

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, JANUARY 12TH, 2024, 9:45 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL

6 TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION

7 COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ABAG AND MTC WEB SITE.

8 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED

9 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT

10 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDS WILL BE CALLED

11 UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL

12 VOTE TAKEN ON ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER

13 PARTICIPATION TODAY. WITH THAT CLERK CALL THE ROLL.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CANEPA?

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARREGUIN?

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COMMISSIONER AHN? I DO NOT SEE HIM. HE IS

24 HERE. BUT HE IS NOT AT A REMOTE LOCATION PUBLISHED IN THE

25 AGENDA. SUPERVISOR CARLSON?



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ECKLUND?

9

10 **PAT EKLUND:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOULTON PETERS?

13

14 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NOACK?

17

18 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE IN-PERSON AT A REMOTE LOCATION BEING

23 OPERATED AT 1195 THIRD STREET NAPA.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR TIEDEMANN?



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** PRESENT. AND I AM NO LONGER THE MAYOR.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THAT BRINGS US TO THE CONSENT
7 CALENDAR. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT
8 CALENDAR?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** IS THERE A SECOND?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SECOND SECONDED.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAY I HAVE THE MOTION AND SECOND AGAIN?
19 MOTION BY SPERING SECOND BY TIEDEMANN ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.
20 CANEPA?

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ARREGUIN?

25



1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CARLTON?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ECKLUND?

12

13 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOULTON-PETERS?

16

17 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NOACK IS ABSENT. RAMOS?

20

21 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SPERING?

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TIEDEMANN?

3

4 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
7 PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. FRED WE HAD NO PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THAT IS CORRECT. THERE ARE NO WRITTEN
12 COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE
13 BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO
14 MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3A,
17 OVERVIEW GOVERNOR NEWSOME FISCAL YEAR 2024, 2025 STATE BUDGET
18 PROPOSAL. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THIS
19 REPORT?

20

21 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR CANEPA AND COMMITTEE
22 MEMBERS. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC AND ABAG STAFF. SO THE
23 GOVERNOR RELEASED HIS BUDGET PROPOSAL ON WEDNESDAY. I WILL TRY
24 TO BE BRIEF. BUT THE BIGGEST TAKE AWAY FROM THE BUDGET IS IT'S
25 A MIXED BAG. GOOD NEWS AND BAD NEWS. ON THE GOOD NEWS SIDE,



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THE FISCAL PICTURE IS ROSIER THAN WAS ANTICIPATED. SO, THE
2 ADMINISTRATION IS PROJECTING A \$38 BILLION BUDGET DEFICIT.
3 THAT'S A REALLY BIG NUMBER. IT MEANS SOME HARD CUTS. BUT IT'S
4 ROUGHLY HALF OF WHAT WAS ANTICIPATED BY THE LEGISLATIVE
5 ANALYST'S OFFICE IN DECEMBER. SO, I'M COUNTING THAT AS GOOD
6 NEWS. IT'S PRETTY TYPICAL THAT THERE IS SOME ROOM BETWEEN THE
7 ADMINISTRATION ANALYSIS AND THE LEGISLATIVE ANALYST OFFICERS
8 ANALYSIS. BUT OUR UNDERSTANDING IS THAT THIS, SORT OF, BIG GAP
9 IS BECAUSE THERE WERE BETTER THAN ANTICIPATED TAX RECEIPTS
10 FROM LAST YEAR THAT ARE CONTRIBUTING TO THIS DIFFERENTIAL. AND
11 SO THE ADMINISTRATION WAS ABLE TO BRING, INTEGRATE THOSE, SORT
12 OF, NEW REVENUES PROJECTIONS WHILE THE LAO HADN'T HAD A CHANCE
13 YET TO DO THAT. SO THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME CHALLENGING CUTS
14 AND IT'S A TOUGH BUDGET YEAR AND COULD BE THAT THE LEGISLATURE
15 NEEDS FILL IS SMALLER THAN ANTICIPATED. GOOD PIECE OF NEWS IS
16 GOVERNOR IS PROPOSING TO HONOR THE \$5.1 BILLION TRANSIT DEAL
17 THAT WAS STRUCK LAST YEAR THAT MEANS THERE IS NOT GOING TO BE
18 A PROPOSED CUT TO THE FUNDS THAT THE COMMISSION AND TRANSIT
19 OPERATORS ARE RELYING ON TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT SERVICE FOR THE
20 NEXT THREE YEARS. TO ENSURE THAT BART SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO
21 AND BART CORE CAPACITY SECURE THEIR FEDERAL MATCHING FUNDS.
22 THERE IS PROPOSED DEFERRAL OF SOME OF THE PROPOSED FUNDING AND
23 OUR INITIAL ANALYSIS IS THAT THE DEFERRAL WILL NOT AFFECT THE
24 CASH FLOW FOR THE CAPITAL PROJECTS NOR ABILITY TO SUSTAIN
25 OPERATING. SO, AGAIN, GOOD NEWS. THE BAD NEWS IS THE GOVERNOR



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 IS PROPOSING REALLY BIG CUTS TO HOUSING PROGRAMS, INCLUDING
2 CLAW BACK OF \$300 MILLION IN REAP 2.0 FUNDS. SORRY. THE
3 REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING PROGRAM. YEAH. THANK YOU. 2.0
4 FUNDS. THAT'S A 50% CUT FROM WHAT WAS COMMITTED EARLIER. AND
5 THE BAY AREA'S \$100 MILLION SPENDING PLAN WAS ACTUALLY JUST
6 APPROVED YESTERDAY BY HCD, SO IT'S A CUT IN PROJECTS AND
7 PROGRAMS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE WERE GETTING READY TO SPEND, AND
8 ACTUALLY HAVE SIGNED SOME CONTRACTS FOR. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK
9 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET IS A
10 STARTING POINT. AND, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE ALWAYS NEGOTIATIONS.
11 THE LAST BIG PIECE IS THAT THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT CUTS PLANNED
12 FOR CLIMATE PROGRAMS. AND I THINK THE TWO BIG TAKE-AWAY'S
13 THERE ARE, ONE, AGAIN, IT'S A NEGOTIATION. THIS IS ONE
14 PROPOSAL THE LEGISLATURE NEEDS TO APPROVE IT SO, WE'LL SEE.
15 AND THEN, TWO, IT IS A TOUGH BUDGET YEAR, BUT WE ANTICIPATE
16 THAT MEANS THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE MORE INTEREST FROM
17 LEGISLATORS AND FOLKS IN SACRAMENTO TO ASK VOTERS TO STEP IN
18 WITH STATE BONDS AND SELF-HELP. SO, WITH THAT, I'LL JUST TURN
19 IT BACK TO THE CHAIR.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
22 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS? MAYOR ARREGUIN?

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** THANK YOU. ON THE REAP 2.0 CUT.
25 TWO THINGS, WHAT WOULD THE IMPACT OF THAT BE, POTENTIALLY, TO



1 THIS REGION? BECAUSE I KNOW WE HAVE -- YOU KNOW, WE HAVE
2 DEVELOPED A BUDGET, I THINK A VERY AMBITIOUS AND IMPORTANT
3 PROGRAM ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THOSE FUNDS, HOUSING,
4 PRESERVATION, SUPPORTING INFILL HOUSING. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE,
5 I'M JUST CURIOUS ABOUT IF WE HAVE A SENSE OF WHAT THE IMPACT
6 OF THAT MIGHT BE?

7

8 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** I THINK THE SHORT WHERE IS WE DON'T
9 KNOW YET. WE DON'T HAVE A PLAN HOW WE WOULD ADDRESS THAT. BUT
10 A SENSE OF THE NUMBERS, THE BAY AREA RECEIVED A LITTLE OVER
11 \$100 MILLION FOR REAP 2.0, THAT'S A 50 MILLION CUT, AND THE
12 ADMINISTRATION HAS CONVEYED THAT THE PLAN WOULD BE BASICALLY
13 AN EVEN CUT ACROSS THE BOARD FOR EVERY REGION. SO AGAIN 50% OF
14 THE BAY AREA'S REAP 2.0.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE WORKING WITH CALCOG AND JURISDICTIONS TO
17 ADVOCATE ON THOSE?

18

19 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** CALCOG THE BROADER HOUSING COMMUNITY IS
20 ENGAGED ON REAP 2.0 AND ANTICIPATE WILL BE WORKING WITH
21 TRANSIT PROVIDERS AS WELL.

22

23 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** THE CUTS TO THE HOUSING
24 PROGRAM, IMPORTANT FOR OUR STATE HOUSING TO MEET NOT ONLY
25 REGIONAL ALLOCATION BUT TO ADDRESS THE CRITICAL SHORTAGE OF



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 HOUSING. WE TALK ABOUT THE ADVOCACY PLATFORM LATER, BUT THIS
2 NEEDS TO BE A PRIORITY THIS YEAR WORKING WITH HOUSING
3 ADVOCATES AND GROUPS, AND ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS TO PUSH
4 TO TRY TO MAINTAIN AS MUCH NHP, CRITICAL, INFILL GRANTS,
5 CRITICAL. SO TRANSPORTATION IS IMPORTANT. BUT IF WE DON'T HAVE
6 THE HOUSING TO GET PEOPLE TO TRANSIT, IT'S KIND OF A MISSING
7 PIECE OF THE PUZZLE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER ECKLUND?

10

11 **PAT EKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I HEAR MAYOR ARREGUIN'S
12 CONCERN ABOUT THE REAP FUNDING. IN FACT, I THINK IF YOU COULD
13 JUST WRITE UP WHAT YOU SAID? BECAUSE IT'S OBVIOUSLY NOT A
14 STAFF REPORT, BECAUSE IT'S REALLY -- [LAUGHTER] THAT WOULD
15 HELP ME START GETTING OUR MACHINE IN MARIN COUNTY TO WORK WITH
16 OUR LEGISLATORS ON THIS. SO I THINK THE SOONER WE COULD GET
17 YOUR ANALYSIS ESPECIALLY ON THE HOUSING PIECE, BECAUSE WE'RE
18 EXPECTING TO MEET OUR RHNA'S, AND IF WE ARE NOT ABLE TO GET
19 THE FUNDING TO THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, THEN I THINK WE NEED TO
20 SEEK LEGISLATION TO PUT OFF SOME OF THE PRESSURE THAT CITIES
21 AND COUNTIES ARE UNDER WITHOUT FUNDING TO DO THAT SO I THINK
22 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE GET THAT INFORMATION AS SOON AS
23 POSSIBLE. APPRECIATE YOU FOLLOWING UP ON IT, I MEAN WITHIN A
24 DAY OF THE ANNOUNCEMENT AND DOING THE ANALYSIS, YOU'RE
25 AWESOME. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CLERK. CLERK, WERE
3 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
6 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
7 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
8 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THAT
11 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3B, THE
12 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE, ENABLING LEGISLATION.
13 REBECCA LONG, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE
16 MEMBERS. REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
17 AFFAIRS. WE'RE FINALLY AT THE MEETING WHERE WE GET TO TAKE
18 ACTION ON THIS ITEM THAT YOU HAVE BEEN HEARING ABOUT FOR A
19 LONG TIME. AND OF COURSE WE'LL BE BRINGING BACK UPDATES,
20 ASSUMING THAT THE COMMISSION DOES, AND THAT THIS COMMITTEE
21 ENDORSES THE DIRECTION THAT WE'RE PROPOSING TODAY. I WANT TO
22 MENTION OFF THE TOP, SENATOR WIENER HAS AGREED TO AUTHOR THIS
23 LEGISLATION, AND THERE IS A BILL NUMBER NOW. IT'S A SPOT BILL.
24 BUT HE DETERMINED THAT IT WAS A GOOD IDEA TO INTRODUCE THE
25 SPOT BILL BECAUSE IT BUYS US ADDITIONAL TIME TO WORK ON THE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 LANGUAGE OF THE INTRODUCTORY VERSION, SB 925, AND IT WON'T BE
2 AMENDED UNTIL 30 DAYS FROM TODAY. SO, WITH THAT, LAST MONTH,
3 JUST TO BRING ALL OF THE ABAG DIRECTORS UP TO SPEED, AS WELL,
4 THE COMMISSION HAD A PRETTY IN-DEPTH DISCUSSION AT THE
5 COMMISSION MEETING ABOUT THE CONCEPT OF THE REGIONAL
6 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. WE GOT DIRECTION WITH RESPECT
7 TO ANY KIND OF TRANSIT REFORM THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAS REALLY
8 EMPHASIZED THEY WANT TO SEE A FOCUS ON OUTCOMES, THAT THE
9 LEGISLATION WHICH INCLUDE PROVISIONS TO STRENGTHEN MTC'S
10 ABILITY TO DO TRANSIT COORDINATION AND IMPROVE THE
11 CONNECTIVITY BETWEEN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS AND STAY AWAY FROM
12 THE PURPOSES OF LEGISLATION ANY KIND OF CONSOLIDATION AT THIS
13 TIME. THAT WAS THE CLEAR DIRECTION THAT WE HEARD. AT THE
14 COMMISSION MEETING. SO OUR RECOMMENDATION FOR INCLUDING IN THE
15 BILL IS BASIC STRENGTHENING MTC'S ROLE AS A TRANSIT MANAGER
16 OVER KEY PRIORITIES THAT RIDERS CARE ABOUT MOST. WE'RE
17 RECOMMENDING A POLICY PROVISION THAT BUILDS ON SOME
18 CONVERSATION YOU JUST HAD THAT MORNING RELATED TO TRAVEL
19 DEMAND MANAGEMENT OR TDM, AND HOW THE PRIVATE SECTOR CAN HELP
20 IN TERMS OF GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS AND WHAT WE'RE
21 RECOMMENDING IS A REQUIREMENT THAT, FOR EMPLOYERS, A 50 OR
22 MORE, THEY PROVIDE SOME KIND OF SUBSIDY TO SUPPORT TRANSIT. I
23 THINK THIS ITEM IN THE MEMO WE TALK ABOUT IT BEING ONLY FOR
24 EMPLOYERS THAT ARE LOCATED NEAR TRANSIT. SINCE THEN, WE HAVE
25 HAD A NUMBER OF CONVERSATIONS WITH FOLKS. WE DON'T WANT TO



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 DISCOURAGE EMPLOYERS TO LOCATE NEAR TRANSIT WE NEED TO BE
2 MINDFUL OF CONSEQUENCES, SOME FAR FROM TRANSIT MAY BE BIKE
3 SUBSIDY OH EV SUBSIDY IT MAKE SENSE. WHAT WE'RE DOING IS
4 ASKING FOR SUPPORT OF A MANDATE OF SOME TYPE FOR EMPLOYERS, A
5 YEAR OR MORE IN THE REGION THAT IS ABOUT ENCOURAGE
6 ALTERNATIVES TO SINGLE OCCUPANT VEHICLE DRIVING. ANOTHER KEY
7 ITEM THAT CAME UP IN THE DISCUSSION AT THE COMMISSION MEETING
8 BY A NUMBER OF STAKEHOLDERS WAS NOT LIMITING THE AMOUNT OF THE
9 PROPOSED REVENUE MEASURE TO A BILLION DOLLARS PER YEAR. SO,
10 WHEN WE DID THE ANALYSIS, YOU RECALL THE DIFFERENT REVENUE
11 OPTIONS, WE ASKED THE CONSULTANT TO TELL US WHAT TAX RATE
12 WOULD BE NEEDED TO GENERATE A BILLION DOLLARS AT THREE
13 DIFFERENT OPTIONS, SALES TAX, HALF CENT, EQUIVALENT TO A
14 BILLED, RECOMMENDING TO LEGISLATION WE DON'T PUT A CAP IN
15 THERE AND WE CONTINUE THAT CONVERSATION WITH LEGISLATURE. THE
16 LEGISLATION MAY NOT WANT A CAP FOR ANOTHER. IT'S PREMATURE TO
17 PROPOSE A CAP THIS WAY WE POTENTIALLY GET MORE FLEXIBILITY AS
18 NOTED IN VARIOUS MEMOS. LIMITING FACTOR IS GOING TO BE WHAT
19 THE VOTERS ARE WILLING TO APPROVE. IF WE GET THE AUTHORIZING
20 LEGISLATION TO BE AS FLEXIBLE AS POSSIBLE THAT WOULD BE IDEAL.
21 IT'S GOING TO BE A DIFFICULT YEAR IN SACRAMENTO. WE WANT TO
22 GIVE OURSELVES AS MUCH FLEXIBILITY, BUT I DON'T KNOW THAT
23 WE'LL BE ABLE TO HAVE THAT ALL THE WAY THROUGH. OUR
24 RECOMMENDATION IS TO SUPPORT THE OPTIONS THAT ARE LISTED IN
25 THE MEMO, BUT NOT PUT A CAP ON THERE. JUST A SUMMARY OF THE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 PROPOSED OUTLINE OF THE LEGISLATION I WOULD DRAW YOUR
2 ATTENTION TO ATTACHMENT B WHICH WALKS THROUGH WHAT WE HOPE
3 WILL BE BECOME ESSENTIALLY THE OUTLINE OF THE LEGISLATION. SO
4 INCLUDING THE GOALS, THE TYPES OF EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES, WE
5 THINK IT'S PREMATURE TO PROPOSE SPECIFIC PERCENTAGES BY
6 EXPENDITURE CATEGORY AT THIS TIME. BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW HOW
7 BIG THE MEASURE IS GOING TO BE, BUT WE WANT TO HAVE CATEGORIES
8 OF TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, SAFE STREETS, CONNECTIVITY AND
9 CLIMATE RESILIENCE. WE'RE NOT PROPOSING A GEOGRAPHIC RETURN TO
10 SOURCE YET BUT WE DO RECOGNIZE THE CONVERSATION WILL EVOLVE
11 TOWARDS THAT AS WE GO FORWARD. AND CERTAIN CATEGORIES,
12 THEMSELVES MORE SO TO THAT THAN OTHERS. SO WE'RE ASKING FOR
13 YOUR SUPPORT FOR THIS APPROACH THIS MONTH. AND THEN WE'LL BE
14 WORKING WITH SENATOR WIENER'S OFFICE ON THE LANGUAGE. AS THE
15 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS MOVES FORWARD AND AMENDMENTS ARE PROPOSED
16 WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE AND KEEP YOU ADVISED. WITH
17 THAT I'LL CLOSE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH REBECCA. AT OUR LAST
20 MEETING WE HAD ROBUST CONVERSATION. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND
21 SECOND TO APPROVE THE REFERRAL OF THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
22 REVENUE MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION TO THE COMMISSION FOR
23 APPROVAL?

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING:** CAN WE HAVE SOME COMMENTS?



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE GET A MOTION
3 ON THE TABLE. WE'LL START WITH COMMISSIONER NOVAK AND MAHAN.

4

5 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT'S BEEN
6 DONE ON THIS AND THE DIRECTION IT'S HEADED IN, IN ALLOWING
7 FLEXIBILITY. I THINK OVER TIME THINGS WILL CHANGE THIS GIVES
8 US A LOT OF OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE THE BEST POSSIBLE. ARE WE
9 THINKING ABOUT SIZE OF PEOPLE IN THE OFFICERS? I MEAN YOU CAN
10 HAVE EMPLOYERS LOCATED CLOSE TO TRANSIT THAT ENSURES EVERYBODY
11 WORKS FROM HOME. I WOULD LOVE TO INCENTIVE EMPLOYERS ALLOWING
12 PEOPLE TO WORK-FROM-HOME ALMOST MORE THAN JUST USING TRANSIT.
13 HOW ARE WE DISTINGUISHING THAT DISCUSSION?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** GREAT QUESTION. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT WITH
16 OTHER REGIONS THAT HAVE MANDATES ALONG THESE LINES, THEY DO
17 MAKE EXCEPTIONS, IF YOU ARE FULLY REMOTE, POTENTIALLY, YOU
18 DON'T CONTRIBUTE AT ALL. THIS IS THE TYPE OF NUANCE AND
19 CONSIDERATION THAT WE REALLY NEED TO TALK WITH THE BAY AREA
20 COUNCIL, WITH THE LEADERSHIP GROUP AND OTHERS ABOUT THEIR
21 THOUGHTS ALONG THESE LINES. THEY HAVE INDICATED THEY'RE MUCH
22 MORE SUPPORTIVE OF THIS AS FAR AS PROVIDING BENEFITS TO THE
23 WORKFORCE AND EMPLOYEE TAXES. SO HOPEFULLY THEY WILL WANT TO
24 HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS AND WE'LL FIND THE SWEET SPOT.

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **SUE NOACK:** HAVE WE THOUGHT ABOUT ANYTHING ALONG THE LANES OF
2 UNIVERSITIES.

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** WITH RESPECT TO UNIVERSITIES OUR CLIPPER BAY
5 PASS IS EXPLORING THAT ALREADY THROUGH THE PILOT.

6

7 **SUE NOACK:** I JUST WANTED TO SEE THAT BROADEN. THE PILOT SEEMS
8 TO HAVE GONE WELL, AND I SIT WITH DBC, AND THEY NOT HAPPENING.
9 IS THERE A WAY TO INCENTIVIZE UNIVERSITIES TO WORK IN
10 CONJUNCTION? I KNOW DBC IS LOOKING AT ADDING A FEE TO EVERY
11 STUDENT IN ORDER TO PUT SOMETHING TOGETHER TO CONTRIBUTE TO
12 THAT I DIDN'T KNOW WHETHER THAT WAS BEING PURSUED AT THE SAME
13 TIME.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE
16 DIRECTOR. AS YOUR ROLE AS VICE CHAIR IN THE REGIONAL NETWORK
17 MANAGEMENT COUNCIL, I THINK WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO THAT GROUP
18 ON THIS QUESTION AND FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE STARTING TO
19 TALK ABOUT THE POST PILOT AND UNIVERSITIES HOW DO WE GET MORE
20 UNIVERSITIES AND COMMUNITIES COLLEGES, MORE EDUCATIONAL
21 INSTITUTIONS ENROLLED THAT'S DEFINITELY AN ACTIVE CONVERSATION
22 AND WE DEFINITELY WANT TO COME BACK TO YOU WITH A BETTER
23 UPDATE ON THAT.

24

25 **SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANKS CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THE WORK ON ENABLING
3 LEGISLATION AND APPRECIATE SENATOR WIENER LEAN IN ON TRANSIT
4 AS HE HAS DONE MANY TIMES BEFORE. I SUPPORT THE DIRECTION
5 WE'RE GOING IN AND AGREE WITH COMMENTS ABOUT KEEPING OPTIONS
6 OPEN AND MAINTAINING AN APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF FLEXIBILITY. I
7 WANTED TO NOTE JUST A FEW THINGS. ONE, I APPRECIATE THE
8 TRANSITION FROM CONSOLIDATION TO COORDINATION. AND AS WE THINK
9 ABOUT COORDINATION, I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT
10 THAT WE HAVE A ROBUST DISCUSSION ABOUT THE OUTCOMES WE CARE
11 MOST ABOUT FROM FARE AND SCHEDULE INTEGRATION TO SAFETY AND
12 RELIABILITY AND JUST REALLY DIG INTO WHAT IT IS THAT OUR
13 RESIDENTS AND VOTERS WANT TO SEE FROM US. I WANTED TO ALSO
14 FLAG THAT FOR SAN JOSE AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AT LEAST -- AND
15 WE HAD A LONG DISCUSSION AT VTA, WHICH IS OUR COUNTY-WIDE
16 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AND TRANSIT AGENCY, I THINK THAT RETURN
17 TO SOURCE IS GOING TO BE VERY IMPORTANT FOR A COUPLE OF
18 REASONS, OR SOME PROPORTIONALITY, SOME MECHANISM OF
19 PROPORTIONALITY. ONE IS THAT WE EFFECTIVELY HIT OUR FISCAL
20 CLIFF IN THE '90S AND RAISED LOCAL REVENUE AND CUT SERVICES
21 AND CONTINUE TO HAVE SERVICE LEVELS PER CAPITA THAT LAG MUCH
22 OF THE REGION AND OTHER CITIES ALONG THE WEST COAST. FOR US
23 THERE'S A PREMIUM THAT WE PLACE ON TRYING TO GET SERVICE
24 LEVELS BACK UP GIVEN THAT REALITY. ALSO BECAUSE WE HAVE FOUR
25 LOCAL SALES TAX MEASURES THAT FUND MUCH OF OUR TRANSIT



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 OPERATIONS, THREE OF WHICH EXPIRE STARTING IN THE MID-2030S,
2 WERE VERY SENSITIVE TO ANY REGIONAL MEASURE THAT MIGHT
3 UNDERMINE OUR ABILITY TO RENEW THOSE MEASURES. SO WE'RE GOING
4 TO HAVE TO THINK CREATIVELY ABOUT COORDINATING OUR STRATEGY
5 AND WE WANT TO BE A GOOD REGIONAL PARTNER IN A WAY THAT
6 DOESN'T UNDERMINE OUR ABILITIES. THERE ARE NUANCES AND
7 SENSITIVITIES I WANTED TO RAISE. I KNOW IT'S A CONCERN FOR
8 VIRTUALLY ALL ELECTED OFFICIALS IN THE SOUTH BAY JUST GIVEN
9 OUR PARTICULAR CIRCUMSTANCES. BY AND LARGE, THE NOTION OF
10 MOVING FORWARD THE ENABLING LEGISLATION, HAVING THAT
11 FLEXIBILITY AND WORKING THROUGH DETAILS TOGETHER AND BEING
12 OUTCOME FOCUSED AROUND COORDINATION RATHER THAN CONSOLIDATION
13 FEELS DIRECTIONALLY APPROPRIATE TO ME. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

16

17 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. AND I WANT TO THANK
18 STAFF. A LOT OF WORK, THERE HAS BEEN MULTIPLE MEETINGS TO GET
19 TO THIS POINT. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE OUR STATE LEGISLATORS,
20 WIENER, IN PARTICULAR, HAS BEEN A TREMENDOUS ALLY. OTHERS
21 WILLING TO STEP UP TO THE TABLE. I SUPPORT THIS, WE'RE ALL
22 LEANING IN, WHAT THIS IS ALLOWING US TO DO IS GIVE US
23 AUTHORITY TO KEEP MOVING FORWARD OUTCOMES THAT WE SEE
24 INSTRUMENTAL TO THE ORGANIZATION AND THIS REGION. WE STARTED
25 WITH THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN NETWORK MANAGEMENT PLAN



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 SUPPORTED THAT. FUNCTION IS NEW REVENUE BUT MAKING SURE WE
2 HAVE AUTHORITY TO EFFECTUATE OUTCOMES WITH RESOURCES. TO ME
3 THAT NEEDS TO BE CLEAR. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE OPERATORS WHO
4 HAVE BEEN DOING BEST THEY CAN TO FINE TUNE AND SHARPEN THE
5 PENCIL. SOME ARE HITTING THE FISCAL CLIFF BUT THE STATE HAS
6 BEEN A PARTNER. WE ARE ALSO CONTRIBUTING SIGNIFICANT RESOURCES
7 TO THIS FISCAL CLIFF THAT WE'RE FACING. SO, AGAIN THIS, IS THE
8 RIGHT THING TO DO AT THE RIGHT TIME. BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE
9 THAT WE'RE ALSO MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE TO MAKE DECISIONS
10 WITHIN THE COMMISSION OF WHAT WE CAN DO NOW AND WHAT WE'RE
11 ALLOWED TO DO IN THE FUTURE, AS WELL.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA, CHAIR:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. AND I THINK OUR CHAIR PEDROZA PUT IT
16 QUITE WELL, THAT THAT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO US. YOU HAVE
17 ACCOUNTABILITY HERE. WE REALLY WOULD LOVE TO SEE HOW IMPACTFUL
18 WE CAN BE WITH CONSEQUENCES. IN OTHER WORDS, REALLY REWARDING
19 ALL THOSE WHO ARE DOING THEIR VERY BEST, SHARPENING THEIR
20 PENCILS, BUT THERE HAS TO BE CONSEQUENCES IF THINGS ARE NOT
21 HAPPENING AS THEY SHOULD. BECAUSE WE PASSED THE RECOVERY PLAN
22 TWO YEARS AGO, AND THIS BOARD HAS ALREADY IMPLEMENTED, OR
23 INVESTED IN COORDINATING FARES IN A WHOLE SIGNAGE AND THAT, SO
24 WE REALLY -- WE KNOW THAT IT CAN BE DONE, AND I'M HOPING THAT
25 THIS LEGISLATION WILL PUT US IN A POSITION WHERE WE REALLY



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 MAKE THAT HAPPEN SOONER RATHER THAN LATER, PARTICULARLY IF
2 WE'RE GOING TO THE VOTERS, BECAUSE THEY WANT TO SEE RESULTS.
3 AND I DO WANT TO EMPHASIZE, TOO, THE RETURN TO SOURCE IS GOING
4 TO BE SO IMPORTANT FOR SO MANY OF OUR JURISDICTIONS. BECAUSE
5 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO SHOW OUR PUBLIC THIS IS HOW GOOD IT'S
6 GOING TO BE AND THIS IS HOW GREAT IT IS, BECAUSE WE'RE GOING
7 TO GET THAT FUNDING. SO THANK YOU FOR ALL THE HARD WORK AND
8 EFFORT. I LIKE REACHING OUT TO THE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS
9 BECAUSE THERE ARE SOME BIG ONES ALSO COMMUNITY COLLEGES IN OUR
10 AREAS THAT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO REDUCING OUR GREENHOUSE
11 GASSES. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. VICE CHAIR
14 JOSEFOWITZ.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AND OBVIOUSLY THE AMBITION OF THIS
17 IS ENORMOUS. AND I WANT TO THANK SENATOR WIENER, NOT SOMEONE
18 WHO SHIES AWAY FROM AMBITION. I THINK IT'S TERRIFIC THAT WE
19 ARE INCORPORATING A REGIONAL PDM APPROACH. I THINK THAT'S
20 GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL TO MEETING ALL THE GOALS THAT WE HAVE
21 FOR THIS MEASURE IN TERMS OF SECURING THE FUTURE OF OUR
22 TRANSIT OPERATORS, GETTING PEOPLE, SORT OF, TO TAKE MORE
23 SUSTAINABLE MODES, AND A VARIETY OF OTHER THINGS. SO,
24 OBVIOUSLY THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF WORK DO ON THAT, BUT I
25 REALLY THINK IT'S TERRIFIC THAT WE'RE PUTTING OUR STAKE NO THE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 GROUND THERE AND SAYING THAT'S GOING TO BE PART OF THE
2 MEASURE. I THINK WE HAVE A WAYS TO GO IN THIS MEASURE WITH
3 REGARD TO PROJECTS THAT REDUCE CARBON EMISSIONS. AND I THINK
4 MY COLLEAGUES MIGHT HAVE SEEN THE LETTER THAT WAS PUT IN BY
5 OVER 26 LOCAL REGIONAL STATE ORGANIZATIONS CALLING ON US NOT
6 TO FUND HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECTS OUT OF THIS MEASURE.
7 PROJECTS THAT NOT ONLY MAKE OUR CLIMATE -- NOT ONLY GENERATE
8 MORE EMISSIONS MORE AIR POLLUTION, BUT ULTIMATELY ARE GOING TO
9 MAKE OUR CONGESTION WORSE NOT BETTER. THERE IS STILL IN THIS
10 LANGUAGE WHAT I WOULD CONSIDER TOO MUCH STUFF, WHICH IS A BIT
11 HAND WAVY, WISHY WASHY, INVESTMENTS PRIMARILY ANTICIPATED TO
12 BE REDUCING, CLIMATE NEUTRAL, BLAH BLAH, I THINK IT'S
13 IMPORTANT, DISCUSSIONS PREVIOUSLY, WHAT WE'RE DOING IN OUR
14 COMMUNITIES AROUND CLIMATE. I THINK WE NEED TO DRAW A LINE IN
15 THE STAND AND SAY FOR THIS MEASURE WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE
16 FUNDING PROJECTS THAT MAKE CLIMATE CHANGE WORSE. WE'RE NOT
17 GOING TO BE FUNDING HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECTS AND I WOULD
18 REALLY STRUGGLE TO SUPPORT THIS MEASURE UNLESS WE CAN DO
19 SOMETHING DEFINITIVE LIKE THAT. THOSE PROJECTS HAVE TO KNOWS
20 OF MONEY THEY CAN DRAW ON THE ENTIRE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING
21 PROGRAM OF THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS STILL VERY MUCH
22 FOCUSED ON HIGHWAYS, ON ROADS. MANY OF THOSE PROJECTS WILL
23 STILL HAPPEN. THEY JUST SHOULDN'T BE HAPPENING OUT OF THIS --
24 THEY SHOULD NOT BE FUNDED OUT OF THIS MEASURE. I THINK WE JUST
25 HAVE TO DRAW A LINE ON THAT. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GRIT. THANK YOU. YES? COMMISSIONER
3 ECKLUND?

4

5 **PAT EKLUND:** OH, YOU WANT ME TO GO FIRST?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES.

8

9 **PAT EKLUND:** I WANT TO RESPOND TO THE COMMENT THAT WAS MADE. I
10 THINK THAT BEFORE WE HAVE THAT BLANKET OF A DECISION -- I KNOW
11 I'M NOT ON MTC -- BUT I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT SOME OF THE
12 PROJECTS THAT HAVE NOT HAD THE ABILITY TO BE COMPETITIVE FOR
13 FUNDING IN THE PAST, AND THE LARGER JURISDICTIONS HAVE GOTTEN
14 MORE OF THE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING FOR WIDENING. BUT I LOOK AT
15 HIGHWAY 37, AND SOME OF THE OTHER ROADS THAT REALLY DO NEED
16 THE WIDENING. AND, SO, I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE SOME
17 FLEXIBILITY. AND, SO, I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A DISCUSSION
18 ABOUT WHICH ONES AND, REALLY, YOU KNOW, BEFORE WE JUST SAY A
19 BLANKET NO MORE WIDENING OF HIGHWAYS. I THINK THERE NEEDS TO
20 BE A REAL DISCUSSION ON WHICH ONES MAY BE AFFECTED AS A RESULT
21 OF IT.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT.

24



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** TO FOLLOW UP ON COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S
2 COMMENTS. FIRST AROUND KEY PROVISIONS FOR THE PROPOSED
3 ENABLING LEGISLATION, I THINK THIS IS ALL EXCELLENT. ALTHOUGH,
4 KEY DETAILS WE WORKED OUT, NAMELY THE BUCKETS AND HOW MUCH IS
5 GOING TO GO INTO EACH RESPECTIVE BUCKET. I AGREE WITH MAYOR
6 MAHAN ABOUT LOOKING AT RETURN TO SOURCE. I THINK IT INVOLVES A
7 COORDINATION RELATIVE TO THE HOUSING MEASURE. I THINK THAT'S
8 GOING TO BE IMPORTANT TO GET BUY-IN REGIONALLY. I STRONGLY
9 SUPPORT IT. DM PROVISIONS AND I THINK THIS IS KEY NOT JUST TO
10 ADVANCE OUR STATE'S CLIMATE GOALS AND OUR REGION'S CLIMATE
11 GOALS BUT ALSO TO GET MORE PEOPLE ON THE BUS AND IF THAT'S THE
12 BIGGEST CHALLENGE WE'RE FACING NOW. SOME TRANSIT OPERATORS
13 HAVE SEEN DECREASES IN RIDERSHIP AND HOW CAN WE INCENTIVIZE
14 PEOPLE TO GET BACK ON TRANSIT IS CRITICAL. UC BERKELEY HAS HAD
15 A LONG-STANDING UNIVERSAL PASS PROGRAM THAT HAS ENORMOUS
16 BENEFIT IN INDUCE MODE SHIFT AND A LOT OF MAJOR EMPLOYEES ARE
17 DOING THIS, AND I AGREE WITH UNIVERSITIES IS IMPORTANT.
18 FINDING LARGE EMPLOYERS IS SOMETHING WE'LL HAVE TO DISCUSS.
19 AND THEN, ONE QUESTION AROUND THE REVENUE OPTIONS. SO, THERE
20 WILL BE A MENU, KIND OF LIKE WITH BAHFA, WHERE WE CAN CHOOSE
21 ONE OF THOSE. IS THE REGIONAL VMT CHARGE, AND VEHICLE
22 REGISTRATION CHARGE, IS THAT -- WE CAN ONLY DO THAT AFTER WE
23 DO THOSE OTHER THINGS? LIKE WITH BAHFA?
24



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANKS VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. SO, THERE IS A
2 COUPLE OF ISSUES WITH THE VMT CHARGE AND THE REG FEE. SO WITH
3 THE VMT CHARGE, WE THINK ADMINISTRATIVELY AND POLITICALLY, IT
4 WOULDN'T BE VIABLE TO INITIATE THAT WITHIN THE REGION WITHOUT
5 AN INFRASTRUCTURE THAT ALREADY EXISTS. SO WE DON'T ANTICIPATE
6 THAT HAPPEN FOR QUITE A WHILE, AND OBVIOUSLY IDEALLY WE NEED
7 THIS FUNDING MUCH SOONER. SO THAT'S WHY WE WERE THINKING IT
8 WOULD BE SUBSEQUENT TO A MEASURE. ALSO, YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON
9 HOW MUCH YOU WANT TO RAISE, RIGHT, FROM THE VMT CHARGE,
10 OBVIOUSLY IT'S NOT THE MOST POPULAR OPTION SO IT MIGHT BE
11 APPROPRIATE AT A LOWER SCALE. SIMILARLY WITH THE REGISTRATION
12 FEE, THERE ARE A COUPLE OF ISSUES THERE, ONE SOUNDS KIND OF
13 SILLY BUT IT'S REAL, THE DMV IS OVERHAULING THEIR
14 REGISTRATION SYSTEM, AND THEY ADVISE THAT THERE IS ABSOLUTELY
15 NO WAY THAT THEY CAN HANDLE A SPECIAL BAY AREA SURCHARGE. AND
16 THAT'S GOING TO TAKE MANY YEARS. [LAUGHTER] -- AS WITH MANY
17 THINGS WITH STATE IT SYSTEMS. AND THAT'S A CONSIDERATION. AND
18 THERE, TOO, WE HAVE LOOKED AT THE NUMBERS LOOKING AT, OKAY,
19 WHAT ARE THE BAY AREA'S SHARE OF VEHICLES AT DIFFERENT VALUES,
20 AND IF WE WERE TO CHARGE X RATE, HOW MUCH WOULD THAT GENERATE.
21 AND YOU'RE TALKING PRETTY LARGE SUPPLEMENTAL CHARGES TO WHAT
22 BAY AREA MOTORISTS PAY EACH DAY ON THE REGISTRATION TO RAISE
23 THE TYPE OF REVENUE THAT WE WANT TO BRING TO THE VOTERS. SO,
24 WE DON'T THINK IT'S VIABLE TO DO THAT IN THE BILLION, YOU
25 KNOW, BILLION PLUS RANGE. THAT'S WHY BOTH OF THOSE WE WERE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THINKING TO MAKE POST -- NO SOONER THAN 2030 OR IT COULD BE
2 AFTER THE INITIAL MEASURE IS APPROVED.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** AND THEN TO THE VISION AND
5 FOCUS AREAS, I THINK, ALL EDIT PROPOSED ARE EXCELLENT, REFLECT
6 THE INPUT WE HAVE HEARD, BUT, SORT OF, ON THE ISSUE OF
7 WIDENING, YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS GETS BACK TO THE CONVERSATION
8 WE JUST HAD AROUND THE SCFS, AND TRYING TO MEET THE STATE'S
9 TARGETS, AND YOU KNOW, HOW ARE WE GOING TO MEET THOSE TARGETS
10 IF WE ARE CONTINUING TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO DRIVE. AND WE'RE
11 NOT -- THE QUESTION IS HOW ARE WE GOING TO MEET THAT
12 TRANSITION TO ZERO-EMISSIONS? YOU KNOW, THE STATE HAS AN
13 AMBITIOUS GOAL, 2045, WE DON'T HAVE THE INFRASTRUCTURE, WE
14 DON'T HAVE THE SCALE OF GRID CAPACITY AND VEHICLES TO HELP
15 ENABLE TRANSITION AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. SO, AT THIS POINT,
16 WE'RE REALLY ENCOURAGING GAS COMBUSTION ENGINES. SO, IF OUR
17 GOAL IS TO MEET THE 19% REDUCTION, HOW DO WE JUXTAPOSE THAT
18 WITH ENCOURAGING TO PUT MORE PEOPLE ON THE ROAD? THAT
19 DISINCENTIVES PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT. I SECOND COMMISSIONER
20 JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS. I THINK WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL ABOUT
21 BALANCING COMPETING NEEDS AND THINKING THOUGHTFULLY ABOUT WHAT
22 REALLY ARE OUR TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES FOR THIS REGION. SO,
23 I JUST WANTED TO LIFT UP AND EXPRESS MY AGREEMENT WITH THOSE
24 COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. I WAS GOING TO SAY MAYOR

2 TIEDEMANN, BUT I'LL SAY COMMISSIONER TIEDEMANN.

3

4 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** THANK YOU. IT'S A HARD ADJUSTMENT FOR ME TOO.

5 [LAUGHTER] I'LL JUST REITERATE WHAT EVERYONE HAS SAID. THIS IS

6 A WIDE RANGING BIG EFFORT THAT HAS OBVIOUSLY HAD A LOT OF WORK

7 PUT INTO IT, ESPECIALLY TO ADJUST ALL THE CONVERSATIONS THAT

8 HAVE HAPPENED AT THIS COMMITTEE AND OTHERS. I REALLY

9 APPRECIATE ALL THAT WORK. I WILL AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER

10 ARREGUIN AND JOSEFOWITZ AROUND, I DON'T THINK IT'S TOO HIGH OF

11 A BAR TO SAY THAT ALL THE MEASURES HERE SHOULD BE REDUCING

12 GHGS AND THAT IT SHOULD NOT BE DOING THINGS THAT INCENTIVIZE

13 INTERNAL COMBUSTION ENGINES OR DRIVING, IN GENERAL, OR JUST

14 ANY OF THAT, SORT OF, POLICY. I THINK WE HAVE HEARD THAT

15 STRONGLY EVERY TIME WE HAVE DISCUSSED THIS, FROM THE PUBLIC

16 COMMENT WE SHOULD HAVE, AND I THINK IT MEETS OUR MISSION AND

17 OVERALL GOAL OF HAVING TRANSIT THAT PROVIDES ALTERNATIVES TO

18 THOSE OPTIONS. SO, I THINK THAT IS A GOOD IDEA. I ALSO HAVE

19 ONE OTHER COMMENT ON, YOU KNOW, A COUPLE OF US HAVE MENTIONED

20 RETURN TO SOURCE HERE. I MAY BE IN THE MINORITY HERE, BUT I

21 THINK WE SHOULD ALWAYS BE WILLING TO CONSIDER THINGS THAT

22 RETURN TO SOURCE A LITTLE LESS. THE BRILLIANT AND UNIQUE THING

23 ABOUT FUNDING MEASURES LIKE THIS IS THAT THEY ALLOW US TO BE

24 REDISTRIBUTIVE ON A REGIONAL LEVEL WHICH IS INCREDIBLY RARE,

25 AND A UNIQUE PART OF REGIONAL POLICY MAKING LIKE THIS. AND I



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THINK IT BEHOOVES US TO THINK ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WE WILL HAVE TO
2 HAVE SOME RETURN TO SOURCE TO PASS THIS, AND TO MAKE SURE THE
3 PEOPLE ARE GETTING THEIR MONEY'S WORTH OUT OF IT. BUT AS MUCH
4 AS WE CAN, THINKING ABOUT CREATING ALTERNATIVES THAT PROVIDE
5 REAL REGIONAL FUNDING, REGIONAL DISTRIBUTION OF RESOURCES TO
6 WHERE IT'S NEEDED OR WHERE IT HASN'T BEEN IN THE PAST. I KNOW
7 THAT HAS BEEN A QUESTION, IN THE BAHFA DISCUSSION THAT HAS
8 BEEN A HUGE PART OF THAT, OF TRYING TO HAVE A REGIONAL BODY
9 THAT GETS A PORTION OF THOSE FUNDS THAT DOESN'T GO BACK TO
10 SOURCE, AND I WANT US TO -- WHEN WE'RE FIGURING THAT OUT IN
11 THE PROCESS OF GETTING THIS LEGISLATION PASSED TO KEEP THAT IN
12 MIND, AND KEEP THAT AS A GOAL, RATHER THAN HAVING AS MUCH AS
13 POSSIBLE RETURN TO SOURCE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES, THANK YOU. I WANTED TO TALK ABOUT
18 THE FREEWAYS AND ADDITIONS OF LANES, OR WHAT HAVE YOU. MY
19 CONCERN IS UNTIL WE CAN GET PEOPLE ON TO PUBLIC TRANSIT, THOSE
20 THAT CONTINUE TO OWN THE GAS ENGINES ARE GOING TO BE STUCK IN
21 TRAFFIC. AND WHEN YOU ARE SITTING THERE IN GRIDLOCK OR NOT
22 MOVING, YOU ARE REALLY NOT DOING ANYTHING TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE
23 GASSES. SO, AS WE -- AND AS WE GET PEOPLE OUT OF GAS VEHICLES,
24 AND INTO THEIR ELECTRIC VEHICLES, THOSE VEHICLES ARE STILL
25 GOING TO NEED A ROADWAY TO MOVE ALONG. SO, IN THE IDEAL WORLD



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 IT WOULD BE GREAT IF EVERYBODY WOULD GET OUT OF THERE
2 VEHICLES. BUT WE NEED TO PROVIDE THOSE THAT FOR WHATEVER
3 REASON CAN'T OR MAYBE CHOOSE NOT TO MY PREFERENCE OF COURSE IS
4 FEWER PEOPLE ON THE ROADWAYS AND CARS BUT I'LL LEAVE IT AT
5 THAT. I THINK MY COLLEAGUE WANTS TO MAKE A COMMENT AS WELL.

6

7 **SUE NOACK:** I LEANED OVER TO EXPRESS CONCERN TO CAROL TO SAY,
8 YOU KNOW, IF WE GO IN AND SAY WE'RE NOT GOING TO IMPROVE OR
9 EXPAND OUR HIGHWAYS AND BEING A THREE ELECTRIC CAR FAMILY, WE
10 DON'T REALLY COMMUTE, BUT THE CONCERN WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO
11 ANYTHING EXPANDING HIGHWAYS AND WE DON'T HAVE THE
12 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OR TRANSIT SYSTEM TO SUPPORT THAT, I
13 THINK THE GOAL OF GHG, OR NEUTRAL DECREASING IS REALLY GOOD
14 BUT TO SAY ABSOLUTELY NO HIGHWAY WIDENING IN 37 WAS A GOOD
15 POINT. I THINK MAYBE DEFEATING TO THE MEASURE. SO, I WOULD BE
16 CONCERNED ABOUT OUTLINING SUCH A STRUCTURE GUIDELINE IN A
17 MEASURE WITHOUT REALLY THINKING THROUGH HOW THAT MIGHT IMPACT
18 PUBLIC PERCEPTION OF THE PROJECT OF THIS MEASURE. THANKS.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** PREMIER?

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. ANDREW FREMIER. THIS
23 IS A HELPFUL CONVERSATION, AND IT'S IMPORTANT TO COMMISSIONER
24 NOACK'S POINT AND USING 37 AS AN EXAMPLE. THE ENVIRONMENTAL
25 DOCUMENT HAS BEEN APPROVED, AND WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WIDENING



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THE SECTION FROM SEARS POINT TO MARE ISLAND, ALONG WITH OUR
2 PARTNERS IN THE NORTH BAY. THE ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT, ALONG
3 WITH PRICING LEADS TO ANALYSIS OF LESS VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED,
4 ACTUALLY. MY POINT IS ALMOST LIKE THE EXPRESS LANE QUESTION.
5 THEY AREN'T ALWAYS THE SAME. THEY HAVE NUANCES. AND I WOULD
6 PAY ATTENTION TO LIMITATIONS, BE MINDFUL OF GOALS BUT BEING
7 CAREFUL ABOUT HOW WE RESTRICT. I THINK THAT'S GOOD ADVICE.

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA, CHAIR:** WELL SAID. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?
10 SORRY. COMMISSIONER AHN?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN:** THANK YOU. AND I JUST ALSO WANTED TO DRAW
13 THE COMMISSION'S ATTENTION TO THE COMMENTS [INDISCERNIBLE] I'M
14 SEEING, IT'S ROUGHLY A LITTLE OVER TWO DOZEN ENVIRONMENTAL
15 JUSTICE AND ADVOCACY GROUPS IN PLANNING AND I REALLY
16 APPRECIATED ITS ACTIVITY AROUND HIGHWAY WIDENING AND
17 DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT ON PARTICULARLY FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES,
18 AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT POINT TO CONSIDER.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** HOW DO YOU MAKE THAT PROJECT
21 GHG NEUTRAL?

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I DIDN'T DO A VERY GOOD JOB.

24

25 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** THAT'S MY QUESTION.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE'RE ADDING AN HOV LANE THAT ALLOWS TRANSIT
3 FOR THE FIRST TIME. THERE IS NO TRANSIT IN THAT CORRIDOR TODAY
4 AND THERE IS AN HOUR LONG BACKUP BY THE COMMUNITY COMING FROM
5 VALLEJO WORKING IN MARIN. PRIMARILY OFFERS OPPORTUNITY FOR
6 TRANSIT TO FOR THE FIRST TIME HIGH-OCCUPANCY TRAVEL
7 OPPORTUNITIES.

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN:** HOW DO YOU MEASURE THAT? IS IT X NUMBER OF
10 PEOPLE? MORE PEOPLE ON BUS DOES THAT OFFSET THIS?

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH, AND WE'RE PRICING THE EXISTING LANE. YOU
13 WILL PAY A PRICE TO DRIVE IN THE NON-HOV LANES. SO THE
14 COMBINATION, IT'S VERY SIMILAR TO, SORT OF, THE TOLLING
15 STRATEGIES WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT IN THE PLAN. IT'S NOT
16 EXACTLY -- YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT AN EXPRESS LANE. IT'S NOT A
17 BRIDGE. BUT IT'S OFFERING TRANSIT OPPORTUNITIES.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** THESE DIFFERENT THINGS, AND
20 MODE SHIFT, SO THEREFORE THAT'S THE REDUCTION?

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CORRECT. AND THE RELIABILITY OF THAT LANE.

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** REBECCA?

2

3 **REBECCA LONG:** THANKS, CHAIR CANEPA. REALLY APPRECIATE THIS
4 CONVERSATION AND IT ILLUSTRATES THE DIVERSITY OF VIEWS, AND OF
5 SUBREGIONS IN TERMS OF HOW PEOPLE TRAVEL. AND I'LL ALSO JUST
6 ACKNOWLEDGE SOME VERY IMPORTANT STAKEHOLDERS HAVE ARTICULATED
7 CONCERNS ABOUT THIS. BECAUSE THE WAY WE FRAMED IT, TO DATE, IS
8 REALLY NOT HAVING HIGHWAY WIDENING, BUT DO ALLOW HOV TO
9 EXPRESS LANE CONVERSION WHICH SOMETIMES DOES INDUCE VMT. SO, I
10 THINK WHAT WOULD REALLY BE MAYBE A GOOD PATH FORWARD IS FOR US
11 TO TAKE THIS FEEDBACK, LOOK AT THE FEEDBACK FROM THE LETTER
12 AND REFINE OUR APPROACH SO THAT IT'S CLEAR WHAT WE'RE
13 RECOMMENDING TO SENATOR WIENER AND BRING THAT BACK TO THE
14 COMMISSION AND SO THAT WE CAN KIND OF MOVE FORWARD TODAY AND
15 DIGEST IT MORE WITH A LITTLE BIT MORE TIME. IF THAT PLEASES
16 THE COMMITTEE.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT SOUND PLEASING. [LAUGHTER] SO, WITH
19 THAT, WE'RE GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. MR. CASTRO?

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. THERE WERE TWO LETTERS
22 SUBMITTED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. ONE FROM HAROLD
23 FINLEY, THE OTHER FROM SPUR AND NUMEROUS OTHER SIGNATORIES.
24 THESE WERE POSTED ONLINE AND E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS.
25 THERE ARE THREE PUBLIC SPEAKERS WHO HAVE SUBMITTED CARDS FOR



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 IN-PERSON. AND WE HAVE EIGHT -- NINE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.
2 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** A MINUTE, PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES. SO, THE TIME IS ONE MINUTE. OUR FIRST
7 SPEAKER. THE IN-PERSON FOLKS CAN LINE UP. CHARLES LAVERY, ONE
8 MINUTE, PLEASE. GO AHEAD.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR CANEPA. VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN.
11 CHARLIE LAVERY WITH THE ENGINEERS, LOCAL THREE. WE PARTNER
12 WITH COMMUNITIES OTHER AND LABOR UNIONS TO SUPPORT MEASURES
13 THAT WILL FUND TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE WE NEED BRINGING
14 A LOT OF PEOPLE POWER ENERGY AND RESOURCES TO A CAMPAIGN.
15 EXCITED AT THE PROSPECT OF A ROBUST REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
16 REVENUE MEASURE. HAPPY TO SEE KEY PROVISIONS OF THE
17 PRESENTATION A GOAL TO DEFER RECOMMENDATION HOW FUNDS WILL BE
18 SHARED AMONG FUNDING CATEGORIES TO ALLOW MORE ENGAGEMENT WITH
19 STAKEHOLDERS THIS IS A CRITICAL MEASURE TO PASS AND I BELIEVE
20 IT MUST INCLUDE INVESTMENT IN PROJECTS THAT WILL DELIVER
21 MULTI-MODAL MOBILITIES OPTIONS FOR ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS
22 INCLUDING CONNECTIVITY AT LOCAL REGIONAL AND STATE LEVEL
23 RESILIENCY ENERGY TRANSITION AND CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION. I
24 RECOGNIZE THAT THIS INVESTMENT NEEDS.

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TIME.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** -- WITH FUNDING AND EQUITY VALUE OF CONNECTING ALL
4 BAY AREA COMMUNITIES WITH ECONOMIC ACADEMIC AND SOCIAL
5 OPPORTUNITY LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUED ENGAGEMENT AND GETTING
6 BEHIND A MEASURE THAT CAN PASS.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR CANEPA AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS.
11 SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR. SPUR SUPPORTS THE PROPOSED OUTLINE
12 FOR LEGISLATION ENABLING A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE
13 THAT WILL SUPPORT AND TRANSFORM OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. WE
14 APPRECIATE THE SIGNIFICANT WORK OF THE COMMITTEE AND MTC STAFF
15 TO LEAD THIS PROCESS OVER THE PAST YEAR. WE ARE PARTICULARLY
16 SUPPORTIVE OF THE FLEXIBLE APPROACH BEING RECOMMENDED WITH
17 REGARD TO KEY PROVISIONS IN THE LEGISLATION, AND ARE
18 ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THE INCLUSION OF POTENTIAL PROVISION
19 RELATED TO A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT
20 MANDATE. ONE AREA WHERE WE ARE NOT SUPPORTIVE OF FLEXIBILITY
21 HOWEVER RELATES TO ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT OF PROJECTS TO BE
22 FUNDED. WE'RE IN THE MIDST OF A CLIMATE CRISIS ON THIS PLANET
23 AND CANNOT SUPPORT FUNDING OF PROJECTS THAT INCREASE VMT AND
24 GHG EMISSIONS. IF THIS PROCESS ADVANCES WE OTHER AND
25 SIGNATORIES TO THE LETTER IN YOUR PACKET URGE TO THE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 COMMITTEE, FULL COMMISSION, AND LEGISLATURE TO REMAIN FIRM IN

2 --

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TIME.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** -- ENSURING THE [INDISCERNIBLE] IS NOT USED FOR
7 HIGHWAY EXPANSION.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER JOSH.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. JOSH, NORTHERN CALIFORNIA
12 LABORERS UNION AND OUR 35,000 MEMBERS. APPRECIATE CHAIR CANEPA
13 AND THE COMMITTEE HONING IN ON A BALANCED REGIONAL
14 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT HAS RESOURCES NECESSARY TO SUPPORT
15 THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS FISCAL CLIFF WHILE ALSO INVESTING IN
16 OUR TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE. WE KNOW THAT POLLING SHOWS
17 THAT A TRANSIT ONLY MEASURE HAS ZERO CHANCE OF PASSING AT THE
18 BALLOT. TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE STRUGGLING AS 4% OF BAY AREA
19 COMMUTERS RELY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT ACCORDING TO MTC'S 2023 VITAL
20 SIGNS REPORT. THE REST OF BAY AREA COMMUTERS AND EV DRIVERS ON
21 ROADS AND HIGHWAYS NEED JOB GENERATING INVESTMENTS AND
22 TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECTS TO HAVE A REALISTIC CHANCE OF PASSING
23 THIS MEASURE AND MAKE THE CASE TO GET OUT OF CARS AND INTO
24 TRANSIT. TO BETTER ARTICULATE THIS BALANCE, WE LOOK AT
25 ATTACHMENT C, WHICH IS THE VISION STATEMENT. WE WOULD



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 ENCOURAGE BRINGING BACK THE TERMS "INFRASTRUCTURE AND
2 ACCOUNTABILITY." WE KNOW THOSE CONCEPTS ARE TOP OF MIND OF
3 VOTERS. THEY WERE IN THE PREVIOUS DRAFT AND HAVE BEEN REMOVED.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER IS AMY BETH WILLIS. GO AHEAD,
7 PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS AMY BETH WILLIS, AND I AM HERE
14 WITH SAVE THE BAY. WE'RE A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
15 TRANSPORTATION, A BROAD BASED COALITION FIGHTING FOR
16 ACCESSIBLE, AFFORDABLE AND SAFE PUBLIC TRANSIT FOR THE BAY. AS
17 A REGIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATION WE SUPPORT FUNDING
18 PUBLIC TRANSIT AND REDUCE POLLUTION, TRASH, AND IMPROVE AIR
19 QUALITY TO CREATE A HEALTHY BAY FOR ALL OF US. WE WANT TO
20 THANK MTC FOR KEEPING PRIORITIES IN THE FINAL BILL AND
21 ESPECIALLY KEEPING IN THE PROPOSAL NO RATE CAPES SO THE
22 REGIONAL MEASURE CAN RAISE 8 BILLION REGIONALLY, AND INCREASE
23 RESOURCES AND MUST KEEP A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF ARE TRANSIT
24 OPERATIONS IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE WE INCREASE TRANSIT SERVICE.
25 THANK YOU.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS DARTON ITO,
3 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS
6 DARTON, AND I AM SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE SAN FRANCISCO
7 IMPROVE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY. TODAY NEARLY HALF A MILLION
8 TRIPS ARE BEING TAKEN ON MUNI EVERY DAY. WE ARE PROUD THAT
9 DESPITE OUR FINANCIAL CHALLENGES WE'RE BRINGING BACK RIDERS
10 WITH 2/3 OF CUSTOMERS RATING SERVICES GOOD OR EXCELLENT. STATE
11 FUNDING HAS BOUGHT US TIME HOWEVER THE FINANCIAL SITUATION
12 FACING THE REGION REMAINS SERIOUS. IN 2026 THE REGION'S
13 TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALL IS ESTIMATED TO REACH 700 MILLION
14 LONG-TERM SOLUTION IS NEEDED SO WE DON'T FIND OURSELVES FACING
15 DEVASTATING SERVICE CUTS IN A FEW SHORT YEARS THAT WILL HURT
16 OR VULNERABLE POPULATIONS AND UNDERMINE THE REGION 53 ECONOMIC
17 GROWTH. WE NEED TO ENCOURAGE A STABLE ONGOING SOURCE OF
18 FUNDING TO ACHIEVE OUR SHARED VISION OF A THRIVING BAY AREA
19 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. WE WANT TO THANK YOU AND YOUR STAFF
20 FOR YOUR ONGOING PARTNERSHIP AND LEADERSHIP AND WE STRONGLY
21 URGE YOUR SUPPORT FOR THE PROPOSAL BEFORE YOU TODAY. THANK
22 YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER IS MAINLY ON. GO AHEAD,
25 PLEASE?



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** MANNY LEON FOR CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS. TRANSIT
3 FUNDING CHALLENGES IN THE BAY AREA WILL EXPERIENCE IN COMING
4 YEARS WE HAVE CONCERNS ALLIANCE SEES NEED FOR MEASURE TO BE
5 BALANCED IN ALL CATEGORIES FROM THE STATE REPRESENTING
6 TRANSIT, HIGHLIGHTS MINOR REFERENCES TO EXPENDITURES, GRADE
7 SEPARATIONS. THIS DOES NOT SOUND LIKE A MEASURE FOR THE BAY
8 AREA TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. WE KNOW FOR A FACT A NUMBER OF BAY
9 AREA RESIDENTS WILL CONTINUE TO REMAIN MOTORISTS NO MATTER
10 WHAT WE KNOW REMOTE WORK HAS CHANGED COMMUTE PATTERNS FOR
11 MANY. STATES OF CURRENT VEHICLE ELECTRIFICATION STRATEGY TO --
12 [INDISCERNIBLE] CLIMATE CRISIS WILL NOT REDUCE VEHICLES ON THE
13 ROAD WE ASK FOR A BALANCED APPROACH MOVING FORWARD AND WE'RE
14 HAPPY TO WORK WITH THE COMMISSION AND STAFF MOVING FORWARD.
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ALIX WALKER. GO AHEAD,
18 PLEASE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR CANEPA AND MEMBERS. ALIX WALKER,
21 LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS MANAGER AT BART. I WANT TO ASSOCIATE
22 MYSELF WITH THE COMMENTS FOR MY COLLEAGUES AT SFMTA, I LOOK
23 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU. I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR
24 ENGAGEMENT THEY HAVE BEEN HAVING WITH OPERATORS AND
25 STAKEHOLDERS AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MTC



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 STAFF AND LEADERSHIP PUTTING TOGETHER A PACKAGE THAT WILL
2 ADDRESS NOT ONLY FUNDING ISSUES, AND ALSO TRANSFORM OUR
3 SYSTEM. LOOKING FORWARD, NOW THAT WE HAVE A BILL INTRODUCED I
4 WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION AND STAFF FOR WORK THEY HAVE DONE
5 AND LOOKING FORWARD TO LANGUAGE IN PRINT AND PUTTING A MEASURE
6 ON THE BALLOT AND PASSING IT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS PETER STRAUSS.
11 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON PETER STRATUS FROM SAN
14 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND PART OF VOICES. I WANT TO
15 ACKNOWLEDGE AND COMMEND REBECCA AND STAFF FOR THE PROPOSAL
16 THEY PUT BEFORE AND YOU HOPE THAT IT HAS YOUR ENTHUSIASTIC
17 SUPPORT. I SUPPORT MAXIMIZING FLEXIBILITY AT THE LEVEL OF THE
18 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION WHICH IS WHAT THIS IS. WE'LL HAVE A
19 LOT OF THOSE DEBATES REGIONALLY AFTERWARDS. SO LONG AS IT
20 EMPHASIZES THE IMPORTANCE EVER FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
21 WE APPRECIATE THE REMOVAL OF THE UPPER LIMIT, UPPER CAPS ON
22 RATES. WE HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO RAISE \$2 BILLION IF NECESSARY.
23 AND THAT IS NECESSARY FOR TRANSIT NEEDS IN THE AREA. WE
24 SUPPORT THE INCLUSION OF PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES, AND,
25 LASTLY, WE SUPPORT THE INCLUSION OF RIDER ORIENTED LANGUAGE,



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, SUCH AS INCLUDING SAFETY AND RELIABILITY IN THE
2 TEXT. THANK YOU, AND, AGAIN, WE ARE DUE TO SUPPORT THIS
3 ENTHUSIASTICALLY.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS JONATHON
6 KASS. GO AHEAD, PLEASE. JONATHON KASS? GO AHEAD.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS JONATHON KASS ONE OF THE
9 PEOPLE WHO HELPED COORDINATE THE COALITION LETTER YOU RECEIVED
10 OBJECTING TO THE IDEA THAT MTC MIGHT FUND EXPANSION PROJECTS
11 THROUGH THIS REVENUE MEASURE. WE ALL KNOW THE URGENCY AND
12 IMMENSE RESOURCE REQUIREMENTS TO HELP TRANSIT SURVIVE AND
13 THRIVE, TO PROMOTE SUCCESSFUL TRAVEL DEMAND MANAGEMENT AND
14 ENSURE WALKING AND BIKING BECOMES AN OPTION FOR MANY BAY AREA
15 RESIDENTS. THIS NOT A REVENUE SOURCE FOR ROADWAY CAPACITY
16 INVESTMENT EXPANSION INVESTMENTS NOT ONLY DO THESE PROJECTS
17 SUCK REVENUE FROM INVESTMENTS THAT HELP ADDRESS OUR CLIMATE
18 AND CONGESTION CHALLENGES, THESE HIGHWAY PROJECTS USUALLY MAKE
19 THESE CHALLENGES WORSE. SO LET'S NOT FUND THEM. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS MAX SEGALL.
22 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS MAX SIEGEL. I'M WITH SCC FOR
25 TRANSIT WE'RE A SANTA CLARA COUNTY TRANSIT ADVOCACY GROUP. I'M



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 CALLING IN TO SUPPORT THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND I WANT TO
2 HIGHLIGHT MAHAN'S COMMENTS REGARDING RETURN TO SOURCE TO SANTA
3 CLARA COUNTY. WE HAVE SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT NEEDS HERE TODAY AND
4 IT WOULD BE VERY DIFFICULT FOR TOURS CONVINCED OUR NEIGHBORS TO
5 VOTE FOR THIS MEASURE IF A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT DOESN'T RETURN
6 TO COUNTY. I ALSO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT VTA HAS ALREADY
7 SUPPORTING PART OF THE FINANCIAL NEEDS OF BART AS IT RELATES
8 TO THE SANTA CLARA PORTION. AS WE'RE OBLIGATED TO, AND THAT
9 SHOULD ALSO BE INCLUDED IN ANY, SORT OF, FUNDING ALLOCATION.
10 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS EMILY
13 LOPEZ. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR CANEPA AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS.
16 EMILY LOPEZ WITH BAY AREA COUNCIL. SO WHILE WE END THE VALUE
17 OF KEEPING THE EXPENDITURE PLAN CATEGORY FLEXIBLE FOR THE
18 PURPOSES OF ENABLING LEGISLATION WE BELIEVE THE EXPENDITURE
19 PLAN THAT GOES TO THE BALLOT MUST BE BALANCED. WE CERTAINLY
20 NEED MORE TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUE TO SIGNIFICANTLY IMPROVE
21 OUR TRANSIT SERVICES BUT POLLING SHOWS VOTERS WANT TO SEE ROAD
22 AND HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS TOO. THE VAST MAJORITY OF BAY AREA
23 RESIDENTS DEPEND ON CARS TO MOVE AROUND OUR REGION WHETHER WE
24 LIKE IT OR NOT. SO A BALANCED PLAN THAT INCLUDES TRANSIT
25 OPERATING, TRANSIT CAPITAL AND ROAD HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS IS



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 OUR BEST BET FOR PASSING A MEASURE AT THE BALLOT. WE LOOK
2 FORWARD TO WORK WITH YOU IN THIS PROCESS AS IT MOVES THROUGH
3 THE LEGISLATURE AND ON THE TDM PROPOSAL TO FIGURE OUT WHAT
4 WORKS BEST FOR THE COMMUTERS AND ACHIEVE THE MOTION AND ALSO
5 IDENTIFY IS FEASIBLE FOR THE EMPLOYERS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN, FRIENDS EVER CALTRAIN AND PART OF
10 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO THANK THE
11 COMMISSION AND STAFF FOR A GOOD PROPOSAL. URGING APPROVAL
12 INCLUDING NO CAP TO ALLOW FOR FUNDING TO MAINTAIN AND IMPROVE
13 TRANSIT, AS EXPECTED, AND ALLOW FOR FLEXIBLE CATEGORIES TO
14 ALLOW FOR PUBLIC FEEDBACK, STRONG NETWORK MANAGEMENT TO ENABLE
15 THAT COORDINATED SERVICES THAT VOTERS WANT, AND IN SUPPORT OF
16 THE LETTER FOR A MEASURE THAT HELPS ACHIEVE OUR CLIMATE GOALS
17 AND NOT GO IN THE OPPOSITE DIRECTION. REGARDING RETURN TO
18 SOURCE. SOME AMOUNT OF THAT IS NEEDED FOR A MEASURE TO APPEAR
19 FAIR TO VOTERS. BUT A FULL RETURN TO SOURCE, 100%, WILL NOT
20 ALLOW US TO ACHIEVE THOSE COORDINATION GOALS. WE CAN'T TAKE
21 HUMP TEE DUMP TEE AND PUT HIM BACK TOGETHER AGAIN.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER.

24



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I MANAGE GOVERNMENT REGULATORY AFFAIRS FOR
2 THE WATER EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AGENCY SAN
3 FRANCISCO BAY FERRY SERVICES WE RECOMMEND FROM THE TRANSIT
4 TRANSFORMATION PLAN IMPROVE COORDINATION, WE URGE SUPPORT OF
5 THIS ITEM SO WE CAN WORK WITH STAKEHOLDERS TO SUPPORT A PLAN
6 THAT HAS AFFORDABLE RELIABLE SEAMLESS TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
7 THAT PROVIDES FREQUENCY PEOPLE NEED TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE
8 COMPETITIVE THAN DRIVING. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NEXT SPEAKER IS JAMES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JAMES, HERE REPRESENTING SOUTH BAY YIMBY
13 AND WE ARE A MEMBER OF THE VOICES COALITION AND WE WANT TO
14 EXPRESS SUPPORT FOR THIS REGIONAL MEASURE INCLUDING, AND AS
15 OTHERS HAVE NOTED, STRONG FOCUS ON TRANSIT OPERATIONS. WE HAVE
16 SOME WONDERFUL PROJECTS BEFORE US IN SOUTH BAY BETWEEN
17 CALTRAIN AND ELECTRIFICATION AND MODERNIZATION AS WELL AS BART
18 EXTENSION AND FUTURE LIGHT RAIL EXTENSIONS THAT WILL BENEFIT
19 GREATLY FROM OPERATIONS FUNDING AND FROM FUNDING FOR THE BUSES
20 THAT PARTICIPATE IN THAT NETWORK. AS A HOUSING ORGANIZATION WE
21 [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR AND NEED SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASED HOUSING
22 IN THE BAY AREA AND WITHOUT INCREASED TRANSIT SERVICE WE WILL
23 NOT BE ABLE TO ACCOMMODATE GROWTH EFFECTIVELY AND OUR CITIES
24 WITH VISION ZERO GOALS, SUSTAINABILITY GOALS, CANNOT
25 ACCOMMODATE ADDITIONAL CARS ON THE ROAD SO WE NEED EVERY OUNCE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 OF FUNDING WE CAN TO IMPROVE TRANSIT, BIKING, WALKING, ET
2 CETERA. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER WITH
5 THE NUMBER ENDING IN 0856. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON I'M SARAH GREENWALD -- JUST A
8 MOMENT. LET ME TURN ON -- SPEAKING FOR 350 SAN FRANCISCO. WE
9 WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF FOR INCLUDING NO RATE CAPS IN THE
10 PROPOSAL. SO THE MEASURE CAN RAISE THE NEEDED 2 BILLION
11 ANNUALLY. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT YOUR INCLUSION OF PROGRESSIVE
12 REVENUE SOURCES AND PLEASE KEEP THOSE SOURCES IN THE BILL. WE
13 STILL THINK THE LEGISLATION NEEDS TO SET ASIDE SIGNIFICANT
14 MINIMUM AMOUNT OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN ORDER TO
15 ENSURE WE CAN MAINTAIN AND INCREASE TRANSIT SERVICE. THAT'S
16 WITH REGARD TO HIGHWAY EXPANSION. WE NEED TRANSIT. AND THANK
17 YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AT THIS CRITICAL TIME. WE NEED BOLD
18 STEPS LIKE YOURS TO BUILD THE ACCESS AND I BELIEVE AFFORDABLE
19 AND ABUNDANT AND SAFE PUBLIC TRANSIT THAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS
20 THE CLIMATE CRISIS POST HASTE. THAT'S IT THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS MONICA
23 MALLON. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

24



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** MONICA MALLON ON BEHALF MYSELF AS A SANTA CLARA
2 COUNTY RESIDENT AND TRANSIT RIDER, SUPPORTIVE OF THIS ENABLING
3 LEGISLATION BUT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE RETURN TO SOURCE
4 ELEMENT TO THIS SO COMMUNITIES CAN RECEIVE THEIR FAIR SHARE
5 WE'RE NOT FACING A FISCAL CLIFF VTA IS RUNNING 1990 SERVICE
6 LEVELS. THERE IS SIGNIFICANT NEED FOR TRANSIT OPERATION
7 FUNDING FOR VTA. VTA CURRENTLY HAS SOME OF THE STRONGEST BUS
8 RIDE RECOVERY IN THE NATION. PROVIDES RESIDENTS --
9 [INDISCERNIBLE] PLEASE CONSIDER RETURN TO SOURCE ELEMENT.
10 THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER. OUR LAST
13 SPEAKER, SARAH GREENWALD HAS HER HAND RAISED BUT SHE ALREADY
14 SPOKE. LAST SPEAKER IS WARREN RELEASE WELLS.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** WARREN WELLS, VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I
17 WANT TO SPEAK BRIEFLY TO THE IMPORTANCE OF TRANSIT BICYCLE
18 PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE FOR DRIVERS BEFORE THE PANDEMIC MORE
19 PEOPLE WENT UNDER THE BAY BRIDGE DURING RUSH HOUR THAN OVER IT
20 HARD TO IMAGINE IT WORSE FOR BAY AREA DRIVERS. DRIVERS DEPEND
21 ON ALL THE PEOPLE WHO DO NOT DRIVE. WE HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THAT
22 INVESTING IN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS A WAY TO GET PEOPLE
23 AROUND, EVEN THOUGH PEOPLE WHO ARE FORCED TO DRIVE BECAUSE OF
24 THEIR WORK, BECAUSE OF WHERE THEY LIVE, BECAUSE OF THEIR
25 PERSONAL MOBILITY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO OTHER PUBLIC MEMBERS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** APPRECIATE THE PUBLIC COMMENTS. AND MY
6 COLLEAGUE'S COMMENTS. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO COMMENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** SURE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE STAFF IS NOT LEAVING
13 THAT THERE IS A CONSENSUS THAT THERE IS NO HIGHWAY EXPANSION.
14 I FIND IT AMUSING ALL THESE GROUPS SAYING NO HIGHWAY
15 EXPANSION. THEY'RE THE ONES ADVOCATING FOR EQUITY AND
16 FAIRNESS, HELP OUR LOW-INCOME, DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES, AND
17 JUST BLANKLY SAY NO HIGHWAY EXPANSION. NO HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS
18 WE'RE DOING RIGHT NOW ARE HELPING THOSE VERY PEOPLE. SO, I
19 DON'T SUPPORT THAT. AND I DON'T WANT STAFF TO LEAVE WITH THAT
20 AND IF YOU NEED AN ANSWER ON THAT IT SHOULD COME BEFORE THE
21 COMMISSIONS. AND 37 WAS BROUGHT UP. WE HAVE A LOT OF LOW-
22 INCOME DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES USING THAT CORRIDOR, AND THEY
23 HAVE TO SIT IN 2, 3 HOURS OF CONGESTION. NO QUALITY OF LIFE
24 FOR THEM. AND YOU JUST ARE THROWING AWAY A WHOLE GENERATION
25 AND YOU ARE WONDERING WHY PEOPLE CAN'T AFFORD TO LIVE HERE,



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THIS IS ANOTHER EXAMPLE OF IT. THERE NEED TO BE EXCEPTIONS.
2 THERE ARE PLACES WE DON'T WANT EXPANSION. THE MAJORITY OF
3 PEOPLE YOU'RE GOING TO ASK TO VOTE FOR THIS THING AND YOU NEED
4 THEIR SUPPORT, YOU TELL THEM WE'RE NOT GOING TO GIVE ANYTHING
5 AND YOU'RE GOING TO SIT IN MORE TRAFFIC. IT DOESN'T MAKE
6 SENSE. IT HAS TO BE A BALANCED PLAN. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE,
7 IF STAFF NEEDS CLARITY ON IT BRING IT BACK TO US AND LET US
8 VOTE ON IT. DON'T LEAVE THINK THAT'S THE DIRECTION OF THIS
9 COMMISSION.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** LET'S GO TO MR. FREMIER. JOSEFOWITZ.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I'M NOT SAYING THERE
14 SHOULD BE NO ROAD INVESTMENTS WE HAVE MAINTENANCE AROUND POT
15 HOLES MAKING OUR ROADS SAFER, THAT'S CERTAINLY AN IMPORTANT
16 PART OF MAKING OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM WORK, MAKING IT WORK
17 FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE DRIVING. SO, I DON'T WANT -- YOU KNOW, I
18 WAS -- I FIND IT PROBLEMATIC YOUR CHARACTERIZATION THAT WE'RE
19 GOING TO BE DOING -- THE POSITION THAT I AND MAYBE OTHERS --
20 I'M JUST SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, THAT I WOULD BE TAKING IS THAT
21 WE SHOULD HAVE NO ROAD INVESTMENTS AT ALL. I WANTED TO CLARIFY
22 THAT. I DIDN'T HEAR THAT WAS CONSENSUS ON THIS BODY AROUND
23 THIS ISSUE EITHER. SO I ALSO HOPED THAT WE CAN KIND OF BRING
24 IT BACK FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION. BECAUSE I THINK, YOU KNOW,
25 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE TRY AND FIND A WAY FORWARD. BECAUSE



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 THIS MEASURE IS EXTREMELY UNLIKELY TO PASS GIVEN THE CURRENT
2 POLLING NUMBERS. AND IF THERE IS A MASSIVE SPLIT ON THIS
3 COMMISSION ABOUT WHAT ARE THE FUNDAMENTAL ELEMENTS OF THIS
4 MEASURE, THEN WHICHEVER WAY, WHOEVER WINS THAT SPLIT, THE
5 MEASURE IS NOT GOING TO PASS ANYWAY. SO IT WILL BE A PERIODIC
6 VICTORY. I DIDN'T WANT TO LEAVE ANYBODY WITH THE WRONG
7 IMPRESSION AND I AGREE WE SHOULD BE HAVING MORE DISCUSSIONS
8 ABOUT THIS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I READ THE LETTER IT'S CLEAR. NO HIGHWAY
11 EXPANSION. THERE HAS TO BE EXCEPTIONS, A PLACE WHERE IT DOES
12 BENEFIT THE ENVIRONMENT, IT DOES BENEFIT THE PEOPLE USING THE
13 CORRIDOR. THERE ARE EXCEPTIONS. IT SHOULD BE PART OF THIS
14 MEASURE. IT SHOULDN'T SAY, WELL, ALL HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS OR
15 IMPROVEMENTS, SOMEBODY ELSE HAS TO PAY FOR IT. GET THE MONEY
16 FROM SOMEWHERE ELSE. IT HAS TO BE BALANCED. A GOOD APPROACH. I
17 AGREE WITH YOU COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ THAT WE SHOULDN'T HAVE
18 HIGHWAY EXPANSION EVERYWHERE THERE ARE PLACE US DON'T WANT IT
19 IT'S NOT GOING TO WORK, AND IT DOESN'T WORK TO OUR ADVANTAGE
20 WITH THE GREENHOUSE GAS GOALS WE HAVE SET. BUT THERE ARE PLACE
21 WHERE IS IT IS NEEDED AND IT HELPS TRANSIT. AND YOU HAVE HEARD
22 ME SAY THIS BEFORE AND I'LL SAY IT AGAIN, IS THAT I'M ALWAYS
23 AMUSED THAT OUR IMPROVEMENTS ON THE I80, 680 INTERCHANGE THAT
24 PEOPLE OPPOSE IT SHOULDN'T BE DOING THAT IMPROVEMENT BUT YET
25 WHEN WE DID IT THE EXPRESS BUS SAVED 15 TO 20 MINUTES FOR



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 COMMUTERS. BECAUSE NOW THE BUS CAN GO THROUGH THE EXPRESS LANE
2 PORTION OF IT. SOME IMPROVEMENTS DO HELP TRANSIT. SO, YOU
3 CAN'T BLANKETLY SAY -- AND I HEAR YOU'RE SAYING YOU'RE NOT
4 SAYING THAT. AND I JUST DIDN'T WANT TO LEAVE STAFF WITH THE
5 IMPRESSION THAT THAT'S WHERE THIS COMMISSION IS.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** SORRY. LET ME BE CLEAR. I AM SAYING WE SHOULD
8 [INDISCERNIBLE] HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS. I'M NOT SAYING WE SHOULD
9 NOT INVEST IN-ROADS TO MAKE THEM --

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. WELL.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK WE DO DISAGREE WITH THAT,
14 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THEN, I DON'T WANT STAFF TO LEAVE. AND YOUR
17 DIRECTION IS THE WAY THIS COMMISSION WANTS TO GO.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING WHAT ARE THE
20 PROJECTS THAT WE SHOULD NOT BE MOVING FORWARD WITH, THAT ARE
21 LEGACY HIGHWAY PROJECTS THAT ARE NO LONGER APPROPRIATE.
22 BECAUSE I THINK IN MY EXPERIENCE AND IN THE EXPERIENCE OF MANY
23 OTHER COMMISSIONS, OF OTHERS WHO WORKED ON THESE ISSUES IT'S
24 LIKE, WELL, MY PROJECT SHOULD BE THE EXCEPTION. AND THEN
25 EVERYBODY IS, LIKE, WELL, MY PROJECT SHOULD BE THE EXCEPTION



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 TOO, AND BEFORE YOU KNOW IT EVERY PROJECT IS THE EXCEPTION AND
2 WE HAVEN'T CHANGED HOW WE ARE MOVING FORWARD IN REGION IN
3 TERMS OF SPENDING OUR TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS. AND I DON'T KNOW
4 MUCH ABOUT HIGHWAY 37. OBVIOUSLY NOT NEARLY AS MUCH AS YOU DO.
5 SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO BE OUTED ABOUT THAT, I THINK WE NEED TO
6 UNDERSTAND IF WE'RE JUST GOING TO MAKE EXCEPTIONS FOR EACH OF
7 THE EXISTING HIGHWAY PROJECTS THAT ARE GOING ON, THEN WE --
8 THE EXCEPTION IS THE RULE. AND I THINK THAT'S A, YOU KNOW,
9 THAT WOULD PUT US ABSOLUTELY IN THE WRONG PATH TO DEALING
10 WITH, YOU KNOW, OUR CLIMATE EMISSIONS, OUR AIR POLLUTION, IT
11 WOULD BE ADDING -- IT WOULD BE DEEPLY PROBLEMATIC, AND,
12 ULTIMATELY, THESE HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS INCREASE CONGESTION THEY
13 MIGHT SOLVE IT IN A PARTICULAR PLACE BUT THEY MOVE IT DOWN THE
14 ROAD. I WAS LOOKING AT THE EIR FOR HIGHWAY 37. I KNOW NOTHING
15 ABOUT IT, ANDY MENTIONED IT, SO I LOOK FORWARD TO READING, I'M
16 GOING TO HAVE DISCUSSION WITH YOU AFTERWARDS SO YOU CAN
17 EXPLAIN IT, AND I THINK THIS IS AN IMPORTANT DISCUSSION TO
18 HAVE. AND I THINK THIS IS THE RIGHT FORUM TO HAVE IT. AND I
19 THINK WE NEED TO DECIDE WHAT DIRECTION WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING
20 IN.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. MR. PREMIER?

23

24 **ANDREW PREMIER:** YOU WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION FOR THE
25 CONVERSATION. I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT WE HAVE MADE QUITE A



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 BIT OF CONVERGENCE FROM WHERE WE STARTED A COUPLE OF MONTHS
2 AGO AND WE'RE PROPOSING BROAD GOALS AND FOCUS AREAS HERE
3 PRINCIPLES THAT CAN GO FORWARD TO GET ENABLING LEGISLATION
4 STARTED BUT WE HEARD A LOT OF INPUT AND WE'LL COME BACK FOR
5 MORE DISCUSSION AT THE COMMISSION AT THE END OF THE MONTH
6 HOPEFULLY REFLECTING DEBATE AS WELL AS OTHER SAYS WE HAVE BEEN
7 HAVING.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO MENTION IN THE VISION STATEMENT,
10 BAY AREA HAS A WORLD CLASS RELIABLE, I THOUGHT WE SAID WE
11 WEREN'T GOING TO USE THAT TERM HAS.

12

13 **REBECCA LONG:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, I THINK WHAT WE WERE
14 TRYING DO, REITERATE THAT A VISION STATEMENT IS WE'RE NOT
15 TRYING TO GO --

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WHY DIDN'T YOU SAY NEEDS? INSTEAD OF HAS.

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.
24 ROLL CALL PLEASE?

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THE MOTION MAHAN, SECOND SPERING. CHAIR
2 CANEPA?

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, V. CHAIR ABAG:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** AHN IS ONLINE BUT EIGHT LOCATE NOT POSTED.
11 SUPERVISOR CARLSON?

12

13 **KEN CARLSON:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ECKLUND? PAT AYE.

20

21 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE. I WANT TO ADD THE STATEMENT THAT I AGREE WE
22 NEED TO BE CAREFUL ON THE ROADWAY EXPANSION TO INCLUDE AREAS
23 WHERE IF WE'RE ENCOURAGING ELECTRIC CHARGERS AND ELECTRIC
24 VEHICLES, THEY NEED LANES TOO, AND I THINK THAT COMMENT THAT



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 WAS MADE EARLIER, BUT I JUST WANT TO REEMPHASIZE, IT HAS TO BE
2 VERY CAREFUL DISCUSSION. AND I DON'T KNOW IF WE'RE THERE YET.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. MAYOR MAHAN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOULTON PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NOACK?

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. ABSENT. RAMOS?

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TIEDEMANN?

23

24 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

25



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
5 AGENDA ITEM 3C, A PROPOSED FINAL 2024 MTC ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY
6 PROGRAM. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE
7 REPORT?

8

9 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM.
10 WE'RE REQUESTING THE COMMITTEE APPROVE THE FINAL 2024 MTC ABAG
11 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM. THIS IS A SLIGHTLY REVISED VERSION OF
12 WHAT YOU SAW IN NOVEMBER, 2023. THE CHANGES TO THE ADVOCACY
13 PROGRAM ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR ATTACHMENT A IN ITALICS AND
14 STRIKE THROUGH. THE MOST SUBSTANTIVE CHANGE IS THAT WE ADDED A
15 LITTLE BIT MORE MEAT TO THE BONES ON THE REVENUE MEASURE ITEM
16 THAT REALLY JUST HIGH-LEVEL REFLECTS THE CONVERSATION HAD YOU
17 TODAY AND THEN VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN, I WANTED -- SORRY -- VICE
18 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, I WANTED TO MAKE SURE TO FLAG FOR YOU THAT
19 THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM LEAVES ROOM FOR US TO SUPPORT, PLAY
20 DEFENSE AGAINST BUDGET CUTS TO HOUSING TRANSPORTATION CLIMATE.
21 WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO WE HAVE A
24 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE REFERRAL OF THE PROPOSED



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 FINAL 2024 MTC ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM TO THE COMMISSION
2 FOR APPROVAL?

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** SO MOVED. RAMOS.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE
9 BOARD? YES, COMMISSIONER ECKLUND?

10

11 **PAT EKLUND:** I JUST WANTED TO REEMPHASIZE, ESPECIALLY THE LAST
12 TWO COMMENTS ON THE HOUSING, I THINK THAT WE REALLY NEED TO
13 FOCUS ON TRYING TO ADVOCATE FOR MONEY FOR CITIES AND COUNTIES
14 TO IMPLEMENT THEIR REGIONAL HOUSING NEED ELEMENTS, OR THE
15 HOUSING ELEMENTS. BECAUSE IF WE DON'T GET THOSE FUNDS, I DO
16 NOT THINK IT'S FAIR FOR US TO BE REQUIRED TO ACHIEVE THE
17 RHNA'S IF WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE GETTING ANY FUNDING TO DO
18 THAT. AND I DIDN'T SEE THAT SPECIFICALLY IN HERE. IT'S JUST A
19 RANGE OF STRATEGIES, TECHNICALITIES NEEDED, BUT NOT
20 NECESSARILY DIRECT FUNDING TO IMPLEMENT THE HOUSING ELEMENTS.
21 SO, JUST COMMENT FROM THE PEANUT GALLERY.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COUNCIL KANE?

24



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YES, THIS IS AGENDIZES FOR WHAT LOOKS LIKE TWO
2 SEPARATE MOTIONS HERE. SO I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY. ONE MOTION
3 TO BOTH BODIES. IT WAS UNCLEAR WITH THE MOTION WHO --

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** JUST TO CLARIFY, SO, THERE WAS THE
6 INFORMATION ITEM. IT WAS THE INFORMATION, THEN WHAT I THEN DID
7 IS WE WENT TO THE NEXT -- WHAT ARE YOU SUGGESTING WE DO
8 COUNSEL?

9

10 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YEAH. SO THE WAY THE MOTION WAS STATED, IT
11 DEPARTMENT STATE THAT IT WAS TO BOTH BODIES. SO I JUST WANTED
12 TO CLARIFY THE MOTION.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WHO WAS THE MAKER OF THE MOTION?

15

16 **BELIA RAMOS:** I WAS.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WHO IS I? SORRY. SUPERVISOR RAMOS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** AND YOU WERE SECOND.

23

24 **KATHLEEN KANE:** JUST WANT TO CLARIFY IT WAS GOING TO BOTH
25 BODIES.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** MOTION WAS TO BOTH BODIES.

3

4 **SUE NOACK:** SECOND. BOTH BODIES. JUST HELPING OUT HERE.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THIS IS AN OUT OF BODY EXPERIENCE.

7 [LAUGHTER] SEEING THERE ARE NO FURTHER COMMENTS FROM THE

8 COMMITTEE. FRED, I HAVE A FEELING WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR

11 THIS ITEM IN THE -- ONE MOMENT, AS I CHECK THE -- SORRY -- IN

12 THE ATTENDEE ROOM, THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE

13 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. AND NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. CAN I HAVE A ROLL CALL PLEASE?

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** ON THE MOTION BY RAMOS, SECOND BY NOACK.

18 CHAIR CANEPA?

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES. AHN IS AT A REMOTE LOCATION

25 NOT POSTED. CARLSON?



1

2 **KEN CARLSON:** AYE MA.

3

4 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NOACK?

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. SPERING?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** TIEDEMANN?

17

18 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
21 PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM
24 FOUR. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC
25 COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD. I WOULD ALSO ASK THAT IF
2 THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
3 TELECONFERENCE, WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM
4 ON TODAY AGENDA, TO PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE. DO WE
5 HAVE ANY COMMENTS?

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
8 FOR THIS ITEM. NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
9 ONE PERSON IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. I CAN
10 PROVIDE ONE MINUTE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ADINA LEVIN, GO
11 AHEAD, PLEASE.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. STANDING BETWEEN Y'ALL AND BREAK.
16 SO, BRIEFLY WANTED TO MAKE A COMMENT ABOUT HOUSING FUNDING AND
17 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING WITH REGARD TO WHAT RETURN TO SOURCE
18 MEANS. WITH HOUSING, EVERY HOME IS IN ONE LOCATION. WITH OUR
19 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, IT'S A NETWORK AND IT GETS PEOPLE FROM
20 PLACE TO PLACE. AND SOME OF THOSE PLACES CROSS JURISDICTIONS
21 AND AGENCIES. SO, THE AMOUNT OF RETURN TO SOURCE AND THE
22 NATURE OF RETURN TO SOURCE IS DIFFERENT FOR TRANSPORTATION,
23 BECAUSE WE ALSO NEED TO DELIVER THE ABILITY FOR PEOPLE TO GET
24 FROM PLACE TO PLACE, WHICH IS NOT MET BY SOMETHING THAT IS
25 100% LOCALLY CONSTRAINED EXPENDITURES.



JANUARY 12TH, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
3 ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC
6 ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD FRIDAY FEBRUARY 9TH,
7 2024 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN
8 FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA AND OTHER REMOTE LOCATIONS. ANY CHANGES
9 TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.

10 [ADJOURNED]

11



NTT

Broadcasting Government