

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
MONDAY, SEPTEMBER 23RD, 2024, 1:30 PM**

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. WITH THAT, MADAM CLERK, LET US DO A ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM WE HAVE A QUORUM HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES, CHAIR POWERS?

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: HERE VICE CHAIR CHAN?

V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: HERE .

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER CUMMINS?

EDDY CUMINS: HERE .

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER PREMIER?



1

2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT? BUT GREG RICHARDSON FOR GONOT?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HURSH?

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

17

18 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WEGENER?

21

22 **CHRISTY WEGENER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ACTION ITEM TWO IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR
2 MINUTES FROM A MY MEETING. LET ME SEE DO I HAVE A MOTION AND
3 SECOND ON CONSENT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MOTION AND SECOND FROM HURSH. PUBLIC
10 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** COMMITTEE MEMBERS COMMENTS? NOT SEEING
15 ANY. ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] ANY OPPOSED? MADAM CLERK,
16 THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** SO, AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 3A IS AN UPDATE
21 ON OUR CLIPPER SCHEDULE, THE IMPLEMENTATION DEPLOYMENT UPDATE.
22 AND I THOUGHT IT IMPORTANT THAT WE START WITH THIS ITEM TODAY
23 AS OPPOSED TO, IN GENERAL, JUST IN FULL TRANSPARENCY, WE
24 GENERALLY LIKE TO TAKE ACTION ITEMS FIRST AND THEN
25 INFORMATIONAL ITEMS. BUT IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE, WE REVERSED



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 THE ORDER BECAUSE OF THE MAGNITUDE OF THE TOPIC IN FRONT OF
2 US. AND, SO, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M CLEAR WITH THE
3 COMMITTEE MEMBERS UP HERE, THAT THAT'S WHY I MADE THAT
4 DECISION ON THIS TOPIC HERE AND WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM MTC,
5 AS WELL AS OUR PARTNERS AT CUBIC ON THIS TOPIC. SO, WITH THAT,
6 JASON, I'M GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO YOU AND THE FLOOR IS ALL
7 YOURS.

8

9 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS BOARD MEMBERS, JASON
10 WEINSTEIN ACTING DIRECTOR FOR THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. OKAY. AT
11 THE MAY 20TH CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING I REPORTED THAT
12 DUE TO SOME ITEMS SEEN DURING THE FIRST LIMITED PILOT TESTING
13 THAT WE NEED TO COME BACK TO THE BOARD AT THIS MEETING IN
14 SEPTEMBER WITH A FULL SCHEDULE UPDATE. IN MAY WE ASSUMED THAT
15 BY THIS MEETING WE WOULD BE SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLETE WITH OUR
16 LAST PHASE OF TESTING AND SEVERAL OTHER SCHEDULE RISKS AND
17 THAT WE WOULD BE IN A BETTER POSITION TO DETERMINE WHERE
18 PRECISELY WHEN CUSTOMER TRANSITION COULD BEGIN. NEXT SLIDE,
19 PLEASE. SINCE THAT REPORT WE HAVE ACCOMPLISHED THE COMPLETION
20 OF A MAJOR MILESTONE THAT TESTED THE FUNCTIONALITY OF THE NEW
21 SYSTEM IN A PILOT WITH FIVE OPERATORS CHANGES MADE TO THE 50
22 PILOT WE HAVE ALSO ACCOMPLISHED REPLACEMENT OF ALL BUS
23 PLATFORM READER EQUIPMENT SOMETHING WE SHOULD CELEBRATE AN
24 UPDATE TO THE LIVE PRODUCTION SYSTEM NECESSARY FOR OTHER
25 VENDORS TO BEGIN THEIR FINAL INTEGRATION STEPS AND NEXT SLIDE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 PLEASE. CUBIC IS NOW PERFORMING DRY RUN TESTS IN THEIR LAB IN
2 PREPARATION FOR THE FINAL PHASE OF TESTING CALLED INTEGRATION
3 TESTING. YOU WILL NOTICE THE TESTING ACTIVITY CIRCLED IN RED
4 IS UNDERWAY SHOWN ON THE SLIDE AT THE TOP. NEXT SLIDE. ONCE
5 THE FORMAL SYSTEM INTEGRATION TESTING IS COMPLETE AND OUR
6 OTHER PARTS OF THE SYSTEM ARE READY, WE'LL CONDUCT A SECOND
7 FULL PILOT TEST AND THIS TIME IT WILL BE ON ALL OPERATORS AND
8 THAT'S CALLED A PRETRANSITION PILOT. THAT IS CIRCLED IN RED
9 TOWARDS THE BOTTOM OF THE TABLE HERE. NEXT SLIDE. ALTHOUGH
10 THIS NOW SHOWS AN APRIL START TO CUSTOMER TRANSITION, WE'RE
11 JUST BEGINNING THE LAST PHASE OF TESTING MAKING IT DIFFICULT
12 TO FULL ASSESS THE RISK AND PICK A PRESENTATION DATE FOR THE
13 START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION, WHICH YOU CAN SEE CIRCLED IN RED
14 AND SHOWN ON THE BOTTOM LINE OF THIS SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE
15 MINDFUL THAT THERE ARE SEVERAL RISK AREAS TO THE SCHEDULE
16 STILL REMAINING INCLUDING COMPLETION OF DRY RUN LAB TESTING
17 WHICH I MENTIONED IS UNDERWAY. FORMAL FINAL SYSTEM INTEGRATION
18 TESTING, FARE GATE INTEGRATION AND INSTALLATION, TICKET
19 VENDING MACHINE, INTEGRATION AND INSTALLATION, AND FINALLY
20 INTEGRATION WITH PHONE PROVIDERS AND THEIR PAYMENT WALLETS.
21 NEXT SLIDE. SO, LOOKING AHEAD TO OCTOBER, WE SHOULD BE ABLE TO
22 INFORM YOU OF COMPLETION OF THE DRY RUNS AND THE START OF THE
23 FORMAL SYSTEM INTEGRATION TESTING, AS WELL AS THE DELIVER
24 TICKET VENDING MACHINE SOFTWARE TO BART WHICH IS GOING TO BE
25 EXPECTED, PERFORM TDM TESTING AND MOBILE PHONE TESTING IN THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 PRODUCTION ENVIRONMENT, AND DELIVERING OF THE FIRST SET OF
2 INSPECTION DEVICES. THESE ITEMS NEED TO BE COMPLETED TO HOLD
3 THE CUSTOMER TRANSITION DATE THAT WE DISCUSSED A MOMENT AGO.
4 AND AS WE PROGRESS ON EACH OF THESE ITEMS WE'LL BE ABLE TO
5 BETTER EVALUATE WHERE WE STAND IN TERMS OF THE SCHEDULE. ALONG
6 WITH OUR TRACKING OF ONGOING ACTIVITIES WE'RE WORKING WITH ALL
7 OUR PARTNERS AND EVALUATING OPPORTUNITIES TO ACCELERATE
8 CUSTOMER TRANSITION, AND WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS BOARD EACH
9 MONTH WITH A BRIEF STATUS AND AT THE DECEMBER BOARD MEETING
10 FOR THE EXECUTIVE BOARD WITH TESTING IDEALLY BEHIND US WE
11 EXPECT TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE A MORE CERTAIN SCHEDULE UPDATE
12 AND I'M JOINED BY CUBIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS PRESIDENT PETER
13 TORRELLAS AND BY MATT NEWSOM FROM CUBIC'S EXECUTIVE TEAM. AND
14 MR. TORRELLAS WILL PROVIDE ADDITIONAL REMARKS WITH REGARD TO
15 THE SCHEDULE.

16

17 **PETER TORRELLAS:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR POWERS AS WELL AS BOARD
18 MEMBERS THANK YOU FOR THE INVITATION TO BE WITH YOU HERE
19 TODAY. MY NAME IS PETER TORRELLAS. I'M THE PRESIDENT OF CUBIC
20 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS. THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATES ON THE
21 SCHEDULE, JASON. OUR LEADERSHIP TEAM AT CUBIC, INCLUDING
22 MYSELF PERSONALLY AS WELL AS GENERAL MANAGER AND CT PROGRAM
23 DIRECTOR HAVE BEEN MEETING WEEKLY WITH MTC AND BART LEADERSHIP
24 THROUGH THE SUMMER TO FOCUS ON PROGRESSING THE PROJECT AS A
25 TEAM. WE HAVE MADE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS THIS SUMMER AND OUR



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 ROLE TO HELP DELIVER THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM. MOST
2 NOTABLY C2 REACHED CRITICAL REVENUE READY MILESTONE IN JUNE
3 WHICH REPRESENTED CULMINATION OF SEVERAL YEARS OF EFFORT.
4 SINCE OUR LAST MEETING IN JULY AND AUGUST ALONE CUBIC HAS
5 SUCCESSFULLY UPDATED BOTH TEST AND PRODUCTION SYSTEMS TO
6 TRANSITION THE READY ARCHITECTURE MAJOR APPLICATION VERSIONS.
7 THIS MEANS MINOR VERSION PATCHES SHOULD BE NECESSARY FROM HERE
8 ON TO OUT TO DELIVERY OF TRANSITION USE CASES. A MAJOR EFFORT
9 AND YEARS OF TESTING BY TEAMS ACROSS CONTINENTS. WE HAVE BEGUN
10 THE DRY RUN OF EVER FINAL ROUND FORMAL LAB TESTING WHICH
11 INCLUDES 48 TEST PROCEDURES 2,000 TEST CASES AND 12,000
12 INDIVIDUAL STEPS. THIS TEST PHASE WILL DEMONSTRATE SYSTEM
13 READINESS FOR FINAL PILOT PRIOR TO LAUNCH. WE HAVE WORKED WITH
14 MTC AND SELECTED VENDORS TO VALIDATE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE C2
15 FARE CARDS AND C2 FARE TICKETS. BOTH VENDORS, PARAGON AND
16 COMTEX HAVE SUCCESSFULLY PRODUCED MEDIA THAT CAN BE SECURELY
17 VENDED AND TAPPED WHICH IS A MAJOR MILESTONE CONCLUDED
18 INSTALLATION OF C2 VALIDATORS WHICH INVOLVE HUNDREDS OF
19 PHYSICAL LOCATIONS AND OVER 3500 VEHICLES AT ALL 23 OPERATORS
20 JUST UNDER 7,000 TOTAL VALIDATORS SYSTEM-WIDE. WE HAVE
21 RECEIVED LOCAL INVENTORY AT FARE GATE UPGRADE KITS FOR ARE
22 SFMTA AND BART AS WELL AS INSPECTION DEVICES FOR ALL OPERATORS
23 IN THE SYSTEM. ALL MANUALS AND TRAINING MATERIAL DELIVERED TO
24 MTC. WE HAVE INCREASED OUR LEVEL OF OPERATION SUPPORT DURING
25 THE OUTSIDE LANDS AND DREAM FORCE WE'RE HAPPY TO SEE NO IMPACT



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 TO ANY CLIPPER SERVICES DURING THESE EVENTS. AT THIS STAGE OF
2 THE PROGRAM, NOW AT MOST OF THE MAJOR DEVELOPMENT IS COMPLETE
3 MOST OF THE MAJOR TECHNICAL RISKS TO THE PROJECT SCHEDULE ARE
4 BEHIND US. OUR TEAM IS WORKING CLOSELY WITH MTC STAFF AND
5 PROGRAM PARTNERS TO KEEP THINGS MOVING FORWARD QUICKLY AND
6 IDENTIFY AND RESOLVE ISSUES AS THEY ARISE. AND I AND MY
7 LEADERSHIP TEAM CONTINUE TO MEET WEEKLY WITH MTC AND BART TO
8 ENSURE WE ARE ALL FOCUSED ON THE SAME PRIORITIES. CUBIC
9 REMAINS FULLY COMMITTED TO DELIVERING A WORLD CLASS FARE
10 COLLECTION SYSTEM THAT THE BAY PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION RIDERS
11 DESERVE. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. DOES THAT CONCLUDE, JASON, WHERE
14 WE ARE ON THIS ITEM FROM YOUR PERSPECTIVE?

15

16 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YES. WE'RE READY FOR BOARD MEMBER QUESTIONS.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. LET'S HOLD OFF ON THAT. LET'S TURN
19 TO OUR CLERK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE COMMITTEE.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM.
22 STARTING OFF WITH ALETA DUPREE AND THEN ADINA LEVIN.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. LET'S GO TWO MINUTES, PLEASE,
25 MA'AM.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
3 FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS GOOD TO BE BACK
4 WITH YOU IN-PERSON WITH YOU AGAIN. THE AGAIN THIS IS HEAVY. I
5 LIKE THE CONCEPT I WANT TO SEE IT COME INTO ITS OWN. I'M A
6 TESTER OF C2. I HAVE A CARD IN MY LIFE BAG HERE. IT GENERALLY
7 WORKS FINE. BUT, OCCASIONALLY, BUT I WILL HAVE A YELLOW SCREEN
8 NOT VALID FOR TRAVEL EVEN THOUGH I MAY HAVE 15 OR \$20 STILL
9 LEFT ON THE CARD. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S BEEN RESOLVED I WOULD
10 HOPE THAT THE SYSTEM WOULD PICK THAT ACTIVITY UP. IT SEEMS TO
11 HAPPEN ON BUSY AND FERRY GATES, BUT WHEN I TAP ON A MUNI FARE
12 GATE, IT WILL SHOW THE BALANCE AND LET ME IN. THAT'S HOW I YOU
13 KNOW THE VALUE OF IT. BUT HOW DO WE GET THERE? I GO TO NEW
14 YORK, AND I USE MY PHONE ON THE BUSES AND THEIR FAMOUS SUBWAY
15 SYSTEM. AND I'M SET UP FOR REDUCED FARE. IT'S A DOLLAR 45 A
16 TRIP, AND I NEVER PAY MORE THAN \$17 IN A ROLLING SEVEN-DAY
17 PERIOD. BUT THEY DID HAVE A BIG MEETING IN NEW YORK A FEW
18 MONTHS AGO WHERE THEY DON'T YET HAVE A FIRM TIME FRAME ON WHEN
19 IT WILL BE IMPLEMENTED ON COMMUTER RAIL. SO, REALLY, WE HAVE A
20 LOT OF COMMON THEMES BETWEEN US AND WHAT'S HAPPENING IN NEW
21 YORK CITY AND NEW YORK STATE. SO, HOW DO WE GET THERE? I'M
22 HOPING THAT WE COULD GET THIS DEPLOYED SOON. MOST OF ALL, WE
23 HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE DO IT RIGHT. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ADINA LEVIN.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS.

3 ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA, HERE LISTENING TO THE

4 DISMAYING NEWS ABOUT THE CHANGE IN THE TIMELINE FOR THIS

5 CRITICAL PROJECT. THE DELIVERY OF CLIPPER TWO HAS TIED TO IT

6 SEVERAL CRITICAL FEATURES THAT ARE VERY POPULAR WITH RIDERS

7 AND ARE EXPECTED TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. THE FREE AND

8 REDUCED PRICE TRANSFERS, THE TAP TO PAY, AND OTHERS, ARE

9 THINGS THAT WILL HELP BRING RIDERS TO THE SYSTEM, HELP

10 INCREASE PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THE TRANSIT SYSTEM, AMONGST THE

11 PUBLIC, AND, ALSO HELP INCREASE CONFIDENCE AMONGST KEY

12 STAKEHOLDERS IN THE REGION UPON WHOM THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IS

13 DEPENDING ON BE ABLE TO BRING TO THE FUNDING TO MAKE SURE THAT

14 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM CONTINUES AND IMPROVE THIS DELAY IS REALLY

15 HARMFUL TO ACHIEVING THOSE BENEFITS AND OBJECTIVES AND LOOKING

16 AT THE SCHEDULE MAYBE I'M NOT READING IT CORRECTLY BUT IT

17 LOOKS LIKE THE OUTCOME WILL BE NEXT SUMMER AND WHEN I'M

18 LOOKING AT THE MILESTONES IT SEEMS LIKE MILESTONES LOOKS LIKE

19 IT'S THREE OR FOUR MONTHS LONG. WHEN I STARTED TRANSIT

20 ADVOCACY WITH DOING MORE ADVOCACY AT A REGIONAL LEVEL WHEN

21 PROJECTS ON CALTRAIN CORRIDOR WITH SIGNAL SYSTEM RAN INTO SOME

22 MAJOR TROUBLE IT LOOKS LIKE THEY CHOSE A TECHNOLOGY THAT

23 TURNED OUT TO BE A BETAMAX AND WHEN THE ELECTRIFICATION

24 PROJECT RAN INTO TROUBLE THERE WAS REALLY A MAJOR OF THE TO

25 WORK WITH THE VENDOR AND WITH THE EXECUTIVE TEAM AND WITH THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 MANAGERS AND BOARD SUPERVISING THAT AND GET BACK ON TRACK THAT
2 LEVEL OF ATTENTION IS NEEDED HERE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE TWO MORE SPEAKERS ONLINE.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ANDREA, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M ANDREA HORVINSKI. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I'M ANDREA, I'M A TRANSIT RIDER I LIVE IN WEST CONTRA
15 COSTA COUNTY I TAKE BART AND MUNI AND AC TRANSIT PRETTY
16 REGULARLY I'M EXTREMELY CONCERNED ABOUT THE CLIPPER2.0 DELAYS
17 AND I WANT TO ECHO WHAT ADINA SAID ABOUT, REALLY, I -- MAYBE
18 IT'S JUST A QUICKER OF THIS MEETING BUT IT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE
19 THERE'S A TON OF URGENCY HERE. AND YOU KNOW, NOT ONLY IS ALL
20 THESE PROJECTS THAT IT'S TIED TO IS CRITICAL FOR GETTING
21 PEOPLE BACK ON TO THE SYSTEM, IT'S THAT WE WANT TO FUND THE
22 SYSTEM BY ASKING PEOPLE TO VOTE YES ON THE MEASURE IN THE
23 UPCOMING FUTURE AND GIVING THEM CONFIDENCE IN THE SYSTEM IS
24 CRITICAL TO GETTING THEM TO PUT YES ON THEIR BALLOTS AND THE
25 BALLOT MEASURE WHEN IT COMES UP SO I REALLY WANT TO URGE THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 BOARD AND ALL STAKEHOLDERS HERE REALLY TO WORK TOGETHER WITH
2 ALL HANDS ON DECK APPROACH TRY TO MAKE THIS HAPPEN SOONER
3 RATHER THAN LATER, SHORTEN MILESTONES, SHORTEN TESTING PERIODS
4 CONCENTRATE ON GETTING THIS DONE MUCH QUICKER THAN IS
5 CURRENTLY PROJECTED. THIS IS NOT NEW TECHNOLOGY YOU KNOW
6 PLENTY OF OTHER PLACES ARE USING IT ALREADY WE'RE ALREADY
7 BEHIND IN TERMS OF OUR TRANSIT AMENITIES AND THE TRANSIT
8 SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE. SO CONTINUING TO DELAY THIS INTO 2025 IS
9 QUITE BAD FOR ALL THE TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT USE CLIPPER AND FOR
10 THE BAY AREA AS A WHOLE, BECAUSE AS EVERYBODY HERE KNOWS
11 TRANSIT IS A WAY THAT WE KEEP TRAFFIC OFF THE ROADS, WE
12 DECREASE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, AND MEET THE STATE'S
13 CLIMATE GOALS. AND MANY OTHER ASSOCIATED BENEFITS. SO, ONCE
14 AGAIN, REALLY, PLEASE BRING THE URGENCY. IT'S NEEDED TO GET
15 THIS PROJECT DELIVERED QUICKER AND SOONER RATHER THAN LATER.
16 THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHNNY
19 PARKER.

20

21 **JOHNNY PARKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON I'M JOHNNY PARKER WITH THE
22 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, ALSO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
23 SUBCOMMITTEE. I AM ALSO DISAPPOINTED IN THE DELAY OF CLIPPER2.
24 BUT, I DO WORK FOR A PUBLIC LIBRARY, AND WE OFTEN DEAL WITH
25 VENDORS WHERE WE JUST CAN'T SEEM TO GET THINGS COMPATIBLE AND



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 HAVE CERTAIN SERVICES RELEASED ON TIME. SO, I CAN KIND OF -- I
2 CAN UNDERSTAND THAT PERSPECTIVE OF IT, AND I JUST HOPE THAT
3 EVERYONE, INCLUDING RIDERS, CAN BE PATIENT. BECAUSE, YES, IT
4 IS A DISAPPOINTMENT, BUT WHAT'S VERY IMPORTANT IS THAT YOU GET
5 IT RIGHT SO THAT YOU DON'T HAVE TO GO BACK AND THEN HAVE TO
6 DEAL WITH MULTIPLE CHANGES. SO, THANK YOU FOR MY COMMENT.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
9 ONLINE.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. YOU KNOW,
12 I AM GONNA TAKE A LITTLE PRIVILEGE HERE AND MAKE SURE THAT WE
13 ALL, AT LEAST, GET A MOMENT TO SPEAK ON THIS TOPIC. PROBABLY
14 NOTHING MORE CRITICAL GOING ON RIGHT NOW IN CONCERT OR IN
15 COLLABORATION WITH THE MEETING THIS MORNING OF THE SELECT
16 COMMITTEE THAN BRINGING CLIPPER TWO ONLINE HERE. SO, EVEN IF
17 IT'S BRIEF, I WOULD ENCOURAGE US ALL TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS
18 HERE. TO MY RIGHT, MIKE. SORRY TO PUT YOU FIRST.

19

20 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I GOT TO SIT ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THE ROOM NEXT
21 TIME.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I KNOW. [LAUGHTER] I'M SORRY.

24



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU FOR BEING FORTH RIGHT AND WHAT I
2 THINK IS THE BEST STORY YOU CAN TELL RIGHT NOW THIS IS
3 TROUBLING I STARTED MY CAREER AS A SUPPLIER IN 1993. I SEE
4 VERTICAL SCHEDULE WHICH IS WORRISOME WHAT I HEARD BASICALLY
5 YOU DON'T REALLY KNOW WHAT THE SCHEDULE IS YOU WILL KNOW
6 BETTER AFTER THE TESTING? IS THAT CORRECT?

7

8 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YES.

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** IS THAT BEST CASE YOU'RE SHOWING US HERE TODAY.

11

12 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WE THINK IN TERMS OF TESTING OVER IN A COUPLE
13 OF MONTHS, IF YOU ASK CUBIC THE SAME QUESTION THEY WILL TELL
14 YOU THE SAME THING WE EXPECT THE TESTING TO GO THIS WAY AND
15 FEEL COMFORTABLE ABOUT THE SCHEDULE WE LAID OUT.

16

17 **MICHAEL HURSH:** BACK A MILLION YEARS AGO WE GOT INTO TROUBLE
18 LIKE THIS WE DIDN'T ALWAYS HAVE THE RESOURCES TO DEPLOY OUR
19 PROJECT ARE WE CONFIDENT WE CAN MOVE THIS SCHEDULE AS FAST AS
20 WE CAN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THING ARE A COUPLE OF ANSWERS TO THAT, LET ME GIVE
23 YOU TWO. 50 I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE PROGRESS THAT WE HAVE MADE
24 SPECIFICALLY AROUND THE MITIGATION OF RISK. WHEN WE TALKED
25 ABOUT WHAT'S AHEAD OF US FROM A TESTING PERSPECTIVE, MOST OF



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 THE TEST CASES HAVE ALREADY BEEN EXECUTED. THIS ISN'T
2 SOMETHING WE'RE GOING INTO A SITUATION WHERE WE DON'T KNOW
3 WHAT THE RISK PROFILE S WE HAVE A MANAGEABLE RISK PROFILE ALL
4 MAJOR SOFTWARE UPDATES HAVE BEEN DEPLOYED THIS IS FINAL DOUBLE
5 CHECKING MAKING SURE WE REACH THE POINT WHERE BENEFITS ARE
6 ROCK SOLID AND IT'S GOING TO WORK NO MATTER WHAT. APRIL IS THE
7 DATE THAT WAS FORECASTING, WHAT WAS SHOWED THERE IS STILL RISK
8 CONTINGENCY IN THERE STILL SOME SLACK IF THE TESTING GOES AS
9 WE BELIEVE IT WILL GO AND ACTIVITIES THAT WE REPORT IN
10 DECEMBER ARE AS WE'RE FORECASTING THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO DO
11 BETTER. BUT BECAUSE IT'S ALWAYS LOOK A KNOWN UNKNOWN, RIGHT?
12 YOU MAY RUN INTO TESTS, YOU MAY FIND SOMETHING THAT YOU DIDN'T
13 PLAN IT'S HARD TO SAY TO THE HOUR WHEN IT'S GOING TO HAPPEN.
14 SO I DON'T WANT TO YOU -- AT LEAST FROM OUR PERSPECTIVE, POINT
15 OF VIEW IS THAT WE HAVE NO IDEA WHEN IT'S GOING TO BE WE'RE
16 GOING THROUGH PHASES OF WORK OUT AND IRONING OUT, BUT FROM A
17 RESOURCING PERSPECTIVE, I WOULD DOUBLE DOWN, I'M PERSONALLY
18 INVOLVED I'M THE GLOBAL RESPONSIBLE PERSON FOR THE ENTIRE
19 ORGANIZATION WE WERE SET SITTING ON CALLS EVERY WEEK WITH MTC
20 MAKING SURE EVERYTHING THAT NEEDED TO BE ESCALATED NO MATTER
21 WHERE SOMEBODY WAS IN THE WORLD WE WERE ABSOLUTELY DEDICATED
22 MAKING SURE WE'RE GETTING ABOUT THROUGH THE SITUATION WHICH IS
23 HOW WE WERE ABLE TO MAKE SO MUCH PROGRESS. WE HAVE BROUGHT
24 PEOPLE IN FROM AUSTRALIA LITERALLY FROM ALL OVER THE WORLD TO
25 MAKE SURE THIS PROJECT GETTING THE ATTENTION AND RESOURCES IT



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 NEEDS TO BE SUCCESSFUL. FROM A RESOURCING PERSPECTIVE, WE'RE
2 AT THE POINT WHERE THE TESTS ARE JUST RUN INTO LINEAR SEQUENCE
3 YOU HAVE TO GO THROUGH IT IN THE DAY IN THE LIFE THE JOURNEY
4 ADDING TEN MORE PEOPLE IS NOT GOING TO MAKE THAT GO FASTER.
5 FROM A CRITICAL RESOURCE PERSPECTIVE WE FEEL THAT WE HAVE
6 ALLOCATED AND WILL CONTINUE TO ALLOCATE AND CONTINUE TO
7 MONITOR AND CONTINUE TO HAVE THOSE MEETINGS UNTIL WE'RE
8 SUCCESSFUL AND FROM AN OVERALL RISK PERSPECTIVE I THINK THERE
9 IS A CLEAR LINE OF SITE INTO GETTING THIS INTO THE PUBLIC
10 HANDS AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE EXCITED ABOUT.

11

12 **MICHAEL HURSH:** MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC'S COMMENT ABOUT VOTER
13 CONFIDENCE CANNOT BE DOUBLE PULLED UNDERLYING EMPHASIS ENOUGH
14 AS WE TRY TO SOLVE A MUCH LARGER PROBLEM I BELIEVE THE
15 FUNDING, TO APPROVE THE \$20 MILLION CONTRACT WHICH WE HAVE
16 ASKED TO NOT MAKE ANY CHANGES THIS BOARD HAS BEEN INCREDIBLY
17 PATIENT TO SEE CHANGES THAT WE HAVE NOW BEEN WAITING ALMOST
18 TWO YEARS FOR.

19

20 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. DENIS MULLIGAN.

21

22 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** WHEN MTC SIGNED THE CONTRACT WITH CLIPPER2.0
23 WHAT WAS THE DATE THAT WE TOLD THE PUBLIC THEY WOULD GO LIVE
24 AND WOULD BE ABLE TO USE THE SYSTEM? IF WE'RE TALK ABOUT
25 DELAY, THINK THE PUBLIC HAS QUESTIONS AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO BE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 TRANSPARENT IF THERE HAVE BEEN CHANGES ALONG THE WAY. WHEN WE
2 SIGNED THIS CONTRACT WITH MTC WHAT WAS THE DATE THAT WE TOLD
3 THE PUBLIC WE WOULD GO LIVE? I THINK IT'S FOUNDATIONAL.

4

5 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I MIGHT HAVE TO LOOK TO MY STAFF. I DON'T
6 KNOW OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD, BOARD MEMBER MULLIGAN. I -- I --

7

8 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** IT'S NOT THE FIRST DELAY. IF YOU COULD LOOK IT
9 UP. YOU SHOULD PUT IT IN THE STAFF REPORT. WE SHOULD BE FULLY
10 TRANSPARENT. CONTRACT THIS DATE, WE WANTED CHANGES OPEN
11 PAYMENTS ADDED TIME TO IT HAD A NEW DATE WITH THE PUBLIC AND
12 NOW WE'RE SLIPPING THAT DATE. WE NEED TO TELL A COMPLETE STORY
13 AND BE TRANSPARENT. MIKE'S POINT, CREDIBILITY WITH THE PUBLIC.
14 THEY WANT TO KNOW THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE HONEST WITH THEM. IF
15 WE AREN'T FULLY HONEST WITH SOMETHING LIKE THIS IT MAY CAST A
16 CLOUD OVER TO THE PRIOR ONE WAS ON US WE WANTED CERTAIN THINGS
17 SO THAT'S ONE QUESTION. THE NEXT QUESTION IS WHEN I GLANCE AT
18 THAT SCHEDULE IT LOOKS LIKE MAYBE NEXT SUMMER WE'LL BE LIVE
19 WITH THE PUBLIC. DOES THAT INCLUDE FULL FUNCTIONALITY? OR
20 THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THAT? NEXT
21 SUMMER, ASSUMING THE RISKS ALL GO THE WAY WE WANT THEM TO O
22 NEXT SUMMER WILL OPEN PAYMENTS BE FULLY FUNCTIONAL? WILL THE
23 TRANSFERS BE FULLY FUNCTIONAL? OR WILL SOME THINGS NOT BE
24 FULLY FUNCTIONAL? BECAUSE IF THAT'S THE CASE WE NEED TO
25 DISCLOSE THAT NOW.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THOSE TWO ITEMS YOU MENTIONED WILL BE FULLY
3 FUNCTIONAL ON DAY ONE WHEN WE START TRANSITION.

4

5 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** WE SHOULD MAKE SURE THE TRANSIT AGENCIES AND
6 ADVOCATES KNOW WHAT THOSE ITEMS ARE IT GETS INTO THE TRUST.
7 TRUST AND TRANSPARENCY ARE VITAL ALL THE TIME AS A PUBLIC
8 AGENCY BUT PARTICULARLY WHEN YOU'RE HAVING CONVERSATIONS ABOUT
9 MORE MONEY. I WOULD ASK FOR CLEAN DELINEATION. I DON'T WANT TO
10 MOVE THE FINISH LINE OR GOALPOST AGAIN. FURTHER UNDERMINING
11 TRUST THAT WE HAVE. THEN I'LL GO BACK TO MY COLLEAGUE TO MY
12 RIGHT'S POINT, WE HAVEN'T MADE CHANGES FOR A LONG TIME BECAUSE
13 IT'S JUST AROUND THE CORNER, JUST AROUND THE CORNER. IT'S BEEN
14 MANY, MANY, MANY YEARS AND THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE HAS BEEN
15 SUFFERING USING OLD TECHNOLOGY. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT. AND
16 ONE LAST QUESTION WHEN MTC SIGNED THIS CONTRACT WITH CUBIC,
17 WENT THROUGH PROCUREMENT THERE IS LOTS OF PROCUREMENTS GOING
18 ON ACROSS THE COUNTRY WHERE CUBIC WAS A SUCCESSFUL VENDOR AND
19 I THINK IT WAS A CONCERN IN THE EARLY DAYS WHEN THE CONTRACT
20 WAS SIGNED, WE'RE A LOT SMALLER THAN A COUPLE OF THOSE REGIONS
21 ARE WE GOING TO GET SAME EFFORT WE DESERVE SO THE QUESTION IS
22 OTHER BIG CONTRACTS HAD SIMILAR DELAYS AND IF DELAYS ARE
23 UNIQUE TO THE BAY AREA OR SOMETHING THAT WE SHOULD HAVE DONE
24 DIFFERENT OR THAT WE'RE SMALLER AND NOT AS IMPORTANT A CLIENT.

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THAT ONE IS FOR ME.

2

3 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** YEAH. I THINK SO TOO.

4

5 **PETER TORRELAS:** I KNOWLEDGE EVERY CLIENT WE COMMIT TO COST WE
6 COMMIT TO AND ORIGINAL CONTRACT STRUCTURE ARE THE PROMISES
7 THAT WE MAKE AND WE AIM TO MEET PROMISES AND KEEP OUR PROMISES
8 WITH ALL OF OUR CUSTOMERS AS FAR AS PROJECTS TAKING LONGER, I
9 BELIEVE THERE ARE MANY PROJECTS THAT HAVE TAKEN LONGER BUT FOR
10 DIFFERENT REASONS, AS YOU SAID, SEQUENCING THINGS DIFFERENTLY
11 AND OTHER CUSTOMERS HAVE FOUND DIFFERENT REASONS TO SEQUENCE
12 THINGS DIFFERENTLY AND CIRCUMSTANCES THAT HAVE GONE THROUGH. I
13 DON'T KNOW THAT THERE IS A 1-TO-1 RELATIONSHIP BUT I THINK
14 FROM RESOURCING PERSPECTIVE YOU HAVE ONE OF THE BEST TEAMS IN
15 THE WORLD ON THIS JOB CERTAINLY ONE OF THE MOST EXPERIENCED
16 PROJECT DIRECTORS IN THE WORLD WE'RE ABSOLUTELY ALLOCATING ALL
17 OF THE RESOURCES THAT WE CAN THAT ARE NEEDED FOR SPECIFIC
18 ISSUES THAT ARE FOUND DURING TESTS TO THE JOB. I DON'T THINK
19 THERE IS ANYTHING RELATED TO SIZE, OR, YOU KNOW,
20 PRIORITIZATION, IF YOU WILL, OF THIS PARTICULAR PROGRAM, OVER
21 ANY OTHER PROGRAM.

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS.

24

25 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS. GREG RICHARDSON, VTA.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **GREG RICHARDSON:** I WILL SAY THE COMMENTS YOU'RE GOING HEAR,
3 WHAT YOU HAVE ALREADY HEARD, THERE IS A LOT OF EXCITEMENT FOR
4 THIS PROJECT, A LOT OF INTEREST IT'S ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT
5 PROJECTS THAT WE HAVE HAD AS A TRANSIT INDUSTRY HERE IN MANY,
6 MANY YEARS. SO I THINK THAT THAT MESSAGE IS HOPEFUL GETTING
7 THROUGH. WE'RE EXCITED AND AS WE GET CLOSER, MY CONCERN NOW
8 IS, WHEN I LOOK AT THE SCHEDULE AND TRUST ME WHEN I SAY, I
9 FULLY APPRECIATE WHEN YOU HAVE GOT A BIG SCHEDULE AND A BIG
10 PROJECT AND THE SCHEDULE KEEPING MOVING, I FULLY APPRECIATE
11 HOW THE PUBLIC SEES THAT. BUT, I THINK TODAY WE HAVE
12 EFFECTIVELY, FOR ME, WE HAVE, SORT OF, DRAWN A LINE IN THE
13 SAND, THERE IS A DATE THAT PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING FOR
14 NOW BASED ON WHERE THIS THING IS GOING. SO COME APRIL THEY'RE
15 GOING TO BE LOOKING FOR THIS TO THE READY. I'M GOING TO ASK
16 YOU KIND OF WHAT TO WHAT MIKE WAS GETTING TO, IS THERE ENOUGH
17 CONTINGENCY BUILT INTO THIS SCHEDULE THAT YOU ARE NOT
18 CONCERNED ABOUT THIS COMING TO FRUITION IN THE SUMMER TIME?

19

20 **PETER TORRELAS:** I CAN ANSWER FROM OUR PERSPECTIVE, AS WE HAVE
21 SAID BEFORE, ALL OF THE MAJOR RISKS THAT WE HAVE SEEN, WE HAVE
22 OVERCOME, SO WE FEEL GOOD ABOUT APRIL. WE'RE ON TRACK TO GET
23 THERE. THERE ARE, OF COURSE, RISKS ON EVERY JOB, SO I WOULDN'T
24 SAY WE'RE COMPLETELY OUT OF THE WOODS, BUT BY AND LARGE WE SEE
25 A CLEAR LINE OF SITE GETTING TO APRIL AND I'M HERE TO



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 PERSONALLY COMMIT TO RESOURCES, TO THE ATTENTION AND DATES
2 SHOWN ON THE SCHEDULE.

3

4 **GREG RICHARDSON:** SO THE ASSUMPTION THERE IS ANYTHING THAT
5 HAPPENS BETWEEN NOW AND THAT TIME FRAME IS GOING TO BE
6 COMPLETELY SOMETHING OUT OF THE ORDINARY THAT WOULD NEVER HAVE
7 BEEN FORESEEN AS A SITUATION THAT WOULD HAVE PRESENTED ITSELF?

8

9 **PETER TORRELAS:** IT WOULD EITHER BE AN UNKNOWN IF YOU WILL OR
10 SOMETHING THAT HAPPENED DURING THE NORMAL COURSE.

11

12 **GREG RICHARDSON:** GOING OUT TO THE SCHEDULE BLOCKS, CURIOUS, WE
13 HAVE IN HERE APRIL DATE THROUGH JULY THAT PROJECTED CUSTOMER
14 TRANSITION, TELL ME WHAT'S HAPPENING DURING THAT TIME FRAME AS
15 FAR AS THAT TRANSITION.

16

17 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I CAN TAKE THAT THAT ONE. WE HAVE APRIL 10
18 MILLION PLUS EXISTING CARDS OUT THERE IN THE WORLD. WE CAN'T
19 JUST TAKE EVERY CARD ON DAY ONE AND FLIP IT OVER SO IT CAN BE
20 USED IN THE SYSTEM. WE'RE GOING TO BE TAKING ABOUT 150,000
21 CARDS A DAY AND FLIPPING THEM AND WE'RE WORKING WITH ALL THE
22 VARIOUS TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF ABOUT WHAT THE ORDER LOOKS LIKE
23 IN TERMS OF WHO TRANSITIONS WHEN. AND, SO, WHEN YOU JUST DO
24 THE BASIC MATH, IT COMES OUT TO ABOUT THREE AND A HALF TO FOUR



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 MONTHS, SOMETHING LIKE THAT. NOW IF WE COULD GO FASTER, MAYBE
2 WE CAN BUT WE WANT TO BE REALISTIC IN TERMS OF --

3

4 **GREG RICHARDSON:** IN THE PILOT PROCESS THAT YOU WOULD LEARN
5 SOME STUFF AND MAYBE COULD MOVE A LITTLE QUICKER DURING THAT.

6

7 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I DON'T KNOW THAT WE'LL LEARN DURING THE
8 PILOT THAT SAYS HEY WE CAN TAKE 200,000 OR 300,000 CARS TODAY.
9 WE MIGHT NOT KNOW THAT UNTIL WE ACTUALLY START.

10

11 **GREG RICHARDSON:** MY LAST QUESTION IS VTA COMING FROM THE BOARD
12 AS FAR AS FARES, CHANGES THAT NEED TO BE IMPLEMENTED, WITH
13 CURRENT CLIPPER THEN TO C2, THE IDEA THERE'S CHANGES, FOR SOME
14 FARE PROGRAMS THAT WE HAVE GOT LET'S SAY VTA HOW MUCH TIME
15 WILL IT TAKE BEFORE THOSE CAN START BEING IMPLEMENTED THROUGH
16 THE SYSTEM?

17

18 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I MEAN THE SENSE IT WILL BE FASTER THAN THE
19 WAY THAT THEY ARE DONE TODAY I THINK THE ANSWER TO THAT WOULD
20 BE THOSE THINGS STILL NEED TO BE TESTED TO MAKE SURE IT
21 DOESN'T MESS UP ANYTHING ELSE THAT'S GOING ON SO WILL IT BE
22 ORDERS OF MAGNITUDE FASTER THAN IT IS TODAY? I DON'T KNOW THAT
23 IT WILL BE, BUT, ALSO, YOU KNOW, IT'S -- AS LONG AS WE KNOW
24 ABOUT THEM IN ADVANCE, I DON'T THINK THAT, TYPICALLY SPEAKING,
25 THE PROCESSES THAT YOU ALL HAVE TO GO THROUGH IN ORDER TO GET



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 FARE CHANGES APPROVED THROUGH YOUR VARIOUS GOVERNING BODIES,
2 YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD BE IN LINE WITH THAT.

3

4 **GREG RICHARDSON:** AGAIN I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE WORK
5 YOU'RE DOING, EVERYONE IS EXCITED FOR THIS TO COME TO
6 FRUITION. SO WE SUPPORT EVERY WAY WE CAN. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS GREG. ANDY?

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANKS, CHAIR POWERS, AND THANK YOU, PETER AND
11 THANK YOU FOR COMING IN TODAY AND FACING THIS INQUISITION
12 HERE. I WANT TO REFLECT ON THE DAY WE HAVE ALL HAD TODAY. AND
13 HOW IT STARTED, REALLY, WITH THE REAL INTENT OF GAINING NEW
14 RIDERS IN THE TRANSIT SYSTEM IT'S PROBABLY THE MOST IMPORTANT
15 ASPECT BEYOND SOME OF THE TRUST ISSUES THAT WERE BROUGHT UP
16 EARLIER. AND WE HAVE CONTINUED, TODAY, WITH A LOT OF
17 PRESENTATIONS ON HOW WE ATTRACT NEW CUSTOMERS. SO, IT'S THE
18 WAYFINDING, IT'S THE SEAMLESS WAYS FOR ALL DISABILITY FOLKS
19 AND EVERYBODY ELSE NEEDING TO GET SOME OF OUR SERVICES EASY
20 APPLICATIONS AND INTO THE SYSTEM. WE'RE NOW HERE TALKING ABOUT
21 PROBABLY THE BIGGEST POSTER CHILD IN THIS SPACE, AND THAT'S
22 THE NEW CLIPPER ENVIRONMENT. THE GOOD NEWS IS WE DO HAVE A
23 VERY WELL FUNCTIONING EXISTING CLIPPER SYSTEM BUT WE HAVE GOT
24 A LOT OF PROMISES IN THIS NEW COMING SYSTEM. I'M ALSO
25 REFLECTING ON ALL THE DIFFERENT CHALLENGES WE HAVE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 COORDINATING WITH BOB'S FARE GATES, MOBILE PROVIDERS, SO MANY
2 DIFFERENT CONNECTIONS CAN. I WANT TO URGE YOU ALL TO MAKE SURE
3 WE'RE DOING OUR BEST NOT TO MISS ANY OF THOSE TRAPS AND IF YOU
4 FEEL LIKE THERE'S SOMETHING NOT BEING COMMUNICATE WELL ABOUT
5 SOME OF THE CONNECTIONS THAT NEED TO BE MADE, BRING THEM
6 FORWARD. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE REGULAR UPDATES AND AGAIN WE'RE
7 TRYING TO GET TO THE FINISH LINE TOGETHER. I URGE YOU TO
8 CONTINUE TO BE FRANK WITH US AND CONTINUE TO TURN THINGS IN
9 AND LET US KNOW WHERE THERE ARE PARTICULAR CHALLENGES SO WE
10 CAN TRY TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO RESOLVE THEM AND MOVE FORWARD.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS ANDY. APRIL THEN JEFF.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** SO, I DO WANT TO THANK THE CUBIC TEAM
15 FOR COMING HERE AND TALK ABOUT THIS. I HAVE TO SAY, USING THE
16 -- AND I'M A BIG USER OF THE CLIPPER CARD, AND IN FACT, I WAS
17 JUST SHARING WITH SOME OF THE FOLKS EARLIER, I HAD TROUBLE
18 USING CLIPPER THIS MORNING, I DON'T KNOW IF IT RELATES TO
19 CLIPPER OR SOME OF THE NEW READERS. IT'S ONE OF THOSE THINGS
20 YOU DON'T WANT TO PUT ANGUISH INTO THE USER, BECAUSE I HAD TO
21 MAKE SURE I'M NOT GOING TO GET TICKETED. I WAS RIDING CALTRAIN
22 THIS MORNING. SO I HAD TO GO OUT GET A CONDUCTOR AND MAKE SURE
23 I'M DOING EVERYTHING I'M SUPPOSED TO DO. I WANT TO MAKE SURE
24 THE SYSTEM IS WORKING AS IT'S SUPPOSED TO AS A USER THAT'S
25 PROBABLY THE LAST THING YOU WANT THEM TO EXPERIENCE. LOOKING



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 AT THE SCHEDULE, I WANT TO MAKE SURE I COMPLETELY UNDERSTAND
2 THIS AND I THINK SOME HAD ASKED THIS QUESTION AND IT DOES LOOK
3 LIKE -- AND SOME MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AS WELL, IT LOOKS LIKE
4 THERE ARE A NUMBER OF THINGS HAPPENING ALMOST CONCURRENTLY
5 JUST TO MAKE SURE I COMPLETELY UNDERSTAND IT DOES APPEAR THAT
6 EVEN SOME OF THE EQUIPMENT HAS NOT BEEN FULLY INSTALLED. AND,
7 SO, THAT'S MAKING SURE, JUST EVEN HAVING THAT TO BE IN PLACE
8 AND MAKING SURE THAT WORKS, WHILE YOU'RE ALSO WORKING ON THE
9 BACK END IT SOUND LIKE, THOSE TWO NEED TO KIND OF WORK AND
10 MAKING SURE THAT IT'S ALIGNED IN THE SCHEDULE, IS THAT -- IS
11 THAT A TRUE STATEMENT?

12

13 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I COULD BE MORE CLEAR. SO, ALL OF THE BUS AND
14 PLATFORM DEVICES ARE IN. WE HAVE A CERTAIN NUMBER -- AMOUNT OF
15 WORK THAT WE NEED TO FOR THE MUNI GATES, DOWNTOWN STATION,
16 THAT ALL HAVE FARE GATES, SAME THING, AND WITH BART WE'RE
17 WORKING WITH BART TO DO THE INTEGRATION WORK THERE. CUBIC IS
18 FILL IN CHARGE OF ALL THE WORK THAT NEEDS TO HAPPEN ON THE
19 MUNI GATE SO THEY'LL HANDLE THAT ON THEIR OWN WE'RE WORKING
20 WITH BART TO MANAGE THEIR EXISTING GATES WITH THEIR NEW VENDOR
21 TRAFFIC IN TERMS OF EQUIPMENT THAT NEEDS TO BE INSTALLED I
22 WOULD SAY MAJOR STUFF LIKE TICKET VENDING MACHINES, LIKE
23 CALTRAIN, VT AMP, SMART, SOME PLACE ELSE.

24



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** SO THAT'S PROGRESSING. WHAT I'M HEARING
2 I WANT IT MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND COMPLETELY, THIS IS WHAT
3 YOU'RE PROJECTING TODAY BUT WE'RE GOING TO GET MONTHLY UPDATES
4 SO THERE IS KEEPING TO THAT BUT I DO -- WE DON'T WANT TO ERODE
5 THE PUBLIC'S TRUST GETTING TO THE TIMELINE. IF I REMEMBER
6 ADINA MAY HAVE SAID THIS, IT'S ONE OF THOSE THINGS, THERE ARE
7 SO MANY OF THESE ENHANCEMENTS THAT WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING FOR
8 AND THOSE ARE SOME OF THE ENHANCEMENTS I THINK THAT'S GOING TO
9 HELP IN TERMS OF USE, YOU KNOW, OUR FARE SYSTEM, IT'S KIND OF
10 SEAMLESS ACROSS THE MANY OPERATORS. SO THOSE ARE ONE OF THE
11 THINGS THAT WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING FORWARD TO AND WE CAN'T HAVE
12 THOSE UNTIL THIS THING IS ACTUALLY FULLY OPERATIONAL. ANYWAY.
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. JEFF?

16

17 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I'LL REPEAT A LITTLE OF WHAT OTHERS HAVE SAID.
18 THANK YOU FOR COMING HERE TODAY THAT IS MEANINGFUL TO US.
19 SECONDLY, AS HAS ALSO BEEN SAID WE SPENT THE MORNING TALKING
20 ABOUT HOW ARE EARTH ARE WE GOING TO CONVINCING THE VOTERS IS OF
21 THE BAY AREA TO TAX THEMSELVES TO GIVE US AN EXTRA BILLION
22 DOLLAR A YEAR. IF WE'RE UNSUCCESSFUL AT THAT THERE ARE FOUR OF
23 US, AT LEAST, THAT ARE GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE DRASTIC SERVICE
24 CUTS IN ORDER TO DEAL WITH THE BUDGET REALITY AND THAT WILL IN
25 TURN CREATE DRASTIC SERVICE CUTS FOR THE OTHERS HERE AT THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 DAIS. IN ORDER TO WIN WE NEED TO CREATE TRUST. AND THE VOTERS
2 DON'T UNDERSTAND THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN US AND OUR TICKETING
3 SYSTEM. IT IS ESSENTIAL THIS WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER
4 THIS PRODUCT AS CLOSE AS POSSIBLE TO ON TIME AND ON BUDGET
5 BECAUSE THAT IS AN ESSENTIAL ELEMENT OF GENERATING TRUST. FOR
6 A FEW OF US, YOU KNOW, MANY OF OUR FARE PRODUCTS ARE NOT
7 AVAILABLE ON CLIPPER ONE AND SO WE ARE AT GREAT EXPENSE
8 MAINTAINING SEPARATE TICKETING SYSTEMS THAT WE WANT TO GET RID
9 OF AND WE DON'T KNOW WHEN THAT EXPENSE WILL GO AWAY. AND
10 MEANWHILE WE'RE SPENDING MONEY THAT WE DON'T HAVE. WE'RE ALSO
11 AWARE BECAUSE WE TALK TO ALL OF OUR FRIEND IN THE INDUSTRY,
12 THAT THIS SPRING NEW YORK MTA TERMINATED ITS CONTRACT WITH
13 CUBIC AND HANDED THE WORK TO MASABI IN ORDER TO DO THE FARE
14 INTEGRATION WORK FOR OMNI FOR LONG ISLAND RAILROAD AND METRO
15 NORTH THIS SUMMER MBTA IN BOSTON WAS TOLD THAT THEIR FARE
16 SYSTEM WORK IS GOING TO BE POSTPONED BY TWO YEARS. I'M
17 CONCERNED THAT CUBIC SEEMS TO BE SPREAD VERY THIN AND I'M
18 WORRIED WHAT ASSURANCE DO WE HAVE THAT YOU WILL BE ABLE TO
19 DEDICATE THE STAFF IN ORDER TO DELIVER THIS WORK ON TIME. AND
20 YOU SAY THAT STAFF WORK ISN'T THE OBSTACLE, BUT I THINK WE ALL
21 HAVE EITHER BURDEN IN CONSULTING OR MAJOR PROJECT DELIVERY
22 BEFORE AND WE KNOW THAT STAFF HOURS ARE USUALLY THE DIFFERENCE
23 BETWEEN BEING ABLE TO DELIVER SOMETHING ON TIME OR NOT. AND,
24 RELATED TO THAT, BECAUSE WE KNOW WE NEED TO BE PART OF THE
25 SOLUTION, AS WELL, WHAT MORE DO YOU NEED FROM US IN ORDER TO



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 HELP YOU DELIVER THIS PROJECT SOONER? AND, FINALLY, A REQUEST
2 I'LL ITERATE FOR OTHERS AS WELL, WE NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT
3 YOUR RISKS ARE, AND HAVE UPDATED RISK ASSESSMENTS REGULARLY IN
4 WAYS THAT ARE TRANSPARENT. BECAUSE AGAIN IF YOU ARE
5 TRANSPARENT ABOUT RISK THAT ALSO SUGGESTS WAYS IN WHICH WE CAN
6 HELP AS WELL. SO THAT'S THREE QUESTIONS.

7

8 **PETER TORRELAS:** I'LL TAKE THE ONES FOR CUBIC. THANK YOU, BOARD
9 MEMBER TUMLIN. LET ME TRY TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE QUESTIONS
10 THAT YOU ASKED IN THE ORDER THAT I REMEMBER THEM. LET'S START
11 WITH NEW YORK. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD POINT THAT YOU RAISED. IN
12 THE CASE OF NEW YORK, THEY ACTUALLY EXTENDED AN EXISTING
13 CONTRACT WITH MASABI THAT THEY CONTINUE TO USE THE TRAIN TIME
14 APP THAT MTA DEVELOPED WHERE THEY HAVE 70% ACCEPTANCE. THE
15 WORK THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IS AN OPTION IN THE CONTRACT
16 THAT THEY DECIDED NOT TO EXERCISE BECAUSE THEIR FOCUS WAS ON
17 SUBWAY AND BUS. SO WHILE IT WAS REPORTED IN THE MEDIA
18 DIFFERENTLY, THERE WAS NOT A TERMINATION OF NEW CONTRACT OR A
19 NEW AWARD TO MASABI, THE FACT IS THAT IN NEW YORK, WE RECENTLY
20 HAD ON SEPTEMBER 5TH THE LAUNCH OF STUDENT CARDS WHICH IS A
21 NEW FARE POLICY THAT THEY ROLLED OUT. IT'S AN INCREDIBLY
22 SUCCESSFUL FARE POLICY, THEY HAVE ALMOST HALF A MILLION
23 STUDENTS PER MONTH USING IT AND WE HAVE UP TO 3 MILLION
24 TRANSACTIONS SINCE THAT'S BEEN RELEASED, WIDELY ALSO REPORTED
25 BY THE NEW YORK TIMES. IN THE CASE OF BOSTON, FOR A VARIETY OF



1 REASONS, INCLUDING RESEQUENCING THE WORK WHICH THEY ANNOUNCED
2 AT THEIR OWN BOARD MEETING WHICH I ALSO ATTENDED, THE NEW
3 PROJECT SCHEDULE SHOWED A LAWN FOR CONTACT LIST ON AUGUST 1ST,
4 THAT WAS ALSO SUCCESSFUL. ALSO YEARS OF TESTING AND DERISKING.
5 SO THE PUBLIC HAD A HIGH QUALITY PRODUCT. THAT FARE COLLECTION
6 SYSTEMS IS NOW OVER A MILLION TAPS, AS REPORTED BY THE BOSTON
7 GLOBE, INCREDIBLY SUCCESSFUL AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO BRIDGE
8 BRINGING THE SAME LEVEL OF SUCCESS HERE ON THIS PROJECT. AS
9 FAR RESOURCES ARE CONCERNED RESOURCES ARE REALLY KIND OF
10 DEPENDING ON SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT THESE CONTRACTS CAN HAVE
11 WE HAVE ALLOCATED THE RESOURCE TO WORK OUT DEFECTS, BUGS, THAT
12 NORMAL HAPPEN DURING SYSTEM INTEGRATION AND I MENTIONED
13 TESTING PHASES AND CRITICAL RESOURCES AND THAT ARE ACTUALLY
14 ALLOCATED TO THE PROGRAM WE HAVE MONITORING, YOU NEVER KNOW
15 SOMEBODY SOMETHING COMES UP, AND THAT'S WHY MY DEPUTIES ARE ON
16 THOSE CALLS SO THAT THERE IS NO SPACE BETWEEN WHAT WAS NEEDED
17 FOR THE PROGRAM WHOEVER'S NEEDED FOR THE PROGRAM AND OUR
18 ABILITY TO ALLOCATE THOSE RESOURCES. IT'S AN INCREDIBLY
19 EXCITING TIME, WHETHER IT'S FARE POLICY OR USER INTERFACE FOR
20 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR THE 23 OPERATORS, THAT WE'RE ALL
21 EXCITED ABOUT WHAT'S COMING IN APRIL. BUT I'M HERE AGAIN TO
22 PERSONALLY TELL YOU THAT WE HAVE ALL HANDS ON DECK TO MAKE
23 SURE THAT THIS IS SUCCESSFUL AND AS WE ENCOUNTER RISK THAT WE
24 HAVE THE RIGHT TEAM TO BE ABLE TO OVERCOME THEM WITH OUR
25 PARTNERS.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU PETER. EDDIE CUMINS.

3

4 **EDDY CUMINS:** YOU KNOW, ALL THE TALK TODAY, AND I DON'T WANT TO
5 REPEAT WHAT EVERYBODY SAID, BUT I THINK HAVING THE TRUST OF
6 THE PUBLIC IS PROBABILITY NUMBER ONE THING FOR US. AND I THINK
7 THAT, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE SPOKE, AND THEY SAID THEY'RE NOT
8 FEELING A SENSE OF URGENCY. I THINK THAT'S A REAL CHALLENGE
9 AND AS WE MOVE FORWARD WE NEED MORE THAN JUST AN UPDATED
10 SCHEDULE, I THINK THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE DETAILED INFORMATION.
11 I MEAN A FEW QUESTIONS RIGHT OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD ARE, HOW
12 ARE THINGS GOING WITH LAB TESTING AND WHAT DO WE SEE AS MAJOR
13 CHALLENGES MOVING FORWARD. THOSE WOULD BE MY QUESTIONS.

14

15 **PETER TORRELAS:** I'LL LET JASON ANSWER THE LEVEL OF DETAILS
16 REPORTED OUT. I WAS AT THE OUR LAB. LAB TESTING ON OUR SIDE
17 CONTINUES TO GO WELL THAT'S HOW WE GOT THROUGH THE TEST CASES
18 AND DRY RUN BUT I'LL LET JASON SPEAK TO THE BROADER LAB TEST.

19

20 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** MY STAFF ACTUALLY TALKS INTERNALLY WE NEED AT
21 STAFF LEVEL WITH CUBIC'S TEAM TO TALK ABOUT WHERE THERE ARE
22 TERMS OF TESTING, AND DRY RUNS RIGHT NOW ISN'T REALLY
23 CONTRACTUALLY REQUIRED IT'S WHAT CUBIC IS DOING TO MAKE SURE
24 THE SYSTEM INTEGRATION TESTING THAT WE -- THAT'S REQUIRED GOES
25 SMOOTHLY AS WE HOPE IT WILL AND WANT IT TO GO ON. SO,



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 OCCASION, WE WILL -- I CAN TELL YOU FROM MY PERSPECTIVE AND
2 THE MTC TEAM WE'RE FULLY COMMITTED -- ANYWAY, I DO NOT TAKE A
3 LOT OF TIME OFF BUT IN ANY CASE, WE OFTEN GET INTO AREAS DOING
4 STUFF THAT WE WOULDN'T NORMALLY BE INQUIRING ABOUT BUT WE ARE
5 ANYWAY JUST TO MAKE SURE WE CAN DO THAT AND CERTAINLY I CAN
6 BRING A MUCH DEEPER LEVEL OF CONVERSATION HERE IF THAT'S WHAT
7 THE BOARD WOULD LIKE, WE'RE HAPPY TO DO THAT. JUST TRYING TO
8 BE MINDFUL OF YOUR TIME AND THE LEVEL OF DETAIL THAT WE NEED
9 TO PROVIDE.

10

11 **EDDY CUMINS:** THANK YOU. I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO HAVE
12 DETAILED INFORMATION SO THE PUBLIC UNDERSTANDS WHAT THE
13 CHALLENGES ARE. I DON'T KNOW THE PUBLIC UNDERSTANDS WHAT'S
14 GOING ON, ALL THEY KNOW IS IT'S BEEN DELAYED. FOOD FOR
15 THOUGHT.

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOOD. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS,
18 EDDIE. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, LET ME JUST WRAP UP HERE A BIT. I
19 WOULD SAY A COUPLE THINGS. TO PUBLIC COMMENTS, WHETHER THEY
20 WERE PUBLIC COMMENT OR COMMENTS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS HERE,
21 THERE IS A SENSE EVER URGENCY HERE. I THINK FROM EVERYBODY ON
22 THIS DAIS, THAT THERE IS PROBABLY NO MORE IMPORTANT PROJECT
23 GOING ON IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW THAN CLIPPER2 AND BRINGING
24 CLIPPER2 INTO REALIZATION. I KNOW YOU KNOW THAT, PETER. AND
25 JASON, I KNOW YOU KNOW THAT AS WELL. AND YOU KNOW, TO THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 PUBLIC THAT DOESN'T SEE THAT URGENCY I -- MISS BOCKELMAN CAN
2 ATTEST TO IT, MR. WEINSTEIN, MR. PREMIER, MR. TORRELAS. EVERY
3 FRIDAY AT 9:00 A.M. THERE ARE THESE STRATEGIC CALLS, MANY
4 TIMES, PETER YOU'RE THERE, IF YOU'RE NOT, CYNTHIA IS THERE.
5 THAT URGENCY, AND BART'S THERE, I HAVE AGM'S THAT PARTICIPATE
6 IN THAT CALL WITH PAM AND SYLVIA THERE. THERE URGENCY THERE. I
7 LOOK AT IT LIKE, THIS WE REALLY DIDN'T HAVE CLARITY, THIS IS
8 MY VERSION OF HISTORY AND EVERYBODY CAN HAVE THEIR OWN VERSION
9 OF HISTORY, ON SCHEDULE, RIGHT? WE DIDN'T. SO WHAT WE ASK,
10 WHAT ALIX COMMITTED TO DO WITH JASON, COMING BACK TO THE
11 MEETING IN SEPTEMBER WHICH IS RIGHT NOW SOME CLARITY ON
12 SCHEDULE. YOU KNOW, MAYBE NOT THE GREATEST TERM, GREG, BUT
13 YOU'RE RIGHT. IT IS A LINE IN THE SAND. I LOOK AT IT -- I LOOK
14 AT IT AS A SCHEDULE WITH SOME CONFIDENCE LEVEL. RIGHT? I DON'T
15 KNOW IF IT'S A P60 OR WHATEVER YOU WANT TO CALL IT, BUT NOW
16 WE'RE SURE, YEAH, APRIL. BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN IT CAN'T BE
17 BEFORE APRIL AND WE DRIVE -- AT LEAST NOW WE HAVE A DATE TO
18 DRIVE TO. AND WE CAN BEAT THAT DATE. WE DIDN'T UNTIL MOST
19 RECENTLY, AND YOU KNOW WE DERISKED THIS THING AS MUCH AS WE
20 CAN. A LOT OF THE ENGINEERING, A LOT OF THE SOFTWARE, A LOT OF
21 THOSE HICCUPS ARE BEHIND US RIGHT NOW AND TO PETER'S POINT,
22 THERE IS A LINE OF SITE. I GET THAT. THIS IS A SYSTEM'S
23 INTEGRATION PROJECT THAT'S WHAT THIS IS AND I HAVE BEEN AT THE
24 CENTER OF THOSE MANY TIMES WITH BART SO HAVING SOME CLARITY ON
25 WHAT SCHEDULE WE'RE DRIVING TO WAS THE FIRST STEP. THAT'S WHY



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 WE DIDN'T HAVE THIS AGENDA ITEM FOR THE LAST COUPLE OF
2 MEETINGS, BECAUSE WE WERE WORKING TOWARDS THAT. AND SO NOW WE
3 HAVE THAT. AND YOU KNOW, MATT HAS DONE A GREAT JOB. AND HE'S
4 KIND OF TRANSITIONED OFF. HE'S JOINING US TODAY. BUT CYNTHIA
5 NOW IS LEADING THIS EFFORT WITH PETER AND SHE'S TAKEN SOME
6 STEPS TO MAINTAIN THAT DATE AND THOSE DATES THERE. WE HAVE
7 ASKED, AT THIS MEETING -- AT THIS BOARD, AND I HAVE INSISTED
8 ON IT, AND IT WAS IN ONE OF MR. WEINSTEIN'S SLIDES THERE,
9 THAT, YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE THE MILESTONES. WHAT HAS TO BE DONE
10 IN OCTOBER, OCTOBER, NOVEMBER, AND DECEMBER TO MAKE THESE
11 MILESTONES. AND EDDIE TO YOUR POINT, HAVING THESE INTERIM
12 MILESTONES THAT WE CAN TRACK TO AND BE TRANSPARENT WITH THE
13 PUBLIC, THAT'S WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE HOLDING EVERYBODY
14 ACCOUNTABLE. THERE'S -- WE ALL HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY TO THE
15 BAY AREA AND TO OUR RIDERS TO GET CLIPPER2 OPERATIONAL, JUST
16 AS FAST AS WE CAN. THERE'S -- I MEAN, EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT.
17 AND, SO, YOU KNOW, PETER, YOU KNOW, I'M KIND OF ROUGH AROUND
18 THE EDGES, AND WE HAVE LOCKED HORNS A COUPLE OF TIMES, SO HAVE
19 YOU AND I, ALIX ON, THIS THE POINT TO WHAT ANDY SAID EARLIER
20 IN THE MEETING ABOUT DRIVING RIDERSHIP UP, IT'S ALL ABOUT
21 THAT. SO WE HAVE TO DRIVE UNTIL THERE ARE MILESTONES AND NOT
22 ONLY MAKE THE LINE IN THE SAND, GREG, BUT MOVE THAT LINE IN
23 THE SAND BACK. YOU KNOW? WHY CAN'T IT BE -- YOU KNOW, PETER, I
24 DON'T KNOW YOUR WORK LIKE YOU DO, BUT I KNOW A LITTLE BIT
25 ABOUT IT, AS IT BECOMES CLEARER AND CLEARER AND CLEARER, WHY



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 CAN'T THAT LINE IN THE SAND THAT GREG IS -- WHY CAN'T THAT BE
2 BROUGHT BACK TO MARCH OR END OF FEBRUARY TO START A
3 TRANSITION. THAT'S THE KIND OF HOPE WE'RE LOOKING FOR IN THE
4 FUTURE HERE. I APPRECIATE YOU BEING HERE PETER AND MATT, NICE
5 SEEING YOU AGAIN. WE HAVE TO START SOMEWHERE WE'RE MOVING
6 AROUND TOO MUCH AND NOW WE HAVE -- I DON'T KNOW, IT'S NOT A
7 NEW BEGINNING, BUT A NEW START DATE AND WE HAVE GOT TO DRIVE
8 TO THAT AND BRING IT BACK IF WE CAN. AND, SO, WITH THAT,
9 ANYBODY, FINAL COMMENTS HERE FROM THE BOARD MEMBERS ON THIS
10 ITEM? OKAY. PETER, AGAIN, THANKS FOR BEING HERE, MATT, THANKS
11 FOR BEING HERE. JASON, THANK YOU FOR PUTTING UP WITH ME ON
12 SOME OF MY EMOTIONAL TIRADES ON FRIDAY MORNING OR WHENEVER WE
13 CHAT. BUT, ALL RIGHT. SO, 3A IS DONE, MADAM CLERK. PUBLIC
14 COMMENT AND COMMISSION REPORT. SO, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO 3B,
15 WHICH IS ITEM 3B, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. THIS IS THE,
16 REALLY THE -- OH, I THOUGHT WE WERE DOING ACTION ITEMS. BUT
17 WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE CLIPPER ONE OPERATIONS AND
18 PERFORMANCE UPDATE, AND THEN WE'LL GO TO THE ACTION ITEMS. IS
19 THAT OUR THINKING, JASON?

20

21 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THAT'S CORRECT.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** YEAH. SORRY ABOUT THAT. OKAY. AND SO, WE
24 ARE JOINED HERE, JENNIFER, ARE YOU GOING TO LEAD US IN THIS
25 DISCUSSION? OR EDWARD?



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ACTUALLY, AKASH IS GOING TO GO THROUGH --

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OH I JUST STRUCK OUT.

5

6 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** GO AHEAD.

7

8 **AKASH GHOSAL:** WE'RE ALL HERE --

9

10 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THAT'S ALL RIGHT IT'S BEEN A LONG AN.

11

12 **AKASH GHOSAL:** GOOD AFTERNOON ARE CHAIR POWERS. I'M HAPPY TO
13 PRESENT THIS MONTH'S CLIPPER OPERATIONS PERFORMANCE ITEM THE
14 CONTENT IN THIS REPORT PROVIDES OVERALL KEY PERFORMANCE
15 OPERATIONS METRICS FOR CLIPPER SYSTEM INDICATORS LIKE
16 TRANSACTIONS REVENUE MOBILE CORPORATE CARD ADOPTION AND USAGE
17 AS WELL AS FOR YOU AND STAFF ON QUARTERLY FARE CHANGES LAST
18 MONTH CLIPPER PROCESSED 14 MILLION TRANSACTIONS AND SETTLED
19 OVER 34 MILLION IN REVENUE BOTH TRANSACTIONS AND REVENUE HAVE
20 INCREASED BY 6 TO 7% COMPARED TO THE SAME TIME LAST YEAR
21 AUGUST 2023 WHICH IS A POSITIVE SIGN THAT TRANSIT USE IS
22 CONTINUING TO INCREASE IN THE REGION. SINCE THE LAST CEB
23 MEETING WE HAVE ALSO SURPASSED THE 3 MILLION MOBILE CLIPPER
24 CARDS MARK WITH OVER 3.1 MILLION NOW CREATED AND AUGUST 2024
25 ALONE SAW 33% TAKEN WITH MOBILE CARD COMPARED TO 28% IN AUGUST



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 OF LAST YEAR WHICH CLIPPER START PROGRAM RECEIVED 71% MORE
2 APPLICATIONS TO AUGUST 2024 COME PAIRED TO AUGUST 2023 CLIPPER
3 START TRIPS INCREASED BY 100% OVER THE SAME TIME PERIOD FARE
4 CHANGES FOR JANUARY 1ST, 2025 ARE REQUESTED TO BE COMMUNICATED
5 BY YOUR AGENCY TO CUBIC BY THE NEXT TUESDAY OCTOBER 1ST, 2024
6 THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT HAPPY TO TAKE ANY COMMENTS OR
7 QUESTIONS.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. MADAM CLERK ANY
10 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** COMMISSIONERS LOOKING FOR RED LIGHTS NOT
15 SEEING ANY HERE. THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE. AS WE MOVE FORWARD,
16 IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP THAT SYSTEM UP AND RUNNING. SO, ALIX
17 AND JASON, SO, THAT CONCLUDES ITEM NUMBER 4A -- WAIT A SECOND.

18

19 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** 3B.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** SORRY. I'M GOING TO GET IT TOGETHER. WE
22 GOT 4A AND 4B. I'M GOING TO TAKE 4B FIRST BECAUSE I MIGHT LOSE
23 A COMMITTEE MEMBER UP HERE OR TWO. LET ME TAKE 4B FIRST. SO
24 WHO IS RUNNING POINT? JASON?

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I'M GOING TO GO THROUGH ITEM 4B.

2

3 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** LET'S GO TO 4B THEN DROP BACK UP TO 4A
4 THEN FOUR C.

5

6 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** OKAY. SO, JUST TO ORIENT US, ITEM FOUR ABOUT
7 IS ABOUT A C1 CONTRACT EXTENSION WITH CUBIC AND THE BOARD --
8 THIS BOARD AUTHORIZED A FIVE-YEAR CONTRACT O&M EXTENSION OF
9 THE C1 CONTRACT WHICH IS SET TO EXPIRE THIS NOVEMBER 2ND,
10 2024. AND AS DISCUSSED, OR WE WILL DISCUSS IN AGENDA ITEM 3A,
11 WE DID DISCUSS -- EXCUSE ME -- THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER
12 SYSTEM IS SET TO LAUNCH IN 2025. MTC ENGAGED CUBIC TO
13 NEGOTIATE CONTRACT EXTENSION TERMS THAT WILL ALLOW FOR THE
14 SMOOTH TRANSITION FROM C1 TO C2. AND TAKES INTO CONSIDERATION
15 THAT THE C1 BACK OFFICE NEEDS TO CONTINUE RUNNING EVEN AFTER
16 THE FULL CUSTOMER TRANSITION OF C2 TAKES PLACE. THIS WILL
17 ALLOW FOR PROPER DECOMMISSIONING OF THE EXISTING SYSTEM AFTER
18 TRANSFERRING OR ARCHIVING ANY REQUIRED DESIGNED C1 SYSTEM DATA
19 FOR THE WORK EXTENSION AMENDMENT PROVIDES FOR EXTENSION OF THE
20 CURRENT O&M TERM BEGINNING NOVEMBER 3RD, 2024 WITH AN END DATE
21 NO LATER THAN JUNE 30TH, 2026 BROKEN UP INTO THREE PHASES
22 FIRST START DATE NOVEMBER 3RD TO THE BEGINNING OF THE CUSTOMER
23 TRANSITION PERIOD SECOND PHASE IS FROM BEGINNING OF CUSTOMER
24 TRANSITION UNTIL THE LAST CARD HAS BEEN TRANSITIONED OVER AND
25 THIRD PHASE IS THE POST CUSTOMER TRANSITION PERIOD WHERE WE'RE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 MOVING DATA OVER. SINCE THE WRITING IS A MEMO ACTUALLY MORE
2 DETAILED DISCUSSIONS HAVE TAKEN PLACE AND WE REALLY COLEAD ON
3 WHERE WE'RE GOING TO BE SO I'LL PROVIDE UPDATES THERE. DURING
4 PHASE ONE, THE CURRENT C1, O&M PAYMENTS WOULD APPLY WITH THE
5 REMOVAL OF THE FEE FOR UNDER 20 MILLION TRANSACTIONS.
6 APPRECIATIVE OF CUBIC WORKING WITH US THERE. DURING PHASE TWO
7 WE COMPLETELY CHANGED THE WAY THE STRUCTURE IS GOING TO BE AND
8 THERE IS GOING TO BE -- O&M PAYMENT WOULD BE COMPRISED ON FLAT
9 FEE PLUS FIXED CARD COST FOR C1 CARDS TO EACH MONTH NOT TO
10 EXCEED \$275,000 WE WOULD PAY ANY INTERCHANGE FEES INCURRED BY
11 C1 TICKET OFFICE TERMINALS WE DON'T EXPECT THAT WOULD BE MUCH
12 GOING ON DURING PHASE THREE ONLY FLAT FEE WOULD APPLY PLUS
13 SOFTWARE LICENSING FEES ADDITIONALLY CURRENT CONTRACT HAS NO
14 PROVISION FOR LOST REVENUE SUPPORT HOWEVER CUBIC SHOW
15 COMMITMENT TO THE PROGRAM AGREEING TO C1EXT TO PROVIDE LOSS
16 REVENUE SUPPORT FAILURES WITHIN THEIR CONTROL REMAINDER OF THE
17 EXISTING CONTRACT TERMS WILL REMAIN ENFORCED THROUGHOUT THE
18 PROPOSED O&M EXTENSION STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
19 BOARD APPROVE THE CONTRACT CHANGE ORDER AMENDMENT WITH CUBIC
20 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS TO ALLOW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC TO
21 FINALIZE NEGOTIATION BENEFICIAL TO BOTH OPERATORS.

22

23 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THAT.
24 COMMISSIONERS WE'RE ON AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 4B MADAM CLERK DO WE
25 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ONE SPEAKER.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON FROM CONVERSATIONS FOR TRANSIT
5 ADVOCACY COMMUNITY ON THIS ISSUE IT SEEMS LIKE THIS ITEM IS
6 ABOUT PROVIDING ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO THE CONTRACTOR BECAUSE
7 THE NEW PROJECT IS RUNNING LATE AND THE QUESTIONS FOR THE
8 ADVOCACY COMMUNITY IS WHY ARE WE PAYING MORE MONEY AS OPPOSED
9 TO HAVING A CONTRACT STRUCTURE THAT WILL HAVE SOME KIND OF
10 DAMAGES AND HAVE A PENALTY RATHER THAN A REWARD FOR RUNNING
11 LATE ON THE NEW PROJECT. AND ALSO, I'M SEEING IN SOME OF THE
12 AGENCIES THAT HAVE INDEPENDENT MOBILE APPLICATIONS, THAT COSTS
13 MONEY THAT THEY'RE NEEDING TO MAINTAIN FOR MORE TIME, AND,
14 WHICH WOULDN'T BE NEEDED IF THE NEW SYSTEM WERE ALREADY
15 RUNNING. SO, THE QUESTION IS, LIKE, WHAT IS THE FAIR
16 ALLOCATION OF COST, GIVEN THE FACT THAT THESE COSTS ARE
17 RELATED TO THE FACT THAT THE PROJECT IS RUNNING LATE. AND
18 THOSE ARE QUESTIONS THAT I HAVE. THERE WAS SOME DECISIONS THAT
19 WERE DISCUSSED IN THE STAFF REPORT THAT I DIDN'T FULLY
20 UNDERSTAND, SO HOPEFULLY THAT WILL BE MADE CLEAR. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. OKAY COMMISSIONERS. CAN I --
23 THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND ON
24 THIS? AND THEN WE'LL HAVE A DISCUSSION.

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MOVE.

2

3 **ANDREW FREMIER:** SECOND.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. RICHARD SON MOTION, FREMIER A
6 SECOND. MICHAEL?

7

8 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I FEEL LIKE BEE HAVE ASKED I DON'T THINK WE
9 HAVE HEARD A RESPONSE ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO MAKE C1
10 CHANGES? AGAIN?

11

12 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** I THINK IF WE MAKE C1 CHANGES, BOARD MEMBER
13 HURSH, IT COULD POTENTIALLY IMPACT THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING
14 ON C2. I MEAN, THE SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE IN C1 IS ALREADY
15 COMPLICATED WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WAYS
16 TO NOT INCREASE IT.

17

18 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I I'M GOING TO BE BLUNT, CAN WE FIGURE OUT WAYS
19 TO NOT INCREASE IT I DON'T THINK IT CAN'T BE DONE WE JUST
20 HEARD THAT WE GOT TO GET OUR FARE INCREASES IN THE NEXT FEW
21 WEEKS WILL APPROVING THIS ITEM ALLOW US TO HAVE ADMINISTRATIVE
22 CHANGES IN C1?

23

24 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ADMINISTRATIVE CHANGES IN TERMS OF TRANSFERS?
25 I DON'T KNOW, ED, I'M GOING TO DEFER TO YOU.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **EDWARD MENG:** I THINK IT DEPENDS ON THE TYPE OF TRANSFER BEING
3 REQUESTED IT'S AN ENTIRELY NEW TRANSFER IT'S A BIT MORE
4 DIFFICULT TO IMPLEMENT AND ROLL OUT THAN ACTIVATING THE
5 EXISTING TRANSFER THAT'S ALREADY.

6

7 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THERE'S MORE DETAILED WAY OF SAYING NOT DOING
8 NEW STUFF I MEAN THAT'S THE QUESTION.

9

10 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I'LL CHECK WITH MY TEAM AND ASK THEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MIKE, WHETHER YOU HOPEFULLY YOU SUPPORT
13 THIS MOTION BUT IF YOU'RE GOING TO VOTE BUT PUSH YOU KNOW
14 THERE'S NO REASON WHY WE SHOULDN'T BE. MULLIGAN?

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I'LL FOLLOW UP ON THE QUESTION MTC HAS
17 SEPARATE CONTRACTS WITH CUBIC FOR 1.0 AND 2.0 THIS ITEM IS FOR
18 1.0 IT SOUNDS LIKE CUBIC'S OFFERED SOME THINGS TO MINIMIZE THE
19 STING A BIT ASSOCIATED WITH CLIPPER2.0 CONTRACT. WE'RE
20 MAINTAINING THREE PAYMENT SYSTEMS AT EACH AGENCY, WHATEVER
21 FAREBOX SYSTEM WE USE, CLIPPER CLIPPER 1.0, CLIPPER 2.0. AND
22 THE MORE SYSTEMS YOU HAVE THE MORE MONEY YOU SPEND COLLECTING
23 MONEY. SEPARATELY A FUNCTIONALITY WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING FORWARD
24 TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR PEOPLE TO USE THE PRODUCT WE'RE SELLING
25 TRANSFER BETWEEN SYSTEMS DELAYED THERE IS CLEARLY IMPACTS



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 ASSOCIATED WITH THAT QUESTION IS DOES CLIPPER2.0 CONTRACT
2 INCLUDE LIQUIDATED DAMAGES OR DELAY OR DAMAGE PIPE PROVISIONS.

3

4 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WINE SHORT ANSWER IS YES IT DOES THE QUESTION
5 WOULD BE WHO IS FULLY RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL THOSE THINGS. WE'RE
6 GOING TO GIVE YOU, BASED ON YOUR QUESTION EARLIER BOARD MEMBER
7 MULLIGAN, DETAILS HOW WE GOT THE SCHEDULE IN THE VARIOUS
8 STAGES AS YOU REMEMBER ONE OF THE THINGS FOR EXAMPLE, WAS
9 THERE WAS OPTION FOR OPEN PAYMENT AND WE A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO
10 SAID HEY WE WANT THIS ON DAY ONE THAT'S NOT THE ONLY THING
11 THERE ARE PROBABLY OTHER THINGS TOO WE'LL DEFINITELY BE BACK
12 IN TOUCH WITH THE BOARD.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GREG?

15

16 **GREG RICHARDSON:** ACTUALLY CLARIFICATION QUESTION ON THE BUDGET
17 ITSELF. THE ADDITIONAL COST HERE, IF I RECALL THE BUDGET THAT
18 WE LOOKED AT SEVERAL MONTHS AGO, IT HAD SPLIT COSTS, I
19 THOUGHT, BETWEEN C1, C2, COST BASED ON IMPLEMENTATION, SO I'M
20 ASSUMING THAT WHAT'S HAPPENING IS WE'RE JUST SHIFTING SOME OF
21 THOSE COST. AN ADDITIONAL 20 MILLION C1 AND SOMETHING ON C2
22 GOING TO BE REDUCED THAT'S OVERALL BUDGET NOT NECESSARILY
23 BEING IMPACTED RIGHT?

24



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** COST OF C2 -- IF IT'S THE SAME AS RUNNING ONE
2 SYSTEM CERTAINLY NOT DOUBLE PER SE.

3

4 **GREG RICHARDSON:** COST OF C2 IS NOT GOING TO CHANGE JUST TIMING
5 WHEN IT STARTS. C1 WILL CONTINUE FARTHER ALONG THAN WE
6 PLANNED; C2 HAPPENS LATER.

7

8 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** C1 COST DURING PHASE ONE WILL REDUCED BASE ON
9 AMOUNT WE JUST SAID AND MUCH FURTHER DURING TRANSITION AND
10 THEN REALLY LOW DURING POST-TRANSITION WHICH WE WOULD HAVE
11 EXPECTED ANYWAY. AND C2 COST WOULD RAMP US FASTER THAN WE --
12 YOU KNOW, WOULD HAVE -- YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT HAPPENING NOW IT
13 WOULD BE LATER.

14

15 **GREG RICHARDSON:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** APRIL?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** IT SOUNDS LIKE WE'RE REALLY SHIFTING ON.
20 AND M COST SO WHAT WE WOULD HAVE SEEN IF C2 WAS HAPPENING NOW
21 WE WOULD HAVE SEEN THOSE COST REALLY IN THE C2. THE ADDING THE
22 ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO C1 IS BECAUSE WE'RE NOW SHIFTING FROM
23 C2, TO C1. I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY AND UNDERSTAND THAT. NUMBER
24 TWO IS, IS THERE GOING TO BE A COST INCREASE TO THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE C2 NOW THAT THE SCHEDULE HAS BEEN
2 EXTENDED? IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S STILL POSSIBLY COMING BACK?
3

4 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** WELL, WE WOULD HAVE TO -- THERE IS A CONTRACT
5 TERM FOR C2 WE HAVE TO SEE WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE WE HAVEN'T
6 CHANGED ANY OF THE TERMS FOR C2 AT THIS POINT. TO ANSWER YOUR
7 FIRST QUESTION AS IT RELATES TO THE C1 COST AND C2 COST, YES
8 WE'RE ESSENTIALLY SHIFTING WHAT IT WOULD BE, AS WAS JUST
9 MENTIONED, RIGHT? WE'RE GOING TO HAVE, POTENTIALLY, FIVE MORE
10 MONTHS OF WHERE WE ARE IN TERMS OF O&M IN C1 BUT WE'RE NOT
11 HAVING ANY COMPLEMENTARY INCREASES IN C2. WHAT WE'RE PAYING
12 FOR THE BASE LEVEL OF C2 COSTS THEY'RE PAYING NOW ARE GOING TO
13 REMAIN WHERE THEY'RE. AS C1 COMES DOWN, C2 WILL GO UP.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** OKAY. GOING BACK TO THE OTHER QUESTION
16 ON -- YOU SAY MAY DEPEND ON WHAT THE TERMS ARE -- I MEAN,
17 ULTIMATELY, BECAUSE NOW THE ROLL-OUT OF THE C2 IS EXTENDED BY
18 AT LEAST ANOTHER 12 MONTHS OR CLOSE TO 12 MONTHS. POSSIBLY
19 THERE IS ADDITIONAL STAFF RESOURCES THAT MAY BE REQUIRED. I'M
20 JUST WONDERING IF THAT'S GOING TO BE BRINGING SOMETHING BACK
21 RECOGNIZING THIS RELATES TO O&M JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND
22 INTERPLAY BETWEEN THE TWO.

23

24 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** GO AHEAD ED.

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **EDWARD MENG:** THE CURRENT TERMS OF THE CONTRACT FOR C2 FOR O&M
2 IS 120 MONTHS IT STARTS FROM DAY ONE OF THE TRANSITION SO
3 PUSHING OUT OF THE TRANSITION WE'RE ADDING MORE TIME BUT IT'S
4 TEN YEARS THAT'S BASICALLY THE ANSWER.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE GOT ALL THE
7 QUESTIONS HERE AND THANK YOU FOR THE RESPONSES. I THINK WE
8 HAVE A MOTION BY RICHARDSON AND SECOND BY FREMIER, IF I
9 RECALL. URBAN SO, ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] OPPOSED? OKAY
10 MADAM CLERK, NOTE THAT IT PASSED. ITEM NUMBER 4B PASSED
11 UNANIMOUSLY. SO WE HAVE TWO OTHER ACTION ITEMS HERE AND MIKE
12 YOU GOTTA GO HERE AND JASON, I KNOW I'M THROWING YOU A BUNCH
13 OF CURVE BUT ALSO, WITH MIKE BEING HERE THIS ONE IS MORE
14 IMPORTANT. THE MOU, 4C

15

16 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** UNDERSTOOD.

17

18 **EDWARD MENG:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. IN 2020 AMENDMENT
19 RESTATED CLIPPER MOU INTO OCTOBER 2022 AMONGST MTC AND ALL
20 CLIPPER TRANSIT OPERATORS CURRENT MOU PREVIOUSLY AGREED UPON
21 TERMS SHARING TERMS THAT LASTED THROUGH THE C1 CONTRACT THOSE
22 COST SHARING AGREEMENTS APPLIED FOR BOTH LINE ITEM PRICING
23 BASIS AND ON TIME MATERIALS PAYMENT BASIS CONTEMPLATED BY
24 FIVE-YEAR O&M EXTENSION THAT EXPIRES NOVEMBER 2ND. BASED ON
25 THE DISCUSSION FOR AGENDA ITEM 4B WE DO NEED TO EXTEND THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 TERM FOR THE C1 O&M TERMS AND WE ALSO NEED TO AMEND THE MOU
2 AND SPECIFIC LEAVE COST SHARING APPENDICES THAT DOCUMENT OUR
3 REGIONAL COST SHARING TERMS TO REFLECT THE CURRENT CONTRACT
4 STATUS AND CURRENT OPERATING PRACTICES. SO THE PROPOSED
5 AMENDMENT ONE TO THE 2022 CLIPPER MOU WOULD BE EFFECTIVE
6 NOVEMBER 2ND, 2024 AND WOULD AMEND THE COST SHARING AGREEMENTS
7 TO REFLECT PERMISSION OF THE EXTENSION OF THIS C1 CONTRACT END
8 DATE TO A NEW END DATE AUTHORIZED BY THIS BOARD IT WOULD ALSO
9 UPDATE THE COST SHARING LANGUAGE TO ALLOW FOR THE COST THE NEW
10 OF COST SHARING AGREEMENT BEYOND JUST THE LINE ITEM PRICING
11 AND TIMING MATERIALS BASIS. AND IT WOULD UPDATE REVENUE
12 ALLOCATION LANGUAGE SO THAT THIS BOARD MAY AUTHORIZE CHANGES
13 IN PROGRAM REVENUE ALLOCATION, SHOULD IT SO CHOOSE. AS A
14 REMINDER, THIS EXECUTIVE BOARD HAS ALREADY AUTHORIZED THE
15 ALLOCATION OF PROGRAM REVENUES PREVIOUSLY TO REIMBURSE TRANSIT
16 AGENCIES FOR CLAIMS OF LOST FARE REVENUE THIS WAS DECIDED AND
17 APPROVED BY THIS BOARD AT THIS YEAR'S JUNE 2024 MEETING. SO WE
18 DO RECOMMEND THAT THIS CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVE THE
19 DRAFT AMENDMENT ONE AS INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENT A TO THIS PACKET
20 -- TO THIS AGENDA ITEM, EXCUSE ME, AND APPROVE CIRCULATION OF
21 THIS AMENDMENT TO MTC AND CLIPPER TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR
22 SIGNATURE AND APPROVAL. THANK YOU.
23



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. LET'S CHECK IN WITH THE PUBLIC
2 EITHER VIRTUALLY OR IN THE ROOM ON THIS AGENDA ITEM. MADAM
3 CLERK WE'RE ON AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 4C.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NO ONE WITH HAND RAISED. THERE
6 ARE NO SPEAKER CARDS AND NOTHING IN WRITING.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. VERY GOOD. THANK YOU.
9 COMMISSIONERS, ACTION ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION AND SECOND?

10

11 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I'LL MOVE APPROVAL, HURSH.

12

13 **EDDY CUMINS:** SECOND.

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** HURSH AND CUMINS, MOTION AND SECOND.
16 COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTARY, QUESTIONS, CONCERNS? MADAM CLERK
17 GOING TO VOTE HERE. ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] OPPOSED?
18 MADAM CLERK IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. WE HAVE ONE FINAL ACTION
19 ITEM THEN WE'LL DROP BACK TO 4A. AND I THINK THAT GETS THROUGH
20 THE ACTION ITEMS HERE, AND WE'LL GO TO THE EXECUTIVE
21 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THIS IS 4A AND THIS IS TO PROCURE SOME
22 ADDITIONAL CLIPPER CARDS. WE HAD -- YOU WANT TO PRESENT THIS
23 ITEM? OR YOU WANT TO DO IT? THE FLOOR IS YOURS. [LAUGHTER]

24



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **JENNIFER LARGAESPADA:** IT'S A STANDARD ONE. THANK YOU, CHAIR
2 POWERS. ANYONE COULD PROBABLY DO THIS ACTUALLY. GOOD AFTERNOON
3 EVERYONE. JENNIFER LARGAESPADA FROM THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. THE
4 ITEM IS TO REQUEST THE APPROVAL OF CHANGE ORDER AMENDMENT WITH
5 CUBIC NOT TO EXCEED \$1 MILLION TO PRODUCE ADDITIONAL CLIPPER
6 CARDS FOR DISTRIBUTION TO CUSTOMER. THE CHANGEORDER AMENDMENT
7 SHOULD PURCHASE APPROXIMATELY 400,000 CARDS AND EXISTING
8 INVENTORY SHOULD LAST THROUGH APRIL OF 2025 AND THE ADDITIONAL
9 CARDS ENSURE WE HAVE ADEQUATE INVENTORY. GOOD NEWS IS IF THERE
10 ARE CARDS REMAINING, THEY COULD BE USED IN THE NEXT GENERATION
11 SYSTEM SO NO CARDS AFTER SWITCH OVER WILL GO TO WASTE. STAFF
12 IS RECOMMENDING THAT THE BOARD APPROVE CHANGE AGREEMENT WITH
13 CUBIC IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$1 MILLION TO PRODUCE CLIPPER
14 CARDS.

15

16 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** EXCELLENT JENNIFER. MUCH BETTER THAN I
17 WOULD HAVE DONE IT. MADAM CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ACTION?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MOTION AND SECOND THERE. NOT SEEING
3 ANYBODY PUSHING TO HAVE DISCUSSION ON THIS PRETTY STRAIGHT
4 FORWARD ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] OPPOSED? MADAM CLERK, IT
5 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. JASON, WE ARE THROUGH THE BUSINESS ITEMS
6 OF FOUR AND A, B, AND C, AND IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE MOVING ON TO
7 THE ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

8

9 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** IN THE INTEREST OF TIME, I WILL PASS.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** BLESS YOU. BLESS YOU, BLESS YOU.
12 APPRECIATE THAT ON SO MANY LEVELS [LAUGHTER] OKAY. MADAM
13 CLERK, LET US GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OTHER ITEMS THAT
14 WERE NOT ON THE AGENDA FOR TODAY. OKAY. LET'S GO WITH TWO
15 MINUTES AGAIN, MA'AM?

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A VERY QUICK QUESTION THROUGH THE CHAIR
18 AND STAFF RELATING TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER
19 ADVISORY GROUP AND THE EVENT THAT'S GOING TO BE UP AT THE TOP
20 OF THE SALESFORCE AT THE PARK TOMORROW WHERE THE PUBLIC IS
21 INVITED FOR TRANSIT MONTH TO COME AND LEARN ABOUT THINGS
22 RELATING TO NETWORK MANAGEMENT INCLUDING THE FARE INTEGRATION
23 FEATURES THAT ARE CONTINGENT ON CLIPPER2 AND SO MY QUICK
24 QUESTION IS IN TERMS OF THE DATES BEING CITED AS APRIL AND
25 JULY, WHICH OF THOSE WOULD BE WHEN AN END USER WOULD GET THE



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 BENEFIT OF FREE TRANSFERS OR HAVE TO PAY? AND WILL IT BE ONE
2 DATE FOR SOME USERS AND ANOTHER DATE FOR OTHER USERS OR ONE
3 DATE FOR EVERYBODY AND I WOULD WELCOME AN ANSWER EITHER ON OR
4 OFF THE AIR BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE ASKING ME AT THIS
5 EVAN. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE COULD -- JASON DO YOU WANT TO TAKE
8 IT?

9

10 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** SURE. AS IT RELATES TO OPEN PAYMENTS ON DAY
11 ONE WITH WE START, WHENEVER THAT S IF IT'S APRIL, THAT'S GREAT
12 OF THE EVERYBODY WHO HAS AN OPEN PAYMENT CARD WHETHER CREDIT
13 CARD OR DEBIT CARD CAN USE THAT ON ANY OPERATOR. AS IT RELATES
14 TO REDUCED TRANSFERS, IT'S MORE COMPLICATED. DEPENDS WHETHER
15 YOUR CARD HAS BEEN FLIPPED TO THE NEW SYSTEM. WE HAVE WORK TO
16 DO IN TERMS OF DECIDING WHAT GROUPS, WHAT PLACES, ALL OF THOSE
17 THINGS, WHO GETS TO GO FIRST BECAUSE EVERYBODY WANTS TO GO
18 FIRST AND WE REALIZE IT'S ALL IMPORTANT. SO THAT'S SOMETHING
19 THAT WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT WITH YOUR STAFF AND, CERTAINLY,
20 CAN, AT LEAST, ADVISE THE BOARD ON WHERE WE'RE AT.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. FROM THE PREVIOUS ITEM ABOUT
23 COMMUNICATIONS, THAT WILL BE A COMMUNICATIONS ISSUE THAT WILL
24 NEED TO BE ADDRESSED. THANK YOU.

25



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:**

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THANKS AGAIN CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA
4 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH PEOPLE TO FOLDS. GOOD
5 MEETING TODAY. GOT A LOT OF WORK DONE. I LIKE GETTING WORK
6 DONE WHICH WE GENERALLY DO. HOW DO WE MOVE FORWARD? THE
7 BIGGEST THING I HAVE BEEN THINKING LATELY IS THE CHALLENGES
8 WITH GROUP USAGE OF CLIPPER ONE AND GOING INTO CLIPPER2. AND A
9 LOT OF THAT HAS TO COME WITH SYSTEMS WHERE YOU TAP ON AND OFF,
10 SUCH AS OUR BART AND CALTRAIN. SOME OF IT HAS TO DEAL WITH
11 LIMITATIONS ON CARD TAPPING. I THINK IN NEW YORK, YOU CAN TAP
12 IN UP TO FOUR TIMES ON ONE CARD PER TRIP. THERE IS A LIMIT
13 THERE TO PROTECT AGAINST FRAUD. AND HOW DO WE DEAL WITH THESE
14 BIGGER GROUPS? WHETHER IT BE SCHOOL GROUPS, MUSEUM GROUPS,
15 SUMMER CAMP GROUPS, LARGE FAMILIES, PLENTY OF FAMILIES AND
16 FRIENDS, GROUPS OF FRIENDS THAT HAVE MORE THAN FOUR PEOPLE.
17 HOW DID WE GET THERE? I DON'T KNOW HOW TO EXPERIENCE THAT.
18 BECAUSE I'M ALWAYS GOING SOMEWHERE BY MYSELF. AND I CAN SEE
19 WHY PEOPLE ARE PUTTING QUARTERS IN THE FAREBOX. BUT THAT JUST
20 COSTS EVERYBODY A LOT MORE MONEY. IT COSTS A LOT OF MONEY TO
21 PROCESS. BUT I HAVE SOME QUARTERS IN MY LIFE BAG HERE. THEY'RE
22 INTENDED FOR PINBALL. I HAVE USED SOME OF THEM. THERE IS A
23 PLACE, IT'S A MUSEUM -- SOMETHING -- CAN'T PRONOUNCE IT. BUT
24 PEOPLE WANT TO TRY THESE NEW THINGS, BUT HOW DID WE MAKE THEM
25 WORK FOR MORE PEOPLE? THANK YOU.



SEPTEMBER 23, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
3 ONLINE AND NO OTHER SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. WE'LL CLOSE AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
6 SIX. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SEVEN IS ADJOURNMENT AND THE NEXT
7 MEETING. WE ARE AT BART HEADQUARTERS ON THE 28th OF OCTOBER OF
8 THE LOOK LIKE WE'RE GOING TO GO AT 1:30 P.M. WITH THAT WE'RE
9 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

10



NTT

Broadcasting Government