

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JUNE 14, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PLANNING COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, JUNE 14TH, 2024, 9:40 AM

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC ABAG WEB SITES. COMMITTEE AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME, OR MARTHA WILL. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO THE REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATING. THAT IS CORRECT, MARTHA? OKAY. FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS WILL BE THE ROLL CALL OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND AFTER THAT WE'LL DO THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND THEN I'LL TURN IT OVER TO PRESIDENT RAMOS.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR AHN? >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN: HERE.



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI? COMMISSIONER
6 DUTRA-VERNACI IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

7

8 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

11 COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS? IS
12 IN THE BACK GETTING FOOD. COMMISSIONER NOACK? THANK YOU. OH
13 THERE, SHE IS, YAY. AND COMMISSIONER RABBITT? IS ABSENT. WE
14 HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM IS THE MTC
17 PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. IT CONSISTS OF THE
18 PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES FROM MAY 10TH, AND I'LL ENTERTAIN A
19 MOTION TO APPROVE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

24



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE
2 PUBLIC COMMENT OR WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
5 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
6 WISHING TO SPEAK.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. WOULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL PLEASE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN. >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN: YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
21 MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT? IS ABSENT. MOTION
5 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. I'LL TURN THE MEETING OVER TO
8 PRESIDENT RAMOS.

9

10 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I WOULD LIKE TO
11 CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
12 COMMITTEE. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS
13 DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE PARTICIPATION TODAY. OUR 50 ITEM WE'LL
14 TAKE UP TODAY IS OUR ROLL CALL. IF THE CLERK -- IF THE CLERK
15 WOULD PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU CHAIR. MAYOR ARREGUIN? >JESSE
18 ARREGUIN: PRESENT AT MY TELECONFERENCE LOCATION BERKELEY
19 CALIFORNIA.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE.



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **OTTO LEE:** PRESENT AT MY REMOTE LOCATION ONTARIO CANADA.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

5

6 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

9

10 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA?

13

14 **CINDY SILVA:** PRESENT AT MY LOCATION, CITY HALL WALNUT CREEK.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

17

18 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. IF YOU WOULD PLEASE MOVE US ON

19 TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE AND THE ABAG COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM

22 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. MEMBERS OF THE ABAG

23 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE

24 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE, PER DIEM, IN THE AMOUNT OF \$150 AND THAT

25 THE PER DIEM SHALL BE PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A



JUNE 14, 2024

1 MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT FOR OUR CONSIDERATION TODAY

5 IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS 6A AND B. 6A CONSISTS OF OUR

6 MINUTES FROM OUR LAST MEETING OF MAY 10TH AND SIX B ARE SOME

7 APPOINTMENTS THAT I AM MAKING HERE AT THE ADMINISTRATIVE

8 COMMITTEE. AND I WANT TO THANK THOSE MEMBERS FOR JOINING US

9 TODAY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND FOR APPROVAL OF THE

10 ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR?

11

12 **OTTO LEE:** SO MOVED.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

15

16 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. I DID NOT HEAR THE MOTION. DID

17 THE CLERK HEAR WHO MADE THE MOTION?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IT WAS LEE.

20

21 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY

22 MEMBERS WHO HAVE ANY DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE.

23 I'LL NOW ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

24



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WERE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
2 THIS ITEM, NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM FOR
3 PUBLIC COMMENT NONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE
6 CONDUCT ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAPPY TO. MAYOR ARREGUIN? >JESSE ARREGUIN:
9 YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT. AYE. [LAUGHTER] SORRY.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE?

16

17 **OTTO LEE:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBITT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
20 RAMOS?

21

22 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?

25



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER SILVA?

4

5 **SYLVIA COX:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:**

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
12 PRESENT.

13

14 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** ON TO ITEM 7A INTER-AGENCY FLOODING IN SEA
15 LEVEL RISE MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING WITH US WE HAVE ALLISON
16 BROOKS FROM BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE AND JOSHUA BRANDT
17 TO GIVE US THE REPORT. GOOD MORNING.

18

19 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIRWOMAN EXCITED TO
20 PRESENT OVERVIEW AND PROVIDE BACKGROUND ON THIS ITEM. YOU HAVE
21 AN ACTION ITEM TODAY SEEKING AUTHORIZATION FROM MR. PREMIER TO
22 SIGN THE MOU. BUT, FIRST, I WANT TO GIVE YOU AN A LITTLE BIT
23 OF BACKGROUND. IF WE CAN BRING UP THE PRESENTATION, PLEASE?
24 SOME OF YOU HAVE HEARD THIS -- HAVE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO HEAR
25 THIS BEFORE. THIS ITEM HAS ALREADY BEEN APPROVED BY THE BAY



JUNE 14, 2024

1 CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION AND THE CALIFORNIA STATE
2 COASTAL CONSERVANCY, SO WE'RE MAKING THE OPPORTUNITY TO BRING
3 IT FORWARD TO EACH OF THE AGENCIES, THAT YOU SEE THERE, THAT
4 PARTICIPATE IN THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE. NEXT
5 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS REALLY -- I'M GOING TO PROVIDE SOME --
6 WHERE DID THIS -- WHERE ARE WE ENTERING INTO THIS MOU. I'M
7 GOING TO GIVE A BIT OF BACKGROUND. MTC AND BCDC DID AN
8 EXCELLENT STUDY THAT ESTIMATED HOW MUCH WE NEED IN OUR REGION
9 TO ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE IN FLOODING ISSUES THAT WAS
10 ESTIMATED TO BE \$110 BILLION TO ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES MANY OF
11 OUR COMMUNITIES FACE ALONG THE SHORELINE WITH RISING SEA
12 LEVELS AND FLOODING. OF COURSE, THE COST OF NOT DOING ANYTHING
13 WHILE HARD TO ESTIMATE IS AROUND 231 BILLION. SO, WE RECOGNIZE
14 THE NEED TO WORK TOGETHER ACROSS AGENCIES TO PREPARE OUR
15 COMMUNITIES FOR THESE RISKS THAT WE KNOW ARE COMING OVER THE
16 COMING YEARS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE DID SOME WORK LOOKING AT
17 HAZARDS WE FACE SO YOU CAN'T NECESSARILY READ THAT GRAPHIC ON
18 YOUR SLIDE, BUT WE DID SOME WORK LOOKING AT ALL HAZARDS OUR
19 COMMUNITIES ARE FACING. AND THIS IS JUST IN THE RELATIONSHIPS
20 OF DIFFERENT AGENCIES ON ADDRESSING THOSE ISSUES, AND WHERE
21 DECISIONS ARE MADE ON DIFFERENT ISSUES. THIS, ALONE, THIS
22 GRAPHIC IS LOOKING AT DIFFERENT RELATIONSHIPS THAT EXIST
23 AROUND NATURE-BASED STRATEGIES AND ALL THE DIFFERENT ENTITIES
24 THAT ARE COLLABORATING IN SOME WAY IN AN INFORMAL SYSTEM OF
25 PROGRAMS, POLICIES, PLANNING, FUNDING, REGULATORY. THERE IS A



JUNE 14, 2024

1 LOT OF ACTIVITY IN THIS SPACE, AND THIS EFFORT AROUND THE MOU
2 IS TO SPRING SOME CLARITY TO THE COMPLEXITIES. SO HOW DO WE
3 GET CLEAR ON THE DIFFERENT ROLES, THAT DIFFERENT PARTNERS AND
4 AGENCIES ARE PLANNING TO ADDRESS THE ISSUE. THE ARE THE THING
5 WE IDENTIFIED WHILE WE HAVE A ROBUST INFRASTRUCTURE FOR
6 NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS, SIMILARLY, WE DON'T HAVE ENTITIES THAT
7 ARE ENGAGED IN KNOWING MORE THAT WE HAVE SOME GRAY AND HARD
8 INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WILL NEED TO GO IN ALONG THE SHORELINE. WE
9 DON'T SIMILARLY HAVE AGENCIES WORKING TOGETHER TO THINK ABOUT
10 WHERE WE'RE GOING TO NEED THE GRAY INFRASTRUCTURE, HOW CAN WE
11 SUPPORT COMMUNITIES NO IMPLEMENTING THAT INFRASTRUCTURE, WHAT
12 IS THE ROLE OF OUR AGENCIES, VIA BARC TO HELP SUPPORT THE
13 ARRAY OF PROJECT TYPES THAT WE NEED ALONG THE SHORELINE FROM
14 GRAY TO GREEN, TO PROTECT OUR COMMUNITIES. SO, WE REALLY SAW
15 DEVELOPING THIS MOU AS A WAY TO ALIGN OUR PLANNING, OUR
16 REGULATORY, AND OUR FUNDING FUNCTIONS TO SUPPORT BETTER
17 OUTCOMES. AND, AGAIN, TO CREATE THESE CLARITY OF ROLES AND
18 RESPONSIBILITIES, AND A BIG IMPETUS BEHIND IT IS IN A WORLD OF
19 SCARCE RESOURCE, AS WE KNOW, HOW DO WE WORK TOGETHER TO MAKE
20 THE CASE TO OUR STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDERS THAT WE NEED
21 RESOURCES AND START TO GET AROUND SUPPORTING SPECIFIC PROJECTS
22 AS THEY COME FORWARD SO WE CAN, OVERTIME, REALLY CHIP AWAY AT
23 PROTECTING ALL -- IMPLEMENTING ALL THE PROJECTS WE NEED AROUND
24 THE SHORELINE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS ISN'T COMING OUT OF
25 LEFT FIELD. BOTH THE FUNDING AND INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK THAT I



JUNE 14, 2024

1 MENTIONED EARLIER, AND THE EFFORT LED BY BCDC AROUND THE BAY
2 ADAPT PROJECT IDENTIFIED THE NEED TO ZERO IN ON WHO ARE THE
3 LEADS ON DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF THIS, OF THE WORK. SPECIFICALLY
4 AROUND FUNDING AND FOR SECURING FUNDING FOR PROJECTS. SO,
5 AGAIN, THIS -- THIS IS EMERGING OUT OF SOME WORK WE HAVE BEEN
6 DOING OVER MANY YEARS, FRANKLY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, WHAT'S
7 IN THE MOU? HOPEFUL YOU HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO LOOK AT IT. BUT
8 IT IDENTIFIES SOME CORE FUNCTIONS THAT WE VIEW AS CRITICAL TO
9 SUPPORT PROJECTS THERE. IS THE PLANNING FUNCTION, FUND
10 MANAGEMENT AND WHO IS GOING TO TAKE THE LEAD ON SECURING BIG
11 GRANTS OR INVESTMENTS, AND THEN MAKING SURE THOSE ARE GOING TO
12 THE RIGHT PLACES. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE IS A BIG ONE WE'RE
13 STILL FIGURING OUT HOW TO RESOURCE AND WORK ON, BUT WE KNOW
14 AGENCIES CAN PROVIDE TA TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND OTHERS TO
15 DELIVER PROJECTS AND THERE IS A LOT OF WORK GOING FROM IDEA TO
16 ACTUAL DELIVERING A PROJECT THAT WILL PROTECT COMMUNITIES. OF
17 COURSE, REGULATORY ENVIRONMENT AND ALIGNING THOSE EFFORTS AS
18 MUCH AS POSSIBLE AND THERE ARE THOSE EFFORT THERE IS THAT WE
19 WANT TO SUPPORT AND CONTINUE TO SUPPORT. AND THE COORDINATION
20 AROUND THIS, ACROSS THESE SEVEN AGENCIES THAT ARE PART OF
21 BARC, BUT, ALSO, THE WHOLE REALM OF ENTITIES, YOU KNOW, THAT
22 WE NEED TO BE WORKING WITH TO SUPPORT THE WORK ON THE GROUND.
23 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS WAS A GRAPHIC THAT WE CAME UP WITH
24 TO JUST ILLUSTRATE ALL THE AGENCIES INVOLVED IN ALL OF THESE,
25 BUT SOME ARE REALLY STEPPING UP TO PLAY A MORE ACTIVE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 LEADERSHIP ROLE IN THE DIFFERENT FUNCTIONS. SO, BCDC, ON
2 PLANNING, BARC WILL PROVIDE A CONVERSATION ROLE, ABAG AND SAN
3 FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP STEPPING IN TO PROVIDE SOME OF
4 THE TA WITH -- AND OTHER ROLES HERE. THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY
5 HAS AGREED TO SERVE IN THIS FUND MANAGEMENT ROLE. ALTHOUGH WE
6 RECOGNIZE WHEN THERE IS TRANSPORTATION COMPONENTS IN DIFFERENT
7 PROJECTS THAT MTC AND CALTRANS WILL LIKELY PLAY A LEADERSHIP
8 ROLE, AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE HAVE NEVER -- WHY
9 DOES THIS MATTER? WE HAVE NEVER DONE THIS BEFORE INTRODUCING
10 THIS COORDINATED STRATEGY TO FUND AND DELIVER PROJECTS, IT'S,
11 YOU KNOW, IT'S A BIG, HEAVY LIFT, BUT WE ARE COMMITTED TO
12 WORKING TOGETHER TO TRY TO FIGURE THIS OUT AND GET MORE
13 REFINED AS WE MOVE FORWARD DEVELOPING A WORKPLAN TO EXECUTE ON
14 THIS. AND ALIGNING AND IDENTIFYING THESE -- THE KEY LEAD ROLES
15 ALONG THE FUNCTIONAL AREAS WILL REALLY HELP US, WE BELIEVE,
16 REACH OUR SHARED GOALS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IN TERMS OF THE
17 NEXT STEPS, HERE WE ARE SEEKING APPROVAL BY EACH AGENCY, AS I
18 SAID, BCDC AND THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY HAVE ALREADY APPROVED
19 IT. AND WE HOPE TO BRING IT FORWARD TO THE BAY AREA REGIONAL
20 COLLABORATIVE GOVERNING BOARD AT OUR JULY MEETING FOR FINAL
21 APPROVAL FROM THERE WE'LL WORK ON IMPLEMENTING THE WORKPLAN IN
22 THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPING AND GETTING INTO THE NITTY-GRITTY OF
23 WHAT IT MEANS AROUND THESE DIFFERENT FUNCTIONAL ASPECTS. THAT
24 LEAVES ME THE NEXT SLIDE THE RECOMMENDATION TO AUTHORIZE MR.
25 FREMIER TO ENTER INTO A MEMO OF UNDERSTANDING AMONG THE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY
2 AREA GOVERNMENTS, ALSO THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP,
3 THE BAY AREA REGIONAL WATER QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, BAY
4 AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE, CALIFORNIA STATE COAST AN
5 CONSERVANCY, CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT
6 FOUR AND SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION
7 AND THE CALIFORNIA REGIONAL WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD, SAN
8 FRANCISCO BAY REGION TO COORDINATE EFFORTS TO ADDRESS THE
9 THREATS OF FLOODING AND SEA LEVEL RISE IN THE SAN FRANCISCO
10 BAY AREA. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GOOD. THANK YOU. THIS ITEM IS FOR MTC
13 AND ABAG ACTION. AND WE'LL CONDUCT THE MTC ACTION FIRST, AND
14 THEN I'LL HAND IT BACK OVER TO CHAIR RAMOS. SO, IS THERE
15 COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS, QUESTIONS? YES, MOULTON PETERS?

16

17 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** NOT A QUESTION, BUT A COMMENT AT THE
18 RIGHT TIME.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES.

21

22 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SO, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR BRINGING
23 THIS FORWARD AND ALSO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR HIS ROLE.
24 THIS HAS BEEN A HEAVY LIFT. I SERVE ON BCDC, AS WELL AS THIS
25 COMMISSION, AND LIKE OUR STAFF, I COULD SEE THIS COMING THAT



JUNE 14, 2024

1 WE NEEDED TO HAVE THE COORDINATION. SO, THE MOU IS A VERY GOOD
2 START. AS YOU HAVE SAID, ALLISON, IT'S BEEN A WORK IN
3 PROGRESS. WE'RE GOING TO START AND IT RATE AND GET IT REFINED
4 AS WE GO ON. SO I JUST WANT TO THANK EVERYONE ON STAFF FOR
5 BRINGING THIS HEAVY LIFT TO US. I THINK IT WILL BE VERY
6 VALUABLE.

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO SAY THIS IS A
9 HISTORIC DOCUMENT, WHEN WE LOOK AT REGIONALISM AND ALL THAT'S
10 RIGHT THIS IS A PERFECT EXAMPLE. WHEN WE LOOK AT THE NUMBER
11 AND THE NEED, IT'S SO GREAT. AND IF YOU CAN ONLY IMAGINE THAT
12 WE ARE ABLE TO TAKE THIS COUNTY BY COUNTY BY COUNTY, YOU JUST
13 COULDN'T SCALE. AND SO WHAT I'M ACUTELY EXCITED ABOUT IS THE
14 ABILITY TO DELIVER PROJECTS, RIGHT? AND MY QUESTION TO YOU --
15 AND IT'S COMPLEX, BUT IT MAY NOT BE COMPLEX. SO, WE'LL SEE HOW
16 IT'S DELIVERED. YOU KNOW, WE DO HAVE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, WE
17 HAVE WHAT'S CALLED ONE SHORELINE. AND YOU KNOW, ONE SHORELINE,
18 OBVIOUSLY, IS RESPONSIBLE FOR, YOU KNOW, VARIOUS
19 INFRASTRUCTURE -- INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS. HOW DO YOU PLAN TO
20 WORK WITH, SORT OF, AGENCIES? I THINK -- IS THERE ANOTHER
21 COUNTY ENTITY, LIKE ONE SHORELINE IN THE REGION?

22

23 **ALLISON BROOKS:** WELL, I THINK ONE SHORELINE IS A REAL ALREADY
24 IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, IT'S BEEN A REAL LEADER ON ORGANIZING
25 YOURSELVES TO ADDRESS WHAT IS A REAL THREAT, PARTICULARLY FOR



JUNE 14, 2024

1 SAN MATEO COUNTY. SO, I THINK A COUNTY AND -- WE NEED COUNTIES
2 TO PLAY A BIG ROLE IN DEVELOPING PROJECTS. SO WE WORK CLOSELY,
3 IN OUR STUDY -- IF YOU -- IN THE COORDINATING BODY, THE
4 FUNCTIONS OF THIS, WE'RE CREATING TABLES WHERE ONE SHORELINE
5 HAS A SEAT AT THE TABLE, WE'RE WORKING WITH OTHER FLOOD
6 MANAGEMENT AGENCIES, AND WITH OTHER COUNTY LEADERS TO BE PART
7 OF THE SOLUTION HERE. SO, I THINK WHAT REGIONAL GOVERNMENT IS
8 GOOD AT, RIGHT, IS LIFTING UP THOSE BEST MODELS THAT ARE BEING
9 IMPLEMENTED IN OUR LEADING CITIES AND COUNTIES, AND HELPING
10 OTHER COUNTIES ADOPT OR ADAPT SIMILAR APPROACHES TO DEALING
11 WITH CHALLENGES. SO, I THINK THAT WHAT WE'RE DOING IS WE'RE
12 CREATING AN ENVIRONMENT OF CONTINUAL LEARNING, RELATIONSHIP
13 BUILDING, AND SUPPORT TO IMPLEMENT PROJECTS, AS YOU SAY. SO,
14 AND EVERY COUNTY GOING TO NEED A KIND OF DIFFERENT SET OF
15 APPROACHES.

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YEAH, AND I'LL JUST SAY THIS. I THINK IT'S --
18 YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE EXPERIENCE, I AM SURE
19 OTHER FLOOD DISTRICTS HAVE EXPERIENCED THROUGHOUT THE REGION,
20 IS JUST THE FUNDING GAP, IT REALLY IT'S JUST NEVER
21 MATERIALIZED. SO, I THINK LOOKING AT IT FROM A REGIONAL
22 PERSPECTIVE, I'M EXCITED BECAUSE OF THE WORK THAT'S HAPPENING
23 AT SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT. IT'S FORECASTED TO BE
24 ABOUT 350 TO \$400 MILLION IN TERMS OF FLOOD CONTROL THERE. AND
25 THERE ARE SO MANY ENTITY THAT ARE A PART OF IT. BUT, REALLY, I



JUNE 14, 2024

1 THINK WHAT YOU'RE DOING IS REALLY, REALLY IMPORTANT. AND IT'S
2 GOING TO HELP LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. SO, I APPRECIATE WHAT YOU
3 DO. I APPRECIATE OUR CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER, AND REALLY
4 PLACING VALUE IN THIS AREA.

5

6 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** BOARD MEMBER ARREGUIN? JESS? >JESSE
9 ARREGUIN: WELL, THANK YOU. I WANT TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
10 THANK ALLISON AND JOSH AND ANDY, AS WELL FOR BRINGING THIS TO
11 THIS COMMITTEE TODAY. THIS IS A REALLY EXCITING STEP TO BETTER
12 COORDINATE OUR REGION TO ADDRESS THE GROWING THREAT OF SEA
13 LEVEL RISE. AND THAT NUMBER OF \$110 BILLION THAT WE NEED TO
14 IDENTIFY, TO ADAPT THAT'S A STAGGERING NUMBER. THE ONLY WAY
15 WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE IS BY WORKING TOGETHER AS A REGION.
16 BY LEVERAGING ALL THE WORK THAT OUR DIFFERENT AGENCIES DO. AND
17 I'M VERY EXCITED THAT ABAG WILL BE PLAYING A ROLE IN
18 SUPPORTING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS TO DO
19 THE PLANNING, TO DO THE WORK, TO IDENTIFY PROJECTS. SO THAT
20 OUR REGION IS WELL PREPARED TO BE ABLE TO LEVERAGE STATE AND
21 FEDERAL FUNDING, TO MOVE THE NEEDLE IN ADDRESSING THIS ISSUE.
22 I WANT TO JUST HIGHLIGHT, AS WELL, THAT OUR ABAG GENERAL
23 ASSEMBLY, WHICH IS GOING TO BE ON FRIDAY, JUNE 21ST,
24 RESILIENCE IS ACTUALLY THE TOPIC OF THAT GENERAL ASSEMBLY.
25 AND, SO, I'M EXCITED THAT OUR AGENCY WILL BE LEADING MORE IN



JUNE 14, 2024

1 THE ISSUE OF RESILIENCE AND CLIMATE ADAPTATION. YOU KNOW?
2 STATE ROUTE 37 IS ONE PRIME EXAMPLE OF THE INTERSECTIONALITY
3 OF HOW THE ISSUES OF CLIMATE CHANGE DIRECTLY IMPACT OUR
4 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE. AND, SO, THE MORE THAT WE CAN
5 WORK TOGETHER AND BETTER COORDINATE OUR PLANNING, OUR POLICY
6 DEVELOPMENT, OUR PROJECTS, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE MORE
7 EFFECTIVE AS A REGION. SO, I WANT TO JUST THANK OUR STAFF FOR
8 BRINGING THIS TO US, AND LOOK FORWARD TO NEXT STEPS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS. COUNCIL
11 MEMBER SILVA? COMMENTS?

12

13 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT AND
14 ALL WORK ON THIS, THE ONLY WAY WE'RE GOING TO REACH ANYTHING
15 CLOSE TO SOLVING THESE ENSUING PROBLEMS IS TO WORK TOGETHER. I
16 HAVE TWO QUESTIONS ON THE WORK TOGETHER PART. ONE IS RELATED
17 TO HOW DO WE ENSURE THAT ALL OF OUR CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE ON
18 BOARD AND ARE NOT GOING TO START COMPETING WITH US LOOKING FOR
19 GRANT MONEY? AND GETTING PROPRIETARY AND PAROCHIAL ABOUT IT.
20 AND THE SECOND QUESTION WHICH IS RELATED TO IT IS, THE SPECIAL
21 DISTRICTS AREN'T REALLY A PART OF ABAG AND MTC, BUT THEY HAVE
22 A LOT OF INFRASTRUCTURE, IN PARTICULAR, I'M THINKING OF OUR
23 WATER AND WASTEWATER AGENCIES. HOW DO WE GET THEM ON BOARD?

24



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU. THOSE ARE EXCELLENT QUESTIONS. AND
2 I'LL START WITH THE LATTER. WE HAVE SET UP COMMITTEES, BCDC IS
3 SUPPORTING THE IMPLEMENTATION COMMITTEE FOR THEIR BAY ADAPT
4 WHICH INCLUDES MANY OF THE STAKEHOLDERS WHICH YOU ARE
5 DESCRIBING. SO, RECOGNIZING THAT THIS IS A COLLABORATION
6 ACROSS MULTIPLE ENTITIES, THAT MEANS THAT SOME AGENCIES ARE
7 GOING TO TAKE THE LEAD ON SOME FUNCTIONAL ASPECTS OF IT. SO,
8 THAT COMMITTEE, IT INCLUDES MANY OF THE SPECIAL DISTRICTS YOU
9 DESCRIBE. ONE SHORELINE, YOU KNOW, AS WAS MENTIONED EARLIER,
10 AND OTHERS. AND IT'S -- THE KEY IS TO CREATE THESE TABLES AND
11 THESE EFFORTS THAT ARE CONTINUALLY SUPPORTING THE RELATIONSHIP
12 BUILDING, THE TRUST BUILDING, THE PARTNERSHIP, THAT ALLOWS
13 EVERYONE TO -- TO GO TO YOUR FIRST QUESTION, OF COURSE WE'RE
14 NEVER GOING TO ELIMINATE COMPETITION AMONG CITIES TO GO AFTER
15 RESOURCES. THAT -- THIS ISN'T GOING TO SOLVE THAT CHALLENGE.
16 BUT IF WE WORK TOGETHER TO IDENTIFY, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S
17 PART OF THIS OF THE IS CREATING THIS -- THIS LIST OF PROJECTS
18 THAT EXIST IN THE REGION, ALL KINDS OF -- THIS IS SOMETHING
19 THAT MTC AND BCDC ARE DEVELOPING AS BUILDING OFF OF THAT
20 INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK, IS CAPTURING FROM ALL THE COUNTIES AND
21 CITIES, THE ADAPTATION PROJECTS THAT THEY'RE WORKING ON. SOME
22 ARE EARLY ON IN THE PROCESS, SOME ARE MUCH FURTHER ALONG, AND
23 BY CONTINUALLY UPDATING AND SUPPORTING THAT LIST OF PROJECTS,
24 THROUGH THAT, I THINK EVERYBODY COULD COME AROUND AND SEE,
25 WELL, LET'S SUPPORT THIS PROJECT GETTING THIS FUNDING THIS



JUNE 14, 2024

1 YEAR, BUT KNOWING THAT WE'RE GOING TO SUPPORT ALL THE FUTURE
2 PROJECTS THAT CITIES AND COUNTIES DEEM IMPORTANT. BUT HOW DO
3 WE USE COMBINED DATA AND INFORMATION IN TERMS OF WHAT'S
4 VULNERABLE AND WHEN. WHAT ARE THE EARLY VULNERABILITY SITES,
5 AND HOW DO WE GET RESOURCES TO THEM, ESPECIALLY THE MOST
6 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES THAT REALLY NEED SOME SUPPORT AND
7 PARTNERSHIP TO BRING THEM UP -- YOU KNOW, BRING THEM UP TO
8 LEVEL PLAYING FIELD. HOW DO WE WORK TOGETHER TO BRING COMFORT
9 DECISIONS BEING MADE DEVELOPING RESOURCES ULTIMATELY WITH THE
10 BEST INTEREST OF ALL COMMUNITIES IN MINDS. I DON'T THINK THERE
11 IS ANY MAGIC TO THAT OTHER THAN RELATIONSHIP BUILDING AND
12 CONTINUALLY KIND OF A WORKING TOGETHER TO IDENTIFY PRIORITIES,
13 IF YOU WILL.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. GOOD QUESTION. ANYONE ELSE?
16 CARLOS?

17

18 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I THINK SOME OF MY QUESTIONS HAVE BEEN ASKED.
19 I'M NOT SURE THAT THEY HAVE BEEN FULLY ANSWERED. AND THANK YOU
20 FOR BRINGING THIS TO US. I KNOW IT'S BEEN AT LEAST A COUPLE OF
21 YEARS THAT THIS BODY HAS BEEN TALKING ABOUT REGIONAL
22 COORDINATION ON SEA LEVEL RISE OF THE IT'S NICE TO HAVE A
23 NUMBER IN FRONT OF US, \$110 BILLION. PROBABLY MORE THAN WE
24 ORIGINALLY ANTICIPATED AND IT'S PROBABLY GOING TO BE EVEN
25 HIGHER THAN THAT. BUT YOU KNOW, COMING FROM A COUNTY LIKE SAN



JUNE 14, 2024

1 MATEO THAT ACTUALLY HAS A NUMBER OF SEA LEVEL RISE PROJECTS
2 THAT HAVE EITHER BEEN COMPLETED; RIGHT? FOSTER CITY, EAST PALO
3 ALTO, WITH ITS SAN [INDISCERNIBLE] JPA, AND SEA LEVEL RISE AND
4 KIND OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] FLOODING DISTRICT, PALO ALTO DOING
5 ANOTHER PEOPLE WITH SANTA CLARA THERE ARE A BUNCH OF LOCAL
6 ENTITIES THAT ARE DOING WORK IN THIS AREA. UNLESS WE CAN
7 IDENTIFY NEW FUNDING, I THINK WE ARE GOING TO BE ALL IN A
8 POSITION WHERE WE ARE COMPETING WITH EITHER FEMA DOLLARS, OR
9 CAL OPA DOLLARS, OR WHO KNOWS WHERE THIS MONEY COMES FROM. I
10 KNOW -- YOU KNOW, IN OUR OWN CITY, IN OUR OWN COUNTY, AN
11 EXAMPLE IS ONE SHORELINE APPLIED FOR A GRANT THIS OUR LOCAL
12 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AGENCY APPLIED FOR AND IT WAS THE
13 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AGENCY THAT GOT THE FUNDING TO DO SOME
14 OF THIS SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION STUFF. I -- I'M WILLING, AT
15 THIS POINT, I THINK, TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THIS MOU, BUT I
16 HONESTLY THINK THAT IT'S GOING TO TAKE A LOT OF TWEAKING AS WE
17 MUTUAL FORWARD. I THINK THERE ARE GOING TO BE A LOT OF PEOPLE
18 WHO ARE NOT AT THE TABLE WHO ARE NOT THE 60 MEMBERS OF BARC
19 WHO WILL EITHER WANT TO COME INTO THAT DOOR OR WANT TO HAVE A
20 FORUM WHICH THEY CAN HAVE A MEANINGFUL VOICE PRIORITIZE AND
21 HOW TO POTENTIALLY CREATE NEW FUNDS. ALLISON THIS, IS NOT AN
22 EASY PROJECT, AND I'M GLAD YOU'RE DOING IT AND NOT ME.
23 [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE THERE REALLY ARE JUST A BUNCH OF CITIES, A
24 NUMBER OF CITIES AND NUMBER OF COUNTIES THAT ARE TRYING TO
25 GRAPPLE WITH THIS RIGHT NOW. THE COORDINATION PIECE I THINK IS



JUNE 14, 2024

1 IMPORTANT. I THINK YOU SAID IT BEST WHEN YOU TALKED ABOUT WE
2 NEED TO FIND OUT WHAT ARE THE PROJECTS THAT ARE OUT THERE,
3 WHAT ARE THE PROJECTS PEOPLE ARE CONTEMPLATING, TO ADD TO
4 THIS, YOU KNOW, FULL PALLET OF APPROACHES. AND THEN TO
5 THOUSAND, IN SOME WAY, COORDINATE. I'M JUST NOT SURE YOU KNOW,
6 WHAT THAT EVENTUALLY WHAT THAT COORDINATION IS GOING LOOK
7 LIKE. I CAN SEE US DRAWING ELBOWS IN PLACES, LIKE, MY GOD, MY
8 COMMUNITY IS GOING TO GET FLOODED. I NEED TO BRING MONEY TO MY
9 COMMUNITY NOW. WE ALL HAVE A REGIONAL HAT HERE I THINK IT'S
10 IMPORTANT TO HAVE A VEHICLE I'M GLAD YOU ALL HAVE COME BACK TO
11 US WITH WHAT WE REQUESTED BUT REALLY I CAN SEE THIS MOU BEING
12 TWEAKED IN A YEAR, RIGHT, TO REALLY BETTER UNDERSTAND HOW WE
13 CAN INCORPORATE PEOPLE AND NOT FEEL -- AND NOT HAVE SOME OF
14 THE CITIES AND COUNTIES SAY WAIT A SECOND I'M NOT AT THAT
15 TABLE. RIGHT. SO, I THINK THIS IS A GOOD STEP. BUT I THINK IT
16 IS GOING TO REQUIRE SOME MATURITY IN TERMS OF HOW WE MAKE THIS
17 THING WORK. AND I DO NOT MEAN TO BE A CASSANDRA ABOUT THIS,
18 BUT I JUST WANT TO POINT THAT OUT. BUT THANK YOU. THIS IS GOOD
19 WORK. THANK YOU.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** STEPHANIE, YOU WANT TO --

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I JUST HAD A FOLLOW-UP QUESTION FOR
24 ALLISON. PERHAPS YOU COULD SAY A BIT ABOUT BCDC'S REGIONAL
25 ADAPTATION PLAN THAT'S GOING ON BECAUSE I THINK THAT MAY



JUNE 14, 2024

1 ADDRESS SOME OF WHAT YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT IN THE INFLUENTIAL
2 CONTAINER THEY'RE TRYING TO CREATE.

3

4 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU. BCDC, THERE WAS A LAW THAT WAS
5 PASSED BY THE STATE, 272 THAT BCDC IS SUPPORTING JURISDICTIONS
6 OF -- IT COULD BE A SITUATION WHERE THERE IS TWO JURISDICTIONS
7 WORKING TOGETHER TO COMPLETE SUBREGIONAL SEA LEVEL RISE
8 PLANNING. AND THROUGH -- AND THAT IS INCLUDED IN THE MOU. SO,
9 THROUGH THAT, JURISDICTIONS WILL HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO AT
10 LEAST GET SOME -- OUT OF THAT IS HOPEFUL TOW IDENTIFY PROJECTS
11 THAT WILL PROTECT THEM FROM FLOODING AND SEA LEVEL RISE. AND
12 THEN WE REALLY DO -- I THINK -- I TAKE WHAT YOU ARE SAYING,
13 DIRECTOR RAMOS, VERY SEER -- ROMERO. SORRY. [LAUGHTER] VERY
14 SERIOUSLY. AND I THINK WE ALL DO, IS HOW DO WE GET THE SUPPORT
15 TO JURISDICTIONS TO HELP ADVANCE THEIR PROJECTS, RECOGNIZING
16 THAT THERE IS NEVER GOING TO BE ENOUGH MONEY TO SUPPORT EVERY
17 PROJECT AROUND THE BAY. BUT, PROJECTS ARE VERY INCREMENTAL.
18 THERE IS A LOT OF STEPS TO GET TO A PROJECT. AND THERE IS
19 DIFFERENT KINDS OF RESOURCES NEEDED TO SUPPORT -- TO SUPPORT
20 THAT. SO, BCDC IS REALLY DESIGNING A TA PROGRAM TO HELP PEOPLE
21 GET OUT OF THE GATE, HELP JURISDICTIONS GET OUT OF THE GATE
22 AND TO DEVELOP THE SEA LEVEL RISE PLANS. AND THEN FROM THERE,
23 WE REALLY NEED TO HELP JURISDICTIONS GO FROM THE PLANNING SIDE
24 TO THE PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION. AND THAT'S WHERE ALL OF OUR
25 PARTNERSHIP WILL REALLY PLAY A ROLE IN STEPPING IN AND HELPING



JUNE 14, 2024

1 TO DO THAT. FOLKS LIKE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP WHO
2 ARE HELPING THE CITY OF PALO ALTO TO BUILD A HORIZONTAL LEVEE,
3 SO THERE IS OTHER EXAMPLES THAT WE CAN SHARE.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PAT?

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR. I JUST WANT TO ADD A
8 COUPLE OF COMMENTS, HAVING WORKED FOR THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL
9 PROTECTION AGENCY FOR 35 YEARS, AND ALL IN THE WATER PROGRAMS.
10 IT IS ACTUALLY MORE COMPETITIVE WHEN YOU HAVE CITIES THAT ARE
11 ADJACENT TO EACH OTHER THAT HAVE SIMILAR ISSUES OR BORDERS
12 THAT NEED THE SAME WORK IF THEY SUBMIT APPLICATIONS TOGETHER.
13 SO, I THINK THIS EFFORT, ALSO WILL HELP CITIES AND COUNTIES
14 COLLABORATE TO BE MORE COMPETITIVE FOR NATIONAL GRANTS, OR
15 EVEN REGIONAL GRANTS. SO, I THINK THAT THE WORK THAT BCDC --
16 ALL THE AGENCIES, ABAG, MTC, ON THIS EFFORT, TO COLLABORATE, I
17 THINK IS REALLY REMARKABLE. BECAUSE A LOT OF AGENCIES WANT TO
18 PROTECT THEIR OWN TURF, NOT NECESSARILY WANT TO SHARE IT WITH
19 OTHERS. SO, I THINK THAT THIS IS GOING FORWARD, REALLY GOING
20 TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE IN THE COUNTY. AND IN THE REGION, AND
21 REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE SUPPORT IT 150% IN ORDER TO
22 HELP MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE DO WORK TOGETHER TO SOLVE THIS
23 PROBLEM THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO SOLVE BY OURSELVES.
24 FOLLOWING UP ON SOME OF CARLOS'S QUESTIONS, ON YOUR



JUNE 14, 2024

1 ORGANIZATIONAL CHART THERE, WHERE DOES THE OUTREACH FALL INTO
2 THAT WHO IS RESPONSIBLE FOR THAT AND HOW IS THAT MANAGED?

3

4 **ALLISON BROOKS:** WELL, I DO THINK THAT'S A ROLE FOR BARC TO
5 PLAY. ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE DOING ALREADY IS FUNDING AN
6 ONLINE PUBLICATION CALLED KNEE DEEP TIMES, IF YOU HAVE HAD A
7 CHANCE TO SEE IT, THAT WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS LED BY BARC AND
8 IT REALLY WAS INTENDED TO LIFT UP EXAMPLES OF WORK UNDERWAY
9 ACROSS OUR REGION AND REALLY DIG INTO THE DETAILS OF HOW THE
10 WORK THAT WE DO HERE AT THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, WHAT THAT MEANS
11 IN TERMS, INTERPRETING THAT, AND HOW THAT PLACE OUT IN ACTUAL
12 COMMUNITIES, AND LIFTING UP LEADERSHIP OF COMMUNITY LEADERS IN
13 ADVANCING PROJECTS. SO, THAT'S ONE EXAMPLE, AND I DO THINK WE
14 COULD WORK TOGETHER TO DO MORE TO SHARE STORIES, DELIVER
15 INFORMATION, UPDATES, ON HOW WE'RE DOING AS A REGION AROUND
16 THIS ISSUE. AND THAT'S GOING TO CONTINUE HOW WE GET PEOPLE
17 ENGAGED AND INVOLVED IN HOW WE ADVANCE THESE PROJECTS.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I SEE THIS KIND OF LIKE A VIEWED THE
20 BAY TRAILS, YOU KNOW, WHERE THEY HAD A PLAN AND THEN STARTED
21 FILLING GAPS. YOU KNOW? AND THE PUBLIC REALLY UNDERSTOOD THAT.
22 SO, I THINK WE NEED TO TAKE THAT TYPE OF APPROACH WHERE THE
23 PUBLIC CAN UNDERSTAND. AND I AM SURE THERE ARE OTHER AREAS
24 WHERE JUST A SIMPLE SEA WALL WILL SOLVE A LOT OF THE PROBLEMS
25 OF THE SO I'M HOPING THAT WE'RE DRILLING DOWN INTO LOCATION



JUNE 14, 2024

1 JURISDICTIONS SO WE CAN COMMUNICATE, MAKE THEM AWARE, AND TO
2 GET THEM TO ACCEPT THE PLAN OF DEALING WITH SEA LEVEL RISE IN
3 THE WHOLE BAY. THAT WOULD BE A ROLE THAT BART COULD PLAY TOO.

4

5 **ALLISON BROOKS:** YEAH.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. IS THERE ANY OTHER -- NOT
8 SEEING ANY. ALETA DUPREE, DO YOU WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR, JIM SPERING AND MEMBERS. ALETA
11 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. IT'S GOOD
12 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THIS AND WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT IT MORE AND
13 TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DEAL WITH IT. IT'S NOT NEW. THE DUTCH
14 HAVE BEEN -- HAVE THE HOLDERS, AND THE DIKES, AND THE WIN
15 MILLS AND HAVE BEEN DOING THAT FOR, LIKE, 400 YEARS, AT LEAST.
16 AND I DID SEE THE VIDEOS OF WATER COMING UP ON EMBARCADERO
17 WHEN THE KING TIDE HITS. AND THINKING DID IT GET IN THE FERRY
18 BUILDING. I GO IN THE FERRY BUILDING A LOT. MORE SO I HEAR
19 ABOUT IT IN NEW YORK. I GUESS I'M VERY DEEPLY ENGAGED THERE,
20 GIVEN THAT I CAME FROM THERE, AND FLOODING ON THE HUDSON METRO
21 NORTH LINE, HUDSON RIVER IS RISING. HAVING TO PROTECT SUBWAY
22 YARDS. SOME OF THEM ARE LOCATED NEAR WATER. TWO OF NEW YORK'S
23 MAJOR AIRPORTS IN THE CITY, THERE IS ONLY TWO, JFK, AND
24 LAGUARDIA ARE SURROUNDED BY WATER. THEN WE HAD SUPER STORM
25 SANDY WHICH THEY'RE STILL TRYING TO RECOVER FROM, YOU GO DOWN



JUNE 14, 2024

1 A RIDE PATH AND THEY'RE STILL WORKING ON THE TUNNEL UNDER
2 HUDSON RIVER. THEN THERE IS THE FORGOTTEN NEIGHBORHOOD IN
3 BROOKLYN AND QUEENS CALLED THE HOLE IT'S OVER BY LYNDON AND
4 HARDLY ANYBODY HEARS ABOUT IT, IT FLOODS THEY'RE CONNECTED TO
5 THE SEWER SYSTEM. WHAT IMPACTED ME LAST YEAR SEEING THE MOTT
6 HAVEN YARD GOT FLOODED THAT LEADS TO GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL
7 THAT FAMOUS RAILROAD STATION IN NEW YORK CITY, 700 TRAINS A
8 DAY COULDN'T USE IT. WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO. THIS IS
9 REAL. THANK YOU.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA IS THERE ANY OTHER
12 COMMENTS.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS
15 ITEM AND NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** BACK TO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE
18 I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

19

20 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE APPROVAL OF THE MTC --

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THIS IS --

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** OH MTC --

25



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YOU CAN DO IT NEXT.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE FURTHER
8 DISCUSSION? PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UPON AHN? >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN: YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT.
21 MOULTON PETERS?

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
5 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** BACK TO CHAIR RAMOS.

8

9 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** AND NOW YOU'RE UP MEMBER ECKLUND DO I HAVE
10 A MOTION AND SECOND TO REFER THE INTER-AGENCY FLOODING AND SEA
11 LEVEL RISE MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
12 BOARD FOR APPROVAL.

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** MOTION.

15

16 **CINDY SILVA:** SECOND.

17

18 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** I'LL LEAVE IT TO YOU I'M NOT GOING TO PICK
19 FAVORITES. WE HAVE HAD DISCUSSION I'LL ASK FOR THE GOOD OF THE
20 ORDER ANY MEMBER COMMENTS ARE? PUBLIC COMMENT.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
23 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
24 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
25 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. IF THE CLERK WOULD PLEASE CALL
3 THE ROLL.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU CHAIR MOTION ECKLUND SECOND
6 SILVA. SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN? IS ABSENT. MAYOR ARREGUIN? >JESSE
7 ARREGUIN: YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

10

11 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE? STEPPED AWAY. SUPERVISOR
14 RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

15

16 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER SILVA?

23

24 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

25



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS IS ABSENT. THE MOTION
2 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. OUR NEXT ITEM ON OUR
5 AGENDA, ITEM 8A. WE WILL RECEIVE AN UPDATE OF KEY FINDINGS FOR
6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ DRAFT BLUEPRINT. AND I WILL ASK CHIRAG
7 RABARI TO GIVE US THE REPORT. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

8

9 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND
10 BOARD MEMBERS. CHIRAG RABARI, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ PROJECT
11 MANAGER. AND PLEASED TO BE REPRESENTING THE BROADER PLANNED
12 BAY AREA TEAM TO PRESENT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT KEY FINDINGS.
13 NEXT SLIDE. THERE WE IN JANUARY 2024 FOLLOWING EXTENSIVE FIRST
14 ROUND OF MTC PLAN ENGAGEMENT MTC AND ABAG COMMITTEES
15 UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED REVISED BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES GEOGRAPHIES
16 FURTHER STUDIES SEVERAL MONTHS DEVELOPING TECHNICAL WORK
17 RUNNING LAND USE TRAVEL MODELS AND DRAFT BLUEPRINTS
18 PERFORMANCE EQUITY OUTCOMES THAT WE ARE FOCUSED ON TODAY
19 TECHNICAL ANALYST CAL PERSPECTIVES THIS IS ONE OF THE MAJOR
20 MILESTONES FOR THE LONG RANGE PLAN THIS IS THE FIRST DRAFT OF
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ ALONG WITH THE TRANSIT 2050+ DRAFT
22 NETWORK AND STRATEGY RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE TRANSIT 2050+
23 TEAM IS CURRENTLY REVIEWING WITH KEY PARTNERS AND WE'LL SHARE
24 WITH YOU ALL IN SEPTEMBER, THESE OUTCOMES ARE REALLY WHAT'S
25 GOING TO DRIVE THE NEXT ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT THAT'S GOING TO BE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 TAKING PLACE IN THE COMING MONTHS. SO WE'RE GOING TO REVIEW A
2 MORE DETAILED NEAR-TERM SCHEDULE LATER IN THE PRESENTATION,
3 BUT AS A QUICK REMINDER, ON KEY UPCOMING MILESTONES AND BOARD
4 DECISIONS, WE ARE ANTICIPATING THAT THE COMMISSION AND
5 EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL TAKE ACTION TO APPROVE FINAL BLUEPRINT
6 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES LATER THIS YEAR INCLUDES FINDINGS
7 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM TRANSIT 2050+ AFTER WHICH WE'LL CONDUCT
8 SIMILAR ANALYSIS OF FINAL BLUEPRINT AS YOU ARE SEEKING TODAY
9 AND SEEK YOUR APPROVAL TO ADVANCE THE PLAN INTO CEQA AND PLANS
10 FINAL PHASE AROUND LATE WINTER OR EARLY SPRING 2025 AND
11 ADOPTION OF THE PLAN ANTICIPATED LATE 2025. NEXT SLIDE. OUR
12 REFRESHER, PLAN WILL ADDRESS ALL OF FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING
13 REQUIREMENTS INCLUDING IT MUST MEET OR EXCEED 19% PER CAPITA
14 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGET BY 2035 MUST PLAN
15 FOR SUFFICIENT HOUSING INCOME LEVELS AND TRANSPORTATION
16 ELEMENT MUST BE FISCAL CONSTRAINED AND RELY ON ANTICIPATED
17 REVENUES LEVERAGING A VISION GUIDE YOU PRINCIPLES FROM THE
18 PREVIOUS PLAN WHICH IS A BAY AREA THAT IS AFFORDABLE CONNECTED
19 DIVERSE HEALTHY AND VIBRANT FOR ALL BAY AREA BY THE YEAR 2050
20 GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE PRESENTATION
21 THAT GUIDE PRINCIPLES AND VALUATION AND QUESTIONS, METRICS
22 LOOKING TO GAUGE PERFORMANCE IN MEETING REGIONAL GOALS, THE
23 FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PREVIOUS PLAN AS WELL AS DIVISION INTO 11
24 THEMES AND 35 STRATEGIES WE HAVE BEEN PURSUING CORE PRIORITIES
25 TO UPDATE THE PLAN, LEANING ON IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS



JUNE 14, 2024

1 INFORMING STRATEGY REFINEMENTS AND PUTTING A LOT OF EMPHASIS
2 ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PLANS FINAL PHASE ENHANCING PUBLIC
3 COMMUNICATION AROUND WHAT THE PLAN IS WHO WE AND ARE WHAT WE
4 DO. NEXT SLIDE. THERE ARE INPUTS AND UPDATES THAT INFORM THIS
5 DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND THE MAIN POINT IS THAT WHAT WE'RE SHOWING
6 TODAY IS WHAT HAPPENS WHEN YOU TAKE ALL OF THESE THINGS
7 TOGETHER. YOU LOOK AT OUR POST-COVID BASELINE OF UPDATE
8 TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS AND LOCAL ZONING AND LAND USE DATA, OUR
9 ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT HOW MUCH THE REGION IS GOING TO GROW IN
10 TERMS OF POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSEHOLDS, AND HOW -- WHAT IT
11 IS FINANCIAL NEEDS ARE AND HOW MUCH MONEY THERE IS FOR
12 INVESTMENTS, HOW EXTERNAL FORCES BEYOND THE REGION'S CONTROL
13 ARE EXPECTED TO DEVELOP, SUCH AS WORK FROM HOME LEVELS. AND
14 THEN YOU THROW IN OUR REFINED PUBLIC POLICIES AND INVESTMENTS
15 THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED OVER 25 YEARS PERIOD, AS WELL AS A
16 REVISED GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WHERE FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS CAN
17 BE FOCUSED AND BASICALLY SEE WHAT THE RESULTS ARE. AND IF --
18 SEE WHAT THE RESULTS ARE IF THE PLAN WERE TO BE IMPLEMENTED.
19 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT'S GROWTH
20 PATTERN BREAKING DOWN HOW THE 900,000 ADDITIONAL NEW
21 HOUSEHOLDS EXPECTED IN THE REGION BETWEEN NOW AND 2050 WILL BE
22 DISTRIBUTED BY COUNTY. AS A REMINDER, THAT HOUSEHOLD GROWTH
23 FIGURE IS DOWN BY SEVERAL HUNDRED HOUSEHOLDS IN THE PREVIOUS
24 PLAN. WE SEE HOW THE PLAN ACHIEVES A CONCENTRATED GROWTH
25 PATTERN FOR NEW HOUSING WITH NEARLY 90% OF GROWTH TAKING PLACE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 IN THE PLAN'S GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WITH SIGNIFICANT PERCENTAGE
2 IN LOCALLY NOMINATED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS, AS WELL AS IN
3 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. THE MAJORITY OF HOUSEHOLD GROWTH IS GOING
4 TO AREAS SUCH AS SILICON VALLEY, THE PENINSULA, AS WELL AS
5 PARTS OF THE EAST BAY WITH MORE MODEST GROWTH IN AREAS OF THE
6 NORTH BAY, FOR EXAMPLE. NEXT SLIDE. FOCUSING SPECIFICALLY ON
7 JOB LOCATION, WE AGAIN SEE A RELATIVELY CONCENTRATED GROWTH
8 PATTERN WITH 70% OF THE REGION'S 1.3 MILLION ANTICIPATED NEW
9 JOBS INSIDE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT
10 HERE WE'RE SHOWING JOBS AS MEASURED BY THE PHYSICAL LOCATION
11 OF THE EMPLOYER. BASICALLY, WHERE A JOB IS LOCATED ON PAPER,
12 NOT THE PHYSICAL LOCATION OF EMPLOYEES. IT DOES NOT ACCOUNT
13 FOR THE SHARE OF JOBS THAT ARE EXPECTED TO BE PERFORMED FROM
14 HOME ON A TYPICAL DAY, WHICH MAY TAKE PLACE IN DIFFERENT
15 COUNTIES AND DIFFERENT TYPES OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. WE EXPECT
16 ON A TYPICAL DAY IN 2050 A QUARTER OF JOBS WILL BE PERFORMED
17 REMOTELY WHICH IS DOWN SLIGHTLY FROM THE 2023 SHARE OF 28%
18 CONSIDER VARIATION ACROSS REGION BY COUNTY EMPLOYMENT SECTOR
19 AND INCOME LEVELS. YOU SEE FUTURE GROWTH OF THESE NEW EMPLOYER
20 JOBS HEAVILY CONCENTRATED IN SILICON VALLEY AND THE PENINSULA.
21 DRIVING FACTORS MOST IMPORTANTLY POST-COVID THERE IS A LOT OF
22 OFFICE VACANCY IN THESE AREAS A LOT OF EXISTING SPACE THAT CAN
23 ABSORB THESE NEW JOBS ESPECIALLY SINCE A LOT OF THE NEW JOB
24 GROWTH IS ANTICIPATED TO BE IN MORE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES
25 ORIENTED INDUSTRIES THAT WILL FIND THESE LOCATIONS ATTRACTIVE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 TO BEGIN WITH. THIS CONTRIBUTES TO LESS SPILLOVER EFFECTS IN
2 TERMS OF NEW OFFICE DEVELOPMENT IN OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION,
3 WE'RE ALSO SEEING POST-PANDEMIC CHANGES IN WORKPLACE DESIGN
4 THAT ALLOW MORE NEW JOBS TO FIT INTO EXISTING AVAILABLE SPACE.
5 WHICH, AGAIN, MAKES EXISTING LOCATIONS WITH HIGH VACANCIES
6 ATTRACTIVE TO FUTURE JOBS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IN TERMS OF
7 A MORE AFFORDABLE BAY AREA, WE DO SEE THAT HOUSING COST
8 BURDENS WILL DECLINE SIGNIFICANTLY BETWEEN 2023 AND 2050,
9 ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE WITH THE FEWEST MEANS TO AFFORD BAY AREA
10 HOMES GOING FROM AROUND 70% OF HOUSEHOLD INCOME SPENT ON
11 HOUSING IN 2023 TO JUST AROUND A QUARTER OF INCOME SPENT ON
12 HOUSING IN 2050. SIMILAR TO RESULTS WE SAW IN PLANNED BAY AREA
13 2050 REGARDING HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND DRAMATIC IMPROVEMENT
14 OVER THE 502 ITERATIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA. THE POLICIES
15 INVESTMENTS INCLUDED IN THE PLAN WILL MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE
16 FOR HOUSEHOLDS WITH LOW-INCOMES IF THE PLAN IS IMPLEMENTED. WE
17 ALSO SEE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT SUCCEEDS IN PRODUCING AND
18 PRESERVING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING WITH THE PLAN'S AFFORDABLE
19 HOUSING STRATEGIES RESULTING IN MORE THAN ONE QUARTER OF THE
20 REGIONAL HOUSING STOCK BEING PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE WITH
21 NEARLY 1 MILLION AFFORDABLE HOUSING UNITS BY THE YEAR 2050.
22 NOW, WE KNOW THAT DELIVERING THESE OUTCOMES WILL COST A LOT OF
23 MONEY, AND THE KEY FOCUS AREA FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WILL BE
24 REFINING STRATEGIES TO INTEGRATE POTENTIAL DEVELOPMENT COST
25 REDUCTION APPROACHES TO MAKE THE MOST OF PUBLIC INVESTMENTS



JUNE 14, 2024

1 AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING WITH STAFF AT
2 THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY TO DEVELOP AND QUANTIFY
3 THESE MEASURES FOR INTEGRATION INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. AND
4 YOU CAN EXPECT TO HEAR MORE IN THE FALL IN AREAS PRECEDING
5 THAT EVENT IN AREAS WE'RE PROPOSING FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.
6 NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FINDINGS REVEAL A CONNECTED
7 BAY AREA IN THE YEAR 2050 ALTHOUGH I WANT TO ADD ONE IMPORTANT
8 CAVEAT WHICH IS THAT THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID NOT CONTAIN
9 SIGNIFICANT TRANSPORTATION EXPANSION ENHANCEMENT INVESTMENTS
10 WHICH WILL BE IDENTIFIED THROUGH TRANSIT 2050+ THE FINAL
11 BLUEPRINT PROCESS ACTIVITY SHIFTS CONNECTIVITY IMPROVEMENTS
12 WERE DRIVEN BY POLICY LAND USE SHIFTS LEVERAGING THE REGION'S
13 EXISTING TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT SAID IN 2050 WE SEE THE
14 BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE ABLE TO ACCESS DESTINATIONS MORE
15 EASILY BECAUSE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AND GROWTH
16 GEOGRAPHIES PRIORITIZE DEVELOPMENT AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR
17 FREQUENT TRANSIT INCREASE OF 5% OF TOTAL NUMBER OF HOUSEHOLDS
18 WITHIN HALF MILE OF FREQUENT TRANSIT AND EVEN LARGER INCREASE
19 IN THE NUMBER OF LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS WITHIN HALF MILE OF
20 FREQUENT TRANSIT WE LOOK AT RELIABILITY OF TRANSPORTATION
21 SYSTEM AS A WHOLE OFFERING A MIXED PICTURE HERE WE SEE CERTAIN
22 CORRIDORS SUCH AS OAKLAND TO SAN FRANCISCO TRAVEL TIME
23 REDUCTIONS HOWEVER ON OTHER SEGMENTS SLIGHTLY HIGHER COMMUTE
24 TIMES WHICH IS NOT SURPRISING CONSIDERING AMOUNT OF POPULATION
25 GROWTH WE ARE EXPECTING TO SEE REGIONALLY AND SLIGHT INCREASES



JUNE 14, 2024

1 IN TRAVEL TIMES MUCH LESS THAN PROJECTED TREND IF WE ARE
2 TOLLING PROGRAMS IMPLEMENTED IN THE FUTURE WITH RESPECT TO
3 TRANSIT. NOT SURPRISING, GIVEN THE SIGNIFICANT POPULATION
4 GROWTH WE'RE SEEING, LOWER LEVELS OF BASELINE TRANSIT SERVICE
5 POST-PANDEMIC AND LACK OF EXPANSION INVESTMENTS IN THE DRAFT
6 BLUEPRINT. SO, WE EXPECT THIS CROWDING TO HOPEFULLY MODERATE
7 SOMEWHAT AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN THE PROCESS. KEY FOCUS AREA FOR
8 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WILL BE TO IDENTIFY COST EFFECTIVE
9 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS THAT ALIGN WITH THE PLAN'S LIMITED
10 EXPANSION ENHANCEMENT REVENUES. WE'RE ALSO GOING TO LOOK AT
11 OPTIMIZING PRICING STRATEGIES TO IDENTIFY AND RELIABILITY
12 ISSUES AS WELL AS GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGET.
13 NEXT SLIDE. IN TERMS OF WHETHER THE BAY AREA COMMUNITIES WILL
14 BE MORE INCLUSIVE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WITH SHARE OF HOUSEHOLDS
15 WITH LOW-INCOMES THAT ARE ABLE TO ACCESS WIDER RANGE OF
16 HOUSING OPTIONS INCREASE BY 10% REGION-WIDE INCLUDING IN
17 TRANSIT-RICH AND HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS IN TERMS OF WHETHER BAY
18 AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE ABLE TO STAY IN PLACE THIS IS A LITTLE
19 COMPLICATED WHILE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT EXPANDS RENTAL
20 PROTECTIONS AND AT RISK AFFORDABLE HOUSING SOME LOW-INCOME
21 RESIDENTS MAY RELOCATE TO ACCESS NEW HOUSING INCLUDING
22 HOMEOWNERSHIP OPPORTUNITIES AS WELL AS OTHER AMENITIES. OUR
23 TAKEAWAY HERE IS THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES HELP
24 ACCELERATE UPWARD MOBILITY AS WELL AS EXPAND ACCESS TO
25 OPPORTUNITY. NEXT SLIDE. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FINDINGS SHOW



JUNE 14, 2024

1 SEVERAL IMPROVEMENTS WHEN IT COMES TO THE OVERALL HEALTH OF
2 THE BAY AREA'S ENVIRONMENT WE SEE POSITIVE TRENDS IN COMMUTE
3 MODE SHARE EVEN WITHOUT TRANSIT EXPANSION INVESTMENT WE SEE
4 DECREASE IN AUTO TRIPS WHILE INCREASE IN TRANSIT ACTIVE
5 TRANSPORTATION TRIPS SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENTS IN BICYCLE AND
6 PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE AS WELL AS MORE DENSE AND WALKABLE
7 NEIGHBORHOODS HELP CONTRIBUTE TO THIS SHIFT. IT'S IMPORTANT TO
8 NOTE ON TRANSIT THAT ALTHOUGH WE ARE SEEING SOME IMPROVEMENT,
9 THAT 10% TRANSIT FIGURE, IN 2050, IS LOWER THAN OUR ACTUAL
10 2019 TRANSIT MODE SHARE WHICH WAS ABOVE 13%. AND WAY BELOW THE
11 PROJECTED 2050 TRANSIT MODE SHARE FROM THE PREVIOUS LONG RANGE
12 PLAN WHICH WAS 19%. WE MAY NOT BE ABLE TO GET ALL THE WAY BACK
13 TO 19% GIVEN WORK-FROM-HOME TRENDS AND OTHER DYNAMICS. BUT WE
14 THINK THERE IS A LOT MORE WE CAN DO TO DRAW RIDERS OLD AND NEW
15 TO THE SYSTEM AND FURTHER REDUCE AUTO MODE SHARE. BUT THAT'S A
16 STORY THAT THE TRANSIT 2050+ EFFORT IS GOING TO HELP US TELL
17 AS WELL AS MAJOR FOCUS AREA FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT.
18 ANTICIPATING THAT BAY AREA RESIDENTS WILL BE HEALTHIER AND
19 SAFER, AS WELL. ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES DRAFT PROTECTING
20 COMMUNITIES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE, WE SEE DECREASES IN ROADWAY
21 FATALITIES AND INJURIES. WE SEE MAJOR INVESTMENT IN PRESERVING
22 HABITAT CREATING NEW PARKS, INCREASING PRESERVED LANDS BY 30
23 ACRES PER THOUSAND RESIDENTS. INVESTMENTS IN VULNERABLE
24 ECOSYSTEMS TOPPING 2 MILLION ACRES PROTECTED, PLANS TO ADAPT
25 TO SEA LEVEL RISE AND INCORPORATING LARGE PORTFOLIO OF GREEN



JUNE 14, 2024

1 AND GRAY INVESTMENTS RESTORATION IN THE REGION. ADDITIONAL
2 FOCUS AREAS FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT INCLUDING INTEGRATING UPDATED
3 COST ASSUMPTIONS RELATED TO SEA LEVEL RISE UPGRADES INTO OUR
4 ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THAT SAID, WE DO HAVE
5 A GAP IN TERMS OF THE PLAN'S STATUTORILY REQUIRED GREENHOUSE
6 GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS TARGET. OUR PREVIOUS PLAN MET AND
7 EXCEEDED THE 19% PER CAPITA TARGET SET BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR
8 RESOURCES BOARD HOWEVER REALIZING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
9 STRATEGIES UNDER UPDATED ASSUMPTIONS YIELDS MODERATED GHG GAP
10 OF ROUGHLY THREE POINTS THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS HURTING
11 US IN THAT ANALYSIS. IN PARTICULAR THERE ARE FEWER PEOPLE
12 TAKING TRANSIT AND THAT IS HAVING A VERY SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON
13 OUR ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR GHG GOALS. AND, ALSO, WE HAVE LOWER
14 POPULATION GROWTH, WHICH, AGAIN, IT'S A LITTLE BIT COUNTER
15 INTUITIVE, BUT THE GHG REDUCTION TARGET IS A PER CAPITA
16 POPULATION, PER CAPITA CALCULATION, SO, ALL THINGS EQUAL
17 HAVING A HIGHER POPULATION THAT'S FOCUSED IN LOW VMT AREAS,
18 CAN HELP WITH THAT CALCULATION. SO, WHEN WE ANALYZE THE DRAFT
19 BLUEPRINT, WE SEE THAT THE -- IT IS ABLE TO MAINTAIN A SIMILAR
20 GHG REDUCTION GAP AS THE REANALYSIS OF THE PREVIOUS PLAN.
21 ALTHOUGH THERE IS A LOT GOING ON UNDER THE SERVICE THERE. SO,
22 HAVING, YOU KNOW, NOT HAVING TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, AND A
23 TIGHTER TRANSPORTATION FISCAL CONSTRAINT, AS WELL AS A
24 SLIGHTLY MORE DISPERSED LAND USE PATTERN IS HURTING US,
25 HOWEVER THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID INCLUDE SIGNIFICANT



JUNE 14, 2024

1 INVESTMENTS IN CLEAN VEHICLE STRATEGIES, FOR EXAMPLE, WHICH IS
2 HELPING US KIND OF STAND -- STAY PUT IN TERMS OF THAT GHG GAP.
3 SO, WE THINK THERE ARE GOING TO BE SEVERAL THINGS THAT WE CAN
4 DO THAT WILL HELP US CLOSE THAT GAP AS PART OF THE FINAL
5 BLUEPRINT AND WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO THIS BODY LATER IN THE
6 FALL TO DISCUSS THESE OPTIONS FURTHER. BUT, YOU KNOW,
7 INCORPORATING THE STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS FROM TRANSIT
8 2050+ WILL HELP, NOT JUST THE EXPANSION IN SERVICE
9 ENHANCEMENTS, BUT, ALSO, THE EMPHASIS, POTENTIAL EMPHASIS ON
10 SAFETY AND SECURITY AND OTHER CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE STRATEGIES
11 THAT CAN, AGAIN, HELP DRAW RIDERS OLD AND NEW TO THE SYSTEM.
12 BEING MORE TARGETED AND STRATEGIC WITH OUR HIGHWAY AND EXPRESS
13 LANES INVESTMENTS, ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF THE PLAN'S FISCAL
14 CONSTRAINT, AS WELL AS THE FANTASTIC THAT SOME OF THESE
15 INVESTMENTS DO HURT US WITH RESPECT TO OUR GHG GOALS, AND
16 FINALLY, PRICING IS ANOTHER TOOL, IMPORTANT TOOL IN THE
17 TOOLKIT. SO, ALL OF THOSE THINGS WILL BE ON THE TABLE, AND
18 WE'LL BE LOOKING FOR FEEDBACK FROM OUR PARTNERS, THE PUBLIC,
19 AS WELL AS POLICY MAKERS, AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN THE NEXT FEW
20 MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF A VIBRANT BAY AREA, WE DO
21 EXPECT THE BAY AREA ECONOMY WILL THRIVE IN THE FUTURE. THE
22 REGION'S GROSS REGIONAL PRODUCT IS PROJECTED TO GROW BY 66%
23 OVER THE NEXT THREE DECADES, AND ECONOMY STRATEGIES SUCH AS
24 GUARANTEED INCOME AND SUPPORT FOR FIRST TIME HOMEOWNERSHIP
25 ENSURE BENEFITS OF THIS GROWTH ARE FELT BROADLY AT THE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 REGION'S DOWNTOWN ALSO RECOVERING FROM THE PANDEMIC IN TERMS
2 OF CENTRAL AREAS OF SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, AND OAKLAND
3 ANTICIPATED TO SEE FULL RECOVERY SPURRED BY MORE EFFICIENT USE
4 OF OFFICE SPACE AND GREATER MIX OF COMMERCIAL AND RESIDENTIAL
5 USES COMPARED 2023 TO 2050 WE EXPECT SIGNIFICANT INCREASES IN
6 THE NUMBER OF IN-PERSON WORKERS NUMBER OF NON-WORK TRIPS AND
7 RESIDENTS OF THE DOWNTOWN REGION'S BIG THREE CITIES NEXT
8 SLIDE. WE'LL BE DOING A FULL RELEASE OF THE COMPLETE SET OF
9 DRAFT BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES IF COMING WEEKS FOLLOWING THIS
10 COMMITTEE MEETING AND THAT IS GOING HELP US MOVE INTO THE NEXT
11 ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT WHICH WE'RE ANTICIPATING KICKING OFF IN
12 AUGUST AND MOVING THROUGH SEPTEMBER. THE GOALS OF THAT
13 ENGAGEMENT EFFORT WILL BE TO SHARE THESE OUTCOMES, AS WELL AS
14 THE DRAFT NETWORK FOR TRANSIT 2050+, GATHER FEEDBACK ON SOME
15 OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOCUS AREAS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED, AS
16 WELL AS START DISCUSSING POTENTIAL EARLY IMPLEMENTATION
17 PRIORITIES. IN TERMS OF THE TOUCH POINTS, WE'RE PROPOSING TO
18 DO POP-UP TABLING EVENTS ACROSS THE NINE COUNTIES, REALLY
19 EMPHASIZING THE ABILITY FOR FOLKS TO HAVE TIME FLEXIBLE
20 PARTICIPATION THROUGH VARIOUS ONLINE ACTIVITIES PURSUING CEO
21 PARTNERSHIPS AND EPC ORGANIZATIONS AS WELL AS ORGANIZATIONS
22 THAT SERVE TRIBAL AND NATIVE AMERICAN COMMUNITIES AND SUITE OF
23 ACTIVITIES THAT ENGAGE PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS PUBLIC
24 COMMENT PERIOD AS WELL AS PROVIDE BRIEF UPDATES IN THE JULY
25 COMMITTEE MEETING. IN TERMS OF TIMELINE WE'LL BE HAVING PUBLIC



JUNE 14, 2024

1 RELEASE OF DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK STRATEGIES IN COMING
2 WEEKS WE WILL BE KICKING OFF SECOND ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT IN
3 AUGUST AND CONCLUDING IN SEPTEMBER WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO
4 THIS BODY TO PROVIDE UPDATES ON 2050+ AS WELL AS DRAFT EQUITY
5 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES LATER THIS SUMMER AND EARLY FALL IN
6 OCTOBER LOOKING TO PRESENT SOME FINAL BLUEPRINT INITIAL
7 RECOMMENDATIONS IN TERMS OF POTENTIAL STRATEGY AND REFINEMENT
8 SHARE FINDINGS FROM ROUND TWO ENGAGEMENT IN NOVEMBER AND
9 FINALLY SEEK COMMISSION AND ABAG APPROVAL FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT
10 STRATEGIES WHICH WILL INCLUDE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT AND
11 TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT THANK YOU FOR YOUR
12 TIME THIS MORNING WE ARE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY
13 HAVE

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION BUT THE
16 WEEKEND FOLLOWING SO IT GIVES US ALL SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT.
17 COUPLE QUESTIONS. ON HOUSING ASSUMPTIONS SUPPLY AND DEMAND
18 CALCULATED INTO THIS BECAUSE THAT DRIVES PRICES OF HOMES WHERE
19 DOES THAT EQUATE INTO YOUR ASSUMPTIONS.

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WE'RE LOOKING AT CURRENT CONDITIONS THEN
22 PROJECTING FUTURE CONDITIONS BASED UPON, YOU KNOW, WHERE THE
23 BAY AREA SITS IN THE BROADER NATIONAL ECONOMY. SO, I THINK ONE
24 OF THE THINGS THAT OUR MODEL AND OUR FORECAST, I THINK, LIKES
25 ABOUT THE BAY AREA IS THAT IT SEES THE BAY AREA AS AN AREA



JUNE 14, 2024

1 WITH A LOT OF AMENITIES, YOU KNOW, A STRONG EDUCATED
2 WORKFORCE, YOU KNOW, A LOT OF HIGH TECH INDUSTRIES. AND
3 COMPARING THE BAY AREA'S AMENITIES AND ENDOWMENTS, SO TO
4 SPEAK, YOU KNOW, TO THE REST OF THE COUNTRY, IT SEES THE BAY
5 AREA AS A STRONG REGION MOVING FORWARD. AND THAT IS DEFINITELY
6 GOING TO DRIVE, YOU KNOW, DESPITE THE UPS AND DOWNS, AND BOOMS
7 AND BUSTS, OVER TIME, IT WILL CONTINUE TO DRIVE STRONG DEMAND
8 IN THE REGION FOR BOTH POPULATION AND JOBS. YOU KNOW, ON THE
9 SUPPLY SIDE, THERE ARE, CERTAINLY, CONSTRAINTS THAT, YOU KNOW,
10 WE HAVE IN THE PRESENT, BUT I THINK PART OF OUR FORECAST DOES
11 ASSUME THAT THE REGION WILL SEE SOME SUCCESS IN IMPLEMENTING
12 THE POLICIES IN THE PLAN, WHICH DO SEEK TO DRIVE GREATER
13 INCREASES IN SUPPLY, PARTICULARLY FOR HOUSING. SO, I THINK,
14 YOU KNOW, IF WE WERE TO HAVE, LIKE, A STATUS QUO TYPE
15 FORECAST, YOU KNOW, MAYBE WE WOULD SEE, YOU KNOW, SLIGHTLY
16 LOWER, YOU KNOW, HOUSING GROWTH IN THE FUTURE. BUT THE PLAN
17 DOES ASSUME THAT THE STRATEGIES THAT IT PROPOSES WILL HAVE
18 SOME SUCCESS IN BEING IMPLEMENTED, WHICH ALL THINGS EQUAL,
19 WILL ALLOW MORE PEOPLE WHO WOULD COME TO THE REGION WHO MIGHT
20 NOT BE ABLE TO.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WHEN YOU COME BACK WITH NO
23 ASSUMPTIONS DO YOU ADJUST THE PLAN? BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO HAVE
24 A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE -- I MEAN IMPACT ON SUPPLY, I MEAN, A



JUNE 14, 2024

1 SURGE OF SUPPLY. BUT IF IT DOESN'T PASS, I SEE THE TREND THAT
2 WE'RE DEALING WITH RIGHT NOW TODAY.

3

4 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I THINK WE WILL KNOW IN NOVEMBER, YOU KNOW,
5 WHICH WILL BE IN ADVANCE OF SOME OF THE FINAL ACTIONS THAT WE
6 WILL BE TAKING TO MOVE THE PLAN INTO THE ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE.
7 AND I THINK WE CAN CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, TAKE THAT INTO
8 CONSIDERATION WHEN WE HAVE MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THE SUCCESS
9 OF THE MEASURE. BUT, I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT, YOU
10 KNOW, THE MEASURE IS OBVIOUSLY GOING TO BE VERY IMPORTANT FOR
11 THE REGION. BUT THE YOU KNOW, THE NEED OVER THE 25 YEARS IS
12 VERY, VERY LARGE. AND I THINK, YOU KNOW, THE MEASURE IS GOING
13 TO BE A NECESSARY, BUT NOT SUFFICIENT, YOU KNOW, POLICY
14 INTERVENTION THAT'S GOING HELP US GET TO OUR GOALS.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. I JUST HOPE STAFF IS NOT
17 UNDERESTIMATING THE IMPACT THAT MEASURE CAN HAVE. I MEAN, IT
18 IS SIGNIFICANT. AND, SO, AND MY LAST QUESTION, TO MY
19 COLLEAGUES IS, AT WHAT POINT DO YOU CONSIDER THE JOB TRENDS,
20 OR PEOPLE GOING TO THE OFFICE, WHEN DO YOU CONSIDER THIS BEING
21 THE NORM? I MEAN, YOU ARE -- YOU KNOW, ARE READING REPORTS,
22 WHERE MATT AND I WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS YESTERDAY, WERE
23 READING REPORTS, AND ONE WE WERE TALKING ABOUT IS AN
24 ACCOUNTING FIRM HAD 70 DESKS AND TABLES, AND CUBICLES, THEY'RE
25 DOWN TO SEVEN. ALL THOSE EMPLOYER EMPLOYEES ARE WORKING FROM



JUNE 14, 2024

1 HOME THEY ARE TOLD THIS IS THE NEW BUSINESS MODEL. THAT'S
2 COMMON TODAY AT SOME POINT WHEN DO YOU ACCEPT THIS IS THE NORM
3 AND WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT BRINGING RIDERS BACK I THINK WE
4 REALLY NEED TO START PUTTING FOCUS ON DEVELOPING NEW RIDERS
5 THAT'S GOING TO BE THE FUTURE OF TRANSIT DEVELOPING NEW
6 RIDERS. HOW DO WE DEVELOP THOSE PEOPLE THAT ARE COMFORTABLE
7 WITH THE SYSTEM USE IT, ARE FAMILIAR WITH IT, YOU KNOW, --
8 GROWN UP WITH IT. AND, SO, IS THERE A POINT THAT WE SAY THIS
9 IS THE NORM? SO, WE START MEASURING FROM HERE AND STOP TALKING
10 ABOUT THIS SURGE OF RETURNING RIDERS?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** HAPPY TO OFFER A COUPLE OF COMMENTS AND IF MY
13 COLLEAGUES WANT TO JUMP IN FEEL FREE AS WELL. I WOULD SAY WITH
14 RESPECT TO THE JOB TRENDS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE WORKING WITH THE
15 BEST AVAILABLE DATA THAT WE HAVE. WE KNOW THERE HAVE BEEN A
16 NUMBER OF SHIFTS, AND I THINK WHERE WE HAVE LANDED IS THAT
17 WHERE THE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS ARE RIGHT NOW, THEY'RE NOT
18 LIKELY TO CHANGE SIGNIFICANTLY.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY.

21

22 **CHIRAG RABARI:** -- INTO THE FUTURE. I THINK RIGHT NOW WE SAW
23 THAT WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS SPIKE AND THEN HAVE DECLINED A
24 LITTLE BIT, BUT HAVE, YOU KNOW, GENERALLY BEEN PRETTY STABLE
25 OVER, YOU KNOW, THE MOST RECENT KIND OF DATA POINTS THAT HAVE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 BEEN AVAILABLE. SO, WE -- WE ARE NOT -- WE ARE NOT
2 ANTICIPATING THAT THAT AMOUNT IS GOING TO CHANGE VERY
3 SIGNIFICANTLY FROM WHERE IT IS OBVIOUSLY AS WE MOVE INTO
4 FUTURE PLANNING CYCLES, WE CAN REASSESS, BUT WE THINK WE'RE
5 PRETTY CLOSE TO WHAT THE NEW NORMAL IS RIGHT NOW AND THAT IS
6 REALLY GOING TO DRIVE A LOT OF THE, AGAIN, YOU KNOW, HOW JOBS
7 ARE GOING TO BE LOCATED IN THE FUTURE, AND THAT, YOU KNOW,
8 THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO SEE AS MUCH NEW OFFICE DEVELOPMENT AS
9 WE PREVIOUSLY WOULD HAVE. THERE IS ALL OF THIS EXISTING SPACE
10 THAT IS ACROSS THE REGION THAT WILL PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES FOR,
11 YOU KNOW, NEW FIRMS TO GROW AND EXPAND INTO EXISTING SPACE. SO
12 WE THINK WE'RE PRETTY CLOSE TO THAT NEW NORMAL RIGHT NOW, BUT
13 OF COURSE WE'LL ASSESSING AS DATA BECOMES AVAILABLE.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I THINK WE OUGHT MAKE THAT PINT
16 BECAUSE YOU KNOW PEOPLE HEAR A LOT -- PEOPLE TALKING ABOUT
17 RECOVERING RIDERSHIP PRE-PANDEMIC. MATT?

18

19 **MATT MALONEY:** WE TALK A LOT OF COMMUTE TRIPS WITH TRANSIT
20 ACTUALLY THOSE WERE, SORT OF, OF THE METRICS WE SHOWED YOU
21 TODAY IT'S IMPORTANT THOSE ARE SMALL PERCENTAGE OF THE TRIP
22 PERCENTAGES. SO EVEN THE WORK-FROM-HOME TRENDS ARE UP FOLKS
23 ARE WORKING FROM HOME STILL MAKING A BUNCH OF DIFFERENT TRIPS
24 THROUGHOUT THE DAY AND WE NEED TO LOOK AT HOW THE PUBLIC
25 TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA CAN ADAPT THE NEW REALITY AND



JUNE 14, 2024

1 TRANSIT 2050 MOSS IS LOOKING AT THAT I THINK WE SHOW SOME OF
2 THOSE RESULTS LATER, CHANGES IN TERMS OF TRYING TO MOVE SOME
3 OF THE BUS SYSTEMS FORWARD AND REALLY HELP KIND OF MATCH WHERE
4 PEOPLE ARE LIVING AND WORKING. THAT'S THE HUGE KEY FOR THE
5 REGION SOME OF THE HEAVY TRUNK LINE SYSTEMS WE CAN'T MOVE THEM
6 BUT FOR BUSES AND RUBBER TIRE SOLUTIONS WE HAVE MORE
7 FLEXIBILITY THERE AND WE'RE EXPLORING THAT AND IS A BIG PART
8 EVER ATTRACTING NEW RIDERS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IN MY COUNTY WE HAVE FOUR CITIES THAT
11 ARE RUNNING MICRO TRANSIT THAT'S IMPORTANT WE'RE NOT RUNNING
12 THE BIG BUSES BUT MICRO TRANSIT IS MEETING THAT DEMAND THAT
13 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. SUE THEN PAT.

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** FOLLOW UP ON A COUPLE OF THINGS. WHERE DOES -- WE
16 HAVE ALL BEEN DEALING WITH THE RHNA HOUSING ELEMENT ISSUES,
17 AND THEY KIND OF -- THEY STEER CONSTRUCTION AND THINGS ONE
18 WAY, AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GOES, SORT OF, ANOTHER WAY, AND
19 HOW WOULD THOSE TWO THINGS GET MARRIED UP IN THE PLANNED BAY
20 AREA 2050. ONE EXAMPLE THE PARK LANDS NUMBER GOES UP. I'M NOT
21 SURE HOW THAT WORKS WHEN WE'RE BUILDING 972,000 NEW HOMES AND
22 SOMEHOW OPEN SPACE INCREASES, YET MOST OF THE POLICIES AND
23 HOUSING ELEMENTS THAT WE HAVE DO FILL UP A LOT OF THAT OPEN
24 SPACE I'M NOT SURE HOW ALL OF THAT HANGS TOGETHER.

25



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I WOULD SAY, WITH RESPECT TO THE PLAN AND RHNA,
2 WE ARE REQUIRED TO BE CONSISTENT. I MEAN, THAT IS A STATUTORY
3 REQUIREMENT. YOU KNOW, WHAT THAT MEANS IN PRACTICE IS THAT
4 THE, YOU KNOW, THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION THAT IS,
5 YOU KNOW, THE EIGHT YEAR FIGURE, ARE OUR LONGER -- [PHONE
6 RINGING] [LAUGHTER] YOU KNOW, OUR LONG RANGE -- YOU KNOW --

7

8 **SUE NOACK:** YOU'RE NEVER GOING TO GET THROUGH THIS ANSWER
9 [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **CHIRAG RABARI:** OUR LONG RANGE FORECAST, IT CANNOT BE SMALLER
12 THAN THAT NUMBER.

13

14 **SUE NOACK:** RIGHT.

15

16 **CHIRAG RABARI:** IT'S BASICALLY, AND ALSO THAT NUMBER WORKS AT
17 THE COUNTY LEVEL, RIGHT? WE CAN'T HAVE A LOWER NUMBER THAN THE
18 RHNA FIGURE OVER THE LONGER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] YEAR PERIOD.
19 WITH RESPECT TO THE PARK LANDS, YOU KNOW, WE'RE PROPOSING
20 INVESTMENTS THAT WILL IMPROVE ACCESS TO OPEN SPACE AND, YOU
21 KNOW, A LOT OF THAT IS -- CAN BE, YOU KNOW, SITE SPECIFIC,
22 PARCEL SPECIFIC, THAT EVEN IN LARGER DEVELOPMENT AREAS, THERE
23 ARE OFTEN -- THERE IS OFTEN GOING TO BE OPEN SPACE THAT IS SET
24 ASIDE WITHIN THESE LARGER DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS. AND THAT, YOU
25 KNOW, THERE ARE -- THERE REMAIN ACQUISITION OPPORTUNITIES THAT



JUNE 14, 2024

1 ARE, YOU KNOW, BEYOND THE REGION'S GROWTH BOUNDARIES. BUT I
2 THINK, YOU KNOW, IN THE CONTEXT OF THE LONG RANGE PLAN, THESE
3 ARE -- THESE ARE POLICY GOALS, AND HOW TO MAKE THAT WORK IN
4 PRACTICE IS FOCUS FOR IMPLEMENTATION.

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** YEAH THAT'S GOING TO BE THE INTERESTING PIECE WHILE
7 GREEN SPACE SET ASIDE YOU MAKE BIG DEVELOPMENTS, YOU'RE TAKING
8 BIG EMPTY PLOT OF LAND THAT WAS CONSIDERED OPEN SPACE AND
9 FILLING IT UP WITH SMALL GREEN SPACE AT THE END SO MAYBE IT'S
10 HOW YOU DEFINE OPEN SPACE VERSUS VACANT LAND IS SOMETHING
11 THAT'S THE ISSUE. I THINK JIM'S POINT ON THE MEASURE
12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND MEASURE IS SUPER IMPORTANT WITHOUT
13 THAT EVERYTHING, SORT OF, FALLS APART. BECAUSE THE AFFORDABLE
14 HOUSING TO DATE HAS STRUGGLED BECAUSE OF FINANCING. AND
15 WITHOUT THAT. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU GUYS ARE -- HAVE GOT A
16 PLAN B? WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT PLAN BS AROUND HERE LATELY, BUT
17 A PLAN B IF IT DOESN'T GO THROUGH, THE WHOLE BAY AREA 2050
18 CHANGES. THE OTHER THING THAT, YOU KNOW, WE TALKED ABOUT
19 BUILDING RIDERSHIP UP, AND MICRO TRANSIT POINT. I'M HOPING
20 TRANSIT 2050 ALSO REALLY LOOKS AT, NOT ONLY WHERE PEOPLE ARE
21 WORKING, BUT WHERE PEOPLE ARE PLAYING, AND WHERE THEY'RE GOING
22 TO. BECAUSE -- AND, YOU KNOW, I BROUGHT UP THIS MANY TIMES AT
23 CTA, WE HAVE PEOPLE DRIVING ALL OVER THE COUNTY TAKING KIDS TO
24 SCHOOL. THAT IS MASSIVE RESTAURANT OPPORTUNITY THAT NEVER GETS
25 ADDRESSED. BUT YOU KNOW IT'S SIGNIFICANT GREENHOUSE EMISSIONS,



JUNE 14, 2024

1 AND THAT PART I JUST DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY WE NEVER TACKLE
2 TRANSPORTATION ISSUES THAT ARE NOT RELATED TO COMMUTERS. IT'S
3 ONLY COMMUTERS. EVERYBODY ELSE SEEMS TO BE FORGOTTEN. AND I
4 THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IF WE'RE LOOKING OUT TO 2050, TO
5 REALLY BE MORE INNOVATIVE IN THE THOUGHT PROCESS ON TRANSIT
6 AND HOW IT'S GOING TO BE USED FOR ALL ASPECTS OF LIFE, NOT
7 JUST FOR THE COMMUTERS. AND, WAIT, I HAVE GOT ONE MORE LITTLE
8 THING I HAVE JOTTED DOWN. YOU BUT I THINK THAT WAS IT I JOTTED
9 IT DOWN AND COULDN'T EVEN READ MY OWN HANDWRITING. THANK YOU

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PAT THEN SILVA. PAT?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR SPERING. REALLY
14 APPRECIATE IT, AND APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS EARLIER, CHAIR. I
15 TOTALLY AGREE. I GUESS I'M STRUGGLING A LITTLE BIT WITH THIS,
16 AS WE PROBABLY ALL ARE. BUT, SO, I'M GOING TO BE MIXING
17 QUESTIONS WITH COMMENTS. SO, HAVE YOU LOOKED AT, BETWEEN 2023
18 AND 2050? AND WHERE DO YOU SEE THE PIVOT POINT? IS IT CLOSER
19 TO 2050? OR IS IT CLOSER TO 2023 [LAUGHTER] -- AND IN TERMS OF
20 INCREASE OF USE OF TRANSIT, INCREASE OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING ALL
21 THE MEASURES THAT YOU'RE PUTTING TOGETHER BECAUSE WHAT I SEE
22 IN THE COMMUNITY IS FAR DIFFERENT THAN WHAT WERE JUST
23 PRESENTED. UM, I READ ABOUT, AS MOST OF US HAVE, HIGH-RISES IN
24 SAN FRANCISCO CONVERTING TO HOMES. AND THAT'S NOT UNCOMMON,
25 BECAUSE, NOW, IN THE SUBURBS, RETAIL MALLS, ACRES AND ACRES



JUNE 14, 2024

1 ARE GOING OUT OF BUSINESS. AND THAT'S BEING CONVERTED TO
2 HOUSING. HOUSING DOESN'T PAY FOR ITSELF. CITIES AND COUNTIES
3 HAVE RELIED ON SALES TAX AND PROPERTY TAX IN ORDER TO PROVIDE
4 SERVICES. I THINK WE HAVE A REALLY FUNDAMENTAL ISSUE HERE, AND
5 IT'S NOT ONLY WHERE PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE LIVING, HOW PEOPLE
6 ARE GOING TO BE MOVED. I COULDN'T AGREE WITH SUE'S COMMENTS
7 EVEN MORE. I MEAN, PEOPLE ARE NOT TAKING TRANSIT. AND I DON'T
8 SEE A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE IN THAT. THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE
9 TAKING TRANSIT TO SAN FRANCISCO. THEY'RE NOT. AND I -- I SEE A
10 DIFFERENT FUTURE. AND MAYBE IT'S BECAUSE I'M IN THE COMMUNITY
11 A LOT MORE, NOW THAT I DON'T COMMUTE TO SAN FRANCISCO OF THE
12 BUT, I SEE BUSES EMPTY. EVEN ON THE LOCAL TRIPS. SO, I GUESS I
13 WOULD LIKE TO SEE A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL ON THE PROJECTIONS
14 BETWEEN 2023, 2024, TO 2050. AND WHERE DO YOU SEE THAT
15 TRAJECTORY CHANGING. BECAUSE I DO NOT SEE IT IN THE NEAR
16 FUTURE. AND THEN, I TOTALLY AGREE WITH SUE'S COMMENTS ABOUT
17 2050 TRANSIT, NEEDS TO BE SO MUCH DIFFERENT THAN WHAT IT IS
18 NOW. AND I DON'T KNOW IF PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE GOING TO
19 BE PREPARED TO BE ABLE TO ADAPT TO IT, BECAUSE WHAT I SEE, AS
20 A LOT OF LOCAL TRIPS, AND PEOPLE ARE DOING THAT MORE WITH
21 BIKES NOW AND WITH SCOOTERS AND WITH A LOT OF OTHER TRANSIT
22 THAT DOESN'T NECESSARILY PUT FAREBOX. AND, SO, I DON'T -- AND
23 WHERE ARE THEY GOING? WHILE THE MALLS ARE CLOSING, SO PEOPLE
24 ARE NOT GOING TO BE GOING TO THE MALLS. THEY'RE GOING TO BE
25 WORKING AT HOME. I DON'T BELIEVE THAT YOUR TRAJECTORY, THAT



JUNE 14, 2024

1 YOU'RE GOING TO SEE AN INCREASE OF PEOPLE COMMUTING TO WORK. I
2 JUST DON'T SEE THAT. BUT, YOU KNOW, I COULD BE SO IMMERSED IN
3 WHAT IS HAPPENING TODAY, BECAUSE MORE AND MORE PEOPLE ARE
4 WORKING AT HOME. I SEE IT ALL THE TIME. SO -- SO, I GUESS I
5 WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME MORE OF THOSE BENCHMARKS IN BETWEEN
6 2023 AND 2050. AND HAVE WE ACTUALLY STARTED LOOKING AT WHAT WE
7 LOOKED AT IN THE PAST PLANNED BAY AREAS TO SEE WHETHER OUR
8 PROJECTIONS ACHIEVED WHAT OUR GUESSTIMATES WERE BECAUSE I
9 THINK THE PANDEMIC IS A FUNDAMENTAL CHANGE TO THE WAY WE LIVE
10 AND WORK AND PLAY AND THAT'S NOT GOING TO GO AWAY. AND I'M NOT
11 SURE WHERE THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT YOU'RE ASSUMING IN THIS ARE
12 GOING TO HAPPEN AND THAT'S WHERE I GUESS THAT'S WHERE THE
13 LEVEL OF DETAIL THAT I NEED TO SEE THAT, UM, AND, AGAIN, I
14 THINK TRANSIT NEEDS TO BE FAR DIFFERENT THAN WHAT IT IS TODAY.
15 AND WE ALSO HAVE TO LOOK AT HOW CAN THE CITIES AND COUNTIES AT
16 THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT CAN PROVIDE THE SERVICES THAT WE'RE
17 PROVIDING TODAY WITHOUT THE REVENUE, ESPECIALLY FROM SALES
18 TAX. YOU'RE GOING TO SEE CITIES BEING BANKRUPT. YOU KNOW,
19 NOVATO, THIS IS OUR THIRD YEAR OF A DEFICIT. WE RELY SO MUCH
20 ON SALES TAX AND PROPERTY TAX, AND SALES TAX IS GOING DOWN
21 SIGNIFICANTLY. BECAUSE BUSINESSES ARE GOING OUT OF BUSINESS.
22 SO, ANYWAY, I GUESS I -- I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A LITTLE BIT
23 MORE DETAIL. AND SORRY THAT THERE IS NOT TOO MANY QUESTIONS,
24 BECAUSE I JUST -- I JUST -- I SAID, I'M NOT SURE THAT THE
25 HOUSING COSTS ARE GOING TO DECLINE. MY MOM HAS HOME CARE.



JUNE 14, 2024

1 THERE IS ONE COMPLEX IN SAN RAFAEL THAT HAS HUNDREDS OF
2 APARTMENTS FILLED WITH ALL HOME CARE PROVIDERS, THAT PRETTY
3 MUCH TWO PEOPLE ARE LIVING IN THE BEDROOM, AND TWO BEDROOM
4 APARTMENT, THERE ARE SIX PEOPLE LIVING IN IT BECAUSE THE
5 LIVING ROOM HAS TWO BEDS, BECAUSE OF THE COST OF HOUSING SO
6 MUCH. MY EYES HAVE BEEN OPENED UP BY HAVING SOME REAL HEART TO
7 HEART DISCUSSIONS ABOUT PEOPLE THAT ARE TRYING TO MAKE IT IN
8 THIS WORLD, THAT DON'T HAVE SOME OF THE ADVANTAGES THAT SOME
9 OF US HAD OF GOING TO COLLEGE. AND, SO, I SEE THERE IS GONNA -
10 - IN MY OPINION, AND I THINK I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME
11 PROJECTIONS ON IT, WHAT IS GOING TO BE THE INCOME FOR THE
12 PEOPLE THAT ARE GOING TO BE HERE IN THE BAY AREA BETWEEN NOW
13 AND 2050, BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WHAT I'M SEEING IS THAT A LOT OF
14 THE PEOPLE THAT CAN'T AFFORD TO BUY A TOWNHOME, OR A HOUSE,
15 ARE MOVING NORTH AND TRYING TO SEE IF THEY CAN AFFORD TO BUY
16 SOMETHING THERE. AND I'M DOING MY DARNEDEST TO TRY TO GET
17 PEOPLE TO BUY HERE SO THAT WE CAN KEEP THE QUALITY OF CARE
18 THAT I NEED FOR MY MOTHER. AND MOST PEOPLE WILL NEED, AS WE
19 AGE. SO, I THINK WE REALLY HAVE A BIGGER CRISIS, I THINK. BUT,
20 I'M NOT SURE THAT WE'RE BEING PREPARED TO HANDLE SOME OF IT.
21 AND SURE WOULD LIKE TO BE A PART OF TRYING TO FRAME THAT SO
22 THAT WE CAN PROVIDE FOR PEOPLE TO LIVE. SO, ANYWAY. JUST SOME
23 COMMENTS FROM MY HEART. I -- I SEE SOMETHING DIFFERENT. AND I
24 THINK WE NEED TO GET DOWN INTO SOME OF THE SPECIFICS, I GUESS.
25 SO, SORRY FOR RAMBLING.



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** MY COMMENTS.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** CINDY THEN STEPHANIE, THEN CARLOS.

7

8 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANKS FOR ALL OF THE
9 COMMENTS THAT PRECEDED ME IN THE PRESENTATION. I WANT TO FIRST
10 SAY THANK YOU TO THE PRESENTER FOR CLARIFYING THE JOBS/HOUSING
11 BALANCE BECAUSE WHEN I INITIALLY LOOKED AT THE 38% OF THE NEW
12 HOUSING TO BEING PROJECTED IN SAN MATEO, SANTA CLARA COUNTY,
13 BUT 58% OF THE JOBS, THAT MEANT THAT IT'S PUSHING HARDER ON
14 THE EAST BAY COUNTIES IN PARTICULAR TO PROVIDE THE HOUSING.
15 AND IT IS NOT EASY, NO MATTER WHAT KIND OF TRANSIT YOU HAVE,
16 IT IS NOT EASY TO NOT DRIVE TO AVOID DRIVING, IF YOU ARE
17 LIVING IN THE EAST BAY AND COMMUTING TO THE SOUTH BAY. OKAY. I
18 DO NOT KNOW WHY -- OKAY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** CINDY?

21

22 **CINDY SILVA:** NO. I WAS RUNNING OUT OF BATTERY SO IT DECIDED TO
23 BLANK EVERYTHING. SO A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. THANK YOU FOR
24 AFFIRMING THAT YOU ARE LOOKING AT THE RHNA REQUIREMENTS IN
25 TERMS OF THE HOUSING ASSUMPTIONS. BUT THERE IS SOMETHING ELSE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 GOING ON IN SACRAMENTO WITH HCD AND THE REGULATORY
2 ENVIRONMENT. OUR NUMBERS ARE NO LONGER -- IT'S NO LONGER JUST
3 A QUANTITATIVE PROCESS. IT IS A QUALITATIVE PROCESS, BECAUSE
4 WE HAVE TO BE FOCUSED ON AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR
5 HOUSING. SO, WHAT WE FOUND IN WALNUT CREEK WITH HCD, THIS
6 CYCLE, WAS THAT IT WASN'T GOOD TO HAVE OUR -- ALL OF OUR
7 HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT AND NEAR DOWNTOWN. WE WERE FORCED TO PUSH
8 SOME OF OUR MIDDLE INCOME AND OUR ASSUMPTION BELOW MARKET RATE
9 HOUSING, FOUR MILES AWAY FROM TRANSIT, WHICH MEANS MORE
10 DRIVING, ET CETERA. THAT ASSUMPTION, I DON'T THINK IS
11 REFLECTED IN THE WAY WE'RE THINKING OF IT, BECAUSE IT IS
12 QUALITATIVE, AND IT'S HARD TO FIGURE OUT WHERE THEY'RE GOING
13 WITH IT. THE OTHER THING IS THINGS LIKE THE BUILDERS REMEDY,
14 CONVERSIONS, AND BY RIGHT ASSUMPTIONS, THOSE ARE NOT
15 STRATEGIC. THAT IS ONE-OFFS THAT COULD OCCUR VERY FAR AWAY
16 FROM TRANSIT. AND VERY FAR AWAY FROM TRANSPORTATION CORRIDORS.
17 SO, WE'RE PROBABLY A LITTLE BEHIND. THEIR ASSUMPTIONS PROBABLY
18 NEED TO BE REASSESSED IN MAYBE 3 TO 4 YEARS. THE -- ONE OF THE
19 CONCERNS I HAVE ABOUT WORKING FROM HOME IS THAT IT'S KILLING
20 DOWNTOWNS. SO, WHERE WE HAD OFFICE CENTERS IN WALNUT CREEK,
21 THOSE OFFICES ARE EMPTY, AND SO LUNCHTIME IS NO LONGER A
22 REALITY IN DOWNTOWN WALNUT CREEK. THE THAT NOT ONLY AFFECTS
23 OUR SALES TAX, AND OUR JOBS, IT AFFECTS OUR LOW-INCOME AND
24 MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY WHO WOULD BE COMING INTO WALNUT CREEK
25 AND COULD BE WORKING IN WALNUT CREEK, WHERE DID THEY GO? SO



JUNE 14, 2024

1 IT'S CHANGING THAT DYNAMIC AND WE DON'T KNOW TO WHAT EXTENT.
2 SO IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL IF WE COULD LOOK AT THIS FROM AN
3 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PERSPECTIVE. IT'S NOT JUST HOUSING AND
4 JOBS, IT'S ALSO, SHOULD WE BE LOOKING AT WAYS TO ENSURE THAT
5 IF YOU WORK-FROM-HOME, BECAUSE YOU DO NOT WANT TO COMMUTE FROM
6 THE EAST BAY TO THE SOUTH BAY, HOW YOU CAN WORK NEAR HOME IN A
7 REMOTE LOCATION FOR YOUR BUSINESS SO THAT SERVICES ARE
8 PROVIDED, AND LOOK AT THAT SO THAT IT GETS BACK TO NOT
9 EVERYTHING BECOMING HOUSING, THAT IT WAS PREVIOUSLY OFFICE.
10 AND I WILL LEAVE THAT, AT ONE OF MY COMMENTS THERE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GOOD COMMENTS CINDY.
13 STEPHANIE.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO APPRECIATE THE
16 COMMENTS OF ALL OF MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS. REALLY GOOD ONES.
17 I WAS LOOKING AT SLIDE 11 ON THE HEALTHIER BAY AREA THAT TIES
18 US BACK TO TRANSPORTATION AND TRANSIT. AND I KNOW YOU'RE GOING
19 TO COME BACK TO US LATER THIS YEAR. I THOUGHT I MIGHT PUT SOME
20 SUGGESTIONS ON THE TABLE, IDEAS I'M SURE THAT THE STAFF HAS
21 ALREADY CONSIDERED. BUT I WANT TO GIVE MY ENDORSEMENT FOR
22 LOOKING AT THESE. I FEEL LIKE OUR TOOLBOX WITH TRANSPORTATION
23 AND TRANSIT IS REALLY LIMITED AND THAT WE DISCUSSED EARLIER,
24 PRICING, LIKE, OH, BOY, LET'S NOT RAISE ANY MORE PRICES FOR
25 ANYTHING. I JUST DO NOT THINK THAT'S A WINNER. I WANTED TO



JUNE 14, 2024

1 OFFER, I'M INTERESTED IN THINGS LIKE, COULD THERE BE A VMT
2 BANK CONCEPT WHERE -- JUST LIKE WE HAVE OUR CAP-AND-TRADE
3 BANK, AND WE HAVE JURISDICTIONS, TRADE VMT ALLOCATION, JUST AS
4 A WAY TO GET AT SOME WINS THAT WAY. I WONDERED IF IT WAS
5 POSSIBLE FOR US TO LOOK AT OUR PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA
6 PROGRAMS MORE CLOSELY IN TERMS OF CARBON SEQUESTRATION
7 POTENTIAL, THAT WE'RE CERTAINLY LOOKING AT IN OUR COUNTY AND I
8 KNOW OTHERS ARE. BUT MY FAVORITE IDEA IS TO SEE IF WE COULD
9 EXPLORE A PILOT TEST WITH CALTRANS ON LOCAL ELECTRIC VEHICLE
10 CHARGING HUBS. I KNOW THAT THERE ARE PROHIBITIONS AT THE STATE
11 AND FEDERAL LEVELS FOR GENERATING REVENUES ON CALTRANS RIGHT
12 OF WAYS AND IN THEIR PARK AND RIDES. BUT I KNOW THAT WE MAY
13 HAVE AT LEAST ONE PARK AND RIDE IN MARIN COUNTY THAT HAS
14 ADJACENT PROPERTY THAT IS NOT OWNED BY CALTRANS. AND I -- I
15 THINK LOOKING AT CHARGING AND VMT -- EXCUSE ME -- AND
16 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION THROUGH ELECTRIC VEHICLES, IT WOULD
17 BE GREAT IF THE MPOS AND COUNTY CMAS COULD HAVE SOME PIECE OF
18 THE GREENHOUSE GAS SAVINGS THAT WE EXPECT TO SEE WITH
19 ELECTRIFICATION. AND THE SAME GOES WITH SOLAR ON THE RIGHT OF
20 WAY. I KNOW CALTRANS IS STARTING INVENTORY, THE POTENTIAL OF
21 THEIR SOLAR CAPACITY AND RIGHTS OF WAY. AND, AGAIN, I WONDER
22 IF THERE IS A POSSIBILITY OF A DEMONSTRATION PROJECT. I WOULD
23 CERTAINLY BE GLAD TO PUT THAT FORWARD WITH DISTRICT FOUR. AND
24 I US TO THINK AS BROADLY AS WE CAN BECAUSE I'M NOT SEEING US



JUNE 14, 2024

1 GETTING WHERE WE NEED TO GET ON OUR GREENHOUSE FOR
2 TRANSPORTATION RELATED. SO THANK YOU FOR TAKING THOSE COMMENTS
3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** CARLOS?

5

6 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YEAH, THIS IS, I THINK, GOING TO BE -- IF I'M
7 STILL AROUND -- THIS IS GOING TO BE MY FOURTH RTP, AND I THINK
8 PREPARING THESE DOCUMENTS IS KIND OF AKIN TO PREPARING KIND OF
9 FINANCIAL PROFORMAS THAT GO THROUGH YEARS THAT REALLY ARE
10 VALUED AT ABOUT FIVE-YEAR BASIS I BELIEVE WE'RE UPDATING THIS.
11 DO I BELIEVE ALL YOUR NUMBERS? I THINK THEY ARE BEST GUESS
12 ESTIMATES, RIGHT? YOU GUYS HAVE BEEN DOING A FAIR AMOUNT OF
13 TESTING THOSE NUMBERS. SPECIFIC TO HOUSING COST, I JUST WANT
14 TO UNDERSTAND THE CAUSE OF ACTION BEHIND YOUR ASSUMPTION THAT,
15 CERTAINLY, AFFORDABILITY WILL BE GREATER IN 2050. ONE, I THINK
16 THE BOND IS PROBABLY PART OF THAT, AS I THINK CHAIR SPERING
17 SAID, I THINK YOU HAVE CONFIRMED THAT. IS FILTERING AT ALL AN
18 ISSUE? SO, 25 YEARS IS PROBABLY LONG ENOUGH WHERE YOU ACTUALLY
19 HAVE HIGHER INCOME UNITS FILTERED OUT. I MEAN, THAT'S MINIMUM,
20 IT'S ABOUT A GENERATION, GENERATION AND A HALF, I THINK WE
21 HAVE SHOULD SOME FILTER HERE I MEAN THAT'S THE MINIMUM, IS GBI
22 ANOTHER WAY THAT WE PUSH THESE AFFORDABILITY NUMBERS DOWN? I
23 MEAN OTHERWISE IF WE DON'T HAVE AN ARRAY OF POLICIES MOVE US
24 IN THIS DIRECTION THE HOUSING BOND ISN'T GOING TO DO IT. THE
25 HOUSING BOND IS GOING TO MOVE US IN A GOOD DIRECTION BUT



JUNE 14, 2024

1 YOU'RE ADDING 900,000 HOMES, WE HAVE 2.5 MILLION, WE GO TO 300
2 -- BASICALLY 33.4 MILLION AND IF YOU LOOK AT THE NUMBERS OF
3 HOUSING WE'RE ADDING DOESN'T QUITE WORK PROPORTIONALLY, HOW DO
4 YOU GET SPECIFICALLY FROM THE CALCULUS PERSPECTIVE, DO YOU GET
5 SPECIFICALLY TO THE HOUSING NUMBER?

6

7 **CHIRAG RABARI:** TO YOUR POINT WITH THE BROAD SUITE OF
8 STRATEGIES, CONFIRMING WHEN WE LOOK AT OUTCOMES RESULTS WHEN
9 ALL OF THE STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN WERE TO BE IMPLEMENTED.
10 APPROACHES LIKE GBI DO HELP IN TERMS OF THINGS LIKE HOUSING
11 COST BURDEN, FOR EXAMPLE, BUT FOR THE, YOU KNOW, FOR THE
12 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PIECE, YOU KNOW, WE ARE BASICALLY LOOKING
13 AT THE ENTIRE PROJECTED NEED FOR LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS,
14 INCLUDING, YOU KNOW, THE UNHOUSED INDIVIDUALS, ESTIMATING HOW
15 MUCH, YOU KNOW, IT WILL COST TO CREATE THOSE NEEDED UNITS OVER
16 THE LIFE CYCLE OF THE PLAN. YOU KNOW, WE ARE -- MAKE -- WE DO
17 A QUANTIFICATION OF HOW MUCH THAT COSTS, CLOSE TO \$500
18 BILLION. AND WE ARE -- THIS IS A VISIONARY HOUSING ELEMENT.
19 IT'S NOT SUBJECT TO, YOU KNOW, FISCAL CONSTRAINT REQUIREMENTS.
20 SO, WE ARE, YOU KNOW, ASSUMING THAT SOME COMBINATION OF STATE
21 AND FEDERAL AND LOCAL AND REGIONAL MONEYS WILL HELP FILL THAT
22 GAP SO THAT WE ARE ABLE TO ACTUALLY DELIVER ALL OF THOSE UNITS
23 AND DRIVE THESE AFFORDABILITY OUTCOMES. AND I THINK, YOU KNOW,
24 THE LOGIC BEHIND THAT WAS, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE LEARNED OVER THE
25 PREVIOUS PLANNING CYCLES OF, YOU KNOW, MAYBE HAVING A MORE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 GROUNDED ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHAT IS FEASIBLE OR REALISTIC WAS
2 NOT GOING TO IMPROVE OUTCOMES FOR THE PEOPLE IN THE REGION.
3 AND I THINK THAT'S DEFINITELY SOMETHING IMPORTANT TO THINK
4 ABOUT AS WE'RE SHARING THOSE, SHARING THESE OUTCOMES, WE COULD
5 TAKE A MORE, YOU KNOW, CONSERVATIVE APPROACH, BUT THEN YOU
6 KNOW, WHAT WE WOULD BE SHARING WOULD BE VERY NEGATIVE OUTCOMES
7 [LAUGHTER] ABOUT WHAT THE LIKELY FUTURE TRAJECTORY OF THE
8 FUTURE WOULD BE AND THEN, YOU KNOW, I THINK THE CONVERSATION
9 MIGHT TURN INTO WHAT DO WE NEED TO DO IN ORDER TO IMPROVE
10 THOSE OUTCOMES. AND I THINK THAT'S REALLY WHAT THE STRATEGIES
11 IN THE PLAN ARE TRYING TO DO IS SHOW US HOW WE CAN GET TO THIS
12 OUTCOME.

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** A QUICK FOLLOW UP. YOU DIDN'T MENTION
15 FILTERING, IS THERE SOME THOUGHT THAT PERHAPS THE FILTERING
16 PIECE IS G ACTUALLY GOING TO MEET SOME OF THE ISSUES AND THAT
17 THOSE EXPENSIVE UNITS OVER 25 YEARS LESS DESIRABLE BECAUSE OF
18 THE LESS DESIRABLE SUPPLY, A PROBLEM INSPIRING BALANCE, THE
19 SUPPLY THAT THOSE UNITINGS ACTUALLY COME BACK IN PRICE IS THAT
20 PART OF THE CALCULATION.

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** IN ADDITION TO ALL OF THE KNOW FUNDING NECESSARY
23 FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION PRESERVATION WE DO LAND USE
24 ANALYSIS IT'S A LOCALIZED SCALE AND WE'RE ABLE TO UNDERSTAND



JUNE 14, 2024

1 UNITS AS THEY AGE OVER TIME AND THAT FILTERING EFFECT IS PART
2 OF THE PATHWAY TOWARDS MORE AFFORDABILITY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ONE LAST QUESTION.
5 AND DAVID, LIKE I -- I LIKE WHAT YOU SAID, SHORT ANSWER. THE -
6 - YOU KNOW, BOARD MEMBER SILVA GAVE YOU AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT'S
7 ACTUALLY HAPPENING ON THE GROWN. I MEAN, THIS IS HAPPENING.
8 SO, IT'S NOT THEORY. AND WHAT SHE'S TALKING ABOUT IS GONNA
9 HAVE A LONG-TERM IMPACT ON WALNUT CREEK AND COMMUNITIES VERY
10 SIMILAR TO THAT. ARE YOU LOOKING AT WHAT'S ACTUALLY HAPPENING?
11 AND ARE YOU FACTORING THAT INTO THIS PLAN.

12

13 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YES. SO, LAST YEAR, TOWARDS THE END OF LAST YEAR,
14 WE WENT THROUGH AND UPDATED A LOT OF THE PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS,
15 BASELINE DATA AND THE LIKE, TO REFLECT POST-COVID CONDITIONS.
16 NOW, WE KNOW THAT THINGS MAY CONTINUE TO EVOLVE, BUT WE HAVE
17 MADE SOME SIGNIFICANT UPDATES TO OUR LAND USE AND TRAVEL
18 MODEL, BASELINE INPUTS TO REFLECT THAT NEW REALLY. AND YOU SEE
19 THAT IN SOME OF THE OUTCOMES, LIKE THAT BREAK DOWN OF MODE
20 SHARE THAT WE SHOWED. WHERE, YOU KNOW, WE ARE NOWHERE NEAR
21 WHAT OUR PROJECTIONS WERE FOR THE LAST PLAN CYCLE. WE HAVE AN
22 OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE TO REFINE THOSE THIS YEAR AS WE MOVE
23 TOWARDS THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND INTEGRATE ANY NEW DATA COMING
24 IN, BUT WE'RE ABSOLUTELY RECOGNIZING THAT A LOT OF THESE
25 TRENDS ARE STARTING TO STABILIZE OR PLATEAU POST-COVID SO THE



JUNE 14, 2024

1 INPUT IN DATA WE'RE PUTTING IS REALLY KEY THE QUESTION IS
2 GOALS CLIMATE GOALS OTHER AND TARGETS THAT WE'RE WORKING TO
3 REACH WHAT ARE THE STRATEGIES THAT ARE NECESSARY TO GET US
4 THERE FROM THIS NEW REALITY. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE GREAT
5 POINTS WERE MADE ON THE WORK-FROM-HOME IMPLICATIONS INCLUDING
6 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT. IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGY REVISION
7 US THAT ALL APPROVED THAT LEAD INTO THIS ANALYSIS WE ACTUALLY
8 INTEGRATED SOME TARGETED REFINEMENT STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS
9 THOSE VERY ISSUES TO TRY TO REACTIVATE DOWNTOWN, TO TRY TO
10 BRING THAT ACTIVITY BACK. AND YOU ARE SEEING THAT IN SOME OF
11 THE NUMBERS. IT'S GOING TO TAKE TIME. BUT THOSE, SORT OF,
12 STRATEGIES ARE NEW TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND REFLECT
13 THAT POST-COVID SITUATION.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY AND LAST COMMENT. I THINK, MATT,
16 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT YOUR STAFF STAYS CONNECTED TO
17 WHAT'S HAPPENING IN COMMUNITIES ON THE GROUND IN THESE TRENDS.
18 THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE WE CAN'T BE MAKING DECISIONS
19 ABSENT OF THAT INFORMATION, WHICH IS ACTUALLY HAPPENING ON THE
20 GROUND. ALETA DUPREE, GO AHEAD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OH GO AHEAD, GINA.

25



JUNE 14, 2024

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER] THE REALITY, I THINK, IS
2 VERY IMPORTANT, HAS BEEN POINTED OUT HERE. ARE WE TRACKING THE
3 SUSTAINABILITY OF AFFORDABILITY? WE HAVE AN EVER GROWING AMI.
4 AND, SO, HOW DO WE KEEP THE AFFORDABILITY AS PART OF THIS
5 ANALYSIS? AND MAINTAIN IT? BECAUSE WHAT I'M UNDERSTANDS
6 SUGGEST WE BUILD AFFORDABLE UNITS, THEY'RE OUT THERE, AND THEN
7 THE PRICE OF THOSE AFFORDABLE UNITS KEEP GOING UP AND UP AND
8 UP. AND IT'S NOT GOING TO ADDRESS THE NEED TO KEEP PEOPLE IN
9 THE AREA WHERE THEY WORK, WHERE THEY LIVE. SO, IT'S JUST --
10 IT'S KIND OF DEVASTATING TO FIND OUT, YOU HAVE DESIGNATED ALL
11 THESE AFFORDABLE UNITS AND THEY'RE NOT REALLY AFFORDABLE. SO,
12 I DON'T HAVE THE ANSWER TO THAT, BUT IT NEEDS TO BE A PART OF
13 THIS, BECAUSE WHEN WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS IS REALLY HELPING
14 PEOPLE STAY IN THEIR HOMES AND, ALSO, BE ABLE TO AFFORD, IN
15 THE AREAS WHERE THESE BIG JOBS ARE HAPPENING HERE. AND ONE
16 OTHER LAST THING HERE IS THAT STATE PARTNERSHIPS, HERE, OKAY -
17 - THE GOVERNOR HAS ORDERED EVERYBODY BACK TO WORK. THE
18 ATTORNEY GENERAL HAS NOT. THERE IS AN OFFICE IN SAN FRANCISCO,
19 ONE IN OAKLAND, THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE NICELY GET TO PROBABLY
20 WORK-FROM-HOME. BUT, TILL F WE'RE TRYING TO AID IN
21 TRANSPORTATION AND REVITALIZING OUR DOWNTOWNS, IT'S A
22 CONSIDERATION THAT MAYBE HE SHOULD BE HELPING TOO. THANK YOU.
23
24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU GINA. ALETA DUPREE. AND
25 THEN ADINA LEVIN.



JUNE 14, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANKS, CHAIR JIM SPERING. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
3 RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THERE IS REALLY A LOT
4 HERE. CALL MYSELF AN EXPERT ON PLANNING AND HOUSING MOST OF MY
5 KNOWLEDGE IS ABOUT TRAINS AND BUSES AND ELECTRICITY. BUT THIS
6 DOES AFFECT ME. I CAN'T REALLY AFFORD TO LIVE HERE FULL-TIME.
7 I COULDN'T AFFORD TO LIVE IN NEW YORK FULL-TIME. I TRAVEL BACK
8 AND FORTH. I HAVE A TWO BEDROOM PLACE THAT I SHARE. I CAN DO
9 BETTER THAN SOME. I KNOW SOME WHO WHERE THEY COULDN'T AFFORD
10 TO LIVE ON THEIR OWN, PERIOD. THEY WOULD HAVE TO HAVE
11 ROOMMATES. AND I THINK TELEWORK WAS ON THE WAY EVEN WITHOUT
12 THE PANDEMIC. I HAVE REALLY MIXED FEELINGS ABOUT TELEWORK. AND
13 ON THE ONE HAND, TELEWORK, IT'S GREAT IF IT'S RAINING AND
14 SNOWING OUTSIDE, AND THE HIGHWAYS ARE ALL ICED OVER. ON THE
15 OTHER HAND THERE IS A LOSS OF REAL COMMUNITY, AND GOING
16 THROUGH THE PANDEMIC, DOING EVERYTHING ON ZOOM WAS REALLY HARD
17 FOR ME. IN 2021, I FINAL GOT ON A PLANE AND I GOT TO COME BACK
18 UP HERE TO BE WITH YOU ALL, BECAUSE I TRY TO COME TO THESE
19 MEETINGS IN-PERSON. HOW CAN PEOPLE AGE IN PLACE? MOST OF THIS
20 HOUSING STOCK IS NOT ADA COMPATIBLE. ALL THESE BEAUTIFUL
21 HOMES, BUT THEY DON'T WORK. FOR ADA AND SOME CAN'T CLIMB
22 STAIRS. HAVE TO HAVE NEW HOMES. I DON'T KNOW IF PEOPLE ARE
23 BUYING CARS LIKE THEY USED TO. I WAS A NEW TRANSIT RIDER 15
24 YEARS AGO WHEN I GOT RID OF MY CAR, BUT THAT WAS 15 YEARS AGO,



JUNE 14, 2024

1 SO I'M RIDING TRANSIT TODAY BUT I'M NOT A NEW TRANSIT RIDER
2 NOW. WHERE CAN WE GET THE NEW PARTNERSHIPS FROM? THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ADINA?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. ADINA LEVIN SEAMLESS BAY AREA. FIRST OF
7 ALL I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR PUTTING IT TOGETHER, AND THE
8 COMMISSIONERS FOR BRINGING FORWARD YOU KNOW, EXAMPLES IN COLOR
9 ON WHAT LEADERS ARE SEEING IN COMMUNITIES ON THE GROUND AND
10 ASKING SHARP QUESTIONS ABOUT MAKING SURE THE PLAN ADDRESSES
11 REALITY. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. FIRST OF ALL, IN TERMS OF
12 ADAPTING TRANSIT TO CURRENT REALITY, WE DO NOT NEED TO
13 UNIQUELY MAKE THIS UP, BECAUSE THERE ARE REGIONS IN NORTH
14 AMERICA AND AROUND THE WORLD THAT STARTED OUT BEFORE THE
15 PANDEMIC WITH LESS OF A CLOSE FOCUS ON COMMUTE PERIOD, HAD ALL
16 THE TIME FOCUSED ON SERVING A WIDER VARIETY OF RIDERS AND A
17 WIDER VARIETY OF TRIPS AND HAVE WOUND UP WITH, YOU KNOW, MUCH
18 MORE RESILIENCE OF THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO THERE ARE TUNES IN
19 TRANSIT 2050+ TO POTENTIALLY FOLLOW THOSE PATTERNS AND HAVE A
20 MORE DIVERSE AND RESILIENT TRANSIT SYSTEM. ALSO, IN THIS DECK,
21 THERE IS SOME LITTLE TABLES THAT LOOK VERY DRY AND ARE
22 ACTUALLY QUITE EXCITING, ESPECIALLY AS REGARDS TO WHAT WE'RE
23 GOING TO SEE WITH TRANSIT 2050+. SO, LOOKING AT EVEN BEFORE
24 TRANSIT 2050+, THE SHARE OF ALL HOUSEHOLDS AND HOUSEHOLDS WITH
25 LOW-INCOMES BEING WITHIN A 10-MINUTE WALK OF FREQUENT TRANSIT.



JUNE 14, 2024

1 AND HOW CAN THAT BE DIALED BE TURNED UP IN TRANSIT 2050+ AS
2 WELL AS THE HOMES IN THE TRANSIT-RICH AREAS. IN A LITTLE
3 TABLE, A NORMAL PERSON WILL NOT UNDERSTAND IT, BUT IF YOU SHOW
4 THAT WITH A MAP AND ME AND MY COMMUNITY AND IN MY
5 NEIGHBORHOOD, HOW WILL IMPROVEMENTS POTENTIALLY BENEFIT ME AND
6 MY COMMUNITY, THAT COULD BE SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY ATTRACTIVE
7 AND EXCITING AS WE'RE LOOKING AT THE NEXT STEPS WITH SB1031
8 AND HOW WE FUND AND IMPROVE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM. THANK
9 YOU.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WELL, MATT, DAVE,
12 AND CHIRAG, GREAT PRESENTATION, GOOD COMMENTS, APPRECIATE YOUR
13 RESPONSES TOO, SO A LOT OF WORK AHEAD OF YOU. THANK YOU FOR
14 THE PRESENTATION.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE ONE THING I WANTED TO
21 ALIGN WITH COMMISSIONER NOACK CITIZEN ISSUE AROUND OPEN SPACE
22 ACRES PER THOUSAND RESIDENTS, I MEAN 2023 IT'S 111 THEN MOVES
23 TO 2050, 141, THE ONE THING THAT DOESN'T CORRELATE IS THE
24 ADDITION OF POTENTIALLY 2 MILLION RESIDENTS, AND SO TO ME I
25 THINK WHAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED IS WHAT'S BEEN



JUNE 14, 2024

1 MENTIONED. I THINK STAFF REALLY NEEDS TO COME BACK TO US. I
2 KNOW YOU HAVE DONE AN ASSESSMENT AND EVALUATION AROUND REMOTE
3 WORK. BUT I WOULD ENCOURAGE STAFF TO DIG A LOT DEEPER. I THINK
4 WE HAVE A PARADIGM SHIFT WE HAVE PEOPLE WHO HAVE CERTAIN SKILL
5 SET IN THE REGION THAT ARE REALLY LEAVING THE REGION THEY'RE
6 GOING TO PLACES WHERE THEY PERHAPS HAVE TAX ADVANTAGES MOVING
7 OUT OF THE REGION. THE ONE THING I WANT TO PUSH BACK ON, AND
8 REALLY HAVE STAFF LOOK AT IT, IN ADDITION, IS REALLY THIS,
9 SORT OF, NOTION THAT NINE TO -- WITH NINE OUT OF TEN RESIDENTS
10 ARE GOING TO STAY WITHIN THEIR AREA. I FIND THAT, YOU KNOW,
11 RESPECTFULLY, I FIND THAT DIFFICULT TO BELIEVE. PLANNERS ARE
12 INCREDIBLE PEOPLE. THEY'RE SPECIAL PEOPLE. MY FAVORITE PLANNER
13 IS MATT -- [LAUGHTER] PERRY -- SUE -- YOU KNOW, IT'S AMAZING,
14 BECAUSE YOU'RE ABLE TO PROJECT -- IT'S LIKE YOU HAVE A MAGIC
15 CRYSTAL BALL AND IT SEEMS IT WORKS OUT. I JUST THINK AT THE
16 END OF THE DAY LET'S DO OUR DUE DILIGENCE ON HOW PEOPLE ARE
17 WORKING NOW-A-DAYS, ESPECIALLY THOSE. MY UNDERSTANDING, IF YOU
18 ARE A START-UP, LET'S SAY YOU ARE A 1-TO-100, THEY'RE NOT EVEN
19 LOOKING AT OFFICE SPACE. I MEAN, YOU'RE JUST A TOTAL -- HEY,
20 WE'RE GOING TO USE SLACK, WE'RE GOING TO USE ALL THESE OTHER
21 TOOLS, AND, SO I JUST DISH WOULD HOPE, WHEN YOU COME BACK
22 THAT, WE REALLY TAKE A FORWARD-THINKING LENS ON HOW PEOPLE ARE
23 WORKING AND WHAT -- AND I HATE TO USE THIS WORD, YOU KNOW,
24 WHAT THE NEW NORM IS. BECAUSE I DON'T SEE IT. AND I THINK THE
25 GREAT -- IS IT ALETA DUPREE? THE GREAT ALETA DUPREE IN PUBLIC



JUNE 14, 2024

1 COMMENT IS ALWAYS, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE ARE JUST WORKING
2 DIFFERENTLY IN THE PANDEMIC AND IT'S PROBABLY ACCENTUATED OR
3 PUSH THAT FORWARD. SO REALLY APPRECIATE YOU INDULGING ME.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** MARTHA IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS
8 ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BELIA.

11

12 **PRES. BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU NEXT MEETING OF ABAG
13 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD FRIDAY JULY 12TH 9:40
14 HERE AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET ANY CHANGES
15 TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED AND I WANT TO THANK MISS
16 SILVA AND MR. CASTRO FOR YOUR ASSISTANCE AS ALWAYS.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. PLANNING COMMITTEE WILL
19 MEET JULY 12th 9:40 A.M. AT 375 BEALE STREET WITH THAT THIS
20 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

21



NTT

Broadcasting Government