



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

**REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP**

**FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 23<sup>RD</sup>, 2024, 1:00 PM**

**CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CALL THE MEETING OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP -- THIS IS THE WRONG TITLE. THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP TO ORDER. COUNCILMEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9 AND I'LL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED ON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE CALLED ON ACTION ITEMS. DUE TO A NUMBER OF PEOPLE PARTICIPATING REMOTELY, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CHAIR, CHAIR DAVID RABBITT WHO I SEE ON THE SCREEN AND VICE CHAIR SUE NOACK WILL INTRODUCE THEMSELVES AND WELCOME US TO THE CUS MERE ADVISORY GROUP. IS COMMISSIONER RABBITT ALSO HERE.

**KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** HE HAS NOT JOINED YET.

**CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** COMMISSIONER NOACK.

**COMMISSIONER NOACK:** I'M SUE NOACK, THE VICE CHAIR OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE AND I AM EXCITED TO BE WORKING WITH YOU ALL ON THE CUS MY ADVISORY COMMITTEE -- ON





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND MAKING SURE OUR DIVERSE  
2 COMMUNITIES, ASPIRATIONS AND DESIRES FOR TRANSPORTATION ARE  
3 REFLECTED IN OUR -- IN OUR WORK OVER THE NEXT YEAR OR SO.  
4 AFTER THE PAST FEW YEARS, WE MADE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS TOWARD  
5 THE INITIATIVES OUTLINED IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND  
6 WITH THE CONVENING OF THIS GROUP, IT WILL FURTHER GUIDE AND  
7 INFORM THIS WORK AND THE FOUNDATION OF OUR REGIONAL NETWORK  
8 MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE. I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU  
9 THROUGH THIS PROCESS AND I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING  
10 AND LOOK FORWARD TO OUR PARTNERSHIP.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WILL WE BE ABLE  
13 TO -- THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER NOACK, WILL WE HAVE COMMISSIONER  
14 RABBITT TO INTRODUCE HIMSELF IF HE'S ABLE TO BE ABLE TO JOIN?  
15 WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 1 WITH A ROLL CALL AND  
16 CONFIRMATION OF A QUORUM WITH HELP FROM STAFF.

17

18 **KIMBERLY WARD, CLERK:** THANK YOU. CHAIR LEVIN.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ALLEN.

23

24 **BOB ALLEN:** PRESENT.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1   **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

2

3   **IAN GRIFFITHS:** HERE.

4

5   **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

6

7   **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER LIEU, MEMBER LIEU IS ABSENT.

8   MEMBER LOPER. MEMBER LOPER IS ABSENT. MEMBER MARTINEZ. MEMBER

9   MARTINEZ IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY.

10

11   **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** HERE.

12

13   **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER PIERCE. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT.

14   MEMBER SCOTT.

15

16   **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

17

18   **BRIAN STANKE:** PRESENT.

19

20   **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER THOMSON. MEMBER THOMSON IS

21   ABSENT. WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU.

22

23   **SECOND.**

24

25   **>>SPEAKER:** MOTION TO APPROVE.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** HELP FROM STAFF WITH VOTING. IS THERE ANY  
3 PUBLIC -- FIRST OF ALL, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE  
4 MINUTES? IF THERE IS NO MEMBER COMMENT, CAN STAFF HELP WITH  
5 VOTE?

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YES.

14

15 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

20

21 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YES.

22

23 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER KALLINS. >WENDI KALLINS: YES.

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER LEWIS, ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER IS

2 ABSENT. MEMBER MARTINEZ IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY.

3

4 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** YES.

5

6 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER PIERCE. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT.

7 MEMBER SCOTT.

8

9 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER STANKE.

12

13 **BRIAN STANKE:** YES.

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THE MOTION PASSES WITH 12 YES AND ONE

16 ABSTAIN. THANK YOU.

17

18 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I SAID YES.

19

20 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** I PUT YOU YES.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. WE ARE MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM 4-A

23 WHICH IS THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE ANNUAL WORK PLAN AND WE WILL

24 GET A PRESENTATION FROM KY-NAM MILLER ON THIS TOPIC.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I THANK YOU, CHAIR LEVIN. AND PERHAPS JUST  
2 SIMILAR TO THE WORK PLAN ITEM WE WENT THROUGH AT THE PREVIOUS  
3 COUNCIL MEETING, I'LL OFFER SOME FRAMING REMARKS AND I WELCOME  
4 YOU AND VICE CHAIR CUSHMAN'S ADDITIONAL CONTEXT, AS YOU  
5 PARTICIPATED IN THE MEETING AND, OF COURSE, COMMISSIONER  
6 NOACK, WHO IS ALSO AVAILABLE HERE. GOOD AFTERNOON, KY-NAM  
7 HERE, THE STAFF LIAISON TO THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP.  
8 EARLIER THIS WEEK, LEADERS FROM THE COMMITTEE AND THIS BODY  
9 ASSEMBLED TO DEVELOP A WORK PLAN FOR THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY  
10 GROUP AS YOU ARE LIKELY AWARE, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
11 COMMITTEE HAS A CLEAR MISSION, VISION, AND OBJECTIVES FOCUSED  
12 ON DELIVERING A RANGE OF CUSTOMER NETWORK AND PUBLIC BENEFITS  
13 THROUGH UNIFIED REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM FOR THE BAY AREA. THE  
14 CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP PLAYS A KEY ROLE ON GRADING THE R.N.M.  
15 COMMITTEE'S -- ACTUAL TRANSIT USERS, PROVIDING DIVERSE RIDER  
16 PERSPECTIVES TO HELP SHAPE POLICY, PLANNING. THE CUSTOMER  
17 ADVISORY GROUP CONTRIBUTES THESE DIVERSE PERSPECTIVES AND  
18 GUIDING EXCLUSIVITY, EQUITY AND ACCESSIBILITY. SPECIFICALLY,  
19 THE GROUP WILL LEVERAGE THE EQUITY PLATFORM AND PRINCIPLES  
20 FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE TO INFORM. YOUR ENGAGEMENT ON  
21 THIS WILL BE ONGOING, COMPREHENSIVE, AND CONSTRUCTIVE TO  
22 ENABLE THE R.N.M. COMMITTEE TO ENHANCE THE CUSTOMER  
23 EXPERIENCE, COORDINATE INTEGRATED NETWORK AND DRIVING PUBLIC  
24 BENEFITS. WITH WIDE RANGING EXPERTISE IN THE COMMUNITIES YOU  
25 SERVE, WE WILL FULFILL THE PROMISE OF TRANSFORMING A REGIONAL





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 TRANSIT SYSTEM. THE TAP GUIDES THE R.N.M.'S WORK OUT OF FIVE  
2 AREAS, ENHANCING FARES, MANAGING AN INTEGRATED NETWORK,  
3 IMPROVING ACCESSIBILITY AND SECURING FUNDING. THIS YEAR'S WORK  
4 AIMS TO MAKE TANGIBLE PROGRESS BY BOTH PLANNING INITIATIVES  
5 AND LAUNCHING CUSTOMER FACING PROJECTS. THE R.N.M. WORK SPANS  
6 A YEAR AND A HALF AND HAS CUSTOMER INFORMATION, NETWORK  
7 COORDINATION, ACCESSIBILITY AND FUNDING. THE KEY PILLARS OF  
8 THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN. ADDITIONALLY, THE COUNCIL WILL  
9 FOCUS ON FOUNDATIONAL GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION TO SUPPORT  
10 AN EFFECTIVE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER. THIS OVERARCHING R.N.M.  
11 WORK PLAN DIRECTLY INFORMED DEVELOPMENT OF THE CUSTOMER  
12 ADVISORY GROUP'S ANNUAL PLAN. IN YOUR ROLE -- AND YOUR ROLE IS  
13 TO PROVIDE THESE DIVERSE COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVES, CENTERING  
14 EQUITY AND DECISION-MAKING, FACILITATING DELIVERY OF WORLD-  
15 CLASS CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. BY ALIGNING THE ADVISORY GROUP'S  
16 CONTRIBUTIONS WITH THE COUNCIL'S AMBITIOUS PORTFOLIO, THE AIM  
17 IS FOR YOU TO COLLABORATIVELY REALIZE R.N.M.'S MISSION OF  
18 DRIVING TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVEMENTS TO THE BAY AREA TRANSIT  
19 SYSTEMS. SEVERAL KEY PRIORITIES STAND OUT. FIRST, THERE WAS AN  
20 IDENTIFIED NEED TO DEVELOP INNOVATIVE FUNDING SOLUTIONS TO  
21 COVER THE COSTS OF IMPROVING ACCESSIBILITY, AFFORDABILITY,  
22 SECOND, ENSURING EQUITY IS CENTRAL ACROSS ALL ASPECTS OF THE  
23 WORK FROM COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT TO SERVICE PLANNING AND, THIRD,  
24 ADVANCING ACCESSIBILITY FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES,  
25 INCLUDING BETTER CONNECTIONS BETWEEN ACCESSIBLE AND FIXED





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ROUTE SERVICES. FINALLY, COLLABORATION ACROSS AGENCIES IS  
2 ESSENTIAL FOR PROVIDING A SEAMLESS CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. FOR  
3 2024, PROPOSED TOPICS BUILD ON THE TAP, TRANSIT ACTION PLAN  
4 FRAMEWORK, INCLUDING ACCELERATING FARE INTEGRATION EFFORTS,  
5 EVALUATING WAY FINDING PROTOTYPES, SCALING DELIVERY, CONCEPTS  
6 THROUGH TRANSIT 2050 +AND WITH THAT I'D LIKE TO -- 2050+ AND I  
7 WANT TO THANK THOSE WHO WORKED ON THIS AND, OF COURSE, CHAIR  
8 LEVIN, VICE CHAIR CUSHMAN AND COMMISSIONER NOACK FOR ANY  
9 ADDITIONAL COMMENTS YOU'D LIKE TO PROVIDE. GO AHEAD, MELANIE.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** IN TERMS OF THE ADDITIONAL CONTEXT, KY-NAM TALKED  
12 THOROUGHLY.

13

14 **MELANIE CHOY:** WE WELCOME YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY.

15

16 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WILL KICK IT  
17 OFF WITH SOME VERY BRIEF INTRODUCTORY NOTES AND THEN BEFORE  
18 HEARING FROM EVERYBODY HERE, SO BRIEFLY AN INTRODUCTION IN THE  
19 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL PRIOR TO THIS THAT OVERALL BODY WAS  
20 EXTREMELY INTERESTED IN THE WORK OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
21 PLAN, AND THIS BODY, AS BEING, YOU KNOW, PARTLY SELECTED FROM  
22 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCILMEMBERS AND WANTED TO HAVE REGULAR  
23 REPORTS, I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT THERE ARE A FEW PEOPLE FROM THE  
24 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WHO HAVE STAYED ON HERE AND MAYBE  
25 THERE'S MORE THAT ARE ALSO WATCHING ONLINE AND THAT IS





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 SOMETHING THAT IS VERY WELCOMED AND ENCOURAGED. IN TERMS OF  
2 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, STAFF HAS STATED THAT IS A  
3 LIVING DOCUMENT AND THERE WILL BE AN UPCOMING STEP TO UPDATE  
4 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT, YOU KNOW,  
5 WHAT HAS ALREADY BEEN DONE AND WHAT MAY BE NEXT TO DO. SO I  
6 THINK THAT IS SOMETHING GOING TO BE A VERY IMPORTANT THING.  
7 AND LASTLY AND BY WAY OF REINFORCING WHAT THE -- WHAT KY-NAM  
8 SAID ABOUT EQUITY, I WANTED TO REPORT SOME CONCERNS THAT I  
9 HEARD FROM STAKEHOLDER AND COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND WANTED TO  
10 MAKE SURE THAT AS MEMBERS OF THIS BODY KIND OF, YOU KNOW, ROLL  
11 OFF AND OTHER PEOPLE COME IN THAT WE REALLY KEEP AN EYE  
12 TOWARDS REPRESENTING A DIVERSITY OF PEOPLE THAT ARE USERS OF  
13 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM AS WE BUILD OUT THIS BODY AS MORE MEMBERS  
14 COME AND GOING FORWARD. SO WITH THAT, WE CAN START TO TAKE  
15 COMMENTS. DO YOU WANT TO START, HILARY?

16

17 **HILLARY BROWN:** ACTUALLY, I'M KIND OF NEW BUT I DO APPRECIATE  
18 THE T.A.P.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. I AM GOING TO GO ALL THE WAY  
21 AROUND AND IF YOU HAVE SOMETHING TO SAY WE'LL CALL ON YOU  
22 AGAIN. WENDI. [INDISCERNIBLE]

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. ZACK GAVE A THUMBS UP.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **BRIAN STANKE:** YEAH, I'D LIKE TO REINFORCE WHAT YOU SAID ABOUT  
2 THE -- BEING INVOLVED IN THE UPDATE AND THE LIVING DOCUMENT  
3 THAT IS THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, AS WE'VE GONE  
4 THROUGH OUR MULTIPLE ITERATIONS. HAVING THE VOICE OF TRANSIT  
5 CUSTOMERS OR USERS IS IMPORTANT IN THAT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** WARREN, SORRY, GO AHEAD.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** I'D JUST LIKE TO SAY THAT HOPEFULLY  
10 -- AND I'M TAKING THIS FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING. HOPEFULLY WE  
11 CAN BE ACCOUNTABLE TO THE TRANSIT --

12

13 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** WE CAN DO EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MAKE THEIR  
14 EXPERIENCE PLEASANT AND SAFE. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** IS THIS ON? OKAY, HI. SO FIRST, I WANT TO SAY THAT I  
17 ENDORSE THE IDEA OF THE FULL POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
18 CONNECTING WITH THIS BODY. I THINK THE PROCESS IS IMPORTANT.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** ALSO, IN TERMS OF THE -- IN PERMS OF  
21 PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES, THERE ARE REALLY THREE AREAS THAT I  
22 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT. ONE WOULD BE THE ITEMS REGARDING PARA-  
23 TRANSIT. THERE ARE SEVERAL, THREE OR FOUR. AND SO RATHER THAN  
24 ELUCIDATE EACH ONE, I WANT TO SAY THAT THE PARA-TRANSIT ITEMS  
25 IN THE T.A.P. IS IMPORTANT FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 WAY FINDING PIECE AS WE DEALT WITH IN THE PAST AND THE  
2 PROGRESSION OF THAT WAY FINDING PROCESS AS IT CONTINUES, ALL  
3 OF THE DIALOGUE AROUND THAT, AND MORE INVOLVEMENT, INCLUDING  
4 FUNDING AROUND THAT, IS IMPORTANT TO ME. AND THEN THE THIRD  
5 PIECE IS SOMETHING THAT WAS RAISED A LITTLE WHILE AGO. THE  
6 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN FIXED ROUTE AND PARA-TRANSIT AND HOW  
7 THOSE TWO INTERPLAY FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND THE  
8 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, THINK ABOUT NOT ONLY THE  
9 PARA-TRANSIT SIDE AND FIXED ROUTE SIDE AND THE RELATIONSHIPS  
10 THEREOF AND HOW PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES CAN UTILIZE THE  
11 SYSTEM IN BOTH. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. IAN.

14

15 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANKS. GENERALLY SUPPORT THIS WORK PLAN. I  
16 WOULD JUST -- THERE'S ONE AREA THAT I'M NOT SEEING REFLECTED  
17 HERE, WHICH IS THE -- REALLY, HOW WE ARE ASSESSING THE  
18 EFFECTIVENESS OF THIS BODY AND THIS OVERARCHING STRUCTURE IS  
19 NOT REFLECTED IN THIS WORK PLAN. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THERE'S A  
20 TWO-YEAR -- THAT THIS FRAMEWORK THAT WE'VE SET UP WITH THIS  
21 COMMITTEE, THE COUNCIL, AND THEN THE -- AND THE -- THE OTHER  
22 COMMITTEE. SORRY. THIS IS A GROUP. THE GROUP, THE COMMITTEE,  
23 AND THE COUNCIL HAS THIS THREE-LAYER CAKE OF KIND OF WEIGHING  
24 IN ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT TOPICS IS GOING TO BE ASSESSED AFTER  
25 TWO YEARS AND I DON'T KNOW WHEN THE BEGINNING OF THAT TWO





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 YEARS OFFICIALLY IS FROM THE POINT WHEN THE COMMITTEE WAS SET  
2 UP OR, YOU KNOW, WHEN THE COUNCIL WAS SET UP, WHICH I THINK IS  
3 THE LAST OF THE THREE BODIES TO GET STOOD UP. BUT REALLY  
4 REFLECTING UPON -- AND I KNOW THIS IS AN 18-MONTH PLAN SO IT'S  
5 UNCLEAR WHEN DO WE START TO SORT OF REFLECT UPON HOW IS THIS  
6 GOING? SURELY, WE'RE GOING TO HAVE PLENTY OF OPPORTUNITIES TO  
7 DISCUSS THESE THINGS, BUT IS THIS -- I HOPE THAT THIS GROUP  
8 WILL HAVE A CHANCE TO WEIGH IN ON, IS THIS AN EFFECTIVE  
9 STRUCTURE FOR ADVANCING NETWORK MANAGEMENT GENERALLY, DO WE  
10 HAVE RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW IT CAN IMPROVE IN THE FUTURE, I  
11 THINK THOSE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT QUESTIONS TO ADDRESS AS WE  
12 MAKE THE CASE FOR FUNDING TO NOT JUST OTHER CUSTOMERS BUT  
13 NONRIDERS IN THE REGION. AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT WAS THE  
14 INTENT OF THE STRUCTURE TO BEGIN WITH. IT WAS NEVER INTENDED  
15 TO BE A PERMANENT STRUCTURE. I WOULD LIKE, HOPEFULLY IN A CAN  
16 BE ACKNOWLEDGED OR ADDRESSED IN SOME WAY IN OUR WORK PLAN,  
17 WHICH -- AND IT DOES SPEAK TO SOME OF THE OTHER, YOU KNOW,  
18 SOME OF THE LINE ITEMS WITHIN THE ORIGINAL TRANSFORMATION  
19 ACTION PLAN OF THE BUSINESS CASE ITSELF FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
20 THAT LED TO THE CREATION OF THIS BODY AS WELL AS OTHER THINGS  
21 IN THAT PLAN LIKE THE REGIONAL RAIL PARTNERSHIP STUDY. THANKS.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** SEBASTIAN.

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** I'M GENERALLY AM IN FAVOR OF THE BROAD  
2 CATEGORIES THAT'S INCLUDED IN THIS WORK PLAN. I THINK ONE,  
3 MAYBE QUESTION TO STAFF. AM I CORRECT THERE IS AN ONGOING  
4 SURVEY OF TRANSIT RIDERS AT A REGIONAL LEVEL?

5

6 **MELANIE CHOY:** IN TERMS OF A REGIONAL SURVEY, IS THAT WHAT  
7 YOU'RE ASKING? THERE ARE PLANS THAT WE'RE CURRENTLY  
8 DISCUSSING. THERE IS CURRENTLY NOT ANYTHING ON THE STREETS AND  
9 IT'S NOT SCOPED.

10

11 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** I DO THINK IT WOULD BE OF INTEREST, EVEN IF  
12 IT'S AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM, FOR THAT ITEM TO COME TO THIS BODY  
13 ALONG WITH -- AGAIN, INFORMATIONAL OF OTHER ITEMS THAT REALLY  
14 PERTAIN TO ANY DATA DESCRIBING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM OR  
15 CHARACTERIZING IT, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THIS BODY STAY  
16 INFORMED OF KIND OF THE REALITIES AND THE NUMBERS AROUND THE  
17 TRANSIT SYSTEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. TERRY.

20

21 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANKS. JUST BRIEFLY. FOR THOSE MEMBERS THAT  
22 WEREN'T AT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING EARLIER. I FIND  
23 THAT THIS -- THIS PROGRAM IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT, AND IT TIES  
24 TOGETHER THE -- IN SOME CASES, COMPETING INTERESTS OF THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 VARIOUS TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT WE HAVE. AND I LIKE THE GENERAL  
2 FORMAT OF IT AND I LIKE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH IT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU, GERRY.

5

6 **GERRY GLASER:** I FIND THAT THE GAP IN THE TOPICS -- LAST WEEK I  
7 SHARED SOMETHING WITH ADINA. A PICTURE OF A WAYFINDING MAP AND  
8 TELLING ME WHERE I COULD CATCH THE BUS, WHERE I CAN CATCH THE  
9 TRAIN. PETALUMA AND SMART. THEY DIDN'T TELL ME THAT GOLDEN  
10 GATE WAS THERE AND SONOMA COUNTY WAS THERE. M.T.C. AND SONOMA  
11 COUNTY DID A STUDY ABOUT HOW TO INTEGRATE THE THREE BUS  
12 SERVICES THAT ARE IN THE COUNTY OF SONOMA AND I SIT ON THE  
13 SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION ADVISORY GROUP AS WELL AND MY  
14 QUESTION WAS, WELL, HOW'S IT GOING? I REVIEWED THAT WITH  
15 STAFF. AND WHEN I WAS TALKING TO THEM THEY SAID, OH, YOU'RE  
16 NOT TALKING ABOUT INTEGRATION. YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT  
17 CONSOLIDATION AND THE ANSWER IS, YEAH, I AM TALKING ABOUT  
18 CONSOLIDATION. SO THE GAP THAT I SEE HERE IS THE GAP THAT  
19 SAYS, WE SHOULD START WORKING NOW ON HOW WE DO SOME OF THE  
20 CONSOLIDATION. WHY DO WE NEED 27 PURCHASING ORGANIZATIONS? WHY  
21 DO WE NEED 27 MARKETING ORGANIZATIONS? WHY DO YOU NEED 27 --  
22 THERE ARE A NUMBER OF PLACES. WHERE WE CAN START ECONOMIZING.  
23 WE TALK ABOUT RAISING FUNDS FOR OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. WE  
24 SHOULD BE WORKING AT THE SAME TIME ON HOW CAN WE MAKE OUR  
25 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM MORE EFFICIENT. AND RUNNING 27 TRANSIT





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 DISTRICTS CLEARLY IS NOT THE MOST EFFICIENT WAY OF DOING THIS.  
2 THERE'S AN AWFUL LOT OF CHALLENGES. READING THE 231-PAGE  
3 REPORT THAT WAS CREATED. I SUGGEST TO EVERYBODY LOOK AT IT  
4 BECAUSE IT'S TYPICAL OF THE PROBLEMS THAT WE WILL RUN INTO  
5 WHEN WE LOOK AT THE ENTIRE REGION ON HOW WE CAN MAKE THE  
6 TRANSFORMATION. THAT REPORT SHOWS A LOT OF DILEMMAS. SO ONE OF  
7 THE THINGS I THINK SHOULD BE ON OUR TOPIC LIST IS IDENTIFYING  
8 WHAT ARE THE BARRIERS TO KEEP US FROM MOVING FORWARD INTO  
9 INTEGRATION? THAT SHOULD BE THE VERY BEGINNING PLACE THAT WE  
10 DO THIS SO WE UNDERSTAND ALL OF THOSE BARRIERS AND SEE IF WE  
11 CAN GET ACROSS THEM. SO I THINK THAT SHOULD BE IN OUR PURVIEW  
12 AS WELL. LOOKING AT THAT. AT THE VERY BEGINNING, IT'S FIGURING  
13 OUT THE SCOPE OF THE PROBLEM THAT WE HAVE. THE OTHER THING  
14 THAT OCCURRED TO ME AND SOMETHING THAT WENDI SAID. SHE JUST  
15 LEFT FOR A SECOND. WE HAVE FIVE TRANSIT DISTRICTS THAT OPERATE  
16 IN SONOMA COUNTY. BUT THERE'S A BUNCH IN MARIN COUNTY. THERE'S  
17 TWO. BUT THERE'S A BUNCH OF PRIVATE CONCERNS AS WELL. WE NEED  
18 TO FIND A WAY TO NOT JUST INTEGRATE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT BUT TO  
19 LEVERAGE SOME OF THE PRIVATE TRANSIT WE HAVE, TOO. IT WAS  
20 ELUDED TO FROM WARREN WHEN HE'S TALKING ABOUT PARA-TRANSIT  
21 BECAUSE IN MANY CASES, FLICKED ROUTE DOESN'T WORK OUT IN THE  
22 COUNTRY, IT DOESN'T WORK. ON DEMAND MIGHT WORK. AS BEING  
23 FULFILLED TODAY BY PRIVATE CONCERNS INSTEAD OF PUBLIC. CAN WE  
24 LEVERAGE THAT? OTHER PLACES IN THE COUNTRY, THAT'S PRECISELY  
25 WHAT THEY'RE DOING. AND I THINK THAT SHOULD BE SOMEPLACE EARLY





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 IN OUR LIST OF THINGS TO BE LOOKING AT AS WELL. SO THOSE ARE  
2 THE GAPS THAT I SEE BUT MOSTLY I'M LOOKING AT CONSOLIDATION,  
3 NOT INTEGRATION. SO I DON'T WANT TO PLAY WITH THE LITTLE  
4 THINGS THAT WE CAN WORK ON. I WANT TO PLAY WITH THE THINGS  
5 THAT WILL TRANSFORM OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM SO THAT EVERYBODY CAN  
6 USE IT.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. DYLAN.

9

10 **DYLAN FABRIS:** THANKS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. I WANT TO PULL TOGETHER A FEW  
13 THEMES QUICKLY BEFORE WE -- YEAH. OH, OKAY. SORRY. HILARY.  
14 ANNE OLIVIA HAS HER HAND ONLINE AFTER HILARY WHICH I CANNOT  
15 SEE ON THE SCREEN SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH, WALLY, FOR TELLING  
16 ME ABOUT THAT. HILARY.

17

18 **HILLARY BROWN:** I WAS THINKING ME AS A FORMER STUDENT AT CAL  
19 STATE, EAST BAY, I WAS THINKING ABOUT SURVEYS OR INTERNSHIPS  
20 FOR PEOPLE THAT GO TO THOSE SCHOOLS AND BRING THEIR VOICES ON  
21 TABLE AND COME TO THIS -- COME TO PLAN. I -- LIKE, FOR  
22 EXAMPLE. A COUPLE YEARS AGO, BART GOES TO S.S. STATE AND CAL  
23 EAST BAY, BART, AND A.C. TRANSIT. MAYBE GET A COLLECTION OF  
24 STUDENTS TO BRING THEIR VOICES ON THE TABLE WHEN IT PERTAINS  
25 TO SURVEYS. I JUST WANT TO BRING THAT UP.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA.

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND THANKS FOR STAFF  
5 AND EVERYBODY ELSE WHO PUT CLEARLY A TON OF REALLY THOUGHTFUL  
6 WORK INTO THIS. SEEING IT IS REALLY EXCITING AND IN GENERAL  
7 VERY SUPPORTIVE. I DID HAVE A COUPLE -- LIKE, REALLY  
8 CLARIFYING QUESTION AND THAT IS -- WHEN STAFF IMAGINES THEY  
9 WILL COME TO THIS BODY FOR INPUT, IS THAT, LIKE A PROBLEM HAS  
10 BEEN IDENTIFIED AND WE NEED TO DEFINE IT? A PROBLEM HAS BEEN  
11 DEFINED -- HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED, WE'VE DEFINED IT, AND NOW  
12 WE'VE COME UP WITH SIX SOLUTIONS FOR YOU TO WEIGH IN ON? OR IS  
13 IT CREATING THOSE SOLUTIONS OR COMING -- LIKE, WHERE DOES  
14 STAFF REALLY SEE -- AT WHAT STAGE IN THE PROCESS DOES STAFF  
15 IMAGINE COMING TO THIS BODY FOR FEEDBACK WOULD BE THE WAY TO  
16 PUT THAT IN A SINGLE SENTENCE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN STAFF SPEAK TO THAT?

19

20 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU, MELANIE CHOY WITH M.T.C. STAFF. IN  
21 TERMS OF THAT QUESTION, IT IS DIFFERENT FOR EVERY PROJECT  
22 BECAUSE THE NATURE OF THE PROJECTS, SOME ARE -- THEY'RE AT  
23 DIFFERENT STAGES. AND SO IN GENERAL, WE WOULD BE COMING TO  
24 THIS BODY AT THE BEGINNING OF EACH OF THESE INITIATIVES AT THE  
25 CONCEPTION OF IT SEEKING INPUT AND THROUGHOUT THE DURATION OF





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 EACH OF THOSE PROJECTS, MILESTONES, WE'LL COME BACK TO THIS  
2 GROUP AS WELL BEFORE THE DECISIONS ARE BROUGHT FORWARD TO THE  
3 R.N.M. COMMITTEE. SO AT THE COMMISSIONER LEVEL GROUP.

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** OKAY. SO WE WILL BE PART OF THE CREATION  
6 OF SOLUTIONS AS OPPOSED TO JUST GIVING FEEDBACK ON SOLUTIONS  
7 IF WE'RE LUCKY ENOUGH TO GET SOMETHING IN THAT STAGE IS WHAT I  
8 HEARD. THAT'S GOOD. IS THAT CORRECT?

9

10 **MELANIE CHOY:** THAT IS CORRECT.

11

12 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** COOL. IS THERE ROOM IN THIS FOR  
13 IDENTIFYING AND DEFINING PROBLEMS? LIKE, IS THIS A PLACE WE  
14 CAN OR OUR CONSTITUENT GROUPS CAN BRING ISSUES THAT THEY HAVE  
15 IDENTIFIED THAT IS CURRENTLY NOT BEING ADDRESSED?

16

17 **MELANIE CHOY:** CERTAINLY THIS GROUP IS WELCOME TO BRING IN AND  
18 IDENTIFY ISSUES AND TO BRING IT UP ON THE AGENDA AS WELL. BUT  
19 THERE IS ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY IN TERMS OF AS WE UPDATE THE  
20 ACTION PLAN FOR A DISCUSSION TO BE HELD, AND WE WOULD BRING  
21 THAT BACK TO THIS GROUP AS WELL FOR DISCUSSION. PER COMMENTS  
22 THAT HAVE BEEN MADE DURING THE -- THIS FEEDBACK. SO WE DO  
23 INTEND TO BRING THE UPDATE OF THE ACTION PLAN TO THIS BODY AS  
24 WE ARE DEVELOPING THAT. UPDATE.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANKS SO MUCH. THAT WAS IT. THANKS FOR  
2 YOUR WORK.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. ACTUALLY, MAYBE I SHOULD SEE IF  
5 THERE ARE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS BEFORE DOING THE SUMMARY? IS  
6 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS EITHER IN THE ROOM OR ONLINE?

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER ONLINE. THAT'S  
9 CHRISTINA FITZGERALD, YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF AND I WILL BRING  
10 UP THE TIMER.

11

12 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES.

15

16 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY, SO --

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MA'AM. TWO THINGS  
21 REALLY QUICKLY. NUMBER ONE, I COULDN'T AGREE MORE THAT WE NEED  
22 TO LOOK AT FULL SOLUTIONS TO INTEGRATE OUR SYSTEMS. THERE ARE  
23 27 SYSTEMS. AMONG THE NINE COUNTIES. SOMETHING TO REMEMBER AS  
24 WE'RE DOING THIS IS PARA-TRANSIT RIGHT NOW IS BOUND BY COUNTY.  
25 WE'RE TRYING TO CHANGE THAT. BUT MORE TO THE POINT, WHEN YOU





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 LOOK AT THE AREAS WHERE PARA-TRANSIT GOES ANYWAYS, OFTEN  
2 THERE'S A -- 3/4 MILE LIMIT TO WHERE THE COST INCREASES. SO  
3 THEY TARGET THE OUTSIDE PORTION, THE TARGET IS GETTING COST  
4 MORE. THE OTHER THING TO CONSIDER IS WHEN YOU ARE LOOKING AT  
5 PRIVATE ENTITIES -- PARDON ME -- PRIVATE ENTITIES LIKE UBER  
6 AND LYFT AND OTHER CONTRACTS LIKE THAT, THEY DON'T TYPICALLY  
7 HAVE ACCESSIBLE TRANSIT UNITS IN THEIR SYSTEMS. THEY'RE EITHER  
8 GOING TO HAVE TO CONTRACT OUT WITH SOMEONE WITH A LOCAL PARA-  
9 TRANSIT COMPANIES OR OTHER ORGANIZATIONS THAT HAVE ACCESSIBLE  
10 ADVANCE OR -- AND THAT'S GOING TO BE SOMETHING TO KEEP IN  
11 MIND, ALSO, AS WE LOOK AT THINGS. THANKS SO MUCH.

12

13 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER --

14

15 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS VINAY PIMPLE,  
16 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **VINAY PIMPLE:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO SAY WHEN WE TALK  
19 ABOUT INTEGRATION OF OUR SYSTEMS, I THINK OUR FOCUS SHOULD BE  
20 ACHIEVING [INDISCERNIBLE] RATHER THAN HOW TO GET THERE. I  
21 THINK ONE IMPORTANT THING TO REMEMBER BEFORE BEING GUNG-HO  
22 ABOUT CONSOLIDATION IS A LOT OF THESE AGENCIES, THE SMALLER  
23 AGENCIES WERE SET UP BECAUSE THE PEOPLE IN THOSE AREAS FELT  
24 THAT THEY WERE NOT GETTING THE PUBLIC TRANSIT THAT THEY  
25 NEEDED. FOR EXAMPLE, IF YOU LOOK AT TOTALLY INTEGRATED





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 AGENCIES, TO THAT -- THAT AGENCY MIGHT DECIDE IF YOU HAVE A  
2 CERTAIN AMOUNT OF RIDERSHIP ON THE ROUTE, YOU WOULD CANCEL  
3 THAT ROUTE. WELL, IN THAT CASE, A LOT OF ROUTES IN SAN  
4 FRANCISCO WOULD REMAIN AND A LOT OF ROUTES IN THE OUTER AREAS  
5 WILL SIMPLY BE SHUT DOWN. THAT IS WHY THOSE SEPARATE AGENCIES  
6 HAVE OFTEN BEEN FORMED. SO I WOULD SAY WE NEED TO FOCUS ON  
7 WHERE THE EFFICIENCIES ARE. AND ALSO ON A CASE-BY-CASE BASIS.  
8 THERE MAY BE A CASE FOR CONSOLIDATING PARA-TRANSIT AGENCIES  
9 BUT NOT OTHER AGENCIES. I JUST THINK THAT WE SHOULD FOCUS ON  
10 THE OUTCOMES THAT WE WANT TO ACHIEVE RATHER THAN HOW WE GET  
11 THERE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
14 ONLINE. THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITER, AND THERE'S NO  
15 ONE -- WRITING AND THERE'S NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO FOR SOME SUMMARIES, THERE WERE A  
18 NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO WERE INTERESTED IN THE UPDATE OF THE  
19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AS A LIVING DOCUMENT AND, YOU KNOW,  
20 WEIGHING IN ON THE UPDATE AND WEIGHING IN ON ISSUES AS THEY  
21 ARE BEING DEFINED, YOU KNOW, NOT JUST -- YOU KNOW, LATE IN THE  
22 DAY WHEN THERE'S SOMETHING TO RATIFY. THERE WAS AN INTEREST IN  
23 -- SO IN TERMS OF ACCESSIBLE TRANSPORTATION, LOOKING AT NOT  
24 ONLY PARA-TRANSIT, WHICH ARE THE ONES CALLED OUT IN THE  
25 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND ALSO THE FIXED ROUTE TRANSITS





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 AND THE OTHER MODES, WE HAVE THE MICRO-TRANSIT AND ON DEMAND.  
2 YOU KNOW, MORE GENERALLY, LOOKING AT THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT  
3 MODES THAT EITHER COMPRISE OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM OR  
4 IN SOME WAY TAKE PUBLIC FUNDING. SO THAT'S A CONSIDERATION OF  
5 THE SCOPE TO INCLUDE THAT SWATH OF MODES THAT TAKES PUBLIC  
6 FUNDING. THERE WAS AN INTEREST IN THE CALLED OUT LINE ITEMS  
7 ABOUT COMMUNICATIONS AND I WOULD ADD TO WHAT SEBASTIAN SAID  
8 ABOUT THE SURVEY TO ALSO INCLUDE THE PROACTIVE COMMUNICATIONS  
9 WHERE THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO DO MORE JOINT AND UNIFIED  
10 COMMUNICATIONS FOR THE PUBLIC. AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST, THERE  
11 WAS AN INTEREST IN THE PERFORMANCE AND STRUCTURAL ELEMENTS OF  
12 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, ASSESSING HOW WELL THE  
13 STRUCTURE IS DOING, ASSESSING WHAT ORGANIZATIONAL BARRIERS MAY  
14 IMPEDE ACHIEVING THE GOALS AND, YOU KNOW, WHETHER THOSE --  
15 WHETHER THE SOLUTIONS TO THOSE MAY BE MORE COORDINATION OR  
16 MORE CONSOLIDATION TO REALLY HAVE AN EXPLICIT FOCUS ON  
17 IDENTIFYING THE BARRIERS AND FIGURING OUT WHAT TO DO ABOUT  
18 THOSE BARRIERS. I HOPE WE DO NOT NEED FULL AGENCY  
19 CONSOLIDATION IN ORDER TO GET BETTER WAYFINDING, BUT WE SHOULD  
20 GENERALLY BE LOOKING AT WHEREVER IT IS IN A WE HAVE BARRIERS  
21 AND WHAT IT IS WE NEED TO KEEP LOWERING THOSE BARRIERS AND I  
22 THINK THAT'S A SUMMARY. SO WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE ON TO --  
23 CLOSE THIS ITEM AND MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA.  
24  
25 **KY-NAM MILLER:** I THINK THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM.





1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. IF THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM, SO CAN WE  
3 VOTE TO APPROVE THE WORK PLAN WITH THE SUMMARY COMMENTS  
4 TRANSMITTED TO THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE AND WHOEVER  
5 ELSE IT NEEDS TO BE TRANSMITTED TO, HOW DOES THAT SOUND AS A  
6 MOTION?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** IN THAT'S A MOTION YOU NEED TO SECOND.

9

10 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SECOND. GRIFFITHS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANY COMMENT? IF NOT, CAN STAFF HELP US  
13 VOTE?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR I HAVE A COMMENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OH, PLEASE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MY COMMENT IS REGARDING THE CONSOLIDATION  
20 INTEGRATION. AND I THINK ONE OF THE -- ONE OF THE BARRIERS IS  
21 GOING TO BE THAT HOW DO WE INTEGRATE ALL THE AGENCIES AND  
22 MANAGE THE DIFFERENT PRIORITIES AND PERFORMANCE MEASURES WHEN  
23 EACH AGENCY HAS A DIFFERENT PRIORITY AND PERFORMANCE MEASURE?

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** SOME AGENCIES PER PERFORMANCE BETTER THAN  
2 OTHER AGENCIES. LIKE, IS THAT GOING TO PUT THEM AT A  
3 DISADVANTAGE? LIKE, HOW DO WE WORK THROUGH THIS TO MAKE SURE  
4 THAT EVERYBODY STARTS OUT ON AN EVEN KEEL AND THEN WE'RE NOT  
5 ACTUALLY MAKING POLICY RIGHT NOW BUT WE'RE LOOKING AT WHAT'S  
6 WORKING IN THE FIELD AND MAKING POLICIES FROM WHAT'S WORKING?  
7 THANK YOU.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ARE FOLKS READY TO VOTE AND -- CAN I  
12 REVIEW THE SUMMARY TO MAKE SURE THAT THE WORDING IS REFLECTIVE  
13 OF ALL THE COMMENTS INCLUDING THE COMMENTS MADE AFTER I DID  
14 THE SUMMARY? IS THAT OKAY?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I'LL STEP IN AND DO MY BEST TO SUMMARIZE WHAT YOU  
17 SUMMARIZED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ALL CLEAR. THE MOTION IS TO VOTE  
18 ON THE WORK PLAN WITH THE ADDED THERE IT REFLECT THAT THE  
19 TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN BE TREATED AS A LIVING MOMENT.

20

21 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THAT CONSOLIDATION, RATHER THAN JUST  
22 INTEGRATION, BE REFLECTED IN THE WORK PLAN. THAT THERE'S EARLY  
23 OPPORTUNITIES TO WEIGH IN ON PROJECTS ASSOCIATED WHERE R.N.M.,  
24 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE, THE FULL ACCESSIBILITY OF THE SYSTEM BE  
25 CORE TO THE WORK PLAN ITEMS. THAT NOT ONLY SURVEY BE BROUGHT





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 TO THIS BODY WHEN IT'S GREEN-LIT BUT COMMUNICATIONS AND  
2 ENGAGEMENT WITH THE PUBLIC ALSO BE BROUGHT TO THIS BODY. AND  
3 THAT PERFORMANCE AND STRUCTURE ELEMENTS OF THE TRANSPORTATION  
4 ACTION PLAN ARE KEY IN ASSISTING THE GROUP'S PROGRESS? DOES  
5 THAT QUITE CAPTURE OR DO YOU WANT ANOTHER GO AT IT?

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THE THINGS I WOULD COMBINE AND REORGANIZE  
8 HAVE TO DO WITH THE PERFORMANCE BECAUSE THE PERFORMANCE THAT  
9 WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS NOT JUST ABOUT US AN ADVISORY BODY WHICH  
10 IS MINIMALLY HELPFUL, BUT THE OVERALL MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE AND  
11 ACHIEVEMENT OF THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION PLAN GOALS, THAT  
12 BROADER SCOPE OF PERFORMANCE, AND THEN AN ORGANIZATIONAL  
13 ASSESSMENT, IT'S THE ORGANIZATIONAL ASSESSMENT OF THE SYSTEM,  
14 INCLUDING LOWERING ANY BARRIERS TO ACHIEVING THE GOALS AND --  
15 AND THOSE LOWERING OF BARRIERS MAY BE IN THE NATURE OF MORE  
16 AND BETTER COORDINATION OR ALSO LOOKING AT WHETHER  
17 CONSOLIDATION WOULD BE AN EFFECTIVE WAY OF ACHIEVING THE GOALS  
18 OR NOT.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** DOES IT NEED TO BE THAT PRECISE?

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** KY-NAM, DID THAT HELP?

23

24 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH. WE'VE BEEN TAKING NOTE OF IT SO IF THE  
25 MOTION PASSES, AS YOU JUST STATED, I WILL TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY





1 TO HAVE YOU TAKE YOUR EYES AND LOOK AT IT AS IT'S TRANSMITTED  
2 TO THE COUNCIL. IT IS A FAIRLY LAYERED SET OF PRIORITIES. DOES  
3 THAT WORK FOR YOU?

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** I WILL HAPPILY HELP WITH THE EDITING. --  
6 EDITING. FANTASTIC.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** TO THE QUESTION. IF YOU LOOK AT THE STUDY, WHEN YOU  
9 LOOK AT THESE THINGS, IT IS TALKING ABOUT METRICS AND THE  
10 VARIOUS PLACES.

11

12 **GERRY GLASER:** THERE ARE DIFFERENT METRICS REQUIRED FOR EACH  
13 DISTRICT OR EACH SERVICE, AND WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SERVICES  
14 THROUGH A SINGLE ENTITY AND THE SERVICES WILL BE MEASURED  
15 DIFFERENTLY. THAT'S THE KIND OF THING THAT IS THERE. I DON'T  
16 THINK IT'S -- IT'S NOT AGAINST BUT YOU'RE LOOKING AT. IT DOES  
17 ACTUALLY SUPPORT IT.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR CAN I MAKE ANOTHER COMMENT OR --

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ARE YOU OKAY WITH THE REPRESENTATION IN  
24 THE WORK PLAN, BECAUSE IF IT GETS INTO THE WORK PLAN, THEN WE  
25 CAN HAVE FULL AGENDA ITEMS ABOUT THE TOPIC?





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** OKAY, THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IF WE GOT IT IN THE WORK PLAN, THEN WE'RE  
5 GOOD. ALL RIGHT. IF EVERYBODY'S GOOD WITH THE -- WITH THE  
6 VOTING ON THE MOTION, IF STAFF CAN HELP US TO VOTE.

7

8 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** SO WE HAVE THE MOTION BY LEVIN AND THE  
9 SECOND BY GRIFFITHS TO ADOPT THE BOARD PLAN. MEMBER -- CHAIR  
10 LEVIN.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

13

14 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** VICE CHAIR CUSHMAN.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES.

17

18 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER ALLEN IS ABSENT. MEMBER BROWN.

19

20 **HILLARY BROWN:** YES.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER DEUTSCH-GROSS.

23

24 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YES.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER ELDRED.

2

3 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

4

5 **DYLAN FABRIS:** YES.

6

7 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER GLASER.

8

9 **GERRY GLASER:** WITH THOSE ADJUSTMENTS, YES.

10

11 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER GRIFFITHS.

12

13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YES.

14

15 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YES. >**WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER LIEU IS ABSENT. MEMBER LOPER IS

18 ABSENT. MEMBER MARTINEZ IS ABSENT. MEMBER PETTY.

19

20 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** YES.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT. MEMBER SCOTT.

23

24 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER STANKE.

2

3 **BRIAN STANKE:** AYE.

4

5 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER THOMSON IS ABSENT. THE MOTION  
6 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. EXCELLENT. SO WE WILL NOW MOVE  
9 ON TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WHICH IS 5-A, CLIPPER START PILOT  
10 PROGRAM UPDATE WHERE WE'LL GET AN UPDATE OF I THINK THE NOTES  
11 HERE ARE A LITTLE BIT COPIED AND PASTED BUT I'M PRETTY SURE  
12 WE'LL GET AN UPDATE ON THE CLIPPER BAYPASS -- ON THE CLIPPER  
13 START PILOT PROGRAM.

14

15 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU, CHAIR LEVIN, ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS.  
16 CAN STAFF PLEASE PULL UP THE PRESENTATION? GOOD AFTERNOON.  
17 JUDIS SANTOS, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR ON IMPACT WITH M.T.C.'S  
18 ACCESSIBILITY AND CULTURAL AND RACIAL EQUITY OFFICE. I'M HERE  
19 WITH LISA HALE, LEAD FOR CLIPPER START. TODAY'S UPDATE IS A  
20 CULMINATION OF WORK BEING DONE BY M.T.C. WITH SUPPORT FROM  
21 PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATORS AND COMMUNITY-BASED  
22 ORGANIZATIONS. THE CLIPPER START PILOT IS ONE OF M.T.C.'S  
23 MEANS TEST PROGRAMS TO PROVIDE INCREASE AFFORDABILITY FOR  
24 THOSE EARNING A LOW INCOME. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TODAY'S UPDATE  
25 WILL FOCUS ON EVOLVING AND GROWING THE PILOT PROGRAM PHASE 3





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 AND ON THE SLIDE, THE FAR RIGHT, GREEN BOX. WE STARTED WITH  
2 PHASE 1, FAR LEFT, IN GETTING THE MEANS-BASED TRANSIT DISCOUNT  
3 FROM CONCEPT TO REALITY. COMPLETED PHASE 2 AND LAST SUMMER,  
4 STAFF PRESENTED KEY FINDINGS, PROPOSED AN EXTENSION OF CLIPPER  
5 START TO JUNE 30, 2025, AND INTRODUCED LOW-HANGING FRUIT  
6 STRATEGIES TO BE IMPLEMENTED IMMEDIATELY AND TO FURTHER  
7 EXPLORE TO INCREASE CLIPPER START PARTICIPATION. SINCE THEN IN  
8 PHASE 3, WE ARE FOCUSED ON INCREASING RIDER, NEW RIDER  
9 PARTICIPATION, BY PROVIDING A CONSISTENT 50% TRANSIT DISCOUNT,  
10 GETTING 100% TRANSIT OPERATOR PARTICIPATION WITH TRANSIT  
11 AGENCIES THAT ARE USING CLIPPER, CONTINUING TARGETED  
12 MARKETING, OUTREACH, AND PROCESS IMPROVEMENTS. AND LASTLY,  
13 REMOVING ADDITIONAL BARRIERS WHETHER IT'S LOGISTICAL,  
14 ADMINISTRATIVE, STRUCTURAL, COMMUNICATIONS TO PARTICIPATION  
15 THAT IS CURRENTLY UNDER WAY. IN A NUTSHELL, THE PROGRAM AND  
16 ITS MANAGEMENT APPROACH ARE CONTINUOUSLY EVOLVING TO BE MORE  
17 CUSTOMER, HUMAN-ORIENTED IN ORDER TO OPERATIONALIZE M.T.C.'S  
18 EQUITY PLATFORM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THIS SNAPSHOT IN TIME  
19 FOR CLIPPER START, WE'RE ACTIVATION THE FOLLOWING PILLARS OF  
20 M.T.C.'S EQUITY PLATFORM. DEFINE AND MEASURE BY RE-  
21 ESTABLISHING GOALS AND METRICS TO EVOLVE AND GROW THE PROGRAM.  
22 LISTEN AND LEARN, CO-CREATING AND APPLYING FEEDBACK WE HEARD  
23 FROM THIS GROUP AND STAKEHOLDERS FOR PHASE 3. CONTINUING TO  
24 FOCUS AND DELIVER IN IMPLEMENTING THE PROGRAM. AND LASTLY,  
25 TRAIN AND GROW BY UTILIZING THE RESULTS FROM THE EVALUATION TO





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 IMPROVE POLICY AND PROGRAMS BEING CURRENTLY IMPLEMENTED  
2 THROUGH PHASE 3 ASSESSMENT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS A REMINDER,  
3 THE CLIPPER START GOALS ARE ON THE LEFT APPROVED IN 2018 VIA  
4 RESOLUTION 4320 TO MAKE TRANSIT AFFORDABLE FOR THOSE LOW  
5 INCOME, MOVE TOWARDS A REGIONAL, CONSISTENT STANDARD FOR FARE  
6 DISCOUNTS. ON THE RIGHT ARE THE IMPLEMENTS OF THE FRAMEWORK TO  
7 EXTEND THE PILOT TO JUNE, 2025. M.T.C. AND THE TRANSIT  
8 AGENCIES BOTH SUBSIDIZE A DISCOUNT. PEOPLE USE THE CLIPPER  
9 CARD TO RIDE AND RECEIVE DISCOUNTS OFF SINGLE RIDE FARES. THE  
10 PILOT IS OPEN TO PEOPLE AGED 19 TO 64 WHOSE INCOME IS AT 200%  
11 LEVEL. FOR A HOUSEHOLD SIZE OF ONE IS UP TO 29-K BEFORE TAXES.  
12 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS INFO GRAPHIC HIGHLIGHTS SOME OF THE  
13 CUSTOMER STATISTICS TO DATE FOR CLIPPER START THROUGH  
14 NOVEMBER, 2023. YEAR THREE SHOWS A TOTAL OF 29,000  
15 APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED AND ENROLLED 25,000 PEOPLE. REFLECTING  
16 PLUS 97% GROWTH COMPARED TO THE FIRST TWO YEARS OF THE  
17 PANDEMIC. NEARLY 18,000 ARE ACTIVELY USING THE PROGRAM. WHERE  
18 WE HAVE SEEN THE BIGGEST GROWTH IN THE NUMBER OF TRIPS TAKEN  
19 IN TRANSFERS. PARTICIPANTS HAVE NOW TAKEN A TOTAL OF 2.8  
20 MILLION TRIPS USING CLIPPER START. LIKEWISE, PARTICIPANTS  
21 TRANSFERRED FROM ONE VEHICLE TO ANOTHER, 582,000 TIMES. THESE  
22 STATISTICS REINFORCE THE TREND THAT CLIPPER START  
23 PARTICIPATION AND RIDERSHIP IS STEADILY GROWING, BENEFITTING  
24 INDIVIDUALS EARNING A LOW INCOME TO GET TO WORK AND WHERE THEY  
25 NEED TO GO. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE CONTINUE TO GROW THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 PROGRAM. WHAT IS NEW IN 2024 IS THAT SANTA CLARA VALLEY  
2 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY IS A PARTICIPATING TRANSIT AUTHORITY  
3 OFFERING THE 50% DISCOUNT. NOW ALL CLIPPER TRANSIT AGENCIES IN  
4 THE REGION OFFER CLIPPER START DISCOUNTS. ANOTHER NEW  
5 DEVELOPMENT IN 2024 IS THE CONSISTENT REGION-WIDE 50%  
6 DISCOUNT, A SIGNIFICANT INCREASE FOR MANY AGENCIES. SINCE  
7 JANUARY, 2024, THERE'S BEEN A SPIKE WITH APPROXIMATELY 30,000  
8 PEOPLE ENROLLED TO DATE COMPARED TO 25,000 IN NOVEMBER, 2023.  
9 WE PLAN TO CONTINUE EXISTING MARKETING OUTREACH EFFORTS WHERE  
10 WE HAVE TARGETED LOW-INCOME, EQUITY-PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND  
11 PRODUCE MATERIALS AND ADVERTISING IN MULTIPLE LANGUAGES. NEXT  
12 SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THE FIRST QUARTER OF THE FISCAL YEAR, AN  
13 ASSESSMENT OF MARKETING OUTREACH WAS CONDUCTED USING FOCUS  
14 GROUPS. A SURVEY AND INTERVIEWS WITH SOCIAL SERVICE AND  
15 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION STAFF. THE RESULTS REINFORCED  
16 MARKETING TACTICS LAST SPRING THAT INCLUDED BOOSTING  
17 RECOMMENDATION OF THE 50% REGION-WIDE DISCOUNT AND PROMOTING A  
18 LARGE Q.R. CODE TAKING PEOPLE TO THE PILOT WEBSITE. TRANSIT  
19 OPERATORS ARE SUPPORTING THREE AGENCIES EVEN PAYING FOR THEIR  
20 OWN ADVERTISING EFFORTS AND ALL AGENCIES PROMOTING THE PROGRAM  
21 THROUGH THEIR COMMUNICATION CHANNELS. ANOTHER RECOMMENDATION  
22 WAS TO CONTRACT WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO PROMOTE  
23 THE PROGRAM. STAFF WORKED WITH ROOTS COMMUNITY HEALTH CENTER  
24 LAST FISCAL YEAR ON A PILOT BASIS AND THIS YEAR STAFF WAS  
25 CONTRACTING WITH AT LEAST 10 ADDITIONAL COMMUNITY





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ORGANIZATIONS. STAFF ARE ALSO OPEN TO NEW IDEAS AND RESOURCES  
2 SUCH AS VIDEOS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. NOW SWITCHING GEARS TO THE  
3 NEAR TERM AND CONTINUED IMPROVEMENT OF THE PROGRAM. IN KEEPING  
4 THE CUSTOMER AT THE CENTER OF THE WORK, WE ARE NOT ONLY  
5 IMPLEMENTING LOW-HANGING FRUIT STRATEGIES TO INCREASE  
6 AWARENESS LIKE IMMEDIATE CHANGES IN MARKETING OUTREACH BUT  
7 ALSO EXPLORING CUSTOMER FOCUSED STRATEGIES TO BREAK DOWN  
8 DIFFICULT BARRIERS TO ACCESS WHICH ARE COMPLEX, MULTI-  
9 DIMENSIONAL, OPERATIONAL AND POLICY-RELATED BARRIERS SPECIFIC  
10 TO CLIPPER START, AND RECOGNIZING THAT THESE BARRIERS ARE ALSO  
11 BEING EXPERIENCED BY OTHER M.T.C. MEANS-BASED POLICIES AND  
12 PROGRAMS SUCH AS EXPRESS LANE START. THESE POTENTIAL  
13 STRATEGIES BEING EXPLORED TO CROSS-CUTTING CHALLENGES INCLUDE  
14 FURTHER REACHING ELIGIBLE RESIDENTS TO POTENTIALLY SOME FORM  
15 OF ADJUSTMENT WITH THE ENROLLMENT MODEL SUCH AS AUTO  
16 ENROLLMENT WITH CUSTOMER CONSENT, SELF-VERIFICATION AND/OR  
17 MARKETING TO PIVOT TO PUBLIC EDUCATION. ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD,  
18 WE HEARD FROM M.T.C. GROUPS, COMMISSIONERS, AND STAKEHOLDERS  
19 ABOUT BROADENING ACCESS TO CLIPPER START. ASSESSING A BROADER,  
20 TARGETED POLICY FOR PEOPLE TO BENEFIT FROM THE DISCOUNT. FARE  
21 POLICY -- MORE CONSISTENT AND AFFORDABLE FARE POLICY. AND  
22 LASTLY, ENGAGING USERS AND FUTURE USERS OF THE SYSTEM IN  
23 DESIGN, IMPLEMENTATION, AND EVALUATION. THESE CHALLENGES ARE  
24 BEING ADDRESSED HOLISTICALLY THROUGH OTHER INTERRELATED  
25 INITIATIVES SUCH AS SURVEY RESULTS TO UNDERSTAND THE BEHAVIOR





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 OF USERS, FUTURE USERS, AND TO GET INFORMATION FROM BAY AREA  
2 HOUSEHOLDS EVERY OTHER YEAR. AND A TECHNOLOGY SOLUTION TO  
3 STREAMLINE THE APPLICATION EXPERIENCE BY PROVIDING A ONE-STOP-  
4 SHOP EXPERIENCE FOR M.T.C.'S TRANSPORTATION BENEFIT ENROLLMENT  
5 RELATED ACTIVITIES. AND LASTLY, TECHNICAL ANALYSIS BEING  
6 LAUNCHED LAST JANUARY AND COMPLETED -- AND TO BE COMPLETED  
7 SUMMER, 2024, TO ASSESS VARIOUS ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLDS AND  
8 ENROLLMENT MODELS TO FURTHER REACH ELIGIBLE RESIDENTS. NEXT  
9 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WHAT IS THIS TECHNICAL ANALYSIS AND WHY IS  
10 IT NEEDED? THE GOAL IS TO BUILD UNDERSTANDING OF THE VARIOUS  
11 OPTIONS AND IMPACT SPECIFICALLY TO CLIP START AND HOW WHERE  
12 AND OTHER ALIGN TO AUTO ENROLLMENT WITH CUSTOMER CONSENT,  
13 SELF-VERIFICATION AND ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD MODELS. WHY DO  
14 THIS? BECAUSE THERE IS A BROAD RANGE OF OPTIONS FOR POTENTIAL  
15 STRATEGIES BEING EXPLORED AND FOR EACH, AS NOTED ON THE LEFT  
16 IN BLUE, HOW WILL THE STRATEGY IMPACT EASE FOR CUSTOMER USE  
17 AND PARTICIPATION RATE, WILL THE STRATEGY MAKE IT EASIER FOR  
18 ELIGIBLE PEOPLE TO HAVE ACCESS TO THE BENEFIT RESULTING IN THE  
19 CUSTOMER USING TRANSIT? WHAT THE REGULATORY AND LEGAL  
20 CHALLENGES AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DECISION-MAKING WITHIN  
21 M.T.C. AUTHORITY? AND ATTACHMENT B TO YOUR PACKET PROVIDES  
22 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND PRELIMINARY ASSUMPTIONS OF CONCEPTS  
23 BEING EXPLORED. IN ADDITION, THERE ARE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS  
24 BEING ASSESSED FOR EACH STRATEGY. AUTO ENROLLMENT WITH  
25 CUSTOMER CONSENT MEANS ENROLLEES IN PARTNER PROGRAMS ARE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ENROLLED INTO CLIPPER START. WE HEARD FROM FOCUS GROUPS THIS  
2 WILL MAKE IT EASIER BUT HOW WILL WE INCORPORATE CHOICE AND  
3 WHAT LEVEL COULD AUTO ENROLLMENT BE FEASIBLY BE DONE? PERHAPS  
4 A COMBINATION. FOR SELF-VERIFICATION, THIS MEANS VERIFYING  
5 ELIGIBILITY DONE IN DIFFERENT WAYS WITH THE OBJECTIVE TO  
6 SIMPLIFY THE ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION PROCESS. OPTIONS INCLUDE  
7 -- EXPANDED AUTOMATION VERIFICATION. FOR EXAMPLE, PARTNERING  
8 WITH A STATE GOVERNMENT INITIATIVE LIKE CAL INTEGRATED TRAVEL  
9 PROJECT, SUPPORTED BY CALIFORNIA STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY  
10 AND CALTRANS. PEER VERIFICATION WHERE THE ELIGIBILITY WILL BE  
11 VOUCHERED FOR BY A COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION. SUCH AS SAN  
12 MATEO 101 EXPRESS LANE, NONPROFITS AND COMMUNITY-BASED  
13 ORGANIZATIONS. AND LASTLY OPEN SELF-VERIFICATION WHERE  
14 APPLICANTS SELF-DECLARE ON THE APPLICATION THAT THEIR INCOME  
15 FALLS BELOW THE ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD. AND THEN FOR  
16 ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD, WHAT SHOULD BE THE ELIGIBILITY  
17 THRESHOLD BE TO PARTICIPATE IN THESE BENEFITS? WHAT IS THE  
18 INCOME LEVEL AMOUNT ADJUSTMENT? AND WHAT SHOULD BE THE  
19 ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD DEFINITION BE? WE'RE CURRENTLY USE THE  
20 FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL AT OR BELOW 200%. SHOULD IT BE DEFINED  
21 AT ANOTHER LEVEL SUCH AS AREA MEDIAN INCOME AND WILL THAT BE  
22 AT THE COUNTY LEVEL, REGIONAL LEVEL? THESE QUESTIONS WILL BE  
23 ASSESSED AND THE TECHNICAL ANALYSIS COMPLETED BY SUMMER OF  
24 THIS YEAR AND STAFF WILL COME BACK AND REPORT DRAFT FINDINGS.  
25 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. NEXT IS CUSTOMER STATISTICS WITH THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ADDITIONAL OF V.T.A. THAT STARTED ON JANUARY 1. CONTINUOUS  
2 IMPROVEMENTS IN MARKETING OUTREACH EFFORTS AND FOR CROSS-  
3 AGENCY STAFF TO CONDUCT INTERRELATED INITIATIVES LIKE THE  
4 SURVEY AND TECHNICAL ANALYSIS TO INFORM POTENTIAL CLIPPER  
5 START ENHANCEMENTS. AND THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION. WE'LL  
6 BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS YOU MAY HAVE.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS UPDATE.  
9 WE'LL TAKE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS FROM THIS BODY STARTING FROM  
10 THE OTHER END NOW WITH DYLAN.

11

12 **DYLAN FABRIS:** THANK YOU. AND FIRST OF ALL, CONGRATULATIONS ON  
13 THOSE NUMBERS. IT'S GREAT SEEING THE UPTICK AND PEOPLE  
14 ADOPTING IN THE MOST RECENT YEAR. AND I HAD SOME QUESTIONS,  
15 ACTUALLY, AROUND AUTO ENROLLMENT AND POVERTY LEVEL. I'M GLAD  
16 YOU'RE TAKING THAT INTO CONSIDERATION AS WELL. I THINK  
17 SOMETHING THAT I'VE HEARD ABOUT SOME OF THESE DISCOUNT  
18 PROGRAMS, 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL ISN'T ENOUGH HERE  
19 IN THE BAY AREA. SO DEFINITELY SUPPORT THAT -- YOU HAVE IT  
20 LISTED I THINK AS C-2, CHANGE TO THE AREA MEDIAN INCOME WHICH  
21 WOULD REFLECT THE ACTUAL SITUATION HERE. I THINK IT JUST MAKES  
22 SENSE FOR BAY AREA PROGRAM TO BE TIED TO BAY AREA COST OF  
23 LIVING AND NOT THE FEDERAL ONES. AND ALSO I LOVE TO SEE YOU  
24 MOVING FORWARD ON THE AUTO ENROLLMENT WITH PROGRAMS LIKE CAL  
25 FRESH AND E.B.T. I THINK THAT'S ANOTHER THING THAT I'VE HEARD,





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, PEOPLE DON'T WANT TO BE APPLYING TO MULTIPLE  
2 PROGRAMS. IT'S SO MUCH EASIER. IT INCREASES UPTICK IF WE CAN  
3 AUTOMATE THAT. SO GLAD TO SEE BOTH OF THOSE ARE MOVING FORWARD  
4 AND LOOKING FORWARD TO MORE UPDATES THERE. I THINK ONE  
5 QUESTION THAT I DO HAVE -- I KNOW THIS IS A PILOT PROGRAM. SO  
6 I'M CURIOUS WHAT THE NEXT STEPS ARE IN TERMS OF MAKING THIS  
7 PERMANENT. IT SEEMS LIKE IT'S BEING SUCCESSFUL. IT SEEMS LIKE  
8 IT'S BEEN SUCCESSFUL. HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THIS DOES BECOME A  
9 PERMANENT PROGRAM AND CAN MOVE FORWARD BEYOND THE PILOT PHASE?

10

11 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SO JUDIS SANTOS, M.T.C. STAFF. SO IT'S BEEN IN  
12 THE PILOT SPACE FOR THREE YEARS. THIS WAS ACTUALLY THE ROAD TO  
13 PERM NANCY SO WE UNDERSTAND THAT THERE ARE CHALLENGES AND  
14 BARRIERS TO BE ADDRESSED. SO THIS IS THE ROAD TO PERM NANCY IN  
15 ORDER TO GET IT PERMANENT. WE'D LIKE TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE  
16 BARRIERS BEFORE A PERMANENT FRAMEWORK IS ADOPTED.

17

18 **DYLAN FABRIS:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GERRY, GO AHEAD.

21

22 **GERRY GLASER:** REINFORCING, DETERMINING ELIGIBILITY BASED ON  
23 OUR INCOMES HERE. IT MAKES A LOT MORE SENSE HAVING TRAVELED  
24 AROUND THE COUNTRY, WE ARE IN A WHOLE DIFFERENT WORLD.

25





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** TERRY.

2

3 **TERRY SCOTT:** I HAVE A QUESTION REGARDING WHAT CONSTITUTES  
4 INCOME? I'M REPRESENTING THE SENIOR COMMUNITY IN NAPA, AND IS  
5 THIS A COMBINATION OF SOCIAL SECURITY, PENSIONS, ANY  
6 ADDITIONAL INCOME, PEOPLE THAT ARE WORKING PART TIME, ETC.?  
7 AND HOW IS THAT -- HOW IS THAT DETERMINED? AND HOW CAN IT BE  
8 REPORTED?

9

10 **JUDIS SANTOS:** I'LL HAVE LISA HALE TO ADDRESS THAT.

11

12 **LISA HALE:** LISA HALE FOR M.T.C. STAFF. IT IS BASICALLY WHAT  
13 YOU WOULD REPORT ON YOUR TAX RETURN.

14

15 **TERRY SCOTT:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SEBASTIAN.

18

19 **SEBASTIAN PETTY::** IT'S ENCOURAGING TO SEE THE GROWTH IN  
20 NUMBERS. I GUESS THE QUESTION I HAVE IS YOU'RE LOOKING TOWARDS  
21 MOVING THIS PROGRAM TO PERM NANCY. DO YOU HAVE A TARGET SIZE  
22 FOR THE MARKET OF CUSTOMERS YOU WOULD ANTICIPATE WOULD BE  
23 COVERED BY THIS PROGRAM IN THE FUTURE?

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SO WE ARE LOOKING AT THE ELIGIBILITY MARKET AS  
2 WELL AS THE TARGETED MARKET. MEANING, USERS OF THE SYSTEM AND  
3 NONUSERS. WE ALSO AS PART OF THE TECHNICAL ANALYSIS WE ARE  
4 REVISITING THE METHODOLOGY AS WELL AS THOSE NUMBERS AS FAR AS  
5 WHAT THE ELIGIBLE POPULATION WOULD INCLUDE.

6

7 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** OKAY. I THINK IN FUTURE PRESENTATIONS HELPFUL  
8 TO SEE THAT JUST BECAUSE, AGAIN, IT'S GOOD TO SEE THE GROWTH  
9 IN THE NUMBERS BUT THEY'RE A LITTLE -- IT WOULD BE GOOD TO SEE  
10 THOSE NUMBERS RELATIVE TO CONTEXT IN TERMS OF BOTH THE SCALE  
11 OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM OVERALL AS WELL AS WHAT THE MARKET MIGHT  
12 LOOK LIKE. WITHIN THAT CONTEXT, IT WOULD ALSO BE GOOD TO  
13 UNDERSTAND THE BARRIERS OF REACHING THAT TARGET, IF IT'S A  
14 FUNDING BARRIER, M.T.C. TO SCALE CAPACITY TO ADMINISTER THE  
15 PROGRAM. AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IAN.

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** I JUST HAVE A QUESTION. WHAT IS -- FROM THE  
20 RESULTS TO DATE, IS THERE AN ESTIMATE OF WHAT THE IMPACT ON  
21 RIDERSHIP IS OF PEOPLE HAVING ACCESS TO CLIPPER START OVER,  
22 YOU KNOW, NOT HAVING ACCESS TO IT?

23

24 **JUDIS SANTOS:** SO WE HAVE SPECIFIC NUMBERS AS FAR AS RIDERSHIP  
25 BY TRANSIT AGENCY AND DEMOGRAPHICS, IS THAT YOUR QUESTION?





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** MY QUESTION IS WITH REGARD TO IF A LOW-INCOME  
3 PERSON IS ELIGIBLE FOR THIS PROGRAM, LIKE PRIOR TO HAVING  
4 ACCESS TO THIS DISCOUNT, HOW MUCH ARE THEY USING TRANSIT? AND  
5 ONCE THEY HAVE ACCESS TO THIS DISCOUNT, ARE THEY USING TRANSIT  
6 MORE OR ARE THEY SAVING MONEY? IS THERE IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP? I  
7 MEAN, I AM NOT JUDGING -- THEY ARE BOTH VALUABLE THINGS.  
8 WHEREAS WE HAVE SOME PRETTY CLEAR DATA ON THE BAY PASS, THE  
9 NEXT PRESENTATION OF WHAT IS THE IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP? BUT I'M  
10 WONDERING WHAT IS THE SORT OF PARALLEL DATA FOR THE CLIPPER  
11 START PROGRAM?

12

13 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WE HAVE THAT INFORMATION AS WELL AS OUR TWO-YEAR  
14 EVALUATION. I DON'T HAVE THAT IN HAND CURRENTLY, BUT WE DO  
15 HAVE THAT INFORMATION, HOW IT'S POSITIVELY INCREASING  
16 RIDERSHIP FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS AS WELL AS FOR INDIVIDUALS  
17 INCREASING TRIP MAKING AS WELL AS INCREASED AFFORDABILITY.

18

19 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** OKAY. I THINK THAT WOULD ALSO BE HELPFUL TO  
20 KNOW IN FUTURE PRESENTATIONS IN ORDER TO REALLY MAKE THE CASE  
21 FOR IT. YOU KNOW, I THINK PEOPLE SAVING MONEY IS A GREAT  
22 BENEFIT AND MAYBE THAT'S THE PRIMARY GOAL OF THIS BUT TO THE  
23 EXTENT THAT THERE IS ALSO DATA THAT SAYS THIS IS INCREASING  
24 RIDERSHIP, OBVIOUSLY, THAT'S ALSO VERY HIGH PRIORITY OF A LOT  
25 OF PEOPLE IN OUR REGION. SO HAVING THE DATA ON BOTH WOULD BE I





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 THINK THE MOST EFFECTIVE FOR MAKING THE CASE TO EXPAND IT.

2 THANKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** CAN I ALSO BE -- IF YOU HAVE IT ON HAND,

5 WOULD YOU BE ABLE TO SHARE IT IN WRITING?

6

7 **JUDIS SANTOS:** YES, BE ABLE TO SHARE THAT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS.

10

11 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I HAVE THE QUESTION ABOUT ELIGIBILITY. IS

12 THAT BASED ON BAY AREA MEDIAN INCOME PER HOUSEHOLD SIZE?

13

14 **JUDIS SANTOS:** CURRENTLY IT'S BASED ON 200% OF THE FEDERAL

15 POVERTY LEVEL. FOR A FAMILY OF FOUR USING THE MOST RECENT

16 NUMBERS, THAT WOULD BE ABOUT \$60,000 A YEAR.

17

18 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** OKAY. AND THE REASON WHY I ASK THAT

19 QUESTION, I WORK IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND FOR A FAMILY OF

20 THREE, WE CONSIDER THAT LOW INCOME AT \$96,000 FOR THE BAY

21 AREA. SO I THINK LIKE THAT ELIGIBILITY STANDARD -- THRESHOLD,

22 MAYBE -- MAYBE WE CAN RECONSIDER IT?

23





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **LISA HALE:** THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE DOING. THAT'S WHAT JUDIS  
2 WAS TALKING ABOUT THAT WE WERE ASSESSING WHETHER OR NOT WE  
3 CALCULATE ELIGIBILITY.

4

5 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AND I WOULD SAY THAT IT SHOULD BE -- THIS IS  
6 MY SUGGESTION. BASED ON MEDIAN INCOME FOR THE BAY AREA'S  
7 HOUSEHOLD SIZE, NOT YOUR INCOME TAX BRACKET BUT YOUR HOUSEHOLD  
8 SIZE?

9

10 **LISA HALE:** IT IS BASED ON HOUSEHOLD SIZE.

11

12 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** BRIAN STANKE.

15

16 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU. I'D AGREE WITH MULTIPLE OF MY  
17 COLLEAGUES ON -- IT SEEMS TO MAKE A LOT OF SENSE SINCE THIS IS  
18 A BARRIER-FOCUSED PROGRAM, CHANGING THE ELIGIBILITY TO MEDIAN  
19 INCOME IN EITHER THE BAY AREA OR COUNTY BY COUNTY, DEPENDING  
20 ON THE IMPLEMENTABILITY OF EITHER OF THOSE. AND DEFINITELY A  
21 LOT OF INTEREST IN THE AUTO ENROLLMENT. SORT OF THE SIGNUP AND  
22 VERIFY ONCE AND NOT IN 15 DIFFERENT PROGRAMS. YOU KNOW, VERY  
23 GLAD TO SEE THIS PROJECT EXPANDING. I GUESS I'D LIKE TO -- IAN  
24 GRIFFITHS REQUEST ABOUT -- I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO  
25 REPORT OUT AND KIND OF ALL YOUR PRESENTATIONS THE IMPACT IT'S





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 HAVING ON RIDERSHIP FROM ENROLLEES. I MEAN, INCREASED MOBILITY  
2 CAN PROVIDE MORE ACCESS TO JOBS, MORE ACCESS TO SOCIAL  
3 OPPORTUNITIES. AND REALLY IS ONE OF THE -- THE ENROLLMENT IS  
4 GOOD METRIC BUT ALSO THE IMPACT IT'S HAVING ON THE ENROLLEES'  
5 MOBILITY. WE CAN SEE THAT THROUGH THE RIDERSHIP. AND AS WELL  
6 AS THE IMPACT ON THE RIDERSHIP AND REVENUE OF THE SYSTEM. IF  
7 MORE PEOPLE ARE USING IT, IT'S A MORE VALUABLE TO -- IT'S MORE  
8 VALUABLE TO THE BAY AREA. YEAH, THOSE ARE THE SORT OF TWO  
9 AREAS FOR MY COMMENT. AGAIN, LOOK FORWARD TO PRESENTATIONS AS  
10 M.T.C. BEGINS TO LOOK AT WHAT -- WHAT CHANGES AND SETUP TO  
11 MAKE WHEN IT'S TIME TO BRING THIS PROGRAM BACK AS NOT A PILOT  
12 BUT SOMETHING LONG TERM? IN THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, WE'RE  
13 ALREADY IN PROJECTS. WE'RE PURSUING -- ASSUMING THIS PROJECT  
14 THAT CLIPPER START BECOMES A PERMANENT PROGRAM THAT PEOPLE --  
15 THAT TRANSIT SERVICES NEED TO ENROLL IN, SO LOOK FORWARD TO  
16 THOSE DISCUSSIONS ON HOW TO MAKE THIS A PERMANENT PROJECT.  
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. ZACK.

20

21 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANKS, ADINA. WE DON'T KNOW THE  
22 ELIGIBILITY MARKET FOR THIS PROGRAM RIGHT NOW?

23

24 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THERE'S AN ELIGIBILITY POPULATION BUT THERE ARE  
25 TARGETED POPULATIONS LIKE RIDER, NONRIDER. SO THERE ARE VERY





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 DIFFERENT NUMBERS, COVID, PRE-COVID AND WHERE WE ARE NOW. SO  
2 WE'RE ASSESSING THE METHODOLOGY FROM THOSE -- IN THOSE VARIOUS  
3 STAGES. AND COMING BACK IN THE SUMMER TO VALIDATE THAT  
4 METHODOLOGY IN MOVING FORWARD.

5

6 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YEAH. THANK YOU. I UNDERSTAND IT'S  
7 COMPLEX. IT'S NOT LIKE SOME BACK OF THE ENVELOPE NUMBERS. I'D  
8 LIKE TO ECHO SEBASTIAN'S POINT. IT'S IMPORTANT TO KNOW 100%  
9 GROWTH IS GREAT BUT FROM WHAT. AND ARE WE ACTUALLY EFFECTIVELY  
10 REACHING PEOPLE? ARE WE JUST REACHING LIKE THE EASIEST PEOPLE  
11 TO REACH? EVEN WITHIN THAT CATEGORY? AND SO I THINK THAT'S  
12 ALSO IMPORTANT BECAUSE WE WANT TO REACH MORE PEOPLE, RIGHT? IF  
13 THIS IS A PILOT WE NEED TO KNOW, LIKE, HOW MUCH MONEY IT'S  
14 GOING TO TAKE TO TRULY REACH 50%, 100% OF THE TARGET  
15 POPULATION? SO THAT FEELS LIKE A PRETTY STRONG PRIORITY FOR ME  
16 TO, LIKE -- TO PRIORITIZE WITHIN THE PILOT AND HAVE OUTCOMES  
17 COMING OUT. IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU'RE WORKING ON BUT WANT TO  
18 EMPHASIZE THAT. THE OTHER THING WE'RE TALKING ABOUT AUTO  
19 ENROLLMENT, I'M A LITTLE STUCK ON WHY ARE WE EVEN STUDYING  
20 THIS? IT FEELS LIKE SUCH A FUNDAMENTAL PIECE. WHY ARE WE  
21 STUDYING IT KIND OF TO ME IMPOSES WHY ARE WE EVEN THINKING IT  
22 WOULD BE HARDER FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE TO SET UP? IT IS  
23 FUNDAMENTAL TO THE ETHOS OF THE PROGRAM TO SUPPORT AUTO  
24 ENROLLMENT. SO, LIKE, TO PUT A THORN ON YOUR SIDE. I FEEL LIKE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 WE SHOULD DO THIS AS PART OF THE PILOT. WE SHOULDN'T BE  
2 STUDYING IT. WE SHOULD IMPLEMENT IT AND SEE HOW IT PERFORMS.

3

4 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU FOR THINKING THAT UP. ON THE LIST  
5 THERE ARE VARIOUS FACTORS THAT NEED TO BE ASSESSED. PRIMARILY,  
6 HOW DO WE DO THIS WITH CUSTOMER CONSENT? BECAUSE YOU KNOW, I  
7 THINK AUTO ENROLLMENT COULD BE EASILY MISINTERPRETED BECAUSE  
8 IN WHAT WE DO WE NEED TO -- WE NEED TO REQUIRE THAT A CUSTOMER  
9 CONSENTS TO WHATEVER THEY'RE BEING SIGNED UP FOR. THERE'S NOT  
10 ONLY THAT BUT ALSO, HOW IS THIS GOING TO -- WHAT ARE THE  
11 REGULATORY CHALLENGES? WHAT ARE THE LEGAL CHALLENGES? WHAT ARE  
12 THE ADMINISTRATIVE CHALLENGES? SO THERE ARE A NUMBER OF  
13 FACTORS TO BE ASSESSED? AND THERE'S ALSO A BROAD EXPECT  
14 PETROLEUM OF HOW DO WE -- HOW DO WE DO THAT? DO WE PARTNER AT  
15 THE FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL LEVEL? IS THERE CROSS-AGENCY, YOU  
16 KNOW, AUTO ENROLLMENT SO THERE ARE VARIOUS WAYS TO DO THAT.

17

18 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** IT'S HOW FOR AUTO ENROLLMENT?

19

20 **JUDIS SANTOS:** ONE OF THE REASON WE ARE DOING THE TECHNICAL  
21 ANALYSIS, WE WANT TO INFORM THIS GROUP AS WELL AS OUR  
22 COMMISSION ON THE VARIOUS FACTORS AND TO FULLY KNOW WHAT WE'RE  
23 GETTING INTO IT IF WE'RE GETTING INTO IT.

24

25 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** THANK YOU.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. WENDI. >WENDI KALLINS: CAN YOU  
3 HAVE A MAGNIFYING GLASS FOR THIS PAGE? JUST ASKING. YEAH, I  
4 THINK THAT THE AUTO ENROLLMENT IS DEFINITELY ESSENTIAL. SO IS  
5 SELF-VERIFICATION. I THINK ONE OF THE BARRIERS TO PEOPLE  
6 SIGNING UP FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS IS THE HAVING TO PRODUCE  
7 THE DOCUMENTS THEMSELVES, ESPECIALLY IF THEY'RE NOT  
8 TECHNICALLY ADVANCED IN ANY WAY, SHAPE, OR FORM, IT'S A LOT OF  
9 WORK. I KNOW I HAD TO DO THINGS LIKE THAT. JUST KNOWING HOW TO  
10 SCAN SOMETHING AND UPLOAD IT IS DIFFICULT. SO I DO HOPE THAT  
11 THE SELF-VERIFICATION WILL WORK OUT. I UNDERSTAND YOU HAVE TO  
12 HAVE SOME OUTSIDE AGENCY HELPING YOU SO THERE ARE SOME COSTS  
13 TO THAT. JUST -- I DON'T KNOW IF IT'S AN ADD-ON OR ADJUNCT TO  
14 WHAT IAN WAS SAYING. I THINK YOU MENTIONED YOU KNOW HOW MANY  
15 PEOPLE HAD NOT USED TRANSIT BEFORE AND HOW MANY HAD, HOW MANY  
16 WERE NONRIDERS BEFORE THEY STARTED THE PROGRAM, DO YOU HAVE  
17 THAT INFORMATION? OR DO YOU HAVE THAT INFORMATION? IN OTHER  
18 WORDS, HAD THEY NEVER -- THEY ENROLLED IN THE PROGRAM, THEY  
19 NEVER USED TRANSIT BEFORE, THIS IS THE FIRST TIME THEY STARTED  
20 USING TRANSIT?

21

22 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WE HAVE INFORMATION IF THEY ARE NEW CLIPPER  
23 RIDERS. >WENDI KALLINS: RIGHT. YOU DON'T KNOW IF THEY EVER  
24 USED TRANSIT BEFORE. WHAT I'M ASKING, I WANT TO KNOW IF THIS  
25 CREATES NEW RIDERS WHO HAD NEVER USED TRANSIT BEFORE, I THINK





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 THAT WOULD BE VALUABLE INFORMATION. SO THAT'S AN ADJUNCT TO  
2 WHAT IAN WAS ASKING.

3

4 **JUDIS SANTOS:** WHEN WE REACHED OUT TO THE CLIPPER STAR PREVIOUS  
5 USERS, THAT IS IN OUR INFORMATION FOR JUST THE FIRST TWO  
6 YEARS. >WENDI KALLINS: THAT WAS FOR THE FOCUS GROUP, FOUGHT  
7 NOR EVERYBODY THAT SIGNED UP?

8

9 **JUDIS SANTOS:** I BELIEVE NOT FOR EVERYONE THAT SIGNED UP BUT  
10 FOR FOCUS GROUPS, YES. UNLESS I'M -- >WENDI KALLINS: IF YOU  
11 ASK THE QUESTION, HAVE YOU EVER USED TRANSIT BEFORE?

12

13 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING WE COULD POTENTIALLY  
14 INCLUDE IN THE APPLICATION FOR PEOPLE TO POTENTIALLY FILL OUT.  
15 >WENDI KALLINS: YEAH. I THINK IT WOULD BE VALUABLE. IT WOULD  
16 SHOW YOU'RE INCREASING RIDERSHIP -- ANOTHER WAY YOU'RE SHOWING  
17 INCREASE IN RIDERSHIP.

18

19 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. AND HEATHER.

20

21 **HILLARY BROWN:** IT'S HILARY.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** MY BRAIN IS CONFUSING. SORRY, HILARY.

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **HILLARY BROWN:** I HEARD ABOUT THIS PROGRAM LIKE FOR THE PAST  
2 FEW MONTHS. I BELIEVE THAT PEOPLE USE THEIR PHONES TO SCAN IT  
3 AROUND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MY UNDERSTANDING ON ELIGIBILITY,  
4 BECAUSE THERE'S A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE SENIORS WHO RECEIVE  
5 SSDI AND S.S.I., THEY CAN PROVIDE DOCUMENTS IF THEY FIT THE  
6 DESCRIPTION. THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING IT'S ALSO ON WEBSITE.  
7 ALSO, IT COMES TO STUDENTS WHO LIVE IN THE REGION MOST LIKELY  
8 DO NOT WORK FULL TIME IF THERE ARE STUDENTS LIKE, FOR EXAMPLE,  
9 S.F. STATE OR CAL -- I MEAN, EAST BAY, MOST LIKELY THEY'RE NOT  
10 WORKING FULL TIME. SO THEY MAY HAVE ELIGIBILITY TO PARTICIPATE  
11 IN THIS PROGRAM IF A LOT OF US OUTREACH TO THEM. IN ADDITION  
12 TO THAT, MEDICARE AND CAL FRESH, IF THEY HAVE THOSE DOCUMENTS,  
13 MY UNDERSTANDING IT'S ON THE WEBSITE THAT THEY MIGHT BE  
14 ELIGIBLE. THAT'S ALL I WANT TO SAY ABOUT THAT ITEM.

15

16 **JUDIS SANTOS:** THANK YOU. LISA, DID YOU WANT TO SAY ANYTHING  
17 ABOUT COLLEGE OUTREACH?

18

19 **LISA HALE:** YES. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THAT UP ABOUT THE  
20 COLLEGES. WE ACTUALLY ARE ACTIVELY WORKING WITH A NUMBER OF  
21 COMMUNITY COLLEGES TO HELP THEM REACH THEIR STUDENTS AND  
22 WE'RE, IN FACT, EMPLOYING STUDENTS FROM SOME OF THE COLLEGES  
23 TO DO OUTREACH WITHIN THEIR OWN COMMUNITIES. SO WE RECOGNIZE  
24 THAT STUDENTS ARE A HUGE OPPORTUNITY FOR THIS PROGRAM AND  
25 THAT'S WHY WE'RE WORKING ON THAT.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **HILLARY BROWN:** I'M FOR THAT.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** MEMBER ELDRED HAS HER HAND RAISED.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ANNE OLIVIA.

7

8 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO TAG ON SOMETHING TO  
9 THE DISCUSSION OF OPTING IN. AND WHEN YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE  
10 TECHNICAL FEASIBILITY, IF YOU COULD TAKE A LOOK AT THE ABILITY  
11 FOR PEOPLE TO OPT OUT AS OPPOSED TO HAVING TO OPT IN, IT'S ONE  
12 OF THE METHODS THAT HAS PROVEN REALLY SUCCESSFUL. WE KNOW THAT  
13 WHEN PEOPLE HAVE TO OPT INTO A PROGRAM, MAJORITY -- EVEN THE  
14 VAST MAJORITY OF PEOPLE WHO QUALIFY DON'T EVER ENROLL. EITHER  
15 THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND OR THERE'S SOME EMBARRASSMENT OR  
16 WHATEVER IT IS. BUT IF PEOPLE, INSTEAD, ARE GIVEN THE  
17 OPPORTUNITY TO OPT OUT, THAT CAN LOWER BARRIERS FAIRLY  
18 SIGNIFICANTLY AND HAVE A HIGHER UTILIZATION RATE. SO THAT'S  
19 MOSTLY WHAT I WANTED TO ADD. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. WARREN.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** GET A LITTLE CLOSER TO THE MIC.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** SO I DO HAVE A QUESTION FOR STAFF.  
3 AS I UNDERSTAND IT, THERE IS SOME MOVING PARTS TO THE R.T.C.  
4 DISCOUNT CARD FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. IS THAT SOMETHING  
5 STAFF WILL BE LOOKING AT? AND WHEN WILL STAFF BRING THAT BACK  
6 TO EITHER THIS BODY OR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL?

7

8 **MELANIE CHOY:** IN TERMS OF -- THROUGH THE CHAIR, MELANIE CHOY,  
9 M.T.C. STAFF. IN TERMS OF THE R.T.C. DISCOUNTS AND TALKING  
10 THROUGH R.T.C., THERE ARE OTHER VENUES. C.B. ALSO DISCUSSES  
11 R.T.C. DISCOUNTS. SO ONE OF THE THINGS, EQUITY AND ACCESS  
12 SUBCOMMITTEE, SO THERE ARE A NUMBER OF VENUES FOR THIS TO  
13 BRING IT TO INTO -- IT INTO THIS DISCUSSION AND GROUP, WE AS  
14 STAFF CAN DISCUSS WHAT MEETINGS TO BRING THAT TO. THERE ARE  
15 IMPROVEMENTS OR CHANGES BEING MADE IN THE R.T.C. PROGRAM. AND  
16 THOSE COULD BE BROUGHT BACK TO THIS GROUP. AND I BELIEVE AT AN  
17 UPCOMING E&A GROUP. LISA MAY ADD.

18

19 **LISA HALE:** WE ARE BRINGING THIS UP TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS  
20 MEETING. WE DO HAVE OUR MONTHLY CLIPPER MEETINGS, AS MELANIE  
21 SAID. AND THAT'S A PLACE TO SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH THE  
22 R.T.C. PROGRAM. ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE WORKING ON IS TRYING  
23 TO DEVELOP AN ONLINE APPLICATION PORTAL WHERE PEOPLE WILL BE  
24 ABLE TO GO ONLINE. RIGHT NOW EVERYTHING'S LIMITED TO PAPER.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 AND WE HAVE GOTTEN FEEDBACK THAT MAKES IT MORE DIFFICULT FOR  
2 SOME PEOPLE TO APPLY, SO WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS THAT NEED.

3

4 **MELANIE CHOY:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I HAVE BROADER COMMENTS ON  
5 THIS DISCUSSION. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT TO WEIGH IN ON YOUR  
6 COMMENTS FIRST.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. I WILL SAY A COUPLE OF THINGS  
9 QUICKLY THAT I DID HAPPEN TO NOTICE THAT THERE IS AN ITEM ON  
10 THE R.T.C. CART COMING TO CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD ON MONDAY.  
11 FOR EVERYBODY ON THIS BODY WHO MIGHT ALREADY KNOW, THAT'S THE  
12 CARD FOR DISABILITY ACCESS. YEAH. THAT IS ON THE C.B. AGENDA  
13 ON MONDAY. A COUPLE OF THINGS BUILDING ON WHAT PEOPLE HAVE  
14 SAID, I WANTED TO REALLY ECHO WHAT BRIAN STANKE AND IAN  
15 GRIFFITHS SAID IN TERMS OF HOW THIS IS ADDITIONALLY GIVING  
16 PEOPLE FINANCIAL RELIEF AND POTENTIALLY INCREASING MOBILITY  
17 FOR PEOPLE. IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT RIDERSHIP FOR TRANSIT  
18 AGENCIES. IT'S ABOUT MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE, THAT SOMEBODY CAN  
19 GET TO THEIR JOB OR SCHOOL OR VISIT THEIR GRANDPARENT OR  
20 GRANDCHILD, LIKE, THAT EXTRA MOBILITY IS A BIG BENEFIT OF THE  
21 PROGRAM. AND I WAS GLAD TO SEE THE MENTION OF CAL I.T.P. ON  
22 THE SLIDE GIVEN THAT THEY ARE -- THEY GAVE A PRESENTATION TO A  
23 STATEWIDE DISABILITY GROUP WITH COMMUNITY MEMBERS, AND AGENCY  
24 STAFF AND THEY SAID THAT THEY ARE WORKING ON TECHNICAL  
25 FEATURES THAT MAKE IT EASIER TO AUTO ENROLL AND GET ACCESS TO





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 BENEFITS. FOR EXAMPLE, FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE WHO ARE ALREADY  
2 ON A PROGRAM LIKE MEDICAL OR CAL FRESH, FOR SENIORS, THAT ARE  
3 WORKING AND LOOKING TO GET DISABILITY, AND I BELIEVE A STUDENT  
4 WORKING ALSO IN THE COMING YEAR. SO IF'S POSSIBLE TO MAKE USE  
5 WITH WHAT THEY HAVE DONE, THAT'S A POTENTIAL HELPFUL PATH  
6 THERE. IF IT IS POSSIBLE TO WORK WITH THEM, THAT HAS THE  
7 POTENTIAL TO HELP WITH SOMETHING ELSE THAT IS A -- IT'S ABOUT  
8 TO BE A FEATURE DEFICIT WITH CLIPPER START AND OUR OTHER  
9 DISCOUNT CATEGORY BECAUSE WHEN CLIPPER 2.0 COMES OUT, IT WILL  
10 BE POSSIBLE TO PAY WITH A CREDIT AND DEBIT CARD IN ADDITION TO  
11 PAYING WITH YOUR DEDICATED CLIPPER CARD. BUT FOR PEOPLE WHO  
12 WILL BE PAYING WITH CREDIT AND DEBIT CARD WITH THE OPEN  
13 PAYMENT FEATURE, THEY WILL NOT AT FIRST LAUNCH HAVE ACCESS TO  
14 THEIR DISCOUNTS, WHETHER IT'S A CLIPPER START INCOME DISCOUNT  
15 OR WHETHER IT'S A SENIOR, DISABILITY DISCOUNT. SO IF IT IS  
16 POSSIBLY TO TAKE ADVANTAGE -- POSSIBLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE AFTER  
17 THE INITIAL ROLLOUT OF CLIPPER. I AM NOT SUGGESTING ADDING ANY  
18 MORE FEATURES IN THE PROGRAM UNDER DEVELOPMENT. THAT COULD  
19 POTENTIALLY BE A WAY TO FIX THAT FUTURE DEFICIT WHICH WILL BE  
20 MORE APPARENT ONCE THAT ROLLS OUT. THAT WAS WHAT I WANTED TO  
21 SAY. SO ANY ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK FROM STAFF FROM WHAT PEOPLE  
22 HAVE BEEN SAYING WOULD BE WELCOME. AND THEN WE CAN MOVE TO THE  
23 NEXT SLIDE AND AFTER THAT. ALSO, WE WILL NEED YOU TO TAKE ANY  
24 PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WE HAVE. STAFF, DO YOU WANT TO SPEAK TO  
25 WHAT PEOPLE HAD TO SAY?





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR LEVIN. MELANIE CHOY, M.T.C.  
3 STAFF. WHAT I WANTED TO DO WAS SUMMARIZE SOME OF THE  
4 CONVERSATION HERE TODAY OR RESPOND TO SOME OF THE CONVERSATION  
5 HERE TODAY IN TERMS OF THIS PROGRAM. WE ARE VERY MUCH  
6 COMMITTED TO THE SUCCESS OF THIS PROGRAM AND AS JUDIS  
7 INDICATED, THIS ANALYSIS IS THE REASON WHY WE HAVE NOT MADE IT  
8 PERMANENT. WE REALLY WANT TO DIAL IN AND EVALUATE HOW TO MAKE  
9 THIS PROGRAM MORE SUCCESSFUL, HOW TO REACH OUT TO MORE OF THE  
10 RIDERS OUT THERE, THE TARGET AUDIENCES, AND WE -- WE RECOGNIZE  
11 WE NEED TO DO BETTER. AND SO THAT IS THE THREAD AND NATURE OF  
12 THIS ANALYSIS AND THE NATURE OF THE CATEGORIES WE HAVE EVEN  
13 HIGHLIGHTED IN TERMS OF EVALUATING. AND THAT HAS BEEN BASED ON  
14 THE FEEDBACK WE HAVE RECEIVED THROUGHOUT AND ON THE EVALUATION  
15 THAT WE DID AT THE TWO-YEAR MARK. WHILE WE DON'T HAVE THAT  
16 SPECIFIC NUMBER IN TERMS OF FUTURE TARGET AUDIENCES, WE KNOW  
17 IT'S A LOT MORE THAN WHAT THE UPTICK HAS BEEN TO DATE. SO WE  
18 ARE VERY MUCH LOOKING AT WAYS TO IMPROVE THAT. AND ANY IDEAS  
19 FROM THIS GROUP IN TERMS OF HOW TO REACH OUT TO THESE TARGET  
20 AUDIENCES IS WELCOME. THAT IS AN AREA THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO  
21 REALLY IMPROVE UPON AND STEP UP OUR EFFORTS ON. SO WE'RE HAPPY  
22 TO COME BACK TO THIS GROUP AND ENGAGE WITH ANY OF YOU IN THAT  
23 VAIN. A FEW THINGS THAT DID COME UP IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT AND  
24 DURING THE EVALUATION COMPONENTS ITSELF IS THIS QUESTION  
25 REGARDING AUTO ENROLL AND CERTAIN THINGS -- CERTAIN CONCEPTS





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 SEEM EASY, LOW HANGING FRUIT ITEMS. IT'S COMPLEX. THERE ARE  
2 TECHNICAL ASPECTS BEHIND THESE THINGS. AND I THINK THE OTHER  
3 IMPORTANT THING THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO STAND UP IS, THERE IS AN  
4 IMPORTANT FACTOR OF CUSTOMER CONSENT, AS JUDIS EMPHASIZED. AND  
5 THAT PRIVACY OF THE CUSTOMER IS AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT THAT WE  
6 WANT TO LOOK AT, NOT JUST FROM A -- SO WE ARE NOT LOOKING AT  
7 TECHNICAL ACIS, HOW MUCH WILL IT COST TO PUT THESE PROGRAMS IN  
8 PLACE? IT'S ALL SIDES OF THE ASPECT OF THE END USER AND  
9 THINKING THAT THROUGH BECAUSE WE -- WE HAVE ONE PERSPECTIVE.  
10 HOWEVER, THIS -- THE POPULATION, OUR TARGET AUDIENCE IS VERY  
11 BROAD. ALSO, THEIR PERSPECTIVES ARE DIVERSE. WE WANT TO MAKE  
12 SURE HOW THIS IS DESIGNED IT'S WITH THAT IN MIND AND ALSO  
13 FEASIBLE GIVEN OUR PURVIEW AS A PUBLIC AGENCY WITH PRIVACY  
14 LAWS. SO I WANTED TO DIAL THAT IN IN TERMS OF HIGHLIGHTING  
15 THAT THAT'S PART OF OUR ANALYSIS. WE WANT TO -- WE WANT TO DO  
16 IT RIGHT. AND THEN, THE LAST PIECE. MAYBE THAT'S THE  
17 HIGHLIGHTS I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE WE ARE  
18 COMMITTED. THE NEXT YEAR AND A HALF OR TWO YEARS, THIS  
19 EXTENSION PERIOD ON REALLY TRYING TO IMPROVE IT. AND OUR  
20 OUTREACH COMPONENT, WE ARE TRYING TO LOOK AT NEW WAYS TO REACH  
21 THE TARGET AUDIENCES. SO WE VERY MUCH WOULD APPRECIATE ANY  
22 FRESH IDEAS IN THAT SPACE THAT ANY OF YOU HAVE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY  
25 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES, THERE IS. THERE IS TWO PUBLIC  
3 SPEAKERS. ONE IS HERE IN THE ROOM. ALETA DUPREE, I AM GOING TO  
4 PUT THE TIMER UP FOR YOU.

5

6 **ALETA DUPREE:** OH, THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON. CHAIR ADINA  
7 LEVIN. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER FOR TEAM  
8 FOLDS. CLIPPER START IS VERY, VERY IMPORTANT. I WOULD LIKE TO  
9 SEE IT GO PERMANENT SOMEDAY. I THINK IT WILL HELP A LOT OF  
10 PEOPLE. I'M SURE IT ALREADY HAS. I ASK OF YOU TO MAKE SURE  
11 THAT AS IMPORTANT AS CLIPPER START IS, IF WE SEE ANYONE WHO  
12 QUALIFIES FOR R.T.C., WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THEY GET INTO  
13 R.T.C. ESPECIALLY IF AN AGENCY, SUCH AS BART, OFFERS A BETTER  
14 DISCOUNT. AND I WOULD ADMONISH YOU AS PEER LEADERS, IF YOU  
15 WILL, BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE I'M IN A PEER GROUP HERE, TO ENSURE  
16 THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT OFFER GREATER DISCOUNTS FOR R.T.C.  
17 THAN CLIPPER START DO NOT REDUCE THEIR R.T.C. DISCOUNTS AS A  
18 MEANS OF PAYING FOR CLIPPER START. I WANT CLIPPER START TO BE  
19 ADDITIONAL. THIS IS NOT ZERO SUM SO WE WANT TO GET AS MANY  
20 PEOPLE INTO CLIPPER START. WHAT DOES A NEW RIDER MEAN? I DON'T  
21 KNOW. IF YOU ASK ME, IN MY LIFE YEARS AGO WHEN I HAD A CAR,  
22 DID YOU EVER USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION? YEAH, I USED THE NEW  
23 YORK CITY SUBWAY SINCE 1970. AND WE CAN REDUCE FARE ON OPEN  
24 PAYMENT BECAUSE WHEN I WENT TO NEW YORK, I HAVE REDUCED FARE  
25 WITH NEW YORK CITY TRANSIT AND I USED OMNI ON SUBWAY WITH MY





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 VISA CARD AND GOT REDUCE FARE WITH THE FARE CAPPING. SO IT  
2 WORKS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CHRISTINE  
5 FITZGERALD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** ARE WE THERE NOW?

8

9 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES, THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, WALLY. I LIKE WHAT I'M  
12 HEARING SO FAR. IT'S REALLY A GOOD THING TO SEE THAT THERE IS  
13 NO WRONG TO APPLY TO THIS. THAT IS FANTASTIC. I'D LIKE TO  
14 REMIND PEOPLE THAT SELF-IDENTIFICATION IS FAR BETTER, FAR MORE  
15 CONDUCIVE TO HONORING THE INDIVIDUAL RATHER THAN THE MEDICAL  
16 MODEL. I DEFINITELY WANT TO PLUS THAT. AND I ALSO WANT TO  
17 REALLY EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE ON MAKING THIS PROCESS AS EASY  
18 AND SEAMLESS AS POSSIBLE SO THAT FOLKS CAN TAKE WHATEVER  
19 TRANSIT THEY ARE USING, R.T.C. OR THE CLIPPER CARD, AS THEY  
20 SEE FIT. NO WRONG DOER, ABILITY TO PAY, WHETHER OR NOT YOU  
21 HAVE A CREDIT CARD, AND SELF-IDENTIFICATION, ALL IMPORTANT TO  
22 THIS PROCESS. THANK YOU.

23





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS  
2 ONLINE. NO ONE IN THE ROOM, AND THERE WAS NOTHING IN WRITING  
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. SO SINCE THAT WAS AN  
6 INFORMATIONAL ITEM, I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE US ON TO AGENDA ITEM  
7 5-D ON THE FARE INTEGRATION UPDATES. WE'LL GET AN UPDATE ON  
8 THE PROGRESS ON THE CLIPPER BAYPASS PILOT AND THE REDUCE AND  
9 NO-COST TRANSFER POLICY.

10

11 **TERRENCE LEE:** THANK YOU, CHAIR LEVIN. CAN WE HAVE THE  
12 PRESENTATION SLIDES UP, PLEASE? ALL RIGHT. GOOD AFTERNOON,  
13 ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS. I'M TERRENCE LEE WITH M.T.C. STAFF. I  
14 WILL BE INTRODUCING AGENDA 5-B IN YOUR PACKET TODAY. THIS WILL  
15 BE AN INFORMATION ITEM AND I WILL PROVIDE UPDATE ON THE  
16 VARIOUS FARE INTEGRATION PILOTS, THE CLIPPER BAYPASS AND  
17 REDUCE OR NO-COST TRANSFER POLICY. NOTE I AM JOINED HERE TODAY  
18 BY MIKE EISEMAN. VIRTUALLY. AND HE WILL BE ABLE TO ADDRESS ANY  
19 QUESTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO AS PART OF THIS  
20 PRESENTATION, I'LL BE SHARING AN OVERVIEW OF WHERE WE'VE BEEN  
21 AND WHAT WE'VE DONE IN FARE INTEGRATION, WHERE WE ARE TODAY  
22 WITH TWO KEY POLICY INITIATIVES, AS WELL AS A PREVIEW OF  
23 WHAT'S TO COME IN THOSE AREAS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WITH  
24 REGARDS TO WHERE WE'VE BEEN, THIS MOST RECENT CHAPTER OF FARE  
25 INTEGRATION STARTED IN 2020 WITH THE LAUNCH OF THE FARE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY, OR FCIS. THE FARE  
2 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE COMPRISED OF EXECUTIVES FROM TRANSIT  
3 OPERATORS, WAS ESTABLISHED, GOVERNED, AND SET THE POLICY  
4 DIRECTION OF A TWO-YEAR-LONG STUDY THAT EVALUATE THE VARIOUS  
5 CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES RELATED TO FARE POLICY AND ITS  
6 IMPACT ON FOUR KEY ISSUES OR METRICS AND THESE ARE HOW FARE  
7 POLICIES IMPACT THE VALUE THAT CUSTOMER PLACES ON THEIR TRIPS,  
8 HOW POLICIES IMPACT THE PAYMENT EXPERIENCE, HOW THEY PLAY A  
9 ROLE IN MEETING THE NEEDS OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AS  
10 WELL AS HOW THEY CAN OPTIMIZE THE RIDERSHIP AND BENEFITS  
11 PROPOSED TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. THE STUDY EVALUATED FARE  
12 POLICIES IN THE BAY AREA AS WELL AS THE -- ACROSS THE TWO  
13 DOZEN OPERATORS AS WELL AS IN REGIONS. THIS CULMINATED IN A  
14 BUSINESS REPORT THAT THEN INFORMED THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE FARE  
15 POLICY VISION STATEMENT. THE STATEMENT DIRECTS STAFF TO  
16 ADVANCE FOUR KEY FARE POLICY INITIATIVES FOR FURTHER  
17 DEVELOPMENTS. IT WAS ENDORSED BY THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK  
18 FORCE IN NOVEMBER OF 2021, WHICH THEN KICKED OFF WORK ON ITS  
19 FIRST INITIATIVE, WHICH WAS TO DEPLOY A PILOT OF A REGIONAL  
20 INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCT AND IT'S BEEN BRANDED CLIPPER BAYPASS.  
21 AND BY REGIONAL, WE MEAN THE BAYPASS PROVIDES UNLIMITED ACCESS  
22 TO ALL BAY AREA TRANSIT SERVICES ON THE CLIPPER SYSTEM AND BY  
23 INSTITUTIONAL, WE MEAN IT'S DESIGNED AND PACKAGED TO BE SOLD  
24 TO ORGANIZATIONS TO COVER ALL EMPLOYEES OR MEMBERS OF A  
25 DEFINED BUT BROAD POPULATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND SO THIS





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 LEADS US TO WHERE WE ARE NOW. WORK IS UNDER WAY ON TWO  
2 DISTINCT PHASES OF THE CLIPPER BAYPASS PILOT. THE FIRST PHASE  
3 IN WHICH WE SUBSIDIZED COOPERATION WITH INSTITUTIONS AND  
4 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROPERTIES LAUNCHED IN DECEMBER, 2022. WE  
5 WERE ABLE TO ESTABLISH M.O.U.'S. WE HAD \$4.5 MILLION OF  
6 SUPPORT. SECURED OPERATIONAL CONSENT. AND WE WORKED WITH  
7 PARTNERS TO HAVE A RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL TO LOOK AT THE  
8 IMPACTS OF THE PILOT. WE'RE NOW ABOUT 3/4 OF THE WAY THROUGH  
9 THE TWO-YEAR PILOT PHASE WITH VERY RICH DATA COLLECTED TO  
10 MEASURE AGAINST THOSE GOALS OF FARE INTEGRATION AND I'LL  
11 HIGHLIGHT THOSE INITIAL FINDINGS FROM PHASE ONE IN A  
12 SUBSEQUENT SLIDE. I'M THRILLED TO REPORT THAT WE RECENTLY  
13 KICKED OFF TWO OF THE THREE EMPLOYERS WHO PURCHASED IT FOR  
14 THEIR EMPLOYEES. IT'S UCSF. CITY OF MEN LOW PARK -- MENLO  
15 PARK. AND ALAMEDA T.M.A. WITH PHASE ONE, STAFF IS IT LOOKING  
16 TO HAVE QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE DATA TO MEASURE  
17 PERFORMANCE AGAINST ITS GOALS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ON THE  
18 TOPIC OF GOALS -- THIS SLIDE ARTICULATES SOME OF THE METRICS  
19 AND SUCCESS CATEGORIES THAT HAVE THE KEY GOALS FROM THE FARE  
20 STUDY. ON CERTAIN METRICS RELATING TO CUSTOMER VALUE AND  
21 EXPERIENCE, THE PRELIMINARY EVALUATION INDICATES POSITIVE  
22 TRENDS. IN OTHER CATEGORIES, THE EVALUATION EFFORTS ARE IN  
23 PROGRESS, AND STAFF WILL SHARE UPDATES WHEN THOSE ARE  
24 AVAILABLE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES SOME OF  
25 THE FINDINGS WERE THE PRELIMINARY ANALYSIS OF YEAR ONE OF





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 PHASE ONE OF THE CLIPPER BAYPASS PILOT, AND MORE SPECIFICALLY,  
2 WITH THE RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL CONDUCTED AT THREE OF THE  
3 UNIVERSITY. AT THESE UNIVERSITIES, WHICH WERE BERKELEY, SAN  
4 FRANCISCO STATE AND SAN JOSE STATE, WE PROVIDED AN UPGRADE TO  
5 THE BAYPASS TO ABOUT 25% OF THE STUDENT POPULATION, WHEREAS  
6 THE REMAINING STUDENTS RETAINED ACCESS TO THEIR PRE-EXISTING  
7 TRANSIT BENEFITS. TYPICALLY A SINGLE AGENCY PASS SUCH AS EASY  
8 PASS, IN THE CASE OF U.C. BERKELEY STUDENTS. THROUGH YEAR ONE  
9 AND OVER -- AND ACROSS OVER TWO MILLION TRIPS, WE'RE ABLE TO  
10 SEE THAT THE AVERAGE STUDENT WITH BAYPASS ARE IN EFFECT TAKING  
11 MORE TRIPS, THEY ARE MAKING MORE TRANSFERS, AND UTILIZING  
12 HIGHER COST SERVICES THAN THEIR PEERS WITH ACCESS TO A SINGLE  
13 AGENCY PASS. WE'RE CONTINUING THE EVALUATION PROCESS, AND AS  
14 PHASE ONE OF THE PILOT CONCLUDES LATER THIS YEAR, WE'LL BE  
15 DEVELOPING A FAR MORE ROBUST EVALUATION REPORT. NEXT SLIDE,  
16 PLEASE. THIS LAST SLIDE ON CLIPPER BAYPASS, I'LL BRIEFLY TOUCH  
17 ON WHERE WE'RE GOING. SO PHASE ONE IS SCHEDULED TO CONCLUDE  
18 LATER THIS YEAR AFTER WHICH STAFF WILL COMPLETE THE PHASE ONE  
19 EVALUATION AND WE'LL BE PLANNING ON RETURNING TO THE FARE  
20 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE THIS SPRING TO DISCUSS NEXT STEPS AND  
21 OPTIONS FOR HOW TO REMAIN ENGAGED WITH PHASE ONE PARTNERS.  
22 WITH REGARDS TO PHASE TWO, STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO RECRUIT FOR  
23 REMAINING PILOT PARTNERS AS WELL AS BEGIN PRELIMINARY  
24 EVALUATION FOR ITS INITIAL PARTNERS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO  
25 THESE LAST TWO SLIDES, WE'LL TOUCH ON THE TRANSFER POLICY. AS





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 MANY OF YOU KNOW, WHEN THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM  
2 COMES ONLINE, WE PROPOSE TO ROLL OUT OUR NEXT FARE INTEGRATION  
3 PILOT PROGRAM, THE FREE AND REDUCED COST TRANSFERS. WHEN THIS  
4 POLICY GOES INTO EFFECT, WE'LL HAVE A SINGLE SET OF STANDARD  
5 TRANSFER DISCOUNTS THAT APPLIES ACROSS ALL SERVICES ON CLIPPER  
6 AND AVAILABLE TO ALL CUSTOMERS ALONGSIDE PROGRAMS LIKE CLIPPER  
7 START AND OPEN PAYMENT TECHNOLOGY IN -- WITH NEXT GEN CLIPPER,  
8 THIS POLICY WILL BE A HIGHLY VISIBLE DEMONSTRATION THAT  
9 REGIONAL COORDINATION EFFORTS ARE BEGINNING TO PAY OFF  
10 DIRECTLY FOR CUSTOMERS. THE INTENT OF THE POLICY IS THAT NO  
11 ONE SHOULD PAY EXTRA JUST TO SWITCH AGENCIES. WE WANT RIDERS  
12 TO BE ABLE TO USE ALL TRANSIT SERVICES AS IF THEY WERE  
13 OPERATED BY ONE AGENCY. AND IN THAT SPIRIT, THE TRANSFER RULES  
14 ARE SET UP SO THAT WHEN A CUSTOMER TRANSFERS ONTO ANY LOCAL  
15 BUS USING CLIPPER, THEY WILL RECEIVE A FREE TRANSFER.  
16 SIMILARLY, WHEN A CUSTOMER TRANSFERS ONTO BART OR NOR RAIL,  
17 FERRY, OR EXPRESS BUS SERVICE, THEY'LL RECEIVE A DISCOUNT  
18 ROUGHLY EQUAL TO THE COST OF A LOCAL BUS TRIP. WE CAN EXPECT  
19 THAT THIS POLICY WILL REDUCE FARE REVENUES SLIGHTLY WITH THAT  
20 INVESTMENT GOING DIRECTLY TOWARDS REMOVING BARRIERS FOR  
21 CUSTOMERS TRYING TO MAKE MULTI-AGENCY TRIPS. AND SO OPERATORS  
22 WILL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR THE FIRST 50 CENTS OF EACH TRANSFER  
23 DISCOUNT AND M.T.C. WILL REIMBURSE OPERATORS FOR BALANCE. THE  
24 INTENT IS FOR THE PILOT TO CONTINUE FOR AT LEAST 24 MONTHS,  
25 AND M.T.C. HAS SET ASIDE FUNDING FOR THIS POLICY, WHICH WE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 EXPECT WILL BE SUFFICIENT TO SUSTAIN THE PILOT FOR AT LEAST 18  
2 MONTHS. M.T.C. AND OPERATORS WILL BE SEEKING TO IDENTIFY  
3 ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO SUSTAIN THE POLICY THROUGH THE -- IN 24  
4 MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THIS LAST SLIDE SHOWS THE  
5 TIMELINE FOR IMPLEMENTING THE FARE TRANSFER POLICY. A LOT OF  
6 WORK HAS ALREADY BEEN COMPLETE, AN M.O.U. HAS BEEN DRAFTED  
7 WITH INPUT FROM TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF WITHIN THE NEXT FEW  
8 WEEKS, THE PROJECT TEAM WILL REQUEST THAT AGENCIES BEGIN  
9 SCHEDULING ACTION TO TAKE THIS M.O.U. TO THEIR BOARDS FOR  
10 ADOPTION AS WE LOOK TOWARDS THE NEXT GEN CLIPPER SYSTEM  
11 TRANSITION IN LATE SUMMER. AND THEN, A CUSTOMER INFORMATION  
12 CAMPAIGN WILL PROCEED AT LAUNCH. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS  
13 CONCLUDES THE UPDATE ON THE VARIOUS FARE INTEGRATION PILOTS.  
14 I'M HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS OR TAKE ANY COMMENTS AND  
15 FEEDBACK.

16

17 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANKS. HILARY, DO YOU WANT TO MAKE  
18 ANY COMMENTS OR GET THE EXTRA GO LAST?

19

20 **HILLARY BROWN:** I'LL MAKE A COMMENT. BECAUSE EARLIER IN YEAR,  
21 THIS PLAN WAS REFERENCED TO THE NEWS. I AM GLAD BECAUSE THE  
22 PRESENTATION, I GOT MORE CLARITY WITH WHAT'S GOING ON. THAT'S  
23 MY COMMENT.

24

25 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** BRIAN.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. SO FIRST, I WANT TO, YOU KNOW,  
3 REITERATE, WE KEEP GETTING THIS GREAT NEWS ABOUT WHAT DOES  
4 SUCCESS LOOK LIKE, AND THE REALLY BIG SUCCESS THIS BAYPASS IS  
5 HAVING IN THE PILOT AND I'M GLAD TO SEE THINGS ARE MOVING  
6 FORWARD WITH BOTH PHASE TWO AND EXPANDING THIS TO M.T.C. LINE  
7 PROGRAM WHICH HOPEFULLY THE M.O.U. IS LOOKING AT BRINGING ALL  
8 THE OPERATORS. I DO WANT TO RAISE SOME CONCERNS. ONE, LOOKS  
9 LIKE WE HAVE A PHASE ONE THAT'S ABOUT FIVE TIMES OR MORE THE  
10 SIZE OF PHASE TWO. AND WORKS TO END THIS SUMMER. AND WE HAVE A  
11 T.B.D. ON HOW WE CONTINUE THAT. SECOND, WITH THE ROLLOUT OF  
12 CLIPPER 2.0, THERE'S THIS PROPOSAL FOR A PILOT, WHICH MAY OR  
13 MAY NOT INCLUDE ALL AGENCIES BUT THEN FUNDING FOR 18 TO 24  
14 MONTHS AND THEN IT ENDS. IF WE REALLY GO BACK TO, WHAT RESULTS  
15 ARE WE SEEING AND WHAT ARE WE TRYING TO DO HERE, WHETHER IT'S  
16 THE FARE INTEGRATION, THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, THE CUSTOMER  
17 ADVISORY GROUP, THIS IS THE DIRECTION WE NEED TO DO GO. IT  
18 LOOKS LIKE -- NEEDS TO GO. IT LOOKS LIKE THE NUMBERS THAT ARE  
19 COMING IN, THIS IS FARE POSITIVE. I'M READING THIS IT'S A 9%  
20 IMPROVEMENT IN THE AMOUNT OF FARE REVENUE COMING IN. WHY ARE  
21 WE DOING TIME-LIMITED PILOTS? THE BAY AREA AGENCIES, M.T.C.  
22 AND THE OPERATORS, NEED TO GO FORWARD WITH THIS IS THE WAY WE  
23 DO BUSINESS. AND HOW DO WE GET FROM, YOU KNOW, PHASE TWO AND  
24 POTENTIALLY AN 18-MONTH PILOT TO, THIS IS THE WAY WE'RE DOING  
25 BUSINESS, ESPECIALLY WHEN WE LOOK AT REGIONAL BUSINESS COMING





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 UP, THIS IS THE WAY WE'RE DOING BUSINESS IN ORDER TO GET BUY-  
2 IN FROM THE BAY AREA CITIZENS THAT THIS IS -- THIS IS  
3 SOMETHING WE'RE SUPPORTING AND WE'RE GOING FORWARD WITH? THANK  
4 YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS.

7

8 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT MADE IT  
9 EASY TO UNDERSTAND. I APPRECIATE IT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** IAN.

12

13 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** THANKS, AGAIN, FOR THIS UPDATE. I THINK I JUST  
14 CAN'T HELP BUT COMPARE THIS PRESENTATION TO THE ONE WE JUST  
15 SAW ON CLIPPER START. IT REALLY CAUSES ME TO WANT TO HAVE  
16 APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON BETWEEN THE PROGRAMS. LIKE, THIS  
17 IS AN EXAMPLE OF SOMETHING. WE DON'T HAVE TO GIVE PEOPLE'S  
18 PERMISSION TO HAVE A TRANSFER OR TO EVEN OFFER SOME PRODUCT  
19 THAT'S AVAILABLE TO LITERALLY EVERYONE. THAT'S WHAT EXCITES ME  
20 ABOUT THESE PROJECTS. YOU KNOW, TO KNOW ACTUALLY -- I SUSPECT  
21 IF WE LOOKED AT THE DATA, WE WOULD BE ABLE TO SEE HOW MANY  
22 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, HOW MANY PEOPLE WHO ARE ACTUALLY PART OF  
23 THE TARGET POPULATION FOR CLIPPER START PROGRAM ARE  
24 BENEFITTING FROM THESE POLICIES AND EVEN CALCULATE HOW MUCH  
25 MONEY THEY'RE SAVING. AND SOMEONE -- I MEAN, BACK OF THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ENVELOPE MATH, SOMEONE WHO MAKES A TRANSFER ON THEIR COMMUTE  
2 EVERY DAY AND WHO COMMUTES FIVE DAYS A WEEK, THEY'RE SAVING  
3 ABOUT \$1,000 A YEAR BECAUSE OF FREE -- THEY WILL START SAVING  
4 ROUGHLY \$1,000 A YEAR, \$5 A DAY, \$4, \$5 A DAY, \$20 A WEEK.  
5 THIS IS ON THE MAGNITUDE WHAT THEY WOULD SAVE IF THEY SIGNED  
6 UP FOR CLIPPER START. AGAIN, IT CAUSES US TO WONDER, SHOULD WE  
7 REALLY FOCUS ON RAMPING UP IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE POLICIES  
8 OR, LIKE, YOU KNOW, WHERE WE HAVE LIMITED RESOURCES OF STAFF  
9 TIME AND OF FUNDING, SHOULD WE BE FOCUSING ON MORE UNIVERSAL  
10 PROGRAMS THAT ARE AVAILABLE FOR EVERYONE VERSUS VERY TARGETED  
11 PROGRAMS? I'M JUST SAYING, I JUST THINK THAT'S AN EXCITING  
12 THING ABOUT THIS WORK. I HOPE THAT WE WILL HAVE THAT DATA THAT  
13 CAN HELP MAYBE BUILD THE CASE TO THE EXTENT THAT MORE FUNDING  
14 IS NEEDED TO ROLL OUT THIS FASTER, I THINK THAT CAN HELP MAYBE  
15 MAKE THE CASE FOR THAT. SO HAPPY TO SEE THIS MOVING FORWARD.  
16 OF COURSE, I WOULD LOVE -- I DIDN'T SEE ANY RECOGNITION OR  
17 MENTION OF, YOU KNOW, THE NEXT POLICIES THAT WERE COMMITTED TO  
18 THAT WERE PART OF THE VISION STATEMENT FOR INTEGRATED FARES  
19 WHICH INCLUDED INTEGRATED STRUCTURE FOR REGIONAL AGENCIES AND  
20 THEN, YOU KNOW, THAT WAS NOTABLY MISSING FROM THIS UPDATE ON  
21 NEXT STEPS. SO I'D BE CURIOUS IF THERE'S ANY MORE INFORMATION  
22 ON WHEN THAT WILL START, BUT THANK YOU FOR THE UPDATE.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. AND CAN YOU RESPOND TO THAT  
25 LAST ITEM BECAUSE I'M PRETTY SURE I SAW IT ON ONE OF THE





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 DECKS, ALSO, THERE WILL BE THE NEXT STEP ON THE REGIONAL  
2 FARES?

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I CAN ANSWER THAT. HI. MIKE EISEMAN,  
5 REMOTELY. WE DON'T HAVE A SPECIFIC TIMELINE RIGHT NOW. I WILL  
6 SAY THERE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSIONS BETWEEN SOME OF THE PARTIES TO  
7 WHAT WILL ULTIMATELY BE MORE DETAILED EVALUATION OF THAT STEP.  
8 IT'S STILL ON THE AGENDA. BUT WE WILL UPDATE WHEN WE HAVE A  
9 MORE CONCRETE TIMELINE.

10

11 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. SEBASTIAN.

12

13 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** HI, MIKE AND TERENCE, THANK YOU FOR THE  
14 UPDATE. ALWAYS GREAT TO SEE THESE PROGRAMS GROWING. I THINK  
15 ONE COMMENT, AS YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT BUILDING MOMENTUM FOR  
16 THESE PROGRAMS, A COUPLE OF THINGS I MIGHT POINT TO, ONE, OVER  
17 TIME, I THINK IT WILL BE HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND PRETTY CLEARLY  
18 WHAT ADDITIONAL FUNDING NEEDS THERE MIGHT BE TO GROW THE  
19 PROGRAM TO SCALE AND TO START GETTING THOSE NUMBERS  
20 SOCIALIZED. OTHER THING I'D POINT OUT, IT MIGHT BE TRICKY TO  
21 DO BUT IT WILL BE A VERY HELPFUL TALKING POINT TO DO SOME KIND  
22 OF A COMPARISON. I FEEL LIKE THERE MIGHT HAVE BEEN SOMETHING  
23 LIKE THIS IN THE ORIGINAL FARE INTEGRATION STUDY OF JUST THE  
24 RELATIVE COST TO BUILD RIDERSHIP THROUGH THESE KINDS OF  
25 MECHANISMS RELATIVELY TO SOME OF THE CAPITAL INVESTMENTS THAT





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 WE MAKE IN THIS REGION. OBVIOUSLY, THERE ARE GOOD REASONS TO  
2 DO BOTH. BUT AT A TIME WHEN WE HAVE LIMITED RESOURCES AND NEED  
3 FOR RIDERSHIP, I THINK THAT IS POWERFUL AND WOULD BE RATHER  
4 SURPRISING TO SOME PEOPLE. THAT WE HAVE SOME TOOLS AT OUR  
5 DISPOSAL TO REALLY GROW RIDERSHIP IN A WAY THAT'S COST-  
6 EFFECTIVE. THANKS.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND TERRY SCOTT.

9

10 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES, THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. I THOUGHT  
11 IT WAS VERY COMPLETE AND VERY INFORMATIVE. I THINK GOING  
12 FORWARD, THE INTRODUCTION OF THIS PROGRAM TO THE PUBLIC NEEDS  
13 TO BE EFFECTIVELY COMMUNICATED IN SUCH A WAY THAT PEOPLE  
14 UNDERSTAND THE POTENTIAL OF THE PROGRAM AND THE POTENTIAL  
15 BENEFITS TO THEMSELVES AND THEIR INDIVIDUAL SITUATIONS. I  
16 CAN'T THINK OF ANY NEGATIVES THAT COME TO PLAY. AND AS FAR AS  
17 REACHING OUT TO FOLKS, PERSONALLY, I'M NOT CONCERNED IF WE  
18 HAVE A GREATER NUMBER OR PERCENTAGE OF RIDERS WHO APPLY FOR  
19 THIS. I THINK THAT EVENTUALLY IT WILL WORK OUT THROUGH  
20 INCREASED RIDERSHIP. THE PUBLIC'S UNDERSTANDING OF THEIR  
21 ABILITY TO MOVE MORE FREQUENTLY, MORE EASILY, AND AT  
22 INDIVIDUALLY POTENTIALLY LESS COST. AND IT MAKES SENSE AND IT  
23 WILL I THINK ENCOURAGE ADDITIONAL RIDERSHIP.

24

25 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. TERRY GLASER.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1

2 **GERRY GLASER:** THIS IS BASICALLY BECAUSE OF IGNORANCE. CAN YOU  
3 EXPLAIN A LITTLE BIT, LET'S SAY, MENLO PARK IS PARTICIPATING  
4 NOW WITH BAYPASS, WHAT DOES MENLO PARK DOES, WHAT DOES THE  
5 RIDERS DO AND HOW DO THE AGENCIES GET REIMBURSED? HOW DOES THE  
6 PASS WORK, THAT I DIDN'T UNDERSTAND.

7

8 **OTTO LEE:** THANKS -- TERRENCE LEE THANKS FOR THAT QUESTION.  
9 THERE IS THE PASS ITSELF FROM THE INDIVIDUAL EXPERIENCE. YOU  
10 KNOW, THEY RECEIVE ON A CLIPPER CARD EITHER MOBILE OR PHYSICAL  
11 OR EXISTING -- CURRENT CLIPPER CARD, WE WOULD ADD ON A CLIPPER  
12 CARD, THE CLIPPER BAYPASS PRODUCT AND IT WOULD FACILITATE  
13 UNLIMITED ACCESS TO ALL CLIPPER SERVICES IN THE BAY AREA. ONE  
14 EXCEPTION BEING THE CABLE CARS. THAT'S THE INDIVIDUAL  
15 PERSPECTIVE. BUT THE BAYPASS ITSELF IS PACKAGED AS AN  
16 INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCT. SO THERE'S AN ARRANGEMENT ESTABLISHED  
17 WITHIN ORGANIZATIONS SUCH AS MENLO PARK OR AN ORGANIZATION  
18 WITH BROAD ENOUGH POPULATION. THEY WOULD PURCHASE THE BAYPASS  
19 TO COVER THEIR ENTIRE POPULATION. SOME WILL USE IT A LOT, SOME  
20 NOT AS MUCH. BUT ACROSS THAT POPULATION, THERE'S SOME CROSS-  
21 SUBSIDY AND THAT KIND OF FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS. SO THROUGH  
22 THE CONTRACT WITH THE INSTITUTION AND CURRENTLY KIND OF CUSTOM  
23 PRICING, WE'RE ABLE TO ESTABLISH A PRICE THAT'S SUFFICIENT TO  
24 REIMBURSE OPERATORS FOR TRIPS TAKEN ON -- WITH THE CLIPPER  
25 BAYPASS. AND THEN MECHANICALLY, THERE'S A PORTAL THROUGH WHICH





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 THE CITY OF MENLO PARK, FOR INSTANCE, WILL BE GIVEN AN ABILITY  
2 TO ADD THE CLIPPER BAYPASS TO A COVERED ELIGIBLE EMPLOYEE.

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** SO IT WORKS AS A DISCOUNT PROGRAM ON TRANSFERS  
5 OR DISCOUNT PROGRAM IN GENERAL?

6

7 **TERRENCE LEE:** I WOULDN'T NECESSARILY CAST IT AS A DISCOUNT  
8 PROGRAM. IT'S A PASS PRODUCT THAT FACILITATES UNLIMITED USE. I  
9 GUESS THIS PERCEPTION OF DISCOUNT WOULD REALLY BE BASED ON THE  
10 PRICE YOU END UP PAYING OR HOW YOU VALUE CLIPPER BAYPASS.

11

12 **GERRY GLASER:** SORRY. I'M USING THE WRONG WORDS, THEN. SO THE  
13 RIDER, THEN -- AN INSTITUTION IS PAID, NOW THE RIDER GOES ON A  
14 RIDE. IS THE RIDE FREE FOR THEM OR ARE THEY PAYING A  
15 DISCOUNTED RATE ON IT?

16

17 **TERRENCE LEE:** THE RIDE FROM THEIR PERSPECTIVE WOULD BE FREE.

18

19 **GERRY GLASER:** THANKS. THAT'S THE CLARIFICATION I WANTED.  
20 THANKS.

21

22 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANKS. DYLAN.

23

24 **DYLAN FABRIS:** YEAH, THANKS. THANKS FOR THIS UPDATE. MY ONLY  
25 QUESTION, KIND OF FOLLOWING UP ON THAT, FOR THE PHASE TWO, HOW





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ARE YOU REACHING OUT TO ORGANIZATIONS TO SIGN UP AND -- ARE  
2 YOU DOING THAT OUTREACH NOW OR IS THERE A WAY FOR INTERESTED  
3 ORGANIZATIONS TO GET INVOLVED?

4

5 **TERRENCE LEE:** WE HAVE A WEBSITE THAT'S LIVE,  
6 CLIPPERBAYPASS.COM. AND ONLINE THERE IS A FORM FOR ANYONE  
7 PARTICIPATING TO INDICATE THEIR INTEREST AFTER WHICH WE WOULD  
8 REACH OUT TO ESTABLISH IF THERE'S A FIT. ESTABLISH NEXT STEPS  
9 FOR WORKING TOGETHER. SO I WOULD ENCOURAGE ANYONE HERE TO  
10 SHARE CLIPPERBAYPASS.COM.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. THANKS. ANNE OLIVIA HAS A HAND  
13 DIGITALLY, CAN WE HEAR FROM ANNE OLIVIA?

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS REALLY EXCITING AND  
16 COOL. I REALLY ENJOYED HEARING THAT. THE ANSWERS HAVE BEEN  
17 REALLY HELPFUL AS WELL. I DID WANT A CLARIFICATION ON ONE  
18 POINT. YOU SAID THAT -- I WOULD IMAGINE, NOT A HUGE SURPRISE,  
19 BUT STUDENTS WHO RECEIVED FREE TRANSIT, MORE BIGGER AND  
20 COMPLICATED RIDES THEY DID, TRANSFERS, THAN PEOPLE WHO DIDN'T,  
21 IS THAT CORRECT?

22

23 **TERRENCE LEE:** YES, THAT'S CORRECT. WE WERE ABLE TO CONDUCT A  
24 RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL SO A PORTION OF THE POPULATION GOT  
25 BAYPASS AND REMAINDER OF THE POPULATION GOT RETAINING THEIR





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 EXISTING PASS SO WE WERE ABLE TO ANALYZE TRAVEL BEHAVIOR AND  
2 THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN THOSE TWO GROUPS.

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** OKAY. WHEN YOU SAID THAT YOU IMAGINE THAT  
5 THIS WILL RESULT IN A LOSS OF FUNDS, LIKE, DECREASED INCOME  
6 FROM RIDERSHIP, IS THAT DECREASED INCOME BASED ON IF PEOPLE  
7 HAD ACTUALLY TAKEN THOSE RIDES WHICH I UNDERSTAND THOSE  
8 STUDIES THEY DON'T TAKE THE RIDE WITH THE BAYPASS OR CAN YOU  
9 EXPLAIN THAT NUMBER?

10

11 **TERRENCE LEE YEAH. THAT REMARK HAD TO DO WITH THE TRANSFER**  
12 **POLICY IN WHICH CASE WE'D BE DISCOUNTING UPWARDS OF \$2.50 PER**  
13 **TRANSFER. THAT'S THE KIND OF RENEW REDUCTION I WAS**  
14 **TRANSFERRING TO. THAT'S DISTINCT FROM THE CLIPPER BAYPASS**  
15 **PILOT.**

16

17 **>>ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THAT MAKES MORE SENSE. I SOMEHOW  
18 COMBINED THOSE TWO THINGS. I WAS LIKE, THAT DOESN'T MAKE  
19 SENSE. THE -- SO WITH THE -- I WOULD BE INTERESTED TO SEE IF  
20 IT REALLY DOES REDUCE INCOME, BECAUSE EVEN IF THERE IS A  
21 REDUCTION IN FARE BUT IT ENCOURAGES MORE PEOPLE TO TAKE MORE  
22 RIDES THAT THEY WOULDN'T HAVE, THEN THAT COULD VERY WELL  
23 RESULT IN A NET INCREASE. AND AS WE ARE LOOKING AT  
24 ESTABLISHING HABITS IN PEOPLE, GETTING MORE PEOPLE USED TO,  
25 LIKE, HAVING THIS BE OKAY AND HAVING -- I LOVE THE PILOT





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 PROGRAM THAT YOU DID EVEN IF IT IS A SEPARATE THING. IT'S  
2 WONDERFUL, THE MORE PEOPLE TALKING ABOUT IT BEING SAFE TO RIDE  
3 PUBLIC TRANSIT, THE MORE LIKELY YOU'RE GOING TO CONVINCE  
4 PEOPLE WHO DON'T TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY'RE AFRAID OF  
5 THEIR SAFETY TO ACTUALLY GET ONTO TRANSIT AGAIN BECAUSE THEY  
6 BELIEVE THEIR PEERS AND AS THEY WATCH THEIR PEERS DOING THOSE  
7 ACTIVITIES, IT'S A MUCH EASIER ADOPTION RATE. BUT I REALLY  
8 THINK THAT REDUCING THAT COST COULD JUST RESULT IN A MUCH  
9 QUICKER REBUILDING OF OUR RIDERSHIP, WHICH IS A NET INCREASE.  
10 SO THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION.

11

12 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. WARREN.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, WARREN CUSHMAN:** YES. I HAVE VERY LITTLE TO ADD. I  
15 JUST WANTED TO POINT OUT THAT WITH THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM,  
16 ALL OF THESE FARE INTEGRATION PIECES, CLIPPER 2.0, THERE'S A  
17 LOT OF MOVING PARTS AROUND ALL OF THIS AND I JUST WANT TO  
18 EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING ALL THOSE MOVING PARTS WORK  
19 TOGETHER. AND THAT WE END UP WITH A PRODUCT THAT MAKES SENSE  
20 FOR EVERYBODY. I WANT TO ECHO SOME OF THE COMMENTS OF MY  
21 COLLEAGUES IN JUST THAT WE HAVE SOMETHING THAT MAKES SENSE FOR  
22 ALL OF US TO LOOK AT IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. COUPLE OF QUICK  
25 THINGS TO ADD ON TO WHAT PEOPLE HAVE SAID. I WANTED TO BUILD





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 ON WHAT ANNE OLIVIA HAD SAID IN TERMS OF LOOKING FORWARD TO  
2 THE ANALYSIS BEING, LIKE, REALLY LOOKING AT A COST -- LIKE,  
3 THE IMPACT ON COST IS -- IT HAS A LOT OF VARIABLES. IT MAY  
4 INCREASE IN COST IF IT HAS RIDERSHIP ABOVE WHAT THE FARE IS  
5 AND AS LONG AS THERE'S CAPACITY IN THE SYSTEM IF YOU HAVE ONE  
6 NET RIDE, EVEN IF IT'S AT A LOWER INCREMENTAL PRICE, IT'S  
7 STILL NET REVENUE POSITIVE. SO REALLY UNDERSTANDING THAT  
8 EQUATION IS GOING TO BE HELPFUL IN TERMS OF FIGURING OUT THE  
9 COST BENEFIT COMPARED TO OTHER OPTIONS OF INCREASING RIDERSHIP  
10 AS SEBASTIAN PETTY SAID IN TERMS OF ASSESSING WHAT WOULD BE  
11 THE COST OF HAVING A BROADLY ROLLED OUT SET OF PROGRAMS THAT  
12 DO INCREASE RIDERSHIP AND THE VALUE OF THE PUBLIC SYSTEM TO  
13 THE PUBLIC. ONE QUESTION I HAD IN TERMS OF SEEING THERE ARE  
14 THREE CUSTOMERS SIGNED UP FOR PHASE TWO OF THE PILOT, ARE  
15 THERE ANY BARRIERS THAT YOU'RE SEEING IN TERMS OF SIGNING UP  
16 THOSE? IS IT A TIMING AND WHEN THEY SIGN UP? LIKE, WHY IS IT  
17 ONLY THREE, YET, GIVEN THAT IT'S A COOL THING THAT MEETS MORE  
18 OF THE NEED OF INSTITUTIONS, FOUGHT BEST OF MY UNDERSTANDING?

19

20 **TERRENCE LEE:** YEAH. IT'S A MYRIAD OF CHALLENGES. I THINK THIS  
21 IS A BRAND-NEW PROGRAM TO THE BAY AREA. SO IT'S A NEW BENEFIT,  
22 A NEW PRODUCT THAT INSTITUTIONS WOULD BE PAYING FOR.  
23 JUSTIFYING IN THEIR BUDGETS, MATCHING BUDGET CYCLES, REACHING  
24 THE RIGHT STAKEHOLDERS AT ORGANIZATIONS. YOU KNOW, CLARIFYING  
25 THE STRUCTURE OF THE PROGRAM AND HOW PRICING IS ESTABLISHED.





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 WE'VE GOT SOME WORK TO DO. I'M OPTIMIZING THOSE  
2 COMMUNICATIONS, BUT WE ARE IN -- WE DO HAVE A RELATIVELY  
3 ROBUST PIPELINE. THROUGH THAT INTEREST FORM WE HAVE RECEIVED  
4 QUITE A BIT OF INTEREST. WE'LL CERTAINLY REPORT BACK AS THERE  
5 ARE NEW CUSTOMERS AND NEW DEVELOPMENTS.

6

7 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. GREAT. GLAD THAT THE ORGANIZATIONAL  
8 SALES PIPELINE, FOR LACK OF BETTER TERMS, IS PART OF WHAT  
9 YOU'RE SEEKING OUT WITH THE PILOT. ALSO, GLAD TO SEE IN THE  
10 PHASE ONE, LOOKING AT POTENTIALLY OTHER EDUCATIONAL  
11 INSTITUTIONS. YOU KNOW, WE'VE BEEN HEARING, ESPECIALLY WITH  
12 OTHER EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS REALLY EAGER TO BE ABLE TO JOIN  
13 WHEN FEASIBLE. AND LAST AND I KNOW THAT THIS IS A SMALL  
14 CAMEL'S TOE IN A BIG TENT, THE ONE THING TO MAYBE START ONCE  
15 AGAIN TO BE THINKING ABOUT IN TERMS OF THE FARE POLICY VISION  
16 AS THERE WAS A NEXT STEP THAT WAS NOT CONSIDERED TO MOVE  
17 FORWARD EARLIER WHICH WAS STANDARDIZING REGIONAL FARES. PARTLY  
18 BECAUSE WITHOUT THE PROSPECT OF ANY ADDITIONAL REVENUE, IT  
19 WOULD HAVE NEGATIVE EQUITY IMPACTS BECAUSE IF YOU ARE  
20 INCREASING THE FARE FOR THE LOWER COST AGENCIES THAT'S HARMING  
21 LOW-INCOME PEOPLE AND IF IT'S DECREASING THE FARE FOR AN  
22 AGENCY THAT DEPENDS ON FARES, IT WOULD BE NEGATIVE FOR THE  
23 AGENCIES. HOWEVER, LIKE, AS WE'RE STARTING TO PLAN FOR THE  
24 REGIONAL MEASURE AND ITS EXPENDITURE PLAN AND GETTING CLOSER  
25 TO THE ROLLOUT OF THE WAY FINDING PROJECT AND CAN REALLY START





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 TO VISUALIZE JUST HOW MUCH HAVING DIFFERENT FARES IS A  
2 CONSTRAINT ON THE EASE OF WAY FINDING, THAT WAY FINDING STUDY  
3 FOUND IF WE WERE ABLE TO, YOU KNOW, REALLY STANDARDIZE THE WAY  
4 FINDING, WHICH YOU CAN'T DO IF YOU HAVE DIFFERENT FARES, LIKE,  
5 THAT WOULD HAVE A LOT OF BENEFIT TO THE EASE OF USE OF THE  
6 TRANSIT SYSTEM. AND I'M STARTING TO HEAR PEOPLE, INCLUDING ON  
7 THIS BODY AND FROM COMMISSIONERS TO SAY, LIKE, WHY CAN'T WE  
8 MAKE THE WAY FINDING THAT LEVEL EASIER? AND SO I WOULD  
9 ENCOURAGE MAYBE STARTING TO THINK IN THE FUTURE STEP AND  
10 BEFORE THE REGIONAL MEASURE TO START TO ASSESS THAT, AGAIN, TO  
11 SEE IF IT'S WORTH IT. AND THAT IS THE END OF THAT CAMEL'S TOE  
12 INTO A TENT COMMENT ON THAT TOPIC. IF STAFF HAS ANYTHING ELSE  
13 TO SAY OTHER THAN I'LL THINK ABOUT IT THAT WILL BE FINE.  
14 OTHERWISE, THAT'S A LONGER CONVERSATION. ANY -- ARE THERE ANY  
15 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

16

17 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES, THERE IS. THERE ARE TWO MEMBERS OF  
18 THE PUBLIC. ONE IS IN PERSON, ALETA DUPREE, AND THEN WE HAVE  
19 CHRISTINE FITZGERALD. STARTING WITH ALETA DUPREE.

20

21 **ALETA DUPREE:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR LEVIN. ALETA DUPREE, SHE AND  
22 HER. THESE PRESENTATIONS ARE GETTING BETTER. I AM LEARNING NEW  
23 THINGS FROM THIS MATERIAL. AS I'VE SAID BEFORE, I'D LIKE TO  
24 SEE SOME ANIMATION. LIKE A YOUTUBE VIDEO OF WHAT THE NUMBERS  
25 LOOK LIKE WHEN WE DO THIS. I THINK IT WILL CERTAINLY BECOME





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 CLEARER TO ME WHEN I ACTUALLY DO THESE TRANSFERS ON MY CLIPPER  
2 CARD, ESPECIALLY FOR ME BEING AN R.T.C. REDUCED FARE USER,  
3 THOSE NUMBERS ARE GOING TO BE A LITTLE DIFFERENT, A LOT  
4 DIFFERENT THAN THE FULL FARE EXAMPLES. AND I'M LOOKING FORWARD  
5 TO A PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BAYPASS, WHICH I HAVEN'T YET  
6 EXPERIENCED ANYWHERE IN THE UNITED STATES. WELL, MY CHICAGO  
7 C.T.A. MONTHLY PASS I GET WORKS WITH PACE. THAT'S PROBABLY THE  
8 CLOSEST I'VE DONE. I THINK IT'S \$35 A MONTH. SO WE'RE GETTING  
9 SOMEWHERE. I THINK THIS IS GOING TO EVENTUALLY HAVE A NET  
10 EFFECT POSITIVE IN REVENUE BECAUSE IT WILL OFFER MORE  
11 PREDICTABILITY. I THINK THE BAY AREA'S UNIQUE, MAYBE ALONG  
12 WITH L.A., OF HOW MUCH OVERLAP WE HAVE WITH TRANSPORTATION  
13 BECAUSE THERE'S SEVERAL WAYS THAT I CAN MAKE THE CROSSING  
14 BETWEEN HERE AND OAKLAND. AND THEY ALL COST DIFFERENT AMOUNTS.  
15 SOMETIMES I PAY MORE FOR ONE MODE BECAUSE I LIKE THAT AND  
16 SOMETIMES -- YOU KNOW, TAKING THE BUS, IT'S DIRECT. SOMETIMES  
17 I USE BART. BECAUSE I JUST FEEL LIKE USING BART AND BART IS  
18 THE PEOPLE'S SYSTEM. AND I LIKE THE FERRY, TOO. SO I'M LOOKING  
19 FORWARD TO US MAKING THIS HAPPEN HOPEFULLY THIS SUMMER.  
20 THANKS.

21

22 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. NEXT PERSON IS CHRISTINE  
23 FITZGERALD, YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

24





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, WALLY. FIRST, I LIKE THE  
2 PRESENTATION. VERY INTERESTING. WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT  
3 AS YOU ROLL OUT ANY KIND OF SAMPLE OR -- A SAMPLE PROCESS,  
4 THAT YOU KEEP IN MIND THAT IF YOU DON'T INCLUDE ENOUGH PEOPLE  
5 IN THIS SAMPLE TO TRY THE PROCESS, YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET AN  
6 ACCURATE BASIS FOR COMPARISON. THIS ALSO IS IN TERMS OF TIME  
7 FRAME FOR DURING THE DAY OR WEEK BUT ALSO DURING THE GIVEN  
8 PERIOD OF TIME OF TRIAL. SO SIX TO EIGHT MONTHS MAY NOT BE  
9 ENOUGH BUT PLEASE DO MAKE SURE THAT YOU NOTIFY THE COMMUNITY  
10 THAT THIS IS IN PROCESS AND THAT YOU KNOW, YOU REALLY HOPE TO  
11 HAVE A VERY ROBUST PROCESS SO YOU CAN TEST DRIVE THIS AND THAT  
12 YOU SHOW AS YOU GET CLOSER TO THE END OF THIS RUN THAT THERE  
13 IS A FUTURE FOR THE -- WHATEVER THE NEXT STEP IS. IF IT'S --  
14 IF THE PILOT PROGRAM IS GOING TO BE FINISHED, WHAT HAPPENS TO  
15 IT? CAUTIONARY TALE. AND THIS HAPPENED WITH V.T.A. I SAW IT  
16 KIND OF GO SIDEWAYS. AND I MYSELF WASN'T PLEASED WITH THE  
17 OUTCOME BECAUSE IT DISAPPEARED. THANK YOU.

18

19 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC  
20 COMMENTS, NO ONE RAISED A HAND ONLINE. THERE'S NOTHING IN  
21 WRITING AND NO ONE IN THE ROOM.

22

23 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I THINK WE  
24 CAN MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 6 ON PUBLIC COMMENT ON OTHER





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 BUSINESS. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WANT TO  
2 MAKE COMMENTS ON ITEMS THAT ARE NOT ON THE AGENDA?

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** YES, WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER HERE. ALETA  
5 DUPREE.

6

7 **ALETA DUPREE:** THANKS, AGAIN, CHAIR ADINA LEVIN AND OTHERS. SHE  
8 AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. GOOD MEETING TODAY. I HAVE BEEN IN  
9 MEETINGS ALL THE DAY. TIME WELL SPENT. ONE REASON WHY I COME  
10 TO THE BAY AREA IS BECAUSE I ENJOY MEETINGS, ESPECIALLY PEER  
11 MEETINGS LIKE THIS, WHERE WE CAN SHARE COMMON EXPERIENCES  
12 BECAUSE EXECUTIVES AND POLICYMAKERS NEED TO HEAR THE STORIES,  
13 THE ORDINARY FOLKS LIKE US OUT ON THE GROUND, OUT IN THE  
14 SYSTEM, OUT ON THE ROAD. AND SO MY INCUMBENCY AT BAY AREA  
15 TRANSIT GOES BACK TO 2004. AND I SPOKE AT M.T.C. AND MEETING  
16 AMY WERTH AT BATA AND SHE ONCE I BELIEVE WAS M.T.C. CHAIR AND  
17 THE BALL GOT ROLLING FOR THIS WITH ME. BUT I BRING YOU 54  
18 YEARS OF PUBLIC TRANSIT. BEGINNING IN THE 34TH STREET AND 8TH  
19 AVENUE STATION OF THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY. 1970 I BEGAN  
20 LEARNING THIS. AND SO ALWAYS LOOKING FOR THINGS, WAYS TO DO  
21 THINGS BETTER. SEAMLESSLY, YEAH, COPYRIGHTS STRIKE, I'M  
22 BORROWING THE WORD. IT'S A GREAT WORD. I LOVE HEARING THAT.  
23 BUT ALL I CAN DO IS SHARE MY STORIES FROM AROUND THE COUNTRY.  
24 I'M SIMPLY AN ORDINARY USER OF THESE SYSTEMS. BUT IT'S  
25 SOMETHING I ENJOY. IT'S MUCH BETTER THAN ME TRYING TO FIND A





FEBRUARY 23, 2024

1 PARKING SPACE. SAVE A LOT OF MONEY. AND BEING PART OF THINGS  
2 BIGGER THAN MYSELF. THANK YOU.

3

4 **WALLY CHARLES, CLERK:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE SPEAKERS  
5 ONLINE. THERE'S NO ONE IN THE ROOM. AND THERE WAS NOTHING IN  
6 WRITING. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. AND WITH THAT WE WILL ADJOURN  
9 TO THE NEXT MEETING WHICH WILL BE HELD ON FRIDAY, APRIL 26 --  
10 FRIDAY, APRIL 26 IT 2024, AT 1:00 P.M. AT THE BAY AREA METRO  
11 CENTER, WITH ANY CHANGES AND AGENDAS TO BE DULY NOTICED TO THE  
12 PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

13





*Broadcasting Government*