

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

2 **FRIDAY, APRIL 3, 2026, 10:00 AM**

3

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** GOOD MORNING. HAPPY FRIDAY APRIL 3RD WELCOME TO
6 YOUR SECOND MEETING THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE
7 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND. ASSOCIATION OF BAY
8 AREA GOVERNMENTS. WEBSITES COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF
9 THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE
10 THE RAISED HAND FEATURE AND I'LL CALL THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
11 TIME MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WHO WOULD
12 LIKE TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY AGENDA ITEM MAY USE THE
13 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STATUE STAR NINE MEMBERS OF THE
14 PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND
15 THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
16 CONDUCTED FOR AGENDA ACTION ITEMS BECAUSE REMOTE
17 TELECONFERENCE PARTICIPATION WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA
18 ITEM ONE NOTING KY-NAM MILLER ACTING AS THE INTERIM CHAIR
19 UNTIL ONE OF YOU IS ELECTED CHAIR LATER IN THIS MEETING FIRST
20 ORDER OF BUSINESS ROLL CALL CONFIRMATION OF QUORUM ALSO
21 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO
22 ORDER REGULAR MEETING OF THE MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY
23 COUNCIL. FRED CALL THE ROLL.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARVELO?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALAJI IS ABSENT. BALDINI?

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ?

9

10 **DIANA BENITEZ:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL?

13

14 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG?

17

18 **AMANDA CHANG:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN?

21

22 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **ASHTON DESMANGLES:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?

4

5 **BRYANT DUONG:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** GERASIMENKO? IS ABSENT. HANKERSON?

8

9 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?

12

13 **WENDY KALLINS:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAVERY?

16

17 **CHARLES LAVERY:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MADRID?

20

21 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** R. SHAY MILES?

24

25 **R. SHAY MILES:** PRESENT.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LOUIS MIRANTE?

3

4 **LOUIS MIRANTE:** HERE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEMSICK? SAATHOFF-HARSHFIELD?

9

10 **PETER SAATHOFF-HARSHFIELD:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES? SALAZAR?

13

14 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** HERE. SANDERS? WE'LL GET BACK TO HIM.

15 SBRANTI?

16

17 **TIM SBRANTI:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SHEPHARD?

20

21 **SONJA SHEPHARD:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TRACHTENBERG? IS ABSENT. LIEU?

24

25 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** PRESENT.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WONG?

3

4 **JANELLE WONG:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES?

7

8 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

11

12 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THEN I SEE PADMA COMING IN WE ALSO HAVE REQUEST

13 FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION FROM MEMBER JOSHUA SAUNDERS ONLINE.

14 PROMOTE HIM TO PANELIST?

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ONE MOMENT.

17

18 **KY-NAM MILLER:** JOSHUA ARE YOU UNMUTED?

19

20 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

21

22 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WE CAN HEAR YOU. DO YOU HAVE THE SCRIPT IN

23 FRONT OF YOU FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION.

24

25 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** I WOULD LIKE TO -- COULD YOU GO THROUGH THAT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WITH ME REAL QUICK?

2

3 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SURE I'LL JUST ASK AFFIRM WHAT I'M SAYING WHICH
4 IS THAT YOU'RE REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE VIA TELECONFERENCING
5 REMOTE PARTICIPATION PER GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54953
6 SUBSECTION C, DISABILITY. AND ALSO CONFIRM THERE IS NO ONE
7 PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER 18 YEARS OF AGE.

8

9 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** I AFFIRM EVERYTHING THAT YOU'RE SAYING AND
10 THERE IS NO ONE HERE PRESENT BUT MYSELF.

11

12 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU MEMBER SAUNDERS YOUR REQUEST IS
13 NOTED. YOU WILL BE MARKED PRESENT. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ
14 THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
17 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
18 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
19 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
20 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
21 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

22

23 **KY-NAM MILLER:** DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? OR
24 WE CAN JUST GO TO GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS IS THE MTC ABAG
25 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL INFORMATION ITEM ON PUBLIC COMMENT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WILL THE CLERK INFORM US OF PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMIT ON THIS ITEM
2 OR WHETHER ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISH TO GIVE PUBLIC
3 COMMENT.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
6 THIS ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
7 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. NONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **KY-NAM MILLER:** MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE COUNCIL
11 MEMBER COMMENTS THIS IS AN ABAG MTC COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL
12 INFORMATION ITEM. ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM COLONEL
13 MEMBERS? NOT SEEING ANY. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE INFORM US OF
14 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM OR WHETHER ARE
15 THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO GIVE PUBLIC
16 COMMENT.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THIS ITEM NO WRITTEN COMMENDATION
19 RECEIVED NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC
20 COMMENT NONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **KY-NAM MILLER:** MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR CHAIR'S REPORT SINCE
23 THERE IS NO CHAIR THERE IS NO CHAIR'S REPORT FOR THIS MONTH
24 WE'LL HAVE ONE NEXT MONTH. ANY COUNCIL MEMBER DISCUSSION OR
25 PUBLIC COMMENTS, FRED ON THIS ITEM?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THIS ITEM NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
3 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
4 NONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

5

6 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE CONSENT
7 CALENDAR MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL ACTION ITEM
8 CONSENT CALENDAR INCLUDES ITEM FIVE APPROVAL OF THE MTC ABAG
9 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL MINUTES OF MARCH 62026.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

12

13 **KY-NAM MILLER:** BALDINI MOVE APPROVAL. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

16

17 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I HEARD A VOICE THAT WAS CHUCK? WAS THAT
18 SAUNDERS?

19

20 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** YES, THAT WAS ME.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE IT WAS A CORRECTED AGENDA THAT WAS
23 DISTRIBUTED AND POSTED ONLINE.

24

25 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SO NOTED. ARE THEY ADOPTING THE MINUTES?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES.

3

4 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SO YOU ALL KNOW THAT ONCE YOU TAKE THIS VOICE
5 VOTE AFFIRMING MINUTES FROM LAST MONTH THAT INCLUDES AN
6 UPDATED AGENDA. FRED ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MR. MILLER, BECAUSE WE HAVE A REMOTE
9 PARTICIPANT WE NEED TO DO ROLL CALL VOTE.

10

11 **KY-NAM MILLER:** ABSOLUTELY. ALSO IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT
12 BEFORE THE ROLL CALL, PLEASE LET US KNOW.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THIS ITEM NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
15 NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT,
16 NONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

17

18 **KY-NAM MILLER:** OKAY. LET'S NOW DO THAT VOTE. ROLL CALL.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THE MOTION BY BALDINI, AND SECOND
21 SAUNDERS. ARVELO?

22

23 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALAJI?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **PADMA BALAJI:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALDINI?

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ?

9

10 **DIANA BENITEZ:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL?

13

14 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG?

17

18 **AMANDA CHANG:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN?

21

22 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **ASHTON DESMANGLES:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?

4

5 **BRYANT DUONG:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** JULIA GERASIMENKO? IS ABSENT. OH. YOU'RE
8 HERE?

9

10 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. HANKERSON?

13

14 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?

17

18 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAVERY? MADRID?

21

22 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MILES? MIRANTE? NEMSICK? HARSHFIELD?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD:** SORRY. WE'RE APPROVING THE MINUTES,
2 RIGHT?

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES.

5

6 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD:** MY NAME IS SPELLED INCORRECTLY.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SORRY APOLOGIZE FOR THAT. THANK YOU. I'LL
9 MAKE THAT CORRECTION. YOUR VOTE?

10

11 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SALAZAR?

14

15 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** AYE.

16

17 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD:** SAUNDERS? SBRANTI? TRACHTENBERG IS
18 ABSENT. ORANTES? MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
19 PRESENT.

20

21 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU FRED. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 6A
22 ELECTION OF ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR AND VICE
23 CHAIR COLONEL LEADERSHIP ELECTIONS AS AN ACTION ITEM. AND
24 REMINDER, WE'LL BE ELECTING THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR UNDER THE
25 PROCEDURES PREVIOUSLY ADOPTED BY THE COUNCIL LAST MONTH. FOR



APRIL 3, 2026

1 TODAY'S ELECTION, THE CANDIDATES FOR CHAIR ARE CARINA LIEU AND
2 CHUCK CANTRELL AND CANDIDATES SO FAR. YOU CAN ALSO ADD YOUR
3 NAME TO THIS. I'LL NOTE SOME CANDIDATES HAVE WITHDRAWN SINCE
4 THE PREVIOUS OPENING OF CANDIDACIES. MILES, CUSHMAN, SHEPHARD,
5 BENITEZ SO FAR. AND YOU CAN PUT YOURSELF FORWARD, OR A
6 COLLEAGUE, IF YOU WISH. WOULD ANY COUNCIL MEMBERS MAKE FURTHER
7 NOMINATION OF THEMSELVES OR A FELLOW COUNCIL MEMBER FOR EITHER
8 OF THE LEADERSHIP POSITIONS? I SEE A LIGHT ON, TRYING TO
9 SPEAK. JUST GOT TO PRESS THE BUTTON THERE. BALDINI?

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES, I WOULD LIKE TO NOMINATE CHARLES LAVERY
12 FOR VICE CHAIR.

13

14 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SURE. NOTED. FRED, YOU GOT THAT CHARLIE LAVERY
15 AS VICE CHAIR? YES? MR. MADRID?

16

17 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST YOU CAN REFRESH US
18 ON RESPONSIBILITY ON EACH?

19

20 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SURE. SO THE VICE CHAIR'S RESPONSIBILITY IS
21 ESSENTIALLY A BACKUP TO THE CHAIR TO STEP IN WHEN THE CHAIR IS
22 NOT AVAILABLE. AND THE CHAIR'S RESPONSIBILITY IS TO CURRENTLY
23 DO WHAT I'M DOING CONDUCT THE MEETING AS THE LEADER OF THIS
24 BODY THEN THERE IS RESPONSIBILITY TO NAME MEMBERS TO
25 SUBCOMMITTEE PRESIDENCY THEN AD-HOC BODIES FROM THIS BODY THEN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 MEETING TO BOTH GIVE REPORTS TO ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE
2 COMMISSION AND ALSO MEETING WITH STAFF MONTHLY TO HELP SET THE
3 AGENDA. THERE IS KIND OF ONGOING WORK ON WITH DEVELOPING AND
4 EXECUTING THE WORK PLAN SO IT'S A SIGNIFICANT SET OF
5 RESPONSIBILITIES.

6

7 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** COULD YOU TELL US A LITTLE BIT ABOUT HOW
8 MUCH HOURS PER MONTH DOES EACH PERSON NEED TO BE COMMITTED?

9

10 **KY-NAM MILLER:** IT'S A LITTLE DEPENDENT ON THE PERSON, EACH OF
11 YOU AS COUNCIL MEMBERS TO PUT IN A LOT OF HOURS DOING THE
12 BACKGROUND READING AND RESEARCH AND ASKING QUESTIONS OF STAFF
13 SO I THINK THAT'S KIND OF THE BASELINE THAT YOU ALL HAVE BUT
14 ON TOP OF THAT THE ADDITIONAL MEETING REQUIREMENTS I WOULD SAY
15 ARE MAYBE FIVE HOURS PER MONTH, MAYBE TEN, DEPENDING ON IF YOU
16 COUNT TRAVEL IF YOU ARE COMING IN-PERSON? I MEAN, IT'S NOT AN
17 INSIGNIFICANT LOAD. HAVING NOT SERVED AS THE CHAIR, MAYBE I
18 COULD INVITE SOMEONE WHO HAS SERVED AS CHAIR TO GIVE A SAMPLE
19 OF THEIR PAST WORKLOAD PER MONTH MAYBE FORMER CHAIR LIEU, DO
20 YOU HAVE ANY INDICATION OF THE TIME COMMITMENT?

21

22 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** SO, THERE IS, COMING TO THIS MEETING, FROM
23 IS PRESENTING AT THE COMMISSION MEETING, THEN THERE IS THE
24 PLANNING MEETINGS WHICH ARE ABOUT AN HOUR THEN THAT'S -- YEAH,
25 PRESENTING TO THE COMMISSION. SO, I WOULD SAY MAYBE FIVE HOURS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 AT MINIMUM, JUST PERFORMING THE DUTIES, LIKE, GOING TO
2 MEETINGS, THEN IT GROWS FROM THERE.

3

4 **KY-NAM MILLER:** ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS BEFORE WE PROCEED? NOT
5 SEEING ANY. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE UP THE CHAIR ELECTION FIRST.
6 FOLLOWED BY THE VICE CHAIR ELECTION. THE DEFAULT PLAN FOR
7 VOTING TODAY IS TO BEGIN WITH VOICE VOTES FOR THE INITIAL
8 ROUNDS, ONCE MAJORITY OUTCOME HAS BEEN PREACHED WE'LL AFFIRM
9 THE RESULT THROUGH ROLL CALL VOTE FOR THE RECORD AND CURRENT
10 PLAN IS TO CONDUCT SINGLE ROLL CALL VOTE AFFIRMING BOTH THE
11 LEADERSHIP POSITIONS FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR TOGETHER IF ANY
12 MEMBERS PREFER TO CONDUCT SEPARATE ROLL CALL VOTES FOR CHAIR
13 AND VICE CHAIR PLEASE SHARE THAT DIRECTION BEFORE WE BEGIN
14 THAT VOTE ON THE MECHANICS OF VOTING AS THIS COUNCIL AGREED TO
15 IN MARCH ALL MEMBERS PRESENT COUNTING TOWARDS QUORUM ARE
16 INCLUDED IN THE VOTE TOTAL EVEN IF THEY ABSTAIN THIS MEANS
17 CANDIDATE MUST RECEIVE 50% PLUS ONE OF ALL VOTES CAST BY
18 MEMBERS COUNTED TORTOISE QUORUM MEMBERS PARTICIPATING REMOTELY
19 THROUGH APPROVED METHODS COUNT TOWARDS BOTH QUORUM AND VOTE
20 TOTAL AND MEMBERS ATTENDING ONLY AS MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC DO
21 NOT COUNT TOWARDS QUORUM AND DO NOT VOTE. WE WILL PROCEED WITH
22 THE CHAIR ELECTION FIRST. IF THERE ARE MORE THAN TWO
23 CANDIDATES AND NO CANDIDATE RECEIVES A MAJORITY OF THE INITIAL
24 VOTE, WE'LL MOVE INTO ADDITIONAL ROUNDS OF VOTING IN EACH
25 ROUND THE CANDIDATE RECEIVING THE LOWEST NUMBER OF VOTES WILL



APRIL 3, 2026

1 BE REMOVED AND VOTING WILL CONTINUE UNTIL A CANDIDATE RECEIVES
2 A MAJORITY. IF THERE IS A TIE OR DEADLOCK OR MULTIPLE ROUNDS
3 DO NOT RESULT IN MAJORITY WINNER, CANDIDATES WHO REMAIN UNDER
4 CONSIDERATION WILL BE INVITED TO MAKE BRIEF RENEWED STATEMENTS
5 BEFORE ANOTHER VOTE IS TAKEN. IF REPEATED DEADLOCK PERSISTS,
6 COUNCIL MAY CHOOSE TO PAUSE ELECTION AND CONTINUE AT A
7 SUBSEQUENT MEETING. ONCE CHAIR IS ELECTED WE'LL FOLLOW SAME
8 PROCESS FOR THE VICE CHAIR ELECTION. AFTER BOTH LEADERSHIP
9 POSITIONS ARE RESOLVED, WE'LL CONDUCT THAT ROLL CALL VOTE TO
10 AFFIRM THE OUTCOME, NOTING THE TALLY OF VOTES EACH CANDIDATE
11 RECEIVED AND DECISIVE VOTE AND FORMALLY RECORD THE COUNCIL'S
12 LEADERSHIP FOR THE TERM. THIS FINAL STEP ENSURES CLARITY IN
13 THE PUBLIC RECORD COMPLIANCE WITH OPEN MEETING REQUIREMENTS.
14 BEFORE WE BEGIN, ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PROCESS OR
15 PREFERENCES REGARDING THE ROLL CALL AFFIRMATION AND I'LL ASK
16 FRED, PREEMPTIVELY, WHAT OUR MAGIC NUMBER IS TODAY, WHICH IS
17 THE TOTAL NUMBER DIVIDED BY TWO PLUS ONE.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WE HAVE 25 MEMBERS PRESENT, MAJORITY IS
20 13.

21

22 **KY-NAM MILLER:** GOT IT. SO THAT WAS A LOT. DO YOU ALL HAVE ANY
23 QUESTIONS BEFORE WE PROCEED? ALL RIGHT. SO, FIRST I'M GOING TO
24 HAVE EACH CANDIDATE FOR CHAIR, I'M GOING TO GIVE TWO MINUTES
25 TO MAKE A CANDIDATE STATEMENT ON WHY THEY SEEK TO SERVE AS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 CHAIR GOING FROM LEFT TO RIGHT ACROSS THE ROOM BEFORE -- CLERK
2 LET'S SEE -- WE HAVE ALREADY CONFIRMED THE 13 THRESHOLD SO
3 GOING BACK WE HAVE MISS CARINA LIEU AND CHUCK CANTRELL TWO
4 CANDIDATES FOR CHAIR SO GOING LEFT TO RIGHT ACROSS THE ROOM
5 GOING WITH MISS LIEU THEN MR. CANTRELL TWO MINUTES EACH WITH
6 THAT TWO MINUTES COUNCILMEMBER LIEU.

7

8 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE FOR THOSE
9 OF WHO YOU HAVEN'T MET ME YET MY NAME IS CARINA LIEU IT'S
10 REALLY GOOD TO BE HERE WITH ALL OF YOU I WANT TO START BY
11 SHARING THAT MY PATH INTO THIS WORK STARTED AS A YOUTH
12 ORGANIZER IN HIGH SCHOOL AND THAT'S WHAT LED ME INTO PUBLIC
13 SERVICE I HAVE STAYED CONNECTED TO THAT SINCE BEING IN A YOUTH
14 COMMISSION ADULT ALLY AND SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL MENTOR SO WHEN
15 I TALK ABOUT REPRESENTATION IT'S NOT JUST THE PEOPLE OF COLOR
16 THAT I REPRESENT FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY IT'S REPRESENTATION ACROSS
17 GENERATIONS AS A PARENT OF SOMEBODY WHO IS A CARETAKER FOR MY
18 FATHER AND FOR YOUTH. I WANT TO NAME FOR THIS BODY THE
19 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL THIS NEW BODY THERE IS NEW
20 OPPORTUNITY TO BRIDGE TOGETHER TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING AND
21 BY RECOGNIZING THAT OUR TRANSPORTATIONS WEREN'T BUILT
22 NEUTRALLY THEY HAVE HAD IMPACTS ON COMMUNITIES CULTURALLY
23 SIGNIFICANT NEIGHBORHOOD THEY HAVE CHANGED THE WAY OUR
24 LANDSCAPE IS BUILT HOW IT AFFECTS THE QUALITY OF LIFE ALSO
25 THIS BODY HAS OPPORTUNITY TO SHAPE DECISIONS ABOUT QUALITY OF



APRIL 3, 2026

1 LIFE FOR COMMUNITY SO BEING ON THIS COUNCIL I BELIEVE THAT WE
2 GET TO BRING ALL THE DIFFERENT EXPERIENCES THAT WE HAVE LIVING
3 ACROSS THE REGION TOGETHER TO MAKE DECISIONS TO LEARN FROM
4 EACH OTHER AND TO HAVE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT HOW WE CAN MAKE
5 INCREMENTAL CHANGES FOR OUR COMMUNITIES AS FORMER CHAIR OF THE
6 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL I HAVE HAD THE EXPERIENCE OF HELPING
7 MOVE COMPLEX CONVERSATIONS FORWARD BRING PEOPLE TOGETHER HOLD
8 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES AND BUILDING ALIGNMENT AND HONESTLY
9 IT'S ONE OF THE THINGS I HAVE ENJOYED MOST ABOUT BEING ON THIS
10 COUNCIL MEETING AND LEARNING FROM PEOPLE ALL ACROSS THIS
11 REGION AND UNDERSTANDING HOW ALL OF YOUR EXPERIENCES SHAPE HOW
12 YOU LIVE. I ALSO APPROACH THIS WORK AS A FACILITATOR I'M
13 COMMITTED TO MENTORING AND SUPPORTING OTHER PEOPLE TO STEP
14 INTO LEADERSHIP SO THIS COUNCIL CONTINUES TO GROW STRONGER
15 OVER TIME. SO IF ELECTED, I WOULD FOCUS ON CLARITY CONNECTION
16 AND MAKING SURE THAT OUR WORK IS UNDERSTANDABLE THAT WE'RE
17 TRULY CONNECTED TO THE COMMUNITIES THAT WE REPRESENT AND THAT
18 WHAT WE DO LEADS TO ACTUAL OUTCOMES AND ACTIONS TAKEN BY THIS
19 COUNCIL. SO, I WOULD BE HONORED TO SERVE THIS COUNCIL AS CHAIR
20 AND I CARE DEEPLY ABOUT THIS WORK. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

21

22 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER LIEU. COUNCIL MEMBER
23 CANTRELL WHY DON'T WE GIVE TWO AND A HALF MINUTES SINCE WE
24 WENT A LITTLE BIT OVER WHATEVER TIME YOU NEED. STARTING WITH
25 TWO MINUTES.



APRIL 3, 2026

1
2 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** HI IT'S GREAT TO MEET EVERYONE AGAIN I'M CHUCK
3 CANTRELL I'LL READ THE STATEMENT THEN WE CAN GO FROM THERE.
4 I'M RUNNING FOR CHAIR, BECAUSE MY PUBLIC WORK HAS ALWAYS
5 FOCUSED ON AMPLIFYING VOICES AND TRANSFORMING INFORMATION TO
6 BETTER POLICY. AS VICE CHAIR OF THE SAN JOSE PLANNING
7 COMMISSION, FORMER BOARD PRESIDENT OF THE GARDENER
8 NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION AND GOOD MORNING FOR GROUPS LIKE SAVE
9 OUR TRAILS AND COMMITTEE FOR GREEN FOOTHILLS, I SPENT YEARS
10 LISTENING DEEPLY SYNTHESIZING COMPLEX INPUT AND ENSURING
11 COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVES SHAPE DECISIONS. MY DYING TO STAY HERE
12 PODCAST AND VIDEO SERIES WHERE I INTERVIEW BLACK RESIDENTS AND
13 ADVOCATES AND LOCAL LEADERS HIGHLIGHT STORIES OFTEN IGNORED IN
14 REGIONAL DEBATES ABOUT HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, AND JUSTICE.
15 POSTING THE SERIES HAS REINFORCED THAT GOOD PROCESS IS EQUITY.
16 PEOPLE PARTICIPATE WHEN THEY FEEL HEARD, RESPECTED, AND NOT
17 RUSHED. AS CHAIR, I'LL BRING -- EXCUSE ME -- I'LL BRING A
18 DISCIPLINED YET COMPASSIONATE APPROACH TO FACILITATION. THE
19 ROLE IS NOT JUST TO RUN AN AGENDA IT'S TO CREATE A SAFER SPACE
20 FOR MEMBERS TO RAISE QUESTIONS, VALUE LIVED EXPERIENCE, AND
21 EXPERTISE AND GIVE PUBLIC COMMENTERS MEANINGFUL TIME. AT THE
22 SAME TIME, I WILL PROTECT PROCESS AND DECORUM AND PACING TO
23 ENSURE TIMELINE ON TOPIC AND ACTIONABLE RECOMMENDATIONS TO MTC
24 AND ABAG. MY GOAL IS A COUNCIL WHERE EVERYONE CAN BE HEARD,
25 MEETINGS CAN MOVE WITH PURPOSE, AND OUR COLLECTIVE VOICES



APRIL 3, 2026

1 CARRY REAL WEIGHT IN THE REGION'S DECISIONS. IF YOU KNOW ME
2 YOU PROBABLY HEARD ME SAY THIS BEFORE SOMETHING I ALWAYS SAY
3 IS "LUCK IS ALL OF LIFE'S EXPERIENCES COMING TOGETHER TO
4 INFLUENCE ONE OF THAT." AND I FEEL MY PREVIOUS EXPERIENCE HAS
5 BRUT ME TO THIS MOMENT WHILE A FEEL PREPARED FOR THIS. THANK
6 YOU.

7

8 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER CANTRELL THANK YOU
9 BOTH COUNCIL MEMBERS FOR PUTTING YOURSELF FORWARD AS
10 CANDIDATES WOULD YOU PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL ON THIS. I THINK
11 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE PEOPLE SAY THE LAST NAME OF THE PREFERRED
12 CANDIDATE DOES THAT SOUND RIGHT PRESENTATION.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES THERE IS A HAND RAISED IN THE ATTEND'S
15 SPACE.

16

17 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SURE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING YOU CAN ALL HEAR ME.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING I'M SORRY CAN'T BE THERE I WANTED TO
24 CALL IN JUST HAVE A COUPLE QUICK REFLECTIONS I DIDN'T KNOW I
25 WOULD BE SPEAKING BEFORE YOU ALL BEFORE YOU ALL GOT TO VOTE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 BUT I WANTED TO SAY I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY WHO HAS TAKEN A
2 STEP FORWARD AND OFFERED THEIR TIME AND ENERGY TO HELP LEAD
3 AND FACILITATE THIS BODY I THINK WE HAVE A NUMBER OF EXCELLENT
4 CANDIDATES MY REFLECTIONS WERE IN THINKING ABOUT A COUPLE OF
5 THINGS ONE THE VALUE OF SOME INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE IS IN MY
6 EXPERIENCE BEING ON THE STAFFER SIDE OF THE THINGS IN THE
7 PUBLIC SECTOR HOW VALUABLE IT IS TO HAVE SOMETHING WHO HAS
8 EXPERIENCE IN LEADING A BOARD ALSO A BIT OF EXPERIENCE LEADING
9 WORKING WITH STAFF AND WHO KNOWS A BIT OF HISTORY OF THE
10 ORGANIZATION'S EFFORTS AND PROGRAMS THEY FACILITATE PRODUCTIVE
11 SO SOPHISTICATED INCLUSIVE INPUT I THINK THAT'S WHERE THIS IS
12 REFLECTED IN ALL OF OUR CANDIDATES TODAY SECOND PIECE I HAVE
13 BEEN THINKING ABOUT IS WHAT WAS REFER REFERENCED IN THE
14 OPPORTUNITY TO CONNECT TO HOUSING AND INTEGRATED PICTURE THAT
15 THIS POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BODY OFFERS I'M SORRY I CAN'T BE
16 THERE WITH YOU TODAY I'M GLAD THAT WE HAVE SO MANY FOLKS WHO
17 ARE WILLING TO STEP UP AND LEAD US I GUESS MY LAST THOUGHT MY
18 UNDERSTANDING THAT THE CHAIRS WILL PLAY A ROLE IN DECIDING AND
19 SELECTING AGENDA ITEMS AND THINGS THAT ARE MOST -- ULTIMATE
20 COME TO US THAT WE DISCUSS AND SO I HOPE THAT WHOMEVER WE
21 SELECT IS ABLE TO FACILITATE A BIT OF DELIBERATIVE PROCESS FOR
22 US TO PROVIDE INPUT ON WHAT THOSE ITEMS AND PRIORITIES ARE.
23 SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH. AGAIN, LOOKING FORWARD TO BEING WITH
24 YOU ALL AT A FUTURE MEETING.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
2 COMMENTS RECEIVED. NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
3 BOARDROOM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** ALL RIGHT LET'S PROCEED WITH A VOTE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARVELO?

8

9 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** LIEU?

10

11 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** BALAJI? LIEU.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALDINI? LIEU.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ? LIEU.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL. CANTRELL.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG? LIEU.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN? LIEU.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES? LIEU?

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **BRYANT DUONG:** LIEU.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** GERASIMENKO?

5

6 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** LIEU.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HANKERSON?

9

10 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** LIEU.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** LIEU.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAVERY?

17

18 **CHARLES LAVERY:** LIEU.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MADRID?

21

22 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** LIEU.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MILES?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **R. SHAY MILES:** LIEU.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MIRANTE?

4

5 **LOUIS MIRANTE:** LIEU.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEMSICK?

8

9 **KAREN NEMSICK:** LIEU.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAATHODD? LIEU.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SALAZAR?

14

15 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** LIEU.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAUNDERS?

18

19 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** LIEU.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SBRANTI? LIEU.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SHEPHARD?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** LIEU.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TRACHTENBERG IS NOT PRESENT. CARINA LIEU?

3

4 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** LIEU.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WONG?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** LIEU.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES?

11

12 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** LIEU.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** 24 VOTES FOR LIEU ONE FOR CANTRELL.

15

16 **KY-NAM MILLER:** OKAY WE'LL NOTE THAT TALLY FOR THE ROLL CALL

17 VOTE LATER. THANK YOU CANDIDATES FOR PUTTING YOURSELF FORWARD.

18 YOU ARE ABLE, MR. CANTRELL, ANYONE ELSE, TO PUT YOURSELF

19 FORWARD FOR VICE CHAIR AS WELL. SO WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH

20 THE VICE CHAIR VOTE. LET'S GO THROUGH THE NAMES LEFT TO RIGHT

21 AGAIN INCLUDING R. SHAY MILES, WARREN CUSHMAN, SONJA SHEPHERD,

22 DIANA BENITEZ, AND CHARLIE LAVERY. WARREN, AM I MISTAKEN THAT

23 YOU'RE ACTUALLY REMOVING YOURSELF FROM CONTENTION FOR VICE

24 CHAIR?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** YOU ARE NOT MISTAKEN. I WAS ABOUT TO RAISE MY
2 HAND IN SAYING I'M GOING TO REMOVE MY NAME FROM VICE CHAIR.

3

4 **KY-NAM MILLER:** OKAY THEN THERE ARE FOUR CHOICES MILES,
5 SHEPHARD, BENITEZ, AND LAVERY, AND WE'RE GOING LEFT TO RIGHT
6 UNLESS THERE IS ANOTHER CANDIDATE WHO WISHES TO PUT THEMSELVES
7 FORWARD FOR A COLLEAGUE? NOT SEEING ANY. COUNCIL MEMBER
8 BENITEZ IS THE FURTHER PERSON BY LEFT THEN WE'LL GO ACROSS THE
9 BOARD.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CAN I ASK A QUESTION? MR. CANTRELL, ARE YOU RUNNING
12 FOR VICE CHAIR? IT WAS ON THE AGENDA, SO I WAS CURIOUS.

13

14 **KY-NAM MILLER:** NO. I DON'T MIND ABSOLUTELY IF YOU ARE GIVEN,
15 GIVE OPPORTUNITY TO STAND FOR IT SO ABSOLUTELY. FIVE
16 CANDIDATES BUT STARTING AGAIN LEFT TO RIGHT WITH MISS BENITEZ.

17

18 **DIANA BENITEZ:** THANK YOU FOR THE NOMINATION THAT I RECEIVED.
19 I'M HONORED TO BE CONSIDERED. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVEN'T MET
20 YET MY NAME IS DIANA BENITEZ. I'M A SENIOR PLANNER AT CANAL
21 ALLIANCE IN MARIN COUNTY AND A CONTRA COSTA COUNTY RESIDENT
22 I'VE SPENT OVER A DECADE WORKING AT THE INTERSECTION OF
23 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LAND USE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION AND
24 I PREVIOUSLY SERVED MORE THAN TWO YEARS ON THE POLICY ADVISORY
25 COUNCIL. I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THIS NEW COUNCIL BECAUSE IT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 BRINGS TOGETHER A WIDE RANGE OF LIVED AND PROFESSIONAL
2 EXPERIENCE AND THAT'S A REAL STRENGTH IT ALSO MEANS THAT WE
3 NEED STRONG FACILITATION AND STRUCTURE TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE
4 CAN PARTICIPATE MEANINGFULLY AND AS YOU ALREADY SAW IN MY
5 STATEMENT IF I'M SELECTED AS VICE CHAIR I WOULD FOCUS ON THREE
6 THINGS FIRST SUPPORTING WELL RUN WELL PACED MEETINGS AND WITH
7 CLEAR AGENDAS ACCESSIBLE MATERIALS AND HELPING US STAY FOCUSED
8 SO WE CAN MAKE THE MOST OF OUR TIME TOGETHER THE SECOND IS
9 MAKING SURE THAT EVERY MEMBER FEELS HEARD AND SUPPORTED WE ALL
10 BRING DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES AND PART OF THIS ROLE IS HELPING
11 TO CREATE THAT SPACE FOR THOSE PERSPECTIVES TO COME THROUGH
12 THIRD IS STRENGTHENING FEEDBACK LOOP WE HAVE BETWEEN THIS
13 COUNCIL AND MTC AND ABAG LEADERSHIP SO OUR INPUT IS CLEARLY
14 COMMUNICATED AND TRACKED AND RESPONDING IN A TIMELY WAY MAKES
15 IMPACT AND I SEE THE ROLE OF VICE CHAIR AS ONE OF STEWARDSHIP,
16 STEWARDSHIP IS MY THING SUPPORTING THE CHAIR AND HELPING
17 TRANSLATE POLICY WHEN NEEDED AND MAKING SURE THAT THIS COUNCIL
18 OPERATING WITH CLARITY EQUITY AND ACCOUNTABILITY. THANK YOU
19 FOR THE CONSIDERATION.

20

21 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER BENITEZ. COUNCIL
22 MEMBER LAVERY?

23

24 **CHARLES LAVERY:** CHARLIE LAVERY I APPRECIATE THE NOMINATION AND
25 OPPORTUNITY TO SERVE I'M A SAN MATEO RESIDENT, I LIVE IN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PACIFICA ON THE COAST SIDE I WORK IN BUNGING GAME MOST OF MY
2 WORK IS IN THE CITY I REALLY GET TO SEE A LOT OF THE BAY AREA
3 A LOT OF DIFFERENT TRANSIT CHALLENGES THAT WE FACE AND GOOD
4 CROSS SECTION OF THE POPULATION I REPRESENT CONSTRUCTION
5 WORKERS IN MY DAY JOB WORK FOR THE OPERATING ENGINEER'S UNION
6 I HAVE A LOT OF EXPERIENCE PASSING INFRASTRUCTURE
7 TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND RESILIENCY BALLOT MEASURES I HELPED
8 PASS -- I WAS CO-CHAIR OF MEASURE L IN THE CITY A COUPLE OF
9 YEARS AGO MEASURE B, CURRENTLY CO-CHAIR OF MEASURE A, WHICH IS
10 THE EARTHQUAKE SAFETY EMERGENCY RESPONSE BOND IN THE CITY. I
11 SERVE ON THE WORKFORCE INVESTMENT BOARD IN SAN FRANCISCO
12 WORKED ON MEASURE AA WHICH WAS WETLANDS RESTORATION, SB1 AND
13 RM3 SO I BRING THE BOARD RELATED EXPERIENCE TO THE COUNCIL I'M
14 PASSIONATE ABOUT EQUITY VALUE WHAT WE DO HERE I BELIEVE THAT
15 EVERY COMMUNITY SHOULD HAVE GOOD TRANSPORTATION, GOOD
16 INFRASTRUCTURE, AND GOOD HOUSING. AND I'M PASSIONATE ABOUT
17 MAKING SURE THE PEOPLE WHO DO THE WORK, THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
18 IMPACTED BY OUR POLICIES AND I BELIEVE IT'S THE ROLE OF THE
19 COUNCIL LEADERSHIP TO ENSURE THAT ALL SIDES OF A DISCUSSION
20 ARE HEARD AND THE OUTCOMES ARE BALANCED AND RESPECT AND
21 REFLECT ALL OF THOSE VOICES. I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING EITHER
22 AS A MEMBER OR PART OF THE LEADERSHIP OF THIS COUNCIL. THANKS.
23
24 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER LAVERY. COUNCIL MORE
25 COUNTY REL, WELCOME TO SUPPLEMENT YOUR PREVIOUS STATEMENT IF



APRIL 3, 2026

1 YOU WOULD LIKE.

2

3 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** I THINK I'LL STAND ON MY PREVIOUS STATEMENT
4 AND PERHAPS ADD THAT THE WORK IS, OBVIOUSLY, VERY, VERY
5 IMPORTANT, AND THE VICE CHAIR ROLE IS NOT JUST A SECOND CHAIR,
6 IT'S AN IMPORTANT ROLE AS WELL, AND I THINK BRINGING THOSE
7 THINGS TO THIS BOARD IS REALLY KEY TO THE SUCCESS OF THE
8 OPERATIONS HERE.

9

10 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU, SIR. COUNCIL MORE SHEPHARD, YOU HAVE
11 TWO MINUTES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS
14 MY INTEREST IN BEING VICE CHAIR. I HAVE CHAIRED HUD HOUSING
15 MEETINGS AS PRESIDENT AND CHAIRED POLICY CIVIL AN REVIEW BOARD
16 MEETINGS AS VICE CHAIR I WAS ALSO JUST CONFIRMED AS CHAIR OF
17 MY TOWN'S COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMISSION I HAVE BACKGROUND IN
18 AFFORDABLE HOUSING ESPECIALLY FOR SENIORS AND IN PUBLIC
19 TRANSPORTATION BECAUSE WITHIN THE LAST TWO YEARS BECAME
20 DEPENDENT ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION DUE TO VISION LOSS SO
21 MAKING THOSE TWO THINGS REALLY WORK HAVE BECOME EVEN MORE
22 IMPORTANT TO ME. IN ADDITION I HAVE FIRSHTHAND EXPERIENCE
23 CHAIRING ALSO BEEN PROVIDING TRAINING IN MY 2024 BOARD
24 COMMISSION'S LEARNING INSTITUTE OFTEN CALLED BCLI WITH HELPFUL
25 TOOLS WHEN CHAIRING A MEETING. FOR EXAMPLE, HOW TO AMEND A



APRIL 3, 2026

1 MOTION, TO MODIFY, APPROVE OR CORRECT THE ORIGINALLY PROPOSED
2 MOTION. USING TECHNIQUES, LIKE THIS ONE, ENSURES THAT WE
3 PROVIDE THE BEST OUTCOME FOR COMMUNITIES THAT WE SERVE MY LIFE
4 EXPERIENCES HAVE SHOWN ME HOW TO FACILITATE A MEETING WHEN
5 TOPICS ARE SENSITIVE AND EMOTIONS ARE PASSIONATE. MY STYLE IS
6 ENCOURAGE ALL OPINIONS AND ASK THAT EVERYONE SHOW RESPECT FOR
7 OPINIONS THAT DIFFER FROM THEIRS. I HUMBLY OFFER MY
8 EXPERIENCE, KNOWING THAT THERE ARE MANY GOOD CANDIDATES. SO,
9 WHOEVER WE SELECT, I KNOW WE'RE OFF TO A REWARDING AND
10 PRODUCTIVE YEAR. I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU.

11

12 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER. MEMBER MILES?

13

14 **R. SHAY MILES:** GOOD MORNING. I'M ASKING FOR YOUR VOTE FOR VICE
15 CHAIR BECAUSE MY BACKGROUND HAS MANAGED INITIATIVES FROM THE
16 GROUND UP I HAVE TANG MY CORPORATE STRATEGY ORGANIZATIONAL
17 GROWTH AND CARRIED IT INTO, A COMMUNITY DEVELOPER BY CHOICE
18 AND I BELIEVE THIS NEW COUNCIL NEEDS LEADERSHIP THAT IS
19 ORGANIZED GROUNDED AND DEEPLY CONNECTED TO THE PEOPLE MOST
20 AFFECTED BY OUR DECISIONS I DO NOT COME TO THIS WORK WITH
21 DISTANCE FROM LIVED EXPERIENCE OR ONLY THROUGH DATA ANALYSIS,
22 MY WORK IS EMBEDDED IN IMPACTED COMMUNITIES ON A REGULAR
23 BASIS, AS A BOARD TREASURER OF HOUSE OF ACT WHICH IS A
24 RECOVERY PROGRAM AS FOUNDER AND CHAIR OF THE 707 COMMITTEE
25 WHICH IS A REGIONAL ACTIVATION, CIVIC CULTURAL ACTIVATION THAT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 HAS MOBILIZED SOLANO COUNTY AND AS A VALLEJO ECONOMIC
2 DEVELOPMENT COMMISSIONER, AS WELL AS COMMUNITY INVESTMENT AND
3 COSMETIC OPPORTUNITY. I UNDERSTAND WHAT IT MEANS WHEN SYSTEMS
4 DO NOT REACH PEOPLE, AND I ALSO UNDERSTAND WHAT IT TAKES TO
5 HELP COMMUNITIES MOVE FORWARD WITH DIGNITY, TRUST, AND REAL
6 PARTNERSHIP. I'M ALSO PREPARED TO DO THE WORK OF LEADERSHIP
7 WELL. I WOULD BRING TIME COMMITMENT, THOUGHTFUL PREPARATION,
8 FOLLOW THROUGH, AND A STRONG APTITUDE FOR ORGANIZATIONAL
9 EXCELLENCE. I KNOW HOW TO HELP GROUPS STAY FOCUSED,
10 CONSTRUCTIVE, AND ALIGNED AROUND SHARED PURPOSE. I STEPPED
11 FORWARD BECAUSE SOLANO COUNTY'S VOICE MATTERS IN THIS REGION,
12 AND BECAUSE I BELIEVE THIS COUNCIL HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO BUILD
13 THE RIGHT CULTURE FROM THE BEGINNING, INCLUSIVE, CREDIBLE, AND
14 COMMUNITY CENTERED AND EFFECTIVE. IF EFFECTIVE, I WOULD BE
15 HONORED TO SUPPORT THE CHAIR, HELP STRENGTHEN THIS COUPLE'S
16 FOUNDATION AND SERVE WITH INTEGRITY ON BEHALF OF THE
17 COMMUNITIES COUNTING ON US. I WOULD BE TRULY DISH WOULD TRULY
18 APPRECIATE YOUR VOTE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER MILES. AND ALL THE
21 COUNCIL MEMBERS WHO STEPPED UP FOR THIS LEADERSHIP
22 OPPORTUNITY. SO, ONCE AGAIN, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE VOTES AND
23 QUESTIONS. MISS LIEU DID YOU HAVE A QUESTION FIRST?

24

25 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** YES WOULD YOU AUDIBLE TO NAME LIKE YOU DID



APRIL 3, 2026

1 IN THE LAST ELECTION THE VOTES IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO
2 DO?

3

4 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THE MAGIC NUMBER IS STILL 13. SO THERE IS FIVE
5 CANDIDATES SO ABSENT ANY CANDIDATE GETTING 13 IN A SINGLE
6 ROUND THEN THE CANDIDATE WITH THE LOWEST NUMBER OF VOTES WILL
7 BE REMOVED AND WE'LL DO A REVOTE AND WE'LL RINSE AND REPEAT
8 UNTIL WE GET TO THE MAGIC NUMBER 13. AND SO FRED IS GOING TO
9 RUN THAT AND WE'RE GOING TO ASK YOU AGAIN TO SAY THE NAME OF
10 YOUR PREFERRED CANDIDATE AND I'LL REPEAT NOW. IT'S COUNCIL
11 MEMBERS DIANA BENITEZ, CHARLIE LAVERY, CHUCK CANTRELL, SONJA
12 SHEPHARD AND SAY MILES. WITH THAT I'LL PASS IT TO FRED.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARVELO?

15

16 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** FIRST OF ALL, LIKE, YEAH, OBVIOUSLY WE HAVE
17 SO MANY OBVIOUSLY QUALIFIED CANDIDATES AND I FEEL SO LUCKY
18 JUST TO EVEN BE IN A ROOM WITH ALL OF YOU, BUT MY VOTE IS
19 GOING TO GO TO CHUCK CANTRELL.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** PADMA BALAJI?

22

23 **PADMA BALAJI:** MILES.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MICHAEL BALDINI?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** LAVERY?

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ?

5

6 **DIANA BENITEZ:** BENITEZ.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL?

9

10 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** CANTRELL.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG?

13

14 **AMANDA CHANG:** BENITEZ.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN?

17

18 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** BENITEZ.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES.

21

22 **ASHTON DESMANGLES:** SHEPHARD.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **BRYANT DUONG:** BENITEZ.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** GERASIMENKO?

4

5 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** BENITEZ.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HANKERSON?

8

9 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** CAN YOU COME BACK TO ME? [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?

12

13 **WENDI KALLINS:** BENITEZ.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAVERY?

16

17 **CHARLES LAVERY:** LAVERY.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MADRID?

20

21 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** BENITEZ.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** R. SHAY MILES?

24

25 **R. SHAY MILES:** MILES.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MIRANTE?

3

4 **LOUIS MIRANTE:** BENITEZ.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEMSICK?

7

8 **KAREN NEMSICK:** MILES.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAATHODD- HARSHFIELD?

11

12 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD:** MILES.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SALAZAR?

15

16 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** BENITEZ.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAUNDERS?

19

20 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** BENITEZ.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SBRANTI?

23

24 **TIM SBRANTI:** LAVERY.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SHEPHARD?

2

3 **SONJA SHEPHARD:** SHEPHARD.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TRACHTENBERG IS NOT PRESENT. LIEU?

6

7 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** BENITEZ.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WONG?

10

11 **JANELLE WONG:** BENITEZ.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES?

14

15 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** BENITEZ.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HANKERSON?

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** SHEPHARD.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MILES, FOUR VOTES; SHEPHARD, THREE VOTES;

22 BENITEZ, 13 VOTES; LAVERY, THREE VOTES; CANTRELL, TWO VOTES.

23

24 **KY-NAM MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. WITH THAT, ACCORDING TO THE

25 PROCEDURES, WE'RE GOING TO DO A REVOTE AND TAKING COUNCIL



APRIL 3, 2026

1 MEMBER CANTRELL FOR --

2

3 **SPEAKER:** WAIT -- WAIT. WE HAVE A MAJORITY.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WE HAVE 13.

6

7 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH. [LAUGHTER] FORGIVE ME. I WAS GAMING OUT
8 THE REVOTES. SO, CONGRATULATIONS COUNCIL MEMBER BENITEZ. YOU
9 MADE THE MAGIC NUMBER. APOLOGIES FOR MY MISFIRE. FOR THAT, I'M
10 HAPPY TO HAND OVER MY DUTIES AS CHAIR TO THE NEW CHAIR, CARINA
11 LIEU. CONGRATULATIONS TO MISS LIEU.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARE WE GOING TO AFFIRM THE VOTE? MR.
14 MILLER, ARE WE GOING TO TAKE A MOTION TO AFFIRM THE VOTE?

15

16 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH LET ME FINISH UP MY DUTIES. SO, WITH THAT
17 I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION TO ADOPT THESE NEW LEADERS
18 NOTING THE TALLIES THAT FRED JUST MENTIONED. NOW I'LL HAVE YOU
19 REPEAT IT, FRED. I THINK IT WAS 24-1 ON THE CHAIR AND WHAT WAS
20 THE VICE CHAIR?

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VOTE FOR LIEU WAS 24 VOTES FOR LIEU, THE
23 VOTE FOR BENITEZ WAS 13.

24

25 **KY-NAM MILLER:** OKAY. SO IF I COULD GET A MOTION TO AFFIRM THAT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 VOTE. MISS SHEPHARD ARE YOU RAISING YOUR HAND?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION TO AFFIRM THE VOTE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

6

7 **KY-NAM MILLER:** OKAY AGAIN THE MOTION IS TO AFFIRM THE
8 LEADERSHIP VOTES JUST TAKEN AS NUMERICALLY DESCRIBED BY FRED
9 CASTRO OUR CLERK NAMING CHAIR CARINA LIEU AS CHAIR, AND VICE
10 CHAIR DIANA BENITEZ AS VICE CHAIR. AND DO WE HAVE A SECOND ON
11 MISS SHEPHARD?

12

13 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** KY-NAM I THINK MR. BALDINI HAS
14 SOMETHING HE WOULD LIKE TO SHARE.

15

16 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO PROPOSE WITHIN THIS IS
17 THAT WE REVOTE FOR BOTH POSITIONS TO SHOW UNANIMOUS SUPPORT
18 FOR OUR NEWLY ELECTED CHAIR AND OUR NEWLY ELECTED VICE CHAIR
19 SO THAT IT DOESN'T REPORT-OUT TO THE MTC THAT WE'RE DIVIDED
20 AMONG OUR LEADERSHIP.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** IF THAT'S THE MOTION, I'LL SECOND THAT.

23

24 **KY-NAM MILLER:** JUST READING, OUR COUNSEL IS AT THE TABLE AND
25 HE SAYS YEAH, I MEAN, WE CAN'T GUARANTEE THAT IT WILL BE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 UNANIMOUS, BUT YOU CAN TAKE THIS MOTION AND VOTE FOR IT BUT
2 THAT'S EMBRACING THIS RESULT. ARE YOU SUGGESTING, MR. BALDINI,
3 THAT WE REMOVE THE TALLIES FROM THE DESCRIPTION.

4

5 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THAT'S CORRECT THAT WE BE UNANIMOUS IN OUR
6 SUPPORT FOR OUR LEADERSHIP.

7

8 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THEN LET'S NOT DO -- LET'S JUST REDO THIS
9 MOTION SINCE THERE HASN'T BEEN A SECOND AND THE TALLIES ARE
10 NOTED IN THE MINUTES IF EVERYONE REALLY WANTS TO FIND OUT.
11 MISS SHEPHARD?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THAT WAS GOING TO BE MY COMMENT I THINK THE TALLY
14 SHOULD REMAIN SO PEOPLE KNEW WHERE THEY STAND I DON'T REALLY
15 AGREE WITH REDOING THE MOTION IT'S OKAY FOR PEOPLE TO VOTE AND
16 DISAGREE. [LAUGHTER] I DON'T AGREE WITH IT.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD ARGUE THAT BOTH THINGS ARE TRUE I THINK IT'S
19 ACTUALLY GOOD TO HAVE -- THE TALLIES ARE IN THE MINUTE AND I
20 BEING THAT'S FINE BECAUSE WE'RE VOTING AMONGST TWO PEOPLE,
21 FIVE PEOPLE, I THINK THAT'S VERY FAIR AND IS ACCURATE AND
22 SHOULD BE IN THE MINUTES BUT I WHOLEHEARTEDLY SUPPORT A MOTION
23 WHERE WE COULD POTENTIALLY HAVE UNANIMOUS CONSENT FOR THE TWO
24 NOW THAT WE KNOW WHO THE MAJORITY SUPPORT. I THINK BOTH CAN BE
25 DONE.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **KY-NAM MILLER:** COUNCIL MEMBER MILES DO YOU HAVE A COMMENT ON
3 THIS?

4

5 **R. SHAY MILES:** I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE MAINTAINING
6 SOME AUTHENTICITY HERE. I DON'T SEE IT THE SAME WAY AS BEING
7 DIVIDED AMONGST LEADERSHIP. I DO SEE IT AS WE ALL HAVE
8 DIFFERENT STRENGTHS AND WE ALL GRAVITATED, OR WERE DRAWN IN A
9 CERTAIN WAY. SO, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE MAINTAINING
10 OUR AUTHENTICITY, THIS IS A NEW COUNCIL AND I JUST WANT TO
11 MAKE SURE WE'RE STARTING OFF ON THE RIGHT FOOT.

12

13 **KY-NAM MILLER:** MR. CANTRELL.

14

15 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** I WANT TO SECOND IT. YOU KNOW WE DON'T REDO
16 ELECTIONS TO GATHER CONSENT FROM EVERYONE. I AM FULLY
17 OFFICIALLY THROWING MY SUPPORT BEHIND THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR
18 BUT DON'T THINK WE NEED IT RECOUNT A VOTE TO DO THAT.

19

20 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WITH THAT SAID THE EXISTING MOTION HASN'T BEEN
21 SECONDED IS TO INCLUDE THE TALLIES ON IT AND AS A MATTER OF
22 PROCEDURE I THINK WE COULD GET --

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** I'LL SECOND IT.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WHOEVER'S THE SECOND? KALLINS?

2

3 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND I SECOND TO DO THE ORIGINAL.

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WERE INCLUDED IN THE TALLY. I SEE MR.

6 HANKERSON. MR. MADRID, MR. HANKERSON FIRST.

7

8 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I HOPE I'M ON POINT. BUT I WOULD NOT LIKE TO

9 REVOTE I THINK IF YOU GIVE ME OPPORTUNITY TO REVOTE ON THE

10 VOTES I WAS REALLY UP IN THE AIR WHO I WANTED TO PICK SO I

11 COULD CHANGE MY VOTE SO JUST FOR CLARITY WE'RE NOT REVOTING ON

12 THE CANDIDATES?

13

14 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WE'RE JUST REAFFIRMING THE VOTES YOU ALL JUST

15 TOOK. MR. MADRID?

16

17 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** I WAS TRYING TO SECOND IT, MY SUGGESTION IN

18 THE FIRST IS THAT I THINK BEFORE WE ELECT NEW LEADERSHIP I

19 THINK WE SHOULD GET TO KNOW EACH OTHER BEFORE VOTING THE NEW

20 PEOPLE. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW, NO OFFENSE TO NEWLY ELECTED

21 LEADERSHIP, WE HARDLY KNOW EACH OTHER. I JUST WANT TO MAKE A

22 COMMENT.

23

24 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU FOR THAT COUNCIL MEMBER MADRID, JUST

25 NOTING YOU WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO SELECT NEW LEADERSHIP IN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 JANUARY 2028 WHEN THIS BRIEF HALF TERM ENDS THEN YOU WILL HAVE
2 THE NEXT OPPORTUNITY. MISS KALLINS?

3

4 **WENDI KALLINS:** I JUST WANT TO SAY, I MEAN YOU KNOW I VOTED FOR
5 PEOPLE WHO WERE ON OUR OLDER MTC COUNCIL BUT THE PEOPLE WHO
6 WERE RUNNING WHO ARE NEW I WANT TO HONOR THEM. I REALLY SAW
7 SOME REALLY TRUE OPPORTUNITIES FOR NEW LEADERSHIP COMING UP.
8 AND I DON'T WANT TO DISHONOR THEM BY REQUIRING US TO HAVE
9 UNANIMOUS CONSENT.

10

11 **KY-NAM MILLER:** COUNCIL MEMBER?

12

13 **PADMA BALAJI:** CLARIFYING QUESTION. IS THE A MOTION TO KEEP THE
14 ORIGINAL TALES OR RETAKE THE TALES IN THE FINAL REPORT.

15

16 **KY-NAM MILLER:** TO KEEP THE TALLIES AS NOTED, BUT YOU'RE VOTING
17 AFFIRMING THOSE VOTES. ALL RIGHT. SO WITH THAT, JUST FOR THE
18 RECORD SO THAT IT CAN BE ENTERED INTO GRANICUS OR ONLINE
19 SYSTEM WE CAN PLEASE DO ROLL CALL AS THE MOTION PREVIOUSLY
20 DESCRIBING AFFIRMING TALLY COINCIDENT FOR CARINA LIEU AS CHAIR
21 AND DIANA BENITEZ VICE CHAIR AS THE NEW COUNCIL LEADERSHIP,
22 MR. CASTRO.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THE MOTION BY SHEPHARD, SECOND BY
25 KALLINS.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARVELO?

3

4 **VICTORINA ARVELO:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALAJI?

7

8 **PADMA BALAJI:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BALDINI.

11

12 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ?

15

16 **DIANA BENITEZ:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL?

19

20 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG?

23

24 **AMANDA CHANG:** AYE.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN?

2

3 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES?

6

7 **ASHTON DESMANGLES:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?

10

11 **BRYANT DUONG:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** GERASIMENKO?

14

15 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HANKERSON?

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?

22

23 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAVERY?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHARLES LAVERY: AYE.**

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MADRID?**

5

6 **ALEXANDER MADRID: YES.**

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MILES?**

9

10 **R. SHAY MILES: AYE.**

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: MIRANTE?**

13

14 **LOUIS MIRANTE: YES.**

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: NEMSICK?**

17

18 **KAREN NEMSICK: AYE.**

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD?**

21

22 **PETER SAATHODD-HARSHFIELD: AYE.**

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SALAZAR?**

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAUNDERS?

4

5 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** AFFIRM.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SBRANTI?

8

9 **TIM SBRANTI:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SHEPHARD?

12

13 **SONJA SHEPHARD:** AYE. TRACHTENBER IS NOT PRESENT. LIEU?

14

15 **CARINA VINH LIEU:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WONG?

18

19 **JANELLE WONG:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES?

22

23 **GABRIELA YAMILET ORANTES:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PRESENT.

2

3 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** WELL THANK YOU EVERYONE. I LOOK
4 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH EVERYONE AND APPRECIATE ALL THE ROBUST
5 DISCUSSION SO FAR. VERY EXCITING. WE'LL START WITH AGENDA ITEM
6 7A VITAL SIGNS WEBSITE AND DATA UPDATE. OVERVIEW OF RECENT
7 UPDATES TO MTC ABAG VITAL SIGNS PERFORMANCE MONITORING
8 INITIATIVE AND PREVIEW OF KEY FINDINGS FROM THE LATEST DATA
9 REFRESHES. THIS IS AN MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL
10 INFORMATION ITEM. ELLIOTT HUANG, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE
11 REPORT.

12

13 **ELLIOT HUANG:** ALL RIGHT THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR LIEU AND
14 MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL, AND CONGRATULATIONS TO CHAIR LIEU AND
15 VICE CHAIR ON YOUR RECENT ELECTION. MY NAME IS ELLIOTT HUANG
16 DATA SCIENTIST IN DATA STRATEGY ANALYTICS DEPARTMENT AT MTC
17 PROJECT MANAGER OF THE VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM. TODAY I WILL
18 PRESENT THE VITAL SIGNS APRIL 2026 UPDATE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
19 SO, I'LL FIRST TALK ABOUT THE OVERALL PURPOSE AND GOALS OF THE
20 VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM, AND PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT ON HOW THIS
21 PROGRAM HAS EVOLVED AND CONTINUES TO EVOLVE OVER TIME. THIS
22 BACKGROUND INFORMATION WILL BE ESPECIALLY USEFUL FOR THOSE ON
23 THE COUNCIL WHO ARE MAYBE NOT AS FAMILIAR WITH VITAL SIGNS.
24 FROM THERE I'LL SHARE SOME TECHNICAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON
25 SOME IMPROVEMENTS WE ARE BEEN MAKING TO THE PLATFORM AND WHY



APRIL 3, 2026

1 THOSE ARE IMPORTANT. AND, FINALLY I'LL SHARE SOME INSIGHTS
2 ABOUT WHAT THE UPDATED VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS ARE ACTUALLY
3 TELLING US ABOUT THE BAY AREA. SO, ABOUT VITAL SIGNS, VITAL
4 SIGNS IS AN MTC ABAG WEBSITE THAT OFFERS DATA VISUALIZATIONS
5 AND CONTEXTUALIZED NARRATIVES ON IMPORTANT TRENDS IN THE BAY
6 AREA ACROSS FIVE TOPIC AREAS, LAND AND PEOPLE, TRANSPORTATION,
7 THE ECONOMY, THE ENVIRONMENT, AND EQUITY. VITAL SIGNS CONSISTS
8 OF 41 INDICATORS AND CONTAINS HUNDREDS OF CHARTS, MAPS, AND AT
9 THAT TIME SETS. OVERALL, VITAL SIGNS HELPS US TRACK TRENDS AND
10 MAKE INFORMED DECISIONS TOWARDS ACHIEVING OUR POLICY GOALS.
11 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO VITAL SIGNS WAS ORIGINALLY LAUNCHED IN
12 2015 WITH CLOSE TIES TO PLANNED BAY AREA. OVER TIME WE HAVE
13 MADE IMPROVEMENTS TO THE SITE SUCH AS A VISUAL REDESIGN THAT
14 WAS LAUNCHED IN 2023. WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE DATA PIPELINE
15 OPTIMIZATION PHASE OF THE PROJECT, WHICH I CAN TALK ABOUT MORE
16 ON THE NEXT SLIDE, BUT AT A HIGH LEVEL IT'S REALLY ABOUT
17 KEEPING THE DATA ON VITAL SIGNS AS UP-TO-DATE AS POSSIBLE.
18 LOOKING AHEAD TO THE FUTURE, WE EXPECT VITAL SIGNS TO CONTINUE
19 WITH EVOLUTION BY ADDING POTENTIALLY NEW INDICATORS OR
20 DROPPING INDICATORS THAT HAVE PERHAPS BECOME LESS RELEVANT
21 OVER TIME. OVERALL, THE PLATFORM IS EVOLVING TOWARDS AN
22 AUTOMATED SYSTEM THAT KEEPS THE REGION'S DATA CURRENT,
23 ACCURATE, AND RELATIVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO ONE SLIDE ABOUT
24 THE DATA PIPELINE, REALLY ADDRESSING HISTORICAL CHALLENGE THAT
25 VITAL SIGNS HAS HAD WITH KEEPING THE HUNDREDS OF DATA SETS UP-



APRIL 3, 2026

1 TO-DATE. THIS PROCESS WAS ORIGINALLY SLOW AND HIGHLY MANUAL.
2 THE SOLUTION WE IMPLEMENTED HERE IS AN AUTOMATED DATA PIPELINE
3 THAT CAN UPDATE THE VITAL SIGNS DATA SET AS SOON AS THE
4 UNDERLYING SOURCE DATA IS AVAILABLE FROM, FOR EXAMPLE, THE
5 U.S. CENSUS BUREAU. THE ANALOGY THAT I LIKE TO USE IS THAT
6 WE'RE BUILDING A TOYOTA FACTORY, WITH THE DATA PIPELINE WE NOW
7 HAVE STANDARDIZED PARTS, AUTOMATED PROCESSES, AND A
8 STREAMLINED PRODUCTION PROCESS THAT OUTPUTS THOSE UPDATED
9 VITAL SIGNS DATA SETS VERY QUICKLY. THIS WAS NOT THE CASE
10 BEFORE THE DATA PIPELINE AND NOW WE HAVE ONE. BY THE END OF
11 THE CALENDAR YEAR WE EXPECT ALL OF THE VITAL SIGNS ON THE
12 WEBSITE TO BE ON-BOARDED TO THE NEW AUTOMATED DATA PIPELINE
13 PROCESS. REALLY THE KEY TAKEAWAY HERE IS THAT OUR ABILITY TO
14 UPDATE THE DATA SETS QUICKLY KEEP THE SITE UP-TO-DATE WILL
15 ALLOW US TO RELIABLY TRACK REGIONAL PROGRESS TOWARDS REGIONAL
16 PRIORITIES AND RESULT IN STRONGER REGIONAL DATA DRIVEN
17 DECISION-MAKING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THE ULTIMATE PURPOSE
18 OF VITAL SIGNS IS TO HELP US KEEP TRACK OF TRENDS IN THE BAY
19 AREA, WITH THE UPDATED DATA PIPELINE WE CAN NOW REPORT ON THE
20 LATEST UPDATES FOR AROUND HALF OF THE INDICATORS ARE ON THE
21 SITE. SO, WHAT ARE THE INDICATORS TELLING US NOW? AT A VERY
22 HIGH-LEVEL, THE INDICATORS ARE SHOWING US A LEVEL OF POST-
23 PANDEMIC ADJUSTMENTS WITH SOME INDICATORS SHOWING NEW TRENDS
24 AND SOME INDICATORS SHOWING CONTINUING OR EVEN ACCELERATING
25 PRE-PANDEMIC TRENDS. ON THE NEXT FEW SLIDES WE'LL DIVE A



APRIL 3, 2026

1 LITTLE BIT DEEPER INTO THE VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS AND WE'LL
2 TALK THROUGH WHAT SOME OF THEM ARE TELLING US ABOUT THE
3 REGION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, FOR THE LAND AND PEOPLE
4 CATEGORY, TWO INDICATORS HERE, POPULATION AND HOUSING. YOU CAN
5 SEE ON THE CHART HERE THERE WAS INDEED A PANDEMIC DIP IN
6 REGIONAL POPULATION. WE ARE SEEING SLOW AND STEADY GROWTH
7 COMING OUT OF THE PANDEMIC -- BLESS YOU -- WITH 50,000
8 RESIDENTS ADDED FROM 2022 TO 2025. ZOOMING OUT, THE PATTERN WE
9 SEE IS ACTUALLY FAIRLY CONSISTENT WITH THE EBBS AND FLOWS OF
10 POPULATION GROWTH IN THE BAY AREA OVER THE PAST DECADE. FOR
11 EXAMPLE, IN THE EARLY 2000s DURING THE DOT COM BUBBLE, WE SAW
12 SOME LEVEL OF SLOWER POPULATION GROWTH FOLLOWED BY LARGE
13 GROWTH PERIOD DURING THE 20 TENS. AT THE SAME TIME THE HOUSING
14 PRODUCTION INDICATOR WE SEE THE HOUSING PRODUCTION HAS NOT
15 KEPT UP WITH POPULATION GROWTH OVER THE RECENT DECADES THIS
16 CONTRIBUTE TO THE HOUSING AFFORDABILITY CHALLENGES THAT WE
17 FACE TODAY WHICH IS REALLY JUST A BACKLOG OF EXISTING NEEDS.
18 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR TRANSPORTATION SPOTLIGHT WE HAVE THE
19 COMMUTE MODE SHARE INDICATOR THIS SHOWS RELATIVE SHARE OF
20 DIFFERENT TRAVEL MODES THAT PEOPLE TAKE TO WORK FOR COMMUTE
21 BASED TRIPS. THROUGHOUT THE 20 TENS COMMUTE MODE SHARE WAS
22 ACTUALLY RELATIVELY STABLE WITH SOME DRIVING TO WORK EVEN SHOW
23 SLOW STEADY DECLINE. DURING THE PANDEMIC AS WE ALL KNOW THERE
24 WAS A SHARP INCREASE IN WORKING FROM HOME. IT PEAKED AT AROUND
25 33% IN THE MIDDLE OF THE PANDEMIC BUT HERE ON THE CHART WE SEE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS ARE STABILIZING AT AROUND 17% AS OF THE
2 2024 LATEST DATA AVAILABLE TRANSIT PRE-PANDEMIC HORRIFIED AT
3 AROUND 12 TO 13% DROPS DURING THE PANDEMIC AS WE ALL KNOW AND
4 NOW IS BACK UP AT AROUND 7.7% AGAIN AS OF 2024. NEXT SLIDE
5 PLEASE. SO VMT, OR VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED IS A GOOD MEASURE OF
6 GENERAL DRIVING ACTIVITY IN THE REGION. HERE REPORTING VMT PER
7 CAPITA JUST TO ADJUST FOR POPULATION FLUCTUATIONS WE SEE VMT
8 PER CAPITA IS DOWN AROUND 15% FROM PRE-PANDEMIC NOW STABLE AND
9 INCREASINGLY SHOWING A SLIGHT INCREASING TREND. OVERALL, THE
10 SUMMARY OF THE TRANSPORTATION INDICATORS, WE APPEAR TO BE
11 APPROACHING WHAT COULD BE CONSIDERED A NEW STEADY STATE AFTER
12 THE INITIAL PANDEMIC SHOCK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR ECONOMY
13 INDICATORS WE'RE HIGHLIGHTING INCOME, INCOME INEQUALITY AND
14 HOME VALUES ALL WHICH ARE SHOWING AN INCREASING 20 AND OF
15 COURSE ALL RELATED THE CHART HERE WE'RE SHOWING HOUSEHOLD
16 INCOME BY PERCENTILE WE SEE 90th PERCENTILE OF AROUND 420K IN
17 THE BAY AREA SO 90th PERCENTILE THAT JUST MEANS THAT 90% OF
18 HOUSEHOLDS MAKE LESS THAN THAT AMOUNT 90% OF HOUSEHOLDS MAKE
19 LESS THAN 420K, 10% MAKE MORE. I LIKE TO THINK OF IT AS THE
20 TOP 10% AMONG THAT GROUP, THE LOWEST HOUSEHOLD INCOME IS 420K,
21 10% OF BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS MAKE MORE THAN THAT. SO, WE CAN USE
22 THE 90TH AND 10th PERCENTILE NUMBERS TO QUANTIFY INCOME
23 INEQUALITY. WE BASICALLY TAKE THE RATIO WHEN WE LOOK AT RATIO
24 COMPARING FROM 2005 TO 2024, WE SEE THE RATIO INCREASING.
25 WHICH IS A WAY TO QUANTIFY THE DEGREE TO WHICH INCOME



APRIL 3, 2026

1 INEQUALITY IS INCREASING. WE CAN SEE FROM THE CHART, THE RED
2 LINE REPRESENTING 90th PERCENTILE GROWING FASTER THAN THE BLUE
3 LINE WHICH REPRESENTS 10th PERCENTILE, ALSO GROWING FASTER
4 THAN THE ORANGE LINE REPRESENTING 50th PERCENTILE, WHICH IS
5 ALSO KNOWN AS MEDIAN INCOME. HOME VALUES, ANOTHER ECONOMIC
6 INDICATOR, ARE ALSO SHOWING UPWARDS TREND 77% INCREASE IN
7 TYPICAL HOME VALUE FROM 2012 THROUGH 2025. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT WE
8 HAVE THE EQUITY INDICATOR. DO WANT TO NOTE THAT I DID SKIP
9 OVER THE ENVIRONMENT CATEGORY. WE DON'T HAVE UPDATES FOR THOSE
10 INDICATORS AT THIS TIME BUT. THOSE ARE SCHEDULED FOR THIS
11 YEAR; JUST WANT TO FLAG THAT BECAUSE IT'S A CATEGORY IN VITAL
12 SIGNS AND OF COURSE VERY IMPORTANT TOPIC FOR THE BAY AREA
13 CONTINUING WITH THE EQUITY INDICATORS OUR SPOTLIGHT HERE IS
14 JOBS BY WAGE LEVEL HERE WE SEE THROUGHOUT DIFFERENT SUBREGIONS
15 IN THE BAY AREA THE SHARE OF MIDDLE WAGE JOBS ORANGE LINE --
16 SORRY -- GREEN LIGHT IN THE CHART SLOWLY DECLINING OVER TIME
17 MEANING THAT JOBS ARE INCREASINGLY BECOMING EITHER HIGH WAGE
18 OR LOW WAGE WITH FEWER MIDDLE WAGE JOBS ANOTHER EQUITY
19 INDICATOR HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, HEADLINE STATISTIC THERE IS
20 MORE THAN 40% OF REPRESENTER HOUSEHOLDS RENTER HOUSEHOLDS
21 SPENT MORE THAN 30% OF THEIR GROSS INCOME ON HOUSING SO MORE
22 THAN 30% WHICH IS THE THRESHOLD CONSIDERED FOR HOUSING COST
23 BURDEN SO ALMOST HALF OF RENTER HOUSEHOLDS ARE CONSIDERED
24 HOUSING COST BURDENED IN THE BAY AREA. SO THAT CONCLUDES THE
25 INDICATOR REVIEW. JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THESE INDICATORS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 AND SEVERAL MORE ARE AVAILABLE ON THE VITAL SIGNS WEBSITE AND
2 ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO TAKE A LOOK AT THAT SITE IF YOU HAVEN'T
3 ALREADY AND FEEL FREE TO BROWSE THROUGH IT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
4 SO, WITH THIS SLIDE I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF WAYS THE
5 VITAL SIGNS PROGRAM IS BEING INTEGRATED INTO OTHER PROGRAMS
6 ACROSS THE ORGANIZATION. KEY ITEM HERE IS OF COURSE PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WHERE VITAL SIGNS IS PLAYING A ROLE IN
8 SUPPORTING THE TRACKING OF PERFORMANCE METRICS ALIGNED WITH
9 THE PLAN'S GOALS AND STRATEGIES. WE ARE PLANNING A PLANNED BAY
10 AREA SPECIFIC WEB PAGE WITHIN VITAL SIGNS, THE LAUNCH IS
11 ANTICIPATED LATER THIS YEAR. KEY TAKEAWAY IS THAT VITAL SIGNS
12 CAN BE USED AS INPUT INTO OTHER PROGRAMS AND AGENCY
13 INITIATIVES IN ORDER TO REDUCE DUPLICATIVE WORK AND ADVANCE
14 THE AGENCY'S GOAL OF OPERATIONAL EXCELLENCE. NEXT SLIDE
15 PLEASE. SO, WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW NEAR AND MEDIUM TERM
16 GOALS SO WE ALL KNOW WHERE VITAL SIGNS IS KIND OF HEADED HERE.
17 TOP PRIORITY, OF COURSE, IS TO TRANSITION ALL OF THE EXISTING
18 VITAL SIGNS INDICATORS INTO THAT AUTOMATED DATA PIPELINE TO
19 DELIVER THOSE FAST DATA UPDATES. SOME OF THE DATA ON VITAL
20 SIGNS NOT QUITE SUPER UP-TO-DATE SO IMPLEMENTING AND FINISHING
21 THE WORK OF THAT DATA PIPELINE IS GOING TO ENSURE THAT ALL THE
22 DATA ON VITAL SIGNS IS UP-TO-DATE. AFTER THAT, THERE IS AN
23 OPPORTUNITY TO EVALUATE THE PORTFOLIO OF EXISTING INDICATORS.
24 OVER TIME SOME INDICATORS HAVE BECOME LESS RELEVANT, NEW
25 INDICATORS OR TOPICS COULD BECOME MORE RELEVANT AND THAT'S



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WHERE THAT DISCUSSION -- THAT'S WHERE WE CAN HAVE THAT
2 DISCUSSION IN TERMS OF POTENTIALLY ADDING OR RETIRING OLDER
3 INDICATORS. THIS DOES INCLUDE AN IMPROVED APPROACH OF HOW WE
4 CONSIDER EQUITY ON THE SITE. WE DO HAVE THE EQUITY INDICATOR
5 CATEGORY. THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT NEW EQUITY
6 INDICATORS, AS WELL AS WEAVE EQUITY INTO EXISTING INDICATORS.
7 EQUITY IS NOT SOMETHING THAT STAND ON ITS OWN IT CAN BE FOUND
8 IN A LOT OF DIFFERENT TOPICS ACROSS THE PORTFOLIO OF
9 INDICATORS. AND THEN FINALLY, OF COURSE LOOK FOR OUR
10 OPPORTUNITIES TO INTEGRATE VITAL SIGNS INTO STRATEGIC
11 INITIATIVES ACROSS AGENCIES AND REDUCE THAT DUPLICATIVE WORK
12 AND INCREASE OPERATIONAL EXCELLENCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THAT
13 CONCLUDES THE MAIN BENEFITTED PRESENTATION. WE DO HAVE SOME
14 QUESTIONS HERE FOR THE COUNCIL JUST TO SPARK SOME DISCUSSION
15 HERE. WHEN YOU LOOK AT VITAL SIGNS WHAT INFORMATION FEELS
16 RELEVANT OR LEAST RELEVANT FOR THE COMMUNITIES THAT YOU
17 REPRESENT WHAT PARTS OF THE SITE FEEL EASIEST TO UNDERSTAND
18 AND DO YOU HAVE ANY FEEDBACK TO MAKE THE SITE MORE USEFUL?
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU, ELLIOTT. IS THERE ANY
22 COUNCIL MEMBER WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? MEMBER
23 CANTRELL. SORRY. CAN YOU PUT YOUR HANDS UP ONE MORE TIME? I'M
24 GOING TO START FROM THIS SIDE. SBRANTI, MIRANTE, NEMSICK,
25 MILES, CHANG, MADRID, KALLINS, BALDINI. HOW MANY IS THAT?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **KYNAM-MILLER:** CANTRELL, AS WELL?

3

4 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** HE WAS ON THE FIRST ONE. AND MEMBER
5 SAUNDERS. IT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVE ABOUT MAYBE 12 PEOPLE ON THE
6 QUEUE. LET'S GO AHEAD AND GIVE EACH MEMBER ABOUT 90 SECONDS TO
7 SHARE THEIR COMMENTS? OR IS THAT TOO LONG? ONE MINUTE. OKAY.
8 WE'LL GIVE EACH MEMBER ABOUT A MINUTE TO SHARE THEIR COMMENTS
9 AND THEN IF THERE KIND OF FEELS LIKE THERE IS A LOT OF
10 QUESTIONS FOR STAFF WE MIGHT PAUSE AROUND LIKE FIVE PEOPLE
11 GIVE YOU A CHANCE TO RESPOND THEN CONTINUE DOWN THE QUEUE.
12 OKAY SO WE'LL BEGIN WITH MEMBER CANTRELL.

13

14 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** THANK YOU. I REALLY LIKE THE ANALOGY OF THE
15 TOYOTA FACTORY. SO I'LL LEAN INTO THAT. HOW DO YOU PREVENT A
16 BAD SHIPMENT OF STEEL FROM DETERIORATING THE QUALITY OF THE
17 PRODUCT? IN TWO WAYS, FIRST WAY IS WHAT IF AN ADMINISTRATION
18 DECIDES TO CHANGE THE WAY WE COLLECT AND ISSUE CENSUS DATA
19 THAT, YOU KNOW, TAKES OFF OUR KEY TRACKING ELEMENTS
20 SIGNIFICANTLY, AND JUST ENTERS THE SYSTEM, HOW DO WE MONITOR
21 AND CORRECT FOR QUALITY? HOW WOULD THAT LOOK? AND THEN ON THE
22 EQUITY ISSUE, I'M GLAD YOU DID MENTION THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT
23 REEVALUATING THAT. THAT WAS AN INTERESTING MEASURE. AND I
24 THINK IT MIGHT ACTUALLY COME TO THAT ANYWAY. BUT WHO ALSO
25 MATTERS. SO, I WOULD LOVE TO SEE A REFLECTION ON THAT.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER CANTRELL. WE'LL TAKE
3 THREE MORE COMMENTS IN INTEREST OF TIME THEN COME BACK TO
4 ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS. NEXT ONE IS MEMBER MIRANTE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THIS I HAVE USED VITAL SIGNS QUITE A
7 BIT IN MY CAREER AND IT'S BEEN INVOLVE I HAVE A COUPLE OF
8 QUESTIONS, I BELIEVE THE VMT DATA WAS DOWN FOR A FEW YEARS IF
9 MEMORY SERVES ME IT HASN'T BEEN UPDATED SINCE 2022, 2023
10 SOMETHING LIKE THAT I WANTED TO GET AN UPDATE ON WHY THAT WAS
11 AND HOW YOU SOLVE THAT. AND I'M ALSO WONDERING WHAT IF
12 ANYTHING THAT WE'RE DOING TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR ALGORITHMS TO
13 READ. IS THIS SOMETHING THAT WE'RE JUST SHARING ON A WEBSITE
14 OR IS THERE SOMETHING LIKE AN APN OR SOMETHING THAT YOU CAN
15 SCAPE AND DO STATISTICS WITH?

16

17 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** ALL RIGHT THANK YOU FOR THAT
18 QUESTION. MEMBER NEMSICK.

19

20 **KAREN NEMSICK:** THANKS. I HAD A QUESTION IN LANDING PEOPLE
21 TALKING ABOUT HOUSING PRODUCTION AND I'M WONDERING IF WE CAN
22 SEE THIS BROKEN DOWN MORE BY INCOME AS WELL JUST TO NOTE IF WE
23 KNOW THAT WE'RE BUILDING X NUMBER OF HOUSES HOW MANY OF THOSE
24 HOUSES ARE FOR VERY LOW-INCOME AND DO THOSE PROPORTIONS ALIGN
25 WITH THE ACTUAL INCOME DISTRIBUTION IN THE BAY AREA?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY LET'S PAUSE AND GIVE MR. HUANG A
3 MINUTE TO RESPOND.

4

5 **ELLIOT HUANG:** ALL RIGHT THANKS FOR THE THOUGHTFUL QUESTIONS
6 COUNCIL MEMBER CANTRELL SO WE TALKED ABOUT, SORT OF, THE BAD
7 DATA COMING IN AND WHAT'S THE QUALITY ASSURANCE KIND OF
8 PROCESS THAT GOES THERE. SO THREE WAYS I'LL ANSWER THAT
9 QUESTION SO FIRST ONE WE DO HAVE AUTOMATED CHECKS JUST FOR
10 GENERAL DATA QUALITY THAT'S MORE BASELINE THAT YOU WOULD
11 EXPECT FROM US ANYWAY SO NOT MUCH MORE TO ADD THERE. THE NEXT
12 ITEM THERE IS, THERE IS AN ELEMENT OF, SORT OF, SUBJECT MATTER
13 EXPERT REVIEW, AND, SO, IT'S NOT A FULLY AUTOMATED TOYOTA
14 FACTORY WHERE DATA GETS PRODUCED AND SHIPPED TO THE CUSTOMER,
15 THERE IS A REVIEW WHERE WE ACTUALLY THINK CRITICALLY, DOES
16 THIS DATA MAKE SENSE, WHAT KIND OF STORY IS IT TELLING DO WE
17 TRUST THE UNDERLYING ASSUMPTIONS THAT WENT INTO THE RAW DATA
18 AND SO ON AND SO FORTH LIKE THAT. SO THERE IS AN ELEMENT OF
19 HUMAN IN THE LOOP IS WHAT WE LIKE TO CALL IT. THE QUESTION
20 ABOUT, SORT OF, INTERFERENCE WITH THE U.S. CONSENSUS DATA
21 DEFINITELY SOMETHING THAT'S A CONCERN AND WE'RE MONITORING
22 CLOSELY THERE WAS A POWERED WHERE SOME OF THE CENSUS DATA WAS
23 MISSING OR DOWN FROM THE SOURCES AND WE HAD A LITTLE BIT OF A
24 REVIEW AND GOT THE TEAM TO HUDDLE TOGETHER TO THINK HOW WE
25 WOULD ACCOUNT FOR A SITUATION LIKE THAT. ONE THING WE'RE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 LOOKING AT IS IDENTIFYING OTHER DATA SOURCES BEYOND FEDERAL
2 GOVERNMENT DATA. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN CONTINUE --
3 THAT'S CONVERSATION WE CAN CONTINUE TO HAVE AS WE DO OUR
4 QUALITY CHECKS AND JUST STAYING CLOSE IN TERMS OF WHAT'S
5 HAPPENING IN THAT SPACE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR FEEDBACK ON EQUITY
6 THAT'S DEFINITELY AN AREA I THINK IS WORTH EXPANDING THERE ARE
7 ALSO RESOURCES OUT THERE SUCH AS BAY AREA EQUITY ATLAS WHICH
8 MANY OF YOU MIGHT BE FAMILIAR WITH AND THERE IS A POTENTIAL
9 PARTNER FOR VITAL SIGNS WITH THAT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
10 QUESTIONS. COUNCIL MEMBER MIRANTE, VMT. SO, WE SOURCE OUR VMT
11 DATA FROM CALTRANS, CALTRANS PUBLISHES A RESOURCE EVERY YEAR
12 CALLED PUBLIC ROAD DATA AND THAT DATA IS ACTUALLY BOTTOMS UP
13 APPROACH WHERE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS FEED THAT UP TO CALTRANS SO
14 THAT'S A BIT OF A BOTTOMS UP REPORTING -- EXCUSE ME -- FROM
15 CALTRANS SO THERE MAY HAVE BEEN SOME DATA ISSUES ON CALTRANS'S
16 SIDE IN TERMS OF DATA ON AN ANNUAL BASIS WE ALSO WERE HAVING
17 DATA PIPELINE CHALLENGES OR WASN'T IMPLEMENTED IN THE LATE 20
18 TENS SO THAT MAYBE WHERE WE SAW A BIT OF A GAP IN BETWEEN WHEN
19 CALTRANS PUBLISHES DATA AND WHEN VITAL SIGNS HAS THE DATA BUT
20 VMT IS A PERFORMANCE MEASURE WHERE WE ARE UPGRADED IT INTO THE
21 NEW DATA PIPELINE SO WE'RE IN A SITUATION NOW WHERE CALTRANS
22 PUBLISHES IT RELATIVELY QUICKLY TO GET THAT INTO VITAL SIGNS
23 WEB PAGE UPDATE THAT SO YOU ASKED ABOUT PROGRAMMATIC ACCESS
24 INTO DATA SETS SO PERHAPS ALIKE A SOFTWARE ENGINEER DATA
25 SIGNIFICANT BUILDING AN APPLICATION CAN CONNECT TO DATA



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WITHOUT HAVING TO CLICK THROUGH AND NAVIGATE THE SITE EVERY
2 DATA SET ON VITAL SIGNS IS PUT ON OUR OPEN DATA PLATFORM
3 BECAUSE THE DATA IS ON THE OPEN DATA PLATFORM OPEN DATA
4 PLATFORM EXPOSES AN API ALL DATA SETS ARE API ACCESSIBLE FOR
5 DEVELOPERS PLANNERS ANALYSTS ANYONE WHO WANTS CAN USE AND
6 WRITE BASICALLY THEY CAN WRITE CODE TO CONNECT TO THE DATA.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S REALLY GREAT I KNOW THAT'S EXPENSIVE AND I
9 WANT TO THANK YOU FOR DOING THAT. REALLY HELPFUL.

10

11 **ELLIOT HUANG:** YES ABSOLUTELY.

12

13 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** AND THE THIRD QUESTION FROM MEMBER
14 NEMSICK.

15

16 **ELLIOT HUANG:** HOUSING PRODUCTION BROKEN FANTASTIC QUESTION WE
17 ACTUALLY FIRST OF ALL WE HAVE THERE IS A PORTION OF THE SITE
18 ON HOUSING PRODUCTION VITAL SIGNS PAGE THAT GOES INTO, SORT
19 OF, INCOME HOUSING UNITS BY INCOME TYPE THAT'S AVAILABLE ON
20 THE VITAL SIGNS PAGE BUT WE'RE PLANNING A BIT OF REFRESH OF
21 THAT TO IMPROVE THE WAY THAT INFORMATION IS BEING SHARED WE DO
22 HAVE HOUSING PERMITS AS WELL THAT'S ANOTHER INDICATOR BROKEN
23 DOWN HOUSING PRODUCTION WE EITHER HAVE IT OR WILL HAVE IT SOON
24 WHERE WE ARE GOING TO LOOK AT NOT ONLY INCOME LEVEL BUT ALSO
25 THE GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION WHERE THOSE UNITS ARE PRODUCED WE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 HAVE INFORMATION BECAUSE WE HAVE THE HOUSING PERMITS WE KNOW
2 WHEN DIFFERENT PERMITS ARE COMPLETE WHEN WE GET THE
3 CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY SO WE KNOW WHERE NEW HOUSING PROJECTS
4 ARE BEING PRODUCED THERE'S A GEE SPATIAL WAY THAT WE'RE GOING
5 TO MAP ALL THAT IN ADDITION TO THE INCOME LEVELS.

6

7 **KAREN NEMSICK:** YEAH IF WE WERE BUILDING 19,700 UNITS BUT 50%
8 OF THOSE ARE MARKET RATE ONLY 40% OR 20% OF OUR POPULATION CAN
9 AFFORD THEM WE'RE BUILDING HOUSING FOR PEOPLE WHO CAN AFFORD
10 THEM BUILDING HOUSING FOR PEOPLE WHO DON'T EXIST SO IF WE CAN
11 BREAK IT DOWN LOOK AT IT BY INCOME THEN WE'RE CLOSELY ALIGNED
12 TO WHAT WE NEED TO BE BUILDING.

13

14 **ELLIOT HUANG:** ABSOLUTELY.

15

16 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MILES THEN ARVELO THEN CHANG.

17

18 **R. SHAY MILES:** I HAVE SOME THINGS I COULD PROBABLY JUST SEND
19 IF THAT'S OKAY BUT THE HOUSING LABOR DATA TOLD THE BIGGER
20 STORY I WANT TO CALL OUT THE LOW PRODUCTION HIGH COST BURDEN
21 WIDENING INEQUALITY AND SHRINKING MIDDLE CLASS ECONOMY MIDDLE
22 WAGE ECONOMY I'M SORRY THOSE CONDITIONS REALLY DESERVE
23 ATTENTION FROM THIS COUNCIL AND YOU KNOW JUST DOING FURTHER
24 RESEARCH ON THAT WOULD BE GREAT BUT IN ADDITION TO INCOME
25 LEVELS THAT WERE MENTIONED IN TERMS OF WHAT WOULD BE INCLUDED



APRIL 3, 2026

1 IN THE REFRESH WILL STAFF ADD STRONGER COUNTY CITY LEVEL DRILL
2 DOWNS ESPECIALLY FOR HOUSING BURDEN DISPLACEMENT RISK MOBILITY
3 ACCESS AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITY WILL THAT ALSO BE INCLUDED AS
4 PART OF THE REFRESH WITH THE PLAN REFRESH, BASICALLY?

5

6 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER MILES. THANK YOU,
7 MEMBER MILES. MEMBER ARVELO?

8

9 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** YEAH, A LOT OF THOSE QUESTIONS WERE
10 ACTUALLY ALREADY COVERED. BUT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT I HAD
11 CONCERNS ABOUT THE FEDERAL DATA SOURCES. LIKE, OF COURSE, IF
12 THE INDICATORS CHANGE, THE FREQUENCY CHANGES. OR IF THEY STOP
13 BEING REPORTED OR, LIKE, THAT DATA GETS PULLED AND YOU KNOW
14 IT'S NO LONGER AVAILABLE, THAT WE DO HAVE A PLAN B FOR THOSE
15 INDICATORS. BUT A QUESTION ABOUT BUT MAKING THIS INFORMATION
16 ACCESSIBLE TO THE PUBLIC WHAT LANGUAGE IS IT OFFERED IN THE
17 GRAPHICS WE SAW LIKE IS THERE ANY KIND OF INTERACTIVE FEATURES
18 ON THE WEBSITE AND IF SO DO THOSE STILL WORK WITH SCREEN
19 READERS AND STUFF LIKE THAT, THEN ON A DIFFERENT NOTE TALKING
20 ABOUT NEW INDICATORS OR REMOVING INDICATORS, WHAT'S THE
21 DECISION-MAKING PROCESS FOR DECIDING WHAT GETS REMOVED AND
22 WHAT GETS ADDED.

23

24 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER ARVELO. MEMBER
25 CHANG?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **AMANDA CHANG:** IF YOU FOR THE QUESTION, I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH
3 THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU POSED IN ORDER I THINK THE FIRST ONE I
4 FOUND THE INCOME DATA REALLY USEFUL I THOUGHT IT WAS REALLY
5 INSIGHTFUL INTO WHAT THE BAY AREA DIRECTION WE'RE HEADING
6 TOWARDS OF INCOME INEQUALITY, AND I ALSO FOUND THAT THE SITE
7 WAS REALLY EASY TO NAVIGATE REALLY EASY TO SEE THE UNDERLYING
8 DATA TO ANSWER THE SECOND QUESTION. AND THEN FOR THE FEEDBACK,
9 I WAS CONFUSED WITH THE RENT PAYMENT STATISTICS VERSUS ASKING
10 RENT STATISTICS BECAUSE IT SAID RENTS INCREASE 24% FROM 2010
11 TO 2019 BUT THEN ASKING RENT DECREASED BY 5% WHERE THAT'S
12 ACKNOWLEDGE FROM UNDERLYING DATA FROM ZILLOW SO I THINK THERE
13 MIGHT BE SOME SQUARE FOOTAGE STUFF THAT MIGHT BE IN THERE LIKE
14 BEDROOM MIGHT BE BETTER TO DRILL DOWN LIKE ASKING RENT PER
15 UNIT THEN THE SAME FOR HOME VALUES I THINK SQUARE FOOTAGE
16 WOULD BE HELPFUL THERE OR SOME BEDROOM COUNT I THINK FOR
17 ACCESSIBILITY MAYBE A GLOSSARY OR TUTORIAL FOR THE SITE WOULD
18 BE HELPFUL WHEN YOU FIRST CLICK FOR PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT BE AS
19 COMFORTABLE WITH THESE KIND OF DASHBOARDS I THINK IT'S SUPER
20 EASY TO UNDERSTAND BUT AT THE SAME TIME WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE
21 GRAPHS THEMSELVES WHAT DO THOSE BAR GRAPHS REALLY SAY. I DID
22 HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT DEMOGRAPHIC DATA IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO
23 FILTER YOU KNOW INCOME BY ETHNICITY OR AGE THINGS LIKE THAT
24 THEN LASTLY IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO CROSS REFERENCE DATA IN ANY
25 WAY LIKE WHAT VEHICLE MILES TRAVEL DEPENDING ON INCOME LIKE IF



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PEOPLE HAVE LOW-INCOME LIKE TRAVELING MORE TO GET TO CERTAIN
2 JOBS THEY HAVE MORE INCOME JUST THINGS LIKE THAT.

3

4 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER CHANG I'M GOING TO
5 PAUSE THE QUEUE HERE TO ALLOW YOU A CHANCE TO RESPOND.

6

7 **ELLIOT HUANG:** COUNCIL MEMBER MILES FIRST YEAH DEFINITELY
8 APPRECIATE THE FEEDBACK I BELIEVE YOU MENTIONED THE DRILL
9 DOWNS AND LOOKING MORE CLOSER TO THE LOCAL LEVEL?

10

11 **KY-NAM MILLER:** MEMBER MILES, YOUR MIC.

12

13 **R. SHAY MILES:** I'M SO SORRY. FOR THE COUNTY AND CITY I THINK
14 IT ALSO FOLLOWS MEMBER CHANG'S JUST GETTING GRANULAR INTO THE
15 DRILL DOWNS.

16

17 **ELLIOT HUANG:** YEAH ABSOLUTELY WE DO TRY TO GO AS GRANULAR AS
18 POSSIBLE UNDERLYING SOURCE DATA PROVIDES UNDERLYING SOURCE
19 DATA DOESN'T GO DOWN TO THE CITY LEVEL ALL THE U.S. CENSUS
20 DATA MOST DATA WILL GO DOWN TO THAT LEVEL AND TO THE EXTENT
21 THAT WE CAN TYPICALLY TRY TO WHERE FEASIBLE SO JUST WANT TO
22 FLAG THAT AS WE LOOK AT THOSE DRILL DOWNS. DOES THAT ANSWER
23 YOUR QUESTION?

24

25 **R. SHAY MILES:** YES IT DOES.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER ARVELO?

3

4 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** FEDERAL DATA SOURCES AND ACCESSIBILITY.

5

6 **ELLIOT HUANG:** FEDERAL DATA SOURCES ABSOLUTELY A CONCERN AND WE
7 WILL LOOK INTO WE HAVE SOME, SORT OF, PLAN B IDEAS THIS'S
8 GOING TO TRY TO IDENTIFY BACKPACK BACKUP DATA SOURCES WHICH
9 MIGHT BE PROPRIETARY OR PAID DATA SOURCES BUT DEFINITELY
10 SOMETHING WE'RE GOING TO HAVE ON OUR BACK POCKET THE FEDERAL
11 SITUATION LOOK A LITTLE MORE CONCERNING. LANGUAGES CURRENTLY
12 THE ONLY LANGUAGES IN ENGLISH BUT THAT'S SOME GREAT FEEDBACK
13 IN TERMS OF INCREASING ACCESSIBILITY FOR USER WHO IS SPEAK
14 OTHER LANGUAGES SO WE DO HAVE A SCOPE ITEM TO LOOK INTO THAT
15 ASPECT AND PERFORM TRANSLATION SERVICES, ACCESSIBILITY SO MORE
16 FOR EXAMPLE IN SCREEN READERS THAT'S SOMETHING WE ARE WORKING
17 ON RIGHT NOW DATA VISUALIZATIONS CAN BE A BIT TRICKY IN TERMS
18 OF MAKING THEM FULLY ACCESSIBLE BUT THERE ARE TECHNIQUES WE
19 CAN DO TO IN SOME WAY CONVEY INFORMATION TO THE SCREEN READERS
20 SO THERE IS TECHNIQUES ALTERNATIVE TEXT AND SUMMARIES OF
21 DIFFERENT CHART ELEMENTS AND KEY TAKEAWAYS. THEN FOR THE
22 PROCESS FOR NEW INDICATORS REMOVING AND ADDING WE DON'T HAVE A
23 FORMAL PROCESS TO FIND AS OF NOW THAT'S DEFINITELY SOMETHING
24 THAT WE ARE GOING TO PARTNER WITH DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS TO
25 ADDRESS A KEY ITEM THERE IS THINKING THROUGH WHAT MAKES A GOOD



APRIL 3, 2026

1 VITAL SIGNS INDICATOR, I FOUND THAT THE BEST INDICATORS ARE
2 GENERALLY EASY TO UNDERSTAND AND USEFUL TO A BROAD AUDIENCE
3 THERE MIGHT BE A FEW INDICATOR PRESIDENCY ON VITAL SIGNS THAT
4 ARE A BIT NICHE THAT ONLY A FEW PEOPLE WOULD REALLY UNDERSTAND
5 OR ARE JUST KIND OF NOT AS USEFUL AND THAT EVOLVES OVER TIME
6 AS SOME INDICATORS BECOME MORE OR LESS RELEVANT BASED ON THE
7 CONVERSATIONS THAT ARE GOING ON SO THAT'S WHAT I CAN SHARE
8 RIGHT NOW. AND AS WE REFINE THAT PROCESS, THAT'S DEFINITELY
9 SOMETHING WHERE WE WOULD INCORPORATE STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** AWESOME. THANK YOU.

12

13 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THEN COUNCIL MEMBER CHANG, REALLY GREAT QUESTION
14 ON RENTS PAYMENTS VERSUS ASKING RENTS. THE ASKING RENTS HAS
15 BEEN UPDATED, RENT PAYMENTS HAS NOT BEEN UPDATED. RENT
16 PAYMENTS IS ONE THAT HASN'T BEEN UPDATED THAT'S ONE WE CHANGE
17 SLIGHTLY. BUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE TWO IS ASKING RENTS
18 WHAT LANDLORDS ARE, SORT OF, LISTING AS WHAT THEY WANT TO BE
19 OFFERED SO LIKE IF IT GOES ON CRAIGSLIST OR APARTMENTS.COM,
20 THE ASKING RENT IS THE RENT THAT THE PROPERTY OWNERS ARE
21 ASKING FOR. AND WHAT THAT INDICATES IS, YOU KNOW, WHAT IT
22 COSTS TO MOVE INTO, LIKE, A NEW PLACE. SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT FROM
23 RENT PAYMENTS. THE RENT PAYMENTS IS WHAT FOLKS ARE ACTUALLY
24 PAYING. YOU CAN THINK OF AN EXAMPLE PERHAPS IF SOMEONE HAS
25 BEEN LIVING SOMEWHERE FOR A LONG TIME, MAYBE THEY HAVE RENT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 CONTROL, THEIR RENT HASN'T GONE UP, THE RENT THEY PAY COULD BE
2 LOWER THAN THE MARTHA RATE ASKING RENTS. THE IMPROVEMENT WE
3 WANT TO MAKE TO THAT INDICATOR IS TALKING ABOUT HOUSING COSTS
4 MORE GENERALLY, RENTERS AND OWNERS, ESPECIALLY GIVEN THE --
5 MAIN THING WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THERE IS, SORT OF, THE LARGE
6 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN HOUSING COSTS BETWEEN RENTERS AND OWNERS,
7 AND THAT HAS OF COURSE SOME INTERESTING EQUITY IMPLICATIONS.
8 SO, THE RENT PAYMENT INDICATOR, NOT UPDATED, WILL BE UPDATED
9 AND IMPROVED. ASKING RENTS IS MORE ABOUT WHAT'S THE MARKET
10 DEMANDING FOR NEW MOVE-IN ESSENTIALLY. HOME VALUES IS A LITTLE
11 BIT DIFFERENT IT USE ZILLOW DATA AND IT'S ESSENTIALLY LIKE THE
12 MARKET VALUE OF THE HOME GLOSSARY TUTORIAL, GREAT IDEA, I
13 THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE CAN IMPLEMENT RELATIVELY EASILY
14 AND WE'LL WILL GO A LONG WAY IN INCREASING USABILITY AND
15 ACCESSIBILITY OF THE SITE. SO DEFINITELY APPRECIATE THAT.
16 DEMOGRAPHIC DATA ABSOLUTELY SOMETHING THAT WE ARE GOING TO
17 UPDATE IN VITAL SIGNS ONCE WE KIND OF GET THROUGH THIS DATA
18 PIPELINE UPDATE PROCESS KIND OF ALLUDED TO IT EARLIER IN TERMS
19 OF EQUITY LENS FOR DIFFERENT INDICATORS SOME INDICATORS WOULD
20 BE USEFUL BY DIFFERENT TYPES OF DEMOGRAPHIC FEATURES AND
21 THAT'S ABSOLUTELY SOMETHING THIS WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT.
22 THEN CROSS REFERENCING INDICATORS THAT'S VERY INTERESTING, AND
23 I THINK SOMETHING THAT WILL ADD A LOT OF VALUE AGAIN EVEN LIKE
24 THE EQUITY INDICATORS AND DIFFERENT OTHER INDICATORS SO THAT'S
25 DEFINITELY SOMETHING WE'LL KEEP TRACK OF AS WELL.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. SO, THE NEXT QUEUE, WE'LL
3 GO WITH MEMBER ORANTES, MEMBER DUONG, MEMBER MADRID.

4

5 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** I WAS WONDERING I DON'T REMEMBER IN
6 THE PREVIOUS COUNCIL BUT COULD BE WRONG BECAUSE I MAY HAVE
7 MISSED A MEETING. DID WE GET A PRESENTATION ON VITAL SIGNS? I
8 DON'T THINK SO, RIGHT? THIS IS THE FIRST TIME THAT I HAVE COME
9 ACROSS THIS DATA AND I'M GEEKING OUT BECAUSE IT'S REALLY
10 EXCITING TO ME, BUT ALSO LIKE A -- THERE IS MANY OF US IN THIS
11 COUNCIL WHO SERVE AS THAT TRANSLATOR BETWEEN DATA AND NOT JUST
12 INTO OTHER LANGUAGES, BUT INTO, LIKE, COMMON-DAY SPEAK, AS
13 WELL. SO, I'M LOOKING AT THIS AND AWARE OF, ALL, MTC'S PUBLIC
14 PARTICIPATION AND COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND CAPACITY BUILDING
15 EFFORTS WITH ORGANIZATIONS THAT ARE ROOTED AND CONNECTED WITH
16 COMMUNITIES. AND MY MIND GOES TO FIRST WHO IS TYPICALLY THE
17 TARGET AUDIENCE FOR THIS WEBSITE? AND WHEN I LOOK AT SOME OF
18 THE DEFINITIONS AND DATA, IT'S SUPER HELPFUL, BUT IT MAKES ME
19 THINK OF DON'T KNOW WHERE THE CAPACITY IS FOR THIS, BUT IF AT
20 ALL THE TARGET AUDIENCE WERE EVERYDAY FOLKS NOT JUST PLANNERS
21 AND TECHNOCRATS OUT THERE AND COMMUNITY ENTITIES WHO ARE
22 TRYING TO INFORM POLICY, BUT IF A REGULAR PERSON CAME ON HERE
23 A WORKER OR RENTER CAME ON HERE IS LIKE THAT'S NOT REALLY HOW
24 RENTS ARE DEFINED IN MY COMMUNITY, JUST IT'S WHATEVER PEOPLE
25 WANT TO CHARGE UNLESS THERE'S THE RENTER PROBATIONS. IS THERE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 A WAY LIKE HAVE A CHAT IN HERE LIKE TELL ME WHAT THIS MEANS OR
2 LIKE I COULD COME UP WITH OTHER QUESTIONS BUT I'M JUST LIKE
3 THAT IS WHAT WOULD SPEAK TO ME IF I WERE TO TELL SOME
4 GRASSROOTS ORGANIZERS HEY THEIR'S THIS AMAZING DATA BUT IF
5 THEY HAD QUESTIONS THERE ISN'T ABOUT I SUE THAT THEIR'S ABOUT
6 A TAB THAT SAYS IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS SEND IT BUT A WAY TO
7 LIKE GENERATE IF THERE IS COMMONLY COMMON QUESTIONS THAT COME
8 FROM COMMUNITIES IMPACTED BY THIS DATA THAT DON'T TYPICALLY
9 NAVIGATE THE PULLING OF THIS KIND OF DATA THEN I WAS JUST
10 CURIOUS IF IN OUR NEXT PRESENTATION WITH CARES GRANT, IS THERE
11 A CONNECT DO THOSE SET OF COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS WHO ARE
12 BUILDING THEIR CAPACITY TECHNICAL CAPACITY AROUND THIS DO THEY
13 GET EXPOSED TO VITAL SIGNS? BECAUSE THAT WOULD BE PRETTY COOL
14 TOO. AND GET INTRODUCED. YEAH. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MEMBER DUONG?

17

18 **BRYANT DUONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. WONDERFUL, JUST
19 A QUICK QUESTION I WAS WONDERING HOW FEASIBILITY IT WOULD TO
20 BE USE THE PERMANENT DATA TO DISTINGUISH WHICH COUNTIES ARE
21 THE DEVELOPMENTS HAPPENING HOW QUICKLY ARE THEY GOING THROUGH
22 THEIR ENTITLEMENT PROCESS OR IF THEY'RE USING SPECIFIC
23 STREAMLINING BILLS OR COST PRODUCTION PER UNIT IF THEY'RE --
24 JUST WONDERING IF THAT DATA COULD BE EASILY DISPLAYED YOU KNOW
25 IN CASE WE WANT TO -- YOU KNOW THE STATE'S HCD DEPARTMENT HAS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 AN ENFORCEMENT UNIT PERHAPS THIS COULD GIVE THEM MORE TEETH
2 MORE EVIDENCE FOR THOSE THAT ARE NOT ABIDING BY THEIR HOUSING
3 ELEMENTS. THAT WAS MY QUESTION. THANKS.

4

5 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** WE HAVE FIVE MORE COMMENTERS. I'LL
6 TAKE ONE MORE ADD ONE MORE TO THE QUEUE SO YOU HAVE FOUR, THEN
7 THE NEXT ONE WE HAVE FOUR SO MEMBER KALLINS ARE YOU READY?

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS:** I'M SORRY --

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MEMBER MADRID'S TURN.

12

13 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** THANK YOU I'M DON'T KNOW SOME OF THE COUNCIL
14 MEMBERS ALREADY ASKED THIS BUT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF
15 THINGS, ONE WHEN IT COMES TO ACCESSIBILITY, I THINK IT WOULD
16 BE GOOD TO TAKE A LOOK AT PLAIN LANGUAGE SO PEOPLE WOULD WITH
17 DISABILITIES AND MAKE IT EASY TO UNDERSTAND PLAIN LANGUAGE.
18 SECOND THING IS THAT WHEN YOU GO, THE SECURITY AND INFORMATION
19 JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE SOME OF THE PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO
20 CHANGE THAT INFORMATION. AND LAST THING YOU MENTIONED IS THAT
21 THIS INFORMATION IS AUTOMATIC, BUT HOW, I JUST WANT TO BE
22 CONSCIOUS OF USING AI. BECAUSE SOME OF THEM ARE NOT VERY
23 SECURE RIGHT NOW. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT INFORMATION IS
24 SECURE. THE LAST THING IS THAT LOW-INCOME HOUSING, I JUST WANT
25 TO ASK IF YOU CAN -- I KNOW A MEMBER ALREADY MENTIONED IT --



APRIL 3, 2026

1 FOR ME, I WANT TO KNOW HOW MANY, IF WE COULD GET INFORMATION,
2 DISABILITY DATA, WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING AND MOBILITY. THINGS
3 LIKE THAT.

4

5 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY NOW WE'LL GO OVER TO YOU MEMBER
6 KALLINS.

7

8 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. JUST A FEW QUESTIONS, WHEN YOU TALK
9 ABOUT THE AMOUNT OF INCOME THAT THE RENTERS ARE PAYING YOU SAY
10 IT'S MORE THAN 35% AS I LOOK AT DETAILS IT'S MORE HIGH RANGE
11 50% IT WOULD BE GOOD TO SHOW THAT RANGE SO THAT'S ONE. THE
12 SECOND ONE TRANSIT WAS PLATEAUIING, IT'S STILL RISING 17% WHEN
13 YOU LOOK AT DETAILS IT DISAPPOINT LOOK LIKE IT'S PLATT DOING,
14 THAT'S A MISNOMER IT'S STEADILY RISING OTHER THING DETAIL
15 TREND YOU HAVEN'T BEEN TRACKING MIGHT BE GOOD THING TO START
16 TRACK SUGGEST GAS PRICES, INDEPENDENT JOURNAL TODAY SOMEBODY
17 FROM SONOMA COMPLAINING ABOUT HOW MUCH HE'S PAYING FOR GAS TO
18 COMMUTE TO HIS JOB IN MARIN, I WANT TO SAY TAKE SMART UNLESS
19 YOU NEED YOUR CAR. SO IF THIS IS SOMETHING I THINK IT MIGHT BE
20 GOOD TO TRACK AS PART OF THE EQUITY.

21

22 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER KALLINS. I'LL TURN
23 IT OVER TO YOU ELLIOTT.

24

25 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THANK YOU FOR THE THOUGHTFUL QUESTIONS I THINK



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WE'LL START WITH COUNCIL MEMBER ORANTES. REALLY GOOD QUESTION
2 ABOUT THE AUDIENCE. THE PRIMARY AUDIENCE IS THE GENERAL PUBLIC
3 BUT WE ALSO WANT TO MAKE IT USEFUL FOR PLANNERS AND DECISIONS
4 OF POLICY MAKERS AS WELL. YOUR FEEDBACK IN TERMS OF, SORT OF,
5 TELL ME WHAT THIS MEANS, MAKE THE LANGUAGE A LITTLE BIT EASIER
6 TO UNDERSTAND, THERE ARE A COUPLE OF IDEAS THAT WE HAVE ON OUR
7 BACKLOG TO IMPLEMENT. ONE THING I THINK THE SITE DOES -- CAN
8 GET A LITTLE TECHNICAL, AND, SO, WE ARE LOOKING AT WAYS OF
9 SIMPLIFYING THE LANGUAGE. I THINK WE, AS A STANDARD HAVE, SORT
10 OF, AN 8TH GRADE READING LEVEL IS MTC-WIDE STANDARD FOR PLAIN
11 LANGUAGE ON OUR WEB SITE. YOU KNOW, REALLY JUST TO MAKE SURE
12 THAT EVERYONE, PERHAPS PEOPLE WHO ENGLISH ISN'T THEIR NATIVE
13 LANGUAGE CAN UNDERSTAND WHAT'S GOING ON THERE. DEFINITELY
14 SOMETHING IN OUR BACKLOG THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT. THERE ARE ALSO
15 SOME INTERESTING TECHNOLOGIES THAT ARE COMING OUT. I THINK I
16 HEARD AI KIND OF MENTIONED. THERE IS SOME INTERESTING CHAT
17 BOT-ALIKE TECHNOLOGIES WHERE A USER YOU COULD CHAT WITH AND
18 USE THAT AS A WAY TO UNDERSTAND THE DATA AND KIND OF HELP
19 TRANSLATE IT FROM SLIGHTLY MORE TECHNICAL LANGUAGE TO MORE
20 PLAIN LANGUAGE. THAT'S AN IDEA THAT WE'RE EVALUATING BUT OF
21 COURSE THERE ARE CONCERNS WITH BIAS AND TRUSTWORTHINESS OF AI,
22 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE TAKING A VERY CLOSE LOOK AT. I
23 THINK YOU HAD ANOTHER QUESTION ABOUT THE CARES GRANTS AND
24 COLLABORATION THERE. WE HAVE NOT HAD THOSE DISCUSSIONS ON
25 STAFF YET, BUT CERTAINLY IT'S WITHIN KIND OF THE SPIRIT OF



APRIL 3, 2026

1 VITAL SIGNS TO ENSURE THAT VITAL SIGNS DATA IS KIND OF USED
2 AND KIND OF INTEGRATED INTO DIFFERENT PROGRAMS, JUST, SORT OF,
3 REDUCE THAT DUPLICATE WORK AND MAKE SURE ALL THE PARTS WE'RE
4 BUILDING IN THE TOYOTA FACTORY CAN BE INTEGRATED INTO OTHER
5 WORK STREAMS AS WELL. COUNCIL MEMBER DUONG, A REALLY
6 INTERESTING QUESTION ABOUT FEASIBILITY I THINK WHAT I HEARD IS
7 SPEED OF PERMIT PROSING ESSENTIALLY HOW QUICKLY WE GET THROUGH
8 THAT PROCESS. I'LL HAVE TO GET WITH OUR HOUSING DATA ANALYST
9 TO FULLY UNDERSTAND AND BE ABLE TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION. I DON
10 THAT THE HOUSING DATA DOES TRACK THE PERMITS AS IT GOES
11 THROUGH THE PROCESS, THE DIFFERENT STEPS, BUT I'M NOT 100%
12 SURE IF WE CAN IMPLEMENT THE, SORT OF, SPEED OF TRACKING IN A
13 ROBUST RIGOROUS WAY. SO, I WILL LOOK INTO THAT. AND THEN
14 COUNCIL MEMBER MADRID.

15

16 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** SO, THANK YOU FOR THE FEEDBACK ON
17 ACCESSIBILITY AND KIND OF -- I THINK ECHOING A PREVIOUS
18 COUNCIL MEMBER, MAKING IT EASIER TO UNDERSTAND, MAKING IT MORE
19 RELATABLE, PLAIN LANGUAGE, ARE DEFINITELY ALL GOALS THAT WE
20 ARE ASPIRING TO ACHIEVE HERE. SECURITY, I WANTED TO ADDRESS
21 THAT ONE. WE DO MONITOR THE SITES REGULARLY FOR SECURITY
22 VULNERABILITIES. ACTUALLY A NEW VULNERABLE CAME OUT A FEW DAYS
23 AGO AND OUR TEAM WAS ON IT, WE LOOKED AT IT, IT DIDN'T IMPACT
24 US, AND WE ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTED SAFEGUARDS IN THE SITUATION IN
25 CASE IT DID IMPACT US. SO, WE ABSOLUTELY TAKE SECURITY OF THE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 SITE, AS WELL AS THE DATA VERY, VERY SERIOUSLY. AND THEN I
2 HEARD A LITTLE BIT OF, SORT OF, TALKED ABOUT AUTOMATION, JUST
3 BEING CAUTIOUS, JUST, SORT OF, EMPHASIZE THERE IS ALWAYS A
4 HUMAN IN THE LOOP WHEN WE'RE DOING THE DATA PROCESSING
5 REVIEWING THE DATA AND WRITING OF THE NARRATIVE SO THERE IS
6 ALSO GOING TO BE A HUMAN IN THE LOOP IT'S NEVER GOING TO BE
7 FULLY AUTOMATED AND THERE WILL ALWAYS BE SOMEONE WHO REVIEWS
8 ALL OF THE DATA AND THE NARRATIVES AND YEAH ABSOLUTELY LOOK
9 INTO DISABILITY AND MOBILITY AS RELATED TO HOUSING INDICATORS
10 AS WELL. APPRECIATE THE FEEDBACK. THEN COUNCIL MEMBER KALLINS.
11 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, SO THE 30% IS HOUSING COST BURDEN. THE
12 50% IS SEVERELY HOUSING COST BURDENED. THAT'S, SORT OF, THE
13 DEFINITION THAT I THINK HUD ACTUALLY HAS. AND, SO, ACTUALLY,
14 WE ARE, RIGHT NOW, THE TEAM IS WORKING ON SURFACING THE 50%
15 CATEGORY, THAT SPEND MORE THAN 50% OF THEIR INCOME ON HOUSING
16 SO THE SEVERELY COST BURDENED HOUSEHOLDS THAT'S ABSOLUTELY
17 SOMETHING THAT BELONGS ON THIS ON THIS PASSAGE TRANSIT
18 STEADILY RISING. I THINK I WOULD AGREE WITH THAT. WE DO HAVE
19 SOME OTHER DATA THE MAKE INTO THIS PRESENTATION THAT I CAN
20 SHARE MONTHLY RIDERSHIP ON A MONTHLY BASIS THE VITAL SIGNS
21 DATA MIGHT NOT HAVE MONTHLY LEVEL GRANULARITY BUT WE DO HAVE
22 MONTHLY FROM SOME OTHER DATA SOURCES AND WE'RE NOT SEEING A
23 STEADY RISING TREND MAYBE NOT AS RISING AS FAST AS IT WAS A
24 COUPLE YEARS AGO, BUT THERE IS A POSITIVE TREND THERE AND THE
25 GAS PRICES THAT'S A GOOD INDICATOR, WE'LL LOOK INTO THAT ONE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 AS WELL.

2

3 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY THANK YOU SO MUCH ELLIOTT. WE'RE
4 GOING TO GO TO THE NEXT QUEUE. THIS IS GOING TO BE THE LAST
5 ONE, BECAUSE IN THE INTEREST OF TIME, I KNOW WE HAVE ANOTHER
6 MEATY TOPIC AND I'M SURE WE WILL ALL WANT TO TALK ABOUT THAT
7 AS WELL. SO I WANT TO MAKE TIME FOR THAT. SO THIS QUEUE WILL
8 HAVE BALDINI, MEMBER SAUNDERS, MEMBER HANKERSON, AND BENITEZ,
9 AND BALAJI. BALDINI?

10

11 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING. QUESTION
12 ON VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED I WOULD LIKE TO SEE HOW TIME FITS
13 INTO THAT AS FAR AS WE GO DOWN THE ROAD LOOKING AT GOOGLE YOU
14 GET WALKING, BUS, SO FORTH, I THINK THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT
15 WE'RE DEALING WITH IN THE NINE COUNTIES SHOULD PROVIDE AVERAGE
16 TRANSIT TIMES FOR THE SERVICE HOW THAT'S DEGRADED OR IMPROVED
17 BECAUSE THAT FACTORS INTO QUALITY OF LIFE WHERE YOU MIGHT LIVE
18 AND ALSO BE INTERESTED IN HOW ADU'S AFFECT HOUSEHOLD INCOME
19 AND SO ON AND SO FORTH, AS FAR AS HOUSEHOLD, MY COMMUTE IS
20 THREE MILES MY PARTNER'S COMMUTE IS 60 MILES. SO HOW DOES THAT
21 FIT INTO THOSE SORTS EVER THINGS, WE LIVE, BECAUSE OF ME, YES,
22 I'M PROBABLY SELFISH, BUT YEAH, YOU LOOK AT THOSE THINGS IT'S
23 BEST VALUE WHERE WE LIVE AND WELL YOU TAKE THE COMMUTE, SORT
24 OF, THING AND HOW THAT IMPACTS SO I DEFINITELY THINK THAT
25 INCOME FOR MILES TRAVELED, YOU KNOW, HOW FAR ARE YOU GOING FOR



APRIL 3, 2026

1 THAT JOB THAT'S GOING TO PAY YOU THIS MUCH, I THINK INCOME IS
2 GREAT, BUT WHAT'S THE PAY OFF WHAT OTHER FACTORS GO INTO THAT.
3 AND LET'S SEE, I THINK THAT COVERS EVERYTHING. BUT ALSO
4 REGIMENTAL INCOME WITHIN THE DWELLING, HOW DOES THAT -- IS
5 THIS MULTIPLE HEAD OF HOUSEHOLD IN A SHARED BUILDING AND HOW
6 DOES THAT AFFECT FAMILY AND SO ON AND SO FORTH, AND THE DATA?
7 THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER BALDINI. MEMBER
10 SAUNDERS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M GLAD TO SEE ALL THIS DATA AVAILABLE.
13 MY FIRST QUESTION HAS TO DO WITH ACCESSIBILITY. I'M A USER OF
14 SCREEN READERS AND I HAVE NOTICED FROM PAST EXPERIENCE THAT
15 THE -- IF YOU ARE DOING TABLES, CHARTS, AND GRAPHS, SOMETIMES
16 THEY'RE -- IT'S MORE DIFFICULT TO DETERMINE EXACTLY WHAT IS
17 MEANT. AND SO I WAS CURIOUS HOW THAT'S GOING TO BE PORTRAYED
18 IN THAT SENSE. AND MY SECOND QUESTION HAS MORE TO DO WITH
19 TRANSIT AND WHETHER THE INFO FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT VERSUS REGULAR
20 CAR TRANSIT IS CLEARLY DELINEATED AND SEPARATED, BECAUSE I
21 KNOW WE'RE HAVING SOME OTHER TRANSIT RELATED ISSUES ON OUR
22 POSSIBLY OUR UPCOMING BALLOT AND SO FORTH. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

23

24 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MEMBER SAUNDERS I HAVE A QUESTION,
25 WHEN YOU SAY CAR TRANSIT?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I'M TALKING ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT LIKE BART OR BUSES
3 AND OTHER STUFF VERSUS WHEN THIS WHOLE THING WHEN THE ORIGINAL
4 DESCRIPTION WAS DESCRIBED THE AMOUNT OF THE DISTANCE TRAVELED
5 BY VEHICLES AS I UNDERSTAND IT SO I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT WAS ACTUALLY BEING CALCULATED IN THE
7 INFORMATION PROVIDED.

8

9 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU FOR CLARIFYING. THANK YOU.
10 WE'LL MOVE ON TO MEMBER HANKERSON.

11

12 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. I REALLY
13 ENJOYED IT. BUT I DO HAVE A -- ABOUT THREE QUESTIONS, THAT I
14 WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE INFORMATION INCLUDED. ONE IS THE NUMBER
15 OF LOW-INCOME TAX CREDIT UNIONS UNITS THAT ARE AVAILABLE IN
16 THE BAY AREA, THE OTHER ONE IS SECTION EIGHT VOUCHERS OR
17 FORMAL SUBSIDY VOUCHERS, HOW MANY ARE IN THE BAY AREA, AND
18 THEN ALSO, IS IT POSSIBLE TO ADD INTO THE RENT BURDEN FOR LOW-
19 INCOME PROGRAMS THE COST OF THE SUPPORTIVE SERVICES THAT ARE
20 NEEDED TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY'RE SUCCESSFUL? THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MEMBER CANTRELL DID YOU HAVE A
23 FOLLOW-UP QUESTION YOU WANTED TO ADD?

24

25 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** YEAH I WONDER IF WE COULD ADD THE ACTUAL



APRIL 3, 2026

1 ABSORPTION OF THE SECTION EIGHT VOUCHERS INTO THE SYSTEM AS
2 PART OF THE QUESTION.

3

4 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YOU MEAN THE PORTS?

5

6 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** I MEAN THE ONES THAT ACTUALLY GET USED.

7

8 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THAT'S WHAT I MEAN HOW MANY SUBSIDIZED
9 VOUCHERS ARE THERE HOW MANY ARE USED IN EACH ONE OF THOSE
10 QUESTIONS. THAT'S WHAT I WANTED TO ASK. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. WE GOT YOUR THREE
13 QUESTIONS MEMBER HANKERSON. I'M GOING MOVE US ALONG TO MEMBER
14 BENITEZ AND MEMBER BALAJI. THANK YOU.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, DIANA BENITEZ:** THANK YOU I'LL BE QUICK THANK YOU SO
17 MUCH I ECHO HOW IT RELATES TO THE CARE PROGRAM AND WANTING TO
18 MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE TRACKING THAT DATA AND VITAL SIGNS DATA
19 IS BEING USED AND THEN I WANTED TO GIVE A SPECIFIC EXAMPLE TO
20 WHAT COUNCIL MEMBER MILES RAISED WHEN YOU USE FEDERAL POVERTY
21 PALESTINE TO LOOK AT POVERTY JUST AS AN EXAMPLE WHEN WE'RE
22 TALKING ABOUT INDIVIDUALS YOU'RE ONLY TALKING ABOUT
23 INDIVIDUALS WHO MAKE 16,000 OR LESS RIGHT NOW I CONTRACT
24 CONTRA COSTA WHERE I LIVE YOU'RE CONSIDERED LOW-INCOME IF YOU
25 MAKE \$87,550 AND LESS THE PREVIOUS COUNCIL HAS ALREADY GIVEN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 FEEDBACK THAT'S AN EXAMPLE OF MORE LOCALIZED DATA THAT WE LIKE
2 TO SEE INTEGRATED AND WE KNOW FEDERAL POVERTY LINE DATA IS
3 REQUIRED FOR FOLKS TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR CERTAIN SUBSIDIES BUT WE
4 HAVE LOCALIZED DATA WE SHOULD USE THEN JUST LAST THING
5 DISPLACEMENT RISK INDICATOR THAT'S USED IN PLANNED BAY AREA
6 2050+ I GAVE FEEDBACK IN THE LAST COUNCIL ON THIS THAT YOU
7 LOOK AT IT DIFFERENTLY YOU LIKE AT HIGH DISPLACEMENT BECAUSE
8 YOU LOOK AT LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS THAT ARE WILLINGLY MOVING TO
9 HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS AND I NOTICED THAT VITAL SIGNS WHEN YOU
10 TALK ABOUT DISPLACEMENT IT'S JUST DISPLACEMENT SO JUST WANT TO
11 MAKE SURE HOW THAT'S GOING TO BE DESCRIBED BECAUSE WE HAD
12 CONCERNS BECAUSE IT'S HARD FOR US TO MAKE ASSUMPTIONS ON WHAT
13 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ARE ACTUALLY GOING TO BE WILLING TO
14 MOVING TO OTHER PLACES SO JUST WANT TO BE INVOLVED IN THAT
15 COORDINATION.

16

17 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. MEMBER BALAJI.

18

19 **PADMA BALAJI:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS PRESENTATION TO MY
20 FELLOW COUNCIL MEMBERS THOUGHTFUL QUESTIONS. I'M REALLY
21 LEARNING A LOT FROM THOSE AS WELL. I KNOW WE DIDN'T TALK MUCH
22 ABOUT THE ENVIRONMENTAL DATA BUT GREAT JUXTAPOSE ALONGSIDE
23 OTHER KINDS OF DATA HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION CLIMATE CHANGE
24 IT'S SOMETHING TO POINT TO AS A FACTOR SOMETHING THAT AFFECTS
25 ACTIONS WE TAKE EVERY DAY LIKE COMMUTING TO WORK THEN ALSO A



APRIL 3, 2026

1 QUESTION ECHOING MEMBER ORANTES' QUESTION ABOUT USAGE AND
2 APPLICATION OF THIS DATA REALLY EXCELLENT I LOST VISUALIZATION
3 IT'S SUPER ACCESSIBLE I'M WONDERING HOW YOUR TEAM IS
4 PRIORITIZING THE FACT THAT LOCAL COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND
5 GRASSROOTS ORGANIZATIONS AND PEOPLE WHO AREN'T PLANNER
6 SUPERVISOR PART OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT AGENCIES THAT REGULAR
7 PEOPLE ARE USING THIS AS WELL AND UNDERSTANDING THIS SO I'M
8 WONDERING IF THERE IS ANYTHING AND YOUR OUTREACH STRATEGY THAT
9 PRIORITIZES THAT AS WELL.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER BALAJI. TURN OVER TO
12 YOU.

13

14 **ELLIOT HUANG:** THANK YOU FOR ALL THE THOUGHTFUL QUESTIONS AND
15 COMMENTS. I THINK WE'LL START FIRST WITH COUNCIL MEMBER
16 BALDINI. I THINK SOME OF THE GREAT FEEDBACK KIND OF THE
17 NUANCES THAT PERHAPS MAY GO ON WITHIN A HOUSEHOLD A LOT OF
18 DATA THAT WE SOURCE IS FROM SOMETHING CALLED AMERICAN
19 COMMUNITY SURVEY IT'S A U.S. CENSUS STYLE SURVEY A LOT OF THE
20 LANGUAGE IN THERE SOMETIMES PREVENTS US FROM GETTING REALLY
21 NUANCED LOOKS MAYBE ONE HOUSEHOLD MEMBER DOING THIS ONE
22 HOUSEHOLD MEMBER DOING THAT, A LOT OF SURVEY QUESTIONS ARE
23 MORE ALONG THE LINES OF WHAT DO YOU TYPICALLY DO, WHAT DO YOU
24 LIKE, WHAT DO YOU TYPICALLY DO AND NOT, PERHAPS NOT OTHERS IN
25 THE HOUSEHOLD SO SOME OF THOSE NUANCES MAY BE DIFFICULT TO



APRIL 3, 2026

1 CAPTURE WITH THE SURVEY INSTRUMENTS THAT WE ARE CURRENTLY
2 USING BUT YEAH DEFINITELY AN INTERESTING QUESTION WE CAN
3 DEFINITELY KEEP OUR EYES OPEN FOR ANY DATA SOURCES THAT MIGHT
4 HAVE MORE GRANULAR LOOKS. COUNCIL MEMBER SAUNDERS. YEAH,
5 APPRECIATE THE OH, VIRTUAL, THAT'S RIGHT. AGAIN, THE FEEDBACK
6 ON CHARTS, GRAPHS, ACCESSIBILITY, WELL TANG. WE DO HAVE A
7 SUBCONSULTANT WORKING ON ACCESSIBILITY SO ABSOLUTELY GOING TO
8 IMPLEMENT SOME OF THOSE. SO JUST WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE
9 TRANSIT AND PUBLIC TRANSIT QUESTIONS. SO, THE VMT SIDE WE'RE
10 LOOKING AT FOR TRANSPORTATION INCLUDES ALL TYPE OF TRAVEL, SO,
11 CAR, BUS, ANYTHING. SO THE WAY THAT WORKS IS THE CITIES KIND
12 OF ESTIMATE AND REPORT UP BASED ON WHAT THEY BELIEVE THEIR VMT
13 IS ON THEIR PUBLIC ROADS AND THEY SURFACE IT UP TO CALTRANS SO
14 THAT WOULD INCLUDE ANY TYPE OF VEHICLE THAT YOU'RE SEEING ON
15 THE ROADWAY. WE DO HAVE SOME TRANSIT DATA AND WE SOURCE THAT
16 FROM THE NATIONAL TRANSIT DATABASE, SO FEDERAL TRANSIT
17 ADMINISTRATION. AND THAT DATA, WHICH WE ALSO HAVE KIND OF
18 ISOLATES PUBLIC TRANSIT MORE PRECISELY, SO HOPEFUL THEY
19 ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION. COUNCIL MEMBER HANKERSON, APPRECIATE
20 THE FEEDBACK IN TERMS OF POTENTIAL NEW INDICATORS OR, SORT OF,
21 NEW DATA POINTS TO INCLUDE, SECTION EIGHT LOW-INCOME HOUSING,
22 RENT BURDEN, COST OF SUPPORTIVE SERVICES, TOOK NOTES HERE, AND
23 WE'LL DEFINITELY LOOK INTO THOSE AS WELL.

24

25 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AND THEN ON THE LOW-INCOME TAX CREDIT UNIT,



APRIL 3, 2026

1 YOU CAN SEPARATE IT BY LEVEL OF INCOME BECAUSE THAT'S HOW THEY
2 RENT APARTMENTS FOR TAX CREDIT LIKE IF YOU HAVE A CERTAIN
3 LEVEL OF INCOME THEN YOU PAY THIS AMOUNT OF MONEY IF YOU HAVE
4 ANOTHER LEVEL OF INCOME YOU PAY THIS AMOUNT OF MONEY WHICH IS
5 REALLY A GOOD SYSTEM BUT I JUST WANT YOU TO KNOW IF YOU COULD
6 INCLUDE THAT INFORMATION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **ELLIOT HUANG:** ABSOLUTELY WILL ADD SOMETHING WE'LL LOOK BACK
9 AND TAKE A LOOK AT. CAN ONLY MEMBER BENITEZ, VICE CHAIR
10 BENITEZ, I APPRECIATED THE FEEDBACK THERE, JUST WANTED TO
11 ADDRESS THE POVERTY INDICATOR THAT'S DEFINITELY AN INTERESTING
12 ONE THERE, FOR CONTEXT, THERE IS THIS FEDERAL POVERTY LIMIT
13 THAT'S, SORT OF, SET NATION-WIDE AND KIND OF ADJUSTED BASED ON
14 NATION-WIDE CONTEXT BUT YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY RIGHT THAT NUMBER
15 MAY NOT NECESSARILY REFLECT BAY AREA CONDITIONS. I DID TAKE A
16 LOOK AT THE LOW-INCOME THRESHOLD YOU'RE CITING FOR CONTRA
17 COSTA COUNTY I BELIEVE THAT'S HCD, SORT OF, AREA MEDIAN INCOME
18 NUMBER. I'M GOING TO TAKE A CLOSER LOOK AT THAT ONE. THOSE
19 NUMBERS ARE CREATED MORE OR LESS FOR THE CONTEXT OF HOUSING
20 AFFORDABILITY. I DO WANT TO GET WITH THE HOUSING PLANNERS JUST
21 TO CONDITION FIRM IF THAT NUMBER CAN BE USED FOR A BIT OF
22 BROADER MEASURE OF POVERTY SO DEFINITELY A GREAT QUESTION.
23 DISPLACEMENT RISK IS A FAIRLY COMPLEX TOPIC, THERE IS NO
24 UNIVERSAL METHODOLOGY FOR CALCULATING THAT. THE VITAL SIGNS
25 INDICATOR IS NOT UPDATED. SO IT HASN'T BEEN UPDATED ON THE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 LATEST AND GREATEST METHODOLOGIES THAT WE HAVE IN OTHER WORK
2 STREAMS. AND THERE ARE OTHER RESEARCH LABS THAT ARE, SORT OF,
3 INVESTIGATING THIS QUESTION AS WELL. UC BERKELEY HAS A REALLY
4 COOL URBAN DISPLACEMENT -- AND THEY'RE USING PRETTY ADVANCED
5 AND COMPLEX TECHNIQUES TO ESTIMATE DISPLACEMENT RISK. SO, THE
6 SHORT ANSWER THERE IS, THERE IS A NEED TO, SORT OF,
7 STANDARDIZE, AT LEAST THE WAY WE'RE TALKING ABOUT DISPLACEMENT
8 RISK, I DEFINITELY WANT TO GET BACK WITH THE PLANNERS TO
9 ENSURE WE HAVE A CONSISTENT WAY OF TALKING ABOUT THAT. THEN
10 FINALLY COUNCIL MEMBER BALAJI, APPRECIATE THE FEEDBACK WE GOT
11 SOME GOOD ENVIRONMENT INDICATORS THAT ARE BEING UPDATED RIGHT
12 NOW ONE INTERESTING ONE I THINK WE HAVE IS, SORT OF, A
13 POPULATION IMPACTED BY SEA LEVEL RISE SO WE HAVE SOME
14 ESTIMATES OF WHERE SEA LEVEL RISE IS GOING TO BE OBSERVED IN
15 THE BAY AREA AND WHAT'S THE POPULATION IMPACTED BY THAT AND
16 THEN PERHAPS INTERESTINGLY WHAT ARE THE DEMOGRAPHIC SLICES OF
17 FOLKS WHO ARE IMPACTED BY THAT. THAT'S ALL GOING TO GO INTO
18 THAT ENVIRONMENT INDICATOR THEN THERE IS A COUPLE MORE
19 ENVIRONMENT INDICATORS AS WELL, AIR QUALITY AND SO ON THEN
20 ABSOLUTELY FEEDBACK WELL TAKEN ABOUT MAKING THE SITE
21 ACCESSIBLE AND UNDERSTANDABLE AND ENGAGE WITH DIFFERENT
22 COMMUNITY MEMBERS REALLY MAKING SURE THE LANGUAGE IS
23 APPROPRIATE MAKING IT EASY TO UNDERSTAND FUNDAMENTALLY THAT IS
24 THE GOAL OF VITAL SCIENCES TO DEMOCRATIZE ACCESS TO DATA WE
25 HAVE A LOT OF DATA SOURCES COMING IN SOMETIMES DATA SOURCES



APRIL 3, 2026

1 REQUIRE SOME TECHNICAL SKILLS TO COMPREHEND OR UNDERSTAND AND
2 REALLY THE MISSION OF VITAL SIGNS IS KIND OF DEMOCRATIZE
3 ACCESS TO THAT KIND OF DATA SO I HAVE HEARD THIS FEEDBACK FROM
4 COUNCIL MEMBER GENERALLY AND THAT'S ABSOLUTELY PRIORITY FOR
5 VITAL SIGNS APPRECIATE THE FEEDBACK.

6

7 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU ELLIOTT I'LL CHECK WITH THE
8 CLERK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM
9 OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ONE MEMBER IN
12 THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT NONE IN THE
13 ATTENDEE SPACE CAN I CALL ON PAT EKLUND TO COME UP? MADAM
14 CHAIR FOR ONE MINUTE?

15

16 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** YES, FOR ONE MINUTE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FIRST OF ALL CONGRATULATIONS ON
19 ALL OF YOU GREAT MEETING AND GREAT COLLABORATION AND FOR A LOT
20 OF PEOPLE WITH DIFFERENT DIFFERENCES, THAT'S AMAZING. FIRST OF
21 ALL AS A POLICY MAKERS, I NEED DATA AND VITAL SIGNS HAS BEEN
22 REALLY FOCUSED ON TRANSPORTATION BASICALLY BECAUSE OF WHERE
23 YOU CAME FROM. WHAT I NEED IS A LITTLE BIT MORE INFORMATION. I
24 WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF HOW MANY PEOPLE
25 ARE LIVING IN HOUSING UNITS. I KNOW FOR A FACT, IN SAN RAFAEL



APRIL 3, 2026

1 -- I'M FROM NOVATO, THE CITY OF NOVATO, I KNOW FOR A FACT THAT
2 IN SAN RAFAEL, THERE ARE AT LEAST EIGHT PEOPLE LIVING IN A TWO
3 BEDROOM APARTMENT FOR RENT JUST TO PAY THE RENT, EIGHT PLUS.
4 THAT REALLY AFFECTS THE QUALITY OF LIFE. I WANT TO KNOW THAT
5 AS A POLICY MAKERS. BECAUSE IF WE THEN NEED TO START
6 REGULATING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE PER UNIT IN ORDER TO ENSURE
7 QUALITY OF LIFE THEN THAT'S SOMETHING I WANT TO BE ABLE TO DO.
8 RENTAL COSTS, APARTMENT, CONDOS, HOUSES, WE REALLY NEED IT BY
9 CITY. IT CAN'T -- YOU COULD DO IT BY COUNTY, BUT IT JUST GETS
10 MASS, YOU REALLY NEED TO SEE IT BY CITY. HOUSING PRODUCTION, I
11 THINK THERE IS A REAL QUESTION ON THE COST OF HOUSING. BECAUSE
12 RIGHT NOW WE HAVE DEVELOPERS THAT ARE NOT DEVELOPING BECAUSE
13 OF THE COST OF THE PRODUCTS. AND SO THAT'S REALLY STOPPED
14 CONSTRUCTION. AND THAT INFORMATION NEEDS TO BE GIVEN TO POLICY
15 MAKERS. SOME OF US DO OUR OWN RESEARCH BUT NOT EVERYONE.

16

17 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AND I HAVE OTHER COMMENTS SO I WOULD LOVE A CHANCE TO
20 SIT DOWN WITH YOU AND TALK I SERVE ON ABAG AND ON SEVERAL
21 OTHER REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS, BCDC, I WORKED FOR EPA FOR A
22 LONG TIME, SO THERE IS ENVIRONMENTAL DATA, IN FACT I WAS IN
23 CHARGE OF IT AT EPA. SO, WOULD LOVE A CHANCE TO TALK TO YOU
24 ABOUT THAT.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. ELLIOTT, THANK YOU
2 FOR THIS GREAT PRESENTATION. IT'S ABSOLUTELY VERY REFRESHING.
3 I THINK WE ALL VERY MUCH ENJOYED IT. SO THANK YOU FOR THIS
4 GREAT WORK AND IMPORTANT WORK. TO MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL,
5 THERE ARE BOX LUNCHES IN THE GREEN ROOM, AND AS WE ARE
6 APPROACHING NOON, AND WE DO HAVE ANOTHER BIG ITEM TO DISCUSS,
7 YOU ARE WELCOME AT YOUR LEISURE TO GO INTO THE GREEN ROOM AND
8 GRAB YOUR BOX LUNCH AND BRING IT BACK TO THE DAIS. NEXT FOR
9 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 8A, MTC CARE UPDATE ON IMPLEMENTATION OF
10 MTC'S COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE AND EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM. THIS
11 IS AN INFORMATION ITEM, JUDIS SANTOS AND KATE FOSBERG WILL YOU
12 PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT.

13

14 **JUDITH SANTOS:** IS IT STILL MORNING? [LAUGHTER] I THINK SO.
15 GOOD MORNING CHAIR LIEU AND CO-CHAIR BENITEZ, WELCOME, AND
16 THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT ON CARE THIS MORNING.
17 I'M JUDIS SANTOS ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF EVIDENCE AND IMPACT.
18 I'M HERE TODAY WITH MTC CARE TEAM MEMBERS JANICA MENDILLO WHO
19 LEADS THE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPONENT
20 OF CARE FOR COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN PROJECTS AND
21 KATZ FOSBERG WHO WILL PRESENT ON THE PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
22 IMPLEMENTATION COMPONENT OF CARE, CONNECTED COLLABORATION
23 SHARED LOCAL AND REGIONAL PRIORITIES EQUITABLE THOSE ARE TERMS
24 YOU WILL HEAR AS PART OF MTC'S MISSION STATEMENT AND IN
25 PLANNED BAY AREA WORDS THAT TRANSLATE TO ACTION LEADING TO



APRIL 3, 2026

1 POLICIES AND PROGRAMS LIKE MTC'S COMMUNITY ACTION PRODUCERS
2 AND EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM CARE FOR SHORT. I AM PLEASED TO
3 PROVIDE YOU WITH A BRIEF ORIENTATION OF CARE ACKNOWLEDGING THE
4 LEGACY STARTING AS EARLY AS 2018 THAT SPARKED AND SHAPED
5 CARE'S DESIGN OF THE THREE PROGRAM COMPONENTS ROOTED IN THE
6 HARD WORK OF COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS, PREDECESSORS OF
7 YOUR COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND YOUR ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT
8 TODAY AND IN THE FUTURE. CARE IS A \$29 MILLION REGIONAL
9 FUNDING CAPACITY BUILDING AND PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION PROGRAM
10 THAT IS BEING DESIGNED TO CLOSE THE GAP BETWEEN WHAT IS
11 IDENTIFIED AS A HIGH PRIORITY COMMUNITY NEED AND
12 TRANSPORTATION, TO WHAT IS ACTUALLY FUNDED FOR IMPLEMENTATION.
13 THE PURPOSE OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS TO PROVIDE A GENERAL
14 OVERVIEW OF THE CARE PROGRAM, SHARE CURRENT THINKING ON THE
15 PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IMPLEMENTATION FRAMEWORK AND TO HEAR
16 YOUR FEEDBACK TO INFORM THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PARTICIPATORY
17 BUDGETING IMPLEMENTATION GUIDELINES AND TO INCORPORATE THEM
18 FOR MAY 2026 NEXT MONTH GUIDELINES APPROVAL. NEXT SLIDE. CARE
19 IS NOT JUST ABOUT FUNDING PROJECTS IT'S A PRACTICE OF
20 CENSORING COMMUNITY VOICE ENGAGING MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERS AND
21 ALIGNING LOCAL REGIONAL SYSTEMS AND PRIORITIES TO IMPROVE
22 MOBILITY CLIMATE AND HOUSING. WHAT SERVES AS THROUGHPUT OF ALL
23 THREE CARE COMPONENTS THAT WE WILL BE REVIEWING SHORTLY IS
24 EQUITY EXPRESSED AS PROCESS, AN OUTPUT AND OUTCOME IN THE
25 ADVANCEMENT EVER COMMUNITIES PRIORITIES. CARE'S APPROACH



APRIL 3, 2026

1 EMBEDS EQUITY IN THE FOLLOWING WAYS, INVESTMENT IN EQUITY
2 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE HISTORICALLY FACED
3 DISADVANTAGED AND UNDERINVESTMENT TARGETING SPECIFIC
4 POPULATIONS TO IMPROVE ACCESS TO TRANSPORTATION SERVICES FOR
5 OLDER ADULTS PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOME
6 AND YOUTH. AND PARTICIPATORY GRANT DESIGN OF CARE POWER
7 BUILDING ENGAGEMENT THROUGH A SPECIFIC COMMUNITY ADVISORY
8 WORKING GROUP. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. CARE IS AN EVOLUTION OF
9 MTC'S LIFELINE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM ESTABLISHED BACK IN THE
10 EARLY 2000s THAT FUNDED PROJECTS IN COUNTY ADMINISTERED
11 COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS FROM AROUND THE REGION
12 LIFELINE EXPAND ACROSS THE REGION WITH REC ENVISION THAT WE
13 NEED TO DO BETTER LINKING COMMUNITY NEEDS WITH IMPLEMENTATION
14 MTC HAS DONE WORK INT GRADING COMMUNITY NEEDS IDENTIFIED IN
15 COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND FUNDING PARTICIPATORY
16 BUDGETING IN THE PAST FEW YEARS. SO WE'LL DIVE INTO THAT IN
17 THE NEXT FEW SLIDES THROUGH CARE WE ARE WORKING TO SUPPORT AND
18 BUILD FROM THE INNOVATION HAPPENING ON THE GROUND. WE'LL NOW
19 TRANSITION INTO CARE'S PROGRAM COMPONENTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
20 CARE'S \$29 MILLION REGIONAL FUNDING CAPACITY BUILDING AND
21 IMPLEMENTATION PROGRAM THAT CENTERS COMMUNITY VOICES
22 STRENGTHENS COMMUNITIES AND MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS AND
23 SUPPORTS COMMUNITY LED SOLUTIONS THAT IMPROVE LIVEABILITY FOR
24 ALL PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA. THE PROGRAM CONSISTS OF THREE
25 COMPONENTS AT EACH DIFFERENT STAGES OF DEVELOPMENT WE'LL DIVE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 INTO EACH IN MORE DETAIL SHORTLY AS AN INTRODUCTION ON THE FAR
2 LEFT IN DARK BLUE AS A POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT COMPONENT
3 WITH TOTAL BUDGET OF 5 MILLION ITS PURPOSE IS TO PROVIDE
4 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND CAPACITY BUILDING RESOURCES TO
5 COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THIS
6 FUNDING HAS BEEN PROGRAMMED AND PROJECTS ARE UNDER WAY IN THE
7 MIDDLE WE HAVE COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN TECHNICAL
8 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM \$12 MILLION PROGRAM THAT FUNDS PROJECT
9 DEVELOPMENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR PROJECTS FROM COMMUNITY-
10 BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS OR CBTP'S WITH THE GOAL BEING TO
11 ADVANCE CBTP CONCEPTS TO CONSTRUCTION READY PROJECTS.
12 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE GUIDELINES WERE ADOPTED BY PROGRAMMING
13 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IN FEBRUARY AND PROJECT NOMINATIONS ARE
14 DUE IN OCTOBER 2026. ON THE RIGHT IS PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
15 IMPLEMENTATION COMPONENT, WITH APPROXIMATELY \$12 MILLION
16 AVAILABLE. THIS PROGRAM FUNDS AND DELIVERS HIGH PRIORITY
17 NEIGHBORHOOD PROJECTS IDENTIFIED THROUGH A PARTICIPATORY
18 BUDGETING SIMILAR COMMUNITY DRIVEN ARE PROJECT GUIDELINES FOR
19 THIS COMPONENTS BEING DEVELOPED AND STAFF ANTICIPATES BRINGING
20 UPDATED PROGRAMS GUIDELINES TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
21 COMMITTEE IN MAY NEXT MONTH FOR ACTION AND PROPOSED APPROVAL
22 THE MAIN FOCUS OF OUR PRESENTATION TODAY IS TO PROVIDE
23 OVERVIEW UPDATE ON THE PARTICIPATORY BUDGET COMPONENT BEFORE
24 THAT LET'S LOOK AT TWO OTHER COMPONENTS UNDERWAY STARTING
25 FIRST WITH POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE AT AN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 EXCITING TIME WITH INAUGURAL LAUNCH OF POWER BUILDING
2 ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM MOBILIZING RESOURCES TO BOOST COMMUNITY
3 POWER THE GOALS AND STRATEGY OF THE PROGRAM WERE INFORMED BY
4 THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCY AS MTC COMMITTEES INCLUDE
5 POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE SUBCOMMITTEE ON EQUITY AND ACCESS
6 INFORMATIONAL INTERVIEWS AND 15 MEMBER COMMUNITY ADVISORY
7 WORKING GROUP CALLED FOR POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT. THE COG
8 WAS FORMED IN APRIL 2025 THROUGH AN OPEN CALL FOR APPLICATIONS
9 PROCESS. THE COG INFORMED POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM
10 CATEGORIES STRATEGIES ON THE RIGHT ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS
11 SCORING CRITERIA AND OUTREACH STRATEGIES. THE GOALS FOR POWER
12 BUILDING ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM INCLUDE BUILDING COMMUNITIES
13 LEADERSHIP AND CAPACITY BUILDING TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING
14 FACILITATE INCLUSIVE MULTI-SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS AND
15 COLLABORATION AND IMPLEMENT RESILIENCE COMMUNITY SOLUTIONS OR
16 COMMUNITIES ROOTED EFFORTS THAT ENHANCE HOUSING AND
17 OPPORTUNITY INTERSECTIONAL NEEDS OF HOUSING TRANSPORTATION AND
18 CLIMATE CHANGE THE STRATEGY IS TO ACHIEVE GOALS ON THE RIGHT
19 INCLUDE COMMUNITIES BASED ORGANIZATION GRANTS PROGRAM
20 PROVIDING SUPPORT IN THE FORM OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PEER
21 LEARNING COHORT CONVENINGS AND EXPERT COACHING AND ACTIVATING
22 LEARNING ACTION LAB IN MID-2026 IN A NUTSHELL THE PROGRAM IS
23 ALL ABOUT BUILDING TRUST. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN SEPTEMBER 2025
24 MTC LAUNCHED A POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT CALL FOR PROJECTS
25 PROCESS COMPLETED IN OCTOBER. 143 APPLICATIONS WERE RECEIVED



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WITH A TOTAL FUND REQUEST OF 18.9 MILLION FOR THE AVAILABLE
2 1.5 MILLION. 1.5 MILLION IN GRANTS WERE PROVIDED TO 16
3 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND WERE AWARDED IN NOVEMBER.
4 WITH STAFF RETURNING TO THE COMMITTEE IN JANUARY 2026 TO
5 PROGRAM AN ADDITIONAL 1 MILLION TO FUND TEN ADDITIONAL
6 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND THEIR PROJECTS, GIVEN THE
7 SIGNIFICANT DEMAND OF THESE HIGHLY COMPETITIVE FUNDS. A LIST
8 OF THE GRANT AWARDEES IS PROVIDED IN YOUR PACKET. THE TABLE
9 ABOVE, IN BLUE, LISTS THE GRANT CATEGORIES FUNDED TO INCLUDE
10 CAPACITY BUILDING, WHICH MEANS STRENGTHENING COMMUNITY INPUT
11 AND INFLUENCE ON PUBLIC POLICY AND BUILDING KNOWLEDGE. MULTI-
12 SECTOR PARTNERSHIPS AND COMMUNITY PROJECTS. IN THE MONTHS
13 AHEAD, WE'LL BE RETURNING TO COUNCIL TO SHARED DETAILS
14 REGARDING A LEARNING ACTION LAB WHICH IS ABOUT CREATING
15 COMMUNITY OF PRACTICE. NEXT SLIDE. THE SECOND CARE PROGRAM
16 COMPONENT IS A COMPONENT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR COMMUNITY-
17 BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN PROJECTS FIRST STASHED IN 2,002 THE
18 CBTP PROGRAM HAS FUND OVER 40 COMMUNITY FOCUSED TRANSPORTATION
19 PLANS THAT SEEK TO IMPROVE MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE WITH LIMITED
20 OPTIONS THESE PLANS ARE TYPICALLY FOCUSED ON ENGAGING WITH
21 RESIDENTS OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ESPECIALLY
22 EMPHASIZING MEANINGFUL COMMUNITY OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT WITH
23 THESE POPULATIONS THESE PLANS ARE CONDUCTED IN PARTNERSHIP
24 WITH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WHERE MTC PROVIDES THE
25 FUNDS FOR THESE PLANS THROUGH OUR ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM



APRIL 3, 2026

1 AND THEY ARE ADMINISTERED ON THE GROUND BY OUR COUNTY
2 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS. THROUGHOUT THE YEARS, COUNTY
3 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES HAVE COMMUNICATED THE NEED FOR
4 IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE PROJECTS AND COMMUNITIES HAVE ALSO
5 BEEN CALLING FOR DELIVERY OF PRIORITY PROJECTS. LIMITED
6 FUNDING FOR THESE PROJECTS LED TO THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CBTPA
7 PROGRAM AS PART OF CARE WITH THE PRIMARY OBJECTIVE OF
8 ADVANCING COMMUNITIES IDENTIFIED PROJECTS TOWARD CONSTRUCTION
9 READINESS BY FUNDING DEVELOPMENT STUDIES ENVIRONMENTAL
10 ANALYSIS AND OTHER REQUIRED PRECONSTRUCTION ACTIVITIES OF THE
11 -- NEXT SLIDE. STAFF IS ADVANCING CBTP A PROGRAM THROUGH A
12 STREAMLINED PROCESS TO ADVANCE HIGH PRIORITY COMMUNITY
13 PROJECTS THE PROGRAM IS SUPPORTED BY A \$12 MILLION NON-FEDERAL
14 FUNDING INTENDED TO DIRECTLY SUPPORT LOCAL PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
15 IMPLEMENTATION AS SHOWN HERE PROJECT ELIGIBILITY IS GROUNDED
16 AND DEMONSTRATED COMMUNITY SUPPORT WITH SPONSORS OFFERED
17 FLEXIBLE PATHWAYS TO DOCUMENT AND REFLECT CURRENT COMMUNITY
18 ENFORCEMENT OF PROPOSED PROJECTS PROGRAM GUIDELINES WERE
19 ADOPTED IN FEBRUARY 2026 WITH PRESENTLY NOMINATIONS DUE FROM
20 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES IN FALL 2026 AND FUNDING AWARDS
21 ANTICIPATED IN EARLY 2027. I'LL NOW HAND IT OVER TO KATE TO
22 REVIEW THE THIRD CARE COMPONENT PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
23 IMPLEMENTATION.
24
25 **KATE FOSBURG:** THANK YOU MY NAME IS KATE FOSBURG GRANT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 SPECIALIST WITH THE FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM SECTIONS AT MTC
2 PROVIDING UPDATE ON THE PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING AND
3 IMPLEMENTATION COMPONENT OF CARE I WANT TO START BY PROVIDING
4 BACKGROUND ON PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING AND PB IS A FORMAL
5 COMMUNITY-DRIVEN PROCESS WHERE RESIDENTS AND COMMUNITY
6 CHAMPIONS HELP SUSPEND PART OF PUBLIC BUDGET BY DEVELOPING AND
7 VOTING FOR PROJECT IDEAS TO BENEFIT THEIR COMMUNITY SO
8 TRADITIONAL PB IS MULTI-STEP PROCESS THAT INVOLVES STEERING
9 COMMITTEE COMMUNITY REPRESENTATIVES RESIDENTS TYPICALLY
10 DEVELOP PROJECT IDEAS VOTE ON PRIORITIES AND THOSE WINNING
11 PROJECTS ARE SELECTED FOR IMPLEMENTATION BY LOCAL JURISDICTION
12 A NOTE FOR THIS PROGRAM TO SET ELIGIBILITY FOR THE CBTP A AND
13 PBI COMPONENTS DON'T REQUIRE FORMAL PP PROCESS BUT DO REQUIRE
14 ROBUST COMMUNITIES SUPPORT AND WE'LL TALK ABOUT A BIT LATER
15 UNDERLYING NEED FOR DEDICATED FUNDING TO SUPPORT
16 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE HIGH PRIORITY COMMUNITY-DRIVEN PROJECTS
17 ESPECIALLY NEIGHBORHOOD SCALE PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT ALWAYS
18 COMPETITIVE FOR OTHER FUNDING SOURCES SO IS THE PBI PROGRAM
19 OBJECTIVE IS TO MAKE FUNDS AVAILABLE TO CONSTRUCT PROJECTS
20 THAT HAVE BEEN PRIORITIZED THROUGH ROBUST COMMUNITIES
21 ENGAGEMENT PROCESS AND ALSO TO SUPPORT FURTHER PARTICIPATORY
22 BUDGETING PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. TO GIVE A BETTER SENSE OF PB
23 PROCESS TYPE OF PROJECTS THAT CAN BE FUNDED I WANT TO
24 HIGHLIGHT THE MTC LED PARTICIPATORY BUDGET PILOT FROM 2018
25 WHICH WAS FUNDED FROM \$1 MILLION SET ASIDE FROM LIFELINE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM AND THE FUNDING AND CARE PBI WILL BUILD
2 ON THIS PILOT. SO MTC LAUNCHED THIS PROGRAM IN 2018 AND IT WAS
3 DEVELOPED WITH THE GOAL OF DEMOCRATIZING TRANSPORTATION
4 PLANNING AND INVESTMENT FOR THE BAY AREA MOST MARGINALIZED
5 COMMUNITIES TWO COMMUNITIES WERE SELECTED TO PARTICIPATE IN
6 THE PB PILOTS BAYVIEW AND SAN FRANCISCO AND VALLEJO AND SOLANO
7 COUNTY AND YOU CAN FIND A FULL OUTLINE OF THESE PROCESSES AND
8 STEPS INCLUDED IN THE RESPECTIVE COMMUNITIES CBTP'S FROM 2020
9 BOTH PROCESSES INCLUDE A STEERING COMMITTEE ROBUST OUTREACH
10 AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND PUBLIC VOTING PROCESS THAT LED TO
11 THE SELECTION OF PROJECTS THAT ADDRESS RESIDENT'S TOP ISSUES
12 AND CONCERNS. SO BAYVIEW TOTAL OF 750,000 WITH \$150,000 IN
13 LOCAL MATCH WENT TOWARDS SEVEN RESIDENT SELECTED PROJECTS
14 WHICH INCLUDED FOUR CROSSWALK UPGRADES TWO NEW BUS SHELTERS
15 AND IMPROVED SAFETY MEASURES ON SELECT TRANSIT LINES IN
16 VALLEJO \$400,000 SUPPORTED SIX COMMUNITIES PRIORITIZED
17 PROJECTS THAT INCLUDED MULTIPLE BUS STOPS AND SHELTER UPGRADES
18 SUCH AS IMPROVED LIGHTING, SHELTERS, BENCHES, SYSTEM MAPS AND
19 LANDSCAPING AS WELL AS CROSSWALK AND SIDEWALK IMPROVEMENTS.
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON THIS SLIDE WE HAVE KEY DETAILS ON THE
21 PBI PROGRAM DELIVERY FRAMEWORK AND OUR APPROACH IS REALLY TO
22 DEVELOP A FRAMEWORK THAT PROVIDES IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING TO
23 HIGH PRIORITY NEIGHBORHOOD PROJECTS, ENCOURAGES ROBUST
24 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT, AND PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROCESSES,
25 AND ALSO ALLOWS FOR FLEXIBILITY IN TIMELINE TO UTILIZE THE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 FUNDS IN THE MOST IMPACTFUL WAY. STAFF ANTICIPATE FUNDING OF
2 APPROXIMATELY \$12.4 MILLION WHICH IS CONTINGENT ON SOME FUTURE
3 PROGRAMMING ACTIONS. AN ELIGIBLE PROJECT FOR IMPLEMENTATION
4 FUNDING INCLUDE CAPITAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS
5 THAT ARE LOCATED IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY, OR CLEARLY
6 SERVING AN EPC, AND HAVE DEMONSTRATED MEANINGFUL COMMUNITY
7 SUPPORT. SO, ARE THE GUIDELINES WILL INCLUDE DETAIL ON WHAT
8 QUALIFIES AS MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT AND COMMUNITY SUPPORT BUT
9 AT A HIGH-LEVEL PROJECTS MUST ORIGINATE FROM A CBTP, AN MTC
10 FUNDED PB OR LOCALLY LED PB PROCESS OR COMPARABLE COMMUNITIES
11 DRIVEN PLANNING EFFORT THAT INCLUDES COMMUNITY VOTING OR
12 PROJECT PRIORITIZATION. AND EVIDENCE WILL BE REQUIRED BASED ON
13 TYPE AND RECENCY OF THE PLANNING PROCESS OR DOCUMENT. AS
14 STATED STAFF PLAN TO PROPOSE REVISIONS TO THE CARE PROGRAM IN
15 MAY 2026 AT THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
16 COMMITTEE. AND THAT WILL INCLUDE PROGRAMMING LEVELS FOR
17 FUNDING AND GUIDELINE UPDATES. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT STEPS AT THIS
18 TIME WE'RE SEEKING FEEDBACK FROM CTA'S ENGAGING PB PILOT
19 PROJECT TEAMS COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND COMMUNITIES
20 MEMBERS AND WE'RE LOOKING TO INCORPORATE THAT FEEDBACK INTO
21 OUR GUIDELINE DEVELOPMENT OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS AND WE PLAN
22 TO ADOPT THOSE GUIDELINES IN MAY OF THIS YEAR AND WE
23 ANTICIPATE THE FIRST ROUND OF NOMINATIONS FOR PROJECTS TO BE
24 LATE 2026 AND ONWARD INTO 2027. LAST THING HERE WE HAVE A FEW
25 QUESTIONS SPECIFIC TO THE PBI COMPONENT. SO TO RECEIVE PBI



APRIL 3, 2026

1 FUNDS SPONSORS MUST SHOW THEIR PROJECT IS A TRUE COMMUNITY
2 AUTHENTIC MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT WHAT DOES DEMONSTRATE
3 AUTHENTIC AND MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT MEAN TO YOU. SECOND WHAT
4 TYPES OF PROJECTS ARE IMPORTANT TO PRIORITIZE FOR
5 IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING KNOWING THAT IT IS LIMITED TO CAPITAL
6 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS. AND LASTLY WHAT ARE POTENTIAL
7 MEASURES OF SUCCESS OR OUTCOMES FOR THE PBI COMPONENT WITH
8 THAT I'LL OPEN FOR FEEDBACK OR QUESTIONS ON THE PBI COMPONENT
9 OR OVERALL CARE PROGRAM.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU STAFF. WE APPRECIATE THE
12 PRESENTATION. NOW I'M GOING TO OPEN UP TO COLONEL MEMBERS FOR
13 DISCUSSION. I WOULD LIKE TO START A QUEUE WE'LL START ON THIS
14 SIDE OF THE DAIS THEN GO THAT WAY TO BE FAIR. DOES ANYBODY ON
15 THIS SIDE WANT TO START WITH COMMENTS? MEMBER KALLINS, MEMBER
16 MADRID, MEMBER GERASIMENKO, MEMBER CHANG, CANTRELL, BALAJI
17 MEMBER SHEPHARD -- AM I GOING TOO FAST? CHANG, CANTRELL,
18 BALAJI MEMBER SHEPHARD, MORE ARVELO, MILES, SALAZAR, NEMSICK,
19 ORANTES AND MEMBER WONG. WE'RE GOING TO DO SAME AS LAST CYCLE
20 ONE MINUTE EACH THEN MAYBE GROUP THEM INTO GROUPS OF FOUR OR
21 FIVE THEN ALLOW YOU TO RESPOND SO WE'LL START WITH MEMBER
22 KALLINS, MADRID, AND GERASIMENKO, AND THEN MEMBER CHANG.
23 MEMBER KALLINS? HAD.

24

25 **WENDI KALLINS:** THIS IS A QUICK ONE ANSWERING TO YOUR SECOND



APRIL 3, 2026

1 QUESTION. SOMETHING THAT'S COME UP IN BOTH POUR SAFE ROUTES TO
2 SCHOOLS TASK FORCE MEETINGS AND ALSO MY MEETING WITH THE
3 COUNCIL ON AGING IS SAFE ACCESS TO BUS STOPS IT'S A NEW ONE
4 BUT SOMETHING THAT'S BEEN NEGLECTED AND IF WE WANT PEOPLE TO
5 USE TRANSIT, ESPECIALLY PEOPLE WHO ARE OTHERWISE MOBILE, I
6 THINK THIS IS AN IMPORTANT ONE TO LOOK AT IS HOW PEOPLE CAN
7 GET TO THE BUS STOPS.

8

9 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER KALLINS. I ALSO WANT
10 TO APPRECIATE STAFF FOR DOING THE CLOCK THAT'S HELPFUL FOR US
11 TO KEEP TIME AND IF YOU COULD HELP US MAINTAIN THAT THROUGHOUT
12 THE QUEUE THAT WOULD BE WONDERFUL. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO
13 MEMBER MADRID.

14

15 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** THANK YOU. I'M JUST CURIOUS, I HAVE TWO
16 THINGS FOR YOU TWICE, ONE IS WHEN IT COMES TO PLANNING STAGE,
17 JUST CURIOUS WHO DECIDES? WHO SITS -- AND HOW MANY PEOPLE --
18 DISABILITY AND ADULTS -- AND BASICALLY PERCENTAGE OF
19 POPULATION. AND THE LAST THING IS THAT, AGAIN, ACCESSIBILITY,
20 I KNOW THAT SAN FRANCISCO AND OTHERS HAS HIGHER TAXES, AND THE
21 SCHOOLS, IF YOU HAVE ANY FUTURE PROJECTS FUTURE PROJECTS
22 INCLUDED? BECAUSE AGAIN, SO WHAT SHOULD BE INCLUDED.

23

24 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER MADRID.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND ALL THE
2 GREAT WORK YOU DO I HAVE SOME THOUGHTS ABOUT PARTICIPATORY
3 BUDGETING I WAS HEAVILY INVOLVED IN THIS PROCESS IN CHICAGO SO
4 I HAVE SOME EXPERIENCE TO PULL FROM THERE, SO, I GUESS IN
5 TERMS OF MEANINGFUL AUTHENTIC ENGAGEMENT I'M CURIOUS IF PART
6 OF THE PB RULES HERE INCLUDE LIKE ANYONE WITHIN THE
7 JURISDICTION OF THE AGE 16 AND OLDER CAN VOTE ON THE
8 PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IF THAT'S ONE OF THE RULES, THAT'S THE
9 WAY IT WORKED IN CHICAGO I THOUGHT THAT WAS A POWERFUL THING
10 TO GET YOUTH INVOLVED AND MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE WERE WELCOME
11 TO VOTE REGARDLESS OF CITIZENSHIP STATUS AS WELL AND THOSE
12 VOTES WERE HOW THE MONEY WAS DECIDED UPON AND THEN ALSO JUST
13 IMPLEMENTATION BEING A KEY THING, I THINK MAKING SURE THAT
14 BEFORE THERE IS ROBUST COMMUNITY DISCUSSION AND ENGAGEMENT
15 WHICH IS WHAT YOU'RE LOOKING FOR, TAKES A LOT OF TIME AND
16 ENERGY FROM PEOPLE, THAT, ARE NOT THAT PEOPLE'S, LIKE, HOPES
17 AND DREAMS ARE SQUASHED, BUT, SORT OF, THE REALITY OR
18 FEASIBILITY IS TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT FROM CITY STAFF OR PERTINENT
19 STAFF AND THEN TRACKING THE TIME IT TAKES TO ACTUALLY BUILD
20 AND IMPLEMENT THE PROJECT TOO. BECAUSE I THINK A LOT OF PEOPLE
21 GET EXCITED AND GET REALLY INVOLVED AND THEN IT TAKES YEARS
22 AND YEARS FOR THEM TO ACTUALLY SEE ANYTHING BUILT SO THAT CAN
23 BE IMPORTANT MEASURES OF SUCCESS. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. MEMBER CHANG?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **AMANDA CHANG:** THANK YOU JUDIS AND KATE FOR THE PRESENTATION.

3 I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH THE QUESTIONS AGAIN, FIRST ONE, I

4 THINK TO ANSWER IT, JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND CORRECTLY THIS IS

5 NOT A PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROCESS WE ARE INSTEAD FUNDING

6 PROJECTS AT THE END OF NOT NECESSARILY PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING

7 BUT JUST SOME, SORT OF, COMMUNITY PROCESS. I DON'T KNOW IF I'M

8 UNDERSTANDING THAT CORRECT HE, AND THEN IN THAT END I JUST

9 WANT TO NOTE WE'RE AT MAY 2026, THAT'S NEXT MONTH WHAT WORK

10 HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE TO LOOK AT COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SPECIFIC

11 MODELS BEST PRACTICES WHO YOU HAVE ALREADY SPOKEN TO OR PLAN

12 TO SPEAK WITH, THE PREVIOUS GRANTEES IN VALLEJO, BAYVIEW-

13 HUNTERS POINT, FOR EXAMPLE? I DON'T KNOW IF YOU HAVE GOTTEN A

14 CHANCE TO ASK THEM ABOUT THAT BUT I WOULD JUST TO UNDERSTAND

15 THE BASELINE OF WHAT'S BEEN DONE FOR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT.

16 SECOND QUESTION I THINK TRANSPORTATION IN RURAL AREAS

17 SOMEWHERE THAT'S REALLY INTERESTING TO LOOK AT WITH FIREARM

18 WORKER COMMUNITIES ESPECIALLY I THINK CURRENT MODELS OF PUBLIC

19 TRANSPORTATION DON'T ALWAYS SERVE RURAL AREAS SO IT WOULD BE

20 GOOD TO UNDERSTAND THAT AND THEN LAST ONE JUST CURIOUS IF YOU

21 KNOW IF THE MEETING CAN BE IDENTIFIED, NEEDS ACROSS LIKE

22 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES IDENTIFIED IN OTHER PLANS AND ALSO

23 IF THERE IS SOME COVER PIPELINE FROM THE PBE TO THE PBI LIKE

24 IF THERE IS SOME, SORT OF, HOPE THAT THEY WILL ALSO ENGAGE IN

25 THIS PROCESS? I THINK THAT'S TIT. THANKS.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER CHANG AND I WANT TO
3 POINT OUT THAT THESE QUESTIONS AT THE END OF THE REPORTS ARE
4 HELPFUL THIS WAS FOR COUNCIL'S EDIFICATION IN THE POLICY
5 ADVISORY COUNCIL WE REQUESTED THAT IN THE FUTURE STAFF REPORTS
6 THERE BE SOME PROCESSING QUESTIONS INCLUDED AT THE END OF THE
7 REPORT JUST TO HELP DISCUSSION BE FOCUSED SO I WANT TO
8 APPRECIATE STAFF FOR IMPLEMENTING THAT BUT ALSO WANT TO
9 APPRECIATE THE COUNCIL MEMBERS WHO ARE REFLECTING ON THAT AS
10 WELL BECAUSE THAT KIND OF MAKES IT A LITTLE BIT MORE LIKE A
11 LOOP WE'RE DOING THE THING THAT WE ASKED FOR SO I WANT TO
12 POINT THAT OUT BECAUSE I APPRECIATE IT AND THOSE OF US WHO ARE
13 RESPONDING TO YOU I HOPE THAT'S HELPFUL SO I'M GOING TO TURN
14 IT OVER TO THE TEAM SO YOU CAN RESPOND TO THE LAST FOUR
15 COMMENTS.

16

17 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER FOR THE COMMENTS AND
18 QUESTIONS REGARDING THE COMMENTS RELATED TO THE BUS STOPS YOU
19 KNOW SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL THAT'S GOING TO BE INCORPORATED IN
20 OUR CARE WITHIN OUR CARE PROGRAM ACROSS THE THREE COMPONENTS.
21 REGARDING PRIORITIZING PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES AND OLDER
22 ADULTS LIFTING UP DIVERSITY THAT'S ONE OF OUR CORE PILLARS
23 WITHIN THE PROGRAM THAT YOU WILL SEE THROUGHOUT. THE THREE
24 PROGRAM COMPONENTS WAS REFLECTED IN INVESTING EQUITY PRIORITY
25 COMMUNITIES, AS WELL AS TARGETING SPECIFIC POPULATIONS THAT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WERE NAMED. AND THEN, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE REFLECTIONS ON
2 THE CHICAGO PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING PROCESS AND WE'LL BE SURE
3 -- WOO WOULD LOVE TO HEAR ADDITIONAL REFLECTIONS THAT YOU MAY
4 HAVE ON THAT SO THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR SHARING THAT AND FOR THE
5 SPECIFIC PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IMPLEMENTATION QUESTIONS I'M
6 GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO KATE WHO IS OUR POINT FOR THE PBI
7 COMPONENT WE MAY NEED SOME HELP WITH SOME OF THE SUBQUESTIONS
8 IF YOU CAN PROMPT US ON THAT AS WELL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I'LL TAKE THE FIRST SHOT AT SOME OF THOSE QUESTIONS
11 YOU MENTIONED OVER 18 AGE LIMIT FOR PARTICIPATORY --

12

13 **SPEAKER:** 16.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES THANK YOU FOR FLAGGING THAT YEAH WE HAVE NOT
16 GOTTEN TO THAT LEVEL OF DETAIL WHAT REQUIREMENTS WE'RE GOING
17 TO INCLUDE IN THE GUIDELINES AND I THINK WE'RE THINKING ABOUT
18 HOW MUCH FLEXIBILITY WE GIVE COMMUNITIES TO DECIDE HOW THEY'RE
19 STRUCTURING THEIR PB PROCESS BUT WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF
20 SETTING UP MEETINGS WITH FOLKS THAT WERE INVOLVED IN THE PB
21 PILOTS AND KNOWLEDGE WE'LL BE TRYING TO LEARN MORE FROM THEM
22 ABOUT KEY PIECES OF THE PROCESS LIKE THAT AND WE WOULD BE
23 HAPPY TO CONNECT FURTHER TOO. IN TERMS OF THE QUESTION AROUND
24 HAVING FUNDING FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PART OF THE WAY THAT
25 WE'RE HOPING TO STRUCTURE THE PBI COMPONENT IS THAT THERE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 WOULD BE A LATER PHASE OF NOMINATIONS THAT WOULD ALLOW FOR PB
2 PROCESS FACILITATION TO TAKE PLACE THEN THEY WOULD HAVE THAT
3 SET ASIDE OF IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING TO USE IN COORDINATION
4 WITH THE PB PROCESS WE ARE HOPING TO PROVIDE THAT. AND THEN IF
5 I COULD TURN IT BACK TO YOU, I THINK -- DID THAT ANSWER YOUR
6 QUESTION ON THE CLARIFICATION ON PB? OKAY.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YEAH AND THAT'S JUST TO SAY WE'RE HOPING TO
11 FACILITATE PB PROCESSES. HAVING DONE A FORMAL PB PROCESS IS
12 NOT THE ONLY WAY THAT PROJECTS CAN BE ELIGIBLE FOR
13 CONSTRUCTION ALSO INCLUSION IN RECENT CBTP AND SHOWING OTHER
14 FORMS EVER COMMUNITY SUPPORT AND ENGAGEMENT WOULD QUALIFY THEM
15 AS WELL. SO IT'S BOTH. YEAH.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I HAD A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION ABOUT THAT SO A QUESTION
18 ABOUT WHAT OUTREACH HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE WAS ANSWERED, IS
19 THERE A REASON FOR THE DEADLINE NEXT MONTH BECAUSE I THINK --
20 THANK YOU FOR THE BASELINE -- MY FOLLOW UP IS I THINK ONE
21 THING TO DEMONSTRATE AUTHENTIC AND MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT IS
22 TIME AND IT JUST FEELS LIKE A MONTH IF SOME GUIDELINES HAVEN'T
23 BEEN ADOPTED YET IT FEELS LIKE MAYBE IT SHOULD BE A LITTLE BIT
24 FURTHER OUT JUST TO BE ABLE TO TALK TO PEOPLE AND REACHING OUT
25 JUST FROM MY EXPERIENCE SOMETIMES IT TAKES A BIT LONG TO GET



APRIL 3, 2026

1 THINGS DONE BUT I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS A SPECIFIC REASON FOR
2 THE DEADLINE BECAUSE OF UNDERSTANDING THESE DISCRETIONARY
3 FUNDS.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I APPRECIATE THAT COMMENT AND FEEDBACK WE'LL TAKE IT
6 INTO CONSIDERATION I THINK YOU KNOW ON SOME OF THE GUIDELINES
7 AROUND THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND SUPPORT THAT WE'RE SEEKING
8 FEEDBACK ON SOME OF THAT, SORT OF, BASELINE WORK HAS BEEN DONE
9 IN PREPARATION FOR THE CBTP AECOM POINT BECAUSE WE'RE ALIGNING
10 THOSE GUIDELINES IN TERMS OF REQUIREMENTS FOR COMMUNITY
11 SUPPORT SO THEY'RE OUTLINED IN THAT COMPONENT AND WE'RE TRYING
12 TO BUILD ON IT SO WE WANT FURTHER FEEDBACK ESPECIALLY ON THE
13 PB PROCESS FACILITATION PIECE AND SOME OF THOSE OTHER
14 GUIDELINES HAVE ALREADY BEEN DECIDED ON GOING THROUGH THE
15 POWER. BI COMPONENT. AND THE OTHER AND THE OTHER THING I WOULD
16 SAY ONE OF THE REASONS TO ADOPT AS SOON AS POSSIBLE WITH THE
17 CBTP A NOMINATION IN OCTOBER THAT'S ACTUALLY A TIMELINE THAT'S
18 ALIGNED WITH THE CALL FOR PROJECTS FOR THE OBAG ONE BAY AREA
19 GRANT CYCLE AND WE WANT TO ALLOW THE CTA'S TO FULLY ALIGN WITH
20 THE PBI COMPONENT AS WELL SO THEY DON'T HAVE TO GO BACK AND DO
21 ANOTHER CALL FOR PROJECTS IF THEY HAVE PROJECTS THAT ARE
22 ALREADY, SORT OF, ELIGIBLE IN THE PIPELINE THEY COULD FULLY
23 COORDINATE SO THAT'S WHY WE'RE TRYING TO DO A PHASE TIMELINE
24 APPROACH AND GET THEM THE GUIDELINES AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. BUT
25 THE FEEDBACK IS APPRECIATED.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU, STAFF. WE'RE GOING TO THE
3 NEXT QUEUE SET. CANTRELL, BALAJI, SHEPHARD, AND --

4

5 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION I LOVE THIS I
6 THINK IS WHAT MOVES COMMUNITIES IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. MY
7 FEEDBACK IS ON THE WHAT THEY ALWAYS SAY, THE PROOF IS IN THE
8 PUDDING. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHAT'S IN THE PUDDING AT THE
9 END. ARE WE TRACKING THE NUMBER OF GRANTS THAT GO TO FOR
10 EXAMPLE, GLAD LED OR BLACK SERVING ORGANIZATIONS OR BIPOC OR
11 WOMEN LED GROUPS TO MAKE SURE THAT PUDDING IS GOOD? AND ON THE
12 OTHER SIDE OF IT, THE CONTRACTS FOR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS THAT
13 MINORITY BIPOC AND WOMEN LED CONTRACTORS ARE DOING THE WORK, I
14 WOULD LIKE TO SAY EXCLUSIVELY, QUITE HONESTLY, BUT TO ENSURE
15 THAT THERE IS ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT FOR THOSE COMMUNITIES AT
16 THE VERY SAME TIME. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER CANTRELL. NEXT IS
19 MEMBER BALAJI. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ASK STAFF IF YOU COULD
20 START THE TIMER AGAIN?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION AND YOUR COMMITMENT
23 TO COMMUNITY, HAVING THE COMMUNITY PARTICIPATE IN THE
24 PROCESSES ONE OF MY QUESTIONS IN THE BACK OF MY HEAD WAS ALSO
25 ARE THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF PEOPLE PARTICIPATING IN THE PROCESS



APRIL 3, 2026

1 SIMILAR DO THEY MATCH THE DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE COMMUNITY I'M
2 WONDERING IF THERE IS DATA FROM THAT BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT
3 VALLEJO GROUPS WHO GOT TO PARTICIPATE WHO IS OVERREPRESENTED
4 UNDERREPRESENTED THEN OF COURSE AS A YOUNG PERSON I HAVE TO
5 MENTION THAT AT TIMES YOUTH GET LEFT OUT OF THE PROCESS THANKS
6 FOR SHOUTING OUT THE 16 AND OVER VOTING I THINK MAKING SURE
7 WE'RE PRIORITIZING THAT I THINK ALSO A GREAT OPPORTUNITY TO
8 SEE THIS NOT ONLY ONE TIME THING BUT AS A WAY TO STRENGTHEN
9 ENGAGEMENT AND EDUCATION LONG-TERM PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN MTC AND
10 THESE COMMUNITIES WHETHER THAT MEANS GOING TO SCHOOLS VERY
11 TEACHERS TALK ABOUT THIS A GREAT WAY TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE IS
12 HEARING ABOUT IT NOT JUST PEOPLE AND THE KIDS THAT ARE REALLY
13 ALREADY INTERESTED YOU KNOW WANTING TO MAKE THEIR VOICES HEARD
14 THEN ON THE CAPITAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS I THINK THE ONE
15 THING TO INVEST COULD BE FIRST MILE LAST MILE SOLUTIONS
16 WHETHER THAT'S E-BIKES MORE SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES WHATEVER
17 SOLUTION THAT MAY BE I KNOWLEDGE THAT'S GOOD. REALLY GOOD
18 POINT TO START OFF.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. MEMBER SHEPHARD?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** YES THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION WHEN YOU TALKED
23 ABOUT THE QUESTION AUTHENTIC AND MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT, I
24 THINK PART OF THAT IS A WAY TO FOLLOW UP AND LET THE GROUPS
25 THAT PUT ON THE, LIKE, I WON'T PARTICIPATE IN FOCUS GROUP FOR



APRIL 3, 2026

1 TRI DELTA, THEY ASKED US QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT WE WANTED AND WE
2 SAID THINGS LIKE, EVERY BUS STOP SHOULD HAVE SEATS. THEY HAD
3 THESE LITTLE TWO-SEATERS THAT JUST KIND OF FOLD OFF THE BUS
4 INSTEAD OF MINIMUM BECAUSE IF YOU MUST RENT ONCE AN HOUR AND
5 YOU WALK TO A BUS STOP YOU HAVE TO STAND FOR AN HOUR, THAT'S A
6 LOT. SO THAT'S ESPECIALLY ON THE WEEKENDS ONCE AN HOUR. SO WE
7 ASK FOR THINGS LIKE THAT. THEN WE SAID THE BART TRAIN ARRIVES
8 AT CERTAIN TIME AND NEEDS TO MEET UP WITH THE BUS YOU HAVE GOT
9 TO LITERALLY TWO MINUTES WHEN I GET OFF A MEETING ON MONDAY I
10 HAVE TWO MACHINES TO RUN TO THE BUS, CATCH THE DOOR OR YOU
11 HAVE TO WAIT ANOTHER HOUR. AFTER GETTING ALL THAT INFORMATION,
12 -- NO WAY TO FOLLOW UP TO LET THEM KNOW IT DIDN'T HAPPEN. NOW
13 WHAT? YOU CALL UP, MAKE A COMPLAINT, WHEN THEY GIVE YOU
14 REFERENCE NUMBER, AND CALL BACK 10 DAYS LATER, THEY CAN'T FIND
15 IT AT LEAST THREE OR FOUR TIMES. IT WAS ALL MEANINGFUL
16 MEANINGFUL AND AUTHENTIC, BUT NOW NO ONE IS RESPONDING AND
17 NOTHING HAPPENED SO TO ME FOLLOW UP IS PART OF THE MEANINGFUL
18 AUTHENTIC ENGAGEMENT. NOW WHAT? BECAUSE NONE OF THE THINGS
19 THAT I MENTIONED HAPPENED. AND THE COMPLAINTS ARE DISAPPEARING
20 INTO THE LITTLE WEBSITE THAT'S NOT WORK -- DOESN'T APPEAR TO
21 BE WORKING. SO THAT WAS MY FIRST COMMENT. THEN MY SECOND IS A
22 QUESTION YOU MENTIONED SOMETHING ABOUT LEARNING ACTION LAB CAN
23 YOU EXPLAIN MORE ABOUT THAT?

24

25 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU, MEMBER SHEPHARD? MEMBER



APRIL 3, 2026

1 ARVELO?

2

3 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** THANK YOU. I WAS ALSO THINKING ABOUT THE
4 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT ASPECT OF IT I THINK ONE WAY THAT WOULD
5 HELP ME PERSONALLY GIVE MEANINGFUL FEEDBACK ON THIS IS TO SEE
6 ACTUAL GUIDELINES LIKE WHAT ARE YOU ALREADY LIKE WHAT'S YOUR
7 EXISTING DEFINITION OF ROBUST COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT BECAUSE
8 THAT DEFINITELY MEANS DIFFERENT THINGS TO DIFFERENT PEOPLE SO
9 IF IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE SEE THE CURRENT GUIDELINES, I WOULD BE
10 SUPER INTERESTED IN FINDING WAYS TO ACTIVELY PARTICIPATE IN
11 UPGRADING THOSE IF NEEDED THEN WONDERING IF THERE IS ALSO
12 CRITERIA FOR PRIORITIZING PROJECTS THAT HAVE CO-BENEFITS AND
13 IN ADDITION TO LIKE THEIR MAIN OBJECTIVE. AND, YEAH, I'LL STOP
14 THERE.

15

16 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. BACK TO STAFF.

17

18 **JUDIS SANTOS:** GROUPING THE RESPONSE BASED ON THEMES FROM
19 COUNCIL MEMBERS, FOR ONE, I THINK A NUMBER OF THE QUESTIONS
20 AND COMMENTS RELATE TO ACCOUNTABILITY. SO, I'LL SPEAK
21 SPECIFICALLY TO THAT. AND BASICALLY, IN A NUTSHELL, CARE IS
22 BASED IN TRUST WHAT DOES THAT MEAN AND HOW DO WE
23 OPERATIONALIZING IT. SO AS FAR AS ACCOUNTABILITY THERE WILL BE
24 A DASHBOARD THAT TRACKS PERFORMANCE AS WELL AS MEASURES NOT
25 JUST BASED ON NUMBERS OF PEOPLE THAT ATTENDED A WORKSHOP, BUT



APRIL 3, 2026

1 BASED ON WHAT -- YOU KNOW, WHAT PEOPLE HAVE LEARNED, THE
2 ABILITY TO INFLUENCE THE DECISIONS OF POLICY AS WELL AS
3 PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION. SO, THERE ARE NUMEROUS METRICS THAT
4 ARE NOT JUST GOING TO BE OUTPUT ORIENTED BUT ALSO OUTCOME
5 ORIENTED AS FAR AS MAKING A DIFFERENCE IMPACT IN COMMUNITIES
6 ADVANCING PROJECTS NOT JUST PROJECTS ARE COMPLETED AND FUNDED
7 BUT THEY MAKE AN IMPACT AND IMPROVE MOBILITY. SO THAT'S IN
8 GENERAL IN THE WORKS NOW DEVELOPING A DASHBOARD WORKING FOR
9 POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT WORKING WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
10 ORGANIZATIONS AND DEFINING THOSE METRICS AND REPORT ON THEM.
11 SECONDLY THERE WAS A QUESTION ABOUT THE LEARNING ACTION LAB
12 THIS'S GOING TO BE LAUNCHED THIS YEAR, MID-YEAR, AND THAT'S
13 AROUND -- IT'S A FELLOWSHIP PROGRAM THAT'S MEANT TO BUILD A
14 COMMUNITY OF PRACTICE SPECIFICALLY FOR SMALLER COMMUNITY-BASED
15 ORGANIZATION AND THE CURRICULUM HAS NOT BEEN DEVELOPED YET.
16 WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO YOU AS FAR AS THE SPECIFICS OF THE
17 LEARN ACTION LAB AND WE'RE LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING YOUR
18 COMMENTS ON THE DESIGN OF THAT. AND THERE WAS A QUESTION ABOUT
19 GUIDELINES. GUIDELINES ARE CURRENTLY AVAILABLE ON OUR WEBSITE.
20 RESOLUTION 4604, AND I THINK, ARE THEY -- ARE THEY ATTACHED TO
21 THIS COMMITTEE AS WELL?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SO THE GUIDELINES FOR THE CBTP AECOM POINT HAVE BEEN
24 ADOPTED AND THEY'RE NOT TAPPED HERE BECAUSE THEY'RE OVERLOAD
25 OF INFORMATION BUT THEY'RE AVAILABLE WHERE JUDITH MENTIONED ON



APRIL 3, 2026

1 THE WEBSITE YEAH JUTTING TO SPEAK TO YOUR QUESTION ABOUT
2 WHAT'S OUTLINED IN THE GUIDELINES SO WHAT IS OUTLINED IN THE
3 CBTP A GUIDELINES IS ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS THAT PROJECTS
4 HAVE TO MEET TO BE CONSIDERED FOR EITHER THE TA PLAN TO CARRY
5 THAT ENGAGEMENT REQUIREMENT THROUGH TO THE PBI COMPONENT IN
6 ADDITION THE PBI GUIDELINES SPECIFIC TO THAT PARTICIPATORY
7 BUDGETING PROCESS WHAT REQUIREMENTS FOR ENGAGEMENT LOOK LIKE
8 BUT I CAN PROVIDE OVERVIEW ON THE REQUIREMENTS FOR ELIGIBILITY
9 IN TERMS OF ENGAGEMENT PROJECTS HAVE TO BE INCLUDED IN EITHER
10 A CBTP PROCESS OR COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN FROM
11 2022 IS IDEAL IT CAN GO FURTHER BACK AND FURTHER YOU GO BACK
12 THE MORE RECENT COMMUNITY SUPPORT EVIDENCE YOU HAVE TO PROVIDE
13 AND EXAMPLES OF THAT INCLUDE LETTERS OF SUPPORT COLLECTIVE
14 PETITIONS OR SIGN-ON LETTERS FORMAL ENDORSEMENTS COMMUNITY
15 PRIORITIZATION WORKSHOPS AND ENGAGEMENT REPORTS OR COMPLETED
16 PLANS OWE THERE ARE WAYS OUTLINED HERE THAT PROJECTS CAN BE
17 SHOWN MORE RECENT COMMUNITY SUPPORT AND YES WE'RE WORKING ON
18 THE FURTHER ENGAGEMENT REQUIREMENTS FOR THE PB PROCESS FOR THE
19 PBI COMPONENT.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** QUICK FOLLOW UP. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE FUTURE
22 UPCOMING GUIDELINES FOR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT BECAUSE SUPPORT
23 LETTERS THAT'S NICE AGAIN LOOKING AT DEMOGRAPHICS PEOPLE
24 SIGNING THESE PETITIONS THEY'RE ENDORSING THIS PROJECT LIKE
25 WE'RE REACHING THE RIGHT COMMUNITIES EVERYONE BEING



APRIL 3, 2026

1 REPRESENTED EQUALLY, LIKE WORKSHOP ON TUESDAY 10:00 A.M. 2
2 PEOPLE WENT. SO LIKE HAVING THE LEVEL OF DEFINITION OF BEING
3 LIKE WHAT IS THE DEMOGRAPHIC OF PEOPLE THAT WE REACHED LIKE
4 WHAT DID COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT METHODOLOGY ACTUALLY LOOK LIKE
5 BEYOND WHAT WE DID TWO WORKSHOPS BUT, LIKE, YEAH, WHEN, WHERE,
6 WHO CAME, LIKE ALL THAT STUFF.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES, ABSOLUTELY. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT --
9 ENGAGEMENT IS MEANINGFUL.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I'M JANICA MANDILLO, I'M WITH REGIONAL PLANNING
14 PROGRAM I'M LEAD FOR COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLAN
15 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPONENT OF CARE AS PART OF THE
16 GUIDELINES WHICH ARE ALSO IN MTC RESOLUTION 4604 WE'RE
17 REQUIRING THAT ANY, SORT OF, CALL FOR PROJECTS OR PROJECT
18 NOMINATION PROCESS WOULD ALIGN WITH ONE BAY AREA GRANTS PUBLIC
19 OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT REQUIREMENTS AND THOSE ALIGNED WITH MTC
20 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN FOR EXAMPLE, THEY WOULD CONDUCT
21 OUTREACH TO COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS NON-PROFITS AND IF
22 THEY'RE CONDUCTING PUBLIC WORKSHOPS THEN WE'RE REQUIRING THEM
23 TO DO THOSE WORKSHOPS IN THE EVENING OR MAKE THEN PUBLICLY
24 ACCESSIBLE THEIR PUBLIC NOTICES ARE IN DIFFERENT LANGUAGES SO
25 THOSE REQUIREMENTS FOR PUBLIC OUTREACH ENGAGEMENT ARE IN ONE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 BAY AREA GRANT RESOLUTION MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4704 AND
2 THAT'S ON PAGE 20 THOSE ARE OUTLINED AS REQUIREMENTS FOR THE
3 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM.

4

5 **JUDIS SANTOS:** I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE WE'RE THROWING OUT A LOT
6 OF TERMS AND RESOLUTIONS THIS IS YOUR FIRST MEETING AND THERE
7 ARE PLANS FOR OTHER STAFF TO COME PROVIDE AN ORIENTATION ON
8 FOR EXAMPLE, ONE BAY AREA GRANTS AND OTHER TOPICS I WANT TO
9 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE IS A LOT OF THAT TO COME.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU JUDIS, YEAH THERE IS SO
12 MUCH I THINK ANY FORMER COUNCIL MEMBER WITH SAY THAT OUR HEADS
13 ARE ALWAYS SPINNING BECAUSE THERE IS SO MUCH INFORMATION BUT
14 IT'S GREAT WE APPRECIATE BEING ENGAGED. I JUST WANT TO CIRCLE
15 BACK TO A QUESTION ABOUT DEMOGRAPHICS. I THINK YOU MENTIONED
16 ACCOUNTABILITY, DASHBOARD. COULD YOU SPEAK TO WHETHER OR NOT
17 DEMOGRAPHIC DATA WOULD BE INCLUDED IN THAT, WHETHER PEOPLE CAN
18 SEE WHICH GROUPS WERE ACTUALLY INVOLVED.

19

20 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SO REGARDING DEMOGRAPHICS, IT'S DEFINITELY GOING
21 TO BE PART OF POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT FOR THE CBTPA, AS WELL
22 AS PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING IMPLEMENTATION. THAT'S SOMETHING
23 STILL BEING DEVELOPED BUT IT'S DEFINITELY IN PB

24

25 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. NEXT IN THE QUEUE MEMBER



APRIL 3, 2026

1 MILES, SALAZAR, ORANTES AND MEMBER WONG.

2

3 **R. SHAY MILES:** THANK YOU. I WAS ACTUALLY A POWER BUILDING
4 ENGAGEMENT CARD MEMBER. SO, I REALLY VALUE THE TIME GOING
5 BEYOND JUST SEEING MTC CARE BE A CONSULTANT MORE TOWARD SHARED
6 POWERS I APPRECIATE AND THOROUGH PREREAD. ONCE AGAIN,
7 APPRECIATE IT AND YOUR PRESENTATION. I ECHO A LOT OF THE
8 INFORMATION THAT WAS JUST -- STATEMENTS THAT WERE ALREADY MADE
9 BY MY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND THE CHAIR. SO, I WON'T REPEAT, BUT I
10 JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT DATA IS SO IMPORTANT. ALSO, SEEING
11 MEASURES OF SUCCESS. AND, SO, THAT WOULD INCLUDE
12 IMPLEMENTATION SPEED, COMMUNITY TRUST, PARTNERSHIPS DEVELOPED
13 AND WHICH PARTNERS ACTUALLY CAME TOGETHER, ACCESSIBILITY
14 IMPROVEMENTS, AND WHETHER SMALLER COMMUNITY-BASED
15 ORGANIZATIONS HAD -- YOU KNOW, DID THEY REALLY FIND MEANING IN
16 THIS PARTICIPATION, BASICALLY, AND, OR, WERE THEY OUTMATCHED
17 BY THE LARGER INSTITUTIONS. AND, SO, I JUST WANT TO SAY, IN
18 TERMS OF YOUR THREE -- YOU KNOW, THE THREE QUESTIONS THAT YOU
19 PRESENTED, I WANTED TO RESPOND TO THOSE. AND THEN FOR MY
20 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS -- SORRY -- HOW WILL MTC ENSURE SMALLER
21 CBO'S AND UNDERRESOURCED COMMUNITIES CAN PARTICIPATE
22 COMPETITIVELY IN THE PBI PROCESS? AND MY QUESTION IS, SINCE
23 VALLEJO WAS PART OF THE EARLIER PB PILOT, WHAT LESSONS FROM
24 THAT PILOT ARE SHAPING THE NEW GUIDELINES? AND IN ADDITION, IS
25 THAT INFORMATION FROM THAT CITY LEVEL SHARED BACK TO THE CITY



APRIL 3, 2026

1 SO THAT THEY CAN ALSO USE THAT INFORMATION?

2

3 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER MILES. MEMBER
4 SALAZAR?

5

6 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. AND I JUST
7 WANT TO ECHO WHAT EVERYBODY HAS BEEN SAYING. I WANT TO MAYBE
8 JUST REITERATE THAT ONE OF THE MEASURES OF SUCCESS IS IN
9 ADDITION TO WHAT EVERYBODY HAD MENTIONED IS ALSO RETENTION AND
10 FREQUENCY OF PARTICIPATION. IDEALLY YOU WANT TO SEE PEOPLE WHO
11 STARTED FROM THE VERY BEGINNING ALSO SEE THE END PRODUCT. AND
12 I'M CURIOUS, AS PART OF THE GUIDELINES, AS WELL, IF THERE IS A
13 POINT OF REFERENCE FOR PROVIDING SOME, SORT OF, LEVEL OF
14 PARTICIPATORY ENGAGEMENT TOOLKIT SO THAT WAY COMMUNITY MEMBERS
15 WHO ARE ORGANIZING AT THE VERY BEGINNING HAVE A TEMPLATE NOT A
16 WAY TO FOLLOW BUT TO MAKE THEIR OWN SO ONE COULD ALSO BE
17 INCLUDED AS IT RELATES TO CAPITAL PROJECTS, ALLOWING THAT
18 LEVEL OF TRANSPARENCY OF JUST THE COST OF THINGS. BECAUSE, YOU
19 KNOW, OBVIOUSLY YOU HAVE A BUDGET NUMBER OF WHAT MIGHT BE
20 ALLOWABLE THROUGH OBAG, AND JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE TO MANAGE
21 EXPECTATIONS WITH THE COMMUNITY, BECAUSE A LOT OF THE TIMES A
22 LOT OF PROMISES ARE MADE AND THINGS ARE NOT FOLLOWED THROUGH
23 AND ONE OF THE BIGGEST ITEMS IS BECAUSE OF THE COST OF RISING
24 OF MANY OF THESE THINGS. SO, THANK YOU.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER SALAZAR. MEMBER
2 NEMSICK. CAN WE HAVE THE TIMER RESTART?

3

4 **KAREN NEMSICK:** YEAH JUST ADDRESSING THE SECOND QUESTION. WHAT
5 ARE THE TYPES OF PROJECTS THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO PRIORITIZE? I
6 WOULD LIKE TO SEE PROJECTS THAT ARE RELATED TO GETTING PEOPLE
7 TO WORK. SO JUST SIMILAR TO FOCUSING ON PROJECTS IN A RURAL
8 AREA, SIMILAR TO THE LAST MILE, ARE WE -- IT WOULD BE GREAT TO
9 MAKE SURE WE'RE BRINGING IN SOME PROJECTS THAT ARE LOOKING AT
10 GETTING PEOPLE TO WORK.

11

12 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU, MEMBER NEMSICK. MEMBER
13 ORANTES.

14

15 **GABRIELA YAMALIT ORANTES:** IN TERMS OF THAT SECOND QUESTION, AS
16 WELL, I THINK THAT OUTCOMES THAT ARE ABLE TO PROVIDE SOME
17 IMMEDIATE MATERIAL CONDITION CHANGES SO PEOPLE CAN ACTUALLY
18 FEEL IT THERE ARE PLANS THAT ARE CARRIED OUT IT'S A LONG WAIT
19 KIND OF GAME AND JUST YOU'RE THANKFUL FOR THE COMMITMENT OF
20 COMMUNITY MEMBERS TO WAIT IT OUT, BUT I THINK THERE IS
21 OPPORTUNITY HERE. THERE HAS BEEN SO MANY -- I CAN THINK FOR MY
22 COUNTY OF SONOMA, AND WHAT I HAVE WITNESSED AND PARTICIPATED
23 IN SO MANY OPPORTUNITIES OF ENGAGEMENT AND YOU DO WONDER WHERE
24 IT ALL GOES. SO IF THIS FUNDING SOURCE CAN BE THAT KIND OF
25 RAISING THE BAR, OR AT LEAST SETTING THE -- LEVEL SETTING THE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 EXPECTATION FOR COUNTIES TO IMPLEMENT SOME, SORT OF,
2 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE, OF REQUESTING A BROAD AND VAGUE, BUT
3 AT THE SAME TIME AT LEAST PUTTING IN THERE THAT COMMUNITIES
4 DON'T WANT TO FEEL TAPPED AND EXTRACTED FOR THEIR EXPERIENCES
5 AND THEN NOT ACTUALLY FEEL IT UNTIL -- AND HAVE TO WAIT UNTIL
6 TEN YEARS WHEN THINGS ARE A LITTLE DIFFERENT OR STILL THE
7 SAME. BUT I THINK THAT WOULD BE A BIG ONE AND ALSO MY QUESTION
8 WITH REGARDS TO VITAL SIGNS, CURIOUS IF THAT WILL MAKE IT INTO
9 THE CAPACITY OR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THAT COMMUNITY
10 ORGANIZATIONS RECEIVE?

11

12 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER ORANTES. AND MEMBER
13 WONG?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS PRESENTATION. I HAVE
16 WORKED AT ORGANIZATIONS THAT HAVE RECEIVED THE CARE GRANT AND
17 DIFFERENT ITERATIONS PRIOR. SO, JUST PLUS ONE TO EVERYTHING
18 THAT'S HAPPENING HERE. I'LL KEEP IT BRIEF THIS IS THE BEAUTY
19 OF GOING LAST. I WANT TO REITERATE THE BEAUTY OF CAPITAL
20 IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS IS YOU CAN SHOW PEOPLE TANGIBLY
21 IMPROVEMENTS AND I THINK THAT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT MAYBE
22 IT'S EVEN A REQUIREMENT IN TERMS OF THE COMMUNITY ORGANIZING
23 AND OUTREACH IS TO SHOW THE COMMUNITY THAT THEIR INPUT WAS NOT
24 WASTED ON TIME THEY SPENT WITH US, AND ALTHOUGH INCREDIBLY
25 IMPORTANT THAT IT IS -- IT FEELS GOOD. IT BUILDS TRUST. AND



APRIL 3, 2026

1 RIGHT NOW GOVERNMENT [LAUGHTER] GOVERNMENT AND COMMUNITY ARE
2 NOT ALWAYS STRONG TRUSTS, BUT ESPECIALLY IN COMMUNITIES OF
3 COLOR, IT'S VERY TENUOUS AT BEST. SO, THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY
4 FOR YOU ALL TO DO THAT. AND ALSO IN TERMS OF TRANSPORTATION, I
5 AGREE, THE YOUTH VOTE, AND WITH THEN ALSO SENIORS. I DO --
6 THOSE OF US THAT WORK TRANSPORTATION IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT I
7 THINK ACCESS TO SERVICES AND RESOURCES LIKE GROCERY STORES,
8 PHARMACIES, THOSE OTHER THINGS SHOULD DEFINITELY BE A PRIORITY
9 IN TERMS OF REACHING THOSE RESOURCES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER WONG. WE'LL TURN
12 OVER TO STAFF TO RESPOND TO THAT SET THEN I SEE PUBLIC
13 COMMENT.

14

15 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU I'LL RESPOND TO COMMENT RELATED TO PB,
16 REGARDING VITAL SIGNS YES THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY TO LINK
17 THE ENGAGEMENT WORK AND THE CBO'S PARTICIPATING THAT WITH
18 VITAL SIGNS SO THAT IS COMING LATER IN THE YEAR. I THINK THE
19 REMAINING QUESTIONS RELATE TO PBI?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YEAH GOING BACK TO COLONEL MEMBER MILES, YOUR
22 QUESTION, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE ALL OF THE GREAT INPUT ON
23 MEASURES OF SUCCESS THAT YOU PROVIDED. SO ON HOW MTC WILL
24 ENSURE SMALLER CBO'S AND COMMUNITIES CAN PARTICIPATE
25 COMPETITIVELY IN THIS PROCESS I THINK ONE OF THE FOCUSES OF



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PBI COMPONENT IS SMALL NEIGHBORHOOD SCALE PROJECTS SO WE WILL
2 BE LOOKING FOR WAYS TO CAPTURE THAT IN THE NOMINATION PROCESS
3 THAT WE ARE REQUIRING OF CTA'S. AND THEN IN TERMS OF LESSONS
4 FROM THE VALLEJO PILOT AND I THINK ALSO BAYVIEW, I THINK WE
5 ARE LOOKING TO REALLY BUILD OFF THAT PILOT PROGRAM SO IN A LOT
6 OF WAYS THIS COMPONENT IS STRUCTURED OFF OF BUILDING OFF OF IT
7 AND THE SUCCESSES OF THAT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE SMALL
8 REALLY HIGH PRIORITY PROJECTS FOR THE COMMUNITY AND THEN IN
9 COMING WEEKS WE ARE LOOKING TO SIT DOWN WITH THOSE TEAMS AND
10 GET MORE GRANULAR FEEDBACK AND HOW WE CAN INCORPORATE THAT.
11 MORE TO COME. I APPRECIATE ALL THE FEEDBACK ON THE TYPES OF
12 PROJECTS WE WOULD LIKE IT SEE PRIORITIZED. I THINK THOSE ARE
13 ALL GREAT COMMENTS. AND YES I'M HEARING A LOT ABOUT, YOU KNOW,
14 ACCOUNTABILITY IN THE PBI COMPONENT AND HOW WE ARE WORKING
15 WITH COMMUNITIES AND THEN REALLY SHOWING HOW THE
16 IMPLEMENTATION HAS TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT ALL OF THAT COMMUNITY
17 INPUT AND YOU KNOW IT IS ONE OF THE REASONS THAT WE'RE TRYING
18 TO PROVIDE AN OPTION FOR FUNDING TO GET TO COMMUNITIES REALLY
19 AS SOON AS, YOU KNOW, EARLY NEXT YEAR, OR YOU KNOW, MIDDLE OF
20 NEXT YEAR WITH A FALL NOMINATION DEADLINE FOR PROJECTS THAT
21 ARE READY AND HAVE BEEN WAITING FOR FUNDS LIKE THIS. WE WANT
22 TO SEE PROJECTS BUILT QUICKLY AND REALLY, YOU KNOW, ALLOW
23 COMMUNITIES TO SEE THE BENEFIT OF THESE FLEXIBLE FUNDS FOR
24 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS. CHAIR ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS
25 THAT I MISSED THAT YOU NOTED?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. I HAD A QUESTION BUT DIDN'T RAISE MY HAND
3 EARLIER.

4

5 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** COUNCIL MEMBER DUONG?

6

7 **BRYANT DUONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION APPRECIATE IT.
8 REALLY, JUST AS EVERYBODY'S BEEN SPEAKING REALLY WANT TO HAVE
9 US THINK ABOUT THESE FUNDS NOT AS FUNDING ONE OFF PROJECTS BUT
10 LOOKING AT TRADITIONALLY OR HISTORICALLY UNDERRESOURCED AREAS
11 AND HAVING THE FUNDS SERVE AS, SORT OF, A FERTILIZER TO
12 IMPROVE OUR KIND OF PRIMA COMMUNITY WHERE THEY COULD
13 POTENTIALLY OR EVENTUALLY BECOME A COMMUNITY BENEFIT ZONE
14 SOMEWHERE WHERE THERE HASN'T BEEN A BUS LINE THERE IS A BUS
15 LINE NOW, NOW THAT THERE IS A BUS LINE, WE CAN BUILD AN
16 AFFORDABLE DEVELOPMENT THERE, USE TAX CREDITS AND IT'S
17 COMPETITIVE BECAUSE THESE FUNDS HAVE PRIMED THE AREA FOR IT SO
18 JUST KIND OF THINKING THE FUNDS IN THAT WAY.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. MISS NAME IS SPELLED DUONG
21 BUT IN VIETNAMESE, THE D IS A Y THAT'S WHY I'M CALLING HIM
22 MEMBER YOUNG. SO IF THAT'S CONFUSING ANYONE --

23

24 **BRYANT DUONG:** APPRECIATE IT.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. MEMBER MADRID?

2

3 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON MY FIRST QUESTION OR
4 COMMENT, I THINK YOU GUYS DIDN'T TOUCH ON REGARDING PLANNING
5 STAGE, AS COUNCIL MEMBERS MENTIONED, I WANT TO MENTION MY
6 FIRST COMMENT WHICH WAS I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WHEN
7 THIS PLANNING STAGE HOPEFULLY ANY DISABILITY ORGANIZATION,
8 THEIR GOALS ARE INCLUDED AT THAT STAGE.

9

10 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** WAS THERE ANOTHER COMMENT? OKAY. JUST
11 FOR THE SAKE OF TIME, THIS IS GOING TO BE THE LAST COMMENT,
12 BECAUSE WE HAVE TWO MORE ITEMS AND I WANT TO GET US TO MOVE
13 OUT OF HERE. NOT BECAUSE I WANT TO RUSH US, BUT BECAUSE I WANT
14 TO BE RESPECTFUL OF EVERYBODY'S TIME. GO AHEAD MEMBER
15 GERASIMENKO.

16

17 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** THANK YOU. I'LL BE BRIEF JUST TOOK A MINUTE
18 TO LOOK OVER THE RESOLUTION 4604 ONLINE, AND THERE WERE SOME
19 DISCUSSION ABOUT EVALUATING PROJECTS BASED ON PERFORMANCE
20 INDICATORS AND REMINDED ME OBVIOUSLY THERE IS A WHOLE
21 DISCUSSION WE COULD HAVE THAT INCLUDE, THE COMMENT EARLIER
22 LIKE TRUSTING COMMUNITY, TRYING TO EVALUATE FOR THAT REALLY
23 INTRIGUING BUT WHEN IT COMES TO SPECIFICALLY TRAFFIC SAFETY
24 IMPROVEMENTS I'M REMEMBERING IN CHICAGO ON THE MENU OF DESIGN
25 INTENTIONS LIKE CURB BUMP OUT OR PROTECTED BIKE LANE, CERTAIN



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PROJECTS WERE FLAGGED WITH THE VISION ZERO LOGO, FOR THOSE WHO
2 DON'T KNOW IT'S KIND OF THIS INTERNATIONAL INITIATIVE TO BRING
3 ALL TRAFFIC DEATHS DOWN TO ZERO, AND I KNOW MTC HAS A VISION
4 ZERO WORKING GROUP. SO FOR, SORT OF, RESEARCH BACKED DESIGN
5 INTENTIONS FOR STREET DESIGN, LIKE FLAGGING THOSE AS LIKE THE
6 MOST IMPACTFUL TO SAVING LIVES COULD BE A GOOD WAY TO KIND OF
7 HELP EDUCATE THE PUBLIC IN DETERMINING WHICH PROJECTS TO
8 CONSIDER. AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE PROCESS,
9 AS WELL. SO, YEAH.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU MEMBER GERASIMENKO. DID YOU
12 HAVE ANY MORE COMMENTS YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO?

13

14 **JUDIS SANTOS:** JANICA HAD A COMMENT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YES, JANICA AGAIN RESPONDING TO COUNCIL MEMBER
17 MADRID'S COMMENT ON PLANNING STAGE I THINK THAT'S IN RESPONSE
18 TO COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION PLANS AND FOR THOSE
19 PROCESSES THERE ARE TYPICALLY TWO COMMITTEES CREATED TO
20 DEVELOP THE OUTREACH PROCESS AND TO, SORT OF, NOMINATE
21 PROJECTS THAT ARE PART OF THE FINAL PLAN SO FIRST TYPICALLY A
22 TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE THOSE ARE COMPRISED OF CITIES
23 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TRANSIT AGENCIES TO, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND
24 THE VISIBILITY OF PROJECTS AND WHETHER TO MOVE THEM FORWARD OR
25 TO REFINE THEM FURTHER FOR IMPLEMENTATION THEN THE SECOND



APRIL 3, 2026

1 COMMITTEE IS COMMUNITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE SO THOSE ARE
2 COMPRISED OF NON-PROFITS COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS
3 RELIGIOUS GROUPS THESE COMMUNITY COMMITTEES ARE DEVELOPED WITH
4 EFFORT TO REPRESENT THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY OR
5 NEIGHBORHOOD OR CENSUS TRACT THAT PLAN IS BEING MADE FOR AND
6 SO IT DEPENDS ON WHICH COMMUNITY SO IN VARIOUS COMMUNITIES
7 THAT I HAVE SEEN THERE ARE VARIOUS REPRESENTATIVES FROM TRIBAL
8 GOVERNMENTS PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND OLDER ADULTS
9 DEPENDING ON WHO, SORT OF, LIVES IN THAT COMMUNITY.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER.

12

13 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THERE IS ALSO ONE OTHER COMMENT I WANTED TO
14 RESPOND TO, COUNCIL MEMBER SALAZAR REGARDING THE PARTICIPATORY
15 ENGAGEMENT TOOLKIT THAT, IS GOING TO BE AVAILABLE AS A
16 RESOURCE.

17

18 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU. WILL THE CLERK LET US KNOW
19 OF ANY PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED THERE IS ONE
22 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ONE
23 PERSON IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE OF THE SHALL I CONFIRM ONE MINUTE
24 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** ONE MINUTE.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** JANE KRAEMER TO COME UP TO THE PODIUM TO
4 SPEAK FOR ONE MINUTE, PLEASE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** JANE KRAEMER. DID I TURN IT ON? OKAY. I'M A COMMUNITY
7 ADVOCATE, AND ONE OF MY MAIN CONCERNS IS CHANGE AGENTS, AND
8 THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE IN MY MIND. AND I FIND IF EXCITING THAT
9 THIS GROUP OF SO SOPHISTICATED PERSONS IN TERMS OF COMMUNITY
10 POLITICS AND COMMUNITY PROCESS ARE SITTING DOWN AND TRYING TO
11 COME UP WITH A PROCESS AMONGST YOURSELVES WHERE YOU DELIBERATE
12 THE BEST ALTERNATIVE AMONGST MANY. THE HOPE IS THAT YOU DON'T
13 END UP IN A TUG OF WAR BETWEEN COMMUNITY AND AGENCY. I FIND
14 THAT TO BE A VERY EXCITING ENDEAVOR AND LOOKING FORWARD TO IT.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS
17 TRACHTENBERG. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

18

19 **GAETANO TRACHTENBERG:** THANK YOU FOR THE WONDERFUL DISCUSSION.
20 I HAVE BEEN WATCHING AND LISTENING TO THE WHOLE MEETING I'M
21 NOT ABLE TO BE THERE BECAUSE I'M IN BRAZIL VISITING MY WIFE'S
22 FAMILY WHICH IS NOT SO FAR FROM THE ORIGINS OF PARTICIPATORY
23 BY THE DAY WHICH I HAVE BEEN AN IN ORDER ABOUT FOR QUITE
24 SOMETIME AND I WANT TO LIFT UP THAT PART OF HISTORY AND
25 CONTEXT OF THIS WAS THE COUNTRY COMING OUT OF DICTATORSHIP AND



APRIL 3, 2026

1 NEED TO DESIRE TO BUILD A MUSCLE FOR CIVIC DEMOCRATIC
2 ENGAGEMENT I THINK A NUMBER OF COMMENTS I HAVE GOTTEN IN
3 THEMES I REFLECT ON COUNCIL MEMBER SHEPHARD EMPHASIZING FOLLOW
4 UP EMPHASIS ON YOUTH ENGAGEMENT AND ALSO WANT TO SAY THERE IS
5 CONNECTION I'M THINKING IT'S EXCITING TO LEARN ABOUT THE
6 PROJECT REGIONAL SCALE SOMETIMES THESE PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING
7 EFFORTS I FEEL LIKE BREAKING OFF A SMALL PORT FOR GAINING
8 ACCESS TO AND REALLY THIS IS AN EXCITING OPPORTUNITY TO
9 CONNECT THESE PROJECTS TO THE LARGER STRUCTURAL LEVERS WHERE
10 RESOURCES AT SCALE ARE POSSIBLE TO TRANSFORM COMMUNITIES SO I
11 APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT'S GOING INTO THIS. GRATEFUL TO
12 LEARN ABOUT IT TODAY.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** COULD I ASK A PROCESS QUESTION WILL THIS BE COMING
17 BACK TO US WILL WE RECEIVE GUIDELINES? HOW WILL WE BE
18 NOTIFIED?

19

20 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SOMETHING THAT WE NEED TO DISCUSS INTERNALLY AS
21 FAR AS HOW THE GUIDELINES WILL BE SHARED AS WELL AS TIMELINE
22 INCLUDES FEEDBACK FROM THIS COUNCIL ON TIMELINE AS WELL AS
23 REVIEWING THE GUIDELINES.

24

25 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** JUST FOR CONTEXT THIS IS PROBABLY THE



APRIL 3, 2026

1 THIRD TIME CARE HAS COME TO THE COUNCIL AND SINCE I HAVE BEEN
2 HERE SOMETIMES WHEN THERE ARE DOCUMENTS OR QUESTIONS REQUESTED
3 STAFF WILL MAKE NOTE OF THEM THEN REACH OUT TO THE INDIVIDUAL
4 COUNCIL MEMBERS WITH A SPONSOR FOLLOW UP MEETING OR SOMETHING
5 LIKE THAT. NEXT WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 9,
6 707 AUTHORIZING THE USE OF REMOTE TELECONFERENCE MEETINGS THIS
7 IS AN ACTION ITEM AND KY-NAM MILLER WILL GIVE THE REPORT.

8

9 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THIS IS A BIT OF HOUSEKEEPING THIS BODY WOULD
10 CONTINUE USE FOR COUNCIL MEETINGS UNDER UPDATED STATE LAW
11 WHILE MAINTAINING CLEAR THAT IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE REMAINS
12 STRONGLY ENCOURAGED FOR THIS BODY SENATE BILL 707 ALLOWS
13 ADVISORY BODIES LIKE THIS COLONEL TO USE FLEXIBLE
14 TELECONFERENCING RULES AND BOTH MTC MISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE
15 BOARD APPROVE THIS PAST MONTH THEIR MARCH MEETINGS EVEN WITH
16 FLEXIBILITY THE COUNCIL WILL CONTINUE TO HOLD MEETINGS AT THIS
17 PHYSICAL LOCATION AND THE AGENCY ENCOURAGE MEMBERS TO ATTEND
18 IN-PERSON WHENEVER POSSIBLE IN-PERSON PARTICIPATION SUPPORTS
19 STRONGER DISCUSSION AND COMMUNICATION. REMOTE PARTICIPATION
20 PROVIDES IMPORTANT BACKUP WHEN IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE IS NOT
21 FEASIBLE LIKE WHEN YOU ARE VISITING YOUR IN-LAWS IN BRAZIL
22 COUNCIL MEMBERS COME FROM ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES IN A
23 BALANCE THE PROFESSIONAL AND PERSONAL RESPONSIBILITY. THIS
24 APPROACH MAINTAINS FULL PUBLIC ACCESS AND TRANSPARENCY MEMBERS
25 OF THE PUBLIC WILL CONTINUE TO HAVE OPTION TO TAN MEETINGS IN-



APRIL 3, 2026

1 PERSON AND REMOTE VIEWING PARTICIPATION OPTIONS WILL ALSO
2 REMAIN AVAILABLE NOTHING IN THIS AUTHORIZATION LIMITS PUBLIC
3 ENGAGEMENT OR OPEN MEETING REQUIREMENTS IF APPROVED TODAY THE
4 ITEM WOULD FORMALLY ALLOW THE COUNCIL TO USE REMOTE
5 PARTICIPATION AROUND FRAMEWORK ALREADY AUTHORIZED BY MTC ABAG
6 WHILE PRESERVING EXPECTATION THAT IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE IS
7 DEFAULT WHENEVER POSSIBLE STAFF WILL ENSURE AUTHORIZATION AND
8 RENEW TIMELINE REQUIRED BY STATE LAW STAFF RECOMMENDS APPROVAL
9 OF THIS ITEM REQUESTING A MOTION TO AUTHORIZE REMOTE
10 PARTICIPATION FOR COUNCIL MEETINGS UNDER SENATE BILL 707, THAT
11 IN-PERSON PARTICIPATION REMAINS THE PREFERRED ENCOURAGED
12 OPTION. DO I HAVE A MOTION TO PUT THIS FORWARD?

13

14 **ALEXANDER MADRID:** QUESTION, FIRST REMOTE FOR THIS MEETING DOES
15 THAT INCLUDE SUBCOMMITTEE AS WELL?

16

17 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YES IT WOULD APPLY TO SUBS AS WELL. MR. LAVERY?

18

19 **CHARLES LAVERY:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

22

23 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** I SAW A MOTION TO APPROVE BY MEMBER
24 LAVERY. WHO WAS THE SECOND FROM?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** JOSH.

2

3 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY. AND THERE -- SO, NOW THAT WE
4 HAVE THE MOTION, WE CAN HAVE DISCUSSION. SO, MEMBER KALLINS,
5 YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH, I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY, DOES THIS
8 CONTINUE THE REQUIREMENTS OF BEING IN A PUBLIC PLACE, POSTING
9 -- SO, WE COULD ATTEND FROM HOME?

10

11 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH, GREATLY LIBERALIZES YOUR ABILITY TO
12 ATTEND FROM HOME.

13

14 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY THANKS FOR THE CLARIFICATION.
15 ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? MEMBER BENITEZ.
16 MEMBER SHEPHARD?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, DIANA BENITEZ:** I JUST HAVE A QUESTION. RIGHT NOW WE
19 HAVE TWO COUNCIL MEMBERS ONLINE, BUT ONE IS ONLY PARTICIPATING
20 AS PUBLIC COMMENT AND SOMEONE, SO, CAN YOU EXPLAIN LIKE FOR
21 THE FUTURE, FOR SOME OF US THAT ARE CONSIDERING THIS, WHAT DO
22 WE DO AHEAD OF TIME SO THAT WE DON'T SHOW UP AS PUBLIC
23 COMMENT?

24

25 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SO, IT WOULD HAVE BEEN A HURDLE, ALTHOUGH COULD



APRIL 3, 2026

1 HAVE DONE A PUBLIC MEETING IN BRAZIL AND WOULD HAVE HAD TO
2 NOTICE IT AND ALLOW FOR PUBLIC ACCESS TO IT, BUT IT'S SIMPLER
3 AROUND THE CURRENT RULES TO ATTEND AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC,
4 BUT IN THE FUTURE, HE WOULD HAVE THE ABILITY TO LET FRED AND I
5 KNOW A WEEK OR TWO BEFOREHAND AND WE WOULD ALLOW THAT TO
6 HAPPEN SO BASICALLY WOULD LOWER THE THRESHOLD FOR REMOTE
7 PARTICIPATION JOHN I MIGHT BE SPEAKING OUT OF HAND?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YEAH THAT'S CORRECT. WE WOULD ASK STILL NOTIFY EITHER
10 CLERK FRED HERE AS EARLY AS POSSIBLE JUST SO WE CAN RECORD IT
11 IN THE MINUTES AND DO ANY NOTE TAKING OR DOCUMENTATION THAT WE
12 NEED TO DO.

13

14 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** MEMBER SHEPHARD?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE VOTING ON THE BROWN ACT LAW WHERE THEY DON'T
17 HAVE TO HAVE POSTED DON'T HAVE TO ALLOW PEOPLE TO COME TO
18 THEIR HOUSE?

19

20 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH REDUCES THE CHANCE YOU HAVE TO OPEN YOUR
21 HOUSE TO STRANGERS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** DOES THIS INCLUDE THE DISABILITY ONE WHERE YOU HAVE
24 TO -- IS AT THE SAME OR DIFFERENT?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH THE DISABILITY IS ALREADY BAKED IN SO IT
2 HAS BROADER ALLOWANCES ALREADY. IF YOU HAVE A DISABILITY THAT
3 PREVENTS YOU FROM ATTENDING.

4

5 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** OKAY, JUST EMPHASIZE WHAT STAFF
6 SHARED IN THE REPORT YES WE LOVE THAT THERE IS FLEXIBILITY
7 IT'S GREAT WE CAN ALL SEE HAVING EVERYONE BEING HERE GET TO
8 SEE EACH OTHER FACE-TO-FACE HAVE LUNCH AND BREAKFAST AND
9 COFFEE WITH EACH OTHER REALLY CUTS DOWN A LOT OF COST
10 INTERACTING WHEN YOU'RE REMOTE WE GET DO IT MORE EFFECTIVELY
11 WHEN WE GET TO HANG OUT JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT. I HOPE WE
12 SEE EVERYONE PRESENT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE WHENEVER YOU CAN.
13 MEMBER LAVERY?

14

15 **CHARLES LAVERY:** YES I WANT TO COMMENT AS EVERYBODY IS PROBABLY
16 NOTICED WHEN EVERYBODY'S PRESENT THE VOTES GO A LOT FASTER AND
17 MAKES OUR MEETINGS GO FASTER WHEN PEOPLE ARE REMOTE IT TAKES
18 ROLL CALL VOTE FOR EVERY ACTION ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
21 ITEM.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
24 THIS ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
25 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** WILL THE CLERK CALL THE ROLL CALL
3 VOTE.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THE MOTION LAVERY, SECOND SAUNDERS.
6 VOTE ON THE MOTION. VICTORINA ARVELO?

7

8 **VICTORINA AREVELO:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** PADMA BALAJI?

11

12 **PADMA BALAJI:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MICHAEL BALDINI?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** BENITEZ?

19

20 **V. CHAIR, DIANA BENITEZ:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANTRELL?

23

24 **CHUCK CANTRELL:** AYE.

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CHANG?

2

3 **AMANDA CHANG:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CUSHMAN?

6

7 **WARREN CUSHMAN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DESMANGLES?

10

11 **ASHTON DESMANGLES:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUONG?

14

15 **BRYANT DUONG:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:**

18

19 **JULIA GERASIMENKO:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HANKERSON?

22

23 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** KALLINS?



APRIL 3, 2026

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** LAST REEF?

5

6 **CHARLES LAVERY:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MADRID? MILES?

9

10 **R. SHAY MILES:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MIRANTE? SOME NEMSICK?

13

14 **KAREN NEMSICK:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** HARSHFIELD? HARSH SALAZAR?

17

18 **MARLENE SALAZAR:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SAUNDERS?

21

22 **JOSHUA SAUNDERS:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SHEPHARD? TRACHTENBERG NOT PRESENT. WONG?

25



APRIL 3, 2026

1 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ORANTES IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
4 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU NEXT AGENDA ITEM 10A STAFF
7 LIAISON REPORT OVERVIEW OF RECENT MTC AND ABAG POLICY
8 DECISIONS AND OTHER ACTIVITY THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM OH
9 ACTUALLY WE JUST DID OUR FIRST ACTION ITEM. YAY. WE SHOULD
10 CELEBRATE OURSELVES. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM KY-NAM MILLER
11 WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT?

12

13 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I DO NOT HAVE MUCH TO ADD TO MY WRITTEN REPORT
14 ALTHOUGH I WILL SAY THE APPLICATIONS FOR THE NORMAN MINETA
15 HIGH SCHOOL ACADEMY OPEN AND I'LL SEND AN E-MAIL REMINDING YOU
16 OF IT PLEASE SPREAD THE WORD SO THERE IS HIGH SCHOOL YOUTH YOU
17 KNOW EITHER DIRECTLY OR IN YOUR NETWORKS ENCOURAGE THEM TO
18 APPLY IN OUR SUMMER PROGRAM. THAT'S IT.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** ANY COUNCIL MEMBER DISCUSSION? AM THE
21 CLERK LET US KNOW IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR
22 THIS ITEM?

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THIS ITEM, NO WRITTEN COMMENTS
25 RECEIVED. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR



APRIL 3, 2026

1 COMMENT, NONE IN ATTENDEE SPACE.

2

3 **CHAIR, CARINA VINH LIEU:** THANK YOU SO MUCH NOW WE WILL MOVE TO
4 AGENDA ITEM 11. THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE MTC ABAG
5 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD MAY 1ST, 2026 AND
6 BEFORE I ADJOURN I JUST HAVE ONE COMMENT I WANT TO
7 CONGRATULATE US ON HAVING A MEETING TOGETHER -- [LAUGHTER] --
8 AND THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR EVERYONE'S LEADERSHIP IN COMMITTING
9 TO THIS PROCESS AND BEING HERE AND SHOWING UP AND DOING YOUR
10 WORK, YOUR PREWORK TO DO -- READ THE MATERIALS AND ENGAGE WITH
11 THE STAFF AND I JUST HOPE THAT AS WE KEEP MOVING WE CONTINUE
12 TO BE THIS ENGAGED TO READ THE REPORTS IN ADVANCE AND COME IN
13 COMMENTS AND TO REALLY REFLECT ON THE THINGS THAT STAFF HAVE
14 ASKED US TO FOCUS ON, I THINK THAT CAN REALLY HELP BE AS
15 EFFECTIVE AS POSSIBLE AS COUNCIL MEMBERS. SO THANK YOU SO
16 MUCH. AND CONGRATULATIONS TO VICE CHAIR BENITEZ. THIS MEETING
17 OF THE MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ADJOURNED.
18 [ADJOURNED]