METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
2	FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 3 RD , 2023, 12:00 PM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: ALL RIGHT EVERYONE. WE'LL ROLL RIGHT
6	INTO THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. I'M DAVID
7	RABBIT, CHAIR ALONG WITH SUE NOACK, THE VICE CHAIR. CALLING
8	THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 3, 2023 TO ORDER. I WANT TO CALL THE
9	MEETING TO ORDER. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC
10	WEBSITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING
11	BY ZOOM RAISE HAND FEATURE, AND YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON YOU AT
12	THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
13	UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. DUE TO
14	PARTICIPATION FROM REMOTE LOCATIONS, A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
15	TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS IS A ROLL
16	CALL, PLEASE
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR RABBITT?
19	
20	DAVID RABBITT: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR NOACK?
23	
24	V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.
25	



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
2	
3	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
6	
7	DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
10	
11	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: EDISON? IS ABSENT. MEMBER GIACOPINI NON-
14	VOTING?
15	
16	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MEMBER LEE? IS ABSENT. MAHAN? IS ABSENT.
19	MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS?
20	
21	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SHAW?
24	
	DIANE SHAW: HERE.



1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER SPERING? 2 3 JAMES P. SPERING: HERE. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE QUORUM. 6 7 8 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGENDA ITEM TWO IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. WE HAVE ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2I. I THINK 9 THAT'S NINE ITEMS TODAY. DO ANY MEMBERS WISH TO PULL FROM THE 10 CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING NONE. I HEARD A MOTION? 11 12 SUE NOACK: I'LL MOVE THE ITEM. 13 14 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC 15 16 COMMENT? 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NONE IN THE BOARD ROOM THERE IS ONE PUBLIC 18 COMMENT. ALETA DUPREE YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. 19 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU SHARE RABBITT. ALETA DOES. FOR THE RECORD 21 22 SHE AND HER. I'M LOOKING AT THE CLOCK. THANK YOU. THERE ARE 23 ITEMS CONCERNING CLIPPER AND THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT. I DIDN'T KNOW YOU ALL HAD APPROVAL ITEMS. THAT'S GOOD. BECAUSE 24 MARKETING AND CUSTOMER SERVICE ARE VERY IMPORTANT PART OF 25



1	OUTREACH AND SHOWING CLIPPER AND HOW IT WORKS, ESPECIALLY FOR
2	OUR VISITORS WHO SOMETIMES THEY COME TO SAN FRANCISCO OR
3	OAKLAND AND THEY REALIZE TOO LATE THEY COULD HAVE PARTICIPATED
4	THIS CLIPPER. THAT'S WHY I'M SPEAKING ABOUT THESE ITEMS. I SEE
5	A CLIPPER CARD ORDER TOO. NOT EVERYONE HAS HOMES. PLASTIC
6	CARDS DO HAVE A PLACE. VERY IMPORTANT PLACE BETTER THAN
7	DEALING WITH CASH AND TICKETS. IT'S GOOD TO BE BACK WITH YOU
8	AGAIN. THANK YOU.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU ALETA. THERE ARE NO OTHER
11	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM
12	AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON IT.
13	
14	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. WITH THAT I HAD A MOTION AND
15	SECOND. ROLL CALL PLEASE.
16	
17	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?
18	
19	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOACK?
22	
23	V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK: AYE.

24

25

CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?



1	
2	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
5	
6	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MOULTON-
7	PETERS?
8	
9	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING?
12	
13	JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
16	PRESENT.
17	
18	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: GREAT. THANK YOU. WE ARE THE OLD
19	OPERATIONS COMMITTEE WE HAVE ITEMS BEFORE US. ITEM 3A.
20	CONSULTANT CONTRACTS SUPPORT BAY BRIDGE FORWARD. WE HAVE
21	INTERSTATE 80, 880, HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLE, LANES AND HOURS OF
22	OPERATION PRODUCTS, CONTRACT WITH ENGINEERING, INC. NOT TO
23	EXCEED 4,600,000 WE HAVE ANOTHER, HOV STRATEGIES PROJECT THAT
24	ONE TO KIMBERLY HORNE AND ASSOCIATES, INC. IN THE AMOUNT NOT



TO EXCEED 1,100,000 AND THIRD 180, IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 1 550,000 WE HAVE KEVIN CHEN TO GIVE US A BRIEF PRESENTATION. 2 3 KEVIN CHEN: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. KEVIN CHEN MTC ABAG 4 5 STAFF I'M IN THE WAY OF EVERYONE'S LUNCH I'LL KEEP IT BRIEF. A FEW SLIDES THE ENTIRE SLIDE DECK IS AVAILABLE IN YOUR 6 COMMITTEE PACKET TODAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THERE ARE A NUMBER 7 8 OF TRANSIT PRIORITY EFFORTS THE AGENCY IS WORKING ON, TODAY'S UPDATE FOCUSING ON BAY BRIDGE FORWARD EFFORT. STAFF WILL COME 9 10 BACK AT A LATER DATE TO GIVE AN DATE ON THE IPSP PROGRAM, ACCELERATED BUS INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM AS WELL AS TRANSIT 11 PRIORITY POLICIES. AGAIN I WANT TO EMPHASIZE TODAY WILL BE ON 12 BAY BRIDGE FORWARD EFFORTS. NEXT PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS A 13 SNAPSHOT OF WHERE WE ARE WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THE 14 15 BLUE LINE AT THE TOP, VEHICULAR TRAFFIC IS BACK TO 92% OF 16 WHERE WE WERE PRE-PANDEMIC. IF YOU LOOK AT THE GREEN LINE FOR BART RIDERSHIP AND ORANGE LINE FOR AC TRANSIT RIDERSHIP BOTH 17 ARE FOR TRANSBAY ONLY, THERE IS ONLY ABOUT 38 [INDISCERNIBLE] 18 PERCENT PRE-PANDEMIC. RIDERSHIP IS LOW THAT'S WHY WE NEED TO 19 DO THESE FORWARD PROJECTS TO IMPROVE OUR TRANSIT SERVICE. TO 20 21 REDUCE DELAY AND IMPROVE RELIABILITY SO WE CAN GET RIDERS BACK. WE ANTICIPATE THE TRANSBAY COMMUTERS TO CONTINUE TO 22 INCREASE SO WE NEED TO FOCUS ON GETTING PEOPLE BACK TO TRANSIT 23 BEFORE THE HIGHWAY GETS OVERWHELMED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HERE 24

ON THE LEFT YOU CAN SEE A GOOGLE MAP SHOWING A TYPICAL WEEKDAY



- 1 MORNING COMMUTE. YOU DO SEE SOME SLOWING OF TRAFFIC ON THE BAY
- 2 BRIDGE. HOWEVER, YOU SEE MORE SUBSTANTIAL DELAY ON THE EAST
- 3 BAY SIDE BEFORE TRAFFIC IS GET ON TO THE BRIDGE THAT INCLUDES
- 4 OUR BUSES AND CARPOOLS. YOU CAN SEE THAT ON THE 80 CORRIDOR,
- 5 THAT'S WITH THE HIGHEST DELAY OF 31 MINUTES. NEXT WE HAVE THE
- 6 580 APPROACH NINE MINUTES OF DELAY AND 1805 MINUTES DELAY
- 7 FORTUNATELY WE HAVE A NUMBER OF ONGOING BAY BRIDGE FORWARD
- 8 PROJECTS THAT ARE LOOKING AT REDUCING DELAYS FROM BUSES FOR
- 9 EACH OF THE APPROACHES AS PART OF THE 880 APPROACH WE HAVE THE
- 10 WEST GRANT APPROACH COMING FROM OAKLAND. WITH THAT MAYBE I CAN
- 11 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE SHOWS THE ONGOING PROJECTS,
- 12 ANDY MENTIONED THIS EARLIER. WE DO HAVE A COUPLE OF PROJECTS
- 13 THAT ARE COMING DOWN THE PIKE FOR CONSTRUCTION THAT INCLUDES
- 14 WEST GRAND BUS LANE EXTENSION PROJECT AS WELL AS 180 POWER
- 15 INTERCHANGE IN EMERYVILLE THOSE WILL PROVIDE BUSES OPPORTUNITY
- 16 TO JUMP THE QUEUES THAT ARE STUCK IN TRAFFIC DURING THE
- 17 MORNING PEAK. LET'S ADVANCE THE SLIDES FORWARD TO SLIDE TO
- 18 SLIDE NINE, PLEASE. IF WE CAN ADVANCE THE SLIDE PLEASE. ONE
- 19 MORE -- TWO MORE. SORRY. ONE MORE. YEAH. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE
- 20 ONGOING PROJECTS -- SORRY -- THE PROJECTS THAT ARE ABOUT TO
- 21 START. THESE ARE THE CONTRACTS WE'RE SEEKING FOR YOUR APPROVAL
- 22 TODAY. BACK IN GROUP WE PRESENTED TO THE MTC OPERATIONS
- 23 COMMITTEE WITH RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE 180 CORRIDOR THESE ARE
- 24 NEAR-TERM STRATEGIES THAT ARE REALLY SPECIFICALLY AIMED AT
- 25 IMPROVING BUS AND HOV OPERATIONS. WE'RE LOOKING AT EXPANDING



- 1 THE HOV HOURS OF OPERATIONS ON THE 80 CORRIDOR AS WELL AS THE
- 2 BRIDGE APPROACHES. RIGHT NOW THEY ARE VERY STANDARD, 5 TO
- 3 10:00 P.M. IN THE MORNING AND THEN 3 TO 7 IN THE AFTERNOON.
- 4 WE'RE LOOKING AT POTENTIALLY EXPANDING IT TO ALL DAY FROM 5 TO
- 5 8:00 P.M. AND POTENTIALLY WEEKEND HOURS AS WELL. THE SECOND
- 6 EFFORT LOOKING AT HOV ACCESS RESTRICTION. THIS WOULD BE
- 7 PROVIDED WITH A DOUBLE WHITE STRIPE TO HELP IMPROVE OPERATIONS
- 8 OF THE HOV LANE. AGAIN, TRYING TO HELP WITH HOV COMPLIANCE,
- 9 REDUCE WEAVING AND IMPROVE THE OPERATIONS. THE THIRD PROJECT
- 10 ON THE LIST IS THE LOCALIZED TRANSIT PRIORITIES AND LAST HOV
- 11 STRATEGIES PROJECT LOOKING AT INTERCHANGES ALONG THE 80
- 12 CORRIDOR FROM EMERYVILLE UP TO HERCULES. WE'LL BE WORKING
- 13 CLOSELY WITH THE LOCAL STAKEHOLDERS AND PARTNERS IN INVESTING
- 14 FORWARD. LASTLY BUT NOT LEAST, THE I-80 BUS ON SHOULDER
- 15 FEASIBILITY STUDY, WHICH WE'LL BE CONDUCTING A STUDY ON THE 80
- 16 CORRIDOR TO SEE WHERE WE CAN POTENTIALLY IMPLEMENT BUS ON YOU
- 17 SHOULDER THROUGH DIFFERENT STRETCHES. SO, AGAIN. SORRY FOR THE
- 18 RUSH. BUT I'M TRYING TO KEEP IT BRIEF. WITH THIS ITEM WE'RE
- 19 SEEKING APPROVAL FOR THE THREE CONSULTING CONTRACTS TO PROCEED
- 20 WITH THE PLANNING AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT WORK ON THESE FOUR
- 21 PROJECTS.
- 23 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: KEVIN, WE APPRECIATE YOUR BREVITY. THANK
- 24 YOU VERY MUCH. THERE ARE THREE CONTRACTS IN FRONT OF US. I'LL
- 25 ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM?



1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 2 3 RECEIVED. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED 4 5 IN ZOOM. ALETA DUPREE, YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE 6 YOURSELF. 7 8 SPEAKER: THANKS CHAIR RABBITT. ALETA DUPREE SHE AND HER FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS IMPORTANT TO ME. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO 9 THE WORK. I AM ACTUALLY ONE OF THE MANY WHO DEAL WITH THE 10 CONGESTION APPROACHING THE BAY BRIDGE. THE WAY I GO THROUGH IT 11 IS I TAKE THE F BUS FROM EMERYVILLE, CHRISTY AVENUE AREA, AND 12 GET ON THE HIGHWAY AT THE POWELL, WHICH IS THE LAST EXIT 13 BEFORE THE BRIDGE. AND IT REALLY DOES GET SLOW TRYING TO GO 14 15 THROUGH, MAKE THAT CURVE OFF THE POWELL AND THROUGH THE 16 BRIDGE. WE HAVE THE BYPASS LANE. BUT WE HAVE TO PRIORITIZE HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT WHICH CARPOOL IS A PLACE. CARPOOL DOES 17 HAVE A PLACE. SOME PEOPLE DO NEED THEIR CARS. BECAUSE I KNOW 18 WHAT IT'S LIKE TO SIT ON THE BUS. AND I DIDN'T KNOW AC 19 TRANSIT'S RIDERSHIP WAS THAT LOW ON TRANSBAY. I THINK THIS IS 20 WORTHY OF APPROVAL. THANK YOU. 21 22 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, ALETA. THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM WISHING 24

25

TO SPEAK.



1	
2	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: BRINGING IT BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE
3	LOOKING FOR ANY
4	
5	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YEAH, I HAVE A QUESTION ON THIS. MY BRAIN
6	IS STUCK ON THE FEASIBILITY OF BUS ON SHOULDER. AND I GUESS
7	THE QUESTION IS FIRST OF ALL, WE DO HAVE BUS ON SHOULDER IN
8	OTHER PARTS OF THE BAY AREA, CORRECT? OH WE DON'T?
9	
10	ANDREW FREMIER: NO. WE DO NOT.
11	
12	SPEAKER: OH. OKAY. WELL THEN THAT MAKES
13	
14	JAMES P. SPERING: [INDISCERNIBLE] [LAUGHTER]
15	
16	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: OH. THERE LIES MY CONFUSION. OKAY. THANK
17	YOU THEN. THEN THAT MAKES IT ALL MAKE MORE SENSE. BECAUSE I
18	THOUGHT WELL IF WE'RE ALREADY DOING THIS THEN WHY ARE WE
19	SPENDING MONEY IF WE ALREADY KNOW IT WORKS. SO, THE ANSWER IS
20	WE DON'T. THANK YOU.
21	
22	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANYTHING? SEEING NO
23	MORE QUESTIONS. CAN I GET A MOTION AND SECOND?
24	
25	JAMES P. SPERING: SECOND.



1	
2	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: I HAVE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER SPERING
3	AND SECOND BY CANEPA. CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR RABBITT?
6	
7	DAVID RABBITT: AYE.
8	
9	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR NOACK?
10	
11	V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
14	
15	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
16	
	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
18	
19	DAVID CANEPA: AYE DUTRA-VERNACI?
20	
21	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
22	CLERK OF MIE DOADD. MAHANO TO ADCENE MONTEON DEEDES
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?
24	STEDHANTE MOITTON-DETEDS. VES



1 2 CLERK OF THE BOARD: SPERING? 3 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 4 5 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 6 7 PRESENT. 8 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. KEVIN FOR THE WORK. 9 10 MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR. PUBLIC COMMENT. I HAVE ONE CARD IN FRONT OF ME. IAN GRIFFITHS. 11 12 IAN GRIFFITHS: GOOD AFTERNOON. SO, IAN GRIFFITHS, SEAMLESS BAY 13 AREA. I WANTED TO DRAW YOUR ATTENTION TO A COMMENT LETTER WE 14 15 SUBMITTED ON THE TOPIC OF CONSOLIDATION. YOU KNOW, THE NETWORK 16 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE IS SUPPOSED TO PROVIDE POLICY DIRECTION AS PART OF THIS NEW STRUCTURE TO THE GROUP OF GENERAL MANAGERS 17 ON WHAT THINGS TO PURSUE. GIVEN THE CONVERSATION WE JUST HAD, 18 TO ME, IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO SAY THIS IS ONE OF THOSE TOPIC 19 AREAS THAT WE WANT TO BE FOCUSING ON. I THINK YOU'RE GOING TO 20 21 GET A WORK PLAN WITHIN THE NEXT MONTH OR TWO ABOUT WHAT NETWORK MANAGEMENT SHOULD BE FOCUSING ON. AND THE WORK THAT WE 22 NEED TO PICK BACK UP IS A RAIL PARTNERSHIP STUDY COMPLETED 23 BACK IN MARCH THAT SAID THE NEXT STEP IS TO DO DETAILED COST 24 BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF EACH OPTION INCLUDING VARIOUS



- 1 CONSOLIDATION OPTIONS. PLEASE CONSIDER THIS AS YOU CONSIDER
- 2 THE WORK PLAN NEXT MONTH ON WHAT TO FOCUS ON NETWORK
- 3 MANAGEMENT. THANK YOU.

4

- 5 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE? ANYONE ONLINE
- 6 WISHING TO SPEAK?

7

- 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO ONE HERE AND THERE WAS A COMMENT LETTER
- 9 IT WAS POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO ALL MEMBERS. AND THERE
- 10 IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK. ALETA DUPREE.
- 11 ONE MINUTE.

- 13 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBITT AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
- 14 FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. A BRIEF MEETING. A GOOD MEETING.
- 15 I LIKE BRIEF AND SUCCINCT MEETINGS AND WE'RE GETTING A LOT OF
- 16 WORK DONE TODAY. THANK YOU. I CAN ONLY SHARE THINGS IF I KNOW
- 17 OF THEM. MAYBE I'LL HAVE TO WRITE YOU A LETTER SOMETIME.
- 18 THINKING ABOUT THINGS I LEARNED IN THE BAY AREA ABOUT
- 19 OPERATIONS AND LEARNING THIS NEW FORMAT YOU'RE DOING. AND
- 20 ABOUT THINGS THAT I DO LEARN AND PRACTICE IN OTHER PLACES. MY
- 21 RÉSUMÉ IN CALIFORNIA IS FAIRLY SHORT, BUT I DID SPEND A MONTH
- 22 IN NEW YORK AND RODE BUSES AND USED SOME EXPRESS BUS LANES AND
- 23 RODE ON THEIR LEGENDARY AND HISTORIC TRAIN SYSTEM CALLED A
- 24 SUBWAY AND VISITED GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL AMONG OTHER THINGS
- 25 AND THERE IS LOTS OF OPERATIONS IN THAT. HOW CAN WE LEARN FROM



OUR FRIENDS AROUND THE WORLD TO HAVE THE BEST OPERATING SYSTEM 1 WE CAN. THANK YOU. 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. ALETA. THERE ARE NO OTHER 4 5 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. 6 7 8 CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT A LITE A 9 THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM FIVE ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD HERE 375 10 11 BEALE STREET ON FRIDAY DECEMBER 8TH, 2023. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED. 12 THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED] 13





Broadcasting Government