

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



MARCH 12, 2025

**PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**

**WEDNESDAY, MARCH 12, 2025, 9:45 AM**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING. DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WOULD THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

**BOARD CLERK:** ESSENTIAL. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

**V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HERE.

**BOARD CLERK:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

**BOARD CLERK:** NON-VOTING EL-TAWANSY?

**DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **BOARD CLERK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT.

2

3 **BOARD CLERK:** PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

6

7 **BOARD CLERK:** NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

8

9 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

10

11 **BOARD CLERK:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. SO, CONSENT INCLUDES 2A  
14 THROUGH 2F; IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO PULL  
15 AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING NO ONE. DO I HAVE A  
16 MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE. ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. MOVED BY ABE-KOGA; SECOND BY  
23 PAPAN. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **BOARD CLERK:** WE -- PARDON ME. WE DO HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW  
2 MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HOW MANY SPEAKERS?

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** JUST ONE AT THE MOMENT.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** TWO MINUTES. THANK YOU.

9

10 **BOARD CLERK:** ALL RIGHT. RIHANN LACOSTA. IF YOU CAN PLEASE  
11 UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS RIHANN LACOSTA. I'M SPEAKING ON SAN  
14 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. AS AN ORGANIZATION WE WOULD LIKE TO  
15 STRONGLY RECOMMEND MTC APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO  
16 ELEVATE THE PORTAL FOR ITS BENEFITS TO RIDERS, THE CLIMATE --

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THE ITEM? THE PORTAL?

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** I'M SORRY, COMMENTER, ARE YOU SPEAKING ON THE  
21 PORTAL PROJECT?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SORRY.

24



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **BOARD CLERK:** THAT IS FOR ITEM 3B. IF YOU CAN PLEASE PROVIDE  
2 COMMENT DURING THAT TIME.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** WE HAVE NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. SO ALL THOSE IF  
9 FAVOR, PLEASE ACKNOWLEDGE BY SAYING AYE. AYE. OPPOSED?  
10 ABSTENTIONS? PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. ITEM 3A. WE'LL HAVE A PUBLIC  
11 HEARING PROPOSED AMENDMENT, THE REGIONAL MEASURE THREE  
12 PROGRAM. I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE UP ITEM THREE A, THE PUBLIC  
13 HEARING ON PROPOSED LIMIT THREE TO REGIONAL MEASURE THREE  
14 PROGRAM OTHERWISE KNOWN AS RM3. DO I HAVE TO GET A MOTION TO  
15 OPEN THE PUBLIC HEARING?

16

17 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** NO YOU DON'T NEED TO HAVE MOTIONS BUT  
18 WE NEED TO HAVE IN THE RECORD THAT IT WAS FORMALLY OPPOSED  
19 THEN WHEN DONE WITH COMMENT.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THE HEARING IS NOW OPEN IF YOU WISH TO  
22 TESTIFY PLEASE SUBMIT A SPEAKER CARD OR IF ON ZOOM USE THE  
23 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. WE ASK EACH SPEAK BE  
24 BRIEF, CONCISE AND KEEP COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO MINUTES.  
25 THE PURPOSE OF THE HEARING IS TO RECEIVE COMMENTS ON PROPOSED



MARCH 12, 2025

1 AMENDMENT TO THE REGIONAL MEASURE THREE PROGRAM, WHICH WAS  
2 RELEASED FOR PUBLIC REVIEW ON MARCH THIRD, 2025. FORMAL  
3 ADOPTION OF REGIONAL MEASURE THREE PROGRAM AMENDMENT WILL BE  
4 CONSIDERED BY THE COMMISSION AT ITS APRIL 23RD, 2025 MEETING.  
5 NOTE THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD STARTED MARCH THIRD AND CLOSES  
6 APRIL 3RD, 2025. WRITTEN COMMENTS MUST BE RECEIVED BY MTC NO  
7 LATER THAN 5:00 P.M. ON APRIL 3RD IN ORDER TO BE CONSIDERED.  
8 ORAL COMMENTS WILL BE RECEIVED UNTIL THE CLOSE OF THIS  
9 HEARING. WRITTEN COMMENTS CAN BE SUBMITTED TO MTC, PUBLIC  
10 INFORMATION OFFICE, BY MAIL, OR UPS. I WILL NOW ASK THE STAFF,  
11 MTC STAFF TO PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT TO  
12 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE PROGRAM. KENNETH WILL NOW PROVIDE THE  
13 INFORMATIONAL ITEM.

14

15 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS. I'M KENNETH  
16 KAO MTC STAFF. REGIONAL MEASURE THREE WAS APPROVED BY VOTERS  
17 IN 2018 AND IDENTIFIES 35 CAPITAL PROJECTS TO BE FUNDED BY  
18 INCREASED BRIDGE TOLLS. STATE STATUTE ALLOWS FOR THE  
19 COMMISSION TO MODIFY THE RM3 PROGRAM AFTER CONDUCTING A PUBLIC  
20 HEARING. TODAY STAFF RECOMMENDS MODIFYING ONE CAPITAL PROJECT  
21 SPECIFICALLY TO MODIFY THE SCOPE OF THE HIGHWAY 101 MARIN  
22 SONOMA NARROWS PROJECT WHICH IS RM3 PROJECT 20 TO INCLUDE  
23 UPDATING THE HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLE LANE HOURS SIGNAGE ON U.S.  
24 101 BETWEEN ARADA LANE, AND WINDSOR AND NORTH BRIDGE BOULEVARD  
25 IN SAUSALITO. PROPOSED CHANGE IS A CORRECTION TO THE PROJECT



MARCH 12, 2025

1 DESCRIPTION TO ALLOW FOR THE SIGNAGE UPDATE FOR THE ENTIRE 101  
2 CORRIDOR ONCE THE MARIN SONOMA NARROW PROJECT OPENS CONNECTING  
3 THE TWO COUNTIES. THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF MARIN AND  
4 SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AS PROJECT SPONSORS  
5 IDENTIFIED IN LEGISLATION SUBMITTED A LETTER REQUESTING THIS  
6 MODIFICATION AND THAT LETTER IS INCLUDED IN YOUR STAFF REPORT.  
7 MTC HAS CONSULTED WITH THE PROJECT SPONSORS -- EXCUSE ME --  
8 AND TOGETHER, AGREED TO RECOMMEND THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT FOR  
9 COMMISSION CONSIDERATION IN APRIL UPON CLOSING OF THE COMMENT  
10 -- UPON CLOSING OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. NOTE THAT THE  
11 COMMENT PERIOD CLOSES ON APRIL 3RD, NOT APRIL 30TH AS  
12 MENTIONED IN THE STAFF REPORT. THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION  
13 AND I'LL RETURN THE MICROPHONE BACK TO THE CHAIR.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW RECEIVE ANY ORAL  
16 TESTIMONY. ONCE AGAIN, IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY, PLEASE SUBMIT A  
17 SPEAKER CARD OR IF ON ZOOM, USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR  
18 DIAL STAR NINE. MYSELF, OR THE CLERK WILL CALL ON YOU. WE ASK  
19 THAT YOU, THAT EACH SPEAKER BE BRIEF, AND CONCISE AND KEEP  
20 THEIR COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO MINUTES.

21

22 **BOARD CLERK:** CONFIRMING I SEE NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WHO  
23 WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.  
24 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED BY NAME CAMERON SCTA AND  
25 ANNE RICHMOND FROM TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF MARIN.



MARCH 12, 2025

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. SO, I THINK I CAN NOW DECLARE THE  
3 PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED. HOWEVER, THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD WILL  
4 BE OPENED UNTIL 5:00 P.M. ON APRIL 3RD. MTC WILL CONTINUE TO  
5 ACCEPT WRITTEN COMMENTS UNTIL THEN. ARE THERE ANY  
6 COMMISSIONERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AT THIS  
7 TIME? OKAY. WELL, THANK YOU. I THINK WE'RE GOOD. WE'LL MOVE TO  
8 THE NEXT ITEM. OKAY. ITEM 3B. MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4537,  
9 REVISED, MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY STAGE-GATE  
10 EVALUATION RECOMMENDATION FOR TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY,  
11 THE PORTAL PROJECT. RECOMMENDED TO COMMISSION APPROVAL TO  
12 ADVANCE THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITIES, THE PORTAL,  
13 INTO THE MAP LEVEL ONE, THROUGH MTC RESOLUTION 4537 REVISED. I  
14 THINK THE OTHER KEN -- THE OTHER KENNETH, WILL NOW PRESENT  
15 THIS ITEM TO THE COMMISSION.

16

17 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY, AND GOOD MORNING  
18 COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS, AS YOU SAID, ITEM 3B, AND IT'S PART OF  
19 OUR MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY. AND IT IS A REQUEST FROM  
20 THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY TO CONSIDER MOVING THE  
21 PROJECT FROM LEVEL TWO OF THE MAP TO LEVEL ONE. SO, I'M GOING  
22 TO ATTEMPT TO GIVE YOU A QUICK BACKGROUND ON THE MA--AND HOW IT  
23 RELATES TO MTC AND THEN HAND IT OVER TO OUR CONSULTANT TEAM  
24 THAT DID THE ACTUAL EVALUATION TO RUN THROUGH WHAT THEY SAW  
25 AND THEN PROVIDE YOU ALL WITH WHAT OUR MTC STAFF





MARCH 12, 2025

1 RECOMMENDATION IS FOR THIS COMMITTEE. THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
2 OF TJPA AND STAFF MEMBERS ARE HERE IF YOU HAD SPECIFIC  
3 QUESTIONS ON THE PROJECT THEY WOULD BE HAPPY TO COME UP AND  
4 ANSWER THAT AS WELL. SO NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE COMMISSION  
5 DIRECTED STAFF AT A RETREAT, BACK IN 2022 TO INCREASE FOCUS IN  
6 PARTICIPATION ON MEGA PROJECTS IN THE REGION, AND NOTING  
7 SPECIFICALLY THE IMPORTANCE OF EARLY IN THE PROJECT  
8 DEVELOPMENT PROCESS TO BE INVOLVED WITH THE PROJECT. SO, TO  
9 THAT END, THE POLICY WAS ADOPTED. THIS MAP, MAJOR PROJECT  
10 ADVANCEMENT POLICY WAS ADOPTED TO SUPPORT THE IMPLEMENTATION  
11 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA PROJECTS. THE PROJECTS HAVE TO BE IN  
12 PLANNED BAY AREA TO BE IN THIS POLICY. A PROJECT IS FIRST IN  
13 THE PLAN THEN IT CAN BE INCLUDED IN THE MAP. AND WHAT WE DID  
14 WITH THE PROJECTS IN THE MAP DEVELOPING THE POLICY WAS WE  
15 INCLUDED THREE LEVELS. LEVEL ONE IS ESSENTIALLY THE PROJECTS  
16 THAT ARE MOST READY TO GO AND MOST CLOSELY HAVE THE FUNDING  
17 PLAN. SO, LEVEL ONE WAS ORIGINALLY ESTABLISHED AT 50%  
18 COMMITTED FUNDING AND A CONSTRUCTION START DATE BY 2028. LEVEL  
19 TWO WERE PROJECTS WITH 30% COMMITTED FUNDING AND CONSTRUCTION  
20 START DATE BEYOND 2028, AND THE FINAL LEVEL THREE WAS PROJECTS  
21 THAT WERE EARLIER IN THE PROCESS. SO, AGAIN FOR MTC LEVEL ONE  
22 WHAT THAT MEANS IS THAT IT'S MOST READY TO START WORK IN  
23 EARNEST AND FINDING A PLAN AND DELIVER THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE  
24 PLEASE. THE PROJECT DESCRIPTION OF THE PORTAL PROJECT IS  
25 INCLUDED HERE IN THE FIRST BULLET POINT ON THE SCREEN THIS



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WOULD ALLOW PASSENGERS ON CALTRAIN AND EVENTUALLY ON HIGH  
2 SPEED RAIL TO REMAIN ON TRAINS FROM FOURTH AND KING AND COME  
3 ALL THE WAY TO THE TRANSIT CENTER NEAR US DOWN HERE AND  
4 OBVIOUSLY VICE-VERSA. THE PROJECT SPONSOR HAS RECENTLY GONE  
5 THROUGH EFFORTS OF SCOPE PRODUCTION VALUE ENGINEERING AND THE  
6 CURRENT PROJECTS AND CONTRACTS WITH PROPOSED GRANT AWARDS  
7 COVERED COST OF THE PROJECT IS ROUGHLY \$8 BILLION AND THE  
8 SHORTFALL IS SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 2.4 AND \$2.5 BILLION OF FUNDING  
9 THAT THEY ARE STILL ATTEMPTING TO SEEK. ALSO NOTED HERE, THE  
10 PROJECT HAS BEEN ACCEPTED INTO THE FEDERAL TRANSIT  
11 ADMINISTRATION'S CAPITAL INVESTMENT PROGRAM. AND WITH A FUTURE  
12 GRANT AMOUNT SUBJECT TO APPROVAL IDENTIFIED AT 3.4 BILLION.  
13 SO, THIS FUND SOURCE IS FTA FEDERAL FUND SOURCE IS VERY  
14 IMPORTANT TO THE PROJECT AND TO MANY PROJECTS IN THE PAST IN  
15 OUR REGION. WE HAVE TRADITIONALLY DONE WELL IN THIS CATEGORY.  
16 USUALLY THIS FUND SOURCE MAKES UP ABOUT 50% OF THE PROJECT  
17 COST. IN RECENT YEARS IT LOOKS LIKE FTA IS DROPPING THAT DOWN  
18 TO SOMEWHERE AROUND 40%. IN OUR REGION PROGRAMS IN THE PAST  
19 THAT HAVE RECEIVED THIS FINISHED SOURCE AND HAVE BEEN ABLE TO  
20 BECOME SUCCESSFUL PROJECTS COMPLETED BART TO SFO, SF MUNI  
21 THIRD STREET LIGHT RAIL MUNI CENTRAL SUBWAY AND THE CALTRAIN  
22 ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT AND BART CORE CAPACITY THAT HELPED BUY  
23 THE TRAINS AND THE TRAIN CONTROL SYSTEM FOR BART SO OBVIOUSLY  
24 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT ANOTHER PRESENTLY THAT IS CURRENTLY  
25 SITTING IN LEVEL ONE OF OUR MAP THAT'S ALSO SEEKING THIS FUND



MARCH 12, 2025

1 SOURCE IS BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO PROJECT THAT'S IN  
2 THIS FTA PIPELINE AS WELL AND IS AGAIN A MAP LEVEL ONE  
3 PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE. WHERE WE'RE AT TODAY THE PORTAL PROJECT  
4 CURRENTLY IS SITTING LEVEL TWO OF THE MAP AFTER THIS  
5 ACCEPTANCE INTO THE ENGINEERING PHASE BY FTA, THE PROJECT  
6 SPONSOR REQUESTED MTC TO CONSIDER MOVING THE PROJECT TO LEVEL  
7 ONE IN THE MAP, AND THEN STAFF, WE, WITH CONSULTANT SUPPORT  
8 HAVE EVALUATED THIS REQUEST AND PERFORMED A STAGE-GATE  
9 ASSESSMENT. I'LL NOW HAND IT OVER TO OUR CONSULTANT STEER  
10 GROUP AND PATRICK MILLER IS HERE FROM THE TEAM AND HE WAS THE  
11 LEAD CONSULTANT THAT PERFORMED THE EVALUATION. HE'LL PROVIDE  
12 THESE FINDINGS AND BASED ON THOSE FINDINGS I'LL LET YOU KNOW  
13 WHAT THE MTC STAFF REPORT IS BACK TO YOU. THANK YOU.

14

15 **PATRICK MILLER:** THANK YOU KENNETH AND COMMITTEE FOR HAVING US  
16 TODAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE GOING TO WALK THROUGH THE  
17 FINDINGS OF OUR EVALUATION PORTAL PROJECT I WANT TO THANK  
18 ALFONSO ON THE TJPA TEAM COLLABORATIVE EFFORT CONDUCTING  
19 REVIEW OF MEGA PROJECTS NO SMALL EFFORT WAS MADE. IT'S NOT AN  
20 EVALUATION OF THE MERITS OF THE PORTAL PROJECT. GOING BACK TO  
21 THE FRAMING PROVIDED BY KENNETH FOLAN. WE'RE HERE TO TALK  
22 ABOUT IS, IS THE PROJECT READY TO MOVE TO MAP STAGE ONE. YOU  
23 WILL SEE GRADINGS LIKE THE WORD SATISFACTORY, STRONG. WE'RE  
24 SAYING, BASED ON ASSEMBLED INFORMATION AVAILABLE, HOW  
25 CONFIDENT ARE WE THIS PROJECT IS READY FOR THAT NEXT LEVEL



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WORK. AS WE GO THROUGH MAKING SURE WE'RE SEEING AND READING  
2 RECOMMENDATIONS AND ANALYSIS IN THE SAME WAY. THAT WE'RE NOT  
3 REVISITING THE OVERALL CASE FOR THE PROJECT, BUT RATHER SAYING  
4 A LOT OF WORK HAS BEEN DONE AND HOW READY WE ARE FOR THE NEXT  
5 LEVEL OF WORK. WE'LL TALK THROUGH FINDINGS. THE FIRST AREA WE  
6 LOOKED AT WAS COST ESTIMATES. THE IDEA HERE IN THE MAP  
7 EVALUATION AND WE RECOGNIZE WORKING IN THIS INDUSTRY COST  
8 CHANGES OVER TIME BOTH IN THE MARKETPLACE AS WELL AS NEED TO  
9 EVOLVE DESIGNS MOVING FURTHER INTO THE DELIVER ENVIRONMENT.  
10 THE PRODUCT TEAM REACHED A SATISFACTORY LEVEL OF WORK, COST  
11 ESTIMATES MAY RUN HIGH COMPARED TO RELATIVE PROJECTS BUT WE  
12 FOUND JUSTIFICATION IN LINE WITH INCREASES. THE RECOMMENDATION  
13 FOUND WAS THERE MIGHT BE OPPORTUNITY FOR MTC TO THINK ABOUT A  
14 DEEP DIVE INTO COSTS AND SEE IF THERE MIGHT BE AREAS FOR  
15 IMPROVEMENT OR AREAS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND TO ARTICULATE THEM  
16 AS THE PROJECT MOVES FORWARD INTO STAGE ONE. THE NEXT AREA WE  
17 LOOKED AT IS THE FUNDING PROGRAM WHERE FUND COME FROM TO BUILD  
18 THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE RECOMMENDATIONS ON THAT. TO COST  
19 SATISFACTORILY LEVEL OF PERFORMANCE MOVING FORWARD IN THE  
20 PROCESS WE FOUND AREAS OF SHORTFALLS AND AREAS WHERE THE  
21 FUNDING STRATEGY MIGHT NEED TO EVOLVE, WE FOUND THE BEDROCK  
22 WAS SUFFICIENT TO MOVE THE PROJECT FORWARD. WE DID THINK ABOUT  
23 CAPITAL OPERATING FUNDS TO RUN SERVICES THROUGH THE END OF THE  
24 PROJECT AND FOUND OPPORTUNITIES FOR FURTHER REVIEW AND  
25 DISCUSSION ABOUT MAKING SURE WE ARE PROACTIVE ON THE FINANCIAL



MARCH 12, 2025

1 PLAN REWARD TO OPERATE THE END SERVICES BUT NO RED FLAGS OR  
2 CONCERNS AND OUR INDEPENDENT REVIEW HERE OVERALL  
3 SATISFACTORILY LEVEL OF DEVELOPMENT ON THE FUNDING STRATEGY  
4 COMMENSURATE. NEED FOR PROJECT TRUTHS IN THIS INDUSTRY CAN  
5 TAKE DECADE TO BRING A PROJECT FROM LINE ON A MAP TO OPERATING  
6 RAILWAY. WHEN WE STARTED THE PROJECT AND PLANTED THE SEED OF  
7 THE IDEA THAT BECAME DESIGN WE'RE REVIEWING THERE IS ENOUGH  
8 CHANGE TO TAKE A STEP BACK AND LOOK AT FUNDAMENTALS. WE FOUND  
9 LEVEL DEVELOPMENT AND THOUGHT INTO THE PROGRAM SINCE ITS  
10 RELEASE IN 2004 SHOWED INTEREST IN EVOLVING THE PROJECT AND  
11 ALIGNING WITH CHANGING NEEDS FOR THE REGION, CONSIDERING  
12 CHANGE IN TRAVEL PATTERNS AND FOLLOWING THE PANDEMIC AS  
13 TANGIBLE EXAMPLES OF THINGS WE LOOKED AT, FOUND SATISFACTORY  
14 LEVEL OF WORK. OPPORTUNITIES MARGINS TO LOOK AT THE REGION'S  
15 GROWTH AND PATTERNS AND RIDERSHIP, ITERATION WE CAN DO,  
16 DELIVERY OF PROJECT AND SERVICES THAT RUN THROUGH IT NO  
17 PRINCIPLE CONCERNS IN THE INDEPENDENT REVIEW WITH RESPECT TO  
18 MOVING TO MAP STAGE ONE. NEXT SLIDE GOES TO BENEFITS OF THE  
19 PROJECT, PURPOSE AND NEED, WHAT MOTIVATES US TO CONSIDER THE  
20 PROJECT IN THE FIRST CASE BENEFITS, WHAT ARE THE REASONS WHY  
21 WE BUILD PROJECTS LIKE THESE. ACROSS TWO DIMENSIONS WE LOOKED  
22 AT PREDICTED RIDERSHIP TRAVEL TIME SAVINGS AND UNLOCKING  
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO SUPPORT REGIONAL GROWTH, WE FOUND  
24 SATISFACTORILY LEVEL OF PERFORMANCE WITHIN THE PRODUCT  
25 DEVELOPMENT GROUP, CAPITAL DECISIONS OPERATING DECISIONS



MARCH 12, 2025

1 EMBEDDED WITHIN THE PROGRAM PLANS WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO  
2 REVIEW AND DISCUSS SHOWED COMMITMENT TO THINKING HOW WE BUILD  
3 THIS PROJECT TO UNLOCK BENEFITS. WE DON'T WANT TO HAVE TRAINS  
4 MOVING AIR WE WANT TRAINS MOVING PEOPLE THERE IS RISK PROJECTS  
5 WON'T DELIVER WHAT WE EXPECT TO BUT FOUND NO RISKS. THINKING  
6 BACK TO CAPITAL AND OPERATING PLANS NO RED FLAGS HERE  
7 INDEPENDENT REVIEW GOOD SCORES HERE AND IN FACT BENEFITS CAN  
8 BE REALIZED, DELIVER -- GOVERNANCE ON THE NEXT SLIDE REFERS TO  
9 ROLE OF ALL PARTNERS AND AUTHORITIES AND DELIVERING A PROGRAM  
10 SUCH AS THIS AND MAKING SURE THERE IS A GOOD MODEL TO MAKE  
11 EFFECTIVE DECISIONS MANAGE DISPUTES LOOK AT RISK AND WHEN WE  
12 NEED TO MAKE CHANGES BE ABLE TO DO THOSE EFFICIENTLY AND  
13 EFFECTIVELY. WE DID FIND A STRONG SCORE ON THIS SIGNIFICANT  
14 EFFORT HAS GONE INTO THE FORMALIZE OF THIS PROGRAM IN THE  
15 VARIOUS ROLES OF AGENCIES ACROSS THE REGION WE FORMED A  
16 RECOMMENDATION ON THE IDEA OF A CHANGE CONTROL BOARD TO ADD  
17 SOME THINKING TO THAT WHICH TO MY UNDERSTANDING IS BEING  
18 REVIEWED. OVERALL STRONG GOVERNANCE FOR A PROGRAM OF THIS  
19 NATURE AND WE WORK ON MEGA PROJECTS LIKE THIS ACROSS NORTH  
20 AMERICA AND INTERNATIONALLY, GOVERNANCE CAN BE A CHALLENGE WE  
21 WERE PLEASED WITH WHAT WE SAW IN THE INDEPENDENT REVIEW AND  
22 MODEL NEEDED TO HAVE SUCCESS AT MAP LEVEL ONE. NEXT LIED  
23 PROCUREMENT SIGNIFICANT THOUGHT PUT INTO PROCUREMENT MODEL  
24 DELIVERING PROJECT COMPLEXITY RISKS AND CHALLENGES OF MEGA  
25 PROJECTS. OVERALL INSIGHTS FROM ELSEWHERE INSIGHTS FROM PAST



MARCH 12, 2025

1 PROJECTS IN THE REGION HAVE BEEN INCORPORATED, THINKING  
2 THROUGH PROJECT DESIGN THROUGH TO THE END AND WE'RE PLEASED TO  
3 SEE THE WORK, AND ARE ABLE TO GIVE THIS A STRONG SCORE WITH NO  
4 EXTRA RECOMMENDATIONS GOOD WORK TO THE TEAM ON THE PROCUREMENT  
5 MODEL. COUPLE AREAS ON THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROJECT,  
6 TECHNICAL RISKS. AGAIN THE DEVELOPMENT PROCESS SPEAKS TOWARDS  
7 MAKING SURE WE HAVE COMMENSURATE LEVEL OF DESIGN, AGAIN  
8 FUNDING THEY WOULD LIKE TO USE DESIGN WORK PROVIDED TO US  
9 DEVELOPMENT DOCUMENTS PROVIDED REFLECTED APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF  
10 DESIGN AND THOUGHT TO GO TO LEVEL ONE AND MAKE USE OF THAT  
11 DESIGNATION TO MOVE THE PROJECT FORWARD RECOMMENDATION IN OUR  
12 REVIEW HERE STRONG SCORE. NEXT SLIDE. YOU CAN'T GO A DAY  
13 WITHOUT HEARING ABOUT RISKS IN THESE MEGA PROJECTS AGAIN WE  
14 FOUND THE TEAM HERE THROUGH ITS QUARTER LEER RISK MANAGEMENT  
15 REPORT AND OTHER EMBEDDED EXERCISES WITHIN THE TEAM THAT  
16 INCLUDES DIFFERENT AGENCIES WORKING ON THE PROJECT IN  
17 PROACTIVE APPROACH TO RISK MANAGEMENT, SPECIFIC RISK  
18 IDENTIFIED OF THE THINGS THAT TYPICALLY DRIVE RISK ON MEGA  
19 PROJECTS SUCH AS THIS AS WELL AS MECHANISMS TO ADDRESS. SO NO  
20 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM US, MAY BE SOME ONGOING TO REVISIT AT  
21 PROJECT MOVES INTO MAP LEVEL ONE ON DIFFERENT RISKS. RECAP WE  
22 HAVE FINAL SLIDE ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS WE HAVE MADE AS AN  
23 INDEPENDENT FIRM APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO COLLABORATE  
24 WITH THE TJPA TEAM AND PARTNER ENVIRONMENT MTC ON THIS OVERALL  
25 WE FIND THE PROJECT MAP LEVEL ONE PERSPECTIVE ACHIEVE STRONG



MARCH 12, 2025

1 SATISFACTORILY PERFORMANCE ACROSS THE OPPORTUNITY TO DRAFT  
2 SOME RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE'RE FRAMING MORE AS THINGS TO  
3 THINK ABOUT FOR MTC AND COMMISSION AS THEY CONTINUE TO WORK ON  
4 THIS PROJECT BUT NO SIGNIFICANT RISKS OR ISSUES THAT ARE  
5 CALLED TO BE IDENTIFIED IN OUR FRAMEWORK OR FOUND FOR THIS  
6 PROJECT AGAIN WE DIDN'T FIND ANYTHING THAT WOULD BE A RED FLAG  
7 OR FATAL FLAW FOR THE REQUEST FOR MOVING TO MAP LEVEL ONE.  
8 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY I'LL TURN THE MICROPHONE TO  
9 KENNETH FOLAN.

10

11 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THANK YOU PATRICK. AND BASED ON THAT EVALUATION  
12 PERFORMED BY STEER, AS WELL AS INPUT FROM THE MTC STAFF, WE  
13 ARE RECOMMENDING REASSIGNING THE PROJECT FROM LEVEL TWO TO  
14 LEVEL ONE. AND I'LL WALK THROUGH A COUPLE OF CONDITIONS AND  
15 RECOMMENDATIONS WE ARE RECOMMENDING THAT YOU ATTACH TO IT.  
16 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, PATRICK MENTIONED THAT THEIR  
17 EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS THAT THERE IS A CHANGE CONTROL  
18 BOARD. WE ARE RECOMMENDING THE FORMALIZE OF A CHANGE CONTROL  
19 BOARD WITH MTC AS VOTING MEMBER. TJPA AND PARTNERS CURRENTLY  
20 HAVE A VERY ROBUST AND STRONG OVERSIGHT STRUCTURE. SO THIS  
21 CHANGE CONTROL BOARD WOULD BE PART OF THAT STRUCTURE THAT  
22 ALREADY EXISTS. ONE, SORT OF, HISTORICAL PIECE ON THESE CHANGE  
23 CONTROL BOARDS, THE RECENTLY COMPLETED CALTRAIN  
24 ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT HAD A SIMILAR SET UP WHERE THE PARTNER  
25 AGENCIES, THE FUNDING AGENCIES, INCLUDING MTC, WERE PART OF A





MARCH 12, 2025

1 CHANGE CONTROL BOARD THAT APPROVED CERTAIN CHANGES TO THE  
2 SCOPE SCHEDULE AND BUDGET OF THE PROJECT AND THOSE WERE  
3 REQUIRED FOR THE CHANGE ORDERS TO BE EXECUTED. WE FOUND THAT  
4 HAVING INDEPENDENT VOICES OUTSIDE OF THE AGENCY, OUTSIDE OF  
5 THE PROJECT TEAM WAS HEALTHY ENVIRONMENT FOR THE PROJECT TO  
6 MOVE FORWARD AND MAKE SURE IT'S BEING TESTED AND AS PATRICK  
7 MENTIONED, IT'S USED WITH SUCCESS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY HERE.  
8 THE OTHER NOTE I'LL MAKE, WE ARE ALSO AN INVESTOR IN THIS  
9 PROJECT. MTC, AS THE AGENCY OVERSEEING THE BRIDGE TOLLS, THIS  
10 PROJECT HAS REGIONAL MEASURE THREE FUNDING IN THE AMOUNT OF  
11 \$325 MILLION. SO, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE TAKE THAT  
12 PERSPECTIVE, AS WELL AS JUST THE REGIONAL LEADERSHIP ON THIS.  
13 THE SECOND CONDITION IS PRIMARILY BASED ON WHAT HAS COME  
14 BEFORE THE COMMISSION RECENTLY. A DEVELOPMENT OF AN OPERATING  
15 COST RANGE REPORT. AS YOU KNOW THE COMMISSION, TRANSIT  
16 OPERATORS, THE ENTIRE STATE ARE VERY FOCUSED ON THE DIRE  
17 FISCAL SITUATION FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THEIR OPERATING  
18 BUDGETS. SO WITH THIS CONDITION WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT  
19 WE'RE NOT JUST ADDING PRESSURES TO THAT SITUATION, BUT  
20 ATTEMPTING TO COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS OUTSIDE OF THE EXISTING  
21 FUNDING SOURCES FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS THAT CAN BE PART OF THE  
22 ONGOING OPERATING OF THIS PROJECT. ULTIMATELY WHEN YOU ADD  
23 EXPANSION TO YOUR SYSTEMS YOU HAVE ADDITIONAL OPERATING COST.  
24 AND AGENCY'S INTERNAL WITH AGENCIES, OR AGAINST OTHER AGENCIES  
25 THERE, IS COMPETITION FOR PRECIOUS DOLLARS SO WE WANT TO PUT



MARCH 12, 2025

1 THAT OUT THERE AND ADDRESS THAT AND WORK WITH THE SPONSOR ON  
2 THAT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THE FOLLOWING TWO SLIDES ARE NOT  
3 CONDITIONS, MORE RECOMMENDATIONS. ARE MORE FOCUSED ON THE  
4 PROJECT SPONSOR SOME ARE EVEN JUST NOTES TO OURSELVES THAT WE  
5 NEED TO KEEP ADVOCATING AND WORKING WITH THE SPONSOR. FIRST  
6 LIST HERE IS COST CONTROL VALUE ENGINEERING LIKE I SAID  
7 EARLIER, THE SPONSOR IS VERY FOCUSED ON THIS. THEY HAVE  
8 ALREADY MADE PROGRESS HERE ON THE COST CONTROL EVALUATE  
9 ENGINEERING. AS FAR AS THE FUNDING CONCERN, I THINK THAT,  
10 AGAIN, THE IMPORTANCE OF THOSE FEDERAL DOLLARS TO THESE  
11 PROJECTS, WE HAVE TO KEEP WORKING ON THAT. AND YOU SEE THE  
12 ACRONYM UP THERE TIRCP, THIS'S THE CAP-AND-TRADE FUNDING THAT  
13 GOES TO TRANSIT EXPANSION PROJECTS. REALLY IMPORTANT THAT THAT  
14 IS IMPORTANT FOR THIS PROJECT, OTHER EXPANSION PROJECTS. SO,  
15 TO GET THAT CAP-AND-TRADE REAUTHORIZATION, LIKE IN THE SECOND  
16 BULLET, AND THEN FINALLY THE LAST ONE IS THERE WAS A  
17 COMMITMENT FROM HIGH SPEED RAIL IN A PRIOR BUSINESS PLAN, AND  
18 THAT'S, OBVIOUSLY, A HALF A BILLION DOLLARS. AND WE NEED TO  
19 KEEP WORKING WITH THE STATE TO SECURE THAT INVESTMENT. NEXT  
20 SLIDE, PLEASE. AND JUST THE THINGS THAT PATRICK MENTIONED, THE  
21 ADHERENCE TO REGIONAL POLICIES, MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE  
22 CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA, AND THEN FINALLY, CONSIDER A  
23 HEALTH CHECK, OR ONGOING HEALTH CHECKS THAT YOU'RE ALWAYS KIND  
24 OF REFINING, SCHEDULE SCOPE AND BUDGET AND MAKING SURE THAT  
25 YOU'RE WORKING WITH ALL PARTNERS TO KEEP THE PROJECT MOVING



MARCH 12, 2025

1 FORWARD. SO, THAT'S THE STAFF REPORT. WHAT THE STAFF IS  
2 RECOMMENDING IS THAT THIS COMMITTEE REFER THE RESOLUTION 4537  
3 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. AND WHAT THAT HAS IS  
4 MOVING THE PROJECT, THE PORTAL PROJECT FROM LEVEL TWO TO LEVEL  
5 ONE OF THE MAP. SO, BACK TO YOU, COMMISSIONER MILEY.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONERS?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR MILEY. AS ONE OF THE  
10 REPRESENTATIVES FROM SAN FRANCISCO, WHO ALSO SERVES AS THE  
11 CHAIR OF THE SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY,  
12 WHICH IS ONE OF THE INVESTORS, I WANTED TO JUST PROVIDE A  
13 COUPLE OF COMMENTS.

14

15 **MYRNA MELGAR:** FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE MTC STAFF, THE  
16 CONSULTANTS FOR A VERY RIGOROUS EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT AND  
17 I WOULD ASK MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS TO PLEASE SUPPORT THE  
18 ELEVATION OF THE PORTAL TWO LEVEL ONE I BELIEVE IT'S BOTH  
19 TIMELY AND NECESSARY I HAVE NEVER DOUBTED THE FINDINGS. THANK  
20 YOU SO MUCH. FOR THOSE OF US WHO HAVE BEEN WATCHING THE PORTAL  
21 HAS BEEN MAKING FOR THE LAST TWO DECADES NOW 70% FUNDED  
22 INCLUDING FEDERAL COMMITMENT OF 3.38 BILLION, JOINT POWERS  
23 AUTHORITY AND ITS PARTNERS ARE WORKING TIRELESSLY TO SECURE  
24 MASK FUNDS NEEDED TO UNLOCK ON BEHALF OF ALL OF US. MTC'S  
25 PRIORITIZATION OF THE PROJECT IS CRITICAL FOR THIS PROJECT TO



MARCH 12, 2025

1 SECURE THE FUNDING THAT WE'RE ALL SEEKING WITH ONE EXAMPLE  
2 BEING THE PROPOSED EXTENSION OF THE STATE CAP-AND-TRADE  
3 PROGRAM. AS CHAIR OF THE SAN FRANCISCO TRANSPORTATION  
4 AUTHORITY, I SEE FIRSTHAND HOW MUCH THE IMPACT OF THE MTC'S  
5 ADVOCACY MAKES ON THE STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING DECISIONS. AND  
6 I BELIEVE THAT THIS SUPPORT IS JUST KEY TO MAKING SURE THAT  
7 THE PROJECT IS SUCCESSFUL. THE ADVANCEMENT OF THE PORTAL TO  
8 LEVEL ONE OF MAP IS CRITICAL TO EXPANDING THE BAY AREA,  
9 SUSTAINABLE AND RESILIENT TRANSPORTATION FUTURE. AND ITS  
10 ABILITY TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. THE PROJECT WILL  
11 ALSO INCREASE EQUITABLE ACCESS TO TRANSIT FOR RIDERS ACROSS  
12 THE BAY AREA, AND EXPAND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES, INCLUDING THE  
13 CREATION OF 60,000 JOBS OVER THE LIFE OF THE PROJECT. SO,  
14 MONDAY IS MY BIRTHDAY. AND LAST NIGHT, MY SISTERS, WHO LIVE,  
15 ONE IN PINOLE, AND ONE IN SACRAMENTO TOOK BUS TO THE HUB. AND  
16 WE HAD DINNER AT A RESTAURANT ON THE GROUND FLOOR. I CAN'T  
17 NAME IT, BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, WE'RE IN A PUBLIC MEETING. BUT YOU  
18 ALL CAN LOOK IT UP. AND IT WAS PACKED ON A TUESDAY NIGHT. SO,  
19 THAT VISION IS ALREADY PARTLY REALIZED, THAT INTERCONNECTED  
20 MULTI-MODAL HUB. AND THE NEXT STEP OF OUR FUTURE AS A REGION,  
21 I THINK, LIES RIGHT -- RIGHT THERE. [LAUGHTER] SO, I'M REALLY  
22 EXCITED THAT WE'RE CONSIDERING IT. IT HAS THE SUPPORT OF A  
23 REALLY BROAD COALITION OF FOLKS IN OUR BAY AREA, ASIDE FROM MY  
24 SISTERS AND MY FAMILY WHO ARE IN ALL NINE COUNTIES OF THE BAY  
25 AREA, I'M SURE YOU ALL TOO, WE SUPPORT LABOR BUSINESS



MARCH 12, 2025

1 ADVOCATES COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS SOME OF WHOM YOU HAVE HEARD  
2 FROM BEFORE AND SOME OF YOU WILL HEAR FROM DURING PUBLIC  
3 COMMENT. AGAIN I WANT TO THANK STAFF AND CONSULTANTS AND THE  
4 WORK OF THIS COMMITTEE FOR CONSIDERING THIS ITEM. I REQUEST  
5 THAT YOU APPROVE THE RECOMMENDATIONS TO ELEVATE THE PORTAL TO  
6 LEVEL ONE OF THE MAP. THANK YOU.

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR  
9 THE PRESENTATION. I APPRECIATED YOUR GOING THROUGH THE  
10 EVALUATION PROCESS. AND HAPPY BIRTHDAY, COMMISSIONER MELGAR. I  
11 AM SUPPORTIVE OF MOVING THE PROJECT TO LEVEL ONE. AND I JUST  
12 WANTED TO MENTION MY APPRECIATION FOR SOME OF THE  
13 RECOMMENDATIONS AND THE POINTS THAT YOU BRING UP. AND ON THE  
14 TJPA COMMITTEE, AND WE HAVE BEEN TALKING A LOT ABOUT  
15 OPERATING, OPERATING BUDGET POST CONSTRUCTION AND IT DOES  
16 AFFECT OTHER AGENCIES. I'M ON THE CALTRAIN BOARD, AS WELL, AND  
17 SO THAT IS A SIGNIFICANT CONCERN ABOUT MAKING SURE THAT THIS  
18 PROJECT DOESN'T EXASPERATE THE OPERATING BUDGETS OF THESE  
19 OTHER AGENCIES. SO, I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING THAT UP. I WOULD  
20 -- I WAS GOING TO ASK IF WE COULD RECEIVE AN UPDATE, MAYBE IN  
21 A YEAR'S TIME, AFTER THE CONDITIONS HAVE BEEN MET. SO, MAYBE  
22 EARLY NEXT YEAR FOR A PRESENTATION AS TO WHERE WE ARE. THANK  
23 YOU.

24



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **EVELYNN TRAN:** I ALSO WANT TO SECOND COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND  
2 SUPPORT MOVING TO LEVEL ONE. I THINK THIS IS A VERY IMPORTANT  
3 PROJECT REGIONALLY. SO I WANTED TO POSE MY SUPPORT. I DON'T  
4 GET TO VOTE ON THIS, BUT WE'RE DEFINITELY IN IT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. OH, GO AHEAD.

7

8 **EVELYNN TRAN:** FULL DISCLOSURE WE'RE ON THE TJPA MEMBER BOARD  
9 MEMBERS.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. CAN YOU CLARIFY FOR ME GOVERNANCE OF THIS  
12 PROJECT BECAUSE I BRING UP THIS RECENTLY WE ARE DEALING WITH  
13 SOME ISSUES WITH CALTRAIN AND AN OPERATOR WHO IS DOING THINGS  
14 THEN JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE LEFT PAYING THE BILLS THINGS DON'T  
15 QUITE WORK OUT. WHO IS IN CHARGE OF THE GOVERNANCE OVER THIS  
16 PROJECT?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THE PROJECT SPONSOR IS THE AUTHORITY HERE AND THAT IS  
19 WHO IS IN CHARGE OF THIS PROJECT AND THE OWNER OF THE  
20 FACILITY.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** GOT IT. OKAY. SO, I MEAN, THIS IS EXCITING, AND  
23 THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT FOREVER, THE MEGA PROJECTS. AND TO  
24 SEE EACH AND EVERY STEP SO THAT IT WILL HELP THE REST OF US  
25 YOU WE PROGRESS WITH REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION HERE MY ONE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 CONCERN HERE IS THE TIRCP BECAUSE YOU CAN'T GET TO SAN  
2 FRANCISCO WITHOUT PASSING THROUGH A LOT OF JURISDICTIONS WHO  
3 NEED GRADE SEPARATIONS AND OTHER ASPECTS TO MAKE THIS REALLY  
4 WORK IN SUCH A WAY. WE SUPPORT, OF COURSE, THE REGION, BUT WE  
5 NEED TO BE CAREFUL HERE THAT INVESTMENTS NEED TO BE EQUITABLY  
6 DISTRIBUTED IN ORDER TO ASSIST IN ALL THESE PROJECTS  
7 HAPPENING. AND I DO COMPLEMENT MY COLLEAGUE HERE ON  
8 INTERCONNECTIONS AND INTERMODAL, AND IT'S FANTASTIC THAT SAN  
9 FRANCISCO IS REALLY PUTTING THOSE PIECES TOGETHER. BUT THERE  
10 IS A LOT OF ROADBLOCKS WHEN OTHER JURISDICTIONS TRY TO DO  
11 SIMILARLY. AND BACKGROUND, WE HAVE THE LARGEST INTERMODAL  
12 CENTER, TRYING TO GET ANY RESTAURANTS OR ANYTHING IN THERE HAS  
13 BEEN BLOCKED BY BART AND SOME OTHER THINGS. SO, I'M GLAD TO  
14 SEE THIS IS COMING TOGETHER AS AN EXAMPLE. BECAUSE WE WANT TO  
15 LEARN TO DO THESE THINGS TO THE BEST OF OUR CAPABILITY. AND  
16 IT'S SIMPLY GOT TO PUT ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER. SO, I FULLY  
17 SUPPORT SAN FRANCISCO'S EFFORTS HERE. AND I HOPE THEY SUPPORT  
18 US ALONG THE CORRIDOR AS WE PROGRESS TO REALLY MAKE THE WHOLE  
19 SYSTEM A LOT MORE SUCCESSFUL. THIS IS EXCITING. AND I KNOW  
20 THERE IS NO CRYSTAL BALL HERE, ESPECIALLY WITH THE NEW  
21 ADMINISTRATION. WHAT EFFORTS ARE BEING MADE, PARTICULARLY WITH  
22 THE -- JUST THE MATERIALS. DO WE HAVE ANY, SORT OF, EFFORTS TO  
23 KIND OF CONTROL THAT COST ELEMENT? SO, YOU HAVE A CHANGE  
24 CONTROL BOARD. YOU CAN ELABORATE A LITTLE MORE ON THAT? THAT  
25 SOUNDS VERY, VERY INTERESTING.



MARCH 12, 2025

1  
2 **SPEAKER:** SURE. AGAIN, THE TJPA IS THE OWNER AND AUTHORITY  
3 HERE. SO, WHAT A CHANGE CONTROL BOARD WOULD DO IS IT WOULD BE  
4 PART OF THE MASTER AGREEMENT THAT THE FUNDING PARTNERS, SAN  
5 FRANCISCO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, CALTRAIN, HIGH  
6 SPEED RAIL, MTC, MAYBE I'M MISSING A FEW, WOULD HAVE, IT'S AN  
7 AGREEMENT THEY HAVE TO ADVISE, ADVOCATE FOR, WORK WITH THE  
8 PROJECT SPONSOR. THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD IS USED ON PROJECTS  
9 TO, WHEN THERE IS ANY, SORT OF, CHANGE OF A SCOPE, SCHEDULE,  
10 BUDGET, AND IF IT HITS THE CRITERIA OF THE CHANGE CONTROL  
11 BOARD FOR A PROJECT THIS BIG, THE DOLLAR AMOUNT THAT YOU WOULD  
12 GO TO THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD WOULD BE HIGHER THAN CALTRAIN  
13 ELECTRIFICATION. BECAUSE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION WAS CLOSER  
14 TO 2 BILLION. THIS IS CLOSER TO 8 BILLION. SO, ON THAT  
15 PARTICULAR PROJECT I BELIEVE IT WAS \$250,000 IF IT WAS A  
16 CHANGE ORDER THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD WOULD SEE A COUPLE OF  
17 MONTHS BEFORE THE BOARD WOULD ASK QUESTIONS, SORT OF, AN  
18 INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT AND THEN WOULD MAKE A RECOMMENDATION SO  
19 THIS WOULD FUNCTION IN THE SAME WAY OR COULD FUNCTIONS IN THE  
20 SAME WAY DEPENDING HOW THE ULTIMATE AGREEMENT IS WORKED OUT  
21 THEN AGAIN WOULD BE A TESTING GROUND TO MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE  
22 THINK THAT'S A GOOD IDEA TO MOVE FORWARD IN THAT WAY. FROM MY  
23 EXPERIENCE WITH THE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION, THERE WERE TIMES  
24 WHERE THERE WERE TENSION, TIMES WHERE THE PROJECT SPONSOR  
25 MIGHT THINK THAT THIS IS SLOWING THEM DOWN, BUT ULTIMATELY IT





MARCH 12, 2025

1 WAS INDEPENDENT OUTSIDE EYES THAT WERE LOOKING AT THE PROJECT  
2 AND THE DECISIONS OF THE PROJECT TEAM, AND I THINK IN THE END  
3 IT WAS WORTHWHILE TO DO THAT ONE.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, I LIKE IT. IT'S JUST, YOU KNOW, I'M NOT  
6 SEEING WHAT KIND OF THE CONSEQUENCES ARE. WE HEAR ALL KIND OF  
7 HORROR STORIES, YOU BRING ON SOMEBODY WHO GOT THE LOWEST BID  
8 THEN ALL OF A SUDDEN YOU SEE ALL THESE CHANGE ORDERS COMING  
9 HERE. HOW DOES THAT PLAY INTO CONTROLLING COSTS?

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER IF I COULD, THROUGH THE CHAIR,  
12 FIRST WE HAVE THE GENERAL MANAGER CEO OF THE JPA HERE AND HE  
13 MIGHT ALSO BE ABLE TO ELABORATE. I WANT TO ROLL BACK THE CLOCK  
14 20 YEARS AS WE GET TO THE PROJECT THAT'S BEHIND HE.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** I WAS.

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THE LEGISLATION SET UP PART OF THAT WAS TO  
19 REQUIRE A RISK MANAGEMENT PLAN THAT WAS OPERATE THROUGH THE  
20 COURSE OF THE PROJECT AND I THINK DINA WOULD ACKNOWLEDGE THAT  
21 AT THE END OF THE DAY THAT LEGISLATION WAS GIVEN A BUDGET AND  
22 A SCHEDULE AND THEY WERE BOTH MET ON THE BAY BRIDGE AND IT HAD  
23 TO DO, REALLY, I THINK, WITH DUE DILIGENCE IN THAT RISK  
24 MANAGEMENT ENVIRONMENT. SO ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE  
25 TRIED TO EMULATE AND THROUGH THESE WORKSHOPS THAT STARTED IN



MARCH 12, 2025

1 2022, WAS TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WHEN WE HAVE A ROLE, AN  
2 INVESTMENT ROLE IN THESE PROJECTS, WE WOULD LIKE TO BE AT THE  
3 TABLE, BOTH ADAM VAN DER WATER AND HIS PREDECESSOR MARK ZABANE  
4 HAD BEEN VERY GOOD ABOUT ALLOWING US TO THE TABLE AND I THINK  
5 IN THIS PARTICULAR CASE ON A VOLUNTARY BASIS WE HAVE DEVELOPED  
6 AGREEMENTS THAT ARE REALLY ALLOWING US ALL TO PARTICIPATE IN  
7 THE DISCUSSION. AND ONE OF THE BIG RISKS, I THINK, THAT WAS  
8 FIRST TACKLED AND IT WAS MENTIONED IN THE REPORT, WAS THE  
9 DECISION ON HOW TO DELIVER THE PROJECT. NOW, YOU DON'T KNOW  
10 HOW THOSE ARE GOING TO SHAPE OUT. CHALLENGES WILL HAPPEN. BUT  
11 WE GOT INVOLVED, AS DID THE OTHER PARTNERS, AND REALLY DID A  
12 DEEP DIVE ON WHAT WAS THE BEST WAY TO START TO DELIVER THE  
13 PROJECT. AND ALL VOICES WERE HEARD, AND WE HAD CONSENSUS ON  
14 THE DECISION. I THINK SOMETIMES WE FORGET THAT THOSE EARLY  
15 DECISIONS ARE ACTUALLY SOME OF THE MOST CRITICAL DECISIONS WE  
16 TALK ABOUT IN THESE MEGA PROJECTS BEFORE THEY'RE ACTUALLY  
17 STARTED. ONCE THE HORSE IS OUT OF THE BARN, YOU LEARN ALL  
18 KINDS OF THINGS THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN NICE TO CATCH EARLIER ON.  
19 I THINK WE HAVE ESTABLISHED A GOOD CADENCE WITH THE PARTNERS.  
20 I THINK THE JPA HAS BEEN VERY ACCEPTING OF THE INVESTMENT IN  
21 OUR TIME, IN MOVING FORWARD. AND WE HAVE ESTABLISHED, EVEN  
22 BEYOND THIS CHANGE CONTROL BOARD, A HIERARCHY OF RELATIONSHIP  
23 WHERE MTC WILL HAVE A NON-VOTING SEAT ON THE TABLE THAT WILL  
24 HEAR INPUT ON A REGULAR BASIS, ON THE STATUTES OF  
25 CONSTRUCTION, ON THE STATUS OF THE RISKS, RISKS THAT ARE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 IDENTIFIED, AND THEN ALSO HOW THEY'RE MANAGED. AND I THINK  
2 THAT'S THE BEST WE CAN OFFER YOU TODAY. I DON'T KNOW IF ADAM  
3 IS INTERESTED OR IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN HEARING A WORD FROM  
4 HIM. BUT HOPEFULLY HE'LL SUPPORT THAT LITTLE MONOLOGUE?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, I THINK HAVING MORE PEOPLE TO ASSIST IN RISK  
7 MANAGEMENT AT THE TABLE OR AT LEAST POINT IT OUT IS VERY  
8 IMPORTANT. THIS IS A GREAT EXAMPLE I WAS HOPING A BROADWAY  
9 GRADE SEPARATION WOULD BE A GOOD MAJOR PROJECT HERE I AM  
10 EXCITED ABOUT THIS ASK JUST ALL THE ELEMENTS YOU WENT THROUGH  
11 HERE AND JUST TRYING TO EDUCATE US ALL, BECAUSE WE'RE ALL  
12 TRYING TO LEARN IS THE BEST WAY TO GET THESE MEGA PROJECTS  
13 DONE AND MOVING ALONG. I FULLY SUPPORT THIS, AND, SO THAT'S  
14 WHY I'M JUST CURIOUS, THIS GOVERNANCE THING SOUNDS REALLY --  
15 NOT THIS GOVERNANCE, BUT THIS CHANGE MANAGEMENT BOARD, THAT  
16 SOUNDS REALLY INTERESTING. SO, I DO HOPE WE'RE LEARNING ALONG  
17 THE WAY HERE. I WOULD AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUE MY COLLEAGUE,  
18 MISS ABE-KOGA THAT, IF YOU COULD KEEP US UPDATED A LOT MORE  
19 THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO MANY OF US HERE. BECAUSE WE WANT TO  
20 SEE THIS GO IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION, AND GET TO WORK ON IT. SO,  
21 THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE AND I'M GOOD ON THAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IF I COULD TAKE ADVANTAGE OF HAVING THE MIC  
24 OPEN. WE ARE TRYING TO, ON A VOLUNTARY BASIS, GET ENGAGED IN  
25 MANY REGIONAL PROJECTS. SO WE HAVE BEEN ENGAGED SINCE DAY ONE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 ON THE DIRIDON PROJECT. WE WOULD LIKE TO GET MORE ENGAGED IN  
2 BART TO SAN JOSE FOR THE VERY SAME REASONS THAT YOU MENTIONED.  
3 AS THESE MEGA PROJECTS COME FORWARD WE THINK WE CAN BEST  
4 ADVISE YOU ON HOW TO MOVE FORWARD BY BEING CLOSE TO THE  
5 DISCUSSIONS AS THEY'RE UNFOLDING AND I THINK THAT'S WHERE OUR  
6 BENEFIT COMES IN BEING ABLE TO GIVE YOU GOOD INFORMATION AS  
7 OPPOSED TO HAVING JUST A PARTNER SHOW UP AND EXPLAIN WHERE  
8 THEY ARE ON THE PROJECT APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** THIS IS BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO .

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** WE'RE WORKING ON A PLAN DO JUST THAT.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE IT.

15

16 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** I MIGHT BE RAISING OR TAKING A SLIGHTLY  
17 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE ON THIS ISSUE. AND I AM A LITTLE  
18 CONFUSED BECAUSE THE BAY BRIDGE IS NOTORIOUSLY USED AS AN  
19 EXAMPLE OF A PROJECT THAT WAS WAY BEHIND SCHEDULE AND WAY OVER  
20 BUDGET. SO, I'M -- MAYBE AFTER THE MEETING YOU CAN CLEAR UP MY  
21 CONFUSION FROM WHEN YOU JUST STATED. EZRA INCLINE IS COMING  
22 OUT WITH A BOOK IN A FEW DAYS CALLED ABUNDANCE, AND IN TEASING  
23 THAT BOOK HE USED AS HIS POSTER CHILD OF WHAT IS BROKEN ABOUT  
24 HOW GOVERNMENT IS WORKING, THE HIGH SPEED RAIL PROJECT IN  
25 CALIFORNIA. AND PART OF THIS PHILOSOPHY IS THAT WE, THE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 GOVERNMENT, NEED TO RECOGNIZE WHEN OUR PROCESSES AND  
2 PROCEDURAL FETISHES ARE, IN FACT, DELAYING AND CAUSING A FALSE  
3 SCARCITY OF THE VERY THINGS THAT OUR PEOPLE NEED. AND, SO,  
4 WHILE ON PAPER, THE COST CONTROL BOARD SOUNDS LIKE A GOOD  
5 IDEA, I JUST WANT TO EXPRESS MY CONCERN THAT IT NOT CAUSE  
6 UNNECESSARY PROCEDURAL DELAYS THAT ACTUALLY ADD TO COSTS,  
7 RATHER THAN CONTAIN THEM. WE HAVE SEEN MANY TIMES THAT WHEN  
8 PROJECTS GET DELAYED THERE IS A COST. AND, SO, AGAIN, IT  
9 SOUNDS LUKE A GOOD IDEA. THIS IS AN INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT  
10 PROJECT. I THINK, YOU KNOW, YOU WILL HEAR EVERYBODY UP HERE IS  
11 SUPPORTING MOVING THIS UP TO PRIORITY ONE. BUT I DO WANT TO  
12 CAUTION THAT WE KEEP OUR EYE ON THE BIG PRIZE, WHICH IS VALUE  
13 FOR THE PEOPLE WE SERVE. AND WE DON'T HAVE THE BEST TRACK  
14 RECORD ON THAT GOING INTO THIS. AND WHEN WE LEARN LESSONS, THE  
15 BAY BRIDGE SEEMS LIKE A LESSON IN HOW DELAYS ACTUALLY ADD  
16 TREMENDOUS COSTS. AND I KNOW THERE ARE MANY, MANY FACTORS,  
17 INCLUDING A BY THAT I ONCE WORKED FOR WHO HAD A VISION  
18 [LAUGHTER] -- AND THAT WAS PART OF IT. BUT I JUST WANT TO ADD  
19 THAT -- THAT AWARENESS THAT I THINK MORE AND MORE PEOPLE, AND  
20 PARTICULARLY THE PUBLIC IS RECOGNIZING THAT SOMETIMES  
21 GOVERNMENTAL PROCESSES ADD COST AND DELAYS IN A WAY THAT IS  
22 NOT SERVING THE PUBLIC. SO THAT'S JUST MY CAUTIONARY WORD.  
23 THANK YOU.  
24



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS. I THINK THIS  
2 BRINGS US ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT HOW WE CAN BE  
3 REGIONABLE. AND IT IS REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE UNDERSTAND THAT  
4 THE BAY AREA IS ONE REGION. IT IS ONE ECONOMY. IT IS ONE  
5 HOUSING MARKET. IT IS ONE TRAFFIC CONGESTION PROBLEM THAT  
6 CAN'T BE SOLVED CITY BY CITY, BUT HAS TO BE SOLVED REGIONALLY.  
7 AND THAT OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA HAVE  
8 THESE GAPS IN THEM. THAT THEY'RE SOMETIMES CALLED THIS LAST  
9 MILE CONNECTIONS, BUT THERE ARE HOLES IN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM.  
10 AND, SO, FILLING THOSE HOLES IS IMPORTANT SO THAT ALL OF OUR  
11 TRANSIT SYSTEMS INTERCONNECT. AND I DO THINK CALTRAIN  
12 ELECTRIFICATION IS A GOOD POSITIVE EXAMPLE IN TERMS OF A  
13 PROJECT THAT IS BOTH REDUCING POLLUTION, IMPROVING THE SPEED  
14 OF PUBLIC TRANSIT, AND, ALSO, ATTRACTING MORE RIDERS AND MORE  
15 POSITIVITY. AND, SO, I CERTAINLY HEARD SOME OF MY COLLEAGUES,  
16 AND OF COURSE, I NEITHER REPRESENT SAN FRANCISCO NOR SOME OF  
17 THE OTHER JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE CONCERNED ABOUT BEING LEFT  
18 BEHIND, SO, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT AS WE WORK ON PROJECTS LIKE  
19 THIS, THAT ARE OF REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE, THAT WE CONTINUE TO  
20 UPLIFT OTHER REGIONAL CONNECTIONS THAT ARE NEEDED THROUGH THE  
21 OUR REGION. AND THAT WE SEE THESE DIFFERENT REGIONAL  
22 CONNECTIONS AS BEING IN SERVICE OF ONE ANOTHER, RATHER THAN  
23 AGAINST ONE ANOTHER. SO I JUST WANTED TO BRIEFLY SHARE THAT A  
24 FEW WEEKS AGO CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION WAS ALMOST KILLED. AND  
25 IN FACT, THE FUNDING WAS REMOVED BY SOMEONE WHO WAS PRESIDENT



MARCH 12, 2025

1 AT THAT TIME. AND THERE WAS A DELEGATION TO WASHINGTON DC OF A  
2 SIGNIFICANT LEADERSHIP FROM THE ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION  
3 COMMISSION WHO JOINED IN ADVOCACY TO RESTORE THE FUNDING FOR  
4 CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION, ALONG WITH OTHERS. AND THAT WAS  
5 SUCCESSFUL. AND NOW THAT PROJECT CAN BE SEEN AS A ROLE MODEL  
6 OF WHAT IT -- WHAT A SUCCESSFUL EFFORT LOOKS LIKE. AND, SO, I  
7 HOPE AS THIS ONE MOVES FORWARD, THAT WE CAN ALSO BUILD ON THAT  
8 FOR OTHER GAPS THROUGH THE OUR REGION, THAT CLOSING THE GAPS  
9 THROUGH THE OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM CAN SERVE THE WHOLE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** ONE MORE QUICK HO THING HERE. NOBODY IS INTERESTED  
12 IN SLOWING THINGS DOWN HERE. BUT WE ARE INTERESTED IN QUALITY.  
13 I DO REMEMBER VAGUELY SALESFORCE STATION OPENING AND THEN  
14 CLOSING. I FORGET WHAT IT WAS. TILE, OR SOMETHING WAS --  
15 SOMEBODY WANT TO REMEMBER THAT FOR ME HERE?

16

17 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THERE WAS A PROBLEM WITH THE MAIN STEEL  
18 GIRDERS THAT WERE CONSTRUCTED.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH. [LAUGHTER] THE IDEA OF MEGA PROJECTS HERE IS  
21 THAT WE GET TO THE BEST WE CAN POSSIBLY BE. SO THERE ARE NOT  
22 ISSUES LIKE THAT, OR SOME OF THE BOLTS ON THE BAY BRIDGE. SO,  
23 I'M REALLY HOPING, WITH ALL THESE ELEMENTS AND ALL THESE  
24 THINGS COMING TOGETHER HERE, WE GET A QUALITY PROJECT THAT'S  
25 NOT GOING TO BE OPENED AND THEN SHUT. AND, BECAUSE SOMETHING



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WENT WRONG. FLUSH I'M NOT THE EXPERT. BUT THE IDEA, AGAIN,  
2 MEGA PROJECTS IS THE EXPERTS WERE BROUGHT TOGETHER SO THAT WE  
3 CAN GET MORE EFFICIENCY, MORE QUALITY, AND REALLY GET THESE  
4 PROJECTS FINISHED. SO, WHATEVER WE CAN DO ON THAT ARENA HERE,  
5 LET'S NOT RUSH IT AND BELOW IT. BECAUSE THAT'S NOT GOING HELP  
6 ANYBODY HERE. AND IT ALWAYS COSTS MORE. SO, JUST WANTED TO  
7 BRING THAT UP. THANK YOU.

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** A FEW QUESTIONS. I TOO WAS CONCERNED ABOUT THE  
10 CHANGE CONTROL BOARD. BECAUSE I'M NOT FAMILIAR WITH THAT. SO,  
11 HOW DO THOSE FOLKS GET SELECTED?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** AGAIN, I THINK THAT ANDY, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR PREMIER,  
14 HE SAID THAT THERE IS AN EXISTING STRUCTURE WITH THE EXECUTIVE  
15 AGREEMENT THAT HAS AN EXECUTIVE TEAM, AND THEN PROJECT  
16 MANAGEMENT TEAM. SO, THE TJPA IS THE OWNER OPERATOR OF THE  
17 PROJECT, THROUGH THAT AGREEMENT STRUCTURE, THE TEAM WOULD BE  
18 WORKING ON A -- ANOTHER AGREEMENT THAT ESTABLISHES THIS BOARD,  
19 CHANGE CONTROL BOARD, WITH CERTAIN RULES, THRESHOLDS,  
20 STANDARDS THAT WHY WOULD SOMETHING NEED TO GO TO THIS BOARD  
21 FOR AN APPROVAL OF THIS GROUP. USUALLY IT'S SOMETHING TO DO  
22 WITH THE SCOPE, ANY, SORT OF, SCOPE CHANGE, BUDGET CHANGE,  
23 SCHEDULE CHANGE. AND THEN ONCE THAT'S ESTABLISHED, WITHIN THAT  
24 ORGANIZATIONAL GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE, THE BOARD WOULD GET AN  
25 ITEM. THEY WOULD REVIEW IT, THEY WOULD ASK QUESTIONS. USUALLY





MARCH 12, 2025

1 THE PROCESS, FROM MY EXPERIENCE WITH CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION,  
2 WAS FAST. IT WAS WITHIN 30 DAYS. THEY WOULD -- THE PROJECT  
3 STAFF WOULD IDENTIFY WHATEVER COMING DOWN THE PIPELINE, THEY  
4 WOULD PROVIDE THE INFORMATION. THEY PROVIDE THE REPORTS, THE  
5 GROUP WOULD HAVE QUESTIONS, THEN THEY WOULD HAVE A FORMAL VOTE  
6 ON IT. AND THEN IT WOULD GO TO THE BOARD FOR THE ACTUAL --  
7 CALTRAIN BOARD, TO APPROVE THE ITEM. THE RULES WOULD NOT BE  
8 WRITTEN UNTIL THEY'RE WRITTEN ON THIS AND EACH ONE IS SOMEWHAT  
9 DIFFERENT BUT THE IDEA WOULD BE TO ESTABLISH THIS WITH A  
10 MEMBERSHIP FROM THE FIVE OR SO INVESTORS OF THE PROJECT AND  
11 AGAIN ELECTRIFICATION HIGH SPEED RAIL, SFCTA, OURSELVES, AND  
12 ANY OTHERS AND THE VOTES WOULD OCCUR, BOTH PROJECT DEVELOPMENT  
13 AND DURING THE CONSTRUCTION PHASE, BASED ON THE RULES THAT ARE  
14 ESTABLISHED AS PART OF IT. THEN ULTIMATELY IT WOULD GO BACK TO  
15 THE TJPA FOR THEM TO MAKE THEIR DECISIONS.

16

17 **NATHAN MILEY:** I THINK YOU ANSWERED MY QUESTION. THE MEMBERSHIP  
18 OF THE JPA, THEY WOULD APPOINT PEOPLE TO THE CHANGE CONTROL  
19 BOARD?

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR MILEY, I THINK IT WOULD BE A GOOD TIME  
22 TO ASK THE GENERAL MANAGER TO COME UP AND SAY A FEW WORDS  
23 BECAUSE I THINK HE WOULD BE VERY SUPPORTIVE. IN GENERAL THE  
24 WAY WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO DATE WE HAVE EXECUTIVE LEVEL SEAT  
25 AT THE TABLE AND WE HAVE ALL SAPID STAFF AT THE PROJECT LEVEL



MARCH 12, 2025

1 TO BE ENGAGED IN DETAILS AND BRING INFORMATION FORWARD THAT'S  
2 LIKELY THE SET UP FOR THAT WE WILL CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD  
3 BUT I WOULD LIKE TO BRING MR. VANDER WATER TO THE PENAL CODE  
4 AMENT.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** I'M ADAM VANDER WATER I'M THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS  
7 AUTHORITY AND OBVIOUSLY HERE IN SUPPORT OF THE ITEM I WANT TO  
8 SPEAK FOR A MINUTE TO YOUR QUESTIONS ON GOVERNANCE OUR JOINT  
9 POWERS AUTHORITY ITSELF IS AN EIGHT MEMBER BOARD DIRECTOR EL-  
10 TAWANSY IS NON-VOTING MEMBER REPRESENTATIVE OF THE STATE THEN  
11 SEVEN MEMBERS FROM CITY AND COUNTY AND THREE FROM THE OPERATOR  
12 CALTRAIN, AC TRANSIT, AND HIGH SPEED RAIL SO THAT IS MY BOARD  
13 GOVERNANCE WE HAVE BEEN OPERATING FOR NEARLY FOUR YEARS AROUND  
14 A SIX PARTY MOU THAT ESTABLISHES INTEGRATED PROJECT MANAGEMENT  
15 TEAM AT THE STAFF TECHNICAL LEVEL AND EXECUTIVE WORKING GROUP  
16 AT MY LEVEL THEN WE ARE PROPOSING CREATION OF CHANGE  
17 MANAGEMENT BOARD AND SUBCOMMITTEE OF MY BOARD CALLED PORTAL  
18 SUBCOMMITTEE THAT WOULD INCLUDE MTC AS PART OF OUR DECISION-  
19 MAKING WE ARE HOPING TO MAKE THE PORTAL PROJECT A MODEL FOR  
20 THE REGION FOR DELIVERY OF THE MEGA PROJECTS THIS IS FIRST  
21 TIME WE HAVE HAD SUCH AN INTEGRATED COLLABORATIVE PROCESS FOR  
22 THIS DELIVERY IS WE HAVE OUR FUNDING PARTNERS MTC AND COUNTIES  
23 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY ENGAGED AT EVERY LEVEL AS I DESCRIBED  
24 OUR OPERATORS AND HOST JURISDICTION HERE IN THE CITY SO THERE  
25 ARE MANY LEVELS THERE IS QUESTION THAT WE STILL NEED TO



MARCH 12, 2025

1 RESOLVE, THRESHOLD AND VOTING REPRESENTATION WITHIN THAT  
2 CHANGE MANAGEMENT BOARD OBVIOUSLY WE NEED TO BALANCE TWO  
3 THINGS HERE ONE IS THE COLLECTIVE DECISION-MAKING TO MAKE  
4 SMART DECISIONS EARLY AS THE DIRECTOR MENTIONED TO MOVE THINGS  
5 FORWARD BUT ALSO TO DO IT SO WE'RE NOT SLOWING THINGS DOWN.  
6 WHEN WE'RE IN THE HEIGHT OF HEAVY CITY TUNNEL CONSTRUCTION,  
7 TUNNELLING THROUGH DOWNTOWN SOUTH OF THE MARKET SAN FRANCISCO  
8 OUR RATE IS IN THE ORDER OF \$2 MILLION PER DAY SO FOR CALTRAIN  
9 ELECTRIFICATION THEIR THRESHOLD WAS 250,000 TO GO TO CHANGE  
10 MANAGEMENT BOARD AND YOU HEARD THAT CAN TAKE 30 DAYS NOT EVERY  
11 DECISION NEEDS TO PLAY IMMEDIATELY WHICH IS WHY THAT CHANGE  
12 MANAGEMENT BOARD AND OUR GOVERNANCE PROCESS HAS A PATH THAT  
13 RUNS THROUGH STAFF TO OUR PROJECT DIRECTOR HERE BEHIND ME AT  
14 EXECUTIVE LEVEL, OUR JPA HAS A PATH TO GO STRAIGHT FOR ITEMS  
15 OF HEALTH AND SAFETY IF IT'S A RIDERSHIP BENEFIT-COST OF  
16 PROJECT WE CAN TAKE THAT TO THE CHANGE MANAGEMENT BOARD WITH  
17 GOVERNANCE AND DECIDE THAT COLLABORATIVELY SO EVERYBODY IS  
18 AWARE AND WE'RE TRANSPARENT IN THE EFFICIENT DELIVERY OF THE  
19 PROJECT LONG-TERM SO HOPEFUL THEY ANSWERS THE GOVERNANCE  
20 QUESTIONS WE ARE HAPPY TO COME BACK AT ANY POINT, THERE ARE  
21 TWO MAJOR THINGS WE ANTICIPATE IN THE NEAR-TERM OPERATING COST  
22 WE'RE WORKING COLLABORATIVELY WITHIN THAT MOU PROCESS ON THE  
23 OPERATING COSTS OF BRINGING CALTRAIN EVENTUALLY HIGH SPEED  
24 RAIL THROUGH THE PORTAL PROJECT WE EXPECT TOO HAVE THAT  
25 ANALYSIS DONE BEFORE THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR WE'RE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WORKING ON BOARDING OUR HEAVY TITLE CONTRACTOR ABOUT A YEAR  
2 FROM NOW, CURRENT 30% DESIGN COMING INTO FULL DESIGN THEY WILL  
3 COME UP WITH A REVISED COST ESTIMATE ABOUT A YEAR AND A HALF  
4 FROM NOW 2026 THAT WILL ALLOW US TO BRING THIS LARGE  
5 CONTINGENCY CARRYING RIGHT NOW DOWN A HOPEFULLY FINGERS  
6 CROSSED VALIDATE AND ADVANCE THE DESIGN, MAKES SENSE TO COME  
7 BACK TO YOU AS THE COMMISSION TO PRESENT BUT WE'LL CERTAINLY  
8 HAVE YOUR TEAM AND STAFF ENGAGED AT EVERY STEP OF THAT PROCESS  
9 HOPEFULLY THAT WILL ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS HAPPY TO TAKE OTHERS  
10 AS YOU HAVE THEM.

11

12 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL I THINK FOR ALL OF US  
13 ADDITIONALLY WHAT'S THE TIME FRAME WHEN YOU ANTICIPATE  
14 BREAKING GROUND. I THINK I HAVE SEEN BEFORE I'M JUST FOR  
15 RECOLLECTION AND MAYBE THE PUBLIC WHEN YOU ANTICIPATE WHAT'S  
16 THE DURATION OF THE PROJECT IN TERMS OF CONSTRUCTING IT AND  
17 GETTING IT OPERATIONAL?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GREAT QUESTION. EVERYBODY WANTS TO SEE THE BENEFITS  
20 OF THESE PROJECTS ARE TO THE RIDER FIRST TO CONNECT THESE  
21 SYSTEMS. WE'RE ABOUT 72% FUNDED AND WORKING TO CLOSE THE  
22 FUNDING GAP THIS ELEVATION TO TIER ONE HELPS US CLOSE THAT  
23 FUNDING GAP MAKING US MORE COMPETITIVE FOR CAP-AND-TRADE AS  
24 LEGISLATURE CONSIDERS EXTENSION AND REAUTHORIZATION. ONCE WE  
25 CLOSE THAT FUNDING GAP WE CAN SIGN WHAT'S CALLED FULL FUNDING



MARCH 12, 2025

1 GRANT AGREEMENT WITH FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION OUR  
2 CURRENT SCHEDULE ADOPTED BY MY BOARD HAS SIGNING THAT JUNE OF  
3 2027 ADMITTEDLY AGGRESSIVE TIME, WE HAVE NOT ONLY TO ALIGN  
4 SOME STATE RESOURCES BUT SOME LOCAL REGIONAL AND FEDERAL ONES  
5 WE CAN DISCUSS THE VIABILITY OF THAT RIGHT NOW COME ALL  
6 TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE ONCE WE GET FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT  
7 WE CAN START PROCUREMENT AND MOBILIZATION ABOUT FIVE YEARS OF  
8 HEAVY CIVIL CONSTRUCTION AND ONE YEAR OF TESTING AND  
9 COMMISSIONING JUST LIKE CALTRAIN COMPLETED IN SEPTEMBER OF  
10 LAST YEAR RUNNING THE TRAINS THROUGH THE SIGNALS  
11 COMMUNICATIONS GEAR AND EARLIEST WE COULD BRING PASSENGER INTO  
12 IN JUST TWO BLOCKS DOWN THE STREET HERE IS 2034.

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY. I THINK MY LAST QUESTION IT'S KIND OF BEEN  
15 ALLUDED TO SO WE KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON WITH OUR NATIONAL  
16 CAPITAL WITH THE NEW ADMINISTRATION. DO WE SEE ANY PROBLEMS  
17 WITH THEM SIGNING OFF ON THE BILLIONS OF DOLLARS THAT'S GOING  
18 TO BE NEEDED?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THE CAPITAL INVESTMENT GRANT PROCESS THAT WE ARE IN  
21 THE ENGINEERING PHASE OF IS A PRESCRIPTIVE AND LONG HELD  
22 HISTORIC PRACTICE. THE FTA HAS A VERY --

23

24 **SPEAKER:** GO AND PRACTICE. [LAUGHTER]

25



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** WE CAN'T GO AND PRACTICE. IT TAKES MANY YEARS TO GO  
2 THROUGH PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND INTO ENGINEERING AND INTO  
3 SIGNING A FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT WE'RE CONTINUING ON  
4 THAT PATH NOTHING IS SUGGESTS OTHERWISE WE HAVE GONE THROUGH  
5 MAJOR TRANSITION AT THE ADMINISTRATION LEVEL BUT REGARDLESS OF  
6 THAT THE INCUMBENCY IS ON US TO IDENTIFY THAT MATCH TODAY'S  
7 ACTION IS CRITICAL IN IDENTIFYING THAT MATCH WE CAN'T ADVANCE  
8 ANY FURTHER WITH THE FULL GOVERNMENT UNTIL WE IDENTIFIED THAT  
9 MATCH THAT WILL TAKE US AT LEAST TWO YEARS UNTIL JUNE OF 2027  
10 AND LONGER IF WE ARE NOT SUCCESSFUL AT EACH LEVEL OUR FOCUS  
11 RIGHT NOW IS HERE AT MTC, UP TO SACRAMENTO AND MAYOR'S OFFICE  
12 THEN OTHER AREAS, IDENTIFYING PIECES SO WE CAN GO TO FTA TO  
13 START NEGOTIATING WHAT'S ABOUT A SIX MONTH NEGOTIATION TO SIGN  
14 THAT.

15

16 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANKS FOR ALL THE INFORMATION I'M JUST A COUNTY  
17 SUPERVISOR, FOR 20 SOME YEARS AND HAPPEN TO SERVE ON THE CITY  
18 COUNCIL IN OAKLAND FOR TEN YEARS AND LIKE WITH THE BAY BRIDGE  
19 I MEAN WE THOUGHT IT WAS GOING TO HAPPEN SOONER, BUT WE HAD A  
20 MAYOR AT THE TIME WITH TJP, WITH HIS WITH THE ICONIC BRIDGE,  
21 AND I THINK THE PUBLIC AT TIMES THEY KIND OF GET PUZZLED WITH  
22 WHAT'S GOING ON. WHY DOES IT TAKE SO MUCH TIME, WHY CAN'T WE  
23 SEE THESE PROJECTS SOONER, WHERE THE DELAY WHY THE COST  
24 OVERRUNS. WHAT ARE THESE ELECTED OFFICIALS AND AGENCIES DOING.  
25 SO, FOR TRANSPARENCY, I JUST THINK THE MORE WE CAN DO TO KIND



MARCH 12, 2025

1 OF PUT OWL THAT OUT THERE, IT'S BENEFICIAL. BECAUSE I KNOW IF  
2 WE'RE ASKED, AS ELECTED OFFICIALS, WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO  
3 RESPOND TO SOME OF THAT -- I DON'T WANT TO CALL IT CRITICISM,  
4 BUT ANGST FROM THE PUBLIC. SO, THANK YOU.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** APPRECIATE THAT.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** BEFORE I MOVE APPROVAL HERE, I HAVE GOT PTSD. YOU  
9 SAID DESIGN. JUST, PLEASE PROMISE ME THAT AS DESIGN GOES, SO  
10 DOES CONSTRUCTION. BECAUSE THE BROADWAY GRADE SEPARATION GOT  
11 SO FAR IN DESIGN WITHOUT CONSTRUCTION, THAT WE'RE NOW 300  
12 MILLION ABOVE. SO, PROMISE ME THAT THERE WILL BE A PART OF  
13 YOUR PROCESS -- I HAVE, ADMITTEDLY, PTSD, DON'T GO SO FAR IN  
14 DESIGN BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T BRING THE CONSTRUCTION PEOPLE  
15 ALONG THE WAY WITH YOU, THE WHOLE WAY, THEN YOUR COSTS ARE  
16 GOING TO BE COMPLETELY BLOWN TO -- YEAH. I'LL MOVE APPROVAL.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOTION AND A SECOND?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I'LL SECOND.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** PAPAN AND ABE-KOGA SECOND. DO WE HAVE  
23 PUBLIC COMMENT.

24



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM  
2 AND ONLINE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HOW MANY?

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** THERE ARE NINE TOTAL.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY.

9

10 **BOARD CLERK:** TWO MINUTES?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YEAH. YEAH. IF FOLKS CAN KEEP IT UNDER  
13 TWO MINUTES, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. BUT GO AHEAD.

14

15 **BOARD CLERK:** TWO MINUTES. OKAY. ALL RIGHT. RUDY GONZALEZ, IF  
16 YOU CAN PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. MY NAME IS RUDY GONZALEZ, AND  
19 I REPRESENT THE SAN FRANCISCO BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION TRADES  
20 COUNCIL. US IN ADDITION TO OUR REGIONAL PARTNERS DELIVERED  
21 PHASE ONE. PHASE TWO IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT, NOT ONLY TO  
22 REDUCING OUR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, BUT AS MANY OF MY  
23 COLLEAGUES HAVE ITERATED IN THEIR WRITTEN COMMENTS TO YOU, THE  
24 JOB GROWTH POTENTIAL, THE ECONOMIC RECOVERY POTENTIAL, THE  
25 INTERMODALITY POTENTIAL, THE IDEA OF CONNECTING OUR REGION IN





MARCH 12, 2025

1 A COMPREHENSIVE WAY, IS JUST TOO EXCITING TO PASS UP. I THINK  
2 DIRECTOR VANDER WATER EXPLAINED IT BETTER THAT I KNOW COULD,  
3 WHICH IS TO SAY THAT WE'RE IN A CRITICAL STAGE IN TERMS OF  
4 ADVANCING THROUGH THE PROCESS TO SECURE THE FULL FUNDING GRANT  
5 AGREEMENT WITH THE FTA. AND ADVANCING US FROM MAP TWO TO MAP  
6 ONE TODAY REALLY WILL PUT US IN THE MOST COMPETITIVE POSITION.  
7 AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO ADVOCATE FOR THE EXCEPTION AND  
8 APPROVAL WITH THE LEGISLATURE HERE IN CALIFORNIA AROUND THE  
9 CAP-AND-TRADE, WHICH IS EQUALLY IMPORTANT. SO REALLY  
10 APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMENTS THAT WERE MADE. I WILL SAY THAT  
11 WHEN YOU RUSH THINGS, IN MY LINE OF WORK, PEOPLE HUGHES LIFE  
12 AND LIMB, AND WE HAVE SEEN THAT ON MEGA PROJECTS IN THE PAST  
13 I'M DEEPLY COMMITTED TO MAKING SURE THAT DESIGN AND  
14 CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT IS SAFE, EFFICIENT, AND PRODUCTIVE, WE  
15 HAVE SEEN THAT IN PHASE ONE OF THE PORTAL AND WE HAVE DEEP  
16 STAFF LEADERSHIP AND COMMITMENT TO MAKING SURE THAT'S  
17 REALIZED. THANK YOU FOR ALL OF YOUR WORK ESPECIALLY  
18 APPRECIATE, AND BELATED BIRTHDAY TO ONE OF OUR COUNTY  
19 SUPERVISORS MELGAR ALL OF HER COMMENTS, I THINK WERE SPOT ON.  
20 AND WE APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT TODAY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. PARDON MY OVERSTEP, VICE CHAIR, BUT TO  
23 FOLLOW PROPER PROCEDURE, WE'LL GO AHEAD AND CALL THOSE WHO ARE  
24 ACTUALLY IN THE BOARDROOM AT THE MOMENT. FIRST STARTING OFF



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WITH CHARLIE LAVERY, OPERATING ENGINEERS THREE AND POLICY  
2 ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR MTC.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, THANK YOU FOR  
5 INTRODUCTION WITH THE OPERATING ENGINEERS UNION WE REPRESENT  
6 TENS OF THOUSANDS OF CONSTRUCTION WORKERS IN NORTHERN  
7 CALIFORNIA AND ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. TRANSPORTATION  
8 INFRASTRUCTURE BUILDS EQUITY. PHASE ONE OF TRANSBAY HAS  
9 GENERATED THOUSANDS OF LIVING WAGE JOBS FOR THE REGION'S  
10 WORKFORCE AND POURED MILLIONS BACK INTO THE REGIONAL ECONOMY.  
11 PHASE TWO, IF THE PORTAL WILL HAVE A SIMILAR IMPACT ON JOBS,  
12 AND WILL TRANSFORM REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION, BRINGING  
13 COMMUNITIES CLOSER TOGETHER AND REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS  
14 EMISSIONS. MOVING THE PORTAL TO MAP LEVEL ONE AT THIS TIME  
15 WILL ALLOW IT TO COMPETE FOR CRITICAL MASS FUNDS AND UNLOCK  
16 THE 3.38 BILLION FROM THE FTA. I STRONGLY RECOMMEND THE MTC  
17 APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND ELEVATE THE PORTAL. SF'S  
18 MOST IMPORTANT CAPITAL PROJECT TO LEVEL ONE MAP. THANKS.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE JOSHUA ARCE, NORTHERN  
21 CALIFORNIA'S LABORERS ALLIANCE FOR JOBS.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR MILEY, COMMISSIONERS. JOSH WITH  
24 NORCAL LABORERS UNION ALSO HERE ON OUR BEHALF LABOR AND  
25 INDUSTRY COALITION IN CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS THAT



MARCH 12, 2025

1 REPRESENTS MORE THAN 100,000 CONSTRUCTION UNION MEMBERS FROM  
2 CENTRAL VALLEY TO THE OREGON BORDER AND 2000 OF OUR  
3 CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY EMPLOYERS WE'RE HERE IN STRONG SUPPORT  
4 OF STAFF RECOMMENDATION AND WANT TO THANK THE STAFF FOR  
5 WORKING WITH THE HARD WORK AND TEAM AT TJPA TO COME UP WITH  
6 THIS FRAMEWORK AND RECOMMENDATIONS JUST WANT TO SPEAK TO  
7 WHAT'S ALREADY BEEN SAID, THE FACT THAT IF THE QUESTION IS  
8 ABOUT READINESS, I THINK IN THE PRESENTATION THE QUESTION IS,  
9 IS IT READY. ABSOLUTELY READY. THERE IS 70% FUNDING THERE IS  
10 MOMENTUM DESPITE SOME CHALLENGES THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED WE  
11 HAVE ALL THE RIGHT MOMENTUM GOING FORWARD ESPECIALLY WITH THE  
12 MAP ONE DESIGNATION. SO WE WOULD LOVE TO HAVE YOUR SUPPORT  
13 GOING FORWARD. AND JUST TO PUT IN AN ASIDE, WHEN THE TIME  
14 COMES BACK TO SUPPORT GRADE SEPARATIONS, COUNT US IN TO COME  
15 BACK ON THAT TOO. THANK YOU.

16

17 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TJPA,  
18 ADAM VANDER WATER FOR ROUND TWO.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'LL BE BRIEF I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT TO THANK STAFF  
21 ON ALL SIDES ON OUR SIDE AND MTC AND CONSULTANTS FOR GETTING  
22 US HERE TODAY THERE IS NO SHORTAGE OF WORK THAT UNDERLIES THE  
23 PRESENTATION AND THAT WAS PRESENTED TODAY AND IT'S BEEN A  
24 COLLABORATIVE PROCESS ALSO IN YOUR PACKET, LETTERS FROM MAYOR  
25 LORI, SENATOR WIENER AND STEPHANIE AND HANEY IN SOME OF THE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 UNION PARTNERS THAT HELPED US DELIVER PHASE ONE. PERSONALLY  
2 WOULD LIKE TO INVITE TO YOU COME TO TOUR THE CENTER, JUST TWO  
3 BLOCKS AWAY AND HOPEFULLY YOU HAVE RIDDEN THE BUS THROUGH THE  
4 BUS DECK I SOME OF YOU HAVE TOURED THE TRAIN BOX BENEATH THE  
5 BUILDING THIS IS AN INCREDIBLE INVESTMENT NEARLY BILLION  
6 DOLLAR TOTAL VALUE INVESTMENT TO CREATE THAT TRAIN BOX THAT  
7 ALLOWS US TO BE HERE WITH YOU TODAY WOULD LOVE TO SHOW YOU  
8 WHAT THE PORTAL FOR BRINGING ELECTRIFIED RAIL INTO THE HEART  
9 OF DOWNTOWN AND EVEN CONTINUE AS PART OF A SECOND TRANSBAY  
10 CROSSING THROUGH LINK 21 SO CONSIDER THAT AN OPEN INVITATION.  
11 WILL FOLLOW UP WITH YOUR STAFF TO REALIZE THAT. THANK YOU,  
12 AGAIN.

13

14 **BOARD CLERK:** NEXT WE HAVE SEBASTIAN PETTY. IF YOU CAN UNMUTE  
15 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES, BEGINS NOW.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR MILEY AND COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS  
18 SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR. SPUR HAS BEEN A LONG TIME SUPPORTER  
19 OF THE PORTAL EXTENSION OF RAIL TO THE SALESFORCE TRANSIT  
20 CENTER AND WE SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATION TO ELEVATE THIS  
21 PROJECT TO LEVEL ONE OF THE MAP. THIS IS A CRITICAL PROJECT  
22 FOR THE REGION, STATE, AND SAN FRANCISCO AND WE'RE EXCITED TO  
23 SEE IT ADVANCE. WE'RE ALSO CEMETERY THE ACCOMPANYING  
24 RECOMMENDATIONS, PARTICULARLY THE IMPORTANCE OF ADDRESSING  
25 FUTURE OPERATING COSTS OF THE EXTENSION. WE REMAIN VERY



MARCH 12, 2025

1 CONCERNED ABOUT THE FINANCIAL STATE OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN  
2 THE REGION, AND ITS CRITICAL WE HAVE A PLAN FOR HOW WE PAY FOR  
3 THE MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS OF OUR TRANSIT EXPANSIONS.  
4 FINALLY WE ALSO SUPPORT THE NOTION THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL AROUND  
5 THE STATE SHOULD BE A SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL PARTICIPANT IN THE  
6 PORTAL AS IT ADVANCES THIS APPROACH BUILDS ON A MODEL THAT WAS  
7 SUCCESSFUL FOR CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION AND WE BELIEVE IT  
8 SHOULD BE CONTINUED FOR THE PORTAL AND ELSEWHERE ON THE  
9 CORRIDOR WHERE PROJECTS ARE BEING DESIGNED AND BUILT FOR THE  
10 FUTURE USE AND BENEFIT OF HIGH SPEED RAIL. THANK YOU.

11

12 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE MICHAEL BALDINI. IF YOU  
13 CAN PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

14

15 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU, CHAIR MILEY. THE  
16 QUESTIONS THAT COME TO MY MIND ARE, AS A SIDES, AND AS A  
17 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEMBER, IS THE \$8 BILLION. AND IF YOU  
18 TOOK A \$50 MUNI RIDE OR CAB FARE, THAT'S 160 MILLION PEOPLE ON  
19 CONSERVE FROM 4TH STREET STATION. THOSE ARE THE DETAILS I  
20 WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND, PARTICULARLY ON THE CONSTRUCTION. I  
21 THINK A WELL TRAINED ENGINEERING CONSTRUCTION GROUP WOULD BE  
22 ABLE TO EXPLAIN HOW THAT DIRT IS GOING TO BE EXPORTED. WHERE  
23 IS IT GOING? THE IMPORTATION OF CONSTRUCTION MATERIAL, HOW  
24 THAT AFFECTS GREENHOUSE GAS, AND SO ON AND SO FORTH. SO, AS  
25 FAR AS OPERATIONS, WHAT, SORT OF, CONVERSATIONS HAVE BEEN



MARCH 12, 2025

1 GOING ON BETWEEN CALTRANS AND HIGH SPEED RAIL ABOUT LANDING  
2 SLOTS IF YOU WILL, HOW IS THAT GOING TO BE ACCOMMODATED. I  
3 HAVE WORKED IN ENGINEERING, RAILROAD CONSTRUCTION, ACTUALLY,  
4 AND THIS WILL PROBABLY BE ONE OF THE LONGEST TUNNELS IN THE  
5 HSR SYSTEM, AS WELL AS CALTRAIN. AND HOW IS THAT MAINTENANCE  
6 GOING FORWARD GOING TO OCCUR. AND, 290 DEGREE CURVES IF A VERY  
7 SHORT PERIOD OF TIME, HOW IS THAT, SPEEDS AND SO ON AND SO  
8 FORTH OPERATING CAPABILITIES. AS FAR AS THE BENEFIT TO THE  
9 RIDER, I SEE ABILITY TO TRANSFER AT MILLBRAE, AS HAD AS SAN  
10 JOSE TO BART, AND SO ON AND SO FORTH, SO THAT LAST MILE  
11 BECOMES VERY IMPORTANT, THAT CONNECTIVITY THAT WE ALSO TALK  
12 ABOUT AND I SUPPORT IT MOVING ON, BUT LET'S ANSWER THESE  
13 QUESTIONS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

14

15 **BOARD CLERK:** NEXT WE HAVE KEN BUKOWSKI. IF YOU CAN PLEASE  
16 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HELLO CAN YOU HEAR ME.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE BEEN AROUND FOR A WHILE, RIDING THE TRAIN TO  
23 DOWNTOWN IN MY LIFETIME, AND I'M 73 NOW AND I WAS ACTIVELY  
24 INVOLVED IN OPPOSING THE BAY BRIDGE I STILL SAY YOU DIDN'T  
25 HAVE TO BE REPLACED. JUST RECENTLY I HEARD THE PRESIDENT SAY



MARCH 12, 2025

1 THAT THEY WERE GOING TO INVESTIGATE THE HIGH SPEED RAIL  
2 PROJECT HE SAID THEY THOUGHT IT WAS A BOONDOGGLE AND IT WAS  
3 WAY OVER COST AND THAT THEY WERE GOING TO INVESTIGATE IT. SO I  
4 DON'T KNOW IF THAT HAS AN IMPACT ON THIS PROJECT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **BOARD CLERK:** NEXT WE HAVE ROLAND IF YOU CAN PLEASE UNMUTE  
7 YOURSELF YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ROLAND LEBRUN SAN JOSE. I  
10 WANT TO EXPRESS VERY STRONG SUPPORT TO MOVE THIS PRESENTLY TO  
11 MAP LEVEL ONE. THIS IS LONG OVERDUE BUT WE NEED TO ADD AN  
12 ADDITIONAL SET OF CONDITIONS WHICH HAVE NOTHING TO DO WITH  
13 FUNDING AND EVERYTHING TO DO WITH THE ENGINEERING. THIS 30-  
14 YEAR-OLD ALIGNMENT WITH THE TWO CURVES WILL NEVER EVER BE ABLE  
15 TO ACCOMMODATE FULL HIGH SPEED TRAIN. BECAUSE IT -- T-BONES  
16 THE TRANSIT CENTER AT 90 DEGREES WHEN IT DOES THAT, THAT  
17 ELIMINATE APPROXIMATELY 700 FEET OF THE EXISTING 1500 FEET OF  
18 PLATFORM WHICH HAS BEEN -- IT REQUIRES, AND COST \$8.8 BILLION.  
19 RIGHT NOW, FOR ONE AND A HALF MILE TUNNEL, RIGHT NOW, IT'S THE  
20 MOST EXPENSIVE TUNNEL IN THE ENTIRE WORLD. AND QUITE FRANKLY,  
21 IT MAKES BART -- THIS ONE AND A HALF MILE STATION -- THIS  
22 PROJECT MAKES BART TO SAN JOSE, WHICH IS FIVE MILE, AND FOUR  
23 STATION, FOR \$14.4 BILLION, LOOK LIKE AN ABSOLUTE BARGAIN. SO,  
24 MOVING FORWARD, I REALLY WOULD LIKE MTC TO BE ENGAGED IN THE  
25 ENGINEERING AND LOOKING AT THE LATEST BEST TUNNEL PRACTICES



MARCH 12, 2025

1 THAT ARE GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET US INTO THIS TRANSIT CENTER,  
2 PROBABLY 4 TO 5 YEARS AHEAD OF SCHEDULE FOR A FRACTION OF THE  
3 CURRENT COST ESTIMATE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** NEXT WE HAVE DYLAN, SF TRANSIT RIDERS, IF YOU CAN  
6 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS DYLAN, I WORK  
9 WITH SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS WHICH IS A NON-PROFIT  
10 ADVOCATING FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. LONG TIME  
11 SUPPORTERS OF THE PORT ALLY WOULD LIKE TO URGE TO YOU PROVE  
12 THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO ELEVATE THE PORTAL TO MAP LEVEL  
13 ONE, TRANSFORMATIONAL INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT THAT'S BEEN IN  
14 THE WORKS FOR DECADES ALREADY OVER 70% FUNDED THANKS TO A 3.38  
15 BILLION FEDERAL COMMITMENT BUT ADDRESSING THE TJPA'S 2.5  
16 BILLION FUNDING GAP UNLOCKING MASK FUNDS IS CRITICAL TO MOVING  
17 IT FORWARD THE PORTAL LEVEL ONE WILL ALLOW THE TJPA TO COMPETE  
18 FOR KEY STATE FUNDING SOURCES LIKE THE CAP-AND-TRADE PROGRAM  
19 WILL FINALIZE A FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT WITH THE FEDERAL  
20 TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION UNLOCKING FEDERAL FUNDS THIS PROJECT  
21 WILL DELIVER HUGE BENEFITS TO THE STATE, REDUCE CLIMATE IMPACT  
22 CUTTING VEHICLES MILES TRAVELED CUT EMISSIONS CREATE JOBS,  
23 ADDITIONAL ECONOMIC GROWTH ONCE COMPLETED, THE PORTAL WILL  
24 SERVE 90,000 DAILY RIDERS INCREASING EQUITABLE ACCESS TO JOBS  
25 AND HOUSING, THIS IS A SUSTAINABLE AND CONNECTED





MARCH 12, 2025

1 TRANSPORTATION FUTURE PLEASE SUPPORT THE NEXT STEP AND APPROVE  
2 THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO ELEVATE THE PORTAL TO LEVEL ONE.  
3 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

4

5 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP WE HAVE RUHAMA.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS RUHAMA ON  
8 BEHALF OF THE NORCAL CARPENTER'S UNION REPRESENTING 37,000  
9 CARPENTERS ADVOCATING TODAY FOR THE PORTAL TO MOVE TO MAP  
10 LEVEL ONE STATUTES. EARLIER WORK ON PHASE ONE OF THE PORTAL  
11 PROVIDED WORK FOR NEARLY 8,000 OF OUR MEMBERS WHO LOGGED OVER  
12 5.7 MILLION HOURS THIS REPRESENTS FAIR PAY AND ACCESS TO  
13 HEALTH CARE FOR THOUSANDS OF WORKERS OUR MEMBERS ARE EXCITED  
14 TO EXPAND THE WORK ON THE PORTAL THE STATUTES ELEVATION IS AN  
15 IMPORTANT STEP TOWARD TJPA CLOSING ITS FUNDING GAP AND  
16 UNLOCKING FEDERAL COMMITMENTS TO ADVANCE THE PROJECT WE  
17 STRONGLY RECOMMEND THAT MTC APPROVES THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.  
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE ADINA LEVIN. ADINA, IF  
21 YOU CAN PLEASE UNMUTE.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** ONE SECOND AND ONE MINUTE. I'LL BE BACK WITH YOU.  
24 HELLO. ADINA H, CAN YOU HEAR ME?

25



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **BOARD CLERK:** YES WE CAN.

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WANTED TO THANK

4 MTC AND THE TJPA AND ALL CONCERNED FOR WORKING ON A GETTING

5 THIS PROJECT READY TO MOVE FORWARD INTO TIER ONE FOR MTC WITH

6 SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND FRIEND OF DTX WANT TO SUPPORT THIS

7 PROGRAM BEING INCLUDED. THIS PROJECT WILL HAVE A LOT OF

8 INDEPENDENT VALUE FOR THE CORRIDOR IT SERVES, AND THE REGION,

9 ON THE, YOU KNOW, LONGER PATH TOWARD A STATEWIDE NETWORK.

10 IT'S, YOU KNOW, BENEFICIAL TO SAN FRANCISCO, BENEFICIAL TO THE

11 CORRIDOR, EVENTUALLY BENEFICIAL TO THE STATE. AND, ALSO WANTED

12 TO SUPPORT SOME OF THE PREVIOUS COMMENTS AS THIS IS MOVING

13 FORWARD FOR THE MTC TO ALSO LOOK AT OPPORTUNITIES TO FUND THE

14 GRADE SEPARATION ALONG THE CORRIDOR THAT ARE GOING TO BE

15 IMPORTANT TO BE AUDIBLE TO SERVE THAT HIGHER LEVEL OF

16 PASSENGER USE OVER TIME. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I DO

17 REASONABLE YOU TO APPROVE MOVING THIS UP IN THE QUEUE. THANK

18 YOU.

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** THANK YOU. AND AT THIS TIME I WILL GO AHEAD AND

21 ANNOUNCE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FOR THE ITEM.

22 STARTING WITH THE OFFICE OF SENATOR WEINER, ASSEMBLYMEMBER

23 HANEY, AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER STEPHANIE; THE OFFICE OF SAN

24 FRANCISCO MAYOR DANIEL LURIE; PAINTERS AND DRYWALL FINISHERS

25 LOCAL UNION 913; INTERNATIONAL BROTHERHOOD OF ELECTRICAL



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WORKERS LOCAL SIX, UNITED ASSOCIATION OF JOIN MEN, PRINCESSES  
2 OF THE PLUMBING AND PIPE FITTING INDUSTRY LOCAL 38  
3 ARCHITECTURAL METAL LOCAL 718 SAN FRANCISCO CARPET LINOLEUM  
4 TILE WORKERS UNION AND DOWNTOWN RAIL EXTENSION CHRIS AND  
5 CEMENT MASONS LOCAL UNION 300.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR ALL  
8 COMMENTS. COMMENTS FROM STAFF BEFORE WE VOTE?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** NO SIR.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY THERE IS A MOTION THAT WE APPROVE  
13 REFERRAL MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4537 REVISED MAJOR PROJECTS  
14 ADVANCEMENT POLICY STAGE-GATE EVALUATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS  
15 FOR THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY, THE PORTAL PROJECT TO  
16 THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. MOVED BY PAPAN, SECOND BY ABE-  
17 KOGA. SO, WOULD THE CLERK CALL THE ROLL?

18

19 **BOARD CLERK:** I BELIEVE WE CAN APPROVE THIS BY VOICE VOTE.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** SURE. ALL IN FAVOR? OPPOSED?  
22 ABSTENTIONS? IT'S JUST THE THREE OF US. RIGHT? YOU HAVE GOT TO  
23 GET US SOME MORE PEOPLE ON THE COMMITTEE. [LAUGHTER]

24

25 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** NO. JUST THE THREE, PLEASE. [LAUGHTER]



MARCH 12, 2025

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THAT'S GREAT. THANK YOU. OKAY.

3

4 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** JUST FOR THE RECORD, MOTION PASSES  
5 UNANIMOUSLY WITH ALL THOSE PRESENT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES. THANK YOU. I THINK WE'RE READY TO  
8 GO TO ITEM 4A INFORMATION OBAG OVERVIEW KEY CONSIDERATIONS  
9 OBAG PROGRAM INCLUDING CONSIDERATIONS DEVELOPMENT SCHEDULE FOR  
10 THE NEXT GRANT CYCLE OBAG FOUR. THOMAS WILL PRESENT THIS  
11 INFORMATION ITEM.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THOMAS AROUND, FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM  
14 SECTION THIS ITEM PROVIDES INFORMATION ON MTC'S BAY AREA GRANT  
15 OR OBAG PROGRAM INCLUDING OVERVIEW OF THE CURRENT GRANT CYCLE  
16 OR OBAG THREE AND KEY CONSIDERATIONS IN OUR SCHEDULE FOR  
17 DEVELOPING THE UPCOMING CYCLE OBAG FOUR. NEXT SLIDE. THE OBAG  
18 PROGRAM IS OUR PROCESS FOR AWARDING FEDERAL HIGHWAY FUND  
19 PORTION TO MTC SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM OR  
20 STP AND CONGESTION MITIGATION AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM  
21 OR CMAQ WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE MIDDLE OF THE OBAG THREE CYCLE  
22 WHICH SPANS FOUR YEARS AND PROVIDES APPROXIMATELY \$2 MILLION  
23 ANNUALLY THIS IS A RELATIVELY SMALL SHARE OF OUR TOTAL  
24 TRANSPORTATION REVENUES AVAILABLE TO THE REGION AS SHOWN IN  
25 THE CHART ON YOUR SLIDE FEDERAL FUNDING CONSTITUTES ONLY ABOUT



MARCH 12, 2025

1 10% OF EXPECTED REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUES OVER THE NEXT  
2 25 YEARS OBAG IS A SMALL SUBSET COMING IN ABOUT 1% OF REGIONAL  
3 FUNDS HOWEVER OBAG IS ONE OF MTC'S FLEXIBLE REGIONAL  
4 DISCRETIONARY FUNDING SOURCES WE HAVE SUCCESSFULLY LEVERAGED  
5 THIS RELATIVELY SMALL POOL OF DOLLARS TO ADVANCE A VARIETY OF  
6 REGIONAL OBJECTIVES. KEY PURPOSE OF THE OBAG PROGRAM IS TO  
7 ADVANCE PLANNED BAY AREA WITH EMPHASIS ON INTERCONNECTED  
8 TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE GOALS. FUNDING FOR THE CURRENT  
9 CYCLE IS SPLIT EVENLY INTO TWO CATEGORIES THE COUNTY PROGRAM  
10 AND THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. THE COUNTY PROGRAM IS ADMINISTERED  
11 BY MTC AND PARTNERSHIP WITH EACH OF THE NINE COUNTY  
12 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES OR CTAS IT FUND A VARIETY OF LOCAL  
13 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS THROUGHOUT THE REGION WITH FOCUS  
14 ON AREAS DESIGNATED FOR FUTURE GROWTH, INCLUDING MTC'S  
15 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. THE REGIONAL PROGRAM PROVIDES  
16 FUNDING FOR MTC'S PROJECTS IN OUR PROGRAMS MANY OF WHICH HAVE  
17 TARGETED GRANT OPPORTUNITY FOR LOCAL AGENCY PARTNERS OPPONENTS  
18 OF THE REGIONAL PROGRAM ADDRESS SPECIFIC GOAL AREAS INCLUDING  
19 SUSTAINABLE LAND GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS EQUITY AND ACCESS  
20 IMPROVEMENTS NEXT SLIDE. I'LL PROVIDE A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF EACH  
21 OF THE PROGRAM COMPONENTS STARTING WITH THE COUNTY SIDE,  
22 PROGRAM EXPANDED INVESTMENTS IN ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION WITH  
23 OVER HALF OF THE FUNDING GOING TOWARD BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN  
24 PROJECTS 20% OF PROJECTS WERE LOCATED IN OR AROUND PRIORITY  
25 DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND OVER HALF FUNDS WERE INVESTED IN EQUITY



MARCH 12, 2025

1 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OBAG THREE REGIONAL  
2 PROGRAM WAS DIVIDED BOO FIVE CATEGORIES SHOWN ON THE TABLE.  
3 THESE THE CONTINUED LONG-STANDING FEATURES OF PRIOR REGIONAL  
4 PROGRAMS INCLUDING PLANNING GRANTS FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO  
5 ADVANCE INTEGRATED TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE. THE REGIONAL  
6 PROGRAM EXPAND INVESTMENTS IN KEY AREAS INCLUDING SUPPORT OF  
7 OUR SAFETY, EQUITY, AND CLIMATE GOALS. AND NOTABLY, THE OBAG  
8 THREE REGIONAL PROGRAM ALSO SUPPORTS IMPLEMENTATION OF MANY  
9 KEY STRATEGIES FROM MTC'S TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.  
10 WE HAVE EXPANDED INVESTMENTS WHERE POSSIBLE IN PART BECAUSE OF  
11 THE ADDITIONAL ONE TIME FUNDING SOURCES THAT SUPPLEMENT THE  
12 OBAG THREE FRAMEWORK. THESE INCLUDE THE STATE REGIONAL EARLY  
13 ACTION PLANNING OR REAP GRANTS AND THE FEDERAL CARBON  
14 REDUCTION PROGRAM OR CRP. AND, TOGETHER, THE REAP AND CRP  
15 PROVIDED ALMOST \$160 MILLION IN ADDITIONAL FUNDING WHICH ARE  
16 PRIMARILY DIRECTED TOWARDS LOCAL AGENCY PROJECTS. THESE  
17 SOURCES SUPPLEMENTED AND AUGMENTED EACH OF THE OBAG THREE  
18 REGIONAL PROGRAM CATEGORIES AS SHOWN IN THE TABLE. NEXT SLIDE  
19 PLEASE. SO THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES SOME HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE  
20 OBAG THEE REGIONAL PROGRAM AND THE WIDE VARIETY OF PROJECTS  
21 THAT IT SUPPORTS. THE TOP ROW OF IMAGES REPRESENTS THE CLIMATE  
22 INITIATIVES, WHICH OFFER GRANTS FOR PARKING MANAGEMENT.  
23 MOBILITY HUBS, AND TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION, INCLUDING  
24 PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS. THE  
25 SECOND ROW REPRESENTS OBAG THREE REGIONAL PROGRAMS THAT RELATE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA GROWTH FRAMEWORK INCLUDING PLANNING  
2 GRANTS FOR PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AND PRODUCTION AREAS AND ALSO  
3 THE FUNDING FOR ACQUISITION & IMPROVEMENT OF REGIONAL TRAILS  
4 AND OPEN SPACE THROUGH THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION PROGRAM OR  
5 PCA PROGRAM. AND FINALLY THE BOTTOM ROW REPRESENTS SOME OBAG  
6 THREE INVESTMENTS IN MULTI-MODAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT  
7 INCLUDING OUR TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY GRANTS, MTC'S REGIONAL  
8 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING STANDARDS AND PILOTS AND EXPANSION  
9 ELECTRIFICATION OF OUR REGIONAL BIKESHARE SYSTEM. THESE ARE  
10 HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE REGIONAL PROGRAM, A FULL LIST OF  
11 INVESTMENTS IS INCLUDED IN MTC RESOLUTION 4505, WHICH WAS PART  
12 OF ITEM 2C ON CONSENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, LOOKING FORWARD  
13 TO OBAG FOUR, WE HAVE TWO INITIAL KEY CONSIDERATIONS TO SHARE  
14 WITH YOU. THE FIRST CONCERN IS AVAILABLE CAPACITY DURING THE  
15 OBAG FOUR PERIOD, WHICH WE EXPECT TO BE LOWER OVERALL THAN  
16 OBAG THREE. THERE IS SOME UNCERTAINTY AROUND THE AMOUNT OF  
17 FEDERAL HIGHWAY FORMULA APPORTIONMENT AVAILABLE TO MTC FOR  
18 OBAG FOUR AND THE EXTENT AMOUNT WILL DEPEND ON CONGRESS  
19 EXTENDING OR REAUTHORIZING THE FEDERAL SURFACE TRANSPORTATION  
20 PROGRAM. FOR NOW WE ARE ESTIMATING THAT FORMULA PORTION MEANT  
21 TO MTC WILL CONTINUE AT EXISTING LEVELS FOR THE OBAG FOUR  
22 PERIOD WHICH IS A RELATIVELY CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTION. LARGER  
23 IMPACTS TO FUNDING COME FROM TWO FACTORS FIRST IS THE  
24 COMMISSION PRECOMMITTED 100 MILLION IN OBAG FOR CAPACITY TO  
25 TRANSIT OPERATIONS AS PART OF THE REGION'S CONTRIBUTION TO THE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 NEAR-TERM TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF THROUGH THE SB125 FRAMEWORK  
2 SECOND IS LOSS OF COMPLEMENTARY FUNDING FROM THE REAP AND CRP  
3 PROGRAMS WHICH ARE NOT ASSUMED TO CONTINUE IN THE OBAG FOUR  
4 PERIOD TAKEN TOGETHER FACTORS MEAN THAT FUNDING AVAILABLE FOR  
5 OBAG FOUR IS OVER 200 MILLION LESS THAN WHAT WAS AVAILABLE  
6 DURING THE THREE PERIOD AS YOU CAN SEE IN THE CHART OVER 900  
7 MILLION IN OBAG THREE AND COMPLEMENTARY SOURCES WERE AVAILABLE  
8 IN THE CURRENT CYCLE ESTIMATING ONLY ABOUT 700 MILLION WILL BE  
9 AVAILABLE FOR OBAG FOUR ACCOUNTING FOR SB125 CONTRIBUTION. KEY  
10 CONSIDERATIONS FOR OBAG FOUR WE ARE SHARING IS MISSION OF THE  
11 MTC TRANSIT ORIENTED POLICIES OR TOC POLICY AS A BRIEF RECAP  
12 THIS POLICY INCENTIVIZES JURISDICTIONS TO PLAN FOR SUSTAINABLE  
13 LAND USE, HOUSING AFFORDABILITY MULTI-MODAL ACCESS AROUND FIX  
14 GUIDEWAY TRANSIT STOPS AND STATIONS THE POLICY WAS ADOPTED IN  
15 2022 BUT IT'S SPECIFICALLY COMMITTED TO APPLYING TO THE TOC  
16 COMPLIANCE IN OBAG FOUR CYCLE POTENTIAL FEATURES THAT STAFF  
17 ARE CONSIDERING FOR TOC POLICY IMPLEMENTATION IN OBAG FOUR  
18 INCLUDE COMPLIANCE TIERS BY JURISDICTION WITH MORE FUNDING  
19 AVAILABLE FOR JURISDICTIONS WITH HIGHER COMPLIANCE WOULD  
20 INCLUDE A SET ASIDE AVAILABLE ONLY TO JURISDICTIONS IN THE TOP  
21 COMPLIANCE TIER AS AN ADDITIONAL INCENTIVE STAFF ARE CURRENTLY  
22 WORKING WITH JURISDICTIONS TO DEVELOP CRITERIA FOR THESE TIERS  
23 AND ALSO ASSIST IN ATTAINING COMPLIANCE. PICTURE ON YOUR SLIDE  
24 IS SAY SNAPSHOT OF THE TORQUE AREA MAP AND THERE ARE MORE  
25 DETAILS IN THE LINK ON THE SLIDE AND IN YOUR STAFF REPORT.





MARCH 12, 2025

1 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL END WITH OUR CURRENT HIGH-LEVEL OBAG  
2 FOUR DEVELOPMENT SCHEDULE AGAIN WE'RE IN EARLY STAGES OF  
3 PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT THIS ITEM IS INTENDED TO INTRODUCE KEY  
4 CONSIDERATIONS AND KEY FACTORS. WE INITIATED OUTREACH WITH  
5 PARTNER AGENCIES THIS PAST FALL AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO WORK  
6 WITH CTAS AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS TO DEVELOP PRIORITIES AND  
7 EVALUATE ALTERNATIVES OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS WE PLAN TO  
8 RETURN TO THIS COMMITTEE IN THE FALL WITH A DRAFT OBAG FOUR  
9 FRAMEWORK FOR YOUR REVIEW AND WE'RE TARGETING TO BRING  
10 RECOMMENDED PROGRAM TO THE COMMISSION FOR EARLY ADOPTION IN  
11 2026. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM ONLY AND WE WELCOME ANY  
12 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY COMMISSIONERS? ABE-KOGA.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OH, THANK YOU CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THE  
17 PRESENTATION. I GUESS MY CONCERNS OR QUESTIONS HAVE MORE TO DO  
18 WITH THE TOC. IN LIGHT OF THE ECONOMY, FRANK HE, LIKE, WE'RE  
19 SEEING A LOT OF COMMERCIAL OFFICE SPACE THAT'S EMPTY NOW. AND  
20 IN THE DOWNTOWNS AND SO FORTH. AND THIS WAS MY CONCERN WHEN WE  
21 DID THE TOC THAT WE HAVE MINIMUM DENSITY RETIRES FOR BOTH  
22 COMMERCIAL AND -- FOR COMMERCIAL. SO I WAS JUST WONDERING IN  
23 LIGHT OF THE CHANGES OF THE ENVIRONMENT, ARE WE MORE FLEXIBLE  
24 WITH THOSE REQUIREMENTS IN THE TOC?

25



MARCH 12, 2025

1 **MATT MALONEY:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, MATT MALONEY  
2 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR METRO PLANNING AND POLICY WE ARE  
3 WORKING CLOSELY WITH ALL OF THE JURISDICTIONS ACROSS THE  
4 REGION THAT MIGHT BE AFFECTED BY THE TOC POLICY. AND IT DOES  
5 APPLY TO ZONING FOR RESIDENTIAL AS WELL AS COMMERCIAL OFFICE.  
6 NOT ALL COMMERCIAL. BUT THAT BEING SAID, YOU KNOW, THE ISSUE  
7 THAT YOU BRING UP ABOUT COMMERCIAL OFFICE IS OBVIOUSLY A BIG  
8 DEAL REGION-WIDE. IT IS ONE OF MANY ISSUES THAT WE'RE  
9 MONITORING THROUGH THE TOC POLICY. AS YOU KNOW, THERE ARE  
10 PARKING REQUIREMENTS, RESIDENTIAL REQUIREMENTS. AND, SORT OF,  
11 EVERY JURISDICTION HAS, SORT OF, A DIFFERENT STORY IN TERMS OF  
12 ALL THESE THINGS. I GUESS -- WE ARE VERY MINDFUL OF THAT, AND  
13 I THINK WHAT THOMAS DESCRIBED TODAY, WE ARE LOOKING  
14 POTENTIALLY AT A TIERING TYPE OF SYSTEM. IF YOU RECALL, ABOUT  
15 A YEAR AGO, WHEN THE LAST TIME THE COMMITTEES TALKED ABOUT  
16 THIS ON THE MTC SIDE, THERE WAS THIS DISCUSSION OF, YOU KNOW,  
17 100% COMPLIANCE VERSUS A LOWER LEVEL OF COMPLIANCE. I THINK WE  
18 STILL NEED TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION ON COMMITTEES. AND WE  
19 PLAN, IN THE MAY OR JUNE TIME FRAME, TO COME BACK TO EITHER  
20 THIS COMMITTEE OR THE FRIDAY COMMITTEES TO KIND OF DISCUSS  
21 WHERE WE ARE ON TOC MORE WRIT LARGE BASED ON CONVERSATIONS AND  
22 INFORMATION WE'RE GETTING FROM THE JURISDICTIONS.  
23  
24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT. I HAVE ALSO LEARNED  
25 THERE WERE SOME, IN TERMS OF PARKING AND CONTRACTURAL



MARCH 12, 2025

1 AGREEMENTS THAT CITIES HAVE WITH ENTITIES THAT THEY WOULDN'T  
2 BE ABLE TO GET OUT OF THAT, WOULD NOT COMPLY WITH OUR TOC. SO,  
3 I APPRECIATE THE DEEPER DIVE, AND LOOK FORWARD TO THOSE  
4 CONVERSATIONS. AND JUST WANT TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE AS MUCH  
5 FLEXIBILITY IN LIGHT OF JUST THE CHANGING NATURE OF THE WORLD.  
6 SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION, AS  
9 WELL. I HAVE SEVERAL MAJOR CONCERNS HERE. FIRST, THE 100  
10 MILLION FOR REGIONAL OPERATIONS. SB125 BEING, IS THAT BEING  
11 TAKEN OUT OF THE REGIONAL FUNDS? OR THE LOCAL FUNDS?

12

13 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. THERESA ROMMEL WITH  
14 MTC STAFF. I DON'T BELIEVE WE HAVE MADE THAT DECISION YET OR  
15 WE HAVEN'T BROUGHT THAT DECISION FORWARD TO YOU TO MAKE THIS  
16 IS A HIGH OVERVIEW FOR YOU TODAY. WE HAVE ALMOST A YEAR OR  
17 LESS THAN A YEAR TO FINALIZE OBAG FOUR BEFORE WE HAVE A FINAL  
18 FRAMEWORK TO BRING FORWARD TO YOU. WE WOULD LIKE TO USE THAT  
19 TIME TO ANSWER SOME IMPORTANT QUESTIONS INCLUDING HOW MUCH  
20 FUNDING WILL WE ULTIMATELY HAVE FOR OBAG FOUR BEFORE WE DECIDE  
21 -- OR PREDECIDE, YOU KNOW, HOW THE FUND ARE GOING TO BE SPLIT,  
22 WHERE THE 100 MILLION IS GOING TO COME FROM. ANOTHER IMPORTANT  
23 QUESTION THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO ANSWER IS REALLY LOOKING AT THE  
24 REGIONAL PROGRAMS AND HAVING A DISCUSSION ABOUT THE BENEFITS  
25 THAT THEY PROVIDE TO THE REGION, TO THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS,



MARCH 12, 2025

1 AS A LARGE PART OF THAT REGIONAL PROGRAM DOES GO BACK TO LOCAL  
2 JURISDICTIONS, AND JUST HOW, YOU KNOW, EFFECTIVE THEY ARE IN  
3 HELPING TO DELIVER THE BENEFITS AND THE GOALS OF THE REGIONAL  
4 PLAN. SO, WE JUST WOULD ASK FOR A LITTLE BIT OF TIME BEFORE WE  
5 HAVE TO MAKE THAT DECISION ON WHERE THAT 100 MILLION COMES  
6 FROM. HOWEVER WE HAVE HEARD, OBVIOUSLY, FROM COMMISSIONERS AND  
7 COUNTY PARTNERS THAT THAT IS TOP OF MINORITY AND THAT'S VERY  
8 IMPORTANT SO WE HAVE THAT IN MIND.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. I DO HAVE TO KEEP  
11 BRINGING IT UP, SO WHEN WE DECIDE. SO, SECOND HERE, AND I  
12 MEANT TO SAY THIS IN ITEM 2C REGARDING THE TOC HERE. THE TOC  
13 IS CHALLENGING, FOR MANY JURISDICTIONS. OUR CITIES ARE  
14 INCREASINGLY FEELING THE AMOUNT OF REGULATIONS AND  
15 REQUIREMENTS COMING DOWN TO US FROM THE TOC COMPLIANCE  
16 JURISDICTIONS. IT REALLY BECOMES SOMEWHAT, ESPECIALLY IF YOU  
17 ARE TALKING ABOUT SMALLER JURISDICTIONS, AND WE DO APPRECIATE  
18 THE HELP WE'RE GETTING HERE, BUT MANY OF OUR CITIES ARE NOT  
19 GOING TO BE COMPLIANT BY THE DEADLINE THAT CURRENTLY EXISTS.  
20 NOW, WE ALL WANT TO COMPLY. DON'T GET ME WRONG HERE. BUT IT'S  
21 A LOT MORE DIFFICULT FOR SOME SMALLER JURISDICTIONS HERE. AND  
22 WITH MTC PROPOSING A SET ASIDE FOR FUNDING TOP TIER  
23 JURISDICTIONS, THAT REALLY IS ONLY GOING TO BENEFIT THE BIG  
24 CITIES. AND THAT IS SOMETHING WE'RE CONSTANTLY DEALING WITH  
25 HERE IN THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS. THEY ARE MORE PREPARED FOR



MARCH 12, 2025

1 ALL OF THIS, AND I REALLY DON'T WANT TO SEE WHEN YOU DO YOUR  
2 TIERS HERE, THE LITTLE CITIES BEING LEFT IN THE DUST. BECAUSE  
3 THAT IS NOT BENEFICIAL. THAT'S NOT REGIONAL, SHALL WE SAY?  
4 BECAUSE WE LIKE TO USE THAT WORD A LOT. IT REALLY HAS THE  
5 POTENTIAL TO SHIFT RESOURCES JUST TO THE LARGER CITIES. SO, I  
6 WOULD LIKE US TO FOCUS ON -- AND I MIGHT HAVE TO REOPEN ITEM  
7 2C HERE, SOME, SORT OF, EXTENSION OF THE DECEMBER 31ST  
8 DEADLINE ON THE COMPLIANCE PART OF THIS. BECAUSE WE WANT TO  
9 SEE ALL THESE CITIES COMPLYING HERE. BUT, AGAIN, THE CURRENT  
10 DEADLINE MAKES IT VERY DIFFICULT. AND I HAVE TO REPRESENT 20  
11 CITIES. SO, THOSE WHO ARE IN THE PROCESS HERE, WE ARE GOING TO  
12 HAVE TO TRY TO FIND SOME FLEXIBILITY, I HOPE, IF THAT'S  
13 POSSIBLE, TO EXTEND THAT DEADLINE. AND, AGAIN, I KEEP BRINGING  
14 UP THAT 50/50 SPLIT. AND WE KEEP HEARING FROM STAFF HOW  
15 WONDERFUL THE REGIONAL PROGRAMS ARE. BUT LOCALLY, THOSE FUNDS  
16 ARE PUT TO SUCH AMAZING USE, AND THERE IS NO, REALLY, OTHER  
17 ALTERNATIVE HERE. SO, I KNOW WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THAT. BUT I  
18 THINK A LOT OF THE COMMISSIONERS, WHO I USUALLY SPEAK FOR HERE  
19 [LAUGHTER] -- ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THAT. SO, WHENEVER WE'RE  
20 GETTING CLOSER TO THAT. IF WE CAN ADDRESS A POSSIBLE EXTENSION  
21 OF TIME, OR TALK OFFLINE HERE, PLEASE LET ME KNOW, IF THAT'S  
22 POSSIBLE.

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, ALIX BOCKELMAN, EXECUTIVE  
25 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. A FEW THINGS HERE YOU KNOW I THINK



MARCH 12, 2025

1 AS MATT NOTED WE WILL BE COMING BACK TO REALLY TALK ABOUT HOW  
2 THE JURISDICTIONS ARE GOING IN MEETING TOC COMPLIANCE. I THINK  
3 THAT SOUND LIKE THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT AND WE'LL GET THAT IN  
4 FRONT OF YOU. BECAUSE AS YOU MENTIONED, A FEW PROGRAMS THAT  
5 ARE REALLY MEANT TO HELP JURISDICTIONS ACHIEVE COMPLIANCE IN  
6 TERMS OF SOME PLANNING SUPPORT ET CETERA, SO YOU KNOW WE ARE  
7 ACTIVELY WORKING WITH THE JURISDICTIONS AND WE REALLY DO WANT  
8 PEOPLE TO BE SUCCESSFUL WHICH IS WHY 100% COMPLIANCE WE MAY  
9 NOT BE THE WAY WE WANT TO APPROACH IT WE REALLY WANT TO MAKE  
10 SURE THAT WE ARE WORKING WITH JURISDICTIONS AND WE ARE MAKING  
11 THEM SUCCESS. IF THAT'S POSSIBLE, MORE IN-DEPTH CONVERSATION  
12 ABOUT HOW JURISDICTIONS ARE DOING AND WE'RE LOOKING AT SLIDING  
13 SCALE OF COMPLIANCE I THINK WE'RE JUST TRYING TO GATHER GOOD  
14 INFORMATION AND YOUR HELP IS GRITTIPLY APPRECIATED HERE.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** WHO IS GOING TO DETERMINE TOP TIER JURISDICTIONS  
17 EVERY COUNTY, IS MY CAN'T GOING TO HAVE TOP TIER JURISDICTION?

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WOULD NOTE THAT WAS POTENTIAL, SO I MEAN  
20 YOU'RE GOING TO GET MORE TO WEIGH IN A LOT MORE ON THE  
21 FEATURES OF OBAG FOUR AND ULTIMATELY THIS COMMISSION WILL  
22 DECIDE WHETHER THERE IS SET ASIDE AND YOU WILL HELP MAKE THE  
23 DECISIONS OR YOU WILL MAKE THE DECISIONS ABOUT ALL OF THAT SO  
24 THAT'S JUST TRYING TO GIVE FORESHADOWING OF SOME OF THE THINGS  
25 THAT WE WILL BE BRINGING TO YOU AS WE DEVELOP OBAG FOUR.



MARCH 12, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** PLEASE BE CONCERNED AS TO THE EQUITY OF THIS AS WE  
3 NEED TO BE CONCERNED ABOUT THE SMALLER LOOKING AT NINE MONTH  
4 PERIOD HERE COMPLIANCE AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY HAS  
5 ACCESS AND CAN ACHIEVE COMPLIANCE BECAUSE WE WANT TO SEE THAT  
6 HAPPENING BUT WHEN YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT LITTLE CITIES IN THE  
7 MIX THERE AND WE'RE MAKING SO MANY DIFFERENT REQUIREMENTS OF  
8 THEM WE DO NEED THAT FLEXIBILITY AND DETERMINATION OF WHOSE IN  
9 COMPLIANCE OR WHOSE IN SUBSTANTIAL COMPLIANCE OR ALL OF THOSE  
10 DESIGNATIONS ARE VERY PERSONALITY. AND STAFF, YOU NEED TO WORK  
11 WITH US HERE [LAUGHTER] -- BECAUSE YOU DO A LOT OF HARD WORK  
12 AND EFFORT HERE, BUT WE DO NEED TO, CLEARLY, ENSURE THAT  
13 EVERYBODY HAS THE OPPORTUNITY. THANK YOU.

14

15 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY IS A  
16 CORE AND CRITICAL POLICY FOR THIS REGION AND THIS BODY. IT  
17 SHOULD NOT BE COMPROMISED OR WATERED DOWN. I ACTUALLY THINK  
18 THAT SOME OF THE SUGGESTIONS THAT STAFF IS BRINGING FORWARD  
19 ARE VERY REASONABLE. YOU ARE TRYING TO ACCOMMODATE THE SHIFTS  
20 THAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA RECOGNIZED. AND I THINK YOUR  
21 PROPOSAL SOUNDS VERY GENEROUS AND REASONABLE. AND MY MEMORY,  
22 AS WE ALREADY CREATED A DELAY. WE ALREADY PUSHED BACK THE  
23 COMPLIANCE DEADLINES ONCE. AND, PLEASE CORRECT ME IF I AM  
24 WRONG. BUT I KNOW THAT THAT'S BEEN AN ISSUE THAT WE HAVE  
25 TALKED ABOUT BEFORE. AND I JUST -- I JUST WANT TO PUT, YOU



MARCH 12, 2025

1 KNOW, MY NAG IN THE SAND [LAUGHTER] -- FOR REALLY RESPECTING  
2 THE SPIRIT OF TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES, AND TAKING INTO  
3 ACCOUNT SOME OF THE CHANGE CONDITIONS, WHICH IS SOUND LIKE YOU  
4 ARE PROPOSING. I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE PRESERVE  
5 THE REGIONAL POT OF OBAG FOUR THAT \$100 MILLION THAT NOT BE  
6 SYPHONED OFF, THAT REMAINS SOMETHING THAT IS PUT TO WORK FOR  
7 THE ENTIRE REGION. THANK YOU.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS?

10

11 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE  
12 YOU SAID WE'RE NOT VOTING ON THIS TODAY AND THAT THERE WILL BE  
13 FUTURE OPPORTUNITIES. I'LL FLAG SOME THINGS FOR THOSE FUTURE  
14 OPPORTUNITIES. ONE IS THE PRO HOUSING DESIGNATION. WHICH IS  
15 SOMETHING THIS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WERE TOLD TO DO AND THAT,  
16 THAT WOULD THEN IMPACT HOW FUNDING HAS BEEN GIVEN OUT. AND  
17 THEN THE BIGGER DISCUSSION IN TERMS OF THE STATE LEVEL  
18 DECISION MAKING AND THAT PRO HOUSING DESIGNATIONS IS NOT BEING  
19 USED TO DETERMINE MOST OF THE STATE MONEY AROUND HOUSING WHICH  
20 DESPITE THE FACT THAT JURISDICTIONS WERE TOLD TO JUMP THROUGH  
21 A BUNCH OF HOOPS WHICH OAKLAND DID, AND OTHERS WERE TOLD TO  
22 JUMP THROUGH THE ROLE OF PRO HOUSING DESIGNATION, TRANSIT  
23 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT IN TRANSIT TORE COMMUNITY WORK INCLUDES  
24 WHETHER IT'S WALKABLE WHETHER IT'S SAFE TO BE WALKABLE AND  
25 THAT THOSE COULD ALSO BE PROJECTS AND FACTORS TO LOOK AT GOING





MARCH 12, 2025

1 FORWARD. AND LASTLY COMMENTS, WHEN WOULD THIS BE COMING BACK  
2 TO THE BOARD FOR ACTION GIVEN THAT TODAY IS NOT ACTION. THANK  
3 YOU SO MUCH.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD QUESTION. WE ARE PLANNING TO BRING THE ONE BAY  
6 AREA GRANT FRAMEWORK BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE IN FALL. WE DON'T  
7 HAVE A MONTH SET. I THINK THERE WILL BE INTERIM DISCUSSION ON  
8 THE TOC POLICY THAT WILL, SORT OF, INFORM THAT FRAMEWORK  
9 RECOMMENDATION TO YOU.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC SPEAKERS ON THIS?

12

13 **BOARD CLERK:** WE HAVE NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM. BUT WE DID  
14 RECEIVE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE. AND THAT WAS FROM BACTA  
15 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS. IT WAS POSTED IN AND INCLUDED IN THE  
16 PACKET AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. SO THIS IS INFORMATIONAL. SO,  
19 THANK YOU. SO, NOW WE WILL GO TO AGENDA ITEM 5A. THIS IS  
20 INFORMATIONAL AS WELL. CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION.  
21 CTC, AND STATE FUNDING PROGRAM UPDATE. I THINK KENNETH WILL  
22 PROVIDE THIS INFORMATIONAL UPDATE.

23

24 **KENNETH KAO:** YES, THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING -- ALMOST AFTERNOON.  
25 KENNETH KAO; MTC STAFF. I'LL BE BRIEF. TWO UPDATES I WANT TO



MARCH 12, 2025

1 PROVIDE FROM THE CTC THAT MET IN JANUARY IN SACRAMENTO. WE GOT  
2 SOME MONEY FROM THE STATE, \$118 MILLION FOR THE BRIDGES. THAT  
3 WAS PART OF IIJA, THE FEDERAL ACT, PART OF THAT TO HELP OFFSET  
4 SOME OF THE LOST BRIDGE TOLLS. GOOD NEWS THERE. I WANT TO  
5 MENTION THE COMMISSION DID ELECT NEW LEADERS, VICE -- CURRENT  
6 VICE CHAIR BRISBY WILL NOW BE A CHAIR OF THE COMMISSIONS, THE  
7 CTC. HE HAILS FROM SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY. AND COMMISSIONER  
8 CLARISSA FALCONE FROM SAN DIEGO WILL BE VICE CHAIR. SO LOOK  
9 FORWARD TO WELCOMING THEM ON TO THE COMMISSION AS THEIR  
10 LEADERSHIP ROLES. NEXT MEETING WILL BE NEXT WEEK IN LONG  
11 BEACH. ALSO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT IN MAY, MTC, SAN FRANCISCO,  
12 THE BAY AREA WILL BE HOSTING THE CTC HERE IN THIS BUILDING SO  
13 LOOKING FORWARD TO WELCOMING THEM, AND A RECEPTION OF WHICH WE  
14 WILL BE INVITING YOU TO. SO, THANK YOU. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY  
15 QUESTIONS.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY COMMENTS OR  
18 QUESTIONS? SEEING NONE. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **BOARD CLERK:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM SPACE OR IN THE  
21 BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT THANKS. OKAY. SO THIS TAKES US  
24 TO ITEM SIX, PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER BUSINESS. I WILL NOW ASK THE  
25 CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED



MARCH 12, 2025

1 WITH THIS ITEM AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY  
2 INTO THE RECORD. I WOULD ALSO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF  
3 THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL  
4 COMMENT NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY'S AGENDA. PLEASE USE  
5 THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE  
6 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM, AND WE WILL CALL  
7 UPON THEM TO SPEAK. SO, CAN I HEAR FROM THE CLERK FIRST THEN  
8 I'LL GO COMMISSIONER KAPLAN.

9

10 **BOARD CLERK:** WE DID RECEIVE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WHICH WAS  
11 INCLUDED IN THE PACKET AND THAT WAS BY ROBERT PRINCE OF BIKE  
12 EAST BAY. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE IN THE  
13 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER KAPLAN.

16

17 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU. ONE ANNOUNCEMENT FOR AN ITEM NOT ON  
18 THE AGENDA AS WE TALK ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF OUR REGIONAL  
19 TRANSIT HUBS AND THE WAY THAT ACTIVATION CAN SUPPORT OUR  
20 PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES I WANT TO ANNOUNCE THAT ON MARCH 22nd  
21 THE OAKLAND ROOTS SOCCER SEASON WILL BEGIN AT THE OAKLAND  
22 COLOSSEUM, AND OAKLAND COLOSSEUM IS ON BART ON AMTRAK CAPITAL  
23 CORRIDOR ON AC TRANSIT AND IS A MAJOR INTERMODAL REGIONAL  
24 TRANSIT HUB WHICH IS PLEASED TO BE SUPPORTING THE 2025 ROUTE  
25 SOCCER SEASON SO COME TO A GAME RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT TO THE



MARCH 12, 2025

1 GAME AND SUPPORT OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM. THANK YOU VERY  
2 MUCH CHAIR MILEY.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** VERY GOOD. ITEM SEVEN ADJOURNMENT THE  
5 NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE WILL  
6 BE HELD WEDNESDAY APRIL 9TH, 2025, AT 9:45 AT BAY AREA METRO  
7 CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE  
8 SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE'RE NOW  
9 ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

10



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*