

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



January 22, 2021

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

2 **FRIDAY, JANUARY 22, 2021, 2:00 PM**

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BROADCASTING TEAM, YOU CAN PLEASE PLAY THE  
5 ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE  
6 TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR,  
7 PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH  
8 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING  
9 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON  
10 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME,  
11 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE  
12 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST  
13 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR  
14 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS  
15 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD  
16 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR  
17 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE  
18 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR  
19 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR  
20 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS  
21 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT  
22 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO  
23 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE  
24 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD  
25 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR



January 22, 2021

1 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE  
2 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.  
3 PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO  
4 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE  
5 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WELCOME EVERYBODY. SO, I WANT  
8 TO START WITH A COUPLE OF BRIEF ANNOUNCEMENTS. AND FIRST OF  
9 ALL, CAN EVERYBODY HEAR ME? GOOD. OKAY. SO, FIRST OF ALL, I  
10 WANTED TO ANNOUNCE THAT CAT CARTER WILL NO LONGER BE SERVING  
11 ON THIS COMMITTEE, AND WE WILL WELCOME MARK CORDES OF SAN  
12 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. WE WILL NOW TO A ROLL CALL, AND  
13 WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A  
14 QUORUM FOR TODAY'S MEETING.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO, AND IT WILL BE BY LAST NAME. BOB  
17 ALLEN? OKAY. ABIGAIL COCHRAN IS EXCUSED. MARK CORDES?

18

19 **MARK CORDES:** I'M HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ELDRED?

22

23 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GRIFFITHS?



January 22, 2021

1

2 **IAN GRIFFITHS: HERE.**

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: HARTMAN?**

5

6 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN: HERE.**

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: HEDGES. RICH HEDGES? KALLINS?**

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR: HERE.**

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: KASS?**

13

14 **JONATHON KASS : HERE.**

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: KINMAN?**

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN: HERE.**

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: LEVIN?**

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR: HERE.**

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD: LITVAK?**

25



January 22, 2021

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MONICA MALLON.

4

5 **MONICA MALLON:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MENDOZA?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** STANKE? IS JOINING AUDIO.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** MAY I HAVE APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF  
16 NOVEMBER 2ND MEETING. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE  
17 THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 2ND?

18

19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SO MOVED. ELDRED.

20

21 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** HARTMAN, SECOND.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** CAN THE CLERK RED ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS IF  
24 WE HAVE GOTTEN ANY ON THIS ITEM AND IF NOT, THEN TO MOVE ON TO  
25 A ROLL CALL OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS.



January 22, 2021

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED ON  
3 THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
4 HANDS RAISED. AND THE MOTION WAS MADE BY ELDRED AND SECONDED  
5 BY HARTMAN. [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
6 MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. OKAY. SO WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON  
9 TO RECEIVE A PRESENTATION FROM STAFF, FROM BILL BACON AND  
10 MICHAEL EISEMAN, WHOLE PRESENT ON AGENDA ITEM FIVE, PATHWAYS  
11 TO INTEGRATION ALTERNATIVE FARE POLICIES AND EVALUATION  
12 FRAMEWORKS. AND LOOKING FORWARD TO THIS VERY SUBSTANTIVE  
13 PRESENTATION ABOUT MANY DIFFERENT WAYS OF INTEGRATING AND  
14 COORDINATING FARES. SO, WE'LL TURN THIS OVER TO THE STAFF  
15 PRESENTATION.

16

17 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU ADINA, AND SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS. IT'S  
18 NICE TO SEE YOU THIS AFTERNOON. I HOPE EVERYONE IS DOING OKAY  
19 IN THESE INTERESTING TIMES THAT WE'RE ALL LIVING THROUGH. WE  
20 CAN GO AHEAD AND BRING UP THE SLIDES, PLEASE. THANKS. SO THIS,  
21 ACTUALLY, THIS PRESENTATION COVERS BOTH ITEMS 4 AND 5 ON THE  
22 AGENDA TODAY, JUST FOR CLARITY'S SAKE, AND FOR THE RECORD. AND  
23 WE'RE GOING TO FIRST PROVIDE SOME BACKGROUND ABOUT WHAT THE  
24 PROJECT TEAM HAS BEEN DOING SINCE THIS SUBCOMMITTEE LAST MET  
25 TWO MONTHS AGO, PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF OUR SCHEDULE AND SORT



January 22, 2021

1 OF WHAT THE PATH FORWARD LOOKS LIKE THEN A REAL SUBSTANTIVE  
2 DISCUSSION WE WANT TO HAVE TODAY AND I THINK MIKE EISEMAN  
3 PROJECT MANAGER IS GOING TO MEET US IS REALLY DIGGING INTO THE  
4 FARE POLICY IDEAS AND CONCEPTS THAT THE PROJECT TEAM IS  
5 LOOKING AT, AND THAT WILL BE, EVENTUALLY, SELECTING A SHORT  
6 LIST FROM WHICH TO GO INTO IN DEPTH ANALYSIS IN THE COMING  
7 MONTHS. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. AS I MENTIONED, WE'RE IN THE  
8 PROCESS, RIGHT NOW, OF REALLY TRYING TO PUT TOGETHER WHAT  
9 WE'RE CALLING SORT OF A LONG LIST OF FARE POLICY ALTERNATIVES,  
10 AND THAT'S WHAT WE WANT TO DISCUSS WITH YOU TODAY, AND THAT'S  
11 GOING TO BE THE FOCUS ON MOST OF THE TIME. YOU WILL RECALL AT  
12 OUR LAST MEETING IN NOVEMBER AND FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO FOLLOWED  
13 THE FARE INTEGRATION MEETING NOVEMBER 7TH ARE PATHWAYS TO  
14 INTEGRATION FOUR DIFFERENT GOVERNANCE MODELS THAT GUIDE WHAT  
15 TYPES OF FARE POLICY CHANGES THE REGION COULD ACHIEVE AND THE  
16 IDEAS WE COULD SUCCESSFULLY IMPLEMENT BASED ON THE DIFFERENT  
17 APPROACHES TO GOVERNANCE. AND I'LL GO THROUGH THAT A LITTLE  
18 BIT MORE IN DEPTH IN THIS PRESENTATION, AS A REMINDER FOR  
19 THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVEN'T SEEN IT. BUT THAT'S SORT OF FRAMING  
20 RIGHT NOW IN TERMS OF TRYING TO DEVELOP A LIST OF ALTERNATIVES  
21 FOR EACH PATHWAY OF INTEGRATION OR QUADRANT AS YOU WILL SEE  
22 LATER IN THE SLIDES. IN FEBRUARY WE'RE GOING TO BE PRESENTING  
23 TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE, THE LONG LIST OF OPTIONS  
24 WE LOOKED AT, PRIORITIZE PROCESS FOR HOW WE WHITTLE THAT DOWN  
25 TO IMPORTANTLY A SHORT LIST OF OPTION THAT IS THE TEAM WILL BE



January 22, 2021

1 RECOMMENDING A DETAILED IN DEPTH ANALYSIS IN THIS CASE WHICH  
2 WE'LL MOVE FORWARD. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, THIS  
3 IS THE ITEM FOUR PORTION, SO WE CAN CONTINUE ON. THANKS. SO  
4 THIS IS A RECAP A BIT OF OUR PROJECT SCHEDULE AND I THINK MANY  
5 OF YOU ARE PROBABLY FAMILIAR WITH THIS. BUT WE KICKED OFF THE  
6 PROJECT IN THE SPRING OF 2020. OUR STAFF WORKING GROUP, OUR  
7 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE, OUR CONSULTING TEAM LED BY STEER  
8 BEGAN WORKING AT THAT POINT, THE SUBCOMMITTEE TEAM AT THIS  
9 TIME, THROUGHOUT THE PERIOD SINCE LAST SUMMER WE HAVE BEEN  
10 DOING DETAILED ANALYSIS OF EXISTING FARE POLICIES WITHIN THE  
11 REGION UNDERSTANDING THE TRAVEL MARKETS THAT USERS WERE  
12 EXPERIENCING BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. WE HAVE LOOKED AT FARE  
13 POLICIES BEST PRACTICES FROM OTHER REGIONS AND WE HAVE BEEN  
14 DOING USER RESEARCH IN A PANDEMIC TRUNCATED WAY BUT FIGURE OUT  
15 WAYS TO BEST IMPLEMENT THE SYSTEM. IN DECEMBER WE'RE IN THE  
16 PROCESS OF IDENTIFYING THOSE DETAILED FARE POLICY ALTERNATIVES  
17 THAT WE WANT TO ANALYZE. WE'RE HERE TODAY ON THE 25th OF  
18 JANUARY, AND -- I'M SORRY -- NOT THE 25th OF JANUARY -- WE'RE  
19 ON THE 22nd OF JANUARY. BUT ON THE 25th OF JANUARY WE'LL BE  
20 UPDATING OUR BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE WHICH YOU ARE ALL FAMILIAR  
21 WITH, AND THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS FOCUSED ON HOW TO  
22 BRING BACK A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT IS STRONGER AND MORE  
23 SUSTAINABLE AFTER THE PANDEMIC, AND THAT BODY IS INTERESTED IN  
24 LEARNING ABOUT THIS WORK SO THERE WILL BE A SMALL PRESENTATION  
25 TO UPDATE THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ABOUT THE WORK OF THE





January 22, 2021

1 FARE INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION PROJECT. SO, AGAIN, LOOKING  
2 FORWARD INTO THE SPRING AND SUMMER OF THIS YEAR. WE WILL BE  
3 IDEALLY IDENTIFYING THAT SHORT LIST OF ALTERNATIVES WHICH WE  
4 DO A DETAILED BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS SO WE'RE LOOKING AT THE  
5 FINANCIAL IMPACTS, THE RIDERSHIP IMPACTS, THESE ARE EXPERIENCE  
6 IMPACTS OF CHANGES TO OUR FARE SYSTEM. AND IDEALLY WE'RE  
7 HOPING TO WRAP UP THIS PROJECT IN THE SUMMER THIS OF YEAR, AND  
8 THAT WILL, HOPEFULLY PROVIDE A TEMPLATE FOR HOW THE REGION CAN  
9 MOVE FORWARD, THE FARE POLICY. NEXT SLIDE. WE HAVE SEEN A  
10 VERSION OF THIS SLIDE IN PAST PRESENTATIONS IT'S WHERE WE ARE  
11 WITH PROJECT TASKS. THE COLORED BOX ON THE LEFT REPRESENT THE  
12 MAIN SEVEN PROJECT TASKS THAT WERE IN OUR CONTRACT WITH OUR  
13 CONSULTING TEAM AND WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW. SO YOU CAN SEE,  
14 AGAIN, I MENTIONED MOST OF THESE THINGS, BUT WE'RE IN THE  
15 MIDST OF A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT ELEMENTS OF THE WORK, AND THE  
16 MAIN AREA THAT HAS BEEN COMPLETED, SORT OF IN LOOKING BEHIND  
17 US NOW REALLY THE EXISTING CONDITIONS AND BACKGROUND RESEARCH  
18 AND PRETTY MUCH THE REST OF THE PROJECT TASKS ARE UNDERWAY  
19 RIGHT NOW, AND WE'RE CONTINUING WITH ALL OF THESE. GO ON TO  
20 THE NEXT SLIDE. SO OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS SINCE THE  
21 SUBCOMMITTEE LAST MET, WE HAVE BEEN DOING TWO MAIN AREAS OF  
22 USER RESEARCH ACTIVITIES THAT JUST WRAPPED UP A SERIES OF  
23 INTERVIEWS WITH TRANSIT RIDERS. IF YOU RECALL WE HAD DEVELOPED  
24 A DATABASE OF HUNDREDS OF DIFFERENT TRANSIT RIDERS WHO SHARED  
25 WITH US DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION ABOUT THEMSELVES AND WE WERE



January 22, 2021

1 ABLE TO IDENTIFY DIFFERENT SUBSETS OF TRANSIT USERS FROM  
2 DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION WITH DIFFERENT CHARACTERISTIC,  
3 WITH DIFFERENT INCOME LEVELS, DISABILITIES STATUS AND WIDE  
4 RANGE OF DIFFERENT CRITERIA. WE SELECTED A NUMBER OF  
5 INDIVIDUALS TO DO ONE-ON-ONE INTERVIEWS WITH SO ACTUALLY A  
6 MEMBER OF OUR CONSULTANT TEAM WHO IS A USER SPECIALIST AND ONE  
7 MEMBER OF THE STAFF, PROJECT TEAM, SAT IN ON EACH OF THE  
8 INTERVIEWS WITH THE PUBLIC. AND I CAN TELL YOU JUST FROM MY  
9 PERSONAL EXPERIENCE SITTING IN ON INTERVIEWS IT WAS INSPIRING  
10 FOR ME AND MADE ME FEEL EVEN MORE DEDICATED TO ADVANCING THIS  
11 WORK JUST HEARING FROM USERS AND PROBABLY FOR MANY OF US  
12 DURING THE PANDEMIC IT'S BEEN AN ISOLATING EXPERIENCE IN MANY  
13 WAYS BECAUSE WE'RE NOT ABLE TO INTERACT WITH PEOPLE SORT OF ON  
14 A HAPPENSTANCE BASIS, JUST ABOUT GOING ABOUT OUR TRAVELS IN  
15 THE REGION. SO THIS WAS REALLY INSPIRING FOR ME, AND WE'RE  
16 STILL CHRONICLING ALL OF THE DIFFERENT THEMES AND STORIES THAT  
17 WE HEARD FROM USERS ABOUT THEIR EXPERIENCE TRAVELING BY  
18 TRANSIT IN THE REGION, AND SPECIFICALLY HOW FARE POLICY SHAPES  
19 THE WAY THAT THEY USE THE SYSTEM OR DON'T USE THE SYSTEM IN  
20 MANY INSTANCES. SO THAT IS AN AREA OF WORK WHERE WE ARE  
21 WRAPPING UP OUR ANALYSIS RIGHT NOW AND WILL BE PRESENTING THE  
22 ANALYSIS TO THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ON FEBRUARY 16TH.  
23 OUR CURRENT MAIN AREA OF USER RESEARCH IS FOCUSED ON USING AN  
24 ONLINE SURVEY TOOL CALLED SENSEMAKER AND WE HAVE SHARED WITH  
25 ALL OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS LAST WEEK, AND I'LL GET INTO



January 22, 2021

1 THIS A BIT MORE IN A MINUTE, BUT WE'RE ACTIVELY SHARING THAT  
2 ACROSS THE REGION AND OUR TRANSIT AGENCY PARTNERS ARE HELPING  
3 WITH THAT. AND THEN AS WE MOVE FORWARD, WE WILL BE DOING QUITE  
4 A BIT MORE USER RESEARCH IN FACT THE VAST MAJORITY OF OUR USER  
5 RESOURCE BUDGET OF THE PROJECT REMAINS AND THAT IS INTENDED TO  
6 BE USED ONCE WE HAVE ALTERNATIVES THAT WE'RE STUDYING DOING  
7 WORKSHOPS, INTERVIEWS, PROTOTYPE TESTING AND VARIETY OF USER  
8 RESEARCH ACTIVITIES IN THE COMING MONTHS OF SPRING. NEXT  
9 SLIDE. RECAPPING WHAT I SAID A MOMENT AGO ABOUT THE ONE-ON-ONE  
10 INTERVIEWS. BUT HERE WE LIST A FEW OF SORT OF QUESTIONS AND  
11 THEMES THAT WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO GET AT, TRYING TO BETTER  
12 UNDERSTAND, AGAIN, HOW PEOPLE USE THE SYSTEM, AND EXPERIENCED  
13 IT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, AND NOW DURING IT. WHY THEY'RE  
14 TRAVELING THE DIFFERENT MODES AND OPERATORS THEY'RE USING.  
15 TRIED TO DIG INTO UNDERSTANDING THE ELIGIBILITY AND FARE  
16 PAYMENT OPTIONS THAT USERS HAVE ACCESS TO TODAY, AND HOW THAT  
17 SYSTEM IS REALLY INTELLIGIBLE, AND LEGIBLE FOR PEOPLE TO  
18 EXPLAIN. I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS THAT MOST STOOD OUT TO ME  
19 IN THE INTERVIEWS THEY WAS A PARTICIPANT IN, WAS HOW  
20 CHALLENGING IT WAS, ACTUALLY, FOR PEOPLE TO DESCRIBE IT. WE  
21 TYPICALLY ASKED A QUESTION, IF YOU WERE TO DESCRIBE A BRAND-  
22 NEW RESIDENT TO THE BAY AREA SOMEONE WHO JUST MOVED HERE, HOW  
23 THE BAY AREA'S FARE SYSTEM WORKED IF YOU WANTED TO GO TO  
24 OAKLAND FROM HAHN SO FOR EXAMPLE, ON TRANSIT IT WAS VERY  
25 CHALLENGING FOR MANY PEOPLE. MANY PEOPLE ACTUALLY LAUGHED IN



January 22, 2021

1 RESPONSE TO THE QUESTION BECAUSE THEY FOUND IT A DIFFICULT  
2 QUESTION TO ANSWER. THESE ARE TERMS OF NEAR AND AFFORDABILITY  
3 UNDERSTANDING HOW CURRENT FARES AFFECT ACCESS AND OPPORTUNITY  
4 AND PRESENTED A RANGE OF DIFFERENT FARE POLICY SCENARIOS TO  
5 USERS AND AN EXAMPLE WAS WE WOULD ASK USERS ABOUT A PRODUCT  
6 THAT CURRENTLY EXISTS IN SAN FRANCISCO, IT'S CALLED THE GATOR  
7 PASS AND IT'S AVAILABLE TO STUDENTS AT SAN FRANCISCO STATE  
8 UNIVERSITY AND PROVIDES A DISCOUNT WHEN TRAVELING TO AND FROM  
9 THE DALY CITY BART STATION AND PROVIDES ACCESS TO THE MUNI  
10 SYSTEM, AND IS A PART OF THEIR STUDENT FEE -- A BENEFIT OF THE  
11 STUDENT FEES THAT STUDENTS AT SF STATE PAY. AND WE SORT OF  
12 EXPANDED FROM THAT, YOU KNOW, TALKING ABOUT WHAT ARE THE RIGHT  
13 KINDS OF FARE POLICY TO OFFER TO STUDENTS AND WHAT ARE THE  
14 SORT OF FARE DISCOUNTS THAT STUDENTS REALLY SHOULD HAVE ACCESS  
15 TO AROUND THE REGION AND IT WAS REALLY INTERESTING TO HEAR,  
16 AGAIN, THE DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES ABOUT HOW DISCOUNTS ARE  
17 OFFERED OR NOT OFFERED TO DIFFERENT GROUPS OF PEOPLE IN OUR  
18 REGION. SO, AGAIN, WE'LL BE SUMMARIZING THIS WORK AT THE FARE  
19 INTEGRATION TASK FORCE IN FEBRUARY. YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT  
20 SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, THE SENSEMAKER TOOLS IS OUR CURRENT AREA OF  
21 WORK. AND AS OF YESTERDAY, WE HAD A LITTLE OVER 400 RESPONSES,  
22 SO FAR, IN THE SURVEY, IN A LITTLE LESS THAN A WEEK. THANK YOU  
23 TO THOSE OF YOU ON THE SUBCOMMITTEE WHO SHARED IT WE HAVE HAD  
24 FROM OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS WHO HELPED US THROUGHOUT THE PROJECT  
25 THEY HAVE BEEN SHARING IT AS WELL AND WE'RE TRYING TO GET THE



January 22, 2021

1 WORD OUT AS BROADLY AS POSSIBLE. PLEASE FEEL FREE TO SHARE  
2 WITH OTHERS. I THOUGHT ABOUT MAYBE PULLING UP THE LINK HERE  
3 BUT I WON'T DO THAT TODAY. BUT IF FOLKS HAVE QUESTIONS AND  
4 WANT TO PROVIDE MORE FEEDBACK OR THOUGHTS ABOUT THE SURVEY,  
5 PLEASE FEEL FREE TO GET TOUCH WITH STAFF OFFLINE OR MAYBE  
6 LATER IN THE MEETING YOU WE CAN TAKE QUESTIONS. ONE OF THE  
7 DISTINCT FEATURES OF THE TOOL IS IT REALLY COMBINED  
8 QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE INFORMATION, AND OUR CONSULTANTS  
9 HAVE HAD SOME REALLY GOOD EXPERIENCES, I THINK, WITH THIS  
10 PLATFORM. I THINK THERE WERE MAYBE SOME USER INTERFACE  
11 CHALLENGES THAT PEOPLE EXPERIENCE, BUT OVERALL, BASED ON THE  
12 NUMBER OF RESPONSES WE HAVE HAD FOR MOST PEOPLE, IT'S BEEN  
13 WORKING OKAY. SO I'M GOING TO PAUSE THERE. THIS IS THE END OF  
14 THE SORT OF SECONDS, OR AGENDA ITEM FOUR PART OF THE  
15 PRESENTATION. JUST TO SEE IF ANYONE HAS ANY QUESTIONS BEFORE I  
16 GO ON INTO THE AGENDA ITEM FIVE, WHICH IS REALLY ABOUT THE  
17 ALTERNATIVES AND THE LONG LIST OF OPTIONS. OKAY. WELL, WE'LL  
18 GO AHEAD, ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT WAS -- OH, CAN YOU GO BACK? PUBLIC  
21 COMMENT.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY SO OUR -- [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] SO I  
24 WOULD --

25



January 22, 2021

1 **WILLIAM BACON:** PUBLIC COMMENT?

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO, I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT  
4 FROM -- CAN FOLKS HEAR ME? ALL RIGHT. SORRY. ZOOM DIDN'T  
5 PROPERLY MERGE MY PHONE. -- ZOOM -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I WILL TRY  
6 THAT AGAIN. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A COMMENT FROM MEMBERS OF  
7 THE PUBLIC AT THE END OF THE STAFF PRESENTATION, BUT I WANTED  
8 TO QUICKLY ASK A CLARIFYING QUESTION ABOUT THE SENSEMAKER  
9 TOOL, SENSEMAKER TOOL BUT WONDERING IF THERE IS GOING TO BE  
10 ANY INTERIM CHECKING ON THE DEMOGRAPHICS TO SEE IF THERE IS  
11 REPRESENTATION BY GEOGRAPHY, INCOME, AND ETHNICITY? AND IF,  
12 YOU KNOW, YOU GO X NUMBER OF WEEKS INTO IT AND YOU REALIZE  
13 THERE IS NO SPANISH SPEAKERS -- WELL, ACTUALLY, IF YOU COULD  
14 TALK ABOUT LANGUAGE IN A SECOND, TOO -- BUT -- IF THERE IS  
15 NOBODY FROM CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, THEN WE CAN MAKE SURE TO TRY  
16 AND GET MORE SAMPLING FROM PEOPLE THAT ARE UNDERREPRESENTED.

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** GOOD QUESTION. OUR CONSULTANTS ARE PROVIDING  
19 UPDATES REGULARLY. SO I DON'T HAVE ANSWERS TO EVERY SINGLE  
20 CRITERIA THAT YOU ASKED, BUT I CAN SAY IN TERMS OF A FEW  
21 DIFFERENT ONES, WE HAVE A PRETTY GOOD CROSS SECTION OF AGES,  
22 THE ONLY SEGMENT THAT IS NOT WELL REPRESENTED ARE PEOPLE UNDER  
23 THE AGE OF 18, SO, CHILDREN, WHICH I'M NOT SURE IS UNEXPECTED,  
24 JUST GIVEN -- YEAH -- I AM SURE THAT IS UNEXPECTED. BUT IN  
25 CASE FOLKS THINK THAT'S AN AUDIENCE WE SHOULD REACH OUT MORE



January 22, 2021

1 TO. IN TERMS OF INCOME, ABOUT 35 PERCENT, I BELIEVE, OF OUR  
2 RESPONDENTS LIVE IN-HOUSE HOLDS THAT MAKE LESS THAN \$49,000 A  
3 YEAR. SO THAT'S ABOUT 35 PERCENT OF OUR RESPONDENTS THAT ARE  
4 IN LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS RIGHT NOW. I WOULD SAY THE AREA THAT  
5 IS MOST OVER REPRESENTED ARE VERY HIGH INCOME, AND THE PEOPLE  
6 WHO LIVE IN-HOUSE HOLDS OF OVER \$200,000 A YEAR. THAT IS OVER  
7 REPRESENTED, BUT I THINK, ON THE LOW INCOME END OF THE  
8 SPECTRUM, WE'RE DOING OKAY IN TERMS OF REPRESENTATION. AND  
9 THEN IN TERMS OF THE COUNTIES OF RESPONDENTS SO FAR, THE AREAS  
10 THAT ARE DEFINITELY THE MOST CHALLENGING ARE SOLANO AND SONOMA  
11 COUNTIES. WE HAVE PRETTY GOOD REPRESENTATION FROM ALL OF THE  
12 OTHER COUNTIES IN THE REGION INCLUDING NAPA, BUT IN SOLANO AND  
13 SONOMA ARE LOWER END. IN FACT WE HAVE MORE RESPONDENTS THAT  
14 LIVE OUTSIDE THE NINE COUNTIES THAN WE HAVE WHO LIVE IN SONOMA  
15 AND SOLANO. THE DATA I'M REFERENCING ARE BASED ON WHEN WE HAD  
16 361 RESPONSES SO IT'S PROBABLY CHANGED MORE SINCE THEN, BUT  
17 THIS IS FROM A COUPLE OF DAYS AGO, WHICH WAS THE LAST SPECIFIC  
18 DATA I HAD.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** AND ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED HAD A HAND.

21

22 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR. I AM EXCITED TO  
23 SEE THE EVOLUTION OF THIS. I WANT TO STRESS THAT THE YOUTH  
24 VOICE ARE A REALLY IMPORTANT VOICE. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO  
25 CONNECT YOU WITH ORGANIZATIONS THAT HAVE PRETTY LARGE NETWORKS



January 22, 2021

1 OF YOUTH. MANY OF THEM ARE QUITE TRANSIT DEPENDENT. THAT'S AN  
2 IMPORTANT DEMOGRAPHIC. AND ALSO IF WE HAVE A SKEWS CURRENTLY  
3 OF FOLKS OVER 200,000, I'M CURIOUS, HOW MANY FOLKS ARE  
4 RENTERS? HOW MANY FOLKS ARE NOT IN STABLE HOUSING? THAT KIND  
5 OF THING? I'M JUST WONDERING HOW THOSE VOICES ARE DOING?

6

7 **WILLIAM BACON:** YEAH, IT'S AN IMPORTANT QUESTION. UNFORTUNATELY  
8 IN THE SENSEMAKER SURVEY ACTIVITY WE'RE NOT COLLECTING HOUSING  
9 TENURE QUESTIONS, IT'S THE TYPE OF SURVEY THAT'S REALLY A  
10 TRADEOFF BETWEEN LENGTH AND THOSE TYPE OF QUESTIONS ARE NOT  
11 SOMETHING WE INCLUDE. WE DID ASK QUESTIONS ABOUT TENURE IN OUR  
12 OVERALL USER DATABASE SURVEYS SO IN THE SENSE OF WHO WE WILL  
13 BE DOING INTERVIEWS WITH AND WHO WE WILL BE GOING BACK TO TALK  
14 TO THROUGH USER RESEARCH THAT ARE PART OF OUR PROJECT LIKE  
15 WORKSHOPS, AND PROTOTYPES, IN THAT ANALYSIS WE DO HAVE DATA ON  
16 THAT QUESTION SO WE WILL BE ABLE TO INVITE PEOPLE TO  
17 PARTICIPATE BASED ON DIFFERENT STATUSES OF HOUSING TENURE, BUT  
18 WE DON'T HAVE THAT FOR THIS SURVEY.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS HAD A HAND.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** YEAH. IT DIDN'T -- YOU KNOW, I WAS  
23 THINKING OF MARIN COUNTY WHEN I FORWARDED THE SURVEY. BUT I  
24 JUST THOUGHT OF A COUPLE OF PLACES YOU MIGHT GET MORE SONOMA  
25 COUNTY RESPONDENTS. THE SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION LAND USE





January 22, 2021

1 COALITION OTHER FRIENDS OF SMART, AND ALSO, THERE IS A LOT OF  
2 PEOPLE WHO WORK AT THE CIVIC CENTER, WHO I KNOW TAKE PUBLIC  
3 TRANSIT, AND I'M NOT EXACTLY SURE WHO IT WOULD GO TO AT THE  
4 MARIN COUNTY CIVIC CENTER, BUT THAT MIGHT BE ANOTHER OPTION. I  
5 CAN TAKE CARE OF THE FRIENDS OF SMART, AND THE SONOMA COUNTY  
6 LAND USE COALITION, I WILL FORWARD TO THEM. AND MAYBE THE  
7 COUNTY ADMINISTRATOR FOR MARIN COUNTY -- I'M NOT SURE. WAS IT  
8 SENT TO THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF SONOMA?

9

10 **WILLIAM BACON:** I THINK WE DID SHARE IT WITH OUR COUNTY  
11 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS. I'LL DOUBLE CHECK ON THAT.

12

13 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. I'LL MAKE A NOTE TO  
14 MYSELF.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ADRIENNE MENDOZA HAS A HAND.

17

18 **ADRIAN MENDOZA:** HI BILL. THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I LIVE  
19 IN SANTA ROSA, SO I HAVE THREE YEARS WITH THE PUBLIC RELATIONS  
20 DEPARTMENT IN SANTA ROSA JR. COLLEGE SO I HAVE CONNECTIONS  
21 THERE, I CAN PUT YOU THROUGH, THAT TAKES CARE OF SONOMA  
22 COUNTY, SANTA ROSA, AS WELL AS YOUTH DEMOGRAPHICS, SO IF YOU  
23 WANT TO CONTACT ME DIRECTLY OR HAVE STAFF CONTACT ME, I CAN  
24 FORWARD THAT TO MY CONTACTS AT SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE.  
25 THANK YOU.



January 22, 2021

1

2 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU. WE WILL FOR SURE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. AND SIMILARLY, WHILE I DOES WORK --  
5 THERE IS A NUMBER OF ORGANIZATIONS THAT WORK IN SAN MATEO  
6 COUNTY AND OTHER COUNTIES THERE ARE GROUPS WHERE IT'S POSSIBLE  
7 TO REACH YOUTH THAT WOULD BE A GOOD WAY TO ADDRESS THAT SET OF  
8 PEOPLE. I DO NOT SEE ANY MORE HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS  
9 GROUP. I WILL TAKE COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AT THE  
10 END. LOOKING FORWARD TO DIVING INTO THE REST OF THE  
11 PRESENTATION.

12

13 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU CHAIR LEVIN, AND IF WE COULD BRING  
14 THE SLIDES BACK UP? OKAY. SO, THIS IS AGENDA ITEM FIVE, AND  
15 WE'RE GOING TO BE WALKING YOU THROUGH THE FARE STRUCTURE,  
16 THAT'S THAT LONG POLICY LIST THAT I REFERRED TO. I'M GOING TO  
17 COVER THE FIRST FEW SLIDES HERE THEN TURN OVER TO MIKE  
18 EISEMAN, THE PLANNING DIRECTOR OF BART TO WALK THROUGHOUT  
19 REST. GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THANKS. SO, THIS SLIDE,  
20 AGAIN, SOME OF YOU MAY HAVE SEEN, THIS BUT THIS IS OUR SORT OF  
21 FRAMEWORK FOR HOW WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE FARE INTEGRATION  
22 POLICIES, AND WE'RE CALLING THESE THE PATHWAYS TO INTEGRATION.  
23 YOU CAN SEE IN THESE FOUR QUADRANTS, THERE ARE FOUR MAIN SORT  
24 OF THEME CLUSTERS, ARE THE BIG TENT, MULTIPLE TENTS ONE  
25 CAMPSITE, GREAT ALLIANCE AND TRADE AGREEMENTS THESE FOLLOW



January 22, 2021

1 GOVERNANCE MODELS AND APPROACHES TO FARE POLICIES. YOU CAN SEE  
2 THE UPPER PORTION REQUIRE MORE OF A SINGLE ENTITY THAT WOULD  
3 BE GOVERNING FARE POLICY FOR THE REGION OR COORDINATING FARE  
4 POLICY FOR THE REGION. AND THE TWO BOXES TOWARDS THE BOTTOM  
5 REPRESENT A MORE DISTRIBUTED GOVERNANCE APPROACH SOMETHING  
6 PROBABLY MORE SIMILAR TO WHAT WE HAVE NOW WHERE EACH REGENCY  
7 RETAINS FULL AUTONOMY OVER POLICY. AND YOU CAN SEE ON THE  
8 LEFT, THOSE POLICIES, THE BIG TENT AND THE GREAT ALLIANCE ARE  
9 MORE THAN STRUCTURED IN A WAY WHERE THERE IS A SINGLE FARE  
10 POLICY FOR THE REGION. SO NO MATTER WHERE YOU ARE IN THE BAY  
11 AREA, YOU'RE MORE LIKELY TO EXPERIENCE CONSISTENT RULES AND  
12 POLICIES. AND THE TWO BOXES ON THE RIGHT HERE, THE MULTIPLE  
13 TENTS CAMP SITES REPRESENT A TRADE AGREEMENT MORE SIMILAR TO  
14 WHAT WE HAVE TODAY THAT THERE ARE DIFFERENT FARE POLICIES AND  
15 STRUCTURES, BUT IT'S NOT -- IT'S FAIR TO ASK WHAT ARE WE  
16 TALKING ABOUT IF IT'S SIMILAR TO TODAY, BUT THE DISTINCTION,  
17 AND MIKE WILL GET INTO, THIS IS THERE ARE LOTS OF OTHER WAYS  
18 RATHER THAN HAVING A SINGLE FARE POLICY THAT YOU CAN IMPROVE  
19 FARE USER EXPERIENCE THROUGH MORE POLICIES THAT REDUCE  
20 FRICTION FROM TRANSFERRING AND CORRIDORS. WE FIRST PRESENTED  
21 THIS AT THE DECEMBER MEETING OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK  
22 FORCE AND AT THAT MEETING THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE  
23 AGREED THAT WE SHOULD DEVELOP A LONG LIST OF ALTERNATIVES FOR  
24 EACH OF THE FOUR QUADRANTS AND THEN PRESENT TO THEM  
25 RECOMMENDATIONS AND PRIORITIZED RECOMMENDATIONS FOR A SHORT



January 22, 2021

1 LIST OF OPTIONS FOR EACH OF THE FOUR QUADRANTS WE ANALYZE. YOU  
2 CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE AND I'LL DESCRIBE THAT MORE. ON  
3 THIS SLIDE SHOWING AGAIN WE'RE AT THAT STAGE TWO MOVING INTO  
4 STAGE THREE WHERE WE'RE DEVELOPING THAT LONG LIST THAT'S WHAT  
5 MIKE WILL BE TALKING ABOUT HOW WE'LL FOCUS ON TAKING FOUR OR  
6 FIVE OPTIONS PER PATHWAY AND NARROWING IT DOWN TO IDEALLY TWO  
7 FOR EACH PERHAPS THREE FOR THE PATHWAY AND THEN THE DETAILED  
8 ANALYSIS WHERE THERE IS SIGNIFICANT RESEARCH, THE FINANCIAL  
9 IMPACTS, THESE ARE EXPERIENCE IMPACTS THROUGH LOTS OF  
10 ADDITIONAL USER RESEARCH WORK AND UNDERSTANDING HOW RIDERSHIP  
11 WOULD BE IMPACTED THROUGH FARE POLICY CHANGE. GO TO THE NEXT  
12 SLIDE. SO THIS IS THE LAST SLIDE I'LL COVER BEFORE TURNING IT  
13 OVER TO MIKE. BUT JUST SORT OF FRAMING HERE AND MIKE WILL  
14 BEGIN TO GO INTO DETAIL, IS HOW TO THINK ABOUT FARE POLICY AND  
15 IN THESE DIFFERENT PATHWAYS. THERE ARE THREE ELEMENTS THAT WE  
16 HIGHLIGHT, WE HAVE THE FARE STRUCTURE AND BY THAT WE MEAN THE  
17 PRINCIPLES BY WHICH FARE SHOULD BE DETERMINED. SO SORT OF  
18 SHOULD THERE BE A SINGLE FARE STRUCTURE FOR THE REGION OR  
19 MULTIPLE DESTRUCTIONS DEPENDING WHERE YOU ARE. AND HOW YOU  
20 IMPLEMENT STRUCTURES, WOULD YOU HAVE ZONES CONSISTENT ACROSS  
21 THE REGION, WOULD YOU HAVE A SINGLE FLAT FARE BY MODE OR  
22 DIFFERENT TYPES OF MODES SO THOSE ARE SORT OF DIFFERENT  
23 VARIANTS OF THAT STRUCTURE. AND AN IMPORTANT DETAIL IN FARE  
24 POLICY BUT SOMETHING THAT WE'RE NOT SPECIFICALLY FOCUSING ON  
25 RIGHT NOW, IN OUR WORK, IS WHAT ARE THE PRICING VARIANCE. SO



January 22, 2021

1 WHAT WOULD YOU SPECIFICALLY CHARGE FOR AN INDIVIDUAL TRIP,  
2 WHAT WOULD BE THOSE THERE AMOUNTS AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT  
3 WOULD COME LATER IN THE WORK ONCE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THE  
4 DIFFERENT STRUCTURES AND OPTIONS. AND ACTUALLY, I'LL DO THE  
5 NEXT SLIDE TOO, AND THEN TURN IT OVER TO MIKE. SORRY. I JUMPED  
6 THE GUN THERE. SO MIKE IS GOING TO SORT OF WALK US THROUGH THE  
7 FARE POLICY, REALLY, AS IT RELATES TO SINGLE TRIPS, AND  
8 CUSTOMERS WHO ARE, YOU KNOW, TAKING A TRIP FROM -- A DISCRETE  
9 TRIP FROM POINT A TO POINT B, AND LOOK AT PASSES, CAPS, PEOPLE  
10 WHO ARE PAYING A FARE THAT SORT OF ALLOWS THEM TO USE MULTIPLE  
11 TRIPS AND THAT'S SORT OF THE FOCUS WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW. AND  
12 THERE ARE OTHER WAYS TO OPTIMIZE FARE POLICY BASED ON YOUR  
13 DISCOUNT STATUS, OR, YOU KNOW, ARE YOU A SENIOR? ARE YOU A  
14 YOUTH, A STUDENT? A PERSON WITH A DISABILITY. AND THOSE  
15 CUSTOMER TYPE ELEMENTS THAT IMPACT FARE POLICY ARE GOING TO BE  
16 ADDRESSED IN OUR WORK BUT WE'RE NOT THERE YET AND WE'RE  
17 HIGHLIGHTING HERE FARES BY TIME OF DAY, SO ARE YOU TRAVELING  
18 ON A WEEKDAY OR A WEEKEND. THERE IS OTHER WAYS TO IMPACT FARE  
19 POLICY. YET AGAIN WE'RE NOT CALLING ALL OF THESE OUT, WE'RE  
20 TRYING TO HIGHLIGHT THAT RIGHT NOW WE'RE FOCUSING ON JUST SORT  
21 OF THE, YOU KNOW, THE TRIP AND PRODUCTS THAT ALLOW YOU TO USE  
22 TRIP, SO FARES AND MULTIPLE TRANSCRIPT. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO  
23 MIKE EISEMAN WHOLE WALK US THROUGHOUT REST OF IT.  
24



January 22, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** HI EVERYBODY. CAN YOU HEAR ME? GO TO THE NEXT  
2 SLIDE PLEASE. I GUESS I'LL START BY THANK EVERYBODY FOR  
3 BEARING WITH US AS WE TALK ABOUT PROCESS. CONGRATULATIONS FOR  
4 MAKING IT TO THIS PART WHERE WE TALK ABOUT ACTUAL FARE POLICY  
5 CHANGES THAT'S EXCITING. I'LL DISCUSS THE CURRENT LIST OF  
6 OPTIONS TO START OFF WITH, HOW DO YOU SET -- WHAT ARE THE  
7 CHOICES HERE AND AS YOU SET CRISIS FOR INDIVIDUAL TRIPS. AND  
8 WHAT WE'RE SHOWING ON THIS IMAGE HERE IS A SPECTRUM THAT  
9 VARIES AS TO WHAT IS THE ROLE OF DISTANCE IN SETTING THE  
10 FARES. SO ON THE FAR LEFT, WE HAVE THE OPTION OF FLAT FARES  
11 FOR SINGLE TRANSIT STRIPS. ON THE FAR RIGHT FARE BY DISTANCE,  
12 SO YOU PAY FOR EXACTLY THE DISTANCE YOU TRAVEL, AND THEN THE  
13 KIND OF MIDDLE OF THAT CHANGE WOULD BE A ZONE STRUCTURE. SO  
14 DISCRETE GEOGRAPHIES WITH PRICES INCREASING THE NUMBER OF  
15 ZONES YOU TRAVEL THROUGH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THEN WE HAVE  
16 A SET OF QUESTIONS HERE RELATED TO MULTIPLE, HOW WE PRICE  
17 MULTIPLE TRIPS. TWO OPTIONS. ON THE LEFT, PERIOD PASSES, SO  
18 YOU CAN BUY TRANSIT IN BULK FOR A PARTICULAR PERIOD OF TIME,  
19 SAY A MONTH AND YOU PAY ONE PRICE, YOU GET ALL YOU NEED  
20 TRANSIT, OR DESCRIBED HERE YOU MIGHT PAY ONE PRICE FOR TRAVEL,  
21 OF THE RIGHT TO TRAVEL A CERTAIN DISTANCE OR GEOGRAPHY BUT A  
22 CERTAIN DISTANCE OVER THAT WOULD BE AN ADDITIONAL CHARGE.  
23 RELATED OPTION CAPS YOU PAY BY THE TRIP UP TO A CERTAIN LIMIT  
24 AND OVER THAT LIMIT, YOU ARE NOT CHARGED ANYMORE, AND CAPS  
25 COULD ALSO EXIST ON A DAILY, WEEKLY, OR MONTHLY BASIS. NEXT



January 22, 2021

1 SLIDE PLEASE. SO, JUST A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT ZONES HERE. SO  
2 ZONES ARE OFTEN USED, YOU KNOW, OVER LARGE GEOGRAPHIES, AND,  
3 AGAIN, WE DIVIDE THE SERVICE AREA UP INTO GEOGRAPHIC AREAS OF  
4 A PARTICULAR SHAPE, AND YOU PAY MORE THE MORE ZONES YOU TRAVEL  
5 THROUGH. YOU KNOW, A LOT OF ZONE SYSTEMS IN THE WORLD WERE  
6 CREATED BEFORE IT WAS POSSIBLE TO DO MORE DETAILED FARE BY  
7 DISTANCE STRUCTURES, BUT EVEN TODAY, THEY HAVE ADVANTAGES, AND  
8 DISADVANTAGES, AS FARE SYSTEMS. ADVANTAGES, SIMPLE AND EASY TO  
9 UNDERSTANDS, IN MANY CASES, YOU KNOW, AND THEY CAN, DEPENDING  
10 ON THE SIZE OF THE ZONES WE USE TO SORT OF CALIBRATE  
11 WILLINGNESS TO PAY AND THE AMOUNT OF SERVICE FOLKS ARE USING.  
12 WE HAVE THIS CHALLENGE, A LITTLE BIT, OF POTENTIALLY ARBITRARY  
13 FARE INCREASES AS WE MOVE ACROSS ZONE BOUNDARIES. THE ACTUAL  
14 SETTING OF THE ZONES CAN BE COMPLEX IT'S IN A MULTI-  
15 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS. AND IF YOU HAVE ONLY A FEW ZONES THEN THE  
16 -- THERE IS SOME CHALLENGES TO OPTIMIZING REVENUE AND  
17 RIDERSHIP. AND THEN ON THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE ALSO JUST  
18 WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT HERE YOU HAVE OPTIONS FROM SIMPLE ZONES TO  
19 COMPLEX, THE METRO VANCOUVER FARE SYSTEM DISPLAYED ON THE  
20 RIGHT THREE ZONES SIMULATING OUT FROM DOWNTOWN VANCOUVER  
21 PENINSULA, CONCENTRIC ZONES AND 300 TOWNS ALMOST DIVIDE INTO  
22 30 SUBZONES. OKAY. SO THAT'S ZONES. AND NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE  
23 NEXT FARE BY DISTANCE THIS'S THE MODEL THAT BART USES, OF  
24 COURSE, SIMILAR TO TAXI, THE FURTHER YOU TRAVEL THE MORE YOU  
25 PAY. AND THAT A THE SYSTEM THAT GIVES AGENCIES THE MOST



January 22, 2021

1 CONTROL OVER SORT OF OPTIMIZING PRICE AND RIDERSHIP. AND IT  
2 GIVES OF THE CUSTOMER A KIND OF CUSTOM FARE THAT IS VERY  
3 SPECIFIC TO THE TRIP THEY TOOK. A DISADVANTAGE IS IF YOU  
4 CHARGE HIGH PRICES FOR VERY LONG TRIPS YOU MAY BE  
5 DISPROPORTIONATELY CHARGING AT LEAST IN OUR COMMUNITIES,  
6 COMMUNITIES THAT ARE LOW INCOME OR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN THAT  
7 TEND TO TAKE LONGER TRIPS. SO THAT'S ONE DISADVANTAGE TO  
8 CONSIDER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND THEN, HERE ARE JUST A FEW  
9 ELEMENTS OF SETTING FARE BY DISTANCE. THERE ARE SOME  
10 COMPLEXITY IN THE SYSTEMS. OFTEN FARE BY DISTANCE SYSTEMS HAVE  
11 AN INITIAL FLAT FARE. FOR SOME, A DISTANCE, AND OTHERS A  
12 DISTANCE POINT WHICH YOU START TO INCREASE, AND OVER SOME SET  
13 OF STEPS, THAT WILL, YOU KNOW, IT COULD BE BY THE MILE, IT  
14 COULD BE BY SOME OTHER DISCRETE STEP, AND THEN THERE IS  
15 TYPICALLY A MAXIMUM FARE THAT YOU CAN PAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
16 SO, AND THEN JUST SORT OF A BIG PICTURE LOOK HERE, WHAT WE'RE  
17 TRYING TO DO, IN OUR LIST OF OPTIONS IS LAY OUT A SET OF  
18 CHOICES THAT ARE FIRST MUTUALLY EXCLUSIVE, SO THEY DON'T  
19 OVERLAP WITH EACH OTHER AND ARE MEANINGFULLY DIFFERENT THEY'RE  
20 NOT VARIANCE OF EACH OTHER BUT THERE IS DIFFERENT STRUCTURE.  
21 ZONE AND SYSTEMS BASED STRUCTURES ARE DIFFERENT AND THERE ARE  
22 CHOICES IN THE LIGHT BLUE AREA BELOW ZONES AND PARTICULAR  
23 STEPS THAT YOU GO THROUGH IN ZONES THOSE ARE PRICING VARIANCE  
24 AND WILL COME UP AFTER THIS LIST IS CHOSEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
25 SO WE WERE GOING TO REVISIT SOME OF THE PATHWAYS DISCUSSION





January 22, 2021

1 THAT BILL TALKED ABOUT THEN MOVE ON TO THE LIST. I WANT TO  
2 BREAK HERE AND SEE IF ANYBODY HAS QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS ABOUT  
3 THE MATERIAL WE JUST RAN THROUGH.

4

5 **BRIAN STANKE:** I HAVE A QUESTION. FOR THE WORK AT THE ZONES AND  
6 PRICE BY DISTANCE, SORT OF -- WHAT IS THE NEXT STEP? WHAT ARE  
7 YOU -- WHAT ARE YOU WEIGHING? WHAT ARE YOU DECISION MAKING ON?

8

9 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH, AS WE MOVE INTO WHAT WE HAVE GOT TO  
10 SHOW YOU NEXT, WHAT WE WILL DO HERE IS SHOW YOU A LIST OF FARE  
11 OPTIONS, THAT FIT IN EACH OF THESE KIND OF PATHWAYS. THEN  
12 WE'RE GOING TO DO A SCREENING STEP WHERE WE EVALUATE EACH AT A  
13 HIGH LEVEL FOR SORT OF FATAL FLAWS AND HIGH LEVEL -- WHETHER  
14 IT ADDRESSES THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE PROJECT, AND THEN  
15 WE'RE GOING TO SET A SHORT LIST, AND TRY TO DO A DETAILED  
16 BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS ON EACH OF THOSE OPTIONS. WELL, SO  
17 MAYBE IT'S MOST USEFUL, ACTUALLY -- SORRY -- GO AHEAD ADINA.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THERE ARE A COUPLE OF HANDS. WENDI HAS A  
20 HAND.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** YEAH, YOU MIGHT BE ANSWERING THIS IN  
23 YOUR NEXT PART. SO, I MIGHT BE PREMATURE HERE. I AM CURIOUS TO  
24 KNOW IF PART OF THE EVALUATION IS LOOKING AT WHICH STRUCTURE  
25 ATTRACTS THE MOST AMOUNT OF RIDERS?



January 22, 2021

1

2 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES. THAT'S DEFINITELY ON THE OPTIONS. WE'RE  
3 SAVING -- SO, THE INITIAL SCREENING FROM LONG TO SHORT LIST IS  
4 GOING TO BE MORE FOCUSED ON -- IS GOING TO BE MORE QUALITATIVE  
5 AND SORT OF LOOKING FOR FATAL FLAWS OR WHETHER IT SERVES THE  
6 OBJECTIVES IN THE PROJECT AND FROM THE SHORT LIST WE'RE GOING  
7 TO TRY TO USE MODELING APPROACHES AND OTHER TOOLS TO TRY TO  
8 ESTIMATE THE RIDERSHIP IMPACT OF EACH OF THE SHORT LIST  
9 OPTIONS.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** AND GOING ALONG WITH THAT, I WOULD  
12 IMAGINE AGENCIES WOULD BE CONCERNED ABOUT MAXIMIZING REVENUES,  
13 AND HOW DO YOU BALANCE THAT OUT WITH MAXIMIZING RIDERS?

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH, FISCAL IMPACT, FISCAL STABILITY IS  
16 DEFINITELY GOING TO BE A CONSIDERATION AS WE EVALUATE THE  
17 SHORT LIST. WE'RE GOING TO DO IT AT SORT OF A REGIONAL SCALE  
18 AND THEN GIVE THE AGENCIES THE TOOLS TO TRY TO ADDRESS AGENCY  
19 SPECIFIC IMPACTS ON REVENUES.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** AND JONATHON HAS A HAND.

24



January 22, 2021

1 **JONATHON KASS:** YEAH, AND I DON'T -- YOU MAY HAVE ANSWERED THIS  
2 IN YOUR ANSWER TO BRIAN BUT I DIDN'T CATCH. IT YOU SAID THAT  
3 TODAY'S FOCUS, AS WE GO THROUGH THESE SPECTRUM, IS ON SORT OF  
4 THE MULTIPLE FARES VERSUS SINGLE FARE STRUCTURE, AND THAT IT'S  
5 A SEPARATE MATTER, ISSUES, SORT OF TIME OF DAY PRICING OR  
6 DISCOUNT PRICES AND THINGS BY INDIVIDUAL CUSTOMER, IT SEEMS  
7 LIKE THOSE FACTORS THAT WE'RE NOT THINKING ABOUT TODAY MAY  
8 HAVE A VERY DIFFERENT IMPLICATION FOR SORT OF THE BALANCE OF  
9 COORDINATION VERSUS LOCAL CONTROL. AND I JUST WONDER IF THAT'S  
10 SORT OF -- IF WE'LL TAKE THE SAME LENS IN A LATER SESSION OR  
11 WE'LL EXTRAPOLATE THE DISCUSSION FROM THOSE.

12

13 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** IT'S AN IMPORTANT QUESTION. WE'LL LOOK AT  
14 OPTIONS AND WAYS TO DIFFERENT BETWEEN OPTIONS AND REVISIT.  
15 WHAT WE CALL VARIANCE PRICING WHETHER WE CAN TRULY LEAVE THOSE  
16 SIDES OR ADD TO THE ITEMS TO THE LONG LIST THAT REPRESENT SOME  
17 OF THOSE CHOICES.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** I'M NOT SEEING ANY MORE HANDS FROM MEMBERS  
20 OF THIS BODY. SO WE SHOULD MOVE ALONG. AND IF, FOR PEOPLE IN  
21 THE GROUP, PLEASE DO USE THE FEATURE TO RAISE YOUR HAND,  
22 BECAUSE I CAN'T 100 PERCENT EXACTLY SEE EVERYBODY AT THE SAME  
23 TIME, SO I'M NOT GUARANTEED TO SEE A PHYSICAL HAND RAISED. SO,  
24 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT SLIDE.

25



January 22, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY. CAN WE -- OH, PERFECT. THANKS. SO THIS  
2 IS BRINGING US BACK TO THE DISCUSSION THAT BILL LED ABOUT THE  
3 PATHWAYS. ACTUALLY, I GUESS I WOULD PREFER TO CALL THESE  
4 MANAGEMENT APPROACHES, STAYING AWAY FROM THE WORD GOVERNANCE,  
5 WHICH MAY CONFUSE SOME PEOPLE INTO TALKING ABOUT BROADER  
6 AGENCY GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS, WHICH ARE CERTAINLY RELATED, BUT  
7 SEPARATE. BUT IF YOU THINK ABOUT THESE AS MANAGEMENT  
8 APPROACHES WE HAVE GOT OUR BIG TENT WHICH IS ESSENTIALLY A  
9 SINGLE FARE SETTING AUTHORITY. MULTIPLE TENTS AT ONE CAMPSITE,  
10 AGAIN A SINGLE FARE SETTING AUTHORITY BUT A POTENTIAL  
11 VARIATION ACROSS THE REGION. AN ALLIANCE WHERE WE TRY TO  
12 ARRIVE AT A SINGLE REGION-WIDE FARE STRUCTURE BUT THE  
13 AUTHORITY TO SET FARES DOES REMAIN DISTINCT AT THE AGENCY  
14 LEVEL. AND THEN TRADE AGREEMENTS WHERE FARE COORDINATION COMES  
15 BY VIRTUE OF BILATERAL OR MULTI- LATERAL DEALS BETWEEN  
16 INDIVIDUAL AGENCIES. SO THOSE ARE THE PATHWAYS WE'RE WORKING  
17 IN. THE NEXT SLIDE, HERE, JUST PROVIDES, ACTUALLY A LITTLE  
18 MORE DETAIL, SOME OF WHICH I JUST PROVIDED. SO ACTUALLY I WANT  
19 TO FOCUS YOUR ATTENTION ON THE NEXT SLIDE. SO, SORT OF THESE  
20 ARE KIND OF THE QUESTIONS WE ASK IN SETTING THE OPTIONS AND  
21 HOW THEY SORT OF PLAY OUT WITHIN EACH OF THOSE PATHWAYS. KEY  
22 QUESTIONS FOR THE FARE OPTIONS, WHAT ROLE DOES DISTANCE PLAY,  
23 ARE WE ZONED, DISTANCES OR WHATEVER, ARE WE ALLOWING SYSTEM BY  
24 MODE FOR EXAMPLE RAIL AND PRICING AND FERRY. AND IS THE ROOM  
25 FOR PRICING TRANSFERS OR AGENCY MODES OR ARE THERE NO PRICE



January 22, 2021

1 FOR SWITCHING VEHICLES, FOR EXAMPLE. ON THE BIG TENT OPTION  
2 WE'RE DOING OPTIONS WHERE WE HAVE SINGLE APPROACH FOR AGENCIES  
3 IN THE REGION WE HAVE FLEXIBILITY DIFFERENCES BETWEEN MODE SO  
4 BUS AND RAIL HAVE DIFFERENT PRICING. BUT THEY WOULD USE THE  
5 SAME STRUCTURE TENT OPTIONS WOULD REMAIN FREE. ALLIANCE  
6 BASICALLY SAME SET OF POLICY OPTIONS KEY DIFFERENCE IS YOU  
7 WOULD HAVE A SINGLE STRUCTURAL MODEL FOR EXAMPLE, YOU COULD  
8 CHOOSE ZONE BASE OR DISTANCE BASED FOR ALL TRANSIT IN THE  
9 REGION, BUT THE AGENCIES THEMSELVES MIGHT HAVE THE ABILITY TO  
10 SET A DIFFERENT PRICE WITHIN THAT STRUCTURE. SO WE CAN TALK A  
11 LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT THAT IN A MOMENT. MULTIPLE TENTS, ONE  
12 CAMPSITE, THERE COULD BE A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT APPROACHES.  
13 THE KEY ISSUE THERE IS THAT IT IS -- IT'S A SINGLE FARE  
14 SETTING AUTHORITY, EVEN WITH MULTIPLE APPROACHES FOR DIFFERENT  
15 PARTS OF THE REGION. AND THEN TRADE AGREEMENTS, ALL OPTIONS  
16 ARE ON THE TABLE, SIX, AS OF TODAY, ALL OPTIONS ARE ON THE  
17 TABLE BUT WE WOULD BE LOOK FOR COORDINATION OPPORTUNITIES TO  
18 IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. OKAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO  
19 WE'RE GOING TO DIVE INTO FOUR TABLES HERE. THIS IS A LOT OF  
20 DETAIL, BUT ONE FOR EACH OF THOSE COLORS IN THE PATHWAYS  
21 GRAPHIC. AND WE'LL START OFF WITH THE BIG TENT, AND WHAT WE  
22 HAVE GOT ON HERE ARE SIX OPTIONS THAT SORT OF LAY OUT THE  
23 BASIC STRUCTURAL CHOICES FOR FARE POLICIES WITHIN THE BIG  
24 TENT. SO WE'LL START OFF WITH TWO VERSIONS OF -- THREE  
25 VERSIONS OF ZONE SYSTEMS, ACTUALLY. SO THE FIRST ONE WE'RE



January 22, 2021

1 CALLING CELLULAR ZONE, POLYGON SHAPED ZONES, AND THIS ONE, YOU  
2 KNOW, WE GAVE AN EARLIER EXAMPLE OF ZURICH, THIS IS ALSO THE  
3 MODEL THAT SEAMLESS BAY AREA USED IN THEIR PROPOSAL, WHICH A  
4 LOT OF YOU HAVE SEEN. SO, LET'S SEE. YOU KNOW, THERE ARE SOME  
5 CHOICES EVEN WITHIN THAT ZONE, THAT WE WOULD WANT TO EXPLORE,  
6 SO SECOND ZONE IS FREE, IS ONE OPTION THAT SOMETIMES GETS  
7 CHOSEN IN A MODEL LIKE THIS TO REMOVE ARBITRARY PRICE,  
8 INCREASES AS YOU CROSS ZONE BOUNDARY. LET'S SEE. AND WE HAVE -  
9 - WE DO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT HERE, THERE'S THE OPTION BETWEEN  
10 DIFFERENTIATION BETWEEN MODE FOR EXAMPLE, RAIL AND BUS COULD  
11 HAVE DIFFERENT FARES. SO THAT'S SORT OF THE CELLULAR ZONE. THE  
12 SECOND ONE HERE IS THE SAME, BUT WITH THE OPTION OF HAVING A  
13 FLAT FARE FOR THE LOCAL TRIPS. AND, YOU KNOW ONE -- I WANTED  
14 TO HIGHLIGHT ONE TECHNICAL CONSIDERATION WE HAVE BEEN KICKING  
15 AROUND AS A PROJECT TEAM THAT'S THE TECHNICAL CONCERN ABOUT  
16 WHETHER OR NOT TAG ON/TAG OFF FARE PAYMENT IS GOING TO WORK ON  
17 CROWDED BUSES. KNOW THERE ARE PLACES IN THE WORLD THAT ITEM  
18 PASSES. BUT WE HAVE CERTAINLY HAD THE CONCERN RAISED BY SOME  
19 OF THE BUS OPERATORS, COULD WE IMPLEMENT THAT EFFECTIVELY  
20 HERE. SO OPTION NUMBER TWO THERE IS A ZONE BASED SYSTEM BUT  
21 FLAT FARE FOR LOCAL TRIPS. SO YOU WOULDN'T HAVE TO TAG OFF THE  
22 BUS YOU JUST PAY A FLAT FARE FOR THE LOCAL BUS TRIP. THIRD  
23 OPTION CIRCULAR ZONES THE SAME FARE STRUCTURE BUT DIFFERENT  
24 SHAPE OF ZONES A LOT OF REGIONS HAVE CIRCULAR SHAPED ZONES  
25 LONDON HAS GIVEN AN EXAMPLE. WE OFFER THIS FOR COMPLETENESS



January 22, 2021

1 SAKE, A LOT OF US OBSERVED THAT BAY AREA GEOGRAPHY IS NOT  
2 SUPER COMPATIBLE WITH CIRCULAR ZONES BUT IT'S ON OUR LIST FOR  
3 NOW AND CERTAINLY WE'RE WILLING TO TALK ABOUT THAT. SO THOSE  
4 ARE THE ZONE BASED OPTIONS LAID OUT HERE THEN MOVING INTO FARE  
5 BY DISTANCE. PURE FARE BY DISTANCE SYSTEM SIMILAR TO THE BART  
6 NETWORK NOW, FARES SET BASED ON HOW FAR YOU TRAVEL, YOU CAN  
7 OFFER INITIAL FLAT FARE FOR A CERTAIN DISTANCE. WE OFFER  
8 DIFFERENT PRICING LEVELS FOR DIFFERENT MODES AND THE CHOICES  
9 ABOUT STEPS IN THE DISTANCED BASED STRUCTURE. AND, AGAIN, JUST  
10 LIKE WITH THE ZONE SYSTEM, YOU COULD OFFER A DISTANCE-BASED  
11 FARE WITH A LOCAL FLAT FARE. AND THEN AT THE BOTTOM THERE, WE  
12 HAVE PUT AS A DISTINCT OPTION THE NOTION OF A REGIONAL PASS OR  
13 CAP, SO YOU COULD STICK WITH THE EXISTING FARE STRUCTURE, NO  
14 CHANGES. BUT CREATE A PASS OR A CAP PRODUCT. ONE THING I  
15 WANTED TO POINT OUT, WE'RE PARTICULARLY INTERESTED AS A  
16 PROJECT TEAM, IN FULLY EXPLORING THE NOTION OF AN EMPLOYER  
17 BASED OR INSTITUTIONAL-BASED PASS PROGRAM ALONGSIDE BROADER  
18 PASS OPTIONS. SO WE HAVE DEFINED IT HERE AS NO CHANGE PLUS  
19 PASS OR CAP, BUT OF COURSE, YOU MAY BE REALIZING THIS, AS  
20 WELL, THAT YOU COULD TAKE THE PASS OR CAP PRODUCT AND APPLY IT  
21 TO ANY OF THE ABOVE OPTIONS AS WELL. SO THOSE ARE THE BIG TENT  
22 OPTIONS. MAYBE WE COULD STOP THERE AND TALK ABOUT ANY  
23 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS OR CONCERNS OR ADDS PEOPLE WANT TO MAKE,  
24 SUGGESTIONS UNDER BIG TENT. OH, AND YOU KNOW, IT MAY BE USEFUL  
25 TO KEEP THE TABLE UP FOR SOME FOLKS TO LOOK AT.



January 22, 2021

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. SO THERE ARE A BUNCH OF PEOPLE  
3 WITH RAISED HANDS. SO, ANNE OLIVIA?

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I REALLY DO APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION  
6 AND THE CLEAR AMOUNT OF WORK AND THOUGHT THAT HAS GONE INTO  
7 EVERYTHING THAT WE'RE SEEING TODAY. I HAVE SOME CONCERNS  
8 REGARDING SOME OF THE APPROACHES, AND I'M JUST HOPING TO ASK  
9 FOR SOME CLARIFICATION, SPECIFICALLY AROUND EQUITY, AND TO  
10 START WITH, I AM DEEPLY OPPOSED TO FARE BY DISTANCE. IT  
11 DISCOURAGES LONG TRIPS, AND WE WOULD REALLY LIKE TO BE  
12 ENCOURAGING LONG TRIPS ON PUBLIC TRANSIT, AS THAT IS THE WAY  
13 THAT WE HAVE THE MOST IMMEDIATE AND SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON  
14 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, WHICH HAS THE IMPACT ON BOTH CARBON  
15 EMISSIONS AS WELL AS OTHER CRITERION POLLUTANT IN OUR  
16 NEIGHBORHOODS, TRAFFIC DEATHS, ALL THAT KIND OF STUFF. LIKE  
17 IT'S FARE BY DISTANCE, REALLY PUNISHES PEOPLE WITH LESS  
18 ECONOMIC RESOURCES. WEALTHY PEOPLE CAN AFFORD TO LIVE NEAR  
19 THEIR JOBS, LOW INCOME PEOPLE CAN'T. SO WE JUST REALLY WANT TO  
20 SAY THAT EQUITY AND WHO IS IMPACTED REALLY SHOULD BE FRONT AND  
21 CENTER WHEN WE LOOK AT ALL THESE THINGS. AND WHAT MODELS  
22 ENCOURAGE OF THE USE OF LONG DISTANCE PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND  
23 ANOTHER THING THAT CAME UP THAT DERAILED MY THOUGHTS  
24 COMPLETELY, WHICH IS THE CONCEPT OF EMPLOYER-BASED PASSES. AND  
25 I HAVE SEEN SOME OF THOSE THINGS, WHERE I GREW UP IN PORTLAND





January 22, 2021

1 OREGON WHICH HAS THE THREE DIFFERENT ZONES FOR TRANSIT, WE  
2 WOULD GET PASSES FROM OUR SCHOOL, AND I JUST WANT TO -- I JUST  
3 -- I REALLY WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT EMPLOYEE BASED PASSES FOR  
4 TRANSIT ARE JUST AS FLAWED AS EMPLOYEE BASED HEALTH CARE WHEN  
5 WE LOOK AT IT WHO GETS THE KIND OF JOBS THAT PROVIDE BONUSES,  
6 LIKE HEALTH CARE AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION BONUSES AND THOSE  
7 KINDS OF THINGS AND WHO DOESN'T, AND IN THE BAY AREA THAT CAN  
8 REALLY FREQUENTLY PLAY OUT ALONG RACE LINES AS WELL AS  
9 DECIDEDLY CLASS LINES. SO, JUST, WHILE SOME OF THOSE THINGS  
10 CAN BE REALLY POSITIVE, I WOULD ENCOURAGE A WAY TO MITIGATE  
11 THE INHERENTLY INEQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF SOME OF THOSE  
12 RESOURCES. MY BRAIN JUST WENT OFF ON THAT COMPLETELY. SO I  
13 WILL REMEMBER WHAT THE OTHER THINGS WERE, AND LET SOME OTHER  
14 FOLKS TALK, AND WAIT UNTIL THE END TO MAYBE ASK THE REST OF MY  
15 QUESTIONS.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. RICH HEDGES HAS A HAND.

18

19 **RICHARD HEDGES:** ONE THING I SEE MISSING AND ACTUALLY THIS MAY  
20 BE A SOLUTION WITH WHAT OLIVIA IS TALKING ABOUT AND SHE CAN  
21 CHIME IN IF SHE AGREES. ONE THING I SEE MISS SUGGEST A CAPPED  
22 DAY PASS. LET ME GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE, ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE  
23 WITH LOW MEANS. WHEN I'M IN LA, IT'S FOR A SHORT PERIOD OF  
24 TIME I'VE TRIED IT BOTH WAYS FOR ALL THE DIFFERENT TRANSFERS  
25 AND DIFFERENT MODES OF TRANSPORTATION OR I CAN BUY A DAY PASS,



January 22, 2021

1 AND I'LL TELL YOU THAT PEOPLE OF MODEST MEANS HAVE THE SAME  
2 PROBLEM. THEY BUY GASOLINE RATHER THAN TAKING TRANSIT, BECAUSE  
3 THIS'S A FIXED PRICE FOR THEM ON THAT DAY. BECAUSE IT'S ALL  
4 THE MONEY THEY HAVE AND IT MAY BE CHEAPER THAN TAKING TRANSIT.  
5 IF YOU CAN TAKE A DAY PASS WHEN YOU NEED A DAY PASS, I THINK  
6 THAT WORKS BEST FOR PEOPLE ON AN EQUITY BASIS. SO YOU CAN  
7 STILL HAVE THE DISTANCE FARES, OR YOU -- AND YOU CAN AUGMENT  
8 IT WITH A REASONABLE DAY PASS FOR PEOPLE. SO THAT THEY DON'T  
9 HAVE TO TRY TO FIGURE OUT ALL THESE DIFFERENT FARES AND  
10 TRANSFERS THEY NEED TO DO, THEY MAKE IT WORK FOR THE ENTIRE  
11 REGION, NO MATTER WHAT MODE IT IS THANK YOU. OH, AND I  
12 APOLOGIZE FOR BEING LATE. I HAD A DOCTOR'S APPOINTMENT. THANK  
13 YOU.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANKS. MOVING ON TO IAN  
16 GRIFFITHS.

17

18 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SORRY. I'LL -- I'LL PASS. I DON'T NEED TO ASK  
19 MY QUESTION NOW. I'LL LET OTHERS GO.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WENDI?

22

23 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** YEAH, I JUST WANT TO ADD A NOTE ON TO  
24 WHAT OLIVIA SAID, BECAUSE I THINK WE DO HAVE TO BALANCE  
25 ENVIRONMENTAL NEEDS WITH EQUITY NEEDS, AND OFTENTIMES THE, YOU



January 22, 2021

1 KNOW, WITH THE EMPLOYEE INCENTIVES, THAT IS DEFINITELY GOING  
2 TO HIGHER INCOME WORKERS, BUT THOSE ARE ALSO THE PEOPLE WHO  
3 HAVE THE ABILITY AND OFTENTIMES DRIVE. AND SO IT IS IMPORTANT  
4 TO HAVE INCENTIVES FOR THOSE WORKERS, WHERE IT'S LOWER INCOME  
5 WORKERS, THEY DON'T SO MUCH NEED INCENTIVE BECAUSE THEY'RE  
6 OFTEN TRANSIT DEPENDENT, AS THEY NEED DISCOUNTED FARES AND  
7 BETTER TRANSIT FOR THEIR NEEDS, TO WHERE THEY'RE GOING, AND  
8 THE TIME OF DAY WHEN THEY HAVE TO GO. SO I THINK YOU NEED TO  
9 LOOK AT BOTH THINGS WHEN YOU'RE BALANCING THESE THINGS OUT.  
10 AND I JUST WANTED TO MAKE THAT COMMENT.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANKS. SO MOVING ON. HARTMAN HAS A  
13 HAND.

14

15 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO ADD A LITTLE  
16 BIT TO WHAT ANNE WAS SAYING. I FEEL VERY STRONGLY ABOUT THE  
17 DISTANCE. AND IT'S FOR THE EXACT SAME REASON THAT ANNE FEELS  
18 VERY STRONGLY ABOUT THE ZONES. AND WHEN I THINK OF THE PEOPLE  
19 WHO ARE THE NEEDIEST WHO USE THIS, THEY'RE GOING TO BE  
20 TRAVELING FROM VERY FAR DISTANCE, FROM TRACY, DOWN TO THE BAY  
21 AREA, THOSE ARE THE COMMUTER POPULATIONS THAT WOULD BE HURT  
22 THE MOST. AND I GET THE SENSE THAT TRAVELING BY ZONE IS GOING  
23 TO PENALIZE SOME USERS WHEREAS DISTANCE MIGHT BE EQUATED TO  
24 THEIR EXACT DISTANCE IN FARES. SO I'M THINKING ALONG THE LINES  
25 OF EQUITY AND LEANING MORE TOWARDS THE DISTANCE BY MILE. SO I



January 22, 2021

1 THINK WHAT WOULD BE BENEFICIAL FOR US AS WE LOOK TO REALLY  
2 MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING EQUITY, IS UNDERSTANDING  
3 WHAT AN AVERAGE, LONG DISTANCE FARE WOULD LOOK LIKE IN THESE  
4 TWO DIFFERENT CLASSIFICATIONS. HOW MIGHT THAT FARE PAN OUT IN  
5 A ZONE AND HOW MIGHT THAT FARE PAN OUT IN A DISTANCE. SO THAT  
6 WE CAN PUT SOME REAL-WORLD MEAT ON THAT BONE AND KIND OF GET A  
7 BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF IT SO WE CAN LEAN INTO ONE THAT MAKES  
8 SENSE WITH EQUITY IN MIND. THAT WAS IT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MARK CORDES?

11

12 **MARK CORDES:** THANK YOU ADINA. I ALWAYS TRY TO HAVE A RULE OF  
13 NOT SPEAKING AT THE FIRST MEETING I EVER ATTEND, AND I HAVE  
14 REAL TROUBLE KEEPING TO THAT RULE. I THINK I'M -- I WANT TO  
15 BRING A COUPLE OF CONCERNS, THAT I AM SURE ARE ON EVERYBODY'S  
16 MIND, BUT I THINK ARE CRITICAL AT THIS JUNCTURE, ONE S YES,  
17 EQUITY HAS TO BE FRONT AND CENTER. IT'S IMPORTANT TO THINK  
18 ABOUT EQUITY. CERTAINLY IT IS CLEAR THAT THE COMMUNITIES AND  
19 NEIGHBORHOODS THAT HAVE BEEN CONSISTENTLY LEFT BEHIND BY  
20 PREVIOUS DECISIONS, AND THOSE FOLKS HAVE TO BE RECENTERED AS  
21 WE MOVE FORWARD. AND THAT GETS TO MY REAL CONCERN WHICH IS ARE  
22 WE DESIGNING A SYSTEM FOR THE -- A FARE SYSTEM FOR THE SYSTEM  
23 THAT WE HAVE? OR FOR THE SYSTEM THAT WE ACTUALLY NEED IN THE  
24 BAY AREA. THE MOST CAR DEPENDENT PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA I KNOW  
25 BEST WHICH IS IN SAN FRANCISCO, I FOLKS FROM THE COMMUNITIES



January 22, 2021

1 OF CONCERN. AND IT'S BECAUSE WE HAVE NOT BUILT OUT THE TRANSIT  
2 INFRASTRUCTURE THAT SERVES THEIR NEEDS APPROPRIATELY, AND WE  
3 DISCOVERED THAT WITH COVID BY HAVING TO REDO OUR SYSTEM NOT TO  
4 DELIVER HIGH VALUE WORKERS TO THE CENTRAL FINANCIAL CORE, BUT  
5 TO ACTUALLY SERVICE THE SERVICE WORKERS AND ESSENTIAL WORKERS  
6 GETTING THEM TO THE PLACES THAT THEY NEED TO GO. AND MY  
7 ARGUMENT WOULD BE, WHAT ABOUT THESE STRUCTURES ENHANCES OUR  
8 ABILITY TO CREATE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WE NEED TO MOVE THE  
9 PEOPLE WHO MOST NEED TRANSIT TOWARDS TRANSIT AS AN EFFECTIVE  
10 MEANS OF MOVING THEM ABOUT THE BAY AREA, AS AN ALTERNATIVE TO  
11 CARS AND OTHER THINGS? MY EXPERIENCE, AS A SAN FRANCISCO  
12 EXPERIENCE WHEN I WORKED IN BERKLEY WAS IT WAS CHEAPER WHEN I  
13 DID THE MATH TO REVERSE COMMUTE BY CAR THAN IT WAS FOR ME TO  
14 TAKE BART. THOSE ARE MY POINTS OF ARE UNDERLYING ISSUES THAT  
15 KIND OF GET EMBEDDED IN THIS BUT I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR CLARITY,  
16 ONE HOW WE DO EQUITY, AND TWO, HOW WE POSITION THE SYSTEM,  
17 WHATEVER IT IS, SO THAT IT ENCOURAGES THE CREATION OF THE KIND  
18 OF TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT THE GREATER BAY AREA REALLY NEEDS TO  
19 SERVICE THE DAY-TO-DAY TRIPS OF FOLKS IN OUR COMMUNITIES. AND  
20 WITH THAT, I WILL STOP. AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. SO, RANDI KINMAN HAS A  
23 HAND.

24



January 22, 2021

1 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO PUT IN THE CIRCLE BACK  
2 TO, AT SOME POINT IN TIME, A COMBINATION OF A COUPLE OF  
3 THINGS, AND THAT'S A CAP TO DAY PASS. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT --  
4 AND I REALLY APPRECIATE RICK'S STATEMENTS, BECAUSE WE NEED TO  
5 BE LOOKING AHEAD AT THE SYSTEM WE WANT TO DESIGN, AND RIGHT  
6 NOW OUR SYSTEM IS NOT DESIGNED FOR THE MASSIVE AMOUNT OF  
7 PEOPLE WHO ACTUALLY BRING MONEY INTO THIS REGION, WHICH IS OUR  
8 TOURIST INDUSTRY. SO MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN OFFER THAT AS A  
9 PROMOTIONAL ITEM TO HOTELS, TO CONVENTION CENTERS, TO ALL OF  
10 THESE PEOPLE WHO EITHER BRING IN-HOUSE DRAW BRINGING IN A HUGE  
11 AMOUNT OF MONEY INTO THIS REGION IN DAY-TO-DAY THINGS OR  
12 SPECIAL EVENTS, I THINK THAT'S REALLY GOING TO BE AN IMPORTANT  
13 SERVICE TO OFFER DOWN THE ROAD. THANK YOU.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. AND I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS TO  
16 ADD TO HERE. AND ONE IS A QUESTION ABOUT HOW COST IS GOING TO  
17 BE LOOKED AT. SO, IN THE ANALYSIS IS, IS THE ANALYSIS GOING TO  
18 COME BACK WITH BOTH THE COSTS AND THE DIVERSE SETS OF BENEFITS  
19 FOR EACH OPTION THAT IS STUDIED?

20

21 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES. SO THE BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS, THE  
22 ULTIMATE -- THE SORT OF THE STEP WHERE WE DO DETAILED ANALYSIS  
23 ON THE SHORT LIST OF OPTIONS, IT WILL HAVE -- WE'LL ATTEMPT TO  
24 SORT OF MODEL TRAVEL BEHAVIOR IMPACTS TO THE EXTENT POSSIBLE,  
25 RIGHT? WE'LL USE THAT TO TRY TO ACCESS THE IMPACT ON TRAVEL



January 22, 2021

1 BEHAVIOR. WE'RE GOING TO TRY TO DO SOME KIND OF ESTIMATE OF  
2 SORT OF SECOND ARE THE IMPACTS ON THINGS LIKE VMT AND AIR  
3 POLLUTION. THERE IS GOING TO BE AN EVALUATION OF, YOU KNOW,  
4 SORT OF THE REVENUE IMPACTS IN TERMS OF THE CHANGES IN THE  
5 FARE STRUCTURE, BUT THEN ALSO THE COST TO IMPLEMENT THE  
6 IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES, ET CETERA. SO, YOU KNOW THERE IS  
7 PARTS OF THE -- THERE IS CASE ANALYSIS THAT TRIES TO HIT EACH  
8 OF THOSE BUCKETS.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** UH-HUH. OKAY. AND, SO ONE THING THAT WOULD  
11 BE INTERESTING TO ANALYZE IN TERMS OF THE COST AS A VARIANT OF  
12 SOMETHING THAT IS IN HERE, I THINK THAT THERE IS AN IDEA  
13 HEREOF THE SECOND ZONE FREE, BUT THERE ARE, OFTEN, ARE  
14 SUGGESTIONS OF MAKING LOCAL BUSES FREE, AND I THINK THAT WOULD  
15 BE THE EQUIVALENT -- ACTUALLY LET ME START SOME PLACE ELSE AND  
16 COME BACK TO THAT. SO, I DEFINITELY THINK THAT WE SHOULD BE  
17 INCLUDING SOME OPTIONS THAT ARE, YOU KNOW, MODE AGNOSTIC  
18 WHERE, YOU KNOW, FOR THE SAME PRICE, YOU CAN USE A, YOU KNOW,  
19 FASTER TRAIN, AND, YOU KNOW, TO TAKE A BASIC TRIP, YOU KNOW,  
20 THERE IS A FIX -- YOU KNOW, A GOOD AMOUNT OF STRUCTURE IN THE  
21 U.S. AND FARE STRUCTURE THAT'S DESIGNED WITH THE IDEA THAT LOW  
22 INCOME PEOPLE WILL USE BUSES AND HIGH INCOME PEOPLE WILL USE  
23 FAST TRAINS, AND THERE'S NO NEED TO PROVIDE AFFORDABILITY TO  
24 SERVICES, AND SO I THINK THAT IT SHOULD BE STUDIED THAT THE  
25 RIDERSHIP ASSETS AND EQUITY BENEFITS ARE HAVING A MODE



January 22, 2021

1 AGNOSTIC SYSTEM AND WITH THAT POTENTIALLY TO HAVE AN OPTION OF  
2 NO FARE ON A SECOND ZONE BUT THEN NO FARE ON A FIRST ZONE IT  
3 COULD BE LOCAL BUS FREE BUT ALSO POTENTIALLY ALLOW SOMEBODY TO  
4 TAKE A SHORT TRAIN RIDE FOR FREE, AND IT MIGHT WIND UP BEING  
5 QUITE COSTLY BUT IT WOULD BE INTERESTING AND INFORMATIVE AND  
6 INTERESTING TO SEE FOR PEOPLE WHAT THAT COST IS. IN TERMS OF  
7 FARE BY DISTANCE, I THINK THAT'S ALSO SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE  
8 REALLY IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT THE COST IMPLICATIONS. BECAUSE IF  
9 WE HAD ENTIRELY FLAT FARES, WHAT WOULD BE THE IMPACT OF  
10 REVENUE, AND HOW MUCH DIFFERENT REVENUE WERE HIGHER BASE  
11 PRICES BE NEEDED TO HAVE, YOU KNOW, A FLAT FARE STRUCTURE. BUT  
12 I DO THINK THAT -- LIKE, IN THAT CURVE, THERE WAS A, DIFFERENT  
13 OPTIONS FOR STEEPNESS, AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT  
14 VARIABLE TO RESEARCH. ONE SUGGESTION I HAVE, AND THIS GOES TO  
15 CONCERNS ABOUT THE INSTITUTIONAL PASSES. CALTRAIN JUST DID  
16 SOMETHING REALLY INNOVATIVE, WHICH WAS, THEY HAD AN  
17 INSTITUTIONAL PASS THAT WAS, UNTIL VERY RECENTLY, ONLY ABLE TO  
18 BE USED BY FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES OF MAJOR CORPORATIONS WHICH  
19 GAVE THE DEEPEST DISCOUNTS TO THE HIGHEST INCOME WORKERS. AND  
20 THAT WAS AN UPSIDE DOWN PERSPECTIVE OF EQUITY AND THEY  
21 RECENTLY ENABLED THAT PASS TO BE USED BY CONTRACTORS AND PART-  
22 TIME WORKERS AND NOT ONLY THAT, TO ALLOW THOSE PASSES TO BE  
23 DONATED TO NON-PROFITS AND THOSE NON-PROFITS COULD BE SOCIAL  
24 SERVICE AGENCIES OR ALSO COULD BE TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT  
25 ASSOCIATIONS THAT SERVE SMALL BUSINESSES THAT HAVE LOW-





January 22, 2021

1 WAGEWORKERS. SO, I THINK THAT, AS ANNE OLIVIA MENTIONED, IF WE  
2 WANT TO GET THE BENEFITS OF HAVING PROGRAMS TO, YOU KNOW, BULK  
3 INCENT WORKINGS AND GROUPS OF PEOPLE TO COME UP WITH A  
4 MECHANISM THAT ALLOWS INCENTIVES TO GO TO LOWER INCOME SETS OF  
5 PEOPLE, AS WELL. I WILL HAVE MORE QUESTIONS ABOUT EQUITY  
6 BEFORE WE ARE DONE, BUT WOULD LOVE TO MOVE ON. ACTUALLY, BRIAN  
7 HAD A HAND.

8

9 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU ADINA. YEAH, I JUST WANT TO CHECK IN  
10 WITH MIKE ON WHAT EXACTLY IS THE FEEDBACK ON THE SIX OPTIONS  
11 YOU'RE LOOKING FOR TODAY? SEVERAL PANELISTS RAISED SOME GOOD  
12 POINTS ABOUT EQUITY, AND, YOU KNOW, AND REVERSE PEAK, AND THAT  
13 GETS TO THE FARES BY TIME OF TRAVEL AND CUSTOMER TYPE THAT YOU  
14 WEREN'T WORKING AT TODAY, BUT I THINK THE PLAN WAS MAKING  
15 IMPORTANT POINTS, BUT WHAT FEEDBACK DO YOU WANT?

16

17 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WE ARE TRYING TO LAY OUT WHAT WE UNDERSTAND  
18 TO BE THE UNIVERSE OF OPTIONS. WE'RE LOOKING FOR YOUR INPUT ON  
19 ANYTHING THAT SORT OF IS MISSING FROM THIS LIST. THIS IS THE  
20 FIRST OF FOUR OF THESE TABLES SO WE'RE GOING GO THROUGH ALL  
21 FOUR, AND THEN AT THE END, WE ARE ALSO GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE  
22 SCREENING CRITERIA, AT A HIGH LEVEL, AT A VERY HIGH LEVEL FOR  
23 HOW WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT FROM LONG LIST TO SHORT LIST.  
24 BUT I THINK FOR NOW, AS WE RUN THROUGH THEM, ONE IS, ANY  
25 CLARIFICATION NEED, TWO, MATTERS OF PREFERENCE WHICH WE WILL



January 22, 2021

1 CERTAINLY MAKE A NOTE ON IN TERMS OF OPTIONS BUT THE MOST  
2 IMPORTANT IS, IS THERE ANYTHING MISSING HERE THAT WE SHOULD BE  
3 ADDING. AND ONE THING TO LOOK AT IS OUR NUMBER SIX HERE IS  
4 INTEND TO UNDERSTAND INCLUSIVE OF A LOT OF THE PASS IDEAS THAT  
5 FOLKS ARE THROWING OUT, IS THIS ONE OPTION OR SHOULD BE SPLIT  
6 INTO MORE THAN ONE ROW, IT'S SOMETHING THAT I THINK I WOULD  
7 WANT TO GO BACK AND TALK TO OUR PROJECT TEAM ABOUT.

8

9 **BRIAN STANKE:** A REGIONAL PASS OR CAP IS SOMETHING YOU CAN  
10 APPLY TO ANY OF THEM.

11

12 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH.

13

14 **BRIAN STANKE:** IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE TO SPLIT IT NOW.

15

16 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** IT'S A DISTINCT OPTION AS LISTED HERE IF IT  
17 WERE THE ONLY CHANGE. YOU COULD LEAVE EVERYTHING INTACT BUT  
18 ADD A REGIONAL PASS, THAT WOULD BE AN ALTERNATIVE AND IT'S  
19 ALSO A VARIANCE AS ANOTHER OPTION.

20

21 **BRIAN STANKE:** I'M JUST NOT SURE IF THERE'S OPTIONS THAT DO  
22 VERY LITTLE, IS IT WORTH PURSUING THOSE? WE GET ALL THE WAY TO  
23 THE BIG TENT AND THEN DON'T CHANGE ANYTHING.

24



January 22, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** JUST A STRUCTURED FARE ADDING A MONTHLY PASS  
2 THAT YOU COULD RIDE TRANSIT, THE WHOLE REASON THAT WOULD BE A  
3 BIG CHANGE AND I'M NOT SURE THAT'S A FARE -- IT WOULD BE A  
4 LESS INTENSIVE CHANGE OR LESS REVOLUTIONARY THAN SOME OF THESE  
5 OTHER IDEAS, FOR SURE. AND IF FOLKS HAVE SOME OTHER OPTIONS  
6 THEY WANT TO TOSS IN --

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** RICH HEDGES HAS A HAND. RICH, DO YOU HAVE  
9 ANOTHER COMMENT ABOUT THESE OR DO YOU STILL HAVE YOUR HAND  
10 RAISED FROM BEFORE?

11

12 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I HAVE ANOTHER COMMENT.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY.

15

16 **RICHARD HEDGES:** GO AHEAD?

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YEAH. GO AHEAD.

19

20 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIZE SOMETHING FROM  
21 MY FIRST COMMENT. I THINK THAT THE PASSES CAN FUNCTION AS A  
22 FLAT FARE, AND IF YOU ADD THE DAY PASS, AND IT GIVES PEOPLE  
23 THOSE THREE OPTIONS, THOSE ARE, DEPENDING ON THEIR COST AND  
24 HOW ASSESSABLE THEY ARE TO PEOPLE OF LOWER INCOME, I THINK  
25 THAT'S AN ANSWER FOR FIXING A FLAT FARE. YOU SAID OTHER



January 22, 2021

1 SYSTEMS, AND I THINK IT WORKS QUITE WELL. I WAS SURPRISED I  
2 ONLY SAW THE MONTHLY OR WEEKLY PASS WRITTEN DOWN HERE. BECAUSE  
3 I HAVE BEEN POUNDING FOR THIS DAY PASS FOR YEARS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO WE ARE NOW MOVING ON TO THE NEXT  
6 SET OF OPTIONS.

7

8 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY. SURE. ON THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS  
9 THE GREAT ALLIANCE, AND YOU WILL NOTICE HERE THAT THE LIST OF  
10 OPTIONS IS THE SAME. SO, THE KEY DIFFERENCE HERE, THE GRAY  
11 ALLIANCE IS A DIFFERENT PATHWAY IT'S A QUESTION OF MANAGEMENT  
12 AUTHORITY. IN THIS APPROACH, INSTEAD OF HAVING A SINGLE FARE  
13 SETTING AUTHORITY, YOU HAVE POTENTIALLY ALL THE OPERATORS IN  
14 THE REGION COMING TOGETHER TO WORK TOGETHER WITHIN A SINGLE  
15 STRUCTURE. SO, YOU MIGHT HAVE A, YOU KNOW, AN EXAMPLE, THE  
16 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, OR A SUBCOMMITTEE THAT RUNS THIS  
17 PROJECT, THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE HAS MANY TRANSIT  
18 AGENCIES THEY MAKE CERTAIN DECISIONS TOGETHER EXCEPT CERTAIN  
19 STANDARDS. TOGETHER A BODY LIKE THAT COULD BE THE MANAGEMENT  
20 STRUCTURE FOR FARES. EACH TRANSIT AGENCY BOARD IN THIS  
21 FRAMEWORK MAINTAINS ITS OWN FARE SETTING AUTHORITY. THEY AGREE  
22 TO WORK WITHIN A PARTICULAR STRUCTURE. FOR EXAMPLE, CELLULAR  
23 ZONES, CELLULAR ZONES WITH FLAT FARES, FARES BY DISTANCE WITH  
24 LOCAL FLAT FARE. THE STRUCTURE WOULD BE APPLIED REGION-WIDE  
25 BUT THE OPTION IN THE MIX HERE IS THAT WITHIN THAT ZONE



January 22, 2021

1 STRUCTURE, EACH AGENCY WOULD HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO SET ITS OWN  
2 FARE. SO MUNI AND AC TRANSIT MIGHT BOTH HAVE FLAT FARES AS  
3 THEY DO TODAY BUT THEY MIGHT HAVE A DIFFERENT FLAT FARE. SO  
4 WITHIN THAT FRAMEWORK, THE GENERAL LIST OF OPTIONS ARE THE  
5 SAME. THE -- LET'S SEE. THE -- SO I THINK A KEY DIFFERENCE IN  
6 TERMS OF IMP IMPLEMENTIBILITY OF THESE OPTIONS IS QUITE  
7 DIFFERENT. ON THE ONE HAND IT REMOVES THE REQUIREMENT THAT THE  
8 BASIC LAWS IN SOME CASES IN RULES ESTABLISHING TRANSIT AGENCY  
9 GOVERNANCE WOULDN'T HAVE TO BE REPLACED WITH SOMETHING NEW  
10 WHICH IS AN IMPLEMENTIBILITY ADVANTAGE. BUT THE SYSTEM ITSELF  
11 IS QUITE STABLE. IN A SITUATION WHERE BART BOARD AND AC  
12 TRANSIT COULD OPT OUT AND DIFFERENT FROM THEIR NEIGHBORHOOD  
13 THAT WOULDN'T BE AS CLEAR AND STRAIGHT FORWARD TO THE RIDER.  
14 LET ME LEAVE THAT THERE. THIS DECISION IS AMONG THE HARDEST  
15 EVEN FOR US TO SORT OF GET OUR HEADS AROUND. I HAVE EXPLAINED  
16 BEST I CAN. I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT ONE THOUGH. SO I'LL OPEN  
17 IT UP TO QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS, CONCERNS ABOUT THIS  
18 DISTINCTION.

19

20 **WILLIAM BACON:** THIS IS BILL. I THINK AS HE SAID THIS IS HARD  
21 TO INTERPRET WHAT THIS DISTINCTION IS AND I'LL THROW OUT TWO  
22 EXAMPLES. THINK, FOR EXAMPLE, YOU WERE -- THERE WAS A REGIONAL  
23 ZONE BASED SYSTEM, THERE WAS A MAP THAT HAD CELLULAR ZONES FOR  
24 OUR REGION, BUT IF YOU TOOK A SAMTRANS BUS FROM THE PENINSULA  
25 TO SAN FRANCISCO, AND YOU TRAVELED THROUGH THREE ZONES, THAT



January 22, 2021

1 WOULD BE THE SAME ZONE APP THAT SOMEONE COULD USE A GOLDEN  
2 GATE TRANSIT BUS TO TRAVEL FROM SANTA ROSA TO SAN FRANCISCO  
3 WAS LOOKING AT, BUT EACH AGENCY, SAMTRANS AND GOLDEN GATE HAVE  
4 THEIR OWN FARE TABLE FOR WHAT IT COST TO TRAVEL THROUGH, YOU  
5 KNOW, THE CERTAIN NUMBER OF ZONES YOU'RE GOING THROUGH. SO  
6 THAT'S MAYBE ONE THING TO THINK ABOUT IS THOSE ARE THE KIND OF  
7 DISTINCTIONS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO DOES ANYBODY HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS  
10 ABOUT THIS SET OF OPTIONS? I SEE WENDI'S HAND.

11

12 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** YEAH. THANKS FOR TRYING TO CLARIFY  
13 THAT, BILL. JUST SO THAT I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE SAYING. SO,  
14 IN THE LAST ONE, THERE WOULD BE, LIKE, ONE UNIVERSAL MAP THAT  
15 SHOWS ALL OF THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND IN THIS ONE EACH  
16 INDIVIDUAL AGENCY WOULD HAVE ITS OWN MAP. IS THAT THE  
17 DISTINCTION? OKAY. DIDN'T GET IT THEN.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THE MAP MIGHT BE THE SAME BUT THE PRICE  
20 DIFFERENT. THE MAP, SO TO TAKE A TRIP LET'S SEE, ON AC TRANSIT  
21 OR BART, YOU KNOW BART -- THE ZONES MIGHT BE THE SAME,  
22 EVERYBODY WOULD WORK FROM THE SAME ZONE MAP, BUT THE BART  
23 BOARD WOULD HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO SET ONE PRICE FOR THAT TRIP  
24 AND AC AUTHORITY BOARD WOULD HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO SET A  
25 DIFFERENT PRICE FOR THE SAME TRIP.



January 22, 2021

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** WHEREAS IN THE BIG TENT EVERYBODY IS  
3 OPERATING UNDER THE SAME PRICE RANGE. IS PRICE RANGE GOING TO  
4 VARY DEPENDING ON WHETHER IT'S A BUS OR A TRAIN?

5

6 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** IT COULD. SO UNDER THE BIG TENT WE LEAVE OPEN  
7 THE OPTION FOR HAVING DIFFERENT PRICING FOR DIFFERENT MODES.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** GREAT. I UNDERSTAND IT NOW.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** AND I SEE THAT RICH HEDGES HAS A HAND.

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. YEAH. I'M LOOKING AT THIS, AND TELL  
14 ME IF I'M WRONG. IT TELLS ME THIS IS MORE COMPLICATED FOR A  
15 RIDER. LET ME GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE, A YOUNG WOMAN WORKED AT  
16 SAFE WAY SHE GOT OFF, WORKED VERY LATE, SHEER -- SHE DIDN'T  
17 HAVE A CAR. SHE MISSED THE BUS SAMTRANS BUS, CALTRAIN PULLED  
18 UP IS SHE JUMPED ON IT PAID HER FARE, AND UNFORTUNATELY SHE  
19 PAID ONLY ONE ZONE BUT THE STATION SHE WAS GOING TO WAS  
20 PASSED, SHE GOT A 280 THERE PARTICULATE FROM CALTRAIN WE WERE  
21 ABLE TO GET THAT DISMISSED FOR OUR MEMBER, BUT IT WAS A LOT OF  
22 STRESS FOR HER. SO IT LOOKS LIKE THIS IS A SYSTEM THAT WOULD  
23 BE MORE COMPLICATED TO FIGURE OUT HOW MUCH IT'S GOING TO COST  
24 THEM, AND UNLESS THEY'RE WELL HEALED AND CAN LEAVE A LARGE  
25 AMOUNT OF MONEY ON A TAP CARD, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE



January 22, 2021

1 PEOPLE GETTING INTO TROUBLE. THANK YOU. OH, AND TELL ME IF I'M  
2 -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YOU HAVE GOT IT. THERE IS MORE RULES TO LEARN  
5 IN THIS -- IN THE DIFFERENT -- IN THE FRAMEWORK WE HAVE  
6 DESCRIBED HERE, POTENTIALLY, IN THE BIG TENT.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA?

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANKS SO MUCH. SORRY TO BE TALKING SO  
11 MUCH TODAY. BUT, JUST TO MAKE IT EVEN MORE COMPLICATED, IT  
12 SEEMS LIKE THE ADVANTAGE TO EACH SYSTEM IS GOING TO DEPEND  
13 PRETTY HEAVILY ON THE PERSPECTIVE THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT IT  
14 FROM. SO INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT AGENCIES MAY WISH TO RETAIN A MORE  
15 AUTONOMY OVER THEIR ABILITY TO SET PRICES, WHEREAS FROM A TRANSIT  
16 RIDER PERSPECTIVE, A DIFFERENT OPTION MAY BE PREFERABLE. SO IF  
17 WE -- LIKE, IS THERE A WAY TO LOOK AT, MAYBE IT'S THE SAME  
18 PRICE FOR THE RIDER, BUT THE PERCENTAGE OF EACH FARE IS SPLIT  
19 BETWEEN -- LIKE, IF IT'S A MULTIPLE FARE RIDE, THAT THINGS CAN  
20 BE SPLIT DIFFERENTLY? OR IS THERE AN OPTION TO KEEP THINGS AS  
21 SIMPLE AS POSSIBLE FOR THE RIDER WHILE ACKNOWLEDGING DIFFERENT  
22 LEVELS OF RELIANCE ON FARES BY DIFFERENT AGENCIES, AS WELL AS  
23 DIFFERENT OPERATIONAL COSTS, WHETHER FROM HAVING MADE PRUDENT  
24 INVESTMENTS EARLY ON, OR FROM JUST DIFFERENT COSTS FOR  
25 OPERATION?





January 22, 2021

1

2 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. I THINK, REALLY, IN ANY OF THESE  
3 OPTIONS, THERE WOULD HAVE TO BE SOME KIND OF REVENUE SHARING  
4 OR DISTRIBUTION MODEL WHERE WE MAKE SURE THAT ALL THE SERVICES  
5 -- WHERE THE REVENUE GETS COLLECTED AND THE SERVICES GET PAID  
6 FOR. SO BOTH BIG TENT AND GREAT ALLIANCE, THERE WOULD HAVE TO  
7 BE A REVENUE SHARING MODEL OF THE TYPE THAT YOU DESCRIBED. I  
8 THINK THAT -- SO A LOT OF THE DISTINCTION HERE DOES HAVE TO DO  
9 WITH SORT OF AGENCY AUTONOMY, AND AGENCY PREROGATIVE, RIGHT?  
10 WHICH MAY NOT BE THAT IMPORTANT OR IMPRESSIVE TO A CUSTOMER.  
11 WE'RE TRYING TO LOOK AT THIS FROM A CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE.  
12 THERE IS STAKEHOLDERS HERE WHO WOULD ALSO MAKE THE CASE THAT  
13 SOME DEGREE OF LOCAL CONTROL IS GOOD FOR ITS OWN SAKE.  
14 ASSOCIATION FOR EXAMPLE, A PARTICULAR COMMUNITY MIGHT REALLY  
15 WANT TO PROVIDE A SUBSIDY TO PROVIDE A HIGHER SENIOR DISCOUNT,  
16 FOR EXAMPLE, THAN SOME OTHER SYSTEM, RIGHT? SO YOU MIGHT WANT  
17 TO -- THAT MIGHT BE SOMETHING YOU VALUE, HAVING COMMUNITIES BE  
18 ABLE TO DIRECTLY PROVIDE THAT SUBSIDY. SO A FRAMEWORK LIKE THE  
19 GREAT ALLIANCE WOULD ALLOW THEM THAT KIND OF LOCAL CONTROL.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IAN.

22

23 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH, SO I DON'T -- THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE  
24 WAY YOU CHARACTERIZE THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE GREAT ALLIANCE  
25 OPTION AND THE BIG TENT BASICALLY THIS ALLOWS FOR DIFFERENT



January 22, 2021

1 AGENCIES OR PARTS OF THE REGION TO SET, SAY, A DIFFERENT LOCAL  
2 TRANSIT FARE. THAT'S POSSIBLE UNDER THE BIG TENT OPTION TOO.  
3 SO THAT'S NOT -- I MEAN, THE BIG TENT OPTION, YOU KNOW, GOING  
4 BACK TO MARK'S QUESTION, LIKE, WHICH OPTION ALLOWS FOR THE  
5 GREATEST RANGE, AND FLEXIBILITY OF APPROACHES, LIKE, I THINK,  
6 MY RESPONSE TO THAT QUESTION WOULD BE BIG TENT, BECAUSE YOU  
7 CAN PUT AS MUCH KIND OF REGIONAL DIFFERENTIATION IN YOU WANT  
8 TO, YOU CAN TAYLOR EQUITY POLICIES FOR A POLICY OR CONNECT  
9 POLICY FOR DIFFERENT PARTS A REGION, I THINK THE RIDERSHIP AND  
10 OTHER COMPONENTS OF THESE APPROACHES, THE GREAT ALLIANCE AND  
11 BIG TENT -- THROUGH THE SAME PERSPECTIVE, THE BIG TENT OPTION  
12 WHERE BY YOU SAY SAN FRANCISCO HAS A LOCAL BASE FARE OF \$3 AND  
13 THEN INCREMENTAL \$1 EXTRA FOR EVERY TIME THAT YOU GO AND THAT  
14 THE LOCAL BASE PAIR IS \$2 SONOMA COUNTY, THAT COULD BE A BIG  
15 TENT MODEL LIKE SONOMA COUNTY HAVING PASSED SOME LOCAL TAX AND  
16 WANTING TO KEEP LOCAL FARES LOWER BUT THE INCREMENT FOR GOING  
17 LONGER DISTANCE IS GREATER. SO I GUESS I JUST -- YEAH, I GUESS  
18 THAT'S MY MAIN COMMENT IS I DON'T SEE THAT -- AS YOU EVALUATE  
19 THE BENEFITS OF EACH OF THESE OPTIONS, I SUSPECT THERE IS  
20 REALLY NO DIFFERENCE IN TERMS OF RIDERSHIP AND MODELING AND  
21 PRICING THAT WOULD REALLY COME FROM THE ORGANIZATION. I THINK  
22 THE QUESTION IS WHICH GOVERNANCE MODEL IS ACTUALLY MORE LIKELY  
23 TO ENABLE THE KIND OF, THE FLEXIBILITY OF THESE OPTIONS WHICH  
24 IS I GUESS A DIFFERENT PART OF THE BUSINESS CASE. I THINK  
25 THAT'S ALL I WANTED TO SAY. I'M SORRY -- WHILE I -- SO I DON'T



January 22, 2021

1 HAVE TO RAISE MY HAND A SECOND TIME, AS FAR AS PREFERENCES, IT  
2 WOULD BE GOOD TO STUDY CERTAINLY A CELLULAR ZONE OPTION, A  
3 FARE BY DISTANCE OPTION. I'M LESS CLEAR ON THE BENEFITS OF A  
4 REGIONAL CAP OR PASS. HONESTLY, IF YOU DO THAT AS A STANDALONE  
5 THING, I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE IT BE AT A SUBREGIONAL  
6 LEVEL NOT JUST AT A REGIONAL LEVEL. I THINK NINE COUNTIES FEW  
7 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO TRAVEL WITHIN THE FULL NINE COUNTIES AND I  
8 THINK YOU WOULD END UP WITH A PASS THAT IS QUITE EXPENSIVE  
9 WHEREAS IF YOU HAD AN EAST BAY PASS AND A NORTH BAY PASS, AND  
10 A SAN FRANCISCO PENINSULA, YOU KNOW, YOU MIGHT HAVE A SET OF  
11 PASSES THAT ARE REALLY SUBREGIONAL IN NATURE, AND THAT MIGHT  
12 BE A -- IF YOU'RE GOING TO STUDY THAT AT ALL, I WOULD SAY THAT  
13 WOULD BE THE WHERE TIME MIGHT BE OF GREATER VALUE.

14

15 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** AND ON THE DISTINCTION WITH GREAT ALLIANCE  
16 AND BIG TENT YOU'RE RIGHT AND I AGREE ALL OF THESE OPTIONS ARE  
17 AVAILABLE ACTUALLY ON THE TABLE. SO WE'RE TRYING TO  
18 DISTINGUISH BUT OF COURSE YEAH A FARE SETTING AUTHORITY COULD  
19 SET DIFFERENT PRICES WITHIN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION IF  
20 THAT WERE THE POLICY CHOICE OF THE SINGLE FARE SETTING ENTITY.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I SEE THAT BRIAN HAS A  
23 HAND.

24



January 22, 2021

1 **BRIAN STANKE:** THANK YOU. YEAH, I'M JUST STRUGGLING WITH  
2 LOOKING AT THIS FROM THE RIDER PERSPECTIVE, HOW GOING FROM ONE  
3 UNDERSTANDABLE SET OF RULES TO 20 NOT UNDERSTANDABLE SET OF  
4 RULES IS SOMEHOW PREFERABLE. IF WE WANT TO HAVE COMPLETE LOCAL  
5 CONTROL AND THE COMPONENT OF RIDERSHIP AND DEATH SPIRALS, WE  
6 HAVE THAT. [LAUGHTER] I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO FOCUS ON WHAT  
7 ARE THE SYSTEMS THAT ENABLE THE MODE SHIFT, THE GREENHOUSE GAS  
8 GOALS THE REGION KEEPS TALKING ABOUT AND NOT ACCOMPLISHING. IF  
9 WE DON'T CENTER THAT AT SOME LEVEL, I DO NOT SEE WHY WE'RE  
10 SPENDING ALL THIS TIME ON IT. I MEAN, TO ME THE DIFFERENCE  
11 BETWEEN GREAT ALLIANCE AND THE BIG TENT SEEMS LIKE IT MIGHT  
12 EASIER BECAUSE SOMEONE DOESN'T HAVE TO PASS A STATE LAW, BUT  
13 I'M NOT SURE THAT SHOULD BE THE CRITERIA WE'RE USING FOR  
14 DECIDING WHICH WAY THE REGION GOES, IF WE'RE TRYING TO  
15 ACCOMPLISH OUR GOALS.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I WANT TO COME BACK TO THAT  
18 POINT WHEN WE GET TO EVALUATION CRITERIA, TOO, BECAUSE THAT'S  
19 A REALLY IMPORTANT POINT. I HAVE A COUPLE OF BRIEF COMMENTS,  
20 AND THEN WANT TO MOVE ON TO THE OTHER SCENARIOS. ONE IS, I  
21 WANT TO ECHO WHAT SEVERAL OTHER PEOPLE SAID, IS THAT FROM THE  
22 PERSPECTIVE OF THE CUSTOMER, THIS TAKES A REALLY SIGNIFICANT  
23 STEP DOWN. SO WHEN I'M TRAVELING BETWEEN THE MID-PENINSULA AND  
24 OAKLAND, AND HAVE A CHOICE BETWEEN, YOU KNOW, THE DB BUS AND  
25 BART, OR BART AND CALTRAIN, OR JUST BART, AND HAVING THREE



January 22, 2021

1 DIFFERENT PRICES FOR ESSENTIALLY THE SAME TRIP, YOU KNOW, LIKE  
2 THAT IS THE CONFUSING WORLD THAT IS NOW, AND IT'S THE  
3 CONFUSING WORLD THAT IS, YOU KNOW, IN THIS. SO I DON'T SEE  
4 THIS AS PROVIDING SIGNIFICANT SIMPLIFICATION. I KNOW THAT'S  
5 NOT WHAT YOU'RE ASKING. YOU'RE GOING TO BE STUDYING OPTION IN  
6 EACH BUCKET. BUT, YOU KNOW, JUST IN GOING FROM THE ONE TO THE  
7 OTHER, THE LEVEL OF USER UNDERSTANDABILITY HAS GONE DOWN. IN  
8 TERMS OF THE PREVIOUS COMMENT ABOUT PICKING SUBREGIONAL  
9 PASSES, I WANT TO, AGAIN, USE THAT PENINSULA/OAKLAND TRIP, AS  
10 AN EXAMPLE SO THAT IF YOU WERE UP FRONT DECIDING WHETHER TO  
11 CREATE A SPECIAL PASS FOR, YOU MIGHT NOT DO IT, BUT THAT'S  
12 ACTUALLY SOMETHING WHERE THERE IS PLENTY OF CAR TRAFFIC, AND  
13 LIKE WITH A SIMPLE ENOUGH STRUCTURE, THAT WILL JUST MAKE THAT  
14 TRIP EASY, AS OPPOSED TO COMMUNICATING WITH A FARE STRUCTURE,  
15 LIKE, WHY ARE YOU TRYING TO DO THAT WITH TRANSIT? JUST GET A  
16 CAR. I WANT TO GO BACK TO THE QUESTION ABOUT THE ABILITY TO DO  
17 PARTICULAR SUBSIDIES AND IS THAT COMPATIBLE WITH THE BIG TENT  
18 MODEL. IT SEEMS IT SHOULD BE. BECAUSE IF YOU HAVE A CONSISTENT  
19 FARE STRUCTURE, THEN YOU COULD PROVIDE A SUBSIDY TO A SET OF  
20 PEOPLE. THE THING IS THAT SUBSIDY WOULD PERTAIN TO ALL OF THE  
21 TRANSIT THAT THEY HAVE THE ABILITY TO USE. SO IF YOU HAD A  
22 COLLEGE OR A UNIVERSITY, INSTEAD OF SAYING THE PEOPLE IN THIS  
23 COLLEGE ARE GOING TO GET A SAMTRANS PASS, YOU WILL STATE  
24 PEOPLE IN THIS COLLEGE GET A TRANSIT PASS THAT THEY CAN USE,  
25 SAMTRANS OR CALTRAIN OR A FERRY OR WHATEVER IT IS THAT



January 22, 2021

1 PERTAINS TO THEM, AND EVEN, SIMILARLY, YOU COULD POTENTIALLY  
2 DO AN EXTRA SUBSIDY FOR PEOPLE WHO, YOU KNOW, LIVE OR WORK IN  
3 AN AREA, BUT IT WOULD PERTAIN TO ALL OF THE TRANSIT THAT THEY  
4 HAVE THE ABILITY TO USE. SO THIS WOULD BE LIKE WE -- THE  
5 TREASURE ISLAND PASS, WHICH, YOU KNOW, GIVES A PASS FOR ALL  
6 THE TRANSIT THAT PEOPLE CAN USE TO GET ON TO, OR OFF OF OR ON  
7 TREASURE ISLAND. BUT, INSTEAD OF HAVING TO HAND CRAFT IT, IT  
8 WOULD BE, LIKE, HERE IS YOUR STANDARD FARE STRUCTURE, AND THEN  
9 YOU CAN PROVIDE EXTRA SUBSIDIES FOR PEOPLE THAT ARE IN A  
10 LOCATION. AND I DON'T SEE THAT AS BEING NECESSARILY  
11 INCOMPATIBLE WITH THAT BIG TENT MODEL, IT'S JUST WHAT THAT  
12 SUBSIDY GETS YOU. I SEE THAT THERE IS ONE MORE COMMENT ON THIS  
13 TOPIC BEFORE WE MOVE ON. TISHA DEE HARTMAN?

14

15 **TISHA DEE HARTMAN:** SORRY. THAT MUST HAVE BEEN LEFT ON FROM  
16 EARLIER. MY APOLOGIES.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO GREAT. LET US MOVE ON TO MORE OPTIONS.

19

20 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** OKAY, YEAH, LET'S GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE,  
21 PLEASE. AND, YOU KNOW, THIS -- SO, ONE, I'LL JUST STEP BACK TO  
22 THE -- TO IAN'S COMMENT, AND MY RESPONSE A MINUTE AGO, BECAUSE  
23 WE WERE TALKING ABOUT, OPPORTUNITY PERHAPS UNDER A SINGLE FARE  
24 SETTING AUTHORITY TO MAKE DISTINCTIONS BETWEEN DIFFERENT PARTS  
25 OF THE REGION OR DIFFERENT SERVICES. THIS IS THE SET OF



January 22, 2021

1 OPTIONS THAT RELATES MOST. A SINGLE FARE SETTING AUTHORITY  
2 CAMPSITE, AS IN BIG TENT BUT A NUMBER OF PERHAPS WITHIN THAT A  
3 NUMBER OF DIFFERENT DISTINCTIONS OR STRUCTURES. WE HAVE FOUR  
4 OPTIONS ON HERE. 50 IS THE OPPORTUNITY FOR INTEGRATION OR  
5 COORDINATION ALONG A SINGLE CORRIDOR. SO, THIS IS PRETTY --  
6 WOULD BE PRETTY SPECIFIC. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, THE CORRIDOR, FROM  
7 THE PENINSULA INTO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO, WE HAVE A NUMBER OF  
8 DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT OPERATE ALONG THAT CORRIDOR,  
9 AND WE COULD, AS A POLICY DECISION, FOCUS ON MAKING SURE THAT  
10 THE TRANSFERS IN THAT CORRIDOR ARE VERY ATTRACTIVE, THAT THE  
11 FARES ARE STANDARDIZED FOR ALL TRIPS ALONG THAT CORRIDOR. IT  
12 MAY BE SIMPLY A QUESTION OF PRIORITIZING PARTICULAR CORRIDORS  
13 OR ADDRESSING A PARTICULAR NEED THAT MAY EXIST ALONG A  
14 PARTICULAR CORRIDOR. SO THAT'S C1. WE COULD PRIORITIZE ON  
15 INTEGRATION BETWEEN SYSTEMS THAT HAVE THE MOST INTER-AGENCY  
16 TRANSFERS WE HIGHLIGHTED THAT IN THE LAST PRESENTATION FOR A  
17 TASK FORCE AND I THINK THE GROUP WE HIGHLIGHTED SOME DATA WERE  
18 ASSEMBLED WHERE THE MOST INTER-AGENCY TRIPS INTERSERVICE  
19 COUNTY TRANSIT WERE BEING MADE. THERE IS A LOT OF TRIPS FOR  
20 EXAMPLE, THAT USE BOTH AC TRANSIT AND BART. INTEGRATING AC  
21 TRANSIT AND BART TRANSIT BECAUSE THOSE ARE FREQUENTLY USED  
22 TOGETHER. YOU COULD EMPLOYEE AGENCY INTEGRATION AND CAPS, IAN  
23 YOU WERE REFERRING TO EARLIER YOU COULD HAVE PASS OR CAP  
24 PRODUCT THE FOR DIFFERENT SUBREGIONS WITHIN THE BAY AREA. AND  
25 PROBABLY NOT A LOT OF OVERLAP BETWEEN USERS OF NORTH BAY



January 22, 2021

1 SYSTEMS AND SOUTH BAY SYSTEMS. SO YOU COULD HAVE DISTINCT PASS  
2 OR CAPS FOR THOSE REGIONS. SO MAYBE I'LL LEAVE IT THERE AND  
3 ASK IF FOLKS HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ABOUT THIS SET OF  
4 OPTIONS.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** LET'S SEE. ANY HANDS FROM THE GROUP? I SEE  
7 THAT WENDI HAS A HAND.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** THIS IS ONE THING THAT CONCERNS ME  
10 ABOUT GROUPING WHAT IS HAPPENING NOW, THE EXISTING SITUATION,  
11 WHEN YOU GIVE THE EXAMPLE AC TRANSIT TRANSFERS TO BART DOESN'T  
12 TAKE INTO ACCOUNT RIGHT NOW WHERE WE HAVE A SITUATION WHERE  
13 SOMETIMES TWO SYSTEMS DON'T INTEGRATE VERY WELL SO FOR INSTANCE,  
14 I DON'T TAKE A BUS TO BART EVEN THOUGH THERE IS ONE, BECAUSE  
15 THIS IS MY FAVORITE STORY, BECAUSE WHEN I GET TO BART, THE  
16 TRAIN HAS LEFT TWO MINUTES BEFORE I GOT THERE. I WOULD LOVE TO  
17 TAKE THE BUS, I WOULD TRANSFER BETWEEN THE SYSTEMS, BUT  
18 THEY'RE NOT INTEGRATED SCHEDULE WISE. AND SO I WOULD BE VERY  
19 CAREFUL ABOUT MAKE DECISIONS BASED ON WHAT IT IS NOW SINCE WE  
20 DON'T HAVE A GOOD INTEGRATION TO BEGIN WITH

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARK CORDES?

23

24 **MARK CORDES:** YEAH, I'LL TAKE OUT OF THIS, THE CORRIDOR  
25 INTEGRATION FARE BY DISTANCE APPROACH. MY CONCERN IS THE





January 22, 2021

1 EQUITY PIECE. JUST BECAUSE THAT MIGHT MAKE THE MOST SENSE IN  
2 SORT OF SOME MATHEMATICAL SENSE OR STATISTICAL SENSE DOESN'T  
3 NECESSARILY MEAN THAT THE EQUITY NEEDS WE'RE CONCERNED ABOUT  
4 WOULD BE WELL CHAMPIONED BY THAT KIND OF DEPLOYMENT. IT SORT  
5 OF BRACES ME FOR ONE OF THE BUILDING BLOCKS OF AN INTEGRATED  
6 SYSTEM COULD BE SOME VERSION OF A SYSTEM OF A MEANS TESTING  
7 WHERE THERE IS AN AGREED UPON REGIME WHERE YOU PROVIDE REDUCED  
8 FARES FOR PEOPLE AT A CERTAIN INCOME LEVEL AND THAT DOES HAVE  
9 A SORT OF LOCALIZED REGIONAL COMPONENT CERTAINLY THE COST OF  
10 LIVING IN SAN FRANCISCO IS HIGHER, SO SOMEBODY JUST GETTING BY  
11 IN SAN FRANCISCO IS PROBABLY DOING IF WITH MORE DOLLARS THAN  
12 SOMEBODY IN FAIRFIELD MIGHT BE, BUT IN THE SENSE OF HOW CAN WE  
13 AGREE ON A REGIME WHERE WE'RE SUPPORTING THE COST AND  
14 PROVIDING SUPPORT TO COMMUNITIES EQUITY THAT ALLOWS THEM TO  
15 ACCESS THE CITIZEN HOWEVER THEY NEED TO USE IT. THAT KIND OF  
16 EQUITY BUILT INTO THE REGIME AND EVERYBODY PARTICIPATES IN  
17 SOME KIND OF MEANS TESTING. AND THE LAST THING I WANT TO SAY  
18 IS TRANSIT BARES THE BURDEN OF SOME OF OUR POLICY FAILURES  
19 PARTICULARLY IN THE AREA LIKE HOUSING. I DON'T KNOW THAT  
20 NECESSARILY WE WANT TO ASSUME THAT OUR CURRENT COMMUNITIES  
21 DISTRIBUTION IS WHAT IT'S ALWAYS GOING TO BE, THE INTENTIONAL  
22 CONSTRUCTION IN HIGH DENSITY AND URBAN CORRIDORS OF AFFORDABLE  
23 HOUSING COMPONENTS MIGHT FIND OURSELVES WITH COMMUNITIES IN A  
24 PLACE THAT WOULD MAYBE BE HIGHER MEANS BUT DOESN'T NECESSARILY  
25 POINT TO HOW IT WOULD BE TOMORROW IN THOUGH COMMUNITIES MIGHT



January 22, 2021

1 WELL SERVED IN THAT REGIME GETTING TO THE SENSE OF THE  
2 BUILDING AND WHAT DOES IT SOLVE WHAT IT MEANS TODAY IN TERMS  
3 OF ACTUALITY OF WHAT MIGHT BE CONSTRUCTED TOMORROW. THOSE ARE  
4 BROUGHT TO ME BY THE CORRIDOR INTEGRATION FARE DISTANCE AND  
5 SOME OF THESE OTHER MODELS.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ON-OLIVIA.

8

9 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I HAD TO SWITCH TO MY PHONE TO MAKE THE  
10 SOUND WORK. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO ECHO THE  
11 CONCERNS ABOUT EQUITY, PRETTY USUAL. I DO REALLY WANT TO SAY  
12 THAT THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO WOULD USE THE SYSTEM IF IT  
13 WORKED BETTER, I THINK IT'S A LOT HIGHER THAN THE PEOPLE WHO  
14 DO. AND I WAS JUST LOOKING UP SOME OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL  
15 IMPACTS, RIGHT? SO GOING BACK TO WHY DO WE WANT THIS TO WORK,  
16 WHAT ARE OUR GOALS HERE? THEY'RE MULTIPLE. RIGHT? WE WANT TO  
17 HAVE THE ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS, WE DON'T WANT THOSE THINGS TO  
18 BE SKEWED IN FAVOR OF WEALTH PEOPLE. WE WANT TO ACHIEVE HIGHER  
19 RIDERSHIP SO IT'S A MORE LIVABLE COMMUNITY FOR OUR RESIDENTS.  
20 AND ALSO WITH ENVIRONMENTAL CONSIDERATIONS WITH CONGESTION,  
21 CONSIDERATIONS WITH HOW LONG IT TAKES TO DO ALL SORTS OF  
22 THINGS, AND I HAVE HAD MULTIPLE PEOPLE STAY AT MY HOUSE  
23 BECAUSE THE -- THERE IS JUST NOT GOOD CONNECTIONS OR HAVE TO  
24 DRIVE BECAUSE IT'S TWO AND A HALF HOURS WITH STUPID  
25 CONNECTIONS ON PUBLIC TRANSIT TO GET A SINGLE WAY. SO, WHILE



January 22, 2021

1 THERE MIGHT NOT BE A HUGE AMOUNT OF RIDERSHIP ON THE SAME DAY  
2 BETWEEN THE, YOU KNOW, VERY NORTHERN PARTS OF OUR AREA TO THE  
3 VERY SOUTHERNNESS PARTS OF OUR AREA, THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO ARE  
4 TRAVELING EXCEPTIONAL DISTANCES TO GET TO WORK EVERY DAY, AND  
5 THEY CERTAINLY ARE NOT AFFORD THE LUXURY OF BEING IN THE SAME  
6 ZONE. SO, I -- I JUST -- I REALLY HOPE THAT WE LOOK AT HOW DO  
7 WE CREATE THE SYSTEM THAT ENDS UP WITH THE RESULTS THAT WE  
8 WANT, AND NOT WHAT IS HAPPENING NOW. BECAUSE THE REASON WE'RE  
9 ALL HERE IS BECAUSE WHAT IS HAPPENING DOES NOT WORK. AND IT'S  
10 REALLY HARMING A LOT OF PEOPLE, AND IT'S NOT, LIKE, I HAVE  
11 LOST A LOT FRIENDS FROM THE BAY AREA, WHO HAVE LEFT, BECAUSE  
12 THEY JUST -- LIKE, THEY CAN'T AFFORD TO WORK ANYMORE, AND IF  
13 YOU HAVE TO MOVE AND YOU CAN'T KEEP YOUR JOB, WHY WOULD YOU  
14 KEEP PAYING THE PRICE TO LIVE HERE. -- WE HAVE MORE TECH  
15 COMPANIES LEAVING A LOT OF THAT STUFF HAPPENING. IF WE'RE  
16 GOING TO KEEP PARTS OF THE BAY THAT'S GOOD LET'S MAKE SURE  
17 THAT IT WORKS. THAT'S IT THANK YOU.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES?

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YES. THANK YOU. I JUST THINK THAT AT LEAST TWO  
22 OF THESE ARE FAR MORE COMPLICATED THAN IT HAS TO BE FOR PEOPLE  
23 TRYING TO NAVIGATE, AND STAY OUTSIDE OF THE TICKET RIDERS.  
24 HAVING A SET FEE, EVEN IF IT'S A TWO OR THREE TIERED SET FEE,  
25 IT'S A LOT SIMPLER, AND HAVING A MODERATE RATE, ESPECIALLY



January 22, 2021

1 SPECIAL RATES FOR EQUITY ISSUES, I THINK THAT MAKES MORE SENSE  
2 THAN MAKING IT COMPLICATED. LET THE AGENCIES FIGURE OUT HOW  
3 THAT I WANT TO SPLIT FARE UP. DON'T MAKE THE PASSENGERS FIGURE  
4 OUT HOW THEY NEED TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THANK YOU.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO I HAVE A COUPLE OF --  
7 ACTUALLY, I SEE THAT IAN HAD A HAND. SO, IAN, GO AHEAD.

8

9 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH JUST -- I GUESS MY PROBLEM WITH THE  
10 CORRIDOR INTEGRATION JUST SEEMS LIKE ITS -- YOU HAVE TO PICK  
11 THE CORRIDORS. A WEAKNESS OF THIS APPROACH IS THAT YOU'RE  
12 STILL MAKING CERTAIN ASSUMPTIONS AS TO WHICH CORRIDORS -- I  
13 MEAN PERHAPS YOU COULD MAKER AN EDUCATED GUESS, YOU KNOW WHERE  
14 PEOPLE ARE COMING FROM AND ARE GOING, TO YOU'RE ONLY SELECTING  
15 CERTAIN CORRIDORS IN WHICH TO PROVIDE INTEGRATED FARES, YOU'RE  
16 PRIVILEGING CERTAIN TYPES OF TRIPS OVER OTHERS. YOU'RE SAYING  
17 THE PENINSULA CORRIDOR, THE 101 CORRIDOR IS VALUABLE, BUT ARE  
18 YOU GOING TO DO THAT INTEGRATION ON THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR, OR  
19 SOMEONE WHO IS MAKING DEAR YOU KNOW, OR LIKE -- AND THE MORE  
20 CORRIDORS YOU PICK, IN THIS MODEL IT DOESN'T REALLY WORK IF  
21 YOU HAVE 20 CORRIDORS DOING INTEGRATE THE FARES I THINK THAT'S  
22 A VERY COMPLEX SYSTEM. I HAVEN'T HEARD OF THIS SYSTEM EXISTING  
23 ANYWHERE IN THE WORLD. SO IT'S CERTAINLY AN INTERESTING IDEA,  
24 I'M NOT SURE HOW PRACTICAL IT IS. CERTAINLY, IF YOU WERE TO GO  
25 TO THE TROUBLE OF HAVING, YOU KNOW, A CENTRALIZED GOVERNANCE



January 22, 2021

1 FRAME WORK FOR FARES, I'M NOT SURE -- ANYWAY, THAT'S JUST MY  
2 IMMEDIATE REACTION TO THIS. YOU'RE INEVITABLY GOING TO BE  
3 PICKING SOME TRIPS AND PICKING SOME TYPES OF INTEGRATIONS OVER  
4 OTHERS AND THAT IN ITSELF IS PERHAPS INEQUITABLE. YOU KNOW.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** SO I WANT TO ADD A FEW THINGS ON TO WHAT  
7 PEOPLE HAVE ALREADY SAID, AND THEN MOVE ON TO THE LAST OPTION  
8 IN THE EVALUATION CRITERIA, WHICH I THINK WE WILL HAVE  
9 THOUGHTS ABOUT. AS MEMBERS OF THIS ADVISORY BODY. I WANT TO  
10 ECHO WHAT SEVERAL PEOPLE SAID IN TERMS OF FOCUSING ON PLACES  
11 THAT ALREADY HAVE A LOT OF CONNECTIONS, HAS SOME ELEMENT OF  
12 THE DRUNK PERSON LOOKING FOR THEIR KEYS UNDER THE STREET LIGHT  
13 BECAUSE THAT YEAH THEY CAN SEE RATHER THAN THAT'S WHERE THEY  
14 MAY HAVE DROPPED THEIR KEYS. THERE HAS BEEN A FAIR AMOUNT OF  
15 CRITIQUE OVER THE GRAND JURY REPORT. THERE WERE STUDIES ABOUT  
16 THE CONNECTIONS BETWEEN SAMTRANS AND CALTRAIN, AND THERE IS A  
17 GRAND JURY REPORT THAT POINTED OUT THAT SAMTRANS BUSES AND  
18 CALTRAIN CONNECTION DIDN'T ACTUALLY CONNECT TO CALTRAIN AND  
19 THERE WERE HYPOTHESIS WERE THERE ISN'T A DEMAND FOR PEOPLE WHO  
20 USE SAMTRANS TO CONNECT TO CALTRANS. AND SAMTRANS DID AN IN  
21 DEPTH STUDY OF RIDERS LARGELY LOW INCOME AND PEOPLE OF COLOR,  
22 AND WHAT THEY FOUND IS AT THE TOP OF THEIR LIST OF THINGS THAT  
23 I WANTED FROM SAMTRANS WAS BETTER CONNECTION TO RAIL. THE  
24 CONNECTION TO CALTRAIN WAS CRUMMY BECAUSE THE SCHEDULE  
25 CALTRAIN WAS RUNNING WAS GAP-TOOTHED AND HARD TO CONNECT TO,



January 22, 2021

1 AS ONE OF THE REASONS. SO YOU SAID THERE IS -- AND ALSO THERE  
2 HAS BEEN NO FARE INTEGRATION. SO IF YOU SAID THERE IS NO  
3 CONNECTION BETWEEN SAL TRAIN AND SAMTRANS RIGHT NOW AND  
4 THEREFORE WE SHOULDN'T LOOK TO IMPROVE IT, THAT'S BACKWARD  
5 EXERCISE UPSIDE DOWN. I THINK WE SHOULD BE LOOKING WHAT THE  
6 POTENTIAL FOR CONNECTIONS IS RATHER THAN WHAT IS HAS  
7 HISTORICALLY BEEN. IN TERMS OF THE CORRIDOR IDEA, I THINK I  
8 AGREE WITH IAN, THAT AS A LONG-TERM SOLUTION, THAT IS  
9 EXTREMELY KLUDGY AND CONVOLUTED AND INEQUITABLE IN TERMS OF  
10 SINGLING OUT PEOPLE IN ONE PART OF THE REGION FOR SIMPLE FARES  
11 AND NOT SIMPLIFYING FOR OTHER PEOPLE. DO I THINK THERE COULD  
12 BE A BENEFIT IN TERMS OF PILOTS OR EARLIER SOLUTIONS BEFORE WE  
13 ARE ABLE TO ROLL SOMETHING OUT COMPREHENSIVELY, AND BECAUSE  
14 WE'RE GETTING MANAGED LANES IN CERTAIN PARTS OF THE REGION,  
15 YOU KNOW, SAYING, YOU KNOW, HEY, FOR THIS CORRIDOR THAT HAS A  
16 LOT OF CAR TRAVEL, LET'S MAKE IT AS CONVENIENT AS POSSIBLE  
17 INCLUDING HARM -- HARMONIZING FARES WITH DIFFERENT FORMS OF  
18 TRANSIT I THINK THAT COULD BE INTERESTING AS A SHORT-TERM  
19 EXPERIMENT WITH HOW MUCH EXTRA RIDERSHIP YOU GET BY MAKING IT  
20 AS EASY AS POSSIBLE ALSO PROVIDING RIDERS WITH FREQUENCY. IN  
21 TERMS OF FREQUENCY AND ROUTES IN TERMS OF MODE, IF YOU SAY  
22 OKAY FOR YOUR SCHEDULE, FOR YOUR PARTICULATE, YOU CAN USE  
23 SEVERAL DIFFERENT MODES THAT INCREASES FREQUENCY AND EFFECTIVE  
24 SERVICE FOR THE TRANSIT SYSTEM BETTER. I THINK THERE MAY BE A  
25 STUDY SHOWING THE BENEFITS, YOU KNOW, EVEN IF IT WINDS UP



January 22, 2021

1 BEING SOMETHING THAT IS A SHORT-TERM, RATHER THAN A LONG-TERM  
2 SOLUTION, IN TERMS OF HOW THAT DATA WINDS UP BEING USED, AND  
3 THE LAST POINT I WANT TO MAKE IN TERMS OF CORRIDORS, IS THAT  
4 WE KNOW THAT TWO THIRDS OF WORKING POOR PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA  
5 COMMUTE BY CAR. AND SO FROM AN EQUITY PERSPECTIVE, IMPROVING  
6 EQUITY IS ALSO MAKING MORE COMPETITIVE TRANSIT FOR PEOPLE THAT  
7 ARE LOW INCOME AND WHO ARE COMMUTING BY CAR. AND THIS IS GOING  
8 TO POINT TO VERY DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS OF EQUITY THAT WE WILL  
9 HOPEFULLY GET TO WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE CRITERIA MOMENTARILY.  
10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WHAT IS NEXT IN THE PRESENTATION?

11

12 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH, JUST BEFORE WE JUMP TO THE NEXT ONE, I  
13 WANT TO -- BEFORE I TAKE OFF MY PROJECT MANAGER HAT AND PUT ON  
14 MY BART HAT, I WOULD SAY THAT BART PARTICIPATES IN A LOT OF  
15 CORRIDORS THAT WOULD CONSIDER C1 AND IT'S HARD FOR ME TO  
16 PICTURE HOW WE MAKE THAT WORK. AS LEAST AS COMPARED TO C2,  
17 SEEMS A MUCH MORE STRAIGHTFORWARD SMALLER STEP TYPE OF  
18 SOLUTION. AS A BART PERSON I MIGHT PROPOSE C1 FOR SCREENING. I  
19 THINK I WOULD ECHO SOME OF THE EARLIER COMMENTS ON THAT. OKAY.  
20 SO WE CAN JUMP TO THE NEXT ONE, PLEASE. THIS ONE IS TRADE  
21 AGREEMENTS. THIS IS THE SITUATION WHERE WE DO NOT HAVE EITHER  
22 A SINGLE FARE SETTING AUTHORITY OR A SORT OF COMPREHENSIVE  
23 AGREEMENT TO CHANGE THE FARE STRUCTURE BETWEEN AUTONOMOUS  
24 AGENCIES, BUT WE ARE LOOKING FOR WAYS TO -- FOR DIFFERENT  
25 AGENCIES OR GROUPS OF AGENCIES TO MAKE FARE CHANGES THAT



January 22, 2021

1 IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND THE USABILITY OF THE SYSTEM.  
2 SO WE'RE LOOKING FOR OPTIONS THAT ARE REALISTIC CHANGES THAT  
3 COULD BE MADE ON A BILATERAL OR MULTI-LATERAL LEVEL. BUT  
4 AGAIN, THIS IS A SITUATION WHERE OPERATORS RETAIN AUTHORITY  
5 OVER PRICING. SO, YOU KNOW, THE MOST STRAIGHT FORWARD,  
6 PERHAPS, FARE CHANGE YOU COULD MAKE, TO OUR PROJECT GOALS IS  
7 SIMPLY ELIMINATING THE DOUBLE PAYMENT OF FARES. SO, AND THAT  
8 COULD BE ACCOMPLISHED THROUGH A BILATERAL OR MULTI-LATERAL  
9 AGREEMENT FOR EXAMPLE, BART OR AC TRANSIT COULD AGREE TO A  
10 DISCOUNT TO REMOVE EITHER ONE SIDE OF THE FARE INTEGRATION  
11 THAT WOULD INCLUDE A TRIP BETWEEN THE VARIOUS AGENCIES AND  
12 AGAIN VARIOUS LEVELS OF PRICING OR DISCOUNTS. AND TWO WOULD BE  
13 A PASS CAP AGREEMENT BETWEEN TWO AGENCIES. A GROUP OF EAST BAY  
14 AGENCIES COULD COME TO AN AGREEMENT ABOUT AN EAST BAY PASS OR  
15 CAP AND DO A REVENUE SHARING AGREEMENT BETWEEN THOSE AGENCIES.  
16 OR IF WE THOUGHT -- IF NEIGHBORING -- PARDON ME -- NEIGHBORING  
17 AGENCIES FELT LIKE THERE WAS TOO MUCH CONFUSION ABOUT THE  
18 FARES FOR TRIPS -- FOR AGENCIES OFTEN USED IN COMMON BECAUSE  
19 THERE WERE DIFFERENT PRICING LEVELS THEY COULD WORK ON  
20 HARMONIZING THEIR PRICING SET A STANDARD LOCAL BUS FARE  
21 BETWEEN NORTH BAY OR EAST BAY TRANSIT OPERATORS COULD BE AN  
22 APPROACH TO BE CARRIED OUT ON A BILATERAL OR MULTI-LATERAL  
23 LEVEL. SO THIS IS, YOU KNOW, SIMPLER, LESS COMPREHENSIVE,  
24 PERHAPS LESS OVERALL CHANGE OR IMPROVEMENT PERHAPS IN CERTAIN  
25 PEOPLE'S EXPERIENCE ON TRANSIT, BUT PERHAPS EASIER TO





January 22, 2021

1 IMPLEMENT. YOU CAN ALSO THINK OF THESE AS A STEP ALONG THE  
2 WAY. SO ONE OPTION WE COULD END UP WITH HERE IS NEAR-TERM,  
3 MEDIUM TERM, LONG-TERM PROPOSALS EVEN IF WE HAVE A MORE  
4 COMPREHENSIVE VISION LONG-TERM, YOU COULD THINK OF OPTION IN  
5 THIS TABLE AS SOMETHING FOR THE NEAR-TERM. SO, WITH THAT I'LL  
6 OPEN IT UP TO ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS OR SUGGESTIONS FOR  
7 ADDS ON THIS ONE, AND THEN, JUST SO YOU KNOW, OUR NEXT --  
8 WHERE WE MOVE NEXT IS ANY DISCUSSION OF THE SCREENING  
9 APPROACH.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ANY HANDS ON THIS? FROM MEMBERS OF THIS  
12 BODY? I SEE THAT IAN HAS A HAND.

13

14 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** SO I'M JUST WONDERING -- THERE IS SO MANY  
15 DIFFERENT ITERATIONS OF WHAT YOU COULD MODEL WITHIN THIS  
16 SCENARIO WITHIN THIS CASE. LIKE WITHIN D ONE, D TWO, D THREE,  
17 LIKE YOU COULD SAY THERE IS A MULTI-LATERAL AGREEMENT BETWEEN  
18 AGENCIES TO OFFER A 75 PERCENT DISCOUNT BUT THEN YOU COULD  
19 PICK ANY TWO AGENCIES YOU COULD SAY WHAT IF IT'S BETWEEN BART  
20 AND THESE OPERATORS WHAT IF IT'S A MILLION DIFFERENT  
21 COMBINATIONS AND HOW WOULD YOU PROPOSE -- SO HOW WOULD YOU  
22 NARROW DOWN WHAT YOU'RE ACTUALLY GOING TO LOOK AT? OBVIOUSLY  
23 PERSPECTIVE IS MORE COMPREHENSIVE THE BETTER BUT ALSO LIKE THE  
24 MORE COMPREHENSIVE THE LESS LIKELY -- ACTUALLY IT'S HARD TO  
25 GET A TRADE AGREEMENT THAT'S TOTALLY COMPREHENSIVE IF IT TRULY



January 22, 2021

1 IS ALL, YOU KNOW -- YEAH, SORRY -- IF ALL AUTHORITY RESIZED  
2 WITHIN THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. IT'S HARD FOR ME TO FIGURE OUT  
3 THE OPTIONS.

4

5 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. I DON'T THINK WE  
6 FULLY KNOW THE ANSWER TO THAT. AN IMPORTANT STEP IS GOING TO  
7 BE DEFINING THE VARIANCE. YOU CAN'T MODEL UNTIL YOU FIGURE OUT  
8 WHAT THE PRICE DIFFERENCE IS. YOU HAVE SOME REASONABLE PRICE  
9 LEVEL CHARACTERISTIC ON A VARIANT LEVEL BEFORE WE GO MODELING  
10 ANYTHING. YOU WOULD HAVE TO PICK TYPICAL TRADE AGREEMENTS AND  
11 IDEALLY THEY WOULD BE ONES AGENCIES ARE READY TO MOVE FORWARD  
12 WITH OR ARE INTERESTED IN PURSUING IN EARNEST. WE HAVE HAD,  
13 ALREADY, SOME CONTRIBUTIONS AND IT'S BEEN HIGHLIGHTED AT THE  
14 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE THAT THE NORTH BAY TRANSIT OPERATORS  
15 ARE DEFINITELY INTERESTED IN INTEGRATION. AND SO, YOU KNOW, I  
16 THINK THAT WOULD BE A GOOD ONE TO TEST ON ONE OR ALL OF THESE  
17 OPTIONS. BUT WE -- YEAH, MY PROPOSAL, AND WE HAVEN'T WORKED  
18 OUT THE MECHANICS OF THIS IS THAT WE START WITH STUFF THAT  
19 SEEMS LIKE AND WHETHER AGENCIES ARE INTERESTED IN MOVING  
20 FORWARD.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER HANDS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS BODY?  
23 YES. SO THE COUPLE OF QUICK THINGS I WOULD ADD HERE IS THE  
24 HISTORICAL CONCERN THAT THINGS IN THIS CATEGORY WILL BE  
25 UNSTABLE, AND WE HAVE HAD SO MANY EXAMPLES OF TRANSFER



January 22, 2021

1 AGREEMENTS THAT ARE MADE AND THEN UNWOUND WHEN THERE IS A  
2 LOCAL ISSUE. AND SO, YOU KNOW, THAT IS CERTAINLY IN THE STAFF  
3 FRAMEWORK THAT STAFF IS PRESENTING. HOWEVER, I DID LIKE THE  
4 FRAMING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, SHORT, MEDIUM, AND LONG-TERM IDEAS. I  
5 THINK THAT MAY BE A HELPFUL WAY TO THINK ABOUT IT, ESPECIALLY  
6 BECAUSE A COMPREHENSIVE SYSTEM THAT MIGHT BE THE EASIEST TO  
7 UNDERSTAND AND THE BEST FOR CUSTOMERS, YOU KNOW, WON'T BE ABLE  
8 TO BE IMPLEMENTED INSTANTLY, AND SO IF THERE ARE SOME OTHER  
9 THINGS THAT CAN BE DONE INCREMENTALLY THAT CAN ALSO HELP TO,  
10 YOU KNOW, BENEFIT RIDERS, AND PROVE OUT SOME HYPOTHESIS ABOUT  
11 IMPROVEMENTS IS SOMETHING THAT COULD BE HELPFUL. I SEE RICH  
12 HEDGES HAS A HAND, BEFORE WE MOVE ON.

13

14 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I THINK YOU HIT UPON THE ONE THING  
15 ABOUT THIS I THINK IS USABLE. I DON'T PARTICULARLY CARE FOR  
16 THIS AT ALL, OUTSIDE OF THAT. BUT THAT WOULD BE THE PROVISIO OF  
17 FREE OR INEXPENSIVE TRANSFERS FROM ONE MODE TO THE NEXT.  
18 AGAIN, I WANT TO KEEP IT AS SIMPLE AS POSSIBLE AND THAT MAY BE  
19 A WAY OF KEEPING IT SIMPLE. ALSO, I WATCHED WHAT HAPPENED WITH  
20 TRANSLINK WHEN THEY TRIED TO COME TO AN AGREEMENT ON FARE  
21 COLLECTION AND WHO WOULD DO THAT, AND IT'S JUST MUCH BETTER TO  
22 HAVE A SIMPLE SETUP LIKE THIS THAT SOMEBODY IS IN CHARGE OF  
23 AND WHO IS MAKE THE DECISIONS ON WHO GETS WHAT. FOR THOSE OF  
24 YOU WHO DON'T KNOW WHAT TRANSLINK, IT WAS THE FIRST ITERATION



January 22, 2021

1 OF THE CLIPPER CARD THAT NEVER GOT OFF THE LAUNCH PAD. THE  
2 ONLY AGENCY INTERESTED WAS BART BEFORE IT GOT CANCELS.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. LET'S MOVE ON TO THE SCREENING  
5 CRITERIA.

6

7 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LET'S SEE. THE GRAPHIC ON  
8 THE LAST, KIND OF SUMMARIZES OUR PROCESS THERE. SO LET'S SEE.  
9 AND WE REALLY HAVE TWO STEPS HERE. THERE IS A SCREENING TO GET  
10 FROM A LONG LIST TO A SHORT LIST AND THEN THE DETAILED  
11 BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. SO THE SCREENING, THAT'S THE STEP  
12 WE'RE ON NOW. WE WANT TO GO FROM LONG TO SHORT LIST. AND THERE  
13 IS TWO STEPS. ONE IS STRATEGIC, AND WHAT WE MEAN BY STRATEGIC  
14 IS, DOES THE OPTION -- SORT OF YES OR NO -- DOES THE OPTION  
15 ADDRESS THE FOUR GOALS FOR IMPROVING THE FARE SYSTEM THAT WE  
16 HAVE LAID OUT HERE? SO, DOES IT IMPROVE, SORT OF, THE  
17 EXPERIENCE, THE CUSTOMER VALUE? DOES IT IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER  
18 EXPERIENCE? DOES IT ADDRESS EQUITY ISSUES? AND IS IT, YOU  
19 KNOW, COMPATIBLE WITH OUR FUTURE TRANSIT PLANS. AND THAT LAST  
20 ONE IS THE LEAST CLEAR AND PROBABLY CONCEPTUALLY AS WE INVEST  
21 IN NEW TRANSIT FACILITIES WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE GET THE MOST  
22 VALUE OUT OF THOSE AND WE WANT A FARE SYSTEM THAT MAXIMIZES  
23 VALUE. AND FARE PURPOSE. DOES IT DO THOSE THINGS. NOT WHICH  
24 OPTION IS THE MOST EQUITABLE, BUT IS THIS OPTION -- DOES IT  
25 ADDRESS EQUITY ISSUES, DOES IT ADDRESS DISPROPORTIONATE



January 22, 2021

1 BURDENS ON PEOPLE WITH LOW INCOME, FOR EXAMPLE, DOES IT TEND  
2 TO IMPROVE THEIR ACCESS TO THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. WE'RE LOOKING  
3 TO ELIMINATE OPTIONS THAT ARE DEFINITELY NOT GOING TO MEET OUR  
4 PROJECT GOALS. AND THE SECOND ONE IS THE IMPLEMENTATION  
5 SCREEN. SO WE'RE ASKING DOES THE OPTION HAVE FATAL FLAWS THAT  
6 MAKE IT NOT IMPLEMENTABLE FOR OUR REGION. FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE  
7 HEARD IN REVIEWING THIS WITH OUR STAFF WORKING GROUP ABOUT THE  
8 -- BOTH DISTANCE AND ZONE BASED FARE SYSTEMS, IN THE BIG TENT.  
9 THE CONCERNS LIKE, HEY, THIS REQUIRES TAG ON-TAG OFF FOR  
10 BUSES. CAN WE DO THAT? IS THAT SOMETHING THAT IS REASONABLE TO  
11 DO? WHERE WE ARE AT THE MOMENT, THERE ARE SYSTEM IN THE WORLD  
12 WHERE THAT HAPPENS WITH CROWDED BUSES. SO WE HAVEN'T YET  
13 STRUCK IT FROM OUR LONG LIST BUT I THINK WE DO HAVE TO  
14 SERIOUSLY CONSIDER THE TEXT CAL FEASIBILITY, THE  
15 IMPLEMENTIBILITY OF OPTIONS AND MAKE SURE WE SATISFY THE  
16 OPERATORS THAT IT IS IN FACT FEASIBLE. SO THAT'S AN EXAMPLE OF  
17 A FEASIBILITY SCREEN. OPTIONS THAT ARE RULED OUT OR DEEMED  
18 FATALLY FLAWED WOULD BE DEPRIORITIZED WE'RE LOOKING AT  
19 PATHWAYS, WE WOULD MOVE ON TO THE SHORT LIST FOR THE DETAILED  
20 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION. WE DON'T HAVE THE DETAILED BUSINESS  
21 CASE EVALUATION FOR YOU TODAY, THAT WOULD BE SOMETHING WE'LL  
22 EXPLORE AT A SUBSEQUENT CONVERSATION. SO DO FOLKS HAVE  
23 THOUGHTS? SO THIS IS SORT OF A HIGH LEVEL SUMMARY. AND THIS IS  
24 STILL BEING BUILT OUT, THIS SCREENING, BUT WE WOULD BE



January 22, 2021

1 INTERESTED IN FEEDBACK THOUGHTS ON THE PROCESS WE'RE SETTING  
2 UP HERE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. I SEE A HAND FROM  
5 WENDI.

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** YEAH, IN MY SCREENINGS, I DON'T SEE,  
8 WILL THIS INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP? WHICH IS A LITTLE  
9 DIFFERENT THAN IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE.

10

11 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** RIGHT. YEAH, THAT IS NOT ONE OF THE CRITERIA  
12 HERE, AND THE REASON IS THAT WE'RE NOT RUNNING THIS IN A  
13 MODEL. WE'RE NOT TRYING TO TEST, AT THIS STAGE, WHAT THE  
14 IMPACTS ON RIDERSHIP WOULD BE. PRESUMABLY SOMETHING THAT  
15 IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IS IMPROVED VALUE FOR CUSTOMERS  
16 WOULD INCREASE RIDERSHIP SOMEWHAT BUT WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE  
17 A MAGNITUDE FOR THIS SCREENING STEP.

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** IS THERE A WAY TO MEASURE THAT  
20 WITHOUT MODELING?

21

22 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** SO, OKAY. WE COULD CERTAINLY DO, LIKE A --  
23 LIKE, A, IS IT PLAUSIBLE SCREEN. OTHER STEP I WOULD SAY IS  
24 WHEN YOU SAW THAT THE OPTIONS THAT WE LISTED OUT DON'T HAVE --  
25 THEY HAVE VARIANCE ENUMERATED UNDER THEM BUT DON'T DEFINE THE



January 22, 2021

1 PRIZE LEVEL, FOR EXAMPLE. AN OPTION MIGHT SPECIFY DISCOUNTS  
2 BETWEEN NEIGHBORING TRANSIT AGENCIES BUT NOT WHAT THE DISCOUNT  
3 WOULD BE, WHICH IS AN IMPORTANT INPUT INTO RIDERSHIP. SO,  
4 AGAIN, WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR HERE IS SORT OF FATAL FLAWS AND  
5 WHETHER THE OPTION SORT OF MEETS PROJECT OBJECTIVES. SO I  
6 DON'T THINK WE'RE -- I WOULD PROPOSE TO OUR TEAM THAT WE STICK  
7 TO NOT ATTEMPTING TO SAY THE MAGNITUDE OF RIDER CHANGES AT  
8 THIS SCREENING STEP.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** SO IS THIS LEVEL OF SCREENING TO  
11 DEPRIORITIZE RATHER THAN RAISE THE LEVEL OF THE BEST POSSIBLE  
12 OPTION?

13

14 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YES. I THINK, FOR EXAMPLE, AND THIS IS  
15 JUMPING THE GUN, A TRANSPORT FOR LONDON STYLE CIRCULAR ZONE  
16 SYSTEM IS NOT COMPATIBLE IN MY VIEW OF THE BAY AREA GEOGRAPHY  
17 SHOULD BE DEPRIORITIZED. THAT'S THE LEVEL OF SCREENING THAT  
18 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE.

19

20 **WENDI KALLINS, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **WILLIAM BACON:** AND I WOULD ADD TO THAT, IF YOU ARE PRIORITIZED  
23 FOR THE SHORT LIST HERE YOU GET INTO THE DETAILS ANALYSIS THAT  
24 LOOKS AT RIDERSHIP IMPACTS, PRICING LEVELS, THE DIFFERENT  
25 DISCOUNT LEVELS FOR SENIORS, STUDENTS, PEOPLE WITH



January 22, 2021

1 DISABILITIES, LOW INCOME PEOPLE, HOW ALL OF THOSE DIFFERENT  
2 PRICING LEVELS IMPACT RIDERSHIP, AND THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE,  
3 AGENCY, FINANCES, ET CETERA.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. SO I SEE THAT JONATHON KASS HAD A  
6 HAND.

7

8 **JONATHON KASS:** YEAH, I HAD A HAND, BUT I GUESS I'M NOT SURE IF  
9 IT FITS HERE. I'LL ASK ANYWAY. I MEAN I -- THIS IS SUPER  
10 HELPFUL IN HELPING US DEEPEN OUR UNDERSTANDING OF THIS BIG  
11 COMPLEXITY. I AM A FAN OF MOVING TOWARD COORDINATION OR  
12 SIMPLIFICATION FOR RIDERS, BUT ALSO I WAS INVOLVED WITH THE  
13 GATOR PASS DEVELOPMENT AND THAT WAS COMPLICATED EVEN JUST  
14 COORDINATING WITH BART AND SFMTA. AND I AM CURIOUS ABOUT --  
15 I'M ALSO A FAN OF LOCAL INNOVATION AND TRYING TO DEVELOP TWO  
16 ROLES THAT RESPOND TO LOCAL SITUATIONS CREATIVELY. AND I AM  
17 JUST CURIOUS HOW YOU THINK ABOUT CAPTURING THE ABILITY TO DO  
18 THAT WHILE WE COORDINATE IN THESE MODELS. IS THERE JUST A  
19 NATURAL LOSS OF THAT FLEXIBILITY? OR IS THERE SOMETHING IN THE  
20 SCREENING OR IN THE WAY YOU REPRESENT THIS THAT CAN CAPTURE  
21 WHERE THERE'S SPACE FOR CREATIVE LOCAL SOLUTIONS?

22

23 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** GOOD QUESTION JONATHON, I HAVE, GENERALLY, SO  
24 FAR AT A HIGH LEVEL THOUGHT OF THOSE AS AN INTENTION, REGIONAL  
25 STANDARDIZATION SIMPLIFICATION FEELS LIKE IT'S INTENTIONAL





January 22, 2021

1 LOCAL CONTROL AND THEREFORE CREATIVE. IF YOU GO TO MULTIPLE  
2 TENTS ONE CAMPSITE WHERE YOU'RE HAVING A STANDARDIZED GENERAL  
3 FRAMEWORK BUT IT ALLOWS FOR SOME LEVEL OF VARIABILITY BETWEEN.  
4 I THINK WE SHOULD THINK HARD WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE IN TERMS OF  
5 ALLOWING PEOPLE TO PURSUE PARTICULAR LOCAL GOALS OR PARTICULAR  
6 LOCAL CHALLENGES. YEAH. THAT'S -- AS FAR AS I CAN THINK OF ON  
7 THAT RIGHT NOW.

8

9 **WILLIAM BACON:** WELL, I COULD ADD TO THAT, JONATHON, I THINK  
10 OUR CURRENT SYSTEM IS VERY LOCALLY CONTROLLED, AND IN THEORY  
11 THAT GIVES YOU A LOT OF FREEDOM TO DO YOUR OWN PRODUCTS. WE'RE  
12 ALSO CONSTRAINED BY THAT SYSTEM IN MANY WAYS, AND ADINA YOU  
13 WERE MENTIONING EARLIER IN TERMS OF PRODUCTS THAT ARE ON OFFER  
14 WE'RE CONSTRAINED BY HOW THE FARE STRUCTURE IS BUILT OR THE  
15 AGENCY BOUNDARIES EXIST. IF YOU WANTED TO HAVE A FARE PRODUCT  
16 AND THE GATOR PASS IS AN EXAMPLE OF THIS, THAT INCLUDES  
17 MULTIPLE AGENCIES IT'S VERY CHALLENGING TO DO THAT NOW AND IT  
18 TAKES A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF NEGOTIATION TO MAKE THAT HAPPEN,  
19 BUT IF YOU HAVE A MORE CONSISTENT STRUCTURE IN POLICIES, IT  
20 WOULD BE MUCH EASIER TO CONSTRUCT PRODUCTS OR TO TRY NEW IDEAS  
21 BECAUSE THE FRAMEWORK EVERYONE'S OPERATING UNDER COULD BE MORE  
22 CONSISTENT THAN ANY OTHER OPTION WE'RE UNDER. THE OTHER THING  
23 I COULD ADD AND THIS IS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF OUR PROJECT BUT  
24 IT IS HAPPENING AND IS RELATIVE TO THIS WORK IS THE ARRIVAL OF  
25 THE CLIPPER INTEGRATION SYSTEM WHICH MAKES THE TECHNICAL



January 22, 2021

1 STANDPOINT IMPLEMENTATION OF NEW PRODUCTS SIMPLER AND EASIER  
2 TO BRING TO CUSTOMERS THAT'S A PRODUCT OF INCREASING  
3 INNOVATION IN A WAY THAT WE'RE NOT DOING RIGHT NOW.

4

5 **JONATHON KASS:** THANK YOU. I THINK HAVING THAT KIND OF COMMENT  
6 ABOUT THE WAY THE STANDARDIZATION WILL OPEN UP SPACE FOR  
7 INNOVATION IS REALLY VALUABLE AS I EXPECT THIS QUESTION WILL  
8 COME UP FURTHER IN THE PROCESS.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AND I SEE THAT RICH  
11 HEDGES HAS A HAND.

12

13 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YEAH, IT'S DAWNED ON ME THAT THERE ARE SOME  
14 THINGS WE NEED TO KNOW. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHERE THE MOST  
15 TRIPS BEGIN AND END. THE SECOND MOST, THE THIRD MOST, THE  
16 FOURTH MOST. I THINK WE NEED TO KNOW WHERE PEOPLE ARE TAKING  
17 TRANSIT AND WHERE THEY'RE COMING FROM BEFORE YOU CAN REALLY  
18 DESIGN THIS SYSTEM. IF WE HAD COOPERATION FROM ALL OF THE  
19 AGENCIES, THEY CERTAINLY SHOULD KNOW, ESPECIALLY WITH THE  
20 CLIPPER CARD, AT LEAST, NOT SO MUCH BY CASH FARES, WHERE  
21 PEOPLE ARE TRAVELLING FROM AND TO. I THINK THAT WOULD HELP US  
22 DESIGN A BETTER AND A MORE USABLE SYSTEM. AND MAYBE EVEN SETUP  
23 THE SYSTEM SO THAT EVERY SO MANY YEARS WE WOULD REVIEW THAT,  
24 AND MAYBE REVISE THE SYSTEM OF PAYMENTS. THANK YOU.

25



January 22, 2021

1 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT SOME OF OUR EARLIER  
4 BACKGROUND WORK FOR THE PROJECT. WE DID ANALYZE AND SUMMARIZE  
5 SOME OF THE REGIONAL TRAVEL PATTERN DATA THAT YOU WOULD NEED  
6 TO DO THAT ANALYSIS, AND WE INTEND TO USE IT AND HAPPY TO SHARE  
7 THOSE EARLIER PRESS AS WELL.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SO I SEE THAT IAN GRIFFITHS HAS  
10 A HAND.

11

12 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH. I GUESS JUST, I FEEL LIKE -- I APOLOGIZE  
13 IF I MADE THIS BEFORE -- BUT I GUESS I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT  
14 IT'S CLEAR THAT, I THINK JUST CONSTRAINING -- LIKE WHAT YOU  
15 HAVE LAID OUT AS FAR AS LIKE 1 TO 2 OPTIONS PER PATHWAY IT  
16 SEEMS THE FIRST TWO BETWEEN GREAT ALLIANCE AND BIG TENT TO ME  
17 THEY'RE THE SAME OPTIONS AND I DON'T KNOW WHY YOU WOULD  
18 ARTIFICIALLY SAY YOU NEED TWO OR THREE OR FROM ONE OR THE  
19 OTHER, LIKE THERE MAYBE COULD BE THREE OR FOUR OPTIONS ACROSS  
20 THE TWO THAT ARE DISTINCT AND A LATER STEP WOULD BE DECIDING  
21 LIKE -- OR DETERMINING WELL OKAY -- BECAUSE TO THE CUSTOMER  
22 THEY LOOK THE SAME BUT THEN IT'S A SEPARATE QUESTION TO SAY  
23 WHAT WOULD BE THE EASIEST OR BEST WAY TO ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTING  
24 THESE. I THINK, KIND OF EVALUATING -- YEAH -- I WOULD JUST  
25 LIKE TO SEE -- THAT WOULD MAKE MORE SENSE TO ME -- YOU



January 22, 2021

1 BASICALLY HAVE THE LEFT SIDE OF YOUR DIAGRAM. YOU'RE PICKING A  
2 SET OF OPTIONS FROM THE LEFT SIDE OF THE EARLIER MATRIX YOU  
3 HAD, YOU HAD MORE COMPREHENSIVE APPROACHES AND I WOULD SAY YOU  
4 HAVE THEM ALL LISTED HERE AND I THINK THAT KIND OF CELLULARS  
5 UNDER FARE BY DISTANCE SOME LOCAL DIFFERENTIATION LIKE THAT'S  
6 A DISTRICT OPTION THAT COULD BE BIG TENT OR GREATER ALLIANCE  
7 AS FAR AS LIMITATION. AND FATAL FLAWS YOU'RE GOING TO DO YOUR  
8 OWN ASSESSMENT BUT I AGREE THE CIRCULAR ZONES SEEMS LIKE A  
9 FATAL FLAW. I JUST WANT TO SAY REGARDING -- YOU HAD MADE A  
10 COMMENT ABOUT LIKE FARE READERS AND READERS ON LOCAL BUSES  
11 DOES THAT POSE A FATAL FLAW TO SOME OF THESE POTENTIAL  
12 OPTIONS, AND JUST BEFORE WE REMOVE ANYTHING ON THAT BASIS I  
13 WOULD WANT TO -- LIKE, THERE IS CHANGING TECHNOLOGY OF COURSE  
14 WITH FARE PAYMENT. AT ONE TIME NONE OF US HAD -- NOW WE'RE  
15 GOING TO HAVE VISA CARDS ALL CLIPPER PAYMENTS IN A YEAR AND A  
16 HALF IT'S A FUNDAMENTAL CHANGE TO WHERE WE HAVE READERS BUT  
17 THOSE TYPES OF THINGS CAN HAPPEN QUICKLY IN SWITZERLAND THEY  
18 HAVE THESE ZONED BASED CELLULAR SYSTEMS MORE COMMONLY LIKE  
19 MOBILE PAYMENTS ARE A VERY INCREASING SHARE AND THEY HAVE NEW  
20 MOBILE PAYMENT COMPANIES THAT ACTUALLY DETECT WHEN YOU GET OFF  
21 A BUS AND CAN IMMEDIATELY LIKE YOU DON'T HAVE TO REMEMBER WHEN  
22 TO TAP OFF IT KNOWS WHEN YOU GET OFF. THAT KIND OF TECHNOLOGY  
23 COULD REMOVE THAT SO-CALLED FATAL FLAW. THERE IS OTHER ISSUES  
24 WITH MOBILE PAYMENTS. BUT I JUST THINK BEING CAREFUL. I SEE  
25 ONE OPTION THAT WOULD BE POTENTIALLY NOT TO BE ELIMINATE ON



January 22, 2021

1 THAT BASIS JUST TO SEE HOW USERS RESPOND TO IT, LIKE ONE OF  
2 THOSE FARE BY DISTANCE CELLULAR ZONES THAT DOESN'T HAVE, LIKE,  
3 LOCAL BUSES FREE, JUST -- AGAIN, I'M NOT SAYING THAT'S A  
4 BETTER POLICY OPTION I'M JUST SAYING IT MAY BE PREMATURE TO  
5 DROP THAT WHEN IT MAY BE FEASIBLE IN THE FUTURE.

6

7 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK THAT'S THE DIRECTION WE'RE PLANNING  
8 TO GO HERE. THAT SPECIFIC RULE OUT IS NOT GOING IT HAPPEN JUST  
9 NOW.

10

11 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** GREAT.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** BRIAN HAS A HAND.

14

15 **BRIAN STANKE:** FIRST I WANT TO AGREE WITH WHAT IAN SAID, JUST A  
16 FEW YEARS AGO GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT DID CAP ON-CAP OFF FOR BUSES  
17 I USED THAT WHEN I WAS COMMUTING AND I LIKE THE IDEA OF TAKING  
18 A ONE, A TWO, A FOUR, A FIVE, AND APPLYING THEM BOTH TO BIG  
19 TENT, AND TO -- WHAT WAS THE OTHER NAME? I THINK THE GREAT  
20 ALLIANCE. FARES, ZONES, AND FARE BY DISTANCE WITH AND WITHOUT  
21 LOCAL FLAT RATES, THERE IS NO REASON TO DIFFERENTIATE  
22 DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR THOSE TWO. I GUESS, LOOKING AT THE  
23 STRATEGIC SCREEN, THOSE ARE GOOD QUESTIONS. I THINK THE WAY  
24 THEY WERE EXPLAINED FOR THE LAST ONE ABOUT SUPPORTING FUTURE  
25 TRANSIT PLANS COULD BE BETTER WRITTEN OUT IN TALKING ABOUT



January 22, 2021

1 THINGS LIKE BAY AREA 2050 TRANSIT GOALS. I GUESS ONE THING I'M  
2 STRUGGLING WITH WHEN LOOKING AT SCREENING IS SORT OF THE  
3 DISCUSSION OF, HOW IN THE -- HOW DO YOU MODEL -- OR YOU CAN  
4 REASONABLY MODEL THAT THE TRADE AGREEMENTS PATHWAY WHEN IT IS  
5 VERY MUCH A NO PROJECT PATHWAY WHERE, YOU KNOW, THERE COULD BE  
6 DOUBLE DISCOUNT FARES, BUT WE CAN'T -- WE CAN'T MODEL EVERY  
7 SINGLE COMBINATION OF DOUBLE DISCOUNTS AND EVERY NUMBER  
8 BETWEEN AGENCIES. THAT GETS TO THE MODEL THAT CLIPPER 1.0 GOT  
9 STUCK IN. I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU WOULD PRIORITIZE ANY OF THE  
10 TRADE AGREEMENT ONES WHEN THEY REALLY ARE KIND OF, A,  
11 UNMODERATABLE. AND, B, AS WE HAVE DISCUSSED BEFORE, WE HAVE,  
12 LIKE, BART PLUS, AND THEY HAVEN'T SURVIVED. THESE MULTI-  
13 AGENCY THINGS HAVE BEEN DONE, AND HAVE FAILED, NOT ONLY AROUND  
14 THE WORLD, BUT HERE. SO, DO WE PRIORITIZE LOOKING AT THOSE,  
15 AGAIN, KNOWING THAT HISTORY. AND THE REAL VALUE OF WHAT'S BEEN  
16 DONE AND WORKED ELSEWHERE AND HERE, AND WHAT'S BEEN DONE AND  
17 HAS WORKED ELSEWHERE AND HERE. AND REALLY USING THAT TO PUT  
18 THE LIMITS RESOURCES WE HAVE IN THIS EFFORT TO THE BEST  
19 DIRECTION IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS. THANKS.

20

21 **WILLIAM BACON:** I WAS GOING TO QUICKLY -- THANK YOU BRIAN, AND  
22 JUST FOR EVERYONE I WANT YOU ALL TO KNOW THAT WE RECOGNIZE THE  
23 SYSTEMS IN THE REGION NOW THAT ARE TAP ON-TAP OFF AND A NUMBER  
24 OF BUS OPERATORS ARE TAP ON TAP OFF AND A NUMBER OF OUR RAILS  
25 ARE AS WELL. WE RECOGNIZE THAT. AND THE QUESTION IS, CAN YOU



January 22, 2021

1 SEE THAT, FOR EXAMPLE, WORKING ON A SYSTEM LIKE MUNI, ON THE  
2 38 BUS AT 8:30 IN THE MORNING, THAT'S WHAT WE MEAN IN TERMS OF  
3 IMPLEMENTATION QUESTION.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** OKAY THANKS. AND THANKS BRIAN FOR THE  
6 MENTION OF LATE, LAMENTED BART PLUS AND I'LL ADD THE LATE  
7 UNLAMENTED AC TRANSIT TRANSFER PILOT. LET'S SEE. ON ECHOING, I  
8 THINK MAYBE WHERE IAN WAS GOING ON THE FATAL FLAW I WOULD LIKE  
9 THOSE TO BE CONSIDERED THINGS THAT ARE FATAL FOR REASONS OF  
10 GEOMETRY AND PHYSICS THAT IT'S LIKE A POLYCENTRIC REGION, A  
11 SINGLE CENTER IT'S MATHEMATICALLY UNVIABLE, BUT NOT TO USE  
12 THINGS THAT ARE POLICY CHOICES OR FAST CHANGING TECHNOLOGY AS  
13 SOMETHING CONSIDERED A FATAL FLAW. IS THIS SOMETHING THAT  
14 REQUIRES POLICY CHANGE TO IMPLEMENT THOSE DECISIONS BE AT THE  
15 END OF THE DAY TO THE POLICY MAKERS BASED ON BENEFITS AND  
16 DRAWBACKS RATHER THAN DECIDING IT UP FRONT AND KIND OF BAKING  
17 IT INTO THAT AS AN ASSUMPTION. THAT SHOULD BE A BAKED IN  
18 CONCLUSION AT THE END OF THE DAY. IN TERMS OF IMPROVING FARE  
19 WITH TRIP VALUE IS HOW THAT RELATES TO CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE,  
20 THAT'S A LITTLE BIT CONFUSING TO ME, BECAUSE I'M THINKING OF  
21 AN EXAMPLE OF THE, WETA WAS PROPOSING A TERMINAL IN REDWOOD  
22 CITY AND THAT FERRY WOULD GO TO SAN FRANCISCO AND OAKLAND, IN  
23 ORDER OF VALUE YOU WOULD SAY THIS IS A BEAUTIFUL VIEW AND  
24 WORTH EXTRA MONEY ON THE OTHER HAND THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS OF  
25 GETTING BETWEEN REDWOOD CITY AND OAKLAND, IF I HAVE THE SAME



January 22, 2021

1 FARE STRUCTURE, I COULD THINK ABOUT THAT FERRY OF INCREASING  
2 MY FREQUENCY IF IT HAS THE SAME PRICE STRUCTURE. SO I THINK AN  
3 ELEMENT OF TRIP VALUE IS, DOES THIS TRIP HELP INCREASE MY  
4 FREQUENCY AND SPAN OF SERVICE? SO, AND THEN THE -- LIKE,  
5 ANOTHER SMALL THING, AND THEN A BIG THING. THE SMALL THING ON  
6 INNOVATION IS, I WOULD HATE FOR US TO CONSIDER, AS INNOVATION,  
7 THINGS THAT SHOULD BE BASIC. SO, LIKE WHEN THE CITY OF  
8 MOUNTAIN VIEW DECIDES ABOUT A HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, AND HAS TO  
9 CHOOSE WHETHER TO GIVE THE RESIDENTS OF VTA PASS OR CALTRAIN  
10 PASS AND YOU CAN SAY, WOW, I MIGHT BE ABLE TO HAVE AN  
11 INNOVATION, YOU KNOW, AND GIVE THEM A TRANSIT PASS. THAT  
12 SHOULDN'T BE, TO EDITORIALIZE, THAT SHOULDN'T BE AN  
13 INNOVATION, IT SHOULD BE A THING AND WE SHOULDN'T HAVE  
14 CREATIVITY TO DO SOMETHING BASIC LIKE GIVING SOMEBODY ACCESS  
15 TO TRANSIT. AND THEN MOVING ON TO EQUITY, I'M -- LIKE, HOW IS  
16 STAFF THINKING ABOUT THAT, GIVEN THAT THERE ARE MANY  
17 DIMENSIONS TO EQUITY. SO ONE IS, LIKE, A SINGLE TRIP PRICE,  
18 AND IS THAT AFFORDABLE TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE LITTLE MONEY. BUT  
19 THERE IS ANOTHER ASPECT OF EQUITY, WHICH IS EVERYDAY LOW  
20 PRICES, BECAUSE THERE ARE MANY PEOPLE THAT ARE VERY PRICE  
21 SENSITIVE IN THIS HIGH CLASS OF REGION, BUT ARE GOING TO BE  
22 ABOVE A MEANS TEST THRESHOLD SO EVERYDAY LOW PRICES THAT WOULD  
23 HELP A HOUSEHOLD WITH 80,000 IN ANNUAL INCOME THAT DOESN'T  
24 QUALIFY FOR THE U.S. POVERTY RATE, IS THAT AN EQUITY  
25 CONSIDERATION. CASH FLOW IS AN EQUITY CONSIDERATION. DO I NEED





January 22, 2021

1 TO PAY \$100 UP FRONT TO BE ABLE TO GET A DISCOUNT? OR DO I  
2 HAVE A PAY AS YOU GO PLAN THAT CAN HELP IF I DON'T HAVE MONEY  
3 AT THE FRONT OF THE MONTH. WHAT ABOUT DISTANCE AND PEOPLE WHO,  
4 YOU KNOW, LIVE IN -- HAVE A LONG COMMUTE, THAT'S AN ASPECT OF  
5 EQUITY. AND THEN LAST BUT NOT LEAST, YOU KNOW, OPPORTUNITY. IF  
6 I AM A LOW INCOME PERSON THAT WANTS TO GO TO COLLEGE, AND I  
7 WANT TO TAKE CLASSES, AND THEY -- THAT'S 30 MILES AWAY, 40  
8 MILES AWAY, AND, YOU KNOW, I CAN'T AFFORD TO GET THERE FAST, I  
9 ONLY AFFORD A TWO HOUR BUS TRIP. THAT'S OPPORTUNITY, AS AN  
10 ELEMENT OF EQUITY, WHERE THIS IS A JOB, OR A SCHOOL  
11 OPPORTUNITY, I WOULDN'T EVEN THINK TO TAKE, BECAUSE I CAN'T  
12 AFFORD IT. SO I WOULD JUST LOVE TO HEAR FROM STAFF HOW STAFF  
13 IS THINKING OF EQUITY CONSIDERING DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS OF  
14 EQUITY.

15

16 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** MAYBE I'LL START AND LET BILL SAY A FEW WORDS  
17 TOO. IT'S INDEED COMPLEX THERE ARE DIFFERENT ELEMENTS AND  
18 WE'RE WORKING HARD ON IT. THIS IS NOT DEFINED PRECISELY FOR  
19 PURPOSES OF THIS SCREENING, JUST YET. SO I'LL TELL YOU SOME OF  
20 THE THINGS WE'RE DOING. OUR CONSULTANTS ARE WORKING HARD ON  
21 LAYING OUT SOME OPTIONS WE DID A PRETTY INVOLVED WORKSHOP WITH  
22 OUR STAFF WORKING GROUP TO GET PERSPECTIVES ON EQUITY FROM  
23 EACH TRANSIT AGENCY AND WHAT THEIR CUSTOMERS WERE  
24 EXPERIENCING, AND WE'RE DOING OUR BEST TO LAY OUT THE ELEMENTS  
25 OF EQUITY IN A SIMPLE WAY FOR SCREENING AND IN A MORE PRECISE



January 22, 2021

1 WAY FOR BUSINESS ANALYSIS. YES YOU'RE RIGHT, YES WE ARE  
2 WORKING ON IT, NO. IT'S NOT DONE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER]

5

6 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** BILL, ANYTHING ELSE YOU WANT TO ADD ON TO  
7 THAT?

8

9 **WILLIAM BACON:** IT WAS REALLY GOOD MIKE. WHAT I WOULD ADD IS  
10 FEEDBACK THAT WE HAVE HEARD TODAY FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE IS  
11 VERY MUCH IN LINE WITH WHAT STAFF HAVE BEEN THINKING IN THE  
12 SENSE THAT ONE OF THE PURPOSES OF UNDERTAKING THIS WORK IS TO  
13 UNDERSTAND HOW THE FARE SYSTEM REDUCES THE ABILITY OF PEOPLE  
14 TO USE TRANSIT, OR MAKE THE MOST OF TRANSIT, MAKE THE MOST OF  
15 OUR SYSTEM EXISTS NOW AND HOW WE WANT OUR SYSTEM TO EVOLVE AND  
16 IMPROVE IN THE FUTURE, AS WE COME OUT OF THE PANDEMIC. AND I  
17 THINK ANNE OLIVIA, YOU HAD SEVERAL COMMENTS THEY THINK STRUCK  
18 HOME EXACTLY IN TERMS OF WHAT WE HAVE BEEN THINKING IN TERMS  
19 OF WE WANT PEOPLE TO BE ABLE TO USE THE SYSTEM. AND THERE ARE  
20 PEOPLE OUT THERE WHO AREN'T USING TRANSIT, WHO COULD USE  
21 TRANSIT IF OUR FARE STRUCTURE PERHAPS WAS DIFFERENT. AND I  
22 THINK THAT'S REALLY ONE OF THE KEY QUESTIONS HERE IN THE  
23 STRATEGIC SCREEN IS, ARE THESE -- ARE THE CHANGES IN THAT  
24 OPTION, YOU KNOW, FACILITATING PEOPLE USING TRANSIT MORE. AND  
25 THAT IS TIED INTO THE OTHER SCREENING QUESTIONS YOU CAN SEE ON



January 22, 2021

1 THIS SLIDE BUT IT'S REALLY SPECIFIC IN TERMS OF WHAT ARE THE  
2 OUTCOMES THAT WE WOULD FORESEE FROM THAT AT AGAIN JUST A HIGH  
3 LEVEL SCREEN, BUT WOULD WE FORESEE NEW PARTS OF THE REGION  
4 THAT ARE OPEN TO CUSTOMERS, AND THAT YOU WOULD HAVE ACCESS TO  
5 OPPORTUNITIES IN OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION THAT MAYBE ARE NOT  
6 ACCESSIBLE TO YOU TODAY. AND HOW DO WE PIN THAT DOWN. YOU  
7 KNOW, THIS IS NOT A QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS HERE, IT IS  
8 QUALITATIVE. BUT I THINK THEORIZE THE KINDS OF QUESTIONS WE  
9 REALLY NEED TO BE PRECISE WITH AND ARTICULATE BETTER ASIDE WE  
10 MOVE FORWARD INTO THE NEXT MONTH OF THIS WORK. SO AS MIKE  
11 SAID, WE'RE NOT DONE YET BUT THIS IS A REALLY PRODUCTIVE  
12 CONVERSATION FOR US.

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** YEAH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO WHAT ELSE DO  
15 YOU WANT? IS THERE ANYTHING THAT YOU WANT TO PRESENT IN THE  
16 LAST COUPLE OF SLIDES? AND WHAT ELSE WOULD YOU LIKE FROM THIS  
17 BODY MOVING FORWARD IN THE PROJECT.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** WE HAVE ONE TO WRAP UP SLIDE AT THE END WHICH  
20 WE CAN SKIP TO NOW. AND IT HAS THE QUESTIONS FOR THIS GROUP,  
21 WHICH WE HAVE ALREADY SORT OF ENGAGED AS WE HAVE MOVED  
22 THROUGH. BUT MAYBE I'LL JUST -- WE'LL JUST PUT IT OUT THERE  
23 ONE MORE TIME, THIS LIST OF QUESTIONS, AND SEE IF FOLKS HAVE  
24 FINAL THOUGHTS ON THESE. YOU KNOW, WHAT DID WE MISS ON THE  
25 LONG LIST? ANY OTHER INITIAL REACTIONS OR SUGGESTIONS, ADVICE?



January 22, 2021

1 AND THEN IF THERE IS ANYTHING ELSE BEYOND WHAT WE HAVE ALREADY  
2 DISCUSSED THAT YOU WOULD LIKE TO HEAR TO UNDERSTAND THE  
3 OPTIONS BETTER, WE'RE CERTAINLY MORE THAN HAPPY TO TALK ABOUT  
4 IT.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND FOR  
7 THIS VERY ROBUST SET OF IDEAS. AND WE'LL WANT TO HEAR ANY LAST  
8 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THIS BODY. AND, ACTUALLY, WHILE  
9 PEOPLE THINK IF THERE IS ANY LAST THING, I WANT TO TAKE  
10 COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. I SEE THAT ROLAND HAS A  
11 HAND RAISED. I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM ROLAND.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR. SO LET ME START WITH THE LAST  
14 ITEM BEFORE MOVING BACK TO THE STATUS UPDATE. I JUST WANT TO  
15 SAY THANK YOU, MICHAEL, FOR THIS ABSOLUTELY EXTENSIVE AND  
16 OUTSTANDING RESEARCH. I ALSO WANT TO THANK ALL THE PANELISTS  
17 FOR THE INPUT. THE ONLY COMMENT I HAVE IS, WHATEVER THE  
18 SELECTED APPROACH IS, EVENTUALLY, THIS NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED  
19 THROUGH A REGIONAL SUBSIDY, AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL, WITHOUT  
20 IMPACTING THE INDIVIDUAL OPERATOR'S BOTTOM LINE. IF NOT, I  
21 PERSONALLY BELIEVE THAT YOU'RE SETTING YOURSELVES UP FOR  
22 STRONG HEAD WINDS FROM THE AGENCIES. NOW, MOVING TO THE  
23 PREVIOUS ITEM. I MEAN, I DO APPRECIATE SOME PEOPLE -- YOU KNOW  
24 I'M MORE COMFORTABLE LISTENING TO THEM THAN LISTENING TO  
25 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, WITH THE BROWN ACT ESPECIALLY IN THIS



January 22, 2021

1 CASE, GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 549594.3, I DID HAVE A QUESTION  
2 FOR BILL IS, HOW THE DATABASE OF 500 BAY AREA TRANSIT USERS  
3 WAS POPULATED. AND I'M CONCERNED AS TO WHAT'S IN THAT DATABASE  
4 IS ACTUALLY BALANCED BECAUSE I THOUGHT -- NOT KNOW, I WAS NOT  
5 INVITED, AND I DEFINITELY WAS NOT ASKED ANY QUESTIONS, AND I  
6 WOULD CONSIDER MYSELF AS A BAY AREA TRANSIT USERS. AND I DID  
7 NOT UNDERSTAND THE CONCERN OF EASE OF USE. WHEN MY RELATIVES  
8 CAME FROM EUROPE OR ASIA, I BASICALLY GAVE THEM A CLIPPER CARD  
9 AND GOOGLE MAPS AND THEY START MOVING AROUND THE SYSTEM JUST  
10 LIKE THEY DO BACK HOME IN EUROPE OR ASIA, AND I DO THE SAME  
11 THING, I JUST GET WHATEVER IS AVAILABLE OUT THERE AND USE  
12 GOOGLE MAPS AND MOVE AROUND GERMANY, FRANCE, UK, WHATEVER.  
13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I SEE  
16 THAT ALETA DUPREE HAS A HAND RAISED. GO AHEAD ALETA.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR ADINA LEVIN. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE  
19 RECORD. A LOT HERE, TRYING TO DIGEST IT ALL. I APPRECIATE YOU  
20 ALL DIGGING INTO IT. BECAUSE IT'S VERY COMPLICATED. AND SOME  
21 OF IT IS STILL CLEAR AS MUD, BUT IT'S BECOMING CLEARER. FOR  
22 ME, FARE ISSUES ARE MORE ANECDOTAL THAN ACADEMIC, AND SO I'M  
23 LOOKING FORWARD TO SOME SCHEMATICS EXAMPLES OF WHAT FARE WOULD  
24 LOOK LIKE. I HAVE USED THE DAY PASS IN THE BAY AREA AND I HAVE  
25 USED PERIOD PASSES. I BELIEVE THE BIGGEST POSSIBILITY FOR



January 22, 2021

1 IMPROVEMENT IS FARE CAPPING. BECAUSE THEN YOU DON'T HAVE TO  
2 THINK ABOUT HOW MUCH FARE YOU'RE GOING TO NEED A MONTH. THE  
3 SYSTEM DOES IT FOR YOU. AND I THINK THAT SHOULD REALLY BE OUR  
4 FOCUS. I MEAN, FLAT FARES, THERE IS A PLACE FOR -- A FLAT FARE  
5 TO RIDE THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY. I'M NOT SO SURE ABOUT FLAT  
6 FARES ON VERY LONG TRIPS. ESPECIALLY WHEN THE LONGER YOU  
7 TRAVEL, THE MORE COSTS EXPENDED IN THE DISTANCE THAT YOU'RE  
8 TRAVELING. AND THE MTA IN NEW YORK IS CONSIDERING KIND OF A  
9 FLAT FARE SYSTEM FOR THEIR RAILROADS, BUT THEY DID NOT TAKE IT  
10 UP AT THEIR MEETING YESTERDAY. SO IN SUMMARY, I THINK THE FARE  
11 CAPPING AND TECHNOLOGY KEEPS TRACK OF YOUR USE, IS IDEAL, SUCH  
12 AS CLIPPER, AND ALSO AN IDEAL IS THE EASY PASS SYSTEM IN THE  
13 LOS ANGELES REGION. THANK YOU.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO ANY  
16 MEMBERS -- CONSIDERING WHAT MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC HAVE SAID,  
17 AND EVERYTHING AND ALL OF THE INFORMATION THAT YOU HAVE HEARD  
18 TODAY, DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE TO ADD TO HELP STAFF WORK  
19 WITH THE OPTIONS AND THE EVALUATION CRITERIA? AT THIS TIME I  
20 SEE THAT IAN HAS A HAND.

21

22 **IAN GRIFFITHS:** YEAH. SO I THINK SOME OF THE MOST INTERESTING  
23 VARIANTS WILL BE WITHIN A ZONED BASED FRAMEWORK WITHIN OTHER  
24 ZONES OR WITHIN THE DISTANCED BASED FRAMEWORK LIKE HOW LIKE  
25 WHAT IS IT LIKE? YOU KNOW, LIKE IS IT TWO -- IS IT LIKE A FLAT



January 22, 2021

1 -- A CERTAIN INCREASE UP TO A CERTAIN DISTANCE AND THEN --  
2 LIKE WHERE DO YOU PUT THE MAXIMUM? WHERE DO YOU CHANGE THE  
3 RATE? AND I WAS UNCLEAR AS TO HOW THAT WILL GET, LIKE,  
4 DEVELOPED. AND, AGAIN -- [INDISCERNIBLE] SPEND A LOT OF TIME.  
5 I GUESS GO BACK TO HAD TO KIND OF WHAT BRIAN WAS SAYING LIKE  
6 USE OUR RESOURCES TO TRY TO MAKE SURE WE'RE USING OUR  
7 RESOURCES TO EXPLORE VARIATION IN THE THINGS THAT CLOSELY MEET  
8 OUR GOALS RATHER THAN SPENDING A LOT OF TIME ON OPTIONS THAT  
9 DON'T MEET OUR GOALS. LIKE. SO I GUESS THAT'S MY QUESTION OR  
10 MAYBE I'M NOT UNDERSTANDING THE PROCESS THAT WE'RE GOING TO GO  
11 THROUGH GOING FORWARD AND WHEN THOSE VARIANTS WILL GET FLUSHED  
12 OUT IN GREATER DETAIL.

13

14 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** YEAH. I THINK, SO, WE'RE STILL WORKING  
15 THROUGH EXACTLY THE TIMING AND THE MECHANICS. I THINK THERE IS  
16 THE OPPORTUNITY TO, AND THE LIKELIHOOD OF SORT OF MODELING OUT  
17 VERSIONS, LIKE VARIANTS OF THE SAME OPTION. BUT THE BUSINESS  
18 CASE ANALYSIS IS DEVELOPING, RIGHT NOW. SO WE SHOULD LEAVE  
19 THAT ON THE TABLE AS AN OPTION. YOU KNOW, AT THE SAME TIME, I  
20 DO THINK -- I THINK IT'S VALLEY VALUABLE THAT WE CONTINUE TO  
21 ADVANCE OPTIONS IN EACH OF THESE PATHWAYS. BECAUSE THERE'S  
22 REALLY HARD STUFF HAVING TO DO WITH GOVERNANCE, AS MANY OF YOU  
23 ARE INTIMATELY FAMILIAR. YOU KNOW, TO IMPLEMENT SOME OF THESE  
24 MORE AMBITIOUS THINGS WOULD REQUIRE REALLY BIG CHANGES IN  
25 GOVERNANCE AND THE FINANCIAL STRUCTURE OF TRANSIST IN OUR



January 22, 2021

1 REGION AND I THINK THE OPTIONS ACROSS EACH OF THESE AREAS  
2 BECAUSE THERE IS GOING TO BE DECISIONS MADE AT STAFF LEVEL AND  
3 WE NEED TO BE IN A POSITION TO RESPOND TO HOWEVER THAT LEVEL  
4 OF DECISION MAKING. I THINK WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT RESOURCES  
5 WE NEED TO PRESERVE SUBVARIANCE.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. SORRY. I'M GOING TO  
8 MUTE MYSELF TO END MY COMPUTER'S RINGING NOISE. RICH HEDGES  
9 HAS A HAND.

10

11 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. I HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT THIS  
12 SINCE THE NEXT TO THE LAST SLIDE. I REALLY LIKED WENDI'S  
13 COMMENT ABOUT, WILL IT INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP? I THINK  
14 THAT SHOULD BE AN INCLUDED CRITERIA WE SHOULD BE AT LEAST  
15 THINKING ABOUT. I'M THINKING ABOUT TROUBLE THAT'S GOING TO  
16 CONSTRAIN US, 1 TO 2 ITEMS FROM EACH PATHWAY. I'M AFRAID WE'RE  
17 GOING TO END UP, IF WE'RE HELD TO THAT, BECAUSE IT SOUNDS TO  
18 ME LIKE THERE IS SEVERAL PEOPLE THAT LIKE ONE PARTICULAR OR  
19 MAYBE TWO WHO MIGHT PREFER THE THIRD OR FOURTH AND I'M AFRAID  
20 WE'RE GOING TO END UP WITH THE OLD ADAGE OF "WHAT IS A CAMEL"  
21 IT'S A HORSE DESIGNED BY COMMITTEE. I THINK WE SHOULD LOOSEN  
22 UP THE NUMBER OF ITEMS FROM EACH PATHWAY I THINK IT MIGHT END  
23 UP A BETTER PRODUCT ESPECIALLY.

24





January 22, 2021

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK THE REAL ANSWER IS 2 TO 3 WHAT WE'RE  
2 AIMING FOR. AND YOU CAN PROBABLY TELL, IN THE ANALYSIS WE HAVE  
3 GONE BACK AND FORTH ABOUT THE RIGHT NUMBER BUT WHAT WE'RE  
4 LOOKING AT RIGHT NOW IS 2 TO 3. HEDGE THANK YOU.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANKS. AND I SEE THAT RANDI KINMAN HAS A  
7 HUNDRED.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO CHIME IN WITH THE MORE  
10 OPTIONS THE BETTER. SOMETIMES SIMPLY BECAUSE IF YOU ONLY HAVE  
11 TWO OPTIONS IT BECOMES AN EITHER/OR THING SO LET'S NOT PUT  
12 PEOPLE IN THAT POSITION, LET'S GIVE THEM THE ACTUAL ABILITY TO  
13 CHOOSE. I WANT TO THANK YOU. THIS IS, YOU KNOW, AFTER YEARS  
14 AND YEARS AND YEARS OF WAITING TO GET TO THIS POINT, I CANNOT  
15 TELL YOU HOW AMAZING THIS PARTICULAR MEETING IS. SO I JUST  
16 WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO ALL OF YOU. BECAUSE THIS IS FRICKEN  
17 AMAZING. A-MAZE-ING. AND THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR ALL OF THIS.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** AND I JUST WANT TO RESPOND TO THE DISCUSSION  
20 HERE IT'S BEEN REALLY SUBSTANTIVE. THERE IS A LOT OF STUFF  
21 THAT YOU HAVE SAID THAT WE REALLY TO NED TO THINK ABOUT I  
22 THINK IT'S GOING SHARPEN THE PRESENTATION WHEN WE TAKE IT TO  
23 THE TASK FORCE. THANK YOU. AND I'M NOT SEEING ANY OTHER HANDS  
24 FROM MEMBERS OF THIS BODY. SO I'M GOING TO CLOSE THIS AGENDA  
25 ITEM AND MOVE ON TO THE LAST TWO -- THREE ITEMS ON THE AGENDA.



January 22, 2021

1 ONE, WHICH IS NEW BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY NEW BUSINESS ITEMS  
2 THAT MEMBERS OF THIS SUBCOMMITTEE WANT TO BRING UP FOR  
3 DISCUSSION OR ADDITION FOR A FUTURE AGENDA? ALL RIGHT. I'M NOT  
4 SEEING ANY ITEMS OF NEW BUSINESS BEING REQUESTED. AND SO  
5 MOVING ON TO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENT. I WILL ASK THE  
6 CLERK TO READ THE NAMES, ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN  
7 PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO AT -- BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY  
8 INTO THE RECORD, AND ALSO IS THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
9 PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WHO HAVE GENERAL COMMENTS ON  
10 ITEMS THAT ARE NOT ON TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND  
11 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE IF YOU'RE NOT ON A PHONE, AND I WILL  
12 CALL UPON YOU FOR GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. ARE THERE ANY ITEMS  
13 WRITTEN?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENT SUBMITTED ON  
16 THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
17 HANDS RAISED.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WITH THAT WE'LL  
20 ADJOURN THE MEETING UNTIL THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY  
21 ADVISORY COUNCIL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION  
22 SUBCOMMITTEE, WILL BE FRIDAY MARCH 12TH, 2021, AT 2:00 P.M.,  
23 BY WEBCAST AND ANY CHANGES WILL BE NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.  
24 THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND WE CAN HEAD OFF TO A MUCH NEEDED  
25 RAINY EVENING. ADJOURN.



January 22, 2021

1



*Broadcasting Government*