

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 19, 2025, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER
6 THIS MEETING OF THE MTC. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC
7 WEB SITE. REMOTE FOLKS USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
8 STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME
9 TO SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED ON BY THE
10 LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE FOR ALL
11 ACTION ITEMS. ITEM ONE ROLL CALL CONFIRM QUORUM PLEASE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR NOACK?

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS WE'LL CIRCLE
18 BACK TO YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES, I'M HERE AT 270 GRANT ROAD IN PALO
21 ALTO.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER
24 AHN?

25



1 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AMBUEHL? IS ABSENT.

4 COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?

5

6 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?

9

10 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER BURT?

13

14 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

17

18 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

21

22 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

25 IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LEE? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?

2

3 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AND THE LOCATION?

6

7 **AMBER MANFREE:** I AM AT THE NAPA COUNTY MAIN OFFICE, 1193 THIRD
8 STREET, NAPA.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MASHBURN? MELGAR? IS ABSENT.
11 MILEY?

12

13 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS? IS ON HER WAY, ABSENT AT THE
20 MOMENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

21

22 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A REQUEST FOR REMOTE
2 PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FROM VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES I'M REQUESTING TO
5 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB 2449 BECAUSE I'M RECOVERING FROM
6 SURGERY. THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE ROOM WITH ME.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED AND WE'RE ADDING VICE
9 CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS AS PRESENT FOR THIS MEETING. AGENDA ITEM
10 TWO IS THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. IF YOU ARE ABLE, PLEASE STAND
11 AND JOIN ME FOR THE PLEDGE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE
12 ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO
13 THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
14 INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION
17 ANNOUNCEMENT?

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
20 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
21 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
22 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
23 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
24 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM FOUR. 4A IS
2 MTC RESOLUTION 4738, APPRECIATION FOR THERESE TRIVEDI. THERESE
3 RETIRED LAST WEEK AFTER 27 YEARS IN PUBLIC SERVICE INCLUDED 23
4 YEARS AT MTC PRECEDED BY FOUR YEARS OF WORK AT SAN FRANCISCO
5 INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT. I'LL REFRAIN FROM READING THE WHOLE
6 RESOLUTION BUT WILL SHARE PASSENGERS. THERESE WAS ORIGINALLY
7 HIRED TO LAUNCH THE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING PROGRAM WHICH IS
8 STILL GOING STRONG AFTER MORE THAN TWO DECADES AND THROUGH
9 WHICH MORE THAN 30 COMMUNITIES IN ALL NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES
10 ALREADY HAVE COMPLETED CBT POWERS. AND WHEREAS THERESA'S
11 PRETER NATURAL -- WHAT -- PRETER NATURAL -- SOMEONE'S GOT TO
12 WORK ON THE WORDS SO I ACTUALLY KNOW WHAT I'M SAYING HERE.
13 INTERPRET BUREAUCRATIC LANGUAGE AND TAKE DIRECTION FROM POLICY
14 DIRECTORS MAKE A TRIPLE THREAT IN PLANNING. MAKING AN
15 ENDLESSLY EVOLVING SET OF PROGRAMS. WHEREAS AFTER TAKING
16 TALENTS TO THE INTERSECTION OF TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE
17 THERESE WORKED AS A PROJECT MANAGER FOR TRANSPORTATION FOR
18 LIVABLE COMMUNITIES STATIONARY PLANNING AND PRIORITY
19 DEVELOPMENT PLANNING PROGRAMS CONDUCTED CORRIDOR LEVEL
20 ANALYSIS TO DETERMINE COMPLIANCE WITH MTC'S REGIONAL TRANSIT
21 ORIENT THE DEVELOPMENT POLICY LAUNCHED THE PDA TECHNICAL
22 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM GUIDED PDA ASSESSMENT ISSUES ARISING FROM
23 ADOPTION OF THE LANDMARK 2013 PLANNED BAY AREA, AND LATER LED
24 A TEAM SHAPING THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY ADOPTED
25 BY THE COMMISSION IN 2022. AND WHEREAS THERESE WAS AN EQUALLY



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 PROLIFIC CONTRIBUTOR TO MTC'S CLIMATE PROGRAMS, GUIDING A
2 GROUP OF AGENCY STASH TO DEVELOP NEW STRATEGIES TO HELP
3 PLANNED BAY AREA AND ITS SUBSEQUENT INCARNATIONS TO MEET
4 MANDATES. WHEREAS UNSURPRISINGLY FOR SOMEONE'S WHOSE FIRST BAY
5 AREA JOB WAS PEDALING TRUCK BICYCLES THERESE'S TRANSITION INTO
6 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION MANAGED TO DEVELOP MTC'S ACTIVE
7 TRANSPORTATION PLAN. WHEREAS THERESE IS BELOVED BY COWORKERS
8 FOR A POSITIVE ATTITUDE, KEENNESS, AND EFFECTIVELY MANAGING
9 TEAMS AND PROJECTS LARGE AND SMALL. NOW THEREFORE, BE IT
10 RESOLVED THAT THE STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS PAY TRIBUTE TO
11 THERESE FOR HER DISTINGUISHED CAREER, INTEGRITY, AND EXTEND TO
12 THERESE AND HER KUNJAL AND THEIR SON DEVON BEST WISHES FOR A
13 HAPPY AND REWARDING RETIREMENT IN WHICH [INDISCERNIBLE] DRAGON
14 IS -- THIS IS WHAT I GET FOR GROWING UP IN CONNECTICUT --
15 DRAGON IS GIGANTIS, FAR A FIELD IN EXPLORATION OF NEW RECIPES.
16 THERESE I'M CURIOUS TO FIND OUT HOW BIG YOUR DOG IS AND DO YOU
17 HAVE ANY OTHER PARTING WORDS EVER WISDOM FOR THE COMMISSION?
18 [LAUGHTER] THERESE? I HAVE GOT A LOT OF QUESTIONS ON THIS.

19

20 **THERESE TRIVEDI:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK I HAVE STEPPED UP TO
21 THIS PODIUM MANY YEARS TO PRESENT ON MANY ITEMS IT'S SURREAL
22 BEING THE SUBJECT OF THE ITEM. WITH THAT SAID, I DO HAVE SOME
23 REMARKS TODAY. THE THEME OF MY REMARKS IS GRATITUDE. I'M
24 REALLY GRATEFUL FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE WORKED ON SUCH A
25 VARIETY OF PLANS, PROGRAMS, AND PROJECTS THAT HAVE SPANNED



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ACROSS TRANSPORTATION, LAND USE, AND HOUSING, THE ENVIRONMENT,
2 AND THE ECONOMY. I HAVE REALLY VALUED THE DIVERSITY OF THE
3 ASSIGNMENTS THAT I HAVE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO WORK ON, ALL
4 WITH THE INTENTION OF SERVING THE BAY AREA AND MAKING IT A
5 BETTER PLACE. WHAT HAS MADE THIS WORK EVEN MORE MEANINGFUL FOR
6 ME IS MY COLLEAGUES. I DON'T THINK THERE IS A COLLECTION OF
7 SUCH SMART, DEDICATED, PASSIONATE, AND KIND COLLEAGUES AS
8 THOSE THAT I HAVE HAD THE PLEASURE OF WORKING WITH IN MY TIME
9 AT MTC ABAG. I'M MORE THAN GRATEFUL THAT I HAVE HAD THE CHANCE
10 TO WORK WITH THEM. I HAVE ALSO VALUED THE WORKING
11 RELATIONSHIPS THAT I HAVE DEVELOPED WITH STAFF FROM THE MANY
12 JURISDICTIONS TRANSIT AGENCIES PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS THAT
13 I HAVE WORKED WITH OVER THE YEARS. THE INPUT THEY PROVIDED ON
14 OUR WORK ALWAYS MADE IT STRONGER. AND, FINALLY, I'M GRATEFUL
15 FOR THE COMMISSION, YOU AND YOUR PREDECESSORS. I APPRECIATE
16 THAT YOU HAVE BEEN UP FOR TAKING ON THE REGION'S CHALLENGES
17 AND OPEN TO STAFF'S OFTEN CREATIVE PROPOSALS ON HOW TO DO SO.
18 I THINK THIS CONTRIBUTES TO WHY OTHER REGIONS OFTEN LOOK TO
19 THE BAY AREA FOR HOW TO SOLVE THEIR OWN TRANSPORTATION LAND
20 USE AND CLIMATE ISSUES. I WISH YOU ALL WELL IN CARRYING ON THE
21 GOOD WORK. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, THERESE. CONGRATULATIONS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ON YOUR RETIREMENT AND MAY YOU FIND MANY HAPPY TRAILS AHEAD
2 AND ALL THOSE THINGS THAT WERE INTRODUCED EARLIER. I STILL
3 DON'T UNDERSTAND. BUT, I WILL FIND OUT AFTER THE FACT. MAY I
4 HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION 4738? OKAY.
5 WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. ANDERSEN AND ASHCRAFT --
6 MASHCRAFT -- [LAUGHTER] I'M COMBINING YOUR NAMES. MASHBURN.
7 SORRY. OKAY. THIS IS GOING TO BE A ROUGH MORNING. I NEED A
8 LITTLE MORE CAFFEINE, I THINK. MASHBURN. OKAY. NOW, WITH THAT
9 ALL CLARIFIED. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

10

11 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** WE NEED TO TECHNICALLY CHECK FOR
12 PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
17 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. I SEE NO RAISED HANDS AND NO ONE HAS
18 APPROACHED THE PODIUM FOR THIS ITEM. WITH THAT ROLL CALL.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PLEASE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. CHAIR NOACK.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

6

7 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

10

11 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?

14

15 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

18

19 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

22

23 **PAT BURT:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES FLEMING?

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE IS ABSENT.

7 -- IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

8

9 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN?

12

13 **MITCH MASHBURN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR IS ABSENT. MILEY?

16

17 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

24 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I THOUGHT MAYBE YOU COULD
2 COMBINE ASHCRAFT AND MASHBURN'S VOTE INTO ONE. [LAUGHTER]

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I DON'T THINK KATHLEEN WOULD LET ME.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** NO, NOT. SORRY. STILL APOLOGIZE APOLOGIZING.
7 I WILL BE APOLOGIZING FOR THAT FOR A WHILE. ITEM 4B IS THE
8 PROPOSED 2026 MTC CALENDAR OF STANDING MEETINGS. YOU SHOULD
9 HAVE RECEIVED THE 2026 MTC CALENDAR OF STANDING MEETINGS. IT
10 WAS SENT BY KIMBERLY WARD LAST NIGHT. NOTE THAT IT WILL BE
11 DARK IN JULY INSTEAD OF RATHER THAN IN AUGUST. I'M SO GLAD YOU
12 CAN BE CHEERING SOMETHING I DID. OKAY. WHICH IS -- RATHER THAN
13 AUGUST, WHICH HAS BEEN THE CASE IN THE PAST. I HOPE THIS
14 CHANGE WILL BETTER ACCOMMODATE SUMMER PLANS AND HELP US
15 ESTABLISHING QUORUMS OVER THE SUMMER. SO, ALL BETTER SHOW UP
16 IN AUGUST NOW. JUST SAYING THAT. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER
17 THAT WOULD LIKE TO HAVE A COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? NO? EXCEPT FOR
18 THE YAHOO'S EARLIER. OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS
19 ITEM?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, NO
22 RAISED HANDS, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. WONDERFUL. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT
25 WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 4C WHICH IS THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP RECAP.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 AND I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU ALL FOR PARTICIPATING IN THE
2 OCTOBER 22nd, 23rd COMMISSION WORKSHOP AND APPRECIATE YOU ALL
3 COMING OUT TO CONTRA COSTA COUNTY FOR THAT. APPRECIATE THE
4 TIME EACH OF YOU DEVOTED TO PREPARATION, PARTICIPATION, AND A
5 LOT OF ROBUST DISCUSSION. GIVEN A NUMBER OF NEW COMMISSIONERS,
6 I THOUGHT IT WAS VALUABLE TO START WITH A REFRESHER OF PLANNED
7 BAY AREA WHICH SERVES AS OUR NORTH STAR AND SETS FORTH
8 STRATEGIES NEEDED TO ACHIEVE A BAY AREA THAT'S AFFORDABLE,
9 CONNECTED, DIVERSE, HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL. I THINK WE
10 HAVE SAID THAT -- THOSE TERMS QUITE A FEW THOSE TWO DAYS. THE
11 CLIPPER BAY PASS AND CLIPPER START ALLOWS US TO SEE HOW WE
12 TRANSLATE THE PLAN INTO POSITIVE OUTCOMES AND IMPROVE
13 AFFORDABILITY FOR RESIDENTS. DIALOGUE WAS ON LINKAGE TO
14 TRANSIT ORIENTED POLICY, BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM OBAG I
15 APPRECIATE THE BACKGROUND PROVIDE AND EVOLUTION OF MTC'S ROLE
16 AND USE OF INCENTIVES TO SUPPORT THE VIBRANT COMMUNITIES NEAR
17 OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. PROPOSED PATH FORWARD IS BALANCED
18 MAINTAINS OUR FRAMEWORK RESPONSIVE TO STATE LAW ESTABLISHES
19 2028 DATE TO REWARD PROGRESS THROUGH AN INCENTIVE PROGRAM AND
20 KEEPS MOMENTUM MOVING IN THE ABAG FORUM. STAFF WILL WALK
21 THROUGH THIS IN MORE DETAIL LATER ON THE AGENDA. ANY
22 COMMISSIONERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT AT THIS TIME? WE'LL BE
23 DISCUSSING IT AT 10A. OR ANYTHING ELSE ABOUT THE WORKSHOP? IS
24 THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT?
25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS NO ONE HAS
2 APPROACHED THE PODIUM, AND, YEAH. NOTHING IN WRITING. THANK
3 YOU.

4
5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY GREAT. THANKS. ITEM 4D. I'M DOING A LOT
6 OF TALKING THIS MORNING. SO, THESE ARE THE EMC POLL RESULTS
7 AND UPCOMING RELATIONS TO THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. SB63
8 WIENER ARREGUIN AUTHORIZES THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE
9 TO BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT IN NOVEMBER 2026. AND THE COUNTIES
10 OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO, AND SANTA
11 CLARA COUNTIES. TO TEST SUPPORT ON OVERALL ATTITUDES REGARDING
12 A POTENTIAL TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE, THE EMC RESEARCH
13 CONDUCTED A POLL OF 2800 BAY AREA VOTERS AND THE FIVE SB63
14 COUNTIES IN OCTOBER. IN SHORT THE POLL FOUND THAT 56% OF
15 VOTERS ACROSS THE FIVE COUNTIES SUPPORTED THE MEASURE AFTER
16 HEARING THE BALLOT QUESTION WITHOUT ANY ADDITIONAL
17 INFORMATION. THE JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE RECEIVED A FULL
18 REPORT ON THE POLL RESULTS AND MORE INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE
19 ONLINE. LOOKING FORWARD I HAVE ASKED THAT STAFF AGENDAIZE A
20 DISCUSSION OF THE POLL RESULTS AND OTHER SB63 IMPLEMENTATION
21 ACTIVITIES FOR OUR DECEMBER COMMISSION MEETING. THIS TIMING
22 WILL SET THE TABLE FOR NEAR-TERM ACTIONS INCLUDING STANDING UP
23 THE PUBLIC TRANSIT REVIEW MEASURE DISTRICT IN EARLY JANUARY
24 2026. AS A REMINDER, THE DISTRICT IS GOVERNED BY THE SAME
25 BOARD AS MTC, TO GETTING A NEW HAT, WITH A NEW SET OF



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 RESPONSIBILITIES. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO
2 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AT THIS TIME? ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC
3 COMMENTS?

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. NO
6 ONE HAS THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM, AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED
7 THE PODIUM.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THE THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA
10 ITEM FIVE WHICH IS THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. AND
11 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CARINA LIEU, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE
12 REPORT? IS CARINA HERE? NOT HERE?

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SHE WAS SUPPOSED TO BE IN THE ZOOM
15 SPACE. SHE IS NOT, SO WE CAN GO AHEAD AND MOVE ON.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE'LL MOVE ON. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
18 REPORT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR
19 REPORT?

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH, GOOD MORNING. I AM HERE. GOOD MORNING
22 COMMISSIONERS ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I WANTED TO
23 GO THROUGH A FEW UPDATES THAT REALLY INVOLVE A LOT OF YOU IN
24 TERMS OF TRAVEL. I THINK WE SUCCESSFULLY MANAGED TO SUPPORT
25 SEVERAL OF YOU ON VARIOUS TRIPS. THE FIRST I WANT TO MENTION



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 IS THE 30th ANNIVERSARY OF THE IMPACT TRANSIT PLUS COMMUNITY
2 CONFERENCE, FORMERLY KNOWN AS RAIL REVOLUTION THAT WAS IN
3 PORTLAND WE HAD AHN, BURT, PAPAN ATTEND SUPPORTED BY CHIEF
4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR ALIX BOCKELMAN AND HAD STAFF UP THERE THAT
5 WERE PRESENTING ON THINGS YOU WILL BE TALKING ABOUT TODAY OUR
6 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, IMPLEMENTATION, AND ALSO
7 SOME OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COLLABORATION. I
8 BELIEVE I HEARD FROM A LOT OF YOU THAT IT WAS A REALLY GOOD
9 TRIP. AND I'M GLAD IT WENT WELL. A FEW OF US ALSO WENT DOWN TO
10 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA ALONG WITH CHAIR NOACK, COMMISSIONERS
11 JOHN-BAPTISTE, RAMOS, SHAW, AND THEN THE FREQUENT FLYER, ALIX
12 BOCKELMAN, ALSO SHOWED UP DOWN THERE. WE HAD DANIEL SAVER TO
13 ATTEND THE CALIFORNIA REGIONAL HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY'S
14 EXCHANGE IN LONG BEACH AND IT REALLY IS, I THINK, BUILDING ON
15 THE WORK THAT WE HAVE DONE AND BUILDING ON OUR TRIPS TO VIENNA
16 WE NOW HAVE RELATIONSHIPS WITH THE THREE RHFAS IN CALIFORNIA
17 ONE IS FROM LONG BEACH -- SORRY -- LA, SAN DIEGO, AND
18 OURSELVES. IT REALLY WAS DESIGNED TO COMMUNICATE STRATEGIES
19 AND LEARN LESSONS FROM EACH OTHER, AND REALLY CONTINUE TO
20 STRENGTHEN RELATIONSHIPS AND EXPLORE OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE CAN
21 ALL CONTRIBUTE TO STATE ADVOCACY. I THINK IT WAS A REAL WELL-
22 RECEIVED TRIP. AND I KNOW THEY WORKED US HARD. SPEAKING OF
23 WORKING HARD, WE HAVE COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND LISA KLEIN
24 BACK NOW FROM THEIR ASIA APTA STUDY MISSION WHERE THEY LOOKED
25 AT SERVICE DELIVER MODELS TECHNICAL ADVANCES, AND IMPROVEMENTS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 IN COST EFFICIENCY AND SAFETY THINGS WE'RE LOOKING AT IN OUR
2 REGIONAL MEASURE WORK AND REGION NAT NETWORK MANAGEMENT AS
3 WELL THEY WERE ALSO SUPPORTED BY AC TRANSIT DIRECTOR JOEL
4 YOUNG AND VTA GENERAL MANAGER CAROLYN GONOT. SO, WE LOOK
5 FORWARD TO HAD OTHER FROM THEM. FINALLY, IN TERMS OF THE
6 TRAVEL, PRESIDENT RAMOS, WHO IS ALSO, OBVIOUSLY, COMMISSIONER
7 RAMOS, WENT DOWN TO THE CALCOG BOARD MEETING ALONG WITH MATT
8 MALONEY. REALLY, I THINK THE STRENGTH THERE WITH CALCOG IS THE
9 WORK THAT WE'RE PLANNING ON, THE MODERNIZATION OF SB 375, IS A
10 STATE ISSUE. AND, SO, WE WERE GLAD TO HAVE HER REPRESENTATION,
11 ALONG WITH MATT DOWN THERE. MOVING ON TO ONE ITEM, I THINK YOU
12 ALL ENJOY OUR SWEEPSTAKES. THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS
13 GRANT PROGRAM IS NOW ACCEPTING APPLICATIONS FOR PROJECTS TO
14 ACQUIRE ENHANCE, OR IMPROVE DESIGNATED PRIORITY CONSERVATIVE -
15 - CONSERVATION AREAS IN THE REGION. THERE IS \$8 MILLION IN
16 THIS POOL. THERE WILL BE GRANTS FOR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS,
17 TRIBES, AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS, AS WELL AS OTHER
18 APPLICANTS. THE APPLICATION WINDOW CLOSES DECEMBER 19TH. SO,
19 PLEASE BE ACTIVE IN THAT SPACE SO THAT WE CAN DO A GOOD JOB AT
20 SELECTING THE RIGHT PROJECTS. FINALLY, I TOO WANT TO THANK YOU
21 ALL FOR THE WORKSHOP BOTH STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS. I THOUGHT
22 IT WAS A REAL ROBUST CONVERSATION. WE HOPE WE ADDRESSED A LOT
23 OF THE THINGS THAT ARE CONVERGING TOWARDS SOLUTIONS THAT WORK.
24 TWO RIBBON CUTTINGS THAT I WANT TO MENTION TO CLOSE OUT. A BIG
25 THANKS TO COMMISSIONER MILEY AND AMBUEHL WHO WITHSTOOD THE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 RAIN OUT IN I-680, HIGHWAY 684 INTERCHANGE IN SUNOL GRADE. IT
2 WAS MEASURE 23 TOLL MONEY PUT TO WORK. I THINK IT WAS A NICE
3 EVENT WITH CALTRANS AND ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
4 COMMISSION SHOWING THEIR WARES. AND THEN FINALLY COMMISSIONER
5 JOHN-BAPTISTE AND I HAD THE CHANCE TO CHRISTEN THE ZELOPHUS
6 FERRY OUT THERE. SHE CHRISTENED IT WITH BREAKING A BOTTLE OF
7 CHAMPAGNE OVER THE BOW GIVING GOOD LUCK AS I UNDERSTAND. THAT
8 WAS A NICE EVENT AS WELL HERE ON THE BAY. THAT'S MY REPORT
9 HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS IF WITH THERE ARE SOME.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM
12 COMMISSIONERS? YES, COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. I WAS JUST WONDERING,
15 THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR THE IMPACT CONFERENCE. WE LEARNED A LOT.
16 HOW DO WE SHARE WITH THE REST OF THE COMMISSION? SEVERAL OF US
17 WERE VERY IMPRESSED WITH THE SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING. THE PILOT
18 PORTLAND HAD GOING, I THINK IT COULD BENEFIT MANY
19 JURISDICTIONS DURING UPCOMING MAJOR EVENTS, LIKE SUPERBOWL AND
20 FIFA AND ALL OF THAT. DO WE HAVE A WAY OF DOING THAT?

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** LET ME SUGGEST, YOU ALL HAD EXECUTIVE
23 SUPERVISION, I'LL WORK WITH EACH OF MY EXECUTIVES AND CONFER
24 WITH ALL TRAVEL AND TRY TO PRODUCE SOMETHING THE COMMISSIONERS
25 CAN READ SOMETHING EFFICIENT PROBABLY ONE OR TWO PAGES



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SOMETHING PEOPLE UNDERSTAND WHAT WAS LEARNED.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH, IF IT'S VERY SIMPLE MANY OF US COULD BENEFIT
4 FROM THAT. AND YES MANY OF US DID HAVE GUIDES AND COMPANIONS
5 THROUGHOUT THE TRIP. THANK YOU.

6

7 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GREAT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANYONE ELSE? OKAY. ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN
10 COMMENTS OR ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS AT ALL?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS AT ALL. HOWEVER I DO
13 SEE COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA HAS HER HAND RAISED.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH SORRY. I FORGOT TO LOOK AT THE TV SCREEN.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST WANTED TO THANK
22 YOU, ALL MY COLLEAGUES, AND STAFF FOR ALLOWING ME TO TAKE THE
23 STUDY TOUR TO SINGAPORE, SEOUL, AND TOKYO. IT WAS GREAT TO
24 HAVE LISA KLEIN WITH ME, AS WELL AS CAROLYN GONOT. I'M WORKING
25 WITH LISA ON HOW TO COMPILE A SUMMARY. IT'S HARD TO CAPTURE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ALL THAT WE SAW. ACTUALLY AT APTA, I BELIEVE WE'LL BE PUTTING
2 A SUMMARY REPORT TOGETHER. I LOOK FORWARD TO OPPORTUNITY TO
3 PRESENT THAT TO YOU ALL. MY TAKEAWAY WAS THAT -- YOU HAVE
4 HEARD ME SAY THIS BEFORE, I JUST THINK IT'S REALLY BENEFICIAL
5 TO TAKE THESE STUDY TOURS TO SEE BEST PRACTICES ELSEWHERE. AND
6 I REALLY BELIEVE ASIA IS AT THE TOP OF THE TRANSPORTATION
7 GAME. AND I HAVE BEEN TALKING WITH THE APTA FOLKS TO SEE IF,
8 ONE, MORE ELECTED OFFICIALS COULD GO ON THESE TRIPS. IT WAS
9 VERY MUCH A LOT OF TRIP GENERAL MANAGER HIGH-LEVEL FOLKS WHO
10 ARE WONDERFUL, BUT THEY'RE REALLY THE EXPERTS AND I THINK
11 FOLKS, LIKE ME, YOU KNOW, THE ELECTED'S, THE LAY PEOPLE WHO
12 MAY NOT BE AS WELL VERSED IN TRANSPORTATION, CAN REALLY GAIN A
13 LOT. AND AS POLICY MAKERS, TOO, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE THE
14 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE SOME POLICY CHANGES THAT I THINK REALLY
15 COULD TRANSFORM OUR -- OUR LEVEL OF DISCUSSION AND VISION FOR
16 WHAT TRANSPORTATION TRANSIT COULD BE IN THE UNITED STATES. SO
17 I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR ALLOWING ME TO GO, AND I HOPE THAT WE
18 CAN CONTINUE TO ENCOURAGE AND SUPPORT OTHER COMMISSIONERS TO
19 ATTEND THESE TYPE OF STUDY TOURS. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SORRY FOR NOT SEEING YOUR
22 HANDLED EARLIER. ANYBODY ELSE? OH YEAH. COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

23

24 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WAS INSPIRED BY
25 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, AND WITH THE TRIP WE WERE ABLE TO TAKE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 IN DECEMBER FOR THE HOUSING STUDY, WE'LL CIRCLE BACK WITH
2 INFORMATION FOR THE COMMISSION MORE BROADLY. IT WAS TREMENDOUS
3 HE HELPFUL FOR ME, IN ORDER TO LOOK AT THE WAYS THAT OTHER
4 JURISDICTIONS ARE DOING THINGS AROUND HOUSING, AND, REALLY,
5 EYE OPENING IN TERMS OF THE WAYS THAT I THINK WE CAN MOVE INTO
6 THE FUTURE IN THE WAY -- THROUGH BAHFA. SO, WE'LL CIRCLE BACK
7 WITH A PRESENTATION IN THE FUTURE. BUT I DIDN'T WANT TO LEAVE
8 YOU ALL HANGING.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU. OKAY. MATCH UP PUBLIC
11 COMMENT. JUST TO DOUBLE CHECK.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOTHING WRITTEN NO HAND RAISED AND NO
14 SPEAKER CARDS.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ITEM SEVEN IS COMMISSIONER
17 COMMENTS. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER WITH SOME GENERAL COMMENTS
18 OR ANNOUNCEMENTS TO MAKE? NO? OKAY. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM
19 EIGHT, THE CONSENT CALENDAR, INCLUDES ITEMS 8A THROUGH 8D. DO
20 I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND? ARE THERE ANY OTHER --

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** SO MOVED.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY MOTION FROM CANEPA AND SECOND FROM
25 ANDERSEN. I GOT THAT RIGHT, DIDN'T I?



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** YOU DID.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT GOOD. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

5

6 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** --

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH PUBLIC COMMENT I CAUGHT MYSELF ON THAT
9 ONE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
12 FOR THIS ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
13 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. NOW ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABSOLUTELY. CHAIR NOACK.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?



1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

9

10 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

13

14 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

17

18 **PAT BURT:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES .

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE IS ABSENT.

4 MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

5

6 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY?

9

10 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

17

18 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

21 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW MOVE ON TO THE

24 COMMITTEE REPORTS. AGENDA ITEM NINE IS PROGRAMMING AND

25 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING, PLEASE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 GIVE REPORT.

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, YOU IT CHAIR. THE PROGRAMMING AND

4 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON NOVEMBER 12TH AND REFERRED FOUR

5 ITEMS TO THE COMMISSIONS FOR APPROVAL; THREE OF WHICH WERE ON

6 CONSENT CALENDAR AND THE OTHER ONE IS AS FOLLOWS. AGENDA ITEM

7 9A, MTC REGIONAL RESOLUTION NUMBER 4604 REVISED, AND 4650

8 REVISED, REVISION TO THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT

9 AND COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE AND EMPOWERMENT PROGRAMS.

10 REVISIONS TO REAP TWO AND CARE PROGRAM INCLUDING AWARDING 1.5

11 MILLION IN POWER BUILDING ENGAGEMENT PROGRAMS AND

12 REPROGRAMMING 1.7 WITH REAP EXPENDITURE PLAN TO ENSURE ALL

13 REAP TWO FUNDS CAN BE SPENT BY THE STATEWIDE EXPENDITURE

14 DEADLINE. I MOVE APPROVAL OF RESOLUTIONS 4604 REVISED AND 4650

15 REVISED AND WOULD CERTAINLY APPRECIATE A SECOND.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMENTS? --

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MOVED.

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RAMOS. DO WE HAVE ANY

22 QUESTIONS OR DISCUSSION FROM THE COMMISSION?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** PLEASE?

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE HAD A ROBUST DISCUSSION,
4 AND I APPRECIATE THAT. IT WAS KIND OF A LOPSIDED
5 RECOMMENDATION. AND WE TALK ABOUT REGIONALISM IN THAT ONE
6 COUNTY DID NOT RECEIVE ANY FUNDING FROM CARE, BUT WE
7 UNDERSTAND THERE IS ADDITIONAL FUNDING AVAILABLE. SO, I WOULD
8 LIKE TO BE ABLE TO REQUEST THAT THE ADDITIONAL FUNDING MAY
9 LEAD TO AN AMENDMENT IN THE FUTURE THAT WE CAN MORE EQUITABLY
10 DISTRIBUTE THE FUNDING, IF THAT IS ALL POSSIBLE. SO, I GUESS
11 I'M MAKING AN AMENDMENT TO THE CURRENT MOTION.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE AMENDMENT IS.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THE AMENDMENT IS THAT WE LEAVE OPEN THE ADDITIONAL
16 FUNDING THAT'S GOING HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE, THAT ALL COUNTIES
17 CAN BE REPRESENTED IN RECEIVING FUNDING.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WONT THAT BE WHEN WE GET TO THAT POINT?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** I DON'T KNOW IF WILL BE INTRANET IN HOW THEY'RE
22 GOING TO DISTRIBUTE THE ADDITION WILL FUNDING IN THE FUTURE.
23 IF WE CAN FIND THAT OUT, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALIX?



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. SO THERE IS \$1
3 MILLION ADDITIONAL GIVEN HOW MUCH DEMAND AND INTEREST THERE
4 WAS IN THIS PROGRAM WE HAVE \$1 MILLION ADDITIONALLY THAT WE
5 WILL BE RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION WITHIN A FEW MONTHS AS
6 EARLY AS JANUARY TO RECOMMEND PROJECTS. SO, AS PART OF THAT, I
7 THINK WE WOULD BE LOOKING AT OUR CRITERIA. WE CAN ALSO
8 CONSIDER GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE IF THAT'S -- WE ALLEGES TRY TO
9 LOOK AT THAT. SO, WE CAN CERTAINLY DO THAT.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** THEN, IF I MAY? PLEASE?

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEP.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE APPROVAL OF THIS WITH THE
16 AMENDMENT THAT GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE IS INCLUDED IN THIS FUNDING
17 PROCEDURE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** MADAM CHAIR --

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HOLD ON O. I HAVE GOT ANDY.

22

23 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AND I HAVE A QUESTION TOO.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANDY?



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONERS, I APPRECIATE THE NEED FOR
3 GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE, AND WE DO DO THAT. I URGE YOU, THOUGH, TO
4 CONSIDER NOT RESTRICTING THESE KINDS OF THINGS. FIRST OF ALL,
5 THERE WAS MONEY FOR ALL NINE COUNTIES, WHEN YOU TOOK A LOOK AT
6 THE PROGRAM. WE ALSO REVIEWED APPLICATIONS AND APPLICATIONS
7 COME IN VARIOUS STRENGTHS AND VARIOUS NUMBERS. AND I DO
8 CAUTION YOU ON PUTTING RESTRICTIONS ON HOW THE MONEY GETS
9 SPENT AND LOOKING AT THE POTS IN VERY SMALL ELEMENTS. YOU GUYS
10 MANAGE A LOT OF MONEY. AND I THINK, OVERALL, WE DO A VERY GOOD
11 JOB OF GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE. SOMETIMES YOU DO HELP DIFFERENT
12 PARTS OF THE REGION DIFFERENTLY AND THAT'S PART OF THE
13 BUSINESS OF DOING GOOD REGIONAL WORK. I WOULD BE CAUTIOUS
14 ABOUT THAT AMENDMENT.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

17

18 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** MY QUESTION IS, SIMPLY, WHERE IS THIS
19 ADDITIONAL MILLION DOLLARS COMING FROM? WAS THAT LEFT OVER
20 BECAUSE IT WASN'T EXPENDED? WHERE IS IT COMING FROM?

21

22 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THE CARE PROGRAM 1.5 MILLION AWARDS IS COMING
23 FROM A LARGER PROGRAM THAT HAS SEVERAL COMPONENTS SO THE
24 MILLION DOLLARS IS JUST BEING SHIFTED FROM A DIFFERENT
25 ELEMENT, BECAUSE AS ALIX STATED, THE INTEREST IN THIS, THIS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 LATEST CALL FOR PROJECTS. SO, IT'S COMING FROM WITHIN THE CARE
2 PROGRAM. WE'RE JUST KIND OF SHIFTING FUND A BIT.

3

4 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** OKAY.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH, I JUST WANTED TO ASK
9 -- I ASSUMED THERE WERE THRESHOLD CRITERIA THAT THESE GRANTS,
10 OR THESE APPLICATIONS HAD TO MEET. IS THAT RIGHT? WAS THAT
11 PART OF THE PROCESS FOR RECOMMENDING PROJECTS FOR FUNDING?

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YES, VICE CHAIR. THAT IS CORRECT. AND IN THAT
14 PRESENTATION, WE OUTLINED AT BROAD SCALE WHAT THOSE WERE.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. I'M
17 GOING TO WEIGH IN AND THINK WE HAVE TO BE COGNIZANT OF MEETING
18 THRESHOLD CRITERIA NOT EVERY COUNTY CAN DO THAT EVERY TIME.
19 MINE CERTAINLY HAS NOT. I THINK GEOGRAPHIC EQUITY IS IMPORTANT
20 WE'LL TALK ABOUT THIS AFTER LATER TODAY AND OTHER FUNDING
21 SOURCES BUT I THINK WE NEED TO MAINTAIN CRITERIA FOR AWARDING
22 FUNDING.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M GETTING CAUGHT UP ON
2 THIS. SO, YOU CAN TALK ABOUT, SO, ALL THE COUNTIES WERE
3 AWARDED THE DOLLARS WITHIN THIS BUCKET, AND SAN MATEO COUNTY,
4 I ASSUME, WAS THE COUNTY THAT WAS NOT. IS THAT CORRECT?

5

6 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YOU KNOW, AGAIN, WHEN I WAS SPEAKING, I THINK
7 WE DO LOOK FOR BENEFIT AROUND THE REGION WITH THESE PROGRAMS.
8 I THINK AT THE PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE, I SPOKE TO THIS, THERE
9 IS AN ATTACHMENT TO THIS ITEM, ATTACHMENT B THAT TALKS ABOUT
10 THE AWARDS, AND IT DOES TALK ABOUT THE COUNTIES FOR THESE
11 COMMUNITY -- THE CBOS THAT ARE BEING AWARDED, AND TWO OF THEM
12 DO WORK IN SAN MATEO. SO, JUST TO SPEAK TO SAN MATEO
13 SPECIFICALLY. I THINK THAT MAYBE THE CONCERN THAT'S BEEN
14 RAISED IS THAT IN THOSE CASES, IN ONE OF THEM, THE BENEFIT IS
15 SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA BY ONE OF THE GRANTS, AND I THINK
16 THE OTHER ONE, IT'S SAN MATEO, THIS IS ON PARTNERSHIPS AND
17 COLLABORATION, IT'S ALAMEDA AND SAN MATEO. AGAIN, SAN MATEO IS
18 REFLECTED IN WITH THESE AWARDS IN TERMS OF BENEFIT. I WANT TO
19 MAKE SURE THAT WAS CLEAR FOR THE RECORD. THERE IS A LOT MORE
20 DETAIL FOR THOSE OF YOU THAT WANT TO LOOK AT ATTACHMENT B
21 WHICH SHOWS INDIVIDUAL GRANTS AND CBOS AND THE TYPE OF WORK
22 THAT THEY'RE DOING.

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION WHAT I
25 HAVE HEARD FROM YOU IS THAT SAN MATEO COUNTY WHILE NOT



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 OFFICIALLY AWARDED AS A COUNTY WILL RECEIVE THE BENEFITS OF
2 THESE TWO OTHER COUNTIES THAT ARE WORKING IN PARTNERSHIP IN
3 SAN MATEO COUNTY. IS THAT CORRECT?

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CORRECT.

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'M FINE WITH US MOVING FORWARD WITH THE
8 RESOLUTION, AS IS. IT MAKES SENSE TO ME. I WOULD SAY, AS WE
9 MOVE FORWARD, THIS TYPE OF CLARIFICATION, I THINK, IS
10 IMPORTANT. AND FOR STAFF TO REALLY, SORT OF, GET OUT AHEAD OF
11 IT, SO, WITH THAT, I'LL MOVE THE ITEM AS IS.

12

13 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** IF I MAY INTERVENE, WE HAVE A COUPLE
14 OF POTENTIALLY COMPETING MOTIONS. WE HAD THE ORIGINAL MOTION
15 ON THE FLOOR, AND THEN COMMISSIONER PAPAN SOUGHT TO AMEND IT.
16 MAYBE WE CAN ASK THE ORIGINAL MOVER AND SECOND IF THEY WANT TO
17 MAKE THAT AMENDMENT? OR IF THEY WANT TO PROCEED WITH THEIR
18 ORIGINAL MOTION?

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH.

21

22 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** MAY I ADD?

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GO AHEAD.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I THINK GIVEN COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONER
2 MOULTON-PETERS AND HOW THIS WORKS FROM A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE
3 THAT I THINK WE SHOULD MOVE FORWARD WITH THE MOTION AS IS, AND
4 THAT THE ORIGINAL MOTION -- ONLY MOTION ON THE FLOOR ACTUALLY
5 WITH THE SECOND, AND WE'LL MAKE SURE IN THE FUTURE THAT WE'LL
6 CONTINUE TO DO OUR BEST, THAT THIS IS WHAT IT IS FOR TODAY.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DID YOU WANT TO --

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** SORRY. YEAH. I JUST WANT TO BE CLEAR WITH MY
11 COLLEAGUES HERE, THERE WERE JOINT GRANTS HERE, RELATED TO
12 OTHER CANDIDATES. IT WAS THE APPEARANCE, OVERALL, AS TO WHO
13 WAS ON THE REVIEW COMMITTEE THAT ONE COUNTY GOT FIVE. ANOTHER
14 -- INDIVIDUAL GRANTS, ANOTHER, 4, 3, 2, 2, 2 THROUGHOUT. SO
15 IT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO BE AWARE OF, MOVING FORWARD HERE,
16 THERE IS ADDITIONAL FUNDING, AND THAT THAT CONSIDERATION
17 CARRIES OVER IN THE FUTURE HERE. I'M FINE -- WE REALLY CAN'T
18 HAVE THESE APPEARANCES IF WE'RE TALKING REGIONALLY SPEAKING.
19 THESE ARE CBOS EVERY COUNTY HAS THEM. THEY'RE IMPORTANT TO
20 THOSE COUNTIES. IT'S NOT A LARGE SUM OF MONEY, BUT NEITHER WAS
21 ACCOMMODATING EACH COUNTY HERE. I HOPE WE CONSIDER THAT MOVING
22 FORWARD HERE. BECAUSE THE APPEARANCE IS NOT REGIONAL. SO,
23 AGAIN, I'M FINE WITH THIS MOVING FORWARD. DO I ASK FOR FURTHER
24 CONSIDERATION WITH THE ADDITIONAL FUNDING THAT WILL BECOME
25 AVAILABLE, THAT WE BE A LITTLE MORE EQUITABLE IN OUR



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 EVALUATION. AND I KNOW THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WAS NOT PART OF
2 THIS REVIEW BOARD, BUT WE NEED TO, AS AN AGENCY, LOOK MORE
3 CLOSELY AT HOW WE DO BUSINESS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

6

7 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. YES, I DEFINITELY
8 APPRECIATE REGIONALISM AND EQUITY. BUT I THINK THE MERITS OF
9 THE APPLICATIONS ARE REALLY THE PRIORITY, AND JUST, YOU KNOW,
10 MAKING SURE THAT THE APPLICATIONS MEET THE CRITERIA AND, YOU
11 KNOW, SCORE HIGH, BASED ON THE CRITERIA. AND ALSO NOTE THAT I
12 JUST TOOK A LOOK AT THE ATTACHMENT OF THE APPLICATION
13 SUPERVISOR WITH THERE IS ALSO JUST THE ISSUE OF NUMBERS,
14 LOOKING AT, LIKE, THE DIFFERENT COUNTIES OF, I NOTICED THAT
15 THERE WERE JUST A LOT MORE APPLICATIONS FROM OTHER COUNTIES
16 AND THAT ALSO MAY HAVE BEEN A FACTOR. IS MY CONCLUSION. SO, I
17 -- I'M HAPPY TO SUPPORT THE MOTION ON AS IT STANDS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. SO, FROM WHAT I'M GATHERING, VICTORIA,
20 YOU MADE A MOTION.

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS:** I AM THE SECOND ON THAT ORIGINAL MOTION.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THE ORIGINAL MOTION? I NEVER HEARD THAT
25 ORIGINAL SECOND. SO -- THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MELGAR? OH DID



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 YOU HAVE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?

2

3 **BELIA RAMOS:** I DID HAVE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS IN SUPPORT OF THE
4 ORIGINAL MOTION. I THINK WE COULD ALL BENEFIT FROM MOVING
5 FORWARD IN THE NEXT TRANCHE OF FUNDING, THAT WE UNDERSTAND
6 WHAT THAT CRITERIA IS. I DON'T BELIEVE IT NECESSARILY NEEDS TO
7 COME TO THE COMMISSION AS AN AGENDA ITEM, BUT, CERTAINLY,
8 THROUGH A ONE-WAY COMMUNICATION TO INFORM US WHAT -- WHAT IT
9 IS -- WHAT OUR OBJECTIVES ARE. AND -- AND I UNDERSTAND,
10 FREQUENTLY A SMALL COUNTY THAT OFTEN GETS LEFT OUT A LOT, I'M
11 GLAD TO JOIN WITH MY FRIENDS IN SAN MATEO IN THAT FEELING
12 RIGHT NOW. IT IS A TOUGH ONE, BECAUSE WE DO HAVE TO THINK MORE
13 REGIONALLY, AND WE ARE NOT ALWAYS GOING TO GET THAT
14 RECOGNITION IN IT. I THINK THAT THIS IS ALSO AN OPPORTUNITY,
15 AND WHAT PERHAPS IS NOT WELL CLARIFIED IN THESE FUNDING
16 RECOMMENDATIONS IS THE IMPORTANCE AND VALUE OF JOINT
17 APPLICATIONS AND CROSS JURISDICTIONAL APPLICATIONS. AND I SAY
18 THAT THROUGH THE LENS OF LOOKING AT SOME OF THESE, FOR
19 EXAMPLE, THE BAY AREA COUNCIL THAT HAS -- AND I HAVE RAISED
20 THIS AS WE HAVE MADE -- AS WE'RE LOOKING AT THE APPLICATIONS,
21 ALSO, FOR THE POLICY COMMISSION, THE BAY AREA COUNCIL LISTS
22 DOING WORK IN NAPA. I HAVE NEVER HAD AN INTERACTION AS A
23 COUNTY SUPERVISOR OF NAPA, THE BAY AREA COUNCIL. THEY MAY IN
24 FACT DO SOME WORK BUT IT DOESN'T TOUCH INTO NAPA. I REALLY
25 THINK THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO REINFORCE WHAT, IN



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 FACT, JOINT AND CROSS JURISDICTIONAL APPLICATIONS LOOK LIKE,
2 AND THE VALUE TO THE COMMISSION AND THE WORK THAT WE ARE
3 TRYING TO ACHIEVE. SO, I DO THINK THERE IS VALUE IN THE
4 COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE FROM THE REPRESENTATIVES OF SAN
5 MATEO ON HOW WE CAN IMPROVE THIS PROGRAM. BUT I DO SUPPORT
6 MOVING FORWARD ON THE MOTION TO TAKE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION,
7 MOVE THAT FORWARD, AND THEN TO FURTHER INFORM THIS PROCESS ON
8 THE NEXT GO ROUND, WE CAN ALWAYS ENHANCE THE FUNDING. AND I
9 THINK WHAT THIS SHOWS IS THAT THE NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS SHOWS
10 A TREMENDOUS NEED AND DESIRE. WE HAVE SEEN THIS. WE HAVE HEARD
11 FROM THE NON-PROFITS ABOUT -- THEY HAVE PUT IN A LOT OF WORK
12 FOR THESE APPLICATIONS. WE DON'T HAVE THE MONEY TO FUND
13 EVERYTHING. AND, SO, I THINK THIS IS A CALL TO ACTION ON OUR
14 PART TO REFINE THAT PROCESS. THE CRITERIA AND THE OBJECTIVES.
15 SO THAT WE CAN BE MINDFUL AND JUDICIOUS ABOUT THE TIME THAT
16 EVERYONE SPENDS ON THIS GOING FORWARD. MY SECOND STANCE.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

19

20 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU. I'MING SUPPORTING THE ORIGINAL
21 MOTION. BUT I HEAR THE FRUSTRATION IN COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S
22 COMMENTS. AND I, SORT OF, WANT TO ASK, BECAUSE, AS YOU KNOW,
23 I'M A MEMBER OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE.
24 THIS IS EQUITY MACHINE. SO, I UNDERSTAND WANTING TO SPREAD IT
25 AROUND THE REGION EQUITABLY. BUT ALSO IT'S EQUITY MONEY FOR



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 THOSE COMMUNITIES. SO I'M WONDERING HOW DO WE MAKE SURE THAT
2 IT'S BOTH GEOGRAPHICALLY DISTRIBUTED BUT ALSO THAT COUNTIES
3 SUPPORT THEIR CBOS DOING EQUITY WORK IN AN ADEQUATE WAY.
4 BECAUSE IF THEY DON'T THOSE CBOS ARE AT A DISADVANTAGE, SO HOW
5 DO WE HOLD THOSE COUNTIES ACCOUNTABLE AS WELL. IS IT TECHNICAL
6 ASSISTANCE? BY CLARIFYING THE RULES, AS COMMISSIONER RAMOS
7 JUST STATED. I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT IT'S BOTH, RIGHT? IT'S
8 BOTH WE WANT GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION BUT ALSO THAT WE HAVE A
9 GOAL IN MIND WITH THIS MONEY THAT ACCOUNTABILITY TO MAKE SURE
10 THAT ALL COUNTIES ARE SUPPORTING THIS WORK ADEQUATELY IS ALSO
11 MET. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT THANK YOU. I WANT TO REAFFIRM ANDY'S
14 COMMENTS ABOUT THIS BODY, OR ALL THE BODIES, GIVE OUT A LOT OF
15 MONEY. AND THEY'RE NOT ALWAYS EQUITABLE. BOTH ON THE REVENUES
16 AND THE EXPENSE -- OR THE DISTRIBUTION SIDE. SO, THIS ISSUE
17 HAS BEEN RAISED SEVERAL TIMES EARLIER THIS YEAR AS WELL ON
18 OTHER TOPICS AND WE NEED TO BE MINDFUL THAT NOT EVERYTHING CAN
19 BE EQUITABLE ON A GEOGRAPHIC BASIS. BUT THAT WE'RE REALLY
20 FOCUSING ON WHAT WORKS BEST FOR THE ENTIRE REGION. SO.

21

22 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COULD I ADD ONE MORE THING? IN, SORT OF, A
23 SUBTLE PIECE, IT WASN'T MENTIONED BUT I WANT TO MENTION IT
24 THERE IS ALSO A QUALITY OF THE APPLICATION AND HOW LET
25 APPLICATION MEETS GUIDELINES THAT WERE PUT OUT THERE. YOU ALSO



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 HIRE PROFESSIONAL STAFF TO DO THE ANALYSIS ON THE CRITERIA AND
2 WE PARTNER WITH THE REGION WHEN WE SET UP THESE PANELS. WE DO
3 NOT DO THEM INTERNALLY, ALMOST NEVER DO WE DO THEM JUST
4 INTERNALLY.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WITH THAT, WE HAVE A MOTION
7 AND A SECOND. BUT IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? OOPS SORRY.

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** JUST MY MOTION, MY ITEM, IF YOU DON'T MIND
10 ONE LAST BEFORE WE CALL FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SURE. GO AHEAD.

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I WANT TO
15 CAUTION US AGAINST CONFLATING EQUITY WITH EVERYBODY GETTING
16 SOMETHING OR THE SAME THING. IT'S NOT WHAT EQUITY IS. EQUITY
17 IS WHAT EACH PARTY NEEDS. AND THAT'S NO COMMENTARY ON ANY ONE
18 COUNTY IN THIS SITUATION AND REGIONALISM ALSO NOT ABOUT
19 EVERYBODY GETTING SOMETHING IN EACH GO ROUND; IT'S ABOUT WHAT
20 THE REGION NEEDS. WITH THAT, WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. DO
21 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
24 THIS ITEM NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND THERE ARE NO
25 MEMBERS IN THE ZOOM SPACE.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** OKAY THANK YOU. PLEASE CALL FOR A VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SURE. CHAIR NOACK.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSON?

21

22 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

25



1 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

4

5 **PAT BURT:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE IS ABSENT.

16 MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

17

18 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR? COMMISSIONER MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES, AND THANK YOU FOR THE CONVERSATION.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
8 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU, ALL, VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE'LL NOW MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 10A WHICH
13 IS NEXT STEPS TRANSIT ORIENT THE COMMUNITIES POLICY AND OBAG
14 FOUR. ALIX, WILL YOU PLEASE PRESENT THIS ITEM?

15

16 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. AND THANK YOU FOR THE
17 INTRODUCTION EARLIER ON THIS ITEM. I'M GLAD THIS LAST ITEM GOT
18 YOU ALL -- YOU'RE ALL AWAKE, I CAN SEE THAT. YOU'RE ALL READY
19 FOR ROBUST DIALOGUE. IF THE TECH TEAM COULD BRING UP THE SLIDE
20 DECK, PLEASE? AND WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, THIS
21 ITEM IS A REVIEW AND REFLECTION ON KEY THEMES AND COMMISSION
22 FEEDBACK FROM THE WORKSHOP THAT WE HAD IN OCTOBER.

23 SPECIFICALLY RELATED TO THE UPCOMING ONE BAY AREA GRANT CYCLE
24 AND ASSOCIATED IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TOC POLICY. THIS SUMMARY

25 WILL LEAD INTO A DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED POLICY REFINEMENTS AND



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NEXT STEPS WHERE WE WILL BE ASKING FOR YOUR INPUT AND
2 DIRECTION PRIOR TO RETURNING TO THE COMMISSION FOR ACTION IN
3 EARLY 2026. NEXT SLIDE. AGAIN AS A BRIEF RECAP OF THE DETAILED
4 BACKGROUND INFORMATION PRESENTED AT THE WORKSHOP, ARE THE OBAG
5 PROGRAM IN THE TOC POLICY ARE INTERRELATED EFFORTS DESIGNED TO
6 IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA. THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM IS
7 OUR LONG-STANDING FRAMEWORK FOR INVESTING FLEXIBLE
8 TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS. WE EXPECT TO HAVE REDUCED AVAILABLE
9 CAPACITY FOR THE UPCOMING OBAG FOUR CYCLE DUE TO THE PREVIOUS
10 COMMITMENT TO SUSTAINING THROUGH THE SV 125 FRAMEWORK AND LOSS
11 OF COMPLEMENTARY STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS FOR REGIONAL
12 PROGRAMS. A KEY CONSIDERATION FOR THE COMMISSION IS HOW TO USE
13 THIS LIMITED CAPACITY TO CONTINUE TO ADVANCE OUR PLANNED BAY
14 AREA GOALS. THE TOC WAS ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION IN 2022 AND
15 ESTABLISHES STANDARDS FOR WELL CONNECTED MIXED USE COMMUNITIES
16 AROUND TRANSIT STATIONS. A KEY CONSIDERATION FOR THE
17 COMMISSION IS HOW TO LINK THIS NEW POLICY TO REGIONAL FUNDING
18 STARTING WITH THE OBAG FOUR CYCLE. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE
19 WORKSHOP, COMMISSIONERS EXPRESSED SUPPORT FOR REAFFIRMING
20 MTC'S LONG-TERM COMMITMENTS TO TOC POLICY GOALS, BUT ASK THAT
21 STAFF ADDRESS KEY CONCERNS WITH NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION.
22 SPECIFICALLY, WE HEARD REQUESTS FROM COMMISSIONERS AROUND
23 NEEDING MORE TIME FOR JURISDICTIONS TO DEMONSTRATE TOC
24 PROGRESS, INCLUDING COMPLETING WORK FUNDED BY RANT MTC GRANTS.
25 WE ALSO HEARD A LOT OF FEEDBACK ON HOUSING PROTECTION



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 POLICIES, INCLUDING REQUESTS TO ADAPT TO THE CURRENT POLICY
2 LANDSCAPE. FINALLY, COMMISSIONERS EMPHASIZED THE IMPORTANCE OF
3 ADDRESSING TRANSPORTATION NEEDS IN RURAL COMMUNITIES,
4 ESPECIALLY IN THE NORTH BAY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THE NEXT TWO
5 SLIDES RECAP THE WORKSHOP PROPOSALS AND COMMISSION FEEDBACK
6 FOR THE OBAG FOUR PROGRAM AND TOC POLICY IN MORE DETAIL. AND
7 WE'LL START WITH OBAG. SO, KEY ELEMENTS OF THE STAFF PROPOSAL
8 AT THE WORKSHOP INCLUDED TAKING THE SB125 COMMITMENT OFF THE
9 TOP OF THE OBAG FOUR PROGRAM AND DISTRIBUTING THE REMAINING
10 FUNDS, 50/50 BETWEEN THE COUNTY AND REGIONAL COMPONENTS IN
11 RECOGNITION OF THE SHARED NEED TO SUSTAIN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM
12 AND TO MAKE ROOM WITHIN THE REGIONAL HALF OF THE PROGRAM FOR A
13 TOC INCENTIVE SET ASIDE. THE STAFF PROPOSAL INCLUDED TWO
14 PRIMARY WAYS TO INCENTIVIZE TOC PROGRESS IN THE OBAG FOUR
15 CYCLE, PROVIDING TOC POINTS WITHIN THE COUNTY PROGRAM CALL FOR
16 PROJECTS, NEXT YEAR, AND INTRODUCING A NEW REGIONAL TOC SET
17 ASIDE INCENTIVE FOR TOP PERFORMERS IN 2028. FINALLY, STAFF
18 PROPOSED A BALANCED FRAMEWORK FOR INVESTING REMAINING ON, BAG
19 FOUR FUNDS TO ADVANCE SHARED GOALS. COMMON AREAS OF FEEDBACK
20 THAT WE HEARD AT THE WORKSHOP INCLUDED A PREFERENCE FOR TOC
21 INCENTIVES AT THIS EARLY STAGE OF IMPLEMENTATION, AN INTEREST
22 IN PRESERVING OBAG SUPPORT FOR LOCAL PROJECTS, REQUESTS FOR
23 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON REGIONAL PROGRAMS AND OUTCOMES, AND,
24 AS PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED, SUGGESTIONS TO EXPAND RURAL
25 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS, PARTICULARLY IN THE NORTH BAY.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NEXT SLIDE. ON THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICY SIDE,
2 STAFF PROPOSALS INCLUDED SCORING ADJUSTMENTS FOR SPECIFIC TOC
3 STANDARDS, ESPECIALLY THOSE RELATED TO PARKING AND COMMERCIAL
4 DENSITIES IN RESPONSE TO FEEDBACK. OTHER ADJUSTMENTS TO
5 EXPECTATIONS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUNDING POLICIES AND
6 PROVIDING FULL CREDIT FOR WORK IN PROGRESS. MUCH OF THE
7 WORKSHOP DISCUSSION FOCUSED ON HOUSING PROTECTION POLICIES AND
8 SOME COMMISSIONERS REQUESTED ADDITIONAL FLEXIBILITY AND
9 CONSIDERATION FOR RECENT STATE LAWS. IN ADDITION,
10 COMMISSIONERS HAD MIXED VIEWS ON CREDIT FOR WORK IN PROGRESS.
11 SOME REALLY DIDN'T LIKE THAT IDEA. AND, I THINK THERE WAS ALSO
12 MIXED VIEWS ON THE EXTENT TO WHICH TOC PROGRESS SHOULD BE
13 FACTORED INTO OBAG FOUR FUNDING DECISIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN
14 RESPONSE TO FEEDBACK FROM COMMISSIONERS, NOTING THAT, YOU
15 KNOW, IT WAS VARIED, BUT WE GOT SOME OF IT AT THE WORKSHOP,
16 STAFF PROPOSED THE FOLLOWING REFINEMENTS TO THE STAFF
17 PROPOSALS THAT WE BROUGHT IN OCTOBER TO THE WORKSHOP FOR
18 FURTHER INPUT FROM THE COMMISSION TODAY. FIRST, STAFF
19 RECOMMEND RETAINING THE REGIONAL TOC SET ASIDE IN 2028, AS
20 PREVIOUSLY PROPOSED, WHILE REMOVING TOC POINTS WITHIN THE OBAG
21 FOUR COUNTY PROGRAM NEXT YEAR. THIS WOULD PROVIDE MORE TIME
22 FOR JURISDICTIONS TO DEMONSTRATE TOC PROGRESS WITHOUT
23 IMPACTING THE OBAG FOUR COUNTY PROGRAM TIMELINE. THE PROPOSED
24 TOC SUBMISSION DEADLINE WOULD SHIFT OUT FROM 2026. IT WOULD
25 ALSO REDUCE ADMINISTRATIVE BURDENS FOR MANY JURISDICTIONS, AS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ONLY JURISDICTIONS SEEKING ACCESS TO THE REGIONAL TOC SET
2 ASIDE WOULD NEED TO SUBMIT MATERIALS TO MTC FOR REVIEW.
3 SECOND, STAFF PLAN TO ALIGN TOC CREDIT, WE PROPOSE TO ALIGN
4 TOC CREDIT FOR HOUSING PROTECTIONS WITH CURRENT STATE LAW AND
5 CONSIDER HOW TO ACKNOWLEDGE COUNTY PROGRAMS ALONG THE LINES OF
6 WHAT COMMISSIONER ANDERSON AND A FEW OTHERS BROUGHT UP AT THE
7 WORKSHOP. THIRD, STAFF PROPOSE TO EXPAND OBAG FOUR INVESTMENT
8 IN RURAL TRANSPORTATION, WHICH WE'LL COVER IN MORE DETAIL ON
9 THE NEXT SLIDE. CRUCIALLY, THE PROPOSED OBAG FOUR -- OH SORRY.
10 GO BACK TO THE SLIDE BEFORE. THERE YOU GO. [LAUGHTER] I DID
11 SAY NEXT SLIDE BUT I DIDN'T MEAN IT. CRUCIALLY, THE PROPOSED
12 OBAG FOUR FRAMEWORK, INCLUDING THE TOC SET ASIDE AND RURAL
13 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT, RELY ON SHARED SB125 CONTRIBUTION
14 SO WE ASK THAT COMMISSIONER AFFIRM SUPPORT FOR THE BALANCED
15 APPROACH TODAY SO STAFF CAN FINALIZE THE RECOMMENDED OBAG FOUR
16 FRAMEWORK FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION IN COMING MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE.
17 THIS SLIDE EXPLORES OPTIONS FOR EXPANDING OBAG FOUR INVESTMENT
18 IN RURAL NORTH BAY COMMUNITIES. STAFF SUGGEST THAT THE
19 COMMISSION CONSIDER AUGMENTING THE EXISTING PRIORITY
20 CONSERVATION AREA PROGRAM AS A MEANS OF ADDRESSING NORTH BAY
21 INVESTMENT NEEDS. THIS PROGRAM ALREADY CEMETERIES
22 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS OUTSIDE OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND THE
23 LATEST GRANT CYCLE INCLUDED A 50% NORTH BAY TARGET. THE
24 ALTERNATIVE IS TO CREATE A NEW REGIONAL PROGRAM TO TARGET
25 GEOGRAPHIC AREAS AND PROJECT TYPES RECOMMENDED BY



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 COMMISSIONERS. THE SLIDE LISTS SOME OPTIONS FOR CRITERIA WHICH
2 WOULD BE UP TO COMMISSIONER DISCRETION IF A NEW PROGRAM IS THE
3 DIRECTION. UNDER EITHER OPTION STAFF RECOMMENDATION DEDICATING
4 AN ADDITIONAL 5 TO 10 MILLION FOR RURAL TRANSPORTATION
5 INVESTMENTS WHICH WOULD BE ON TOP OF PREVIOUSLY PROPOSED
6 FUNDING LEVELS FOR EXISTING ELIGIBLE PROGRAMS, SUCH AS THE PCA
7 PROGRAM THAT EXISTS TODAY, THE COUNTIES PROGRAM, ET CETERA.
8 THE AMOUNT OF THE PROGRAM WOULD BE CONTINGENT ON OTHER
9 DECISIONS MADE IN REGARD TO THE OBAG FUNDING FRAMEWORK. NEXT
10 SLIDE. FINALLY, STAFF ARE PROVIDING ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON
11 THE OBAG REGIONAL PROGRAMS WITH THIS ITEM AS REQUESTED BY
12 COMMISSIONERS AT THE WORKSHOP. AS A REMINDER, THE ITEM SHOWN
13 HERE ARE THE REGIONAL PROGRAM FOCUS AREAS THAT WE PROPOSED AT
14 THE WORKSHOP. AND THAT INCLUDES THE PLANNING AND
15 IMPLEMENTATION, GROWTH FRAMEWORK, ENVIRONMENT, COMPLETE
16 STREETS, AND SEAMLESS TRAVEL NETWORK. EVEN WITH SB125 FUNDING
17 TAKEN OFF THE TOP, THE LOSS OF COMPLEMENTARY FUNDING SOURCES
18 FOR REGIONAL PROGRAMS MEANS THAT WE NEED TO MAKE SUBSTANTIAL
19 REDUCTION ACROSS ALL CATEGORIES IN OBAG FOUR. WE'RE PROPOSING
20 TO ACCOMPLISH THIS BY FOCUSING ON HIGH PERFORMING INITIATIVES
21 AND CONSOLIDATING PROGRAMS WHERE POSSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE.
22 ATTACHED TO THIS ITEM IS A REGIONAL PROGRAM FACT SHEET THAT
23 DESCRIBES EACH PROGRAM FUNDED FROM OBAG THREE ON THE REGIONAL
24 SIDE, INCLUDING QUANTIFIABLE OUTCOMES AND METRICS WHEN
25 AVAILABLE. I'LL HIGHLIGHT A FEW OF THOSE. I THINK ONE OF THEM,



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WE DEFINITELY TALKED ABOUT THE WORKSHOP, WHICH IS THAT
2 SENTENCE 2,008, WE HAVE SEEN 66% OF HOUSING GROWTH IN PDAS WE
3 WOULD LIKE TO THINK THAT THE PDA PLANNING GRANT PROGRAM HAS
4 HELPED WITH THAT. WE KNOW THAT ISN'T THE ONLY REASON. WE ALSO
5 ON THE PCA PROGRAM SIDE 7,000 ACRES OF FARMLAND AND OPEN SPACE
6 HAVE BEEN PRESERVED AND RESTORED AND ENHANCED THROUGH THOSE
7 INVESTMENTS. AND THROUGH THE ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM RECENTLY
8 WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO FUND 800 CHARGERS. SO AGAIN THE
9 ATTACHMENT WITH MORE INFORMATION IS INTENDED TO FURTHER INFORM
10 YOUR DISCUSSION ON THE OBAG FOUR FRAMEWORK AND RELATED
11 TRADEOFFS. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY, I WANTED TO WRAP UP WITH NEXT
12 STEPS, AND THEN I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU FOR DISCUSSION.
13 SPECIFICALLY WE'RE LOOKING FOR YOUR DIRECTION TODAY ON THE
14 SB125 OFFER THE TOP PROPOSAL AND OTHER POLICY REFINEMENTS THAT
15 ARE PROPOSED HERE IN THE PRESENTATION. AND DEPENDING ON INPUT
16 AND DIRECTION FROM YOU ALL, WE WOULD, NEXT MONTH, PLAN TO
17 CONTINUE OUTREACH TO THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND
18 OTHER STAKEHOLDERS WITH UPDATES ON THE LATEST PROPOSALS. IN
19 JANUARY OR FEBRUARY, STAFF WOULD RETURN TO THE COMMISSION WITH
20 RECOMMENDED ACTIONS, INCLUDING ADOPTION OF THE OBAG FOUR
21 PROGRAM AND ASSOCIATED TOC IMPLEMENTATION, AGAIN, PENDING YOUR
22 DIRECTION. AND AT THE SAME TIME, WE WOULD PLAN TO RECOMMEND
23 TARGETED REVISIONS TO THE TOC POLICY, ITSELF, TO ALIGN TOC
24 CONSISTENCY DEADLINES FOR THE EXTENSION PROJECTS WITH THE
25 TIMELINE OF THE SET ASIDE FROM 2026 TO 2028. AND FOLLOWING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ADOPTION OF THE OBAG FOUR PROGRAM EARLY NEXT YEAR, MTC STAFF
2 WOULD WORK WITH THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES SO THEY
3 COULD RELEASE THEIR CALL FOR PROJECTS ON SCHEDULE. AND AS
4 CURRENTLY PROPOSED HERE TODAY, THE TOC PROGRESS WOULDN'T BE
5 FACTORED INTO THAT CALL FOR PROJECTS. AND THEN, FINALLY, IN
6 2028, THE COMMISSION WOULD HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO AWARD OBAG
7 FOUR TOC SET ASIDE FUNDS TO TOP PERFORMERS. THIS WOULD ALLOW
8 ADDITIONAL TIME FOR JURISDICTIONS TO DEMONSTRATE TOC PROGRESS
9 WITH A SHIFT IN SUBMISSIONS FROM 2026 UNTIL PROBABLY IN 2027
10 TO GET READY FOR AWARDS IN 2028. AGAIN, THIS IS AN
11 INFORMATIONAL ITEM TODAY, BUT WE'RE LOOKING FOR YOUR DIRECTION
12 SO THAT WE CAN KEEP MOVING FORWARD AND BRING SOMETHING BACK
13 FOR ACTION AS EARLY AS JANUARY OR FEBRUARY OF 2026. THANK YOU
14 VERY MUCH.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THAT. JUST ONE THING
17 THAT I WANT -- WE'RE TALKING ABOUT OUTREACH TO CTAS OTHER AND
18 STAKEHOLDERS IN DECEMBER, AND I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT
19 FOR THEM TO KNOW WHAT THE FINAL VOTE IS IN JANUARY AND
20 FEBRUARY SO THEY KNOW FIRMLY WHAT THE DECISION IS SO I'M
21 CONCERNED ABOUT LETTING THEM KNOW PRE-JANUARY DECISION SO JUST
22 THOUGHT ON WHEN WE COMMUNICATE TO THE CTA'S TO MAKE SURE THEY
23 KNOW THAT THE DECISION POINT IS IN JANUARY, IN FEBRUARY, NOT
24 THAT WHAT THEY'RE HEARING IS THE FINAL DECISION JUST WANT TO
25 MAKE SURE WE CLARIFY THAT. RAMOS.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF HAS THIS IN OCTOBER WE HAD
3 THE TABLE THAT HAD THE FUNDING AND PROPOSALS OF HOW THAT WOULD
4 WORK DID YOU BY CHANCE DO AN UPDATE ONE WITH THESE
5 RECOMMENDATIONS SO THAT WE CAN SEE THE NUMBERS?

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WE DID NOT. ARE YOU THINKING ABOUT THE COUNTY

8 --

9

10 **BELIA RAMOS:** THE COUNTY PORTION, AND THE TOTALS, THE FUNDING
11 TO THE SB125. BECAUSE I KNOW WHAT WE SAW IN OCTOBER WAS TAKING
12 THE REGIONAL SB125 COMMITMENT OFF THE COUNTY PORTION THAT
13 SHOWS THE DIRECT PORTION, AND, SO, THE PROPOSAL THAT YOU HAVE
14 BEFORE US TODAY, THE SUGGESTED LANGUAGE FOR DISCUSSION, IS A
15 DIFFERENT CALCULATED AMOUNT THAN WHAT WAS BEFORE US ON
16 OCTOBER. AND I KNOW SOME OF US HERE ARE A LITTLE MORE VISUAL,
17 AND THE DOLLARS MIGHT MAKE A LITTLE MORE SENSE TO US.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG, I THOUGHT IN
20 OCTOBER WE HAD 125 ACKNOWLEDGE OFF THE -- COMING OFF WILL TOP
21 AS WELL. IT HASN'T CHANGED?

22

23 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH MAYBE IF I SPEAK TO SOME MEMBERS.

24

25 **BELIA RAMOS:** WE HAD A SLIDE.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** APOLOGIZE WE DON'T HAVE IT FOR YOU ALL TO SEE
3 WE DID SHOW A COUNTY PROGRAM ESTIMATED 300 MILLION ASSUMED
4 THAT SB125, 500 MILLION CAME OFF THE TOP TODAY WE'RE PROPOSING
5 TO RETAIN AND MAINTAIN THE SAME FRAMEWORK.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** JUST FOLLOW UP HISTORICALLY, SB125 CAME OUT OF THE
8 COUNTY PORTION NOT OFF THE TOP IN ESSENCE THAT I DON'T KNOW IF
9 MTC SIDE IS THAT HISTORICALLY IT CAME OFF?

10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ONE TIME SB125 FRAMEWORK WE DON'T
12 REALLY HAVE A HISTORIC PRINCIPLE, I THINK THERE HAS BEEN A LOT
13 OF INTEREST IN IT COMING OFF THE REGIONAL SIDE IN ITS ENTIRETY
14 BUT THERE HAS NEVER BEEN A DECISION FROM THE COMMISSION ON
15 THAT SO BECAUSE THIS IS SORT OF FIRST TIME YOU ALL ARE GOING
16 TO HAVE TO MAKE THAT DECISION.

17

18 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** THROUGH THE CHAIR COULD WE NOT USE THE NUMBERS
19 OF LEGISLATION AND USE PLAIN ENGLISH DESCRIPTIONS OF WHAT IT
20 IS THIS IS THE GAP FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SO, JUST IN
21 GENERAL, WE SHOULD ALL BE BETTER ABOUT THAT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** AND AS A FOLLOW UP, I KNOW WE REALLY DIDN'T
24 HAVE TIME TO DISCUSS IT WHEN I WENT TO THE WORKSHOP, THROUGH
25 THE POWERPOINT, WE DIDN'T TAKE A DEEP DIVE ON IT. REPRESENTING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 A TRANSIT AGENCY AS WELL I'M EXTREMELY CONCERNED PARTICULARLY
2 LOOKING AT THERE IS NOTHING IN THERE IN THE INTERIM BEFORE
3 POTENTIALLY A REGIONAL MEASURE MIGHT PASS FOR BUS FEEDER FARES
4 AND OTHER THINGS. SO, I'M LEANING TOWARD HAVING IT COME OUT OF
5 THE REGIONAL SHARE SO THAT OUR LOCAL TRANSPORTATION
6 AUTHORITIES CAN THEN ALLOCATE MORE FUNDING TOWARD TRANSIT,
7 AMONG OTHER THINGS. SO I'M -- WHILE I RECOGNIZE THERE IS MERIT
8 IN SAYING LET'S TAKE IT OFF THE TOP, I WOULD RATHER SEE IT
9 TAKEN OFFER THE REGIONAL SHARE THEN ALLOWING MORE DISCRETION
10 OF OUR LOCAL TRANSIT -- TRANSPORTATION -- THAT UP AUTHORITIES
11 TO ALLOCATE IT TOWARDS TRANSIT IF NEEDED.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** JUST TO CLARIFY, THE ONLY ONES THAT ARE
14 MISSING THE BUS FEEDER PATTERNS ARE THE THREE IN CONTRA COSTA
15 COUNTY.

16

17 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YEAH, YEAH, AND THAT'S WHERE IT'S COMING
18 FROM, I RECOGNIZE --

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I JUST DON'T WANT IT TO IMPLY THIS ALL THE
21 OTHER TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE THE SAME ISSUE.

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** FAR EAST CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. AND ALSO I
24 JUST SEE THE LOCAL NEEDS. AND COMING THROUGH OUR CTAS AND
25 HAVING MORE OF THAT LOCAL IMPACT. SO, I -- IF WE WERE TAKING A



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 POLL, RIGHT NOW, I WOULD BE MORE INCLINED TO TAKE IT OFF THE
2 REGIONAL SIDE.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

5

6 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, IF I COULD ADD ONE THING. THE
7 COLLATERAL EFFECT OF THAT HAS TO DO WITH THE TOC SIDE AS WELL
8 THE PRESENTATION INDICATED THAT WITHOUT COMING OFF THE TOP WE
9 CAN'T DO THE TOC SIDE SO THEY BOTH GET AFFECTED BY THAT
10 DECISION.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** TOC SET ASIDE IS ONLY OFF THE REGIONAL SIDE.
13 NOT OFF THE COUNTY SIDE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, JUST ONE OTHER --

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY. I'M NOT USED TO THIS ROOM.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I HEAR THE CONCERN ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATORS AND
20 FISCAL CLIFFS. I DID WANT TO NOTE THAT THE SB125 DID SUPPORT
21 THE FEEDER BUS OPERATORS IN PARTICULAR BOTH TRI DELTA TRANSIT
22 AND WESTCAT AND A FEW OTHERS AS WELL DID RECEIVE SOME OF THAT
23 FUNDING. I WOULD ALSO NOTE THAT HISTORICALLY, THE COUNTY FUNDS
24 HAVE TYPICALLY BEEN SPENT MORE ON CAPITAL AND NOT TO SUPPORT
25 TRANSIT OPERATIONS, WHERE YOU, AS A COMMISSION, HAS BEEN ASKED



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 TO LOOK ON THE REGIONAL SIDE TO SUPPORT THESE, SORT OF,
2 INITIATIVES. SO THAT'S JUST SOMETHING TO CONSIDER.

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HELPFUL TO KNOW, AND I APPRECIATE THAT
5 PERSPECTIVE. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN. I'M GOING TO GET THIS
8 RIGHT.

9

10 **MITCH MASHBURN:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. I APPRECIATE THAT. BUT I
11 WOULD TAKE THE OTHER, TOO. THE MASHCRAFT.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WELL. ALL RIGHT. GOOD. IN CASE I MESS THAT
14 UP.

15

16 **MITCH MASHBURN:** THAT SAID, I'M GOING DO A DOWNLOAD BECAUSE I
17 WANT TO COVER IT ALL IN ONE SHOT. DON'T WANT TO KEEP PUSHING
18 THE BUTTON, PUSHING THE BUTTON TO TALK. WE MADE SOME NOTES ON
19 THIS LAST NIGHT ME AND SOME STAFF THE PERSPECTIVE OF MY COUNTY
20 WHICH IS OF THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES \$100 MILLION OF SB125
21 COMMITMENT SHOULD COME OUT OF THE REGIONAL SHARE REDUCING THE
22 REGIONAL SHARE TO 31 MILLION NEW FUNDING MTC APPLIES TO OBAG
23 SHOULD BE APPLIED 50/50 BOTH COUNTY AND REGIONAL PROGRAM
24 SHARES UNLESS UNLIKE THE LAST CYCLE FUNDING WAS APPLIED TO
25 REGIONAL PROGRAMS FOR EXAMPLE, \$194 MILLION DEFICIT SHOWN ON



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SLIDE NINE REGIONAL PROGRAMS COMPOSED OF \$50 MILLION OF SB125
2 THE REST REAP AND CRP THE TOC SET ASIDE SHOULD COME FROM THE
3 REGIONAL PROGRAM AND BE LESS THAN \$50 MILLION SINCE A NEW
4 PROGRAM SUPPORT NORTH BAY LOCAL COUNTY SHARE AUGMENTATION FROM
5 TOC PROGRAM SUPPLEMENTS THE OBAG COUNTY TARGETS FOR PROJECTS
6 CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PREFERENCE RATHER THAN
7 AUGMENTS THE PCA PROGRAM WHICH HAS MORE LIMITED PROJECT
8 ELIGIBILITY.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PAPAN.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** THE SET ASIDE 100 MILLION SPLIT HERE I THINK SOME
13 OF US HAVE BEEN CLEAR HERE FUNDING WAS USED FOR REGIONAL
14 TRANSIT OPERATING DEFICITS AND I DON'T THINK IT SHOULD COME
15 OUT OF THE COUNTY SHARE AT ALL. I THINK WE HAVE MENTIONED THAT
16 SEVERAL TIMES I WOULD NOT BE INCLINED TO DO SO I THINK THE
17 COUNTIES NEED IT MUCH MORE AND ARE PUTTING IT TO GREAT USE SO
18 I WOULD NOT SUPPORT TAKING IT OFFER THE TOP AGAIN AS SEVERAL
19 ARE COMMISSIONERS HAVE ALREADY MENTIONED THAT IT NEEDS TO COME
20 OFF THE REGIONAL PART. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

23

24 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** CHAIR, ARE YOU WANTING US TO GIVE COMMENTS NOW
25 ON THE TOTALITY OF THE PROPOSAL?



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I'M -- I WAS -- COMMISSIONER MASHBURN DID
3 THAT, AND, SO, IF YOU WANT TO DO THAT, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE
4 THOSE. AND I'M SURE STAFF CAN TAKE THAT. SO, IF THERE ARE
5 OTHER COMMENTS, AS WELL.

6

7 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** DO YOU WANT TO DO THAT OR DO YOU WANT TO DO
8 CLARIFICATIONS FIRST? LET'S JUST GO. [LAUGHTER] ARE YOU READY
9 TO GO?

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** READY TO GO.

12

13 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** SO, THERE ARE A FEW THINGS WE'RE BEING ASKED TO
14 OPINE ABOUT, RIGHT?

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

17

18 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** AND I, AS SOMEONE WHO WAS THERE IN IT 2022, AND
19 WE SPENT A HUGE AMOUNT OF TIME PASSING -- LET'S -- I'M GOING
20 TO START WITH THE TOC POLICY, THE TRANSIT ORIENT THE
21 COMMUNITIES POLICY, I ACTUALLY WANT TO TAKE US FROM THE TREES
22 BACK UP TO THE FOREST FOR ONE SECOND. BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE WE
23 ARE NOT REMINDED -- WE'RE SO IN THE WEEDS ABOUT THE SCORING
24 SYSTEM AND THE FUNDING ALLOCATIONS AND OBAG, THIS, THAT, AND
25 THE OTHER THING THAT, WE'RE FORGETTING THAT THIS IS ALL IN



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SERVICE OF OUR LEGAL AND MORAL OBLIGATION TO REDUCE THE HUMAN
2 SUFFERING CAUSED BY CLIMATE CHANGE. THE SCIENCE IS VERY CLEAR,
3 EVEN IF WE, ALL OF US WERE IN EVS TOMORROW, WE CANNOT REACH
4 OUR REDUCTION GOALS WITHOUT CHANGING LAND USE. THE SCIENCE IS
5 CLEAR. AND, SO, THIS WAS OUR ATTEMPT TO ACTUALLY IMPLEMENT
6 WHAT IS IN PLANNED BAY AREA, WHICH IS BASED ON OUR SCIENTIFIC
7 OBLIGATIONS. AND I WANT TO ADD, ALSO, THAT THE TOC, TO ME,
8 REPRESENTS A COMPACT THAT US, AS GOOD STEWARDS OF THE PUBLIC
9 THERE OWE. YOU KNOW, WE'RE GIVEN TREMENDOUS AMOUNTS OF
10 DISCRETIONARY FEDERAL DOLLARS THAT GO INTO JURISDICTIONS TO
11 CREATE THESE VERY EXPENSIVE TRANSIT SYSTEMS, BOTH TO CREATE
12 AND MAINTAIN THEM. AND THAT IT'S A COMPACT BETWEEN THE PUBLIC,
13 THE TAXPAYER, AND THESE JURISDICTIONS TO ENSURE THAT THOSE
14 INVESTMENTS ARE MAXIMIZED. AND WE MAXIMIZE THAT HUGE
15 INVESTMENT IN TRANSIT SYSTEMS BY DENSIFYING DEVELOPMENT AROUND
16 STATIONS, BY ENSURING THERE IS GOOD ACCESS, AND ALSO BY
17 ENSURING THAT THESE POLICIES DON'T CREATE DISPLACEMENT,
18 PARTICULARLY OF OUR MOST VULNERABLE CITIZENS. THAT'S WHAT THE
19 TOC POLICY IS IN SERVICE OF, THAT STEWARDSHIP, THAT COMPACT,
20 AND OUR MORAL OBLIGATIONS REGARDING POLLUTION AND EMISSIONS
21 REDUCTION. SO, HERE IS WHAT I HAVE BEEN ABLE TO BRUSH OFF MY
22 MEMORY CELLS ABOUT WHAT WE DID IN 2022. AND I JUST -- I WANT
23 TO START BY REALLY APPRECIATING OUR STAFF. YOU GUYS ARE
24 PHENOMENON. YOU ARE EXCELLENT. YOU ARE ACCOMMODATE ACCUSTOMED
25 TO A COMMISSION THAT WORKS ON A CON ACCEPTS US BASIS, AND I



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 APOLOGIZE, I DON'T THINK YOU HAVE THAT, UNFORTUNATELY,
2 SITUATION HERE ON THIS ISSUE. SO KIND OF THE NORMAL MTC
3 FUNCTIONING OF TRYING TO PUT FORWARD A PROPOSAL THAT YOU THINK
4 IS A CONSENSUS PROPOSAL MAY NOT ACTUALLY BE APPROPRIATE ON
5 THIS ISSUE. BUT I WANT TO APPRECIATE, LIKE, THAT IS OUR
6 CULTURE. IT'S A GOOD CULTURE, IT'S DEFINITELY BETTER THAN THE
7 BLOOD SPORT OF OAKLAND POLITICS THAT I'M USED TO. AND SO, I
8 JUST WANT TO APPRECIATE YOU. SO, MY MEMORY, THOUGH, IS WHEN WE
9 ADOPTED THIS IN 2022, WE WERE NOT TALKING ABOUT A SCORING
10 SYSTEM. WE WERE TALKING ABOUT REQUIREMENTS. REQUIREMENTS. AND
11 I ACTUALLY PULLED OUT THE ORIGINAL SOLUTION -- [LAUGHTER] --
12 AND REREAD IT. THE WORD "REQUIREMENT" IS EVERYWHERE. BUT THE
13 COMPLIANCE WITH THESE REQUIREMENTS WAS VOLUNTARY. IT WAS A
14 CONDITION FOR GETTING DISCRETIONARY MONEY. I DON'T KNOW IF
15 THIS IS A GOOD ANALOGY OR NOT, BUT I'M GOING TO USE IT JUST
16 FOR EASE. IT'S JUST LIKE THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ENDED UP
17 CONDITIONING HIGHWAY FUNDS ONLY IF STATES WOULD CHANGE THEIR
18 DRINKING AGE TO 21. I WAS IN COLLEGE AT THE TIME, SO I
19 REMEMBER THAT WELL.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU AND ME BOTH. [LAUGHTER]

22

23 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** SO, AGAIN, WE DON'T HAVE THE REGULATORY
24 AUTHORITY, BUT WE CAN CONDITION DISCRETIONARY FUNDS ON
25 VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE WITH THE POLICY. THAT IS MY MEMORY OF



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WHAT WE WERE DOING IN 2022. NOT A SCORING SYSTEM, AND THE
2 WORDING ABOUT THE FUNDING HAD TO DO WITH THIS SET ASIDE IDEA
3 THAT WE WERE GOING TO ACTUALLY BE DEDICATING FUNDING. SO, WE
4 HAD THE POLICY THAT YOU HAD TO COMPLY WITH TO RECEIVE GENERAL
5 DISCRETIONARY MONEY THEN WE WERE GOING TO SET ASIDE SPECIAL
6 FUNDING FOR TOC PROJECTS. OKAY? THOSE TWO PARTS THAT I
7 REMEMBER WAS PART OF WHAT I THOUGHT WE WERE DOING IN 2022. AND
8 I APOLOGIZE IF MY MEMORY, MY POST MENOPAUSAL MEMORY IS BAD,
9 CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG IF MY MEMORY IS WRONG OR INACCURATE.
10 SO, HERE WE ARE. I THINK THERE ARE SOME GOOD -- YOU CALL THEM
11 REFINEMENTS -- I THINK WE SHOULD BE HONEST WITH THE PUBLIC AND
12 SAY THESE ARE REVISIONS. THEY'RE NOT REFINEMENTS. THEY'RE
13 REVISIONS TO OUR POLICIES. I DO THINK THAT WE NEED TO KIND OF
14 STICK TO THIS VERY IMPORTANT POLICY IN THE ORIGINAL INTENT
15 WITH WHICH WE PASSED IT. THERE ARE SOME MODIFICATIONS THAT I
16 CAN SUPPORT. I THINK, AT THE WORKSHOP, SOMEONE WE TALKED ABOUT
17 MAKING THINGS A LITTLE LESS ONEROUS AROUND COMPLIANCE. YOU
18 KNOW, THE NEW SB79 ZONING AROUND TRANSIT, PLAIN ENGLISH
19 LANGUAGE. I'M GOING TO TRY TO DO THAT, MODEL MY OWN REQUEST. I
20 THINK THOSE SHOULD AUTOMATICALLY DEEM COMPLIANT WITH THE TOC
21 POLICIES DENSITY REQUIREMENT IF THE JURISDICTION IS SUBJECT TO
22 SB79, THEY ARE DEEMED COMPLIANT WITH DENSITY. SIMPLIFY OUR
23 COMPLIANCE. ALSO LIKE COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN, I BELIEVE IT WAS
24 YOUR SUGGESTION, THAT CITIES SEEN AS DOING HOUSING POLICIES
25 LIKE TENANT PROTECTIONS OR TENANT ASSISTANCE, IF THE COUNTY IS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 DOING IT, WITH THE ONE REQUEST THAT THE CITY SHOULD DO
2 SOMETHING TO CONTRIBUTE TO IT EITHER MONETARILY OR THROUGH IN
3 KIND CONTRIBUTIONS BY LIKE PUTTING A LINK TO IT ON YOUR CITY
4 WEB SITE OR USING CITY STAFF TO PROMOTE THE PROGRAM. I THOUGHT
5 THAT WAS AN EXCELLENT SUGGESTION, AND ACTUALLY INCENTIVIZES
6 CITY COUNTY COLLABORATION AND COOPERATION WHICH I THINK WE
7 COULD ALL USE MORE OF, RIGHT? [LAUGHTER] THEN, FINALLY, I
8 COULD ALSO SUPPORT THE NORTH BAY RURAL TRANSPORTATION
9 INVESTMENT. I THINK THAT IS GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. BUT
10 ONLY IF WE ARE GOING TO PRESERVE A STRONG TOC POLICY AND ONLY
11 IF, AND I THINK YOU HEARD HOW ALL OF THESE DOLLARS AREN'T
12 WORKING, ONLY IF THE TRANSIT BRIDGE MONEY FROM SB125 DOES COME
13 OFF THE TOP. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE IT'S A BAD TIME TO BE
14 IMPLEMENTING THIS NEW POLICY. IT'S ALWAYS BETTER TO IMPLEMENT
15 NEW POLICIES WHEN YOU HAVE EXTRA RESOURCES. BECAUSE EVERYBODY
16 GETS WHAT THEY HAVE HAD IN THE PAST AND THEN JUST SOME PEOPLE
17 GET MORE AND MORE. SO, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, IT'S A REALLY
18 HARD TIME TO IMPLEMENT THIS POLICY, BECAUSE WE'RE IN A MOMENT
19 OF LESS. BUT, THIS IS -- THE GOALS OF THIS POLICY ARE SO
20 IMPORTANT. AND I THINK WE MUST BE THE REGIONAL LEADERS THAT WE
21 ARE AND DO THIS. SO, HERE ARE MY THREE REQUESTS. YOU KNOW,
22 AGAIN, I THINK BECAUSE THIS IS NOT THE USUAL MTC SITUATION, I
23 DO ASK, GOING FORWARD, THAT STAFF CLARIFY THE DIFFERENCE
24 BETWEEN INDIVIDUAL COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND COMMISSION
25 SENTIMENT OR DIRECTION. AND AS WE TELL OUR KIDS, SILENCE DOES



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NOT EQUAL CONSENT. SOMETIMES PEOPLE CHOOSE TO SPEAK; SOMETIMES
2 THEY DON'T. SO, JUST ON THIS ISSUE, I THINK GOING FORWARD THAT
3 WOULD BE APPROPRIATE. SECOND, I THINK SOME OF US ARE STILL
4 CONFUSED AND I HOPE YOU WILL MAKE YOURSELF AVAILABLE FOR
5 FURTHER COMMISSIONER BRIEFINGS, JUST SO THAT WE FULLY
6 UNDERSTAND ALL THE COMPLICATED FUNDING PROPOSALS, POLICY
7 PROPOSALS, ET CETERA, AND THEN, FINALLY, JUST TO BE CLEAR AND
8 NOT SILENT, I BELIEVE TODAY'S PROPOSED REFINEMENTS, AS YOU'RE
9 CALLING THEM, GO IN THE WRONG DIRECTION. I JUST WANT TO BE
10 CRYSTAL CLEAR ABOUT THAT. THEY DO NOT REPRESENT THE SENTIMENTS
11 OF THIS COMMISSIONER. AND ONE THING THAT YOU MAY CONSIDER
12 DOING, THAT I KNOW IS NOT THE TYPICAL PRACTICE, BUT YOU MIGHT
13 WANT TO BRING US OPTIONS. YOU MIGHT WANT TO BRING SOME
14 DIFFERENT OPTIONS. I RECOGNIZE YOU ARE TRYING TO DO YOUR BEST
15 TO, YOU KNOW, THREAD THE NEEDLE OF A GREAT VARIETY OF FEELINGS
16 AND NEEDS, BUT YOU MIGHT, IN THIS CASE, BE WISE TO BRING US
17 OPTIONS TO CHOOSE FROM, INSTEAD OF JUST ONE PROPOSAL. THOSE
18 ARE MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER AHN?

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** I'LL FOCUS ON THE POSITIVE I FOUND IN THE STAFF
23 PRESENTATION. FIRST TWO THINGS I DID LIKE WAS THE 50 MILLION
24 SET ASIDE UNTIL 2028 THE IDEA OF BUYING THE COUNTIES MORE TIME
25 TO COMPLY OR GROW ALONGSIDE THE POLICY PERHAPS SECOND THING I



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 LIKE WAS NORTH BAY ROAD TRANSPORTATION AUGMENTATION FUNDING
2 PROPOSED ADHERING TO COMMISSIONER SCHAFF'S COMMENT ON HAVING
3 THAT ALIGN MORE CLOSELY WITH THE TOC POLICY, MY RECOLLECTION
4 SIMILAR TO WHAT COMMISSIONER SCHARFF DESCRIBED, THE WHOLE
5 THING AROUND THE SCORING HISTORY I HAVE TWO OVERARCHING
6 COMMENTS WHEN IT COMES TO THAT JUST HAVING SAT THROUGH DOZENS
7 OF HOURS OF PUBLIC COMMENT AROUND PLANNED BAY AREA AND THEN
8 THIS ZOOM NO LESS DURING THE PANDEMIC MY TWO OVERARCHING
9 COMMENTS ARE IF WE KEEP THE SCORING SYSTEM I THINK IF THAT TOC
10 SCORING SHOULD BE KEPT IN THE COUNTY PROGRAM, I HAVE TWO
11 SUBTHOUGHTS THE SCORING AS EVOLVED AS A WAY TO TRY TO MAKE
12 THIS FEEL MORE FAIR AND I THINK THE IRONING IS THAT IT FELT
13 LESS FAIR TRYING TO MAKE THIS MORE FLEXIBLE BUT THEN BECAME
14 MORE COMPLEX UNWIELDY. I'M NOT SURE WHERE THAT LEAVES US TODAY
15 NOT SURE THE SOLUTION IS EVEN THROWING IT OUT THAT FEELS
16 HAPHAZARD DEMOLITION OF THIS KIND OF WEIRD STRUCTURE TRYING TO
17 BUILD, IF WE GET RID OF IT -- KIND OF THE FOUNDATION,
18 RECOGNIZING CONSENSUS IS PROBABLY NOT POSSIBLE ON SOMETHING
19 THAT IS BASED ON WHAT I HEARD IN THE WORKSHOPS BUT I LIKE
20 COMMISSIONER MELGAR'S COMMENT HOLDING COUNTIES ACCOUNTABLE AS
21 MONEY IS DISTRIBUTED FOR SPECIFIC PURPOSE STAFF PRESENTATION
22 EMPHASIZING PLANNED BAY AREA TRYING TO MAKE TRANSIT
23 SUSTAINABLE AND AFFORDABLE FOR ALL CITIZENS OF THE BAY AREA
24 AND TOC IS ABOUT TRYING TO INCREASE DENSITY AND COMMERCIAL
25 DEVELOPMENT IN A WAY THAT MADE THOSE TRANSIT NETWORKS AT LEAST



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NOT ON THE VERGE OF COLLAPSE, AS IT SEEMS LIKE NOW, I WANT TO
2 AS A FINAL NOTE RETURN TO COMMISSIONER FLEMING'S COMMENTS.
3 ALSO ON THE EARLIER ITEM TOO WHICH WAS THINKING ABOUT
4 GEOGRAPHIC EQUITY WHEN WE TRENCH IT. I THINK PART OF THE
5 ANXIETIES IS PERCEPTION THAT EVERY COUNTY IN THE BAY AREA IS
6 NOT GETTING THEIR SHARE OUT OF THIS WHAT I PERCEIVE TO BE A
7 SMALLER POT OF MONEY. MTC AS A BODY REALLY DISTRIBUTES TO THE
8 REGION AS A WHOLE. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
9 EQUITY WE'RE NOT JUST FLATTENING ALL EXPERIENCE. SECOND DAY OF
10 THE WORKSHOP THERE WAS WHAT I SAW ALMOST LIKE AN OVERLY
11 CONFUSING FOCUS -- CONFUSING FOR THE PUBLIC AT-LARGE, A SET OF
12 POLICIES THAT WERE SPECIFIC TO ONE COUNTY. IN THE SAME WAY I
13 WOULD NOT WANT ONE COUNTY IMPOSE ITS POLICIES ON ALL OTHER
14 COUNTIES. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS PROGRAM WHICH I VIEW
15 AS BEING FOR VERY SPECIFIC PURPOSES, YOU KNOW, IS ALLOWED TO
16 DO WHAT IT'S INTENDED TO DO WITH THE LIMITED RESOURCES WE HAVE
17 AND IT'S ALL ABOUT IN MY MIND TRYING TO LEVERAGE THAT, OR
18 IDEALLY, A MORE ROBUST REGION. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE
23 COMMENTS OF MY -- OOPS -- MY -- YOU CAN -- OH --

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEP WE CAN HEAR YOU.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I GUESS I'M LOOKING AT
3 THIS -- IT'S THE C125 FUNDS FIRST. BECAUSE WHAT I HEARD FROM
4 STAFF, IT WOULD DETERMINE -- IT SEEMS LIKE IT WOULD DETERMINE
5 THE ABLE TO IMPLEMENT A TOC POLICY. AND I'M TRYING -- I'M
6 LOOKING AT THIS REALLY FRANKLY FROM A, WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO
7 THINK AS A PRAGMATIC PERSPECTIVE. I SAID IT AT THE WORKSHOP,
8 AND I KNOW WE RECEIVED LETTERS FROM THE CTA'S, BUT IN THIS
9 TIME, I JUST DON'T THINK TAKING THE FUNDING FROM THE COUNTY
10 POT IS THE BEST IDEA. YOU KNOW, A LOT OF THE CITIES,
11 ESPECIALLY THE SMALLER CITIES USE THAT FUNDING. THEY NEED THAT
12 FUNDING RIGHT NOW WHEN FUNDING IS TIGHT. AND WE'RE ABOUT TO GO
13 OUT FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE WHERE WE NEED THE SUPPORT OF THESE
14 COMMUNITIES AND THESE CITIES. AND I JUST DON'T FEEL LIKE THIS
15 HAS BEEN THE TIME TO TAKE MONEY AWAY FROM THEM. SO, I WOULD
16 LIKE TO -- I SUPPORT THE IDEA OF TAKING IT FROM THE REGIONAL
17 POT AND LEAVING THE COUNTY MONEY INTACT. SO, THAT IT WOULD
18 JUST DETERMINE WHAT WE DO WITH THE TOC TO A LARGE EXTENT. I
19 WOULD, FRANKLY -- AND I APPRECIATE THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
20 ON THIS FOR MANY YEARS NOW, BUT WHEN WE STARTED DISCUSSING IT,
21 WE, YOU KNOW, DIDN'T REALLY KNOW WHAT THE FISCAL CLIFFS WERE
22 GOING TO LOOK LIKE, AND, YOU KNOW, NOW WE HAVE THAT IN FRONT
23 OF US. AND I THINK, RIGHT NOW, I WOULD LIKE FOR US TO JUST
24 FOCUS ON GETTING THROUGH THAT IN THIS NEXT YEAR, AND THEN WHEN
25 WE HOPEFULLY HAVE MORE RESOURCES AND, YOU KNOW, LISTENING TO



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF'S COMMENTS, YEAH, THIS IS A REALLY BAD
2 TIME, BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE MORE RESOURCES. SO, I WOULD PREFER
3 FOR US TO HAVE A DISCUSSION AND FORMULATE A POLICY WHEN WE
4 ACTUALLY HAVE RESOURCES TO GIVE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

7

8 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU, CHAIR NOACK. AND I WANTED TO
9 ACTUALLY APOLOGIZE TO MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF.
10 BECAUSE DURING THE WORKSHOP, WHICH WAS UNFORTUNATELY TIME TO
11 COINCIDE WITH SOME FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ACTION IN MY CITY,
12 BECAUSE BASED IN MY CITY, I FELT LIKE A YO-YO BECAUSE I KEPT
13 HAVING TO LEAVE THE ROOM OR TAKE CALLS OR RESUME WITH THE
14 GOVERNOR'S STAFF, SO I MISSED SO MUCH OF THE DISCUSSION. BUT I
15 READ THE MATERIALS AND I WAS IN FOR PART OF IT. BY THE WAY, I
16 ADOPT EVERYTHING, COMMISSIONER SCHAFF AND MY FELLOW NEXT DOOR
17 NEIGHBOR MAYOR SAID IN HER REMARKS I READ -- I WAS IN CITY
18 COUNCIL MEETING UNTIL MIDNIGHT LAST NIGHT BUT ON THE FERRY
19 THIS MORNING I READ ALL THE CORRESPONDENCE THAT WAS SENT TO US
20 LAST NIGHT THERE WAS A LETTER FROM MY STATE SENATOR JESSE
21 ARREQUIN WHO USED TO SIT ON THIS BOARD AND YOU KNOW AS
22 PRESIDENT OF ABAG URGING US IMPLORING US TO PLEASE MAINTAIN
23 THE SPIRIT AND INTENT WHICH THEY BROUGHT THIS PROGRAM FORWARD
24 I ALSO READ THE SPUR LETTER AND I VERY MUCH AGREE WITH WHAT IT
25 SAID I WANT TO FOCUS ON THE SUGGESTION THAT WE AMEND OR REMOVE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 THE POLICIES ON THE THREE P'S OF HOUSING. AND SOME YEARS AGO I
2 WAS ON A COMMITTEE OF ABAG LOOKING AT CRITERIA AND I BELIEVE
3 IT WAS REBECCA LONG I RECALL DESCRIBING THE THREE P'S TO US,
4 PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION, AND PROTECTION AS A THREE-LEGGED
5 STOOL, AND YOU NEEDED ALL THREE, THE STOOL COULD NOT EXIST OR
6 STAND BALANCED WITHOUT THE OTHERS. AND PROTECTING OUR TENANTS,
7 ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS THAT IS ENDEMIC THROUGHOUT THE
8 BAY AREA, THIS VASTLY WEALTHY REGION, AND, YET, WE HAVE PEOPLE
9 SLEEPING UNDER FREEWAY OVERPASSES AND CREEK BEDS, AND JUST
10 PLACES WHERE HUMANS SHOULDN'T LIVE, IS JUST SO FUNDAMENTAL.
11 AND, SO, I DO NOT WANT TO SEE, AND I CANNOT SUPPORT HAVING
12 THAT AS A PICK AND CHOOSE -- CHOOSE ONE, OR TWO, OR NONE, IN
13 THE CRITERIA. THAT CRITERIA, I FIRMLY BELIEVE, HAS TO STAY
14 INTACT AND HAS TO STAY AS A REQUIREMENT. AND I HEARD -- I HAD
15 TO STEP OUT WHEN THERE WAS A QUESTION -- OR A PUBLIC SPEAKER,
16 AND THERE WERE LOTS OF LANDLORDS, MOM AND POPS, IF YOU WILL,
17 SPEAKING. AND I HAD A FLASHBACK TO, OH, A GOOD EIGHT YEARS
18 AGO, WHEN MY CITY -- MAYBE EVEN A LITTLE LONGER -- WHEN MY
19 CITY WENT THROUGH DOING OUR RENT CONTROL ORDINANCE, IT WAS
20 VERY CONTENTIOUS. AND WE HEARD FROM VERY ANGRY LANDLORDS. BUT
21 WHAT WE DID--THE A PROCESS, AND YOU JUST CAN'T OVERSTATE THE
22 IMPORTANCE OF COMMUNICATION. WE WORKED WITH THE LANDLORD
23 GROUPS, WITH THE LANDLORD GROUPS OF DIFFERENT SIZES, WE WORKED
24 WITH THE TENANT ORGANIZATIONS. WE CREATED A RENT PROGRAM THAT
25 IS FLOURISHING TODAY BOTH PROTECTING TENANTS BUT ALSO HELPING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 EDUCATE LANDLORDS, AND I WILL HASTEN TO SAY THAT THE VAST
2 MAJORITY OF LANDLORDS WANT TO DO THE RIGHT THING. SOMETIMES
3 THEY DON'T KNOW WHAT THE LAWS ARE THAT APPLY TO THEM, HOW TO
4 COMPLY WITH REGULATIONS THAT'S WHERE WE COME IN TO HELP, AND
5 WE DO IT IN A VARIETY OF LANGUAGES. THE SO, I HAVE BEEN AT
6 THAT POINT IN THE CONVERSATION, BUT I HAVE ALSO SEEN IT ON THE
7 OTHER END. IT WORKS TO PROTECT BOTH LANDLORDS AND TENANTS TO
8 HELP PEOPLE BE ABLE TO IMPROVE THEIR PROPERTY, ALL THOSE
9 IMPORTANT THINGS. THIS IS NOT THE TIME. WE HAVE NOT SOLVED THE
10 HOUSING CRISIS IN THE BAY AREA, NOT BY A LONG SHOT. THIS ISN'T
11 THE TIME TO MAKE THIS MULTIPLE CHOICE, OR CHOOSE NONE OF THE
12 ABOVE. SO, I VERY MUCH EMBRACE EVERYTHING THAT WAS SAID IN THE
13 SPUR LETTER, AND I HOPE WE WILL, AS WELL. THANK YOU, CHAIR.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ANDERSON?

16

17 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES THANK YOU. NOW I'LL TALK ABOUT HOUSING.
18 [LAUGHTER] AND I WANT TO THANK STAFF ACTUALLY FOR YOUR
19 PROPOSAL. I'M SUPPORTIVE OF US TAKING A DEEPER DIVE AND
20 REFLECTING. I AGREE THAT THE THREE P'S ARE REALLY, REALLY
21 IMPORTANT. AND I THINK WHAT IT OFTEN COMES DOWN TO IS, WHAT
22 ARE THOSE AND WHO IS DEFINING THEM. I'M LOOKING AT PROBABLY
23 THE MOST IMPORTANT THING TO ME IS PRODUCTION. AND I THINK YOU
24 CAN'T HAVE PRODUCTION UNLESS YOU HAVE WILLING BUILDERS. OF THE
25 IT'S NOT GOVERNMENT MONEY THAT'S GOING TO BUILD T IT'S GOING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 TO BE A COMBINATION THEREOF. AND A LOT HAS CHANGED SINCE 2022.
2 AND I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK THAT WENT IN WITH THE ORIGINAL
3 MTC COMMISSIONER, STATE LAW HAS SIGNIFICANT HE CHANGED. AND I
4 APPRECIATE THAT'S SOMETHING THAT STAFF IS GOING TO BE LOOKING
5 AT AND INCORPORATING. IS TO, WHAT ARE CITIES, COUNTIES,
6 ALREADY REQUIRED TO DO UNDER STATE LAW WHETHER THAT BE
7 PRESERVATION, PRODUCTION, OR OUR THIRD P, AS I'M SITTING HERE.
8 I THINK THERE IS DIFFERENCE OF OPINIONS WITH REGARD TO HOW YOU
9 PRESERVE HOUSING. YOU KNOW, I REPRESENT PARTS OF CONTRA COSTA
10 COUNTY WHERE WE APPROVED HOUSING BEFORE I WAS ON THE BOARD OF
11 SUPERVISORS WITH ONLY 20 YEARS AFFORDABILITY COMPONENT. AND SO
12 NOW THOSE UNITS ARE BECOMING -- THEY HAVE COME UP. I'M HAVING
13 PEOPLE COME UP TO ME AND SAY HEY, THIS ISN'T -- I CAN'T AFFORD
14 THIS HOUSING ANYMORE, BECAUSE MY AFFORDABILITY IS GONE. YOU
15 KNOW? CAN WE HAVE POLICIES ENCOURAGE LONGER LENGTHS OF TIME
16 WHEN YOU ARE BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THINGS THAT ACTUALLY
17 ARE WORKING I APPRECIATE YOU TAKING SERIOUSLY MY SUGGESTION
18 THAT WE LOOK AT COUNTIES WHERE WE HAVE THE COUNTY PROVIDING
19 ALMOST ALL SOCIAL SERVICES AT WHAT PROGRAMS ARE ALREADY IN
20 PLACE. I THINK THIS'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT, AS WELL. BUT AT
21 THE END OF THE DAY, WHAT I WAS HEARING FROM MY CITIES WAS A
22 REAL CONCERN. AND THESE WERE FROM CITIES WITH BART STATIONS
23 WHO WERE BUILDING HOUSING, WHO ARE SAYING IT WANT WORKING THE
24 WAY WE HAD IT SET UP. SO, TO ME, TAKING A LITTLE PAUSE,
25 LOOKING AT THIS AS TO HOW WE CAN STILL CONTINUE THIS SPIRIT OF



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 PROVIDING THIS, BUT IN A PRACTICAL WAY, TAKING INTO
2 CONSIDERATION EVERYTHING ELSE THAT CITIES ARE ALREADY BEING
3 REQUIRED TO DO, TAKING INTO ACCOUNT ALL OF THE ADVANTAGES THAT
4 THEY CURRENTLY HAVE THROUGH OTHER PROGRAMS THAT ARE IN PLACE,
5 AND INFORMING, MAKING THAT INFORM THE PROCESS THAT WE GO
6 THROUGH. SO, I'M NOT INCLINED -- I REALLY THINK THE TWO, JUST
7 BECAUSE WE HAVE, SORT OF, SET OUT FOR MUCH OF THE PUBLIC TO,
8 THIS IS THE PROCESS WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH, I THINK WE
9 SHOULD HONOR THAT PROCESS AND EVEN IF IT TAKES A LITTLE BIT
10 LONGER, END OF THE DAY, I THINK WE ALL WANT TO CONTINUE TO
11 PRIORITIZE HOUSING AROUND TRANSIT. IT MAKES SO MUCH SENSE, BUT
12 WE HAVE DO IT IN A WAY THAT WILL ACTUALLY WORK. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

15

16 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO SAY THAT I ASSOCIATE
17 MY COMMENTS STRONGLY WITH COMMISSIONER SCHAFF. AS A
18 REPRESENTATIVE FROM SAN FRANCISCO, I TOTALLY HEAR YOU,
19 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON, AND I WONDER. SO THE DEBATE THAT WE'RE
20 HAVING, I THINK, IS A DIFFERENCE IN THE ADOPTION OF, LIKE,
21 URBANIST TOOLS IN THE TOOLBOX OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED
22 COMMUNITIES PLAN REFLECTING OUR COMMUNITIES, WHICH ARE VERY
23 DIFFERENT. SO, WHEN YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT INFILL DEVELOPMENT
24 AND THE NECESSITY TO PROTECT RENTERS IN SAN FRANCISCO, IT'S
25 VERY DIFFERENT THAN DOING GREENFIELD DEVELOPMENT IN A COUNTY



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WHERE THINGS ARE NOT BUILT OUT AS WELL. WHEN YOU ARE BUILDING
2 A TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE AT THE SAME TIME AS HOUSING. I
3 THINK PART OF THE TRICK THAT WE NEED TO PURSUE IS MAKING SURE
4 THAT WE GET IT RIGHT FOR EVERYONE WHILE AT THE SAME TIME NOT
5 ABANDONING VISION AND THE PRINCIPLES THAT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF,
6 YOU KNOW, STATED, FOR THIS ALL STARTED FROM. AND I WONDER IF,
7 FOR STAFF, THANK YOU SO MUCH, YOU'RE DOING, LIKE, AMAZING WORK
8 [LAUGHTER] -- TRYING TO HERD ALL THE CATS, BUT IF WE SHOULDN'T
9 HAVE THAT CONVERSATION ABOUT REITERATION OF THE STATEMENT OF
10 PRINCIPLES AND GOALS TO BEGIN WITH IF WE DIVE INTO THE TOOLBOX
11 AND THE, YOU KNOW, DETAILS. BECAUSE I FEAR THAT WE ARE LOSING
12 SITE OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH AND HOW WE CAN, SORT
13 OF, YOU KNOW, SORT OF, GET THAT RIGHT, ENGRAVING IT TO TARGET
14 THE NEEDS OF VERY DIFFERENT REALITY BETWEEN URBAN AND SUBURBAN
15 AND, YOU KNOW, PERI URBAN, AND AT THE SAME TIME TRYING TO
16 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE POLITICAL REALITY FOR THOSE VOTERS IN
17 DIFFERENT PLACES IS DIFFERENT. AND YOU KNOW WE'RE LIVING IN A
18 TIME RIGHT NOW WHERE FROM THE FEDERAL LEVER ALL THE WAY DOWN
19 WE'RE HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE DENYING CLIMATE CHANGE, IN THIS
20 CONVERSATION DENYING THE FACT THAT WE HAVE A HOUSING CRISIS IN
21 THE BAY AREA AND EVEN WISHING FOR A TIME WHERE WE'RE NOT
22 GROWING ECONOMICALLY. SORT OF, SAYING THESE PEOPLE NORTE GOING
23 TO LIVE HERE, WE ACTUALLY SHOULD BE PLANNING FOR POPULATION
24 DECREASE, WHICH WOULD BE TERRIBLE FOR EVERYONE LIVING HERE
25 WITH DEFICIT BUDGETS AND A DECREASE IN JOBS. AND, SO, I THINK



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 THAT, YOU KNOW, GIVEN THAT POLITICAL REALITY, SORT OF,
2 REITERATING OUR VISION AND OUR GOALS, AND AGREEING ON THE
3 PRINCIPLE BEFORE WE DIVE INTO THE DETAILS MIGHT BE HELPFUL.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?

7

8 **AMBER MANFREE:** THANK YOU. I REALLY APPRECIATE THIS THOUGHTFUL
9 CONVERSATION. IT'S INTERESTING TO LISTEN TO ALL THE DIFFERENT
10 PERSPECTIVES. SO, I'M JUST GOING TO GET KIND OF, YOU KNOW,
11 RIGHT TO WHERE NAPA COUNTY MAYBE HAS A CONCERN. AND, YOU KNOW,
12 I HAVE HEARD FROM STAFF THAT SOME HOW WILL SHAKE OUT SO THAT
13 WE'RE CONSIDERED IN A WAY WHERE WE GET RESOURCES, YOU KNOW.
14 BUT I HAVEN'T REALLY HEARD A SPECIFIC PLAN OR SCHEMA FOR THAT.
15 SO WHAT MAKES SENSE TO ME IS A SUPPORT THE NORTH BAY SET ASIDE
16 CONCEPT. I THINK TAKING ABOUT 10 MILLION OUT OF THE REGIONAL
17 POT AND AUGMENTING THE NORTH BAY SHARE, SPLITTING THAT FOUR
18 WAYS AMONG THE COUNTIES MIGHT MAKE SENSE FOR US. OTHER NORTH
19 BAY COUNTIES WHICH MAY HAVE TRANSIT ORIENT THE COMMUNITIES
20 DON'T HAVE NEARLY AS MANY LOCATIONS THAT WILL QUALIFY. SO, I
21 THINK THIS IS A WAY TO KIND OF BRIDGE THAT GAP IN THE NATURE
22 OF OUR -- THE WAY THIS OUR LANDSCAPES HAVE OR HAVEN'T BEEN
23 DEVELOPED SO FAR. AND I THINK THAT GOING IN THIS DIRECTION
24 WOULD ALLOW US TO DO IT IN A WAY THAT DOESN'T CREATE AN
25 ADMINISTRATIVE BURDEN, IT DOESN'T REALLY CREATE A LOT MORE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WORK THAT WAY. SO, YEAH, JUST TO THE POINT THERE. LET'S SEE
2 WHAT ELSE PEOPLE HAVE TO SAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

5

6 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. COMMISSIONER MELGAR, I REALLY
7 APPRECIATE YOU GOING BACK TO PRINCIPLES AND I THINK AS WE SIT
8 HERE WITH THIS VERY WIDE REACH OF A COMMISSION THAT PRINCIPLES
9 WOULD CERTAINLY HELP TO ANCHOR US IN WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO
10 ACHIEVE, IN FACT PRINCIPLES ARE WHAT GOT US TO SB63, THE
11 TRANSIT FUND THING MEASURE. AND I THINK WE NEED TO THINK IN
12 THAT WAY. IT'S MY SINCERE HOPE, I EVEN SAID THIS WEARING MY
13 BAHFA HAT THAT WE NEED TO START WITH THOSE PRINCIPLES BECAUSE
14 THEN WE CAN ALL BE WORKING TOWARDS THEM. A COUPLE OF THINGS
15 THAT I WANT TO -- I HAVE HEARD EVERYONE, AND IT'S INTERESTING,
16 I SIT IN THIS POSITION WITH SPEAKING TO YOU -- AS OF RIGHT
17 NOW, I HAVE NO DOG IN THE FIGHT BECAUSE I HAVE NO DOLLARS,
18 WHICH CAN ALSO MAKE ME SUPER ANGRY, BUT WITH THE SPIRIT OF
19 COMMISSIONER AHN'S SUGGESTION, LET'S TRY AND NOT LEAVE THIS
20 CONVERSATION ANGRY, I'M GOING TO TRY TO GET US TO A PLACE OF
21 SOME CONSENSUS. BUT I DO AGREE WE SHOULD BE WORKING ON SOME
22 CONSENSUS. AND I HEAR WHAT HAS COME FORWARD. SO, IF I'M DOING
23 MY NUMBERS HERE RIGHT, IT'S ABOUT HALF OF US THAT THINK THAT
24 THE GAP CONTRIBUTION -- I'M GOING TO TRY AND USE WORDS. GAP
25 CONTRIBUTION SB125 SHOULD COME OFF OF THE -- WHAT IT THE --



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 OFF THE TOP, AS OPPOSED TO THE REGION. AND SO, I -- THIS IS
2 THE FIRST TIME WE HAVE ENDEAVORED THIS. AND, SO, WHERE MY
3 COMMENTS ARE COMING FROM -- AND I ASK FOR ASSISTANCE IN TRYING
4 TO FIGURE OUT WHAT OTHER EXAMPLES DO WE HAVE OF A COST SHARE.
5 AND I'M ACTUALLY GOING TO PROPOSE -- AND I THINK IT WOULD BE
6 VERY HELPFUL FOR US TO START OFF IN DISCUSSING THE MONETARY
7 PORTIONS FIRST SO THAT WE CAN REALLY GET TO WHAT THE CRUX IS
8 OF EVERYTHING ELSE. BECAUSE THIS KIND OF HOLDS -- THE MONETARY
9 PORTIONS ARE HOLDING UP THE REST OF THE DISCUSSION, HOW
10 MEANINGFUL IS THE TOC GOING TO BE WHAT'S THE NORTH BAY SET
11 ASIDE GOING TO BE. BUT IF WE WERE TO USE THE STIP DISTRIBUTION
12 WHICH IS 75 REGIONAL -- 75% TO THE RTIP AND 25% TO I TIP AS A
13 GUIDING PRINCIPLE, SO THAT WE WOULD TAKE FROM THE -- WE WOULD
14 TAKE FROM THE REGIONAL POT 75% OF IT, AND ASCRIBE 25% TO THE
15 COUNTIES, WE WOULD ALSO BE INVESTED IN THE REGIONAL OUTCOME.
16 IT WOULDN'T BE AS LARGE OF A REDUCTION TO THE COUNTIES. IT
17 WOULD STILL BE A REDUCTION TO ALL OF THE COUNTIES, OUT OF THE
18 COUNTY SHARE. BUT I THINK THAT THIS SHOWS OUR REGIONAL
19 COMMITMENT. I ABSOLUTELY HEAR YOU, COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN. YOU
20 KNOW, YOU HAVE TRANSIT OPERATORS, AND YOU ARE NEEDING THAT
21 MONEY IN A MORE FLEXIBLE WAY FOR YOUR COUNTY. WE ARE ALL
22 WORKING WITH LESS RIGHT NOW. BUT I PUT THAT UP FOR YOUR
23 CONSIDERATION, THAT PERHAPS A 75/25 SPLIT, AND WHAT THE
24 OVERALL OUTCOME WOULD BE IS THAT THE 7% REDUCTION FOR THE
25 COUNTIES, VERSUS THE TOTAL OVER ON THE OTHER SIDE. SO, FOR THE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NORTH BAY, AND I -- I DO BELIEVE THAT THE PURPOSES HERE OF THE
2 TOC POLICY, I VERY MUCH BELIEVE IN WHAT IT IS WORKING TOWARDS,
3 BACK TO THE PRINCIPLES, IT IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THIS IS
4 LONG-RANGE PLANNING. I -- YOU KNOW, I WAS THINKING, AND NOT TO
5 BE ISN'T THAT CORRECT E BUT THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR JUST
6 REMINDED US OF ALL THE EXECUTIVE TRIPS WE WENT ON AND GUESS
7 WHAT YOU'RE LEARNING ABOUT PUTTING HOUSING NEXT TO TRANSIT SO
8 IF YOU ENJOYED YOUR TRIPS TO ASIA, PORTLAND, OR WHEREVER WE
9 ALL WENT. THAT'S EXACTLY -- I HAVE TAKEN ONE TO MIAMI.
10 PHENOMENAL THE TRIP I TOOK WITH STAFF A FEW YEARS AGO TO
11 MIAMI, WHERE I LITERALLY TO SEE WHAT HOUSING AND BUSINESS
12 LOOKS LIKE NEXT TO TRANSIT AND TRAINS GOING THROUGH BUILDINGS,
13 WHICH FELT VERY BACK TO THE FUTURISH TO ME, AT THE MOMENT,
14 BECAUSE WE'RE NOT THERE, THAT IS WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE.
15 WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE SYNERGY BETWEEN ALL THE SPOTS -- ALL
16 THE PLACES AND WORK THAT WE, AS A COMMISSION, ARE RESPONSIBLE
17 FOR. SO, I APPRECIATE THAT. BUT I ALSO APPRECIATE THE
18 DIVERSITY AND GEOGRAPHY AND COMPLEXITY OF OUR REGION THAT
19 WE'RE NOT THE SAME. AND SO, I WOULD OFFER UP, YOU KNOW, FOR
20 THE NORTH BAY, I THINK THERE ARE A COUPLE WAYS TO DO A NORTH
21 BAY SET ASIDE. AND I THINK ONE OF THE WAYS WE CAN GO BACK TO
22 USING THE PD'S STRUCTURE AND THE PDA FUNDING, THE THAT OBAG
23 THREE HAD, AND UTILIZING THAT SPECIFICALLY FOR THE NORTH BAY.
24 THE OTHER ONE WOULD BE -- AND WITH THEN I HAD MENTIONED THIS
25 BEFORE, WHAT THE NORTH BAY REALLY, REALLY STRUGGLES WITH IS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 BIKE PED AND VISION ZERO ACHIEVEMENTS. WE, IN NAPA COUNTY, WE
2 HAVE ONE OF THE MOST DANGEROUS ROADWAYS FOR BICYCLES. FOR
3 BICYCLISTS. AND I KNOW THAT THIS IS VERY NEAR AND DEAR TO VICE
4 CHAIR COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETER'S HEART, AND MARIN STRUGGLES
5 IN THE SAME WAY, SO, I'M NOT NECESSARILY LOOKING FOR SOMETHING
6 THAT IS NEW, A NEW PROGRAM. WHAT I'M LOOKING FOR IS
7 ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT WE CAN PLAY IN THIS GAME WITH EVERYONE,
8 JUST NOT IN THE SAME WAY AND AT THE SAME CALIBER. SO THAT WE
9 CAN ACHIEVE THAT. RIGHT? YOU'RE AT THE POINT, YOU HAVE THE
10 TRANSPORTATION, SO NOW IT'S A MATTER OF HOW DO WE CHALLENGE
11 OURSELVES PLACE THAT HOUSING NEAR THE TRANSPORTATION? WE DON'T
12 YET HAVE ALL THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, SO WE CAN'T EVEN BEGIN
13 TO IMAGINE WHAT HOUSING AROUND TRANSPORTATION WOULD LOOK LIKE.
14 SO, I WOULD JUST CHALLENGE US TO THINK ABOUT BACK TO THE
15 PRINCIPLES, HOW DO WE GET THERE. I THINK THERE'S A WAY FOR US
16 TO BE SUPPORTIVE, ACKNOWLEDGE AND RECOGNIZE THE SHORTCOMINGS
17 THAT WE ALL HAVE, AND WE HAVE SHORTCOMINGS BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT
18 ACHIEVED THE BALANCE THAT WE NEED TO ACHIEVE. THAT'S WHY THIS
19 IS HARD. I'LL STOP THERE.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

22

23 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I THINK IT'S HELPFUL THIS KIND OF SESSION
24 WHERE EVERYBODY SAYS WHAT THEY THINK AND WANT. BECAUSE STAFF
25 YOU HAVE BEEN IN THIS UNFORTUNATE POSITION TRYING TO CRAFT A



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 POLICY TWO VOICES WHO SAY ONE THING ON ONE DAY AND A COUPLE
2 WHO SAY ANOTHER THING ON ANOTHER DAY AND IT'S REALLY
3 IMPOSSIBLE. BUT I DO THINK WHAT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF AND MELGAR
4 AND RAMOS HAVE SAID AROUND GETTING BACK TO PRINCIPLES, WE HERE
5 ARE TRYING TO DO LONG-RANGE PLANNING FOR A BAY AREA THAT WORKS
6 FOR OUR CHILDREN AND GRANDCHILDREN, AND ONE WHERE EMISSIONS
7 AND POLLUTION ARE REALLY DRIVEN DOWN, AND THAT, IN THIS MOMENT
8 IS JUST SO HARD TO DO. BECAUSE WHATEVER WE DECIDE TODAY -- I
9 WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, IT'S A LOSE-LOSE. IF WE DO WHAT WE NEED
10 TO DO FOR THE FUTURE TODAY, WE'RE GOING TO GO HOME TO OUR
11 COUNTIES AND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE LESS, AND THAT IS JUST REALLY
12 HARD TO DO. AND IF WE GO HOME TO OUR COUNTIES AND SAY YES
13 WE'RE GOING TO BRING HOME THE FULL SHARE, OR WE'RE NOT GOING
14 TO TAKE THIS MONEY OFF THE TOP, WE'RE TELLING OUR KIDS AND OUR
15 GRANDKIDS THAT WE HAD GOOD PRINCIPLES, WE HAD THE SCIENTIFIC
16 INFORMATION BUT DIDN'T HAVE THE NERVE TO SAY NO TO OURSELVES
17 NOW. AND IN LEADERSHIP WE OFTEN TALK ABOUT THE ABILITY TO NOT
18 -- NOT GIVE INTO SELF--- INTO INSTANT GRATIFICATION, BUT
19 SAYING NO IT'S JUST -- IT'S A REALLY, REALLY TOUGH THING TO
20 DO. AND I URGE ALL OF US WHO DO BELIEVE IN CLIMATE SCIENCE,
21 WHO BELIEVE IN OUR CHILDREN AND GRANDCHILDREN TO TRY TO STAY
22 STRONG IN DOING THAT. BUT I THINK WE SHOULD DO IT WITH A
23 MEASURED HAND, KINDNESS AND FAIRNESS. I THINK WHAT
24 COMMISSIONER RAMOS SUPPORT -- PUT FORWARD AROUND A 75/25 SPLIT
25 IS REASONABLE. IT'S NOT MY FAVORITE THING. I THINK 50/50 SHOWS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SOLIDARITY ACROSS THE BOARD IN A CERTAIN WAY BUT I BELIEVE IN
2 COMPROMISE LIKE WHAT COMMISSIONER AHN SAID US NOT WALKING AWAY
3 IN THE RIGHT WAY ANGRY. SO I'LL BE SECONDING THE IDEA OF A
4 75/SPLIT. YOU'RE STILL GOING TO BE ANGRY.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WORKING ON IT. THE.

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THE OTHER OPTION YOU GUYS COME FORWARD WITH
9 A 50/50 SPLIT. AND FOR ME THE THING IS THIS IF WE DO 75/25, I
10 KNOW IT'S REALLY TOUGH BUT I WANT TO DO THE TOC COMPLIANCE
11 ASAP. BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE -- IT'S LIKE THIS, IF YOU HAVE A
12 CRUISE SHIP AND YOU PICK THE NORTH STAR FOR THE CRUISE SHIP
13 BUT YOU DON'T PUT ANY GAS POUR AT THIS POINT ELECTRIC
14 BATTERIES, RIGHT, THAT SHIP IS NOT GOING TO GO WHERE YOU WANT
15 IT TO GO. SO WE HAVE ALL SAID WE'RE GOING TO POINT IT IN THIS
16 DIRECTION, BUT IF WE DO NOT FUND IT, WE'RE DOING NOTHING. SO I
17 SAY LET'S GO 75/25, BUT LET'S IMPLEMENT TOC NOW. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. FIRST OFF, WE'RE NOT VOTING ON ANYTHING
22 TODAY. THANKFULLY. AND, YOU KNOW, WE ALL HAVE COMMON GOALS
23 HERE. I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN HERE IS THAT TIMES
24 HAVE CHANGED AND WE ARE BEING, LIKE, AN AVALANCHE OF STATE
25 LAWS HERE, WHICH IS GOOD, WHICH ARE TRYING TO GET EVERYBODY ON



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 THE SAME PAGE, AND I DON'T THINK ANYBODY LOCALLY HERE, IF YOU
2 HAVE HAD TO DO YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT, YOU HAVE SPENT HUNDREDS
3 OF THOUSANDS OF DOLLARS COMPLYING WITH THAT, DOING JUST WHAT
4 HAS BEEN SAID HERE, DEVELOPING AROUND TRANSIT. AND IF YOU
5 HAVEN'T SEEN THAT, COME TO MY COUNTY. OKAY? WE ARE DOING THAT.
6 SO, I MEAN, A LITTLE -- NOT ANGRY, BUT I AM TRYING TO GET
7 PEOPLE TO REALIZE, THINGS ARE BEING DONE HERE. WE NEED TO
8 RECOGNIZE THAT. AND AS I SAID AT THE WORKSHOP IS THAT, THAT'S
9 WHAT WE NEED TO BE LOOKING AT. WHAT IS WORKING. CITY OF
10 DUBLIN, FASTEST GROWING CITY. HOW ARE THEY DOING THAT? HOW IS
11 THAT HAPPENING? MILLBRAE, IN SAN MATEO, FASTEST GROWING CITY
12 WITHOUT THE TOC. WE'RE GETTING IT DONE. AND WE ARE STILL --
13 THERE ARE SO MANY APPROVED PROJECTS IN THE PIPELINE. WE ARE
14 TRYING TO WORK WITH DEVELOPERS TO GET THEM DONE. I HAVE TEN
15 STORIES NEXT TO THE BART STATION 488 HOUSING UNITS MUCH A
16 PERCENTAGE AFFORDABLE HERE BELIEVE IT OR NOT HIGH SPEED RAIL
17 GOT IN THE WAY. WE ARE DOING THESE THINGS AND I THINK WE NEED
18 TO RECOGNITION THAT WE AS COMMISSIONERS -- WE SET POLICY, WE
19 CAN ALSO CHANGE POLICY, SO YOU'RE NOT COMMITTED TO THINGS OF
20 THE PAST BUT WE NEED TO LOOK AT THE REALITY HOW ARE THESE LAWS
21 WORKING HERE THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO WORK WITH AND THAT'S
22 REALLY THE IMPACT ON OUR CITIES. SO, I REALLY --

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THAT WE NEED TO KEEP. [AUDIO DISTORTION] --

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OOPS. SOMEBODY HAS GOT TO MUTE.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ISSUES WITH PARKING. OKAY, IF YOU
4 ARE END OF THE LINE STATION -- YOU NEED PARKING TO GET PEOPLE
5 ON TRANSIT SO WE CAN REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES. BUT I HEAR
6 PEOPLE FROM THE EAST BAY I CAN'T GET TO THE END OF THE LINE
7 PARKING I GOT TO DRIVE TO NEXT ONE. THESE ARE ALL ISSUES THAT
8 NEED TO BE EVALUATED WHAT'S WORKING WHAT'S NOT WORKING HERE.
9 THE GOALS NOBODY DISAGREES WITH. BUT WE'RE KIND OF TALKING
10 LIKE THINGS ARE NOT GETTING DONE WHEN IN FACT THEY ARE. STATE
11 LAW GOES THROUGH AN INTENSE PROCESS OPEN HEARINGS WHERE ALL
12 ADVOCATES GET TO SPEAK WHERE EVERYBODY HAS THEIR INPUT AND
13 WITH THEN THEY ARE GIVEN TO US. AND I DON'T THINK ANYBODY WILL
14 DENY THAT IT'S BEEN AN AVALANCHE OF LAWS THAT WE NEED TO
15 COMPLY WITH THAT HAVE THE SAME GOALS AS PLANNED BAY AREA, THAT
16 ARE TRYING TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES, THAT ARE TRYING TO GET
17 HOUSING NEAR TRANSIT. THESE THINGS ARE HAPPENING. BUT I THINK
18 WE ARE KIND OF AT A DISADVANTAGE. AND, YES, THIS HAS BEEN
19 GOING ON FOR YEARS, THE PROCESS. AND I COMPLIMENT STAFF, THANK
20 YOU FOR GIVING JURISDICTIONS ADDITIONAL TIME TO ACTUALLY LOOK
21 AT THE GRANTS OR COMPLY WITH THE GRANTS YOU HAVE GIVEN THEM TO
22 STUDY THIS KIND OF THING. THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. WILL IT
23 WORK IN ONE JURISDICTION AND MAYBE NOT ANOTHER? THAT'S THE
24 MOST IMPORTANT THING WE NEED TO BE DOING HERE. SO, AND I ASK
25 THE CHAIR HERE -- AND ALSO THE LONGEST SERVING COMMISSIONER



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 HERE, HOW DO WE, AS COMMISSIONERS -- AND ONE NON-VOTING -- YES
2 IF WE WANT TO MARK THAT FOR THE RECORD --

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DOREEN AS WELL.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** DOREEN, YES, WHERE IS DOREEN. OKAY. SO, I ASK THE
7 CHAIR --

8

9 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** RIGHT HERE.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS DOREEN.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** THANKS DOREEN. GOOD TO HEAR YA. HOW DO WE AS
14 COMMISSIONERS ENSURE THAT THESE DISCUSSIONS, LIKE TODAY, GO ON
15 THAT WHAT COMMISSIONERS AND JURISDICTIONS ARE EXPRESSING
16 BECOME A PART OF THE OVERALL EVALUATION WITHOUT BEING KIND OF
17 INFLUENCED BY PERSONAL PREFERENCES FROM ONE GROUP OR ANOTHER.
18 WHAT WE LEARNED AT THE WORKSHOP WAS THAT, MAYBE CERTAIN
19 ADVOCATES OR CERTAIN STAKEHOLDERS WERE NOT PART OF THE
20 PROCESS. AND THAT DOESN'T HELP US TRYING TO MAKE EDUCATED
21 DECISIONS HERE. BECAUSE EVERYONE HERE, I HOPE, WOULD WANT AS
22 MUCH INFORMATION AS POSSIBLE. SO, WHEN I'M ASKING THE CHAIR
23 HERE, I'M NOT SURE HOW WE GO ABOUT THIS OR EVEN IF WE HAVE A
24 POLICY THAT, WHEN THE COMMITTEES MEET, AND THERE IS A CERTAIN
25 DISCUSSION, HOW THAT BECOMES A PART OF THE MESSAGE TO THE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ENTIRE COMMISSION. I DON'T FINISH WE HAVE THAT. I HAVEN'T SEEN
2 IT. BUT WE HAVE GREAT CONVERSATIONS, AS WE ARE TODAY, THAT WE
3 NEED TO ENSURE THAT THESE POLICY MAKERS HAVE AS MUCH
4 INFORMATION AS POSSIBLE. SO, IF WE CAN, KIND OF TRY TO DEVELOP
5 THAT AS WE GO DOWN THIS AVENUE TO MAKE THIS AS SUCCESSFUL AS
6 POSSIBLE. I HOPE WE CAN COME UP WITH SOMETHING THAT ACTUALLY,
7 WE WERE AT THE WORKSHOP, THERE WAS A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS GOING
8 ON, STAFF CAPTURED SOME OF IT, BUT, I THINK THERE WERE A LOT
9 OF MESSAGES SENT BY COMMISSIONERS THAT NEEDED TO BE EXPRESSED.
10 AND I'LL SAY VOTING COMMISSIONERS AT THAT ONE. [LAUGHTER] TO
11 HELP MAKE THE RESULTS HERE BETTER. AND IT IS CONCERNING WHEN
12 WE HAVE, AGAIN, THIS HAS BEEN TWO YEARS IN COMING, YOU HAVE
13 LETTERS IN YOUR PACKET, BUT BEFORE THAT, THERE WERE LETTERS
14 UPON LETTERS UPON LETTERS FROM LOCAL JURISDICTIONS THAT SHOULD
15 BE IMPACTING WHATEVER DECISION WE MAKE. BECAUSE THOSE ARE THE
16 PEOPLE WE ARE IMPACTING. SO, IN OUR PROCESS MADAM CHAIR WE CAN
17 BE MORE UNIVERSAL HOW WE PRESENT THE ASPECTS OF IT THERE HAVE
18 BEEN CERTAIN MODIFICATIONS AND CHANGES WHICH ARE APPRECIATE
19 BUT I THINK THE TIME NOW IS NOT JUMP THE GUN AND ADD MORE ON
20 JURISDICTIONS BUT REALLY LOOK AT HOUSING ELEMENTS AND STATE
21 LAW, AND LOOK HCD IS THE PRINCIPLE HERE, THEY CAN TAKEAWAY
22 YOUR HOUSING ELEMENT JUST AS HARD AS YOU HAVE WORKED TO GET
23 THAT. SO, THERE IS OVERSIGHT TO ENSURE THAT THERE IS
24 DEVELOPMENT AROUND TRANSIT, THAT ALL THE ASPECTS OF PLANNED
25 BAY AREA ARE HAPPENING HERE, BUT WE NEED TO RESPECT THAT. AND



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WE NEED TO WORK WITH THAT AND REALLY FIND OUT WHAT THE REALITY
2 IS, MANY OF YOU HERE, YOU KNOW THE REALITY. YOUR STAFF HAS
3 TOLD YOU WHAT THAT IS, SO HOW DO WE MAKE THAT WORK TO THE BEST
4 POSSIBLE OUTCOME? BECAUSE I KNOW WE ALL BELIEVE IN PLANNED BAY
5 AREA AND THE GOALS THEREOF. BUT I DON'T THINK WE HAVE REALLY
6 REACHED THE BEST POSSIBLE RESULT WITH THE TOC. BECAUSE I THINK
7 THAT EXCEEDS STATE LAW. AND I APPRECIATE STAFF RECOGNIZING
8 THAT, PARTICULARLY NOT IMPOSING IT ON THE LOCAL. BECAUSE YOU
9 ARE GETTING THE RESULTS. I THINK, ACTUALLY ADDING ON, AS SOME
10 HAVE SUGGESTED HERE, WILL SLOW DOWN THE PROCESS. OF GETTING
11 THE HOUSING DONE, OF GETTING PEOPLE ON TRANSIT. AND WE DON'T
12 WANT TO SEE THAT. WE WANT TO SEE RESULTS HERE. SO, WE NEED TO
13 FOCUS ON WHAT IS BEFORE US AND THE BENEFITS TO ACHIEVING THESE
14 GOALS. WE ARE ACHIEVING THE GOALS. WE MUST TAKE THAT INTO
15 CONSIDERATION HERE AND ENSURE THE PROCESS IS NOT HIJACKED BY
16 ONE GROUP OVER ANOTHER, BUT KIND OF WHAT THE STATE, PEOPLE WE
17 ELECTED, HAVE GIVEN US TO GET THOSE GOALS GOING HERE. AND I
18 THINK WE NEED TO BE MORE TRANSPARENT. I'M GOING TO ASK,
19 BECAUSE WE'RE NOT DECIDING FULLY HERE, THAT IF YOU DECIDE IT'S
20 100%, AND IT'S 50/50, SHOW A CHART. THIS IS HOW YOUR COUNTY
21 WILL BE IMPACTED. THIS IS THE FUNDING YOU WOULD LOSE. WE ALL
22 KIND OF HAVE IT. WE WERE GIVEN IT LAST TIME BY ALL OF OUR
23 LOCALS HERE. EVERY COMMISSIONER HERE NEEDS TO SEE WHAT
24 PERCENTAGE YOU WOULD GET OR WOULDN'T GET. AND IT'S 75/25, I
25 STILL DON'T BELIEVE THAT INVESTMENT SHOULD BE MADE AT THIS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 TIME BECAUSE EVERYONE IS STRUGGLING. EVERY TIME OF CHANGE,
2 SINCE 2022, PEOPLE ARE NOT WORKING IN SAN FRANCISCO. THEY ARE
3 COMMUTING OUTSIDE. THEY'RE GOING OTHER PLACES HERE. WHAT IS
4 REALLY WORKING? WHAT ARE THE IMPACTS? SO, I WOULD SUGGEST THAT
5 WE HAVE SOME, SORT OF, A POLICY THAT ALL THE COMMUNICATIONS
6 THAT HAVE BEEN RECEIVED HERE, IT'S NOT JUST THE MOST RECENT
7 LETTERS, EDUCATE NEW COMMISSIONERS HERE. WHAT WE'RE DOING AND
8 HOW IT WILL IMPACT OUR FUTURE. I TOO WANT US TO ACHIEVE
9 EVERYTHING IN PLANNED BAY AREA. I THINK WE CAN DO SO,
10 EVALUATING WHAT STATE LAWS HAVE BEEN GIVEN TO US, HOW THEY'RE
11 WORKING. I DON'T BELIEVE THIS PARKING THING IS WORKING.
12 BECAUSE IT'S SO VARIED. I THINK LOCALS SHOULD BE DETERMINING
13 THAT, AND HOW YOU'RE GETTING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. AGAIN, IT'S
14 VERY DIFFERENT. IF YOU ARE END OF THE LINE, OR YOU ARE
15 INTERMODAL, WE WANT PEOPLE ON TRANSIT, BUT IF YOU ARE
16 RESTRICTING THAT FROM FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS THAT ARE HAPPENING
17 RIGHT THERE, AT THE STATION, THAT CAN HAVE A VERY NEGATIVE
18 IMPACT. SO, I ASK THAT, PLEASE, LET'S MAKE THAT OUR EMPHASIS.
19 BECAUSE I KNOW WE CAN ACHIEVE THOSE GOALS. WE ARE, AGAIN, LOOK
20 AT DUBLIN. LOOK AT THE CITIES THAT ARE SUCCEEDING HERE WITHOUT
21 THE ADDED REQUIREMENTS. AND I THINK WE CAN ALL BENEFIT AS TO
22 FINDING OUT WHAT'S WORKING THERE, WHAT'S WORKING HERE, WITHOUT
23 EXPANDING ON SOMETHING THAT, I THINK, WE KNOW IS NOT REALLY
24 PUT TOGETHER WITH ALL THE STAKEHOLDERS. SO, WE -- AGAIN, WE
25 WANT TO BENEFIT FROM EVERY BIT OF INFORMATION, ALL THE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 STAKEHOLDERS, AND EVERYTHING THAT'S PRESENTED TO US,
2 ESPECIALLY RECOGNIZING WHAT COMMUNICATIONS HAVE COME FROM
3 JURISDICTIONS. BECAUSE THAT NEEDS TO BE PART OF THIS. THANK
4 YOU. STICK TO THAT POINT

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** QUESTION TO STAFF ARE WE MEETING OUR GHG
9 REDUCTION GOALS IN THE BAY AREA?

10

11 **DAVE VAUTIN:** NO.

12

13 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** AND THERE IS NO GUARANTEE WE WOULD MEET IT EITHER
16 WAY. SO WE'RE DOING THE BEST WE CAN.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** I WANT TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES FOR A ROBUST
21 CONVERSATION. AS YOU CAN TELL, THROUGH THE BOARD, THEY'RE
22 DIVERGENT VIEWPOINTS. AND SO MY QUESTION IS, FIRST OF ALL LET
23 ME JUST SAY I WANT TO APPLAUD STAFF, APPLAUD MATT, DAVID, FOR
24 WHAT I BELIEVE IS BEFORE US, A GREAT PROPOSAL AND SOMETHING
25 THAT I CAN SUPPORT. SECONDLY, YOU KNOW, I HAVE A QUESTION OF



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 YOU, MATT, WHEN IT COMES TO THE TOC POLICY, ESPECIALLY AROUND
2 THE PROTECTION PIECE, YOU KNOW, IT SEEMS, JUST READING THE
3 ROOM, THERE ARE SOME FROM URBAN AREAS, THERE ARE SOME FROM
4 SUBURBAN AREAS, RURAL AREAS, YOU KNOW, I REPRESENT A SUBURBAN
5 DISTRICT, IS IT POSSIBLE WITHIN THE TOC POLICY TO TAKE THAT
6 INTO CONSIDERATION? OR DO WE NEED A UNIFORM POLICY TO MOVE
7 FORWARD? I'M REALLY TALKING ABOUT WHAT IS, SORT OF --

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DENSITY VERSUS TOTAL POPULATION.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** CORRECT IN TERMS OF PROTECTION PIECE. THE THREE
12 P'S.

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:**

15

16 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK THERE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS TO DO THIS.
17 THIS STAFF PROPOSAL IS COMING UP WITH A WAY THAT WE FEEL
18 REAFFIRMS THE TOC POLICY AND ALLOWS THIS COMMISSION TO APPLY
19 IT IN DIFFERENT WAY AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN THE NEAR AND LONG-
20 TERM. BUT IN TERMS OF DEALING WITH WHAT'S IN FRONT OF US FROM
21 THE OBAG FOUR DECISION AND STATE SIGNIFICANT STATE LAWS THAT
22 HAVE BEEN PASSED ON PROTECTION IN RECENT YEARS THAT, WE WOULD,
23 SORT OF, YOU KNOW, ASSUME COMPLIANCE WITH THOSE STATE LAWS,
24 BUT THE COMMISSION CAN ALWAYS TAKE A LOOK AT THAT IN THE
25 FUTURE, BECAUSE MANY OF THESE STATE LAWS DO SUNSET. AND PART



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 OF WHAT THE POLICY TRIES TO DO IS GO BEYOND THOSE SUNSET
2 DATES. SO, THE COMMISSION HAS AN OPPORTUNITY TO COME BACK AND
3 LOOK AT THAT AT A LATER DATE.

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT, AND YOU'RE REFERRING TO, IS IT 2028? IS
6 THAT WHEN THOSE POLICIES SUNSET?

7

8 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK PROBABLY DEPENDS. I THINK IT'S 2030.

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** IT'S 2030? YOU KNOW, MY NEXT QUESTION IS,
11 CONSIDERING, YOU KNOW, YESTERDAY, AT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
12 IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, IN MY DISTRICT, WE APPROVED -- WE
13 ACTUALLY BOUGHT A PROPERTY, WHICH IS OVER -- MANY OF YOU KNOW
14 IT'S NEXT TO COLMA BART SO IT'S TRANSIT-RICH, ABOUT 72 UNITS
15 OF THOSE 72 A LOT DESIGNATED FOR FOSTER YOUTH, MENTAL HEALTH,
16 BASICALLY WE'RE TRYING TO CREATE SERVICES FOR THOSE RESIDENTS.
17 BUT IT'S REALLY, IT'S 100% AFFORDABLE. I GUESS THE -- WHAT I,
18 SORT OF -- I'M TRYING TO FIGURE OUT AROUND THIS PROTECTION
19 PIECE IS WHY IS IT SO IMPORTANT FOR THE ADVOCATE -- FOR
20 ADVOCATES? SO, WE RECEIVED LETTERS FROM SPUR, FROM OTHERS, WHY
21 IS HAVING THIS PROTECTION PIECE, WHY IS IT IMPORTANT TO THOSE
22 STAKEHOLDERS?

23

24 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK -- WELL, I DON'T WANT TO SPEAK FOR THE
25 ADVOCACY COMMUNITY, STAFF, TO YOU --



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** SURE.

3

4 **MATT MALONEY:** I BELIEVE THAT THE REASON WHY IT'S ONE OF OUR
5 THREE P'S IS BASED UPON THE INCREDIBLE HOUSING CRISIS WE HAVE
6 HAD IN THIS REGION FOR YEARS AND THE AMOUNT OF ACTUAL REAL
7 DISPLACEMENT THAT HAS OCCURRED IN THIS REGION AND CONTINUES TO
8 OCCUR IN SOME PARTS OF THE REGION SO AGAIN JUST WANT TO SPEAK
9 FOR THE ADVOCACIES HERE BUT I THINK COST OF LIVING AND ALL OF
10 THAT WHICH WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT FOR OVER A DECADE.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** BUT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE DO IN TERMS OF THE LAND
13 USE COMPONENT IS THERE PROTECTION BUILT IN OR ARE WE MOSTLY
14 FOCUSED ON THE PRODUCTION SIDE OF IT? BECAUSE MY EXPERIENCE I
15 SERVED ON THE GRAND BOULEVARD TASK FORCE I SERVED ON THOSE
16 BODIES AROUND TRANSIT I HEARD ABOUT RELATIVE TO GHG I ALWAYS
17 THOUGHT IN TERMS OF WHAT WE WERE DOING MOVING FORWARD IS
18 SOLELY FOCUSED ON THE PRODUCTION SIDE OF IT? IS THAT CORRECT?
19 IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE DOING WITH THE OBAG DOLLARS?

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** HARD TIME WITH THIS ONE. FIRST OF ALL, THE
22 OBAG DOLLARS ARE FOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, BECAUSE THEY'RE
23 FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS. I WANT TO MENTION THAT. THE
24 FORMULA THAT HELPS ESTABLISH COUNTY TARGETS HAVE BAKED INTO IT
25 BOTH -- SORT OF, THREE THINGS, ACTUALLY, ACTUAL POPULATION



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 TODAY. SOME ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF HOW MUCH HOUSING PEOPLE ARE --
2 COUNTIES ARE AGREEING TO AS PART OF RHNA, AND IT LOOKS AT
3 PRODUCTION. THAT'S PART OF THE TARGET. AND, OBVIOUSLY, THE TOC
4 POLICY, WHICH WE HAVE NOT YET APPLIED TO OBAG, BUT WE'RE
5 HAVING ROBUST CONVERSATION AROUND IT DOES BUILD IN ALL OF THE
6 THREE P'S AS AN IMPORTANT PART OF THE POLICY.

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. FINALLY, LET ME JUST SAY THIS IN TERMS OF
9 WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY, I CAN SUPPORT WHOLEHEARTEDLY. THE
10 SECOND THING IS I WANT TO TALK A BIT ABOUT THE NORTH BAY. I
11 REALLY HAVE NO ISSUE WITH THE NORTH BAY AND THE PRESENTATIONAL
12 THAT'S PUT BEFORE US. I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. I THINK
13 FROM A, SORT OF, A LAND USE PERSPECTIVE, AND, SORT OF, WHAT
14 THE FUTURE CAN BE, YOU KNOW, I KNOW A LOT OF THESE PROJECTS
15 TAKE DECADES, BUT I THINK THE IMPORTANCE OF US SUPPORTING THE
16 REGION IS REALLY CRITICAL. AND I THINK WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY
17 IS SOMETHING THAT I CAN SUPPORT. I KNOW 50/50, 75/25, BUT JUST
18 IN TERMS OF THE FUTURE OF THE REGION, I THINK IT'S A FUTURE OF
19 THE NORTH BAY, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO THE REGION IN ITS
20 TOTALITY. SO, I THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER BURT?

23

24 **PAT BURT:** THANK YOU. SO I ALSO WANT TO TAKE A STEP BACK AND
25 TAKE A LOOK AT THE FORCE AND THE PREMISES THAT WE HAD HERE.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 TRANSIT ORIENT THE DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSIT ORIENT THE
2 COMMUNITIES HAVE A MULTITUDE OF BENEFITS. THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC
3 BALANCE IS FURTHERED BY IT, THE FAVORABLE ECONOMICS FOR OUR
4 COMMUNITIES, AND ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS OF A RANGE. HOWEVER,
5 AS SOMEBODY WHO HAS BEEN DEEPLY IMMersed IN CLIMATE ACTION AND
6 CLIMATE PROGRAMS, AND FROM A CITY THAT IS A REAL LEADER IN
7 THAT, WE HAVE DONE OUR CARBON BALANCING CALCULATIONS. AND THE
8 IMPACT OF A 25% GROWTH IN HOUSING WITHIN OUR COMMUNITY IN THE
9 NEXT EIGHT YEARS, PREDOMINANTLY IN TRANSIT ORIENTED LOCATIONS,
10 IS NOT A STRONG IMPACT ON OUR CARBON REDUCTION. AND IT HAS AN
11 IMPACT, BUT IT IS NOT ONE OF THE PRINCIPLE IMPACTS IN OUR
12 CARBON REDUCTION. AND WHEN PEOPLE REALLY LOOK AT THE SCIENCE
13 AND THE MATH OF IT, IT IS NOT AS STRONG AS MANY OF US HAVE
14 PRESUMED. THAT DOESN'T MEAN THERE AREN'T OTHER STRONG REASONS
15 FOR TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. BUT I DO WANT TO CHALLENGE
16 HOW STRONG OF AN IMPACT THAT IS ON OUR CLIMATE ACTION. AND THE
17 OTHER THING THAT I BROUGHT UP AT OUR WORKSHOP IS THAT WE
18 REALLY NEED TO REFLECT ON THE INTENTION VERSUS WHAT WE'RE NOW
19 SEEING AS THE OUTCOMES OF SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS AND HOW WE
20 MIGHT IMPROVE. THEM AS A RESULT. WE HAD THE ACHIEVEMENT OF 2/3
21 OF OUR DEVELOPMENT BEING IN TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT IN
22 THE PREVIOUS 15 YEARS OR SO. IN PRECOVID WE WERE SEEING A
23 DECLINE IN TRANSIT USE. I ASKED STAFF AND THEY PROVIDED REALLY
24 SOME ADDITIONAL BACKGROUND INFORMATION THAT I'M JUST STARTING
25 TO ABSORB AND TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, HOW DO WE RECONCILE THOSE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 APPARENT CONTRADICTIONS. AND I CAN TELL THAT YOU SOME OF IT IS
2 THAT BUILD IT AND THEY WILL COME IS SOMEWHAT OVERSTATED. IN
3 OUR COMMUNITY, WE HAVE A STRONG TRANSIT USE, NOT PREDOMINANTLY
4 BECAUSE OF OUR SUCCESS IN TRANSIT ORIENT THE DEVELOPMENT OVER
5 RECENT DECADES. WE'RE WORKING WITH AN AGGRESSIVE PLAN TO HAVE
6 GREATER, SIGNIFICANTLY GREATER TRANSIT ORIENT THE DEVELOPMENT.
7 BUT BECAUSE OF ACCESS TO TRANSIT, ACCESS BEING BOTH PHYSICAL
8 ACCESS AND NETWORKS AS WELL AS A VERY AGGRESSIVE TRANSIT PASS
9 PROGRAM. I AM -- I DON'T KNOW HOW MANY OF US TODAY TOOK
10 TRANSIT TO GET TO THIS MEETING, BUT I LIVE A MILE AND A HALF
11 TWO MILES FROM A TRAIN STATION I'M THERE IN EIGHT MINUTES FROM
12 A LOW DENSITY COMMUNITY OR NEIGHBORHOOD THEN GET OFF THE
13 CALTRAIN ALONG WITH 100 OR SO OTHER BIKE RIDERS AND THOSE ARE
14 RIDING E-BIKES COMING FROM GREATER DISTANCE FROM THE TRANSIT
15 STATION, THE PROXIMITY IS HELPFUL, BUT IT'S NOT RESULTING IN
16 THE OUTCOMES THAT WE THOUGHT IT WOULD, ON THE SURFACE THERE
17 ARE A VARIETY OF FACTORS. WE HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THOSE. SO AS A
18 RESULT, I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE THEN GO DOWN INTO WHAT ARE
19 THESE PROGRAMS, AND WE TALKED ABOUT CARROTS VERSUS STICKS. AND
20 I THINK A LOT OF WHAT WE'RE HEARING IS THAT THIS IS A CONCERN
21 THAT, WHEN WE SAY A CARROT, ARE WE SAYING, WELL T HAS TO BE A
22 CARROT OF THIS COLOR, THIS LENGTH, AND THIS DIAMETER, OR IS IT
23 REALLY GIVING A BIT GREATER LATITUDE? MY COMMUNITY IS STRONG
24 IN RENTER PROTECTIONS. BUT OTHER COMMUNITIES ARE STRONGER IN
25 PRODUCTION. AND WE HAVE A SET OF SCORING SYSTEMS SET UP THAT



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 BASICALLY SAYS YOU HAVE TO HAVE X IN EACH OF THESE COLUMNS AS
2 OPPOSED TO A SCORE WHERE IT MIGHT RECOGNIZE A COMMUNITY THAT'S
3 STRONGER IN PRODUCTION CAN GET MORE POINT IN TOTALITY EVEN IF
4 THEY DIDN'T SCORE WELL IN EACH CATEGORY. SO, I THINK WE NEED
5 TO REFLECT ON THE SYSTEM THAT RECOGNIZES THESE DIFFERENCES NOT
6 ONLY URBAN AND SUBURBAN BUT EVEN WITHIN COMPARABLE SUBURBAN
7 COMMUNITY, DIFFERENT APPROACHES THAT HAVE DIFFERENT SUCCESSES.
8 AND I THINK THE PROGRAM HAS GOTTEN TOO PRESCRIPTIVE. BUT
9 COMING UP WITH THE ANSWERS AT HOW TO MAKE IT MORE EFFECTIVE IS
10 A MORE COMPLEX QUESTION, BUT I DO THINK WE NEED TO REFLECT ON
11 WHY WE HAVEN'T HAD THE APPARENT SUCCESSES THAT WE THINK WE
12 WOULD HAVE HAD BASED UPON WHAT HAS HAPPENED OVER THE LAST 15
13 YEARS. SO, THOSE ARE MY THOUGHTS.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT OF THE COMMISSIONER MELGAR, THEN WE'RE
16 GOING TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT THEN BACK TO COMMISSIONERS FOR
17 COMMENTS.

18

19 **MYRNA MELGAR:** IT MIGHT BE MY LAST COMMENT. I FELT COMPELLED TO
20 RESPOND TO A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT WERE SAID. I DO WANT TO GO
21 BACK TO MY COMMENT AROUND PRINCIPLES AND VISION AND THEN HOW
22 DO WE MEASURE SUCCESS. I HEAR YOU COMMISSIONER BURT. SO, SAN
23 FRANCISCO, LIKE PALO ALTO, ALSO HAS CLIMATE ACTION GOALS THAT
24 WE MEASURE YEARLY, AND WE HAVE ONE OF OUR COMMISSIONERS FOR
25 THE ENVIRONMENT WHO IS ALSO OUR COMMISSIONER HERE REPRESENTING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SAN FRANCISCO. AND I WONDER IF WE'RE MEASURING THE RIGHT
2 THINGS. WE MEASURE THE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS FOR SAN
3 FRANCISCO BUT NOT NECESSARILY FOR ALL OF THE WORKERS THAT WE
4 EXPORT TO OTHER PLACES THAT THEN DRIVE BACK. I MEAN, THERE IS
5 A CERTAIN MEASURE FOR THAT BUT I'M NOT SURE WE CAPTURE IN THE
6 WAY THAT WE DO. INTERESTED IN SEEING YOUR METHODOLOGY BECAUSE
7 I DON'T THINK WE DO IT ADEQUATELY. IN PART OF THAT IS REGIONAL
8 IT EXPORTATION OF PEOPLE FROM SAN JOSE PALO ALTO SAN FRANCISCO
9 HIGH COST AREAS TO LOWER COST AREAS I DON'T KNOW THAT WE
10 MEASURE THAT ON A REGIONAL LEVEL THE WAY WE SHOULD. YOU KNOW,
11 PUT ON THE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT WHAT WE DO BUT THE ASIDE FROM
12 THAT I WANT TO CAUTION US FROM GOALS AGAINST EACH OTHER
13 PRODUCTION VERSUS PRESERVATION BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THAT'S
14 PRODUCTIVE IN A POLITICAL -- AT DISCOURSE I THINK YOU KNOW IT
15 PITS AGENDAS ALSO I THINK HAMPERS OUR PROGRESS INDIVIDUALLY
16 AND REGIONALLY TRYING TO GET TO A PLACE WHERE WE ARE DRIVING
17 TOWARD EQUITY INCLUSIVITY ALSO TRYING TO MEET OUR REGIONAL
18 GOALS I WANT TO SAY THAT REALLY APPRECIATE THE ROBUST
19 DISCUSSION HOW SMART YOU ALL ARE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** AND NONE OF US ARE ANGRY YET SO THAT'S GOING
22 TO BE ADDED TO OUR T-SHIRTS GOING FORWARD. NOT LEAVING ANGRY.
23 ANYWAY, WE'LL GO ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I KNOW WE HAVE PUBLIC
24 COMMENT. WE'RE PROBABLY GOING TO HAVE QUITE A BIT AND LIMIT TO
25 ONE MINUTE A PIECE. KIMBERLY IF YOU WANT TO START CALLING



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 NAMES, I APPRECIATE IT.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BEFORE WE DO THAT I'LL CALL INTO THE
4 RECORD WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE THAT WE RECEIVED SENATOR
5 ARREGUIN, TWO LETTERS FROM SPUR. I THINK THEY'RE IDENTICAL,
6 BUT POSTED THEM NONETHELESS A LETTER FROM COUNCIL MEMBER SEE
7 CILIA LUNA PARA LETTER FROM COALITION, LETTER SENT BY
8 ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY ANOTHER COALITION LETTER SENT BY PUBLIC
9 ADVOCATES THEN THERE WERE TWO LATE BREAKING ITEMS THAT WERE
10 RECEIVED AS WELL AFTER I SENT YOU THE ITEMS LAST NIGHT THEY'RE
11 FROM GENE WALSH OF AC TRANSIT FROM AARON TIEDEMANN I'LL POST
12 TO THE ONLINE AGENDA THIS AFTERNOON I HAVE SENT THEM TO YOU BY
13 MAIL SO WITH THAT WE'LL TURN TO THE PUBLIC COMMENTS IN ZOOM
14 THEN FOLLOWED BY ZOOM IF YOU'RE IN THE ZOOM SPACE PLEASE RAISE
15 YOUR HAND SO THAT YOU'RE NOT OVERLOOKED WHEN I CALL ON THE
16 ZOOM SPACE. FIRST UP IN THE ROOM AMANDA FOLLOWED BY EMILY,
17 FOLLOWED BY SARAH GREENWALD, FOLLOWED BY EMILIANO. I'LL BRING
18 UP THE CLOCK. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** KIMBERLY, I'M SORRY. EVERYBODY IS JUMPING UP
21 HERE FOR A SECOND. CAN WE JUST TAKE A QUICK FIVE MINUTE BREAK
22 SO EVERYBODY CAN GET FOOD GET DRINKS USE THE RESTROOM SO THEN
23 WE CAN ALL PAY ATTENTION TO THE PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FIVE MINUTE BREAK, THEN WE'LL COME BACK.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 AND I'LL MAKE SURE. OKAY. [BREAK] [MEETING WILL RESUME
2 SHORTLY]

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IF EVERYBODY COULD COME BACK TO THEIR SEATS?

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S COME BACK, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AT YOUR PLEASURE JUST LET ME KNOW WHEN
9 TO CALL THOSE NAMES AGAIN.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK MOST OF THE COMMISSIONERS ARE BACK.
12 SO, WE CAN GO AHEAD AND START PUBLIC COMMENT.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. SO, I'LL RESTATE THE NAMES.
15 WE'RE GOING TO START WITH JONATHON BUILD BY EMILY, FOLLOWED
16 EMELE, AMANDA, SARAH GREENWALD. PLEASE STEP TO THE PODIUM.
17 I'LL START THE CLOCK.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. JONATHON KASS. I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED WITH THIS
20 POLICY OVER A LONG TIME REALLY APPRECIATE THE LEVEL OF THE
21 CONVERSATION HERE TODAY. AND I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT A LOT OF
22 THE ISSUES DISCUSSED OR GRAPPLED WITH OVER THE MANY YEARS THAT
23 THE POLICY WAS BEING DEVELOPED AND ALL OF THE TRADE-OFFS WERE
24 TRYING -- THEY TRIED TO BUILD THAT INTO THE FLEXIBILITIES OF
25 THE POLICY. SO, I THINK A POLICY OVER WHATEVER PERIOD WE NEED



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 HOPEFULLY NOT TOO LONG COMMITS US TO FULL COMPLIANCE IS GOING
2 TO BE WHAT IT TAKES TO MAKE THIS POLICY CONNECTED TO THE PLAN
3 THAT YOU ALL JUST PASSED A BLUEPRINT FOR. AND THE PLAN
4 INTENDED TO BALANCE SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN
5 DESCRIBED. THERE HAVE BEEN QUESTIONS ABOUT WHETHER TODD REALLY
6 DELIVERS. SOMETIMES IT DOES, SOMETIMES IT DOESN'T. THE PARKING
7 MAXIMUMS FOR EXAMPLE, ARE A WAY TO GET PEOPLE LIVING IN IT. OD
8 THAT ARE TRULY TRANSIT USE THAT NEED TRANSIT USE THAT ORIENT
9 THEIR LIVES AROUND TRANSIT THIS WENT INTO THE THINKING OF THE
10 POLICY BEFORE, SO I HOPE YOU ADVANCE FULL COMPLIANCE. THANK
11 YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EMILY.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS EMILY I AM HERE ON BEHALF OF 20 HOUSING
16 JUSTICE ORGANIZATIONS FROM ACROSS THE BAY AREA. THE WAY THAT
17 MTC MEETINGS ARE SET UP MAKES IT HARD FOR WORKING FOLKS TO
18 PARTICIPATE BUT WE SUBMITTED A LETTER IN SUPPORT OF THE
19 MAINTAINING AND STRENGTHENING THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN
20 PARTICULAR PROTECTION POLICIES IN THE TOC WE ALSO OPPOSE
21 PROPOSAL THAT WOULD ALLOW JURISDICTIONS TO RECEIVE ARE POINTS
22 WITHOUT FULLY COMPLYING WITH THE TOC. ADDRESSING THE REGION'S
23 HOUSING CRISIS INVOLVES COMMITMENT TO ALL THREE P'S MTC HAS
24 EXPLICITLY COMMITTED TO IT IN PLANNED BAY AREA AND IN ALL
25 THEIR OPPORTUNITIES. THE TOC HOUSING POLICY IS ALREADY THE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 COMPROMISE THERE ARE OPTIONS TO MATCH LOCAL CONTEXT ANY
2 CHANGES TO THE SUBSTANCE OF THE HOUSING POLICIES INCLUDING
3 ALLOWING JURISDICTIONS TO BE COMPLIANT THROUGH ADHERENCE TO
4 STATE LAW WOULD UNDERMINE THE INTENT OF THE TOC AND
5 COMMITMENTS THAT MTC HAS MADE THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA I WOULD
6 ENCOURAGE COMMISSIONERS TO TAKE COMMITMENT TO REGIONALISM
7 MERIT BASED PROPOSALS FROM THE LAST ITEM THROUGH THIS ITEM.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EMILE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY
13 PARTNERS AFFORDABLE HOUSING NON-PROFIT YOU HAVE SEEN OUR
14 LETTER IN THE PACKET ALONGSIDE OTHER ADVOCATES A BIT ABOUT
15 MYSELF I WAS RAISED IN DALY CITY SAN MATEO IN THE SHADOWS OF
16 COW PALACE RAISED BY A SINGLE MOM MAKING \$30,000 A YEAR MY
17 FAMILY AND I HAVE BEEN DISPLACED BECAUSE OF LACK OF TENANT
18 PROTECTIONS MY MOM CURRENTLY DRIVES TO HER JOB IN THE
19 PENINSULA EVERY CHANCE SHE GETS, AN HOUR AND A HALF EACH WAY.
20 I WOULD ENCOURAGE COMMISSIONERS WHO ARE UNCERTAIN ABOUT THE
21 VALE OF TENANT PROTECTION, TO ASK LOW INCOME RESIDENTS. A LOT
22 OF THE POINTS RAISED ARE DETAIL ED IN OUR ELEVATOR HAPPY TO
23 CHAT ABOUT THEM WE OPPOSE WATERING DOWN ATTEMPTS FOR THE TOC
24 POLICY AND HOLD THEM OF GREAT VALUE. THANK YOU.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AMANDA.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS AMANDA CHIANG
4 I'M A STAFF MEMBER OF URBAN HABITAT AND ALSO FROM SAN MATEO
5 COUNTY. ACTUALLY TODAY IS MY BIRTHDAY I WAS BORN IN PENINSULA
6 HOSPITAL 30 PLUS YEARS AGO TODAY. AND I'M HERE TODAY EVEN
7 THOUGH THIS IS NOT NECESSARILY THE BEST PLACE TO CELEBRATE MY
8 BIRTHDAY NO OFFENSE TO YOU ALL BECAUSE I CARE ABOUT
9 AFFORDABILITY IN THE REGION I STRONGLY BELIEVE THAT WE NEED TO
10 DO SOMETHING ABOUT THE CRISIS THIS WE'RE FACING OVER THE
11 DECADES IT'S GOTTEN WORSE GAS IS OVER \$4. THE BUS I TOOK HERE
12 -- I NOW LIVE IN ALAMEDA BECAUSE I ALSO COUNTY LIVE IN SAN
13 MATEO COUNTY ANYMORE, IS 650 IT'S REALLY DIFFICULT TO GET HERE
14 AND I WANT TO ALIGN MY COMMENTS WITH WHAT I HEARD TODAY FROM
15 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF AND MY MAYOR, COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT, AND
16 JUST REALLY HOPE THAT WE TAKE THE TIME TO PUSH FORWARD POLICY
17 THAT WAS REFINED OVER MANY YEARS AND ADD FOR THE NORTH BAY
18 COUNTY PIECE I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THAT APPLY TO RURAL PARTS
19 BECAUSE SAN MATEO COUNTY ALSO HAS RURAL AREAS ON THE COAST
20 THAT NEED TRANSPORTATION. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. SARAH GREENWALD FOLLOWED BY
23 JANE KRAEMER.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** OR VICE VERSA. HI. I'M SARAH GREENWALD. AND I'M SO



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 GLAD TO SEE THIS POLICY IS MOVING FORWARD. THAT IS GREAT. BUT
2 I DO -- I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE FULL COMPLIANCE WITH THE TOC
3 POLICY. IT DISAPPOINT SEEM TO BE INSISTED ON ENOUGH.
4 FLEXIBILITY IS WONDERFUL. BUT, YOU KNOW, ALLOWING THESE KIND
5 OF INCOMPLETES, AS I THINK OF THEM, JUST DRAG ON FOREVER,
6 THAT'S NOT HELPING ANYBODY. IT'S NOT HELPING YOUR FRIEND IN
7 THE CITY COUNCILS WHO HAVE NOTHING TO POINT TO FOR WHY THE
8 COUNCIL NEEDS TO PASS THE RES-- THE POLICY CHOSEN, AND, SO IT
9 CAN BE STARTED ACTING UPON. WELL, I HOPE YOU WILL LISTEN TO
10 WHAT DIRECTOR SCHAFF HAS BEEN SAYING AND TAKE SOME OF THOSE
11 SUGGESTIONS VERY SERIOUSLY.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. JANE KRAEMER AND THEN WE'LL
14 MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS AN INTERESTING DISCUSSION. YOU ALL WANT THE
17 SAME THING, BUT YOU'RE ALL COMING FROM DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES
18 AND YOU'RE ALL IN A QUERY ABOUT HOW TO DO IT. A GENERAL
19 SUGGESTION IS THAT YOU PRACTICE MIXING AND MATCHING, THAT YOU
20 DOVETAIL BETWEEN YOURSELVES WHAT DOES THIS PERSON HAVE TO
21 OFFER, WHAT DOES THIS PERSON NEED. IT'S GOING TO TAKE BOTH
22 PRACTICAL POLITICS AND IMAGINATION. AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE
23 TO BE VERY TRANSPARENT WITH YOUR CONSTITUENTS. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. SO MOVING INTO THE ZOOM



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 SPACE, FIRST UP IS CADE KENNEDY. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE
2 MINUTE. LOOKS LIKE CADE HAS DROPPED OFF. SO WE'RE GOING TO
3 MOVE TO DAISY ALVAREZ. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. DAISY
4 ALVAREZ. HAS LOWERED HER HAND, I BELIEVE. OKAY. MOVING ON TO
5 ROLAND. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF, ROLAND.

6

7 **ROLAND LEBRUN:** THANK YOU. SO, IS WHAT I'M GOING TO DO TODAY,
8 WITH YOUR PERMISSION, IS TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE OF WHERE TOC
9 CAN GO FATALLY WRONG BECAUSE THE TRANSIT NEVER COMES. AND THE
10 CASE STUDY IS A FORMER IBM PLANT IN SOUTH SAN JOSE IT WAS A
11 DREAM WITH CALTRAIN TO THE NORTH AND TWO LIGHT TRAIN STATIONS
12 TO THE SOUTH WE HAVE TWO TRANSIT VILLAGES WE BUILT 3,000 UNITS
13 BETWEEN THE CALTRAIN STATION AND THE LIGHT RAIL STATION HARDLY
14 ANYBODY USES THE LIGHT RAIL BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO BASICALLY
15 RISK THEIR LIFE CROSSING THE FREEWAY GETTING TO THE STATION
16 CALTRAIN STATION SEES ABOUT 200 RIDERS A DAY BECAUSE THERE IS
17 NO SERVICE BECAUSE VTA DEFAULTED ON THEIR COMMITMENTS TO UNION
18 PACIFIC BACK IN 2013 THE OTHER LIGHT RAIL STATION GOT KILLED
19 BY THE CITY OF SAN JOSE WHEN THEY DID CHANGE TO GENERAL PLAN
20 WHICH MOVED VTA33 ACRES AROUND THE OTHER SIDE OF THE FREEWAY.
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS CHANO.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS CHANO I'M HERE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ON BEHALF OF THE NON-PROFIT HOUSING ASSOCIATION NORTHERN
2 CALIFORNIA MPH. WE ARE PART OF A COALITION LETTER WITH
3 ENTERPRISE WE HAVE OUTLINED OUR CONCERNS IN DETAIL, FIRST WE
4 WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT THE PROPOSALS TO GIVE CREDIT FOR
5 POLICIES THAT ARE ONLY IN PROGRESS I THINK THAT SIGNIFICANT
6 REVISIONS BEING DISCUSSED CAN BE PROBLEMATIC WHEN POLICIES ARE
7 NOT FULLY ADOPTED EXPECTATIONS SHIFT BEFORE IMPLEMENTATION
8 WHICH MAKES IT HARDER TO MAINTAIN CONSISTENT REGIONAL
9 STANDARDS CLEAR TIMELINE AND PATH TO FULL COMPLIANCE IS GOING
10 TO PROVIDE A BETTER ACCOUNTABILITY AND SUPPORT FOR
11 JURISDICTIONS WHICH WAS MENTIONED. SECOND CONCERN ABOUT
12 CHANGING HOUSING POLICY MENU REALLY SEEING EVIDENCE BASED
13 REASON FOR SHIFT THIRD SCALE OF INCENTIVE FUNDING SHOULD MATCH
14 THE IMPORTANCE OF POLICY WE SHOULD HAVE AT MINIMUM FULL 70
15 MILLION GROWTH FRAMEWORK POOL TO SUPPORT THE TOC COMPLIANCE WE
16 ENCOURAGE CONSIDERATION OF THE \$360 MILLION PROGRAM AS WELL.
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP DAVID STARK.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** DAVID STARK CHIEF PUBLIC AFFAIRS COMMUNICATIONS
22 OFFICER FOR BAY YOUTH ASSOCIATION I PARTICIPATED IN-PERSON
23 DURING THE OCTOBER 23RD MEETING, PROTECTION POLICIES CAN HAVE
24 THE SUSTAINABLE SUPPLY OF RENTAL HOUSING AGGRESSIVE RENTAL
25 HOUSING POLICIES DO NOT HELP SOLVE THE HOUSING CRISIS



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 PRODUCTION IS PROTECTION RATHER THAN MANDATE ANOTHER LAYER OF
2 LOCAL REGULATION ON HOUSING PROVIDERS THAT MAY CREATE BARRIER
3 TO NEW PRODUCTION. PLEASE DIRECT STAFF TO REPLACE THE THREE
4 P'S WITH EXISTING STATE-MANDATED HOUSING POLICIES SUCH AS
5 STATE CERTIFIED HOUSING ELEMENTS. I SHARED IN THE OCTOBER 23RD
6 MEETING, WHEN IT COMES TO SUPPLIER HOUSING, DO NO HARM. THANK
7 YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. JULIA G. I'M NOT GOING TO
10 BUTCHER YOUR LAST NAME. [LAUGHTER]

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M JULIA GARCIA HOUSING AND PARKING
13 POLICY MEASURING AT TRANSFORM HERE ON BEHALF OF TRANSFORM AS
14 WELL AS SIGNED ON TO THE LETTER ORGANIZED BY ENTERPRISE AS
15 WELL AS PUBLIC ADVOCATES ARE I WAS ALSO IN ATTENDANCE ON
16 OCTOBER 23RD, PROPONENTS OF THE TOC POLICY URGING TO MAKE SURE
17 THE OBAG FOUR FUND REMAIN CONDITIONED ON FULL TOC COMPLIANCE
18 WE'RE CONCERNED THAT CURRENT PROPOSAL COULD WEAKEN PROTECTIONS
19 BY GIVING TOC CREDIT FOR MEETING MINIMAL STATE LAW SUCH AS
20 REMOVAL OF PARKING MINIMUMS THAT WOULD REMOVE INCENTIVE FOR
21 JURISDICTIONS TO ADOPT MEANINGFUL TENANT PROTECTIONS OR
22 PRESERVATION POLICIES THE TOC MENU ALREADY REFLECTS BEST
23 PRACTICE AND PROVIDES FLEXIBILITY I URGE YOU TO CONDITION THE
24 FUND ON FULL COMPLIANCE AVOID AWARDING POINTS FOR MEETING
25 STATE LAW PROTECT ALL THREE HOUSING CATEGORIES ENSURE EQUAL



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WAITING AND TIMELY IMPLEMENTATION TENANT PROTECTIONS MUST
2 REMAIN CENTRAL BECAUSE KEEPING PEOPLE HOUSED NEAR TRANSIT IS
3 BOTH EQUITY AND EFFECTIVE CLIMATE STRATEGIES JURISDICTION HAVE
4 HAD YEARS OF SUPPORT THAT SUPPORT SHOULD CONTINUE NOW IT'S
5 TIME TO MOVE FROM PLANNING TO IMPLEMENTATION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS KEN CHAN.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I'M THE SENIOR ORGANIZER WITH HOUSING LEADERSHIP
10 COUNCIL SAN MATEO COUNTY WE WORK WITH COMMUNITIES AND LEADERS
11 TO PRODUCE AND PRESERVE QUALITY AFFORDABLE HOMES I WOULD LIKE
12 TO HIGHLIGHT HOUSING POLICIES AND DECISIONS OUR SYSTEMS SHOULD
13 HELP US PLAN FOR AND PROVIDE CRITICAL THINGS THAT OUR
14 COMMUNITY MEMBERS NEED TO LIVE WORK AND THRIVE HERE IN THE BAY
15 AREA ON BEHALF OF TENANT PROTECTIONS, JURISDICTIONS ALREADY
16 HAVE AN ATTAINABLE WAY TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE] NEEDS OF THE
17 COMMUNITY -- A FRAMEWORK THAT'S ALREADY WORKABLE. WE CONCERNED
18 ABOUT THE POLICIES IN PROGRESS WITHOUT TIMELINES POLICIES
19 GUARDRAILS JURISDICTIONS MAY RECEIVE CREDIT FOR POLICIES THAT
20 THEY MAY NEVER GET FULLY ADOPTED FINALLY RECOMMEND ALLOCATING
21 FULL 7 MILLION THERE GROWTH FUND FRAMEWORK TOWARDS TOC
22 COMPLIANCE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ANHAL BABAR.

25



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** HI. ANHAL BABAR WITH CALIFORNIA APARTMENT ASSOCIATION
2 THE IMPACT OF HAVING THE HOUSING COMPONENT OF THE TOC CREATES
3 DUPLICATIVE AND CONFLICTING REQUIREMENTS FOR CITIES AND
4 COUNTIES EXISTING LAW ADDRESSES MANY GOALS THAT WITH THE TOC
5 WITHOUT CREATING CONFLICT SB79 ENSURES HOUSING WHETHER MARKET
6 OR AFFORDABLE ARE BUILT AREN'T TRANSIT I WANT TO VOICE SUPPORT
7 FOR THE PROPOSAL TO USE HOUSING ELEMENT IN LIEU OF DISTINCT
8 HOUSING COMPONENTS IN THE TOC COMMENTS EMPHASIZED THE VALUE IN
9 THIS APPROACH WHERE ONE SIZE DOES NOT FIT ALL. BY REMOVING THE
10 HOUSING COMPONENT OF THE TOC ALLOWING HOUSING ELEMENT WHICH
11 CONTAIN THE THREE P'S, AVOID CREATING DISCUSSION AND CONFUSION
12 FOR EACH CITY. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ROBERT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. OR AFTERNOON. SORRY. THIS IS BOB
17 ALAN. I'M CALLING TODAY IN MY CAPACITY AS A MEMBER OF THE
18 EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR THE CALIFORNIA FACULTY ASSOCIATION CHAPTER
19 STATE SAN FRANCISCO STATE WHERE I WORK WITH A STUDENT GROUP
20 AND COMMITTEE TO ADDRESS HOUSING ISSUES WHERE WE SEE LOTS OF
21 OUR STUDENTS AROUND THE THREAT OF EVICTION AND I WANT TO
22 DIRECTLY SAY SOMEONE WHO PARTICIPATED IN THE OBAG PROGRAM
23 DEVELOPMENT SUNS THE BEGINNING WHAT'S CONSISTENT IS THAT
24 TENANTS ARE ALWAYS PUT AT THE BACK OF THE LINE TO WAIT FOR
25 TENANT PROTECTIONS, I WANT TO DIRECTLY ADDRESS THE APARTMENT



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ASSOCIATION FOLKS IN THE ORWELLIAN USE OF THE IDEA THAT
2 PRODUCTION IS PROTECTIONS. WE ARE GOING LET IT RIP WITH THE
3 SET OF STATE POLICIES WE HAVE IN THE MARKET ORIENT THE
4 APPROACH WE'RE GOING TO SEE WHAT HAPPENS WITH PRODUCTION BUT
5 THE IDEA THAT THOSE POLICIES ARE THE SAME IS AT BEST A
6 WILLFULLY IGNORANT UNDERSTANDING OF THE DIFFERENTIATION
7 BETWEEN THOSE POLICIES AND WE OUGHT NOT CONFUSE THOSE. THANK
8 YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ERIC PANSER.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO THERE. JUST MAKING SURE YOU ALL CAN HEAR ME.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE CAN.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS ERIC PANSER SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF BERKELEY
17 CITY COUNCIL MEMBER MARK HUMBERT REPRESENTING DISTRICT EIGHT
18 IN BERKELEY. COUNCIL MEMBER HUMBERT WOULD LIKE TO ADD HIS
19 VOICE TO THE CHORUS OF FOLKS WHO ARE OPPOSING THE CHANGES TO
20 THE HOUSING POLITICS MENU SPEAKING IN FAVOR OF REQUIRING
21 FULLER COMPLIANCE WITH THE TOC POLICIES FOR THE OBAG FOUR SET
22 ASIDE AND FINALLY SUPPORTING MORE FUNDING FOR TOC INCENTIVE
23 POOL WITH FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ATTACKING CLIMATE CHANGE EFFORTS
24 AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WE IN THE BAY AREA SHOULD NOT BE
25 BACKING AWAY FROM OUR EFFORTS TO SAVE OUR CLIMATE AND ENSURE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 THAT PEOPLE AT ALL INCOME LEVELS HAVE ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE
2 MOBILITY AND AFFORDABLE HOMES NEAR JOBS HAVING THESE OPEN-
3 ENDED PARTIAL CREDIT APPROACHES TO CRUCIAL POLICIES IS
4 INSUFFICIENT TO INCENTIVE MEANINGFUL ACTION AND POLICY CHANGES
5 IN SUPPORT OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND TRANSIT ORIENT THE
6 HOMES BERKELEY IS PROUD TO BE A COMMUNITY THAT'S BEEN TAKING
7 STRONG ACTION TO SUPPORT HOUSING AND NON-AUTOMATIVE
8 TRANSPORTATION AND WE HOPE TO SEE OTHER COMMUNITIES FOLLOW
9 SUIT SO COUNCIL MEMBER HUMBERT THEREFORE ENCOURAGES THE BOARD
10 ENSURE MORE RIGOROUS AMBITIOUS APPROACHES TO PROMOTING THESE
11 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICIES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LORI DROFT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS LORI I'M THE
16 HOUSING PLANNING POLICY DIRECTOR AT SPUR NOW MORE THAN EVER
17 OUR REGION NEEDS TO REDUCE CLIMATE POLLUTION AND BUILD MORE
18 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND INCLUSIVE COMMUNITIES THE TOC POLICY IS
19 ONE OF THE STRONGEST EVIDENCE BASED TOOLS WE HAVE TO ACHIEVE
20 THOSE GOALS AND WE URGE YOU TO UPHOLD AND FULLY IMPLEMENT THE
21 TOC POLICY STANDARDS BASED ON THE WORKSHOP DISCUSSION WE HAVE
22 CONCERNS ABOUT SEVERAL OF THE PROPOSE THE CHANGES FIRST
23 COMPLIANCE SHOWER REQUIRED FOR THE OBAG FOUR TOC SET ASIDE WE
24 DON'T NEED SO MANY LAYERS OF FLEXIBILITY SO THAT JURISDICTIONS
25 COULD RECEIVE FULL OR PARTIAL CREDIT WHILE MAINTAINING ONLY A



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 FRACTION OF THE DENSITY HOUSING OR PARKING STANDARDS THAT
2 UNDERMINES THE PURPOSES EVER TOC POLICY SECONDLY
3 ACCOUNTABILITY MATTERS AWARDED PARTIAL CREDIT FOR POLICIES
4 MERELY IN PROGRESS WITHOUT TIMELINE OR CONFIRMATION THAT THE
5 POLICIES ARE ACTUALLY ADOPTED RISKS OF WEAKENING POLICY EVEN
6 FURTHER. THE TOC POLICY REFLECTS YEARS OF HARD WORK AND COMP
7 MITS ALREADY PROVIDES MULTIPLE PATHWAYS FOR JURISDICTIONS TO
8 COMPLY WHILE ADVANCING PLANNED BAY AREA REGIONAL GOALS. WE
9 URGE YOU TO KEEP IT STRONG.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. SHANTY.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE CAN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M THE LEGISLATIVE DIRECTOR TOGETHER WITH
18 STATEWIDE COALITION OF 70 TENANT LED ORGANIZATION INCLUDING
19 DOZENS IN THE BAY I'M A BAY AREA TENANT MYSELF WE URGE YOU TO
20 SUPPORT MAINTAINING AND STRENGTHENING VITAL TENANT PROTECTIONS
21 IN THE TOC PROPOSE PROPOSAL THAT WOULD WEAKEN ITS AFFORDABLE
22 HOUSING COMMERCIALIZE STABILIZE POLICIES, PIECE MENU WE OPPOSE
23 ALLOWING JURISDICTIONS TO BE TOC COMPLIANT VIA STATE LAW THIS
24 IS ESSENTIAL TO THE SUCCESS OF THE WHOLE PLAN IT'S WORKING
25 CLASS BAY AREA TENANTS WHO ARE MOST DEPENDENT ON TRANSIT BASED



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 ON EVIDENCE USE OF TRANSIT IS THE MOST THEY FILL THE THREE P'S
2 TRANSIT ORIENT THE PROTECTION PRODUCTION PRESERVATION THERE IS
3 A REASON AFFORDABILITY IS ON THE LIPS OF EVERY ELECTED
4 OFFICIAL IN THIS COUNTRY WE HAVE A RARE OPPORTUNITY TO LEAD ON
5 THAT IN CLIMATE VIA STRONG TENANT PROTECTION. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CAROL ELDRIDGE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS CAROLE ELDRIDGE. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE CAN.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I'M SPEAKING AS A MEMBER OF THE COMMUNITY GROUP
14 CALLED ONE SAN MATEO WHICH FIGHTS FOR GREATER HOUSING AND
15 RACIAL JUSTICE IN THE CITY OF SAN MATEO I WANT TO WEIGH IN
16 TODAY IN FAVOR PRESERVING THE TOC POLICY AND TYING OBAG
17 FUNDING TO THE TOC POLICY AS ORIGINALLY ADOPTED I WAS TOLD
18 THERE WAS RHETORIC CIRCULATING TO THE EFFECT OF THE TOC POLICY
19 REQUIRED ADOPTION OF RENT LIKE CONTROL POLICY I HEARD USED IN
20 A VARIETY OF CONTEXT USUALLY BY REALTORS AND LANDLORDS AND THE
21 OBJECTIVE IS ALWAYS THE SAME WHICH IS TO MISLEAD AND TO
22 INFLAME IN TRUTH TOC POLICY PROVIDES FLEXIBLE MENU OF OPTIONS
23 FOR TENANT PROTECTION PRESIDENCY. UTILIZING ALL TOOLS IN OUR
24 TOOLBOX INCLUDING TENANT PROTECTIONS SOMETIMES A NUDGE IS NEED
25 THE TOC POLICY HELPS CREATE SUCH A NUDGE IT'S A VALUABLE TOOL



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 PLEASE KEEP IT AND KEEP IT STRONG. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ROVI ANTONIO.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. ROVI ANTONIO WITH CALIFORNIA
6 APARTMENT ASSOCIATION REPRESENTING RENTAL HOUSING PROVIDERS
7 OUR COMMENTS ARE SPECIFICALLY REGARDING THE HOUSING IN THE TOC
8 SINCE WE WERE NOT INCLUDED IN THE COMPACT THAT WAS DEVELOPED
9 TO CREATE THE TOC IN 2022 WE THANK STAFF FOR THE OVERVIEW OF
10 THE OCTOBER WORKSHOP THAT WE PARTICIPATED IN ALONG WITH OUR
11 COALITION AND FORTUNATELY THE WORKSHOP DID NOT FULLY CAPTURE
12 ALL COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS AND CONCERNED STAKEHOLDERS
13 WITH THE TOC. THE HOUSING LIST HAS PERMANENT PROGRAMS THAT
14 REQUIRE ONGOING PERMANENT FUNDING IN EXCHANGE FOR ACCESS TO
15 ONE TIME TRANSPORTATION FUNDS. WE BELIEVE THAT MTC SHOULD NOT
16 BE ADDING ANOTHER LAYER OF HOUSING REQUIREMENTS SINCE THE
17 HOUSING ELEMENT IS SURF. IT COVERS THE THREE P'S WITH BIG
18 FOCUS ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING THROUGH THE AFFH. AS A TRANSIT
19 AGENCY, MTC SHOULD NOT BE CREATING A LIST OF ENDORSEMENT OF
20 HOUSING POLICIES ESPECIALLY WHEN THIS IS USING METRICS THAT
21 HAVE HOUSING POLICIES HAVE A NEGATIVE IMPACT ON HOUSING. THANK
22 YOU VERY MUCH.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SCCAOR GOVERNMENT
25 AFFAIRS. AND YOU HAVE DROPPED OFF. SO, IF YOU STAFF OWE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 GONZALEZ. WE'LL MOVE ON TO YOU. GUSTAVO GONZALEZ.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** YES, CAN YOU HEAR ME.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE, WE CAN HEAR YOU.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI EVERYBODY. I AM GUSTAVO GONZALEZ, LIVE IN THE CITY
8 OF SAN JOSE AND I OWN RENT-CONTROLLED APARTMENT BUILDINGS.
9 HERE IS WHAT I CAN TELL YOU, ADDING ANOTHER LAYER OF
10 GOVERNMENT BUREAUCRACY IS GOING TO FORCE ME OUT OF THIS
11 BUSINESS. WHY DO I SAY THIS? BECAUSE I HAVE SOME APARTMENT
12 BUILDINGS THAT ARE NOT ENSURED. WHY? BECAUSE THE INSURANCE
13 COMPANIES DON'T WANT TO NICHE PROPERTIES THAT ARE UNDER ALL OF
14 THIS RENT CONTROL AND THAT'S A BAD PROBLEM FOR ME AS AN OWNER
15 AND FOR MY TENANTS WHO ARE LIVING THERE. SO I WANT YOU TO
16 PLEASE THINK ABOUT THIS LOGICALLY AND STOP MAKING OUR LIVES
17 MISERABLE YOU'RE TEARING THE HEART OUT OF THE SMALL MOM AND
18 POP PROPERTY OWNERS WHO CARE ABOUT THEIR TENANTS I HAVE A
19 TENANT TODAY THAT HASN'T PAID IN SIX MONTHS AND SHE'S NOT
20 HOMELESS BECAUSE I HAVE A HEART AND CARE ABOUT MY TENANTS I
21 HAVEN'T SOLD BECAUSE IT'S BECAUSE I CARE ABOUT MY TENANTS
22 OTHERWISE I WOULD HAVE SOLD IT'S NOT SMART TO KEEP APARTMENTS
23 WITH ALL OF THESE REGULATIONS. PLEASE STOP. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT HOWARD WONG.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, I'M AN ARCHITECT AND PLANNER, I
3 THINK ANY STEP OF ANY PROCESS ONE HAS TO KIND OF STEP BACK AND
4 TAKE AN OVERVIEW. PLANNING HAS TO BE SOMEWHAT FLEXIBLE. AND
5 THE REASON FOR THAT IS BECAUSE WE -- PRESERVATION,
6 AFFORDABILITY, IS IMPORTANT, BUT THERE IS ALSO PRESERVATION OF
7 AESTHETICS, OF VALUES, OF CULTURE, SO THAT IN PARIS LIMITED
8 HEIGHTS CENTRAL PARIS OPEN VENICE, ITALY DOESN'T ALLOW HOTELS
9 AND CONDOS ALONG THE CANALS OR WHEN ZURICH HAS A WALKABLE CITY
10 WITH VERY QUAIN'T BEAUTIFUL BUILDINGS, WENT OUT AND STEP BACK
11 AND THINK HOW DO WE PRESERVE OUR CULTURE AND VALUES AS WELL AS
12 BUILD MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CADE KENNEDY.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS CADE KENNEDY SENIOR DIRECTOR OF
17 PROGRAMS WITH CLIMATE RESILIENT COMMUNITIES ENVIRONMENTAL
18 JUSTICE ORGANIZATION THAT WORKS IN SAN MATEO COUNTY FRONTLINE
19 RESIDENTS IN WORKING CLASS COMMUNITIES ARE FACING A REAL
20 THREAT OF DISPLACEMENT AS WELL AS MULTIPLE COMPOUNDING EFFECTS
21 OF CLIMATE CHANGE AND ENVIRONMENTAL INJUSTICES. I'M CALLING
22 TODAY TO, AGAIN, JOIN WITH THE CHORUS OF VOICES THAT IS
23 SUPPORTING FULL COMPLIANCE AS WELL AS RETAINING THREE P'S,
24 SPECIFICALLY MENLO PARK IN THE BELLHAVEN COMMUNITY WE HAVE
25 WORKED HARD TO GET POLICIES AND PROGRAMS IN PLACE TO COMPLY



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 WITH THE THREE P'S AND TO BE A GOOD STEWARD OF THE TOC POLICY,
2 AND THIS WOULD BE UNDERMINING A LOT OF GREAT COMMUNITY WORK ON
3 BEHALF OF OUR FRONTLINE COMMUNITIES, OUR WORKING CLASS
4 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE JUST TRYING TO CONTINUE TO LIVE AND WORK
5 AND PROVIDE THE RICH DIVERSE PLACE WE LOVE TO CALL OUR HOME.
6 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS ELLA ZAMBALIST.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, MY NAME IS ELLA, UPON
11 HAPPY TO SPEAK ON BEHALF OF THE PARTNERSHIP FOR BAY'S FUTURE
12 AND ALSO A PART OF COALITION LETTER FROM ENTERPRISE AND PUBLIC
13 ADVOCATES, SAN FRANCISCO FOUNDATION, PARTNERSHIP FOR BASE
14 FUTURE HELPS CREATE IMPLEMENT POLICIES ACROSS THE THREE P'S
15 ALLOW MORE BAY AREA RESIDENTS TO STAY IN THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS
16 AND STRONG EFFECTIVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TOC IS KEY TO
17 ADVANCING ENSURING LONG-TERM STABILITY TODAY WE UPHOLD THE TOC
18 POLICY PURPOSES SUBSTANTIVE COMPLIANCE ARE ESSENTIAL
19 FLEXIBILITY ARE BUILT INTO THE POLICY REFLECTS YEARS OF
20 COMPROMISE ALLOWING JURISDICTIONS TO COMPLIANCE SIMPLY TO
21 FOLLOW STATE LAW FOR MAKING MINIMAL PROGRESS RISK GUTTING
22 TENANT PROTECTIONS UNDERMINING INTENTION OF THE POLICY, OBAG
23 FOUR FUNDS SHOULD BE CONTINGENT ON FULL COMPLIANCE WITH THE
24 TOC AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMERCIAL STABILIZE POLICIES. I
25 APPRECIATE THE TIME. THANK YOU.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS CECILIA LUNA PARA.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS CECILIA PARA. I'M A BERKELEY CITY
5 COUNCIL MEMBER REPRESENTING THE UC BERKELEY CAMPUS AND
6 STUDENTS SUPER MAJORITY NEIGHBORHOOD ALSO A RECENT UC BERKELEY
7 GRADUATE IN CITY PLANNING HERE IS THE REALITY 10% OF UC
8 BERKELEY STUDENTS EXPERIENCE HOMELESSNESS AT SOME POINT DURING
9 THEIR UNDERGRADUATE YEARS STUDENTS ARE LIVING IN OVERCROWDED
10 HOUSING OVER THE PAST EIGHT YEARS BERKELEY HAS BEEN WORKING ON
11 OUR HOUSING POLICIES AND IT HAS GOTTEN BETTER BUT WE CAN'T DO
12 THIS ALONE. ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING CRISIS NEEDS TO BE A
13 REGIONAL EFFORT. I WANT TO SPEAK ON THE POSSIBILITY OF
14 EXACERBATING GENTRIFICATION IF YOU DON'T PROTECT TENANTS
15 BERKELEY HAS SOME OF THE STRONGEST TENANT PROTECTIONS IN THE
16 STATE AND WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO SEE AN INCREASE IN HOUSING
17 SUPPLY IT'S IMPERATIVE THAT WE MAINTAIN AND STRENGTHEN TENANT
18 PROTECTIONS. PLEASE SUPPORT FULL COMPLIANCE WITH THE TOC
19 POLICY FOR THE OBAG FOUR SET ASIDE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ACCAOR GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS IS
22 BACK. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ENRIQUE, I'M A GOVERNMENT
25 AFFAIRS ASSOCIATE WITH THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY ASSOCIATION OF



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 REALTORS I WANT TO REITERATE OUR OPPOSITION TO THE TOC POLICY
2 WE OPPOSE THE INCLUSION OF ANTI-HOUSING REGULATIONS SUCH AS
3 NOT LIMITED TO RENT CONTROL, JUST CAUSE EVICTIONS SO-CALLED
4 TENANT ANTIHARASSMENT PROTECTIONS TAXPAYER FUNDED ATTORNEY'S
5 AGAINST HOUSING PROVIDERS THE COMMUNITIES OPPORTUNITY TO
6 PURCHASE ACT WE DEMAND THESE POLICIES BE REMOVED FROM THE TOC
7 POLICY MEMORY THEY DO NOT BUILD OR ENCOURAGE HOUSING IN FACT
8 THEY DISCOURAGE IT FURTHERMORE, THE CHARACTERIZATION OF THE
9 MEETING IN THE STAFF REPORT REGARDING THE OCTOBER 33rd
10 WORKSHOP SEEMS TO SUGGEST THERE WAS A CONSENSUS AROUND KEEPING
11 THE HOUSING POLICY AS IS. IF YOU REMEMBER FROM ALL THE PUBLIC
12 COMMENT, THAT WAS DEFINITELY NOT THE CASE AND IT WASN'T
13 REFLECTED IN THE STAFF REPORT AND ADDITIONALLY THERE WAS
14 CERTAINLY NO CONSENSUS AROUND PRESERVING THE HOUSING POLICIES
15 AS IT IS BY THE COMMISSION THEMSELVES. SO, THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. JANE HUNT.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO MAKE A QUICK COMMENT
20 ABOUT THE RENT CONTROL ASPECTS OF THE TORQUE. I AM --
21 ENCOURAGE YOU TO OPPOSE THOSE, PRIMARILY BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT
22 EVERYBODY IS LOOKING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING, BUT THOSE KIND OF
23 EFFORTS ACTUALLY INCREASE THE COST OF HOUSING AND REDUCE THE
24 PRODUCTION OF HOUSING. SO, THOSE THAT ARE HOPING TO GET MORE
25 HOMES BUILT, PARTICULARLY PLACES LIKE BERKELEY WITH THEIR



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 STUDENTS AND THEIR HOUSING, LIVING ON THE COUCHES AND STUFF
2 LIKE THAT, WE NEED MORE HOUSING, WE DON'T NEED RENT CONTROL
3 MEASURES. SO, I APPRECIATE IT IF THIS GROUP WOULD ELIMINATE
4 THAT FROM THE TOC. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. DAVE T.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS DAVE THOMPSON, I AM
9 CODIRECTOR OF VOICE I'M SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF OUR RENTERS
10 ORGANIZING COMMITTEE EDEN RENTERS UNITED WE'RE LOCATED IN EDEN
11 AREA OF ALAMEDA COUNTY WE URGE THE COMMISSION TO CONTINUE TO
12 SUPPORT THE PRO PEOPLE PRO FAMILY TENANT PROTECTION POLICIES
13 CURRENTLY INCLUDED IN THE TOC WE KNOW THAT TENANT PROTECTIONS
14 KEEPS PEOPLE IN THEIR HOMES, FAMILIES IN THEIR HOMES, IN THIS
15 CURRENT STATE WHERE UP TO 20% OF SINGLE-FAMILY HOMES ARE
16 BOUGHT BY CORPORATE INVESTORS, HAVING THESE PROTECTIONS ARE
17 CRITICAL. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. JOSEPH IPHONE. JOSEPH IPHONE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, WE CAN HEAR YOU.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** I'M SPEAKING AS SOMEONE WHO USED TO OWN AFFORDABLE



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 HOUSING. THESE TENANT PROTECTION AND EVICTION MORATORIUM
2 THINGS PUT US OUT OF BUSINESS. YOU PUT 28 PEOPLE THAT USED TO
3 LIVE IN OUR FACILITIES OUT IN THE STREET, OR YOU FORCE THEM
4 INTO MARKET RATE HOUSING. YOU CAN'T CONTINUE TO ASK US TO
5 PROVIDE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND THEN PUT THESE CRAZY LIMITS ON
6 US. WE HAVE GOT TO HAVE INCOME IN ORDER TO PROVIDE DOESN'T
7 PLACES. WHEN YOU DO THINGS LIKE EVICTION MORATORIUMS, WHO YOU
8 ALLOW PEOPLE WHO HAVE INCOME TO CHOOSE NOT TO PAY, YOU JUST
9 PUT US OUT OF BUSINESS. AND I WANT TO BE CLEAR, WE SOLD OUR
10 PROPERTIES IN THE BAY AREA, 28 PEOPLE ARE EITHER OUT ON THE
11 STREET, OR THEY ARE NOW IN MARKET RATE HOUSING, BECAUSE THE
12 PEOPLE THAT BOUGHT OUR PROPERTIES DID NOT SUPPORT WHAT WE USED
13 TO DO. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
16 RAISED HANDS MADAM CHAIR.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU FOR ALL THOSE
19 COMMENTS. I'M JUST GOING TO BRING IT BACK TO ANY ADDITIONAL
20 COMMENTS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS. WE HAVE LOST QUITE A FEW
21 COMMISSIONERS IN THE PROCESS BUT I WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY FOR
22 SUCH ROBUST CONVERSATION. WE WILL LOOK TO PUT A GROUP TOGETHER
23 TO, SORT OF, SYNTHESIZE EVERYTHING WE HAVE HEARD AND TRY TO
24 COME UP WITH ANY DIFFERENT OPTIONS THAT WE HAVE FROM WHAT WE
25 HEARD TODAY. A LOT OF THE DIFFERENCES SEEM TO STEM AROUND RENT



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1 CONTROL OR RENT STABILIZATION. AND I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE,
2 THIS POLICY IS A LOT BROADER THAN THAT. AND WE NEED TO THINK
3 ABOUT ALL THOSE PARTS, NOT JUST THAT ONE PIECE, WHICH SEEMS TO
4 BE THE HEATED TOPIC. ANYWAY, WITH THAT, SO, WE WILL TRY TO
5 CONVENE A SMALLER GROUP TO WORK ON SOME OF THIS, AFTER ALL THE
6 GREAT INPUT FROM EVERYBODY, AND APPRECIATE THAT. OKAY. THAT
7 WAS JUST AN INFORMATION ITEM. SO, I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
8 PUBLIC, AS WELL, FOR ALL THEIR INPUT. WE'LL GO ON TO ITEM 11,
9 WHICH IS OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT. SO, ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC
10 COMMENTS?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
13 THIS ITEM, NO ONE HAS RAISED THEIR HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND
14 NO ONE HAS PROVIDED A SPEAKER CARD.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WONDERFUL. THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 12 IS
17 ADJOURNMENT THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN
18 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY
19 AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, ON
20 WEDNESDAY DECEMBER 17TH. AND PLEASE NOTE THAT THIS MEETING IS
21 THE THIRD WEDNESDAY, NOT THE FOURTH, DUE TO THE HOLIDAYS.
22 WE'LL ALSO BE HERE IN THE YERBA BUENA ROOM INSTEAD OF ACROSS
23 THE WAY, SINCE OUR BRETHREN HAVE TAKEN UP THAT ROOM.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** OH.



NOVEMBER 19, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I YOU KNOW. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL
3 BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED. PLEASE STAND
4 BY FOR THE BATA MEETING. [ADJOURNED]