METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
2	WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 14TH, 2024, 10:10 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS
6	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR OF MTC. I'M GOING TO BE FILLING IN FOR
7	CHAIR CHAVEZ AND VICE CHAIR MILEY. I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER
8	THE MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS
9	MEETING IS BEING WEBCASTED ON THE MTC WEBSITE. CALL THE ROLL,
10	PLEASE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: IN ABSENCE OF CHAIR CHAVEZ AND VICE CHAIR
13	MILEY, WE WILL BE DEPUTIZING CHAIR PEDROZA AS CHAIR OF THIS
14	MEETING. I'LL CALL ROLL. CHAIR PEDROZA?
15	
16	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. MILEY IS ABSENT. CHAVEZ
19	IS ABSENT. ABE-KOGA?
20	
21	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: PRESENT.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY?
24	
25	DINA EL-TAWANSY: PRESENT.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING?
3	
4	VICTORIA FLEMING: PRESENT.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GLOVER?
7	
8	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN?
11	
12	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?
15	
16	HILLARY RONEN: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NON-VOTING SCHAFF?
19	
20	LIBBY SCHAFF: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. WE HAVE QUORUM.
23	
24	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO
25	ITEM TWO, OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. WE HAVE A FEW ITEMS ON



CONSENT. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR CONSENT 1 2 CALENDAR? 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED AND NO 4 5 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM SPACE OR IN THE BOARDROOM WHO 6 WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT. 7 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: BRING IT BACK LOOKING FOR A MOTION ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR? FIRST BY RONEN. SECOND GLOVER. NO ROLL 9 CALL VOTE. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE. 10 11 SPEAKER: AYES. OPPOSED ABSTENTION? MOTION PASSES. MOVING TO 12 OUR NEXT ITEM MTC RESOLUTION, FISCAL YEAR '24/'25 MIRRORS FUND 13 14 ESTIMATE. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO STAFF, TERENCE LEE. 15 16 TERENCE LEE: I'LL BE PRESENTING MTC ITEM 3A TODAY ACTION ITEM ON MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4629 FISCAL YEAR 2025 MTC FUND 17 ESTIMATE. IT'S A REQUIREMENT THE MTC COMMISSION ADOPT FUND 18 ESTIMATE BY MARCH 1ST OF EACH YEAR FUND REVENUE FORECASTS 19 ESTABLISHES DISTRIBUTION FRAMEWORK OF \$1 BILLION FUNDING 20 21 ACROSS SEVERAL MAJOR FUND SOURCES. I'LL PRESENT A SUMMARY, TRENDS, AND HIGHLIGHT, RELATED TO THE FUND ESTIMATE. FIRST UP 22 23 IS THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT TDA FUNDS GENERATED FROM A QUARTER CENT SALES TAX, REVENUES GENERATED IN EACH COUNTY 24 ARE ALLOCATED TO OPERATORS WITHIN THE SAME COUNTY. ESTIMATES



- 1 PREPARED BY COUNTY AUDITOR OFFICES PROJECT A TOTAL OF FIVE
- 2 HUNDREDS \$9 MILLION IN REVENUE FOR THE FISCAL YEAR 2024, 2025.
- 3 2.4% HIGHER THAN REVISED ESTIMATES FOR THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR
- 4 AND BASED ON ACTUAL REVENUE RECEIPTS THROUGH THE FIRST SIX
- 5 MONTHS OF THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR, FY '24 WHICH ARE TRACKING
- 6 BELOW ORIGINAL ESTIMATES CURRENT ESTIMATES REVISED DOWN WARDS
- 7 BY 4% TO 400 EVERYONE IN MILLION DOLLARS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 8 SO NEXT UP IS THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE, STA FORMULA
- 9 PROGRAMS. EACH OF THE PROGRAMS ARE SPLIT STATEWIDE REVENUES
- 10 5050 USING A REVENUE BASED FORMULA AND POPULATION BASED
- 11 FORMULA. REVENUE BASED FORMULA UTILIZES AN OPERATOR SHARE OF
- 12 QUALIFYING REVENUES IN FISCAL YEAR '19 AND COLLECTIVELY THE
- 13 MTC REGION RECEIVES 54% OF THOSE REVENUES. MTC ALSO RECEIVES
- 14 APPROXIMATELY 19% OF THE POPULATION BASED FUNDS BASED ON THE
- 15 REGION'S SHARE OF THESE STATEWIDE POPULATION. COLLECTIVELY THE
- 16 FISCAL YEAR 2024 TO '25STA FORMULA PROGRAMS ARE PROJECTED TO
- 17 BRING \$453 MILLION OF FUNDING TO THE BAY AREA. THE LARGEST OF
- 18 THE PROGRAMS IS THE STA PROGRAM FOR WHICH REVENUES ISSUE BASED
- 19 ON A TAX ON DIESEL FUEL AND FY '25 ESTIMATE IS \$340 MILLION.
- 20 OF NOTE WHILE THE FUND ESTIMATE IS BASED ON FORECAST FROM THE
- 21 STATE CONTROLLERS OFFICE THE GOVERNOR'S PROPOSED BUDGET
- 22 RELEASE IN JANUARY REFLECTED A LOWER FORECAST FOR THE CURRENT
- 23 YEAR FISCAL YEAR '24STA REVENUES. IF FORECASTS BUYER BARE OUT
- 24 IT WOULD RESULT IN A \$34 MILLION REDUCTION IN THE FY '24STA
- 25 FUND CURRENTLY REFLECTED IN THE FUND STAFF WILL RETURN TO THE



- 1 COMMISSION LATER THIS YEAR WITH UPDATES BUT TRANSIT OPERATORS
- 2 SHOULD BE PREPARED FOR A POSSIBLE REDUCTION IN STA FUNDING.
- 3 NEXT SLIDE. LAST MAJOR REVENUE SOURCE HIGHLIGHTING ASSEMBLY
- 4 BILL A.B. 1107 FUNDS HALF CENT SALES TAX IN ALAMEDA CONTRA
- 5 COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO COUNTIES BART RECEIVED 75% OF THIS
- 6 FUNDING MTC ESTABLISHES FUNDING POLICY FOR THE RAPING 25%
- 7 WHICH HAS HISTORICALLY BEEN SPLIT EVENLY BETWEEN SFMTA AND AC
- 8 TRANSIT BASED ON CURRENT SALES TAX TRENDS CURRENT YEAR
- 9 FORECAST REMAINS UNCHANGED AT \$104 MILLION AND WILL SIMILARLY
- 10 BE \$104 MILLION FOR FY '25. NEXT SLIDE IS HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY
- 11 TABLE MAJOR FUNDING SOURCES AND FUND ESTIMATES HIGHLIGHTING
- 12 FOOTNOTE ABOUT THE POSSIBLE REDUCTION OF FY '24 AND STA
- 13 REVENUES. NEXT SLIDE. IS HIGHLIGHTING ECONOMIC TRENDS STARTING
- 14 WITH THE BAY AREA POPULATION, SINCE 2020 THE BAY AREA'S
- 15 POPULATION HAS CONTINUED TO DECREASE POPULATION REFLECTED IN
- 16 BLUE BARS RATE OF CHANGE REFLECTED IN THE LINES ORANGE FOR THE
- 17 BAY AREA AND DOTTED GREEN FOR THE STATEWIDE RATE OF CHANGE.
- 18 NOTE STATEWIDE AND REGIONAL POPULATIONS HAVE DECLINED BAY AREA
- 19 POPULATION HAS BEEN DECLINING AT A FASTER RATE. NEXT SLIDE
- 20 PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE UNEMPLOYMENT RATES SINCE 2019.
- 21 THE SOLID BLUE LINE REFLECTS THE NATIONAL AVERAGE. ORANGE LINE
- 22 REFLECTS THE CALIFORNIA AVERAGE, AND THE DOTTED LINES REFLECT
- 23 UNEMPLOYMENT RATES IN EACH. NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. AFTER A
- 24 SPIKE DURING -- AFTER A SPIKE DURING THE ONSET OF THE
- 25 PANDEMIC, THE BAY AREA UNEMPLOYMENT RATE HAD IMPROVED



- 1 SIGNIFICANTLY AND HAVE MOSTLY BEEN BELOW THE STATEWIDE AND
- 2 NATIONAL AVERAGES. HOWEVER, THIS TREND HAS REVERSED IN THE
- 3 LAST YEAR WITH INCREASE IN EACH -- IN EACH BAY AREA COUNTY.
- 4 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS EACH COUNTY'S UNEMPLOYMENT
- 5 RATES SINCE 2019 IN MORE DETAIL. YOU WILL SEE THE INCREASE
- 6 FROM 2022 TO '23 IN EACH COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LASTLY, IN
- 7 THE ECONOMIC OVERVIEW THIS SLIDE SHOWS TDA REVENUES IN
- 8 INFLATION ADJUSTED FIGURES REFLECTED IN THE DOTTED BLUE LINE
- 9 WHICH SHOWS PEAK IN FISCAL YEAR 2001, AND DECLINED 11% SINCE
- 10 DESPITE CONTINUOUS INCREASES IN TDA REVENUES IN NOMINAL TERMS.
- 11 REVENUES HAVE NOT KEPT UP WITH INFLATION IMPACTING PURCHASING
- 12 POWER OF THOSE REVENUES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND, FINALLY, A
- 13 FEW ADDITIONAL ISSUES TO HIGHLIGHT. FIRST, THE FUND ESTIMATE,
- 14 WITHIN THE FUND ESTIMATE, ESTABLISHED BY AN AGREEMENT BETWEEN
- 15 BART AND FOUR EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS BART HAS COMMUNICATED
- 16 INTEREST IN ESTABLISHING A PATH TO REDUCING FEEDER BUS
- 17 PAYMENTS AS WELL AS ESTABLISHING A NEW APPROACH FOR HOW
- 18 PAYMENTS ARE CALCULATE. IN ADVANCE OF THE FY '24 ESTIMATE
- 19 OPERATORS HAVE AGREED TO A 15% REDUCTION IN FY '23 PAYMENTS
- 20 AND 25% REDUCTION IN FY '24 PAYMENTS. THE APPROACH FOR FY25
- 21 REFLECTED IN THE FUND ESTIMATE IS TO CARRY FORWARD THE 25%
- 22 REDUCTION OF THESE FEEDER BUS PAYMENTS. NEXT UP ON THE MIDDLE
- 23 OF THIS PAGE, THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND FEE
- 24 ADMINISTRATION, OR THE CDTFA HAS BEEN AUDITING SALES TAX
- 25 ATTRIBUTIONS WHICH MAY IMPACT PDA SALES TAX REVENUES IN THE



- 1 BAY AREA COUNTIES. STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO MONITOR RESULTS OF
- 2 AUDITS AND REPORT BACK TO THE COMMISSION AS APPROPRIATE.
- 3 LASTLY THERE, IS A NEW PAGE OF THE FUND ESTIMATE WHICH WILL
- 4 TRACK DISTRIBUTION OF SENATE BILL, SB125 FUNDS INCLUDING \$171
- 5 MILLION THAT WILL BE ALLOCATED TO OPERATORS IN FY '25. NOT ON
- 6 THIS PAGE, I WANT TO NOTE THAT THERE WILL BE SOME ADJUSTMENTS
- 7 TO ATTACHMENT A OF THE FUND ESTIMATE TO CAPTURE RECENT
- 8 TRANSACTIONS THAT WERE NOT REFLECTED IN MATERIALS IN TODAY'S
- 9 PACKET. THIS DOES NOT CHANGE ANY OF THE REVENUE ESTIMATES
- 10 DESCRIBED TODAY BUT WILL ADJUST AVAILABLE ALLOCATION AMOUNTS
- 11 FOR A FEW OPERATORS. THERE WILL BE SUMMARY CHANGES IN THE
- 12 PACKET THAT WILL GO TO THE COMMISSION TWO WEEKS. NEXT SLIDE.
- 13 STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4629 TO THE
- 14 COMMISSION FOR ADOPTION. THIS CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. I
- 15 WOULD BE HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS

16

- 17 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATIONS.
- 18 ENJOYED YOUR GRAPHS. LET ME JUST MAKE A COMMENT. SO, SALES TAX
- 19 IS DOWN. POPULATION GROWTH IS DECLINING. THAT TREND IS A
- 20 LITTLE BIT OF A CONCERN. SO, NOW THAT WE KNOW THAT, YOU KNOW,
- 21 HOW DOES THAT ADJUST IN THE FORECAST IN THAT WE CONTINUE TO DO
- 22 IN THE FUTURE. IS IT RHETORICAL QUESTION AT THIS POINT BECAUSE
- 23 I'M LOOKING AT THE CONCERNS IN TERMS OF OVERALL STATE OF OUR
- 24 REGION TYPICALLY YOU DO NOT WANT THAT.



THERESA ROMMELL: THERESA ROMMEL MTC STAFF I THINK USUALLY 1 THESE FORECASTS SOMETIMES THEY GO UP-AND-DOWN OBVIOUSLY WE SEE 2 3 CONTINUING DECREASES IN POPULATION AND THAT WOULD AFFECT OVERALL REVENUE FOR SURE BUT SALES TAX OFTEN DOES GO UP AND 4 5 DOWN KIND OF THERE ARE PEAKS AND VALLEYS AND IT'S HARD TO DETERMINE BASED ON A COUPLE OF YEARS WORTH OF INFORMATION 6 WHETHER YOU MIGHT KNOW IF THEY'RE GOING TO CONTINUE OR 7 8 DECLINE. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I THINK IN TERMS OF WHAT WE LOOK AT IN 10 11 SUSTAINABLE REVENUE FOR OUR REGION AND HOOKING AT POPULATION GROWTH AND WHO IS SPENDING FROM SALES TAX CONSUMPTION IS 12 SOMETHING WE NEED TO BE MINDFUL OF HOW IT IMPACTS AND JUST 13 REINFORCING THE CONVERSATION. I APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION. 14 15 COMMISSIONER GLOVER? 16 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YOU CAN SPEAK MORE TO THE FEEDER BUS 17 SERVICE? MAYBE ANDY CAN PROVIDE SOME CONTEXT TO THIS? 18 19 ANDREW FREMIER: YEAH. COMMISSIONER, ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE 20 DIRECTOR. IT IS A BIG DEAL IN TERMS OF ALL THESE NUMBERS GOING 21 22 DOWN. IT IS PUTTING STRESS ON ALL THE WORK THAT WE HAVE ALL 23 BEEN TRYING TO DO WITH TRANSIT RECOVERY. I KNOW THERESA IS

PROBABLY IN BETTER SHAPE TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION DIRECTLY,



1 BECAUSE SHE HAS BEEN WORKING WITH THE EAST BAY OPERATORS ON

2 THIS QUESTION.

3

4 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: OKAY.

- 6 THERESA ROMMELL: THIS HAS BEEN ONGOING CONVERSATION AT LEAST
- 7 PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC. WE'RE PROPOSING THE 25% DISCOUNT OR
- 8 REDUCTION IN THE PAYMENT, BECAUSE, AS ANDY NOTED, WE'RE
- 9 CONTINUALLY CONCERNED WITH ONGOING PRESSURE ON OPERATING
- 10 REVENUE. AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE AHEAD OF THE OPERATOR BUDGET
- 11 THAT THEY -- THAT WE'RE BEING FRUGAL AND NOT PUTTING IN AN
- 12 AMOUNT THAT IS GOING TO BE DIFFICULT TO MAINTAIN. AS TERENCE
- 13 NOTED, STA REVENUE BASED ON THE GOVERNANCE BUDGET IS LIKELY TO
- 14 BE MUCH LOWER THAN ANTICIPATED. AND, UNFORTUNATELY, THAT DOES
- 15 HAVE A DISPROPORTIONATE AFFECT ON BART. SO, WE'RE JUST TRYING
- 16 TO BE A LITTLE BIT FRUGAL HERE, AND, ALSO, NOTE THAT, YOU
- 17 KNOW, WE DID -- WE WENT THROUGH THIS PROCESS OF LOOKING AT THE
- 18 TRANSIT OPERATOR SHORTFALLS AND WE BELIEVE A 25% REDUCTION IN
- 19 THE FEEDER BUS PAYMENT IS CONSISTENT, OR ALIGNED WITH WHAT WAS
- 20 ASSUMED IN THOSE FORECASTS. WE BELIEVE IT'S MANAGEABLE. IT HAS
- 21 BEEN -- IT'S BASICALLY THE SAME DISCOUNT AS IT WAS IN THE
- 22 PRIOR YEAR. SO, WE'RE HOPEFUL THAT THE FEEDER BUS OPERATORS
- 23 CAN AT LEAST WORK WITH THAT LEVEL OF FUNDING UNTIL WE FIND A
- 24 LONGER TERM SOLUTION FOR HOW WE FINISHED AND SUSTAIN FEEDER
- 25 SERVICE.



1 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YEAH. THE FEEDER BUS SERVICE REALLY BUYS 2 3 INTO THE WHOLE NOTION OF HOW WE GET THE RIDERSHIP NUMBERS. AND I'M JUST AFRAID THAT IT'S A MAJOR IMPACT WHEN YOU LOOK AT WHAT 4 5 TAKES PLACE WITHIN THOSE REGIONS. BECAUSE THEY'RE HEAVILY, HEAVILY BURDENED BY THE COST, NOT ONLY OF THE FEEDER SERVICE, 6 BUT, ALSO, THE TOTAL OPERATIONS AS IT CONTINUES, THOSE 7 8 INDIVIDUALS ARE PAYING, YOU KNOW, THE PARKING, THE BRIDGE TOLL, THE WHOLE NINE YARDS. AND I'M JUST VERY CONCERNED WITH 9 10 THAT, THE IMPACT THAT IT'S HAVING ON THAT REGION. AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A MODEL WHERE THIS IS NOT QUESTIONED, BUT IT'S 11 BUILT UP INTO CAPITAL COST AND BART AND THEM DOING THEIR 12 SERVICES. SO, I'M HOPING THERE IS ONGOING DISCUSSION WITH 13 THIS. I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT IT TODAY, BECAUSE I THINK THERE 14 IS MORE WORK TO BE DONE IN THAT AREA. AND I HOPE THAT WE'RE 15 16 LOOKING TO CONTINUE THE DIALOGUE WITH THE OPERATORS AND BART. 17 ANDREW FREMIER: COMMISSIONER, WE CERTAINLY ARE. AND AS THERESA 18 MENTIONED. WE HAVE SPENT OUITE A BIT OF TIME REALLY TRYING TO 19 UNDERSTAND THE VARIOUS COMMUNITIES UP THERE. ONE THING OF NOTE 20 21 IS TRI DELTA, WHICH I KNOW IS ONE OF YOUR BIG INTERESTS IN YOUR AREA, THEY DON'T HAVE A LOT OF CLIPPER PENETRATION SO WE 22 DON'T HAVE A LOT OF DATA HOW THEY ACTUALLY MOVE THROUGH THE 23 SYSTEM. SO WE WANT TO WORK WITH THEM AND FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET 24 THEIR NUMBERS UP. COUNTY CONNECTION HAS QUITE A BIT OF CLIPPER 25



PENETRATION WHICH IS HELPFUL FOR UNDERSTANDING HOW PEOPLE ARE 1 MOVING AROUND THE REGION. BUT I ASSURE YOU WE'RE CONTINUING TO 2 3 WORK WITH THEM AND TO THERESA'S POINT THIS, IS GOOD BUSINESS TODAY THAT HELPS KEEP US IN RELATIVELY SOLID FOOTING BUT WE'RE 4 5 GOING TO CONTINUE TO GIVE YOU NEWS IN TERMS OF HOW MUCH REVENUE IS COMING IN AND WHAT WE FOUND WITH THE STATE BUDGET 6 7 CHANGES AS WELL. 8 9 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: ALL RIGHT. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ANYONE ELSE? DO WE HAVE PUBLIC 11 COMMENT? 12 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE OR IN 14 THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT AND NO WRITTEN 15 16 CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED. 17 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: AT THIS POINT I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION. 18 I'LL MOVE THE ITEM FORWARD. SECOND BY RONEN. ANY DISCUSSION? 19 ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: AYES.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: AYE. OPPOSED? NO ABSTENTION. MOTION

PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT WITH NO FOR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

23

24



- 1 COMMISSIONER GLOVER. PROCEEDING TO 4A MTC RESOLUTION 4630
- 2 FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PLAN.

- 4 RALEIGH MCCOY: RALEIGH McCOY MTC FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM STAFF
- 5 HERE TODAY TO PRESENT UPDATE ON THE FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024
- 6 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM OR PIP FOR SHORT. UPDATE ON
- 7 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SENATE BILL 125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY
- 8 MEASURES AND NEXUS BETWEEN THE TWO PROGRAMS. REFRESHER
- 9 PARTICULARLY SINCE PIP HAS BEEN ON HIATUS IN THE PAST FEW
- 10 YEARS DUE TO COVID-19, AND THE PURPOSE OF PIP IS TO IDENTIFY
- 11 OPPORTUNITIES FOR OPERATORS TO IMPROVE THEIR COST
- 12 EFFECTIVENESS FOR MTC TO TRACK OPERATORS PROGRESS IMPLEMENTING
- 13 INITIATIVES. PIP IS ADOPTED ANNUALLY TO MEET REQUIREMENTS
- 14 ASSOCIATED WITH TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT STATE TRANSIT
- 15 ASSISTANCE FUNDS WHICH ARE TWO OF THE PRIMARY SOURCES OF STATE
- 16 SUPPORT FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. OPERATORS MUST DEMONSTRATE
- 17 SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS TOWARDS THEIR PROJECTS IN ORDER TO BE
- 18 ELIGIBLE TO RECEIVE ALLOCATION OF TDA AND STA FUNDING. NEXT
- 19 SLIDE. ON HERE IS A SUMMARY OF SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY
- 20 MEASURES ADOPTED MTC RESOLUTION 4619 IN NOVEMBER 2023. THIS IS
- 21 A SUMMARIZATION OF ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES ADOPTED AND
- 22 SPECIFIC LANGUAGE IS INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET AS ATTACHMENT D.
- 23 AS YOU CAN SEE THE REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES RANGE FROM
- 24 REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE APPLIED TO ALL OPERATORS RECEIVING SB125
- 25 FUNDS, SUCH AS ACTIVE PARTICIPATION AND A HOST OF REGIONAL



- 1 INITIATIVES PARTICIPATION IN ONGOING SCHEDULE ARE COORDINATION
- 2 WORK AS WELL AS ASSESSMENT OF QUALITY OF GENERAL TRANSIT FEED
- 3 SPECIFICATION GTFS DATA AND THAT POWERS REALTIME ARRIVAL
- 4 PRODUCTIONS SUCH AS PERSONALITY DATA SOURCE FOR TRANSIT USERS
- 5 ADDITIONALLY THE TABLE SEVERAL OPERATOR SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS
- 6 AS WELL AS ATTACHED IN SB125 FUNDS THAT PRESENT TAILORED
- 7 SOLUTIONS TO OPERATOR SPECIFIC INITIATIVES. THE RESOLUTION
- 8 4619 PROPOSAL IS TO INTEGRATE REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES
- 9 AS PROJECTS WITHIN THE PIP DOVETAILING MEASURES INTO AN
- 10 EXISTING REPORT PROCEDURE THAT OPERATORS ARE FAMILIAR WITH.
- 11 DEMONSTRATING SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS TOWARD IMPLEMENTATION OF
- 12 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES IN ORDER TO ELIGIBLE TO
- 13 RECEIVE ALLOCATION OF SB125 FUNDS. ADDITIONALLY SINCE
- 14 OPERATORS REGARDLESS WHETHER OR NOT THEY'RE RECEIVING SB125
- 15 FUNDS ARE REQUIRED TO HAVE AT LEAST ONE PIP PROJECT PROPOSAL
- 16 FOR OPERATORS WOULD BE ASSIGNED TO THE FIRST BULLET WITH FOUR
- 17 SUBBULLETS AS PIP PROJECTS FOR THIS YEAR. ACCOUNTABILITY
- 18 MEASURES GO BEYOND WHAT WAS REQUIRED IN SB125 GUIDELINES THERE
- 19 WAS NO REQUIREMENT FOR LEVEL OF ACCOUNTABILITY SO THIS
- 20 DEMONSTRATES MTC AND OPERATOR COMMITMENT TO ENHANCING TRANSIT
- 21 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE CHARTS OUT
- 22 PROPOSED PROCESS FOR IMPLEMENTING REPORTING ON SB125
- 23 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES HERE IN FEBRUARY ON THE PRECIPICE OF
- 24 THE FIRST MILESTONE ADOPTION OF THE PIP WHICH IDENTIFIES SB125
- 25 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES AS PIP PROJECTS. ROLLING



- 1 BASIS BEGINNING SUMMER 2024 OPERATORS WOULD SUBMIT REQUESTS
- 2 FOR ALLOCATIONS OF TDA, STA FUNDS AND NOW SB125 FUNDS WHEN
- 3 OPERATORS REQUEST ALLOCATIONS THEY SUBMIT SUPPORTING
- 4 DOCUMENTATION TO MTC INCLUDING REPORTING ON PROGRESS TOWARD
- 5 THEIR PIP PROJECTS. ADDITIONALLY IN LINE WITH EXISTING
- 6 PROCEDURES THESE ALLOCATIONS REQUESTS ARE REQUIRED TO BE BOARD
- 7 APPROVED GIVES US TRANSIT BOARDS FIRMING COMMITMENTS TO
- 8 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY. MTC STAFF WOULD ASSESS OPERATOR
- 9 ADVANCE OF THEIR PIP PROJECTS OR SB125 ACCOUNT ACCOUNTABILITY
- 10 MEASURES AND PROVIDE ALONG WITH PROGRESS ALONGSIDE REQUESTS
- 11 FOR APPROVAL OF SB125 FUNDS. BEGINNING SUMMER 2024 AND
- 12 OCCURRING ON A ROLLING BASIS ADDITIONALLY MTC REPORT FROM
- 13 OPERATORS IN EARLY 2025 WOULD BE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO
- 14 RETURN TO YOU ALL AND PROVIDE OPERATORS PROGRESSING TOWARD
- 15 IMPLEMENTATION OF THEIR PROJECTS. WITH THAT THE RECOMMENDED
- 16 ACTION TODAY IS REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4630 THE
- 17 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM TO THE COMMISSION FOR
- 18 ADOPTION AND AGAIN RECAP NEXT STEPS IN SUMMER OF 2024
- 19 RECEIVING UPDATES ON STATUS OF PIP PROJECTS FROM OPERATORS
- 20 RECEIVING SB125 FUNDS AND WE'LL BE RETURNING TO YOU AT THAT
- 21 TIME SUMMER OF 2024 TO PROVIDE UPDATE.
- 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

24



- 1 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. I REALIZE WE SAW THIS ONCE BEFORE.
- 2 [LAUGHTER] I DO BELIEVE WE NEED TO BE ACCURATE IN THE
- 3 PRESENTATION HERE, AS I'M UNDERSTANDING IT. SO IF WE COULD GO
- 4 BACK TO THE SLIDE -- THE ADOPTED -- OR, THE MEASURES, REGIONAL
- 5 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES HERE.

6

7 RALEIGH MCCOY: SLIDE TWO, PLEASE.

- 9 GINA PAPAN: YES. THAT ONE. GREAT. I WOULD BE MORE COMFORTABLE
- 10 IF WE COULD ADD A LINE HERE. YOU HAVE GOT -- AND I UNDERSTAND
- 11 THIS HAS BEEN ASKED FOR BUT HAS NOT BEEN INCLUDED HERE. BART,
- 12 SF, MTA, AND CALTRAIN IN THERE. BUT THE STATEMENTS OR CUSTOMER
- 13 EFFICIENCY ENHANCEMENTS, THEY DON'T REALLY REFLECT WHAT
- 14 CALTRAIN IS INVOLVED IN, WHICH IS, I UNDERSTAND IT AS SUICIDE
- 15 PREVENTION AND CROSSINGS. SO, I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO BE
- 16 SPECIFIC HERE. AND I UNDERSTAND THEY HAVE ASKED FOR THAT. SO,
- 17 I WOULD FEEL BETTER IF WE COULD JUST ADD A LINE TO BREAK THAT
- 18 OUT. BECAUSE WE REALLY NEED TO KNOW. YOU SAY THAT THE PIP
- 19 FUNDING IS GOING TO BE BASED ON THAT, BUT WHAT'S ASKED FOR
- 20 HERE IS NOT REALLY REFLECTIVE OF THAT REAL AGENCY. SO, I WOULD
- 21 SPECIFICALLY ASK FOR THAT MODIFICATION SO THAT WE CAN REALLY
- 22 KNOW WHAT IS BEING ACHIEVED, ACCOUNTABILITY-WISE HERE AND THEN
- 23 I NEED TO GO BACK UP TO BART IMPLEMENTATION FARE GATE
- 24 STATEWIDE. THAT NEVER HAS BEEN REALLY PRESENTED TO US IN A WAY
- 25 -- IS THIS -- IF YOU COULD CLARIFY FOR ME, WHERE IS THAT



FUNDING COMING FROM? THAT'S KIND OF THE FIRST POINT. THE 1 SECOND POINT IS THAT THERE IS A RUMOR GOING AROUND THAT 2 3 CERTAIN COUNTIES ARE GOING HAVE TO PAY FOR THOSE. WE HAVEN'T BEEN APPROACHED BY BART TO DO THAT. AND I UNDERSTAND THERE HAS 4 5 BEEN AN AGREEMENT WITH SOME TRANSIT AGENCIES. THE WAY IT'S 6 PRESENTED HERE, CAN WE GET SOME CLARIFICATION PLEASE? 7 8 THERESA ROMMELL: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I CAN TRY AND RESPOND TO SOME OF THOSE OUESTIONS. FIRST ONE, I THINK YOUR CONCERN OVER 9 THIS SLIDE HERE, AS RALEIGH STATED THIS, IS DONE TO COMBINE 10 SOME OF THE LINE ITEMS JUST FOR THE PURPOSES OF SPACE, BUT IF 11 YOU LOOK AT ATTACHMENT B, IT'S ATTACHMENT B, BUT I THINK IT'S 12 C ALSO. [LAUGHTER] -- IT'S ATTACHMENT C OF THE PREVIOUS 13 14 RESOLUTION THAT CONTAINS ACCOUNTABILITY REQUIREMENTS. CALTRAIN 15 HAS ITS OWN ROW AND THAT WAS REQUESTED AND WE DID RESPOND BY 16 DOING THAT IN THE ACTUAL RESOLUTION. WE HAVE SEPARATED OUT CALTRANS CRISIS PREVENTION PROGRAM FROM THE BART AND SAN 17 FRANCISCO MTA AMBASSADOR PROGRAM. THAT WAS A REQUEST THAT WE 18 ACTUALLY ACCOMMODATED AND IT'S JUST NOT IN THIS SLIDE 19 PRESENTATION IN THE SAME WAY THAT IT'S DEPICTED IN THE ACTUAL 20 21 ATTACHMENT. 22

GINA PAPAN: I GET THAT. IT'S BEING PRESENTED.



THERESA ROMMELL: WE'LL TRY TO REMEDY THAT SO IT'S MORE 1 SPECIFIC. IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING PLAN FOR THE FARE GATE WE 2 3 HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THESE RATES FOR A WHILE AND IT WAS ALWAYS STAFF EXPECTATION UNDERSTANDING THAT FUNDING PLAN HAD 4 5 BEEN COMMUNICATED TO THE VARIOUS FUNDING PARTNERS IN TALKING WITH BART STAFF THEY HAVE HAD CONVERSATIONS WITH CONGESTION 6 MANAGEMENT AGENCY AND CCAG AND SOME EXECUTIVES THAT THEY HAVE 7 8 AT THE COUNTY. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THAT'S INACCURATE. I'M SORRY. SO 10 PREVIOUSLY BART HAD SOUGHT ADDITIONAL FUNDING AND SAID IF THEY 11 GOT THAT FUNDING FROM MTC, THEY WOULD USE IT FOR FARE GATES. 12 SO NEXT LEVEL HERE REPRESENT IS THAT'S BEEN MADE THEY WOULD 13 HAVE SIZE WIDE FARE GATES BY 2025 AND THE REQUEST -- BECAUSE 14 15 THEY DIDN'T GET THE FUNDING FROM MTC OR WHATEVER HAS NEVER 16 BEEN COMMUNICATED AT LEAST IN OUR JURISDICTIONS IT'S JUST RUMOR BY THE WAY YOU GUYS ARE GOING TO HAVE TO PAY FOR THOSE 17 AND WE DON'T KNOW WHAT'S THE COST WE DON'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT 18 THIS RIGHT NOW IT'S RUMOR. SO WE NEED CLARIFICATION OF THIS 19 KIND OF GOING AROUND, WELL, WE ASKED FOR THIS AND THAT -- IT'S 20 21 NOT SPECIFIC COMMUNICATION. WHICH IS VERY HELPFUL. WE ALL LOVE THE FARE GATES. WE WANT TO SEE THEM. BUT I REALLY DO NOT 22 APPRECIATE THE REPRESENTATION THAT THEY'RE GIVING YOU, OR, I 23 GUESS, SOME OF THE JURISDICTIONS. BECAUSE IT'S NOT ACCURATE AS 24

TO THIS LINE ITEM HERE. IMPLEMENTATION, NEW FARE GATE SYSTEM



RIDE TO MEET THIS. SO, I REALLY NEED CLARIFICATION. I THINK 1 THE PUBLIC NEEDS CLARIFICATION HERE. WE WANT THESE. WE WANT 2 3 THEM. BUT IT'S KIND OF A SHELL GAME, AND IT'S NOT BEING TRANSPARENT. THERE ARE FIVE STATIONS IN MY AREA JUST TELL US 4 5 BUT NOBODY HAS SAID A WORD IT MAKES IT DIFFICULT AS FAR AS 6 ACCOUNTABILITY. 7 8 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WE HEAR YOUR CONCERNS. 125 9 PROCESS IT DOES ALLOW US TO MONITOR HOW OPERATORS ARE DOING IN 10 EACH OF THESE WE UNDERSTAND THAT THERE'S A LOT OF INTEREST IN 11 THE NEW FARE GATES THROUGHOUT THE REGION SO WE CAN CERTAINLY 12 COME BACK TO PROVIDE MORE ON THAT BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T PROVIDED 13 THAT TO THE COMMISSION YET SO WE CAN WORK TO DO THAT. I THINK 14 15 ONE OF THE THINGS, BART HAS PRESENTED TO THE BOARD KIND OF 16 THEIR FUNDING PLAN BUT OBVIOUSLY IT'S BEEN A WHILE. I THINK THE FUNDING PLAN DID SHOW WHEN THEY PRESENTED TO THEIR BOARD 17 TOTAL COST IT DID MAKE ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTIONS 18 FROM THE THREE BART COUNTIES AS WELL AS NON-BART COUNTIES THAT 19 WOULD PARTICIPATE, WHICH I THINK SANTA CLARA HAS. WE NEED MORE 20 21 INFORMATION WE NEED TO MAKE SURE BART IS WORKING DILIGENTLY WITH FUNDING PARTNERS TO MAKE SURE THEY HAVE THE FULL FUNDING 22 PLAN WE CAN COME BACK WITH DETAIL ON THE PROJECT PLAN BECAUSE 23 WE KNOW HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO THE REGION AND BART SO WE CAN 24

PROVIDE MORE INFORMATION AT A FUTURE MEETING.



1 GINA PAPAN: I APPRECIATE THAT. THIS IS WHERE WE'RE BEING HELD 2 3 ACCOUNTABLE TO THE LEGISLATURE I ASSURE YOU OUR LEGISLATIVE MEMBERS WOULD LIKE TO KNOW AS WELL. I FEEL LIKE THEY'RE HIDING 4 5 THE BALL AND THAT'S NOT APPROPRIATE. I APPRECIATE YOUR EFFORTS IN THAT REGARD. WE NEED TO BE TRANSPARENT ESPECIALLY IF WE ARE 6 LOOKING AT A BOND, FOR COMMUNITIES TO FUND, THE MORE 7 8 TRANSPARENCY AND THE MORE ACHIEVABLE ACCOUNTABLE MEASURES THAT ARE OBTAINED, THAT'S WHAT THE PUBLIC WANTS. I THINK THAT'S 9 WHAT WE ALL WANT. THAT WOULD BE EXCEPTIONALLY HELPFUL HERE. 10 SO, I THINK I HAVE SAID MY PEACE. I THANK YOU. BUT, PLEASE, WE 11 REALLY -- THE MORE WE CAN COMMUNICATE, THE CLEARER WE CAN 12 COMMUNICATE, REALLY THE BETTER FOR ALL OF OUR UNDERSTANDING 13 AND THE PUBLIC. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE IT. 14 15 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS AT THIS MOMENT. DO WE HAVE ANY 17 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 18 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM 20 21 SPACE NOR IN THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT WAS RECEIVED. 22 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I'LL TRY TO SUMMARIZE. I HEARD STAFF 24 MENTION THEY WILL COME BACK AND PROVIDE MORE OF A PRESENTATION



ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FARE GATES AS REQUESTED BY 1 COMMISSIONER PAPAN. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. I'LL LOOK FOR A 2 3 MOTION TO APPROVE MTC RESOLUTION 4630 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. 4 5 GINA PAPAN: MOVE WITH A SLIGHT ADDITION, IF YOU COULD ON YOUR 6 7 CHART, I KNOW IT MAKES IT SMALLER, AND SOME FOLLOW UP, I WILL 8 MOVE. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: CONFIRM WITH STAFF THEY UNDERSTAND THE 10 11 REQUEST. 12 ANDREW FREMIER: UNDERSTOOD. 13 14 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MOTION BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. SECOND 15 16 BY ABE-KOGA. ROLL CALL. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE. 17 SPEAKER: AYES. 18 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: AYE. 20 21 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OPPOSED ABSTENTION? MOTION PASSES. THANK 23 YOU ALL. THANK YOU FOR THE DISCUSSION COMMISSIONERS. ITEM 5A

CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION UPDATE. KENNETH KAO.

24



- 1 KENNETH KAO: KENNETH KAO MTC FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM SECTION
- 2 HERE TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE JANUARY CTC MEETING, MET IN
- 3 MODESTO LATE JANUARY, FIRST CONSIDERED DRAFT 2025 ACTIVE
- 4 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM FUND ESTIMATE AND GUIDELINES. THE
- 5 GOVERNOR'S JANUARY PROPOSED BUDGET INCLUDES A \$200 MILLION CUT
- 6 FROM ATP SO THIS'S SOMETHING THAT'S CONCERNING FOR EVERYONE
- 7 WHO IS LOOKING FORWARD TO COMPETE FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
- 8 PROGRAM FINALIZED WE'LL BE MONITORING THAT AND UPDATE. MTC
- 9 WILL PRESENTING OUR REGIONAL ATP GUIDELINES TO THIS COMMITTEE
- 10 NEXT MONTH AND EXPECT TO RELEASE CALL FOR PROJECTS IN MARCH
- 11 WITH APPLICATIONS DUE IN JUNE. ANOTHER BIG ITEM OF DISCUSSION
- 12 WAS THE I15 EXPRESS LANES IN SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY. WHICH
- 13 WHILE IS NOT DIRECTLY RELATED TO THE BAY AREA, IT DID GARNER A
- 14 LOT OF DISCUSSION AND ATTENTION SO I THOUGHT IT WAS IMPORTANT
- 15 TO RAISE TO YOU. IT WAS DEFERRED FROM THE CTC MEETING IN
- 16 DECEMBER BECAUSE IT WAS A DEADLOCK VOTE BUT THE CTC DID
- 17 APPROVE THE ALLOCATION AT 9 TO 1 VOTE. FINALLY I WANT TO
- 18 UPDATE YOU ON SOME LEADERSHIP AND COMMISSION CHANGES WITH THE
- 19 CTC. THE CTC DID ELECT VICE CHAIR KARL GUARDINO AS THE NEW
- 20 CHAIR FOR CTC STARTING IN MARCH. AS YOU KNOW COMMISSIONER
- 21 GUARDINO IS FROM THE SOUTH BAY AND THEY ALSO ELECTED
- 22 COMMISSIONER DARNELL GRISBE TO BE VICE CHAIR IN MARCH AND
- 23 COMMISSIONER GRISBY LIVES IN SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY. FINALLY
- 24 COMMISSIONER LIEU'S ASSEMBLY APPOINTMENT DID EXPIRE IN JANUARY
- 25 AND CURRENT ASSEMBLY SPEAKER ROBERT RIVAS FROM SALINAS



APPOINTED COMMISSIONER BOB TIFFANY TO CTC EFFECTIVE FEBRUARY. 1 COMMISSIONER TIFFANY WAS FORMERLY A SAN BENITO COUNTY 2 3 SUPERVISOR. NEXT CTC MEETING WILL BE MARCH. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WELCOMING CTC TO OUR REGION. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 6 7 8 GINA PAPAN: IT WAS SO NICE TO GET THE PRESENTATION. WE SEEM TO 9 RUSH OVER IT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. 10 11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: WE HAVE AN HOUR AND 45 MINUTES, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. 12 13 GINA PAPAN: NO. WE HARDLY EVER GET THE REAL PRESENTATION. 14 15 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GREAT COMMENT. 17 18 19 GINA PAPAN: MOVE APPROVAL? 20 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. 21 22 RECEIVED. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?



CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM OR IN 1 THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO 2 3 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE AT THIS POINT. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ITEM SIX GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. 6 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ZOOM OR IN 7 8 THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT AND NO 9 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ITEM SEVEN ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING 11 OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING SCHEDULED 12 TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY MARCH 13TH SAME TIME SAME PLACE. WE ARE 13 ADJOURNED. WE HAVE ONE MORE MEETING COMMISSIONERS STARTS AT 12 14 15 PROMPTLY. MEETING ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]





Broadcasting Government