

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JULY 23, 2025

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, JULY 23, 2025, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING
6 OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS MEETING IS
7 BEING WEBCAST -- OH, SORRY AMBER I DIDN'T SEE YOU. THIS
8 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. COMMISSIONERS AND
9 MEMBERS PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE
10 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND AND I WILL CALL UPON
11 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
12 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THE PHONE NUMBER. A
13 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. WILL THE
14 CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GOOD MORNING. CHAIR NOACK?

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

4

5 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT? BURT?

8

9 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT. GIACOPINI? I SEE HER

12 WAVING. COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN?

13 MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

14

15 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN?

18

19 **MITCH MASHBURN:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR?

22

23 **MYRNA MELGAR:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY? PAPAN?



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS? IS ABSENT. SCHAFF IS ABSENT.

5 QUORUM IS PRESENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. FOR ALL ABLE, PLEASE JOIN ME IN

8 THE PLEDGE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO

9 THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC

10 FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH

11 LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION

14 ANNOUNCEMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM

17 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD

18 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING

19 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS

20 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR

21 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. MOVE ON TO ITEM FOUR, THE CHAIR'S

24 REPORT. I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME OUR NEWEST MEMBER OF THE

25 COMMISSION, BARBARA LEE, MAYOR OF OAKLAND. MAYOR LEE NEEDS NO



JULY 23, 2025

1 INTRODUCTION. HAVING SERVED AS A MEMBER OF CONGRESS FOR OVER
2 TWO DECADES AND IN THE CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE FOR NEARLY A
3 DECADE BEFORE THAT. COMMISSIONER LEE, WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE
4 SOME COMMENTS.

5

6 **BARBARA LEE:** THANK YOU. HONOR TO BE WITH YOU. LOOK FORWARD TO
7 OUR WORK TOGETHER. AS FOR CONTEXT MY BACKGROUND FORMALLY ON
8 THE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE IN CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE FIRST
9 BILL SIGNED INTO LAW, THE BILL IS NOT VERY APPEALING AB 666.
10 IT WAS MAKING SURE WE COULD ADD MORE RACKS TO BUSES FOR
11 BICYCLES. WORKED ON THE FERRY SERVICE, WORKED ON HELMETS
12 ACTUALLY FOR MOTORCYCLISTS, AND MADE SURE THAT OUR PORT OF
13 OAKLAND CAN DREDGE WITH REGARD TO TRANSPORTING THE DREDGE
14 LANDS TO SONOMA BAYLANDS CREATED WETLANDS IN TERMS OF JUSTICE
15 WORKING ON TRANSPORTATION FUNDING THROUGH THE INFLATION
16 REDUCTION ACT THROUGH ALL OF THE FEDERAL INITIATIVES
17 TRANSPORTATION HAS BEEN DEAR TO MY HEART LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN
18 MAKE SURE THAT MORE PEOPLE HAVE A LIVABLE COMMUNITY AS IT
19 RELATES TO TRANSPORTATION ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES HOUSING ALL
20 INTEGRATED INTO ONE THIS BODY IS IMPORTANT TO ME AND OAKLAND
21 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND LOOK FORWARD TO
22 OUR WORK TOGETHER.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WELL WE LOOK FORWARD TO IT AS WELL AND
25 APPRECIATE ALL YOUR EXPERIENCE. I WOULD LIKE TO APPOINT



JULY 23, 2025

1 COMMISSIONER LEE TO THE SECOND WEDNESDAY COMMITTEE MEETINGS.
2 AND PLEASE SEE THE HANDOUT AT YOUR PLACES. EVERYBODY ELSE IS
3 STAYING THE SAME WE'RE JUST ADDING COMMISSIONER LEE TO THE
4 WEDNESDAY MEETINGS. I NEED A MOTION AND A SECOND TO CONFIRM
5 THAT APPOINTMENT FOR COMMISSIONER LEE.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** SECOND.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. IS
12 THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THAT
13 ITEM? OKAY. THEN MAY WE HAVE THE ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE?

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BEFORE WE DO WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT,
16 I BELIEVE?

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH YEAH. PUBLIC COMMENT.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE
21 AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM WITH THAT I'LL GO AHEAD
22 WITH THE ROLL CALL VOTE.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

6

7 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

10

11 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE ANDERSON?

12

13 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN IS ABSENT. JOHN-BAPTISTE IS

16 ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

17

18 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES MASHBURN?

19

20 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR?

23

24 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE MILEY?

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** YES RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
6 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO ITEM 4A WHICH
9 IS SENATE BILL 63, UPDATE. I WANT TO PROVIDE A BRIEF UPDATE ON
10 SB63 THAT WOULD AUTHORIZE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
11 MEASURE FOR THE BAY AREA, I HAD OPPORTUNITY TO TESTIFY ON
12 BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION AT THE ASSEMBLY REVENUE AND TAXATION
13 COMMITTEE HEARING LAST WEEK AND PLEASED TO REPORT THE BILL
14 PASSED OUT OF THAT COMMITTEE THIS ITEM INCLUDES POWERPOINT
15 ATTACHMENT PREPARED FOR OUR LEGISLATION COMMITTEE THAT
16 INCLUDES UPDATED LEGISLATIVE CALENDAR REFLECTING THAT
17 MILESTONE HEAD INTO A PIVOTAL STRETCH OVER THE NEXT FEW WEEKS
18 NEGOTIATIONS FOCUS ON TWO CRITICAL ELEMENTS SHAPING THE
19 EXPENDITURE PLAN AND DETERMINING THE COUNTY PARTICIPATION. AS
20 A REMINDER THE COMMISSION HAS A SUPPORT POSITION ON THE BILL
21 CONSISTENT WITH THE PRINCIPLES WE ADOPTED EARLIER THIS YEAR
22 THOSE PRINCIPLES EMPHASIZE THE MEASURE MUST BE PASSABLE, FAIR,
23 MITIGATE DEVASTATING SERVICE CUTS AND DELIVER REAL
24 IMPROVEMENTS FOR RIDERS ON THE LAST POINT WE ENDORSED A \$45
25 MILLION PACKAGE OF RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS TO HELP MAKE



JULY 23, 2025

1 TRANSIT AFFORDABLE ACCESS AND I BELIEVE EASIER TO USE, THE
2 LEGISLATURE CONVENES AFTER SUMMER RECESS AUGUST 18TH AND WE
3 EXPECT A BUSY MONTH LEADING UP TO THE MID-SEPTEMBER DEADLINE
4 FOR FINAL BILLS PASSAGE YOU ALL HAVE RECEIVED A COPY OF THE
5 LETTER WE JUST RECEIVED MINUTE AS AGO REGARDING DRAFT PROPOSED
6 TRANSPORTATION EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR THE FIVE COUNTIES WE'LL
7 DIGEST IT SO NOT GOING TO COMMENT ON THAT FURTHER BUT YOU ALL
8 CAN REVIEW THAT. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS ON
9 THE UPDATE? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR AS I UNDERSTAND IT WHEN THE
12 LEGISLATURE RECONVENES IT WILL GO BACK TO THE ASSEMBLY
13 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND WE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY ARE
14 WORKING CLOSELY WITH OUR REPRESENTATIVE TO, AS THIS BODY HAS
15 NOTED, MAKE IT SOMETHING THAT OUR VOTERS WOULD BE ABLE TO
16 ACCEPT, UNDERSTANDING ALL THE CONSEQUENCES AND ISSUES PENDING
17 HERE. SO, WE LOOK FORWARD TO, AGAIN, WORKING WITH OUR LOCAL
18 REPRESENTATIVES AND OUR STATE REPRESENTATIVES AS THIS BILL
19 MOVES FORWARD.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** OH YES, I DON'T KNOW IF I MISSED IT, BUT DID SAN
24 MATEO, AND SANTA CLARA ARE THEY GOING TO BE WITH US?

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THEIR DECISION HAS TO BE MADE -- THEIR
2 DECISION HAS TO BE MADE BY AUGUST 11TH BUT THE DRAFT LETTER
3 AND DRAFT TP IS ON A FIVE-COUNTY MEASURE BUT THAT'S JUST TO
4 SHOW WHAT IT WOULD LOOK LIKE IF THERE WAS A FIVE-COUNTY
5 MEASURE.

6

7 **NATHAN MILEY:** I SEE. OKAY.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHER? OH [LAUGHTER] AND MAYOR MAHAN HAS
10 NOW JOINED US.

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** SORRY TO BE LATE. I THINK WE'RE MAKING GOOD
13 PROGRESS THOUGH.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YE WE ARE MAKING GOOD PROGRESS AND HOPEFULLY
16 WE CAN CONTINUE THAT. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER BURT?

17

18 **PAT BURT:** JUST NOTE THAT SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAVE
19 BEEN WORKING WITH SENATOR WIENER AND ALL THE PARTNER AGENCIES
20 THAT -- THAT ARE THE AGENCIES OVERSEEING CALTRAIN. SO, THERE
21 HAS BEEN STRUGGLES THAT, WHAT SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY
22 ARE BEING ASKED TO COVER IN CALTRAIN EXPENSES EXCEEDS WHAT
23 WOULD BE THEIR, IN A CALCULATED SHARE, BUT, OVERALL, IN THE
24 ENTIRE MEASURE IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS GOING TO HAVE TO BE SOME
25 GIVE BY EVERYBODY TO MAKE IT HAPPEN. AND WE'LL SEE HOW WE CAN



JULY 23, 2025

1 RESOLVE THE REMAINING ISSUES WESTERN CALTRAIN WE STILL HAVE
2 MEETINGS AND NEGOTIATIONS THAT ARE EVEN GOING ON BETWEEN THOSE
3 THREE PARTNER AGENCIES. I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I JUST
4 WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE IS THAT SOME OF THE TENSION BETWEEN THE
5 OBLIGATIONS OF SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO COUNTY AND, FOR THAT
6 MATTER, SAN FRANCISCO, GO BACK HISTORICALLY TO THE FACT THAT
7 SAN MATEO COUNTY REALLY -- IT WAS THE COUNTY THAT SAVED
8 CALTRAIN THAT STEPPED FORWARD FINANCIALLY AND ADMINISTRATIVELY
9 FOR YEARS. WE NOW ALSO HAVE A CIRCUMSTANCE WHERE WE'RE UNDER
10 MEASURE RR, SANTA CLARA COUNTY IS PAYING DISPROPORTIONATELY TO
11 THE RIDERSHIP SO WE'RE TRYING TO BALANCE THOSE DIFFERENT
12 LEGITIMATE POINTS OF VIEW. BUT AS MAYOR MAHAN SAID, WE'RE
13 THINK WE'RE MAKING PROGRESS, AND WE'LL SEE. WE HAVE TO HAVE A
14 MEASURE THAT WE CAN SELL TO OUR BOARD AT VTA, CALTRAIN HAS
15 ALREADY ENDORSED IT. AND TO OUR VOTERS, AS WELL. SO, I'M
16 HOPEFUL, AND WE'LL SEE HOW IT PROCEEDS.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT DID YOU -- NO? YOU'RE
19 JUST LOOKING AT ME.

20

21 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I WAS LOOKING AT COMMISSIONER MAHAN
22 WONDERING IF HE WANTED TO --

23

24 **MATT MAHAN:** I THINK COMMISSIONER BURT SAID IT WELL WE'LL HAVE
25 A BOARD WORKSHOP AT VTA AUGUST 1ST I BELIEVE WE'LL CERTAINLY



JULY 23, 2025

1 MAKE A DECISION BY THE 11th WHICH IS OUR TARGET HERE AND I
2 THINK AS MEMBER BURT SAID WE JUST NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE
3 CAN MAKE THE CASE TO VOTERS OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY THAT THEY
4 ARE GETTING VALUE FOR THE DOLLARS WE'RE ASKING THEM TO INVEST
5 AND THAT CONTRIBUTIONS EVERYONE'S MAKING ARE FAIR AND
6 PROPORTIONATE TO THE NEED AND IMPACT REALLY IN EACH COUNTY
7 THERE ARE STILL ONGOING CONVERSATIONS WITH THE SENATOR AS
8 NOTED WITH STAKEHOLDERS IN OTHER COUNTIES PARTICULARLY SAN
9 FRANCISCO, AS IT PERTAINS TO CALTRAIN IN PARTICULAR WE'RE
10 COMFORTABLE WITH CONTRIBUTIONS WE'RE MAKING AND WE ALL SEE
11 NEED FOR PROTECTING RIDERSHIP THERE IN ALL SYSTEMS. I THINK
12 WE'RE GETTING CLOSER. WE DO HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT THE LEVEL OF
13 CONTRIBUTIONS SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS MADE TO CALTRAIN
14 HISTORICALLY, AND SO THAT'S STILL SOMETHING WE'RE WORKING
15 THROUGH. BUT UNDERSTAND THAT EVERYBODY IS GOING TO -- I THINK
16 MEMBER BURT SAID IT WELL, EVERY ENTITY HERE IS NOT GOING TO
17 GET EXACTLY WHAT IT WANTS. THAT'S JUST THE REALITY. THERE WILL
18 BE SHARED SACRIFICE IF WE'RE GOING TO RAISE THE FUNDS TO
19 ADDRESS THE OVERARCHING CONCERN WE SHOULD ALL HAVE WHICH IS IF
20 WE HAVE TO SIGNIFICANTLY CUT TRANSIT SERVICES WE'RE GOING TO
21 END UP IN A NEGATIVE SPIRAL ECONOMICALLY AND IN TERMS OF
22 QUALITY OF LIFE FOR THE ENTIRE REGION. I THINK WE NEED TO FINE
23 A WAY TO GET AT YES BUT IT'S NOT A FOREGONE CONCLUSION WE'RE
24 GOING TO GET THERE WITHOUT NEGOTIATION, WE'RE MAKING GOOD
25 PROGRESS.



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER BURT AND MAHAN THERE
5 HAS BEEN PROGRESS TO THE REGIONAL MEASURE. FOR THOSE WHO SIT
6 ON CALTRAIN BOARD REALLY WHAT IS THE CONTRIBUTION LEVEL? I
7 KNOW THERE IS GOING TO BE ROBUST DISCUSSION TODAY WE HAVE A
8 SPECIAL MEETING TODAY AT 3:30 TO DISCUSS IT AND I, SORT OF,
9 LOOK AT THINGS IN BIG PICTURE -- THE BIG PICTURE IS, HOW DO WE
10 ENSURE THAT WE DON'T -- WE MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT IS ABLE TO
11 CONTINUE TO THRIVE OR CONTINUE TO NOT FAIL, MAYBE THAT'S A
12 BETTER WORD AND AT THE SAME TIME REALLY GET INTO THE DETAILS
13 OF WHAT A POTENTIAL FORMULA FOR A CONTRIBUTION LOOKS LIKE. AND
14 I THINK WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE WHEN WE TALK ABOUT EQUITY
15 AND FAIRNESS IN TERMS OF THAT CONTRIBUTION. I THINK, FROM THE
16 SAMTRANS SIDE OF THE HOUSE, YOU KNOW, WE'LL BE HAVING A
17 MEETING, I THINK THE FIRST WEEK IN AUGUST TO TALK ABOUT HOW
18 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A MEASURE. WHETHER WE'RE
19 GOING TO SUPPORT OR NOT SUPPORT. AS YOU KNOW, WITHIN SAN MATEO
20 COUNTY, THERE IS, AMONG ELECTED OFFICIALS, TO BE QUITE CANDID
21 WITH YOU, THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF DIVISION IN SUPPORT OF THE
22 MEASURE. YOU KNOW, I HAVE GONE ON RECORD TO SAY THAT I FULLY
23 SUPPORT THE MEASURE, BUT THERE ARE SOME WHO DO NOT SUPPORT THE
24 MEASURE. HOWEVER, IN THE SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION, I THINK
25 CONTINUING TO INFORM AND TO EDUCATE OTHERS, THROUGH VARIOUS



JULY 23, 2025

1 STAKEHOLDERS THROUGH DIFFERENT ELECTED'S, I DO THINK THERE IS
2 A PATH FORWARD. AND TO SPEAK TO WHAT YOU HAD MENTIONED, MAYOR
3 MAHAN, IS WE STARTED, AND I THINK SANTA CLARA WAS THE SAME
4 WAY, WE STARTED WITH A HARD NO POSITION. BUT IT'S REALLY
5 THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS, IT'S EVOLVED. NOW IT'S JUST FIGURING
6 OUT WHAT THE DETAILS LOOK LIKE. AND SO, WE'RE WORKING IN THE
7 SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION AND COLLEGIALITY AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL
8 BE ABLE TO ADVANCE THIS. I THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR, FOR THE
9 TIME.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

12

13 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK, AND I JUST WANT
14 TO COMMEND EVERYONE WHO HAS BEEN A PART OF THESE NEGOTIATIONS.
15 WHAT I'M HEARING FROM THOSE WHO ARE CLOSER TO IT, AND IT'S --
16 IT REALLY HAS BEEN A LEARNING EXPERIENCE FOR ME TOO, BECAUSE,
17 YOU KNOW, REPRESENTING THE CITY OF ALAMEDA COUNTY I HAVE A
18 CERTAIN PERSPECTIVE AND UNDERSTANDING I THINK IT'S BEEN VERY
19 IMPORTANT FOR US TO UNDERSTAND THE CONCERNS, VERY LEGITIMATE
20 CONCERNS THAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY, SAN MATEO COUNTY HAD, AND
21 I'M HEARING THAT THOSE BODIES ARE FEELING MORE LISTENED TO,
22 MORE HEARD, AND THEIR PERSPECTIVES RESPECTED. AND, SO, I'M
23 JUST GLAD THAT WE HAD THE TIME FOR THAT TO HAPPEN. THERE IS A
24 LITTLE MORE TIME, NOT A LOT, BUT A LITTLE MORE AND I'M HOPEFUL
25 THAT WILL BE WHAT IT TAKES BUT I COMMEND THE GOOD WILL AND



JULY 23, 2025

1 SPIRIT OF COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION WITH WHICH YOU ALL
2 HAVE ENTERED THESE TALKS THANK YOU AND LET'S KEEP MOVING.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? IS.

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** I DON'T WANT TO BELABOR BUT I WANT TO SAY
7 I'M REALLY OPTIMISTIC AND REALLY APPRECIATE THE PROGRESS WE
8 HAVE MADE. I HAVE LEARNED A LOT THROUGH ALL OF THE MANY
9 DIFFERENT PERMUTATIONS OF CONVERSATIONS WE HAVE HAD. AND I
10 THINK AS A COMMISSIONER I FEEL MUCH MORE -- AT LEAST MUCH MORE
11 ENLIGHTENED ABOUT ALL OF THE OTHER PARTS OF OUR REGION, AND,
12 SO, THIS HAS BEEN JUST A POSITIVE EFFORT MUCH MORE
13 ENLIGHTENMENT PROCESS, MUCH IMPROVED FROM THE ONE WE DID
14 EARLIER A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO AND I APPRECIATE THE SENATOR AND
15 HIS LEANING IN AND YES WE STILL HAVE NEGOTIATION, WE DO HAVE
16 AN AFTERNOON CALTRAIN MEETING WHERE WE'LL BE GOING THROUGH THE
17 DIFFERENT ELEMENTS IN DETAIL BUT I THINK WE'RE CLOSE. THE BIG
18 PICTURE ALTERNATIVE WOULD BE BLEAK, I HOPE WE CAN KEEP THAT IN
19 MIND, IT'S THE WILLINGNESS TO COLLABORATE THIS TIME AND I
20 THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP ON THIS. AND, YEAH,
21 AND I'M HOPEFUL THAT WE'LL GET THERE. THANKS SO MUCH.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY ADDITIONAL?

24

25 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. I WANT TO THE ASSOCIATE



JULY 23, 2025

1 MYSELF WITH THE COMMENTS OF COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IN THE
2 SPIRIT OF COLLABORATION. BUT I ALSO WANTED TO THANK STAFF.
3 BECAUSE ALL OF THESE NUMBERS REFLECT ALL OF THE INTERPLAY OF
4 THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN BROUGHT UP IN THIS BODY, RETURN TO
5 SOURCE, YOU KNOW, POSSIBILITY, YOU KNOW, FAIRNESS,
6 PROPORTIONALITY OF RIDERSHIP AND DISTANCE, THERE IS ALL OF
7 THESE THINGS THAT HAVE TO MAKE SENSE TO VOTERS AT THE END OF
8 THE DAY. AND I OFTEN TELL PEOPLE, COMMISSIONER CANEPA, THAT
9 DISTRICT 7 SHARES A LONGER BORDER WITH DISTRICT 5, SAN MATEO
10 COUNTY THEN DISTRICT 5, SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY SHARES A LONG
11 BORDER WITH DISTRICT FIVE AND WE'RE ALL INTERRELATED. SO,
12 DESPITE THE BIG FISH THAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA TALKED ABOUT
13 IN OUR FUTURE TOGETHER IN TERMS OF WORKFORCE, OF, YOU KNOW,
14 BEING ABLE TO MOVE PEOPLE AROUND, OF OUR GROWTH AS A REGION,
15 WE, ALSO, HAVE TO, AT THE END OF THE DAY, THE NUMBERS NEED TO
16 MAKE SENSE, WE ALL HAVE TO GIVE A LITTLE. BUT I WANT TO
17 PARTICULARLY THANK STAFF BECAUSE THESE NUMBERS REFLECT THAT.
18 AND I THINK THAT ALL OF THE FACETS AT THE TA, AT THE MTC HEARD
19 OUR COMMENT AND CRUNCHED THE NUMBERS. AND YOU KNOW, LIKE A
20 PUZZLE PUT THIS ALL TOGETHER WITH SENATOR WIENER AND SENATOR
21 ARREGUIN AND THEIR STAFF SO THAT WE COULD HAVE SOMETHING THAT
22 WORKS AND THAT WE CAN PUT FORWARD AND DEFEND. SO, THANK YOU SO
23 MUCH TO EVERYONE FOR ENGAGING IN THIS CONVERSATION. I THINK,
24 YOU KNOW, ASIDE FROM THIS, THE RELATIONSHIP THAT WE BUILD, AND
25 THE PROCESS THAT WE WENT THROUGH, WILL HELP US IN TERMS OF



JULY 23, 2025

1 WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE AS A REGION AND TRANSPORTATION
2 GOING FORWARD. AND I AM REALLY GLAD WE DID IT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. I JUST WANT TO ADD MY THANKS. STAFF
5 HAS PUT IN, I THINK, WHAT TIME DID YOU SEND ME AN E-MAIL LAST
6 NIGHT, ANDY? 10:00 OR SOMETHING. I WAS STILL UP WATCHING
7 TELEVISION. BUT THE AMOUNT OF HOURS THAT ANDY, ALIX, GEORGIA,
8 REBECCA, EVERYBODY HAS PUT INTO THIS HAS BEEN TREMENDOUS. THE
9 CTAS PROVIDING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON ALL THESE NUMBERS WAS
10 REALLY A LOT OF WORK. AND IT ALSO RAN AT SENATOR WIENER'S
11 OFFICE HAS SPENT -- BUT I FOUNTAIN OUT ABOUT IT -- I'M NOT
12 GOING TO SAY THIS. I'LL SKIP THAT. I'LL DO THAT IN PRIVATE. HE
13 SPENT A LOT OF HOURS ON THIS EVEN ON THE WEEKEND WHEN HE WAS
14 OVER AT FRIEND'S HOUSE HE CALLED ME IN THE MIDDLE AND I SAID
15 WHAT YOU ARE DOING. YOU KNOW, EVERYBODY, GREAT DEAL OF THANKS
16 FOR WORKING ON THIS WE DO APPRECIATE WHEN WE WERE DOING THE
17 SELECT COMMITTEE NOT THAT LONG AGO IT WAS PRETTY CON TENUOUS
18 AND NOT VERY PRETTY WE TALKED ABOUT REASONABLENESS AND T-
19 SHIRTS, ACTUALLY GETTING THOSE REALLY APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S
20 WORK AND COOPERATION AND COLLABORATION WE'RE NOT DONE YET
21 KEEPING IT GOING. PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU READ INTO THE RECORD THE LETTER FROM
24 SENATOR WIENER AND SENATOR ARREGUIN THAT WILL BE POSTED TO THE
25 ONLINE AGENDA FOLLOWING THIS MEETING. WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF



JULY 23, 2025

1 THE PUBLIC ALETA DUPREE, APPROACH THE PODIUM. HOW MUCH TIME.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GIVE ME A MOMENT ALETA, I'LL SHARE THE
6 CLOCK THAT I KNOW YOU LOVE SO MUCH. AND YOU WILL HAVE TWO
7 MINUTES.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS.
10 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THIS
11 ISN'T EASY. I'M ALWAYS THINKING OF NEW THINGS. I WENT TO
12 PORTLAND AND SEATTLE. PORTLAND DOESN'T HAVE A SALES TAX AND
13 THEY PAY FOR THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEM SOMEHOW. I'M NOT SAYING WE
14 SHOULD REDO EVERYTHING. I THINK WE HAVE A GOOD THING GOING.
15 BUT WE HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER. I KNOW THERE IS THE ISSUE OF
16 DONOR COUNTIES AND RECIPIENT COUNTIES, AND I THINK ABOUT ALL
17 THE WORK THAT THE MUSIC INDUSTRY DID LIKE SPOTIFY FIGURING OUT
18 THE ALLOTMENTS OF ROYAL TEES ACROSS ALL THE DIFFERENT
19 STAKEHOLDERS TO HAVE A SUSTAINABLE PLAN. WE CAN DO THAT HERE
20 TOO. THE I THINK OFTEN IN MORE BROADER CONCEPTS HOW WE ALL GET
21 TOGETHER PERHAPS WE SHOULD GET TOGETHER AND LISTEN TO LOVE
22 COMES TO EVERYONE BY GEORGE HARRISON. I DON'T KNOW IF ANY OF
23 YOU HEARD OF IT. WHEN I HEARD IT I WAS REMINDED OF GRAND
24 CENTRAL TERMINAL IN NEW YORK CITY AND GOING THROUGH THE DOORS
25 TO THOSE TRAINS. WHAT WE NEED TO HAVE IS OUR GRAND CENTRAL



JULY 23, 2025

1 TERMINAL MOMENT. AND SOME OF YOU HAVE TOLD ME YOU HAVE
2 ACTUALLY SEEN THAT FAMOUS STATION, WHAT WOULD NEW YORK CITY BE
3 LIKE WITHOUT GRAND CENTRAL TERMINAL AND WITHOUT THE SUBWAY?
4 WHAT WOULD OUR COMMUNITY BE LIKE IF WE DON'T HAVE THE BART,
5 WHICH I USED TO COME HERE THIS MORNING AND I AM PREOCCUPIED
6 WITH LOTS OF THINGS AND THERE ARE MEETINGS AND I AM
7 PREOCCUPIED WITH THE SAN FRANCISCO JEWISH FILM FESTIVAL RIGHT
8 NOW. IT'S YOUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
9 THAT GET ME THERE, AC TRANSIT AND MUNI AND THE BART, TO DO ALL
10 THESE DIFFERENT THINGS WHILE I'M HERE WITH YOU. SO, HOW DO WE
11 PUT OUR DIFFERENCES ASIDE? THIS ISN'T DONE YET. BUT ONCE WE
12 GET IT SIGNED BY THE GOVERNOR, THEN WE HAVE GOT TO SELL THIS
13 TO THE VOTERS. I WANT TO SEE THIS PASS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. WE DO HAVE ANOTHER SPEAKER.
16 MISS JANE KRAEMER. GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM. YOU HAVE
17 TWO MINUTES AND THEN WE DO HAVE SOMEONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE.
18 MISS KRAEMER?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HERE WE GO. SO, JANE.

21

22 **JANE KRAMER:** I THINK IN TODAY'S CLIMATE WE ALL REALIZE THAT
23 THE PUBLIC IS CLAMORING FOR REAL FACTUAL INFORMATION. IT WOULD
24 BE GREATLY APPRECIATED, I THINK, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE. SO, WHAT
25 I THINK I WISH, I HOPE, I ASSUME YOU WILL ALL ATTEMPT TO DO IS



JULY 23, 2025

1 OPEN A PUBLIC DISCUSSION ON THIS PROPOSITION THAT IS FACTUAL,
2 OPEN, AND CREATIVE. AND I THINK YOU WILL, IF YOU DO THAT, IF
3 THAT'S SUCCESSFUL, YOU WILL END UP WITH A WORKABLE POLICY.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MISS KRAEMER. NEXT UP IS
7 ROLAND LEBRUN IN THE ZOOM SPACE. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS. THROUGH THE
10 CHAIR, I'M WONDERING IF IT WOULD BE POSSIBLE TO POST THE DRAFT
11 EXPENDITURE PLAN AT THE EARLIEST OPPORTUNITY, AND THAT
12 CONCLUDES MY REMARKS. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
15 RAISED HANDS.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM FIVE,
18 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR
19 CARINA LIEU, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

20

21 **CARINA LIEU:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS CARINA
22 LIEU. I REPRESENT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AS THE CHAIR. I
23 DO REPRESENT ALAMEDA COUNTY AND CITY THE OAKLAND, EXCITED TO
24 HAVE MARY LEE HERE. I WILL BE REPORTING BACK A LITTLE BIT FROM
25 OUR JUNE 24TH MEETING AS WELL AS YESTERDAY'S MEETING BECAUSE



JULY 23, 2025

1 IT WAS SB63 FOCUSED. I'LL START WITH A QUICK UPDATE FROM OUR
2 RECENT COUNCIL MEETING YESTERDAY WHILE WE DIDN'T TAKE FORMAL
3 ACTION THE CONVERSATION DID REFLECT A DEEP SENSE OF URGENCY
4 AND INVESTMENT IN THE FUTURE OF THE SB63 MEASURE. THE
5 DISCUSSION WAS ANCHORED IN THE LEGISLATURE'S RECENT AMENDMENT
6 TO CAP RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS AT 5% OF TOTAL REVENUES DOWN
7 FROM 10% PREVIOUSLY ENDORSED BY THE COMMISSION. STAFF WALKED
8 US THROUGH THE COMMISSION'S PROPOSED \$45 MILLION ANNUAL
9 ALLOCATION FOR THESE IMPROVEMENTS AN AMOUNT NOW FEASIBLE ONLY
10 IF THE FIVE COUNTIES OPT IN. COUNCIL MEMBERS FACE STRONG
11 CONCERNS ABOUT FURTHER REDUCTIONS TO THAT \$45 MILLION
12 ESPECIALLY GIVEN THAT IT WAS ALREADY SCALED BACK. SEVERAL
13 EMPHASIZE THAT RIDER FOCUSED INVESTMENTS ARE ESSENTIAL, NOT
14 JUST FOR SYSTEM IMPROVEMENT, BUT FOR PUBLIC SUPPORT AND
15 PASSAGE OF A MEASURE. SO, HERE ARE A FEW KEY THEMES THAT
16 EMERGED. RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS ARE FOUNDATIONAL. THESE
17 ARE NOT EXTRAS, THEY'RE BASELINE FOR RESTORING RIDERSHIP AND
18 PUBLIC TRUST. MEMBERS WERE CLEAR THAT THINGS LIKE FARE
19 INTEGRATION, ACCESSIBILITY AND SIGNAGE ARE CRITICAL.
20 ACCESSIBILITY INVESTMENTS WERE WELCOME. THERE WAS STRONG
21 SUPPORT FOR THE DEDICATED \$10 MILLION FOR ACCESSIBILITY
22 INCLUDING IMPROVEMENTS TO PARATRANSIT COORDINATION AND CAPITAL
23 UPGRADES LIKE SAFE PICK UP AREAS. WAYFINDING REMAINS A
24 CONCERN. MANY WERE DISAPPOINTED BY THE REDUCTION IF FUNDING
25 FOR SIGNAGE AND MAPPING. MEMBERS TRESS THAT THIS ISN'T ABOUT



JULY 23, 2025

1 AESTHETICS BUT WAYFINDING IS A CORE ACCESSIBILITY ISSUE.
2 FRAMING AND COMMUNICATION MATTER. SOME MEMBERS WERE CONFUSED
3 ABOUT THE SHIFT FROM TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TO RIDER FOCUSED
4 IMPROVEMENTS EVEN THOUGH WE DO LIKE RIDER FOCUSED
5 IMPROVEMENTS. STAFF CLARIFIED IT WAS JUST A CHANGE FROM
6 FRAMING AND MEMBERS URGE STRONGER STORY TELLING TO HELP THE
7 PUBLIC AND LOCAL AGENCIES UNDERSTAND WHAT THESE INVESTMENTS
8 ACTUALLY DELIVER. THERE WAS STRONG INTEREST IN ENSURING THAT
9 MTC CLEARLY COMMUNICATES HOW SB63 BENEFITS RESIDENTS ACROSS
10 ALL THE COUNTIES. MEMBERS SAW THIS AS A KEY TO SECURING
11 BROADER BUY-IN. DELIVERY AND ACCOUNTABILITY MATTER. THERE WERE
12 ALSO SUGGESTIONS AROUND USING SOME OF THIS FUNDING TO IMPROVE
13 COORDINATION ACROSS AGENCIES, REDUCE DUPLICATION AND HOLD
14 IMPLEMENTERS ACCOUNTABLE TO THE OUTCOMES. AGAIN, WHILE WE
15 DIDN'T TAKE A VOTE, THE TONE OF THE MEETING WAS CLEAR, THIS
16 CATEGORY OF INVESTMENTS IS SEEN AS ESSENTIAL, NOT PERIPHERAL
17 TO THE MEASURE'S SUCCESS AND SEVERAL MEMBERS URGE THE
18 COMMISSION TO STRONGLY DEFEND IT AS THE PROCESS TONS THE STATE
19 LEVEL. AND NOW I'LL QUICKLY REFLECT ON THE COUNCIL'S ACTIONS
20 FROM THE JUNE 24TH MEETING, SINCE IT STILL HELPS US
21 CONTEXTUALIZE OUR PRIORITIES. EVEN THOUGH SOME OF THE ACTION
22 PREDATES SOME OF THE MOST RECENT REVISIONS TO SB63. AT THAT
23 MEETING THE COUNCIL FORMALLY SUPPORTED THE STAFF
24 RECOMMENDATION FOR THE MEASURE WITH A FEW KEY AMENDMENTS. WE
25 PUSHED FOR A STRONGER INTER-AGENCY EFFICIENCY STUDY, WE ALSO



JULY 23, 2025

1 URGED THE COMMISSIONS TO RESTORE THE ORIGINAL \$55 MILLION
2 FOCUS FOR RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS, OR AT LEAST TIE THAT
3 AMOUNT TO A FIXED PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL REVENUES SO THAT FUNDING
4 IS AT SCALE IF MORE COUNTIES JOIN THE MEASURE. AGAIN, COUNCIL
5 MEMBERS SHARED BROADER FEEDBACK ABOUT WHAT RIDER FOCUSED
6 IMPROVEMENTS SHOULD REALLY MEAN. WE SUPPORTED THE SHIFT AWAY
7 FROM TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND EMPHASIZE THAT THIS FUNDING
8 SHOULD GO TOWARDS TANGIBLE IMPROVEMENTS. OTHER PRIORITIES THAT
9 CAME UP WERE ENSURING THAT PARATRANSIT IS SEAMLESS ACROSS THE
10 COUNTIES AND ACCESSIBLE WITHOUT DUPLICATIVE ELIGIBILITY
11 SCREENINGS. FRAMING CLEANLINESS, RELIABILITY, AND VISIBILITY
12 OF STAFF AS EQUITY ISSUES NOT JUST SERVICE EQUITY UPGRADES.
13 AND MAKE SURE THAT REGIONAL COORDINATION DOESN'T GET LOST
14 ESPECIALLY IN AREAS LIKE SIGNAGE AND FARE SYSTEMS WHERE
15 FRAGMENTATION COULD SET US BACK. THERE WAS A LITTLE DISCUSSION
16 AROUND THE REVENUE MECHANISM LIKE SALES TAX VERSUS GROSS
17 RECEIPTS TAX BUT MEMBERS GENERALLY UNDERSTOOD THAT THE SALES
18 TAX WAS CHOSEN TO MAX MIGHT BALLOT VIABILITY. THE TONE OF THAT
19 MEETING WAS COLLABORATIVE BUT CLEAR WE WANT TO SEE REAL
20 INVESTMENT IN RIDER EXPERIENCE AND COORDINATION AND WE TRY TO
21 PUSH FOR THAT LANGUAGE AND FUNDING THAT WOULD REFLECT THAT.
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER -- YES,
25 COMMISSIONER?



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** CARINA THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. IS THERE A WAY
3 FOR YOU TO FORWARD YOUR NOTES THAT WERE PRESENTED TODAY
4 PLEASE? BECAUSE SOME OF US ARE IN THE PROCESS OF WORKING ON
5 THAT.

6

7 **CARINA LIEU:** YES I CAN SEND THAT TO YOU.

8

9 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR THERE IS AN ADDENDUM POSTED
10 TO THE AGENDA THAT DOES HAVE THESE TALKING POINTS MAYBE NOT
11 VERBATIM BUT IT DOES HAVE THE THEME THAT SHE JUST WENT
12 THROUGH.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? IS THERE ANY
15 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE
18 AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ITEM SIX, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
21 REPORT. ANDY, WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** SURE. GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND MEMBERS OF
24 COMMISSIONS I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE STAFF WELCOME MAYOR LEE WE
25 LOOK FORWARD TO SUPPORTING YOU AS A COMMISSIONER AND YOUR TIME



JULY 23, 2025

1 HERE GLAD TO YOU HAVE ON THE PODIUM. RUSHING THROUGH A FEW
2 ITEMS I WANT TO MENTION THAT ON JUNE 27TH THE CALIFORNIA
3 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION APPROVED ABOUT A DOZEN GRANTS FOR
4 BAY AREA PROJECTS TOTAL OF ABOUT \$400 MILLION THIS IS FROM THE
5 LANDMARK 2017 SB1 TRANSPORTATION FINANCING PACKAGE IT INCLUDES
6 \$73 MILLION FOR THE HIGHWAY 37 SEARS POINT MARE ISLAND
7 IMPROVEMENT PROJECT, A PAIR EVER GRANTS FOR \$100 MILLION TO
8 BART SAN JOSE EXTENSION THEN \$87 MILLION TO HELP SONOMA-MARIN
9 AREA RAIL SERVICE DISTRICT EXTEND SERVICE FROM NEWLY OPENED
10 WINDSOR STATION TO HEALDSBURG SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING
11 WITH PARTNERS TO GET THAT MONEY WORKING QUICKLY. THERE HAS
12 BEEN SOME GOOD SUCCESS IN SACRAMENTO RELATIVE TO MTC PRIORITY
13 BILLS WE TALKED ABOUT SB63 ALREADY BUT AB 67 WHICH IS CORK
14 SILVA ALLOWS HOUSING PRESERVATION PROJECTS TO COUNT TOWARDS
15 THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION MOVE FORWARD THROUGH THE
16 SECOND HOUSE AS DID AB 697, A WILSON BILL THAT'S RELATED TO
17 KEEPING 37 MOVING ON AN EXPEDITED PATH. SO, WE'RE PROUD TO SEE
18 THOSE THINGS WORK THEIR WAY THROUGH SACRAMENTO. AND THANKS TO
19 A LOT OF OUR COMMISSIONERS FOR PROVIDING SUPPORT AS THEY HAVE
20 MADE THEIR WAY THROUGH THAT. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION JUST A
21 LITTLE BIT OF EXCITING NEWS, OUR DIRECTOR OF FINANCIAL REPORTS
22 AND OPERATIONAL ACCOUNTS GRACE MARTINEZ HAS BEEN INDUCTED AS
23 THE PRESIDENT ELECT OF THE GOVERNMENT FINANCE OFFICER'S
24 ASSOCIATION. SO, WE WANT TO CONGRATULATE GRACE FOR HER TIME
25 THERE. JUST AS A RECOGNITION MUCH HOW MUCH WE PUT EFFORT INTO



JULY 23, 2025

1 A LOT OF DIFFERENT ASSOCIATIONS OUT THERE TO MAKE SURE THAT
2 WE'RE STAYING ATTUNE OF WHAT IS HAPPENING IN INDUSTRY
3 STANDARDS ACROSS OUR FIELDS. I WANTED TO MENTION THAT THE
4 APPLICATION DEADLINE FOR THE NEW MTC ABAG COMMUNITY ADVISORY
5 COUNCIL HAS BEEN EXTENDED TO AUGUST 3RD THIS COUNCIL'S FOUR-
6 YEAR-TERM BEGINS IN JANUARY 2026 WE'RE HOPING YOU ALL SPREAD
7 THE WORD SO WE CAN GET COMPETITIVE APPLICATIONS POWER THAT.
8 JUST AGAIN, A REMINDER ABOUT THE SAVE THE DATE, COMMISSIONER -
9 - CHAIR NOACK HAS SET A DATE FOR OCTOBER 22ND AND 23rd IN
10 WALNUT CREEK, IN A FACILITY LOCATED VERY CLOSE TO THE PLEASANT
11 HILL BART STATION BUT WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE WORKSHOP
12 FOLLOWING THE REGULARLY SCHEDULED COMMISSION MEETING THAT WILL
13 BE HELD HERE. BONUS ITEM LAST BUT NOT LEAST I WANT TO MENTION
14 THAT SEPTEMBER IS TRANSIT MONTH. SO, MTC HAS BEEN SPONSORING
15 THIS MONTH LONG CELEBRATION OF ALL THINGS TRANSIT FOR SEVERAL
16 YEARS NOW, AND IT'S REALLY ABOUT ENCOURAGING FOLKS TO GET OUT
17 THERE AND RIDE TRANSIT, MAYBE TRY AWE NEW SYSTEM, TRY AND SEE
18 OR TAKE A LOOK AT SOME OF THE NEW IMPROVEMENTS THAT OUR
19 OPERATORS HAVE MADE ACROSS THE REGION. IT'S LED BY THE SAN
20 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA. THIS YEAR'S
21 TRANSIT MONTH INTEND TO ONCE AGAIN FEATURE EVENTS IN EACH
22 COUNTY AND ALSO A POPULAR GM RIDE-ALONG WHERE RIDERS CAN
23 MINGLE WITH THE LEADERS OF THESE SYSTEMS AS THEY, SORT OF,
24 CRISS CROSS THE REGION ON TRANSIT. SO AN UPDATED WEB SITE AND
25 FULL CALENDAR OF EVENTS WILL BE COMING SOON. I'M HAPPY TO TAKE



JULY 23, 2025

1 ANY QUESTIONS

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS BY
4 COMMISSIONERS? NO? OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I
7 HAVE ONE PERSON IN THE BOARDROOM, ALETA DUPREE. TWO MINUTES.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA
10 DUPREE SHE AND HER FOR THE RECORD FROM TEAM FOLDS. GOOD
11 REPORT. YOU ALWAYS ENJOY ANDY'S HELPFUL REPORTS. FOCUS ON
12 TRANSIT MONTH HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE INTERESTED IN THIS TOOK ME
13 TO SEE CHANGE, A BOY IN MY CAR 16 YEARS AGO, I HAVE GROWN UP
14 WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN NEW YORK HOW DO WE DEVELOP
15 RELATIONSHIPS TO GET PEOPLE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT IT'S NOT JUST
16 ABOUT FARE, THERE IS SAFETY IN NUMBERS MORE PEOPLE IN THE
17 TRAIN OR ON THE BUS. I HAVE BEEN ON THE GENERAL MANAGER'S
18 RIDE-ALONG TWO YEARS AGO WENT UP TO PITTSBURG BAY POINT AND
19 DID BUS RIDING UP WALNUT CREEK AND HAD DINNER THERE HAS BEEN A
20 COUPLE OTHER ONES HOPEFULLY WE CAN GET THAT GOING. I MIGHT BE
21 ABLE TO MAKE IT TO THAT. THOSE WERE A LOT OF FUN AND IT IS
22 ANOTHER WAY TO GET PEOPLE OUT THERE. YEAH, I PAID FARE JUST
23 LIKE EVERYBODY ELSE. THAT'S MORE FARE THAT THE SYSTEMS GET.
24 THERE IS A LOT OF WORK GOING ON IN SACRAMENTO, IT WAS JUST
25 MENTIONED ABOUT SOME OTHER BILLS AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN GET SOME



JULY 23, 2025

1 NEW CANDIDATES FOR THIS COMMUNITY ADVISORY PANEL. THIS IS NEW
2 TO ME. IT'S NOT EASY GETTING PEOPLE TO DO THESE VOLUNTEER
3 POSITIONS, ESPECIALLY AS FAR FLUNG AS THE BAY AREA IS THAT'S
4 WHY I HAVE SUPPORTED WORK WITH THE LEGISLATURE TO MAKE THE
5 BROWN ACT MORE EXPANSIVE SO ADVISORY MEMBERS DON'T HAVE TO BE
6 FORCED TO TRAVEL SO MUCH. SO, OVERALL, IT'S A GOOD REPORT. I
7 ENJOY HEARING IT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
10 RAISED HANDS.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM SEVEN
13 WHICH IS COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONERS
14 THAT WOULD LIKE TO GIVE COMMENT OR MAKE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS?
15 YES?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. I WAS ACTUALLY ASKED TO MAKE A
18 COMMENT. I KNOW WE'RE ON SUMMER BREAK, AND I TOOK A PERSONAL
19 TRIP TO JAPAN AND KOREA BUT DECIDED SINCE THERE TO ASK OUR
20 CONSUL GENERAL'S OFFICES TO SET ME UP, I MET WITH HUONG QUE
21 AND OSAKA, WHICH IS ONE OF THE LARGEST PRIVATE RAIL LINES IN
22 JAPAN AND LEARNED A LOT ABOUT HOW THEY SUPPORT THEIR RAIL
23 LINE. VERY INTERESTING CONCEPT. THEY HAVE THE RAIL LINE AND
24 THEN THEY OWN PROBABLY MOST OF SOUTHERN JAPAN, AND THEY USE
25 THE REAL ESTATE TO BUILD HOUSING, OFFICE, RETAIL, AND EVEN



JULY 23, 2025

1 ENTERTAINMENT ZONES SO THAT THERE IS A 24/7 SUPPORT RIDERSHIP
2 TO DESTINATIONS AND THAT'S WHAT I LEARNED IS WE HAVE TO CREATE
3 DESTINATIONS FOR PEOPLE TO WANT TO GO ON TRANSIT. SO, VERY
4 INTERESTING. AND THEN I WENT TO KOREA AND WAS ABLE TO MEET
5 WITH THEIR TRANSPORT OPERATIONS AND INFORMATION SERVICES WHICH
6 IS LIKE COMMAND CENTRAL, THEY RUN THE BUS LINES, THEY MONITOR
7 THE TAXICABS. THEY HAVE EMERGENCY RESPONSE ALL IN THIS ONE
8 COMMAND CENTRAL ROOM. VERY INTERESTING. AND I KNOW THAT WE
9 HAVE TRAVEL APPROVAL ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR OTHER
10 MEMBERS. BUT I WOULD JUST REALLY LIKE TO ENCOURAGE, I THINK
11 IT'S SO HELPFUL TO LEARN AND GO AND SEE WHAT OTHER PLACES ARE
12 DOING. AND, FRANKLY, LIKE, THIS EXPERIENCE HAS HELPED ME TO
13 SEE HOW IMPORTANT, YOU KNOW, LIKE, THE REGIONAL MEASURE IS SO
14 WE CAN GET TO A HIGHER LEVEL OF WHAT WE CAN SEE HAPPEN. I
15 WOULD ENCOURAGE AT SOME POINT IN TIME IF WE COULD EVEN HAVE AN
16 MTC DELEGATION, PRIMARILY TO ASIA WHEN IT COMES TO TRANSIT. I
17 HAVEN'T BEEN ALL OVER THE WORLD, BUT I DO THINK, AND
18 ESPECIALLY JAPAN IS REALLY AT THE PINNACLE OF WHAT TRANSIT CAN
19 BE. AND IT'S -- WHEN YOU SEE IT, AND YOU EXPERIENCE IT, IT
20 DOES -- IT'S CHANGED MY PERSPECTIVE AND THE VISION OF WHAT CAN
21 BE DONE. AND, SO, I HOPE THAT AT SOME POINT IN TIME WE CAN
22 LOOK AT DOING SOMETHING LIKE THAT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS. ANY OTHER -- OH, I SEE COMMISSIONER
25 GIACOPINI.



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** YES, THANK YOU. -- [SILENCE]

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DID WE LOSE HER?

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE HER IN THE ZOOM. WE JUST LOST HER
7 VIDEO. SO, NOT SURE WHAT HAPPENED THERE.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PRESSED THE WRONG BUTTON?

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VIDEO BUTTON MAYBE.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DOREEN? DOREEN? OH, HERE SHE IS. SHE'S BACK
14 OF THE ALL RIGHT. DOREEN, LOST YOU THERE FOR A MINUTE.

15

16 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** CAN YOU HEAR ME OKAY?

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

19

20 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** OKAY. GREAT. I JUST WANTED TO MENTION
21 THAT SFMTA IS HAVING A 35th ANNIVERSARY CELEBRATION OF THE
22 AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT AT THE, I BELIEVE IT IS THE
23 BANDSHELL AT GOLDEN GATE PARK THIS COMING SATURDAY IN THE
24 AFTERNOON THERE WILL BE A NUMBER OF TRANSPORTATION AS WELL AS
25 DISABILITY RELATED ORGANIZATIONS THERE. AND I THINK IT IS A



JULY 23, 2025

1 WONDERFUL OPPORTUNITY TO MEET AND GET TO KNOW EACH OTHER, AND
2 CREATE PATHWAYS FOR COMMUNICATION AND THE ABILITY TO WORK
3 TOGETHER IN A FUN AND CELEBRATORY ENVIRONMENT. SO, I HOPE
4 PEOPLE WILL CONSIDER GOING.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANKS DOREEN. ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER
7 COMMENTS? YES? COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** REAL QUICK. SO, MANY OF US WEREN'T HERE THIS LAST
10 MEETING BECAUSE, I THINK A LOT OF OUR JURISDICTIONS TAKE TIME
11 OFF IN JULY. AND I WAS WONDERING, MOVING FORWARD HERE, IF WE
12 COULD ACTUALLY POLL THE COMMISSIONERS AS TO WHEN THEIR
13 JURISDICTIONS ARE IN RECESS DURING THE SUMMER, WHETHER IT'S
14 JULY OR AUGUST, JUST BECAUSE AS WE DEAL WITH MANY IMPORTANT
15 THINGS, AND I WOULD BE CURIOUS TO FIND OUT IF WE CAN ALTER
16 THAT IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE? NO. ALL
19 RIGHT. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM EIGHT WHICH IS
20 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. INCLUDES ITEMS 8A THROUGH 8A. YES?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** CAN I PULL 8C PLEASE?

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** 8C. ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY ITEMS THEY WANT
25 PULLED? OKAY. CAN I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND FOR ITEMS 8A



JULY 23, 2025

1 THROUGH 8A, EXCLUDING 8C?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE, ABE-KOGA.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THOSE
6 ITEMS?

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PARDON ME. I HAVE RECEIVED ONE LETTER OF
9 CORRESPONDENCE FROM ROBERT RED E VICE PRESIDENT OF STANFORD
10 UNIVERSITY IN ASSOCIATION WITH AGENDA ITEM 8F THAT WAS POSTED
11 TO YOUR ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED LAST NIGHT. WE HAVE
12 ALETA DUPREE AT THE PODIUM FOR CONSENT CALENDAR. GO AHEAD MR.
13 DUPREE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA
16 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. A LOT HERE.
17 THE MINUTES LOOK GOOD. THANK YOU. YOU DO A GOOD JOB WITH THE
18 MINUTES REFLECTING MY NAME AND TEAM FOLDS. WE HAVE A TRAVEL
19 AUTHORIZATION. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO
20 SEEING A BREAKDOWN OF HOW THIS TRAVEL WILL -- THE DIFFERENT
21 ITEMS, CATEGORIES, LODGING, TRANSPORTATION, MEALS, ET CETERA.
22 INTERNATIONAL TRAVEL IS NOT CHEAP. I GET STICKER SHOCK WHEN I
23 LOOK AT FLIGHTS. I WOULD ENCOURAGE OUR GROUP TO USE PUBLIC
24 TRANSPORTATION IN VIENNA, AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. I HAVE NEVER
25 BEEN TO VIENNA. ALL I REALLY KNOW ABOUT VIENNA IS VIENNA



JULY 23, 2025

1 SAUSAGE AND WIENER SCHNITZEL, AND MAYBE LATER THIS WEEK I WILL
2 GET TO HAVE MY VERY FIRST CURRY WURST. THIS IS -- I WE WANT
3 CALL IT A VACATION. I MEAN, THIS CONFERENCE THAT'S HAPPENING,
4 AND THIS IS PART OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT. WE CAN'T LIVE IN
5 A VACUUM. I GO TO ALL DIFFERENT KINDS OF PLACES. OF COURSE,
6 I'M NOT REIMBURSED FOR ANY OF THAT, AND I BRING THINGS BACK TO
7 YOU FROM NEW YORK OR SEATTLE. SO, I'M SURE THAT THIS EVENT IS
8 GOING TO HAVE PEOPLE FROM ALL OVER THE WORLD SHARING THEIR
9 IDEAS. HOUSING IS NOT REALLY MUCH OF MY WHEELHOUSE, BUT IT'S
10 VERY IMPORTANT. AND, SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO A REPORT AFTER THIS
11 TRIP, NOT JUST AN EXPENSE REPORT, BUT HOPEFULLY HEARING ABOUT
12 WHAT Y'ALL ATE AND RIDING THE TRAINS THERE, AND WIENER
13 SCHNITZER AND VIENNA SAUSAGE, ET CETERA. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND ON ITEMS
18 8A THROUGH 8A, EXCEPT 8C, CAN WE HAVE ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE?

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. NOACK?

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

18

19 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. JOHN-BAPTISTE IS

22 ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN?

23

24 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?

2

3 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE MASHBURN?

4

5 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY?

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

16 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW GO TO 8C, COMMISSIONER

19 PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. I CAN'T SUPPORT THIS

22 EXPENDITURE. LAST YEAR WE SENT SEVERAL MEMBERS OF OUR STAFF

23 TO, I BELIEVE, THIS SAME CONFERENCE. I DON'T THINK A LOT HAS

24 CHANGED AS FAR AS SOCIAL HOUSING FIELD. AND WE DIDN'T -- I

25 MEAN, IT DOESN'T REALLY MATCH WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE. SO, AS



JULY 23, 2025

1 WAS POINTED OUT BY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, I THINK THIS FUNDING
2 WOULD BE MUCH BETTER USED IF WE'RE FOCUSING ON TRANSPORTATION.
3 AND WE HAVEN'T YET DONE THAT, OR IT'S BEEN VERY LIMITED. SO, I
4 THINK THIS IS A BIT REDUNDANT, AND I CAN'T SUPPORT THIS MOVING
5 FORWARD, BECAUSE, AGAIN, HOW MANY, FOR CLARIFICATION, HOW MANY
6 PEOPLE WENT TO THIS CONFERENCE LAST GO ROUND?

7

8 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I BELIEVE WE HAD TWO COMMISSIONERS AND THREE
9 STAFF.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. I WOULD ENCOURAGE MY ASSOCIATES THAT WE CAN
12 SPEND THIS \$40,000 IN A DIFFERENT WAY. I DON'T THINK WE WOULD
13 BE RECEIVING ANY NEW SIGNIFICANT INFORMATION AS IT RELATES TO
14 HOUSING. WE ALL KNOW HOW IMPORTANT THAT IS. BUT WE DO KNOW
15 THAT WE'RE IN THE MIDDLE OF A CRISIS WHEN IT COMES TO
16 TRANSPORTATION. AND THE MORE INFORMATION WE CAN RECEIVE ALONG
17 THOSE LINES, I THINK IS VITALLY IMPORTANT TO OUR PROCESS HERE.
18 SO, I WOULD -- I WOULD VOTE NO ON THIS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

21

22 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR NOACK. SO, I AM ONE OF THE
23 COMMISSIONERS WHO INTEND TO GO ON THIS TRIP. I THINK THAT WE
24 ARE AT A PIVOTAL MOMENT, NOT JUST IN TRANSPORTATION, BUT ALSO
25 HOUSING, WHICH IS ALSO RELATED. WE HAVE A NEW AGENCY IN BAHFA



JULY 23, 2025

1 THAT IS SEEKING TO DO SOMETHING SIMILAR TO WHAT VIENNA HAS
2 DONE IN TERMS OF UTILIZING NON-PROFIT CORPORATIONS TO DEVELOP
3 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, TO SUPPORT THE GROWTH OF THE REGION. AND,
4 YOU KNOW, OUR MODEL IS STILL INFLUX. YOU KNOW, WE WERE JUST
5 PRESENTED BY DIRECTOR SAVE ERR AT OUR LAST MEETING, WHAT IT
6 COULD LOOK LIKE RIGHT NOW GIVEN OUR ECONOMIC CIRCUMSTANCES,
7 AND OUR MARKET CIRCUMSTANCES WITH INTEREST RATES IN LABOR
8 COSTS THE WAY THEY ARE. SO, WE -- IT WILL BE ON US, YOU KNOW,
9 AS A BAHFA BOARD TO FIGURE OUT WHAT IS A SUSTAINABLE MODEL
10 ECONOMICALLY, BUT ONE THAT SUPPORTS, AS COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA
11 JUST STATED, WHAT THEY DO IN JAPAN, WHICH IS DEVELOP A
12 TRANSPORTATION ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT PATTERN THAT SUPPORTS
13 RIDERSHIP IN TRANSPORTATION. IT IS RELATED. SO, I THINK THAT
14 IT IS A JUSTIFIABLE EXPENSE. AS THE TWO OF US WHO ARE GOING
15 DID NOT GO LAST TIME. AND WE ARE ON THE BAHFA BOARD NOW, AND
16 IT WILL BE ON US TO DO THIS. I -- ANYWAY, I'M JUST MAKING MY
17 PITCH FOR WHY THIS IS IMPORTANT THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.

20

21 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH I'M GOING TO AGREE WITH MY
22 COLLEAGUE COMMISSIONER MELGAR AND SAY LOOK WE HAVE GOT TO GET
23 A CLEAR VISION OF WHAT'S POSSIBLE AND WE MAY NOT TAKE THE SAME
24 ROAD TO GET TO THE SAME OUTCOME THAT VIENNA HAS BUT IT'S
25 USEFUL TO SEE WORKING MODELS AND THAT'S THE PURPOSE OF THIS



JULY 23, 2025

1 TRIP AND I THINK THE MODERN THAT WE LEARN ABOUT OPTIONS THAT
2 ARE AVAILABLE AROUND THE WORLD THE BETTER OFF WE'LL BE. SO I'M
3 LOOKING FORWARD TO ATTENDING AND COMING BACK AND SHARING WHAT
4 WE LEARN.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. AND AS ONE WHO TOOK THE TRIP
9 LAST YEAR. IT WAS EXTREMELY EDUCATIONAL. FOR THOSE WHO ARE
10 CONCERNED WE WORKED HARD FROM 8R 8:00 A.M. UNTIL INTO THE
11 EVENING EVERY DAY, AND AGAIN I'LL SAY, I KNOW IT'S CHALLENGING
12 AND SOMETIMES WE GET QUESTIONS FROM OUR CONSTITUENTS, BUT I
13 REALLY DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO GET OUT OF OUR OWN
14 BUBBLE TO SEE WHAT'S GOING IN THE REST OF THE WORLD AND LEARN
15 BEST PRACTICES. AND I WOULD SAY IT WAS EXTREMELY BENEFICIAL
16 FOR ME. THERE ARE SOME ELEMENTS FROM THAT TRIP THAT WE ARE NOW
17 WORKING ON, SPECIFICALLY HERE IN THE BAY AREA. SO, I THINK THE
18 MORE OF US WHO CAN EXPERIENCE AND SEE THAT IN-PERSON IS
19 HELPFUL. SO, I AGREE, I THINK THERE IS SOME GOOD
20 TRANSPORTATION TRIPS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT
21 SENDING FOLKS TO AS WELL, AND I DIFFERENCE IS, YOU KNOW, I DID
22 THIS LAST TRIP ON MY OWN PERSONAL TIME AND MADE, YOU KNOW, GOT
23 IN BECAUSE OF SOME CONNECTIONS, BUT IT'S A LOT HARDER TO DO,
24 AND IT'S EASIER IF YOU'RE GOING ON AN OFFICIAL DELEGATION TRIP
25 TO MEET WITH THE APPROPRIATE PEOPLE. SO, I VERY MUCH SUPPORT



JULY 23, 2025

1 THE IDEA. SO, I WILL BE SUPPORTING THIS. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN?

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA'S LAST COMMENTS,
6 AND JUST MAYBE REASSURE THE PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL WORK TRAVEL
7 IS ACTUALLY QUITE HARD. AND I HAVE DONE A LITTLE BIT MYSELF
8 IT'S ALMOST AROUND THE CLOCK FOR COMMISSIONERS TO GO ON THESE
9 KINDS OF TRIPS COMMISSIONERS WILLING TO DO THIS PUBLIC SERVICE
10 MAYBE AS A REQUEST TO STAFF I DON'T HAVE A SENSE, WHAT A
11 MISSING MAYBE A HALF STREET DESCRIBING TAKE-AWAY'S FROM THIS
12 KIND OF TRIP WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR BOTH COMMISSIONERS AND THE
13 PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER LEE DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?
16 COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT FIRST. DON'T KNOW WHO WAS SIGNALING ME
17 FIRST.

18

19 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I ALWAYS THINK OF HER AS A
20 CONGRESSWOMAN AND WOULD ALWAYS DEFER. BUT I WANTED TO MAKE A
21 POINT THAT I DO SUPPORT THIS TRIP. THE INTERSECTIONALITY OF
22 HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, AND CLIMATE CHANGE IS UNDENIABLE. AND
23 WE HAVE TO LEARN HOW TO DO BETTER. A MONTH OR TWO AGO NPR DID
24 A PIECE ON HOUSING AND CLIMATE CHANGE AND WITH THEY FEATURED
25 SOME HOUSING MODELS IN VIENNA. SO, I WAS HAPPY TO HEAR VICE



JULY 23, 2025

1 CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS SAY THAT THERE WOULD BE A REPORT BACK. I
2 THINK I WOULD ALSO LOVE TO SEE THE CITY AGENDA AND TAKE-AWAY'S
3 BUT I VERY AM LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM THE DELEGATION WHEN
4 THEY RETURN. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER LEE?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO MENTION WHY I SUPPORT THIS
9 VISIT. BECAUSE I HAVE VISITED VEENKER A I HAVE VISITED CORTINA
10 BRAZIL AND SEVERAL INTERNATIONAL CITIES AND WHERE THE
11 INTEGRATION OF TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, CLIMATE INITIATIVES
12 ARE COMBINED AND CREATE WHAT I LIKE TO USE AS A MODEL,
13 FRUITVALE TRANSIT VILLAGE IN OAKLAND. SO, I THINK WE NEED TO
14 LOOK AT HOUSING IN A DIFFERENT AND BROADER PERSPECTIVE IN
15 TERMS OF ACCESS, IN TERMS OF TRANSPORTATION, AND IN TERMS OF
16 THE ENVIRONMENT. AND THAT'S THE WAY OF THE FUTURE. AND, SO, I
17 WOULD CERTAINLY BELIEVE THAT FOR A TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION,
18 THAT HOUSING IS DEFINITELY ESSENTIAL TO OUR DECISIONS THAT WE
19 MAKE HERE.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE? JUST A FINAL NOTE
22 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE MY COLLEAGUE'S COMMENTS
25 HERE. AGAIN, I WILL BE CONSISTENT ON THIS IN THAT I THINK



JULY 23, 2025

1 WE'RE BEING A BIT REDUNDANT AND MANY OF US HAVE STUDIED THE
2 VIENNA MODEL AND ITS APPLICATION IS LIMITED HERE AND AS
3 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AS NOTED WE HAVE TAKEN BACK WHAT WE
4 RECEIVED INFORMATION LAST TIME. SO, MY PREFERENCE IS I AND
5 BELIEVE ME, I REPRESENT AN INTERMODAL CENTER, THE LARGEST ONE
6 IN THE BAY AREA, AND WE CAN DO MUCH, MUCH BETTER. BUT I DO
7 THINK THAT FOCUS SHOULD BE SHIFTED TO TRANSPORTATION. SO,
8 AGAIN, TO MY COLLEAGUES, WE DEFINITELY REPORT BACK ON ALL
9 TRAVELS THAT HAPPEN HERE. BUT I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO EMPHASIZE
10 ANY SIGNIFICANT CHANGES, WHICH I DON'T THINK CURRENTLY EXIST.
11 SO, WITH THAT, AGAIN, I WILL STICK TO MY POINT HERE IS THAT I
12 THINK WE NEED TO REEMPHASIZE THE CONNECTION, AS COMMISSIONER
13 ABE-KOGA POINTED OUT, IN OTHER JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE DOING
14 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION IN A WAY THAT I DON'T THINK WE HAVE
15 YET SEEN. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. IF THAT'S IT FOR COMMENTS, DO I HAVE
18 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
21 THIS ITEM, HOWEVER, DO I SEE MICHAEL BALDINI'S HAND IS RAISED.
22 MR. BALDINI, IF YOU WILL GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU
23 WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

24

25 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** GOOD MORNING. GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU. THE --



JULY 23, 2025

1 THIS COMES UP EVERY YEAR, PARTICULARLY THIS -- THIS EVENT. AND
2 I APPRECIATE THE TRANSPARENCY AND THE -- AND I SUPPORT THESE
3 TRIPS, AS A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND AS
4 MYSELF, FROM NAPA, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. AND I APPRECIATE
5 COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENT ABOUT LET'S -- LET'S BROADEN OUR
6 VIEWPOINT, OUR PERSPECTIVE BY -- BY -- AND AS COMMISSIONER
7 ABE-KOGA -- EXCUSE ME -- PRESENTED ABOUT HER TRIP TO ASIA
8 PARTICULARLY JAPAN THAT, WE TAKE A LOOK AT THESE OTHER --
9 OTHER PLACES. BUT, THERE IS A TRUST IN VERIFY, SO REPORT-OUT
10 TO THE COMMUNITY, TO THE REST OF THE COMMISSIONERS, TO THE
11 PUBLIC, I THINK IS VERY PERSONALITY. BUT I FULLY SUPPORT THESE
12 -- THESE OBSERVATIONS, AND OTHER PERSPECTIVE ON HOW WE COULD
13 ADOPT BEST PRACTICES HERE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] AND HERE IN THE
14 BAY AREA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
17 RAISED.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. 8C, DO I HAVE A MOTION?

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE ABE-KOGA.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SECOND MOULTON-PETERS.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL



JULY 23, 2025

1 VOTE?

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. WITH A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER ABE-
4 KOGA, SECONDED BY MOULTON-PETERS?

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** VICE CHAIR.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

21

22 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JAN B IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LEE?
4 MAHAN?

5

6 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN.

9

10 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR?

13

14 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** ABSTAIN.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** NO.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. THE MOTION PASSES WITH
25 ONE ABSTENTION, ONE NO. THE MOTION PASSES. THANK YOU.



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM NINE
3 WHICH IS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT.
4 COMMISSIONER MELGAR, IN THE ABSENCE OF COMMISSIONER FLEMING,
5 WILL YOU PLEASE GIFT REPORT?

6

7 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. THE PROGRAMMING AND
8 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET JULY 9TH, 2025 AND REFERRED SEVEN
9 ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL SIX OF WHICH WERE ON THE
10 CONSENT CALENDAR AND THE OTHER IS AS FOLLOWS AGENDA ITEM 9A
11 MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4706 REVISED, FISCAL YEAR 2025, '26
12 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM AMENDMENTS;
13 AMENDMENTS 2025/2026 RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM TO SUPPORT
14 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MARIN SONOMA COOPERATED TRANSIT SERVICE
15 MASCOTS PLAN. I LOVE THE NAME. [LAUGHTER] I MOVE APPROVAL OF
16 MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4706 REVISED.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE A MOTION. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND. ABE-KOGA.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS ON THIS
23 ITEM? OKAY. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I



JULY 23, 2025

1 SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO ONE
2 HAS APPROACHED PODIUM.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANN?

19

20 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

23

24 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

2

3 **PAT BURT:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JAN B IS ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN?

10

11 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE MANNER FREE? MASHBURN?

12

13 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY? PAPAN? RAMOS IS ABSENT.

16 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AND WE'LL MOVE ON TO 9B?

19

20 **MYRNA MELGAR:** YES ITEM 9B WAS ADDED AFTER THE PROGRAMMING AND

21 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING TO ADDRESS A TIME SENSITIVE

22 MATTER OF POTENTIAL LAPSING FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION

23 FORMULA FUND. SO, STAFF HAS AN UPDATE. AND IS RECOMMENDING

24 THIS ITEM BE PULLED AS IT IS NO LONGER NECESSARY GIVEN ACTIONS

25 SINCE THE AGENDA WAS POSTED.



JULY 23, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I GUESS WE DON'T NEED -- DO WE NEED PUBLIC
7 COMMENT ON NO ACTION?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SURE. YEAH.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SURE. ANYBODY A PUBLIC COMMENT ON A PULLED
12 ITEM.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING FOR SAID ITEM
15 AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO HAND RAISED IN THE
16 ZOOM SPACE.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ASSUMING NO COMMISSION COMMENTS ON THE PULL
19 ITEM? GREAT. MOVING TO ITEM TEN WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT OR
20 OTHER BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS OR MEMBERS OF
21 THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, I
24 SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN THE
25 ZOOM SPACE ROLAND LEBRUN GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU HAVE



JULY 23, 2025

1 TWO MINUTES.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU THIS IS GOING TO BE VERY BRIEF THERE HAVE
4 BEEN VARIOUS COMMENTS DURING THIS MEETING ABOUT JAPAN, AND HOW
5 THEY FINANCE RAILWAYS. AND I WAS IN JAPAN LAST YEAR, AND I
6 VISITED THE PENINSULA, AND I CAME ACROSS ONE OF THOSE LINES.
7 AND THEN WHEN I STARTED BACK TRACKING, I DISCOVERED THAT THAT
8 LINE WAS ONE OF, I THINK EIGHT OR TEN RAILWAY LINES OWNED BY
9 PRIVATE COMPANY KNOWN AS THE TOKYU CORPORATION, SPELLED T-O-K-
10 Y-U. AND I JUST WENT ON TO WIKIPEDIA, THERE IS A GREAT ARTICLE
11 TELLING YOU EXACTLY HOW THESE PRIVATE COMPANIES ARE ABLE TO BE
12 PROFITABLE, WHICH IS, QUITE FRANKLY THIS IS WHAT SHOULD BE
13 HAPPENING TO CALTRAIN IF IT WAS A PRIVATE COMPANY. AND THEY'RE
14 NOT JUST PROFITING FROM OPERATING RAILWAYS, BUT THEY ALSO HAVE
15 CHAINS OF HOTELS, YOU KNOW, SHOPPING CENTERS, ET CETERA. SO,
16 THERE ARE SOME GREAT READING TO START OUR DAY, BUT THE KEY
17 POINT IS THAT THIS IS A PRIVATE BUSINESS. THIS IS NOT PUBLIC
18 TRANSPORTATION AS WE KNOW IT IN THE UNITED STATES. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AND WE HAVE ONE PERSON IN THE
21 BOARDROOM. ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND TURN ON THE MICROPHONE.
22 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA
25 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I'M TIRED



JULY 23, 2025

1 TODAY. I GOT A LONG DAY AHEAD OF ME. HOPEFULLY I DON'T FALL
2 ASLEEP AT THE THEATRE. I THINK A VERY BIG ISSUE ON MY FRONT
3 BURNER, AT LEAST, THAT WE HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND IS CLIPPER2. WE
4 DON'T HAVE A START DATE FOR THAT YET. AND WE'LL KNOW IT WHEN
5 THEY SAY SO. I'M WAITING FOR IT, PROBABLY MORE THAN ANYBODY.
6 AS IT WILL OPEN UP A LOT OF NEW POSSIBILITIES. RECENTLY I
7 STARTED USING THE SPARE CAPPING FEATURE OF AC TRANSIT. THEY
8 HAVE AN AP, THIS TOKEN APP THEY WORK WITH. I'M PROBABLY THE
9 ONLY PERSON TESTIFYING ABOUT IT AT A MEETING I ONLY JUST
10 LEARNED ABOUT THIS. APPS ARE GOOD AND TRYING TO IMPROVE AWAY
11 FROM PAPER TICKETS. AND HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE LESS CASH ON THE
12 SYSTEM. CASH DOESN'T DO MUCH FOR YOU WHEN IT'S JUST SITTING
13 AROUND. AT LEAST IF IT'S IN THE BANK IT'S GETTING LENT OUT AND
14 THINGS ARE BEING DONE WITH IT. BUT, YET, CLIPPER2, \$465
15 MILLION INVESTMENT. I REMEMBER THAT MEETING IN IT WASN'T 18,
16 JAKE -- HOW DO I FORGET HIS NAME JAKE MACKENZIE WAS CHAIRING,
17 I WROTE A LETTER TO YOU ALL THEN THAT I COMPOSED ON A CHICAGO
18 TRAIN BACK THEN AND E-MAILED IT FOREMOST BECAUSE IT'S A
19 PROGRAM THAT TOUCHES MILLIONS OF PEOPLE I ASK ALL OF YOU AS A
20 BOARD TO GET BEHIND CLIPPER2 AND ENSURE THAT GETS TURNED ON.
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
24 RAISED HANDS.

25



JULY 23, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM 11 WHICH IS
2 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN
3 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY
4 AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET ON WEDNESDAY SEPTEMBER
5 24TH, 2025. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED
6 TO THE PUBLIC. AND WE ARE ADJOURNED. [MEETING ADJOURNED]