

**ASSOCIATION OF BAY
AREA GOVERNMENTS
Meeting Transcript**

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD**

2 **THURSDAY, DECEMBER 15, 2022 5:05 PM**

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** GOOD EVENING I'M BERKELEY MAYOR
5 JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. I WOULD
6 LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD TO ORDER
7 AND WILL STAFF NOW PLAY THE COVID-19 MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT
8 RECORDING? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO
9 COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR
10 PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS
11 CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING
12 WEBCAST ON THE ABAG WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
13 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
14 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
15 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
16 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
17 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
18 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
19 USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
20 CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
21 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
22 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
23 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
24 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
25 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
2 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
3 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
4 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
5 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
6 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
7 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
8 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP-TO-DATE.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. WILL THE ABAG CLERK OF
11 THE BOARD CONDUCT ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS
12 PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE MAYOR ADAMS?

15

16 **SUSAN ADAMS:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

19

20 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BAS? ABSENT. MAYOR BUTT?

23

24 **TOM BUTT:** HERE.

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. EKLUND?

2

3 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ELLENBERG? IS ABSENT. ESPARZA?

6

7 **MAYA ESPARZA:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FIFE? IS ABSENT.

10 COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR?

11

12 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GARCIA? I LOST MY VIDEO. I'M HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR HAUBERT? IS ABSENT.

17 MAYOR HUDSON?

18

19 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE?

22

23 **OTTO LEE:** PRESENT.

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MANDELMAN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MAR? IS
2 ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ BELTRAN?

3

4 **YVONNE MARTINEZ:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY? IS ABSENT. MITCHOFF?

7

8 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER
11 PERALEZ? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?

20

21 **CARLOS ROMERO:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR SPERING?

24

25 **JAMES SPERING:** PRESENT.

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER TAYLOR? IS ABSENT. MAYOR
3 YOUNG?

4

5 **STEVE YOUNG:** HERE .

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COUNCIL MEMBER FOLEY?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR ROGERS?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE .

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT .

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** NEXT ITEM, PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE
18 ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON
19 ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA? I SEE NO RAISED HANDS ON ZOOM. WILL
20 THE CLERK INFORM WHETHER THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED FOR
21 THIS ITEM.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ITEM THREE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER
2 ANNOUNCEMENTS. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY
3 ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS, RAISE YOUR HAND.
4 SEEING NONE. I WILL ASK IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
5 ITEM?

6

7 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** THERE IS ONE HAND JESSE.

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. YES, DIRECTOR ROGERS?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** QUICKLY, BEFORE THIS MEETING STARTED AT ABAG, I WAS
12 AT A MEETING WHERE THE SAN FRANCISCO HOUSING COMMISSION
13 ADOPTED OUR HOUSING ELEMENT.

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** GREAT NEWS, THAT ANNOUNCEMENT. ARE
16 THERE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE
17 BOARD. IF NOT, ONCE AGAIN, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
18 ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED AND NO
21 MEMBERS OF THE ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC
22 COMMENT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THAT. BRINGS US
25 TO ITEM FOUR, THE PRESIDENT'S REPORT AND THIS IS MY REPORT FOR

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 TODAY, DECEMBER 15TH, 2022 I WANT TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES FOR
2 THEIR PARTICIPATION IN THIS EVENING'S ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
3 MEETING. OUR LAST MEETING FOR THE YEAR, AND IN ADDITION TO THE
4 CONSENT COMMITTEE REPORTS WE'LL CONSIDER THE APPROVAL OF OUR
5 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM WHICH IS OUR LEGISLATIVE PLATFORM FOR
6 BOTH FEDERAL AND STATE ADVOCACY. AND I WANT TO TAKE A MOMENT
7 TO ACKNOWLEDGE OUR COLLEAGUES ON THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, WHO
8 ARE STEPPING DOWN FROM THE EXECUTIVE BOARD, AND EXPRESS OUR
9 DEEPEST THANKS AND GRATITUDE FOR THEIR SERVICE TO THE REGION.
10 AND I'M GOING TO LIST MEMBERS WHO WILL BE DEPARTING FROM THE
11 EXECUTIVE BOARD. FIRST MAYOR TOMB B CITY OF RICHMOND WHO
12 SERVED ON THE ABAG GENERAL ASSEMBLY AND ON THE ABAG
13 CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION, MAYA ESPARZA FROM
14 CITY OF SAN JOSE, REDWOOD CITY MAYOR, ALSO SERVED ON GENERAL
15 ASSEMBLY AND BARBARA HALLIDAY WHO WANTS TO THANK THE ABAG
16 EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR THEIR SUPPORT AND PARTNERSHIP OVER THE
17 YEARS SHE ALSO SERVED ON THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY AND THE ABAG
18 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. SAN FRANCISCO SUPERVISOR GORDON MAR WHO
19 SERVED ON THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE COUNCIL
20 MORE PERALEZ FROM THE CITY OF SAN JOSE WHO SERVED ON OUR
21 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. SUPERVISOR JAMES SPERING FROM THE
22 COUNTY OF SOLANO WHO SERVED IN -- HAD MANY HATS IN OUR REGION,
23 A LONG TIME MEMBER OF MTC, BUT ALSO A LONG TIME MEMBER OF ABAG
24 AND SERVED ON OUR ADMINISTRATIVE, FINANCE, REGIONAL PLANNING
25 AND OUR HOUSING COMMITTEE AND WE'RE SO GRATEFUL TO SUPERVISOR

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 SPERING FOR HIS MANY DECADES OF SERVICE TO THE REGION AND
2 PARTICULARLY HIS CONTRIBUTIONS TO ABAG OVER THE PAST YEARS.
3 AND COUNCILMEMBER LAWRENCE TAYLOR FROM THE CITY OF OAKLAND.
4 AND ON BEHALF OF THE ENTIRE EXECUTIVE BOARD AND STAFF OF ABAG
5 MTC WE WANT TO EXPRESS OUR DEEPEST GRATITUDE FOR THE OUTGOING
6 BOARD MEMBERS FOR THEIR LEADERSHIP AND SERVICE AND I KNOW YOU
7 WILL STILL BE INVOLVED EITHER IN YOUR COMMUNITIES OR ON
8 REGIONAL ISSUES AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU IN
9 YEARS TO COME AND WANT TO TURN THE FLOOR OVER TO ANY OF OUR
10 DEPARTING COLLEAGUES IF YOU WANT TO OFFER ANY COMMENTS AND
11 WE'LL ACKNOWLEDGE SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF VERY SHORTLY. SO I JUST
12 WANT TO OPEN UP IF ANY OF OUR DEPARTING COLLEAGUES WANT TO
13 MAKE ANY COMMENTS FEEL FREE TO RAISE YOUR HAND. YOU'RE NOT
14 OBLIGATED TO. I WANT YOU JUST TO ACKNOWLEDGE THIS IS THE LAST
15 MEETING OF THE YEAR AND LAST MEETING WHICH WILL EXPRESS
16 SERVING.

17

18 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** I WANT TO SAY WHAT A GREAT HONOR AND PRIVILEGE
19 IT WAS TO SERVE WITH YOU ALL. I WISH YOU WELL. YOU HAVE BIG
20 WORK TO DO LOTS OF BIG WORK TO DO. THAT'S NOT VERY GOOD
21 GRAMMAR BUT RELATIVE TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING AS WE MOVE FORWARD
22 TO COMPLETE AND SERVE OUR COMMUNITIES TO TRY AND GET HOUSING
23 TO EVERYONE, AND IT'S -- IT'S A HEAVY LIFT, BUT I KNOW THAT
24 ALL OF YOU HAVE THE SKILLS AND TALENTS TO DO SO, AND I KNOW,
25 IN LEAVING, THAT I LEAVE THAT VERY IMPORTANT WORK TO ALL OF

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 YOU, IN ADDITION TO ALL THE OTHER WORK WE DO. BUT THAT'S A BIG
2 THING COMING UP. SO, THANK YOU, AGAIN.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF.
5 SUPERVISOR SPERING?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MAYOR. YOU KNOW, I JUST WANT TO
8 SAY THANK YOU TO ALL MY COLLEAGUES. I CERTAINLY WILL BE
9 CONTINUING TO WORK WITH MANY OF YOU, THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
10 HAVE APPOINTED ME BACK ON MTC, SO I'LL BE SERVING THERE. SO, I
11 JUST WANT TO CONGRATULATE EVERYBODY THAT'S BEEN INVOLVED IN
12 THIS LONG TIME MERGER OF ABAG AND MTC. THE LEVEL OF
13 COOPERATION TODAY IS NOTHING I HAVE SEEN IN THE 30 PLUS YEARS
14 I HAVE BEEN ON MTC, AND CHAIR HAR ARREGUIN, I CREDIT YOU ON
15 BUILDING THE CONSENSUS. THE MOD WE HAVE NOW THE PEOPLE WHO
16 AREN'T REPRESENTED THROUGH MTC HAVE A VOICE ON ABAG AND I
17 THINK IT'S SOMETHING SERVING THE REGION WELL, AND I THINK THIS
18 ABAG MTC MERGER AND THE LEVEL OF COOPERATION IS THE MODEL THAT
19 SHOULD BE LOOKED AT NATIONALLY, AND I THINK YOU'RE STARTING TO
20 SEE MANY OF THE POSITIVE RESULTS. WE HAVE GOT GOOD LEADERSHIP
21 AND MAYOR ARREGUIN I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU, YOU REALLY GOT
22 THE BALL -- YOU AND ALFREDO GOT THE BALL OVER THE FINISH LINE.
23 SO, THANK YOU.

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** WELL, I'M VERY GRATEFUL FOR THOSE
2 VERY KIND WORDS SUPERVISOR SPERING VERY GLAD TO HEAR THAT YOU
3 WILL BE CONTINUING ON MTC, AND WANT TO THANK YOU FOR ALL THE
4 WORK YOU HAVE DONE FROM BEING THE FATHER OF OUR TOD PROGRAM
5 AND SEEING THE BENEFIT OF THAT IN THE BAY AREA, TO THE WORK
6 YOU HAVE DONE MOST RECENTLY ON TRYING TO ADDRESS OUR TRANSIT
7 FISCAL CLIFF. SO, VERY GRATEFUL TO YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE ON
8 ABAG AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ON MTC. ARE THERE
9 ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM ANY OTHER BOARD MEMBERS? OKAY. IF NOT,
10 I WILL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO
17 PART B OF THIS ITEM, WHICH IS THE ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION 23-
18 2022, A RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR SUPERVISOR KAREN
19 MITCHOFF, AND THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. AND I WANT TO TAKE THIS
20 OPPORTUNITY TO ACKNOWLEDGE AND THANK SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF FOR
21 HER SERVICE ON THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND FOR THE SAN
22 FRANCISCO BAY REGION AND SHE HAS SERVED IN MANY LEADERSHIP
23 ROLES IN THIS AGENCY, NOT ONLY ON THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY, BUT
24 HAS SERVED ON OUR ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE, SHE IS THE CHAIR
25 OF OUR FINANCE COMMITTEE. SHE HAS BEEN THE CHAIR OF THE

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE, SHE SERVED ON OUR HOUSING
2 COMMITTEE, OUR LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, AND GOVERNMENT
3 ORGANIZATION COMMITTEE, JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE
4 AND LASTLY AS THE CHAIR OF THE ADVANCING CALIFORNIA FINANCE
5 AUTHORITY. AND I'M GOING READ A FEW CLAUSES FROM THE
6 RESOLUTION WHICH IS ACTUALLY INCLUDED IN OUR PACKET ON PAGE
7 NINE AND THEN MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE IT WHEREAS SUPERVISOR
8 MITCHOFF JOINED THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AS AN ALTERNATE IN JANUARY
9 2022 AND WAS NOMINATED AS A REPRESENTATIVE IN SUMMER OF 2012,
10 AND NOMINATED AS A REPRESENTATIVE IN SUMMER OF 2012 AND WENT
11 TO SERVE ON AS A MEMBER OF THE HOUSING COMMITTEE, JOINT MTC
12 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AS WELL AS SERVED IN VARIOUS CAPACITIES
13 INCLUDING CHAIR OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE, REGIONAL PLANNING
14 COMMITTEE, AND THE ADVANCING CALIFORNIA FINANCE AUTHORITY
15 BOARD. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF WAS AN ENGAGED AND ACTIVE MEMBER OF
16 THE LEADERSHIP TEAM THROUGH CHALLENGES AND CHANGE OF THE
17 AGENCY DURING WHICH DECADES OF PUBLIC EXPERIENCE PROVIDED A
18 VALUABLE EXPERIENCE IN NAVIGATING SUCH SIGNIFICANT MILESTONES
19 SUCH AS THE 2017 STAFF CONSOLIDATION WITH THE METROPOLITAN
20 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, THE 2018 CREATION OF THE ADVANCING
21 CALIFORNIA FINANCE AUTHORITY, WHICH PROVIDED SECURE LOW COST
22 AND COMMUNITY PUBLIC FINANCING FOR PUBLIC AGENCIES AND
23 PARTNERS IN THE BAY AREA. UNDER KAREN'S LEADERSHIP THE
24 REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE ADVISED SIGNIFICANT ABAG PLANNING
25 INITIATIVES SUCH AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2040, PLANNED BAY AREA

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 2050, AND THE STATE-MANDATED REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
2 ALLOCATION. WHEREAS KAREN HAS SAID THAT SHE CAN SEE LIFE ON
3 THE OTHER SIDE OF HER RETIREMENT. COMMENTING IN A RECENT
4 INTERVIEW, "IT'S BEEN AN HONOR TO SERVE, AND I HAVE LISTENED
5 TO ALL SIDES WHEN MAKING DECISIONS." THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED
6 WE ARE THE ONES WHO ARE PRIVILEGED TO WORK WITH KAREN MITCHOFF
7 OVER THE PAST DECADE AND APPRECIATE HER RESPECTFUL THOUGHTFUL
8 AND EFFICIENT STYLE OF LEADERSHIP, HER BOISTEROUS LAUGH AND
9 THANK HER FOR MANY YEARS OF PUBLIC SERVICE AND PAY TRIBUTE TO
10 HER LEADERSHIP TO THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA AND ENCOURAGE HER
11 THROUGH HER TRAVEL PLANS, I KNOW RETIREMENT MAY NOT QUITE BE
12 THE WORD FOR SOMEBODY WHO HAS BEEN SO ACTIVELY INVOLVED IN
13 MANY SOCIAL CAUSES AND WISH SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF ALL THE BEST
14 IN HER ENDEAVOR IN THE YEARS AHEAD. WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO
15 MAKE A MOTION THAT WE ADOPT THE RESOLUTION 23-2022, TO OUR
16 DEPARTING COLLEAGUE KAREN MITCHOFF?

17

18 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** SECOND.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ANY COMMENTS? SUPERVISOR RABBIT.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE
23 FOR THEIR SERVICE AT ABAG, ESPECIALLY YOU KAREN, WE HAVE
24 SERVED CONCURRENTLY, IT'S DAYS LIKE TODAY THAT I DO WISH WE
25 WERE IN PERSON TO SAY THANK YOU, IN PERSON, FACE-TO-FACE,

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 INCLUDING EVERYONE, BUT ESPECIALLY YOU, KAREN, AND ALL THE
2 ROLES THAT YOU HAVE PLAYED AND ALL THE HOURS THAT WE HAVE ALL
3 SPENT TOGETHER OVER THE YEARS, ENJOY YOUR PERSPECTIVE, YOUR
4 LEADERSHIP, YOUR STYLE, YOUR CAMARADERIE, COLLEGIALITY,
5 PROFESSIONALISM, JUST A JOY TO WORK W THANK YOU, AND THANK YOU
6 FOR YOUR SERVICE TO YOUR COMMUNITY AND YOUR SERVICE TO THE BAY
7 AREA AS A WHOLE. I WILL MISS SEEING YOU IN THOSE MEETINGS BUT
8 I DO HOPE THAT WE CAN KEEP IN TOUCH, AS THE FUTURE GOES
9 FORWARD. AND JUST WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU.

10

11 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU SUPERVISOR RABBIT.
12 SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF, YOU ARE MUTED.

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** L THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM EMBARRASSED TO
17 ADMIT THAT I DID NOT SEE THIS ON THE AGENDA WHEN I LOOKED AT
18 THE AGENDA IT'S LIKE PRESIDENT'S REPORT, OKAY, WHAT'S ON THE
19 AGENDA, CONSENT. AND I DIDN'T LOOK. SO YOU HAVE CAUGHT ME BY
20 SURPRISE. I AM VERY TOUCHED. I WILL SAY, AND IT'S, SORT OF,
21 FUNNY. I APPRECIATE THE FOLKS WHO PUT THIS RESOLUTION TOGETHER
22 WHERE YOU QUOTED ME, JESSE AS IT'S BEEN AN HONOR AND PRIVILEGE
23 TO SERVE. THAT IS TRUE. I HAVE LISTENED TO ALL SIDES IN MAKING
24 DECISIONS THAT WAS IN RESPONSE TO A NEGATIVE COMMENT ABOUT HOW
25 STUPID WE ARE AT OUR BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR NOT

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 UNDERSTANDING ALL SIDES OF AN ISSUE. BUT I'LL TAKE IT IN THIS
2 RESOLUTION AS A POSITIVE. AND IT'S JUST BEEN A PLEASURE
3 WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU. THANK YOU, DAVID. AND I'M SORRY WE
4 AREN'T IN PERSON, BUT THAT OPPORTUNITY MAY ARISE IN THE
5 FUTURE. AND, WHAT CAN ONE SAY WHEN ONE IS SURROUNDED BY SO
6 MANY WONDERFUL AND BRIGHT -- AS I REFERRED TO ON TUESDAY, MY
7 BROTHERS AND SISTERS? HAD ELECTED OFFICE. THANK YOU.

8

9 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND I BELIEVE
10 THERESE, WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE A FRAMED SIGNED COPY OF THIS
11 TO SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF. AND I SECOND WHAT SUPERVISOR RABBIT
12 SAID. I'M REALLY SORRY THAT WE COULD NOT DO THIS IN PERSON.
13 BUT WE WILL BE SURE TO GET THIS TO YOU SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF.
14 MAYOR HUDSON IN.

15

16 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I ALWAYS LIKE LOOKING AT PEOPLE WHEN WE GET
17 TO THESE MEETINGS AND IT'S NOT HARD TO FIGURE OUT THE ONES WHO
18 ARE LEAVING THE ONES WITH THE BIGGEST SMILES ON THEIR FACES.
19 THERE IT IS YOU COULD SEE IN THE LAST MONTH, AT ALL THESE
20 MEETINGS, I'M GETTING SHORTED. IT REMINDING ME LEAVING VIETNAM
21 COUNTING DOWN HOURS INSTEAD OF DAYS. KAREN I'M NOT GOING TO
22 GIVE YOU A LOT MORE WORDS. I WANT YOU TO TAKE A LOOK OVER MY
23 SHOULDER THIS IS WHAT YOU CALL A STRONG HINT, IT'S TIME TO GO
24 BACK, AND HAVE A GREAT TIME AWAY FROM THIS LOVELY THING WE
25 CALL GOVERNMENT.

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. AND ARE THERE ANY OTHER
3 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD?

4

5 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YEAH. IF I MAY, KAREN, SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF.
6 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP ON THE REGIONAL
7 PLANNING COMMITTEE. I SERVED AS YOUR VICE CHAIR FOR ALMOST
8 FOURS YEARS. VERY MUCH APPRECIATED HOW YOU RAN THOSE MEETINGS
9 AND THE WAY YOU UNDERSTOOD THE MATERIALS. YOU ARE WILL
10 DEFINITELY BE MISSED. YOU ARE LEAVING SOME BIG SHOES TO FILL.
11 HOWEVER ENJOY A MUCH DESERVED RETIREMENT.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
14 OTHER COMMENTS? OKAY. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER RAISED HANDS. SO,
15 I WILL NOW ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, WITH THAT, I
22 WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE CLERK TO PLEASE CALL THE ROLL ON THE
23 RESOLUTION IN APPRECIATION OF OUR RETIRING COLLEAGUE,
24 SUPERVISOR KAREN MITCHOFF.

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY ARREGUIN SECOND BY HUDSON. VICE
2 MAYOR ADAMS?

3

4 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN?

7

8 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR ARREGUIN?

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER FORTUNATO BAS?

15

16 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR BREED IS ABSENT. MAYOR BUTT?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR CANEPA? IS ABSENT. COUNCIL
23 MEMBER EKLUND?

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR ELLENBERG? IS ABSENT. COUNCIL
3 MEMBER ESPARZA?

4

5 **MAYA ESPARZA:** THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF. YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FIFE?

8

9 **CARROLL FIFE:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR?

12

13 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR GARCIA?

16

17 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR HAUBERT? IS ABSENT. MAYOR
20 HUDSON?

21

22 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE?

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **OTTO LEE:** HECK YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN? IS
4 ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MAR? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ
5 BELTRAN?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES. GOOD LUCK.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES. YES, KAREN, WE'LL MISS YOU AS WELL.

12

13 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** THANK YOU NATE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** ABSTAIN. [LAUGHTER]

18

19 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** LET'S KEEP HER.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MOULTON PETERS? IS ABSENT.

22 COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

23

24 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

2

3 **BELIA RAMOS:** WITH GRATITUDE, YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?

6

7 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR SPERING?

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, KAREN. YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER TAYLOR IS ABSENT. MAYOR
14 YOUNG?

15

16 **STEVE YOUNG:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FOLEY?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DIRECTOR ROGERS?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** YES.

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES ALMOST
2 UNANIMOUSLY WITH ONE ABSTENTION.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND ONCE
5 AGAIN, BITTER SWEET. WE'RE JUST SO GRATEFUL FOR YOUR
6 INCREDIBLE LEADERSHIP FOR ABAG AND FOR THE REGION. BUT WE WANT
7 TO WISH YOU ALL THE BEST IN YOUR RETIREMENT, AND WE HOPE TO
8 SEE YOU IN THE FUTURE. SO, THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF.
9 WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM FIVE, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
10 REPORT. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. I WOULD LIKE TO FORWARD
11 IT TO EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THERESE MCMILLAN

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH PRESIDENT ARREGUIN.
14 AND I DO HAVE A SUBSTANTIVE REPORT. BUT I JUST WANT TO SAY ON
15 BEHALF OF MYSELF AND THE STAFF, CONGRATULATIONS AND GRATITUDE
16 TO ALL THE MEMBERS WHO ARE LEAVING. ESPECIALLY TO SUPERVISOR
17 MITCHOFF, WHO STOOD WITH US AS WE WERE GETTING THOSE PACKETS
18 OUT SOMETIMES AT THE LAST MINUTE. BUT, I JUST WANTED TO
19 OBSERVE THAT IF THERE WAS ANY YEAR THAT WAS KIND OF A BANNER
20 YEAR, I THINK A RHNA YEAR WOULD QUALIFY AS THAT. AND, SO,
21 AGAIN, IT'S BEEN COORDINATE WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU WHO ARE
22 LEAVING, AND WE ALL WISH YOU THE BEST. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. IS THERE ANY
25 DISCUSSION BY MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD ON THIS ITEM? IF

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I DO NOT SEE ANY HAND RAISED FROM
2 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS. I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF
3 THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
4 ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
7 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
8 ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO
11 ITEM SIX, THE CONSENT CALENDAR CONSISTS OF 6A ADOPTION OF
12 RESOLUTION BETWEEN THE-0022 ADOPTION OF A.B. 361, AND BAY RON
13 CONTRACT COLLECTION STRATEGIES CONSULTING LLC NOT TO EXCEED
14 \$175,000 ACTION ITEM I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE THE
15 ITEM.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT:** MOVE.

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SECOND.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** RABBIT MOVES ROMERO SECONDS.
22 COLLEAGUES ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? IF SO RAISE YOUR
23 HAND. SEEING NONE FROM EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS. I WOULD LIKE
24 TO ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISHES TO

21

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? OR WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
2 ON THIS ITEM.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. NOW I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE
9 CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL ON THE MOTION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY RABBIT. SECOND BY ROMERO. VICE
12 MAYOR ADAMS?

13

14 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARREGUIN?

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BAS?

25

22

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BREED? IS ABSENT. MAYOR BUTT?

4

5 **TOM BUTT:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA? IS ABSENT. EKLUND?

8

9 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ELLENBERG? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER

12 ESPARZA?

13

14 **MAYA ESPARZA:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER FIFE?

17

18 **CARROLL FIFE:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR?

21

22 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GARCIA?

25

23

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAUBERT? IS ABSENT. MAYOR HUDSON?

4

5 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE?

8

9 **OTTO LEE:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER -- SORRY -- SUPERVISOR

12 MANDELMAN? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MAR? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER

13 MARTINEZ BELTRAN?

14

15 **YVONNE MARTINEZ BELTRAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MILEY?

18

19 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

22

23 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** YES.

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MOULTON PETERS? IS ABSENT.

2 COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

7

8 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?

11

12 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TAYLOR IS ABSENT. MAYOR YOUNG?

19

20 **STEVE YOUNG:** YES COUNCILMEMBER FOLEY?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE -- I MEAN AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR ROGERS?

25

25

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
4 PRESENT.

5

6 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH THAT BRINGS US
7 TO OUR LAST AGENDA ITEM, 7A IS APPROVAL OF THE 2023 MTC ABAG
8 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM OUTLINING THE 2023 STATE AND FEDERAL
9 LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM I WILL GIVE THE
10 REPORT HOWEVER GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN AND JULIE SNYDER FROM MTC
11 ABAG ARE AVAILABLE FOR QUESTIONS. THE PROPOSED 2023 JOINT
12 ADVOCACY PROGRAM PROVIDES FRAMEWORK TO GUIDE MTC ADVOCACY AND
13 ABAG ADVOCACY IN SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON, D.C. AND OUTLINES
14 SEVERAL PROPOSALS THAT OUR AGENCIES WILL ACTIVELY ENGAGE ON IN
15 COMING YEAR. ADVOCACY PROGRAM ADDRESSES A RANGE OF TOPICS,
16 FROM HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION FUNDING TO THE BAY AREA
17 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY TO CLIMATE RESILIENCE. THE
18 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE IN NOVEMBER REVIEWED THE DRAFT ADVOCACY
19 PROGRAM AND PROVIDED FEEDBACK TO STAFF INCLUDING SECURING
20 TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF AND GROW
21 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP SHOULD BE A TOP ADVOCACY PRIORITY THIS YEAR.
22 CLEAN UP LEGISLATION TO MAXIMIZE THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
23 AUTHORITY'S FINANCING POTENTIAL IS ANOTHER HIGH PRIORITY ITEM
24 IN THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM. OTHER TOPICS INCLUDE SEEKING
25 AFFORDABLE HOUSING RESOURCES AND SUPPORTING ONGOING

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 INVESTMENTS IN CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING AND PROJECTS. AT
2 THE SEPTEMBER MEETING THE JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
3 SUPPORTED REVISING THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM TO CLARIFY THAT MTC
4 WILL LEAD LEGISLATION IN 2024 TO IMPROVE OUR ABILITY TO
5 COMMUNICATE WITH FASTRAK AND CLIPPER CUSTOMERS. THAT CHANGE IS
6 REFLECTED IN THE HANDOUT PROVIDED YESTERDAY, AND POSTED ON MTC
7 LEGISTAR, WHICH IS AN UPDATED FINAL JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM
8 DOCUMENT, ATTACHMENT A. AN UPDATED FINAL PROPOSED ADVOCACY
9 PROGRAM I'LL SHARE WITH YOU AS A HANDOUT AND POSTED ON THE WEB
10 SITE, THIS VERSION REFLECTS THE CHANGE POSTED BY THE
11 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE RELATING TO MTC PURSUING LEGISLATION
12 DURING THIS TWO-YEAR SESSION TO ENABLE BETTER COMMUNICATION
13 WITH TOLL FACILITY CUSTOMERS. AND THAT CHANGE WAS MADE TO ITEM
14 6B IN THE JOINT PLATFORM. SO, WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE
15 ADOPTION OF THE 2023 ADVOCACY PLATFORM AND ASK IS THERE A
16 SECOND?

17

18 **BELIA RAMOS:** SECOND, RAMOS.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** SECONDED BY VICE PRESIDENT RAMOS.
21 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COLLEAGUES, THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS OR
22 COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSED JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM? SUPERVISOR
23 SPERING?

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I FULLY SUPPORT THE
2 AGENDA. BUT I JUST WANTED TO, JUST SPEAK ABOUT THE ADVOCACY
3 FOR THIS FISCAL CLIFF THAT THE OPERATORS ARE FACING. I HOPE WE
4 AREN'T JUST PROMOTING THE ORGANIZATION TO TRANSIT OPERATORS.
5 WE REALLY HAVE TO TALK ABOUT THE PEOPLE THAT NEED THIS
6 SERVICE. AND, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A FULL SPECTRUM OF RESIDENTS
7 IN THE REGION THAT DEPEND ON TRANSIT. AND THEY'RE THE REAL
8 LOSERS IF WE DON'T FIND MONEY FOR THIS FISCAL CLIFF. AND WE
9 HAVE A LOT OF LEGISLATORS WHO JUST DON'T LIKE TRANSIT. SO I
10 DON'T THINK WE SHOULD MAKE IT ABOUT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS. WE
11 SHOULD MAKE IT ABOUT TRANSIT RIDERS AND THE PEOPLE THAT REALLY
12 NEED THIS SERVICE. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

13

14 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THAT'S A REALLY EXCELLENT POINT,
15 SUPERVISOR SPERING. AND I APPRECIATE YOU EMPHASIZING THAT
16 POINT AND THAT SHOULD BE PART OF OUR MESSAGE AND ADVOCACY.
17 MAYOR YOUNG? FOLLOWED BY SUPERVISOR RABBIT.

18

19 **STEVE YOUNG:** THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO WHAT SUPERVISOR
20 SPERING SAID ABOUT THE NEED FOR SUPPORT TO TRANSIT AGENCIES
21 AND ALSO, I THINK IT'S IN THERE ALREADY, THE NEED FOR HOUSING
22 SUBSIDIES, PARTICULARLY FOR SMALLER CITIES WHO HAVE THE SAME
23 OBLIGATIONS TO BUILD, ZONE AND BUILD FOR HOUSING UNDER RHNA,
24 BUT DON'T HAVE ANY INTERNAL RESOURCES. DON'T HAVE
25 REDEVELOPMENT AGENCIES, DON'T HAVE HOUSING FUNDS AT ALL. AND

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 SO WHILE WE CAN AND WILL ZONE APPROPRIATELY TO ALLOW HOUSING,
2 WITHOUT SUBSIDIES, AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AT LEAST, IT'S NOT
3 GOING TO GET BUILT, AND I THINK THAT'S JUST A REALITY THAT THE
4 STATE HAS TO UNDERSTAND. AND REALLY NEEDS TO STEP FORWARD WITH
5 SUPPORT IF THEY'RE GOING TO RELY ON CITIES TO CARRY OUT THESE
6 STATE LEVEL MANDATES. AND ON THE ISSUE OF MANDATES, I THINK,
7 YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD CERTAINLY BE TALKING ABOUT LIMITATIONS ON
8 UNFUNDED MANDATES THAT ARE COMING DOWN. ONE, OF COURSE, BEING
9 THE MOST RECENT ONE BEING THE REQUIREMENT FOR RECYCLING OF
10 ORGANIC WASTE THAT PUTS, WELL, A GOOD IDEA, AS IS THE HOUSING
11 STUFF, IT PUTS THE COST ON THE OBLIGATIONS ON LOCAL
12 GOVERNMENTS AND THEIR CUSTOMERS TO PAY FOR THESE NEW PROGRAMS
13 AND OFTENTIMES THE RATEPAYERS ARE OFTEN IN THE DARK AS TO WHY
14 THEIR RATES ARE GOING TO GO UP. AND LAST, I'LL BE OPPOSING THE
15 STATE CHAMBER OF COMMERCE AND THE BUSINESS REFERENDUM TO MAKE
16 ALL FEES OF ANY SORT SUBJECT TO VOTER APPROVAL IT LOOKS LIKE
17 IT'S GOING QUALIFY FOR THE '24 BALLOT AND IT WOULD BE
18 DEVASTATING TO IMPROVE FINANCES ACROSS THE BOARD. SO I YOU
19 THINK ABAG OUGHT TO BE INVOLVED IF NOT LEADING A CHARGE TO
20 OPPOSE THAT MEASURE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THANK YOU. ON THAT LAST POINT,
23 GEORGIA, YOU KNOW, IF THE MEASURE DOES QUALIFY, YOU KNOW, WE
24 HAVE TAKEN POSITIONS ON STATE BALLOT MEASURES BEFORE, AND WE

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 COULD CERTAINLY BRING THAT TO ABAG AND MTC TO TAKE A POSITION,
2 IN OPPOSITION TO THAT.

3

4 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THIS IS GEORGIA DOHRMANN, ABAG STAFF.
5 YES WE HAVE TAKEN POSITIONS ON BALLOT MEASURES BEFORE AND WE
6 TYPICALLY TAKE POSITIONS, YOU KNOW, I THINK IF WE'RE LOOKING
7 AT SOMETHING FOR THE 2024 BALLOT WE WOULD PROBABLY CONSIDER
8 BRINGING THAT NEXT YEAR, IN 2024.

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OKAY. WE'LL GO
11 NEXT TO SUPERVISOR RABBIT FOLLOWED BY COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT. I JUST WANT TO
14 REITERATE, AGAIN, WHAT SUPERVISOR SPERING HAD MENTIONED
15 REGARDING THAT FISCAL CLIFF ON THE TRANSIT AGENCY SIDE OF
16 THINGS. I MEAN, WE HAVE, WHAT? 27 DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES
17 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND EACH AND EVERY ONE SERVES OUR
18 COMMUNITIES MANY MULTIPLE SERVING THE COMMUNITIES AND IT'S THE
19 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP THAT WILL SUFFER THE MOST. IF YOU DO A
20 SURVEY AND ASK, IT'S MORE TRIPS MORE OFTEN QUICKER EXPRESS
21 ROUTES AND GET TO PLACES MORE OFTEN OF COURSE THAT MEANS
22 ADDITIONAL SERVICES THAT THE NUMBERS AREN'T QUITE SUPPORTING
23 AT PRESENT. AND TYPICALLY LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE DOING
24 BETTER THAN THE COMMUTE FOCUSED OPERATORS WHICH AGAIN GOES TO
25 THAT TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERSHIP MODE. TRUTH IS, DOWNTOWN SAN

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 FRANCISCO, IS, WHAT? SUFFERING THROUGH A 25% OFFICE VACANCY
2 RATE RIGHT NOW AND THAT DOES INCLUDE ON TOP OF THAT WE SHOULD
3 INCLUDE THE TELECOMMUTE STRUGGLES THAT ARE ONGOING WHERE
4 PEOPLE AREN'T COMING INTO THE CITY EACH AND EVERY DAY. THAT'S
5 24 MILLION SQUARE FEET OF UNLEASED OFFICE SPACE IN DOWNTOWN
6 SAN FRANCISCO ALONE. I BELIEVE WE NEED AS BAY AREA NEED TO
7 HELP SAN FRANCISCO FIX THAT PROBLEM. AND HAVE THAT IN OUR
8 SITES AND YOU CAN'T DO TRANSPORTATION PLANNING WITH RED INK ON
9 THE HORIZON AND I HAD MY MEETING THIS MORNING WITH THE GOLDEN
10 GATE TRANSIT, ON OUR COMMITTEE MEETINGS CHAIR OF SMART, AND WE
11 ALL SUFFER THE SAME WAY LOOKING OVER THE HORIZON IS REALLY
12 DIFFICULT PLANNING REALLY DIFFICULT WHEN THERE IS FISCAL CLIFF
13 OR RED INK, AND WE TALKED ABOUT THE UNALLOCATED CAP-AND-TRADE
14 DOLLARS TO HAVE A SMOOTH PERIOD FOR FIVE YEARS AND BECAUSE
15 SOON THE AGENCIES WILL BE GETTING TO THE BOTTOM OF THOSE
16 DOLLARS THAT WERE ALLOCATED THROUGH THE FEDERAL PANDEMIC
17 RELIEF FUNDS. I CAN'T EXPRESS ENOUGH APPRECIATION OF ALL THE
18 WORK THAT ABAG AND MTC HAS DONE IN REGARD TO THAT. THANK YOU.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** FLIGOR?

21

22 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, I WANT TO START BY
23 THANKING THE GROUP THAT PUT TOGETHER THE 2023 PROGRAM. I THINK
24 IT REFLECTS THE CONCERNS WE HAVE BEEN HEARING FROM OUR
25 DIFFERENT CITIES. KUDOS. GREAT JOB. I WANT TO SUPPORT THE

31

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 SENTIMENTS OF DIRECTOR YOUNG WITH REGARDS TO THE MANDATES THAT
2 ARE COMING FROM SACRAMENTO. YOU KNOW, WE DO KNOW THAT THEY'RE
3 FORECASTING A DEFICIT FOR 2023, AND, SO, TO THE EXTENT, YOU
4 KNOW, THERE WON'T BE FUNDS TO SUPPORT THE MANDATES THAT ARE
5 IMPOSED ON LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. I REALLY APPRECIATE THE
6 ADVOCACY WORK THERE WHERE WE HAVE THE MESSAGE BE CLEAR THAT,
7 TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE THAT, WE SHOULD DELAY SOME OF THESE
8 MANDATES AS WE'RE NOT ABLE TO FUND THEM. AND THE LAST THING I
9 WANTED TO THANK YOU, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, I WAS VERY HAPPY TO
10 SEE THAT ADDED TO THE PROGRAM IS THE PROVISION RECOMMENDING
11 SUPPORT FOR LEGISLATION TO ENABLE HCD TO PROVIDE AN EXTENSION
12 TO THE DEADLINE FOR CERTIFYING HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATES. OF
13 COURSE, IF IT'S DETERMINED TO BE JUSTIFIED, I KNOW WE HAD
14 TALKED ABOUT THAT, AND SO I WAS VERY HAPPY TO SEE THAT. SO
15 THANK YOU FOR INCORPORATING THAT.

16

17 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU. ARE THERE
18 ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE
19 BOARD ON THE JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM? IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR
20 HAND. OKAY. I DO NOT SEE ANY ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS. SO WE'LL
21 PROCEED TO PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
22 WHO WISHES TO GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? OR ARE THERE
23 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** OKAY. I'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE
6 EXECUTIVE BOARD AND ASK IF THERE ARE ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS OR
7 COMMENTS? OKAY. IF NOT, WE DO HAVE A MOTION WHICH IS TO
8 APPROVE THE 2023 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK
9 THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY ARREGUIN, SECOND BY -- I'M SORRY
12 -- WAS IT RAMOS? I BELIEVE SO. YES. VICE MAYOR ADAMS?

13

14 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN?

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR ARREGUIN?

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO BAS?

25

33

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR BREED IS ABSENT? MAYOR BUTT?

4

5 **TOM BUTT:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EKLUND?

8

9 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ESPARZA?

12

13 **MAYA ESPARZA:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIFE?

16

17 **CARROLL FIFE:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLIGOR?

20

21 **NEYSA FLIGOR:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GARCIA?

24

25 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

34

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAUBERT IS ABSENT. HUDSON IN.

3

4 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
7 MANDELMAN? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MAR? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER
8 MARTINEZ BELTRAN?

9

10 **YVONNE MARTINEZ BELTRAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MILEY?

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

17

18 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MOULTON PETERS? IS ABSENT.
21 COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

35

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO?

5

6 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR SPERING?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER TAYLOR? IS ABSENT. MAYOR

13 YOUNG?

14

15 **STEVE YOUNG:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER FOLLY? FOLLOW.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROGERS?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES.

24

DECEMBER 15, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, PRESIDENT:** THAT COMPLETES ITEM SEVEN. THAT
5 BRINGS US TO ITEM EIGHT, ADJOURNMENT. I WOULD LIKE TO NOW ASK
6 THAT WE ADJOURN OUR MEETINGS IN HONOR OF OUR DEPARTING
7 COLLEAGUES INCLUDING SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF. THE NEXT MEETING OF
8 THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD IS ON JANUARY 19TH, 2023. WITH THAT,
9 THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

10



NTT

Broadcasting Government