METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
3	WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2022 9:45 AM
4	
5	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WELCOME
6	EVERYONE TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. I'M
7	DAVID RABBIT CHAIR, ALONG WITH GINA PAPAN, VICE CHAIR. I'M
8	GOING TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER. PLEASE ROLL THE
9	ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE
10	TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR
11	PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS
12	CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING
13	WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
14	COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME,
15	AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
16	GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
17	AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
18	ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
19	OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD
20	USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL
21	CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
22	ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
23	PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
24	NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
25	VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT



- 1 INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO
- 2 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
- 3 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
- 4 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR
- 5 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
- 6 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
- 7 PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS
- 8 NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
- 9 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.
- 11 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU, AGAIN. AND, ONCE AGAIN,
- 12 THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR KEEPING US ALL ROLLING TOGETHER HERE.
- 13 WITH THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER TWO,
- 14 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THERE ARE SIX ITEMS ON THE CONSENT
- 15 CALENDAR --

10

16

18

20

- 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M SORRY, MR. CHAIR.
- 19 GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: ROLL CALL.
- 21 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BEFORE WE DO THAT, WE NEED TO TAKE THE
- 22 ROLL.
- 24 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: WE SHOULD DO THAT. I WAS ON A ROLL.
- 25



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU WERE ON A ROLL. [LAUGHTER]
2	
3	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: SORRY.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NO WORRIES. CHAIR RABBIT?
6	
7	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: HERE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
10	
11	GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
14	
15	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
18	COMMISSIONER GLOVER? COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS HERE.
19	COMMISSIONER MILEY?
20	
21	NATHAN MILEY: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?
24	
25	HIIIADY DONEN. HERE



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER WORTH?
3	
4	AMY R. WORTH: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.
7	
8	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AND GLOVER IS HERE.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER.
11	
12	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. SORRY ABOUT THAT. GETTING AHEAD OF
13	MYSELF. BACK TO THOSE SIX ITEMS ON CONSENT. 2A THROUGH 2F, AND
14	I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS, OR
15	CONCERNS ON CONSENT. IF NOT, CAN I GET A MOTION TO APPROVE?
16	
17	AMY R. WORTH: MOVE APPROVAL, WORTH.
18	
19	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: SECOND. AND PUBLIC COMMENT.
20	
21	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: SURE. WITH THAT I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY
22	PUBLIC COMMENT ON CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS?
23	



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2	THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3	ON THIS ITEM.
4	
5	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. WITH THAT, CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL
6	VOTE ON THE APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR?
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SURE. MOTION BY WORTH, SECOND BY GLOVER.
9	CHAIR RABBIT?
10	
11	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: AYE.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
14	
15	GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: YES.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
18	
19	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS ABSENT.
22	COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
23	
24	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
25	



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY? IS ABSENT. 1 2 COMMISSIONER RONEN? 3 HILLARY RONEN: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER WORTH? 6 7 8 AMY R. WORTH: AYE. 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 10 11 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 12 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA 13 ITEM 3A, THIS IS MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4444 REVISED, 4510 14 REVISED, 4513 REVISED, AND 4169 REVISED. THE TRANSIT CAPITAL 15 16 PRIORITIES, OR TCP POLICY, AND PROGRAM FISCAL YEAR 2021/'22, THROUGH FISCAL YEAR 2023/'2024 UPDATES FOR PROCESSING CRITERIA 17 PROGRAMS 42.3 MILLION IN THE TCP PROGRAM INCLUDING 40 MILLION 18 IN THE FORMULA REV FUNDING FISCAL YEARS 2021 THROUGH 2023, 19 2024 FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS STATE OF GOOD REPAIR CONSISTENT 20 21 WITH TCP PROCESS AND CRITERIA ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING OF 2.3 MILLION IN A BRIDGE TOLLS AND BATA PROJECT SAVINGS PROGRAM 22 23 DISCUSSION OF FINANCING TO ASSIST WITH FUTURE REVENUES. WE HAVE MARGARET DOYLE FOR THIS PRESENTATION. 24



- 1 SPEAKER: MARGARET DOYLE WITH THE TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES
- 2 PROGRAM JUST A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE CAPITAL PRIORITIES
- 3 PROGRAM OR TCP IT FUNDS THE BASIC REQUIREMENTS TO ACHIEVE AND
- 4 MAINTAIN STATE OF GOOD REPAIR, AND THE MTC POLICY OR PROCESS
- 5 TCP PROCESS AND CRITERIA POLICY IS TO ENSURE LIMITED FEDERAL
- 6 FORMULA FUNDS GO TO MOST ESSENTIAL PROJECTS. IN ORDER TO
- 7 PROGRAM THE TCP, OPERATORS SUBMIT CAPITAL PROJECT FUNDING
- 8 REQUESTS AND THE FUNDER PROGRAM DIDN'T PROGRAMMED IN SCORE
- 9 ORDER FACTOR IN PROGRAM ELIGIBILITY URBANIZED AREA OR UZA
- 10 ELIGIBILITY AND PROJECT [INDISCERNIBLE]. STAFF CAME TO THIS
- 11 COMMITTEE IN MARCH TO RECOMMEND PROGRAMMING THE FIRST TRANCHE
- 12 OF MTC FUNDS TO A BASELINE SCORE OF 16 PROJECTS AND TO PRESENT
- 13 POLICY OPTIONS MOVING FORWARD. STAFF RETURNS TO THIS COMMITTEE
- 14 IN MAY TO PROGRAM \$325 MILLION OVER THREE YEARS TO THE BART
- 15 RAIL CAR REPLACEMENT PROGRAM AND PAY GO. AS WELL AS TO SET-
- 16 ASIDE FUNDS FOR INCREASED FIXED GUIDEWAY CAPS, AND A ZERO-
- 17 EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE SET-ASIDE PROGRAM. SO TODAY'S
- 18 ACTION PROGRAMS THOSE SET-ASIDES TO THE FIXED GUIDEWAY
- 19 PROJECTS AND THE ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM FOR
- 20 FISCAL YEAR 2021, 2022, AS WELL AS MAKES MINOR UPDATES TO THE
- 21 PROGRAM AS REQUESTED BY OPERATORS. THIS ACTION UPDATES THE TCP
- 22 PROCESS AND CRITERIA POLICY, THE MTC RESOLUTION SET FORWARD TO
- 23 CONFORM TO SET-ASIDE THOSE NEW INCREASES AND THE BUS
- 24 INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMS, AND FINALLY PROGRAMS \$2.3 MILLION IN
- 25 BRIDGE TOLL MATCHING FUNDS TO ELIGIBLE OPERATORS. SO FOR THE



1	FIXED GUIDEWAY CAP INCREASE, THE FIXED GUIDEWAY CAPS ARE FOR
2	INFRASTRUCTURE REHABILITATION AND HISTORICALLY HAS BEEN FUNDED
3	AT \$120 MILLION PER YEAR. THIS CAP IS IN PLACE DUE TO LIMITED
4	AVAILABLE FUNDS HOWEVER THE NEED HAS REGULARLY EXCEEDED THE
5	\$120 MILLION CAP. THIS PROGRAM IS FUNDED BY THE 5337 PROGRAM,
6	THE FIXED GUIDEWAY STATE OF GOOD REPAIR FEDERAL PROGRAM, AND
7	UNDER THE BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE LAW THIS PROGRAM RECEIVES
8	A 50% INCREASE IN FUNDING. SO THIS INDICATES AN EMPHASIS ON
9	THESE PROJECTS AND BECAUSE OF THAT, AND BECAUSE THE FIXED
10	GUIDEWAY CAPS HAVE NOT GONE UP IN SEVERAL YEARS, IN MAY, THE
11	COMMISSION DIRECTED STAFF TO SET-ASIDE ENOUGH FUNDING FOR A
12	20% INCREASE TO THE FIXED GUIDEWAY CAPS. SO TODAY'S ACTION
13	PROGRAMS THAT INCREASE WHICH AMOUNTS TO APPROXIMATELY \$23
14	MILLION, AS REQUEST BY OPERATORS SO THESE ADDITIONAL FUNDS ARE
15	BEING DIRECTED TOWARD RENOVATION AND REPLACEMENT OF RAIL AND
16	TRACK WAY POWER SYSTEMS CONTROL AND DREDGING AND PRODUCT
17	DETAIL CAN BE FOUND IN THE ATTACHMENT TO TODAY'S MEMO. FOR THE
18	ZERO EMISSION BUS INFRASTRUCTURE SET-ASIDE TCP IS A CRITICAL
19	SOURCE MOVING FORWARD AS THE REGION TRANSITIONS TO A ZERO-
20	EMISSIONS BUS FLEET OR ZEB FLEET AS REQUIRED BY THE CALIFORNIA
21	AIR RESOURCES BOARD INNOVATIVE CLEAN TRANSIT RULE. THE INFLUX
22	OF BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE LAW FUNDING AS WELL AS POTENTIAL
23	STATE BUDGET FUNDS PROVIDE THE OPPORTUNITY TO FUND VEHICLES AS
24	WELL AS INFRASTRUCTURE. IN MAY THE COMMISSION DIRECTED STAFF

TO SET-ASIDE AN AVERAGE OF \$20 MILLION PER YEAR TO FUND ZERO-



- 1 EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WOULD NORMALLY NOT BE
- 2 PRIORITIZED FOR IT. CP FUNDING, TO HELP MEET THIS NEED.
- 3 TODAY'S ACTION PROGRAMS APPROXIMATELY \$18 MILLION IN FISCAL
- 4 YEAR 2022, 2022 FUNDING TO OPERATORS IN THE LARGER URBANIZED
- 5 AREAS OF SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, CONCORD, ANTIOCH, AS THESE
- 6 ARE THE AREAS THAT HAVE TOO MANY COMPETING SCORE 16 NEEDS TO
- 7 FUND ZEB INFRASTRUCTURE, SO OPERATORS ARE UTILIZING THESE
- 8 FUNDS FOR BATTERY ELECTRIC BUS CHARGE INFRASTRUCTURE HYDROGEN
- 9 FUELING INFRASTRUCTURE AND ZERO-EMISSIONS FACILITY DEVELOPMENT
- 10 PROJECTS. CREATION OF THE ZEB INFRASTRUCTURE SET-ASIDE AND TO
- 11 PROGRAMMING PRINCIPLES ARE INCORPORATED INTO THE PROCESS AND
- 12 PRIORITY UPDATES PROPOSED TODAY AND THE DETAIL FOR
- 13 INFRASTRUCTURES SET-ASIDE CAN BE FOUND IN TODAY'S MEMO. THE
- 14 UPDATES TO THE EXISTING PROGRAM OTHER THAN THE FIXED GUIDEWAY
- 15 CAPS AND THE ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT PROGRAM
- 16 INCLUDE PROGRAMMING AB664 MATCHING FUNDS AND TO ELIGIBLE
- 17 OPERATORS A CORRECTION OF AC BATA PROJECT SAVINGS PROGRAM,
- 18 MINOR REBALANCING BETWEEN PROJECTS AND REFLECTION OF THE
- 19 EXCHANGES BETWEEN TCP AND THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY
- 20 TASK FORCE WHICH WERE REFINED IN THE PROGRAMMING OF THE
- 21 REGION'S AMERICAN RESCUE PLAN FUNDS FINALLY REGARDING THE BART
- 22 REPLACEMENT RAIL CAR FUNDING AND FINANCING THE AFOREMENTIONED
- 23 \$325 MILLION INVESTMENT IN THE PAY GO PROGRAM FOR FISCAL YEARS
- 24 2022 THROUGH 2024 DOES SIGNIFICANTLY REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF
- 25 INTEREST EXPENSES THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED TO BE PAID FOR THE



1

SEPTEMBER 14, 2022

PROJECT BUT DOES NOT REMOVE THE NEED FOR SOME TYPE OF

FINANCING IN THE FUTURE SO BART CONTINUES TO ACCEPT NEW RAIL 2 3 CARS FROM THE MANUFACTURE AND CASH FLOW PROJECTIONS FOR PROCEEDS FROM FINANCING WILL BE NEEDED NEAR THE END OF THE 4 5 FISCAL YEAR AND IN COMING MONTHS COMING TO THIS COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND ADOPTION OF THE ASSOCIATED TAX AND REGULATORY 6 AGREEMENT BY CALENDAR YEAR 2023 TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF 7 8 FINANCING STRUCTURE. IN SUMMARY, STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS ACTION ARE TO PROGRAM GUIDEWAY CAPS AND ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS 9 INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDS AND MAKE UPDATES TO THE TCP PROGRAM SO IT 10 INCLUDES MTC RESOLUTION 4510 REVISED AND 4169 REVISED TO 11 UPDATE TCP PROCESS CRITERIA REFLECTING INCREASES IN FIXED 12 GUIDEWAY CAPS AND 0-EMISSION INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM. THIS 13 INCLUDES RESOLUTION MTC RESOLUTION 4444 REVISED TO PROGRAM 14 15 MATCHING FUNDS TO ELIGIBLE OPERATORS, MTC RESOLUTION 4513 16 REVISED. IN THE FUTURE, STAFF WILL RETURN TO PROGRAM THE

20

17

18

19

21 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I SEE A

REMAINDER OF THE BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE LAW AUTHORIZING

SPENDING AMOUNT TO EXISTING TRANSIT INVESTMENTS. THAT

22 HAND UP. COMMISSIONER VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

CONCLUDES MY COMMENTS. ANY QUESTIONS?

- 24 GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. THANK YOU MARGARET.
- 25 JUST A QUICK QUESTION. IT CONSTANTLY SEEMS LIKE WE'RE PAYING



FOR THE BART CAR REPLACEMENT. IS THIS A MOVING TARGET? OR IS 1 THIS LIKE A SET FIGURE THAT WE'RE JUST FUNDING KIND OF AS WE 2 3 GO? DO YOU KNOW? 4 5 MARGARET DOYLE: I'LL DEFER TO CRAIG ON THIS ONE. OR THERESA. 6 7 CRAIG BOSMAN: I'LL DEFER TO KENNETH. 8 KENNETH FOLAN: HI, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. THANK YOU FOR THE 9 OUESTION. I AM KENNETH FOLAN IN THE PROGRAMMING SECTION. THIS 10 IS PART OF THE BASE CONTRACT OF 775 CARS AND THE CONTRACT 11 LOCKED IN AT PRICED AT APPROXIMATELY \$3.2 MILLION PER CAR, SO, 12 I WOULDN'T CHARACTERIZE IT AS A MOVING TARGET. IN FACT THERE 13 IS ADDITIONAL OPTIONS FOR CARS BEYOND THE 75, THAT WE ARE 14 STILL HOPING TO WORK WITH BART TO MAKE SURE TO KEEP THE \$3.2 15 16 MILLION PRICE. AS LONG AS WE HAVE THE FUNDING AND LOCKED IN AT 3.2 MILLION PER CAR AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL DO THE EXPANSION FOR 17 THE CARS AS WELL. HOPEFULLY, THAT'S ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION. 18 19 THANK YOU. 20 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU KENNETH. THAT IS VERY HELPFUL. IF THAT 21 NUMBER EVER CHANGES, YOU COULD ALERT US TO THAT? THAT WOULD BE 22 HELPFUL. AND ALWAYS ALERT TO THE FACT OF WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO 23

DO WITH THEIR OLD CARS. I KNOW THERE IS DIFFERENT STORIES OUT



- 1 THERE. BUT THAT'S NOT HERE. ALWAYS A CONCERN FOR US. THANK YOU
- 2 FOR YOUR PRESENTATION AND ALL OF YOUR HARD WORK.

3

- 4 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE
- 5 OUESTIONS OF STAFF ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY
- 6 OTHER HAND RAISED. BEFORE WE DO TAKE OUR MOTION TO MOVE THE
- 7 ITEM, WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. ASK OUR CLERK TO LEAD US
- 8 THROUGH PUBLIC COMMENT. LOOKS LIKE YOU MIGHT BE FROZEN THERE.
- 9 I DO SEE ONE HAND RAISED ON OUR ATTENDEE'S LIST. I BELIEVE
- 10 THAT IS ALETA DUPREE.

- 12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR DAVID RABBIT. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
- 13 RECORD, SHE AND HER. I GOT TO READ THROUGH THIS DOCUMENT A
- 14 BIT. IT'S A GOOD DOCUMENT. AND THE BART CAR IS VERY IMPORTANT
- 15 TO ME, BECAUSE THE OLD ONES ARE SHOWING THEIR AGE. WHEN THEY
- 16 GO THROUGH THE TUNNELS OUR EARS HURT. SO WE WANT TO GET THAT
- 17 WORK DONE. I AM ENCOURAGED BY THE ZERO-EMISSIONS PROJECTS THAT
- 18 WE HAVE, SOME WORK WITH SAMTRANS IN SOUTH BAY. AND ITS
- 19 INFRASTRUCTURE, IT'S THE TYPE OF THING THAT YOU DON'T SEE, BUT
- 20 IT'S NECESSARY. AND WE DON'T WANT TO BE AFRAID OF DOING
- 21 ELECTRIC VEHICLE INFRASTRUCTURE. IT MAY SEEM NEW, BUT IT'S
- 22 REALLY NOT. WHEN YOU BUILD A TRUCK STOP, YOU STILL HAVE TO PUT
- 23 IN UNDERGROUND STORAGE TANKS AND FUEL ISLANDS ET CETERA. SO
- 24 THIS REALLY ISN'T ANY DIFFERENT FROM BUILDING A TRUCK STOP,
- 25 IT'S JUST BUILDING A BETTER KIND OF STRUCK STOP. I THINK THIS



- 1 IS IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST. IT'S NOT JUST BECAUSE I LIKE
- 2 ELECTRIC BUSES AND I'M IN AN APARTMENT WHICH IS OPERATING
- 3 ENTIRELY ON SOLAR POWER AND ALL ELECTRIC APPLIANCES. THIS WILL
- 4 HELP WITH MANY, MANY THINGS, AND EVEN WITH THE ELECTRICITY
- 5 ISSUES THAT WE HAD IN THE HEAT WAVE, THIS INFRASTRUCTURE, WITH
- 6 THE ELECTRIC VEHICLES, CAN ACTUALLY HELP US DURING HEAT WAVES,
- 7 BECAUSE WE CAN PLAN. AND WE COULD LOOK TOWARD POSSIBLY USING
- 8 ELECTRICITY IN A BIDIRECTIONAL MANNER. LET'S KEEP WORKING WITH
- 9 HAVING MORE OF THESE ZERO EMISSION ITEMS IN FUNDING
- 10 DOCUMENTATIONS. BECAUSE I WANT TO EXPERIENCE THAT MYSELF.
- 11 THANK YOU.

12

- 13 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU ALETA. AND ONCE AGAIN I'LL LOOK
- 14 TO THE CLERK TO READ ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ASSOCIATED
- 15 WITH THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD.

16

- 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I RECEIVED NOTHING
- 18 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM. THANK YOU.

19

- 20 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: SEEING NO HANDS RAISED, CAN I GET A
- 21 MOTION TO APPROVE?

22

23 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: GLOVER APPROVES.

24

25 AMY R. WORTH: WORTH SECOND.

1	
2	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE,
3	PLEASE?
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR RABBIT?
6	
7	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: AYE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
10	
11	GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: AYE.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
14	
15	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. GLOVER?
18	
19	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY?
22	
23	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
24	
25	CI.ERK KIMRERI, WARD. ROMEN?



1 2 HILLARY RONEN: AYE. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WORTH? 4 5 AMY R. WORTH: AYE. 6 7 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 9 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 10 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. ALL 11 MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3B MTC RESOLUTION 4505 REVISED IT 12 REVISES THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM INCLUDING PROGRAMMING 103 13 MILLION IN OBAG THREE REGIONAL PROGRAM FUNDS. KENNETH KAO WILL 14 PRESENT THIS ITEM AND GIVE US A LITTLE MORE DETAIL. KENNETH? 15 16 KENNETH KAO: ACTUALLY MALLORY ATKINSON WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. 17 18 I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MALLORY. 19 MALLORY ATKINSON: HELLO. MALLORY ATKINSON PRESENTING ON THE 20 OBAG THREE PROGRAM. AS A REMINDER THE COMMISSION APPROVED THE 21 22 OVERALL FRAMEWORK A PROGRAM 40,750 MILLION OF FEDERAL FUNDING 23 PROGRAMMING FOR FRAMEWORK INCLUDING COMPONENTS OF REFINING PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS WITHIN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. TO DATE THE 24 COMMISSION HAS PROGRAMMED 160 MILLION OR 40% OF FUNDS 25



- 1 AVAILABLE WITHIN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM TO SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND
- 2 PROGRAMS AND THESE PREVIOUS ACTIONS ARE SHOWN IN ATTACHMENT
- 3 ONE TO THIS AGENDA ITEM. AND THIS MONTH'S STAFF'S
- 4 RECOMMENDATION OF TRANCHE FUNDING THE BULK OF FUNDS WILL BE
- 5 WITHIN THE MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE
- 6 CATEGORY 87000000 FUNDING COMMITMENTS FOR PROJECTS A.B. 37 AND
- 7 BAY AREA PROGRAM MANAGEMENT REGIONAL COMMUNICATION FREEWAY AND
- 8 OPERATIONS, DESIGN ASSESSMENTS AND OTHER PILOTS. STAFF
- 9 PRESENTED ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON REACH OF THESE REGIONAL
- 10 MISH INITIATIVES AT THE JULY OPERATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING.
- 11 ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING 14 MILLION FOR CONTINUATION OF MTC 511
- 12 TRAVELER INFORMATION SERVICES, TWO AND A HALF MILLION FOR BAY
- 13 TRAIL PLANNING AND PROJECT DELIVERY ACTIVITIES AND 1.3 MILLION
- 14 TO DEVELOP COUNTY-WIDE LOCAL ROADWAY SAFETY PLANS IN CONTRA
- 15 COSTA, NAPA AND SAN MATEO COUNTIES. THIS MONTH'S ACTION
- 16 REFLECTS THAT SAMTRANS WILL USE 7 MILLION OF THE PREVIOUSLY
- 17 PROGRAMMED AS PART OF CALTRAIN RIGHT OF WAY PAYMENT
- 18 ARRANGEMENT MAINTENANCE PROJECT AND FINALLY ON THE COUNTY AND
- 19 LOCAL PROGRAM STAFF RECOMMENDS INCREASING THE AMOUNT THAT WAS
- 20 PREVIOUSLY PROGRAMMED TO SAN MATEO COUNTY, CCAG'S ONGOING SAFE
- 21 ROUTES TO SCHOOL PROGRAM TO REFLECT THE FULL AMOUNT
- 22 RECOMMENDED BY C GAG AS TOP PRIORITY FOR OBAG FUNDING WITHIN
- 23 SAN MATEO COUNTY. WITH THAT STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRAL OF MTC
- 24 RESOLUTION 4505 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND
- 25 THIS DOES INCLUDE PROGRAMMING OF WHO UNDERSTAND 3 MILLION



WITHIN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM TO VARIOUS MTC ADMINISTERED 1 ACTIVITIES. WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. 2 3 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: VALERIE THANK YOU SO MUCH. APPRECIATE 4 5 THAT. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES. ANY OUESTIONS COMMENTS OR CONCERNS FOR MALLORY? I SEE ONE HAND RAISED. COMMISSIONER 6 7 SPERING. GO AHEAD JIM. 8 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. MALLORY, ON THE 9 ATTACHMENT IN THE CASE WHERE WE HAVE THE BAY AREA FORWARD 10 RESILIENT OR 37 -- HOW DOES THAT HELP ADVANCE THAT PROJECT? I 11 KNOW THERE IS, LIKE, TEN BULLETS YOU CAN GO INTO DETAIL ON 12 THAT? 13 14 MALLORY ATKINSON: FOR BAY AREA FORWARD PROGRAM WHAT WE'RE 15 16 PROPOSING THIS MONTH TO IDENTIFY SPECIFIC AMOUNTS FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECTS IN NEED TO BE DEFINED WITHIN THE 17 BAY AREA FORWARD. FOR THE SR37 THIS MONTH, WE'RE PROPOSING 10 18 MILLION -- HOPEFULLY, THERE MIGHT BE SOMEONE TO PROVIDE 19 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON THAT -- BUT I BELIEVE THIS IS 20 21 SPECIFICALLY FOR THE DESIGN, PRELIMINARY ENGINEERING AND 22 DESIGN OF THE INTERIM SR37 PROJECT? 23 KENNETH KAO: RIGHT. THAT IS MY UNDERSTANDING, AS WELL. 24



- 1 ALIX BOCKELMAN: COMMISSIONER SPERING, THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN,
- 2 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. WE DID A DETAILED REPORT
- 3 IN JULY AND CAN CERTAINLY GET BACK TO YOU WITH MORE
- 4 INFORMATION AND I NOTICED ANDY FREMIER IS HERE IF HE WANTED TO
- 5 ADD MORE ON THE SR37.

6

- 7 ANDREW FREMIER: NOT RELATED TO THAT PART OF THE QUESTION. BUT
- 8 I BELIEVE THAT KENNY AND MALLORY ARE RIGHT.

9

- 10 JAMES P. SPERING: I JUST WANTED TO CONFIRM. IN THE LETTER WITH
- 11 SOME OF THE CONCERNS ABOUT THE PROJECT, I WANT TO MAKE SURE
- 12 THAT WE'RE STAYING ON TRACK AND THAT WE'RE STILL MOVING
- 13 FORWARD WITH THE ASSUMPTION THAT WE'RE GOING GO FORWARD WITH
- 14 THE INTERIM PROJECT.

15

- 16 ANDREW FREMIER: WE ARE COMMISSIONER ANDREW F, DEPUTY DIRECTOR
- 17 WE CERTAINLY HAVE CHALLENGES AND IT'S PROBABLY WORTH A
- 18 CONVERSATION AT A FUTURE MEETING BECAUSE IT'S A MEATY SUBJECT
- 19 BUT WE ARE MOVING FORWARD ON THE INTERIM PROJECT AND TRYING TO
- 20 GET STRAIGHT INTO DESIGN ONCE THE ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENT IS
- 21 COMPLETED IN THE NEXT MONTH OR SO.

22

- 23 JAMES P. SPERING: OKAY. THANK YOU MALLORY, THANK YOU MR.
- 24 CHAIR.



- 1 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THAT UPDATE TO
- 2 STATE ROUTE 37 APPRECIATE THAT. COMMENTS QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS
- 3 FOR STAFF ON THIS ITEM? ONCE WE TAKE OUR MOTION I'LL ASK THE
- 4 CLERK TO READ COMMENTS ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM INTO THE RECORD
- 5 AND READ PUBLIC COMMENTS.

6

- 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING ON
- 8 THIS ITEM AND I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
- 9 RAISED. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 11 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR DAVID RABBIT. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
- 12 RECORD, SHE AND HER. LOTS OF IMPORTANT THINGS. I'LL MAKE IT
- 13 NOTEWORTHY MENTIONING THIS PROGRAM, WHICH, I THINK, WOULD BE
- 14 VERY HELPFUL, IS \$30 MILLION GOING TO CLIPPER C2, WHICH ON THE
- 15 CHART, HAS INDEED BEEN PROGRAMMED. GETTING ON TOWARD 2023, I
- 16 HOPE TO SEE MORE CLIPPER INFRASTRUCTURE WORK BEING DONE,
- 17 BECAUSE THAT DOES AFFECT ME. THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. AND I AM A
- 18 USER OF MULTI-MODAL SYSTEMS THAT TAKE MANY DIFFERENT SHAPES
- 19 AND FORMS. BECAUSE I DO NOT DRIVE A SINGLE OCCUPANCY
- 20 AUTOMOBILE IN -- INTO THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO, NOR THE BAY
- 21 AREA, BECAUSE I HAVEN'T DROVE A CAR IN 13 YEARS. AND I JUST
- 22 HAPPENED TO RENT ONE. SO ANY OF THESE MULTI-MODAL ITEMS
- 23 ESPECIALLY SAFETY RELATED MULTI-MODAL ITEMS ARE VERY HELPFUL
- 24 TO ME BECAUSE I WANT TO SEE A SHIFT MORE TOWARDS THAT SO WE
- 25 DON'T HAVE TO FEEL THAT WE HAVE TO USE SINGLE OCCUPANCY



1	VEHICLES TO GET AROUND. SO, I THINK THIS ITEM IS WORTHY OF
2	APPROVAL. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THAT CLIPPER WORK
3	DONE. THANK YOU.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HAND
6	RAISED, MR. CHAIR.
7	
8	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. BRINGING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE
9	I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR
10	CONCERNS AND IF NOT, CAN I GET A MOTION TO APPROVE?
11	
12	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO MOVED, ABE-KOGA.
13	
14	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: SECOND BY GLOVER.
15	
16	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOTION BY ABE-KOGA; SECOND BY
17	GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR RABBIT?
20	
21	DAVID RABBIT: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
24	
25	GINA PAPAN: AYE.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
3	
4	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS ABSENT.
7	COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
8	
9	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY?
12	
13	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN?
16	
17	HILLARY RONEN: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WORTH?
20	
21	AMY R. WORTH: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
24	ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



- 1 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING ON
- 2 TO AGENDA ITEM 3C MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4544 AND 4545,
- 3 ADOPTION OF THE 2023 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM OR THE
- 4 TIP, AND THE TRANSPORTATION AIR OUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS
- 5 FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND THE 2023 TIP. AND I BELIEVE
- 6 ADAM CRENSHAW WILL BE MAKING A PRESENTATION ON THIS ITEM.
- 7 ADAM?

- 9 ADAM CRENSHAW: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I'M ADAM CRENSHAW
- 10 WITH THE FUNDING AND POLICY AND PROGRAM SECTION PRESENTING
- 11 2023 TIP ACCOMPANYING TRANSPORTATION ANALYSIS FOR YOUR REVIEW.
- 12 COMPREHENSIVE LIST OF TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS TO RECEIVE
- 13 FEDERAL FUNDS SUBJECT TO FEDERAL REQUIRED ACTION FOR
- 14 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT FARE EQUALITY CONFORMITY PURPOSES. 2023
- 15 TIP COVERS A FOUR YEAR PERIOD, FISCAL YEAR 2022/'23 THROUGH
- 16 2025/'26. ALL PROJECTS IN THE TIP ARE CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED
- 17 BAY AREA 2050 AND TIP IS FINANCIALLY CONSTRAINED BY YEAR.
- 18 STAFF IN 2023 TIP IN COOPERATION WITH FEDERAL AGENCIES,
- 19 PARTNERS AROUND THE REGION AND OTHER INTERESTED PARTIES. IN
- 20 ALL THE TIP CONTAINS MORE THAN 300 PROJECTS TOTALING \$11
- 21 BILLION IN COMMITTED FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL AND LOCAL
- 22 FUNDING OVER THE FOUR YEAR TIP PERIOD AS WELL AS OVER 200
- 23 PROJECTS FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES. AS IN PAST UPDATES STAFF
- 24 CONDUCTED FOCUS ON EQUITY IMPLICATIONS OF TIP INVESTMENTS
- 25 RESULTS OF POPULATION ANALYSIS INDICATE OVERALL THAT



- 1 INVESTMENTS IN THE 2023 TIP DIRECT EQUITABLE PROPORTION
- 2 INVESTMENTS TO SUPPORT TRANSPORTATION OF RESIDENTS OF LOW-
- 3 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS PEOPLE OF COLOR AND SENIORS. ANALYSIS
- 4 DEMONSTRATES THERE IS NOT A DESPERATE IMPACT IN FEDERAL AND
- 5 STATE FUNDING FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS
- 6 INCLUDING COMPARISON WITH PREVIOUS ANALYSIS IS INCLUDED IN
- 7 YOUR PACKETS. PER FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS AND REGULATIONS 2023
- 8 TIP MAKES PROGRESS TOWARDS ACHIEVING REGIONAL PERFORMANCE
- 9 TARGETS A REPORT ON THESE PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT EFFORTS AND
- 10 PERFORMANCE TARGETS FOR ACHIEVEMENTS IS INCLUDED IN YOUR
- 11 PACKET ANALYZING TIP REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN TO DETERMINE
- 12 THE REGION IS IN COMPLIANCE FOR AIR OUALITY REQUIREMENTS FOR
- 13 OZONE AND PARTICULATE MATTER PM 2.5 ACCORDING TO THE EPA
- 14 TRANSPORTATION CONFORMITY REGULARS PROCEDURES ADOPTED IN MTC
- 15 RESOLUTION 3757 SAVVY AND CONSULTED WITH THE AIR OUALITY
- 16 CONFORMITY TASK FORCE THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS. ANALYSIS
- 17 DEMONSTRATES BOTH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE 2023 TIP
- 18 INFORM THE FEDERAL AIR OUALITY STANDARDS AND THE STATE
- 19 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. BECAUSE OF THIS STAFF IS RECOMMENDING
- 20 THAT THE COMMISSION MADAM CLERK A POSITIVE CONFORMITY
- 21 DETERMINATION. DRAFT 2023 TIP AND CONFORMITY ANALYSIS WERE
- 22 BOTH RELEASED TO THE PUBLIC FOR REVIEW ON JULY 5TH. THE DRAFT
- 23 DOCUMENTS WERE PRESENTED ON JULY 13TH AND REVIEW AND COMMENT
- 24 PERIOD CLOSED AUGUST 3RD. MTC RECEIVED ONE COMMENT ON THE
- 25 DOCUMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC. A COPY OF THIS COMMENT ALONG WITH



- 1 STAFF'S RESPONSE IS INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKETS AS WELL. IN
- 2 ADDITION TO COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC MTC RECEIVED SEVERAL
- 3 COMMENTS FROM PARTNER AGENCIES THAT MADE CHANGES TO PROJECTS
- 4 OF THE TIP SUMMARY OF PROJECTS IS INCLUDED IN PACKETS. IN
- 5 CLOSING STAFF REQUESTS THAT YOU REFER RESOLUTION 4544
- 6 CONFORMITY ANALYSIS AND RESOLUTION 40 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WHICH
- 7 IS THE TIP TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. WITH THAT I'LL
- 8 CLOSE AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.
- 10 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH ADAM. I'LL
- 11 LOOK TO COLLEAGUES ANY QUESTIONS FOR STAFF ON THIS PARTICULAR
- 12 ITEM? NOT SEEING ANY HAND RAISED. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO WALK
- 13 US THROUGH PUBLIC COMMENT.
- 15 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
- 16 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
- 17 ON THIS ITEM.

9

14

18

21

- 19 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. BRINGING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE,
- 20 I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE.
- 22 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO MOVED, ABE-KOGA.
- 24 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOTION BY ABE-KOGA. AND I HAVE A SECOND
- 25 BY?



1	
2	AMY R. WORTH: WORTH.
3	
4	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ROLL CALL VOTE,
5	PLEASE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SURE. CHAIR RABBIT?
8	
9	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
12	
	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
14	
15 16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
17	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
18	MINORELI IEEE ROOM. MIE.
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS ABSENT.
20	COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
21	
22	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY?
25	



NATHAN MILEY: AYE. 1 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN? 4 5 HILLARY RONEN: AYE. 6 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WORTH? 8 9 AMY R. WORTH: AYE. 10 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 12 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 13 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING ON 14 THEN TO AGENDA ITEM 4A, MTC RESOLUTION 4504 REVISED FISCAL 15 16 YEAR 2023, 2023 MTC FUND ESTIMATE UPDATES THE 2022, 2023 FUND ESTIMATE TO INCORPORATE THE ACTUAL FISCAL YEAR 2021, 2022 17 REVENUE FOR STATE TRANSIT STANCE STA AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR 18 SGR PROGRAMS AND REVISES OUR FISCAL YEAR 2022, 2023 REVENUE 19 ESTIMATES. AND I BELIEVE WILLIAM BACON WILL MAKE THIS 20 21 PRESENTATION. 22 23 WILLIAM BACON: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS BILL BACON WITH THE POLICY AND PROGRAM SECTION AND THIS ITEM 24 UPDATES THE FUNDING ESTIMATE TO INCORPORATE THE 2021, 2022 25



- 1 REVENUE FOR THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE PROGRAM AND THE STATE
- 2 OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAM. OVERVIEW OF PROGRAMS, PROVIDED BY
- 3 STATEWIDE FUNDING SALES TAX ON DIESEL FUEL IN CALIFORNIA
- 4 AMOUNT OF REVENUE SUBJECT TO VARIATIONS AND THE PRICE OF
- 5 DIESEL AS WELL AS AMOUNT OF DIESEL CONSUME STATEWIDE. STATE OF
- 6 GOOD REPAIR PROGRAM ESTABLISHED BY SENATE BILL ONE BACK IN
- 7 2017 AND IS A STABLE FUNDING SOURCE FOR STATE OF GOOD REPAIR
- 8 PROJECTS FUNDED BY VEHICLE REGISTRATION ESTABLISHED. JUNE 30TH
- 9 ELEVATED PRICE OF DIESEL FUEL WORLDWIDE, TRANSIT SYSTEM
- 10 REVENUE CAME IN ABOUT \$15.7 MILLION HIGHER THAN ANTICIPATED
- 11 AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR REVENUES FUNDED BY VEHICLE
- 12 REGISTRATION FEES CAME IN SLIGHTLY LOWER THAN EXPECTATIONS.
- 13 COMPARISON, 2023 ADOPTED STATE BUDGET FORECASTS 30% INCREASE
- 14 IN STA REVENUES COMPARED TO FY WENT 21, 2022, BASED ON
- 15 ELEVATED DIESEL FUEL PRICES BRINGING IN ADDITIONAL 81 AND A
- 16 HALF MILLION DOLLARS IN STA FUNDS TO THE BAY AREA IN THE
- 17 CURRENT FISCAL YEAR. TWO OTHER ISSUES I WOULD LIKE TO MENTION
- 18 RELATED TO THE FUND ESTIMATE FIRST IS AN UPDATE ON THE ONGOING
- 19 DISCUSSIONS INVOLVING FOUR EAST BAY BUS OPERATOR, COUNTY
- 20 CONNECTION, LAFTA, WESTCAT AND TRI DELTA TRANSIT AND BART IN
- 21 REGARDS TO THE FEEDER BUS AGREEMENTS AND PAYMENTS THAT BART
- 22 MAKES ON AN ANNUAL BASIS TO THE FOUR BUS OPERATORS. THE
- 23 EXISTING AGREEMENT PROCESS HAS NOT BEEN UPDATED SINCE 1987 AND
- 24 MTC STAFF ARE CONTINUING TO MEET WITH PARTIES TO MEET A PATH
- 25 FORWARD THAT'S BOTH PROTECTS BUS SERVICE FOR RIDERS AND



- 1 RECOGNIZES NEAR-TERM FINANCIAL CHALLENGES THAT BART IS FACING.
- 2 STAFF'S HOPE IS TO PROPOSE OPTIONS FOR A MODERNIZED POLICY
- 3 BEFORE THE END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR WORKING IN PARTNERSHIP
- 4 WITH EACH OF THE PARTIES. EXPECTATION IS THAT WITH A CHEER
- 5 PATH TO RESOLUTION OF THIS ISSUE THE REMAINING FISCAL YEAR
- 6 202223 PAYMENT FUNDS CAN BE PAID TO BUS OPERATORS ON TIME AS
- 7 REVENUES ARE GENERATED OVER THE COURSE OF THE FISCAL YEAR.
- 8 KNOW FINAL ISSUE RELATES TO THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE
- 9 REVENUE BASED PROGRAM COMPONENT OF THE STA PROGRAM DISTRIBUTES
- 10 TRANSIT OPERATOR FUNDS BASED ON AN AMOUNT CALLED QUALIFYING
- 11 REVENUE THINGS SUCH AS SALES TAXES PASSENGER FARES PARKING
- 12 REVENUES AND BRIDGE TOLLS GENERATED BY EACH TRANSIT OPERATOR
- 13 IN CALIFORNIA. AND SINCE FISCAL YEAR 2020, 2021, THE FIRST
- 14 FULL FISCAL YEAR OF THE PANDEMIC THE STATE LEGISLATURE HAS
- 15 FROZEN THIS STA BASED FORMULA CALCULATION WHICH IS PROTECTED
- 16 EACH TRANSIT OPERATOR'S SHARE OF THE OVERALL STA PROGRAM. THIS
- 17 FREEZE THAT WAS ADOPTED BY THE LEGISLATOR IS SET TO EXPIRE
- 18 WITH THE UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR, SO FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 AT
- 19 WHICH POINT THE STA REVENUE BASED PROGRAM CALCULATIONS WILL
- 20 BEGIN BEING MADE WITH UPDATED FINANCIAL INFORMATION. SO THIS
- 21 WOULD INVOLVE USING FISCAL YEAR 2021, 2022 TRANSIT OPERATOR
- 22 REVENUE DATA. SO THIS IS A VERY TECHNICAL ISSUE BUT AS A
- 23 RESULT, MTC STAFF, EXPECT THERE WILL BE SIGNIFICANT ADVERSE
- 24 FINANCIAL IMPACTS TO STA REVENUE BASED FUNDING FOR BAY AREA
- 25 TRANSIT OPERATORS AS A WHOLE, RELATIVE TO OTHER REGIONS WHERE



TRANSIT REVENUE SOURCES HAVE RECOVERED MORE ROBUSTLY FROM THE 1 PANDEMIC. THIS IS ESPECIALLY SO FOR THOSE BAY AREA OPERATORS 2 3 WITH PREVIOUSLY HIGH FARE PARKING OR TOLL REVENUES THAT HAVE NOT REBOUNDED AS OUICKLY AS SALES TAXES FROM THE IMPACTS OF 4 5 THE PANDEMIC. SO, AS DATA BECOMES AVAILABLE MTC WILL RETURN TO THE COMMITTEE WITH UPDATES ON THE IMPACTS OF THIS ISSUE AS 6 PART OF A BROADER DISCUSSION ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATOR FINANCIAL 7 8 UNCERTAINTY. WRAPPING UP STAFF ARE RECOMMENDING THAT THE COMMITTEE FORWARD MTC RESOLUTION 4504 REVISED ADOPTING THE 9 FISCAL YEAR 2022 '23 FUND ESTIMATE TO THE COMMISSION FOR 10 APPROVAL. THANK YOU. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS. 11 12 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES. I 13 14 SEE A HAND RAISED. COMMISSIONER WORTH. 15 16 AMY R. WORTH: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE REPORT. AND I APPRECIATE THE CHALLENGING POSITION MTC IS IN WITH REGARDS TO 17 GREATER NEED FOR REVENUE THAN EXISTS. SO I JUST WANT TO FOLLOW 18 UP ON THE ITEM RELATIVE TO THE FEEDER BUS ISSUE. AND I WANTED 19 TO FIND OUT, FROM STAFF, WHAT YOU IDENTIFY AS MEANINGFUL, YOU 20 21 KNOW, MEANINGFUL PROGRESS. OBVIOUSLY THE ORIGIN OF THE FEEDER 22 SYSTEM ORIGINALLY WAS BART IN ITS COMMITMENT TO THE VOTERS WAS GOING TO PROVIDE THIS FEEDER SERVICE TO LINK COMMUNITIES AWAY 23 FROM THE -- YOU KNOW, GIVING THE COMMUNITIES OPPORTUNITIES 24

TRANSIT TO GET TO BART AS OPPOSED TO DRIVING AND LOOKING AT



VARIOUS INITIATIVES LOOKING AT PUTTING MORE HOUSING ON THE 1 BART LOTS REDUCING PARKING AND THE GOAL FOR OUR GREENHOUSE 2 3 EMISSIONS AND REDUCING VMT OBVIOUSLY LINKING TRANSIT TO BART IS CRITICAL. AT THE SAME TIME RECOGNIZING BART IS IN A 4 5 DESPERATE FINANCIAL SITUATION RELATED TO COVID AND WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO LOOK FOR LONGER TERM SERIOUS FUNDING TO MAINTAIN 6 THOSE SERVICES. I'M STRUGGLING BECAUSE I'M HEARING FROM OUR 7 8 EAST BAY OPERATORS THAT WANT TO, YOU KNOW, ARE VERY ENGAGED WITH BART AT PROVIDING THOSE DIRECT SERVICES, LINKING ALL OF 9 10 THE PROGRAMS AND THE SCHEDULES AND EVERYTHING LIKE THAT, SO, WHERE -- WHERE -- HOW -- WHERE DO YOU SEE THIS MOVING FORWARD? 11 12 THERESA ROMMELL: THROUGH THE CHAIR, THERESA ROMMEL WITH 13 FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAMS SECTION. I APPRECIATE YOUR 14 15 QUESTION, COMMISSIONER WORTH. WE ACTUALLY JUST MET -- WE, 16 BEING MTC STAFF, BILL AND MYSELF MET WITH THE FOUR FEEDER BUS OPERATORS AND WITH THE CONTRA COSTA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY 17 JUST YESTERDAY. AND I DO THINK THAT WE MADE SOME INCREMENTAL 18 PROGRESS. I DON'T THINK THE OUESTION HERE IS WHETHER OR NOT WE 19 THINK FEEDER BUS SERVICES SHOULD BE SUPPORTED. I THINK WE 20 AGREE THAT IT IS AN IMPORTANT SERVICE. I THINK WHAT WE'RE 21 LOOKING TO DO IS TO MODERNIZE AS BILL SAID, MODERNIZE THE 22 AGREEMENTS THAT WERE FIRST INITIATED IN 1997, AND ENSURE THAT 23 THOSE AGREEMENT UPDATES ARE GROUNDED IN MORE KIND OF RECENT 24

FACTORS. AND I THINK WE, IN OUR CONVERSATIONS YESTERDAY, WE --



- 1 YOU KNOW, DEVELOPED A PLAN TO GO FORWARD, TO KIND OF COME UP
- 2 WITH SOME OF THOSE FACTORS SO THAT WE COULD THEN PUT TOGETHER
- 3 IF PROPOSALS FOR THE NEGOTIATION OF DISCUSSION WITH BART. IN
- 4 MY OPINION, WHEN WE HAVE A FEW SCENARIOS THAT ARE REASONABLE
- 5 AND GROUNDED, AS I NOTED, IN MORE MODERN FACTORS, THEN WE
- 6 WOULD CONSIDER THAT FORWARD PROGRESS, AND, YOU KNOW, THAT
- 7 WE'RE MAKING -- WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS TOWARDS RESOLVING THIS
- 8 ISSUE.

9

- 10 AMY R. WORTH: GREAT. THERESA, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT
- 11 CLARIFICATION. THAT'S VERY HELPFUL. SO, APPRECIATE, AGAIN, ALL
- 12 OF THE WORK THAT YOU AND THE TEAM ARE DOING IN TERMS OF THESE
- 13 DISCUSSIONS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

- 15 THERESE MCMILLAN: IF I COULD, THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE
- 16 DIRECTOR. APPRECIATE, COMMISSIONER WORTH, YOUR QUESTION AND
- 17 INQUIRY. BUT I THINK THAT ALSO UNDERSCORES THE POINT THAT BILL
- 18 MADE AT THE END OF HIS PRESENTATION THAT WE, AS THE EXHIBITION
- 19 ARE WORKING WITH OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS, TO TRY AND GET AN
- 20 HONEST GRIP ON WHAT THE FUTURE IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE FOR
- 21 TRANSIT. AND IT IS GOING TO BE CHALLENGING FOR US, I THINK, TO
- 22 HAVE TO STEP UP, LOOK AT WHAT WAS BEFORE, IN TERMS OF SERVICE
- 23 AGREEMENTS, YOU KNOW, MOUS, WHATEVER THE CASE MAY BE, AND SAY,
- 24 WHAT IS OUR RIDERS' NEEDS NOW. AND WITH THE CHALLENGING
- 25 FINANCIAL CIRCUMSTANCES WE'RE FACING, AS BILL JUST SAID, WE



- 1 MAY SEE A SIGNIFICANT DIP IN SOME OF OUR FORMULA OPERATING
- 2 REVENUES AVAILABLE. WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO TAKE, I THINK,
- 3 WITH, AGAIN, OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS, THAT REALLY CLEAR-EYED
- 4 ANALYTICAL LOOK ABOUT WHERE ARE TRAVEL PATTERNS NOW, WHERE DO
- 5 WE ANTICIPATE THEM TO BE, AND HOW DO WE DISTRIBUTE AVAILABLE
- 6 REVENUES IN A WAY THAT BEST MEETS THE NEEDS OF OUR RIDERS
- 7 RIGHT NOW, WHICH ARE CHANGING, AND HOW DOES THAT LOOK LIKE
- 8 GOING FORWARD. SO, JUST TO SAY THAT ALL OF THIS, I THINK THE
- 9 CHALLENGE FOR US WILL BE TO CONTINUE TO ADDRESS THINGS
- 10 INDIVIDUALLY, BUT TRY TO PUT THEM IN THIS LARGER CONTEXT OF A
- 11 CHAIN -- OF A FOUNDATION ALLEY CHANGING PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 12 LANDSCAPE THAT WE'RE SEEING, AND HOW WE CAN BEST RESPOND TO
- 13 THAT, REFLECTING ON A LOT OF THE WORK FROM THE BLUE RIBBON
- 14 TASK FORCE. SO, I THINK IT ALL LINKS TOGETHER BUT IT RAISES, I
- 15 THINK, SOME VERY DIFFERENT CHALLENGES FOR US, AS A COMMISSION
- 16 TO PUT THAT ANALYTICAL LENS ON A VERY COMPLEX SITUATION. SO I
- 17 JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT OBSERVATION.
- 19 AMY R. WORTH: THERESE, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THOSE COMMENTS,
- 20 AND I CONCUR THAT WE'RE FACING THIS VERY, VERY SERIOUS ISSUE,
- 21 LOOKING FORWARD IN TERMS OF FUNDING. AND, AGAIN, THAT --
- 22 SPEAKING TO OUR PREVIOUS ITEM ABOUT GETTING THE ANALYTICS FOR
- 23 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PROCESS AND ALL THE WORK THAT YOU ALL
- 24 ARE DOING IN THE COMMISSION AND ALL THE AGENCIES AROUND THE



- 1 REGION. SO, WE JUST WANT TO HAVE EVERYTHING KIND OF CONSIDER
- 2 ALL THESE FACTORS, AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU.

3

- 4 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
- 5 VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

- 7 GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, WILLIAM, AND
- 8 THERESE, GREAT CONVERSATION HERE. AND IT IS A VERY CHALLENGING
- 9 TIME, BUT I REALLY WANT TO EMPHASIZE WHAT THE BLUE RIBBON
- 10 TRANSIT RECOVERY DID HERE. IN ORDER TO GET PEOPLE BACK ON
- 11 TRANSIT, IT HAS TO BE NEW. IT HAS TO -- IT CAN'T -- I'M
- 12 DESPERATELY HOPING WE'RE NOT GOING BACK TO THE OLD WAYS OF
- 13 DOING THINGS THAT WERE INCONVENIENT AND NOT HELPFUL TO THE
- 14 RIDERS. AND I COMPLETELY -- I MEAN, OUR BUS SYSTEMS WERE THE
- 15 ONES THAT WERE REALLY ABLE TO PIVOT HERE AND GET PEOPLE FROM
- 16 POINT A TO POINT B, AND IT IS SO IMPORTANT THAT THE RAIL
- 17 OPERATORS REALIZE THAT CONNECTION HAS TO BE ENHANCED AND NOT
- 18 PULLED BACK ON. SO, I'M VERY HOPEFUL THAT, IN YOUR
- 19 NEGOTIATIONS MOVING FORWARD THERE, WE CAN EMPHASIZE THE
- 20 ELEMENTS OF THE BLUE RIBBON, THE SEAMLESSNESS, THAT HAS TO BE
- 21 A PART OF THIS PROCESS IN ORDER FOR EVERYONE TO SUCCEED MOVING
- 22 FORWARD HERE. AND, YOU KNOW, IF THEY -- IT'S THE ONLY WAY THAT
- 23 WE'RE GOING TO GET FUNDS MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION AS FAR
- 24 AS RIDERSHIP GOES. SO, THANK YOU EVERYONE FOR ALL YOUR HARD
- 25 WORK EFFORTS. BUT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE TO THE OPERATORS,



1	[INDISCERNIBLE] I HOPE THAT IT IS COMMUNICATED AND WE CAN HELP
2	THEM GET THERE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
3	
4	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANYONE ELSE HAVE
5	QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR CONCERNS? SEEING NO OTHER HAND RAISED,
6	I WILL LOOK TO OUR CLERK TO LEAD US THROUGH PUBLIC COMMENT
7	BEFORE WE MOVE TO APPROVE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, MR.
10	CHAIR, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
11	RAISED.
12	
13	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. SO WITH THAT, AND SEEING NO OTHER
14	QUESTIONS, CAN I GET A MOTION TO APPROVE?
15	
16	AMY R. WORTH: MOVE APPROVAL.
17	
18	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. WE HAVE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER
19	WORTH AND A SECOND BY?
20	
21	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: GLOVER.
22	
23	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: COMMISSIONER GLOVER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

24

25

WITH THAT, ROLL CALL VOTE.

1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR RABBIT?
2	
3	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: AYE.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
6	
7	GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: AYE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
10	
11	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
14	
15	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY?
18	
19	NATHAN MILEY: AYE COMMISSIONER RONEN?
20	
21	HILLARY RONEN: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER WORTH?
24	
25	AMY R. WORTH: AYE.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 3 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 4 5 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU ALL VERY MUCH. MOVING ON 6 THEN TO AGENDA ITEM 5A INFORMATIONAL ITEM, CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION STATE FUNDING PROGRAM UPDATE. AND I 7 8 THINK WE HAVE KENNETH KAO TO GIVE US THE UPDATE. 9 KENNETH KAO: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS KENNETH KAO MTC STAFF 10 I WANT TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE CTC MEETING THAT HAPPENED IN 11 AUGUST IN SAN JOSE. THE BIG ITEM TO REPORT THERE WAS THAT CTC 12 APPROVED THE GUIDELINES FOR THE SB1 COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS 13 14 INCLUDES SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDORS, CORRIDOR 15 ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM AND THE LOCAL PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM. 16 APPLICATIONS FOR THOSE ARE DUE AT THE END OF THIS CALENDAR YEAR, NOVEMBER 18TH FOR THE TRADE CORRIDOR PROGRAM AND 17 18 DECEMBER 2ND FOR THE SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDORS PROGRAM. IN JULY WE APPROVED THE MTC PROGRAMS FOR THOSE AND WE 19 ALSO, TODAY, AMENDED THE TRADE CORRIDOR PROGRAM. THE NEXT 20 21 MEETING OF THE CTC IS GOING TO BE IN OCTOBER, 12th, AND 13th, DOWN IN SANTA BARBARA. SO WE'LL REPORT -- WE'LL DO A PRODUCE 22 VIEW OF THAT AV THE OCTOBER PAC MEETING. AND IN CLOSING I WANT 23 TO REPORT SAD NEWS THAT CTC COMMISSIONER BOBBY ALVARADO 24

RECENTLY PASSED AWAY. HE SERVED ON THE CTC COMMISSION FOR



1

SEPTEMBER 14, 2022

ALMOST 15 YEARS AND EARLIER THIS YEAR HE RETIRED FROM THE CTC

2 AND WE ALSO AT MTC COMMISSION PROVIDED HIM WITH A RESOLUTION 3 OF APPRECIATION IN JANUARY. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION THAT COMMISSIONER ALVARADO SERVED ON THE MTC COMMITTEE TO HOUSE THE 4 5 BAY AREA, OUR CASA SELECT STEERING COMMITTEE, SO HE DEFINITELY WAS VERY INVOLVED IN REGIONAL ACTIVITIES, AS WELL. SO I WANTED 6 TO PASS THAT SAD NEWS ALONG. WITH THAT, HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY 7 8 QUESTIONS. 9 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU, KENNETH. SORRY TO HEAR ABOUT 10 11 THE PASSING OF MR. ALVARADO, AND WE SHARE CONDOLENCES WITH HIS FAMILY, I'M SURE. ANY OUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FOR KENNETH ON 12 THAT REPORT? I'LL ASK OUR CLERK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT 13 ON THIS ITEM AND ASK IF WE CAN INCLUDE ITEM SIX PUBLIC COMMENT 14 15 AS WELL. 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SURE. I SEE NO RAISED HANDS AT THIS 17 18 TIME, AND I DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE THAT WAS ATTACHED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED TO COMMISSIONERS 19

22

20

21

ELSE.

- 23 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT
- 24 CONCLUDES ITEM SIX PUBLIC COMMENT. ITEM SEVEN IS ADJOURNMENT.

FROM BOB, PRESIDENT OF SAVE MUNI. WITH THAT, I HAVE NOTHING

25 THE NEXT MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE



1	IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY OCTOBER 12TH, 2022. ANY
2	CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.
3	THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR ALL THE GREAT WORK AND TO MY FELLOW
4	COMMISSIONERS, I HOPE YOU HAVE A GOOD REST OF THE DAY AND A
5	PRODUCTIVE WEEK. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]
6	
7	
8 9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14 15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20 21	
22	
23	
24	
2526	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31 32	
33	
34	
35	
36	
37 38	
39	
40	



Broadcasting Government