

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JANUARY 8, 2025

1 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**

2 **WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 8TH, 2025, 9:45 AM**

3

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO
6 ORDER THE FOLLOWING -- I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE
7 MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS
8 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS
9 AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO
10 SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE,
11 AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WILL THE
12 CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL TO CONFIRM A QUORUM?

13

14 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CERTAINLY. CHAIR MILEY?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY NON-VOTING IS
23 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.



JANUARY 8, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

7

8 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

11

12 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM TWO, CONSENT

17 CALENDAR. IT INCLUDES AGENDA ITEMS 2A AND 2B. IS THERE ANY

18 COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT

19 CALENDAR?

20

21 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, IT ACTUALLY THROUGH

22 2H. THE CONSENT CALENDAR GOES THROUGH ITEM 2H.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

25



JANUARY 8, 2025

1 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** APOLOGIES IF THERE WAS AN ERROR IN
2 THERE.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** 2H. THANK YOU. ANY COMMISSIONER WANT TO
5 PULL AN ITEM OFF CONSENT? OKAY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOVED BY PAPAN; SECOND BY ABE-KOGA.

12 LET'S SEE. WERE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON ANY ITEM ON
13 CONSENT?

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE IN THE
16 BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANKS. WILL ALL THOSE IN FAVOR, PLEASE
19 SAY AYE? ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] OPPOSED? ABSTENTIONS?

20 OKAY. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. SO NOW WE GO TO AGENDA ITEM 3A.

21 THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION

22 COMMISSION, CTC STATE FUNDING PROGRAM UPDATE. AND KEN KAO WILL

23 PRESENT THIS INFORMATIONAL ITEM.

24



JANUARY 8, 2025

1 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS. I'M KENNETH
2 KAO WITH MTC'S PROGRAMMING TEAM. I'M HERE TO PROVIDE UPDATE ON
3 THE DECEMBER CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION MEETING.
4 THEY MET LAST MONTH IN RIVERSIDE. I HAVE TWO ITEMS, WHICH YOU
5 MAY KNOW ABOUT. WE GOT A WIN. YOU WIN SOME; YOU LOSE SOME.
6 GOOD NEWS, WE GOT A DECENT AMOUNT OF MONEY FROM THE TIRCP.
7 SOME GREAT PROJECTS FUNDED THERE. REALLY EXCITED TO MOVE THOSE
8 PROJECTS FORWARD ON THE TRANSIT SIDE. UNFORTUNATELY, WE DID
9 NOT GET ANY MONEY FROM THE STATEWIDE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
10 PROGRAM. THERE WAS \$84 MILLION AVAILABLE STATEWIDE, AND THEY
11 ONLY FUNDED, LIKE, NINE PROJECTS AND UNFORTUNATELY NO BAY AREA
12 PROJECTS WERE ON THAT LIST. WE WILL BE COMING BACK TO YOU NEXT
13 MONTH IN FEBRUARY TO BRING THE REGIONAL SIDE OF THE ACTIVE
14 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, WHICH IS ABOUT \$14 MILLION AND ALSO
15 BRINGING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE RM3 PORTION OF THE SAFE
16 ROUTES TO TRANSIT BAY TRAIL, WHICH HAS \$75 MILLION AVAILABLE.
17 SO, LOOKING FORWARD TO SOME GOOD NEWS NEXT MONTH. THE NEXT
18 MEETING OF THE CTC WILL BE IN SACRAMENTO AT THE END OF THIS
19 MONTH. AND LOOK FORWARD TO REPORTING BACK AFTER THAT MEETING.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** WHO GOT ALL THAT MONEY. [LAUGHTER]

22

23 **KENNETH KAO:** FROM THE STATEWIDE ATP? LOS ANGELES GOT A DECENT
24 AMOUNT OF MONEY THERE, AND I THINK SOME OF THE MORE RURAL AND
25 CENTRAL VALLEY FOLKS ALSO GOT SOMETHING.



JANUARY 8, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** DID WE LEARN ANYTHING IN THAT PROCESS --

3 [LAUGHTER] -- OR COME AWAY WITH ANYTHING THAT WOULD HELP US IN
4 THE FUTURE?

5

6 **KENNETH KAO:** I THINK OUR CONDITIONED FOCUS ON PROVIDING
7 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WILL BE VERY BENEFICIAL. I THINK WE HAVE
8 HEARD THAT WAS REALLY HELPFUL FOR SOME OF OUR APPLICANTS. I
9 WOULD NOTE THAT, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE'RE -- WITH SUCH A SMALL
10 AMOUNT, 84 MILLION, IT DOESN'T REALLY GO DOWN THE LINE, YOU
11 KNOW? YOU CAN ONLY FIND EIGHT OR NINE PROJECTS FROM THAT. AND
12 SO, WHEN YOU'RE SCORING SOMETHING LIKE IT'S OUT OF 100 AND I
13 THINK THEY ONLY FUNDED PROJECTS IN, LIKE SCORED 95 AND 96. SO,
14 THAT WAS THE CUTOFF. THE DIFFERENCE REALLY BETWEEN 94 AND 96
15 REALLY IS NOT, IT'S REALLY HARD TO DIFFERENTIATE THAT. I THINK
16 THE LESSON LEARNED IS WE NEED MORE MONEY SO WE CAN GO FURTHER
17 DOWN THE LINE. AS YOU MAY KNOW, THE STATE BUDGET REDUCED THAT
18 AMOUNT FOR THE STATEWIDE, BY A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT, BY ALMOST
19 75%. SO, IF THAT STATE BUDGET WASN'T CUT FOR THE ATP, WE WOULD
20 HAVE GOTTEN A LOT MORE PROJECTS, I THINK OAKLAND WOULD HAVE
21 GOTTEN A PROJECT. I THINK SAN FRANCISCO WOULD HAVE GOTTEN SOME
22 PROJECTS. SO, WE WOULD HAVE BEEN A LOT MORE GEOGRAPHICALLY
23 SPREAD AROUND THE STATE. BUT, UNFORTUNATELY, WITH 84 MILLION,
24 JUST, THE DOLLARS DIDN'T GO VERY FAR.

25



JANUARY 8, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** NOT THAT WE'RE COMPETITIVE, BUT WE ARE.

2

3 **KENNETH KAO:** WE ARE.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** SO, AND KEN, WE NEVER GET TO HEAR FROM YOU. YOU'RE
6 ALWAYS IN SUCH A RUSH. [LAUGHTER]. SO, IT'S VERY GOOD TO SEE
7 YOU, AND, I GUESS, PLEASE LET US KNOW HOW WE CAN HELP
8 TECHNICALLY FOR FUTURE FUNDING. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9

10 **KENNETH KAO:** ABSOLUTELY. THANK YOU.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? DID WE
13 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED. NO ONE
16 IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. AGENDA ITEM FOUR, PUBLIC COMMENT
19 AND OTHER BUSINESS. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ANY
20 RECEIVED PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS AGENDA ITEM AT
21 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M., AS STATING TO THE RECORD.
22 ALSO ASK IF THERE IS ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
23 TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON
24 TODAY'S AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED THE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL



JANUARY 8, 2025

1 STAR NINE. IN-PERSON FOLKS, PLEASE COME TO THE PODIUM, AND
2 WE'LL CALL UPON YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM SPACE. NO
5 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM, AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. SO, ITEM FIVE, ADJOURNMENT AND
8 NEXT MEETING.

9

10 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** VICE CHAIR, IF I MAY? THE NEXT MEETING
11 OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS WILL BE HELD FEBRUARY 12TH,
12 2025 AT 9:45. I BELIEVE THE NOTES LIST IT INCORRECTLY.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. SO WE'RE NOW
15 ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

16



NTT

Broadcasting Government