



# **BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE**

## **Meeting Transcript**



JANUARY 19, 2024

**BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE GOVERNING BOARD**

**FRIDAY, JANUARY 19<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 10:00 AM**

**CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GOOD MORNING. BEFORE WE CALL THIS MORNING'S BARC GOVERNING BOARD MEETING TO ORDER. WE HAVE SOME ANNOUNCEMENTS WE WOULD LIKE TO MAKE. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO THE CLERK.

**CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN. BEFORE WE BEGIN THERE ARE A FEW HOUSEKEEPING ITEMS. ABOVE THE CONTROL ROOM YOU SEE AN ON AIR SIGN. WHEN THE SIGN IS ILLUMINATED, WE ARE IN SESSION. PLEASE BE SURE TO TURN YOUR MICROPHONE OFF WHEN NOT IN USE. MEMBERS PARTICIPATING FROM THE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS THE ZOOM WEBINAR IS NOW LIVE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. BOARD MEMBERS PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED TO SPEAK. PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IN-PERSON MEMBERS FORM A LINE BEHIND THE PODIUM. BECAUSE THERE ARE TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS, A ROLL CALL FOR QUORUM AND FOR VOTING ON MOTIONS WILL BE TAKEN. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GOOD MORNING. I'M BERKELEY MAYOR JESSE  
2 ARREGUIN, THE CHAIR OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE.  
3 GOVERNING BOARD. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE BARC  
4 GOVERNING BOARD TO ORDER FOR FRIDAY JANUARY 19TH, 2024 AND ASK  
5 THE CLERK TO CONDUCT A ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM QUORUM IS PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, SERENA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA? ABSENT. AHN?  
8 ABSENT. ARREGUIN?

9

10 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** EISEN?

13

14 **REBECCA EISEN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ECKLUND?

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** GIOIA?

21

22 **JOHN GIOIA:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?

25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1    **DAVID HAUBERT:** PRESENT.

2

3    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. NOACK?

4

5    **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

6

7    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? ABSENT. PINE? ABSENT. RABBITT?

8    ABSENT. RAMOS?

9

10    **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

11

12    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ROSS?

13

14    **MARK ROSS:** HERE.

15

16    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SPERING? ABSENT. WASSERMAN?

17

18    **ZACK WASSERMAN:** HERE.

19

20    **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE QUORUM.

21

22    **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SERENA, I UNDERSTAND WE HAVE REQUEST

23    FROM VICE CHAIR WASSERMAN TO PARTICIPATE IN OUR MEETING UNDER

24    PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 2449?

25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THIS IS CORRECT.

2

3 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SO, UM --

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THERE IS A -- [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR YOU TO  
6 ASK BOARD MEMBER WASSERMAN TO SPEAK AND TO REPLY UNDER THE  
7 ITEM WHICH I HAVE SHARED WITH HIM.

8

9 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** TURNING TO CHAIR WASSERMAN WITH RESPECT  
10 TO YOUR REQUEST UNDER ASSEMBLY BILL 2449.

11

12 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** I HAVE GOT WHAT APPEARS TO BE THE NOROVIRUS  
13 TWO DAYS AGO. I AM IN RECOVERY, BUT CLEARLY VERY CONTAGIOUS  
14 AND THEREFORE CANNOT SAFELY ATTEND THE MEETING.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** JUST TO CONFIRM VICE CHAIR WASSERMAN  
17 WHETHER THERE ARE ANY INDIVIDUALS --

18

19 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** THERE ARE NO INDIVIDUALS PRESENT WITH ME.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OKAY. THANK YOU VERY  
22 MUCH FOR PARTICIPATING AND WE WISH YOU A SPEED RECOVERY. WITH  
23 THAT, A QUORUM IS PRESENT. WE'LL PROCEED TO THE NEXT ORDER OF  
24 BUSINESS, ITEM TWO, GOVERNING BOARD MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS THIS  
25 IS AN INFORMATION ITEM ARE THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 MEMBERS OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD? SEEING NO MEMBERS IN-  
2 PERSON WISHING TO SPEAK. ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM? SEEING NONE.  
3 PUBLIC COMMENTS OR WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS AND I DON'T SEE ANY  
6 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ITEM THREE, THE BARC CHAIR  
9 REPORTS. I WOULD LIKE TO REPORT THE FOLLOWING. FIRST I WANT TO  
10 CALL ATTENTION TO THE REPORT THAT CAME OUT LAST YEAR. I KNOW  
11 WE TALKED ABOUT THIS AT A PREVIOUS BOARD MEETING THE REGIONAL  
12 SYSTEM ASSESSMENT FOR ADAPTING TO CLIMATE CHANGE BUILDING ON  
13 ALL THE WORK WITH THE SYSTEMS MAPPING WORK PROVIDING GOOD  
14 FRAMEWORK FOR THE WORK UNDERWAY TO BRING OUR REGIONAL AGENCIES  
15 TOGETHER TO DEVELOP A PLAN FOR ADDRESSING RESILIENCE AND  
16 ADAPTING TO CLIMATE CHANGE. A FEW ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS.  
17 WORKING WITH THE VICE CHAIR TO FORM AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE TO  
18 DEVELOP AN EVALUATION PROCESS FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO  
19 ENSURE THAT THE BOARD CAN PARTICIPATE IN THE EVALUATION OF OUR  
20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. IN CONSULTATION WITH OUR EXECUTIVE  
21 DIRECTOR, WE'RE ALSO INTERESTED IN EXPLORING CREATING A  
22 STRATEGIC PLANNING PROCESS FOR BARC LOOKING AT STATUTORY  
23 RESPONSIBILITIES AND FUTURE DIRECTION OF THE AGENCY. WE'LL  
24 REPORT BACK ON THAT AT OUR NEXT MEETING, AND ALLISON WILL BE  
25 UPDATING US ON CONVERSATIONS HAPPENING WITH MEMBER AGENCIES



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 AROUND DEVELOPING A MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING AROUND SHARED  
2 WORK ADDRESSING SEA LEVEL RISE AND RESILIENCE IN THE BAY AREA.  
3 THAT WILL BE PART OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THAT'S  
4 MY REPORT FOR TODAY. AND I'LL ASK THE BOARD IF THERE ARE ANY  
5 QUESTIONS. ANY QUESTIONS FROM ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY.  
6 SEEING NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? WERE  
7 THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED AND I SEE  
10 NO PUBLIC COMMENTS FOR THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. PROCEEDING TO ITEM FOUR, THE  
13 CONSENT CALENDAR. CONSISTS OF ONE ITEM, APPROVAL OF THE  
14 MINUTES OF DECEMBER 8TH, 2024. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO  
15 APPROVE THE MINUTES.

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** MOVED BY NOACK. I'LL SECOND FOR  
20 PURPOSES OF DISCUSSION. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION?  
21 SEEING NONE. AND WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON  
22 THIS ITEM?

23

24 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENTS AND  
25 SEE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.



JANUARY 19, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** CALL THE ROLL ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

3

4 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. AHN IS ABSENT.

5 ARREGUIN?

6

7 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** EISEN?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ECKLUND?

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES. GIOIA?

16

17 **JOHN GIOIA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. HAUBERT?

20

21 **DAVID HAUBERT:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. NOACK?

24

25 **SUE NOACK:** YES.





JANUARY 19, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** PEDROZA? IS ABSENT. PINE IS ABSENT.  
3 RABBITT? ABSENT. RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. ROSS?

8

9 **MARK ROSS:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. SPERING? IS ABSENT.  
12 WASSERMAN?

13

14 **ZACK WASSERMAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION CARRIES.

17

18 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL  
19 PROCEED NOW TO ITEM FIVE, THE BARC MEMBER AGENCY EXECUTIVE  
20 DIRECTOR UPDATE. WE'LL HEAR UPDATES FROM THE EXECUTIVE  
21 DIRECTORS OF OUR MEMBER AGENCIES. THESE ARE INFORMATION ITEMS.  
22 WE'LL GO FIRST TO CALTRANS DISTRICT FOUR. AND I BELIEVE WE  
23 HAVE A REPRESENTATIVE FROM CALTRANS DISTRICT FOUR WITH US THIS  
24 MORNING, CECELIA, THE ACTING PLANNING DEPUTY FOR CALTRANS  
25 DISTRICT FOUR. I WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO YOU. AND WELCOME.



JANUARY 19, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. CECILIA, THE  
3 DISTRICT FOUR ACTING PLANNING DEPUTY. I'LL GO OVER A COUPLE OF  
4 ITEMS FOR DINA, SINCE SHE WASN'T ABLE TO ATTEND. IN THE NEAR-  
5 TERM FOR OUR 2024 SHOP, WHICH WILL BE A STATE HIGHWAY  
6 OPERATIONS SECTION PROGRAM, WHICH IS OUR MAIN FUNDING VEHICLE  
7 FOR PROJECTS. WE HAVE TWO NEAR-TERM PROJECTS ADDRESSING SEA  
8 LEVEL RISE AT -- ONE IN SAN MATEO AT ATASCADERO FOR A TOTAL OF  
9 24 MILLION TO ADDRESS SOME EXISTING STORM DAMAGE. THAT IS  
10 AHEAD ALONG OF THE PROJECT THAT WE'RE WORKING ON INITIATING A  
11 PROJECT FOR, FOR THE 2026 SHOP. TO ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE. OUR  
12 OTHER NEAR-TERM PROJECT IS ON U.S. 101 IN MARIN CITY AT  
13 DONAHUE EXIT INTERCHANGE FOR 20 MILLION TO ADDRESS FLOODING  
14 INCARNATION WITH MARIN COUNTY AS WELL AS INTERIM SEA LEVEL  
15 RISE. WHAT'S NEW FOR US AT CALTRANS IS WE NOW HAVE PERFORMANCE  
16 MEASURES IN OUR STATEWIDE -- STATE HIGHWAY SYSTEM MANAGEMENT  
17 PLAN FOR THE 2023 CYCLE. FOR DISTRICT FOUR, WE'RE TAKING THE  
18 OPPORTUNITY TO NOMINATE PROJECTS IN THE LAST FIVE YEARS OF OUR  
19 10-YEAR SHOP. FOR A TOTAL OF 1.4 BILLION. MOST OF IT IS GOING  
20 TO BE LONG LEAD OR LONG-TERM. BUT SOME OF IT WE'RE HOPING TO  
21 PHASE AND BE SHORTER. SO, WE'RE TAKING A LOOK, AS MENTIONED,  
22 HIGHWAY 101 ATASCADERO, ADDITIONAL NEWER TERM STRATEGIES THAT  
23 U.S. 101 AND MARIN CITY. WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT SALINAS LAGOON,  
24 U.S. 101 IN SANTA CLARA, ALONG THE SOUTH BAY SHORELINE, ROUTE  
25 ONE IN BOLINAS ASSUMING WE GET OUR ADAPTATION STUDY COMPLETED



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WITH SAN JOSE STATE NEAR-TERM SOLUTIONS FOR ROUTE 61 AND  
2 ALAMEDA ON DOOLITTLE DRIVE DOWN RUSSIAN GULCH BRIDGE IN  
3 SONOMA. THAT'S WHAT WE'RE PLANNING RIGHT NOW FOR THE FIRST  
4 QUARTER OF THE TEN YEAR BOOK WE'RE TAKING A LOOK AT EITHER THE  
5 NEXT QUARTER OR COUPLE OF QUARTERS TO SEE HOW WE CAN  
6 INCORPORATE ADDITIONAL SEA LEVEL RISE PROJECTS ON ROUTE 101 IN  
7 MARIN RELATED TO THE FLOOD REDUCTION PROJECT THAT HAS FINAL  
8 ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT DEADLINE OF THE END OF THIS MONTH.  
9 WE'RE ALSO TAKING A LOOK AT WHAT WE CAN DO FOR 12 AND 121  
10 SONOMA ASHEVILLE. THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

11

12 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GRATEFUL TO  
13 HAVE CALTRANS PARTICIPATING WITH BARC. OBVIOUSLY REQUIRES ALL  
14 OF OUR AGENCIES, INCLUDING OUR STATE, TO WORK ON HELPING  
15 ENSURE THAT OUR REGION IS RESILIENT. IT IS ADAPTING TO THE  
16 THREAT OF RISING SEA LEVELS. WE APPRECIATE YOUR PARTICIPATION  
17 AND WANT TO ASK IF ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS FROM ANY BARC BOARD  
18 MEMBERS. DIRECTOR ECKLUND?

19

20 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CECELIA. WE HAD A  
21 PRESENTATION THE OTHER DAY ABOUT HORIZONTAL LEVEES K YOU  
22 EXPLAIN A LITTLE BIT ABOUT HOW CALTRANS IS APPROACHING THE  
23 HORIZONTAL LEVEES AND USE OF TRYING TO DEAL WITH FLOODING AND  
24 ALSO SEA LEVEL RISE AND HAVE YOU ANY INVOLVEMENT IN ANY KIND  
25 OF PROJECT JUST KIND OF LIKE TO KNOW WHAT DISTRICT FOUR'S



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 PERCEPTION IS ABOUT THE CONCEPT OF HORIZONTAL LEVEES RATHER  
2 THAN CREATING LEVEES. I USED TO WORK FOR THE ARMY CORP OF  
3 ENGINEERS AND ALSO THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY SO  
4 VERY FAMILIAR WITH THE WORK THAT'S BEEN DONE IN THE PAST BUT  
5 HORIZONTAL LEVEES SEEM TO BE WORKING. I'M JUST KIND OF CURIOUS  
6 WHAT YOUR POSITION IS ON THAT.

7

8 **CECILIA McCUAIG:** SO, RECENTLY WE HOSTED A MEETING OR GET  
9 TOGETHER, WITH SAN FRANCISCO BAY ESTUARY GROUP AND WE AT OUR  
10 BURMA ROAD SO WE ARE TRYING TO WORK WITH ALL OUR PARTNERS IN  
11 EXPLORING HORIZONTAL LEVEES OR LIVING LEVEES, AS ONE OF THE  
12 STRATEGIES THAT, YOU KNOW, CAN ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE.  
13 OBVIOUSLY WE'RE LOOKING AT ALL THE STRATEGIES. WE'RE  
14 FOLLOWING, YOU KNOW, OCEAN PROTECTION COUNCIL GUIDELINES AND  
15 TAKING A LOOK AT THE BROADER STRATEGIES OF --

16

17 **MARK ROSS:** [INDISCERNIBLE] YEAH.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** APPRECIATE THAT SO MUCH CECILIA. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS? OKAY. ANY  
22 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. DON'T  
23 SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR JOINING US THIS  
24 MORNING. WE'LL PROCEED NOW TO THE NEXT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
25 REPORT. WHICH IS FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY REGIONAL WATER



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 QUALITY CONTROL BOARD. AND WE'RE JOINED BY EILEEN WHITE, THE  
2 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE WATER BOARD.

3

4 **EILEEN WHITE:** GOOD MORNING. HAPPY FRIDAY. AND THANK YOU FOR  
5 INVITING US. I WANT TO SHARE THAT LAST WEEK OUR BOARD MET AND  
6 HAD A NICE BOARD RETREAT. AND OUR BOARD IS VERY SUPPORTIVE OF  
7 THE MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING THAT BARC IS WORKING ON  
8 PUTTING TOGETHER FOR THE AGENCIES COMING TOGETHER THAT WORK  
9 JOINTLY TO ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE THREAT AND FLOODING HERE IN  
10 THE BAY AREA. SO I WANT TO REPORT-OUT ON THAT, THAT WE'RE VERY  
11 SUPPORTIVE AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALLISON AND THE  
12 TEAM TO GET AN MOU, WHEN YOU WORK WITH THIS MANY AGENCIES  
13 THAT, WE CAN ALWAYS AGREE TO AND MOVE FORWARD. AND IN NEWS  
14 ABOUT THE GREENACTION COMMUNITY GROUP IN BAYVIEW-HUNTERS  
15 POINT, THEIR NOTICE OF INTENT TO SUE EPA AND THE NAVY FOR THE  
16 NAVAL SHIPYARD, WE'LL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH GREENACTION, WE  
17 MEET ON MONDAY AND CONTINUE TO MEET, TO DISCUSS TOXIC  
18 SUBSTANCES AND DISCUSS HOW WE'RE DEALING WITH ADDRESSING SEA  
19 LEVEL RISE AND CLEAN UP SITES. THIS FIVE-YEAR REVIEW REPORT  
20 FOR HUNTERS POINT HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR A LONG TIME, FOR  
21 PEOPLE LIVING THERE, SOME MULTI-GENERATIONAL AND WE WILL  
22 CONTINUE TO MAKE PROGRESS ON THAT. IT'S BEEN IN THE NEWS AND I  
23 WANT TO BE SURE THEY'RE AWARE OF OUR ROLE AND CONTINUE WITH  
24 THE GROUPS THERE. AND SOMETHING THAT IMPACTS THE ENTIRE SAN  
25 FRANCISCO BAY REGION IS THAT WE'LL BE ISSUING THE THIRD WEEK



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WATERSHED PERMIT WE'LL REQUIRE NUTRIENT REDUCTION FROM THE BAY  
2 AREA WASTEWATER UTILITIES AND PART OF THAT WE'LL BE  
3 ENCOURAGING MULTI-BENEFIT SOLUTIONS LOOKING AT HORIZONTAL  
4 LEVEES, LOOKING AT RECYCLED WATER AS PART OF THE PORTFOLIO FOR  
5 REDUCING NUTRIENTS. THOSE ARE THE HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE WATER.

6

7 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS  
8 FROM BOARD MEMBERS HERE ON ZOOM? THANK YOU FOR YOUR ONGOING  
9 PARTNERSHIP. WE'LL GO TO THE NEXT REPORT WHICH IS FROM THE --  
10 MY AGENCY, ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS AND  
11 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. BRAD PAUL WILL GIVE  
12 THE REPORT.

13

14 **BRAD PAUL:** GOOD MORNING. I HAVE FIVE QUICK ITEMS THAT HAVE  
15 COME UP SINCE OUR LAST MEETING. THE FIRST HAS TO DO WITH A NEW  
16 STATE GRANT FOR HIGHWAY 37 UPGRADES. THE CALIFORNIA  
17 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION RECENTLY APPROVED A \$50 MILLION  
18 GRANT TO HELP MTC, CALTRANS, AND OUR PARTNERS ADVANCED  
19 TRANSPORTATION AT ECOLOGICAL RESILIENCE ALONG THE STATE ROUTE  
20 37 THIS INCLUDES RESTORATION OF TIDAL MARSH IN SOLANO COUNTY  
21 AND REPLACEMENT OF AN EXISTING HIGHWAY 37 BRIDGE OVER TOLAY  
22 CREEK IN SONOMA COUNTY THIS WILL REPLACE IT WITH MUCH LONGER  
23 BRIDGE THAT WILL PROMOTE RESTORATION OF HISTORIC SAN PABLO  
24 BAYLANDS. I'M VERY INTERESTED IN THIS BECAUSE I LIVE ADJACENT  
25 TO SAN PABLO BAYLAND, AND THIS IS GOING TO PROTECT MY HOME



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 THIS IS GOING TO PROTECT MY HOME. DECEMBER 10TH CALIFORNIA  
2 STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY SECRETARY APPOINTED OUR VERY OWN  
3 CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ALIX BOCKELMAN TO THE STATE'S  
4 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE WHICH WILL BE DEVELOPING  
5 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS TO GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, IMPROVE THE  
6 TRANSIT EXPERIENCE FOR RIDERS AND IMPORTANTLY ADDRESSING LONG-  
7 TERM NEEDS FOR OPERATIONAL SUBSIDIES AND FUNDS FOR TRANSIT  
8 AGENCIES ACROSS CALIFORNIA. ALSO AT THE END OF THE YEAR, BAHFA  
9 BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY LAUNCHED TWO NEW EXCITING  
10 PROGRAMS. FIRST IN NOVEMBER BAHFA LAUNCHED ITS FIRST LOAN  
11 PROGRAM TO PROMOTE CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING ON  
12 PROPERTIES NOMINATED BY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, THOSE WILL BE  
13 CALLED PRIORITY SITES NEAR TRANSIT SERVICES AND GREEN SPACE WE  
14 USED \$28 MILLION IN STATE FUNDS, SET UP AS A LOAN FUND TO  
15 PROVIDE LOW INTEREST LOANS FOR CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE  
16 HOUSING AND RELATED INFRASTRUCTURE ALSO COVER PREDEVELOPMENT  
17 COSTS. BORROWERS CAN START CONSTRUCTION WITHIN 24 MONTHS ARE  
18 ELIGIBLE FOR LOANS UP TO \$5 MILLION. BAHFA LAUNCHED ITS FIRST  
19 EVER HOMELESSNESS PREVENTION PROGRAM \$5 MILLION GRANT IN NAPA  
20 COUNTY TO PILOT A PROGRAM HELPS RENT IN NAPA COUNTY SENIOR  
21 CITIZENS WHO ARE DISABLED OR LIVING ON FIXED INCOMES AND IT  
22 SUBSIDIZES THEIR RENT FOR 48 MONTHS WHILE AT THE SAME TIME  
23 IT'S FINDING PERMANENT AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR THEM TO MOVE  
24 INTO. BAHFA HOPES TO USE LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE PILOT TO  
25 SCALE THE PROGRAM AS THEY GET MORE FUNDING. HOPEFULLY AFTER



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 NOVEMBER WHEN A REGIONAL BOND MEASURE PASSES FOR 10 TO 20  
2 MILLION DOLLARS. FINALLY, LOOKING AHEAD, SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY  
3 PARTNERSHIP ONCE AGAIN HOSTING STATE OF THE SAN FRANCISCO  
4 ESTUARY CONFERENCE MARCH 12TH TO WEDNESDAY MARCH 13TH AT HENRY  
5 KAISER CENTER IN DOWNTOWN OAKLAND KEYNOTE SPEAKERS WILL  
6 INCLUDE CALIFORNIA EPA SECRETARY AND US EPA REGION NINE  
7 ADMINISTRATOR ONLINE REGISTRATION IS NOW OPEN. YOU CAN GO TO  
8 THEIR WEB SITE TO LEARN MORE ABOUT THE CONFERENCE. THAT'S MY  
9 REPORT.

10

11 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU, MR. PAUL. ANY QUESTIONS OR  
12 COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON THE REPORT? SEEING NONE HERE IN  
13 THE ROOM NONE ON ZOOM. THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS MEMBER FROM THE  
14 CALIFORNIA STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY JOINED BY AMY HUTZEL.

15

16 **AMY HUTZEL:** THANK YOU, CHAIR ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS OF THE  
17 BOARD. FIRST I WANTED TO MENTION THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET CAME  
18 OUT LAST WEEK AND IT DOES ADDRESS ANTICIPATED REDUCTIONS IN  
19 THE STATE BUDGET, AND ONE OF THE PARTS OF THE SOLUTIONS IS  
20 REDUCING THE STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY FUNDING FOR SEA LEVEL  
21 RISE AND COASTAL RESILIENCE. SO, OVER THE LAST TWO YEARS, WE  
22 HAVE BEEN APPROPRIATED ABOUT A BILLION, THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET  
23 PROPOSES A REDUCTION OF \$392 MILLION OF THAT AMOUNT. MOST OF  
24 THE REST OF THAT AMOUNT HAS EITHER GONE TO PROJECTS ALREADY,  
25 OR WILL BE GOING AT OUR NEXT FEW BOARD MEETINGS TO PROJECTS.





JANUARY 19, 2024

1 SO, DEFINITELY IMPACTS -- OR COULD IMPACT OUR ABILITY TO TAKE  
2 ON NEW PROJECTS FOR COASTAL RESILIENCE AND SEA LEVEL RISE. AND  
3 THOSE NUMBERS ARE FOR THE ENTIRE COASTAL CONSERVANCY  
4 JURISDICTION, SO, FOR THE BAY AREA AND THE OUTER COAST. AT OUR  
5 FEBRUARY 15TH BOARD MEETING, WE'RE TAKING A REALLY LARGE  
6 NUMBER OF PROJECTS, AND WITH THE REMAINING PROJECTED FUNDS IN  
7 JUST SOME OF THE HIGHLIGHTS FOR BAY AREA PROJECTS, A GRANT FOR  
8 BENEFICIAL USE OF PETALUMA RIVER DREDGE SEDIMENT AT CULLEN  
9 RANCH WE'RE GOING TO COST SHARE THAT WITH THE CORP OF  
10 ENGINEERS. WE'RE TAKING A PROJECT IN EMERYVILLE ALONG  
11 MCLAUGHLIN EAST SHORE STATE PARK. THIS IS CALTRANS FUNDING  
12 THAT WAS REQUIRED IN A BCDC PERMIT AND IT'S TAKING A WHILE TO  
13 MOVE THIS FORWARD BUT WITH THE CITY OF EMERYVILLE IN EAST BAY  
14 PARKS WE'RE GOING TO DO SOME IMPROVEMENTS FOR PUBLIC ACCESS  
15 AND HABITAT RESTORATION ALONG A NEGLECTED CORNER. BAYLANDS  
16 PLANNING WHICH I'M SURE ARE COORDINATING WITH MTC CALTRANS IS  
17 PLACEMENT OF SEDIMENT AT POND A4 IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY THIS IS  
18 VALLEY WATER THEY OWN THIS BOND AND ARE WORKING TOWARDS  
19 RESTORATION OF IT. SO ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO BENEFICIALLY USE  
20 SOME DIRT. AND ANOTHER LARGE GRANT, I THINK IT'S FIVE AND A  
21 HALF MILLION TO SAN FRANCISCO RECREATION AND PARK DEPARTMENT  
22 FOR INDIA BASIN PARK WORK. SO, THOSE ARE HIGHLIGHTS FROM OUR  
23 FEBRUARY 15TH MEETING COMING UP. WE ARE ALSO WORKING ON A NOAA  
24 GRANT APPLICATION. WHEN PRESIDENT BIDEN WAS DOWN IN PALO ALTO  
25 WITH NEWSOM, UNVEILED THIS -- WHAT'S IT CALLED? THE CLIMATE



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 RESILIENCE CHALLENGE, I THINK -- IT HAS A LOT OF CS AND RS IN  
2 THE ACRONYM. SO WE'RE WORKING REALLY HARD, OUR STAFF, WITH  
3 MOST OF THE BARC AGENCIES ON A \$75 MILLION APPLICATION FOR SAN  
4 FRANCISCO BAY. IT INCLUDES THE NORTH RICHMOND LIVING LEVEE,  
5 SAFER BAY WORK, DOWN IN THE SOUTH BAY, REGIONALLY ADVANCING  
6 LIVING SHORELINES, IMPLEMENTATION OF TEN PROJECTS IN THE  
7 CENTRAL BAY, OYSTER AND EEL GRASS RESTORATION, SUPPORT FOR THE  
8 BRRIT, THE REGULATORY TEAM, AND SUPPORT FOR ONGOING REGIONAL  
9 COORDINATION AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION, PARTICULARLY  
10 NATURE-BASED. WE ARE ALSO IN THE MIDST, WITH THE SAN FRANCISCO  
11 BAY RESTORATION AUTHORITY, OF THE MEASURE AA GRANT ROUND  
12 SEVEN. STAFF WILL BE BRINGING A LIST OF RECOMMENDED PROJECTS  
13 FOR THIS GRANT RUINED TO MARCH RESTORATION AUTHORITY BOARD  
14 MEETING. AGAIN, THAT'S A \$25 MILLION PER YEAR PARCEL TAX IN  
15 THE BAY AREA. SO, BRINGING THAT LIST OF PROJECTS TO THE MARCH  
16 BOARD MEETING THEN MOVING THE PROJECTS FORWARD AT FUTURE BOARD  
17 MEETINGS AS THEY ARE READY TO GO. AND THEN, FINALLY, JUST ON  
18 THE NOTE OF THE SEA LEVEL RISE MOU THAT WE'RE ALL WORKING ON,  
19 I -- WE HAVE A BRAND-NEW BOARD MEMBER ON THE CONSERVANCY,  
20 CAROL HART, SHE'S THE CHAIR OF THE COASTAL COMMISSION NOW. SO,  
21 SHE SITS ON THE CONSERVANCY BOARD IN THAT POSITION, AND SHE  
22 HAS KINDLY AGREED TO TAKE PART IN DISCUSSIONS AROUND THE MOU,  
23 WHICH I'M EXCITED B SO, IT WILL BE CAROL HART, ALONG WITH OUR  
24 CHAIR DOUG BOSCO.

25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** NOACK?

2

3 **SUE NOACK:** THE 392 CUT THAT WAS AN UNALLOCATED AMOUNT? IT  
4 WASN'T CLEAR. IT SOUNDED LIKE YOU ALREADY HAD MONEY ALLOCATED  
5 PROJECTS THAT ARE GETTING APPROVED THEN 392 THAT HAD NOT BEEN  
6 ON THE HORIZON YET?

7

8 **AMY HUTZEL:** THE CONSERVANCY IN THE LAST TWO BUDGETS WE  
9 RECEIVED ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS FOR COASTAL RESILIENCE AND  
10 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION. THE 392 MILLION WAS NOT YET  
11 ALLOCATED FOR ANY PROJECTS. THAT WAS THE AMOUNT THAT'S BEING  
12 PROPOSED FOR REDUCTION. THE -- SO, 1 BILLION, MINUS 392  
13 MILLION IS WHAT WE HAVE TO WORK WITH. MOST OF THAT HAS GONE  
14 TOWARDS PROJECTS AND WE'RE JUST DEALING WITH THE FINAL -- THE  
15 FINAL AMOUNTS.

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? ANY  
20 MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. SEEING NONE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL  
21 GO TO THE REPORT FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY CONSERVATION  
22 DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

23

24 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** THANK YOU CHAIR, COMMISSIONERS. LARRY  
25 GOLDZBAND. A FEW THINGS. AT SOME POINT TODAY -- AND I DON'T



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 KNOW IF IT'S HAPPENED YET BECAUSE IT'S ONLY 10:35, THE OCEAN  
2 PROTECTION COUNCIL WILL UNVEIL THE NEW RISING SEA LEVEL  
3 GUIDANCE DOCUMENT THAT WILL BE UP FOR DISCUSSION FOR A 45 DAY  
4 PERIOD. THE DRAFT DOCUMENT WILL BE RELEASED TODAY, AT SOME  
5 POINT, BUT WE HAVE NOT BEEN TOLD EXACTLY WHEN. I HAVE SEEN A  
6 LITTLE BIT OF IT, AND IF I WERE TO TELL YOU ANYTHING ABOUT IT,  
7 NOT ONLY WOULD I LOSE MY JOB, BUT I WOULD HAVE TO KILL YOU  
8 ALL. AND IT IS BEING VERY CLOSELY GUARDED. BUT WE WILL HAVE A  
9 BRIEFING AT BCDC DURING OUR NEXT MEETING, FEBRUARY 1ST, ON THE  
10 DOCUMENT, AND THAT BRIEFING WILL BE LED BY COMMISSIONER JEN  
11 ECKERLY, WHO IS HEAD OF THE OCEAN PROTECTION COUNCIL. SO, FOR  
12 ANYBODY WHO IS INTERESTED, PLEASE FEEL FREE TO JOIN FEBRUARY  
13 1ST. THIS TUESDAY, WE ARE GOING TO BE HOSTING A SEDIMENT  
14 MANAGEMENT STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP. SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT FOR ALL  
15 OF YOU WHO HAVE NOT HAD THE PLEASURE OF DEALING WITH MUD  
16 RECENTLY, IS THE FANCY TITLE FOR HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT THE  
17 DIRT GOES WHERE IT NEEDS TO GO SO THAT AMY AND EVERYBODY AT  
18 THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND EVERYBODY ELSE WHO IS DOING  
19 PROJECTS ACTUALLY CAN BENEFICIALLY REUSE THAT WHICH IS DREDGED  
20 WITHIN THE BAY. THIS IS THE FIRST OF TWO IN-PERSON WORKSHOPS  
21 TO DISCUSS AND PROVIDE INPUT ON AN ACTION ROADMAP THAT WILL  
22 MAXIMIZE THE USE OF BENEFICIAL REUSE OF SOILS AND SEDIMENT FOR  
23 ADAPTING BAY AREA WETLANDS. AND ULTIMATELY IF ALL GOES AS  
24 PLANNED, WILL LEAD TO A BAY PLAN AMENDMENT DEALING WITH  
25 BENEFICIAL REUSE. THAT WORKSHOP WILL START AT 9:15, HERE, ON



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 BEALE STREET. AND IT WILL INCLUDE STRATEGY SESSIONS AND BREAK-  
2 OUT SESSIONS ON ISSUES SUCH AS DREDGE SEDIMENT FROM NAVIGATION  
3 CHANNELS AND STRATEGIC AND INDIRECT PLACEMENT. IT IS A  
4 SOMEWHAT TECHNICAL WORKSHOP, BUT I THINK IT WOULD REALLY BE  
5 WORTHWHILE IF YOU HAVE STAFF WHO ARE INTERESTED IN BENEFICIAL  
6 REUSE FOR THEM TO AT LEAST LISTEN IN, AND AN INVITATION FLYER  
7 IS ON THE BCDC WEB SITE. AMY TALKED TO YOU ABOUT THE BUDGET  
8 ISSUES THAT ARE FACING THE STATE. YOU ALL KNOW ABOUT THEM. THE  
9 GOOD NEWS IS THAT WE WERE TOLD LAST DECEMBER THAT THE STATE  
10 WAS FACING A \$68 BILLION DEFICIT, GIVE OR TAKE A FEW. IT'S NOW  
11 DOWN TO 40. BUT AS THE LATE EVERETT DIRK SON SAID, A BILLION  
12 HERE AND A BILLION THERE ADS UP TO REAL MONEY. WITH REGARDS TO  
13 BCDC, I CAN TELL YOU THAT THE BIGGEST DISAPPOINTMENT WITH  
14 REGARD -- ONE OF THE TWO BIGGEST DISAPPOINTMENT WITH REGARD TO  
15 THE BUDGET IS WE HAD THE PULL BACK OF OUR PROMISE CAITLIN AND  
16 TO THE ESTUARY TO BE COSPONSORS FOR WHICH WE APOLOGIZED  
17 PUBLICLY. AND THEN FINALLY, I WILL LET YOU KNOW THAT BCDC  
18 STAFF ARE BACK IN THE OFFICE TWO DAYS PER WEEK. EVERYBODY IS  
19 COMING IN ON THURSDAYS, AND THAT HAS, I THINK, ELICITED LOT OF  
20 SMILES FROM OUR STAFF. FIRST THURSDAY WE SAW PEOPLE SMILING  
21 AND HUGGING EACH OTHER WHO HAD NOT ACTUALLY BEEN IN THE OFFICE  
22 TOGETHER FOR UPWARDS OF THREE OR FOUR YEARS. MOST EVERYBODY IS  
23 IN THE OFFICE ON WEDNESDAYS. I THINK THERE ARE TWO OF US IN  
24 THE OFFICE TODAY. MONDAYS AND FRIDAYS ARE PRETTY EMPTY, BUT AT



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 LEAST ON WEDNESDAYS AND THURSDAYS. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY  
2 QUESTIONS.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WERE THERE ANY  
5 QUESTIONS? YES, DIRECTOR ECKLUND.

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** LARRY, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR UPDATE. I'M  
8 KIND OF CURIOUS, WHAT DO YOU THINK ABAG CAN DO TO HELP WITH  
9 THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MAXIMIZING BENEFICIAL REUSE OF THE  
10 SEDIMENT IN OTHER PARTS OF ABAG'S AREA? I GUESS IT'S -- I  
11 GUESS BCDC, DOES IT COVER ALL OF ABAG'S TERRITORY? OR THERE  
12 ARE SOME AREAS THAT --

13

14 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** WELL, THERE ARE 46 CITIES, COMMISSIONER  
15 ECKLUND, AS YOU KNOW, AND NINE COUNTIES, AND THEY'RE ALL PART  
16 OF ABAG. BENEFICIAL --

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** BUT AREN'T THERE 101?

19

20 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** THERE ARE 101 CITIES, BUT THERE ARE 46 THAT  
21 TOUCH THE BAY. FROM OUR PERSPECTIVE, THE WAY I TEND TO SEE IT,  
22 BENEFICIAL REUSE IS, SORT OF, A WHOLESALE ISSUE AS OPPOSED TO  
23 RETAIL ISSUE. THESE THINGS HAPPEN ON LARGE-SCALE. THEY HAPPEN  
24 IN THE WATER AND BENEFICIAL REUSE, THEN THE SOILS ARE SENT --  
25 THE SEDIMENT IS SENT TO PLACES THAT ARE, FOR MOST PART,



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 PUBLICLY OWNED, SO THERE IS NOT A LOT OF CITY OR COUNTY DIRECT  
2 EXPOSURE IN THAT. THE BEST THING ABAG CAN DO IS EDUCATE  
3 MEMBERS ABOUT STUFF THAT'S GOING ON THAT THEY MAY NOT KNOW,  
4 AND BENEFICIAL REUSE CAN CERTAINLY BE PART OF THAT. WE ARE  
5 GOING TO BE -- AND I KNOW CHAIRMAN ARREGUIN KNOWS THIS -- WE  
6 ARE GOING TO BE LOOKING TO ABAG DURING THE SPRING TO MAKE SURE  
7 WE CAN USE ABAG AS A CHANNEL TO EDUCATE CITIES AND COUNTIES  
8 ABOUT THE GUIDANCE THAT IS BEING DEVELOPED THIS YEAR THAT WILL  
9 DIRECT HOW CITIES, COUNTIES, AND OTHER GOVERNMENTS CREATE  
10 SUBREGIONAL PLANS FOR SHORELINE ADAPTATION. AND WE'RE LOOK  
11 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ABAG ON USING THAT CHANNEL TO BE  
12 EDUCATIONAL FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS.

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT. I -- BECAUSE I WORKED  
15 FOR EPA, AND ARMY CORP, I HAVE A REAL UNDERSTANDING ABOUT  
16 BENEFICIAL REUSE, BUT WHEN I TALK TO OTHER ELECTED OFFICIALS,  
17 THEY DON'T NECESSARILY UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF IT. I HAD  
18 A CONVERSATION WITH ONE THE OTHER DAY WHERE I SAID NO WE CAN'T  
19 JUST DUMP THIS THING OUT IN THE OCEAN. IT'S WHERE A LOT OF IT  
20 IS GOING NOW. AND SO IT'S -- WE HAVE GOT AN UPHILL BATTLE,  
21 BECAUSE WITH THE ELECTED OFFICIALS SUPPORT AND UNDERSTANDING  
22 WHAT THE ISSUES ARE IT'S GOING TO BE A LITTLE BIT HARDER. BUT  
23 WE HAVE THE REGULATORY REQUIREMENT. I WANT TO THANK YOU VERY  
24 MUCH AND EVERYBODY ELSE FOCUSING ON THAT. WHEN I WORKED FOR  
25 EPA, I WENT BACK TO DC AND I HELPED WRITE EPA'S POLICY ON



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 BENEFICIAL REUSE OF SLUDGE, BASICALLY, MUNICIPAL SLUDGE, WHICH  
2 IS SIMILAR TO THE SEDIMENT WE'RE DEALING WITH. A LITTLE BIT  
3 DIFFERENT, BUT IT'S CHALLENGING JUST AS MUCH. BUT, ANYWAY,  
4 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M VERY INTERESTED IN THAT, OBVIOUSLY.

5

6 **AMY HUTZEL:** CAN I CHIME IN ON THAT? THIS IS MY FAVORITE TOPIC.

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** I KNOW. IT'S MINE TOO. [LAUGHTER]

9

10 **AMY HUTZEL:** A LITTLE EMBARRASSING.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** NO, IT'S NOT EMBARRASSING.

13

14 **AMY HUTZEL:** THIS YEAR, THE CORP OF ENGINEERS DOES MOST OF THE  
15 DREDGING IN SAN FRANCISCO BAY. 2 MILLION CUBIC YARDS.

16

17 **PAT ECKLUND:** I SPENT A LOT OF TIME ON THE [INDISCERNIBLE]  
18 DREDGE. [LAUGHTER]

19

20 **AMY HUTZEL:** YEAH. AND THIS YEAR, THE CORP WAS ABLE TO  
21 BENEFICIALLY USE 80% OF THE DREDGE SEDIMENT, WHICH IS DOUBLE  
22 WHAT THEY HAVE DONE HISTORICALLY AND IT'S BECAUSE OF FEDERAL  
23 APPROPRIATIONS OF FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE ACT FUNDING. I THINK  
24 THAT'S ANOTHER WAY LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIALS CAN HELP. IT REALLY  
25 DOES TAKE FEDERAL FUNDING TO MAKE THE BENEFICIAL USE HAPPEN.





JANUARY 19, 2024

1   THERE HAS BEEN -- WE HAVE HAD WERDA LANGUAGE IN A COUPLE WATER  
2   RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT ACTS IN THE LAST 6 OR 7 YEARS, BUT THE  
3   CORP NEEDS THE APPROPRIATIONS, AS WELL, TO DO THIS WORK.

4

5   **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LOVE TO SEE US PROHIBIT TAKING THE  
6   MATERIAL OUT INTO THE OCEAN. BUT I KNOW THAT'S A WISH. THANK  
7   YOU VERY MUCH.

8

9   **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? ANY  
10  MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. THANK YOU. LARRY. WE'LL GO TO OUR LAST  
11  MEMBER AGENCY REPORT, WHICH IS FROM THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY  
12  MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, AND I THINK GREG NUDD IS ON ZOOM WHO WILL  
13  BE PRESENTING ON BEHALF OF BAAQMD.

14

15  **GREG NUDD:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I'M GOING TO COVER A COUPLE OF  
16  BROAD TOPICS TODAY, ONE IS CLIMATE MITIGATION AND THE OTHER IS  
17  ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE. WITH RESPECT TO CLIMATE MITIGATION  
18  THERE IS FUNDING IN THE INFLATION REDUCTION ACT FOR CLIMATE  
19  PROTECTION -- CLIMATE POLLUTION REDUCTION GRANTS, ABOUT \$4.6  
20  MILLION AVAILABLE NATION-WIDE. AND THE WAY IT'S STRUCTURED IS  
21  THAT IN ORDER TO APPLY FOR THOSE IMPLEMENTATION GRANTS, IT HAS  
22  TO BE TAGGED TO A MEASURE THAT'S IDENTIFIED IN A PRELIMINARY  
23  CLIMATE PLANNING GRANT. AND THE EPA IS IMPLEMENTING THE  
24  PROGRAM HAS BROKEN IT UP BY METROPOLITAN PHYSICAL AREAS AND  
25  STATEWIDE. SO, WITHIN THE BAY AREA, THE AIR DISTRICT IS



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WORKING ON A PLAN FOR THE COUNTIES THAT TOUCH THE NORTHERN  
2 SIDE OF THE BAY. SO, THAT EXCLUDES SANTA CLARA. SANTA CLARA  
3 COUNTY IS WORKING ON A PLAN FOR THEIR NSA, WHICH GOES BACK  
4 INTO SAN BENITO COUNTY AND THERE IS STATEWIDE PLAN AS WELL.  
5 ALL OF THESE PIECES FIT TOGETHER IN THE END WHEN YOU ARE  
6 LOOKING TO APPLY FOR GRANTS. THE AIR DISTRICT'S PLAN WE'RE  
7 FOCUSING ON TWO BROAD TYPES OF MEASURES. BUILDING  
8 DECARBONIZATION AND MOBILITY HUBS. THE SIMILAR FOCUS IN THE  
9 SANTA CLARA PLAN ESPECIALLY IN DECARBONIZATION, STATEWIDE PLAN  
10 IS NOT COVERING BUILDING DECARB BUT IS COVERING SOME OTHER  
11 AREAS THAT ARE OF INTEREST TO FOLKS HERE IN THE BAY AREA, I  
12 BELIEVE SOME OF THE PROJECTS THAT THE PORT WOULD LIKE TO GET  
13 FUNDED COVERED UNDER THE STATEWIDE PLAN AND EXPECT STATEWIDE  
14 PLAN TO COVER SOME OF THE THINGS OUR FRIENDS IN THE NORTH  
15 WOULD BE INTERESTED IN RESPECT TO LAND APPLICATION AND CARB ON  
16 SINK. THOSE IMPLEMENTATION GRANTS IN APRIL 1ST THEY HAVE TO BE  
17 BASED ON INFORMATION FROM A PRELIMINARY CLIMATE PLANNING GRANT  
18 DUE ON MARCH 1ST. SO IT'S A BIT OF A TRICK TO BE ABLE TO GET  
19 THIS DONE WE'RE HOPING TO GET OUR DRAFT MEASURES OUT FOR FOLKS  
20 TO REVIEW BY END OF THIS MONTH. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH MTC  
21 AND ABAG ON THIS AND MAYBE OTHER PARTNERS WHO ARE INTERESTED  
22 IN PURSUING SOME FUNDING, WHICH COULD BE IN THE RANGE OF 50 TO  
23 \$200 MILLION FOR THE BAY AREA FOR PROJECTS FOR REDUCING  
24 CLIMATE POLLUTANTS IN THIS AREA. MOVING TO ENVIRONMENTAL  
25 JUSTICE WE RECENTLY KICKED OFF THE BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 COMMUNITY AND EMISSION REDUCTION PLANNING PROCESS. THE  
2 STEERING COMMITTEE HELD ITS FIRST MEETING. MANY PARTNERS IN  
3 THE MEETING TODAY MENTIONED ACTIVITIES IN BAYVIEW HUNTERS  
4 POINT. WE WANT TO LINK EVERYBODY TOGETHER TO MAKE SURE WE'RE  
5 FOLLOWING ALONG WITH WHAT FOLKS ARE CONCERNED B THE MAIN  
6 CONCERN THAT WE'RE HEARING IN BAYVIEW-HUNTERS POINT SEEMS TO  
7 BE DERIVED FROM ACTIVITIES AT THE SHIPYARD. SO, DEFINITELY  
8 SOME ALIGNMENT WITH DISCUSSIONS OTHER FOLKS ARE HAVING. IN  
9 OTHER NEWS ALONG THOSE LINES WE HAVE RELEASED THE DRAFT  
10 COMMUNITY EMISSION REDUCTION PLAN FOR RICHMOND, NORTH  
11 RICHMOND, SAN PABLO. AND UNLIKE THE WEST OAKLAND COMMUNITY  
12 EMISSION REDUCTION PLAN THERE ARE SPECIFIC ACTIONS FOR THE AIR  
13 DISTRICT IN THIS PLAN BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT OF STATIONARY  
14 SOURCE POLLUTION IN THAT AREA. SO, THAT'S WHERE WE EXPECT THAT  
15 TO GENERATE SOME INTERESTING CONVERSATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE  
16 LONG-TERM FATE OF THE REFINERY SECTOR IN THE BAY AREA. AND  
17 KIND OF PREPARING FOR THAT TRANSITION. ALSO, ALONG THE LINES  
18 OF ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE, WHEN WE HAVE OUR BOARD RETREAT LATER  
19 THIS MONTH IN BAYVIEW HUNTERS POINT, WE'LL BE DISCUSSING OUR  
20 STRATEGIC PLAN AND ONE OF THE MAIN CHALLENGES IN OUR STRATEGIC  
21 PLAN IS MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE WEAVING ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE  
22 ISSUES THROUGH THE THAT PLAN AND SO I EXPECT ROBUST DISCUSSION  
23 ALONG THE RETREAT. THAT CONCLUDES THE UPDATE FROM THE AIR  
24 DISTRICT. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.  
25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THERE ARE  
2 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS HERE IN THE BOARDROOM  
3 OR ON ZOOM? IF NOT, THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE TODAY AND FOR  
4 YOUR REPORT AND FOR YOUR ONGOING PARTNERSHIP. I'LL ASK IF  
5 THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OF THOSE MEMBER AGENCY  
6 REPORTS, EITHER IN-PERSON OR ON ZOOM?

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I SEE NO IN-PERSON COMMENTS, OR WE HAVE  
9 RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENTS.

10

11 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. OKAY. NEXT AGENDA ITEM, 6B,  
12 THE BARC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR UPDATE. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL  
13 ITEM. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, ALLISON  
14 BROOKS.

15

16 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR ARREGUIN. THANK YOU  
17 FOR CALLING OUT THE SYSTEMS MAPPING REPORT TOO. IT'S A GOOD  
18 REMINDER THAT WE ARE LOOKING AT, REALLY WHAT CLIMATE CHANGE,  
19 WE'RE LOOKING AT MULTIPLE -- MULTIPLE HAZARDS. AND I,  
20 RECENTLY, ON FRIDAY, ACTUALLY, I ATTENDED -- I SERVE ON THE  
21 GOVERNOR'S OFFICE OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH, THE INTEGRATED  
22 CLIMATE AND RESILIENCE PROGRAM, THEIR TECHNICAL ADVISORY  
23 COUNCIL. I'M SO PROUD OF MYSELF FOR BEING ABLE TO BE SPELL OUT  
24 ALL THOSE ACRONYMS. AND THAT WAS -- IT WAS BASED IN RIVERSIDE,  
25 ON FRIDAY, AND IT WAS OPR AND CLIMATE RESOLVE, WHICH IS A NON-



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 PROFIT BASED OUT OF LOS ANGELES HOSTED THIS EVENT AT CARB'S  
2 BEAUTIFUL LEAD CERTIFIED OFFICES IN RIVERSIDE. AND WAS A LOT  
3 OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA REPRESENTATIVES THERE. A LOT OF PEOPLE  
4 FROM THE INLAND EMPIRE WHICH THEY CALL THE IE, WHICH I WAS NOT  
5 -- I DIDN'T KNOW PEOPLE THAT LIVE IN THE IE CALL IT THE IE.  
6 BUT, ANYWAY, IT WAS REALLY ILLUMINATING IN THE -- YOU KNOW,  
7 FLYING INTO ONTARIO. I HAVEN'T DONE THAT IN 20 YEARS. I DON'T  
8 KNOW IF YOU HAVE DONE THAT RECENTLY. BUT THE -- SPEAKING OF  
9 THE PORT AND DRAYAGE AND MILES AND MILES -- AS YOU ARE FLYING  
10 IN -- OF THE BIG DISTRIBUTION CENTERS THAT HAVE BEEN BUILT  
11 THERE. IT WAS REALLY, REALLY SOMETHING. AND I THINK IT WAS A  
12 REMINDER THAT WE LIVE IN A REGION AMONG MANY REGIONS THAT ARE  
13 WORKING ON CLIMATE CHANGE IN DIFFERENT WAYS AND NEED RESOURCES  
14 TO DO THAT. AND AS WE'RE ALL WORKING TOGETHER TO GET RESOURCES  
15 TO DEAL WITH A VARIETY OF HAZARDS WE'RE FACING HERE, WE'RE  
16 STRONGER BY WORKING TOGETHER. BECAUSE THERE IS A LOT OF  
17 COMPETING INTEREST, AND ALL JUSTIFIABLE INTEREST FOR NEEDING  
18 TO ADDRESS MULTIPLE ISSUES. THE BIG ISSUE DOWN THERE WAS HEAT.  
19 AND THEY WERE REALLY -- A BIG DISCUSSION, BIG -- A LOT OF  
20 SESSIONS ON HEAT, AND A LOT OF WORK THAT'S BEING DONE AROUND  
21 THAT. SO, I JUST WANTED TO SHARE THAT. I THOUGHT IT WAS REALLY  
22 INTERESTING. AND IT WAS NICE TO BE IN A PLACE, AGAIN,  
23 RECONNECTING WITH COLLEAGUES AND OTHERS WORKING ON THESE  
24 ISSUES AND BEING IN-PERSON. AS LARRY SAID, A LOT OF PEOPLE, A  
25 LOT OF ENERGY AND MEETING TOGETHER AROUND THAT. YOU HAVE --



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 THEY BROUGHT UP A LITTLE IMAGE OF OUR ANNUAL REPORT AT A  
2 GLANCE. JOSH AND I WORKED ON THIS. WE THOUGHT IT WOULD BE  
3 HELPFUL FOR YOU ALL TO SEE THE RANGE OF ACTIVITIES THAT REALLY  
4 BARC STAFF IS WORKING ON, WITH ALL OF -- WITH STAFF FROM ALL  
5 OF THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES. I WANT TO THANK -- YOU KNOW, WE  
6 HAVE A LOT OF AGENCIES PARTICIPATING. AND NOW EVERYBODY IS  
7 PROVIDING THESE UPDATES. THERE ARE SEVEN AGENCY THAT ARE  
8 ACTIVELY ENGAGED IN WORKING TOGETHER ON BARC, AND IT'S NOT  
9 ALWAYS EASY TO COORDINATE. EVERY AGENCY IS VERY -- HAS THEIR  
10 OWN CULTURE AND WAY OF WORKING AND PRIORITIES. BUT I NEVER  
11 FEEL LIKE THAT COMMITMENT ISN'T THERE TO TRY TO WORK TOGETHER  
12 AND FIGURE OUT HOW WE CAN COLLECTIVELY MAKE A DIFFERENCE FOR  
13 THE PEOPLE THAT LIVE AND WORK IN THE BAY AREA. SO, THE ANNUAL  
14 REPORT WAS REALLY AN ATTEMPT TO JUST PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF  
15 WHAT JOSH AND I DO ON A DAILY BASIS. AND A LOT OF IT -- THERE  
16 WERE MORE THINGS CAPTURED HERE, BUT THEY'RE REALLY FOCUSED ON  
17 ACTIVITIES ORIENTED TO COORDINATION AND DELIVERING ON THE  
18 SHARED WORK PLAN THAT YOU ALL APPROVED LAST YEAR. AND I HOPE  
19 THIS RESONATES WITH YOU. AND HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS,  
20 OR, YOU KNOW -- ONE OF THE BENEFITS OF PERHAPS WORKING ON SOME  
21 STRATEGIC PLANNING, THE LAST TIME WE DID ANY KIND OF STRATEGIC  
22 PLANS FOR BARC WAS IN 2015. SO WE'RE COMING ON TEN YEARS. I  
23 FIND JUST REALLY CONNECTING WITH THE GOVERNING BOARD. MANY OF  
24 YOU ARE NEW TO THE GOVERNING BOARD, CONNECTING TO THE  
25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND LEADERSHIP OF THE AGENCIES TO MAKE



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 SURE WE ALL FEEL LIKE WE'RE WORKING ON ALL THE THINGS WE NEED  
2 TO BE WORKING ON AND WE'RE MAKING A DIFFERENCE. IN THE END WE  
3 IDENTIFIED EMERGING OPPORTUNITY THAT'S WHERE THE MEMORANDUM OF  
4 UNDERSTANDING IS. IT REALLY IS A MEMORANDUM OF OPPORTUNITY TO  
5 MAKE A DIFFERENCE. BUT I'LL GIVE YOU AN OVERVIEW OF -- AND  
6 JUST, ACTUALLY, LET ME BACK UP A LITTLE BIT. THE IMPETUS  
7 BEHIND THE TWO EMERGING OPPORTUNITIES THERE ARE THE MOU AND  
8 THIS COMPREHENSIVE STUDY, EXPLORING, WHICH THE COASTAL  
9 CONSERVANCY IS TAKING THE LEAD ON BUT IT'S THE U.S. ARMY CORP  
10 OF ENGINEERS TO DO A COMPREHENSIVE STUDY FOR SEA LEVEL RISE  
11 AND THE IMPETUS BEHIND THESE TWO EMERGING EFFORTS ARE THE  
12 REPORT THAT MTC AND BCDC RELEASED WHERE WE NEED ABOUT \$105  
13 BILLION TO -- WE HAVE ABOUT ROUGHLY 5 BILLION, BUT WE NEED 105  
14 MORE TO ADDRESS THE -- OUR VULNERABILITIES TO SEA LEVEL RISE  
15 AND FLOODING. AND WHERE ARE WE GOING TO GET THOSE RESOURCES?  
16 LIKE I SAID, WE'RE COMPETING NOT ONLY WITH OTHER REGIONS AND  
17 THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, WHICH IS THE LEADER ON CLIMATE CHANGE  
18 EVEN IF THEY'RE CUTTING THE BUDGET, WE STILL HAVE MORE STATE  
19 RESOURCES GOING TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES THAN MOST OTHER STATES  
20 IN THE COUNTRY. AND, BUT WE ARE COMPETING AGAINST OTHERS, AND  
21 WE'RE COMPETING NATIONALLY AGAINST OTHER REGIONS THAT ARE  
22 DEALING WITH HURRICANES, AND REAL DISASTERS THAT ARE IMPACTING  
23 THEIR COMMUNITIES. SO, REALLY, THE IMPETUS BEHIND BOTH OF  
24 THESE EFFORTS WAS TO CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER, TO GENERATE  
25 THE RESOURCES WE NEED TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES IN A TIMELY



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 MANNER. THE U.S. ARMY CORP IS REALLY -- REALLY OUR PRIMARY  
2 FEDERAL SOURCE OF SIGNIFICANT DOLLARS. WE'RE TALKING, YOU  
3 KNOW, OTHER REGIONS ACROSS THE COUNTRY THROUGH DOING  
4 COMPREHENSIVE STUDIES HAVE GENERATE 55 BILLION TO WORK ON  
5 PROJECTS. SO THAT'S AN AVENUE WORTH EXPLORING WE RECOGNIZE IT  
6 MAY BE CHALLENGING BECAUSE WE'RE ASKING FOR 100% FEDERAL  
7 FUNDING TO EXPLORE THIS AND THAT MAY BE A HURDLE WE MIGHT NOT  
8 BE ABLE TO GET OVER, BUT WE'RE GOING TO TRY. THE MOU IS A WAY  
9 FOR US TO DOCUMENT IN MANY WAYS THINGS WE'RE ALREADY DOING,  
10 BUT TO GET IT ALL DOWN ON PAPER AND CAPTURE WHAT THE SEVEN  
11 AGENCY THAT IS PARTICIPATING IN BARC, HOW WE'RE CONTINUING TO  
12 WORK TOGETHER TO COORDINATE, TO ADDRESS, FROM A GOVERNANCE  
13 PERSPECTIVE, TO ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE AND FLOODING. IT'S --  
14 WE HAVE GOT A -- SO, OUR FIRST KICKOFF MEETING, WE HAVE A  
15 LEADERSHIP COMMITTEE MADE UP OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND  
16 SOME REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE COMMISSIONS AND DIRECTORS OF THE  
17 PARTICIPATING AGENCIES. WE HAD A FIRST MEETING IN SEPTEMBER.  
18 AND OUT OF THAT WAS, OKAY, DRAFT A -- MAKE -- HAVE AN INITIAL  
19 DRAFT OF THE MOU, AND WE'LL COME BACK TOGETHER AND REVIEW  
20 THAT. SO WE JUST RECENTLY CAME BACK TOGETHER. WE HAD A REVIEW  
21 OF A FIRST DRAFT ON JANUARY 11TH. AND THERE IS A COMMITTEE, OR  
22 A WORKING GROUP OF STAFF, FROM YOUR RESPECTIVE AGENCIES THAT  
23 ARE WORKING ON THIS, ON DRAFTING THIS. SO, WHERE WE LEFT IT,  
24 IT WAS A REALLY INTERESTING CONVERSATION. I THINK TRYING TO  
25 GET THIS DOWN ON PAPER, WHICH EILEEN WHITE, YOU KNOW,





JANUARY 19, 2024

1 MENTIONED, IS A CHALLENGING EFFORT TO TRY TO CAPTURE WHAT EACH  
2 AGENCY'S KIND OF PRIORITIES ARE, AND GET IT ALL DOWN ON PAPER  
3 AND GET SOMETHING BEFORE YOU THAT EVERYONE CAN AGREE WITH, SO  
4 WE'RE CONTINUING TO KIND OF WORK ON THAT. BUT THE NEXT STEP IS  
5 THAT EACH OF THE AGENCIES HAVE A DRAFT, AND THEY'RE GOING TO  
6 PROVIDE COMMENTS AND EDITS AND HIGHLIGHT THOSE AREAS THAT  
7 MAYBE THERE IS SOME DISCOMFORT, OR WHERE FOLKS AREN'T QUITE  
8 SURE HOW IT'S GOING TO HIT WITH THEIR COMMISSIONS BOARDS AND  
9 WE JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THOSE ISSUES ARE. THEY'RE  
10 GOING TO GET THOSE COMMENTS TO US BY FEBRUARY -- VALENTINE'S  
11 DAY. FEBRUARY 14TH, BECAUSE WE'RE FEELING THE LOVE. WE'RE  
12 FEELING A LOT OF LOVE AROUND THIS. HOPEFULLY BEFORE, AND THEN  
13 WE'LL RECONVENE IN MARCH TO REVIEW THE DRAFT. AND HOPEFULLY,  
14 WE HAD AN INITIAL GOAL OF HAVING THIS DONE BY MARCH. WE PUSHED  
15 IT OUT A LITTLE BIT JUST TO GIVE EVERYBODY A LITTLE MORE TIME  
16 AND WE'RE HOPING TO BRING THIS FORWARD FOR APPROVAL BY JUNE.  
17 AND I THINK THAT'S ALL I HAVE TO SHARE. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER  
18 ANY QUESTIONS.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU, ALLISON. YES, DIRECTOR  
21 NOACK?

22

23 **SUE NOACK:** JUST, HOW DOES THE MOU FACTOR INTO THE STRATEGIC  
24 PLANNING PROCESS?

25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **ALLISON BROOKS:** RIGHT. THAT'S -- IT'S A VERY GOOD QUESTION. I  
2 THINK WHAT THE MOU IS -- SO, PART OF THE DISCUSSION WE'RE  
3 HAVING AMONG THE -- AT, YOU KNOW, TOGETHER, IS, HOW  
4 TRANSFORMATIVE ARE WE TRYING TO BE. AND I -- AND ONE OF THE  
5 FINDINGS IS MOUS AREN'T VERY TRANSFORMATIVE IN AND OF ITSELF,  
6 BUT IT'S THE WORK THAT WE DO TOGETHER. [LAUGHTER] SO HOW DO WE  
7 CAPTURE ANY CHANGES, FOR EXAMPLE, ADJUSTMENTS THAT NEED TO BE  
8 MADE, IN THE PRIORITIES, AND EVEN THE COMPOSITION OR THE  
9 PURPOSE OF ALL THE, YOU KNOW, FOR BARC, FOR EXAMPLE, IS BARC  
10 FULFILLING ALL OF THE POTENTIAL IT COULD FULFILL. ARE THERE  
11 OTHER TWEAKS OR ADJUSTMENTS WE MIGHT NEED TO MAKE AS, WITH  
12 THIS ENTITY, IN RELATIONSHIP TO THE OTHER PARTICIPATING  
13 AGENCIES? IT'S JUST ONE THOUGHT BEHIND THAT.

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** [INDISCERNIBLE] INTERESTED -- WORKING TOGETHER.

16

17 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YEAH, AND I THINK OUT OF THAT, YOU  
20 KNOW, WHAT IS BARC'S ROLE, VIS-A-VIS, THERE IS BIGGER WORK  
21 THAT WE NEED DO. AND I DO AGREE WITH ALLISON, IT'S BEEN TEN  
22 YEARS SINCE THERE HAS BEEN A STRATEGIC, YOU KNOW, PLANNING  
23 PROCESS TO REALLY LOOK AT WHAT IS IT THAT WE ARE STATUTORILY  
24 ESTABLISHED TO DO. BECAUSE WE'RE CREATED BY STATUTE. STATE  
25 STATUTE. AND YOU KNOW, SO WITHIN THAT, WHAT IS IT THE STATE



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WANTS US TO DO AS A REGION AND WHAT ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES TO  
2 FOCUS ON THE NEEDS OF THE BAY AREA HERE IN 2024. AND, SO, WE  
3 HAVE HAD KIND OF PRELIMINARY CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT AND  
4 WHETHER WE NEED TO BRING ON SOME RESOURCES OF ASSIST IN DOING  
5 SOME OF THE STRATEGIC PLANNING PROCESS. WE'LL PROVIDE MORE  
6 INFORMATION ABOUT THAT AT A FUTURE MEETING. BUT I THINK SOME  
7 OF WHAT WILL COME OUT OF THIS MOU WILL HELP INFORM THAT BIGGER  
8 STRATEGIC CONVERSATION. AND I THINK WHAT IT REMINDS DOWN IT,  
9 IT'S REALLY THE MOU CONVERSATION IS REALLY ABOUT PUTTING ON  
10 PAPER WHAT WE'RE ALREADY DOING, BUT ALSO THINKING ABOUT WHERE  
11 THIS AGENCY CAN HAVE VALUE ADD GIVEN PARTICULAR ROLES AND  
12 EXPERTISE AND HOW COULD THEY TAKE ON SOME SPECIFIC ROLE AND  
13 COORDINATING WORK AROUND RESILIENCE. AT ABAG WE'RE INTERESTED  
14 IN TRYING TO ADVANCE THIS WORK. THERE IS CONVERSATION ABOUT US  
15 FORMING A RESILIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE AT ABAG FOCUSED ON POLICY  
16 DISCUSSION WORK IN THIS AREA. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO APPROVE  
17 IT ASSIGN RESOURCES AND LEAN IN ON THIS ALSO. THERE IS A  
18 COMMITMENT FROM EVERYONE INVOLVED THAT WANT TO DO THIS AND  
19 IT'S JUST FINALIZING DETAILS AT THIS POINT. DIRECTOR ECKLUND?

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR ARREGUIN. I'M REALLY  
22 EXCITED ABOUT YOUR DISCUSSION ABOUT THE MOU BETWEEN THE  
23 DIFFERENT AGENCIES. I REMEMBER 2015 WHEN WE FIRST STARTED  
24 BARC, AND THERE WAS A LOT OF DISCOMFORT WITH SOME, THINKING  
25 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO TAKE OVER THE REGULATIONS, OR WHATEVER,



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 TAKE MORE CONTROL. AND I THINK THAT BARC HAS DONE A GREAT JOB  
2 IN TRYING TO BRING EVERYONE TOGETHER AND COLLABORATE MORE SO  
3 WE CAN GET MORE DONE IN THE BAY AREA. I THINK THIS MOU WILL  
4 ALSO PROVIDE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO IDENTIFY GAPS IN ORDER -  
5 - THINGS THAT ARE NOT GETTING DONE, IN AREAS WHERE WE MIGHT  
6 WANT TO SEEK ADDITIONAL LEGISLATION, OR WHATEVER IF WE NEED  
7 TO, TO FILL THOSE GAPS, IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE OBJECTIVE THAT  
8 WE'RE WORKING TOWARDS. SO, I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT IT. AND  
9 I'M REALLY EXCITED, TOO, ABOUT THE PROGRESS THAT HAS BEEN  
10 MADE. AND YOU HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB, ALLISON, JUST REALLY WANT  
11 TO COMPLIMENT YOU. YOU HAVE TAKEN THIS ORGANIZATION THROUGH A  
12 LOT OF TOUGH TIMES. I KNOW IT HASN'T BEEN EASY. BUT YOU HAVE  
13 DONE A GREAT JOB IN MAKING PEOPLE FEEL MORE COMFORTABLE,  
14 COLLABORATING AND GETTING THINGS DONE. IT'S GOING TO HELP THE  
15 101 CITIES AND I FORGET HOW MANY COUNTIES WE HAVE. NINE.  
16 [LAUGHTER] IT'S EASIER TO REMIND CITIES BUT HARDER TO REMEMBER  
17 COUNTIES. ANYWAY. GREAT JOB.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS  
20 HERE IN THE BOARDROOM? IF NOT WE'LL GO TO BOARD MEMBERS ON  
21 ZOOM. ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS  
22 ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT? OKAY. SEEING NONE. I'LL  
23 ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

24



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT PRESENT AND WE HAVE  
2 RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENTS.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. THAT COMPLETES THIS AGENDA  
5 ITEM. WE'LL GO TO THE NEXT ITEM WHICH IS ALSO AN INFORMATION  
6 ITEM, WHICH IS A PRESENTATION FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY  
7 PARTNERSHIP ON A REPORT ON NATURE-BASED SHORELINE STRATEGIES.  
8 AND SO WE'LL RECEIVE A BRIEFING ON THE ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP'S  
9 WORK TO ADVANCE NATURE-BASED SHORELINE INFRASTRUCTURE WITH  
10 MULTIPLE BENEFITS. HI. GOOD MORNING.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. I JUST WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE  
13 THAT A COUPLE OF YOU RECEIVED A SIMILAR VERSION OF THIS  
14 PRESENTATION LAST NIGHT AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MEETING  
15 THAT CAITLIN AND MYSELF PRESENTED AT. SO, I'LL TRY TO MAKE IT  
16 INTERESTING FOR YOU. [LAUGHTER] ADD SOME NEW DETAILS. BUT,  
17 THANK YOU, ALLOW. ALL. -- ALL. AND I'LL BE PRESENTING ON A  
18 PROGRAM OUR CLIMATE RESILIENCE PROGRAM FOCUSED ON NATURE-BASED  
19 SOLUTIONS. OH I'M NOT THE ONE WHO ADVANCES THE SLIDES. NEXT  
20 SLIDE. SO JUST FOR A BIT OF BACKGROUND ON THE ESTUARY  
21 PARTNERSHIP, FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO MIGHT BE LESS FAMILIAR WITH  
22 US. THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP IS A PLACE-BASED  
23 NON-REGULATORY PROGRAM OF THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION  
24 AGENCY. WE'RE 1 OF 28 MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ESTUARY PROGRAM  
25 WHICH WAS ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS IN 1988 TO PROTECT AND



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 RESTORE ESTUARIES OF NATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE. THE NATIONAL  
2 ESTUARY PROGRAM MODEL FOCUSES ON LOCAL PARTNERSHIP,  
3 COLLABORATION, AND CONSENSUS BUILDING. WE LEVERAGE FUNDING AND  
4 PARTNERSHIPS TO SUPPORT EFFORTS TO PROTECT, ENHANCE, AND  
5 RESTORE THE ESTUARY SYSTEM WORKING WITH A LARGE SUITE OF  
6 DIVERSE PARTNERS USING THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT AS OUR GUIDING  
7 DOCUMENT, WHICH I'LL TALK ABOUT IN JUST A MINUTE. NEXT SLIDE.  
8 THE CURRENT VERSION OF THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT IS A REGIONAL  
9 VISION ASKING OURSELVES WHERE WE WANT TO BE IN 2050 AND AN  
10 ACTIONABLE STRATEGY FOR WHAT WE CAN DO OVER THE NEXT FIVE  
11 YEARS TO GET THERE. THE BLUEPRINT RESTORING HEALTH OF THE  
12 ESTUARY ADDRESSING CHEMICAL, PHYSICAL, BIOLOGICAL, AND SOCIAL  
13 ECOLOGICAL PROCESSES. I'M GOING, TO AS I MENTIONED, FOCUS THIS  
14 PRESENTATION ON A SUITE OF ACTIONS WITHIN THE BLUEPRINT  
15 FOCUSED ON NATURE-BASED SHORELINE ADAPTATION. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
16 JUST TO LEVEL SET WHAT WE MEAN WHEN WE SAY NATURE-BASED  
17 SOLUTIONS, WE REALLY LIKE THIS DEFINITION FROM THE  
18 INTERNATIONAL UNION FOR THE CONSERVATION OF NATURE AND NATURAL  
19 RESOURCES THAT TALKS ABOUT LEVERAGING NATURE AND THE POWER OF  
20 HEALTHY ECOSYSTEMS TO PROTECT PEOPLE, OPTIMIZE INFRASTRUCTURE,  
21 AND SAFEGUARD STABLE AND BIO DIVERSE FUTURE. NBS REPRESENTS A  
22 SUITE OF PROJECT TYPES FOR THE SHORELINE AS WELL AS ACTIONS  
23 INTO THE WATER SHED. AND AS I MENTIONED, THIS PRESENTATION  
24 WILL FOCUS SHORELINE SOLUTION. NEXT SLIDE. WHY NATURE-BASED  
25 SOLUTIONS? WE HAVE A NUMBER OF DRIVERS OF URGENCY FOR



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 ADVANCING NBS ON THE SHORELINE ARE INCREASING, MULTIPLE  
2 DRIVERS OF SEA LEVEL RISE, FLOODING, WATER QUALITY IMPROVEMENT  
3 NEEDS AND OTHER PRESSURES ON THE SHORELINE INCREASE OUR  
4 URGENCY TO ADVANCE INNOVATIVE APPROACHES AND SUPPORT MULTI-  
5 BENEFIT PROJECTS IN PARTICULAR. WE HAVE A NUMBER OF REGIONAL  
6 GUIDING DOCUMENTS THAT REALLY ELEVATE THE IMPORTANCE OF NBS,  
7 INCLUDING PLANNED BAY AREA, THE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT, WHICH I  
8 MENTIONED, AND THE BAY ADAPT JOINT PLATFORM, AS WELL AS STATE  
9 AND FEDERAL EXECUTIVE ORDERS, INCLUDING ONE FROM THE BIDEN  
10 EXECUTIVE ORDER FOCUSING ON PRIORITIZING NATURE-BASED  
11 SOLUTIONS WHEREVER POSSIBLE WHEN LOOKING AT FUTURE MANAGEMENT  
12 DIRECTION. NEXT SLIDE. THERE IS A FEW DIFFERENT TYPES OF  
13 SHORELINE NBS PROJECT TYPES AND THAT INCLUDES NATURAL HABITAT  
14 SUCH AS TIDAL MARSHES, TIDAL FLATS, SANDY BEACHES, EEL GRASS  
15 AND OYSTER BEDS THAT MAY BE DOING A SUITE OF DIFFERENT  
16 BENEFITS ALONG THE SHORELINE. HYBRID APPROACHES SUCH AS LIVING  
17 SEA WALLS, AS WELL AS ECOTONES AND HORIZONTAL LEVEES WHICH  
18 WERE ALREADY MENTIONED IN THIS MEETING, WHICH IS GREAT BECAUSE  
19 THAT'S WHAT I'LL BE FOCUSING ON FOR A FEW SLIDES, GETTING TO  
20 WHAT A HORIZONTAL LEVEE REALLY IS AND WHERE WE'RE SEEING  
21 PROJECTS LIKE THAT ALONG THE SHORELINE. NEXT SLIDE. IN THE  
22 FACE OF GLOBAL CLIMATE CHANGE COASTAL CITIES ARE EXPERIENCING  
23 MORE INTENSE STORM EVENTS AND CONSTANT CREEP OF SEA LEVEL  
24 RISE. IN RESPONSE THE COASTS MUST ADAPT. INVOLVING ARMORED  
25 LEVEES, RIP ROUTE SEA WALLS TO PROTECT INLAND INFRASTRUCTURE



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANTS AND IN THIS IMAGE, ANGELA ZIEGLER  
2 EPA DEVELOPED I WANT TO CREDIT HER ON THE LEFT YOU SEE AN  
3 EXAMPLE OF THE TRADITIONAL FLOOD PROTECTION SYSTEM WASTEWATER  
4 TREATMENT PLANT IN THIS CASE BEHIND THE WALL. THIS  
5 CONVENTIONAL APPROACH IS SUSCEPTIBLE TO FAILURE AS THEY DON'T  
6 DISSIPATE WAVE ACTION AND AS THE WAVES OVER THE TOP OF THAT  
7 SYSTEM THE SEA WILL REACH ITS LIMIT IN TERMS OF PROTECTION.  
8 THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE SOLUTION ALTERNATIVE ON THE RIGHT IS HARD  
9 LANDSCAPE IT LINES EXISTING STORM CONTROL LEVEES IN SOME CASES  
10 GRADUALLY SLOPED MARSH PLANTED WITH NATIVE VEGETATION IN  
11 ADDITION USES TREATED WASTEWATER REVERSE OSMOSIS CONCENTRATE  
12 WE'RE BEGINNING TO EXPLORE PROVIDING SIGNIFICANT BENEFITS FOR  
13 THE ESTABLISHMENT OF HABITAT MORE RAPIDLY AT MANY LOCATIONS  
14 LOOKING AT MULTIPLE SOLUTIONS ON THE SHORELINE RATHER THAN ONE  
15 PROBLEM ONE APPROACH. SOMETIMES IT STILL DOES INCORPORATE A  
16 SEA WALL BUT IS ALSO PROVIDING ADDITIONAL BENEFITS ON TOP OF  
17 THAT AS SHOWN IN THIS IMAGE, INCLUDING HABITAT, VEGETATION,  
18 PUBLIC ACCESS IN SOME CASES AND THE WATER TREATMENT LAYER  
19 WHERE TREATED WASTEWATER IS PUMPED BELOW GROUND YOU WOULDN'T  
20 NECESSARILY SEE THAT IF YOU'RE LOOKING AT IT. IT'S BELOW  
21 GROUND. AND IMPROVING THAT WATER QUALITY OVER TIME. IN  
22 PARTICULAR WE HAVE SEEN INCREDIBLE WATER QUALITY IMPROVEMENT  
23 BENEFITS WITH THE REMOVAL OF NUTRIENTS AND CONTAMINANTS OF  
24 EMERGING CONCERN THROUGH A SYSTEM LIKE THIS. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
25 IN SUMMARY, THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE IS REALLY A REIMAGINING OF





JANUARY 19, 2024

1 WASTEWATER WHICH IS TYPICALLY SOMETHING PUMPED OUT IN THE BAY,  
2 TO THE OUTER COAST AND DISPOSED OF, AS A RESOURCE THAT CAN BE  
3 USED TO HELP ESTABLISH HABITAT MORE RAPIDLY AND IMPROVE WATER  
4 QUALITY IN THE PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. REIMAGINING WETLANDS AS A  
5 PLACE THAT PROVIDES MULTIPLE BENEFITS FOR BOTH PEOPLE AND  
6 NATURE ON THE SHORELINE. NEXT SLIDE. ADVANCING AT TWO SCALES  
7 FIRST IS OUR REGIONAL WORK WHERE WE DO TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER AND  
8 CONVENINGS BRINGING PARTNERS TOGETHER IN PARTICULAR TO ADDRESS  
9 BARRIERS TO IMPLEMENTATION FOCUSED ON FUNDING REGULATORY AND  
10 GOVERNANCE CHALLENGES WE SUPPORT FUNDING TO LOCAL COMMUNITIES  
11 THROUGH GRANT WRITING IN COORDINATION WITH FEDERAL PARTNERS.  
12 WE ADVANCE ON THE GROUND PROJECTS WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AND  
13 CBOS AND COMMUNITIES. AND I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT WHERE WE'RE  
14 DOING SOME OF THAT WORK. NEXT SLIDE. THIS MAP SHOWS SOME OF  
15 THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE LOCATIONS WHERE WE PARTNERS WITH  
16 WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANTS AROUND SAN FRANCISCO BAY. I WANT  
17 TO MENTION, IN ADDITION TO THIS, THAT WE HAVE SEVERAL  
18 OPERATIONAL LANDSCAPE UNIT OR SUBREGIONAL SCALE ADAPTATION  
19 EFFORTS WE HAVE GOING ON IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY, INCLUDING  
20 SAN LEANDRO OPERATIONAL LANDSCAPE UNIT PROCESS GOING FROM  
21 ALAMEDA UP TO SAN LEANDRO WILD CAT NORTH OF RICHMOND  
22 SURROUNDING AREAS AS WELL AS NOVATO BAYLANDS. CALTRANS WE  
23 RECENTLY HAD A MEETING SOME OF THE PARTNERS LOOKING AT  
24 STARTING AT BAY BRIDGE AND MOVING UP THE EMERYVILLE CRESCENT  
25 INTO EAST BAY LOU SO SPANNING THE WHOLE SHORELINE LOOKING AT



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 THE INTERSECTION OF BAY BRIDGE AND SEA LEVEL RISE  
2 VULNERABILITY AND WHERE WE CAN UTILIZE NATURE-BASED APPROACHES  
3 TO IMPROVE RESILIENCE OF THAT WHOLE SYSTEM THAT WAS THE  
4 IMPETUS OF CALTRANS ASKING AS FP TO CONVENE INITIATING  
5 DISCUSSION. SO, WE'RE EXCITED TO SEE WHERE THAT GOES. NEXT  
6 SLIDE. THE FIRST HORIZONTAL LEVEE WE BUILT WAS IN 2019. I WANT  
7 TO EMPHASIZE THIS IS A PROOF OF CONCEPT NOT DIRECTLY CONNECTED  
8 TO THE BAY. BUT A LIVING LABORATORY PLACE WHERE WE'RE STILL  
9 DOING MONITORING AND STUDYING. IT'S ALSO THE SITE YOU CAN  
10 VISIT ANY OF YOUR STAFF WANT TO DO A SITE VISIT WE WOULD BE  
11 HAPPY TO ARRANGE THAT. THIS WAS AT THE IMPETUS AT DAVID  
12 SEDLAK'S LAB AT UC BERKELEY AND A PARTNERSHIP WITH SAN  
13 FRANCISCO ESTUARY INSTITUTE AND Oro LOMA SANITARY DISTRICT  
14 USING SOME OF THE CREATIVE FUNDING TO BUILD THIS CONCEPT WE  
15 HAVE BEEN MONITORING EVER SINCE CURRENTLY STUDYING  
16 MICROPLASTICS AND PFAS FOREVER CHEMICALS. ANOTHER PROJECT,  
17 PALO ALTO HORIZONTAL LEVEE A PROJECT THAT'S BEGINNING  
18 CONSTRUCTION THIS YEAR AND THIS WILL BE THE FIRST TIME WE'RE  
19 SEEING HORIZONTAL LEVEE THAT'S RIGHT ON THE SHORELINE DIRECTLY  
20 DISCHARGING WASTEWATER RIGHT THROUGH THE WETLAND AND OUT INTO  
21 THE BAY. SO, IT'S A HUGE STEP FOR THE REGION. IMPLEMENTS  
22 SEVERAL OF OUR ESTUARY BLUEPRINT TASKS LIKE I SAID A HUGE STEP  
23 FOR HORIZONTAL LEVEES IT'S A SMALL PROJECT WHEN WE STARTED IT  
24 WE HONESTLY DIDN'T FINISH WE WOULD BE ABLE TO DESIGN AND  
25 PERMIT IT NOW WE HAVE ALMOST ALL OF YOU ARE OUR PERMITS IN



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 HAND AND AS I MENTIONED MANAGING CONSTRUCTION OF THIS PROJECT.  
2 WE STITCH TOGETHER A LOT OF FUNDING AND WERE CREATIVE IN OUR  
3 EFFORT WITH THE CITY OF PALO ALTO AND MANY PARTNERS SAVE THE  
4 BAY. NEXT SLIDE. FOCUSING ON THE HORIZONTAL LEVEES ENVISIONED,  
5 THIS AREA BIXBY PARK ACROSS THE STREET FROM WASTEWATER  
6 TREATMENT PLANT IN PALO ALTO, GOALS OF THIS PROJECT ARE TO  
7 IMPROVE HABITAT ALONG THE HARBOR MARSH PERIMETER OF MARSH  
8 ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE THERE'S AN EXTENSIVE COORDINATION WITH  
9 THE SAFER BAY SHORELINE STUDY ALIGNING WITH EXPECTING FLOOD  
10 PROTECTION THAT WILL BE PROVIDED IN THAT AREA MAINTAINING  
11 PUBLIC ACCESS EXISTING TRAIL SYSTEM ENSURING PERSPECTIVES OF  
12 MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES WE'RE DOING A LOT OF EDUCATION AND  
13 COMMUNITY-BASED MONITORING ALONGSIDE THIS PROJECT TO PROVIDE  
14 THIS POLISHING TREATMENT USING TREATED WASTEWATER. AS I  
15 MENTIONED AT THE BEGINNING OF MY PRESENTATION WE WORK IN FOUR  
16 CATEGORIES TO ADDRESS CHALLENGES TO IMPLEMENTATION THROUGH OUR  
17 CLIMATE RESILIENCE PROGRAM. FIRST IS REALLY PACE AND SCALE,  
18 REALLY UNDERSTANDING HOW CAN WE GET TO THE STALE THAT WE NEED  
19 IN ORDER TO ADVANCE OUR SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION NEEDS FOR  
20 THE REGION AND WHERE CAN NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS REALLY PLAY A  
21 CRUCIAL ROLE THERE. NEXT IS REGULATORY. I WAS ON A MEETING  
22 THIS MORNING WE WORK CLOSELY WITH OUR REGULATORY PARTNERS TO  
23 UNDERSTAND WHERE THERE IS PERMITTING BARRIERS, AND THERE ARE A  
24 LOT OF CHALLENGES IN THAT ARENA AND HOW WE CAN OVERCOME THEM  
25 COLLABORATIVELY. WE'RE DOING A LOT ON CONSCIENCE UNDERSTANDING



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 THESE SUBREGIONAL PROCESSES WHERE WE'RE WORKING ACROSS  
2 LANDOWNERS LOOKING AT DIFFERENT KINDS OF GOVERNANCE  
3 ARRANGEMENTS AND HOW THEY'RE DURABLE TO THIS KIND OF -- THIS  
4 LEVEL OF IMPLEMENTATION ON THE GROUND. AND, ALSO, WITH ALL OF  
5 THIS, ALSO KEEPING COMMUNITIES AND EQUITY AT THE HEART OF WHAT  
6 WE DO, AND REALLY, THAT COMMUNITY NEEDS REALLY DRIVING THESE  
7 PROCESSES. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.  
8 WONDERFUL TO PRESENT TO YOU ALL THIS MORNING. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU SO VERY MUCH. OPEN UP FOR  
11 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. YES, DIRECTOR ECKLUND.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** YOUR PRESENTATION IS EVEN BETTER TODAY THAN IT  
14 WAS YESTERDAY. [LAUGHTER] NO QUESTION ABOUT IT. AND YOU KNOW,  
15 FOR SOMEONE -- I HAVE TO HAVE A RIP REPLACEMENT. I'M IN A LOT  
16 OF PAIN, BUT I'M NOT FOCUSING ON THE PAIN. I'M FOCUSING ON  
17 THIS GREAT PROJECT. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. ONE IS  
18 PROBABLY A LITTLE -- I'M NOT SURE YOU HAVE HAD ANY THOUGHTS  
19 ABOUT THIS, BUT WHEN I WENT BACK TO DC, WE DID THAT POLICY ON  
20 REUSE OF MUNICIPAL SLUDGE. HAVE YOU THOUGHT OF THE POSSIBILITY  
21 OF REUSING MUNICIPAL SLUDGE ALONG WITH DREDGE MATERIAL FOR  
22 APPLICATION IN MARKED FOR IDENTIFICATION THESE AREAS? BECAUSE  
23 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT THE -- WHEN I WAS WORKING FOR EPA, EPA  
24 WAS PROMOTING REINJECTION, AND USE OF WASTEWATER TREATED  
25 WASTEWATER, WHETHER REINJECTING INTO THE GROUNDS OR REUSING



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 IT, AND FOR APPLICATION ON AG-LAND, ALONG WITH DREDGE MATERIAL  
2 IN AG-LAND SO THERE IS REUSE COMPONENT THERE. HAVE YOU HAD ANY  
3 DISCUSSION ABOUT POSSIBLY THINKING ABOUT COMBINING MUNICIPAL  
4 SLUDGE WITH DREDGE MATERIAL? SEE FIGURE THERE'S A WAY WE CAN  
5 USE BOTH. BECAUSE THOSE ARE TWO AREAS WHERE GOVERNMENTS AND  
6 COUNTIES, WASTEWATER TREATMENT FACILITIES ARE HAVING  
7 CHALLENGES NOT ONLY REUSE OF TREATED WATER BUT ALSO MUNICIPAL  
8 SLUDGE AND WHAT TO DO WITH IT? JUST A QUESTION.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. TO CLARIFY, BY MUNICIPAL SLUDGE  
11 DO YOU MEAN BIOSOLIDS?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES WE DEFINITELY HAVE LOOKED AT THAT AND WE HAVE  
16 BEEN WORKING WITH SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY SUBSTITUTE, I THINK  
17 THERE IS SOME CONCERN WITHIN BIO SOLIDS CONTAMINANTS. I'M ALL  
18 EARS PASSING SOME STUDIES ALONG TO THE RIGHT FOLKS TO HELP  
19 ADVANCE THAT BUT SOME SITES WHERE WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING IT  
20 DEFINITELY TRYING TO OVERCOME THAT QUESTION OF CONTAMINATION.

21

22 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE SOME DISCUSSION AT SOME  
23 POINT. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** DIRECTOR NOACK?



JANUARY 19, 2024

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** I HAVE NEVER HEARD OF HORIZONTAL LEVEES BEFORE BUT  
3 I LOVE THE CONCEPT OF COMING FROM THE EAST COAST THAT GETS HIT  
4 BY HURRICANES. HOPING WE CAN DO SOMETHING THERE. YOU CAN GIVE  
5 ME AN IDEA, I'M NOT THE FINANCE PERSON, AN IDEA OF THE COST  
6 BETWEEN TRADITIONAL LEVEE AND HORIZONTAL LEVEE, LOOKING AT OUR  
7 \$105 BILLION COST, I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT FOR US  
8 TO UNDERSTAND COST FACTORS OF ONE VERSUS THE OTHER.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. WE GOT THIS QUESTION YESTERDAY FROM THE  
11 EXECUTIVE BOARD. ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD.

12

13 **SUE NOACK:** I DIDN'T KNOW THAT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS A REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTION AND IT'S ON MY  
16 LIST OF STUDIES TO DO A COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF THE  
17 HORIZONTAL LEVEE NATURE-BASED SOLUTION COMPARED TO TRADITIONAL  
18 FLOOD PROTECTION. I DON'T HAVE A GOOD APPLES TO APPLES  
19 COMPARISON TO GIVE YOU BUT I KNOW THEY'RE EXPECTED TO BE AT  
20 LOWER COST THAN THE TRADITIONAL ENGINEERED APPROACH. AND I  
21 WOULD LOVE TO INVESTIGATE THAT FURTHER. SORRY.

22

23 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY WE'RE GOING TO GO NEXT TO  
24 SUPERVISOR GIOIA.

25



JANUARY 19, 2024

1   **JOHN GIOIA:** YEAH. I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION. I WANT TO  
2   HIGHLIGHT ON THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE, BECAUSE OUR OFFICE IS  
3   INVOLVED WITH THE NORTH RICHMOND PROJECT. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT  
4   WHAT IS REALLY UNIQUE ABOUT THE PROJECT ALONG THE NORTH  
5   RICHMOND SHORELINE IS THAT THE COMMUNITY WAS INVOLVED IN  
6   REALLY HELPING DEVELOP THAT RECOMMENDATION, WORKING WITH  
7   EXPERTS. IT CAME OUT OF THE RESILIENT BY DESIGN COMPETITION A  
8   FEW YEARS AGO SPONSORED BY BCDC. AND THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE,  
9   THIS NATURE-BASED SOLUTION, IT'S ALSO INVOLVING WETLAND  
10  RESTORATION. WHICH IS WHY IT'S GETTING SOME FUNDING FROM THE  
11  SAN FRANCISCO BAY RESTORATION AUTHORITY, AND IN PROVIDING  
12  COBENEFITS TO THE NEIGHBORING COMMUNITY OF NORTH RICHMOND. SO,  
13  IT'S -- AND I HOLD THAT UP AS A MODEL BECAUSE THE COMMUNITY  
14  HAS REALLY BEEN INTIMATELY INVOLVED WITH THIS PROJECT AS IT'S  
15  GONE ALONG. SO IT'S MORE OF THOSE PROJECTS WHERE WE ENGAGE AND  
16  INVOLVE COMMUNITY. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT. THANK YOU, JOSH  
17  FOR YOUR WORK FROM THE BEGINNING WORKING WITH US ON THIS. JOSH  
18  BRADT, SO LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING THAT PROJECT FUNDED.

19

20  **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR  
21  COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS? EITHER HERE IN THE BOARDROOM OR  
22  ON ZOOM? ANY QUESTIONS FROM ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM? IF SO  
23  PLEASE RAISE YOUR HANDS. ALLISON? YES?

24



JANUARY 19, 2024

1   **ALLISON BROOKS:** I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT, AND THANK YOU SO MUCH.  
2   THAT WAS A WONDERFUL PRESENTATION -- AS I HAVE BEEN LEARNING  
3   ABOUT NATURE-BASED STRATEGIES, AS WELL, JUST HOW THEY COULD BE  
4   USED FOR OTHER HAZARDS, NOT JUST FOR FLOODING AND SEA LEVEL  
5   RISE, BUT FOR HEAT AND HOW WE CAN CREATE MORE -- I KNOW IN NEW  
6   YORK CITY FOR EXAMPLE, THEY'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH AN EFFORT  
7   TO MAKE NEW YORK A SPONGE. SO, WHEREVER THEY CAN, CREATE  
8   PLACES WHERE, FOR WATER TO GO AND BE ABSORBED. AND THE SAME  
9   IDEA HERE AND HOW IT CAN BE APPLIED TO MORE THAN JUST SEA  
10   LEVEL RISE ISSUES, AS WELL.

11

12   **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES, BRAD?

13

14   **BRAD PAUL:** I WOULD URGE YOU TO TAKE SFEP UP ON THEIR OFFER TO  
15   GIVE YOU TOURS. I TOOK A TOUR BEFORE COVID OF THE Oro LOMA  
16   SITE, AND IT WAS VERY EYE OPENING. TO SUPERVISOR GIOIA'S POINT  
17   ABOUT CO-BENEFITS. WHEN YOU WALK OUT THERE AND YOU HEAR HOW  
18   IT'S SET UP, YOU SEE COBENEFITS AND ALL THE THINGS THAT IT'S  
19   DOING, AND YOU SEE HOW BEAUTIFUL IT IS AS A RECREATION AREA  
20   FOR PEOPLE TO WALK OUT WITH THEIR FAMILIES, THE WILDLIFE IT  
21   ATTRACTS. AND GOING BACK TO THE EARLIER CONVERSATION ABOUT  
22   BENEFICIAL REUSE OF DREDGE, I BELIEVE, IF I REMEMBER  
23   CORRECTLY, OVER THE FIRST TEN YEARS OR SO, THE LEVEE HEIGHT  
24   WENT UP TWO OR THREE FEET. AND IT'S FROM THE NATURAL TIDAL  
25   ACTION OF THE SILT IN THE WATER DROPPING OUT AS IT GETS CAUGHT





JANUARY 19, 2024

1 IN THE LEVEE. SO, ALL THESE DIFFERENT BENEFITS GOING ON SO  
2 THAT WHEN YOU TRY TO DO THE COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, YOU HAVE TO  
3 WEIGH ALL OF THAT IN. IT'S NOT LIKE YOU BUILD THIS AND THAT  
4 WALL THAT EVERYBODY HATES, BECAUSE IT'S UGLY, AND YOU HAVE TO  
5 REPLACE IT IN 10 OR 15 YEARS. IT'S A VERY DIFFERENT APPROACH  
6 THAT HAS ALL THESE OTHER BENEFITS. TO GO OUT THERE AND LOOK AT  
7 IT IN Oro LOMA IT'S A REALLY PRODUCTIVE USE OF OUR TIME.

8

9 **LARRY GOLDZBAND:** CAN I -- AND ONLY BECAUSE SUPERVISOR GIOIA IS  
10 BCDC COMMISSIONER, AND HAPPENS TO BE THE CHAIR OF LOCAL  
11 ELECTED TASK FORCE, WE TOOK THE LOCAL ELECTED TASK FORCE OUT  
12 TO NORTH RICHMOND AREA, AND IT'S A REALLY TREMENDOUSLY  
13 VISUALLY EFFECTIVE WAY TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE PROCESS WORKS.  
14 IT'S TRULY BUILDING A BETTER MOUSE TRAP IF YOU CAN FIGURE OUT  
15 THE RIGHT VENUE -- AND THAT'S REALLY VERY MUCH THE ISSUE --  
16 AND, SORT OF, JUST START OFF THE PROCESS.

17

18 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. I'LL ASK ARE THERE ANY OTHER  
19 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE  
20 PRESENTATION. SEEING NONE. CLEARLY, THIS IS ONE OF MANY  
21 SOLUTIONS WE NEED TO LIFT UP AS WE'RE TRYING TO ADAPT TO THIS  
22 RISING SEA LEVELS. AND REALLY GREAT TO SEE PROJECTS THAT ARE  
23 ALREADY UNDERWAY THAT ARE DEMONSTRATING THE IMPACT, AND I  
24 THINK WE CAN ALL AGREE THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE WANT TO  
25 SUPPORT MORE OF REGIONALLY. DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT OR



JANUARY 19, 2024

1 QUESTION? OKAY. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, THIS WAS AN INFORMATION  
2 ITEM. WE CAN PROCEED TO ITEM EIGHT, PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-  
3 AGENDA MATTERS. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH  
4 TO SPEAK ON ANY ITEMS NOT LISTED ON OUR AGENDA THIS MORNING  
5 EITHER IN-PERSON OR ON ZOOM? I DON'T SEE ANY IN-PERSON  
6 SPEAKERS OR HANDS RAISED FOR NON-AGENDA COMMENTS. WERE THERE  
7 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.

10

11 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** LAST ITEM, ADJOURNMENT. NEXT REGULAR  
12 MEETING OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD WILL BE FRIDAY MARCH 15TH,  
13 2024 AT 10:00 A.M. THIS MEETING IS NOW ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.

14 [ADJOURNED]

15



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*