

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 12TH, 2025, 9:45 AM**

V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY: OKAY. GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. ROLL CALL AND QUORUM. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING EL-TAWANSY IS
2 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE DO HAVE A QUORUM.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. OKAY. CONSENT CALENDAR,
13 INCLUDES ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2F. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT
14 WOULD LIKE TO PULL AN ITEM FROM CONSENT? IF NOT, DO I HAVE A
15 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** IS THERE A SECOND? OKAY. I'LL SECOND.

20 [LAUGHTER]

21

22 **SPEAKER:** SORRY.

23



1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** [LAUGHTER] MOVED AND SECONDED. ANY
2 COMMISSIONER COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO
6 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CERTAINLY. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

19

20 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

25



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. OKAY. SO, ITEM 3A, MTC
5 RESOLUTION 4688, FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026, MTC FUND ESTIMATE.
6 ANNUAL FUND ESTIMATE AND PROPOSED APPORTIONMENT AND
7 DISTRIBUTION OF APPROXIMATELY \$1 BILLION FOR FISCAL YEAR
8 2025/2026. TERENCE LEE WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM FOR COMMISSION
9 APPROVAL.

10

11 **TERENCE LEE:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS TERENCE LEE
12 WITH MTC STAFF I'LL BE PRESENTING Y3A IN YOUR PACKET THIS
13 MORNING THIS IS THE MTC FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026 FUND ESTIMATE
14 THROUGH MTC RESOLUTION 4688. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS MORNING
15 I'LL WALK THROUGH OVERVIEW OF KEY FUND SOURCES IN THE FUND
16 ESTIMATE. I'LL TOUCH ON SOME OF THE ECONOMIC INDICATORS THAT
17 ARE RELEVANT TO TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, AS WELL AS SPEAK TO A
18 FEW ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS FOR YOUR AWARENESS THAT ARE ALSO
19 RELEVANT TO THE FUND ESTIMATES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BY WAY OF
20 BACKGROUND, THE MTC FUND ESTIMATE IS A STATUTORY REQUIREMENT
21 OF MTC. IT IS A REVENUE FORECAST, AS WELL AS A DISTRIBUTION
22 FRAMEWORK FOR SEVERAL MAJOR TRANSPORTATION FUNDING SOURCES,
23 INCLUDING THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT OR TDA, STATE
24 TRANSIT ASSISTANCE, STA, AND ASSEMBLY BILL AB1107 FUNDS
25 COLLECTIVELY TOTAL APPROXIMATELY \$1 BILLION IN REVENUES FOR



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 TRANSPORTATION IN THE BAY AREA. TRANSIT OPERATORS COUNTY
2 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES AND MTC UTILIZE THE FUND ESTIMATE
3 FOR BUDGET DEVELOPMENT AND REQUEST ALLOCATION OF THESE FUNDS.
4 TYPICALLY ADOPTED IN FEBRUARY IN ADVANCE OF THE MARCH
5 STATUTORY DEADLINE AND TYPICALLY UPDATED TWICE A YEAR TO
6 REFLECT ACTUAL RECEIPTS AND UPDATED FORECAST AS THEY ARE
7 AVAILABLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, STARTING WITH TDA,
8 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACTS, THESE ARE REVENUES GENERATED
9 FROM A QUARTER CENT SALES TAX. IT IS A RETURN TO SOURCE FUND,
10 WHICH MEANS THAT REVENUES MUST BE SPENT IN THE COUNTY IN WHICH
11 THEY ARE GENERATED. THE COUNTY-WIDE FORECAST ARE PROVIDED AND
12 UPDATED BY THE COUNTY AUDITOR OFFICES AND MTC APPORTIONS
13 REVENUES BASED ON SERVICE AREA POPULATION OR BY COUNTY
14 SPECIFIC FORMULA. THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR FY 2024, 2025 THE
15 ESTIMATES HAVE BEEN REVISED FROM \$472 MILLION REPRESENTS 7%
16 DECREASE FROM THE ORIGINAL ESTIMATES FROM LAST FEBRUARY AND 3%
17 DECREASE FROM LAST YEAR'S ACTUAL RECEIPTS CHANGES VARY BY
18 COUNTY AND DETAILED IN ATTACHMENT A TO THE RESOLUTION UPCOMING
19 FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026 ESTIMATED THAT NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES
20 WILL GENERATE APPROXIMATELY \$485 MILLION -- TDA FUNDING OR
21 ABOUT 2.6 HIGHER THAN THE REVISED FY2025 ESTIMATES. THE IMAGE
22 ON THE RIGHT SHOWS HOW THIS BREAKS DOWN BY COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE.
23 STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE OR STA FORMAL PROGRAMS REPRESENT THE
24 NEXT LARGEST GROUP OF FUNDING IN THE MTC FUND ESTIMATE AND
25 CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS REVENUES PERFORMED IN RECENT YEARS



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 INCLUDE STATE TRANSIT SYSTEMS FUNDS STA'S STATE OF GOOD REPAIR
2 OR SER FUNDS AS WELL AS WELL. C TOP LOW CARBON TRANSIT
3 OPERATIONS PROGRAM REVENUES FOR EACH PROGRAM ARE GENERATED
4 STATEWIDE AND APPORTIONED THROUGH TWO FORMULA PROGRAMS FIRST
5 REVENUE BASED FORMULA APPORTIONS 50% STATEWIDE REVENUES TO
6 TRANSIT OPERATORS BASED ON SHARE OF QUALIFYING REVENUES
7 TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN BAY AREA TYPICALLY RECEIVE 54% OF THESE
8 FUNDS AND NOTES IN BOLD SECOND BULLET THERE HAS BEEN A FREEZE
9 TO THE FORMULA SINCE 2020 TO MITIGATE THE IMPACTS FROM THE
10 PANDEMIC BUT THIS FREEZE IS SET TO EXPIRE AT THE END OF FISCAL
11 YEE 2026 I'LL TOUCH ON THIS AGAIN OTHER HALF STATEWIDE FUND
12 ARE PORTIONED THROUGH POPULATION BASED FORMULA BAY AREA
13 REPRESENTS APPROXIMATELY 19% OF STATEWIDE POPULATION THUS
14 RECEIVES 19% FUND COLLECTIVELY STA FORMULA FUND ARE EXPECTED
15 TO GENERATE \$408 MILLION FOR THE BAY AREA FISCAL YEAR '25/'26.
16 NEXT SLIDE. LASTLY ON REVENUES SIDE AB1107 IS A HALF CENT
17 SALES TAX IN ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, AND SAN FRANCISCO
18 COUNTIES. BART RECEIVED 75% OF SALES TAX RECEIPTS AND MTC
19 ESTABLISHES FUNDING POLICY FOR REMAINING 25%. BY STATUTE ONLY
20 AC TRANSIT BART AND SFMTA ARE ELIGIBLE TO RECEIVE AB1107 FUNDS
21 HISTORICALLY THE COMMISSION POLICY HAS BEEN SPLIT 25% SHARED
22 EVENLY BETWEEN AC TRANSIT AND SFMTA. AND BASED ON SALES TAX
23 TRENDS ESTIMATED THAT REVENUES FOR FISCAL YEAR 2025 AND 2026
24 WILL BE \$104 MILLION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES KEY
25 FUND SOURCES MANY OF WHICH I DESCRIBED. HOWEVER, I WILL



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 HIGHLIGHT FOOTNOTES FOR CURRENT FISCAL YEAR '25 STA ESTIMATES.
2 THE FUND ESTIMATE TYPICALLY RELIES ON THE LATEST OFFICIAL
3 REPORTS FROM THE STATE CONTROLLER'S OFFICE WHICH FOR THE 25
4 ARE FROM AUGUST 2024 HOWEVER BASED ON REVENUE FORECAST FROM
5 THE GOVERNOR'S PROPOSED BUDGET RELEASED THIS PAST JANUARY LAST
6 MONTH, IT IS ANTICIPATED AT CURRENT YEAR '25 STA REVENUES WILL
7 DECREASE BY MERELY 13% NEXT SLIDE. RELEVANT TO TRANSPORTATION
8 FUNDING, THE BAY AREA POPULATION REPRESENTED BY THE BLUE BARS
9 ON THE CHARTS YOU SEE THAT AFTER NEARLY TWO DECADES OF
10 CONTINUOUS GROWTH, THE BAY AREA'S POPULATION STARTED TO
11 DECLINE IN 2021 AND HAS STABILIZED TO ABOUT 7.6 MILLION IN
12 2024. THE LINES ON THE GRAPH SHOWS THE RATE OF CHANGE. THE
13 DARK ORANGE FOR THE BAY AREA AND THE GREEN FOR THE CALIFORNIA
14 GROWTH RATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS CHART SHOWS THE
15 UNEMPLOYMENT RATE SINCE 2019 FOR THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES
16 REPRESENTED BY DOTTED LINES, AS WELL AS THE STATEWIDE RATE IN
17 THE SOLID ORANGE LINE AND THE NATIONAL RATE IN THE SOLID BLUE
18 LINE AFTER A SHARP SPIKE IN THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC. EIGHT
19 OF THE NINE COUNTIES OUT PERFORMED BOTH THE STATEWIDE NATIONAL
20 RATE IN 2022 HOWEVER 2024, THREE COUNTIES NOW HAVE
21 UNEMPLOYMENT RATES ABOVE THE NATIONAL RATES. UNEMPLOYMENT RATE
22 IS A FUNCTION OF THE LABOR FORCE WHICH IS COMPRISED OF
23 INDIVIDUALS LOOKING FOR WORK AND THIS IS REPRESENTED BY THE
24 ORANGE AREA IN THE CHART WITH THE TOTAL EMPLOYMENT REPRESENTED
25 BY THE BLUE AREA AND THE KEY TREND TO NOTE HERE IS THAT



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 NEITHER OF THE REGIONAL LABOR FORCE NOR THE REGIONAL
2 EMPLOYMENT LEVELS HAVE RECOVERED TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS TAKEN
3 TOGETHER THE DATA IN THE LAST FEW SLIDES TELL US THERE ARE
4 FEWER PEOPLE LIVING IN THE BAY AREA AND FEWER PEOPLE WORKING
5 HERE IN THE BAY AREA SINCE 2019 WHICH EXPLAINS IN PART SOME OF
6 THE TRENDS WE HAVE SEEN IN SALES TAX PERFORMANCE. NEXT SLIDE
7 PLEASE. BUT IN ADDITION TO THE RECENT PLATEAU IN SALES TAX
8 REVENUES, THE DOLLARS HAVE ALSO NOT KEPT UP WITH INFLATION.
9 THIS CHART SHOWS TDA RECEIPTS IN BOTH NOMINAL TERMS IN THE
10 ORANGE LINE AND INFLATION ADJUSTED TERMS IN THE DOTTED BLUE
11 LINE. AND YOU WILL SEE THAT COMPARED TO AN ALL-TIME HIGH IN
12 2000, REAL SALES TAX REVENUES HAVE ACTUALLY DECLINED 18%.
13 COMPARED TO A 20 YEAR AVERAGE SALES TAX REVENUES HAVE STAYED
14 FLAT DESPITE NEAR CONTINUOUS INCREASES IN NOMINAL TERMS. NEXT
15 SLIDE. LAST SLIDES WILL HIGHLIGHT IMPORTANT ISSUES AND
16 CONSIDERATIONS RELATED TO THE FUND ESTIMATE AND THE FIRST TIER
17 IS ABOUT THE BART FEEDER BUS PAYMENTS. THESE PAYMENTS WERE
18 ESTABLISHED IN 1997 TO TRANSFER FEEDER BUS OPERATIONS FROM
19 BART TO FOUR EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS. THESE INITIAL PAYMENTS
20 WERE SET BY THE AGREEMENTS AND HAS BEEN INDEXED TO GROWTH IN
21 AB1107 GROWING TO APPROXIMATELY \$9 MILLION. IN FISCAL YEAR
22 2021 BART COMMUNICATED AN INTEREST IN ESTABLISHING A PATH TO
23 BOTH REDUCE THE PAYMENTS AND TO ESTABLISH A NEW APPROACH FOR
24 HOW THEY ARE CALCULATED. THERE HAS NOT BEEN SIGNIFICANT
25 PROGRESS MADE ON ANY LONG-TERM CHANGE BUT OPERATORS HAVE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 AGREED TO A 25% REDUCTION TO THE PAYMENTS FOR THE LAST TWO
2 FISCAL YEARS. BART HAS INDICATED THAT FISCAL YEAR 2026
3 UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR WILL BE THE LAST YEAR IT WILL BE ABLE TO
4 CONTINUE THESE FEEDER BUS PAYMENTS. FUND ESTIMATE PROPOSES
5 CONTINUATION OF THE 25% REDUCTION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2026 WE WORK
6 WITH OPERATORS TO IDENTIFY A PATH FORWARD THAT CONSIDERS BOTH
7 SUCCESSFUL AND UNSUCCESSFUL 2026 BALLOT MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE
8 PLEASE. AND THIS LAST SLIDE HERE HIGHLIGHTS OTHER
9 CONSIDERATIONS, FIRST SAY PROPOSED ADJUSTMENT TO THE TDA
10 DISTRIBUTION FORMULA IN SONOMA COUNTY AS RECOMMENDED BY THE
11 MARIN SONOMA COORDINATED TRAIT SERVICE PLAN, OR MASCOTS, THIS
12 CHANGE WILL MIRROR THE CURRENT FORMULA IN MARIN WHERE FUND ARE
13 ALLOCATED USING PERFORMANCE BASED MODEL THAT TAKES INTO
14 ACCOUNT RIDERSHIP AND SERVICE HOURS SHIFTING APPROXIMATELY \$2
15 MILLION FROM GOLDEN GATE TO SMART BUS OPERATORS IN FISCAL
16 YEARLY '26. NEXT SLIDE IS THE STA REVENUE BASED FORMULA FREEZE
17 WHICH I TOUCHED ON EARLIER, FREEZE SET TO EXPIRE AT END OF
18 THIS 2026 AND HIGHLIGHTING OPPORTUNITIES TO ADVOCATE FOR
19 CONTINUATION OF THE FREEZE WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE POTENTIAL
20 RISK IMPACTS TO STA REVENUES TO BAY AREA OPERATORS IF THE
21 PROVISION WERE TO EXPIRE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF SALES TAX
22 AND FEE ADMINISTRATOR CDTFA HAS BEEN CONDUCTING AUDITS RELATED
23 TO THE ATTRIBUTION OF SALES TAXES THESE AUDITS HAVE RESULTED
24 IN NEGATIVE CORRECTIONS RECENTLY AND WE EXPECT ONGOING
25 VOLATILITY LIKELY IN THE NEAR FUTURE ALL THINGS TAKEN INTO



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 CONSIDERATION. LAST SLIDE, PLEASE. CONCLUDES THE PRESENTATION.
2 THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS TO REFER MTC
3 RESOLUTION 4688 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR
6 COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, PLEASE.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** ON THE BART FEEDER BUS AGREEMENT, 9 MILLION
11 THERE'S BEEN 25% REDUCTION WHAT IS THAT 99 CURRENTLY?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** IT'S 9 MILLION BEFORE ADJUSTMENT SO WITH THE 25%
14 REDUCTION IT WILL BE CLOSER TO SIX AND A HALF, SEVEN.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** AND THAT'S JUST FOR THIS YEAR?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYONE ELSE? SO, WITH THIS INFORMATION,
23 IS IT GOOD NEWS OR BAD NEWS? [LAUGHTER]

24

25 **SPEAKER:** IT'S NEWS. [LAUGHTER]



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I THINK THERE IS -- EXCUSE ME, THERESA
3 ROMMEL, MTC. I THINK IT'S A MIXTURE OF GOOD NEWS AND BAD NEWS.
4 I THINK THE BAD NEWS IS STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE REVENUES ARE
5 DECLINING A BIT, HOWEVER, THE GOOD NEWS IS THAT WE'RE STILL
6 OKAY. WE'RE NOT SUFFERING ANY MAJOR VALLEYS RIGHT NOW IN OUR
7 SALES TAX REVENUES. SO, THAT'S THE SILVER LINING.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** SO, WE'RE LUCKY ENOUGH TO HAVE A BUNCH OF BIG
12 EVENTS COMING TO THE AREA. WHEN IT COMES TO SALES TAX, IS
13 ANYBODY ANTICIPATING WHAT THOSE BOOSTS WILL BE? AND DO THEY
14 REFLECT OUR REGION? OR DO THEY JUST GO STATEWIDE? HOW DOES
15 THAT HAPPEN HERE? WITH THE NBA, WHAT'S GOING ON RIGHT NOW?

16

17 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK YOU'RE REFERRING TO THE ALL-STAR
18 EVENT, REFERRING TO THE ALL-STAR EVENT AND WE HAVE FIFA AND
19 SUPERBOWL. I DON'T THINK WE HAVE INFORMATION ON THAT WE COULD
20 CERTAINLY WORK WITH HDL WHO DOES SOME WORK WITH US AND JUST
21 SEE IF THEY HAVE ANY INFORMATION OR PROJECTIONS BUT I THINK AT
22 THIS TIME WE HAVEN'T DONE FORECAST ON THAT HOW THAT MIGHT
23 AFFECT THE REGION.

24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK OUR ONLY HOPE IS FORECASTING AT THIS
2 POINT. [LAUGHTER]. THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND
5 TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4688 FISCAL YEAR
6 2025/'26 MTC FUND ESTIMATE TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** SO MOVED, FLEMING.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** SECOND BY PAPAN. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
13 COMMENT?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE NO ONE IN THE
16 BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** TAKE THE ROLL?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

25



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
12 PRESENT.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. WE'LL MOVE TO
15 AGENDA ITEM 3B. MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4689, ADOPTION OF THE
16 FISCAL YEAR 2024, 2025 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM, PIP.
17 ADOPTION OF PIP, WHICH INCORPORATES SENATE BILL 125 REGIONAL
18 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES AND UPDATE ON OPERATOR PROGRESS. I
19 WOULD LIKE TO ASK THERESA ROMMEL, MTC FUNDING POLICY AND
20 PROGRAMS TO MAKE INTRODUCTORY REMARKS BEFORE TURN IT OVER TO
21 RALEIGH McCOY WHO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM FOR COMMISSION
22 APPROVAL.

23

24 **THERESA ROMMEL:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. THERESA ROMMEL.

25 BEFORE RALEIGH BEGINS HER PRESENTATION, I WANT TO ALERT THE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 COMMITTEE MEMBERS THAT HER PRESENTATION WILL ADDRESS SEVERAL
2 QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED BY THE COMMISSION THE LAST
3 TIME THE SUBJECT OF THIS ITEM WAS BROUGHT FORWARD AT THE
4 NOVEMBER PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS STAFF PRESENTED UPDATE ON
5 THE STATUTES OF SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES AND
6 RECEIVED APPROVAL OF THE \$300 MILLION IN REGIONAL -- IN
7 REGIONAL FUNDING FRAMEWORK WHICH COMPLEMENTS THE STATE'S
8 EMERGENCY OPERATIONS ASSISTANCE. AT THAT MEETING COMMISSIONERS
9 REQUESTED UPDATE ON SPECIFIC ITEMS, EFFORTS SUCH AS
10 INTEROPERATOR TRANSIT SCHEDULES AND NEW BART FARE GATES FOR
11 PASSENGERS WITH DISABILITIES DURING ELEVATOR OUTAGES AND OTHER
12 TEMPORARY OCCURRENCES AND IMPACT ON FUNDING AVAILABILITY FOR
13 COUNTY AND EXPLANATION OF HOW FISCAL CLIFF FUND ARE GOING TO
14 BE SPENT. TODAY'S PRESENTATION SPEAKS TO THOSE TOPICS AND ALSO
15 PROVIDES UPDATE ON THE STATUTES OF THE SB125 REGIONAL
16 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES FOR THE LARGE FIVE OPERATORS RECEIVING
17 SB125 FUNDS. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO RALEIGH TO DELIVER
18 THE PRESENTATION.

19

20 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE INTRODUCTORY REMARKS. GOOD
21 MORNING COMMISSIONERS. RALEIGH MCCOY MTC STAFF AS NOTED
22 TODAY'S ITEM REQUESTS APPROVAL OF THE PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT
23 PROGRAM, PIP FOR SHORT AND PROVIDES SOME OF THOSE
24 INFORMATIONAL UPDATES THAT THERESE FORESHADOWED. PIP IS TO
25 IDENTIFY OPPORTUNITIES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO IMPROVE COST



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 EFFECTIVENESS AND TRACK OPERATOR PROGRESS PIP IN LINE WITH
2 STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH OUR STATE TRANSIT
3 OPERATING FUNDING SOURCES LAST YEAR THE COMMISSION ADOPTED
4 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM TO INCLUDE SB125 REGIONAL
5 ACCOUNTABILITY AND RECOMMENDATIONS IS TO CONTINUE THAT
6 APPROACH FOR THIS UPCOMING YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. BY WAY OF RECAP,
7 SB125 IS A STATE FUNDING SOURCE THAT WILL PROVIDE \$1.2 BILLION
8 IN FUNDING FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL
9 ENHANCEMENTS OVER A FIVE-YEAR PERIOD. THE MTC REGION HAS
10 ADDITIONALLY IDENTIFIED A CONTRIBUTION OF 300 MILLION IN
11 REGIONAL FUND THAT WILL COMPLEMENT THAT STATE OPERATING
12 ASSISTANCE. TOGETHER THESE FUNDS SUPPORT CONTINUED SERVICE
13 PROVISION FUNDING VITAL NEEDS SUCH AS OPERATOR SALARIES,
14 CLEANLINESS EFFORTS AT STATIONS PUBLIC SAFETY INITIATIVES AND
15 ROUTINE ASSET MAINTENANCE. IN THE SB125 FUNDS ARE NOT USED TO
16 FUND OPERATOR'S CAPITAL COMMITMENTS AND THAT'S IMPORTANT TO
17 US. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE PROVIDES A RECAP OF THE
18 CURRENT STATUTES OF OUR SB125 FUNDS, SOME NEAR-TERM MILESTONES
19 AND FUTURE DECISIONS ASSOCIATED WITH SB125. TO DATE MTC HAS
20 RECEIVED 535 MILLION FROM THE STATE AND ALLOCATED 161 MILLION
21 IN OPERATING ASSISTANCE. ADDITIONALLY AS REFERENCED THE
22 COMMISSION IN NOVEMBER APPROVED THE \$300 MILLION REGIONAL
23 FUNDING FRAMEWORK WE'RE NOW IN THE PROCESS OF IMPLEMENTING
24 THAT FRAMEWORK. LOOKING TO NEAR-TERM MILESTONES MTC HAS
25 APPLIED FOR THE SECOND TRANCHE OF SB125 FUNDS WHICH ARE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 EXPECTED TO ARRIVE IN THE SPRING. MTC WILL THEN ALLOCATE 375
2 MILLION IN OPERATING ASSISTANCE FOR THE UPCOMING YEAR.
3 SIMULTANEOUSLY REGIONAL FUNDS ARE PRONGING THROUGH THE FEDERAL
4 APPROVAL PROCESS WHICH IS ANTICIPATED TO CONCLUDE IN FALL OF
5 THIS YEAR. NOW TURNING TO OUR LATER TERM DECISIONS THE
6 COMMISSION WILL MAKE PROGRAMMING DECISIONS ON THE 90 MILLION
7 CONTRIBUTION OF STP CMAQ FUND THAT ARE PART OF THAT \$300
8 MILLION FUNDING FRAMEWORK AS PART OF THE OBAG FOUR FRAMEWORK
9 DEVELOPMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO NOW SHIFTING GEARS TO FOCUS ON THE
10 SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES THAT ARE INCORPORATED
11 INTO THE PIP, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES THOSE REGIONAL
12 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES WHICH WERE ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION
13 IN HEAT 2023. FOR ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS WITH A SHORTFALL THIS
14 INCLUDES REQUIREMENTS TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL INITIATIVES,
15 PARTICIPATE IN SCHEDULE COORDINATION EFFORTS AND ADHERE TO
16 BEST PRACTICES FOR GTFS DATA. ADDITIONALLY THE COMMISSION
17 IDENTIFIED SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS FOR INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS SUCH
18 AS ADVANCEMENT OF AMBASSADOR AND CRISIS PREVENTION PROGRAMS,
19 EFFORTS TO CURTAIL FARE EVASION AND SERVICE OPTIMIZATION
20 PLANNING EFFORTS. AND WITHIN THE PIP OPERATORS THAT DO NOT
21 HAVE A SHORTFALL ARE ASSIGNED THAT FIRST MEASURE OF
22 PARTICIPATION IN REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES AS THEIR PIP
23 PROJECT FOR THE UPCOMING YEAR. THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY THE
24 FOLLOWING SLIDE WILL PROVIDE A SUMMARY OF THE STATUTES OF THE
25 SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES FOR EACH OF THE FIVE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 OPERATORS. THERE IS MORE DETAIL, INCLUDING VERY DETAILED COLOR
2 CODED TABLES WITHIN YOUR PACKETS AS WELL. FOR EACH
3 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE STAFF HAS ASSESSED OPERATOR'S CURRENT
4 PROGRESS AND ASSIGNED 1 OF 3 DETERMINATIONS. THE GREEN
5 MAINTAIN CURRENT PERFORMANCE INDICATING THAT THE OPERATOR HAS
6 FULFILLED THEIR ACCOUNTABILITY REQUIREMENTS AND SHOULD
7 MAINTAIN THEIR CURRENT STANDARD OF THE PERFORMANCE. YELLOW
8 PROGRESS WITH SATISFACTORILY PROGRESS MADE INDICATING OPERATOR
9 IS ON THE RIGHT TRACK TOWARD FULFILLING ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE
10 THOUGH OUTCOME IS STILL PENDING AND FINALLY RED IN PROGRESS
11 WITH UNSATISFACTORY PROGRESS MADE INDICATING OPERATOR SHOULD
12 ACCELERATE PERFORMANCE IN ORDER TO REMAIN ELIGIBLE FOR SB125
13 FUNDS. TURNING TO AC TRANSIT SPECIFIC PERFORMANCE WE SEE THE
14 OPERATOR IS CURRENTLY IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE INITIATIVE WITH
15 THE MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL INITIATIVES AND HAS
16 MADE SATISFACTORY PROGRESS TOWARD REMAINING ACCOUNTABILITY
17 MEASURES AND ONE INTERESTING AREA TO HIGHLIGHT FOR YOU ALL IS
18 THE RECENT ADOPTION OF THE AC TRANSIT REALIGN PLAN WHICH IS A
19 SERVICE PLANNING INITIATIVE GUIDING EVOLUTION OF AC TRANSIT
20 SERVICE IN RESPONSE TO CHANGING DEMAND PATTERNS LOOKING AHEAD
21 STAFF ENCOURAGE AC TRANSIT TO PRIORITIZE ADOPTING COMMON
22 REGIONAL OPERATOR SIGN UP SCHEDULE IN THEIR UPCOMING 2025
23 LABOR NEGOTIATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. TURNING TO BART CURRENTLY IN
24 COMPLIANCE WITH THE MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL
25 INITIATIVES AND MAKING SATISFACTORY PROGRESS TOWARD REMAINING



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 AND ALSO IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE AMBASSADOR PROGRAM INITIATIVE
2 WITH THE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. INTERESTING AREA TO
3 HIGHLIGHT FOR YOU MAPPING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVEMENTS AT EL
4 CERRITO DEL NORTE BART STATION WE SEE THE IMAGE HERE ON THE
5 SLIDE THESE PROJECT COLEAD BY MTC WILL MAKE A NUMBER OF
6 CUSTOMER FOCUSED MAPPING AND WAYFINDING IMPROVEMENTS AT THE
7 EAST BAY HUB PREPARATION FOR THE NEXT PROGRESS UPDATE STAFF
8 WILL BE MONITORING BART'S PROGRESS TOWARDS INSTALLATION OF
9 FARE GATES WE CAN ALSO ANNOUNCE ON TOPIC NEW FARE GATES HAVE
10 BEEN INSTALLED AT 15 BART STATIONS WITH MORE EXPECTED TO COME
11 ONLINE EACH MONTH STAFF LOOK FORWARD TO RECEIVING CONTINUED
12 UPDATES ON THAT EFFORT. NEXT SLIDE. CALTRAIN WE SEE IS
13 CURRENTLY IN COMPLIANCE WITH THE REGIONAL INITIATIVES AND
14 MAKING SATISFACTORY PROGRESS ON REMAINING AREAS. HIGHLIGHT FOR
15 CALTRAIN WILL BE COVERED IN THE NEXT TWO SLIDES WHERE WE'RE
16 SUMMARIZING ONGOING COORDINATION ACTIVITIES THAT BART AND
17 CALTRAIN ARE PARTICIPATING IN LOOKING AHEAD NEXT FEW MONTHS
18 STAFF ENCOURAGE BOTH BART AND CALTRAIN TO CONTINUE
19 COORDINATION EFFORTS TO IMPROVE SHARED TRANSFER EXPERIENCES AT
20 SHARED HUBS: NEXT SLIDE. SO THERE ARE FOUR AREAS OF
21 COORDINATION I'M GOING TO HIGHLIGHT FOR YOU ALL ACROSS THE
22 UPCOMING TWO SLIDES. SO, FIRST, BART STAFF SERVE ON THE
23 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM FOR THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROGRAM
24 AND BOTH AGENCIES, BART AND CALTRAIN, ARE ACTIVE PARTICIPANTS
25 IN THAT EFFORT. STAFF FROM BOTH AGENCIES ARE CURRENTLY



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 COLLABORATING TO HARMONIZE WAYFINDING SIGNAGE FOR THEIR JOINT
2 STATION AT MILLBRAE. SECOND, IN AREA OF FARES, BOTH AGENCIES
3 ARE PARTICIPATING IN EFFORTS TO STREAMLINE FARES. THE FARE
4 PAYMENT PROCESS, INCLUDING PARTICIPATION IN THE CLIPPER BAY
5 PASS INSTITUTIONAL PASS AND THE CLIPPER START MEANS BASED
6 DISCOUNT. LOOKING AHEAD, CONCURRENT WITH THE LAUNCH OF NEXGEN
7 CLIPPER, THE FREE AND DISCOUNTED TRANSFERS PILOT, WHICH IS AN
8 INITIATIVE OF MTC WILL REDUCE COST FOR USERS TRANSFERRING
9 BETWEEN SYSTEMS AND IS ANTICIPATED TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. AND
10 THIRD, BOTH AGENCIES ARE WORKING TO PROACTIVELY ENSURE
11 ACCESSIBILITY OF THEIR SERVICES FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES
12 IN THE EVENT OF OCCURRENCES SUCH AS ELEVATOR OUTAGES. SO WHEN
13 AN ELEVATOR OUTAGE OCCURS BOTH AGENCIES HAVE DETAILED
14 PROTOCOLS TO ACCOMMODATE PASSENGERS THAT REQUIRE ELEVATOR
15 ACCESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, FINALLY, WE HAVE A FEW UPDATES
16 FOR YOU ON THE AREA OF SCHEDULE COORDINATION. BUT FIRST IT'S
17 IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT BOTH BART AND CALTRAIN DO HAVE
18 SEVERAL CHALLENGES THAT THEY MUST ACCOMMODATE WHEN
19 COORDINATING THEIR RESPECTIVE SCHEDULES. FOR ONE, THE TWO
20 SYSTEMS DO OPERATE WITH DIFFERENT FREQUENCIES. OF THE BART
21 OPERATES A 15-MINUTE HEADWAY SERVICE ON THE PENINSULA -- SORRY
22 -- EXCUSE ME. BART OPERATES A 20 MINUTE HEADWAY ON THE PENS
23 LAY CALTRAIN RUNNING SERVICE AT EITHER 15 OR 30 MINUTE
24 INTERVALS DEPENDING ON TIME OF DAY THERE IS TIMING MISMATCH
25 THERE FINALLY SYSTEMS HAVE MULTIPLE TIME TRANSFER POINTS



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THROUGHOUT THE SYSTEM THEY NEED TO CONSIDER OTHER UPSTREAM
2 COMPLEXITIES RELATED THROUGHPUT AND SPACING THAT LIMIT ROOM
3 FOR ADJUSTMENT CHALLENGES THE OPERATORS HAVE DEPLOYED SEVERAL
4 TACTICS TO IMPROVE TRANSFER TIMING AND EXPERIENCE THAT
5 INCLUDES ADVANCED MEETINGS AHEAD OF SCHEDULE CHANGE AND PUBLIC
6 INFORMATION EFFORTS SUCH AS THIS SHARED TRANSFER TIME TABLE
7 YOU SEE ON THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE OF YOUR SLIDE POSTED ON BOTH
8 AGENCIES WEB SITE. FURTHER MOVEMENTS WOULD REQUIRE INCREASES
9 IN FREQUENCY A SOLUTION THAT IS NOT FEASIBLE GIVEN PRESENT
10 OPERATING DEFICITS. NEXT SLIDE. RETURNING TO OUR COLOR CODED
11 TABLES PROGRESS FOR GOLDEN GATE CURRENTLY IN FULL COMPLIANCE
12 WITH THAT MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL INITIATIVES AND
13 HAS MADE SATISFACTORY PROGRESS TOWARD REMAINING ACCOUNTABILITY
14 MEASURES. IN THIS UPDATE RECEIVED AN ESTIMATE FROM GOLDEN GATE
15 ON WORK ON THE MASCOT INITIATIVE WHICH IS A JOINT EFFORT
16 BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL TRANSIT AGENCIES AND MTC SEEKING TO
17 IMPROVE TRANSIT SERVICE AROUND THE U.S. 101 CORRIDOR AND
18 LOOKING FORWARD STAFF ANTICIPATE CONTINUED PROGRESS ON THE
19 MASCOT'S INITIATIVE AND CONTINUED PARTNERSHIP ON THE REGIONAL
20 INITIATIVES SUCH AS THE INSTALLATION OF MAPPING AND WAYFINDING
21 SIGNAGE AT AREAS TRANSIT SERVICE AREAS. FINAL OPERATOR SFMTA
22 CURRENTLY IN FULL COMPLIANCE WITH THE MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE
23 IN THE REGIONAL INITIATIVES, REMAINING ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE
24 HIGHLIGHT FOR YOU ALL SFMTA'S WORK ON FARE ENFORCEMENT AND
25 EDUCATION SFMTA HAS BUDGETED FOR 36 NEW FARE INSPECTORS AND



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 SYSTEMS IS CURRENTLY FILLED 16 OF THOSE POSITIONS FROM OUR
2 LAST UPDATE FROM SFMTA AND HIRING WILL CONTINUE UNTIL ALL
3 VACANCIES ARE FILLED MONITORING EFFECTIVENESS AND IMPACTS OF
4 THE INITIATIVE LOOKING AHEAD STAFF ANTICIPATE RECEIVING
5 INFORMATION ON IMPACTS AND INVESTMENTS IN FARE COLLECTION AND
6 LESSONS LEARNED. NEXT SLIDE. FINAL SLIDE TODAY IS RECOMMENDED
7 ACTION TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4689 THE PRODUCTIVITY
8 IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM TO THE COMMISSION FOR ADOPTION OF NEXT
9 STEPS. SB125 PROGRAM OPERATORS WILL AGAIN REPORT ON THE
10 STATUTES OF ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES WHEN THEY REQUEST
11 ALLOCATION OF FISCAL YEAR 2026 FUNDS WITH MOST OPERATORS
12 SUBMITTING THIS REQUEST IN THE SUMMER OPERATOR PROGRESS WILL
13 INCLUDE BE INCLUDED IN THE PACKET AS THEY ARE RECEIVED AND
14 STAFF WILL RETURN WITH ANOTHER UPDATE FOR THIS COMMITTEE IN
15 FALL OF 2025. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
16 QUESTIONS

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. THERE HAS BEEN A
21 LOT OF WORK DONE ON THE FARE SCHEDULE COORDINATION. IF YOU
22 HAVE ANY DETAILS, I MEAN, WE ARE FOCUSING ON ACCOUNTABILITY
23 HERE. IF WE COULD GET MORE DETAILS ON THE SFO CONNECTIONS,
24 THIS, ONCE AGAIN, 43,000 PEOPLE WORK THERE, AND WE'RE HOPING
25 VACATIONERS, UNTIL THAT IMPROVES SOMEWHERE DOWN THE LINE. SO



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. ON YOUR ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES, YOU
2 TALK ABOUT THE PROGRAM AMBASSADORS WE ALWAYS TALK ABOUT REGION
3 NAMELY AND THAT IS NOT A REGIONAL OPERATION. SO I WOULD LIKE
4 TO BE CLEAR ON THAT. AND, ALSO, THE CURTAILING FARE EVASIONS.
5 SO IF YOU COULD BE A LITTLE CLEAR ON THAT AS FAR AS BART GOES
6 BECAUSE AGAIN WE REFER TO THIS AS A REGIONAL SYSTEM, AND AS
7 FAR AS I KNOW THAT IS NOT REGIONALLY IMPLEMENTED. SO
8 ACCOUNTABILITY IS BIG FOR EVERYONE. ESPECIALLY AS WE TALK
9 ABOUT FUNDING IN THE FUTURE. IF WE COULD GET SOME
10 CLARIFICATION ON THAT, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. YOU TALK ABOUT
11 ACCESSIBILITY. THIS IS SLIDE EIGHT. I GET -- AND I DON'T KNOW
12 IF WE TRACK -- BART IS VERY GOOD ABOUT SENDING OUT MESSAGES,
13 AS TO WHEN ELEVATORS ARE DOWN. BUT I THINK WE SHOULD GET SOME,
14 SORT OF, A SUMMARY ON THAT. CALTRAIN NEVER GOT A ONE ON THAT,
15 MAYBE I'M NOT SIGNED UP HERE. BUT WE NEED TO KNOW AS FAR AS
16 ACCESSIBILITY GOES, HOW OFTEN THESE THINGS ARE HAPPENING, WHEN
17 THEY'RE HAPPENING, AND WHERE THEY'RE HAPPENING. BECAUSE IT'S
18 REALLY VERY DIFFICULT FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES TO GET
19 AROUND. I MEAN, I GET SO MANY NOTIFICATIONS AS TO WHEN THEY'RE
20 DOWN, IT'S ALMOST DAILY. SO, IF WE COULD GET THE OPERATORS TO
21 SHARE THAT INFORMATION, MORE SO, THAT WOULD BE GOOD. AGAIN,
22 GREATLY APPRECIATE, PARTICULARLY WITH BART, THAT THEIR
23 ANNOUNCEMENTS ARE OUT THERE, AND YOU GET THAT, AND THEN THEY
24 TELL YOU WHEN IT'S BACK UP. THIS'S GOOD. NO SUCH THING FROM
25 CALTRAIN. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT OTHERS IT'S HELPFUL BUT WE NEED



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 TO KNOW HOW OFTEN THIS IS HAPPENING. BECAUSE AGAIN WE'RE
2 LOOKING AT POSSIBLY SOME, SORT OF, PUBLIC FUNDING ONE WAY OR
3 ANOTHER HERE. AND THE BIGGEST SALES POINT TO PEOPLE IN THE
4 COMMUNITY ARE GOING TO BE ACCOUNTABILITY AND IMPROVEMENTS. SO
5 THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. WAYFINDING. I DON'T KNOW HOW LONG WE
6 HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THIS. [LAUGHTER] THE BLUE RIBBON
7 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE CAME OUT WITH A WHOLE BUNCH OF
8 RECOMMENDATIONS, AND I THINK WE'RE GOING ON YEAR SIX. DO WE
9 HAVE A COMPLETION DATE? OR HOW QUICKLY CAN -- I KNOW WE HAVE
10 HAD PILOT PROGRAMS. WE NEED TO GET THIS MOVING. CAN WE GET AN
11 UPDATE ON WHEN -- AND I GET IT, MONEY IS INVOLVED. [LAUGHTER]
12 I UNDERSTAND THAT. BUT IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO, I THINK,
13 EVERYONE, THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. AND I APPRECIATE YOU
14 FINALLY GETTING -- OR THEY'RE FINALLY GETTING TO THE LARGEST
15 INTERMODAL CENTER WEST OF THE MISSISSIPPI THIS'S GOING TO BE
16 HELPFUL BUT EVERYWHERE ELSE TOO, CROSS OVER. PUTTING IT DOWN
17 HERE IS THE COORDINATION EFFORTS IT'S APPRECIATED BUT WHEN IS
18 THIS GOING TO HAPPEN? THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYBODY ELSE? RESPOND?

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF
23 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. ON YOUR LAST POINT COMMISSIONER
24 PAPAN JUST ABOUT MORE DETAILS SCHEDULE REPORT ON MAPPING AND
25 WAYFINDING WORK. I THINK THIS IS MAYBE ONE OF THE DRAWBACKS OF



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THE WEDNESDAY AND FRIDAY DAYS BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN MAKING
2 PRETTY DETAILED PRESENTATIONS TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK
3 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. SO WE WILL CERTAINLY -- WE CAN SHARE
4 THAT WITH THIS COMMITTEE JUST SO YOU HAVE THE DATES. IT'S ALL
5 SYSTEMS GO. EVERYONE IS WORKING HARD. I THINK WE HAVE
6 EXPLAINED IT, IT TAKES A WHILE TO ROLL OUT THE MAPPING AND
7 WAYFINDING. BUT THE FACT THAT WE HAVE ONE PILOT INSTALLED, THE
8 NEXT ONE, NEXT WEEK UP IN SANTA ROSA, WILL BE DEPLOYED, AND
9 THEN WE'RE DOING BROADER PILOTS, I THINK, IN THE NEXT YEAR BUT
10 ANYWAYS WE HAVE THE DETAILS SCHEDULED SO WE CAN GET THAT TO
11 THIS COMMITTEE.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. ANYONE ELSE? DO WE HAVE A
14 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION
15 4689, ADOPTION OF FISCAL YEAR '24/'25 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT
16 PROGRAM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** I WILL MOVE APPROVAL BUT CAN WE ALSO INCLUDE THE
19 TRACKING OF THE -- THE ACCOMMODATIONS OR ADA INFORMATION?
20 WOULD THAT BE POSSIBLE? BECAUSE WE ARE TALKING ABOUT
21 ACCOUNTABILITY?

22

23 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL, I CAN CERTAINLY COMMIT TO
24 WORKING WITH THE OPERATORS TO SEE IF THEY ARE TRACKING
25 ACCESSIBILITY CONCERNS I'M NOT SURE IF THAT NEEDS TO PART OF



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THE MOTION BUT WE CAN CERTAINLY COMMITMENT TO BART ASK
2 CALTRAIN ON THAT ISSUE.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD BE HAPPY WITH THAT AT THIS POINT IN TIME.
5 IN THE FUTURE, LET'S TRY TO PLAN BIGGER HERE FOR SHOWING
6 ACCOUNTABILITY. THANK YOU. SO MOVED, CHAIR.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOVED BY PAPAN. IS THERE A SECOND? OKAY.
9 I'LL SECOND.

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** SECOND.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. FLEMING SECONDS. THANK YOU. DO WE
14 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE, NO ONE IN THE
17 BOARDROOM, AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHTY. TAKE THE ROLL?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CERTAINLY. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
13 PRESENT.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. OKAY, NOW MOVING TO ITEM 4A.
16 MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4633 REVISED. AND 4639 REVISED;
17 ADOPTION OF THE 2025 REGIONAL ACTIVITY ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
18 PROGRAM, CYCLE SEVEN PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND ADOPTION OF THE
19 REGIONAL MEASURES THREE SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND BAY TRAILS
20 PROGRAM SR2TBT CYCLE ONE PROJECTS. ANNUAL FUND ESTIMATE AND
21 PROPOSED APPORTIONMENT AND DISTRIBUTION OF APPROXIMATELY 1
22 BILLION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026, KARL ANDERSEN WILL PRESENT
23 THIS ITEM FOR COMMISSION APPROVAL.

24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **KARL ANDERSON:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR MILEY. GOOD MORNING. I'M
2 KARL ANDERSEN WITH MTC FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF THIS
3 ITEM IS ADOPTION OF THE PROGRAM PROJECTS FOR TWO MTC
4 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING PROGRAMS 2025 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION --
5 SORRY 2025 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM ALSO KNOWN
6 AS ATP CYCLE SEVEN AND ADOPTION OF THE FIRST CYCLE OF THE
7 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT BAY TRAIL
8 PROGRAM ATP CYCLE SEVEN FOLLOWED BY SAVER ROUTES OF TRANSIT IN
9 BAY TRAIL. NEXT SLIDE. THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IS A
10 STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM ESTABLISHED IN 2013 WITH THE
11 GOAL OF PROMOTING ACTIVE FORMS OF WALKING AND BIKING DIVIDED
12 INTO A STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM REGIONAL COMPETITIVE
13 PROGRAMS FOR TEN LARGEST MPOS IN THE STATE AND COMPETITIVE
14 PROGRAM FOR SMALL OPEN AND RURAL COMMUNITIES 100 MILLION
15 AVAILABLE ANNUALLY STATEWIDE AND THE PROGRAM IS ADOPTED EVERY
16 TWO YEARS RECENTLY THE PROGRAM HAS RECEIVED A FEW NOTABLE
17 AUGMENTATIONS NOTABLY IN 2023 THE STATE BUDGET ADDED ONE TIME
18 \$1 BILLION AUGMENTATION FOR ATP CYCLE SIX CONVERSELY IN 2025,
19 STATE BUDGET WALK BACK OF SOME FUNDING IN THE FORM OF \$400.01
20 TIME REDUCTION RESULTING IN SMALLER PROGRAM FOR THE STATE AND
21 MTC AT 89,000,014 MILLION RESPECTIVELY. THE ATP REMAINS A RILE
22 COMPETITIVE AND OVERSUBSCRIBED GRANT PROGRAM WHICH EXACERBATED
23 THIS CYCLE OF THE SMALLER FUNDING POT AVAILABLE. STATE
24 RECEIVED 277 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING OR 2.5 BILLION IN FUNDING
25 AVERAGE REQUEST FOR THIS CYCLE INCREASED TO 9 MILLION UP FROM



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 CYCLE SIX WHICH WAS 7 MILLION. AFTER STATEWIDE COMPETITIVE ATP
2 LIST OF PROJECTS ON DECEMBER 5TH, 2024 UNFORTUNATELY CTC DID
3 NOT SELECT PROJECTS IN MTC REGION FOR FUNDING. MTC REGIONAL
4 PROGRAM REGIONAL PROGRAM GUIDELINES ON MARCH 27th 2024
5 APPLICATIONS FOR REGIONAL PROGRAM WERE DUE JUNE 17TH LAST YEAR
6 CTC, ATP AND PARTNER HIS STAFF RECOMMEND REVISITING THE
7 PROGRAM GUIDELINES TO INCLUDE AWARD LIMITS SINCE APPLICATIONS
8 WERE DUE BEFORE THE GOVERNOR SIGNED THE 2025 STATE BUDGET
9 STAFF RECEIVED 35 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING \$324 MILLION FOR THE
10 MTC REGIONAL PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. NEW FOR ATP CYCLE SEVEN MTC
11 USED STATE PROVIDED SCORES AS BASELINE FOR EVALUATING
12 APPLICATIONS STAFF SCORED REGIONAL SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATIONS
13 AND RANK UNDERSTAND APPLICATIONS AT MAXIMUM OF 110 POINTS
14 STAFF RECOMMENDS FULLY FUNDING FOUR PROJECTS AND PARTIALLY
15 FUNDING ONE PROJECT FOR TOTAL 14.4 MILLION RANKED CONTINGENCY
16 LIST 135.5 MILLION INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT ONE OF THE MEMO.
17 PROPOSED CONTINGENCY LIST IS LARGER THAN THE PREVIOUS ATP
18 CYCLES TO ACCOMMODATE POTENTIAL FUNDING RESTORATION OR
19 AUGMENTATIONS IN RESPONSE TO THE 2025 STATE BUDGET RECISSION.
20 ALL PROPOSED PROJECTS IN THE ATP BENEFIT PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
21 EXCEEDING RETIRE 25 STATE TARGET FOR DISADVANTAGED
22 COMMUNITIES. FURTHER AMENDED PROJECT LIST FOR MTC INITIATIVES
23 SUCH AS EXPANDING THE REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK.
24 I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT ITEMS RELATED TO ATP
25 RECOMMENDATIONS. FIRST, FOR HIGH SCORE PROJECTS THAT DID NOT



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 RECEIVE A FUNDING RECOMMENDATION. THE RECOMMENDED PROJECT LIST
2 DOES NOT INCLUDE FUNDING FOR THE 4TH AND 5TH HIGHEST SCORING
3 PROJECTS, WHICH ARE OAKLAND'S 73rd AVENUE PROJECT AND NAPA
4 COUNTY'S VINE TRAIL AND YOUNTVILLE TO ST. HELENA SEGMENT. BOT
5 PROJECTS REQUESTED SIGNIFICANTLY MORE FUND AND WERE AVAILABLE
6 AFTER FUNDING HIGHER SCORING PROJECTS. AWARDING REMAINING
7 PROGRAM FUNDS WOULD HAVE HEFT EITHER PROJECT WITH A \$20
8 MILLION OR MORE FUNDING GAP IN EITHER FUNDING PLAN. THEREFORE
9 STAFF RECOMMENDS FUNDING PROJECTS FOR THE LIST PROJECTS ARE
10 LISTED IN THE CONTINGENCY LIST IF NO ADDITIONAL FUNDING
11 BECOMES AVAILABLE STAFF WILL ADVOCATE FOR MINIMAL TO NO
12 CHANGES TO THE ATP CYCLE EIGHT STATE GUIDELINES TO HELP ENSURE
13 THESE PROJECTS CAN REMAIN COMPETITIVE SHOULD THEY NEED TO
14 REAPPLY. SECOND. THE CITY OF ALAMEDA REQUESTED 6.6 MILLION IN
15 ATP FUNDS FOR THE WILLIE STARGELL AVENUE SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS
16 PROJECT. HOWEVER ONLY 673,080 FUNDS REMAINED AFTER FUNDING
17 HIGHER SCORING PROJECTS. ALAMEDA SUBMITTED THE SAME PROJECT
18 APPLICATION FOR THE SAME REQUEST AMOUNT AS PART OF THE
19 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL
20 PROGRAM. THE WILLIE STARGELL AVENUE SAFETY IMPROVEMENT PROJECT
21 SCORED HIGHLY IN THE SAFE ROUTES TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL PROGRAM
22 EVALUATION PROCESS AND RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING IN THE SAFE
23 ROUTES TRANSIT BAY TRAIL PROGRAM. THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDS
24 PARTIALLY FUNDING THE PROJECT WITH 673,000 IN ATP FUNDS. DO I
25 HAVE ONE MORE SLIDE? THIS CONCLUDES THE ATP HALF OF THE ITEMS



1 PRESENTATION. I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU, VICE CHAIR MILEY IF
2 YOU WOULD LIKE TO CONSIDER QUESTIONS NOW IN THE ATP BEFORE I
3 PRESENT THE REGIONAL MEASURE THREE SAFE ROUTES OF TRANSIT
4 METRO PROGRAM. OR I CAN MOVE TO TAKE QUESTIONS BEFORE BOTH
5 PROGRAMS AT THE END.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YEAH. LET'S CONTINUE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SOUND GOOD. SECOND PART OF ITEM 4A ADOPTION OF
10 PROJECTS FOR THE FIRST CYCLE OF THE REGIONAL MEASURE THREE
11 SAFE ROUTES OF TRANSIT BAY TRAIL PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. REGIONAL
12 MEASURE THREE PROVIDES 150 MILLION TO PROJECT NUMBER FOUR TO
13 FUND COMPETITIVE GRANT PROGRAM FOR BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN
14 ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS IN THE VICINITY OF STATE OWNED TOLL BRIDGE
15 CORRIDORS CONNECTING RAIL TRANSIT STATIONS AND FERRY
16 TERMINALS. MTC IS LISTED AS A PROJECT SPONSOR AND IS
17 RESPONSIBLE FOR ADMINISTERING COMPETITIVE GRANT PROGRAMS FOR
18 THESE FUNDS. FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF BEGAN DEVELOPING
19 THE PROGRAM STRUCTURE IN 2023 AND ENGAGED WITH INTERNAL AND
20 EXTERNAL PARTNERS THROUGH SPRING OF 2024 TO DEVELOP PROGRAM
21 GUIDELINES. THE PROGRAM GUIDELINES FUNDAMENTALLY REFLECTING
22 SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT PROGRAM DEVELOPED UNDER REGIONAL
23 MEASURE TWO WITH ADDED EMPHASIS ON BAY TRAIL PROJECTS TO
24 REFLECT PROGRAMS INTENT UNDER RM3. SPECIFIC TO THIS PROGRAM
25 THE GUIDELINES'S APPLICATION AND EVALUATION CRITERIA



1 PRIORITIZED TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECTS THAT ENHANCE SAFETY AND
2 ADVANCE MULTIPLE PROGRAM GOALS, INCLUDING SUPPORTING THE BAY
3 TRAIL NETWORK AND GAP CLOSURE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, IMPROVING
4 ACCESS TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, REDUCING CONGESTION IN STATE-
5 OWNED TOLL BRIDGES. THREE PROGRAM PRIORITIES WERE WEIGHTED
6 EQUALLY TO SELECT PROJECTS THAT COULD ACHIEVE THE GREATEST
7 CUMULATIVE IMPACT ACROSS THESE PRIORITIES MAXIMIZING
8 EFFECTIVENESS OF THE AVAILABLE FUNDING. ON JUNE 26TH OF LAST
9 YEAR, MTC ADOPTED THE PROGRAM GUIDELINES FOR THE FIRST CYCLE
10 WHICH INCLUDES 75 MILLION FOR THE BAY TRAIL, FOR THE SAFE
11 ROUTES AND TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL PROGRAM. STAFF RELEASED THE
12 CALL FOR PROJECTS IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING ADOPTION OF THESE
13 GUIDELINES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THE FIRST CYCLE, STAFF
14 RECEIVED 51 APPLICATIONS REQUESTING 315 MILLION IN SAFE ROUTES
15 TO TRANSIT IN BAY TRAIL PROGRAM FUNDS. THE AVERAGE REQUEST
16 SIZE CAME IN AT ABOUT 6.1 MILLION. 36 APPLICATIONS CATEGORIZE
17 THEIR PROJECT AS TRANSFORMATIVE AND IN TOTAL STAFF RECEIVED 45
18 INFRASTRUCTURE APPLICATIONS, FIVE APPLICATIONS FOR PLANS, AND
19 ONE APPLICATION FOR QUICK BUILD STYLE PROJECT. MTC FUNDING
20 POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF ASSEMBLED AN 11-MEMBER EVALUATION
21 COMMITTEE AND DIVIDED THE TEAM INTO TWO REVIEW TEAMS THAT
22 REVIEWED HALF OF THE APPLICATIONS RECEIVED. ATTACHMENT THREE
23 TO THIS MEMO IS A LIST OF NUMBER OF EVALUATORS AND THEIR
24 AGENCY AFFILIATION. STAFF ASSURED THERE WERE NO CONFLICTS OF
25 INTEREST IN THE EVALUATOR REVIEW AND APPLICATIONS. THE REVIEW



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 COMMITTEE SCORED APPLICATIONS AGAINST THE ESTABLISHED
2 APPLICATION CRITERIA FROM THE PROGRAM GUIDELINES FOR MAXIMUM
3 SCORE OF 100 POINTS. NEXT SLIDE. USING CONSENSUS SCORE STAFF
4 FROM THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE RECOMMENDS FULLY FUNDING SIX
5 PROJECTS AND PARTIALLY FUNDING ONE PROJECT FOR TOTAL OF \$75
6 MILLION 100% OF THE FUNDING PROPOSED WILL BENEFIT MTC EQUITY
7 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND SUPPORTS PROJECTS ON THE MTC ACTIVE
8 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. FIVE OF THE SEVEN PROJECTS ARE ON OR
9 CONNECT TO THE BAY TRAIL AND ONE RECOMMENDED PLAN WILL SUPPORT
10 FUTURE CONNECTIONS TO THE BAY TRAIL NETWORK. STAFF ALSO
11 RECOMMENDS ADOPTING A LIST OF CONTINGENCY PROJECTS TOTALING 31
12 MILLION. THESE PROJECTS ARE ALL DETAILED ON THE SECOND PAGE OF
13 ATTACHMENT ONE. BEFORE MOVING ON TO THE NEXT PART OF THE
14 PRESENTATION THERE ARE TWO ITEMS OF INTEREST THAT I WOULD LIKE
15 TO HIGHLIGHT. FIRST A PARTIAL AWARD. AS MENTIONED IN THE ATP
16 PORTION OF THE PRESENTATION, THE CITY OF ALAMEDA SUBMITTED THE
17 SAME PROJECT APPLICATION FOR THE SAME REQUEST AMOUNT AS PART
18 OF THE CONCURRENT REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION CYCLE SEVEN
19 PROGRAM. ALAMEDA REQUESTED \$6.6 MILLION IN SAFE ROUTES TO
20 TRANSIT BAY TRAIL FUNDS FOR THE WILLIE STARGELL AVENUE SAFETY
21 IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT. HOWEVER, 4.9 MILLION OF SAFE ROUTES TO
22 TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL FUNDS REMAIN AFTER FUNDING HIGHER
23 SCORING PRIORITIES. THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDS PARTIALLY
24 FUNDING THE PROJECT WITH 4.9 MILLION IN SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT
25 BAY TRAIL FUNDS. BETWEEN THE TWO PROGRAMS, STAFF IS



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 RECOMMENDING A TOTAL AWARD OF 5.5 MILLION FOR THE PROJECT,
2 ABOUT 1 MILLION SHORT OF THE 6.6 MILLION ALAMEDA REQUESTED.
3 MTC STAFF EXPECTS THE FULL PROJECT BENEFITS TO BE DELIVERED AS
4 THE FUNDING PLAN WILL BE NEARLY COMPLETE BETWEEN THE
5 RECOMMENDED FUNDING AND REGIONAL ATP SAFE ROUTES TRANSIT AND
6 BAY TRAIL PROGRAMS. STAFF PROPOSES THE CITY PROVIDE AN UPDATED
7 FUNDING PLAN AND LETTER TO MTC BY MAY 1ST OF THIS YEAR
8 EXPLAINING HOW THE PROJECT BENEFITS LISTED IN THE APPLICANTS
9 WILL BE DELIVERED. SHOULD ALAMEDA NOT BE ABLE TO DELIVER THE
10 PROJECT BENEFITS OR FULLY FUND THE PROJECT USING OTHER FUNDS,
11 STAFF RECOMMENDS REMOVING THE STARGELL PROJECT FROM BOTH
12 PROGRAMS AND REDIRECTING AWARD TO OTHER PROJECTS ON THE
13 CONTINGENCY LIST. AND NEXT, A CONDITIONAL AWARD. THE STAFF
14 RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDE CONDITIONAL AWARD FOR 23.8 MILLION FOR
15 MULTI-MODAL BASED SKYWAY PROJECTS SUPPORTING SAN FRANCISCO AND
16 ALAMEDA COUNTIES. STAFF RECOMMENDS CONTINUING THE AWARD ON THE
17 PROJECT TEAM SECURING REMAINING FUNDING IN THE CURRENT ROUND
18 OF STATE SENATE BILL ONE SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDORS
19 PROGRAM OR PRESENTING MTC STAFF WITH DELIVERABLE SEGMENT THAT
20 MAINTAINS THE BENEFITS THAT WERE DESCRIBED IN THE APPLICATION.
21 SHOULD EITHER CONDITION NOT BE MET, STAFF WILL RETURN TO THE
22 COMMISSION TO REVISE RECOMMENDATIONS TO AWARD FUNDS TO
23 PROJECTS FURTHER DOWN THE CONTINGENCY LIST. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT I
24 WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT TWO PROJECTS INCLUDED IN THE
25 PROGRAMMING PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS. FIRST ON THE LEFT SIDE OF



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 YOUR SCREEN, THE EAST BAY GREENWAY MULTI-MODAL PHASE ONE
2 PROJECT. THIS WILL CREATE A REGIONAL ALL-AGES AND ABILITY
3 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN FACILITY THAT ARE SAFE AND COMFORTABLE
4 FOR USERS OF ANY AGE OR EXPERIENCE LEVEL THROUGH THE HEAVILY
5 URBANIZED AREAS OF THE EAST BAY AND IT RUNS PARALLEL TO THE
6 BART NETWORK AND IT CONNECTS FIVE BART STATIONS STRETCHING
7 FROM LAKE MERRITT TO BAY FAIR. NEXT ON THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE OF
8 THE SCREEN, THE CANAL NEIGHBORHOOD BELLAM GATEWAY LOCAL ACCESS
9 IMPROVEMENT PROJECT WOULD IMPLEMENT A FULLY SEPARATED SHARE
10 USE PATH ALONG BELL BOULEVARD FROM PLAYA DEL REY TO KERNER
11 DRIVE AND ALONG BELL BOULEVARD AND 580 ANDERSEN DRIVE SOUTH
12 ANDERSEN JACOB STREET CONNECTING NORTH SOUTH GREENWAY AND
13 BEYOND DOWNTOWN SAN RAFAEL LARKSPUR. STAFF IS PRESENTING ITEMS
14 TOGETHER ENHANCING ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION SAFETY AND
15 IMPROVEMENT ACCESS THROUGHOUT THE REGION BECAUSE THERE IS
16 PROJECT DELIVERY OVERLAP WE WANTED TO ENSURE THAT INVESTMENTS
17 OF BOTH PROGRAMS WERE COORDINATED. THROUGHOUT THE EVALUATION
18 PERIOD THERE WERE 12 APPLICATIONS THAT APPLY TO BOTH REGIONAL
19 ATP AND SAFE ROUTES OF TRANSIT IN BAY TRAIL PROGRAMS THE
20 PROGRAM TEAMS ENSURED THAT THE RECOMMENDATIONS DID NOT
21 CONFLICT OR SUPPLY OTHER COMMITTED FUND AND STAFF RECOMMENDS
22 PARTIALLY FUNDING FROM BOTH PROGRAMS THE ONE PROJECT FROM THE
23 CITY OF ALAMEDA. NEXT SLIDE. IN CONCLUSION STAFF RECOMMENDS
24 REFERRING MTC RESOLUTION 4633 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR
25 APPROVAL AND DIRECTING STAFF TO SUBMIT MTC'S REGIONAL ATP



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 CYCLE SEVEN PROGRAM TO THE CTC AND STAFF ALSO RECOMMENDS
2 REFERRING MTC RESOLUTION 4639 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR
3 APPROVAL. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER
4 ANY QUESTIONS

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONERS QUESTIONS?
7 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** SO LITTLE MONEY [LAUGHTER] -- SO MUCH NEED. THANK
10 YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I GREATLY APPRECIATE IT HERE. I
11 THINK, BECAUSE WE HAVE TO FUND SO FEW PROJECTS, REALLY MAKING
12 SURE THEY REACH FRUITION AND RESULTS IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT SO
13 THAT WE CAN SHOW, MOVING FORWARD HERE, THINGS CAN GET DONE.
14 SO, I HOPE -- AND YOU HAVE SUCH A LONG CONTINGENCY LIST,
15 KEEPING THOSE CONTINGENCY PEOPLE REALLY UP TO SPEED -- I MEAN,
16 I DON'T -- YOU HAVE FUNDED HERE SOME REALLY WONDERFUL
17 PROJECTS. THERE IS NO DOUBT ABOUT THAT. ONE THING I WOULD LIKE
18 TO POINT OUT THOUGH, THIS IS SUPPOSED TO BE REGIONAL, FROM THE
19 REGIONAL MONEY, REGIONAL FUNDS HERE. AS I SAID, CURRENT
20 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE WONDERFUL, BUT I AM CONCERNED THEY DON'T
21 REFLECT THE REGION. THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, IN ONE PART AND NOT
22 OTHERS, ARE THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE PAYMENT FROM BRIDGE TOLLS,
23 THE FUNDS MOVING FORWARD TO MOBILITY AND MOVING PEOPLE AROUND
24 HERE. I WANT US TO TAKE A LOOK AT THE PROJECT EVALUATORS FOR
25 SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT. THEY INCLUDE REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVES



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 BUT THEY DON'T INCLUDE A REGIONAL REPRESENTATIVE FROM
2 CALTRAIN. AND CALTRAIN COVERS THREE DIFFERENT COUNTIES. WE ARE
3 HEAVY ON MTC STAFF, OUT OF THE 11. SEVEN REPRESENTATIVES
4 THERE. I THINK WE NEED TO REALLY TAKE A LOOK AT, SHOULD MONEY
5 FALL FROM THE SKY [LAUGHTER] -- AGAIN, WE NEED TO STRESS MORE
6 REGIONAL ASPECTS AS TO HOW THIS MONEY IS DISTRIBUTED. SO, I
7 HOPE EACH AND EVERY PROJECT IS SUCCESSFUL, MOVING FORWARD, AND
8 WE CAN SEE THE RESULTS FROM THIS. BUT I DO THINK WE NEED TO
9 LOOK AT HOW WE SHAPE THESE PROJECT EVALUATORS SO THAT WE ARE
10 CONSIDERING THE REGION AND EQUAL REPRESENTATION MOVING
11 FORWARD. THANK YOU.

12

13 **KARL ANDERSON:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYONE ELSE? OKAY.

16

17 **PAT BURT:** THANK YOU. I WOULD JUST LIKE TO FOLLOW DIRECTOR
18 PAPAN'S COMMENTS AND TO EMPHASIZE THAT CALTRAIN NOW HAS A
19 STATION ACCESS PROGRAM THAT IS REALLY EXPANDING THE FOCUS ON
20 HOW TO GET PEOPLE TO AND FROM TRANSIT WITH A STRONG FOCUS ON
21 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION. AND SO REALLY LOOKING AT HOW WE
22 FACILITATE TRANSIT THROUGH THESE PROGRAMS, ARE NOT ONLY
23 THROUGH STANDALONE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS, BUT HOW
24 THEY INTERSECT WITH TRANSIT FACILITATION. AND WE HAVE, YOU
25 KNOW, A VARIETY OF PHYSICAL PROGRAMS, AND THEN OPERATIONAL



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 ONES, AND IN PALO ALTO, WE HAVE OUR OWN TMA THAT IS PROVIDING
2 BICYCLES TO LOW-INCOME WORKERS IN ADDITION TO TRANSIT PASSES
3 FOR ALL THOSE WORKERS. AND THE CONCEPT IS THAT WE REALLY,
4 PERHAPS, NEED TO THINK ABOUT UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES, NOT ONLY
5 WHERE THEY RESIDE, BUT WHERE THEY WORK. AND GETTING THEM TO
6 AND FROM THEIR JOBS. AND THAT'S ALL A NETWORK TO SERVE THOSE
7 COMMUNITIES. THOSE WORKERS AND THOSE RESIDENTS NEEDS FOR
8 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION DON'T END AT THEIR CITY EDGES. AND SO
9 THAT'S MY ADDED THOUGHT. THANK YOU.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** RESPONSE?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** SURE. AT LEAST IN THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM,
14 ONE OF THE KEY EMPHASIS ELEMENTS OF THE SCORING CRITERIA IS
15 WHETHER OR NOT THE PROJECT SERVES A DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY.
16 AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S UNIQUE IS THAT THERE IS A VARIETY
17 OF WAYS IN WHICH YOU CAN DEFINE YOUR DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY
18 AND ONE WHICH WE HAVE SEEN PROJECT SPONSORS START TO TAKE
19 TRANSIT DATA, TRACK EMPLOYMENT CENTERS FOR SPECIFIC
20 DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS AND PORTRAY THE CASE HOW A PROJECT
21 MAY NOT NECESSARILY BE PHYSICALLY IN A GEOGRAPHIC AREA THAT IS
22 DISADVANTAGED BUT IS SERVING A POPULATION THAT NEEDS THIS TYPE
23 OF PROJECT FOR ACCESS.

24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** DID YOU HAVE ANY RESPONSE TO THE
2 COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS?

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL, I CAN SAY THAT FOR THE NEXT
5 CYCLE WE CAN CERTAINLY EVALUATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE
6 REPRESENTATION FROM CALTRAIN OR REGIONAL OPERATORS BESIDES THE
7 ONES THAT ARE ALREADY ON THERE ON THE EVALUATION PANEL.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? I HAVE A FEW.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I'LL JUST ADD THAT THESE ARE PROJECTS IN AREAS THAT
14 REALLY NEED THEM AND I DON'T KNOW IF THE EQUITY PRIORITY
15 DISTRICT OR AREA THAT I REPRESENT APPLIED FOR ANY PROJECTS BUT
16 IT DOES STRIKE ME THE GEOGRAPHIC CLUSTERING OF THESE I'M
17 DEFINITELY A REGIONALIST I DON'T HAVE ANY PROBLEM WITH THEM
18 JUST HOPE THAT IF MY JURISDICTION DID APPLY FOR ONE THAT WAS
19 UNSUCCESSFUL I HOPE THAT THERE IS A LOT OF COMMUNICATION ABOUT
20 HOW WE CAN BE COMPETITIVE IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. IF THERE'S NO ONE ELSE, I HAVE A
23 FEW THINGS. I HAVE BEEN ON THE COMMISSION MAYBE THREE YEARS OR
24 SOMETHING LIKE THAT. SO, I'M NOT SURE I HAVE SEEN THIS REPORT
25 BEFORE. BUT DEFINITELY A STRONG PROPONENT OF ACTIVE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 TRANSPORTATION AND SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT. I APOLOGIZE TO THE
2 COMMISSION THAT A LOT OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTY IS GETTING --
3 [LAUGHTER] I HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT. I HAD NOTHING TO DO
4 WITH IT. BUT WE'LL TAKE IT. SO, WITH THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
5 PROGRAM, WHAT TYPE OF PROJECTS CAN BE FUNDED? JUST A GENERAL
6 QUESTION.

7

8 **KARL ANDERSON:** NOT THE MOST GENERAL LEVEL. IT'S ANY SORT OF
9 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FOCUS PROJECT THAT IS SHOWING AN EXPRESS
10 NEED TO IMPROVE A SAFETY BENEFIT AND THAT WOULD JUST INCREASE
11 THE POTENTIAL MODE SHIFT FOR MORE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION USERS.
12 THERE IS A WIDE RANGE OF ELIGIBLE PROJECT COMPONENTS THAT THE
13 CTC AND CALTRANS WORK WITH THE PROJECT SPONSORS TO HELP
14 DISCERN WHAT IS GOING TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM. AND IT'S
15 KIND OF A LOOSE PROCESS, AS A PROJECT IS BEING DEVELOPED AND
16 BEING DELIVERED WITH CALTRANS. SO THERE ISN'T A SUPER STRICT
17 ELIGIBILITY LIST OF SAYING, HEY, YOUR PROJECT HAS TO HAVE THIS
18 COMPONENT OR HAS TO HAVE THIS ELEMENT. BUT AS LONG AS THE
19 SCOPE AT THE END OF THE DAY IS PROMOTING MORE ACTIVE
20 TRANSPORTATION AND IMPROVING SAFETY THEN IT'S LIKELY ELIGIBLE.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION IS BIKE AND
23 WALKING?

24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **KARL ANDERSON:** BIKING, WALKING, MOBILITY, THOSE TYPES OF
2 ELEMENTS.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. HOW LONG IS THIS ACTIVE
5 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM BEEN AROUND?

6

7 **KARL ANDERSON:** SINCE 2013. IN 2013 THE STATE INTRODUCED
8 LEGISLATION THAT CONSOLIDATED A FEW DIFFERENT FUNDING SOURCES
9 FOR TARGETED ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING PROGRAM.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** IF WE SEE THIS FUNDING FOR THIS LEVEL
12 OFF -- YOU NOTICED IT WAS DIMINISHED THIS YEAR OR PAST YEAR.

13

14 **KARL ANDERSON:** AFTER THE ADOPTION IN 2017 SENATE BILL ONE
15 ADDED AN INFUSION OF 100 MILLION A YEAR SO THE POTS OF MONEY
16 AT THAT TIME WERE PRETTY STRONG SO ON PREVIOUS CYCLES REGIONAL
17 CYCLES WERE ARRANGING BETWEEN 40 AND 50 MILLION AND THEN IN
18 2023 THERE WAS A BIG INFLUX OR AUGMENTATION OF FUNDS WHICH
19 ALLOWED FOR US TO FUND PROJECTS TWO YEAR AGO BUT THEN RESPONSE
20 TO THAT ONE TIME AUGMENTATION BUDGET SHORTFALLS AT THE STATE
21 LEVEL STATE CALLED BACK SOME OF THAT SEEING SMALL BUCKET OF
22 FUNDS AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL IDEALLY WE KIND OF GO BACK TO
23 NORMAL IN THE NEXT ATP CYCLE OF UNCERTAINTIES THAT WE CAN'T
24 REALLY FOCUS ON AT THIS POINT.

25



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** REALLY THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM
2 IS POPULAR, 77 APPLICATION AND WE GOT 35 APPLICATIONS.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES 35 FOR OUR REGIONAL PROGRAM AND THERE WAS 277
5 ACROSS THE STATE FOR THE STATEWIDE COMPONENT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THEY CAN ONLY FUND SO MANY -- AND WE CAN
8 ONLY FUND SO MANY?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY SO JUST CURIOUS ABOUT HOW THE
13 PROGRAM'S HISTORY, DO WE HAVE A SENSE OF THE PROGRAM SINCE
14 BEEN IN PLACE BENEFITS DERIVED?

15

16 **KARL ANDERSON:** ONE OF THE ELEMENTS OF THE PROGRAM IS QUARTERLY
17 REPORTING AND TRACKING AND POST PROJECT DELIVER REPORTS AND
18 COUNT THAT ARE DONE AND MANAGED BY THE STATE SO ANY PROJECT
19 THAT RECEIVES ANY, SORT OF, ATP FUNDS WHETHER STATE OR
20 REGIONAL FUNDS THEY'RE SUBJECT TO REPORTING REQUIREMENTS AT
21 THE STATE AND THE STATE CONSOLIDATES ALL DATA AND RESOURCES
22 AND STARTS TO REPORT BACK. I THINK THE INITIAL REPORT THAT WAS
23 PRESENTED TO THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WAS
24 PROBABLY 3 TO 4 YEARS AGO ONCE THE CYCLE ONE PROJECT WAS
25 ACTUALLY STARTING TO BE CONSTRUCTED AND STARTING TO SEE



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 OUTCOMES. I CAN DIG UP ONE OF THOSE REPORTS AND SHARE IT WITH
2 YOU, BUT I CAN'T NECESSARILY CATEGORIZE THE IMPACT OF THE
3 ENTIRE STATE RIGHT OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** WHAT ABOUT HERE IN OUR REGION.

6

7 **KARL ANDERSON:** IN OUR REGION WE DON'T NECESSARILY DO ANY
8 PROJECT TRACKING IMPACT REPORTS FOR THE PROJECTS IN OUR REGION
9 BECAUSE THAT WORK CAN DONE AT THE STATE BUT THAT IS
10 INFORMATION AND DATA I COULD GET FROM THE CALIFORNIA
11 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND CALTRANS AND SHARE WITH THE
12 COMMITTEE IF NEEDED.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** WHEN WOULD YOU BE REPORTING TO THE
15 COMMITTEE AGAIN ON THIS?

16

17 **KARL ANDERSON:** ON THIS, THERE ISN'T A PLAN TO COME BACK TO THE
18 COMMITTEE UNLESS ARE THERE ANY CHANGES TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS
19 ON THE CONTINGENCY LIST. SO, THE NEXT TIME WE WOULD BE TALKING
20 ABOUT THIS ITEM WOULD BE IN ABOUT A YEAR AND A HALF WHEN WE'RE
21 DEVELOPING THE GUIDELINES FOR ATP CYCLE EIGHT.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** BECAUSE I DON'T HAVE ANY PROBLEM WITH
24 THE REPORT BUT IF IT'S NOT TOO MUCH TROUBLE IF SOMEWHERE DOWN
25 THE ROAD, KIND OF, IF WE COULD JUST SEE THE BENEFITS DERIVED,



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THE OUTCOMES. SINCE THE PROGRAM'S INCEPTION, IN THIS REGION. I
2 WOULD BE VERY CURIOUS TO SEE THAT.

3

4 **KARL ANDERSON:** I'LL WORK WITH THE STATE AND CALTRANS TO PULL
5 SOME WITH OF THAT DATA AND FIGURE OUT A WAY TO SHARE IT WITH
6 YOU.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. AND THEN HIS SEE HERE. THE SKYWAY,
9 IS THAT THE PROJECT FROM THE BAY BRIDGE.

10

11 **KARL ANDERSON:** THE MULTIMODAL BASED SKYWAY THEIR APPLICATION
12 CONSISTED TWO OF SUBPROJECTS ONE OF WHICH IS IMPROVEMENTS FOR
13 THE YERBA BUENA MULTI-USE PATHWAY PROJECT WHICH IS ON YERBA
14 BUENA ISLAND AND THE OTHER COMPONENT OF THAT PROJECT IS THE
15 WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT WHICH IS ENHANCING THE IMPROVING
16 CONNECTION BETWEEN WEST OAKLAND NEIGHBORHOOD TO THE BAY TO THE
17 EXISTING BAY BRIDGE TRAIL.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. THEN WITH THE EAST BAY GREENWAY. I
20 THINK YOU SAID FROM OAKLAND TO BAY FAIR?

21

22 **KARL ANDERSON:** YEAH FOR THE BART STATIONS IT'S GOING TO BE A
23 PARALLEL PATH TO THE BART CORRIDOR CONNECTING -- PHASE ONE
24 CONNECTS LAKE MERRITT BART STATION TO BAY FAIR BART STATION.

25



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THIS IS --

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS 250 MILLION LEVERAGING SIGNIFICANT
4 INVESTMENTS FROM -- [INDISCERNIBLE]

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** I HAVE BEEN WAITING FOR THAT PROJECT TO
7 EXTEND BEYOND BAY FAIR ALL THE WAY TO HAYWARD. SO THAT'S WHY --
8 - [INDISCERNIBLE] JUST ASKED FOR MONEY FOR --

9

10 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** I THINK THOSE ARE ALL MY QUESTIONS. IF
13 THERE IS NO OTHER QUESTIONS. LET'S SEE, DO WE HAVE A MOTION
14 AND A SECOND TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF THE MTC RESOLUTION 4633
15 REVISED AND 4639 REVISED, ADOPTION OF THE 2025ATP CYCLE SEVEN
16 PROGRAM AND PROJECTS AND ADOPTION OF THE RM3 SAFE ROUTES TO
17 TRANSIT AND BAY TRAILS PROGRAM CYCLE ONE, PROGRAMS AND
18 PROJECTS TO THE COMMISSIONS FOR APPROVAL?

19

20 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** SO MOVED. FLEMING.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** FLEMING.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** SECOND BY PAPAN.

25



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** SECOND BY PAPAN. ANY OTHER COMMENTS?

2

3 **KATHLEEN KANE:** BEFORE THE CLERK CALLS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT I
4 WANT TO ALERT THE COMMITTEE THAT WE ACCIDENTALLY OMITTED A
5 LETTER OF SUPPORT FOR THE PROJECT YOU WERE JUST TALKING ABOUT
6 COMMISSIONER MILEY THE EAST BAY GREENWAY MULTIMODAL PHASE ONE
7 LAKE MERRITT BAY FAIR PROJECT THAT LETTER WAS RECEIVED IN
8 SEPTEMBER OF THE PAST YEAR FROM THEN CONGRESS MEMBER BARBARA
9 LEE AND ERIC SWALWELL IN SUPPORT OF FULL FUNDING OF THAT
10 PROJECT REQUEST. THAT ITEM IS BEING UPLOADED TO THE WEB SITE
11 NOW AND IS BEING DISTRIBUTED HERE IN-PERSON.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM?
16 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HOW MANY FOLKS DO WE HAVE?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE IN THE BOARDROOM. AND ONE
21 ONLINE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** TWO MINUTES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MARTIN REYES FROM SFCTA.



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS MARTIN
3 REYES. I'M HERE ON BEHALF OF THE SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY
4 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY WHICH ALSO SERVES AS THE TREASURE
5 ISLAND MOBILITY MANAGEMENT AGENCY OR TIMMA FOR SHORT. I'M HERE
6 TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT IN THE RM3 AWARD FOR THE MULTI-MODAL BAY
7 SKYWAY PROJECT. THE SAN FRANCISCO COMPONENT OF THIS PROJECT
8 WILL EXPAND THE EXISTING MULTI-USE PATH ON THE EAST SPAN OF
9 THE BAY BRIDGE FROM EXISTING TERMINUS TO TREASURE ISLAND WHY
10 PEDESTRIAN AND CYCLISTS WILL BE ABLE TO BOARD AN ELECTRIC
11 FERRY TO DON'T SAN FRANCISCO IT ALSO SUPPORTS THE DELIVERY OF
12 8,000 UNITS OF HOUSING 27% OF ALCOHOL BE AFFORDABLE ON ISLAND
13 WITH ASSOCIATED GOAL OF ACHIEVING 50% OF TRIPS ON AND OFF THE
14 ISLAND MADE BY TRANSIT WALKING AND BIKING. WE WANT TO THANK
15 MTC AND BATA STAFF FOR THEIR COLLABORATION ON THIS PROJECT AND
16 THE RECOMMENDED AWARD AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO REALIZING
17 IMPLEMENTATION. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE JULIANNE CARLINI.
20 YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'M JULIANNE CARLINI SPEAKING FOR MYSELF THANK YOU
23 ALL FOR YOUR SERVICE I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THE PROJECTS WITH THE
24 ATP TRANSIT TO TRAIL ACCESS BEING APPLYING FOR THESE FUNDS.
25 THANK YOU VICE CHAIR MILEY FOR YOUR QUESTIONS AROUND



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 ELIGIBILITY. BELMONT, [INDISCERNIBLE] CORRIDOR PROJECT IS A
2 CAR PROJECT NOTHING MORE OR LESS NO REAL SHIFT TO CYCLING
3 WALKING OR MICRO-MOBILITY. THANK YOU FOR REJECTING. THE
4 REQUEST IS A SCAM. IT'S A FRAUD. IT ASKS FOR 16 MILLION WITH
5 PERHAPS A FEW THOUSAND FOR CYCLING IMPROVEMENTS. I CAN'T SPEAK
6 TO HOW MUCH WOULD GO TO PEDESTRIAN OR TRANSIT. THIS PROJECT
7 HAS FOUR SCHOOLS DIRECTLY ON IT MORE THAN A HALF MILE. AS
8 DESIGNED IT CREATES AN UNSAFE ROUTE TO SCHOOLS EXACTLY THE
9 OPPOSITE OF WHAT WE NEED. PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURES ONLY THAT
10 MANDATED BY LAW, ALMOST [INDISCERNIBLE] NO ACCESS TO TRANSIT.
11 NO ADDITIONAL ACCESS TO THE BAY TRAIL. I'M A TRANSIT CYCLIST
12 SO I'M GOING TO FOCUS ON THAT A BIT. I'M NOT ANTI-CAR. I OWN
13 TWO CARS. I USE BOTH REGULARLY, BUT WHEN I CAN, I LIKE TO RIDE
14 MY BIKE TO PLACES. THIS PROJECT PROVIDES NOT ONE INCH OF
15 ADDITIONAL CYCLE LANES. THERE IS SAY SIGNIFICANT GAP WHERE
16 THERE IS NO CYCLE LANE. THE CYCLING INFRASTRUCTURE IS PERHAPS
17 \$2000 A FEET. [INDISCERNIBLE] PAINT, NOT ONE BIKE LANES
18 REQUIRED BY CALTRAIN'S FHWA OR NACTO. IT WILL MAKE THINGS MORE
19 DANGEROUS AT THE DESIGN TRAFFIC CIRCLES INCREASING SPEEDS VMT
20 AND GHG. I CAN'T BELIEVE THAT THIS PROJECT SCORED 70 AND 51. I
21 HOPE YOU FIGURE OUT HOW TO DISCOURAGE MOTOR VEHICLE PROJECTS
22 TO THESE PROGRAMS PLEASE DO ADD REAL ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS
23 TO THESE. THANK YOU.
24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE
2 AND NO ONE ELSE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY RESPONSE TO THE PRIOR QUESTION OR
5 COMMENT.

6

7 **KARL ANDERSON:** I'LL JUST SAY THAT SPEAKER WAS SPEAKING ON A
8 PROJECT IN THE CITY OF BELL METROPOLITAN, THE ALAMEDA DE LA
9 PULGAS PROJECT WHICH IS NOT ON THE RECOMMENDED PROJECT LIST.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. CLERK, TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE. THE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
5 PRESENT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. SO WE'RE NOW TO
8 AGENDA ITEM FIVE. I WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS
9 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AT
10 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD.
11 I WOULD ALSO ASK THAT IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
12 PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT
13 RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY'S AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED
14 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE
15 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND WILL BE
16 RECOGNIZED TO SPEAK.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED. NO ONE IN THE
19 BOARDROOM AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WISHING TO SPEAK.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** VERY GOOD. OKAY. ITEM SIX. ADJOURN THE
22 MEETING AND THE NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND
23 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY MARCH 12th
24 9:45 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO
2 THE PUBLIC. [ADJOURNED]
3



NTT

Broadcasting Government