

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 28, 2026, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANYBODY LEFT IN THE BACK ROOM, PLEASE COME
6 OUT. WE WANT TO GET STARTED. I DON'T KNOW WHO IS BACK THERE.
7 WE WILL GET STARTED. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS
8 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS
9 MEETING IS BEING WEBCASTED ON THE MTC WEBSITE. REMOTE
10 PARTICIPANTS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND
11 FEATURE OR DIAL *9 AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
12 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
13 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL
14 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE
15 CALL THE ROLL CALL.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOOD MORNING. CHAIR NOACK.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AMBUEHL IS ABSENT.

9 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

14 COMMISSIONER BURT.

15

16 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

19

20 **NOELIA CORZO:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

23

24 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING IS
2 ONLINE, REMOTE. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER, I SEE YOU THERE. JUST
3 ONE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE, COMMISSIONER LEE,
4 COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER
5 MANFREE, COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

6

7 **MITCH MASHBURN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

10

11 **MYRNA MELGAR:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

18

19 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE FROM 1195 THIRD STREET IN NAPA. THERE IS NO
20 ONE IN THE ROOM WITH ME.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
23 SCHAAF IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, FOR ALL THOSE WHO ARE ABLE,



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 PLEASE STAND AND JOIN ME FOR THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. I
2 PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
3 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
4 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL. WILL THE CLERK
5 PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I'M MAKING THE
8 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD WILL BE
9 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH,
10 PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A
11 MEETING WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ITEM 4 IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT. I
14 WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME OUR NEWEST MEMBER OF THE COMMISSION,
15 SUPERVISOR CORZO. WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE SOME REMARKS?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY, I'M VERY EXCITED TO SERVE ON THIS BODY.
18 AS YOU STATED, I'M NOELIA CORZO. I GREW UP IN SAN MATEO, WHICH
19 I PROUDLY REPRESENT IN MY DISTRICT. I GREW UP IN A
20 HISTORICALLY UNDERSERVED COMMUNITY, THE SAN MATEO NEIGHBORHOOD
21 AND I GREW UP RELYING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT AND MY SON AND MY
22 FATHER CONTINUE TO USE TRANSIT EVERY SINGLE DAY. I AM ALSO
23 VERY PASSIONATE ABOUT AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND INCLUSIONARY
24 HOUSING AND FOR ME, HAVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING WAS ACTUALLY
25 ESSENTIAL TO ME RUNNING FOR COUNTY SUPERVISOR AND THEN WINNING



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 MY ELECTION. AS A SINGLE MOM WHO WAS A NON-PROFIT SOCIAL
2 WORKER FOR MANY YEARS, I KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE TO LIVE IN OUR
3 BEAUTIFUL BAY AREA AND RECOGNIZE THAT IT'S A SACRIFICE TO STAY
4 IN THIS COMMUNITY BECAUSE ECONOMIC DECISIONS HAVE TO BE MADE
5 AND THEY'RE NOT EASY ONES. I SHARE THIS BECAUSE IT IS
6 IMPORTANT FOR ME THAT MY LIVED EXPERIENCE BE AT THE TABLE WITH
7 ME WHEN I AM MAKING POLICY DECISIONS AND THAT I ADVOCATE FOR
8 CENTERING THE NEEDS OF OUR MOST VULNERABLE AND IMPACTED
9 RESIDENTS. SO, I ALSO HAVE A PRIORITY OF EXPANDING HOUSING
10 OPPORTUNITIES NEAR TRANSIT, FUNDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND
11 PROTECTING TENANTS. I TELL FOLKS THAT I BELIEVE WE WORK BETTER
12 TOGETHER AS A REGION AND THAT WE MUST THINK ABOUT YOU KNOW,
13 DOING WORK LOCALLY, BUT THINKING GLOBALLY AND REGIONALLY. SO,
14 I AM EXCITED TO WORK ON THIS COMMISSION AND TO BE IN THE WORK
15 WITH YOU ALL. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU AND WELCOME. I BELIEVE I AM GOING
18 TO SKIP 4A? YEP. WE'RE GOING TO GO TO 4B, I'LL COME BACK TO
19 4A. SO AGENDA ITEM 4B IS A RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR
20 DAVID CANEPA ON HIS DEPARTURE FROM MTC. DAVID IS STEPPING DOWN
21 FROM DYNAMIC SERVICE REPRESENTING THE PEOPLE OF SAN MATEO
22 COUNTY IN THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. I WILL REFRAIN FROM
23 READING THE WHOLE RESOLUTION BUT I WANTED TO UNDERSCORE HIS
24 IMPACT ON THE COMMISSION OVER THE YEARS. DAVID PRESIDED AS
25 CHAIR OF THE JOINT MTC-ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND SERVED



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AS PART OF THE BATA REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEES AND
2 HE SERVED WITH DISTINCTION AS A MEMBER OF A REVENUE MEASURE
3 SELECT COMMITTEE THAT IN 2024, BROUGHT ELECTED OFFICIALS
4 TOGETHER WITH LABOR GROUPS, BUSINESS INTEREST, AND
5 TRANSPORTATION ADVOCATES TO EXPLORE OPTIONS, REFINE DETAILS,
6 AND BUILD CONSENSUS ON THE EXPENDITURE PLANS TO AUTHORIZE BAY
7 AREA VOTERS CONSIDERATION OF A 2026 TAX MEASURE TO PRESERVE
8 AND ENHANCE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN THE REGION. WHEREAS DAVID
9 LAST YEAR GUIDED DEVELOPMENT OF THE CONNECT BAY AREA ACT,
10 HELPING TO NAVIGATE ITS PASSAGE THROUGH THE HEARINGS AND
11 AMENDMENTS, PROCESS AND FLOOR VOTES BEFORE THE BILL WAS SIGNED
12 INTO LAW. WHEREAS DAVID THROUGHOUT HIS TIME AT MTC
13 THOUGHTFULLY BALANCED REGIONAL LEADERSHIP WITH LOCAL ADVOCACY,
14 CHAMPIONED EFFORTS TO BRING NEXT GENERATION FARE GATES AND
15 FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS TO SAN MATEO COUNTY, BART STATIONS, AND A
16 POWERFUL PROPONENT OF CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION, UPGRADING THE
17 101 INTERCHANGE, EXPANSION OF THE BAY WHEELS BIKE SHARE
18 SERVICE TO HIS LONG TIME HOMETOWN OF DAILY CITY, AS WELL AS
19 TRANSIT UPGRADES IN THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR. STAFF AND
20 COMMISSIONERS OF MTC THANK DAVID FOR HIS CONTRIBUTIONS ON
21 BEHALF OF THE RESIDENTS, BUSINESSES, AND WORKERS OF SAN MATEO
22 COUNTY AND THE GREATER BAY AREA. APPRECIATE THAT HIS PASSION
23 FOR TRANSPORTATION IS MATCHED BY HIS COMMITMENT TO BEING A
24 GOOD DAD, HIS ADVOCACY FOR HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, HEALTH AND
25 WELLNESS, ECONOMIC GROWTH, AND ENVIRONMENTAL STEWARDSHIP. I



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 LOOK FORWARD TO HIS CONTINUED PARTNERSHIP IN A NEVER-ENDING
2 QUEST TO MAKE THE BAY AREA MORE CONNECTED, AFFORDABLE,
3 DIVERSE, AND RESILIENT. MTC'S WEDNESDAY COMMISSION MEETINGS
4 FOR THURSDAY MEETING WITH THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. DAVID, DO
5 YOU HAVE ANY PARTING WORDS FOR YOUR COLLEAGUES?

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANTED TO
8 RECOGNIZE THIS BOARD. YOU HAVE DONE SUCH A TREMENDOUS JOB. I
9 HAVE KNOWN MANY OF YOU FOR MANY YEARS, AND WITH ALL THESE BIG
10 ISSUES MOVING FORWARD, ESPECIALLY AROUND TRANSIT. YOU HAVE
11 BEEN CHAMPIONS. I WANT TO THANK YOU IN PARTICULAR FOR YOUR
12 LEADERSHIP, YOUR HARD WORK, YOUR EFFORT WORKING NON-STOP TO
13 BRING PEOPLE TOGETHER. I THINK WITH YOU AND STEPHANIE AND THE
14 VICE CHAIR, YOU GUYS HAVE JUST DONE AN AMAZING JOB PUSHING
15 ISSUES FORWARD AND BASICALLY AT THE END OF THE DAY, SAVING
16 TRANSIT. SO I REALLY WANT TO RECOGNIZE THE LEADERSHIP AND THEN
17 FINALLY, I WANT TO RECOGNIZE OUR COUNSEL. THANK YOU FOR ALL
18 THE WONDERFUL WORK YOU HAVE DONE IN CHAMPIONING THIS. I THANK
19 THE MTC ON BALANCE, I SAID THIS NUMEROUS TIMES, THIS IS MY
20 18th YEAR AS AN ELECTED OFFICIAL AND HOPEFULLY AFTER THIS
21 ELECTION, IT WILL BE 20 MORE. I SAY THAT LAUGHING BUT REALLY,
22 THIS STAFF IS JUST AMAZING. I THINK ABOUT MATT. I THINK OF
23 SHARICE. I THINK ABOUT WHAT THEY HAVE DONE ON A PROFESSIONAL
24 LEVEL. THEIR PROFESSIONALISM IS SECOND TO NONE SO FINALLY I
25 WANT TO RECOGNIZE TWO PEOPLE THAT I THINK HAD A PROFOUND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 IMPACT, ANDY AND ALEX. SAN MATEO COUNTY IS THE EASIEST COUNTY
2 AS ANDY ALWAYS SAID, BUT AS MENTIONED THROUGH YOUR RESOLUTION,
3 THE ABILITY TO DELIVER FOR THE REGION BUT FOR OUR COUNTY IS
4 NOT FORGOTTEN. I'LL JUST SHARE WITH YOU AN ANDY AND ALEX
5 STORY. THERE WAS A LITTLE TENSION BETWEEN BART AND SAN MATEO
6 COUNTY ON THE STATIONS. THEY ARE WORKING WITH MICHAEL JONES
7 BUT YOUR LEADERSHIP WITH SETTING UP MEETINGS WITH OUR COUNTY
8 EXECUTIVES AND MEETINGS WITH A LOT OF PEOPLE, THAT
9 RELATIONSHIP WAS RESET AND THAT RELATIONSHIP IS THRIVING.
10 FINALLY AS I CLOSE, I WILL JUST SAY THIS. OUR CLERKS, OUR
11 CLERKS AND KIM, GIVE IT UP FOR OUR CLERKS. [APPLAUSE].

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** NOW, I AM GOING TO GET IN TROUBLE HERE. WE HAVE
14 KIM, MARTA, MARCY, FRED, AND BRITTANY. THE MTC STAFF IS JUST
15 AMAZING. KIM, I REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING. YOU
16 HAVE DONE AN AMAZING JOB AND YOU STAFFED ALL OF US INCREDIBLY
17 WELL AND WITH THAT, I SAY GOODBYE BUT I WILL SEE YOU AT THE
18 NEXT ABAG MEETING. I WILL SEE YOU IN MARCH. WITH THAT, I THANK
19 YOU AND I WISH YOU THE BEST ON THE TOC. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
20 [APPLAUSE].

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, DON'T GO TOO FAR. I NEED A MOTION AND
23 A SECOND TO PASS THE RESOLUTION.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** AND REBECCA AND GEORGIA.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I 'LL MOVE IT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I 'LL SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY WANT TO MAKE ANY
7 COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER CORZO.

8

9 **NOELIA CORZO:** THANK YOU, I WANTED TO RECOGNIZE COMMISSIONER
10 CANEPA FOR ALL HIS YEARS REPRESENTING OUR COUNTY AND BEING A
11 STRONG ADVOCATE FOR OUR COUNTY JOINING SB63 AND MANY OTHER
12 INITIATIVES OVER THE YEARS. I WILL SEE YOU ALL THE TIME, SO I
13 AM NOT SAYING GOODBYE BUT SEE YOU LATER.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

16

17 **MYRNA MELGAR:** SO DAVID, YOU HAVE BEEN AN AMAZING COWORKER. I
18 JUST LIKE TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT DISTRICT 7 IN SAN FRANCISCO
19 COUNTY SHARES A LONGER BORDER THAN DISTRICT 5 IN SAN MATEO
20 COUNTY THAN SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY AND WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF
21 THINGS TOGETHER. I HAVE ALWAYS APPRECIATED YOUR KNOWLEDGE AND
22 YOUR EMOTIONAL INTELLIGENCE AND YOUR DEEP COMMITMENT TO
23 SERVING THE PEOPLE AND DOING IT THE RIGHT WAY. I WILL MISS YOU
24 ON THIS BODY, BUT WE WILL WORK WITH YOU IN MANY OTHER WAYS.
25 THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMITMENT TO REGIONALISM AND KEEP DOING



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 WHAT YOU'RE DOING BECAUSE YOU HAVE BEEN DOING GREAT.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, I WANTED TO THANK DAVID. I THINK
6 WE STARTED TOGETHER ON THE AIR DISTRICT AND HE AND I AND I
7 THINK JOHN WERE THE YOUNGEST IN THE COMMISSION AT THAT TIME SO
8 WE SORT OF BONDED AND THEN ALSO TO JOIN UP HERE AT MTC, IT'S
9 BEEN A PLEASURE TO WORK WITH YOU AND CALTRAIN AS WELL, AND AS
10 A SAN MATEO HOMETOWN GIRL, I APPRECIATE HOW YOU REPRESENT SAN
11 MATEO COUNTY AND THE PARTNERSHIP WITH US ON SANTA CLARA
12 COUNTY, AND YOUR SENSE OF REGIONALISM. I JUST WANT TO THANK
13 YOU BECAUSE I HAVE ALWAYS FELT THAT YOU'VE HEARD EVERYONE,
14 INCLUDING ME, AND YOUR INTEREST AND CONCERN OF EVERYONE'S
15 OPINIONS AND INPUT IS REALLY VALUABLE AND THAT REALLY HAS LED
16 TO OUR ABILITY TO WORK TOGETHER COLLABORATIVELY. SO, LOVE YOUR
17 SENSE OF HUMOR AND YOUR ENERGY AND I WILL DEFINITELY MISS YOU
18 HERE BUT I WISH YOU ALL THE BEST AND I AM SURE THAT OUR PATHS
19 WILL CROSS. SO GOOD LUCK TO YOU ON EVERYTHING. THANKS SO MUCH.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MILEY.

22

23 **NATE MILEY:** DAVID, WE'RE GOING TO MISS YOU. LIKE MARGARET
24 SAID, WE WERE ON THE AIR BOARD TOGETHER AND YOU KNOW, YOU CAME
25 OVER HERE, SO EVENTUALLY YOU BROUGHT ME OVER HERE AND NOW YOU



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ARE LEAVING, HAGERTY IS GONE, SO SORRY I DIDN'T GET TO HANG
2 OUT WITH YOU IN SAN MATEO. THEY KEEP ME SO BUSY IN ALAMEDA
3 COUNTY BUT MAYBE I'LL GET OVER THERE IN SOME POINT. BEST OF
4 LUCK IN THE FUTURE WITH YOUR CANDIDACY. I APPRECIATE YOU MY
5 FRIEND.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** DAVID. I APPRECIATE THE OPENNESS, THE WORKING
8 TOGETHER, THE WORKING WITH THE CITIES. YOU HAVE BEEN GREAT AND
9 ALWAYS ENTERTAINING, I GOT TO SAY. IT'S BEEN A REAL JOY
10 WORKING TOGETHER HERE AND SO MUCH HAS BEEN ACCOMPLISHED. YOU
11 ARE THE EVER READY BUNNY AS FAR AS BEING EVERYTHING AND REALLY
12 REACHING OUT AND LISTENING TO PEOPLE. SO, I THINK THAT REALLY
13 IS YOUR GREATEST SKILL MOVING FORWARD HERE TOO. SO, THANK YOU
14 VERY MUCH, REALLY FOR KEEPING THE LINES OF COMMUNICATION
15 ALWAYS OPEN. WE HAVE ALWAYS HAD THAT AND THAT IS WHAT MAKES A
16 DIFFERENCE IN STRENGTHENING THE REPRESENTATION AND ALSO WITH
17 THIS BODY. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK AND
18 EFFORT AND CARPOOLING WORKS GOOD. THANKS.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** VICE CHAIR.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH, DAVID THANK YOU FOR
23 THE WARM WELCOME YOU EXTENDED TO ALL OF US AS WE JOINED MTC. I
24 AGREE WITH EVERYTHING THAT HAS BEEN SAID. YOU ARE SOMEONE THAT
25 REALLY KEEPS THE COMMUNICATION OPEN. YOU ARE ALSO A SEASONED



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ELECTED WHO CAN SEE THE FOREST AND THE TREES AND NOT EVERYBODY
2 CAN DO THAT. YOU FIND A WAY TO FORGE CONSENSUS AND COMMON
3 GROUND, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT IN YOU AND YOUR SENSE OF
4 HUMOR, FANTASTIC. GOOD LUCK AND DON'T BE A STRANGER. WE'LL SEE
5 YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I AM JUST GOING TO MAKE A QUICK COMMENT
8 BECAUSE I AGREE WITH EVERYBODY HERE. I CAN ALWAYS COUNT ON
9 DAVID IF MY PHONE RANG EARLY IN THE MORNING, BEFORE I GET IN
10 THE SHOWER, I KNOW WHO IT WAS. IT WAS DAVID. YOU'LL HAVE TO DO
11 THAT EVERY ONCE IN A WHILE, TO KEEP ME ON MY TOES SO I
12 APPRECIATE THAT. WE STILL NEED A LUNCH OR DINNER AT ORIGINAL
13 JOE'S. SO WE HAVE TO FOLLOW UP ON THAT AND I KNOW WE WILL STAY
14 IN TOUCH, SO I APPRECIATE THAT. ANYBODY ELSE OR WE WILL GO FOR
15 A VOTE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BEFORE WE DO THAT, PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH PUBLIC COMMENT, SORRY.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOW MUCH TIME?

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK ONE MINUTE. HOW MUCH TIME DO YOU
24 NEED TO THINK DAVID?

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY, ONE MINUTE IT IS AND WE'LL CALL UPON
2 ALETA DUPREE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS HARD. I DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT THIS DEPARTURE
5 UNTIL I READ THE AGENDA. I WISH I COULD BE IN THE ROOM WITH
6 YOU ALL TODAY. I HAVEN'T BEEN TO THE BAY AREA SINCE OCTOBER.
7 YES, I REALLY WISH I WAS IN THE ROOM WITH YOU AND I AM VERY
8 FORTUNATE TO KNOW DAVID. BACK IN SEPTEMBER, DAVID AND I GOT TO
9 HAVE A VISIT AT HIS OFFICE IN THAT NICE NEW BUILDING IN
10 REDWOOD CITY. WE SHARED STORIES. WE COME FROM DIFFERENT
11 PLACES, BUT WE HAVE MUCH IN COMMON. I WILL SHARE ABOUT MY 55
12 YEARS OF NEW YORK SUBWAY EXPERIENCE AND MY MANY TIMES IN GRAND
13 CENTRAL TERMINAL, WHICH SOME OF YOU HAVE TOLD ME YOU GOTTEN TO
14 SEE. MAYBE I SHOULD WRITE YOU A LETTER. DAVID, I WISH YOU
15 WELL, THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
18 HANDS MADAM CHAIR.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, CAN WE HAVE A VOTE THEN PLEASE?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER MASHBURN,
23 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER LEE, CHAIR NOACK, YES, VICE CHAIR
24 MOULTON-PETERS, YES, COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, AYE, COMMISSIONER
25 AHN, AYE, COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, AYE, COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ABSENT, COMMISSIONER BURT, YES, CORE, YES, COMMISSIONER
2 FLEMING, YES, COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE, AYE, COMMISSIONER
3 LEE, AYE, COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT, COMMISSIONER MANFREE,
4 AYE, COMMISSIONER MASHBURN, AYE, TECHNICAL GLITCH,
5 COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN,
6 YES, COMMISSIONER RAMOS, YES. THANK YOU, THE MOTION PASSES
7 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IF YOU WANT TO STAY THERE.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. [APPLAUSE]

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO ITEM 4C, MTC
14 RESOLUTION 4746, A RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION AND IN MEMORY OF
15 PETER LEE. THOSE OF YOU WHO WERE PRESENT AT LAST MONTH'S
16 MEETING AT THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY, WE RECALL COMMISSIONER
17 RAMOS'S COMMENTS ABOUT RECENT PASSING OF PETER LEE AND THAT
18 MEETING'S ADJOURNMENT IN PETER LEE'S MEMORY. TO REMEMBER HIS
19 LONG AND DISTINGUISHED CAREER, I WANT TO MAKE SURE A FEW
20 SECTIONS ARE ENTERED INTO THE PUBLIC RECORD. I UNDERSTAND THAT
21 PETER AND ASHLEY'S CHILDREN, OLIVIA IS HERE AND I THINK
22 MATTHEW IS AT SCHOOL AND OTHER FAMILY MEMBERS, ANDREW, ANNA,
23 AND I DON'T KNOW IF DIANE -- SHE IS NOT HERE, OKAY. AFTER I
24 READ SECTIONS FROM THE RESOLUTION, THE COMMISSION VOTES, I
25 WILL INVITE YOU UP TO PRESENT THE FRAMED RESOLUTION TO YOU AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 FOR A PHOTO. THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WERE
2 GRACED BY PETER LEE'S ENGINEERING EXPERTISE, PROBLEM-SOLVING
3 PROWESS, AND GENUINE KINDNESS. OVER HIS CAREER, HE BECAME
4 ASSOCIATED WITH MTC TOLL BRIDGE PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRAIN, AND
5 THE SCALE AND COMPLEXITY OF THE VARIOUS TOLL BRIDGE PROJECTS
6 WHICH HE WORKED INEVITABLY PROVIDED CHALLENGES. HE FACED
7 DIFFICULTIES WITH A CALM, THOROUGH, PROFESSIONAL AND
8 SOLUTIONS-ORIENTED APPROACH. HE CAPITALIZED ON THE STRENGTHS
9 OF EACH TEAM MEMBER TO KEEP THE PROJECTS MOVING FORWARD. PETER
10 WAS AMONG A SMALL NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT MADE THE PARTNERSHIP
11 WORK EACH DAY, STEADILY BUILDING MOMENTUM FOR THE SUCCESSFUL
12 COMPLETION OF THE REGIONAL MEASURE 1 PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND
13 THE RETROFIT PROGRAM, AND THE ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM, WHICH
14 THE AGENCIES WORKED TOGETHER TO ASSURE COST-EFFECTIVE LONG-
15 TERM MANAGEMENT AND INVESTMENTS IN THE STATE-OWNED BRIDGES.
16 WHEREAS THROUGH CONSISTENT COLLABORATION WITH CALTRAIN, HE
17 STRENGTHENED THE BONDS OF TRUST FOR THE NEXT GENERATION OF
18 TOLLBOOTH IMPROVEMENTS, INCLUDING THE MAINTENANCE AND
19 REHABILITATION PROJECTS IDENTIFY IN THE TOLL BRIDGE CAPITAL
20 IMPROVEMENT PLAN AND PREPARATION FOR THE NEXT GENERATION WAS A
21 REOCCURRING THEME OF PETER'S CAREER, WHICH HE ENGRAINED IN HIS
22 STAFF THE NEED TO FUTURE PROOF THE BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE
23 WITH AN EMPHASIS ON SAFETY, RECRUITED, HIRED AND CULTIVATED
24 THE TOWN SO THE DEDICATED AND DYNAMIC TEAM OF YOUNGER
25 OFFICIALS, AND SUPPORTED HIS STAFF'S PROFESSIONAL AND PERSONAL



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 GOALS. WHEREAS ENORMOUSLY PROUD OF HIS WIFE ASHLEY'S CHILDREN,
2 MATTHEW AND OLIVIA, PETER'S JUGGLING OF PROFESSIONAL AND
3 PATERNAL RESPONSIBILITIES MADE CLEAR THAT THE NEXT
4 GENERATION'S WELLBEING WAS PRIORITY ONE AT HOME, AS WELL AS ON
5 THE JOB, PERHAPS BEST EVIDENCE IN THE MANY CALLS AND ZOOM
6 MEETINGS HE TOOK BEHIND THE WHEEL OF AN AUTOMOBILE,
7 CHAUFFEURING FAMILY MEMBERS TO APPOINTMENTS. PETER IS
8 REMEMBERED BY HIS COLLEAGUES AS MUCH FOR HIS HUMOR, HUMILITY,
9 COMPASSION, BOOMING VOICE, HEARTY LAUGH, AND EVER PRESENT CUP
10 OF COFFEE OR CAN OF SODA, AND PROBLEM-SOLVING CAPABILITY, NOW
11 THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THE STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS OF
12 MTC HONOR PETER'S LIFE AND LEGACY, EXPRESSED DEEP GRATITUDE
13 FOR HIS ENDURING WORK ON BEHALF OF THE PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA
14 AND ALL OF CALIFORNIA AND JOIN ASHLEY, MATTHEW, OLIVIA, AND
15 ALL OF PETER'S FAMILY IN MOURNING HIS PASSING WHILE ALSO
16 CELEBRATING HIS MEMORY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND FOR THAT
17 RESOLUTION?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY SPEAKER WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A COMMENT AT
24 THIS TIME? OKAY, ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND
2 THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.
3

4 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** CAN I SAY SOMETHING? I JUST WANTED TO SAY
5 THAT I HAVE KNOWN PETER FOR A VERY, VERY LONG TIME IN HIS ROLE
6 AT MTC AND BAHFA. HE IS SUCH A SWEET, SWEET MAN. I ENJOYED
7 EVERY TIME I BUMPED INTO HIM OR HAD ANY INTERACTION WITH HIM.
8 HE IS SUCH A WONDERFUL GUY. HIS SENSE OF HUMOR WAS AMAZING. I
9 AM THANKFUL THAT I HAD THE CHANCE TO SEE HIM EARLIER THIS YEAR
10 DURING THE DISABILITY SUMMIT AND I THINK IT WAS DURING THE
11 DISABILITY SUMMIT AND IT MAY HAVE BEEN THE ENDING OF THE
12 CELEBRATION OF THE INTERNS AS THEY ENDED THEIR TIME WITH US.
13 ASHLEY, I LOVE YOU AND I WISH YOU ALL THE BEST. PETER WAS AN
14 AMAZING GUY. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS DOREEN. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CONDUCT
17 A ROLL CALL VOTE?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN,
20 SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS, CHAIR NOACK.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

8

9 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, COMMISSIONER

12 ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER BURT.

13

14 **PAT BURT:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

17

18 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

21

22 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT AT

25 THE MOMENT. EXCUSE ME, JUST ONE MOMENT, PLEASE. COMMISSIONER



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 LEE, COMMISSIONER MAHAN, COMMISSIONER MANFREE, COMMISSIONER
2 MASHBURN.

3

4 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY,
7 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

12

13 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
16 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, I WOULD LIKE TO INVITE PETER'S FAMILY
19 TO THE DAIS TO ACCEPT THE RESOLUTION. WOULD EITHER ONE OF YOU
20 LIKE TO MAKE ANY COMMENTS? OLIVIA, WOULD YOU LIKE TO SPEAK?

21

22 **OLIVIA LEE:** THANK YOU FOR THE RESOLUTION. I KNOW THIS MEANT A
23 LOT TO MY DAD AND HE WAS VERY PROUD OF HIS WORK. THANK YOU.

24 [APPLAUSE].

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, WE WILL NOW MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 5,
2 WHICH IS A CLOSED SESSION. AGENDA 5A, CLERK WERE THERE ANY
3 ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AND IF
4 ANYONE IN THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE
5 RAISE HAND FEATURE AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A
6 LINE AT THE PODIUM.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
9 THIS ITEM AND NO RAISED HANDS IN ZOOM AND NO ONE HAS
10 APPROACHED THE PODIUM. IF I MAY CHAIR -- PARDON ME,
11 COMMISSIONER RAMOS AND COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, I SENT AN
12 INVITATION TO YOU WITH A DIAL IN FOR THE CLAREMONT CONFERENCE
13 ROOM, YOU CAN USE THAT NOW.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. CLOSED SESSION WITH LEGAL COUNSEL ON
16 ANTICIPATED LITIGATION, ANYTHING OF LITIGATION PURSUANT TO
17 PARAGRAPH 4 OF SUBDIVISION D OF SECTION 54956.9, ONE CASE AND
18 COMMISSIONERS, IF YOU WOULD JOIN ME IN THE CLAREMONT
19 CONFERENCE ROOM FOR THIS CLOSED SESSION. AT THE END OF THE
20 CLOSED SESSION, WE WILL RETURN TO THE BOARDROOM IN OPEN
21 SESSION. [CLOSED SESSION]

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, WE WILL RECONVENE. COMMISSION IS NOW
24 BACK IN SESSION. I WILL ASK OUR GENERAL COUNSEL TO REPORT OUT.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** YES, THANK YOU. SO THE COMMISSION MET
2 IN CLOSED SESSION. THERE WAS A UNANIMOUS VOTE BY ALL MEMBERS
3 PRESENT FOR INITIATION OF LITIGATION BECAUSE FURTHER
4 DISCLOSURE AT THIS POINT MAY INHIBIT OUR ABILITY TO PROSECUTE
5 THE ACTION OF WHAT I AM ABOUT TO SAY NOW UPON OFFICIAL AND
6 PUBLIC ACTION. FURTHER INFORMATION ABOUT THE CLOSED SESSION
7 WILL BE AVAILABLE FOR PUBLIC INQUIRY.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, NOW I WILL GO TO AGENDA ITEM 4A,
10 APPRECIATION FOR LONG TIME CHAIR RANDI KINMAN. WE RECOGNIZE,
11 SINCE 2007. FOR NEARLY TWO DECADES, RANDI HAS BEEN A VOICE FOR
12 THE COMMUNITY SHE REPRESENTS WHILE EMBRACING THE REGIONAL
13 PERSPECTIVE THAT DEFINES HER WORK. SHE SERVED MULTIPLE TERMS
14 AS CHAIR, GUIDING THE COUNCIL THROUGH COMPLEX POLICY
15 DECISIONS, WITH CLARITY, FAIRNESS, AND A DEEP COMMITMENT TO
16 EQUITY. SHE EXEMPLIFIES THE BALANCE WE STRIVE FOR AND KEEPING
17 SIGHT OF THE BROADER REGIONAL CHALLENGES WE FACE. HER WORK
18 CONSISTENTLY CENTERED EQUITY. SHE REMINDED US TIME AND TIME
19 AGAIN OF THE NEEDS OF STUDENTS, WORKING FAMILIES, OLDER
20 ADULTS, AND PEOPLE OF DISABILITIES. ONE OF RANDI'S ENDURING
21 LEGACIES IS HER INSISTENCE THAT YOUTH HAVE A SEAT AT THE
22 TABLE. WE CONSIDER THE NEW COUNCIL MEMBERSHIP, INCLUDING TWO
23 HIGH SCHOOL MEMBERS TO THIS COUNCIL, A TRUE REFLECTION OF
24 VISION AND ACTION. HER ADVOCACY HAS SPURRED THE RELAUNCH OF
25 THE SUMMARY ACADEMY AND ANNE COLLEGE MENTEE PROGRAM, NOW WITH



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OVER 500 ALUMNI SHAPING THE FUTURE OF PUBLIC POLICY AND PUBLIC
2 SERVICE IN THE BAY AREA. RANDI'S CONTRIBUTIONS HAVE LEFT A
3 LASTING MARK ON THIS COUNCIL AND ON MTC. ON BEHALF OF THE
4 COMMISSION, THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP, YOUR PASSION, AND
5 YOUR UNWAVERING DEDICATION TO MAKING THE BAY AREA A BETTER
6 PLACE FOR ALL. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER
7 ABE-KOGA FOR SOME ADDITIONAL REMARKS FOR RANDI.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR NOACK, IT'S MY PLEASURE TO
10 SHARE A FEW WORDS OF RANDI WHO I HAD A PLEASURE OF KNOWING FOR
11 A LONG TIME. SHE IS A FORCING TO RECKONED WITH IN SANTA CLARA
12 COUNTY. SHE HAS BEEN A STEADFAST VOLUNTEER LEADER IN SAN CLARA
13 COUNTY AND I WANT TO ENSURE THE COUNTY RECOGNIZES HER TIRELESS
14 ADVOCACY. AS MENTIONED, SHE HAS A CLEAR FOCUS ON THE NEXT
15 GENERATION AND FOSTERING YOUNG PEOPLE SO IN ADDITION TO THE
16 YEARS OF VOLUNTEER SERVICE, CHAIR NOACK JUST DESCRIBED, RANDI
17 AS SERVED AS A TRUSTEE OF THE WEST VALLEY MISSION COLLEGE
18 DISTRICT SINCE 2016, WHERE SHE BRINGS THE SAME EQUITY-FOCUSED
19 LENS SHE APPLIES TO HER WORK HERE AT MTC. SHE DEEPLY
20 UNDERSTANDS THAT FOR MANY COMMUNITY COLLEGE STUDENTS,
21 PARTICULARLY THOSE FROM LOW-INCOME FAMILIES, PUBLIC
22 TRANSPORTATION ISN'T A CONVENIENCE, IT'S THE DIFFERENCE
23 BETWEEN GETTING TO CLASS OR DROPPING OUT. HER WORK AT BOTH MTC
24 AND THE COLLEGE DISTRICT REFLECTS THAT UNDERSTANDING OF
25 TRANSIT AS A TRUE LIFELINE FOR MANY PEOPLE. RANDI HAS ALSO



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 BEEN A STRONG ADVOCATE AT THE NEIGHBORHOOD LEVEL THROUGH THE
2 SHERMAN OAKS NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION AND THE BURBANK DEL
3 MONTE NEIGHBORHOOD ADVISORY COMMITTEE, WORKING TO ENSURE THAT
4 REGIONAL POLICIES ACTUALLY WORK FOR THE PEOPLE LIVING IN THE
5 COMMUNITIES MOST IMPACTED BY THEM. ON BEHALF OF THE SANTA
6 CLARA COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS I'M PROUD TO PRESENT
7 ACCOMMODATION FROM THE COUNTY RECOGNIZING RANDI'S NEARLY 20
8 YEARS OF SERVICE TO MTC AND HER UNWAVERING BELIEVE THAT
9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS SHOULD SERVE EVERYONE. SO RANDI, THANK
10 YOU SO MUCH FOR LEADING WITH BOTH EXPERTISE AND HEART. THE
11 COMMUNITY COLLEGE STUDENTS THAT CAN GET TO CLASS, YOUR
12 NEIGHBORS, AND ALL OUR NEIGHBORS THAT HAVE A VOICE IN
13 PLANNING, AND THE TRANSIT RIDERS WHOSE NEEDS YOU CHAMPIONED
14 FOR SO MANY YEARS MAY NOT ALL KNOW YOUR NAME BUT THEY ALL
15 BENEFITTED FROM YOUR GREAT WORK. THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANK YOU,
16 CHAIR.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. RANDI, DO YOU HAVE SOME COMMENTS?
19 WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. IT'S A PLEASURE TO STAND HERE WITH
22 FRIENDS TODAY. I WAS NOT GOING TO TEAR UP UNTIL I SAW DOREEN
23 AND THAT KIND OF DID IT. OVER 50 YEARS AGO, I STARTED OFF
24 TRYING TO FORGE A NEW ME AS SOMEBODY WHO WORKED IN THE GARLIC
25 SHEDS IN THE MIDDLE OF THE NIGHT, PUSHING LOADS OF GARLIC OFF



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THE TOP OF A LOADING MACHINE AND SHOIVING THEM DOWN A RAMP SO
2 THEY CAN BE PROCESSED, I KNEW THERE WAS SOMETHING BETTER. VTA
3 HAD THIS NEW THING WHERE I COULD CALL AND I COULD GET A BUS TO
4 TAKE ME ANYWHERE I WANTED, NOT ANY TIME OF THE DAY, BUT PRETTY
5 MUCH ANY TIME OF THE DAY. SO I CALLED THOSE BUSES AND THEY
6 TOOK ME AND MY TODDLER SON TO COLLEGE WHERE I LEARNED TO
7 ACQUIRE SKILLS IN OFFICE WORK AND OBTAIN CERTIFICATES THAT
8 ALLOWED ME TO GET OFF THAT DAMN GARLIC SHOOT AT 10:00 IN THE
9 MORNING AND GO TO COMFY WARM OFFICES AND FEED MY FAMILY AND
10 GET AWAY FROM THE MENIAL WORK I KNEW NEEDED TO BE DONE BUT I
11 DIDN'T WANT TO DO BECAUSE I HAD ANOTHER CHILD ON THE WAY. THE
12 OTHER THING THAT WAS HELPFUL FOR ME AT THAT TIME WAS THAT THE
13 FACT THAT COMMUNITY COLLEGES AT THAT POINT HAD FREE CHILDCARE.
14 IT WAS A TWO-PRONGED THING. WE HAD CHILDCARE AND WE HAD
15 TRANSPORTATION AND WE CAN'T HAVE ONE WITHOUT THE OTHER AND
16 BUILD AN ECONOMY. SO, AS MUCH WORK AS I HAVE DONE IN
17 TRANSPORTATION, I WOULD LOVE TO ASK YOU TO TAKE THAT SECOND
18 KEY THAT WAS SO CRUCIAL FOR ME, CHILDCARE, AND TURN THAT INTO
19 A BIG FOCUS FOR OUR ECONOMY. WE CANNOT JUST TREAT CHILDCARE AS
20 ANOTHER THING. IT IS A DRIVING FACTOR IN KEEPING WOMEN IN THE
21 WORKFORCE, KEEPING MEN IN THE WORKFORCE, AND KEEPING OUR
22 ECONOMY RUNNING. I WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR THIS HONOR. IT'S
23 A PLEASURE TO HAVE BEEN HERE FOR 17, 18, 20 YEARS, HOWEVER
24 MANY IT'S BEEN. I'M PRETTY SURE IT'S BEEN LONGER THAN THAT OR
25 SHORTER THAN THAT, DEPENDING WHICH WAY YOU LOOK AT IT. THANK



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 YOU SO MUCH.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE].

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** RANDI, DON'T GO ANYWHERE, WE HAVE PUBLIC
6 COMMENT AND SOME OF THE COMMISSIONERS WOULD LIKE TO MAKE
7 COMMENTS AS WELL. SO COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** RANDI, YOU HAVE BEEN SO AMAZING AT THE ADVISORY
10 COMMITTEE LEVEL. YOUR PRESENTATIONS TO THIS BOARD HAVE BEEN
11 JUST SO REFLECTIVE OF ALL THE MEMBERS OF THE ADVISORY
12 COMMITTEE AND SO INFORMATIVE TO ALL OF US, AND YOU HAVE
13 MENTORED THE YOUNGER MEMBERS. WE SEE ONE RIGHT THERE, MS.
14 CAMPOS. YOU HAVE DONE SUCH AMAZING WORK. I JUST WANT YOU TO
15 KNOW HOW MUCH IT HAS MEANT TO THIS COMMISSION BECAUSE YOU ARE
16 REALLY THE FRONT LINE AND I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING
17 YOU HAVE DONE, FOR THE REGION, FOR ALL OF US, FOR ALL THE
18 PEOPLE AND TO HEAR YOUR PERSONAL STORY IS EVEN MORE
19 ENLIGHTENING. YOU CAN SEE THAT IT ALL CAME FROM THE HEART AND
20 THE REAL REALITY OF PEOPLE THAT WE REPRESENT, SO THANK YOU
21 VERY, VERY MUCH. I WISH YOU ALL THE BEST IN THE FUTURE.
22 HOPEFULLY YOU WON'T BE GOING TOO FAR BECAUSE YOU CAN STILL
23 SHAPE WHAT HAPPENS HERE FOR THE BETTER. SO THANK YOU, VERY,
24 VERY MUCH.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI.

2

3 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. RANDI, I CAN'T BELIEVE I --
4 YES, EXACTLY WHAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID. I HOPE YOU ARE NOT
5 GOING TOO FAR BECAUSE WE -- I CAN'T IMAGINE DOING THE WORK
6 THAT WE DO HERE WITHOUT YOUR AMAZING INPUT. IT'S BEEN, IT'S
7 BEEN MY PLEASURE TO WORK WITH YOU OVER THESE YEARS. THERE IS
8 SO MUCH YOU HAVE DONE TO HELP FACILITATE THE INCLUSION OF
9 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES INTO THE LARGER -- INTO PARTICIPATION
10 IN THE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK OF THE BAY AREA. I DON'T THINK
11 THERE IS ANYTHING THAT I CAN SAY OR THAT WE CAN DO TO THANK
12 YOU ENOUGH FOR THAT. PLEASE KEEP IN TOUCH AND PLEASE TELL US
13 WHEN WE'RE FORGETTING SOMETHING OR WHEN WE HAVE MADE A MISTAKE
14 BECAUSE WE VERY, VERY MUCH VALUE YOUR OPINION. BEST WISHES
15 RANDI, THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS DOREEN. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER IN THE BOARDROOM,
20 PAMELA CAMPOS. DO YOU WANT TO GO UP TO THE PODIUM NOW? AND I
21 DON'T SEE ANYONE IN THE ZOOM ROOM WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

22

23 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I AM VERY HONORED TO PRESENT
24 ACCOMMODATION WITH THE MAYOR OF SAN JOSE AND MY COLLEAGUES AT
25 THE SAN JOSE COUNCIL FOR RANDI AND HER YEARS OF LEADERSHIP AT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 MTC, BEING A STRONG VOICE AND REPRESENTATIVE FOR SANTA CLARA
2 COUNTY, IN PARTICULAR SAN JOSE AS THE MOST POPULOUS COUNTY IN
3 THE REGION, MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE OUR FAIR SHARE
4 REPRESENTATION AND RESOURCES COMING DOWN TO THE SOUTH BAY TO
5 SUPPORT OUR NEIGHBORHOODS. RANDI AND I WOULD COMMUTE UP TO MTC
6 MEETINGS FREQUENTLY BECAUSE WE DEFINITELY NEED TO CONTINUE TO
7 WORK TOGETHER TO SUPPORT THE INTERCONNECTED BAY AREA TRANSIT
8 SYSTEM AND IN THOSE CONVERSATIONS, RANDI HELPED ME GROW INTO
9 MY LEADERSHIP, MAKING SURE THAT I HAD ALL THE PERSPECTIVES
10 THAT I NEEDED TO TAKE IN MAKING A DECISION, NEVER TELLING ME
11 WHAT TO DO, BUT MAKING SURE I WAS THINKING ABOUT ALL THE
12 VOICES THAT WERE INCLUDED. SO, I AM SO PROUD OF THE MENTOR SHE
13 HAS BEEN TO MYSELF AND TO COLLEAGUES ON THE COUNCIL THAT I SEE
14 HERE IN THE ROOM. WE ALL BENEFITTED VERY MUCH FROM YOUR
15 LEADERSHIP AND I AM SO GRATEFUL FOR YOUR 17 YEARS OF SERVICE
16 AND YOUR STRONG VOICE IN SAN JOSE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. JUST ON A FINAL NOTE, THANK YOU
19 SO MUCH. OH, YOU WANT A PICTURE? YEP, GREAT. THIS IS MUSICAL
20 CHAIRS. [LAUGHTER].

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE WILL NOW
23 MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 7, CHAIR'S REPORT. AGENDA ITEM 7A,
24 UPDATED COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS AND FOLLOW UP TO OUR
25 INTRODUCTION TO NEW COMMISSIONER NOELIA CORZO. FIRST, I WOULD



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 LIKE TO APPOINT COMMISSIONER CORZO TO THE SECOND FRIDAY
2 COMMITTEE. THIS IS FILLING THE VACANCY LEFT BY COMMISSIONER
3 CANEPA. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE IS APPOINTED TO THE ABAG
4 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN IS APPOINTED TO
5 CHAIR OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. AND
6 COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS APPOINTED TO VICE CHAIR OF THE
7 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. THESE CHANGES ARE
8 EFFECTIVE IMMEDIATELY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO
9 APPROVE THESE UPDATED APPOINTMENTS?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MOVE THAT.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WANTS
16 TO COMMENT? NO? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M SORRY, WAS THAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA
19 THAT SECONDED IT? THANK YOU. I SEE NO RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM
20 SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, AND NOTHING IN
21 WRITING. I DID PASS OUT THE ASSIGNMENTS TO EACH OF YOU AND I
22 WILL E-MAIL THEM TO YOU AFTER THE MEETING.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, DID EVERYBODY GET A COPY? WE HAVE AN
25 EXTRA UP HERE FLOATING AROUND. OKAY, YOU DIDN'T GET ONE? SO IT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 GOES BACK AND FORTH BETWEEN ABAG AND MTC, IT TAKES TURNS. SO,
2 IT HAD BEEN EXTENDED AN EXTRA YEAR BECAUSE OF SB63 LAST YEAR,
3 SO NOW IT'S GOING BACK TO ABAG THIS YEAR. OKAY. OKAY, CAN WE
4 HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND, AND CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE,
5 PLEASE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, CHAIR NOACK.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, COMMISSIONER
24 ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER BURT.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **PAT BURT:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

4

5 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

16

17 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MANFREE.

20

21 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN.

24

25 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN, COMMISSIONER
3 MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, COMMISSIONER
4 RAMOS.

5

6 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
9 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. YOUR MIC, PLEASE.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH, I THOUGHT IT WAS ON. AGENDA ITEM 7B
12 APPOINTMENT OF THE SB63, FINE EFFICIENCY REVIEW OVERSIGHT
13 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. AS YOU KNOW, THE SB63 LEGISLATION REQUIRES
14 THE COMMISSION TO MANAGE A THIRD-PARTY FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY
15 REVIEW OF THE FOUR MAJOR TRANSIT OPERATORS. THE LEGISLATION
16 ALSO DRAWS ACCESS TO ESTABLISH AN OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE THAT
17 REVIEWS, DIRECTS REVISIONS TO, AND ULTIMATELY ADOPTS THAT
18 WORK. OF THE 9 VOTING MEMBERS OF THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. THE
19 COMMISSION IS RESPONSIBLE FOR APPOINTING 4 INDEPENDENT EXPERTS
20 WITH EXPERIENCE IN PUBLIC TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND FINANCE?
21 IDENTIFYING THE 4 EXPERT CANDIDATES, MTC IS FACT-FOCUSED ON
22 INDEPENDENCE, DEPTH OF EXPERTISE, DIVERSITY OF PERSPECTIVES,
23 GEOGRAPHIC AWARENESS, AND EXPERIENCE WORKING IN POLITICALLY
24 COMPLEX ENVIRONMENTS. STAFF CONDUCTED TARGETED OUTREACH TO
25 INDIVIDUALS WITH STRONG BACKGROUNDS AND TRANSIT LEADERSHIP,



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY, FINANCE, GOVERNANCE, AND OVERSIGHT,
2 AND SCREENED FOR AVAILABILITY, AND POTENTIAL CONFLICTS OF
3 INTEREST. WHILE THE REMAINING WELL QUALIFIED CANDIDATES, THE
4 SLATE REFLECTS THE BEST OVERALL MIX OF PRACTICAL OPERATING
5 EXPERIENCE AND FINANCIAL AND GOVERNMENT EXPERIENCE TO SUPPORT
6 THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE'S FORMAL RESPONSIBILITIES ON SB63. THE
7 FOUR EXPERTS ARE DEBRA JOHNSON, GENERAL MANAGER AND CEO OF
8 DENVER REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT, FORMER CHIEF
9 OPERATING OFFICE OF METRO AND SFMTA. NANCY WHELAN, GENERAL
10 MANAGER OF MARIN TRANSIT, AND MANAGEMENT CONSULTING FIRM.
11 LOUIS THOMPSON, MANAGER OF THE PEER REVIEW GROUP AND
12 LEADERSHIP ROLES AT THE WORLD BANK AND FEDERAL RAILROAD
13 ASSOCIATION. BEN ROSENFELD, FOR THE COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO.
14 THEY ARE TO BRING INDEPENDENT EXPERTISE AND SUPPORT THE
15 COMMITTEE'S RESPONSIBILITY TO REVIEW, DIRECT REVISIONS TO AND
16 ADOPT THE CONSULTANT'S WORK. ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? DO I
17 HAVE A MOTION?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER AHN SECONDS.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENT? DO WE HAVE ANY
24 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND NO HANDS
2 IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WILL THE CLERK TAKE THE ROLL CALL VOTE,
5 PLEASE?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR NOACK.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, COMMISSIONER
24 ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER BURT.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **PAT BURT:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

4

5 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

16

17 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN.

20

21 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MANFREE.

24

25 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN, COMMISSIONER
3 MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, COMMISSIONER
4 RAMOS.

5

6 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
9 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. YOUR MIC, PLEASE.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** EVERY TIME WE DO A VOTE, MY LIGHT GOES OFF.
12 USE TO NOT HAPPEN. I AM GOING TO PUT A STICKER ON THERE. NOW
13 IT'S TIME FOR SOMEONE ELSE TO SPEAK INSTEAD OF ME SO WE'LL GO
14 TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. WILL YOU GIVE YOUR REPORT.

15

16 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR NOACK. I WILL TRY TO BE BRIEF
17 IN THE INTEREST OF TIME. THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS I WOULD
18 LIKE TO BRING FORWARD. IN YOUR UPDATES, WE HAVE THE LATEST
19 DISCUSSIONS AS WE PROGRESS THROUGH THE TRANSITION IN CLIPPER.
20 WE RECOGNIZE THAT IT HAS NOT WORKED, AS WELL AS PEOPLE HAVE
21 HOPED. WE ARE ENGAGED WITH OUR CONTRACTOR AT THE HIGHEST LEVEL
22 TO ENSURE THAT CUSTOMER PROBLEMS ARE RESOLVED AS QUICKLY AS
23 POSSIBLE AND THE TRANSITION WORKS AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. WE ARE,
24 I AM DIRECTING STAFF TO MAKE SURE THAT ANY CUSTOMER WHO LOST
25 ACCESS TO FUNDS OR PASSES DURING THE TRANSITION IS COVERED IN



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THAT SENSE. WE WILL MAKE THEM WHOLE. IN ADDITION, THE CONTRACT
2 DOES REQUIRE THE CONTRACTOR TO PAY FOR LOST REVENUE AND
3 PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND I AM WORKING WITH GENERAL COUNSEL TO
4 MAKE SURE WE AGGRESSIVELY PURSUE AND HOLD ACCOUNTABLE THE
5 CONTRACTOR FOR THOSE ITEMS, BUT OUR GOAL FIRST OF ALL IS TO
6 FIX THE SYSTEM AND KEEP IT WORKING. I WILL CONTINUE TO UPDATE
7 YOU AS WE PROGRESS THROUGH THAT IN THE COMING MONTH. I WANTED
8 TO ALSO MENTION ON THE FOURTH PAGE THAT MTC'S ABAG'S REGIONAL
9 HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM HOSTED THEIR FIFTH
10 OVERVIEW OF HOUSING RELATED BILLS SIGN IN THE LEGISLATION ON
11 DECEMBER 6TH. WE HAD PRESENTATIONS FROM SOME LAW FIRMS WHO
12 WERE VERY ENGAGED IN IT TO PROVIDE QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS FROM
13 JURISDICTION STAFF. THERE WAS MORE THAN 400 STAFF FROM THE
14 NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES AND COMMUNITIES THAT PARTICIPATED,
15 ALONG WITH THE STATE. I THINK THAT CONTINUES TO BE ONE OF THE
16 THINGS THAT WE DO WELL, TO PUT INFORMATION IN FRONT OF YOUR
17 STAFF MEMBERS AND YOUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES TO KEEP THE WORK
18 MOVING, AS WELL AS POSSIBLE. I WENT RIGHT BY THE ONE I WANTED
19 TO MENTION, THE BAHFA AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS THAT WE
20 RECENTLY SIGNED TWO, ONE IN VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS'S AREA
21 PRESERVED AFFORDABLE HOMES THROUGH THE WELFARE TAX EXEMPTION
22 FOR PRESERVATION PROGRAM IN THE SAN RAFAEL CANAL DISTRICT AND
23 IN COMMISSIONER RAMOS'S AND COMMISSIONER MANFREE'S AREA, THE
24 PILOT PROVIDED A \$3 MILLION LOAN TO OUR TOWN SAINT HELENA,
25 MAINTAINING A FACILITY. WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE WITH A LITTLE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 BIT OF HISTORY. AS YOU KNOW, THIS BUILDING DOES HAVE A LOT OF
2 BAY AREA HISTORY IN IT. IF YOU HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY ON YOUR WAY
3 OUT, NEXT DOOR TO US IS A REFURBISHED CLOCK THAT USE TO BE AT
4 THE BAY BRIDGE TOLL AREA, IT SERVED THERE UNTIL 1985. WE FOUND
5 SOMEONE TO PUT IT BACK TOGETHER AND IT'S NICE TO DISPLAY IT.
6 IT'S IDENTICAL TO THE ONE AT THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE. WE ARE
7 PAYING ATTENTION OF THE AESTHETIC FOR YOU. THAT'S MY REPORT.
8 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** QUESTIONS? COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** NOT QUESTIONS, BUT SOME COMMENTS AND
13 FEEDBACK. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT OTHERS BUT OUR E-MAIL BOX BLEW UP
14 ON FRIDAY.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OURS DID TOO.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I HEARD CONCERNS FROM CONSTITUENTS AND
19 OPERATORS AND I ACTUALLY THOUGHT WE WOULD HAVE THIS ITEM TO
20 DISCUSS TODAY. I JUST WANTED TO SHARE ONE COMPLAINT AND I
21 THINK HE IS WORKING WITH US, BUT A WRITER WAS UNABLE TO USE
22 HIS CLIPPER CARD FOR OVER A MONTH AND THE PRE-TAX COMMUTER
23 BENEFITS ARE VISIBLE IN THE SYSTEM ONLINE, BUT HE CAN'T ACCESS
24 THEM. SO HE IS FORCED TO PAY OUT OF POCKET WHILE WAITING FOR
25 THIS TO BE FIXED. HE ALSO CALLED CUSTOMER SERVICE AND WAS ON



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 HOLD FOR ALMOST AN HOUR. HE IS JUST ONE OF MANY OTHER STORIES
2 WE HEARD. WE ALSO HEARD FROM FRONT LINE WORKERS, THE FARE
3 INSPECTION DEVICES AREN'T WORKING AND THE CUSTOMER SERVICE
4 TERMINALS CAN'T SOLVE ISSUES, SO WE'RE PUTTING STAFF IN AN
5 IMPOSSIBLE SITUATION. MY HUSBAND AND DAUGHTER TAKE TRANSIT
6 EVERY DAY AND THEY'RE TELLING ME THAT PEOPLE ARE TRYING TO PAY
7 BUT IT'S NOT WORKING SO THEY'RE BEING TOLD DON'T WORRY ABOUT
8 IT. I ALSO THINK ABOUT LOST REVENUE THERE. SO I KNOW STAFF IS
9 PURSUING REMEDIES UNDER THE CONTRACT BUT I STILL DON'T HAVE A
10 CLEAR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THE REMEDIES ARE OR HOW
11 ACCOUNTABILITY IS BEING FORCED. SO I ASKED FOR A SUMMARY OF
12 OUR RECOURSE OPTIONS LAST WEEK AND I WANT TO REITERATE THAT
13 REQUEST, TO HAVE IT SENT TO THE FULL COMMISSION. IN LIGHT OF
14 ALL THESE ISSUES, I THINK AS COMMISSIONERS WE SHOULD HAVE THAT
15 INFORMATION AND MORE BROADLY, I THINK WE NEED TO BE HONEST.
16 YOU KNOW, I TALKED ABOUT CLIPPER, OUR CLIPPER PROGRAM SYSTEM
17 FOR MANY YEARS, CONCERNS. I HAVE SEEN OTHER OPTIONS AND I
18 DON'T KNOW IF THEY ARE ACTUALLY AVAILABLE IN THE UNITED
19 STATES, BUT I ASKED FOR LOOKING AT ALTERNATIVES AND TOLD THAT
20 WE EITHER INVESTED TOO MUCH IN CLIPPER OR SOME OTHER REASONS,
21 AND I REALLY THINK IT'S TIME FOR US TO LOOK AT ALTERNATIVES.
22 WE'RE NOT SATISFYING THE RIDERS WITH THIS SITUATION. SO, I AM
23 ASKING THAT THESE ISSUES BE RESOLVED NEXT MONTH AND IF THEY
24 ARE NOT, I WOULD LIKE TO FORMALLY REQUEST AN INVESTIGATION
25 INTO ALTERNATIVES. WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT OTHER OPTIONS EXIST



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 BEFORE WE PUT ANYMORE MONEY INTO THIS FLAWEDED SYSTEM. GOING
2 FORWARD, I'M LOOKING FOR A WRITTEN DETAILED PLAN SO THE
3 COMMISSION UNDERSTANDS WHAT IS STILL BROKEN, WHO IS FIXING IT,
4 WHEN RIDERS CAN EXPECT RELIEF, AND WHEN OUR CONTRACTUAL
5 RECOURSE IS. THEY ARE PROMOTING THE TOKEN TRANSIT APP FOR THE
6 SUPER BOWL. I'M DISAPPOINTED THAT ONE OF OUR BIGGEST OPERATORS
7 HAS TO ACTIVELY PROMOTE WORKAROUNDS FOR THIS MAJOR NATIONAL
8 EVENT THAT WE HAVE HAD YEARS IN THE PLANNING FOR. CLIPPER IS
9 CORE, IF WE WANT PEOPLE TO RIDE TRANSIT AND MAKE IT EASY FOR
10 THEM, BUT WHEN IT DOESN'T WORK, WHICH IS WHAT'S HAPPENING,
11 PEOPLE ARE MISSING WORK, SCHOOL, LOSING ACCESS TO MONEY THEY
12 ALREADY PAID FOR, SO I EXPECT CONTINUED TRANSPARENCY AND
13 ACCOUNTABILITY AS THIS MOVES FORWARD AND I AM GOING TO KEEP
14 PRESSING FOR DETAILED ANSWERS AS YOU KNOW. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** I WANTED TO EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF CLIPPER
19 HERE. I THINK WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS REQUESTING HERE IS
20 IMPORTANT TO ALL OF US. IT SHOULD BE AGENDIZE AT THE NEXT
21 MEETING SO WE CAN SEE WHAT'S GOING ON. ACCOUNTABILITY IS
22 EVERYTHING. WE NEED TO SEE THAT AND THE PUBLIC NEEDS TO SEE
23 THAT NOT ONLY ARE THINGS HAPPENING BEHIND THE SCENES BUT
24 PUBLICLY, WHAT IS GOING ON HERE AND IF WE'VE MADE A MISTAKE,
25 IT'S NOT WORKING, WE NEED TO REALLY ADDRESS THAT SOONER RATHER



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THAN LATER. WHAT WAS JUST STATED ABOUT ONE OF THE LARGEST
2 EVENTS COMING TO OUR REGION, THE SUPER BOWL, AND
3 ACCOMMODATIONS HAVING TO BE MADE BY OPERATORS DEEPLY
4 CONCERNING. SO I DON'T THINK IT'S INAPPROPRIATE AND I DON'T
5 THINK WE HAVE A SET POLICY HERE, BUT I WOULD SECOND A MOTION
6 TO HAVE THAT PUT ON THE AGENDA FOR ALL OF US TO SEE WHAT'S
7 HAPPENING. WE ARE GETTING CALLS. OUR LEGISLATIVE MEMBERS,
8 EVERYBODY IS GETTING CALLS ON THIS. THE PUBLIC NEEDS TO KNOW,
9 WE NEED TO KNOW WHAT'S HAPPENING. SO I HOPE THAT DOES HAPPEN.
10 THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

13

14 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU. I DON'T WANT TO BELABOR THE POINT. I
15 AGREE WITH EVERYTHING MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS HAVE SAID AND I
16 ALSO GOTTEN NUMEROUS CALLS, TEXTS, CONVERSATIONS FROM
17 CONSTITUENTS AND YOU KNOW, I JUST WANTED TO POINT OUT THAT OUR
18 LAST MEETING WE TALKED A LOT ABOUT TOLLING AND YOU KNOW, THE
19 INFRASTRUCTURE FOR TOLLING, HOW WE ARE ESSENTIALLY SELLING
20 REGIONALISM THROUGH THIS BODY, LIKE OUR ABILITY TO WORK
21 TOGETHER AND IN ORDER TO DO THAT, IT NEEDS TO BE A VALUE-ADDED
22 TO EVERYONE. WE NEED TO DO BETTER OFF DOING IT TOGETHER THAN
23 WE COULD BE INDIVIDUALLY. WE ARE ALSO THE HOME OF SILICON
24 VALLEY. WE'RE AT THE FOREFRONT OF THIS STUFF, YOU KNOW, IN THE
25 WORLD. SO IT SEEMS KIND OF INEXCUSABLE THAT WE DON'T HAVE A



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 VISION AND A PLAN FOR THIS AREA. IT SHOULD BE SEAMLESS, IT
2 SHOULD BE EASY FOR PEOPLE TO PAY, IT SHOULD BE BETTER FOR THEM
3 TO PAY THROUGH OUR SYSTEMS AND INDIVIDUALLY AND WE'RE JUST NOT
4 THERE YET. SO, THE CLIPPER 2.0 ROLL OUT WAS JUST EVERYBODY WAS
5 WAITING WITH BATED BREATH FOR A LONG TIME IN HOPING WE WOULD
6 GET THERE AND WE DIDN'T FOR A LONG TIME. SO I ASKED MYSELF THE
7 SAME QUESTION, YOU KNOW, WHEN DO WE STOP THROWING GOOD MONEY
8 AFTER BAD AND AT WHAT POINT DO WE ACTUALLY HAVE A VISION THAT
9 IS INTEGRATED, THAT IS EXCELLENT, THAT ALLOWS US TO TAKE IN
10 INCOME TO AGENCIES THAT ARE DESPERATELY IN NEED OF IT AND
11 ALLOWS US TO SAY THAT MESSAGE THAT WE'RE BETTER OFF TOGETHER
12 THAN WE WOULD BE INDIVIDUALLY. SO I FULLY SUPPORT PUTTING IT
13 ON THE AGENDA. I LOOK FORWARD TO US ALL WORKING TOGETHER TO DO
14 THAT TOGETHER, AND TO BE BETTER OFF BY DOING IT.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH, IF WE CAN GET SOME OF THE FOLKS IN
17 HERE TO HEAR FROM US, I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES, ABSOLUTELY BUT I ALSO WANT TO CONSIDER THE
20 ALTERNATIVES. PUT SOME DOLLARS SO WE CAN CONSIDER IT AS A
21 DECISION.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH, JUST FOR THE PUBLIC TO CALL CUBIC ON
24 THE CARPET TO FIND OUT WHAT'S GOING ON, TIMING AND PUT THE
25 PRESSURE ON IT FROM THIS BOARD I THINK WILL BE IMPORTANT. SO



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 WE WILL WORK TO GET THAT SCHEDULED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. ANY --
2 OH SORRY. COMMISSIONER MASHBURN. I WAS CLOSE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, I AGREE. IT'S GREAT TO HAVE HIM HERE, BUT I
5 WOULD LIKE TO LOOK AT ALTERNATIVES AS WELL. THE PRIVATE SECTOR
6 IS DOING THIS ALL OVER THE PLACE. WAL-MART HAS AN APP TO PUT
7 MONEY ON AND SPEND AND UBER DOES IT. ANYONE IN THE PRIVATE
8 SECTOR, THEY ALL MANAGE TO DO IT AND WE SCREW IT UP. SO I
9 WOULD LIKE TO GET IT FIXED AND FIGURE OUT WHAT THE PRIVATE
10 SECTOR IS DOING THAT WE CAN'T QUITE MANAGE.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

13

14 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES, I AGREE WITH EVERYTHING THAT MY
15 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS HAVE SAID SO FAR. I WOULD LOVE WHEN WE
16 HAVE THIS CONVERSATION TO NOT ONLY THINK ABOUT WHAT ARE THE
17 ALTERNATIVES HERE BUT I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT
18 THIS STRATEGY IS TO GET THROUGH THIS REALLY MESSY PERIOD. I
19 PERSONALLY WAS ON THE PHONE WITH THE FOLKS ON CLIPPER CUSTOMER
20 SERVICE FOR A VERY, VERY LONG TIME AND ULTIMATELY WHAT SHE
21 SAID TO ME WAS IT'S NOT YOUR FAULT, BUT YOU HAVE TO CALL BACK
22 IN THREE WEEKS BECAUSE THERE IS NOTHING WE CAN DO FOR YOU. I
23 AM A HIGH INFORMATION USER OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. I KNEW I
24 COULD SWITCH FROM TAP TO PAY, BUT IF WE WERE TO GO IN A
25 DIFFERENT DIRECTION, WE STILL WOULD HAVE TO GET TO A DIFFERENT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 DIRECTION AND THE SITUATION THAT WE'RE IN RIGHT NOW IS FRANKLY
2 EMBARRASSING. I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE STRATEGY IS
3 TO GET US OUT OF THIS IN SHORT ORDER.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANYBODY ELSE? OH SORRY, COMMISSIONER CORZO.

6

7 **NOELIA CORZO:** THANK YOU, AS THE NEWEST COMMISSIONER, I AM
8 STILL LEARNING OBVIOUSLY. I ALSO RECENTLY HAD AN EXPERIENCE
9 WHERE I WAS TRYING TO USE OUR COUNTY TRANSIT CARD TO ADD MONEY
10 TO CLIPPER AND IT WOULDN'T GO THROUGH. I WAS TOLD IT TAKES
11 DAYS TO PROCESS. IN THE MEANTIME, I HAD TO PAY OUT OF POCKET
12 WHEN I HAVE MONEY SITTING THERE IN MY COUNTY CARD. SO I AM
13 INTERESTED IN LEARNING AND UNDERSTANDING HOW WE AS
14 COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF CAN SOLVE THIS PROBLEM TOGETHER. THANK
15 YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. DOREEN? SORRY, COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI.

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** NO PROBLEM. MY MEMORY IS THAT WE HAVE HAD
20 DECADES OF ISSUES WITH CUBIC AND SO I AM WONDERING IF IT WOULD
21 BE HELPFUL FOR THE COMMISSIONERS WHO HAVE NOT BEEN AROUND FOR
22 DECADES TO ALSO RECEIVE BACKGROUND ON THE PREVIOUS PROBLEMS
23 THAT WE HAVE HAD WITH CUBIC.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT, ADD THAT TO THE AGENDA QUESTION.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 YES, COMMISSIONER? I'M LOSING TRACK HERE.

2

3 **PAT BURT:** WELL, I JUST WANTED TO SAY IT'S NOT A CONCILIATION
4 TO THESE REALLY SEVERE PROBLEMS BUT OUR CITY HAS PARTICIPATED
5 IN THE BAY PASS PROGRAM FOR ALL CITY EMPLOYEES AND IT SEEMS TO
6 BE WORKING REAL WELL. IT DOESN'T SOLVE THIS PROBLEM, BUT I
7 JUST WANTED TO SHARE THAT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, WELL WE WILL FOLLOW UP ON THIS
10 EVERYBODY. ALL GOOD COMMENTS AND GOOD CONCERNS. ALL RIGHT, WE
11 WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 9.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE NEED TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT
14 ITEM.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT
17 ITEM?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
20 THEIR HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. ONE MINUTE.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PLEASE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU GOT IT. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **ROLAND:** GOOD MORNING AND THANK YOU. THE ONLY THING I WOULD
2 LIKE TO ADD TO THE CONVERSATION IS MAYBE AT SOME POINT, WE ARE
3 GOING TO HAVE TO LOOK AT THE MIRROR AND DO AN ANALYSIS AS TO
4 WHY CUBIC IS SUCCESSFUL ACROSS MULTIPLE LOCATIONS. I COME FROM
5 LONDON, AND IT'S ABSOLUTELY FLAWLESS, NO PROBLEM. MOVING
6 FORWARD, IT'S FRAGMENTATION AND THE AGENCY HAS SOMETHING
7 REALLY SPECIAL AND THEN GO BACK AND LOOK AT SOME OF THEM AND
8 WHY IT'S WORKING FOR THEM AND NOT WORKING FOR US. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ADINA LEVIN.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES, THANKS SO MUCH FOR THE COMMISSIONERS TO BE
13 REALLY TAKING A HARD LOOK AT THE CLIPPER ROLL OUT CHALLENGES
14 AND HOW TO COME THROUGH IT AND COME UP WITH A TRAJECTORY,
15 DIFFERENT GOING FORWARD. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
16 DON'T THROW OUT THE BABY WITH THE BATH WATER, MAKING TRANSIT
17 MORE CONVENIENT WITH THE FREE AND REDUCED PRICED TRANSFERS AND
18 ALL AGENCY PASS, WHICH IN WHATEVER PAYMENT MECHANISM THAT IS
19 USED, WE SHOULD CONTINUE THAT PROGRESS ON HAVING FARES THAT
20 WORK ACROSS MULTIPLE AGENCIES. AS THERE WAS COMMENT FROM
21 MULTIPLE PEOPLE AT THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, SOME OF THE
22 PROBLEMS WITH THE ROLLOUT WERE REALLY ELEMENTARY PROBLEMS THAT
23 SHOULD HAVE BEEN FORESEEN AND SHOULD HAVE BEEN PREVENTABLE. WE
24 CAN SEND COMMENTS IN WRITING. THANK YOU.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
2 HANDS.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, AGENDA 9, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS.
5 ANY COMMISSIONERS WANT TO GIVE GENERAL COMMENTS OR
6 ANNOUNCEMENTS? NO, AGENDA ITEM 10, THE CONSENT CALENDAR,
7 INCLUDING ITEMS 10A THROUGH 10F. IS THERE ANYBODY THAT WANTS
8 TO PULL ANYTHING OR ANY COMMENT? OTHERWISE, I WILL LOOK FOR A
9 MOTION AND A SECOND.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** MOVED, COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** SECOND, COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, ANY COMMENT FROM COMMISSIONERS?
16 ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, NO HANDS
19 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, WILL YOU PLEASE CALL THE ROLL CALL
22 VOTE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER MELGAR,
25 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE, CHAIR NOACK.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

21 COMMISSIONER BURT.

22

23 **PAT BURT:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

9

10 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

13

14 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN.

17

18 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MANFREE.

21

22 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN, COMMISSIONER

25 MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, COMMISSIONER



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 RAMOS.

2

3 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
6 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE WILL MOVE ON TO COMMITTEE REPORTS, AGENDA
9 ITEM 11 IS LEGISLATION COMMITTEE REPORT AND I WILL GO AHEAD
10 AND GIVE THIS REPORT. THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET JOINTLY AS
11 THE MTC-ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE ON JANUARY 9, 2026, AND
12 REFERRED THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.
13 AGENDA ITEM 11A, THE MTC RESOLUTION 4686 REVISED PROVEN
14 NOMINEES TO THE INAUGURAL MTC-ABAG ADVISORY COUNCIL RUNNING
15 FROM JANUARY 1, 2026, THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 2029. DO I HAVE A
16 MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION 4686?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER ADDITIONAL COMMENTS ON
23 THIS ITEM? OKAY, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME, I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 FOR THIS ITEM AND I DO HAVE TWO SPEAKERS IN THE BOARDROOM,
2 NONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE AT THIS TIME. IF YOU WILL APPROACH THE
3 PODIUM, WE'LL START THE CLOCK FOR YOU. THE FIRST IS AMANDA
4 CHANG, FOLLOWED BY JULIA.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI, GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS AMANDA
7 CHANG, I'M A STAFF MEMBER AT URBAN HABITAT AND WAS NOMINATED
8 TO BE APPOINTED TO THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL. SO I JUST
9 WANTED TO INTRODUCE MYSELF. I MET SOME OF YOU WORKING GLOBALLY
10 AND REGIONALLY AND JUST REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING
11 TOGETHER WITH MY COUNCIL MEMBERS AND WITH YOURSELVES TO MOVE
12 THE REGION FORWARD WHERE WE CAN WORK LOCALLY AND THINK
13 REGIONALLY. SO THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY, THANK YOU FOR
14 THE HONOR OF THE APPOINTMENT AND I AM JUST LOOKING FORWARD TO
15 WORKING WITH YOU ALL ON MANY THINGS, INCLUDING THE TOC POLICY
16 AND THANK YOU AGAIN.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JULIA.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HELLO EVERYONE, I'M JULIA, THE HOUSING AND PARKING
21 POLICY MANAGER AT TRANSFORM. WE'RE A TRANSPORTATION AND
22 HOUSING ADVOCACY GROUP BASED IN OAKLAND, BUT WORKING
23 THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTIES OF THE AREA. I AM HERE TO
24 INTRODUCE MYSELF BECAUSE I TOO WAS APPOINTED TO THE COMMUNITY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ALSO IT'S AN HONOR. I AM REALLY GRATEFUL



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 FOR THE POSITION AND THE SUPPORT TO SERVE AND I HOPE THAT WE
2 CAN ALL WORK TOGETHER TO PROMOTE KIND OF THE STRENGTH OF THE
3 REGION AND MAKING SURE THAT RESOURCES ARE EQUITABLY
4 DISTRIBUTED TOWARDS CURBING THE IMPACTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE
5 THROUGH HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION POLICY AND I THINK TOGETHER
6 WE CAN MAKE SOME REALLY BEAUTIFUL THINGS HAPPEN. I LOOK
7 FORWARD TO PRESENTING COMMUNITY INTERESTS IN TERMS OF MAKING
8 SURE THAT POLICY IS DONE, SORT OF WITH COMMUNITY IN MIND,
9 REDISTRIBUTING RESOURCES, AND ENSURING THAT VOICES ARE
10 REPRESENTED AT THIS BODY. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
13 RAISED.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, THANK YOU. CAN WE PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL
16 CALL VOTE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, I WILL. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER LEE
19 AND I THINK SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. CHAIR NOACK.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

11

12 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

15 COMMISSIONER BURT.

16

17 **PAT BURT:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

20

21 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT AT THE

24 MOMENT, COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

4

5 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT AT THE
8 MOMENT, COMMISSIONER MANFREE, COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

9

10 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY,
13 COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

18

19 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
22 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 11B, THE FINAL MTC
25 AND ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM, EXPRESSING THE STATE AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES. THERE IS A HANDOUT BEFORE YOU
2 THAT INCLUDES AN ADDITION TO THE HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION
3 AND ALLOCATION LANGUAGE AS APPROVED BY THE ABAG BOARD. DO I
4 HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ADAPT THE JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. ANY
11 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, NO HANDS
14 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE,
19 SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, CHAIR NOACK.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

11

12 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

15 COMMISSIONER BURT.

16

17 **PAT BURT:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

20

21 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT AT THE

24 MOMENT, COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.

2

3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER LEE.

4

5 BARBARA LEE: AYE.

6

7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MAHAN.

8

9 MATT MAHAN: AYE.

10

11 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MANFREE.

12

13 AMBER MANFREE: AYE.

14

15 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

16

17 MITCH MASHBURN: AYE.

18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY,

20 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

21

22 BELIA RAMOS: YES.

23

24 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

25 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, THANK YOU. WE WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA
3 ITEM 12, WHICH IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
4 REPORT AND COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE
5 THE REPORT.

6

7 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES, ITEMS 10C ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR
8 AND 12A, MTC SOLUTION 4739, ADOPTS MTC BAY AREA TRANSIT
9 PRIORITY POLICY FOR ROADWAYS AND I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE APPROVAL
10 OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4739.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I WILL SECOND THAT.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? ANY PUBLIC
15 COMMENTS?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
18 THIS ITEM, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, THERE IS ONE HAND
19 RAISE IN THE ZOOM SPACE. THAT IS ADINA LEVIN, GO AHEAD AND
20 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** YES, THIS IS A GOOD FIRST STEP WITH A POLICY THAT
23 WILL HELP ENCOURAGE MORE CITIES ACROSS THE REGION TO DEVELOP
24 TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICIES AND TO CREATE A TRANSIT PRIORITY
25 NETWORK AROUND THE REGION THAT CAN IDENTIFY CORRIDORS AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 PROJECTS THAT SHOULD BE PRIORITIZED TO MAKE BUSES AND SERVICE
2 TRANSPORTATION FASTER AND OUT OF TRAFFIC. THIS IS A THE GOOD
3 FIRST STEP. THERE ARE POTENTIAL FUTURE STEPS TO BE MORE
4 QUANTITATIVE AND HAVING QUANTITATIVE GOALS FOR SPEED AND
5 RELIABILITY AND CONNECTIONS GOING FORWARD AND WE NEED TO MAKE
6 SURE THAT OUR TRANSIT PRIORITY AND STREET SAFETY GO HAND IN
7 HAND, WHICH IS WHAT THIS POLICY IS INTENDED TO DO. THANK YOU
8 VERY MUCH.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
11 HANDS.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, CAN WE HAVE THE ROLL CALL VOTE
14 PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER JOHN-
17 BAPTISTE, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, CHAIR NOACK.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

13 COMMISSIONER BURT, COMMISSIONER CORZO.

14

15 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT, COMMISSIONER
5 MANFREE.

6

7 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

10

11 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY,
14 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

15

16 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
19 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM
22 13, WHICH IS PROGRAMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT.
23 COMMISSIONER FLEMING, WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT.

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR. PROGRAMING AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON JANUARY 14TH AND REFERRED TO THE
2 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL FOR THE FOLLOWING ITEMS, 10E AND 10F
3 ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND FOR THE FOLLOWING ITEM 13A, MTC
4 RESOLUTION NUMBER 4604 REVISED, 389 REVISED, APPROVED REVISION
5 TO THE MTC COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE AND EMPOWERMENT TO AWARD
6 AN ADDITIONAL 1 MILLION IN POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT
7 PROJECT ROUND TWO AND I WILL MOVE APPROVAL OF THE MTC
8 RESOLUTION 4604 REVISED AND 3989 REVISED.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** A SECOND?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** A MOTION AND A SECOND. ANY COMMISSIONERS
15 WANT TO COMMENT ON THIS IDEA? COMMISSIONER MILEY.

16

17 **NATE MILEY:** YES, I NEED TO CHECK WITH COUNSEL AGAIN, AT THE
18 COMMITTEE MEETING, I MENTIONED I AM THE PRESIDENT OF THE
19 COMMITTEE AND I RECEIVED NO COMPENSATION. SHOULD I ABSTAIN OR
20 RECUSE MYSELF? NORMALLY I RECUSE MYSELF FROM THESE ITEMS.

21

22 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** YES, BUT YOU HAVE NO FINANCIAL SELF-
23 INTEREST IN THIS, SO IT'S EFFICIENT TO ABSTAIN FROM THIS VOTE
24 BUT YOUR REASONS FOR ABSTAINING IS IN THE RECORD.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, DO I HAVE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING IN WRITING, NO HANDS RAISED IN THE
4 ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT, A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR NOACK.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

4 COMMISSIONER BURT, COMMISSIONER CORZO.

5

6 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT.

13 COMMISSIONER LEE.

14

15 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT, COMMISSIONER

18 MANFREE.

19

20 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

23

24 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR, COMMISSIONER MILEY.

2

3 **NATE MILEY:** ABSTAIN.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, LET ME JUST NOTE THAT REALLY
6 QUICK. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS.

11

12 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH 1
15 ABSTENTION.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I HOPE EVERYBODY DOESN'T MIND,
18 COULD WE TAKE A QUICK 5-MINUTE BREAK? THAT WOULD BE
19 APPRECIATED. YOU JUST GOT SETTLED, BUT WE'RE GOING TO TAKE A
20 5-MINUTE BREAK AND THEN WE'LL BE BACK. [BREAK - MEETING WILL
21 RESUME SHORTLY]

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, IF I CAN GET EVERYBODY BACK. OH, HERE.
24 ALL RIGHT, I THINK WE CAN GET STARTED AGAIN. THANK YOU FOR
25 ALLOWING ME THAT LITTLE BREAK. WE WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 14A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4740, BAY AREA GRANT FOR FUNDING
2 FRAMEWORK. IT PROPOSES ADOPTION OF THE ONE BAY AREA OBAG 4
3 PROGRAM, INCLUDING SET ASIDES FOR INCENTIVIZING PROGRESS ON
4 THE TOC. WE HAVE HAD SUBSTANTIAL DISCUSSIONS ON THESE TOPICS
5 THE LAST FEW MONTHS, INCLUDING AT THE OCTOBER WORKSHOP AND
6 NOVEMBER COMMISSION MEETING. I WANT TO START BY THANKS EACH OF
7 YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND INPUT ON THESE COMPLEX AND CONSEQUENTIAL
8 ISSUES. FOLLOWING OUR NOVEMBER MEETING, VICE CHAIR MOULTON-
9 PETERS AND I MET WITH AN AD HOC GROUP OF COMMISSIONERS TO
10 DISCUSS HOW TO SYNTHESIZE POINTS FOR THE COMMISSION. WE
11 INCLUDED A COVER LETTER TO THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET EXPLAINING
12 OUR PROCESS AND INTRODUCING OUR PROPOSED APPROACH. AS
13 SUBSCRIBE IN THE LETTER AND STAFF REPORT, WE PLAN TO TAKE
14 ACTION ON OBAG 4 AND TOC IN TWO STEPS. WE WILL CONSIDER
15 APPROVAL FOR THE FUNDING FRAMEWORK AND NEXT MONTH, WE WILL
16 FOCUS ON ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS FOR A MODEST BUT MEANINGFUL
17 TOC SET ASIDE PROGRAM. THE VICE CHAIR AND I FEEL THAT THE
18 RECOMMENDATIONS TODAY STRIKE THE RIGHT BALANCE AND ADDRESS
19 MANY OF THE KEY CONCERNS YOU RAISED IN PREVIOUS DISCUSSIONS.
20 WE HOPE THAT OUR PROPOSED TWO-STEP APPROACH ALLOWS US TO MOVE
21 FORWARD ON KEY DECISIONS THIS MONTH AND IN FEBRUARY. WITH
22 THAT, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO THOMAS TO PRESENT THE ITEM.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, I'M
25 WITH MTC FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM SECTION AND I'M PLEASED TO



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 PRESENT THE OBAG FRAMEWORK FOR ADOPTION THIS MORNING. WE WILL
2 START BY REVIEWING SOME KEY CONTEXT ON THE OBAG 4 CYCLE,
3 INCLUDING A TIMELINE TO DATE AND PRINCIPALS THAT INFORM THE
4 FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS AND DETAILS ON THE IMPACT AND IMPORTANCE
5 OF REGIONAL PROGRAMS. THEN I WILL MOVE INTO THE STAFF PROPOSAL
6 AS THE CHAIR DESCRIBED IN THE COVER LETTER AND INTRODUCTORY
7 REMARKS, WE'RE RECOMMENDING A TWO STEP APPROVAL PROCESS. WE
8 PLAN TO START WITH THE ADOPTION OF THE OBAG 4 FUNDING
9 FRAMEWORK AND NEXT MONTH WITH POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OBAG
10 4 AND TOC GUIDELINES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO TO REVIEW SOME
11 KEY CONTEXT FOR THE OBAG 4 PROGRAM, THE COMMISSION HAD TWO
12 MAJOR NEW CONSIDERATIONS THIS CYCLE. THE FIRST WAS REDUCED
13 AVAILABLE FUNDING TO IMPART TO THE PRE-COMMITMENT OF OBAG 4
14 CAPACITY, THROUGH THE PACKAGE FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND
15 TRANSFORMATIVE CAPITAL PROJECTS. ON TOP OF THAT, WE HAD THE
16 LOSS OF COMPLIMENTARY FUNDS FROM ONE TIME STATE AND FEDERAL
17 SOURCES THAT AUGMENT OF OBAG 3. THE SECOND IS THE TOC POLICY,
18 DISCUSSIONS TO DATE ON THIS TOPIC HAVE INCLUDED IDEAS FOR A
19 REGIONAL TOC SET ASIDE INCENTIVE, A NORTH BAY AUGMENTATION,
20 AND IMPLEMENTATION OPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO AS YOU
21 KNOW, THE COMMISSION AND STAKEHOLDERS HAVE HAD EXTENSIVE
22 DISCUSSIONS ON OBAG 4 AND I HAD TO SUMMARIZE THAT ON THE TABLE
23 HERE. I WON'T GO THROUGH IT IN DETAIL, BUT THE INPUT ON THE
24 TOPICS AND THAT OF THE PARTNER AGENCIES HAVE BEEN CRUCIAL IN
25 SHAPING THE RECOMMENDATIONS BEFORE YOU TODAY. NEXT SLIDE,



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 PLEASE. THIS SLIDE IS A REMINDER OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO
2 ACCOMPLISH WITH THE OBAG PROGRAM. IT'S A VEHICLE TO IMPLEMENT
3 THE VISION AND GOALS ESTABLISHED IN PLAN BAY AREA. THE COUNTY
4 PROGRAM IS A FLEXIBLE SOURCE OF FUNDING FOR LOCAL PRIORITIES
5 THAT ENABLES AND INCENTIVIZES OUR PARTNERS TO MAKE PROGRESS ON
6 SHARED PRIORITIES AND THE REGIONAL PROGRAM IS A FOCUS-SET OF
7 INVESTMENTS THAT SUPPORT MTC INITIATIVES AND SERVICES ACROSS
8 THE BAY AREA, INCLUDED TARGETED LOCAL GRANT OPPORTUNITIES.
9 THESE TWO COMPONENTS COMPLEMENT AND REINFORCE ONE ANOTHER TO
10 ADVANCE PLAN GOALS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THIS SLIDE
11 SUMMARIZES SOME ADDITIONAL CONTEXT ON THE STRENGTHS AND
12 BENEFITS OF THE OBAG REGIONAL PROGRAMS. FOR CONTEXT ON THE
13 SB125 SPLIT. OVER HALF OF THE REGIONAL FUNDS ARE DIRECTED
14 TOWARDS LOCAL PROJECTS AND WE INCLUDED PROJECT MAPS BY COUNTY
15 AS ATTACHMENT 2 ON THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET. IN ADDITION, THE
16 COMMISSION LEVERAGED FLEXIBLE OBAG REGIONAL FUNDS FROM PRIOR
17 CYCLES TO MAKE STRATEGIC INVESTMENTS AND RESPOND TO EMERGING
18 PRIORITIES, AND WE INCLUDED SOME EXAMPLES IN ATTACHMENT 3 IN
19 YOUR PACKET. ALSO IN THE ATTACHMENT IS ADDITIONAL INFORMATION
20 ABOUT THE SHARED BENEFITS OF THE SB125 INVESTMENTS, WHICH ARE
21 SUSTAINING TRANSIT SERVICE AND MAKING IMPROVEMENTS FOR RIDERS
22 ACROSS THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO NOW, PIVOTING TO
23 RECOMMENDATIONS. AGAIN, WE'RE PROPOSING A 2-STEP APPROVAL
24 PROCESS FOR OBAG 4 AND TOC IMPLEMENTATION. THIS MONTH, WE'RE
25 RECOMMENDING KEY FUNDING DECISIONS THROUGH THE ADOPTION OF THE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OBAG 4 FRAMEWORK, INCLUDING THE SB125 TRANSIT SPLIT AND THE
2 TOC INCENTIVE AMOUNTS. NEXT MONTH, STAFF PLANS TO RETURN WITH
3 POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS RELATED TO THE OBAG 4 GUIDELINES AND
4 THE TOC EVALUATION FRAMEWORK. AS DETAILED IN THE COVER LETTER,
5 THIS APPROACH IS INTENDED TO ADVANCE INDIVIDUAL DECISIONS ON
6 KEY TOPICS, ALLOW THE COUNTY PROGRAM TO PROCEED THIS YEAR AS
7 PLANNED, AND PROVIDE CLARITY TO JURISDICTION AND OTHER
8 PARTNERS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS MONTH, WE'RE RECOMMENDING
9 ADOPT ON THE OBAG 4 FUNDING FRAMEWORK. IT WOULD TAKE THE
10 TRANSIT COMMITMENT OFF THE TOP OF THE OBAG 4 PROGRAM, LEAVING
11 \$360 MILLION EACH FOR THE COUNTY AND REGIONAL COMPONENTS. IT
12 WOULD SET ASIDE \$50 MILLION FOR TOC INCENTIVE PROGRAM,
13 INCLUDING \$45 MILLION FOR TOP PERFORMERS AND \$5 MILLION FOR
14 NORTH BAY COUNTIES, AND IMPORTANTLY THE COUNTY PROGRAM WOULD
15 NOT REQUIRE OR INCORPORATE TOC PROGRESS. THE TOC PROGRESS
16 WOULD BE IMPLEMENTED THROUGH THE REGIONAL SET ASIDES. NEXT
17 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE NEXT FEW SLIDES PREVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS
18 THAT WE WOULD BE BRINGING IN FEBRUARY AND THEY ARE DETAILED IN
19 THE ATTACHMENTS. WE'RE PROPOSING MODEST CHANGES TO OBAG 4
20 POLICIES TO INCORPORATE BEST PRACTICES FROM THE CURRENT CYCLE.
21 THE PROPOSED CHANGES WOULD SIMPLIFY AND STANDARDIZE COUNTY AND
22 REGIONAL CALLS FOR PROJECTS AND ADD FLEXIBILITY FOR EXISTING
23 REQUIREMENTS. WE ALSO PLAN TO ACCOMMODATE NEW REGIONAL
24 POLICIES, SPECIFICALLY THE TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY FOR
25 ROADWAYS, WHICH WAS JUST ADOPTED EARLIER THIS MORNING, AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ASSOCIATED CHANGES TO MTC'S COMPLETE STREETS CHECKLIST. NEXT
2 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THIS TABLE SUMMARIZES THE DRAFT COUNTY
3 PROGRAM, AND HOW THE AUGMENTATION WOULD IMPACT FUNDING FOR
4 EACH COUNTY. TO BRIEFLY WALK THROUGH THE TABLE, THE SECOND
5 COLUMN SHOWS THE DRAFT BASE PLANNING AMOUNTS FOR THE CTA. THE
6 THIRD AND FOURTH COLUMNS SHOW THE TARGET SHARES IN AN
7 ILLUSTRATIVE DISTRIBUTION OF COUNTY FUNDING. AS A REMINDER,
8 COUNTRIES ARE NOT GUARANTEED TO RECEIVE THEIR TARGET SHARE IN
9 ACCORDANCE WITH FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS. THE FIFTH COLUMN SHOWS
10 THE REGIONAL NORTH BAY AUGMENTATION TARGETS, THEY ARE INCLUDED
11 HERE FOR REFERENCE ONLY. FINALLY THE LAST COLUMN SHOWS
12 ILLUSTRATIVE TOTALS BY COUNTY, WHICH IS NOT GUARANTEED AND
13 WOULD FOLLOW THE CALL FOR PROJECTS PROCESS, BUT INCLUDED HERE
14 FOR REFERENCE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. NOW SHIFTING TO THE
15 REGIONAL SIDE, THIS TABLE SUMMARIZES THE DRAFT REGIONAL
16 PROGRAMS AND GOAL AREAS. THESE ARE SIMILAR TO WHAT WE
17 PRESENTED AT THE OCTOBER WORKSHOP AND NOVEMBER COMMISSION
18 MEETINGS, EXCEPT THE SET ASIDES ARE BROKEN OUT AS A CATEGORY
19 FOR CLARITY AND THE REMAINING CATEGORY AND GOAL AREAS ARE THE
20 SAME AND THESE INCLUDE THE GROWTH FRAMEWORK, ENVIRONMENT,
21 COMPLETE STREETS, MULTIMODAL NETWORKS. AS WE DISCUSSED
22 PREVIOUSLY, THESE DRAFT FUNDING AMOUNTS REPRESENT SUBSTANTIAL
23 REDUCTIONS FROM THE OBAG 3 REGIONAL FRAMEWORK. NEXT SLIDE,
24 PLEASE. FINALLY THIS SLIDE PREVIEWS TOC POLICY TOPICS THAT
25 WILL BE ADDRESSED IN THE FEBRUARY RECOMMENDATIONS. FIRST STAFF



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 WILL RECOMMEND A FINAL EVALUATION FRAMEWORK TO DETERMINE
2 ELIGIBILITY FOR THE \$45 MILLION TOC SET ASIDE PROPOSED TODAY.
3 THIS FRAMEWORK WILL ADDRESS OUTSTANDING TOPIC AREAS RELATED TO
4 CREDITS, RECENT STATE LAWS, AND COUNTY HOUSING PROTECTION
5 PROGRAMS. SECOND, STAFF WILL RECOMMEND UPDATED DEADLINES FOR
6 JURISDICTIONS COMPETING FOR THESE TOC SET ASIDE FUNDS AND
7 STAFF WILL RECOMMEND REVISIONS TO THE TOC RESOLUTION FOR
8 CONSISTENCY AND REVIEW ASSOCIATED UPDATES TO THE TOC
9 ADMINISTRATIVE GUIDANCE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, I'LL LEAVE
10 YOU WITH OUR DRAFT RECOMMENDATION TODAY, WHICH IS TO ADOPT THE
11 OBAG 4 FRAMEWORK, INCLUDING THE SB125 OFF THE TOP, AND THE \$50
12 MILLION IN REGIONAL TOC INCENTIVES SET ASIDES. I LOOK FORWARD
13 TO YOUR QUESTIONS AND DISCUSSION. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, BEFORE I GO TO QUESTIONS, I
16 WANTED TO COMMENT JUST A LITTLE BIT, THE RECOMMENDATION, THE
17 AD HOC COMMITTEE THAT MET. WE LOOKED AT A VARIETY OF WAYS TO
18 DO THE SPLIT AND WE THOUGHT THIS WAS A GOOD BALANCE OF
19 ADDRESSING THE 125 BUT ALSO HAVING SIGNIFICANT ENOUGH DOLLARS
20 TO USE FOR THE INCENTIVIZING ON THE TOC POLICY. OTHER SPLITS
21 DID NOT ALLOW FOR SUFFICIENT DOLLARS TO REALLY INCENTIVIZE THE
22 TOC POLICY AND WE THOUGHT THAT WAS IMPORTANT BECAUSE IT WAS
23 NOT BEING USED ON THE COUNTY SIDE. I WANTED TO GIVE YOU THE
24 BASIS OF THE AD HOC COMMITTEE'S DISCUSSION ON THAT POINT. WITH
25 THAT, ANY COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I KNEW



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THERE HAD TO BE SOMEBODY.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** DO WE KNOW HOW MANY PUBLIC COMMENTS WE'RE GOING TO
4 HAVE TOO?

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I DO NOT KNOW YET.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** IT MAY BE INTERESTING TO HEAR FROM THEM FIRST. CAN WE
9 DO THAT?

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IF THERE ARE NO QUESTIONS RIGHT NOW, WE CAN
12 GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SHE IS FLASHING NUMBERS AT ME. 15? WE HAVE
17 15, OKAY. ALL RIGHT, WE WILL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY, WE WILL START WITH THOSE IN THE ROOM
20 AND THEN WE WILL MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE. WE'RE GOING TO STICK
21 WITH ONE MINUTE.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES, PLEASE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LET ME BRING UP THE CLOCK SO WE CAN GET



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THAT OUT OF THE WAY. PLEASE GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM
2 AND I WILL SHARE THE CLOCK. TAP THE BUTTON FIRST.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. HI, MY NAME IS EMILY. I AM WITH PUBLIC
5 ADVOCATES AND I'M A RESIDENT OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. I AM HERE TO
6 SUPPORT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND TENANT PROTECTION POLICY.
7 YOU HAVE A MANDATE TO MEET AND THE CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND
8 TENANT PROTECTIONS. IT'S WAY TOO LOW TO BE A MEANINGFUL
9 INCENTIVE. CONSIDERING THAT OBAG IS A SMALL PORTION OF THE
10 TOTAL FUNDING, WE THINK IT'S A REASONABLE REQUEST THAT ALL
11 FUNDING IS CONDITIONED ON TOC COMPLIANCE. WITHOUT STRONG ANTI-
12 DISPLACEMENT MEASURES, MTC WILL NOT MEET THEIR TARGETS AND
13 PROBABLY BE SUED. TAKE THIS SERIOUSLY AND ACT WITH TENANT
14 PROTECTIONS THAT GO BEYOND STATE LAW AND STRONG INCENTIVES.
15 THANK YOU VERY MUCH, HAVE A WONDERFUL DAY.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, ENRIQUE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSION, I'M ENRIQUE WITH THE
20 REALTORS GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS. IT DOESN'T MAKE A DIFFERENCE IF
21 IT'S \$1 OR \$1 MILLION, THE TOC IS FLAWED AND SHOULD NOT BE
22 LINKED TO TRANSPORTATION FUNDS. WE OPPOSE LINKING
23 TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO POLICIES LIKE RELOCATION PAYMENTS AND
24 TAXPAYER FUNDED AND ONE SIDED LEGAL REPRESENTATION FOR TENANTS
25 BUT NOT HOUSING PROVIDERS. MTC SHOULD BE FOCUSED ON DISPENSING



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 TRANSPORTATION GRANTS TO LOCAL CITIES WITHOUT CONTINGENCIES ON
2 HOUSING REGULATIONS. HOUSING IS AN INTENSELY REGULATED
3 INDUSTRY AND WE SHOULD NOT BE ADDING MORE REGULATIONS ON THE
4 STATE LEGISLATURE CONSIDERS HUNDREDS OF NEW HOUSING LAWS EACH
5 LEGISLATIVE CYCLE. IF MTC WANTS TO SPEND MORE MONEY ON HOUSE,
6 THEY SHOULD SPEND IT ON BUILDING HOUSING. WITH THE GOALS OF
7 BUILDING HOUSING IN MIND, WE RECOMMEND THAT MTC REPLACE TOC'S
8 PRODUCTION --

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. GREG, FOLLOWED BY JOSEPH, AND
11 SANDY.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, MY NAME IS GREG, I'M WITH THE SANTA CLARA
14 ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS AS WELL. I'M GOING TO GET TO THE POINT
15 HERE. THE MTC SHOULD REJECT THE HOUSING SECTION OF THE TOC
16 BECAUSE IT WAS DEVELOPED BY PEOPLE WHO WORKED TO BRING RENT
17 CONTROL TO LOCAL CITIES, LOCAL BAY AREA CITIES, INCLUDING
18 THROUGH BALLOT INITIATIVES THAT SEW DIVISION IN OUR
19 COMMUNITIES. IF ANY OF THESE PEOPLE WERE INVOLVED IN THESE
20 EFFORTS AND THEY WORKED ON THE TOC, THAT IS ENOUGH PROOF THAT
21 YOU REJECT THE TOC FOR BEING BIAS. MTC SHOULD DISPENSE GRANTS
22 TO LOCAL CITIES WITHOUT CONTINGENCIES ON HOUSING REGULATIONS.
23 MTC CAN NO LONGER ALLOW STAFF TO PERPETUATE THE NARRATIVE THAT
24 WE ARE AT FAULT FOR THE HOUSING PROBLEM AND HOUSING PROVIDERS
25 NEED TO BE PUNISHED. YOU MTC COMMISSIONERS CAN STOP THIS



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 UNFAIR TREATMENT. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, JOSEPH FOLLOWED BY SANDY AND
4 REBECCA.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES, JOSEPH, BART RIDER FOR YEARS. I DON'T UNDERSTAND
7 WHY THIS GROUP IS GOING TO RESIST OPPOSITION TO THIS POLICY BY
8 PUTTING IN THESE ONEROUS HOUSING POLICIES. WE SHOULD BE
9 FOCUSED ON TRANSPORTATION, NOT IN DICTATING TO CITIES WHAT
10 THEIR HOUSING POLICIES SHOULD BE. VOTERS HAVE REJECTED A
11 NUMBER OF THESE POLICIES BEFORE. I URGE THE COMMISSION TO
12 SUPPORT THE VOTERS AND REJECT THESE POLICIES. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SANDY, FOLLOWED BY REBECCA, AND
15 JEFF.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE, I'M GOING TO BE SHORT AND SWEET. I THINK
18 SPENDING TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO REGULATE HOUSING PROVIDERS
19 NOT ONLY WRONG, BUT IT'S A WASTE OF TAXPAYER MONEY. THAT MONEY
20 IS BETTER SPENT ON ACTUAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS TO IMPROVE
21 MOBILITY AND PEDESTRIAN SAFETY. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.
22 APPRECIATE IT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. REBECCA, JEFF, AND JOHN.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M REBECCA, AN ADVOCATE FOR SENIORS.
2 WHEN MTC TIES TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO HOUSING MANDATES THROUGH
3 THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES FRAMEWORK, IT ENCOURAGES
4 REDEVELOPMENT PRESSURE NEAR TRANSIT. THAT PRESSURE DOES NOT
5 FALL EVENLY. SENIORS ON FIXED INCOMES ARE ESPECIALLY
6 VULNERABLE. MANY SENIORS ARE FACING RISING UNAVOIDABLE COST,
7 INSURANCE IS A CLEAR EXAMPLE. MTC SHOULD BE FOCUSED ON
8 DISPENSING TRANSPORTATION GRANTS TO LOCAL CITIES WITHOUT
9 CONTINGENCIES ON HOUSING REGULATIONS. WHEN REDEVELOPMENT
10 ACCELERATES MINOR DISRUPTIONS LIKE CONSTRUCTIONS DAMAGE,
11 UTILITY SHUT OFFS, OR TEMPORARY DISPLACEMENT BECOMES SERIOUS
12 FINANCIAL RISKS. WITHOUT INCOME FLEXIBILITY, THERE IS NO
13 BUFFER, NO RECOVERY TIME. I SUPPORT MORE HOUSING AND BETTER
14 TRANSPORTATION BUT EQUITY MEANS --

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THAT'S YOUR TIME. NEXT UP IS
17 JEFF, FOLLOWED BY JOHN, AND JOE BROWN.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON, JEFF FROM THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY
20 ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS. HOUSING IS AN INTENSELY REGULATED
21 INDUSTRY, ESPECIALLY IN THE RETAIL HOUSING MARKET. MTC SHOULD
22 NOT BE ADDING MORE REGULATIONS WHEN STATE LEGISLATURES ALWAYS
23 CONSIDERING HUNDREDS OF NEW HOUSING LAWS EACH LEGISLATIVE
24 YEAR. WE'RE OPPOSED TO THIS COMMITTEE FUNDING THE ALLOCATION
25 TO TLC BECAUSE THE TLC IS NOT FULLY ADOPTED BY THIS COMMITTEE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AND MTC. WE WISH TO CORRECT THAT. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JOHN, FOLLOWED BY JOE BROWN,
4 AND JENNY.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME, I AM A REAL ESTATE AGENT IN
7 SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA. I LIVE IN SAN JOSE MY ENTIRE LIFE. I
8 HAVE BEEN IN REAL ESTATE 52 YEARS. ALL I'VE SEEN IN THE LAST
9 SEVERAL YEARS IS POLICY COMING OUT THAT IS HURTING OUR MARKETS
10 BOTH FOR RENTERS AND FOR OWNERS. TOO MUCH LEGISLATION, TOO
11 MANY LAYERS THAT YOU NEED TO GO THROUGH, BUILDERS DON'T WANT
12 TO BUILD HERE BECAUSE IT TAKES TOO MUCH TIME TO GO THROUGH
13 THOSE LAYERS, AND OUR TENANTS ARE COMPLAINING ABOUT HIGH RENTS
14 WHILE WE'RE LOSING OUR HOUSING PROVIDERS BECAUSE THEY DON'T
15 WANT TO COME HERE WITH THE POLICIES THAT WE HAVE HERE SET FOR
16 THEM TO WORK BY. I'M ASKING THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY TO DO
17 WHAT THEY DO BEST, STICK WITH TRANSPORTATION. LET THE REAL
18 ESTATE INDUSTRY HANDLE THAT END OF IT. IT'S A TOUGH ONE TO DO,
19 BUT WE'RE TRYING OUR BEST AND IT DOESN'T HELP WITH MORE
20 LAYERS. I WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF YOU CONSIDER THAT. I
21 UNDERSTAND THAT THE REST OF YOUR AGENDA, BUT PLEASE KEEP REAL
22 ESTATE OUT OF IT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JOE BROWN, FOLLOWED BY JENNY,
25 AND ANIL. IT'S ALREADY ON.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T FOLLOW DIRECTIONS VERY WELL. JOE BROWN, SANTA
3 CLARA COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS. WE FACE IN NORTHERN
4 CALIFORNIA, WE FACE HOUSING SHORTAGE. WE FACE MULTIPLE UNITS
5 AVAILABLE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE FACE HOUSING FOR THE
6 HOMELESS. WE OPPOSE THIS BILL BECAUSE IT'S JUST GOING TO ADD
7 MORE REGULATION ON TO WHAT WE ARE ALREADY OVERREGULATED AND
8 WHERE IT'S GOING TO HINDER THE BUILDING OF NEW HOMES AND NEW
9 RENTAL UNITS, AND SHELTER FOR THE HOMELESS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, JENNY FOLLOWED BY ANIL, AND
12 RORY.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS JENNY, I AM HERE TO SPEAK ON BEHALF OF BAY
15 AREA HOMEOWNERS NETWORK, A GRASSROOTS ORGANIZATION
16 REPRESENTING THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA MOM-AND-POP HOUSING
17 PROVIDERS. WE RESPECTFULLY REQUEST THAT THE COMMISSIONERS TO
18 OUTRIGHT REJECT TO LINK TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO BAD HOUSING
19 POLICIES THAT ADDS ADDITIONAL BURDENS TO HOUSING PROVIDERS.
20 MOM-AND-POP ARE NATURALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROVIDERS. WE ARE
21 THE VICTIMS OF THESE BAD POLICIES. WE ARE ALSO WITNESSES FROM
22 THE PAST DECADES HOW THE BAD POLICIES DO TO THE LOCAL CITIES.
23 IF MTC STAFF WANTS TO SPEND MONEY ON HOUSING, PLEASE SPEND
24 THEM ON BUILDING HOUSING INSTEAD OF SCREW US. THANK YOU.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ANIL, FOLLOWED BY ROW, AND
2 JENNIFER.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, WITH THE CALIFORNIA
5 APARTMENT ASSOCIATION, WE'RE A NON-PROFIT THAT REPRESENTS
6 RENTAL HOUSING PROVIDERS ACROSS THE STATE. THE POLICY BEFORE
7 YOU TODAY HAS SEEN SIGNIFICANT CHANGES TO ADDRESS THE IMMENSE
8 AMOUNT OF FEEDBACK RECEIVED FROM A NUMBER OF ORGANIZATIONS AND
9 INDIVIDUALS. HOWEVER, THE CHALLENGE WITH THE CHANGES THAT ARE
10 BEING RECOMMENDED IS THAT IT'S SETTING THE FUNDING LEVELS
11 BEFORE THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA IS SET. SO THIS BEGS THE
12 QUESTION, WHAT ARE WE FUNDING? WE SHOULD BE DISCUSSING THE
13 ISSUES FIRST AS THERE HAVE BEEN IMMENSE AMOUNTS OF FEEDBACK
14 FROM STAKEHOLDERS REGARDING THE REMOVAL OF THE HOUSING
15 COMPONENT. SINCE THAT HAS BEEN COVERED BY THE HOUSING ELEMENT
16 AND SO WE ASK THAT WE TAKE A PAUSE AND FOCUS ON WHAT WE'RE
17 GOING TO BE FUNDING BEFORE WE TALK ABOUT FUNDING. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, I AM HERE TODAY TO
22 SUPPORT THE DISTRIBUTION OF OBAG 4 FUNDS TO LOCAL
23 JURISDICTIONS AND OPENING UP THE APPLICATION PERIOD TO THE
24 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS AS EARLY AS POSSIBLE. MY COMMENT TODAY IS
25 GOING TO BE FOCUSED SOLELY ON THE \$45 MILLION TO \$50 MILLION



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THAT TOC SETS ASIDE. WE BELIEVE THAT APPROVING THAT FRAMEWORK
2 IS PREMATURE, ESPECIALLY WHEN THE TOC IS NOT FINALIZED AND
3 THIS COMMISSION HAS TO DECIDE WHETHER OR NOT TO LINK OBAG 4
4 FUNDS TO TOC. THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO BE ENGAGED IN THE
5 DISCUSSION AND MAKE THIS DECISION BEFORE COMMITTING 45 TO 50
6 MILLION TO OBAG 4 FUNDS. HOLDING OFF ON THIS COMMITMENT TODAY
7 IS THE PRUDENT THING TO DO BECAUSE NEXT MONTH'S MEETING WILL
8 FOCUS ON WHAT THE TOC WILL LAND. IT BROUGHT MANY INVESTMENTS
9 IN LOCAL JURISDICTIONS FOR TRANSPORTATION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP, JENNIFER, FOLLOWED BY
12 AMANDA, AND JULIA.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, I AM WITH THE CALIFORNIA
15 APARTMENT ASSOCIATION. WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT MTC'S PROPOSED
16 TWO-STEP PROCESS FOR THE OBAG 4 PROGRAM. SPECIFICALLY, THE
17 DECISION TO APPROVE FUNDING ACTIONS BEFORE POLICY ACTIONS. FOR
18 THIS REASON, WE RESPECTFULLY OPPOSE ALLOCATING THE FUNDING FOR
19 THE TOC SET ASIDES BEFORE THE TOC POLICY IS EVEN FINALIZED.
20 COMMISSIONERS EXPRESSED A WIDE RANGE OF PERSPECTIVES AND
21 PREFERENCES ON BOTH FUNDING AND POLICY ISSUES, AND WANTING TO
22 MOVE QUICKLY SHOULD NOT COME AT THE EXPENSE OF CONTINUED
23 DELIBERATIONS OR DISREGARD FOR THE DIVERSE VIEWPOINTS OF YOUR
24 FELLOW COMMISSIONERS. THE STAFF REPORT STATES THAT THIS TWO-
25 STEP PROCESS WILL ALLOW THE CALL FOR PROJECTS TO PROCEED IN



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THE NEAR-TERM AND PROVIDE CERTAINTY TO JURISDICTIONS AND OTHER
2 STAKEHOLDERS REGARDING THE TOC INCENTIVE PROGRAM. I WOULD ASK
3 YOU, HOW CAN STAFF PROVIDE CERTAINTY ABOUT A TOC INCENTIVE
4 PROGRAM BEFORE THE COMMISSION EVEN REVIEWS OR APPROVES THE
5 PROPOSED TOC EVALUATION FRAMEWORK.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AMANDA, FOLLOWED BY JULIA, AND
8 IMIL.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, I'M AMANDA WITH URBAN
11 HABITAT. I WANTED TO BRING US ON TOPIC WITH TODAY'S VOTE,
12 WHICH IS ABOUT THE FUNDING FRAMEWORK FOR THE TOC, WHICH WAS
13 VOTED ON AND APPROVE IN 2022. I WANTED TO EMPHASIZE THAT THE
14 REASON WHY THE TOC WAS PASSED WAS TO COMPLY WITH SB365 AND TO
15 BRING PLAN BAY AREA 2050 TO FRUITION, NOT JUST MAKE IT A PLAN.
16 WE NEED TO HAVE A WAY TO COMPLY WITH SB375 WITH OUR OBAG MONEY
17 THAT WAS GIVEN TO US BY THE STATE. I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THE
18 COMMISSION HAS A PLAN IF THEY CONTINUE TO WATER DOWN THE TOC
19 TO THIS DEGREE, HOW ARE WE GOING TO CONDITION THE MONEY TO
20 MAKE SURE WE'RE COMPLYING WITH STATE REGULATION. HOUSING
21 POLICY IS PART OF THAT, THAT'S PART OF PLAN BAY AREA. SO IF
22 THIS IS SOMETHING YOU WANT TO DO TO WATER IT DOWN FURTHER,
23 JUST MAKE SURE YOU HAVE A PLAN GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JULIA.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HELLO AGAIN COMMISSIONERS, JULIA WITH TRANSFORM. I AM
3 HERE AS AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING ADVOCATE AND CLIMATE ADVOCATE TO
4 SUPPORT THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES AND URGE YOU TO
5 STRENGTHEN HOW IT'S TIED TO ONE BAY AREA GRANT. SO STATE LAW
6 ALREADY RECOGNIZES THAT HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION IS
7 INSEPARABLE, UNDER SB375, MTC IS DIRECTED TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE
8 GAS EMISSIONS BY COORDINATING LAND USE, HOUSING, AND
9 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING. WHEN THOSE SYSTEMS ARE TREATED
10 SEPARATELY, WE MOVE BACKWARDS ON OUR PLAN BAY AREA GOALS AND
11 JUST SIMPLY AS A REGION, PREVENTING DISPLACEMENT AND
12 PRESERVING AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT IS CENTRAL
13 TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES. VEHICLES MILED TRAVELED AND
14 EMISSIONS INCREASE. THE TOC POLICY, WHICH HAS BEEN PASSED,
15 REFLECTS YEARS OF WORK. IT ONLY WORKS IF COMPLIANCE IS A REAL
16 CONDITION FOR RECEIVING THOSE FUNDS. PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT
17 CONDITIONING --

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME. THANK YOU. EMIL AND WENDI.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, I AM WITH ENTERPRISE
22 COMMUNITY PARTNERS AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING NON-PROFIT. YOU
23 PROBABLY SEEN OUR LETTER IN YOUR PACKET, ALONG WITH OUR
24 ADVOCACY PARTNERS. WE WELCOME THE PROPOSED \$5 MILLION FOR THE
25 NORTH BAY AUGMENTATION AND THE SPLIT OF FUNDS BETWEEN REGIONAL



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AND COUNTY PROGRAMS. WE THINK IT STRIKES A GOOD BALANCE
2 BETWEEN REGIONAL PRIORITIES AND SUBREGIONAL PRIORITIES, GIVEN
3 THE DIVERSITY OF OUR REGION. HOWEVER, WE STRONGLY URGE AND
4 ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO CONSIDER INCREASING THE TOC SET
5 ASIDE TO MAKE IT A WORTHY INCENTIVE FOR TOC COMPLIANCE. WE
6 WANT TO REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT PART OF YOUR MANDATE IS THE
7 IMPLEMENTATION OF PLAN BAY AREA AND THIS IS ONE OF THE PRIMARY
8 TOOLS TO IMPLEMENT THAT PLAN. WITHOUT THE TOC POLICY, WE WOULD
9 NOT BE ABLE TO REACH OUR GOALS. THE TOC POLICY WAS PASSED IN
10 2022 UNDER CAREFULLY NEGOTIATED PROVISIONS, SO WE URGE YOU TO
11 KEEP THAT READY.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, WENDY WONG AND THEN WE WILL
14 MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI, GOOD MORNING. I AM THE SPEAKER OF SAN FRANCISCO
17 COALITION FOR GOOD NEIGHBORHOODS. I RARELY ATTEND ANY PUBLIC
18 HEARINGS, BUT THE AVENUE WE HAVE THAT TOOK US 30-PLUS YEARS TO
19 REPAVE IT. IMAGINE IT TAKES 30-YEARS AND IT COSTS A LITTLE
20 OVER \$1 MILLION OVER THE \$45 MILLION THAT YOU ARE GOING TO
21 CONTRIBUTE TO THE TOC. THE HOUSING ISSUE IS NOT, IS NOT ONLY
22 THE MOM AND POP LANDLORD ISSUE, BUT IT'S RESTRAINING LAWS AND
23 REGULATIONS TO STOP PROVIDING THE HOUSING. THE MTC SHOULD
24 FOCUS ON THEIR MISSION. THE MISSION IS TO HAVE THE LAND USE
25 AND ALSO PLANNING. THERE IS NO COLLAPSING OF RENT CONTROL



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ISSUES. STICK WITH YOUR COMMISSION, PLEASE. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, BEFORE WE GO TO THE ZOOM SPACE,
4 WE DID RECEIVE LETTERS OF CORRESPONDENCE, THREE LETTERS FROM
5 THREE DIFFERENT COALITIONS. THEY HAVE ALL BEEN POSTED TO THE
6 ONLINE AGENDA AND SENT TO YOU LAST NIGHT. SO FIRST IN THE ZOOM
7 SPACE --

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** KIMBERLY, CAN WE ASK FOR ANYBODY WHO WOULD
10 LIKE TO SPEAK ONLINE TO PLEASE RAISE THEIR HAND NOW AND IN 5
11 MINUTES, CUT THAT OFF.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AS THE CHAIR NOTED, IF YOU ARE
14 IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND WANT TO SPEAK, RAISE YOUR HAND NOW
15 PLEASE. THANK YOU. SO FIRST UP, KEN CHAN, PLEASE UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS KEN, AND WE
19 WORK WITH COMMUNITIES AND THEIR LEADERS TO PRESERVE QUALITY
20 AFFORDABLE HOMES. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR PUTTING TOGETHER
21 THE REPORT AND PRESENTATION TODAY. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT
22 WHEN LEADERS LIKE YOU MAKE GOOD HOUSING POLICIES AND
23 DECISIONS, OUR HOUSING SYSTEM OPERATES BETTER AND WE DON'T
24 LEAVE THE SURVIVAL TO CHANCE OR LUCK. IT SHOULD PROVIDE THE
25 CRITICAL THINGS THAT OUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS NEED TO LIVE, WORK,



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AND THRIVE IN THE BAY AREA. YOU CAN STRENGTHEN YOUR COMMITMENT
2 TO THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICY. I URGE YOU TO
3 INCREASE THE SET ASIDE TO 20% OF THE REGIONAL PROGRAM AND TO
4 CREATE A DEDICATED TOC INCENTIVE POOL. YOU CAN ENSURE THE
5 SUCCESS OF THE TOC POLICY AND MORE IMPORTANTLY, MAKE SURE THAT
6 THE NEIGHBORHOODS -- MAKE SURE THE NEIGHBORHOODS ACROSS YOUR
7 COMMUNITIES ARE MORE LIVABLE, CONNECTED, AND SUPPORTIVE OF
8 YOUR RESIDENTS' EVERY DAY NEEDS. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, NEXT UP IS EBLC TEAM. PLEASE
11 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, I'M THE POLICY DIRECTOR AND I'M SPEAKING ON
14 BEHALF OF A BROAD COALITION OF ORGANIZATIONS REPRESENTING
15 HUNDREDS OF EMPLOYERS ACROSS THE REGION. WE SHARE MTC'S GOALS
16 OF ENCOURAGING HOUSING ACCESS AND AFFORDABILITY, BUT WE'RE
17 CONCERNED THE THREE P'S REQUIREMENTS WILL CREATE BARRIERS FOR
18 DESPERATELY NEEDED HOUSING. WE WANT THEM TO REPLACE IT WITH
19 HOUSING CERTIFICATION, MAKING SURE TOC REQUIREMENTS ARE ALIGN
20 WITH STATE LAW. THIS WILL GIVE TOC A CHANCE. OUR COALITION
21 SUBMITTED A LETTER YESTERDAY THAT OUTLINES THE FULL
22 RECOMMENDATION ON THE TOC POLICY AND WE URGE THE COMMISSION TO
23 REVIEW IT IN ADVANCE OF YOUR FEBRUARY MEETING. PLEASE REACH
24 OUT WITH ANY QUESTIONS OR TO DISCUSS FURTHER. THANK YOU SO
25 MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO, GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, SPEAKING NOW FOR
5 MY LOCAL PROJECT, A COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION FOCUSING ON
6 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN MENLO PARK, AND I REALLY WANTED TO
7 SUPPORT THE THREE P'S PRODUCTION AND PRESERVATION AND RENTER
8 PROTECTION. HAVING THE REGIONAL LEVEL POLICIES AND INCENTIVES,
9 IN ADDITION TO THE STATE LAWS, IS SOMETHING THAT HAS ALREADY
10 BEEN HELPFUL AT ADVANCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND TENANT
11 PRODUCTION IN MENLO PARK. SO I WOULD ENCOURAGE, I AM STAYING
12 THE COURSE FOR THE BAY AREA, HAVING HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION
13 POLICIES WORK TOGETHER IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO BE ABLE TO
14 ACHIEVE ALL OF THOSE GOALS. SO PLEASE CONTINUE WITH THESE
15 POLICIES, THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SHANTI SINGH.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI, MY NAME IS SHANTI, THE STATE LEGISLATIVE DIRECTOR
20 AT TENANTS TOGETHER AND I'M A SAN FRANCISCO TENANT. ON BEHALF
21 TO THE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS IN OUR COALITION, WE SUPPORT
22 THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROTECTIONS OF THE TOC. PREVENTING
23 DISPLACEMENT IS ESSENTIAL TO MEETING THE GREENHOUSE GAS
24 REQUIREMENTS. WORKING-CLASS PEOPLE USE TRANSIT MORE AND THEY
25 NEED PROTECTION FROM SKYROCKETING RENT HIKES AND EVICTIONS.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 TRANSIT AND GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS REQUIRE TENANT
2 PRODUCTION. GIVEN THAT OBAG IS A SMALL PORTION OF THE TOTAL
3 FUNDING, IT'S REASONABLE TO CONDITION ALL OBAG FUNDING TO
4 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON COMPLIANCE, WITHOUT STRONG ANTI-
5 DISPLACEMENT MEASURES, MTC WILL NOT MEET THEIR TARGETS. WE
6 WANT TO GO BEYOND STATE LAW, WHICH IS MEANT TO BE A POLICY
7 FLOOR, NOT A CEILING. THE BAY CAN AND SHOULD DO BETTER. THANK
8 YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JORDAN GRIMES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, JORDAN GRIMES. THE OBAG
13 FRAMEWORK MUST REFLECT THE REALITY. UNDER SB375, THEY HAVE A
14 CLEAR OBLIGATION TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND IT CAN
15 ONLY BE ACHIEVED IF DOLLARS ARE LINKED TO OUTCOMES THAT REDUCE
16 VMT. WE'RE FAILING OUR CLIMATE GOALS, WE'RE FAILING OUR
17 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY GOALS, AND TRANSPORTATION SITS AT THE
18 CENTER OF BOTH. TLC ALIGNS WITH THE LAND USE DECISIONS THAT
19 SUPPORT TRANSIT NEAR AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE TOC POLICY
20 REFLECTS YEARS OF HARD WORK, THOUGHTFUL WORK TO ALIGN
21 TRANSPORTATION AND CLIMATE GOALS, BUT TOC ONLY WORKS IF
22 COMPLIANCE IS REAL, ENFORCEMENT, AND TIED TO FUNDING
23 DECISIONS. STRENGTHENING ITS CONNECTIONS TO OBAG IS ESSENTIAL
24 TO DELIVERING THE OUTCOMES PLAN BAY AREA REQUIRES. IF WE'RE
25 SERIOUS ABOUT CLIMATE AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY, A STRONG TOC



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 IS NOT OPTIONAL, IT'S ESSENTIAL. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
4 HANDS MADAM CHAIR.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU, SO WE'RE GOING TO BRING IT
7 BACK TO COMMISSIONERS FOR ANY COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS.
8 COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

9

10 **MITCH MASHBURN:** I'LL KICK IT OFF. THANKS MA'AM. IT'S A COUNTRY
11 BOY THING. JUST LIKE LAST TIME WHEN WE ALL TALKED ABOUT THIS
12 AT OUR WORKSHOP SESSION, RIGHT? I GOT ISSUES WITH SOME OF THE
13 POLICY PIECES OF THIS. I'M APPRECIATIVE HOW YOU DIVVIED UP THE
14 DOUGH. I HAVE TO AGREE WITH FOLKS IN THAT WE'RE PUTTING THE
15 CART BEFORE THE HORSE, WE NEED TO FLIP THE SCRIPT. I AM GOING
16 TO HAVE A LOT TO SAY ABOUT POLICY, BUT IT'S GOING TO BE TIED
17 TO THE MONEY, RIGHT? SO, I AM THINKING THERE ARE PROBABLY
18 OTHER FOLKS OUT HERE WITH THE SAME FEELING ABOUT IT,
19 ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES TO THINGS AROUND HOUSING AND
20 PARTICULARLY RENT CONTROL, HAVE ISSUES WITH US REQUIRING THAT.
21 I'LL GET INTO ALL THAT WHEN WE HAVE THAT DISCUSSION ON THE
22 POLICY PIECE. I CAN SUPPORT HOW YOU WANT TO DIVVY UP THE
23 MONEY, BUT I THINK WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT THE POLICY PIECE
24 FIRST AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO TIE THAT TO THE MONEY BEFORE WE
25 DO THAT. SO THAT IS MY PIECE OF THIS. THAT IS ALL ABOUT I GOT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 TO SAY. I DON'T WANT TO GET TO THE REST OF IT AND CAUSE A
2 KERFUFFLE.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** RIGHT NOW THERE IS NO TOC MONEY TIED TO THE
5 COUNTY PIECE. IT'S ONLY THE \$45 MILLION. WERE YOU CONCERNED
6 ABOUT THE AMOUNT OR THE AMOUNT OF WHAT IT'S TIED TO?

7

8 **MITCH MASHBURN:** I'M CONCERNED ABOUT WHAT IT'S TIED TO, THE
9 POLICIES.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO ALL WE'RE VOTING ON TODAY IS THE AMOUNT
12 AND THE SPLIT AND THE POLICIES WILL BE NEXT MONTH.

13

14 **MITCH MASHBURN:** RIGHT, I GOT THAT PIECE. I KNOW THAT BUT WHAT
15 I'M SAYING IS THAT SOME OF THOSE POLICIES THAT WILL BE
16 AFFECTING THE \$50 MILLION, I MIGHT HAVE ISSUES WITH AND SO DO
17 OTHER PEOPLE HERE. SO IT MIGHT BE GOOD TO WAIT ON THAT \$50
18 MILLION PIECE OR AT LEAST \$45 MILLION PIECE UNTIL AFTER WE HAD
19 THOSE DISCUSSIONS. THAT'S ALL I'M SAYING. THAT'S WHERE I AM
20 AT.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU TO MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS FOR ALL THE
25 DISCUSSIONS AND INPUT WE HAVE BEEN HAVING HERE. WE DO OUR BEST



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 WORK IN PUBLIC WHEN WE HAVE A LOT OF FACTS BEFORE US HERE AND
2 THAT'S WHEN DEMOCRACY WORKS BEST TOO. THE CONSENSUS IS THAT WE
3 WANT THIS MONEY TO GO OUT BUT I AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUE HERE,
4 WE ARE ATTACHING IT TO SOMETHING THAT HAS YET TO BE DEFINED. I
5 THINK WE CAN BE VERY, VERY PRODUCTIVE LOOKING AT THE
6 INCENTIVES IN OBAG 3. THOSE ARE INCENTIVES. THOSE ARE STRONG
7 ACCOUNTABILITY INCENTIVES. THE ACCOUNTABILITY AS EVERY
8 JURISDICTION KNOWS UP HERE, WHEN YOU GET YOUR HOUSING
9 CERTIFICATION, IT IS FULLY ENFORCED BY THE STATE AND THEY CAN
10 TAKE THAT AWAY. SINCE 2022, WHEN THE FIRST TOC CAME OUT, THERE
11 HAS BEEN AN ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF STATE LEGISLATION, INCLUDING
12 THE TENANT BILL OF RIGHTS. WE HAVE SO MANY PROTECTIONS BUILT
13 IN RIGHT NOW. OUR JURISDICTIONS ARE ACHIEVING THE GOALS OF
14 PLAN BAY AREA AND WE POINTED THAT OUT. WE HAVE SOME SUPERSTARS
15 WITH DUBLIN, EVEN MY LITTLE CITY, THE FASTEST GROWING CITY IN
16 ALL SAN MATEO COUNTY, THE FIFTH FASTEST IN THE REGION HERE, WE
17 HAVE DISCUSSED THIS TIME AND TIME AGAIN. WE NEED TO BE LOOKING
18 AT THE ONES THAT ARE ACHIEVING THE MOST WITH WHAT WE HAVE
19 PRESENTLY, WITH WHAT THE STATE LAWS ARE. WHAT WE HAD IN OBAG 3
20 IS CHANGING EVERY MINUTE AND GETTING MORE AND MORE
21 ACCOUNTABILITY BUILT IN BECAUSE OUR LEGISLATURE IS WORKING
22 OVERTIME WITH HOUSING, BILLS COMING A MILE A MINUTE, I THINK
23 COMMISSIONER RAMOS MENTIONED LAST TIME OVER 100 PIECES OF
24 HOUSING LEGISLATION LAST YEAR ALONE. SO, WE ARE ACHIEVING PLAN
25 BAY AREA. WE ARE. SAN FRANCISCO REACHED 100% OF THEIR GOAL.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 SAN MATEO COUNTY, 110%. SO, OUR STAFF HAS BEEN SO EXTREMELY
2 HELPFUL IN AIDING JURISDICTIONS TO GET THOSE CERTIFICATIONS.
3 THAT IS WHERE OUR STAFF SHINES. IT'S HELPING THE JURISDICTIONS
4 GET THIS DONE. WE ARE BUILDING ALONG THE TRANSIT CORRIDORS. WE
5 ARE DOING ALL THE THINGS THAT THE STATE IS REQUIRING AND THANK
6 YOU TO OUR REPRESENTATIVES BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT THIS IS AN
7 EVER-CHANGING POLICY AND THIS IS SO PROGRESSIVE, WHAT WAS SET
8 OUT IN OBAG 3. WE DO NOT NEED TO LEAN IN AND ADD ON WHEN IN
9 FACT JUST CATCHING UP WITH THE NEW LAWS -- JURISDICTIONS ARE
10 HAVING SPECIAL MEETINGS JUST BASED ON SB79. IF WE CAN HELP AS
11 MTC, HELP OUR JURISDICTIONS THROUGH THAT PROCESS WITHOUT
12 ADDING ON TO THINGS THAT WE DON'T KNOW IF WILL GET FURTHER
13 RESULTS. WE KNOW WE ARE GETTING RESULTS AND WE HAVE SOME
14 SUPERSTARS, THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO FOCUS ON HERE. WE HAVE THE
15 INCENTIVES. THEY WERE SET OUT IN OBAG 3, YOU GET YOUR HOUSING
16 ELEMENT AND THAT HOUSING ELEMENT MEETS THE THREE P'S. WE ALSO
17 NOW HAVE THE TENANT BILL OF RIGHTS. IT HASN'T HAD AN
18 OPPORTUNITY TO WORK. THE LEGISLATURE HAS HAD HEARINGS JUST
19 RECENTLY THAT SAID LET'S GIVE IT TIME. LET'S SEE WHAT WORKS.
20 WE ARE ALL OBLIGATED BY LAW TO COMPLY WITH THE LAWS THAT ARE
21 COMING DOWN FROM THE LEGISLATURE. WE ARE SO PRODUCTIVE IN THAT
22 REALM RIGHT NOW, I DON'T KNOW WHY WE'RE NOT RECOGNIZING THAT
23 REALITY BECAUSE IT IS THE MOST PROGRESSIVE, THE MOST IMPACTFUL
24 REALITY IS WHAT WE PUT IN OBAG 3. IT GOT US AMAZING RESULTS
25 AND AGAIN, WE'RE GETTING THEM NOW. SO, WE SHOULDN'T BE TURNING



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OUR BACKS ON WHAT WE HAD THERE TO GO INTO SOMETHING NEW, WHICH
2 IS NOT CONSISTENT WITH STATE LAW. THAT CAUSES COMPLICATIONS.
3 WHAT WE HAVE NOW IS THE TRUST OF THE PUBLIC. WE HAVE
4 ACCOUNTABILITY, WE HAVE CONSISTENCY, WE HAVE CERTAINTY. WHAT
5 THE PROPOSED TOC, WHICH WE DON'T EVEN KNOW WHAT IT IS RIGHT
6 NOW, WE HAVEN'T SEEN IT. THE PROPOSED TOC IS UNCERTAINTY. WE
7 HAVE EFFICIENCIES RIGHT NOW, WE'RE ADDRESSING HOUSING,
8 TRANSPORTATION, CLIMATE WITH WHAT WE SET FORTH IN OBAG 3. WE
9 DO NOT NEED TO BE THE ENFORCERS OR ENFORCE JURISDICTIONS TO DO
10 MORE WHEN IN FACT IT'S THERE. THIS IS WHAT WE SHOULD BE
11 RELYING ON. IF WE GO TO SOMETHING NEW OR ADDITIONAL STUFF, WE
12 DON'T KNOW NEED TO ADD ON TO OUR JURISDICTIONS WHO ARE
13 STRUGGLING FINANCIALLY. I MEAN WHO WOULD THIS BENEFIT IF YOU
14 GO TO SOMETHING NEW THAT IS UNCERTAIN, WHO IS THAT GOING TO
15 BENEFIT? JURISDICTIONS THAT ALREADY HAVE SOME OF THESE
16 ELEMENTS? OUR JOB IS TO GET THIS MONEY OUT THERE SO THAT WE
17 CAN BENEFIT OUR COMMUNITY AND TO ACHIEVE THAT, WE HAVE BEFORE
18 US THE ANSWER. THAT IS WHAT WE SET FORTH IN OBAG 3. WE
19 SHOULDN'T BE GOING BEYOND THAT NOR SHOULD WE BE ADDRESSING
20 FUNDS HERE THAT CLEARLY SAY, THESE FUNDS ARE ATTACHED TO THE
21 TOC. SO, WE HAVEN'T DEFINED THAT YET. I THINK WE CAN, WE CAN
22 ABSOLUTELY DO THAT TODAY. WE CAN MAKE THAT HAPPEN BUT I STILL
23 HAVE PROBLEMS WITH EVEN THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS BECAUSE WE
24 HAVE SAID THERE IS A PROBLEM WITH THE 100 MILLION FROM SB125.
25 THAT I HAVE ASKED MULTIPLE TIMES AT EVERY JURISDICTION, FOR



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 ALL OF US TO MAKE AN EDUCATED DECISION. EACH ONE OF US NEEDS
2 TO KNOW THAT THIS 50/50 SPLIT, HOW THAT WILL EFFECT YOUR
3 JURISDICTION. SOLANO, ALAMEDA, WE HAVE THE TARGETS. WE ASK
4 THAT THIS BE SHARED WITH EVERYBODY UP HERE. I DON'T KNOW WHY
5 WE'RE AFRAID OF INFORMATION. IT'S LIKE THAT IS THE REALITY,
6 YOU NEED TO KNOW, YOU ARE GOING TO LOSE MILLIONS OF DOLLARS,
7 HOW THAT IS GOING TO IMPACT YOUR PROGRAMS AS THEY EXIST NOW,
8 AND THEN MAKE THAT DECISION WHEN YOU KNOW THAT. THAT HAS NOT
9 BEEN ADDRESSED AND I HOPE EVERYBODY KNOWS HOW THAT IS GOING TO
10 IMPACT THEM, JUST SO YOU HAVE THE FACTS. AGAIN, WE DO BETTER
11 WHEN WE HAVE THE FACTS SO WE KNOW WHAT IS IMPACTING US.
12 PLEASE, I THINK WE CAN GET TO FANTASTIC RESULTS IF WE
13 IMPLEMENT THE INCENTIVES SET FORTH IN OBAG 3. THEY ARE THE
14 BEST. I MEAN THEY ARE EVER-CHANGING. IT'S SO PROGRESSIVE, IT'S
15 EVER-CHANGING AND THEY WILL BENEFIT EACH AND EVERY
16 JURISDICTION. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN.

19

20 **MATT MAHAN:** I WILL BE BRIEF. I KNOW WE HAVE TO RUN WHEN WE
21 TALK ABOUT EQUITY, I WILL RAISE THE ISSUE OF GEOGRAPHIC
22 EQUITY. IT'S HARD TO MAKE IT THROUGH ALL THESE MEETINGS WHERE
23 FROM WE ARE. I HEAR COMMISSIONER MASHBURN'S POINT, I GENERALLY
24 WHEN ALLOCATING DOLLARS AND COMMITTING MONEY TO SOMETHING, I
25 WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHAT I'M BUYING. I DO FEEL THIS



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 CONVERSATION IS OUT OF ORDER AROUND THE TOC POT, THE SET
2 ASIDES SPECIFICALLY. I RECOMMEND THAT IF WE MOVE FORWARD WITH
3 ALLOCATIONS TODAY, WE INCLUDE IN THE MOTION THE FLEXIBILITY TO
4 RETURN THE MONEY TO THE POT IF WE CAN'T COME UP WITH A SHARED
5 FRAMEWORK THAT WE HAVE CONSENSUS AROUND. I THINK WE NEED THE
6 ABILITY TO REVISIT SPENDING IF WE REALLOCATE IT TODAY BEFORE
7 WE KNOW WHAT WE'RE BUYING AS A FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPAL. I HAVE
8 BIGGER CONCERNS ABOUT THE PRINCIPAL. FOR ME, WHERE I SIT, THE
9 BIGGEST CHALLENGE I HAVE SEEN FOR OUR STAFF IS THE CONSTANT
10 ENDLESS AMOUNT OF STAFF WORK TRYING TO KEEP UP WITH ALL OF THE
11 NEW RULES AND POLICIES FROM THE STATE. WE HAVE A LOT OF LOCAL
12 RULES. WE'RE VERY AMBITIOUS ON HOUSING IN SAN JOSE. WE PROVED
13 OF 20,000 UNITS IN THE PAST YEARS. NOW TO HAVE A REGIONAL
14 LAYER, ADDING MORE LEVELS, WE HAVE TO HIRE MORE CONSULTANTS
15 AND FIND OUT HOW IT AFFECTS REGIONAL RULES, I THINK WE HAVE
16 GOOD MECHANISMS AT THE STATE LEVEL. THE HOUSING ELEMENTS HAVE
17 TEETH, THEY'RE AGGRESSIVE AND AMBITIOUS. OURS WAS REJECTED
18 BECAUSE IT TOOK US A WHILE TO GET SIGN OFF AND WE'RE STILL
19 WORKING TO ACTUALLY WORKING THROUGH DOZENS OF POLICIES AND
20 PRACTICES, PROGRAMS THAT WE COMMITTED TO UNDER THE THREE P'S
21 PRINCIPAL. I WAS IN A CITY COUNCIL MEETING UNTIL 10:30 LAST
22 NIGHT IN LARGE PART BECAUSE OF THE WORK WE'RE DOING AROUND
23 SB79, WHICH IS OPENING UP AND FRANKLY FOR US, TAKING OUR
24 LIMITED LAST 13% OF EMPLOYMENT LAND THAT FUNDS OUR GENERAL
25 FUND DISPROPORTIONATELY THAT IF WE DON'T SCRAMBLE TO FIGURE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OUT WHICH LAND TO PROTECT, WE'RE GOING TO BE ONLY HOUSING AND
2 NOT PROVIDE ANY SERVICES TO OUR RESIDENTS. I AM GETTING
3 STRESSED ABOUT THE LEVEL. I KNOW WE HAVE A HOUSING CRISIS, WE
4 ABSOLUTELY NEED TO TACKLE IT. IT IS CORRECT AS MANY OF OUR
5 PUBLIC SPEAKERS POINTED OUT, THAT THERE IS A CLEAR NEXUS
6 BETWEEN TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE. WE TALKED ABOUT THAT FOR
7 YEARS HERE. WE ABSOLUTELY NEED TO MAKE THAT CONNECTION, BUT I
8 AM NERVOUS ABOUT NEW AND ADDITIONAL HOUSING REQUIREMENTS THAT
9 WE DO NOT HAVE CONSENSUS ON, WE DIDN'T ARTICULATE, AND WE'RE
10 TALKING ABOUT SETTING ASIDE A POT OF MONEY TO BE APPLIED TO
11 THOSE. I WILL ASK FOR THE FLEXIBILITY TO RETURN IT TO THE POT
12 IF WE DON'T HAVE CONSENSUS AND GEOGRAPHIC EQUITY. I MADE A
13 JOKE ABOUT THAT, AND THE TRAVEL INVOLVED, BUT I WILL SAY LET'S
14 NOT SET UP A POLICY THAT EFFECTIVELY JUST DOUBLES DOWN ON THE
15 DENSEST MOST TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES WE HAVE WITHOUT
16 ALLOWING THE REST OF US TO CATCH UP. WE'RE THE FIRST BIG CITY
17 TO ELIMINATE PARKING MINIMUMS. WE ADOPTED PRESERVATION
18 POLICIES. WE HAVE 137 APPROVED POLICIES FOCUSED ON THE THREE
19 P'S. WE APPROVED 20,000 HOUSING UNITS IN THE LAST FIVE YEARS.
20 WE HAVE 54 TRANSIT STATIONS ACROSS THE CITY OF 200 SQUARE
21 MILES. OUR ROUGH ASSESSMENT, WE MAY NOT BE COMPETITIVE ON THE
22 TOC SET ASIDE BASED ON CURRENTLY WHAT WE UNDERSTAND. DESPITE
23 TRYING TO GET CLOSER TO A SAN FRANCISCO, WHERE IT'S
24 APPROPRIATE WITHIN THE 200 SQUARE MILES. I THINK WHAT COMES IN
25 THE NEXT MEETING IS WHAT MATTERS MORE. I'M NERVOUS ABOUT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 COMMITTING TO A FRAMEWORK BEFORE WE KNOW WHERE WE'RE ALIGNED
2 ON THAT. WE NEED TO PUSH OURSELVES TO HELP THE AREAS THAT WANT
3 TO IMPLEMENT OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS TO GET THAT DENSE TRANSIT
4 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AND DON'T ACTUALLY UNINTENTIONALLY MAKE
5 IT HARDER FOR US TO CATCH UP AND GET TO THAT IDEAL THAT I
6 THINK WE SHARE. THERE ARE PLENTY OF AREAS WHERE WE WANT DENSE,
7 MIXED USE, HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT. WE HAVE TO BE REALISTIC ON
8 WHAT GETS US THERE. THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME SHARE A FEW
9 THOUGHTS.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, IF YOU HAVE TO RUN
12 TOO.

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES, I WANTED TO FOCUS ON THE ALLOCATION
15 PIECE AND THE QUESTION ABOUT SB125 FUNDS, WHETHER IT'S OFF THE
16 TOP OR WHICH POT OF MONEY TO TAKE IT FROM AND I HAVE SAID THIS
17 BEFORE. I CONTINUE TO BELIEVE THAT IT SHOULD COME FROM THE
18 REGIONAL SHARE. SO, GOING BACK TO SB125 WHEN THAT HAPPENED
19 THAT ALLOWED US TO TAKE FUNDING FROM CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT THE
20 STATE PROVIDES US TO BE USED FOR OPERATIONS, IF THEY ARE
21 NEEDED, AND THEN WE HAD TO COME UP WITH A PLAN. SO, WE DID
22 THAT AND THE PLAN WAS THAT WE WOULD TAKE OBAG FUNDS TO FILL
23 THE HOLES. SO IN LIGHT OF THAT BEING OUR DECISION, IT WAS A
24 REGIONAL PROBLEM OR SITUATION WE WERE IN, I BELIEVE THE
25 FUNDING SHOULD COME FROM THE REGIONAL POT. IF THE CONCERN IS



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THAT IT'S NOT ENOUGH IN THE REGIONAL POT TO DO IT, THEN I
2 WOULD SAY LOWER THE SET ASIDE AND I DO THINK THAT -- AND IT'S
3 HARD TO BIFURCATE ON WHAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO TALK ABOUT NEXT
4 MONTH BECAUSE I DO AGREE THAT WHAT WE END UP PUTTING IN THE
5 POLICY DOES EFFECT HOW WE ALLOCATE THE MONEY OR HOW MUCH
6 MONEY. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT \$100 MILLION, OR \$50 MILLION, WHICH
7 SOUNDS LIKE A LOT, BUT WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT THE ENTIRE NINE
8 BAY AREA REGIONS, EQUITABLY DISTRIBUTING IT, WE'RE TALKING
9 ABOUT NINE COUNTIES, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS THAT? \$10 MILLION,
10 WHICH MAY SOUND LIKE A LOT BUT FOR A COUNTY LIKE SANTA CLARA
11 COUNTY, WE HAVE SAN JOSE WITH A MILLION PEOPLE, IT'S REALLY
12 NOT A LOT OF MONEY. I WAS LISTENING LAST NIGHT AFTER MY FULL
13 DAY OF BOARD OF SUPERVISORS MEETING, I CAME HOME AND WATCHED
14 THE MOUNTAIN VIEW CITY COUNCIL MEETING ON YOUTUBE. THEY WERE
15 THERE UNTIL 12:30 TALKING ABOUT SB79. SO I REALLY DO SHARE THE
16 SENTIMENTS OF COMMISSIONER MAHAN THAT THE CITIES HAVE A LOT
17 PUT ON THEM. THEY'RE WORKING THROUGH IT. I SEE IT IN MY
18 DISTRICT 5. I HAVE NINE CITIES, SOME TINY CITIES WITH 3,500
19 PEOPLE, AND THEY HAVE ALL BEEN WORKING HARD TO GET THEIR
20 HOUSING ELEMENTS CERTIFIED, THERE ARE BUILDERS REMEDY PROJECTS
21 COMING THROUGH, AND THEY ARE WORKING HARD TO BUILD MORE
22 HOUSING, AND ALLOW FOR HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS. I JUST THINK IF
23 THIS MONEY WAS A LOT OF MONEY, IF WE HAD MORE MONEY TO GIVE
24 OUT, IT WOULD MAKE SENSE BUT WHEN CITIES AND COUNTIES ARE
25 STRUGGLING TO EVEN GET THEIR PROJECTS THAT THEY HAVE ON THE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 BOOKS RIGHT NOW DONE AND THEY ARE WORKING TO TRY TO MEET ALL
2 OF THESE STATE HOUSING LAWS, I JUST DON'T THINK THIS IS THE
3 TIME TO PUT ANOTHER LAYER OF REQUIREMENTS FOR THEM TO GET THIS
4 LITTLE BIT OF MONEY THAT WE'RE HANDING OUT AT THIS TIME. SO
5 THAT'S HOW I FEEL ABOUT WHERE THE MONEY SHOULD COME FROM, HOW
6 MUCH MONEY IT SHOULD BE, AND THEN YOU KNOW, WE'LL CONTINUE
7 NEXT, TALK MORE ABOUT IT. JUST OVERALL, I JUST DON'T THINK
8 THIS IS THE TIME. I THINK MAYBE GOING BACK TO OBAG 3
9 REQUIREMENTS IS ENOUGH AND LET'S JUST FOCUS. WE HAVE A LOT OF
10 ISSUES FOLKS. WE HAVE TO WORK ON TRANSPORTATION RIGHT NOW AND
11 I JUST DON'T THINK THIS IS THE TIME FOR US TO BE ADDING MORE
12 BUREAUCRACY TO WHAT'S GOING ON. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

15

16 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WILL START REMARKS BY SAYING
17 THANK YOU TO CHAIR NOACK FOR YOUR GRACE AND ELEGANCE THROUGH
18 THIS PROCESS. THERE ARE A LOT OF COMPETING VOICES ON THIS
19 COMMISSION AND IN THE PUBLIC AND ALSO TO STAFF FOR BEING ABLE
20 TO WADE THROUGH A PROCESS AND TRYING TO CREATE A FRAMEWORK TO
21 REACH SOME CONSENSUS WHEN WE ALL CLEARLY SEE THINGS
22 DIFFERENTLY. I WILL SAY THAT WHAT I UNDERSTOOD WE ARE DOING
23 TODAY IS THE ALLOCATION. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT NUMBERS AND THE
24 TIME WHEN WE ATTACH IT TO POLICY IS A MONTH FROM NOW. IT GIVES
25 US TIME TO THINK AND DIGEST. I, IN PRINCIPAL, LIKE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S SUGGESTION THAT WE KEEP IT FLEXIBLE IN
2 CASE WE CHANGE OUR MIND, BUT LOOKING AT THE NUMBERS, I REALLY
3 -- YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT LIKE WE ATTACH A SPECIFIC AMOUNT TO A
4 SPECIFIC POLICY. SO I AM NOT SURE HOW THAT WOULD WORK
5 OPERATIONALIZING IT, ALTHOUGH IN PRINCIPAL, IT SOUNDS GOOD TO
6 KEEP IT FLEXIBLE. SO WHAT I WILL SAY IS YOU KNOW, WE ARE ONE
7 OF THE MOST DIVERSE REGIONS IN OUR COUNTRY, SO WE ALL COME
8 FROM URBAN AREAS, RURAL AREAS, SUBURBAN AREAS, AND WE HAVE A
9 WIDE RANGE OF FOLKS, ETHNICITY, GENERATIONS ALL OVER. SO WE
10 NEED TO COME TO SOME CONSENSUS ON POLICY. CLEARLY WE DISAGREE
11 ON SOME THINGS BUT I THINK THAT ONE OF THE FOUNDATIONAL
12 PRINCIPALS OF REGIONALISM IS TO ALWAYS EVOLVE AND TO LOOK AT
13 DATA AND TO SEE HOW THINGS HAVE WORKED. I WILL TELL YOU HAVING
14 GONE THROUGH A HUGE FIGHT IN SAN FRANCISCO OVER OUR HOUSING
15 ELEMENT AND OUR UP ZONING TO COMPLY WITH OUR HOUSING ELEMENT,
16 WE LEARN THINGS EVERY TIME. EVERY SIX MONTHS, THERE ARE NEW
17 THINGS. I THINK THE IDEA OF GOING BACK TO OBAG 3 TO ME SEEMS
18 REALLY KIND OF REGRESSIVE BECAUSE WE HAVE LEARNED AN AWFUL LOT
19 FROM GOING THROUGH THESE PROCESSES, SB79, THE NEW MANDATES, SO
20 I DO THINK IT IS APPROPRIATE TO THINK ABOUT HOW DEVELOPMENT,
21 FOR EXAMPLE, EFFECTS TENANTS. I DON'T THINK THAT WE ARE
22 PUTTING IN NEW MANDATES OR LEGISLATION. I THINK THAT IS A
23 LITTLE BIT OF, YOU KNOW, RHETORIC MEANT TO INFLAME RATHER THAN
24 FACTUAL. WHAT WE ARE DOING IS ATTACHING INCENTIVES TO A WIDE
25 ARRAY OF CHOICES THAT YOU KNOW, COUNTIES AND CITIES CAN MAKE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AND IN FACT, WE ARE THINKING ABOUT THINGS MORE BROADLY. HOW
2 CAN WE ALLOW FOLKS WHO ARE BIDDING FOR THIS MONEY TO GET THOSE
3 POINTS IN DIFFERENT WAYS? I THINK STAFF AND OUR CHAIR HAVE
4 BEEN VERY CREATIVE IN THINKING ABOUT THESE THINGS TO TRY TO
5 GET US TO CONSENSUS. I JUST WANT TO TAKE A STEP BACK FROM THAT
6 RHETORIC, THAT THIS BODY IS NOT A LEGISLATIVE BODY. WE'RE NOT
7 CREATING NEW LAWS. WE'RE NOT IMPOSING NEW REQUIREMENTS. WE ARE
8 TRYING TO ATTACH INCENTIVES TO MONEY AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
9 SUPPOSED TO DO. THAT'S WHAT THIS MONEY IS FOR. I WILL LEAVE
10 THAT THERE AND MAKE A PITCH THAT WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT IS THE
11 DISTRIBUTION OF THE MONEY BECAUSE THERE WAS, YOU KNOW, NOT
12 CONSENSUS ON THAT EARLIER AND IT WILL GIVE US SOME TIME TO
13 DIGEST WHAT THE PUBLIC COMMENTERS HAVE SAID, ALL SIDES, AND
14 WHAT OUR FELLOW COMMISSIONERS HAVE SAID TO MAKE A DECISION
15 ABOUT THE POLICY NEXT MONTH. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

18

19 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** THANK YOU. AGAIN, I APPRECIATE EVERYONE WHO
20 IS SO INVESTED IN THIS, ALL OF US ARE AS WE ALL HAVE THE
21 PRIMARY GOAL OF EFFECTING THE GOALS OF PLAN BAY AREA AND HOW
22 TO INTEGRATE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. I CONTINUE TO VERY
23 MUCH BE OF THE POSITION THAT WE ALREADY HAVE IN PLACE IN OUR
24 CITIES AND OUR COUNTIES SOME VERY STRONG PRO TEXTS --
25 PROTECTIONS AND ACCESSIBILITY TO THEM. I APPRECIATE WHAT THE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 COMMITTEE HAS DONE, TAKING A DEEPER DIVE, LOOKING AT WHAT THE
2 NEW STATE LAWS AND LOOKING AT THE WE CAN HAVE CITIES THAT ARE
3 SMALLER TAKING ADVANTAGE OF THE PROTECTIONS AFFORDED THROUGH
4 COUNTIES, LIKE SOME OF THE PROGRAMS I HAVE IN CONTRA COSTA
5 COUNTY AS WELL. I THINK WE NEED TO REALLY FOCUS ON WHAT WE
6 AGREE UPON RATHER THAN WHAT DO WE NOT AGREE UPON. I'M HOPEFUL
7 NEXT MONTH WHEN WE HAVE THIS DISCUSSION, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
8 SOME PRINCIPALS OF AGREEMENT THAT WE CAN FULLY EMBRACE. I AM A
9 LITTLE LESS CONCERNED OF WHAT IS ON THE TABLE TODAY BECAUSE I
10 BELIEVE IT GIVES US THE FLEXIBILITY NEXT MONTH TO GO AHEAD AND
11 HAMMER OUT WHAT THOSE PRINCIPALS WILL BE, THE 45 MILLION
12 ABSOLUTELY TO COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S COMMENTS. WE CAN MODIFY IT
13 IF WE NEED TO NEXT MONTH, BUT I THINK WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD
14 AND WE NEED TO REALLY JUST HAMMER OUT THIS IS WHAT THE
15 PRINCIPALS WILL BE AND IN THE SCHEME OF THINGS, IT'S NOT A LOT
16 OF MONEY. I WISH IT WAS MORE BUT WE LOST FEDERAL AND STATE
17 MONEY, WE NEED TO GET WHAT DOLLARS WE CAN OUT THERE. I AM
18 GOING TO SUPPORT WHAT IS RECOMMENDED TODAY BUT ABSOLUTELY, I
19 AM HEARING LOUD AND CLEAR FROM MANY PEOPLE, THEIR CONTINUED
20 CONCERNS THAT WE WILL BE PUTTING ON NEW REGULATIONS, NEW
21 THINGS ON TOP OF WHAT WE'RE REQUIRING BECAUSE OF STATE
22 LEGISLATION AND I THINK THERE IS A PATH FORWARD, I'M FEELING
23 GOOD ABOUT IT.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1
2 **NOELIA CORZO:** THANK YOU. SO I WANTED TO SHARE MY STRONG
3 SUPPORT FOR MOVING FORWARD WITH THE PROPOSED OBAG FRAMEWORK
4 TODAY. I THINK AS LEADERS, WE HAVE TO USE ALL THE TOOLS IN OUR
5 TOOL BOX TO SUPPORT HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITABLE
6 DEVELOPMENT AND THAT NECESSARILY INCLUDES CREATING INCENTIVES
7 AND SYSTEMS THAT SUPPORT INCENTIVES SO WE GET CLOSER TO THE
8 OUTCOMES WE'RE LOOKING FOR AND IT MEANS SUPPORTING BOLD
9 SOLUTIONS TO REGIONAL PROBLEMS. I HEARD SAN MATEO MENTIONED
10 AND A STATISTICS THROWN OUT THAT I THINK WAS MISLEADING. I
11 WANT TO CLARIFY AND I WANT TO BE HONEST HERE. MY COUNTY, SAN
12 MATEO COUNTY IS OUT OF COMPLIANCE RIGHT NOW WITH OUR HOUSING
13 ELEMENT. WE ARE NOT IN COMPLIANCE AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT
14 THAT WE ARE HONEST ABOUT THESE THINGS BECAUSE JURISDICTIONS
15 SHOULD BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE. IF THAT MEANS SAN MATEO COUNTY
16 DOESN'T QUALIFY FOR INCENTIVES, THAT IS WHAT IT MEANS. UNTIL
17 WE GET OUR ACT TOGETHER AND WE MEET THE BAR THAT THE STATE HAS
18 SET. THE STATE HAS PASSED MANY LEGISLATION, HAS PASSED A LOT
19 OF LEGISLATION, BUT THAT LEGISLATION HAS BEEN NECESSARY
20 BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T, AS A REGION, AS A STATE BEEN MEETING OUR
21 HOUSING GOALS AND THAT IS ALSO ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY. I AM
22 GOING TO JUST END HERE BY SAYING THAT I AM ALSO IN SUPPORT OF
23 TAKING SB\$125 OFF THE TOP EVENLY AS PROPOSED AND WHILE THIS IS
24 MY FIRST KIND OF BIG IMPACTFUL COMMENT ON A CONTENTIOUS TOPIC,
25 I AM EXCITED TO KEEP LEARNING AND BE A VOICE FOR MY COUNTY AND



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 THE MANY TENANTS IN OUR COMMUNITY WHO NEED PROTECTIONS AND I
2 KNOW OF MANY TENANTS IN SAN MATEO COUNTY WHO A RIGHT IS ONLY A
3 RIGHT IF YOU KNOW TO ASSERT IT. TENANT PROTECTIONS IN OUR
4 STATE AND IN SAN MATEO COUNTY ARE THE FLOOR AND MANY TENANTS
5 ARE STILL BEING TAKEN ADVANTAGE OF AND I AM GOING TO BE A
6 VOICE FOR THEM HERE. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER FLEMING. I WAS GOING
9 TO EVERYBODY THAT HASN'T SPOKEN YET.

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, THERE HASN'T BEEN A LOT THAT HASN'T
12 BEEN SAID TODAY THAT I CAN THINK OF THAT HASN'T ALREADY BEEN
13 SAID. I CONCUR WITH COMMISSIONER MELGAR AND COMMISSIONER CORZO
14 AND WILL BE SUPPORTING, AS WELL AS COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, WILL
15 BE SUPPORTING THE ALLOCATION AS PROPOSED BY STAFF THROUGH THE
16 REALLY INTENSE WORK THAT THE CABINET DID. WE WERE REALLY
17 DELIBERATIVE AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE MOVE FORWARD
18 WITH THIS SET ASIDE WITH THE ALLOCATIONS TODAY SO THAT WE CAN
19 TURN OUR ATTENTION TO A FRAMEWORK, WHICH DOES WHAT I BELIEVE -
20 - I SAID THIS IN OUR RETREAT IN OCTOBER THAT YOU KNOW, THAT
21 THE PURPOSE WE'RE BEING ASKED BY SOME ADVOCACY GROUPS TO NOT
22 MAKE POLICIES THAT CONDITION POLICY OUTCOMES, WHICH IS EXACTLY
23 WHAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO DO, WHICH IS TO TRY TO LOOK AT WHAT THE
24 OUTCOMES ARE THAT WE NEED TO HAVE AROUND GREENHOUSE GAS
25 EMISSIONS, AROUND PROTECTING OUR MOST VULNERABLE RESIDENTS,



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 AND IMPLEMENT POLICIES THAT HELP US MEET THEM. IT'S TOTALLY
2 FINE IF WE DON'T AGREE WITH WHAT THOSE POLICIES ARE BUT OUR
3 PURPOSE IS TO LOOK TOWARDS TO ACHIEVING THAT. NEXT MONTH, WE
4 WILL LISTEN TO EACH OTHER AND COME TO UNDERSTANDINGS ON HOW WE
5 CAN BEST GET TO WHERE WE WANT TO GO. I KNOW WE GENUINELY WANT
6 THE BEST FOR THE BAY AREA RESIDENTS. THE BAY AREA IS A DYNAMIC
7 PLACE. I BELIEVE WE SHOULD MOVE FORWARD, NOT BACKWARDS WITH
8 OUR POLICIES IN WAYS THAT ARE CARING AND THOUGHTFUL. AS WE
9 THINK ABOUT MOVING INTO NEXT MONTH, WE HAVE DONE OUR BEST. THE
10 COST-OF-LIVING IN THE BAY AREA IS REALLY CHALLENGING FOR
11 FOLKS. HOUSING AFFORDABILITY HASN'T GOTTEN BETTER IN SPITE OF
12 SOME OF THE STATE REGULATIONS AND I HOPE THAT WE FIGURE OUT
13 WAYS TO SUPPORT THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REGULATIONS THAT ARE
14 ON THE BOOKS, BUT ALSO TO MAKE THINGS STRONGER AND MORE
15 ATTAINABLE FOR OUR WORKING FAMILIES.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

18

19 **BARBARA LEE:** THANKS VERY MUCH. VERY QUICKLY, I SUPPORT THE
20 STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION BUT I WANTED TO REITERATE THE FACT THAT
21 WE CONSISTENTLY IN MANY WAYS SUPPORTED THE CONNECTION AND THE
22 INTERSECTION BETWEEN HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, ENVIRONMENTAL
23 PROGRESS, AND TO BACKSLIDE WITH EVEN THE POLICY OF NOT
24 SUPPORTING THE NECESSARILY THE LINKAGE BETWEEN HOUSING AND
25 TRANSPORTATION TO ME WOULD BE A SETBACK. I THINK WE NEED TO



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 MOVE FORWARD AND WE NEED TO BE SURE THAT WE SEND A STRONG
2 SIGNAL THAT HOWEVER WE COME OUT OF THIS, WE DO BELIEVE IN
3 TRANSIT ORIENTED HOUSING, AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND ALL OF THIS
4 TOGETHER WILL CREATE A BETTER HOUSING ENVIRONMENT FOR EVERY
5 SINGLE LEVEL OF INCOME IN EVERY PART OF THE STATE AND THE
6 REGION. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN. OH SORRY, COMMISSIONER
9 MANFREE.

10

11 **AMBER MANFREE:** I DID JUMP IN THERE. SO I JUST WANTED WITHOUT
12 GETTING INTO THIS DEBATE TOO MUCH BECAUSE NAPA DOES NOT
13 QUALIFY FOR TOC, SO I WILL LEAVE IT UP TO YOU. SO OUR CARVE
14 OUT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT BECAUSE OF THAT SITUATION AND WE
15 ARE IN OUR OWN WAYS AND WAYS WE FEEL ARE APPROPRIATE FOR OUR
16 COMMUNITY PURSUING POLICIES AND PURSUING PROJECTS THAT ARE
17 ALIGNED WITH THE SPIRIT OF THESE GOALS IN A MORE RURAL SETTING
18 AND YEAH, THAT'S IT. I AGREE THAT IT WOULD BE GREAT TO INCLUDE
19 THE OPPORTUNITY TO RETURN MONEY TO THE POT IF NEEDED, WHICH
20 COMMISSIONER MAHAN BROUGHT UP AND I DO HAVE A LITTLE BIT OF A
21 CONCEPTUAL PROBLEM WITH ATTACHING MONEY TO POLICY WE HAVE NOT
22 DETERMINED YET. I CAN SEE WHY IT IS THAT WAY RIGHT NOW, BUT
23 THERE IS A LITTLE PART OF ME THAT SAYS THIS FEELS LIKE CART
24 BEFORE THE HORSE. THANKS.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. ANYBODY ELSE?
2 COMMISSIONER BURT, SORRY.
3
4 **PAT BURT:** SORRY, WE'LL SEE IF MY VOICE HOLDS UP. I WILL JUST
5 SAY THAT THE MORE I COME TO UNDERSTAND THIS ISSUE, THE MORE
6 COMPLEX I UNDERSTOOD IT TO BE. I THINK THAT WE HAVE THE ONE
7 QUESTION BEFORE US TODAY OF WHAT THE DOLLARS ARE AND WHERE
8 THEY COME FROM, I DO HAVE A CONCERN WITH THE 50/50 SPLIT FROM
9 HALF OF IT COMING FROM COUNTY COMPONENTS. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
10 IT MAYBE A 75/25, BUT I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS GOING TO BE
11 SUPPORT FOR THAT. ON THE BROADER ISSUES WHICH WE'RE TEEING UP
12 FOR NEXT TIME, MOST OF THIS DISCUSSION, I HAVE BEEN CONCERNED
13 THAT WE HAVEN'T BEEN STEPPING BACK IN SAYING WHAT ARE THE
14 GOALS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE? IT'S NOT A SINGLE GOAL.
15 OUR ANTICIPATION IS THAT TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES WILL
16 INCREASE TRANSIT USE, REDUCE AUTOMOBILE TRIPS, PROVIDE HOUSING
17 AT DESIRABLE LOCATIONS, PROVIDE MULTIPLE ENVIRONMENTAL
18 BENEFITS, AND EVEN PROVIDE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT. I THINK THOSE
19 PRINCIPALS STILL HAVE A LOT OF MERIT BUT AT OUR WORKSHOP, WE
20 SAW THAT OVER THE LAST -- IF I RECALL IT CORRECTLY, 15 YEARS,
21 WE HAD ABOUT TWO-THIRDS OF OUR HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT HAS
22 BEEN IN TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. SO REGIONALLY IN THAT
23 TIMEFRAME, WE HAD POPULATION GROWTH, WORKER GROWTH, AND A
24 FOCUS OF WORKERS AND POPULATION NEAR TRANSIT AND LEADING UP TO
25 THE DROP OFF IN TRANSIT USE FROM COVID, WE WERE SEEING A



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 DECLINE IN TRANSIT USE. THERE IS AN IMPLICATION THERE THAT
2 SOMETHING IS NOT WORKING AND DOUBLING AND TRIPLING DOWN IS NOT
3 NECESSARILY THE TOTALITY OF THE SOLUTION. IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT
4 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES AREN'T A RIGHT THING TO DO FOR A
5 VARIETY OF REASONS BUT THE NOTION THAT SEEMS TO BE THE
6 OVERWHELMING PREMISE THAT THIS IS GOING TO DRIVE A SIGNIFICANT
7 INCREASE IN TRANSIT USE SEEMS FLAWED. I STRONGLY SUSPECT THAT
8 THE MISSING LINKS HAVE TO DO WITH THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.
9 THE NETWORKS THAT ARE NEEDED IN TRANSIT, BOTH BUS NETWORKS,
10 BIKE NETWORKS, PEDESTRIAN ORIENTATION, AND THEN OUR WHOLE
11 PROGRAM OF PASSES IN OUR COMMUNITY, WE, AS I MENTIONED BEFORE,
12 WE HAVE THREE-QUARTERS OF ALL THE CALTRAIN GO PASSES FOR THE
13 WHOLE SYSTEM IN STANFORD AND PALO ALTO. WE HAD 20 YEARS OF
14 DELIBERATE PROGRAMS DRIVING IT. AS A RESULT, OUR MODEST SIZED
15 COMMUNITY IS THE SECOND LARGEST BOARDINGS IN THE WHOLE
16 CALTRAIN SYSTEM. I THINK WE HAVE A DISPROPORTIONATE FOCUS ON
17 THE TRANSIT-ORIENTED COMMUNITIES, NOT THAT IT'S A WRONG FOCUS,
18 BUT WE'RE MISSING SOME REAL KEY PIECES IF WE REALLY WANT TO
19 HAVE THE SUCCESSES WE'RE AIMING FOR. I'LL JUST NOTE TOO ON THE
20 COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE ABOUT THE MYRIAD, HUNDRED OR SO,
21 STATE HOUSING LAWS AND TWO OF MY COLLEAGUES MENTIONED JUST IN
22 THE LAST DAY THEY HAVE HAD SIGNIFICANT BRIEFINGS, PRELIMINARY
23 BRIEFINGS ON SB79 IMPLICATIONS. I ALSO HAD ONE YESTERDAY AND
24 WE ARE -- IT IS MIND BOGGLING THE IMPLICATIONS OF IT,
25 PARTICULARLY FOR CERTAIN COMMUNITIES WHERE IT'S SAN JOSE'S



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 CONCERN THAT IT WOULD PREEMPT THEIR INTEREST IN HAVING JOBS
2 NEAR TRANSIT, WHICH ACTUALLY DATA SHOWS DRIVES MORE TRANSIT
3 USE THAN HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT. IT DOESN'T MEAN HOUSING NEAR
4 TRANSIT ISN'T RIGHT, BUT IN THAT SENSE, IT WOULD WORK AGAINST
5 THAT PRINCIPAL OF INCREASING TRANSIT USE FOR THEM. ON SUBURBAN
6 CITIES, IT COMPLETELY SUPERSEDES A HUGE REALLOCATION OF
7 CALCULATIONS AND WE'RE JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW IMMENSE
8 THOSE IMPACTS WILL BE FROM SB79 AND NO ONE REALLY KNOWS IT. WE
9 HAVE A REALLY SHORT TIMEFRAME UNDER THE CURRENT LAW TO
10 DETERMINE OUR PATHWAYS, BECAUSE THERE ARE SOME ALTERNATIVE
11 PATHWAYS UNDER SB79, BUT IT GOES BACK TO THE WHOLE NOTION OF
12 WHETHER WE SHOULD BE PUTTING OUR OWN SET OF INCENTIVES AND
13 DISINCENTIVES ON TOC FOR ALLOCATION OF TRANSIT DOLLARS. I AM
14 REALLY HESITANT ABOUT GOING FORWARD IN AN ADDITIONAL PATH ON
15 TOP OF THE DRASTIC TRANSFORMATIONS THAT WE'RE FACING FROM SB79
16 AND OTHERWISE AND I DO THINK WE NEED TO TAKE A STEP BACK ON
17 THAT. THAT IS GOING TO BE MORE OF THE DISCUSSION FOR NEXT
18 MONTH.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. NOW YOUR TURN.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THANKS, I JUST WANT IT CLEAR FOR THE RECORD HERE,
23 THE OBAG 3 INCENTIVES, THE ONES I AM REFERRING TO,
24 JURISDICTIONS COMPLIANT WITH STATE LAWS INCLUDING HOUSING
25 ELEMENT CERTIFICATION. THERE IS NOTHING REGRESSIVE ABOUT THAT



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 OR RHETORIC. THIS IS THE REALITY THAT WE'RE ALL DEALING WITH.
2 THAT IS WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE, KEEPING IT SIMPLE. THAT
3 IS, THAT LINE ALONE IS EVER-CHANGING. THE LEGISLATURE IS DOING
4 THAT IN PUBLIC FOR US, SO TO SAY THAT, THAT'S SLIDING
5 BACKWARDS IS NOT APPROPRIATE HERE. WE NEED TO FOCUS ON WHAT
6 THE REALITY IS AND WHERE WE'RE GETTING RESULTS HERE. THE NEW
7 PROPOSAL DOES CHANGE STATE LAW. IT DOES CAUSE INCONSISTENCIES.
8 I THINK WE CAN MOVE AHEAD AND HELP OUR JURISDICTIONS IF WE
9 FOCUS ON WHAT WAS SET FORTH IN OBAG 3 BECAUSE IT'S EVER-
10 CHANGING. IT'S PROGRESSIVE. IT'S DOING AN AMAZING JOB AND WILL
11 CONTINUE TO DO SO EVERY YEAR. I WOULD LIKE TO STATE CLEARLY
12 THE 20 CITIES IN SAN MATEO ARE IN COMPLIANCE WITH OUR HOUSING
13 CERTIFICATION AND WE'RE PROUD OF THAT. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

16

17 **MITCH MASHBURN:** I DIDN'T HAVE SO MUCH OF A COMMENT BUT TO MAKE
18 A MOTION. I KNOW YOU AND THE VICE CHAIR PROBABLY HAVE STUFF TO
19 SAY. IF YOU'RE WILLING TO LET ME MAKE A MOTION, I WILL MAKE IT
20 NOW.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DEPENDS ON WHAT THE MOTION IS. SORRY. I'M
23 SURE I WASN'T SUPPOSED TO SAY THAT.

24

25 **MITCH MASHBURN:** THAT'S ALL RIGHT.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO, YOU KNOW FROM LISTENING -- DID YOU HAVE
3 A COMMENT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** NO, I'M WAITING FOR THE MOTION.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** FROM WHAT I'M HEARING, NOT EVERYBODY BUT A
8 LOT OF PEOPLE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE 45 MILLION AND HAVING
9 SOME FLEXIBILITY AS FAR AS ADDRESSING THAT NEXT MONTH, WHETHER
10 IT'S COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S COMMENTS ABOUT RETURNING IT OR
11 AMENDING IT NEXT MONTH, AND I AM OKAY WITH THAT. IF YOU'RE
12 GOING TO MAKE A MOTION WITH THAT INCLUSION, PLEASE GO AHEAD.

13

14 **MITCH MASHBURN:** THAT'S MY MOTION WITH THAT INCLUSION.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THERE IS A HAND UP, IF SHE IS STILL THERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT'S HER CURSOR, NOT HER HAND.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO PLEASE GO AHEAD.

21

22 **MITCH MASHBURN:** SO THAT'S MY MOTION, TO MOVE FORWARD WITH
23 STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S
24 COMMENTS THAT WE TAKE THOSE INTO CONSIDERATION AND WE BUILD IN
25 THE FLEXIBILITY TO REALLOCATE THOSE FUNDS IF WE DO NOT COME TO



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 A CONSENSUS NEXT MONTH.

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** SECOND.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. WE HAVE
6 ALREADY DONE PUBLIC COMMENT.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** WITH REGARD TO REALLOCATING IF THERE IS NOT
9 CONSENSUS, WHAT DOES THAT SPECIFICALLY MEAN?

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK THE DISCUSSION WILL MEAN -- AND
12 MAYBE IT'S NOT EXACTLY REALLOCATION. WE CAN -- LET'S SAY WE
13 CAN AMEND THE \$45 MILLION, WHETHER THAT BE LARGER, CHANGE IT,
14 OR IF WE DON'T COME TO AN AGREEMENT, THAT MONEY GOES BACK TO
15 THE REGIONAL POT UNTIL WE HAVE A CONSENSUS.

16

17 **MITCH MASHBURN:** BECAUSE THERE WILL BE A LOT OF DISCUSSION.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** CAN I ADD TO THE AMENDMENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU CAN MAKE AN AMENDMENT AND HE CAN OKAY
22 THE AMENDMENT. NOW KATHLEEN IS JUMPING IN TO CLARIFY THIS FOR
23 US LEGALLY.

24

25 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** SO THERE IS A TWO-PARTER HERE. WHEN WE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 USE THE TERM CONSENSUS, THAT MEANS 100% AGREEMENT. IS THAT THE
2 INTENT OF THE MOTION?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** NO, JUST THE MAJORITY OF THE BOARD.

5

6 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** WITH THAT CLARIFICATION, WE'RE TALKING
7 ABOUT A MAJORITY VIEW OF. SO THAT IS JUST TO CLARIFY THE
8 RECORD ON THAT. AND COMMISSIONER LEE, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
9 YOU ARE SEEKING TO AMEND OR IS THAT YOUR UNDERSTANDING WITH
10 THE MOTION?

11

12 **BARBARA LEE:** I WOULD LIKE CLARIFICATION. I WILL AMEND HIS
13 AMENDMENT IF WE DON'T GET CLARIFICATION.

14

15 **MITCH MASHBURN:** I DON'T HAVE A PROBLEM CLARIFYING THAT.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE CAN AMEND THE \$45 MILLION ALLOCATION AND
18 AMEND COULD BE REALLOCATE, IT COULD BE CHANGING IT, BASED ON
19 OUR DISCUSSION AT FEBRUARY'S MEETING. SO IF WE WANT TO
20 INCREASE OR DECREASE THE AMOUNT, RETURN A PORTION TO THE
21 REGIONAL SIDE, THAT IS WHAT -- DEPENDING ON THE DISCUSSION
22 NEXT MONTH.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** IT'S BASED ON THE ALLOCATION, NOT THE POLICY.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WHEN WE DECIDE ON THE POLICY, IF WE COME TO
2 A CONCLUSION ON THE POLICY OR WE DON'T COME TO A CONCLUSION ON
3 THE POLICY, WE CAN ADDRESS WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO WITH THE 45
4 MILLION. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I'M THERE.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

11

12 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU SUE. I WANT TO BE VERY CLEAR HERE,
13 FIRST YOU SAID CONSENSUS. THANK YOU FOR CLARIFYING. THEN YOU
14 SAID A MAJORITY OF THE COMMISSION. I WANT TO CLARIFY I WOULD
15 BE IN FAVOR AS LONG AS WE MEET A MAJORITY FOR THE VOTE.

16

17 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** YES, SO A MAJORITY OF THE MEMBERS
18 PRESENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, SO NOW WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND.
21 CAN WE TAKE THE ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** CAN I OFFER ANOTHER AMENDMENT, WHICH WOULD BE TO ON
24 THE SB125 OFF THE TOP TO ADD THE PRECOMMITMENT BE 75% FROM THE
25 REGIONAL AND 25% FROM THE COUNTY.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO THAT WAS DISCUSSED IN DETAIL AT THE AD
3 HOC AND THE DECISION WAS TO LEAVE IT 50/50. YOU CAN MAKE THE
4 MOTION.

5

6 **PAT BURT:** UNDERSTOOD, I'M OFFERING AN AMENDMENT AND IF IT GETS
7 A SECOND, WE'LL VOTE ON IT.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I'LL SECOND.

10

11 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** I THINK WE'RE DOING A SUBSTITUTE
12 MOTION, SO THAT GOES IN ORDER FIRST SO WE HAVE TO TAKE THE
13 SUBSTITUTE MOTION, DISCUSS IT, TAKE A VOTE ON THAT, IF THAT
14 FAILS, THEN WE GO BACK TO THE ORIGINAL. THE ORIGINAL MAKER OF
15 THE MOTION DID NOT WANT TO AMEND HIS MOTION TO INCORPORATE
16 THAT.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** YES, BUT THE BODY CAN PUT FORWARD AN AMENDMENT TO THE
19 MOTION AND THEN WE VOTE ON THE AMENDMENT AND THEN THE PRIMARY
20 MOTION.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT'S A SUBSTITUTE. YEAH. THAT'S THE WAY I'VE
23 ALWAYS DONE IT.

24

25 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** WE CAN TAKE A RECESS TO CONSULT OUR



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 RULES IF WE WANT TO. I'M NOT OPPOSED TO THAT.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DO YOU WANT TO MAKE A SUBSTITUTE MOTION?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I WILL, WITH THE EXCEPTION OF A 75/25 SPLIT.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO WE HAVE TO VOTE ON THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION
8 FIRST. OKAY. YOU WANT TO TAKE THE ROLL CALL ON THE SUBSTITUTE
9 MOTION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ON THE SUBSTITUTE MOTION WITH A MOTION BY
12 COMMISSIONER BURT, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. CHAIR
13 NOACK.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** NO.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** NO.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

22

23 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** NO.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

5

6 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** NO.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

9 COMMISSIONER BURT.

10

11 **PAT BURT:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

14

15 **NOELIA CORZO:** NO.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** NO.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** NO.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **BARBARA LEE:** NO.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
5 MANFREE.

6

7 **AMBER MANFREE:** NO.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.

10

11 **MITCH MASHBURN:** NO.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

14

15 **MYRNA MELGAR:** NO.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY.

18

19 **NATE MILEY:** ABSTAIN.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS IS ABSENT, NOTING HER



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 LOCATION IS STILL OPEN. WITH THAT, THE MOTION DOES NOT PASS
2 WITH 3 AYES, 11 NAYS, AND 1 ABSTENTION.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY, THEN WE MOVE TO THE ORIGINAL MOTION,
5 SO COULD WE TAKE THE ROLL CALL VOTE ON THE ORIGINAL MOTION.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, THE ORIGINAL MOTION BY COMMISSIONER
8 MASHBURN, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER AHN. CHAIR NOACK.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** NAY.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN.

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT.

4 COMMISSIONER BURT.

5

6 **PAT BURT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CORZO.

9

10 **NOELIA CORZO:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

17

18 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER LEE.

21

22 **BARBARA LEE:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER

25 MANFREE, COMMISSIONER MASHBURN.



JANUARY 28, 2026

1

2 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR.

5

6 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY.

9

10 **NATE MILEY:** NAY.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** NO.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS IS ABSENT. THE MOTION
17 PASSES WITH 13 AYES, 2 NAYS AND I THINK THAT WAS IT. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I AM GOING TO TURN THE MEETING
21 OVER TO VICE CHAIR FOR A FEW SECONDS. I HAVE TO CALL MY
22 FATHER.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY, WITH THAT WE ARE
25 GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 14B, THIS IS AN UPDATE ON THE



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 GOVERNOR'S BUDGET AND THE BAY AREA TRANSIT LOAN. OUR EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I WILL TRY TO GO THROUGH THIS AS QUICKLY AS
5 POSSIBLE BUT WE CAN HAVE AS MUCH DIALOG AS YOU WANT. I WANTED
6 TO MAKE SURE THAT YOU ALL KNEW WE'RE STILL IN DISCUSSION WITH
7 THE DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE. WHILE WE DON'T HAVE ANYTHING
8 CONCLUSIVE YET, WE REMAIN COMMITTED TO MAKING SURE THAT
9 WHATEVER THEY PROPOSED DOES NOT REDIRECT FUNDING FOR BAY AREA
10 PRIORITY CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT COULD POTENTIALLY CAUSE DELAYS
11 AND PUT AT RISK FEDERAL MATCHING FUNDS. WE ALSO ARE HOLDING
12 STEADY TO NOT TRANSFER ANY OVERSIGHT OF STATE AWARDS FROM THE
13 STATE TO MTC AND WE ARE CONTINUING TO PURSUE LOAN PAYMENT
14 LENGTH THAT OPERATORS CAN KEEP UP WITH SO THAT IT'S NOT A REAL
15 QUICK TURNAROUND. IN RESPONSE TO THAT, THEY ARE AT LEAST
16 MOVING IN THE DIRECTION OF COMING UP WITH A LOAN WITH SIMILAR
17 FRAMEWORKS. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT INTEREST RATES, WE'RE TALKING
18 ABOUT TERMS, WE'RE STILL STRUGGLING WITH THE PROTECTION OF BAY
19 AREA PROJECTS. WE HAVE BEEN IN CONSTANT COMMUNICATION WITH
20 DOF, IN FACT WE'RE MEETING THEM AS SOON AS THIS MEETING IS
21 OVER WITH. WE ALSO CHECK IN EVERY DAY WITH THE OPERATORS IN
22 THE REGION, INCLUDING THE SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION
23 AUTHORITY BECAUSE THEY HAVE SOME OF THE BIGGEST AWARDS THAT
24 WOULD BE AT RISK UNDER SOME OF THE DISCUSSION POINTS. WE
25 CONTINUE TO WORK ON A PATH FORWARD THAT AVOIDS SERVICE CUTS



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 FOR ESSENTIAL TRANSIT SERVICES AND A LOAN THAT IS REPAYABLE IN
2 TERMS THAT DON'T HURT THE REGION'S ABILITY TO BRING BACK
3 TRANSIT. REMEMBER, THIS IS FOR THAT PERIOD OF TIME BETWEEN NOW
4 AND WHEN SB63 IS DECIDED AT THE BALLOT BOX. SO, WE DO LOOK
5 FORWARD FOR SOME OF YOUR FEEDBACK AND DIRECTION BUT THIS IS AN
6 INFORMATION ITEM AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO REPORT BACK AS WE
7 MAKE PROGRESS. WE REALLY NEED TO GET THINGS RESOLVED IN THE
8 COMING COUPLE OF WEEKS AS THE BUDGET DEAL GETS CONCLUDED FOR A
9 WHOLE BUNCH OF OTHER ITEMS AND THIS IS TRAILER BILL LANGUAGE
10 THAT WE'RE WORKING ON AT THIS TIME.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY, THANK YOU FOR THAT.
13 I AM GOING TO CALL ON MY COMMISSIONER COLLEAGUES, ARE THERE
14 COMMENTS ON THIS ONE OR POINTS TO BE MADE OR DID WE WEAR YOU
15 OUT WITH THE LAST DISCUSSION? OKAY, I WILL GO ON TO SAY THANK
16 YOU ANDY FOR THAT. LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS
19 ITEM, NO HANDS ARE RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS
20 APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE.
23 THAT MOVES US TO AGENDA ITEM 15, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON
24 OTHER BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY HANDS RAISED FOR THIS KIMBERLY?

25



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE, WE HAVE ONE
2 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM, ALEX MILLER, PLEASE GO
3 AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM AND I'LL START THE CLOCK. YOU
4 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

5
6 **SPEAKER:** YES, HI, GOOD AFTERNOON. ALEX MILLER. I REALLY URGE
7 THE GROUP TO PUT PUBLIC COMMENT FIRST. YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WANT
8 TO COME AND MAKE A COMMENT TO YOU GUYS NOT ON THE AGENDA, WHY
9 DO WE HAVE TO SIT THROUGH ALL OF THIS TO MAKE A PUBLIC
10 COMMENT? IT'S A DISSERVICE. PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO WANT TO
11 SIT HERE AND MAKE A COMMENT TO YOU GUYS AND 1 MINUTE IS NOT
12 FAIR. I DROVE THREE HOURS FOR 1 MINUTE? THAT IS SLIGHTLY
13 OUTRAGEOUS. I CAME IN FRONT OF THE COMMISSION LAST TIME
14 BECAUSE I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT WE SPEND
15 ON MAIL. I KNOW THIS SOUNDS CRAZY AND YOU MIGHT THINK I'M
16 CRAZY, BUT THE ORGANIZATION SPENDS A LOT OF MONEY ON MAIL.
17 SENDING MAIL TO NOTICE OF VIOLATORS ON THE TOLLS, SO IF YOU
18 VIOLATE THE TOLL, WE SEND YOU A NOTICE. THE NEXT WEEK, WE SEND
19 YOU ANOTHER NOTICE. WE CONTINUE TO SEND YOU NOTICES. IT'S
20 COSTING THE AGENCY, I BELIEVE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF MONEY.
21 THIS IS JUST SIMPLY TWO TOLL VIOLATIONS OF MAIL. SO I AM GOING
22 TO HAND THIS BACK TO YOU GUYS, YOU GUYS CAN HAVE IT. I DON'T
23 WANT THE MAIL. I FIGURED OUT MY FAST-TRACK. THERE HAS TO BE A
24 WAY TO STREAMLINE THIS PROCESS, PUT IT ON THE DMV RECORD, DO
25 SOMETHING THAT MAKES SENSE BECAUSE THE WAY IT IS BEING HANDLED



JANUARY 28, 2026

1 NOW, IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE. HERE'S A PUBLIC RECORDS REQUEST
2 ACT ON ALL THE DOCUMENTS ON THE MAIL AND I WILL REPORT WHEN I
3 GET THOSE DOCUMENTS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC
6 COMMENTS.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY, THANK YOU. WE ARE
9 GOING TO CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT NOW. AGENDA ITEM 16 ADJOURNMENT,
10 THE NEXT MEETING OF THE MTC IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD HERE, THE
11 METRO CENTER WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 25, 2026. ANY CHANGES TO THE
12 SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED TO THE PUBLIC AND WE ARE
13 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU AND PLEASE STAND BY FOR THE BATA MEETING.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** IF I CAN NOTE FOR THE COMMISSIONERS, WE DO HAVE AN
16 ACTION ITEM ON BATA WE NEED TO ACT ON TODAY SO IF YOU CAN MAKE
17 SURE YOU SAY, THANK YOU.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** BATA MEMBERS IF I CAN ASK
20 YOU TO STAY, PLEASE.