

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



September 23, 2020

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 23, 2020, 9:45 AM**

3

4 DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM

5 WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNOR'S

6 EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS

7 OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB

8 SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND

9 OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND

10 RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS

11 PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED

12 ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS.

13 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM,

14 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL

15 STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

16 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR

17 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC

18 SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT PROVIDING

19 SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING

20 TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN WRITING

21 AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED WILL BE

22 POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD BUT

23 WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN

24 CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO ON THE

25 REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE. SPEAKERS



September 23, 2020

1 SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
2 APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL
3 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE
4 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO
5 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO
6 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
7 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. KIMBERLY COULD WE PLEASE
10 MOVE TO THE ROLL CALL?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. HAGGERTY.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

17

18 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BRUINS?

25



1 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY?

4

5 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORTESE?

8

9 **DAVID CORTESE:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

12

13 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIOCAPINI?

16

17 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

20

21 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

24

25 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO? IS
3 ABSENT. MACKENZIE?

4

5 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN IS ABSENT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** I'M HERE. SORRY. TRYING TO UNMUTE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. RONEN IS PRESENT. SCHAFF?

18

19 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SLOCUM? COMMISSIONER SLOCUM IS ABSENT.
22 SPERING?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** STRACNER? COMMISSIONER STRACNER
2 SUPERINTENDENT. HE'S HAVING MICROPHONE DIFFICULTIES. TAVARES
3 IS ABSENT.

4

5 **AMY R. WORTH:** WORTH HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ITEM CHAIR'S REPORT AUTHORIZED AS CHAIR
10 FOR SELECTION OF APPOINTMENT TO GENERAL COUNSEL WE HAVE
11 REACHED TERMS ON EMPLOYMENT AND MOVED CONTRACT TO THE
12 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL I MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE THE
13 CONTRACT WITH KATHLEEN CAIN FOR MTC GENERAL COUNSEL.

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** MOVE APPROVAL.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WAS THE SECOND SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER WORTH SECOND BY
24 SPERING ANYBODY FROM THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO RAISED HANDS AND NO
2 PUBLIC COMMENTER IF ITEM.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? I
5 SEE NOBODY. STILL NOBODY. SO WITH THAT I'M GOING TO CALL FOR A
6 ROLL CALL VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAGGERTY?

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA? COMMISSIONER PEDROZA? ABSENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BRUINS?

19

20 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CONNOLLY.

23

24 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORTESE?

2

3 **DAVID CORTESE:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

10

11 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

14

15 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO? COMMISSIONER LICCARDO IS ABSENT.

18 MACKENZIE?

19

20 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBIT?

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

6

7 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

10

11 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SLOCUM?

14

15 **WARREN SLOCUM:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH?

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** EXCITING TIMES. ITEM THREE POLICY
3 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT RANDI KINMAN. ARE YOU ON? THERE YOU
4 ARE.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN:** I'M GOING TO RUN THROUGH COMMENTS ON THE BLUE
7 RIBBON TASK FORCE AS WELL, BECAUSE I HAVE TO BUG OUT A LITTLE
8 EARLY TODAY. RELATED TO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE COMMENTS
9 THAT WE HAVE COLLECTED ALONG THE LAST MONTH IS WE STILL WANT
10 TO SEE AN OUTWARD FACING PORTAL ON MTC WARDING ON WHAT
11 AGENCIES ARE DOING AND WHAT THEIR SPECIFIC PROTOCOLS ARE OR
12 HOW THEY'RE PERFORMING THEIR SPECIFIC GOALS. WHILE THE
13 DASHBOARD IS IN BETA PHASE RIGHT NOW CAN WE PLEASE PROVIDE A
14 ONE STOP SHOP TO LINKS TO OTHER AGENCIES BECAUSE MANY OF US
15 USE MULTIPLE AGENCIES IN OUR TRAVELS WE ALSO HAVE CONTINUED
16 CONCERN FOR AGENCIES NOT HAVING EMERGENCY MASK SUPPLIES ON
17 BOARD IF YOU GO AND YOUR MASK IS BROKEN OR DAMAGED THEY
18 GENERALLY HAVE REPLACEMENT FOR YOU AND THAT WOULD BE
19 BENEFICIAL FOR BOTH DRIVERS AND RIDERS. WE ALSO HAVE VERY
20 STRONG FEELINGS ABOUT THE CONSOLIDATION OF AGENCIES GOING
21 FORWARD, IN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE PROCESS. WE ALSO
22 SUPPORTED THAT, WE ADOPT TO KEEP IN MIND PARATRANSIT AS PART
23 OF THAT EQUATION, AND WE MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT THE
24 CONSOLIDATION OF PARATRANSIT DELIVERY SYSTEMS WITHIN SMALLER
25 REGIONS. BUT ANYTHING MTC CAN DO TO CONSOLIDATE SOME OF THESE



September 23, 2020

1 AGENCIES WOULD BE SOMETHING WE WOULD CARRY PICKET SIGNS FOR.
2 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION
3 SUBCOMMITTEE INTEGRATION SUBCOMMITTEE WILL HOLD ITS SECOND
4 MEETING THIS WEEK. EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MET THIS
5 WEEK AND REVIEWED TITLE SIX REPORT AND ASKED STAFF TO RETURN
6 NEXT MONTH TO ADDRESS THINGS WE DIDN'T GET TO THIS MONTH. WE
7 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT MTC AND CLIPPER KEEP IN MIND THE
8 DIFFICULTY THAT LOW INCOME HOMELESS AND UNBANKED RIDERS HAVE
9 IN RELOADING ANY CLIPPER CARD WITHOUT THE ABILITY TO DO IT
10 WITH CASH. THERE ARE MANY CASH ONLY RIDERS WHO CANNOT REACH
11 KIOSKS AND OUR CURRENT REACH OUT SYSTEM IS PRETTY SLIM.
12 COUNCIL MET THIS MONTH REVIEWING AND DISCUSSING PLANNED BAY
13 AREA 2050. WE HAVE ALSO SKETCHED OUT OUR WORK PLAN FOR THE
14 NEXT YEAR PER THE RESOLUTION THAT ALLOWS US TO OPERATE.
15 RESOLUTION ALSO SAYS WE'RE SUPPOSED TO HOLD A YEARLY MEETING
16 WITH THE COMMISSION, WHICH WOULD BE THE ENTIRE COMMISSION AND
17 THE ENTIRE COUNCIL AND I DON'T SEE OBVIOUSLY ANY WAY OF DOING
18 THAT IN THE NEAR FUTURE. SO MY SUGGESTION IS THAT WE EITHER
19 SUBMIT IT IN WRITING OR THAT I HAVE A MEETING WITH VICE CHAIR
20 PEDROZA WHO WILL INHERIT THE YEAR LONG PLAN. AND THAT'S MY
21 REPORT.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. YOU CAN GO AHEAD AND MEET
24 WITH VICE CHAIR PEDROZA. SO, ANYBODY HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THE



September 23, 2020

1 REPORT? I SEE NONE. THANK YOU RANDI. I'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE
2 FORWARD THEN. MOVE TO ITEM 4A.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR, THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE
5 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND I DIDN'T RECEIVE ANY
6 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SORRY. YEAH. I MISSED THAT. I
9 APOLOGIZE. GO AHEAD.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PROBLEM. THAT PERSON IS RICH HEDGES.
12 MR. HEDGES?

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SPEAK. I WANT TO
15 ADD THAT I HAD REACHED OUT, BASED ON SOME OF THE REPORTS, TO
16 THE HEAD OF AT LEAST ONE OF THE AT UNITS AND HE'S TELLING ME
17 BASED ON DRIVER SENTIMENT THAT THEY REALLY PERFECT TO HAVE
18 REAR-DOOR BOARDING. AND THEY HAVE GENERALLY FRIGHTENED ABOUT
19 TELLING PEOPLE THEY HAVE TO HAVE MASKS CONCERN OF BEING
20 ASSAULTED AND OF COURSE REAR BOARDING LEAVES A PROBLEM WITH
21 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES OR WHEELCHAIRS BECAUSE THE FRONT OF
22 MOST BUSES ARE LOWERS TO ALLOW THEM EASIER ACCESS. THERE IS
23 GENERAL CONCERN ABOUT PEOPLE NOT WEARING MASKS. ABOUT THE
24 THREE-FOOT DISTANCING, AND ABOUT FRONT BOARDING AND ABOUT
25 ASSAULTS. SO, THOSE ARE THEIR MAJOR CONCERNS, AND THEY DID NOT



September 23, 2020

1 THINK, AT LEAST TO THIS ONE AGENCY THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK
2 FORCE HAD ADDRESSED THOSE. SO THANK YOU.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. I SEE NO
5 OTHER ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HANDS UP. I'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO
6 4A THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

7

8 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING
9 COMMISSIONERS. THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. WE HAD
10 POSTED MY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. I KNOW WE HAVE A LOT
11 AHEAD OF US. SO I JUST WANT TO POINT TO THREE THINGS. AND THE
12 THIRD WILL BE AS RANDI KINMAN HAD REFERENCED, THE REPORT-OUT
13 ON THE BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN AND
14 DASHBOARD. IN ADDITION THAT, THOUGH, I WOULD LIKE TO NOTE THE
15 RETIREMENT OF LAURA THOMPSON. LAURA STARTED WITH ABAG IN
16 SEPTEMBER OF 1999, AND WITH MTC AS ASSISTANT DIRECTOR IN THE
17 PLANNING SECTION ON JULY 1ST, 2017 AS PART OF THE STAFF
18 CONSOLIDATION. LAURA OVERSAW THE -- OVERSEES UNTIL SHE LEAVES
19 US TO GO TO SCOTLAND, THE BAY TRAIL, WHICH IS A SIGNATURE HIGH
20 PROFILE INVESTMENT. AND IN FACT, AN AMAZING RESOURCE FOR THIS
21 REGION. AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, BECAUSE HER TENURE HAD
22 BEEN SO LONG, DIRECT WORKING WITH THAT AGENCY, GAVE HER A
23 LOVELY RESOLUTION LAST MONTH AT THE EXECUTIVE BOARDS. WE WANT
24 TO WISH HER WELL. AND, YOU KNOW, SHE IS SETUP HER TEAM TO
25 CONTINUE TO PROVIDE THE BAY TRAILS DEVELOPMENT AND WE LOOK



September 23, 2020

1 FORWARD TO THAT AS PART OF HER LEGACY. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO
2 POINT OUT THAT THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION
3 CERTIFICATION REPORT HAD BEEN CONDUCTED THIS YEAR BY FHWA AND
4 FTA, AND WE RECEIVED THE FINAL REPORT, AS PART OF -- THIS IS
5 AN IMPORTANT CERTIFICATION FOR MTC'S PLANNING PROCESS THAT'S
6 DONE EVERY FOUR YEARS. WE RECEIVED A NUMBER COMMENDATIONS FOR
7 OUR PROCESSES, HOWEVER THERE WAS ONE CORRECTED ACTION TO
8 IMPROVE ADMINISTRATION OF OUR SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK
9 GRANT PROGRAM AND MITIGATION AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM
10 THIS IS DONE COLLECTIVELY IN OUR ADMINISTRATION AS OUR ONE
11 BAY AREA GRANT OR OBAG. CONCERN HAD TO DO WITH OUR PRACTICE ON
12 USING A FORMULA FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF STP FUNDS AS PART OF
13 THE OBAG'S PERSPECTIVE AND WFA WAS THAT FEDERAL ALLOCATION IN
14 PLANNING LAW WOULD NOT ALLOW THAT. SHORT OF IT MOVING FORWARD,
15 WE WILL NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW THESE PROGRAM FUNDS ARE ADDRESSED AND
16 ENSURING WE'RE COMPLYING WITH THE CORRECTIVE ACTION AND
17 OBVIOUSLY ANY REQUIREMENTS GOING FORWARD, AND WE WILL REPORT
18 TO THE COMMISSION ON THAT AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WITH THAT,
19 WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS TURN TO THE PRESENTATION THAT IS
20 HERE, ASK THE TEAM TO BRING THAT IT UP UNDER MY EXECUTIVE
21 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. OKAY.

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THERESE, I AM SO SORRY. FOLLOWING THE
24 COMMISSION'S DIRECTION, AND INFORMED -- EXCUSE ME -- DID OUR --
25 -- DID THE PRESENTATION -- HOLD ON. I'M SORRY. I NEED TO JUST



September 23, 2020

1 GET THE PRESENTATION BACK UP ON MY COMPUTER. JUST A SECOND.
2 OKAY. NOW WE'RE SETUP. AND I AM NOT MUTED SO HERE WE GO.
3 FOLLOWING THE RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT
4 RECOVERY TASK FORCE, THE COMMISSION HAD DIRECTED MTC STAFF TO
5 PROVIDE A MONTHLY REPORT OF DATA THAT WOULD BE TRACKED ON THAT
6 DASHBOARD. DASHBOARD DEVELOPED AND MAINTAINED BY THE BAY
7 AREA'S PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES. PUBLIC HEALTH METRICS ARE
8 DRAWN FROM THE LARGER WRITING BAY AREA TRANSIT HEALTH PLAN
9 THAT WAS PRESENTED TO THE OPERATOR IN AUGUST. THIS WILL BE THE
10 FIRST REPORT THAT WE'LL BE MAKING AND IT WILL BE A BIT LONGER
11 BECAUSE IT WILL CONTAIN A DESCRIPTION OF THE DASHBOARD
12 DEVELOPMENT AND STRUCTURE. FROM THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC, THE
13 BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES HAD UNITED AROUND A COMMON GOAL TO
14 IMPLEMENT MEASURES FOR A SAFE RIDE FOR THE PUBLIC AS OUR
15 REGION RESPONDS TO THE CONTINUING COVID-19 PANDEMIC. TIMELINE
16 THAT'S ILLUSTRATED HERE OUTLINED KRON LOGICALLY THE TRANSIT
17 AGENCY' OWNERSHIP AND COLLABORATION BEGINNING LATE JUNE AND
18 AUGUST TO DEVELOP PUBLISHING RIDING TOGETHER THE BAY AREA
19 HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN. AS A REMINDER, THAT WAS, AGAIN, RELEASED
20 IN AUGUST, AND INCLUDES COMMITMENTS AND BEST PRACTICES TO
21 ALIGN WITH INDUSTRY, STATE, AND FEDERAL GUIDELINES FOR
22 FREQUENT CLEANING, PERSONAL PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT, FACE
23 COVERINGS, SOCIAL DISTANCING, VENTILATION, AND TOUCHLESS FARES
24 AROUND OTHER PUBLIC HEALTH METRICS. AT THE AUGUST BLUE RIBBON
25 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE MEETING, THE AGENCIES DID COMMIT



September 23, 2020

1 TO REGULAR REPORTING ABOUT THIS PLAN VIA A PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE
2 DASHBOARD. TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ESTABLISHED AS OF TODAY, A
3 MICRO-SITE, THEY HAVE BEEN COLLECTING DATA AND ARE PASSING
4 RESOLUTIONS IMPLEMENTING THE HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN, WHICH
5 INCLUDES PARTICIPATION IN THIS DASHBOARD. AND THE TIMELINE
6 ALSO SHOWS THAT THERE IS A GOING FORWARD INTENT TO MONITOR
7 REPORT AND MODIFY THE PLAN AS CONDITIONS MAY CHANGE DURING THE
8 PANDEMIC. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS FOCUSES QUICKLY ON
9 DASHBOARD FEATURES. DASHBOARD IS DESIGNED TO BE A SIMPLE EASY
10 TO USE AND UNDERSTANDABLE PLATFORM. IT FEATURES INTUITIVE
11 NAVIGATION AND WILL BE USABLE ON ANY DEVICE. AGENCIES WILL BE
12 GIVEN A STAR RATING OF 1 TO 5 FOR EACH OF THE METRICS THAT ARE
13 TRACKED ACROSS THEM ALL AND THAT WILL BE ILLUSTRATED IN AN
14 UPCOMING SLIDE. DASHBOARD WILL PROVIDE DEFINITIONS OF EACH OF
15 THE METRICS, A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE AGENCY'S METHODOLOGIES
16 OF UTILIZING DATA AND VISUAL OBSERVATIONS TO OBTAIN IT AND THE
17 RATINGS EACH AGENCY RECEIVES FOR THE REPORTING PERIOD. VERY
18 IMPORTANTLY, AS INDICATED IN THE FOURTH BULLET, EACH AGENCY'S
19 DATA RESULTS DISPLAY WILL ALSO INCLUDE A LINK TO THE
20 RESPECTIVE AGENCY'S COVID-19 PAGE. THAT INCLUDES INDIVIDUAL
21 WORK AND EFFORTS THAT THE AGENCY IS DOING TO KEEP PASSENGERS
22 AND THEIR EMPLOYEES SAFE. SUPPLEMENTING THE SHARED METRICS
23 BEING TRACKED ACROSS THE AGENCIES. MTC STAFF WILL ALSO PUT
24 THESE LINKS ON OUR WEB SITE. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS
25 SLIDE, AGAIN, BRIEFLY INTRODUCE WHERE WE ARE A BETA WEB PAGE



September 23, 2020

1 THROUGH THE 17th FOR THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES 21 OF THE 25
2 THAT ARE PARTICIPATING. ALL AGENCIES ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TO
3 OPERATIONALIZE DATA COLLECTION AND WILL REPORT THE DATA EACH
4 MONTH BASED ON A 30 DAY PERIOD. FOR EXAMPLE, SEPTEMBER 10TH
5 THROUGH OCTOBER 9TH. BETA DASHBOARD WILL BE LIVE. HOWEVER, TO
6 THE PUBLIC ON SEPTEMBER 28TH, AN ACCEPTABLE, FROM
7 HEALTHYTRANSITPLAN, ALL ONE WORD.COM. NEXT SLIDE. REPORTS
8 METRICS THAT WILL BE INCLUDED IN THE DASHBOARD INCLUDE FOUR
9 ESSENTIAL AND USEFUL MEASURES TO MONITOR HOW THE AGENCIES ARE
10 DOING AND INCLUDES TWO FOR PASSENGER FACING METRICS AND TWO
11 FOR EMPLOYEE FACING METRICS. PROPERLY WORN FACE COVERINGS ARE
12 MONITORED FOR BOTH CUSTOMERS AND EMPLOYEES. VEHICLE CAPACITY
13 TO ALLOW FOR A SIX FOOT SOCIAL DISTANCING IS MONITORED AND
14 MASHED -- MEASURED AS ONE OF THE METRICS AND CONTACT TRACING
15 IS EMPLOYED FOR RELATED MEASURES. THERE HAS BEEN MASS
16 DISTRIBUTION AS WAS MENTIONED BY RANDI KINMAN AND OTHERS,
17 WHICH WERE NOT TRACKED AS METRICS ON THE DASHBOARD BUT THE
18 TRANSIT AGENCIES PROVIDED THIS UPDATED INFORMATION. PERSONAL
19 PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT, PPE, IS PROVIDED FOR ALL WORKPLACE
20 SETTINGS, MAINTAINED BY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. SOME JOB
21 CATEGORIES MAY REQUIRE DIFFERENT PPE THAN OTHER JOB CATEGORIES
22 AND THE AGENCIES ARE RESPONDING TO THAT WITH JOB HAZARD
23 ANALYSIS TO DETERMINE SPECIFIC HAZARDS OR EXPOSURE
24 POSSIBILITIES, AND BASE THEIR PPE ALLOCATION TO THEIR
25 EMPLOYEES ON THAT ASSESSMENT. CURRENTLY, MASKS ARE PROVIDED TO



September 23, 2020

1 RIDERS BY MANY TRANSIT AGENCIES, INCLUDING -- THIS IS AN
2 INCLUSIVE LIST. AC TRANSIT, SFMTA, ACE, PETALUMA TRANSIT,
3 BART. TRI DELTA. THIS INFORMATION CAN BE FOUND ON THEIR
4 RESPECTIVE WEB SITES. FOR THOSE AGENCIES NOT CONSISTENTLY
5 PROVIDING MASKS AT THIS TIME, THEY ARE MONITORING COMPLIANCE
6 WITH PUBLIC HEALTH ORDERS TO WEAR MASKS AND WILL RECONSIDER
7 SUPPLYING MASKS IF COMPLIANCE BECOMES AN ISSUE ON THEIR
8 SYSTEM. LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. THIS IS A HIGHLIGHT
9 OF WHAT THE REPORTING WILL LOOK LIKE. THE DASHBOARD FEATURES A
10 STAR RATING FOR EACH OF THE FOUR METRICS THAT WERE DESCRIBED.
11 IT WAS DONE IN THIS FASHION TO BE EASILY UNDERSTOOD BY THE
12 PUBLIC. THE AGENCIES ARE GIVEN 1 TO 5 STARS BASED ON THE
13 PERCENTAGE THEY INDIVIDUALLY REPORT FOR EACH OF THE METRICS.
14 AND, AGAIN, IT RANGES FROM ONE STAR WHICH IS LESS THAN 60
15 PERCENT COMPLIANCE, TO FIVE STARS, WHICH IS GREATER THAN 95
16 PERCENT COMPLIANCE. NEXT SLIDE. DATA DASHBOARD IS SETUP AS ONE
17 MEANS OF ACCOUNTABILITY AND REPORTING. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
18 TO RECOGNIZE THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS ARE HOLDING THEIR
19 GM'S ACCOUNTABLE TO COVID RELATED RESPONSES AS THEY DO FOR ALL
20 SAFETY ISSUES. AGENCY DASHBOARD IS CURRENTLY IN BETA AS THE
21 AGENCIES ARE WORKING TO OPERATIONALIZE THEIR DATA COLLECTION.
22 AND THE DASHBOARD WILL INCLUDE THE AGENCY'S COMMITMENT AS WELL
23 AS TIPS FOR PASSENGERS, THAT'S ILLUSTRATED ON THIS SLIDE. AND
24 THE CUSTOMER TIPS, IN PARTICULAR, ARE IMPORTANT SINCE THE
25 SUCCESS OF THE PLAN IS BOUND WITH PASSENGER PARTICIPATION



September 23, 2020

1 INCLUDING PROPERLY WEARING THE MASK AND KEEPING A SAFE SIX
2 FOOT DISTANCE FROM OTHERS NOT IN THEIR HOUSEHOLD. WE WANT TO
3 NOTE THAT SIX FEET IS THE WORKING DIRECTIVE FOR BAY AREA
4 AGENCIES, AND IS THE METRIC CURRENTLY EVALUATED UNTIL ANY
5 FURTHER DIRECTION IS PROVIDED BY PUBLIC HEALTH OFFICIALS.
6 LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS PROVIDES YOU A STATIC
7 SNAPSHOT PREVIEW OF THE DATA COLLECTED THROUGH SEPTEMBER 17TH,
8 WHICH IS CURRENTLY BEING TESTED ON THE BATA WEB SITE AND BEING
9 SETUP FOR ALL OF THE AGENCIES. SITE WILL BE LIVE AND
10 INTERACTIVE ON SEPTEMBER 28TH. DATA WILL CONTINUE TO BE
11 COLLECTED THROUGHOUT MONTH OF SEPTEMBER TO PROVIDE A COMPLETE
12 REPORTING PERIOD IN OCTOBER. A SUBSEQUENT REPORTING PERIOD
13 WILL BE BASED ON, AGAIN, A 30 DAY PERIOD. AGENCIES HAVE PUT IN
14 SIGNIFICANT EFFORTS TO THE DASHBOARD'S DESIGN AND THE
15 COLLECTION OF THE DATA WHAT YOU CAN SEE HERE AS AN EXAMPLE IS
16 BOTH LARGE AND SMALL AGENCIES ARE COMMITTING RESOURCES TO DO
17 SO. THEY HAVE WORKED TO MEASURE ACROSS MODES, THEIR VARIOUS
18 FLEET SIZES AND ACQUIRING STATISTICALLY DIFFERENT SAMPLES ON
19 ACCOUNTS AND CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. THIS FEATURES A SNAPSHOT OF
20 LARGE AGENCY SUCH AS ALAMEDA -- OR AC TRANSIT, SAMTRANS, BART,
21 MUNI, AND SMALLER AGENCIES, SUCH AS ACE AND TRI DELTA. AGAIN,
22 THE AGENCY RATINGS, THIS IS A SNAPSHOT FOR INFORMATION THROUGH
23 SEPTEMBER 17TH. AGAIN, IS BASED ON THE 1 TO 5 STAR RATING. AND
24 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THE AGENCY'S CONTINUED MONITORING OF
25 THEIR PLAN AND UPDATES AND MODIFICATIONS AS, AGAIN, THE



September 23, 2020

1 PANDEMIC EVOLVES. NEXT SLIDE. ONE OF THE IMPORTANT REQUESTS BY
2 CHAIR HAGGERTY AND THE COMMISSION WAS THE ADOPTION OF
3 RESOLUTIONS BY THE TRANSIT AGENCIES TO COMMIT TO IMPLEMENTING
4 THE PLAN THAT THEY HAD DEVELOPED, THE WRITING TOGETHER THE BAY
5 AREA HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN. THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THE STATUS
6 OF THOSE RESOLUTIONS. 25 AGENCIES, AGAIN, WE'RE WORKING TO
7 PASS THEM. 16 AGENCIES HAVE ALREADY ADOPTED THEM. NINE
8 AGENCIES ARE SCHEDULED FOR ADOPTION, EITHER LATER THIS MONTH
9 OR IN OCTOBER. NEXT SLIDE. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. I
10 WOULD NOTE THAT IF THERE IS QUESTIONS, TECHNICAL QUESTIONS
11 REGARDING THE DASHBOARD, HANNAH LINDALOKT OF BART IS HERE TO
12 ANSWER THOSE QUESTIONS AS THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE THE ONES
13 DEVELOPING MAINTAINING AND POPULATING THE DASHBOARD. THAT MR.
14 CHAIR CONCLUSION MY PRESENTATION.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU THERESE. I THINK ONE OF
17 THE THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO SEE POSTED ON THE INDIVIDUAL PAGES
18 SAY COPY OF THE RESOLUTION THAT THEY HAVE APPROVED IN THE
19 VOTE. TO MAKE SURE WE'RE UNANIMOUS. IF YOU COULD WORK ON THAT
20 THAT WOULD BE GREAT. I DON'T SEE HANDS FROM COMMISSIONERS.
21 WE'LL GO TO THE ATTENDEES. KIMBERLY CALL ON THEM.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I WOULD BE HAPPY TO. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD
24 YOU ALLOW?

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS KEVIN. I.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS KEVIN MCDONNELL. AS WEEN THE
6 PANDEMIC IS STILL GOING ON AND TRANSIT AGENCIES STILL REMAIN
7 IN DEEP FINANCIAL CRISIS THAT REQUIRES AN EMERGENCY THAT MTC
8 HAS SO FAR LACKED. AT THE RECOVERY TASK FOREHEAD DIRECTORS
9 SAID THEY WOULD ANALYZE THE BUDGET TO DISCOVER DEBT SPIRALS.
10 MTC IS A STAFF WITH A LARGE BUDGET AND LOTS OF STAFF AND IT'S
11 TIME TO PUT THAT STAFF BOO USE AND YOU FAILED SO FAR TO SHIFT
12 MUCH FUNDING TO PREVENT MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS.
13 WHILE THE DASHBOARD LOOKS FINE IT STILL PLACES THE BURDEN ON
14 INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MAKE A VALID HEALTH PLAN THAT
15 SOMETIMES DOES REQUIRE A PUSH FROM ABOVE TO ACTUALLY GET
16 THINGS GOING OTHER WISE WE BECOME A PATCHWORK THAT NO ONE
17 WANTS. THIS IS A CRISIS AND WE DEMAND SAFE AND HEALTHY
18 TRANSPORTATION FOR WHAT WE NEED FOR TRANSIT RIDERS TODAY.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS NATHANIEL
21 ARNOLD.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES. HELLO. MY NAME IS NATHANIEL ARNOLD. AND I AM A
24 MEMBER OF AC TRANSIT. I AM IN CHARGE OF THEIR SAFETY AND
25 HEALTH FOR THE UNION AND OF THE REASON I'M HERE IS ME AND MY



September 23, 2020

1 WORKERS ARE ON THE FRONT LINES OF THIS CRISIS. LAST WEEK A BLUE
2 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE, DIRECTOR MCMILLAN STATED
3 MTC WOULD ALLOW ANALYSIS FOR MTC'S BUDGET TO DETERMINE WHICH
4 MONEYS WOULD BE SHIFTED TO ADDRESS THE URGENCY OF SERVICE CUTS
5 AND MAJOR DROPS IN RIDERSHIP. TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING
6 SEVERE SERVICE CUTS AND JOB LOSSES IN THE COMING MONTHS. YOUR
7 BUDGET CANNOT REFLECT BUSINESS AS USUAL. WE ARE IN THE MIDDLE
8 OF A CATASTROPHE FOR ALL OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND FOR THOSE
9 OF US WHO DEPEND ON IT YOU CONTROL BILLIONS OF DOLLARS AND
10 NUMEROUS FUNDING SOURCES. THIS IS A TIME TO PRIORITIZE AND
11 KEEP MONEY ON THE GROUND TO PROVIDE SERVICE. MTC IS A REGIONAL
12 AGENCY WITH A MISSION AND ABILITY TO ADDRESS THIS CRISIS. YOU
13 HAVE AN OPERATING BUDGET OF OVER \$70 MILLION A YEAR. YOU TOOK
14 ONE PERCENT OF THE CARES ACT FUNDING TO SUPPORT YOUR TRANSIT
15 RECOVERY. YOU FAILED TO PRESENT ANY OPTIONS TO SHIFT FUNDING
16 THAT YOU CONTROL TO AVOID MASSIVE LAYOFFS ASK SERVICE CUTS IN
17 FACT THIS MONTH THE ONLY AGENDA ITEM RELATED TO EMERGENCY
18 TRANSIT FUNDING PURPOSES IS TO SPEND THAT \$500,000 OF THE
19 CARES ACT MONEY YOU TOOK TO SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY EFFORTS.
20 REEVALUATION OF THE FUNDS OF THE MTC ALLOCATES MUST BE A TOP
21 PRIORITY. YOU MUST LEAVE HEALTH AND SAFETY UP TO THE OPERATORS
22 WHO PROVIDE BAY AREA MINIMUM TO THE TRANSIT PLAN. WE ARE
23 WAITING FOR THE DASHBOARD TO BE MADE PUBLICLY AVAILABLE ON THE
24 WEB SITE AND TO ENSURE IT INCLUDES BASIC INFORMATION SUCH AS
25 WHETHER AGENCIES WHO ARE PASSING OUT THE MASKS --



September 23, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER --

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THE LIMITED RESPONSE OF THE FACE OF THE PUBLIC HEALTH
7 RISK ON PUBLIC TRANSIT --

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CAN YOU WRAP IT UP PLEASE?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** YES. THIS IS A CRISIS WE DEMAND ACTION TO PUBLIC
12 TRANSPORTATION TO PROVIDE FUNDING FOR IMMEDIATE NEEDS.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVE CAMPBELL. UNMUTE
17 YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS DAVE CAMPBELL ADVOCACY DIRECTOR FOR BIKE EAST
20 BAY ALSO VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. I WANT TO FIRST THANK AC
21 TRANSIT FOR PROVIDING FREE MASKS AND SANITIZER. THIS'S GREAT.
22 I'M PLEASED THEY'RE LISTENING TO CALLS FROM THE PUBLIC TO DO
23 SO. STILL PUSHING OTHER EAST BAY OPERATORS TO DO THE SAME. SO
24 THE TWO POINTS I WANT TO MAKE IS, ONE, WE HAVE TO GET ALL OF
25 OUR OPERATORS TO DO THAT AND WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THE UPCOMING



September 23, 2020

1 TRANSIT SHORT FALL. PROPOSITION 15 IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR THAT.
2 SO YES ON PROP 15 TO HELP FILL THE FUNDING GAP GOING FORWARD.
3 BUT HERE TO ASK MTC TO STEP UP, QUICKLY, TO SHOW MORE
4 LEADERSHIP. ESTABLISH MORE LEADERSHIP TO MOVE FUNDING FROM
5 FREEWAY PROJECTS, HOWEVER THAT CAN HAPPEN, TO STABILIZE
6 TRANSIT FUNDING OVER THE NEXT COMING YEARS, AND ON THE PPE,
7 POINT, I HAD A GOOD CONVERSATION WITH COMMISSIONER WORTH AFTER
8 LAST MONTH'S MEETING AND SHE PROMISED SHE WAS GOING TO HOP ON
9 HER EAST BAY BUSES AND SEE WHAT THE PPE USAGE WAS ON LIKE
10 THEM AND SHARE THAT EXPERIENCE WITH YOU HERE TODAY. SO THANK
11 YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH FOR DOING THAT. AND ALSO, THANK YOU FOR
12 ASKING THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS HERE TODAY TO DO THE SAME, AND
13 TO CONTINUE TO DO THE SAME AS WE HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT
14 PPE, PUBLIC HEALTH, AND NEEDED TRANSIT FUNDING. WE NEED OUR
15 COMMISSIONERS ON THESE BUSES REGULARLY. WE NEED YOU STANDING
16 AT BUS STOPS, MISSING BUSES BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT COMING AND
17 EXPERIENCE EVERYTHING EVERYONE OUT THERE IS EXPERIENCING.
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JAVANKA
21 BECKELS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING YOU ALL, COMMISSIONERS, MY NAME IS
24 JAVANKA, I AM WITH VOICES OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION.
25 AC TRANSIT WORKERS ARE WORRIED ABOUT CUTS TO BUS LINES WAGES



September 23, 2020

1 AND JOBS AND DEMANDING SERIOUS SAFETY MEASURES TO PROTECT THE
2 WORKERS AND THE RIDERS. MTC, YOUR AN AGENCY IS AN AGENCY WITH
3 A MISSION AND ABILITY TO ADDRESS THIS CRISIS. YOU HAVE THE
4 MONEY AND THE STAFF TO HELP FUND AND COORDINATE A REAL
5 RESPONSE. WE KNOW THAT YOU HAVE ACCEPTED \$13 MILLION IN THE
6 CARES ACT FUNDING. THAT SHOULD BE SPENDING -- THAT YOU SHOULD
7 BE SPENDING TO MAKE OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COVID SAFER AND
8 TO STAVE OFF MASSIVE SERVICE CUTS AND LAYOFFS. BUT AFTER SIX
9 MONTHS IT'S IMPORTANT MTC HAS ACCOMPLISHED NOTHING. YOUR
10 HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN IGNORED ATUS DEMANDS TO ENSURE RIDER AND
11 WORKER SAFETY. YOU EMPLOYED MINIMAL SAFETY STANDARDS. MONTHS
12 LATER THEY'RE STEPPING UP TO MEET DEMANDS NO THANKS TO MTC.
13 BECAUSE YOU HAVE DONE NOTHING TO SHIFT FUNDING TO AVOID
14 MASSIVE LAYOFFS AND SERVICE CUTS. THIS MONTH THE COMMISSION IS
15 RECOMMENDING SPENDING A MILLION DOLLARS OF CARES ACT FUNDS TO
16 SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY WITHOUT SAYING WHAT THAT MEANS OR
17 WHERE THIS MONEY IS ACTUALLY GOING. THIS IS ABSOLUTELY ABSURD.
18 AC TRANSIT IS NOW CONSIDERING SERVICE CUTS OF UP TO 30 PERCENT
19 AND CUTTING AWAY JOBS OF OUR MAJORITY BLACK WORKFORCE. MTC HAS
20 MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN CARES ACT FUNDING AND BILLIONS FROM
21 OTHER SOURCES THAT MIGHT BE USED TO SUPPORT TRANSIT RECOVERY.
22 BUT UNFORTUNATELY, MTC HASN'T EVEN TOLD US HOW MUCH OF THAT
23 MIGHT BE USED TO HELP OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. MTC HAS A
24 RESPONSIBILITY TO SAVE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM, WORKING
25 PEOPLE DEMAND ACTION.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM OAKLAND TENANT
5 UNION.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JUST WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE. TWO
8 MINUTES TO SPEAK.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OAKLAND TENANT UNION. PLEASE UNMUTE
11 YOURSELF. OKAY. MOVING TO NEXT SPEAKER. GREEN FOR ALL.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS NICHOLE WONG A
14 CAMPAIGN MANAGER AT BETWEEN FOR ALL AND RESIDENT AND ACTIVE
15 PARTICIPANT IN THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION.
16 PUBLIC TRANSIT HAS BEEN UNDERWATER FOR SIX MONTHS. DELAYING
17 SAFETY MEASURES THAT CAN PROTECT LIVES NOW TRANSIT FACING
18 DRASTIC CUTS YOU CANNOT AFFORD TO PASS BY OBJECTIVE THAT
19 MAINTAINS STATUS QUO. MTC IS THE AGENCY'S BEST VIEW TO OFFER
20 LEADERSHIP DURING THIS CRISIS ABOUT AN OPERATING BUDGET OF
21 OVER \$170 MILLION EACH YEAR TAKE ACTION. TRANSIT RIDERS ARE
22 DEPENDENT ON YOU. SHIFT FUNDING FROM CARES ACT FUNDING TO
23 AVOID MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS. IT'S IMPERATIVE MTC
24 DETERMINES ALLOCATIONS. YOU HAVE LEFT HEALTH AND SAFETY AT THE
25 TRANSIT SYSTEMS THIS HAS LIST THE BURDEN ON RIDERS AND WORKERS



September 23, 2020

1 THEMSELVES. DASHBOARD YOU PRESENTED TODAY REFLECTS THIS
2 LACKING IN SPECIFICITY AND ARE RIDER EMPLOYEE FOCUSED. FOR
3 INSTANCE THE DASHBOARD FAILS TO MONITOR WHETHER TRANSIT
4 AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING HAND SANITIZERS AND MASKS TO RIDERS
5 MEASURES TO KEEP RIDERS AND WORKERS SAFE. PLEASE ENSURE THE
6 NEEDS OF OUR RIDERS AND OPERATORS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT IS MARK RICHARD ANTONIO. PLEASE
9 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS RICHARD MARK
12 ANTONIO WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC
13 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. OVER THE DECADES YOU HAVE DIRECTED
14 UNTOLD BILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO BUILD, MAINTAIN AND OPERATOR
15 TRANSIT SYSTEM. PANDEMIC AND ECONOMIC DOWNTURN NOW POSE AN
16 EXISTENTIAL CRISIS TO THAT TRANSIT SYSTEM. BUT SIX MONTHS IN,
17 THERE IS NO SIGN THAT MTC IS TREATING THIS AS A CRISIS. LAST
18 MONTH, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SAID MTC WOULD BE EXPECTING EACH
19 TRANSIT AGENCY TO TRANSLATE THE HEALTHY TRANSIT PLAN INTO A
20 SPECIFIC AGENCY PLAN. WHERE IS THE AGENDA ITEM ABOUT THOSE
21 PLANS? I WROTE TO SIX OF THE LARGEST TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND
22 MOST HAD NOT CREATED AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND DIDN'T
23 DISCLOSE ANY PLANS TO DO SO. AND WHERE IS THE AGENDA ITEM
24 ABOUT HOW MTC WILL SHIFT FUNDING TO EMERGENCY TRANSIT
25 OPERATING SUPPORT? IT'S AS IF MTC IS STILL EXPECTING ANOTHER



September 23, 2020

1 FEDERAL STIMULUS BEFORE THE CURRENT ONE RUNS OUT AND MEANWHILE
2 AGENCIES ARE PREPARING FOR MASSIVE LAY OFFS AND SERVICE CUTS.
3 YOU ARE THE STEWARDS OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, THAT SYSTEM IS IN
4 CRISIS. AND YOU MUST NOT ALLOW IT TO BE DESTROYED WITHOUT
5 DOING EVERYTHING IN YOUR POWER TO PRESERVE T THANK YOU.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, CAN YOU DO ME A FAVOR AND TRY
8 THE OAKLAND -- I NOTICED THEY CAME BACK ON AGAIN.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OAKLAND TENANT UNION PLEASE UNMUTE
11 YOURSELF. SOMEONE FROM THE OAKLAND TENANT UNION, YOU HAVE YOUR
12 HAND RAISED. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE UNMUTE
13 YOURSELF.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THERE YOU GO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. OCCUR HEAR ME?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HI. SORRY FOR THE MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER MEMBER OF
22 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT COALITION PUBLIC TRANSIT HAS BEEN
23 AFFECTED FOR SIX MONTHS WE'RE ASKING YOU TO RESPOND TO THE
24 EMERGENCY. I AM A TRANSIT RIDER ON THE FRONTLINE OF THIS
25 CRISIS. AND I RIDE TRANSIT REGULARLY. LAST WEEK AT THE BLUE



September 23, 2020

1 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN STATED
2 THAT MTC STAFF WOULD ANALYZE MTC'S BUDGET TO DETERMINE WHICH
3 MONEY SHOULD BE SHIFTED TO ADDRESS EMERGENCY OF THIS CRISIS TO
4 ADDRESS MAJOR DROPS IN RIDERSHIP. YOUR BUDGET CANNOT REFLECT
5 BUSINESS AS USUAL. WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF A CATASTROPHE FOR
6 THOSE THAT DEPEND ON IT. YOU CONTROL BILLIONS OF DOLLARS FROM
7 NUMEROUS FUNDING SOURCES THIS IS THE TIME TO PRIORITIZE MONEY
8 TO KEEP SERVICE ON THE GROUND. MTC HAS THE ABILITY TO ADDRESS
9 THIS CRISIS. YOU HAVE AN OPERATING BUDGET OF OVER \$70 MILLION
10 A YEAR AND STAFF, AND YOU TOOK FUNDS FROM CARES ACT, BUT YOU
11 FAILED TO PRESENT OPTIONS TO PREVENT MASSIVE LAYOFFS. TRANSIT
12 FUNDING PROPOSES TO SPEND \$500,000 OF CARES ACT MONEY YOU
13 TOOK. REEVALUATION OF THE FUNDS MTC ALLOCATES MUST BE A TOP
14 PRIORITY. OPERATORS CONTRIBUTE TO THE BAY AREA MINIMUM OF THE
15 TRANSIT PLAN WHICH AS YOU MENTIONED EARLIER WAS SUPPOSED TO BE
16 GUIDELINES NOT OF THE TOP OF WHAT PEOPLE WERE AIMING FOR. THIS
17 IS A CRISIS. WE DEMAND ACTION SAY PUBLIC TRANSIT BY FUNDING
18 IMMEDIATE OPERATING NEEDS OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. THANK YOU
19 VERY MUCH.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS HALEY
22 CURRIER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS THIS IS HALEY CURRIER
25 POLICY ADVOCACY MANAGER AT TRANSFORM MEMBERS OF PUBLIC



September 23, 2020

1 TRANSPORTATION AND MEMBER OF BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK
2 FORCE. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT DURING THE HEALTH AND PUBLIC
3 CRISIS -- PUBLIC SAFETY AND SERVICE AND JOB CUTS.
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS IS ACTUALLY AN IMPORTANT STEP TO ENSURING
5 EVERY AGENCY HAS WHAT THEY NEED TO KEEP RIDERS AND OPERATORS
6 SAFE. THIS IS THE GOAL OF THE PROJECT. METRICS ARE
7 UNDERDEVELOPED. SHOULD BE AGENCY IS HANDING OUT MASKS YES OR
8 NO. AGENCY IS HANDING OUT HAND SANITIZER YES OR NO. DIRECTOR
9 WORTH HAS THAT INFORMATION. WHY ISN'T IT HANDED OUT AS
10 REQUESTED. MTC SHOULD WORK WITH OPERATORS AND RIDERS NOT JUST
11 MEASURE COMPLIANCE. THIS ISN'T ABOUT SHAMING OR PUNISHING
12 AGENCIES. PRESENTS OPPORTUNITY FOR EACH AGENCY IDENTIFYING
13 BEST PRACTICE AND FILLING THE GAP. SECOND OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES
14 ARE FACING SERVICE AND JOB CUTS THAT WILL LEAD TO FURTHER
15 DROPS IN RIDERSHIP AND STRANDED. TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE
16 STATED MTC STAFF WOULD ANALYZE FUNDS CONTROLLED BY MTC TO
17 DETERMINE WHICH FUNDS COULD BE SHIFTED TO FILL THE URGENT
18 NEED. THIS IS A CRISIS. THIS IS A TIME FOR LEADERSHIP AND
19 CREATIVITY THIS IS NOT THE TIME TO ACCEPT THE WAY THING HAVE
20 BEEN. WHEN YOU SEE HUNDREDS OF JOBS BEING CUT DOZENS OF BUS
21 LINES BEING CUT RIDERS WAITING FOR BUSES THAT NEVER COME TO
22 GET TO THE STORE OR HELPFUL WHAT ARE WE GOING TO DO. DON'T
23 TELL THE TRANSIT RIDERS WHAT YOU CAN'T DO. TELL US WHAT YOU
24 CAN DO TO ENSURE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM MAKES IT THROUGH THE
25 CRISIS.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT ALAN.
3 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT AND
6 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I THINK THE
7 COMMENTING THIS MORNING IS SOMETHING YOU'RE ALL AWARE OF WE'RE
8 IN A CRISIS IN TERMS OF THE SYSTEM YOU ALL HAVE BEEN A PART OF
9 BUILDING OVER YOUR TIME WITH THE STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS. I
10 THINK WHAT WE'RE ALL SAYING TODAY IS WE CLEARLY NEED TO SEE A
11 RESPONSE ON HEALTH AND SAFETY THERE HAS BEEN PROGRESS IN TERMS
12 OF WHAT WAS PRESENTED TODAY I'LL QUICKLY ECHO ULTIMATELY NOT
13 HAVING THE METRIC THEY THINK MOST LAY PEOPLE AND RIDERS WOULD
14 FOCUS ON WHICH THE AVAILABILITY OF MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER
15 SEEMS INCREDIBLY PROBLEMATIC AND UNDERMINES FROM A TYPICAL
16 RIDERS PERSPECTIVE THE INFORMATION YOU HAVE AND SHOULD BE
17 INCLUDED IN THE DASHBOARD. BUT THE AREA IN WHICH THE HEALTH
18 AND SAFETY, WHERE IT'S IRREFUTABLE THAT MTC HAS NOT JUST THE
19 POLITICAL RESPONSIBILITY TO ADDRESS BUT A STATUTORY ONE, I
20 THINK IS CLEARLY ON THE FISCAL CRISIS WE'RE FACING. OPERATORS
21 AT THE LOCAL LEVEL ARE PRESENTING INCLUDING VTA, SFMTA, OTHER
22 AGENCIES, A REALLY ROBUST SET OF DIFFICULT TRADEOFFS THAT WE
23 HAVE TO MAKE TO KEEP THE SYSTEM GOING. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE
24 HEARING TODAY WE NEED TO HEAR WHAT YOU CAN DO AS A REGIONAL
25 TRANSIT PLANNING AGENCY. THERE IS TRADEOFFS TO THOSE



September 23, 2020

1 DECISIONS. WE'RE IN SEPTEMBER AND WE STILL HAVEN'T HAD A
2 CONVERSATION ABOUT WHAT THE METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION
3 COULD DO. THAT'S YOUR RESPONSIBILITY, IT'S YOUR RESPONSIBILITY
4 TO VOTE ON WHAT THOSE OPTIONS ARE AND IT'S OUR RESPONSIBILITY
5 AT THE PUBLIC AND ADVOCATES OF THE COMMUNITY TO HAVE A ROBUST
6 DISCUSSION. WE DON'T HAVE THAT INFORMATION. IT NEEDS TO HAPPEN
7 AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS COME UP TO THE
8 TASK FORCE. IT'S UNCONSCIONABLE TO TALK ABOUT IMPORTANT
9 CONVERSATION IN STAGE THREE WHEN WE HAVEN'T DONE ANYTHING
10 AROUND STAGE TWO IMMEDIATE RECOVERY MUCH PLEASE LISTEN TO WHAT
11 FOLKS HAVE SAID TODAY AND TAKE ACTION ON THAT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI.
14 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI CAN YOU HEAR ME?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. WELL, I JUST WANT TO GET BACK TO THE IDEA OF
21 EQUITY. WE REALLY NEED TO START THINKING ABOUT HOW WE CAN MAKE
22 PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE. WE HAVE ALL THESE PEOPLE LOSING THEIR
23 JOBS AND THAT MAKES IT MORE DIFFICULT. THEY CAN'T GET AROUND
24 THEY CANNOT BE PRODUCTIVE. HOMELESS PEOPLE CANNOT BE
25 PRODUCTIVE UNLESS THEY GET TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO. IF WE



September 23, 2020

1 COULD FOCUS ON MAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT FREE, LET'S TAKE A LOOK
2 AT THE COST OF COLLECTING A FARE. AND CLIPPER IS OVER \$400
3 MILLION. SO NOW WHEN I WANT TO USE BART, I HAVE TO USE AN
4 EXTRA \$3 TO GET A CLIPPER CARD. I DON'T THINK THAT'S FAIR. WE
5 ARE GOING TO LET TRANSIT SUFFER AND WONDER WHY SO MANY PEOPLE
6 WANT TO DRIVE. LET'S LOOK AT HOW TO MAKE TRANSIT FREE AND
7 RECOVERY MONEY FROM PROPERTY OWNERS WHO BENEFIT FROM THE
8 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS NICK FRENCH. PLEASE UNMUTE
11 YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS NICK FRENCH I AM A LONG TIME BART
14 AND AC TRANSIT RIDER. I WANT TO ECHO COMMENTS MADE ALREADY BY
15 THE VOICE FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I THINK MTC HAS
16 FAILED TO SHOW THE LEADERSHIP OF THE CRISIS FACING OUR TRANSIT
17 SYSTEM I WAS STRUCK SEEING THE DASHBOARD THAT MTC IS TAKING A
18 PASSIVE ROLE REPORTING WHAT AGENCIES ARE DOING, BUT NOT EVEN
19 REPORTING SOME OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS, LIKE, YOU KNOW,
20 THE ISSUES AROUND MASKS AND HAND SANITIZER THAT HAVE BEEN
21 RAISED, AND MORE FUNDAMENTALLY THAT IT STRUCK ME THAT MTC IS
22 NOT USING ITS CONSIDERABLE RESOURCES AND AUTHORITY TO ACTUALLY
23 DIRECT OUR BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT
24 IS SAFE FOR RIDERS DURING THE PANDEMIC. SO AGAIN JUST WANT TO



September 23, 2020

1 ECHO COMMENTS OTHERS HAVE MADE. THIS IS A CRISIS THAT THE MTC
2 HAS NOT HANDLED.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN COURTNEY.
5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. MY NAME IS JOHN COURTNEY, ATU
8 LOCAL 265 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. I DO AGREE WITH WHAT NICK
9 JUST SAID ABOUT LEADERSHIP. IT COMES DOWN TO LEADERSHIP. AND
10 YOU HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING AND NOT LEADING AT ALL. IN FACT, ONE
11 OF THE COMMISSIONERS MADE A COMMENT, IN THE PAST MONTH ABOUT
12 STAYING IN YOUR LANE. AND IF THERE WAS EVER A TIME FOR MTC TO
13 SHOW LEADERSHIP IT'S NOW. I HAVE A FEW EXAMPLES AT VTA. VTA
14 HAS NOT BEEN A BAD ACTOR. DON'T GET ME WRONG. THEY HAVE DONE
15 MOST PROGRESSIVE THINGS IN TERMS OF KEEPER RIDERS AND
16 OPERATORS SAFE HOWEVER THERE'S A SHORT FALL. I HAVE AN
17 OPERATOR CURRENTLY WHO JUST CAME OUT A COMA SHE ONLY WENT TO
18 WORK, FROM HOME TO WORK AND ENDED UP IF A COMA SHE WAS DENIED
19 WORKER'S COMPENSATION. YOU CAN IMAGINE HOW DISGUSTING THAT IS.
20 AND TIME AND TIME AGAIN WE'RE NOT FOLLOWING THROUGH ON ALL
21 YOU'RE DOING HERE PUTTING OUT THIS DASHBOARD AND YOU'RE JUST
22 WALKING AWAY FROM T THERE IS NO ACCOUNTABILITY, THERE IS NO
23 GOING TO POLICE THE AGENCIES, THERE IS NO FOLLOW UP, NO
24 LEADERSHIP. AND THIS'S WHAT IS REALLY FRUSTRATING FOR US. LIKE
25 I SAID IF THERE EVER WAS A TIME FOR MTC TO SHINE AND ACTUALLY



September 23, 2020

1 DO YOUR JOB, THE TIME IS NOW. WE NEED TO SAVE LIVES AND KEEP
2 TRANSPORTATION GOING. SERVICE CUTS ARE NEVER -- COME BACK --
3 [INDISCERNIBLE] SERVICE CUTS -- PLEASE MOVE SOME FUNDING
4 AROUND.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MUTE PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES.
9 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. MR. HEDGES?

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. YEAH. I REALLY MISS RIDING TRANSIT
12 DURING THIS PANDEMIC. I ACTUALLY LOVE GETTING ON IT, TALKING
13 TO PEOPLE, FINDING OUT THEIR VIEWS ON THING WITHIN THE BAY
14 AREA AND NATIONALLY. BUT, I WOULD SAY THIS IS A VERY DIFFICULT
15 TIME. I UNDERSTAND THE LACK OF POWER THAT MTC HAS TO DRIVE THE
16 TRANSIT AGENCIES INTO ANY PARTICULAR PROGRAM. IF WE CUT TO
17 THAT, I THINK THE FIVE STAR PROGRAM IS A GOOD START, IN GIVING
18 PEOPLE INFORMATION BUT I WILL TELL YOU THAT THE PEOPLE THAT
19 ARE MOST IN TOUCH WITH THIS, AND THAT ARE IN TRANSIT VEHICLES
20 EVERY DAY, ARE THE DRIVERS. MTC SHOULD LISTEN TO THEM VERY
21 CAREFULLY. THEY UNDERSTAND THE PROBLEMS. AND I WOULD SAY THE
22 SAFETY OF THE PASSENGERS ARE DIRECTLY RELATED TO THE DRIVERS.
23 ISSUES THEY BRING UP ARE REAR BOARDING, EVERYBODY WEARING A
24 MASK, THEY'RE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT NOT FINDING OUT WHO AMONG
25 THEM HAS CONTACTED COVID. SOME OF THE AGENCIES TELL ME THAT



September 23, 2020

1 THEY'RE ONLY TOLD WHEN IT HAPPENS, NOT -- I UNDERSTAND THE
2 GOVERNOR HAS MADE THAT ABILITY OPEN TO THE AGENCIES TO LET THE
3 DRIVERS REPRESENTATIVES KNOW WHO HAS BEEN INFECTED SO THE
4 DRIVERS CAN KNOW WHETHER THEY HAVE BEEN IN PROXIMITY OF THE
5 WORKERS. I THINK THAT WILL MAKE DRIVERS FEEL A LOT SAFER.
6 SAFETY OF THE DRIVERS IS DIRECTLY RELATED TO SAFETY OF THE
7 PASSENGERS LISTEN TO THE DRIVERS AND SINCE IT'S SELF REPORTING
8 CONTACT THE DRIVERS OR SETUP A VEHICLE WHERE THEY CAN TELL YOU
9 THEIR FEELINGS ABOUT WHEN'S BEING REPORTED. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS BONNIE
12 LOCKHART. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES. HI. MY NAME IS BONNIE LOCKHART AND I AM A
15 VOLUNTEER FOR VOICES WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND I AM HERE
16 BECAUSE I'M PASSIONATE ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IT'S RACIAL
17 ISSUE AND SOCIAL JUSTICE ISSUE AND CLIMATE ISSUE. I WANT TO
18 REITERATE ALL THAT'S BEEN SAID ABOUT HEALTH AND SAFETY. PUBLIC
19 TRANSIT IS IN DEEP CRISIS. TREATING THIS LIKE THE EMERGENCY IT
20 IS WHAT IS YOUR PLAN. PUBLIC TRANSIT IS ABOUT TO GO OFF A
21 CLIFF TALKING ABOUT CUTS TO CRUCIAL SERVICES MAY NEVER
22 RECOVER. YOU CONTROL THE BUDGET. BUCK STOPS HERE. YOU TOOK
23 MILLION DOLLARS IN CARES ACT FUNDS FOR TRANSIT RECOVERY. WE
24 HAVE NOT SEEN HOW YOU'RE GOING TO USE THOSE BILLIONS OF
25 DOLLARS TO SAVE PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE NEED A RESPONSE THAT THIS



September 23, 2020

1 EMERGENCY DEMANDS. WE HAVE GOT TO SEE YOUR ANALYSIS OF HOW
2 YOU'RE GOING TO SHIFT FUNDS TO HALT THIS DEATH SPIRAL OF
3 SERVICE CUTS AND FARE INCREASES AND THEN REDUCED RIDERSHIP. WE
4 NEED TO YOU PRIORITIZE PLANNING ABOVE ALL ELSE THIS SHOULD BE
5 TOP AGENDA HEALTH AND SAFETY IS CRUCIAL TO THAT PLAN AND WE
6 NEED A RECOVERY BUDGET, THAT IS WAY OVERDUE. THIS COVID CRISIS
7 HAS SHOWN US WHAT DENIAL BY LEADERSHIP OF THE DEPTH OF A
8 CRISIS LEADS TO. BEFORE THE NEXT MTC MEETING, WE NEED TO SEE A
9 PLAN OF HOW YOU'RE GOING TO FIND THE FUNDS, HOW YOU'RE GOING
10 TO SHIFT THE FUNDS, AND HOW YOU'RE GOING TO SAVE PUBLIC
11 TRANSIT. WE NEED TO FACE REALITY WITH COURAGE AND VISION.
12 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SARAH BETWEEN
15 WALD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SARAH BETWEEN -- GENE WALD WITH 350 BAY
18 AREA. THAT WAS A NICE PRESENTATION ON THE PROGRESS OF THE
19 SOFTWARE AND YOUR TRACKING PROGRAM, BUT, THIS IS HAPPENING
20 VERY LATE, AND IT STILL ISN'T DOING ENOUGH ON DRIVER AND RIDER
21 SAFETY. SO I'M ALARMED THAT OVER A THIRD OF THE AGENCIES, IF I
22 READ IT CORRECTLY, HAVE NOT ADOPTED THE COVID HEALTH PROGRAM.
23 MTC'S JOB IS TO -- SO I HEARD, UNDER THE AGENCIES, TO LEAD
24 THEM TO WORK TOGETHER. AND IT'S NOT HAPPENING. SOFTWARE STILL
25 NEEDS TWEAKING TO PROPERLY SHOW THE SAFETY SITUATION AS PEOPLE



September 23, 2020

1 HAVE DISCUSSED. COVID CRISIS IS IN ITS SIX MONTH AS I'M SURE
2 YOU KNOW. CLIMATE CRISIS HAS BEEN DECLARED EMERGENCY IN THE
3 BAY AREA. WHY? SIMPLY AS EVERYBODY WOULD SAY, YOU SIMPLY HAVE
4 NOT INVESTED ENOUGH IN DOING THIS. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT CALLER IS 6262 LE BRUN. MR. LE BRUN,
7 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. THIS IS ROLAND IN SAN JOSE. SO
14 RIGHT NOW THERE IS A CONFERENCE GOING ON IN LONDON IT'S CALLED
15 BROADCAST WEEK AND MONDAY STARTED OFF WITH ARTICLE 19 AND KEYS
16 TO SUCCESS IN COVID-19. BEFORE I TALK ABOUT RAIL I WANT TO
17 TALK ABOUT BUSES BECAUSE I THINK BUSSES AND RAIL HAS TO BE
18 HANDLED DIFFERENTLY. BUSES ARE BASICALLY AN ESSENTIAL
19 LIFELINE. THERE IS NO TWO DAYS ABOUT IT AND LEAVING PEOPLE ON
20 THE SIDE OF THE ROAD BECAUSE THERE IS NOT ROOM FOR SOCIAL
21 DISTANCING ON THE BUSES. WILL WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THAT. I ASKED
22 THE QUESTION, HOW IS SOCIAL DISTANCING GOING, AND THEY TOLD
23 ME, IF WE HAVE TO OPERATE TRAINS AT 50 PERCENT, WE WILL NOT
24 SURVIVE. WE REALLY NEED TO BE IN 80 TO 90 PERCENT. RESULTS,
25 BASICALLY IS CATASTROPHIC. IN LONDON IT WAS 10,000 NEW CASES,



September 23, 2020

1 WHAT IS THE SOLUTION. LATER PLANNING TO ADDRESS THIS WHEN WE
2 TALK ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. ALL THE INFRASTRUCTURE, RAIL
3 INFRASTRUCTURE, A PORTION IS NOT DOING A LOT. WE START
4 STUDYING HOW WE CAN USE IT FOR GOODS MOVEMENT AND GENERATING
5 REVENUE THAT AWAY. I AM INCLUDING BART. BART IS SHIPPING SOME
6 KINDS OF GOODS WITH BART WHICH BY THE WAY IS BEING ELECTRIFIED
7 IS THE WAY THE GOODS ARE MOVING THROUGH THE SYSTEM NOW. THAT'S
8 MY TWO CENTS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAJ, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR HAND IS
11 RAISED. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. THIS IS -- I HOPE EVERYONE IS
14 SAFE AND DOING WELL. I WANT TO PROVIDE A BIT OF AN UPDATE NOW
15 THAT THE CARES ACT FUNDING HAS BEEN DISTURBED. OUR DISTRICT
16 HAS ADOPTED THE MTC RESOLUTION FOR OUR DISTRICT. IT'S STILL
17 FALLING SHORT IN MEETING ALL THE STATE AND COUNTY GUIDELINES.
18 WHAT'S EVEN MORE TROUBLING IS THAT THEY ARE NOW CONSIDERING
19 SERVICE CUTS INTO THE FUTURE AND THIS'S JUST NOT AT VTA BUT
20 ALL OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES AS WELL. ONE OF THE SOLE PURPOSES
21 OF THOSE MONEYS WAS TO MAINTAIN SERVICE ON THE STREETS. I'M
22 ASKING THE MTC TO PROVIDE OVERSIGHT AND HOLD THE TRANSIT
23 AGENCY'S ACCOUNTABLE TO PROVIDING A SAFE BUT MORE IMPORTANTLY
24 A RELIABLE SERVICE. AGENCIES THEMSELVES ARE SHRUGGING THEIR
25 RESPONSIBILITY. I WOULD ASK TO WITHHOLD FUNDING IF THE



September 23, 2020

1 AGENCIES THEMSELVES DON'T DO THE RIGHT THING. SO ONCE AGAIN,
2 I'M ASKING THE MTC TO PROVIDE THE MUCH NEEDED OVERSIGHT. THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA MALLEN,
6 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALLEN I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA
9 COUNTY AND AM SPEAKING FOR VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I
10 WANT TO TREAT THIS LIKE THE CRISIS IT IS I AM A TRANSIT RIDER
11 MYSELF AND AM WORRIED THERE WON'T BE ENOUGH MONEY, IS I'M
12 WORRIED IT'S ALMOST GOING TO BE IMPOSSIBLE TO GET AROUND AFTER
13 CUTS ARE MADE. MAIN TWO AGENCIES I USE ARE VTA AND CALTRAIN
14 RIGHT NOW VTA IS CONSIDERING CUTTING SERVICE BY 30 PERCENT AND
15 IF THEY DON'T PASS THE MEASURE RR. YOU HAVE THE POWER, PLEASE
16 MAKE SURE TRANSIT IS SAFE AND CUTS ARE PREVENTED. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS EUGENE BRADLEY. PLEASE
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS EUGENE BRADLEY FOUNDER AND CEO OF SILICON
22 VALLEY TRANSIT USERS. I DO A LOT OF BUSINESS IN SANTA CLARA
23 COUNTY EVEN THOUGH CURRENTLY NOW I LIVE IN MONTEREY COUNTY. IT
24 DISTURBS ME TO SEE MTC HAS NOT DONE VERY MUCH REGARDING HEALTH
25 TO KEEP THESE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES SAFE DURING THE COVID-



September 23, 2020

1 19 PANDEMIC. IT TROUBLES ME MORE THEY'RE CONSIDERING ASKING
2 EMPLOYERS TO ONLY ALLOW 60 PERCENT OF THEIR EMPLOYEES TO WORK
3 FROM HOME. WHAT HAPPENS TO THE OTHER 40 PERCENT OF EMPLOYEES,
4 SAY, LIKE, A WAITER OR GAS STATION ATTENDANT, OR EVEN SOMEBODY
5 -- OR A DOCTOR WHO CAN'T WORK FROM HOME, THEY HAVE TO GO IN
6 PHYSICALLY. THEIR TRANSIT FUNDING IS GOING TO BE CUT EVEN
7 MORE. IT'S TROUBLING TO HEAR THAT VTA AND OTHER TRANSIT
8 AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE NATION HAVE PROPOSED CUTTING THEIR
9 TRANSIT SERVICE WHILE MEANWHILE MTC CONTINUES TO DO THE SAME
10 OLD SAME OLD. I SAW A CARTOON YEARS AGO THAT DESCRIBES WHAT
11 MTC HAS TO DO WHICH FRANKLY, DON'T JUST STAND THERE, DO
12 SOMETHING. IT'S PAST THE TIME YOU DO SOMETHING TO MAKE SURE
13 RIDERS AND OPERATORS ARE SAFE AND MAKE SURE THERE IS FUNDING
14 FOR TRANSIT THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS ISABELLA CHIU
17 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ISABELLA CHU FOUNDER OF REDWOOD CITY BOARD
20 AND FREQUENT TRANSIT RIDER I BIKE AND TAKE THE TRAIL ALMOST
21 EVERYWHERE. FUNDAMENTAL PROBLEM WITH TRANSPORTATION IN THE
22 U.S. GENERALLY AND INCLUDING PROGRESSIVE AREAS LIKE THE BAY
23 AREA IS THAT WE HAVE GOT AN ALL YOU CAN EAT BUFFET AND
24 UNLIMITED SUBSIDIES FOR DRIVING AND TRANSIT IS FORCED TO FIGHT
25 FOR EVERY SCRAP AND NOT JUST TRANSIT, BEING BUT YOU KNOW,



September 23, 2020

1 WALKING, BIKING AND TRANSIT ARE LEFT FIGHTING FOR SCRAPS AND
2 THERE ARE SO MANY STRATEGIES AVAILABLE TO US INCLUDING PRICING
3 PARKING AT WHAT ITS WORTH ELIMINATING PARKING MINIMUMS, YOU
4 KNOW, STARTING TO PRICE DRIVING, IT'S SOMETHING LIKE ITS TRUE
5 COST, BUT THERE IS A TREMENDOUS RESISTANCE TO EVEN CONSIDERING
6 ANY OF THESE SORT OF STRATEGIES WHICH WOULD AT LEAST PUT
7 TRANSIT ON A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD WITH TRYING. -- DRIVING.
8 THAT'S THE FIRST THING. I HAVE A FLEXIBLE JOB, I LOVE WORKING
9 FROM HOME, I THINK THE IDEA OF MANDATING THAT 60 PERCENT OF
10 PEOPLE DO THAT IS ABSURD. CERTAINLY WE SHOULD MAKE IT
11 APPEALING, WE SHOULD, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY MAKE IT EASY TO DO,
12 AND AN OPTION. BUT TO MANDATE IT MAKES NO SENSE. AND THERE ARE
13 MANY OPPORTUNITIES AND OPTIONS AVAILABLE TO US THAT DON'T
14 INVOLVE DRACONIAN MEASURES WHICH PUNISH PEOPLE WHO CHOOSE NOT
15 TO DRIVE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. TWO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC SPEAKERS
18 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
19 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM MR. CHAIR.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WITH THAT I WILL CLOSE THE PUBLIC
22 COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION. I WOULD CERTAINLY
23 ASK IF THERE IS ANY COMMISSIONERS WITH COMMENTS? OKAY. I THINK
24 IT'S KIND OF A STRETCH TO MAKE COMMENTS SUCH AS MTC HAS DONE
25 NOTHING. I THINK MTC HAS DONE A LOT. I THINK, IF I'M THE



September 23, 2020

1 COMMISSIONER, I WAS THE ONE THAT SAID STAY IN YOUR LANE. I
2 WILL STAY IN MY LANE. I AM A FIRM BELIEVER. I KNOW IT'S FINE
3 TO COME TO MTC AND POUND AS OPPOSED TO GOING TO THE DIFFERENT
4 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND SPEAK WITH THEM. THAT'S WHERE THESE
5 COMMENTS NEED TO BE. WE HAVE PUT OUT CARES ACT FUNDING IN
6 RECORD TIME THROUGH THE GOOD WORK OF OUR STAFF, THERESE, ALIX,
7 AND OTHERS. WE HAVE FORMED A BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. I REALLY
8 BELIEVE MTC IS SHOWING LEADERSHIP IN THIS REGARD, AND I THINK
9 THAT'S ENOUGH SAID FROM ME. NICK THEN JIM.

10

11 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU CHAIR. SO I MAY HAVE MISSED
12 IT. IS THERE -- THE GUIDELINES DON'T REQUIRE TRANSIT AGENCIES
13 TO PROVIDE PPE TO RIDERS WHO NEED IT, EVEN THOUGH I KNOW A LOT
14 OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE DONE THAT, AC TRANSIT, VTA, SFMTA
15 AND OTHERS, IS THERE ANYWHERE ON THE DASHBOARD WHERE WE CAN GO
16 TO SEE WHICH TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE PROVIDING PPE, PROVIDE PPE
17 TO ALL THE RIDERS WHO NEED IT?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** AS I MENTIONED, THERESE MCMILLAN EXECUTIVE
20 DIRECTOR. -- THERE WILL BE LINKS TO EVERY SINGLE AGENCY'S
21 COVID-19 WEB PAGE. AND FOR THE AGENCIES THAT DO PROVIDE MASKS,
22 THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE ON THOSE LINKS. I DON'T KNOW IF
23 HANNAH IS -- WOULD COUNTER WHAT I JUST SAID, BUT THAT IS THE
24 PLACE WHERE THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE AVAILABLE ON A -- FOR
25 EACH AGENCY. AND IF PROVIDED IT WOULD BE POSTED THERE.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HANNAH'S BEEN UNMUTED SHE CAN RESPOND.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** CURRENTLY THAT'S NOT ON THE DASHBOARD ITSELF BUT
5 THERE WILL BE A LINK TO THE AGENCY AND ITS COVID RESPONSE.

6

7 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THE DASHBOARD IS TRYING TO BE A CENTRAL
8 REPOSITORY OF INFORMATION THAT SEEMS CRITICAL ELEMENT MAKING
9 SURE PEOPLE ARE WEARING MASKS AND HAVE ACCESS TO PPE IS THE
10 MOST EFFECTIVE THING THAT WE CAN DO AS A SOCIETY TO PREVENT
11 THE SPREAD OF COVID. SO I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS A NEXT
12 ITERATION OF THIS DASHBOARD. BUT I WOULD REALLY ADDRESS TO
13 INCLUDE THAT INFORMATION IN THE DASHBOARD IF IT'S NOT GOING ON
14 THE DASHBOARD GET A REPORT BACK TO THE COMMISSION ON IT.
15 BECAUSE I'M CERTAINLY INTERESTED IN IT AND I THINK WE NEED TO
16 KNOW IF TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE NOT DOING THAT. BECAUSE I DON'T
17 WANT TO ASSUME THAT THEY'RE NOT. BECAUSE THEY MAY ALL BE, BUT
18 I DON'T KNOW THAT. NO ONE HAS TOLD ME THAT. I HAVE BROUGHT
19 THIS UP IN PREVIOUS MEETINGS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND
20 THE COMMISSION. IT'S IMPORTANT TO KNOW IF TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
21 PROVIDING PPE TO RIDERS WHO NEED IT.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YEAH. I THINK THAT CERTAINLY -- I DON'T
24 THINK IT'S A BAD THING TO HAVE, ON THE DASHBOARD SAYING IF
25 THEY'RE GIVING OUT MASKS, BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO



September 23, 2020

1 UNDERSTAND THAT MASKS ARE AN ORDER, I HEALTH ORDER, AND WE'RE
2 ALL SUPPOSED TO BE WEARING MASKS. SO IT'S -- YOU KNOW, I MEAN,
3 BY THE TIME YOU GET TO THE TRANSIT AGENCY, WHETHER IT BE BART
4 OR A BUS, YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO HAVE YOUR MASK ON 30 MINUTES
5 BEFORE YOU GOT THERE. BUT I WOULD AGREE THAT, IN A CASE
6 SOMEONE BREAKS OR SOMETHING, THEY SHOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE SPARE
7 THE AIRS -- SPARES IN MY CAR. IF SOMEONE NEEDS ONE THEY CAN
8 GIVE THEM ONE. MAYBE WE SHOULD TAKE A LOOK AT THAT. SPERING,
9 WORTH, PAPAN.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO ECHO YOUR COMMENTS MR. CHAIR. I
12 THINK IT'S MISGUIDED TO SAY MTC HAS DONE NOTHING. EVERYBODY
13 HAS A TENDENCY TO FORGET THAT THESE ARE THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
14 HAVE DIRECTLY ELECTED BOARDS, THEY'RE APPOINTED BOARDS, MTC
15 HAS ABSOLUTELY NO AUTHORITY OVER THEM. WE CAN CERTAINLY GIVE
16 THEM GUIDANCE AND, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE REQUIRED THEM TO PUT THIS
17 CONSORTIUM TOGETHER, TO WHERE THEY DEVELOPED THIS HEALTH AND
18 SAFETY PLAN. I THINK THEY HAVE DONE AN OUTSTANDING JOB. AND IT
19 AMUSES ME THAT THE VERY PEOPLE COMPLAINING ABOUT THIS ARE THE
20 ONES DOING MORE DAMAGE TO THE TRANSIT OPERATORS THAN ANYBODY
21 ELSE. THEY KEEP PORTRAYING IT AS UNHEALTHY AND NOT SAFE AND IT
22 JUST ISN'T THE CASE. ALL OF MY TRANSIT AGENCIES REQUIRING
23 MASKS FOLLOWING IT STARTING TO GET RIDERSHIP BACK AND MOST
24 COUNTIES ARE DOING THAT. AND YOU KNOW, WE HAVE GOT CARES MONEY
25 OUT QUICKLY. WE'RE LOOKING AT THE ORGANIZATION, OPERATIONAL



September 23, 2020

1 STRUCTURE OF THESE OPERATIONS, AND SO MTC HAS REALLY INVESTED.
2 WE'RE ALSO WITH THE CARES MONEY, YOU KNOW, WE'RE PUTTING
3 TOGETHER A MARKETING CAMPAIGN, AND WE'RE LOOKING AT MANY
4 ISSUES. WE'RE GOING TO BE PUTTING TOGETHER SURVEYS TO WHERE
5 WE'RE SURVEYING EMPLOYEES, THE RIDERS, WE'RE GOING TO BE
6 LOOKING AT A REALTIME CAMPAIGN FOR THE ACTUAL OPERATIONS OF
7 THE TRANSIT AND THE HELP PROVIDE THE WAYFINDING FOR THE
8 OPERATORS. DEVELOPING COMMUNICATIONS FOR BOTH RIDERS AND
9 EMPLOYEES. I MEAN, THERE IS A WHOLE PLETHORA OF THINGS THAT
10 MTC IS PUTTING TOGETHER. AND ONE OF THE REASONS WE CAN'T BE
11 THE CONDUIT BETWEEN THE PEOPLE THAT YOU HEAR COMPLAINING AND
12 THE OPERATORS, IS THAT WE DON'T HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. AND WE'RE
13 DEVELOPING THIS RELATIONSHIP WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND I
14 THINK IT'S REALLY DEVELOPING, AND MATURING TO WHERE IT'S
15 BECOMING A VERY FUNCTIONAL AND RESPONSIVE RELATIONSHIP TO MAKE
16 THESE CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE FACING, AND I ALSO WANT TO END,
17 MR. CHAIRMAN, MTC DOES NOT HAVE ENOUGH MONEY TO BAIL OUT ONE
18 OF THESE AGENCIES MUCH LESS ALL OF THEM. WE DON'T HAVE THE
19 RESOURCES. WE'RE THE PLANNING ORGANIZATION. WE'RE NOT A
20 FUNDING OH THE MONEY TRAVELS THROUGH MTC, AND AS THERESE WILL
21 TELL YOU, WE CAN'T BAIL OUT ANYBODY OR MTC WILL NEED A BAIL
22 OUT. SO WE HAVE TO BE VERY CAUTIOUS AND WE HAVE TO WORK
23 CLOSELY TOGETHER. I DON'T THINK THERE IS A SINGLE PERSON ON
24 THIS COMMISSION THAT DOESN'T WANT TO SAVE EVERY SINGLE JOB WE
25 CAN, AND WE'RE PUTTING TOGETHER A STRONG ADVOCACY IN



September 23, 2020

1 SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON, D.C. AND IT WOULD BE GOOD IF WE
2 COULD ALL PULL TOGETHER TO ADDRESS THEE ISSUES BUT THERE IS NO
3 EASY SOLUTION TO THIS. AND MTC IS, YOU KNOW, OUR STAFF IS,
4 WHOING NIGHT AND DAY AND DOING AS MUCH AS THEY CAN TO HELP
5 FACILITATE, YOU KNOW, KEEPING THESE TRANSIT OPERATIONS GOING.
6 BUT IT IS A UNIQUE CHALLENGE THAT WE FACE. BUT THE CRITICISM
7 TO SAY MTC IS DOING NOTHING JUST IS NOT VALID, AND I THINK
8 IT'S VERY COUNTERPRODUCTIVE IF THEY KEEP HAMMERING ON THESE
9 OPERATIONS WHEN THEY'RE DOING A PRETTY DOG ON GOOD JOB AND
10 WE'RE NOT GETTING SPIKES FROM TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE VIRUS.
11 SO I WOULD JUST HOPE THAT MTC STAYS THE COURSE AND THAT WE
12 CONTINUE TO DO EVERYTHING THAT WE CAN IN THE CAPACITY THAT
13 WHAT WE HAVE. THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. SPERING. SPERING.
16 THERESE, I NOTICED YOU'RE IN THE QUEUE DID YOU WANT TO SAY
17 SOMETHING NOW OR DID YOU WANT TO WAIT.

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I COULD SAY SOMETHING AFTER THE
20 COMMISSIONERS HAVE.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU CHOOSE TO WAIT. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

23

24 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I WANT TO CONCUR WITH THE
25 PREVIOUS COMMENTS. I THINK THE COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION



September 23, 2020

1 WITH ALL OF THE AGENCIES AND MTC HAS BEEN HISTORIC. I LOOK
2 BACK AT THE RECORD AND I KNOW MANY OF US SERVED ON TRANSIT
3 BOARDS AND WE CARE DEEPLY ABOUT WORKER OPERATOR SAFETY AND
4 RIDER SAFETY. THIS IS ESSENTIAL IF GETTING OUR SYSTEMS BACK.
5 SECOND PIECE IS THE FEDERAL FUNDING. WE ABSOLUTELY NEED
6 ADDITIONAL STATE OR FEDERAL FUNDING TO SUSTAIN THESE
7 OPERATIONS. FINANCIAL CHALLENGES ARE STAGGERING, AND I KNOW
8 THEY'RE KEEPING OUR AGENCIES AWAKE, AND ESPECIALLY THE FINANCE
9 OFFICERS, LATE AT NIGHT, LOOKING AT NUMBERS AND SEEING HOW WE
10 CAN, YOU KNOW, MAINTAIN SERVICES. I DID ACCEPT DAVE'S
11 CHALLENGE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO REPORT, AS I COMMITTED HIM
12 TODAY, I AM WORKING ON THAT TASK. AND IT'S STILL IN PROGRESS.
13 I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO TOMORROW. IT'S BIKE TO ANYWHERE DAY.
14 RIDING MY BIKE FROM HOME TO THE BUS, GETTING ON THE BUS AND
15 RIDING BACK HOME AGAIN. I DO THINK OUR BOARD CARES DEEPLY, ALL
16 OF OUR COMMISSIONERS ABOUT RESTORING TRANSIT AND SUPPORTING
17 ALL OF THE TRANSIT INITIATIVE THAT CHAIR SPERING OF THE TASK
18 FORCE AND CHAIR HAGGERTY HAVE OUTLINED. ALSO, JUST WANT TO
19 POINT OUT, THAT I THINK THE OTHER THING I WANT TO POINT OUT
20 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE DOING
21 ARE LOOKING AT THE FINANCIAL AND OPERATIONAL ISSUES, WITH THE
22 LENS THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF EQUITY. AND I JUST
23 WANTED TO ADD TO OUR COMMENTS FROM OUR CITIZENS ADVISORY
24 COMMITTEE. ONE OF THE AREAS THAT'S PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT IS
25 PARATRANSIT. AND I KNOW THAT JUST RECENTLY SEVERAL AGENCIES



September 23, 2020

1 HAVE ADOPTED A PROGRAM WHERE IN THE PAST, YOU HAD TRANSFERS
2 FROM ONE COUNTY TO THE NEXT TO TAKE SOMEBODY FROM HOME TO AN
3 APPOINTMENT. WE'RE NOT PROVIDING A SEAMLESS TRANSPORTATION
4 BETWEEN, FROM ONE JURISDICTION TO ANOTHER. SO, I THINK THOSE
5 KINDS OF INNOVATIONS IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF SERVICE AND
6 OPERATIONS AND PROVIDING A SAFE TRAVELING ENVIRONMENT. I AGREE
7 WITH THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE AND WANT TO ASSURE
8 EVERYONE I THINK WE ALL WANT TO AND ARE CONTINUING TO WORK
9 HARD TO SUPPORT TRANSIT AND TO ENSURE ITS SURVIVAL DURING THIS
10 CRISIS TIME. SO THANK YOU.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH, AND I
13 ASSUME YOU'LL BE ROCKING THE NEW E-BIKE TOMORROW.

14

15 **AMY R. WORTH:** I WILL. I WILL. SO I CAN GET BACK UP THE HILL
16 WHEN I GET HOME.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I UNDERSTAND THAT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. VERY WELL SAID BY PRIOR COMMISSIONERS THERE.
21 I WISH WE HAD MORE ABILITY TO MAKE THESE AGENCIES ACCOUNTABLE
22 BUT AS POINTED OUT, THE AGENCIES AND THE BOARDS ARE THE ONES
23 MAKING DECISIONS AT THIS POINT IN TIME. AND AS SPERING POINTED
24 OUT WE HAVE LEGISLATORS ON THE BLUE RIBBON COMMISSION ASK WE
25 ARE TALKING ABOUT LEGISLATION IF THAT NEEDS TO BE THE WAY TO



September 23, 2020

1 MAKE THEM MORE ACCOUNTABLE BUT WE'RE DOING THE BEST WE CAN DO
2 ASSURE SUSTAINABILITY THERE ISN'T ENOUGH MONEY IN THE RECOVERY
3 SO PLEASE WORK WITH US AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN MAKE SHOULD
4 DIFFERENCE HERE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MCMILLAN?

7

8 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** MAYBE JUST TO WRAP UP. APPRECIATE HEARING
9 ALL THE COMMENTS. I WOULD SAY THAT, AGAIN, AS A REMINDER, THE
10 DASH -- CAN YOU HEAR ME -- I'M SORRY -- GOSH -- I -- OKAY --
11 I'M UNMUTED -- I THINK I'M UNMUTING MYSELF AT THE SAME TIME
12 KIMBERLY --

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NO YOU'RE WORKING FINE. SOMEBODY CAME
15 OVER YOU.

16

17 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SO, AGAIN, APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS FROM
18 EVERYONE. A COUPLE OF THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO CLARIFY. FIRST,
19 THAT, AS A REMINDER, THE DASHBOARD IS DEVELOPED BY THE TRANSIT
20 OPERATORS THEY DEVELOP IT CONTROL IT ARE COLLECTING THE DATA
21 ET CETERA I CAN BRING FORWARD TO THEM THE COMMENTS THAT
22 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS HAVE MENTIONED ABOUT MASKS
23 AND AVAILABILITY OF THAT INFORMATION SOMEHOW IN THE DASHBOARD.
24 SO I WILL COMMUNICATE THAT BACK TO THEM. IN ADDITION, BEING
25 WITH RESPECT TO THE INFORMATION ABOUT OPERATING REVENUE, AT



September 23, 2020

1 THE LAST BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE MEETING THAT SEVERAL OF THE
2 SPEAKERS IN FACT ARE A MEMBER OF, IT HAD BEEN ONE OF THE MAJOR
3 THINGS THAT WAS DISCUSSED AT THAT TIME, WAS THE FISCAL CLIFF.
4 AND THE IMPLICATIONS THAT IT HAD FOR SERVICES, AND THE TRANSIT
5 OPERATORS THEMSELVES, SPECIFICALLY POINTED TO THE NEED TO HAVE
6 A SURVIVAL STAGE, IF YOU WILL, A CONTINUING RECOVERY STAGE
7 THAT WILL HAVE TO MOVE ALONGSIDE ANY DISCUSSIONS WE HAVE ABOUT
8 REBUILDING, AS PART OF THE TASK FORCE'S AGENDA. AND AT THAT
9 TIME, THERE WAS A REQUEST FOR MTC STAFF TO BE ABLE TO BRING
10 FORWARD, BACK TO THE TASK FORCE, A CLARIFICATION OF WHAT
11 OPERATING REVENUE EXISTS, AND WHAT FLEXIBILITIES MIGHT THERE
12 BE TO BRING OTHER SOURCES TO BEAR TO SUPPLEMENT THOSE GIVEN
13 THE FACT THAT THERE ARE THESE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES FACING
14 NOT ONLY THE OPERATORS HERE, BUT EVERY TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE
15 STATE AND MANY ACROSS THE COUNTRY. SO, WE DID COMMIT TO
16 BRINGING THAT INFORMATION BACK TO THE NEXT BLUE RIBBON TASK
17 FORCE, AND ABSENT OTHER DIRECTION FROM COMMISSIONERS TODAY,
18 THAT WOULD BE WHERE WE WOULD BRING THAT INFORMATION. SO, THANK
19 YOU MR. CHAIR.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR
22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES IT DOES. THANK YOU.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M GOING TO DO SOMETHING I NEVER DO.
2 SAM, YOU MAY WANT TO CHANGE YOUR NAME. YOU DON'T LOOK LIKE
3 ESTELLA.

4
5 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU.

6
7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I AM ALLOWING TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.
8 THEN WE'RE DONE WITH PUBLIC HEARING ON THIS ISSUE. JUDITH,
9 UNMUTE YOURSELF AND SPEAK. YOUR HAND IS DOWN NOW. SO I'M
10 ASSUMING YOU'RE DONE.

11
12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I AM JUDITH. I HAVE BEEN ASKED TO JOIN THE
13 MEETING REGARDING CONCERNS OF ONE OF OUR OPERATORS WHO TESTED
14 POSITIVE FOR COVID-19. I WISH TO SHARE WITH YOU, THAT THE
15 CONTRACT IS WITH TRISTAR RISK MANAGEMENT WHO HANDLES ALL WORK
16 COMP MATTERS FOR VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY INCLUDING
17 FULL INVESTIGATIONS TO DETERMINE COMPENSABILITY. ON THE
18 INSTANCE AT HAND THE DATE OF INJURY WAS AUGUST 14TH INCIDENT
19 INVOLVED AN UNRULY PASSENGER THAT RESULTED IN THE ARREST OF
20 THE PASSENGER. WE WERE ABLE TO COMPILE THE COACH DATA, FILES
21 AND VIDEO AND WERE ABLE TO DETERMINE THE OPERATOR AND THE
22 PASSENGER WERE WEARING FACE MASKS WHEN THE ENCOUNTER OCCURRED
23 THAT THE OPERATOR WAS PROTECTED BY A COACH SHIELD. THERE WAS
24 NO CLOSE CONTACT BETWEEN THE PASSENGER AND THIS -- AND THE
25 OPERATOR. PASSENGER WAS ARRESTED BY THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY



September 23, 2020

1 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, AND TWO TESTS WERE PERFORMED ON THE
2 PASSENGER THAT DETERMINED THAT HE WAS FREE FROM COVID-19.
3 BASED ON THE CIRCUMSTANCES INVOLVED, OUR THIRD PARTY CLAIMS
4 ADMINISTRATOR STARS RISK DENIED THE CLAIM AS COMPENENSIBLE.
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. OKAY WITH THEY WILL NOW
8 LEAVE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT AND THANK HER FOR THAT
9 COMPREHENSIVE REPORT AND NOTE YOU WILL BE TAKING THINGS BACK
10 TO THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AS WAS STATED BY NICK. IT'S A START.
11 IT'S A WORK IN PROGRESS. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO COMMISSIONER
12 COMMENTS AND HOPE THAT MANY OF YOU ARE PRETTY MUCH COMMENTED
13 OUT AT THIS POINT. ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE ARE. OKAY. WE'RE
14 GOING TO GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO ITEM SIX. CONSENT CALENDAR. DO I
15 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE CONSENT? IS

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND, DUTRA-VERNACI.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I HAVE A MOTION BY MACKENZIE AND SECOND
22 BY DUTRA-VERNACI. I WILL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE IS ANYBODY WHO
23 HAS -- IF SHE'S RECEIVED ANY ITEMS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT
24 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM. I'LL ALSO ASK THE PUBLIC TO USE THE
25 RAISE HAND FEATURE OR STAR NINE. YOU'RE GOING TO GET TWO



September 23, 2020

1 MINUTES TO SPEAK AND THEN WE'LL DO A ROLL CALL. SO WITH THAT,
2 I NOTICED WE HAVE ONE ATTENDEE. DO YOU HAVE ANY WRITTEN --
3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE -- SORRY -- I HAVE NO WRITTEN
5 PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM. AND I DO SEE THE ONE MEMBER OF
6 THE PUBLIC WITH THE RAISED HAND. JOHN COURTNEY. PLEASE UNMUTE
7 YOURSELF.

8
9 **SPEAKER:** YEAH THIS IS JOHN COURTNEY FROM ATU. I WANT TO THANK
10 VTA. I WISH I HAD THAT POWER TO DISAPPEAR EIGHT BOARD MEETING.
11 THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. I WAS NOT ABLE TO GET ANY
12 INFORMATION PRIOR. IT WAS MY IMPRESSION THAT AN ASSAULT TOOK
13 PLACE. WERE SAFETY REGULATIONS VIOLATED. I IMPLORE VTA TO SIT
14 DOWN WITH US SO WE CAN WORK ON SOME OF THESE CASES WHERE THE
15 FRUSTRATION LEVEL AND THE FAMILIES AND RELATIVES ARE CALLING
16 THE UNION AND CALLING THE COMPANY. SIT DOWN WITH US LET'S TALK
17 ABOUT THESE CASES ON AN INDIVIDUAL BASIS WE HAVE A MEETING
18 WITH THE GENERAL MANAGER NEXT WEEK AND WE DID AGENDAIZE THOSE
19 ITEMS. I WANT TO THANK VTA FOR BRINGING RISK MANAGEMENT INTO
20 THIS CONVERSATION. I APPRECIATE THAT.

21
22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WE'RE ON CONSENT NOW. WE HAVE KIND OF
23 MOVED O THANK YOU JOHN. OKAY. SO WITH THAT I HAD A MOTION. I
24 BELIEVE IT WAS MACKENZIE DUTRA-VERNACI. FINE SCOTTISH DUO.
25 WITH THAT I'LL CALL FOR A ROLL CAUGHT VOTE, PLEASE.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WE'LL MOVE TO 7A AND B PROGRAMMING AND
5 ALLOCATIONS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

6

7 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** JUST PULLING UP MY SCRIPT BECAUSE I
8 NEVER KNOW WHAT TO SAY UNLESS SOMEONE TELLS ME EXACTLY WHAT TO
9 SAY. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY
10 SEPTEMBER 9TH 2020, AND REFERS THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO THE
11 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. MTC RESOLUTION 4402 REVISED UPDATES
12 FUND ESTIMATE TO INCORPORATE FY 19/20 REVENUE FOR THE STATE
13 TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMS AND
14 REVISED FY 20/21 REVENUE ESTIMATES. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC
15 RESOLUTION 4402 REVISED. I CAN ALSO MOVE THE SECOND ONE AT THE
16 SAME TIME IF YOU WANT TO CHAIR HAGGERTY.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NICK, WE CAN TRY THAT. BUT WE ALWAYS
19 GET IN TROUBLE WHEN WE DO IT. GO AHEAD.

20

21 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MTC RESOLUTIONS 4429 REVISED 4430
22 REVISED, 4431 REVISED, AND 4432 REVISED TO ALLOCATE \$139
23 MILLION IN FY 2021 TDA, STA, RM2 AND AB 1107 FUNDS TO FIVE
24 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE SOLANO TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY TO
25 SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION



September 23, 2020

1 IN ADDITION A RECISSION ACTION OF \$5.6 MILLION IN STA FUNDS
2 FROM MTC'S CLIPPER PROGRAM TO ALLOW FOR THE REDIRECTION OF
3 THESE FUNDS TO THE CLIPPER START MEANS BASED FARE PILOT. I
4 MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION, 4429 REVISED, 4430 REVISED,
5 4431 REVISED, AND 4432 REVISED.

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I'LL SECOND THOSE.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I DON'T SEE ANYBODY WISHING TO SPEAK.
10 ANYTHING SUBMITTED IN WRITING KIMBERLY?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVE TO ITEM 8A
19 JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE MEETING WITH THE ABAG
20 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER SPERING.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN, THE JOINT MTC
23 PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MET
24 ON SEPTEMBER 11TH AND THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE REFERRED ONE
25 ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THIS IS AN AGENDA ITEM



September 23, 2020

1 8A, MTC RESOLUTION 4437, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL
2 BLUEPRINT. REVISIONS DISCUSSED IN THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
3 FINAL BLUEPRINT. SUMMER 2020 ENGAGEMENT AND PROPOSED REVISION.
4 RESOLUTION ADOPTS THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST. STAFF WILL
5 THEN ANALYZE THIS PACKAGE EVER FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AND
6 REPORT BACK ON FORECASTED OUTCOMES BY THE END OF 2020. AT
7 WHICH TIME, STAFF WILL SEEK APPROVAL OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS
8 PREFERRED ALTERNATIVE IN THE CONTEXT OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA
9 2050 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT. THE COMMITTEE'S UNANIMOUS
10 RECOMMENDATION APPROVAL OF THE ITEM TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
11 BOARD AND COMMISSION WITH AN AMENDMENT FROM COMMISSIONER
12 LICCARDO REQUESTING PRIORITIZATION OF FUNDING FOR CALTRAIN
13 GRADE SEPARATIONS FOR PROJECTS THAT SERVE THE DUAL PURPOSE OF
14 CONNECTING HIGH SPEED RAIL TO THE BAY AREA IN IMPROVING THE
15 CALTRAIN SYSTEM. THIS AMENDMENT WAS REFERRED TO IN THE
16 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. I BELIEVE YOU ALL RECEIVED A COPY OF
17 THE BACKGROUND MATERIAL, 8A, IT WAS A PRETTY GOOD DESCRIPTION
18 AND I BELIEVE MATT MALONEY IS GOING TO GIVE US A BRIEF
19 PRESENTATION. AND I THINK IT'S A PRETTY GOOD COMPROMISE THAT
20 WAS WORKED OUT WITH COMMISSIONER LICCARDO AND STAFF.

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** GOOD MORNING MATT MALONEY JOINED BY DAVE VAUTIN.
23 MTC AND ABAG MET JOINTLY IN REFERRING AN ACTION TO YOU TODAY
24 THIS REFERS A MAJOR MILESTONE IN WORK YOU HAVE BEEN ENGAGED
25 WITH EVERY STEP OF THE WAY. ACTION BEFORE TO YOU TODAY IS TO



September 23, 2020

1 APPROVE A SET OF STRATEGY FOR THE FORECASTED PLANNED BAY AREA
2 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT ONCE APPROVED WE WILL MOVE FORWARD TO
3 ANNOUNCE THE FINAL RESULTS IN DECEMBER AND ANNOUNCE THE PLAN
4 AS WE MOVE INTO THE FINAL PROCESS. WE ALSO MADE SIMILAR
5 DETAILED PRESENTATIONS TO THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND
6 THE ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE. LASTLY, I WILL MENTION
7 THAT THIS ITEM, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WAS ALSO APPROVED BY YOUR
8 COLLEAGUES OVER AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD LAST WEEK. PLANNED
9 BAY AREA 2050 IS A LONG RANGE 30 YEAR PLAN ENSURING THAT THE
10 BAY AREA IS CONNECT, DIVERSE, HEALTHY CONNECT AND VIBRANT FOR
11 ALL. REPORT INCLUDED FEEDBACK FROM THE PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS
12 RECEIVED OVER THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER. COVID-19 PANDEMIC
13 MEANT THAT WE HAD TO RECALIBRATE OUR OUTREACH STRATEGY TO
14 VIRTUAL ENVIRONMENT. WE HELD NINE COUNTY SPECIFIC WORKSHOPS
15 THREE DIGITAL STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS
16 AND SEVEN FOCUS GROUPS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
17 ORGANIZATIONS RAN A STATISTICALLY VALID POLL IN ALL NINE
18 COUNTIES BASED ON STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT.
19 POLL RESULTS WERE SHARED AND DISCUSSED WITH MTC PLANNING
20 COMMITTEE AS PART OF THE ITEM EARLIER THIS MONTH. RESULTING IN
21 7600 PARTICIPANT IN ALL ACTIVITIES IN 3600 COMMENTS RECEIVED.
22 OUR BIGGEST CHALLENGES IN THE BLUEPRINT CONCERNS THAT ROSE TO
23 THE TOP AFFORDABILITY ON THE HOUSING FRONT AND CONCERNS ABOUT
24 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION IN CLIMATE CHANGE. WE BELIEVE THE
25 FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES BEFORE YOU TODAY HELPS TACKLE THOSE



September 23, 2020

1 INVESTMENT IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION
2 AND JUMP-STARTING DEVELOPMENT ON PUBLICLY OWNED AND COMMUNITY
3 LAND ON HOMES. GAP WE FACE IN THE REGION IS A SERIOUS HILL TO
4 CLIMB. OUR ROLE AS A REGION IS FOR THIS PLAN TO ACHIEVE A
5 FORECASTED 19 PERCENT PER CAPITA GHG REDUCTION BY THE YEAR
6 2035. THIS MUST BE ACCOMPLISHED THROUGH GHG REDUCTIONS FROM
7 CARS AND LIGHT DUTY TRUCKS THE STRATEGIES MUST BE ONES THAT
8 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ARE POISED TO DELIVER WE CAN'T TAKE CREDIT
9 FOR MANY OF THE CHANGES MADE ON THE STATEWIDE NATIONAL OR
10 INTERNATIONAL LEVEL WE MUST INCLUDE POLICIES AND INVESTMENT
11 THAT SHOW WHAT THE REGION CAN DO TO MEET THE GOAL. OUR
12 STRATEGY FOR ACHIEVING THE GHG GOAL THIS TIME IS EVERYTHING
13 INCLUDING THE KITCHEN SINK. STRATEGIES ARE INDEED BOLD AND
14 UNFLINCHING TO USE THE COMMISSIONARY TERMINOLOGY. STARTING
15 POINT FOR ACHIEVING THIS IS AN EXTREMELY FOCUSED PATTERN OF
16 HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH BASED AROUND PROXIMITY TO HIGH QUALITY
17 TRANSIT SERVICE HOWEVER THIS ALONE WILL NOT BE SUFFICIENT TO
18 REACH THE TARGET THEREFORE WE HAVE INCLUDED NEW STRATEGIES
19 SUCH AS ROBUST TELEWORK STRATEGY AND INCREASED EMPHASIS ON THE
20 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM TO COMPLIMENT THE LAND USE PATTERN AND
21 THE PLAN'S MAJOR INVESTMENT IN PUBLIC TRANSIT. THESE
22 STRATEGIES TAKEN AS A WHOLE ARE GAME CHANGING AND AS STAFF OUR
23 VIEW IS THAT THESE STRATEGIES ARE ABSOLUTELY NECESSARY
24 COMPONENTS TO ACHIEVING OUR GHG GOAL. COMMITTEES UNANIMOUSLY
25 RECOMMENDED APPROVAL OF THIS ITEM TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD



September 23, 2020

1 AND COMMISSION WITH AN AMENDMENT FROM COMMISSIONER LICCARDO.
2 AT THIS POINT I WANT TO TOUCH ON THAT AMENDMENT. AT COMMITTEE
3 OUR TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES INCLUDED A ROBUST SET OF
4 INVESTMENTS SERVING THE SOUTH BAY WHICH IS POISED TO RECEIVE A
5 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF GROWTH IN THIS PLAN. THOSE INVESTMENTS
6 INCLUDED A MIX OF COUNTY AND REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING
7 FOR CALTRAIN, HIGH SPEED RAIL INVESTMENTS THROUGHOUT THE
8 CORRIDOR AS WELL AS RAMPED UP INVESTMENTS IN THE VTA LIGHT
9 RAIL SYSTEM IN RESPONSE TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO'S AMENDMENT
10 ACTIVITY STAFF HAS CLARIFIED SPECIFICS OF SOME OF THE FUNDING
11 WHICH IS ASSIGNED IN THE PLAN FIRST WE ARE CLARIFYING THAT 4.1
12 BILLION IN REGIONAL FUNDING FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS CAN ALSO BE
13 USED FOR OTHER MODERNIZATION EFFORTS THAT BENEFIT CALTRAIN AND
14 THE HIGH SPEED RAIL ON THE EXTENT OF THE CORRIDOR. WE ALSO
15 EXPANDED THE TOTAL AMOUNT OF FUNDING ASSIGNED FOR CALTRAIN AND
16 HIGH SPEED RAIL CAPITAL PROJECTS BY 3 BILLION. THIS WAS DONE
17 BY REDUCING THE SCOPE OF NORTH SAN JOSE VTA LIGHT RAIL TO A
18 COMMENSURATE AMOUNT. THAT WOULD BE ASSIGNED SPECIFICALLY TO
19 THE SEGMENT SOUTH OF TAMIEN STATION AND COULD BE USED FOR A
20 POTENTIAL ARRAY OF INVESTMENTS. 7.1 BILLION IN REGIONAL
21 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING INCLUDES HIGH SPEED RAIL DUAL PURPOSE
22 INVESTMENTS FROM SOUTH TO NORTH TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS
23 IDENTIFIED BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO RELATED TO THIS MOTION.
24 FURTHERMORE THIS 7.1 BILLION IN FUNDING COULD SEPARATE GRADE
25 INTEGRATIONS SOUTH OF DIRIDON IN SAN JOSE. LASTLY WE WANT TO



September 23, 2020

1 UNDERScore THE REGION'S EXISTING COMMITMENT TO A BLENDED
2 SYSTEM ON THE PENINSULA CORRIDOR THIS AGREEMENT MEMORIALIZED
3 IN A NINE PARTY MOU IDENTIFIES INVESTMENTS IN THE TRANSIT IN
4 SAN JOSE GIVEN THIS PROPOSED AMENDMENT WOULD ASSIGN PLANNED
5 BAY AREA 2050 REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY INVESTMENT TO THE
6 CORRIDOR SOUTH OF TAMIEN STATION MTC STAFF WOULD ENCOURAGE
7 NINE PARTIES TO COOPERATE ON POTENTIAL UPDATES TO THE MOU TO
8 INCORPORATE THE EXPANDED GEOGRAPHIC. OUR RECOMMENDATION TODAY
9 IS TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4437 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL
10 FURTHERMORE WE ALSO RECOMMEND MTC WORK WITH THE OTHER MEMBERS
11 OF THE NINE PARTY MOU UPDATE THE AGREEMENT WITH THE BAY AREA
12 INTEGRATE CALTRAIN CORRIDOR SOUTH OF SAN JOSE AND ANY OTHER
13 ADJUSTMENTS DEEMED NECESSARY.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE CHAIR IS MUTED. MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** KIMBERLY, I THINK HE STEPPED OUT FOR A
18 SECOND. I WILL JUMP RIGHT IN. AND I'LL ASK CHAIR SPERING DO
19 YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO REPORT UNDER YOUR CHAIR COMMITTEE
20 REPORT.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I'LL MAKE A MOTION.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'LL OPEN IT UP FOR COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. WE
25 HAVE A FEW. I'M GOING TO START WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. JUST FOR CLARIFICATION, ON
3 THAT LAST AMENDMENT PROPOSED BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, SO, THE
4 EXISTING FUNDING FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS THROUGHOUT SAN MATEO
5 COUNTY IS -- WHERE IS THAT?

6

7 **MATT MALONEY:** THOSE EXISTING GRADE SEPARATIONS ARE INCLUDED IN
8 THE PROJECT LIST OF THE PLAN. THERE ARE \$5.7 BILLION IN THE
9 PLAN FOR GRADE SEPARATIONS AND MODERNIZATION ALONG THE
10 ENTIRETY OF THE CORRIDOR. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER LICCARDO DOES
11 STIPULATE THAT AN ADDITIONAL 3 BILLION ON TOP OF THAT AMOUNT
12 WOULD BE DEDICATED TO INVESTMENTS SOUTH OF TAMIEN.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** SO NO DEFERMENT OF FUNDS FOR THE REST OF THE GRADE
15 CROSSINGS?

16

17 **MATT MALONEY:** NO.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. MR. CHAIR, BEFORE
20 THIS GETS AHEAD, I HAVE ISSUES RELATED TO THE PLAN SHOULD I
21 ADDRESS THEM NOW?

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I THINK CHAIR HAGGERTY IS BACK. GO AHEAD.

24



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MY VICE CHAIR IS GOING TO SAY IF
2 THEY'RE RELEVANT TO THIS ITEM GO AHEAD AND GO.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD ASK THAT WE ADD AN
5 AMENDMENT, CAN YOU PLEASE INCLUDE AIRPORT IN THE MAPPING OF
6 THE PLAN? FOR SOME REASON THAT KEEPS GETTING LEFT OUT. I WAS
7 TOLD THAT IMPROVING ACCESS TO AIRPORTS IS PART OF THE PLAN.
8 SO, BUT IT JUST SEEMS RIDICULOUS THAT WE DO NOT INCLUDE MAJOR
9 ASPECTS, AND THOSE ARE THE THREE AIRPORTS ON THE DIAGRAM.
10 THAT'S ONE PRIMARY ISSUE THERE. SECONDARILY THERE WAS A
11 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE CITY OF BRISBANE, AND I, FOR ONE, AM
12 VERY, VERY HESITANT TO GO AHEAD WITH A PLAN THAT SAYS WE'RE
13 GOING TO BE WORKING IT OUT WITH CITIES. WE SHOULD HAVE DONE
14 THAT AT A PRIOR TIME HERE. TO BE SPECIFIC THE LAND THAT
15 BRISBANE HAS DOUBLES THE POPULATION SIZE AND WHAT IS BEING
16 PROPOSED IN THE PLAN FAR EXCEEDS THAT AND INCLUDES LAND WHICH
17 IS NOT DEVELOPABLE. IT IS TOXIC, AND HAZARDOUS. SO, YOU KNOW,
18 I'M FRUSTRATED BY THE FACT THAT THEY'RE BEING ASSESSED A HUGE
19 NUMBER OF HOUSING UNITS WHERE YOU CANNOT BUILD ON THERE AND IN
20 ADDITION THAT, THERE IS A REPRESENTATION THAT STAFF SEEMS TO
21 BE ACCEPTING THAT, OH, EVERYBODY'S GOING TO WORK IT OUT WITH
22 HIGH SPEED RAIL. WELL, WE HAVE ALL TRIED THAT AND I DON'T
23 THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE. RIGHT NOW HIGH SPEED RAIL HAS SAID
24 THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE THAT LAND FROM BRISBANE AND ALSO SAID
25 THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE LAND FROM MILLBRAE, SO TO SAY IN THE



September 23, 2020

1 PLAN WHICH GOES TEN YEARS FORWARD HERE, THAT WE STILL HAVE
2 CERTAIN HOUSING REQUIREMENTS ON LAND WHICH IS BASICALLY TRYING
3 TO BE TAKEN BY HIGH SPEED RAIL, CAN SOMEONE PLEASE ADDRESS
4 THAT FOR ME? >DAVE VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THIS IS DAVE
5 VAUTIN WITH THE PLANNING TEAM AT MTC. I WANT TO ADDRESS BOTH
6 OF YOUR POINTS. I THINK WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO INDICATE THE
7 AIRPORTS ON FUTURE MAPS THAT WE INCLUDE IN THE PLANNED BAY
8 AREA 2050 DOCUMENT SO WE'LL RECOGNIZE THAT AND WE'LL MAKE THAT
9 CORRECTION GOING FORWARD. WITH REGARDS TO THE CITY OF
10 BRISBANE, ALL CITIES IN THE REGION HAD AN EXTENSIVE PERIOD OF
11 TIME TO REVIEW INPUT DATA TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO AN
12 INITIATIVE CALLED BASAS THIS OCCURRED OVER A FOUR TO 6 MONTH
13 PERIOD IN 2019 WHERE JURISDICTIONS COULD DIG INTO THE DATA AND
14 GIVE FEEDBACK. WE DIDN'T GET ANY FEEDBACK ON SOME OF THESE
15 PARCELS IN QUESTION FROM BRISBANE DURING THAT JUNCTURE AND
16 BRISBANE DID RAISE THIS OVER THE COURSE OF THE SUMMER AND WE
17 HAVE BEEN WORKING TO CLARIFY THE SPECIFIC PARCEL AND USES.
18 WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THEM ON THAT. WE DIDN'T GET THE
19 FEEDBACK DURING THE COMMENT PERIOD DURING THAT PERIOD IN 2019
20 WE'RE LOOKING TO FIND A RESOLUTION TO THAT IN THE FINAL
21 BLUEPRINT PHASE NOW.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THE WORD YOU USED WAS FINAL. AND THAT CONCERNS ME.
24 WE'RE BEING ASKED TO APPROVE A FINAL HERE. THIS CONCERNS ME
25 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO CHANGE THE FACT THAT THE LAND



September 23, 2020

1 IS CURRENTLY UNUSABLE FOR HOUSING. IT'S TOXIC. I'M LOOKING FOR
2 AN AMENDMENT THAT ADDRESSES THAT NOW. IS THAT POSSIBLE? >DAVE
3 VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER, I THINK THE ISSUE IS WE HAVE NOT
4 RECEIVED ENOUGH INFORMATION ABOUT THE SPECIFIC PARCELS FROM
5 BRISBANE AND WE'RE CONTINUING TO TALK TO THEM ABOUT THAT.
6 WE'RE MORE THAN HAPPY TO REMOVE PERMANENTLY INDUSTRIAL PARCELS
7 LIKE THE PG&E SUBSTATION AND THE POTENTIAL HIGH SPEED RAIL
8 YARD ON THE LANDS YOU'RE REFERRING TO HOWEVER THERE ARE A
9 NUMBER OF LANDS THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED IN THE CITY AS THE
10 BAY LANDS SITE FOR FUTURE HOUSING THAT REMAIN CRITICAL PIECES
11 OF THE PUZZLE HERE. SO WE CAN COMMIT TO CONTINUING THAT
12 DIALOGUE WITH THEM AS WE CONDUCT THE ANALYSIS OF THIS FINAL
13 BLUEPRINT, OR WE WOULD WANT TO WORK TOWARDS A RESOLUTION THIS
14 FALL BEFORE WE COME BACK TO YOU IN DECEMBER ON THE FINAL
15 BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. PLEASE. I NEED THAT RESOLUTION BECAUSE
18 EVIDENTLY THEY WORKED IT OUT WITH THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE. FINAL
19 NOTE HERE IS THE REQUIREMENT THAT 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS
20 TELECOMMUTE. AND, THERE IS NO -- I MEAN -- IT WAS MENTIONED
21 EARLIER, THE IMPACT THAT MIGHT HAVE, WELL, THE BRIDGES, ALSO,
22 THE IMPACT THAT IT HAS ON VARIOUS COMPANIES, AS WELL AS THE
23 FACT THAT WE'RE NOT EVEN SAYING AS AN ALTERNATIVE OR ENCOURAGE
24 THEM TO GET ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SO, IT'S JUST KIND OF --
25 IT'S A TOO GENERAL STATEMENT WITHOUT ANY MODIFICATION TO



September 23, 2020

1 ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AS AN
2 ALTERNATIVE, OR JUST, I CAN'T SUPPORT THIS IN THE WAY IT'S
3 CURRENTLY WRITTEN. I GUESS, I GET THE POINT, GREENHOUSE
4 GASSES, WE WANT THAT -- WE DON'T WANT THAT. WE WANT TO REDUCE
5 THEM. BUT JUST TO SAY OUTRIGHT WE'RE GOING TO REQUIRE 60
6 PERCENT TO TELECOMMUTE. THAT'S PROBLEMATIC. SO I HAVE
7 DIFFICULTY SUPPORTING THAT AND AS A LAST NOTE -- SORRY MR.
8 CHAIRMAN -- I CAN'T FIND IT I'LL HAVE TO COME BACK TO IT. I
9 DON'T WANT TO HOLD EVERYBODY UP.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WELL, WE'LL SEE HOW THAT GOES. GOING TO
12 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

13

14 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I JUST WANTED TO LET EVERYBODY KNOW THAT
15 RATHER THAN GETTING A HAIRCUT, I HAVE PUT ON A HAT. SAME
16 PURPOSE.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THAT WAS A COUPLE MEETINGS AGO.

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SO WE GET A --

21

22 **SAM LICCARDO:** I STILL SUPPORT THE HAIRCUT.

23

24 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I HAVE LOCAL CONTROL OVER MY OWN HAIR.

25 SO, I'M -- YOU KNOW, WE GET TO THE END OF THESE PROCESSES, AND



September 23, 2020

1 I THINK WE FOCUS ON THE THINGS THAT AREN'T RIGHT WITH THE PLAN
2 BUT I WANT TO START OFF BY COMMENDING STAFF FOR DOING AN
3 INCREDIBLE JOB IN A DIFFICULT MOMENT IN A THORNY SET OF ISSUES
4 TO SET BROADLY ASPIRATIONAL VISIONS OF HOW WE GET TO THE
5 PROBLEMS IN OUR REGION. I THINK IT'S A REALLY POWERFUL
6 DOCUMENT. I ALSO WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER LICCARDO FOR
7 RAISING THE ISSUES AROUND HIGH SPEED RAIL BECAUSE I THINK THIS
8 REGION REALLY NEEDS A PLAN FOR HOW WE GET HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO
9 OUR REGION. AND IF WE JUST SIT ON OUR HANDS AND WAIT FOR THE
10 TRAIN TO COME, WE'LL BE WAITING A LONG TIME, AND IT'S
11 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE COME TOGETHER AS A REGION TO MAKE
12 -- TO DO WHAT WE CAN TO MAKE SURE IT COMES HERE AND COMES HERE
13 FIRST. SO, HAVING SAID THAT, AND YOU MAY HAVE ALREADY SAID
14 THIS MATT, BUT I HAVE BEEN A BIT CONFUSED BY THESE LAST MINUTE
15 CHANGES, AND I GET INTO THE SORT OF EDITS OF THIS ELEMENT LAST
16 NIGHT, THE \$4 BILLION, JUST, RUN MU THROUGH WHERE THAT'S --
17 HOW -- WHERE THAT'S GOING, AND WHAT ITS PRIORITIZED FOR, AND
18 WHAT DOES PRIORITIZATION MEAN? DOES THAT MEAN WE'RE GOING TO
19 MARCH OUR WAY UP FROM THE SOUTH AND NOT FUND ANY PROJECTS FROM
20 THE NORTH UNTIL WE FUND PROJECTS FROM THE SOUTH. HOW DOES THAT
21 WORK?

22

23 **MATT MALONEY:** WE HAVE A SLIDE, I'LL ASK KIMBERLY WARD, IF YOU
24 HAVE THAT SLIDE, TO POP IT UP ON THE SCREEN OR TECH SUPPORT IF
25 THAT'S APPROPRIATE.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

3

4 **MATT MALONEY:** I'M HOPING EVERYONE CAN SEE THIS SLIDE. I'LL
5 KEEP THIS UP AND DAVE VAUTIN FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN AND AUGMENT
6 ANYTHING I MISSED. WHAT WE'RE SHOWING HERE IS ESSENTIALLY THE
7 CHANGES WE HAVE MADE THIS MONTH BETWEEN THE COMMITTEE ITEM AND
8 THE COMMISSION ITEM. SO YOU WILL NOTICE, IN THE TOP BAR, THERE
9 IS A SET OF INVESTMENTS FOR CALTRAIN HIGH SPEED RAIL SYSTEM
10 WIDE GRADE SEPARATIONS. THERE IS SOME COUNTY BUDGET DOLLARS
11 ASSIGNED TO THAT IN THE PLAN, BOTH FROM SAN MATEO AND SANTA
12 CLARA. AS WELL AS 4.1 MILLION REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY. OVER ON
13 THE RIGHT SIDE IN BETWEEN AND YELLOW, YOU WILL SEE THERE IS A
14 SET OF INVESTMENTS INCLUDED FOR VTA LIGHT RAIL NORTH SAN JOSE
15 MOD AND DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE MODERNIZATION. BOTTOM INDICATES WHAT
16 WE'RE PROPOSING TODAY INCLUDING THE AMENDMENT OF COMMISSIONER
17 LICCARDO. ESSENTIALLY, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT IS
18 THE BLACK PARENTHESIS ON THE BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN THAT SHOWS
19 OF THE 7.1 BILLION IN THE EXPANSION TO 7.1 IS DONE IN PART BY
20 A DOWN SCOPING OF THE VTA LIGHT RAIL NORTH SAN JOSE MOD
21 PROJECT. THAT PROJECT IS STILL IN THE PLAN IT JUST DOES NOT
22 ASSUME SOME OF THE INFRASTRUCTURE IN SERVICE THAT WOULD GO
23 INTO IT. THAT 3 BILLION COMES OVER FROM VTA THAT BECOMES 7
24 BILLION AND WE HAVE A BIGGER AMOUNT OF INVESTMENTS BUT KEY
25 POINT MINIMUM AMOUNT 3 BILLION WOULD BE USED FOR CALTRAIN AND



September 23, 2020

1 HIGH SPEED RAIL SOUTH OF TAMIEN. DAVE, IF THERE IS ANYTHING I
2 MISSED THERE THAT I SHOULD HAVE POINTED OUT THAT I DIDN'T
3 PLEASE POINT IT OUT.

4

5 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** COULD YOU POINT OUT HOW YOU SEEING IT
6 APPLIED.

7

8 **MATT MALONEY:** WHEN YOU SAY PRIORITIZATION IN THE STRATEGIES.

9

10 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I DON'T HAVE IT IN FRONT OF ME. IT SAID
11 PRIORITIZATION --

12

13 **SAM LICCARDO:** ATTACHMENT "I" MAY BE HELPFUL. IT'S PAGE 12 OF
14 ATTACHMENT "I."

15

16 **MATT MALONEY:** I'M PULLING IT UP AND IF DAVE PULLS IT UP
17 QUICKER FEEL FREE TO RUN THROUGH THAT.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SAM DO YOU HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT
20 THAT IS.

21

22 **SAM LICCARDO:** NICK AND I TALK ABOUT THIS. THIS IS VARIOUS
23 STRATEGIES ON ATTACHMENT I, STRATEGY 11 IS THE EXPAND AND
24 MODERNIZE REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK DESCRIBED ON PAGE 12 AND I
25 THINK THIS'S THE LANGUAGE THAT NICK IS REFERRING TO.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **MATT MALONEY:** ONE OF THE IMPORTANT PIECES HERE IS THIS AS THE
3 STRATEGY SAYS IT FUNDS CAPITAL, MODERNIZATION PROJECTS ALONG
4 THE CORRIDOR PRIORITIZING DUAL PURPOSE INVESTMENTS SOUTH TO
5 NORTH THAT CONNECT HIGH SPEED RAIL TO THE BAY AREA. I THINK
6 THE INCUMBENT IN THIS CONVERSATION IS VERY IMPORTANT TO POINT
7 OUT IS THE FACT THAT WE AS A REGION HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING OF
8 HOW WE INVEST IN THE CORRIDOR THAT NINE PARTIES HAVE AGREED
9 TO. THERE IS NO DOUBT THIS AMENDMENT ALTERS THE CENTER OF
10 GRAVITY OF THIS CONVERSATION. AND THIS IS A LONG RANGE OF PLAN
11 OF 30 YEARS WHAT'S HAPPENING TODAY IS A POLICY MARKER THAT
12 ILLUSTRATES THE IMPORTANCE OF BRINGING HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO
13 THE BAY AREA, AND INVESTMENTS TO THE SOUTH OF TAMIEN. BUT, YOU
14 KNOW, I WOULD SUBMIT THAT WHAT IS REALLY REQUIRED,
15 PRACTICALLY, IS FOR THE PARTIES TO COME TOGETHER TO HASH THIS
16 OUT. PLAN IS OBVIOUSLY -- THIS IS PLANNING, INVESTMENT, POLICY
17 MARKER DOLLARS. THIS IS NOT AN ALLOCATION OF DOLLARS AT THIS
18 STAGE. SO THAT TYPE OF COORDINATION IS GOING TO BE VERY
19 IMPORTANT TO FLESH THIS OUT.

20

21 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. I THINK FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I
22 WOULD HAVE A PROBLEM IF IT WAS LIKE, YOU KNOW, THIS REGIONAL
23 DISCRETIONARY PART, WE WOULD JUST, LIKE, STARTING WITH THE
24 SOUTH MOST GRADE SEPARATION, AND THEN JUST KIND OF MOVING
25 NORTH ONE BY ONE IF THAT'S WHAT IT MEANT, IF YOU WERE TELLING



September 23, 2020

1 ME THAT'S NOT WHAT IT MEANT IT'S JUST KIND OF A GENERAL
2 INDICATION OF LIKE A PRIORITY WE NEED TO CONSIDER AMONGST
3 OTHER PRIORITIES, I'M FINE WITH THAT, AND I THINK IT'S -- THAT
4 MAKES SENSE. IS THAT WHAT YOU ARE TELLING ME MATT?

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** GENERALLY YES AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO DISTINGUISH
7 THAT THERE IS A SET OF INVESTMENT IN THE PROJECT LIST THAT ARE
8 ESSENTIALLY CORRIDOR WIDE. AND THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, THEY SHOULD
9 BE UNDER DISCUSSION BY THE GROUP. WE ARE ESSENTIALLY
10 HIGHLIGHTING, ILLUSTRATING, EARMARKING, IF YOU WILL, A SET OF
11 INVESTMENTS, ALSO IN THE PLAN, THAT IS SOUTH OF TAMIEN
12 STATION. READING THAT AS A MATTER OF POLICY IN THE PLAN.

13

14 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. I DON'T KNOW, COMMISSIONER
15 LICCARDO IF YOU WANT TO SPEAK TO THIS. I HAVE SOMETHING ELSE I
16 WANT TO TALK ABOUT WITH REGARDS TO --

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** JUST KEEP GOING.

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. I HAVE REAL CONCERNS, AND SO DOES
21 -- AND THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO DOES GENERALLY ABOUT THE WORK
22 FROM HOME MANDATE. COMMISSIONER RONEN UNFORTUNATELY HAD TO
23 LEAVE, BUT SHE ASKED ME TO READ -- SHE POSTED SOMETHING IN THE
24 CHAT WHICH SHE ASKED ME TO READ OUT. I'LL DO THAT THEN ADD MY
25 OWN COMMENTS SHE SAYS I'M CONCERNED THAT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT



September 23, 2020

1 60 PERCENT OF EMPLOYEES TELECOMMUTING IF THIS BECOMES REALITY
2 IT WILL HAVE A TREMENDOUS IMPACT ON SAN FRANCISCO AN IMPACT I
3 DON'T BELIEVE WE HAVE SUFFICIENTLY DISCUSSED OR EVALUATED TO
4 INCLUDE IN THE BLUEPRINT I ASK THAT YOU STRIKE OUT THIS
5 REQUIREMENT I AM CERTAINLY WILLING TO REVISIT THE IMPACTS ON
6 THE ENVIRONMENT GIVEN THE MAJOR IMPACTS THAT SUCH A POLICY OR
7 REQUIREMENT WOULD HAVE ON OUR CITY I ASK THAT WE HAVE AN
8 EXTENSIVE PROCESS BEFORE DELIBERATING ON A MANDATE IN THIS
9 REGARD. I WANT TO ADD, THAT THE PROBLEMS THEY HAVE WITH THIS
10 MANDATE ARE SORT OF THREE FOLD. I THINK WE HAVE A REAL PROBLEM
11 WITH THE EQUITABLE -- WITH EQUITY AROUND THIS MANDATE. IT'S
12 FINE TO ASK PEOPLE TO WORK FROM HOME IF THEY LIVE IN A LARGER
13 HOME WITHOUT ROOMMATES OR FAMILY MEMBERS OR IF THEY LIVE IN A
14 SMALLER APARTMENT OR LIVE WITH FAMILY MEMBERS OR ROOMMATES I
15 DON'T THINK IT'S FAIR TO ASK THEM TO WORK FROM HOME. I HAVE
16 SOMEONE ON MY TEAM, SHE IS INDUSTRY, LIVES IN AN APARTMENT
17 WITH FIVE OTHER ROOMMATES. WE COULDN'T EXPECT TO SAY IF SHE
18 HAS THE OPTION TO WALK TO WORK THAT WE REQUIRE SHE WORK FROM
19 HOME. THERE IS NO CLIMATE CONGESTION BENEFIT IF PEOPLE WHO
20 STAY HOME RATHER THAN TAKE TRANSIT OR VANPOOL TO WORK. AND I
21 THINK THERE ARE OTHER MORE FLEXIBLE OPTIONS LIKE TRIP CAPS,
22 VERY AGGRESSIVE TDM OPTION WHERE IS WE CAN GET EXACTLY THE
23 SAME GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BENEFIT BUT WITHOUT A LOT OF THE
24 PROBLEMS. WORK FROM HOME MANDATES ALSO PENALIZE THE SORT OF
25 DOWNTOWNS. BECAUSE DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, ESPECIALLY, AS MANY



September 23, 2020

1 OTHER DOWNTOWNS, RELY ON -- AND OUR WHOLE CITY BUDGET RELIES
2 ON WORKERS COMING TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, AND IF WE'RE
3 PREVENTING THEM FROM COMING EVEN IF THEY'RE TAKING BART OR AC
4 TRANSIT OR CALTRAIN OR BIKING OR WALKING THAT'S GOING TO HAVE
5 A TREMENDOUS EFFECT. I WOULD LIKE TO -- I DON'T WANT TO MAKE -
6 - I WILL -- I'M NOT MAKING THIS MOTION, BUT IF -- I WOULD
7 REALLY APPRECIATE IF THERE WAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AN
8 AMENDMENT TO ADD AN AMENDMENT WHICH WOULD STRIKE THIS WORK
9 FROM HOME MANDATE FROM THIS PLAN. AND REPLACE IT WITH AN
10 EQUIVALENT MANDATE THAT WOULD BE -- THAT WOULD HAVE TRIP CAPS,
11 WHICH GENERATE A SIMILAR AMOUNT OF GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS
12 REDUCTIONS. BUT WHICH DON'T HAVE THE NEGATIVE IMPACT ON
13 DOWNTOWNS, AND PROVIDE MORE FLEXIBILITY TO WORKERS. I KNOW
14 SPERING WANTS TO MAKE THE MOTION AND I DON'T KNOW IF HE WOULD
15 CONSIDER INCORPORATING THAT IF NOT I'LL MAKE MY OWN AMENDMENT.
16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HE'S WAY DOWN THERE. I WOULD LIKE TO
18 HEAR MATT'S RESPONSE TO THAT.

19

20 **MATT MALONEY:** COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ I'LL START OFF. I THINK
21 THE FIRST THING TO UNDER SCORE IS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD
22 ALWAYS SAY THIS IS REMEMBER IT. THIS IS A 30 YEAR LONG RANGE
23 PLAN, AND YOU KNOW, THESE STRATEGIES ARE MEANT TO BE PLANNING
24 IDEAS TO HELP THIS REGION GET TO OUR GOALS. DETAILS OF ALL
25 THESE THINGS MATTER VERY GREATLY, AND THESE STRATEGIES ARE NOT



September 23, 2020

1 INTENDED TO BE PRESCRIPTIVE. SO THERE IS A LOT OF WIGGLE ROOM
2 INVOLVED. THAT BEING SAID, AS WE LOOK AT THIS PLAN, GOING
3 AHEAD TO 2035, THIS TELECOMMUTING STRATEGY IS ONE OF THE
4 BIGGEST, MOST NECESSARY PIECES, WE BELIEVE, TO GET INTO THAT
5 GHG GOAL. WE BROUGHT THIS STRATEGY IN THE SUMMER, THE REQUEST
6 THAT WE RECEIVED FROM THE COMMISSION WAS TO AIM HIGHER AND
7 THAT WE WERE BEING TOO MODEST SO WHAT WE HAVE DONE IS AUGMENT
8 THE PREVIOUS ASSUMPTION WHICH WAS AT A 14 PERCENT REGION WIDE
9 LEVEL UP TO PROVE PERCENT. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT
10 WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IN THIS PLAN IS A 25 PERCENT LEVEL OF
11 TELEWORK, NOT 60. IT IS ACCOMPLISHED IN PART BY DOING MORE
12 WITH OFFICERS EMPLOYEES, BUT THE TOTAL AMOUNT IS 25. I'LL ALSO
13 SAY WE RAN, IN THE STATISTICALLY VALID POLL WE RAN A QUESTION
14 ON THE SUBJECT. AND THE QUESTION HAD TO DO WITH WHETHER PEOPLE
15 SUPPORTED EMPLOYERS LIMITING IN-PERSON OFFICE WORK WHEN
16 TELECOMMUTING OR WORKING FROM HOME WAS POSSIBLE. AND THE
17 RESULT OF THAT POLL SHOWED 76 PERCENT SUPPORT, REGION WIDE,
18 FOR A STRATEGY LIKE THIS. I'LL ALSO MENTION THIS STRATEGY IS
19 COMPLIMENTED BY ANOTHER STRATEGY, EC3, IF YOU'RE FOLLOWING
20 ALONG THE STRATEGY ATTACHMENT WHICH IS INVESTED IN HIGH SPEED
21 INTERNET IN UNDERSERVED LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES WE'RE CONCERNED
22 ABOUT THE EQUITY IMPACTS. AND THUS IT'S IMPORTANT TO
23 UNDERSTAND THE FACT THAT WE HAVE COMPLIMENTED THE TELEWORK
24 STRATEGY WITH THIS OTHER STRATEGY AND DAVE IF YOU HAVE
25 ANYTHING TO ADD THAT I HAVE MISSED FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN. >DAVE



September 23, 2020

1 VAUTIN: THE ONE THING I WOULD ADD TO WHAT MATT JUST COVERED
2 IS, THESE ARE, AGAIN, LONG RANGE STRATEGIES THAT CAN BE
3 REFINED FURTHER AS WE MOVE INTO IMPLEMENTATION. IT IS NOT
4 SAYING THAT THIS SORT OF STRATEGY WE PUT INTO PLACE IN 2021 OR
5 2022, WHAT WE'RE TELLING OUR REGULATORS AT THE CALIFORNIA AIR
6 RESOURCES BOARD IS THAT THIS STRATEGY IS SOMETHING THAT THE
7 REGION WOULD ENVISION BY 2035, AND THAT GIVES US A NUMBER OF
8 YEARS TO NOT ONLY REFINE THE CURRENT STRATEGY OR FIND
9 EQUIVALENT STRATEGIES THAT WOULD GET US TO THAT SAME GOAL. WE
10 HAVE ALSO SPOKEN TO, AGAIN, OUR REGULATORS WHO NEED TO PROVE
11 THIS PLAN AND IN ORDER FOR TRANSPORTATION FUNDING TO KEEP
12 FLOWING TO THE BAY AREA. AND THEY HAVE A GREATER LEVEL OF
13 OPENNESS FOR THIS STRATEGY THAN FOR THE TRIP CAP APPROACH,
14 WHICH IS PART OF THE REASON WHY IT IS SOMETHING THAT WE'RE
15 CONSIDERING IN THE PLAN CONTEXT, AND I WOULD UNDERSCORE WHAT
16 MATT SAID THAT THE PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR IT IS QUITE STRONG. AS I
17 MENTIONED, THE THREE QUARTERS BAY AREA RESIDENTS IN THE POLL
18 INCLUDING 70 TO 80 PERCENT OF RESIDENT IN EVERY BAY AREA
19 COUNTY SUPPORTED THE CONCEPT. SO THIS WAS SOMETHING WHERE WE
20 WERE REALLY BEING RESPONSIVE TO THE PUBLIC FEEDBACK.

21

22 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. BUT WHY ARE YOU GOING
23 TO REQUIRE SOMETHING WHO WALKS TO WORK, TO STAY HOME. WHAT'S
24 THE CLIMATE BENEFIT? WHAT'S THE CONGESTION BENEFIT? WHAT'S THE
25 ECONOMIC BENEFIT?



September 23, 2020

1

2 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** HOLD ON. YOUR BOSS WANTED TO GET IN.

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** TO ANSWER COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT'S
5 EXACTLY THE KIND OF IMPLEMENTATION NUANCE THAT WOULD COME INTO
6 DISCUSSIONS ON HOW YOU WOULD ACTUALLY MOVE SOMETHING LIKE THIS
7 GOAL FROM CONCEPT TO ACTION. IT WOULD BE A MORE REFINED POLICY
8 THAT SAYS THE FOCUS OF THE TELEWORK WOULD BE FOR THOSE
9 EMPLOYEES THAT ARE DIVING TO THE OFFICE. THOSE ARE THE KINDS
10 OF LAYERED REFINEMENTS THAT WOULD HAPPEN AT THE POINT THAT
11 THIS STRATEGY WOULD BE TAKEN FORWARD FOR ANY KIND OF
12 IMPLEMENTATION AT A REGIONAL, LOCAL LEVEL, IF IT WAS STATE,
13 YOU KNOW, REGULATIONS, THAT NEEDED TO BE DONE, THERE'S A WHOLE
14 HOST OF IMPLEMENTATION LEVERS THAT ARE TO BE DETERMINED. SO
15 WE'RE TAKING NOTE, AND WHAT I THINK STAFF IS HIGHLIGHTING IS
16 THAT IS A DIFFERENT LEVEL, BUT THE BROADER CHALLENGE FOR THE
17 REGION, IS WE HAVE TO HAVE A STRATEGY ON TOP OF EVERYTHING
18 ELSE WE HAVE DONE. I WAS JUST CHECKING THE SLIDE FROM BEFORE.
19 THAT WE HAD PRESENTED BACK IN, TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE, WHEN
20 WE HIGHLIGHTED THE FAMOUS ARROW SLIDE, PRIOR TO THE FINAL
21 BLUEPRINT WHEN WE DID ALL OF THIS PUBLIC OUTREACH, WE HAD ONLY
22 MANAGED TO IDENTIFY NINE PERCENT OUT OF 19. IN THE SUMMER.
23 THAT WAS HOW MUCH GROUND THAT WE NEEDED TO MAKE UP. AND SO
24 THIS, YOU KNOW, TELEWORK BUNDLES, AS WE HAVE SAID, WITH REALLY
25 IMPORTANT PARALLEL STRATEGIES, IS, YOU KNOW, A SIGNIFICANT



September 23, 2020

1 PART OF WHAT WE ARE GOING TO HAVE TO TAKE TO CARB IN ORDER FOR
2 THEM TO APPROVE THIS PLAN AND THE GHGS. SO JUST TO HIGHLIGHT,
3 THAT'S THE PLACE WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I MEAN, I UNDERSTAND THAT I'M BEING TOLD
6 THAT LIKE, YOU KNOW, LIKE -- I HAVE TO WAIT, BECAUSE, LIKE --
7 BUT, ON SPECIFICS OF THIS POLICY, BUT IT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE A
8 SPECIFIC TO SAY, THE 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS -- WHAT I'M
9 PROPOSING IS THAT WE SAY 60 PERCENT OF WORKERS HAVE TO EITHER
10 TELECOMMUTE OR TAKE A SUSTAINABLE -- OR TAKE A SUSTAINABLE
11 MODE TO THE OFFICE. THAT DOES NOT SEEM LIKE A DETAILED
12 IMPLEMENTATION THAT SEEMS LIKE A FUNDAMENTALLY DIFFERENT
13 POLICY WHICH ACHIEVES ALL OF THE GOALS THAT YOUR POLICY
14 ACHIEVES BUT PROVIDES MORE FLEXIBILITY AND ISN'T A THREAT TO
15 CITIES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, AND WHAT WE HAVE IN OUR -- AND IS
16 IN EFFECT FOR CITIES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO, TO THE SAME DEGREE.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NICK, WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON? I THINK THE
19 CASE HAS BEEN MADE. I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE EITHER MORE
20 PEOPLE IN OR OUT ON THIS IDEA. AND LET'S JUST SEE WHERE IT
21 GOES BUT LET ME LET OTHER PEOPLE SPEAK. IS THAT OKAY?

22

23 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THAT'S GREAT.

24



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY, AND LICCARDO, AND
2 AHN.

3

4 **DAMON CONNOLY:** GREAT I'LL JUMP IN AND START WITH THANKS FOR
5 THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT WENT INTO THE BLUEPRINT TODAY, TO
6 STAFF AND COLLEAGUES AS WELL AS PUBLIC COMMENT WE RECEIVED WAS
7 GREAT. SO SPEAKING FOR MARIN COUNTY. I WANT TO FAVORABLY
8 COMMENT ON THE TRANSPORTATION COMPONENT OF THE BLUEPRINT. ALL
9 OF THE PAGER PROJECTS THAT MARIN PROPOSED HAVE BEEN INCLUDED
10 IN THE PLAN. THOSE INCLUDE A RESILIENT STATE ROUTE 37 IN
11 THERE, I PARTICULARLY WANT TO THANK MY NORTH BAY COLLEAGUES
12 FOR JOINING FORCES TO BRING THAT ACROSS THE FINISH LINE. MARIN
13 SONOMA NARROWS. U.S. 101 TO 580 DIRECT CONNECTOR AND RICHMOND
14 SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE WESTBOUND JOINT USE LANE WHICH IS STILL
15 UNDER CONSIDERATION BUT INCLUDED AS MOVING FORWARD IN THE
16 PLAN. ON THE REGIONAL GROWTH PROJECTIONS AND STRATEGIES, A
17 COUPLE OF ISSUES I WANTED TO RAISE AND PERHAPS GET SOME FOLLOW
18 UP FROM STAFF. THE FIRST IS -- AND THIS HAS COME UP THROUGHOUT
19 THE CONVERSATION, HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, WHICH CONTINUE TO BE A
20 LITTLE BIT NEBULOUS. BUT MY MAIN CONCERN IS TO WHAT EXTENT ARE
21 THEY ACTUALLY TETHERED TO HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT? THE GOAL
22 STATED HERE IS TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND PROMOTE
23 EQUITY. TO THE EXTENT THAT WE'RE PROPOSING A LOT OF NEW
24 HOUSING, AND WE ALL RECOGNIZE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS A REGIONAL
25 GOAL THAT WE ALL NEED TO PURSUE, MARIN COUNTY IS CONTINUING IN



September 23, 2020

1 THAT DIRECTION, INCLUDING TWO NEW PDAS, PROPOSED THIS YEAR,
2 ONE IN INCORPORATED MARIN, ONE IN UNINCORPORATED. BUT THE FACT
3 IS -- AND I'LL GET TO NUMBERS WE'RE SEEING RECENTLY FROM RHNA
4 THAT A LOT OF HOUSING IS BEING PROPOSED IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS
5 WITH NO INDICATION THERE IS ANY RELATIONSHIP TO HIGH QUALITY
6 TRANSIT. LAST THING WE WANT TO DO IS HAVE PEOPLE DRIVING IN
7 SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES, AND THEREBY INCREASING GREENHOUSE
8 GAS EMISSIONS, LET ALONE FORCING WORKING CLASS FOLKS WHO RELY
9 ON TRANSIT TO HAVE TO GO OUT AND BUY A VEHICLE. SO THAT'S ONE
10 ISSUE. WE HAVE BEEN PUSHING FOR A HYBRID APPROACH. IT'S NOT
11 CLEAR TO ME THAT THAT WAS RESPONDED TO IN THIS PLAN. SO THAT'S
12 A CONCERN. PRACTICALLY SPEAKING, WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN MARIN
13 FROM THE DRAFT RHNA NUMBERS IS THAT THE UNINCORPORATED
14 ALLOCATION FOR MARIN HAS GONE UP 22 TIMES FROM THE LAST RHNA
15 CYCLE. IT'S EYE POPPING. SO THE QUESTION I HAVE THAT'S MORE
16 FUNDAMENTAL, EVEN, IS TO WHAT EXTENT DOES ADOPTING THIS
17 BLUEPRINT DRIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF RHNA? BECAUSE YOU CAN WELL
18 IMAGINE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A PROBLEM WITH THAT IF THE ANSWER
19 IS THIS IS A PRINCIPLE OR MAIN DRIVER OF THAT PROCESS. SO I
20 WOULD LIKE STAFF TO -- AND I RECOGNIZE THE RHNA NUMBERS ARE
21 GRAPHED, BUT FRANKLY, THAT'S WHERE THE RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD.
22 THERE ARE PROBABLY A FEW ISSUES. YOU KNOW, IS IT SOMETHING
23 RELATED TO UNINCORPORATED STATUS, FOR EXAMPLE, BUT AGAIN, THAT
24 OVERALL ISSUE, AND IN FACT, I WOULD EVEN, WHETHER A MOTION OR



September 23, 2020

1 A MORE DIRECT STATEMENT, THAT BY APPROVING THIS, THAT IS NOT
2 DRIVING THOSE OUTCOMES AS PART OF THE RHNA PROCESS.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

5

6 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO JOIN IN THE THANKS
7 AND PARTICULARLY TO THANK MATT AND ALIX FOR WORKING WITH US TO
8 CARVE OUT A PATH TO ENSURE THE REGION CAN GET CONNECTED TO
9 HIGH SPEED RAIL IN OUR LIFETIME. COMMISSIONER PUT IT WELL,
10 ABOUT THE PRIORITIES HERE, AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK,
11 CERTAINLY, SEVERAL OF MY COLLEAGUES, COMMISSIONER PEDROZA AND
12 SPERING AND THOSE WHO HAVE JUMPED IN TO HELP, I LOOK FORWARD
13 TO THE MASTER AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE NINE PARTIES. I THINK THAT
14 CONVERSATION IS IMPORTANT AND OVERDUE AND WE ALL AGREE IT
15 NEEDED TO BE REVISED EVEN BEFORE THIS POINT. I WANT TO CLARIFY
16 IF THERE ARE TWO SEPARATE THINGS GOING ON HERE SO FOLKS AREN'T
17 MIXING THE TWO. ONE IS WHAT WE HAVE ESSENTIALLY DONE AS MATT
18 DESCRIBED IS REMOVE \$3 BILLION FROM A LOCAL SANTA CLARA
19 PROJECT TO GET THIS HIGH SPEED RAIL PROJECT INTO THE BAY AREA.
20 AND SECONDLY, THE \$4.1 BILLION REGIONAL FUNDS ALONG THAT
21 CORRIDOR, WHICH WOULD BE FOR THE DUAL USE PROJECTS, ACTUALLY
22 BOTH COULD BE FOR DUAL USE, AND THAT'S WHERE THE
23 PRIORITIZATION FROM SOUTH AND NORTH EXIST, AND I AGREE WITH
24 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT THIS IS NOT A STRICT AND
25 EXCLUSIVE KIND OF PRIORITIZATION. OBVIOUSLY THERE ARE OTHER



September 23, 2020

1 FACTORS THAT NEED TO BE CONSIDERED. FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLE IS
2 THAT WE HAVE DEPOSIT TO BUILD THE FIRST STORY OF THE BUILDING
3 BEFORE WE START BUILDING THE 13th STORY. AND I THINK WE HAVE
4 SEEN WHAT HAS EMERGED FROM THIS BOOK END STRATEGY OF HIGH
5 SPEED RAIL STATEWIDE AND IT'S BEEN A POISONOUS RESULT THAT WE
6 HAVE CREATED THIS GOLDEN GOOSE MENTALITY THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL
7 AND ITS PURPOSE IS TO CREATE FUNDING THAT LOCAL COMMUNITIES
8 CAN USE TO REALLY CREATE TRANSIT THAT'S SEPARATE FROM HIGH
9 SPEED RAIL THAT MIGHT GET CONNECTED IN A DECADE OR TWO. AND
10 WHAT I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO DO, AS A REGION, IS TO
11 UNDERSTAND HOW BEST WE CAN GET HIGH SPEED RAIL HERE AND
12 STARTING AT GROUND FLOOR GOING UP TO THE 13 TO 15th STORY.
13 WHEREVER WE END UP. I THINK WE ALL UNDERSTAND THAT WE'RE NEED
14 TO GET TO SALESFORCE TOWER, BUT IT'S GET TO GET TO THE FIRST
15 FLOOR FIRST. AND SO THAT IS WHAT'S BEHIND THIS WHOLE
16 PRIORITIZATION. I THINK, I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S
17 CONCERNS, IT'S KNOWN FUNDING THAT HAS TRADITIONALLY CREATED
18 GREAT SEPARATIONS SAN MATEO COUNTY OR NORTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY
19 IS BEING TOUCHED THROUGH THIS, BUT RATHER WHAT WE WANT TO DO
20 IS ENSURE THAT WE GET FIRST THINGS FIRST WHICH IS GETTING THE
21 TRAIN HERE. AND I HOPE WE CAN COME BACK IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS
22 AND TALK MORE IN DEPTH ABOUT WHAT THAT STRATEGIES NEEDS TO BE.
23 WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH HIGH SPEED RAIL STAFF TO TALK ABOUT
24 WHAT THE STAGING MIGHT LOOK LIKE TO GET THE FUNDING IN PLACE
25 TO GET TO THE BAY AREA AND TO BE PAROCHIAL FOR A MOTION, I



September 23, 2020

1 THINK IN THIS CASE BEING PAROCHIAL ALIGNS WITH THE REGIONAL
2 OBJECTIVE, IF WE CAN'T GET IT TO DIRIDON STATION THEN NONE OF
3 THIS IS WORTH THE EFFORT, BUT WHATEVER WE'RE SPENDING ANYWHERE
4 ELSE ALONG THE LINE TO BENEFIT HIGH SPEED RAIL BECAUSE IT'S
5 ONLY IN DIRIDON STATION THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL CAN GET TO THE
6 ONE PLACE IN THE BAY AREA WHERE WE WILL HAVE BART, CALTRAIN,
7 ACE, CAPITAL CORRIDOR, AND A HOST OF OTHER LOCAL COMMUTER
8 SYSTEMS LIKE LIGHT RAIL AND BUS RAPID TRANSIT. THAT'S THE ONLY
9 PLACE IN THE BAY AREA WHERE YOU CAN ACTUALLY GET ALL THE
10 SYSTEMS. THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO BRING HIGH SPEED
11 RAIL INTO CONNECTIVITY WITH ALL THE OTHER SYSTEMS WHICH MEANS
12 WE GOT TO GET IT THROUGH PACHECO PASS AND GILROY AND MORGAN
13 HILL THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT TO ME THAT WE HAVE DOLLARS
14 COMMITTED TO COMMUNITIES TO GILROY AND MORGAN HILL AND THAT'S
15 BASIS FOR PRIORITIZATION. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR WHAT THEY
16 HAVE DONE. I THINK WE'RE ALL GOING TO GET THERE AND IT'S
17 IMPORTANT FOR US TO CONVENE AGAIN ON THIS ISSUE. WE NEED TO
18 TALK ABOUT WHAT STRATEGIES MAKE SENSE FOR THE ENTIRE REGION
19 AND I APPRECIATE MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS SUPPORT AND
20 PARTICULARLY COMMISSIONERS WORKING WITH ME.

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION ON FUNDING I HAVE
23 BEEN FOLLOWING IT IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE A GENERAL
24 PRIORITIZATION THAT GETS AT HOPEFULLY ET NEEDS OF THE SOUTH
25 BAY AS WELL. I THINK THE THING I WANT TO FOCUS ON IS 60



September 23, 2020

1 PERCENT GOAL FOR TELEWORKING IT STRIKES ME AS UNREALISTIC AND
2 A HIGH NUMBER AS WE WERE WORKING OFF THE ORIGINAL ASSUMPTION
3 OF 35 PERCENT AND JUMPING TO THAT GOAL I'M CONCERNED ABOUT.
4 NOW I WOULD SUPPORT ELIMINATING THE LANGUAGE ENTIRELY OR AT
5 LEAST DOING WHAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS SUGGESTING IS
6 BUILDING FLEXIBILITY WHICH IS THE IDEA OF TELEWORKING AND
7 BUILDING SUSTAINABLE TRIPS, TRIP CAPS.

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? SCHAFF HALF HERE
10 I'LL PUT ON MY CAMERA. THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. I WILL SAVE MY
11 COMMENTS ON TELECOMMUTING FOR LAST. BUT BASICALLY I WANT TO
12 THANK STAFF FOR RESPONDING TO PUBLIC COMMENTS. I DO HOPE THAT
13 OAKLAND CAN BE A PARTNER ON THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND I
14 WOULD LOVE FOR YOU TO INCLUDE MY STAFF AS YOU DEVELOP IT. I
15 KNOW IN OAKLAND, OUR EQUITY -- EQUITABLE CLIMATE ACTION PLAN
16 THAT WE RECENTLY ADOPTED REALLY FOCUSES ON SHORT-TERM
17 IMPLEMENTATION ON OUR FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES IMPROVED
18 AFFORDABILITY AND REBUILDING A SEAMLESS TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO,
19 EXCITED ABOUT THE FOCUS ON THAT AND THE IMPLEMENTATION STAGE.
20 I'M EXCEPTIONALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE STRATEGY TO PROVIDE
21 TARGETED MORTGAGE RENTAL AND SMALL BUSINESS ASSISTANCE THAT
22 WAS A FANTASTIC ADDITION. AND HOW THIS CAN BE A CODED RESPONSE
23 MODEL AS WELL IN THE SHORTER TERM. I DO HAVE SOME CONCERN. YOU
24 USED THE TERM BASIC INCOME AS A FOUNDING MEMBER OF MAYORS FOR
25 GUARANTEED INCOME, WE ARE REALLY TRYING TO EDUCATE THE PUBLIC



September 23, 2020

1 ABOUT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN GUARANTEED INCOME AND BASIC
2 INCOME. AND I REALLY ADVISE THAT WE CHANGE THAT LANGUAGE TO
3 GUARANTEED INCOME, WHICH IS TARGETED -- IT IS NOT UNIVERSAL OR
4 FOR EVERYONE. IT IS FOR THOSE WHO NEED IT. AND SO, IF THERE IS
5 FURTHER DISCUSSION, I NEED TO HAVE OFFLINE WITH STAFF, I WOULD
6 LIKE TO -- SORRY. IT SUDDENLY STARTED -- I THINK URSULA.
7 URSULA, IF YOU COULD MUTE YOURSELF? BUT ANYWAY, I WOULD LIKE
8 TO -- I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT GUARANTEED INCOME. AND THEN
9 FINALLY ON THE TELECOMMUTING MANDATE. I HAVE SOME PRETTY
10 STRONG FEELINGS ABOUT THIS. AND WHILE I GENERALLY TRY AND BE
11 VERY COLLEGIAL THAT WE'RE UNDER A CLEAR MORAL IMPERATIVE
12 PARTICULARLY IN THIS MOMENT IN THIS YEAR TO BE UNEQUIVOCAL
13 ABOUT PUTTING PEOPLE BEFORE PROFIT AND THE CLIMATE DEVASTATION
14 THAT HAS CAUSED THAT POLLUTED AIR HAS CAUSED IS SO MUCH MORE
15 IMPORTANT THAN THE VIABILITY OF PROFITS. SO, I BELIEVE THIS IS
16 A VERY IMPORTANT POLICY. IF IT MAKES PEOPLE FEEL MORE COMPANY
17 TO SAY THAT IT IS A 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING, OR EQUIVALENT,
18 MANDATE, TO REALLY SIGNAL THAT THE GOAL IS THE "BENEFITS" OF
19 THIS POLICY AND THERE IS FLEXIBILITY IN HOW IT'S ACHIEVED SO
20 THAT COMPANIES COULD CERTAINLY GET CREDIT FOR NON-CAR OWNING
21 EMPLOYEES ET CETERA. I THINK CERTAINLY THAT IS WISE AND I
22 THINK WE HAVE HEARD STAFF SAY CLEARLY THAT THESE ARE THE TYPES
23 OF FLEXIBILITIES AND ACCOMMODATIONS THAT WE WOULD SEE IN THE
24 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. BUT I AM NOT WILLING TO NOT HAVE A
25 TELECOMMUTING MANDATE IN THIS POLICY. OR IN THIS BLUEPRINT. WE



September 23, 2020

1 HAVE GOT TO CONTINUE IDEALLY LOOK FOR SILVER LININGS AMIDst
2 THIS HORRIFIC TRAGEDY THAT WE'RE SUFFERING RIGHT NOW AND ONE
3 OF THEM IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO THING THAT WE -- THAT COULD
4 NOT HAVE BEEN DONE IN THE PAST, AND CERTAINLY, ACCELERATING
5 TELECOMMUTING POLICIES AND REALLY DRIVING WHAT BENEFITS WE CAN
6 DERIVE FROM TELECOMMUTING. NOW IS A TIME, MORE THAN EVER, THAT
7 WE CAN DO THAT IN A WAY THAT WOULD BE LEAST IMPACTFUL AND
8 HARMFUL. I WOULD FEEL COMFORTABLE WITH ADDING THE TERM OF
9 EQUIVALENT IF THAT WOULD WORK WITH VALID CONCERNS. I AM
10 SUPPORTIVE OF THE WORK AND APPRECIATE THE INCREDIBLE THOUGHT
11 STAFF HAS PUT INTO THIS AS WELL AS THE GOOD COMMENTS FROM MY
12 COLLEAGUES. THANK YOU.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU MAYOR. PEDROZA, BRUINS,
15 SPERING, LICCARDO, AGAIN.

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. AND I AGREE WITH MAYOR
18 SCHAFF ON THE TELEWORK POLICY. GREAT COMMENTS ON THAT. I WANT
19 TO START BY THANKING STAFF. A LOT OF WORK WENT INTO THIS, IN
20 PARTICULAR OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN, MAKING
21 SURE WE STAY WITHIN THE FINANCIAL ENVELOPE AND REMAIN
22 STRATEGIC. WE CAN'T KEEP DOING BUSINESS AS USUAL SO WE HAVE TO
23 GET UNCOMFORTABLE WHETHER IT'S POLICIES OR TELEWORK AROUND
24 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS. GOVERNOR ANNOUNCED BY 2035 HE'S GOING TO
25 BE BANNING GAS POWERED VEHICLE. THIS IS GOING TO HAPPEN. IS



September 23, 2020

1 THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHAPE THE FUTURE. THIS IS WHAT I SEE
2 TO SHAPE THE PLAN. ON THE TELEWORK POLICY IT'S BENEFITS WE
3 WANT TO ACHIEVE. WE KNOW THERE IS BENEFIT TO -- LET'S PROVIDE
4 AMENDMENTS TO THAT AND TO THE HOUSING WE NEED TO LOOK AT THE
5 NEED AND IT'S GOING TO HAPPEN SO WE NEED TO MAKE SURE LOCALLY
6 THAT WE TRY TO BE PART OF THE SOLUTION VERSUS PART OF THE
7 PROBLEM. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT PLAN THAT'S HIGH LEVEL. THERE
8 IS A LOT TO BE SAID ABOUT HOW WE IMPLEMENT IT BUT THIS IS
9 FIRST STEPS. I'M IN SUPPORT OF WHAT'S OUTLINED HERE AND THANK
10 YOU TO MAYOR LICCARDO FOR WANTING TO LOOK AT HIGH SPEED RAIL
11 IF A VERY GOOD WAY BUT ALSO UNDERSTANDING WE HAVE A BALANCE
12 THAT WE NEED TO FIND HERE FOR THE REGION. SO JUST SUPPORTIVE
13 OF THIS PLAN. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR.

14

15 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER BRUINS.

16

17 **JEANNIE BRUINS:** THANK YOU TO STAFF. THERE IS A LOT OF HARD
18 WORK THAT GOES INTO THIS AND SO MANY COMPETING PERSPECTIVES
19 AND PRIORITIES. I THINK YOU HAVE DONE A NICE JOB AND THE
20 WORDING, I THINK YOU HAVE THREADED THE NEEDLE PRETTY WELL. SAM
21 LICCARDO I WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU IN TERMS OF THE CHANGES
22 THAT YOU BROUGHT INTO REGARDING HIGH SPEED RAIL ET CETERA I
23 DEFINITELY SUPPORT THAT, AND YOU KNOW, NICK, I TRIED TO FIGURE
24 OUT WHAT THE ANALOGY WAS, AND I'M GLAD SAM WAS OF THE ONE WHO
25 MENTIONED YOU HAVE TO BUILD THE GROUND FLOOR BEFORE YOU BUILD



September 23, 2020

1 THE 13th STORY. THIS IS IMPORTANT. DIRIDON IS A CRITICAL PLACE
2 TO GET IT AT LEAST THAT FAR AND THEN WE GO FROM THERE, AND YOU
3 CAN'T GET TO DIRIDON IF WE DON'T PUT THIS AS PRIORITY HERE. IN
4 TERMS OF THE LAST ITEM, AS FOR AS THE MANDATE, I ACTUALLY -- I
5 MEAN, I CAN SEE BOTH SIDES OF THIS. BUT I THINK MY PERSONAL
6 PREFERENCE IS IF WE COULD TRY AND FIGURE OUT SOME HYBRID
7 LANGUAGE SO WE DON'T LOSE SIGHT OF IT'S NOT JUST A MANDATE AT
8 HOME IT'S MORE THE HYBRID LANGUAGE THAT NICK TRIED TO GET TO
9 SOMETHING STAFF COULD WORK WITH GIVING US MORE OF HYBRID
10 THING.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SPERING, DID YOU WANT TO HOLD OFF?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WHEN YOU'RE READY FOR A MOTION.

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO I'M GOING HOLD
17 YOU OFF TOO. SO I CAN GET TO EVERYBODY ELSE FIRST.

18 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE?

19

20 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** MY APOLOGIES, YOU CAUGHT ME UNAWARES I WAS
21 EXPECTING TO BE THIRD IN LINE. NEVER MIND. LICCARDO, HIGH
22 SPEED RAIL, IF WE WANT TO BE A 21st CENTURY NATION STAKED, OR
23 WHATEVER WE ARE IN CALIFORNIA, THE HIGH SPEED RAIL PROJECT HAS
24 GOT TO MOVE FORWARD. OTHERWISE, WE'RE A THIRD WORLD NATION AS
25 FAR AS I'M CONCERNED. COMMISSIONER CONNOLY AND HIS REMARKS



September 23, 2020

1 ABOUT THE NORTH BAY AND THE RESILIENT STATE ROUTE 37 PROJECT,
2 THAT BRINGS TO MIND ONE OF THE SERIOUS PROBLEMS THAT WE'RE
3 GOING TO BE DEALING WITH, AND I'M NOT GOING TO BE DEALING WITH
4 IT INTO THE INDUSTRY, BUT SEA LEVEL RISE. AND JUST TO MAKE
5 SURE THAT AS WE'RE MAKING OUR PROJECTIONS ON HOUSING, THAT
6 WE'RE TAKING INTO EFFECT WHAT WE KNOW IS HAPPENING, AND WHAT
7 WE KNOW IS GOING TO BE HAPPENING. IN THE NORTH BAY, I THINK WE
8 HAVE FOUGHT OUR CORNER VERY WELL, AND I WOULD STILL REMIND
9 PEOPLE THAT IN THE STATE RAIL PLAN THE EXPANSION OF RAIL
10 SERVICE FROM THE SMART CORRIDOR OVER TO THE MAIN LINE AT
11 CORDELIA JUNCTION IS SOMETHING, AGAIN, THAT IS IMPORTANT, I
12 BELIEVE, TO OUR BAY AREA. AND, FINALLY, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING,
13 AND THE RHNA NUMBERS, THAT THE PROJECTIONS FOR THE COUNTY OF
14 SONOMA -- AND I HOPE THAT COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS STILL ON THE
15 LINE AND WILL JUMP IN, BUT THE NUMBERS THAT I HAVE HEARD KIND
16 OF PARALLEL WHAT COMMISSIONER CONNOLY WAS TALKING ABOUT, AND
17 THAT IS MASSIVE INCREASE IN UNINCORPORATED SONOMA COUNTY.
18 SONOMA COUNTY -- ALL NINE CITIES HAVE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES
19 APPROVED BY THE VOTERS. WE HAVE COMMUNITY SEPARATORS APPROVED
20 BY THE VOTERS TO CONSTRAIN GROWTH AROUND THESE URBAN GROWTH
21 BOUNDARIES. CITY CENTERED GROWTH IS THE COUNTY'S GENERAL PLAN,
22 AND I BELIEVE THAT THE CITIES IN SONOMA COUNTY ARE POISED AND
23 WE IN ROHNERT PARK HAVE DEMONSTRATE THAT WE ARE WILLING TO
24 GIVE DEVELOPMENT APPROVAL FOR MORE HOUSING, AND WE CONTINUE TO
25 HAVE THAT ATTITUDE. SO, I'M VERY CONCERNED ABOUT THE COMING



September 23, 2020

1 TOGETHER OF RHNA NUMBERS AND AS FAR AS I'M CONCERNED, THESE
2 NUMBERS THAT ARE PROPOSED FOR UNINCORPORATED SONOMA COUNTY,
3 THERE IS GOING TO BE A BIG -- THERE IS GOING TO BE A BATTLE.
4 ANYWAY. THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I HAVE TO LEAVE THIS MEETING AT
5 2:00 FOR A MEDICAL APPOINTMENT. SO, I KNOW THAT THE JOINT
6 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL EVENTUALLY COME IN FRONT OF THIS
7 BODY, BUT IF IT'S AFTER 2:00, I'M GOING TO HAVE TO ASK YOU TO
8 TAKE OVER THE REINS FOR ME.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT:** KUDOS TO STAFF FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK.
13 COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE MENTIONED MY NAME, I FEEL I WOULD TALK
14 BRIEFLY ABOUT THE SITUATION HERE IN SONOMA AND WHY IT'S
15 IMPORTANT THAT WE CAN'T BE SO IN FAVOR OF HOUSING THAT IT
16 CONTRADICTS OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS GOALS AND
17 SUSTAINABILITY GOALS AND THAT'S WHAT'S HAPPENING. PERCENTAGE
18 OF INCREASE FOR THE UNINCORPORATED COUNTY OF SONOMA IS ABOUT
19 550 PERCENT FROM THE LAST CYCLE, AND WE DON'T HAVE A LOT OF
20 AREAS THAT HAVE SERVICES THAT CAN ACCOMMODATE THAT TYPE OF
21 HOUSING. WE DO HAVE, IN THIS COUNTY, AND I THINK WE'RE THE
22 ONLY ONE, AND I CAN SAY THAT ONLY ONE IN THE STATE, I'LL THROW
23 THAT OUT THERE UNTIL I'M PROVEN OTHERWISE, THAT HAS VOTER
24 APPROVED ALL CITIES URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES COMMUNITY
25 SEPARATORS THROW ON TOP OF THAT OPEN SPACE ACQUIRED LAND AND



September 23, 2020

1 MAKING SURE WE'RE PROTECTING THOSE AND WHAT IT'S LEAD TO WHEN
2 YOU COME TO SONOMA YOU CAN ACTUALLY DRIVE FROM ONE CITY YOU
3 ENTER A GREENBELT UNTIL YOU ENTER THE NEXT CITY AND SO ON AND
4 SO FORTH SO IT'S REALLY ABOUT CITY CENTER GROWTH AND WE'RE NOT
5 TRYING TO SHORT CHANGE OUR GROWTH AND WE WELCOME IT AND WANT
6 MORE. WE HAVE SEEN POPULATION DECLINE AND NEED FOR HOUSING.
7 BUT WE NEED TO FIX THAT AS WE GO FORWARD. I UNDERSTAND LAST
8 FRIDAY'S METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE, THE NUMBER HAS DROPPED
9 SLIGHTLY MARIN HAS THE SAME ISSUE OF 2,000 PERCENT INCREASE IN
10 THE UNINCORPORATED AREA. THAT'S REALLY NOT WHERE ALL THAT
11 HOUSING NEEDS TO BE BUILT. AND I WOULD SAY THE SAME THING HERE
12 IN SONOMA COUNTY. AND THE OTHER THING WE'RE STRUGGLING WITH
13 HERE IN SONOMA IS TO COMPLETE OUR SMART RAIL SYSTEM NORTH, AND
14 WE DO -- WE ARE ACTIVELY CONSTRUCTING INTO WITHSTAND --
15 WINDSOR. THAT'S GREAT. IT'S A BENEFIT AND CHALLENGE WHEN
16 YOU'RE NOT INCLUDED ON PLANS GOING FORWARD ESPECIALLY WHEN
17 GIVEN A VOTER APPROVED MEASURE WHICH JUST MAKES IT POLITICALLY
18 A TOUGH HAUL. I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU MR.
19 CHAIR.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO I HAVE NOW OUR EXECUTIVE
22 DIRECTOR. SHE IS OFFICIALLY RAISING HER HAND. I JUST, FOR ME,
23 MAYBE I WAS WAY OFF BASE, YOU KNOW, BUT WHEN I GOT UP THIS
24 MORNING, I KIND OF FIGURED THAT ALL THIS TALK ABOUT HOUSING
25 AND EVERYTHING WAS DONE AT ABAG AND WE WERE GOING TO BE



September 23, 2020

1 TALKING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS HERE. SO I'M A LITTLE
2 CONFUSED. I MEAN, YOU KNOW YOU NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT
3 ANYTHING WE DO, IF WE UNRAVEL WHAT WAS DONE BY ABAG OR TRY TO,
4 OR ATTEMPT TO CHANGE, THEN WE GOT TO GO BACK TO ABAG AND WHERE
5 IS THIS GOING TO STOP? WE HAVE ELECTED OFFICIALS THAT SIT ON
6 ABAG TOTALLY VETTED, HOUSING PRODUCTION, AND RHNA NUMBERS, NOW
7 WE'RE SITTING HERE AT MTC, THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY TALKING
8 ABOUT HOUSING. IT'S A LITTLE FRUSTRATING TO ME. GO AHEAD
9 THERESE.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** AND ANTICIPATING THAT I WANTED TO JUMP IN
12 HERE, AND I'LL CALL ON MATT AND DAVE TO HELP ME IF I DON'T GET
13 EVERYTHING COMPLETELY CORRECT. BUT I THINK THE ISSUE THAT
14 COMMISSIONER CONNOLY HAD FIRST RAISED AND THEN WAS SORT OF
15 ECHOED BY COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE AND COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS
16 THE BASIC RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE FORECAST THAT WE ARE IN
17 FACT ASKING YOU TO ADOPT, AS PART OF THIS SUITE OF ACTIONS
18 RELATIVE TO THE PLAN, BECAUSE AS WE HAVE JUST BEEN TALKING,
19 OUR ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHERE WE PUT AND DISTRIBUTE HOUSING, IS
20 A MAJOR PART OF THE PLAN BUT THE QUESTION IS HOW THAT RELATES
21 OR DRIVES RHNA. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO HIT ON A COUPLE
22 OF POINTS. A, THE HOUSING NUMBERS THAT WE PUT IN PLANNED BAY
23 AREA ARE 30 YEAR NUMBERS. RHNA IS AN EIGHT YEAR PROCESS. SO
24 THERE IS A VERY BIG DISTINCTION THERE. HOWEVER, STATE LAW DOES
25 REQUIRE THAT THERE IS A CONSISTENCY BETWEEN PLANNED BAY AREA



September 23, 2020

1 AND RHNA, AND IN TERMS OF THE BROAD SORT OF GUIDE POST OF WHAT
2 THE PLANNED BAY AREA PROVIDES, WHICH, BASED ON ABAG ACTIONS
3 WAS TO ASSUME THE BASIC DISTRIBUTION PATTERN AS PART OF THE
4 FACTORS THAT GO INTO THE BASELINE FOR RHNA, THAT'S BEING
5 BROUGHT INTO PLAY, HOWEVER THERE ARE SPECIFIC SET OF ACTIONS
6 THAT SITS WITH THE RHNA PROCESS THAT ARE INDEPENDENT AND NOT
7 TIED TO PLANNED BAY AREA. AND THAT'S JUST THE WAY THAT, YOU
8 KNOW, THOSE TWO PROCESSES ARE SETUP BY STATE LAW. I THINK AT
9 THAT POINT, I WOULD OFFER THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND OUR
10 HOUSING ASSUMPTION HERE DO NOT, IN THEIR ENTIRE -- IN THEIR
11 ENTIRETY, DRIVE WHAT THE RHNA PROCESS REQUIRES. THERE IS A LOT
12 OF DIFFERENT FACTORS OVER AND ABOVE PLANNED BAY AREA THAT NEED
13 TO BE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT, AND AS CHAIR HAGGERTY SAID, ABAG IS
14 LEADING THAT PROCESS, AND NOT DISCUSSION. BUT I'LL TURN IT
15 OVER TO MY STAFF IN CASE THERE IS ANY OTHER CLARIFICATIONS WE
16 SHOULD MAKE IN TERMS OF THAT RELATIONSHIP. >DAVE VAUTIN:
17 THANKS THERESE. I WANT TO ADD TWO QUICK CLARIFICATIONS
18 RECOGNIZING THAT RHNA IS IN THE ABAG DOMAIN, BUT PERHAPS
19 ANSWERING THE QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS TODAY. ONE IS
20 THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, 1 OF THE STRATEGIES YOU ALL ARE
21 CONSIDERING FOR APPROVAL AND YOU HAVE IN FEBRUARY OF THIS YEAR
22 WAS TO FOCUS ALMOST ALL GROWTH IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN
23 URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES SO WHEN IT COMES TO GROWTH IN PLANNED
24 BAY AREA 2050 THAT WHERE GROWTH IS BEING CONCENTRATED WITHIN
25 URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES RHNA CONSIDERS FACTORS SUCH AS WHERE



September 23, 2020

1 EXISTING HOUSEHOLDS LIVE AND THAT'S POWERING PORTIONS AS WELL
2 NOT JUST THE GROWTH IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I WANT TO
3 PROVIDE A BIT OF ARRAY OF HOPE WE HAVE DEVELOPED A POTENTIAL
4 TO CONCERN OF SELECT UNINCORPORATED AREAS IN THE REGION
5 WORKING WITH THEM TO POTENTIALLY SHIFT A SHARE OF THE RHNA IN
6 THE SPHERE OF INFLUENCE AREAS OVER TO THE CITIES TO ADDRESS
7 THIS ISSUE. AND WE HAVE OFFERED IT UP TO SPECIFIC
8 JURISDICTIONS IF THEY CAN PROVIDE DOCUMENTATION OF ALL THE
9 SMART GROWTH, URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES ANNEXATION POLICIES TO
10 HCD, WE HAVE MAKE THAT ADJUSTMENT IN OCTOBER BEFORE GOING BACK
11 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. AND WE ACTUALLY HAVE HAD SPECIFIC
12 DIALOGUE WITH SOLANO, SONOMA AND SANTA CLARA COUNTIES THAT
13 HAVE EXPRESS THE DIRECT INTEREST IN THE ADJUSTMENT. WE HAVEN'T
14 HEARD BACK CONFIRMATION IN THE EIGHT JURISDICTIONS BUT WE ARE
15 WORKING ACTIVELY WITH A NUMBER OF COUNTIES.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. I'M GOING TO GO TO SAM, GINA, AND
18 THEN JIM.

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANKS FOR INDULGING ME A SECOND TIME. I WANT TO
21 WEIGH IN AND SUPPORT THE MOTION OF AMENDING THE MANDATE OF
22 WORKING FROM HOME. IT'S GOING TO IMPACT THOSE COMMUNITIES
23 DIFFERENTLY IN THOSE COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE A HIGH PERCENTAGE
24 OF WORKERS THAT DO NOT HAVE THE LUXURY OF WORKING FROM HOME,
25 RESTAURANT COOKS, LABORERS, CONSTRUCTION WORKERS, NURSES, I



September 23, 2020

1 THINK WE'RE SEEING HOW THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE
2 DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACTS LOW INCOME AND MODERATE INCOME
3 RESIDENTS. THERE IS A REAL SYNERGY AND I'M HEARING FROM MY
4 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS AROUND A COMPROMISE SPERING IS GOING TO
5 COME UP WITH BRILLIANT LANGUAGE TO CAPTURE ALL THE BENEFITS OF
6 WORKING FROM HOME BUT CERTAINLY NOT MANDATING IT AND FINDING
7 OTHER ALTERNATIVES THAT WE ALL KNOW SO MUCH ABOUT WHETHER
8 WALKING OR TRANSIT. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO FIND IMPACTS
9 SOCIALLY AND PSYCHOLOGICALLY, THIS ISOLATION WILL BE WITH US
10 FOR A GENERATION AND WORKING FROM HOME IS CERTAINLY NOT THE
11 IDEAL SOLUTION. SO WE HAVE GOT TO FIND LOGICAL ALTERNATIVES.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. YES. I AM ALSO IN SUPPORT OF THE
16 AMENDMENT AS FAR AS MAKING IT WORK FOR THE COMMON GOOD THERE.
17 I NEED TO KNOW, ON THE ACCELERATED USE OF PUBLIC AND COMMUNITY
18 LAND MIXED LAND HOUSING AND ESSENTIAL SERVICES. I GET THAT. I
19 SUPPORT THAT, BUILDING ON COLLEGES AND HIGH SCHOOL CAMPUSES
20 AND STUFF THAT DIRECT IMPACTS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
21 INFRASTRUCTURE COST BECAUSE I THINK THEY'RE ALL EXEMPTED FROM
22 PAYING OUR LOCAL FEES TO HELP US BE SUSTAINABLE. SO JUST WANT
23 TO BE AWARE. WAS THERE A QUESTION? OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW
24 ON THE PERMANENT RESTRICTION ON LOW INCOME, EITHER RENTALS OR
25 HOUSING AND STUFF, IS THAT MOVING FORWARD? OR IS THAT INCLUDE



September 23, 2020

1 PROPERTY THAT'S ALREADY BEEN DESIGNATED FOR A LIMITED PERIOD
2 OF TIME? >DAVE VAUTIN: TO CLARIFY ON THE RENTER PROTECTION
3 STRATEGY, THE ONLY CHANGE THAT'S BEEN MADE TO THAT STRATEGY TO
4 WHAT YOU ALL HAVE APPROVED IN FEBRUARY ARE ADDITIONS OF SOME
5 LEGAL SERVICES FOR TENANTS INCORPORATING THAT INTO THE MIX. SO
6 IT REMAINS THE SAME AS WHAT WAS PREVIOUSLY APPROVED.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU. LAST THING HERE, I BELIEVE,
9 IS THE ALL LANE TOLLING THAT WAS PRESENTED TO OUR JURISDICTION
10 AS BEING STUDIED THEN STAFF RESPONDED THAT IT'S ALREADY BEEN
11 STUDIED, AND IT'S JUST THAT IT SEEMS TO BE THAT'S THE ONLY
12 THING THAT YOU'RE STUDYING HERE. I DON'T THINK IT'S GOING TO
13 WORK FOR OUR JURISDICTION BECAUSE OTHER STUDIES WOULD BE MORE
14 HELPFUL. FOR INSTANCE, FREE TRANSIT IN AND OUT OF SFO. 43,000
15 EMPLOYEES. PUBLIC TRANSIT, I MEAN, THOSE ARE THE TYPE OF
16 ALTERNATIVES I'M NOT SEEING HERE THAT WOULD ACHIEVE MAJOR
17 GOALS IN REDUCING GREENHOUSE GASSES, IT JUST SEEMS LIKE
18 EVERYTHING WAS PUT ALL ON THE ALL LANE TOLLING. AND I KNOW FOR
19 A FACT OUR JURISDICTION IS NOT IN SUPPORT OF THAT. AND WHERE
20 ALSO HOW DOES THAT AFFECT IF YOU'RE DOING ALL LANE TOLLING AND
21 WHAT THE GOVERNOR JUST ANNOUNCED IF WE'RE GOING TOWARD ALL
22 ELECTRIC VEHICLES THEN ARE WE -- I'M NOT SURE THE IMPACT THERE
23 IS WHAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE. SO AS FAR AS THE PROPOSAL, I
24 REALLY WISHED WE WOULD HAVE SEEN OTHER ALTERNATIVES BESIDES
25 THIS ALL LANE TOLLING, AND I THINK WE WERE REALLY CLEAR ON



September 23, 2020

1 THAT WHEN WE PRESENTED OUR LETTER. SO I WAS WONDERING WHAT
2 STAFF -- HAS THE STUDY BEEN COMPLETED OR WERE WE
3 MISREPRESENTED? >DAVE VAUTIN: I THINK A COUPLE OF POINTS ON
4 YOUR QUESTION, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, FIRST OF ALL, WE DID STUDY
5 ALL LANE TOLLING IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE FOUND THAT IT WAS A
6 MAJOR CONTRIBUTOR TO REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND
7 THAT THE MEANS-BASED TOLL POLICY ADDRESSED MANY OF THE EQUITY
8 CONCERNS THAT DOESN'T MEAN THE STUDY, THAT FURTHER STUDIES
9 AREN'T NEEDED. IN FACT WE WANT TO STUDY IT FURTHER IN THE
10 FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE HERE WITH FURTHER REFINEMENTS IDENTIFIED
11 IN THE PACKET AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN PHASE, SHOULD THE
12 STRATEGY MOVE FORWARD, A MUCH MORE COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL
13 STUDY WOULD BE NECESSARY AS A FIRST STEP. MORE WORK WOULD BE
14 REQUIRED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH ORGANIZATIONS ACROSS THE REGION.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** AS COMMISSIONER CONNOLY NOTED DEFINITION OF STRONG
17 MARKET AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, THOSE ARE REALLY VAGUE AND I
18 WOULD APPRECIATE FURTHER DEFINITION MY CITY HAS BEEN LISTED AS
19 A STRONG MARKET WE HAVE VERY MINIMAL MARKET OR BUSINESS IN OUR
20 CITY. SO CLARIFICATION ON THAT MOVING FORWARD WOULD BE
21 EXCEPTIONALLY HELPFUL. IS THAT POSSIBLE? >DAVE VAUTIN: HAPPY
22 TO ANSWER THAT RIGHT NOW. HIGH RESOURCE IS DEFINED BY THE
23 STATE. IT'S AN OFFICIAL DEFINITION APPROVED BY THE STATE OF
24 CALIFORNIA THEY DEVELOPED MAPS FOR HIGH RESOURCE AREAS WE HAVE



September 23, 2020

1 INCORPORATED THOSE MAPS YOU CAN FIND THOSE ON THE TREASURER'S
2 WEB SITE FOR THE STATE.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** STRONG MARKET? >DAVE VAUTIN: WHERE IT'S STRONG
5 MARKET WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THERE IN OUR ANALYSIS ARE THE
6 TRANSIT-RICH HIGH RESOURCE AREAS THAT OFTEN HAVE HIGHER HOME
7 VALUES. THEY HAVE HISTORICALLY HAD A STRONGER MARKET FOR
8 DEVELOPMENT.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** BUT THAT'S -- STRONGER MARKET FOR DEVELOPMENT IN
11 WHICH WAY? IS COULD YOU CLARIFY FOR ME? BECAUSE WE HAD HIGH
12 TRANSIT AND WE GOT YES HIGH HOME PRICES BUT THERE IS NO OTHER
13 LAND. WHERE IS THAT SUPPOSED TO HAPPEN. >DAVE VAUTIN: WHAT
14 WE'RE SAYING THERE IN STRONG REAL ESTATE MARKET WE'RE SAYING
15 UNDERLYING CHARACTERISTIC GREAT SCHOOLS FOR RESIDENTS, A WIDE
16 ARRAY OF PARKS, A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT SOCIAL SERVICES, THOSE
17 ARE THINGS THAT OFTEN LEAD TO HIGHER HOME VALUES AND MAKE THE
18 COMMUNITIES MORE ATTRACTIVE TO LIVE IN.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** I UNDERSTAND. THANK YOU. AGAIN, I AM SUPPORTIVE OF
21 THE AMENDMENT.

22

23 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** DAVE, IF I CAN JUMP IN, WHAT ABOUT HIGH
24 RESOURCE AND CONSTRAINED TRANSIT. >DAVE VAUTIN: WITH REGARD TO
25 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, THE COMPROMISE THAT WAS REACHED IN



September 23, 2020

1 FEBRUARY ON HIGH RESOURCE AREAS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
2 REMAINS IN THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. SO IT'S NOT ALL HIGH
3 AREAS THAT ARE IN INCORPORATED PLAN 2050 IT'S THOSE THAT MEET
4 THE MINIMUM TRANSIT THRESHOLDS THAT'S COMPROMISING MANY OF THE
5 RESOURCES ARE NEAR JOB CENTERS, AND A COMMUTER COULD USE
6 TRANSIT OR AUTO WHICH WOULD ATTRACTIVE AS WELL AND THEY WOULD
7 HAVE ACCESS TO HIGH PERFORMING SCHOOLS THIS'S DIFFERENT FROM
8 THE RHNA PROCESS WHICH IS ONE OF THE REASONS WE'RE SEEING
9 HIGHER ALLOCATIONS IN RHNA IS THAT IT BUILDS AND ACCELERATES
10 REGARDLESS OF HIGH LEVEL OF TRANSIT RESOURCE.

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** REAL QUICK BEFORE I GO TO SPERING. HOW
13 MANY TIMES HAVE WE HEARD THIS ITEM?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MULTIPLE TIMES, MR. CHAIR. OVER THE PAST
16 COUPLE OF YEARS.

17

18 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YEAH. I'M SURPRISED. DAVE, AND/OR MAYBE
19 MATT, I'M NOT SURE WHO, THE ADDITIONAL MONEYS THAT ARE BEING
20 ALLOCATED TO, AND FIRST OF ALL I'M VERY SUPPORTIVE OF HIGH
21 SPEED RAIL AND SAM'S AMENDMENT. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
22 BECAUSE IT'S STILL PRETTY FAR OUT, A LOT OF ENVIRONMENTAL WORK
23 -- THIS IS CONSIDERED PROGRAM TWO MONEY, RIGHT.

24



September 23, 2020

1 **MATT MALONEY:** THAT'S CORRECT. THIS WOULD BE PERIOD TWO OF THE
2 PLAN, THE BACK HALF.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THEN I'M FINE. SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. YOU KNOW, YOU'RE
7 HEARING ALL THE COMMENTS, AND I THINK A LOT OF THEM ARE VALID,
8 BUT WE ARE AT THE 11th HOUR, AND THERE IS A LOT OF MONEY AT
9 RISK HERE. AND I THINK AS MOST OF YOU KNOW, WHEN THIS PLAN IS
10 ADOPTED WE NOW START ON THE NEXT PLAN AND A LOT OF THE
11 STRATEGIES AND SUGGESTIONS THAT ARE BEING MADE RIGHT NOW
12 CERTAINLY WILL BE BROUGHT INTO THE NEXT PLAN. YOU KNOW, BUT
13 FOR US TO, AT THIS POINT, SAY WE WANT TO ELIMINATE THIS
14 MANDATE ON THE TELECOMMUTING IS A HUGE IMPACT ON US APPROVING
15 THIS PLAN IN A TIMELY FASHION. IT'S JUST NOT GOING TO HAPPEN.
16 STAFF -- I DON'T BELIEVE IS GOING TO FIND THE EQUIVALENT
17 BENEFITS BETWEEN NOW AND THE END OF THIS YEAR. DAVID YOU MIGHT
18 WANT TO HELP ME ON THIS WE EMBARKED ON THIS SEVERAL YEARS AGO,
19 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS SAID THIS IS
20 GOING TO BE VERY DIFFICULT AND VERY UNCOMFORTABLE FOR US TO
21 MOVE FORWARD AND I THINK THE OPTIONS THAT STAFF HAS PUT IN I
22 THINK ARE MANAGEABLE AT THIS POINT. I UNDERSTAND THE
23 IMPLICATION. ISSUES THAT NICK IS RAISING, I THINK NEED TO BE
24 EXPLORED A LOT MORE. BUT I JUST REALLY WOULD CAUTION STAFF ON
25 JUST MAKING AMENDMENTS TO THE PLAN THAT REALLY WE CAN'T



September 23, 2020

1 JUSTIFY OR WE CAN'T MEET THOSE TARGETS, AND YOU KNOW, I WOULD,
2 YOU KNOW, MAYBE MATT OR DAVE CAN JUST COMMENT REAL BRIEFLY BUT
3 IF WE START AMENDING THIS PLAN AT THIS LATE HOUR, I MEAN, DO
4 YOU HAVE ANY RABBITS IN YOUR HAT THAT'S GOING TO GET US
5 THROUGH THE THRESHOLD, TO THE FINISH LINE? >DAVE VAUTIN: SO AT
6 THIS POINT SPERING, WE'RE FEEL LIKE WE HAVE PULLED OUT EVERY
7 RABBIT IN THE HAT IS MAYBE SEARCHED FOR SOME MORE RABBITS.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH. AND THAT'S THE POINT I'M MAKING AND
10 THE OTHER QUESTION I WANT TO ASK, YOU'RE COMING BACK TO US AT
11 THE END OF THE YEAR WITH ADDITIONAL STRATEGIES THIS IS ON
12 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES OR SOMETHING. WHEN THAT COMES BACK TO US
13 SOME OF THE SUGGESTIONS THAT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHER
14 COMMISSIONERS HAVE MADE, YOU CAN GUYS AT LEAST BE LOOKING AT
15 THOSE TO SEE IF THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, ANY BENEFITS OR ANY
16 EQUIVALENTS THAT WOULD CLOSE THAT GAP TO WHERE MAYBE IT'S NOT
17 THE SIX PERCENT THRESHOLD. IS THAT NOT SOMETHING THAT COULD BE
18 AT LEAST LOOKED AT? >DAVE VAUTIN: ABSOLUTELY.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THAT'S ALL I NEED. DAVE ALL I WANTED WAS A
21 YES. MY MOTION, AND HOPE -- SAM, FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU. I
22 FELT WE WOULD HAVE BEEN REMISS IF WE DIDN'T HIGHLIGHT HIGH
23 SPEED RAIL AND I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING THAT FORWARD AND I'M
24 GLAD THAT WORKED OUT SO I'M HOPING YOU'RE PROBABLY GOING TO BE
25 DISAPPOINTED IN THE MOTION I'M GOING TO MAKE BUT THE MOTION IS



September 23, 2020

1 GOING TO BE THAT WE ADOPT THIS PLAN THAT'S BEING PRESENTED TO
2 US TODAY AND THAT WE DIRECT STAFF TO LOOK AT POTENTIAL
3 STRATEGIES THAT WILL GIVE US THE EQUIVALENT OF THAT 60 PERCENT
4 MANDATED TELECOMMUTE. SO THAT WOULD BE THE MOTION. SO WHAT IT
5 DOES, IS IT OPENS THE DOOR FOR STAFF, IF HE'S LOOKING AT
6 STRATEGY BETWEEN NOW AND THE END OF THE YEAR. SO THAT WOULD BE
7 THE MOTION, MR. CHAIRMAN, BUT I JUST WANT TO TELL THE
8 COMMISSION THAT, YOU KNOW, THIS IS THE 11th HOUR. WE HAVE BEEN
9 WORKING ON THIS. A LOT OF THESE ISSUES HAVE BEEN ADDRESSED I
10 DON'T KNOW OF ANOTHER WAY WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THE FINISH
11 LINE. I WOULD ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH WHAT
12 STAFF HAS PRESENTED AND THAT WE START WORKING ON THESE
13 STRATEGIES WHERE WE REALLY NEED TO CHANGE IT IN THE NEXT PLAN
14 THAT WE ADOPT THAT WE REALLY CAN ADOPT LIKE THE ISSUES SAN
15 FRANCISCO IS RAISING. THAT WOULD BE MY MOTION MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'LL SECOND THE MOTION MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND I'M GOING TO
20 STOP ON THE COMMISSIONER FOR A MINUTE I WANT TO GIVE THE
21 PUBLIC AN IDEA OF THE DIRECTION WE'RE GOING BUT NOW WE HAVE A
22 LOT OF PUBLIC SPEAKERS JAKE IF YOU CAN HOLD IN THERE OR NOT.

23



September 23, 2020

1 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I UNDERSTAND MR. CHAIR. I DO HAVE THE MEDICAL
2 APPOINTMENT AT TWO. I JUST DIDN'T THINK WE WERE GOING TO BE
3 GOING THIS LONG.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** NO WE -- WELL, I NEVER THINK WE'RE
6 GOING TO GO THIS LONG. SO, AGAIN, MY --

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** MR. HAGGERTY, I'LL GIVE YOU AN
9 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE AMENDMENT AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YES. I'M GOING TO GO TO THE PUBLIC NOW,
12 JAKE, DO YOU WANT TO PULL YOUR SECONDS? BECAUSE YOUR NOT GOING
13 TO BE HERE. VAL, JOHN --

14

15 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'LL MAKE MY MOTION MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DO I HAVE A SECOND.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** WHO?

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALFREDO.

24

25 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. KIMBERLY CALL THE SPEAKERS.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR HOW MANY MINUTES WOULD YOU LIKE?

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** MINUTE AND A HALF.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIRST SPEAKER IS VAL MINOTTI, PLEASE
7 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS VAN WITH BART. CHIEF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
10 OFFICER. FIRST I WANT TO THANK YOU AND STAFF FOR YOUR WORK. I
11 WANT TO THANK STAFF AND THE COMMISSION ON THE TRANSIT
12 INVESTMENTS STATE OF GOOD REPAIR IT'S IMPORTANT TO MAINTAIN
13 OUR EXISTING SYSTEM. SECOND ONE IS THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL
14 CROSSING IT'S A BIG MEGA REGIONAL PROJECT THAT WILL INCLUDE
15 BOTH COMMUTER RAIL AND BART TECHNOLOGIES IT'S KEY TO MAKE
16 LINKAGES IN THE REGION. SECOND I WOULD SAY I DO HAVE CONCERNS
17 ABOUT THE MANDATE FOR THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING. WE -- OUR
18 SUPPORT OF GETTING TO THE GREENHOUSE REDUCTIONS EMISSIONS AND
19 APPRECIATE SPERING'S COMPROMISED PROPOSAL. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN BATE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS JOHN BATE. I'M WITH THE ADVOCACY
24 GROUP ENVIRONMENTALISTS SPEAK FOR THE PEOPLE. I WANT TO SPEAK
25 ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE, EMPLOYEES WORKING FROM HOME



September 23, 2020

1 THREE OUT OF FIVE DAYS A WEEK WILL OPT TO WORK AT HOME FIVE
2 OUT OF FIVE DAYS A WEEK MAKING EXODUS FROM THE BAY AREA.
3 ACCOMMODATED POPULATION GROWTH IN A SUSTAINABLE MANNER TO
4 OTHER REGIONS THIS DOESN'T REDUCE OVERALL EMISSIONS. OTHER
5 REGIONS HAVE HIGHER PER CAPITA USAGE. THIS IS AN ABJECT
6 FAILURE OF PLANNING. WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO REVIEW THE COMMENTS
7 SUBMITTED BY GROUPS SUCH AS URBAN ENVIRONMENTALISTS WHICH
8 PROPOSE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION POLICIES
9 PARTICULARLY REMOVAL OF FREEWAY INFRASTRUCTURE WE CAN REMOVE
10 GREENHOUSE GAS IF WE REDUCE CARBON EMISSIONS BY IMPROVES
11 ENVIRONMENTALLY AND BELT OF LIFE RATHER THAN EXCLUDING FROM
12 QUALITY OF THE REGION OR WORK FROM HOME.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS LAST FOUR DIGITS 6262, MR.
15 LEBRUN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. IN A MINUTE AND A HALF, I WANT TO THANK
18 MAYOR LICCARDO FOR THE APPROACH HE'S TAKING BUT I BELIEVE THAT
19 WE'RE GOING TO SEE HIGH SPEED RAIL WHERE IT'S ALREADY MADE IN
20 THE BAY AREA AND EVENTUALLY CONNECT TO THE CENTRAL VALLEY AND
21 THE REST OF THE STATE, NOT THE OTHER WAY AROUND. THING I WANT
22 TO TALK ABOUT IS ADDING ONE RABBIT TO TODAY'S TASK. IS YOU
23 CANNOT POSSIBLY MAKE A SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION IN GHGS IF YOU DO
24 NOT LOOK AT GOODS MOVEMENTS. STARTING WITH STRATEGIC PLANNING
25 OF THE LOCATION OF DISTRIBUTION CENTERS AND I WOULD CALL THEM.



September 23, 2020

1 HDH HIGH DISTRIBUTION AREAS LOOK WHAT HAPPENED IN SAN JOSE,
2 DISTRIBUTION CENTER WAS NIXED NOW WE'RE GETTING FOUR
3 DISTRIBUTION CENTERS, INCLUDING AMAZON. THIS WAS NOT PLANNED
4 PROPERLY ALL DISTRIBUTION CENTERS ARE EAST OF HIGHWAY 101.
5 PRIOR TO THAT THOSE DISTRIBUTION CENTERS WERE AGAINST THE
6 CALTRAIN TRACKS THAT WE GOT TO ELECTRIFY BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND
7 GILROY AND I WANT YOU TO THINK ABOUT AMAZON WHAT WE'RE GOING
8 TO DO, THEY'RE GOING TO BE DISTRIBUTORS WITH EVERYTHING
9 WITHDRAWN. HOW IS THAT GOING TO WORK. 15 MILES AWAY FROM THE
10 PLACE WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO BE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN SAN
11 JOSE FOR EXAMPLE, IF AMAZON COULD BE LOCATED IN THE CAPITAL
12 EXPRESS WAY AREA. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KEN BUKOWSKI.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. A COUPLE THINGS ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA. I'M
17 NOT SURE HOW REALISTIC IT IS. REVENUE IS OPTIMISTIC TO SAY THE
18 LEAST. HOW ARE THEY GOING TO PROVIDE THE HOUSING REQUIRED IS
19 HOW ARE THEY GOING TO EXIST UNDER THE CURRENT CIRCUMSTANCES.
20 THERE IS NOTHING ABOUT FUTURE RIGHTS HERE. MAYBE WE DON'T WANT
21 TO PUSH EVERYBODY INTO BUSES OR ACCELERATE RIDE-SHARE.
22 CARPOOLING DIDN'T WORK BUT WE COULD PROVIDE A FINANCIAL
23 INCENTIVE THROUGH REGISTRATION FEES WHICH WOULD GET PEOPLE
24 ENCOURAGED TO USE RIDE-SHARE WITH THEIR CARS. OTHER THING IS
25 ALL LANE TOLLING. I DON'T KNOW WHO YOU'RE SERVING WHO THINK



September 23, 2020

1 THIS IS A GOOD IDEA BUT EVERYBODY I SPEAK TO THINKS IT'S A
2 DISASTER. IT HURTS THE ECONOMY. JUST LIKE THE EXPRESS LANE
3 IMPACTS LOW INCOME PEOPLE. DRIVING DOWN HIGH RENTS AND THEY
4 CAN'T AFFORD TO TRAVEL WE NEED IT AS A MAIN OBJECTIVE IN THIS
5 PLAN. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SABIK TRADAN.
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS SABEEK AND I ENCOURAGE YOU NOT TO
11 IMPLEMENT THIS MANDATE. THIS INDUSTRY CONTINUES TO BE
12 CONCENTRATED HERE DESPITE OUR ASTRONOMICAL COST OF LIVING OF
13 THE PROPOSING THIS MANDATE WILL IMPACT PRODUCTIVITY AND WORK
14 SATISFACTION AND WILL HAVE A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON PEOPLE WITH
15 ROOMMATES WHO CAN'T BE AS EFFECTIVE WHEN WORKING FROM HOME.
16 REDUCING CARBON EMISSIONS IS OF IMPORTANCE BUT WORK FROM HOME
17 MANDATE IS THE WRONG APPROACH. BIKING AND WALKING OVER DRIVING
18 IS SO PEOPLE CAN GET TO WORK WITHOUT CARBON INTO THE AIR.
19 INSTEAD OF DOING WHAT WE'RE CURRENTLY DOING CUTTING TRANSIT
20 AND MAKING PARKING FREE. WE NEED TO PUT MORE OFFICE
21 DEVELOPMENT INTO CITY CENTERS RATHER THAN SPRAWLING CITY PARKS
22 THAT FORCE EMPLOYEES TO DRIVE. I URGE YOU ALL NOT TO APPROVE
23 IT AND I URGE YOU ALL TO REALLY EMPHASIZE POSITIVE SOLUTIONS
24 RATHER THAN POINTLESS MANDATES. THANK YOU.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ALIX SUITE
2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS ALIX SWEET
5 TRANSPORTATION SUPERVISOR TO MAYOR LONDON BREED IN SAN
6 FRANCISCO FOR THE MANDATE FOR WORKERS TO WORK FROM HOME, I
7 SINCERELY APPRECIATE MTC SHOWING WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO MEET
8 THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS GOALS WITH THE TELECOMMUTE
9 STRATEGY HOWEVER I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THE STRATEGY AND
10 IMPLEMENTATION CANNOT BE ONE SIZE FITS ALL THE WAY THE
11 STRATEGY IS WORDED IGNORES THE BENEFITS OF THE APPROXIMATELY
12 70 PERCENT OF PEOPLE WHO WORK BIKE WALK AND TAKE TRANSIT IN
13 SAN FRANCISCO MANDATING 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE MAY AFFECT
14 RECOVERY AND WILL HAVE IMPLICATIONS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND ON
15 SERVICES THAT DEPEND ON DOWNTOWN TAX INCOME. WE BELIEVE THE
16 STRATEGY NEEDS REVISIONS PREFERABLY NOW OR IN THE
17 IMPLEMENTATION PHASE TO REDUCING COMMUTES RATHER THAN BLANKET
18 TELECOMMUTE. THANK YOU FOR ALL OF YOUR WORK AND TIME.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS BEVEN D.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I AM BEVEN D MEMBER OF THE BARC BOARD OF DIRECTORS
23 AND I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR UPLIFTING THE RAIL TRANSBAY
24 CORRIDOR AND I WANT TO POINT OUT THE SURVEY RESEARCH WE HAVE
25 DONE SHOWS THAT IN THE MEGA REGION 80 PERCENT OF THE



September 23, 2020

1 RESPONDENTS FELT WE SHOULD BE MOVING FORWARD TO FIX OUR
2 TRANSIT SYSTEM AND TO MAKE IT MORE EFFECTIVE AND SPECIFICALLY
3 WHEN PRESENTED WITH NTRC, 80 PERCENT OF THE MEGA REGION AND 84
4 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA SAID THAT THIS IS REALLY AN ESSENTIAL
5 PROJECT. I'M HONORED TO BE DAD OF A 14-YEAR-OLD I DON'T THINK
6 HE'S GOING TO THANK ME FOR BARC INVOLVEMENT IT'S GOING TO BE
7 DOWN THE ROAD WHERE GENERATIONS ARE GOING TO ENJOY A SEAMLESS
8 TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THAT WE HAVE TIED OUR RAIL SYSTEMS TOGETHER
9 SO THEY CAN BE MOST EFFECTIVE AS POSSIBLE. I WOULD ALSO LIKE
10 TO SAY I THINK THIS PROJECT AND YOU CITE IT AS ADDRESSING
11 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND I THINK THAT IS ABSOLUTELY
12 ESSENTIAL. AND THAT WE ARE ATTACHING AN EQUITY VISION TO THE
13 NEW RAIL CROSSING AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE SIGNIFICANT I
14 APPRECIATE SO MUCH THE OPPORTUNITY TO TESTIFY AND IF I COULD I
15 WOULD LIKE TO CONGRATULATE CHAIR HAGGERTY FOR 20 YEARS OF
16 SERVICE TO THE MTC AND TO THE BAY AREA THROUGH THE MTC. THANK
17 YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU BEVEN.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM SEAMLESS
22 BAY AREA. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. COMMISSIONERS THIS IS ADINA LEVIN. CAN YOU
25 HEAR ME? AND I DO NOT KNOW WHY ZOOM DOES THAT. I WOULD LIKE TO



September 23, 2020

1 SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF THE PROPOSAL FROM COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ
2 TO SUPPORT A REQUIREMENT FOR NON-DRIVE ALONE, BUT NOT
3 REQUIRING ONE SPECIFIC MODE BEING TELEWORK TO NOT DRIVE ALONE.
4 YOU KNOW, REQUIRING PEOPLE WHO WALK TO WORK TO STAY HOME
5 INSTEAD, MAKES NO SENSE AS MANY PEOPLE HAVE ALREADY MENTIONED
6 WAYS TO ACHIEVE THAT, SEAMLESS BAY AREA DID FORWARD YOU A
7 REPORT WHICH WE HAVE RECENTLY COMPLETED. WE HAD SHARED AN
8 EARLIER DRAFT OF THAT REPORT TO YOU, SHOWING THAT THERE IS A
9 STRONG CORRELATION BETWEEN THE AMOUNT OF TRANSIT SERVICE AND
10 THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. SO WE WOULD ENCOURAGE THE
11 VERSION THAT COMES TO YOU FOR EXPERIMENTAL REVIEW, TO HAVE A
12 VERSION THAT GETS US TO THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE THAT THEY
13 HAVE -- WHAT WE HAVE HERE CORRELATED WITH AN INCREASE IN
14 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP INCREASING TRANSIT SERVICE IS NOT THE ONLY
15 THING WE NEED TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IN THE LONG RANGE
16 PLAN WE NEED CHANGES AS AN ESSENTIAL COMPONENT AND WE
17 RECOMMEND THAT APPROVAL STRATEGY IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
18 AS A WAY TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS GAP. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CLIFF LENTZ,
21 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. I'M CLIFF LENTZ BRISBANE
24 CITY COUNCILMEMBER. I WANT TO SAY MYSELF AND THE CITY OF
25 BRISBANE SUPPORTS REGIONAL PLANNING THAT MAKES SENSE AND



September 23, 2020

1 CREATES COLLABORATIVE FEEDBACK FROM LOCAL GOVERNMENT. CITY OF
2 BRISBANE PASSED MEASURE JJ IN 2018 SO HOUSING COULD OCCUR IN
3 THE BAY LANDS THIS ACTION BY CITIZENS WILL DOUBLE THE
4 POPULATION OF OUR CITY THIS WAS NOT AN EASY ENDEAVOR BUT WE
5 WORKED WITH OUR COMMUNITY AND STATE REPRESENTATIVES TO COME UP
6 WITH A BALANCE THE PLAN. SUPPORTED BY THE DEVELOPER AND
7 HOUSING ADVOCATES, AND SENATOR SCOTT WIENER SHOWING PEOPLE OF
8 CALIFORNIA HOW TO DO IT RIGHT FOR ADDRESSING THE HOUSING
9 CRISIS. MOVING FORWARD TO INCREASE HOUSING PRODUCTION BY 100
10 PERCENT FOR WHATEVER REASON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROPOSES
11 THAT BRISBANE INCREASE ITS HOUSING STOCK QUITE POSSIBLY UP TO
12 ABOUT 450 PERCENT. ALSO, THE AREAS WHERE HOUSING IS BEING
13 PROPOSED IS LOCATED ON LAND THAT HOUSING SHOULD NOT BE
14 DEVELOPED ON. SUCH AS FORMER UNREGULATED GARBAGE DUMP NEXT TO
15 A PROCESSING FACILITY ON A CURRENT PG&E SUBSTATION, AREAS THAT
16 ARE VULNERABLE TO SEA LEVEL RISE. NOW, I'M NOT SAYING POSTPONE
17 YOUR VOTE TODAY. IN FACT I'M NOURISHING YOU TO MOVE FORWARD IN
18 THE PROCESS, HOWEVER, WHAT I AM ASKING IS THAT WE CONVENE A
19 MEETING WITH THE CITY OF BRISBANE, SAN MATEO COUNTY
20 REPRESENTATIVES, PBA2050 STAFF AND EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE
21 MCMILLAN. THERE SEEMS TO BE A DISCONNECT WITH OUR CITY THAT
22 NEEDS GET IRONS OUT. THERESE, I'M ASKING YOU IF YOU COULD HAVE
23 YOUR STAFF REACH OUT TO OUR CITY MANAGER CLAY HOLSTEIN TO
24 ADDRESS THEE ISSUES AND MOVE FORWARD TO DEVELOP A REALISTIC
25 MISSION FOR BRISBANE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE WANT TO MAKE



September 23, 2020

1 SOMETHING HAPPEN BUT WHAT'S BEING ADDRESSED RIGHT NOW IS JUST
2 UNREALISTIC. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DAVE, IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT YOU
5 WORK WITH ALL THE PLANNING DIRECTORS FROM ALL THE CITIES?

6

7 **DAVE CORTESE:** THAT'S CORRECT. WE HAD SEVERAL MEETINGS WITH THE
8 BRISBANE TEAM ALREADY THROUGHOUT PROCESS.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. NEXT
11 PERSON.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS KEVIN MA, PLEASE UNMUTE
14 YOURSELF.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MTC COMMISSIONERS, KEVIN MA, I SUPPORT THE
17 REQUIREMENT WE ALL RECOGNIZE GHGS ARE ONE COMPONENT OF TRANSIT
18 OF GOING TO WORK BUT TELEWORK IS INCREDIBLY INEQUITABLE IN THE
19 CURRENT SYSTEM BASED ON HOW PEOPLE LIVE IN THEIR HOMES HOW
20 PEOPLE ACTUALLY GET TO WORK AS OF RIGHT NOW AND THE KINDS OF
21 WORK AN EMPLOYEE HAS TO DO TO GET THEIR HOME SETUP FOR
22 EMPLOYER WORK. TECH IS FINE BUT RETAIL IS MUCH HARDER TO DO,
23 THERE IS GOING TO BE INEQUITY, THE CARS TRIPS FOCUS IS THE
24 MAJORITY OF WHERE EMISSIONS COME FROM IN THE PROCESS WE SHOULD
25 SUPPORT MECHANISMS TO GET THEM ON TRANSIT THEN THEY GET TO USE



September 23, 2020

1 TRANSIT OUTSIDE OF WORK TOO T INSTEAD, WHICH IS SHOWN IN THE
2 OTHER SLIDE FOR THE TOLLING STRUCTURE THAT ACTUALLY CAN FUND
3 THESE THINGS. 60 PERCENT MANDATE IS KIND OF HARD TO MEET WE
4 SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON THING THAT ARE LIKELY TO HAPPEN. IT'S
5 HARD IN THIS CURRENT FINANCIAL SITUATION.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS STEVEN BUS, PLEASE UNMUTE
8 YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS STEVEN BUS FROM SAN FRANCISCO. I'M PART
11 OF YIMBY ACTION HERE IN THE CITY. I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS MY
12 STRONG DISAPPROVAL OF THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. WE ARE ALL
13 SACRIFICING, NOW, TO REDUCE THE SPREAD OF THE VIRUS BUT NO ONE
14 IS WORKING FROM HOME. IT'S PROBABLY FINE IF YOU OWN A BIG
15 HOUSE OUT IN THE SUBURBS AND YOU'RE ENGINEER RETIREMENT BUT
16 FOR YOUNG WORKERS LIKE ME WHO LIVE IN CROWDED CONDITIONS
17 WORKING FROM HOME IS TERRIBLE. MYSELF AND FRIENDS OF MINE HAVE
18 ALL FALLEN INTO DEPRESSION. WE DO NOT WANT TO CONTINUE THIS AS
19 A LIFESTYLE. AND BY FORCING WORKERS TO WORK FROM HOME, YOU ARE
20 GUARANTEEING THAT WE JUST LEAVE. AND I DON'T HAVE TO REMIND
21 YOU, BUT OUR OBLIGATIONS REQUIRE GROWTH. AND IF THE REGION
22 STARTS TO SHRINK BECAUSE OF MANDATES YOUR PENSIONS WILL DRY
23 UP. NO ONE WANTS THIS TO HAPPEN. SO GOING FORWARD, PLEASE
24 STRIKE THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. THIS IS A TERRIBLE WAY TO



September 23, 2020

1 LIVE. AND AS SAID IT'S INEQUITABLE FOR PEOPLE WHO LIVE --

2 [INDISCERNIBLE]

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADAM PABLAKA.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO BRIEFLY, CHAIR HAGGERTY HAD MENTIONED THAT
11 HE WAS SURPRISED BY ALL OF THIS TALK ON HOUSING. BUT HOUSING
12 AND TRANSIT ARE INTRINSICALLY RELATED. YOU CAN'T SEPARATE
13 THEM. I THINK IT COMES BACK TO WHAT LIBBY SCHAAF SAID EARLIER
14 SHE WANTED THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME BUT LIKE MANY FOLKS
15 HERE THAT'S SIMPLY NOT EQUITABLE. YOU LOOK AT WHO IS CALLING
16 IN RIGHT NOW NOBODY IN THE RETAIL SECTOR NOBODY LOW INCOME IS
17 ABLE TO CALL IN. ALL OF THOSE OF US CALLING IN WORK FROM HOME
18 WHO HAVE THE JOBS TO COVER THIS. I THINK THE PROBLEM HERE, IT
19 GOES BACK TO THE OLD HENRY FORD QUOTE YOU ASK PEOPLE WHAT THEY
20 WANT THEY WILL SAY THEY WANT A FASTER HORSE. A 60 PERCENT WORK
21 FROM HOME MANDATE IS THE FASTER FORCE. WHAT YOU NEED IS
22 REDUCTION IN GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS. SIMPLY, MANDATING WORK FROM
23 HOME ISN'T GOING TO BENEFIT THE FOLKS WHO HAVE MONEY IT'S
24 GOING TO BENEFIT THE FOLKS WHO CAN BUYER BIGGER HOMES OR EVEN
25 BUY UNITS EVICTING LOW INCOME FOLKS AND MERGE 1, 2 BEDROOMS TO



September 23, 2020

1 MAKE A BEDROOM FOR ZOOM. I ENCOURAGE COMMISSIONERS TO FOCUS ON
2 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION AS A GOAL BUT DO NOT REQUIRE 60
3 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME THAT'S INEQUITABLE AND WILL HURT THOSE
4 OF US WHO CAN'T AFFORD IT AND ARE ABLE TO AT LEAST WORK FROM
5 HOME.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'M SORRY. BUT WE KEEP
8 ADDING SPEAKERS SO I'M GOING TO HAVE TO MOVE IT IF WHAT'S BEEN
9 ADDED IN THE BEGINNING I WOULD HAVE STARTED WITH A MINUTE PER
10 SPEAKER BECAUSE WE'RE STILL AT 29 SPEAKERS. SO, ONE MINUTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SELINE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M SALIM, A BAY AREA NATIVE. I WAS REALLY HAPPY
15 TO HEAR THE COMMENTS I HEARD FROM JOSEFOWITZ, AND I HOPE
16 THAT'S THE DIRECTION COUNCIL GOES IN. I THINK THE 60 PERCENT
17 WORK FROM HOME MANDATE IS OUTRAGE FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE. IT'S
18 TAKEN AS LITERAL POLICY THAT YOU WOULD IMPLEMENT. MTC DOES NOT
19 HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. EVEN AS A STRATEGY IT'S SOMEWHAT OUTRAGE.
20 YOU KNOW, I THINK A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO WORK FROM HOME DON'T
21 LIKE WORKING FROM HOME. I'M ONE OF THEM, AND ADDITIONALLY IT
22 WOULD HURT THE LOCAL ECONOMY, WHICH IN LARGE PART DEPENDS ON
23 PEOPLE MOVING AROUND OUTSIDE OF THEIR OWN TOWN AND GOING TO
24 PLACES WHERE THEY WORK. AND, ADDITIONALLY, I, YOU KNOW, I
25 THINK THAT THERE REALLY ISN'T AN ENVIRONMENTAL POINT TO JUST



September 23, 2020

1 TAPPING WORK FROM HOME WHEN YOU COULD HAVE OTHER SUSTAINABLE
2 WAYS OF GETTING TO WORK. I DO SUPPORT THE AMENDMENT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS STACY
5 RANDECKER.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. SORRY. I WASN'T READY FOR THAT. I'M A 20 YEAR
8 RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND AN ADVOCATE FOR ALL THE OUTCOMES
9 THAT YOU'RE SEEKING. I FOCUSED ON MAKING THIS REGION BETTER,
10 AND THE PLANET, VIA TRANSPORTATION. AND I'M SIMPLY IN SHOCK AT
11 THE THINKING AROUND THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE YES
12 WE WANT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES BUT WHY AREN'T YOU
13 CONSIDERING TRANSIT, WALKING, BIKING? YOU HAVE EVER RIDDEN
14 TRANSIT. YOU HAVE RIDDEN TRANSIT LATELY? I DID THE OTHER NIGHT
15 CALTRAIN WAS EMPTY FROM FRONT TO BACK AND I DON'T KNOW HOW
16 THEY'RE GOING TO SURVIVE COVID. WORK FROM HOME MANDATE MAY
17 WORK FOR HIGH INCOME WORKERS BUT IT'S GOING TO DECIMATE
18 TRANSIT DOWNTOWN COMMUTERS AND LEAD TO DESTROYING THE BAY
19 AREA. BECAUSE IF THAT WORKER CAN WORK FROM HOME, WHY DO THEY
20 NEED TO LIVE HERE? WHY COULDN'T THEY BE IN PEORIA ILLINOIS OR
21 INDIA. WORK FROM HOME WILL HAVE TREMENDOUS UNINTENDED
22 CONSEQUENCES BUT THERE IS A RABBIT IN THE HAT, A WAY TO HAVE
23 BETTER OUTCOMES THAN THIS 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE WE
24 NEED TO FOCUS ON EVERY INDIVIDUAL NOT JUST COMMUTE TRIPS FOR
25 LARGE EMPLOYERS. YOU CAN DO THIS. YOU CAN PUT DEVICES IN THE



September 23, 2020

1 CARS. IF YOU SIMPLY REQUIRE IT THROUGH PUBLIC POLICY, YOU
2 COULD APPLY POLICY TO VEHICLE UTILIZATION AND NOT JUST FOR
3 SOME COMPUTERS. YOU COULD THEN SHIFT TO TRACKING HOW THAT
4 VEHICLE WAS USED, WHERE IT IS USED AND WHEN AND PRICE IT
5 ACCORDINGLY. AND IT WOULD BE NOTHING TO YOU. IT IS A LOW COST
6 THING YOU CAN PUT INSIDE THE CARS. AND IT WOULD ELIMINATE THE
7 TOLLING AND CONGESTION PRICING SOLUTIONS. YOU CAN IMPLEMENT IT
8 QUICKLY AND YOU CAN GET EFFECTIVE EFFICIENT EQUITABLE AND
9 EXPERIMENTALLY SOUND TRANSIT. PLEASE CONSIDER --

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. YOUR TIME IS UP. THANK YOU.
12 KIMBERLY.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARE YOU THERE? I CAN'T HEAR YOU MR. CHAIR.
15 YOU'RE FROZEN.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT ONE -- SO HELP ME
18 OUT IF I DON'T HEAR --

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** CAN YOU HEAR ME KIMBERLY?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I CAN HEAR YOU NOW.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I NEED TO HEAR THE TIMER GO OFF ON
2 THAT. IF I HAPPEN TO MISS IT PLEASE CATCH IT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I WILL. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVID
5 PAGE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI THANKS EVERYONE THANKS TO THE STAFF AND
8 COMMISSIONERS FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK. I'M WITH 350 SOL CON
9 VALLEY TELEWORK TEAM AND WE'RE REALLY OVERJOYED WITH THIS
10 PROPOSAL ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT RULE. THERE IS BEEN A LOT OF
11 TALK ABOUT HOW MUCH THERE IS PROBLEMS WITH TELEWORK. AND I
12 THINK ALL OF US KNOW THE GOOD AND BAD OF IT WE HAVE BEEN
13 THROUGH IT FOR THE LAST SEVERAL MONTHS BUT THERE IS NOT SO
14 MUCH TALK ABOUT THE PROBLEMS WITH WILDFIRES AND HURRICANES AND
15 THE INEVITABLE GRADUAL WORSENING OF CLIMATE THROUGHOUT THE
16 WORLD THE PEOPLE WHO DIE FROM GREENHOUSE GAS PHENOMENAL IS
17 GOING TO BE WORSE IN THE THIRD WORLD. TERMS OF EQUITY AND
18 BENEFIT IS OUT OF BALANCE IN TERMS OF WHAT WE SHOULD BE DOING
19 TO GET THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS DOWN.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. YOUR TIME IS UP.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MR. PAGE. NEXT SPEAKER IS CLIFF
24 BARGER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** HI THANK YOU. MY NAME IS CLIFF. I LIVE IN SAN
2 FRANCISCO. ESPECIALLY AFTER WHAT WE WENT THROUGH THE LAST FEW
3 WEEKS I COULDN'T AGREE MORE STRONGLY WITH THE GOALS TO LIMIT
4 OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. I THINK THAT'S SUPER IMPORTANT
5 BUT I WANT TO REALLY EMPHASIZE MY AGREEMENT WITH COMMISSIONER
6 JOSEFOWITZ. 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE JUST REALLY
7 DOESN'T MAKE ANY SENSE FOR OUR REGION. I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY
8 WE WOULD BE MANDATING SO MANY PEOPLE WORK FROM HOME WHEN THEY
9 COULD TAKE MORE SUSTAINABLE MODES OF TRANSPORTATION AND HAVE
10 ESSENTIALLY THE SAME IMPACT, ESPECIALLY WHEN WE KNOW THAT
11 THERE ARE SO MANY POTENTIAL REGRESSIVE CONCERNS WITH FORCING
12 PEOPLE TO WORK FROM HOME WHO DO NOT HAVE THE LARGE LIVING
13 ROOMS OR ROOM, HOME OFFICES, IF THEY LIVE WITH MULTIPLE
14 ROOMMATES. PERSONALLY I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO WHEN I CAN GET
15 BACK INTO MY OFFICE ON A MORE REGULAR BASIS AND COLLABORATION
16 WITH MY EMPLOYEES BUILDING MEDICAL DEVICES. I CAN'T -- I'M NOT
17 AS EFFECTIVE WORKING FROM HOME. AND I DON'T THINK I'M ALONE
18 HERE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM THE BAY AREA AIR
21 QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. I CAN'T SEE YOUR NAME. PLEASE
22 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** YES GOOD AFTERNOON MR. CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS I'M
25 HILKIN PLANNING DIRECTOR AT THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY



September 23, 2020

1 MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. I WANT TO EXPRESS THE AIR DISTRICT'S
2 SUPPORT FOR THE STAFF PROPOSAL BEFORE YOU TODAY.
3 TRANSPORTATION IS THE LARGEST SOURCE OF GREENHOUSE GASSES AND
4 AIR POLLUTION IN THE BAY AREA. AND WE SIMPLY WILL NOT MAKE OUR
5 GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS AND AIR POLLUTION GOALS, ESPECIALLY IN
6 OUR MOST IMPACTED COMMUNITIES IF WE DO NOT REDUCE VEHICLE
7 MILES TRAVELED. SO STAFF HAS ASSEMBLED A BOLD AND
8 COMPREHENSIVE SET OF STRATEGIES FOR YOU, AND WE SUPPORT THE
9 PROPOSED BLUEPRINT BEFORE AND YOU WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING
10 WITH YOU IN THE YEARS AHEAD WHEN YOU HAVE COMPLETED THIS
11 PROCESS NEXT YEAR, THANKS.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS BOB ALAN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANKS COMMISSIONERS. I WANT TO ECHO THE COMMENTS
16 THAT ADINA LEVIN ENCOURAGED TO YOU HOPEFULLY LOOK AT WHAT WE
17 THINK AS A HIGH QUALITY CONSULTANT PROPOSAL ABOUT HOW WE CAN
18 INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AS A KEY STRATEGY AND HOPE YOU'LL
19 INCORPORATE THAT. MOST OF US AGREE ON THE NEED TO HAVE A
20 SERIOUS TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY. I THINK PUTTING ONE OUT THERE
21 THAT SEEMS TO HAVE IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES, IS UNREALISTIC AND
22 UNINTENDED EQUITY IMPACTS WARRANTS SERIOUS REEVALUATION OF THE
23 POLICY YOU ADOPT LOOK AT A TELECOMMUTE STRATEGY ONE THAT'S
24 GOING TO REDUCE YOUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS. STAFF HAS
25 AN IMPOSSIBLE JOB I THINK WE ALL ACKNOWLEDGE THAT I HOPE WE



September 23, 2020

1 RELY ON STRATEGY THAT WE THINK ACTUALLY HAVE A REALISTIC
2 OPPORTUNITY FOR IMPLEMENTATION AND TAKE A LOOK AT WHAT
3 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ PUT IN THE MIX IN THE ROUND TRIP
4 CAPPING AND OTHER IDEAS THAT WILL GET US TO THE SAME OUTCOME.
5 THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JONATHON C.
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS JONATHON CASS SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF
11 SPUR. WE APPRECIATE ALL OF THESE AMBITIOUS STRATEGIES. LIKE
12 MANY WHO ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE OR
13 AGGRESSIVE TDM MANDATE TRIP CAPS WHERE PEOPLE HAVE THE OPTION
14 TO WALK, BIKE, VANPOOL CARPOOL OR WORK FROM HOME. IN ADDITION
15 WHAT'S BEEN SIDE MANDATE WORK FROM HOME IS GOING TO DAMAGE
16 SOME OF OUR SUSTAINABLE AND WALKABLE COMMUNITIES GREENHOUSE
17 GAS IMPACTS OF REMOTE WORK IS NOT STRAIGHT FORWARD. WORK FROM
18 HOME CAN CAUSE MORE AUTO TRIPS FOR PEOPLE WHO WORK ALL DAY.
19 POLICY NEEDS TO BE REVISED TO ADDRESS BENEFITS NOT JUST PEOPLE
20 WORKING FROM HOME. REDUCED AUTO TRIPS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ROB. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.
23 ROB NIELSEN.

24



September 23, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ROB NIELSEN FROM PALO ALTO. I WANT TO
2 SPEAK ON THE 60 PERCENT WORK AT HOME MANDATE. I WOULD LIKE TO
3 ECHO THOUGHTS OF COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND SUPPORT FOR MORE
4 FLEXIBLE TARGETS BIKING, WALKING, LIMITING SINGLE DRIVING
5 COMMUTES. WORK AT HOME IS GOOD FOR SOMEBODY LIKE ME. I HAVE
6 BEEN DOING IT FOUR AND A HALF YEARS IN PALO ALTO. I HAVE A
7 NICE SIZE COUCH AND PEOPLE AROUND IT'S NOT GOOD FOR PEOPLE WHO
8 -- THEIR NEEDS INTO ACCOUNT. ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT HAVING
9 GREATER DEVELOPMENT OUTSIDE OF THE BAY AREA RESULT IN POLICIES
10 LIKE THIS AND OTHER AREAS OF THE COUNTRY. NETTING MUCH MORE
11 GREENHOUSE GASS REDUCING GHGS IN THE BAY AREA. THAT CONCLUSION
12 MY COMMENTS.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS DARIO.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS DARIO IGLESIAS CALLING FROM SAN
17 FRANCISCO. I'M CALLING TO OPPOSE STRONGLY THE 60 PERCENT
18 MANDATE FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS. FIRST, IT IS UNREALISTIC IN
19 A SENSE THAT IT IS NOT POSSIBLE TO IMPLEMENT. SECOND, IT IS
20 UNREALISTIC IN ET SENSE THAT EVEN IF IT WAS IMPLEMENTED, THE
21 COMPANIES WOULD RATHER MOVE THEIR OFFICES ELSEWHERE THAN
22 SATISFY SUCH MANAGEMENT. IT WAS MEANT TO BE A CHECK OFF IN A
23 PLANNING TARGET INSTEAD LET'S TALK TAKE THE ACTUAL OBJECTIVE
24 SERIOUSLY IN HELPING REDUCE CONGESTION HAVING HIGHER DENSITY
25 SO THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT BECOMES FEASIBLE. IMPLEMENTING BIKING



September 23, 2020

1 INFRASTRUCTURE TO GET PEOPLE OUT OF THERE ARE CARS WE NEED TO
2 STOP SUBSIDIZING CARS WITH FREE PARKING ET CETERA FEMALE WE
3 NEED TO IMPLEMENT PROJECTIONS PRICING SO THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY
4 DISINCENTIVIZE TRAVELING BY CAR.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS VADIM AND I AM STRONG HE OPPOSED TO THE
9 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE BACK BEFORE COVID WHEN I
10 WORKED IN AN OFFICE I NEVER EMITTED GREENHOUSE GAS DURING MY
11 COMMUTE BECAUSE I BIKED TO WORK. WORKING FROM HOME IN MY
12 APARTMENT FORCED ME TO WORK TO A HOME WHICH REQUIRES MORE
13 ENERGY TO HEAT AND COOL. AND I NOW DRIVEWAY AN OLD BEATER CAR
14 THAT GETS TEN MILES PER GALLON. I THINK WE CAN ALL AGREE THAT
15 BEING FORCED TO WORK FROM HOME VASTLY INCREASED MY GREENHOUSE
16 GAS MISSIONS AND I AM NOT ALONE. PLEASE DON'T FORCE PEOPLE TO
17 INCREASE GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS BY MANDATING WORK FROM HOME.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS FROM GREENBELT ALLIANCE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ZOEY DIRECTOR AT GREENBELT ALLIANCE.
22 I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF ON THE WORK. I WOULD LIKE TO EXPRESS
23 MY SUPPORT FOR THIS EFFORT. BUT IF WE DON'T PLAN FOR FLOODING
24 ALL HOMES ROADS AND STRATEGIES WILL BE FLOODED CLIMATE A
25 ADAPTION CANNOT STOP AT THE SHORELINE MANY AREAS SUSCEPTIBLE



September 23, 2020

1 TO FLOODING IMPACTING COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. DEVELOPMENT
2 LARGELY PROTECTED FROM FLOODING BASED ON PROJECTS BEING
3 IMPLEMENTED THESE ASSUMPTIONS WILL NOT BE REALITY WITHOUT
4 LEADERSHIP OF THIS COMMISSION WE URGE YOU TO LEADERSHIP THE
5 CONVERSATION ABOUT POTENTIAL MEASURES AS SOON AS POSSIBLE.
6 ADDITIONALLY WE RECOMMEND A REVAMP --

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS NILO.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS NILO, AND I LIVE IN SUNNYVALE AND
13 WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE WHAT MANY PEOPLE HAVE SAID ABOUT BEING
14 FLEXIBLE WITH THE 60 PERCENT MANDATE AND NOT MAKING IT ABOUT
15 TELECOMMUTING SO MUCH OF WHAT MAKES CITIES GREAT IS PEOPLE
16 GETTING TOGETHER AND I WOULD POINT OUT THE CITIES THAT HAVE
17 THE BEST JOB OF LOW GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS RELY ON PEOPLE
18 GETTING TO JOB BY FREQUENT ELECTRIC TRAINS LIKE TOKYO AND
19 HAVING LOTS OF HOUSING AND JOBS NEAR THOSE TRAIN STATIONS SO
20 THINGS THAT ENCOURAGE THAT INSTEAD OF TRYING TO DO THIS FIRST
21 IN THE WORLD TELECOMMUTE THING PROBABLY ARE MORE REALISTIC AND
22 BETTER FITS, OUR FRIENDS IN THE NORTH BAY HAVE A TRAIN LINE
23 THEY'RE BUILDING THEY SHOULD ELECTRIFY THAT RUN IT MORE
24 AFFECTIONATE HE AND RUN WELL HOUSING NEXT TO THAT WHICH SHOULD



September 23, 2020

1 SOLVE ALL THE PROBLEMS ABOUT GREENBELTS. APARTMENT BUILDINGS
2 AIR GREAT FORM OF HOUSE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS COREY SMITH.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYBODY COREY SMITH ON BEHALF OF BAY
7 AREA HOUSING COALITION. I SHARE MANY OF THE CONCERNS MENTIONED
8 EARLIER AND APPRECIATE NICK JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS. ONE PIECE
9 OF THIS THAT I WOULD LIKE TO ADD IS THAT THERE IS SO MUCH
10 ABOUT THE ECONOMY THAT WE DON'T KNOW WHAT IT'S GOING TO LOOK
11 LIKE A YEAR FROM NOW, FIVE YEARS FROM NOW, TEN YEARS FROM NOW,
12 AND ONE INDUSTRY THAT I CAN SPECIFICALLY POINT OUT IS THE
13 MEDICAL INDUSTRY AND THE PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE THAT ARE DOING
14 IN-PERSON MEDICAL VISITS VERSUS DIGITAL MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS
15 SO THERE IS SO MANY DIFFERENT PIECES HERE THAT ARE MOVING AND
16 SHAKING OUT, SO MAXIMUM FLEXIBILITY IS REALLY APPRECIATED.
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JEREMY ROSE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE MY NAME IS JEREMY ROSE I LIVE IN SAN
22 FRANCISCO I WANT TO CALL IN ECHO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S
23 CONCERNS AROUND TELECOMMUTING MANDATE NOT ALL JOBS CAN BE
24 PERFORMED REMOTELY I ACTUALLY HAVE IN FRONT OF ME A REPORT ON
25 THE BAY AREA ECONOMY FROM 2011 BUT AT LEAST 50 PERCENT OF



September 23, 2020

1 EMPLOYMENT IN THE BAY AREA ACCORDING TO THESE SURVEYS IN
2 INDUSTRIES LIKE RETAIL, LIKE FOOD SERVICES, LIKE
3 MANUFACTURING, THINGS CANNOT BE DONE IN PERSON. SO I DON'T SEE
4 JUST HOW SIMPLY PROCLAIMING THOSE JOBS SHOULD HAPPEN REMOTELY
5 IS GOING TO MAKE THAT OCCUR. SECOND FOR WORKER WHO IS DO HAVE
6 THE OPTION TO WORK REMOTE HE I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THOSE WHO TO
7 NOT LIVE CLOSE ENOUGH TO WALK OR BIKE TO WORK, WILL BE LESS
8 LIKELY TO RECEIVE RAISES AND PROMOTIONS. AND FOCUS ON PUBLIC
9 TRANSIT AS A CLIMATE SOLUTION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JARROD NIELSEN. PLEASE
12 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS JARROD NIELSEN AND I WORK IN PALO
15 ALTO. I STRONGLY OPPOSE THE TELECOMPUTING MANDATE. IN-PERSON
16 WORK IS INCREDIBLY USEFUL FOR PROBLEM SOLVING COHESION
17 BUILDING COMMUNITIES I AGREE CLIMATE CHANGE IS A PROBLEM AND I
18 WORRY ABOUT IT BUT THIS TELECOMMUTING MANDATE IS INCREDIBLY
19 SHORT SITING AND FOR THAT THINKING. MANDATE WILL CRASH THE
20 REMOTE ECONOMY WITH TECH WORKERS LEAVING WHICH WILL DEVASTATE
21 THE LOW INCOME RETAIL PORTION AS WELL. IF THIS MANDATE IS
22 PASSED THERE WILL NOT BE REVENUE TO EFFECT OTHER POTENTIAL
23 CHANGES SUCH AS HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ROLAND KATEL.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO COMMISSIONERS ROLAND CALLING FROM SAN
3 FRANCISCO. I LIKE MANY OTHER CALLERS AGREE CAN COMMISSIONER
4 JOSEFOWITZ'S RECOMMENDATION. I USED TO WALK A MILE TO WORK AND
5 BACK IT MAKES NO SENSE TO MAKE PEOPLE WHO WALK STAY HOME JUST
6 TO IMPROVE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WHAT YOU SHOULD BE DOING
7 INSTEAD IS GETTING MORE PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT. AND NOT THROW
8 UP YOUR HANDS AND SAY YOU CAN'T SOLVE THE BAY AREA'S
9 TRANSPORTATION CHALLENGES. THOSE CHALLENGES ARE YOUR JOB AND
10 YOU CAN'T SAY YOU'RE NOT GOING TO DO IT. WE'RE GOING TO MAKE
11 PEOPLE TODAY HOME. THAT'S NOT ACCEPTABLE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS THEO. PLEASE
14 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I AM THEODORE RANDOLPH RESIDENT OF SAN
17 FRANCISCO I AM CALLING TO SUPPORT JOSEFOWITZ'S AMENDMENT.
18 MANDATE IS BAD FOR OFFICES, WE SHOULD PROMOTE INTERNET ACCESS
19 FOR OTHER REASONS. OVERSTATED GREENHOUSE GAS FOR COVID
20 [INDISCERNIBLE] PEOPLE ARE NOT DRIVING CHILDREN TO SCHOOLS NOT
21 EATING AT RESTAURANTS ALL OF THAT IS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THE
22 SOLUTION IS AVAILABLE BUT UNAVOIDABLE MORE DENSITY HIGH
23 QUALITY PUBLIC TRANSIT TURNING NEIGHBORHOODS INTO MIXED USE
24 WALKABLE COMMUNITIES. ALSO I THINK T ONE IS THE MOST EXPENSIVE
25 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN, [INDISCERNIBLE] INCLUDING ELECTRIC



September 23, 2020

1 CARS FROM -- TN EIGHT -- INFRASTRUCTURE IS MORE EXPENSIVE MORE
2 HIGH QUALITY TRANSIT AND WALKABLE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LAST FOUR DIGITS, 6187 PLEASE UNMUTE
6 YOURSELF. 6187 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS SARAH O. I HAVE RELIED ON PUBLIC
9 TRANSIT TO GET TO WORK. I OPPOSE OF THE WORK FROM HOME MAP
10 MANDATE AND ACCEPT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S COMP MIGRATION.
11 SOUNDS TO ME LIKE A STEEP DROP IN BUSINESS. I THINK IT'S
12 ATTEMPTING TO BUILD A VOID NEAR WORK CENTERS. DO NOT APPROVE
13 THIS MANDATE PLAN ON BUILDING MORE HOUSING IN HIGH RESOURCE
14 AREAS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ROBERT
17 FRUCKMAN.

18

19 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** I'M OUT OF HERE MR. CHAIR. BYE-BYE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS I'M ROBERT FRUCKMAN LIVE
22 IN SAN FRANCISCO CALLING ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME
23 MANDATE I SUPPORT THE AMENDMENT OF COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. IF
24 THE ANSWER IS WE HAVE TOO MANY CARS ON THE ROAD, THE LANGUAGE
25 ABOUT INCREASING USAGE ABOUT OTHER TRANSPORTATION MODES BUT



September 23, 2020

1 THE STRATEGIES DO NOT INCLUDE LANGUAGE ABOUT LONG-TERM
2 SOLUTIONS ABOUT REDUCING PARKING. WHITE COLLARS WORKER --
3 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS FORCES CAR OWNERSHIP AND POLLUTION ON
4 POOR POPULATIONS AND 60 PERCENT MANDATE WOULD NOT ADDRESS THIS
5 IF WE KNOW THAT CAR TRAVEL IS HARMFUL WE SHOULD REDUCE CAR
6 DEMAND BY EVERYONE NOT JUST OFFICE WORKERS REQUIRING WORKERS
7 TO WORK FROM HOME DOESN'T REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS IT MAKES THEIR
8 JOBS WORSE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA MALL ON
11 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS MONICA MALLEEN, I LIVE IN SANTA CLARA
14 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MENTIONED EARLIER THE REPORT
15 THE BAY AREA IS UNDERSERVED WHEN IT COMES TO TRANSIT
16 PRECISIONS SO I WANT TO ENCOURAGE YOU TO LOOK AT INCLUDING
17 MORE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN PLANNED BAY AREA SO
18 THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY HAVE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS GOING TO
19 WORK FOR PEOPLE. YOU KNOW, I HAVE EXPERIENCED GOOD TRANSIT
20 BEFORE. I HAVE BEEN TO VANCOUVER I HAVE BEEN ON TRAINS THAT
21 RUN EVERY THREE MINUTES AND BUSES THAT RUN EVERY FIVE OR SIX
22 MINUTES IT'S POSSIBLE AND WE CAN DO IT HERE TOO. PLEASE DON'T
23 GIVE UP ON TRANSIT AND THINK ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AS A
24 SOLUTION BECAUSE IT IS COOL AND IT IS GREAT AND IT'S GOING
25 HELP US SAVE THE PLANET. THANK YOU.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DON C PLEASE
3 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THERE SAN FRANCISCO RESIDENT GREAT WORK ON THE
6 PLAN TOTALLY SUPPORT GHG REDUCTION CAN'T SUPPORT A 60 PERCENT
7 MANDATE TELECOMMUTING MUST BE A STRATEGY BUT THIS IS SO OFF
8 BASE. YOU REFERENCED THE POLL. POLL ASKED A QUESTION
9 INCENTIVES TO ADDRESS COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT AT STOPS THAT GOT
10 20 PERCENT SUPPORT SO I'M CONFUSED ABOUT HOW THAT DRIVES
11 EVERYTHING I'M HERE TO SPEAK FOR THE SMALL BUSINESS OWNERS
12 BEING DECIMATED AROUND DOWNTOWN. COVID IS KILLING PEOPLE. THIS
13 IS LIKE A MASSACRE THESE PEOPLE EMPLOY LOW INCOME AND LOW-WAGE
14 WORKERS AND IF PEOPLE DON'T GET BACK TO WORK THESE BUSINESSES
15 WILL NEVER SURVIVE. I LIVE AT THE FOURTH AND KING STATION IN
16 SAN FRANCISCO, MY NEIGHBORHOOD, I DON'T RECOGNIZE IT ANYMORE.
17 SO THIS IS A STRATEGY, BUT THIS CAN'T END POLLUTION. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLES WHITFIELD PLEASE
21 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS CHARLES WHITFIELD CALLING
24 TO OPPOSE THE BLANKET 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE AS
25 WRITTEN. FORCING WORKERS TO USE ALREADY CRAMPED OFFICE SPACE



September 23, 2020

1 DOES NOT TO HAVING OUR CLIMATE GOALS OR REDUCE CONGESTION. IF
2 WE WANT TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS VMT AND TRAFFIC
3 VIOLENCE WE MUST FOCUS ON THE SOURCE OF EMISSIONS CARS. WE
4 MUST FOCUS ON DENSER HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT AS PRIMARY TOOLS TO
5 REDUCE OUR CARBON FOOTPRINT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JASON BAKER.
8 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I GOT MUTED AND UNMUTED. THANK YOU JASON BAKER VICE
11 PRESIDENT OF TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
12 FOR THE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA LEADERSHIP GROUP WE REPRESENT 350
13 BUSINESSES IN THE BAY AREA AND I WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE
14 MANDATE SOLUTION TO POLLUTION AND TRAFFIC AND CARS.
15 TELECOMMUTING IS ONE TOOL IN THE TOOLBOX OTHERS INCLUDE
16 BELIEVE IT TRANSIT WALKING BIKING AND MOBILITY. A REMOTE
17 WORKING MANDATE LIKE THIS RISKS ENCOURAGING SPRAWL AND NOT
18 WORK COMMUTE TRIPS AND DOING MORE HARM TO OUR ENVIRONMENTAL
19 EFFORTS ASKING COMMUTERS TO SWITCH TO SUSTAINABLE MODES OF
20 GETTING TO WORK. [INDISCERNIBLE] WE ENCOURAGE MTC TO WORK WITH
21 THE BUSINESSES THAT THIS WILL IMPACT. WE WANT TO REDUCE
22 GREENHOUSE. WE KNOW IT'S IMPORTANT. BUT THIS POLICY ISN'T THE
23 WAY TO DO IT. I ALSO WANT TO THANK MTC COMMISSIONERS FOR
24 THINKING AS A REGION ON THE HIGH SPEED RAIL ISSUE AND THE
25 BUILDING BLOCKS FOR OUR HIGH SPEED RAIL.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SHEHAN.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS SHAHIN CALLING FROM SAN FRANCISCO,
5 REGARDING THE TELECOMMUTING MANDATE I'M CALLING IN SUPPORT OF
6 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S SUGGESTIONS. THIS IS A WELL
7 INTENTIONED MANDATE THAT THE LANGUAGE IN THE PLAN PUTS THE
8 CART BEFORE THE HORSE I'M NEARLY HALF MY COWORKERS COMMUTING
9 TO OUR PALO ALTO OFFICE VIA BICYCLE AND TALL TRAIN 60 PERCENT
10 TELECOMMUTING POLICY WOULD LEAVE MANY OF US BEHIND AT HOME FOR
11 NO REASON. THIS IS THE ROLLING BLACKOUT OF TRANSPORTATION
12 PLANNING AND IT WOULD BE PAY PLANNING FAILURE NOT A SUCCESS.
13 INSTEAD I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MTC WORK TO REDUCE CAR TRIPS TO
14 REDUCE CONGESTION WHILE ALLOWING TRANSIT AND OTHER MODE SHARES
15 TO GROW. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION TO MY COMMENT AND
16 THANK YOU FOR YOUR IMPORTANT WORK ON THIS PLAN.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN GRIMES.

19

20 GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JORDAN GRIMES. I'M PRIMARILY HERE
21 TO STRONGLY OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE
22 HAVING PEOPLE SHELTER-IN-PLACE IS NOT THE ANSWER TO THE CRISIS
23 WE NEED TO IMPLEMENT INFRASTRUCTURE, RAPID TRANSIT BUS ONLY
24 LANES INCREASING FREQUENCY AND TRANSIT PRIORITY BUILDING OUT
25 LANES ET CETERA IT'S VERY FRUSTRATING TO HEAR STAFF PROPOSE



September 23, 2020

1 THIS AS THE ONLY OPTION WHEN WE CURRENTLY SPEND MILLIONS ON
2 ROADS. I SPENT THE LAST SIX MONTHS WORKING FROM HOME MYSELF
3 AND DOING THIS 100 PERCENT OF THE TIME IS NOT VIABLE IT TAKES
4 A SERIOUS TOLL ON MENTAL. ONLY PEOPLE I KNOW WHO THINK THIS IS
5 A GOOD ARE RETIRED BOOMERS WHO HAVE TIME TO SPEND ALL DAY ON
6 BACK TO BACK MEETINGS. PLEASE CONSIDER COMMISSIONER
7 JOSEFOWITZ'S MOTION. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEGGY.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HI. I STRONGLY OPPOSE MANDATE THAT PRESCRIBES THAT
12 INDIVIDUALS AND COMPANIES HAVE TO STAY HOME, WHETHER IT'S FOR
13 WORK, FOR SCHOOL I MEAN FOR CORONAVIRUS, YES. THIS IS NOT A
14 SOLUTION. SOLUTION IS PUTTING SOMETHING IN PLACE THAT ENABLES
15 ALTERNATIVES TO CARS. RIGHT? SO MORE TRANSPORTATION, LIMITS ON
16 CARBON EMISSIONS, AND MORE ELECTRIC OPTIONS THAT DON'T EMIT --
17 I STRONGLY OPPOSE THIS. THIS. THIS IS NOT THE RIGHT THING FOR
18 SAN FRANCISCO FOR INDUSTRY FOR INDIVIDUALS. I HOPE YOU WILL
19 RECONSIDER. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JORDAN WAYNE.
22 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS JORDAN WAYNE
25 RESIDENT OF SAN FRANCISCO AND I OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT



September 23, 2020

1 TELECOMMUTE REQUIREMENT. I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO COMMENTERS IN
2 PARTICULAR COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. THIS IS A TOOL FOR
3 REDUCING GHG EMISSIONS SHIFTING ROAD SHARE. [INDISCERNIBLE] I
4 SUPPORT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S ALTERNATIVE PROPOSAL. I
5 THINK WE SHOULD REPLACE THIS MANDATE WITH POLICIES THAT TARGET
6 SHIFTING MODE SHARE TO WALKING OR BIKING AND MODE SHARE
7 INSTEAD. I THINK IT WOULD BE IN LINE WITH THIS BODY TO SUPPORT
8 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION NOT FORBID TRIPS PEOPLE WANT TO TAKE
9 WHICH WOULD IMPROVE THEIR LIVES. A RECOMMENDATION WOULD BE
10 BETTER FOR EXAMPLE, TAXING EMPLOYERS BASED MODE SHARE AND THE
11 EMPLOYEES THAT DRIVE TO WORK OR THE NUMBER OF PARKING SPOTS
12 THEY OFFER OR BOTH. I WOULD SUPPORT CONGESTION PRICING AS AN
13 ALTERNATIVE. BUT I THINK THE 60 PERCENT IS NEEDLESS.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ZACK.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ZACK AND I LIVE IN SAN
18 FRANCISCO. I OPPOSE THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING MANDATE THIS
19 IS THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, THE STRATEGY IS
20 A FUNDAMENTAL ABDICATION OF YOUR JOB TO PROVIDE SUPPORT FOR
21 TRANSPORTATION. IF IMPLEMENTED, THE STRATEGY WOULD PROPOSE
22 SIGNIFICANT EQUITY CONCERNS TO VIRTUALLY EVERY SMALL BUSINESS
23 AND WIDESPREAD ECONOMIC EFFECTS THAT AVOID WIDESPREAD ECONOMIC
24 EFFECTS IF NOT IMPLEMENTED THE BLUEPRINT WON'T ACHIEVE ITS
25 CLIMATE GOALS IT'S INSULTING THEY PROPOSAL HAS GOTTEN THIS FAR



September 23, 2020

1 WITH SO LITTLE THOUGHT. IT'S YOUR JOB TO MEET THE NEEDS. THIS
2 STRATEGY IS JUST GIVING UP. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS RODNEY NICKENS.
5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE MY NAME
8 IS RODNEY NICKENS I AM A MEMBER OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY
9 COMMITTEE AND POLICY MEMBER. I AM CALLING IN FAVOR OF THE LAND
10 USE HOUSING AND ANTI- STRATEGIES ESPECIALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE
11 PROSPECT OF EXPANDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION AND
12 PRESERVATION AND BEING LOOKING FORWARDING TO FURTHER
13 CONVERSATION. I AM A MEMBER OF THE GREATER COMMUNITIES
14 COLLABORATIVE AND AM EXCITED ABOUT THE POSSIBILITIES OF
15 DEVELOPMENT ON COMMUNITY LAND AS ALLUDED MANY STRATEGIES WILL
16 FALL SHORT TO ADDRESS OUR AFFORDABILITY CHALLENGES SO WE NEED
17 TO CONTINUE TO WORK TO BUILD AN IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THAT WILL
18 ADDRESS RACIAL EQUITY AND ENCOURAGE MORE HOUSING GROWTH IN THE
19 COMMUNITY. I WILL CLOSE PIE SAYING IT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO
20 WORKING WITH STAFF IN THE NEXT PHASES OF THE PLAN. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ANDY CHAU.
23 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



September 23, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE 60
2 PERCENT WORK FROM HOME MANDATE. I THINK IT SHOULD BE AMENDED
3 TO ALLOW OTHER FORMS OF COMMUTE REDUCTION WITH THE OUTCOME OF
4 REDUCING SINGLE, A SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES. I AM CONCERNED,
5 INSTEAD, RIGHT NOW, A LOT JOBS HAVE THE REQUIREMENT OF HAVING
6 RELIABLE TRANSPORTATION, WHICH MEANS THAT YOU ESSENTIALLY HAVE
7 A CAR. BUT RIGHT NOW WITH THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE, WHAT IT
8 COULD BE IS, INSTEAD, IS MAKE CHANGING TO HAVING A DEDICATED
9 HOME OFFICE WHICH MEANS A LOT OF PEOPLE IS, THEY CANNOT HAVE A
10 -- THEY NEED TO HAVE A DEDICATED SPACE, THAT MEANS THEY MOVE
11 TO -- LARGER HOUSING PRESUMABLY IN THE SUBURBS THAT HAS EQUITY
12 ISSUE AND ULTIMATELY HINDER PEOPLE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER IS KELSEY. PLEASE
15 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS KELSEY BANES CALLING
18 APPROXIMATE PENINSULA FOR EVERYONE. AND I DO SUPPORT
19 STRATEGIES TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS BUT I AGREE WITH
20 THE OTHER SPEAKERS THAT THE WORK FROM HOME MANDATE IS ILL
21 ADVISED. I LIVE IN PALO ALTO IT'S ONE OF THE WORST CITY IN
22 TERMS OF JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND I THINK A LOT OF SPEAKERS
23 TODAY HAVE MENTIONED THEY WORK IN PALO ALTO. BUT I THINK IT'S
24 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE WHAT THE TOP EMPLOYER IN PALO ALTO
25 ARE. IT'S LUCILLE PACKARD CHILDREN'S HOSPITAL, STANFORD HEALTH



September 23, 2020

1 CARE, STANFORD UNIVERSITY, VA PALO ALTO HEALTH CARE SYSTEM.
2 TOP EMPLOYERS ARE EDUCATION AND HEALTH CARE AND OUR TEACHERS
3 WHO ARE TEACHING AT STANFORD AND SERVING VETERANS AT THE VA
4 ARE NOT INTERESTED IN CONTINUING TO WORK FROM HOME FOR
5 FOREVER. MANDATE IS A HEAVY-HANDED WAY OF HANDLING THIS ISSUE.
6 AND WOULD PREFER TO SEE MTC FOCUS ON INCREASING TRANSIT
7 OPERATIONS. I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DANIEL WOODS MULLIGAN. YOU ARE THE LAST
12 SPEAKER. AFTER THIS SPEAKER PUBLIC HEARING WILL CLOSE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS DANIEL WOODS MILLIGAN I LIVE AND WORK IN
15 SAN FRANCISCO. I UNDERSTAND THE REASONS FOR THIS, AND THAT
16 BUDGETS ARE HARD AND THAT TRANSPORTATION IS CROWDED. I JUST
17 LIKE TO ECHO SOME OF THE OTHER COMMENTS. I LIVE WITH FIVE
18 ROOMMATES THAT'S NORMAL FOR A LOT OF US. I WORK IN DOWNTOWN.
19 THIS WOULD MAKE MY LIFE UNLIVABLE. THERE IS NO WAY THEY COULD
20 AFFORD TO LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND WORK IN SAN FRANCISCO WITH
21 FIVE OF US IN ONE HOUSE WORKING FROM HOME. I HOPE THAT THOUGHT
22 CAN BE GIVEN TO WHAT THIS WOULD MEAN FOR THOSE OF US WITH
23 THESE ROOMMATE SITUATIONS WHICH ARE REALLY COMMON IN SAN
24 FRANCISCO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ALL OF YOU FOR YOUR WORK.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT'S THE END OF THE
2 PUBLIC HEARING.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MR. CHAIR, SORRY TO INTERRUPT YOU, THERE
5 WERE OVER 100 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS. OKAY. JUST WANT TO MAKE
6 SURE.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DO YOU WANT TO POST THEM?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THEY ARE POSTED AS A SINGLE DOCUMENT
11 LISTED AS A EIGHT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT, AND IF YOU'RE READY
12 I'LL READ THEM INTO THE RECORD.

13

14 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE TO READ THEM ALL?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I BELIEVE SO. LET'S ASK LEGAL COUNSEL TO
17 CONFIRM THAT.

18

19 **ADRIENNE WEIL, COUNSEL:** THAT'S THE PREFERABLE WAY TO GO.

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IS IT PREFERABLE? OR IS IT THE LEGAL
22 WAY? JUST READ THEM.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. SCOTT SINI, SCOTT CONNER, MIKE
25 G. ERIN E ANDREW F. BARIC. ZACK L. AUNT S. JASON BAKER SILICON



September 23, 2020

1 VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP. JONATHON Z, ELIZABETH GROSSMAN.
2 ALLISON A. JIM W OF BAY AREA COUNCIL. PARTHIC, STACY BARTLETT,
3 STEPHANIE BEECHAM. MAC B OF SAN FRANCISCO, JASON BAKER. AKSHAE
4 B. BRAD, CLAYTON BRISBANE, MILA, HARE COOK, KAY COOK ADRIAN
5 CULVERT JOSHUA DAVIS. KYLE. KRISTEN CONNOLY EAST BAY
6 LEADERSHIP GROUP. DAVID ELLIS JESSE FARMER KEVIN FERGUSON JOHN
7 G. OF CONSTRUCTION FIELD INCORPORATED, HANCOCK OF FLYNN
8 PROPERTIES INCORPORATED. SAMUAL FRITZ, JOSH G, RYAN G.,
9 GALETE, JONATHON GORDON, MICK HARRIS, MIHMY HART, JIM HARTNETT
10 OF SAN MATEO DISTRICT. DARLENE G OF HMTV CORPORATION, ANNE
11 HILL, DARLENE G. OF ATT CORPORATION. BRENDON IRVINE BROOK.
12 CATHY JORDAN. C MICHAEL CAM. IRA KAPLAN. CATTLE, MATT LINK.
13 DANIEL C. BUDRY, ANDREW KRAUSS. JOSEPH. DAVID L. DEBBIE L.
14 KEVIN MCDONNELL JUSTIN. PROSPER N. ED P. CHRISTOPHER PETERSON,
15 KEVIN PETERSON, CHRIS REVEAL OF PLANT CONSTRUCTION COMPANY.
16 ZABIK, JUSTIN P. HANSEN Q, ALEXANDER Q. DR. STEVE R. JESSE
17 RICHMOND, SHAHIM, MARK CROSS, ERIC S. WILLIS B JR. ADINA LEVIN
18 SEAMLESS BAY AREA. MATT, KELLY S, CAITLIN, RICHARD OF SWIFT
19 REAL ESTATE PARTNERS, ZACK TAYLOR NATHAN T. KAREN T. MICHAEL
20 COVARRUBIAS OF TMG PARTNERS. ALIX T, PATRICK T. BENJAMIN O,
21 COLLIN OF VAN BARTEN GROUP; CHELSEA, DAVID WHITTAKER, JORDAN
22 WAYNE. WOODROW, WOODS, CLAIR WRIGHT, RICHARD Y, ZAVAKER,
23 MICHAEL Z, OF WEST COAST INDUSTRIES BEN SOTO, ROSEANNE FAUST.
24 AND TESLIN YOW OF ALAMEDA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION.
25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I CAN GO TO COMMISSIONERS?
2 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

3

4 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY. SO I
5 WAS GOING TO MAKE A -- OFFER AN AMENDED MOTION. IF THAT WAS
6 APPROPRIATE AT THIS STAGE.

7

8 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** YOU CAN TRY IT AND SEE IF THE SECOND IS
9 MAKER WILL ACCEPT IT.

10

11 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** OKAY. SO I WILL ALSO PUT THIS IN THE
12 CHAT AND I WILL READ IT OUT. SO, IT'S THE AMENDED MOTION IS A
13 MODIFICATION TO STRATEGY EN SEVEN WHICH THE STRATEGY EVERYBODY
14 HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT TO RE-- [INDISCERNIBLE] COMMUTING
15 MANDATES FOR OFFICE EMPLOYERS AND MANDATE TELECOMMUTING
16 SUSTAINABLE MODES OR EQUIVALENT THAT WOULD GENERATE THE SAME
17 GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS AT THE EXISTING STRATEGY BY
18 MODIFYING OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE STRATEGY BECAUSE BY
19 INCORPORATING THE ABILITY FOR PEOPLE BASED ON THE FEEDBACK
20 THAT WE GOT FROM STAFF, YOU CAN'T JUST ADD IN TRANSIT, INTO
21 THIS STRATEGY AND EXPECT THE SAME LEVEL OF GREENHOUSE GAS
22 EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS SO YOU NEED TO MODIFY IT A LITTLE BIT,
23 FOR INSTANCE BY, I DON'T WANT TO DO THE MODIFICATION HERE
24 BECAUSE I DON'T HAVE THE MODEL, BUT GIVING STAFF A LITTLE BIT



September 23, 2020

1 OF LEEWAY TO MAKE SLIGHT MODIFICATIONS TO THE STRATEGY TO
2 STILL BE ABLE TO MEET OUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS.

3

4 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT TO THE MAKER OF THE MOTION
5 AND THE SECONDER WHICH WAS PEDROZA SPERING, OR PEDROZA SPERING
6 EITHER WAY, ARE YOU GOING TO ACCEPT THAT AMENDMENT?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, I JUST WANT, DAVE, V, YOU JUST
9 HEARD THAT MOTION, WHAT DOES THAT DO TO THIS PLAN AND THE TIME
10 FRAME?

11

12 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** SPERING, LET ME START FIRST AND THEN I'LL
13 HAND IT OVER TO DAVE. I THINK THERE IS A COUPLE OF THINGS
14 THAT, FRANKLY, AS STAFF WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BALANCE IN
15 TERMS OF THIS. ONE OF THE, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE SITUATIONS IS
16 THE FACT THAT THIS IS -- THIS BROADER INTERPRETATION IS
17 OVERLAYING OVER A SET OF STRATEGIES THAT WE ARE ALREADY
18 ASSUMING IN THE PLAN. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE, I THINK WE HAVE AN UNDERSTANDING
21 THERE. IF DAVE COULD JUST ANSWER THAT QUESTION BECAUSE I WANT
22 TO SEE IF WE CAN MOVE THIS THING ALONG. DOES THIS IMPACT THE
23 GREENHOUSE GAS NUMBERS THAT ACHIEVE WITH THE MOTION THAT'S
24 BEING MADE? >DAVE VAUTIN: WHAT I WOULD SAY COMMISSIONER
25 JOSEFOWITZ, PHRASING HERE WOULD ENABLE US TO INCREASE THE



September 23, 2020

1 LEVEL OF THE MANDATE TO ACHIEVE INCREASED -- OR THE SAME I
2 SHOULD SAY, GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS, WE WOULD NEED TO SPEND
3 TIME CALCULATING THAT AND IT MIGHT LEAD TO A MUCH HIGHER
4 MANDATE MODEL SUCH AS 80 PERCENT OR MORE FOR OFFICE SPACE
5 EMPLOYERS FOR THESE VARIETY OF TRIP TYPES. SO THIS MAY CAUSE
6 THIS NEXT PHASE OF ANALYSIS TO TAKE A BIT LONGER THAN
7 PREVIOUSLY ENVISIONED. MAYBE NOT MUCH LONGER BUT WOULD
8 PROBABLY REQUIRE A BIT MORE WORK.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN I'M CERTAINLY GOING TO OPPOSE
11 THE MOTION, IF IT DOES GET A SECOND. A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT
12 NEED TO BE STATED. ONE IS THAT THIS APPRISES TO SMALL
13 BUSINESSES, TO THE LARGE EMPLOYERS 25 PEOPLE OR MORE SMALL
14 BUSINESSES AREN'T GOING TO BE IMPACTED. IF WE GO TO THE MIDDLE
15 OF NOVEMBER, 6 TO 8 MONTHS ALL OF THESE ISSUES BEING TALKED
16 ABOUT CAN BE ADDRESSED IN THAT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND
17 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ IS PROPOSING IMPACTS ALL OF US WE
18 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE IMPACTS ARE GOING TO BE IT ISN'T FAIR TO
19 THROW THAT OUT AT THIS MINUTE AND NOT UNDERSTAND WHAT THE
20 IMPACT IS. LET'S HAVE STAFF GO THROUGHOUT ANALYSIS IN THE
21 IMPLEMENTATION PHASE OF WHAT'S BEING PROPOSED. AND THE OTHER
22 THING I WANT TO POINT OUT, WE HAVE 6 TO 10 PERCENT THAT ARE
23 COMMUTING NOW? THIS PLAN TAKES IT UP TO ABOUT 25 PERCENT. 75
24 PERCENT OF THE WORKERS ARE STILL GOING TO BE COMMUTING.
25 THEY'RE STILL GOING TO BE PLUGGING UP OUR BRIDGES AND



September 23, 2020

1 EVERYTHING AND STILL DRIVING INTO SAN FRANCISCO. SO AGAIN I
2 WOULD REALLY ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO ADOPT THIS PLAN, LET
3 US ADDRESS THESE ISSUES THAT ARE BEING RAISED WHEN WE GO
4 THROUGH THE IMPLEMENTATION IT'S GOING GIVE US TIME TO LOOK AT
5 IT, STUDY IT AND REVIEW IMPACTS.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IT'S NOT A MOTION. WE ASKED WHETHER YOU
8 WANT TO ACCEPT THE FRIENDLY AMENDMENT.

9

10 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I DON'T LIKE TO PUT A WRENCH IN THINGS
11 AT THE LAST MOMENT BUT THIS WAS A STRATEGY WE SAW TWO WEEKS
12 AGO AT THE COMPETE MEETING. I RAISED THE CONCERNS AT THE TIME
13 BUT THERE WAS NO ALTERNATIVE AT THIS COMMISSION MEETING TO
14 GRAPPLE WITH. SO THAT'S WHY I'M GOING TO MAKE A SUBSTITUTE
15 MOTION. FIRST MOTION WOULD SAY INCLUDE MY AMENDMENT.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO YOU'RE MOVING THE STAFF
18 RECOMMENDATION PLUS YOUR AMENDMENT?

19

20 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

21

22 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** IS THERE A SECOND.

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** I'LL SECOND.

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

4

5 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. ROLL CALL VOTE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]

8

9 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. MOTION FAILS. WHAT WAS THE VOTE?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE COUNT, FOUR AYES NINE NOS.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY NOW MOVE BACK TO THE ORIGINAL
14 MOTION. SPERING DO YOU WANT TO RESTATE YOUR ORIGINAL MOTION.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MOTION IS THAT I MOVE THE APPROVAL OF THE
17 REVISED MTC RESOLUTION 4337 PLANNED BAY AREA FINEST BLUEPRINT
18 AS PRESENTED TODAY AND THAT STAFF LOOK AT THE -- I CAN'T
19 REMEMBER THE WORD WE USED SOME OF THE ALTERNATIVES MENTIONED
20 BY JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS AND BY THE END OF THE YEAR WHEN THE
21 PLAN COMES BACK TO US FOR THE GROSS -- GROWTH STRATEGY, THEY
22 WOULD HAVE TO BE EQUIVALENT, GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS BENEFITS. SO
23 THAT WAS THE MOTION, MR. CHAIRMAN.

24

25 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND CHAIR.



September 23, 2020

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** I CAN HEAR THAT AGAIN PLEASE SORRY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I'M MOVING THE PLAN AS PRESENTED THEN WE'RE
5 ASKING STAFF TO LOOK AT ANY OF THESE ALTERNATIVES AND BETWEEN
6 NOW AND NOVEMBER, WHEN THE PLAN COMES BACK TO US, THAT IF THE
7 ALTERNATIVES THAT ARE BEING MENTIONED BY COMMISSIONER
8 JOSEFOWITZ AND OTHERS, IF IT GIVES US THE EQUIVALENT OF THE
9 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS THAT WE'RE GETTING FROM THE PROPOSED
10 PLAN, THEY WILL BE CONSIDERED AT THAT TIME. WE'RE ADOPTING A
11 PLAN THAT MEETS OUR GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. MOTION PEDROZA SAID HIS SECOND
14 STANDS. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] OKAY. THAT WILL BE 12
17 YES. ONE NO. ONE ABSTENTION.

18

19 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON. I THINK
20 IT'S THE CHAIR OF THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE, WHICH JAKE HAS
21 LEFT. JULIE IS THE CHAIR. MAYBE THAT'S THE FIRST THING WE
22 SHOULD TALK ABOUT ABAG IS THE CHAIR FOR THE LEGISLATIVE
23 COMMITTEE, JULIE PIERCE JAKE WAS MADE VICE CHAIR. MTC
24 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET SEPTEMBER, REFERRED THREE ITEMS TO
25 THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. ITEM NINE A MEASURE RR CALTRAIN



September 23, 2020

1 \$0.18 SALES TAX DEDICATED SOURCE OF TAX REVENUE FOR A 18 OR
2 1.205 SALES TAX FOR 30 YEARS FOR OPERATING MAINTENANCE CAPITAL
3 CONSISTENT WITH CALTRANS REVENUE STREAMS NEW TAX ESTIMATE TO
4 BE SUFFICIENT TO MEET OPERATING COST AT THIS TIME THEREBY
5 REDUCING FINANCIAL PRESSURE ON MEMBER AGENCIES MOVE FOR
6 SUPPORT ON POSITION RR.

7

8 **JEANNIE BRUINS, VICE CHAIR:** SECOND.

9

10 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** SECOND BY BRUINS. ROLL CALL VOTE,
11 PLEASE? WAIT. ANYBODY WISHING TO SPEAK? ANY COMMENTS ANYBODY
12 WISHING TO SPEAK?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT AND I
15 HAVE RECEIVED NO RAISED HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

16

17 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]

20

21 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** STOP. I'M GOING TO DO THE WHOLE REPORT
22 AND IN ONE MOTION IF THAT'S OKAY. EVERYBODY OKAY WITH THAT?
23 MEASURE DD SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY --
24 [INDISCERNIBLE] EXTENSION 20 YEAR EXTENSION WOULD PROVIDE
25 CERTAINTY NEEDED TO KEEP PROJECT PIPELINE MOVING AND MATCHING



September 23, 2020

1 FUNDS FOR STATE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS AND OTHER PROGRAMS.
2 RENEWABLE SUNSET MARCH 30, 2045. I MOVE APPROVAL OF THAT ONE.
3 PROPOSITION 16 STATEWIDE BALLOT INITIATIVE TO REPEAL
4 CALIFORNIA AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLAN ACROSS CALIFORNIA EVENTUAL
5 TOOL TO HELP CREATE MORE DIVERSE WORKFORCE CONTRACTING POOL
6 AND STUDENT BODY WITHIN THE CONFINES OF THE FEDERAL LAW. I
7 IMPROVE A SUPPORT POSITION OF 16. LET'S SEE HERE. IN ADDITION
8 TO THE ITEMS REFERRED BY ABAG MTC LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE THERE
9 IS STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO SECOND A SUPPORT POSITION ON SB146
10 AUTHORED BY SENATOR BEALL ASSURING ROBUST DIGITAL ENGAGEMENT
11 EFFORTS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WITHOUT REACH REQUIREMENTS
12 AFTER SHELTER-IN-PLACE IS LISTED CHAIR HAGGERTY AND FORMER MTC
13 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE CHAIR AUTHORIZED STAFF TO COMMUNICATE A
14 POSITION OF SUPPORT ON THE BILL IN JULY PURSUANT TO THE
15 MISSION URGENCY PROCEDURES THIS ACTION SO THIS ACTION TODAY IS
16 SIMPLY TO RATIFY THE POSITION, THE BILL IS CURRENTLY AWAITING
17 SIGNATURE BY GOVERNOR NEWSOM I MOVE A SUPPORT POSITION OF
18 SENATE BILL 146. SO WITH THAT, YOU HAVE ALL OF THEM TOGETHER.
19 IS THERE A SECOND?

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND, PEDROZA.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. IS
24 EVERYBODY OKAY VOTING ON THEM ALL TOGETHER?

25



September 23, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** YES.

2

3 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THERE WAS -- YOU HAD NO LETTERS. I

8 FORGOT TO ASK IF YOU HAD ANYTHING RECEIVED.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC

11 COMMENT AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

12

13 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** I'M ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS UNDER

14 PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM TEN AT INFO

15 BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD ALSO

16 ASK IF ANY MEMBERS FROM THE GENERAL PUBLIC WITH QUESTIONS OR

17 ANY COMMENT UNRELATED TO ANYTHING ON THE AGENDA. PLEASE RAISE

18 YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

19 COMMENT?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE.

22

23 **SCOTT HAGGERTY, CHAIR:** THIS CONCLUDES THIS MEETING. NEXT

24 MEETING OF METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WILL BE HELD



September 23, 2020

1 REMOTELY BY WEBCAST OR 375 BEALE STREET ANY CHANGES TO THE
2 PUBLIC WILL BE DULY NOTED. [ADJOURNED]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27



Broadcasting Government