# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, MAY 28 <sup>TH</sup> , 2025, 9:35 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING
6	OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS MEETING IS
7	BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF
8	THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE
9	THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. AND AND I WILL CALL
10	UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME, OR ACTUALLY [INDISCERNIBLE]
11	IS GOING TO DO THAT. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
12	UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL
13	CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
14	
15	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR NOACK?
16	
17	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
20	
21	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ABE-KOGA?
24	
25	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.



1	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?
3	
4	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ANDERSEN? [ AUDIO DISTORTION ]
7	
8	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THERE WE GO.
9	
10	CANDACE ANDERSEN: HERE FROM SUPERVISOR KEN CARLSON'S OFFICE,
11	FOR CANDACE ANDERSEN.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?
14	
15	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER BURT?
18	
19	PAT BURT: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
22	
23	DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
24	
25	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: EL-TAWANSY, NON-VOTING?



1	
2	SPEAKER: HERE.
3	
4	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?
5	
6	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER ANDERSON? COMMISSIONER
9	FLEMING KEEPS UNMUTING HERSELF. COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY, NON-
10	VOTING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
11	
12	VICTORIA FLEMING: I'M HERE. BUT I'M HEARING THREE DIFFERENT
13	MEETINGS SIMULTANEOUSLY BEING CAST. IT'S VERY, VERY CONFUSING
14	
15	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: JUST USE THE ZOOM LINK AND GET RID OF
16	THE OTHER ONE THAT'S ON LEGISTAR THAT'S ON THE MTC PAGE.
17	BECAUSE THOSE ARE DELAYED. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI,
18	NON-VOTING?
19	
20	DOREEN GIACOPINI: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?
23	
24	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: HERE.



1	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.
2	COMMISSIONER MANFREE?
3	
4	AMBER MANFREE: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MASHBURN?
7	
8	MITCH MASHBURN: HERE.
9	
10	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MILEY?
11	
12	NATHAN MILEY: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PAPAN?
15	
16	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RAMOS? IS ABSENT. SCHAFF NON-VOTING? IS
19	ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.
20	
21	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. VICTORIA, I BELIEVE, IS MAKING A
22	REQUEST FOR PARTICIPATION UNDER AB2449.
23	



VICTORIA FLEMING: THANK YOU CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO PARTICIPATE 1 REMOTELY UNDER AB2449 DUE TO MEDICAL ILLNESS THERE IS NOBODY 2 3 UNDER THE AGE OF 18 IN THE ROOM WITH ME. 4 5 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED, COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS PRESENT FOR THIS MEETING. IF EVERYBODY 6 WOULD PLEASE JOIN IN THE ROOM THERE FOR THE PLEDGE OF 7 8 ALLEGIANCE. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC 9 10 FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL." 11 12 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION 13 14 ANNOUNCEMENT? 15 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE 17 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP 18 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A 19 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH 20 21 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. 22 23 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: AGENDA ITEM FOUR IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT.

BEFORE WE GET INTO THE BUSINESS OF THE DAY, I'M SAD TO SHARE

WITH YOU THAT FORMER AND LONGSTANDING MTC COMMISSIONER,

24



- 1 FEDERAL GLOVER, DIED ON SUNDAY MAY 18TH AT THE AGE OF 69.
- 2 COMMISSIONER GLOVER WAS THE FIRST AFRICAN AMERICAN ELECTED TO
- 3 THE CONTRA COSTA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND LOGGED MANY
- 4 CIVIC ACHIEVEMENTS IN HIS NEARLY THREE DECADES OF PUBLIC
- 5 SERVICE. HE SERVED SIX TERMS ON THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND
- 6 WAS APPOINTED TO THE COMMISSION IS 2006 AND SERVED UNTIL HIS
- 7 RETIREMENT FROM PUBLIC OFFICE JUST A FEW MONTHS AGO. DURING
- 8 HIS 18 YEARS ON THE COMMISSION, HE WAS A LONG TIME CHAIR OF
- 9 THE BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND LIFE CYCLE ANALYSIS GUIDE
- 10 MAINTENANCE AND REHABILITATION PLANS ON STATE OWNED TOLL
- 11 BRIDGES AS WELL AS ADOPTION OF \$2 BILLION PLUS TOLL BRIDGE
- 12 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROGRAMS, AMONG MANY OTHER
- 13 ACCOMPLISHMENTS. COMMISSIONER GLOVER WAS A CHAMPION OF
- 14 PROGRAMS THAT REDUCE BARRIERS TO MOBILITY FOR LOWER INCOME
- 15 RESIDENTS, SUCH AS CLIPPER START, EXPRESS LANES START, AND THE
- 16 BAY AREA TOLL PAYMENT PLAN. COMMISSIONER GLOVER'S MOST
- 17 IMPRESSIVE ACCOMPLISHMENT MAY HAVE BEEN HIS RECOVERED FROM
- 18 CRITICAL ILLNESS, ONE THAT REQUIRED HEART TRANSPLANT AND
- 19 DOUBLE KIDNEY TRANSPLANT IN 2015. COMMISSIONER GLOVER'S DEEP
- 20 FAITH, PERSONAL STRENGTH, COURAGE, RESILIENCE AND
- 21 PERSEVERANCE, HE WAS ABLE TO EXTEND HIS REMARKABLE LIFE FOR
- 22 ANOTHER DECADE. WE WILL ADJOURN TODAY'S MEETING IN HIS HONOR.
- 23 NOTE THAT I, ALONG WITH COMMISSIONER ANDERSON AND EXECUTIVE
- 24 STAFF WILL BE LEAVING THIS MEETING EARLY TODAY TO ATTEND
- 25 FEDERAL'S FUNERAL, AS IT'S HAPPENING LATER THIS MORNING. AND



- 1 AT THAT TIME, I'LL TURN THE MEETING OVER TO VICE CHAIR
- 2 MOULTON-PETERS. AFTER THE NEXT ITEM, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO
- 3 STEPHANIE. AGENDA ITEM 4A TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE
- 4 UPDATE. WE'LL RECEIVE AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION OF THIRD-
- 5 PARTY INDEPENDENT REVIEW OF TRANSIT OPERATOR SHORTFALLS AND
- 6 REVIEW OF LOCAL CONTRIBUTION TO BART AND CALTRAIN AS WELL AS
- 7 UPDATE ON SENATE BILL 63 WIENER AND ARREGUIN, TRANSPORTATION
- 8 REVENUE MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
- 9 ALIX BOCKELMAN, WHO IS SITTING RIGHT NEXT TO ME, FOR HER
- 10 COMMENTS.

- 12 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. AND GOOD MORNING,
- 13 COMMISSIONERS. THIS INFORMATION ITEM ON THE TRANSPORTATION
- 14 REVENUE MEASURE IS IN TWO PARTS. FIRST, WE HAVE A PRESENTATION
- 15 BY MGO ON THE THIRD-PARTY INDEPENDENT REVIEW. AFTER THAT
- 16 PRESENTATION, WE'LL PAUSE FOR QUESTIONS ON THE THIRD-PARTY
- 17 REVIEW, AND NEXT MTC STAFF, GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN WILL PROVIDE
- 18 A LEGISLATIVE UPDATE ON SENATE BILL 63, INCLUDING AN
- 19 ILLUSTRATION OF HOW TRANSFORMATION FUNDING COULD SUPPORT
- 20 RIDER-FOCUSED ENHANCEMENTS AND A LOOK AHEAD AT IMPORTANT
- 21 DATES. SEVERAL MONTHS AGO, FOLLOWING CONCLUSION OF THE
- 22 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE'S WORK, MTC
- 23 WAS TASKED WITH ENGAGING A CONSULTANT TO PERFORM A THIRD-PARTY
- 24 INDEPENDENT REVIEW OF TRANSIT OPERATOR FINANCES AND THE
- 25 DEVELOPMENT OF FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES THAT COULD BE USED TO



- 1 INFORM COUNTY CONTRIBUTIONS TO REGIONAL OPERATORS WITH
- 2 OPERATING SHORTFALLS. IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE COMMITTEE OF
- 3 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, MTC SELECTED MGO TO PERFORM
- 4 THIS INDEPENDENT REVIEW. THE ASSIGNMENT WAS AMBITIOUS TO
- 5 COMPLETE A DETAILED FINANCIAL VALIDATION AND DEVELOP
- 6 PRELIMINARY FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES IN JUST UNDER THREE
- 7 MONTHS THE WORK REQUIRED CLOSE COORDINATION ACROSS MULTIPLE
- 8 AGENCIES AND REPRESENTS A SIGNIFICANT ANALYTICAL EFFORT. IT'S
- 9 IMPORTANT TO SET EXPECTATIONS ABOUT WHAT THE THIRD-PARTY
- 10 REVIEW WAS AND WHAT IT WASN'T INTENDED TO ACCOMPLISH. THE GOAL
- 11 WAS TO PROVIDE AN INDEPENDENT CHECK ON THE SCALE AND SCOPE OF
- 12 OPERATING SHORTFALLS AND TO LAY THE GROUNDWORK FOR DISCUSSIONS
- 13 ABOUT REGIONAL FUNDING STRATEGIES. MGO WAS NOT ASKED TO
- 14 STANDARDIZE ASSUMPTIONS AGENCIES OR PASS ADJUSTMENT ON AGENCY
- 15 DECISIONS BUT RATHER TO DOCUMENT COMPARE AND HIGHLIGHT
- 16 DIFFERENCES IN A TRANSPARENT WAY. ON THE FAIR SHARE SIDE MGO
- 17 REVIEWED HISTORICAL AGREEMENTS AND BEST PRACTICES FROM ACROSS
- 18 THE COUNTRY TO PROPOSE SCENARIOS THAT COULD SERVE AS A
- 19 STARTING POINT CERTAINLY NOT A CONCLUSION FOR A REGIONAL
- 20 NEGOTIATIONS BY SB63 ON THE LEGISLATIVE SIDE WITH RECENT
- 21 AMENDMENTS TO SENATE BILL 63 INCLUDING REMOVAL OF THE
- 22 RESPONSIBILITY PLAN WHICH IS CALLED THE T-FRP THE COMMISSION
- 23 IS NOW ON RECORD IN FULL SUPPORT OF THE BILL THE LEGISLATION
- 24 STILL ANTICIPATES THAT OPERATORS WILL COME TOGETHER AROUND A
- 25 CON SENSES US EXPENDITURE PLAN THIS SUMMER AND THIS REPORT BY



- 1 FACT THE BASE FOUNDATION TO INFORM THOSE CONVERSATIONS AND MTC
- 2 STAFF ARE CONTINUING TO OFFER TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WITH THAT
- 3 EFFORT WHICH IS BEING LED BY THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
- 4 AGENCIES AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO SCHRUTI HARI,
- 5 MTC'S FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM SECTION, WHO WORKS CLOSELY WITH
- 6 MGO AND OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS SO SHE CAN PROVIDE A
- 7 BIT MORE ON THE SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY AND REPORT BEFORE
- 8 INTRODUCING THE LEAD.

- 10 SHRUTI HARI: THANK YOU ALIX AND GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK,
- 11 COMMISSIONERS. AS MENTIONED MGO WAS BROUGHT IN TO DO AN
- 12 INDEPENDENT THIRD-PARTY REVIEW OF FIVE BAY AREA TRANSIT
- 13 OPERATORS WITH THE LARGEST PROJECTED OPERATING DEFICITS BART,
- 14 SFMTA, CALTRAIN AC TRANSIT GOLDEN GATE THE MAIN GOAL OF THIS
- 15 REVIEW WAS TO CONFIRM NEAR-TERM OPERATING DEFICITS REPORTED BY
- 16 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ESSENTIALLY TO BRING TRANSPARENCY TO
- 17 THESE NUMBERS ALSO SUMMARIZE KEY FINANCIAL SERVICE
- 18 CHARACTERISTICS ACROSS THE REGION, TASKED WITH PROVIDING
- 19 INFORMATION AND FAIR SHARE ALLOCATION METHODOLOGIES
- 20 SPECIFICALLY MGO ENGAGEMENT INCLUDE REVIEWING OPERATOR
- 21 SUBMITTED FINANCIAL PROJECTIONS AGAINST PUBLIC DATA AND
- 22 AUDITED STATEMENTS LOOKING AT RESERVES IN THE CONTEXT OF EACH
- 23 AGENCY POLICIES AND HOW FINALIZED MOVED BETWEEN OPERATING AND
- 24 CAPITAL BUDGETS SUMMARIZING NOW SERVICE LEVELS LINE UP WITH
- 25 EXPECTED DEMAND DOCUMENTING CURRENT AND POTENTIAL COST SAVINGS



- 1 AND REVENUE GENERATING STRATEGIES AND TO FLAG WHERE
- 2 ASSUMPTIONS OR PRACTICES DIFFERED FROM BROADER TRANSIT TRENDS
- 3 OR INDUSTRY BEST PRACTICES. WHAT MGO WAS NOT TASKED WITH WAS
- 4 ENFORCING STANDARDIZED ASSUMPTIONS ACROSS OPERATORS NOR
- 5 OFFERING OPINIONS ON POLICY OR FINANCIAL DECISIONS IN TERMS OF
- 6 REVIEW COMPARED TO OPERATOR FINANCIAL PROJECTIONS FOR FISCAL
- 7 YEARS 26 TO 30 AGAINST HISTORICAL AND AUDITED INFORMATION ARE
- 8 FROM FISCAL YEARS '19 TO '24 AS WELL AS LOOKING AT FISK '25
- 9 BOARD 3R50U6D BUDGETS OPERATIVE STAFF HAD MULTIPLE
- 10 OPPORTUNITIES TO REVIEW AND CLARIFY THE INFORMATION MGO USED
- 11 AND THOSE INPUTS WERE INCORPORATED TIMELY SUBSTANTIATED I WANT
- 12 TO NOTE HERE GIVEN THE COMPRESSED TIME FRAME MTC AND MGO ARE
- 13 APPRECIATIVE OF THE TIME AND ATTENTION BY THE TRANSIT
- 14 OPERATORS NOW ANALYSIS WE ARE TALKING ABOUT TODAY IS BASED ON
- 15 DATA SUBMITTED BY THE OPERATORS BETWEEN FEBRUARY AND APRIL
- 16 2025 UPDATES RECEIVED AFTER APRIL REFERENCED IN NARRATIVE FORM
- 17 BUT CORE FINANCIALS REMAINED VALIDATED DURING THAT REVIEW
- 18 WINDOW, I WANT TO NOTE HERE SFMTA SUBMITTED SOME LATE BREAKING
- 19 TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS TO EXPENSE CATEGORIZATIONS WHICH HAVE
- 20 NOW BEEN INCORPORATED INTO THE FINAL VERSION OF THE REPORT. ON
- 21 THE FAIR SHARE COMPONENT MGO REVIEWED SEVERAL HISTORICAL
- 22 AGREEMENTS SUCH AS THE BART SAMTRANS COMPREHENSIVE AGREEMENT
- 23 AND CALTRAIN'S GOVERNANCE MOUS AND ASSESSED RECENT COUNTY
- 24 CONTRIBUTIONS. THEY ALSO MODELED A FEW DIFFERENT ALLOCATION
- 25 METHODOLOGIES, INCLUDING A BENEFIT BASED APPROACH, ABILITY TO



1

# MAY 28, 2025

PAY, AND HYBRID OPTIONS, ARE ALL OF WHICH YOU WILL SEE IN THE

SLIDE DECK PRESENTATION FROM MGO TODAY. AND THESE WERE DRAWING 2 3 FROM BEST PRACTICES NATIONALLY AND INTERNATIONALLY. I DO WANT TO, AGAIN, NOTE HERE, BECAUSE THIS IS IMPORTANT, IS THIS THESE 4 5 METHODOLOGIES ARE INTENDED AS INPUTS AND REFERENCE POINTS NOT RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE EXPENDITURE PLAN DEVELOPMENT UNDER 6 SB63. TO THAT END, MTC STAFF HAS BEEN ACTIVELY SUPPORTING CTA 7 8 LEAD EXPENDITURE PLAN DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS BY PROVIDING UPON REQUEST KEY IMPORTS LIKE FUNDING WORKSHEETS MGO FOR EXAMPLE 9 STARTING POINT DATA AS WELL AS TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE, AT THE 10 OUTSET THIS REPORT IS MEANT TO PROVIDE A SHARED BASELINE CLEAR 11 INDEPENDENT LOOK AT NUMBERS TO SUPPORT PRODUCTIVE REGIONAL 12 DISCUSSIONS MOVING FORWARD I'LL TURN IT OVER TO KYLE O'ROURKE 13 FROM MGO TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE FINDINGS IN MORE DETAIL I'LL 14 15 REQUEST THE TECH TEAM TO BRING UP THE SLIDE. 16 KYLE O'ROURKE: THANK YOU ALIX FOR THE INTRODUCTION GOOD 17 MORNING, EVERYONE MY NAME IS KYLE O'ROURKE I'M PARTNER WITH 18 MGO AND LEAD A LOT OF OUR ADVISORY CONSULTING WORK FOR STATE 19 AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS INCLUDING TRANSIT AGENCIES PLEASURE TO 20 21 BE WITH YOU TODAY LOOK FORWARD TO THE COORDINATION. I WANT TO REITERATE APPRECIATION TO THE OPERATORS AS WELL AS THE TEAM AT 22 MTC. A LOT OF INFORMATION PRESENTED TO US OVER THE LAST TWO OR 23 THREE MONTHS AND A LOT OF EFFORT BY OPERATORS TO HELP US THERE 24 FINANCIAL OPERATIONS AND DIVE INTO SOME OF THEIR NUMBERS THANK 25



- 1 YOU ALL VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION. NEXT SLIDE. TODAY
- 2 WE'RE GOING TO COVER BRIEFLY THE PROJECT OVERVIEW. I THINK YOU
- 3 GOT IT I'LL SKIP THOSE SLIDES GENERALLY SPEAKING AND GO TO
- 4 ITEMS 4 AND 5 ON THE AGENDA WHICH GET TO COMPONENTS OF OUR
- 5 ANALYSIS SHORTFALLS AND FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES. JUMP FORWARD
- 6 TWO SLIDES. WE CAN SKIP -- IF YOU WANT TO SEE OUR TEAM MEMBERS
- 7 THEY'RE ON THE PRIOR SIDE. IN TERMS OF OVERVIEW TWO LARGE
- 8 COMPONENTS FIRST OF WHICH IS LOOKING AT SHORTFALLS PROJECTED
- 9 DEFICITS ACROSS FIVE TRANSIT OPERATORS, SECOND COMPONENT
- 10 ANALYSIS AROUND FAIR SHARE FOR B.A.R.T. AND CALTRAIN. PERIOD
- 11 REVIEW COVERED ADDITIONALLY I WANT TO MENTION THE SUBSEQUENT
- 12 SLIDES TWO PERIODS REFERENCED FIRST FY '26 THROUGH FY '30
- 13 PERIOD, A FIVE-YEAR PERIOD THIS'S THE FOCAL FOCUS OF OUR
- 14 ANALYSIS HOWEVER WE WANT TO COMMENT ON SPECIFICALLY FINAL FOUR
- 15 YEARS OF THAT PERIOD FY '27 THROUGH '30 THE REASON THOSE YEARS
- 16 SHORTFALLS OR DEFICITS ARE LARGEST, LOOKING AT FIVE-YEAR
- 17 PERIOD BUT NOTES ON THE FOUR YEAR PERIOD SPECIFICALLY IN OUR
- 18 PRESENTATION. JUMP TO THE METHODOLOGY. I'LL COVER THIS
- 19 OUICKLY. EXCHANGED A WHOLE HOST OF FINANCIAL INFORMATION
- 20 PRIMARILY THE FINANCIAL FORECAST. WE MET WITH THE VARIOUS
- 21 OPERATORS, MTC, AS WELL AS MTC TO DISCUSS THE NATURE OF THOSE
- 22 FINANCIAL PROJECTIONS, AND DIVE DEEP INTO THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT
- 23 DRIVE THEM. WE CONDUCTED A HOST OF ANALYSIS YOU CAN SEE A LIST
- 24 ON YOUR SCREEN RIGHT NOW TAKING A LOOK AT RESERVES CAPITAL
- 25 TRANSFERS COST SAVINGS ACTIONS ALL DETAILED IN OUR REPORT, TO



- 1 SOME EXTENT IN TODAY'S PRESENTATION. WE'RE IN THE MIDST OF OUR
- 2 REPORTING PROCESS. SO, WE CAN JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE WHICH IS
- 3 THE FIRST SLIDE WITH DATA. WE HAVE A FEW SLIDES AT THE ONSET
- 4 OF THE PRESENTATION, WHICH COVER THE SHORTFALLS AT THE
- 5 CUMULATIVE OR AGGREGATE LEVEL ACROSS THESE FIVE OPERATORS. AND
- 6 THEN WE'LL HAVE A SLIDE FOR EACH OPERATOR SUBSEQUENTLY. ON
- 7 YOUR SCREEN RIGHT NOW YOU SEE THE -- A CHART WITH THE
- 8 SHORTFALLS BY OPERATOR, BY YEAR, THAT ARE COLOR CODED AND AT
- 9 THE BOTTOM YOU SEE THE CUMULATIVE DEFICIT ACROSS THE FIVE-YEAR
- 10 PERIOD. FOCUSING IN ON THE FOUR-YEAR PERIOD, WHERE YOU CAN SEE
- 11 DEFICITS THAT ARE AT THEIR LARGEST. LOOKING AT CUMULATIVE
- 12 DEFICIT SHY OF \$3.7 BILLION OR \$915,000,000 ANNUALLY OVER THAT
- 13 FOUR-YEAR PERIOD '27 TO '30. NEXT SLIDE. KEY DRIVERS OF THESE
- 14 DEFICITS, AGGREGATOR CUMULATIVE LEVEL: OF COURSE, THE DECREASE
- 15 IN RIDERSHIP RESULTING IMPACTS TO FAREBOX REVENUE THAT
- 16 OCCURRED DURING THE PANDEMIC, AND THEN RELATIVE SLOW TO
- 17 RECOVER SINCE. SIMULTANEOUS TO THAT, EXPENSES HAVE INCREASED
- 18 AND CONTINUE TO INCREASE AT HIGHER RATE THAN REVENUE. AND OVER
- 19 THE 11-YEAR PERIOD, WE SAW AN AVERAGE ANNUAL INCREASE ACROSS
- 20 THE OPERATORS OF 4% ON EXPENSES. AND OF THE EXPENSES, WAGE AND
- 21 LABOR EXPENSES GENERALLY ARE THE LARGEST COST CATEGORY. WE
- 22 HAVE SEEN SIGNIFICANT INCREASES IN THOSE COST CATEGORIES IN
- 23 RECENT YEARS AND CONTINUE IN SUBSEQUENT FIVE-YEAR PERIOD. IT'S
- 24 WORTH NOTING, GENERALLY, EXPENSES ACCOUNT FOR MORE THAN 50% OF
- 25 ANNUAL EXPENSES FOR EACH OPERATOR. SO, A SIGNIFICANT DRIVER OF



**METROPOLITAN** 

- 1 INCREASE IN EXPENSE. GO AHEAD AND JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE. ON
- 2 THIS SLIDE WE KEY THE TOP FIVE EXPENSE CATEGORIES SPECIFICALLY
- 3 IN FY '26, AND AGAIN YOU SEE HERE LABOR IS THE MOST
- 4 SIGNIFICANT DRIVER OF EXPENSES ACROSS OPERATORS AND THEN OTHER
- 5 COST CATEGORIES INCLUDING OUTSOURCED SERVICES, PROFESSIONAL
- 6 SERVICES, ELECTRICITY, FOR EXAMPLE, FOR CALTRAIN, WHO IS
- 7 ELECTRIFIED THEIR FLEET RECENTLY, SOME OTHER COST CATEGORIES
- 8 WE SEE IN THE TOP FIVE COST BY OPERATOR. IT'S WORTH NOTING
- 9 THAT IN THE APPENDIX OF THIS PRESENTATION WE DIVE DEEPER INTO
- 10 EACH OF THESE NUMBERS BY OPERATOR. THIS IS THE AGGREGATE LEVEL
- 11 HERE. IF WE JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE WHICH PROVIDES A SNAPSHOT
- 12 OF FAREBOX REVENUE OVER THIS 11 YEAR PERIOD. FY 20AND 21 WE
- 13 SEE SIGNIFICANT DECREASES IN FAREBOX REVENUE AND THEN RATE OF
- 14 GROWTH THAT OCCURS, MODERATE RATE OF GROWTH THAT OCCURS POST-
- 15 PANDEMIC AND FROM '26, ONWARD. AT THE BOTTOM, WE HAVE A CHART
- 16 THAT COMPARES FAREBOX REVENUE AND FY '19 TO FAREBOX REVENUE IN
- 17 FY '30. WORTH NOTING THIS IS ON A NOMINAL BASIS WITHIN OUR
- 18 ACTUAL REPORT WE DO CALCULATIONS IN TERMS OF FAREBOX REVENUE
- 19 FACTORING IN, INFLATION, BUT HAD IS ON A NOMINAL BASIS.
- 20 JUMPING TO OUR NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS, SLIDE SHOWS REVENUE HOURS.
- 21 VEHICLE REVENUE HOURS BY FISCAL YEAR, BY OPERATOR. IT'S NOT
- 22 THE SAME AS RIDERSHIP. WE WANT TO MAKE NOTE OF THAT. THE BUT
- 23 THE OPERATORS ARE PROJECTING INCREASES TO RIDERSHIP RANGING
- 24 FROM 1% TO 10%. NOW, IN TERMS OF VEHICLE REVENUE HOURS,
- 25 SIMILARLY WE SEE SOME DECREASES IN THE INITIAL YEARS OF THE



- 1 PANDEMIC AND RECOVERY SINCE. THE NEXT SLIDES BEGIN OUR
- 2 OPERATOR SPECIFIC SLIDES, AND WHAT YOU SEE, OR WILL SEE BEFORE
- 3 YOU ARE A SINGLE SLIDE BY OPERATOR THAT SHOWS THE REVENUE
- 4 EXPENSE, DEFICIT BY YEAR. SO, THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE SEEING IN
- 5 FRONT OF YOU RIGHT NOW SPECIFICALLY FOR AC TRANSIT. AGAIN, YOU
- 6 WILL SEE THIS MORE TO A GREATER DEGREE WITH OTHER OPERATORS
- 7 BUT THE FOUR-YEAR PERIOD FY '27 THROUGH '30 IS THE FOUR YEARS
- 8 WHERE WE SEE MOST SIGNIFICANT DEFICITS IN THIS QUAIS AHMADYAAR
- 9 C TRANSIT IS PROJECTING A CUMULATIVE DEFICIT JUST SHY OF WHO
- 10 HUNDRED \$40 MILLION OR AVERAGE ANNUAL AMOUNT OF 60 MILLION.
- 11 ITEM WORTH NOTING AC TRANSIT WE DID NOTICE FROM FY '19 THROUGH
- 12 '25 THERE WERE SURPLUSES THAT CONALTIVELY REPRESENTED OVER \$2
- 13 MILLION THE NOTE AT THE BOTTOM EXPLAINS SOME OF THE USES OF
- 14 THOSE FUNDS CURRENTLY. JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AS NOTED
- 15 PREVIOUSLY, BART IS ONE OF THE OPERATORS WHERE THE PROJECTED
- 16 DEFICITS OF SIGNIFICANT FROM FY '27 TO '30. OVER THE FOUR-YEAR
- 17 PERIOD CUMULATIVE DEFICIT PROJECTED JUST SHY SUFFICIENT 1.5
- 18 BILLION OR SHY OF 30070s MILLION DOLLARS ANNUALLY WORTH NOTING
- 19 PROVIDED DETAIL IN THE REPORT APPENDIX IS THAT THERE ARE
- 20 FEDERAL EMERGENCY FUNDS THAT EXPIRE OR WILL BE DEPLETED IN FY
- 21 '26 ACCOUNT FOR JUST OVER \$300 MILLION IN FY '26 SO A
- 22 SIGNIFICANT DRIVER ONCE DEPLETED FOR DEFICITS IN FUTURE YEARS.
- 23 NEXT SLIDE. CALTRAIN IS PROJECTING \$282 MILLION CUMULATIVE
- 24 DEFICIT OVER THE FOUR-YEAR PERIOD, '27 THROUGH '30 WHICH IS
- 25 AVERAGE ROUGHLY JUST OVER \$70 MILLION ANNUALLY. WORTH NOTING



- 1 FOR CALTRAIN THAT EXPENSE GROWTH OUTPACES THE REVENUE GAINS IN
- 2 THE FUTURE YEARS. JUMPING TO OUR NEXT SLIDE, GOLDEN GATE.
- 3 GOLDEN GATE'S DEFICITS CUMULATIVE DEFICITS ARE \$225 MILLION
- 4 OVER THE FOUR-YEAR PERIOD THAT WE'RE FOCUSING ON, WHICH IS
- 5 JUST OVER \$55 MILLION ANNUALLY. AND, LASTLY, WE'LL LOOK AT
- 6 SFMTA, ACTUALLY, PROJECT A SURPLUS IN THE CURRENT YEAR,
- 7 HOWEVER OVER \$300 MILLION ANNUALLY IN SUBSEQUENT YEARS FOR A
- 8 CUMULATIVE DEFICIT OF JUST SHY OF 1.45 BILLION FROM '27 TO '30
- 9 OR JUST OVER \$360 MILLION ANNUALLY. SO, AGAIN, IN OUR REPORT,
- 10 WE GO INTO MUCH GREATER DETAIL IN TERMS OF THE DRIVERS OF
- 11 THESE DEFICITS. SOME HISTORICAL ANALYSIS FOR THE PRECEDING FEW
- 12 YEARS, AND THEN THE APPENDIX WE HAVE SOME OF THAT INFORMATION
- 13 AS WELL AS SNAPSHOT OF REVENUE CATEGORIES AND EXPENSE
- 14 CATEGORIES AND KEY DRIVERS TO THE FINANCIALS OF EACH OF THESE
- 15 OPERATORS. JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE THIS IS WHERE WE CHANGE
- 16 TOPICS TO THE SECOND AREA OF FOCUS FOR MGOS ANALYSIS AND
- 17 INDEPENDENT REVIEW WHICH IS CORRELATED TO FAIR SHARE. OUR
- 18 ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES FIRST THING WE BEGAN CONSULTING WITH
- 19 VARIOUS STAKEHOLDERS BART CALTRAIN MTC TO UNDERSTAND CURRENT
- 20 STATE OF AFFAIRS ON VARIOUS PERSPECTIVES WE LOOKED AT
- 21 AGREEMENTS THOSE ARE SUMMARIZED IN THE NARRATIVE REPORT
- 22 VARIOUS AGREEMENTS THAT LEAD TO OUR CURRENT STATE ARE
- 23 SUMMARIZED THEN WE DID SOME INDUSTRY RESEARCH LOOKED AT
- 24 SIMILAR ENTITIES WHO USE FAIR SHARE MODELS TO ALLOCATE COSTS
- 25 BOTH NATIONALLY AND INTERNATIONALLY AND SOME OF THOSE ARE



- 1 SUMMARIZED IN OUR REPORT AS WELL. ULTIMATELY THERE ARE THREE
- 2 METHODS TO ALLOCATE COST USING THREE FAIR SHARE ALLOCATION
- 3 METHODOLOGIES FIRST OF WHICH IS TO ASSIGN COST TO THE FOLKS
- 4 WHO ARE BENEFITTING, AND USING A BENEFIT'S BASED APPROACH.
- 5 ALTERNATIVELY ABILITY TO PAY APPROACHES OR LASTLY, THE HYBRID
- 6 APPROACHES CONSIDERING VARIABLES THAT ARE BOTH BENEFIT BASED
- 7 AND ABILITY TO PAY FOCUSED. JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS A
- 8 LOT OF INFORMATION ON THIS SLIDE. I WANT TO MAKE NOTE THAT THE
- 9 TABLE IN THE MIDDLE OF THE SLIDE IS COUNTY CONTRIBUTIONS
- 10 PERTAINING TO BART FOR FY '24, AND THESE ARE OPERATING EXPENSE
- 11 SPECIFIC. SO, IN FY '24, THAT TOTAL IS \$451 MILLION. WE WANTED
- 12 TO LAY OUT THE CURRENT STATE OF AFFAIRS AND PROVIDE A CURRENT
- 13 YEAR -- EXCUSE ME -- PROVIDE A RECENT YEAR OF DATA. AS WE
- 14 NOTE, WHAT WE DO, SUBSEQUENTLY, ON THE NEXT SLIDE IS TAKE
- 15 DEFICITS WHICH ARE OUTSIDE OF THESE EXISTING DOLLARS AND RUN
- 16 THAT ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLE OF FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES BUT
- 17 WANTED TO PROVIDE ON THIS SLIDE, SORT OF, A CURRENT STATE OF
- 18 AFFAIRS NOTING THAT ON SUBSEQUENT SLIDE SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS
- 19 NOT BEEN INCLUDED IN THE FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES DUE TO
- 20 EXISTING AGREEMENTS SO THAT SAID JUMP TO THE NEXT SLIDE. WE
- 21 RAN SEVERAL ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLES OF FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES
- 22 WE PUT BART'S DEFICIT \$378 MILLION FIGURE IN THE FY '27 MODELS
- 23 SHOWING RESULTS AS PERCENTAGES, THE NUMBER ISN'T SPECIFICALLY
- 24 IMPORTANT HOWEVER FY '27 FIRST YEAR BART'S DEFICITS OF
- 25 SIGNIFICANT WHICH IS WHY WE USE THE FY '20 NUMBER BENEFIT



- 1 BASED APPROACH WE RAN TWO SCENARIOS FOR FIRST ALLOCATED COST-
- 2 BASED ON BOARDINGS SECOND OF WHICH WE USED ALL DAY BOARDINGS
- 3 AND YOU CAN SEE SECONDLY WE LOOKED AT ABILITY PAY BASE
- 4 SCENARIOS RAN THOSE FIRST BASED ON PROPERTY TAX ASSESSED VALUE
- 5 SECOND POPULATION AND THIRD SALES TAX BASE. LASTLY WE RAN
- 6 SEVERAL HYBRID SCENARIOS WE PUT ALL OF THE PREVIOUSLY
- 7 MENTIONED DRIVERS INTO SCENARIOS, WEIGHING THEM 5050, AND YOU
- 8 CAN SEE THE RESULTING RANGES THERE AS WELL. THE INFORMATION
- 9 PERTAINING TO THE FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGY FOR BART. ON THE NEXT
- 10 SLIDE WE DO HIGHLIGHT THE WORK THAT WE DID, THE CONVERSATIONS
- 11 WE ENGAGED IN AS IT PERTAINS TO CALTRAIN. CALTRAIN DURING OUR
- 12 ANALYSIS WAS IN THE MIDST OF THESE CONVERSATIONS WITH MEMBER
- 13 AGENCIES AND AS A RESULT WE DID NOT CONDUCT THESE ANALYSIS
- 14 INDEPENDENTLY, IN THE MIDST OF NEGOTIATIONS. WE CAN SAY
- 15 THOUGH, AND THERE IS MORE INFORMATION IN THE REPORT ON THE,
- 16 SORT OF, CONSIDERATIONS THAT CALTRAIN IS CURRENTLY WORKING
- 17 WITH. AND THOSE DO INCLUDE VARIABLES, INCLUDING AM BOARDINGS,
- 18 ALL DAY BOARDINGS, MEASURE RR AND [INDISCERNIBLE] SERVICE.
- 19 GILROY SERVICE. THAT CONCLUDES OUR PREPARED REMARKS FOR TODAY
- 20 AND I THINK WE'RE READY FOR DISCUSSIONS OR QUESTIONS OR
- 21 ALTERNATIVELY, ALIX, FEEL FREE TO GUIDE US IN TERMS OF NEXT
- 22 STEPS.

24 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THIS IS CHAIR NOACK. STEPHANIE, I'M TURNING

25 THE MEETING OVER TO YOU AT THIS POINT, BECAUSE I'M UNABLE TO



- 1 SEE HANDS RAISED, AND SO ON. SO, IF YOU DON'T MIND, I'LL TURN
- 2 IT OVER TO YOU.

3

- 4 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HEY, COMMISSIONERS. ANY
- 5 QUESTIONS? I'M LOOKING TO MY LEFT. NO HAND RAISED. LOOKING TO
- 6 MY RIGHT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

7

8 GINA PAPAN: REALLY? THE ONLY ONE? COME ON.

9

10 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: SO FAR.

11

- 12 GINA PAPAN: SO FAR. THANK YOU. AMAZING WORK IN A VERY SHORT
- 13 PERIOD OF TIME. GREATLY APPRECIATED THAT. AND SOME VERY
- 14 IMPORTANT WORK. I THINK WE ALL LEARNED A LOT ABOUT EACH OTHER
- 15 AND THE OPERATORS WITHIN OUR REGION HERE. THERE IS ONE
- 16 DISCREPANCY FOR US. LET'S SEE, ON THE BART, I THINK IT'S THE
- 17 FAREBOX LOSSES, B.A.R.T. REPORTED 276 MILLION AND MTC SOMEHOW
- 18 HAS 310 MILLION. AND I THINK THAT PROBABLY IS RELATED TO THE
- 19 SAN MATEO COUNTY PORTION HERE. DO WE HAVE ANY DETAILS ON THE
- 20 DIFFERENTIALS AS REPORTED? OR COULD WE FIGURE THAT OUT? THAT'S
- 21 A BETTER QUESTION.

- 23 THERESA ROMMELL: I THINK MAYBE I CAN TAKE THIS ONE. THIS IS
- 24 THERESA ROMMEL WITH MTC. I THINK THE THEE HUNDRED 10 MILLION
- 25 FIGURE YOU QUOTED WAS FROM THE PRIOR, KIND OF, ESTIMATES OF



- 1 FARE LOSSES FOR BART. THAT ASSUMED A CERTAIN ESCALATION. THOSE
- 2 NUMBERS HAVE SINCE BEEN UPDATED WITH A LITTLE BIT LATER
- 3 INFORMATION AND THE MGO REPORT PRESENTS NUMBERS IN ON TWO
- 4 DIFFERENT WAYS BOTH NOMINAL AND ESCALATED BY INFLATION. SO,
- 5 THE NUMBERS IN THE REPORT ARE A BIT MORE UPDATED AND YOU HAVE
- 6 TO CONSIDER THAT THERE IS TWO DIFFERENT TYPES. THERE IS
- 7 ESCALATED AND NON-ESCALATED AND IN THE PRIOR YEARS, ESTIMATES
- 8 OF FARE LOSSES WE DID ESCALATE, THE FARES FROM FISCAL YEAR
- 9 '19, THROUGH FISCAL YEAR '24, I BELIEVE, BY A CERTAIN
- 10 PERCENTAGE RATE. SO THOSE NUMBERS ARE NOT COMPLETELY
- 11 COMPARABLE.

12

- 13 GINA PAPAN: THEY ARE DETERMINING FOR SOME OF US HERE. SO, BY
- 14 ESQ. -- CAN YOU DEFINE ESCALATED?

15

- 16 THERESA ROMMELL: ESCALATED MORE PIMPLES BY PERCENTAGE WHEN IT
- 17 BE INFLATION OR SOME OTHER INDEXING TOOL THAT YOU COME OUT TO
- 18 A CURRENT DAY VALUE FOR THAT FARE REVENUE OBVIOUSLY IN FISCAL
- 19 YEAR '19 FARES WERE AT A CERTAIN LEVEL BUT WE WOULD EXPECT
- 20 THOSE TO GROW WITH INFLATION OR INDEX RATE OVER TIME.

21

22 GINA PAPAN: I THINK I NEED MORE EXPLANATION ON THAT.



THERESA ROMMELL: I WANT TO SAY THE LARGER REPORT GOES MORE IN-1 DEPTH ON FARE LOSSES WHETHER YOU USE THE ESCALATOR OR NON-2 3 ESCALATED NUMBERS BOTH NUMBERS IN THERE. 4 5 GINA PAPAN: I GOT TWO DIFFERENT NUMBERS THERE SO WE CAN GET INTO THAT MORE A LOT OF DIFFERENT DETAILS HERE IN THE 6 INCLUSION SORRY I DON'T MEAN TO OFFEND ANYBODY. THE INCLUSION 7 8 OF GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT AS FAR AS EVALUATION MORE FOR FARES I'M NOT OUITE SURE IN SCOPE OF ANALYSIS. 9 10 THERESA ROMMELL: GOLDEN GATE WAS INCLUDED IN THE SCOPE FOR MGO 11 BECAUSE THEY HAVE A SIGNIFICANT SHORTFALL ONE OF THE OPERATORS 12 WITH THE LARGEST SHORTFALLS SO THOSE OPERATORS THAT HAD BEEN 13 PART OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE WORK REMAINED AS PART OF THE 14 15 SCOPE OF WORK FOR MGO. 16 GINA PAPAN: SO THEY WOULDN'T BE A PART OF THE SB63 PROPOSAL? 17 18 THERESA ROMMELL: NOT AT A THREE COUNTY OR EVEN FIVE COUNTY 19 20 LEVEL. NO. 21 GINA PAPAN: TWO MORE QUESTIONS HERE. THERE WAS SOME DISCUSSION 22 23 ABOUT REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDING FOR OPERATORS AND IT

SEEMED TO BE SOMEWHAT QUESTIONABLE IN -- FOR CERTAIN

OPERATORS, AS WHAT WAS COMING THROUGH MTC. WAS FURTHER

24



CLARIFICATION PROVIDED TO THE OPERATORS? SO, LIKE, SOME WERE 1 COUNTING IT, SOME WEREN'T COUNTING IT, AND KIND OF WHERE ARE 2 3 WE ON THAT FRONT? 4 5 THERESA ROMMELL: I BELIEVE THAT FOR REGIONAL MEASURE THREE, MOST OPERATORS DID NOT COUNT THAT PAST FISCAL YEAR '26, 6 BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT PROGRAMMED THOSE FUNDS MOVING FORWARD. YOU 7 8 KNOW, THOSE FUNDS, I THINK, ARE ANTICIPATED TO BE PROVIDED TO EXPRESS BUS OPERATORS. SO WE HAVE AN IDEA OF THE UNIVERSE OF 9 OPERATOR THAT CAN RECEIVE THOSE FUND BUT WE DO DON'T HAVE 10 FRAMEWORK FOR THOSE FUNDS DISTRIBUTION ACROSS OPERATORS SO TO 11 BE SAVE AND CONSERVATIVE MOST OPERATORS DID NOT INCORPORATE 12 THOSE PAST FISCAL YEAR '26. 13 14 15 GINA PAPAN: WE'RE TALKING ABOUT -- IF WE CAN BE ANY MORE 16 CLARIFYING. 17 THERESA ROMMELL: AS NOTED IN THE REPORT FUNDS ARE AVAILABLE 18 AND THEY COULD BE BROUGHT TO BEAR AND ARE LIKELY TO BE BROUGHT 19 TO BEAR FOR CERTAIN OPERATORS. 20 21 GINA PAPAN: JUST CONSIDERATION WHEN WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT 22 WHAT TO DO HERE MY FINAL NOTE I DON'T HAVE THEM ALL HERE I DO 23 APPRECIATE WHAT BART HAS BEEN DOING, THEIR LOCKING IN ON 24

ENERGY COST, I THINK THAT'S GREAT, WONDERFUL. IS THERE ANY WAY



WE CAN -- WE HEARD ABOUT CALTRAIN PUTTING A LOT BACK INTO THE 1 GRID HERE BUT NOT GETTING ANY CREDIT FOR IT. THAT WOULD 2 3 DEFINITELY HELP THEIR BOTTOM LINE AND THEIR BURDEN EXPENSES HERE. DO WE SEE ANYTHING ON THE HORIZON? THERE WAS ONE STATE 4 5 REPRESENTATIVE THAT WAS TRYING TO HELP ON THAT FRONT BUT IT SEEMS LIKE COMMON SENSE THAT TO -- GEORGIA IS BEHIND THERE 6 GOING, HEY. [LAUGHTER] YEAH, I MEAN, THE STATE HAS TO HELP, 7 8 PG&E HAS TO HELP IT WOULD REDUCE THEIR COST IMMENSELY TO A BIG 9 CHUNK IF THEY WERE TO BE ABLE TO GET SOME CREDIT. GEORGIA? 10 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: CALTRAIN HAS BEEN SPONSORING A BILL 11 THIS YEAR TO TRY TO GET COST RECOVERY FROM THE RESOURCES THAT 12 ARE GOING BACK TO THE GRID I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE 13 SCALE OF COST RECOVERY IS \$1 MILLION A YEAR SO IT'S NOT 14 CERTAINLY -- CERTAINLY IMPORTANT IT'S NOT AT THE SCALE OF 15 16 CALTRAIN'S DEFICIT UNFORTUNATELY THE BILL HAS RUN INTO A LOT OF OPPOSITION AND CHALLENGES. I THINK IT MIGHT BE A MULTIPLE 17 YEAR EFFORT. 18 19 GINA PAPAN: WHAT KIND OF OPPOSITION? I MEAN, JUST DON'T SEE 20 21 IT. AND WHY? 22

GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: NOT OPPOSITION FROM THE BAY AREA

DELEGATION IT'S MORE OPPOSITION RELATED TO ENERGY COMPANIES

23



AND SOME OF THE CHAIRS THAT ARE OVERSEEING SOME OF THE ENERGY 1 2 COMPANIES. 3 GINA PAPAN: CAN WE, AS A BODY, HELP IN THAT REALM HERE? IT'S 4 5 ONLY A MILLION DOLLARS AS YOU SAID, BUT TO --6 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: YEAH AND I'M NOT TRYING TO DOWNPLAY IT 7 8 A MILLION DOLLARS IS A MILLION DOLLAR. IT'S SOMETHING WE COULD 9 BRING THROUGH THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. 10 GINA PAPAN: LET US ALL KNOW AS INDIVIDUALS HERE BECAUSE IT 11 SEEMS LIKE ONE LITTLE BAND-AID ON A BIG GUSHING PROBLEM HERE. 12 SO, OKAY. AGAIN, THERE IS A LOT TO ABSORB HERE. I APPRECIATE 13 ALL THAT WAS DONE FROM THE OPERATORS. AND IT GIVES US A LOT TO 14 15 DISCUSS. SO, THANK YOU. 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES, COMMISSIONER MILEY? 17 18 NATHAN MILEY: YES, I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF HAS HAD A CHANCE TO 19 REVIEW THE OUESTIONS FROM LIVERMORE, AMADOR VALLEY TRANSIT 20 AUTHORITY, BECAUSE I JUST GOT THIS THIS MORNING -- I SENT IT 21 22 TO ALIX AND ANDY. OKAY. 23 THERESA ROMMELL: I HAVE NOT SEEN THOSE QUESTIONS. 24



NATHAN MILEY: COULD YOU SEND THEM TO STAFF TO SEE IF THEY CAN 1 2 RESPOND S. 3 ALIX BOCKELMAN: ALIX HERE, THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY. I SAW 4 5 AN E-MAIL BUT I DON'T SEE THE ACTUAL OUESTION. SO, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PROBABLY NEED TO FOLLOW UP WITH STAPH 6 7 AND YOU TO RESPOND TO THE QUESTIONS. 8 NATHAN MILEY: OKAY. I'LL TRY IT AGAIN. THANKS. 9 10 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: COMMISSIONER MELGAR? 11 12 MYRNA MELGAR: THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR. I HAD A QUESTION FOR 13 KYLE, OR PERHAPS STAFF. SO, THIS IS A REALLY GREAT REPORT. 14 15 THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE STRONG QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS. I 16 WONDER IF WE HAVE ANY DATA ON THE QUALITATIVE SIDE. SO, UNDERPINNING THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT WE ARE SUCCESSFUL IN 17 NOESHLTHING A PACKAGE, AND -- NEGOTIATING A PACKAGE AND SB63 18 THAT WE ARE ABLE TO PLUG THE BUDGET HOLES YOU KNOW THROUGH A 19 COMBINATION OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL STUFF THAT THESE TRANSIT 20 21 SYSTEMS WILL RECOVER, AND I AM WONDER FIGURE WE HAVE DATA THAT'S QUALITATIVE IN TERMS OF HOW THE RIDERSHIP FEELS ABOUT 22 GOING BACK TO THOSE SYSTEMS AS OPPOSED TO ANYTHING ELSE. SO, I 23 KNOW THE MTA DOES THAT, ON OUR OWN, I WONDER IF THE OTHER 24

TRANSIT AGENCIES DO THAT TOO. AND I'M WONDERING IF WE HAVE



- 1 TAKEN A LOOK AT THAT DATA AND INCLUDED THAT IN, SORT OF, ALL
- 2 OUR NEGOTIATIONS AND, YOU KNOW, VISIONING ABOUT WHAT IT COULD
- 3 BE. SO, IT'S SAFETY, I MEAN WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT ALL
- 4 THAT, BUT IT IS ALSO FREQUENCY, IT'S RELIABILITY, IT'S ALL OF
- 5 THOSE THINGS TOO. SO.

- 7 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MELGAR. REBECCA LONG
- 8 DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS WE ARE CERTAINLY
- 9 TRACK BEING THE RIDER SURVEYS VARIOUS OPERATORS HAVE BEEN
- 10 DOING, SAN FRANCISCO, MUNI CUSTOMER FEEDBACK HAS BEEN VERY
- 11 POSITIVE, HIGHEST THEY HAVE HAD IN ABOUT A DECADE. BART'S
- 12 SAYING THE SAME THING, CALTRAIN, ALSO, I THINK PEOPLE ARE
- 13 SHOWING WITH THEIR FEET, RIDERSHIP IS WAY UP SINCE
- 14 ELECTRIFICATION, SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY RECENTLY DID A
- 15 SURVEY, EXTREMELY HIGH RIDER SATISFACTION, AND AS THE REPORT
- 16 DETAILS, RIDERSHIP IS STEADILY GROWING. RIGHT? -- ACROSS THE
- 17 BOARD. WE'RE SEEING DEFINITE POSITIVE TRENDS, WITH BART YOU
- 18 MENTIONED SAFETY, THEIR CRIME RATES HAVE DEFINITELY DROPPED
- 19 AND THEIR PASSENGERS ARE SHOWING THAT THEY'RE FEELING SAFER,
- 20 AS WELL. SO, I THINK THINGS REALLY ARE MOVING IN THE RIGHT
- 21 DIRECTION. I WOULD JUST ALSO NOTE ONE OF THE PRINCIPLES IN THE
- 22 COMMISSION'S ADVOCACY ON SB63 IS TO ENSURE THAT THERE IS
- 23 FUNDING PROVIDED FOR RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS TO IMPROVE THE
- 24 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, WHEN WE HAVE BEEN CALLING TRANSIT
- 25 TRANSFORMATION. AND, SO THAT, YOU KNOW, REMAINS A REALLY



- 1 IMPORTANT PART OF THE MEASURE, THAT WILL INCLUDE -- IMPROVE
- 2 THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IN TERMS OF FARE INTEGRATION, OTHER
- 3 THINGS THAT WE'RE GOING TO GET INTO ON THE NEXT PART OF THIS
- 4 PRESENTATION. BUT, HOPEFULLY, THAT -- THOSE INVESTMENTS THAT
- 5 ARE PROPOSED, WE HAVE DONE QUITE A BIT OF RESEARCH ON, AND
- 6 THEY SHOULD ALSO GROW RIDERSHIP.

7

- 8 SHRUTI HARI: COMMISSIONER I WANT TO ADD THAT WE'RE TRACKING
- 9 THESE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES AS PART GIVING THE OPERATORS THE
- 10 SB125 PACKAGE OF FUNDING WHICH IS THE STATE FUNDING PLUS A BIT
- 11 OF REGIONAL FUNDS THAT ALL OF YOU APPROVED AS PART OF THAT
- 12 WE'RE TRACKING AGENCIES THAT ARE AGAINST THESE ACCOUNTABILITY
- 13 MEASURES THAT REBECCA MENTIONED, SORT OF, WHAT YOU WERE
- 14 ALLUDING TO.

15

- 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: GREAT. COMMISSIONER CANEPA
- 17 AND COMMISSIONER BURT.

- 19 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT I WANT TO THANK YOU THE THIRD-PARTY
- 20 INDEPENDENT REVIEW BY MGO IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT OBVIOUSLY
- 21 THIS IS REQUESTED BY THE OPERATORS AND SOME OF THE BOARD
- 22 MEMBERS. I WANT TO THANK STAFF. THIS REPORT WAS INTERESTING,
- 23 BECAUSE IT REALLY ADDRESSED A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT WE ALREADY
- 24 KNEW. WHAT WAS DRIVING THE DEFICIT, THOSE THREE KEY POINTS.
- 25 BUT MY QUESTION FOR KYLE OR THROUGH THERESE, WHAT DID WE LEARN



FROM THIS REPORT THAT WE DIDN'T KNOW BEFORE? WAS THERE 1 2 ANYTHING THAT, FROM THIS PARTICULAR REPORT, THERE WAS A 3 VARIANCE. I'M JUST CURIOUS. 4 5 THERESA ROMMELL: I CAN GIVE THAT OUESTION A TRY. I DON'T KNOW THAT WE LEARNED ANYTHING NEW. I THINK THE INTENTION FOR THE 6 REPORT WAS REALLY TO PROVIDE AN ADDITIONAL LAYER OF 7 8 TRANSPARENCY TO CONFIRM THE SHORTFALLS THAT WE HAD BEEN GIVEN BY THE OPERATORS, AND, SO, THAT WAS NUMBER ONE, WAS TO ENSURE 9 THAT THEY WERE -- THERE WAS TRANSPARENCY, AND VALIDATION OF 10 THOSE SHORTFALLS. AS HAS BEEN SAID, A COUPLE OF TIMES NOW IT 11 WAS NOT THE INTENTION TO STANDARDIZE OR TO CAST JUDGMENT ON 12 THE ASSUMPTIONS BEING USED BUT REALLY JUST TO BE ABLE TO TIE 13 OFF WHAT WE'RE BEING TOLD BY THE OPERATORS WITH PUBLICLY 14 15 AVAILABLE FINANCIAL DOCUMENTS, ET CETERA. SECOND PART I THINK 16 IS VALUABLE WAS THE MGO DID RESEARCH ON THE FAIR SHARE METHODOLOGIES SOMETHING WE HAD NOT HAD A CHANCE TO DO. THEY 17 DOCUMENTED IN THE REPORT CAME UP WITH SAMPLE METHODOLOGIES 18 THAT WE COULD USE AND I THINK THOSE IN THEMSELVES WILL PROVIDE 19 A GOOD STANDING POINT FOR NEGOTIATIONS OF COUNTY CONTRIBUTIONS 20 21 ARE IF OUR REGIONAL OPERATORS GOING FORWARD. SO, THAT TO ME WAS A BENEFIT OF THIS REPORT. 22 23 DAVID CANEPA: I THINK THAT'S EXTRAORDINARILY IMPORTANT THERESE 24

AND THE TEAM BECAUSE MY UNDERSTANDING FROM THE BEGINNING IS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



THAT SOME OF THE FOLKS AND OPERATORS THERE MAY HAVE BEEN A 1 DIFFERENCE IN THE NUMBERS BUT WITH THIS THIRD-PARTY, AND IT'S 2 3 OBVIOUSLY A THIRD-PARTY, IT, SORT OF, VALIDATES WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT RELATIVE TO ITEM ONE. ITEM TWO I THINK IS EXTREMELY 4 5 IMPORTANT WHEN WE MOVE FORWARD WHEN WE TALK ABOUT FAIR SHARE AND CONTRIBUTIONS. I KNOW THERE ARE DIFFERENT BOARDS THAT WILL 6 BE ADDRESSING THAT DOWN THE ROAD BUT I THINK IN BALANCE THIS 7 8 REPORT THAT CAME OUT IS JUST IMPORTANT TO THE PROCESS AND HOW WE MOVE FORWARD RELATIVE TO SB63 AND HAVING THAT INDEPENDENT 9 10 REPORT REALLY, SORT OF, DRIVES US. AND I THINK, REBECCA HAD SPOKE TO A LITTLE BIT ABOUT, SORT OF, THE MOMENTUM AND I 11 THINK, JUST I THINK IN THE REGIONS AND THE AREAS DIFFERENT 12 COUNTIES WE'RE TALKING ABOUT I THINK THAT MOMENTUM IS 13 CONTINUING TO MOVE IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. I WANT TO THANK 14 15 YOU, AND KYLE FOR YOUR WORK ON THIS ISSUE, MGO I THINK WAS ON 16 BALANCE A VERY FAIR REPORT. SO, THANK YOU. 17 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: COMMISSIONER BURT? 18 19 PAT BURT: THANK YOU. I CONCUR THAT THIS HAS BEEN A REAL 20 21 VALUABLE REPORT. I DID WANT TO SHARE, FIRST, THAT -- OR CONFIRM THAT THE REPORT WAS FOCUSED ON THE AGENCIES THAT WERE 22 IDENTIFIED IN THE LEGISLATION, PLUS GOLDEN GATE, IS THAT IT? 23 AND I JUST WANTED TO SHARE FOR COLLEAGUES, THE VTA POSITION 24

AND LAST YEAR WHEN WE WERE LOOKING AT THE REGIONAL MEASURE,



- 1 VTA WAS REALLY FOCUSED ON THE NEED TO RESTORE BUS SERVICE THAT
- 2 WE HAD CUT YEARS AGO IN ORDER TO HAVE AT THAT TIME A
- 3 SUSTAINABLE BUDGET. AND VTA'S MODEL IS ONE OF SIGNIFICANT
- 4 LOCAL SALES TAX. SUPPORTING BUS AND LIGHT RAIL WITH HIGH
- 5 SUBSIDIES FOR LOW FAREBOX RECOVERY AND THAT'S REALLY OUR MODEL
- 6 WE IN THE LAST NINE MONTHS HAVE RECEIVED UPDATES FROM OUR
- 7 FINANCE DEPARTMENT OF A GROWING DEFICIT ON OPERATIONS BASED
- 8 UPON SALES TAX DECLINE WHICH WE'RE HIGHLY DEPENDENT ON AND
- 9 THAT'S BECOME VERY SIGNIFICANT. AND I JUST WANT TO SHARE THAT,
- 10 THOSE ARE ON TOP OF WHAT WAS ALREADY OUR FOCUSED ON FINANCIAL
- 11 NEED FOR TRANSIT RESTORATION AS A COUNTERPART TO OTHER
- 12 AGENCIES THAT ARE LOOKING AT CUTTING SERVICE, LIKE WE DID, WE
- 13 WERE LOOKING AT RESTORING IT. WE NOW HAVE A VERY SIGNIFICANT
- 14 PROJECTED DEFICIT GOING FORWARD BASED ON SALES TAX DECLINES.
- 15 THANKS.

16

- 17 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OTHER COMMISSIONERS? YES,
- 18 PLEASE.

- 20 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. ALONG
- 21 THOSE LINES, I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE REPORT. I THINK IT WAS
- 22 HELPFUL. I LEARNED -- IT WAS HELPFUL TO LEARN ABOUT THE
- 23 DIFFERENT AGENCIES, AND I LEARNED SOME GOOD THINGS, SO THANK
- 24 YOU VERY MUCH FOR DOING THIS. AS WE HAVE BEEN TALKING WITH OUR
- 25 SOUTH BAY DELEGATION, AND THE CHANGE AND THE SITUATION FOR



VTA, I GUESS I STARTED TO THINK, THIS WAS FOCUSED ON THESE 1 2 FIVE AGENCIES, I BELIEVE, RIGHT? AND I REMEMBER AT A CERTAIN 3 POINT IN TIME WE IDENTIFIED THEM AS THE ONES WHO WERE GOING TO BE EXPERIENCING A SHORTFALL, BUT MY QUESTION IS THAT, WITH THE 4 5 OTHER AGENCIES, ARE THERE OTHER AGENCIES THAT HAVE HAD A 6 CHANGE IN THEIR SITUATION LIKE VTA HAS, AND MAYBE LOOKING AT SHORTFALLS AND IF SO, HOW -- I GUESS THIS IS A TANGENT --7 8 MOVING AWAY FROM THE REPORT BUT REALLY LOOKING AT THE REGIONAL MEASURE AT THIS POINT BUT HOW WILL WE ADDRESS THE ISSUES OF 9 10 OTHER AGENCIES THAT MAY NOW BE LOOKING AT SHORTFALLS? AND THAT'S REALLY OUR CHALLENGE WITH VTA, IS THAT IN OUR 11 CONVERSATIONS IS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TO PROVIDE OUR SERVICE, 12 BUT WE DO HAVE THESE OBLIGATIONS TO THESE PARTNERS LIKE BART 13 AND TO CALTRAIN, BUT TO, LIKE, WE HAVE TO BALANCE, RIGHT, BUT 14 WE DON'T WANT TO HAVE TO CUT OUR SERVICE TO PAY FOR THESE 15 16 OTHER SYSTEMS. AND I'M JUST WONDERING, CURIOUS, AS IF OTHER AGENCIES ARE IN A SIMILAR SITUATION AS US AND IF SO HOW WILL 17 THIS MEASURE ADDRESS ALL OUR CHALLENGES NOT JUST OF THE FIVE 18 THAT ARE IDENTIFIED? 19 20 21 THERESA ROMMELL: CAN I GIVE IT A TRY. I BELIEVE THE WORK RIGHT NOW IN THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IS MOVING FORWARD. AND YOU KNOW, 22

MTC IS NOT THE LEAD THERE, THE CTAS ARE, BUT MY UNDERSTANDING

IS THAT WORK INCORPORATES OPERATORS WITHIN EACH OF THE FAUN OF

FIVE COUNTIES AND IT'S NOT JUST LIMITED TO THESE OPERATORS. IN

only and is not an official record of any action taken.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience

23

24



TERMS OF AN EXPENDITURE PLAN THERE COULD BE OPERATORS THAT 1 RECEIVE REGIONAL FUNDS THROUGH THE MEASURE THAT ARE NOT ONE OF 2 3 THESE OPERATORS THAT ARE PART OF -- THAT ARE SUBJECT TO THE REPORT. SO, I THINK IT WOULD BE INCLUSIVE OF ALL OPERATORS 4 5 WITHIN THE PARTICIPATING --6 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AND, SO, HOW IS -- ONE OF THE ISSUES THAT 7 8 WE'RE ALSO DEBATING, OR TRYING TO ADVOCATE FOR IS THE RETURN TO SOURCE OR DIRECT REMITTANCE OF THE FUNDS. BECAUSE THAT, TO 9 US, I THINK WOULD ENABLE TO EACH OF OUR AGENCIES TO TAKE CARE 10 OF WHATEVER NEEDS WE HAVE FIRST AND THEN PUT INTO THE BIGGER 11 POT. I DON'T KNOW WHERE EVERYBODY IS ON THAT BUT THAT'S WHERE 12 WE'RE MOVING TOWARDS. LOOKS LIKE THE LEGISLATION DOESN'T SAY 13 THAT, SO IN LIGHT OF THAT HOW WOULD WE BE ABLE TO ENSURE THAT 14 EVERY AGENCY IS CARED FOR IN THE WAY THAT THEY NEED TO BE? 15 16 REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE VICE CHAIR. 17 18 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: CAN I JUMP IN FOR A SECOND? THIS NEEDS 19 ROBUST DISCUSSION AND I THINK ALL OF US WOULD LIKE TO BE PART 20 21 OF IT BUT WE HAVE TO RUN TO THIS FUNERAL AT THIS POINT. AND I THINK MARGARET WE TALKED A LITTLE ABOUT THIS WHEN WE IN THE 22 LAST WEEK. SO, I APPRECIATE IT. IT'S GOING TO TAKE MORE 23 DISCUSSION THAN WE'RE ABLE TO DO AT THIS TIME. SO, HOPEFULLY 24



WE CAN POSTPONE -- OR NOT POSTPONE, BUT JUST HAVE THIS 1 2 DISCUSSION LATER ON SO WE CAN ALL BE A PART OF IT? 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I THINK THAT'S GREAT. I THINK WE SHOULD ALL 4 5 HAVE IT, BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT I HAVE BEEN STARTING TO HEAR 6 FROM OTHER AGENCIES IS THAT WE'RE ALL MAYBE STARTING TO SEE CHANGES IN OUR ECONOMIC SITUATION. SO, WE MIGHT HAVE TO 7 8 RETHINK SOME OF THIS. THANK YOU. 9 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER 10 JOHN-BAPTISTE? NO? OKAY. YES, PLEASE, COMMISSIONER MANFREE. 11 12 AMBER MANFREE: I JUST TURNED THAT OFF. I NOTICED ON SLIDE 18 13 AND THIS IS A METHODS QUESTION SO PROBABLY FOR MR. O'ROURKE, 14 15 THE FAIR SHARE AMOUNTS ARE PRESENTED AS RANGES, AND I'M 16 WONDERING HOW THOSE RANGES WERE ESTIMATED. BECAUSE THEY VARY QUITE A BIT. BIGGEST ONE I SPOTTED WAS A 23% SPREAD AND THAT'S 17 A MEANINGFUL, LOW TO HIGH END, MEANINGFUL DIFFERENCE IN THAT 18 PLACE SOME OF THEM ARE 15 TO 12% I WONDER WOULD LIKE MORE 19 INFORMATION ABOUT RANGES ESTIMATION AND WHY THEY VARY SO MUCH 20 21 AND OBVIOUSLY AS THIS ROLLS FORWARD NOBODY'S GOING TO PAY A RANGE OF RATES THEY'RE GOING TO PAY SPECIFIC RATES SO IF YOU 22 HAVE THOUGHTS ON HOW THAT'S GOING TO BE DETERMINED HOW WE MOVE 23 TO A MORE SPECIFIC NUMBER FROM THERE THAT WOULD BE REALLY 24

25

HELPFUL. THANK YOU.



1 2 KYLE O'ROURKE: YES, THANKS SO MUCH FOR THE QUESTION. I'LL 3 START WITH THE SECOND HALF OF YOUR QUESTION FIRST. THESE ARE ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLES AND THEY'RE INTENDED TO BE THAT. SO, THE 4 5 RANGES DO, IN SOME CASES END UP BEING FAIRLY BROAD. BUT IN TERMS OF THE NEXT STEPS, I THINK YOU ALL WILL BE TALKING 6 AMONGST YOURSELVES AND NEGOTIATING, SO TO SPEAK, IN ORDER TO 7 8 ARRIVE AT THE APPROPRIATE DRIVERS OF THESE CALCULATIONS. SO, WE WEREN'T TASKED SPECIFICALLY WITH ANSWERING THE OUESTION, 9 BUT OF COURSE PRESENTING THE INFORMATION TO YOU ALL TO DO 10 THAT. IN TERMS OF THE FIRST QUESTION, THE RANGES ARE DRIVEN BY 11 DRIVERS THAT YOU HIGHLIGHTED I MIGHT REVERSE THESE SO I'M NOT 12 LOOKING AT THE SPREADSHEET FOR EXAMPLE, THE DATA FOR SAN 13 FRANCISCO UNDER BENEFITS BASED APPROACH SHOWS 22 TO 45% RANGE 14 WHICH INDEED IS A LARGE RANGE BUT THAT'S BECAUSE ONE OF THE 15 16 FACTORS AM BOARDINGS DRIVES THE NUMBER ONE WAY OTHER BOARDINGS DRIVE THE NUMBER THE OTHER DIRECTION SO REALLY THE RANGES ARE 17 SPECIFIC TO THE DRIVERS THAT WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED IN THIS CASE, 18 AM BOARDINGS VERSUS ALL DAY BOARDINGS. 19 20 21 AMBER MANFREE: THANK YOU. 22 23 THERESA ROMMELL: IF I CAN ADD TO THAT. I DO THINK THAT SOME OF THESE METHODOLOGIES DO HAVE A NUMBER OF FACTORS IN THEM WHICH 24

CARRY DIFFERENT WEIGHTS AND IMPORTANCE WITHIN THE FORMULA AND



- 1 I WANT TO NOTE THAT THIS -- THE WORK FOR THE EXPENDITURE PLAN
  2 DEVELOPMENT IS A SEPARATE PROCESS THAT IS BEING UNDERTAKEN BY
- 3 THE CTAS, CERTAIN CTAS AND THE SPREADSHEET THAT MGO DEVELOPED
- 4 TO KIND OF RUN THESE METHODOLOGIES IS PROVIDED TO THOSE CTA AS
- 5 A TOOL SO THAT THEY CAN DO THEIR WORK, AS WELL. OF THE.

6

- 7 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN,
- 8 I HAVE A FEW REMARKS THEN PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

- 10 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. I HAVE A FEW, I FORGOT SOME. SO, WE
- 11 IDENTIFIED SOME EFFICIENCIES, WHICH WERE GREAT, MR. O'ROURKE,
- 12 WERE THERE ANY PUBLICLY INEFFICIENCIES THAT WERE DETERMINED
- 13 DURING THE BAILOUT PERIOD?

14

- 15 KYLE O'ROURKE: NONE THAT WE NOTED. WE WEREN'T SPECIFICALLY
- 16 TASKED WITH IDENTIFYING INEFFICIENCIES. BUT I CAN SAY THAT
- 17 THROUGH THE REVIEW OF THE PROCEEDING -- HISTORICAL AND
- 18 PROJECTIONS, THERE WERE NO SIGNIFICANT ITEMS OF NOTE THAT
- 19 WOULD SUGGEST INEFFICIENCIES. BUT NOT A, SORT OF, PRIMARY
- 20 ELEMENT OF OUR ANALYSIS.

- 22 GINA PAPAN: HONESTY IS THE BEST POLICY THERE WERE A LOT OF
- 23 EFFICIENCIES IDENTIFIED WHICH WAS NICE. I WANT TO BE CLEAR
- 24 HERE JURISDICTIONS LIKE SAN MATEO COUNTY, SAMTRANS IS GOING TO
- 25 BE HEADING FOR A SIMILAR DEFICIT. SO WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-



- 1 KOGA BROUGHT UP IS A REALITY, FOR MANY OF US HERE. AND TO BE
- 2 TRANSPARENT AT THIS POINT IN TIME, AS FAR AS THE FAIR SHARE
- 3 APPROACHES HERE, ABOUT THE ONLY ONE THAT SEEMS TO BE
- 4 ACCEPTABLE AT THIS POINT IS THE BENEFIT BASED FOR SAN MATEO
- 5 COUNTY. I AM HEARING, LOUD AND CLEAR, AS TO THE OTHER TWO, NOT
- 6 BEING APPROPRIATE. BUT WE ARE WORK BEING, AND THIS REPORT
- 7 HELPS US IN THAT PROCESS. SO, I DO WANT TO BE STRAIGHT
- 8 FORWARD, SINCE MR. BURT REVEALED SOMETHING, WELL, NOT
- 9 REVEALING, BUT AS FAR AS OUR DISCUSSIONS GO, THAT'S WHERE WE
- 10 ARE AT THIS POINT. THANK YOU.

- 12 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN,
- 13 THANK YOU FOR SAYING THAT. THAT TEES UP REMARKS I WANT TO MAKE
- 14 ABOUT THE NORTH BAY WHICH WAS NOD INCLUDED. IT WAS INCLUDED IN
- 15 THE STUDY, GOLDEN GATE IS THE LARGEST COMMUTE TRANSIT
- 16 PROVIDER, NOW WITH THE SMART TRAIN. THE HOWEVER, I WANT TO SAY
- 17 THAT, AS YOU HAVE HEARD BEFORE, WE'RE UNDERTAKING A PROCESS TO
- 18 OVERHAUL BUS TRANSIT IN MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTY, IT'S CALLED
- 19 MASCOTS AND IN THIS PROCESS, WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING AT GAPS AND
- 20 DUPLICATION IN OUR ROUTES AMONG THE SIX TRANSIT PROVIDERS AND
- 21 WE ARE COLLECTIVELY WORKING TO REWORK THE TRANSIT SYSTEM, SUCH
- 22 THAT WE REDUCE THE NUMBER OF DUPLICATIVE ROUTES, AND WE
- 23 INCREASE THE FREQUENCY ON ROUTES THAT REALLY SERVE THE MOST
- 24 PEOPLE. AND, SO, WE ARE LOOKING AT EFFICIENCIES, INTERNALLY,
- 25 AND I WOULD EXPECT OUR LARGER CONVERSATION TO HAVE AN



- 1 ITERATIVE PROCESS LIKE THIS IN EACH REGION, WHERE EACH REGION
- 2 LOOKS AT THE TRANSIT YOU HAVE AND WHAT YOU NEED. IN THESE
- 3 TIMES, IT WOULD BE HARD TO IMAGINE PUTTING BACK ALL THE
- 4 SERVICE WE WANT, QUITE CANDIDLY, WE'RE CERTAINLY NOT ABLE DO
- 5 THAT BUT WE'RE GOING TO MAKE THE MOST OF THE DOLLARS WE HAVE,
- 6 AND WE ARE HAVING TO REJIGGER FUNDING AMONG THE AGENCIES
- 7 THAT'S WHERE WE ARE NOW. THAT'S NEVER A FUN PART OF THE
- 8 PROCESS, BUT WE'RE DOING IT. SO WE'RE HOPING THAT BY JANUARY
- 9 1ST, WE WILL HAVE HAD AGREEMENT THAT ALLOWS US TO REWORK OUR
- 10 SCHEDULE AND GO OUT WITH A NEW CONSOLIDATED SCHEDULE FOR MARIN
- 11 SONOMA COUNTY FOR OUR PROVIDERS. I WANTED TO ADD THAT, I WANT
- 12 TO WELCOME COMMISSIONER BELIA RAMOS, NICE TO YOU HAVE, AND NOW
- 13 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT, AND I'LL ASK, FIRST, FOR
- 14 PUBLIC COMMENT IN -- HERE IN THE CHAMBER SUPERVISOR THEN
- 15 WRITTEN. IS THAT RIGHT, CLERK?

17 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES.

- 19 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
- 20 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.
- 22 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES THERE IS. WE HAVE TWO IN-HOUSE. HOW
- 23 MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE.
- 25 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: WE'LL DO TWO MINUTES.

16

18

21



1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE HAVE ALETA, YOUR FIRST UP, FOLLOWED 2 3 BY JASON BAKER. I'LL START THE TIMER. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM 6 FOLDS WHERE IS MY CLOCK. THIS IS BIG AND HEAVY I KEEP RIDING 7 8 THE CIRCUIT NOT BECAUSE OF ALL THE ELEMENTS THAT WE NEED TO PAY SYSTEMS I DO APPRECIATE THE MENTION EARLIER OF ELECTRICITY 9 WHY CALTRAIN'S THE ONLY RAILROAD IS, I'M SURE BART SYSTEMS 10 AROUND THE STATE HAVE TO DEAL WITH THAT TOO SB63 IS WINDING 11 ITS WAY THROUGH THE PROCESS I SAW THE WRITTEN REPORT NOT ONLY 12 HAS TO PASS SENATE BUT HAS TO GO INTO ASSEMBLY DELIBERATION 13 HOPEFULLY THEY CAN RECONCILE THAT AND HAVE SOMETHING THE 14 15 GOVERNOR IS WILLING TO SIGN SO WE CAN GO OUT AND ADVERTISE THIS TO THE PUBLIC. BUT THERE ARE SO MANY PIECES, HEARING 16 ABOUT THE NORTH BAY AND TRANSFERS, I DON'T KNOW MUCH ABOUT THE 17 NORTH BAY I HAVEN'T BEEN UP THERE A WHOLE LOT I SHOULD GO 18 THERE MORE OFTEN ON THE GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT IN THE SMART TRAIN 19 BUT WE HAVE TO KEEP FINDING COMMON GROUND WITH ALL THESE 20 21 PIECES. WE ARE NOT UNIQUE, BUT MAYBE IT'S CALIFORNIA, I THINK 27 DIFFERENT SYSTEMS HERE, IN ADDITION TO 20-SOMETHING SYSTEMS 22 DOWN IN THE LOS ANGELES AREA THAT I OFTEN USE THREE OR FOUR 23 SYSTEMS IN THE COURSE OF A DAY, AND ESPECIALLY HEARING ABOUT 24 CALTRAIN, WHICH IS REALLY DOING WELL, AND WE JUST HAVE TO 25



FIGURE OUT A WAY TO PAY FOR ALL THESE THINGS THAT BENEFITS 1 2 EVERYONE. THANK YOU. 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JASON BAKER. PUSH 4 5 Τ. 6 SPEAKER: ONE OF THESE DAYS I'LL DO IT WITHOUT INSTRUCTIONS. 7 8 JASON BAKER, DIRECTOR OF GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS FOR CALTRAIN. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORDS MEMORIALIZING COMMISSIONER 9 GLOVER HE WAS HERE WHEN I WAS ON THE COMMISSION AND ALWAYS 10 WELCOMING AND UP FOR A CHAT ABOUT ANYTHING. OUR MEMBERS ARE 11 WORKING HARD ON THE FAIR SHARE ANALYSIS THANKS TO MTC AND MGO 12 FOR LETTING THAT PLAY OUT AND LETTING US DO OUR OWN 13 HOUSEKEEPING ON THE ISSUE OF REGENERATIVE, THANK YOU FOR 14 15 BRINGING THAT UP COMMISSION ARE PAPAN, 3372, A TWO-YEAR BILL 16 DIDN'T MAKE IT OUT OF THE UTILITIES AND ENERGY COMMITTEE BUT WE'RE WORKING HARD ON IT, AND NEXT WE CAN USE ANY SUPPORT, 17 WORKING WITH COMMUNITY CHOICE AGGREGATORS PARTNERS TO HAVE 18 THEM HELP ON THAT ISSUE TOO BECAUSE THEY HAVE GOT A PIECE TO 19 PLAY AS WELL AS THAT LEGISLATION FINALLY THERE IS ISSUE ON 20 PAGE 42 OF THE MGO REPORT I WANTED TO MENTION BRINGS UP LABOR 21 NUMBER OF 591.1%, BECAUSE WE CONTRACT FOR LABOR WITHOUT 22 23 ORGANIZATION CALL TAZI DOES THE EXPENSE FOR US MORE THAN JUST STRICTLY LABOR FOOTNOTE PAGE 42 NOTES THEY TAKE FULL TAZI 24

AMOUNT FOR LABOR, ALSO HAS THINGS LIKE EQUIPMENT FENCING AND



- 1 DISPATCH COMMUNICATIONS AND SIGNAL STATIONS, ONLY ABOUT 72% OF
- 2 COST ARE LABOR, THE FISCAL YEAR '25 NUMBER 71% AND FISCAL YEAR
- 3 '26, 30% EXTRA WAS INCLUDED IN OUR LABOR WHEN YOU TAKE ALL
- 4 THAT OUT CALTRAIN PERCENTAGE FOR LABOR IS ACTUALLY 41% AND
- 5 THAT'S SIGNIFICANTLY LOWER THAN A NUMBER OF PIERCE IN THE
- 6 REPORT. THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR SERVICE.

8 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU. SPEAKERS

9 ONLINE?

7

10

14

11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC

- 12 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. ROLAND, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
- 13 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.
- 15 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. AND I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO START BY
- 16 RECOGNIZING FORMER COMMISSIONER GLOVER. I MET HIM RIGHT AFTER
- 17 SURGERY AND I ASKED HIM WHAT WAS YOUR SECRET FOR LOSING SO
- 18 MUCH WEIGHT. AND HE TOLD ME, I REALLY WILL NEVER EVER WISH
- 19 ANYBODY ELSE WOULD HAVE TO GO THROUGH. MOVING ON TO CALTRAIN
- 20 AND CLOSING UP, CALTRAIN IS CURRENTLY RUNNING 25% OF ITS
- 21 ENERGY CONSUMPTION BACK TO THE GRID MY QUESTION TO THE CHAIR
- 22 HOW COULD THIS POSSIBLY AMOUNT TO ONLY \$1 MILLION A YEAR.
- 23 MOVING FORWARD, THE SOLUTION IS TO DEVELOP A FUNDING PACKAGE
- 24 FOR BATTERY STORAGE, SUFFICIENT TO CAPTURE CALTRAIN'S
- 25 REGENERATED ENERGY, INSTEAD OF RETURNING IT BACK TO THE GRID.



- 1 THE REAL REASON FOR VTA'S DEFICIT IS THE BART EXTENSION TO SAN
- 2 JOSE, CURRENTLY BURNING A MILLION AND A HALF A DAY, WITHOUT
- 3 ANY CONSTRUCTION. BART TO SAN JOSE IS BURNING 80% OF VTA'S
- 4 2,000 MEASURE EIGHT BECAUSE TRANSIT IS CURRENTLY CAPPED AT
- 5 20%. IN CLOSING, VTA IS LONG OVERDUE BY AN AUDITOR OR OTHER
- 6 MGO, VTA IS INDEPENDENT -- [INDISCERNIBLE] AUDITOR, BECAUSE
- 7 THIS AUDIT IS MOST LIKELY TOLL RED FLAG THAT AN UNCONDITIONAL
- 8 RETURN TO SOURCE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WOULD BE TOTALLY
- 9 IRRESPONSIBLE. THANK YOU.

11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU AND THERE WAS NO WRITTEN

12 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

14 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. I WANT TO THANK

- 15 EVERYONE FOR A VERY ROBUST DISCUSSION, LOTS OF MOVING PARTS
- 16 AND MORE TO COME. I WANT TO GO BACK TO STAFF TO SEE IF THERE
- 17 ARE FINAL COMMENTS OR ANYTHING YOU WOULD LIKE TO ADD BEFORE WE
- 18 WRAP UP?

10

13

19

- 20 THERESA ROMMELL: THERE IS A PART TWO OF THE PRESENTATION.
- 22 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES AND WE'LL GET TO THAT
- 23 FOR SURE. JUST TO CONCLUDE THIS PORTION TO SAY YOU KNOW THERE
- 24 IS ADDITIONAL INFORMATION INCLUDING THE WHOLE MGO REPORT
- 25 THERE, IS A LINK IN THE AGENDA PACKET. AND NO ACTION IS



- 1 REOUIRED ON THIS ITEM, SO WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON NOW TO
- 2 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, WHO IS GOING TO GIVE US AN UPDATE ON
- 3 SB33. GOOD MORNING GEORGIA.

- 5 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS AND VICE
- 6 CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS. CAN WE BRING UP THE PRESENTATION,
- 7 PLEASE, FOR THE SECOND COMPONENT OF THIS AGENDA ITEM? THERE WE
- 8 GO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. EXCUSE ME. TODAY I'M GOING TO TRY TO
- 9 KEEP THIS BRIEF I'LL START WITH A STATUTES UPDATE ON SB63
- 10 THAT'S A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE BILL AUTHORED
- 11 BY SENATOR WIENER AND ARREGUIN AND MTC IS NOW IN AN OFFICIAL
- 12 POSITION OF SUPPORT. THE BILL HAS ADVANCED SIGNIFICANTLY THIS
- 13 SPRING IT'S NOW IN FINAL STAGES OF FIRST HOUSE NEGOTIATIONS IN
- 14 SACRAMENTO AND COULD BE -- JUST CHECKING IN WITH THE AUTHOR'S
- 15 OFFICE IT'S NOT EXPECTED TO GO TO THE FLOOR TODAY BUT WILL GO
- 16 FOR A FLOOR VOTE IN THE SENATE SOMETIME IN THE NEXT WEEK. NEXT
- 17 SLIDE PLEASE. THANK YOU. THE CURRENT VERSION OF THE BILL
- 18 INCLUDES A SALES TAX AUTHORIZATION FOR A 10 TO 15 YEAR
- 19 DURATION. THE RATE WOULD BE HALF CENT SALES TAX WITH VARIABLE
- 20 RATE FLEXIBILITY STILL UNDER CONSIDERATION. AND THE SALES TAX
- 21 WOULD BE APPLICABLE IN ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, AND SAN
- 22 FRANCISCO WITH OPTIONAL PARTICIPATION FOR SAN MATEO AND SANTA
- 23 CLARA COUNTY. OH COULD WE BRING THE PRESENTATION BACK UP,
- 24 PLEASE? WHILE WE ARE WAITING FOR THAT, I'LL JUST KEEP GOING.
- 25 IT ALSO INCLUDES A VERY HIGH-LEVEL EXPENDITURE FRAMEWORK THAT



- 1 WOULD DEDICATE THE BULK OF THE REVENUE TO AVERT MAJOR SERVICE
- 2 CUTS PARTICULARLY FOR BART, MUNI, AC TRANSIT, AND CALTRAIN,
- 3 REPRESENTS UP TO 10% FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND THEN TO
- 4 THE DISCUSSION EARLIER ABOUT THE MANY OTHER TRANSIT OPERATOR'S
- 5 SERVICE NEEDS THROUGHOUT THE REGION IN PARTICULAR WITH THE
- 6 PARTICIPATING COUNTIES IT ALSO ENABLES COUNTIES TO FUND LOCAL
- 7 PRIORITIES INCLUDING TRANSIT PRAYER OPERATIONS WITH ANY
- 8 REMAINING FUNDS. SO, THE FRAMEWORK REALLY SIGNALS THE AUTHOR'S
- 9 PRIORITIES BUT WHAT'S IMPORTANT IS THE SPECIFIC EXPENDITURE
- 10 DETAILS ARE GOING TO BE DEVELOPED BY LOCAL PARTNERS. THIS IS A
- 11 REALLY SIGNIFICANT DEPARTURE FROM THE, SORT OF, TACT THAT THE
- 12 LEGISLATURE TOOK LAST YEAR WITH SB1031. IT'S REALLY AN
- 13 ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF A LOT THE WORK THAT THE SELECT COMMITTEE DID
- 14 AND THE ACTIVE ENGAGEMENT FROM ALL OF AND YOU PARTNERS THAT
- 15 THE LEGISLATURE DECIDED TO PUSH DOWN THE EXPENDITURE PLAN
- 16 NEGOTIATIONS TO LOCALS. THERESE MENTIONED THE COUNTY
- 17 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES ARE LEADING THE EXPENDITURE PLAN
- 18 FRAMEWORK AND MTC IS PLAYING A TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ROLE
- 19 REALLY TO HELP ENSURE THAT THE FINAL PRODUCT IS FINANCIALLY
- 20 FISCALLY SOUND AND THAT IT'S IMPLEMENTABLE. WE EXPECT MOST OF
- 21 THE FUNDS WILL GO TOWARDS KEEPING SERVICE RUNNING AND THAT'S
- 22 EXACTLY WHAT THE EMPHASIS SHOULD BE, BUT YOU AT THE COMMISSION
- 23 HAS BEEN VERY CLEAR OVER THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS THAT IN ORDER
- 24 TO PASS VOTERS WILL NEED TO SEE TANGIBLE BENEFITS AND THAT'S
- 25 WHERE THAT UP TO 10% RIDER IMPROVEMENT SET ASIDE COMES IN AND





- 1 MTC IS REALLY DRIVING THAT PIECE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THANK
- 2 YOU. SO, TODAY WE'RE PRESENTING FOR YOUR FEEDBACK, A PROPOSED
- 3 SUITE OF RIDER IMPROVEMENTS, ARE THE GOAL IS REALLY TO DELIVER
- 4 MEANINGFUL CHANGE WITHOUT BREAKING THE BANK. A LOT OF THINGS
- 5 THAT RIDERS ARE SAY WOULD BE MEANINGFUL CHANGE INCLUDE THINGS
- 6 LIKE A BUS EVERY FIVE MINUTES OR B.A.R.T. TRAINS EVERY FIVE
- 7 MINUTES THOSE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT AND ALSO SOMETHING THAT'S
- 8 SCALEABLE WITHIN THE SALES TAX THAT WE'RE PROPOSING TO BE ABLE
- 9 TO GENERATE. AND, SO, THIS IS A PROPOSED EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT
- 10 COULD REALLY GET A LOT OF BANG FOR YOUR BUCK AND COULD DELIVER
- 11 VERY TANGIBLE IMPROVEMENTS FOR RIDERS WITH REVENUE ON THE LOOP
- 12 THAT COULD BE POSSIBLE WITHIN THE HALF ACCEPT THE SALES TAX IN
- 13 3 TO 5 COUNTIES. SO, SINCE WE DO NOT KNOW YET WHICH COUNTIES
- 14 WILL PARTICIPATE, THIS SLIDE IS BASED ON 10% OF A FOUR-COUNTY
- 15 HALF CENT SALES TAX MEASURE. WE REALLY CHOSE THAT -- AGAIN, WE
- 16 NEEDED TO PICK A NUMBER, AND DEMONSTRATED WHAT WE COULD INVEST
- 17 IN ONE SCENARIO, AND THIS IS THE SCENARIO THAT YOU ALL
- 18 DIRECTED US TO POLL. SO IN TOTAL THAT'S ABOUT \$55 MILLION PER
- 19 YEAR AND THIS SLIDE HAS A BREAK DOWN OF PROPOSED INVESTMENTS
- 20 I'LL WALK THROUGH THEM QUICKLY. THE 50 BIG TRANCHE WOULD BE
- 21 \$25 MILLION FOR FARE INTEGRATION. THIS AMOUNT OF INVESTMENT,
- 22 ANNUALLY COULD FUND FREE AND DISCOUNTED TRANSFERS WE EXPECT
- 23 THAT COULD ATTRACT 30,000 NEW RIDERS TO GIVE YOU A SENSE OF
- 24 SCALE THAT'S ABOUT THE SAME NUMBER OF RIDERS THAT SAMTRANS
- 25 PROVIDES ON A DAILY BASIS. IT'S ALSO QUITE A BIT HIGHER THAN



- 1 THE AMOUNT OF RIDERS THAT THE FOUR SMALL OPERATORS IN ALAMEDA
- 2 AND CONTRA COSTA CARRY. SO WHAT THIS COULD REALLY DO IS DRAW A
- 3 BRING A BUNCH OF NEW RIDERS TO THE SYSTEM AND I WANT TO
- 4 HIGHLIGHT THOSE SYSTEMS, BECAUSE THE BENEFIT OF THE FREE AND
- 5 DISCOUNTED TRANSFERS IS THAT IT REALLY CAN BENEFIT THOSE FOLKS
- 6 THAT ARE TRANSFERRING INTO BART OR TRANSFERRING TO CALTRAIN.
- 7 SO, AGAIN FOR THOSE LOCAL TRANSIT OPERATORS, IT'S A REALLY BIG
- 8 RIDER INCREASE DRIVER. THAT AMOUNT OF MONEY, THE 25 MILLION
- 9 COULD ALSO EXPAND CLIPPER START, WHICH YOU KNOW IS A VERY
- 10 POPULAR PROGRAM THAT PROVIDES A 50% FARE DISCOUNT FOR LOW-
- 11 INCOME RESIDENTS IN THE BAY AREA. IT COULD EXPAND THAT TO BE
- 12 ABLE TO SERVE 100,000 MORE LOW-INCOME RIDERS. THE NEXT
- 13 CATEGORY ON HERE IS \$10 MILLION FOR MAPPING AND WAYFINDING,
- 14 THAT REALLY WOULD BE ABOUT FACILITATING SEAMLESS TRANSIT
- 15 NAVIGATION FOR PEOPLE COMING INTO THE SYSTEM. THE NEXT IT
- 16 WOULD BE A PROPOSAL FOR \$15 MILLION TO MAKE FOR TRANSIT
- 17 PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS THOSE ARE REALLY IMPROVEMENTS THAT CAN
- 18 GET BUSES OUT OF TRAFFIC AND TO SPEAK TO THE RIDER IMPROVEMENT
- 19 COMPONENT AND THINGS THAT RIDERS WILL SHARE MAKING TRANSIT
- 20 FASTER AND MORE RELIABLE, TRANSIT NOT BEING TOO FAST AND NOT
- 21 BEING RELIABLE ARE TWO BIG BARRIERS TO RIDING TRANSIT WE HAVE
- 22 SEEN WITH OPERATORS THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO INVEST IN TRANSIT
- 23 PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS THAT REALLY DOES DRAW NEW RIDERS TO THE
- 24 SYSTEM, PROPOSAL WOULD BE 5 MILLION FOR ACCESSIBILITY, THIS
- 25 TYPE OF INVESTMENT SUPPORT ONE-SEAT, TRANSIT RIDES MOBILITY



- 1 MANAGEMENT THROUGH THE COUNTIES FIRST AND LAST MILE TRANSIT
- 2 ACCESS I WANT TO FLAG THAT THE PROPOSAL DOESN'T GO INTO
- 3 SPECIFIC DETAIL ON HOW ALL OF THE FUNDS WOULD BE ADMINISTERED
- 4 BUT THE INTENT IS REALLY TO ENSURE THAT THE TAXPAYERS ARE
- 5 PAYING INTO A MEASURE ARE THE ONES THAT ARE SEEING BENEFIT SO
- 6 THE STRUCTURE WOULD BE RELATED TO TRANSIT PRIORITY AND MAPPING
- 7 AND WAYFINDING THOSE INVESTMENTS WOULD ONLY BE MADE IN THE
- 8 COUNTIES THAT ARE PARTICIPATING IN THE MEASURE AND ONE THING
- 9 THAT'S HELPFUL WITH SOME OF THE TRANSIT FARE COMPONENTS ARE
- 10 THAT, SO THIS EXAMPLE IS A FOUR COUNTY MEASURE, 94% OF ALL
- 11 CURRENT CLIPPER START USERS WHO TAP THEIR CARD AND GET THE
- 12 BENEFIT ARE IN THE FOUR COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN
- 13 MATEO, AND SAN FRANCISCO. AND, SO, THERE REALLY IS A DIRECT
- 14 CONNECTION TO THE FOLKS WHO WOULD BE PAYING INTO THE SYSTEM. I
- 15 WANTED TO SHOW THIS TO YOU TODAY, GET YOUR FEEDBACK, AND THEN
- 16 WE DO WANT TO COME BACK NEXT MONTH FOR ACTION TO ENDORSE
- 17 PRIORITIES RELATED TO THE TRANSIT RIDER IMPROVEMENT COMPONENT.
- 18 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE SHOWS HOW THE LEGISLATIVE
- 19 PROCESS IS TRACKING ALONGSIDE REGIONAL ENGAGEMENT AND POLLING.
- 20 BUT I WANTED TO REALLY EMPHASIZE TODAY ARE SOME OF THE KEY
- 21 NEGOTIATION DEADLINES. SO, JUNE 6TH IS KIND OF -- RIGHT
- 22 BETWEEN MAY AND JUNE, IT'S THE NEXT IMMEDIATE MILESTONE SO
- 23 THAT'S WHEN THE BILL NEEDS TO PASS THE SENATE FLOOR. THERE IS
- 24 A NEW NOT PICTURED DEADLINE IN HERE OF AUGUST 11TH FOR COUNTY
- 25 AND OPERATORS TO REALLY ADDRESS SOME OF THE FOUNDATIONAL



- 1 QUESTIONS, WHICH COUNTIES ARE IN THE SALES TAX RATE AND THE
- 2 DETAILED EXPENDITURE PLAN. THAT'S ABOUT TWO MONTHS BETWEEN NOW
- 3 AND THAT DEADLINE. BECAUSE THAT AUGUST 11TH DEADLINE IS QUITE
- 4 CLOSE TO THE END OF THE SESSION, WE EXPECT THAT THE AUTHORS
- 5 WILL REALLY WANT TO RESOLVE OTHER DETAILS WELL BEFORE THEN,
- 6 LIKELY BY THAT JULY 18TH ASSEMBLY POLICY COMMITTEE DEADLINE.
- 7 SO, THE TYPES OF THINGS THAT MIGHT BE ABLE TO -- THAT REALLY
- 8 ARE A TARGET TO GET RESOLVED BY THEN ARE THINGS LIKE THE
- 9 GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS, FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW, HOW THE
- 10 FUNDS WOULD BE ADMINISTERED, THAT GOAL WOULD REALLY BE TO
- 11 CLEAR THE DECKS ON OPEN QUESTIONS SO THAT THEN STAKEHOLDERS
- 12 AND PARTNERS CAN REALLY FOCUS ON THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IN
- 13 AUGUST AND BEFORE SEPTEMBER 5TH WHICH IS THE LAST DAY FOR
- 14 BILLS TO GET PASSED. THIS TIMING REALLY DOES ALSO GIVE THE
- 15 COMMISSION A NATURAL OPPORTUNITY TO WEIGH IN AGAIN IN JUNE,
- 16 ESPECIALLY ON THOSE RIDER IMPROVEMENT PRIORITIES. BECAUSE THEN
- 17 THERE IS STILL TIME FOR NEGOTIATIONS BEFORE THAT AUGUST 11TH
- 18 DEADLINE. SO, WITH THAT, I JUST -- YEAH, WE WANTED TO PROVIDE
- 19 YOU SOME OF THIS OVERVIEW AND APPROXIMATE WOULD LIKE YOUR
- 20 FEEDBACK.
- 21
- 22 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU. GREAT UPDATE,
- 23 GEORGIA. COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER, PLEASE.



MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: THANK YOU SO MUCH, VICE CHAIR. THANK 1 YOU MISS GANN DOHRMANN. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. SO, ON 2 3 THE PROPOSED \$55 MILLION ANNUAL INVESTMENT, HOW WOULD THESE INVESTMENTS IS BE APPORTIONED AMONG THE VARIOUS TRANSIT 4 5 AGENCIES? 6 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: SO, MOST OF THE RESOURCES FROM THE 7 8 PROPOSED MEASURE WOULD BE GOING DIRECTLY BACK TO TRANSIT OPERATORS, RIGHT, TO GO INTO THEIR OPERATING BUDGETS, WHEREAS 9 THESE RIDER IMPROVEMENT CATEGORIES WOULD NOT GO DIRECTLY TO 10 OPERATORS TO GO INTO THEIR BUDGET THEY WOULD REALLY GO TO MAKE 11 IMPROVEMENTS TO THE TRANSIT SYSTEM, BUT THOSE ARE SOMETHING 12 THAT MTC WOULD HOLD AND YOU ALL WOULD MAKE DECISIONS AROUND 13 ADMINISTERING. SO, THAT'S KIND OF THE BEGINNING PART OF WHERE 14 NEGOTIATIONS WOULD BE, AN EXAMPLE, BUT IT'S VERY LIKELY THAT 15 16 WE WOULD WANT TO COME BACK AND GET DIRECTION FROM YOU NEXT MONTH ON SPECIFICALLY HOW EACH OF THOSE ITEMS COULD BE 17 DISTRIBUTED. TO CLARIFY TWO DUCTS OF HOW THEY COULD BE 18 DISTRIBUTED ONE ON THE FARE INTEGRATION COMPONENT IS REALLY 19 SOMETHING THAT WOULD GET ADMINISTERED THROUGH CLIPPER AND 20 21 CLIPPER IS A PROGRAM THAT MTC ADMINISTERS, YOU KNOW, ON BEHALF OF FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS SO RELATED TO FARE INTEGRATION 22 WOULD COME TO MTC AND AGAIN BENEFITS WILL GO OUT TO THE 23 OPERATORS AND TO THE RESIDENTS WHO WOULD BE USING THE SYSTEM. 24

THEN MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AND TRANSIT PRIORITY ARE, SORT OF,



- 1 TWO CATEGORIES THAT ARE A LOT MORE -- YOU KNOW, THEY'RE
- 2 LOCATION SPECIFIC, SO THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR DISCUSSION
- 3 AROUND SHOULD IT BE SOMETHING THAT MTC ADMINISTERS, SHOULD
- 4 THAT BE SOMETHING THAT GETS DIRECTED TO THE COUNTIES AND
- 5 COUNTIES MAKE DECISIONS. SO, IT'S JUST THAT'S REALLY AGAIN A
- 6 COMPONENT WHERE WE NEED TO SEEK YOUR FEEDBACK.

7

- 8 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: SOUNDS LIKE THE ANSWER MIGHT BE TBD AND
- 9 THEN IT'S COMING TO THE COMMISSION. THE DIFFERENT BUCKETS
- 10 TRANSIT FARE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, ET CETERA, I JUST WONDER,
- 11 THERE IS 10 MILLION FOR MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, THEY'RE ALL
- 12 IMPORTANT, I MIGHT ADD, AND THEN THERE IS HALF THAT AMOUNT, 5
- 13 MILLION FOR ACCESSIBILITY, WHICH IS, YOU KNOW, MOBILITY
- 14 ASSISTANCE AND OPERATIONAL SUPPORT, BUT ALSO THAT FIRST AND
- 15 LAST MILE TRANSIT ACCESS THAT WE HEAR SO MUCH OF THE TIME CAN
- 16 BE A BARRIER TO USING TRANSIT. SO, HOW -- HOW WAS IT
- 17 DETERMINED THAT, YOU KNOW, THE DIFFERENT AMOUNTS ASSIGNED TO
- 18 THE DIFFERENT BUCKETS, WHOMEVER WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THAT
- 19 QUESTION?

- 21 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT. AGAIN, THIS IS
- 22 SUBJECT TO YOUR FEEDBACK, NEXT MONTH WE'LL BE BRINGING IT BACK
- 23 AS AN ACTION ITEM. THIS FRAMEWORK HERE AND THESE RATIOS ARE
- 24 SIMILAR TO WHAT OUR NETWORK MANAGEMENT STAFF HAVE BEEN
- 25 PRESENTING TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE, FOR EXAMPLE, THERE WAS A



- 1 PRESENTATION ON, YOU KNOW, WHAT WOULD 100 MILLION BE
- 2 DISTRIBUTED ON AN ANNUAL BASIS, AND JUST FOR SENSE OF SCALE
- 3 THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT IN OUR -- SEVERAL YEARS
- 4 AGO, WE DID AN ESTIMATE, AND IT'S QUITE STALE NOW, SO WANT TO
- 5 BE CLEAR ABOUT THAT, ABOUT WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO FULLY DEPLOY
- 6 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, REGION-WIDE, SO THIS IS CHANGING
- 7 SIGNAGE PRETTY MUCH NEW BUS FLAGS ALL OF THAT, ABOUT \$100
- 8 MILLION SO BIG UNDERTAKING WE HAVE ALREADY FINISHED THE DESIGN
- 9 OF THIS WHOLE NEW SYSTEM WE HAVE DONE A TON OF STAKEHOLDER
- 10 FEEDBACK AND OUTREACH WITH THE OPERATORS SO WE HAVE PUT A LOT
- 11 INTO THIS AND WE BELIEVE IT'S GOING TO TRANSFORM AND WE WANT
- 12 TO ACTUALLY DEPLOY IT AND SO AT \$10 MILLION A YEAR RIGHT THAT
- 13 WOULD CERTAINLY NOT HAPPEN OVERNIGHT BUT IT WOULD HELP US CHIP
- 14 AWAY AT FULL-SCALE DEPLOYMENT TRANSIT PRIORITY AGAIN AS
- 15 GEORGIA MENTIONED IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF SPEEDING UP TRANSIT WE
- 16 HAVE SEEN SIGNIFICANT RIDERSHIP GAINS FROM THAT AND THAT'S
- 17 EXPENSIVE, I MEAN, CERTAINLY BUS RAPID TRANSIT YOU CAN SEE
- 18 HERE WE HAVE TWO CORRIDOR WIDE PROJECTS RIGHT WITHIN 15
- 19 MILLION SO THAT'S SNAG'S EXPENSIVE WE EXPECT WILL GENERATE BIG
- 20 RETURNS ON RIDERSHIP, ON ACCESSIBILITY, THE COSTS THERE
- 21 THEY'RE FRANKLY QUITE A BIT LOWER. SOME OF IT IS MORE KIND OF
- 22 FIGURING OUT THE TECHNOLOGY TO, YOU KNOW, DEPLOY ONCE YOU RIDE
- 23 WITHIN A COUNTY. SO, THEY'RE NOT AS INFRASTRUCTURE INTENSIVE,
- 24 AND WHILE THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT AND VALUABLE, THAT DOESN'T



HAVE THE POTENTIAL AND THE SAME EXTENT TO GENERATE NEW 1 RIDERSHIP. SO, IT'S BALANCING THOSE GOALS. 2 3 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: AND WHEN THE LAST BULLET POINT ON 4 5 ACCESSIBILITY BUCKET IS SHOWN, THE 50 AND LAST MILE TRANSIT ACCESS THAT WAS JUST FOR, LIKE, PARATRANSIT AND ACCESSIBILITY 6 7 SERVICES? 8 REBECCA LONG: THAT IS THE INTENT THERE. THERE IS SOME 9 10 CONSIDERATION OF POTENTIALLY AUGMENTING BAY WHEELS ACCESS, BIKESHARE ACCESS, BUT THAT WAS REALLY VERY LIMITED AND, AGAIN, 11 SUBJECT TO YOUR FEEDBACK. 12 13 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: ALL RIGHT. THANKS SO MUCH. 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU. 17 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. 18 NEXT WE'RE GOING TO GO TO COMMISSIONER MILEY, THEN 19 20 COMMISSIONER CANEPA, AND THEN COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. 21 22 NATHAN MILEY: RIGHT. SO, I HAVE A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS OF THE FIRST OF ALL, I'M GOING TO START WITH LAFTA. GEORGIA, YOU CAN 23 HELP RESPOND TO SOME OF LAFTA'S CONCERNS? THAT'S MY FIRST --24

25

TO THEY HAD A FEW QUESTIONS.



1	
2	GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: I'LL PULL THAT UP AND FOR THE SAKE OF
3	BRINGING EVERYBODY ALONG WITH US I'LL READ THE QUESTIONS OUT
4	LOUD. SO, HERE WE GO. SO, THE FIRST QUESTION WAS RELATED TO
5	THE TRANSIT RIDER IMPROVEMENT EXPENDITURE PLAN SLIDE, AND IT
6	NOTED THAT THE EXPENDITURE PLAN SIDE HIGHLIGHTS MTC'S SHARE OF
7	THE REVENUE MEASURE, WHICH WOULD BE UP TO 10%, AND THE
8	QUESTION WAS WHAT IS THE FORECASTED RIDERSHIP IMPACT OF THESE
9	INVESTMENTS AND IS THE FORECASTED RIDERSHIP INCREASE GREATER
10	THAN THE FORECASTED RIDERSHIP LOSS ON OUR EAST BAY LOCAL BUS
11	OPERATORS SHOULD THEY RECEIVE ANY MEASURE FUND FROM THIS
12	MEASURE, AND THEN THIRD QUESTION ARE KPIS FOR MTC'S
13	PERFORMANCE ON DELIVERING SOME OF THESE INVESTMENTS. I DID MY
14	PRESENTATION TO SHARE SOME OF THE RIDERSHIP FORECAST NUMBERS
15	AN EXAMPLE IS ONE OF THE INVESTMENTS WOULD BRING IN A PROPOSED
16	BUSINESS CASE FOR THE FREE AND REDUCED TRANSFERS IS PROPOSED
17	TO BRING IN 30,000 DAILY NEW RIDERS, AND THAT, SORT OF,
18	RIDERSHIP GROWTH IS AT A SCALE THAT IS GREATER THAN THE
19	COMBINED DAILY RIDERSHIP OF THE SMALL BUS OPERATORS IN ALAMEDA
20	AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. SO, IT WOULD BE A SIGNIFICANT
21	PROPORTIONATE INCREASE IN RIDERS. AND THEN, I THINK THAT THE
22	OTHER QUESTION IS AROUND WHAT ARE KPIS ON THESE INVESTMENTS. I
23	THINK IT'S REALLY, ACTUALLY GREAT THAT WE CAN HAVE A LOT OF
24	TOOLS TO TRACK RIDERSHIP INCREASE. SO, I HOPE
25	[INDISCERNIBLE] ON THAT ONE?



1 NATHAN MILEY: THERE WAS A QUESTION BELOW THAT AS WELL. 2 3 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: YES THE NEXT PEEK IS I UNDERSTAND THAT 4 5 OUR SUBURBAN EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS HAVE BEEN COMMUNICATING THEIR SHORTFALLS TO THE LEGISLATURE AND IT SEEMS IMPORTANT FOR 6 REGIONAL MEASURE TO INCLUDE RESOURCES PERHAPS GUARANTEED 7 8 FUNDING SET ASIDE FOR THE EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS AND SO THOSE ARE THE SMALLER OPERATORS IN THE EAST BAY AND I WANT TO 9 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WHAT I THINK IS REALLY GREAT IS THAT THE 10 LEGISLATION, RIGHT NOW, DOES SPECIFY THAT EAST BAY BUS 11 OPERATORS ARE ELIGIBLE FOR RESOURCES. IT ALSO REALLY, SORT OF, 12 DEVOLVES THE DECISION MAKING ON AN EXPENDITURE PLAN TO THE 13 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES. MTC AGAIN IS PROVIDING 14 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE IN THAT SPACE. SO, I JUST SAY THE REAL 15 16 PLACE TO BE DISCUSSING EXACTLY WHAT RESOURCES FOR THE EAST BAY SMALL OPERATORS WOULD LOOK LIKE WOULD REALLY BE IN YOUR ROLE, 17 RIGHT, ACTC TO REALLY TALK ABOUT THE, SORT OF, WHAT THOSE 18 RESOURCES AND HOW MONEY COULD FLOW TO LAFTA AND OTHER EAST BAY 19 OPERATORS. 20 21 22 NATHAN MILEY: OKAY. THANKS FOR RESPONDING TO THAT. I WANT TO ASK MARILYN, BECAUSE MARILYN IS THE VICE CHAIR FOR ACTC, HAVE 23 WE DISCUSSED THIS YET? 24



1	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: SO, ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
2	COMMISSION HAS HAD SOME DISCUSSION OF SB63. WE HAVE NOT YET
3	TAKEN A POSITION.
4	
5	NATHAN MILEY: OKAY. SO WE HAVEN'T GOTTEN INTO THE NITTY-
6	GRITTY?
7	
8	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: NOT YET.
9	
10	NATHAN MILEY: OKAY.
11	
12	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: BUT I WOULD JUST ADD THAT OUR INTERIM
13	EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR CAROLYN IS LOOKING AT THE DIFFERENT WAYS
14	THAT THE FUNDS WOULD BE
15	
16	NATHAN MILEY: ALAMEDA COUNTY OBVIOUSLY WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO
17	PRODUCE A WIN-WIN IF POSSIBLE, FOR THIS, IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE
18	2/3. NO?
19	
20	GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THE LEGISLATION AUTHORIZES A CITIZEN'S
21	INITIATIVE OPTION WHICH WOULD BE SUBJECT TO SIMPLE MAJORITY.
22	
23	NATHAN MILEY:
24	



GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: POLLING THUS FAR IS INDICATE NAG 1 CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE WOULD BE THE ONLY VIABLE PATH. 2 3 NATHAN MILEY: AND WITH THE TRANSIT FARES, AND I KNOW YOU SAID 4 5 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT HAS BEEN LOOKING AT THIS, AND SO I TRUST PEOPLE, ON TOP OF IT, BUT IN MY ADVOCACY AND WORK WITH 6 OLDER ADULT IN THE DISABLED COMMUNITY, AND FOLKS HAVING GOTTEN 7 8 BACK TO ME ABOUT THIS JUST YET, I DO APPRECIATE THAT THIS HAS BEEN REVIEWED, AND I APPRECIATE THAT THERE MIGHT BE NEW AND 9 DISCOUNTED FARES FOR TRANSFERS, BUT WHAT'S THE POSSIBILITY OF 10 NEW FREE AND DISCOUNTED FARES WITH OLDER ADULTS AND 11 DISABILITIES PERIOD? I'M NOT JUST TALKING TRANSFERS. I'M 12 TALKING PERIOD. LIKE, IF SENIORS AND DISABLED PERSONS COULD 13 RIDE THE BUS -- YOU KNOW, TRANSIT, FOR MINIMAL AMOUNT -- I 14 15 KNOW THEY'RE ALREADY GETTING A DISCOUNT NOW, BUT EVEN MORE, NOT SAYING FREE, CLOSER TO FREE NOW I'M SURE THAT WOULD 16 INCREASE RIDERSHIP AS WELL. HAS THAT BEEN ANALYZED OR 17 CONSIDERED? 18 19 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY. UNDER CURRENT 20 21 PRACTICE SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES QUALIFY FOR OTHER DISCOUNTS, I BELIEVE IT MIGHT BE 65% UNDER, YOU KNOW, 22 CURRENTLY PRACTICE. SO, THE BILL, RIGHT NOW, AND WHAT WE HAVE 23 PROPOSED IS NOT CHANGING THAT. WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING IS TO HELP 24 25 FUND WHAT WILL BE UNROLLING LATER THIS YEAR THROUGH NEXGEN AND



CLIPPER WHICH IS FREE AND REDUCED TRANSFERS THEN EXPANSION OF 1 2 THE CLIPPER START WHICH IS FOR LOW-INCOME. 3 NATHAN MILEY: HOW MUCH WOULD IT COST FOR A SENIOR OR DISABLED 4 5 PERSON TO RIDE TRANSIT, PERIOD? 6 7 REBECCA LONG: FOR FREE? OR JUST WHAT THE CURRENT PRICES ARE? 8 NATHAN MILEY: THE CURRENT, AND THEN IF IT WERE FURTHER 9 10 REDUCED. 11 REBECCA LONG: OKAY WE CAN CERTAINLY FOLLOW UP WITH YOU ON 12 THAT. 13 14 NATHAN MILEY: A LOT OF SENIORS AND PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES 15 16 ARE ON FIXED INCOME. I KNOW AT ACTC, WE PROVIDE FREE STUDENT BUS PASSES AND OUR ABILITY TO TRY TO ALLOW FOR THAT TYPE OF 17 CONSIDERATION, I THINK WOULD ALSO INCREASE, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT 18 USAGE. AND LET ME SEE IF I HAD ONE OTHER QUESTION. LAFTA, THAT 19 ONE, I THINK THOSE ARE MY QUESTIONS. SO, THANK YOU, AT THE 20 21 MOMENT. 22 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL GO 23

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

24

25

NOW TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA.



- 1 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ALETA DUPREE MENTION THAT
- 2 WE HAVE ABOUT 27 OPERATORS AND SO WHAT I THINK IS REALLY
- 3 CRITICALLY IMPORTANT, AND MAYBE HERE IS A QUESTION FOR
- 4 REBECCA, CAN YOU JUST -- REBECCA, CAN YOU SPEAK, OR GEORGIA,
- 5 CAN YOU KIND OF SPEAK TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND HOW WE
- 6 GOT TO THIS PLACE AROUND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION? MANY MEMBERS
- 7 MAY NOT KNOW, OR THEY MAY KNOW. I DON'T KNOW.

8

- 9 REBECCA LONG: YEAH. HAPPY TO. SO, THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
- 10 TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE WAS CONVENED BY MTC, I THINK, IN MAY
- 11 OF 2020. SO, REALLY RIGHT IN THE MIDST OF THE PANDEMIC, TO
- 12 RESPOND TO THIS EMERGENCY. AND IN RECOGNITION THAT, YOU KNOW,
- 13 IT WASN'T SUFFICIENT TO JUST SECURE FUNDING, BUT IT REALLY WAS
- 14 AN OPPORTUNITY TO THINK ABOUT HOW CAN WE HAVE A BETTER MORE
- 15 INTEGRATED TRANSIT SYSTEM OVERALL. AND, SO, THE COMMITTEE WAS
- 16 COMPRISED OF COMMISSIONERS, AS WELL AS REPRESENTATIVES OF THE
- 17 BUSINESS COMMUNITY, STAKEHOLDERS, ET CETERA. AND IT WORKED
- 18 OVER ALMOST TWO YEARS TO COME UP WITH A BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT,
- 19 OR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, AND THAT PLAN INCLUDED,
- 20 ACTUALLY 27 DIFFERENT ACTION ITEMS OF WHICH THE FOUR PRIORITY
- 21 ONES WERE THOSE THAT ARE IN OUR PROPOSED EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR
- 22 SB63. SO, IT WAS FARE INTEGRATION, MAPPING AND WAYFINDING,
- 23 TRANSIT ACCESSIBILITY, AND TRANSIT PRIORITY.



- 1 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. AND MY FOLLOW-UP OUESTION IS, YOU TALKED
- 2 ABOUT THE NUMBER LOOKS DIFFERENT, TALKED ABOUT \$55 MILLION, I
- 3 REMEMBER AT THE TIME THAT NUMBER WAS MUCH GREATER. WHY WAS
- 4 THAT NUMBER REVISED, YOU KNOW? BECAUSE THE NEED IS SO GREAT,
- 5 FROM UNDERSTANDING FROM A STAFF PERSPECTIVE, IT WAS \$100
- 6 MILLION, HOW DID WE LAND ON 55 MILLION?

7

- 8 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: WE LAND ON 55 MILLION BECAUSE THE
- 9 DISCUSSION DURING THE SELECT COMMITTEE WAS REALLY AROUND 10%
- 10 OF A MEASURE AND THE COMMITTEE CONSIDERED NINE COUNTY MEASURE
- 11 10% OF WHAT NINE COUNTY MEASURE WOULD HAVE BEEN 100 MILLION
- 12 AND DISCUSSION MOVED TO THE COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE REALLY
- 13 LEANED INTO FIVE --

- 15 DAVID CANEPA: IN MY CITY IN MY COUNTY PEOPLE GO FROM REDWOOD
- 16 CITY THEY MAY GO UP TO THE NORTH BAY THEY MAY GO TO THE EAST
- 17 BAY. AND, SO, WHAT I HAVE HEARD FROM RIDERS IS JUST THIS
- 18 ABILITY TO CONNECT. AND THAT SEEMS TO REALLY BE A PROBLEM.
- 19 ESPECIALLY FOR THE MOST VULNERABLE WORKING CLASS PEOPLE,
- 20 RIGHT? AND IT'S LIKE, YOU KNOW, HOW DO I MAKE SURE I GET IT MY
- 21 JOB ON TIME. AND I THINK WHAT WE HAVE LAID OUT IN THIS BLUE
- 22 RIBBON -- I FORGOT IT WAS TWO YEARS -- IS REALLY THIS ISSUE OF
- 23 CONNECTIVITY. I THINK CLIPPER START BEING ABLE TO CONNECT
- 24 WITHOUT BEING, SORT OF, CHARGED, I THINK THAT'S REALLY, REALLY
- 25 PERSONALITY. I LOOK AT THE ACCESSIBILITY PIECE, AND SO I THINK



- 1 WHAT WE'RE TRYING DO FOR USERS IN THIS IS TO REALLY MAKE SURE
- 2 RIDERS IS TO REALLY MAKE SURE THAT IT'S SEAMLESS AND THAT
- 3 THEY'RE ABLE TO CONNECT. AND TO ME THAT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE.
- 4 BECAUSE THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION HAS LOOKED AT IT FOR TWO
- 5 YEARS, AND THANK YOU FOR REMINDING ME ABOUT THAT, BUT I THINK
- 6 MOST IMPORTANTLY IS THE 27 OPERATORS THAT WE HAVE HOW DO WE
- 7 ENSURE THAT PEOPLE ARE ABLE TO GET TO WHERE THEY HAVE TO GO,
- 8 WHETHER IT'S A JOB. SO I'M IN GREAT SUPPORT OF \$55 MILLION I
- 9 DON'T KNOW I THINK IT WILL MAKE A SIGNIFICANT DENT PROBABLY
- 10 SHOULD BE MORE BUT I THINK THE DIRECTION WE'RE GOING RELATIVE
- 11 TO MAKING SURE OUR RIDERS REGARDLESS OF WHAT COUNTY THEY LIVE
- 12 IN ARE ABLE TO GET TO WHERE THEY HAVE TO GO IS MOST IMPORTANT
- 13 TO ME. I'M IN GREAT SUPPORT AND WITH THAT I'LL GIVE IT BACK TO
- 14 YOU MADAM CHAIR.

15

- 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
- 17 CANEPA, COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND THEN COMMISSIONER BURT.

- 19 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. DEFINITELY
- 20 VERY MUCH INTERESTED IN THE TRANSFORMATION NETWORK, BLUE
- 21 RIBBON ITEMS, AND I APPRECIATE HOW YOU LAID THAT OUT.
- 22 OBVIOUSLY I'M ON THE WEDNESDAY COMMITTEES, AND I KNOW THAT
- 23 COMMITTEE MEETS ON FRIDAY. SO TO BE FRANK, I JUST HAVE NOT
- 24 BEEN ABLE TO KEEP ON WHAT'S GOING ON, AND THERE IS A LOT OF
- 25 QUESTIONS. AND, SO, I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST, COULD WE HAVE A





- 1 FULL COMMISSION PRESENTATION ON A MORE -- AND MORE DETAILED
- 2 PRESENTATION ON THAT, AND TO ANSWER ALL OF THESE QUESTIONS WE
- 3 HAVE HAD. BECAUSE I HAVE QUESTIONS, AND WE DON'T HAVE THE TIME
- 4 TODAY. BUT FRANKLY JUST LOOKING AT THE NUMBERS FOR FEE
- 5 TRANSFERS, AND THE FEE PIECE TRANSFERS VERSUS CLIPPER START,
- 6 VERY MUCH APPRECIATE TRANSFERS BUT FOR A COUNTY LIKE OURS
- 7 WHERE 75% OF OUR RIDERS RIDE WITHIN THE COUNTY, IT DOESN'T
- 8 AFFECT US. SO I LOOK AT THE NUMBERS AND CLIPPER START, TO ME,
- 9 WOULD BE MUCH MORE HELPFUL. AND I KNOW WE WERE ON THE KITCHEN
- 10 CABINET FOR THE MEANS BASED PILOT, AND I HAVE QUESTIONS ABOUT
- 11 HOW THAT WORK IS CONNECTED TO THIS. BECAUSE I REMEMBER WE WERE
- 12 LOOKING AT FOLKS WHO QUALIFY FOR MEDICAL IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY
- 13 IS SOMETHING LIKE 250,000 PEOPLE. SO IF THEY COULD QUALIFY FOR
- 14 CLIPPER START THAT'S 250,000 PEOPLE RIDING IT FOR A LOWER
- 15 AMOUNT SO THESE ARE MORE DETAILS THAT I THINK WE REALLY NEED
- 16 TO HAVE TO HAVE A COMFORT LEVEL TO DECIDE WHAT THE PERCENTAGE
- 17 SHOULD BE, WHETHER WE SHOULD, FOR OUR COUNTY, WHETHER WE
- 18 SHOULD OPT IN OR NOT. SO, IF I COULD REQUEST THAT MAYBE AT OUR
- 19 NEXT MEETING TO HAVE THAT DEEP DIVE, I WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE
- 20 IT. AND THEN ALONG THAT, TOO, I KNOW THAT VTA WOULD BE VERY
- 21 APPRECIATIVE OF HAVING A PRESENTATION FROM MTC STAFF, AS WELL.
- 22 BECAUSE SOME OF THE OTHER ITEMS, LIKE WAYFINDING, I KNOW THERE
- 23 IS A PILOT PROGRAM GOING. I'M CONCERNED, FRANKLY, ABOUT HOW
- 24 LONG IT'S TAKING. AND YOU KNOW, MY QUESTION WOULD BE COULD
- 25 EACH AGENCY OR COUNTY TAKE THEIR PIECE, LIKE IF YOU JUST LAY



- 1 OUT WHAT THE GUIDELINES ARE FOR COLORS AND SIGN FONTS AND WHAT
- 2 NOT, CAN WE POTENTIALLY, AS A COUNTY, GO OUT AND JUST DO IT,
- 3 YOU KNOW, AT A QUICKER, SO WE'RE DOING MULTIPLES AT THE SAME
- 4 TIME, RATHER THAN THE ONE -- IT SOUNDS LIKE IT'S A ONE BY ONE
- 5 PROCESS. SO, THINGS LIKE THAT, AND THEN TRANSIT PRIORITY, TOO,
- 6 ALREADY, I THINK A LOT OF OUR AGENCIES AND COUNTIES ARE
- 7 ALREADY LOOKING AT PROJECTS. SO, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO SEE
- 8 HOW WE COULD SOURCE FROM THIS FUNDING POT SOME OF WHAT WE'RE
- 9 ALREADY WORKING ON? SO, IF WE COULD HAVE THAT, OVERALL, FOR
- 10 US, AND THEN I DON'T -- I'M SURE OTHER AGENCIES WOULD
- 11 APPRECIATE A ONE-ON-ONE PRESENTATION, AS WELL.

12

- 13 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: GREAT. YEAH, THANK YOU.
- 14 COMMISSIONER BURT, AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

15

- 16 PAT BURT: THANK YOU. FIRST I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON ONE OF THE
- 17 POINTS THAT COMMISSIONER CANEPA WAS TALKING ABOUT, WHICH IS
- 18 REALLY SCHEDULE COORDINATION. AND I DON'T SEE IT LISTED UNDER
- 19 THE ACTION PLAN. IS THAT BECAUSE IT REALLY DOESN'T REQUIRE A
- 20 LOT OF DOLLARS, BUT IS IMPORTANT TO OUR -- WHY IS IT NOT
- 21 LISTED?

- 23 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. YEAH, IT'S A GREAT
- 24 QUESTION. IT IS SOMETHING THAT WAS TALKED ABOUT A LOT AT THE
- 25 BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND I WOULD SAY A FEW THINGS.



- 1 ONE IS IF YOU HAVE A HIGH FREQUENCY TRANSIT SYSTEM, THEN THE
- 2 SCHEDULE COORDINATION, YOU KNOW, DOESN'T BECOME QUITE AS
- 3 IMPORTANT, RIGHT? BECAUSE YOU KNOW THAT EVERY FIVE MINUTES OR
- 4 SO -- SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THE GENERAL MANAGERS POINTED
- 5 OUT QUITE A BIT, LIKE WITH RAIL BART AND CALTRAIN, FOR
- 6 EXAMPLE, THAT'S IMPORTANT AND SOMETHING THAT BART AND CALTRAIN
- 7 HAVE WORKED ON AND RECENTLY PUT OUT A TIME TABLE, AND SO, IT'S
- 8 NOT -- IN THAT CASE, IT'S NOT ABOUT MONEY, RIGHT? IT'S JUST
- 9 ABOUT DOING THE WORK TO COORDINATE THE SCHEDULES. ANOTHER
- 10 IMPORTANT IMPROVEMENT IN SCHEDULE COORDINATION IS THE
- 11 OPERATORS HAVE AGREED VOLUNTARILY TO CHANGE THEIR SCHEDULES ON
- 12 THE SAME CYCLE, I THINK IT'S, YOU KNOW, TWICE A YEAR THEY HAVE
- 13 THE OPTION TO DO THAT. AND THAT HAS REALLY IMPROVED, SO THAT
- 14 YOU KNOW, OPERATORS AREN'T JUST REACTING TO AND SUDDENLY
- 15 HAVING A BIG GAP. SO, I GUESS THE -- TO SUM IT UP, SCHEDULE
- 16 COORDINATION, IT COULD BE A FINANCIAL THING, IF YOU ARE
- 17 IMPROVING SERVICE, BUT AS GEORGIA MENTIONED, YOU KNOW,
- 18 CHANGING SERVICE FREOUENCIES IS ONE OF THE MOST EXPENSIVE
- 19 THINGS YOU CAN DO, BECAUSE THAT REQUIRES, YOU KNOW, NEW
- 20 DRIVERS, ET CETERA. IT IS REALLY IMPORTANT. WE'RE SEEING SOME
- 21 IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT'S WHY IT'S NOT INCLUDED IN THE MEASURE
- 22 RIGHT NOW.

24 PAT BURT: YEAH, I THINK IT DOES COME DOWN TO TWO CATEGORIES,

25 ONE IS INCREASING SERVICE TO GRATE GREATER COORDINATION, THE



- 1 OTHER IS SIMPLY COOPERATING THE EXISTING SERVICE MORE
- 2 EFFECTIVELY WHICH IS NOT A REAL FINANCIAL IMPACT. AND I WOULD
- 3 ADD THAT BUS TO RAIL IS A VERY IMPORTANT PART, AND EVEN BUS TO
- 4 BUS. PALO ALTO IS IN A MODAL CENTER, IS THAT THE SOUTHERN
- 5 TERMINUS OF SAMTRANS AND NORTH OF VTA AND IT'S AN AC TRANSIT
- 6 AND CALTRAIN. SO GETTING THAT COORDINATION, I SEE ALL THE
- 7 TIME, IS IMPORTANT. AND FRANKLY WE HAVEN'T DONE A GOOD JOB OF
- 8 THAT HISTORICALLY. SO, EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT A SIGNIFICANT
- 9 FINANCIAL PART, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO REALLY CALL IT OUT
- 10 SO WE'RE CONTINUING TO RECOGNIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF DOING IT,
- 11 ASIDE FROM IT OUR ABLE TO ACTUALLY INCREASE THE SERVICE
- 12 LEVELS, WHICH MAKES IT EASIER. AND THEN, I WANTED TO -- ON
- 13 SLIDE TWO, WHICH SUMMARIZES THE CURRENT PROVISIONS OF SB63,
- 14 ONE QUESTION, IS THERE -- I THINK WE HAVE SEEN THIS
- 15 PREVIOUSLY, BUT THE PERCENT OF SALES TAX THAT WOULD BE PAID
- 16 PER COUNTY, IF ALL THE COUNTIES WERE PAYING AT THE SAME RATE,
- 17 WHAT'S THE PERCENTAGE AMONG THE THREE COUNTIES THAT ARE
- 18 ALREADY OPTED IN? AND THEN SEPARATELY, IF SAN MATEO AND SANTA
- 19 CLARA COUNTY WERE OPTING IN?
- 21 REBECCA LONG: JUST A CLARIFYING QUESTION COMMISSIONER BURT,
- 22 ARE YOU ASKING WHAT PERCENT WOULD GO TOWARDS TRANSIT
- 23 TRANSFORMATION?

25 PAT BURT: NO WHAT'S THE INPUT OF TAX DOLLARS.

20



1 2 REBECCA LONG: THE TOTAL RATE, THAT'S IT BD. 3 PAT BURT: NO IT'S BASED UPON -- I'M TALKING ABOUT POPULATION 4 5 AND SALES TAX GENERATED FROM IT EACH COUNTY IF YOU HAVE A IF YOU HAVE THE SAME RATE FROM EACH COUNTY SO IF EVERYBODY OPTED 6 IN FOR HALF CENT, WHAT PORTION -- AND THERE WERE FIVE COUNTIES 7 8 IN, WHAT PORTION OF THE TOTAL TAX WOULD BE PAID BY EACH 9 COUNTY? 10 REBECCA LONG: YEAH, I MEAN, I GUESS THAT'S SIMPLE MATH. I 11 DON'T HAVE THAT OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD. I KNOW WHAT I DO HAVE 12 OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD BECAUSE I WAS JUST LOOKING AT IT, 13 RIGHT, IS SANTA CLARA IS BY FAR THE LARGEST GENERATOR ABOUT 14 15 312 MILLION A YEAR IS THE FORECAST FOR FISCAL YEAR '27, SAN 16 FRANCISCO IS GENERATING ABOUT 100 MILLION SO WE CAN CERTAINLY 17 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] 18 PAT BURT: THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH MY MEMORY AND I THINK IT'S 19 REALLY IMPORTANT APPROXIMATE INCLUDING IN THIS WHOLE OUESTION 20 21 OF HOW WE HAVE RETURN TO SOURCE. BECAUSE WHEN I LOOK AT THE FOURTH BULLET ON SLIDE TWO THAT SAYS THE PORTION TO AVERT 22 MAJOR SERVICE CUTS IN BART, CALTRAIN, AC, AND MUNI E PLUS 23 FUNDING FOR FEEDER BUS IN PARTICIPATING COUNTY, AND THEN IT 24

SAYS REMAINDER, IF ANY, TO BE USED FOR LOCAL TRANSIT



PRIORITIES TO BE DETERMINED BY THE COUNTIES. TRANSPORTATION 1 AGENCIES. AND, SO, I THINK IF WE LOOK AT THOSE TWO NUMBERS, 2 3 AND IN OUR CASE, THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY WITH WHAT? A QUARTER? 20-WHAT PERCENT? ANYWAY, A VERY HIGH PERCENTAGE OF THE TOTAL, 4 BUT UNDER THE WAY THAT CURRENT PROVISIONS OF SB63 ARE, IT 5 WOULD BE REMAINDER, IF ANY, RETURNED. AND THAT'S A BIG 6 DIFFERENCE. 7 8 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: YEAH AND COMMISSIONER BURT, ONE OF THE 9 THINGS WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE IS, SORT OF, THE WAY THAT THE BILL 10 HAS HAD TO NAVIGATE. THAT IT'S WRITTEN, RIGHT NOW, TO ASSUME 11 THAT ONLY THREE COUNTIES ARE OPTED -- ONLY THREE COUNTIES ARE 12 PARTICIPATING IN THE MEASURE AND THAT OTHERS MAY OPT IN. SO, 13 JUST THE MATH ON ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, AND SAN FRANCISCO IS 14 15 THAT IT'S LIKELY VERY LARGE MAJORITY OF THOSE RESOURCES WOULD 16 HAVE TO BE USED FOR AVERTING SERVICE CUTS AND THEN THAT'S ALSO 17 THE REASON WHY IN THE BILL THERE ARE SPECIFIC SMALLER OPERATORS LISTED AND THEY'RE ONLY THOSE OPERATORS THAT ARE IN 18 ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. AND, SO, AS THE DISCUSSIONS 19 EVOLVE, THE BILL WILL NEED TO BE -- AND ANYBODY CHOOSES TO OPT 20 21 IN THE BILL WOULD THEN NEED TO BE UPDATED TO REFLECT --22 PAT BURT: EXACTLY. AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY 23 UNDERSTOOD THAT IN ORDER FOR SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND PERHAPS 24

SAN MATEO COUNTY, THE CURRENT WORDING OF THE BILL WOULDN'T



WORK. BUT HOPEFULLY WE CAN COME UP WITH WORDING THAT WOULD. 1 2 OKAY. THANKS. 3 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 4 5 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. ALONG THOSE LINES HERE, THAT SAME 6 SLIDE. A PORTION TO AVERT TO MAJOR SERVICE CUTS ON BART. SO, 7 8 GIVEN THE BENEFIT BASED, WOULD THAT NUMBER OR PERCENTAGE BE LOCKED IN? IN OTHER WORDS, IF SAN MATEO COUNTY, I THINK THE 9 10 SERVICE, SAY, IS 10%. SO, JUST 10% WOULD COME OUT OF SAN MATEO COUNTY, AND THE REMAINDER OF WHATEVER SALES TAX WE HAVE 11 RETURNS TO SOURCE? OR IS THAT A VARIABLE NUMBER THAT THERE 12 WILL BE NO CONTROL OVER? 13 14 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: THAT'S REALLY SOMETHING THAT THE COUNTY 15 16 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES AND OPERATORS, I THINK THAT'S GOING 17 TO BE A KEY ITEM THAT THEY NEGOTIATE. I WOULD SAY THAT, SORT OF, A COUPLE OF THINGS HERE AND SOME OF THE LESSONS LEARNED 18 FROM OTHERS AROUND THE -- OTHERS AROUND THE STATE THAT HAVE 19 REALLY WORKED ON CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE, SOME OF THE GUIDANCE 20 21 HAS BEEN THAT THAT THERE IS BENEFIT TO BE PRESCRIPTIVE IN THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IN THE LEGISLATION. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, IT 22 WOULD BE, PERHAPS, A BENEFIT TO GET SPECIFIC ON EITHER A 23 PERCENTAGE OR A DOLLAR AMOUNT THAT WOULD GO TO EACH OPERATOR. 24

OUR UNDERSTANDING, SORT OF, WHAT'S ONGOING RIGHT NOW IS THE



- 1 CALTRAIN JPA NEGOTIATIONS ARE THAT ARE ONGOING WOULD HELP
- 2 IDENTIFY WHAT EVERYBODY'S SHARE CAN GOING TO BE FOR CALTRAIN.
- 3 AND THAT THESE -- SO, ONE OF THE BIG QUESTIONS IN THIS
- 4 EXPENDITURE PLAN IS WHAT'S FAIR SHARE FOR B.A.R.T. AND I
- 5 ANTICIPATE THAT A MEASURE -- THERE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS THAT THE
- 6 LEGISLATIVE LANGUAGE COULD BE WRITTEN BUT THAT IT WOULD BE
- 7 REASONABLE IF A MEASURE MIGHT SAY, YOU KNOW, OF X THERE -- OF
- 8 X MONEY THAT'S COMING IN, X AMOUNT GOES TO SAN MATEO GOES TO X
- 9 OPERATOR, X AMOUNT FROM SANTA CLARA GOES TO X OPERATOR, X
- 10 AMOUNT FROM ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA THEN YOU COULD BE
- 11 PRESCRIPTIVE AS YOU WANT COULD ALSO LIMIT DISCRETION AT THE
- 12 COMMISSION LEVEL LIMIT AT THE DISCRETION.
- 14 GINA PAPAN: EXACTLY WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT WE WOULD FEEL MUCH
- 15 MORE COMFORTABLE IF IT WAS LOCKED IN, YOU KNOW, THERE IS
- 16 RETURN TO SOURCE HERE I THINK I'M NOT SURE ABOUT THE OTHER
- 17 COUNTIES HERE BUT THE COUNTIES THAT ARE PARTICIPATING, SHOULD
- 18 BE THE ONES DECIDING I DON'T THINK OTHER COUNTIES SHOULD BE
- 19 DECIDING WHAT HAPPENS TO OUR TAXPAYER MONEY. SO THAT'S A
- 20 LITTLE UNCOMFORTABLE, DON'T THINK I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES
- 21 HERE, BUT RESPECT TO THE OTHER COUNTIES, WE NEED TO BE MAKING
- 22 THE DECISION IF WE'RE IN. SO, THAT IS TO THE -- AND THEN THE
- 23 TRANSFORM ACTION PLAN HERE, I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER ABE-
- 24 KOGA, THAT THE REST OF US NEED TO BE BRIEFED ON THIS, AND IT
- 25 IS VERY DISAPPOINTING TO THINK THAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE TEN



1	YEARS	AND	ANOTHER	\$50	$MTT_{i}T_{i}TON$	FOR	MAPPING	AND	WAYFINDING.	AND

- 2 I'M NOT SURE THE PUBLIC -- I MEAN, HOW DO WE JUSTIFY THAT TO
- 3 THE PUBLIC HERE? THEY WANT TO SEE TRANSFORMATION NOW. AND THIS
- 4 JUST SEEMS TO DRAG THINGS OUT MORE AND MORE HERE. THE
- 5 OPERATORS SHOULD BE MORE CONCERNED WITH WHAT HAPPENS RIGHT
- 6 NOW. I DO KNOW BART IS TRYING. ALTHOUGH THEY STILL NEED TO
- 7 PAINT THE MILLBRAE SIGN STATION. THEY DID ON ONE SIDE, BUT NOT
- 8 THE OTHER. AND IT'S THINGS LIKE THAT, YOU'RE ASKING FOR A
- 9 COMMITMENT -- A TEN-YEAR-PERIOD HERE, AND IT JUST SEEMS TO BE
- 10 DRAGGING OUT, WHEN WE KNOW THE CONSUMER WANTS TRANSFORMATION
- 11 NOW. SO, IT WOULD BE BETTER IF WE SAW SOMETHING LIKE THIS WITH
- 12 DEADLINES. WHEN COULD THE MAPPING IN EACH OF OUR COUNTIES AND
- 13 WAYFINDING BE COMPLETED? BECAUSE ALWAYS -- I WAS ON THE BLUE
- 14 RIBBON FIVE YEARS AGO [LAUGHTER] IT'S BEING LIKE, THERE HAS
- 15 BEEN SO LITTLE MOVEMENT HERE, THAT IF WE ARE TRYING TO
- 16 CONVINCE THE VOTERS OF SOMETHING, THEY NEED TO KNOW THAT IT'S
- 17 GOING TO HAPPEN. AND WHERE IS THE ACCOUNTABILITY TO MAKE SURE
- 18 THAT THE OPERATORS ARE PARTICIPATING HERE AND NOT -- I'M NOT
- 19 SAYING -- I DON'T KNOW WHERE THE DELAYS ARE HAPPENING HERE,
- 20 USUALLY IT'S FUNDING. BUT IF WE'RE GOING TO SELL SOMETHING TO
- 21 THE VOTERS, PUTTING IN THIS SHOULD HAPPEN HERE, THERE, AND AT
- 22 THIS TIME FRAME, WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. THANK YOU.



V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. MESSAGE RECEIVED. 1 ANY LAST COMMENTS? NOT SEEING ANY. SO WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC 2 3 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER IN-HOUSE THAT WOULD 6 LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. LAUREL PETTIS YOU HAVE TWO 7 MINUTES. 8 SPEAKER: HELLO LAUREN, FROM VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, 9 PROBABLY ALL OF YOU RECOGNIZE THIS BUT WE WANTED TO REITERATE 10 WE ARE SUPPORTING PROGRESSIVE SOURCE RAISES FUND PROBLEMS THAT 11 HAVE BEEN DISCUSSED HERE TODAY LIKE ENOUGH FUNDING FOR TRANSIT 12 TRANSFORMATION OR SMALL OPERATORS FOR DEFICITS WE SAW IN THE 13 EARLIER ITEM AND BE SUPPORTED BY VOTERS WE ALSO SUPPORT 14 15 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION THAT WAS DISCUSSED TODAY 16 WOULD HOPE THERE IS OUTREACH TO THE PUBLIC TO GET FEEDBACK BETWEEN NOW AND THE NEXT MONTH MEETING SO YOU CAN BE ABLE TO 17 SHARE THAT BACK TO THE COMMISSION BEFORE ANY DISCUSSION IS 18 MADE, I JUST WANTED TO FLAG I SUBMITTED A LETTER FROM 13 19 TRANSIT AND CLIMATE ORGS THAT HOPEFULLY MADE IT INTO THE 20 PACKET REALLY ASKING FOR SOME, SORT OF, SHORT-TERM CONTINGENCY 21 PLANNING WORK RIGHT NOW TO ADDRESS THE AMOUNT OF UNCERTAINTY 22 THAT WE'RE SEEING IN THE FEDERAL BUDGET AND STATE BUDGET AND 23 THE ECONOMY AND THE CLIMATE, AND OUR, YOU KNOW, CALIFORNIA'S 24

CLEAN AIR POLICIES, BEING ATTACKED AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL BUT



THERE IS A LOT OF UNCERTAINTY RIGHT NOW AND WE NEED SOME 1 SHORT-TERM CONTINGENCY PLANNING TO IDENTIFY THE TRADE-OFFS 2 3 AVAILABLE FOR FUNDING THAT MTC MAKES DECISIONS ABOUT. THANK YOU. 1K37 WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS IN ZOOM THAT WOULD LIKE TO 4 5 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. FIRST UP IS GOING TO VINAY PIMPLE FOLLOWED 6 BY HOWARD WONG. VINAY WHEN YOU HAVE 15 SECTIONS LEFT, I'LL SAY 7 15. 8 VINAY PIMPLE: THANK YOU. I'M VINAY FROM -- I SERVE ON THE 9 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. WE HAD OUR MEETING YESTERDAY AND 10 QUITE A FEW PEOPLE WERE QUITE ANXIOUS AND PANICKY ABOUT THE 11 LANGUAGE FOR THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ALLOCATION, BECAUSE IT 12 SAID UP TO 10%, WHICH COULD MEAN 0%. I HAVE BEEN ON -- I HAVE 13 HEARD OF MANY OF THESE MEETINGS, AND I HAVE NEVER SEEN A BACK 14 TRACKING OF THE COMMITMENT OF THE 10% ON PART OF STAFF OR ON 15 16 PART OF THE COMMISSION, BUT I THINK IT WOULD JUST RELIEVE A LOT OF FOLKS'S ANXIETY IF THE CHAIR, THE VICE CHAIR ACTUALLY 17 JUST GAVE REASSURANCE THAT YOU ARE GOING TO HARDEN THAT 18 COMMITMENT TO THE TEP% NUMBER AND HOPEFULLY THAT 10% NUMBER 19 WILL ACTUALLY BE REFLECTED AS A 10% IN THE BILL AND UP NOT UP 20 21 TO 10%. 22 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: OKAY NEXT UP IS HOWARD WONG. GO AHEAD

25

24

AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.



- 1 HOWARD WONG: HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY
- 2 COUNCIL. I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT IN ALL OF OUR
- 3 COMMUNICATIONS, WHAT'S WITHIN THE BILL, AND THE DISCUSSIONS
- 4 ABOUT THE BILL, AND THE PUBLIC MEETINGS THAT WE EMPHASIZE A
- 5 NO-COST TYPE OF COMMUNICATION THAT IS BEYOND THE WAYFINDING
- 6 PROGRAM, BEYOND BAY PASS, BEYOND THE CLIPPER CARD CHANGES,
- 7 BEYOND CREDIT CARD, ACCESS TO FARES, BEYOND TRANSIT
- 8 TRANSFORMATION PLANS THAT WE COMMUNICATE TO THE PUBLIC THAT
- 9 THE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE COMMUNICATING AND COORDINATING,
- 10 AND THAT WE ARE INCLUDING THE 141 TRANSIT ORIENTED PROVIDERS
- 11 THAT THERE IS A REGIONAL -- NEW REGIONAL OUTLOOK DEMONSTRATING
- 12 A NEW POTENTIAL FUTURE, SHOWING THE PUBLIC THAT BEST PRACTICES
- 13 AROUND THE WORLD ARE POSSIBLE AND WE NEED TO SHOW THOSE BEST
- 14 CASE STUDIES FROM OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES. IF THERE IS A VISION
- 15 OF WHAT'S POSSIBLE THAT WE'RE COMMUNICATING THAT UNIFIED
- 16 APPROACH EVEN OF ALL THE COUNTIES THAT ARE NOT AT THE REGIONAL
- 17 MEASURE THAT WE HAVE A NEW COORDINATED MINDSET TO ADDRESS A
- 18 COMMON TRANSIT CRISIS AND VISIONARY APPROACH. THANK YOU.

19

- 20 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 21 IN ZOOM WISHING TO TALK ON THIS ITEM.

- 23 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. THANK
- 24 YOU, AGAIN, TO OUR STAFF AND TO ALL OF THE COMMISSIONERS FOR
- 25 YOUR INPUT.



1 2 NATHAN MILEY: CHAIR? 3 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES, SORRY. YES, PLEASE. 4 5 NATHAN MILEY: THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO -- MARGARET RAID A 6 REPORT, THE COMMITTEE THAT MEETS ON FRIDAY, BECAUSE I'M NOT ON 7 8 IT EITHER, IS IT THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE? WHAT'S THE NAME OF THE COMMITTEE? NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. SO CAN WE 9 HAVE A REPORT TO ALL OF US? BECAUSE I AM VERY INTERESTED IN 10 THAT PIECE. AND I'M KIND OF LIKE MARGARET ON THAT TOO. 11 12 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YEAH, THANK YOU FOR THE FOLLOW UP. REBECCA, 13 HOW DO YOU SEE US FOLLOWING UP? 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: WE'RE HAPPY TO BRING THAT BACK TO THE FULL COMMISSION IN JUNE. WE WERE THINKING SINCE WE WANT TO HAVE AN 17 ACTION ITEM FOR THE COMMISSION TO APPROVE DIRECTION ON THE 18 EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PIECE, WE 19 COULD PRECEDE THAT WITH THE PRESENTATION FROM OUR DIRECTOR, 20 21 MELANIE CHOY ON ALL THE WORK THAT IS HAPPENING RELATED TO 22 THIS. 23 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. SOUND GOOD? ALL 24

RIGHT. THAT'S WHERE WE'RE GOING THEN WE'LL BE BACK IN JUNE ON



- 1 THIS ONE. I'M GOING TO TRY TO MOVE US QUICKLY THROUGH THE REST
- 2 OF THE AGENDA. BUT FOR SOME FUN, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO THE
- 3 BIKE CHAMPIONS OF THE YEAR, AND AS A LIFE-LONG CYCLIST AND A
- 4 FREQUENT PARTICIPATION IN BIKE TO WHEREVER DAY, IT GIVES ME
- 5 GREAT PLEASURE TO DO THESE AWARDS. NOW, IS THERE A STAFF
- 6 PRESENTATION ON THIS? OR AM I TO READ THE -- SORRY. WE'RE JUST
- 7 PINCH HITTING HERE. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. I WILL DO THAT SO, AS
- 8 PART OF THE REGION'S ONGOING CELEBRATION OF BIKE MONTH AND THE
- 9 PRESENTING OF SPONSOR OF BIKE TO WHEREVER DAYS, THE COMMISSION
- 10 WOULD LIKE TO RECOGNIZE THIS YEAR'S BIKE CHAMPION OF THE YEAR
- 11 WINNERS, MTC HAS SPONSORED BIKE TO WORK DAY, NOW CALLED BIKE
- 12 TO WHEREVER DAY FOR OVER TWO DECADE WITH THE GOAL OF
- 13 ENCOURAGING BAY AREA RESIDENTS TO TRY BIKING AS A DAY-TO-DAY
- 14 MODE OF TRANSPORTATION. EACH YEAR ONE OR SOMETIMES A FEW
- 15 ENTHUSIASTIC CYCLISTS ARE CELEBRATED BY THE COUNTY AND
- 16 SELECTED AND RECOGNIZED BY THAT COUNTY AS THEIR -- AS EACH
- 17 COUNTY'S BIKE CHAMPION OF THE YEAR. SO, WE WILL START WITH,
- 18 FIRST BY CHAMPION, RICK RICARD FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY. MR. RICARD
- 19 WHO HAS BEEN A FORCE IN EAST BAY BIKE ADVOCACY FOR OVER 50
- 20 YEARS. IS RICK HERE WITH US TODAY? JUST WAVE AT US. FROM
- 21 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, WE HAVE THERESA DUTTAR WHO COMMUTES, WOW,
- 22 NEARLY 70 MILES A DAY BY BIKE AND BART. ALL RIGHT, THERESA.
- 23 CHUCK FORD FROM MARIN COUNTY IS A LIFE-LONG BIKE COMMUTER AND
- 24 OUTDOOR EDUCATOR WHO HAS INSPIRED GENERATIONS OF CYCLISTS AND
- 25 ENCOURAGED COUNTLESS STUDENTS TO RIDE. WAY TO GO CHUCK. THIS



- 1 YEAR, NAPA COUNTY RECOGNIZED THREE CHAMPIONS TO HUSLEY HAS
- 2 BEEN RIDING AND ADVOCATES FOR CYCLING FOR OVER 60 YEARS AND
- 3 HELPED LAUNCH THE VINE TRAIL AMBASSADOR PROGRAM. AND THE OTHER
- 4 WINNERS FROM NAPA COUNTY ARE ERIC HEIGHTS AND LOUISE OWENS WHO
- 5 TOGETHER MAKE UP THE CALISTOGA RIDING FOR FOCUS TEAM. THEY ARE
- 6 TEACHERS WHO BROUGHT THE LIFE CHANGING CALISTOGA RIDING FOR
- 7 FOCUS PROGRAM TO CALISTOGA STUDENTS. FROM SAN FRANCISCO WE
- 8 HAVE YOUNGEST CHAMPION TONY GUAN, HE IS ONLY IN 8TH GRADE BUT
- 9 A LEADER WHO TEACHES YOUNG I STUDENTS AT MLK JR. MIDDLE
- 10 SCHOOL, HAD A RIDE REPAIR AND EXPLORE CITY BY BIKE IN SAN
- 11 MATEO WE HAVE ADINA LEVIN MTC'S OWN POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
- 12 MEMBER WHO WAS RECOGNIZED FOR ADVOCACY FOR TRANSIT AND CYCLE
- 13 FIGURE MENLO PARK AND BEYOND AND LANG FROM SANTA CLARA COUNTY
- 14 UNDER BIKE CLUB AT SARATOGA HIGH SCHOOL, THE SCHOOL'S LARGEST
- 15 CLUB LAMONT JONES FROM SOLANO COUNTY CYCLES AND HIS SON HE
- 16 RIDES DAILY AND SHARES JOURNEY TO INSPIRE OTHERS PROMOTING
- 17 HEART HEALTH AND COMMUNITY MATT FOUNDED NORCAL HIGH SCHOOL
- 18 CYCLING LEAGUE BUILDING CULTURE OF CONFIDENCE HEALTH AND
- 19 VENDOR THAT CONTINUES TO GROW AMONG SONOMA COUNTY YOUTH WE
- 20 HAVE BILL PINK HAM WHO WAS HONORED SEAMLESSLY IN CONTRA COSTA
- 21 COUNTY REMEMBERED AS AN ADVOCACY FOR SAFE SUSTAINABLE
- 22 TRANSPORTATION ENRICHMENT BILL SERVED ON MULTIPLE COMMITTEES
- 23 AND ALWAYS BROUGHT WARM SPIRIT TO EVERY OF THE HE IS DEEPLY
- 24 MISSED. PLEASE JOIN ME IN A ROUND EVER APPLAUSE TO
- 25 CONGRATULATE ALL THESE. [APPLAUSE] I INVITE THE WINNERS WHO



ARE HERE TODAY TO JOIN US IN FRONT OF THE DAIS TO RECEIVE YOUR 1 PLAQUE AND BE RECOGNIZED. OKAY. GREAT. CONGRATULATIONS 2 3 EVERYONE. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RICK RICARD, CAN YOU TURN YOUR CAMERA ON? 6 7 8 SPEAKER: YES. HERE I AM. 9 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: SOME OF US ARE GOING TO 10 11 GET BLOCKED OUT. WE'RE GOING TO STAND UP. WANT TO TAKE A STRETCH BREAK. OKAY. SQUEEZE ON IN. ALL RIGHT. [OFF-MIC 12 INDISCERNIBLE] 13 14 SPEAKER: -- SMART BY. I KNOW HIM, PERSONALLY -- [OFF-MIC 15 16 INDISCERNIBLE] WORKING --17 SPEAKER: CAN'T HEAR WHAT HE'S SAYING. [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE] 18 19 SPEAKER: --20 21 22 SPEAKER: SOMEBODY IS SPEAKING, BUT I CAN'T TELL WHAT HE'S 23 SAYING. 24 **SPEAKER:** -- [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE] 25



1 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANK 2 YOU. APPRECIATE IT. OKAY. I THINK WE HAVE SOME ADDITIONAL 3 PICTURES WITH COMMISSIONERS WITH AWARD ROOM RECIPIENTS 4 5 HAPPENING. OKAY. WELL, THIS IS HAPPENING. ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? LOOKING 6 AT -- NO, PAT? ALICIA? OKAY. I THINK WE'RE GOOD. SO, WE'LL 7 8 WAIT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND THE PHOTOS. 9 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 10 11 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM OR THE REMOTE LOCATIONS WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. 12 13 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 14 GREAT. ALL RIGHT. WE'LL MOVE NOW TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE 15 16 THIS IS OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. WITH OUR CHAIR CARINA LIEU IS SHE HERE WITH US TODAY? 17 18 19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: SHE'S JOINING ON ZOOM. SHE'S GOING TO BE UNMUTING HERSELF SOON. 20 21 22 CARINA LIEU: GOOD MORNING. CAN YOU HEAR ME. 23

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YEP. WE CAN HEAR YOU. GOOD MORNING.

24



- 1 CARINA LIEU: THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING ME TO PRESENT THIS REPORT
- 2 VIA ZOOM. I WILL BE SUMMARIZING THE ACTIVITY OF THE POLICY
- 3 ADVISORY COUNCIL. OVER THE PREVIOUS MONTH WE MET ON APRIL 2ND,
- 4 2025 COVERING THREE ITEMS INCLUDING TWO LEGISLATIVE BILLS AND
- 5 RECEIVED AN UPDATE ON THE SUCCESSOR ADVISORY BODY TO THE
- 6 COUNCIL THAT IS BEING LAUNCHED THIS YEAR. WELL, NEXT YEAR, BUT
- 7 RECRUITMENT IS HAPPENING THIS YEAR. FIRST UP, I WANT TO
- 8 MENTION THAT THERE IS A NEW APPOINTEE TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
- 9 SUBCOMMITTEE THAT IS JAIME VALORIA WHO REPRESENTS SAN
- 10 FRANCISCO. AND TEN UPDATE ON OUR DISCUSSION ON SB63, THE
- 11 COUNCIL'S DISCUSSION FOCUSED LARGELY ON THE FAIRNESS OF
- 12 FUNDING CONTRIBUTIONS PARTICULARLY FOR MULTI-COUNTY TRANSIT
- 13 SYSTEMS. STAFF DID NOTE THAT THERE IS AN INDEPENDENT THIRD-
- 14 PARTY REVIEW BY MGO, AND THAT REPORT IS EXPECTED -- WAS
- 15 EXPECTED FOR THIS MONTH TO VALIDATE TRANSIT OPERATOR DEFICITS
- 16 AND HELP GUIDE EQUITABLE COST SHARING AMONG COUNTIES, WHICH IS
- 17 A CRITICAL STEP TO ENSURING ACCOUNTABILITY AND PUBLIC
- 18 CONFIDENCE. COUNCIL MEMBERS EMPHASIZED THE IMPORTANCE OF
- 19 TAILORED MESSAGING, CLARITY ON SYSTEM WIDE BENEFITS, AND A
- 20 STRONG EQUITY NARRATIVE TO BUILD PUBLIC SUPPORT. AND IN
- 21 RESPONSE TO THIS STAFF DID ITERATE THAT MTC CANNOT LEAD A
- 22 CAMPAIGN TO PASS THE MEASURE BUT WILL CONTINUE TO SHARE
- 23 FACTUAL INFORMATION AND PROMOTE THE VALUE OF REGIONAL TRANSIT
- 24 INVESTMENTS. AND THEN NEXT THERE WAS A STATUTES UPDATE ON
- 25 SB239, WHICH WOULD EXPAND REMOTE PARTICIPATION OPTIONS FOR



- 1 BROWN ACT ADVISORY BODIES WITHOUT FINANCIAL DECISION-MAKING
- 2 AUTHORITY. IT WOULD ALLOW THOSE OF US WHO CANNOT ATTEND, TO BE
- 3 ABLE TO REMOTE IN. AND COUNCIL MEMBERS EXPRESSED STRONG
- 4 SUPPORT EMPHASIZING THAT REMOTE ACCESS IMPROVES ACCESSIBILITY,
- 5 EQUITY, AND PARTICIPATION, ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE FACING TRAVEL,
- 6 CARE GIVING, OR FINANCIAL BARRIERS. VICE CHAIR ORANTES AND
- 7 MEMBER BALDINI TESTIFIED IN SACRAMENTO IN SUPPORT OF BILL AND
- 8 SHARED POSITIVE REFLECTIONS. AND MEMBERS WERE ENCOURAGED TO
- 9 SUBMIT LETTERS OR E-MAILS AHEAD OF THE SENATE JUDICIARY
- 10 COMMITTEE HEARING ON MAY 6TH. LASTLY WE DISCUSSED AN UPDATE ON
- 11 THE NEW MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL SCHEDULED TO
- 12 LAUNCH IN 2026, THE NEW BODY AIMS TO STREAMLINE GOVERNANCE
- 13 WHILE MAINTAINING A STRONG COMMUNITY VOICE THOUGH ELIGIBILITY
- 14 WILL BE LIMITED TO NON-ELECTED RESIDENTS WITH SOME EXCEPTIONS
- 15 SUCH AS COLLEGE BOARD MEMBERS. STRUCTURE INTRODUCES DESIGNATED
- 16 STAKEHOLDER ROLES REPRESENTING YOUTH TRANSIT ADVOCATES LABOR
- 17 BUSINESS ENVIRONMENT CIVIC ORGANIZATIONS AND AFFORDABLE
- 18 HOUSING COUNCIL MEMBERS EXPRESSED MIXED REACTIONS WHILE
- 19 SUPPORT OF EQUITY GOALS INCLUDING MEMBER ELDRED, GUPTA, RHODES
- 20 RAISE CONCERNS ABOUT THE EXPANDED SCOPE FOR POLICY ENGAGEMENT
- 21 -- DEEPER ENGAGEMENT WOULD REQUIRE MORE PREPARATION OR TIME
- 22 COMMITMENT FROM MEMBERS. MEMBER HANKERSON ADVOCATED FOR
- 23 VETERANS TO BE RECOGNIZED AS AN UNDERREPRESENTED GROUP AND
- 24 SEVERAL COUNCIL MEMBERS ENCOURAGED ROBUST OUTREACH TO YOUTH,
- 25 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES



7

13

17

MAY 28, 2025

- 1 EMPHASIZING THE NEED FOR SUPPORT STRUCTURES SUCH AS MENTORING
- 2 AND NON-PROFIT PARTNERSHIPS TO ENSURE THEIR MEANINGFUL
- 3 PARTICIPATION. SUGGESTIONS TO SUPPORT FUNCTIONALITY INCLUDED
- 4 TRAINING, AND FORMING SUBCOMMITTEES OR AD-HOC GROUPS TO MANAGE
- 5 THE WORKLOAD. CURRENT PAC MEMBERS WERE ENCOURAGED TO APPLY.
- 6 AND THAT IS THE END OF MY REPORT.

8 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR

- 9 YOUR REPORT, CARINA. ARE THERE ANY BOARD COMMENTS OR OUESTIONS
- 10 ON THAT REPORT? OKAY. I'M NOT SEEING ANYBODY. THANK YOU,
- 11 AGAIN, CARINA, ALWAYS A GOOD REPORTED. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
- 12 COMMENT ON THIS?
- 14 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
- 15 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
- 16 ZOOM OR AT THE REMOTE LOCATION WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.
- 18 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. VERY GOOD. SO WE'LL
- 19 NOW MOVE TO ITEM SIX, THIS IS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.
- 20 YOU HAVE THAT, AND ANDY IS NOT WITH US, BUT HE IS HAPPY TO
- 21 TAKE INDIVIDUAL QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ONLINE OR BY PHONE. SO,
- 22 BUT I WILL TAKE PUBLIC -- COMMISSIONER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS,
- 23 ANYTHING ON THIS? OKAY. NOT TO THE LEFT. NOT TO THE RIGHT.
- 24 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT



CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 1 2 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM, 3 ZOOM, OR AT THE REMOTE LOCATION WITH --4 5 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SEVEN ANY GENERAL COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? NO. AND 6 NO. OKAY. WE WILL MOVE ON. THIS IS A CONSENT CALENDAR NEXT 7 8 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER EIGHT INCLUDING ITEMS 8A THROUGH K. MAY I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE CONSENT? 9 10 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: MOVE APPROVAL, JOHN-BAPTISTE. 11 12 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU. 13 14 15 GINA PAPAN: SECOND, PAPAN. 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY ANY COMMISSIONER 17 COMMENT ON CONSENT? I'M NOT SEEING ANY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC 18 COMMENT WRITTEN OR? 19 20 21 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] 22 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 23

RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM,

ZOOM, OR AT THE REMOTE LOCATION WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

24



1	
2	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY MOTION BY JOHN-
3	BAPTISTE SECOND PAPAN. WOULD THE CLERK NOW CONDUCT A ROLL CALL
4	VOTE?
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WILL DO, CHAIR NOACK? IS ABSENT. THE
7	REMOTE LOCATION IS STILL OPEN. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
8	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES. COMMISSION ARE ABE-
10	KOGA?
11	
12	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER AHN?
15	
16	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER ANDERSON IS ABSENT.
19	COMMISSIONER BURT?
20	
21	PAT BURT: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
24	
25	DAVID CANEPA: YES.



1	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT? STEPPED AWAY
3	FOR THE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
4	
5	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?
8	
9	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? STEPPED AWAY FOR THE
12	MOMENT. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?
13	
14	AMBER MANFREE: AYE.
15	
16	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MASHBURN STEPPED AWAY FOR
17	THE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER MELGAR?
18	
19	MYRNA MELGAR: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MILEY?
22	
23	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
24	
25	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PAPAN?



1 2 GINA PAPAN: YES. 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RAMOS? 4 5 6 BELIA RAMOS: YES. 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS ABSENT. EZZY 9 ASHCRAFT HOW WOULD YOU LIKE TO VOTE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? 10 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: YES. 11 12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 13 14 PRESENT. 15 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, COMMISSIONERS. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER NINE. THIS 17 IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE REPORT. 18 COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE, WOULD YOU GIVE THE REPORT, PLEASE? 19 20 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: WE'RE ON ITEM NINE? EXCELLENT. 21 22 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES. 23



1	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: I WOULD BE HAPPY TO GIVE A REPORT. SO,
2	THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE MET ON MAY 9TH, 2025
3	AND REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THAT IS
4	AGENDA ITEM 9A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4714, CLIPPER START
5	PILOT UPDATE, WHICH PROVIDES AN UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER START
6	PILOT AND A REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER
7	4714, WHICH WOULD TRANSITION THE PILOT TO AN ANNE GOING FARE
8	PROGRAM. AND I WILL MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER
9	4714.
10	
11	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: I'M GOING TO CALL FOR
12	PUTTING MY MIC ON. AND THEN DO I HAVE A SECOND TO ADOPT MTC
13	RESOLUTION NUMBER 4714?
14	
15	SPEAKER: I WILL SECOND.
16	
17	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. SO JOHN-BAPTISTE HAS
18	PUT FORWARD THE MOTION. AND EZZY ASHCRAFT HAS SECONDED. ANY
19	COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? LOOKING TO MY
20	LEFT.
21	
22	GINA PAPAN: QUESTION?
23	

V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES, PAPAN?

24



GINA PAPAN: IN A NUTSHELL HOW ARE WE DOING ON THIS PROGRAM? 1 [LAUGHTER] IT'S BEEN A WHILE AND WE HAVE HEARD DIFFERENT 2 3 THINGS ABOUT IT. ARE WE PROGRESSING? AT WHAT KIND OF PACE? 4 5 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OH BOY. 6 7 GINA PAPAN: IN A NUTSHELL. 8 9 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: REALLY? 10 GINA PAPAN: ON WEDNESDAY WE DON'T GET AN UPDATE ON THIS ONE. 11 AGAIN. 12 13 LISA KLEIN: GOOD MORNING I'M LISA KLEIN, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE 14 15 DIRECTOR FOR MOBILITY. IN A NUTSHELL, WE'RE DOING WELL ON THIS 16 PROGRAM. WE HAVE SEEN AN UPTICK ON USAGE AND ENROLLMENT OVER THE PAST SEVERAL MONTHS. 17 18 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. VERY GOOD. 19 20 GINA PAPAN: OKAY. THANK YOU. 21 22

V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: WE MIGHT SEE IF WE CAN GET

YOU AN UPDATE, EVEN ON THE WEDNESDAY COMMITTEES, JUST GIVEN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content.

Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

23

24

25

THIS IS A HOT TOPIC.



1 2 GINA PAPAN: THAT WOULD BE NICE. 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I HAD A OUESTION, I BROUGHT IT UP EARLIER 4 5 ABOUT THE MEANS BASED PILOT PROGRAM. AND DOES THIS BUDGET REFLECT SOME ALLOCATION TO THAT PILOT? 6 7 8 LISA KLEIN: YEAH. I MEAN THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. I THINK THAT'S REALLY, IN TERMS OF WHAT WERE THE NEXT STEPS IN SORT OF 9 10 THE STEPS TO EXPAND ENROLLMENT, THERE IS STILL WORK TO BE DONE IN DEFINING THAT WORK AND HOW THAT WORKS. AND IN PARTICULAR, I 11 KNOW, COMMISSIONER, YOU HAVE BEEN VERY INTERESTED IN THE CROSS 12 QUALIFICATION AND WE HAVE HAD QUITE A FEW DISCUSSIONS WITH YOU 13 AND YOUR TEAM ABOUT THAT. YOU KNOW, THE SHORT ANSWER IS THAT 14 WE REALLY DO HAVE MORE WORK TO DO TO UNDERSTAND WHAT IT TAKES 15 16 TECHNICALLY, IN PARTICULAR, TO MAKE A MORE KIND OF AUTOMATED 17 CROSS-QUALIFICATION. AND UNTIL WE REALLY DEFINE THE SCOPE OF THAT WORK, WE -- IT'S HARD TO INCLUDE IT IN THE BUDGET. SO, IF 18 IT'S A VERY -- IF IT'S, SORT OF, A MINIMAL LEVEL OF TECHNICAL 19 WORK, THEN THE BUDGET ACCOMMODATES IT, AND IF IT'S A MORE 20 SIGNIFICANT LEVEL OF WORK, THEN IT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO 21 SCOPE OUT AND BRING BACK TO INCLUDE IN THE BUDGET. 22 23 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: YEAH, SO, I KNOW -- AND I APPRECIATE THE 24 25 CONVERSATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN HAD. MY UNDERSTANDING -- AND



- 1 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THIS, THE OTHER COUNTY PROGRAMS ACROSS
- 2 APPLYING -- AND, SO, OUR STAFF INVOLVED AT THE COUNTY HAS SAID
- 3 THAT IT IS ACTUALLY QUITE DOABLE, AND I THINK THEY ARE PRETTY
- 4 READY TO GO. THAT'S MY CONCERN IS I DON'T WANT IT TO BE
- 5 DELAYED BECAUSE OF A LACK OF FUNDING ALLOCATION. SO, I --

6

- 7 LISA KLEIN: WE WON'T HAVE THE BUDGET STAND IN THE WAY BUT WE
- 8 NEED TO UNDERSTAND, IN PARTICULAR, THE BIGGEST PUZZLE REALLY
- 9 IS HOW YOU HANDLE THE PERSONAL IDENTIFIABLE INFORMATION AND
- 10 THE TALKING BETWEEN STATE AND REGIONAL AND COUNTY SYSTEMS AND
- 11 TRANSFERRING THAT INFORMATION. AND THAT'S WHAT REQUIRES MORE
- 12 SCOPE. BUT WE WON'T LET THE BUDGET, ITSELF, PROCESS STAND IN
- 13 THE WAY OF IMPLEMENTING SOMETHING ONCE WE UNDERSTAND WHAT IT
- 14 TAKES TO IMPLEMENT.

15

- 16 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. I'M HEARING, FRANKLY, THE OPPOSITE.
- 17 SO, YEAH, AS LONG AS WE CAN KEEP MOVING THIS.

18

19 LISA KLEIN: YEAH. HAPPY TO CONTINUE DISCUSSIONS.

20

21 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU.

- 23 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. GOOD COMMENT. I'M
- 24 NOT SEEING ANY FURTHER COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. OH SHOOT. WHERE



ARE WE? OKAY. DID WE VOTE? TIME TO VOTE? OKAY. [LAUGHTER] WE 1 2 HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE? 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PUBLIC COMMENT. 4 5 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OH DEAR. PUBLIC COMMENT. 6 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT 9 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM IN ZOOM. ALETA DUPREE, GO 10 AHEAD APPROXIMATE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. 11 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS AND MEMBERS. 12 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I 13 NEED MY CLOCK HERE. THANK YOU. I SUPPORT THIS. I HAVE BEEN 14 15 TALKING ABOUT THE CLIPPER START, ET CETERA, FOR A LONG TIME, 16 AND THIS MOTION TO GO TO PERMANENT PROGRAM IS CERTAINLY IMMINENT THIS IS A PROGRAM THAT'S WORKING AND IS SUSTAINABLE. 17 THAT BEING SAID, ALSO, WHAT CLIPPER START CAN OFFER US, 18 BESIDES HELPING A LOT OF PEOPLE TO QUALIFY FOR REDUCED FARE 19 BASED ON INCOME IS THAT IT CREATES AWARENESS IN THAT IN THE 20 21 COMMUNITIES SEEING THIS CAN ALSO LEAD PEOPLE WHO CAN QUALIFY FOR THE REGULAR REDUCED FARE DISCOUNTS, WHAT WE KNOW IS RTC, 22 WHICH WILL EVENTUALLY BE RENAMED CLIPPER ACCESS, IF THEY TOO 23 WILL ALSO BE ABLE TO JOIN IN THESE DISCOUNT PROGRAMS. SO 24

CLIPPER START IS NOT JUST A DOOR TO CLIPPER START BUT TO OTHER



1	PROGRAMS. THERE SHOULD NEVER BE A WRONG DOOR IF SOMEBODY
2	QUALIFIES FOR RTC, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY GET INTO RTC. SC
3	I SUPPORT THIS FOR MULTIPLE REASONS, OFTEN NOT HEARD. I LOOK
4	FORWARD TO THIS GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. AND THERE ARE NO OTHER
7	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM IN ZOOM.
8	
9	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. NOW I'M GOING TO
10	CALL FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE.
11	
12	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR NOACK IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR
13	MOULTON-PETERS?
14	
15	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES. COMMISSIONER ABE-
16	KOGA?
17	
18	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
19	
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER AHN?
21	
22	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
23	

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN IS ABSENT.

24

25

COMMISSIONER BURT?



1	
2	PAT BURT: YES.
3	
4	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
5	
6	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
7	
8	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?
9	
10	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: YES.
11	
12	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
13	
14	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
15	
16	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?
17	
18	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.
19	
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? COMMISSIONER MAHAN
	IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?
22	
23	AMBER MANFREE: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MASHBURN?





MITCH MASHBURN: AYE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MELGAR? MYRNA MELGAR: AYE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MILEY? NATHAN MILEY: AYE. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PAPAN? GINA PAPAN: YES. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RAMOS? BELIA RAMOS: YES. CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE BEFORE I MOVE ON NOW TO OUR NEXT ITEM, THROUGH OUR

PROGRAMMING, I'M GOING TO ASK STAFF GIVEN WHERE WEER TIME AND



- 1 THAT MOST OF WHAT REMAINS IS BUDGET FOR THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT
- 2 COMMITTEES, BUT WOULD YOU START -- WOULD YOU THINK ABOUT HOW
- 3 WE CAN MANAGE THE REST OF THE TIME WE HAVE? WE HAVE GOT,
- 4 ESSENTIALLY, AN HOUR UNTIL 1:00, WHEN OUR MEETINGS GO. AND I'M
- 5 NOT SURE HOW WE'RE GOING TO MAKE IT, BUT YOU PROBABLY HAVE
- 6 FIGURED THAT OUT ALREADY. SO, ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO TO ITEM
- 7 NUMBER 11A. DRAFT METROPOLITAN -- NO. NO. I'M SORRY. PLANNING
- 8 -- FORGIVE ME, YEP. PLANNING -- PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS.
- 9 COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

10

- 11 VICTORIA FLEMING: YES, THANK YOU VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS. I
- 12 HAVE ASKED COMMISSIONER MELGAR TO DO THAT SO THAT I'M NOT
- 13 REMOTELY DOING THE MEETING IN A WAY THAT GETS IN THE WAY OF
- 14 THE ORGANIZATION.

15

- 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. VERY GOOD. THANK
- 17 YOU. COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

- 19 MYRNA MELGAR: THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WILL BE READING THE REPORT
- 20 AS CHAIR FLEMING ASKED ME TO. SO, THE PROGRAMMING AND
- 21 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON MAY 14TH, 2025 AND REFERRED EIGHT
- 22 ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL WHICH WERE ON THE CONSENT
- 23 CALENDAR. ONE ITEM UNDER THE PURVIEW OF THE PROGRAMMING AND
- 24 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS BEING BROUGHT DIRECTLY TO THE
- 25 COMMISSION GIVEN THE TIMING OF THE RELEASE, FINDING ON,



- 1 APPORTIONMENT AS FOLLOWS. AGENDA ITEM 10A, MTC RESOLUTION
- 2 NUMBER 4674 REVISED WHICH IS TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES
- 3 PROGRAM, FISCAL YEARS '24, '25, AND '25, '26 UPDATE OF TRANSIT
- 4 CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM INCLUDING ADJUSTMENT BASED ON
- 5 FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION FINAL APPORTIONMENTS FOR FISCAL
- 6 YEAR 20 WERE 2, 20 TWIFRP AND MINOR REPROGRAMMING UPDATES SO
- 7 DELIVER A MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 46 KNOW 74
- 8 REVISED.

9

- 10 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: VERY GOOD. ANY
- 11 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY. IS THERE
- 12 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

13

- 14 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
- 15 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM, ZOOM, OR AT
- 16 THE REMOTE LOCATION WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECONDS.

19

- 20 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: MOTION BY MELGAR SECOND BY
- 21 PAPAN. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

22

- 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: NOACK IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-
- 24 PETERS?





1	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ABE-KOGA?
4	
5	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?
8	
9	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ANDERSEN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER BURT?
12	
13	PAT BURT: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
16	
17	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?
20	
21	MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: FLEMING?
24	
25	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.



1	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
3	
4	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?
7	
8	AMBER MANFREE: YES.
9	
	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MASHBURN?
11	NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE PARTY O
12	MITCH MASHBURN: AYE.
	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MELGAR?
15	Canally Tancini Ciavan. Indicanc.
16	MYRNA MELGAR: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MILEY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
19	
20	GINA PAPAN: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RAMOS? MOTION PASSES
23	UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



- 1 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: VERY GOOD. THANK YOU
- 2 EVERYONE. ALL RIGHT. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM 11A, THE DRAFT
- 3 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026
- 4 OPERATING CAPITAL BUDGET. WELCOME, DEREK.

- 6 DEREK HANSON: THANK YOU VERY MUCH VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.
- 7 IN LIGHT OF THE LATE HOUR AND THAT WE HAVE GOT A NUMBER OF
- 8 MEETINGS TO GET THROUGH WHICH DO HAVE APPROVAL ACTIONS, I'M
- 9 NOT GOING TO PULL UP THE PRESENTATION. IT IS ATTACHED AND WE
- 10 WON'T BE PULLING UP THE PRESENTATIONS IN THE OTHER AGENCY
- 11 REPORTS. BUT I DO WANT TO SPEAK FOR A COUPLE OF MINUTES JUST
- 12 TO WHAT'S IN THE ITEM AND CERTAINLY HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
- 13 OUESTIONS. OBVIOUSLY WE SIT HERE TODAY WITH DRAFT BUDGETS FOR
- 14 ALL OF THE MTC OPERATING ENTITIES AND WILL BE BACK NEXT MONTH
- 15 WITH THE FINAL PROPOSED BUDGETS. DO WANT TO START AND JUST
- 16 THANK ARLEICKA CONLEY AND HER TEAM. SHE'S UP ON THE SCREEN
- 17 THERE. SHE HAS GOT A GREAT TEAM AND THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING
- 18 REALLY HARD. WE TALK ABOUT BUDGET SEASON; IT'S INAPPROPRIATE
- 19 TO TALK ABOUT A "BUDGET SEASON" WHEN IT ACTUALLY LASTS ABOUT
- 20 SIX AND A HALF MONTHS, IT'S BASICALLY BUDGET HALF YEAR. I WANT
- 21 TO NOTE THE KEY ASSUMPTIONS FOR THE FY '26 BUDGET DO INCLUDE
- 22 DECREASE IN IT. DA FUNDING. THE NOTE ALL OF THIS IS IN CONTEXT
- 23 WE TALKED PREVIOUSLY DURING THE BUDGET STUDY SESSIONS ABOUT
- 24 UNCERTAINTY, ABOUT CHALLENGES IN THE BUDGET. THIS ASSUMPTION
- 25 ON TDA FUNDING IS A PIECE OF IT. BECAUSE IT'S REALLY AN



- 1 IMPORTANT SOURCE OF OUR DISCRETIONARY FUNDING FOR THE AGENCY.
- 2 WE HAVE GOT A LOT OF FUNDING THAT'S PRETTY LIMITED AND TIED.
- 3 TDA, WE HAVE GOT A LITTLE MORE FLEXIBILITY WITH, AND WHEN
- 4 THAT'S -- WHEN WE'RE WORRIED ABOUT THAT GOING DOWN THERE'S A
- 5 CONCERN WHEN WE HAVE GOT ALL SORTS OF OTHER THINGS GOING UP.
- 6 INTEREST CONCERNS GOING UP ABOUT THREE AND A HALF% CONSISTENT
- 7 WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT LAST MONTH. AGAIN, WEEP HAVE DEVELOPED IT
- 8 IN THE FACE MUCH SIGNIFICANT UNCERTAINTY, INCLUDING CONCERNS
- 9 ABOUT ECONOMIC GROWTH, INFLATION, INTEREST RATES, AND OF
- 10 COURSE WHAT ACTIONS MIGHT BE TAKEN BY OUR FEDERAL FUNDING
- 11 PARTNERS. IN RESPONSE WE HAVE DISCUSSED PREVIOUSLY, AGAIN, THE
- 12 FEDERAL ACTION'S RESPONSE TIME THAT WE HAVE DEVELOPED AMONG
- 13 EXECUTIVE AND SENIOR STAFF. MOSTLY IN UNDERSTAND WHAT ACTIONS
- 14 ARE AND FRANKLY SOME THAT AREN'T BEING TAKEN AND HOW BEST TO
- 15 MANAGE THE AGENCY AND ITS VARIOUS PROGRAMS. AND WE HAVE
- 16 INSTITUTED A SCENARIO PLANNING PROCESS WHICH WE'LL BE
- 17 DISCUSSING. WANT TO NOTE WHILE FEDERAL GRANT FUNDING
- 18 REPRESENTS OVER HALF OF THE AGENCY'S BUDGET AND THAT'S A
- 19 HEADLINE THAT'S MAYBE A LITTLE SCARY, THE MAJORITY OF THIS IS
- 20 PASSED THROUGH FUNDING AND THE BALANCE MOST OF IT IS PROVIDED
- 21 TO THE AGES THROUGH A FORMULA BASED THROUGH FHWA FUNDING. THE
- 22 DECREASE IN STATE FUNDING THAT YOU WILL NOTE IS ALMOST
- 23 ENTIRELY ASSOCIATED WITH THE DECREASE IN 2.0 FUNDING WHICH IN
- 24 THE CURRENT YEAR WAS PASSED THROUGH BAHFA. AGAIN, SHARP
- 25 INCREASE IN STA FUNDING, MAJORITY OF THAT PASSED THROUGH OTHER



- 1 AGENCIES. OTHER FUNDING INCREASES ARE TIED TO TRANSFERS FROM
- 2 BATA, WHICH PAYS FOR ADMINISTRATIVE OVERHEAD, AS A PERCENTAGE
- 3 OF REVENUE. SO, FINALLY, YOU KNOW, ON THIS PIECE, GIVEN THE
- 4 SIGNIFICANT ADDITION OF STAFF COMING OUT OF THE PANDEMIC, THE
- 5 INTEREST IN SITTING WITHIN OUR REVISED ORGANIZATIONAL
- 6 STRUCTURE, AND ECONOMIC UNCERTAINTY, WE ARE PROPOSING ALMOST
- 7 NO CHANGES TO AUTHORIZE STAFFING LEVELS AND THAT'S CONSISTENT
- 8 WITH WHAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT. WE ARE PROPOSING THEE NEW
- 9 FULL-TIME POSITIONS, THOSE NEED TO BE AUTHORIZED BY MTC, AND
- 10 MTC AS THE EMPLOYER, ONE OF THOSE IS A SHARED SERVICES COST
- 11 ASSOCIATED WITH TECHNOLOGY SERVICES THROUGHOUT THE BUILDING,
- 12 SO THAT GETS SHARED ACROSS ALL OF THE AGENCIES, AND THE OTHER
- 13 TWO ARE SOLELY FUNDED BY THE ABAG POWER OPERATIONS, WHICH HAVE
- 14 NOTICED -- WHICH HAVE SEEN SIGNIFICANT GROWTH. SO, ADDITIONAL
- 15 STAFFING RESOURCES WITHIN MTC PROPER ARE NOT BEING PROVIDED
- 16 WITHIN THIS BUDGET. THERE ARE ONLY MODEST ADDITIONS TO THE
- 17 CAPITAL BUDGET PROPOSED ON THE TECHNOLOGY SPACE. YOU HAVE
- 18 ASKED HOW WE'RE DEALING WITH THE OUESTIONS OF SCENARIO
- 19 PLANNING. OUR GENERAL APPROACH IS TO IDENTIFY RISK IN THE
- 20 VARIOUS TOOLS THAT ARE ABLE TO BE USED TO MANAGE AGAINST AND
- 21 MITIGATE RISKS. A KEY FEATURE OF THOSE IS NIMBLENESS AND A KEY
- 22 FEATURE OF OUR APPROACH IS BEING NIMBLE. WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO
- 23 ADAPT BOTH TO THOSE NO UNKNOWNS THAT KEEP GETTING REFERRED TO
- 24 AS WELL AS THE UNKNOWN UNKNOWNS AND TODAY THERE ARE A LOT OF
- 25 THOSE WHERE WE JUST DON'T KNOW AND WE NEED TO KNOW THE STEPS



1	THAT ARE TAKEN TO ACTUALLY EFFECTUATE THE ACTIONS WE WANT TO
2	DO. SO NOT JUST THAT WE CAN IDENTIFY SOMETHING, BUT WE NEED TO
3	KNOW HOW WE MOVE FROM IDENTIFYING IT AS A POSSIBILITY TO
4	ACTUALLY MOVING IT FORWARD. ALL OF THIS IS PARTICULARLY
5	CHALLENGING IN AN AGENCY WITH THE COMPLICATED FUNDING THAT MTC
6	IS RELIANT UPON, AND THE RESTRICTIONS THAT COME WITH EACH OF
7	THOSE POTS OF FUNDING. SO WE DON'T JUST GET GREEN DOLLARS WE
8	GET PURPLE, MAUVE, CHARTREUSE. IT'S A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT
9	SHADES OF MONEY THAT ALL HAVE THEIR OWN ABILITY TO USE, BUT
10	RESTRICTIONS ON WHAT THEY CAN BE USED FOR. THAT IS FURTHER
11	COMPLICATED BY THE CONSOLIDATED NATURE OF MTC STAFF, WITH
12	RESPONSIBILITY FOR OPERATIONS VERY FAR A FIELD FROM FUNDING
13	SOURCES MOST AT RISK IN TODAY'S ENVIRONMENT. FIRST STEP IN THE
14	PROCESS IS REALLY UNDERSTANDING THE FUNDING SOURCES THAT ARE
15	MOST AT RISK DEVELOPING COMPREHENSIVE UNDERSTANDING ACROSS THE
16	AGENCY OF HOW THOSE VARIOUS FUNDING SOURCES ARE USED WHICH
17	PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS ARE DEPENDENT ON THE FUNDING SOURCE AT
18	THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF RISK WE NEED TO KNOW THE TIMING OF SPEND
19	ASSOCIATED WITH POSSIBLE RISKS ARE THOSE NEAR-TERM PROBLEMS OR
20	MULTI-YEAR EXPOSURES WHERE WE MAY HAVE SOME ABILITY TO REACT
21	IN A MORE THOUGHTFUL AND PROACTIVE WAY. AND FINALLY ON THIS
22	FRONT, WHAT SPECIFIC LEGAL AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS ARE
23	THERE FOR BOTH THE FUNDING SOURCES AND THE ACTIVITIES THAT MTC

MUST PERFORM. THE FIRST STEP IN OUR SCENARIO PLANNING EFFORTS

THIS YEAR HAS BEEN TO BE CONSERVATIVE IN THE DRAFTING OF THE

24



- 1 FISCAL '26 BUDGET AND VERY HARD DECISIONS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE
- 2 IN THE DOCUMENT BEFORE YOU TODAY CONSIDERING PARTICULARLY
- 3 THOSE EFFORTS FUNDED FROM THIS DISCRETIONARY FUNDS THIS
- 4 RESULTED IN A BUDGET WITH A SMALL SURPLUS THAT SURPLUS
- 5 PROVIDES THE AGENCY WITH SOME AMOUNT OF WIGGLE ROOM, TECHNICAL
- 6 FINANCE TERM SHOULD DISCRETIONARY FUNDS FALL SHORT OF
- 7 PROJECTIONS CURRENT EFFORTS AGAIN STARTING WITH THE BUDGET
- 8 TODAY INCLUDE CONTINUED MONITORING INFORMATION GATHERING
- 9 ANALYSIS WHICH IS KEY IN SUCH A FLUID ENVIRONMENT
- 10 UNDERSTANDING ALL OF OUR CONTRACTUAL COMMITMENTS IN LIGHT OF
- 11 THE POTENTIAL RISK TO ENSURE OUR APPROPRIATE ABILITY TO
- 12 MITIGATE AND WE ARE WORKING TO DEVELOP RESERVE POLICIES THAT
- 13 WILL BE BROUGHT TO THE COMMISSION FOR CONSIDERATION IN JULY OR
- 14 SEPTEMBER. NOTABLY SCENARIO PLANNING IN THE CONTEXT OF WHAT WE
- 15 LOOK AT IS NOT A SPREADSHEET EXERCISE. THERE ARE JUST TOO MANY
- 16 VARIABLES. SO, I COULD PLAN FOR MAYBE A THOUSAND DIFFERENT
- 17 SCENARIOS AND NONE OF THOSE PARTICULAR SCENARIOS IS GOING TO
- 18 EVOLVE. WHAT WE REALLY NEED DO IS, AGAIN, RECOGNIZE WHAT EACH
- 19 OF THOSE BUCKETS OF RISK ARE, HOW WE'RE EXPOSED TO THOSE
- 20 RISKS, AND WHAT STEPS WE CAN DO TO MITIGATE THOSE RISKS THAT'S
- 21 THE WAY WE NEED TO CONDITION STRAIN SCENARIO PLANNING WITHIN
- 22 THIS TO MAKE IT AN ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTABLE PROCESS. AND, AGAIN,
- 23 WE ARE IN THAT PHASE OF WORK RIGHT NOW. SO AGAIN WITH THAT WE
- 24 WANT TO THANK OUR BUDGET TEAM, ALL INFORMATION FOR THIS AND



OTHER BUDGETS IS INCLUDED IN YOUR VARIOUS PACKETS. HAPPY TO 1 2 TAKE QUESTIONS 3 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU DEREK. I'M GOING 4 5 TO TURN TO MY COLLEAGUES IN A MOMENT. ARE WE THEN RELEASING THIS BUDGET FOR THE PUBLIC? 6 7 8 DEREK HANSEL: IT'S IN THE PACKET, ALL SCHEDULES ALL INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE IN TODAY'S PACKET FOR EACH OF THESE 9 BUDGETS ALL OF THE SCHEDULES ARE ATTACHED AGAIN THE 10 PRESENTATIONS ARE ALL THERE. AND ANY FEEDBACK YOU PROVIDE 11 EITHER TODAY OR DURING THE NEXT COUPLE WEEKS WILL BE INCLUDED 12 IN THE PROPOSED BUDGETS THAT WILL BE BROUGHT BACK IN FOUR 13 14 WEEKS. 15 16 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: AND THEN WE WILL VOTE ON THEM IN JULY? 17 18 DEREK HANSEL: THAT IS -- YOU WILL VOTE ON THEM IN JUNE, IN 19 FOUR WEEKS. 20 21 22 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: EXCUSE ME. JUNE. YES, I'M 23 GOING TO OPEN NOW -- YES, COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.



ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: THANK YOU. THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. 1 I WAS HOPING YOU COULD CLARIFY WITH THE SCENARIO PLANNING AND 2 CONTINGENCY PLANNING, IS THAT FOCUSED ON MTC THE ORGANIZATION? 3 OR IS IT FOCUSED ON MORE BROADLY ALL OF THE FUNDS THAT FLOW 4 5 THROUGH MTC AND THEN THE RAMIFICATIONS FOR THE REGION? 6 DEREK HANSEL: YEAH, SO, THE SCENARIO PLANNING IS FOCUSED ON 7 8 MTC THE ORGANIZATION. WE HAVE TALKED PREVIOUSLY ABOUT SOME OF THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING AT THIS FEDERAL ACTIONS RESPONSE 9 10 LEVEL. WE'RE HELMED REALLY BY MATT MALONEY, TO MY LEFT, AND THAT IS CONSIDERING, FRANKLY, ALL OF THE ACTION THAT IS THE 11 ADMINISTRATION MAY BE TAKING, INCLUDING SOME OF ITS 12 13 CONSEQUENCES FOR OUR OPERATORS. 14 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: I THINK -- THANK YOU, AND I THINK IT 15 16 WOULD BE -- AND I'M SORRY, I MAY HAVE MISSED A PRIOR 17 DISCUSSION ON THIS, I DO THINK IT WOULD BE USEFUL TAKING THE SAME EXERCISE CARE AND DILIGENCE THAT YOU'RE APPLYING TO THE 18 ORGANIZATION ITSELF AND THINKING ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS, ARE 19 NOT JUST OF FEDERAL ACTION, BUT STATE ACTION AND OTHER KIND OF 20 MACRO FORCES THAT WE'RE GRAPPLING WITH, ON OUR CAPACITY TO 21 MEET OUR GOALS AS A REGION. I THOUGHT THAT THE LETTER ACTUALLY 22 FROM THE -- THAT WAS IN THE PACKET TODAY, WITH THE COALITION, 23 A BUNCH OF PEOPLE SIGNED ON, PUBLIC ADVOCATES, TRANSFORM, ET 24

CETERA, WAS -- HAD A GOOD POINT, WHICH IS WE DO NEED TO BE



- THINKING CAREFULLY ABOUT, WE HAVE GOALS THAT WE HAVE SET FOR 1 2 OURSELVES, WE'RE LIVING IN A CHANGING ECOSYSTEM, AND IT'S OUR 3 RESPONSIBILITY TO UNDERSTAND HOW WE'RE GOING TO NAH FATE OUR -- NAVIGATE OUR WAY THROUGH THIS AND SCENARIO PLANNING 4 5 CONTINGENCY PLANNING STARTING TO THINK ABOUT WHAT ARE THE 6 THINGS THAT WE NEED TO MOST PRIORITIZE IS A REALLY IMPORTANT 7 EXERCISE FOR US TO BE UNDERTAKING AT THIS TIME. THANK YOU. 8 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU SO MUCH. 9 ANY OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? DEREK, I HAD A FOLLOW-UP TO 10
- 12 ARE FUNDED BY TAKING ALL YOUR DIFFERENT FUNDING BUCKETS AND

COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE. FROM WHAT YOU SAID, OUR OPERATIONS

- 13 CROSS CHANNELING THEM TO CREATE THE PROGRAMS WE HAVE? IS THAT
- 14 A FAIR -- SO WE HAVE FUNDING STACKS FOR OUR PROGRAM?

16 **DEREK HANSEL:** WE HAVE A VARIETY OF FUNDING STACKS ALL OF WHICH

- 17 -- SHOULDN'T SAY ALL OF WHICH -- MOST OF WHICH HAVE DEDICATED
- 18 THINGS FOR WHICH THEY'RE USED. SO, FOR THE BULK OF OUR MONEY,
- 19 WE CAN'T TAKE IT OUT OF THE GREEN BUCKET AND PUT IT INTO THE
- 20 BLUE BUCKET. THERE ARE CERTAIN POTS OF MONEY WHICH ARE HIGHLY
- 21 DISCRETIONARY AND WHERE WE HAVE GOT A GREAT DEGREE OF LATITUDE
- 22 ON HOW TO USE THAT FUNDING. UNFORTUNATELY, THAT'S A RELATIVELY
- 23 SMALL PIECE OF THE OVERALL FUNDING PACKAGE THAT YOU SEE IN OUR
- 24 BUDGET. AND I WILL TELL YOU THAT THE NEEDS AND DESIRES FOR
- 25 THAT MONEY WELL OUTSTRIP ITS RESOURCES. SO, THAT'S A -- THERE

11



1

2

MAY 28, 2025

IS A BIT OF A -- I ADOPT WANT TO QUITE CALL IT A STRUCTURAL

CHALLENGE, BUT THIS IS -- IT CERTAINLY -- THERE IS MORE THAT

3 WE WOULD LIKE TO DO THAN WE CAN AFFORD TO DO. 4 5 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YEAH AND THE CONSTRAINTS SOUNDS VERY MUCH LIKE COUNTY HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES WHERE 6 THE MONEY IS VERY MUCH DEDICATED TO CERTAIN POTS AND THAT'S 7 8 ALL YOU CAN USE IT FOR. I WOULD SUPPORT COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE'S REQUEST THAT WE AT LEAST LOOK AT SOME OF OUR 9 FEDERAL STATE FUNDING STREAMS TO UNDERSTAND BE HOW DO WE 10 MAXIMIZE DOING GOOD WITH THE MONEY WE HAVE IN THOSE BUCKET 11 PRESIDENCY EVEN AS SOME OF THEM ARE GOING TO DECREASE. SO, 12 WITH THAT I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER COMMENTS HERE ON THE DAIS. 13 I'M GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT NOW PLEASE. 14 15 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR 17 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. 18 19 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY VERY GOOD THIS WAS AN 20 21 INFORMATIONAL ITEM SEE YOU BACK IN FOUR WEEKS. THAT BRINGS US

TO AGENDA ITEM 13 -- EXCUSE ME -- 12, OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT ON

ANYTHING. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTERS?

22

23



- 1 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: YES WE DID RECEIVE WRITTEN
  2 CORRESPONDENCE FROM CCTA AND PUBLIC ADVOCATES IT WAS POSTED
- 3 ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COMMISSIONERS AND IS AVAILABLE
- 4 ON THE DAIS OUTSIDE WITH THE HANDOUTS AND THERE IS NO ONES IN
- 5 THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM AND WE HAVE ALETA
- 6 DUPREE ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK-THIS ITEM. ALETA GO AHEAD AND
- 7 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 9 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN, VICE CHAIR STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS.
- 10 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. GOOD
- 11 MEETING TODAY. LET'S GOING ON AND I THOUGHT I WOULD LET YOU
- 12 ALL KNOW -- SOME OF YOU DON'T KNOW, BUT I THOUGHT I WOULD LET
- 13 YOU ALL KNOW, I'M A BIG FAN OF MTC. EVEN IN THIS MEETING WE'RE
- 14 SHOWING THAT WE VERY GOOD AT WHAT WE DO. I THINK WHAT I AM
- 15 GOING TO ENLIGHTEN YOU ABOUT GOING FORWARD IS MATTERS OF
- 16 CLIPPER. I NOTICED THAT THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL BE
- 17 MEETING ON THIS COMING MONDAY, WHICH IS UNUSUAL. I DON'T KNOW
- 18 WHAT TO MAKE OF IT. I HOPE TO BE THERE. BUT CLIPPER IS MOVING
- 19 TOWARD CLIPPER TWO. WE DON'T HAVE AN OPENING DATE YET. I'M NOT
- 20 GOING TO ATTEMPT TO CONJECTURE WHEN THAT OPENING DATE IS GOING
- 21 TO BE. I'M GOING TO LEAVE THAT TO THE STAFF THAT OVERSEE
- 22 CLIPPER. BUT CLIPPER2 WAS HIGHLY ANTICIPATED, IN OPENING UP A
- 23 LOT OF POSSIBILITIES. ONE IS THE OPEN PAYMENTS PROTOCOLS THAT
- 24 LET YOU USE YOUR OWN DEVICE, YOUR OWN PHYSICAL CARD TO PAY, IN
- 25 ADDITION TO THE CLIPPER CARD SYNAPSE THAT ARE IN PLACE TODAY.



- 1 BUT THE NEW TECHNOLOGY OF CLIPPER2 WILL ALSO ALLOW FOR
- 2 DIFFERENT KINDS OF FARE PRODUCTS TO BE OFFERED. BECAUSE WE'RE
- 3 EVOLVING. WE'RE SEEING FARE ACCUMULATION, JUST LIKE WHAT I DID
- 4 WHEN I WENT TO NEW YORK. I NEVER PAY MORE THAN \$17 A WEEK FOR
- 5 NEW YORK CITY TRANSIT, GET THE REDUCED FARE THROUGH OMNI, AND
- 6 OMNI IS A MEGA PROJECT. SO, I BELIEVE THAT OUR CLIPPER PROGRAM
- 7 IS A MEGA PROJECT, AS WELL. SO, I ASK OF YOU ALL, AS OFFICIALS
- 8 OF MTC, TO BE ENGAGED. THANK YOU.

10 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY.

12 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE

13 PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK IN ZOOM.

15 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. WE WILL

- 16 ADJOURN THE MTC COMMISSION MEETING. WE'LL BE BACK WITH YOU
- 17 NEXT MONTH. [ADJOURNED]

18

9

11





Broadcasting Government