

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, APRIL 12<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 9:45 AM**

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS  
5 MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. THE  
6 MEETING IS WEBCAST ON MTC AND ABAG WEB SITES MEMBERS OF THE  
7 PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE  
8 RAISED HAND FEATURE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE  
9 APPROPRIATE TIME TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON  
10 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL  
11 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN ON ACTIONS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER  
12 PARTICIPATION TODAY. WILL THE CLERK CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM  
13 A QUORUM?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER AHN?

24

25 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?

3

4 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE .

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI? THANK YOU . MEMBER  
7 ECKLUND?

8

9 **PAT EKLUND:** PRESENT .

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

12

13 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE .

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

16

17 **MATT MAHAN:** HERE .

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS?

20

21 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE . [LAUGHTER]

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU . MEMBER NOACK?

24

25 **SUE NOACK:** HERE .



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

7

8 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER TIEDEMANN?

15

16 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** AGENDA ITEM TWO INCLUDES AGENDA ITEMS 2A

21 THROUGH 2D DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE

22 CONSENT CALENDAR?

23

24 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED, NOACK.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

2

3 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MOTION BY NOACK AND SECOND BY DUTRA-  
4 VERNACI. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO  
5 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE. WILL THE CLERK NOW CONDUCT  
6 ROLL CALL VOTE?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
9 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, THERE IS NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN  
10 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM THAT WISHES  
11 TO SPEAK UNDER CONSENT ITEMS. SO, CHAIR CANEPA.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THAT BRINGS US TO  
14 AGENDA ITEM --

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLL CALL VOTE. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES. YES. YES. YES. YES. YES. GO AHEAD.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER AHN?

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

12

13 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

16

17 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS? MEMBER NOACK?

20

21 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER TIEDEMANN?

11

12 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
15 PRESENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. AGENDA ITEM 3A,  
18 ASSEMBLY BILL 2485, CARILLO REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS  
19 DETERMINATION. JULIE SNYDER IS HERE TO PROVIDE THE REPORT.

20

21 **JULIE SNYDER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMITTEE MEMBERS JULIE SNYDER,  
22 MTC STAFF. I AM PRESENTING ON A.B. 2485, AUTHORED BY ASSEMBLY  
23 MEMBER JUAN CARILLO AND SPONSORED SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA  
24 ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS, OR SCAG. STAFF IS RECOMMENDING  
25 SUPPORT POSITION ON THIS MEASURE. THE BILL WOULD REQUIRE STATE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING TO PUBLISH THE DATA AND METHODOLOGY THAT  
2 IT USES DURING EACH REGION'S REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS  
3 DETERMINATION AND WOULD ALSO REQUIRE THE DEPARTMENT TO CONVENE  
4 AN ADVISORY PANEL BEFORE THE PREPARATION OF EACH RNHD TO  
5 INFORM ITS DECISIONS. SO, JUST BY WAY OF BACKGROUND UNDER  
6 CURRENT LAW, EVERY EIGHT YEARS, THE DEPARTMENT CALCULATES EACH  
7 REGION'S EXISTING AND FUTURE HOUSING NEEDS, AND THIS IS DONE  
8 IN CONSULTATION WITH THE RELEVANT COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS. NEED  
9 IS BASED ON SEVERAL STATUTORY FIGURES OR FACTORS, INCLUDING  
10 HOW MUCH ARE HOUSEHOLDS PAYING IN RENT OR MORE GAUGES WHAT  
11 DOES OVERCROWDING LOOK LIKE AND WHAT ARE VACANCY RATES IN THE  
12 REGION. FUTURE NEEDS ARE CALCULATED BASED ON PROJECTED  
13 POPULATION GROWTH COMBINING THE TWO FIGURES GENERATES THE  
14 REGION'S EIGHT YEAR HOUSING NEED. WITH A.B. 2485 SCAG IS  
15 SEEKING TO INCREASE THE TRANSPARENCY IN THIS PROCESS AS WELL  
16 AS THE USE OF OUTSIDE EXPERTS IN THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS  
17 DETERMINATION PROCESS. THEY HOPE THIS WILL AID INTERESTED  
18 PARTIES IN MONITORING BOTH THE ACCURACY OF THE DATA AND WILL  
19 HOPEFULLY PROMOTE GREATER CONFIDENCE IN THE FINAL HOUSING  
20 NEEDS FIGURES DEVELOPED BY THE DEPARTMENT. FOR THIS REASON,  
21 STAFF IS RECOMMENDING A SUPPORT POSITION, AND I WOULD BE HAPPY  
22 TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO I HAVE A  
25 MOTION AND A SECOND TO REFER A SUPPORT POSITION ON ASSEMBLY





APRIL 12, 2024

1 BILL 2485 CARILLO TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND MTC  
2 COMMISSION RESPECTFULLY FOR APPROVAL?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

5

6 **PAT EKLUND:** SECOND.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND. ARE THERE  
9 ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS THAT WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? YES?

10

11 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO STAFF. I WOULD  
12 JUST ADD, ON THIS ONE, I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY -- THIS  
13 SEEMS LIKE A BILL THAT WOULD LIKELY INVITE CHANGES AND  
14 AMENDMENTS JUST TO MAKE SURE WE GET IT RIGHT, AND I WOULD HOPE  
15 THAT WE'RE FOLLOWING THIS TO ENSURE THAT THE COMMENTS THAT WE  
16 RECEIVED THROUGH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IN REGARDS  
17 TO THE METHODOLOGIES, BUT SPECIFICALLY HERE FOR THE BAY AREA,  
18 THE DETERMINATION OF DATA, HOW IT IS UTILIZED TO ARRIVE AT  
19 WHAT IS A HIGH-RESOURCE AREA, REALLY DID IMPACT A NUMBER OF  
20 COUNTIES, WHICH WAS, YOU KNOW, THOSE COUNTIES THAT HAVE THOSE  
21 HILLSIDE REGIONS, CERTAINLY SOMETHING I HAVE RAISED, THE  
22 TOPOGRAPHY, THE GEOGRAPHY. I KNOW THAT THE COUNTY OF NAPA  
23 SUBMITTED A LETTER ON THE RHNA HOUSING THAT SPECIFICALLY  
24 TALKED ABOUT THIS METHODOLOGY, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO THIS  
25 BEING DEFINITELY A MORE TRANSPARENT PROCESS, BUT THAT CAN



APRIL 12, 2024

1 HONESTLY BE USED TO HIGHLIGHT SOME OF THE CONCERNS THAT OUR  
2 MEMBER JURISDICTIONS HAD THROUGH THE RHNA APPEALS PROCESS.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. MAYOR ARREGUIN?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** I THINK THIS IS TANGENTIALLY RELATED  
7 ARE THERE OTHER BILLS THAT HAVE BEEN INTRODUCED TO MAKE  
8 CHANGES TO THE HOUSING ELEMENT STATUTE AROUND THE RHNA  
9 PROCESS?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR F I MAY?

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** SURPRISINGLY NO. WE HAD ANTICIPATED COMING OUT OF THE  
16 PROCESS THAT HCD RAN LAST YEAR, THE STAKEHOLDER PROCESS,  
17 SEEING MORE LEGISLATION, HOWEVER, THE REPORT HAS NOT COME OUT  
18 YET FROM THAT. WE'RE TOLD IT WILL HOPEFUL APPEAR THIS MONTH  
19 AND THAT MAY GENERATE SOME ADDITIONAL BILLS.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT UPDATE. WE  
22 WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, AFTER  
23 THAT REPORT COMES OUT, TO HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT ITS  
24 FINDINGS. HAVING GONE THROUGH THE RHNA PROCESS FOR THE LAST  
25 CYCLE, I KNOW WE HAD A LOT OF IDEAS AROUND, NOT JUST



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IMPLEMENTATION, BUT ALSO POLICY. SO, LOOK FORWARD TO THAT  
2 CONVERSATION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER ECKLUND?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YOU'RE MUTED.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOTTA UNMUTE.

9

10 **PAT EKLUND:** I TOTALLY -- THANK YOU VERY MUCH -- I TOTALLY  
11 AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE SO FAR. WHAT'S IN  
12 THE BILL RIGHT NOW, DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH, IN MY OPINION. SO,  
13 I REALLY THINK THAT WE NEED HAVE SOME ACTIVE DISCUSSION. IF  
14 THIS IS GOING TO BE THE ONLY BILL, I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE  
15 SOME SPECIFIC CHANGES ADDED TO IT IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE THAT  
16 THE NEXT CYCLE IS GOING TO GENERATE, AT LEAST, A BETTER  
17 CONFIDENCE LEVEL THAT THE NUMBERS ARE ACCURATE. BECAUSE  
18 THERE'S STILL A LOT OF UNCERTAINTY ABOUT THE ACCURACY OF THE  
19 NUMBERS. SO, ANYWAY, I TOTALLY AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS THAT  
20 HAVE BEEN MADE AND URGE THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD TO START  
21 HAVING SOME DISCUSSIONS NOW ABOUT WHAT WE WANT TO SEE IN PIECE  
22 OF LEGISLATION SO THAT WE CAN BE PREPARED IN ADVANCE TO REALLY  
23 ADVOCATE FOR IT STRONGLY. THANK YOU.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THERE ARE ANY OTHER COMMITTEE  
2 MEMBER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?  
3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
5 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN  
6 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.  
7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ALL RIGHT. WILL THE CLERK NOW CONDUCT A  
9 ROLL CALL VOTE?  
10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. CHAIR CANEPA?  
12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.  
14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN.  
16

17 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.  
18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?  
20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.  
22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?  
24

25 **SPEAKER:** AYE.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

7

8 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS? NOACK?

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN?

23

24 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT BRINGS US TO 3B REGIONAL  
5 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. WITH THAT I'LL  
6 ASK MR. FREMIER?

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA AND WELCOME TO THE MAIN  
9 EVENT. SO, THIS MORNING, IT'S STILL MORNING, WE ARE PRESENTING  
10 THE COMMITTEE WITH SOME SIGNIFICANT AMENDMENTS FOR  
11 CONSIDERATION TO KEEP SB1031 ALIGNED WITH THE COMMISSION'S  
12 CORE OBJECTIVES AS SPONSOR OF THE BILL. THE GOAL IS TO AVERT  
13 THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF, IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE ON  
14 TRANSIT, AND PROVIDE A GEOGRAPHICALLY AND MODALLY BALANCED  
15 EXPENDITURE PLAN. SB1031 HAS STRONG ALIGNMENT WITH MOST OF THE  
16 AREAS WITHIN THE KEY POLICY ELEMENTS APPROVED BY THE  
17 COMMISSION IN JANUARY. BUT TODAY WE'LL FOCUS ON THE AREAS OF  
18 DIFFERENCE, AND ON A PROPOSED EXPENDITURE PLAN DETAILS THAT  
19 WERE NOT IN FRONT OF YOU AT THE JANUARY MEETING. SEVERAL  
20 THINGS THAT WERE INCLUDED ARE A TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION  
21 ASSESSMENT AND PLAN, AND THAT'S ONE AREA OF DIFFERENCE THAT'S  
22 RESULTED IN A NUMBER OF AGENCIES TAKING AN OPPOSE UNLESS  
23 AMENDED POSITION ON THE BILL. STAFF HAS BEEN DEVELOPING  
24 ALTERNATIVE CONSOLIDATION STUDY LANGUAGE THAT WAS DEVELOPED IN  
25 COLLABORATION WITH THE REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THAT



APRIL 12, 2024

1 WILL NUMBER HERE TODAY. THE COMMISSION HAS REPEATEDLY AFFIRMED  
2 ITS SUPPORT FOR STRENGTHENED NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY TO  
3 IMPROVE THE TRANSIT RIDER EXPERIENCE AND ENSURE TRANSIT  
4 REFORM. SB1031 INCLUDES SUCH PROVISIONS THAT BUILT OFF OF  
5 MTC'S EXISTING AUTHORITIES ALREADY IN STATE LAW. OPERATORS  
6 HAVE RAISED CONCERNS ABOUT THESE PROVISIONS. WE HAVE HEARD  
7 THESE CONCERNS AND ATTEMPTED TO STRIKE A BALANCE WITH PROPOSED  
8 AMENDMENTS THAT PROVIDE CLARIFYING GUARDRAILS ON THE SCOPE OF  
9 MTC'S AUTHORITY TO DELIVER A SEAMLESS BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM.  
10 ANOTHER AREA OF KEY CONSIDERATION FOR THE COMMITTEE TODAY IS  
11 HOW MUCH DETAIL SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN SB31, 1031, AS COMPARED  
12 TO FLEXIBILITY FOR MTC TO CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE PARTNERS  
13 AND STAKEHOLDERS TO FINALIZE THESE DETAILS AND TO DELIVER SOME  
14 OF THE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. THIS IS  
15 AN AREA OF INTEREST TO THE SENATORS AUTHORIZING AND CRAFTING  
16 LEGISLATION, AS WELL. SO, WITH THAT, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO  
17 REBECCA LONG TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE DETAILS OF THE PROPOSED  
18 EXPENDITURE PLAN FRAMEWORK AND SOME OF THESE OTHER AMENDMENTS.  
19  
20 **REBECCA LONG:** GREAT. THANK YOU, ANDY. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE.  
21 IF THE TEAM COULD PULL UP THE PRESENTATION? THANK YOU. AND I  
22 WANT TO JUST HIGHLIGHT THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF ADDITIONAL  
23 MATERIALS IN YOUR PACKET. HOPEFULLY, YOU KNOW, NOT TOO MUCH,  
24 BUT THERE REALLY IS A LOT OF INFORMATION IN -- THAT GOES INTO,  
25 YOU KNOW, MORE DETAIL ON THE NUMBERS, AS WELL AS WHAT ANDY



APRIL 12, 2024

1 JUST DESCRIBED ON THE PROPOSED CHANGES TO STRENGTHEN MTC'S  
2 NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY, EXPLAINING, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS  
3 CURRENT LAW, HOW IS THIS PROPOSED TO CHANGE, AND THE PROPOSED  
4 AMENDMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS ANDY JUST OUTLINED, THE  
5 COMMISSION'S CORE OBJECTIVES, IN JANUARY, IN SPONSORING THIS  
6 BILL, WERE TO SUSTAIN AND IMPROVE TRANSIT, ADDRESSING THE  
7 FISCAL CLIFF, AND ALSO IMPROVING TRANSIT ACROSS THE REGION  
8 WITH A FOCUS ON THE RIDERS. AND THAT REALLY WAS A CORE  
9 OBJECTIVE WITH STRENGTHENING MTC'S EXISTING NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
10 AUTHORITY EVEN OUTSIDE THE MEASURE, SO THE WAY THE BILL IS  
11 CRAFTED THERE IT STRENGTHENS OUR AUTHORITY TO ADVANCE THE  
12 BALLOT MEASURE. LASTLY IMPROVING MOBILITY FOR ALL USERS NOT  
13 JUST FOR TRANSIT RIDERS, AND DEVELOPING A GEOGRAPHICALLY  
14 BALANCED PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. AND SO THIS SLIDE JUST ILLUSTRATES  
15 WHAT ANDY JUST DESCRIBED IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, THE WAY IN  
16 WHICH THE BILL IS LARGELY ALIGNED WITH COMMISSION ACTION IN  
17 JANUARY. AND THEN IT ILLUSTRATES AREAS WHERE THERE IS NOT SO  
18 MUCH ALIGNMENT. SO, THE FIRST ONE I'LL HIGHLIGHT, IN TERMS OF  
19 CHANGE, IS ON THE FUNDING DISTRIBUTION. SO, IN JANUARY, WE  
20 PROPOSED SPECIFIC EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES, AND THAT'S WHAT THE  
21 BILL DOES INCLUDE. SO, THE SAFE STREETS, TRANSIT  
22 TRANSFORMATION, CONNECTIVITY. BUT WE EXPLICITLY DID NOT  
23 RECOMMEND PERCENTAGES, OR COUNTY RETURN TO SOURCE, BECAUSE WE  
24 WANT TO TAKE MORE TIME ON THAT. THE BILL WAS THEN AMENDED IN  
25 MARCH, WITH THE FIRST ROUND OF SUBSTANTIVE EVENTS AND INCLUDED





APRIL 12, 2024

1 THIS \$750 MILLION FLOOR FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WHICH  
2 INCLUDES THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SO THAT, YOU KNOW, SET IN  
3 MOTION, OBVIOUSLY, A LOT OF CONVERSATION ABOUT, OKAY, HOW ARE  
4 WE GOING TO STRUCTURE THE REST OF THIS TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS WE  
5 JUST DESCRIBED. THAT'S A SUBSTANTIVE CHANGE, AND OF COURSE,  
6 THE CONSOLIDATION STUDY WAS NOT SOMETHING THAT THE COMMISSION  
7 WANTED TO SEE. THERE WAS A LOT OF CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT IN  
8 JANUARY, AS YOU WILL RECALL, AND THE DIRECTION WAS TO FOCUS ON  
9 TRANSIT COORDINATION AND STRENGTHENING OUR NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
10 AUTHORITY. SO, OTHER THAN THAT, THE LANGUAGE IN THE BILL  
11 REALLY IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT THE COMMISSION DIRECTED. I  
12 GUESS ONE OTHER THING I WILL FLAG, WE HAVE TWO CHECKS THERE,  
13 BUT THERE IS A COMMENT ON THE VERY LAST ROW, IS ON THE REVENUE  
14 OPTIONS. THE COMMISSION DID INCLUDE A REGIONAL INCOME TAX, AND  
15 A VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED CHARGE, AS A POTENTIAL OPTIONS ON THE  
16 MENU. BUT THOSE WERE NOT INCLUDED, I THINK, GIVEN JUST A LOT  
17 OF CONCERNS ABOUT THE POLITICAL VIABILITY OF THOSE OPTIONS.  
18 SO, THAT WAS ANOTHER IMPORTANT CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WE HAVE  
19 HIGHLIGHTED THE CENTRAL GOAL OF TRANSIT FUNDING IN THIS  
20 MEASURE ADDRESSING, YOU KNOW, THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF, BUT  
21 ALSO IMPROVING TRANSIT, REALLY HELPING US ACHIEVE OUR GOALS OF  
22 HAVING MANY MORE BAY AREA RESIDENTS RELY ON TRANSIT AS A, YOU  
23 KNOW, A CHOICE OF HOW THEY GET AROUND. AND JUST WANTED TO  
24 REALLY EMPHASIZE, YOU KNOW, THAT TRANSIT IS A NETWORK IN OUR  
25 REGION, AND HOW INTERRELATED THE DIFFERENT SYSTEMS ARE, AND



APRIL 12, 2024

1 HOW MUCH FUNDING WE HAVE UNDER DEVELOPMENT, HOW MUCH FUNDING  
2 WE'RE ASKING FOR FROM THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, AND HAVE  
3 COMMITTED, YOU KNOW, THANKS TO VOTERS AND STATE FUNDING. SO,  
4 WE HAVE ABOUT \$20 BILLION PLUS IN CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT ARE  
5 UNDERWAY IN DIFFERENT STAGES, AND, AGAIN, ARE ASKING THE  
6 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT THROUGH THE FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT  
7 PROCESS, FOR APPROXIMATELY 11 BILLION IN MATCHING FUNDS. AND  
8 THE WAY THAT THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION RIGOROUSLY  
9 REFUSE THESE REQUESTS, WHICH ARE HIGHLY COMPETITIVE, THERE IS  
10 NOT ENOUGH FUNDING TO GO AROUND TO MEET ALL FULL FUNDING GRANT  
11 AGREEMENTS -- IS THEY LOOK AT COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF WHAT IS  
12 ESTIMATED AND RIDERSHIP, AND SO, THE EVALUATION OF RIDERSHIP  
13 IS CONTINGENT ON HAVING THRIVING LOCAL TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT  
14 CONNECTS TO THESE MEGA PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IT'S  
15 ENCOURAGING THAT WHAT WE HAVE BEEN HEARING FROM VOTERS,  
16 STAKEHOLDERS AND LEGISLATORS IS ALIGNED WITH THE PRINCIPLES  
17 THAT THE COMMISSION INCORPORATED IN JANUARY INTO THE BILL. SO,  
18 AGAIN, THE IMPORTANCE OF THE FISCAL CLIFF BEING ADDRESSED  
19 PEOPLE WANT TO SEE TRANSIT PROTECTED, THE IMPORTANCE OF  
20 REFORMS AND ACCOUNTABILITY, PEOPLE WANT A BETTER SYSTEM AND  
21 THEY VERY MUCH DO THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE OVERSIGHT. AND THEY  
22 WANT TO SEE SOME GUARANTEE OF FUNDING COMING BACK TO THEIR  
23 LOCAL COMMUNITY. AND THEN, OF COURSE, WE HAVE AN ARRAY OF  
24 NEEDS. AND WE WANT TO -- VOTERS WANT TO SEE INVESTMENT IN  
25 LOCAL ROAD IMPROVEMENTS, BIKE PED IMPROVEMENTS AND THE LIKE.



APRIL 12, 2024

1 NEXT SLIDE. SO, JUST TO CONFIRM, AGAIN, THAT THE EXPENDITURE  
2 CATEGORIES THAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING FOR THIS FRAMEWORK ARE  
3 CONSISTENT WITH THE COMMISSION'S DIRECTION IN JANUARY WITH ONE  
4 CHANGE AND THAT IS WE DID HAVE A CLIMATE RESILIENCE STANDALONE  
5 CATEGORY BEFORE BUT IN ALL THE STAKEHOLDER WORK WE HAVE BEEN  
6 DOING AND THINKING ABOUT THIS, WE THINK IT MAKES MORE SENSE TO  
7 MAKE THAT TYPE OF INVESTMENT ELIGIBLE WITHIN THE SAFE STREETS  
8 CONNECTIVITY CATEGORIES RATHER THAN A STANDALONE. BECAUSE THE  
9 NEEDS FOR CLIMATE RESILIENCE, THEY'RE NOT NECESSARILY UNIFORM  
10 ACROSS EVERY COUNTY AND IT JUST, I THINK, IS MORE, FROM A  
11 POLICY STANDPOINT, THAT MAKES MORE SENSE. AND WHAT THAT DOES,  
12 IS IT ALSO LIFTS UP THIS IDEA OF HAVING A FLEXIBLE PROGRAM.  
13 AND YOU WILL SEE THAT THIS FLEXIBLE CATEGORY IS REALLY  
14 NECESSARY TO ACHIEVE THE VARIOUS OBJECTIVES OF ADDRESSING THE  
15 FISCAL CLIFF AND PROVIDING RETURN TO SOURCE. SO IT'S REALLY A  
16 KEY PART OF THE WAY THE MATH WORKS. NEXT SLIDE. JUST TO  
17 EMPHASIZE WHAT THE CONNECTIVITY PROGRAM IS, THAT IS A MULTI-  
18 MODAL CAPITAL PROGRAM THAT WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO FUND COUNTY  
19 PRIORITIES THAT ARE CONSISTENT AND INCLUDED IN PLANNED BAY  
20 AREA 2050+ AND SUCCESSOR PLANS AND THEN THE FLEX FUNDING I  
21 MENTIONED IS ENVISIONED AS BEING ELIGIBLE TO FUND, WHETHER  
22 IT'S GOING TO THE REGION IN FLEX, OR TO THE COUNTIES, ANY OF  
23 THE TYPES OF PROJECTS ACROSS THE THREE MAIN PROGRAMS OF  
24 CONNECTIVITY, TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND SAFE STREETS. NEXT  
25 SLIDE. ALL RIGHT. SO NOW WE GET INTO THE MATH. AND, AGAIN,



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THERE IS OTHER MATERIALS, YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON THE WAY THAT  
2 YOU RECEIVE INFORMATION, WITH MORE DETAILS, I THINK IT'S  
3 ATTACHMENT D THAT HAS ANOTHER TABLE. BUT THIS IS THE ESSENCE  
4 OF THE PROPOSAL AND WE'RE ILLUSTRATING IT HERE WITH A \$1.5  
5 BILLION MEASURE AND A \$1 BILLION MEASURE. SO, OFF THE TOP,  
6 LOOKING AT THE TOP LINE NUMBERS, YOU HAVE A 45% DEDICATION TO  
7 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. I'M GOING TO JUMP DOWN TO THE NEXT  
8 MAIN ITEM, THEN 25% FOR SAFE STREETS, 15% CONNECTIVITY, AND  
9 15% FLEX. WITHIN THE SAFE STREETS AND THE CONNECTIVITY  
10 PROGRAMS, THOSE ARE GOING RIGHT BACK TO EVERY COUNTY IN  
11 PROPORTION TO HOW MUCH OF THE OVERALL REVENUE THEY GENERATE.  
12 SO, JUST STRAIGHT RETURN TO SOURCE. AND WE ENVISION THAT THE  
13 SAFE STREETS WOULD GO TO THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES,  
14 MOST OF WHICH HAVE ALREADY DEVELOPED THESE PROGRAMS, AND THEIR  
15 SALES TAX MEASURES, THAT WOULD FUND BOTH LOCAL ROAD REPAIRS,  
16 AS WELL AS BIKE PED IMPROVEMENTS. FOR THE CONNECTIVITY PROGRAM  
17 WE'RE ENVISIONING THIS AS A CAPITAL PROGRAM MUCH LIKE A SALES  
18 TAX MEASURE, OR A REGIONAL MEASURE TWO OR THREE WHERE THE  
19 PROJECTS INCLUDED IN THAT PROGRAM WOULD BE SELECTED IN  
20 CONSULTATION WITH THE COUNTIES, BUT THE FUNDS WOULD BE  
21 ADMINISTERED BY MTC THROUGH BONDING IN ORDER TO ACCELERATE THE  
22 CONSTRUCTION OF THE PROJECTS. AND THE BENEFIT, THE RETURN TO  
23 SOURCE WOULD BE CALCULATED OVER WHATEVER TIME FRAME THAT  
24 CAPITAL EXPENDITURE PLAN IS. THE TRANSIT PORTION IS WHERE  
25 THINGS GET A BIT MORE COMPLICATED. YOU CAN SEE WE HAVE A 40%



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TRANSIT FORMULA AND A 60% DISCRETIONARY. HOW THE TRANSIT  
2 FORMULA WORKS IS SIMILAR TO THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT  
3 ACT, TDA, LOOKING AT THE SALES TAX EXAMPLE, WHERE EACH COUNTY,  
4 AGAIN, GETS BACK IN PROPORTION TO WHAT THEY GENERATE, AND THEN  
5 THERE WOULD BE ALLOCATION WITHIN THAT FORMULA FUNDING TO FIRST  
6 MEET MINIMUMS THAT WE'RE PROPOSING BE INCORPORATED INTO THE  
7 TRANSIT PORTION. SO MINIMUMS FOR LARGE OPERATORS, WE'RE  
8 PROPOSING ALL LARGE OPERATORS SHOULD BE GETTING AT LEAST 25  
9 MILLION, THEN WE HAVE OTHER MINIMUMS FOR SMALLER OPERATORS, AS  
10 WELL. AND THEN WHAT IS CRITICAL IS THE ASSIGNMENT WITHIN THE  
11 TRANSIT FORMULA MONEY, AFTER THOSE MINIMUMS, IF THERE IS STILL  
12 A DEFICIT FOR A TRANSIT OPERATOR SERVING THAT COUNTY, SOME OF  
13 THOSE FUNDS NEED TO BE APPLIED TOWARDS THAT DEFICIT. WE'RE NOT  
14 GOING TO BE ABLE TO FULLY CLOSE THE TRANSIT OPERATING  
15 SHORTFALLS WITH THAT FORMULA FUNDING SO THAT'S WHERE THE  
16 TRANSIT DISCRETIONARY FUNDING COMES IN THAT WOULD BASICALLY BE  
17 A COMMITMENT THAT THE LEGISLATION WOULD BE MAKING THAT WE  
18 WOULD BE CLOSING THOSE SHORTFALLS FROM THE DISCRETIONARY  
19 FUNDING. IN A \$1 BILLION SCENARIO YOU CAN SEE WE DON'T GET ALL  
20 THE WAY TO, YOU KNOW, FULLY CLOSING THOSE DEFICITS, WE MAY  
21 NEED TO PULL ON SOME OF THE FLEX FUNDING TO GET THERE. THAT'S  
22 THE FRAMEWORK FOR THE TRANSIT PIECE. THEN WALKING THROUGH THE  
23 FLEX NOW, THERE'S OVERARCHING, AS YOU CAN SEE FIRST BULLET IS  
24 A 70% RETURN TO SOURCE TO EVERY COUNTY OR COUNTY BENEFIT. THE  
25 REASON WE'RE MAKING THAT DISTINCTION IS WE'RE COUNTING THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 ASSIGNMENT OF FUNDING THAT WOULD GO TOWARDS TRANSIT OPERATING  
2 SHORTFALL BACK TO THE COUNTY, IN PROPORTION TO THE RIDERSHIP  
3 ON THAT SYSTEM. AND, SO, IN SOME CASES, RIGHT, YOU'RE GOING  
4 HAVE A COUNTY THAT'S GETTING SIGNIFICANTLY MORE THAN 70%,  
5 BECAUSE THAT COUNTY HAS VERY LARGE USAGE ON AN OPERATOR, LET'S  
6 SAY BART, FOR EXAMPLE, AND SO THEIR PROPORTIONATE SHARE MIGHT  
7 BE HIGHER THAN 70% BECAUSE THEY'RE HELPING TO ADDRESS THE  
8 OPERATING SHORTFALL, WHEREAS ANOTHER COUNTY, BECAUSE THEY  
9 DON'T HAVE SIGNIFICANT USAGE OF AN OPERATOR THAT HAS A LARGE  
10 SHORTFALL, WE'RE GOING TO BE USING THAT FLEX FUNDING, THAT 15%  
11 FLEX, TO MAKE SURE THAT EVERYONE COMES UP TO AT LEAST THE 70%.  
12 AND, SO, AGAIN, THE WAY TO THINK ABOUT THE STRUCTURE IS THAT  
13 THERE ARE MINIMUMS. THERE IS A MINIMUM 70% STRUCTURE BENEFIT  
14 AND RETURN TO SOURCE THEN THE \$1.5 BILLION SCENARIO THERE  
15 WOULD BE A FAIR AMOUNT OF REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING THAT  
16 COULD FURTHER SUPPLEMENT THE BENEFITS THE COUNTY WOULD SEE.  
17 NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS SLIDE COMPARES TO ILLUSTRATIVE COUNTIES,  
18 THE ONE ON THE LEFT, YOU CAN SEE THAT THEY'RE ALL VERY SIMILAR  
19 GOING ALL THE WAY UP FROM THE BOTTOM WITH THE GREEN FOR SAFE  
20 STREETS, THE DARK GREEN CONNECTIVITY, THE LIGHT GREEN --  
21 EXCUSE ME -- THE LIGHT BLUE TRANSIT FORMULA IN PROPORTION TO  
22 WHAT'S GENERATED, AGAIN RETURN TO SOURCE, AND WHERE COUNTY X  
23 IS DIFFERENT THEY ARE A COUNTY THAT HAS SIGNIFICANT USAGE OF  
24 AN OPERATOR THAT HAS A TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALL THAT'S  
25 BRINGING, YOU KNOW, THEM TO THAT ABOVE 70%, WHEREAS COUNTY-



APRIL 12, 2024

1 WIDE, GETS TO THAT GUARANTEED 70% THROUGH THE FLEX FUNDING.  
2 AND THEN ON THE FAR RIGHT THERE IS THE AVAILABILITY UNDER A  
3 \$1.5 BILLION SCENARIO OF DISCRETIONARY FUND, WHICH, AGAIN,  
4 DON'T JUST STAY AT THE REGION, RIGHT, THOSE ARE INVESTED BACK  
5 INTO IMPROVEMENTS BENEFITTING, YOU KNOW, VARIOUS COUNTIES  
6 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE. AND THIS SLIDE REALLY  
7 ILLUSTRATES, AGAIN, JUST, OBVIOUSLY, THE BENEFIT, MORE MONEY -  
8 - MORE MONEY IS ALWAYS BETTER. BUT YOU CAN SEE THAT LOOKING, I  
9 GUESS, AT THE 1 BILLION SCENARIO, THE NON-OPTIMAL SCENARIO,  
10 YOU STILL HAVE THE SAME TRANSIT OPERATING GAP TO CLOSE, AND SO  
11 THAT DARK BLUE DOESN'T CHANGE, AND THEN WHAT YOU HAVE IS  
12 SIGNIFICANTLY LESS FUNDING AVAILABLE FOR THE OTHER PROGRAMS,  
13 THE SAFE STREETS CONNECTIVITY AND FLEXIBLE FUNDING AND YOU  
14 REALLY DON'T HAVE ANY FUND THAT'S AVAILABLE IN ORDER TO MEET  
15 THE 70% RETURN TO SOURCE FOR REGIONAL DISCRETION. WHEREAS, IN  
16 A \$1.5 BILLION SCENARIO, OBVIOUSLY ALL OF THE FORMULA PROGRAMS  
17 ARE LARGER AND YOU DO HAVE QUITE A BIT AVAILABLE TO DO OTHER  
18 REGIONAL PRIORITIES. NEXT SLIDE. AND THIS JUST PUTS SOME THERE  
19 FIGURES ON THOSE CHARTS. SO, THE TRANSIT FUNDING RANGE IN THE  
20 \$1.5 BILLION SCENARIO IS A MINIMUM OF 825 MILLION, UP TO 1.1  
21 BILLION IN TERMS OF WHAT ARE ALL THE ELIGIBLE FUNDING SOURCES  
22 FOR TRANSIT VERSUS, YOU KNOW, \$1 BILLION SCENARIO, YOU'RE AT A  
23 MINIMUM OF 600 MILLION, WHICH IS APPROXIMATELY OUR ESTIMATE OF  
24 THE OPERATING SHORTFALL UP TO 750 MILLION. AND THEN, WITH THE  
25 WHAT'S AVAILABLE FROM A DISCRETIONARY STANDPOINT, YOU KNOW,



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THIS, AGAIN, IS A VERY STARK DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE 1.5 AND  
2 THE 1 BILLION IS AROUND 92 MILLION FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION  
3 REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY. SO, THIS COULD BE SUPPORTING EXPANSION  
4 OF THE BAY PASS AND ALL OF THE OTHER THAT WE HAVE UNDERWAY,  
5 THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROGRAM, AS WELL AS THE 147 MILLION  
6 AVAILABLE THAT COULD GO TOWARDS CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS AND OTHER  
7 REGIONAL PRIORITIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA. AND VIRTUALLY NONE IN  
8 A 1 BILLION SCENARIO. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THAT, I GUESS, SUMS UP  
9 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN PORTION, AND NOW I'LL JUST PROVIDE AN  
10 OVERVIEW OF THE AMENDMENTS RELATED TO CONSOLIDATION AND THE  
11 GUARDRAILS. SO, ON THE CONSOLIDATION STUDY, AGAIN, NOT  
12 SOMETHING THAT, YOU KNOW, THE COMMISSION ASKED FOR, BUT WAS  
13 CLEARLY INCLUDED AT THE DIRECTION OF SENATE LEADERSHIP, AND SO  
14 WE DID THINK IT WAS STRATEGIC TO THINK ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW  
15 COULD WE OFFER SOMETHING THAT WASN'T COMPLETELY REMOVING THE  
16 STUDY BUT MAKES IT MUCH MORE ACCEPTABLE AND PALATABLE. SO, ONE  
17 OF THE FIRST MOST IMPORTANT PIECES WAS TO CLARIFY THAT THE  
18 INTENT IS NOT TO SIMPLY EXAMINE AND PREDETERMINE THAT ALL  
19 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA SHOULD BE MERGED. SENATOR  
20 WAHAB HAS MADE CLEAR IN DIFFERENT MEETINGS AND STATEMENTS THAT  
21 IS NOT HER INTENT, THAT THE LANGUAGE WAS ONE SIMPLE WAY TO  
22 PROPOSE CHANGING AND THEN TO ENSURE CONSOLIDATION IS DEFINED  
23 BROADLY ENOUGH TO INCLUDE SHARED SERVICES TYPES OF MODELS NOT  
24 JUST GOVERNANCE OF THE WE'RE ALSO RECOMMENDING THAT THE DATE  
25 OF THE ASSESSMENT BE PUSHED OUT. THERE IS JUST A LOT OF WORK





APRIL 12, 2024

1 HAPPENING TO ACCELERATE THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
2 PLAN. YOU KNOW, IMPLEMENT SOME OF THE ACCOUNTABILITY  
3 PROVISIONS THAT THE COMMISSION DIRECTED OPERATORS TO DO IN  
4 ORDER TO RECEIVE THAT STATE FUNDING AND REGIONAL FUNDING. SO,  
5 IT'S -- IT'S SET -- THE SENSE IS, AMONG OPERATORS THAT, THE  
6 ORIGINAL DUE DATE, WHICH IS JANUARY 1ST, 2026, IS JUST REALLY  
7 CHALLENGING TO MEET, AND WE HAVE HEARD FEEDBACK, UNOFFICIALLY,  
8 FROM THE STATE THAT THEY AGREEMENT AND THEN THERE IS AN  
9 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, RECOMMENDATION IS JUST TO HAVE THAT BE  
10 DUE A YEAR AFTER THE ASSESSMENT WHICH IS CONSISTENT WITH THE  
11 CURRENT LANGUAGE. I WILL SHARE THAT LAST NIGHT WE RECEIVED  
12 FROM LANGUAGE FROM THE BILL AUTHORS ON CONSOLIDATION. WE  
13 HAVEN'T HAD A CHANCE TO FULLY DIGEST IT AND DO A CROSSWALK  
14 WITH WHAT'S BEEN PROPOSED, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING TO  
15 YOU TODAY, AND WHAT THE AUTHOR APPEARS -- AUTHORS APPEAR TO BE  
16 PUTTING FORWARD BUT IT LOOKS LIKE IT'S COMING MUCH MORE IN  
17 THIS DIRECTION. SO THIS'S ENCOURAGING. NEXT SLIDE. THE OTHER  
18 SET OF AMENDMENTS THAT ARE IN YOUR PACKET AS A HANDOUT TODAY  
19 ARE REALLY IN RESPONSE TO CONCERNS WE HAVE HEARD FROM  
20 OPERATORS ABOUT THE PROVISIONS THAT WERE INCLUDED AT THE  
21 COMMISSION DIRECTION TO STRENGTHEN OUR NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
22 AUTHORITY AND THEY HIGHLIGHTED, YOU KNOW, KEY AREAS WHERE THEY  
23 WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY RETAINED CONTROL, INCLUDING  
24 THEIR OPERATING BUDGETS AND FARE POLICIES, THEIR OWN FUND  
25 SOURCES, COLLECTIVE BARGAINING, AND USE OF LOGOS AND BRANDS,



APRIL 12, 2024

1 AND SCHEDULE AND SERVICE PLANNING. AND, SO, WE HAVE TRIED TO  
2 STRIKE A BALANCE BETWEEN, AGAIN, THE COMMISSION'S DESIRE TO  
3 HAVE MORE NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY AND OPERATORS CONCERNS  
4 AND PUT TOGETHER, ESSENTIALLY, LANGUAGE THAT TRIES TO MAKE  
5 CLEAR, YOU KNOW, WHERE WE CAN SET RULES AND REGULATIONS, AND  
6 REALLY, THE CIRCUMSTANCES WHERE OPERATORS CAN MAKE A CASE  
7 THAT, YOU KNOW, THIS IS -- THIS IS UNACCEPTABLE, THIS IS GOING  
8 CAUSE ME TO HAVE TO CUT SERVICE AND REALLY MAKE AN APPEAL,  
9 BASICALLY, TO THE COMMISSION, OR IN SOME INSTANCES, JUST ADOPT  
10 A FINDING BY THEIR BOARD AFTER COMING TO THE COMMISSION AND  
11 EXPLAINING THE IMPACT OF THE PROPOSED POLICY. AND WE REALLY DO  
12 SEE THIS SCENARIO BEING USED, YOU KNOW, AFTER THERE WOULD BE  
13 THE NORMAL GIVE-AND-TAKE OVER ANY ADOPTED RULES. SO, I THINK,  
14 YOU KNOW, IT CAN APPEAR, MAYBE, RIGID, BUT IT'S VIEWED, AS,  
15 OKAY, SO, WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN WHEN THERE'S KIND OF A  
16 STALEMATE AROUND COMMISSION POLICY AND OPERATOR RESPONSE. I  
17 THINK THAT -- OH, HERE WE GO, A COUPLE MORE SLIDES. JUST TO  
18 GIVE SOME CONTEXT TO THE TIMING, THE SENATE TRANSPORTATION  
19 COMMITTEE IS HAVING A HEARING ON THE 23rd, WHICH IS THE DAY  
20 BEFORE THE COMMISSION MEETING. THE SENATE REVENUE AND TAXATION  
21 COMMITTEE IS NEXT HEARING THE BILL ON THE DAY OF THE  
22 COMMISSION MEETING, AND THEN IT WILL MOVE TO THE  
23 APPROPRIATIONS COMMITTEE. SO, THERE IS DEFINITELY SOME URGENCY  
24 ON THE CALENDAR FOR THE COMMISSION TO COMMUNICATE ITS  
25 DIRECTION, AND THEY THINK -- WE ARE AWARE THAT THE AUTHORS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 OBVIOUSLY HAVE BEEN HEARING FROM STAFF AND OUR LEADERSHIP  
2 ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THE -- THESE DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS, AND DO --  
3 ARE EAGER TO HEAR WHAT THE OUTCOME IS FROM TODAY. SO, WITH  
4 THAT I'LL CLOSE. ONE MORE SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. [LAUGHTER] I'M  
5 GOING TO SUMMARIZE WHAT THE ACTION IS THAT WILL PROBABLY BE  
6 HELPFUL. SO, THE REQUESTED STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS TO ENDORSE  
7 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN FRAMEWORK THAT I WALKED THROUGH THAT IS  
8 ALSO THERE AS ATTACHMENT D, AND THAT'S REALLY THE PERCENTAGES  
9 TO THE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES, THE INCLUSION OF THE 70% RETURN  
10 TO SOURCE BENEFIT TO COUNTIES COMPONENT, AND THE, YOU KNOW,  
11 MINIMUM AMOUNTS GOING TOWARDS TRANSIT AGENCIES TO ENDORSE THE  
12 CONSOLIDATION STUDY AMENDMENTS, AND ENDORSE THE NETWORK  
13 MANAGEMENT GUARDRAIL AMENDMENTS. WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE.  
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, REBECCA, AND  
17 THANK YOU AND YOUR TEAM FOR JUST THE TREMENDOUS WORK. IT'S NOT  
18 EASY BUT REALLY APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK. COLLEAGUES, DO I HAVE  
19 A MOTION AND SECOND TO REFER A SUPPORT POSITION ON SENATE BILL  
20 1031 TO THE MTC COMMISSION

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR CANEPA, I CANNOT MAKE A MOTION BUT IF I  
23 MAY I HAVE COMMENTS. WE WERE HERE WEDNESDAY AND I FEEL LIKE  
24 IT'S THE SAME DISCUSSION OVER AGAIN AND I'LL SAY THE SAME  
25 THING, WE CANNOT LET PERFECT GET IN THE WAY OF PROGRESS. THIS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IS NOT PERFECT AND STAFF HAVE DONE SOME TREMENDOUS WORK TO GET  
2 TO THIS POINT AND I LIKE THE FRAMEWORK OF HOW TO GET TO YES I  
3 HAVE BEEN HEARING FROM OPERATORS WITH RESPECT THAT WE'RE ALL  
4 IN THIS TOGETHER THIS COMMISSION HAS DONE AN EXTRAORDINARY  
5 AMOUNT OF WORK TO GET FUNDING FOR OUR REGION WHETHER CARES  
6 FUNDING TO GOING UP TO SACRAMENTO TO ADVOCATING FOR OUR MONEY  
7 TO PUTTING IN OUR MONEY IN THE KETTLE TO HELP THE TRANSIT  
8 OPERATORS AND HELP, ULTIMATELY THE RIDERS. THIS IS CENTERED  
9 ABOUT THE RIDERS IN THE REGION. I SEE THIS AS A STEP FORWARD.  
10 THERE ARE QUESTIONS WE ALL SHOULD HAVE, AND ONE OF THE  
11 QUESTIONS I HAVE FOR STAFF IS, WHEN DO WE HAVE TO COMMUNICATE  
12 SOME OF THESE AMENDMENTS TO THE LEGISLATOR. THAT'S QUESTION  
13 ONE, AND IF WE CAN GET THAT ANSWER CHAIR TO LEVEL SET?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** I THINK WE WOULD LIKE THE COMMITTEES TO BE  
16 TAKING ACTION ON A BILL THAT REFLECTS THESE AMENDMENTS, WE  
17 REALLY NEED TO BE COMMUNICATING THAT THIS AFTERNOON.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. FAIR ENOUGH. SO, LOOK, I'M  
20 GOING TO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS AND, AGAIN, I'M  
21 GOING TO ASK EVERYONE THAT WE CONTINUE TO HAVE THE MINDSET OF  
22 HOW WE CONTINUE TO GET TO A YES. ALSO, TO SACRAMENTO, I THINK  
23 THIS COMMISSION HAS DONE A LOT OF WORK TO BE A GOOD PARTNER  
24 AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT'S A 2-WAY STREET. THAT WE ARE A  
25 SPONSOR OF THIS BILL. AND IF THERE ARE ELEMENTS THAT THIS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 COMMISSION DECIDES NOT TO BE THERE, THEN THAT SPONSORSHIP CAN  
2 BE PULLED WE'RE NOT AT A POINT RIGHT NOW TO DO THAT BUT WE'RE  
3 AT A POINT TO CONTINUE TO TALK ABOUT HOW WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
4 COMMISSIONERS WHAT ARE THE ELEMENTS THAT CONCERN YOU HOW DO WE  
5 GET TO A YES BUT WE HAVE TO CONTINUE THIS FORWARD. THE  
6 ALTERNATIVE IS IF THIS DOES NOT GO FORWARD WE KNOW WHERE WE'RE  
7 GOING TO BE A YEAR FROM NOW AND WE KNOW WHAT THAT'S LIKE TO GO  
8 UP TO SACRAMENTO AND WHAT IT'S LIKE FOR EVERYONE KNOCKING ON  
9 THE DOOR. SO THIS WE DON'T WANT TO BE HANGING ON BY THE BUMPER  
10 THIS IS OUR TIME TO GET IN THE CAR WE HAVE TO STOP POSTURING  
11 AND TALKING ABOUT OUR INTEREST TO FIND A WAY TO GET TO YES.  
12 THANK YOU CHAIR FOR ALLOWING ME TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS. I  
13 ENCOURAGE THIS COMMISSION TO BE OPEN ABOUT WHAT THOSE ELEMENTS  
14 ARE, WHAT THOSE AMENDMENTS ARE TO BE ABLE TO GET SUPPORT IF WE  
15 MAY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER  
18 NOACK?

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** SO, I WOULD AGREE WITH CHAIR PEDROZA ABOUT NOT  
21 BEING PERFECT. THE GENERAL FRAMEWORK IS AN EXCELLENT START ONE  
22 OF THE THINGS EVERYBODY HAS BURDEN LOOKING FOR IS SOME  
23 GUARANTEED RETURN TO SOURCE AND I THINK THAT'S WHAT THIS  
24 FRAMEWORK DOES AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT. I THINK THERE IS  
25 STILL -- SPEND MORE TIME E-MAILING GEORGIA AND REBECCA ON



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THIS, IN THE LAST SEVERAL DAYS ON, SOME DETAILS. I THINK SOME  
2 OF THAT STILL NEEDS TO BE WORKED OUT BUT THE GENERAL  
3 FRAMEWORK, I THINK, IS AN EXCELLENT START. ONE OF THE AREAS  
4 THAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING CONCERNS ABOUT, ON THE CONSOLIDATION  
5 AND THE STUDY PIECE AND SOME OF THE AUTHORITY IS GIVEN TO MTC,  
6 IS THOSE THINGS ARE GOING TO BE PUT IN PLACE REGARDLESS OF THE  
7 SUCCESS OF A MEASURE IN 2026. AND I THINK SOME OF THE CONCERNS  
8 IS, WHAT HAPPENS IF THE MEASURE ISN'T A SUCCESS AND THOSE  
9 AUTHORITIES ARE IN PLACE. I THINK PEOPLE ARE AFRAID OF LOSING  
10 FUNDS AT THAT POINT. THEY'RE AFRAID OF LOSING TOTAL CONTROL IN  
11 RELATION TO OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND, SO, I THINK -- AND  
12 THEN, YOU KNOW, WHO -- HOW IS THE STUDY PAID FOR IF WE DON'T  
13 HAVE A MEASURE TO, SORT OF, PAY FOR THE STUDY? SOME OF THOSE  
14 THINGS, I THINK, ARE QUESTIONS THAT ARE COMING UP ON THE  
15 AUTHORITY PIECE, IN THE CONSOLIDATION STUDY PIECE, ALONG WITH  
16 THE THINGS THAT YOU POINT OUT. SO, I JUST WANT TO COMMENT  
17 THAT. I'M SURE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE LOTS OF DISCUSSIONS ON THE  
18 FRAMEWORK. THE NUMBERS ARE, LIKE, GOING AROUND IN MY HEAD. I  
19 HAVE GOT TO TAKE A STEP BACK, TAKE A WEEKEND OFF AND TAKE A  
20 LOOK AT THEM AGAIN. BUT I THINK IT'S A GOOD START AND IT DOES  
21 GET US RETURN TO SOURCE WHICH IS IMPORTANT FOR EVERY COUNTY.  
22 THANKS.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
25 VERNACI?



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THANK YOU, CHAIR. APPARENTLY WE'RE  
3 NOT DOING THE MOTION RIGHT NOW, MAKING COMMENTS BUT THAT BEING  
4 SAID -- [LAUGHTER] -- I'LL GO AHEAD AND COMMENT. I DID  
5 APPRECIATE THE PHONE CALL WITH REBECCA YESTERDAY I ASKED A  
6 WHOLE LOT OF QUESTIONS AND SHE DID GIVE ME THE ANSWERS. I  
7 THOUGHT TO GET MORE DETAIL I WENT AHEAD AND CALLED THE  
8 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, COUNTY  
9 COMMISSION, AND HAD A GOOD CONVERSATION WITH HER AS WELL. SO,  
10 I'M CERTAINLY SUPPORTIVE OF THIS. THERE IS GOING TO BE PLENTY  
11 OF OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO TWEAK THIS AS WE GO ALONG, AND EVEN  
12 KILL IT IF WE DECIDE IT'S JUST NOT ACCEPTABLE TO US, BUT AT  
13 THIS POINT, I DO AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS THAT IF WE DON'T DO  
14 ANYTHING WE'RE JUST GOING TO GET NOTHING. SO WE HAVE GOT TO  
15 KEEP ON MOVING. SO, THANK YOU. AND I'M HAPPY TO MAKE THE  
16 MOTION WHEN THE TIME COMES.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR. MY JURISDICTION HAS  
21 SPOKE UP QUITE SPECIFICALLY IN CERTAIN AREAS AND I THINK WE'RE  
22 REALLY LOOKING FOR ASSURANCES AS TO THE NEGOTIATIONS INVOLVED  
23 HERE. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK A LOT OF COUNTIES HAVE BEEN ABLE  
24 TO EXPRESS THEIR REAL ISSUES HERE, BECAUSE WE HAVE TO PASS  
25 THIS IN THE COUNTIES HERE. SO, I'M LOOKING FOR REAL ASSURANCES



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THAT THOSE ISSUES ARE ADDRESSED HERE, SPECIFICALLY TOO, AS FAR  
2 AS THIS FORMULA FUNDING GOES, IF YOU ARE BASING IT ON WHO  
3 PROVIDES THE MOST SERVICES -- AND WE ALL KNOW BART HERE -- IF  
4 THEY GET FUNDING, I NEED ASSURANCES THAT IT'S EQUALLY  
5 DISTRIBUTED TO EVERY COUNTY THEY SERVE IN. I CAN'T HEAR LATER  
6 ON THAT, OH, WELL, NO, YOUR COUNTY, OR SANTA CLARA COUNTY,  
7 YOU'RE NOT A PART OF OUR BOARD, SO YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET  
8 THAT FUNDING. SO, IF THERE IS A -- IF I'M EXPLAINING THIS  
9 CORRECTLY -- A LARGE DISTRIBUTION, IN THIS FORMULA, TO THE  
10 LARGEST OPERATORS, I BELIEVE YOU SAID 25 MILLION TO LARGE  
11 OPERATORS, THAT NEEDS TO BE AN EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF THAT  
12 FUNDING THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NOT JUST OH WE'RE ONLY GOING TO  
13 FOCUS ON OUR COUNTIES HERE. SO, THESE ARE REGIONAL SYSTEMS, IN  
14 OTHER WORDS, AND THAT KIND OF FUNDING NEEDS TO BE DISTRIBUTED,  
15 IN ADDITION TO WHATEVER OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS GET. IT'S --  
16 YOU KNOW, WE KEEP TALKING REGIONAL, REGIONAL, REGIONAL, AND WE  
17 KEEP -- THERE IS FUNDING OUT THERE, AND IT'S NOT REGIONALLY  
18 DISTRIBUTED. SO, THAT IS ONE POINT THERE, IF WE CAN, MOVING  
19 FORWARD HERE, AND THE FLEXIBILITY OF FUNDING IS REALLY  
20 IMPORTANT TO PASSING ANY, SORT OF, FUNDING IN OUR AREA HERE.  
21 SO, THE FLEXIBILITY, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S NOT --  
22 WE TALK ABOUT FLEXIBILITY, WE TALK ABOUT RETURN TO SOURCE, BUT  
23 WHEN IT COMES DOWN TO WHERE THAT FUNDING GOES, HOW THE  
24 ANALYSIS IS -- HOW ITS DISTRIBUTED. OUR JURISDICTIONS, WE NEED  
25 THE FLEXIBILITY. IF WE DON'T HAVE AN OPERATOR THAT'S BEING IN





APRIL 12, 2024

1 NEED OF THAT FUNDING THERE, WE NEED THE ROADS, THE GRADE  
2 SEPARATIONS, THAT KIND OF THING. WE NEED TO PUT THE MONEY TO  
3 USE THAT BENEFITS IN OUR AREA HERE. AND I HAVE ONE SPECIFIC  
4 QUESTION, STRENGTHENING MTC'S AUTHORITY. YOU STATED -- AND WE  
5 KNOW THERE IS LEGISLATION THAT GIVES MTC AUTHORITY -- AND THE  
6 QUESTION BECOMES, ESPECIALLY FROM OUR REGION HERE, WHY ISN'T  
7 IT BEING USED? AND WHY DIDN'T IT WORK TO DATE? SO, I MEAN,  
8 MOVING FORWARD HERE, BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT OF DOUBT, WHY  
9 WOULD WE GIVE MTC MORE AUTHORITY WHEN THEY HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE  
10 TO USE THEIR AUTHORITY TO THE POINT WHERE THE AGENCIES ARE  
11 ACCOUNTABLE. OUR TRANSFORMATION PLAN IS THREE YEARS OLD. IF  
12 YOU LOOK AT THE REGIONAL MANAGEMENT MEETING, THE NEXT ONE,  
13 THERE IS PROBABLY ONLY ONE OF ITEM THERE THAT REALLY RELATES  
14 TO ALL THE THINGS WE SET OUT IN THAT TRANSFORMATION PLAN. SO,  
15 WHY AREN'T WE ABLE TO MOVE THESE THINGS MORE QUICKLY AND IT  
16 ALL COMES BACK THEN TO ACCOUNTABILITY AND CUSTOMER SERVICE.  
17 SO, THOSE SPECIFICS, I APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMENTS OF MY  
18 COLLEAGUES HERE, WE NEED TO KIND OF BE ACCOUNTABLE TO THE  
19 COUNTY NEEDS AS WE PROGRESS HERE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BACK TO YOU,  
22 MR. PEDROZA.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'LL SAY COMMISSIONER PAPAN RAISED SOME GREAT  
25 POINTS. THE OPPORTUNITY HERE IS TO CODIFY AND REINFORCE THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 AUTHORITY. AND I'LL SAY, GINA, WE PUT THE PLAN IN PLACE, THERE  
2 WAS A LOT OF COMPETING INTEREST AT THAT POINT IN TIME THE FACT  
3 THAT WE KNOW THERE IS A NEW FUNCTION OF REVENUE THAT'S NEEDED  
4 TO TAKE ON THESE INITIATIVES I LOOK AT AS A PACKAGE  
5 OPPORTUNITY. I HEAR YOUR POINTS AND I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING  
6 WHEN WE WERE DOING A LEG VISITS WE HEARD FROM LEGISLATORS  
7 RIGHTFULLY SO. SO I SEE THIS AS THE CATALYST TO DOUBLING DOWN  
8 ON THE AUTHORITY WE NEED TO MAKE THE CUSTOMER-FACING  
9 IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE NEED FOR THE RIDERS.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ALL RIGHT. MAYOR TIEDEMANN?

12

13 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO ECHO MY THANKS TO  
14 STAFF FOR ALL THE WORK ON THIS, ESPECIALLY AROUND THE  
15 DEVELOPMENT OF THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, SORT OF, OUTLINE, THAT WE  
16 HAVE BEFORE US. I KNOW WE WEREN'T ORIGINALLY PLANNING ONGOING  
17 INTO THAT LEVEL OF DETAIL SO I APPRECIATE THE QUICK ACTION TO  
18 DO IT AND ALSO THE FRAMING OF THAT AROUND RETURNING BENEFIT TO  
19 -- AS THE RETURN TO SOURCE. I MAY BE AN EXCEPTION ON THIS  
20 BOARD, THOUGH I AM USUALLY ADVOCATING FOR LESS RETURN TO  
21 SOURCE I THINK THE REGIONAL MEASURES ARE CHANCE TO BE  
22 REDISTRIBUTIVE I THINK IS KIND OF IMPORTANT BUT HOW WE  
23 STRUCTURE THE PLAN MAKES THE DIFFERENCE IN THE DEFICIT WE ALL  
24 HAVE TO DEAL WITH AND HAS WITHIN THE CATEGORIES IT SETS OUT  
25 THAT RETURN TO SOURCE WILL BE BASED ON THE BENEFIT TO THOSE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT SERVE THEM BY THE RIDERSHIP PERCENTAGE  
2 AND SOME OF IT IS DIRECTLY ADMINISTERED BY THE COUNTIES THAT,  
3 YOU KNOW, THAT -- THAT IS RETURNING TO BUT ALSO SOME OF IT IS  
4 ADMINISTERED BY MTC FOR THE BENEFIT OF THOSE COUNTIES. SO, I  
5 APPRECIATE THAT IT IS A SLIGHTLY MORE COMPLEX VERSION OF  
6 RETURN TO SOURCE THAN I THINK WE HAVE SEEN IN SOME OF THE  
7 OTHER CONVERSATIONS AROUND, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT  
8 RETURN TO SOURCE IN BAHFA TERMS. SO, I'M HAPPY TO SUPPORT IT  
9 AS IS AND I REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WORK.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER  
12 SPERING?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OH THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, I SUPPORT THE  
15 CHAIR'S RECOMMENDATION. BUT, YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO  
16 TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT CHANGE. YOU KNOW IF WE PASS THIS  
17 TODAY, WE'RE GOING HAVE OUR WORKSHOP, AND THAT WORKSHOP CAN  
18 COME UP WITH VERY DIFFERENT RESULTS. AND, SO, HOW -- HOW DOES  
19 THAT COORDINATE WITH THE LEGISLATION? YOU KNOW, AND AT SOME  
20 POINT, I THINK WE HAVE TO HAVE A DISCUSSION, ALMOST COUNTY BY  
21 COUNTY, I WANT TO KNOW WHAT IS HAPPENING IN SANTA CLARA. I  
22 WANT TO KNOW WHAT'S HAPPENING IN SONOMA, I WANT TO KNOW -- I -  
23 - I WANT TO KNOW WHAT THOSE CHALLENGES ARE AND WHAT THE IMPACT  
24 THIS MEASURE IS GOING TO HAVE. YOU KNOW, TODAY, I THINK IT'S  
25 VERY IMPORTANT WE TAKE THAT FIRST STEP SO WE CAN START HAVING



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THOSE CONVERSATIONS. BUT THE OTHER PIECE, AND SUE JUST TOUCHED  
2 ON IT, THAT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE IN THE FOREFRONT  
3 OF THIS DISCUSSION, IF THIS MEASURE DOESN'T PASS A LOT OF THE  
4 ALLOCATIONS WE'RE MAKING TODAY, THEY'RE GOING TO CHANGE. TDA,  
5 I MEAN, YOU CAN GO RIGHT DOWN THE LIST. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK  
6 THIS COMMISSION IS GOING TO SIT BY AND WATCH, YOU KNOW, BART  
7 AND MUNI, WATCH THEM FAIL. THAT ISN'T GOING TO BE THE CASE.  
8 AND SO STAFF NEEDS TO BRING THAT INFORMATION FORWARD TOO.  
9 BECAUSE THAT'S A REALITY OF WHAT'S GOING TO BE A BYPRODUCT IF  
10 WE DON'T FIND ADDITIONAL RESOURCES. AND THOSE TOUGH DECISIONS  
11 ARE GOING TO BE BEFORE THIS COMMISSION. BUT, I THINK IT'S VERY  
12 IMPORTANT THAT WE HEAR FROM -- YOU KNOW, I HAVE SOME CONCERNS.  
13 YOU KNOW, I -- AM CERTAINLY SUPPORTIVE OF GOING FORWARD TODAY  
14 BUT I WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT THIS COMMISSION IS GOING TO HAVE  
15 TO ADDRESS A LOT OF ISSUES, A LOT OF CONCERNS THAT EACH COUNTY  
16 HAS, AND REALLY LOOK HOW WE CAN PUT SOME OF THOSE, EITHER  
17 PROTECTIONS, OR GUARDRAILS OR WHATEVER YOU WANT TO CALL IT  
18 INTO EACH COUNTY SO THEY FEEL THIS IS GOING TO BENEFIT THEM IN  
19 THE LONG-TERM. I DO NOT SEE HOW, ESPECIALLY THE BART COUNTIES,  
20 I DO NOT SEE HOW A STRUGGLING OR FAILING BART SYSTEM BENEFITS  
21 THEM IN THE LONG-TERM. IT JUST DOESN'T. SO THEY HAVE TO BE  
22 CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. AND SO, I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT  
23 WE LOOK AT IT IN, SORT OF, A HOLISTIC WAY. BUT I WOULD LIKE  
24 STAFF TO RESPOND TO POTENTIAL CHANGES OR ADDITIONS TO THIS  
25 LEGISLATION OR CONCERNS. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, I THINK MTC IS IN



APRIL 12, 2024

1 A VERY STRONG POSITION. IF WE OPPOSE THIS BILL OR WE SAY THAT  
2 WE'RE NOT GOING TO SUPPORT IT, THIS BILL ISN'T GOING ANYWHERE.  
3 AND, SO, YOU KNOW -- AND WE'RE IN A POSITION WHERE THE  
4 COMMISSION NEEDS TO START TALKING ABOUT THESE ISSUES THAT EACH  
5 COUNTY HAS AND HOW WE ADDRESS THEM, AND WHAT CAN -- WHAT CAN  
6 WE PUT IN PLACE TO MITIGATE SOME OF IT. BUT WE CAN'T BE  
7 SHORTSIGHTED THAT, YOU KNOW IF THIS DOESN'T PASS, EVERYTHING IS  
8 GOING TO BE OKAY. BECAUSE IT'S NOT. THERE IS GOING TO BE  
9 TREMENDOUS CHANGES. BUT I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO RESPOND TO THAT,  
10 YOU KNOW

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, I APPRECIATE THOSE  
13 CONCERNS AND QUESTIONS. AND JUST AS A REMINDER IN THE WORK  
14 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO SET THE STAGE AS TO WHAT KINDS OF  
15 FINANCIAL CHALLENGES WE HAVE AND HOW SOME OF THE FINANCIAL  
16 DECISIONS THAT WE HAVE MADE OVER THE YEARS, SORT OF, REPRESENT  
17 THE CURRENT ALIGNMENT OF FUNDING DECISIONS. BECAUSE YOU'RE  
18 ABSOLUTELY RIGHT, PLAN B IS TO TAKE A HARDER LOOK AT HOW WE  
19 DECIDED HOW WE'RE GOING TO DISBURSE DISCRETIONARY MONEY, AND  
20 WHEN YOU FOCUS, BART USED TO BE ABLE TO RECOVER QUITE A BIT  
21 FROM THEIR FAREBOX; THAT'S DIFFERENT TODAY. I THINK STAFF  
22 AGREES 100% WITH YOU, THAT A REGION WITHOUT A STRONG BART  
23 SYSTEM IS A CHALLENGE. I'M HOPEFUL THAT WHEN WE GET TO THE  
24 WORKSHOP, TOO, YOU MENTIONED THERE MIGHT BE SIGNIFICANT  
25 CHANGES. I THINK THE CATEGORIES ARE STRONG, AND I THINK THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 QUESTION IN TERMS OF THE LIMITATIONS ON HOW MUCH TAX PAYERS  
2 MIGHT BE WILLING TO JUMP INTO THE FRAY ARE IMPORTANT. AND AS  
3 YOU SAW FROM REBECCA'S NUMBERS, A BILLION DOLLAR ELEMENT GIVES  
4 YOU LESS FLEXIBILITY. A BILLION AND A HALF, WHICH IS MUCH MORE  
5 DIFFICULT TO PASS, PROBABLY, GIVES YOU A LOT MORE FLEXIBILITY  
6 IN WHICH YOU CAN KIND OF MAKE SURE THAT YOU'RE TAKING CARE OF  
7 A LOT OF THESE SMALLER NEEDS. BUT, WE DO BELIEVE THAT WE CAN  
8 CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE LEGISLATOR TO GET CHANGES ALL THE  
9 WAY UP TO THE END. AND AS TO CHAIR PEDROZA'S POINT, YOU CAN  
10 MAKE A DECISION TO NOT BE A SPONSOR AT ANY POINT ALONG THE  
11 WAY. SO, WE'RE USING OUR DISCUSSIONS THAT WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY  
12 WITH REGIONAL MEASURE THREE WITH THE BAHFA DISCUSSIONS TO  
13 REALLY TRY TO CONTINUE TO WORK AT GETTING CONSENSUS AND MOVING  
14 FORWARD IN A POSITIVE WAY. SO, WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT THE  
15 CHALLENGE IF FRONT OF US, BUT WE KNOW IT'S A REAL STEEP CLIMB.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. WELL, AND ANSWER THE QUESTION ABOUT  
18 THE BILL CHANGING. WE HAVE, WHAT? TWO AND A HALF YEARS FROM  
19 TODAY?

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'LL LET REBECCA ANSWER THAT. BUT I THINK  
22 THAT'S AN EXTREMELY IMPORTANT POINT. THIS IS TRYING TO GET  
23 ENABLING LEGISLATION THAT'S WHERE FLEXIBILITY HELPS. IN THE  
24 NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS, IN THE NEXT YEAR WE'RE GOING TO BE  
25 DELIVERING ON A LOT OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IMPROVEMENTS WHILE COMMISSIONER PAPAN MENTIONED THAT WE  
2 HAVEN'T TURNED THE NEED NELL THAT SPACE WE'RE GETTING NEXT  
3 GENERATION CLIPPER UP AT THE BEGINNING OF THE YEAR, MAPPING  
4 AND WAYFINDING PILOTS ARE GOING OUT INTO THE STREET SO WE ARE  
5 MAKING, I THINK, VERY GOOD AND DIRECT PROGRESS IN A LOT OF THE  
6 AREAS THAT WERE IDENTIFIED AS CRITICAL FIRST HITS. I THINK  
7 THIS CHALLENGE OF MAKING SURE OUR BIG CAPITAL PROJECTS STAY ON  
8 SCHEDULE AND WITHIN THE BUDGETS THAT ARE IDENTIFIED IS ANOTHER  
9 IMPORTANT AREA WHERE WE HAVE GOT TO PUT A LOT OF ENERGY INTO  
10 IT SO BART IS SUCCESSFUL AND THAT WE'RE ABLE TO DELIVER ON  
11 THESE IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE BELIEVE MAKE THE SYSTEM A LOT MORE  
12 SEAMLESS.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. LAST THING, MR. CHAIRMAN, IS THAT, YOU  
15 KNOW, THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY THAT MOST OF US ARE NOT GONNA SEE  
16 AGAIN IN OUR POLITICAL CAREERS. AND, SO, I FEEL THAT WE HAVE  
17 TO GET IT RIGHT THIS TIME. AND WE HAVE TO STAND TALL ON SOME  
18 OF THE CORE ISSUES THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO MTC. AND, YOU KNOW,  
19 TO COMPROMISE ON SOME OF THE THINGS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT  
20 FOR A LONG TIME. I KNOW CONSOLIDATION IN CERTAIN PLACES  
21 DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. OTHER PLACES A SMALL COUNTY LIKE SOLANO A  
22 SMALL OPERATOR, IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. WE CAN'T BACK AWAY FROM  
23 THINGS BECAUSE WE FEEL THE LEGISLATORS AREN'T COMFORTABLE WITH  
24 IT BUT THE VOTERS IF YOU DON'T HAVE CHANGE IN THIS MEASURE,  
25 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO SUPPORT IT. BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT GOING TO



APRIL 12, 2024

1 SUPPORT THE STATUS QUO. THAT'S CLEAR IN THE POLLING WE DO,  
2 PEOPLE YOU TALK TO. AND THE LAST THING I WANT TO ADD IS THAT,  
3 YOU KNOW, I WISH ADVOCATES AND VARIOUS PEOPLE WOULD STOP  
4 SAYING YOU CAN'T INCLUDE THIS, YOU CAN'T INCLUDE THAT. THERE  
5 IS SOME PLACE WHERE IS SOME HIGHWAY EXPANSION IS IMPORTANT.  
6 YOU KNOW, HIGHWAY 37 IS A CLASSIC EXAMPLE. THE MANY  
7 DISADVANTAGED PEOPLE THAT ARE USING THAT THING, LOW-INCOME.  
8 SO, YOU KNOW, I WOULD JUST ASK PEOPLE NOT TO DIG IN YET. GIVE  
9 US AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES, LET US TALK ABOUT  
10 THEM. AND ADDRESS SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT I THINK EVERY COUNTY  
11 IS GOING TO HAVE. AND, SO, IF WE DON'T ALL WORK TOGETHER, IT'S  
12 NOT GOING TO TAKE MUCH TO KILL THIS MEASURE. I MEAN, THAT'S --  
13 AND I THINK THAT'S THE REALITY. SO, WE ALL NEED TO START  
14 ADDRESSING EACH OTHER'S CONCERNS AND SEEING WHAT WE CAN DO TO,  
15 YOU KNOW, GET PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR THIS. BUT, YOU CAN'T  
16 PRECLUDE. AND I AM ALWAYS AMAZED THAT 97% OF THE PEOPLE ASKING  
17 FOR THIS ARE DRIVING A CAR. SO I SAY TO THEM YOU GET TO SIT IN  
18 MORE CONGESTION WE'RE GOING TO GIVE BART MORE MONEY AND NOT  
19 REQUIRE ANY CHANGES. WE HAVE TO MAKE THIS PLAN WORK AND WHAT  
20 STAFF BROUGHT FORWARD IS A GOOD FIRST STEP AND I'LL CERTAINLY  
21 SUPPORT THE MOTION.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. MAYOR MAHAN?

24





APRIL 12, 2024

1 **MATT MAHAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR, AND I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER  
2 SPERING'S COMMENTS HE'S RIGHT ON SAYING WE NEED TO DIVE INTO  
3 THE SITUATION IN EACH COUNTY AND UNDERSTAND THE UNIQUE  
4 CHALLENGES WE'RE FACING AND FIGURE OUT IF WE CAN ALL COME  
5 TOGETHER AND MOVE FORWARD AS A REGION. AND I'M GOING TO  
6 HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF THOSE IN A MOMENT. I DO WANT TO START BY  
7 THANKING STAFF FOR WHAT I KNOW HAS BEEN HOURS OF WORK TO PUT  
8 TOGETHER THESE UPDATES ON POTENTIAL AMENDMENTS. AND GIVE US A  
9 CLEARER EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK, WHICH, I THINK, IS HELPFUL AND  
10 MOVES THE CONVERSATION FORWARD. AND I APPRECIATE SENATOR  
11 WIENER AND SENATOR WAHAB TRYING TO COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS, AND  
12 I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT. WHILE THERE IS SOME REAL CONCERN  
13 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, STILL. YOU KNOW, ON THE CONSOLIDATION  
14 FRONT, FRANKLY, I THINK THE CONVERSATION IS HEADED IN A BETTER  
15 DIRECTION, AND I THINK WE SHOULD ABSOLUTELY EMBRACE ANALYSIS  
16 AND DISCUSSION AND UNDERSTAND PROS AND CONS, WHERE THE  
17 OPPORTUNITIES ARE, WHAT'S CHALLENGING. AND WHILE IT'S  
18 PREMATURE TO TALK ABOUT IMPLEMENTATION, I DO THINK, OVER TIME  
19 IN THE LONG RUN WE'RE GOING TO NEED A MUCH BETTER COOPERATED  
20 SYSTEM THIS'S SHORT-TERM, THAT'S NOW -- [LAUGHTER] -- AND SOME  
21 AMOUNT OF CONSOLIDATION LIKELY MAKES SENSE. 37 TRANSIT  
22 AGENCIES IN THE REGION IS NOT SOME MAGIC NUMBER. I MEAN, OVER  
23 TIME WE'RE GOING TO GROW AND CHANGE. THAT'S CONVERSATION WE  
24 SHOULD EMBRACE. AND I'M FEELING BETTER ABOUT WHERE THAT PIECE  
25 OF IT IS GOING. I DO THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 OPERATORS AND THE MAJOR STAKEHOLDERS AROUND THE REGION ARE  
2 VERY INVOLVED FROM THE BEGINNING AND THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS.  
3 AND HAVING THEIR VOICES HEARD AND BEING ABLE TO ENSURE WE  
4 FULLY UNDERSTAND THEIR CONCERNS AND INCORPORATE THEM INTO THE  
5 STUDY. THE CONCERNS, I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT QUICKLY AND I  
6 KNOW WE'LL HAVE MORE TIME, AND I THINK CONTINUING THIS  
7 CONGRESSIONAL IS IMPORTANT, BUT FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY,  
8 SPECIFICALLY, WE HAVE ALWAYS BEEN OPERATING WITH A MASSIVE  
9 FISCAL CLIFF, IF YOU WILL. WE HAVE RELATIVELY LOW RIDERSHIP  
10 AND FAREBOX RECOVERY AND HAVE REPEATEDLY ASKED OUR VOTERS TO  
11 SUPPORT SALES TAX MEASURES TO HEAVILY SUBSIDIZE TRANSIT.  
12 ROUGHLY 80% OF OUR TRANSIT RIDERS WITHIN THE COUNTY ARE LOW-  
13 INCOME AND ARE RELYING ON LOCAL TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK,  
14 PRIMARILY BY BUS AND THAT DOESN'T MEAN WE'RE NOT PART OF THE  
15 REGIONAL SYSTEM WE VALUE THE REGIONAL SYSTEM BUT WE HAVE ASKED  
16 THROUGH FOUR SEPARATE SALES TAX MEASURES THAT ARE CURRENTLY IN  
17 PLACE TO TAX THEMSELVES PRETTY SUBSTANTIALLY. SO THE CONCERN  
18 WE HAVE IS IT, IN THE COMING YEARS, WE WILL NEED TO RENEW  
19 THREE OF THOSE FOUR MEASURES. THOSE MEASURES TEND TO BE  
20 RENEWED, HISTORICALLY, 6 TO 8 YEARS BEFORE THEY EXPIRE. SAN  
21 FRANCISCO RECENTLY RENEWED 110 YEARS BEFORE IT EXPIRED BECAUSE  
22 YOU NEED TO BE ABLE TO PLAN AND BOND AGAINST THEM, AND EVEN  
23 THOUGH THEY DON'T COME IS UP UNTIL THE 2030S, WE'RE STARTING  
24 TO TALK ABOUT THEM NOW, AND THE 2040s. SO, OUR CONCERN IS  
25 REALLY AROUND VOTER FATIGUE AND CANNIBALIZATION, AND I FIND IT



APRIL 12, 2024

1 JUST TO BE VERY BLUNT AND WHETHER WE LIKE IT OR NOT IN SANTA  
2 CLARA COUNTY IT WILL ULTIMATELY BE COMMUNICATED THIS WAY BY  
3 SOME, I FIND IT VERY HARD TO GO TO OUR VOTERS AND SAY LET'S  
4 PASS THIS TAX THAT DOESN'T REALLY FULLY MEET OUR NEEDS AND,  
5 WILL, LET'S BE FRANK, WILL REPRESENT PRETTY SIGNIFICANT  
6 TRANSFER OF RESOURCES FROM SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO OTHER NEEDS  
7 AND OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION THEN COME BACK IN QUICK  
8 SUCCESSION AND RENEW THREE MORE MEASURES AFTER THAT. THAT  
9 MAKES FOR A VERY DIFFICULT DECADE AND A HALF. AND I FEEL A  
10 REAL OBLIGATION TO MAKE SURE THAT WHATEVER WE DO DOES NOT PUT  
11 AT RISK OUR ABILITY TO RENEW THOSE THREE MEASURES AND CONTINUE  
12 TO FUND THE CORE OPERATIONS OF OUR LOCAL TRANSIT SYSTEM. WE  
13 JUST CAN'T PUT THAT AT RISK. AND THAT'S WHY YOU'RE SEEING THE  
14 OPPOSITION YOU'RE SEEING FROM SANTA CLARA COUNTY, OUR VTA, OUR  
15 BIG COUNTY-WIDE TRANSIT SYSTEM, WE BASICALLY CONSOLIDATED  
16 WITHIN OUR COUNTY, AS THE LARGEST COUNTY IN THE REGION, TOOK  
17 AN OPPOSE UNLESS AMENDED STANCE. AND THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE  
18 TALKED ABOUT ARE A -- THERE IS A DESIRE TO SEE FULL RETURN TO  
19 SOURCE. I UNDERSTAND THAT, THAT MAY NOT BE WHERE WE NEED TO  
20 END UP HERE, BUT I THINK THE CURRENT RETURN TO SOURCE PROBABLY  
21 ISN'T ENOUGH TO GET THE SUPPORT OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY, JUST  
22 THROWING THAT OUT THERE. OR, AN OPTION TO HAVE MORE CONTROL  
23 OVER TIMING AND MAYBE THE ABILITY FOR OUR COUNTY TO OPT OUT  
24 GIVEN WE WILL BE GOING TO THE BALLOT FOR THREE OTHER MEASURES  
25 TO RENEW. I KNOW THAT'S NOT IDEAL AND I DON'T -- I'M NOT



APRIL 12, 2024

1 SAYING THAT'S WHERE WE NECESSARILY WANT TO END UP HERE, BUT  
2 I'M JUST -- WANT YOU TO KNOW THAT AT LEAST FOR SANTA CLARA  
3 COUNTY, WHICH OBVIOUSLY, IS A LARGE COUNTY, THERE ARE SOME  
4 REAL CONCERNS ABOUT OUR ABILITY TO RENEW OUR OTHER THREE  
5 MEASURES, AND I THINK WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT VOTER FATIGUE,  
6 TIMING AND HOW WE ENSURE THAT WE DON'T DEFUND AND HARM OUR  
7 ABILITY TO MAINTAIN THE SERVICE LEVELS WE HAVE IN COUNTY. SO  
8 VERY OPEN TO CONTINUING THE CONVERSATION, FURTHER ANALYSIS  
9 TRYING TO GET TO YES TO THE POINT BUT WE HAVE SOME VERY  
10 SIGNIFICANT CONCERNS.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

13

14 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE ALL THE  
15 COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN EXPRESSED ALREADY. I WILL JUST TELL  
16 YOU, IN SONOMA COUNTY, WE ALSO TOOK OPPOSE UNLESS AMENDED. I  
17 PERSONALLY THINK THAT WAS A LITTLE PREMATURE AND I APPRECIATE  
18 STAFF'S -- AND THAT WAS BASED ON PREVIOUS FORMULAS AND LOWER  
19 RETURN TO SOURCE NUMBERS. SO, WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO BE AT THE  
20 TABLE AS WE GO FORWARD. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE  
21 MOVE THIS AND FIND THE COLLABORATION COOPERATION WITH  
22 EVERYONE, WITHIN THE BAY AREA. I COULD TELL YOU FOR US IT'S  
23 REALLY A MATTER OF THE RETURN TO SOURCE CRITERIA. THE TAX  
24 MECHANISM, THERE IS GREAT FEAR. WE HAVE SALES TAX AS HIGH AS  
25 10.25% IN SONOMA, AND THEY'RE NOT LOOKING TO ADD TO THAT. LIKE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 SAN JOSE, ALL HAVE THESE INTERNAL TAX MEASURES THAT THEY WANT  
2 TO BE ABLE TO CARRY ON IN THE FUTURE. I WILL SAY, YOU KNOW, I  
3 SAID THIS BEFORE, THERE IS REALLY, AGAIN, ONLY ONE TRANSIT  
4 AGENCY THAT HAS A FISCAL CLIFF, AND THAT IS SMART. YOU COULD  
5 TALK ABOUT BART ALL YOU WANT, YOU COULD TALK ABOUT ALL THE  
6 OTHER ONES, BUT AS OF MARCH, WE HAVE A DATE, MARCH 2029, IF WE  
7 DON'T HAVE A NEW MEASURE APPROVED BY THEN, WE HAVE A 600 TO  
8 \$700 MILLION ASSET THAT WILL BE, BASICALLY, MOTH BALLED. AND,  
9 YOU KNOW, FOR US, I'LL BE HONEST, WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT  
10 IT FOREVER. IT WAS DENIED TO BE PUT INTO THE PLAN, INTO  
11 CLOVERDALE, YOU KNOW, PART OF HAVING SMART IN THE BAY AREA  
12 PLAN IS SOMETHING THAT OUR COUNTY HAS BEEN LOOKING AT AND  
13 WANTING, AND FEELING LEFT OUT UPON. SO, WE WANT TO BE A  
14 REGION. I THINK WE NEED TO ACT LIKE A REGION AND CARE ABOUT  
15 THAT RAIL SYSTEM, AS MUCH AS THE RAIL SYSTEM THIS'S UNDER THE  
16 GROUND OVER HERE AND THAT'S WHAT IT COMES TO, I BELIEVE, IN  
17 SONOMA COUNTY, I NEED TO BE BLUNT ABOUT THAT, WE NEED TO  
18 FIGURE OUT A SOLUTION TOGETHER FOR ALL THE PROBLEMS THAT EXIST  
19 AND SOME ARE MORE DIRE THAN OTHERS. I DO THINK THAT ON THE --  
20 AND WE DO HAVE A REGIONAL NETWORK, WE NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW  
21 FAR WE'RE PUSHING, QUITE HONESTLY -- [LAUGHTER] -- AND, YOU  
22 KNOW, I DON'T KNOW WHAT'S BEST FOR THE COUNTIES. AND I HAVEN'T  
23 SEEN NEW REAL ANALYSIS OF WHAT THE CONSOLIDATION WOULD LOOK  
24 LIKE, OR HOW HARD THAT WOULD BE, OR WHAT -- YOU KNOW, AND WE  
25 WENT THROUGH THIS WITH FIRE AGENCIES IN OUR COUNTY WHERE WE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 HAVE 48, NOW WE HAVE, I THINK, 18. IT TOOK THREE MAJOR  
2 WILDFIRES FOR THAT TO HAPPEN. HOPEFULLY THAT'S NOT GOING TO BE  
3 THE SAME KIND OF TURMOIL THAT WOULD HAVE TO HAPPEN TO  
4 CONSOLIDATE OTHER AGENCIES BUT WHEN PUSH COMES TO SHOVE YOU DO  
5 WHAT YOU HAVE TO DO TO MAKE SURE YOU CAN PROVIDE THE SERVICE  
6 GOING FORWARD. I LOOK FORWARD TO THOSE DISCUSSIONS KIND OF  
7 RAMPING UP AS WELL, AND I DO THINK TO COMMISSIONER SPERING'S  
8 COMMENTS, YOU KNOW, AT THE END OF THE DAY, IT'S WHAT THE  
9 VOTERS ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING FOR AND SOME OF THE COMMENTS,  
10 AGAIN, I TOTALLY AGREE. NO NEW INTERCHANGES. WE HAVE  
11 INTERCHANGES FROM 1950 THAT ARE TOTALLY UNSAFE AND CREATE  
12 BOTTLENECK, NOT JUST BOTTLENECK BUT CONGESTION. THOSE  
13 BOTTLENECK END UP WITH SEVERE ACCIDENTS. IT'S A SAFETY ISSUE.  
14 TO SAY NO TO THAT IS IRRESPONSIBLE AND THE PEOPLE VOTING ON  
15 THIS MEASURE ARE GOING TO BE THE PEOPLE EXPERIENCING THAT ON A  
16 DAILY BASIS NOT SO MUCH ON THE TRANSIT SIDE OF THINGS AND NOT  
17 SO MUCH THE SMALLER TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF AGENCIES TYPES OF  
18 THINGS. SO, I THINK WE NEED TO BROADEN OUR HORIZON A BIT AND  
19 LOOK, STAND UP AT THAT 30,000 FOOT LEVEL. SO, APPRECIATE THE  
20 WORK. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WE'LL GO TO COMMISSIONER AHN AND WRAP UP  
23 WITH ALFREDO.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **EDDIE AHN:** JUST TWO QUICK COMMENTS ON REGIONAL GOVERNMENT  
2 STRUCTURES. I APPRECIATE THE GUARDRAIL LANGUAGE; THAT'S  
3 HELPFUL TO MAKE SURE THERE IS NO UNFUNDED MANDATES, WHICH OF  
4 COURSE FROM A POLICY STANDPOINT, IT'S THE MOST TOXIC TERM YOU  
5 CAN IMAGINE. BUT ALSO, SECONDLY, THE ONE THING TO PUT ON YOUR  
6 FLAG IS MAKING SURE WITH THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
7 GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE ITSELF, THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE  
8 WELL REPRESENTED. I KNOW MTC STAFF HAS BEEN VERY GOOD AT  
9 WORKING PAT THAT AND LOOKING FORWARD TO DEVELOPING. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. SUPERVISOR MOULTON PETERS?

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SO, I WANT TO  
14 THANK STAFF FOR ALL THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE. THERE IS AN  
15 INCREDIBLE NUMBER OF VARIABLES AND WE HAVE BEEN HEARING ABOUT  
16 IT ON THE DAIS HERE OF ISSUES THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED. I'M  
17 GOING TO SUPPORT THE CHAIR WITH AGREEING WITH THE FRAMEWORK  
18 AND UNDERSTANDING THAT IT'S EVOLVING OVER TIME. WE'RE GETTING  
19 MORE CLARITY. I THINK THE RETURN TO SOURCE WAS A VERY GOOD  
20 CLARIFICATION, AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MOREOVER TIME WITH HOW  
21 FUNDING WILL BE RETURNED TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES WITHIN EACH  
22 COUNTY. BUT GOING FORWARD, AS COMMISSIONER SPERING WAS TALKING  
23 ABOUT, WE'RE TRYING TO INCENTIVIZE CHANGE OVER TIME ON  
24 MULTIPLE FRONTS. AND, SO, I'LL BE INTERESTED WHEN IT'S PART OF  
25 THE CONSOLIDATION STUDY OR PRECURSOR TO IT, AS TO WHAT SORTS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 OF PERFORMANCE STANDARDS OR OTHER MEASURES ARE GOING TO  
2 INCENTIVIZE AND REWARD THE KIND OF CHANGES WE WANT TO SEE AND  
3 DISINCENTIVIZE AND NOT REWARD, OR MAYBE I'LL SAY PENALIZE  
4 DECISIONS MADE BY OPERATORS THAT ARE NOT MOVING TOWARDS FISCAL  
5 HEALTH OVER TIME. THINGS ARE CHANGING. WE JUST TALKED WITHIN  
6 THE HIGHWAY DISCUSSION THAT THERE IS A LOT WE DON'T KNOW ABOUT  
7 WHAT'S HAPPENED WITH COMMUTES AFTER COVID. SAME IS TRUE WITH  
8 TRANSIT. AND, SO, TO ME, WE NEED TO BUILD IN, AS YOU STARTED  
9 TO DO, CHANGE OVER TIME. WHAT DO WE EXPECT, WHERE ARE OUR  
10 CHECK POINTS AT THREE YEARS OR FIVE YEARS ABOUT HOW IS IT ALL  
11 GOING, HOW ARE WE EVALUATING HOW IT'S ALL GOING AND WHERE DOES  
12 OUR FUNDING GO IN THE FUTURE. SO THOSE ARE OF THE THINGS I  
13 WOULD LIKE TO SEE BUT I'M HAPPY WITH THE WAY THINGS ARE MOVING  
14 AND THE DIRECTION NOW. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. CHAIR PEDROZA?

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONERS FOR  
19 KEEPING AN OPEN MIND ON HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET TO YES. THESE  
20 ARE GREAT POINTS. AND YOU MENTIONED WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT HOW  
21 DO WE GET BACK INTO OUR JURISDICTIONS AND LOCAL ISSUES. THAT'S  
22 APPROPRIATE TO THINK ABOUT AS WE'RE ALSO THINKING ABOUT THE  
23 REGIONAL ASPECT. AND I THINK THE FOCUS HERE IS HOW DO YOU GROW  
24 THE PIE. AND I KNOW THESE ARE HARD DECISIONS. BUT, JUST  
25 ENVISION A SCENARIO WHERE THERE IS NO NEW MONEY AND THEN WE





APRIL 12, 2024

1 HAVE TO MAKE DECISIONS OF THE DISCRETIONARY MONEY THAT WE  
2 HAVE. THOSE ARE HARDER DECISIONS WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE.  
3 AND COMMISSIONER SPERING ILLUSTRATED THAT. I APPRECIATE  
4 EVERYONE'S ATTITUDE AROUND WE UNDERSTAND THERE ARE ISSUES,  
5 IT'S NOT PERFECT. BUT WE HAVE TO CONTINUE TO ADVOCATE FOR  
6 THOSE ISSUES THAT WE HEARD TODAY I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION  
7 AROUND THIS IMPORTANT ISSUE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK THE  
10 COMMISSION AND STAFF FOR REALLY BEING COLLABORATIVE, REALLY  
11 WORKING WITH THE STATE LEGISLATORS. BUT AT THE SAME TIME,  
12 REALLY, THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS, REALLY INCORPORATING THE  
13 BOARD'S THOUGHTS AND THE IDEAS. AND I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS  
14 THAT WAS ARE REALLY ADDRESSED, AND IT'S BEEN MENTIONED BY MY  
15 COLLEAGUES, IS REALLY THIS ISSUE OF THE RETURN TO SOURCE. AND  
16 I HAVE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT SOME OF THE NUMBERS AND  
17 THE FIGURES. I DO THINK, TO THE REGION, IT'S EXTREMELY,  
18 EXTREMELY BENEFICIAL. THERE HAVE BEEN ISSUES OUTLINED,  
19 OBVIOUSLY WE TALKED ABOUT CONSOLIDATION. BUT, REALLY, HOW  
20 STAFF ADDRESSED IT IN TERMS OF COORDINATION, AND, REALLY, JUST  
21 WALKING THROUGH THESE COMPLEX ISSUES, AND THERE IS MORE WORK  
22 THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE. I'M IN FULL SUPPORT, OBVIOUSLY, OF  
23 WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY. LET ME JUST SAY THIS. WHEN WE TALK  
24 ABOUT STRENGTHENING THE MTC NETWORK MANAGER FUNCTION, MAKE NO  
25 MISTAKE ABOUT IT, THIS NEEDS TO BE DONE. WE HAVE 27 OPERATORS,



APRIL 12, 2024

1 ADDITIONALLY, MY GOAL IS TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S ABOUT THE END  
2 USER, MOVING THE END USER THROUGH WHAT IS RIGHT NOW, A VERY  
3 COMPLEX SYSTEM. AND WE TALK ABOUT FARE INTEGRATION, WE TALK  
4 ABOUT SCHEDULING. THESE ARE CRITICAL, CRITICAL ISSUES. AND,  
5 SO, I'M REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO CONTINUING THIS WORK. I WANT  
6 TO UPLIFT OUR STAFF, ALIX, REBECCA, ANDY, AND GEORGIA AND  
7 REALLY MAKING SURE THAT WE CONTINUE THESE CONVERSATIONS. AND  
8 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, I THINK IS IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, AND I  
9 DO SUPPORT THIS. THROUGH THE CLERK, I THINK ON THIS PARTICULAR  
10 ITEM, BEFORE WE MOVE FORWARD, WE HAVE TO INVOKE, CORRECT?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORRECT. WE WOULD LIKE TO.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CORRECT. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO ASK YOU,  
15 ALFREDO PEDROZA, IF YOU COULD MAKE THE MOTION?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HE CAN'T MAKE THE MOTION.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OH YOU'RE NOT -- [LAUGHTER] -- OKAY. IS  
20 THERE A MEMBER THAT WANTS TO MAKE THE -- DUTRA-VERNACI,  
21 PLEASE?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THAT'S VERY SIMPLE TO DO. I'LL GO  
2 AHEAD AND MOVE THIS ITEM [LAUGHTER]

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY GREAT. YOU'RE GOING TO MOVE THIS  
5 ITEM. AND THROUGH COUNCIL, WHAT IS THE APPROPRIATE LANGUAGE ON  
6 INVOKING? BECAUSE I KNOW THERE'S -- I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE,  
7 THROUGH STAFF? IF REBECCA, YOU CAN HELP US WITH THIS,  
8 NAVIGATE?

9

10 **REBECCA LONG:** HI. ABSOLUTELY, CHAIR CANEPA, THE LANGUAGE IS TO  
11 INVOKE THE COMMISSION'S URGENCY PROCEDURES SO WE CAN  
12 COMMUNICATE THE POSITION IN ADVANCE OF THE COMMISSION MEETING  
13 AND WE WOULD BE BRINGING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION MEETING, OF  
14 COURSE.

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** OKAY IF THAT'S THE CASE MY MOTION WOULD  
17 BE TO MOVE THIS ITEM AND INVOKE THE EMERGENCY PROVISIONS TO  
18 KEEP THIS ON A TIMELY MANNER.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** IS THERE A SECOND MR. SPERING?

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** FIRST AND SECOND. AND WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC  
25 COMMENT RIGHT NOW.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, STARTING IN ZOOM, IF YOU WISH TO  
3 SPEAK, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND NOW. IT WILL BE CUT OFF IN 30  
4 SECONDS. SO, OKAY. SO, WE HAVE 14 COMMENTERS. YOU WILL HAVE  
5 ONE MINUTE EACH. FIRST UP IS MARJORIE ALBERTO FOLLOWED BY  
6 MARILYN GINNIS. MARJORIE, WE CAN'T HEAR YOU.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS MARJORIE, I'M A VOLUNTEER WITH 350 -  
9 - CAN YOU HEAR ME?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. VOLUNTEER WITH 350 BAY AREA AND GENESIS BOTH  
14 MEMBER ORGANIZATIONS OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
15 COALITION. 350 HAS BEEN WORKING HARD IN FAVOR OF ZERO-  
16 EMISSIONS TRANSPORTATION AND REDUCING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED  
17 AND GENESIS WORKS HARD ON EQUITY AND TRANSPORTATION, INCLUDING  
18 ON WORK FOR THE PAST 15 YEARS. I AM GETTING FREE YOUTH BUS  
19 PASSES THROUGH SUPPORT ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY AT TOMORROW'S  
20 CLIMATE LEADERS. THANKS VERY MUCH TO MTC STAFF FOR WORK IN  
21 SUPPORT OF A TRANSIT FUNDING MEASURE AND I ASK WHEN  
22 CONSIDERING AMENDMENTS TO THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION PLEASE  
23 REMEMBER THAT A WELL FUNDED WELL SUPPORTED TRANSPORTATION  
24 SYSTEM, TRANSIT PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM BENEFITS ALL HIGHWAY AND  
25 STREET USERS REGARDLESS OF MODE, MORE TRANSIT MEANS LESS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 CONGESTED STREETS LESS VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. STUDY SHOWS  
2 THAT THERE ARE FEWER COLLISIONS AND DEATHS WITH WELL SUPPORTED  
3 TRANSIT.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANKS.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS MARILYN FOLLOWED BY  
10 GEORGE SPEIS. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HI CAN YOU HEAR ME.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YEP.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS MARY LIM, WITH MY ORGANIZATION  
17 GENESIS, VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. GENESIS HAS  
18 PRESENCE IN ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA AND BEGINNING TO ORGANIZE IN  
19 SONOMA COUNTIES. WE HAVE SPENT 15 YEARS EDUCATING ON BASE ON  
20 TECHNICAL ASPECTS OF PUBLIC TRANSIT POLICIES SO WE CAN SUPPORT  
21 A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT WILL ALIGN WITH OUR VALUES. I HOPE  
22 THAT YOU AS COMMISSIONERS CAN APPRECIATE THAT MTC IS A BODY  
23 AND PUBLIC TRANSIT, AS AN ISSUE CAN BE VERY TECHNICAL AND  
24 WONKY, SO THAT THE REGULAR VOTERS IS OFTEN UNABLE TO DIGEST  
25 VERY IMPORTANT ISSUES THAT YOU'RE RESPONSIBLE FOR, WE'RE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 SUPPORTIVE OF THE AMENDMENTS THAT FOCUS ON PROGRESSIVE FUNDING  
2 MEASURES. OUR MEMBERS THROUGHOUT THE REGION ARE STRESSED  
3 ECONOMICALLY, AND IT WOULD BE HARD FOR US AS A RACIAL AND  
4 ECONOMIC EQUITY ORGANIZATION TO SUPPORT OUR REGRESSIVE TAX.  
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND FOR THE RECORD, JORDAN  
8 GRIMES WILL BE OUR LAST SPEAKER. NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE GEORGE  
9 SPEIS FOLLOWED BY IAN GRIFFITHS. GEORGE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
10 YOURSELF.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO GEORGE SPEIS COFOUNDER OF TRAFFIC VIOLENCE  
13 RAPID RESPONSE IN OAKLAND CALIFORNIA. AND WE STRONGLY WANT TO  
14 URGE THE MTC TO SUPPORT THIS BILL, BOTH BECAUSE IT PROVIDES  
15 REALLY IMPORTANT SAFE STREETS FUNDING TO PROTECT OUR  
16 PEDESTRIAN AND OTHER VULNERABLE ROAD USERS, AND ALSO TO  
17 SUPPORT TRANSIT AT A TIME OF GREAT TRANSFORMATION IN THE BAY  
18 AREA. IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THAT KIND OF SUCCESS, WE NEED TO BE  
19 RIDER FIRST. RATHER THAN BEING PAROCHIAL INTEREST FIRST, WE  
20 HAVE TO THINK ABOUT OUR WORKERS, OUR RIDERS, OUR REGIONAL  
21 OCCUPANTS, RIGHT, RESIDENTS AND THEY HAVE TO BE ABLE TO MOVE  
22 AROUND THE REGION. WE NEED FUNDING AND COORDINATION IN ORDER  
23 TO MOVE PEOPLE FROM DRIVING TO TRANSIT. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. IAN GRIFFITHS, AND THEN AMANDA  
2 CRUISE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** IAN GRIFFITHS SENIOR POLICY DIRECTOR WITH SEAMLESS  
5 BAY AREA, I WANT TO THANK THE STAFF WORK, IN PARTICULAR, FOR,  
6 YOU KNOW, REALLY CHALLENGING WORK IN TERMS OF BALANCING THE  
7 NEED FOR INVOLVING COMPETING INTEREST AROUND THIS FUNDING  
8 MEASURE THE NEED FOR RETURN TO SOURCE SQUARING THAT WITH NEED  
9 TO ADDRESS OPERATION SHORTFALLS AND THE IMPORTANCE OF NETWORK  
10 MANAGEMENT THIS IS A GREAT START. AND I'M REALLY PLEASED TO  
11 HEAR THE COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS TODAY IN REALLY SHOWING  
12 YOUR LEADERSHIP ON UNDERSTANDING THAT THIS IS A STARTING  
13 PLACE. WE NEED TO GET TO YES. THERE REALLY IS NO PLAN B. I  
14 HEARD REFERENCE TO PLAN B. FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE RIDER  
15 THERE IS NO PLAN B NOTHING WE CAN CONSIDER. I WOULD LIKE TO  
16 REMOVE ANY CONSIDERATION OF KILLING THIS BILL. I THINK THAT  
17 WOULD BE HIGHLY IRRESPONSIBLE IT WOULDN'T BE PUTTING RIDERS  
18 FIRST. LET'S CONTINUE FORWARD HERE AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
19 LEADERSHIP.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, IAN. NEXT UP AMANDA CRUISE  
22 FOLLOWED BY PUBLIC ADVOCATES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AMANDA CRUZ, DIRECTOR OF GOVERNMENT AND  
25 COMMUNITY RELATIONS WITH BART. OUR ORGANIZATION HAS A SUPPORT



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IF MANNED POSITION ON THIS BILL. WE APPRECIATE THE WORK OF MTC  
2 STAFF TO WORK COLLABORATIVELY WITH BART AND OTHER TRANSIT  
3 OPERATORS ON THE SET OF AMENDMENTS REVIEWED TODAY TO ADDRESS  
4 THE CONSOLIDATION REQUIREMENTS, AS WELL AS PROPOSED GUARDRAILS  
5 TO MTC'S ENHANCED NETWORK MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY. WE'RE  
6 ENCOURAGED TO SEE THAT CLOSING OPERATOR'S FISCAL CLIFFS  
7 CONTINUE TO BE A HIGH PRIORITY WITHIN THE PROPOSED EXPENDITURE  
8 FRAMEWORK AND RETURN TO SOURCE PROVISIONS. WE WANT TO THANK  
9 MTC STAFF FOR ONGOING WORK WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AND URGE THE  
10 COMMISSION TO ENDORSE THE AMENDMENTS AND THE EXPENDITURE PLAN  
11 FRAMEWORK BEING PROPOSED TODAY.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES.  
14 FOLLOWED BY ROBERT ALAN.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON THIS IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES PART OF  
17 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION WE SUBMITTED A  
18 SUPPORT IF AMENDED LETTER IN YOUR PACKET WE WANT TO MOVE THE  
19 BILL FORWARD ENSURING FUNDING IN TODAY'S PROPOSAL IS DEPOSIT  
20 ON THE 150 MILLION ASSUMPTION, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE  
21 UNDERSTANDING WHAT IS MEANS FOR RIDERSHIP 150 MILLION MTC IS  
22 RECEIVING FROM BOOKING REVENUE OF MONEY NOT SPENT ON FARES,  
23 WHICH WILL DOWN AS RIDERSHIP GOES UP AND THAT FARE REVENUE  
24 MONEY GOES TO AGENCIES. THE 150 MILLION MIGHT BE DOUBLE  
25 COUNTING FARE REVENUES AGENCY ASSUMING IN BUDGET PROJECTIONS,





APRIL 12, 2024

1 AND THE GOAL IN THE MATTER, THE CORPORATE TAX IS MORE  
2 EFFICIENT THAN TDM MANDATE. THE GOAL TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP FOR  
3 REGIONAL UNLIMITED PASS, WHICH WOULDN'T RAISE REVENUE --  
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] -- WE DON'T ACCEPT IT TO BE A MANDATE IN THE  
5 PLACE OF A PROGRESSIVE REVENUE -- CORPORATE TAX. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP ROBERT ALAN FOLLOWED BY  
8 EMILY LOPER.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. BOB ALAN WITH URBAN HABITAT, VOICES FOR  
11 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENT MADE WE  
12 PROVIDED A LETTER THAT SUMMARIZES OUR COMMITMENT, WE KNOW  
13 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO GET THERE WITH VOTERS AND IT'S GOING TO  
14 HAVE TO PASS BUT IT'S CLEAR TO EVERYONE I WOULD SAY I  
15 APPRECIATE COMMENTS MADE BY COMMISSIONER SPERING ONE THING  
16 WE'RE TRYING TO FOCUS ON IS ALL OF YOU HAVE MENTIONED  
17 STRUCTURAL DEFICITS WHICH AT THE LOCAL LEVEL RELATE FROM AN  
18 IMBALANCE IN OPERATING MONEY BUT THAT IMBALANCE STARTS WITH  
19 HIGHWAYS VERSUS TRANSIT AND IF WE DON'T START REBALANCING THE  
20 MODES IN A WAY THAT ADDRESSES THE STRUCTURAL PROBLEMS WE HAVE  
21 WITH THIS MEASURE AROUND FOCUSING AND OPERATING WE'RE GOING  
22 TO CONTINUE TO HAVE THIS DISCUSSION SO WE NEED BALANCE BUT WE  
23 NEED TO ADDRESS THE STRUCTURAL OPERATING DEFICITS THIS IS A  
24 STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION THANK YOU.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. EMILY LOPER FOLLOWED BY VINAY  
2 PIMPLE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I'M EMILY LOPER BAY  
5 COUNCIL WE APPRECIATE THE EFFORT BY MTC TO CREATE A BALANCED  
6 EXPENDITURE DISTRIBUTION FRAMEWORK HERE IN RESPONSE TO MANY  
7 MULTIMODAL NEEDS WE'RE INSPIRED BY THIS PROGRESS WE HAVE TAKEN  
8 OPPOSE UNLESS AMENDED ON THE POSITION AS IT CURRENTLY STANDS  
9 DUE TO CONCERNS OF LACK OF BALANCE IN THE FRAMEWORK AND  
10 CONCERNS ABOUT FINANCIAL VIABILITY OF THE TDM REQUIREMENT OF  
11 THE EMPLOYERS WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO WORK WITH  
12 YOU AND THE AUTHORS AS THIS PROCESS MOVES FORWARD. THANK YOU  
13 VERY MUCH.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE FOLLOWED BY  
16 ANTHONY. VINAY I'M GOING TO SAY 15 SECONDS WHEN YOU HAVE 15  
17 SECONDS LIST. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY  
20 COUNCIL. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK THEY  
21 HAVE DONE. I STRONGLY AGREE WITH CHAIR PEDROZA WHEN HE SAYS  
22 OUR PRIORITY RIGHT NOW IS TO COME UP WITH A FRAMEWORK THAT  
23 WOULD TAKE US TO A YES. LET'S STAY FOCUSED ON THAT. LET'S ALSO  
24 BE FLEXIBLE BECAUSE A LOT OF COMMISSIONERS, SPERING AND PAPAN  
25 HAVE RAISED REALLY IMPORTANT CONCERNS THAT NEED TO BE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 ACCOMMODATED. LET'S BE FLEXIBLE. LET'S NOT DIG IN AND LET'S  
2 GET TO A YES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU VINAY. ANTHONY FOLLOWED BY THEA  
5 SHELBY.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ANTHONY I AM A TRANSIT RIDER AND  
8 MEMBER OF TRANSBAY STATE COALITION I WANT TO THANK MTC AND  
9 STAFF FOR DOING EVERYTHING THEY HAVE SO FAR TO TRY TO GET TO  
10 YES. THE BIG VOTE IS YES, AS MANY COMMISSIONERS NOTED IT WOULD  
11 BE DISASTROUS IF WE DIDN'T PASS THIS MEASURE AND LOST FUNDING  
12 FOR ALL OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. WE NEED TO FIND SOMETHING  
13 THAT IS COMPELLING FOR PEOPLE TO VOTE FOR I SEE IN THE \$1  
14 BILLION REVENUE SCENARIO WITH 80% RETURN TO SOURCE THERE WOULD  
15 STILL BE A \$40 MILLION OPERATION SHORTFALL NEW JERSEY THAT'S  
16 SOMETHING THAT'S ENCOURAGING TO HAVE ON THE TABLE. I THINK  
17 RETURN TO SOURCE IS IMPORTANT TO HAVE A CERTAIN GUARANTEE FOR  
18 FOLKS FOR THE COUNTIES THAT ARE GOING TO SUPPORT THIS BUT WE  
19 SHOULDN'T PRIORITIZE THAT OVER MAKING SURE THAT EVERYONE HAS  
20 SOME MINIMUS BASELINE AMOUNT OF SERVICE I HOPE WE GO FOR THE  
21 \$1.5 BILLION MEASURE AND SUPPORT FLEXIBILITY IN FUNDING.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. TAYA SHELBY, FOLLOWED BY YASHA  
24 ZARENKO.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MY NAME IS TAYA SELBY AND I AM  
2 THE COFOUNDER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHICH IS A  
3 COALITION MADE UP OF OVER 100,000 MEMBERS AND 40 PLUS  
4 ORGANIZATIONS. I AM PART OF THE SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS  
5 WHERE WE WORK TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT RIDERS VOICES ARE AT  
6 THE TABLE. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT THE COMMISSIONERS  
7 DOING HERE. WE'RE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF THIS MEASURE AND HAVE  
8 WORKED HARD SINCE 2017 TO GET TO THIS POINT. I DID WANT TO SAY  
9 A FEW THINGS REGARDING WHAT COMMISSIONER RABBITT SAID. I DO  
10 UNDERSTAND THAT SALES TAX AT 7.25 IS NOT VIABLE, WHICH IS WHY  
11 WE URGE TO YOU LOOK AT INCOME TAX, MEANS BASED INCOME TAX,  
12 WHICH RAISES QUITE A BIT OF FUNDING. I ALSO WANT TO SAY THAT  
13 ONE OF YOUR EXTREME SUCCESSES HAS BEEN THE BAY PASS WITH  
14 STUDENTS. AND I THINK YOU SHOULD LOOK AT THAT AND SAY, THIS  
15 MOVES THE NEEDLE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. YASHA. FOLLOWED BY MARCIA.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MY NAME IS YASHA PROGRAM DIRECTOR AT  
20 TRANSPORTATION JUSTICE URBAN HABITAT ALSO SEW MEMBER OF VOICES  
21 FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I WANT TO ECHO SENTIMENTS THAT  
22 COLLEAGUES HERE ON THIS CALL HAVE MADE I WANT TO THANK THE  
23 COMMISSION FOR TRYING TO MOVE THIS BILL FORWARD I KNOW WANT TO  
24 HIGHLIGHT IMPORTANT INFORMATION IN TERMS OF PROGRESSIVE  
25 REVENUE MECHANISM MEASURES THAT ARE NECESSARY FUNDING



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION WITH PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES IS CRITICAL TO  
2 EQUITY AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS ASKING FOR  
3 RIDER MECHANISMS SUCH AS MEANS BASED AND INCOME TAX AND PARCEL  
4 TAX. SALES TAXES CAN BE REGRESSIVE IT TAKES UP LARGE SHARE OF  
5 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLD BUDGETS AND THERE ARE 40 JURISDICTIONS  
6 AND NINE COUNTIES THAT EXCEED 9.25 SALES TAX MULTIPLE CITIES  
7 IN ALAMEDA COUNTY HAVE SALES TAX THAT EXCEED 10.75%. SO IT'S  
8 KEY TO PROVIDING A TRANSIT THAT'S FREQUENT, CONVENIENT, AND  
9 RELIABLE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MARISSA LOVELESS FOLLOWED BY  
12 PAUL BICKMORE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS MARCIA, GENESIS AND MEMBER OF VOICES FOR  
15 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION OUR ORGANIZATION IS COMMITTED TO  
16 CENTERING AROUND PEOPLE WHO ARE MOST VULNERABLE. FOR THAT  
17 REASON I ASK THAT YOU CONSIDER AMENDING THE CURRENT  
18 LEGISLATION SO THAT A MINIMUM OF 750 MILLION OR 70% OF THE  
19 REVENUES GO TOWARDS OPERATIONS. IN THE PAST, FOCUSING ON  
20 CAPITAL PROJECTS AT THE EXPENSE OF OPERATIONS HAS CAUSED  
21 MULTIPLE PROBLEMS. AND, ALSO, WE -- I AGREE AND ECHO THE  
22 REQUEST FOR ADDITIONAL PROGRESSIVE REVENUE MECHANISMS, SUCH AS  
23 MEANS BASED INCOME TAX, CORPORATE TAX, PER SQUARE FOOT PARCEL  
24 TAX, HIGHER RATE FOR NON-RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY, SO THAT THE  
25 POOREST PEOPLE DON'T GET HIT THE HARDEST.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PAUL BICKMORE FOLLOWED BY  
3 BRUISE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS PAUL BICKMORE. I GET AROUND WITHOUT A  
6 CAR. I DEPEND ON TRANSIT TO GET PLACES AND I VOLUNTEER WITH  
7 THE EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE AND I'M CALLING IN SUPPORT OF A  
8 LARGER 1.5 BILLION MEASURE SO THAT WE DON'T RISK A DOOM LOOP  
9 OF TRANSIT WHERE LESS AND LESS PEOPLE USE IT AND START DRIVING  
10 AND I ALSO THINK WE SHOULD NOT BE RISKING SPENDING ANY MORE  
11 MONEY ON THINGS LIKE ROAD EXPANSION, WHICH WE KNOW DO NOT  
12 WORK. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE SPENDING MONEY ON THINGS  
13 THAT, YOU KNOW, IF WE RISK CUTS, COULD REVERBERATE THROUGH  
14 DECADES IN TERMS OF BACK CONSEQUENCES. THAT'S TRANSIT AND  
15 COMPLETE STREETS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. BRUCE FOLLOWED BY OUR LAST  
18 SPEAKER JORDAN GRIMES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS BRUCE FROM BIKE WALK CASTOR VALLEY WE ALL  
21 KNOW THE CLIMATE CRISIS IS CRUSHING US. WE'RE SPENDING A LOT  
22 OF MONEY ON TRANSPORTATION TO FIX ROADS DESTROYED FROM STORMS.  
23 SO, I'M A CYCLIST AND I RIDE ALL AROUND THE REGION. SO, MTC IS  
24 REGIONAL. I TAKE BART AND SMART AND THE FERRIES. AND I TRY TO  
25 GET AROUND AS MUCH AS I CAN WITHOUT A CAR. WE DEFINITELY NEED



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TO DEEMPHASIZE THE DRIVING. AND, SO, WE NEED TO, MAYBE, MAYBE  
2 TAX DRIVERS A LITTLE MORE. PEOPLE ARE TALKING ABOUT OTHER WAYS  
3 TO GET INCOME. I ALSO THINK IT SHOULD BE A LARGER POT OF  
4 MONEY, THIS 1.5 BILLION, PERHAPS. SO, WE JUST NEED TO  
5 TRANSITION FROM DRIVING TO NON-DRIVING, BASICALLY. THANKS.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND OUR LAST SPEAKER, JORDAN  
8 GRIMES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YES. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. JORDAN GRIMES  
11 SPEAKING IN A PERSONAL CAPACITY TODAY IN SUPPORT OF THE STAFF  
12 RECOMMENDATION. FIRST, REALLY APPRECIATE CHAIR PEDROZA AND  
13 CANEPA'S COMMENTS AROUND ENSURING CUSTOMER-FACING IMPROVEMENTS  
14 FOR RIDERS AND END USERS WE SHOULD BE LASER FOCUSED ENSURING  
15 THE MEASURE IMPROVES THE RIDER EXPERIENCE RETAINING EXISTING  
16 RIDERS AND INCENTIVIZING NEW ONES AND INCLUDE BAY AREA VOTERS  
17 TO PULL THE TRIGGER IN NOVEMBER WE NEED TO ENSURE THINGS  
18 AREN'T BUSINESS AS USUAL STATUS QUO ISN'T GOING TO CONTINUE  
19 CONSOLIDATION DISCUSSIONS ARE CRUCIAL. MEASURES RR AND W  
20 FUNDING THE SYSTEMS I'M DISAPPOINTED TO SEE MY AGENCIES TAKING  
21 OPPOSE POSITIONS I'M NOT ALONE FEELING THAT WAY AMONG LOCAL  
22 ADVOCATE SUPERVISOR RIDERS WHEN WE DISCUSS WHAT COUNTIES AND  
23 LOCALITIES NEED PLEASE LOOK TO THE RIDERS AND VOTERS. THANK  
24 YOU.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
2 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM IN ZOOM AND WE  
3 DID RECEIVE CORRESPONDENCE FROM SAMTRANS ROLAND LEBRUN VARIOUS  
4 ORGANIZATIONS THAT WERE LISTED ON THE DOCUMENT AND VOICES FOR  
5 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. ALL COMMENTS RECEIVED ARE POSTED ONLINE  
6 AND HAVE BEEN DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COMMISSIONERS AND COMMITTEE  
7 MEMBERS.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET ME TAKE  
10 COMMENTS. IF WE CAN HAVE THE SPEAKERS LINE UP, WE'LL DO ZACK,  
11 I THINK IT'S DEUTSCH-GROSS, SAM SERGEANT, AND SEBASTIAN PETTY.  
12 IF YOU CAN COME UP TO THE MICROPHONE?

13

14 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS POLICY DIRECTOR  
15 TRANSFORM AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WE'RE IN  
16 SUPPORT OF AN OPPOSE UNLESS AMENDED POSITION WE WANT TO SEE  
17 CHANGE IN LEGISLATION AND MTC FRAMEWORK WE RECOMMEND YOU MOVE  
18 FORWARD WITH THE FRAMEWORK TODAY SO DIALOGUE CONTINUES WE CAN  
19 GET TO COMPROMISE AND YES AND ENSURE ALL COUNTIES IN THE  
20 REGION MAKE SURE VOICES ARE HEARD IN THE REGION AND WE CAN  
21 PASS IT. TO RESPOND TO OUR AMENDMENTS BRIEFLY WE SUPPORT  
22 ALTERNATIVE TO SALES TAX SO THAT WE CAN HAVE PROGRESSIVE  
23 SOURCES AND SO IT'S NOT COMPETING WITH EXISTING TRANSIT FUNDS  
24 AND REAUTHORIZATIONS. ADDITIONALLY IN THIS UNCERTAIN FUTURE WE  
25 TALKED ABOUT IN THE HIGHWAY SESSION EARLIER TODAY WE WANT TO





APRIL 12, 2024

1 MAKE SURE OUR LIMITED FUNDS FOR THIS MEASURE GO TOWARDS  
2 PRIORITIZING SAFER STREETS STATE OF GOOD REPAIR THAT INCLUDES  
3 PROJECTS SUCH AS HIGHWAY 37 BUT WE DO WANT TO PRIORITIZE THE  
4 PROJECTS WE KNOW WE NEED AND USE THAT WITH OUR FUNDS. THANK  
5 YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** SAM?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS SAM SERGEANT DIRECTOR OF  
10 STRATEGY AT CALTRAIN. LAST WEEK THE CALTRAIN BOARD TOOK AN  
11 OPPOSED UNLESS AMENDED POSITION ON SB1031 CALTRAIN STAFF WITH  
12 BOARD DIRECTION ASKED LEGISLATORS AND MTC STAFF REFOCUS ON  
13 ESTABLISHING REVENUE GENERATING MECHANISMS, A BALANCED  
14 EXPENDITURE PLAN AND ENSURE ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE GOING  
15 BENEFIT FROM A MEASURE IN NEW OPERATIONS FUNDING WE ALSO ASK  
16 THAT THE MEASURE INCLUDE ADDITIONAL RETURN TO SOURCE  
17 PROVISIONS, AS THE MAYOR SPOKE TO EARLIER. AND MORE GUIDANCE  
18 ON THE R AND M ROLE THERE IS MORE GUIDANCE CONTAINED IN OUR  
19 LETTER THAT OUR BOARD SUBMITTED TO BOTH CHAIR'S CORTESE AND  
20 GLASER, WHICH WAS SHARED WITH THE COMMISSION YESTERDAY AND  
21 CALTRAIN THROUGH OUR BOARD ASKED THE CONSOLIDATION LANGUAGE IN  
22 SB1031 BE REMOVED. I WOULD ALSO BE REMISS IF WE DID NOT THANK  
23 MTC STAFF FOR THE WORK THEY'RE DOING WITH OUR TEAM AND OTHER  
24 OPERATORS TO MAKE SURE WE CAN MAKE ADJUSTMENTS OF THIS  
25 SUCCESSFUL MEASURE FOR EVERYBODY. THANK YOU.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. SEBASTIAN.

3

4 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** GOOD AFTERNOON. SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR.  
5 WANT TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF THE MOVING FORWARD WITH THE  
6 AMENDMENTS. REALLY APPRECIATE TREMENDOUS WORK OF MTC STAFF AS  
7 WELL AS OPERATOR STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS AND LEGISLATIVE STAFF  
8 AND OTHERS THAT HAVE IN THE LAST WEEK MADE NEEDED IMPROVEMENTS  
9 TO THE LANGUAGE AND ARE VERY SUPPORTIVE WITH MOVING FORWARD  
10 WITH THIS BILL ALSO HIGHWAY WIDENING, ECHO COMMENTS FROM  
11 TRANSFORM THERE ARE REGIONAL ROUTES THAT MIGHT NEED TO BE  
12 INVESTED AND TALKING ABOUT INTERCHANGES WE DON'T NEED  
13 ADDITIONAL INTERCHANGE OR NEW INTERCHANGE.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLIE LAVERY AND ADINA,  
16 AND DON.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** MANNY LEON. CALIFORNIA FOR JOBS. I WANT TO THANK  
19 STAFF FOR THE HARD WORK IN THE PROPOSAL THE ALLIANCE WANTS TO  
20 SEE DEVELOPMENT OF SUCCESSFUL MEASURE WE STAND READY TO ENGAGE  
21 ALLIANCE VIEWS SUCCESSFUL MEASURE BALANCED EQUITABLE FAIR  
22 EXPENDITURES EQUALLY BENEFITTING THE BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION  
23 NETWORK WE HAVE DONE THE HOMEWORK WE SUBMITTED LETTERS TO  
24 STAFF COMMISSION AND LEGISLATURE AND WE HAVE PROPOSED AN  
25 EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK THAT I WOULD CATEGORIZE BASED ON



APRIL 12, 2024

1 CONVERSATIONS WE HEARD HERE TODAY AS WE CAN WE CAN FUND  
2 TRANSIT OPS WE CAN FUND SAFETY PROJECTS WE CAN FUND GRADE  
3 SEPARATIONS WE CAN FUND GOODS MOVEMENT, FUND MAINTENANCE AND  
4 REHABILITATION AND FUND ATP AND COMPLETE STREETS UNDER OUR  
5 PROPOSAL. AND WE'RE HAPPY TO WALK THROUGH WITH ANYONE ON THOSE  
6 PARTICULAR DETAILS. LIKE MANY WE'RE OPPOSED TO 1031. AND THANK  
7 YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT BRINGS US TO MR. LAVERY.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. CHARLIE LAVERY WITH THE POLICY  
12 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE OPERATING ENGINEERS LOCAL THREE,  
13 OPPOSING SB1031 UNLESS AMENDED WE WANT TO SEE A SUCCESSFUL  
14 REGIONAL MEASURE WITH A BALANCED EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT  
15 IMPROVES THE ENTIRE BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IN AN  
16 EQUITABLE MANNER AND INCLUDES TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDS TO  
17 SUPPORT BAY AREA TRANSIT SERVICE, TRANSIT CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT  
18 PROJECTS TO IMPROVE AND EXPAND EXISTING SERVICE, CAPITAL  
19 HIGHWAY AND ROAD IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE INCLUDED IN IMPROVED  
20 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY  
21 STRATEGIES. ALSO ROAD HIGHWAY AND BRIDGE INFRASTRUCTURE  
22 MAINTENANCE, REHABILITATION, AND RESILIENCY PROJECTS. OE3  
23 STANDS READY TO PARTNER WITH MTC TO FIND A BALANCED  
24 EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT PROVIDES MULTI-MODAL BENEFITS TO BAY  
25 AREA RESIDENTS, CREATES THOUSANDS OF UNION CONSTRUCTION JOBS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 AND BUILDS THE INFRASTRUCTURE WE NEED FOR SUSTAINED ECONOMIC  
2 VIBRANCE INTO THE FUTURE. LASTLY OUR COLLECTIVE EXPERIENCE IN  
3 PAST SUCCESSFUL AND LOCAL AND REGIONAL MEASURES TELLS US THIS  
4 SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGNS CONSIDERED INTEREST AND INPUT FROM  
5 BUSINESS LABOR AND THE COMMUNITY. THANK YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** ADINA LEVIN, ADVOCACY DIRECTOR WITH SEAMLESS BAY  
8 AREA. WANT TO EXPRESS THANKS TO CHAIR PEDROZA WHO IS NOT HERE  
9 IN THE ROOM ANYMORE, ON HIS INSPIRING WORDS ABOUT GETTING TO  
10 YES. THANKS VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR THE REALLY HARD WORK  
11 CRUNCHING THE NUMBERS ON THE HARD MATH INCLUDING RETURN TO  
12 SOURCE CONCEPTS TO BRING MORE OF THE REGION AND STAKEHOLDERS  
13 ON BOARD, AND REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE EVERYONE WHO HAS  
14 DIFFERENT POINTS OF VIEW TO CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER AND TO  
15 KEEP NEGOTIATING TO GET TO YES. BECAUSE THERE IS NOT A PLAN B.  
16 IF WE HAVE MULTIPLE COMPETING MEASURES ON THE BALLOT AT THE  
17 SAME TIME, IMAGINE SAN FRANCISCO TRYING TO DECIDE WHETHER TO  
18 SUPPORT MUNI OR BART OR CALTRAIN, IMAGINE SANTA CLARA COUNTY  
19 TRYING TO REAUTHORIZE A LOCAL TAX WHILE BART AND CALTRAIN ARE  
20 NOT RUNNING. THAT WILL NOT GET THE VOTER CONFIDENCE EITHER. WE  
21 DO NOT HAVE A PLAN B. WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO GET TO YES. AND,  
22 LASTLY, I WOULD LIKE TO PLEAD TO MTC AS THE SPONSORS OF THIS  
23 LEGISLATION, WHEN THESE DISCUSSIONS ARE HAPPENING, TO BE  
24 THERE, WATCHING THE BOARD MEETINGS AND HEARING SKEPTICISM



APRIL 12, 2024

1 HAVING THAT PRESENCE AS THE SPONSORS OF THE LEGISLATION IS  
2 IMPORTANT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** DON CECIL?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. DON CECIL REPRESENTING ROSEANNE AND  
7 THE SAN MATEO COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION. I GREW  
8 UP IN THE CITY OF SAN JOSE AND NOW LIVE IN CITY OF SAN  
9 FRANCISCO STAFF SEEMS SO IMPERSONAL, REBECCA, GEORGIA THANK  
10 YOU FOR ALL YOU HAVE BEEN DOING ON THIS. WE ARE INFORMED BY  
11 WHAT OUR LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE SAYING, WHAT PARTNERS LIKE  
12 THE BAY AREA COUNCIL, LABOR, FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN AND OTHERS. I  
13 WOULD IMPLORE YOU, KEEP STRIVING FOR MORE CONTROL. BECAUSE IT  
14 FEELS HIKE SOME OF THAT CONTROL HAS BEEN LOST. I ALSO THINK,  
15 BEFORE PEOPLE GET REALLY EXCITED ABOUT \$1.5 BILLION, PLEASE  
16 POLL IT. PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT IS ACTUALLY A FEASIBLE AMOUNT  
17 OF MONEY THAT YOU CAN RAISE BEFORE WE ALL GET EXCITED ABOUT  
18 THINGS THAT MAY NOT BE POSSIBLE. SO, KEEP UP THE GOOD WORK.  
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I KNOW HIM PERSONALLY, A MAN OF WISDOM.  
22 THANK YOU, DON. NOW WE HAVE A MOTION. WE HAVE A SECOND ON THE  
23 TABLE, BUT I'M GOING TO ALLOW MAYORAL PRIVILEGE HERE.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** TWO QUICK THINGS FOR THE RECORD, ONE I'M GLAD WE HAVE  
2 27 NOT 37 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT'S STILL A LOT. THE OTHERS, I  
3 AM DISH WAS GOING SAY THIS, BUT I AM GOING TO VOTE YES ON THIS  
4 IN THE SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION AND CONTINUING THE CONVERSATION  
5 IN EVERYTHING THAT'S BEEN SAID BUT I WANT TO BE CLEAR TO FOLKS  
6 BACK HOME WHO ARE PAYING ATTENTION, WERE THIS A FINAL VOTE  
7 TODAY I WE WANT BE ABLE TO DO THAT. WE HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO  
8 AND I WANT TO BE CLEAR. I THINK I MADE THOSE POINTS EARLIER  
9 BUT I'M READY TO LEAN IN AND HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS BUT WE  
10 DO CONTINUE TO HAVE SOME DEEP CONCERN PERCENT AND A LONG WAY  
11 TO GO. SO JUST WANT TO MAKE THAT CLEAR, BUT I WILL BE VOTING  
12 YES.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** CHAIR?

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** IN THE EFFORTS OF COLLABORATION HERE, THE LETTERS  
19 OF OPPOSITION UNLESS AMENDED WE'LL CLEARLY WORK WITH STAFF ON.  
20 THE SPECIFICS IS ARE OUT THERE, BECAUSE WE WANT TO SEE THE  
21 CHANGES AND THAT THERE IS NO NEGATIVE IMPACT. SO, I'LL BE  
22 SENDING ALL THOSE THEIR WAY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, HOPEFULLY  
23 WILL BE WORKING TOGETHER WITH THIS. BUT WE HAD TO SEND A  
24 STRONG MESSAGE. IT DOESN'T MEAN WE'RE NOT WORKING, BUT WE WILL  
25 BE WORKING. THANK YOU.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. ALWAYS THE  
3 ADVOCATE FOR OUR COUNTY. I APPRECIATE IT. SO THERE IS A MOTION  
4 AND A SECOND ON THE TABLE. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR CANEPA?

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND? MEMBER ECKLUND?

2

3 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MEMBER MAHAN?

6

7 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

22

23 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?





APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN.

5

6 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
9 PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WONDERFUL. WONDERFUL. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
12 COMMENT, MARTHA? I'M TRYING TO FOLLOW MY NOTES. I HAVE A  
13 PROBLEM SOMETIMES DOING THAT.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FOR GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. [LAUGHTER]  
16 OKAY. THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM  
17 NO ONE WITH HAND RAISED IN ZOOM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM  
18 WISHING TO SPEAK.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE ADJOURNMENT  
21 THE NEXT MEETING OF THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD  
22 FRIDAY MAY 10th 2024 NINE 45 A.M. AT 375 BEALE STREET SAN  
23 FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO  
24 THE PUBLIC. [ADJOURNED]

25



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*