

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE SPECIAL MEETING**

2 **FRIDAY, DECEMBER 8TH, 2023, 9:45 AM**

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS
5 MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. THIS
6 MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEB SITES. COMMUNITY
7 MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
8 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
9 NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME?
10 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
11 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN
12 FOR ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION
13 TODAY. AGENDA ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL. WILL THE CLERK CALL THE
14 ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARREGUIN?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** HERE AT [INDISCERNIBLE] STREET,
23 BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA CALIFORNIA.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER AHN?



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?

5

6 **KEN CARLSON:** HERE FROM PLEASANT OFFICE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI? ECKLUND?

9

10 **PAT EKLUND:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

13

14 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

17

18 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS, ABAG V. CHAIR:** HERE THIRD STREET NAPA.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN?

8

9 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

12

13 **PAT EKLUND:** BEFORE YOU GO FORWARD I NEED TO SAY I'M AT MY
14 REMOTE LOCATION AT THE HAM TILL TON ROAD COMMUNITY CENTER.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS US TO
17 ITEM TWO, CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2B DO I HAVE A
18 MOTION TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT:** MOTION.

21

22 **PAT EKLUND:** SECOND.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MOTION AND SECONDS. IS THERE ANY
25 COMMITTEE MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 ITEM? CLERK WERE THERE ANY REMINDS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC
2 COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
5 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN
6 THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE IN ZOOM WITH THEIR
7 HAND RAISED.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH. WITH
10 THAT BEING SAID, WE WILL MOVE FORWARD TO AGENDA ITEM 3A. ROLL
11 CALL VOTE, PLEASE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR CANEPA?

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON?



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **KEN CARLSON:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MEMBER ECKLUND?

9

10 **PAT EKLUND:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MEMBER MOULTON-
13 PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

18

19 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS, ABAG V. CHAIR:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND TIEDEMANN?

9

10 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
13 PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGENDA ITEM
16 3A, BAY AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION EFFORT, VOTER SURVEY
17 REPORT. REBECCA LONG WITH MTC AND RUTH BERNSTEIN OF EMC
18 RESEARCH. WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT?

19

20 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR CAN PARKS COMMISSIONERS AND
21 DIRECTORS. I'LL KICK THIS OFF THEN TURN IT OVER TO RUTH
22 BERNSTEIN CEO OF RESEARCH. THIS POLL WAS NOT A VIABILITY POLL
23 AS YOU KNOW WE'RE PURSUING ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR
24 TRANSPORTATION THAT WOULD BE PUT ON THE BALLOT NO SOONER THAN
25 NOVEMBER OF 2026 SO THE PURPOSE OF TESTING SPECIFIC REVENUE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 OPTIONS WAS TO COMPARE AGAINST EACH OTHER TO SEE WAS THERE
2 MORE SUPPORT FOR ONE TYPE OF REVENUE OPTION THAN OTHER RATHER
3 THAN ARE THE VOTERS GOING TO PASS THIS. JUST WANT TO PROVIDE
4 THAT CONTEXT. AND WE ALSO REALLY WANTED TO GAUGE THE TYPES OF
5 EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES AND PRIORITIES THAT STAFF HAVE BEEN
6 PROPOSING FOR THE STRUCTURE OF THE LEGISLATION BASED ON
7 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AND SOME OTHER IN-PERSON ENGAGEMENT
8 WITH BAY AREA RESIDENTS AGAINST A MORE SCIENTIFIC POLL. AND,
9 SO, THAT'S REALLY TO INFORM THE ENABLING LEGISLATION, AS WELL
10 AS IN TERMS OF EXPENDITURES, AS WELL AS TESTING SOME REFORMS
11 SINCE WE HAVE BEEN HEARING BOTH FROM THE COMMISSION,
12 STAKEHOLDERS, AND LEGISLATORS IN SACRAMENTO THAT REFORMS ARE
13 AN IMPORTANT PART OF THIS LEGISLATION. SO, WE'LL BE TALKING
14 MORE ABOUT THAT IN THE NEXT ITEM. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER
15 TO RUTH.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. HI EVERYONE. I'M ASSUMING MY
18 SLIDES ARE GOING TO MAGICALLY APPEAR UP IN FRONT. [LAUGHTER]
19 ALL RIGHT. SO, I'M GOING TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE BIG PICTURE
20 RESULTS ON THE NEXT SLIDE, OF THE SURVEY. IF WE COULD GO TO
21 THE NEXT SLIDE? THIS SURVEY WAS CONDUCTED RECENTLY AT THE END
22 OF OCTOBER. SO, YOU KNOW, PRETTY RECENT RESULTS. WE DID A
23 PRETTY LARGE SAMPLE SIZE OF 2700 INTERVIEWS THAT ARE
24 REPRESENTATIVE OF THE VOTERS THAT ARE LIKELY TO VOTE IN A
25 NOVEMBER 2026 ELECTION. OR ACTUALLY, I THINK THIS IS A WIDE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SAMPLE OF REGISTERED VOTERS OVERALL. WE DID A MULTILINGUAL AND
2 USED MULTIMODAL METHODS SO WE COULD REACH PEOPLE WHERE THEY'RE
3 AT, PHONE TEXT OR E-MAIL. REFLECTIVE OF THE BAY AREA
4 ELECTORATE OVERALL. AND WE DID A SUBMIT SAMPLE, SUCH A LARGE
5 SAMPLE SIZE ONE SO THAT WEEKEND LOOK AT THE LARGE NUMBER OF
6 DEMOGRAPHICS BUT ALSO A SPLIT SAMPLE WHERE 1/3 OF RESPONDENTS
7 HEARD ONE TYPE OF REVENUE OPTION IN A BALLOT 1/3 HEARD ANOTHER
8 1 AND 1/3 HEARD ANOTHER SO WE GOT A NICE SAMPLE SIZE. NEXT
9 SLIDE. GOING INTO RESULTS JUMPING RIGHT IN HERE. SO, OVERALL
10 MOOD: ARE THINGS IN THE BAY AREA GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION
11 OR ON OR OFF TRACK? 62% OF BAY AREA VOTERS RIGHT NOW ARE
12 FEELING LIKE THINGS ARE OFF ON THE WRONG TRACK. THEY'RE
13 FEELING FAIRLY NEGATIVE; ONLY 33% THE RIGHT DIRECTION. I'LL
14 SHOW YOU WHY THIS MATTERS. A LOT OF FOLKS SAY, WHY DO YOU KEEP
15 ASKING THIS QUESTION. IT'S SUCH WEIRD WORDING. WE ASK IT
16 BECAUSE IT'S A GOOD GAUGE OF WHETHER PEOPLE ARE FEELING
17 OPTIMISTIC OR PESSIMISTIC. THEY'RE FEELING PESSIMISTIC AND WE
18 THINK THAT RELATES TO HOW THEY FEEL ABOUT A MEASURE TO RAISE
19 THEIR TAXES AND THEY KIND OF CORRELATE ALONG. ON THE NEXT
20 PAGE, ASKING ABOUT WHAT ARE VOTERS CONCERNED ABOUT IF THEY'RE
21 NOT FEELING SO HAPPY. WHAT ARE THEY CONCERNED ABOUT. WE ASK,
22 WHAT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT PROBLEM. CRIME IS COMING TO THE TOP,
23 AT 27% MENTIONING CRIME IN AN OPEN-ENDED QUESTION AS THEIR
24 MOST IMPORTANT PROBLEM IN THE BAY AREA. THAT'S SIGNIFICANTLY
25 INCREASED RECENTLY. WE'RE ALSO SEEING HOMELESSNESS. THAT'S



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 BEEN AT THE TOP, HOMELESSNESS, 25% MENTIONING HOMELESSNESS.
2 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, COST OF LIVING UP THERE AT THE TOP OF
3 VOTER CONCERNS. ON THE NEXT PAGE, JUST SO THAT YOU SEE THE
4 CONTEXT, THE NUMBER OF PLACES THROUGH THE HERE WE'RE GOING TO
5 SHOW YOU BREAK DOWN OF TRANSIT RIDERS. SO WE WANT TO SHOW UP
6 FRONT WE DID ASK PEOPLE HOW FREQUENTLY THEY USE PUBLIC
7 TRANSIT. YOU CAN SEE THERE ON THE LEFT, WE HAVE A HANDFUL, 5%
8 THAT DO RIDE TRANSIT DAILY, 17% TOTAL SAY THEY'RE RIDING
9 TRANSIT WEEKLY A THIRD RIDING TRANSIT OCCASIONALLY AND HALF
10 ARE NON-TRANSIT RIDERS REALLY DON'T RIDE AT ALL. ON THE NEXT
11 PAGE. SO, EVEN THOUGH A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE NOT RIDING TRANSIT,
12 BAY AREA VOTERS THINK TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT. HOW IMPORTANT
13 WOULD YOU SAY PUBLIC TRANSIT IS IN THE BAY AREA, THIS IS
14 GENERALLY PUBLIC TRANSIT, YOU CAN SEE HERE OVERALL 78% SAYING
15 THAT IT IS IMPORTANT. 47% VERY IMPORTANT. NO SURPRISE THAT WE
16 SEE HIGHER IMPORTANCE AMONG THOSE THAT RIDE TRANSIT
17 FREQUENTLY. SO, AMONG THOSE WHO RIDE IT A LOT, 69% SAYING IT'S
18 VERY IMPORTANT. SEVEN ON A 1 TO 7 SCALE, BUT EVEN HALF OF
19 VOTERS WHO ARE NON-RIDERS WE SEE 69% SAYING IT'S VERY
20 IMPORTANT AND 37 VERY IMPORTANT SO EVEN IF YOU'RE NOT RIDING
21 TRANSIT IT'S IMPORTANT. NEXT PAGE WE ASK FEELINGS ABOUT PUBLIC
22 TRANSIT FAVORABLE OR UNFAVORABLE OPINION THIS IS WHERE WE SEE
23 PEOPLE ARE NOT AS HAPPY WITH WHAT THEY HAVE NOW ON PUBLIC
24 TRANSIT. OVERALL 52% FAVORABLE 46% UNFAVORABLE AMONG TRANSIT
25 RIDERS 72% FAVORABLE. SO THOSE TAKING TRANSIT ARE ACTUALLY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 PRETTY HAPPY. I TOOK BART THIS MORNING. I WAS HAPPY. IT CAME,
2 IT WAS CLEAN. IT WAS GREAT. OCCASIONAL RIDERS 58%, FAVORABLE
3 42% UNFAVORABLE. BUT THOSE NON-RIDERS HAVE NEGATIVE PERCEPTION
4 OF TRANSIT. NON-RIDERS, 56% SAY THEY HAVE AN UNFAVORABLE
5 OPINION, 22% STRONGLY UNFAVORABLE. SO, WE HAVE THOSE WHO ARE
6 TAKING IT STILL LOVE; IT IT'S NOT THE GREATEST. BUT THEY HAVE
7 A POSITIVE OPINION. WHAT WE HAVE SEEN IN OTHER QUALITATIVE
8 RESEARCH IS PEOPLE SAYING, WELL I WANT IT TO BE BETTER. I LIKE
9 TAKING TRANSIT, BUT I WANT IT TO BE BETTER. ON THE NEXT PAGE.
10 AWARENESS OF NEED FOR FUNDING. WE ASK DO YOU THINK THERE IS A
11 GREAT NEED? SOME NEED? A LITTLE NEED? OR NO MONEY FOR MONEY
12 FOR TRANSIT. WE SEE 65% ARE AWARE THERE IS NEED FOR MONEY; 33%
13 NO NEED. THAT'S ALMOST IDENTICAL TO THE POLL THAT WE DID IN
14 MARCH. EVEN THOUGH THERE HAVE BEEN CHANGES IN FUNDING
15 AVAILABILITY WE SEE NOT A LOT OF CHANGE IN PERCEPTION, 65%
16 THINKING THERE IS A NEED. SORRY. THAT WAS TRANSPORTATION, NOT
17 TRANSIT. IT WAS ABOUT TRANSPORTATION IN GENERAL. THANK YOU. ON
18 THE NEXT PAGE, WE, GENERALLY, ON TAX ATTITUDES, WE ASK THIS
19 BEFORE WE ASKED THE BALLOT QUESTION. SO JUST SAYING, DO YOU
20 AGREE OR DISAGREE? WE NEED TO ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE IN OUR
21 TRANSPORTATION FUTURE EVEN IF IT MEANS RAISING TAXES. 56%
22 AGREE WITH THAT. WE NEED STABLE LONG-TERM FUNDING FOR PUBLIC
23 TRANSIT, EVEN IF IT MEANS RAISING TAXES. 57% AGREE WITH THAT.
24 WE NEED SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENTS TO PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY
25 AREA EVEN IF IT MEANS RAISING TAXES, 54% AGREE WITH THAT. WE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HAVE A SIGNIFICANT PERCENTAGE, OVER 40% THAT DISAGREE WITH
2 THAT. BUT A MAJORITY HERE ARE AGREEING THAT EVEN IF IT MEANS
3 RAISING TAXES, WE WANT THE INVESTMENT. WE LOST HALF OF THAT.
4 [LAUGHTER] ON THE NEXT PAGE. THIS IS WHERE WE ASKED A BALLOT
5 QUESTION. WE SAID THIS MAY BE ON THE BALLOT IN THE FUTURE.
6 WOULD YOU VOTE YES OR NO. AND AS I SAID, WE DID WHAT'S CALLED
7 A SPLIT SAMPLE. SO, A THIRD OF THE RESPONDENTS HEARD BAY SALES
8 TAX, A THIRD HEARD ABOUT AN INCOME TAX, A THIRD HEARD ABOUT A
9 PAYROLL TAX. THEY DID NOT HEAR BOTH. YOU JUST HEARD ONE OR THE
10 OTHER. THEY ALL HEARD THE INTRO. HERE IS A MEASURE THAT MIGHT
11 BE ON THE BALLOT TO IMPROVE SAFETY AND CLEANLINESS ON BART AND
12 OTHER LOCAL PUBLIC TRANSIT, REDUCE BAY AREA TRAFFIC, EXPAND
13 AND IMPROVE BUS, LIGHT RAIL, FERRY SERVICE, RELIABILITY
14 CONVENIENCE, REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, REPAIR POTHoles,
15 MAKE TRANSIT EASIER MORE AFFORDABLE TO USE, AND MAKE STREETS
16 SAFER FOR WALKING AND BIKING. AND THEN THEY HEARD ENACTING
17 HALF-CENT SALES TAX, OR THEY HEARD ENACTING A 0.17% INCOME
18 TAX, OR THEY HEARD A PAYROLL TAX OF 3.6%. AS WE SEE HERE, NOT
19 A LOT OF DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE MEASURES AND JUST ABOVE A
20 MAJORITY SUPPORTING 55% FOR THE SALES TAX, 51% INCOME TAX, 55%
21 PAYROLL TAX. ALL OF THEM JUST SLIGHTLY ABOVE MAJORITY, NOT AT
22 THAT 2/3 LEVEL. BUT OUR UNDERSTANDING IF THE LEGISLATION IS
23 WRITTEN CORRECTLY THERE IS A POSSIBILITY THAT A MEASURE WOULD
24 ONLY NEED 50% PLUS ONE AND NOT THE 2/3 LEVEL. AND ALSO TO NOTE
25 THAT -- I'LL SHOW YOU IN A LATER SLIDE -- BUT THIS IS LOWER



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SUPPORT THAN WE HAVE SEEN FOR A MEASURE IN THE PAST. JUST --
2 I'M SORRY, ON THE NEXT PAGE, LOOKING AT -- JUST A COUPLE OF
3 DEMOGRAPHICS, WE DIDN'T WANT TO GO INTO A LOT OF DETAIL. BUT
4 WE WANTED TO SHOW YOU HERE THAT THERE IS A DIFFERENCE, A
5 LITTLE BIT OF A DIFFERENCE BY GENDER WITH YOUNGER MEN AT 57
6 SUPPORT OLDER MEN OVER 50 44 SUPPORT, WOMEN UNDER 50 61% WOMEN
7 OVER 50, 54%, THEN A SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE ON TRANSIT
8 RIDERSHIP. THOSE WHO TAKE TRANSIT FREQUENTLY, 71% SUPPORT THIS
9 MEASURE AND THEN THOSE NON-RIDERS ONLY 43% SUPPORT. ON THE
10 NEXT PAGE, GEOGRAPHY, WHICH I KNOW EVERYONE IS ALWAYS
11 INTERESTED IN. OF THE WE SEE MORE COMMONALITY REALLY THAN
12 DIFFERENCE HERE. THE HIGHEST SUPPORT, REALLY, AMONG THOSE
13 AREAS WHERE THERE ARE HIGHER TRANSIT -- THERE IS HIGHER
14 TRANSIT USAGE, ALAMEDA COUNTY, 58% SUPPORT, SAN FRANCISCO 57%,
15 SAN MATEO 58%, SANTA CLARA 54%, AND THEN LOWER SUPPORT IN
16 OTHER AREAS, CONTRA COSTA 47, MARIN SONOMA, NAPA SOLANO 48.
17 THAT'S CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE SEE IN THE LOCAL AREAS AS WELL
18 WHEN WE ASK ABOUT MEASURES. ON THE NEXT PAGE, JUST A QUICK
19 COMPARISON. AS YOU KNOW, WE DID A SURVEY IN MARCH. WE ASKED
20 SIMILAR QUESTIONS. IN MARCH WE ASKED A MEASURE THAT HAD SALES
21 TAX ABOUT TRANSIT ONLY THEN SALES TAX FOR TRANSIT AND
22 TRANSPORTATION THEN COMPARED TO THIS POLL. AS WE SAID,
23 SLIGHTLY HIGHER SUPPORT IN MARCH 59% YES FOR TRANSIT ONLY, 63%
24 TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION, THIS EFFORT, WE ACTUALLY TOOK THE
25 LEARNINGS FROM THE PAST POLL, AND PAST POLLING AND TRIED TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 RANK AN ABSOLUTELY DIFFERENT QUESTION THAT MIGHT RESONATE THIS
2 WAS REALLY I DON'T THINK ABOUT PROJECTS THEMSELVES BUT MAYBE
3 ABOUT MOOD BUT 55% NOW SUPPORT COMPARED TO IN THE PAST. OR IN
4 THE -- EARLIER THIS YEAR. ON THE NEXT PAGE, WE HAVE A COUPLE
5 OF PAGES HERE, WE ASKED ABOUT A NUMBER OF ITEMS. HERE ARE
6 POTENTIAL ITEMS THAT COULD BE INCLUDED IN THIS MEASURE ALL
7 RANDOMIZED BROKEN INTO A COUPLE DIFFERENT SLIDES BY CATEGORY
8 FIRST ARE IN TRANSIT ITEMS I'M NOT GOING TO READ ALL BUT
9 GENERALLY THIS IS ABOUT IMPROVING TRANSIT. SO MAKING ALL OF
10 OUR TRANSIT OPTIONS MORE RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE, MAKING THEM
11 SAFER, CLEANER, AVOIDING CUTS, EXPANDING SERVICE TO OTHER
12 AREAS, CREATING A SEAMLESS TRANSIT NETWORK. YOU CAN SEE ALL OF
13 THESE HERE ARE FAIRLY HIGH PRIORITIES TO VOTERS. ALL ABOVE
14 70%. AND WE SEE SOME REAL INTENSITY WITH 45% RATING VERY HIGH
15 PRIORITY MAKING TRANSIT MORE RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED,
16 45% VERY HIGH PRIORITY IMPROVING SAFETY CLEANLINESS, 44%
17 SERVICES. ALL HIGH PRIORITY. ON THE NEXT PAGE. LOOKING AT ALL
18 OF THOSE BY TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. SO, THIS IS THE AVERAGE ON A 1
19 TO 7 SCALE. AND YOU CAN SEE THE DARK BLUE ARE THOSE THAT TAKE
20 TRANSIT FREQUENTLY. ALL OF THESE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS ARE
21 RATED AS HIGHER PRIORITY. AMONG THOSE TRANSIT USERS, THAN THEY
22 ARE AMONG THOSE NON-USERS. SO NON-USERS, YOU STILL SEE ON
23 AVERAGE THEY'RE ABOVE A FIVE. SO THEY'RE RATED AS IMPORTANT
24 BUT NOT GETTING THE HIGH INTENSITY THEY GET AMONG TRANSIT
25 USERS. NOT MUCH OF A SURPRISE. [LAUGHTER] ON THE NEXT PAGE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SOME OTHER ITEMS. THESE ARE KIND OF IN THE CATEGORY OF ROADS
2 AND CLIMATE. BUT OTHER ITEMS HERE, THE TOP ONE, POTHOLE REPAIR
3 AND SAFETY. POTHOLE REPAIR AND SAFE ROADS MAKING IT EASIER TO
4 GET AROUND SAFER FOR DRIVERS BICYCLES AND PEDESTRIAN PRIORITY
5 HIGH PRIORITY 81 AND 43% RATING AS AN INTENSE HIGH PRIORITY
6 SIMILARLY ALL TRANSIT ITEMS ACTUALLY SO JUST TO NOTE WE PUT
7 THIS ON A SEPARATE SLIDE. BUT SIMILAR TRANSIT ITEMS THEN SOME
8 OF THESE ENCOURAGING ALTERNATIVES TO EXPANDING ACCESS TO EV,
9 ELECTRIC VEHICLES PROTECTING AIR QUALITY, AND ALLOWING ONLY
10 PROJECTS THAT REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS GET AROUND 50 TO
11 -- YOU KNOW, 49 TO 58% AS A PRIORITY. SO, THEY ARE A PRIORITY
12 TO A MAJORITY, BUT NOT THE SAME INTENSITY. ON THE NEXT PAGE.
13 SOME OTHER REFORMS THAT WE ASKED ABOUT. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TO
14 KEEP IN MIND THAT THESE COULD BE ASKED IN A MILLION DIFFERENT
15 WAYS. WE TRIED TO SIMPLIFY THESE BECAUSE WE WERE ASKING ABOUT
16 A LOT OF ITEMS. WE SEE THE OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY TO
17 ENSURE AN EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC
18 TRANSIT. NOT A BIG SURPRISE THAT THAT IS POPULAR. 80% RATING
19 AS A PRIORITY, 45% STRONG PRIORITY, VOTERS LIKE OVERSIGHT AND
20 ACCOUNTABILITY. AND SOME OF THESE OTHERS WE SEE EVERYTHING
21 HERE ON THIS PAGE IS ABOVE 55% OF PRIORITY, SOME UP TO 70%. ON
22 THE TOP REQUIRING TRANSPORTATION PLAN HAS CLEAR GOALS ALONG
23 WITH FLEXIBILITY TO ADJUST AS NEEDS CHANGE. PRIORITIZING
24 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS IN HISTORICALLY DISADVANTAGED
25 COMMUNITIES, 66% PRIORITY, COMBINING THE 21 BAY AREA BUS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 OPERATORS INTO ONE BUS OPERATOR PER COUNTY TO GET BETTER
2 COORDINATED SERVICE AND SAVE TAXPAYER MONEY, 65%, HAVING ONE
3 REGIONAL AGENCY BE RESPONSIBLE FOR COORDINATING SCHEDULE AND
4 SIGNAGE AND ALL OF THOSE THINGS, 61% OF PRIORITY, AND THEN
5 MERGING BART AND CALTRAIN INTO ONE INTEGRATED SIZE 55%
6 PRIORITY. AND THEN WE DID SEE THAT ITEM IS A LITTLE MORE
7 POPULAR IN THE CALTRAIN COUNTIES, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN
8 MATEO. ON THE NEXT PAGE. I JUST HAVE A COUPLE MORE HERE. THIS,
9 ON THE NEXT PAGE WE HAVE -- SORRY. [LAUGHTER] WE HAVE WHAT'S
10 CALLED A FORCED CHOICE HERE. WE ASKED PEOPLE WHICH IS CLOSER
11 TO YOUR OPINION. SO, A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE SHOULD HAVE
12 CLEAR GOALS FOR HOW MONEY WILL BE SPENT WHILE ALLOWING
13 FLEXIBILITY BASED ON CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES AND TRANSPORTATION
14 DEMAND VERSUS IT SHOULD BE A DETAILED EXPENDITURE PLAN WITH
15 LIMITED ABILITY TO MAKE CHANGES. VOTERS WANT FLEXIBILITY. 70%
16 SAYING THEY WANT FLEXIBILITY, VERSUS 25% SAYING I WANT IT ALL
17 WRITTEN DOWN AND NOT CHANGED. I THINK AS WE ALL KNOW, WE HAVE
18 GONE THROUGH A VERY CHANGING, RAPIDLY CHANGING TRANSPORTATION
19 ENVIRONMENT, SO I THINK VOTERS RECOGNIZE THAT NOW. THEN ON THE
20 NEXT PAGE, WE DID, AFTER WE GAVE THAT WHOLE LONG LIST OF
21 THINGS THAT A MEASURE MIGHT FUND, THEN WE ALSO GAVE SOME
22 ARGUMENTS, VERY BRIEF ARGUMENTS, KIND OF IN FAVOR AND OPPOSED
23 OF EACH KIND OF TAX. SO WE SAID, FOR INSTANCE, HERE ARE SOME
24 STRENGTHS OF AN INCOME TAX, WEAKNESSES OF AN INCOME TAX, AND
25 WE ASK AGAIN NOW HOW WOULD YOU VOTE ON THIS MEASURE. AND WHAT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 WE SEE IS NOT A LOT OF CHANGE. THIS IS NOT A VIABILITY POLL.
2 WE DID NOT TEST EXTENSIVE CAMPAIGN TYPE MESSAGES WE WEREN'T
3 TRYING TO SIMULATE A PUBLICLY FUNDED CAMPAIGN EFFORT. BUT
4 GENERALLY WE SEE SUPPORT IS WHERE IT'S AT WITH THE SALES TAX
5 ENDING AT 53%, INCOME TAX 50% PAYROLL TAX 54%, RIGHT AROUND
6 THAT MAJORITY. ON THE NEXT PAGE AS I MENTIONED, WE DO THINK
7 MOOD IS IMPORTANT HERE. ON TOP THE BLUE LINE IS THE PERCENTAGE
8 THAT VOTED -- THAT THEY SAID THEY WOULD VOTE YES ON SALES TAX.
9 FROM POLLING CONDUCTED IN 2019. BEFORE COVID GREEN LINE IS THE
10 PERCENTAGE OF BAY AREA VOTERS THAT SAID THINGS ARE GOING IN
11 THE RIGHT TRACK, MAY OF 2019 WE SAW 66% SAYING THEY THOUGHT
12 RIGHT DIRECTION 38% SAME POLL RIGHT DIRECTION, 38%, 67% TAX
13 THEN IN NOVEMBER, 2019 WE START SEW SEE RIGHT DIRECTION, GOING
14 DOWN A BIT. MARCH OF 2022, RIGHT DIRECTION 21%, SUPPORT FOR
15 SALES TAX 57 THEN IT GOES UP IN THIS PAST MARCH, 39% SAYING
16 RIGHT DIRECTION THE SUPPORT FOR SALES TAX WAS AT 63, RIGHT
17 DIRECTION, 33 SUPPORT AT 55. IS THIS THE ONLY FACTOR? NO. IT
18 IS NOT THE ONLY FACTOR BUT WE ARE SEEING IN OTHER POLLING
19 WE'RE CONDUCTING ON OTHER ITEMS, ON SCHOOLS, ON FIRE ALL OTHER
20 REVENUE MEASURES TESTING AROUND THE STATE WE'RE SEEING LOWER
21 SUPPORT AS OPTIMISM COMES DOWN PEOPLE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT COST
22 OF LIVING, CONCERNED ABOUT OTHER ISSUES AS WELL. SO, YOU KNOW,
23 WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW -- SORRY, NEXT PAGE. I TURNED IT ON MY
24 LAPTOP BUT IT DIDN'T CHANGE. [LAUGHTER] BUT WE SEE OVERALL,
25 YOU KNOW, THE BAY AREA VOTERS BELIEVE PUBLIC TRANSIT IS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IMPORTANT. I BELIEVE IN ALL -- IN WORKING ON THIS FOR YEARS,
2 WHAT VOTERS WANT IS FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT TO GET BETTER. SO THEY
3 CAN TAKE IT MORE. THEY WANT TO SEE IMPROVEMENT. THEY WANT TO
4 BRING CHANGE. THEY BELIEVE IT'S THE RIGHT THING TO DO, AND
5 THEY BELIEVE AND THEY WANT IT TO GET BETTER. MEASURES ARE
6 SLIGHTLY ABOVE MAJORITY. THAT'S WHERE WE ARE NOW. AND WE HAVE
7 TO REMEMBER, IT'S A LONG WAY UNTIL AN ELECTION IN NOVEMBER, A
8 POTENTIAL ELECTION IN NOVEMBER 2026, AND ATTITUDES ARE GOING
9 TO CHANGE. YOU KNOW? WE'RE IN A REALLY CHANGING ENVIRONMENT,
10 ESPECIALLY RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION. BECAUSE OUR COMMUNITY
11 HABITS ARE GOING TO CHANGE OFFICE USE IS GOING TO CHANGE ARE
12 PEOPLE GOING TO BE OPEN IT TAKING TRANSIT, ARE THEY GOING TO
13 LEAVE THEIR HOUSE MORE. WE'LL SEE WHAT HAPPENS. AND ALSO
14 OVERALL MOOD IN THE COUNTRY AND IN THE BAY AREA COULD CHANGE A
15 LOT IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS. THERE ARE A LOT OF FACTORS. THAT
16 ARE COMPLETELY BEYOND OUR CONTROL THAT AFFECT VOTER MOOD. SO
17 WE CONTINUE TO WATCH THAT. THANK YOU, AND I CAN TAKE
18 QUESTIONS.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. DO ANY MEMBERS HAVE ANY COMMENTS
21 FOR RUTH? COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU RUTH NICE TO SEE
24 THE RESULTS OF POLLING COMING THROUGH AND THE BIG QUESTION IS
25 UNDERSTANDING THE MOOD AND UNDERSTANDING, IT'S INTERESTING



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THAT -- YOU KNOW, WHATEVER "GET BETTER" MEANS WHEN HALF OF THE
2 PEOPLE AREN'T NECESSARILY TAKING TRANSIT, WHAT DOES GET BETTER
3 MEAN TO THEM, VERSUS WHAT DOES GET BETTER MEAN TO THOSE -- AND
4 YOU HAD MORE DETAIL REGARDING WHAT GET BETTER MEANS TO THOSE
5 WHO TAKE TRANSIT, WHICH IS UNDERSTANDABLE. BECAUSE THEY HAVE
6 THE EVERYDAY EXPERIENCES AND A FEW MORE TRIPS OR WHATEVER IT
7 MAY BE. AND I TAKE IT THAT ANY KIND OF FUTURE POLLING WOULD GO
8 INTO A DEEPER DIVE ON THOSE KIND OF MATTERS. BECAUSE I THINK
9 THE BIG QUESTION -- I KNOW I'M INTERESTED IN -- IF THE NUMBERS
10 ARE GETTING CLOSE TO WHERE THERE COULD BE SUCCESS, WOULD
11 PEOPLE VOTE FOR SOMETHING THAT IS STATUS QUO? OR DOES IT HAVE
12 TO BE A SIGNIFICANT CHANGE? AND WHAT DOES SIGNIFICANT CHANGE
13 THEN MEAN, AND HOW DO WE ACTUALLY, YOU KNOW, PUT THAT DOWN.
14 WHETHER IT'S, HONESTLY, YOU KNOW, ALL THE REFORMS AND
15 CONSOLIDATION, WHICH IS A BIG SCARY WORD FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE
16 AND WHAT ARE THE CONSEQUENCES OF THAT. WHEN YOU ASK THOSE
17 QUESTIONS THOSE ARE JUST ASKED AS WRITTEN WITHOUT
18 UNDERSTANDING WHAT HAPPENS IF THAT WERE TO BE ENACTED?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YEAH.

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** THAT'S WHAT I FIGURED. SO GOING FORWARD WOULD BE
23 THE NEXT STEP, IF WE WERE TO GO IN THAT, WHENEVER THAT MAY BE,
24 WOULD TRY TO ASCERTAIN WHAT WOULD HAVE TO HAPPEN TO REALLY GET
25 PEOPLE EXCITED TO SAY, OKAY, NOW I SEE LIGHT AT THE END OF THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TUNNEL AND THIS IS A DIFFERENT APPROACH. LESS QUESTIONS IN
2 THERE AND MORE COMMENTS, I REALIZE, BUT JUST TRYING TO TAKE
3 THAT OUT OF WHAT YOU PRESENTED. AND I APPRECIATE THE WORK.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

7

8 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CANEPA. I AGREE WITH SOME OF
9 THE COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONER RABBITT. I THINK THE POSITIVES,
10 ARE THE FACT THAT THOSE WHO ARE USING OUR SYSTEMS BELIEVE WE
11 NEED TO MAKE MORE IMPROVEMENTS I THINK THAT'S A HUGE POSITIVE.
12 THAT DATA STOOD OUT TO ME AND AS WE GO FORWARD LOOKING AT
13 THOSE NOT RIDING TRANSIT, THEIR OPINIONS ARE, SO THEY'RE THE
14 CONVERTERS THAT WE CAN CONVERT. RUTH, FOR ME, WHEN I LOOK AT
15 THIS, I LOOK AT BASELINE MEMBERS ATTITUDES AND I LOOK AT
16 REFORMS AND I SEE POLLING, SUPPORT FOR REFORMS, TO ME THEY
17 INDICATE WHAT'S MOVING PEOPLE, AND THEY'RE GENERAL -- YOU'RE
18 RIGHT COMMISSIONER RABBITT -- BUT IT DOES HIT ON SOME OF THE
19 REFORMS IT SEEMS LIKE REFORMS 80%, 70%, 60%, THOSE ARE PRETTY
20 HIGH NUMBERS. IS THAT NORMAL?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I THINK, AGAIN, IT SPEAKS TO VOTERS LOOKING FOR
23 IMPROVEMENTS. THEY WANT THE SYSTEM -- YOU KNOW, GOING BACK TO
24 THE BEGINNING MANY PEOPLE ARE CRITICAL OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM
25 AND THEY WANT IT TO GET BETTER. SO I THINK THE SUPPORT FOR



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 REFORMS IS GENERALLY SAYING, I WANT IMPROVEMENTS. IF YOU ARE
2 TELLING ME THIS IS GOING TO MAKE IT FASTER, MORE RELIABILITY,
3 MORE CONVENIENT, THEN I LIKE T.

4

5 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT THE WAY I INTERPRETED IT TOO. TO ME THE
6 NEXT ITEM IS GOING TO BE A GREAT ITEM BUT IT LEADS ME TO
7 BELIEVE THIS IS WHAT THE PUBLIC IS ASKING FOR, THESE
8 ENHANCEMENTS THIS, IS HOW IT MAKES THE TRANSIT SYSTEM OPERATE
9 MORE EFFICIENTLY IN OUR REGION. AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR THE
10 REPORT.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER?

13

14 **SUE NOACK:** YES, JUST A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. ONE OF THE THINGS
15 THAT I NOTICED THROUGHOUT THE PRESENTATION IS TRANSPORTATION
16 VERSUS TRANSIT, AND THE CONFUSION IN THE PUBLIC, POTENTIALLY,
17 WITH THAT. YOU KNOW, A LOT OF PEOPLE WHEN THEY HEAR TRANSIT
18 THEY -- AT LEAST THOSE IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY WOULD THINK
19 BART, AND, PRETTY MUCH, SOLELY BART. DESPITE THE FACT THAT THE
20 BUS SYSTEMS ARE ALSO IN TRANSIT, IN THEIR MIND IT'S BART, AND
21 BART GETS A LOT OF PRESS, MOSTLY NEGATIVE, I WOULD HAVE TO
22 SAY, AND, SO, SOME OF THAT PERCEPTION FROM MEDIA, SOME
23 REALITY, RIGHT. SO, AND THE OTHER PART, THE TRANSPORTATION
24 PART IS REALLY POTHOLES AND STREET REPAIRS AND THINGS LIKE
25 THAT. SO, YOU KNOW, I'M HOPING THAT AS WE GO DOWN THE LINE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 FURTHER, WE DIG DEEPER AND REALLY CLARIFY TRANSPORTATION
2 VERSUS TRANSIT AND WHERE THOSE REAL NEEDS FOR IMPROVEMENT ARE
3 AND WHAT THEY'RE REALLY LOOKING AT. BECAUSE I THINK SOME OF
4 THOSE QUESTIONS GET CONFUSED IN A POLL. SO, THAT'S -- YOU
5 KNOW, THAT'S REALLY MY BIG COMMENT HERE. AND I THINK -- I
6 THINK, HOPEFULLY, IN THREE YEARS, WE ALSO LOOK AT THIS DATA
7 AND SAY WHAT CAN BE DONE OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS TO ALSO
8 MAKE PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THE INFORMATION BETTER AND WHAT CAN BE
9 DONE AND CAN'T BE DONE IN HOPES OF MAKING THOSE, ESPECIALLY
10 THE NON-RIDERS UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY'RE REALLY LOOKING AT AS
11 POTENTIAL CHANGES. THANKS.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK
16 YOU RAISED AN INTERESTING POINT JUST NOW THAT THE POTHoles ARE
17 WHAT SELL THIS MEASURE TO THE NON-RIDERS, RIGHT? THAT'S WHAT'S
18 IN IT FOR THEM. MAYBE BETTER ROADS FOR THE BUSES AND FOR THEM,
19 SO, SOMETHING FOR EVERYONE. I WANT TO THANK YOU, RUTH, FOR
20 YOUR PRESENTATION, AND ASK AT THE END OF ALL THE COMMENTS, IF
21 YOU COULD REINFORCE SOME OPPORTUNITIES YOU SEE BASED ON
22 RESULTS ARE. IN OTHER WORDS, HOW DO WE GO FORWARD. FOR
23 INSTANCE, ONE OF THE THINGS I WANT TO OBSERVE TO MY COLLEAGUES
24 IS IN FUTURE MESSAGING, THAT A LOT IN OUR NETWORK MANAGEMENT
25 MEETING WE'LL TALK ABOUT THE INPUTS TO BETTER RELIABILITY.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 AND, SO, SIGNAGE AND SEEING FARES AND THIS AND THAT; THOSE ARE
2 NOT THE OUTCOMES THAT IS WHAT OUR CONSTITUENTS WANT. SO, WE
3 HAVE TO BE VERY CLEAR ON MESSAGING THAT WHAT WE'RE WORKING ON
4 IS NOT WHAT'S GONNA TO SELL. IT IS IN THE END, BUT THAT ISN'T
5 GOING TO BE OUR MESSAGE POINT WHICH IS MORE RELIABILITY, AND
6 SAFETY, AND FREQUENCY, AND ALL THAT. I THINK WE NEED TO
7 FEATURE STORIES FOR RIDERS ABOUT HOW IT WORKS FOR THEM.
8 THEY'RE GOING TO BE OUR STRONGER ADVOCATES TO THOSE THAT DON'T
9 RIDE OR WHO DON'T RIDE AS FREQUENTLY. AND I THINK BETTER STORY
10 TELLING ALL AROUND ABOUT THE HISTORY OF TRANSIT IN THE BAY
11 AREA. I KNOW ONE OF THE REASONS I MOVED FROM LOS ANGELES TO
12 THE BAY AREA IS BECAUSE THE BAY AREA HAD BART AND WE DIDN'T.
13 AND I THOUGHT THAT WAS FORWARD THINKING. WE NEED TO BUILD ON
14 THAT. THIS IS DISTINCTIVE, AND I THINK THAT'S WHY BART AND
15 CALTRAIN, THIS IS WHY PEOPLE BELIEVE IN TRANSIT IN THE BAY
16 AREA BECAUSE WE HAVE THAT HISTORY THAT OTHER COMMUNITIES IN
17 CALIFORNIA DON'T. MORE COMMENTS THAN QUESTIONS. BUT LOVE YOUR
18 FURTHER THOUGHTS IF YOU HAVE ANY, RUTH, WHEN WE CAN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I THINK, AS I SAID, I BELIEVE THAT WHAT BAY AREA
21 RESIDENTS WANT IS, IT'S BETTER. MORE RELIABLE, MORE
22 CONVENIENT. I THINK THEY BELIEVE IN TRANSIT AND WANT TO TAKE
23 IT, AND THEY DON'T FEEL LIKE IT'S ACCESSIBLE FOR THEM, FOR
24 MANY PEOPLE. AND SO IMPROVEMENTS IS WHAT I THINK PEOPLE WANT.
25 BUT WE ALSO HAVE TO RECOMMEND -- RECOGNIZE THAT IT'S VERY HARD



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 FOR PEOPLE TO ENVISION SOMETHING THAT ISN'T -- DOESN'T EXIST
2 IN FRONT OF THEM. SO, YOU KNOW, WE ALL KNOW WHAT OUR CURRENT
3 BUILT COMMUNITY IS. IT'S HARD TO ENVISION SOMETHING THAT ISN'T
4 THERE. SO, I THINK YOUR STORIES AND EXPLAINING TO PEOPLE WHAT
5 IT COULD BE IS A HUGE OPPORTUNITY.

6

7 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** UH-HUH. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU FOR THE SUMMARY OF THE POLL. THE
12 ONE THING THAT REALLY STANDS OUT, AND SEVERAL OF MY COLLEAGUES
13 HAVE MENTIONED, IS WHEN YOU INCLUDE REPAIRING POTHOLES,
14 REPAVING, IMPROVING SIDEWALKS ALL THOSE IMPROVEMENTS UPDATING
15 81%. AND, SO, I DON'T THINK THAT A MEASURE THAT JUST COUNTS ON
16 TRANSIT RIDERS WILL GET US OVER THE TOP. SO, IT'S GOING TO
17 HAVE SOME OF THESE OTHER TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS. AT LEAST
18 THAT'S THIS SNAPSHOT IN TIME, THAT'S WHAT IT TELLS ME. WHAT'S
19 THE ANALOGY OF THAT?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T WANT TO DRAW CONCLUSION WHAT WE THINK SHOULD
22 OR SHOULDN'T BE IN THE MEASURE. IT'S HARD TO SAY WHAT'S GOING
23 PASS. WE STILL DON'T KNOW WHAT THE FUNDING MECHANISM IS GOING
24 TO BE. WE'RE A LONG WAY FROM DETAIL.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WELL, IN JUST ASKING THAT QUESTION, THE
2 NUMBERS JUST JUMPED UP TO 81%. THAT TELLS YOU SOMETHING.
3 DOESN'T IT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I THINK, TO ME, VOTERS ARE SAYING, WE'RE ASKING FOR
6 IMPROVEMENTS. YOU FIGURE OUT HOW TO BRING US THOSE
7 IMPROVEMENTS. LIKE, THEY DON'T KNOW WHETHER THERE IS LOCAL
8 MONEY TO DO IT. AGAIN, THEY'RE SAYING WE WANT -- WE'RE TELLING
9 YOU WHAT WE WANT IMPROVED. YOU LEADERS GO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DO
10 IT IS KIND OF --

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OKAY. IT JUST SEEMS LIKE THERE IS A STRONG
13 SUPPORT -- AND I HAVE SEEN IT IN PREVIOUS POLLS WHERE, YOU
14 KNOW, POTHoles, REPAVING, SO IT IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND FOR ME,
15 I DON'T SEE HOW YOU WOULD HAVE A MEASURE THAT DOESN'T HAVE
16 SOME COMPONENT THAT DEALS WITH THAT ISSUE. I MEAN, THAT --
17 MOST OF THOSE THINGS DO IMPROVE TRANSIT, YOU KNOW, DOING THOSE
18 IMPROVEMENTS. SO, THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WHY DON'T WE GO TO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

21

22 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU CHAIR FOR ALLOWING ME TO
23 PARTICIPATE. SOME ARE THE COMMITTEE WEREN'T ABLE TO MAKE IT,
24 SO I WANTED TO JOIN IN AND I WANTED TO FIRST THANK MISS EDITH
25 FOR THE OVERVIEW OF THE SURVEY. I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 COMMENTS THAT WERE ALREADY MADE. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT
2 OVERVIEW OF ATTITUDES, BUT I THINK THERE IS, OBVIOUSLY, A LOT
3 MORE WORK THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE. WE HAVE DONE REVENUE MEASURES
4 FOR TRANSPORTATION IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. SO, A LOT OF THIS
5 INFORMATION IS ACTUALLY VERY -- TRACKS TO SOME OF THE RESULTS
6 THAT WE HAVE SEEN IN OUR COUNTY. AS COMMISSIONER SPERING
7 MENTIONED, YES, POTHOLES ALWAYS DO TEND TO GET -- RATE VERY
8 HIGH. AND I THINK THAT SPEAKS TO THE FACT THAT THERE IS A
9 LARGE POPULATION THAT DOESN'T RIDE TRANSIT. SO I THINK THEY
10 THINK, YOU KNOW, WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME, AND THAT WOULD BE THE
11 ROAD REPAIRS AND POTHOLES. AND I GUESS MY QUESTION WOULD BE,
12 LIKE, WHERE DO WE GO FROM HERE? THIS IS A NICE OVERVIEW, BUT,
13 YOU KNOW, I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN THE QUESTIONS OF, WITH THE
14 FOLKS WHO ARE NOT RIDING TRANSIT, YOU KNOW, WHAT WOULD MAKE
15 THEM RIDE TRANSIT, AND I UNDERSTAND THE COMMENT ABOUT MAYBE
16 THEY DON'T KNOW WHAT COULD HAPPEN OR WHAT THEY CAN ENVISION,
17 AND I WOULD SAY, YOU KNOW, THAT WOULD PROBABLY BE OUR JOB TO
18 TRY TO PRESENT A VISION OF WHAT COULD HAPPEN. AND, AGAIN, IN
19 OUR SOUTH COUNTY HERE WE'RE DOING THAT WITH A VISION PLAN FOR
20 A VTA. BUT, AS WE TALK ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WE OFTEN TALK ABOUT
21 THE CUSTOMER BEING CUSTOMER-CENTERED OR CLIENT-CENTERED SO
22 CERTAINLY ASKING OUR CURRENT RIDERS WHAT THEY WANT IS
23 IMPORTANT AND HELPFUL, BUT I'M, OBVIOUSLY, INTERESTED IN
24 EXPANDING OUR RIDERSHIP, SO I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO WORK ON,
25 HOW DO WE CONVINCe FOLKS, HOW DO WE SHOW FOLKS WHAT A REALLY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 STRONG TRANSIT SYSTEM COULD BE, AND HOW DO WE GET [NATIONAL
2 ANTHEM] ♪ "OH, SAY CAN YOU SEE, BY THE DAWN'S EARLY LIGHT,
3 WHAT SO PROUDLY WE HAILED, AT THE TWILIGHT'S LAST GLEAMING?
4 WHOSE BROAD STRIPES AND BRIGHT STARS, THROUGH THE PERILOUS
5 FIGHT, O'ER THE RAMPARTS WE WATCHED, WERE SO GALLANTLY
6 STREAMING. AND THE ROCKET'S RED GLARE, THE BOMBS BURSTING IN
7 AIR, GAVE PROOF THROUGH THE NIGHT, THAT OUR FLAG WAS STILL
8 THERE. OH SAY DOES THAT STAR SPANGLED BANNER YET WAVE, FOR THE
9 LAND OF THE FREE, AND THE HOME OF THE BRAVE." ♪ TO SUPPORT
10 THAT. THESE QUESTIONS, TO ME, ARE A LITTLE GENERAL. I THINK
11 EVERYBODY WANTS IMPROVEMENT. SO, IT'S NOT SUPER HELPFUL TO BE
12 HONEST, TO SEE THAT. IT'S KIND OF OBSTACLE. BUT I THINK MAYBE
13 WE NEED TO MAYBE DRILL DOWN TO UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, WHAT ARE
14 PEOPLE LOOKING FOR THAT WOULD GET THEM OUT OF THEIR CARS AND
15 ON TO TRANSIT. SO, I GUESS THAT WOULD BE MY QUESTION IS, IT
16 MIGHT BE MORE TO THE COMMITTEE, OR STAFF, LIKE, WHAT DO WE DO
17 WITH THIS INFORMATION? WHERE DO WE GO FROM HERE. I THINK THERE
18 IS A LOT MORE DETAILS THAT WE NEED TO GET BEFORE WE REALLY
19 MAKE SOME STRONG -- SOME FORMED DECISIONS ON WHERE WE GO.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. COMMISSIONER
23 PAPAN?

24



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I THINK THE MOST SIGNIFICANT
2 ASPECT OF THIS IS SOMETHING WE HAVE ALREADY KNOWN. THIS IS
3 VERY REPETITIVE. OF COURSE, WE KNOW THE PUBLIC WANTS TO BE
4 BETTER. WANTS TRANSIT TO BE BETTER. BUT THE 80% REQUIRING
5 OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY, I THINK THAT'S WHERE THIS
6 COMMITTEE HAS THE GREATEST POTENTIAL. AND WE NEED TO HAVE
7 TEETH. WE NEED TO MAKE IT HAPPEN. WE HAVE TRIED OVER AND OVER
8 AGAIN, THE LEGISLATURE HAS TRIED. I THINK WHAT THE PUBLIC
9 WANTS IS REAL HONEST RESULTS. AND WE HAVE KNOWN FOREVER. WITH
10 THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT PLAN, RECOVERY PLAN, WE HAVE LAID IT
11 ALL OUT. AND NOT ENOUGH HAS HAPPENED. SO, I THINK WHEN WE TAKE
12 THIS TYPE OF RESEARCH, AGAIN, IT'S NOT UNUSUAL, BUT WHATEVER
13 WE DO WITH IT -- AND WE NEED TO DO WITH IT -- WE REALLY DON'T
14 NEED LEGISLATORS OR STAKEHOLDERS RUNNING AWAY WITH CERTAIN
15 ASPECTS OF THIS. WE NEED TO SHAPE A SITUATION THAT THE PUBLIC
16 WILL KNOW WE MEAN IT. AND WE ARE GOING TO GET RESULTS. SO, I
17 THINK THAT'S WHERE I HOPE WE CAN BE VERY CAREFUL IN OUR
18 DISCUSSIONS MOVING FORWARD. A FIRE STORM WAS STARTED ON SOME
19 OF THESE QUESTIONS. AND I UNDERSTAND, THE PUBLIC COULD BE
20 EASILY CONFUSED. THE PUBLIC DOESN'T REALLY UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU
21 MEAN BY MERGING CALTRAIN AND BART AND WHAT THE SIGNIFICANCE OF
22 SOMETHING LIKE THAT IS. WE'LL GET TO, PROBABLY, IN THE NEXT
23 ITEM, BUT, AGAIN, I THINK THAT QUESTION, THAT 80% IS WHERE
24 THIS BODY CAN MAKE THE MOST DIFFERENCE. AND I HOPE WE DO. WE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 STAY REALLY FOCUSED ON NO LOOPHOLES, NO ESCAPES, BUT WHAT THE
2 PUBLIC WANTS AND WHAT WE CAN ACTUALLY MAKE HAPPEN. THANKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
5 VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THANK YOU. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH
8 FOR THIS POLLING AND THE RESULTS. CERTAINLY THEY'RE GOING TO
9 HELP INFORM THE NEXT ITEM. AND THAT'S REALLY WHERE I WAS GOING
10 WITH THIS COMMENT. BECAUSE MY THOUGHTS, AS I READ THE POLLING
11 QUESTIONS, WHICH WERE DESIGNED TO BE BROAD, DID GIVE US WHAT
12 WE NEEDED TO KNOW IN TERMS OF ATTITUDE. BUT, AS COMMISSIONER
13 PAPAN JUST MENTIONED, WHAT WE REALLY NEED TO DO, IN ESSENCE,
14 IS THE DEEPER DIVE, WHAT DO THESE THINGS MEAN. SO, THAT'S WHY
15 I'M REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT ITEM, WHEN WE DO GET
16 INTO THAT CONVERSATION. BUT I THINK THIS IS A GOOD STARTING
17 POINT TO HELP INFORM US IN THAT CONVERSATION. SO, THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** PEDROZA?

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I JUST WANT TO SAY A FINAL COMMENT. I AGREE
22 WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS OF ASKING THE QUESTION. YOU
23 KNOW, THE THING I'LL SAY IS WE DID A MARK ON THIS, WE STARTED
24 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, WE PROPPED UP NETWORK MANAGEMENT.
25 I THINK THE QUESTION WE'RE ASKING IS IT ENOUGH TO KEEP MAKING



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE WANT TO SEE FOR OUR REGION. IN SHORT-TERM
2 DELIVERABLES THE POLL VALIDATES WHAT WE'RE HEARING, LET'S DO
3 THINGS NOW, THE QUESTION IS WHAT CAN WE DO, DO WE HAVE THE
4 AUTHORITY AND WHAT ARE THE BIG TICKET ITEMS WE NEED TO DISCUSS
5 THAT ARE TRANSFORMATIONAL FOR OUR REGION. THIS IS THE RIGHT
6 TIME TO HAVE THIS DISCUSSION, THE POLLING, DATA VALIDATES THAT
7 THE PUBLIC WANTS THIS DISCUSSION. NOW IT'S UP TO COMMISSION
8 LEADERSHIP TO MAKE SURE IT'S TIGHT, DEFINED AND IS PRODUCING
9 OUTCOMES THAT ARE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR THE CUSTOMER. I SURE
10 HOPE IT WAS CAPTURING EVERYTHING. THE POINT IS, THIS IS A
11 GREAT SEGUE TO THE NEXT CONVERSATION. I JUST AGREE WITH MANY
12 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO TAKE PUBLIC
15 COMMENT FIRST. WE'LL ALLOCATE A MINUTE. WE'LL GO TO ZOOM.
16 LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT FIRST. FIRST IS CHARLIE LAVERY.

17

18 **CHARLIE LAVERY:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS CHARLIE LAVERY WITH
19 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL OPERATING ENGINEERS LOCAL THREE.
20 EXTENSIVE EXPERIENCE ON TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURES
21 CAMPAIGNS INCLUDING RM3 AND MEASURE L LAST YEAR WHICH PASSED
22 72% SAN FRANCISCO, I THINK OUR COLLECTIVE EXPERIENCE IN THOSE
23 CAMPAIGNS TELLS US THAT SUCCESSFUL MEASURE CONSIDER THE
24 INTERESTS AND TAKES INPUT FROM BUSINESS, LABOR, AND COMMUNITY.
25 AND THAT THEIR ULTIMATE PASSAGE IS DEPENDENT ON A SUPPORTIVE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 COALITION OF THOSE GROUPS. CONSTRUCTION UNIONS AND THEIR
2 EMPLOYERS SPENDING A LOT OF ENERGY AND RESOURCES TO SUPPORT
3 THIS KIND OF MEASURE TO GENERATE JOBS FOR THEIR MEMBERS AND
4 CREATE THE INFRASTRUCTURE WE NEED FOR SUSTAINED REGIONAL AND
5 ECONOMIC GROWTH. I THINK THE POLLING SUPPORTS THE NEED FOR
6 IMPROVEMENTS, AND WE WANT TO SUPPORT A MEASURE THAT MEETS
7 THOSE NEEDS, HAS BROAD APPEAL AND WILL PASS.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU, MR. LAVERY. CAN WE GO TO ZOOM?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. FIRST UP IS GREG GREENWAY FOLLOWED BY
12 PUBLIC ADVOCATES. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GREG GREENWAY SPEAKING FOR SAN
15 MATEO COUNTY WE SUBMITTED A LETTER TO THE COMMITTEE. MY
16 COMMENTS MIGHT BE MORE APPROPRIATE FOR THE NEXT ITEM. BUT I'M
17 SPEAKING ABOUT POTENTIAL ITEMS TO BE INCLUDED IN THE TRANSIT
18 MEASURE. SPECIFICALLY THE --

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT'S THE NEXT ITEM.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'LL JUST MAKE MY COMMENTS. I CAN CONNECT THEM. THE
23 QUESTION IN THE POLL ABOUT SEAMLESS BAY AREA TRANSIT NETWORK
24 WITH COORDINATED FARES ROUTES AND SCHEDULED SIGNAGE. SO THERE
25 IS A LOT OF CONCERN IN SAN MATEO COUNTY ABOUT THIS ISSUE,



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 PARTICULARLY THE IDEA THAT CALTRAIN MIGHT BE INTEGRATED WITH
2 BART OR OTHER AGENCIES. I UNDERSTAND WE'RE EARLY IN THE
3 CONVERSATION BUT THE POINT OF OUR LETTER AND MY COMMENT IS TO
4 FLAG THAT AS SOMETHING OF CONCERN. WE DEFINITELY SUPPORT THE
5 GOAL OF HAVING AN INTEGRATED TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA
6 THAT MAKES IT EASY FOR TRANSIT RIDERS TO MOVE FROM ONE MODE TO
7 ANOTHER. WE HAVE 1500 MEMBERS REPRESENTING 100,000 EMPLOYEES
8 IN --

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, GREG. AS A REMINDER THIS, IS
11 FOR AGENDA ITEM 3A, BAY AREA REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION EFFORTS
12 FOR THE SURVEY. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE NEXT ITEM,
13 3B PLEASE LOWER YOUR HAND NOW AND RAISE YOUR HAND AGAIN LATER
14 FOR THIS ITEM WHEN IT'S APPROPRIATE. NEXT UP IS PUBLIC
15 ADVOCATES FOLLOWED BY ANDREW. GO AHEAD PUBLIC ADVOCATES.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER, AND I AM A MEMBER OF
18 THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT COALITION. AND I AM A TRANSIT
19 RIDER, MYSELF. WE APPRECIATE MTC INCLUDING AN INCOME TAX
20 REVENUE OPTION IN THE POLL, BUT THE LACK OF INCOME THRESHOLD
21 LIKELY IMPACTED ITS SUPPORT IN THE RESULTS. IN MARCH OF
22 2020BPT POLLED BAY AREA VOTERS WITH OPTIONS OF INCOME TAX
23 THRESHOLD AT \$300,001,000,000 AND SUPPORT FOR ALL THREE
24 VARIATIONS WITH HIGHER THAN FOR SALES TAX. WE ASK MTC ADOPT AN
25 INCOME THRESHOLD AS PART OF AN INCOME TAX IN THE AUTHORIZING



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 LEGISLATION OF FUTURE POLLING AS WE FEEL THIS WILL HAVE AN
2 IMPACT ON THE RESULTS AND SUPPORT FOR THAT OPTION. THANK YOU
3 VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE YOUR WORK ON THIS. HAVE A WONDERFUL
4 DAY.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU EMILY. NEXT UP IS ANDREW FOLLOWED BY RAY
7 MUELLER. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY NAME IS ANDREW. AND I'M GLAD
10 TO SEE IN THE POLLING INCLUDED CONSIDERATION OF AN INCOME TAX
11 AND A PAYROLL TAX THIS TRANSPORTATION TAX MEASURE. PREVIOUS
12 TRANSPORTATION TAX MEASURES ONLY CONSIDERED SALES TAXES AS
13 FUNDING MEASURES. AND THE ONES THAT I'M MOST FAMILIAR WITH ARE
14 THE 2016 SANTA CLARA CAN'T MEASURE BE IN THE 2018 SAN MATEO
15 COUNTY MEASURE W. THOSE ONLY CONSIDERED SALES TAXES WHICH ARE
16 THE MOST DAMAGING TYPE OF TAX THAT YOU COULD CONSIDER. THE
17 LOWEST INCOME PEOPLE PAY THE HIGHEST PERCENTAGE FROM SALES
18 TAXES. AND YOU INCREASE IT EVEN MORE IT MAKES IT HARDER TO
19 LIVE HERE IN THE BAY AREA HOWEVER A PAYROLL TAX WHICH WOULD BE
20 A TAX ON JUST LARGE CORPORATIONS OR COULD BE LIMITED TO LARGE
21 WEALTHY CORPORATIONS THAT IS THE LEAST ECONOMICALLY HARMFUL
22 TYPE OF TAX. I VERY MUCH WOULD SUPPORT THAT INCOME TAX ON
23 ONLINE HIGH INCOME INDIVIDUALS WOULD BE A BETTER IDEA AS WELL.
24



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS RAY MUELLER,
2 FOLLOWED BY PETER STRAUSS. RAY GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YEP.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. I'M SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF LAWYERS TODAY FROM
9 CALTRAN -- CALTRAIN AND SAMTRANS. I SERVE ON THOSE BOARDS. I
10 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT I NOTED FOR THE COMMISSION THAT EVERY
11 MEMBER OF THE CALTRAIN BOARD, DELEGATIONS FROM SAN FRANCISCO
12 SAN JOSE AND SAN MATEO VOTED FOR THAT LETTER INCREDIBLY
13 CONCERNS THAT POLLING WAS DONE ON CONSOLIDATION WITHOUT EVEN
14 DISCUSSING WITH CALTRAIN FEASIBILITY OF SUCH AND COST BENEFITS
15 NOR WITH BUILDING SUPPORTING PUBLIC POLICY ANALYSIS AND
16 PERCENTAGE TO THE PUBLIC IN THE POLLING THAT WOULD NEED TO BE
17 DONE FIRST SO THEY COULD BE EDUCATED AND TO DO SO IN SUPPORT
18 OF A BALLOT MEASURE IS, FRANKLY, AND TO CONSIDER MOVING
19 FORWARD WITH A BALLOT MEASURE WITHOUT DOING THAT IS SOMEWHAT
20 RECKLESS. FROM A SUBSTANTIVE ISSUE, CONSOLIDATED FROM A SHARED
21 SERVICES PERSPECTIVE WITH SAMTRANS. SO, THERE IS NO-COST
22 SAVINGS THERE. AND SO I WOULD JUST, AGAIN, SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF
23 THOSE LETTERS AND ASK THE BOARD TO CONSIDER THEM IN YOUR
24 DELIBERATIONS TODAY.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PETER STRAUSS FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** PETER STRAUSS. I'M ON THE BOARD OF SAN FRANCISCO
4 TRANSIT RIDERS, ALSO VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I SEE
5 THE CLOCK ISN'T GOING. AM I BEING HEARD?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THANK YOU FOR CATCHING THAT.
8 APPRECIATE IT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO UNDERSCORE POINTS EMILY WHEELER MADE THAT
11 THE INCOME TAXES QUESTION HERE -- AND THANK YOU FOR DOING THIS
12 SURVEY -- THIS IS EXTREMELY VALUABLE. BUT THE INCOME TAX
13 QUESTION ONLY A FLAT TAX WHICH SCORED SLIGHTLY LOWER IN THE
14 PAST THAN WHEN INCOME TAX HAS BEEN ASKED AND ONE THAT IS
15 TARGETED AS HIGHER INCOME LEVELS IT TENDS TO SCORE SLIGHTLY
16 HIGHER THAN OTHER TAXES THAT WERE PARTS OF SURVEYS. IN
17 PARTICULAR, IT IS IMPORTANT THAT WE STRESS THAT NON-REGRESSIVE
18 TAXES ARE OPPORTUNITIES NOT JUST REGRESSIVE SALES TAXES. THANK
19 YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU PETER. AND LAST WE HAVE ADINA
22 LEVIN. ADINA UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN WITH FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN. AND WANTED
25 TO SPEAK TO THE QUESTIONS RAISED BY COMMISSIONERS ABOUT WHAT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IS THIS POLL SHOW ABOUT THE OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE THE PUBLIC
2 BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN A MEASURE WOULD GO ON THE BALLOT. AND
3 THERE WAS BOTH THE RESPONSES FROM NOT -- BECAUSE PEOPLE WHO
4 RIDE ARE MUCH MORE POSITIVE, THERE ARE SOME EXCITING
5 OPPORTUNITIES IN THE NEXT YEAR WHEN WE HAVE OPEN PAYMENT, THE
6 ABILITY TO PAY WITH YOUR CREDIT AND DEBIT CARD TO TAKE IMPULSE
7 RIDES ON TRANSIT. SURVEY FROM A WHILE AGO ON CALTRAIN SAID
8 THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE HAVE A SPECIAL EVENT AS THEIR FIRST TIME
9 OF USING TRANSIT THAT'S A GREAT OPPORTUNITY. THE TRANSIT
10 RIDERS ARE GOING TO BE THE VOLUNTEER BASE FOR A MEASURE. SO
11 THEY'RE REALLY IMPORTANT BEYOND OUR NUMBERS BECAUSE WE'RE THE
12 PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING TO BE OUT DOING THE FIELD THAT WILL BE
13 THE MARGIN OF VICTORY IN A CAMPAIGN. THANK YOU

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU ADINA. THERE ARE NO OTHER
16 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.
17 AND WHEN THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS MENTIONED SUBMITTING LETTERS THEY
18 SUBMITTED ONLY FOR ITEM 3B THERE WAS NO CORRESPONDENCE
19 RECEIVED FOR ITEM 3A.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK
22 RUTH. I DO THINK THE POLL IS QUITE INFORMATIVE. I THINK WHAT
23 THE POLL SAYS TO ME -- AND I KNOW THERE IS A LOT MORE WORK
24 THAT NEEDS TO BE DONE, BUT WE'RE ON THE RIGHT PATH. AND I
25 THINK WHEN WE MAKE THESE DECISIONS, THE DECISION WE HAVE TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 MAKE IS WHAT'S BEST, NOT FOR ANY ORGANIZATION, NOT FOR
2 OPERATORS BUT WHAT'S BEST FOR THE RIDERS. WHAT STRUCK ME ON
3 SLIDE FOUR, WITH THE ISSUE OF CRIME AND HOMELESSNESS. AND I
4 THINK THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. BUT I SEE A TREMENDOUS
5 OPPORTUNITY, AND THAT OPPORTUNITY IS REALLY PARTNERING WITH
6 CITIES, WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS. BUT THIS ISSUE OF CRIME AND
7 HOMELESSNESS, WE REALLY HAVE TO BE LASER FOCUSED. AND ONE OF
8 THE THINGS THAT THE POLL REALLY STOOD OUT FOR ME, AND I KNOW
9 WE'RE LOOKING AT A MEASURE, WE'RE ON THIS FISCAL CLIFF, THAT
10 WE CAN'T MOVE FORWARD WITH A MEASURE THAT DOESN'T HAVE AN
11 ACCOUNTABILITY PIECE TO IT. AND, SO, THE POLL -- AND WE HAVE
12 BEEN WORKING ON THIS FOR DECADES, ACCORDING TO SOME, AND I
13 KNOW WITH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THEN ALSO, YOU KNOW,
14 WITH THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER, THIS IS THE TIME TO MOVE
15 FORWARD. AND THAT BRINGS US, RE-BECK A INTO AGENDA ITEM 3B,
16 THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE UPDATE. AND
17 REBECCA, CAN YOU PLEASE GIVE US YOUR REPORT?

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR CANEPA I'LL OPEN. THE LAST POINT CHAIR
20 CANEPA IS A REALLY IMPORTANT ONE BECAUSE IT TRANSCENDS BETWEEN
21 TRANSIT AND WHAT WE HAVE TO DO TO KEEP THE CITY SAFE. THIS
22 PARTICULAR ITEM IS REALLY A RESPONSE TO THIS COMMITTEE'S
23 FEEDBACK OVER THE PAST TWO MONTHS TO STAFF TO COME BACK WITH
24 POTENTIAL REFORMS AND ACCOUNTABILITY THAT YOU HAVE ALL BEEN
25 TALKING ABOUT TO PAIR WITH THE NEW FUNDING THAT IS IN THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 ENABLING LEGISLATION DISCUSSION. BECAUSE IF WE ARE GOING TO BE
2 SUCCESSFUL IN ANY KIND OF A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, WE'RE
3 GOING TO HAVE TO DELIVER ON THE OUTCOMES AS WE HAVE BEEN
4 TALKING ABOUT, AND THEY ARE ASSOCIATED VERY DIRECTLY WITH THE
5 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. WE DID PUT IN THE STAFF REPORT TOP
6 LINE TAKEAWAYS FROM SEVERAL SIGNIFICANT STUDIES THAT MTC HAS
7 INITIATED OVER THE LAST 15 YEARS OR SO. AND I ALSO WANTED TO
8 REFLECT ON THE FACT THAT, NOT SURPRISINGLY, COMMISSIONER
9 SPERING, ALONG WITH COMMISSIONER GLOVER, AND COMMISSIONER
10 GIACOPINI ARE REALLY THE ONLY ONES THAT ARE STILL ON THE
11 COMMISSION THAT REALLY DID THAT HEAVY LIFTING. HOWEVER, THERE
12 ARE QUITE A FEW FOLKS IN SACRAMENTO THAT ALSO PARTICIPATED IN
13 THOSE DISCUSSIONS. SO, IT WAS CHAIRED BY SENATOR DODD, SENATOR
14 WIENER WAS INVOLVED, AS WAS SENATOR CORTESE, AND OTHERS. SO, I
15 DO THINK, REALLY TAKING A LOOK AT THAT GOOD WORK, AS CHAIR
16 CANAPA MENTIONED OVER THE LAST 15 YEARS, WILL HELP US AS WE
17 NAVIGATE FORWARD. AND I SEE SIMILARITIES IN THE WORK THAT
18 WE'RE DOING THAT WE JUST NEED TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DO BETTER
19 AND FASTER AND WORK WITH OUR OPERATOR PARTNERS. SO, THE
20 CONCLUSIONS ARE VERY SIMILAR. WE DO WANT TO CONTINUE TO TRY TO
21 CREATE AN OPTIMAL TRANSIT SYSTEM, AND AS WE HAVE SEEN IN THE
22 POLLS AND AS YOU ALL HAVE TALKED ABOUT, WE HAVE GOT TO FIND A
23 WAY TO TAP INTO FOLKS WHO ARE NOT RIDING TODAY AND MAKING
24 INCENTIVES AND OPPORTUNITIES TOWARDS THIS REAL IMPROVED



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TRANSIT SYSTEM TO MAKE IT WORK. I'LL TURN IT TO REBECCA TO
2 COVER THE ITEM.

3

4 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, ANDY. GOOD MORNING. I'M GOING TO
5 START ON PAGE TWO OF WHAT IS A VERY LONG MEMO. APOLOGIES FOR
6 THAT. BUT A LOT TO COVER. AND JUST REITERATE WE'RE BRINGING
7 THIS FORWARD AT THE REQUEST OF THE COMMITTEE TO PROVIDE YOU
8 WITH SOME SUBSTANTIVE IDEAS TO CONSIDER AS FAR AS ANY REFORM
9 PROVISIONS THAT SHOULD BE PART OF THE ENABLING LEGISLATION.
10 SO, WE THOUGHT IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE, YOU KNOW, SINCE
11 REFORM, IN AND OF ITSELF ISN'T REALLY THE GOAL, RIGHT? THAT
12 REFORM IS ABOUT HOW TO DRIVE OUTCOMES TO JUST RECAP WHAT THE
13 GOALS OF THE MEASURE ARE, AS FAR AS WHAT STAFF HAS PROPOSED SO
14 FAR. JUST AS A REMINDER, WE HAVEN'T HAD ANY ACTION TAKEN ON
15 THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION YET. WE'RE HOPING TO BRING THAT
16 FORWARD NEXT MONTH. AND JUST TO LET YOU ALL KNOW, WE ARE
17 PLANNING TO BRING AN ITEM TO THE FULL COMMISSION IN DECEMBER
18 THAT WOULD, KIND OF, TELL THE FULL STORY ABOUT THE MEASURE
19 OVERALL, SOME PRIORITIES WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, AS WELL AS
20 FEEDBACK FROM TODAY. BUT SO, ON PAGE TWO WE HIGHLIGHT THE
21 OVERARCHING GOAL IS TO HELP CREATE A CLIMATE FRIENDLY
22 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT IS SAFE, ACCESSIBLE, AND CONVENIENT
23 FOR ALL. THAT THERE ARE, SORT OF, THREE FOCUS AREA THAT WE
24 PROPOSE, PROTECTING AND ENHANCING TRANSIT SERVICE, MAKING
25 TRANSIT FASTER, SAFER, AND EASIER TO USE. AND THE THIRD ITEM



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IS REALLY THE BROADER NON-TRANSIT TYPES OF INVESTMENTS THAT WE
2 HEARD BOTH IN THE POLL AND IN OUR STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT. THIS
3 SAFE STREETS CATEGORY THAT WOULD INCLUDE POTHOLE REPAIRS, AS
4 WELL AS MAKING LOCAL ROADS MORE ACCESSIBLE, SAFER FOR PEOPLE
5 WALKING, BIKING, WHEELING, AND MAYBE SOME TRAFFIC CALMING IN
6 THERE. SO, WE, VERY MUCH, RECOGNIZE THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PIECE.
7 ABOUT HALF OF OUR REGION SAY THEY'RE NOT REALLY USING TRANSIT
8 AND IF THEY'RE GOING TO BE PAYING WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE
9 ARE BENEFITS FOR THEM TOO. ANOTHER GOAL IS FINANCIAL
10 SUSTAINABILITY OF THE REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WE DO THINK
11 AS WE ENGAGE IN THIS DIFFICULT CONVERSATION, BOTH IN NEXT YEAR
12 IN SACRAMENTO AND SUBSEQUENTLY, WHEN WE'RE TALKING TO VOTERS,
13 THEY'RE GOING TO WANT TO KNOW, YOU KNOW, IS THE SYSTEM BEING
14 ORGANIZED IN SUCH A WAY THAT IS OPTIMIZING THE RESOURCES, THE
15 TAX RESOURCES THAT IT HAS ALREADY. AND, SO, SOME OF THE
16 STUDIES THAT I'LL SUMMARIZE WERE FOCUSED MORE ON THAT COST
17 SAVING. ARE WE, YOU KNOW, POSITIONED MOST EFFECTIVELY TO
18 DELIVER CAPITAL PROJECTS ON TIME, AND, YOU KNOW, ON BUDGET,
19 WHICH IS OBVIOUSLY VERY CHALLENGING WITH MEGA PROJECTS. SO,
20 THAT, JUST FRAMING, I THINK IS REALLY INTENDED TO ADDRESS THE
21 WHAT AND THE HOW THAT WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT A LOT IN THIS
22 COMMITTEE. RIGHT? IS THAT WE'RE NOT PURSUING A TRANSPORTATION
23 MEASURE JUST TO PURSUE A MEASURE AND GET MORE MONEY. WE'RE
24 REALLY TRYING TO ACHIEVE THESE OUTCOMES. AND SO, THE WHAT ARE
25 THOSE OUTCOMES THAT I JUST SUMMARIZED. THOSE ARE THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 UNDERLYING GOALS OF THE MEASURE AND THEN THE HOW IS THE
2 FUNDING THAT WE ARE PROPOSING TO GET ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR
3 AND PUT BEFORE THE VOTERS, AS WELL AS, POTENTIALLY, SOME
4 POLICY PROVISIONS. AND THAT'S MORE THE REFORM IDEAS. OTHER
5 POLICY PROVISIONS COULD INCLUDE SOME TRAVEL DEMAND MANAGEMENT
6 PROVISIONS, SUCH AS, YOU KNOW, REQUIRING EMPLOYERS TO DO MORE
7 TO INCENTIVIZE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP. AND THERE WAS A QUESTION ON
8 THE POLL THAT SHOWED SOME STRONG SUPPORT. SO, DON'T NEED TO
9 RECAP THE POLL. BUT JUST JUMPING DOWN TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY IN
10 THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. THIS COMMISSION HAS DONE A
11 LOT ON THAT IN THE LAST SIX MONTHS OR SO. AND LATER THIS
12 AFTERNOON, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE IS GOING
13 TO BE MEETING. THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL HAS
14 RECENTLY BEEN STOOD UP AND THAT'S THE FORMAL ADVISORY BODY
15 CONSISTING OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS AS WELL AS OUR EXECUTIVE
16 DIRECTOR. THEN WE HAVE A NEW REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
17 CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP WITH THE GOAL REALLY OF HAVING TRANSIT
18 RIDERS AT THE TABLE HELPING GUIDE OUR PRIORITIES. AND, SO, ALL
19 OF THIS, YOU KNOW, IS CERTAINLY PROGRESS, YOU KNOW. IT'S
20 CERTAINLY PROGRESS. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE FORMALIZING
21 BOTH THE COMMISSION'S ROLE IN THIS SPACE THAT IS CODIFIED IN A
22 LOT OF STATUTORY PROVISIONS. AND YOU DO HAVE, AS AN ATTACHMENT
23 TO THIS ITEM, LIKE A SUMMARY OF THE DIFFERENT PROVISIONS IN
24 STATE LAW THAT EMPOWER AND DIRECT MTC TO PLAY THIS
25 COORDINATING ROLE. BUT IT IS A CONSENSUS-BASED APPROACH. THAT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IS INHERENTLY CHALLENGING WHEN YOU HAVE OVER TWO DOZEN
2 OPERATORS. IN THAT SCENARIO, A SINGLE OPERATOR OR A HANDFUL OF
3 OPERATORS REALLY CAN SLOW THINGS DOWN. AND I THINK THAT'S
4 WHERE EVEN OPERATORS THEMSELVES ARE FRUSTRATED THAT WE'RE NOT
5 MOVING AS FAST AS FOLKS WOULD LIKE IN THE WAKE OF THE
6 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. AND THAT DELAY DOES DRIVE UP COSTS
7 AND JUST SLOWS DOWN BENEFITS TO RIDERS. SO, A DIFFERENT MODEL
8 ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT WOULD BE A MORE EMPOWERED NETWORK
9 MANAGER THAT WOULD BE RESPONSIBLE FOR ADVANCING KEY CUSTOMER
10 PRIORITIES TO CREATE A MORE SEAMLESS SYSTEM. AND THAT IS SNAG
11 WE HAVE HEARD ABOUT A LOT OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS STARTING
12 WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER CHU'S BILL IN 2020, AND THEN 2021, AND
13 THEN CARRIED FORWARD LAST YEAR BY SENATOR BECKER. AND IN THOSE
14 BILLS, THEY WERE REALLY FOCUSED ON SPECIFIC INITIATIVES THAT
15 WERE ALREADY UNDERWAY AND BEING TALKED ABOUT IN THE REGION,
16 AND THEY DID LOOK TO MTC TO ASSUME SOME OF THAT
17 RESPONSIBILITY, AND FOR OPERATORS TO BE REQUIRED TO ADHERE TO
18 THESE POLICIES. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, AN OPTION WOULD BE TO
19 DESIGNATE MTC WITH THIS RESPONSIBILITY MORE CLEARLY IN
20 STATUTE. YOU KNOW, AGAIN, THERE IS KIND OF LANGUAGE THAT TALKS
21 ABOUT MTC, YOU KNOW, SHALL COORDINATE, AND SHALL DO THIS, BUT
22 IT'S REALLY ON US TO TRY TO MAKE THE OPERATORS COOPERATE. IT
23 DOESN'T KIND OF GO THE OTHER WAY AROUND AND TALK ABOUT THE
24 OPERATORS, YOU KNOW, WILL ABIDE BY THESE POLICIES. SO, THAT'S
25 ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT. AND THEN ON THE, SORT OF, MORE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 GOVERNANCE SIDE OF THINGS, JUST TO REALLY BREEZE THROUGH SOME
2 OF THESE STUDIES. STARTING WITH THE TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY --
3 EXCUSE ME -- STARTING WITH THE REGIONAL RAIL PLAN, IN 2007,
4 TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY PROJECT AND THEN THE MORE RECENT RAIL
5 PLAN, KEY FINDINGS OF THE TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY PROJECT WERE,
6 FOR EXAMPLE, THAT THE BAY AREA HAS ABOUT 228 INDIVIDUAL
7 TRANSIT DECISION MAKERS AT THE GOVERNING BOARD LEVEL AND THAT
8 INCLUDES EVERYTHING FROM LOCAL CITY COUNCILS, FROM MUNICIPAL
9 YOU OPERATORS, AS WELL AS SPECIFIC DISTRICTS, OR COUNTY BOARDS
10 OF SUPERVISORS. AND THAT THIS, YOU KNOW, SIGNIFICANT
11 FRAGMENTATION, LOOKED AT AS A REGION, WE DO HAVE HIGHER
12 ADMINISTRATIVE COST THAN LOOKING AT PEERS OF OTHER LARGE METRO
13 AREAS AND THAT WAS ESTIMATED IN 2012 AT COSTING ABOUT NEEDN'T
14 MILLION MORE THAN IF WE WERE AT THE AVERAGE WHICH WOULD BE
15 ABOUT 120 MILLION TODAY. THAT STUDY ALSO FOUND THAT
16 INSTITUTIONAL CONSOLIDATION COULD POTENTIALLY BE MORE COST
17 EFFECTIVE WHEN YOU ARE LOOKING AT SMALLER OPERATORS, MERGING
18 SMALLER WITH SMALLER, VERSUS MERGING A SMALLER OPERATOR INTO A
19 LARGER OPERATOR WOULD TEND TO GRAVITATE TO THE HIGHEST COST.
20 SO THERE, IS CLEARLY TRADE-OFFS THERE. AND YOU'RE NOT GOING TO
21 KNOW WHETHER YOU'RE GOING TO SAVE MONEY UNTIL YOU'RE LOOKING
22 AT ANY SPECIFIC CASE. AND THEN THE TFP DID FIND SOME KIND OF
23 BENEFITS ON JUST THE CUSTOMER SIDE RELATED TO TRANSIT
24 INTEGRATION. AND THOSE ARE SUMMARIZED ON PAGE SEVEN. AND WE DO
25 SEE SOME PROGRESS HERE. FOR EXAMPLE, JOINT PROCUREMENT OF



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SERVICES AND EQUIPMENT SOME OPERATORS ARE DOING THAT
2 VOLUNTARILY. SOME INSTITUTIONAL CONSOLIDATION HAS HAPPENED.
3 AND WE CAN LOOK AT THAT, YOU KNOW, WITH WETA. THE FERRY
4 SERVICE WERE A NUMBER OF SMALLER OPERATORS AND THEN ON FARE
5 STRUCTURE AND HARMONIZATION, WE'RE DEFINITELY MAKING PROGRESS
6 ALBEIT SOMEWHAT SLOW. AND THEN ON THE RAIL SIDE,
7 CHRONOLOGICALLY THE 2000 STUDY LOOKED AT BENEFITS THAT DID
8 INCLUDE THINGS THAT ARE STRICTLY NOT ON THE CAPITAL SIDE,
9 POTENTIAL MORE CENTRALIZED RAIL GOVERNANCE WOULD LIKELY HELP
10 WITH SCHEDULE COORDINATION, FARE INTEGRATION AND THE LIKE, NOT
11 TO SAY THAT THOSE THINGS CAN ONLY HAPPEN THROUGH SOME TYPE OF
12 INTEGRATION, BUT, YOU KNOW, MORE LIKELY TO HAPPEN THAT WAY.
13 AND THEN RISKS, THOUGH COULD BE AGAIN HIGHER LABOR COSTS.
14 POTENTIAL FOR WORK STOPPAGES, AND THEN AND FINALLY THE MOST
15 RECENT STUDY WAS CONDUCTED STARTING IN 2021 THROUGH THE EARLY
16 PART OF THIS YEAR AND IT DID FOCUS QUITE A BIT ON THE CAPITAL
17 SIDE NOTING THAT WE HAVE \$69 BILLION IN RAIL PROJECTS THAT ARE
18 IN OUR PLAN, AND THAT THE ABSENCE OF A CENTRAL ENTITY TO
19 OVERSEE THAT IS NOT OPTIMAL. YOU KNOW? FROM A DELIVERY
20 PERSPECTIVE, FROM A CENTRALIZED EXPERTISE, AND WE DID A
21 WORKSHOP HERE A FEW YEARS AGO THAT DID HIGHLIGHT SOME OF THOSE
22 LIMITATIONS OF RELYING SO MUCH ON THE PRIVATE SECTOR TO GUIDE
23 PROJECTS. SO, THAT WAS A QUICK BREEZE THROUGH OF THE STAFF
24 REPORT TRYING TO KIND OF EDUCATE AND PUT ON THE TABLE THESE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 DIFFERENT IDEAS. AND WITH THAT, I WILL CONCLUDE AND OPEN IT UP
2 FOR DISCUSSION.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. CHAIR PEDROZA?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WELL, THANK YOU, CHAIR CANEPA. I WANT TO
7 START BY THANKING STAFF. YOU KNOW, IT'S HARD SOMETIMES TO JUMP
8 INTO THESE CONVERSATIONS BUT I THINK IT'S COMPLETELY
9 APPROPRIATE FOR WHAT WE'RE EXPERIENCING. AND I HAVE A LOT OF
10 RESPECT FOR THOSE COMMISSIONERS THAT WERE AROUND THAT DID THAT
11 STUDY. BUT I DO NOT WANT TO BE PART OF HISTORY IN WHERE WE DO
12 IT AND TALK ABOUT IT. AND SOMEONE IS REFERENCING THAT. I THINK
13 THE OPPORTUNITY WE HAVE IS TO ACTUALLY CHANGE SOMETHING. SO I
14 AM VERY INTEREST UNDERSTAND IN LEANING INTO THIS OPPORTUNITY
15 VERY INTENTIONALLY. AND THE PRINCIPLE FOCUS, THE PILLAR FOR ME
16 IS THOSE CUSTOMER-FACING IMPROVEMENTS. WE HEARD FROM THE POLL.
17 SEE SAW THE POLL. MANY OF US AGREED THAT THESE REFORMS ARE
18 POPULAR. AND I THINK IT'S UP TO US TO TALK ABOUT THE OUTCOMES
19 AND HOW, THROUGH THE PROCESS IMPROVEMENTS, WE GET TO ACHIEVE
20 THAT KIND OF DESTINATION AND STATE THAT WE'RE ALL LOOKING FOR.
21 SO, YOU KNOW, FOR ME, I APPRECIATE THE OPERATORS, I APPRECIATE
22 WHAT THIS COMMISSION HAS DONE WITH NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND
23 CREATING THAT POSITION. AND I THINK THERE IS AN ACKNOWLEDGMENT
24 TO ACHIEVE THE REFORMS WE WANT TO ACHIEVE, WE NEED TO DO MORE
25 AND THAT MEANS REFORMS AND THAT MIGHT MEAN REDUCING TRANSIT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 OPERATORS THAT MIGHT MEAN STRENGTHENING MTC'S AUTHORITY TO DO
2 THAT. THOSE ARE THE QUESTIONS I HAVE THAT I HOPE THIS
3 COMMISSION CAN REALLY TALK ABOUT WE HAVE INCREDIBLE
4 OPPORTUNITIES WE HAVE LEGISLATORS WHO HAVE ASKED US QUESTIONS
5 AROUND THIS MOMENT. AND MANY OF US HAVE SAW THIS DEFICIT
6 AROUND THE FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS, AND I THINK ABOUT
7 CHALLENGES WITH RESOURCES AND I THINK IT'S UPON US TO LOOK AT
8 FISCAL CONSTRAINTS THAT WE MIGHT HAVE BUT ALSO SEIZING THIS
9 MOMENT FOR THE BETTERMENT OF THE RIDERS IN OUR REGION. THEY
10 DON'T DISTINGUISH BOUNDARIES. THEY DON'T DISTINGUISH
11 OPERATORS. AND I DO BELIEVE WE HAVE INCREDIBLE OPERATORS IN
12 OUR REGION. I REALLY BELIEVE THAT. AND I KNOW THEY HAVE BEEN
13 DOING INCREDIBLE WORK. BUT I THINK THIS IS ABOUT MAKING THAT
14 NEXT STEP THAT REALLY LOOKS AT THIS REGION IN THE FUTURE. AND,
15 YOU KNOW, I THINK COMMISSIONER, SOMEONE MENTIONED -- I THINK
16 IT WAS MOULTON-PETERS WHO TALKED ABOUT WHY SHE MOVED TO THE
17 REGION, FOR THOSE TRANSIT OPERATORS. WELL, WE HAVE GOT TO
18 CREATE THE NEW SYSTEM SO PEOPLE KEEP MOVING BACK INTO THE
19 REGION FOR THAT. THAT'S WHAT'S BEFORE US. I APPRECIATE THE
20 NARRATIVE. COMMISSIONER CANEPA, I APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP
21 ON THIS. WE HAVE ALL RECEIVED EXTENSIVE CALLS, EXTENSIVE E-
22 MAILS AROUND IT, BUT WE CAN'T SHY AWAY FROM THIS MOMENT. AND I
23 AM LOOKING FORWARD TO HAVING THESE CONVERSATIONS IN SUPPORT OF
24 REFORMS THAT WE HAVE LAID OUT TODAY. THANK YOU.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER SPERING, THEN
2 COMMISSIONER NOACK.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. FOR SOMEONE THAT WAS AROUND ON
5 THE TRANSIT SUSTAINABILITY PROJECT, YOU KNOW, TWO THINGS THAT
6 REALLY STOOD OUT, AND ONE WAS THE DISCUSSION ABOUT FARE
7 INTEGRATION. THAT WAS SOMETHING THAT COMMITTEE REALLY FELT
8 THAT NEEDED TO TAKE PLACE. AND THE OTHER WAS WE DISCUSSED THE
9 NUMBER OF OPERATORS IN THE REGION. THAT WAS ANOTHER THING THAT
10 WAS -- AND WHERE I THINK THAT A COMMITTEE FELL SHORT IS THAT
11 WE NEVER CHALLENGED A COMMISSION ON THESE ISSUES. WE NEVER
12 CAME TO THE COMMISSION THAT SAYS WHAT DO YOU WANT TO DO ABOUT
13 THIS, ARE YOU SATISFIED WITH THE STATUS QUO, DO YOU WANT TO
14 MAKE CHANGES. AND I THINK WE'RE AT THE POINT WHERE THIS
15 COMMISSION NEEDS TO BE CHALLENGED. AND I AGREE WITH THE
16 CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS THAT, YOU KNOW, AS WE DEVELOP THIS VISION,
17 WE HAVE TO CONVINCING THE VOTERS, WHAT'S THE REALITY SIDE OF IT.
18 YOU KNOW? HOW CAN WE DELIVER THIS VISION. AND WHAT IS IT GOING
19 TO TAKE TO DELIVER IT? AND OF COURSE REVENUE IS A VERY
20 IMPORTANT PIECE OF THAT. AND REBECCA, YOU TALKED ABOUT MTC'S
21 AUTHORITY. I DON'T KNOW WHICH ONE OF THE STAFF MEMBERS CAN
22 TALK ABOUT -- YOU KNOW, AT SOME POINT WE HAVE TO START TALKING
23 ABOUT WHAT AUTHORITY DO WE HAVE AND WHAT AUTHORITY DO WE NEED.
24 AND PROBABLY BEFORE THAT QUESTION IS ASKED, I THINK THE
25 COMMISSION SHOULD SAY, THIS IS WHAT WE WOULD LIKE TO PURSUE.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 AND YOU KNOW, FOR ME, EVERYTHING SHOULD BE ON THE TABLE. YOU
2 KNOW, I KNOW THE CALTRAIN BART THING IS CONTROVERSIAL, AND I
3 HAVE RECEIVED SEVERAL E-MAILS TALKING ABOUT THAT. AND YOU
4 KNOW, IT'S A SHAME THAT PERCEPTION IS THAT IT'S BART AS IT IS
5 TODAY, IS THE MERGER. [LAUGHTER] WELL, THAT MAY NOT BE THE
6 CASE. AND SO I THINK IT'S WORTHY THAT EVERYTHING IS ON THE
7 TABLE AND THAT WE HAVE THOSE DISCUSSIONS. SO IT WOULD BE GOOD
8 TO KNOW WHAT AUTHORITY WE HAVE, AND WHAT AUTHORITY WE WOULD
9 LIKE TO ASK FOR. THE OTHER QUESTION THAT I HAVE IS, IS THERE A
10 DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND SHOULD HAVE
11 THESE OTHER ISSUES THAT WE'RE ASKING FOR LIKE ADDITIONAL
12 AUTHORITY AND OTHER ISSUES. ARE THEY BOTH IN THAT ENABLING
13 LEGISLATION? OR ARE THEY SEPARATE?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? SO, JUST ON THAT LAST
16 QUESTION, I THINK THAT IS TBD, BUT I THINK STAFF'S
17 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT, YOU KNOW, YOU AND OTHERS HAVE
18 SUGGESTED, IS THAT THEY REALLY DO NEED TO BE PAIRED TOGETHER.
19 AND, SO, IT COULD BE THAT THE LEGISLATION, ITSELF, YOU KNOW,
20 HAS CERTAIN PROVISIONS RELATED TO REFORM THEN IT HAS
21 PROVISIONS AUTHORIZING MTC TO PLACE A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT
22 THEY COULD BE TOGETHER. THEY COULD BE SEPARATED THERE ARE
23 LIKELY PROS AND CONS TO THAT.

24



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THE ONE ADVANTAGE TO SEPARATION, IS THAT WE
2 IDENTIFY WHAT AUTHORITY WE HAVE; WE IDENTIFY WHAT AUTHORITY WE
3 NEED. AND WE GET THAT AND GO FORWARD, INSTEAD OF HAVE TO
4 MEASURE DETERMINE THAT. AND THERE ARE THINGS THAT WE SHOULD BE
5 DOING WHETHER THE MEASURE PASSES OR NOT.

6

7 **REBECCA LONG:** IF I COULD FOLLOW UP ON THAT. THERE ARE
8 PROVISIONS IN THE WAY LEGISLATION COULD BE STRUCTURED. THERE
9 ARE PROVISIONS THAT COULD TAKE EFFECT JANUARY 1, 2025 ASSUMING
10 IT'S PASSED NEXT YEAR. THE PROVISIONS RELATED TO REFORMS DON'T
11 NEED TO BE CONDITIONED ON MEASURE. THEY COULD BE. BUT THEY
12 COULD JUST BE ENACTED BY THE LEGISLATURE.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** FOR ME, I THINK THE POLLING IS NOT VERY
15 ENCOURAGING. BUT I REALLY FEEL STRONGLY THAT WE NEED TO GO
16 FORWARD WITH THE ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR THE MEASURE. A LOT
17 CAN CHANGE IN TWO YEARS. AND WE SHOULD HAVE THE ABLE TO AT
18 LEAST USE THAT TOOL IF WE NEED TO AT THAT TIME, INSTEAD OF
19 WAITING UNTIL HOPEFULLY THE TIME IS RIGHT TO START THE
20 ENABLING LEGISLATION. SO, I THINK WE SHOULD GO FORWARD WITH
21 THAT AT THIS TIME. YOU KNOW, YOU HAD MENTIONED ABOUT THE --
22 AND ALSO IN THE SUSTAINABLE PROJECT, SUSTAINABILITY, WE TALKED
23 ABOUT THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS. AND, SO, WHAT IS STAFF -- AND
24 HOW ARE YOU THINKING ABOUT -- ESPECIALLY THE SMALLER OPERATORS
25 THAT FEED INTO THIS SYSTEM, HOW IS STAFF -- WHAT THOUGHTS OR



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IDEAS DO YOU HAVE ABOUT THAT ISSUE? YOU KNOW, WE HAVE FIVE
2 OPERATORS, WHICH I DON'T THINK IS VERY EFFICIENT, AND SO WHERE
3 -- WHAT CAN WE DO? WHAT AUTHORITY DO WE HAVE? OR WHAT
4 AUTHORITY DO WE NEED TO START LOOKING AT THAT ISSUE, THE
5 NUMBER OF OPERATORS IN THE REGION?

6

7 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER SPERING IF I COULD START OUT AND
8 RELY ON OTHERS TO FINISH UP IF I DON'T COVER IT ALL. YOU KNOW,
9 I THINK THIS PARTICULAR MEMO OUTLINES AN AWFUL LOT OF THINGS
10 THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO REMIND OURSELVES ABOUT. I THINK FIRST OF
11 ALL, THOUGH, ONE THING I GOT OUT OF THE POLLING WAS THE IDEAS
12 IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WERE CORRECT. AND WE DON'T
13 WANT TO DO ANYTHING THAT UNDERMINES THE HARD WORK THAT HAS
14 GOTTEN US THIS FAR BUT WE HAVE TO RECOGNIZE THAT IT IS STILL
15 AWFULLY CUMBERSOME AND A LOT OF DECISIONS GET WATERED DOWN A
16 LITTLE BIT BY TOO MUCH CONSENSUS. AND SO, KIND OF MANAGING HOW
17 YOU ACCELERATE DECISIONS THAT ARE GOOD FOR THE CUSTOMER ARE
18 GOING TO BE KEY THINGS THAT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
19 COMMITTEE, OUTSIDE OF EVEN THE WORK THAT THE COUNCIL DOES,
20 INSTRUCTS FOR US. I ALSO THINK THE MEMO LAYS OUT A LOT OF THE
21 LEGISLATION THAT DOES EXIST AND DEFINES MTC'S CURRENT
22 RESPONSIBILITIES. BUT WHEN YOU LOOK AT EVEN JUST THE MATRIX,
23 IT'S GOT A LOT OF SOFT WORDS IN IT THAT DON'T REALLY LEAD TO
24 DEFINITE AUTHORITY. SO WHAT I THINK WE NEED TO DO IS REALLY
25 THINK ABOUT, IT GOES BACK ACTUALLY TO SOMETHING COMMISSIONER



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 PAPAN MENTIONED BACK IN PLEASANTON A COUPLE YEARS AGO ON ONE
2 OF OUR WORKSHOPS. WE REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT 3866 AND PUT IT TO
3 WORK AND FIGURE OUT WHAT MIGHT NEED TO BE CHANGED. THAT'S
4 GOING TO TAKE WORK FROM US TO GIVE YOU SOME SPECIFIC THINGS TO
5 DO ON. AND ASSUMING YOU WANT TO JUMP IN WITH A BIT MORE
6 AGGRESSION, THEN WE CAN DO SO. AND WE CAN BRING BACK SOME
7 IDEAS THAT WE THINK WILL MAKE LEGISLATION STRONGER SO THAT THE
8 3866 INTENT TURNS INTO REALITY. YOU KNOW, THE QUESTION ABOUT
9 THE NUMBER OF OPERATORS, WE HAVE A COUPLE OF EXAMPLES THAT
10 REBECCA MENTIONED, BOTH ON THE WETA FERRY SYSTEM AND UP IN
11 YOUR NEIGHBORHOOD WITH SMALL EFFORTS TO MOVE FORWARD IN
12 CONSOLIDATION THAT PROVE TO BE ATTAINABLE. SO, I'M HOPEFUL
13 THAT THIS CONVERSATION DOESN'T SCARE US AWAY FROM ASKING THOSE
14 QUESTIONS AND WORKING WITH THE OPERATORS IN THE COUNTIES THAT
15 HAVE MULTIPLE BUS OPERATORS, OR EVEN THIS BIG HARD QUESTION OF
16 THE RAIL REGION, YOU KNOW, QUALIFICATIONS, AND SEE IF WE CAN
17 FIND SOME, YOU KNOW, ITEMS THAT MAYBE DON'T BOTHER FOLKS SO
18 MUCH. BECAUSE MAYBE THERE ARE ADMINISTRATIVE THINGS THAT ARE
19 ENOUGH TO MAKE US MORE EFFICIENT AND MAYBE THERE ARE SOME REAL
20 OPPORTUNITIES. I KNOW WE HAVE MORE WORK IN THE NORTH BAY, AND
21 MORE WORK IN YOUR COUNTY. AND I WOULD RESPECTFULLY LIKE TO
22 START TALKING TO THE EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS TO SEE IF WE CAN
23 MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN LOOK AT HARD DECISIONS TO STILL
24 RECOGNIZE THERE ARE LOCAL NEEDS THAT THESE SMALLER OPERATORS
25 ARE PROVIDING, THAT THE BIG BACKBONE SYSTEMS DON'T NECESSARILY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 DEAL WITH. AND I THINK THERE IS A WILLINGNESS TO HAVE THAT
2 CONVERSATION IF YOU WOULD LIKE US TO PURSUE IT.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** FOR ME, IF THERE IS ONE THING TO COME OUT OF
5 THIS DESIGNATION TODAY, IS THE STAFF CHALLENGE THIS COMMISSION
6 AND GIVES IT THE OPPORTUNITY TO SAY YES WE SUPPORT SOMETHING
7 OR NO WE DON'T. I THINK WHAT HAS HAPPENED IS THE COMMISSION
8 HASN'T BEEN CHALLENGED AND WE HAVEN'T BEEN CLEAR IN DECISION
9 YES WE WANT TO PURSUE THAT. AND I THINK WE'RE AT THE POINT WE
10 HAVE TO DO THAT. AND A LOT OF THESE DISCUSSIONS ARE GOING TO
11 BE VERY UNCOMFORTABLE, YOU START TALKING ABOUT CONSOLIDATING,
12 ELIMINATING, I THINK THEY'RE GOING TO BE CONTROVERSIAL. I
13 THINK THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO TAKE THOSE ISSUES. I DON'T KNOW
14 OF ANY OTHER BODY IN THE REGION THAT CAN DO THAT WORK. IT'S
15 COMMISSION WORK. I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO COME BACK AND SAY THIS
16 IS THE AUTHORITY YOU HAVE, THIS IS THE AUTHORITY WE NEED AND
17 PURSUE THAT AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE TO MAKE SOME OF THESE
18 DECISIONS IT'S IMPORTANT TO DEVELOP A VISION SO THESE NON-
19 TRANSIT RIDERS SAY, YEAH, I THINK I WANT TO TRY THAT. AND WHAT
20 IT'S GOING TO TAKE TO DELIVER THAT VISION. I THINK THAT'S
21 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. AND I AGREE WITH OUR CHAIR PEDROZA'S
22 COMMENTS EARLIER, IN HOW WE GO FORWARD. SO, I WOULD JUST ASK
23 STAFF TO PUT EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE. BRING IT FORTH, HAVE THE
24 COMMISSION, YOU KNOW, COMMIT ONE WAY OR ANOTHER IF IT'S
25 SOMETHING WE WANT TO PURSUE. I DON'T WANT TO BE PURSUING



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SOMETHING IF THERE IS NO SUPPORT UP THERE ON THE COMMISSION. I
2 WANT TO DO -- PURSUE THE THINGS THAT THERE IS GENERAL SUPPORT
3 FOR, AND THAT WE GIVE YOU THAT CLEAR DIRECTION. WE'RE AT THE
4 POINT WHERE WE HAVE TO START MAKING SOME DECISIONS. AND I
5 CAN'T -- YOU KNOW, WE CAN'T JUST CONTINUE TO JUST TALK ABOUT
6 THESE ISSUES. I HAVE BEEN ON THIS COMMISSION A LONG TIME AGO,
7 AND I'LL TELL YOU, 25 YEARS AGO, WE WERE TALKING ABOUT THE
8 SAME THINGS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT RIGHT NOW TODAY. THE NUMBER OF
9 OPERATORS, FARE INTEGRATION, THE SAME ISSUES, WE'RE STILL
10 TALKING ABOUT. SO, IT HAS TO BE A STRATEGY OR MECHANISM TO
11 BRING THESE ISSUES FORWARD TO HAVE A DECISION. FROM WHERE I
12 SIT, A LOT IS HAPPENING BY DEFAULT WE'RE NOT TAKING ACTION.
13 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IT AND IT JUST CONTINUES. MANY TRANSIT
14 OPERATORS IN MANY OF THE REGIONS THEY DO A LOT OF GOOD WORK
15 AND OUR POSITION OUGHT TO BE LET'S MAKE IT BETTER. LET'S TAKE
16 WHAT YOU'RE DOING RIGHT, AND CONTINUE THAT, AND LET'S IMPROVE
17 HERE FOR THE RIDER. AND THE ONE THING, AND CHAIR CANEPA
18 MENTIONED THIS, THE ONE THING THAT CAME OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON
19 WAS STOP FOCUSING ON THE OPERATORS, FOCUS ON THE RIDER. THAT'S
20 HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET FUTURE RIDERSHIP. THAT'S HOW WE'RE
21 GOING TO GET A MUCH HIGHER SATISFACTION ON USING TRANSIT. AND
22 SO, I THINK THIS COMMISSION NEEDS TO REALLY WEIGH IN ON THAT
23 ISSUE. SO, THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS, MR. CHAIRMAN

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1
2 **SUE NOACK:** SO, JUST FOLLOWING UP ON THAT, ON COORDINATION, AND
3 CONSOLIDATION. I JUST WANT US TO THINK A LITTLE MORE BROADLY
4 ON THAT AND LOOK AT EFFICIENCIES, AND EFFECTIVENESS. BECAUSE I
5 DON'T THINK JUST CONSOLIDATING ENTITY GETS US TO WHERE WE NEED
6 TO BE. WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT THE EAST COUNTY, AND JIM WAS
7 TALKING ABOUT HIS COUNTY, YOU CAN'T REALLY LOOK AT THOSE
8 LINES. BECAUSE SERVICES TO THE CUSTOMERS, THEY DON'T STOP AT A
9 LINE, AN ARBITRARY LINE. SO WE HAVE TO LOOK AT WHERE
10 EFFICIENCIES CAN BE MADE A LITTLE BIT MORE REGIONALLY. AND NOT
11 JUST FOCUSING ON CONSOLIDATING ENTITY. I TALKED ABOUT
12 HORIZONTAL INTEGRATION THEN VERTICAL INTEGRATION AND I THINK
13 WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THOSE THINGS TO GET SOME OF THE
14 EFFECTIVENESS AND THINK BY THE TIME CUSTOMER, THOSE KIND OF
15 EFFICIENCIES, I THINK ARE -- FIGURES, MY PHONE JUST STOPPED.
16 AND THE OTHER THING I THINK WE NEED TO THINK B AS WELL IS, YOU
17 KNOW, WE EXPERIENCED, THROUGH COVID, THE REAL IMPORTANCE OF A
18 LOT OF LOCAL ENTITIES AND THEIR ADAPTABILITY TO CHANGE IN
19 SITUATIONS. SO WE DON'T WANT TO CREATE SOMETHING SO MASSIVE,
20 AS WELL, THAT WE TAKE AWAY THAT ABILITY TO RELATE TO LOCAL
21 NEEDS AND ADAPT TO LOCAL NEEDS. AND WE DON'T -- AND WE DON'T
22 WANT TO ALSO CREATE SOMETHING THAT CAN'T ADAPT TO CHANGING
23 TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION NEEDS. I MEAN, LOOK AT HOW MUCH HAS
24 CHANGED IN THE LAST FOUR YEARS. AND WE REALLY HAVE TO LOOK,
25 SORT OF, AT A VISION, A STRUCTURE OF TRANSIT AND



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION THAT WILL MEET NOT ONLY NOW, BUT CHANGING NEEDS
2 GOING FORWARD. SO, I THINK THOSE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT. AND
3 THERE ARE ALSO CHALLENGES THERE. WE HAVE THE ONE-SEAT RIDE IN
4 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY HAS WORKED WELL AND THE STUMBLING BLOCK TO
5 MAKING THAT PERMANENT IS FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS. SO HOW CAN WE,
6 AS A BIG BODY, HELP WITH MAKING SOME OF THOSE CHANGES AT A
7 NATIONAL LEVEL THAT WILL MAKE OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS ALSO MORE
8 EFFICIENT AND GIVE THEM THE ABILITY TO MERGE SOME OF THOSE
9 OPERATIONS, LIKE THE ONE-SEAT RIDE. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, I
10 THINK A LOT -- A BIG PIECE OF THIS IS IF WE REALLY WANT TO
11 MOVE TRANSIT, WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT HOW WE LOOK AT FIRST AND
12 LAST MILE. IN ORDER TO -- YOU KNOW, WHAT WE'RE SAYING, AND
13 CERTAINLY IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY, IS THE BUS RIDERS HAVE
14 REALLY COME BACK, BUT THEY'RE NOT CONNECTING TO BART RIGHT
15 NOW. AND IT'S NOT NECESSARILY ALL BART IT'S ALSO THE ECONOMY
16 IN SAN FRANCISCO. HOW DOES THE CHANGING ECONOMY WORK INTO, AND
17 HOPEFULLY TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WILL ADDRESS SOME OF THAT -- BUT
18 WE HAVE TO KEEP AN EYE ON THOSE CHANGES AS WE THINK ABOUT
19 CHANGES MOVING FORWARD. THE OTHER THING I THINK IS REALLY
20 IMPORTANT IN THIS PROCESS IS LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES AND
21 PILOTS THAT EXIST. A COUPLE OF PLACES WE TALK ABOUT PILOT OF
22 ONE SEAT RIGHT. WE HAVE HAD A THREE YEAR PILOT GOING ON THAT'S
23 SUPER SUCCESSFUL IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY AND USING BEST
24 PRACTICES ACROSS TO EXPAND THOSE THINGS RATHER THAN STARTING
25 NEW PILOTS. I KEEP WAITING FOR THE BAY PASS TO HIT DVC



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 COMMUNITY COLLEGE, AND I DON'T KNOW HOW LONG THAT PILOT IS
2 GOING ON, OR WHENEVER DVC WILL GET THAT, BUT TAKING THOSE
3 PILOTS THAT ARE REALLY SUCCESSFUL AND MOVING THOSE INTO A
4 BROADER BASIS IS ANOTHER PIECE WHERE WE HAVE LOOKED FOR
5 FUNDINGS TO EXPAND THAT AND THIS WOULD FALL INTO THAT AS WELL.
6 THE ANYWAY, THAT IS A LONG LIST OF MY COMMENTS. THANKS

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. YOU'RE WORK. GOING TO ZOOM,
9 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND, AGAIN, THANK YOU FOR
12 THE PRESENTATION. I GUESS I HAVE A LOT OF QUESTIONS. AND PART
13 OF IT IS BECAUSE, PERHAPS I'M NOT ON THE FRIDAY COMMITTEES.
14 BUT, I WANTED TO ASK ABOUT THE -- ACTUALLY, THE POLL. A COUPLE
15 OF QUESTIONS IN REGARDS TO -- AND I GUESS IT WOULD BE UNDER
16 REFORM. BUT, I OFTEN THINK ABOUT AND HEAR FROM PEOPLE THAT
17 BEING ABLE TO JUST INCREASE OUR SERVICE LEVELS, REDUCE
18 HEADWAYS, WOULD BE A REFORM, OR THAT, YOU KNOW, FOLKS WOULD
19 LIKE TO SEE, AND WHY WAS THAT NOT ASKED?

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. IF I HEARD YOU
22 CORRECTLY, YOU ASKED WHY WE HAVEN'T ASKED ABOUT IMPROVED
23 HEADWAYS AS POTENTIAL REFORMS?

24

25 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES INCREASING FREQUENCY.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** I WOULDN'T CHARACTERISTIC THAT AS REFORM RIGHT
3 THAT WOULD BE AN ENHANCEMENT IN TERMS OF SERVICE. WE DID TALK
4 ABOUT IMPROVING QUALITY OF SERVICE BUT CERTAINLY AS WE DO
5 FURTHER POLLING CAN DRILL DOWN AND TEST HIGHER FREQUENCIES
6 THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN DO. BUT WE WERE LUMPING SOME OF THE
7 TRANSIT ENHANCEMENT CATEGORIES TOGETHER SO IT WASN'T STRICTLY
8 ENHANCED SERVICE.

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. BECAUSE -- WE HAVE DONE SOME POLLS IN
11 THE PAST, AND WE ALWAYS SEEM TO RISE TO THE TOP THIS IDEA OF,
12 YOU KNOW, NOT JUST -- [INDISCERNIBLE] BUT HOW DO WE EXPAND
13 SERVICE MAKE IT MORE FREQUENT, CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE TO TAKE
14 IT AND TO GET TO PLACES THEY WANT TO GO IN A TIMELY FASHION. I
15 SEE THAT AS A FUNDAMENTAL ISSUE THAT WE NEED TO PUT OUT THERE.
16 AND GOING BACK TO THE EARLIER CONVERSATION, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS
17 THE VISION, I THINK THAT IS PART OF THE VISION OF WHAT WE'RE
18 LOOKING FOR IN A WELL RUN TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA, AS
19 SOMETHING THAT FOLKS CAN TAKE, CONVENIENTLY TO GET TO WHERE
20 THEY WANT TO GO. SO, I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE SHOULD
21 BE, YOU KNOW, LOOKING AT, AND REALLY KIND OF FUNDAMENTAL TO
22 ALL THIS. AND THE OTHER QUESTION I HAD, I NOTICED IN ASKING
23 ABOUT THE DIFFERENT TAXES, YOU -- IT LOOKS LIKE IT WAS BASED
24 ON A BILLION DOLLARS, OR \$816 MILLION A YEAR, AND I WAS -- I
25 WANTED TO KNOW WHERE THAT NUMBER COMES FROM.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** SO, WHEN WE DID THE POLLSTER -- OR EXCUSE ME --
3 THE CONSULTANT ASSISTED US WITH FINANCIAL ANALYSIS WE ASKED
4 THEM TO TELL US WHAT THE TAX RATE TO GENERATE A BILLION
5 DOLLARS, THE HALF ACCEPT THE SALES TAX IS CLOSE TO A BILLION
6 DOLLARS THAT'S CERTAINLY ONE OF THE POSITIONS ON THE TABLE BUT
7 IT IS ARGUABLY THE BALLPARK OF WHAT WE NEED TO HAVE ANY KIND
8 OF MEASURE THAT IS GOING TO MOVE THE NEED CELL IF WE'RE -- IF
9 PART OF THE PURPOSE OF THE MEASURE IS TO REALLY ADDRESS THE
10 TRANSIT OPERATING GAP WHICH IS ANYWHERE FROM 600 MILLION TO
11 ABOUT 750 MILLION, AND THEN AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN THIS
12 DISCUSSION TODAY, WE DO ANTICIPATE THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE A
13 NEED TO HAVE NON-TRANSIT INVESTMENTS TOO, AS WELL AS SOME
14 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS. SO THEN YOU'RE ONLY LOOKING AT ABOUT 300
15 MILLION NET. SO THAT WAS REALLY WHY WE THOUGHT A BILLION
16 DOLLARS WAS A GOOD PROXY LOOKING AT RATES AND MECHANISMS SO
17 THAT WAS THE RATIONALE.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET ME MOVE ON TO
22 DAVID RABBITT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT, AND THEN COMMISSIONER
23 DUTRA-VERNACI.

24



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THE WORK. I'M
2 KIND OF NODDING ALONG WITH A LOT OF MY COLLEAGUE'S COMMENTS,
3 BUT TO COMMISSIONER SPERING, THE ONE THING THAT RESONATES WITH
4 ME, AND I DO SIT ON -- LIKE I THINK WE ALL DO, THREE SEPARATE
5 TRANSIT OPERATING BOARDS, SMART, SONOMA COUNTY TRANSIT, AND
6 SONOMA TRANSIT, BUT I DO THINK THAT WHAT RESONATES IS WE HAVE
7 TO SEIZE THE MOMENT. THAT THIS MOMENT IS UNIQUE IN TIME.
8 BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC, THE AFTERMATH OF THAT, I THINK THE
9 REMOTE WORK, PHENOMENON THAT IS APPARENTLY THE NEW NORMAL
10 GOING FORWARD, AND EVERYTHING THAT CAME WITH IT. AND I DO
11 THINK THAT THE PUBLIC, THROUGH THE POLLING, RECOGNIZES THAT
12 AND WANTS IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL. IT'S UP TO US TO UNDERSTAND
13 THE CONSEQUENCES OF THOSE IMPROVEMENTS, WHICH FOR ME IS ALWAYS
14 -- YOU KNOW, SO, WHAT IS THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE.
15 LET'S NOT COME UP WITH A SOLUTION TO A PROBLEM THAT DOESN'T
16 EXIST. BUT WHAT IS THE ARE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE AND
17 HOW DO WE SOLVE IT AND WHAT ARE THOSE CONSEQUENCES. SOMETIMES
18 WHAT YOU READ IN THE POLLING IS IF YOU REALLY WENT DOWN THAT
19 PATH, WOULD IT BE BETTER OR WORSE FOR THAT INDIVIDUAL REQUIRED
20 AND TO THE CHAIR'S POINT IT ALSO HAS TO COME BACK TO THAT
21 INDIVIDUAL, ALL THE OPERATORS INCLUDING AGENCIES I SIT ON WANT
22 TO DO ALL THE THINGS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THEY WANT TO PROVIDE
23 THE BEST POSSIBLE SERVICE. THEY'RE HAMPERED BY MANY THINGS.
24 USUALLY MONEY. LOTS OF THINGS. HO BREAKING FORWARD THROUGH
25 THAT, AND EVERY TIME WE HAVE THIS CONVERSATION, AND I THINK I



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HAVE TOLD THE STORY BEFORE AND TO ME IT RESONATES BECAUSE
2 THERE ARE THINGS THAT ARE SIMILAR, WHEN I FIRST GOT ELECTED WE
3 HAD 48 SEPARATE FIRE AGENCIES IN SONOMA COUNTY. TODAY WE HAVE
4 15. HOW DO WE -- AND THERE WAS A TIME WHEN NO ONE WANTED TO
5 CONSOLIDATE, NO ONE WANTED TO CHANGE THE WAY -- THEY LOVED
6 THEIR OWN BOARDS, THEIR OWN FIRE CHIEF, THEIR OWN COMMUNITY
7 PIECE AND JUST LIKE THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TODAY, YOU WOULD
8 NEVER DESIGN A SYSTEM LIKE THAT TODAY NOR WOULD YOU WERE
9 DESIGN A SYSTEM WITH 27 SEPARATE TRANSIT AGENCIES LIKE WE HAVE
10 TODAY, I WOULD IMAGINE. IT WOULD LOOK LIKE SOMETHING
11 DIFFERENT. WE AT THAT TIME SAID WE'RE GOING HAVE ONE ENTITY WE
12 PUT THAT SHOT OVER THE BOW AND OF COURSE THREE WILDFIRES DOES
13 HELP PROVIDE SOME MOTIVATION. BUT YOU KNOW, THE TRUTH OF THE
14 MATTER IS WE KNEW IT WASN'T GOING TO BE ONE BUT IT WAS GOING
15 TO BE SOMETHING A LOT LESS THAN 48, BUT WE'RE AT 15. IS THAT
16 RIGHT? I THINK 12 IS THE RIGHT NUMBER AND WE'RE PROBABLY GOING
17 TO GET THERE OVER TIME. WHAT HAPPENS IS THE THERE STARTED
18 BEING TIED TO THE ABILITY TO PROVIDE THE SERVICE AND IF THERE
19 WAS A NEED FOR ADDITIONAL DOLLARS, ARE IT WAS GOING TO COME AT
20 A LONGER TERM FINANCIAL STRATEGY OF, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GIVE
21 YOU THE DOLLARS TO BAIL YOU OUT YEAR OVER YEAR, YOU HAVE TO
22 COME UP WITH A PLAN AND A LOT OF TIMES THAT PLAN ENDED UP
23 BEING THE CONSOLIDATION SO IT BECAME MUCH MORE NATURALLY. I
24 ALSO KNOW THE REASON WE HAVE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY
25 AREA IS THE HISTORICAL WAY THAT THEY HAVE BEEN FUNDED,



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 INCLUDING EVERYONE PASSING A DIFFERENT SALES TAX FOR A
2 DIFFERENT AGENCY. THAT CREATES, I BELIEVE, MANY, MANY HURDLES,
3 CHALLENGES, OBSTACLES DEPENDING ON YOUR OPINION OF MOVING
4 FORWARD IN A CONSOLIDATION WAY. AND WE HAVE THOSE FUNDING
5 SOURCES. BECAUSE THE STATE HASN'T HISTORICALLY NOT BEEN THE
6 ONE TO PRIMARILY FUND, UNLIKE BACK EAST. SO I DO LOOK FORWARD
7 TO, I THINK EVERYTHING SHOULD BE ON THE TABLE BECAUSE WE
8 SHOULD ALWAYS BE STRIVING FOR CONSTANT IMPROVEMENT. AND I
9 THINK THAT THE OPERATORS ARE TRYING TO HAVE CONSTANT
10 IMPROVEMENT, BUT IT JUST NEEDS TO BE A COORDINATE THE EFFORT.
11 WE NEED TO ALL GET ON THE SAME PAGE. NOT LOOKING AT IT AS
12 LOSING OUT BECAUSE MY ENTITY IS NOT -- I'M FEARFUL THAT I
13 MIGHT NOT HAVE AN ENTITY IN THE FUTURE BUT REALLY HOW CAN WE
14 PROVIDE THE SERVICE THAT'S REALLY BEST FOR THOSE CUSTOMERS
15 GOING FORWARD. BUT I DO WANT TO MAKE SURE, YOU KNOW, MY
16 HOMETOWN OF PETALUMA HAS PETALUMA TRANSIT. SHOULD THAT BE ONE?
17 SHOULD THAT BE SONOMA TRANSIT? I WOULD LOVE TO KNOW. I
18 COULDN'T ANSWER THAT QUESTION TODAY BECAUSE OF THE FACTS AND
19 FIGURES OF WHAT THAT CHANGE WOULD BE. BUT I'M WILLING TO
20 EXPLORE THAT EVEN IN, YOU KNOW, KNOWING I'LL GET A FEW LETTERS
21 FROM MY COLLEAGUES. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE TO DO
22 AS LEADERS, AND ESPECIALLY IN THIS BODY, MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN
23 CONTINUE TO EXPLORE ALL THOSE THINGS BECAUSE WE WANT CONSTANT
24 IMPROVEMENT ON THE EFFICIENCY SIDE, THE DOLLAR SIDE, WHICH ARE
25 GOING TO BECOME -- HAVE -- OR JUST DIFFICULT TO COME BY. SO, I



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 APPRECIATE THAT AND LOOK FORWARD TO THE DISCUSSIONS GOING
2 FORWARD.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GOING TO COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI,
5 MOULTON-PETERS, THEN PAPAN.

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I AGREE WITH THE COMMISSIONER SPERING AND
8 RABBITT'S COMMENTS. I AGREE EVERYTHING SHOULD BE ON THE TABLE
9 BECAUSE THE ULTIMATE GOAL IS RIDER EXPERIENCE. WE NEED TO
10 EXPLORE ALL OPTIONS. HOWEVER, THAT BEING SAID, I APPRECIATE
11 WHAT I JUST HEARD FROM COMMISSIONER RABBITT IN HAS EXAMPLE
12 WITH FIRE SERVICES THAT ONE MIGHT NOT BE THE OPTIMAL OUTCOME,
13 DEPENDING ON WHAT THE CIRCUMSTANCES ARE. AND THE REASON I SAY
14 THAT IS BECAUSE, FOR EXAMPLE, IN UNION CITY, WE HAVE UNION
15 CITY TRANSIT, AND I HAVE BEEN TOLD THAT IF WE WERE TO
16 CONSOLIDATE, MERGE, WHAT HAVE YOU, AC TRANSIT, THAT THE
17 FLEXIBILITY WOULD BE LOST. AT A HIGHER COST, FOR THAT MATTER.
18 SO I DON'T KNOW IF THAT IS TRUE OR NOT. BUT, AGAIN, THAT'S WHY
19 EVERYTHING HAS TO BE ON THE TABLE AND HAVE TO HAVE A
20 CONVERSATION BECAUSE IF THE ULTIMATE GOAL IS THE RIDER
21 EXPERIENCE WE DON'T WANT TO TAKE AWAY THE HEADWAYS THAT IS
22 CURRENTLY BEING ENJOYED. IN TERMS OF THE TAXING MECHANISM, AS
23 THAT WAS BEING TALKED ABOUT, I DO AGREE THAT WE NEED TO KEEP
24 EQUITY IN MIND, THAT WE DO NOT WANT TO DISPROPORTIONATELY
25 IMPACT THOSE THAT ARE LOWER INCOME. SO, I THINK THAT'S THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 OVERARCHING CONCERN THAT I HAVE WHEN WE LOOK AT THIS
2 COORDINATION AND CONSOLIDATION, MAKE SURE WE END UP WITH A
3 BETTER PRODUCT FOR A PRICE THAT MAKES SENSE. AND AGAIN ALL FOR
4 THE RIDER EXPERIENCE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SO I WANT TO ADD, I AGREE WE NEED TO
7 MOVE FORWARD. I WANT TO UNDERSTAND MAYBE WITH STAFF'S HELP, IF
8 WE HAVE AN APPROACH, YOU CAN'T ACCOMPLISH TRANSFORMATION BY
9 DOING EVERYTHING ALL AT ONCE. SO, DO WE HAVE A PHASED
10 APPROACH? ANDY, YOU ALLUDED TO THAT IN YOUR COMMENT STARTING
11 WITH SOME OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS IN THE NORTH BAY I THINK
12 THAT'S GOOD TO GET MOMENTUM GOING. I NEED A ROADMAP. IT MAY BE
13 IN SOME OF THE PLANS AND I HAVEN'T READ THEM. THEN LAST
14 COMMENT I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN YOUR THOUGHTS, WE HAVE A LOT
15 OF SMALL AGENCIES ALL OF OUR COUNTIES I THINK ALL OF THE SMALL
16 CITIES WE HAVE TO LOOK AT CONSOLIDATION, AND I KNOW WE HAVE
17 USED FUNCTIONAL CONSOLIDATION AS OPPOSED TO POLITICAL
18 CONSOLIDATION WHERE YOU ALL AGREE TO USE THE SAME OPERATING
19 PRINCIPLES AND THE AGENCIES DON'T NECESSARILY GO AWAY THAT'S
20 ANOTHER WAY TO MOVE INTO THIS WITHOUT TRYING TO TACKLE IT ALL
21 AT ONCE. ANDY OR REBECCA, IF YOU COULD ENLARGE A LITTLE BIT?

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** LET ME GIVE IT A SHOT AND REBECCA CAN HELP OUT
24 AS WELL. ONE IS THE LONELIEST NUMBER, RIGHT? I THINK WE HAVE
25 TO MAKE SURE WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO RESPOND TO THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 CUSTOMER'S NEEDS. SOMETHING THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID
2 EARLIER, WHILE I THINK THE COUNTIES DO HAVE A LOT OF
3 UNIQUENESS, THEY HAVE A LOT OF SIMILARITIES BUT THE REGION
4 WHEN YOU BREAK IT DOWN IS NOT REALLY COUNTY DRUNK SO WE HAVE
5 SIMILARITIES IN NORTH BAY AND SONOMA AND MARIN THEN WE HAVE
6 DIFFERENT RESOURCES, TRAIN LINE, EXPRESS BUSES GOLDEN GATE
7 RUNS AND THOUSAND WE HAVE GOT A LOT OF COUNTY SUPPORT IT'S
8 DIFFERENT IN CONTRA COSTA WHERE IT'S MORE EAST WEST ALIGNMENT
9 AND AC TRANSIT A LOT OF THEIR EFFORTS ARE ACTUALLY IN ALAMEDA
10 SO YOU DON'T NEED AND HOPEFULLY SUPPORT CONNECTING TO THE BART
11 SYSTEM WE HAVE FIVE COUNTIES THAT HAVE RAIL DOWN IN THE
12 GREATER BAY AREA THEY NEED SOME CONVERSATIONS AROUND HOW WE DO
13 BUSINESS IN TERMS OF SCHEDULE COORDINATION IN TERMS OF FARES
14 AND RESOURCES. THOSE FIVE COUNTIES HAVE DIFFERENT CAPITAL
15 PROJECT NEEDS WE'RE COMPETING AGAINST OURSELVES IN SOME PLACES
16 WHEN IT COMES TO THE BIG INVESTMENTS. WE JUST WRAPPED UP A
17 VERY SUCCESSFUL PROGRAM ON ELECTRIFICATION OF CALTRAIN. VERY
18 IMPORTANT. BUT THAT WAS A SIGNIFICANTLY LARGE CAPITAL
19 IMPROVEMENT PROJECT. WE'RE NOW FACING BART TO SILICON VALLEY
20 IN THE PORTAL IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. IN A LOT OF WAYS
21 COMPETING AGAINST EACH OTHER. THEY HAVE GOT DIFFERENT POLICY
22 BOARDS. THEY TALK ABOUT STRATEGIZING AND COMPETING IN THAT
23 FORMAT. I DO THINK WE HAVE SOME THINGS IN PLACE THAT WE SHOULD
24 GET A LOT MORE ENGAGED IN. WE GAVE SOME MONEY TO THE NORTH BAY
25 TO TAKE A LOOK AT THE SONOMA QUESTION AND HOW IT INTEGRATES,



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 AND WE, SORT OF, LET IT HAPPEN. I THINK WE NEED TO GET MUCH
2 MORE ENGAGED IN THAT AND TRY TO FORCE SOME CONCLUSIONS THAT
3 HELP ANSWER THE QUESTIONS THAT YOU'RE ASKING US. AND I THINK
4 THAT'S, SORT OF, A COMBINATION OF LEARNING FROM THE WORK WE
5 HAVE DONE THAT'S BEEN IDENTIFIED IN PREVIOUS STUDIES. I THINK
6 THAT IS THE ROADMAP. AND I THINK IT IS CONSISTENT WITH WHAT
7 WE'RE TRYING TO ACCOMPLISH IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.
8 BUT I THINK REALLY PUTTING MORE ENERGY INTO BRINGING BACK
9 THINGS TO YOU THAT CAN HELP YOU DECIDE THAT. BECAUSE
10 ULTIMATELY IT MAY NOT BE A COST DECISION THAT REALLY IS WHAT
11 YOU'RE LOOKING FOR. EFFICIENCIES ARE NICE, BUT MAYBE GETTING
12 BACK TO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA'S QUESTION, IF YOU WANT
13 ADDITIONAL SERVICE, THAT'S GOING TO COST ADDITIONAL MONEY. AND
14 MAYBE THAT'S WHAT YOU NEED TO START DRIVING SOME INCENTIVES
15 THAT BRING MORE PEOPLE INTO TRANSIT. BUT THAT'S NOT A GOOD
16 BOTTOM LINE DECISION RIGHT OFF THE BAT BUT THAT'S GOING TO BE
17 ONE OF THE OTHER CHALLENGES WE FACE AND IT TIES INTO REBECCA'S
18 ALSO THE ANSWER ON HOW MUCH MONEY WE NEED. WE TALK ABOUT 6 TO
19 \$700 MILLION TO KEEP THINGS GOING, THAT'S STATUS QUO, BART 20
20 MINUTE HEADWAYS CREATES CHALLENGES WITH OTHER SCHEDULE
21 COORDINATION PIECES BUT IT'S A GOOD DECISION TO SAVE SOME
22 MONEY ON BART BUT IF YOU WANT TO START IMPROVING SOME OF THOSE
23 AND MAYBE FOR SOME EXTRA CONNECTING SERVICES THAT'S IN
24 ADDITION TO THE 60 OR \$70 MILLION NUMBER AND THAT'S NOT AN
25 EFFICIENCY NUMBER BUT IT'S GOOD FOR THE CUSTOMER. SOMETHING TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 LAY OUT, ALL OF THE PARTS AND PIECES OUT THERE THAT WHAT WE
2 NEED TO DO FOR YOU IS TO TRY TO PUT THEM TOGETHER IN SOME
3 ORDER BUT TRY TO GET ENGAGED IN WHAT STUDIES ARE BEING DONE IN
4 THE NORTH BAY, IN SOLANO COUNTY, I THINK WE NEED TO START. AND
5 I KNOW THEY'RE WILLING TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION IN CONTRA
6 COSTA, BUT WHAT CAN WE DO IN ORDER TO TAKE A LOOK AT IT IN
7 DIFFERENT WAYS. COMMISSIONER NOACK YOUR POINT ABOUT THE ONE
8 SEAT RIDE IS GREAT POINT FOR THE CUSTOMER IS IT CHANGES IN LAW
9 OR CREATING A SINGLE ENTITY THAT MIGHT MAKE THAT WORK BETTER?
10 I HONESTLY DON'T KNOW BUT I KNOW THEY'RE WILLING TO HAVE THAT
11 CONVERSATION. I THINK THAT WILL HELP US MARRY BETWEEN THE
12 CONSENSUS MODEL BETWEEN WHAT WE HAVE TRADITIONALLY WORKED ON
13 IN THE REGION ALBEIT SLOW, BUT IT'S MORE AGGRESSIVE
14 RECOGNIZING, AGAIN I WANT TO REPEAT THIS POINT IT MAY NOT BE
15 THE MOST ECONOMICAL DECISION WE SHOULDN'T RELY JUST ON ECONOMY
16 OF THE SOLUTIONS TO BE THE ANSWER. BECAUSE THAT DOES NOT
17 DIRECTLY CORRELATE TO CUSTOMER BENEFITS AT ALL TIMES. YOU
18 KNOW? AND I THINK THAT IS, SORT OF, A RISK REWARD THAT THE
19 COMMISSION MIGHT NEED TO STEP INTO MORE DIRECTLY. THE
20 CHALLENGES WE HAD AROUND THE BAY PASS PILOT ARE REALLY AROUND
21 -- THERE IS REVENUE THAT'S POTENTIALLY LOST. IT'S A GOOD
22 EXPERIMENT BUT WHAT DO WE DO ABOUT THAT POTENTIAL REVENUE
23 LOSS. WE NEED TO WATCH THAT. WE'RE GOING TO MANAGE IT IN THE
24 PILOT BUT I THINK IT'S ONE OF THE REAL REASONS WHY IT'S HARD
25 TO MAKE A DECISION IN THAT SPACE BECAUSE YOU DO HAVE A BOTTOM



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 LINE TO KEEP THE SERVICES GOING AND THAT'S WHAT'S SO IMPORTANT
2 TO IMPROVE ON AND IT'S NOT CHEAP.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER TIEDEMANN?

5

6 **AARON TIEDEMANN:** THANK YOU. I WOULD AGREE WITH A LOT OF MY
7 COLLEAGUES ON HAVING THESE LARGE CONVERSATIONS ABOUT WHAT WE
8 NEED TO REFORM. I THINK ONE OF THE THINGS I WANTED TO -- THAT
9 DRAWS MY ATTENTION IN THIS REPORT IS THAT NUMBER, YOU KNOW,
10 THERE ARE 228 TRANSIT DECISION MAKERS ACROSS 27 BODIES, AND TO
11 LINK THAT TO OUR PREVIOUS ITEM, PEOPLE WANT EFFICIENCY AND
12 ACCOUNTABILITY. AND I DON'T THINK THAT THAT MANY DECISION
13 MAKERS AND THAT THAT MANY BODIES THAT THEY SIT ON MAKES IT
14 EASY FOR EVEN PEOPLE WHO SIT ON THOSE BODIES, LIKE
15 COMMISSIONER RABBITT SAID EARLIER -- [LAUGHTER] -- TO MAKE
16 THAT ACCOUNTABLE AND TO MAKE THEIR FEELINGS HEARD ON THE BIG
17 POLICY DECISIONS FOR THAT UNLESS YOU HAD A MAP OF ALL OF THESE
18 BODIES, I DON'T THINK THE AVERAGE PERSON WOULD KNOW WHAT TO DO
19 WITH THEM OR HOW TO GET WHAT THEY WANT IMPLEMENTED. SO, I
20 WOULD DO WHAT MANY OTHERS HAVE SAID AROUND, YOU KNOW, WE NEED
21 TO THINK ABOUT CONSOLIDATION OF SOME OF THESE, TO NOT JUST FOR
22 EFFICIENCIES, BUT MAKING IT SO PEOPLE KNOW WHERE THEY HAVE TO
23 GO TO GET THEIR ISSUES ADDRESSED AND TO GET POLICY
24 IMPLEMENTED. AND, AS WELL AS, CONSIDER HOW WE CAN MAKE MTC AS
25 THE, SORT OF, OVERALL GOVERNING STRUCTURE, THE CLEARING HOUSE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 FOR SETTING THAT LARGER SCALE POLICY. AND I THINK WE'LL HAVE
2 TO DO, TO SOME EXTENT, BOTH OF THOSE THINGS. WE'RE NOT GOING
3 TO BE ABLE TO CONSOLIDATE UNDER JUST ONE THING, BUT WE CAN DO
4 THAT AS WELL TO MAKE MTC HAVE A MORE POWERFUL HAND IN SETTING
5 THAT OVERALL POLICY. AND I WANT TO THANK ANDY FOR SAYING
6 EARLIER, OF ONE ACTIONABLE THING THAT WE SHOULD CONSIDER IN
7 DOING THAT IS STAFF CAN BRING BACK CHANGES TO LEGISLATION OF
8 MAKING IT ACTIONABLE OF HOW CAN WE TIGHT END UP THE LANGUAGE
9 IN OUR ENABLING LEGISLATION THAT MAKES IT SO THAT WE CAN MORE
10 SET POLICY AND BE THAT PLACE THAT PEOPLE CAN COME TO AND KNOW
11 THAT IF IT'S TALKED ABOUT HERE AND IF WE ARE DIRECTING IT,
12 EVEN IF THERE IS MORE THAN ONE BODY DOWN BELOW, AND MORE THAN
13 ONE TRANSIT AGENCY, IT WILL GET IMPLEMENTED AND IT'S BEING
14 HEARD. SO, I THINK THAT'S WHAT WE SHOULD AIM FOR.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WAS 1 OF 8 MEMBERS OF MTC
19 WHO WORKED THROUGH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. AND I'M VERY,
20 VERY PROUD OF THAT. WE IDENTIFIED SO MANY DIFFERENT ACTIONS
21 AND PROGRESS HAS BEEN MADE ON CERTAIN THINGS, BUT THAT'S BEEN
22 A WHILE NOW. [LAUGHTER] SCHEDULES, FARES, AND SOME REASON IT'S
23 NOT HAPPENING. AND WE NEED TO KNOW WHY. SO, WHY AREN'T WE
24 SAYING, YOU REPORT TO US WHY YOU WEREN'T ABLE TO COORDINATE
25 SCHEDULES WITH THAT OTHER OPERATOR AND THEN PROBABLY BRING THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 PARENTS INTO THE ROOM WITH A COUPLE OF COMMISSIONERS.
2 [LAUGHTER] THIS IS NOT IMPOSSIBLE. ZURICH SWITZERLAND HAS 33
3 OPERATORS IN ONE CITY YOU WOULDN'T KNOW IT IT'S COMPLETELY
4 SEAMLESS IT'S WHAT'S HAPPENING. WE WORKED ON THE TASK FORCE,
5 NEVER ONCE DID WE MENTION A MERGER BETWEEN CALTRAIN OR BART OR
6 CONSOLIDATION. WE DID DISCUSS MERGING SMALLER OPERATORS AND
7 BUS SYSTEMS AND MAYBE WE NEED TO FOCUS JUST ON THAT ASPECT OF
8 IT WITH THEM AT THE TABLE. CALTRAIN IT'S SAFE, CLEAN, WE HAVE
9 ROLLED OUT ELECTRIFICATION IT'S GOING TO BE FASTER THAN EVER
10 ARE FOR RIDERS. ANY TYPE OF CONSOLIDATION REALLY WOULDN'T
11 BENEFIT THE COMMUNITY, COST WISE, COMPLETELY OUT OF THE
12 QUESTION. WHAT IS A FOCUS THAT NEEDS TO BE DEALT WITH ON GRADE
13 SEPARATIONS. GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTIONS COME ALONG WITH THAT.
14 PUBLIC SAFETY IN THESE CROSSINGS, JOBS EFFICIENCY. WE DON'T
15 NEED TO BE DISTRACTED BY CERTAIN ACTIONS THAT WERE MENTIONED
16 HERE. WE DO HAVE THINGS TO FOCUS ON AND YOU WANT EVERYTHING ON
17 THE TABLE, MAYBE THIS BODY SHOULD LOOK AT STOP BUNDLING FUNDS.
18 LET'S PULL OUT WHAT EVERY OPERATOR IS GETTING. LET'S SEE HOW
19 EFFICIENT THEY ARE. LET'S SEE IF THEY ACTUALLY ARE BEING
20 EFFECTIVE IN WHAT THEY'RE DOING? WE ALREADY KNOW SOME ARE AND
21 SOME AREN'T. BUT STOP PRESENTING TO US. YOU HAVE GOT TO GET
22 THIS BUNDLE OF MONEY OUT THE DOOR. 45% IS GOING TO AN OPERATOR
23 THAT WE KNOW HAS BEEN LOSING FUNDS, HEMORRHAGING. BUT THAT
24 REALLY IMPACTS THE REST OF THE OPERATORS HERE. SO, IF YOU WANT
25 EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE, LET'S BE DRAMATIC HERE. LET'S TAKE A



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HARD LOOK AT WHAT'S HAPPENING HERE. AND WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
2 ENABLING LEGISLATION, IT NEEDS TO HAPPEN HERE, THIS BODY,
3 THESE POLICY MAKERS. NOT INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS, LEGISLATORS. WE
4 NEED TO COLLABORATE. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE OUR STAFF
5 UNDERSTANDS WHAT POLICIES WE WANT IN THAT ENABLING LEGISLATION
6 HERE. WE TALK ABOUT RESOLUTION 3866, WHICH WAS A HUGE
7 DISCOVERY FOR ME AS A NEW COMMISSIONER. WHICH GIVES US A LOT
8 OF POWER. WE JUST DON'T USE IT. WE DON'T HOLD THEM
9 ACCOUNTABLE. WE DON'T SAY YOU DIDN'T COORDINATE YOUR
10 SCHEDULES, YOU DIDN'T DO THIS, THEREFORE YOU'RE NOT GETTING
11 THE FUNDING. THAT'S WHAT THAT RESOLUTION SAYS. WE DON'T HOLD
12 THEM ACCOUNTABLE. SO WE KNOW WHAT THE CONSUMERS WANT. WE'LL
13 HAVE KNOWN WE HAVE KNOWN FOR A LONG TIME. WE NEED TO DO THIS
14 RIGHT. SO LET'S PUT SOME TEETH TO THE MEASURE HERE AND LET'S -
15 - THIS BODY HAS HAD A GREAT CONVERSATION HERE, BUT WHEN IT
16 GOES TO THE FULL COMMISSION, NONE OF THE COMMENTS, NONE OF THE
17 QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN PULLED OUT TODAY GENERALLY GET TO THE
18 FULL BODY. WE NEED TO START MODIFYING THE WAY WE DO BUSINESS
19 HERE SO THAT WE'RE NOT REPEATING OURSELVES. [LAUGHTER] AND WE
20 GET REAL RESULTS. SO, LET'S REALLY -- YOU WANT EVERYTHING ON
21 THE TABLE, LET'S TAKE A LOOK AT HOW WE OPERATE, HOW WE DO
22 BUSINESS. WE CAN BE VERY, VERY EFFECTIVE. AND THAT'S WHAT WE
23 ALL WANT TO DO HERE. SO, LET'S BE THE POLICY MAKERS THAT WE
24 ARE. AND LET'S -- WE COLLABORATE. WE HAVE DONE THAT. THERE HAS
25 BEEN LEGISLATION HERE. THEY HAVE BEEN SEAMLESS LEGISLATION.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THE LAST SEAMLESS LEGISLATION WAS KILLED BY ONE OPERATOR,
2 BEHIND THE SCENES. SO, LET'S REALLY HOLD PEOPLE ACCOUNTABLE.
3 AND GET THE JOB DONE. I KNOW WE CAN DO IT. WE JUST NEED TO FIX
4 THOSE LITTLE NUANCES. THIS IS EVEN BEFORE A MEASURE GOES
5 FORWARD HERE. LET'S SHOW THE PUBLIC, WE CAN GET YOU REAL
6 RESULTS, REAL FAST. [LAUGHTER] BUT YOU NEED TO REALLY COMMIT.
7 AND ONE THING ABOUT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, WE GOT THE
8 BUY-IN FROM THE MANAGERS. WE NEVER GOT SIGN OFF FROM ALL THOSE
9 BOARDS THAT RUN THE MANAGERS. SOME DID, SOME DIDN'T. WE DIDN'T
10 REQUIRE THAT. AND MAYBE WE SHOULD SAY, LOOK, WE NEED THESE
11 THINGS -- WE NEED YOU TO COMMIT TO THESE THINGS THEN WE CAN
12 GET TO THE POINT AND BY THAT WE'RE SHOWING THE PUBLIC WE'RE
13 INSISTING ON EFFICIENCIES, BELIEVABILITY, AND FISCAL
14 RESPONSIBILITY. I HOPE WE CAN DO ALL THAT MOVING FORWARD BUT
15 IT'S REALLY GOING TO TAKE UNITY

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING GO TO CHAIR
18 PEDROZA THEN COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, I HAVEN'T FORGOTTEN ABOUT
19 YOU. SO WE'RE GOING TO GO TO CHAIR PEDROZA.

20

21 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA I WAS JUST IN
22 SWITZERLAND AND IT'S HARD TO COMPARE. WE'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE
23 COMPARISON OF APPLES TO APPLES BUT IT'S GOOD TO LEARN FROM
24 OTHER REGIONS AND HOW THEY OPERATE. THERE IS A DESIRE TO COME
25 BACK QUICKLY ON IMPROVEMENT AND WHAT AUTHORITY WE HAVE NOT TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 REVISIT A TRIP DOWN MEMORY LANE BUT AS COMMISSIONER SPERING
2 SAID, DO WE WANT TO HAVE THAT AUTHORITY, IF NOT HOW DO WE GET
3 IT. THAT'S A QUESTION WE NEED TO ASK AND ANSWER AT THE
4 COMMISSION SOON. SECOND IS THE BROADER DISCUSSION OF
5 REENVISIONING TRANSIT. COMMISSIONER PAPAN EVERYTHING HAS TO BE
6 ON THE TABLE AND IF THOSE OPERATORS ARE DOING GOOD WORK IT'S
7 GOING TO SHOW. AND IT'S GOING TO ADDRESS THE VISION THAT WE
8 WANT. SO I DON'T THINK WE NEED TO EMBRACE THE PROTECTIONIST
9 MENTALITY IT'S JUST LET'S BRING EVERYONE TOGETHER FIND ERRORS
10 AND WEAKNESS AND STRENGTHS, AND IMPROVE AND BUILD OFF THAT
11 THIS IS NOT TEAR DOWN AND REBUILD THIS IS ENHANCEMENT. THAT'S
12 HOW WE SEGMENT THIS CONGRESSIONAL ARE THAT LEADS TO REGIONAL
13 MEASURE. BUT I WANT TO BE CLEAR WITH STAFF WHAT WE'RE ASKING
14 OF YOU TO COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION IN THE SHORT-TERM WHAT
15 WE NEED THAT'S GOING TO SHAPE THE REGIONAL MEASURE. I WANT TO
16 MAKE SURE WE SUMMARIZE SO STAFF KNOWS WHAT TO COME BACK WITH.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** EXACTLY. DOREEN?

19

20 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO EXPRESS MY AGREEMENT
21 WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THIS
22 FOR A LONG TIME, THAT WE HAVE HAD -- [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO
23 DISTORTION] FOR A LONG TIME, AND I THINK THAT THE FEDERAL
24 GOVERNMENT, IN GENERAL, WOULD LOOK KINDLY UPON MORE EFFORT TO
25 COORDINATE. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. I SEE NO OTHER HAND RAISED. WHY
3 DON'T WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS IAN
4 GRIFFITHS, SEAMLESS BAY AREA. IAN.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD
7 WITH THIS ENABLING LEGISLATION THIS YEAR. AND REALLY APPLAUD
8 THE STAFF REPORT AND THE REALLY THE HIGHLIGHTING OF THE NEED
9 TO STRENGTHEN NETWORK MANAGEMENT. WE STRONGLY SUPPORT THAT.
10 MTC IS THE RIGHT BODY TO DID THAT BUT A QUICK QUESTION LOOKING
11 AT ENABLING LEGISLATION IS HOW WE SET UP MTC TO SUCCEED AS AN
12 EFFECTIVE NETWORK MANAGER, AND THAT MEANS ADDRESSING MANDATE
13 AND CAPACITY IT TAKE ON THESE FUNCTIONS WITHIN THE
14 ORGANIZATION TO LEAD IT TO DEVELOP THE RIGHT STANDARDS TO HAVE
15 CONFIDENCE THAT IF YOU'RE GOING TO CONDITION MONEY TO
16 ALLOCATIONS THAT YOU HAVE GOT THE RIGHT EXPERTISE, IN HOUSE,
17 TO DO THAT. SO, THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. BUT, ALSO, THE
18 DECISION-MAKING SO DECISIONS ARE VIEWED AS LEGITIMATE BY
19 OPERATORS AND THE PUBLIC. SO, WE HAVE A LETTER THAT'S
20 INCORPORATING EXPERTS, INDEPENDENT EXPERTS, INTO THE NETWORK
21 DECISION-MAKING NETWORK MANAGEMENT. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE GLEN OVERTON. MR.
24 OVERTON?

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THE BAY AREA IS A LEADING TECHNOLOGY CENTER.
2 WHAT IS LAGGING IN TRANSPORTATION? WHY IS THAT? I'M TIRED OF
3 THE EGOTISTICAL INNER-AGENCY OF FIGHTING. I'M JUST A COMMITTEE
4 OF ONE HERE. JUST ONE. AND I HATE WHAT YOU'RE DOING. I GO ON
5 GOOGLE, AND IT INTEGRATES, FOR ME, ALL OVER THE UNITED STATES.
6 I DON'T EVEN NEED YOUR -- IF YOU JUST MAKE ONE APPLICATION FOR
7 ALL OF THE REGIONAL TRANSITS, YOU COULD CALL IT "BAY AREA
8 METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION LINK." AND THEN, IF YOU ARE
9 PETALUMA, YOU COULD JUST SIMPLY SAY, "BAY AREA METROPOLITAN
10 TRANSPORTATION LINK PETALUMA." WHAT I'M SAYING IS INTEGRATE
11 NOW, OPTIMIZE LATER. WRITE THE SOFTWARE. PRESENT IT TO THEM. I
12 HATE ALL THESE SOFTWARE WITH THESE DIFFERENT PERSONALITIES.
13 IT'S MY TIME. IS MY TIME GONE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** BECAUSE I'M NOT DONE.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GIVE THE GENTLEMAN 20 MORE SECONDS.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THE BRAIN, THE HEART, THE STOMACH, THE LIVER, THEY
22 ALL PERFORM DIFFERENT FUNCTIONS. BUT GUESS WHAT? YOU'RE ONE
23 ENTITY, MULTIPLE FUNCTIONS TO PRESENT ONE ENTITY, YOU SEE? ONE
24 INTEGRATED ENTITY. THANK YOU.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, SIR. WE HAVE EMILY
2 LOPER. MISS LOPER.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR CANEPA AND COMMISSIONERS.
5 EMILY LOPER WITH BAY AREA COUNCIL. SO, WE HAVE LED MAJOR
6 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURES OVER THE YEARS, OF COURSE. AND
7 MOST RECENTLY FASTER AND RM3, AND TODAY OUR ECONOMIC RECOVERY
8 DEPENDS ON OUR ABILITY TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR PEOPLE TO MOVE
9 AROUND THE REGION. SO, WE WERE PROUD TO HELP SECURE STATE
10 FUNDING TO PUSH OFF THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF FOR A COUPLE OF
11 YEARS, BUT WE RECOGNIZE THAT ADDITIONAL REVENUE WILL BE
12 NECESSARY TO BUILD THIS WORLD CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WE
13 ENVISION FOR THE BAY AREA. HOWEVER BEFORE ASKING VOTERS FOR
14 ADDITIONAL MONEY WE WANT TO SEE IMPROVEMENTS ON THE SYSTEMS TO
15 REBUILD VOTER TRUST AND PUBLIC CONFIDENCE IN THESE SERVICES.
16 SO WE AGREE WITH MUCH OF WHAT'S BEEN SAID ABOUT THE GOALS AND
17 PRIORITIES FOR THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND THE REGIONAL
18 MEASURE. SOME OF OUR TOP PRIORITIES ARE, ONE, IT IS ESSENTIAL
19 THAT WE MAKE TRANSIT SAFE AND CLEAN. BART HAS MADE A LOT OF
20 GREAT PROGRESS IN THIS AREA IN THE PAST COUPLE OF MONTHS BUT
21 WE NEED TO BUILD ON THAT BEFORE GOING TO THE VOTERS. TWO WE
22 WANT TO WORK QUICKLY TO DELIVER THAT SEAMLESS CONNECTED
23 NETWORK ACROSS OUR 27 OPERATORS, AS WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSS -- AS
24 YOU ALL HAVE DISCUSSED AT LENGTH TODAY. TO THAT END WE SUPPORT
25 THE PROPOSAL OUTLINED HERE TO EXPAND THE POWER AND AUTHORITY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE AS PART OF THE
2 ENABLING LEGISLATION.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIME PLEASE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** -- THREE: WE BELIEVE SERVICES FEED TO BE MAINTAINED
7 AND RESTORE TO MANAGE OUR DOWNTOWN RECOVERY WE SUPPORT KEEPING
8 THE PLAN FLEXIBILITY BUT SUPPORT THE INCLUSION OF HIGHWAY AND
9 ROAD IMPROVEMENTS TO BE ATTRACTIVE TO A WIDE RANGE OF BAY AREA
10 RESIDENTS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHARLIE LAVERY?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR CANEPA, COMMISSIONERS.
15 CHARLIE LAVERY, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND OPERATING
16 ENGINEERS LOCAL THREE. AS WORKERS, WE KNOW EQUITY VALUE OF
17 TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION CONNECTING COMMUNITIES TO
18 OPPORTUNITY. WE KNOW OUR CURRENT SYSTEM IS NOT DOING THAT. A
19 SYSTEM THAT CONNECTS REQUIRES CAPITAL INVESTMENT. WE
20 ACKNOWLEDGE THE EQUITY VALUE OF CONTINUITY TO SERVICES THAT
21 ARE CURRENTLY CONNECTING UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES TO
22 OPPORTUNITIES NEED TO BE SUSTAINED. OUR ASK TODAY IS THIS BODY
23 ACT JUDICIOUSLY AND TAKE THE TIME TO DELIBERATE AND FIND
24 BALANCE OF FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS AND NECESSARY CAPITAL
25 IMPROVEMENT AND INVESTMENT IN THE PROJECTS, THE BIG PROJECTS,



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THAT WILL DELIVER A SYSTEM THAT MEETS THE LONG-TERM REGIONAL
2 NEEDS, INCLUDING CONNECTIVITY AT THE LOCAL STATE LEVEL,
3 RESILIENCY, ENERGY TRANSITION AND CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION. I
4 BELIEVE WE HEARD TODAY SUPPORT FOR SIGNIFICANT CAPITAL
5 IMPROVEMENTS IN A FUNDING MEASURE IF IT IS TO PASS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. MR. CLERK, DO WE HAVE FOLKS ON
8 ZOOM? AND HOW MANY PEOPLE DO WE HAVE ON ZOOM?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE MOMENT, PLEASE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE 11 MEMBERS OF ATTENDEES FOR
13 PUBLIC COMMENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. WE'LL DO ONE MINUTE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR FIRST SPEAKER IS GREG
18 GREENWAY. GO AHEAD PLEASE. ONE MINUTE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M SPEAKING FOR CHAMBER SAN MATEO COUNTY.
21 WE ALSO SUBMITTED A LETTER TO THE COMMITTEE. APPRECIATE THE
22 CONVERSATION TODAY. REGARDING POTENTIAL ITEMS TO BE INCLUDED
23 IN THE REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE THERE IS A LOT OF CONCERN
24 ABOUT THIS IN SAN MATEO COUNTY PARTICULARLY THE IDEA THAT
25 CALTRAIN MIGHT BE CONSOLIDATED WITH BART AND OTHER AGENCIES.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 YOU HAVE HAD CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT TODAY. AND I CERTAINLY
2 APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS A MOMENT AGO. WE
3 CERTAINLY SUPPORT THE IDEA OF HAVING AN INTEGRATED TRANSIT
4 SYSTEM OUR CONCERN IS HOW CALTRAIN ARE INCLUDED IN THAT
5 CONVERSATION. TWO MAIN POINTS. PLEASE BALANCE LOCAL CONTROL
6 WITH REGIONAL INTEGRATION AS YOU CONSIDER A SEAMLESS TRANSIT
7 SYSTEM. AND PLEASE ENGAGE THE PUBLIC AND LOCAL STAKEHOLDERS IN
8 A MEANINGFUL WAY. THIS IS A HUGE ISSUE. THE PUBLIC PROCESS
9 SHOULD BE COMMENSURATE WITH THAT. EDUCATE THE PUBLIC ABOUT
10 OPTIONS AVAILABLE AS COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID. THE PUBLIC MAY
11 BE EASILY CONFUSED AND I WANT TO AMPLIFY AND SUPPORT RAY
12 MUELLER'S COMMENTS ON THE LAST ITEM. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS LAUREL
15 PADGETT. GO AHEAD.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS LAUREL FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES THANKS FOR THE
18 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION HAS
19 ABUNDANT TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA PARALLEL TO A REGIONAL
20 MEASURE WE ARE WORKING FOR THE MTC CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN AND
21 WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES VISIONARY PLANS TO ILLUSTRATE WHAT TYPE
22 OF SERVICE FUNDING COULD PROVIDE FOCUSING ON RESTRUCTURING TO
23 ADDRESS EFFICIENCY AND TRANSIT OPERATING COST BUT FOR BUS AND
24 STREET RAIL BIGGEST CAUSE OF OPERATING IN EFFICIENCY IS
25 TRAFFIC CONGESTION. MTC IS WORKING TO COORDINATE ON STREET



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 FEDERAL PRIORITY AND REGIONAL MEASURE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION
2 FOR POLICY CHANGE TO SPEED UP THIS WORK AND SPEED UP OUR
3 TRANSIT SERVICE PROVIDERS WE SUPPORT A STRENGTHENED
4 ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE FOR TRANSIT COORDINATION BUT IT NEEDS
5 TO ENGAGE PRIORITIZE LEADERSHIP OF TRANSIT WORKERS AND RIDERS.
6 MTC'S CURRENT STRUCTURE DOES NOT ADEQUATELY REPRESENT THE
7 TRANSIT RIDERS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS PETER STRAUSS.
10 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS PETER
13 STRAUSS, ON THE BOARD OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS AND PART
14 OF THE VOICES COALITION. I WANT TO RETURN TO SOME OF THE
15 BASICS. REBECCA'S MEMO MENTIONED THREE FOCUS AREAS WHICH ALIGN
16 CLOSELY WITH OUR PRINCIPLES I WANT TO COMMENT ON THE FIRST ONE
17 WHICH COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA REFERRED TO, ALSO, WHICH IS
18 PROTECT AND ENHANCE TRANSIT SERVICE. REBECCA MENTIONED THE
19 FIGURE OF \$1 BILLION, YOU KNOW, TO SUPPORT THIS MEASURE. BUT
20 IN TERMS OF OUR OPERATING SYSTEMS NEEDS WE NEED TO STRIVE FOR
21 A REVENUE STREAM MORE LIKE A BILLION DOLLARS, 1.5 BILLION FOR
22 TRANSIT, HALF A BILLION FOR OTHER NEEDS. THIS IS A CHALLENGE
23 BUT WE NEED TO ACHIEVE A TWO BILLED REVENUE STREAM TO ALLOW
24 TRANSIT TO RECOVERY AND MODESTLY EXPAND. THANK YOU.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA
2 LEVIN. GO AHEAD PLEASE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I WANTED TO SUPPORT THE COMMENTS FROM ALLIES
5 AT VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AS WELL AS BUILD ON IAN
6 GRIFFITHS'S COMMENTS FOR SEAMLESS BAY AREA. WITH REGARD TO THE
7 POLLING CLEARLY SHOWED THAT VOTERS WANT TO SEE MORE CONVENIENT
8 AND SEAMLESS TRANSIT SYSTEM AND THEY WANT ACCOUNTABILITY FOR
9 THAT. AND I THINK WHAT THAT CLEARLY IMPLIES IS THAT REFORMS TO
10 CREATE THAT ACCOUNTABILITY NEED TO BE INCLUDED IN THE
11 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION. THAT RESOLUTION 3866 PUT STRINGS ON
12 FUNDING BASED ON PREVIOUS LEGISLATION FOR STA FUNDS. IF THERE
13 IS GOING TO BE A LARGE SOURCE OF NEW REGIONAL FUNDING, THERE
14 NEEDS TO BE, BAKED IN, THE FACT THAT RECEIVING THOSE FUNDS ARE
15 GOING TO NEED TO BE KEYED TO DELIVERING ON THE TRANSFORMATION
16 ACTION PLAN INITIATIVES. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS CHRISTINE
19 FITZGERALD. GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

20

21 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU. I COULDN'T AGREE MORE WITH
22 ALL THE SPEAKERS THAT HAVE PREVIOUSLY TALKED. AND I WOULD LIKE
23 TO ADD TO THE CONVERSATION BY SAYING TWO THINGS. LOOKING AT
24 THE ENABLING LEGISLATION, THERE SHOULD ALSO BE, NOT ONLY THE
25 ACCOUNTABILITY AND THE TRACKING, BUT ALSO THE FOLLOW UP TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 SHOW WHAT HAS BEEN DONE. AND REALLY HELP THE COMMUNITY
2 UNDERSTAND WHAT HAS AND HASN'T BEEN ACHIEVED AND THE TIMELINES
3 THAT FOLLOW. AND THE OTHER THING THAT I WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT
4 ON IS, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR POINTING OUT THE ONE SEAT RIDES.
5 PARATRANSIT, IT RELIES ON FIXED ROUTES. AND FIXED ROUTES, WHEN
6 YOU CHANGE ANYTHING IN THE SYSTEM, AND CHANGE IN THE NATURE OF
7 PARATRANSIT. KNOWING THAT PARATRANSIT RELIES ON ADA AND FDA
8 BACKING, WE REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT THAT AND, YOU KNOW,
9 REORGANIZE THAT BETTER.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT SPEAKER IS BOB ALAN.
12 GO AHEAD, PLEASE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. BOB ALAN WITH URBAN HABITAT AND VOICES FOR
15 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THERE ARE A LOT OF REFORMS WE NEED TO
16 MAKE. ONE REFORM WE HAVE BEEN TRYING TO GET THROUGH THAT MTC
17 HAS CONTROL IS MAKING SURE WE HAVE ENOUGH FUNDING TO DO THE
18 REFORMS. BIGGEST REFORM WOULD BE OPERATING TRANSIT SERVICE AS
19 FREQUENT ENOUGH LEVELS THAT WOULD GET PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS
20 AND THAT IS SOMETHING YOU WILL HAVE MORE CONTROL OVER IF YOU
21 ENABLING LEGISLATION TOGETHER AT THE REVENUE LEVELS THAT PETER
22 STRAUSS TALKED ABOUT WHICH IS MORE LIKE TWO BILLED, WE HAVE TO
23 TALK TO VOTERS AND GET REFORMS IF YOU ASK 20 DIFFERENT VOTERS
24 YOU WILL PROBABLY GET 20 DIFFERENT REFORMS. IT'S NOT A
25 REGIONAL MEASURE. WE KNOW THIS BODY, METROPOLITAN



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, WILL RESIDE OVER THE COMPLETE
2 DEMISE OVER PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. THAT'S THE
3 REALITY. WE HAVE BEEN AVOIDING THE STRUCTURAL ISSUE OF
4 OPERATING FUNDS, GET THAT IN PLACE, GET THE MONEY TO DO THE
5 REFORMS THEN WIN THE VOTERS AT THE BALLOT IN HOPEFULLY 2026.
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS RHYAN FROM SENATOR WIENER'S
9 OFFICE FOLLOWED BY LARISSA.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS RYAN PROVIDING
12 PUBLIC COMMENT ON BEHALF OF SENATOR SCOTT WIENER THANK YOU FOR
13 YOUR STRONG SUPPORT IN OUR SUCCESSFUL PUSH FOR NEAR-TERM
14 TRANSIT OPERATIONS FUNDING IN THIS YEAR'S STATE BUDGET TO
15 PREVENT SERVICE CUTS THIS FUNDING IS TEMPORARY THOUGH WE STILL
16 FACE A MAJOR ONGOING FISCAL CLIFF WE HAVE TO SET UP WITH LONG-
17 TERM FUNDING I SUPPORT A REGIONAL TRANSIT TRANSPORTATION
18 MEASURE, SENATOR WIENER SUPPORTS A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
19 MEASURE THAT PROVIDES SHORTFALL OF AVOIDING REVENUE FOR
20 TRANSIT OPERATIONS EXPANDS TRANSIT AND TRANSFORMS THE SYSTEM
21 FOR THE RIDER THAT ADDITIONAL REFER NEWS SHOULD BE ACCOMPANIED
22 BY SAFETY, CLEANLINESS AND RELIABILITY IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL AS
23 SEAMLESS SYSTEM THAT PROVIDES AN INTEGRATED EXPERIENCE FOR THE
24 RIDER WE CAN'T GO BACK TO STATUS QUO WE NEED TO DEVELOP
25 CONSENSUS TRANSFORMATIVE VISION FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER IS AN EFFECTIVE EXAMPLE OF THIS
2 VISION. AS THIS EXPRESS COMMENCES IN EARNEST DISCUSSIONS ABOUT
3 SENSITIVE REFORMS --

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT'S OKAY. THE NEXT SPEAKER.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** NEXT UP IS LARISSA FOLLOWED BY ANDREW.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR CANEPA AND MEMBERS OF THE
12 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS LARISSA, SPEAKING ON BEHALF
13 OF ROSEANNE FOUSE AND SAN MATEO COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
14 ASSOCIATION. WE SUBMITTED A LETTER YESTERDAY COSIGNED WITH
15 CHAMBER SAN MATEO COUNTY AND CALIFORNIANS ADVOCATING FOR
16 RESPONSIBLE REAL DESIGN OPPOSING CONSOLIDATION OF CALTRAIN AND
17 BART AS PART OF ENABLING LEGISLATIVE EFFORTS. WE WOULD LIKE IT
18 ECHO COMMENTS SUBMITTED BY SPUR IN THE LETTER AND SUPPORT
19 CONCERNS EXPRESSED BY THE BOARDS OF SAMTRANS AND CALTRAIN. IF
20 A 2026 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE TO SUCCEED, IT
21 WILL REQUIRE UNANIMOUS CONSENSUS AMONG STAKEHOLDERS LEADING UP
22 TO ELECTION DAY. MTC'S CURRENT SUGGESTIONS OF CALTRAIN BART
23 CONSOLIDATION IS DISRUPTIVE AND DISTRACTING. THANK YOU.

24



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE ANDREW FOLLOWED BY
2 NADYA.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS ANDREW. DESPITE THE FACT THAT THIS
5 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION TAX MEASURE IS DESIGNED AS A PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT MEASURE MTC STAFF IS RIGHT NOW PLANNING FOR ABOUT 20%
7 OF THE FUNDS GENERATED BY THE MEASURE TO BE SPENT ON HIGHWAY
8 CAPACITY EXPANSION PROJECTS. IN OTHER WORDS, WIDENING THE
9 HIGHWAYS WITH ADDITIONAL LANES FOR MORE CAR TRAFFIC, OR
10 REBUILDING HIGHWAY INTERCHANGE SES FOR MORE CAR TRAFFIC DURING
11 THE MORNING AND EVENING WEEKDAY RUSH HOURS. NOW, THAT'S EVEN
12 TRUE IF THEY'RE CARPOOL LANES OR EXPRESS LANES BECAUSE THOSE
13 LANES ARE CREATED ONLY BY WIDENING THE HIGHWAY AND PUTTING
14 ADDITIONAL LANES THERE. WIDENING HIGHWAYS FOR MORE CAR TRAFFIC
15 IS VERY MUCH IN VIOLATION OF ALL THE GOALS PROPOSED FOR THIS
16 TRANSPORTATION TAX MEASURE SUCH AS A CLIMATE FRIENDLY
17 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT IS SAFE, ACCESSIBLE, AND CONVENIENT
18 FOR ALL, HOW EXPANSIONS SHOULD NOT BE INCLUDE IN THE THIS TAX
19 MEASURE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NADYA FOLLOWED BY AMY THOMPSON.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS NADYA NYAK COFOUNDER OF
24 CARB. WE'RE ADVOCACY GROUP ON THE PENINSULA WORKING SINCE 2009
25 AND HAVE HELPED IN VARIOUS TAX MEASURE CAMPAIGNS. WE SUPPORT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 ENABLING LEGISLATION. BUT MERGING CALTRAIN AND BART IS A
2 SOLUTION TO A PROBLEM THAT DOESN'T EXIST. THERE ARE NO
3 EFFICACIES TO BE HAD FROM MERGING COMPLETELY TECHNOLOGICALLY
4 DIFFERENT SYSTEMS. FROM A RIDER PERSPECTIVE, IF BART SWALLOWS
5 CALTRAIN, THE PENINSULA AND SOUTH COUNTY NEEDS WILL BE
6 ECLIPSED BY THOSE LARGER SYSTEM. THE CHALLENGE IN RUNNING THE
7 MEASURE CAMPAIGN IN SANTA CLARA WAS ENSURING THE MONEY
8 WOULDN'T BE TAKEN BY BART. VOTERS REMEMBER THE HISTORY HERE.
9 ANY DISCUSSION EVER MERGING B.A.R.T. AND CALTRAIN WOULD KILL
10 SUPPORT FOR THIS TAX MEASURE. FREQUENT TRANSFERS AND FARE
11 INTEGRATION ARE THE THINGS VOTERS WANT TO SUPPORT IN PUBLIC
12 TRANSIT. PLEASE FOCUS ON THESE PROBLEMS AND DON'T INCLUDE A
13 POISON PILL IN THE MEASURE OR ALL TRANSIT WILL SUFFER. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS AMY THOMPSON. WITH THE LAST
17 SPEAKER BEING CYRUS HALL.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI THERE. MY NAME IS AMY WITH TRANSFORM. I APPRECIATE
20 THE WORK MOVING FORWARD THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION LETTER. IN
21 ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION VISION
22 OF FREQUENT RELIABLE SAFE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA THAT
23 SUPPORTS CURRENT RIDERS THAT IS ENOUGH TO GET PEOPLE OUT OF
24 THEIR CARS WE MUST ADOPT THIS LEGISLATION THIS YEAR ANY
25 RESTRUCTURING OR ACCOUNTABILITY SHOULD PRIORITIZE TRANSIT



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 DRIVERS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE TWO MOST IMPORTANT THINGS OF
2 THE VISION OF THE BAY AREA, SERVICE INCREASES AND TRANSIT --
3 [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS IS WHAT TRANSIT RIDERS WILL --
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] EVERY DAY WHEN THEY GET WHERE THEY'RE GOING.
5 TRANSIT PRIORITY WILL BE LEADING PARTS OF THE MEASURE AND
6 [INDISCERNIBLE] -- COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS TODAY. THANK YOU VERY
7 MUCH.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, AMY. NEXT UP IS DIANE HOWARD --
10 I MEAN, CYRUS HALL FOLLOWED BY DIANE HOWARD.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS, MY NAME IS CYRUS HALL.
13 I USE TRANSIT AND RIDE MY BICYCLE AROUND THE BAY. I WOULD LIKE
14 TO GIVE ADDITIONAL FRAMING TO THE REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE. 3B
15 GIVES MEAT TO THE BONES OF WHAT A 2026 REGIONAL MEASURE SHOULD
16 DO IT SAYS STAFF PROPOSES A MEASURE CENTRAL GOAL TO BE A
17 CLIMATE FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT'S SAFE ACCESS AND
18 I BELIEVE CONVENIENT FOR ALL THIS IS A GREAT START BUT I WILL
19 LIKE TO SUGGEST THE VISION NEEDS TO BE SIGNIFICANTLY MORE
20 AGGRESSIVE. CARB HAS MADE IT CLEAR THE STATE MUST REDUCE VMT
21 BY 25% BY 2030 THAT'S 40 YEARS. EFFICIENTLY SCALING THE VITAL
22 GOAL INCREASE IN SCALE WOULD BE EQUITABLE PROVIDING SERVICE TO
23 AREAS THAT ARE CURRENTLY UNDERSERVED. I RECOMMEND MTC LOOK AT
24 SIGNIFICANTLY MORE THAN 1 BILLION IN THIS MEASURE TO MEET THIS
25 CRITICAL CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOAL. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU CYRUS. OUR FINAL SPEAKER IS
3 GOING TO BE DIANE HOWARD.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS DIANE HOWARD. I'M ON THE CITY
6 COUNCIL IN REDWOOD CITY. STRONG SUPPORTER OF CALTRAIN
7 ELECTRIFICATION AND GRADE SEPARATIONS AND ACTIVE ADVOCATE FOR
8 FUTURE ROAD WOOD CITY WATER TRANSIT. I AM NOT SUPPORTIVE OF
9 CALTRAIN CONSOLIDATION WITH ANOTHER AGENCY AS IT WOULD IMPOSE
10 SIGNIFICANT UP FRONT COST AND PROVIDE NO CLEAR BENEFIT FOR
11 CALTRAIN RIDERS. THIS DISTRACTIONS COULD IMPEDE PROGRESS AT A
12 TIME WHEN FOCUS SHOULD BE ON ADVANCING RECOVERY EFFORTS AND
13 FULFILLING THE PROMISE OF ELECTRIFICATION. INSTEAD I ASK MTC
14 LEADERS AND STAFF TO PRIORITIZE THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A
15 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER AND FOCUS ON THEIR COMMITMENT TO
16 SUPPORTING STATE EFFORTS RELATED TO SB125 AND THE TWIT
17 RECOVERY TASK FORCE. THESE OTHER AND EXISTING POLICIES,
18 PROGRAMS, AND SOLUTIONS HAVE THE POTENTIAL FOR MEANINGFUL
19 IMPROVEMENTS TO TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATIONS AND THE PASSENGER
20 EXPERIENCE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS
23 OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED IN ZOOM. WRITTEN
24 CORRESPOND WAS RECEIVED FROM CONGRESS MEMBERS ASHOO, MULLIN,
25 LOFGREN, PANETTA, SENATOR JOSH BECKER, VOICES FOR PUBLIC



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION, SPUR, CARB, CHAMBER OF SAN MATEO COUNTY, SAM
2 CEDA, SAMTRANS, SEAMLESS BAY AREA, AND CALTRAIN.
3 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED WAS POSTED ONLINE AND DISTRIBUTED TO
4 ALL COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** MR. FREMIER COULD YOU WRAP UP AND
7 SUMMARIZE?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK THERE WAS A LETTER FROM ASSEMBLYMEMBER
10 PAPAN AND BERMAN.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** LET THE RECORD SHOW THAT COMMISSIONER
13 PAPAN SAYS THAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER PAPAN AND BERMAN HAVE SENT A
14 LETTER AND WE'LL LOOK INTO THAT. MR. FREMIER?

15

16 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU FOR THAT CHAIR CANEPA, AND I REALLY
17 DO APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION AND A LOT OF THE INPUT EVEN IN
18 THE PUBLIC COMMENT WAS VERY IMPORTANT FOR US. YOU KNOW, ONE
19 THING I THINK IS VERY CLEAR AT THE OUTSET THAT FOR A MEASURE
20 TO BE SUPPORTED, WE NEED TO REALLY COME FORWARD WITH SOME VERY
21 DIRECT ACCOUNTABILITY AND REFORMS IN THE SYSTEM. AND WHAT
22 THOSE MIGHT BE ARE DOWN A VERY LONG LIST OF ITEMS IN THE
23 SPECTRUM THAT MAYBE ENDS, TO COMMISSIONER RABBITT'S POINT, AT
24 ONE AGENCY, BUT NOT NECESSARILY HAVING TO GET THERE, BUT I
25 THINK KIND OF RUNNING DOWN THAT LIST. THE OTHER THING THAT WE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HEARD VERY MUCH AND SEEMS TO BE QUITE A BIT OF CONSENSUS IS
2 THAT YOU HAVE TO FOCUS ON SOLUTIONS THAT ARE IMPORTANT FOR THE
3 CUSTOMER. AND SO WHATEVER WE DO, THAT IS THE PRIMARY RECIPIENT
4 OF THE BENEFIT. WE NEED TO COME BACK AND, SORT OF, REAFFIRM
5 WHAT SOME OF THE FOUNDATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS ARE THAT YOU HAVE
6 ALREADY SET US DOWN THE PATH ON WHICH INCLUDES MOST OF THE
7 ITEMS THAT WE'RE CURRENTLY WORKING ON IN THE TRANSFORMATION
8 ACTION PLAN. WHERE THE NEW THINGS START TO COME IN, AND I
9 THINK IT'S IDENTIFIED AT LEAST WHAT OUR STATUTE STRENGTH IS,
10 WE NEED TO FIND SOME OF THE GAPS IN OUR AUTHORITY THAT HELP US
11 ACHIEVE SOME OF THESE GOALS THAT SEEM TO BE MISSING. AND THAT
12 HAPPENS TO BE AROUND FARE AND SCHEDULE COORDINATION AS MUCH AS
13 ANYTHING ELSE. WE IDENTIFIED THE IDEA THAT WE HAVE GOT THE
14 TRANSIT SUSTAINABLE WORK AND THE RAIL STUDIES THAT ARE IN
15 THERE. WE CLEARLY NEED TO PROVIDE A LITTLE BIT OF EDUCATION
16 FOR THE BROADER COMMISSION SO THAT THOSE ITEMS AREN'T LOST AND
17 ALL THAT HARD WORK IS NOT FORGOTTEN OR TAKEN ADVANTAGE OF. AND
18 THEN SEE WHICH ONE OF THOSE SPECIFIC ITEMS ARE WORTH REALLY
19 JUMPING INTO. WE ALSO COMMITTED TO REALLY PUTTING SOME
20 STRUCTURE AROUND THE CURRENT NORTH BAY PILOTS AND SEE IF
21 WHETHER OR NOT THEY CAN APPLY IN OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION, IN
22 PARTICULAR, AROUND SOME OF THE BUS OPERATIONS. AND THEN, ALSO,
23 TO HIGHLIGHT, I THINK, TO GET TO SOME OF THE IMPROVEMENT IN
24 SERVICE REQUIREMENTS THAT PEOPLE REALLY ARE LOOKING FOR, WHAT
25 KINDS OF RISKS MIGHT MTC NEED TO TAKE ON IN ORDER TO REALLY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 USE THAT AUTHORITY PROPERLY. THE TRANSIT VISION THAT WE HAVE
2 IS REALLY IDENTIFIED BY CREATING A WORLD CLASS RELIABLE,
3 AFFORDABLE, AND CONNECTED TRANSPORTATION NETWORK, DOES RELY ON
4 THE NEED TO FIND SOME ADDITIONAL REVENUE; THAT'S VERY CLEAR.
5 AND SO WE ALSO NEED TO CONTINUE TO WORK WITH OUR FRIEND UP IN
6 SACRAMENTO TO REALLY IDENTIFY HOW WE CAN MARRY THE CHALLENGES
7 THAT WE HAVE IN THE REGION WITH THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE
8 ACROSS THE STATE. AND SO BRINGING SOME OF THAT INFORMATION
9 FORWARD TO, AND REALLY KIND OF CLARIFYING WHAT KIND OF
10 ADDITIONAL REVENUE WE MIGHT NEED IS WHAT I THINK YOU JUST TOLD
11 US TO GO EMBARK ON AND RETURN AND IN A SHORT ORDER

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK THE SUMMARY IS GREAT. ONE OF THE
14 THINGS I'M THINKING ABOUT, IF WE MOVE FORWARD, WHEN WE PURSUE
15 THIS BILL, IS HOW WE SHOULD SET UP MTC TO BE A STRONGER
16 NETWORK MANAGER. AND YOU KNOW, I WANT STAFF TO COME BACK I
17 WANT US TO LOOK INTO THAT. MY QUESTION TO YOU ANDY OR REBECCA
18 IS WHAT'S THE NEXT STEP AFTER THIS IN TERMS OF TIMELINE?

19

20 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU CHAIR CAN PAMPHLET SO AS I MENTIONED,
21 DECEMBER 20TH, THIS MONTH'S COMMISSION MEETING WE PLAN TO COME
22 BACK WITH AN INFORMATION ITEM FOR THE FULL COMMISSION. WE
23 WOULD SUMMARIZE THIS CONVERSATION THERE AS WELL AS SUMMARIZE A
24 FULL RECAP OF THE STAFF PROPOSAL AROUND THE FUNDING
25 MECHANISMS, DIFFERENT EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES, ET CETERA, SO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THAT WILL BE AN INFORMATION ITEM BUT I THINK WE CAN SYNTHESIZE
2 WHAT WE HEARD TODAY AS FAR AS STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOR WHAT
3 KIND OF REFORMS COULD POTENTIALLY BE IN THE MEASURE. AND THEN
4 JANUARY IS ACTION TIME. BECAUSE IF WE WANT TO INTRODUCE A BILL
5 NEXT YEAR, IT NEEDS TO BE IN PRINT BY, AT THE LATEST EARLY
6 FEBRUARY. SO THEN WHAT WILL BE COMING BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE
7 IN JANUARY, I THINK IT'S THE 12th, IS A WHOLE OUTLINE OF THIS
8 IS WHAT THE BILL WILL INCLUDE, THESE ARE THE REFORM ITEMS THAT
9 COULD POTENTIALLY BE IN THERE AND THEN THE COMMISSION WOULD
10 ACT ON THAT IN JANUARY AS WELL

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. CHAIR PEDROZA? ANY COMMENTS?

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO. I THINK YOU SUMMARIZED IT WELL AT THE
15 NEXT MEETING YOU WILL COME BACK EVEN THOUGH IT'S AN
16 INFORMATION ITEM BUT YOU'RE ASKING THE QUESTION DO WE HAVE THE
17 AUTHORITY WHERE THE GAPS THAT MIGHT HELP SHAPE LEGISLATION
18 WHICH WE'LL ALSO TALK ABOUT SOME OTHER INITIATIVES THAT'S
19 WHERE THE CONSENSUS WILL LIE, CORRECT?

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** YES.

22

23 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHAIR COMMISSIONER SPERING?



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I DON'T WANT TO LOSE SIGHT OF THE MONEY THAT
3 WE'RE GOING TO BE ALLOCATING MILLIONS OF DOLLARS I HOPE WE
4 CONDITION THE MONEY FOR HIGHER COOPERATION IN THE WAYFINDING
5 FARE COORDINATION SCHEDULING IN AREAS THAT WE CAN GET SOME
6 IMPROVEMENT TODAY WITH THE MONEY THAT WE'RE GOING TO ALLOCATE
7 GETTING REFORM OR CHANGES.

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IN THE PRESENTATION AROUND SB125 WE SHOW
10 VARIOUS POINTS IN TIME WE GO BACK REFLECT ON THAT I NEED TO
11 EMPHASIZE IN THE WAYFINDING AND MAPPING, THAT CAN BE FORGOTTEN
12 BUT IT'S CHALLENGING AND WORTH INVESTING IN. ALIX WANTS TO ADD
13 SOMETHING.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WANT TO ADD THAT THE PROGRAMMING AND
16 ALLOCATIONS NEXT WEEK WILL BE TAKING UP NEXT WEEK SB125 REPORT
17 THAT WE SUBMIT TO THE STATE WHICH INCLUDES ACCOUNTABILITY
18 PROVISIONS WHICH I DO -- SO, I THINK YOU WILL GET A CHANCE AT
19 THE END OF THE MONTH TO SEE THOSE AGAIN. IT DOES INCLUDE
20 ADDITIONAL STRENGTHENING OF HAVING THE TRANSIT BOARDS TAKE
21 ACTION, THAT THEY UNDERSTAND THE ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS
22 THAT YOU ATTACHED TO THE MONEY. YOU WILL HAVE TIME TO REVIEW
23 THAT BEFORE WHAT ANDY'S BRINGING UP WHEN YOU ALLOCATE FUNDS
24 NEXT SPRING.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I WANT TO THANK MY COLLEAGUES FOR THE
2 ROBUST DISCUSSION AND FOR ALL THE PUBLIC COMMENT. REALLY
3 APPRECIATE YOUR INPUT AND FEEDBACK. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA
4 ITEM 4A, SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON, D.C. VISITS. GEORGIA GANN
5 DOHRMANN, WILL YOU GIVE THE REPORT, PLEASE?

6

7 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR CANEPA AND
8 COMMITTEE MEMBERS. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC AND ABAG STAFF.
9 I'LL KEEP THE ITEM BRIEF. WE'RE RECOMMENDING, SORT OF, GIVEN
10 THE WEIGHTY ITEMS WE MIGHT HAVE IN FRONT OF US UP IN
11 SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR TO REALLY TAKE THE MARCH TIMELINE, WHICH
12 IS A REALLY KEY TIME UP IN SACRAMENTO FOR YOU ALL TO BE GOING
13 UP THERE AND VISITING LEGISLATORS TO TALK ABOUT MTC AND ABAG'S
14 TOP ADVOCACY PRIORITIES. SO WHAT THAT MEANS IS TRADITIONALLY
15 WE HAVE HAD MTC AND ABAG GO TO WASHINGTON, D.C. IN MARCH AND
16 WE'RE PROPOSING, AGAIN, INSTEAD TO, SORT OF, PRIORITIZE THAT
17 TIMELINE FOR VISITS UP TO SACRAMENTO AND MOVE WASHINGTON DV
18 VISIT TO THE MAY TIMELINE. WHICH IS STILL A GREAT TIME TO BE
19 IN DC. AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK TO THE CHAIR.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS? ARE THERE
22 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? VIRTUAL OR EITHER IN-PERSON?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
25 ON THIS ITEM THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HAND RAISED IN ZOOM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO
2 SPEAK.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE.
5 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT OR OTHER BUSINESS?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
8 ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO
9 SPEAK AND NO ONE IN ZOOM WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE NEXT MEETING OF
12 THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MEETING WILL BE HELD
13 ON FRIDAY JANUARY 12th, 2024 9:45 A.M., AT THE BAY AREA METRO
14 CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA AND OTHER
15 REMOTE LOCATIONS. CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED.

16 [ADJOURN]

17



NTT

Broadcasting Government