# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
2	MONDAY, JUNE $2^{ND}$ , 2025, 1:00 PM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE
6	CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS BEING
7	WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF
8	THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM AND WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD
9	USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I WILL CALL
10	UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES
11	WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE
12	NUMBER. SO, AGENDA ITEM NUMBER ONE, MADAM CLERK, IS THE ROLL
13	CALL AND CONFIRM THAT WE HAVE A QUORUM.
14	
15	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. CHAIR POWERS?
16	
17	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR CHAN?
20	
21	V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MCCULLOUGH FOR CUMINS?
24	
25	SPEAKER: HERE.



1	
2	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: FREMIER?
3	
4	ANDREW FREMIER: HERE.
5	
6	SPEAKER: HERE.
7	
8	SPEAKER: HERE.
9	
10	SPEAKER: HERE.
11	
12	SPEAKER: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MULLIGAN?
15	
16	DENIS MULLIGAN: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WEGENER?
19	
20	CHRISTY WEGENER: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE QUORUM.
23	
24	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT. LET'S GET RIGHT INTO
25	IT. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO CONSENT CALENDAR THIS IS AN ACTION



ITEM, TWO ITEMS THERE, 2A THROUGH 2D AGAIN ACTION ITEM LET ME 1 CHECK AND SEE COMMISSIONERS IF THERE IS A MOTION ON THE 2 3 CONSENT CALENDAR? 4 5 V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: MOTION TO MOVE APPROVAL. 6 7 ANDREW FREMIER: SECOND. 8 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: MOTION FROM CHAN AND A SECOND FREMIER. 9 MADAM CLERK, LET'S CHECK WITH THE PUBLIC ON THIS ITEM, THE 10 CONSENT CALENDAR. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENTARY ON THIS ITEM 11 EITHER IN THE ROOM OR VIRTUAL? 12 13 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE NO ONE ONLINE, NO ONE IN THE 14 ROOM AND THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. 15 16 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTARY, 17 18 CONCERNS, EPIPHANIES ON CONSENT? NOT SEEING ANY. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR, PLEASE STATE AYE. [AYES] 19 20 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: ANY OPPOSITION? MADAM CLERK, FOR THE 21 22 RECORD, UNANIMOUS VOTE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. 23

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU.

24



- 1 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 3 HAS GOT A
- 2 COUPLE OF ITEMS THERE. FIRST ONE IS AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 3A, AND
- 3 I THINK EDWARD MENG IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH THIS ITEM.
- 4 COMMISSIONERS, THIS ITEM, JUST TO REFRESH YOUR MEMORY, IF I
- 5 MIGHT, WAS BROUGHT TO US BY EDWARD'S TEAM AT THE APRIL CEB
- 6 MEETING, KIND OF THE TWO-STEP PROCESS, WE BRING IT ONCE AS AN
- 7 INFORMATIONAL ITEM, YOU KNOW, KIND OF KNOCK IT AROUND A BIT
- 8 THEN BRING BACK AS AN ACTION ITEM WITH COMMENTS AND CONCERNS
- 9 FROM THE PRIOR MEETING ADDRESSED IN THIS UPDATE HERE THAT'S
- 10 THE BACK STORY ON THIS ITEM. EDWARD I'M GOING TO TURN THIS
- 11 OVER TO YOU TO WALK US THROUGH THIS ITEM.

- 13 EDWARD MENG: YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. GOOD AFTERNOON TO
- 14 THIS BOARD. THIS IS THE TWO-YEAR CLIPPER OPERATING CAPITAL
- 15 BUDGET FOR YOUR APPROVAL. FOR CLARIFICATION, FY 2025/'26 AND
- 16 '16/'27 ARE THE FISCAL YEARS CURRENTLY UNDER REVIEW AND WILL
- 17 BE REQUESTED FOR APPROVAL. THESE TWO FISCAL YEARS ARE OUTLINED
- 18 IN RED IN EACH OF THE ATTACHMENTS. WHEN THIS ITEM WAS
- 19 PRESENTED TO THE BOARD IN APRIL AS AN INFORMATION ITEM, WE
- 20 RECEIVED A REQUEST TO DISCUSS THE OUTLINE IN FUTURE YEARS AND
- 21 THE QUESTION OF DEFICIT IN OUT YEARS IN THE BUDGET. WHEN
- 22 PREPARING THE CLIPPER BUDGET, WE TEND TO PLAN CONSERVATIVELY,
- 23 AS HISTORICALLY THE PROGRAM HAS NEEDED TO BE FLEXIBLE TO BE
- 24 ABLE TO RESPOND TO CHANGES AND REQUESTS. THIS IS REFLECTED IN
- 25 KEY ASSUMPTIONS WE HAVE MADE IN THIS BUDGET. MTC'S OPERATING



- 1 BUDGET, STARTING WITH ATTACHMENT A, THE OPERATING BUDGET;
- 2 MTC'S OPERATING BUDGET ARE APPROVED ANNUALLY SO EVEN THOUGH WE
- 3 SHOW FIVE YEARS OF PROJECTED COSTS, WE DON'T TYPICALLY COMMIT
- 4 TO SPECIFIC FUNDING BEYOND THE TWO YEARS BEING APPROVED BY
- 5 THIS BOARD. MTC IS COMMITTED TO CONTINUE TO IDENTIFY POTENTIAL
- 6 FUND SOURCES TO HELP BRIDGE THE GAP AND MANAGING AND FULLY
- 7 FUNDING CLIPPER PROGRAM OPERATIONS IN THE OUTER YEARS.
- 8 HOWEVER, TO ADDRESS CONCERNS BY THIS BOARD, WE HAVE UPDATED
- 9 SOME OF THE FUND SOURCES IN THE FUTURE YEARS TO INDICATE
- 10 POTENTIAL SOURCES OF FUNDING THAT HAVE NOT YET BEEN COMMITTED.
- 11 ALTHOUGH, WE BELIEVE THEY ARE LIKELY TO BE AVAILABLE TO THE
- 12 PROGRAM. IN THE OPERATING BUDGET, YOU CAN SEE THE ITALICIZED
- 13 TBDS TO INDICATE THAT THESE ARE POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES, BUT
- 14 THAT SPECIFIC AMOUNTS ARE NOT YET KNOWN. WE DO BELIEVE THAT
- 15 PLANNING FOR THE FUTURE WITH THE KNOWLEDGE THAT THIS UPCOMING
- 16 DEFICIT EXISTS IS BENEFICIAL TO THE PROGRAM AND TO THE REGION,
- 17 AND CLIPPER STAFF WILL WORK OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL BUDGET
- 18 CYCLES TO IDENTIFY POTENTIAL AREAS FOR BOTH COST SAVINGS AND
- 19 ALTERNATIVE FUND SOURCES IN THE NEAR AND MEDIUM TERMS. I ALSO
- 20 DO WANT TO MENTION THAT WE WORK WITH YOUR STAFF TO DISTRIBUTE
- 21 BENEFITS TO THE REGION, PARTICULARLY TO HELP OFFSET THE COST
- 22 OF OPERATING TWO PARALLEL SYSTEMS. IF YOU WILL RECALL, LAST
- 23 YEAR, THIS BOARD APPROVED A REVISION TO THE CLIPPER MOU THAT
- 24 ALLOWED USE OF INTEREST ACCRUED AS A RESULT OF MTC'S
- 25 INVESTMENT OF THE CLIPPER FLOAT ACCOUNT TO APPLY TO THE



- 1 OPERATING BUDGET, AND WE HAVE BEEN ACTIVELY APPLYING THEM TO
- 2 THE O&M COST OF THE CURRENT CLIPPER SYSTEM. SO, YOUR AGENCIES
- 3 HAVE NOT BEEN RECEIVING C1 O&M INVOICES FROM US SINCE THE
- 4 BEGINNING OF THIS YEAR. THIS BUDGET, FOR APPROVAL, PROPOSES TO
- 5 CONTINUE THAT PRACTICE FOR THE ENTIRE NEXT FISCAL YEAR AND WE
- 6 HAVE ESTIMATED AROUND 7.3 MILLION CAN BE APPLIED TO OPERATOR
- 7 C1 O&M IN ORDER TO CONTINUE TO DELIVER THOSE BENEFITS. THAT
- 8 AMOUNT IS INCLUDED IN LINE 27 OF THE OPERATING BUDGET AND
- 9 SHOULD COVER LINE 12 OF THE OPERATING EXPENSES. WE HAVE ALSO
- 10 APPLIED FOR AROUND 13 MILLION IN LC TOP LOW CARBON TRANSIT
- 11 OPERATIONS PROGRAM FUNDING FROM OUR STATE'S CAP-AND-TRADE
- 12 PROGRAM OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS IN ORDER TO SUPPORT THE
- 13 ACCOUNT-BASED SYSTEM AS A PRIMARY PLATFORM FOR DELIVERING
- 14 CUSTOMER FACING BENEFITS AND PROGRAMS TO THE REGION, INCLUDING
- 15 CLIPPER START MEANS BASED PROGRAM, CLIPPER RTC ACCESS REDUCED
- 16 COST PROGRAM, REDUCED AND NO-COST REGIONAL INTEROPERATOR
- 17 TRANSFER DISCOUNTS, FARE CAPPING AND ACCUMULATORS AND OTHER
- 18 DIRECT RIDER AND CUSTOMER BENEFITS. IN RESPONSE TO BOARD
- 19 OUESTIONS ABOUT THE FUNDS THAT WERE BUDGETED BUT STILL REMAIN
- 20 AFTER ACTUAL COSTS ARE CONSIDERED, WE SLIGHTLY REFORMATTED THE
- 21 BUDGET TO SHOW THE PRIOR YEARS' CARRY FORWARD IN THE SAME YEAR
- 22 AS THE BUDGET YEAR AND TO SHOW DIRECT CORRELATION BETWEEN
- 23 COST, FUNDS, PRIOR YEAR CARRY FORWARD AMOUNTS AND
- 24 CORRESPONDING NET VALUE. I'M HAPPY TO PAUSE HERE FOR ANY



1 QUESTIONS ON THE OPERATING BUDGET BEFORE MOVING ON TO THE 2 CAPITAL BUDGET.

3

- 4 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. WE'LL JUST TAKE A QUICK PAUSE
- 5 HERE, EDWARD. COMMISSIONERS, OUICK COMMENTARY AND WE'RE GOING
- 6 TO HAVE ANOTHER SHOT AT OPEN DISCUSSION WITH EDWARD AFTER HE
- 7 GETS THROUGH THE NEXT PORTION OF THIS. QUICKLY, ANYBODY?
- 8 APRIL?

- 10 V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: CAN I ASK, IN TERMS OF THE -- SO,
- 11 EDWARD, SO, THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ON THE LOW CARBON
- 12 TRANSIT OPERATION PROGRAM -- AND MAYBE THIS IS A MORE
- 13 APPROPRIATE QUESTION FOR ALIX -- GIVEN THE STATE BUDGET
- 14 PROPOSAL AND THIS IS ONE OF THE ONES THAT COULD BE POTENTIALLY
- 15 BE NIXED, IS THERE ANY CONCERN THAT IN TERMS OF FUNDING
- 16 STABILITY FROM THAT PROGRAM TO FUND THE CLIPPER OPERATING COST
- 17 GOING FORWARD, QUESTION NUMBER ONE. IN TERMS OF THE CLIPPER
- 18 FLOAT INTEREST ACCOUNT, I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU SAID IS THAT MTC
- 19 HAS BEEN ABLE TO GENERATE SUFFICIENT INTEREST THAT OPERATORS
- 20 DON'T NEED TO. BUT IF INTERESTS ARE NOT SUFFICIENT, WHAT ARE
- 21 WE ASKING FROM EACH OF THE OPERATOR? AND NOT NECESSARILY THIS
- 22 IS AN ITEM I NEED IN ORDER TO APPROVE THE BUDGET; I THINK IT
- 23 WOULD BE GOOD TO KNOW EACH OPERATOR WOULD HAVE BEEN ASKED TO
- 24 PICK UP. ITS GREAT THAT WE HAVEN'T HAD THE NEED FOR THE PAST



- 1 COUPLE OF YEARS, BUT IT WOULD BE GREAT TO KNOW WHAT THE DOLLAR
- 2 AMOUNTS MIGHT BE IF IT DOES COME TO US.

3

- 4 EDWARD MENG: I CAN ANSWER THE SECOND QUESTION, THE CLIPPER
- 5 FLOAT ACCOUNT INTEREST. SO, THAT MONEY ALREADY EXISTS. THAT
- 6 7.3 MILLION TYPICALLY SPLIT AMONGST THE OPERATORS IT'S ROUGHLY
- 7 AROUND 40% BART, 40% MUNI, 20% ALL OF THE OTHER OPERATORS.
- 8 THEN 20% SPLIT BETWEEN THE REMAINING 20-ISH OPERATORS IN THE
- 9 PROGRAM.

10

- 11 ALIX BOCKELMAN: ON THE FIRST POINT, WE'LL NEED TO GET BACK TO
- 12 YOU, OBVIOUSLY WE'RE MONITORING THE BUDGET CONVERSATIONS
- 13 CLOSELY AND THEY'RE CHANGING DAY-TO-DAY BUT I DON'T HAVE A
- 14 CERTAIN ANSWER FOR YOU TODAY.

15

16 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. OTHER -- YES, PLEASE?

17

- 18 SPEAKER: JUST A OUICK CLARIFICATION. ED, CAN YOU REMIND ME ON
- 19 OPERATING EXPENSES AS IT GOES OUT INTO THE OUTER YEARS,
- 20 '25/'26 THE OPERATING COSTS FROM 53.4 TO 40.2, AND THEN THEY
- 21 RISE AGAIN.

- 23 EDWARD MENG: YEAH, SO THE 53.4 IS THE COST OF RUNNING TWO
- 24 PARALLEL OPERATING SYSTEMS. I BELIEVE THE ASSUMPTIONS WE MADE
- 25 ARE THAT NEXT FISCAL YEAR WE WILL NO LONGER NEED TO FUND THE



- 1 C1 OPERATING COST OR EXPENSES. FROM THERE WE MADE A COUPLE OF
- 2 ASSUMPTIONS. PER THE C2 SYSTEM INTEGRATOR CONTRACT, THERE ARE
- 3 FIRM, FIXED COST FOR O&M. BUT CUBIC SHOULD NOT INVOICE US THAT
- 4 COMPLETE COST UNTIL THEY ACHIEVE SYSTEM COMPLETION MILESTONE.
- 5 THESE COSTS GOING UP OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS ARE
- 6 INTENDED TO, RIGHT NOW, BE LOWER BECAUSE START UP COST, THEN
- 7 ASSUMING FULL COST IN OUTER YEARS.

8

- 9 JASON WEINSTEIN: I'LL ADD TO THAT, JASON WEINSTEIN HERE,
- 10 CLIPPER DIRECTOR. THERE ARE PROVISIONS FOR THOSE FIXED FEES TO
- 11 GO UP. SO, THEY'RE INCLUDED IN THIS BUDGET, AS WELL.

12

13 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: YES, JULIE KIRSCHBAUM, SFMTA.

14

- 15 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: DO THOSE FIXED FEES DIFFER BASED ON CLIPPER
- 16 VERSUS CREDIT CARD?

17

18 JASON WEINSTEIN: THEY DO NOT, NO.

19

20 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: THANK YOU.

21

- 22 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. OTHER QUICK CHECK-INS HERE?
- 23 EDWARD, WE'RE GOING TO TURN THIS BACK OVER TO YOU FOR THE
- 24 SECOND PORTION OF THIS.



- 1 EDWARD MENG: THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN
- 2 YOUR ATTENTION TO ATTACHMENT B OF THIS ITEM. THE CLIPPER
- 3 CAPITAL BUDGET REMAINS STABLE AS WE HAVE IDENTIFIED FUNDING
- 4 FOR CAPITAL WORK UP UNTIL SYSTEM COMPLETION AND WE PLAN TO
- 5 CONTINUE TO KEEP THIS BOARD UPDATE ON THE CAPITAL STATUS OF
- 6 THE WORK THAT ALL THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER CONTRACTORS ARE
- 7 DELIVERING. AT THE APRIL 2025 BOARD MEETING, BOARD MEMBERS
- 8 REQUESTED INFORMATION ON STAFFING COSTS. SO WE'RE PROVIDE --
- 9 WE PREPARED TO PROVIDE YOU SOME RESPONSES. THE CLIPPER PROGRAM
- 10 HAS OPERATED CONSISTENTLY FOR YEARS WITH STAFFING LEVEL AROUND
- 11 15 FTES IN ORDER TO SUPPORT ONGOING CLIPPER CONTRACT
- 12 MANAGEMENT AND OVERSIGHT, PROGRAM ADMINISTRATION, MAINTENANCE
- 13 OF REGIONAL PROGRAMS DELIVERED THROUGH THE CLIPPER PLATFORM,
- 14 AND CUSTOMER OUTREACH AND COMMUNICATIONS. IN THE LAST TWO
- 15 YEARS, CLIPPER STAFF HAVE IDENTIFIED THE NEED AND FUNDING FOR
- 16 THREE ADDITIONAL POSITIONS IN ORDER TO ADDRESS OUR GROWING AND
- 17 EXPANDING PORTFOLIOS OF SERVICES AND PROGRAMS, INCLUDING
- 18 CLIPPER START, CLIPPER RTC ACCESS, THE CLIPPER BAY PASS, ASSET
- 19 MANAGEMENT REQUIREMENTS, HARDWARE AND SOFTWARE DEVELOPMENT,
- 20 RETAIL NETWORK OVERSIGHT FOCUSING ON EQUITY PRIORITY
- 21 COMMUNITIES, AND DIRECT TRANSIT OPERATOR SUPPORT, INCLUDING
- 22 SUPPORT FOR THIS BOARD. WE HAVE ALSO ASSUMED IN PLANNING FOR
- 23 ADDITIONAL CAPITAL WORK EQUIPMENT PROCUREMENT AFTER SYSTEM
- 24 COMPLETION. INITIALLY, AROUND 5 MILLION, WHICH WE RECOGNIZE
- 25 HAS YET TO BE FULLY SCOPED OR FUNDED, BUT BASED ON HISTORICAL



- 1 EXPERIENCE, WE THINK THAT AS A PROGRAM, THE CLIPPER PROGRAM
- 2 NEEDS TO PREPARE TO CONTINUE FUNDING FOR THINGS LIKE SYSTEM
- 3 MODIFICATIONS, ADDITIONAL EQUIPMENT AND CAPITAL PROCUREMENTS,
- 4 AND OTHER INVESTMENTS. THESE NUMBERS ARE NOW ITALICIZED IN THE
- 5 CAPITAL BUDGET TO INDICATE THESE WOULD LIKELY COULD OR WOULD
- 6 CHANGE IF FUNDING IS NOT AVAILABLE. GIVEN OUR PRIOR DECADES OF
- 7 LESSONS LEARNED FOR A NEED TO CONTINUOUSLY PLAN FOR CAPITAL
- 8 ENHANCEMENT AND IMPROVEMENTS, 5 MILLION HISTORICALLY
- 9 CONSISTENT TO PLAN FOR ADDITIONAL CAPITAL INVESTMENT WE
- 10 BELIEVE IT'S RESPONSIBLE AND IN THE REGION'S BEST INTEREST TO
- 11 PLAN FOR AND CONTINUE TO SEEK FUNDING OPTIONS FOR FUTURE
- 12 CAPITAL INVESTMENTS TO THE SYSTEM AS A REMINDER WHEN WE
- 13 AWARDED THE SYSTEM INTEGRATOR CONTRACT WE INCLUDED IN THE
- 14 BUDGET CONTINGENCY AND TAX ESTIMATES THAT WERE LIKELY TO
- 15 REVISIT AS THE C2 CAPITAL DELIVERY BEGINS TO WRAP UP AND FUND
- 16 SET ASIDE AND CONTINGENCY AND TAX COULD LIKELY BE USED FOR
- 17 CAPITAL PURPOSES WE PLAN TO RETURN TO THIS BOARD AFTER THE
- 18 INITIAL CAPITAL SYSTEM HAS BEEN DEPLOYED WITH AN UPDATE ON
- 19 CAPITAL COST SPECIFIC LIKELY AT THE POINT WE CAN IDENTIFY HOW
- 20 MUCH OF THAT FUNDING STILL REMAINS FOR OTHER POTENTIAL
- 21 INVESTMENTS. OVERALL WE BELIEVE THE CLIPPER PROGRAM IS STABLE
- 22 IN THE NEAR-TERM AND ARE CONFIDENT THAT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL
- 23 WORK ARE FULLY FUNDED IN THE NEXT TWO YEARS BEING PROVED BY
- 24 THIS BOARD WE RECOGNIZE NEED TO SEEK FURTHER FUNDING TO
- 25 MAINTAIN CLIPPER OPERATIONS AND ADDITIONAL CAPITAL PROJECTS



- 1 AND WORKS TO CONTINUE TO SUPPORT LONG-TERM TO THE BOARD IN SIX
- 2 MONTHS WITH UPDATE ON THE BUDGET AS WELL AS ACTUAL AMOUNT FOR
- 3 THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR ENDING JUNE 30TH, 2025 THAT CONCLUDES
- 4 MY REMARKS I'M HAPPY TO TAKE FURTHER OUESTIONS.

5

- 6 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT AS ALWAYS EDWARD
- 7 THOROUGH AND CONCISE THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO THE
- 8 PROGRAM. MADAM CLERK BEFORE WE HEAR FROM THE COMMISSIONERS,
- 9 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM EITHER VIRTUALLY OR IN THE ROOM.

10

- 11 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ONE PERSON IN THE ROOM ALETA DUPREE, YOU
- 12 HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

- 14 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR BOB POWERS AND
- 15 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM
- 16 FOLDS. WELL, WE'RE ABOUT HERE. WE'RE GOING TO GET OURSELVES A
- 17 BUDGET AGAIN. AND I HAVE BEEN READING THIS OVER, AND I THINK
- 18 WE HAVE A GOOD BUDGET WE HAVE GOOD CONTROLS IN PLACE TO USE
- 19 OUR MONEY WISELY. AND OUR STAFFING WISELY. I AM LOOKING
- 20 FORWARD TO THE EFFICIENCIES THAT ARE GOING TO COME FROM GOING
- 21 TO ONE PAYMENT SYSTEM, INSTEAD OF TWO. AND THIS WILL HELP US
- 22 SAVE SOME MONEY. INTEREST RATES, IT'S HARD TO TELL. I'M
- 23 GETTING 4% FOUR AND A HALF%. HARD TO TELL HOW LONG IT'S GOING
- 24 TO LAST. IT'S GOOD FOR HELPING TO PAY FOR THINGS, BUT
- 25 INFLATION COULD BE MORE SO WE MIGHT JUST BE SPINNING OUR



- 1 WHEELS BUT IT'S BETTER THAN FALLING BEHIND. I LOOK FORWARD TO
- 2 SIX MONTHS OUT HAVING AN UPDATE ESPECIALLY SEEING HOW CREDIT
- 3 CARD FEES ARE GOING TO PLAY OUT WHEN WE HAVE A LOT OF VERY
- 4 SMALL TRANSACTIONS. AS OPPOSED TO LARGER ONES. AND THAT IS
- 5 SOMETHING THAT IS BASED IN PART ON THE TYPE OF CARD THAT IS
- 6 USED. DEBIT CARDS ARE NOT VERY GOOD FOR SMALL TRANSACTION, AS
- 7 THEY HAVE A HIGH FIXED FEE MAKING CREDIT CARDS MORE FAVORABLE,
- 8 VICE-VERSA, AND VICE-VERSA, NEW YORK IS SEEING THIS BUT IN
- 9 TALKING WITH PEOPLE IN NEW YORK THEY'RE KEEPING THEIR CREDIT
- 10 CARD FEES IN LINE WITH WHAT IT WOULD COST TO BUY A ONE WEEK
- 11 METRO CARD PASS WE HAVE TO PASS THIS STAY ON TOP OF IT WITH
- 12 REGULAR UPDATES HOPING WE WILL SEE MORE CLIPPER USAGE WHICH
- 13 WILL HELP US AMORTIZE THIS \$465 MILLION INVESTMENT BUT TODAY
- 14 CITIZEN DAY.
- 15
- 16 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS ONLINE
- 17 NOTHING WAS RECEIVED IN WRITING.
- 18
- 19 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU MADAM CLERK FOR THAT.
- 20 COMMISSIONERS, THE ITEM IN FRONT OF US, AGAIN, IS AN ACTION
- 21 ITEM 3A AND THIS IS TO APPROVE THE TWO YEAR BUDGET AND
- 22 WORKPLAN. WE HAVE HEARD FROM EDWARD ON TWO OCCASIONS HERE. SO,
- 23 FIRST IT'S AN ACTION ITEM, IS THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND ON
- 24 THE ACTION ITEM, THEN WE'LL HAVE A DISCUSSION HERE.



ANDREW FREMIER: I'LL MOVE IT. FREMIER. 1 2 SPEAKER: I'LL SECOND. 3 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. SO, WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND HERE. TO APPROVE WHAT'S IN FRONT OF US HERE. IS THERE 6 ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION? GOING. I'M GOING TO MAKE ALTERNATIVE 7 8 MOTION HERE. SO, ARE I JUST WANT TO BE UP FRONT HERE. ON THE CURRENT MOTION THAT'S ON THE TABLE, ON THE FLOOR, ANYTHING? 9 OKAY. COUNSELLOR, I'M GOING TO MAKE A SUBSTITUTE MOTION HERE 10 11 THAT WE GO AHEAD AND APPROVE THIS TWO-YEAR BUDGET AND WORKPLAN, BUT THAT WITH THE UNKNOWN TO VICE CHAIR CHAN'S 12 COMMENT AND LC TOP AND THE FUNDS THAT ARE PROGRAMMED IN THIS 13 BUDGET THAT WE DON'T HAVE CONTROL OF, THAT THE MOTION DIRECTS 14 STAFF TO COME BACK TO THIS BOARD AS THOSE VARIABLES ARE 15 16 IDENTIFIED IN THE STATE'S BUDGET AND WHAT -- AND CHASE THOSE THROUGH THIS BUDGET THAT WE'RE APPROVING RIGHT NOW, SO THAT 17 THIS BOARD HAS A FULL UNDERSTANDING OF WHERE IT'S GOING. SO 18 THAT WOULD BE MY SUBSTITUTE MOTION. 19 20 SPEAKER: IS THE ORIGINAL MOTION WITHDRAWN? 21 22 23 ANDREW FREMIER: CAN WE ENTERTAIN A PRESENTLY AMENDMENT I'M ALL

RIGHT MOVING THAT ITEM AS DESCRIBED.

24



1

2

JUNE 2, 2025

CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY WE CAN CERTAINLY DO THAT THE MOTION

IS TO MOVE THEM WITH THAT FRIENDLY AMENDMENT TO T.

3 SPEAKER: OKAY. 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS ADVICE, BEFORE I 6 7 GET TOO FAR OVER MY SKIS. PARDON. 8 SPEAKER: SECOND. 9 10 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT. COMMENTS, CONCERNS, 11 ANYTHING COMING AROUND THIS WAY? ANYBODY? JULIE? 12 13 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: QUESTION FOR THE STAFF, IF THE LC TOP MONEY 14 15 DOESN'T COME THROUGH, WOULD THAT COME OUT OF OTHER MTC SOURCES 16 OR COME OUT OF AGENCIES BE'S BUDGETS OR JUST DO LESS? HOW WOULD THAT WORK? 17 18 ALIX BOCKELMAN: I THINK THAT WE WOULD NEED TO COME BACK TO YOU 19 AND DISCUSS IT. AS A REMINDER, WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE BUDGET 20 21 IS THROUGH THE CAP AND INVEST PROPOSAL THAT, SORT OF, THE CONTINUOUS APPROPRIATIONS THAT WE HAVE ENJOYED, INCLUDING FOR 22 LC TOP, ARE JUST, SORT OF, ON THE TABLE FOR RENEGOTIATION. 23 THEY'RE NOT PROPOSED FOR ELIMINATION AT THIS POINT, BUT 24

THEY'RE, SORT OF, MAYBE THROWN UP IN THE AIR A LITTLE BIT. SO,



1

JUNE 2, 2025

I THINK WE, OBVIOUSLY, WILL BE MONITORING THIS AND WE'LL NEED

2 TO COME BACK WITH THOUGHTS ABOUT HOW WE WOULD FILL SUCH A BIG 3 GAP IF THAT FUNDING WAS TO BE CUT OR GO AWAY. 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? NOT SEEING 6 ANY. OKAY. SO, WE HAVE A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT ON THE FLOOR HERE TO APPROVE THE BUDGET AND THE WORKPLAN WITH THAT FRIENDLY 7 8 AMENDMENT. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR SAY AYE. [AYES] 9 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: ANY OPPOSITION? NOT SEEING ANY MADAM 10 CLERK WE PASSED UNANIMOUSLY ITEM NUMBER 3A CLIPPER2 YEAR 11 BUDGET AND WORKPLAN. EDWARD, THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION. 12 AND I SEE LYSA HALE COMING TO JOIN US AT THE BENCH UP FRONT 13 HERE AND THE ITEM IN FRONT OF US MISS HALE IS THE CLIPPER 14 15 EDUCATION OUTREACH CONTRACT ACTION ITEMS THERE IS A COUPLE OF 16 CONTRACT AMENDMENTS THAT YOU'RE GOING TO WALK THIS BOARD 17 THROUGH. SO, WITH THAT INTRODUCTION, I'LL TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO YOU, LYSA. 18 19 LYSA HALE: OKAY. THANK YOU. LYSA HALE WITH CLIPPER STAFF. I'M 20 21 HERE TODAY TO REQUEST APPROVAL TO ADD FUNDS TO TWO CONTRACTS, OUR CUSTOMER EDUCATION CONTRACTOR AND OUR OUTREACH CONTRACTOR, 22 MOORE LACOFANO GOLTSMAN, MIG, HAS BEEN PROVIDING CUSTOMER 23 EDUCATION SERVICES FOR BOTH THE REGULAR CLIPPER PROGRAM AND 24

CLIPPER START PROGRAM. FOR THE REGULAR PROGRAM, THEY MANAGE



- 1 OUR WEB SITE AND SOCIAL MEDIA, PRODUCE SIGNAGE AND BROCHURES
- 2 AND DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT ADVERTISING CAMPAIGNS WE HAVE HAD IN
- 3 RECENT YEARS, SUCH AS SUCCESSFUL EFFORT TO MOVE CLIPPER
- 4 CUSTOMERS TO MOBILE CARDS. FOR THE COMING YEAR, THEIR WORK
- 5 WILL BE LARGELY FOCUSED ON SUPPORTING THE LAUNCH OF NEXT
- 6 GENERATION CLIPPER. THIS WILL INCLUDE A NUMBER OF CAMPAIGNS
- 7 USING ADVERTISING ON SOCIAL MEDIA AND E-MAIL, PRODUCTION,
- 8 EDUCATIONAL VIDEOS PRINTED MATERIALS FOR CUSTOMERS AND TRANSIT
- 9 AGENCIES, PRESENTATIONS, AND CONTINUE MARKETING OF CLIPPER
- 10 MOBILE PAYMENT. THEIR WORK ON CLIPPER START WILL INCLUDE A
- 11 CAMPAIGN STARTING IN AUGUST FEATURING ADVERTISING,
- 12 INFLUENCERS, TOOL KITS FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES AND UPDATES TO THE
- 13 WEB SITE. OUR OUTREACH FOR CLIPPER START HAS BEEN PROVIDED BY
- 14 CARIBOU PUBLIC RELATIONS. CARIBOU STAFFS EVENTS AT COMMUNITY-
- 15 BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND BART STATIONS, DISTRIBUTES MATERIALS
- 16 IN TARGETED ZIP CODES, IN CONTRAST WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
- 17 ORGANIZATIONS TO SERVE AS INFORMATIONAL HUBS AND PROMOTE THE
- 18 PROGRAM TO THEIR SERVICE POPULATIONS. STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT
- 19 THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVE THE ADDITION OF 3.1
- 20 MILLION TO THE MIG CONTRACT AND \$400,000 TO THE CARIBOU
- 21 CONTRACT. AND WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.
- 23 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT MISS HALE. SO WE HAVE
- 24 AN ACTION ITEM IN FRONT OF THE BOARD FOR TWO AMENDMENTS. LET'S



PAUSE FOR A SECOND. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM 1 2 EITHER VIRTUALLY OR IN THE ROOM? 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES, WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER HERE IN THE 4 5 ROOM. ALETA DUPREE, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. 6 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA 7 8 DUPREE. FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT I HAVE BEEN DOING CLIPPER FOR ABOUT 15 YEARS 9 NOW. YOU CAN NEVER UNDERESTIMATE THE IMPORTANCE OF OUTREACH. I 10 SEE PEOPLE GETTING ON VARIOUS CONVEYANCES AND THEY'RE OFTEN 11 FROM OTHER PLACES AND THEY DON'T KNOW HOW OUR SYSTEMS WORK. I 12 SEE IT SOMETIMES ON THE AC TRANSIT F-BUS GOING TO SAN 13 FRANCISCO, PEOPLE HAVE A \$20 BILL. THEY DON'T KNOW ABOUT 14 15 CLIPPER. AND THE CLIPPER APP. THEY HAVE PHONES. SOON WE'RE 16 GOING TO HAVE OPEN PAYMENT. AND SO THERE IS A LOT OF FACTORS AT PLAY. I THINK ABOUT BEING BACK IN NEW YORK AND A CLOSE 17 FAMILY MEMBER ASKED ME FOR HELP IN SETTING UP HER REDUCED FARE 18 OMNI, WHICH I DID WE MADE A PHONE CALL TOGETHER AND WE GOT HER 19 SET UP AND NOW SHE PAYS HALF FARE ON THE SUBWAY, AS SHE 20 21 SHOULD. SHE'S 83. AND HOW DO WE GET OUT THERE TO ALL THESE DIFFERENT POPULATIONS WHICH OF WHICH MAY NOT HAVE PHONES, SOME 22 OF WHICH MAY NOT HAVE TELEVISIONS OR INTERNET ACCESS, AND SOME 23 MAY NOT HAVE BANK ACCOUNTS BUT YOU CAN DO CLIPPER WITHOUT A 24

BANK ACCOUNT. I HAVE SEVERAL SMALL BANK ACCOUNTS, BUT YOU CAN



- 1 DO IT WITHOUT A BANK ACCOUNT. SO, WE WANT PLACES THAT PEOPLE
- 2 CAN TAKE THEIR MONEY, IMAGINE IF YOU COULD POUR YOUR SMALL
- 3 CHANGE INTO A MACHINE, LIKE THEY HAVE IN SUPERMARKETS AND YOU
- 4 CAN PUT THAT ON YOUR CLIPPER, BECAUSE THAT MONEY IS NOT DOING
- 5 YOU MUCH GOOD SITTING IN ONE OF THOSE BIG FIVE GALLON WATER
- 6 JUGS. I SEE THOSE HERE AND THERE, YOU TAKE IT TO THE BANK PUT
- 7 IT INTO CLIPPER THEN YOU HAVE PLENTY OF TRANSIT FARE TO ENJOY
- 8 GETTING AROUND. BUT OUTREACH IS ESSENTIAL AND IT'S COMPLICATED
- 9 YOU CAN ONLY DO SO MUCH WITH ONE-ON-ONE. SO IT'S THESE
- 10 CONTRACTS THAT WILL HELP US GET OUT INTO MANY MORE COMMUNITIES
- 11 THAN I COULD. SO, WE HAVE TO DO THIS. THANK YOU.

- 13 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN. YOU HAVE TWO
- 14 MINUTES TO SPEAK. YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF.

15

- 16 ADINA LEVIN: YES, ADINA LEVIN. AND CHAIRING THE NETWORK
- 17 MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP, SERVING ON THE POLICY
- 18 ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND, ALSO, WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. I THINK
- 19 THESE POINTS ARE GOING TO START FROM THE NOT SPEAKING FOR THE
- 20 ADVISORY GROUPS THAT REPORTING ON THINGS THAT HAVE BEEN
- 21 DISCUSSED AT THE ADVISORY GROUPS, WHERE BUILDING ON THE
- 22 PREVIOUS COMMENT, IT'S GOOD TO SEE THE PLAN TO DO THE
- 23 PROMOTION OF CLIPPER START, AND REALLY FOCUSING ON PEOPLE THAT
- 24 WOULD BENEFIT FROM THESE INITIATIVES, AND, SO, THE QUESTION IS
- 25 IT SEEMS LIKE THIS IS ABOUT PROMOTING THE CURRENT PRODUCT;



- 1 THERE IS ADDITIONALLY A NEED TO HAVE A MORE REFINED
- 2 UNDERSTANDING OF THE PAYMENT NEEDS FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE A LOT
- 3 OF MONEY AND THERE IS A VARIETY OF ISSUES RANGING FROM ARE
- 4 THERE ENOUGH PLACES TO RECHARGE YOUR CLIPPER CARD, HOW WELL IS
- 5 THE PROCESS OF SIGNING UP FOR THE DISCOUNTS WORKING, AND SOME
- 6 OF THE INITIATIVES TO STREAMLINE THAT PROCESS AS THE
- 7 DEVELOPMENT PROCEEDS OF FEATURES THAT ALLOW DISCOUNTS TO WORK
- 8 WITH OPEN PAYMENT, HOW IS THAT GOING, WHAT KINDS OF, YOU KNOW,
- 9 PREPAID CARDS OR BENEFIT CARDS WOULD WORK WITH THAT, SORT OF,
- 10 SYSTEM. THERE IS A VARIETY OF POTENTIAL WAYS TO IMPROVE THE
- 11 USER EXPERIENCE, SO I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S INCLUDED IN THIS OR
- 12 WHETHER THAT WOULD BE ADDITIONAL INVESTMENT. THANK YOU VERY
- 13 MUCH.

14

17

- 15 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 16 ON THIS ITEM.
- 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK FOR THAT. AND
- 19 THANK YOU FOR ALL THE SPEAKERS WHO TOOK TIME OUT OF THEIR DAY
- 20 TO COME TO THIS BOARD MEETING AND PUT PUBLIC COMMENT,
- 21 APPRECIATE IT. WE HAVE IN FRONT OF US, COMMISSIONERS, AN
- 22 ACTION ITEM FOR TWO AMENDMENTS, ONE TO MIG AND ONE TO CARIBOU,
- 23 ACTION ITEM. YOU HAVE HEARD DISCUSSION FROM MISS HALE. FIRST
- 24 LET ME SEE IF THERE IS A MOTION ON THIS ITEM.



SPEAKER: I'LL MAKE A MOTION TO MOVE. 1 2 SPEAKER: I'LL SECOND. 3 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. 6 COMMISSIONERS, COMMENTS? CONCERNS? ANY? GREG? AND I HAVE ONE. 7 8 GREG RICHARDSON: CLARIFICATION. THE DOCUMENT SHOWS THE CURRENT CONTRACT IS JUNE 30TH, 2026. SO, DOES THIS EXTEND THE TERM OF 9 THAT CURRENT CONTRACT OR DOES IT STAY WITHIN THE JUNE 30, 2026 10 CONTRACT? 11 12 LYSA HALE: IT STAYS WITHIN THAT TERM. IT JUST ADDS MONEY FOR 13 14 THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR. 15 16 GREG RICHARDSON: OKAY. THANK YOU. 17 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: SO, MISS -- OH, YEAH. SORRY. APRIL CHAN, 18 VICE CHAIR. 19 20 V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: THANKS LYSA. JUST CLARIFICATION. SO, 21 22 \$3.1 MILLION IS FOR THE UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR 2026. I PRESUME WHEN WE STARTED FISCAL YEAR 2025, KNOWING THAT WE WERE GOING 23 TO ROLL OUT CLIPPER2.0, WAS THERE SOME SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT THAT 24

WAS INCLUDED IN THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR THAT NOW WILL BE



AVAILABLE FOR THIS UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR? AND I LOOKED AT THE 1 2 SCOPE, IT INCLUDES BOTH CLIPPER2.0 AND ALSO CLIPPER START, AND 3 ARE WE TRYING TO PUSH OUT MORE ON THE CLIPPER START? LIKE, WHAT IS THE DIVVYING OF RESOURCES BETWEEN CLIPPER2.0 AND 4 5 CLIPPER START? 6 LYSA HALE: WELL, TO ANSWER THE LAST OUESTION FIRST, THE AMOUNT 7 8 FOR CLIPPER START IS \$800,000, AND THEN THE REMAINDER IS FOR THE REST OF THE PROGRAM. YES, WE DID HAVE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT 9 10 ALLOCATED FOR THIS -- ALLOCATED ISN'T THE CORRECT WORD -- SET ASIDE FOR NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER. WHAT WE HAVE FOUND IS WE 11 HAVE GOTTEN STARTED ON A LOT OF THE MATERIALS THAT NEED TO BE 12 DEVELOPED. AND AS -- AS OUR PLANS HAVE ROLLED OUT, WE HAVE 13 DETERMINED THAT WE NEED TO DO SOME MORE ADVERTISING THAN WHAT 14 15 WE ORIGINALLY ANTICIPATED. FOR EXAMPLE, WE WERE GOING TO DO 16 SOMETHING FOR SOFT LAUNCH JUST LETTING PEOPLE KNOW THAT CONTACTLESS PAYMENTS ARE HERE, THEN WE ALSO NEED TO DO 17 SOMETHING ABOUT TELLING PEOPLE HOW TO CHECK THEIR BALANCE AND 18 HOW TO AVOID CARD CLASH. SO THOSE ARE THREE SEPARATE CAMPAIGNS 19 RATHER THAN THE ONE THAT WE WERE ENVISIONING AND ALL OF THOSE 20 21 COME WITH SIGNIFICANT PRICE TAGS IN TERMS OF PAYING FOR THE ADVERTISING SPACE. SO THAT'S JUST AN EXAMPLE. 22 23 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: GOOD. OKAY. HEY, LYSA, AT A HIGH-LEVEL, 24

YOU'RE COMING UP HERE IN FRONT OF THE BOARD AFTER EDWARD AND



HE JUST GOT, WITH THE FRIENDLY AMENDMENT HIS BUDGET IN THE 1 WORKPLAN APPROVED GIVE ME SOME ASSURANCES THAT THESE 2 3 AMENDMENTS HAVE CROSS WALKED INTO EDWARD'S WORKPLAN THAT WE JUST VOTED ON, CONNECT THOSE DOTS FOR ME. ASSUMING THEY ARE. 4 5 LYSA HALE: THEY ARE. 6 7 8 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: GIVE ME ASSURANCE THAT IF I VOTE FOR 9 THIS THAT YOUR COORDINATED EFFORTS WITH MIG AND CARIBOU ARE INHERENT IN EDWARD'S THAT WE JUST APPROVED. 10 11 JASON WEINSTEIN: CAN I TRY OUR TEAM COLLECTIVELY MEETS WHEN WE 12 PRODUCE THE BUDGET OUR WHOLE TEAM FOR ALL CONSULTANT CONTRACTS 13 ALL WORK THAT WE'RE DOING THAT ARE IMPROVEMENTS TO THE PROGRAM 14 GET WORKED THROUGH THE BUDGETARY PROCESS SO WE MAKE SURE WE 15 16 AREN'T LEAVING THINGS ON THE TABLE AND SAY HEY YOU HAVE GOT THIS THING APPROVED BUT WE DIDN'T HAVE IT IN THE BUDGET SO 17 REALLY THE BUDGET IS, SORT OF, NORTH STAR THEN EVERYTHING KIND 18 19 OF FLOWS FROM THAT. 20 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY EDWARD. EDWARD, ANYTHING ON THE 21

22

23

RESPONSE.



EDWARD MENG: ON THE OPERATING BUDGET IF YOU LOOK AT LINE 22 1 THOSE ARE THE REGIONAL MEASURE TWO FUNDS THAT ARE INCLUDED IN 2 3 OUR BUDGET THAT WOULD BE FUNDING LYSA'S AMENDMENTS. 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THE RM2 FUNDS. 6 7 LYSA HALE: THAT'S FOR THE REGULAR CLIPPER PROGRAM FUNDS. 8 9 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: GOT IT. 10 LYSA HALE: THE \$800,000 FOR CLIPPER START IS ABOVE THAT AND 11 COMES FROM A SEPARATE FUNDING SOURCE. 12 13 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. I JUST WANTED TO GET SOME 14 ASSURANCES THAT, YOU KNOW, DEPENDING DEPARTMENTS ARE TALKING 15 16 TO EACH OTHER AS ALL OF THIS COMES IN FRONT OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD I APPRECIATE THE CONFIDENCE LEVEL THANK YOU 17 FOR THAT. COMMISSIONERS WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE 18 BOTH OF THESE AMENDMENTS. ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] ANY 19 OPPOSITION? MADAM CLERK, FOR THE RECORD, UNANIMOUS VOTE ON 20 BOTH AMENDMENTS UNDER AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 3B. WHICH BRINGS US 21 TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER 4A AGENDA ITEM 4A IS THE CLIPPER 22 SCHEDULE IMPLEMENTATION AND DEPLOYMENT UPDATE. AND SO WITH 23 THAT I'LL TURN THIS OVER TO YOU, JASON. 24



- 1 JASON WEINSTEIN: THANKS CHAIR POWERS. COULD WE GET THE SLIDES
- 2 UP? THANK YOU. SO, WHEN THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MET APRIL
- 3 28TH WE PARTICIPATED THAT THE PRETRANSITION PILOT TEST WOULD
- 4 START IN JULY. HOWEVER, BECAUSE OF THE CONTINUED PROGRAM AND
- 5 SCHEDULE RISKS, WE HAVE HAD TO MOVE THAT DATE. CUBIC AND MTC
- 6 EXECUTIVES MEET EACH WEEK TO DISCUSS PROGRESS AND SCHEDULE
- 7 MITIGATION IDEAS AND WE CONTINUE TO WORK WITH URGENCY TO BRING
- 8 ALL THE DIFFERENT MOVING PARTS OF THE SYSTEM TOGETHER, EXCUSE
- 9 ME -- TO ACHIEVE THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER CUSTOMER
- 10 TRANSITION. NEXT SLIDE. AS NOTED IN APRIL ALL RISKS NEED TO BE
- 11 EITHER RESOLVED OR FULLY UNDERSTOOD BEFORE WE CAN RESPONSIBLY
- 12 MOVE ON TO CUSTOMER TRANSITION. NUMBER ONE GOAL IS MINIMAL
- 13 IMPACT FOR CUSTOMERS AS WE MOVE TO THE NEW SYSTEM AND I AM
- 14 CONFIDENT BEING ABLE TO CROSS OFF THE FARE GATE INSTALLATION
- 15 AND TRAINING AND I'LL GET TO THAT LATER IN THE PRESENTATION.
- 16 NEXT SLIDE. TODAY WE HAVE OVER 100 MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF OUT
- 17 TESTING THE NEW SYSTEM ON ACTUAL DEVICES AND MULTIPLE
- 18 OPERATORS WHILE ALSO TESTING CARD ORDERING AND DISCOUNTS
- 19 APPLICATION PROCESSING SFMTA FARE GATES ARE FULLY INSTALLED.
- 20 SO, THAT'S GREAT NEWS THERE, AND BART JUST DAYS AWAY FROM
- 21 THEIR FARE GATE COMPLETION. BART TICKET VENDING MACHINES ARE
- 22 BEING CONTINUALLY TESTED AND INSTALLED AND VENTEK CONTINUES TO
- 23 MAKE PROGRESS ON COMPLETING THEIR SOFTWARE UPDATE. WE HAVE
- 24 ALSO MADE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS WITH THE MOBILE WALLET TESTING.
- 25 WE'RE JUST A COUPLE WEEKS AWAY FROM COMPLETION. IN HAVING THE



- 1 NEW HARDWARE WORK WITH THE OLD SYSTEM, THEN SEAMLESSLY
- 2 SWITCHING TO THE NEW SYSTEM HAS REALLY PROVEN MORE DIFFICULT
- 3 THAN WE HAD ESTIMATED. BUT THE GOOD NEWS IS THAT THESE
- 4 ACCOMPLISHMENTS WE'RE GETTING CLOSE TO COMPLETING THE TASK TO
- 5 EXPAND TO THAT PUBLIC PILOT. YOU WILL SE ON THIS SLIDE, AS I
- 6 MENTIONED JUST VERBALLY BEFORE WE REMOVE THE FARE GATE
- 7 INTEGRATION INSTALLATION AND TRAINING OPERATOR STAFF. THAT,
- 8 DOESN'T MEAN THEY'RE COMPLETE. IT JUST MEANS THAT WE THINK
- 9 THEY'RE NOT RISKED TO THE SCHEDULE AT THIS POINT. SO, FOR NOW,
- 10 LET'S SEE. I'M GOING TO PAUSE AND INTRODUCE MARK STADTHERR,
- 11 SENIOR ADVISOR, AND REINTRODUCE ANTHONY DEVITO, SENIOR
- 12 DIRECTOR FROM CUBIC, WHO ARE GOING TO DISCUSS THE SPECIFIC
- 13 CUBIC ACCOMPLISHMENTS.

- 15 MARK STADTHERR: THANKS JASON, AND THANK YOU TO MEMBERS OF THE
- 16 BOARD FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO HERE WITH YOU TODAY. I'M MARK
- 17 STADTHERR, SENIOR LEADER IN AMERICA'S WEST REGION, CUBIC
- 18 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS, NOW ACTING AS ADVISOR ON THE NEXT
- 19 GENERATION CLIPPER PROGRAM. IN MY ROLE AT CUBIC, I HAVE
- 20 OVERSIGHT OF MULTIPLE SYSTEM UPGRADE PROGRAMS, LIKE THIS ONE,
- 21 AND I AM APPLYING BEST PRACTICES FROM ACROSS CUBIC TO
- 22 ACCELERATE OUR READINESS FOR THE SYSTEM LAUNCH LATER ON THIS
- 23 SUMMER. MY FOCUS LEADING UP TO THE LAUNCH WILL BE TO
- 24 UNDERSTAND THE ISSUES THAT PARTICIPANTS ARE RAISING AND TO
- 25 ALIGN OUR RESOURCES TO GET THEM RESOLVED AS QUICKLY AS



POSSIBLE. TO THIS END, WE HAVE MOBILIZED A SERIES OF DAILY 1 STAND-UP MEETINGS WITH DEVELOPMENT TEAMS RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL 2 3 VARIOUS COMPONENTS IN THE NEXT GENERATION SYSTEM. WE ARE USING THESE MEETINGS TO DRIVE PRIORITIZATION AND TO PROVIDE MTC WITH 4 5 UPDATES ON THE ISSUE RESOLUTION AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. AS DISCUSSED IN RECENT CB MEETINGS, CUBIC IS FULLY COMMITTED TO 6 DELIVERING A HIGH QUALITY AND WORLD CLASS FARE COLLECTION 7 8 SYSTEM AND ALL OF OUR RESOURCES ARE BEING APPLIED TO COMPLETING THE ROLL OUT OF THE PROGRAM, RESOLVING THE KNOWN 9 ISSUES AND SUPPORTING THE REGION'S STAKEHOLDERS TO FACILITATE 10 THE SUCCESSFUL LAUNCH THIS SUMMER. NEXT YOU WILL HEAR FROM 11 ANTHONY DEVITO SENIOR DIRECTOR OF THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER 12 PROGRAM. ANTHONY WILL WALK US THROUGH CUBIC'S PROGRESS AND THE 13 MAJOR ACCOMPLISHMENTS SINCE WE LAST MET. ANTHONY. 14 15 16 ANTHONY DEVITO: THANK YOU, MARK. GOOD AFTERNOON BOARD MEMBERS MY NAME IS ANTHONY DEVITO I AM THE SENIOR DIRECTOR AT CUBIC 17 RESPONSIBLE FOR DELIVERY OF THE C2 SYSTEM INTEGRATED PROJECT 18 ACROSS ALL OF OUR 22 PARTICIPATING TRANSIT AGENCIES THANK YOU 19 FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE HERE, IN THE WEEKS SINCE OUR LAST 20 21 MEETING WE HAVE HAD SEVERAL MAJOR ACCOMPLISHMENTS, ALL FARE 22 AGAINST IN SFMTA HAVE BEEN UPGRADED TO NEXT GENERATION READERS SOFTWARE HAS ENHANCED, ADDITIONALLY BART HAS MADE SIGNIFICANT 23 PROGRESS WITH THEIR READER INSTALLATION, AND REFITS BART HAS 24

INDICATED THEY WILL COMPLETE THEIR CORRESPONDING INSTALLATION



- 1 EFFORTS SHORTLY, AND BART WITH TWO ADDITIONAL ITERATIONS OF
- 2 THEIR CONVINCING MACHINE SOFTWARE COLLABORATING WITH ROLL OUT
- 3 OF NEW READERS, ALSO CONTINUE TO COLLABORATE WITH MOBILE
- 4 WALLET PARTNERS WE HAVE CONFIRMED SUPPORT FOR THE NEXT
- 5 GENERATION CLIPPER VIRTUAL CARDS AS WELL AS SEAMLESS MIGRATION
- 6 TO THE NEW SOLUTION FROM THE SERVICES USED TODAY WE'LL BE
- 7 DEPLOYING THE NEW PLATFORM TO PRODUCTION FOR INCLUSION IN THE
- 8 PILOT TESTING PROCESS. AS FARE GATE'S TDMS AND MOBILE WALLETS
- 9 HAVE BEEN MAKING PROGRESS WE HAVE CONTINUED TO ROLL OUT NEW
- 10 FEATURES AND FUNCTIONS FOR USE DURING THE PILOT PART OF
- 11 ADVANCEMENTS OF A LARGER ECOSYSTEM SYSTEM OF TOOLS AND
- 12 PLATFORMS TO PARTNER TECHNOLOGIES THAT WILL WORK TOGETHER
- 13 SEAMLESSLY, HUNDREDS OF FARE PRODUCTS REQUIRED BY
- 14 PARTICIPATING TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN IMPLEMENTED WHICH HAS
- 15 ENABLED COMPONENTS LIKE VENTEK TVMS AND VARIOUS WEB PORTALS
- 16 DEVELOPMENT AND TESTING, PRODUCTION SYSTEMS DEMONSTRATING THE
- 17 COMPLETE ORDER FULFILLMENT PROCESS, WE'RE FOCUSING OUR LOCAL
- 18 TEAM ON DAILY ANALYSIS OF SYSTEM ACTIVITY AND RESOLUTION OF
- 19 ISSUES REPORTED BY PILOT PARTICIPANTS, MEETINGS HELD DAILY
- 20 WITH VARIOUS DEVELOPMENT TEAMS GLOBALLY TO CLARIFY OUR
- 21 UNDERSTANDING OF REPORTED ISSUES AND PRIORITIZE REMEDIATION
- 22 ACTIVITIES WE'RE MEETING WITH MTC MULTIPLE TIMES A WEEK 90
- 23 ALIGNMENT WITH MANY STAKEHOLDERS WORKING TOWARD THE PILOT
- 24 SUCCESS AND REVIEWING REPORTED ISSUES AND FOLLOW UP WORK. NEXT
- 25 FEW WEEKS INCREASING PILOT ACTIVITY WILL BE KEY BUILDING OUR



CONFIDENCE IN THE SYSTEM AS WE PLAN FOR HIGH OUALITY LAUNCH 1 THIS SUMMER. WITH THAT I'LL HAND IT BACK TO DIRECTOR WEINSTEIN 2 3 TO CONTINUE WITH THE PRESENTATION. 4 5 >>JASON WEINSTEIN: THANKS, ANTHONY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS A DETAILED CRITICAL PATH SLIDE, WHICH I PRESENTED AT THE 6 APRIL CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING SHOWING THE CRITICAL 7 8 PATH AND NEAR CRITICAL PATH ITEMS, WHICH I WILL UPDATE ON THIS NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, YOU CAN SEE I HAVE HIGHLIGHTED AND 9 NOTATED THE ITEMS THAT WE WERE UNABLE TO COMPLETE SINCE THE 10 LAST CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING. BY SOME OF THESE TASKS 11 NOT BEING COMPLETED, IT HAS PUT THEM ON THE CRITICAL PATH. 12 ALTHOUGH, WE HAVE MADE GOOD PROGRESS WITH OUR ACCOMPLISHMENTS, 13 SOME OF THESE TASKS ARE ONLY NOW NEARING COMPLETION, WHICH 14 WILL ALLOW US TO MOVE TO THE NEXT STEP ON THE SCHEDULE. THIS 15 16 HAS ADDED APPROXIMATELY A MONTH TO OUR PROJECTED SCHEDULE, WHICH CAN BE SEEN ON THE NEXT TWO SLIDES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. 17 AS I NOTED AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PRESENTATION, WE HAVE 18 REMOVED FARE GATE INSTALLATION AND THE TRAINING ITEMS FROM THE 19 REMAINING RISKS IN THE BOX THAT YOU SEE ON THE RIGHT OF THAT 20 SLIDE. BECAUSE WE DON'T SEE THEM AS BEING MOTIVATORS TO THE 21 CRITICAL PATH. I HAVE, HOWEVER, ADDED ITEMS SHOWN THAT WERE 22 NOT COMPLETED ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE TO THIS LIST. SO YOU CAN 23 SEE THEM HIGHLIGHTED IN YELLOW HERE. YOU SEE AT THE BOTTOM TWO 24

ROWS OF THE SCHEDULE THAT THE PILOT PERIOD HAS EXTENDED TO



- 1 ACCOMMODATE THESE NEW SCHEDULE DRIVERS AND UNTIL ALL RISKS
- 2 SHOWN HERE ARE RESOLVED WE CAN'T RESPONSIBLY MOVE ON TO
- 3 CUSTOMER TRANSITION. FINALLY WE'LL GO BACK TO THE MORE
- 4 DETAILED SCHEDULE. SO, NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS AN UPDATED
- 5 VERSION OF A DETAILED SCHEDULE WITH THE ITEMS THAT WERE
- 6 HIGHLIGHT ON THE PREVIOUS SCHEDULE SHOWN WITH THE NEW
- 7 PROJECTED DATES. THERE IS A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF DETAIL BEYOND
- 8 WHAT'S SHOWN HERE, BUT I WANTED TO ILLUSTRATE THE COMPLEX
- 9 NATURE OF THIS VERY SUBSTANTIAL TECHNOLOGY PROJECT, WHICH FOR
- 10 MANY OF THE BOARD MEMBERS THAT ARE KEENLY AWARE. AS HAS BEEN
- 11 SEEN AND DISCUSSED AT THE LAST CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
- 12 MEETING, ANY OF THESE ITEMS CAN BE THE NEW CRITICAL PATH WITH
- 13 A SLIGHT CHANGE IN THEIR DURATION. WE DO CONTINUE TO MAKE
- 14 PROGRESS AND PUSH FORWARD AND AS STATED EARLIER THE NUMBER ONE
- 15 GOAL IS TO ROLL OUT THE NEW SYSTEM WITH MINIMAL IMPACT ON
- 16 CUSTOMERS WE'LL BE BACK IN A FEW WEEKS TO PROVIDE ANOTHER
- 17 UPDATE TO THIS BOARD AND WE'RE ALL HERE TO ANSWER THE
- 18 OUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.
- 20 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT UPDATE ON WHERE
- 21 WE ARE WITH THE SCHEDULE FOR CLIPPER2. MADAM CLERK, THE --
- 22 AGAIN, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM, COMMISSIONERS. MADAM
- 23 CLERK, LET'S CHECK WITH OUR PUBLIC AND SEE IF THERE IS ANY
- 24 PUBLIC COMMENT, EITHER IN THE ROOM OR VIRTUALLY?

25



CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE TWO PUBLIC SPEAKERS. STARTING 1 2 OUT IN THE ROOM WITH ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE COME TO THE PODIUM. 3 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. 4 5 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN. CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THIS ISN'T 6 EASY. AND WE'RE TRYING. I THINK WE ARE. I'M DEPENDING ON 7 8 EVERYONE TO DO THEIR PART. YOU'RE GIVING OVERSIGHT, AND OUR TEAM HERE IS DOING THE HEAVY LIFTING OF GETTING THIS DONE. AND 9 THIS IS A MEGA PROJECT. BECAUSE I THINK BACK TO WATCHING MTA 10 BOARD MEETINGS AND THEIR OMNI FARE SYSTEM IS CALLED A MEGA 11 PROJECT. AND THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST COMPLEX PROJECTS THAT WE 12 HAVE EVER SEEN. I DON'T THINK IT'S EVER REALLY BEEN DONE 13 BEFORE. I CAN'T SPEAK FOR LA, THEY HAVE A SIMILAR NUMBER OF 14 15 AGENCIES OUT THERE. AND I'M NOT REAL HAPPY ABOUT THINGS BEING 16 PUSHED BACK. AND I OFTEN THINK ABOUT GERRY RAFFERTY'S SONG GET IT RIGHT NEXT TIME. WELL, WITH US THERE IS NO NEXT TIME. WE 17 HAVE TO GET IT RIGHT THE FIRST TIME. AND I HAVE BEEN HEARING 18 IN NEW YORK THAT'S GENERATING A LOT OF BUZZ ABOUT PEOPLE WHO 19 ARE FINDING A LOT OF SMALL TRANSACTIONS COMING UP ON THEIR 20 21 PHONES AND ON THEIR CARD STATEMENTS FOR ALL THESE -- FOR ALL THE TIMES THAT THEY TAP INTO THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. THERE IS 22 NOTHING TECHNICALLY WRONG. EVERYTHING IS WORKING RIGHT. IT'S 23 JUST AN ISSUE OF TIMING. BUT IT STILL GENERATES A LOT OF BUZZ 24

BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE WONDERING WHY ARE THESE COMING IN SO LATE



AND THEY'RE MISMATCHED WITH THE PERCEPTION OF WHEN THESE 1 CHARGES SHOULD BE COMING IN. SO, THERE IS NOTHING WRONG WITH 2 3 OMNI. BUT EVEN WHEN THINGS ARE GOING RIGHT, BUT PEOPLE PERCEIVE THEM TO BE OFF, IT GENERATES A LOT OF BUZZ. WE HAVE 4 5 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE GET THIS RIGHT, BECAUSE NONE OF US WANT EGG ON OUR FACE. I DON'T WANT EGG ON MY FACE. BECAUSE I TALK 6 ABOUT THIS ALL THE TIME. WE HAVE TO GET IT RIGHT THE FIRST 7 8 TIME. THANK YOU. 9 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA 10 LEVIN, YOU HAVE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO 11 12 SPEAK. 13 ADINA LEVIN: ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA WITH A NARROW 14 15 OUESTION AND THEN A BROADER COMMENT. THE NARROW OUESTION IS, 16 AS THE ITEMS ON THE TASKING LIST AND CRITICAL PATH LIST GET 17 CROSSED OFF THERE, SEEM TO BE SOME FINE GRAINED DIFFERENCES IN WHAT WAS REPORTED LAST WEEK TO THE AC TRANSIT BOARD AND WHAT'S 18 IN THE MTC STAFF REPORT THAT COULD JUST BE A REFLECTION OF THE 19 DIFFERENT GRANULARITY WHERE AC TRANSIT HAD MORE LINE ITEMS 20 THAN THE MTC SLIDES SO IT COULD BE THAT THINGS LOOK DIFFERENT 21 THEY'RE ACTUALLY THE SAME I HOPE THAT'S THE CASE. THE BIGGER 22 COMMENT IS THAT AS THIS PROJECT IS CONTINUING TO INCREMENTALLY 23 BE LATER THAN ANTICIPATED, YOU KNOW, DELIVERING LARGE PROJECTS 24

IS KNOWN TO BE DIFFICULT, THERE HAVE BEEN ANY NUMBER OF --



- 1 EXAMPLES OF PROJECTS IN OUR REGION OTHER AND LOCATIONS THAT DO
- 2 RUN LATE AND IT WOULD BE USEFUL TO HAVE AN INTENTION TO HAVE
- 3 AN AFTER ACTION REVIEW ONCE THIS IS DELIVERED IN ORDER TO BE
- 4 ABLE TO FINE TUNE HOW FUTURE FEATURES WERE DELIVERED. IN THE
- 5 PREVIOUS ITEM ON THE BUDGET, THERE ARE GOING TO BE FUTURE
- 6 FEATURES ON THIS PLATFORM AND BEING ABLE TO DELIVER THEM IN A
- 7 MORE TIMELY FASHION WILL BE HELPFUL. THERE MAY BE SOME LESSONS
- 8 LEARNED AS TO HOW TO ORGANIZE THIS PROJECT IN A WAY TO, YOU
- 9 KNOW, DELIVER MORE PROMPTLY, AND IN DISCUSSING THE REGIONAL
- 10 FUNDING MEASURE, WHICH IS A POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCE, THERE IS
- 11 SOME SKEPTICISM ABOUT THE AGENCIES WORKING WITH MTC TO DELIVER
- 12 COORDINATION WHICH COULD RISK THAT FUNDING SOURCE DELIVERING
- 13 FUNDING. SO, SHOWING A GOAL OF GETTING THIS PROCESS UNDER
- 14 BETTER CONTROL WILL ALSO HELP TO BRING ABOUT THE FUNDING.
- 15 THANK YOU.
- 17 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 18 ON THIS ITEM.
- 20 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
- 21 INFORMATIONAL ITEM ON THE C2 SCHEDULE AND ROLL OUT. SO,
- 22 COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS, ADVICE, CONCERNS YOU'RE HEARING. GREG
- 23 RICHARDSON, VTA?

24

16



GREG RICHARDSON: A COUPLE OF OUICK LITTLE FOLLOW UPS YOU 1 MENTIONED PILOT PARTICIPANTS WHAT YOU HAD SAID BEFORE IT'S 2 BEEN A WHILE SINCE I HAVE BEEN ENGAGING ON THIS I'M CURIOUS 3 HOW THE FEEDBACK FROM THE PILOT PARTS HOW THAT PROCESS WORKS 4 5 AND UNDERSTANDING THAT. 6 JASON WEINSTEIN: I CAN TAKE THAT, GREG, IF THAT'S OKAY. WE 7 8 HAVE A COUPLE OF DIFFERENT WAYS FOR MEMBERS OF OUR TEAM, INTERNAL, WE HAVE INTERNALLY A SLACK GROUP. SO, THEY JUST 9 RESPOND TO US. FOR MEMBERS OF -- WE'RE ALSO TESTING OUT THE 10 CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. SO, WE HAVE A LIVE PERIOD OF TIME 11 EACH DAY WHERE FOLKS JUST CALL, HEY I HAVE A PROBLEM; HELP ME 12 OUT. THEY CALL THE NEW CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER ON A SEPARATE 13 LINE DURING -- BETWEEN THE HOURS OF 12:00 P.M. AND 4:00 P.M., 14 15 AND THEY CAN GET ANSWERS TO QUESTION THAT WAY, OR REPORT ISSUES THAT THEY SEE. IN TERMS OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, WHO 16 WE HAVE A FEW FOLKS. I THINK WE HAVE CARS OUT IN THE HANDS 17 FOR, AS I MENTIONED LAST TIME, LIKE ADVISORY GROUP FOLKS, SO, 18 LIKE, CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUPS MEMBERS HAVE CARDS IN THEIR 19 HANDS. AND, SO, THE WAY THAT THEY WOULD REACH OUT TO, JUST 20 21 LIKE I SAID, TO THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER, THEY CAN -- WE HAVE A SPECIFIC E-MAIL WHERE THEY CAN REACH OUT TO US, OUR 22 TEAM, SO WE HAVE OF DIFFERENT WAYS THAT PEOPLE CAN PROVIDE 23

THEIR FEEDBACK AND THEN WE WILL EVENTUALLY CONSOLIDATE THAT



AND GET BACK TO CUBIC. IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS ALREADY BEEN 1 2 DISCOVERED. 3 SPEAKER: OKAY. SO, WE'RE RELYING ON THEM TO PROVIDE US, 4 5 DIRECTLY, THAT IF AN ISSUE HAPPENS WE'RE RELYING ON THEM TO COME TO US TO SAY SOMETHING ABOUT IT NOT THE OTHER WAY AROUND? 6 7 WE'RE NOT --8 JASON WEINSTEIN: WE HAVE GIVEN INSTRUCTIONS TO FOLKS ABOUT HOW 9 10 TO DO THAT. IN FACT, WE'RE GOING TO BE HAVING SOME TOWN HALL MEETINGS ON ZOOM TO GIVE ADDITIONAL INSTRUCTIONS TO FOLKS, 11 TOO, IN THE FUTURE. 12 13 SPEAKER: THEN, LASTLY, ON THE CRITICAL PATH CHAR, THE ONE THAT 14 SHOWS THE DELAYS AND THE INCOMPLETE. 15 16 JASON WEINSTEIN: YEAH. CAN WE PULL THAT BACK UP? I THINK IT 17 WAS SLIDE --18 19 SPEAKER: I DON'T HAVE THE NUMBER ON MIND. SORRY ABOUT THAT. 20 21 THE ONLY THING I WANT TO MAKE SURE OF THERE IS, ARE THE CAUSES 22 AND CONCERN FOR THE TEAM AS TO FOR THOSE DELAYS, FOR THOSE INCOMPLETE, ARE YOU CONCERNED THAT THEY COULD CONTINUE TO 23 PRESENT THEMSELVES AND POSSIBLY CREATE MORE DELAYS? OR ARE 24

THEY OKAY FROM YOUR PERSPECTIVE?



1 JASON WEINSTEIN: I TURNED MYSELF OFF. THAT IS A POSSIBILITY. I 2 3 MEAN I -- I'LL LOOK TO CUBIC TO WEIGH IN HERE A LITTLE BIT. YOU KNOW, IN TERMS OF FIXING SOME OF THESE THINGS, SOMETIMES 4 5 IT'S SOMETHING VERY SIMPLE. AND OTHER TIMES IT'S MORE COMPLICATED WHICH REQUIRES CUBIC'S TEAM TO DIG INTO IT MORE, 6 TRY AND REPLICATE IT, FIGURE IT OUT, FIRST THEY TRIAGE IT, 7 8 THEN TRY AND REPLICATE IT THEN DO A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS WORK THROUGH THE BUG AND BRING IT THROUGH THE SYSTEM, AND THAT 9 PROCESS, I'LL LET ANTHONY WALK THROUGH IT. HE'S GOT A LITTLE 10 BETTER THAN I DO. 11 12 ANTHONY DEVITO: FORGIVE ME TO THE QUESTION POTENTIALLY RISKS 13 TO FURTHER DELAY. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: CURIOUS TO BARRIERS FOR US TO CONTINUE MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS ON TIME. 17 18 SPEAKER: MY PERSPECTIVE IS ISSUES WE'RE EXPERIENCING ARE 19 ACTUALLY FAR TO THE EDGE OF THE OUTSIDE OF THE SYSTEM, THERE 20 ARE CERTAINLY ISSUES WITH THE WEB SITE OR SOME BUSINESS RULE 21 OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. BUT IN TERMS OF THE ARCHITECTURE AND 22 FUNDAMENTAL CAPABILITIES OF THE SYSTEM THOSE ARE KIND OF LAST 23 MILE TWEAKS WE CAN MAKE IN DAYS AS OPPOSE SAID TO FUNDAMENTAL 24

ARCHITECTURE WE NEED TO REEXAMINE OVER THE COURSE OF A MINUTE



- 1 OR SEVERAL, IT'S A BIT INVERSE OF THE ISSUES THAT WE'RE SEEING
- 2 A NEED TO BE ADDRESSED THEY'RE WHAT WE WOULD EXPECT TO SEE AT
- 3 THIS STAGE OF A PILOT AND A FAIRLY MATURE PRODUCT AT R AT THIS
- 4 POINT.

5

6 SPEAKER: THANK YOU.

7

- 8 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION GREG. OTHER
- 9 COMMENTS COMING AROUND OVER HERE. GO AHEAD APRIL. WHO AM I
- 10 GOING TO? JENNIFER, THEN SAL.

- 12 SPEAKER: YOU WERE TWEAKING AROUND THE EDGES BUT I WOULD
- 13 ENCOURAGE BOTH CUBIC AND MTC I KNOW THEY HAVE BEEN WORKING
- 14 WITH CLOSELY WITH AGENCIES, THERE IS A LOT OF EXPERTISE ON
- 15 STAFF ON THE FIELD AND IN OPERATIONS, SO I FEEL LIKE
- 16 COLLABORATING WITH THEM TO TRIAGE SOME OF THESE THINGS.
- 17 BECAUSE I HAVE HAD A COUPLE OF THINGS WHERE I WAS, LIKE, THIS
- 18 DOESN'T NEED TO HAPPEN AT LAUNCH, SO GO WORK ON THIS OTHER
- 19 STUFF, SO THIS PART, AND I ENCOURAGE THAT COLLABORATION TO
- 20 MAKE SURE WE CAN MOVE UP THE LAUNCH AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE IF
- 21 THESE THINGS AROUND THE EDGES ARE THINGS WE CAN PRIORITIZE AND
- 22 MAYBE WE HAVE WANT TO HAVE THEM DONE BUT MAYBE CAN GET LAUNCH
- 23 DONE AND SOME OF THESE FINE TUNED I WOULD ENCOURAGE STAFF TO
- 24 REACH OUT TO THE AGENCY STAFF BECAUSE WE WANT TO WORK TOGETHER
- 25 AND MAKE SURE THAT WHATEVER FIELD MODIFICATIONS NEED TO HAPPEN



OR PRIORITIZATION TO MOVE SOME OF THIS TESTING WE'RE MORE THAN 1 2 HAPPY TO COLLABORATE. 3 JASON WEINSTEIN: APPRECIATE THAT. ONE -- CAN I, IF IT'S OKAY 4 5 TO RESPOND. 6 7 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: PLEASE. 8 JASON WEINSTEIN: SO, YOU KNOW, THAT MAKES A TOTAL SENSE. AND 9 OUR TEAM DOES THAT TO A SUDDEN EXTENT WE JUST HAVE TO BE 10 CAREFUL ABOUT, THERE MIGHT BE SOME THINGS THAT GOLDEN GATE 11 GOLDEN GATE IS OKAY WITH AND OTHER AGENCY MIGHT NOT AND YOU 12 NEED TO GET DONE AFFECTS YOU BOTH SO MAKE SURE DECISIONS ARE 13 AT A GROUP. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: BRINGING AGENCIES TOGETHER TO TRIAGE SOME OF THIS WOULD BE HELPFUL IF THERE THINGS THAT YOU CAN EITHER AGREE 17 THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO DO ON LAUNCH DAY SO WE CAN GET THE 18 FUNDAMENTAL CORE OUT AND LAUNCHED. BUT I KNOW YOU ARE COMING 19 DOWN TO THE WIRE. WHEN I SEE THINGS ON THE LIST, LIKE THESE 20 21 THINGS HAVE TO BE DONE, I DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER NECESSARILY IF YOU ASK THE AGENCIES, IF THESE THREE THINGS ARE DONE AND READY 22 23 TO GO BUT OTHER FOUR THINGS TESTING AND MOVING IF THEY'RE AROUND THE EDGES AS OPPOSED TO IN THE CORE THAT WOULD HELP 24

MOVE THE TIMELINE UP A BIT AND I HAVE SEEN CREATIVE



COLLABORATION BETWEEN THE AGENCIES WHEN THEY KNOW IT'S IN THE 1 FIELD. THANKS. 2 3 JASON WEINSTEIN: YEP. 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. SAL FROM AC TRANSIT. SAL? 6 7 8 SALVADOR LLAMAS: THANK YOU, CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND DETAILED REPORT. I DO APPRECIATE THAT, AND 9 HEARING ALL COMMENTS ON THE COLLABORATION AND ALSO DOING ROOT 10 CAUSE ANALYSIS ON SOME OF THE ISSUES EXPERIENCED. FIRST 11 OUESTION, I AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES AND MY FELLOW BOARD 12 MEMBER COMMENTS, WE HAVE A LOT OF SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS AND 13 THAT CONNECT WITH RIDERS AND CUSTOMERS AND REALLY 14 15 UNDERSTANDING NEEDS AND PRIORITIES ON HOW PHASING SOME OF 16 THESE NEXT CRITICAL PATH, YOU HAVE TIMELINE MOVED FROM JULY TO AUGUST WHAT IS YOUR CONFIDENCE LEVEL AUGUST IS ON TRACK AND 17 YOU HAVE TAKEN NECESSARY STEPS TO BE ABLE TO STAY ON TRACK? 18 ONE WAS THE BIGGEST CONCERNS I HAVE IS GETTING TRANSIT 19 OPERATOR COMMUNICATIONS TEAMS AND OUTREACH TEAMS ENOUGH LEEWAY 20 TO BE ABLE TO START VOICING THIS OUT TO THE COMMUNITIES TO 21 PEOPLE THAT DEPEND ON THE SYSTEM, AND WITHOUT KNOWING A DATE 22 23 AND STICKING TO A FIRM DATE IS DIFFICULT FOR EVERYONE TO DO

THAT BACKGROUND WORK THAT'S NECESSARY.

25



JASON WEINSTEIN: I'LL ANSWER THE SECOND PART FIRST WHICH IS TO 1 2 SAY THAT, YOU KNOW, AS WE HAVE BRIEFED THE BOARD IN PREVIOUS 3 MEETINGS, YOU KNOW, WE SAID THAT WE WOULD BE GIVING 30 DAYS NOTICE IN TERMS OF, RIGHT, LIKE, HOW WE WOULD BE LAUNCHING THE 4 5 PUBLIC INFORMATION CAMPAIGN. THAT DOESN'T REALLY HELP IN TERMS OF THAT'S A MOVING TARGET FROM YOUR PERSPECTIVE. I UNDERSTAND. 6 I THINK I MIGHT PIVOT TO SEE IF CUBIC WANTS TO TAKE A STAB AT, 7 8 YOU KNOW, TELLING US WHY WE THINK WE'RE IN A GREAT SPOT TO 9 MAKE AUGUST? 10 SPEAKER: MY VIEW IS THAT IT REALLY REVOLVES AROUND WHAT MISS 11 MANUCCHI SAID YOU KNOW THAT ALL OF THE ISSUES WE'RE 12 IDENTIFYING WE'RE GETTING HUNDREDS OF COMMENTS BACK OVER THE 13 COURSE OF THE LAST MONTH THAT'S WHAT WE WANT, PILOT PART WELL 14 PARTNERSHIPS INTERACTING WITH THE SYSTEM MESSING AROUND WITH 15 THE EDGES TRYING TO BREAK IT, RESULTING IN ISSUES 16 QUANTITATIVELY BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN THEY'RE ALL OF EQUAL 17 VALUE AND KEY ASPECT IS DOES THE BUTTON NEED TO MOVE TO THE 18 LEFT OR IS THIS A CRITICAL EQUITY PRODUCT ABSOLUTELY NEEDS TO 19 BE THERE ON DAY ONE SO AT THIS POINT I THINK WE'RE MAKING A 20 21 LOT OF COLLABORATIVE PROGRESS MTC HAS WORKED WITH US THROUGH ISSUES AND TRIAGE IDENTIFYING CRITICAL PATH, THIS IS AN 22 ONGOING PROCESS EVERY DAY AS NEW PEOPLE ARE ADDED TO PILOT NEW 23

ISSUES DISCOVERED DURING PILOT MAKING SURE WE TAKE A



PRACTICING MAT PICK LOOK AT NECESSARY LAUNCH AND IF NOT HOW 1 2 SOON AFTER THAT CAN OUR TEAM DEVELOP A FIX. 3 SALVADOR LLAMAS: ONE FOLLOW-UP, ON THE PILOT I PERSONALLY KNOW 4 SOMEONE ON THE PILOT AND HAVE HEARD SOME FEEDBACK, YOU HAVE 5 HEARD FEEDBACK THAT'S CONCERNING, THAT YOU HAVE NOT CONSIDERED 6 AS PART OF THIS PROJECT THAT MAY BE CAUSE IMPACT TO THAT 7 8 AUGUST DATE? 9 JASON WEINSTEIN: I DON'T SEE THAT IT DEPENDS ON OTHER THINGS 10 WE HAVE SEEN AND ANTHONY ADDRESSED IT BEFORE IT SEEMS IN TERMS 11 THEY FEEL THE CORE IS THERE. WE SEE THINGS THAT WE EXPECT TO 12 WORK A CERTAIN WAY F IT DOESN'T WORK THAT WAY, WE REPORT IT TO 13 CUBIC. I HAVEN'T SEEN SOMETHING THAT'S CATASTROPHIC THAT SAYS, 14 15 I DON'T -- WE HAVE SIX MONTHS OF WORK TO DO. SO, THAT'S NOT 16 BEEN OUR -- THAT'S NOT BEEN OUR VIEW OF WHAT WE SEE SINCE WE HAVE BEEN TESTING FOR THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS. 17 18 SPEAKER: JUST ADDING ON TO THAT, I THINK WE'RE LOOKING AT IT A 19 COUPLE DIFFERENT WAYS, LIKE SEVERAL YEARS AGO FINANCIAL 20 REPORTING MAKING SURE THAT THE DEPOSITS IN THE BANK ACCOUNTS 21 MATCH AMOUNTS ON REPORTS, CRITICALLY, IF NOT 100% RIGHT TO THE 22 PENNY EVERY SINGLE TIME THEN WE WANT THE EXCEPTIONS, AND WORK 23 THROUGH, A THIRD OF THE TAPS IN THE SYSTEM SORRY THROUGH 24

MOBILE WALLETS AT THIS POINT SO A LOT OF THE INTERFACE TO



- 1 CUSTOMERS IN TERMS OF QUANTITY OF TAPS IS THROUGH A MOBILE
- 2 WALLET PARTNER IT'S NOT NECESSARILY THROUGH OUR APP OUR
- 3 THROUGH OUR WEB SITE OR E-MAIL OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. THAT'S
- 4 AN AREA WHERE WE'RE MAKING SURE WE'RE TAKING FEEDBACK
- 5 CRITICALLY, THAT'S MAJOR CUSTOMER INFORMATION THROUGHPUT IS
- 6 THE MOBILE WALLET JUST THROUGH THAT CATEGORY WE'RE MAKING SURE
- 7 TRIAGE WITH APPROPRIATE TEAMS BOTH ON OUR SIDE AND MOBILE
- 8 WALLET PARTNERS, THAT GIVES YOU A SENSE OF HOW WE'RE RECEIVING
- 9 IN AND FILTERING HOW MANY PEOPLE DOES THIS AFFECT HOW CRITICAL
- 10 IS THIS TO PEOPLE WHO USE THE PROGRAM EVERY DAY THAT, SORT OF,
- 11 THING THAT'S, SORT OF, WHERE WE'RE MAKING SURE WE INTEND A LOT
- 12 OF TIME MAKING SURE MONEY GETS TO THE RIGHT PLACE THAT'S
- 13 ACCOUNTABLE AND RECONCILABLE AND CUSTOMER CHANNELS WHERE
- 14 INFORMATION IS MOST READILY PROVIDED INSTANTLY VERSUS CHECKING
- 15 A REPORT OR WEB SITE ONCE A WEEK, WATCHING CLOSELY THOSE ARE
- 16 THE KIND OF THINGS THAT WE'RE PRIORITIZING.
- 18 SALVADOR LLAMAS: THANK YOU.
- 20 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: JULIE KIRSCHBAUM. SFMTA.
- 22 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: I HAVE A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS THEN SOME
- 23 COMMENTS.
- 25 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: PLEASE.

17

19

21



1 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: LET ME START WITH AN APPRECIATION. I REALLY 2 3 AM GRATEFUL, JASON, FOR THE REGULAR UPDATES THAT YOU HAVE BEEN PROVIDING ON THE SFMTA WORK. I AM GRATEFUL TO BE OUT OF THE 4 5 CRITICAL PATH. BUT I FELT THAT YOU WERE SUPER RESPONSIVE TO MY ASKING FOR UPDATES AND WERE REALLY TRANSPARENT WHEN THERE WERE 6 CHALLENGES AND ALSO WHAT THE STRATEGY WAS TO ADDRESS THOSE 7 8 CHANGES. SO, I'M VERY GRATEFUL THERE. COULD YOU GO BACK A SLIDE? TO THE LIST OF RISKS? 9 10 JASON WEINSTEIN: I THINK -- I THINK IT MIGHT BE THE ONE AFTER 11 THIS. NO, FORWARD. NEXT ONE. NEXT ONE. THAT ONE. YES? 12 13 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: YEAH. I APPRECIATE MY COLLEAGUES RAISING 14 15 OUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT WE'RE GETTING FROM SOME OF THE EARLY 16 TESTING AND WHAT ISSUES ARE BEING IDENTIFIED. BUT I'M NOT EVEN CONVINCED THAT WE ARE ON TRACK TO INITIATE THE PILOT. YOU CAN 17 TALK US THROUGH WHICH OF THESE RISKS ARE NECESSARY TO BE 18 COMPLETED BEFORE THE PILOT PHASE BEGINS? 19 20 21 JASON WEINSTEIN: SO, I MEAN -- I'LL SAY IT FROM THE 22 PERSPECTIVE OF WE'RE -- WHEN WE'RE PILOTING IT, THERE ARE TWO PERSPECTIVES. IT COULD BE LIKE AN END TO END TEST WHERE WE'RE 23 LOOKING AT, SORT OF, THE FULL LIFE EXPERIENCE. FOR EXAMPLE, 24

WHAT'S HAPPENING NOW WE'RE ALL TESTING IN PRODUCTION. BUT THAT



DOESN'T INCLUDE THE, FOR EXAMPLE, THE FIRST THING THAT'S 1 HIGHLIGHT ON THAT LIST, INSTITUTIONAL TRANSIT BENEFITS PORTAL 2 3 INTEGRATION. 4 5 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: SORRY. LET ME CLARIFY. I'M INTERESTED IN HOW MANY OF THESE ARE CRITICAL PATHS FOR THE END-TO-END PILOT 6 7 TESTING? 8 JASON WEINSTEIN: SO, ALL OF THESE THINGS WOULD BE CRITICAL TO 9 MAKING SURE THAT WE SEE WHAT WE'RE SEEING IN PILOT BEFORE WE 10 LAUNCH TO THE PUBLIC. 11 12 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: THANK YOU. AND THEN I THINK MY NEXT 13 QUESTIONS ARE FOR MARK. MARK, I REALIZE THAT YOU HAVE KIND OF 14 A MUCH BROADER ROLE AT CUBIC, BUT WHAT IS YOUR CURRENT ROLE AS 15 16 IT RELATES TO THE BAY AREA'S PROJECT? 17 SPEAKER: THANK YOU FOR THE OUESTION. MY ROLE IN BEING HERE IS 18 TO BRING THE EXPERIENCE OF CUBIC, AS A WHOLE, TO BEAR ON THIS 19 PROJECT. I THINK THE OUESTIONS WE'RE RECEIVING FROM THE BOARD, 20 21 AND I APPRECIATE THEM ALL, BECAUSE IT'S GETTING QUITE QUICKLY 22 TO THE TRUCKS OF THE MATTER AND THAT'S HOW DO WE INSTILL THE CONFIDENCE THAT WE'RE READY AND YOUR OUESTION IS GOING RIGHT 23 TO THE POINT, RAMPING UP THE PILOT AND DEPLOYING FEATURES AND 24

FUNCTIONALITY TO PRODUCTION AND GETTING USAGE ON IT, IS A



CONFIDENCE INSTILLING ACTIVITY, YOU KNOW? IT'S ONE THING TO 1 COLLECT BUGS AND FIX THEM; THAT'S HAPPENING. BUT THE POINT OF 2 3 DOING THAT IS TO INSTILL CONFIDENCE, AND IT'S OUR COLLECTIVE CONFIDENCE IN OUR READINESS TO ROLL OUT PUBLIC USAGE. IN MY 4 5 ROLE, AGAIN, AND GETTING BACK TO THE QUESTION THAT YOU ASKED, WE'RE DOING MULTIPLE SYSTEM UPGRADE PROJECTS ACROSS THE NORTH 6 7 AMERICA REGION AND WE'RE BRINGING BEST PRACTICES TO BEAR. 8 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: HOW LONG HAVE YOU BEEN DOING THAT FOR THIS 9 10 PARTICULAR PROJECT? 11 SPEAKER: I JUST STARTED DOING THIS FOR CLIPPER. I HAVE JUST 12 COME ON BOARD. 13 14 15 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: AND HOW -- WHEN DID THE DAILY STAND UP 16 MEETINGS START. 17 SPEAKER: TWO WEEKS AGO. WE HAVE HAD A LONG SERIES OF ISSUES 18 MEETINGS THAT WERE DIRECT WITH AGENCIES, A SERIES OF INTERNAL 19 MEETINGS ACROSS A DOZEN DIFFERENT TEAMS WITH CUBIC WE SPEND 20 TWO OR THREE HOURS A WEEK UNDERSTANDING TRIAGING ISSUES THAT 21 THEY'RE RAISING, AND A WHOLE PROCESS OF DO WE UNDERSTAND WHAT 22 YOU ARE SEEING CAN WE DUPLICATE WHAT YOU ARE SEEING WHO WITHIN 23 CUBIC IS GOING TO FIX IT WHEN ARE THEY GOING TO FIX IT CAN WE 24

TEST THEIR FIX THEN CAN WE GET IT IN PRODUCTION, WE KICKED



INTO A SERIES OF DAILY STAND UPS AS OPPOSED TO NORMAL WEEKLY 1 BIWEEKLY CADENCES 2 TO 3 WEEKS AGO. 2 3 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM: THE REST OF MY COMMENTS FIRST COMMENT IS YOU 4 5 STARTED DOING SOMETHING 2 TO 3 WEEKS AGO THAT IN MY MIND NEEDED TO START SIX MONTHS AGO THAT BRINGING THE EXPERTISE OF 6 PROCESSES TO BEAR ON THIS PROJECT WAS ALSO NEEDED MANY MONTHS 7 8 AGO. AND I JUST -- I FOUND THE FOCUS OF YOUR PRESENTATION ON ACCOMPLISHMENTS RATHER THAN YOUR FOCUS BEING ON HOW YOU ARE 9 10 MITIGATING THE OUTSTANDING RISKS TO JUST BE DISRESPECTFUL TO THIS BOARD'S TIME. AND I DO NOT HAVE CONFIDENCE. I ACTUALLY 11 HAD OUITE A BIT OF CONFIDENCE IN JULY. I THOUGHT JULY WAS, 12 LIKE, A CLEARING THE AIR AND LIKE A REALLY FRESH CONVERSATION. 13 BUT TO COME AND SLIP 30 DAYS WITH NO KIND OF EXPLANATION OF 14 15 WHY JUST 30 DAYS AND WHAT HAD SLIPPED AND WHAT WAS BEING DONE 16 TO BRING THINGS BACK ON TRACK, HAS LEFT ME WITH VERY, VERY LITTLE CONFIDENCE IN ARGUE, WHICH IS DEVASTATING, BECAUSE AS 17 SAL INDICATED, WE DESPERATELY NEED THIS PROJECT. AND JASON, I 18 APPRECIATE YOU TRYING TO ANSWER SOME OF THESE HARD QUESTIONS, 19 BUT AT THIS POINT THE HARD OUESTIONS NEED TO BE POINTED AT 20 21 CUBIC. IF THIS PROJECT IS GOING TO WORK. THANK YOU. 22 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: SO, JUST A COUPLE, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, 23 AS BOTH THE CHAIR OF THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD AND AS THE 24

BART GENERAL MANAGER, AND FROM A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE. AND,



- 1 YOU KNOW, DON'T MISCHARACTERIZE MY TONE AND MY -- MY ATTITUDE
- 2 TOWARDS THE EFFORT HERE. I FUNDAMENTALLY -- YOU HAVE ZERO
- 3 CREDIBILITY. I MEAN, YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT BUILDING CONFIDENCE,
- 4 YOU HAVE GOT ZERO, MEANING CUBIC. THIS IS THE THIRD MEETING IN
- 5 A ROW THAT I HAVE HEARD THAT SPEECH, RAH-RAH LOOK AT US, LOOK
- 6 AT WHAT WE HAVE DONE, THE THIRD MEETING IN A ROW THAT YOU HAVE
- 7 COME UP HERE AND SAID, OH, THE DATE FROM THE PRIOR MEETING,
- 8 WE'RE NOT GOING TO MAKE THAT DATE, IT'S GOING TO BE WHATEVER
- 9 IT'S GOING TO BE. THIRD MEETING IN A ROW. IT DOESN'T WORK
- 10 ANYMORE. YOU HAVE ZERO CREDIBILITY TO -- THE COMMENT FROM
- 11 JULIE KIRSCHBAUM FROM SFMTA, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE SAYING AUGUST.
- 12 YOU SHOULD BE ABLE TO GO THROUGH THOSE LISTS THAT ARE IN
- 13 YELLOW RIGHT NOW TELL ME IF YOU ARE GOING TO MAKE THEM FOR
- 14 AUGUST. YOU OUGHT TO KNOW RIGHT NOW BECAUSE A LOT OF THEM ARE
- 15 SUPPOSED TO BE DONE BY THE MIDDLE OF JUNE. AND THIS IS JUNE
- 16 2ND. YOU GUYS SHOULD HAVE SOME KIND OF -- YOU ARE LOOKING AT
- 17 THIS LIKE TWO DEER IN A HEADLIGHT AND DON'T KNOW WHAT'S GOING
- 18 ON WITH IT AND AGAIN THIS IS NOT DON'T TAKE IT THE WRONG WAY
- 19 BUT YOU HAVE ZERO CREDIBILITY FROM ME, THIS AS CHAIR --
- 20 SOMEBODY SAID TO ME THIS MORNING, MARK, AND IT REALLY WAS
- 21 INSIGHTFUL, BECAUSE THIS IS SOMETHING WE CONTROL MEETING IN
- 22 THIS ROOM THIS IS NOT SOMETHING COMING OUT OF SACRAMENTO OR
- 23 WASHINGTON DC OR SOMETHING, TO DO SOMETHING -- WHAT WE'RE
- 24 TALKING ABOUT TRYING TO GO IS WITHIN OUR CONTROL THIS IS OF



OUR DOING DO YOU KNOW HOW LATE YOU ARE IN THIS PROJECT? HOW 1 2 LATE? 3 SPEAKER: 18 MONTHS. 4 5 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: YEAH, IT'S MORE THAN THAT. I THINK, MY 6 MATH, BEFORE I SHOWED UP HERE, YOU'RE AROUND 700 DAYS LATE ON 7 8 THIS PROJECT. AND TO YOUR POINT, JULIE, I DON'T -- AUGUST? COME ON. I MEAN, LOOK AT THOSE SHE JUST ASKED YOU, ARE YOU 9 GOING TO MAKE MIDDLE OF JUNE TO GET THAT STUFF DONE SO WE MAKE 10 AUGUST? RIGHT? I MEAN NA'S JUST -- JUST COMING IN HERE AND 11 HAVING THAT DISCUSSION WITH THIS CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD AND 12 NOT A BUNCH OF, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, HERE IS WHAT WE HAVE 13 ACCOMPLISHED. THIS IS THE THIRD TIME I HAVE HEARD THAT SPEECH, 14 15 MARK. ONCE FROM YOU THE ONE PRIOR FROM CYNTHIA, AND THE ONE 16 FROM PETER, AND YOU KNOW OH WE'RE GETTING BETTER GETTING BETTER AND YOU COME INTO THIS MEETING AND OH WHAT WE TOLD YOU 17 LAST TIME ISN'T GOING TO HAPPEN, AND THEN THE NEXT CLIPPER 18 MEETING MADAM CLERK IS 23rd OF JUNE? 19 20 21 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: 23rd JUNE. 22 23 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THREE WEEKS AWAY. I GUESS I'M GOING WRAP IT UP YOU'RE PROBABLY LIKE WELL WHO IS THIS LUNATIC UP HERE 24

TALKING AND IT'S FINE. YOU KNOW, THE BAY AREA DESERVES BETTER.



IT DESERVES BETTER, FROM ALL OF US STARTING WITH YOU. AND IT'S

JUST DISAPPOINTING THAT WE CAN'T GET THAT MESSAGE ACROSS TO

YOU AND YOUR TEAM, BUT THE BAY AREA DESERVES BETTER. SO, WITH

THAT, MADAM CLERK, WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE OUT THIS ITEM. ALL

RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE, AGENDA

ITEM NUMBER FIVE IS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT FROM JASON

WEINSTEIN. JASON?

8

1

- 9 JASON WEINSTEIN: WELL, AT THE RISK OF SOUNDING TOO POSITIVE, I
- 10 DID WANT TO AT LEAST RECOGNIZE AND THANK TRANSIT OPERATOR
- 11 STAFF FOR THEIR PARTICIPATION AND FLEXIBILITY AS WE MOVE
- 12 THROUGH THESE FINAL STEPS OF INSTALLATION AND TRAINING. AND
- 13 ALSO THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING TO SUPPORT EACH OTHER BY
- 14 REVIEWING MATERIALS AND PRESENTING AND BEING AVAILABLE TO
- 15 ANSWER OUESTIONS FOR THE VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD MEETINGS
- 16 THAT ARE COMING UP. SO, I'LL LEAVE IT AT THAT.

17

- 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC
- 19 COMMENT ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

20

- 21 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS IN WRITING,
- 22 NOTHING -- NO ONE IS ONLINE WITH COMMENTS, AND NO ONE IN THE
- 23 ROOM.



- 1 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. WE WILL CLOSE AGENDA
- 2 ITEM NUMBER FIVE AND MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX. THIS IS
- 3 PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT WAS NOT ON THE
- 4 AGENDA TODAY, MADAM CLERK?

5

- 6 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER HERE IN THE ROOM.
- 7 ALETA DUPREE. YOU MAY UNMUTE.

- 9 SPEAKER: ALETA DUPREE SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. GEORGE
- 10 HARRISON SAID, GOT TO DO IT, GOT TO GO THROUGH THAT DOOR.
- 11 THERE IS NO EASY WAY OUT AT ALL. STILL IT ONLY TAKES TIME 'TIL
- 12 LOVE COMES TO EVERYONE AND GEORGE HARRISON WAS TALKING ABOUT
- 13 GOING THROUGH THE DOORS OF GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL IN NEW YORK
- 14 CITY. WELL, THESE ARE NOT EASY TIMES FOR US, AND I AM A PRETTY
- 15 PATIENT PERSON. MAYBE IT'S EASY FOR ME, BECAUSE I'M NOT
- 16 ACCOUNTABLE. I'M JUST AN ORDINARY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO IS
- 17 LOOKING FOR THIS TO HAPPEN. BUT I SEE THE BENEFITS THAT COME.
- 18 I REMEMBER MY TIMES IN NEW YORK SPEAKING BEFORE THE MTA AND
- 19 SAYING, OMNI IS GREAT, AND I USED IT ON THE LEXINGTON LINE,
- 20 THE PILOT, AND NOW IT'S AVAILABLE FOR FULL FARE, AND I WANT TO
- 21 SEE IT COME TO REDUCED FARE. THAT TOOK, LIKE, I THINK, FOUR
- 22 YEARS TO GET TO REDUCED FARE. I KNOW THIS IS NOT EASY. SO, ALL
- 23 KIND OF THINGS I TALK ABOUT AND WRITE IN LETTERS ABOUT THAT
- 24 AREN'T EASY. BECAUSE I'M WAITING FOR THE DAY. I THINK OF MY
- 25 EXPERIENCES. I DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT STORED VALUE BALANCES



- 1 IN NEW YORK ANYMORE. DON'T HAVE TO WORRY ABOUT DAMAGED METRO
- 2 CARD STORIES. I OFTEN GRAPPLE WITH STORED VALUE BALANCES THAT
- 3 I HAVE ON CLIPPER, AND IT'S GOING TO BE INTERESTING WHEN WE
- 4 SEE CLIPPER FOR REDUCED FARE WITH OPEN PAYMENT, JUST AS
- 5 THEY'RE DOING IN NEW YORK CITY, WITH THE HALF FARE PROGRAMS.
- 6 THIS IS NOT EASY. AND I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS REALLY A
- 7 PRECEDENT FOR WHAT WE'RE DOING. I MEAN, LA HAS A SIMILAR LAY
- 8 OUT AS WHAT WE HAVE, AND I'M NOT SURE WHERE THEY'RE AT. I
- 9 HAVEN'T BEEN TO LA IN A COUPLE OF MONTHS. IT'S HARD STAYING
- 10 THE COURSE. BUT GO DO IT. GOT TO GO THROUGH THAT DOOR. THANK
- 11 YOU.

12

- 13 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

- 16 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. MADAM CLERK, WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE
- 17 ITEM NUMBER SIX THAT BRINGS US TO OUR FINAL AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
- 18 SEVEN ADJOURNMENT AND OUR NEXT MEETING AS MADAM CLERK STATED
- 19 WE WILL RECONVENE MONDAY JUNE 23RD AND WILL BE AT BART
- 20 HEADQUARTERS OVER ON WEBSTER STREET IN OAKLAND. AND WITH THAT,
- 21 MADAM CLERK, THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

22

23 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]



Broadcasting Government