

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

2 **WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 9TH, 2024, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. WELCOME
6 TO OUR BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MEETING. I'M MARGARET ABE-
7 KOGA, VICE CHAIR, FILLING IN FOR OUR CHAIR FEDERAL GLOVER
8 TODAY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. THIS MEETING
9 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND
10 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK
11 SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I
12 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. I'LL START WITH
13 AGENDA ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL, AND WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE
14 ROLL.

15

16 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THANK YOU. CHAIR GLOVER IS ABSENT. VICE
17 CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

24



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING EL-
2 TAWANSY?

3

4 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING ABSENT AT THE
7 MOMENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

8

9 **NATE MILEY:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?

16

17 **HILARY RONEN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

20

21 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. WE DO HAVE A
24 QUORUM.

25



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. IF YOU COULD PLEASE
2 JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE? PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I
3 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
4 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
5 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

6

7 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. ITEM THREE
8 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE.

9

10 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
11 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
12 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
13 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS
14 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
15 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. ITEM FOUR, THE CONSENT
18 CALENDAR, ITEMS 4A THROUGH 4E. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT
19 WOULD LIKE TO PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? IF NOT,
20 DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

21

22 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE, NO ONE
23 IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MAY I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN, MOVE APPROVAL.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND?

5

6 **HILLARY RONEN:** SECOND.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION BY PAPAN, SECOND BY RONEN.

9 ROLL CALL?

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** GLOVER IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ?

16

17 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. MILEY?

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?

3

4 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** AND THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
7 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL GO TO
10 AGENDA ITEM 5A, WHICH IS THE CONSULTANT BENCH FOR 2024, BATA
11 CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT DESIGN SERVICES AND ASSET MANAGEMENT
12 PROGRAM SUPPORT SERVICES. AND I WILL BE RECUSING MYSELF FROM
13 THIS PRESENTATION, DISCUSSION, AND VOTING FOR THIS ITEM, DUE
14 TO A CONFLICT OF INTEREST. AND I WOULD LIKE TO ASK COMMISSION
15 ARE PAPAN TO TAKE OVER CHAIR OF THE ITEM.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I'LL HAVE TO WAIT UNTIL SHE STEPS OUT
18 HERE FOR A SECOND. OKAY. CONTINUING ON WITH ITEM 5A. ERIK, WE
19 HAVE A PRESENTATION? THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHANG ERIK:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS ERIK CHANG
22 MTC BATA STAFF LEAD PROCUREMENT AND EVALUATION OF THE 2024
23 CONSULTANT BENCH ITEM 5A BEFORE YOU IS REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF
24 THE BENCH TO ESTABLISH LIST OF ARE CONSULTANTS AS NEEDED
25 PROFESSIONAL SERVICES WOULD INCLUDE CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 DESIGN SERVICES AND ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM SERVICES WITH THE
2 PREVIOUS BENCH EXPIRING JUNE 30TH OF 2024. NEW BENCH WOULD BE
3 EFFECTIVE FROM DATE THE APPROVAL UNTIL JUNE 30TH, 2027 WITH
4 OPTIONAL EXTENSION OF TWO YEARS TO JUNE 30TH, 2029 TO. PROVIDE
5 BACKGROUND ON THE BENCH WE SUCCESSFULLY USED THE BENCH IN THE
6 PAST TO SECURE CONSULTANT SERVICES IN A TIMELY MANNER TO MEET
7 PROJECT DELIVERY NEEDS EXAMPLES OF THE BENCH INCLUDE
8 PROCUREMENT, CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT SERVICES FOR THE RICHMOND
9 SAN RAFAEL B TWO PROJECT DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE DUMBARTON
10 PART-TIME BUS ONLY LANE PROGRAM ASSET MANAGEMENT NORTHERN
11 SOUTHERN TOLL BRIDGES AFTER ISSUING REQUESTOR QUALIFICATIONS
12 IN JULY OF THIS YEAR WE RECEIVED 21 PROPOSALS WITH ONE BEING
13 FOUND NON-RESPONSIVE SET UP A PANEL OF EVALUATES TO REVIEW AND
14 SCORE PROPOSALS BASED ON CRITERIA AND LISTED COMMITTEE MEMO
15 CRITERIA AND EVALUATION PANEL FOUND ALL PROPOSERS MET
16 EXPECTATIONS AND ARE QUALIFIED FOR REPLACEMENT ON THE BENCH IN
17 CONCLUSION RECOMMENDS THE COMMITTEE TO APPROVE THE BENCH
18 IDENTIFIED IN ATTACHMENT 5A TO PROVIDE CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT
19 DESIGN SERVICES PROGRAM SUPPORT SERVICES ON AS NEEDED BASIS.
20 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** FOR CLARIFICATION THIS RUNS FROM JUNE 30TH, 2027
23 THROUGH JUNE 30TH, 2029.

24



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **ERIK CHANG:** FROM THE DATE OF APPROVAL UNTIL JUNE 30TH, 2027,
2 AND WE HAVE OPTIONAL EXTENSION.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER FLEMING HAS ARRIVED. THIS
5 ITEM 5A CONSULTANT BENCH, ANY COMMISSIONERS WITH QUESTIONS?
6 HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY CORRESPONDENCE REGARDING THIS ITEM?

7

8 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED NO
9 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO ONE ONLINE WHO WOULD LIKE TO
10 PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. QUICK QUESTION, DID THIS BENCH CHANGE MUCH
13 FROM THE LAST -- FROM ALL THESE, THE SAME YOU MENTIONED ONE
14 WAS NOT.

15

16 **CHANG ERIK:** WE HAVE SOME OF THE SAME CONSULTANTS FROM THE
17 PREVIOUS BENCH. A FEW ARE NEW DON'T KNOW OFF THE TOP OF MY
18 HEAD BUT CAN GET THAT TO YOU.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** JUST CURIOUS.

21

22 **CHANG ERIK:** OKAY.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** NO QUESTIONS CORRESPONDENCE CAN WE HAVE A MOTION
25 ON ITEM 5A?



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.
7 ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAIR GLOVER IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR ABE-
10 KOGA IS RECUSED. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

15

16 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

19

20 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

25



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

2

3 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION

6 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, EVERYONE. WE WILL BRING BACK OUR CHAIR.

9 THE. THERE SHE IS.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

12 THANK YOU. WE WILL NOW GO TO AGENDA ITEM 6A FOR INFORMATION,

13 REGARDING THE TOLL INCREASE ARE FOR BRIDGES STAFF ARE WILL

14 SEEK FEEDBACK ON A PROPOSAL FOR A TOLL INCREASE TO SUPPORT

15 MAINTAINING BATA BRIDGES IN A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR FOR

16 COMMITTEE DISCUSSION. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

17 IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ANY REMARKS THEN TURN IT OVER TO

18 DEREK HANSEL.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

21 IT'S AN HONOR TO WORK ON THESE BRIDGES I HAVE HAD THE HONOR

22 FOR MOST OF MY ENTIRE CAREER IN THE BAY AREA IT'S FASCINATING.

23 THE BEST PART OF MY COMMUTE FRANKLY IS WALKING DOWN THE

24 WATERFRONT LOOKING AT THE BAY BRIDGE WITH FOG OVER IT IT'S

25 EVEN BETTER. SEEING THE SUN IS HAS COME UP REALLY NICE. I WANT



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE PARTNERSHIP THAT WE HAVE WITH COMMISSIONER
2 EL-TAWANSY TEAM CALTRANS AND BATA HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THE
3 BRIDGES TOGETHER SINCE 1996 AND TAKE THAT ROLE SERIOUSLY WE
4 HAVE STRONG RELATIONSHIPS WHEN IT COMES TO MAINTENANCE AND
5 OPERATIONS AND CARE AND OF THE BRIDGES AND I WANT TO INDICATE
6 THAT WHEN YOU LOOK AT SOME OF THE REPORT CARDS OUR
7 INFRASTRUCTURE CROSSINGS 11 BRIDGES ARE NOT PART OF THE
8 NEGATIVE REPORT CARD THEY'RE IN GOOD SHAPE AND WE WANT TO KEEP
9 IT THAT WAY. BUT THE CHALLENGE IN THIS DIFFICULT TIME THAT
10 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY IS TO MAINTAIN THE STEWARDSHIP WE DO
11 NEED TO DEAL WITH ADDITIONAL REVENUE IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE
12 THAT THE BRIDGES STAY IN THE CONDITION THEY'RE IN WE HAVE BEEN
13 ACTIVE IN WORKING WITH CALTRANS TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE MORNING
14 ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM THAT IS WHAT'S DEFINED IN THE NEED WE
15 ARE PRESENTING IN THE COORDINATION TODAY JUST AS A REMINDER WE
16 HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY WITH ALL OF YOU SINCE THE SUMMER TO
17 THAT THE INFORMATION IS SOLID AND UNDERSTANDABLE I WANTED TO
18 MENTION THAT THE BATA PLAN OF FINANCE HAS HAD A DOLLAR TOLL
19 INCREASE SINCE THE LAST TEN OR 15 YEARS AND IT WAS FORECASTED
20 TO BE IN 2027. THIS PROPOSAL MOVES FORWARD ONLY ABOUT SIX
21 MONTHS BUT ASKS FOR SOME ADDITIONAL INCREMENTS MOVING INTO THE
22 FUTURE I KNOW THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO MANAGE THE ROLE OF THE
23 COMMISSION IN VARIOUS HATS THAT IT WEARS AS MTC OF THE PILLARS
24 OF OUR PLAN BAY AREA 2050 IS THE TRANSIT, THE IMPORTANCE IN
25 TRANSIT IN MEETING OUR GOALS AND OBJECT IS HOWEVER OUR JOB



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 FACILITATING AND CONVENING AND TRY TO GET CONSENSUS ON THE
2 REGION ON HOW TO MOVE FORWARD. BUT WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING WE
3 HAVE A LOT OF AUTHORITY IT'S YOUR STATUTORY RESPONSIBILITY TO
4 RAISE TOLLS TO COVER FOR MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS NEEDS TO
5 KEEP THEM IN GOOD WORKING ORDER. THIS REQUEST SOLELY RELATED
6 TO THE REHABILITATION NEEDS OF THE BRIDGE GOING FORWARD IT'S
7 WITH THAT I WANT TO KICKOFF THIS ITEM AND I LOOK FORWARD TO A
8 LOT MORE INPUT THIS IS INFORMATIONAL AND WE GO THROUGH A WHOLE
9 PROCESS INCLUDING PUBLIC COMMENT WE TRY TO ADDRESS A LOT OF
10 THE CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN BROUGHT UP FROM YOU ALL OVER THE
11 SUMMER AND INTO THE FALL AND I DEREK AND HIS TEAM HAVE DONE A
12 NICE JOB IN PRESENTING THAT. MR. HANSEL?

13

14 **DEREK HANSEL:** THANK YOU ANDY. THIS DISCUSSION WE HAVE BEEN
15 HAVING WITH THE BOARD AND COMMITTEE ABOUT THE NEED FOR
16 ADDITIONAL REVENUE SINCE APRIL WHEN WE HAD THE WORKSHOP DOWN
17 IN SAN JOSE AND FOR THIS ADDITIONAL REVENUE AGAIN SUPPORT
18 PRESERVATION AND MAINTENANCE OF THE STATE OWNED BRIDGES WE
19 HAVE BEEN WORKING OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS TO ADDRESS
20 FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMITTEES ON THE NEEDS ASSOCIATED WITH THE
21 BRIDGES WHAT THAT DELIVERS FOR THE BRIDGE USERS DATA ON THE
22 BRIDGE USAGE AND YOU WILL HEAR A BIT MORE TODAY AND THE
23 IMPORTANCE OF TOLL DIFFERENTIAL BETWEEN FASTRAK AND INVOICE
24 CUSTOMERS AND FINALLY THE COLLECTIVE AGENCIES SUPPORTIVE
25 EQUITY WITHIN THE BATA SPACE ITSELF BUT ALSO THE OTHER



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 AGENCIES. SORRY YOU CAN BRING UP THE DECK, PLEASE? TOTALLY
2 FORGOT ABOUT IT. THERE WE GO. YOU NEEDED THAT. COME ON. NEXT
3 SLIDE PLEASE. THERE WE GO. SO, AGAIN, WE HAVE DONE THESE
4 THINGS. AND, REALLY, TODAY'S GOAL, THEN, IS TO ADDRESS ANYMORE
5 FEEDBACK, OBTAIN MORE INPUT ON WHAT'S REALLY GOING TO BE A
6 PRETTY SPECIFIC PROPOSAL FOR A SET OF TOLL INCREASES THAT
7 WOULD BEGIN IN JANUARY OF 2026, AS ANDY MENTIONED, THE PLAN OF
8 FINANCE HAS LONG CONTEMPLATED A TOLL INCREASE FOR FISCAL '27,
9 SO SOMETHING THAT WOULD HAVE BEGUN JULY OF 26. SO, WE'RE
10 ADVANCING SIX MONTHS BUT WE'RE ACTUALLY, YOU WILL SEE THAT
11 IT'S A LITTLE SLOWER IN THE IMPLEMENTATION THAN HAD BEEN
12 ORIGINALLY PROPOSED. NEXT SLIDE. AND, SO, AGAIN, WHY NOW? WE
13 HAVE TALKED ABOUT THIS A LITTLE BIT BEFORE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
14 FUNDAMENTALLY, THE TOLL BRIDGES ARE CRITICAL TO THE REGION'S
15 ECONOMY, AND THE NUMBER ONE JOB OF THE AUTHORITY IS TO
16 MAINTAIN THEM IN A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR, GOOD CONDITION, TO
17 SERVE AS A LYNCH PIN FOR THE TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE,
18 WHICH INCLUDES NOT ONLY LOTS AND LOTS OF INDIVIDUAL VEHICLE
19 CROSSINGS, BUT CERTAINLY CRITICAL COMMERCIAL FREIGHT MOVEMENT,
20 YOU KNOW, ALL OF THE THINGS WE NEED TO GO ABOUT OUR DAILY
21 LIVES, WHICH OFTEN IS COMING IN ACROSS THOSE BRIDGES. THE
22 AUTHORITY HAS A \$1.9 BILLION 10-YEAR CIP. WE ARE WORKING ON AN
23 ADMINISTRATIVE UPDATE OF THAT CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PLAN AND
24 WE'LL BE BACK WITH YOU EARLY NEXT YEAR TO DO THAT ADMIN
25 UPDATE. THAT'S GOING TO TAKE THE NUMBER NORTH OF \$2 BILLION.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 SO, REAL SIGNIFICANT WORK. AS ANDY MENTIONED, WE'RE ALSO DOING
2 SOME VERY GOOD COOPERATIVE WORK WITH CALTRANS ON A MUCH LONGER
3 VIEW OF THE LIFE CYCLE COST OF MAINTAINING THESE ASSETS. AND,
4 CERTAINLY, WHAT WE'RE PRESENTING TO YOU TODAY IS BASED ON
5 THAT. CONSTRUCTION COSTS ARE GOING UP SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER
6 THAN GENERAL LEVELS OF INFLATION. THIS IS A CHALLENGE. AND WE
7 NOTED THIS BEFORE, TODAY, WE HAVE TO BORROW ALL THE MONEY THAT
8 WE SPEND ON BRIDGE PRESERVATION. WE DO NOT HAVE THE EXCESS
9 CASH FLOW, AS WE WOULD HAVE PRE-PANDEMIC IN ORDER TO FUND
10 THESE NEEDS. SO, IT'S ALL BEING BORROWED. THAT'S TOUGH. SO.
11 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THESE BRIDGE PRESERVATION PROJECTS ARE
12 REALLY ADDRESSING VERY CRITICAL NEEDS. AND IN FRONT OF YOU,
13 YOU CAN SEE SOME OF THESE, YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT THE FENDER
14 REPLACEMENT, AND WEST BAND PAINT ON THE OAKLAND BAY BRIDGE,
15 IMPORTANT CONCRETE REPAIR OVER THE WATER ON THE SAN MATEO
16 HAYWARD BRIDGE. AND PAINT, PAINT, LOTS OF PAINT. HUNDREDS OF
17 MILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF THE CIP IS ADDRESSING BRIDGE PAINT,
18 WHICH IS CRITICAL TO THE PRESERVATION OF THE STEEL STRUCTURES
19 IN THIS PRETTY TOUGH MARINE ENVIRONMENT. THE NEW CIP WILL
20 PROBABLY HAVE APPROACHING 800 MILLION OF THE TWO PLUS BILLION
21 OF ASSOCIATED PAINT, STEEL SCRAPING, PRESERVATION. YOU KNOW,
22 IT'S AN EXPENSIVE PROCESS BUT CRITICAL. THIS WORK IS ALL
23 DESIGNED TO MEET THE CRITICAL CURRENT NEEDS OF THE SYSTEM AS
24 WELL AS ADDRESS THOSE LIFE CYCLE COST MAINTENANCE ISSUES TO
25 ENSURE WE'RE PRESERVING THEM WE THEY NEED TO BE PRESERVED SO



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 WE DON'T HAVE TO REPLACE THEM BECAUSE THAT WOULD FUNDAMENTALLY
2 BE ORDERS OF MAGNITUDE MORE EXPENSIVE OVER TIME. NEXT SLIDE
3 PLEASE. AS ANDY SAID, AGAIN, A DOLLAR TOLL INCREASE FOR FISCAL
4 '27 HAS BEEN LONG INCLUDED IN THE [INDISCERNIBLE] FINANCING
5 PLANS. THE TOP LINE HERE SHOWS YOU WHAT WE WOULD HAVE
6 ESTIMATED FOR BRIDGE REVENUE, INCLUDING THAT ONE THERE
7 INCREASE PRE-PANDEMIC. THE BOTTOM HEIN SHOWS WHAT WE HAVE
8 ACTUALLY REALIZED AND WOULD REALIZE WERE THERE TO BE NO TOLL
9 INCREASE. THAT GAP IS FUNDAMENTALLY THE PROBLEM, RIGHT? IT
10 DOES NOT ALLOW US TO SPEND ANY MONEY ON A PAY AS YOU GO BASIS
11 FOR BRIDGE REHAB AND PRESERVATION EXPENSES. WHAT THAT'S
12 MEANING IS WE'RE SIMPLY HAVING TO BORROW THE MONEY TO FUND
13 THAT GAP. THE LAST TIME BRIDGE TOLLS WERE INCREASED FOR ON
14 BRIDGE PURPOSES, AS OPPOSED TO RM3 WAS 2010. THAT WAS A BASE -
15 - THAT CREATED A BASE TOLL OF \$4. THAT'S WORTH ABOUT \$2.80
16 TODAY. SO, WE HAVE LOST PURCHASING POWER ASSOCIATED WITH THAT
17 BASE TOLL, SUBSTANTIALLY. AND WE HAVE GOT TRAFFIC DECLINES,
18 COST ASSOCIATED WITH THE CONVERSION TO ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING,
19 WHICH CREATE ADDITIONAL PRESSURES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AGAIN,
20 WE'RE BORROWING TO DO THESE REHAB PROJECTS. IF WE CONTINUE TO
21 DO THAT, WHAT WE HAVE TO DO IN ORDER TO MITIGATE THE IMPACT OF
22 THAT BORROWING ON DEBT SERVICE, RIGHT NOW, IS PUSH THE
23 AMORTIZATION OF THAT PRINCIPLE TO THE VERY BACK END OF OUR
24 DEBT SERVICE STRUCTURE. NONETHELESS BECAUSE OF THE INTEREST
25 CARRY WE DO HAVE TO CARRY INTEREST DURING THAT PERIOD. JUST AS



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 AN EXAMPLE, IF WE DEBT FINANCE ANOTHER \$600 MILLION, THIS
2 SHOWS YOU WHAT WOULD HAPPEN, AND IT DOES RESULT IN ABOUT \$700
3 MILLION OF ADDITIONAL INTEREST EXPENSE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHO IS
4 USING THE BRIDGES? NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS, AGAIN, REFINES
5 SOME INFORMATION THAT WE PROVIDED PREVIOUSLY ON BRIDGE USAGE.
6 WHAT YOU SAW LAST MONTH WAS REALLY LOOKING AT ZIP CODE DATA
7 FOR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. IT'S -- WHAT WE HAVE DONE NOW
8 IS DRILL INTO A SPECIFIC MONTH AND BECAUSE WE'RE DRILLING DOWN
9 WE'RE ABLE TO GET THE ACTUAL CENSUS TRACK LEVEL DATA WHICH IS
10 WHERE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ARE DEFINED. WATERFALL
11 CHARTS SHOW YOU THE BRIDGE USAGE IN A SINGLE MONTH OCTOBER
12 2023 PRETTY REPRESENTATIVE OF WHAT WE WOULD EXPECT IN A
13 TYPICAL MONTH. KIDS ARE BACK IN SCHOOL FROM VACATIONS, THERE
14 AREN'T ANY HOLIDAYS IN THIS PERIOD. SO, AGAIN, IT'S PRETTY
15 REPRESENTATIVE. IN OCTOBER 2023, APPROXIMATELY 17% OF THE
16 TOTAL CROSSINGS WERE MADE BY FOLKS IN EQUITY PRIORITY
17 COMMUNITIES. AS WE POINTED OUT LAST MONTH, THIS DOES NOT MEAN
18 THAT LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS MAKE ALL OF THESE TRIPS. THERE ARE
19 LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS AND NON-LOW-INCOME CUSTOMERS IN THE
20 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, THAT'S TRUE OF NON-EQUITY
21 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES TOO, BUT WE WANTED TO GIVE YOU A SENSE OF
22 WHERE ARE OUR CUSTOMERS COMING FROM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE
23 DATA THAT WE HAVE BEEN GETTING ALSO ALLOWS US TO LOOK AT THE
24 FREQUENCY TRIPS TAKEN BY CUSTOMERS SYSTEM-WIDE. SYSTEM-WIDE
25 ABOUT 90% OF OUR CUSTOMER ACCOUNTS HAD FEWER THAN TEN TRIPS IN



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 THE MONTH. SO, WE MAY THINK LOTS OF PEOPLE CROSS THE BRIDGE
2 ALL THE TIME. MOST OF OUR FOLKS DO NOT CROSS THE BRIDGE ALL
3 THE TIME. I WOULD NOTE FURTHER, AGAIN, THIS IS ON AN ACCOUNT
4 BASIS. THE AVERAGE NUMBER OF VEHICLES PER ACCOUNT IS TWO. SO,
5 IF WE THEN SAY, OKAY, HOW TRIPS ARE MADE BY THE AVERAGE
6 VEHICLE, TAKE THESE NUMBERS AND DIVIDE THEM IN HALF, RIGHT?
7 SO, IT'S NOT A TON. NONETHELESS, YOU KNOW, IT'S IMPORTANT TO
8 RECOGNIZE THAT FOR OUR MOST FREQUENT COMMUTERS, YOU KNOW,
9 THERE WILL BE A REAL IMPACT OF TOLLS ON THOSE FOLKS. NEXT
10 SLIDE, PLEASE. WHEN WE, AGAIN, TRY TO LOOK AT AND DISTINGUISH
11 BETWEEN FOLKS IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND FOLKS IN NON-
12 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, THIS DOES SHOW THAT, YOU KNOW,
13 KIND OF WHAT WE WOULD EXPECT AN INSTITUTE, WHICH IS RESIDENTS
14 AND EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES DO HAVE HIGHER RELATIVE USAGE
15 OF THE BEST OF MY KNOWLEDGE FACILITIES THAN RESIDENTS AND NON-
16 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AGAIN IT'S STILL SIGNIFICANTLY
17 LESS THAN WE MIGHT HAVE THOUGHT. BUT WE DON'T WANT TO MINIMIZE
18 THE IMPACT ON THOSE FOLKS WHO ARE DRIVING THE BRIDGE
19 FREQUENTLY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WHAT HAVE WE DONE TO
20 SUPPORT EQUITY? WE WANTED TO REFINE A LITTLE BIT OF WHAT WE
21 HAVE SHOWN PREVIOUSLY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THERE ARE LOTS OF
22 QUESTIONS. HOW DO PEOPLE GET FASTRAK TODAY? RIGHT? WE HAVE WEB
23 SITES AVAILABLE 24/7, WE HAVE CALL CENTER AND WALK-IN CENTER
24 THAT ARE OPEN DURING BUSINESS HOURS EVERY SINGLE DAY ON THE
25 WEEKDAYS. WE ALSO SELL THE FASTRAK TRANSPONDERS THROUGH COSTCO



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 AND SELECT WALGREENS LOCATIONS. WE SUPPORT THIS PROCESS IN A
2 NUMBER OF DIFFERENT LANGUAGES. WE HAVE ALSO REDUCED SOME OF
3 THE WAYS THAT DEPOSIT WORKS TRYING TO REDUCE SOME OF THOSE
4 BARRIERS, TAG DEPOSIT IS \$5, AND WE DON'T CHARGE A DEPARTMENT
5 AT ALL IF YOU SET UP THE TAG WITH AUTOMATIC RELOAD WITH A
6 CREDIT CARD. AGAIN, WE WANT TO MOVE FOLKS INTO THAT CHANNEL.
7 ANY OF OUR INVOICES AND VIOLATION NOTICES PROMOTE GETTING A
8 FASTRAK. WE WANT TO GET IN THERE. AND WE HAVE GOT, AGAIN,
9 REGULAR CAMPAIGNS AND OUTREACH TO ENCOURAGE FASTRAK USAGE. WE
10 THINK THIS IS GOOD. IT IS NOT GOOD ENOUGH. WE KNOW WE HAVE GOT
11 TO DO MORE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. FUNDAMENTALLY, WE HAVE GOT TO
12 DEVELOP FUTURE OPPORTUNITIES FOR MEETING CUSTOMERS WHERE THEY
13 ARE, WHETHER THAT'S IN THE FASTRAK SPACE OR ELSEWHERE. SO,
14 WHAT ELSE CAN WE DO? WE'RE WORKING TO EXPANDING ACCESS TO THE
15 TAGS INTO THE ACCOUNTS, INCLUDING WORKING TO REDUCE ANY MORE -
16 - YOU KNOW, THOSE FINANCIAL BURDENS THAT ARE ASSOCIATED WITH
17 OPENING AND MAINTAINING AN ACCOUNT. WE'RE GOING TO BE
18 ANALYZING INCENTIVES THAT MAY BE AVAILABLE TO PROMOTE THE
19 USAGE OF FASTRAK. SO, SOMETHING WE DON'T NECESSARILY DO TODAY,
20 BUT WHAT ARE THE THINGS AROUND THE EDGE THAT WE COULD DO. AND
21 WE WOULD WORK TO CONSIDER OTHER CHANNELS BY WHICH CUSTOMERS
22 CAN PAY THEIR TOLLS. FUNDAMENTALLY, THAT'S WHAT WE WANT. THEY
23 CROSS THE BRIDGE, WE WOULD LIKE YOUR MONEY, BUT WE'RE NOT
24 TRYING TO DING YOU. RIGHT? NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IT'S IMPORTANT
25 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE IMPORTANT STEPS THAT BATA HAS ALREADY TAKEN



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 IN THE EQUITY SPACE, INCLUDING INCREASED ACCESS TO ACCOUNTS,
2 INCLUDING LANGUAGE -- INCLUDING LANGUAGE ACCESSIBILITY,
3 INCREASED OPTIONS TO PAY BY CASH, REDUCING FINANCIAL BURDENS
4 FOR ESTABLISHING AND MAINTAINING THOSE FASTRAK ACCOUNTS. SOME
5 THINGS WE HAVE ALREADY TAKEN, AGAIN THERE ARE MORE THINGS WE
6 NEED TO DO AND BETTER SUPPORTING OUR INVOICE CUSTOMERS. NEXT
7 SLIDE PLEASE. AND THE BOARD HAS TAKEN REALLY CRITICAL STEPS IN
8 OTHER SPACES IN THE TRANSPORTATION SECTOR IN THIS REGION TO
9 SUPPORT EQUITY, INCLUDING SUPPORT OF THE CLIPPER START AND
10 EXPRESS LANE STARTS PROGRAM. BOTH OF THOSE OFFER SUBSTANTIAL
11 DISCOUNTS TO CUSTOMERS AND STAFF IS WORKING ACTIVELY TO
12 INCREASE PROGRAM UPTAKE AND TO STREAMLINE ENROLLMENT IN THOSE
13 PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WHAT ARE WE ACTUALLY
14 PROPOSING? NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, TO PROVIDE THE FUNDING
15 NECESSARY FOR MAINTENANCE OF THE TOLL BRIDGES, STAFF IS
16 PROPOSING A MULTI-YEAR PLAN OF TOLL INCREASES BEGINNING
17 JANUARY 1ST OF 2026. THIS PLAN INCLUDES FIVE ANNUAL \$0.50
18 INCREASES, ALONG WITH THE INTRODUCTION OF TOLL DIFFERENTIALS
19 FOR INVOICE CUSTOMERS AND LICENSE PLATE ACCOUNTS. WE'RE
20 PROPOSING TO PHASE THE TOLL INCREASE OVER FIVE YEARS, BECAUSE
21 WE KNOW THAT THE TOLL INCREASE, PARTICULARLY OF THIS
22 MAGNITUDE, HAS A REAL EFFECT ON BOTH INDIVIDUAL AND COMMERCIAL
23 CUSTOMERS. SO, WE, YOU KNOW, WANT TO START BY UNDERSTANDING
24 THAT. WE RECOGNIZE IT. WE ALSO THINK THIS IS CURRENT WITH THE
25 NEED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS JUST SHOWS YOU WHAT THAT



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 WOULD DO COMPARED TO THAT CHART THAT I SHOWED EARLIER. WHILE
2 THIS TOLL INCREASE PROPOSAL WOULD NOT GET US BACK TO THE LEVEL
3 OF REVENUE THAT HAS BEEN ESTIMATED PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC, IT
4 WOULD PUT US ON A MUCH SOUNDER FINANCIAL FOOTING WITH WHICH TO
5 ADDRESS THE BRIDGE SYSTEM'S CRITICAL NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE,
6 PLEASE. AND THIS PROPOSAL WOULD ALSO PROVIDE REGIONAL
7 CONSISTENCY, BOTH IN TERMS OF THE ANNUAL LEVEL OF INCREASES
8 BEGINNING IN JANUARY '26, AS WELL AS THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
9 TOLL DIFFERENTIALS FOR INVOICE CUSTOMERS AND THOSE WITH
10 LICENSE PLATE ACCOUNTS WHEN WE COMPARE THOSE TO THE FOLKS IN
11 OUR FASTRAK PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, WHAT ARE WE DOING
12 FROM HERE? NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AGAIN WE HAVE BEEN TAKING YOUR
13 FEEDBACK OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS NOW. BASED ON FEEDBACK
14 TODAY, WE'LL MAKE ANY NEEDED REVISIONS TO THIS TOLL INCREASE
15 PROPOSAL AND RETURN TO THE BATA BOARD IN TWO WEEKS FOR
16 FEEDBACK FROM THE ENTIRE BOARD. SUBSEQUENT TO THAT FEEDBACK
17 WE'LL CONDUCT A PUBLIC HEARING PROCESS ON A FINALIZED PROPOSAL
18 IN NOVEMBER 2024. THIS WILL INCLUDE WEBINAR WITH QUESTIONS AND
19 ANSWERS, A FORMAL COMMENT PERIOD AND A PUBLIC HEARING THAT WE
20 WOULD HOLD AT THE BOARD'S NOVEMBER MEETING. AND, FINALLY, WE
21 WOULD COME BACK TO THE BOARD IN DECEMBER TO SEEK APPROVAL FOR
22 THE PROGRAM OF TOLL INCREASES IN CONJUNCTION WITH AN UPDATE TO
23 THE SYSTEM'S HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLE POLICY. NEXT SLIDE,
24 PLEASE. AND SUBSEQUENT TO A HOPED FOR BOARD APPROVAL OF THIS
25 TOLL INCREASE PROGRAM, STAFF WOULD WORK WITH OUR SYSTEM



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 VENDOR, THE CUSTOMER SERVICE VENDOR, CONDUENT, AND WITH
2 CALTRANS ON IMPLEMENTATION STEPS, INCLUDING THE NECESSARY
3 TOLLING SYSTEM CHANGES AND SIGNAGE. AT THE SAME TIME, WE WOULD
4 BE WORKING ON ALL OF THE STEPS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT
5 PREVIOUSLY, BOTH RELATIVE TO FASTRAK PENETRATION AND THE
6 DEVELOPMENT OF OTHER PAYMENT CHANNELS, AND ENSURE CUSTOMER
7 EDUCATION ON THE TOLL INCREASES. WITH THAT, BOTH LISA AND I
8 AND ANY OTHERS WHO ARE NEEDED, ARE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
9 QUESTIONS.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE
12 ANY COMMISSIONERS WITH QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I KNOW WE HAD A
13 -- I HAVE HAD QUITE AN EXTENSIVE DISCUSSION.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

18

19 **HILLARY RONEN:** SURE. THANK YOU. THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION.
20 WHEN WE HAD MET TO HAVE A BRIEFING ON THIS SUBJECT, I
21 UNDERSTOOD THAT WE CANNOT LEGALLY CHARGE DIFFERENTIAL RATES
22 FOR INDIVIDUALS OF LOWER INCOME LEVELS, OR WHO USE THE BRIDGE,
23 YOU KNOW, EVERY SINGLE DAY TO GET TO WORK. BUT I HAD ASKED IF
24 WE COULD HAVE DIFFERENTIALS BASED ON DIFFERENTIALS BASED ON
25 DIFFERENT INDUSTRIES, LIKE, YOU KNOW, SERVICE INDUSTRY, ET



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 CETERA, AND YOU WERE GOING TO LOOK INTO IT AND I WONDER FOUND
2 ANSWER THE TO THAT.

3

4 **DEREK HANSEL:** YES. WE WILL LOOK INTO IT HAVE NOT HAD
5 OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT YET.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY?

8

9 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION, DEREK AND
10 LISA. I WANT TO ADD MY VOICE TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
11 PREMIER. ON THESE BRIDGES CONTINUE TO GROW, AND IN THE PAST
12 SEVERAL YEARS, I HAVE WORKED CLOSELY WITH THE DATA STAFF ON
13 THESE NEEDS WE HAVE A TEN YEAR PLAN THAT WE LOOK AT ALL THE
14 UNCONSTRAINED NEEDS AND THEN ON AN ANNUAL BASIS WE GET
15 TOGETHER TO SEE WHAT WE CAN POSSIBLY FUND. THE FUNDING LEVELS
16 HAVE BEEN LOW DUE TO THE FACT THAT WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TO BE
17 ABLE TO FUND THE NEEDS ON AN ANNUAL BASIS. MAINTAINING THEM IN
18 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR IS GOING TO REALLY BE CRITICAL FOR ALL OF
19 US THAT'S WHY WE'RE HERE THIS IS OUR PRIMARY RESPONSIBILITY I
20 WANT TO PUT IN A PLUG FOR THE COMMISSION TO REALLY CONSIDER
21 THIS REQUEST. WE ARE ALSO WORKING CLOSELY WITH OUR BATA TEAM
22 TO REALLY ASSESS THOSE NEEDS BASED ON AN ASSET MANAGEMENT
23 PLAN. ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN WOULD BE CRITICAL IN INFORMING HOW
24 THESE INVESTMENTS NEED TO HAPPEN, WHEN THEY NEED TO HAPPEN,
25 WHAT WOULD BE THE COST OF DEFERMENT IF WE DEFER ANY OF THESE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 ITEMS. JUST IN GENERAL, WORKING IN THIS INDUSTRY FOR MANY,
2 MANY YEARS, THE MORE WE DEFER, OF COURSE THE COST GROWS, AND
3 WE HAVE GOT INFLATION. NOTHING IS GETTING CHEAPER. SO, I
4 REALLY URGE THE COMMISSIONERS, HERE, TO REALLY CONSIDER THIS
5 ASK FOR US TO START REALLY LOOKING INTO WHAT DO WE NEED DO TO
6 KEEP IT IN GOOD STATE OF REPAIRS. THANK YOU.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. YOU KNOW, THIS ONE IS HARD,
11 BUT IT IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO, DINA I AGREE WITH YOU. AND WE
12 WEAR MULTIPLE HATS. YOU CAN'T LOOK AT THIS JUST IN ISOLATION.
13 I AM SENSITIVE TO THE OVERALL COST LIVING IN THE BAY AREA
14 WORKING FAMILIES REALLY FEELING THAT IMPACT NOT JUST ON
15 TRANSPORTATION, BUT BACK AT HOME, UTILITIES, GROCERIES,
16 CHILDREN, BUT WHAT I OFFER IS THAT THIS ORGANIZATION, YOU
17 KNOW, MTC AS A WHOLE, IS LOOKING AT HOW DO WE HELP WORKING
18 FAMILIES THROUGH THE MEANS BASED PROGRAM. SO, WHETHER YOU ARE
19 CROSSING THE BRIDGE OR TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT, WE'RE TRYING TO
20 PROVIDE TRANSPORTATION THAT LEADS PEOPLE TO WHERE THEY'RE AT
21 THROUGH AFFORDABILITY THROUGH DIFFERENT PROGRAMS. THAT'S WHAT
22 GIVES ME THE COMFORT AND CONFIDENCE TO GO FORWARD ON THIS. I
23 RECOGNIZE THE COST BUT I ALSO HAD OPPORTUNITY AND PRIVILEGE OF
24 GOING WITH OUR CFO TO NEW YORK TO TALK TO OUR BANKERS WHO
25 LENDS US MONEY ON THESE BRIDGES AND THE ONE THING THEY ASK US



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 ABOUT IS THE STATE OF OUR BRIDGES. I THINK THAT'S TIED TO THAT
2 AND WE'RE ON THE RIGHT PATH. I WANT TO CHALLENGE US, I WOULD
3 LIKE TO KNOW THE PEOPLE THAT NEED US THE MOST, IT'S ABOUT
4 REACHING THEM. AND I KNOW THAT'S A HARD GROUP TO REACH. AND I
5 KNOW WE HAVE TRIED. I DON'T WANT TO DISCOUNT OUR EFFORTS TO
6 WHAT STAFF HAS DONE. BUT WE ALL REPRESENT OUR CITIES AND
7 COUNTIES WE ALL HAVE FAMILIES IN OUR COMMUNITIES THAT WE HELP
8 THROUGH MEDICARE, MEDICAL, THROUGH SELF-SUFFICIENCY WE
9 TYPICALLY KNOW WHO THEY ARE. I DO NOT THINK -- I DO THINK IT'S
10 POSSIBLE TO CREATE PARTNERSHIPS TO WORK WITH COUNTIES AND
11 CITIES TO IDENTIFY THOSE FOLKS THAT ARE ALREADY ENROLLED IN
12 SERVICES THAT ARE PROBABLY ELIGIBLE FOR HELP AND ASSISTANCE. I
13 THINK WE NEED TO BE REACHING THEM. AND WHETHER IT'S WORKING
14 WITH SMALLER COUNTIES TO PILOT SOMETHING, HAPPY TO VOLUNTEER
15 IN NAPA, BUT IF THERE IS A WAY DO THAT, YOU KNOW, LET'S WORK
16 SMARTER NOT HARDER. SO, I DO THINK THAT'S AN OPPORTUNITY.
17 AGAIN, I'M INTERESTED IN HELPING PEOPLE THAT NEED HELP THE
18 MOST. I ACKNOWLEDGE OUR RESPONSIBILITY WE HAVE AROUND OUR
19 BRIDGES AND THIS IS SOMETHING WE MUST DO, YOU ILLUSTRATED
20 THAT, THANK YOU. BUT IT'S ALSO AT TRYING TO REACH PEOPLE THAT
21 WE NEED TO REACH. NOT A LOT OF QUESTIONS, JUST MORE COMMENTS.

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, IN RESPONSE BECAUSE I THINK IT
24 TIES TO COMMISSIONER RONEN, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ HAS BEEN CLEAR
25 ABOUT WE ACCEPT THE FACT THAT THERE IS NOT A FLOOR HERE THAT



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 WE HAVE TO STOP AT AND CONTINUING TO TRY TO FIND CREATIVE WAYS
2 TO DO WHAT YOU'RE ASKING US TO DO ANTICIPATE OVER THE COURSE
3 OF THIS ACTION THROUGH THE COURSE OF NEXT YEAR WE WILL BE BACK
4 IN FRONT OF YOU LETTING YOU KNOW OUR PROGRESS AND IDEAS WE
5 HAVE COME UP WITH, I ASSURE YOU WE'RE WORKING VERY HARD TRYING
6 TO ADDRESS THAT IMPORTANT COMPONENT OF THIS QUESTION.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. I DO --
11 YOU KNOW, I WANT TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS JUST ABOUT HOW WE DO
12 ADDRESS THE MEANS ISSUE, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE IT BEING
13 RAISED BY MY COLLEAGUE. I WAS WONDERING FROM A COMMUNICATION
14 PERSPECTIVE IF WE WERE GOING TO GET THE PUBLIC'S ATTENTION AND
15 WE HAD ONE SLIDE IN THIS DECK WHERE WE WOULD SAY THIS IS THE
16 INCREASE, THIS IS WHAT WE'RE USING IT FOR, WHICH ONE WOULD I
17 POINT TO IF I WANTED TO GET FEEDBACK FROM THE PUBLIC?

18

19 **DEREK HANSEL:** ONE SINGLE SLIDE.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** DEREK, YOU ARE A MAN OF MANY SLIDES. [LAUGHTER]

22

23 **DEREK HANSEL:** MAN OF MANY SLIDES. IT'S A MULTI-FACETED STORY.
24 I MIGHT SHOW THE ONE SLIDE THAT SHOWS THE PROJECTS THAT WE'RE
25 ACTIVELY WORKING ON. RIGHT? YOU KNOW, AND IT'S NOT TO TRY TO



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 SCARE PEOPLE, AND HADN'T REALLY THOUGHT ABOUT THIS QUESTION,
2 IT'S NOT TO SCARE PEOPLE, AS ANDY SAID, THE BRIDGES IN GOOD
3 SHAPE AND WE'RE WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH CALTRANS TO ENSURE
4 THEY'RE IN GOOD SHAPE. RIGHT? BUT THIS IS NOT AN OPERATING
5 REQUEST. GENERALLY, NOT AN OPERATING REQUEST FOR SPENDING,
6 RIGHT? THIS IS FOR CRITICAL MAINTENANCE NEEDS. AND THE REALITY
7 IS THAT MOST OF THIS STUFF HAPPENS UNDERNEATH THE BRIDGES
8 WHERE NOBODY CAN SEE IT. AND IT'S ALL SUPER EXPENSIVE.

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** WELL, I THINK THAT AS WE MAKE THE CASE TO THE
11 USERS, I -- I WOULD REALLY REQUEST THAT WE FIND A -- AN
12 INFOGRAPHIC, JUST RECOGNIZING THAT PEOPLE AREN'T GOING TO GO
13 THROUGH MULTIPLE SLIDES, BUT ONE THAT CAN BE USED BOTH BY YOU,
14 BUT ALSO BY THE BOARD, EVEN AS WE'RE MOVING THROUGH THESE
15 COMMUNICATION PLANS WITH THE PUBLIC. I THINK THAT WOULD JUST
16 BE REALLY HELPFUL AND GO A LONG WAY TO ASSURING THAT, YOU
17 KNOW, THAT PEOPLE UNDERSTAND, AT LEAST BROADLY, THAT THESE ARE
18 CAPITAL PROGRAMS, AND THAT THESE ARE NEEDED FOR PUBLIC SAFETY.
19 AND I DO THINK IT'S OKAY TO SAY THAT, BECAUSE THAT'S, IN FACT,
20 THE -- YOU KNOW, I MEAN, THAT'S JUST FACT. IT'S JUST TRUE. SO,
21 ANYWAY. I'M MAKING THAT REQUEST MORE AS IT RELATES TO HOW WE
22 TALK TO THE PUBLIC ABOUT THIS. AND THEN THE SECOND ISSUE THAT
23 I JUST WANT TO GO BACK AND BETTER UNDERSTAND, AND I APOLOGIZE
24 THAT I -- I -- I MISSED THIS. IN THE SLIDE THAT HAS THE
25 REGIONALLY CONSISTENT DIFFERENTIAL PRICING AND THE PARTNERSHIP



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 WITH GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, COULD YOU JUST SAY A LITTLE BIT ABOUT
2 HOW THAT GETS OPERATIONALIZED RELATIVE TO COMMUNICATIONS? IS
3 THAT MORE OF AN ALL-BRIDGE COMMUNICATION STRATEGY? OR IS IT
4 SOMETHING DIFFERENT?

5

6 **DEREK HANSEL:** NO. I THINK THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. I THINK, YOU
7 KNOW, AGAIN, GOLDEN GATE HAS HAD DIFFERENTIAL PRICING FOR
8 SEVERAL YEARS NOW, BETWEEN FASTRAK AND INVOICE CUSTOMERS. SO,
9 I THINK THERE WOULD BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO BE VERY CLEAR, KIND
10 OF REGION-WIDE, HEY THERE, IS GOING TO BE A DIFFERENCE. AND,
11 YOU KNOW, GETTING FASTRAK PENETRATION UP FOR US WOULD ALSO BE
12 GOOD FOR GOLDEN GATE, RIGHT? FOR BOTH OF OUR AGENCIES, THE
13 MORE FASTRAK PENETRATION INTO ACCOUNTS, THE BETTER. FRANKLY
14 BETTER FOR OUR CUSTOMERS TOO. IT OFFERS THEM -- IT WOULD OFFER
15 THEM IN A DIFFERENTIAL WORLD ECONOMIC SAVINGS, IT OFFERS
16 CONVENIENCE, AND AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT BEFORE, ONE OF THE
17 KEYS TO MAKING THAT HAPPEN, WE HAVE GOT TO GET BETTER ABOUT
18 INCREASING PENETRATION OF THOSE ACCOUNTS AND WE HAVE GOT MAKE
19 IT EASIER FOR PEOPLE TO GET INTO THOSE ACCOUNTS AND MAINTAIN
20 THOSE ACCOUNTS REGARDLESS OF WHOM THEY ARE, WE NEED TO MEET
21 THEM WHERE THEY ARE ON THAT SPACE. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT
22 HELPS.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH. I MEAN, I WOULD JUST SAY THAT FOR CLARITY,
25 FOR CLARITY, IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATION, I THINK THERE IS SOME



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 VALUE. I DO WANT TO WEIGH IN ON THE POINT THAT HILARY RAISED,
2 WHICH IS THAT I, I DO THINK -- I MEAN ONE OF THE THINGS I
3 THINK IS CRITICAL IS THAT WE'RE LOWERING THE BARRIER TO BE
4 ABLE TO MAKE ALL OF THIS SO EASY TO ACCESS THAT IT'S JUST --
5 THAT IT'S NOT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT YOU HAVE TO SWEAT ABOUT,
6 THERE IS JUST SOME REALLY SIMPLE WAYS THAT YOU CAN ACCESS
7 THIS, YOU KNOW, THE FASTRAK AND ALL OF THAT. I FEEL LIKE WE'RE
8 A LITTLE BIT AWAYS ON THAT. AND I APPRECIATE YOU SAYING THAT,
9 THAT WE'RE JUST GOING TO KEEP WORKING AT IT. I'M INTERESTED IN
10 MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE A MECHANISM OR A TOOL THAT MAKES IT
11 EASY FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE HIGH USERS, ESPECIALLY THOSE THAT ARE,
12 YOU KNOW, LOW-INCOME, THAT THIS DOES NOT BECOME A BARRIER FOR
13 PEOPLE TO DO WORK IN THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO, AND YOU HAVE
14 TOO MANY PEOPLE OPT OUT IF YOU HAVE TO TAKE TOO MANY TRIPS
15 BACK AND FORTH, AND I ASK IS THERE A CAP ON HOW MUCH YOU GET
16 CHARGED IN A DAY GOING BACK AND FORTH?

17

18 **DEREK HANSEL:** WE DO OFFER A MULTI-BRIDGE DISCOUNT.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THERE IS A MULTI-BRIDGE DISCOUNT IF YOU DRIVE
21 TWO BRIDGES IN THE SAME DAY I THINK THAT'S SPECIFIED IN RM2
22 LEGISLATION.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** TO FOLLOW UP, IF YOU ARE SOMEBODY WHO MAYBE
25 CROSSES GOLDEN GATE -- I MEAN ANY BRIDGE, ACTUALLY, MULTIPLE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 TIMES IN A DAY, IS THERE A MAXIMUM YOU CAN BE CHARGED FOR A
2 DAY'S WORTH OF BACK AND FORTH?

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NO THERE IS NOT, AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ
5 THERE, ARE SO MANY COMPLICATIONS IN THIS AREA, STARTING, FIRST
6 OF ALL, WITH A RELATIONSHIP TO PLANNED BAY AREA AND WHAT WE'RE
7 TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH IN PLANNED BAY AREA, WHICH IS MINIMIZE
8 VEHICLE MILES TRAFFIC AND REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS IS WHERE THE
9 CHALLENGES ARE THERE TO YOUR COMMUNICATION STRATEGY WE
10 ACTUALLY HAD A MEETING YESTERDAY ON THE PLANNED OPENING NEXT
11 YEAR OF MARIN SONOMA 101 HOV HOURS. AND THE HOV HOURS ARE
12 DIFFERENT IN SONOMA, MARIN, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, AND RICHMOND
13 BRIDGE. THEY'RE ALL DIFFERENT. WE RECOGNIZE THE CHALLENGE WITH
14 TRANSPORTATION COMMUNITY THAT'S CREATING A SEAMLESS VOICE THAT
15 IS WHAT IS JUST LIKE IN TRANSIT, WHAT'S THE MESSAGE. WE'RE
16 WORKING CLOSELY WITH ALL OF OUR PARTNERS TO GET BETTER IN THAT
17 SPACE. AND THE CLOSER WE ALIGN TO THE CONCEPT OF GOLDEN GATE
18 BRIDGE IS DOING, NOT NECESSARILY THE SAME TOLL RATES, THE
19 BETTER IT WILL BE TO EXPLAIN TO THE PUBLIC WHAT IT TAKES TO
20 MANAGE YOUR TRANSPORTATION EXPERIENCE AND, HOPEFULLY, FIND
21 WAYS TO GET YOU INTO TRANSIT AND SUPPORT A LOT OF THOSE LONG
22 RANGE PLANNED BAY AREA GOALS. WE KNOW THE AUDIENCE YOU'RE
23 TALKING ABOUT AND WE'RE HOPEFUL THAT SOME OF THE INFORMATION
24 WE'RE PRESENTING IN OUR COMMITMENT TO COME UP WITH CREATIVE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 IDEAS TO DEAL WITH THAT WILL BE HELPFUL OVER THE COMING MONTHS
2 AND YEARS. BUT IT'S COMPLICATED.

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES, ALL OF OUR WORK IS. BUT WHAT I WOULD JUST
5 RECOMMEND IS THAT WE'RE DOING FOCUS GROUPS WITH THE PEOPLE
6 THAT WE INTEND TO HELP. AND I AGREE WITH YOU THAT WE WANT TO
7 MINIMIZE UTILIZATION SO PEOPLE GET ON BART AND USE OTHER MEANS
8 I'M REALLY THINKING ABOUT THOSE KINDS OF JOBS THAT ARE
9 IRREGULAR AT TIMES FROM A TIMING PERSPECTIVE AND MAY REQUIRE
10 SOME TRAVEL THAT ARE MORE IN THE SERVICE AREA BUT I WOULD JUST
11 RECOMMEND THAT WE ARE HAVING CONVERSATIONS WITH THE COMMUNITY
12 AND DOING IN A FOCUS MANNER AS WELL WHICH I KNOW YOU'RE
13 ALREADY DOING BUT JUST WANTED TO REINFORCE THE. THE LAST
14 QUESTION I HAVE IS ONE THAT'S MORE CONTROVERSIAL AND I KNOW
15 THAT THERE WILL BE A LOT OF PULLING AND PUSHING AS TO WHETHER
16 OR NOT YOU KNOW WE TREAT TOLL INCREASES AND I REMEMBER ONE
17 DISCUSSION WHERE WE WERE HAVING LOOKING AT FILLING THE GAP FOR
18 TRANSIT AND THERE WAS SOME EYE TOWARDS BRIDGE TOLLS TO REMEDY
19 THE TRANSPORTATION PROBLEM AND I RECOGNIZE THAT THE BUCKETS
20 ARE BIG IN EACH OF THESE AREAS AND I'M WONDERING IF THAT ISSUE
21 HAS COME REALLY FROM THE COMMUNITY OR FROM -- I HAVEN'T HEARD
22 IT FROM THE BOARD OF LATE BUT FROM OUR PROVIDING COMMUNITY AND
23 THE REASON I ASK THIS QUESTION IS I WANT TO MAKE SURE STAFF
24 ARE PREPARED TO RESPOND TO THE REASON THAT THESE BODIES OF
25 WORK ARE BEING DECOUPLED IN TERMS OF NOT DISADVANTAGING ANY OF



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 OUR SYSTEMS DRAMATICALLY BUT LETTING ONE SYSTEM NECESSARILY
2 LEAN TOO HARD ON ANOTHER AND THEREFORE CAUSING CHARGES FOR THE
3 BRIDGES. I WONDER COULD YOU SPEAK TO THAT A BIT.

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I SURE CAN. WE ACTUALLY HAD A BRIEFING WITH
6 SOME OF THE TRANSPORTATION TRANSIT OPERATORS JUST THE OTHER
7 DAY AND THAT WAS A QUESTION THEY BROUGHT FORWARD, BECAUSE OF
8 THE CHALLENGES THEY FACED. WE HAVE BEEN CLEAR THROUGH LAWS AND
9 HIGHWAY CODE, BATA HAS THE AUTHORITY TO RAISE TOLLS WITHOUT A
10 VOTE. THIS IS YOUR DECISION FOR THE SPECIFIC PURPOSE OF BRIDGE
11 REHABILITATION AND MAINTENANCE AND OPERATION AND TO PROTECT
12 THE OBLIGATION OF THE BONDS HOLDERS. YOUR QUESTION IS A
13 BROADER ONE, FAIR TO BRING INTO THE CONVERSATION, BUT IT'S NOT
14 RELATED TO THIS PARTICULAR ASK, BUT WOULD HAVE TO BE DONE IN
15 CONCERT WITH WHAT THIS WORK IS REQUESTING. DEREK MENTIONED
16 PREVIOUS PRESENTATIONS, RIGHT NOW ABOUT HALF OF THE TOLL
17 REVENUE IS GOING INTO INVESTMENTS IN THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
18 THAT ARE BROADER THAN THE BRIDGES. THAT'S ONE CHALLENGE WE
19 FACE WE RECOGNIZE THE DECISIONS BUT OVERALL IMPACT ON HOW TO
20 MOVE FORWARD WE'RE HOPING TO FUTURE DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHAT WE
21 CAN DO TO BE CREATIVE PRICING OF THE ENTIRE SYSTEM IS IN FRONT
22 OF THE COMMISSION IS ONE OF THE CHALLENGES LOOKING AT
23 DIFFERENT WAYS TO FIND TRANSIT PRIORITY ON THE BRIDGES IS
24 IMPORTANT CONGESTION PRICING ON THE BRIDGES BROUGHT FORWARD BY
25 THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO AND OTHERS MULTIPLE TIMES WE HAVE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 EXPERIMENTED WITH IT PREVIOUSLY ON THE BRIDGES. SO, LOOK, I --
2 I THINK WE ARE, CERTAINLY, AWARE OF ITS CHANGE IN THE
3 CONVERSATION, BUT WE WANT TO BE VERY CLEAR, THIS IS A
4 DISTINCTLY DIFFERENT ASK.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. AND I APPRECIATE THE POINT YOU'RE RAISING.
7 I'M NOT SURE I WOULD DRAW AS -- I MEAN, I -- I THINK WHAT
8 YOU'RE SAYING, AND I THINK IT'S JUST IMPORTANT WHEN THIS COMES
9 TO THE BOARD THAT THE LANGUAGE THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IS IT
10 SHAPES THIS PART OF THE CONVERSATION AND WHAT I WOULD ALSO SAY
11 IS THAT I DO THINK THAT AS I WAS JUST LISTENING TO YOU I WAS
12 REMINDED THAT -- AND I'M REALLY THINKING BACK THOSE
13 DISCUSSIONS THAT WE WERE HAVING AT THE BOARD LEVEL, THAT THERE
14 IS A REALLY BIG DEFINED NEED HERE. KIND OF, PERIOD. AND I DO
15 THINK THAT BEING ABLE TO EXPLAIN THAT NEED AND THE DISTINCTION
16 OF THE BOARD'S, BOTH OBLIGATION AND OPPORTUNITY, IS REALLY
17 HELPFUL AND I APPRECIATE THAT. AND I ALSO THINK THE POINT YOU
18 RAISED, I'M NOT SURE THAT WE WOULD BE LOOKING TO THE BRIDGES
19 TO SOLVE THIS OTHER PROBLEM. AND I THINK IT'S OKAY FOR THE
20 BOARD TO, SORT OF, WRESTLE THAT TO THE GROUND, EVEN AT, YOU
21 KNOW, THAT THAT WILL HAPPEN OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS, BUT
22 EVEN IN THIS MOMENT OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS TO SAY WE'RE GONNA
23 -- THIS IS OUR FIRST STEP, YOU KNOW, THAT WILL BE, IF EVER, A
24 SECOND STEP, AND IF THIS COMES TO THE FULL BOARD JUST A
25 RECOGNITION OF THE CURRENT EXPENDITURES, AGAIN, JUST TO REMIND



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 US ALL. BECAUSE I REALLY APPRECIATE YOU REMINDING ME OF THAT
2 TOO. THOSE ARE MY QUESTIONS COLLEAGUES. THANK YOU.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. OKAY. WE'LL GO
5 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH HERE. WE'RE HEADING IN THE
8 RIGHT DIRECTION. COMMUNICATION IS VERY KEY ON THIS ONE. I DO
9 BELIEVE THE ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM IS GOING TO BE DEFINING
10 MOVING FORWARD HERE. I DO APPRECIATE THE FASTRAK PENETRATION
11 EFFORTS ARE. I'M LOOKING AT THE MAP RIGHT NOW. [LAUGHTER]
12 COSTCO REQUIRES A MEMBERSHIP. SO, THE VAST MAJORITY OF THE
13 REGION WHERE YOU'RE OFFERING THE COMMUNITY OUTREACH IS NOT
14 GETTING THERE. I SEE A WHOLE BUNCH OF WALGREENS IN SAN
15 FRANCISCO, AND A FEW TRICKLE OUT. SO IF WE CAN WE REALLY NEED
16 TO EXPAND THOSE EFFORTS. AND I WOULD LOVE TO SEE US TRACKING
17 AND ESTABLISHING A TIMELINE FOR THAT. BECAUSE WE KNOW, YOU
18 HAVE INFORMED US, THAT WE CAN SAVE SOME MONEY AND HELP THE
19 COMMUNITY, AS WELL. SO, THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN PUTTING
20 SOMETHING IN A SLIDE AND, REALLY, THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY NOW.
21 POINT IN TIME WHERE, IF YOU CAN, SHOW US NOT ONLY A TRACKING
22 PLAN, BUT A PLAN FOR TIME IMPLEMENTATION. IF IT'S WALGREENS,
23 FINE, WE NEED TO GET TO THE REST OF THE COUNTIES WITH THOSE
24 WALGREENS. I WOULD BE INTERESTED TOO, DATA IS VERY IMPORTANT,
25 THE DIFFERENTIAL FROM PEOPLE OUTSIDE THE NINE BAY AREA



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 COUNTIES, AND IF WE HAVE THAT DATA AS TO WHO IS COMING IN. WE
2 KNOW, I'M GUESSING, WE KNOW -- BUT, PEOPLE CAN'T AFFORD HOMES
3 HERE, SO THEY HAVE THE SOUL CRUSHING COMMUTE, AND NOW WE'RE
4 TACKLING ON, FOR GOOD REASON, AN ADDITIONAL FUND -- OR COST TO
5 THEM. SO, I THINK WE NEED TO BE AWARE OF, IF YOU HAVE THAT
6 DATA, IT WOULD BE VERY INTERESTING. I NOTICED WE'RE ACTUALLY -
7 - YOU CAN GET A FASTRAK OUT IN TRACY, TURLOCK, WAY DOWN THERE,
8 THERE IS A COUPLE LOCATIONS, BUT I WOULD BE INTERESTED NA THAT
9 DATA, AS WELL. BECAUSE I DO THINK THE EQUITY DIFFERENTIAL IS
10 IMPACTED BY OUTSIDE OUR REGION. AND I THINK THAT'S VERY
11 IMPORTANT. SO, AS WE PROGRESS, AND AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ SAID
12 HERE, LIKE, ONE PICTURE -- [LAUGHTER] -- SOMETHING. AND, NO.
13 NOBODY'S GOING TO BE LOOKING UNDER THE BRIDGE. YOU MIGHT WANT
14 TO LEAD WITH YOUR CUTE LITTLE TROLL THAT SOMEBODY SNUCK UNDER
15 ONE [LAUGHTER] BUT REALLY SHOWING, AND NOBODY HAS ANY IDEA OF
16 THE COST OF PAINT AND STUFF LIKE THAT, BUT IT HAS TO BE
17 PRESENTED HERE. BUT YOU DO HAVE TO EMPHASIZE. THIS IS JUST
18 PRESERVATION IN ORDER SO WE DON'T HAVE TO REBUILD THEM ALL.
19 YEAH, I MEAN, THAT HAS TO BE -- WHAT DID THE COST -- THE BAY
20 BRIDGE, JUST ONE SECTION, THE OVERALL COST THERE? I DO BELIEVE
21 WE ARE HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION FOR THE RIGHT REASONS
22 HERE, BUT WE HAVE TO GET THE COMMUNITY BUY-IN, AND YOU HAVE TO
23 MAKE THE FASSTRAKS EASIER. SO TELL ME THIS, IF I GO INTO THE
24 WALGREENS WITH THE OLD VERSION, ARE THEY GOING TO TAKE MY OLD
25 TRANSPONDER AND GIVE ME A NEW ONE?



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **DEREK HANSEL:** I THINK YOU WOULD HAVE TO MAIL THAT IN, BUT THEY
3 CAN CERTAINLY GIVE YOU A NEW ONE. PARTNERSHIPS WITH THE
4 RETAILERS IS AN INTERESTING SPACE, RIGHT? BECAUSE, YOU KNOW,
5 YES, WE GIVE THEM A LITTLE BIT OF MONEY TO DO THIS. WE DON'T
6 GIVE THEM SO MUCH MONEY THAT IT'S A GOOD BUSINESS PROPOSITION
7 FOR THEM. RIGHT? THEY'RE REALLY DOING THAT AS A CUSTOMER
8 SERVICE THING, YOU KNOW, CUSTOMER SUPPORT THING. THAT DOESN'T
9 MEAN WE'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO BE DOING MORE, AND WE WILL BE DOING
10 MORE. RIGHT? BUT WE NEED TO KIND OF LEAD WITH THAT WITH THESE
11 FOLKS HAVING THEM UNDERSTAND THAT THIS IS A WAY THAT THEY CAN
12 SUPPORT THEIR CUSTOMERS. IT'S NOT A PROFIT CENTER FOR THEM.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** SO, BUT IT DOES BRING PEOPLE IN. THEY'RE GOING TO
15 BUY THAT MAGAZINE. THEY'RE GOING TO BUY THAT CHAPSTICK,
16 WHATEVER, BY THE COUNTER. AGAIN. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A FORMER
17 PLAN HERE.

18

19 **DEREK HANSEL:** SURE.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** IF I HAVE AN OLD TRANSPONDER, ARE YOU GOING TO
22 SEND ME AN ENVELOPE THAT I CAN SEND IT IN?

23

24 **DEREK HANSEL:** YES.

25



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CALIFORNIA IS ACTUALLY ONE OF THE ONLY STATES
2 THAT REQUIRES INTEROPERABILITY FOR ITS TOLL SYSTEMS IN
3 CALIFORNIA YOU CAN GET A FASTRAK ANYWHERE IN THE STATE IT'S
4 USABLE ON OUR BRIDGES AND WE HAVE BACK OFFICE DEAL WITH ALL
5 THE OTHER OPERATORS TO SHARE PAYMENT REGARDLESS OF WHO IS YOUR
6 CUSTOMER THE BAY AREA GOES ONE STEP FURTHER WE HAVE ONE
7 CUSTOMER SERVICE FOR ALL TOP OPERATORS WE HAVE IN THE REGION
8 WE'RE ALSO WELL CONNECTED WITH OUR FRIENDS IN SACRAMENTO AND
9 SAN JOAQUIN WHO ARE IN THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPING TOLL PROGRAMS
10 FOR THEIR CONGESTION FREEWAYS ENTERING THE REGION PREVIOUS
11 SLIDES DEREK HAS SHOWN SHOW THE POPULATION OF PEOPLE THAT ARE
12 COMING FROM OUTSIDE THE REGION AND WHERE THEY'RE CONCENTRATED
13 AND FRANKLY SAME KINDS OF ANALYSIS DOING FOR EQUITY PRIORITY
14 COMMUNITIES WE'RE DOING THERE SO WE'RE GETTING BETTER IN THAT
15 DATA SPACE WE USED TO BORE YOU WITH ALL THE STATISTICS ON HOW
16 NEW FASTRAK CUSTOMERS GROW OVER TIME AND WE SHOULD START TO DO
17 DISCRIMINATELY, WE FIND A CONSIDERABLE AMOUNT OF PEOPLE DO
18 JOIN EVERY MONTH IT MOVES THE NEEDLE IN A VERY LITTLE WAY.
19 DEREK MENTIONED TO KEEP RETAILERS INTERESTED IN THE BUSINESS
20 IT'S A GREAT BUSINESS MODEL BUT SMALLER PORTION OF IT I'M
21 SAYING IT'S IDENTIFIED THAT A LOT OF WAYS TO GET THE TURN OUT
22 TO BE THE MOST EFFECTIVE WAY WHEN IT COMES TO MANAGEMENT OF
23 NEW TAG WE'LL SEND YOU A NEW TAG FIRST THEN SENDS YOU AN
24 ENVELOPE TO SEND THE OLD ONE BACK BECAUSE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE
25 IT GETS PROPOSED PROPERLY.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** RETAILERS DON'T GET MUCH OUT OF THIS BUT YOU HAVE
3 SOME FABULOUS PEOPLE THAT GO OUT TO COMMUNITY EVENTS I HAVE
4 SEEN THEM AT MINE, INDIVIDUALS COME UP AND, HOW CAN I GET MY -
5 - YOU CAN GIVE THEM NEW ONES RIGHT I MEAN THERE IS A SECTION
6 OF THE POPULATION THEY'RE OUT THERE THEY'RE GOING TO STOP AT
7 YOUR BOOTH.

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE'RE PUTTING THAT OUT THERE WE'LL COME BACK
10 TO YOU.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** AND THE PEOPLE THAT ARE WORKING YOUR BOOTHS WOULD
13 LOVE IT TOO BECAUSE THEY JUST KEEP GETTING ASKED THE SAME
14 QUESTIONS WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION FOR THE RIGHT
15 REASONS MESSAGING IS GOING TO BE KEY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. TO LISTEN TO COMMISSION
20 ARE PAPAN SAY A BUNCH OF TEENAGE GIRLS ARE GOING TO BE GETTING
21 MAGAZINES AND CHAPSTICK AND WE ENCOURAGE THEM TO GET ON THE
22 ROADS. POINT WELL TAKEN I WANT TO REITERATE A COUPLE OF POINTS
23 THAT MORE THAN ONE PERSON BROUGHT UP, TO THE DEGREE THAT WE
24 CAN HAVE CUSTOMER-FACING ACCESSIBLE WAYS FOR PEOPLE TO GET
25 THESE TAGS ASSUMING THAT IF YOU DID, PEOPLE WHO ARE STRUGGLING



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO PAY THIS IN A WAY THAT DOESN'T CAUSE
2 FRICTION AND PEOPLE ARE GETTING WHO NEED TO GET THESE NOT ON
3 THE INTERNET THERE'S PROBABLY SIGNIFICANT OVERLAP OF FOLKS
4 WHILE WE DO GREAT PENETRATION ON THE INTERNET I THINK WE NEED
5 TO EMPHASIZE THE BRICK AND MORTAR I WOULD BE INTERESTED TO
6 KNOW THE MECHANICS OF OUTREACH. ONE OF THE BIGGEST, I HAD TO
7 MAIL TO MTC, OR COME INTO THE BUILDING AT MTC, AND WE'RE LIKE,
8 ISN'T IT A PRETTY BUILDING BUT PEOPLE DON'T CARE ABOUT OUR
9 ARCHITECTURE. MAKING SURE WALGREENS HAS THE ENVELOPE, WOULD BE
10 HELPFUL. A GREAT MAJORITY OF FOLKS PAY TO CROSS THE BEST OF MY
11 KNOWLEDGE WOULD PROBABLY BE IN THIS POSITION. HAVING TO RAISE
12 TOLLS REALLY PUNISHES FOLKS WHO ARE DOING THE RIGHT THING. AND
13 I WANT TO GIVE A SECOND TO COMMISSIONER RONEN'S REQUEST ABOUT
14 THE DIFFERENTIAL PRICING, FOR FOLKS WHO MIGHT STRUGGLE TO BE
15 COMPLIANT WITH THE LAW AND SLICING AND DICING TO GET TO SUBSET
16 OF THE POPULATION THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO REACH. THANK YOU FOR
17 YOUR WORK.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WANT TO SAY TO LEAN IN ON HILARY'S POINT AND I
22 APOLOGIZE, I DIDN'T WANT TO DO THIS BUT WHAT WE ASKED FOR AT
23 THE LAST MEETING WAS LOOKING AT BEHAVIORAL ECONOMICS FOR ALL
24 THE WAYS THAT WE BILL PEOPLE FOR SERVICES. AND THE OTHER THING
25 WE ASKED ABOUT WAS WHETHER OR NOT IT MADE SENSE TO HAVE SOME



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 CASH LINES STILL. AND I STILL AM INTERESTED. AND I THINK,
2 ACTUALLY, I THINK IT WAS VICTORIA WHOEVER'S TALKING ABOUT
3 HAVING THE MACHINES THERE, OFF TO THE SIDE, LIKE, RIGHT WHEN
4 PEOPLE NEED THEM. AND I THINK WE -- AND I DON'T REMEMBER WHOSE
5 GREAT IDEA IT WAS, BUT WE ASKED FOR THAT TO COME BACK AS WE'RE
6 GOING TO BE MAKING THESE BIG DECISIONS AND WHAT I WAS
7 CONCERNED ABOUT, I DIDN'T HEAR WHEN YOU WOULD BE RESPONDING
8 BACK TO HILARY'S REQUEST, BUT, FRANK LIE, WE ASKED THESE
9 QUESTIONS AT THE LAST MEETING, AND ARE WE GOING TO HAVE SOME
10 MORE OF YOUR THINKING ABOUT HOW WE CAN PUSH THE ENVELOPE
11 BEFORE WE -- THE DECISION IS MADE IN DECEMBER?

12

13 **DEREK HANSEL:** RIGHT. SO, FIRST ON THE ISSUE OF BEHAVIORAL
14 ECONOMICS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE LOOKED AT IT, WE HAVE HAD
15 DISCUSSIONS, I THINK, WITH A FEW DIFFERENT COMMISSIONERS ABOUT
16 THIS. FUNDAMENTALLY, WE THINK THAT THE TWO PRIMARY DRIVERS OF
17 WHY PEOPLE WOULD CHOOSE TO GET INTO FASTRAK, AS OPPOSED TO
18 SOMETHING ELSE, ARE GOING TO BE TIME AND MONEY. SO, THE TOLL
19 DIFFERENTIAL, CERTAINLY, IS PROBABLY GOING TO BE THE BIGGEST
20 SINGLE THING WE CAN DO, FRANKLY, TO DRIVE THAT FASTRAK
21 PENETRATION ONCE WE HAVE MADE IT FULLY AVAILABLE TO FOLKS.
22 RIGHT? SO, WE HAVE GOT TO DO THAT. BUT THEN, YOU KNOW, WE
23 THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE THE CASE. THE OTHER THING, YOU KNOW,
24 AGAIN, WHEN I BRING UP TIME, YOU KNOW, I HAVE TOLD SEVERAL
25 FOLKS THIS STORY, WHEN I SIGNED UP FOR EASY PASS BACK ON THE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 EAST COAST, I REMEMBER EXACTLY WHEN I DID IT. I WAS IN A LONG
2 LINE FOR CASH PAYING ON THE NEW JERSEY PIKE, AND LOOKING AT
3 PEOPLE WHIZZING BY ME GOING THROUGH EASY PASS LANES AND THEY
4 HAD A BIG SIGN GET EASY PASS, WITH THE PHONE NUMBER AND I
5 CALLED FROM THE CAR. I WASN'T GOING TO DO THAT AGAIN. NOW THAT
6 WE'RE IN THE SPACE OF ELECTRONIC TOLLING WE DON'T HAVE THE
7 SAME TIME INCENTIVE SO THAT CONVENIENCE FACTOR, NOT HAVING TO
8 DEALING WITH THE INVOICE PAYMENT YOU KNOW, GEE I HAVE SET IT
9 UP LOAD ON MY CREDIT CARD IT'S CONVENIENT, AGAIN BIGGEST FROM
10 A BEHAVIORAL ECONOMICS PERSPECTIVE --

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** DERRICK, I JUST THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A WRITTEN
13 EXPLANATION ABOUT HOW WE'RE PROCEEDING WHAT WE'RE CONSIDERING
14 UNDER WHAT TERMS AND CONDITIONS WE'RE GOING TO CONSIDER IT.
15 FRANKLY WE HAVE BEEN HAVING THIS DISCUSSION ON THE BOARD ABOUT
16 HOW WE MAKE THINGS MORE ACCESSIBLE TO THE CUSTOMER, HOW WE'RE
17 DEALING WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME AND THERE IS A LOT OF
18 ACTIVITY HAPPENING IN THE AGENCY AND I THINK IT WOULD BENEFIT
19 THE BOARD TO UNDERSTAND FROM THE STAFF LEADING ON THAT WORK
20 HOW THAT WORK IS BEING INTEGRATED INTO ALL THE DIFFERENT AREAS
21 THAT WE'RE PROVIDING SERVICES AND WHAT IS AND ISN'T BEING
22 CONSIDERED. THE THING I WAS GOING EXPLAIN ABOUT THE CASH LANE
23 IS WE STILL HAVE SOME PEOPLE WHO ARE -- YOU KNOW, HAVE A
24 DIFFICULTY BANKING. AND WHO ARE COMING FROM OTHER PLACES. AND
25 IT'S HARD FOR ME TO BELIEVE THAT THERE WOULDN'T BE AN



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO, AT A LOWER LEVEL, JUST BE ABLE TO
2 COLLECT CASH AND, YOU KNOW, FRANKLY, WE HAVE TALKED A LITTLE
3 BIT ABOUT THE SAFETY ON THE BRIDGES TOO, WE DON'T HAVE HUMAN
4 BEINGS ON THEM ANYMORE, AND THE IMPLICATIONS OF THAT RELATIVE
5 TO OTHER ACTIVITIES WE HAVE DISCUSSED. SO, I THINK, IF THIS --
6 WHAT WOULD BE GREAT IS FOR THE STAFF JUST TO COME BACK WITH A
7 LIST OF ALL THE THINGS THAT ARE BEING CONSIDERED IN A NUMBER
8 OF DIFFERENT AREAS, EXPLAIN IF THERE IS CONFLICT WITH LAW OR
9 STRATEGY SO JUST THAT THE BOARD -- BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE WE KIND
10 OF DANCE AROUND THIS. AND WE KNOW YOU'RE TRYING TO DO YOUR
11 BEST, BUT WE DON'T UNDERSTAND, NECESSARILY, ALL THE AREAS THAT
12 ARE BEING CONSIDERED, AND, FRANKLY, WE HAD SOME PROBLEMS EARLY
13 ON, EVEN WITH OUR PARTNER AGENCY CONDUENT BEING ABLE TO
14 INTEGRATE SOME OF THE IDEAS THAT ARE IMPORTANT. I UNDERSTAND
15 LONG-TERM IF WE HAVE GOT THE RIGHT PARTNERS AND I'M SURE OTHER
16 COLLEAGUES WILL BE CURIOUS ABOUT THAT AS WELL. AND COLLEAGUES,
17 THANK YOU. I APOLOGIZE FOR DOUBLE DIPPING BUT I DIDN'T WANT TO
18 MISS OPPORTUNITY TO REINFORCE WHAT HILARY AND VICTORIA ARE
19 TALKING ABOUT AND FRANKLY TO SAY LET'S GET THE BOARD STUDY
20 REPORT AND SAYS ALL THE THINGS WE'RE CONSIDERING HERE IS WHAT
21 YEAR NOT CONSIDERING AND SOMETHING JUST SO EVERYBODY
22 UNDERSTANDS THAT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

25



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** I WAS NOT GOING TO SAY ANYTHING BUT FEEL LIKE I
2 SHOULD WEIGH IN. FIRST OF ALL IT WAS MY IDEA ABOUT HAVING
3 FASTRAKS FOR SALE AT THE SIDE OF THE TOLL PLAZA AND I WANT TO
4 COMMEND STAFF FOR GOING THROUGH ANALYSIS EXPLAINING WHY IT'S
5 FAR TOO DANGEROUS TO DO THAT. I'M SORRY THAT THE REST OF THE
6 COMMISSION ACTUALLY -- I PERSONALLY WANT WAS SATISFIED AND
7 WANT TO COMMEND YOU FOR YOUR RESPONSIVENESS, SO THANK YOU. AND
8 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ THEY DID RESPOND TO ME VERY TIMELY WITH A
9 THOROUGH ANALYSIS. I WAS JUST IN ROCHESTER, NEW YORK. I HAVE
10 ANOTHER THING TO SHOW YOU THAT THEY DO THERE. I DO -- AND THIS
11 KIND OF GOES A BIT WITH MY COMMENTS AT OUR LAST MEETING --
12 WE'RE NOT GOING TO SOLVE POVERTY AND INCOME AND INEQUALITY
13 THROUGH A BAY BRIDGE TOLL PROGRAM. AND MAYBE I HAVE BEEN
14 LISTENING TO TOO MUCH EZRA KLEIN, AND I'M WORRIED ABOUT OUR
15 EVERYTHING BAGEL PROBLEM, AND IF ANYBODY WANTS A COPY OF THAT
16 EPISODE, I WILL SEND IT TO YOU. BECAUSE I THINK AS GOOD
17 PROGRESSIVE LIBERALS, IT'S ACTUALLY A GOOD THING FOR US TO
18 THINK ABOUT. THE BUT I THINK WHAT YOU'RE HEARING IS YOU HEAR A
19 HUGE VALUE OF EQUITY FROM THIS COMMISSION, AND YOU'RE HEARING
20 A SENSE THAT WE'RE NOT SEEING ENOUGH TANGIBLE SOLUTIONS. AND,
21 SO, TO AVOID WHAT I THINK IS ACTUALLY PROBABLY NOT A GOOD BANG
22 FOR THE BUCK OF US TRYING TO, YOU KNOW, SQUEEZE AN EQUITY --
23 WHAT? BLOOD OUT OF A TURNIP, OR SOMETHING -- IN EVERY SINGLE
24 PRESENTATION THAT YOU'RE BRINGING US TO, IS IF YOU MADE US
25 FEEL LIKE THERE WAS A COMPREHENSIVE PLAN IN PLACE -- AND



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 PERHAPS THE ANSWER IS, LOOK, WE SHOULD STOP TRYING TO ADDRESS
2 INCOME INEQUALITY THROUGH OUR TOLL PROGRAM AND WE SHOULD RAISE
3 THE MINIMUM WAGE AND WE SHOULD REQUIRE EMPLOYERS THAT HAVE
4 SERVICE INDUSTRY EMPLOYERS TO PURCHASE BUS PASSES AND BART
5 PASSES OR SOMETHING, I MEAN I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE SOLUTION IS,
6 BUT I'M WORRIED THAT IT'S NOT THE BEST USE OF YOUR
7 ADMINISTRATIVE BANDWIDTH AND TIME AND ENERGY TO BE LOOKING AT
8 AN EQUITY SOLUTION FOR EVERYTHING THAT MTC DOES AND I THINK
9 YOU WILL FIND THAT YOU WILL STOP BRINGING UP THIS IN TIME IF
10 WE WERE ENGAGED IN A MORE COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH TO THIS
11 BIGGER PROBLEM THAT WE ALL DEEPLY CARE ABOUT. I WANT TO
12 CAUTION, I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING TO SOLVE POVERTY WITH A
13 BRIDGE TOLL PROBLEM. AND YOU KNOW THIS IS AN ISSUE THAT I CARE
14 ABOUT, I'M USUALLY THE PERSON JUMPING IN AND SAYING I AGREE
15 WITH YOU. SO I JUST RAISE THAT -- OH, PLEASE DON'T. WE HAVE
16 BEEN ON THIS SUBJECT WAY TOO LONG. I WANT GOING TO SAY
17 ANYTHING, BUT SINCE THIS GOT BROUGHT UP A THIRD TIME, I WANTED
18 TO CHIME IN. YOU'RE HEARING IT'S A BIGGER PROBLEM, YOU'RE
19 GOING TO KEEP HEARING IT EVERY TIME IF WE DON'T FEEL LIKE
20 THERE IS A COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH. IS THAT RIGHT? PLEASE?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I WOULD LIKE TO GO TO THE NEXT --
23 I HAVEN'T HAD A CHANCE IN THE LINE TO SPEAK. ON THAT ISSUE, I
24 AGREE. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT THIS COMMISSION IS SO
25 MINDFUL AND THOUGHTFUL ABOUT HOW WE HELP THE DISADVANTAGED.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 AND I HAVE BEEN THINKING, AND IT WAS ACTUALLY FROM YOUR
2 QUESTION, COMMISSIONER RONEN, AND I KNOW, I THINK I GOT THE
3 EXPLANATION CORRECTLY WHEN WE HAD OUR BRIEFING ABOUT NOT BEING
4 ABLE TO CHARGE DIFFERENT FARES, I WAS THINKING -- BECAUSE WE
5 DO THE OTHER WAY, AND THEN THIS ACTUALLY TIES INTO YOUR
6 THOUGHTS, COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, ABOUT, YOU KNOW, AN OVERALL
7 PROGRAM FOR TRANSPORTATION, AND I THINK ABOUT THE OTHER
8 THINGS, LIKE, FASTRAK, YOU KNOW, EXPRESS LANES, AND EVERYTHING
9 -- TRANSIT PASSES AND WHAT NOT, BUT -- AND IT TIES INTO, ALSO,
10 JUST MY INTEREST IN GUARANTEED BASIC INCOME, BUT CAN WE BE
11 LOOKING AT A TRANSPORTATION SUBSIDY PROGRAM THAT SOMEONE CAN
12 USE FOR WHATEVER THEIR NEEDS ARE. SO, WHETHER IT BE TRANSIT
13 PASSES OR EXPRESS LANES, OR TOLLS, THAT THAT'S GREAT. SO,
14 MAYBE THAT'S HOW WE LOOK AT THIS FROM OUR MTC PERSPECTIVE,
15 INSTEAD OF DOING EVERY SINGLE PROGRAM INDIVIDUALLY AND OVERALL
16 TRANSIT DISCOUNT PROGRAM. SO, THAT WOULD BE MY ASK. AND THEN,
17 I DO AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER -- THE COMMISSIONERS WHO TALKED
18 ABOUT A WORKPLAN. AND I ASKED, YOU KNOW, WE TALKED ABOUT THAT
19 TOO, DEREK, BUT I WANT TO SEE A TIMELINE. I KNOW WE HAVE TWO
20 YEARS UNTIL WE IMPLEMENT THE ACTUAL INCREASES. SO, I WOULD
21 LIKE FOR US TO HAVE -- TO SEE A TIMELINE, A WORKPLAN AS TO HOW
22 WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE IN TERMS OF OUTREACH AND PENETRATION
23 AND, YEAH, LIKE, WHAT ARE WE GONNA DO. AND, I KNOW WE DID A
24 BRAINSTORM OF DIFFERENT IDEAS, BUT CLEARLY LOOKING AT THE MAP
25 -- LIKE, I DON'T KNOW WHY IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WE DON'T HAVE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 A WALGREENS THAT OFFER IT, BUT EVEN BEYOND THAT, WE REALLY
2 NEED TO MAKE IT TO BE ACCESS AND I BELIEVE USABLE, AND THE
3 OTHER PIECE NOT JUST BEING ABLE TO GET IT BUT THEN BEING ABLE
4 TO SIGN UP FOR IT RIGHT AWAY. AND THAT SHOULD BE DOABLE BY
5 PHONE OR MAYBE WE HAVE TO SET UP KIOSKS AT THESE PLACES. BUT,
6 GOING BACK TO YOUR COMMENT, LIKE, I DO THINK THAT WE MIGHT
7 HAVE TO SPEND SOME MONEY TO MAKE MONEY. SO IF THERE ARE
8 UPFRONT COSTS TO THAT, YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE COST
9 DIFFERENTIAL OR COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS ON THAT, WITHOUT
10 SPENDING TOO MUCH TIME ON THAT [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE I WOULD
11 RATHER JUST GET IT DONE. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A CLEAR
12 TIMELINE ON HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE. ANYONE ELSE?
13 COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY, LAST THOUGHTS HERE?

14

15 **EVELYNN TRAN:** YEAH, NO. THANK YOU. I AM DIVERTING A BIT FROM
16 FASTRAK DISCUSSION I WANT TO GO BACK TO SOMETHING I HEARD THE
17 WORD SAFETY A FEW TIMES TODAY. I DO DOUBLE DOWN OUR OR ADD TO
18 THE COMMENT FROM COMMISSIONER ARECHAVEZ ABOUT REALLY THE
19 MESSAGE ABOUT WHAT WE WANT TO DO WHY WE WANT TO DO IT AND WHY
20 IT'S IMPORTANT. BUT WE NEED TO BE ALSO VERY CLEAR THAT WE
21 DON'T CONFLATE SAFETY WITH GOOD STATES OF REPAIR. THESE ARE
22 VERY DIFFERENT THINGS. THE BRIDGES ARE SAFE IF THEY'RE NOT
23 SAFE, I WOULDN'T SITTING LEER, NONE OF US WOULD. BUT THE GOAL
24 HERE IS TO CONTINUE TO KEEP THEM SAFE AND TO CONTINUE TO KEEP



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 THEM IN GOOD STATE OF REPAIR. SO I JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT
2 PLUG. THANK YOU.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS THERE ANY
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

6

7 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE.
8 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** TWO MINUTES.

11

12 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** OKAY.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR ABE-KOGA AND MEMBERS.
15 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS,
16 REPRESENTING SKIRT FOLD. I HOPE YOU CAN HEAR ME ALL RIGHT,
17 BECAUSE I'M AT AN AIRPORT ABOUT TO GET ON AN AIRPLANE. THANK
18 YOU FOR THE DISCUSSION. I CERTAINLY WOULD LIKE A WAY TO REACH
19 OUT AND SHARE WITH YOU MY LIFE OF HOW I HAVE OPERATED IN THE
20 TOLL SPACE. BECAUSE I'M A PERSON OF EQUITY PRIORITY
21 COMMUNITIES, AND I'M IN SUPPORT OF A DIFFERENTIAL PROGRAM.
22 BECAUSE AS A PERSON WHO IS IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY, AND
23 REALLY A FACE OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY, FASTRAK
24 DIFFERENTIAL WOULD BENEFIT ME IF I HAD A CAR, AND I WAS USING
25 A TRANSPONDER. SO, I THINK I'M HEARING THINGS THAT WORK. AND I



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 HOPE THAT YOUR AGREEMENT WOULD BE UNANIMOUS. I REALLY DO THINK
2 THAT WE HAVE TO HAVE THIS TOLL INCREASE. AND IT'S VERY RARE
3 THAT I SUPPORT A TOLL INCREASE, BECAUSE, REALLY, THE ONLY
4 TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT I HAVE SUPPORTED THE TOLL INCREASE ON HAS
5 BEEN NEW YORK. BECAUSE THE SUBWAY NEEDS IT REALLY BAD. AND I
6 APPRECIATE YOUR MENTIONING OF YOUR TRIP TO NEW YORK, AND I
7 HOPE THAT YOU GOT TO DO BRIDGES. I DO BRIDGES ON THE BUS
8 SOMETIMES, AND I HOW MUCH YOU GOT TO SEE THE SUBWAY, I'VE USED
9 SINCE 1970. BUT I HAVE BEEN DOING ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING SINCE
10 1991 IN OKLAHOMA AND IT'S ACTUALLY REALLY EASY TO USE EVEN
11 WITHOUT THE INTERNET. SO, I CAN DO THESE THINGS AND DO THEM
12 VERY EASILY, EVEN GIVEN THE SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE. I THINK WE
13 SHOULD, OF COURSE, DO MORE. BUT I APPRECIATE THAT I THINK THAT
14 YOUR AGENCY HAS TAKEN, REALLY, THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF
15 TRANSPARENCY IN ADVOCATING FOR THIS TOLL INCREASE. THE BRIDGES
16 HAVE TO BE KEPT IN A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR, BECAUSE THAT'S HOW
17 YOU KEEP THE BRIDGES SAFE. SO, I THINK WE'RE DOING SOME GOOD
18 THINGS. AND WE HAVE TO MAKE THE CASE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE?

21

22 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE. NO
23 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED, AND NO MEMBER IN THE
24 BOARDROOM.

25



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SO, THIS IS AN
2 INFORMATION ITEM. I BELIEVE THAN IT WILL COME BACK TO US. BUT,
3 WITH THAT, IF YOU COULD PLEASE -- IS IT, IF YOU COULD BRING
4 BACK THE REQUESTED ITEMS, THE WORKPLAN, AND OTHERS, THAT WOULD
5 BE GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WILL MOVE ON, NOW, TO AGENDA
6 ITEM 6B, AND, ALSO, INFORMATION ITEM ON THE HIGH-OCCUPANCY
7 VEHICLE POLICY CHANGE FOR BATA BRIDGES. AND WE HAVE MR. PETER
8 LEE. WELCOME.

9

10 **PETER LEE:** WELCOME COMMISSIONERS. PETER LEE, BATA STAFF, A
11 PRESENTATION ON THE PROPOSED CHANGES FOR OUR HIGH-OCCUPANCY
12 VEHICLE POLICIES ON THE TOLL BRIDGES. HERE TODAY TO SEEK YOUR
13 INPUT BECAUSE WE WOULD LIKE TO IMPLEMENT THESE POLICIES ALONG
14 WITH THE TOLL INCREASE AS DEREK SAID EARLIER. NEXT SLIDE. SO,
15 THIS IS NOT OUR FIRST TIME BRINGING THESE PROPOSED POLICY
16 CHANGES TO THE BOARD. WE WERE HERE BACK IN MAY OF 2023 WITH AN
17 INITIAL PRESENTATION. SO OUR GOAL HERE TODAY IS TO SEEK
18 ADDITIONAL INPUT SO WE CAN BRING IT BACK TO YOU AS PART OF THE
19 TOLL SCHEDULE CHANGE PROPOSAL. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THESE CHANGES
20 THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO DO ARE DRIVEN BY SOME OF THE FUTURE
21 CHANGES WE'LL HAVE WITH THE OPEN ROAD TOLLING PROGRAM THAT WE
22 HAVE. SO, THIS IS AN IMAGE OF THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE,
23 AT THE TOP, CURRENTLY WITH THE CANOPY, AND THE TOLL BOOTH, AND
24 WHAT YOU SEE BELOW IS THE FUTURE CONDITION FOR OPEN ROAD
25 TOLLING. SO WHAT WE'RE DOING AT THE BRIDGES IS WE'RE TAKING



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 OUT THE CANOPY, TAKING OUT THE BOOTHS AND REALIGNING THE TOLL
2 PLAZA AREAS FOR HIGH SPEED TRAVEL. SO, INSTEAD OF 25 MILES AND
3 GOING THROUGH THE BOOTHS THAT YOU'RE SUPPOSED TO GO, YOU CAN
4 GO AT HIGHWAY SPEEDS THROUGH THE TOLL PLAZA AS AND IT WILL
5 STREAMLINE OPERATIONS, ALLOW US TO REMOVE SOME OF THE BOOTHS,
6 PROVIDE SHOULDERS, MAKE IT A SAFER OPERATION IN GENERAL. BUT
7 WILL REQUIRE US TO REALIGN AND CHANGE SOME OF OUR POLICIES TO
8 MAKE SURE WE HAVE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT FLOW THROUGH THE
9 PLAZA. NEXT SLIDE. SO, ALL THE BRIDGES HAVE DEDICATED HOV
10 LANES TO PROVIDE TIME SAVINGS AND PRIORITY NOT ONLY FOR BUSES
11 BUT FOR CARPOOLS. AND THE HOV LANES WILL BE MAINTAINED WITH
12 THE OPEN ROAD TOLLING AT ALL TOLL PLAZAS. PROPOSED HOV CHANGES
13 TO THE TOLL PLAZA ARE IMPROVE SAFETY MINIMIZING SOME OF THE
14 WAVING GOING ON INCREASE OUR OVERALL PERSON THROUGHPUT AND
15 ENHANCE REGIONAL CONSISTENCY WITH OUR TOLL SCHEDULE. I'LL GO
16 THROUGH EACH ONE OF THOSE ITEMS. NEXT SLIDE. PROPOSED CHANGES
17 HERE, AND I'LL WALK THROUGH THIS SLOWLY BECAUSE IT'S SOMEWHAT
18 COMPLICATED. CURRENTLY, WE PROVIDE A TOLL DISCOUNT OF 50% FOR
19 ALL HOV THREE GOING ACROSS THE BRIDGES SO IN THE MIDDLE COLUMN
20 HOV PLUS RECEIVE 50% DISCOUNT. AT THE BOTTOM MIDDLE COLUMN AT
21 THE DUMBARTON SAN MATEO HAYWARD BRIDGES, WERE GRANDFATHERED AT
22 A TIME HOV DISCOUNT FOR TWO PEOPLE IN THE CAR SAN MATEO
23 CURRENTLY RECEIVE 50% DISCOUNT ALSO. PROPOSING FOR THE
24 REGIONAL CONSISTENCY MAKE THREE PLUS AT ALL THE BRIDGES AT 50%
25 PROVIDE HOV TWO SO YOU HAVE TO PEOPLE IN YOUR CAR INTO THE



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 LANES AT THE BRIDGES BUT ALL THE BRIDGES BAY BRIDGE ANTIOCH,
2 BENICIA RICHMOND, DUMBARTON AND SAN MATEO HAYWARD WE WOULD
3 ALLOW TWO PLUS INTO THE LANE BECAUSE WE HAVE CAPACITY IN THOSE
4 LANES TO ALLOW FOR THOSE HOV TWOS TO ENTER INTO THAT LANE TO
5 GET SOME TIME SAVINGS NOT THE TOTAL DISCOUNT BUT TIME SAVINGS
6 WE WOULD ACCOMPLISH THAT BY REQUIRING USERS TO HAVE FASTRAK TO
7 BE IN THE DESIGNATED LANE AS WELL AS SWITCHER TAG
8 APPROPRIATELY TO THE THREE OR TWO POSITION IN THE FASTER LANE
9 SO THIS IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE HAVE AT EXPRESS LANES WHERE
10 YOU DESIGNATE YOUR OCCUPANCY YOUR EXPRESS LANES. NEXT SLIDE.
11 PRIMARY REASONS WE WE'RE ASKING FOR THIS RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL
12 PROJECT GOING TO CONVERT GENERAL PURPOSE LANE FROM THE TOLL
13 PLAZA ON THE LEFT BACK TO THE REGATTA APPROXIMATELY THREE
14 MILES FOUR MILES OF HIGHWAY, BACK TO HOV LANE CURRENTLY WHEN
15 WE FINISH WITH THE PROJECT FOUR PROJECT AS WELL AS OPEN ROAD
16 TOLLING IS GOING TO PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT SAVINGS BOTH IN
17 GENERAL PUBLIC AS WELL AS HOV 2 AND 3 PEOPLE IN THE LANE
18 CURRENTLY JUST NOT ENOUGH DEMAND IN THE HOV THREE NUMBERS TO
19 NOT IMPACT OVERALL GENERAL TRAFFIC SO WE'RE TO OPEN IT TODAY
20 SO WE NEED THIS CHANGE TO ALLOW TWOS BUILD UP CAPACITY IN HOV
21 LANE THEN OVERALL CONGESTION SHOULD BE REDUCED WITH MOST
22 BENEFIT GOING TO THE LANE. NEXT SLIDE. A TABLE SHOWING HOV
23 LANE BASICALLY ALL BRIDGES BUT THE BAY BRIDGE WHERE WE HAVE
24 HIGH-LEVEL OF HOV THREE USAGE ALLOWING HOF TWOS INTO THE LANE
25 SHOULD NOT RESULT IN ADDITIONAL CONGESTION IN THE HOV SOME



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 ADDITIONAL CONGESTION IN THE HOV LANE AROUND LETTING MORE CARS
2 IN BUT WOULD TAKE CARS OUT OF THE GENERAL PURPOSE LANE OVERALL
3 INCREASE PERSON THROUGHPUT SHOULD REDUCE SOME TRIPS ACROSS THE
4 BRIDGE. LASTLY ENHANCE REGIONAL CONSISTENCY WE ARE PROPOSING
5 DISCOUNT AT ALL OF THE BRIDGES THAT WILL BE A CHANGE AT
6 DUMBARTON SAN MATEO WHERE THEY CURRENTLY RECEIVE DISCOUNTS,
7 PROVIDING MAXIMUM BENEFIT TO THE HIGHEST OCCUPANCY VEHICLES,
8 PROVIDING DISCOUNTS FOR THOSE CARRYING MOST OCCUPANTS IN THE
9 CAR THEN ALLOWING HOV TWOS RECEIVING TIME SAVINGS AT LEAST ON
10 BRIDGES AS COMPARED, AND CONSISTENT WITH OUR AGENCY'S POLICY.
11 NEXT SLIDE. PROPOSED TIMING FOR THIS HOV CHANGE AS WELL AS
12 TOLL SCHEDULE CHANGE IS TO ALIGN WITH RICHMOND FORWARD
13 PROJECT. WE HOPE TO HAVE COMPLETED IN EARLY 2026 SO WE
14 PROPOSED TO IMPLEMENT THIS POLICY ALONG WITH THE TOLL INCREASE
15 APPROVAL MAKE THIS EFFECTIVE FIRST OF JANUARY 2026. NEXT
16 SLIDE. AND, SO, THE NEXT SERIES OF SLIDES ARE SIMILAR TO WHAT
17 DEREK HAD IN HIS PRESENTATION TO THE TOLL INCREASE. WE'RE HERE
18 TO SOLICIT YOUR INPUT AND YOUR FEEDBACK ON THE POLICY AND WE
19 WILL RETURN BACK IN OCTOBER BATA MEETING AS WELL AS THE
20 NOVEMBER TO SEEK THE TOLL SCHEDULE CHANGE FOR THESE POLICY
21 CHANGES. SO, NEXT SLIDE. AND, AGAIN, THIS IS THE SAME SCHEDULE
22 THAT DEREK HAS SHOWN AS PART OF THE TOLL INCREASE TIMELINE. WE
23 WOULD SPEND ALL OF 2025 MAKING MODIFICATIONS AND PREPARING
24 OURSELVES FOR THIS CHANGE. EFFECTIVE DATE OF JANUARY 1, 2026.
25 NEXT SLIDE. THAT MIGHT BE IT. OKAY. I THINK THAT IS THE LAST



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, STAFF HERE TO RESPOND AND GET YOUR INPUT OR
2 FEEDBACK ON THE PROPOSAL.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS OR
5 COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. THAT DEFINITELY AFFECTS ARE THE BRIDGES
8 IN MY AREA HERE. IT KIND OF COMPLICATES THE CONNECTIONS WITH
9 THE EXPRESS LANES. SO, SAN MATEO COUNTY, JPA OFFERS A 50%
10 DISCOUNT FOR HOV TWO, ALAMEDA OFFERS 100% DISCOUNT FOR THEIR
11 HOV TWO, AND THE I80. SO, THE QUESTION I HAVE BEEN GIVEN HERE,
12 POTENTIALLY AN HOV VEHICLE WOULD BE ABLE TO TRAVEL WITH 100%
13 DISCOUNT ON THE I80, AND THE BRIDGE TOLL THEN ON SAN MATEO,
14 THEY WOULD ONLY RECEIVE -- OH, ACTUALLY, THEY WOULDN'T, HOV
15 TWO -- NO DISCOUNT BUT THEY COULD USE THE LANE. OKAY. DO WE
16 HAVE ANY IDEA THE DATA THAT SUPPORTS INCREASING THE COST ON
17 CARPOOLS AS A RESULT OF THIS? I MEAN, BECAUSE WE HAVE GOT OUR
18 TDMS AND THE GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS. DO WE KNOW WHAT THE
19 IMPACT WOULD BE?

20

21 **PETER LEE:** I WOULD HAVE TO LOOK THAT UP. BUT WE DO FIND ON OUR
22 LAST MANUAL COUNT THAT MOST PEOPLE IN THE HOV LANE AT
23 DUMBARTON SAN MATEO ARE HOV TWO, NOT THREE.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** WE HAVE A SMALLER BRIDGE.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **PETER LEE:** BUT WE CAN PULL THAT UP, COMMISSIONER.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** BUT I DO THINK THE IMPACT ON CARPOOLS IS
5 IMPORTANT. SO, IT'S GOING TO BE SOME INCONSISTENCY AND IT'S
6 GOING TO HIT PEOPLE'S BOTTOM LINE.

7

8 **PETER LEE:** YES.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** SO IF WE CAN GET THAT DATA IT WOULD BE HELPFUL.
11 BECAUSE AGAIN I THINK WE HAVE ALREADY STUDIED THE IMPACT OF
12 THOSE TWO BRIDGES FROM THE OUTSIDE REGION AND THE COMMUTE
13 PATTERNS COMING FROM WELL OUTSIDE OUR REGION. SO, I WOULD BE
14 CURIOUS TO SEE THAT INFORMATION, PLEASE. THANK YOU.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?
17 YES, COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, THANK YOU FOR THIS. I WANT TO COMMEND
20 YOU FOR THIS GRAPHIC ON THE CURRENT TOLL BRIDGE HOV POLICY,
21 THIS ONE HERE. WHAT WOULD BE SUPER HELPFUL IS IF YOU DID
22 ANOTHER ONE WITH PROPOSED CHANGES SO WE COULD -- I'M A PRETTY
23 VISUAL PERSON, SO YOU COULD DO ONE -- DID YOU DO THAT?

24

25 **PETER LEE:** THAT'S THE FAR RIGHT COLUMN.



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** OH FAR RIGHT. VISUALLY NOW IT'S MAKING SENSE
3 THAT YOU SAID THAT. THE OTHER THING IS THE REASON THAT YOU
4 DON'T RECOMMEND A FULL TOLL FOR TWO --

5

6 **PETER LEE:** THE TOP BAY BRIDGE WE'RE NOT PROPOSING ANY CHANGE,
7 IT'S TO A CERTAIN DEGREE IT'S WELL SUBSCRIBED BASICALLY A FULL
8 LANE OF TRAFFIC RIGHT NOW ON THE BAY BRIDGE RIGHT NOW HOV, AND
9 PROBABLY NOT MORE CAPACITY. IT WOULD BE WELL OVERSUBSCRIBED.

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** TIME SAVINGS FOR THE HOV TWO IN THE ONES,
12 THE BRIDGE IN THE ANTIOCH DESTINATION RICHMOND.

13

14 **PETER LEE:** THERE IS LITTLE BECAUSE THE BRIDGES ARE UP IN THE
15 NORTH BAY AND THERE IS REVERSE COMMUTE THERE'S ACTUALLY QUITE
16 A BIT OF CAPACITY FOR PEOPLE TO MOVE INTO.

17

18 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I'M JUST MINDFUL RESPECTING OUR CUSTOMERS
19 AND ACHIEVING OUR POLICY GOALS AND I THINK THIS IS A PRETTY
20 GOOD WAY TO DO IT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
23 ITEM?

24



OCTOBER 9, 2024

1 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE NOR
2 BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. IF THERE ARE NO OTHER
5 COMMENTS, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL CLOSE THIS ITEM. AND
6 GOING TO ITEM SEVEN PUBLIC COMMENTS ARE THERE MEMBERS OF THE
7 PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON NON-AGENDAIZED ITEMS.

8

9 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WE DOES RECEIVE A WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
10 FROM A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, CHRISTOPHER BUENA, AND IT WAS
11 POSTED ONLINE AND INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET BUT NO FURTHER
12 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM OR ONLINE.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GREAT THANK YOU. WE'LL CLOSE
15 PUBLIC COMMENT GO TO AGENDA ITEM EIGHT ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT
16 MEETING THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY
17 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE METRO
18 CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO WEDNESDAY NOVEMBER 13TH,
19 2024. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE
20 PUBLIC. AND WE ARE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]

21



NTT

Broadcasting Government