

**ASSOCIATION OF BAY  
AREA GOVERNMENTS  
Meeting Transcript**

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1           **JOINT BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE**

2                           **WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 12<sup>TH</sup>, 2025, 11:30 AM**

3

4

5   **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I HAVE BEEN TOLD  
6 BY THE CLERK THAT WE HAVE QUORUM FOR BOTH MEETINGS. SO, WITH  
7 THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS JOINT MEETING OF THE ABAG  
8 HOUSING COMMITTEE AND THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE TO ORDER.  
9 TIME IS 11:43. COULD WE PLEASE HAVE ROLL CALL?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS IS ROLL CALL FOR THE ABAG HOUSING  
12 COMMITTEE ECKLUND?

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIFE? WILL THE OAKLAND LOCATION, PLEASE --  
17 COUNCIL MEMBER MOTOYAMA

18

19 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. ROMERO?

22

23 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

24

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE'RE STILL WAITING FOR OAKLAND LOCATION  
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FIFE. WE HAVE QUORUM PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** DO YOU WANT TO DO THE COMPENSATION  
5 ANNOUNCEMENT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE  
8 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG COMMITTEE IN  
9 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN  
10 AMOUNT OF \$150 AND PER DIEM IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF  
11 CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO  
12 COLLECT PER DIEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GOING TO HAND  
15 THIS OVER TO THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIR. DO WE HAVE  
16 ONE?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** WE DO.

19

20 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** OKAY.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** MY NAME IS GINA PAPAN, I'M FILLING IN, I GUESS,  
23 FOR THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIR. ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE .

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE .

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

9

10 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE .

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE .

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

17

18 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE .

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM .

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU EVERYBODY FOR BEING HERE .

23

24 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** IS OAKLAND ON?

25

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M TRYING TO REACH THEM NOW.

2

3 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** I'M GOING TO LOOK TO COUNSEL. SHOULD  
4 THIS NOW BE CHAIRED BY GINA SINCE WE DON'T HAVE A FULL QUORUM.

5

6 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YES, BECAUSE WE HAVE A NOTICED LOCATION IN  
7 OAKLAND, UNTIL IT'S LIVE, WE CAN'T PROCEED WITH THE ABAG  
8 PORTION OF THE AGENDA. SO, IF --

9

10 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** CHAIR PAPAN?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** ALL RIGHTY. CAN WE HAVE THE SECRETARY PLEASE HAVE  
13 THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE GIVE THE COMPENSATION  
14 ANNOUNCEMENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAPPILY. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM  
17 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD  
18 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING  
19 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS  
20 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR  
21 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** SINCE WE HAVE TIME TO BURN HERE. THIS MEETING IS  
24 BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS  
25 PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISED

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED TO  
2 SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE  
3 LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THE PHONE NUMBER. IN PERSON MEMBERS OF THE  
4 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE PODIUM AND WE'LL CALL ON  
5 PUBLIC MEMBERS TO SPEAK. I WAS JUST TRYING TO FILL SOME TIME.  
6 WHAT'S NEXT?

7

8 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR  
13 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT  
14 AND NO MEMBERS IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

15

16 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** COMMITTEE ANNOUNCEMENTS? OKAY. SEEING NONE.  
17 AGENDA ITEM 4A. ABAG -- OH THAT'S YOU GUYS. SORRY. STILL  
18 WAITING. OKAY. LET ME SEE WHAT I CAN FIND HERE .

19

20 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** COUNSEL, CORRECT, I SHALL HOLD OFF ON MY  
21 CHAIR REPORT UNTIL I HAVE QUORUM. IS THAT CORRECT?

22

23 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT'S RIGHT. AND WE CAN SKIP AHEAD, TODAY,  
24 CHAIR PAPAN TO ITEM 6A WHICH IS THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE  
25 CONSENT CALENDAR.

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** SOUNDS GOOD. GO TO ITEM 6A, BAHFA OVERSIGHT  
3 COMMITTEE CALENDAR. APPROVAL OF THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE  
4 MINUTES FROM DECEMBER 11TH. DOES ANYBODY HAVE ANY COMMENTS OR  
5 CHANGES? SEEING NONE, NONE ONLINE. OKAY. CAN WE -- CAN I MOVE  
6 APPROVAL OF THIS? DO I HAVE SOMEONE?

7

8 **NATHAN MILEY:** MILEY MOVES.

9

10 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** MILEY MOVED APPROVAL. SECOND BY ABE-KOGA.  
11 ROLL CALL PLEASE.

12

13 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE HAVE TO -- PUBLIC COMMENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** OH PUBLIC COMMENT?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR  
18 THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM SPACE  
19 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

20

21 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** ROLL CALL.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

24

25 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

7

8 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
11 PRESENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** ALL RIGHT. IS 7A OURS TOO?

14

15 **KATHLEEN KANE:** YES. YOU CAN CALL FOR THAT.

16

17 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. MOVING ON TO 7A REAP 2.0 PRIORITY

18 SITES REDEVELOPMENT. OKAY. AND REAP STANDS FOR, ONCE AGAIN,

19 REGIONAL -- WHAT? I KNEW THIS WAS GOING TO GET EVERYBODY. YOU

20 SEE YOU PUT ALL THESE INITIALS IN HERE. LOBBYING.

21

22 **DANIEL SAVER:** THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT

23 PROGRAM.

24



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. SAVER. ACRONYMS. THIS IS A  
2 REQUEST OF REFERRAL TO BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY  
3 THAT'S US, BAHFA, TO APPROVE RESOLUTION NUMBER 0035 REVISED  
4 ALLOCATING 3 MILLION IN PRIORITY SITE REDEVELOPMENT PILOT  
5 PROGRAM FUNDING FOR THE -- [LAUGHTER] -- DID I SAY THAT RIGHT?  
6 SOMEBODY CAN CORRECT ME. PROJECT TO THE AMADOR STATION  
7 PROJECT. THIS ITEM IS ALSO A PROGRESS UPDATE ON THE PRIORITY  
8 SITES REDEVELOPMENT LOAN PILOT PROGRAM. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM  
9 FOR US AND RUBEN IS PRESENT. HELLO RUBEN. THANK YOU. YOU'RE  
10 ON.

11

12 **RUBEN ANGUIANO:** YES, THANK YOU. HI EVERYONE. RUBEN A ANGUIANO,  
13 HOUSING ANALYST FOR BAHFA I'LL PROVIDE A PREDEVELOPMENT ALONE  
14 PILOT FUNDING PROGRAM UPDATE AS WELL AS SEEKING AMENDMENT TO  
15 OUR APPROVED LIST. NEXT SLIDE. JUST TO START OFF AND GROUND  
16 OURSELVES. SO WHAT ARE PRIORITY SITES, LOCALLY IDENTIFIED  
17 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT SITES FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND MARKET  
18 RATE AND MIXED INCOME HOUSING. THESE SITES ARE CLOSE TO  
19 TRANSIT, SERVICE AND AMENITIES AND UPON REDEVELOPMENT OR  
20 DEVELOPMENT OF THAT SITE WOULD ALSO BRING THESE TRANSPORTATION  
21 UPGRADES AND AMENITY SERVICES TO THAT NEIGHBORHOOD. NOVEMBER  
22 2023 MTC AND ABAG APPROVED 211 SITES THAT CAN APPLY FOR  
23 PREDEVELOPMENT FUNDING FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FINISHING.  
24 NEXT SLIDE. TIMELINE GOES BACK IN 2021 RELEASED PLANNED BAY  
25 AREA CAME UP AS, SORT OF, A BIT OF NASCENT IDEA FOR ONE OF OUR

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 HOUSING STRATEGIES THEN IN 2022 THE CONCEPT PAPER PRIORITY  
2 SITES IDEA THEN AFTER THAT CAME A COUPLE OF WEBINARS TO  
3 FURTHER TAYLOR THE PROGRAM AND IN 2023 MTC AND ABAG IN MARCH  
4 APPROVED THIS CRITERIA UNDER WHICH JURISDICTIONS WOULD APPROVE  
5 OR NOMINATE SITES UNDER THIS PROGRAM AS WELL AS FUNDING SITES  
6 AS WELL AS FUNDING REQUIRED FOR THE PILOT PROGRAMS, THEN  
7 JANUARY WE RECEIVED LETTERS OF INTEREST FOR FUNDING PROGRAMS  
8 IN MAY WE CAME BACK TO THE BOARD TO RECEIVE APPROVAL FOR AWARD  
9 AND LAUNCH THESE PILOTS THEN TODAY WE'RE SEEKING AMENDMENT AND  
10 ALSO PROVIDING AN UPDATE SO WE CAN MEET ALL TARGET LOAN  
11 CLOSINGS BY JUNE 2025. NEXT SLIDE. WHERE DOES OUR PILOT  
12 FUNDING FIT IN THESE ARE REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT SITES VERY  
13 LARGE SITES USUALLY MULTIPLE PHASES MULTIPLE PROJECTS. THEY'RE  
14 ALSO, THINK OF LIKE A BART STATION PARKING LOT OR VTA PARKING  
15 LOT. THERE IS NOT TOO MUCH SO THERE REQUIRES UPFRONT CAPITAL  
16 TO GET THAT SITE READY FOR DEVELOPMENT. SO OUR PREDEVELOPMENT  
17 FUNDING COMES TO PROJECTS THAT ARE A BIT FURTHER ALONG IN THE  
18 PREDEVELOPMENT STAGE SO THIS IS KIND OF CONTINUING THE  
19 PROGRESS THAT THOSE DEVELOPERS HAVE MADE, SUCH AS CONTINUING  
20 MORE DETAILED ARCHITECTURE AND ENGINEERING WORK. THE FUNDING  
21 CAN ALSO SUPPORT WITH PULLING BUILDING PERMITS AND FUNDING  
22 COMMITMENTS ALSO CEMETERY THESE PROJECTS AS THEY APPLY TO  
23 STATE FUNDING AND TRY TO PIECE TOGETHER THEIR CAPITAL STACK IT  
24 REALLY HELPS LEVERAGING SCORES AS WELL AND HELPS THEM ALONG IN  
25 THE PREDEVELOPMENT STAGE. NEXT SLIDE. AND JUST FOR A BIT MORE

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 CONTEXT, AGAIN, IN FALL, WE RECEIVED APPROVAL FOR THE FUNDING  
2 THAT'S 28 MILLION OF PREDEVELOPMENT PILOT FUNDING. IN JANUARY  
3 WE RECEIVED 24 LETTERS OF INTEREST, TOTALING 77 MILLION IN  
4 PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN REQUESTS. AND AFTER THAT STAFF INTERNALLY  
5 REVIEWED AND WE CAME TO THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE AND THE  
6 BAHFA BOARD TO RECEIVE APPROVAL FOR OUR PREDEVELOPMENT PILOT  
7 PROJECTS AFTER THAT WE WENT BACK TO WORK WITH THE BORROWERS  
8 AND DEVELOPERS IN AUGUST WE CLOSED OUR FIRST LOAN AND WE HAVE  
9 BEEN WORKING WITH THE DEVELOPERS SINCE THEN TODAY WE'RE  
10 SEEKING UPDATE ALSO RECOMMENDED AMENDMENT TO REPLACE THE ONE  
11 PROJECT THAT RECEIVED OR WE RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING THAT NO  
12 LONGER NEEDS FUNDING WITH ONE THAT DOES. AWARDS ON THE LEFT  
13 PROPOSED AMENDMENT IN BLUE RED STRIKE THROUGH WHEN WE WERE  
14 DISCUSSING WITH BORROWERS, BESONIA VILLAGE LET US KNOW THAT  
15 THEY NO LONGER NEEDED OUR PREDEVELOPMENT FUNDING SO THEREFORE  
16 STAFF WENT BACK TO THE LIST OF PROJECTS, SCORED BASED OFF OF  
17 NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY THAT WE PROVIDED FOR THAT  
18 RELEASE IN NOVEMBER 2023 AND ALSO ATTACHMENT C IN THE PACKET  
19 WENT BACK TO THAT PROJECT SO TO REALLOCATE THE 3 MILLION THAT  
20 WOULD HAVE GONE TO THE VILLAGE NEXT PROJECT IN LINE WAS AMADOR  
21 STATION. AMADOR STATION IS REDEVELOPING DUBLIN PLEASANTON BART  
22 STATION BRINGING 154 AFFORDABLE HOMES IN THE FIRST PHASE WE  
23 CONTACTED THE DEVELOPER TO CONFIRM FUNDING NEED AND ALSO TO  
24 REQUEST PROJECT UPDATES THEREFORE STAFF IS RECOMMENDING WE --  
25 RECOMMENDING AMADOR STATION TO REALLOCATE THE \$3 MILLION THAT

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 WOULD HAVE GONE TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE] VILLAGE. NEXT SLIDE,  
2 PLEASE. AND THIS SLIDE JUST REALLY TRYING TO SHOW YOU A FULL-  
3 SCALE UPDATE OF OUR WHERE OUR LOANS ARE WITH REGARDS TO THE  
4 OTHER TEN AND YOU CAN SEE THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT FOR AMADOR  
5 STATION AT THE BOTTOM. BUT HERE, WE HAVE CLOSED TWO OF OUR  
6 LOANS LAST YEAR LIKE WITH LAKE MERRITT AND SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO  
7 PUC, WE'RE EXPECTING TO CLOSE FOR MIDWAY VILLAGE IN EARLY  
8 MARCH AND THEN FOR THESE NEXT FOUR WE HAVE RECEIVED -- MADE  
9 SUBSTANTIAL PROGRESS, GETTING THAT FIRST SET OF NEGOTIATIONS  
10 WITH THE DEVELOPERS, GETTING KEY CRITERIA, KEY TERMS THAT MAY  
11 NEED TO NEGOTIATE GETTING THIS OUT OF THE WAY AND NEGOTIATING  
12 WITH THEM AND SO GETTING THAT FIRST ROUND IS REALLY GOOD  
13 PROGRESS AND WE REALLY HOPE TO CLOSE BEFORE THAT IN THE NEXT  
14 COMING MONTHS AND WE'RE WAITING FOR TWO MORE ROUND COMMENTS  
15 FROM TWO DEVELOPERS AND THEN DEPENDING ON THIS AMENDMENT, WE  
16 REALLY HOPE TO ENGAGE AMADOR STATION TO GET THAT PROCESS  
17 STARTED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THEN HERE,  
18 I JUST -- WE JUST WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THE TWO PROJECTS THAT WE  
19 HAVE CLOSED LOANS ON AND GIVE YOU A SENSE OF HOW OUR FUNDING  
20 IS WORKING IN THE HOUSING ECOSYSTEM AND FUNDING THESE  
21 PROJECTS. LAKE MERRITT THAT SITE WE PROVIDED \$3 MILLION  
22 DEVELOPMENT LOAN TO THE TOD POLICY 96 UNITS BEING DEVELOPED,  
23 AFFORDABLE UNITS RESERVED FOR HOMELESS HOUSEHOLDS WE CLOSED  
24 AUGUST 2024 AND STARTED CONSTRUCTION MID-OCTOBER AND  
25 PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN REALLY SUPPORTED THE DEVELOPER GETTING

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THESE, OUR PREDEVELOPMENT PLAYED A CRITICAL PART IN THAT LAST  
2 STEP WHERE THE DEVELOPER DID NOT HAVE ACCESS TO CAPITAL  
3 WITHOUT THE CONSTRUCTION LOAN COMING IN. ANOTHER KEY PART OF  
4 THIS PROJECT AND THE CATALYTIC NATURE OF THE PRIORITY SITES,  
5 IS THAT WITH THIS FIRST PHASE OF THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING  
6 PROJECT ALONG WITH FUNDING FROM AIG AND ASIC THE CONSTRUCTION  
7 OF THE SITE BRINGS FORWARD THE MAJORITY OF THE TOD, TRANSIT  
8 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT OPEN SPACE AND TRANSPORTATION UPGRADES TO  
9 THE SITE, SO IT'S 85% OF THE PUBLIC OPEN SPACE AND  
10 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS SO THAT SETS UP THE STAGE FOR  
11 FURTHER SUBSEQUENT PHASES I THINK IT'S THE MARKET RATE PHASE  
12 THAT FOLLOWS. BUT JUST BRINGS A LOT OF THAT AMENITIES TO THAT  
13 SITE. AND JUST HOW THAT FITS IN WITH THE HOUSING ECOSYSTEM,  
14 BACK IN 2009 MTC AND ABAG PROVIDED FUNDING TO SUPPORT THE  
15 EARLY SITE PLANNING AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT WORK THAT  
16 EVENTUALLY LED TO THE LAKE MERRITT PARK STATION AREA PLAN AND  
17 EVENTUALLY LED TO THE BUILDING THAT'S BREAKING GROUND TODAY.  
18 ON THE OTHER SIDE FOR THE OTHER PROJECT FOR SOUTH SAN  
19 FRANCISCO PUC WE PROVIDED \$2.1 MILLION PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN  
20 ONLY SO THEY WILL PAY THAT BACK IN ABOUT TWO TO THREE YEARS  
21 FUNDING GOES DIRECTLY TOWARDS FUNDING OF HORIZON  
22 INFRASTRUCTURE FOR THE SUBSEQUENT DEVELOPMENT OF A COUPLE OF  
23 PHASES. THIS IS A PRETTY LARGE SITE, THE SIX ACRE SITE AND  
24 RELATIVELY VACANT. SO IT REQUIRES A LOT OF UP FRONT CAPITAL  
25 SUCH AS THE RELOCATION OF UTILITIES, TRANSPORTATION UPGRADES

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 TO THE MAIN STREET ADJACENT TO THE MAIN PROPERTY. THEY'RE ALSO  
2 BUILDING A PEDESTRIAN AND VEHICLE PROJECT COVERS COLMA CREEK  
3 SO DESIGN AND PERMITTING WORK IS A LOT OF JUST A LOT THAT  
4 NEEDS TO HAPPEN BEFORE THE PROJECTS CAN EVEN BREAK GROUND  
5 THEMSELVES. AND SO THIS KIND OF FUNDING IS NOT NECESSARILY  
6 SUPPORTING DIRECTLY THE UNITS BUT IT SETS UP THE SITE AND SETS  
7 UP THE STAGE SO THAT ONCE THE PROJECTS DO GET FUNDING THEY'RE  
8 ABLE TO PROCEED. SO PHASE ONE THEY WILL BRING 158 UNITS OF  
9 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND 375 UNITS OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO SAN  
10 FRANCISCO. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS FOR NEXT STEPS STAFF WILL  
11 CONTINUE WORKING WITH THE BORROWERS AS WE HAVE BEEN, TO CLOSE  
12 THE LOANS. WE HAVE OUR MAIN DEADLINE AS JUNE 2025 WHERE  
13 BORROWERS HAVE TO DRAW ON THE FUNDS BEFORE THEN. SO WE'RE  
14 TRYING TO CLOSE TO MAKE SURE THEY CAN REACH THAT DEADLINE. NO  
15 DEVELOPER HAS MENTIONED THAT'S AN ISSUE. AS FUNDS ARE SCARCE  
16 AND WOULD LIKE TO GET FUNDING TO WORK. DRAW ALL FUNDS WILL BE  
17 DRAWN DOWN BY JUNE 2026 SO ALL FUNDING EXTENDED BY THEN. THEN  
18 LONGER TERM, WORTH MENTIONING, PROJECTS THAT RECEIVED  
19 PREDEVELOPMENT LOANS ONLY THEY WILL REPAY IN TWO TO THREE YEARS  
20 THEREFORE EXPECT TO GET PAYMENT ON FUNDS AND THEN --  
21 [INDISCERNIBLE] RE-- INTO OTHER PRIORITY PROJECTS. WITH THAT,  
22 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THAT CONCLUDES THE PRESENTATION AND I'M  
23 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.  
24

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** BEFORE WE JUMP TO QUESTIONS, IT'S REALLY  
2 EXCITING TO SEE ALL OF THIS MOVING FORWARD HERE. AND MONEY  
3 WELL, WELL USED. THANK YOU. I BELIEVE ABAG HAS --

4

5 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** MAKE SURE WE CALL THE ORDER, BUT WE  
6 DIDN'T HAVE QUORUM. WE NOW HAVE QUORUM. IS THAT CORRECT?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE DID HAVE QUORUM. WE DID NOT HAVE AT  
9 THAT TIME THE OAKLAND LOCATION CONNECTED BUT IT IS NOW  
10 CONNECTED. YES.

11

12 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** I SEE.

13

14 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** GO AHEAD.

15

16 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** IF I MAY, THEN, BRING IT BACK TO TODAY'S  
17 CHAIR, WHICH IS SUPPOSED TO BE THE HOUSING COMMITTEE. AND  
18 RATHER THAN BREAK UP THIS CONVERSATION, THEN LET'S MOVE  
19 FORWARD WITH QUESTIONS, IF STAFF HAS ANY. IS THAT OKAY?

20

21 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** SURE. OKAY. MISS ECKLUND?

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR A GREAT PRESENTATION.  
24 I DID A LITTLE ANALYSIS OF THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE LOANS. CAN  
25 YOU REMIND ME WHERE MARIN AND SONOMA THE ONLY TWO APPLICATIONS

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THAT WERE SUBMITTED FOR THOSE TWO COUNTIES WHY THEY WERE NOT  
2 RECOMMENDED FOR FUNDING?

3

4 **DANIEL SAVER:** EXCUSE ME IF I MAY INTERJECT HERE. DANIEL SAVER  
5 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR HOUSING AND ENERGY. WHEN WE  
6 RECEIVED THE INITIAL SET OF APPLICATIONS WE SCORED ALL  
7 CRITERIA AGAINST THE CRITERIA THAT HAD BEEN PROVIDED AS PART  
8 OF THE NOTICE OF FUNDING AVAILABILITY. IN ATTACHMENT C, THERE  
9 WAS SPECIFIC NUMERICAL SCORING CRITERIA THAT WERE USED FOR ALL  
10 OF THE PROJECTS. I DON'T RECALL SPECIFICALLY WHAT ABOUT THOSE  
11 PROJECTS KIND OF MADE THEM SCORE WHERE THEY DID. BUT AS YOU  
12 NOTE, YOU CAN SEE THE CRITERIA, AND KIND OF WHAT THEY ARE. I  
13 GUESS ONE POINT THAT I WOULD MAKE HERE THAT'S RELEVANT FOR  
14 AMADOR STATION AND KIND OF WHY AMADOR STATION WAS THE NEXT IN  
15 LINE IF YOU WILL, IS THAT ONE OF THE CRITERIA THAT CARRIED  
16 MOST POINTS RELATED TO READINESS. AND, SO, AMADOR STATION WAS  
17 ONE OF THE PROJECTS THAT HAD A HIGHER READINESS SCORE. AND  
18 THAT WHEN WE CONNECTED BACK WITH THE AMADOR STATION  
19 DEVELOPMENT TEAM, THEY WERE ABLE TO CONFIRM THAT TYPE OF  
20 READINESS. READINESS GENERALLY IS AN IMPORTANT CRITERIA THAT  
21 WE HAVE. BECAUSE WE WANT TO SEE THINGS MOVE. [LAUGHTER] IN  
22 THIS PARTICULAR PROGRAM IT'S ESPECIALLY SALIENT BECAUSE IT'S A  
23 TIME LIMITED FUND SOURCE. SO WE ALSO, BASED ON THE STATE  
24 REQUIREMENTS OF THIS PARTICULAR COLOR OF MONEY, WE NEED THE  
25 PROJECTS TO BE ABLE TO START DRAWING DOWN FULLY. AND THEN ALSO



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 TO FULLY EXPEND THEIR ALLOCATION FROM US VERY SWIFTLY. SO, I  
2 DON'T -- AGAIN, I CAN'T SPEAK SPECIFICALLY TO THOSE TWO  
3 PROJECTS WE CAN GO BACK AND CORRECT CAN YOU OFFLINE DIRECTOR  
4 ABOUT THE QUALITIES OF THOSE. THEY DO REMAIN ON THE LIST. SO,  
5 WE STILL HAVE EIGHT OF THESE LOANS THAT WE NEED TO CLOSE,  
6 SHOULD WE ENCOUNTER ANY HICCUPS, WE'LL CONTINUE TO KIND OF  
7 RETURN TO THE LIST THAT WE HAVE. SO, IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE  
8 YOU WANT TO ADD TO THAT?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** JUST A TINY THING FOR MARIN SONOMA, THAT PROJECT HAS  
11 -- [ AUDIO DISTORTION ] CLOSED ON CONSTRUCTION FINANCING AND  
12 THEY'RE -- SO, THEY HAVE KIND OF NO LONGER NEEDED OUR MONEY  
13 BUT THEY HAVE MOVED ON FROM OUR -- THEY HAVE MADE PROGRESS.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** FOR SONOMA. WHAT ABOUT THE MARIN SITE?

16

17 **RUBEN ANGUIANO:** FOR MARIN, AS MENTIONED FOR THESE PROJECTS,  
18 FOR LOANS IN THE NEAR FUTURE, I THINK THAT PROJECT WOULD BE  
19 VERY -- WELL, WE WOULD CONSIDER THAT PROJECT MOVING FORWARD  
20 FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN THE FUTURE.

21

22 **DANIEL SAVER:** SPECIFICALLY ABOUT THAT PROJECT.

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD APPRECIATE THAT. BECAUSE AT SOME POINT,  
25 WE WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS EARLIER OFFLINE. I THINK IT'S

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1    IMPORTANT FOR US TO HELP THE COUNTIES THAT HAVE NOT BEEN AS  
2    COMPETITIVE FOR THESE FUNDS AND HELP THEM BE MORE COMPETITIVE  
3    IN THE FUTURE. BECAUSE ALL OF US HAVE RHNA NUMBERS TO BE ABLE  
4    TO ACHIEVE AND SOMETIMES THE DEVELOPERS NEED THAT FUNDING BUT  
5    JUST DO NOT HAVE THE CAPACITY TO BE ABLE TO DEVELOP A WELL  
6    COMPETITIVE APPLICATION. SO, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. BECAUSE  
7    WHEN I LOOK AT THE STATISTICS, YOU KNOW, THERE IS NINE  
8    COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA. TWO OF WHICH APPLIED THAT DID NOT  
9    GET ANY AWARDS. AND THEN THERE WAS TWO THAT DID NOT APPLY.  
10    NAPA AND SOLANO. SO IT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO GET SOME  
11    INFORMATION FROM THOSE COUNTIES AS TO WHY DIDN'T THEY APPLY.  
12    DID THEY JUST NOT KNOW HOW TO DO IT? DID THEY NOT HAVE THE  
13    CAPACITY? OR WERE THE PROJECTS NOT, QUOTE, READY ENOUGH?  
14    ANYWAY, SO, I APPRECIATE THAT FEEDBACK. BECAUSE EVERYBODY HAS  
15    THE NEEDS AND IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO HELP THE ONES THAT ARE  
16    FALLING BEHIND A LITTLE BIT.

17

18    **RUBEN ANGUIANO:** AND I'LL MENTION ONE OTHER THING THERE, AND  
19    ONE FOLLOW UP, AS WELL. OF THE WHEN WE PRESENTED THIS A YEAR  
20    AGO WE PRESENTED KIND OF THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM AS  
21    WELL AS PREDEVELOPMENT PROGRAM. AND THE PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN  
22    SIDE IS FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE A BIT FURTHER ALONG. THE  
23    TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE SIDE IS A BIT MORE TAILORED TO HELPING  
24    JURISDICTIONS PREPARE THE SITE FOR DEVELOPERS TO EVENTUALLY  
25    DEVELOP ON THAT WE DID CONSIDER A DIVERSE APPLICANT SET FOR

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE SIDE WHICH WE CAN ALSO PROVIDE THAT  
2 FOR FOLLOW UP. I THINK IN THE WHOLE WE TRIED TO GET THE  
3 DIVERSITY OF THE BAY AREA AND ACROSS BOTH PROGRAMS.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** I APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** ARE THERE ANYMORE -- SORRY [LAUGHTER]  
8 WE'RE LOOKING AT EACH OTHER.

9

10 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** YEAH.

11

12 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** IS THERE ANYMORE PUBLIC COMMENT OR  
13 ONLINE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FOR COUNCIL MEMBER OR PUBLIC?

16

17 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR  
20 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT  
21 AND NO MEMBERS IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** I JUST HAVE ONE QUICK OBSERVATION,  
24 COMMENT, I THINK YOU MENTIONED THIS. SO, \$11.1 MILLION, WHICH  
25 IS IN PREDEVELOPMENT FUNDING WILL BE REVOLVING BACK INTO THIS

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 PROGRAM SOMETIME OVER THE NEXT 2 TO 3 YEARS. IS THAT CORRECT?  
2 SO THIS IS THE TYPE OF REALLY MONEY THAT CAN BE REUSED AGAIN  
3 FOR FUTURE PROJECTS TO ALLOW THEM TO GET TO THE POINT WHERE,  
4 INDEED, THEY CAN START BUILDING. SO, I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT WE  
5 HAVE THIS PERMANENT FUNDING. BUT THAT PREDEVELOPMENT PIECE I  
6 THINK IS IMPORTANT. I LIKE THE BALANCE THAT I SEE. THIS IS A  
7 VOTE FOR YOU ALL.

8

9 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** YES. SEEING NO OTHER COMMISSIONER OFFER  
10 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS, AND NOBODY ONLINE OR IN THE ROOM.  
11 THAT'S CORRECT?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT IS CORRECT. YES.

14

15 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** CAN WE HAVE A VOTE ON ITEM 7A FROM THE  
16 BAHFA MEMBERS?

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I BELIEVE WE NEED A MOTION.

19

20 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** A MOTION FIRST. I THINK THAT WAS --

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** I'LL MOVE.

23

24 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** COMMISSIONER MILEY AND COMMISSIONER FLEMING  
25 I THINK IS GOING TO SECOND THAT.

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

3

4 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY MILE SECOND BY COMMISSIONER

7 FLEMING. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

8

9 **KATHLEEN KANE:** SHE HAS STEPPED AWAY BUT HER SITE REMAINS OPEN

10 SO WE CAN CONTINUE WITH THE VOTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VERY GOOD. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

21

22 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

25 PRESENT.

20

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT -- YOU WANT TO TURN  
3 YOUR MIC ON?

4

5 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** YES. YOU'RE HANDING IT BACK TO ME?

6

7 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** YES IF WE COULD GET PERMISSION HERE, CAN WE  
8 CONCLUDE? BECAUSE I HAVE GOT SOME PEOPLE FROM BAHFA?

9

10 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** SO THERE ARE A FEW ITEMS I NEED TO DEAL  
11 WITH. BUT I DON'T BELIEVE THAT IT'S NECESSARY FOR YOU TO STAY  
12 IF YOU NEED TO LEAVE AT THIS POINT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOING TO LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES HERE, SOME OF WHOM  
15 WHO DRIVE VERY FAR. WE CAN CONCLUDE OUR MEETING AND WHOEVER  
16 WANTS TO STAY CAN STAY. THAT WOULD BE IDEAL.

17

18 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT'S FINE. WE CAN JUST CONCLUDE THE ABAG  
19 HOUSING AGENDA.

20

21 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** WE'RE GOING TO CONCLUDE THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT  
22 COMMITTEE.

23

24 **KATHLEEN KANE:** RIGHT AND THEN I MEAN GO FORWARD WITH THE ABAG  
25 HOUSING AGENDA.

21

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, GINA PAPAN:** SO I WILL CONCLUDE THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT  
3 COMMITTEE, AND THE NEXT MEETING FOR IS WEDNESDAY MARCH 12th,  
4 2025. AND THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. COLLEAGUES?

5

6 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** COLLEAGUES FOR YOUR TEAM, YOU ARE  
7 WELCOME TO STAY IF YOU WOULD LIKE. [LAUGHTER] SO, I -- LET ME  
8 JUST QUICKLY GO TO -- ALTHOUGH THE WIND HAS BEEN TAKEN OUT OF  
9 MY SAILS ON THE HOUSING COMMITTEE CHAIR'S REPORT. BUT QUICKLY,  
10 LATE LAST YEAR WE DID RECEIVE A REPORT FROM STAFF WITH  
11 PRELIMINARY IDEAS FOR REGROUPING PROCESS AROUND BAHFA --  
12 EXCUSE ME -- THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY'S BOND,  
13 AND THEN REMOVAL OF RM4 AS WELL AS OUTCOME OF THE 2024  
14 ELECTION. AND PROP FIVE, WHICH WE WILL HAVE TO PUT OUR HEADS  
15 TOGETHER SOON TO BEGIN TO THINK ABOUT HOW WE ADDRESS THIS  
16 FUNDING ISSUE FOR THE NINE COUNTIES. ONE OF THE TAKE-AWAY'S  
17 FROM BAHFA STAFF IS THAT THEY HAVE FULL WORK PLANS AT THIS  
18 POINT TO MOVE FORWARD MANY OF THE PILOT PROJECTS THAT WE WANT  
19 TO DEMONSTRATE TO COUNTIES THE NECESSARY NEED TO ACTUALLY HAVE  
20 A BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY THAT CAN BE A VALUE-ADD  
21 TO OUR COUNTIES. SO, DELIVERING THESE PILOT PROJECTS THAT YOU  
22 JUST SAW TODAY WILL BE IMPORTANT, AGAIN, TO DEMONSTRATE THAT.  
23 YOU KNOW, LASTLY, IN THE COMING MONTHS, STAFF, THIS BODY, WILL  
24 BE TALKING ABOUT ADDITIONAL THOUGHTS ABOUT THE BAHFA STRATEGIC  
25 PIVOT TO FIND OUT HOW WE FUND LARGE-SCALE PROJECTS. WE EXPECT

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1 THESE DISCUSSIONS TO BE A MAJOR FOCUS OF OUR COLLABORATIVE  
2 WORK AND COLLECTIVE WORK FOR THE REMAINDER OF 2025. SO STAY  
3 TUNED. WE WILL BE, INDEED, BRINGING THAT BACK TO THIS BODY, AS  
4 WELL AS TO OUR RESPECTIVE LARGER BODIES, AND IN OUR CASE, THE  
5 ABAG EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE FOR THESE ITEMS. LAST ITEM, WITH THAT  
6 I THINK I'M GOING TO MOVE ON. WE HAVE ONE CONSENT CALENDAR  
7 ITEM, WHICH IS APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I'LL SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** OKAY WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. LET  
12 ME ASK IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR  
15 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT  
16 AND NO MEMBERS IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE. AND NONE AT THE REMOTE  
17 LOCATIONS.

18

19 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** OKAY THAT WAS A MOTION BY ECKLUND AND  
20 SECOND BY MOTOYAMA. ROLL CALL VOTE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY ECKLUND SECOND BY MOTOYAMA.  
23 ECKLUND?

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIFE?

3

4 **CARROLL FIFE:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTOYAMA?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RAMOS IS ABSENT.

11 ROMERO?

12

13 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

16 PRESENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU. AND WITH THAT, LET'S SAY OUR

19 MEETING IS NOW ADJOURNED. THE NEXT MEETING IS WEDNESDAY MARCH

20 12th IN THESE CHAMBERS AT -- WILL THIS BE -- ARE WE -- IS THIS

21 11:30 GOING TO BE OUR NORMAL START TIME? NO. IT WILL BE 12

22 NEXT TIME, CORRECT?

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YES WE TRY TO TIME IT BASED ON WHEN THE

25 MEETINGS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] BUT 12 NOON.

FEBRUARY 12, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU ALL. MEETING ADJOURNED.

3 [ADJOURNED]

4



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*