CITIES THAT FELL
11 OUT -- LOST ITS DESIGNATION IN WEST OAKLAND I WANT TO
12 UNDERSTAND IF THEY WERE BASED ON MATERIAL CHANGES LIKE THE
13 FORMULA BECAUSE THERE HAVE BEEN CHANGES IN MY DISTRICT THAT
14 HAVE LED TO BETTER OUTCOMES, ENVIRONMENTAL OUTCOMES FOR
15 COMMUNITIES. SO I'M UNCLEAR ABOUT HOW THESE CHANGES ARE BUILT
16 ON THE ACTUAL IMPACTS THAT HAVE RESULTED, AS A RESULT OF USING
17 MORE HYDROGEN VEHICLES, VERSUS DIESEL VEHICLES, AND
18 DIMINISHMENT OF PARTICULATE MATTER IN WEST OAKLAND AROUND THE
19 PORT OF OAKLAND. SO, WHEN -- IT'S SAYING THAT IT'S BEEN DRIVEN
20 BY METHODOLOGICAL CHOICES, I WANT TO UNDERSTAND THE FORMULA,
21 IF IT'S BASED ON THE MATERIAL CHANGES THAT HAVE BEEN
22 BENEFITING OUR DISTRICT, ENVIRONMENTALLY, BECAUSE THEY HAVE
23 BEEN SOME REAL SHIFTS THAT ARE BENEFICIAL.

24

25 **KEARY SMITH:** THANKS FOR THAT QUESTION, AND I WILL SAY IT'S A



APRIL 10, 2026

1 COMBINATION OF THINGS. OBVIOUSLY THE POINT THAT YOU'RE RAISING
2 IS TRUE AND I HAVEN'T CAPTURED THAT SPECIFIC QUESTION THAT
3 YOU'RE ASKING DIRECTLY IN THE DATA BUT I CAN SAY THAT THE
4 UPDATE IN THE ACS INFORMATION THAT'S BEING USED THAT'S THE
5 CENSUS INFORMATION THAT CARRIES THE POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS
6 AS WELL, THOSE CHANGES ARE ALSO A FACTOR IN DRIVING THE LOSS
7 OF SOME OF THESE DACS SO IT COULD BE THE LOSS OF POP OPERATION
8 CHANGES OF MINORITIES GROUPS WITHIN THESE AREAS THOSE ARE
9 COMBINATIONS OF THINGS THAT CAN HAPPEN DISPLACEMENT PRESSURE
10 IS ALSO A CONCERN THAT CAN, SORT OF, BE SEEN IN THIS
11 INFORMATION SO THOSE ARE THE -- THAT'S HOW I WOULD ANSWER THAT
12 QUESTION IT'S SUBTLE CHANGES IN THE METHODOLOGY, DEFINITE
13 IMPROVEMENTS IN CERTAIN AREAS AROUND POLLUTION BURDEN. BUT THE
14 BIGGEST THING IS HOW IT'S SCALED IN RELATIONSHIP TO THE ENTIRE
15 STATE. SO, IT'S A PERCENTILE SCORING SYSTEM. THAT'S THE FLAW
16 THAT WE'RE POINTING OUT IN IT. SO IT'S A RANKING AND WHEN YOU
17 LOOK AT PLACES LIKE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA, SPECIFICALLY, SCAG,
18 WHICH DOMINATES CALENVIROSCREEN SCORING, I THINK THEY HAVE
19 OVER 70% OR SOMETHING. I DON'T HAVE THE NUMBER SPECIFICALLY IN
20 MY READ RIGHT NOW BUT ABOUT 70% OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES
21 IN LA. SO THAT RANKING ALSO IS A METHODOLOGICAL CHOICE THAT
22 FORCES OUT SOME OF THESE COMMUNITIES. WHY WE DON'T SEE A
23 SIGNIFICANT DROP IN SOME OF THE NUMBERS IN THESE COMMUNITIES,
24 THE RANKING IS THE PART OF THIS PROCESS THAT CREATES A
25 CHALLENGE.



APRIL 10, 2026

1

2 **CARROLL FIFE:** I'M DEFINITELY GOING TO HAVE TO SPEAK TO YOU
3 OFFLINE SO I CAN FULLY UNDERSTAND BECAUSE GENTRIFICATION
4 DISPLACEMENT IS AN OUTCOME OF SOME OF THESE SHIFTS BUT I NEED
5 TO UNDERSTAND THE RANGING HOW NORTHERN CALIFORNIA IS DIFFERENT
6 THAN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. AND I WAS WONDERING DOES THIS HAVE
7 ANY BEARING ON CDLAC AND TCAC ALLOCATIONS? IT'S SOMETHING NA'S
8 COME UP IN CONVERSATIONS PREVIOUSLY IN ABAG, I KNOW SENATOR
9 ARREGUIN WHO WAS THE CHAIR AT THE TIME TALKED ABOUT THE
10 DIFFERENT WAYS THAT OUR CITIES ARE SCORED, THAT CAN IMPACT
11 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. SO, DOES
12 THIS PLAY INTO THESE CALENVIROSCREEN SCORES PLAY INTO HOW
13 THOSE POINTS ARE SCORED AS WELL? CAN ANYONE SHARE?

14

15 **KEARY SMITH:** YES I BELIEVE THAT IS TRUE BUT I MIGHT DEFER TO
16 SOMEONE ELSE TO HELP ME OUT ON THAT. [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU
17 THERESA.

18

19 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES, ACTUALLY, THERE ARE CAP-AND-TRADE AND
20 CAP AND INVEST PROGRAMS THAT DO USE CALENVIROSCREEN AS A MAJOR
21 -- OR AS A FACTOR IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS ACROSS THE
22 STATE.

23

24 **CARROLL FIFE:** THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** AND OF COURSE CAP AND INVEST IS A
2 VERY ROBUST DISCUSSION RIGHT NOW WHICH INDICATES TIMELINESS OF
3 ALL THIS TOO. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. THIS IS DEVASTATING TO SAY THE LEAST HERE,
6 BUT YOUR EXPLANATIONS ARE VERY, VERY HELPFUL HERE. AND TIGHT,
7 OFFLINE TOO, I'M NOT SURE HOW THEY EVALUATE THESE
8 PARTICULATES, IF YOU HAVE AN AIRPORT, OR -- I MEAN, IT ALWAYS
9 SEEMS TO BE SOMEWHAT OF A QUESTION, HOPEFULLY YOU CAN EDUCATE
10 US ON THAT FRONT. AND I DO AGREE WITH THE UNITED LEGISLATIVE
11 APPROACH FROM ALL OF OUR BAY AREA COUNTIES, ONE OF OUR MEMBERS
12 IS THE CHAIR OF THE WATER COMMITTEE. AND WE ARE -- I DON'T
13 KNOW IF THIS PLAYS INTO IT I KNOW OUR CHAIR HERE HAS MENTIONED
14 NOT ADDING ON HERE, BUT WHAT ABOUT THE VULNERABILITY TO SEA
15 LEVEL RISE. THAT REALLY NEGATIVELY IMPACTS A LOT OF OUR
16 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN HERE. SO, I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT PLAYS
17 IN THESE ARE JUST GENERAL QUESTIONS. I'M SURE I CAN TALK TO
18 EDDIE OFFLINE ON THAT, BUT, WE ARE DEEPLY CONCERNED ABOUT
19 THESE LOSSES AND UNDERSTAND IT'S A BIG STATE, BUT IF WE CAN
20 HELP OUR COMMUNITIES, BECAUSE TO LOSE THESE COMMUNITIES IS --
21 IT'S VERY, VERY IMPACTFUL. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** THE LOSS OF SHORELINE COMMUNITIES I
24 STILL DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT WHETHER IT'S IN SAN MATEO,
25 CANAL AREA, SAN RAFAEL HAS NEVER FALLEN SO THE MAP THAT WAS



APRIL 10, 2026

1 SHOWN EARLIER IS JUST THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN CALENVIROSCREEN 5
2 AND 4 BUT IN ALL ITERATIONS CALENVIROSCREEN SOMEWHERE THAT
3 CANAL AREA OF SAN RAFAEL IN PARTICULAR WHICH I JUST SPENT THE
4 LAST WEEKEND IN DOES NOT GET INCLUDED IS MIND BOGGLING TO ME
5 IT HOVERS AT THAT COST LIKE 60, 65. WHAT ARE YOU ABLE TO
6 IDENTIFY AN INDICATOR MAKES A FALL OUT SOMEHOW?

7

8 **KEARY SMITH:** IT'S -- CAN TAKE A DEEP DIVE. I HAVE BEEN
9 SPENDING A LOT OF TIME IN THIS DATA LATELY TO LOOK AT, SEE IF
10 I CAN PROVIDE AN ANSWER.

11

12 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** THE OVERARCHING COMMENT,
13 RECOMMENDATION THAT MTC SUBMITTED TO CALENVIROSCREEN I WANT TO
14 UNDERSTAND, AGAIN 23 INDICATORS DIVIDED INTO TWO BUCKETS
15 POPULATIONS ENVIRONMENTS SOCIO-ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENTAL BURDEN,
16 AS A LAY PERSON WAY TO PUT IT BUT THE GIST WE ADVOCATE FOR IS
17 EXPANSION OR EITHER/OR SCENARIO HOW MUCH THAT IMPROVES THE MAP
18 AND IS THAT TO OUR LIKING I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR THE
19 COMMISSIONERS TO UNDERSTAND.

20

21 **KEARY SMITH:** I'LL TAKE A STAB AT PROVIDING SOME CONTEXT AROUND
22 THAT. WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING THROUGH THIS PROCESS AND
23 UPDATING FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY. JUST SO YOU UNDERSTAND
24 THERE IS CALENVIROSCREEN AND WE HAVE OUR EQUITY PRIORITY
25 COMMUNITIES EPC'S ARE A DRIVING FORCE FOR A NUMBER OF OUR



APRIL 10, 2026

1 PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS WE FUND IN THE BAY AREA, THAT'S ON OUR
2 EQUITY BASELINE CALENVIROSCREEN 5.0 IS SOMETHING WE ANSWER TO
3 INTERACT THROUGH THESE GRANTS PROGRAMS ET CETERA THAT'S WHY
4 WE'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO BOTH. ONE OTHER COMMENT I'LL MAKE IS
5 I DID REVIEW THE COMMENT LETTERS THAT HAVE BEEN SUBMITTED TO
6 THE STATE THERE IS SURPRISING AGREEMENT AND OVERLAP BETWEEN
7 EVERYONE'S COMMENTS THAT'S SOMETHING I CAN DEFINITELY SHARE
8 WITH FOLKS I HAVEN'T SHARED THAT WITH MY TEAM YET I LOOKED AT
9 THIS, THIS MORNING, BUT SOMETHING I WANT TO SHARE WITH THEM
10 AND WE CAN GIVE THEM CONTEXT AND HOPEFULLY SHARE THAT WITH THE
11 COMMITTEE AFTER THAT.

12

13 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** IF THERE ARE NO OTHER COMMENTS ONE
14 BASIC QUESTION I HAVE IS TIMELINE DO WE KNOW WHAT THE TIMELINE
15 IS FOR FINALIZING CALENVIROSCREEN AND THEN REACHING THE
16 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES DEFINITION MAP? YOU MIGHT NEED TO
17 GET BACK TO US ON IT.

18

19 **KEARY SMITH:** YEAH THAT'S SOMETHING THAT DEFINITELY WILL --
20 COMMISSIONER, YOU MENTIONED THE MAP AND LOOKING AT THAT
21 EITHER/OR COMPARISON, IT IS SOMETHING THAT I HAVE LOOKED AT,
22 AND STARTED TO GET INTO, YOU KNOW, INDICATING WHERE THESE
23 LOCATIONS ARE, BASED ON THAT CRITERIA AT THE CENSUS TRACT
24 LEVEL AND WE'RE ALSO PREPARING A DEEPER DIVE MAP SERIES THAT
25 LOOKS AT THIS QUESTION. SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I WILL VET



APRIL 10, 2026

1 WITH MY INTERNAL TEAM. IT'S A PRODUCT THAT WE HAVE BEEN
2 TALKING ABOUT BUT HAVEN'T GOT TONE A PLACE WHERE WE CAN SHARE
3 IT YET BUT SOMETHING I CAN BACK TO THIS GROUP IF MY EXEC TEAM
4 AGREES AND SHARE MORE DETAILED INFORMATION WITH YOU BUT THE
5 MAP IS SURPRISINGLY INTERESTING THE DRAFT ONE THAT I LOOKED
6 AT.

7

8 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS?
9 COMMISSIONER FIFE?

10

11 **CARROLL FIFE:** ONE LAST QUESTION, AND YES, I STEPPED OVER
12 METHODOLOGICAL, BUT SAY THAT FIVE TIMES FAST. BUT THE TWO
13 PROJECTS WE'RE WORKING ON LATER THIS YEAR, DOES IT ENGAGE
14 COMMUNITY MEMBERS LIKE THE ONES THAT WERE LISTED EARLIER? AND
15 WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE?

16

17 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I CAN TAKE THIS QUESTION. SO, THE EQUITY PRIORITY
18 COMMUNITIES REFRESH PROJECT WILL BE KICKING OFF, AS KEARY
19 MENTIONED MIDDLE OF THIS YEAR WE WILL BE COMING TO THIS
20 COMMITTEE WITH AN UPDATE NEXT MONTH ON THAT TOP BEING WE'RE
21 HAPPY TO GET INTO IT MORE BUT IT INVOLVES DEEP ENGAGEMENT WITH
22 COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS DIFFERENT PUBLIC AGENCIES TO
23 UNDERSTAND GAPS AND OPPORTUNITIES IN THE EQUITY SPACE THEN TO
24 THINK THROUGH HOW WE EVOLVE OUR QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
25 FRAMEWORK IT IS GOING TO BE A MULTI-YEAR EFFORT BUT I WANT TO



APRIL 10, 2026

1 UNDERScore IT'S GOING TO START WITH A LISTEN AND LEARN
2 APPROACH OF ENGAGING COMMUNITIES AND THINKING ABOUT FRAMEWORK
3 THAT WE USE HERE FOR SO MANY THINGS IN THE BAY AREA SO WE'LL
4 BE SHARING MORE NEXT MONTH OR TWO.

5

6 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** SEEING NO OTHER COMMENTS MAY WE GO TO
7 PUBLIC COMMENT.

8

9 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
10 THIS ITEM AND NO ONES IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO
11 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** WELL THANK YOU AGAIN FOR YOUR
14 ATTENTION TO THIS KNOWING THE TIMELINE OF THIS AND DRIVING
15 TOWARDS SOME OF THE THINGS THAT THE COMMISSIONERS HAVE DISCUSS
16 SAID TODAY'S IDEALLY A REQUEST TO CAL EPA'S SECRETARY HAVE MORE
17 FORMAL KIND OF DISCUSSION AROUND THIS SO WE CAN TAKE IN
18 COMMUNITY INPUT WOULD BE NICE THEN COMMISSIONERS CAN ALSO
19 WEIGH IN FROM THE RESPECTIVE JURISDICTION AS WELL THEN THE
20 SECOND BASIC IS BAY AREA CAUCUS I THINK THAT IS IMPORTANT
21 THING TO DO IN MONTHS AHEAD. ANYTHING ELSE? CHAIR RAMOS?

22

23 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WE'LL GO AHEAD AND TAKE GENERAL
24 PUBLIC COMMENT, ITEM NINE.

25



APRIL 10, 2026

1 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED UNDER
2 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
3 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

4

5 **CHAIR BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WITH GRATITUDE TO THE DATA
6 SCIENTISTS IN THE ROOM TODAY FOR ALL THE HELPFUL INFORMATION
7 THAT HELPS TO INFORMANT WORK THAT WE DO AT THE GROUND LEVEL.
8 THE NEXT MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL BE
9 HELD FRIDAY MAY 8TH, 2026 AT 940 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER
10 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE
11 WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC THIS MEETING OF THE ABAG
12 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

13

14 **CHAIR, EDDIE AHN MTC PC:** THE NEXT MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING
15 COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD FRIDAY MAY 8TH, 2026 AT 9:40 A.M. AT
16 THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO ANY
17 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.
18 THIS MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE IS ADJOURNED. THANK
19 YOU. [ADJOURNED