



**BAY AREA REGIONAL
COLLABORATIVE**
Meeting Transcript



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE GOVERNING BOARD**

2 **FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 15TH, 2023, 10:00 AM**

3

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** BEFORE WE BEGIN -- BEFORE WE BEGIN,
6 THERE ARE A FEW HOUSEKEEPING ITEMS. JUST ABOVE THE CONTROL
7 ROOM, THERE IS A SIGN WHEN IT'S ILLUMINATED, WE ARE IN
8 SESSION. PLEASE TURN YOUR MICROPHONE OFF WHEN NOT IN USE. FOR
9 THOSE PARTICIPATING FROM TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS THE ZOOM
10 WEBINAR IS NOW LIVE. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
11 SITE. MEMBERS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND
12 FEATURE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED ON TO SPEAK. MEMBERS OF THE
13 PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM -- SORRY. I HAVE NOT EDITED THAT
14 YET. WE WILL CALL YOU BY LAST NOW YOU ARE DIGITS OF YOUR PHONE
15 NUMBER. IN-PERSON SHOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE PODIUM. THE
16 CLERK WILL CALL UPON MEMBERS TO SPEAK. A ROLL CALL FOR QUORUM
17 AND VOTING MOTIONS WILL BE TAKEN. IF TELECONFERENCING UNDER
18 A.B. 2449 JUST CAUSE OR PERSONAL EMERGENCY PROVISIONS IS
19 REQUESTED BY A MEMBER THEN THE EXECUTIVE BOARD IS TO ONE VOTE
20 WHETHER TO ADD AN AGENDA ITEM ON APPROVAL OR JUST CAUSE
21 URGENCY TELECONFERENCING AND IF APPROVED TO VOTE WHETHER TO
22 APPROVE TELECONFERENCING UNDER THE JUST CAUSE EMERGENCY
23 PROVISION.

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GOOD MORNING. I'M JESSE ARREGUIN BAY
2 AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS
3 MEETING TO ORDER. ROLL CALL.

4

5 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ARREGUIN?

10

11 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** EISEN?

14

15 **REBECCA EISEN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** ECKLUND?

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. GIOIA IS ABSENT. HAUBERT?

22

23 **DAVID HAUBERT:** PRESENT.

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. PEDROZA IS ABSENT. PINE IS
2 ABSENT. NOACK IS ABSENT. RABBITT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. RAMOS? IS ABSENT. ROSS?

7

8 **ALLISON BROOKS:** HE IS -- I NOTICED HE IS IN THE ATTENDEE LIST
9 AND NEEDS BE INVITED IN AS A PANELIST.

10

11 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. AND SPERING?

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. WASSERMAN?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, ZACK WASSERMAN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. CHAIR, WE HAVE ACHIEVED
20 QUORUM.

21

22 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE SEE MARK
23 ROSS HAS NOW BEEN MOVED OVER TO PANELIST. WE NOTE HIM AS
24 PRESENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM TWO, GOVERNING
25 BOARD ANNOUNCEMENTS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. ARE THERE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF OUR GOVERNING BOARD? SEEING
2 NONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK. ANYONE ON ZOOM? I
3 DON'T SEE ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. IS THERE ANY
4 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? I DON'T SEE ANYONE PRESENT IN THE
5 BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM. OKAY. IF NOT, WE CAN PROCEED TO THE NEXT
6 AGENDA ITEM, WHICH IS ITEM THREE, THE CHAIR'S REPORT. THIS IS
7 AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND I HAVE NO REPORT OTHER THAN TO THANK
8 MY COLLEAGUES FOR BEING HERE IN-PERSON AND BEING ON ZOOM AND
9 LOOK FORWARD TO TODAY'S MEETING. AND ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS?
10 IF NOT, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

11

12 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY THANK YOU. PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR,
15 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, WHICH CONSISTS OF 4A APPROVAL OF THE
16 BARC GOVERNING BOARD MEETING MINUTES OF JULY 1ST, 2023. 21st -
17 - I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, ZACK WASSERMAN:** SECOND.

22

23 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** MOTION AND SECOND. COLLEAGUES, ARE
24 THERE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THE MOTION? IF NOT. PUBLIC
25 COMMENT ON ITEM FOUR, THE CONSENT CALENDAR?



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM FOUR.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER DISCUSSION WE
5 CAN PROCEED TO ROLL CALL VOTE ON ITEM FOUR, APPROVING THE
6 CONSENT CALENDAR.

7

8 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT.
9 AHN?

10

11 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** UPON THANK YOU. ARREGUIN?

14

15 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** EISEN?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** HAUBERT?

22

23 **DAVID HAUBERT:** AYE.

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NOACK? IS ABSENT. PEDROZA IS ABSENT.

2 PINE IS ABSENT. RABBITT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU. RAMOS? IS ABSENT. ROSS?

7

8 **MARK ROSS:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** SAY THAT AGAIN? THANK YOU. SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** WASSERMAN?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, ZACK WASSERMAN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM FIVE. THESE ARE

21 OUR BARC MEMBER AGENCY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR UPDATES. WE'LL HEAR

22 FROM THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S OF OUR MEMBER AGENCIES. AND

23 WE'LL FIRST START WITH THE FIRST AGENCY LISTED, WHICH IS THE

24 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA

25 GOVERNMENTS ANDREW F, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1
2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR. ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE
3 MTC COMMISSIONERS THAT SIT ON THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE
4 AUTHORITY HAVE ASKED STAFF TO TAKE STEPS NECESSARY TO PLACE
5 THE REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER 2024
6 BALLOT. AS YOU KNOW. EARLIER THIS WEEK WE GOT GOOD NEWS
7 SACRAMENTO RELATED TO EFFORTS. I THOUGHT IT MAKES SENSE TO
8 UPDATE THE GROUP. FIRST THE HOUSING ARENA WE DID SPONSOR A.B.
9 1319 THAT ADDRESSES PROBLEMS UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES IN THE
10 BAHFA ENABLING LEGISLATION THIS CLEAN UP BILL HAD STRONG
11 SUPPORT FROM ACROSS THE BAY AREA WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER HOUSING
12 CHAIR WICKS AUTHORIZING THE BILL AND BAY AREA MEMBERS SIGNED
13 OFF AS COAUTHORS. NOW WAITS ACTION BY THE GOVERNOR. YESTERDAY
14 THE STATE SENATE PASSED ACA AGUIAR-CURRY AUTHORIZES A
15 STATEWIDE BALLOT MEASURE IN NOVEMBER 2024 TO LOWER THE VOTER
16 THRESHOLD FOR LOCAL AND REGIONAL HOUSING BONDS TO 55% OF ACA
17 ONE PASSES ON NOVEMBER 24TH, THE TEAM WILL GO AND START
18 WORKING WITH THE AUTHOR AND OUR BAHFA ALLIES OVER THE FALL TO
19 CLEAN UP LEGISLATION TO ENSURE THAT MEASURE APPEARS BEFORE
20 VOTERS IN BEST POSSIBLE WAY WITH THE MOST CLEAR LANGUAGE
21 AVAILABLE TO US. AND MONDAY THE STATE SENATE PASSED SB FOUR
22 WIENER 32 TO 2 AND SENT TO THE GOVERNOR'S DESK THE BILL ALLOWS
23 FAITH INSTITUTIONS NON-PROFIT COLLEGES TO BUILD AFFORDABLE
24 HOUSING ON THEIR PROPERTY EVEN IF LOCAL ZONING PREVENTS THAT
25 HOUSING THAT'S GOOD MOVEMENT THIS WEEK THANKS TO OUR STAFF



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT WAS WORKING IN THE HALLS IN SACRAMENTO. A COUPLE OF
2 THINGS IN THE TRANSPORTATION MTC AND ABAG SUPPORTED CAMERA
3 SAFETY BILL A.B. 645 FRIEDMAN AND SECURED FINAL APPROVAL BY
4 THE LEGISLATURE EARLIER THIS WEEK AND NOW HEADS TO THE
5 GOVERNOR'S DESK THE IMPORTANT TRANSPORTATION SAFETY BILL
6 AUTHORIZES CALIFORNIA CITIES INCLUDING OAKLAND, SAN FRANCISCO,
7 SAN JOSE TO PILOT AUTOMATED SPEED ENFORCEMENT AND I THINK WE
8 HAVE CERTAINLY SEEN PEOPLE DRIVING POORLY AND PEOPLE ARE
9 GETTING HURT WALKING AROUND THE STREETS SO HOPEFULLY THAT WILL
10 LEAD TO SOME REAL IMPROVED STATISTICS ALSO SENATOR WIENER
11 PAUSED HIS BILL SB532 THAT WAS TO ENACT A TEMPORARY \$1.50 TOLL
12 INCREASE ON THE BAY AREA BRIDGES TO FUNDS PUBLIC
13 TRANSPORTATION TRANSIT AVOID SERVICE CUTS INSTEAD HE'S GOING
14 TO START A WORKING GROUP WITH BAY AREA REPRESENTATIVES TO TRY
15 TO FIGURE OUT WHAT'S THE BEST APPROACH FOR TRYING TO DEAL WITH
16 THAT SIGNIFICANT PROBLEM. FINALLY MTC AND ABAG LEGISLATIVE
17 COMMITTEE AND MTC COMMISSIONERS WERE IN THE EARLY STAGES OF
18 EXPLORING A POTENTIAL REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE IN 2026
19 AND I'LL UPDATE YOU ON OUR PROGRESS AT FUTURE MEETINGS. THAT'S
20 BEEN AN EXTREMELY BUSY IN SACRAMENTO. I WANTED TO ADD A LITTLE
21 BIT ON STATE ROUTE 37, MTC LATE LAST MONTH BEGAN THE PROCESS
22 TO ASK FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO HELP FUND LONG-TERM PROJECT WORK
23 ON STATE ROUTE 37 SPECIFICALLY COORDINATED WITH THE CALIFORNIA
24 NATIONAL RESOURCE AGENCY AND CALTRANS TO SUBMIT A LETTER OF
25 INTENT TO IMPLY FOR \$75 MILLION FOR A NEW CLIMATE RESILIENCE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 REGIONAL CHALLENGE THROUGH NATIONAL OCEANIC ATMOSPHERIC
2 ADMINISTRATION NOAA FUNDING WOULD ALLOW ADVANCEMENT OF LONG-
3 TERM RESILIENCE WORK WE'RE COMMITTING TO AND ALLOW US TO DO
4 PLANNING EFFORTS THAT FOCUS ON WHAT'S AFTER THE FIRST SERIES
5 OF PROJECTS THAT ARE STARTING TO GET UNDERWAY. WE LOOK FORWARD
6 TO WORKING CLOSELY WITH THE STATE AGENCIES ON STATE ROUTE 37
7 TRYING TO LOOK AT BETTER PARTNERSHIP TO INCORPORATE A LOT OF
8 RESILIENCY IMPROVEMENTS ALONG WITH SOME TRANSPORTATION
9 IMPROVEMENTS AT THE SAME TIME. I DO LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUE
10 INFORMATION ON IMPROVEMENTS THERE. I WANT TO THANK
11 COMMISSIONER EKLUND. SHE JOINED THE STATE ROUTE 37 TOUR LAST
12 WEEK WITH THE POLICY FOLKS, AND FROM ALL INFORMATION IT SOUNDS
13 LIKE IT WENT WELL. GETTING PEOPLE OUT THERE SEEING WHAT WE'RE
14 TRYING TO DO IS GOING GO A LONG WAYS TO IMPROVE OUR ABILITY TO
15 COMMUNICATE WITH ONE VOICE ON HOW ALL IMPROVEMENTS ARE PLANNED
16 GOING TO BE EFFECTIVE IN MOVING THAT PROJECT FORWARD. THAT'S
17 MY REPORT FOR NOW.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? YES?

20

21 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE ANDY'S REPORT ON
22 HIGHWAY 37. THAT PRESENTATION WAS INCREDIBLE. AND I THINK THAT
23 ANYBODY THAT HAS ANYTHING TO DO WITH HIGHWAY 37 SHOULD TAKE
24 THE TOUR LIKE THAT. AND I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND I
25 RAISE THIS ISSUE THAT THE REGULATORY AGENCIES NEED TO BE MORE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 ENGAGED EARLY ON. AND I THINK THEY, AT THE TOUR, THEY SAID
2 THEY'RE STARTING TO REACH OUT TO THE REGULATORY AGENCIES. I
3 WAS THINKING SPECIFICALLY ABOUT BCDC, AND THE REGIONAL BOARD
4 AND THE OTHER ORGANIZATION THAT IS ACTUALLY PART OF THIS
5 GROUP. HAVING WORKED FOR THE U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
6 AGENCY FOR OVER 36 YEARS, IT'S IMPORTANT TO GET THE REGULATORY
7 AGENCIES ENGAGED. BUT I THOUGHT IT WAS AN OUTSTANDING TOUR.
8 AND YOU'RE RIGHT, IT'S NOT REALLY A HIGHWAY PROJECT OR FREEWAY
9 PROJECT. IT'S REALLY A RESILIENCY PROJECT. AND THAT'S HOW IT'S
10 BEING PRESENTED. AND I THINK THAT'S BRILLIANT, AND REALLY
11 APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP, ANDY, AND REALLY LOOKING FORWARD
12 TO WORKING WITH YOU AND OTHER REGULATORY AGENCIES TO TRY TO
13 STREAMLINE THE PERMITTING, WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT I'M VERY
14 CONCERNED ABOUT.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR WASSERMAN

17

18 **V. CHAIR, ZACK WASSERMAN:** I AGREE WITH YOU. BCDC IS REALLY
19 INVOLVED WITH WORKING WITH THE TEAM. AND I'M NOT SURE OF THE
20 OTHER AGENCIES. BUT I THINK THEY ARE. THERE IS A THOUGHTFUL
21 AND AGGRESSIVE OUTREACH TO GET EVERYBODY WORKING TOGETHER TO
22 MAKE THIS VERY TOUGH PROJECT HAPPEN.

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** I REALLY THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR SOME OF THE
25 BCDC COMMISSIONERS TO GET AN EARLY LOOK AT WHAT THEY'RE GOING



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 TO BE BEING PRESENTED WITH. I RECOGNIZE THAT THE STAFF IS
2 REALLY WORKING CLOSELY, WHICH IS ESSENTIAL. BUT I THINK IT'S
3 IMPORTANT FOR THE BCDC COMMISSIONERS AND COMMISSIONERS OF
4 OTHER ORGANIZATIONS TO GET THAT PREVIEW. ONLY BECAUSE IT WILL
5 HELP US LEGISLATIVELY, AS WELL. THIS SHOULD BE THE PRIORITY, I
6 THINK, FOR THE REGION. BECAUSE IT'S REALLY GOING TO AFFECT ALL
7 OF THE COUNTIES IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA.

8

9 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
10 COMMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS? OKAY. ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM
11 WHO HAVE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FOR MR. PREMIER? OKAY. I
12 DON'T SEE MEMBERS WISHING TO BE RECOGNIZED. SO, THANK YOU, MR.
13 PREMIER FOR BEING HERE THIS MORNING. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO
14 THE NEXT REPORT FROM THE CALIFORNIA STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY.
15 I'LL TURN IT OVER TO AMY HUTZEL.

16

17 **AMY HUTZEL:** THANK YOU CHAIR ARREGUIN AND MEMBERS OF THE BARC
18 BOARD. I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY
19 RESTORATION AUTHORITY, THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE IS MEETING JUST
20 ACROSS THE HALL, RIGHT NOW. SO, WE ARE IN THE MIDST OF THE
21 REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS PROCESS FOR THIS YEAR'S RESTORATION
22 AUTHORITY MEASURE AA FUNDING. AND THEN THE STATE COASTAL
23 CONSERVANCY, WE HAD OUR BOARD MEETING YESTERDAY IN HEALDSBURG,
24 WHICH WAS LOVELY, AND AUTHORIZED ALMOST \$84 MILLION IN GRANTS,
25 UP-AND-DOWN THE COAST, AND IN THE BAY AREA. SO, IT WAS AN



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 EXCITING BOARD MEETING. SOME OF THE PROJECTS IN THE BAY AREA
2 THAT WOULD BE OF INTEREST INCLUDE 1.23 MILLION TO THE CITY OF
3 OAKLAND FOR THE 66th AVENUE BART TO BAY TRAIL DESIGN, WHICH IS
4 FUNDING -- ITS MITIGATION FUNDS THROUGH BCDC FROM CALTRANS
5 FROM QUITE A WHILE AGO, AND WE'RE REALLY HAPPY TO BE PUTTING
6 THESE TOWARDS A PROJECT THAT WILL BENEFIT THE OAKLAND
7 COMMUNITY. WE'RE ALSO MOVING FORWARD WITH THE THIRD PHASE OF
8 THE SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO BAY SHORELINE FEASIBILITY STUDY, WHICH
9 IS MOUNTAIN VIEW, AND SUNNYVALE. SO, WE'RE GOING TO BE -- THE
10 BOARD AUTHORIZED ENTERING INTO THE COST SHARE AGREEMENT WITH
11 VALLEY WATER AND THE CORP OF ENGINEERS TO GET THAT STUDY
12 MOVING ALONG. THERE WAS A \$5.1 MILLION GRANT FOR INDIA BASIN,
13 THE 900 INNISS, THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE PARK BY SAN FRANCISCO
14 REC AND PARK DEPARTMENT AND 1.78 MILLION TO LITERACY FOR
15 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE FOR WORK AT HERON'S HEAD PARK, REALLY
16 ECO APPRENTICES AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS LEAD 8.99
17 MILLION TO THE CITY OF BERKELEY FOR BERKELEY MARINA WORK
18 REPLACING DOCKS, AND DREDGING THE MARINA WHICH IS ONE PART OF
19 IMPROVING THE OVERALL MARINA INCREASING REVENUE SUPPORT THE
20 WORK AT THE MARINA. 4.35 MILLION TO SAN FRANCISCO STATE
21 UNIVERSITY FOR SOME ON GROUND SEA LEVEL RISE NATURE-BASED
22 ADAPTATION PROJECTS IN MARIN COUNTY ALONG WITH WORKFORCE
23 DEVELOPMENT EFFORTS WITH COMMUNITY COLLEGES IN THE BAY AREA
24 THAT WAS EXCITING TO SEE THE COMBINATION OF SAN FRANCISCO
25 STATE UNIVERSITY WORKING WITH UMM SEVERAL OF THE COMMUNITY



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 COLLEGES AND THEN STARTING IN OYSTER SHELL RECYCLING PROGRAM
2 WHICH HAPPENS A LOT ON THE EAST COAST. WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE
3 THAT TAKE OFF IN THE BAY AREA SO WE CAN USE THAT OYSTER SHELL
4 NON-NATIVE OYSTERS THAT WE'RE EATING, BUT WE CAN USE THE
5 OYSTER SHELL ONCE THEY'RE CURED, THEY JUST SIT IN THE SUN FOR
6 A YEAR WE CAN USE THAT FOR RESTORATION PROJECTS AND JUST A
7 GREAT WAY TO ENGAGE PEOPLE IN THE LIVING SHORELINE WORK, THE
8 OYSTERS THEY'RE EATING ARE ACTUALLY BENEFITTING THE SAN
9 FRANCISCO BAY THEN \$3.4 MILLION TO DUCKS UNLIMITED FOR DESIGN
10 AND CEQA WORK IN THE SONOMA CREEK BAYLANDS, AND THAT INCLUDES
11 DESIGN FOR RESTORATION, FLOOD PROTECTION, AND PUBLIC ACCESS
12 WORK THAT CAME OUT OF THE SONOMA CREEK BAYLANDS -- I FORGET
13 THE EXACT NAME -- I'M GOING TO SAY THE MASTER PLAN, BUT THERE
14 WAS MORE COMPLICATED NAME FOR IT. THEN I WANTED TO POINT OUT
15 WORK WITH ALLISON AND BCDC AND OTHERS TO SUBMIT TO SENATOR
16 PADILLA AND SENATOR FEINSTEIN A PROPOSAL FOR WORDA LANGUAGE IN
17 2024 SO THE SENATORS HAVE REQUESTED A DUE DATE TODAY FOR ANY
18 IDEAS FOR WORDA LANGUAGE FOR NEXT YEAR'S WORDA AND WE HAVE
19 SUBMITTED A VERY PRELIMINARY CONCEPT FOR CORP OF ENGINEERS
20 COMPREHENSIVE STUDY FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY THIS IS IN THE VERY
21 BEGINNING OF THE PROCESS THERE IS A LOT OF WORK AND NEXT STEPS
22 WOULD BE IF SENATORS WANT TO PURSUE THIS THEY WOULD REQUEST
23 LEGISLATIVE DRAFTING SERVICES FROM THE CORP OF ENGINEERS AND
24 THEN WE WOULD GET INTO THE DETAILS BUT A POTENTIAL WAY TO GET
25 FEDERAL PROJECTS FEDERAL FUNDING IN THE LONG-TERM AFTER



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 COMPREHENSIVE STUDY THAT IDENTIFIES PRIORITIES FOR THE COASTAL
2 FLOOD PROTECTION AND AQUATIC ECOSYSTEM RESTORATION PROJECTS IN
3 THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY. THEN WE ALSO SUBMITTED AN APPLICATION,
4 A \$75 MILLION APPLICATION, TO THE NOAA COASTAL CHALLENGE
5 PROGRAM, WITH A NUMBER OF PARTNERS AND THE APPLICATION
6 INCLUDES THE NORTH RICHMOND LIVING LEVEE, EDEN LANDING IN
7 HAYWARD, RESTORATION OF SOME SOUTH BAY CREEKS IN SANTA CLARA
8 COUNTY, THE MOUTHS OF THE CREEKS, AND THEN CENTRAL BAY LIVING
9 SHORELINE PROJECTS AND THEN SOME REGIONAL COORDINATION EFFORTS
10 AROUND REGULATORY WORK AND COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT WORKFORCE
11 DEVELOPMENT. SO, THAT IS MY SUMMARY. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. A LOT OF EXCITING
14 WORK. I DIDN'T THAN WE GOT THE \$8 MILLION GRANT. SO, THAT MADE
15 MY DAY. [LAUGHTER] ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS? YES, VICE CHAIR
16 EISEN?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I WAS GOING TO COMMENT ONE OF THE GRANTS, BUT ALL OF
19 THEM SOUND FANTASTIC. BUT IN PARTICULAR AS AN OAKLAND
20 RESIDENT, I REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE GRANT FOR THE BAY
21 TRAIL HAVING SAFE AND ENJOYABLE PUBLIC ACCESS IN OAKLAND IS
22 ALWAYS A CHALLENGE. IT'S A BIG HELP. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

23

24 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?
25 COMMISSIONER RABBITT?



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU FOR ALL THE WORK. I DID HEAR ON THE
3 OYSTER SHELL PIECE, IN PETALUMA, THE EGG CAPITAL OF THE WORLD.
4 ALTHOUGH WE STILL PRODUCE ABOUT 600,000 EGGS DAILY IN AND
5 AROUND PETALUMA, OYSTER SHELLS ARE USED AS FEED SUPPLEMENT FOR
6 THE BIRDS TO MAKE SURE THE SHELLS ARE STRONG AND CAN MAKE IT
7 TO THE MARKET. ALL OF THOSE THINGS. I APPRECIATE IT VERY MUCH.
8 IT WAS ONE MARINE WHO BROUGHT IN THE OYSTERS SHELLS THEY
9 BARGED INTO DOWNTOWN PETALUMA AND NOW HAVE MOVED OVER TO
10 AMERICAN CANYON. THANK YOU FOR THAT WORK. APPRECIATE IT.

11

12 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS? ON ZOOM? SEEING
13 NONE. THANK YOU, MISS HUTZEL FOR BEING HERE TODAY. WITH THAT,
14 WE'LL GO TO THE CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION? JESSICA
15 ARE YOU GIVING THE REPORT TODAY?

16

17 **JESSICA FAIN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND BOARD MEMBERS. LARRY
18 GOLDZBAND IS NOT IN TODAY. I'M FILLING IN. I WANT TO THANK AMY
19 HUTZEL AND THE STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND THEIR LEADERSHIP
20 ON THE LETTER OF INTENT FOR THE NOAA GRANT PROPOSAL THAT AMY
21 WAS REVIEWING AND IT'S A GREAT EXAMPLE HOW THE BARC AGENCIES
22 CAN BE WORKING TO PUT TOGETHER A STRONG PROPOSAL WE'LL KEEP
23 YOU POSTED ON HOW THAT GOES. EARLIER THIS WEEK THE STATE
24 LEGISLATURE PASSED SENATE BILL 272 THE LAIRED BILL FOR SEA
25 LEVEL RISE PLANNING AND ADAPTATION WHICH HAS BEEN SENT TO THE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 GOVERNOR FOR SIGNATURE THIS BILL REQUIRES LOCAL GOVERNMENTS
2 WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF EITHER BCDC OR STATE OR CALIFORNIA
3 COASTAL COMMISSION TO CREATE ADAPTATION SHORELINE PLANS AND IT
4 REQUIRES BCDC OR THE COASTAL COMMISSION TO CREATE GUIDELINES
5 FOR PLANS BY DECEMBER 2024 AND FOR JURISDICTIONS TO COMPLETE
6 THOSE PLANS THEY WILL PRIORITIZE FOR STATE FUNDING. BCDC TOOK
7 A SUPPORT POSITION. BCDC IS ON A PATH TO MEETING 2024 DEADLINE
8 FOR REGIONAL GUIDELINES THROUGH REGIONAL SHORELINE ADAPTATION
9 PLAN WHICH IS PART OF OUR BAY ADAPT PROGRAM YOU MIGHT SEE US
10 POPPING UP IN THE EVENTS AROUND THE BAY AREA OVER THE NEXT FEW
11 MONTHS. FEEL FREE TO REACH OUT TO ME WE WOULD LOVE TO WORK
12 WITH FOLKS TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE CAN GET OUT THERE AND MAKE
13 THIS WORK VISIBLE. A FEW WEEKS AGO WE HELD OUR FIRST IN-PERSON
14 MEETING OF BCDC'S SEA LEVEL RISE ELECTED OFFICIAL SAYS TASK
15 FORCE WHICH IS A GROUP COMPRISED OF 19 LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIALS
16 FROM AROUND THE REGION A BIG THANK YOU TO SUPERVISOR GIOIA WHO
17 CHAIRS THE GROUP AND HOSTED US AT WEST COUNTY WASTEWATER
18 FACILITY IN RICHMOND TO LEARN ABOUT THE ROLE THAT LOCAL
19 ELECTED OFFICIALS PLAYED IN DEVELOPMENT OF THE HORIZONTAL LEVY
20 PROJECT. THAT'S MY REPORT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD
23 MEMBERS? IS YOUR MIC ON FROM BEFORE? ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS
24 FROM MEMBERS ON ZOOM? IF SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. I DON'T
25 SEE MEMBERS WISHING TO BE RECOGNIZED. THANK YOU JESSICA FOR



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 BEING HERE TODAY FOR YOUR REPORT AND YOUR PARTNERSHIP. WE'LL
2 GO NEXT TO THE REPORT FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA AIR
3 QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. GREG NUDD WILL GIVE THIS REPORT.

4

5 **GREG NUDD:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE BARC BOARD MY
6 NAME IS GREG NUDD I'M THE DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR
7 SCIENCE POLICY AT THE AIR DISTRICT. DR. FINE COULDN'T BE HERE
8 TODAY HE'S AT OUR COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL RETREAT. I'M
9 TALKING ABOUT A COUPLE OF THINGS GETTING OUR STRATEGIC
10 PLANNING EFFORT KICKOFF AND ALSO WANT TO TALK ABOUT CLIMATE
11 PLANNING ENGAGEMENT WORK IN COOPERATION WITH BARC AND BAY RUN.
12 STRATEGIC PLANNING CHALLENGES WE HAVE RIGHT NOW IS IT WAS
13 DEVELOPED AND DESIGNED TO BE AN AGENCY THAT HELPED WITH
14 REGIONAL AIR POLLUTION AND ENFORCED UNDER AND THROUGH THE
15 CLEAN AIR ACT. BUT OVER TIME WE HAVE TAKEN ON ADDITIONAL
16 RESPONSIBILITIES ADDRESSING THE CLIMATE CRISIS AND
17 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE GIVEN CHALLENGES WE HAVE WITH AIR
18 QUALITY IS THE FOLKS WHO ARE MOST EXPOSED TO BAD AIR ARE THE
19 FOLKS MOST VULNERABLE TO HEALTH IMPACTS FROM IT. HOW DO WE
20 BALANCE THAT KIND OF CORE DESIGN OF THE AGENCY WITH THESE NEW
21 INITIATIVES? SO, THE PURPOSE OF THE STRATEGIC PLANNING PROCESS
22 WILL BE TO DEVELOP A FIVE-YEAR STRATEGIC PLAN TO GIVE A
23 FRAMEWORK TO ALIGN PRIORITIES WITH RESOURCES. THEN USE THAT
24 FRAMEWORK FOR IMPROVED EFFICIENCIES IN TRACKING, REPORTING OUT
25 TO THE BOARD, REPORTING OUT TO THE EXECUTIVES AND EVENTUALLY



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 FORMING A FRAMEWORK FOR OUR PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT PROCESS. WE
2 HAVE PARTNERED WITH BLUE POINT PLANNING WHO DID THE STRATEGIC
3 PLANNING FOR BCDC AND ALSO THE METROPOLITAN GROUP WHO IS
4 HELPING US DEVELOP AN ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE STRATEGY. THE IDEA
5 IS HAVING THAT EQUITY STRATEGY FULLY INTEGRATED INTO THE
6 OVERALL STRATEGIC PLAN. SO, THE NEXT STEP IS THERE IS GOING TO
7 BE AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE OF OUR BOARD HAS FORMED TO WORK WITH
8 THE STAFF ON DEVELOPING A STRATEGIC PLAN AND WE'LL HAVE A
9 MEETING WITH THEM ON SEPTEMBER 20TH. WE DO EXPECT THERE WILL
10 BE EXTENSIVE STAKEHOLDER OUTREACH PROCESS, BECAUSE I THINK
11 THIS IS GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT LOOKING FORWARD TO THE
12 KIND OF THINGS THAT FOLKS NEED THE AIR DISTRICT TO DO MAKING
13 SURE THEIR VOICE IS HEARD IN THIS PROCESS. SO, MOVING ON FROM
14 STEAK PLANNING TO CLIMATE PLANNING. WE GAVE A PRESENTATION TO
15 OUR STRATEGIC -- I MEAN, I'M SORRY -- OUR STATIONARY SOURCE
16 COMMITTEE, EARLIER THIS WEEK, AND ASKED THEM TO APPROVE THE
17 ACCEPTANCE OF \$1 MILLION IN FUNDING FROM U.S. EPA FOR CLIMATE
18 PLANNING. THERE IS A BIG PROGRAM AROUND THE INFLATION
19 REDUCTION ACT THAT HAD TWO PARTS. THERE IS FUNDING FOR
20 PLANNING AND FUNDING FOR CLIMATE IMPLEMENTATION. AND THE
21 IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING IS A NATIONALLY COMPETITIVE POOL OF
22 \$4.6 BILLION. SO, IN ORDER TO DO THAT, THOUGH, YOU HAVE TO DO
23 THE PLANNING. AND THE WAY IT'S DESIGNED, IT SEEMS STRANGE FROM
24 OUR PURPOSE FROM THE BAY AREA, BECAUSE IT ACTUALLY DIVIDED THE
25 BAY AREA UP. THE WAY THE PLANNING GRANTS GO OCCUPY IS



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 METROPOLITAN STATISTICAL AREAS GET \$1 MILLION EACH. AND THE
2 WAY EPA SET THIS UP, THERE IS ONE AREA THAT INCLUDED ALAMEDA
3 CONTRA COSTA MARIN SAN FRANCISCO SAN MATEO AND ANOTHER AREA
4 THAT INCLUDES SANTA CLARA AND SAN BENITO. SO THERE ARE TWO
5 PLANNING GRANTS GOING TO THE BAY AREA. THE AIR DISTRICT WILL
6 BE MANAGING THE ONE GOING TO ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA MARIN THAT
7 PART OF THE BAY AND SANTA CLARA WILL BE MANAGING SANTA CLARA
8 AND SAN BENITO. WE'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH SANTA CLARA STAFF
9 TO MAKE SURE EFFORTS ARE CLOSELY ALIGNED. THE FUNDING FOR
10 PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION WE EXPECT THAT SOLICITATION TO COME OUT
11 SOON. IT'S A NATIONALLY COMPETITIVE POOL OF 4.6 BILLION.
12 THINGS MUST BENEFIT ARE LOW-INCOME DISADVANTAGED FRONT LINE
13 COMMUNITIES AND IT MUST IMPLEMENT MEASURES THAT ARE IDENTIFIED
14 IN THE PLAN WHICH IS WHERE THIS GETS TRICKY FROM A TIMING
15 STANDPOINT. THERE ARE TWO PHASES OF THIS, THERE IS A PRIORITY
16 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN DUE ON MARCH 24TH. SO EVEN THOUGH WE
17 BARELY HAVE GOT THE MONEY AND DON'T HAVE A PLAN TO SPEND IT
18 YESTERDAY, WE'RE ALREADY DOING THIS BECAUSE WE HAVE TO HIT THE
19 MARCH 24th DEADLINE BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE YOU HAVE TO IDENTIFY
20 THOSE ONE OR TWO PRIORITY SECTORS FOR THAT IMPLEMENTATION.
21 THAT'S CRITICAL. THIS IS OBVIOUSLY ONGOING AND WE WANT TO GET
22 GOOD INPUT FROM PARTNERS BUT WE SEEM TO BE FOCUSING AT THIS
23 POINT ON BUILDINGS AND KIND OF LAST MILE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
24 CONNECTIONS. SO, THAT WOULD BE WHERE I EXPECT WE WILL LAND ON
25 THOSE TWO PRIORITY SECTIONS. AND THEN THE SHORT LIST, YOU KNOW



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 -- AND THEN THERE IS THE COMPREHENSIVE CLIMATE ACTION PLAN
2 WHICH IS AN INTERESTING THING. WE HAVE A STATEWIDE CLIMATE
3 ACTION PLAN WHICH IS COMPREHENSIVE. WE HAVE A LOT OF LOCAL
4 PLANS. WE HAVEN'T DONE A PROPER REGIONAL PLAN. SO THIS IS
5 GOING TO BE A USEFUL TOOL TO TIE ALL THOSE LOCAL PLANNING
6 ISSUE AREAS TOGETHER WITH THE STATEWIDE PLAN. IT'S GOING TO BE
7 CHALLENGING THOUGH BECAUSE OF THE WAY THAT EPA HAS DIVIDED US
8 UP. SO THAT'S GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE FOR US MOVING ON. SO THE
9 ADVISORY WORKING GROUP ON THIS PLANNING PROCESS INCLUDES BARC,
10 BAYREN, MTC AND ABAG, ALAMEDA COUNTY STOP WASTE, CONTRA COSTA
11 COUNTY, MARIN COUNTY, SAN MATEO, BERKELEY, OAKLAND, CITY AND
12 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO OF THE WE'RE ALSO PULLING IN NAPA
13 SONOMA AND SOLANO AS WE'RE CALLING THEM EX-OFFICIO MEMBERS AS
14 THEIR NEEDS ARE IDENTIFIED IN THIS PLANNING PROCESS. IN TERMS
15 OF IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING SONOMA NAP AND SOLANO WILL STILL BE
16 ELIGIBLE FOR IMPLEMENTATION FUNDS AND WE'LL BE WORKING WITH
17 THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD AND DOING STATEWIDE
18 PLANNING TO IDENTIFY PRIORITIES. OUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES WILL
19 FALL UNDER THAT STATEWIDE PLANNING AND WE'RE WORKING WITH CARB
20 AND WE'RE WORKING WITH EPA TO MAKE SURE THAT THEIR NEEDS ARE
21 IDENTIFIED CLEARLY AND ARE FUNDABLE THROUGH THAT
22 IMPLEMENTATION GRANT PROCESS. SO, THAT CONCLUDES MY UPDATE.
23 AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT Y'ALL MIGHT HAVE
24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS FROM BOARD
2 MEMBERS? ANY BOARD MEMBERS HERE IN THE ROOM? OKAY SEEING NONE.
3 ANY QUESTIONS FROM ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM? I DO NOT SEE ANY
4 BOARD MEMBERS WISHING TO BE RECOGNIZED. THANK YOU FOR BEING
5 HERE, MR. NUDD, FOR THE UPDATE. WE WILL NOW GO TO OUR LAST
6 MEMBER AGENCY UPDATE FROM THE SAN FRANCISCO REGIONAL WATER
7 QUALITY CONTROL BOARD. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO EILEEN WHITE.

8

9 **ELLEN WHITE:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING BOARD MEMBERS.
10 I WANT TO GIVE A BRIEF UPDATE FROM OUR BOARD MEETING THIS
11 WEEK. WE PUT OUT OUR STRATEGIC WORK PLAN WHICH WE PRESENTED
12 EARLIER THIS WEEK AND WE WANTED TO REPORT-OUT OUR FISCAL YEAR
13 ACCOMPLISHMENTS. I'M NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH ALL
14 ACCOMPLISHMENTS BUT TALK ABOUT WHAT RELATES TO WORK REGIONALLY
15 OUR THREE ORGANIZATIONAL PRIORITIES AS WE OUTLINED IN OUR
16 STRATEGIC WORK PLAN IS WORKFORCE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
17 ADVANCING RACIAL EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE IN THE BAY
18 AREA AND CLIMATE CHANGE AND WE CONTINUE WITH THE WATER BOARD
19 INCORPORATING CLIMATE ACTIONS INTO OUR PROGRAMS AND UTILIZING
20 AUTHORITY TO ADVANCE CLIMATE ADAPTATION PLANNING TECHNICAL
21 ASSISTANCE AND PERMITTING. WE RECOGNIZE THAT ADDRESSING
22 CLIMATE CHANGE IS CRITICAL FOR LONG-TERM PROGRAMS AND WATER
23 QUALITY I WANT TO LET YOU KNOW THAT THE BOARD IS APPRECIATIVE
24 OF HEARING ABOUT THE REGIONAL PLANNING FOR SHORELINE
25 ADAPTATION AND BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE BAY ADAPT PLATT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 NORM AND WE HAVE HAD BART BARC COME TO OUR BOARD EARLIER IN
2 THE YEAR COORDINATED PLANNING REGULATORY MONITORING EFFORTS
3 FACILITATING CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION AND IN PARTICULAR THE
4 MULTI-AGENCY PLANNING EFFORT FOR STATE HIGHWAY 37 AND THE
5 NORTH BAY. SO, TO FOLLOW ON BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS THE REGIONAL
6 BOARD HAS BEEN AT THE TABLE. WE'RE VERY INVOLVED IN THE
7 HIGHWAY 37 PROJECT AND DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MAKE SURE
8 THE SOLUTION ADDRESSES CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION AND ANYTHING
9 WE CAN DO AS FAR AS PERMITTING PROCESS. SO, JUST REALLY
10 PLEASED WITH ALL COLLABORATION HAPPENING IN THE BAY AREA TO
11 ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE. SWITCHING GEARS FROM OUR STRATEGIC
12 WORK PLAN THAT WE PRESENTED. WANT TO TOUCH BASE. SOME OF YOU
13 MAY HAVE HEARD THAT IN LATE JULY OUR HARMFUL ALGAE BLOOM KNOWN
14 AS RED TIGHT WAS OBSERVED IN PARTS OF SAN FRANCISCO INCLUDING
15 THE LAGOON OFF ALAMEDA THEN EMERYVILLE, ALBANY AND CERTAIN
16 PARTS OF MARIN COUNTY THIS SPECIES ASSOCIATED WITH THE BLOOM,
17 IS A SPECIES THAT TAKES ON REDDISH BROWN COLOR, IT'S BEEN
18 DETECTED WITH MODERATE FREQUENCY OVER THE PAST 30 YEARS IN SAN
19 FRANCISCO BAY. BUT, GENERALLY, AT LOW-LEVELS UNTIL LAST
20 SUMMER. AND LAST SUMMER WE SAW THIS ALGAE BLOOM TAKE OFF AND
21 SPREAD THROUGHOUT THE BAY AND IT RESULTED IN THOUSANDS AND
22 THOUSANDS OF DEAD FISH THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA'S BAY. WE'RE
23 FORTUNATE BY THIS YEAR, BY AUGUST THE ALGAE BLOOM BEGAN TO
24 DISSIPATE, AND THE TOTAL FISH DEATHS REPORTED RELATED TO THIS
25 RED TIED WAS ABOUT 90 EVEN THOUGH WE FEEL IT WAS HIGHER BUT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT'S WHAT WAS REPORTED. WE HAD LOTS OF MEMBERS AT THE SIERRA
2 CLUB COME AND TALK AND THE WATER BOARD HAS BEEN WORKING ON
3 THIS FOR OVER A DECADE. WE HAVE BEEN COLLABORATING WITH BAY
4 KEEPERS, USGS, SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY INSTITUTE HAS BEEN
5 LEADING THE SCIENCE PROGRAM AND THE 37 WASTEWATER AGENCIES
6 HAVE CONTRIBUTED OVER \$15 MILLION TO FUNDING THE MONITORING IN
7 SAN FRANCISCO BAY, MODELING AND RESEARCH STUDIES AND WE
8 REQUIRE THEM AS PART OF THE SECOND WATER SHED PERMIT ISSUED IN
9 2019 FOR THEM TO DO A STUDY TO LOOK AT WAYS TO REDUCE NUTRIENT
10 LEVELS BY NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS AND ALSO REQUIRED THEM TO DO
11 A STUDY THAT WAS DUE BY JUNE 30TH OF THIS YEAR ON LOOKING AT
12 OPPORTUNITIES TO REDUCE NUTRIENT LEVELS IN WASTEWATER BY
13 LOOKING AT WATER RECYCLING OPPORTUNITIES. GOOD NEWS IS WHEN
14 THE WATER BOARD ISSUES THIRD NUTRIENT WATER SHED PERMIT IN THE
15 SPRING OF NEXT YEAR WE HAVE INFORMATION AS FAR AS
16 OPPORTUNITIES LOOKING AT NATURE BASED AND WATER RECYCLING AND
17 WATER TREATMENT WHICH CAN GET EXPENSIVE AND COST THE BAY AREA
18 OVER \$10 BILLION. WE'RE WORKING AND LETTING THE SCIENCE LEAD
19 REGULATIONS BUT THIS IS SOMETHING YOU MAY HEAR MORE B I'M GLAD
20 TO SEE A FOG ONE DAY HERE IN THE BAY AREA BECAUSE WE'RE NOT
21 CLEAR WHAT TRIGGERED THE ALGAE BLOOM LAST SUMMER OR THIS
22 SUMMER BUT WE THINK SOME COMBINATION OF SUNNY DAYS, LESS WIND
23 ACTION, LESS SEDIMENT AND THIS PARTICULAR SPECIES HAVING A
24 TAIL AND BEING ABLE TO SWIM ALLOWED IT TO SPREAD THROUGHOUT
25 THE BAY AREA. NOT READY TO DECLARE VICTORY FOR THIS YEAR BUT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 HOPEFULLY WE DON'T GET A BAD ALGAE BLOOM AS BAD AS LAST YEAR
2 JUST WANTED TO UPDATE YOU BECAUSE SAN FRANCISCO BAY IS SO
3 SPECIAL TO US LIVING HERE IN THE BAY AREA. THAT CONCLUDES MY
4 COMMENTS JUST TO SAY MYSELF AND OUR BOARD REALLY APPRECIATE
5 THE COLLABORATION WITH THE BAY AREA AGENCIES.

6

7 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR REPORT.
8 ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS? OKAY. I DON'T SEE
9 ANY QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS HERE IN THE BOARDROOM. ANY
10 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM? I DON'T SEE
11 ANY RAISED HANDS. THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE MISS WHITE. THANK
12 YOU FOR YOUR REPORT. THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR PARTNERSHIP. WE
13 REALLY APPRECIATE IT. AND WITH THAT, UNLESS THERE IS ANY
14 FURTHER DISCUSSION, WE WILL PROCEED TO OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM,
15 WHICH IS ITEM SIX, THE BARC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR UPDATE. AND I
16 WILL NOW RECOGNIZE OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ALLISON BROOKS.

17

18 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR ARREGUIN AND GOOD
19 MORNING GOVERNING BOARD MEMBERS. AND SHANA TOVAH, FOR THOSE OF
20 YOU CELEBRATING ROSH HASHANA, THE NEW YEAR AS WE ENJOY THESE
21 WANING DAYS OF SUMMER. I THOUGHT I WOULD WEAR MY WHITE JACKET
22 BECAUSE I'M NOT GOING TO BE ABLE TO WEAR IT SOON. RIGHT? SO,
23 HAPPY TO GIVE YOU AN UPDATE THIS MORNING ON SOME ACTIVITIES
24 THAT WE HAVE BEEN ENGAGED IN. NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL TALK ABOUT THE
25 UPDATE ON THE SHARED WORK PLAN, ANOTHER GRANT WE APPLIED FOR



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 RECENTLY, THERE IS A LOT OF RESOURCES OUT THERE THAT
2 HOPEFULLY, KNOCK ON WOOD, WE'LL BE ABLE TO BRING INTO THIS
3 REGION TO DELIVER AND IT WAS GREAT TO HEAR AMY'S UPDATE ON
4 MONEY FLOWS TO SUPPORT ADAPT EFFORTS. WE'LL GIVE YOU PROGRESS
5 ON THAT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR THOSE OF YOU NEW TO THE BOARD,
6 YOU AREN'T AS AWARE OF THE SHARED WORK PLANNER WE DEVELOPED
7 CREATED IN MAY OF 2022 AND APPROVED IN SEPTEMBER OF 2022. AND
8 WITHIN THAT, THERE ARE THREE INITIATIVES THAT BARC STAFF, JOSH
9 AND I, WORK HARD ON, WITH THE STAFF FROM THE MEMBER AGENCIES
10 AND ONE IS THE DEVELOPMENT OF THIS IDEA OF DEVELOPING A
11 REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD ADAPTATION PLAN. ANOTHER IS AROUND A
12 REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM, AND A
13 THIRD YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR ABOUT LATER TODAY IS A ZERO-
14 EMISSIONS TRANSIT BUS INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT THAT WE HAVE BEEN
15 INVOLVED IN. THERE IS A FOURTH INITIATIVE BASED ON OUR
16 ABILITY, CAPACITY, EXPLORING THIS IDEA OF LOW CARBON HIGH
17 EQUITY NEIGHBORHOODS THAT WE CAN ACHIEVE THOSE ACROSS THE
18 REGION. I'M GOING TO DELVE INTO DETAILS ON HOW WE'RE DOING ON
19 THESE INITIATIVES. NEXT SLIDE. YOU HAVE HEARD ABOUT THE IN THE
20 PAST SEVERAL GOVERNING BOARD MEETINGS THE SYSTEMS MAPPING
21 ANALYSIS THAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING, DELVING INTO THE WORK THAT
22 MEMBER AGENCIES ARE DOING, CAPTURING THAT AND MAPPING THAT AND
23 THEIR CURRENT ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES AND CLIMATE
24 ADAPTATION. SO, WITHIN THAT, WE DID -- WE WORKED WITH THE
25 CONSULTANT TEAM TO DO DESKTOP RESEARCH, INTERVIEWS IN



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 DEVELOPING THESE MAPS IN BOTH A VISUAL FORMAT AND A NARRATIVE
2 FORMAT. AND THAT REPORT WILL BE COMING OUT LATER THIS MONTH.
3 AND I JUST WANT TO THANK THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS OF THE
4 AGENCIES WHO HAVE DEDICATED THEIR STAFF TO WORK WITH US ON
5 THIS. IT'S BEEN A VERY STAFF INTENSIVE EXERCISE TO DEVELOP
6 THIS INFORMATION THAT'S REALLY, YOU KNOW, IT'S BEEN AN EIGHT
7 MONTH PROJECT THAT WE SEE WILL SERVE AS A FOUNDATION FOR
8 ADVANCING BOTH INITIATIVES 1 AND 2 IN OUR WORK PLAN. AND THEN
9 A PART OF THAT WAS REALLY TO UNDERSTAND THE STATE OF TECHNICAL
10 ASSISTANCE AVAILABLE IN THE REGION CURRENTLY. SO, THE KINDS OF
11 WORK EFFORTS THAT ARE HAPPENING ACROSS THE AGENCIES TO SUPPORT
12 JURISDICTIONS IN ACHIEVING CLIMATE ADAPTATION GOALS, BOTH FROM
13 THE USER AND THE PROVIDER PERSPECTIVE. SO, YOU HAVE SEEN SOME
14 OF THAT WORK, AND WE'LL BE RELEASING THE FULL REPORT SOON.
15 WE'RE JUST KIND OF GETTING THE FINAL DETAILS TOGETHER. NEXT
16 SLIDE, PLEASE. THE HAZARDS THAT WE LOOKED AT WITHIN THAT WERE
17 MANY. SO, LOOKING AT HEAT AND DROUGHT, WATER QUALITY,
18 WILDFIRE, AIR QUALITY, COASTAL FLOODING, AND INLAND FLOODING.
19 SO WE'LL DELVE INTO THOSE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF
20 ONE OF THE SYSTEMS MAPS THAT WILL BE IN THE REPORT. THIS IS
21 FOR SEA LEVEL RISE ACTIVITIES BY REGIONAL AGENCY THIS IS
22 ACTUALLY ONE OF THE MOST ROBUST AREAS THAT WE'RE ALL
23 RESPECTIVE AGENCY INVOLVED WITH. I DON'T EXPECT YOU TO DELVE
24 IN AND UNDERSTAND THIS RIGHT NOW, BUT THIS IS A LOT OF
25 ACTIVITIES UNDERWAY BY THE REGIONAL ENTITIES. AND THE AGENCIES



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 ARE COORDINATING ON THESE -- ON THESE ISSUES IN A VARIETY OF
2 WAYS, BUT IT'S REALLY HARD FOR PROJECT PROPONENTS, THE PEOPLE
3 THAT HAVE VULNERABLE PROPERTIES, OR IN A JURISDICTION, TO KNOW
4 WHERE AND HOW TO ENGAGE IN THIS ISSUE. WHERE DO YOU START? IF
5 YOU KNOW YOU HAVE A SITE VULNERABLE TO FLOODING AND SEA LEVEL
6 RISE, HOW DOES ONE GET STARTED TO BEGIN TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE?
7 SO, THIS IS WHAT WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO WORK TOGETHER TO
8 DEVELOP A SYSTEM THAT'S CLEAR TO EVERYONE IN THE REGION AND
9 HOW YOU BEGIN TO ENGAGE IN THIS. AND OF COURSE, BCDC HAS DONE
10 A LOT OF GREAT WORK AND PLANNING AND ALL OF THE AGENCIES ARE
11 ENGAGED. BUT IT'S REALLY WORK TOGETHER TO REALLY DEVELOP THAT
12 SYSTEM OUT FULLY, SO IT'S EASY FOR EVERYONE TO UNDERSTAND HOW
13 TO JUMP IN AND WHERE THEY NEED TO GO FOR WHAT INFORMATION, AT
14 WHAT POINT IN THE PROCESS. SO, NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OTHER
15 FINDINGS. AND THIS IS, YOU KNOW, A FAIRLY STRAIGHT FORWARD WAY
16 TO SUMMARIZE SOME OF THE FINDINGS OF THIS ANALYSIS IS THAT
17 THERE ARE HAZARDS IN OUR REGION WHERE THE REGIONAL ROLE IN
18 ADDRESSING THOSE IS FAIRLY LIMITED AT THIS POINT. SO, HAZARDS
19 LIKE HEAT AND DROUGHT RECEIVE SIGNIFICANTLY LESS ATTENTION
20 FROM THE REGIONAL AGENCIES CURRENTLY. AND MAYBE THERE IS --
21 THERE ARE REASONS FOR THAT, AND MAYBE THAT'S OKAY. BUT WE
22 REALLY WANT TO UNDERSTAND MORE FULLY, IS THERE A REGIONAL
23 ROLE? HELPING TO SUPPORT ACTIONS AT THE LOCAL LEVEL, OR OTHER
24 LEVELS AROUND THESE HAZARDS? AND WHAT WOULD THAT BE? AND WHAT
25 DOES THAT LOOK LIKE. SO REALLY DELVING INTO THAT FURTHER AND



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 REALLY UNDERSTANDING HOW THE SYSTEM IS WORKING OVERALL. NEXT
2 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, WITH OUR INITIATIVE TWO, WITH THOSE
3 REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM, SOME OF
4 THIS ANALYSIS HAS ALREADY BEEN USED AS A RESOURCE FOR THIS
5 GRANT WE JUST APPLIED FOR THROUGH OPR, THE GOVERNOR'S OFFICE
6 OF PLANNING AND RESEARCH, THROUGH THEIR REGIONAL RESILIENCE
7 GRANT PROGRAM. AND THIS SLIDE IS JUST TAKEN FROM OUR SHARED
8 WORK PLAN PRESENTATION OF MAY 2022. AND IT OFFERS THIS
9 CHALLENGE STATEMENT AND APPROACH THAT REALLY TRACKS WELL WITH
10 WHAT WE FOUND IN THE REPORT IN THE SYSTEMS ANALYSIS. AND THAT
11 WE'RE CONTINUING TO PURSUE. SO, PROGRAMS SHOULD -- AND ONE OF
12 THE FINDINGS THERE ARE PROGRAMS SHOULD REFLECT A RANGE OF
13 NEEDS EXPRESSED BY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND COMMUNITY-BASED
14 ORGANIZATIONS SO AS WE'RE DEVELOPING A TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
15 PROGRAM UNDERLYING CONCEPT OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AS WE
16 PURSUE A WORK PROGRAM WHAT IT MIGHT LOOK LIKE SUPPORT LOCAL
17 ACTIONS AND CONTRIBUTE TO OUR SHARED REGIONAL GOALS ALL OF THE
18 GOALS THAT WE'RE ADVANCING THROUGH OUR WORKING TO THE. HOW ARE
19 WE GETTING TO THE RESOURCES, TO LOCAL SUPPORT ACTIONS AND
20 WE'RE FINDING THAT ALL OF OUR AGENCIES ARE ALREADY ENGAGED AND
21 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE CERTAINLY IN DIFFERENT WAYS BUT IF YOU
22 LOOK AT IT FROM THIS ANALYSIS PERSPECTIVE IT'S HAPHAZARD AND
23 THIS PROGRAM AS WE WORK TOGETHER REALLY GEARED TOWARDS MAKING
24 A COHERENT EASY WAY TO NAVIGATE FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS SO
25 THAT'S REALLY THE THOUGHT BEHIND OUR WORK TO DEVELOP A PROGRAM



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT COULD BE EFFECTIVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE, SYSTEMS
2 ANALYSIS AND THE TA REPORT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE REPORT HAVE
3 IDENTIFIED THAT WE HAVE MET THE FIRST BULLET OF WHAT WAS
4 PRESENTED TO YOU OVER A YEAR AGO, TO UNDERSTAND THE LAY OF THE
5 LAND. SO, HOW IS IT CURRENTLY WORKING. AND IDENTIFY THE GAPS
6 IN SERVICE AND SUPPORTS, AND THEN HOW DO WE, YOU KNOW, USE
7 THIS INFORMATION AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO DEVELOP A TECHNICAL
8 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. SOME OF THE WORK THAT WE DID THROUGH THIS
9 ANALYSIS. WE DID INITIAL SURVEY WORK WITH COMMUNITY-BASED
10 ORGANIZATIONS AND FOLKS ON -- IN JURISDICTIONS AROUND WHAT
11 KINDS OF ASSISTANCE THEY'RE RECEIVING CURRENTLY. SO WE HAVE
12 DONE SOME OF THIS WORK ALREADY. AND WE'RE BUILDING THIS
13 KNOWLEDGE AS WE MOVE FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SOME OTHER
14 FINDINGS FROM THE REPORT THAT INFORM THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
15 WORK. AND WE ALL KNOW THIS INTUITIVELY. DISADVANTAGED
16 COMMUNITIES FACE DIFFICULTIES WITH THESE COMPLEX GRANT
17 PROGRAMS THAT EXIST OUT THERE IN COMPETING WITH BETTER
18 RESOURCE COMMUNITIES FOR ATTENTION AND RESOURCES IN THE TYPES
19 OF INTERVENTIONS WE KNOW NEED TO HAPPEN TO ADDRESS CLIMATE
20 HAZARDS SO WE DON'T HAVE A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD IN OUR REGION
21 AND IS THERE A REGIONAL ROLE WHAT REALLY TO BRING EVERYBODY UP
22 TO SPEED AND PROTECT HELP EVERYBODY MANAGE THE RISK THEY'RE
23 FACING IN THEIR COMMUNITIES AND SUPPORT SYSTEMS BRINGING
24 RESOURCES AND THAT ARE NEEDED BY LOCAL PARTNERS. SO THAT'S
25 SOME OF THE FINDINGS OF THE REPORT THAT WILL INFORM, THAT I



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 WILL GO INTO IN A LITTLE BIT. WE DID SUBMIT THIS PROPOSAL IT
2 DID INVOLVE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK AND INVOLVEMENT BY
3 MANY PARTNERS TO DEVELOP THIS. WE REQUESTED 3 MILLION THROUGH
4 THIS PROGRAM, AND THE IDEA BEHIND THIS IS TO DEPLOY AN
5 INTERDISCIPLINARY TEAM TO SPECIFIC DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES
6 TO SUPPORT COMMUNITY IDENTIFICATION AND ADVANCEMENT OF
7 SPECIFIC STRATEGIES TO REDUCE RISK AND BUILD COMMUNITY
8 CAPACITY BY DIRECTLY RESOURCING COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS
9 AND IN DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY TO ENGAGE STAKEHOLDERS AND BE
10 PART OF BOTH DELIVERING TA, AND RECEIVING TA, AND WE WANT TO
11 WORK FROM THESE PLACES AND LEARN HOW WE CAN DEVELOP THIS
12 SUPPORT SYSTEM TO INFORM WHAT A REGIONAL SCALE PROGRAM COULD
13 LOOK LIKE THEN FORMATION THAT AMONG OUR PARTNER ORGANIZATIONS
14 TO PROVIDE THOSE SERVICES. REALLY LEARN FROM OUR PLACE, OUR
15 PARTNERS AND COMMUNITIES, AND DEVELOP THAT PROGRAM BASED ON
16 THAT REALTIME PARTNERSHIP AND FEEDBACK SYSTEM. THERE IS A LOT
17 WE DON'T KNOW IF WE'RE GOING TO GET THIS GRANT, BUT I WILL SAY
18 THAT THE PROCESS ITSELF DEVELOPING PARTNERSHIPS WITH A RANGE
19 OF AGENCIES ACROSS BARC BUT ALSO MANY OF THE SERVICE PROVIDERS
20 ACROSS THE REGION LIKE BAYCAN, BAY AREA REGIONAL HEALTH
21 INITIATIVES EQUITIES INITIATIVE ALAMEDA COUNTY PUBLIC HEALTH
22 DEPARTMENT, GREENBELT ALLIANCE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY
23 INSTITUTE, THE BAY UC BERKELEY THESE WERE ALL PARTNERS I THINK
24 WE WILL CONTINUE TO WORK TOGETHER IT'S EXCITING TO SEE ALL
25 THIS WORK WE HAVE BEEN DOING OVER THE YEARS TO BUILD TRUST



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 PARTNERSHIPS REALLY COMING TO FRUITION IN TERMS OF BUILDING
2 TRUST AND RELATIONSHIPS WITH OTHERS TO DELIVER WHAT'S NEEDED
3 TO HELP US ADAPT AND I THINK THAT PLAYED OUT IN THE
4 APPLICATION PROCESS WE HAVE ALL BEEN ENGAGED IN WITH THE NOAA
5 GRANTS AND OTHERS THESE PARTNERSHIPS ARE HELPFUL AND WITH BARC
6 ADVANCING OUR PRIORITIES AS A REGION. THESE ARE A LIST OF
7 PARTNERS HERE. THROUGH THIS GRANT, THE KINDS OF STRATEGIES
8 THAT WE WOULD ADVANCE ARE ADVANCING NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS,
9 IMPROVING BOTH WATER QUALITY, WHICH WE JUST HEARD ABOUT FROM
10 EILEEN WHITE, AND ACHIEVING ACCELERATED PROGRESS IN SHORELINE
11 ADAPTATION THOSE ARE THE KINDS OF PROJECTS WE WANT TO MOVE
12 FORWARD, TARGETING TREE PLANTING AND INVESTMENT IN GREEN
13 INFRASTRUCTURE TO ADDRESS HEAT AND OTHER FLOODING CHALLENGES.
14 OR AIR QUALITY ISSUES. UPDATING LOCAL BUILDING CODES, LOCAL
15 HAZARD MITIGATION PLANS AND GENERAL PLAN SAFETY ELEMENT TO
16 MITIGATE VULNERABILITIES, AND DEVELOP RESILIENCE HUBS TO SERVE
17 MULTIPLE FUNCTIONS IN DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES THESE ARE
18 EXAMPLES OF THE KINDS OF STRATEGIES WE CAN WORK TOGETHER TO
19 ADVANCE IN COMMUNITIES THROUGH SUCH A PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE
20 PLEASE. THEN I'LL WRAP UP. UPDATE DELVING INTO HOW WE'RE
21 FOCUSED ON INITIATIVE TWO AND THE PROGRESS WE'RE MAKING THERE.
22 AND HOPEFUL WE'LL GET THE RESOURCES TO HELP, THROUGH THIS
23 GRANT PROGRAM, TO REALLY BUILD-OUT THAT PROGRAM. AND THAT,
24 ACTUALLY, WILL -- I THINK WE'RE STILL IN THE PROCESS OF
25 FIGURING OUT, AND THE SYSTEMS ANALYSIS REPORT IS HELPFUL TO US



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 TO THINK ABOUT WHAT ACTUALLY DOES A REGIONAL MULTI-HAZARD
2 ADAPTATION PLAN LOOK LIKE, WHAT'S INVOLVE IN IT. I THINK THERE
3 IS A LOT OF QUESTIONS THERE ABOUT IS IT A STRATEGY? IS IT A
4 PLAN? YOU KNOW, HOW DO WE CAPTURE WHAT'S NEEDED AROUND THESE
5 DIFFERENT HAZARDS AND WHAT'S THE REGIONAL ROLE IN SUPPORTING
6 COMMUNITIES AND MITIGATING THEIR RISK. SO, THERE IS A LOT OF
7 WORK THERE TO KIND OF FIGURE OUT AND WORK ON TOGETHER TO THINK
8 ABOUT WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE. AND, SO, THAT'S THE PROGRESS
9 THERE. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU HAVE. THERE WAS A LOT
10 OF INFORMATION TO THROW AT YOU THERE. AND YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR
11 ABOUT SOME PROGRESS ON INITIATIVE THREE AFTER ME TODAY. SO
12 WE'LL DELVE INTO THAT A LITTLE BIT. BUT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER
13 ANY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU, ALLISON. ANY QUESTIONS FROM
16 BOARD MEMBERS? COMMISSIONER AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** YES. THANKS FOR THIS PRESENTATION, ALLISON. I
19 NOTICED THERE WERE ESSENTIALLY TWO DEFINITIONS THAT WERE USED
20 ON ONE SLIDE, THE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES, THAT DEFINITION,
21 AND THEN, OF COURSE, EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES WHICH I
22 PERCEIVE AS MORE OF AN MTC DEFINITION. ARE YOU TRYING TO BLEND
23 BOTH?

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **ALLISON BROOKS:** FAIR QUESTION. BECAUSE I THINK WE TOGGLE
2 BETWEEN, YOU KNOW, THERE, IN THE PROPOSAL, THEY USE THE TERM
3 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. AND, SO, I THINK WE'RE ALSO TRYING
4 TO TIE IN THE FACT THAT, AS A REGION, WE HAVE BEEN THINKING
5 ABOUT THIS ISSUE AND HAVE OUR OWN TERMINOLOGY, AND USE OUR OWN
6 TERMINOLOGY AROUND THIS, SO, I THINK IT'S A LITTLE BIT OF
7 REFERENCING THAT. BUT, YEAH.

8

9 **EDDIE AHN:** WHEN THEY WERE USING THAT DEFINITION WERE THEY
10 REFERRING TO CALENVIROSCREEN? A SPECIFIC PERCENTILE WAS MADE
11 BY THE STATE?

12

13 **ALLISON BROOKS:** YES. AND I WANT TO THANK JOSH AND I WERE
14 ACTIVELY INVOLVED IN THIS. THEY HAD THEIR OWN MAPS THAT WERE
15 REFERENCED IN THEIR COMMUNITIES THAT THEY SAW AS PART -- AS
16 BEING DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES, IN REGIONS. AND I THINK, YOU
17 KNOW, WITH OUR EXPERIENCE WITH CALENVIROSCREEN, WE ALSO KNOW
18 THERE IS A LOT OF DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES IN THE BAY AREA
19 THAT EARLY ON WERE NOT ACKNOWLEDGED THROUGH THE -- THAT
20 CALENVIROSCREEN PROCESS. BUT I THINK THEY HAVE IMPROVED THAT
21 SOME.

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** IT HAS IMPROVED. I THINK MY OWN PERSONAL
24 PERSPECTIVE, AND I HAVE COMMUNICATED THIS BOTH AT BCDC AND
25 MTC, IT STILL HAS A WAYS TO GO PARTICULARLY FOR THE CITY AND



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO. IF YOU LOOK AT PARTS OF THE
2 SOUTHEAST, MISSION DISTRICT, CHINATOWN IS ENTIRELY LEFT OUT OF
3 CALENVIROSCREEN ITSELF. I THINK IT'S PROBLEMATIC. SO I WOULD
4 JUST BE CURIOUS, YOU KNOW, IT'S HARD TO SEE ON THIS MAP,
5 RIGHT, THE FONT IS SO SMALL, IF YOU CAN WEAVE THAT NEEDLE. I
6 TO LIKE MTC'S EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES DEFINITION MORE. SO
7 IF THERE IS OPPORTUNITY IF AND WHEN YOU GET THIS PROPOSAL TO
8 USE THAT DEFINITION. THAT WOULD BE BETTER.

9

10 **ALLISON BROOKS:** EARLY ON WE HAD A JOINT LETTER FROM AGENCIES
11 FROM ALL AGENCIES IN CALENVIROSCREEN AND KNOW HOW IT DIDN'T
12 REPRESENT A LOT OF THE COMMUNITIES AS WE KNOW ARE VULNERABLE
13 IN THE BAY AREA REGION. SO DEFINITELY THAT'S SOMETHING WE NEED
14 TO BE ON TOP OF.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** VICE CHAIR WASSERMAN?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, ZACK WASSERMAN:** I WOULD ECHO COMMISSIONER AHN'S
19 REMARKS BUT MAYBE MAKE THEM EVEN MORE STRONGLY AND THIS IS AN
20 ISSUE MANY OF US HAVE DEALT WITH IN OUR RESPECTIVE BODIES,
21 THIS IS MAYBE A PLACE NOT TO COME UP WITH OUR OWN DEFINITIONS,
22 PLEASE, BUT IN TASK TO GET SOME UNITY AT LEAST AMONGST THE
23 BARC MEMBERS ON A SENSIBLE DEFINITION. I WOULD LOVE TO TAKE ON
24 THE CALENVIROSCREEN, WHICH I THINK YOU ARE BOTH BEING TOO
25 CHARITABLE, STILL, BUT I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT. ALTHOUGH IT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 MAY BE A PRELUDE TO THAT. WHO KNOWS? BUT I DO THINK IT'S AN
2 IMPORTANT PIECE TO -- I DON'T KNOW HOW FAR WE CAN GET, BUT AT
3 LEAST TO PUT ON OUR AGENDA TO TRY AND GET SOME AGREEMENT
4 AMONGST THE AGENCIES. AND I DON'T -- I MEAN, IT MAY BE THAT
5 THE MTC ONE WORKS. BUT -- AND I HAVE NOT DELVED INTO IT
6 RECENTLY. BUT I THINK WE OUGHT TO DO THAT.

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AND I APPRECIATE CHAIR WASSERMAN'S COMMENT. THE
9 ADDITIONAL COMMUNITIES I WOULD SHOUT OUT IN THE BCDC FRAMEWORK
10 ARE UNDER THE ART MAPPING TOOL, ADAPTING TO RISING TODAY'S
11 TOOL, ALVISO, MARIN, NORTH BAY I MEAN THERE ARE SO MANY
12 COMPANIES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA THAT ARE NOT CAPTURED BY
13 CALENVIROSCREEN. SO I UNDERSTAND THE BUREAUCRATIC AROUND THAT
14 MAPPING TODAY I DON'T WANT TO SUCCUMB TO IT EITHER. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** JUST A QUESTION ON THE \$3 MILLION
17 REGIONAL TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM WHICH IS GREAT I MEAN
18 IT'S REFERENCED IN THE SLIDE THERE WILL BE FOCUS ON RESOURCING
19 COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS WILL THERE BE AN ELEMENT FOR
20 GOVERNMENT AGENCIES AS WELL?

21

22 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THE WAY WE RECOGNIZED IT IS OVER 3 MILLION OF
23 THE GRANT WOULD GO TO COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. WE HAVE
24 OUTLINED THE OTHER PARTNERS HOW THE KINDS OF RESOURCES THAT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THEY WOULD GET. BUT WE DON'T HAVE A LOT GOING TO GOVERNMENT
2 AGENCIES.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY.

5

6 **ALLISON BROOKS:** AND PART OF THIS IS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE HEARD A
7 LOT FROM COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS OF THEIR NEED FOR
8 CAPACITY BUILDING AND GROWING THEIR CAPACITY. AND WE HOPE THE
9 STATE ACTUALLY SEES IN THIS PROPOSAL OUR COMMITMENT TO DOING
10 THAT. AND A LOT OF PROPOSAL WE DIDN'T GO INTO THE GREAT DETAIL
11 OF HOW THIS IS GOING TO WORK IN SPECIFIC COMMUNITIES. BECAUSE
12 THE OTHER THING WE HEAR FROM OUR COMMUNITY PARTNERS REGULARLY
13 IS THEY NEED TO BE AT THE ABLE TO DESIGN THE APPROACH AND THE
14 WORK IN THE COMMUNITIES THAT WE'RE WORKING IN, AND WITH THEM,
15 TO ADDRESS THESE ADAPTATION CHALLENGES. SO, WE HOPE THAT THE
16 STATE WILL INVEST IN US REALLY WANTING TO BUILD A MODEL OF
17 WORKING EXTREMELY CLOSELY AND BUILDING THE CAPACITY OF
18 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO HELP BE AT THE ABLE TO DESIGN
19 THESE STRATEGIES. THAT COULD INFORM OUR REGIONAL, KIND OF, WAY
20 AND APPROACH OF PROVIDING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE.

21

22 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, JUST A FOLLOW UP
23 QUESTION. I SEE THE LIST OF PARTNERS ON SLIDE FOUR.

24

25 **ALLISON BROOKS:** UH-HUH.



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** SO, THEY ARE -- WE'RE GOING TO WORK
3 WITH THEM TO IDENTIFY THE CBOS THAT WILL PARTICIPATE?

4

5 **ALLISON BROOKS:** SOME OF THE CBOS HAVE ALREADY BEEN IDENTIFIED.
6 AND IT'S REALLY ABOUT THAT -- IN THE PROPOSAL, WE DIDN'T
7 INCLUDE THAT IN THIS PRESENTATION -- WE HAVE IDENTIFIED AND
8 THEY ARE REPRESENTATIVE AROUND THE BAY OF THE DISADVANTAGED
9 COMMUNITIES THAT WOULD BE PART OF THIS PROPOSAL. AND THESE
10 REPRESENT COMMUNITIES THAT ARE FACING FLOODING, SEA LEVEL
11 RISE, ALSO HEAT AND WILDFIRE. THOSE ARE THE THREE HAZARDS
12 WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS PRIMARILY ON IN THE PROPOSAL ARE THOSE
13 THREE. AND THOSE -- SO, WE WOULD HAVE A PROCESS WHERE WE KIND
14 OF -- IF WE WERE SUCCESSFUL IN GETTING THE FUNDING, WHERE WE
15 WOULD KIND OF FORMALIZE THOSE PLACES THAT WERE WORKING, AND
16 THEN GET RESOURCES OUT AND BUILD PARTNERSHIP STRUCTURES WITH
17 THE CBOS IN THOSE LOCATIONS. THE LOCATIONS THAT WE'RE LOOKING
18 AT ARE PLACES WHERE MANY OF OUR AGENCIES AND OTHER PARTNERS
19 ARE ALREADY IN PLACE. SO, THEY'RE NOT STARTING FROM SCRATCH.
20 SO WE WOULD BE ABLE TO KIND OF JUMP IN AND DEVELOP KIND OF,
21 FAIRLY QUICKLY, BECAUSE THIS IS A 30-MONTH GRANT WE WOULD BE
22 ABLE TO JUMP IN AND BUILD-OUT THESE APPROACHES IN EACH
23 LOCATION.

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GREAT. WHEN DO WE FIND OUT ABOUT THE
2 GRANT?

3

4 **ALLISON BROOKS:** JANUARY.

5

6 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY.

7

8 **ALLISON BROOKS:** YEAH. YEAH.

9

10 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** IS THERE ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO HELP? WE
11 ALL REPRESENT DIFFERENT ELECTED POSITIONS OR POINTED
12 POSITIONS. IS THERE ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO HELP ADVOCATE FOR
13 THAT?

14

15 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THAT'S A GOOD QUESTION. WE DID HAVE A LOT OF
16 SUPPORT LETTERS FROM THE PARTNERS. SO, WE DID GET THAT IN. IT
17 IS -- YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A QUESTION, ACTUALLY, INTO OPR NOW. IS
18 IT TOO LATE TO SUBMIT KIND OF ADDITIONAL KIND OF SUPPORT
19 LETTERS? SO WE ARE ASKING THEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. KEEP US POSTED.

22

23 **ALLISON BROOKS:** IT'S TOO LATE. JOSH IS TELLING US IT'S TOO
24 LATE. [LAUGHTER] BUT WHO KNOWS, IF YOU RUN INTO SOMEBODY AT
25 THE MARKET



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'LL PUT IN A GOOD WORD.

3

4 **ALLISON BROOKS:** [LAUGHTER] YEAH.

5

6 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THIS IS VERY EXCITING. I'M EXCITED FOR
7 ALL THE PROGRESS WE'RE MAKING TO ADVANCE THE SHARED WORK PLAN,
8 AND I'LL ASK IF ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM
9 BOARD MEMBERS? ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. IF NOT, THANK
10 YOU, ALLISON.

11

12 **ALLISON BROOKS:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. WITH THAT, WE'LL PROCEED -- I'LL
15 ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

16

17 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL
20 PROCEED TO ITEM SEVEN. THIS IS A PRESENTATION DISCUSSION OF
21 AGENCY PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS ON ZERO-EMISSIONS TRANSIT CARBON
22 TRANSPORTATION AND CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE. AND, ALLISON,
23 WOULD YOU LIKE TO INTRODUCE THIS ITEM? OR I CAN HAND IT OVER
24 TO THE PRESENTERS.

25



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **ALLISON BROOKS:** WELL, FIRST UP IS CRAIG BOSMAN FROM MTC WHO
2 HAS REALLY BEEN LEADING THE EFFORT ON THE MTC'S MEGA PROJECT,
3 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS, PROJECT DELIVERY AND INFRASTRUCTURE AND
4 THIS IS A DIRECTIVE THROUGH CARB TO 35 THIS. SO, THANKS,
5 CRAIG, FOR BEING HERE. BECAUSE THIS IS A COMPLICATED PROJECT.
6 SO THANKS FOR GIVING US AN UPDATE.

7

8 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** THAT IT IS GOOD MORNING BOARD MEMBERS CRAIG
9 BOSMAN MTC FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM SECTION. THIS IS AN UPDATE
10 ON OUR ZERO EMISSION TRANSIT TRANSITION STRATEGY. WHICH IS IN
11 PROGRESS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A REMINDER, THE CALIFORNIA AIR
12 RESOURCES BOARD HAS SOMETHING CALLED THE INNOVATIVE CLEAN
13 TRANSIT RULE OR ICT WHICH REQUIRES TRANSIT AGENCIES TO
14 TRANSITION TO 100% ZERO EMISSION BUS FLEET BY 2040. AND THAT
15 IS IMPLEMENTED THROUGH PURCHASING REQUIREMENTS WHICH ARE NOW
16 UNDERWAY. SO, LARGE OPERATORS, CURRENTLY, 25% OF THE BUSES
17 THAT THEY BUY HAVE TO BE ZERO-EMISSIONS. AND THAT WILL RAMP UP
18 TO 100% BY 2029. FOR SMALL OPERATORS, THE REQUIREMENTS KICK IN
19 2026, AND ALSO RAMP UP TO 100% AT 2029. OPERATORS HAVE TO
20 SUBMIT ROLL-OUT PLANS FOR HOW THEY'RE GOING TO ACCOMPLISH THIS
21 TO CARB. THE SMALL OPERATORS SUBMITTED THOSE A COUPLE OF YEARS
22 AGO -- SORRY -- LARGE OPERATORS SUBMITTED A COUPLE OF YEARS
23 AGO, SMALL OPERATORS BY THIS SUMMER. AND THE MAJORITY OF
24 OPERATORS IN THE REGION HAVE INITIAL 0 EMISSION BUS
25 DEPLOYMENTS OUT IN SERVICE. THIS STRATEGY IS ALSO LOOKING AT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 FERRIES. CARB ALSO HAS A COMMERCIAL HARBOR CRAFT REGULATION
2 WHICH WAS RECENTLY UPDATED TO LOWER EMISSION FERRY FLEETS. I'M
3 NOT GOING TO TOUCH ON THAT TOO MUCH IN THIS PRESENTATION BUT
4 THE GOLDEN GATE FERRY FLEET PLAN TO COMPLY WITH THIS BY
5 REPLACING THEIR FERRY FLEET OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS WITH
6 LOWER EMISSION FERRIES THAT MEETS THE REQUIREMENT AND WETA
7 PLAN TO DO SO THROUGH THE COMBINATION OF BATTERY ELECTRIC
8 FERRIES AND FERRIES THAT TOTAL WILL MEET THE REQUIREMENT. NEXT
9 SLIDE. THE STRATEGY SURRENDER WAY IN PARTNERSHIP WITH MTC,
10 BARC, AND TRANSIT OPERATORS TO DEVELOP A STRATEGY FOR VEHICLES
11 AND INFRASTRUCTURE THAT FOCUSES ON IDENTIFYING THE CHALLENGES
12 AND THE OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE AT THE REGIONAL AND LOCAL
13 LEVELS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SOME OF THE PRINCIPLES THAT ARE
14 GUIDING THIS STRATEGY ARE TOO TRANSITION IN PARTNERSHIP NOT
15 ONLY WITH THOSE THAT I JUST MENTIONED WITH THE COUNTIES, THE
16 STATE, AND THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TO ACCELERATE THE ELEMENTS,
17 TO FOCUS OUR FACILITY INVESTMENTS ON INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S
18 READY FOR ZERO-EMISSIONS, TO MAKE SURE THAT WE KEEP IN MIND
19 SUPPORTING A DYNAMIC BUS SYSTEM THAT SERVES LOCAL ROUTES, KEY
20 TRUNK CORRIDORS AND THE EXPRESS LANE NETWORK AND TO EVALUATE
21 AND MANAGE RISK THROUGH THE THIS WHOLE TRANSITION. NEXT SLIDE,
22 PLEASE. RIGHT NOW THERE ARE OVER 450 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES
23 DEPLOYED THROUGHOUT THE REGION ACROSS 12 AGENCIES THAT'S 10%
24 OF THE REGION'S FLEET. A LARGE PORTION OF THAT ARE ELECTRIC
25 TROLLEYS THAT MUNI RUNS, HAS BEEN RUNNING FOR A LONG TIME. BUT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 WE ALSO HAVE 130 BATTERY ELECTRIC BUSES AND 40 HYDROGEN
2 FUELCELL ELECTRIC BUSES. THESE BUSES MOSTLY CHARGE UP OR FUEL
3 UP AT THE BUS DEPOT, THE YARD THEY'RE STORED AT, AND THERE IS
4 A LIMITED NUMBER OF ON ROUTE CHARGING FOR EXAMPLE, CAN'T
5 CONNECTION AT WALNUT CREEK BART STATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
6 THE FIRST -- I'M GOING TO GET INTO SOME OF THE EARLY KEY
7 FINDINGS FROM OUR INITIAL DELIVERABLE WHICH IS THE
8 SUMMARIZATION OF THE CURRENT AGENCY PLANS, WE HAVE BEEN
9 REVIEWING THOSE ROLL OUT PLANS, TALKING TO ALL THE OPERATORS.
10 THESE ROLL OUT PLANS ARE CONSTANTLY INFLUX AS THE MARKET
11 CHANGES, AND AS OPERATORS REALLY FINE TUNE THEIR
12 IMPLEMENTATION PLANS. WE SEE THAT, IN THE FUTURE, WE'LL HAVE
13 SIGNIFICANT NUMBERS OF BOTH BATTERY ELECTRIC AND FUELCELL
14 BUSES. A MAJORITY, IN THE REGION, ARE BATTERY ELECTRIC, BUT A
15 SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF FUELCELL. SOME AGENCIES ARE COMMITTED TO
16 ONE OR BOTH TECHNOLOGIES AND OTHERS ARE STILL ASSESSING WHAT
17 THEIR FLEET IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE IN TEN OR SO YEARS. THERE IS
18 A PRIMARY FOCUS ON CONTINUING THE DEPOT BASED CHARGING AND
19 FUELING WITH SOME STRONG INTEREST IN STRATEGIC ON ROUTE
20 CHARGING, OPPORTUNITY CHARGING ALONG THE ROUTE, AND NECESSARY
21 POP-UPS TO GET BACK TO THE DEPOT. THE OVERALL COST IS BEING
22 REFINED. THERE IS A LOT OF MOVING PARTS. BUT IT'S GOING TO BE
23 IN THE HIGH SINGLE DIGIT BILLIONS OF DOLLARS. AS ALLISON
24 MENTIONED IT'S A MEGA PROJECT, VERY EXPENSIVE TO MAKE THIS
25 TRANSITION. A COUPLE OF KEY FACTORS ARE VEHICLES THEMSELVES,



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 WE HAVE SEEN SIGNIFICANT COST INFLATION IN THE VEHICLE MARKET.
2 DELTA BETWEEN DIESEL OR DIESEL HYBRID BUSES AND ZERO-EMISSIONS
3 BUSES IS NOT SHRINKING. IN FACT IT'S MAYBE GETTING WORSE.
4 BATTERY ELECTRIC BUSES ARE EASILY OVER \$1 MILLION NOW AND
5 FUELCELL BUSES APPROACHING A MILLION AND A HALF DOLLARS. THERE
6 ARE COMPLEX FACILITY PROJECTS AS THE FLEET GETS CLOSER TO
7 100%. WHEN YOU ARE ADDING ONE OR TWO BUSES AS A PILOT, AND YOU
8 CAN ADD IN ONE OR TWO CHARGERS, IT'S NOT SO SIGNIFICANT. BUT
9 AS YOU LOOK AT FULLY REBUILDING YOUR FACILITIES, AND ADDING
10 ALL THE POWER, ALL THE CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE, PERHAPS ADDING
11 HYDROGEN FUELING LOCATIONS, THE COST RISES AND GETS VERY
12 COMPLEX. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE LOOKING AT RISKS IN THIS
13 STUDY AND THERE IS A LOT. I THINK THE TWO TO HIGHLIGHT RIGHT
14 NOW ARE SCHEDULE AND BUDGET. SO, ON THE SCHEDULE, YOU KNOW,
15 THERE IS A RISK THAT THE TIMELINE OF THE FACILITY
16 INFRASTRUCTURE GETS DELAYED. AND THAT IMPACTS AN OPERATOR'S
17 ABILITY TO PURCHASE THE BUSES IF THEY DON'T HAVE THE PROPER
18 PLACE TO STORE THEM AND RECHARGE OR FUEL THEM. ONE ELEMENT OF
19 THIS IS THE UTILITY CAPACITY. IF THERE IS, YOU KNOW,
20 INSUFFICIENT GRID POWER AVAILABLE ON THE REQUIRED TIME FRAME,
21 YOU KNOW, THE FACILITY, EVEN IF THEY'RE ABLE TO COMPLETE THE
22 CIVIL ELEMENTS, THE CHARGING ELEMENTS, GETTING THAT POWER IN
23 COULD BE A RISK TO THE SCHEDULE. AND THEN WE KNOW THAT THERE
24 IS A BUDGETARY RISK. RIGHT NOW, WE PROJECT A GAP IN THE
25 BILLIONS OF DOLLARS. AGAIN, THIS WILL BE FURTHER FINE TUNED AS



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THE STUDY GOES ON. BUT WE KNOW THEY'RE ALREADY INEFFICIENT AND
2 AS THE CAPITAL AND OPERATING COSTS GROW THAT GAP COULD GET
3 WIDER AS FUNDING SOURCES MAY NOT FOLLOW. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
4 ANOTHER THING THAT THE STUDY IS LOOKING AT IS COLLABORATION
5 OPPORTUNITIES. THERE IS A LOT OF THEM. AND WE'RE TRYING TO
6 PUSH THEM FORWARD. A FEW THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED ARE WORKFORCE
7 TRAINING, KNOWLEDGE SHARING, YOU KNOW, BEST PRACTICES OF
8 DEPLOYING ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES. COLLABORATION ON VEHICLE
9 PURCHASES, THIS IS SOMETHING OPERATORS HAVE BEEN ABLE DO FOR A
10 LONG TIME BUT AS THEY LEARN ABOUT NEW TECHNOLOGY SUPERVISOR
11 TALK TO EACH OTHER, WE ANTICIPATE SOME OPPORTUNITIES FOR JOINT
12 PROCUREMENTS AND, YOU KNOW, FINDINGS EFFICIENCIES THERE. ALSO
13 COLLABORATION ON HYDROGEN FUEL PROCUREMENT AS HYDROGEN BUSES
14 ROLL OUT MORE WIDELY THERE IS GOING TO BE A NEED TO FIND
15 FUELING LOCATIONS PERHAPS ON-SITE IN CERTAIN LOCATIONS AND
16 COLLABORATION ON THE PROCUREMENT OF THOSE. AND DEFINITELY
17 INTER-AGENCY COORDINATION ON INTERAGENCY COORDINATION ON
18 SHARED ROUTE CHARGES SO THERE COULD BE TRANSIT HUBS OTHER
19 PLACES THAT MULTIPLE BUS SERVICE COME TOGETHER THERE IS A LOT
20 OF WORK TO BE DONE TO FIGURE OUT HOW THE SCHEDULE IS GOING TO
21 WORK, WHEN ONE OPERATOR OR ANOTHER GOES OUT ALL OF THOSE
22 FACTOR TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT. NEXT SLIDE. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT
23 FUNDING. SO MTC TYPICALLY FUNDS THE MAJORITY OF REPLACEMENT
24 VEHICLE COSTS THROUGH FTA FORMULA FUNDS, TRANSIT RAPID COST
25 ESCALATION EARLIER IS GOING TO START HAVING SOME STRAIN ON



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT VEHICLES AS PART OF THE PERCENTAGE OF OVERALL TRANSITION
2 ARE HIGHEST COST. THERE IS ALSO SIGNIFICANT NEEDS FOR
3 FACILITIES AND CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE. LOOKING OUTSIDE OUR
4 TYPICAL FORMULA FUNDING. THE RECENT PERFORMANCE IN THE REGION
5 AND FTA DISCRETIONARY BUS FUNDING WAS STRONG WE GOT 7% OF THE
6 NATION-WIDE TOTAL BUT THAT'S 110 MILLION AND IF WE HAVE A
7 FUNDING GAP IN THE BILLIONS WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO CONTINUE
8 BRINGING HOME THOSE TYPES MUCH AWARDS ALSO LEVERAGE MORE. SO,
9 WE NEED TO KEEP LEVERAGING EXISTING DISCRETIONARY PROGRAMS AT
10 THE STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL. WE NEED ACCESS TO SOURCES THAT
11 HAVE NOT TYPICALLY FUNDED AS MUCH TRANSIT AND ENERGY AND
12 EMISSIONS FOCUSED FUNDING SOURCE WE NEED TO REALIZE THE
13 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES TO MEET THE GAP AND TO THAT SPECIFIC
14 GROUP BE OPPORTUNITY ON FURTHER AIR DISTRICT AND MTC FUNDING
15 THOSE WAYS WE CAN COLLABORATE TO FUND VARIOUS ELEMENTS OF THIS
16 TRANSITION. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE GET FURTHER INTO THE STUDY WE'LL
17 REFINE THE COST ESTIMATE AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE FUNDING
18 STRATEGY FURTHER ANALYZING TECHNICAL APPROACHES AND
19 COMPATIBLE, LOOKING AT FEASIBILITY OF SHARED INFRASTRUCTURE
20 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. WE'LL BE ANALYZING CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT
21 INTEROPERABILITY AND EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS. WE'LL BE
22 DEVELOPING MAPS OF EXISTING AND PLANNED FALLACIES, HUBS, AND
23 CHARGING AND FUELING LOCATIONS, AND FURTHER ANALYZING THE
24 REGIONAL TUNES AND CHALLENGES. SO, I THINK I'M HAPPY TO TAKE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 ANY QUESTIONS NOW, OR PASS IT ON TO MY COLLEAGUES, WHO WILL BE
2 GETTING FURTHER INTO ZERO-EMISSIONS STUFF.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WHY DON'T WE TAKE QUESTIONS ON THIS
5 PRESENTATION FIRST, AND I'LL GO TO BOARD MEMBER EKLUND.

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM NOT SURE ABOUT WHAT THE
8 RIDERSHIP IS ON BUSES, BUT GIVEN WHAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING,
9 HAVE YOU THOUGHT OF -- OR IS THERE AN EFFORT TO TRY TO CHANGE
10 VANS? SO, THAT INSTEAD OF JUST REGULAR VANS, WE COULD MAYBE
11 LOOK AT MORE CLEANER VANS? BECAUSE I THINK THAT THERE'S -- AT
12 LEAST WHAT I HAVE HEARD, IS THAT THERE IS LESS PEOPLE TAKING
13 TRANSIT, TOO. AND GIVEN, YOU KNOW, NOT COMING INTO SAN
14 FRANCISCO AS MUCH AS I USED TO IN THE PAST -- SAN FRANCISCO
15 DEFINITELY HAS CHANGED -- SO -- AND IT SEEMS LIKE, WE COULD
16 MAXIMIZE THE USE OF MORE VANPOOLS OR VANS FOR TRANSIT, AND
17 MAYBE THAT MIGHT BE MORE COST EFFECTIVE. AS SOMEBODY WHO USED
18 TO TAKE THE BUS, ACTUALLY, TO SAN FRANCISCO, MY ENTIRE WORKING
19 CAREER, AND, ALSO, THE FERRY, BUT IT REALLY DEFINITELY HAS
20 CHANGED DRAMATICALLY. SO, KIND OF CURIOUS ABOUT VANS INSTEAD
21 OF BUSES.

22

23 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** CERTAINLY. I THINK THAT OPERATORS ARE ASSESSING
24 THEIR FLEET NEEDS AS PART OF THIS TRANSITION. AND WHAT IS THE
25 TOTAL NUMBER OF VEHICLES THEY REQUIRE, WHAT TYPES OF VEHICLES



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THEY REQUIRE. SPECIFIC TO THE ZERO-EMISSIONS CHALLENGE, YOU
2 KNOW, THIS EFFORT IS MOSTLY FOCUSED ON TRANSIT BUSES. THOSE
3 ARE THE ONES THAT WERE KIND OF READY TO GO FIRST. BUT, AS THE
4 MARKET DEVELOPS AND ZERO-EMISSIONS OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE FOR
5 PARATRANSIT FOR VANS, AND, ALSO, AS OTHER REGULATIONS COME
6 INTO PLAY ON SMALLER VEHICLES, TEA WILL BRING SOME OF THEIR
7 OWN CHALLENGES WITH THE ELECTRIFICATION. SO, I THINK IT'S --
8 IT'S KIND OF BOTH SIDES. IT'S LOOKING AT THE RIGHT SIZE AND
9 TYPE OF FLEET, AND, ALSO, ASSESSING WHAT ARE THE IMPLICATIONS
10 OF A ZERO EMISSION TRANSITION FOR THOSE, AS WELL.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS?
15 YES, VICE CHAIR EISEN?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** DISPLAYING MY IGNORANCE. YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT EVS
18 VERSUS HYDROGEN BUSES AND THE RISK OF INSUFFICIENT GRID POWER.
19 BUT THAT'S FOR EV BUSES, RIGHT? NOT HYDROGEN? OR AM I WRONG
20 ABOUT THAT?

21

22 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** THAT'S RIGHT. A LOT OF OPERATORS HAVE
23 CONSIDERATION WHEN THEY'RE CHOOSING BETWEEN THOSE TWO
24 TECHNOLOGIES, BROAD CONCERNS OVER AVAILABILITY OF POWER TO



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THEIR YARDS AND CERTAINLY A FACTOR IN SOME OPERATORS LOOKING
2 AT HYDROGEN FUELCELL AS OPPOSED TO BATTERY ELECTRIC.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** FEW QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS, THANK YOU
7 FOR THE PRESENTATION, AND LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN ADDRESS THE
8 TRANSITION FROM A REGIONAL SCALE. AND I SUPPORT PRINCIPLES. IT
9 SEEMS ONE OF THE BIGGEST CHARGES IS THE COST OF PURCHASING THE
10 VEHICLES, AND THE CHALLENGES ARE GETTING THE INFRASTRUCTURE IN
11 PLACE. AND I KNOW THAT THERE'S -- WE'RE HEAR VERY SHORTLY
12 ABOUT THE EFFORT MTC IS ENGAGED IN TO HELP SUPPORT, AND THE
13 AIR DISTRICT TO SUPPORT THE EXPANSION OF THE CHARGING
14 INFRASTRUCTURE, BUT WITH RESPECT TO THE GRID CAPACITY THAT'S A
15 BIGGER ISSUE THAT'S GOING TO TAKE SOME TIME TO RESOLVE AND I
16 KNOW WE HAVE CHALLENGES WITH PG&E IN TERMS OF THEIR ACTIVATING
17 SOME OF THESE CONNECTIONS AS WELL. SO HAS THERE BEEN
18 ASSESSMENT, MAYBE THAT'S PART OF THIS OVERALL INITIATIVE, LIKE
19 WHAT IS THE OVERALL COST NEED TO REACH THIS 2040 GOAL? I DID
20 SEE REFERENCE TO, YOU KNOW, TO FUNDING LEVELS ARE INSUFFICIENT
21 AT CURRENT PROJECTIONS GAP IN THE BILLIONS OF DOLLARS.

22 BALLPARK HOW MUCH DO WE NEED AS A REGION?

23

24 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** IF YOU WANT TO THROW OUT A NUMBER IT'S SOMETHING
25 LIKE 8 BILLION FOR THE TRANSITION AND RELIABLE FUND SOURCES



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT ARE -- I DON'T KNOW, FOUR OR \$5 BILLION FUNDING GAP.
2 WE'RE HOPING TO GET, YOU KNOW, TO BETTER NUMBERS. AND I THINK,
3 YOU KNOW, TO YOUR EARLIER POINTS, THE AVAILABILITY OF FUNDING
4 FOR FACILITIES WILL BE A DRIVER IN SOME OPERATOR'S ABILITY TO
5 GET THOSE BIGGER ZERO EMISSION FLEETS IN.

6

7 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YEAH. A COUPLE OF OTHER POINTS.
8 HYDROGEN PROCUREMENT. SO, HAVE YOU BEEN IN TOUCH WITH SOME OF
9 THE REFINERIES IN THE BAY AREA? I KNOW THERE ARE A COUPLE OF
10 INITIATIVES, LIKE AT CHEVRON RICHMOND, AND PHILLIPS, RODEO,
11 AND I THINK ONE IN MARTINEZ, WHERE THEY'RE DOING SOME GREEN
12 FUEL RESEARCH AND INVESTMENT. I KNOW THEY'RE TRYING TO DO A
13 PILOT PROGRAM IN RICHMOND ON GREEN HYDROGEN. I MEAN, THE
14 REALITY IS THAT WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO TRANSITION THESE
15 FACILITIES AWAY FROM, YOU KNOW, EXTRACTING AND PROCESSING,
16 ALSO, FUELS, AND THERE SEEMS -- THEY'RE LOOKING AT INVESTING
17 IN, SORT OF, ADVANCING GREEN FUEL RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT. SO
18 JUST RAISING THAT AS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR POTENTIAL PARTNERSHIP.
19 AND WITH RESPECT TO, LOOKING AT ALL THE DIFFERENT FUNDING
20 SOURCES HOW TO LEVERAGE THE IMPACT AND OUR ABILITY TO CLOSE
21 THAT GAP AND INFORMING OUR BUDGET REQUESTS WHETHER THEY'RE AT
22 THE FEDERAL OR STATE LEVEL BECAUSE IF WE'RE GOING TO MEET THIS
23 2040 GOAL WE NEED TO BE CLEAR ABOUT WHAT'S NEEDED TO MEET THAT
24 GOAL AND I THINK LOOKING AT A SHARED INFRASTRUCTURE



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 INTEROPERABILITY, I THINK THAT'S REALLY GOOD TO FOCUS ON AS
2 WELL.

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. IF I COULD
5 CHIME HERE, I THINK THAT TIES INTO YOUR FIRST AND THIRD
6 COMMENT IN PARTICULAR OBVIOUSLY THE EFFECTS OF THE CLIMATE
7 CHANGE AND WHAT'S GOING ON -- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DR. PHILIPPE
8 FINE TO SEE IF THERE ARE WAYS WE CAN CONTINUE TO DOUBLE DOWN
9 ON AGENCY COLLABORATION FOR ONE I THINK WE CAN FIND MORE
10 EFFICIENT WAYS TO MOVE MONEY. I ALSO THINK IN TERMS OF THE
11 TIME IT'S GOING TO TAKE US TO FIND THE KINDS OF DOLLARS YOU'RE
12 TALKING ABOUT IN THIS ITEM ARE GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE. BUT I
13 THINK WE CAN DO CREATIVE THINGS WITH MONEY THAT'S AVAILABLE BY
14 TRYING TO MARRY DIFFERENT SOURCES THAT THE AIR DISTRICT HAS
15 AND MTC HAS. I'M SURE THE AIR DISTRICT WOULD BE WILLING TO
16 WORK WITH US AGGRESSIVELY IN THIS SPACE BUT THAT'S THE ASPECT
17 FROM US AND WE CAN COME BACK AND HOPEFULLY REPORT MEANINGFUL
18 PROGRESS ON STUFF WE'RE WORKING ON NOW.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. THAT'S THE PURPOSE OF THIS
21 AGENCY IS TO BE A FORUM TO BRING THE AGENCIES TOGETHER IN
22 COLLABORATION. I SEE WHAT WE'RE DOING WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION
23 ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVES, THE AIR DISTRICT HAS THEIR
24 SOLICITATION. IT'S ALL KIND OF -- WE'RE ALL DOING DIFFERENT
25 THINGS, AND I THINK TO THE EXTENT WE CAN KIND OF LEVERAGE AND



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 MAXIMIZE THE SCALE OF IMPACT, I THINK THAT'S REALLY EXCELLENT.
2 THANK YOU. AND OTHERS QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? ANY MEMBERS ON
3 ZOOM? I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO THE
4 NEXT PRESENTATION.

5

6 **JAMES CHOE:** HI EVERYONE. JAMES CHOE, CLIMATE PROGRAM MANAGER
7 WITH MTC ABAG. IN THIS PORTION OF THE ITEM I'M GOING TO BE
8 TALKING ABOUT OUR TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION OR TE
9 INITIATIVES. A LITTLE BIT BACKGROUND, FIRST OF ALL FOR
10 CONTEXT, THIS CAME OUT TO HELP MEET OUR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
11 GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS. ONE OF THE EXPANSIONS OF
12 STRATEGIES IN THAT VERSION OF THE PLAN WAS ON CLEAN VEHICLE
13 STRATEGIES. AND THIS HAS BEEN REFLECTED IN, SORT OF, THE
14 GROWTH IN THE MARKET AND EXCITEMENT IN NEW TECHNOLOGIES
15 SURROUNDING THIS SECTOR. SUPPORTING IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS
16 STRATEGY FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. OUR COMMISSION APPROVED
17 BACK IN OCTOBER OF LAST YEAR ALLOCATING 65 MILLION TO SUPPORT
18 THE TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVES. AND ALSO GIVEN
19 THE SIGNIFICANT FOCUS ON ELECTRIFICATION, AND GUIDANCE FROM
20 OUR COMMISSIONERS TO REALLY, AGAIN, TO THIS POINT THAT WAS
21 JUST MADE, TO COLLABORATE AND COORDINATE REGIONALLY, WITH THE
22 AIR DISTRICT, WITH LOCAL PARTNERS, WITH COMMUNITY CHOICE
23 AGGREGATORS, WHO ARE ALREADY DOING THIS WORK ON THE GROUND,
24 AND OUR PARTNERS, LOCAL GOVERNMENT PARTNERS, WE DID A
25 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF ENGAGEMENTS THROUGH THE OVER THE PAST



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 YEAR TO UNDERSTAND WHAT ARE THE NEEDS OF THE REGION. AND,
2 ALSO, HEARING ABOUT THE MANY BARRIERS THAT THEY FACE IN
3 TRANSITIONING TO EVS, ELECTRIC MOBILITY OPTIONS, AND THE
4 CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE NECESSARY TO SUPPORT THAT. SO, NEXT
5 SLIDE, PLEASE. BASED ON THIS ENGAGEMENT WE DEVELOPED A
6 PROPOSED SET OF TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVE THAT
7 IS GEARED TO FILL THE GAPS THAT WE HEARD ABOUT FROM OUR LOCAL
8 PARTNERS, AND, ALSO, TRY TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE BARRIERS THAT
9 THEY ALSO EXPRESSED. AND IN APRIL OF THIS YEAR, OUR
10 COMMISSIONERS APPROVED THIS PROPOSED SET, TE INITIATIVES
11 CONSISTING OF FOUR MAIN AREAS, CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE,
12 ELECTRIC BIKESHARE, LOCAL PUBLIC FLEET ELECTRIFICATION, AND
13 THEN REGIONAL AND LOCAL PLANNING PROGRAM STRATEGY. NEXT SLIDE.
14 WE'RE EXCITED TO ANNOUNCE THE RECENT ROLL OUT LAST WEEK OF OUR
15 FIRST CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAM. THIS IS THE GRANT
16 PROGRAM THAT'S THE TRANSIT STATION PUBLIC CHARGING PROGRAM
17 WHICH IS CURRENTLY OPEN, ACCEPTING APPLICATIONS. AND THIS
18 FUNDING IS TO SUPPORT THE DEPLOYMENT OF PUBLICLY ACCESSIBLE
19 CHARGING STATIONS FOR ELECTRIC VEHICLES, OR ELECTRIC MOBILITY
20 DEVICES SUCH AS ELECTRIC BIKES, SCOOTERS, ASSISTIVE MOBILITY
21 DEVICES AT BAY AREA TRANSIT STATIONS AND THIS PROGRAM IS TO
22 IMPROVE ACCESS TO CHARGING OPPORTUNITIES NOT ONLY FOR TRANSIT
23 CUSTOMERS BUT ALSO FOR SURROUNDING COMMUNITY MEMBERS AROUND
24 THOSE STATIONS. AND PROVIDING CHARGING AT TRANSIT STATIONS CAN
25 HELP DRAW POTENTIAL CUSTOMERS WITH RELIABLE CHARGING



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 LOCATIONS, AND SUPPORT THE USE OF CLEAN MOBILITY OPTIONS FOR
2 THOSE FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS
3 I SAID, THIS PROGRAM IS CURRENTLY OPEN. WE HAVE UP TO 10
4 MILLION AVAILABLE IN FEDERAL CARBON REDUCTION PROGRAM FUNDING.
5 AND PROJECTS ARE A MINIMUM OF \$250,000, UP TO A MAXIMUM OF 3
6 MILLION. ALTHOUGH DEPENDING ON THE NEEDS EXPRESSED BY PROJECT
7 SPONSORS AND THE OVERALL DEMAND IN THE PROGRAM, STAFF MAY MAKE
8 EXCEPTIONS TO THAT MAXIMUM AMOUNT. AND TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
9 ELIGIBLE APPLICANTS, ALSO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS, IN PARTNERSHIP
10 WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THOSE CASES WHERE THE TRANSIT STATION
11 FACILITIES ARE OWNED BY LOCAL GOVERNMENT. AND TO APPLY,
12 APPLICANTS CAN GO TO OUR TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION WEB
13 SITE WHERE THEY CAN DOWNLOAD THE PROGRAM GUIDE AND THE
14 APPLICATION, AND THEN SUBMIT THAT APPLICATION. THE DEADLINE IS
15 OCTOBER 18TH, AND WE ARE AIMING TO RECOMMEND AWARDS EARLY
16 2024. AND WE ANTICIPATE RELEASING THE REMAINING SET OF OUR
17 INITIATIVES OVER THE NEXT YEAR. AND SO WE'RE GOING TO BE
18 ANNOUNCING THOSE AS THEY GET RELEASED. AND WITH THAT, I'M
19 HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE ANY
22 QUESTIONS FROM BOARD MEMBERS ON THE PRESENTATION? IF SO,
23 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. OKAY. I HAVE NO QUESTIONS. ANY BOARD
24 MEMBERS ON ZOOM? I DON'T SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. THANK YOU VERY
25 MUCH.



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **JAMES CHOE:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WE'LL GO TO OUR LAST PRESENTATION AS
5 PART OF THIS ITEM, WHICH I BELIEVE IS FROM THE AIR DISTRICT.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** LINDA.

8

9 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** AND LINDA, I BELIEVE, WILL BE GIVING
10 THE PRESENTATION.

11

12 **LINDA HUI:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR ARREGUIN AND GOVERNING BOARD
13 MEMBERS. MY NAME IS LINDA HUI, I'M SUPERVISOR AT THE BAY AREA
14 AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. TODAY I'M PRESENTING THE AIR
15 DISTRICT COMPETITIVE SOLICITATION OF OUR ELECTRIC CHARGING
16 INFRASTRUCTURE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE MAIN GOAL OF THIS
17 SOLICITATION IS TO FUND THE INSTALLATION OR EXPANSION OF
18 PERMANENT ELECTRIC CHANGING INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WAS SPURRED,
19 THE DEPLOYMENT OF ZERO EMISSION VEHICLES AND EQUIPMENT IN THE
20 BAY AREA. THE FOCUS OF THIS SOLICITATION IS ON HEAVY-DUTY
21 VEHICLE EQUIPMENT SECTOR. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ELIGIBLE
22 PROJECTS ARE ELECTRIC CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE THAT SUPPORTS
23 ALL CATEGORIES OF HEAVY-DUTY ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND EQUIPMENT
24 FOR EXAMPLE, ON ROAD VEHICLES WITH GROSS VEHICLE WEIGHT RATING
25 ABOVE 14,001 POUND. SUCH AS TRANSIT BUSES, SCHOOL BUSES AND



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 TRUCKS. ANOTHER EXAMPLE IS MOBILE OFF-ROAD EQUIPMENT THAT IS
2 25 HORSEPOWER OR GREATER SUCH AS AGRICULTURAL EQUIPMENT,
3 CONSTRUCTION EQUIPMENT, TRANSPORTATION REFRIGERATION UNITS,
4 FORKLIFTS, CARGO HANDLING EQUIPMENT AND GROUND SUPPORT
5 EQUIPMENT. OTHER EXAMPLES ARE LOCOMOTIVES AND MARINE VESSELS
6 AND EQUIPMENT. NOTE THAT THIS IS NOT AN EXHAUSTIVE LIST. AT A
7 MINIMUM ALL PROJECTS MUST MEET THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE CARL
8 MOYER GUIDELINES. AND ALTHOUGH THIS PROGRAM DOESN'T OFFER
9 FUNDING FOR INFRASTRUCTURE, THAT SUPPORTS LIGHT-DUTY VEHICLES,
10 THE AIR DISTRICT DOES PROVIDE FUNDING FOR THESE TYPES OF
11 PROJECTS THROUGH A SEPARATE PROGRAM CALLED CHARGE. AND CHARGE
12 TYPICALLY OPENS ANNUALLY IN THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. HERE
13 IS A HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY OF FUNDING THAT'S AVAILABLE. THE AIR
14 DISTRICT MAY AWARD FUNDING FROM ANY OF THIS AVAILABLE GRANT
15 REVENUE SOURCES SUCH AS CARL MOYER AND THE TRANSPORTATION FUND
16 FOR CLEAN AIR. A TOTAL OF \$30 MILLION IS AVAILABLE 80% OF THE
17 FUNDS WILL BE AWARDED TO PROJECTS THAT REDUCE EMISSIONS IN THE
18 AIR DISTRICT'S PRIORITY COMMUNITIES TO SOLICITATION FUND AT
19 LEAST SEVEN SITES. THE MAXIMUM AWARD PER SITE IS \$5 MILLION
20 AND MINIMUM AWARD PER SITE IS \$50 MILLION. MAXIMUM AWARD TO A
21 SINGLE APPLICANT IS \$15 MILLION, HOWEVER THERE IS NO CAP ON
22 THE NUMBER OF SITES APPLICANTS CAN APPLY FOR AND COFUNDING
23 WITH OTHER SOURCES IS TO ALLOW AS LONG AS REQUIREMENTS OF ALL
24 PROGRAMS ARE MET. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS TABLE SHOWS THE
25 MAXIMUM FUNDING PERCENTAGES BASED ON WHETHER THE PROJECT IS IN



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 A DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY AND OTHER ATTRIBUTES. I WON'T GO
2 INTO TOO MUCH DETAIL ON THIS SLIDE, BUT YOU CAN SEE THAT THE
3 MAXIMUM FUNDING PERCENTAGES RANGES FROM 50% TO 100%. NEXT
4 SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS OUR TENTATIVE PROGRAM SCHEDULE. THE
5 SOLICITATION OPENED IN JULY AND CLOSED THIS PAST TUESDAY. SO,
6 WE'RE CURRENTLY EVALUATING. BY JANUARY OF NEXT YEAR WE'RE
7 HOPING TO HAVE OUR INITIAL EVALUATIONS AND RANKING COMPLETED
8 TO BE ABLE TO BRING TO THE AIR DISTRICT BOARD DIRECTORS. AND
9 IDEALLY WE WANT TO BE CONTRACTING BY THE END OF FEBRUARY. ALL
10 CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE MUST BE INSTALLED AND IN PLACED INTO
11 SERVICE WITHIN TWO YEARS FROM WINDOW OF NOTICED AWARD ISSUED.
12 AND GRANTEES MUST MEET THEIR USAGE REQUIREMENT AND SUBMIT
13 THEIR FINAL REPORT IN SPRING OF 2029. SO THAT CONCLUDES MY
14 PRESENTATION. HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM BOARD
17 MEMBERS? COMMISSIONER EISEN.

18

19 **REBECCA EISEN:** SO WE'RE TALKING EARLIER, BRINGING UP THE ISSUE
20 OF DEFINITIONS FOR DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND PRIORITY
21 COMMUNITIES AND I SEE THAT BOTH TERMS ARE USED IN THIS SET OF
22 SLIDES AS WELL. I'M WONDERING IF THESE FOLLOW A PARTICULAR
23 DEFINITION OR IF THESE ARE A GOOD SUBJECT FOR CHAIR
24 WASSERMAN'S THOUGHT THAT WE TRY TO ACHIEVE SOME KIND OF
25 UNIFORMITY IN THIS COMMISSION?



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1

2 **LINDA HUI:** GOOD QUESTION. WHEN WE REFER TO PRIORITY
3 COMMUNITIES WE'RE ACTUALLY REFERRING TO THE AIR DISTRICT'S
4 DEFINED PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. AND WE DEFINE THAT AS THE AB 617
5 COMMUNITIES. YOU KNOW, THEY INCLUDE WEST OAKLAND, EAST
6 OAKLAND, AND SOME OTHER AREAS, AS WELL. IN ADDITION TO THAT,
7 WE ALSO INCLUDED, AS PART OF THAT DEFINITION, DISADVANTAGED
8 COMMUNITIES AND LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES. AND THESE ARE DEFINED
9 BY A.B. 1550 AND ONE OF THE SENATE BILLS.

10

11 **EDDIE AHN:** IT'S SB535. THIS IS EDDIE AHN AGAIN. I KNOW MORE
12 ABOUT THIS THAN I PROBABLY SHOULD. [LAUGHTER] IT SOUNDS LIKE
13 THEY'RE USING WHAT'S TERMED AT THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES
14 LEVEL, THE PRIORITY POPULATION DEFINITION THAT'S A CAPITAL P,
15 CAPITAL PRIORITY, CAPITAL POPULATIONS. THAT IS, ACTUALLY, A
16 MUCH MORE COMPREHENSIVE DEFINITION. AND I THINK THE CHALLENGE,
17 AS WE'RE ALL REALIZING AS A BOARD IS, LIKE, YOU WANT TO MAKE
18 SURE IT'S A CREDIBLE EQUITY DEFINITION BUT ALSO NOT MAKE IT SO
19 ENCOMPASSING WHERE THE DEFINITION AROUND EQUITY BECOMES
20 MEANINGLESS. IT'S A BALANCE TO STRIKE. BUT I THINK THE SHORT
21 OF IT, THE PRIORITY POPULATIONS DEFINITION IS MORE INCLUSIVE
22 THAN JUST CALENVIROSCREEN, BY ITSELF. SO, I HOPE THAT HELPED,
23 TOO.

24



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** ARE THERE ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
2 COMMENTS? YES, COMMISSIONER SPERING.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YOU CAN GIVE EXAMPLES OF PROJECTS THAT WOULD
5 TAKE PLACE IN A DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES? WHAT ARE YOU
6 TARGETING IN THOSE COMMUNITIES, SPECIFICALLY?

7

8 **LINDA HUI:** SO, AS I MENTIONED EARLIER THIS PROGRAM, IN TERMS
9 OF ELIGIBLE CATEGORY, UM, WOULD SUPPORT A RANGE OF EQUIPMENT
10 AND HEAVY-DUTY VEHICLE TYPES. SO, EACH -- I WOULD IMAGINE EACH
11 COMMUNITY WOULD BE DIFFERENT. FOR EXAMPLE, IN WEST OAKLAND WE
12 MAY SEE MORE PROJECTS THAT ARE RELATED TO PORT ACTIVITY, SUCH
13 AS FORKLIFTS, AND IN THE OTHER AREAS, WE MAY SEE MORE
14 AGRICULTURAL EQUIPMENT. SO, IT VARIES FROM DIFFERENT
15 COMMUNITIES.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YEAH, JUST -- I MEAN, SOME OF THOSE
18 EXAMPLES, I DON'T THINK REALLY APPLY IN A LOT OF THE
19 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES. YOU KNOW, IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WE'RE
20 LOSING SITE OF THE VERY PEOPLE WE'RE TRYING TO SERVE. AND I
21 THINK WE NEED TO DRILL DOWN A BIT FURTHER TO FIGURE OUT HOW
22 THE DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES CAN BENEFIT FROM THIS PROGRAM.
23 IT'S NOT CLEAR TO ME, EVEN WHAT YOU JUST EXPLAINED. SO, I
24 THINK A LITTLE MORE DEFINITION WOULD BE HELPFUL.

25



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
2 COMMENTS? ANY MEMBERS ON ZOOM? OKAY. I SEE NONE ON ZOOM.
3 COMMISSIONER AHN?

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** SEEING HOW THIS HAS COME UP IN THIS MEETING
6 MULTIPLE TIMES. I WELCOME COLLEAGUES OPINIONS ON THIS AS WELL
7 AS STAFF, I HAVE A GENERAL PERSONAL OPINION THAT THE EQUITY
8 DEFINITION SHOULD BE TAILORED TOWARD THE POLICY WE'RE TRYING
9 TO MAP. SO SOMETHING LIKE THIS, THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT EV
10 CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE, PROBABLY MAKES SENSE TO USE A MORE
11 EXPANSIVE DEFINITION AND PARTICULARLY WHEN TARGETING LOW-
12 INCOME COMMUNITIES. THAT'S A TERM, BY ITSELF, IN SACRAMENTO.
13 SO, I'M OPEN TO PEOPLE'S THOUGHTS ON THIS. AND I UNDERSTAND
14 ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WITH EQUITY DEFINITIONS WE ALL WANT ONE
15 TO TELL US WHAT IS THE DEFINITION WE SHOULD BE WORKING WITH
16 ACROSS ALL THE GRANT APPLICATIONS THAT WOULD MAKE OUR LIVES
17 MORE SIMPLE BUT POLICY MAKING IS RARELY THAT SIMPLE AS WE
18 KNOW, TOO.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES?

21

22 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC ABAG. I WORK
23 ON THE LEGISLATIVE SIDE AND THIS CONVERSATION IS HAPPENING AT
24 THE FEDERAL LIST AT JUSTICE 40 INITIATIVE AND ONE OF THE
25 THINGS THE FEDS HAVE TIE TO DO IS HAVING EACH AGENCY COME UP



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 WITH A -- I DON'T LIKE TO CALL IT DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY A,
2 A, SORT OF, DESIGNATION FOR WHICH COMMUNITIES ARE MOST IN NEED
3 OF THE PARTICULAR FUNDING SOURCES THAT THOSE AGENCIES HAVE
4 ACCESS TO. SO, THEY HAVE COME UP WITH KIND OF A DUAL MODEL.
5 ONE IS EACH AGENCY COMES UP WITH THEIR OWN TRANSPORTATION
6 PRIORITY COMMUNITY. FOR EXAMPLE, THROUGH THE DEPARTMENT OF
7 TRANSPORTATION. AND THEN THERE IS ALSO A BROADER JUSTICE 40
8 EQUITY COMMUNITY. SO YOU ESSENTIALLY CAN KIND OF LOOK AT 2, 1
9 IS JUST IN GENERAL, SORT OF, A RANGE OF FEDERAL FUNDS. WHAT
10 THE FEDS MIGHT LOOK AT AS A COMMUNITY WHERE THEY WANT TO
11 PRIORITIZE PUTTING INFRASTRUCTURE RESOURCES OR OTHER TYPES OF
12 RESOURCES THEN THEY TAYLOR ONE THAT EACH OF THE AGENCIES HAS
13 DEVELOPED. IT'S A MODEL THAT CALIFORNIA MIGHT LOOK AT IN THE
14 FUTURE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. YEAH, I MEAN, I THINK THAT -
17 - THAT IS -- THAT'S A MUCH MORE LOGICAL APPROACH. HAVING A
18 BASELINE DEFINITION AND ONE THAT'S MORE TAILORED TO THE
19 SPECIFIC AGENCY OR GRANT OR REGULATION. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR
20 COMMENTS? OKAY. IF NOT, WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
21 ITEM. ITEM SEVEN. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HERE IN
22 THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON ITEM SEVEN? IF
23 SO, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. AND I DON'T SEE ANY IN-PERSON
24 SPEAKERS OR SPEAKERS ON ZOOM.

25



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** I SEE NO IN-PERSON PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

2

3 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. IF NOT, THANK YOU. I THINK THIS
4 WAS AN INSIGHTFUL PRESENTATION. IT'S GOOD TO SEE ALL THE
5 DIFFERENCE INITIATIVES DIFFERENT AGENCIES ARE ENGAGED IN AND I
6 APPRECIATE DEPUTY DIRECTOR FREMIER'S STATEMENT ABOUT LOOKING
7 AT TRYING TO PUSH FOR A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH OF HOW WE'RE
8 ADDRESSING THE ISSUE. UNLESS THERE IS FURTHER DISCUSSION WE'RE
9 GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM 8A PRESENTATION ON 2023 LEGISLATION
10 WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN FROM MTC ABAG
11 ON VARIOUS LEGISLATIVE ACTIVITIES RELEVANT TO THE BODY AND THE
12 DAY AFTER THE END OF SESSION. THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE. I KNOW
13 IT'S BEEN A DIFFICULT LAST FEW MONTHS.

14

15 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** STILL GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC ABAG
16 STAFF. GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. IT'S KIND
17 OF NICE FOR MY JOB THAT MY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND JESSICA
18 COVERED A LOT OF THE SPECIFIC BILLS THAT I WAS GOING TO GIVE
19 YOU AN UPDATE ON, BECAUSE THEY DID SUCH A GREAT JOB I'M GOING
20 TO KIND OF SKIP OVER SOME OF THE SPECIFICS AND MAYBE FOCUS ON
21 MORE ON THE BIGGER PICTURE ITEMS THAT WERE MOVING THROUGH
22 SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR. AND SOME OF WHAT, I THINK, FROM A, SORT
23 OF, LOOK PAST, AND THEN THE CRYSTAL BALL FOR 2024, MIGHT BE OF
24 REALLY, SORT OF, INTEREST FOR THIS GROUP. JUST TO START, YOU
25 KNOW, MONEY IS WHAT DROVE A LOT OF THE CONVERSATION IN



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR, AS IS, SORT OF, TYPICAL. AND FOR THE
2 PAST COUPLE OF YEARS, A LOT OF WHAT HAPPENED IN OUR WORLD, IN
3 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, CLIMATE RESILIENCE, ENVIRONMENT WAS
4 DRIVEN SPECIFICALLY BY THE STATE A FISCAL OUTLOOK, AND THE
5 FACT THAT THE STOCK MARKET HAD BEEN GOING, SORT OF, BANANAS
6 AND THAT MEANT THAT WE HAD ALL THESE UNPRECEDENTED STATE
7 BUDGET SURPLUSES. SO THERE WAS A HUGE AMOUNT OF ENERGY IN
8 SACRAMENTO THAT WAS FOCUSED ON HOW TO DIVVY UP TENS OF
9 BILLIONS, NEW AND REALLY UNEXPECTED RESOURCES FOR CLIMATE, FOR
10 TRANSIT, FOR BROADER TRANSPORTATION, FOR HOUSING, ET CETERA,
11 ET CETERA. AND THAT RESULTED IN A LOT OF REALLY SUBSTANTIAL
12 NEW COMMITMENTS FOR A WHOLE RANGE OF PROGRAMS, INCLUDING WHAT
13 CRAIG JUST TALKED ABOUT WAS ZERO-EMISSIONS TRANSITION. WHAT
14 THIS GROUP TALKED A LOT ABOUT WITH HOUSING, TRANSIT,
15 TRANSPORTATION, AND CLIMATE RESILIENCE AND IT WAS SUCH A
16 PERIOD OF YES IN SACRAMENTO THAT LEGISLATORS, SORT OF, ENDED
17 UP OVERCOMMITTING. WHAT THE LEGISLATURE AND GOVERNOR HAD DONE
18 IN PREVIOUS YEARS WAS THEY, SORT OF, FULLY COMMITTED THAT
19 YEAR'S BUDGET THEN THEY ALSO COMMITTED OUT-YEAR FUNDING FOR
20 PROGRAMS THAT FOLKS, SORT OF, STARTED TO DEPEND ON, BUT THE
21 ACTUAL MONEY COMING IN FOR THOSE PROGRAMS WAS DEPENDENT ON
22 CONTINUED, SORT OF, BUDGETS. SO THIS YEAR THERE WAS THIS
23 WHIPLASH WITH THE STOCK MARKET NOT BEING AS, SORT OF, FOREVER
24 INCREASING AND A REALLY, I THINK, SORT OF, SHOCKING BUDGET
25 DEFICIT THIS YEAR, THAT SACRAMENTO HAD TO DEAL WITH, AND WHAT



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 THAT ENDED UP DOING WAS THOSE COMMITTED MONEYS THAT FOLKS WERE
2 DEPENDING ON COMING TO FRUITION IN 20 -- ALL OF A SUDDEN
3 WEREN'T THERE ANYMORE. AND THAT MEANT THAT ONE THAT WAS REALLY
4 AN UPHILL BATTLE TO SECURE GENERAL FUND RESOURCES IN THIS
5 YEAR'S BUDGET TO MAINTAIN ANY OF THE PRIOR YEAR COMMITMENTS
6 AND IT'S GOING TO BE CONTINUING CHALLENGE IN YEARS BECAUSE THE
7 FISCAL OUTLOOK LOOKS LIKE IT'S GOING TO CONTINUE TO NOT BE AS
8 ROBUST AS IT HAD BEEN. A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT THAT UPHILL
9 BATTLE MEANT FOR THIS YEAR, WITH ISSUES THAT YOU ALL CARE A
10 LOT ABOUT. I'M GOING TO START WITH, ONE, TRANSIT AND THEN,
11 TWO, TALK ABOUT THE CLIMATE COMMITMENTS. FIRST THERE WAS
12 SUCCESS IN THE TRANSIT SPACE AND MTC AND ABAG'S TOP
13 LEGISLATIVE PRIORITY THIS YEAR AS YOU KNOW CONNECTING
14 FRUSTRATIONS, YOU HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT THIS, TO SECURE FUNDS
15 TO STAVE OFF TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CLIFF WHILE RETAINING
16 THE STATE'S PRIOR YEAR CONDOMINIUMS TO TRANSIT CAPITAL
17 RESOURCES SO WE WERE ABLE TO SECURE BOTH THOSE PRIOR YEAR
18 COMMITMENTS TO TRANSIT CAPITAL RESOURCES THE STATE WAS ABLE TO
19 DO THAT WHICH IS GOING ENABLE THE BAY AREA TO LEVERAGE
20 BILLIONS AND BILLIONS OF FEDERAL INFRASTRUCTURE DOLLARS FOR
21 MAJOR TRANSIT PROJECTS ACROSS THE REGION. THE LEGISLATURE ALSO
22 PROVIDED ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS IN NEW MONEY FOR TRANSIT
23 OPERATIONS. THAT MONEY CAME OVER A PERIOD OF YEARS. SORT OF,
24 THE SAME SITUATION WE SAW IN PREVIOUS BUDGET CYCLES WHERE THEY
25 SAID WE'RE GOING TO GIVE YOU A BILLION DOLLARS, BUT ONLY A



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 TINY BIT THIS YEAR AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO COME BACK TO US
2 IN FUTURE YEARS AND ASK FOR IT AGAIN. SO IT'S PRETTY SOLID BUT
3 IT'S DEFINITELY GOING TO BE AN AREA OF FOCUS IN FUTURE YEARS.
4 WHAT THAT ALSO MEAN IS THAT IN THE NEAR-TERM, MTC HAS BEEN
5 GIVEN THE RESPONSIBILITY FOR DIVVYING UP THOSE OPERATIONS
6 RESOURCES AND, ALSO, THE RESPONSIBILITY FOR IMPLEMENTING AN
7 OVERSIGHT OF SOME ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES THAT THE LEGISLATURE
8 PUT INTO THOSE RESOURCES. SO, THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF
9 BACK AND FORTH AT THE LEGISLATURE OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF
10 YEARS TO MAINTAIN THIS LIFELINE. LET'S SEE. I CAN MOVE ON
11 QUICKLY. I THINK THE OTHER PIECE THAT OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
12 BROUGHT UP WAS, REALLY, THERE IS ALSO AN EFFORT IN LOOKING
13 INTO SACRAMENTO AROUND WHAT'S THE LONG-TERM PLAN FOR FINANCIAL
14 SUSTAINABILITY IT'S GOING TO BE A BIG FOCUS OVER THE NEXT
15 SEVERAL YEARS AS WELL. MOVING ON TO CLIMATE IT'S A PRETTY BIG
16 CONTRAST THE STATE THIS YEAR DID NOT FUND CLIMATE PROGRAMS
17 ANYTHING CLOSE TO THE LEVELS WERE COMMITTED IN PRIOR YEAR
18 BUDGETS THE BUDGET ACTUALLY RESCINDED HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF
19 DOLLARS IN CLIMATE FUNDING THAT THE LEGISLATURE HAD
20 APPROPRIATED LAST YEAR BUT HADN'T BEEN SPENT YET SO THEY
21 CLAWED THAT BACK AND THEN THE IDEA WAS LEGISLATURE AND
22 GOVERNOR WERE COLLECTIVELY SUPPORTING GOING TO THE VOTERS AND
23 BRINGING A STATEWIDE GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND TO HELP BACKFILL
24 SOME OF THOSE COMMITMENTS THAT LEADS US TO THE SECOND TAKE
25 AWAY WHICH IS PART OF THE BIGGER TREND THAT WE SAW IN



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR WITH THE STATE LOOKING AT GO BONDS THEY
2 PUT OUT \$200 BILLION WORTH OF PROPOSED BONDS THIS YEAR AND
3 LOCAL MEASURES TO FUND SOME OF THE PRIORITIES THEY PREVIOUSLY
4 HAD BEEN ABLE TO FUND THROUGH THE GENERAL FUND HOW DID THAT
5 PLAY OUT? WELL FIRST THE LEGISLATURE DID TAKE A BIG STEP
6 FORWARD TO EMPOWER LOCAL, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WALKED
7 THROUGH THAT WITH MEMBER AGUIAR-CURRY'S ASSEMBLY
8 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT. SO, THAT MEANS THE GOVERNOR HAVE TO
9 SIGN THE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT SO WITH SENATE PASSAGE
10 YESTERDAY, YEAH, LAST DAY, IT'S GOING TO GO TO VOTERS IN
11 NOVEMBER 2024. SO, THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE VERY BIG STEP
12 TOWARDS SUPPORTING SELF-HELP. ON THE STATE BONDS PIECE, THEY
13 ENDED UP WITH A TWO PART DEAL TO NARROW DOWN THOSE \$200
14 BILLION WORTH OF BONDS THAT THEY HAVE BEEN CONSIDERING. AND SO
15 THE GOVERNOR'S TOP PRIORITY IN THIS SPACE WAS TO GO TO MARCH
16 2024 BALLOT WITH A MENTAL HEALTH AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE SUPPORT
17 MEASURE THAT WOULD CREATE 10,000 BEDS FOR INDIVIDUALS
18 EXPERIENCING SEVERE MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES AND STRUGGLING WITH
19 SUBSTANCE ABUSE CHALLENGES. LEADERS IN THE LEGISLATURE HAD
20 ALSO ENDED UP COALESCING BEHIND THE TENS OF BILLIONS OF
21 DOLLARS IN BONDS FOR CLIMATE BONDS THAT WOULD REPLACE SOME OF
22 THE PRIOR YEAR COMMITMENTS, HOUSING AND SCHOOLS, THOSE ENDED
23 UP COALESCING AS THE TOP PRIORITIES. AND WHAT'S INTERESTING
24 AND DIFFERENT THIS YEAR IS THAT MARCH 2024 IS, SORT OF, THE
25 IDEAL TIMING THAT FOLKS ARE LOOKING AT BRINGING BOND MEASURES



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 TO THE BALLOT. BECAUSE THE TURN-OUT IS EXPECTED TO BE LARGE
2 WITH THE SENATE -- U.S. SENATE PRIMARY HAPPENING IN MARCH.
3 WHAT ENDED UP, BACK IN-ROOM NEGOTIATIONS, THEY DECIDED TO MOVE
4 FORWARD THE GOVERNOR MENTAL HEALTH BONDS TO GET PLACED ON THE
5 MARCH 2024 BALLOT AND PULL BACK ALL OF THE OTHER STATEWIDE
6 BOND MEASURES THAT ARE GOING TO BE CONTINUOUSLY NEGOTIATED
7 OVER THIS WINTER AND EARLY SPRING, THOSE BOND MEASURES MIGHT
8 GO TO THE NOVEMBER 2024 BALLOT. SO, THERE WILL BE MORE WORK IN
9 THAT SPACE AND MORE TO BRING BACK TO YOU ALL TO DISCUSS AND
10 SHARE UPDATES. SO THAT'S REALLY WHAT HAPPENED ON THE MONEY
11 SIDE. [LAUGHTER] IT'S AN INTERESTING SPACE TO BE IN WITH THE
12 LEGISLATURE FEELING A TIGHT SQUEEZE WHILE WE'RE ALL HERE STILL
13 SEEING SUCH AN UNPRECEDENTED AMOUNT OF RESOURCES COMING OUT
14 THAT ARE AVAILABLE THROUGH THE FEDS AND STATE THAT WERE
15 COMMITTED IN PRIOR YEARS. SO I THINK IT'S REALLY STRATEGIC
16 THAT EVERYONE IS BEING VERY AGGRESSIVE AND GOING AFTER GRANT
17 RESOURCES AND, YOU KNOW, MAKING SURE WE CAN BRING AS MUCH AS
18 WE CAN BACK TO THE BAY AREA NOW. BECAUSE NOW IS THE TIME.

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ARE THERE
21 ANY QUESTIONS FROM ANY BOARD MEMBERS ON THE PRESENTATION?
22 WELL, I THINK ONE BILL THAT MR. FREMIER HAD MENTIONED EARLIER
23 IS SENATE BILL 272. AND THAT'S ON THE GOVERNOR'S DESK.
24 OBVIOUSLY VERY IMPORTANT TO THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING HERE IN
25 THE BAY AREA AROUND SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION PLANNING. SO,



SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1 ENCOURAGE EVERYONE TO CONTACT THE GOVERNOR TO EXPRESS SUPPORT
2 FOR THAT BILL AND URGE SIGNATURE. AND, OBVIOUSLY, THE
3 CONVERSATION ON TRANSIT FUNDING IS ONGOING. ARE THERE ANY
4 OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS FROM
5 MEMBERS ON ZOOM? I DON'T SEE ANY HAND RAISED. THANK YOU VERY
6 MUCH, GEORGIA. THANKS FOR ALL YOUR WORK THIS LEGISLATIVE
7 SESSION. I GUESS IT'S NOT OVER, NOW THAT WE HAVE TO FOCUS ON
8 THE BILLS BEING SIGNED. BUT REALLY APPRECIATE ALL YOUR
9 ADVOCACY FOR OUR REGION. THANK YOU. OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC
10 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM FROM ANYONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM?
11 I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. SO, SEEING NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON
12 THIS ITEM, WE'LL PROCEED TO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM WHICH IS ITEM
13 NINE, PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA MATTERS: ARE THERE ANY
14 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO WISH TO SPEAK TO AN ITEM NOT ON THE
15 AGENDA? IF SO, PLEASE COME FORWARD OR PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND
16 YOU'RE ON ZOOM. SEEING NO SPEAKERS. WERE THERE WRITTEN
17 COMMENTS FOR THIS ITEM

18

19 **CLERK, SARINA SEATON:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** THAT BRINGS US TO THE LAST ITEM, OUR
22 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BARC GOVERNING BOARD IS
23 FRIDAY NOVEMBER 15TH, 2023 AT 10:00 A.M. AND OUR MEETING IS
24 NOW ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

25



Bay Area
**Regional
Collaborative**
Meeting Transcript

SEPTEMBER 15, 2023

1



NTTT

Broadcasting Government