

METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript



PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT

2 WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 7, 2026, 1:30 PM

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HAPPY NEW YEAR TO EVERYONE. I HOPE EVERYBODY
5 HAD GREAT HOLIDAYS, AND WELCOME BACK TO REALITY. SORRY.

6 [LAUGHTER] SORRY. [LAUGHTER] IT'S MY THIRD MEETING TODAY
7 ALREADY. SO. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS FIRST MEETING
8 OF THE PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT. WE'LL REFER TO
9 THIS MEETING BODY AS THE DISTRICT THROUGHOUT TODAY'S MEETING.
10 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON MTC WEB SITE REMOTE
11 PARTICIPANTS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HANDS
12 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON TO
13 SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE
14 LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
15 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. ITEM ONE ROLL CALL PLEASE. MAY WE
16 PLEASE HAVE ROLL CALL

17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR NOACK?

19

20 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.

21

22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOULTON-PETERS?

23

24 V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.

25

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. EXCUSE ME.

2 COMMISSIONER AHN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AMBUEHL IS ABSENT.

3 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN IS ABSENT.

4

5 **MYRNA MELGAR:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER BURT? CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING? GIACOPINI?

12

13 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

16

17 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE UPON COMMISSIONER LI?

18

19 **ANNA LEE:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THE ADDRESS AT THE LOCATION.

1

2 **MATT MAHAN:** 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET, SAN JOSE CALIFORNIA
3 MAYOR'S CONFERENCE ROOM.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU SO MUCH.

6

7 **MATT MAHAN:** IS THAT SPECIFIC ENOUGH? WE HAVE PLENTY OF SEATING
8 FOR ANYONE WHO WANTS TO JOIN.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER
11 MANFREE?

12

13 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN? COMMISSIONER
16 MELGAR? COMMISSIONER MILEY?

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE, AND I'M LOCATED AT 20980 CASTRO VALLEY
19 BOULEVARD, SUITE 250 IN CASTRO VALLEY IN ONE OF MY OFFICES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

5

6 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT. [SILENCE]

9

10 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** MADAM CHAIR, YOUR -- YOUR MICROPHONE.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE
13 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THANK YOU. MAKING THE FOLLOWING
16 ANNOUNCEMENT SHOULD THE DISTRICT ADOPT RESOLUTION NUMBER ONE
17 TODAY WE ANTICIPATE THAT EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
18 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO
19 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY THIS AMOUNT IS PROVIDED
20 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS
21 ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. NOW ITEM FOUR I'M SUPPOSED TO SAY
24 HAPPY NEW YEAR, BUT I ALREADY DID ALL THAT. SO WE'LL SKIP THE
25 CHAIR'S REPORT. [LAUGHTER] ITEM FIVE R5A PUBLIC TRANSIT

1 REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT RESOLUTION NUMBER 001. KATHLEEN WILL
2 YOU PRESENT THIS ITEM AND WELCOME BACK TO THE BOARDROOM
3 DISTRICT APPROVAL.

4

5 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THANK YOU CHAIR GOOD TO BE BACK IN-
6 PERSON AFTER A LONGER THAN I WISHED FOR HIATUS TO CONFIRM WE
7 DIDN'T HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CORRECT.

10

11 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** ALL RIGHT. SO THIS ITEM CAN BE QUICK
12 AS YOU KNOW THIS IS OUR FIRST MEETING OF THE PUBLIC TRANSIT
13 REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT IN ORDER TO DO BUSINESS AS THE
14 DISTRICT WE HAVE TO DO SOME STUFF AND THIS STUFF IN RESO ONE
15 ATTACHED TO YOUR AGENDA NOW FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO ARE HERE WHEN
16 WE INSTITUTED BAHFA THIS IS MUCH THE SAME PROCEDURE AS WE'RE
17 SET UPPING THE NEW ENTITIES YOU NEED TO ADOPT CERTAIN THINGS
18 FIRST WHICH IS THE PROCEDURES AS WITH BAHFA WE'RE HAVING YOU
19 ADOPT THE EXISTING MTC PROCEDURES THOSE ARE ALL THE SAME ONES
20 THAT ALL OF THE SISTER BOARD MEMBERSHIP USED SO BATA, BAIFA,
21 EVERYBODY USES, SAME PROCEDURES AND CONTINUITY OF OPERATIONS.
22 THAT'S A SUGGESTION HERE THERE IS ONE MINOR AMENDMENT TO THOSE
23 PROCEDURES THAT'S TO MAKE CLEAR THE AUTHORITY OF THE EXECUTIVE
24 COMMITTEE TAKE ACTIONS IF YOU NEED TO RESPOND IN REALTIME TO
25 SOMETHING THAT'S HAPPENING ON THE ELECTIONS CALENDAR THAT THE

1 EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE CAN DO THAT SO THAT WE DON'T MISS A
2 DEADLINE SOME OF WHICH COME UP ABRUPTLY DEPENDING ON HOW
3 THINGS ARE GOING WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT BECAUSE THEIR
4 STATUTORY WE DON'T MISS THEM IT'S ANTICIPATED THE FULL BOARD
5 WILL TAKE ACTION BUT IT'S A SAFETY WAVILY IN CASE THERE IS
6 STATUTORY DEADLINE THAT WE NEED TO HIT. WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE
7 THAT WE HAVE APPOINTED AN ELECTIONS OFFICIAL AND IT'S STAFF
8 SUGGESTION THAT YOU POINTS SECRETARY AND HEAD OF THE CLERK OF
9 THE BOARD KIMBERLY AWARD TO PERFORM THAT OFFICE IT'S ACTUALLY
10 STATUTORY AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE SOMEBODY IN THAT
11 SEAT SO THAT THEY CAN CARRY OUT THE DUTIES OF THAT JOB AND CAN
12 RESPOND IN REALTIME AGAIN AND ALSO WE'RE SUGGESTING THAT
13 ESSENTIALLY THE OFFICERS OF MTC BE APPOINTED AS THE OFFICERS
14 OF THE DISTRICT. SO, WITH THAT, IF ANYONE HAS ANY QUESTIONS,
15 HAPPY TO TAKE THEM, OR DISCUSSION.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY QUESTIONS? GINA?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** OH YEAH. OH SORRY. PAPAN --

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY. I'M WAY OUT --

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT'S OKAY APPOINTMENT OF THE OFFICERS FROM MTC
24 NOW O BECAUSE THIS IS -- ARE WE GETTING INTO THE 14 YEAR
25 THING? LIKE, WILL THAT CHANGE? AND WILL WE HAVE TO CHANGE

1 OFFICIALLY? AS THE COMMISSION CHANGES?

2

3 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** OH NO IT'S BY POSITION.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** POSITION EXACTLY.

6

7 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** IT'S NOT PERSONAL TO THE INCOUPLE
8 BENTS.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** GOT IT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WOULD BE REALLY OLD BY THE TIME 14 YEARS
13 WENT BY. SO, JUST SAYING. NO? ANY OTHER COMMENTS? NO? OKAY.
14 ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE
15 PUBLIC THAT ARE WISHING TO SPEAK?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
18 THIS ITEM. THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HERE TO SPEAK ON
19 THIS ITEM, MR. TOM WISE MILLER. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE
20 TO GIVE?

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** TWO MINUTES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOT IT. MR. WEISMILLER, TAP THE
25 MICROPHONE WHERE THAT ARROW IS. THERE YOU GO.

1

2 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONERS, MY NAME IS TOM WHEEZE MILLER, SAN
3 MATEO COUNTY HAVE BEEN A LONG TIME ARE THE THERE, I USE BART,
4 CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS EX-STIFFENSLY BEFORE I RETIRED. NOT SO MUCH
5 NOW. THREE THINGS, CONVENIENT I PREFER GETTING AROUND WITHOUT
6 DRIVING UNFORTUNATELY THESE OPPORTUNITIES ARE FEW. TWO, MY
7 WIFE AND I ARE RETIRED LIVING ON A FIXED INCOME AND INCREASING
8 OUR -- THE TAX BURDEN, IS TROUBLING. THREE. SUGGEST THIS BODY
9 ORGANIZE AS A PUBLIC TRANSFER -- NOT AS A PUBLIC TRANSIT
10 REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT, BUT ORGANIZE AS A COMMITTEE TO
11 FACILITATE PRIVATIZATION OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. FOR
12 EXAMPLE, JUAREZ MEXICO HAS A ROBUST TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
13 ORGANIZED BY ENTREPRENEURS. I BELIEVE ENTREPRENEURS WILL FIND
14 A WAY TO MEET TRANSPORTATION DEMANDS IN A MANNER THAT THE
15 PUBLIC WILL APPRECIATE AND AT A LOWER COST. I SUGGEST THIS
16 BODY CONSIDER PARTNERING WITH JUAREZ, MEXICO, AND OTHERS THAT
17 HAVE PRIVATELY OWNED BUS TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS. I SAY THIS
18 BECAUSE I DON'T BELIEVE THERE IS THE APPETITE TO PAY MORE
19 TAXES AND A PRIVATIZATION CAN BE MORE WELCOMING TO THE
20 COMMUNITY AND BETTER SERVED. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC
23 SPEAKERS AT THIS TIME.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. GREAT. DO I HAVE A MOTION?

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION ESTABLISHING THE PUBLIC TRANSIT
3 REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT STRUCTURE AND ADOPTING RULES AND
4 PROCEDURES PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE DIRECT RESOLUTION
5 NUMBER 001.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. CAN WE
10 HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER CANEPA P
13 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK IT WAS MELGAR.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PARDON ME. I'M SORRY.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HE WAS READY BUT IT WAS MELGAR.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M SORRY MUST BE OUT OF PRACTICE. THANK
22 YOU FOR THE CORRECTION. ROLL CALL VOTE. NOACK?

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

25

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA NOW PRESENT.

6

7 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AMBUEHL IS ABSENT.

10 ANDERSEN? ABSENT.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

19

20 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LI?

23

24 **ANNA LEE:** MAHAN? .

25

1 **TYLER MAYO:** .

2

3 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MANFREE?

6

7 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

18

19 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
22 PRESENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ITEM 5B CONSIDERATION OF A
25 BOARD PROPOSED PUBLIC TRANSIT REFINERY OF REVENUE MEASURE.

1 ANDY AND KATHLEEN, I BELIEVE YOU'RE GOING TO PRESENT ON THIS?

2

3 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YES CHAIR NOACK GOOD AFTERNOON BOARD MEMBERS
4 ANDREW FREMIER EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE DISTRICT I GUESS, SO
5 NOW THAT YOU HAVE TAKEN ACTION TO ESTABLISH THE DISTRICT
6 APPROVED CERTAIN RULES AND PROCEDURES THIS ITEM ALLOWS THE
7 DISTRICT BOARD TO CONSIDER WHETHER TO TAKE STEPS NECESSARY TO
8 PLACE A BOARD PROPOSED CONNECT BAY AREA BALLOT MEASURE
9 ON THE NOVEMBER 2026 BALLOT I'M GOING TO TAG TEAM KATHLEEN
10 PROVIDING A QUICK REFRESHER ON SB63 PROVISIONS REVIEWED WITH
11 THE COMMISSION AT THE DECEMBER MEETING THEN TURN IT OVER TO
12 KATHLEEN TO WALK YOU THROUGH IMPORTANT PROCEDURAL ELEMENTS AND
13 CONSIDERATIONS. AS A REMINDER THE LEGISLATURE ENACTED SB63 TO
14 CONNECT BAY AREA ACT WHICH AUTHORIZES A MEASURE TO BE PLACED
15 ON THE NOVEMBER 2026 BALLOT IN FIVE BAY AREA COUNTIES ALAMEDA
16 CONTRA COSTA SAN FRANCISCO SAN MATEO SANTA CLARA TO PREVENT
17 MAJOR SERVICE CUTS ON BART CALTRAIN SF MUNI AND AC TRANSIT THE
18 REVENUE MECHANISM IS A 14 YEAR SALES TAX WHICH WOULD GENERATE
19 APPROXIMATELY \$980 MILLION A YEAR AND THE TAX RATE IS ONE HALF
20 CENT IN FOUR COUNTIES AND FOUR COUNTIES \$0.01 IN SAN FRANCISCO
21 BEYOND TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING FOR THOSE FOUR OPERATORS THE
22 MEASURE WOULD PROVIDE FLEXIBLE FUNDING TO FOUR OF THE FIVE
23 COUNTIES THAT COULD BE SPENT ON TRANSIT OPERATING CAPITAL
24 NEEDS AND CAPITAL NEEDS IN LOCAL ROAD REPAIR ON ROADS SERVED
25 BY FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT. FURTHER THE MEASURE WOULD PROPOSE

1 FUNDING COMMITTED TO IMPROVING TRANSIT RIDER EXPERIENCE AND
2 IMPORTANT OVERSIGHT PROVISIONS THE CONNECT BAY AREA ACT SETS
3 FORTH THE DISTRICT'S ELECTION RELATED ROLE RESPONSIBILITIES
4 AND MECHANICS OF HOW A BALLOT MEASURE COULD BE PUT BEFORE THE
5 VOTERS THE ACT AUTHORIZES TWO DISTINCT PATHS FOR HOW A MEASURE
6 COULD BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT ONE THE DISTRICT BOARD PROPOSES
7 THE MEASURE BE PLACED ON THE BALLOTED OR TWO THE MEASURE IS
8 PROPOSED VIA QUALIFIED VOTER INITIATIVE. THE BOARD WILL
9 CONSIDER WHETHER IT WANTEDS TO PURSUE THE FIRST PATH TODAY
10 HOWEVER IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT EVEN IF THE MEASURE WERE
11 PROPOSED VIA QUALIFIED VOTER INITIATIVE THE DISTRICT WOULD
12 STILL MAINTAIN MANY IMPORTANT RESPONSIBILITIES INCLUDING
13 SEVERAL RELATED TO THE NOVEMBER UPON 2,026 ELECTION TO HELP
14 WITH THIS DECISION AND ASSESS THE FEASIBILITY OF A POTENTIAL
15 PUBLIC TRANSIT MEASURE AFTER THE BILL WAS ENACTED MTC ENGAGED
16 EMC TO CONDUCT A RANDOMIZED POLL OF 2800 BAY AREA VOTERS IN
17 THE FIVE COUNTIES AS PRESENTED TO MTC IN DECEMBER THE POLL
18 FOUND THAT 56% OF VOTERS ACROSS THE FIVE COUNTIES SUPPORTED
19 THE MEASURE AFTER HEARING THE BALLOT QUESTION WITHOUT
20 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION THIS ROSE TO 59% AFTER RECEIVING
21 ADDITIONAL DETAILS ABOUT THE INTENDED OUTCOMES OF THE MEASURE
22 THEN FELL AGAIN TO 54% AFTER HEARING THE NEGATIVE ARGUMENT
23 AGAINST THE MEASURE. BASED ON POLLS RESULTS IT APPEARS THE
24 MEASURE WOULD ACHIEVE THE 2/3 VOTE THRESHOLD REQUIRED FOR
25 PASSAGE WE ALSO HAVE EMC HERE WITH US IF YOU HAVE QUESTIONS

1 AROUND THAT POLLING. THERE ARE MORE DETAILS THAT ARE ATTACHED
2 IN YOUR ITEM IN THE PACKET. I'LL NOW TURN IT OVER TO KATHLEEN
3 WHO WILL PROVIDE MORE INFORMATION ON THE DISTRICT'S ROLES AND
4 RESPONSIBILITIES ARE FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION TODAY.

5

6 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THANK YOU ANDY, I DON'T HAVE TOO MUCH
7 TO ADD TO THAT BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING SB63 YOU KNOW
8 OVER THE COURSE OF SEVERAL MEETINGS HERE AND SO I THINK
9 EVERYONE IS PRETTY FAMILIAR WITH IT THE KEY ISSUE BEFORE YOU
10 TODAY WEARING YOUR HATS AS DISTRICT BOARD MEMBERS IS WHETHER
11 YOU WANT TO INSTRUCT STAFF TO PREPARE A MEASURE FOR OURSELVES
12 PUT ON DIRECTLY AND STAFF DOES NOT HAVE THAT MANDATE WITHOUT
13 YOUR DIRECTION SO WE HAVE NOT UNDERTAKEN TO TRY TO DO A FULL
14 MEASURE. WHAT YOU DO SEE ATTACHED TO THE AGENDA IS A, SORT OF,
15 AMALGAMATION OF SOME OF THE TECHNICAL COMPONENTS THAT ANY
16 MEASURE WHETHER IT'S OURS OR A VOTER INITIATIVE WOULD HAVE TO
17 INCLUDE, ONE THING TO NOTE IS THAT SB63 IS PRETTY PRESCRIPTIVE
18 IN TERMS OF THE EXPENDITURE PLAN AND HOW THE TAX IS TO BE
19 APPLIED AND RAISED, AND THEN IN COMBINATION WITH EXISTING
20 ELECTIONS LAW AND STANDARDS FROM CDTFA, THERE IS A LOT OF,
21 SORT OF, MANDATED LANGUAGE ABOUT THE MECHANICS OF WHAT A
22 MEASURE WOULD HAVE TO INCLUDE. SO THAT'S WHAT IS THERE BEFORE
23 YOU. IT IS NOT MEANT TO BE -- INCLUDE ANY OF THE DISCRETIONARY
24 LANGUAGE THAT THIS BODY WOULD WANT TO CONSIDER IF YOU WERE TO
25 BUILD-OUT A FULL MEASURE SO IT DOES NOT INCLUDE THINGS THAT

1 WOULD NEED TO BE IN A COMPLETE MEASURES LIKE FINDINGS AND
2 DECLARATIONS, STATEMENTS OF PURPOSE AND SO ON BECAUSE THAT
3 LANGUAGE HAS MORE POLICY SDMERNGZ DIMENSIONS TO IT AND THINGS
4 THAT YOU ALL WOULD WANT TO CONSIDER IN MORE DETAIL BUT THE
5 IDEA WAS TO PROVIDE YOU SOME SENSE OF FRAMEWORK WHAT THIS
6 WOULD NEED TO INCLUDE AND THE GUTS OF IT AS IT WERE PRETTY
7 WELL DICTATED BY THE STATUTE AND EXISTING STANDARDS FROM
8 ELSEWHERE IN THE STATE. SO, REALLY THE QUESTION IS HANDING
9 BACK TO THE CHAIR HERE TO HANDLE THE DISCUSSIONS AS YOU SEE
10 FIT ABOUT WHETHER YOU WANT TO DO THIS AND DIRECT STAFF TO DO
11 IT OURSELVES OR IF IT'S SOMETHING THAT THE DISTRICT DOES NOT
12 WANT TO PURSUE AT THIS TIME YOU KNOW WE DO MAINTAIN CONTROL
13 OVER OUR AGENDAS IF SOMETHING CHANGES IN THE FUTURE WE CAN
14 ALWAYS BRING AN ITEM BACK. BUT FOR RIGHT NOW IT'S IMPORTANT
15 GIVEN THE TIGHT TIMELINES TO MAKE THE NOVEMBER BALLOT THAT
16 STAFF HAVE A SENSE OF YOUR DIRECTION ON WHETHER YOU WANTED US
17 TO PROCEED.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** QUESTIONS? [LAUGHTER] YOU HAVE A CONFUSED
20 LOOK ON YOUR FACE.

21

22 **MYRNA MELGAR:** CLARIFICATION OF WHAT DISTRICT ACTION MEANS,
23 WHAT WE ARE BEING ASKED TO DO. SO, IS IT THAT YOU WANT US TO,
24 LIKE, HAVE A DISCUSSION AND THEN GIVE YOU GUIDANCE? AND THEN
25 WHATEVER ACTION WE TAKE WE VOTE ON WHATEVER COMES OUT OF THE

1 DISCUSSION, GIVEN THAT YOU HAVE ALREADY TOLD US THAT THE
2 APOLOGY SAYS THAT IF WE PUT IT ON THE BALLOT THAT IT'S TWO
3 THIRDS AND IT'S NOT GOING TO PASS. I'M JUST CONFUSED ABOUT
4 WHAT THE DIRECTIVE IS HERE.

5

6 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** RIGHT WE AGENDAIZED THIS FOR ACTION IN
7 CASE YOU WANTED TO TAKE ONE. SO, YOU DON'T HAVE TO -- WHEN
8 WE'RE AGENDAIZING, WE WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT SENDSIZE FOR
9 THE MAXIMUM THING THAT YOU MIGHT DO. SO IN THIS CASE BECAUSE
10 YOU MIGHT TAKE A MOTION WE WANT TO MAKE SURE IT WAS AGENDAIZED
11 TO ALLOW YOU TO DO THAT. SPECIFICALLY, IF YOU ARE GOING TO
12 DIRECT STAFF TO PREPARE A MEASURE TO PUT ON OURSELVES, THAT'S
13 SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD WANT TO HAVE MEMORIALIZED IN A MOTION
14 IN THE MINUTES. IF THE DIRECTION IS NOT TO DO THAT THEN WE
15 DON'T NEED TO NECESSARILY DO A MOTION BUT WE DO NEED CLEAR
16 DIRECTION THAT YOU DON'T WANT US TO TAKE THAT UP SO IT'S
17 REALLY MORE A MATTER OF BROWN ACT MAKING SURE THAT WE HAD
18 ADEQUATELY COVERED WHATEVER DECISION YOU MIGHT WANT TO TAKE
19 HERE.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DOES THAT ANSWER? OKAY. OTHER QUESTIONS?
22 COMMENTS? WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF
25 CORRESPONDENCE THAT WAS POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA, AND

1 DISTRIBUTED TO YOU LAST NIGHT, FROM CONNECT BAY TRANSIT
2 COMMITTEE. COPIES ARE AVAILABLE AT THE ENTRANCE FOR THOSE THAT
3 WANT IT, AND THEN WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HERE TODAY
4 THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM. THE FIRST IS LIAM
5 CHIANG FOLLOWED BY EMILY LOPER. AND YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.
6 I'LL SET THE TIMER ON THE PODIUM FOR YOU.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
9 TIRELESS WORK IN SUPPORTIVE BAY AREA TRANSIT AND
10 TRANSPORTATION. MY NAME ISLY AN CHIANG AND I AM A
11 TRANSPORTATION ADVOCATE AND MOM IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND I'M
12 REALLY DELIGHTED TO JOIN EMILY LOPER TODAY TO SHARE OUR
13 INTENTION TO GATHER OVER 200,000 SIGNATURES FROM VOTERS ACROSS
14 THE COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, SANTA CLARA,
15 AND SAN FRANCISCO, IN ORDER TO PLACE THIS CRITICALLY NEEDED IT
16 REVENUE MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER BALLOT. BAY AREA RESIDENTS
17 NEED TO GET TO AND FROM WORK, SCHOOL, DOCTORS APPOINTMENTS AND
18 GROCERY SHOPPING AS WELL AS SOCIAL ACTIVITIES AND WITHOUT THIS
19 MEASURE CATASTROPHIC CUTS TO SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA PUBLIC
20 TRANSIT SYSTEMS AND LACK OF FUNDS FOR ROAD REPAIRS WILL
21 SERIOUSLY HARM ALL OF US AS YOU ALL KNOW WELL. THE CONNECT BAY
22 AREA TRANSIT COMMITTEE HAS BEEN RAISING FUNDS PREPARING THE
23 MEASURE AND ORGANIZING IN ORDER TO START GATHERING SIGNATURES
24 WITHIN THE NEXT COUPLE OF WEEKS. THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA VOTERS
25 ARE READY TO HELP GATHER SIGNATURES OR TO SIGN THE PETITION

1 AND OUR TEAM OF TRANSIT ADVOCATES IS EXCITED TO GET THAT OUT
2 THERE AND MAKE THIS HAPPEN TO GET THIS MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.
3 THANK YOU SO MUCH.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, HAPPY NEW YEAR. I'M EMILY LOPER WITH
8 BAY AREA COUNCIL. OVER THE PAST SEVERAL DECADES THE BAY AREA
9 COUNCIL HAS EITHER LED OR PARTNERS ON EVERY MAJOR PUBLIC
10 TRANSIT FUNDING MEASURE BECAUSE WE KNOW TRANSIT IS SO
11 ESSENTIAL TO OUR REGIONAL ECONOMY AND WE'RE HERE TODAY BECAUSE
12 WE THINK THE PATH FORWARD IS CLEAR. WHILE THE POLLING DOESN'T
13 YET MEET THE 2/3 THRESHOLD REQUIRED FOR A DISTRICT-LED MEASURE
14 IT'S BEEN CONSISTENTLY STRONG FOR A VOTER LED INITIATIVE AND
15 WE'RE ENCOURAGED TO SEE THAT STRENGTH HOLD THROUGHOUT THIS
16 PAST YEAR. THIS REFLECTS A REGIONAL CONSCIENCE US THAT WE
17 BUILT THROUGHOUT OF THE SB63 PROCESS AND AN EXPENDITURE PLAN
18 THAT WAS REALLY SHAPED AROUND WHAT VOTERS WANT, WHICH IS
19 RELIABLE, SAFE, AND ACCOUNTABLE TRANSIT. SINCE SB63 WAS SIGNED
20 INTO LAW, WE HAVE MOVED QUICKLY. WE FORMED THE CONNECT BAY
21 AREA TRANSIT COMMITTEE, BUILT A PRO BROAD COALITION ACROSS THE
22 REGION AND RAISED REALTY MONEY TO LAUNCH THIS CAMPAIGN AND
23 NEXT WEEK WE PLAN TO BEGIN SIGNATURE GATHERING. WE SUBMITTED
24 FULL TEXT OF THE MEASURE TO YOU ON MONDAY AND YOU WILL SEE IT
25 DRAFTED WITH DISTRICT COMPLIANCE WITH SB63 STATUTE. SIMPLY PUT

1 RELIABLE TRANSIT IS NOT OPTIONAL IT'S HOW OUR REGION FUNCTIONS
2 HOW PEOPLE GET TO WORK AND WHAT MAKES THE BAY AREA COMPETITIVE
3 IF WE STAY UNIFIED AGENCIES BUSINESSES LABOR AND CIVIC LEADERS
4 ARE CON IF I DENTS WE CAN WIN THIS MEASURE IN NOVEMBER WE KNOW
5 HOW TO RUN THESE CAMPAIGNS AND WE KNOW HOW TO WIN W THANK YOU
6 VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED LANDS.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER BURT?

13

14 **PAT BURT:** THANK YOU TO THE SPEAKERS BECAUSE THAT'S ENCOURAGING
15 THAT YOU ARE COMMITTED TO GETTING WITH THIS MEASURE ON THE
16 BALLOT. I WANT TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO EMPHASIZE THAT WHEN
17 WE LOOK AT A TRANSIT MEASURE LIKE THIS WE HEAR SO OFTEN THAT
18 IT'S FOCUSED ON THOSE WHO CHOOSE AND NEED TO TAKE TRANSIT, AND
19 THAT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. BUT THE VOTERS INCLUDE PEOPLE
20 WHO DON'T TAKE TRANSIT. AND THE QUESTION THAT I THINK IS
21 EQUALLY IMPORTANT IS WHY SUPPORT FOR A MEASURE IS CRITICAL TO
22 THEM. AS I THINK ABOUT IT AND HAVE WITNESSED IT OVER TIME,
23 THERE'S REALLY -- AT LEAST THREE DIFFERENT WAYS IN WHICH IT
24 MATTERS TO THEM. FIRST, IN OUR COMMUNITY AND ELSEWHERE, OUR
25 SERVICE WORKERS ARE ESPECIALLY RELIANT ON TRANSIT, AND IT

1 GREATLY CONTRIBUTES TO RETENTION AND RECRUITMENT OF THOSE
2 WORKERS WHICH ARE ESSENTIAL TO OUR LOCAL ECONOMIES. SECOND, WE
3 ALL BENEFIT FROM THE ENVIRONMENTAL REASONS. AIR QUALITY AND
4 CLIMATE REASONS, EVERYBODY BENEFITS FROM THAT. AND, LASTLY,
5 EVERYBODY WHO DRIVES A CAR BENEFITS. BECAUSE WITHOUT OUR
6 TRANSIT SYSTEMS, OUR ROADWAYS AND FREEWAYS WILL BE GRID
7 LOCKED. AND I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE DON'T KEEP
8 THINKING THAT WE'RE GOING TO MESSAGE THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS BY
9 FOCUSING ON TRANSIT USERS. BECAUSE THEY'RE LIKELY SUPPORTERS
10 ALREADY. SO, I JUST WANTED TO USE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
11 EMPHASIZE THAT.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT? SHOULD.

14

15 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU'RE ON.

18

19 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANKS. I ALSO THANK THE SPEAKERS, AND
20 I'M HAPPY TO LEARN THAT THE BAY AREA COUNCIL IS ON BOARD IN
21 SUPPORT. MY QUESTION IS FOR OUR COUNSEL. SO, IF THE ADVOCATES
22 ARE STARTING THEIR PETITION GATHERING NEXT WEEK, THEN DO WE
23 HAVE ETCHED IN STONE THE BALLOT LANGUAGE? BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO
24 -- DON'T THEY HAVE TO ACCURATELY REPRESENT TO THE -- THE FOLKS
25 THEY'RE ASKING TO SIGN THE PETITIONS WHAT IT IS THEY'RE

1 SUPPORTING?

2

3 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** SO, IF THE DISTRICT DOES NOT WANT TO
4 DO THIS OURSELVES, THEN WE ARE NOT DRAFTING THE MEASURE --
5 ALTHOUGH AS WE HAVE DISCUSSED MUCH OF THE MEASURE IS DRAFTED
6 FOR US BY STATUTE -- AND, SO, THE NEXT -- THE NEXT THING TO
7 HAPPEN IS A -- ANY PROPONENT OF A CITIZEN'S INITIATIVE WOULD
8 FILE A NOTICE OF INTENT AND WOULD HAVE THEIR OWN LANGUAGE THAT
9 THEY WOULD PUT FORWARD FOR THE SIGNATURE GATHERING. AND, YOU
10 KNOW, THE SIGNATURE VERSION IS THE ONE THAT WOULD THEN NEED TO
11 GO ON THE BALLOT. SO, WHAT WAS SUBMITTED AS PART OF PUBLIC
12 COMMENT DOES COMPORT WITH, YOU KNOW, THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE
13 STATUTES. SO, IT APPEARS TO BE OPERATIONAL. YOU KNOW? IT'S
14 NOT, OBVIOUSLY, FOR US TO ULTIMATELY DETERMINE THE INDIVIDUAL,
15 SORT OF, WORD CHOICE ISSUES ON THAT, BUT THAT IS -- THAT IS A
16 FUNCTIONAL DOCUMENT THAT THEY WOULD BE TAKING AS PART OF THEIR
17 PROCEDURE. OUR PART OF IT, AS THE DISTRICT, FOR ANY KIND OF
18 VOTER INITIATIVE WOULD BE, SORT OF, ELECTIONS MECHANICS END OF
19 IT IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, RECEIVING, NOTICES MAKING SURE THAT
20 THE SIGNATURES COMPORT WITH THE VARIOUS COUNTIES REGISTRAR'S
21 REQUIREMENTS, THAT KIND OF THING. AND THEN YOU KNOW, FINAL
22 ACTIONS BY THE DISTRICT TO GET IT ON TO THE BALLOT AT THE END
23 OF THE PROCESS. BUT, WITNESS THIS BOARD DETERMINES THAT WE'RE
24 NOT DOING IT, THEN WE NEED TO BE HANDS-OFF ABOUT SOME OF THE
25 DETAILS OF BOTH THE LANGUAGE OF THE MEASURE AND ANY CAMPAIGN

1 ACTIVITIES. BECAUSE IT IS NOT FOR THIS BOARD TO ENGAGE IN ANY
2 OF THAT. WHICH I KNOW YOU'RE AWARE OF BUT I ALWAYS TAKE
3 OPPORTUNITY TO MENTION IT AGAIN.

4

5 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** NO THAT'S GOOD SEGUE BUT I WOULD SAY
6 PROBABLY SHOULDN'T SPEAK FOR MY COLLEAGUES ON THE COMMISSION
7 BUT I THINK WE READ THE REPORT AND HEARD THE POLLING WE WANT
8 THIS TO SUCCEED WE AREN'T GOING TO PUT IT ON THE BALLOT
9 BECAUSE THE THRESHOLD WOULD BE HIGHER SO WHOEVER GETS TO THE
10 STARTING GATE FIRST WE'RE NOT PUTTING IT ON THE BALLOT AND
11 THEN IF YOU WOULD JUST REMIND US NOW THAT WE ARE MEMBERS OF
12 THE DISTRICT BOARD BUT STILL MTC COMMISSIONERS WHAT ARE THE
13 GUARDRAILS WE SHOULD BE AWARE OF?

14

15 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** SURE THANK YOU FOR WHAT WAS ACTUALLY
16 LEGITIMATE UNPLANNED BUT I APPRECIATE THE REMINDER, I KNOW
17 EVERYONE ON THE BOARD HERE IS FAMILIAR WITH IT BUT FOR THE
18 PUBLIC YOU KNOW WE CAN'T USE MTC/DISTRICT RESOURCES TO
19 ADVOCATE FOR OR AGAINST ANYTHING THAT IT IS APPROPRIATE FOR US
20 TO MAKE SURE THAT NON-BIASED ACCURATE INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE
21 TO THE PUBLIC ON THIS AND ARE THE POLICY ISSUES THAT THE
22 PUBLIC MAY BECOME AWARE OF BUT OR NEED TO CONSIDER BUT IT'S
23 NOT WE CAN'T USE ANY RESOURCES FOR CAMPAIGN ACTIVITY YOU KNOW
24 EVERYONE HERE WEARS DIFFERENT HATS SO YOU HAVE ACTIVITY
25 WEARING YOUR OTHER HATS IS SOMETHING THAT YOU HAVE TO CONSULT

1 WITH YOUR OWN ATTORNEYS ABOUT AS APPROPRIATE DEPENDING ON WHAT
2 THOSE HATS ARE BUT WHEN YOU'RE ACTING IN YOUR CAPACITY AS
3 DISTRICT OR MTC BOARD MEMBERS THEN IT'S STRICTLY AN
4 INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES YOU KNOW ONE OF THE THINGS TO NOTE IS
5 THAT THE WORK OF MTC DOESN'T STOP JUST BECAUSE THESE ISSUES
6 ARE PENDING SO THERE ARE OTHER THINGS THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE
7 DOING THE SAME TIME FRAME CONTINUE TO RELATE TO OUR EXISTING
8 MANDATES ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT AND YOU KNOW REGIONAL MAN. ING
9 SO WE ARE NOT FRONTED FRO ENGAGING IN POLICY DISCUSSIONS ABOUT
10 THOSE BUT WE'RE GOING TO BE CAREFUL TO MAKE SURE THAT WE DON'T
11 TRIP OVER THE LINE IN TERMS OF ADVOCACY OR USE OF RESOURCES.

12

13 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU IT'S LOVELY TO SEE YOU BACK
14 IN-PERSON.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER LEE?

17

18 **ANNA LEE:** THANKS VERY MUCH LEGALITY ME ASK YOU WHAT LAWS OR
19 REGULATIONS GOVERN WHICH LANGUAGES THE BALLOT MEASURE IS
20 WRITTEN IN AND SECONDLY SOME OF OUR COMMUNITIES HAVE LARGE
21 NUMBERS OF LOW-INCOME PEOPLE LARGE NUMBERS OF BLACK AND BROWN
22 PEOPLE WHO USE, IN MY DISTRICT, FOR EXAMPLE, AC TRANSIT THAT'S
23 LIKE THE BLOODLINE REASPECTS FOR PEOPLE WHO NEED AC TRANSIT
24 JUST TO MANAGE THEIR LIVES SO THE MESSAGING AROUND THE
25 IMPORTANCE OF THIS TO PEOPLE WHO NEED THIS DESPERATELY TO LIVE

1 DAY-TO-DAY THAT NEEDS TO BE COMMUNICATED CLEARLY. HOW IS THAT
2 DETERMINED IN TERMS OF THE BALLOT MEASURE? WHO DETERMINES THE
3 LANGUAGE AND THE MESSAGING AND WHICH LANGUAGES GO ON THE
4 MEASURE.

5

6 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** OWE SO MUCH OF THE MECHANICS OF BALLOT
7 LANGUAGE AND ALL OF THAT IS SPECIFY IN THE ELECTIONS CODE AND
8 WHEN WE HAVE A REGIONAL MEASURE SUCH AS THIS THE MOST POPULOUS
9 COUNTY BECOMES, SORT OF, THE LEAD OFFICE, YOU KNOW, REGISTRAR
10 THE VOTERS SO THEY KIND OF COORDINATE THE ELECTIONS OFFICIALS
11 ACTIVITIES AROUND THINGS LIKE BALLOT TRANSLATION AND MAKING
12 SURE THAT THE ARGUMENTS MAKE IT IN ON TIME TO BE PUBLISHED AND
13 ALL THE REST OF THAT. BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO COORDINATE BALLOTS
14 IN MULTIPLE COUNTIES. SO THAT'S NOT -- AND THEN OUR NEWLY
15 APPOINTED ELECTIONS OFFICIAL WILL BE COORDINATING WITH THEM TO
16 MAKE SURE THAT EVERYTHING HAPPENS AS IT NEEDS TO FOR THE
17 DISTRICT AS A WHOLE. SO, THAT IS THE LEGAL ANSWER. I THINK,
18 FROM PERSPECTIVE OF MAKING SURE INFORMATION IS OUT THERE,
19 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THE CAMPAIGN WOULD BE PRIMARILY
20 RESPONSIBLE FOR IN THIS INSTANCES. WHEN IT COMES TO OUR OWN
21 COMMUNICATIONS AS MTC/THE DISTRICT, WE HAVE OUR OWN PUBLIC
22 PARTICIPATION PLAN THAT GOVERNS HOW WE DO OUTREACH AND THAT
23 DOES LOOK AT KIND OF COMMUNITIES OF INTEREST FOR VARIOUS
24 ISSUES AND MAKING SURE THAT BOTH THE LANGUAGES AND, ALSO, THE
25 -- THE AVENUES FOR COMMUNICATION ARE SENSITIVE TO WHO NEEDS

1 KNOW WHAT INFORMATION. RIGHT? SO IF WE'RE WORKING ON A NEW --
2 JUST IN GENERAL IF WE'RE WORKING ON A NEW PROJECT THAT MAY
3 AFFECT A PARTICULAR COMMUNITY WE MAKE SURE THAT WE USE THE
4 RIGHT MEDIA FOR EXAMPLE, TO GET THROUGH TO THE PEOPLE IN THAT
5 COMMUNITY BECAUSE IT'S NOT ONE-SIZE-FITS-ALL IN THIS REGION
6 IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP THAT MIND YOU KNOW AND WE'RE ALWAYS
7 TRYING TO IMPROVE IT'S A CONTINUAL IMPROVEMENTEST AS AN AGENCY
8 BUT THAT'S SOMETHING SHOULD THAT WE TRY TO TAYLOR.

9

10 **ANNA LEE:** DO WE GET TO SEE A DRAFT OF OUR OWN PLAN BEFORE IT'S
11 ACTUALLY WRITTEN IN STONE?

12

13 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** WE'LL HAVE PARTICIPATION PLAN OFFLINE
14 WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE WITH YOU THAT YOU CAN SEE THIS
15 PREVIOUSLY ADOPTED WE CAN TALK TO YOU ABOUT THAT.

16

17 **ANNA LEE:** IS THERE ROOM FOR UPDATING IT?

18

19 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THERE IS ALWAYS ROOM FOR UPDATING IT
20 SO THAT'S PROBABLY AN MTC FUNCTION THAT WE WOULD WANT TO TAKE
21 UP ON THAT ON FORMAT BUT YES SOMETHING THAT OUR STAFF PUTS A
22 LOT OF THOUGHT INTO HOW TO BEST CONTINUALLY TAYLOR IT'S
23 BECAUSE AS MEDIA CHANGES WE'RE AN ENTIRELY DIFFERENCE
24 ENVIRONMENTS NOW THAN WE WERE SAY FIVE YEARS AGO. WE NEED TO
25 BE UPDATING AND FIGURE OUT WHAT CHANNELS TO USE TO GET

1 INFORMATION OUT TO PEOPLE.

2

3 **ANNA LEE:** THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

6

7 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES THANK YOU I HAVINGLY QUESTIONS FIRST IT IS
8 KIND OF FOLLOWING UP ON COMMISSIONER LEE'S QUESTION SO THE
9 DISTRICT WILL BE PUTTING OUT A QUESTION AND ANSWER AS WELL AS
10 FACT SHEET IS THAT ACCURATE?

11

12 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** I HEAR OUR LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS PERSON
13 SAYING YES SO WE ARE MAKING SURE THE INFORMATION IS GOING OUT
14 IT'S GOING TO BE FACTUAL AND NON-ARGUMENTATIVE BUT WE ARE
15 MAKING SURE THAT THERE IS INFORMATION GOING OUT.

16

17 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY SECOND QUESTION, AND I KNOW I MISSED THE
18 MEETING ON THE 20TH OR 17TH OR WHENEVER IT WAS, CONTAINS
19 REMEMBER IN DECEMBER BUT LET'S SEE HERE WHAT HAPPENS IF ONE OF
20 THE FIVE COUNTIES DECIDES NOT TO PUT IT ON THE BALLOT.

21

22 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THE WAY THE STATUTE IS CONSTRUCTED
23 THAT'S ACTUALLY NOT OPTIONAL.

24

25 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY ALL RIGHT THEN IT REQUIRES 50% PLUS ONE TO

1 PASS.

2

3 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** DEPENDS ON WHO IS PUTTING IT ON
4 ASSUMING THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT VOTER INITIATIVE THAT'S
5 CORRECT YES.

6

7 **NATHAN MILEY:** IS THAT 50 PLUS ONE THROUGHOUT THE FIVE COUNTIES
8 OR PER COUNTY.

9

10 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** IT'S WITHIN THE ENTIRETY OF THE
11 DISTRICT.

12

13 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. ALONG THE LINES OF FACTS, AND, REALLY,
18 TRUST HERE, AND I UNDERSTAND WHERE MTC IS GOING TO BE, I THINK
19 OUR DECISION TODAY IS PRETTY SIMPLE HERE, BUT JUST WANT TO BE
20 CLEAR THE ATTACHMENT, THE COMMUNICATION TODAY IS NOT SOMETHING
21 WE'RE ENDORSING BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T RELEASED OUR FACTS YET BUT
22 SOME FACTS SEEM TO BE MISSING FROM THAT SO JUST TO BE CLEAR
23 BECAUSE IT'S NOW IN OUR RECORD, RIGHT? SO WE'RE NOT ENDORSING
24 ENDORSING THAT LANGUAGE THAT WAS PRESENTED?

25

1 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** NOT AT ALL THAT IS PUBLIC COMMENT THAT
2 CAME INDEPENDENTLY FROM THE PUBLIC IT'S NOT LIKE ANY OTHER
3 PUBLIC COMMENT IT BECOMES PART OF THE RECORD PART OF THE
4 MEETING BECAUSE IT WAS BEFORE YOU AS THE BOARD BUT YOU'RE NOT
5 TAKING ANY ACTION ON THAT.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? NO? VICE CHAIR?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JUST OUT OF AN ABUNDANCE
12 OF CAUTION I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE FOR THE RECORD THAT THIS
13 DISTRICT NOT PLACE A BALLOT MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. AND I WOULD
14 LIKE THAT TO BE CONSIDERED.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** --

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SECOND?

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I WOULD SECOND THAT.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU WOULD SECOND THAT. WE GOT ASHCRAFT IN
25 THIS TIME, EVEN THOUGH BURT TRIED TO.

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENT? DID WE DO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ALREADY? WE DID.
4 THANK YOU. OH GOSH. SORRY. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION BY VICE CHAIR MOULTON-
7 PETERS SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER PARDON ME, BOARD MEMBER EZZY
8 ASHCRAFT. CHAIR NOACK?

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER AHN IS ABSENT. MEMBER ANDERSEN? IS
19 ABSENT. MEMBER EZZY ASHCRAFT?

20

21 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER BURT?

24

25 **PAT BURT:** YES.

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

11

12 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

15

16 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE?

19

20 **PETER LEE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? .

23

24 **TYLER MAYO:** .

25

1 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MANFREE?

4

5 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR? PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

12

13 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
16 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. [INDISCERNIBLE]

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL THIS VOTING MESSES UP MY MIC EVERY TIME.
19 GOTTA WORK ON THAT ONE. ITEM SIX PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER BUSINESS
20 IS THERE ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITE I HAVE
23 RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM AND I SEE NO RAISED
24 HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE -- WAIT. YEP. ONE HAND IN THE ZOOM
25 SPACE NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM. COTECH.

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS MARK JOFFE I'M THE
3 PRESIDENT OF THE CONTRA COSTA TAXPAYERS ASSOCIATION AND ALSO A
4 MEMBER OF THE BOARD OF SCHIFF BAY AREA ENCOURAGED TO SEE IT
5 COME OUT IN OPPOSITION TO THE BILL YOUR AIR'S WEALTH TAX
6 RECENTLY AND I'M SURPRISED THAT THE MAYOR IS FOR TAXING HIS
7 POOR RESIDENTS 11 OR TEN AND A HALF% SALES TAX IF THIS MEASURE
8 PASSES I'M ALSO SURPRISED THAT MAYOR LEE THINKS THAT 11 SALES
9 TAX IS APPROPRIATE FOR THE LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS SO WHILE YOU
10 HAVE ALREADY MADE YOUR DECISION I THINK YOU REALLY NEED TO
11 STEP BACK AND THINK ABOUT THE IMPACT OF CONTINUING TO RAISE
12 TAXES TO BAILOUT FAILING TRANSIT AGENCIES ON THE GENERAL
13 PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
16 HANDS.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY WITH ITEM SEVEN IS ADJOURNMENT. THE
19 NEXT MEETING OF THE PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT
20 WILL BE HELD AT A DATE AND TIME TO BE DULY NOTICED TO THE
21 PUBLIC. WE ARE GENTS -- ADJOURNED. THANK