

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 8TH, 2024, 9:45 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO
6 ORDER THE MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE.
7 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC ABAG WEBSITES.
8 COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
9 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR
10 DIAL NUMBER STAR 9, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
11 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
12 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER, AND A ROLL CALL
13 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE
14 COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION TODAY. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO
15 CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR CANEPA?

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

22

23 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER AHN? STEPPED AWAY. MEMBER CARLSON?



1

2 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE .

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI? STEPPED AWAY. MEMBER
5 ECKLUND?

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA VERNACI:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI. MEMBER
12 GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

13

14 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE .

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? THANK
17 YOU. MEMBER NOACK? MEMBER RABBITT?

18

19 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE .

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

22

23 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE .

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN?

5

6 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEMS 2A AND 2B *(1:26)

11 MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

12

13 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND, DUTRA-VERNACI.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MOTION AND SECOND. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS

18 ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

21 RECEIVED ON ANY ITEMS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. AND THERE IS NO

22 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THE ITEMS ON

23 THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ROLL CALL PLEASE. *(1:58)



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR? ARREGUIN AHN?

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

11

12 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING? TIEDEMANN? MOTION PASSES

23 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3A
2 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE UPDATE.
3 REBECCA LONG.

4

5 **REBECCA LONG:** ACTUALLY I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO OUR
6 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU REBECCA. WE HAVE A PRESENTATION
9 WE'RE GOING TO PUT UP. I WANT TO THANK REBECCA AND THERESA
10 ROMMEL AND THEIR TEAMS FOR THE WORK THEY HAVE DONE IN
11 SUPPORTING STUART, ALIX, AND MYSELF AS WE TRY TO KEEP UP WITH
12 CHAIR SPERING IN THIS EXERCISE. *(2:56) SO, GOOD MORNING. THIS
13 PRESENTATION IS GOING TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE WORK OF THE
14 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE WAS DOING.
15 WE'RE REALLY INTERESTED IN THE FEEDBACK OF THIS COMMITTEE,
16 THERE ARE QUITE A FEW ATTACHMENTS IN THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET
17 THERE ARE HANDOUTS TODAY THAT INCLUDE FEEDBACK FROM COMMITTEE
18 MEMBERS AS WELL AS BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AS RECENTLY AS
19 YESTERDAY AFTERNOON. WE WILL BE INCLUDED FORMAL FEEDBACK
20 SUPPORT TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE IN A REPORT THAT WILL BE
21 ASSEMBLED BY THE END OF THIS MONTH AND THAT WILL BE SUBMITTED
22 TO OUR FRIENDS IN SACRAMENTO. SO, APOLOGIES TO COMMISSIONERS
23 WHO HAVE LIVED THROUGH THIS, AND FOLLOWED THIS SUBJECT FOR THE
24 PAST FIVE MONTHS WE'RE DOING THIS FOR OUR ABAG DIRECTORS. I
25 WANT TO DO SOME CONTEXT SETTING FIRST. NEXT SLIDE. SO, MTC



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 CONVENED THE SELECT COMMITTEE TO HELP THE BAY AREA LEADERSHIP
2 AND STAKEHOLDERS REACH CONSENSUS ON A POTENTIAL 2026
3 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AFTER THE ENABLING LEGISLATION
4 SPONSORED BY MTC, SB1031 RAN INTO OPPOSITION, AND THE BILL
5 AUTHOR SENATOR WIENER AND WAHAB ALONG WITH MTC LEADERSHIP
6 AGREED THAT RESET WAS IN ORDER. MEMBERS MET MONTHLY FROM JUNE
7 TO OCTOBER TO CONSIDER OPTIONS AND ALTERNATIVES AND TRY TO
8 BUILD CONSENSUS FOR A MEASURE THAT COULD BE ON THE BALLOT IN
9 2026. NEXT SLIDE. THE SELECT COMMITTEE INCLUDED NINE
10 COMMISSIONERS, INCLUDING MANY OF YOU THAT ARE ON THIS
11 COMMITTEE AND SEVERAL REPRESENTATIVES OF KEY CONSTITUENCIES
12 ALONG WITH OFFICIO PARTICIPATION BY STAFF FROM SENATOR WEINER
13 AND WAHAB'S OFFICE AND LEGISLATIVE STAFF FROM TRANSPORTATION
14 COMMITTEES IN REGULAR ATTENDANCE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, BEFORE
15 DIVING INTO WHAT THE COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED, I WANTED TO REVIEW
16 A LITTLE BIT OF THE CONTEXT FOR FUNDING CRISIS THAT THE BAY
17 AREA TRANSIT SYSTEM HAS WHICH IS THE CORE PROBLEM THAT WE'RE
18 TRYING TO SOLVE WITH THIS MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, BASED ON
19 SURVEYS MTC HAS CONDUCTED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE BAY AREA
20 COUNCIL, HALF OF THE BAY AREA'S LAWYERS HAVE STAFF COMING INTO
21 THE OFFICES 2 TO 3 DAYS A WEEK WITH ONE QUARTER COMING IN 4 TO
22 5 DAYS A WEEK. SHARE OF EMPLOYERS FULLY REMOTE HAVE SETTLED IN
23 AROUND 12%. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE CHANGE IN COMMUTING HAS BEEN
24 THE DRIVING FORCE IN REALLY UNDERSTANDING THE TRANSIT
25 RIDERSHIP THROUGHOUT THE REGION. AND WHILE WE HAVE BEEN GOING



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 UPWARDS TO THE LOW POINT SINCE 2020 RIDERSHIP IS 2/3 OF WHAT
2 PRECOVID LEVELS WERE. THERE IS A GREAT DEAL OF VARIATION BY
3 OPERATOR THAT HISTORICALLY SERVE LOCAL TRIPS THAT HELP RECOVER
4 MORE QUICKLY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE CHALLENGE REALLY ISN'T JUST
5 ABOUT MOBILITY, IT'S ABOUT OUR CLIMATE GOALS THAT ALSO DEPEND
6 ON TRANSIT. AND IF YOU LOOK AT THIS CHART, SHOWS WHAT WOULD
7 HAPPEN IF WORST-CASE SCENARIOS WERE ENACTED. CUTTING SERVICE
8 TO ONE HOUR HEADWAYS REDUCES OUR GOALS BY 10%. NEXT SLIDE.
9 TRANSIT IS ALWAYS FOUNDATIONAL TO OUR HOUSING STRATEGIES AS
10 YOU KNOW, OUR REGION HAS BEEN TAKING HUGE STRIDES TO ADDRESS
11 OUR HOUSING CRISIS WITH PLANNING FOR MORE ZONE AND HOUSING TO
12 AVOID FUTURE CLOGGING OF HIGHWAYS AND REDUCING IMPACTS ON
13 CLIMATE CHANGE IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THE NUMBER OF HOMES
14 WITHIN A HALF MILE OF THE BART STATION IS PROJECTED TO MORE
15 THAN DOUBLE WITH NEARLY 70% OF NEW HOUSING BEING PROJECTED TO
16 BEING AFFORDABLE. LOCATING AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT
17 BOOSTS RIDERSHIP AND GREATLY LOWERS TRANSPORTATION COSTS FOR
18 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS BY MAKING IT EASIER TO DRIVE LESS. NEXT
19 SLIDE. *(07:20) SO, GIVEN HOW FUNDAMENTAL TRANSIT IS FOR OUR
20 GOALS, IT'S NOT SURPRISING THAT IT'S HISTORICALLY BEEN FUNDED
21 BY MANY LEVELS OF GOVERNMENT. AS SHOWN ON THE LEFT, BEFORE
22 COVID, COUNTY AND LOCAL SOURCES CONTRIBUTED NEARLY HALF OF THE
23 FUNDING PIE AND FARES CONSTITUTED MORE THAN A QUARTER OF THE
24 OVERALL FUNDING MIX. WITH THE PANDEMIC, FARES EVAPORATED, AND
25 CONGRESS, LEGISLATURE, AND MTC STEPPED UP TO BACKFILL FOR THAT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LOSS WITH VARIOUS ONE-TIME INFUSIONS OF CASH. AND OVER THE
2 LAST FEW YEARS WE HAVE SEEN NEW OPERATING FUNDING COME ONLINE
3 FROM THE LOCAL AND REGIONAL LEVELS THROUGH FARE INCREASES, NEW
4 VOTER APPROVED MEASURES AND TOLL INCREASES AT THE BRIDGES.
5 NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS WE THINK ABOUT THE FUTURE AND WHAT OUR
6 POST-PANDEMIC FINANCIAL MODEL WILL LOOK LIKE IT'S IMPORTANT TO
7 CONSIDER THAT ADDRESSING TRANSIT'S OPERATING FUNDING
8 CHALLENGES WILL LIKELY NEED TO TAP INTO A HOST OF NEW SOURCES,
9 NOT JUST ONE. A REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE WILL NOT ELIMINATE
10 THE NEED FOR INCREASED INVESTMENT AT THE LOCAL LEVEL BY
11 OPERATORS AS WELL AS ADVOCACY OF NEW FUNDS WOULD NEED TO BE
12 SUPPORTED BY FEDERAL AND STATE SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE. SO WHAT
13 DID THE COMMITTEE THEN TRY TO CREATE AS AN OUTCOME? NEXT
14 SLIDE. THE COMMITTEE EXAMINED PROBLEM MEASURES WHEN IT COMES
15 TO TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING. TWO DISTINCT APPROACHES, THE
16 BLUE BARS ON THE RIGHT PROVIDED SHORTFALLS THAT WERE PROVIDED
17 TO MTC BY THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. ESTIMATED DEFICITS OPERATORS
18 FORECASTED IN 2027 COMPRISED OF GAP BETWEEN OPERATING COST AND
19 OPERATING REVENUES AND NOW TOTAL OVER \$900 MILLION REGION-
20 WIDE. THE DARK BLUE BARS ON THE LEFT SHOW LOWER AMOUNTS AND
21 NOTE EACH OPERATOR'S GAP IN REVENUE COLLECTED BEFORE THE
22 PANDEMIC AND WHAT IS BEING COLLECTED NOW PLUS 2% ANNUAL
23 ESCALATION FACTOR TO ACCOUNT FOR RISING COST. WE CALL THIS
24 ADJUSTED FARES AND IT TOTALLED \$544 MILLION PER YEAR REGION-
25 WIDE. ADJUSTED FARES MEASURES THE FINANCIAL IMPACT OF THE LOSS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 OF RIDERSHIP POST-PANDEMIC AND IT'S EASY TO MEASURE AND
2 VERIFY. OPERATOR REPORTED SHORE FALLS INCORPORATED RISING COST
3 AND HOST QUESTIONS HOW TO VERIFY AND STANDARDIZE ACROSS
4 DIFFERENT OPERATORS. SAID THAT OPERATORS REPORTED SHORTFALLS
5 ARE LIKELY TO BE CLOSER TO THE ACTUAL OPERATING DEFICIT THAT
6 THE REGION'S TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL FACE SINCE THEY ENCOMPASS
7 THE COMPLETE BUDGET PICTURE. A MEASURE THAT FUNDS ONLY
8 ADJUSTED FARE LOSSES LEVEL, WOULD STILL REQUIRE TRANSIT
9 AGENCIES TO MAKE SHOULD REAL DIFFICULT DECISIONS ON HOW TO
10 BALANCE THEIR BUDGETS GOING FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO WITH THAT
11 CONTEXT LET'S MOVE TO FEEDBACK THAT WAS PROVIDED BY THE SELECT
12 COMMITTEE. WE ASKED THE COMMITTEE TO SCORE KEY COMPONENTS OF A
13 POTENTIAL MEASURE ON A 1 TO 5 SCALE OF GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT.
14 ON GEOGRAPHY, THERE WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR THE MEASURE TO
15 BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT IN AT LEAST THE FOUR COUNTIES OF
16 ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN MATEO, BUT
17 LETTING THE OTHER FIVE OPT IN. VERSUS REQUIRING A MEASURE TO
18 INCLUDE ALL NINE COUNTIES AS WAS DONE IN SB1031. ON DURATION,
19 THE SELECT COMMITTEE SLIGHTLY PREFERRED TEN YEARS BUT THERE
20 WAS A STRONG PREFERENCE FOR A TEN-YEAR MEASURE AMONG
21 COMMISSIONERS REPRESENTING THE COUNTIES, SANTA CLARA
22 COMMISSIONERS, ON THE OTHER HAND, PREFERRED A 30-YEAR MEASURE.
23 COMMITTEE MEMBERS, OVERALL, HAD A SLIGHT PREFERENCE FOR
24 TARGETING ADJUSTED FARES FOR OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS.
25 COMMISSIONERS, BUSINESS COMMUNITY, CONSTRUCTION, LABOR



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 REPRESENTATIVES STRONGLY PREFERRED ADJUSTED FARES WHEREAS
2 TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND TRANSIT LABOR REPRESENTATIVES FAVOR
3 OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. WITH RESPECT TO FUND SOURCE,
4 SALES TAX WAS PREFERRED OVER PARCEL TAX AND PAYROLL TAX. BUT
5 THERE WAS A LOT OF INTEREST IN A MEASURE WITH MULTIPLE SOURCES
6 AS A WAY TO GAIN MORE REVENUE THAT SPREAD THE TAX BURDEN MORE
7 BROADLY. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE FINAL MEETING, THE COMMITTEE
8 RECEIVED A PRESENTATION ON FOUR VARIATIONS OF A POTENTIAL
9 MEASURE. BUILDING ON WHAT HAD BEEN PRESENTED IN SEPTEMBER, THE
10 FOUR OPTIONS VARIED ON FUNDING SOURCE DURATION LEVEL OF
11 FUNDING OVERALL SCOPE SCENARIO 1 AND 1A FUNDED BY A HALF CENT
12 SALES TAX, WHEREAS HYBRID TERM WOULD BE FUNDED BY COMBINATION
13 OF HALF CENT SALES TAX AND EITHER A PAYROLL OR PARCEL TAX.
14 NEXT SLIDE. THE COMMITTEE RECEIVED A PRESENTATION ON
15 COMPROMISED PROPOSAL SUMMARIZED HERE THAT WAS DEVELOPED BY SAN
16 FRANCISCO MTA *(12:43) COMPRISED OF VARIABLE RATE SALES OR
17 PARCEL TAX IN THE FIVE COUNTIES SERVED BY BART. IN THIS
18 FRAMEWORK, THE SAN FRANCISCO RATE WOULD BE HIGHER THAN THE
19 OTHER FIVE COUNTIES AND THE RATE IN SANTA CLARA WOULD BE THE
20 LOWEST OF ALL COUNTIES REFLECTING THE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF
21 NEED. THAT MEASURE HAD A MINIMUM OF FIVE COUNTIES ALLOWING THE
22 NORTH BAY TO OPT IN AND THE GOAL WAS TO COVER THE FULL
23 OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. NEXT SLIDE. ON TO NEXT STEPS.
24 THE SELECT COMMITTEE RECOMMEND THAT ALL OPTIONS PLUS FRAMEWORK
25 DEVELOPED * BY SAN FRANCISCO MTA BE FURTHER EXPLORED AND



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 POLLED. HOWEVER GIVEN TIMING AND NEED TO PREPARE FORWARD NEXT
2 LEGISLATIVE SESSION CHAIR SPERING REQUESTED STAFF REVIEW THE
3 FEEDBACK RECEIVED TO DATE AND DO OUR BEST THINKING ABOUT WHAT
4 TWO PROPOSALS AND OPTIONS WE SHOULD BRING FORWARD TO THE
5 COMMISSION FOR FURTHER CONSIDERATION AND POLLING. IN ANALYZING
6 THESE RESULTS FROM THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT, EXERCISE AND
7 FROM THE GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT EXERCISE AND BASED ON INPUT
8 RECEIVED, WE BELIEVE THESE TWO OPTIONS HAVE THE BEST CHANCE OF
9 ACHIEVING THE CORE OBJECTIVES IN ACHIEVING CENSUS NEEDED AT
10 LEGISLATURE AND BALLOT. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THESE PROPOSALS DO
11 NOT YET RESOLVE CONCERNS RAISED BY SAN MATEO COUNTY ELECTED
12 OFFICIALS AND ONE WAS THE HANDOUTS PROVIDED TODAY IS A LETTER
13 EXPRESSING THESE CONCERNS. WE DO TAKE THEM SERIOUSLY AND WANT
14 TO CONTINUE TO BE PRODUCTIVE IN OUR CONVERSATIONS IN
15 NEGOTIATIONS THAT ARE NEEDED TO REACH AN AGREEMENT AMONG ALL
16 FOUR PARTICIPATING COUNTIES WHO WOULD BE INCLUDED IN SCENARIO
17 1A. NEXT SLIDE. AS SHOWN ON THIS MAP SCENARIO 1A IS PROPOSED
18 FOR COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, AND SAN
19 FRANCISCO WHICH HAVE HAD HIGHEST TRANSIT USAGE AND FACED MAJOR
20 FUNDING GAPS. IF FOCUS IS IN ON THE CORE NEED FOR MORE TRANSIT
21 FUNDING TO AVERT MAJOR CUTS AND INVEST IN TRANSIT
22 TRANSFORMATION. SANTA CLARA, SHOWN IN GREEN, WOULD BE GIVEN
23 THE OPTION TO PARTICIPATE WITH THE UNDERSTAND IF THEY CHOOSE
24 NOT TO, THEY WOULD STILL BE FUNDING THEIR A SHARE OF BART'S
25 OPERATING COSTS TO VTA AGREEMENT AND THEY WOULD BE EXPECTED TO



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PROVIDE NEW FUNDING FOR CALTRAIN AND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.
2 NEXT SLIDE. I'M SORRY. I STILL HAVE MORE HERE. CONTINUE THERE
3 WE GO. NOTE, VTA SENT A LETTER SIGNED BY THEIR GENERAL MANAGER
4 AND THREE SANTA CLARA COUNTY COMMISSIONERS INDICATING THEIR
5 SUPPORT FOR PROVIDING THIS FUNDING FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
6 AND CALTRAIN AND THEIR PREFERENCES FOR RAISING FUNDS THROUGH
7 THEIR OWN MEASURE RATHER THAN JOINING A REGIONAL MEASURE. IT
8 IS ALSO IN YOUR HANDOUTS IN YOUR PACKET. FRAMEWORK WOULD
9 PROVIDE ADDITIONAL \$505 MILLION ANNUALLY TO MAKE UP FOR THE
10 LOST FARE REVENUE FOR BART, CALTRAIN, AC TRANSIT AND MUNI.
11 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE PROVIDES A SNAPSHOT OF THE FINANCIALS
12 IN SCENARIO 1A, AND ON THE LEFT ARE THE ANNUAL FIGURES WHILE
13 RIGHT SIDE SUMMARIZES AMOUNTS BY OPERATORS OVER TEN YEARS.
14 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES THE HYBRID SCENARIO. IT HAS
15 A 30-YEAR DURATION AND PROVIDES HIGHER CURRENT SERVICE LEVELS
16 IN OPERATOR SUSTAINING CURRENT SERVICE LEVELS TARGETING
17 OPERATOR REPORTED DEFICITS, NOT JUST FARE LOSS. THAT HIGHER
18 FUNDING LEVEL DEMANDS A HIGHER TAX SO THIS OPTION PROPOSES TWO
19 FUNDING SOURCES HALF CENT SALES TAX PAIRED WITH \$0.09 PER
20 BUILDING SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX. UNLIKE SCENARIO ONE WHICH IS
21 PROPOSED TO BE IN FIVE COUNTIES AT MOST, THIS FRAMEWORK COULD
22 INCLUDE ALL NINE. WHILE SANTA CLARA IS SHOWN AS OPT-IN ON THIS
23 SLIDE WE DO NOT THINK THIS OPTION MAKES SENSE TO PURSUE UNLESS
24 SANTA CLARA OFFICIALS SUPPORT IT. REALLY BECAUSE THE GRADIENTS
25 AGREEMENT OF SANTA CLARA FAVORED 30 YEAR MEASURE AND IT MAKES



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THE MATH WORK EASIER. ANOTHER IMPORTANT FEATURE IS HYBRID
2 TYPES OF TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS SUCH AS ROADWAY AND
3 BICYCLE PEDESTRIAN PROJECTS STARTING IN YEAR 15 WHEN 90% OF
4 SALES TAX WILL BECOME AVAILABLE FOR COUNTY FLEX. THESE FUNDS
5 COULD BE SPENT ON ANY COUNTY PRIORITY ALIGNED WITH THE PLANNED
6 BAY AREA AND PROJECTS WILL BE SELECTED BY CAN'T TRANSPORTATION
7 AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE. VISUAL HERE ON THE NUMBERS FOR THE
8 HYBRID FRAMEWORK. IF ALL NINE COUNTIES CHOOSE TO PARTICIPATE,
9 THE MEASURE WOULD GENERATE \$1.5 BILLION PER YEAR AND ALMOST
10 \$30 BILLION IN NEW REVENUE FOR COUNTY FLEX OVER 30 YEARS. NEXT
11 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE RECAPS THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S ACTION ON
12 POLICY PROVISIONS TO INCLUDE IN THE LEGISLATION, AND IT'S THE
13 SECOND PAGE OF ATTACHMENT C IN YOUR PACKET. THE COMMITTEE
14 UNANIMOUSLY AGREED ON THESE ITEMS, INCLUDING STRENGTHENING
15 TRANSIT AGENCY ACCOUNTABILITY, BY REQUIRING OVERSIGHT OVER
16 TRANSIT AGENCY FINANCIAL INFORMATION AND CONDITIONING FUNDINGS
17 FROM THE MEASURE ON AGENCIES COMPLYING WITH POLICIES AIMED TO
18 IMPROVE THE TRANSIT RIDER EXPERIENCE. KEEPING TRANSIT AGENCIES
19 CONSOLIDATION OUT OF THE LEGISLATION WHILE ACKNOWLEDGING THE
20 TOPIC WORTHY OF FURTHER STUDY AND INVESTING 10% OF THE REVENUE
21 FROM THE MEASURE IN TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WHICH WE'LL TALK
22 ABOUT MORE IN THE FOLLOWING SLIDES. FINALLY, WE'RE ENSURING
23 THAT THE MEASURE CAN BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT VIA A CITIZEN
24 INITIATIVE, SO IT CAN BE APPROVED IF SUPPORTED BY A MAJORITY
25 OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS. NEXT SLIDE. THE SCENARIO PROVIDES 10%



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 OF FUNDS FROM SALES TAX TO GO TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
2 AND THE SELECT COMMITTEES ENDORSE THIS. BASED ON FEEDBACK
3 WE'RE PROPOSING HALF OF FUNDS GO TOWARDS LOCAL TRANSFORMATION
4 PRIORITIES IN EACH COUNTY IN PROPORTION TO SHARE OF THE SALES
5 TAX GENERATED. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS AND IS
6 ILLUSTRATIVE OF ALL OF OUR INVESTMENTS IN THE VARIOUS
7 CATEGORIES OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND HOW MONEY
8 WOULD BE SPENT. IT INCLUDES TRANSIT FARE COORDINATION, MAPPING
9 AND WAYFINDING, TRANSIT PRIORITY, AND ACCESSIBILITY AND
10 PARATRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, FINALLY, TALKING ABOUT TIMELINE.
11 ON THE TOP LEFT, AFTER TODAY, MTC WILL HOLD A SPECIAL
12 COMMISSION MEETING ON DECEMBER 9TH WHERE THE COMMISSION WILL
13 BE ASKED TO TAKE ACTION ON A PROPOSAL FOR ENABLING
14 LEGISLATION, SUBJECT TO REFINEMENT AND POLLING WHICH WOULD
15 BEGIN IN DECEMBER OR EARLY JANUARY. WE ANTICIPATE ONGOING
16 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT WITH THROUGHOUT THE NEXT YEAR AND UNDER
17 THE LEGISLATIVE ENGAGEMENT, WE HAVE BEEN KEEPING LEGISLATORS
18 INFORMED ABOUT THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S WORK AND ARE PLANNING TO
19 BRIEF THE BAY AREA DELEGATION AFTER THE COMMISSION'S MEETING
20 ON DECEMBER 9TH. THE BILL WOULD BE INTRODUCED SOMETIME BETWEEN
21 JANUARY AND LATE FEBRUARY AND WE HAVE NOTED THAT SOME TRANSIT
22 AGENCIES MAY INTRODUCE A PLAN B, LEGISLATION OF THEIR OWN, AS
23 A FALL BACK STRATEGY. FINALLY, THE RED DOT ON THE LOWER RIGHT
24 SHOWS OUR TARGET. THAT MID-SEPTEMBER DATE, NEXT YEAR, IS WHEN
25 WE WOULD NEED TO HAVE THE BILL REACH THE GOVERNOR'S DESK, IF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 NOT BEFORE, AND THAT'S TEN MONTHS AWAY. THAT CONCLUDES IT'S OF
2 INFORMATION AND HAPPY TO TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR FOR
3 QUESTIONS.

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, MR. PREMIER. WHY DON'T
6 WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT, MARTHA, TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT HERE THEN
7 GO VIRTUALLY. OKAY?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ALL THOSE WISHING TO SPEAK IN ZOOM, PLEASE
10 RAISE YOUR HAND NOW. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE TO DO SO. OR YOU WILL
11 NOT BE CALLED UPON. FIRST UP, IN-HOUSE, WE HAVE AARON QUIGLEY.
12 ALL PUBLIC SPEAKERS WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. AARON QUIGLEY REPRESENTING SANTA CLARA
15 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. COMMISSIONERS ABE-KOGA,
16 CHAVEZ, AND MAHAN ARE UNABLE TO ATTEND THIS MEETING DUE TO A
17 SPECIAL MEETING OF THE VTA BOARD. THIS MORNING AS EXECUTIVE
18 DIRECTOR PREMIER MENTIONED YOU HAVE A LETTER FROM THEM AND VTA
19 GENERAL MANAGER. I WANT TO ECHO THEIR GRATITUDE TO SELECT THE
20 COMMITTEE CHAIR SPERING FOR HEARING THE CONCERNS OF OUR
21 COUNTIES VTA PROPOSES A PARALLEL SEPARATE 30-YEAR HALF CENT
22 SALES TAX MEASURE IN OUR COUNTY ADMINISTERED BY VTA IF POLLING
23 DEMONSTRATES VOTER SUPPORT. THE MEASURE WOULD SUPPORT A FOUR
24 COUNTY REGIONAL MEASURE AND ALLOW VTA TO MEET ITS OBLIGATIONS
25 TO BART OPERATIONS AND CALTRAIN OPERATIONS, REGIONAL TRANSIT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 TRANSFORMATION, AND ENSURE WE CAN INCREASE OUR SERVICE LEVELS
2 COMPARABLE TO OTHER OPERATORS IN THE REGION. WE'RE COMMITTED
3 TO THE SUCCESS OF OUR PARTNERS. AND THE RESTORATION OF OUR
4 SERVICE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ADINA LEVIN?

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY
9 COUNCIL. I'LL SERVE IN CHAIR CAMPOS'S REPORT, THE POLICY
10 ADVISORY COUNCIL SUPPORTED REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING COVERING
11 AS MUCH OF THE REGION AS POSSIBLE AND SUPPORTING A VARIETY OF
12 OUR TRANSIT SERVICES AROUND THE REGION, NOT ONLY AGENCIES THAT
13 HEAVILY DEPENDED ON FARES BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, AND VERY MUCH
14 SUPPORTED TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN INVESTMENTS TO HAVE A
15 MORE COORDINATED AND AFFORDABLE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
16 FOR PEOPLE AROUND THE REGION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. MR. ALETA DUPREE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, CHAIR DAVID C. AND MEMBERS.
21 ALETA ADMIT FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. WE
22 HAVE TO DO SOMETHING. AND I APPRECIATE YOUR WORK. AND I HOPE
23 WE'LL HAVE A PLAN AND A VOTE ON DECEMBER 9TH. I HAVE
24 EXPERIENCE. I KNOW WHAT UNDERFUNDED AND UNFUNDED TRANSIT LOOKS
25 LIKE. AND I HAVE BEEN ON IT. WE'LL JUST GO BACK TO THE 1970S,



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 WHEN I RODE THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY. THIS IS WHAT IT LOOKED
2 LIKE. IT WAS COVERED IN GRAFFITI. BROKEN LIGHTS AND ALL KINDS
3 OF OTHER THINGS. WE HAVE TO LEARN FROM HISTORY. OUR SYSTEMS
4 ARE FAIRLY NEW. WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT THE PAST. AND IN NEW
5 YORK, THEY'RE HAVING A FISCAL CLIFF. WE CAN'T LET THAT HAPPEN
6 HERE. I ASK THAT WE PLAN AND TAKE ACTION SEE THIS WE CAN PAY
7 FOR THIS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AARON QUIGLEY.
10 OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE HAVE WARREN CUSHMAN.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. HELLO COMMITTEE MEMBERS. WARREN CUSHMAN.
13 COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING. WHAT YOU ARE DOING
14 TODAY IS SPEAKING ABOUT AND TALKING ABOUT THE FUTURE OF
15 TRANSPORTATION IN ALL NINE COUNTIES. NOW, I HOPE THAT FOLKS
16 WILL THINK REGIONALLY TODAY. I HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT WE WANT
17 TO DO IT ALONE, WE WANT TO GO ON OUR OWN MEASURES. YOU KNOW,
18 EVERYBODY FOR THEMSELVES. THAT IS NOT GOING TO SUPPORT PEOPLE
19 WITH DISABILITIES AND SENIORS. WE NEED TO HAVE A UNIFIED,
20 SUPPORTIVE, NINE-COUNTY MEASURE THAT SUPPORTS PARATRANSIT,
21 ACCESSIBILITY, WAYFINDING. SO, PLEASE, THINK REGIONALLY, LET'S
22 GO ALL NINE COUNTIES. \$1.5 BILLION. LET'S GO FOR THE WHOLE
23 NINE YARDS. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. DYLAN FABRIS.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. DYLAN FABRIS, REPRESENTING SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT
3 RIDERS WHICH IS A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.
4 TUESDAY'S ELECTION PUTS A FINER POINT ON THE FACT THAT WE NEED
5 TO FIND SUSTAINABLE AND SUBSTANTIAL FUNDING FOR THE REGION'S
6 TRANSIT AGENCIES WE CAN'T ASSUME THAT THE FUNDING IS COMING
7 FROM ANYWHERE ELSE. HAPPY TO SEE LANGUAGE INCLUDED THAT ALLOWS
8 THE MEASURE TO BE PUT ON THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE. BUT IF
9 THAT'S THE CASE WE NEED A MEASURE THAT CITIZENS CAN GET
10 BEHIND. ADVOCATES ARE READY AND WILLING TO TAKE UP THIS CAUSE
11 BUT IT HAS TO BE SOMETHING THAT SUPPORTS IMPROVED
12 TRANSPORTATION. SOMETHING THAT INCLUDES PROGRESSIVE REVENUE
13 SOURCES THAT HELP THE WORKING CLASS RIDERS. AND CREATES A
14 DEDICATED FUNDING SOURCE FOR TRANSIT. ALSO, I WANT TO
15 HIGHLIGHT THAT FUNDING NEEDS TO MATCH OPERATOR NEEDS. OFFICIO
16 MEMBERS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE DID INDICATE THAT, INCLUDING
17 STATE SENATORS, AND WE NEED THEIR SUPPORT TO GET THIS THING
18 PASSED. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IS THERE ANY
21 ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IN-HOUSE?

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** IN-HOUSE.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. WITH THAT, MR. TUMLIN. THANK YOU.

5

6 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** JEFFREY TUMLIN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE SAN
7 FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY. SPECIAL THANKS TO
8 CHAIR CANEPA AND CHAIR SPERING FOR YOUR WORK TRYING TO BRING
9 THE REGION TOGETHER. AT MUNI IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THAT
10 FARES ARE THE SMALLEST CONTRIBUTOR TO OUR BUDGET. WE HAVE
11 EXPERIENCED MASSIVE LOSSES, PARTICULARLY WITH OUR DOWNTOWN
12 PARKING REVENUE, FAR GREATER LOSING THAN WE HAVE ON THE FARE
13 SIDE AND OPTION 1A ONLY COVERS A THIRD OF MUNI'S NEEDS. WE ARE
14 WORRIED ABOUT PITTING BART VERSUS MUNI AGAINST EACH OTHER ON
15 THE SAN FRANCISCO BALLOT IN NOVEMBER OF '26. AND WANT TO MAKE
16 SURE THAT MTC WORKS WITH US ON A UNIFIED STRATEGY FOR FIGURING
17 OUTS HOW TO SOLVE OPERATING NEEDS FOR EVERY REGION. WE ALSO
18 UNDERSTANDS NEEDS TO ACCOMPANY EACH COUNTY'S INDIVIDUAL
19 CONCERNS WHETHER THAT'S COMPETITION WITH SALES TAX
20 REAUTHORIZATION OR NEED TO COVER BOTH OPERATING AND CAPITAL
21 AND VERY IMPORTANTLY NECESSITY TO HAVE A FARE RETURN TO SOURCE
22 IN EACH COUNTY.. WE URGE YOU TO LOOK AT THE LETTER IN YOUR
23 PACKET AND ASK THAT WE CONSIDER MOVING FORWARD WITH BOTH
24 PARCEL AND SALES TAXES, WITH FLEXIBILITY AS TO TERM, IDEALLY,
25 FLEXIBILITY AS TO RATE, BECAUSE THAT IS THE ONLY WAY THAT WE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO FIGURE OUT A WAY TO SOLVE BOTH THE OPERATOR
2 NEED AS WELL AS RETURN TO SOURCE AT THE SAME TIME. IN THE
3 MEANTIME WE HOPE THAT MTC WILL CONTINUE WORKING DIRECTLY IN
4 PARTNERSHIP WITH THE OPERATOR AND THE COUNTIES IN ORDER TO
5 SOLVE THIS PROBLEM AS ONE UNIFIED REGION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. TUMLIN.
8 DO WE HAVE ANY REMOTE COMMENTS?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE DO. FIRST UP IS GOING TO BE VALERIE
11 LARSEY, FOLLOWED BY ANTHONY. VALERIE, YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR. I RECENTLY GOT OFF CAMPAIGNING
14 FOR MEASURE -- I'M SORRY -- PROPOSITION L IN SAN FRANCISCO,
15 WHICH WAS A CITIZEN BALLOT MEASURE TO GET AN ACHIEVABLE VOTING
16 THRESHOLD TO GET MUNI FUNDED. WE GOT MORE THAN 50% OF THE
17 VOTE. I WOULD SUGGEST THINKING ABOUT A LONG SHOT WITH THAT.
18 BECAUSE ALL POLLING SHOWS GETTING MORE THAN 2/3 OF THE VOTE
19 COULD BE UNLIKELY. ALSO POINT OUT MAIN OPPOSITION FROM MANY
20 DIFFERENT STRIPES, INCLUDING DEMOCRAT GROUPS WAS LACK OF
21 REFORM, LACK OF EFFICIENCY. A BIG THING. I WOULD STRONGLY
22 ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO THINK ABOUT READING LANGUAGE
23 AROUND CONSOLIDATION, OR ANYTHING THAT SAYS TO VOTERS THIS IS
24 TRANSFORMATION, AND NOT WHAT THEY SEED AS BAILOUT FOR FAILING.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 ULTIMATELY VOTERS DON'T CARE ABOUT THE KIND OF PERSONAL FEE
2 LOCAL MISTER AGENCY AND COMMISSIONERS TEND TO. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ANTHONY FOLLOWED BY
5 WENDI KALLINS.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ANTHONY, I'M A BERKELEY RESIDENT WHO
8 RELIES ON AC TRANSIT AND BART TO GET TO WORK AND TO EVERYTHING
9 I DO AROUND THE BAY AREA. FEDERAL ELECTION RESULTS ON TUESDAY
10 HAS PLUNGED US INTO UNCERTAINTY. A NEW MEASURE IS ESSENTIAL.
11 TRANSIT IS NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO PASS ITS OWN MEASURE SAN
12 FRANCISCO VOTERS ARE NOT GOING TO PASS THREE SEPARATE MEASURES
13 FOR BART, MUNI AND CALTRAIN. OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES LIKE WHEELS
14 AND COUNTY CONNECTION ARE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO PUT FORWARD
15 THEIR OWN MEASURE. THEY ABSOLUTELY HAVE TO EXPAND SERVICE. I
16 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE UNIFY AND STOP SQUABBLING AS
17 COUNTIES WE NEED TO REMEMBER THAT VOTERS DECIDE AND WE NEED AS
18 MUCH FLEXIBILITY GOING INTO 2026 TO RESPOND TO THAT
19 ENVIRONMENT. I SUPPORT SFMTA'S OPERATOR PROPOSAL MORE
20 FLEXIBILITY AND HOPE THAT WILL BE CARRIED FORWARD. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS WENDI KALLINS.

23

24 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS, I SERVE ON THE POLICY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL. I WOULD LIKE TO SUPPORT THE HYBRID VERSION



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 WHICH ALLOWS FOR FLEXIBILITY. I AGREE WITH EVERYTHING THE
2 PREVIOUS SPEAKER JUST SAID I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE INCLUDE
3 OPPORTUNITY FOR CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE. I DON'T THINK GIVEN THE
4 MOOD OF THE VOTERS THAT WE'RE GOING TO GET TO 2/3. SO THAT
5 GIVES US AN OPPORTUNITY, NOT ONLY TO GET A LOWER THRESHOLD,
6 BUT, ALSO, REALLY INCLUDE THE NEEDS OF THE RIDERS AND THE
7 PEOPLE WHO -- THOSE OF US WHO REALLY WANT TO ENCOURAGE MORE
8 PEOPLE TO USE TRANSIT, BY HAVING A UNIFIED REGIONAL AGENCY --
9 NOT AGENCY, BUT CONNECTED TRANSPORTATION, A TRANSFORMATION
10 THAT REALLY MAKES TRANSIT SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE WANT TO USE.
11 SO, I HOPE THAT THAT COMES OUT -- I KNOW THAT THERE IS NO
12 DECISION MADE TODAY, BUT I HOPE THAT INFLUENCES SOME OF THE
13 PEOPLE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, WENDI. KEN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, KEN KIRKEY WITH ALL HOME,
18 OUR ORGANIZATION FOCUSED ON ADDRESSING HOMELESSNESS EXPANDING
19 HOUSING AND ECONOMIC SECURITY FOR ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS WITH
20 LOW-INCOMES. SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL
21 COALITIONS LEADERSHIP. WE KNOW THAT BARRIER TO HOUSING --
22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO SERVE REGION'S RESIDENTS IN NEED
23 SUPPORTIVE OF TRANSPORTATION MEASURE RECOGNIZES NEED FOR BOTH
24 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AND HOUSING OVER THE NEXT FEW
25 YEARS. WE BELIEVE WE HAVE A VIABLE PATH AND WANT MEASURES NOT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 IN COMPETITION REGARDING PURPOSE, REVENUE SOURCE. WE BELIEVE
2 THAT THERE ARE LESSONS WE CAN LEARN TO FIND A PATH FORWARD TO
3 ENSURE WE MEET REGION'S HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION NEEDS. WE
4 ASK THAT THE HOUSING COMMUNITY ENGAGE IN THE REGIONAL
5 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS TO ENSURE THAT THERE ARE NO UNINTENDED
6 CONSEQUENCES BECAUSE OF SILOED DISCUSSIONS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, KEN.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MARTHA, HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EIGHT MORE.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WHY DON'T WE DO LAST CALL FOR SPEAKERS
15 REALTIME NOW AND MOVE THE EIGHT. OKAY?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UH-HUH.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DILLON FINCH.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS DYLAN FINCH, I AM A MEMBER OF THE
24 REDWOOD CITY PLANNING COMMISSION AND SAMTRANS CITIZEN'S
25 ADVISORY COMMITTEE. TODAY SPEAKING FOR MYSELF. I WANT TO



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 SUPPORT THE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE SUPPORT A PLAN WITH A VISION
2 TO TRANSFORM TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA AND WANT TO SUPPORT A
3 REGION FALL FUNDING MEASURE. IF FROM IS TOO MUCH FRICTION
4 BETWEEN AGENCIES OR IF SOME REGIONAL AGENCIES ARE FUNDED
5 PEOPLE WHO CAN DRIVE WILL DRIVE BECAUSE DEALING WITH
6 INFREQUENT OPTIONS AND LONG TRANSFER TIMES IS TOO MUCH. AND I
7 THINK AS MORE PEOPLE RETURN TO WORK THIS IS GOING TO PUSH
8 ANYONE WHO HAS A CHOICE BACK INTO THEIR CARS AND ON TO OUR
9 ALREADY CLOGGED HIGHWAYS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS 350 SAN FRANCISCO.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M SARAH GREENWALD WITH 350 BAY AREA, THE
14 CLIMATE ORGANIZATION. PERSONALLY, I DEPEND ON OUR TRANSIT
15 AGENCIES, INCLUDING BART, CALTRAIN, SF MUNI. IN THE REGION,
16 MANY OF US DON'T HAVE THE OPTION TO DRIVE OR THE MONEY FOR A
17 LOT OF TAXIS. BUT 350 BAY AREA'S OTHER GREAT CONCERN IS THAT,
18 WE AS HUMAN BEINGS HAVE ONLY A FEW YEARS TO MOVE FAST TO GET
19 OUT OF CLIMATE CRISIS. AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS ONE OF THE
20 MOST HOPEFUL CLIMATE SOLUTIONS WE HAVE. THE ELECTIONS HAVE
21 SHOWN THAT OUR REGION UNDERSTANDS. THIS OUR REGION ALSO KNOWS
22 THAT FEDERAL FUNDING MAY WITHER UP, AT LEAST UNTIL THE MID-
23 TERMS. OUR REGION'S VOTERS WANT TO SEE FUNDING TO MAINTAIN AND
24 IMPROVE SERVICE WITH FREQUENT, WELL COORDINATED AFFORDABLE
25 TRANSIT FOR AS MUCH OF THE AREA AS POSSIBLE. THEY KNOW TRANSIT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 IS ONE OF OUR BEST CLIMATE HOPES. IT'S UP TO US TO SAVE THIS
2 HOPE AND IT'S UP TO YOU.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SPRAGUE IPHONE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDER THROUGHOUT THE
7 BAY AREA, CITIZEN MEASURE 50% VOTER THRESHOLD MUCH LIKE
8 MEASURE L, PEOPLE LOVE SAN FRANCISCO IF THERE IS A PROPOSAL ON
9 THE BALLOT THAT HELPS SUPPORT EFFICIENCIES LESS BUREAUCRACY,
10 SEEM LITTLE IMPROVEMENTS A LOT OF PEOPLE WOULD BE EXCITED TO
11 GATHER SIGNATURES. ET CETERA. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ANDREA H FOLLOWED BY CARTER
14 LAVIN.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. ANDREA, EAST BAY TRANSIT RIDER CONTRA COSTA
17 COUNTY I USE AC TRANSIT BART AND MUNI CALTRAIN TO GET AROUND
18 THE BAY AREA. I WANT TO PUT A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE ON THE
19 BALLOT. LOCAL REGIONAL RESULTS HAVE SHOWN 2/3 IS A HEAVY LIFT
20 ESPECIALLY IN AN UNCERTAIN CLIMATE I WANT TO GO FOR THE
21 CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE PATHWAY. REITERATE THAT WE NEED TO MAKE
22 SURE THE MEASURE AS WRITTEN IS NOT JUST FUNDING TO REPLACE
23 LOST FARE REVENUES OR LOST PARKING REVENUES BUT ENOUGH FUNDING
24 TO PUT OUT A TRANSFORMATIVE FREQUENT VISION OF TRANSIT
25 THROUGHOUT THE REGION THAT REALLY EXCITES PEOPLE. I THINK I



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 HAVE SEEN WITH ELECTRIC CALTRAIN, THAT PEOPLE ARE EXCITED
2 ABOUT IT AGAIN. AND THAT KIND OF CHANGE IS WHAT WE NEED TO WIN
3 THE MEASURE AND WIN FUNDING TO SAVE TRANSIT IN THE REGION.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. CARTER LAVIN FOLLOWED BY PETER
7 -- OR FOLLOWED BY ROBERT ALAN.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS CARTER LAVIN, COFOUNDER OF TRANSBAY
10 COALITION AND OUR MEMBERS USE, BASICALLY FROM THE NINE COUNTY,
11 ALL THE 27 TWIT AGENCIES WE HAVE, WE'RE ALSO PART OF THE
12 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. WE'RE THE ONES WHO
13 ARE GETTING OUT THE VOTE WORK, CANVASSING, THE FLYERING, BOOTS
14 ON THE GROUND FOR A TRANSIT MEASURE. A PASSABLE MEASURE IS ONE
15 THAT'S A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE WHICH HAS A LOWER PASSING
16 THRESHOLD. THE FUNDING ALSO NEEDS TO BE ENOUGH TO EXPAND
17 TRANSIT. WE NEED TO MAKE PEOPLE'S LIVES A LOT BETTER NOT
18 PREVENT IT FROM GETTING WORSE. FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS NOT ONLY
19 NOT GOING TO HELP AS WE SAW IN THE LAST TRUMP ADMINISTRATION
20 THEY WILL LIKELY TRY TO CLAW BACK TRANSIT FUNDING AND WE'RE
21 HERE TO PUSH BACK AGAINST THAT. AT THE SAME TIME TRUMP'S
22 ATTACK ON CLIMATE POLICY MEANS WE AS A REGION NEED TO DO MORE
23 TO REDUCE EMISSIONS AND EXPANDING TRANSIT IS A HUGE PART OF
24 THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROBERT ALAN.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT VOICES FOR PUBLIC

4 TRANSPORTATION. WE SEE THE FEDERAL LANDSCAPE CHANGE, WANT TO

5 EMPHASIZE VOTER SENTIMENT WE NEED A VOTER CAMPAIGN NO MATTER

6 STRATEGIES WE GO WITH WE WANT A MEASURE CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE

7 THAT'S CRITICAL. REALLY IMPORTANT TO COORDINATE, ON HOUSING

8 PROP FIVE AND REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE WE'RE IN ALIGNMENT WITH

9 THAT AND FINALLY WHATEVER WE DO WE GENERATE ENOUGH REVENUE

10 BASED ON OPERATOR'S NEEDS -- NOT THE OPERATOR'S NEEDS, IT'S

11 THE RIDERS NEEDS AND WE'RE GOING TO PASS ANYTHING WHATEVER

12 STRATEGIC PATH WAIL, TO TRANSFORM. WE SHOULD TAKE THAT LESSON

13 NOT JUST FROM THE LAST ELECTION BUT FROM OUR WORK IN THE BAY

14 AREA AND WITH PUBLIC TRANSIT HOUSING GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. PETER.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS PETER STRAUSS, PART

19 OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND ON THE BOARD OF SAN

20 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. ADD MY VOICE TO WHAT YOU HAVE HEARD,

21 ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF THE BART POLL AND PROP L AND OTHER

22 EXPERIENCE. ALL OF THESE SUGGEST A 2/3 FAVORABLE VOTE WOULD BE

23 UNACHIEVABLE AND THE VITAL PATH TO SUCCESSFUL MEASURE, PERHAPS

24 ONLINE PATH IS THE VOTER INITIATIVE THAT CAN PASS WITH THE

25 FIRST% VOTE. WE NEED TO REMEMBER THAT IF THIS MEASURE IS PUT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 ON THE BALLOT AND DISAPPOINT PASS, WE LOSE. WE NEED TO HAVE
2 SOMETHING THAT WINS AND INITIATIVE MAY BE THE ONLY WAY TO DO
3 THAT. OF ITS ESSENTIAL THAT ENABLING LEGISLATION REMAIN
4 SIMPLE, FLEXIBLE, PARTICULARLY ALLOW MULTIPLE FUNDING SOURCES
5 BUT ALSO COMMIT STRUCTURE THAT THE ADVOCATES ARE GOING TO BE
6 CALLED ON TO DO A LOT OF THE WORK ON THIS INITIATIVE, ARE ABLE
7 TO SUPPORT. IT NEEDS TO BE SOMETHING THAT THE COMMUNITY CAN BE
8 ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT FOR ALL THE WORK THAT WILL BE NEEDED. THANK
9 YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU PETER. WE HAVE RECEIVED IN
12 CORRESPONDENCE FROM CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS, VOICES FOR
13 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, COMBINED LETTER FROM SAMTRANS, SAN
14 MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND SAN MATEO
15 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY BOARD OF DIRECTORS, THE BAY
16 AREA COUNCIL, AC TRANSIT, VTA, SPUR, CCAG, AND CALTRAIN, THE
17 LETTER SUBMITTED BY SFMTA WAS INCLUDED IN THE ORIGINAL PACKET
18 MAILING. AND ALL CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED WAS POSTED ONLINE AND
19 DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CHAIR SPERING
22 CHAIRED THE SELECT COMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER SPERING, DO YOU
23 HAVE ANY COMMENTS?

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YOU KNOW, JUST BRIEF. THIS WILL PROBABLY BE
2 ONE OF THE MOST DIFFICULT DECISIONS THAT WE'LL MAKE HERE IN
3 THE NEAR FUTURE. AND I THINK IT'S GOING TO DETERMINE, YOU
4 KNOW, THE DESTINY OF TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. YOU KNOW, I
5 THINK THAT I JUST WANT TO APPLAUD THE WORK OF STUART, THAT I
6 SEE HERE? NO. HE LEFT. PROBABLY WANTED TO GET OUT OF THE
7 BUILDING. YOU KNOW, ON OUR STAFF, I MEAN, WE HAVE SPENT HOURS
8 AND HOURS TRYING TO BRING SOMETHING FORWARD THAT WE THINK
9 ADDRESSES THE THREE GOALS THAT WE H1 IS TO ADDRESS THE TRANSIT
10 SHORTFALL. TWO, AND WE'RE NOT GOING TO ADDRESS IT AT THE
11 THRESHOLDS THAT THE OPERATORS ARE ASKING FOR BUT WE NEED TO DO
12 EVERYTHING WE CAN TO SEE THAT THEY CONTINUE OPERATING. AND
13 MAYBE IN SOME CASES, USE MORE SERVICE. THE NEXT ONE WAS THAT
14 WE FUND THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. YOU KNOW, AS YOU LOOK AT
15 ALL OUR POLLING THAT WE HAVE DONE, THE PUBLIC WANTS CHANGE.
16 THEY WANT THAT ACCOUNTABILITY AND WANT TO MAKE SURE INVESTMENT
17 WE PUT IN PUBLIC TRANSIT THEY GET THE BENEFIT OF THAT. THEN
18 THE THIRD ONE IS BRINGING A MEASURE FORWARD THAT THE PUBLIC
19 CAN SUPPORT. AND WE HAVE WORKED HARD TRYING TO BALANCE ALL
20 THREE MANY PROPOSALS WE HAVE DON'T ADDRESS ALL THREE SO WE
21 HAVE TRIED TO COME UP WITH SOMETHING THAT WILL AT LEAST
22 ADDRESS THIS IMPORTANT ISSUE THAT'S BEFORE THIS COMMISSION AND
23 BOARD. SO, MR. CHAIRMAN, I JUST WANTED TO KIND OF OUTLINE THE
24 CHALLENGES, AND FINDING THAT BALANCE HAS BEEN A REAL
25 CHALLENGE. BUT I THINK WHAT WE'RE BRINGING FORWARD IS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 SOMETHING THAT CAN WORK. THE LAST THING I WANT TO SAY IS THAT
2 WE HAVE WORKED HARD TO PUT A FRAMEWORK IN PLACE THAT CAN BE
3 MODIFIED. AND THAT CAN LOOK AT OTHER FUNDING SOURCES. SO WHAT
4 WE'RE HOPING IS THAT, YOU KNOW, WHAT COMES OUT OF THE
5 COMMISSION IS SOMETHING THAT THE LEGISLATURE CAN WORK WITH,
6 CAN SUPPORT, AND A MEASURE THAT CAN MOVE FORWARD WITH
7 FLEXIBILITY TO ADDRESS MANY OF THE ISSUES THAT YOU HAVE HEARD
8 FROM THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS
11 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SORRY. I HAVE TO GO. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME
14 SPEAK FIRST. I THINK THE, SORT OF, FLEXIBILITY THAT
15 COMMISSIONER SPERING TALKED ABOUT IS SUPER IMPORTANT. AND I
16 REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF COMING BACK WITH A TEN YEAR OPTION,
17 WHICH I THINK IS VERY RESPONSIVE TO SOME OF THE CONCERNS THAT
18 HAVE BEEN RAISED. BUT, OF COURSE, RAISES CONCERNS FROM OTHER
19 PEOPLE. AND YOU KNOW, EVERY TIME YOU MOVE IN ONE DIRECTION,
20 THEN THE PEOPLE WHO WANTED YOU TO MOVE IN THE OTHER ARE GOING
21 TO BE FRUSTRATED. AND I THINK -- AND, BUT I THINK THAT, SORT
22 OF, WE HAVE HEARD LOUD AND CLEAR THAT ONE OF THE OPTIONS THAT
23 WE COULD GENERATE CONSENSUS AROUND IS SOMETHING WHICH IS
24 REALLY JUST IS AS SMALL AS POSSIBLE TO ADDRESS THE NEED THAT
25 WE HAVE. AND THAT IS, I THINK, THAT'S NOT QUITE WHAT 1A IS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 BECAUSE IT CERTAINLY DOESN'T ADDRESS MUNI'S NEED. SO I HOPE WE
2 CAN CONTINUE TO REFLECT THAT. AND I THINK IT'S REALLY
3 IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT FLEXIBLE FUND -- YOU KNOW, FLEXIBLE
4 TAX RATES. BECAUSE THE NEED IN SAN FRANCISCO IS DIFFERENT FROM
5 THE NEED IN CONTRA COSTA AND SAN MATEO AND OTHER COUNTIES. SO,
6 I THINK THAT IS DEFINITELY ONE OPTION WHICH WE COULD BE
7 STARTING TO SEE, SORT OF, PEOPLE COMING AROUND. BUT I ALSO
8 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP THE OTHER OPTIONS ON THE TABLE. A
9 30 YEAR MEASURE THAT IS LARGER THAT, HAS MORE COUNTIES, THAT
10 FUNDS MORE THINGS, IS SOMETHING THAT WE COULD ALSO START TO
11 SEE CONSENSUS AROUND. SO, I'M VERY -- I THINK THAT, SORT OF,
12 WHAT CAME OUT OF SELECT COMMITTEE IS, SORT OF, PATH FORWARD,
13 AND, SORT OF, REALLY HELPING RAISE -- HELPING EVERYBODY HAVE A
14 FORUM WITH WHICH THEY CAN RAISE THEIR CONCERNS. WE CAN START
15 THINKING ABOUT HOW TO ADDRESS THEM. WE CAN ENGAGE IN THAT
16 ITERATIVE PROCESS WITH ALL OF THE REALLY IMPORTANT
17 STAKEHOLDERS, I THINK IS KEY. SO, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER.
18 THANK YOU, THANK YOU STAFF. AND SORRY, BUT I HAVE TO GO.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH COMMISSIONER
21 JOSEFOWITZ. ARE THERE ANY OTHER MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE
22 COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU TO STAFF. AND IT'S NICE TO SEE THERE IS
25 SOME AGREEMENT ON RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH REFLECTS THE PUBLIC



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 HERE, THE TRANSFORMATION -- TRANSIT ACCOUNTABILITY,
2 CONSOLIDATION IS A NO. BUT THE TRANSFORMATION IS REALLY VERY,
3 VERY IMPORTANT HERE. CONGRATULATIONS TO SAN FRANCISCO, TOO, ON
4 MEASURE L, WHICH WILL HOPEFULLY BRING YOU SOME -- NO? IT SAYS
5 HERE, LEADING BY 56%. WELL, THE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE DIDN'T
6 REFLECT THAT. WE HOPE WE GET TO SEE MORE FUNDING THERE. I ASK
7 COLLEAGUES TO PLEASE TAKE A VERY CLOSE LOOK AT THE SAMTRANS
8 SAN MATEO COUNTY LETTER BECAUSE VOLUNTARY PARTICIPATION IS KEY
9 HERE. IT SEEMS WE HAVE COMMISSIONERS, SOME WHO REALLY DON'T
10 HAVE A STAKE IN THE GAME THAT ARE REALLY PUSHING FOR THIS FOUR
11 COUNTY PROPOSAL HERE. AND I DO NOT BELIEVE -- AND I PROBABLY
12 MISSED IT HERE, BUT WE HAVE TAX MEASURES THAT NEED TO BE
13 RENEWED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND WHAT IS BEING PROPOSED HERE
14 WOULD ENDANGER THOSE GREATLY. AND THAT'S NOT WHAT THIS
15 COMMITTEE WANTED TO DO. THIS COMMITTEE WAS VERY CONCERNED
16 ABOUT THAT. AND IT IS STILL DEEPLY A CONCERN FOR ALL OF US
17 HERE. THE LETTER FROM SAM CLEARLY POINTS OUT THAT SAN MATEO
18 COUNTY IS GIVING TO BART, AND THEY HAVE BEEN GIVING TO BART,
19 AND WHAT EXTENT THEY HAVE DONE SO HERE, IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT
20 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THIS. AND BART IS ONLY 25 -- ONLY SERVES 25% OF
21 OUR COUNTY. AND THAT YOU'RE ASKING THE ENTIRE COUNTY TO
22 PARTICIPATE IN A TAX MEASURE HERE. THE FLEXIBILITY, WHAT WAS
23 MENTIONED, IS IMPORTANT IF YOU WANT TO GET ANYTHING PASSED
24 HERE. WHAT I'M NOT SEEING, AGAIN, HERE -- I LOVE THE WAY SANTA
25 CLARA IS SAY, YEAH, 30 YEARS, AND THEN THEY'RE NOT A PART OF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THAT [LAUGHTER] SEEMS TO BE A LITTLE INTERESTING IN THAT
2 PERSPECTIVE HERE. CALTRAIN HAS A THREE COUNTY AGREEMENT. THAT
3 NEEDS TO BE MAINTAINED HERE. SO, THAT SHORTFALL HAS TO BE
4 ADDRESSED BY ALL THREE COUNTIES, IN WRITING. AND TO SUGGEST
5 THAT THE COUNTIES ARE GOING TO WAIT 15 YEARS BEFORE A RETURN
6 TO SOURCE, WE ALL HAVE EXTREME NEEDS WHEN IT COMES TO
7 TRANSPORTATION, WHEN IT COMES TO INFRASTRUCTURE. WE HAVE GOT
8 THE LOVELY ELECTRIFICATION OF CALTRAIN. BUT WE HAVE GRADE
9 SEPARATIONS, A HUGE AMOUNT OF INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENTS WHICH
10 LABOR HAS POINTED OUT IS KEY TO THEM AS WELL. SO, WE'RE HEADED
11 IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION HERE, BUT, PLEASE, COMMISSIONERS, NOTE,
12 THERE IS A GREAT DISAGREEMENT HERE ON HOW BART HAS PRESENTED
13 THEIR DEFICIT. NOW IF WE ARE TALKING LOSS OF FARES, THAT'S A
14 DIFFERENT STORY HERE. BUT WHAT THEY'RE TRYING TO ASSESS, ON
15 SAN MATEO COUNTY, IS SYSTEM-WIDE SHORTFALLS. CAPITAL
16 IMPROVEMENTS. THAT IS NOT APPROPRIATE HERE. FAIR SHARE IS
17 APPROPRIATE. EQUITABLE PARTICIPATION IS APPROPRIATE HERE. SO,
18 WHAT I WOULD LOVE TO SEE IS THAT THIS BODY GETS CONSENSUS ON
19 HOW THESE SHORTFALLS ARE ANALYZED, HOW THEY'RE PRESENTED.
20 BECAUSE WE NEED CONSISTENCY FROM ALL THE OPERATORS HERE AS TO
21 YOUR SHORTFALL, HOW IT WAS DETERMINED, COMPLETE TRANSPARENCY,
22 IT'S VERY IMPORTANT HERE AS TO WHAT PARTICIPATION AND WHAT THE
23 PUBLIC WILL ACCEPT. I THINK THAT'S FAIR ACCURATE. WE NEED TO
24 BE CLEAR ON THAT. AND IF WE NEED TO BRING IN A THIRD PARTY, OR
25 SUGGEST THAT THE LEGISLATURE HAS A THIRD PARTY TO OVERSEE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THAT, THAT IS IMPORTANT. BECAUSE WE OWE IT TO THE PUBLIC TO BE
2 TRANSPARENT. THE OPERATORS HAVE TO BE ACCOUNTABLE HERE. SO
3 THAT, IS A STEP I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO SEE PROGRESS TO THE
4 NEXT LEVEL HERE. BECAUSE IT'S FAIR, IT'S EQUITABLE. IF WE ARE
5 ABLE TO DO THAT. AND WE DON'T WANT SOMETHING GOING TO
6 SACRAMENTO THAT OUR LEGISLATORS ARE GOING TO HAVE TO FIGHT
7 OVER. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY GET SOMETHING THAT'S WORKABLE,
8 THAT THEY CAN SUPPORT, AND THEN THE COMMUTERS WILL BENEFIT
9 FROM. I'M REALLY GLAD TO SEE THE ACCOUNTABILITY AND THE
10 TRANSFORMATION COMING TO THE TOP HERE. BECAUSE WE KNOW, EVERY
11 SINGLE POLL HAS SHOWN, COMMUTERS, THE PUBLIC, WANTS TO SEE
12 TRANSFORMATION. AND I GET IT. SOMETIMES THAT COSTS A LITTLE
13 MORE. BUT IT WILL RESULT IN GREATER RIDERSHIP. WE WILL GET
14 THAT THERE. SO, AGAIN, PLEASE TAKE A CLOSE LOOK AT THE SAN
15 MATEO COUNTY LETTER. BECAUSE WE ARE TRYING TO REALLY HELP THIS
16 PROCESS, BUT THESE THINGS NEED TO BE ACKNOWLEDGED. AND IT WILL
17 NOT SELL IN SAN MATEO COUNTY IF YOU ARE EXPECTING A SALES TAX,
18 AND THEN THERE IS NO RETURN FOR 15 YEARS. BECAUSE THERE IS TOO
19 MUCH AT STAKE. AND, AGAIN, WE NEED ACCURATE NUMBERS, AND
20 THINGS TO MOVE FORWARD HERE THAT THE PUBLIC WILL ACCEPT. SO, I
21 THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. AND I THINK THERE IS PROGRESS HERE,
22 WHICH IS GREAT. BUT LET'S REALLY STICK TO THE DATA, STICK TO
23 THE FACTS, AND TRY TO REFINE THOSE SO THAT WE CAN MOVE
24 FORWARD. THANK YOU.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ARE THERE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?
2 COMMISSIONER NOACK, THEN COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

3

4 **SUE NOACK:** SO, I DO LIKE THE ACCOUNTABILITY TERMS IN HERE. BUT
5 I THINK FIRST AND FOREMOST, I, SORT OF, LOOK AT WHAT WOULD THE
6 WORLD LOOK LIKE IF WE LOST OUR TRANSIT. AND THERE IS A GOOD
7 POSSIBILITY THAT IF WE DON'T PUT SOMETHING TOGETHER, YOU KNOW,
8 BART GOES TO ONCE AN HOUR, THINGS LIKE THAT, WE NEED TO
9 CERTAINLY HAVE BART, SFMTA WHO HAS BEEN HERE AND I REALLY
10 APPRECIATE THAT, THE OTHER TRANSIT AGENCY IS TO REALLY TALK
11 ABOUT WHAT THEY CAN DO ADDRESS, HOW TO TRANSFORM WHAT THE
12 CURRENT RIDERSHIP IS TOTALLY AGREE WITH ALL OF THAT. WE DON'T
13 NECESSARILY HAVE TIME TO DO ALL THAT BEFORE WE GET SOMETHING
14 TO THE LEGISLATORS BUT SOMETHING WE NEED TO WORK ON BEFORE THE
15 MEASURE IS PUT IN PLACE AND I THINK THE PUBLIC EXPECTS US TO
16 DO THAT WORK AND HOLD EVERYBODY'S FEET TO THE FIRE TO ADDRESS
17 THE CHANGES IN RIDERSHIP TODAY. AS FAR AS A MEASURE GOES, FOUR
18 COUNTY, NINE-COUNTY, WHAT I WOULD EXPECT, CONTRA COSTA HAS
19 SIMILAR BOND -- WE HAVE TWO SALES TAX MEASURES, TWO PARCEL
20 TAX, AND SURCHARGE AT CONTRA COSTA TO SUPPORT BART. SO, WE'RE
21 IN THE SAME BOAT AS SAN MATEO. BUT WE'RE NOT SAYING WE'RE OUT.
22 AND WE EXPECT EVERY COUNTY THAT PARTICIPATES AND GETS THE
23 BENEFIT OF BART, TO CONTRIBUTE FAIRLY AND EVENLY. AND, YOU
24 KNOW, I HAVE SEEN THE NUMBERS. AT LEAST THE DATA I HAVE SEEN
25 SO FAR, AND CONTRA COSTA WILL NOT, YOU KNOW, BAIL OTHER



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 COUNTIES OUT, BECAUSE THEY DON'T WANT TO PARTICIPATE; THAT'S
2 NOT GOING IT WORK. SO WE HAVE TO BE IN THIS TOGETHER TO GET
3 THE TRANSFORMATION, TO GET THE TRANSIT DONE. AND I THINK
4 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE COME TOGETHER AS A BODY, TO
5 COME TO THE SOLUTION, AND NOT JUST LOOK AT OUR INDIVIDUAL
6 COUNTIES. WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THIS HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET THIS
7 DONE CAN COME UP WITH SUGGESTIONS. IN ORDER TO GET, YOU KNOW,
8 SAVE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND, HOPEFULLY, DOWN THE ROAD,
9 TRANSFORM. YOU KNOW, IT'S INITIALLY WHY I SUGGESTED A 10-YEAR
10 MEASURE. BECAUSE IT'S REALLY AN EMERGENCY. IT'S NOT -- IT'S
11 NOT A TRANSFORMATION AT THIS POINT. LET'S SAVE IT, AND THEN WE
12 CAN TRANSFORM IT. BUT IT NEEDS TO BE, YOU KNOW, SORT OF,
13 ADDRESSED INITIALLY WITH THE PUBLIC. SOME OF THOSE THOUGHTS ON
14 WHAT WE CAN DO, INITIALLY, TO REDUCE COST TO ADDRESS THE
15 CURRENT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS, BUT WE REALLY NEED TO COME
16 TOGETHER AS A GROUP. AND NO COUNTY IS GOING TO MAKE UP OTHER
17 COUNTY'S SHARES. WE DO HAVE -- YOU KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO, WITH
18 ITS MUNI PROBLEM, AND THERE MAY BE SOME THERE, BUT CONTRA
19 COSTA IS NOT GOING TO BAIL ANY OTHER COUNTY OUT. SO, I JUST
20 WANTED TO MAKE THAT POINT.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. THAT'S FINE. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
23 VERNACI?

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CANEPA. FIRST OF ALL, I
2 WANT TO -- NOT HAVING BEEN ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE, OR EVEN
3 FOLLOWED IT VERY CLOSELY, TO BE PERFECTLY HONEST -- I WANT TO
4 THANK CHAIR SPERING, AND ALL OF THE OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS,
5 BECAUSE THIS WAS A VERY HARD CONVERSATION TO V WE ALL THAN WE
6 NEED TO HAVE THE TRANSPORTATION TO KEEP ON ROLLING. AND COMING
7 TO A CONSENSUS WAS NOT EASY, FOR SURE. IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, AND,
8 AGAIN, NOT HAVING FUND FOLLOWED IT, MAYBE ALREADY HAD THESE
9 CONVERSATIONS, IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, WE HAVE SIX OF OUR 14 CITIES
10 THAT ARE ALREADY PAYING A 10.75% SALES TAX. SO, I AM ASSUMING
11 THAT THE CONVERSATION WAS HAD THAT WHEN THIS GETS TO
12 SACRAMENTO, THEY'RE GOING TO BE CREATING SOME LEGISLATION THAT
13 WILL ALLOW THE INCREASE OF THAT SALES TAX CAP SO THAT IT WOULD
14 BE APPLICABLE. SO, THAT'S MY FIRST THOUGHT. THEN THE SECOND
15 THOUGHT IS IN TERMS OF JUST AS THE COMMISSION JUST POINTED
16 OUT, SAVING TRANSPORTATION. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT HEARING ABOUT
17 A MEASURE THAT WOULD BE 30 YEARS THAT HANDLES NOT JUST THE
18 IMMEDIATE PROBLEM, BUT TRANSFORMATION AND WHAT HAVE YOU. AND
19 THE REASON I SAY THAT IS I'M LOOKING AT THE OTHER THINGS THAT
20 ARE ON THE HORIZON IN TERMS OF OUR BRIDGE TOLL INCREASE. AND
21 WHEN I THINK ABOUT THAT, THE EDUCATION THAT'S GOING TO BE
22 NEEDED. BECAUSE RIGHT NOW, FOR THE \$7, GOING ACROSS THE
23 BRIDGE, NOT INCLUDING GOLDEN GATE, OF COURSE, BUT OF \$7 A LOT
24 OF PEOPLE DON'T REALIZE IN ESSENCE THERE IS A BASE FARE AND
25 THEN THE REGIONAL MEASURE IS ADDED ON TOP, AND FOR THEM TO BE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 ASKED TO PAY TO CROSS -- TO INCREASE THAT TOLL, POTENTIALLY,
2 IS A CHALLENGE, WHEN WE COME TO LOOKING AT OUR ENTIRE
3 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, AS WELL AS THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE GOT, IN
4 ESSENCE, WITH REGIONAL MEASURE THREE PROJECTS THAT ARE IN THAT
5 BILL THAT ARE SO FAR REMOVED FROM THE BRIDGE STRUCTURE,
6 ITSELF, THAT I'M CONCERNED THAT AS PEOPLE ARE LOOKING AT A
7 BILL AND WHAT THEY MIGHT BE WILLING TO SUPPORT, THAT IF
8 THEY'RE, AGAIN, SEEING THINGS THAT AREN'T DIRECTLY SUPPORTING
9 MASS TRANSIT, THAT THAT COULD BE AN ISSUE. SO, AGAIN, NO
10 QUESTIONS. JUST COMMENTS. AND, AGAIN, THE GRATITUDE FOR THOSE
11 THAT SERVED ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE TO BE ABLE TO COME UP TO
12 WHERE WE ARE AT THIS POINT IN TIME.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY OTHER
15 COMMENTS? MR. RABBITT.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TO ALL COMMITTEE
18 AND STAFF AND ALL THE MEMBERS ALL THE PARTICIPATION WE HAD
19 ESPECIALLY COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR GOING ABOVE AND BEYOND THE
20 MEETING PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA REALLY TAKING ON ALL
21 THAT INFORMATION. JIM, DID A GREAT JOB. DIFFICULT TOPIC, AS WE
22 SIT HERE FROM OUR RESPECTIVE JURISDICTIONS, AND AGENCIES, WE
23 PROBABLY ALL SERVE ON WE WANT TO KEEP OUR REGIONAL HAT OOH WE
24 NEED TO FIND OUT WHAT THE VOTERS ARE GOING TO SUPPORT,
25 DICTATED BY POLLING FIRST AND FOREMOST AND WE HAVE TO BE --



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, WE COULD BE -- TO ME, IT'S LIKE YOU HAVE GOT TO MAKE
2 SURE YOU CAN COMPROMISE TO SET YOURSELF UP FOR SUCCESS AND NOT
3 FAILURE. I DO THINK, AS LOOKING AROUND IN MY PARTICULAR
4 COUNTY, I CAN TELL YOU THAT THERE'S THE AGENCIES THAT I
5 REPRESENT AND THERE IS NOT A FISCAL CLIFF, EXCEPT SMART HAS A,
6 YOU KNOW, A TAX DEADLINE THAT'S OUT THERE AND THAT WILL BE
7 AFFECTED BY WHAT WE DO IN THE REGION, WILL PROBABLY CHANGE AT
8 ELECTION DATE AND WE'LL PROBABLY GO BEFORE THE REGIONAL
9 MEASURE TO MAKE SURE WE TAKE CARE OF THAT. I SERVE ON GOLDEN
10 GATE. WE ARE ONE OF THOSE AGENCIES THAT HAS A, ALONG WITH THE
11 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS, WE HAVE A DEFICIT. WE'LL DEAL
12 WITH THAT. BUT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO RIGHT SIZE EITHER WITH
13 SERVICE, THE BUDGET [LAUGHTER] OR BOTH, GOING FORWARD. I DO
14 THINK THAT LOOKING AT WHAT VOTERS WILL SUPPORT, IT HAS TO BE -
15 - HAVE THE MOST FLEXIBILITY. AND I KNOW IN MY COUNTY, MY
16 COUNTY IS GOING TO BE LOOKING FOR THE MOST FLEXIBILITY IF THEY
17 DO WANT TO PARTICIPATE. AND THAT INCLUDES ALSO THE
18 INFRASTRUCTURE SIDE OF THINGS AND NOT JUST BEING TIED TO
19 TRANSIT. BECAUSE WE KNOW THROUGH THE POLLING THAT THAT WILL
20 BRING PEOPLE ALONG AND INCREASE THE LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS. SO
21 WE JUST NEED TO BE REALISTIC ABOUT THAT AS WE GO FORWARD, YOU
22 KNOW. AND EVERY ELECTION CYCLE, COULD TELL YOU THAT I GET VERY
23 ANXIOUS ABOUT THE SALES TAX MEASURES, THAT CONTINUE TO
24 SEEMINGLY PASS. I DON'T KNOW WHEN THE WALL WILL HIT. BUT IT'S
25 NOT HERE QUITE YET. AND THAT IT'S ACTUALLY NOT BAD, BUT IT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LET'S PEOPLE PROVIDE THAT OPPORTUNITY OF THE THINGS THAT
2 PRESENT THEM, SOMETHING THAT THEY CAN SUPPORT, AND THEY HAVE
3 SHOWN THAT THEY WILL DO THAT. BUT I THINK FIRST AND FOREMOST
4 IT'S REALLY LISTENING TO WHAT THE VOTERS ARE WILLING TO PUT
5 FORWARD. THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS AN INTEGRAL PART OF
6 THAT. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK PEOPLE ARE WILLING TO PAY FOR WHAT
7 THEY PERCEIVED, AT LEAST, WAS OPERATING IN THE PAST. AND WE
8 NEED TO REALLY BE ABLE TO CONVINCED THEM, ALONG WITH ALL OF OUR
9 PARTNER AGENCIES THAT WE'RE MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION. SO,
10 AGAIN, I JUST WANTED TO SAY A GREAT THANK YOU TO COMMISSIONER
11 SPERING.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ARE THERE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?
14 YES? YES? >JESSE ARREGUIN: I'M NOT GOING TO MAKE ANY COMMENTS
15 BECAUSE I'LL BE WEIGHING IN ON THIS AT THE LEGISLATURE. BUT
16 I'M LISTENING VERY INTENTLY TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT AND COMMENT
17 OF THE COMMISSIONERS AS WELL THAT TENDS TO PLAY A VERY ACTIVE
18 ROLE IN THIS PROCESS AS IT MOVES TO SACRAMENTO. BUT JUST A
19 QUESTION ABOUT NEXT STEPS. SO, THE COMMISSION IS GOING TO
20 RECOMMEND ONE OPTION, OR TWO OPTIONS, AND THEN YOU'RE GOING TO
21 POLL ON THOSE OPTIONS, AND THEN BASED ON THE POLLING, WE
22 DECIDE WHAT TO MOVE FORWARD? WHAT'S THE NEXT STEP?

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WELL, I THINK THE NEXT STEP IS REALLY JUST TO
25 KIND OF GET THE FEEDBACK WE'RE GETTING TODAY THEN PREPARE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PROBABLY SIMILAR TWO OPTIONS TO THE COMMISSION MEETING TO LET
2 THEM DECIDE ON HOW THEY WANT TO GO. COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS
3 BEEN CLEAR HE WOULD LIKE TO GET CONSENSUS WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE
4 WILL HAPPEN AFTER DISCUSSION ON DECEMBER 9TH. POLLING MAKES
5 SENSE PUTS FRAMEWORK AROUND IT THEN WOULD START TO TEASE OUT
6 WHAT THESE QUESTIONS HOW THEY RESONATE AND ARE SUPPORTED.

7 >JESSE ARREGUIN: THAT'S HELPFUL. I DO THINK POLLING WOULD BE
8 BENEFICIAL. BECAUSE OPTION A, THAT MAY NOT POLL AS WELL AS
9 OPTION B. AND I THINK THAT'S RELEVANT INFORMATION. BUT I ALSO
10 UNDERSTANDS THAT YOU CAN'T LET THAT DECIDE WHAT THE PRIORITIES
11 ARE AND WHAT THE NEEDS ARE. SO, THANK YOU. THIS IS VERY
12 HELPFUL. AND THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING, FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE
13 LEADERSHIP THROUGH THIS PROCESS.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CAN I?

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** SURE.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I'M HOPING WHAT WE DO IS SENDS BOTH THESE
20 OPTION AND I THINK THE ONE THE OPERATORS PUT TOGETHER SHOULD
21 BE INCLUDED WHAT WE SEND TO THE LEGISLATURE. I HOPE WE COME UP
22 WITH A PREFERRED OPTION, SAY THIS IS OUR PREFERRED AND THEN
23 THOSE OTHERS TO BE CONSIDERED. I'M GOING TO RECOMMEND THAT ALL
24 THE LETTERS WE RECEIVE IN THE PACKET WE SEND TO THE
25 LEGISLATURE SO THEY CAN SEE ALL COMMENTS FROM THE VARIOUS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 COUNTIES, WE ASKED ALL THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS FROM THE MINORITY
2 POSITION TO SUBMIT THAT WILL BE INCLUDED. SO, MAYOR, WE NEED
3 AS MUCH FLEXIBILITY. BECAUSE THE POLLING WILL PROBABLY
4 DETERMINE OUR DESTINY. SO WE'RE VERY MUCH AWARE OF THAT. AND
5 YOU KNOW, AS MUCH LATITUDE THAT THE LEGISLATURE CAN GIVE US IN
6 THIS, I THINK WE WILL HAVE A BETTER OUTCOME. SO, THAT'S KIND
7 OF THE DIRECTION THAT WE'RE GOING.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MOULTON-PETERS?

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I WANTED TO SAY SOMETHING TO
12 COMMISSIONER ARREGUIN. THANK YOU FOR CARRYING THE BALL WHEN
13 YOU GET THERE. [LAUGHTER] I THINK THIS EXERCISE, THOUGH IT
14 DIDN'T RESULT IN A CONCLUSIVE CHOICE, I THINK FOR ME WHAT IS
15 SHOWED IS WE WENT DOWN EVERY AVENUE WE COULD THINK OF. AND WE
16 LOOKED AT IT CLOSELY AND WHAT WE FOUND IS, THERE WAS NOT A ONE
17 SIZE FITS ALL SOLUTION, WHICH I THINK THE LEGISLATION WOULD
18 LOVED TO HAVE SEEN. BUT IN PRACTICALITY, IT JUST DOESN'T SEEM
19 TO WORK. SO THIS IDEA OF FLEXIBILITY THAT JIM WAS TALKING IN
20 LATITUDE FOR ALL THE COUNTIES, IF WE CAN ALL SWIM TOGETHER
21 TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BUT DO IT IN SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT
22 WAYS THAT'S OKAY. WE GET TO THE GOAL THAT'S THE POINT. SO,
23 ANYWAY, WE DID OUR HOMEWORK, AND THIS IS ALL WE CAME OUT WITH,
24 AND THAT'S APPRECIATED. THANK YOU.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? YOU KNOW,
2 I DO HAVE CONCLUDING COMMENTS. SO, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT
3 WE MAINTAIN A STRONG REGIONAL PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY
4 AREA. WE DON'T WANT OUR RAIL SYSTEMS TO FAIL. ANY SOLUTION
5 MUST BE FAIR, NOT JEOPARDIZE OUR LOCAL TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM,
6 AND CRITICALLY MUST BE SOMETHING THE VOTERS WILL SUPPORT. WE
7 FULLY SUPPORT CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS, A MEMBER AGENCY FOR CALTRAIN
8 -- I SIT ON THE BOARD -- SAN MATEO COUNTY IS COMMITTED TO
9 FUNDING CALTRAIN UNDER THE STRUCTURE OF JOINT POWERS
10 AGREEMENT. CALTRAIN ALSO SERVES THE ENTIRE LENGTHS OF SAN
11 MATEO COUNTY. CALTRAIN ALSO HAS TWO OTHER MEMBER AGENCIES. AND
12 ONE OF THEM IS NOT IN THIS BALLOT MEASURE. WE CANNOT AGREE TO
13 ANY MEASURE WITHOUT EACH PARTY'S PARTICIPATION AND FUNDING
14 CALTRAIN, GUARANTEED. BART IS DIFFERENT. SAMTRANS HAS AN
15 EXISTING CONTRACT WITH BART, AND MTC THAT RECOGNIZED THE
16 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN CONTRIBUTIONS AND LAND-
17 VALUE CONTRIBUTIONS WE HAVE MADE. THIS AGREEMENT CLEARLY
18 STATES THAT BART IS RESPONSIBLE FOR ITS ADDITIONAL FUNDING
19 NEED. SAN MATEO COUNTY RECOGNIZES THAT TIMES HAVE CHANGED
20 SINCE THE 2007 AGREEMENT. NO ONE COULD HAVE PREDICTED THE
21 PANDEMIC AND ITS IMPACT ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. TO BE CLEAR, ANY
22 CONTRIBUTION TO BART FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY IS VOLUNTARY. WE
23 HAVE NO OBLIGATION, AND OUR COMMUNITY MUST SEE THE BENEFITS IN
24 RETURN. ANY ADDITIONAL FUNDS FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY TAXPAYERS
25 MUST BE MET WITH IMPROVEMENTS AND ACCOUNTABILITY. WE WANT TO



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 SEE SIGNIFICANT BART IMPROVEMENTS TO OUR STATIONS. FREQUENT
2 CLEANING, IMPROVED SECURITY, LIGHTING, FARE GATES, AND
3 ENHANCED ACCOUNTABILITY, INCLUDING RESPONSIBLE FISCAL
4 MANAGEMENT. THESE QUALITY OF LIFE IMPROVEMENTS, WITH A
5 COMMITMENT TO CONTINUOUS SERVICE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AT A
6 LEVEL CONSISTENT WITH SYSTEM-WIDE SERVICE ARE CRITICAL TO
7 GATHERING SUPPORT OF ELECTED LEADERS AND, ULTIMATELY, VOTERS
8 IN OUR COUNTY. THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE OF OPINION
9 ABOUT WHAT IS THE APPROPRIATE CONTRIBUTION SAN MATEO COUNTY
10 COULD CONSIDER HELPING BART FUND ITS CATASTROPHIC DEFICIT
11 WHICH COULD THREAD AN EXISTING BART SERVICE IN SAN MATEO
12 COUNTY AND THROUGHOUT THE REGION. THAT IS A CONTINUING
13 CONVERSATION. BART/MTC HAVE SUGGESTED THAT SAN MATEO COUNTY'S
14 REASONABLE FAIR SHARE TOWARDS BART COULD RANGE BETWEEN 70 TO
15 \$100 MILLION ANNUALLY. THESE ARE AMOUNTS WELL BEYOND BART'S
16 POST-PANDEMIC FARE LOSS. SAN MATEO COUNTY ELECTED LEADERS
17 MAYBE ARE WILLING TO CONSIDER CONTRIBUTING PROPORTIONALLY TO
18 BART'S POST-PANDEMIC FARE LOSS IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND RETURN
19 FOR SIGNIFICANT BART IMPROVEMENTS TO OUR STATIONS. NOT THE
20 STATUTES QUO. WE HAVE OTHER CONCERNS THAT WE NEED TO ENSURE
21 THAT FUNDS GENERATED IN OUR COUNTY SUPPORT DIFFERENT COUNTY
22 OBLIGATIONS. SAN MATEO COUNTY MAKE NO MISTAKE ABOUT IT WILL
23 NOT BE A DONOR COUNTY SOLUTIONS MUST BE FAIR LIKELY TO PASS
24 THE VOTERS AND PROTECT OUR ABILITY TO RENEW A MEASURE CRITICAL
25 FUNDING MECHANISM FOR TRANSPORTATION IN SAN MATEO COUNTY



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LOOKING CREATIVELY ABOUT PRACTICAL FUNDING SOLUTIONS SPEAKING
2 WITH COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS AND LEADERS FROM OUR DIFFERENT
3 TRANSPORTATION RELATED BOARD OF DIRECTORS. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE
4 ONE OF THESE POINTS IT HAS TO PASS. I HAVE YET TO HEAR A
5 COMPELLING REASON FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE THAT WILL HELP
6 CONVINCING SAN MATEO COUNTY LEADERS TO SUPPORT ANY OF THESE
7 MEASURES. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE POLLING DATA. BECAUSE THIS IS
8 ALL ACADEMIC WITHOUT SOMETHING VOTERS WOULD SUPPORT. AND, SO,
9 WITH THAT, I APPRECIATE STAFF'S WORK ON THIS. I APPRECIATE THE
10 SELECT COMMITTEE'S WORK ON THIS, AND WE'LL MOVE ON TO THE NEXT
11 ITEM. THIS ITEM WAS INFORMATIONAL. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE
12 ARE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 3B, NOVEMBER 2024 ELECTION UPDATE. JULIE
13 SCHNEIDER.

14

15 **JULIE SNYDER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MR. CHAIR, COMMISSIONERS AND
16 DIRECTORS. JULIE S, MTC ABAG STAFF. YOU HAVE A HANDLED OUT
17 WITH RESULTS AS OF YESTERDAY MORNING FROM ABOUT 25 LOCAL
18 MEASURES ON TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING, THREE STATE
19 PROPOSITION, AND NINE LEGISLATIVE RACES. ONLY ONE ADDITIONAL
20 RACE HAS BEEN CALLED BY THE ASSOCIATED PRESS SINCE YESTERDAY,
21 WITH, OF COURSE, MANY BALLOTS REMAINING TO BE COUNTED. AND I
22 DON'T HAVE TO TELL YOU THAT ALL RESULTS ARE UNOFFICIAL UNTIL
23 CERTIFIED. I'M GOING TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW OF THE CALLED RACES
24 AND SOME OF THE EXPECTED OUTCOMES FOR YOU. FIRST, ONE OF THE
25 TWO STATE PROPOSITIONS YOU ENDORSED HAS BEEN UNOFFICIALLY



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 DECLARED A WINNER, THAT'S PROPOSITION FOUR, THE \$10 MILLION
2 CLIMATE BOND. A REMINDER THAT THIS BOND PROVIDES \$85 MILLION
3 IN DEDICATED FUNDED TO IMPLEMENT THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY
4 RESTORATION AUTHORITY ACT AND THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY
5 CONSERVANCY PROGRAM, AS WELL AS THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMPETE FOR
6 GRANTS FOR WILDFIRE MITIGATION, SEA LEVEL ADAPTATION AND OTHER
7 AGENCY PRIORITIES. THE OTHER MEASURE YOU ENDORSED PROPOSITION
8 FIVE TO REDUCE THE VOTE THRESHOLD FOR LOCAL BOND IS TRAILING
9 WITH APPROXIMATELY 44%. OF THE REGION'S SEVEN OPEN STATE
10 LEGISLATIVE SEATS, THE AP HAS CALLED TWO OF THEM. THE FIRST IS
11 A NORTH COAST SEAT HELD CURRENTLY BY ASSEMBLYMEMBER JIM WOODS,
12 WHICH CHRIS ROGERS HAS WON. ROGERS PREVIOUSLY SERVED IN THE
13 OFFICE OF SENATE PRESIDENT PRO TEMPORE MIKE MCGUIRE. THE
14 SECOND SEAT IS SENATE DISTRICT THREE WON BY FORMER WEST
15 SACRAMENTO MAYOR, CHRISTOPHER BALDWIN. ON THE FEDERAL LEVEL,
16 THE BAY AREA'S DELEGATION WILL INCLUDE TWO NEW MEMBERS, FORMER
17 MAYOR SAM LICCARDO HAS BEEN DECLARED THE WINNER OF HIS SEAT,
18 WHILE BART DIRECTOR LATIFAH SIMON HOLDS A WIDE MARGIN IN THE
19 RACE FOR REPRESENTATIVE SEAT. TWO COUNTY LEVEL MEASURES OF
20 NOTE BOTH WERE PLACED ON THE BALLOT THROUGH SIGNATURE
21 GATHERING THEREFORE REQUIRING OWN 50% PLUS ONE. FIRST MEASURE
22 IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY IS ON TRACK TO PASS IT DOUBLES AN
23 EXISTING SALES TAX AND EXTEND THAT INDEFINITELY RAISING MORE
24 THAN A BILLION DOLLARS A YEAR FOR HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS.
25 AND I'LL NOTE THAT A THIRD OF THOSE FUNDS ARE ALLOCATED TO THE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LOS ANGELES VERSION OF BAHFA. THEREBY PROVIDING AN ONGOING
2 FUNDING SOURCE FOR THAT AGENCY. AND THEN IN SAN DIEGO, A
3 SIMILAR EFFORT TO IMPOSE A HALF CENT SALES TAX, THIS TIME FOR
4 TRANSPORTATION, IS FALLING SHORT. LASTLY, I WANTED TO
5 HIGHLIGHT A FEW LOCAL BAY AREA MEASURES. NAPA COUNTY'S HALF
6 CENT SALES TAX RENEWAL FOR ROAD REPAIRS IS LEADING AND
7 EXPECTING TO PASS WITH MORE THAN 2/3 OF THE VOTE, THAT'S
8 MEASURE U. AND IN BERKELEY, VOTERS WERE CONFRONTED WITH
9 DUELING LOCAL ROAD AND SAFETY IMPROVEMENT MEASURES. BOTH ARE
10 CURRENTLY EXCEEDING THE MAJORITY VOTE NEEDED, AND THE ONE WITH
11 THE HIGHER MARGIN OF APPROVAL WILL WIN. SO, I'M GOING WRAP UP
12 THERE. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE HAVE PUBLIC
15 COMMENT. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT, MARTHA.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
18 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM
19 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. ARE THERE
22 ANY COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD MEMBERS? >JESSE ARREGUIN: THIS IS
23 MY LAST COMMITTEE -- THEY DIDN'T CALL MY RACE YET, BUT I HAVE
24 A 20 POINT DIFFERENTIAL. SO, I THINK WE CAN CALL IT TODAY AND
25 JUST SAY THIS IS THE MY LAST TIME I'LL BE SERVING ON THE JOINT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE. IT WAS AN HONOR TO SERVE ON THIS
2 COMMITTEE AND CHAIR THIS COMMITTEE. I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING
3 WITH YOU ALL OF YOU IN MY NEW CAPACITY TO CONTINUE THE WORK WE
4 HAVE DONE IS TO ADVANCE HOUSING, CLIMATE, AND REGIONAL
5 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS. AND, SO, I THINK MY LAST ABAG EXECUTIVE
6 BOARD MEETING IS NEXT THURSDAY. BUT JUST WANTED, JUST REFLECT
7 AND TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO THANK YOU ALL FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP
8 FOR OUR REGION AND THIS IS A PARTNERSHIP AND WE NEED TO WORK
9 TOGETHER TO MAKE OUR REGION BETTER. SO LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING
10 WITH ON YOU THAT.

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** JUST WANTED TO EXPRESS MY APPRECIATION FOR YOU, IN
13 PARTICULAR, ALL THE COMMISSIONERS HERE ARE GREAT. BUT YOU
14 REALLY ARE A STAND-OUT, WHO HAS THE REGION'S INTEREST AT
15 HEART. REALLY APPRECIATE YOUR SERVICE.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** JESSE, I WANT TO SAY WE THINK OF YOU
18 SERVING AS AN EX-OFFICIO MEMBER OF THIS BODY IN SACRAMENTO.
19 THANK YOU VERY MUCH LOOK FORWARD TO THE CONTINUED PARTNERSHIP
20 THAT YOU HAVE FORMED HERE.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING:** JESS, YOU HAVE HEARD ME SAY THIS SEVERAL
23 TIMES, AND I'LL SAY IT AGAIN, I THINK THIS RELATIONSHIP
24 BETWEEN MTC AND ABAG IS DUE TO YOUR HARD WORK AND CREDIT. AND
25 I THINK IT'S GOING TO SERVE THIS REGION FOR THE NEXT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 GENERATION. THAT'S SOMETHING YOU SHOULD BE VERY PROUD OF. I
2 THINK WE'RE STARTING TO ACCOMPLISH GREAT THINGS WORKING
3 TOGETHER. SO, THANK YOU.

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** SAME THING. FITTING YOUR FIRST GOOD BY IS HERE,
6 AT A COMMITTEE THAT YOU WERE INSTRUMENTAL IN FORMING, THROUGH
7 OUR JOINT GOVERNANCE. AND TO REALLY, YOU HAD A VISION THAT WE
8 WOULD COME TOGETHER AND PLAY NICE AND HERE WE ARE AND ACTUALLY
9 WORKING TOGETHER AND MOVING FORWARD TO JOINT GOVERNANCE. I
10 APPRECIATE YOUR MENTORSHIP, BEING YOUR VICE PRESIDENT FOR FOUR
11 YEARS, A LITTLE UNIQUE, BUT WE LIVED IN UNIQUE TIMES DURING
12 THAT TIME. AND NOW TO WORK WITH YOU IN THIS CAPACITY, WE'RE
13 CERTAINLY GOING MISS YOU HERE AT THIS COMMITTEE, BECAUSE YOU
14 REALLY HAD AN EYE TOWARDS THE REGION, OBVIOUSLY, TOWARDS THE
15 STATE, AS WELL, AND WE WILL CALL UPON YOU AS AN EX-OFFICIO
16 MEMBER OF THIS BODY WHEN WE COME TO VISIT YOU. THANK YOU.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING ME OPPORTUNITY
19 TO SAY SOMETHING. JESSE, CONGRATULATIONS. I REALLY HAVE LOVED
20 YOUR LEADERSHIP. IT IS -- YOU HAVE DONE IT WITH GRACE, YOU
21 HAVE DONE IT WITH UNDERSTANDING ALL OF US AND REALLY LEADING
22 THE REGION. AND YOU HAVE MADE A TREMENDOUS IMPACT ON THE
23 ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS. AND I, PERSONALLY, AM
24 GOING TO MISS YOU VERY, VERY MUCH. AND I HOPE THAT OUR WORK
25 DOESN'T STOP HERE, IT CONTINUES. AND I WILL BE CALLING ABOUT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 SOME ISSUES THAT I THINK WE MIGHT WANT TO WORK TOGETHER ON, OR
2 THERE ARE THINGS THAT I AM SURE THAT YOU WANT TO LEAD THAT I
3 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN HELPING TO -- HELPING YOU BE
4 SUCCESSFUL. SO, CONGRATULATIONS. AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR
5 LEADERSHIP. AND I KNOW IT'S GOING TO BE BROADENED, NOW,
6 THROUGH THE WHOLE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. AND LOOK FORWARD TO
7 SEEING YOU CONTINUE TO ADVANCE IN THE FUTURE.

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THANK YOU. SO, I WASN'T SURE IF
10 JESSE WILL BE ATTENDING OUR ALAMEDA COUNTY MAYOR'S CONFERENCE
11 IN UNION CITY NEXT WEEK. BECAUSE IF YOU WERE, THEN I THINK
12 YOU'RE GOING TO BE GETTING A GOODBYE FROM ALL THE MAYORS. IN
13 CASE YOU'RE NOT PLANNING ON ATTENDING THAT, I WANTED TO TAKE
14 THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SAY THANK YOU. IT WAS WONDERFUL WORKING
15 WITH YOU, AND LOOK FORWARD TO ALL THE GREAT THINGS YOU'RE
16 GOING TO DO IN SACRAMENTO.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ARE THERE ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? ANDY?

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'M NOT GOING TO LEAVE JESSE ALONE. I MISS HIM
21 ALREADY. [LAUGHTER]

22

23 **CHAIR DAVID CANEPA:** YOU KNOW, I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU,
24 JESSE. WE'RE SO PROUD OF YOU. JESSE AND I WENT TO THE SAME
25 HIGH SCHOOL. JESSE WAS A YOUTH COMMISSIONER, WHO WORKED IN



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 GOVERNOR -- NO -- WORKED IN SUPERVISOR NEWSOM'S OFFICE. BUT I
2 JUST THINK, AS A PERSON, AND WHAT YOU HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DO,
3 ALL OF US, SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO COUNTY, THROUGH THE
4 REGION, WE'RE SO PROUD OF YOU. AND THIS JUST OF THE BEGINNING,
5 MY FRIENDS. SO, CONGRATULATIONS. REALLY, CONGRATULATIONS. WE
6 KNOW HOW HARD YOU WORK. AND IT'S AMAZING HOW YOU'RE ABLE TO
7 BUILD THE DIVERSE COALITIONS OF PEOPLE AND BRING THEM
8 TOGETHER. SO, GOOD JOB. OH, DORENE.

9

10 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. JESSE, I JUST WANTED TO SAY
11 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IT'S BEEN GREAT KNOWING YOU, AND, WELL, I
12 MEAN, GETTING TO KNOW YOU ON THE COMMISSION, AND LOOK FORWARD
13 TO CONTINUING TO WORK WITH YOU IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** SEEING THAT THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
16 COMMENTS, THIS BRINGS US TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT SECTION, WHICH
17 IS AGENDA ITEM FOUR. AND, SO W THAT, I THINK WE HAVE ALETA
18 DUPREE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN. CHAIR DAVID CANEPA AND MEMBERS. ALETA
21 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER CAN TEAM FOLDS. THANK YOU
22 FOR THE MEETING. WHY DO I SPEAK ABOUT LEGISLATION? BECAUSE
23 LEGISLATION IS HOW WE MAKE THINGS HAPPEN. I HAVE ONLY BEEN TO
24 SACRAMENTO ONCE AND NOT TO THE CAPITAL. I DID STAY IN THE
25 HOTEL WHERE ARNOLD SCHWARZENEGGER STAYED DURING HIS TIME AS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 GOVERNOR, AND RODE THE LIGHT RAIL. I DON'T KNOW WHAT IT TAKES
2 TO GET STANDING BEFORE THE CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE. BUT YOU DO
3 THAT FOR ME. I CAN'T CALL MYSELF AN EXPERT. AND WHEN I WAS IN
4 HIGH SCHOOL, I SPENT MY TIME SKIPPING FARE ON THE NEW YORK
5 CITY SUBWAY, AND I'M MAKING AMENDS TO THE SUBWAY. SO, I HOPE
6 WE CAN ALL MAKE AMENDS TO OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM BY PASSING
7 LEGISLATION THAT WILL FUND IT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** MY MIC. THERE WE GO. HELLO MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATION
10 COMMITTEE. THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN FROM COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR
11 INDEPENDENT LIVING IN HAYWARD. AS I THINK ABOUT LEGISLATION
12 FOR NEXT YEAR I CAN'T HELP TO THINK ABOUT THAT WITHOUT
13 THINKING ABOUT THE BUDGET. I HEARD THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
14 LOOKING AT CUTS NEXT YEAR WITH GOVERNOR NEWSOM PROPOSING YET
15 ANOTHER BUDGET WITH DEFICIT IN MY VIEW THROWING US INTO
16 DISCUSSION ABOUT WHERE WE FIND MONEY RATHER THAN HOW WE DEAL
17 WITH DEFICITS VERSUS LOOKING FOR WAYS TO SOLVE PROBLEMS. SO,
18 EXCUSE ME, I GUESS WHAT I'M REALLY THINKING ABOUT IS THAT WE
19 NEED TO DO BOTH. WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT LEGISLATION AND HOW TO
20 SOLVE PROBLEMS, BUT WE ALSO NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT HOW WE
21 FUND THE TRANSPORTATION MATTERS THAT WE NEED TO DEAL W AS WELL
22 AS THE HOUSING MATTERS WE NEED TO DEAL WITH AND WE NEED TO DO
23 THEM AT THE SAME TIME. THANK YOU.

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
2 ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENTS?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO -- OH THERE IS ONE PERSON IN
5 ZOOM THAT WISHES TO SPEAK UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. ZACK,
6 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ZACK LIPTON I'M A TRANSIT RIDER IN SAN
9 FRANCISCO. I WANT TO SPEAK TO THE IMPORTANCE OF ROBUST FUNDING
10 FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. THIS IS JUST NOT SOMETHING
11 THAT'S GOING TO WORK IF WE'RE GOING TO PROMISE PEOPLE THAT
12 THEY PAY MORE MONEY FOR SERVICE CUTS AND LESS SERVICE THAN
13 THEY HAVE TODAY. WE REALLY NEED A CITIZEN INITIATIVE THAT WE
14 CAN PASS WITH 50% AND A PROCESS THAT GIVES US A BETTER FUTURE
15 WITH REFORM AND INTEGRATED SERVICE ACROSS THE REGION. AND I
16 REALLY HOPE THAT THE COMMITTEE CAN TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT AND
17 WORK TOWARDS SOMETHING THAT GIVES US A BETTER TRANSIT NETWORK.
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF
21 THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND THERE IS NO WRITTEN
22 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGENDA ITEM
25 FIVE ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING. NEXT MEETING OF THE JOINT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL
2 BE HELD FRIDAY DECEMBER 13TH, 2024 AT 9:45 A.M. AT THE SAME
3 LOCATION. THANK YOU SO MUCH. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

4 [ADJOURNED]

5



NTT

Broadcasting Government