

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1                   **REGIONAL MEASURE 3 INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE**

2                                   **FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 15<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 11:00 AM**

3  
4

5   **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I CERTAINLY  
6 DID NOT EXPECT TO BE SITTING IN THIS CHAIR THIS MORNING. MY  
7 NAME IS PAMELA KINDIG. I AM FROM NAPA COUNTY. I AM THE VICE-  
8 CHAIR, AND I WILL CHAIR TODAY'S MEETING. THIS IS ALL BECAUSE  
9 DUE TO NEW EMPLOYMENT COMMITTEE MEMBER AND CHAIR BRIAN DAVID  
10 SHAW HAS HAD TO STEP DOWN FROM THE COMMITTEE. AND I WILL BE  
11 QUITE HONEST WITH YOU, I REALLY HAVE A LOT OF RESPECT FOR  
12 BRIAN AS HE HEADED OUR MEETINGS IN THE PAST. FOR THOSE OF US  
13 WHO HAVE BEEN HERE. HE WAS JUST VERY ORGANIZED AND VERY WELL  
14 ON TOP OF THINGS. SO THIS COMMITTEE IS GOING TO MISS HIM. JUST  
15 SO YOU KNOW WHAT IS GOING TO HAPPEN NEXT, AT OUR NEXT MEETING  
16 IS WHEN WE WILL ELECT A NEW CHAIR FOR THIS COMMITTEE. SO THAT  
17 WILL TAKE PLACE IN -- IF WE HAVE OUR DECEMBER MEETING, IT WILL  
18 TAKE PLACE THEN. SO WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST  
19 ON THE MTC WEBCAST. MEMBERS OF PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM  
20 WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE THE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL  
21 9. AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.  
22 SO WITH THAT, WE WILL PROCEED WITH THE AGENDA. WILL THE CLERK  
23 CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM, PLEASE.

24

25   **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES, THANK YOU.



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** PRESENT.

3

4 **STEVE BRIDLEBOUGH:** PRESENT.

5

6 **KATHY CHANG:** PRESENT.

7

8 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** PRESENT.

9

10 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** HERE.

11

12 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** HERE.

13

14 **JOHN MAITLAND:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER NASIR IS ABSENT. MEMBER NATARAJAN

17 IS ABSENT. >NAZANIN SHAKERIN: PRESENT.

18

19 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE A QUORUM, THANK YOU.

22

23 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THANK YOU. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE READ

24 THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING  
2 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE REGIONAL  
3 MEASURE 3 INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE HERE TODAY WILL BE  
4 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$50 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM  
5 OF FOUR MEETINGS PER YEAR. THIS AMOUNT IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT  
6 OF CONVENING A MEETING WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO  
7 COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SO AT THIS TIME, I WOULD LIKE TO  
10 WELCOME OUR NEW COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I APOLOGIZE FOR MY  
11 MISPRONUNCIATIONS. FROM CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. ALSO, KATHY CHANG  
12 FROM CONTRA COSTA COUNTY.

13

14 **KATHY CHANG:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** AND NASIR IS ALSO A NEW MEMBER, AND  
17 SHE IS NOT ABLE TO ATTEND THE MEETING TODAY. WE MOVE ON WITH  
18 THE AGENDA AND MOVE TO THE CONSENT AGENDA. AND THIS IS THE  
19 ITEM THAT INCLUDES THE MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 9, 2024  
20 MEETING. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE  
21 CONSENT CALENDAR?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I MOVE THAT THE ITEM BE -- I MOVE THE ITEM BE  
24 APPROVED.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** IS THERE A SECOND?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I WILL SECOND.

4

5 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ANY COMMITTEE MEMBER THAT WOULD LIKE  
6 TO HAVE ANY COMMENTS ON THE MINUTES OF THAT MEETING? CLERK,  
7 WERE THERE ANY ITEMS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS  
8 ITEM. AND IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON  
9 THIS ITEM USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL 9. AND MEMBERS OF  
10 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL  
11 CALL ON YOU TO SPEAK.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. NO HAND  
14 RAISED ON LINE. AND NO ONE IN THE ROOM WITH A SPEAKER CARD.

15

16 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ALL RIGHT, SINCE WE COVERED ALL OF  
17 THAT, WILL ALL OF THOSE IN FAVOR OF THIS MOTION, ACKNOWLEDGE  
18 BY SAYING AYE. OPPOSED?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I ABSTAIN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I ABSTAIN AS WELL, PLEASE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** NOT BEING PRESENT AT THE MEETING, I ABSTAIN.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE DO NEED A MAJORITY OF ALL MEMBERS  
2 PRESENT IN ORDER TO PASS THE ITEM.

3

4 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** CHUG THOSE WHO ARE ABSTAINING?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THOSE ABSTAINING DO NOT COUNT TOWARD THE VOTE. SO WE  
7 NEED A MAJORITY OF ALL MEMBERS PRESENT TO PASS.

8

9 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ALL RIGHT. SO DO WE NEED TO TAKE AN  
10 ORAL VOTE ON THAT THEN?

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE STILL HAVE A MAJORITY OF THE MEMBERS  
13 PRESENT, RIGHT?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** LET'S DO A ROLL CALL VOTE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE WILL DO A ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** OKAY.

20

21 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES. CHARLOTTE CHARLESTON MEMBER  
22 AMBROSE IS ABSENT. MEMBER BRIDLEBOUGH.

23

24 **STEVE BRIDLEBOUGH:** AYE.

25



1 **KATHY CHANG:** AYE.

2

3 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** AYE.

4

5 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** ABSTAIN.

6

7 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** AYE.

8

9 **JOHN MAITLAND:** AYE.

10

11 **NAZANIN SHAKERIN:** AYE.

12

13 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** SO THE MOTION PASSES WITH EIGHT YES, ONE  
16 ABSENT, AND ONE ABSTAIN. THREE ABSENT, AND ONE ABSTAIN. THANK  
17 YOU.

18

19 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SO THE MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES  
20 UNDER THE CONSENT AGENDA HAS PASSED. ALL RIGHT. WITH THAT, WE  
21 WILL -- FORGETTING TO PRESS THE BUTTON. WITH THAT, HE WILL  
22 MOVE TO THE APPROVAL OF INFORMATION, WHICH IS ITEM NUMBER 5.  
23 AND ANNE SPEVACK WILL PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON RM3 ALLOCATIONS,  
24 EXPENDITURES AND OTHER ACTIVITIES TO STATE.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **ANNE SPEVACK:** YES, GOOD MORNING, COMMITTEE MEMBERS. MY NAME IS  
2 ANNE SPEVACK. IF WE CAN GET THE PRESENTATION UP. THEN I CAN  
3 GET STARTED. THIS ITEM WILL SHARE UPDATES ON THE REGIONAL  
4 MEASURE 3 EXPENDITURES INCLUDING PROGRAMMING, ALLOCATIONS AND  
5 EXPENDITURE OF RM3 FUNDS FOR SPENDING FOR CAPITAL PROBLEMS AND  
6 PROGRAMS. THIS ITEM INCLUDES A LOT OF INFORMATION IN THE  
7 ATTACHMENTS IN YOUR PACK CANAL, BUT MOST OF IT HAS BEEN  
8 PRESENTED AT PREVIOUS IOC MEETINGS. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT  
9 ALL THE INFORMATION IS ACCESSIBLE TO YOU FOR REFERENCE, BUT I  
10 WILL BE HIGHLIGHTING INFORMATION THAT IS NEW TO YOU SINCE THE  
11 LAST IOC MEETING IN THIS PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TO  
12 BRIEFLY TOUCH ON BACKGROUND FOR NEW MEMBERS AND TO REFRESH  
13 EVERYONE, THROUGH RM3, BAY AREA VOTERS APPROVED A \$3 TOLL  
14 INCREASE ON STATE-OWNED BRIDGES TO BE PHASED IN OVER SIX YEARS  
15 STARTING JANUARY 1, 2019. TO DATE, TWO \$1 TOLL INCREASES HAVE  
16 BEEN IMPLEMENTED. RM3 INCLUDE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT  
17 IDENTIFY CAPITAL INVESTMENTS WITH RM3 REVENUES WITH THE GOAL  
18 OF IMPROVING THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM REGION WIDE. CAPITAL  
19 PROGRAM COMMITS \$4.5 BILLION TO 35 NAMED CAPITAL PROJECTS AND  
20 PROGRAMS. AND AFTER 16% OF RM3 REVENUE FOR UP TO \$60 MILLION  
21 OF THE TERMINAL, FERRY SERVICES AND EXPRESS BUS SERVICES. NEXT  
22 SLIDE. UNDER RM3 STATUTE, MTC HAS THE AUTHORITY TO MODIFY THE  
23 PLAN UNDER CERTAIN CIRCUMSTANCES AND WITHIN LIMITS AFTER  
24 HEARING HOLDING A PUBLIC HEARING. DETAILS ARE IN YOUR MEMO FOR  
25 THIS ITEM AND IN THE RM3 STATUTE. SINCE THE LAST UPDATE TO THE





NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 IOC, THE MTC HAS NOT APPROVED ANY NEW CHANGES TO THE RM3  
2 EXPENDITURE PLAN. AND DETAILS OF THE PRIOR EXPENDITURE PLAN  
3 CHANGE WHICH HAVE BEEN PROVIDED AT PREVIOUS MEET WILLING ARE  
4 INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT A TO THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET. NEXT  
5 SLIDE. MOVING ON TO UPDATES ON PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATING FUND  
6 TO SPECIFIC PROJECTS. FOR OPERATING FUNDS, MTC APPROVES ANNUAL  
7 PROGRAMMING THAT SETS THE MAXIMUM FUNDING LIMITS FOR OPERATING  
8 PROJECTS. OPERATORS CAN REQUEST ALLOCATIONS OF THE FUNDING OF  
9 DOCUMENTATION OF THE RM3 POLICIES AND PROCEDURES. NO NEW  
10 PROGRAMMING OF OPERATING FUND HAVE BEEN APPROVED SINCE THE  
11 LAST UPDATE TO THE IOC, BUT SINCE WE DID NOT CALL YOUR  
12 ATTENTION TO IT DURING THE LAST MEETING, WE WANTED TO MAKE  
13 SURE TO NOTE THAT THE FY 2024-25 OPERATING PROGRAM WAS  
14 APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION IN MAY 2024. SET THE MAXIMUM  
15 FUNDING LEVELS FOR FERRY SERVICE AND THE BAY TERMINAL FOR THIS  
16 FISCAL YEAR. FUNDING LEVELS WILL BE REASSESSED AND SET LATER  
17 THIS FISCAL YEAR. MTC HAS APPROVED ONE ALLOCATION OF OPERATING  
18 FUND TO WETA, THE OPERATOR OF THE SF BAY FERRIES. FOR FERRY  
19 SERVICE CONSISTENT WITH THE APPROVED FY '25 PROGRAMS. DETAILS  
20 ARE IN ATTACHMENT B, THE CONDITION OF ALLOCATION ACTION. NEXT  
21 SLIDE. FOR RM3 CAPITAL FUNDS, MOST PROJECTS ARE LIST BY NAME  
22 IN THE RM3 STATUTE WITH AN IDENTIFIED PROJECT SPONSOR AND DO  
23 NOT NEED ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING BEFORE A SPONSOR REQUESTS AN  
24 AL OCCASION. SOME BROADER CATEGORIES WITH MTC INCLUDED AS A  
25 SPONSOR OR CO-SPONSOR REQUIRE MTC TO PROGRAM FUND TO SPECIFIC



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 PROJECTS AND SPONSORS TO THE CATEGORY BEFORE ALLOCATIONS. MTC  
2 HAS TAKEN NO NEW PROGRAMMING ACTIONS SINCE THE LAST UPDATE TO  
3 THE IOC. ATTACHMENT D TO THIS ITEM IN YOUR PACKET INCLUDES MTC  
4 PAST PROGRAMMING APPLICATIONS. FOR ALLOCATIONS, THE MTC  
5 COMMISSION APPROVED \$85.5 MILLION IN NEW CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS  
6 FOR THE PROJECTS LISTED ON THIS SLIDE. MTC'S EXECUTIVE  
7 DIRECTOR ALSO APPROVED AN ADDITIONAL \$1.6 MILLION IN  
8 ALLOCATIONS VIA DELEGATED AUTHORITY. DETAILS OF THESE  
9 ALLOCATIONS ARE PROVIDED IN ATTACHMENT B TO THE ITEM, THE  
10 INDEX OF ALLOCATION ACTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS THE  
11 OVERALL PROJECT OF THE RM3 CAPITAL PROGRAM. 36% OF RM3 CAPITAL  
12 FUNDS HAVE BEEN ALLOCATED TO SPECIFIC PROGRAMS AND PROJECTS.  
13 AND MAY INVOICE MTC FOR REIMBURSEMENT OF ACTUAL EXPENSES. AS  
14 OF OCTOBER, 5% OF THE OVERALL RM3 PROGRAM HAS BEEN REIMBURSED.  
15 ATTACHMENT C TO THIS ITEM LISTS ALL CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS WITH  
16 SOME PROJECTS DETAILS, THE PHASE OF THE PROJECTS, ANTICIPATED  
17 COMPLETION YEAR AND TOTAL COSTS AND PERCENT OF THE ALLOCATIONS  
18 THAT WAS REIMBURSED AT THE END OF OCTOBER. THIS SLIDE NOTES  
19 THAT PROJECT UPDATES FROM THE LAST UPDATE WAS IN THE SEPTEMBER  
20 IOC MEETING. NEXT PROGRAM WILL BE AT THE DECEMBER PROGRAM OF  
21 ALLOCATIONS MEETING AND WILL BE SHARED AT AN UPCOMING IOC  
22 MEETING AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. THE NEXT TWO SLIDES PRESENT  
23 INFORMATION ABOUT MTC AUDITS OF RM3 INVOICES IN RESPONSE TO  
24 IOC MEMBER REQUESTS. ENGAGES AN AUDITOR FOR TEST SAMPLE TO  
25 MAKE SURE THAT RM3 EXPENDITURES WERE ALLOCATED. THE FISCAL



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 YEAR 2023 AGREED MACHINE UPON PROCEDURES REVIEW WAS COMPLETED  
2 IN EARLY 2024, AND NO ISSUES WERE FLAGGED WITH ANY FY '23  
3 INVOICES. THE FY '24 AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES ARE IN PROCESS AND  
4 FINDINGS WILL BE AVAILABLE TO THE IOC WHEN AVAILABLE. NEXT  
5 SLIDE. MTC PERIODICALLY ENGAGES AN AUDITOR FOR PROGRAMS TO  
6 MAKE SURE THEY ARE SUBMITTED IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE RM3  
7 POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND CHECK FOR DUPLICATE CHARGES OR  
8 OTHER ERRORS. COVERED THE AREA APRIL 1, 2023 TO FEBRUARY 9,  
9 2024, AND NO ISSUES WERE FLAGGED WITH ANY INVOICES DURING THIS  
10 PERIOD. THE AUDITOR REPORTS HAVE BEEN INCLUDED AS AN  
11 ATTACHMENT TO THE DRAFT IOC ANNUAL REPORT IN ITEM 5-C IN THIS  
12 -- FOR THIS MEETING NEXT SLIDE. THIS CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION  
13 ON THIS ITEM. I AM HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** AGAIN, THIS ITEM WAS PRESENTED FOR  
16 INFORMATION ONLY AND NO ACTION IS REQUIRED OF THE COMMITTEE.  
17 IS THERE ANY COMMITTEE MEMBER WHO WOULD LIKE TO HAVE COMMENTS  
18 AT THIS TIME?

19

20 **KATHY CHANG:** I HAVE A QUESTION.

21

22 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

23

24 **KATHY CHANG:** MTC DISPERSED FUND, WHAT KIND OF CLAUSES DO YOU  
25 GUYS HAVE TO REVIEW ELIGIBLE PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, AND SCOPE OF



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 PROJECT OR THE FUNDING REQUEST. JUST ACTUALLY WANT TO KNOW DID  
2 YOU GUYS ACTUALLY HAVE A REVIEW COMMITTEE FOR THE IMPLEMENTING  
3 AGENCY WHEN THEY SUBMIT A REIMBURSEMENT OR PROGRAMMING  
4 REQUEST?

5

6 **ANNE SPEVACK:** THE PROCESS THAT WE HAVE IN PLACE IS SET IN THE  
7 RM3 POLICIES AND PROCEDURES. AND THAT REQUIRES THE PROJECT  
8 SPONSOR TO SUBMIT AN ANNUAL OCCASION REQUEST WHICH INCLUDES A KIND  
9 OF REALLY DETAILED REPORT OF THE SCOPE AND THE SCHEDULE  
10 FUNDING PLAN FOR THE PROJECT, WHICH IS REVIEWED ON A STAFF  
11 LEVEL. AND THE -- THE PROJECT SPONSOR BOARD ALSO NEEDS TO  
12 APPROVE A BOARD RESOLUTION THAT CONFIRMS THAT THE PROJECT IS  
13 CONSISTENT WITH THE -- THE RM3 STATUTE IN THE POLICIES AND  
14 PROCEDURES. STAFF MAKES A RECOMMENDATION TO THE COMMISSION  
15 THAT IS REVIEWED FIRST BY THE MTC PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS  
16 COMMITTEE AND GOES TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. OF THE  
17 ALLOCATION.

18

19 **KATHY CHANG:** ANOTHER QUESTION. ACTUALLY THE RM3 SAYS -- I SEE  
20 PERFORMANCE MEASURES ACTUALLY REQUIRED FOR, LIKE, THE  
21 OPERATING. WHAT ABOUT THESE CAPITAL PROJECTS? ARE THERE ANY  
22 PERFORMANCE MEASURES, YOU KNOW, FOR THOSE CAPITAL PROJECTS?

23

24 **ANNE SPEVACK:** WE DON'T HAVE PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR CAPITAL  
25 PROJECTS, NO.



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **KATHY CHANG:** OKAY. SO HOW DO WE MEASURE, KNOW, THEIR  
3 PERFORMANCES?

4

5 **THERESA ROMELL:** THERESA ROMELL WITH PROGRAM ALLOCATIONS STAFF.  
6 WE DON'T REALLY MEASURE THE -- THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE  
7 PROJECT. THESE PROJECTS ARE SELECTED BY THE VOTERS AND THEY  
8 ARE, YOU KNOW, IN A VOTER APPROVED EXPENDITURE PLAN. SO WE  
9 HAVE VERY LIMITED ABILITY TO MAKE CHANGES TO THAT EXPENDITURE  
10 PLAN. SO WE DO NOT MEASURE THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROJECT  
11 ITSELF THAT HAS BEEN VETTED THROUGH THE VOTER PROCESS.

12

13 **KATHY CHANG:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THANK YOU, MISS SPEVACK FOR THAT  
16 PRESENTATION. I'M NOT SURE HOW TO ASK THE QUESTION. AND HE  
17 WILL COMMENT FIRST AND THEN FORM A QUESTION. IT SEEMS 5% OF  
18 THE FUNDS BEING REIMBURSED AND 35% OF THE FUNDS BEING  
19 ALLOCATED ARE LOW. DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO COMPARE THAT TO IN  
20 TERMS OF SCHEDULING OF THE FUND? AND ARE YOU HAPPY WITH IT?

21

22 **ANNE SPEVACK:** THE -- I WOULD SAY THAT THE INVOICING AND  
23 EXPENDITURE HAS BEEN A LITTLE BIT SLOWER THAN WAS REPORTED BY  
24 MOST PROJECT SPONSORS DURING THEIR ALL OCCASION REQUESTS. AND  
25 WE ARE WORKING WITH SPONSORS TO -- TO ENCOURAGE THEM. I THINK



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 TO SOME EXTENT, IT IS A RESULT OF -- BECAUSE THIS IS A  
2 REIMBURSEMENT-BASED PROGRAM THEY ARE SPENDING MONEY AND LATER  
3 COMING TO US FOR THE REIMBURSEMENT. SO WHAT WE HAVE SPENT IS A  
4 LITTLE BIT BEHIND WHAT THEY HAVE ACTUALLY SPENT, BUT WE ARE  
5 WORKING WITH THEM TO GET THE CASH FLOW MOVING FORWARD.

6

7 **REBECCA WEBSTER:** INVOICES IN THE PIPELINE THAT HAVEN'T BEEN  
8 PROCESSED YET?

9

10 **THERESA ROMELL:** THAT IS USUALLY THE CASES. INVOICES IN THE  
11 PIPELINE AND SOMETIMES THEY WILL NEED AN AL OCCASION BEFORE  
12 GOING OUT TO BID FOR A CONTRACT. THAT COULD BE A DELAY. WE  
13 HAVE IN THE PAST TRIED TO TIGHTEN THE TIME FRAME BETWEEN A  
14 PROJECT SPONSOR COMING IN FOR AN AL OCCASION AND THEN GETTING  
15 THE FUNDS EXPENDED. WE HAVE A SIX-MONTH WINDOW THAT WE TRY TO  
16 ENFORCE. BUT THAT CAN HAPPEN BECAUSE THESE ARE VERY LARGE  
17 SCALE PROJECTS IN SOME CASES AND DELAYS CAN HAPPEN IN ACTUAL  
18 EXPENDITURE AND REIMBURSEMENT.

19

20 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** GREAT. THANK YOU, I APPRECIATE IT.

21

22 **FEDERICK ARN HANSSON:** SO ITEM 2, THE EXPRESS LANES. I GOT TO  
23 TAKE THESE OUT. I NOTICED IN THE PAPERS, IT WAS SUGGESTED THAT  
24 THE EXPRESS LANES IN SAN MATEO COUNTY ACTUALLY HAS NOT



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 IMPROVED EVERYTHING. IN FACT MAY HAVE MADE THINGS WORSE. DO  
2 YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS TO THOSE REPORTS?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** IT WOULD BE DIFFICULT FOR STAFF TO COMMENT ON AN ITEM  
5 LIKE THAT. THAT IS NOT OUR PLACE YOU ARE OUR PLAN TO ALLOCATE  
6 FOR REGIONAL MEASURE 3. THE EFFICACY OF SOME OF THESE PROJECTS  
7 COULD BE A WIDE RANGES PERSPECTIVE FOR A LOT OF DIFFERENT  
8 AREAS. SO I DON'T HAVE ANY RESPONSE TO THAT.

9

10 **FREDERICK ARN HANSSON:** I MEAN, I HAVE ADVOCATED BEFORE -- I  
11 DON'T THINK THE VOTERS THOUGHT THIS COMMITTEE ALSO THOUGHT OF  
12 HOW EFFECTIVE THESE PROJECTS ARE. IF THE PROJECTS ARE  
13 INEFFECTIVE, HOW DO THEY GET REMEDIED WITH OUR MONEY?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THEY HAVE ALREADY BEEN BUILT IN THE CASES OF SAN  
16 MATEO COUNTY, SO THAT WOULD BE, YOU KNOW, SOMETHING THAT IS  
17 NOT FOR RM3.

18

19 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** SO WE ARE HERE TO SPEND MONEY JUST TO  
20 SPEND MONEY.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** NOT SPENDING ON EXPRESS LANES FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY  
23 FOR REGIONAL MEASURE 3. WE HAVE EXPENDED THOSE FUNDS AND THEY  
24 ARE IN THE PROCESS. WHETHER OR NOT THEY ARE SUCCESSFUL OR NOT  
25 IS EVERYONE'S OPINION.



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** I THINK I MADE MY POINT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** YES, MY QUESTION IS FOR MISS SPEVACK  
5 AND REGARDING THE SOURCE OF FUNDS. MY QUESTION IS ABOUT  
6 WHETHER FOR BOTH CAPITAL, AS WELL AS OPERATING THE SOURCE OF  
7 FUNDING AND SPECIFICALLY IT IS BONDED OR ALL FROM TOLLS.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** I CAN ADDRESS THAT. THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. SO  
10 THE -- WE RECEIVE RM3 REVENUE THROUGH THE BRIDGE TOLLS. THE  
11 CURRENT BRIDGE TOLL IS \$7 THAT WILL GO UP TO \$8 ON JANUARY 1  
12 OF THE \$7 TOLL, \$2 IS PROGRAMMED FOR RM3. ONCE WE -- ONCE WE  
13 RECEIVE THAT REVENUE, FRANKLY, IT IS LIKE ANY OTHER BRIDGE  
14 REVENUE. AND WE HAVE A WHOLE SERIES OF OBLIGATIONS WE HAVE TO  
15 MEET AGAINST. ONE OF THOSE IS PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATING 16%  
16 OF THE RM3 REVENUE, CAPPED AT \$60 MILLION A YEAR, FOR RM3  
17 OPERATING PURPOSES. THE OTHER OBLIGATION THAT WE HAVE IS TO  
18 FUND \$4.45 BILLION RELATED OF CAPITAL PROJECTS. WE FULLY  
19 ANTICIPATE THAT THE SPENDING OF THE \$4.5 BILLION OF CAPITAL  
20 PROJECTS IS GOING TO PROCEED THE ACTUAL RIGHT OF 4.5 BILLION  
21 NET. WE HAVE BORROWED MONEY FOR REGIONAL MEASURE 3 CAPITAL  
22 PROJECTS. WE LOOK TO DO THAT IN CONJUNCTION IS THE OVERALL  
23 FINANCES OF THE ENTERPRISE. WHEN IT IS APPROPRIATE TO BORROW.  
24 WHAT THE COST OF BORROWING IS AT ANY POINT IN TIME. WHAT OUR  
25 REINVESTMENT RATES ARE ON THE INVESTMENTS WE HAVE. SO WE HAVE





NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 BORROWED FUND. WE WILL BE CONTINUING TO BORROW FUNDS AT  
2 VARIOUS POINTS BUT THOSE ARE DECISIONS THAT HAVE YET TO BE  
3 MADE.

4

5 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **KATHY CHANG:** SO, YOU KNOW FOR 2023-2024, TOTAL \$13 MILLION. I  
8 DID A QUICK CALCULATION. 4.5 BILLION -- PROBABLY WILL TAKE  
9 ABOUT 20 YEARS, AM I CORRECT?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** IT WILL -- AGAIN, THAT WILL BE LESS THAN THAT SIMPLY  
12 BECAUSE WE DO HAVE THAT THIRD DOLLAR COMING INTO PLACE IN  
13 JANUARY 1, OKAY. SO THAT WILL BE THE LAST DOLLAR OF THE RM3  
14 TOLLS. SO WE TAKE THAT, BUT THEN, AGAIN, WE DO HAVE THE  
15 OPERATING MONEY THAT WE HAVE GOT TO SPEND AS WELL. SO THERE IS  
16 THAT BALANCING. AND, AGAIN, WE WILL BE BALANCES THAT OVER  
17 TIME.

18

19 **KATHY CHANG:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ARE THERE OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO  
22 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE COMMENTS OR ASK QUESTIONS AT THIS TIME?  
23 CLERK, WERE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT  
24 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEMS.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS IN WRITING. NO  
2 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED ONLINE AND NO  
3 SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** IS THE COMMITTEE READY TO GO ON TO  
6 ITEM 5-B? ALL RIGHT. 5-B DEALS WITH THE DRAFT OF THE RM3  
7 ANNUAL REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE. AND ANNE SPEVACK WILL  
8 PROVIDE INFORMATION FOR THE DRAFT REPORT TO IT THE LEGISLATURE  
9 TO BE SUBMITTED BY THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY TO THE  
10 LEGISLATURE AFTER APPROVAL.

11

12 **ANNE SPEVACK:** YES. AGAIN, I AM ANNE SPEVACK WITH MTC STAFF. WE  
13 CAN MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM FOR  
14 YOU TO REVIEW THE RM3 ANNUAL REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE  
15 PREPARED BY THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OR BATA. SEPARATELY  
16 FROM THE IOC'S REPORTING REQUIREMENTS, BATA IS REQUIRED BY RM3  
17 STATUTE TO PREPARE AN ANNUAL REPORT ON RM3 PROJECTS AND  
18 PROGRAMS AND SUBMIT IT TO THE LEGISLATURE. THE FY '24 RM3  
19 ANNUAL REPORT WAS PRESENTED TO THE BATA CITY EARLIER THIS WEEK  
20 AND RECOMMENDED FOR BATA APPROVAL LATER THIS MONTH. NEXT  
21 SLIDE. THE RM3 ANNUAL REPORT COVERS THESE TOP EX ON THE RM3  
22 PROGRAM. UPDATE ON TOLL IMPLEMENTATION AND REVENUE COLLECTION.  
23 CHANGES TO THE EXPENDITURE PLAN. THE OPERATIONS PLAN. CAPITAL  
24 ALLOCATIONS AND EXPENDITURES. CAPITAL PROJECT REPORTING AND  
25 HIGHLIGHTS, END DENT OVERSITE COMMITTEE AND UPDATE ON POLICIES



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 AND PROCEDURES. ALL IS PROVIDED IN YOUR PACKET FOR A REVIEW.  
2 WE DON'T EXPECT THIS REPORT TO HAVE NEW INFORMATION FOR YOU AS  
3 WE TEND TO BRING THE INFORMATION THROUGHOUT THE YEAR DURING  
4 THE MEETING LIKE THE ITEMS THAT WE JUST COVERED ON THIS  
5 AGENDA. NEXT SLIDE. AS WE NOTED EARLIER, THE REQUIREMENT FOR  
6 BATA TO PREPARE AN ANNUAL RM3 REPORT IS SEPARATE FROM THE  
7 ANNUAL REPORTING REQUIREMENT OF INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT  
8 COMMITTEE. WE ARE HELPING THE BATA FOR OVERVIEW OF THE RM3.  
9 REQUESTED HAVING IT AS AN ATTACHMENT TO THE REPORT TO PROVIDE  
10 BACKGROUND AND DETAILS OF THE RM3 PROGRAM. ONCE BOTH REPORTS  
11 ARE APPROVED, THE REPORTS WILL BE TRANSMITTED TO THE  
12 LEGISLATURE ACCORDING TO THE STATE'S REPORTING REQUIREMENT.  
13 NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT, I AM HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS. THANK  
14 YOU.

15

16 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SO, AGAIN, JUST AS A NOTE, THIS IS  
17 PRESENTED AS INFORMATION ONLY AND NO APPLICATION IS REQUIRED  
18 OF THE COMMITTEE. SO ARE THERE ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS THAT  
19 WOULD LIKE TO HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM AT THIS TIME? AND  
20 WOULD YOU PLEASE BE ACKNOWLEDGED THROUGH THE CHAIR AS YOU ASK  
21 YOUR QUESTIONS. ARE THERE QUESTIONS REGARDING THE ANNUAL  
22 REPORT THAT IS GOING TO BE PRESENTED? SO, ANNE, IT HAS BEEN  
23 NOT FORMALLY PASSED YET BUT WILL BE FORMALLY PASSED AT THE  
24 NEXT MEETING, IS THAT CORRECT?

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **ANNE SPEVACK:** NEXT WEEK IS THE BATA MEETING WE ARE  
2 RECOMMENDING APPROVAL OF THE REPORT.

3

4 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** AND SO IT WILL BE THAT -- IT WILL BE  
5 THAT REPORT THEN THAT WILL BE ATTACHED IF THIS COMMITTEE  
6 AGREES AS PART OF THE IOC REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE. THAT IS  
7 YOUR RECOMMENDATION?

8

9 **ANNE SPEVACK:** YES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** MADAM CHAIRPERSON, THROUGH THE CLEAR, I WOULD LIKE TO  
12 ASK WHOEVER WOULD LIKE TO FIELD THE QUESTION, COULD I GET A  
13 BRIEF BREAKDOWN OF THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THE REPORT OF THIS  
14 COMMITTEE SINCE WE ARE PUTTING IT TOGETHER AND BATA'S REPORT?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I CAN TRY TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION. INFORMATION ON  
17 ALLOCATIONS AND EXPENDITURES WILL, VERY SIMILAR. IT WILL BE AN  
18 ATTACHMENT OF THE BATA REPORT THAT IS GOING TO LEDGE CH YOU  
19 ARE, ABOUT YOU YOUR REPORT AS WE WILL SEE IN THE NEXT ITEM  
20 WILL HAVE AN INTRODUCTION OF THE IOC THIS COMMITTEE AND A  
21 LITTLE BIT OF YOUR ROLE AND AREAS OF THE COMMITTEE THAT YOU  
22 HAVE WORKED ON PROVIDING YOUR OWN PERSPECTIVE ON THE PROCESS.  
23 SO WE WILL GO THROUGH THAT IN THE NEXT -- IN THE NEXT ITEM.  
24 YOU WILL GET A SUMMARY. BUT THAT IS ESSENTIALLY THE DIFFERENCE  
25 IS THAT YOU HAVE AN ADDED TO IT THE REPORT.



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** AS FAR AS CONTENT, ARE THEY PRETTY MUCH THE SAME?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** OUTSIDE OF THE FORWARD -- THE FRONT OF THE REPORT  
5 THAT HAVE THE PERSPECTIVES OF THE IOC. THE ATTACHMENTS ARE  
6 SIMILAR.

7

8 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** VERY GOOD. THANK YOU.

9

10 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THANK YOU. OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS  
11 REGARDING THIS ITEM?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** MADAM CHAIR.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THIS. BECAUSE IT IS REALLY  
18 EASY TO READ. VERY EASY TO DIGEST. I APPRECIATE THE EFFORT YOU  
19 PUT INTO THAT SO THAT THE READER IS COMFORTABLE FOR THE  
20 READER. SO THANK YOU.

21

22 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ALL RIGHT. SO WITH THAT, WE WILL MOVE  
23 ON TO OUR NEXT ITEM WHICH IS ITEM 5-C, THE APPROVAL OF THE RM3  
24 INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** WE NEED TO TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT LAST ITEMS.

2

3 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** MY APOLOGY CEASE.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS IN WRITING, NO  
6 MEMBERS OF PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND NO SPEAKER CARDS  
7 IN THE ROOM. THANK YOU.

8

9 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SOIL ANNOUNCE THE ITEM NOW. AGENDA  
10 ITEM NUMBER 5-C, APPROVAL OF THE RM3 INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT  
11 COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT. UNDER THE DIRECTION OF THE RM3  
12 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CHAIR BRIAN SHAW, AN AD HOC COMMITTEE, AN  
13 AD HOC WORKING COMMITTEE -- WORKING GROUP OF THE COMMITTEE WAS  
14 CONVENED TO OVERSEE THE BODY REPORT TO THE COLLEGE HIGH  
15 TEMPERATURE. THE WORKING GROUP WAS COMPRISED MANUFACTURE  
16 MEMBERS WHO HAVE VOLUNTEERED -- THANK YOU -- TO PARTICIPATE  
17 DURING A SEPTEMBER 9 MEETING OF THE IOC AND INCLUDED FORMER  
18 CLEAR AND MEMBER SHAW, MEMBER HAGERTY, AND MEMBER BRIDLEBOUGH.  
19 THE WORKING GROUP MET WITH STAFF WITH MTC VIA ZOOM ON OCTOBER  
20 22 AND NOVEMBER 15, 2024. THE RESULT OF THE WORKING GROUP'S  
21 EFFORT IS THE DRAFT REPORT PRESENTED FOR YOUR REVIEW AND  
22 APPROVAL AS PART OF THE AGENDA ITEM. CRAIG BOSEMAN WILL  
23 PROVIDE THE ANNUAL REPORT FOR OUR CONSIDERATION AND APPROVAL  
24 AND THERE WILL BE COMMENTS BY THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, VICE-CHAIR KINDIG AND CRAIG BOSEMAN WITH  
2 MTC PROGRAMMING STAFF. I WANT TO PROVIDE A BRIEF OVERVIEW AND  
3 WHAT IT CONTAINS BEFORE TURNING IT BACK OVER TO YOU ALL FOR  
4 CONVERSATION FROM THE COMMITTEE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO AS A  
5 REMINDER, THE STATUTORY REQUIREMENT FOR THIS BODY IS TO  
6 ANNUALLY REVIEW THE EXPENDITURE OF FUNDS BY THE BAY AREA TOLL  
7 AUTHORITY FOR THE PROBLEMS AND PROGRAMS SPECIFIED IN THE RM3  
8 STATUTE AND PREPARE AND SUBMIT A REPORT TO THE TRANSPORTATION  
9 COMMITTEE TO EACH HOUSE OF THE LEGISLATURE SUM RISING ITS  
10 FINDINGS. THAT IS WHAT IS IN FRONT OF YOU TODAY. NEXT SLIDE,  
11 PLEASE. AS JUST MENTIONED AN AD HOC COMMITTEE WAS FORMED TO  
12 DRAFT THIS REPORT. MEMBERS HAGERTY AND STEVE BRIDLEBOUGH ARE  
13 HERE TODAY, AS WELL RECENTLY RESIGNED FORMER CHAIR SHAW MET IN  
14 OCTOBER AND NOVEMBER AND STARTED WITH THE TEMPLATE THAT WAS  
15 PROVIDED BY MTC STAFF IN SEPTEMBER. THEY COLLABORATIVELY DREW  
16 UP DRAFT FINDS AND REQUESTED FOR MTC STAFF TO PROVIDE  
17 ADDITIONAL DETAIL IN THE REPORT. SOME OF THOSE NEWLY ADDED  
18 EXCEPTIONS INCLUDE DISCUSSION OF THE RM3 POLICIES, PROCEDURES  
19 HOURS AND ALLOCATION PROJECT. LETTER OF NO PREJUDICE TOOL THAT  
20 HAS USED. DISCUSSION OF AUDITOR FUNCTIONS THAT MTC ENGAGES IN,  
21 WHICH WERE DETAILED IN ITEM 5-A EARLIER. AND THE -- AND THE  
22 INCLUSION AND DISCUSSION OF THE -- OF THE BATA ANNUAL REPORT  
23 TO THE LEGISLATURE WHICH WE JUST TALKED ABOUT IN ITEM 5-B. AND  
24 SO THAT IS INCLUDED AS AN APPENDIX TO YOUR REPORT BY  
25 REFERENCE. AND -- WE ARE HOPING IT SORT OF SERVES AS A SOURCE



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 OF TRUTH FOR WHAT MTC AND BATA HAS DONE IN TERMS OF THESE ARE  
2 THE ALLOCATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE. THESE ARE OUR POLICIES  
3 AND PROCEDURES AND A COUPLE OF REFERENCES WITHIN THE DRAFT  
4 REPORT SO THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT IS -- IT IS ALL -- IT IS ALL  
5 CONSISTENT AND CLEAR. WE HAVE ALSO INCLUDED TWO APPENDIXES  
6 THAT ARE THE INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANTS REPORTS THAT WERE  
7 DETAILED EARLIER IN ITEM 5-A AS WELL. ONE, YOU KNOW -- ONE  
8 NOTE ABOUT THE DRAFT REPORT IN FRONT OF YOU. THE -- THE ROSTER  
9 AND THE CHAIR THAT ARE LISTED ON THE SECOND PAGE OF THE  
10 REPORT, OBVIOUSLY WE WILL UPDATE THAT PRIOR TO SUBMITTING TO  
11 THE LEGISLATURE. BUT -- BUT OTHERWISE, WE ARE PRESENTING THIS  
12 FOR APPROVAL TODAY. YOU KNOW IF PRESIDENT COMMITTEE WISHES TO  
13 GO THAT DIRECTION. I WOULD ALSO JUST NOTE A COUPLE OF THE  
14 DISCUSSIONS THAT WE ARE PRESENT ON IN THE AD HOC COMMITTEE.  
15 MENTIONED A FEW COMMUTER -- A FUTURE PROCESS CHANGES SUCH AS  
16 STARTING THE PROCESS A LITTLE BIT EARLIER IN THE YEAR, DELVING  
17 INTO MORE TOPICS, PERHAPS MORE COMMITTEES, DELVING INTO  
18 CAPITAL AND OPERATING SEPARATELY AND MORE DEEPLY. BUT WE  
19 REALLY THINK THAT WHAT IS IN FRONT OF YOU TODAY IS A GREAT  
20 PIECE OF WORK, A GREAT START TO THE COMMITTEE IN THE FIRST  
21 YEAR, AND NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE, BY THE WAY. SO TODAY THE  
22 COMMITTEE CAN APPROVE THE REPORT. THIS CAN BE APPROVED AS --  
23 AS IS LISTED IN THE PACKET. WITH SPECIFIC CHANGES INCLUDING  
24 PERHAPS THE MEMBERSHIP UPDATE. WE CAN ALSO TAKE IT AS AN  
25 ACTION -- APPROVAL ITEM WITH ANY SPECIFIC EDITS THAT ARE --





NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 THAT ARE MOTIONED AND APPROVED BY THE COMMITTEE.  
2 ALTERNATIVELY, IF THERE IS -- IF THERE IS MORE DETAILED  
3 FEEDBACK OR MORE COMPLICATED EDITS, MTC STAFF CAN INCORPORATE  
4 THAT FEEDBACK AND REVISE THE REPORT IN -- IN COORDINATION WITH  
5 THE AD HOC COMMITTEE AND YOU ALL CAN MEET AGAIN ON DECEMBER 9,  
6 TO REVIEW AND APPROVE AN UPDATED FINAL REPORT. AND ONCE IT IS  
7 APPROVED, MTC STAFF WILL SEND THE REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE.  
8 WE WILL INCLUDE THE BATA APPROVED ANNUAL REPORT TO THE  
9 LEGISLATURE. AGAIN THAT IS SCHEDULED FOR NEXT WEDNESDAY, THE  
10 20th OF NOVEMBER. WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO HAND IT BACK OVER  
11 TO THE COMMITTEE OR ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS THAT WE CAN  
12 ADDRESS RIGHT NOW.

13

14 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** BEFORE WE ACTUALLY TAKE AND MAKE THE  
15 MOTION, MEMBER HAGERTY, WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE SOME COMMENTS  
16 AT THIS TIME?

17

18 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** I AM OVER HERE

19

20 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SORRY, I AM GETTING CONFUSED.

21

22 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** ON BEHALF OF SUBCOMMITTEE THAT WORKED ON THIS  
23 REPORT, STEVE, BRIAN AND MYSELF. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF  
24 FOR WORKING WITH US. THEY LISTENED TO US. THEY INCORPORATED  
25 OUR THOUGHTS AND IDEAS IN THE DRAFT THAT IS BEFORE US TODAY. I



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 THINK THEY DID A SUPER JOB. SO CRAIG DID A GREAT JOB  
2 SUMMARIZING WHAT WE TALKED ABOUT AND WHAT ACTIONS THE STAFF  
3 TOOK. AND JUST BRIEFLY, AGAIN, JUST -- BECAUSE I THINK IT IS  
4 IMPORTANT THAT THE IOC UNDERSTAND THIS. WE FELT THAT THE --  
5 THAT THE PROJECT DESCRIPTION NEEDED TO BE BEEFED UP A LITTLE  
6 BIT. THAT WAS DONE. WE FELT IT WAS IMPORTANT THAT THE PUBLIC  
7 UNDERSTAND WHAT THE POLICIES AND PROCEDURES WERE THAT MTC  
8 STAFF IS USING IN ORDER TO ALLOCATE FUND. AND WE WANTED TO  
9 MAKE SURE THAT THIS -- THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE WAS COMFORTABLE  
10 THAT THOSE PROCEDURES WERE ONES THAT -- THAT RESULTED IN  
11 PRESIDENT MONIES BEING ALLOCATED APPROPRIATELY. WE THOUGHT  
12 THAT THE -- WE THOUGHT THAT THE AUDITS HAD TO BE REFERENCED.  
13 EVEN INCLUDED IF POSSIBLE. AND WE ALSO FELT THAT THE -- THAT  
14 OUR REPORT SHOULD BE CONSISTENT WITH OTHER RELATED REPORTS. SO  
15 WE TALKED ABOUT THE BAFTA REPORT. IT IS CONSISTENT WITH THAT  
16 REPORT. AND THEN WE ALSO -- AS CRAIG SAID -- THERE WAS SOME  
17 RECOMMENDATIONS, THE MAJOR ONES -- A COUPLE OF THEM. THE MAJOR  
18 ONE IS WE FELT IT WAS IMPORTANT THAT THE COUNTIES WHO HAVE NOT  
19 FILLED THESE SEATS ON THIS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE DO SO AS SOON  
20 AS POSSIBLE. AND THERE WERE SOME SUGGESTION OF FORMING A  
21 SUBCOMMITTEE IN THE FUTURE THAT WILL BREAK DOWN MAYBE CAPITAL  
22 OR OPERATING EXPENSES. BE ABLE TO REVIEW THAT. SO WITH THAT,  
23 THE SUBCOMMITTEE -- AND STEVE JUMP IN -- BUT I THINK ITS FAIR  
24 TO SAY THAT THE SUBCOMMITTEE IS VERY HAPPY WITH THE RESULTS WE  
25 GOT FROM THE STAFF.



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **STEVE BRIDLEBOUGH:** YEAH, I JUST COMMENTED THIS IS A VERY  
3 PRELIMINARY EFFORT. AND I -- I THINK WE'VE BEEN ABLE TO  
4 RECOGNIZE THAT THE AUDIT SEEMS TO COVER THINGS. THE AUDITS ARE  
5 A LITTLE SKEWED IN TERMS OF WHAT IS AVAILABLE. THEY CAN --  
6 SORRY. THEY -- THEY COVER THE FISCAL YEAR AND A NUMBER OF  
7 THINGS THAT ARE GOING ON RIGHT NOW THAT -- THAT HAVEN'T BEEN  
8 SUBJECT TO AUDIT. BUT GENERALLY, THIS IS A -- I THINK, THIS IS  
9 AN ADEQUATE REVIEW OF WHAT IS GOING ON.

10

11 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SO TO MOVE THE ITEM FORWARD SO WE CAN  
12 CONTINUE OUR DISCUSSION, I AM GOING TO ASK -- DO I HAVE A  
13 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE ANNUAL REPORT.

14

15 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** I MOVE TO APPROVE THE ANNUAL REPORT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I SECOND.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT AS STAFF, WE ARE  
20 ENABLED BY YOU TO MAKE SOME VERY FUNDAMENTAL ET ITS TO THE  
21 ROSTER, THE MEMBER INFORMATION AND THE -- AND THE -- THE CHAIR  
22 POSITIONS OF THE SIGNATORY ON THE REPORTS. SORRY IF I JUMPED  
23 THE GUN A LITTLE BIT, BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE  
24 ABILITY TO DO THAT.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU NEED FOR US TO AMEND THE MOTION?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** IT IS IN THE DISCRETION OF THE COMMITTEE AND YOU CAN  
4 TAKE THAT MOTION AS AMENDED IF RECOMMENDED BY THE CHAIR.

5

6 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I WOULD RECOMMEND THE MOTION BE  
7 AMENDED TO INCLUDE YOUR COMMENTS.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HOW DO WE DO THAT WITH A MOTION ON THE FLOOR?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SO WHAT WE OUGHT TO DO IS TAKE A VOICE VOTE TO AMEND  
12 THE MOTION.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SO I MOVE TO AMEND THE MOTION TO ALLOW STAFF TO MAKE  
15 CHANGES TO THE CURRENT ROSTER AS IS OR AS NEEDED.

16

17 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** IS THERE A SECOND TO THAT?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** I WILL SECOND.

20

21 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ALL THOSE IN FAVOR OF THE AMENDED  
22 MOTION, SAY AYE. OPPOSED? THE AMENDED MOTION IS PASSED.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MAY I JUST REPEAT THE MOTION AND THE  
25 SECOND, MOTION BY WEBSTER, AND SECOND BY HAYES, IS THAT RIGHT?



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1

2 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** HAGERTY.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HAGERTY. THANK YOU SO AS MUCH.

5

6 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** MADAM CHAIR, MAY I MAKE A COMMENT?

7

8 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES, YOU CAN, JOANNE.

9

10 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** I WANT TO THANK KEVIN AND STEVE AND BRIAN WHO  
11 IS NOT HERE. THANK YOU FOR TAKING THE TIME TO MAKE THE REPORT  
12 MUCH BETTER. MUCH APPRECIATED. BUT JUST A COMMENT TO STAFF. I  
13 REALLY ENCOURAGE THE VACANT SEATS TO BE FILLED AS WELL. THAT  
14 REALLY HELPS WITH QUORUM. IF ANYTHING THAT THIS COMMISSION CAN  
15 DO -- OR THIS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE CAN TO DO ASSIST WITH THAT,  
16 BECAUSE I DON'T WANT TO PUT EXTRA WORK ON STAFF, BUT OUTREACH  
17 THAT IS NEEDED TO COLLEAGUES IN DIFFERENT COUNTIES, HAPPY TO  
18 ASSIST WITH THAT.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** WE WILL CERTAINLY TAKE THAT UNDER CONSIDERATION AND  
21 SEE IF ANYTHING THAT THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS CAN TO DO HELP.

22

23 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** THANK YOU.

24



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** JOANNE, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THOSE  
2 COMMENTS. BECAUSE WITHOUT A FULL MEMBER BOARD, IT IS HARD FOR  
3 THIS COMMITTEE TO PROCEED GOING FORWARD.

4

5 **KATHY CHANG:** CAN I ALSO MAKE A COMMENT?

6

7 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

8

9 **KATHY CHANG:** I THANK MTC. THIS TIME I ACTUALLY MADE AN EFFORT  
10 TO REACH OUT TO THE MEMBERS, YOU KNOW AHEAD OF TIME, BECAUSE I  
11 RECEIVED E-MAIL FOR THE FIRST TWO MEETINGS KIND OF -- TOO  
12 CLOSE. HE ALREADY HAVE THINGS PLANNED OUT. EVEN THIS TIME,  
13 WHEN I RECEIVED THE VOICEMAIL, THAT WAS THE DAY I WAS ON THE  
14 WAY TO SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT AND FLYING OUT. SO I THINK E-MAIL  
15 -- E-MAIL COMMUNICATION IS GREAT AND ALSO AHEAD OF THE TIME,  
16 YOU KNOW, FOR THE MEETING DAYS. THAT WILL WORK SO MUCH BETTER.  
17 THANK YOU.

18

19 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** SO LET'S GET DOWN TO THE NITTY GRITTY  
20 FOR COMMENTS ABOUT THE REPORT THAT WE RECEIVED. I WOULD LIKE  
21 SOME INPUT AS TO HOW YOU ALL ARE FEELING ABOUT WHAT THE  
22 COMMITTEE -- WHAT THE AD HOC COMMITTEE PUT TOGETHER. I THINK  
23 IT IS IMPORTANT THAT -- THAT WE ARE ALL COMFORTABLE AS WE GO  
24 FORWARD TO BE ABLE TO PRODUCE THIS REPORT.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** MADAM CHAIR, I AM A LITTLE BIT CONFUSED, AND I  
2 APOLOGIZE. WE JUST PASSED THE APPROVAL OF THE REPORT. AND I  
3 THOUGHT WE HAD MADE COMMENTS. SO -- I THOUGHT WE -- I  
4 APOLOGIZE.

5

6 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I THOUGHT WE ONLY PASSED THE AMENDED  
7 MOTION.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** IT IS A LITTLE UNCLEAR WHAT -- IN RETROSPECT WHAT  
10 APPROVAL WAS DONE. SO WHY DON'T WE TREAT THE APPROVAL AS  
11 APPROVING THE AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION AND TAKE A FINAL VOTE ON  
12 APPROVAL OF THE REPORT ITSELF, SUBJECT TO ANY COMMENTS THAT  
13 THE COMMITTEE MIGHT HAVE.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THANK YOU, MATTHEW.

16

17 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ARE THERE OTHER COMMENTS? YES?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I AM VERY COMFORTABLE.

22

23 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES, FREDERICK.

24



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** I AM VERY COMFORTABLE WITH THE REPORT.  
2 I HAVE A LITTLE DIFFERENT VIEW OF WHAT THIS COMMITTEE SHOULD  
3 BE DOING, BUT WHAT HAS BEEN PRODUCED, I THINK IT IS WELL-DONE.  
4 I THINK A LOT OF EFFORT WENT INTO IT TO EXPLAIN IT. AND WHAT  
5 THE COMMITTEE THINKS AS A WHOLE THINKS SHOULD BE DONE. SO I  
6 WILL SUPPORT IT.

7

8 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES, MATTHEW.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** IF THOSE ARE ALL THE COMMENTS, AN AMENDED MOTION THAT  
11 HAS BEEN APPROVED. I THINK WE NEED TO VOTE ON THAT NOW.

12

13 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** DOES THE CLERK NEED TO MAKE ANY  
14 COMMENTS BEFORE WE FINISH OUR FINAL VOTE ABOUT -- OTHER  
15 COMMENTS?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** AGAIN, THE MOTION IS, AS I UNDERSTAND IT, TO APPROVE  
18 THE REPORT, SUBJECT TO ADMINISTRATIVE CHANGES THAT MAY NEED TO  
19 BE MADE THAT MISS ROMELL HAVE REFERENCED AND I THINK WE ARE  
20 READY FOR A VOTE ON THAT.

21

22 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** ALL RIGHT. SO COMMITTEE, YOU HEARD NO  
23 YOU WHAT THE MOTION IS. SO I WILL ASK IF ALL THOSE IN FAVOR BY  
24 STATING AYE.

25





NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** MADAM CHAIR, DO WE NEED A ROLL CALL VOTE SINCE THIS  
4 IS A MAJOR VOTE OR CAN WE JUST RAISE OUR HANDS?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** SINCE ALL MEMBERS ARE PRESENT, YOU CAN PROCEED WITH A  
7 VOICE VOTE. IF THE CLEAR WOULD PREFER A ROLL CALL VOTE, THAT  
8 IS IN THE CHAIR'S DISCRETION.

9

10 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** WOULD YOU PREFER THE ROLL CALL VOTE?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I THINK SO THERE IS RECORD OF HOW WE VOTED. THANK  
13 YOU.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** WITH THAT, I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO  
16 PLEASE CALL THE ROLL ON THIS MOTION THAT WE ARE ABOUT TO PASS  
17 TO 'PROVE THE ANNUAL REPORT THAT WE WILL PRESENT TO THE  
18 LEGISLATURE.

19

20 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

21

22 **STEVE BRIDLEBOUGH:** AYE.

23

24 **KATHY CHANG:** AYE.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** YES.

2

3 **FREDERIC ARN HANSSON:** YES.

4

5 **WILLIAM G. JERRY HAYES:** YES.

6

7 **JOHN MAITLAND:** YES.

8

9 **NAZANIN SHAKERIN:** AYE.

10

11 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MOTION PASSES.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THE COMMITTEE GIVES THANKS TO KEVIN  
16 AND GIVES THANKS TO STEVE. AND THANKS TO DAVID SHAW. HE JUST -  
17 - WHEN I RECEIVED THIS INFORMATION, YOU ALL DID SUCH A GREAT  
18 JOB OF SUMMARIZING WHAT WE HAVE BEEN GOING THROUGH. THE NUMBER  
19 OF DOCUMENTS AND ALL THE PAPERWORK WE HAVE BEEN GOING THROUGH  
20 TO HAVE IT SUMMARIZED IN SUCH A WAY THAT WILL BE REALLY EASY  
21 FOR THE PUBLIC TO HEAR AND READ. THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR  
22 WORK. WITH THAT, LET'S MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM -- OH, YES.

23



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. NO PUBLIC  
2 COMMENTS RECEIVED IN WRITING. NO MECHANICS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
3 THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO SPEAKER CARD IN THE ROOM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** WITH THAT, MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM  
6 NUMBER 6, PUBLIC COMMENT AND ANY OTHER BUSINESS. I WILL NOW  
7 ASK THE CLERK TO LIST THE ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT  
8 ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM AT INFO BAY AREA.GOV BY 5 P.M.  
9 YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD.

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITE WILLING. NO  
12 SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM. AND NO HANDS RAISED ONLINE. THANK  
13 YOU.

14

15 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** AND I SPREE NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT  
16 HERE IN THE ROOM. SO WITH THAT, I WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM  
17 NUMBER 7. THE ADJOURNMENT AND NOTICE OF THE NEXT MEETING. SO  
18 IS THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE RM3 INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT  
19 COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HEALED DECEMBER 9 AT 11:00.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES, THAT'S CORRECT.

22

23 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THE LOCATION WILL BE HERE.

24



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:**MADAM CHAIR, I BELIEVE THAT MEETING WITH AS SCHEDULED  
2 IN CASE WE COULDN'T APPROVE THE REPORT. SO DO WE NEED THAT  
3 MEETING?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** WE DO NOT NEED THAT MEETING. WE CAN PROCEED WITH  
6 SCHEDULING A REGULAR MEETING OF THE IOC AT THE APPROPRIATE  
7 TIME MAYBE AFTER THE HOLIDAYS.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** MADAM CHAIR, ANOTHER QUESTION.

10

11 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THINK IT WILL BE -- I AM ON OTHER OVERSIGHT  
14 COMMITTEES. AND THEY POINT SCHEDULE THE DATES FOR THE COMING  
15 NEAR IN ADVANCE TO WE CAN GET THEM ON THE CALENDAR. WILL THAT  
16 BE POSSIBLE WITH THIS GROUP?

17

18 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I WILL SUPPORT THAT 100%. AND DO WE  
19 HAVE A LIMITED -- I MEAN -- A LIMITED AMOUNT -- DO WE HAVE TO  
20 MEET FOUR TIMES A YEAR? I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT --

21

22 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, THERE IS NO LIMIT. REIMBURSEMENT UP TO FOUR  
23 MEETINGS PER YEAR. I AM TRYING TO RECALL WHAT WE SAID AT THE  
24 FIRST MEETING OF KIND OF THE CADENCE OF THESE MEETINGS. IT  
25 LOOKS LIKES WE DIDN'T REALLY LAND ON ANYTHING IN TECH, BUT WE



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 COULD -- WE COULD SCHEDULE FOUR AND IF THE COMMITTEE AT THE  
2 SIDES WE DON'T WANT OR NEED ONE OF THE MEETINGS, WE CAN CANCEL  
3 IT AT YOUR WILL.

4

5 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I THINK IT WAS NOTED ALSO EARLIER WHEN  
6 KEVIN WAS TALKING ABOUT -- ABOUT PRESIDENT NEED TO MAYBE HAVE  
7 ADDITIONAL SUBCOMMITTEES THAT WOULD BE INVOLVED IN LOOKING AT  
8 SPECIFIC THINGS. SO I WOULD THINK THAT WE WOULD WANT TO  
9 SCHEDULE THE FOUR MEETINGS SO THAT THEY WORK AROUND WHEN  
10 FINANCIAL INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE. AND WHEN THINGS HAVE TO BE  
11 SCHEDULED. SO, I MEAN -- I WOULD THINK WE WILL BE LOOKING FOR  
12 SOMETHING LIKE MARCH, JUNE, SEPTEMBER, DECEMBER. THAT IS JUST  
13 SOMETHING I AM -- I AM PUTTING OUT THERE. OTHER COMMENTS?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THE LAST MEETING -- I THINK IT IS GOOD THAT WE HAD A  
16 MEETING IN NOVEMBER. IF WE HAVE TO COMPLETE THE REPORT BE THE  
17 END OF THE CALENDAR YEAR. I WOULD SUGGEST THAT LAST MEETING BE  
18 SCHEDULED IN NOVEMBER WITH THE FALL-BACK OF ANOTHER POSSIBLE  
19 MEETING IN DECEMBER, IF WE NEED IT.

20

21 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** RIGHT. GOOD POINT, KEVIN. YES, JOANNE  
22 REBECCA WEBSTER I DON'T SEE A POINT TO HAVE MORE THAN FOUR  
23 MEET AGENCIES YEAR AND GIVES STAFF TIME TO DO THE WORK THEY  
24 ARE DOING SO WELL. WE CAN ALWAYS CANCEL. I THINK PUTTING FOUR



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 ON THE CALENDAR WILL BE GREAT. I AGREE WITH KEVIN, I THINK  
2 NOVEMBER SHOULD BE THE LAST ONE OF THE CALENDAR YEAR.

3

4 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** OTHER INPUT? IS THERE A -- IS THERE A  
5 NEED TO MEET BEFORE MARCH FROM A STAFF'S STANDPOINT?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** NOT FROM A STAFF'S STANDPOINT. IF YOU WANTED TO MORE  
8 EVENLY PEACE OUT THE MEETINGS, WE MIGHT WANT TO CONSIDER A  
9 FEBRUARY MEETING SO THAT WE CAN COMPLETE FOUR MEETINGS BY  
10 NOVEMBER, BUT IT IS -- THIS NO URGENCY TO ANY PARTICULAR  
11 MONTH.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SUGGEST THAT WE HAVE MEETINGS, LET'S SEA, A  
14 MONTH OR SIX WEEKS AFTER WE HAVE GOT AN A YOU HAD FOR'S  
15 REPORT. BECAUSE THAT'S SORT OF THE MAIN ISSUE WE NEED TO BE  
16 LOOKING AT. AND THOSE -- I AM NOT SURE EXACTLY WHAT -- HOW  
17 THAT SCHEDULING IS DONE.

18

19 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** WORK ON JULY TO JUNE FISCAL YEAR,  
20 CORRECT?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, SO THE AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES THAT  
23 YOU ARE REFERRING TO IS DONE ON A HEIGHT OF THE -- IT IS STILL  
24 LOOKING AT THE FISCAL YEAR, BUT A SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT SCHEDULE



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 THAN OUR TYPICAL AUDITS, SO I CAN GET BACK TO YOU WHEN WE WILL  
2 ANTICIPATE THAT BEING COMPLETED.

3

4 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I HEAR A FEBRUARY AND NOVEMBER  
5 MEETING.

6

7 **JOANNE WEBSTER:** IF I MAY, THE HOLIDAY IS USUALLY A TIME WHEN  
8 PEOPLE -- IT IS SORT OF LIKE DOWNTIME. WELL-DEPOSIT SERVED  
9 DOWNTIME. I FEEL IT IS REALLY IMPORTANT AS A BODY, WE MEET  
10 WHEN THERE IS -- WHEN THERE IS WORK TO DO AND WORK TO REVIEW.  
11 AND I AM A LITTLE CONCERNED WE WOULD MEET IN FEBRUARY, AND WE  
12 WON'T HAVE UPDATES. I AM REALLY GOING TO DEFER TO THE STAFF  
13 HERE RELATIVE TO THAT. DO YOU ANTICIPATE THE NEED FOR THIS  
14 BODY TO REVIEW ANY WORK BEFORE MARCH?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YOU KNOW, EXPENDITURES WHICH IS YOUR PURVIEW TO  
17 REVIEW EXPENDITURES FOR RM3, THEY HAPPEN ON A ROLLING BASIS  
18 THROUGHOUT THE YEAR. NOT ONE PARTICULAR MONTH THAT IS HEAVIER  
19 THAN OTHER. DEPENDS ON WHEN PROJECT SPONSORS NEED THEIR  
20 FUNDING. SO WE CAN ROLL ANY NUMBER OF MONTHS TOGETHER AND  
21 PRESENT THOSE TO YOU AS -- AS YOU WISH. AND SO THERE IS NOT  
22 ANY -- I MEAN, YOU CAN HAVE THREE MEETINGS. YOU CAN HAVE TWO  
23 MEETINGS. IT IS ALL KIND OF UP TO YOUR DISCRETION.

24



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** THANK YOU. WHEN WILL JUNE 30 AUDIT  
2 REPORT BE COMPLETED. IF WE WANT TO LOOK AT AUDIT INFORMATION,  
3 THE JUNE 30, '24 WE WILL BE LOOKING AT.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I WILL NEED TO GET BACK TO STAFF WHEN THEY EXPECT THE  
6 AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES REPORT TO BE COMPLETED FOR PRESIDENT  
7 PERIOD ENDING JUNE 30.

8

9 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** MAYBE THAT IS THE DECIDING FACTOR IS  
10 WHETHER WE MEET IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH. I WOULD THINK WE WOULD  
11 WANT TO SEE SOME OF THAT AUDIT INFORMATION TO BE ABLE TO GET  
12 THINGS IN LINE FOR WHAT WE ARE SPECIFICALLY LOOKING AT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:**BASED ON WHAT DEREK CAN DISCERN FROM THE SCHEDULE. IF  
15 YOU WOULD LIKE, STAFF COULD PROPOSE A SET OF DATE BASED ON THE  
16 AUDIT FINDINGS.

17

18 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES. LET'S DO THAT. YES. MISS CHANGE.

19

20 **KATHY CHANG:** SO I HEARD ACTUALLY IT IS REALLY AGREED MACHINE  
21 UPON PROCEDURE. NOT REALLY A FULL AUDIT, CORRECT?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT. YOU KNOW, IT IS REALLY TRYING TO GET AT A  
24 VERY DIFFERENT KIND OF THING. OUR FINANCIAL AUDITS FOR MTC AND  
25 ALL OF ITS RELATED INCIDENT TYPES ARE COMPLETED AND ACCEPTED





NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 BY ALL OF THE BOARD FRANKLY THE LAST BOARD -- THE SET OF  
2 BOARDS LAST NIGHT FOR THE ABAG AND RELATED ENTITIES, MTC  
3 ACCEPTED THEIRS BACK IN OCTOBER. AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES ARE  
4 DOING SOMETHING VERY DIFFERENT. IT IS NOT LOOKING AT WHETHER  
5 THE FINANCIAL STATEMENTS THEMSELVES HAVE BEEN PREPARED OUT ANY  
6 MATERIAL MISSTATEMENTS WHICH, WE DID GET UNMODIFIED OPINIONS  
7 FROM OUR INDEPENDENT AUDITOR. THE AGREED-UPON PROCEDURES ARE  
8 DOING SOMETHING VERY DIFFERENT. WHAT IT IS DOING IS KIND OF  
9 SPOT-CHECKING ALL OF THE EXPENDITURES TO DETERMINE WHETHER WE  
10 FOLLOWED THE RULES AND REQUIREMENTS OF THE REGIONAL MEASURE 3.  
11 IT IS REALLY NOT A FINANCIAL AUDIT, BUT LOOKING AT A DIFFERENT  
12 SET OF COMPLIANCE RULES.

13

14 **KATHY CHANG:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES, JOHN MATTE ARE WILL HE LOOKING AT  
17 THREE MEETINGS, SPRING, SUMMER AND FALL WITH THE IDEA THAT WE  
18 MAY HAVE TO HAVE A DECEMBER MEETING?

19

20 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** I THINK THAT IS WHAT IT IS FALLING TO.  
21 YES.

22

23 **KATHY CHANG:** MADAM CHAIR, THIS MAY NOT BE IN OUR PURVIEW. I AM  
24 JUST WONDER ANY INTEREST ON THIS COMMITTEE ONCE THE CAPITAL  
25 PROJECTS STARTS GETTING OFF THE GROUND THAT WE MAY ASK FOR A



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 PRESENTATION FROM THE APPROPRIATE AGENCIES TO COME HERE AND  
2 JUST TELL US ABOUT THE PROM AND THEIR PROGRESS. I KNOW IT NOT  
3 NECESSARILY HAVE TO DO WITH THE FINANCIAL OVERSIGHT, BUT ANY  
4 INTEREST THAT WE WOULD LIKE -- ESPECIALLY SOME OF THE HIGH  
5 EXPOSURE PUBLIC PRINCE GEORGE TO SEE GENERAL INTEREST WHAT THE  
6 PROJECT IS LIKE IN TERMS OF DESIGN AND OPERATION. JUST AN IDEA  
7 OR SUGGESTION. I AM NOT SURE IF WE HAVE THE TIME OR INTEREST  
8 TO DO IT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I THINK STAFF WILL HAVE TO LOOK AT THE -- HOW SUCH A  
11 PRESENTATION COULD BE MADE SUCH THAT IT WILL BE WITHIN THE  
12 PURSUE OF THIS BODY.

13

14 **NAZANIN SHAKERIN:** OKAY, THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WILL ADD FROM TIME TO TIME WE HAVE PRESENTATIONS AT  
17 OTHER COMMITTEES THAT WE CAN CERTAINLY PROVIDE YOU A HEADS-UP,  
18 IF WE ARE ABLE TO.

19

20 **NAZANIN SHAKERIN:** GREAT, THANK YOU.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** BEFORE I LET YOU COMMENT, KEVIN, I  
23 NEED TO GO FOR A MOMENT. I SIT ON A MEASURE MEETING AND WE GET  
24 PRESENTATIONS EVERY ME MEETING. I CAN UNDERSTAND YOUR  
25 INTEREST, BECAUSE IT DOES -- IT NOT ONLY GIVES YOU PICTURES OF



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 WHAT THEY HAVE DONE. PERSONAL OPINIONS HOW IT IS WORKING. YOU  
2 KNOW I SORT OF WILL SUPPORT GETTING SOME SORT OF REPORT, YES.  
3 KEVIN.

4

5 **KEVIN HAGERTY:** I -- THERE SEEMS TO BE SOME CONFUSION HERE. AND  
6 I AM EVEN MAYBE A LITTLE CONFUSED MYSELF. I AM WONDER IF IT  
7 WOULD BE APPROPRIATE MAYBE AT THE NEXT MEETING IF STAFF  
8 PROVIDED US WITH KIND OF AN OVERVIEW OF WHAT THE PURPOSE OF  
9 THIS GROUP IS THAT IS APPROPRIATE, WHAT IS NOT APPROPRIATE.  
10 BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS STILL SOME CONFUSION. AND I THINK IT  
11 WILL BE GREAT IF WE WERE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE.

12

13 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** EVERY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE I HAVE  
14 OPINION ON HAS HAD THAT ISSUE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** FROM STAFF, I THINK WE CAN CERTAINLY AGENDAIZE A VERY  
17 SHORT REPORT. I THINK WE -- WE HAVE KIND OF TOUCHED ON THIS  
18 ISSUE BEFORE. AND YOU ALL DISCUSSED IT AT YOUR COMMITTEE  
19 MEETINGS, BUT I BELIEVE IT DOESN'T HURT TO KIND OF GROUND US  
20 TO THAT.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I THINK JUST ONE COMMENT ON THAT.  
23 BECAUSE WE ARE NOT A COMPLETE BODY YET. WE WEREN'T -- WE DON'T  
24 HAVE ALL THE VACANCIES FILLED. WE HAVE NEW PEOPLE COMING IN ON  
25 A REGULAR BASIS AND THOSE PEOPLE MIGHT NOT HAVE HEARD YOUR



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 ORIGINAL PRESENTATION. SO -- I MEAN, THERE ARE SEVERAL WAYS TO  
2 DO THIS. ONE IS, TO CREATE SOME TYPE OF OR EDUCATION FOR  
3 PEOPLE COMING IN. MAYBE A VIDEO OR SOMETHING THAT EVERYBODY IS  
4 GETTING THE SAME INCHES, OR WE COULD PERIODICALLY HAVE A STAFF  
5 UPDATE AND TO REMIND US AS TO WHAT OUR RESPONSIBILITIES ARE.

6

7 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** GOOD POINTS, KEVIN. YES, JOHN.

8

9 **JOHN MAITLAND:** THE PROBLEM IS WE HAVE 35 PROJECTS TO LOOK AT.  
10 AND TO HAVE PRESENTATIONS BY THOSE WILL BE A LOT MORE  
11 MEETINGS. MAYBE IT COULD BE THAT THERE ARE PRESENTATIONS GIVEN  
12 IN THE LOCAL AREA THAT MAYBE THE RM3 STAFF COULD BE INVITED  
13 TO, PARTICULARLY THE ONES THAT ARE FROM THAT AREA THAT MAY --  
14 THAT MAY HELP. AND SECOND COMMENT IS, AFTER THE SECOND MEETING  
15 HERE. I WAS GOING, WHAT ARE WE DOING SOMETHING IN SO I -- I  
16 ALWAYS KIND OF FELT THAT WAY. IN SOME WAYS, IT IS A VERY  
17 SIMPLE MISSION. WE LOOK AT WHAT THE PROJECTS ARE. WHAT MONEY  
18 IS BEING PROGRAMMED AND IS IT BEING SPENT THERE? IT IS KIND OF  
19 THAT SIMPLE. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE WANT PROBABLY MORE  
20 INFORMATION, BUT WHAT OUR ABSOLUTE RESPONSIBILITY IS REALLY  
21 SOMETHING WE HAVE TO, YOU KNOW, SIT DOWN AND UNDERSTAND. THANK  
22 YOU.

23

24 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** YES.

25



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 **KATHY CHANG:** CORRECT ME IF I'M WRONG, BUT IT SEEMS MTC IS  
2 REALLY A DISPERSING AGENT. SPONSOR AGENCIES, ACTUALLY THEY ARE  
3 IMPLEMENTING AGENCIES. THEY ACTUALLY -- ACTUALLY SPEND MONEY  
4 AND BUILD PROJECTS. SOME IT SEEMS OUR RESPONSIBILITY JUST AS  
5 YOU SAID, OKAY. IT IS AGREED-UPON PROCEDURE WHETHER YOU  
6 DISPERSE MONEY PROPERLY. SO THERE IS NO AUDIT OF EXPENDITURES.  
7 BECAUSE THEY ARE JUST DISPERSING AGENCY TO ME. AM I CORRECT?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, I THINK THAT IS GENERALLY CORRECT. AGAIN -- AND  
10 I THINK A NUMBER OF FOLKS HAVE ALLUDED TO IT TODAY. WE HAVE  
11 GOT TO A DEFINED SET OF PROJECTS AND STATUTES THAT WE ARE  
12 SUPPOSED TO FUND. THERE ARE SPONSORING AGENCIES FOR EACH OF  
13 THOSE PROJECTS. WE -- YOU KNOW, STAFF REIMBURSEMENT FOR THESE  
14 PROJECTS, WE LOOK TO MAKE SURE THE REIMBURSEMENT REQUESTS ARE  
15 ASSOCIATED WITH OF GOOD EXPENDITURES OF THOSE PARTICULAR  
16 PROJECTS. IT IS KIND OF WHERE IT STOPS.

17

18 **KATHY CHANG:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **V.CHAIR, PAMELA KINDIG:** EVEN THOUGH SOME OF THE PUBLIC WOULD  
21 TAKE THAT AS BEING NOT ENOUGH. SO -- BUT I CERTAINLY AGREE  
22 WITH YOUR TAKE ON WHAT OUR RESPONSIBILITY IS. AT THIS POINT, I  
23 THINK WE ARE ADJOURNING THIS MEETING TO AN UNSCHEDULED DATE,  
24 BUT IT MAY BE SOMETHING OF ALONG THE LINE OF THREE MEETINGS,  
25 HOLDING MAYBE DECEMBER FOR A MEETING THAT MAY BE REQUIRED AND



NOVEMBER 15, 2024

1 THAT STAFF WILL COME UP WITH THOSE THREE MEET WILLING THAT FIT  
2 THE SCHEDULE OF INFORMATION THAT THEY RECEIVE APPROPRIATELY TO  
3 BRING TO US AS THE COMMITTEE. WITH THAT, I WILL SAY WE ARE  
4 ADJOURNED.

5



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*