

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**FRIDAY, OCTOBER 11<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 9:40 AM**

**CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** I WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND CALL THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. AND THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEB SITE COMMITTEE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND WE WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION TODAY. FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS FOR US IS THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. EDDIE, WOULD YOU LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE? [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

**CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL CALL FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR SPERING?

2

3 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?

22 IS ABSENT. RABBITT?

23

24 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

2

3 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS THE MTC  
4 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING  
7 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE  
8 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP  
9 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
10 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
11 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THE NEXT  
14 ITEM IS THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS  
15 AGENDA ITEM 5A IS ON CONSENT, AND IS THERE A MOTION TO APPROVE  
16 CONSENT?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THE ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** EDDIE, DO YOU WANT TO SECOND  
21 THAT? [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, EDDIE. OKAY. I HAVE A MOTION AND A  
22 SECOND. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? IS THERE ANY WRITTEN  
23 COMMENTS?

24



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
2 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR  
3 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

4

5 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. IS THERE ANY MTC  
6 COMMISSIONERS ON REMOTE THAT'S VOTING?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE STILL HAVE TO DO ROLL CALL BECAUSE  
9 THERE IS --

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** NO. I KNOW THAT. BUT I WAS  
12 JUST ASKING --

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO ONE ON ZOOM OR IN THE  
15 BOARDROOM.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ROLL CALL.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR SPERING?

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

24

25 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND THE CONSENT CALENDER PASSES

19 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO

22 HAND THE MEETING OFF TO PRESIDENT RAMOS AND SHE'LL WALK US

23 THROUGH THE ABAG PROCEDURES.

24



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. CALL TO  
2 ORDER THE ABAG ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. A ROLL CALL WILL BE  
3 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE  
4 PARTICIPATION TODAY. WE'LL ESTABLISH QUORUM FIRST. SO I WOULD  
5 ASK THE CLERK TO CONDUCT -- TO CHECK OUR PARTICIPATION HERE IN  
6 THE ROOM AND ALSO REMOTELY. THANK YOU MISS SUTHERLAND.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. CHAIR RAMOS?

9

10 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT, AT MY NOTICED VIDEO  
15 CONFERENCE LOCATION, 2180, MILL [INDISCERNIBLE] BERKELEY  
16 CALIFORNIA.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ANDERSEN?

19

20 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** PRESENT IN DANVILLE AT MY OFFICE HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MEMBER ECKLUND?

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? ROMERO?

2

3 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** SILVA?

6

7 **CINDY SILVA:** PRESENT AT THE COUNTY SUPERVISORS'S OFFICE,  
8 PLEASANT HILL.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WILLIAMS?

11

12 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HERE.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A REQUEST FOR  
15 REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FOR MEMBER LEE.

16

17 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT RAMOS. I AM REQUESTING TO  
18 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB2449 JUST CAUSE DUE TO BUSINESS  
19 NEED. THERE IS NO ONE IN THIS ROOM OVER 18 YEARS OLD. AND I AM  
20 PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. NOTING MEMBER LEE AS  
23 PRESENT. NEXT ITEM WILL BE FOR OUR CLERK TO READ OUT OUR  
24 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING  
2 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG  
3 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE  
4 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$150 AND PER DIEM IS  
5 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
6 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT WE DO  
9 HAVE OUR CONSENT CALENDAR UNDER AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, AND WE HAVE  
10 ONE MATTER FOR OUR CONSIDERATION, 8A, WHICH ARE OUR MINUTES.  
11 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE ABAG CONSENT  
12 CALENDAR?

13

14 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** SO MOVED BY SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.

15

16 **PAT ECKLUND:** AND SECOND BY, UHM, ECKLUND. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE HAVE A  
19 MOTION BY WILLIAMS AND SECOND BY ECKLUND. THANK YOU FOR  
20 REMEMBERING YOUR NAMES. ARE THERE ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO  
21 WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? DO WE HAVE ANY ONLINE?  
22 SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK IS THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

23



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
2 WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WITH THEIR HAND  
3 RAISED AND NONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO PROVIDE COMMENT.

4

5 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ROLL CALL  
6 VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ABSOLUTELY. PRESIDENT RAMOS?

9 [SILENCE]

10

11 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** -- YES, THAT'S ME. [LAUGHTER] I  
12 FORGOT MY NAME.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** -- [LAUGHTER] VICE PRESIDENT  
15 ARREGUIN?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ANDERSEN?

20

21 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ECKLUND?

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** LEE?

3

4 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? MEMBER ROMERO?

7

8 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER SILVA?

11

12 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** WILLIAMS?

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

19 MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT ITEM, 9A.

22 THIS IS A CONTRACT FOR BAYREN, BAY AREA REGIONAL ENERGY

23 NETWORK FOR SINGLE-FAMILY PROGRAM DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

24 WITH FRANKLIN ENERGY. AND IT IS AN -- IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 EXCEED 22,100,000. JANE ELIAS, WOULD YOU PLEASE PROVIDE THE  
2 REPORT FOR US TODAY?

3

4 **JANE ELIAS:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD  
5 MEMBERS. JANE ELIAS DIRECTOR OF ENERGY PROGRAMS. THIS IS AN  
6 ABAG ITEM. SINCE 2013, THE BAY AREA REGIONAL ENERGY NETWORK,  
7 OR BAYREN, IMPLEMENTED PORTFOLIO. OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY  
8 PROGRAMS. THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION APPROVED  
9 BAYREN'S STRATEGIC BUSINESS PLAN FOR 2024 THROUGH 2031 AND 4-  
10 YEAR PROGRAM PORTFOLIO FROM 2024 THROUGH 2027 WITH  
11 ACCOMPANYING BUDGET OF APPROXIMATELY \$157 MILLION. WHILE  
12 SINGLE-FAMILY PROGRAM HAS BEEN AROUND SINCE 2013 AND HAS  
13 SUCCESSFULLY REACHED MANY CUSTOMERS OVER THE YEARS, FROM DATA  
14 COLLECTED SURVEYS PERFORMED IN THE RECENT YEARS BAYREN  
15 REALIZED ITS GOAL OF PRIMARILY REACHING THE UNDERSERVED  
16 AUDIENCE OF MODERATE INCOME RESIDENTS WAS FALLING SHORT.  
17 BAYREN INITIATED A REDESIGN PROCESS IN 2022 TO BETTER ACHIEVE  
18 THE GOALS OF THE HEALTH, COMFORT, SAFETY, AND SAVINGS THROUGH  
19 ENERGY UPGRADES FOR THESE RESIDENTS. BAYREN DECIDED TO  
20 SOLIDIFY THE DIRECTION BY RECLASSIFYING THE SINGLE-FAMILY  
21 PROGRAM AS CPUC EQUITY PROGRAM AND CPUC APPROVED BUSINESS PLAN  
22 FOR 2024 THROUGH 2031. A LITTLE DETAIL NEW PROGRAM DESIGN THE  
23 LAST TWO YEARS BAYREN CONDUCTED EXTENSIVE RESEARCH TO  
24 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT TO IDENTIFY GAPS IN THE ENERGY  
25 LANDSCAPE AND PROGRAM DESIGN. INCLUDED SIX WORKSHOPS WITH



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 LOCAL GOVERNMENT REPRESENTATIVES FROM NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES  
2 35 FOCUS GROUPS DISCUSSIONS LISTENING SESSIONS ENGAGING 70  
3 COMMUNITY-BASED NON-PROFITS ACROSS NINE COUNTIES FOR PROGRAM  
4 DESIGN FEEDBACK AND PHONE SURVEY REACHING 1,000 HOUSEHOLDS  
5 INCLUDING SAMPLE MODERATE INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND 12 IN DEPTH  
6 INSTALLING CONTRACTOR INTERVIEWS. FINDINGS VERIFIED THAT  
7 MODERATE INCOME RESIDENTS FAMILIES WHO EARN TOO MUCH TO  
8 QUALIFY FOR THE LOW-INCOME PROGRAMS BUT DON'T HAVE ENOUGH  
9 CAPITAL UPFRONT COST AND ENERGY UPGRADES ARE UNDERSERVED.  
10 WHILE THERE IS RISE IN ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAMS WE FOUND THERE  
11 IS STILL SHORTAGE OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS AVAILABLE TO  
12 THIS SEGMENT OF THE POPULATION. THE NEW PROGRAM KNOWN AS  
13 BAYREN'S ENERGY AND SUSTAINABLE ENERGY, EAS SETTLEMENT HOME  
14 PROGRAM WILL DELIVER LOW-COST HEALTHY HOME RETROFITS WITH  
15 FOCUS ON WEATHERIZATION AND ENERGY EFFICIENCY UPGRADES  
16 IMPROVED INSULATION AND AIR SEALING TO QUALIFYING MODERATE  
17 INCOME RESIDENTS TO IN THE BAY AREA AND INCOME QUALIFICATIONS  
18 WILL BE BASED ON COUNTY AREA MEDIAN INCOME FOCUS ON NON-  
19 ENGLISH SPEAKING HOUSEHOLDS AND THOSE THAT LIVE IN THE  
20 POLLUTION BURDEN AREAS AS WELL AS PROVIDE PARTICIPANTS WITH  
21 ONE-ON-ONE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FROM DEDICATED PROJECT  
22 COORDINATOR AND LEVERAGE REBATES FROM PROGRAMS MANAGED BY THE  
23 PROJECT COORDINATOR DIRECTLY INSTALLED BY TRUSTED EXPERTS EASE  
24 HOME AIMS TO REACH OVER 2700 MODERATE INCOME HOUSEHOLDS OVER  
25 THE NEXT THREE YEARS AND OVER \$18 MILLION OF 22,001,000



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CUSTOMERS IN THE FORM OF INCENTIVES. LASTLY EASE HOME WILL  
2 INCLUDE WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT CRITERIA IMPORTANT AND OFTEN  
3 OVERLOOKED ASPECT OF RESIDENTIAL DECARBONIZATION SECTOR  
4 WORKFORCE ELEMENTS INCLUDE PREVAILING WAGE STANDARDS  
5 REQUIREMENTS FOR INSTALLING FACTORS TO BE BASED IN THE BAY  
6 AREA TARGETED HIRING STRATEGIES TRAINING PROGRAMS AND MORE  
7 THEY RAN POSTED RFP AUGUST 24TH, 2024 AND ABAG RECEIVED THREE  
8 PROPOSALS BASED ON RFP PROCESS WE SELECTED FRANKLIN ENERGY I  
9 RESPECTFULLY ASK FOR YOUR APPROVAL ON THIS ITEM AND JILIAN DU  
10 BAYREN'S SINGLE-FAMILY PROJECT PROGRAM MANAGER IS ONLINE AND  
11 AVAILABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. THIS IS EXCITING AND  
14 GOING TO FULFILL A NEED VERY CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE HAVE BEEN  
15 WANTING TO DO FOCUSING ON MEANINGFUL INVESTMENTS. ANY  
16 QUESTIONS?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE WORK  
25 AND THE DATA AND EVERYTHING. AND AS THIS PROGRAM MOVES FORWARD



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 WITH THE INCENTIVES FOR THOSE INDIVIDUALS OF MODERATE INCOME  
2 LEVELS, ONCE IT'S PASSED, HOW WILL THIS INFORMATION GET OUT TO  
3 THE COMMUNITIES? WILL BAYREN BE WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH THE  
4 CITIES AND COUNTIES TO HELP OR PUT TOGETHER A PROGRAM TO HELP  
5 GET THIS INFORMATION OUT TO THE COMMUNITY SO THEY CAN TAKE  
6 ADVANTAGE OF IT?

7

8 **JANE ELIAS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION. BAYREN IS A COALITION  
9 OF THE NINE COUNTIES. SO, OUR NINE COUNTY MEMBERS WILL BE  
10 WORKING INDIVIDUALLY WITHIN THEIR JURISDICTIONS AND WITH THE  
11 CITIES WITH WHATEVER COALITIONS THEY HAVE BUILT. AND TO GET  
12 THE WORD OUT, THEY HAVE RECEIVED FUNDING FOR THE MARKETING AND  
13 OUTREACH PORTION AND THEY WILL BE WORKING CLOSELY WITH  
14 FRANKLIN, WHO IS THE IMPLEMENTER FOR THIS, TO IDENTIFY THE  
15 NEIGHBORHOODS AND TARGET SEGMENTS OF THE POPULATION THAT WE'RE  
16 SPECIFICALLY GOING AFTER. EACH COUNTY MAY LOOK AT THIS A  
17 LITTLE BIT DIFFERENTLY, AS WELL, AND CITIES. SO THEY WILL WORK  
18 TOGETHER TO FOCUS ON POLLUTION BURDEN OR IF IT'S NON-SPEAKING  
19 ENGLISH, OR WHATEVER TARGETS OF POPULATION THAT MIGHT BE  
20 IMPORTANT WITHIN THEIR JURISDICTIONS.

21

22 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THAT'S GOOD TO HEAR. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE  
23 SURE. AND WITH THAT, CHAIR RAMOS, I'LL SECOND BOARD MEMBER  
24 ECKLUND'S MOTION.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LEE, I DID SEE  
2 YOUR HAND UP FOR A BIT. OH, YOU'RE ON MUTE.

3

4 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WAS GOING TO SECOND IT,  
5 ACTUALLY. SINCE I [INDISCERNIBLE] -- I'M GLAD MEMBER WILLIAMS  
6 DID THAT. AND MY QUICK COMMENT, OR QUESTION, REALLY, IS IT  
7 SEEMS LIKE THIS IS BASICALLY A WAY FOR US TO HELP THESE TYPE  
8 OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAM BUT PREVIOUSLY OUR TARGET  
9 AUDIENCE WAS NOT ABLE TO BENEFIT, SO WE'RE REDESIGNING IT SO  
10 THAT THE INCOME LEVEL MIGHT BE HIGHER SO WE WILL HAVE MORE  
11 FAMILIES THAT WILL BE ABLE TO BE ELIGIBLE. THAT'S MY TAKEAWAY.  
12 IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **JANE ELIAS:** YES, THAT'S CORRECT WE HAD INTENDED THE SINGLE-  
15 FAMILY TARGET MODERATE INCOME DATA SHOWED, IT WAS ABOUT 40% OF  
16 THE PROJECT THAT WERE DONE COMPLETED IN MODERATE HOUSEHOLDS  
17 THAT WAS NOT ENOUGH OF OUR GOAL AND REALLY TRYING TO PUT THE  
18 EMPHASIS ON EQUITY AND RECLASSIFY THIS WE'RE GOING 100%  
19 EQUITY.

20

21 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LIKE TO COMPLIMENT JANE FOLLOWER THE  
24 GREAT EXPLANATION ON THE PROGRAM AND I WOULD LOVE A COPY OF  
25 WHAT YOU READ BECAUSE I'M GOING TO PUT IT IN MY WRITTEN ABAG



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 REPORT THAT I DISTRIBUTE TO ALL ELECTED OFFICIALS IN MARIN  
2 COUNTY. BECAUSE YOU ACTUALLY SAID SOME VERY IMPORTANT THINGS  
3 IN THERE THAT WERE NOT NECESSARILY IN THE STAFF REPORT AND I  
4 THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT FOR ME TO GET THAT INFORMATION OUT  
5 TO FOLKS IN MARIN COUNTY AND ACTUALLY MY REPORTS DO ALSO GO  
6 OUT TO SONOMA COUNTY FOR PEOPLE AND OTHER ELECTED OFFICIALS  
7 THAT HAVE REQUESTED COPIES. THANKS.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. IS NO OTHER  
10 MEMBER COMMENTS? I'LL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE ARE PUBLIC  
11 COMMENTS?

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON IN THE ZOOM  
14 SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE.

15

16 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** TWO MINUTES PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VINAY PIMPLE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
19 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY  
22 COUNCIL, I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT BACK IN THE DAY, OUR FINANCES  
23 WEREN'T THAT GREAT WE DID MAKE USE OF THE STRUCTURED PROGRAM  
24 IT WAS HELPFUL IT ALSO HAD ADDED COMPONENT OF LOCAL YOUTH WHO  
25 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH OUR PROGRAM, AND YOUNG PEOPLE FROM



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DISADVANTAGED BACKGROUNDS, GET INTO THE WORKFORCE. THAT WAS A  
2 COMPONENT OF IT THAT WAS SUPER GOOD. I ALSO WANT TO EMPHASIZE  
3 MY EXPERIENCE IN TERMS OF THE OUTREACH ISSUE. A LOT OF TIMES  
4 THESE PROGRAMS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] MORE POLITICALLY AWARE, THE  
5 KIND OF WHO GET E-MAILS FROM THEIR LOCAL COUNCIL MEMBERS OR  
6 FROM SUPERVISOR AND STUFF LIKE THAT. OUTREACH IS IMPORTANT NOT  
7 JUST FOR PEOPLE WHO TEND TO BE MORE POLITICALLY AWARE, BUT  
8 IT'S A GREAT PROGRAM. AND I JUST WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY.  
9 THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT FOR  
12 THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WELL, THAT WAS  
15 A GREAT PROPS TO STAFF AND TO THE PROGRAM ITSELF. SO WITH THAT  
16 IF THE ABAG CLERK WOULD PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL VOTE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU MOTION BY ECKLUND SECOND  
19 BY MEMBER WILLIAMS. RAMOS?

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN?

24

25 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ANDERSEN?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LEE?

7

8 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? MEMBER ROMERO? HAS STEPPED  
11 OUT. MEMBER SILVA?

12

13 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND MEMBER WILLIAMS?

16

17 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
20 MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WILL NOW  
23 PASS IT OVER TO MY COLLEAGUE TO INTRODUCE OUR PLANNED BAY AREA  
24 AMENDMENT ITEM.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT RAMOS.  
2 NEXT ITEM IS 9B, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AMENDMENT, THE SONOMA-  
3 MARIN AREA RAIL TRANSIT TO HEALDSBURG, AND DAVE VAUTIN ARE YOU  
4 GOING TO PRESENT?

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YES, I AM, CHAIR SPERING. GOOD MORNING  
7 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. DAVE VAUTIN ASSISTANT  
8 DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS PRESENTING THIS MORNING ON BEHALF OF  
9 MY COLLEAGUE ADAM NOELTING WHO LED THIS IMPORTANT EFFORT OVER  
10 THE LAST THREE MONTHS. ALSO JOINED BY AMY HAGUERA OF DOWNEY  
11 BRANDS OUR CEQA LEGAL CONSULTANT ON PROJECT. THIS MORNING  
12 WE'RE ASKING MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG  
13 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE  
14 AMENDMENT TO THE EXISTING REGIONAL PLAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
15 TO INTEGRATE SMART RAIL EXTENSION TO HEALDSBURG WHICH WOULD  
16 UNLOCK FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AT STATE LEVEL FOR THAT PROJECT  
17 IN THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD. PLAN AMENDMENT REQUIRES SUITE  
18 OF UPDATED DOCUMENTS TO BE APPROVED BY MTC ABAG AND TODAY'S  
19 ACTION INCLUDES DOCUMENTS AS WELL AS THREE RESOLUTIONS TO BE  
20 REFERRED TO THE OCTOBER COMMISSION AND TWO RESOLUTIONS TO BE  
21 REFERRED TO THE NOVEMBER ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING.  
22 BACKGROUND, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED IN OCTOBER 2021  
23 AND INCLUDED ROBUST INVESTMENTS IN THE NORTH BAY IN PARTICULAR  
24 IN THE SMART RAIL CORRIDOR THAT CURRENTLY CONNECTS NORTH SANTA  
25 ROSA AND LARKSPUR INCLUDED ONE STATION EXTENSION FURTHER NORTH



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TO HEALDSBURG SLATED TO OPEN NEXT YEAR OR SO AND STATION IN  
2 NORTH PETALUMA ALSO IN A SIMILAR TIME FRAME INVESTMENTS IN THE  
3 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN CORRIDOR PARALLELING THE RAIL LINE IN  
4 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS FOR SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS  
5 NECESSARY TO KEEP THE SYSTEM OPERATIONAL THROUGH 2050.  
6 HOWEVER, NORTH OF HEALDSBURG -- SORRY. NORTH OF WINDSOR, IT  
7 ONLY INCLUDED PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL STUDIES. AND EARLIER  
8 THIS YEAR REQUESTED MTC AND ABAG CONSIDER AMENDING THE PLAN TO  
9 INCLUDE AN ADDITIONAL ONE-STATION EXTENSION TO NORTH  
10 HEALDSBURG. STAFF PRESENTED UPDATE TO MTC PLANNING AND ABAG  
11 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEES IN JULY 2024 REGARDING REQUEST,  
12 UNDERSCORING THAT INTEGRATION OF EXTENSION INTO THE FISCALLY  
13 CONSTRAINED TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN WOULD NEED TO  
14 COMPLY TO STATUTORY OBLIGATIONS UNDER FEDERAL AND STATE LAW.  
15 TO ADDRESS LIMITATIONS, STAFF CONSULTED WITH THE SONOMA COUNTY  
16 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY STAFF TO IDENTIFY AN EQUIVALENT  
17 AMOUNT OF COUNTY ROADWAY PROJECTS IN THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED  
18 PLAN THAT COULD BE REMOVED TO OFFSET THE COST OF THE SMART  
19 EXTENSION. AS A RESULT, THIS ACTION ITEM WOULD NOT ONLY ADD  
20 THE ONE-STATION SMART EXTENSION BUT CONCURRENTLY REMOVE THE  
21 101 RAILROAD AVENUE INTERCHANGE AND THE FARMERS LANE EXTENSION  
22 IN SANTA ROSA FROM THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED PLAN. THESE  
23 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE LATEST DRAFT  
24 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND TRANSIT 2050  
25 PLUS, THE NEXT GENERATION PLAN AROUND ACTIVE DEVELOPMENT.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS, IN PARTICULAR, WILL BE RETURNING TO THIS  
2 COMMITTEE FOR ACTION IN JANUARY. SINCE THE PRIOR STAFF UPDATE  
3 ON THIS PLAN AMENDMENT WAS BROUGHT FORWARD IN JULY, STAFF HAVE  
4 ADVANCED THE NECESSARY TECHNICAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE STEPS ON A  
5 VERY RAPID TIMELINE, INCLUDING AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY AND  
6 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS SOLICITATION OF  
7 PUBLIC COMMENTS BY A 30-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. TECHNICAL  
8 ANALYSIS FOUND THAT THE AMENDMENT WOULD HAVE MINIMAL IMPACT ON  
9 REGIONAL TRAFFIC AND WOULD NOT AFFECT THE REGION'S ABILITY TO  
10 MEET GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS OR ACHIEVE A POSITIVE  
11 AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY DETERMINATION. THE PUBLIC COMMENT  
12 PERIOD GENERATED MORE THAN 50 RESPONSES, AND WHILE SOME  
13 COMMENTS INDICATED OPPOSITION TO THE AMENDMENTS, THE MAJORITY  
14 OF FEEDBACK SUPPORTED ADDING THE PROJECT TO PLANNED BAY AREA  
15 2050. MANY LETTERS ALSO ADVOCATED FOR FURTHER EXTENSION TO  
16 CLOVERDALE WHICH IS BEYOND THE SCOPE OF THIS AMENDMENT. MORE  
17 DETAILED RESPONSES TO COMMENT THEMES CAN BE FOUND IN THE PLAN  
18 AMENDMENT ITSELF UNDER COMMENTS AND RESPONSES. GIVEN THE  
19 STRONG SUPPORT FOR AMENDING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO INCLUDE  
20 AN ADDITIONAL STATION IN HEALDSBURG, AND THE ABILITY TO DO SO  
21 IN A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED MANNER THAT DOES NOT WORSEN  
22 ENVIRONMENTAL OR AIR QUALITY IMPACTS, STAFF RECOMMENDED  
23 ADVANCING ALL THREE APPROVAL ITEMS, FIRST STAFF RECOMMEND  
24 FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4465 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL,  
25 THAT'S THE AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ASSESSMENT. SECOND, STAFF



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 RECOMMEND FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4466 TO THE COMMISSION AND  
2 ABAG RESOLUTION 0924 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. WHICH IS THE  
3 EIR ADDENDUM. AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST STAFF RECOMMEND  
4 FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4467 TO THE COMMISSION AND ABAG  
5 RESOLUTION 1024 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, WHICH WOULD  
6 FORMALLY AMEND THE PLAN. THANKS FOR YOUR TIME THIS MORNING AND  
7 WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. COMMITTEE MEMBERS, ANY  
10 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? PAT? PAT FIRST.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M KIND OF CURIOUS WHETHER IS CLOVERDALE STILL  
13 IN THE PLAN TO HAVE A STATION? BECAUSE FROM IS A LOT OF  
14 SUPPORT FOR CONTINUING IT. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S  
15 STILL PART OF THE PLAN.

16

17 **DAVE VAUTIN:** CLOVERDALE HAS NOT BEEN PART OF PRIOR PLANNED BAY  
18 AREA OVER COURSE THERE IS PLANNING FOR ENVIRONMENTAL WORK IN  
19 THE NORTHERN PART OF THE CORRIDOR AND THAT'S AS A RESULT OF  
20 FOUR FISCAL CONSTRAINTS IN THE PLAN AS MENTIONED IN THE  
21 EARLIER ITEM THE LAST PLAN INCLUDED EXTENSION UP TO WINDSOR  
22 THIS WOULD MOVE ONE STATION FURTHER NORTH THE CONSIDERATION OF  
23 THE CLOVERDALE IS A CONTINUING CONVERSATION IN THE CONTEXT OF  
24 OUR NEXT UPDATE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** ARE THEY PAYING THE TAX?

2

3 **DAVE VAUTIN:** MINDING IT'S A BY COUNTY TAX.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVE DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBITT:** I JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR BRINGING THIS  
10 FORWARD VERY MUCH I THINK THE GOOD THING THAT WE HAVE TO  
11 UNDERSTAND THE FISCAL CONSTRAINTS BUT AT THE SAME TIME  
12 UNDERSTAND THE PROJECTS WITHIN EACH INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES OR  
13 JURISDICTION GETS ANALYZED WITHIN THOSE JURISDICTIONS IN THIS  
14 PARTICULAR CASE THE TWO PROJECTS THAT WE'RE INCLUDING OR  
15 SWAPPING OUT, I CAN HONESTLY SAY AS SITTING ON THE SONOMA  
16 COUNTY CONSERVATION -- OR SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION  
17 AUTHORITY THAT NEITHER ONE WILL PROBABLY EVER WOULD BE BUILT.  
18 LAST GENERAL PLAN, 20 SOMETHING YEARS AGO, WAS THE DIVERTING  
19 TRAFFIC WHICH ALSO THAT'S THE RAILROAD 101 INTERCHANGE. AND TO  
20 MAKE THAT PROJECT SUCCESSFUL WOULD INCLUDE A WIDENING TO THREE  
21 LANES, SOMETHING THAT I DO NOT THINK IS -- ANY OF US WOULD  
22 SUPPORT TODAY, PROBABLY A COUPLE OF MILES' SECTION OF COUNTY  
23 ROAD, WHICH WOULD ALSO PROBABLY HAVE EQUIVALENT DOLLAR AMOUNT  
24 TO THE WORK AT THE INTERCHANGE. AND IT'S JUST SOMETHING THAT'S  
25 NOT GOING TO GO FORWARD. FARMERS LANE EXTENSION HAS BEEN ON



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 THE BOOKS FOREVER. AND IT'S ANOTHER ONE OF THOSE THINGS. I  
2 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT WE CAN SWAP OUT THE PROJECTS AND I  
3 KNOW OUR GENERAL MANAGER FROM SMART IS HERE TO SAY A FEW WORDS  
4 AS WELL. SOME DECADES AGO, NOW, SONOMA AND MARIN COUNTIES GOT  
5 TOGETHER TO HELP US TO MOVE ON THE 101 CORRIDOR. IT WAS AGREED  
6 THAT A COMMUTER TRAIN WOULD BE MORE BENEFICIAL THAN  
7 CONTINUALLY WIDENING THE FREEWAY. SO, WE GOT THAT DONE. WE  
8 WERE CONTINUING TO MOVE. AND WHILE BUS TRANSIT SERVICE IS  
9 GREAT, RIDERSHIP NUMBERS WERE DECLINING PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC  
10 AND SMART'S RIDERSHIP NUMBERS CONTINUE TO GROW AND SET NEW  
11 RECORDS. AND FOR ME, PERSONALLY, I LOVE THESE PROJECTS THAT  
12 ARE GENERATIONAL IN NATURE. AND WHEN WE'RE LONG GONE IN OUR  
13 ROCKING CHAIRS BACK HOME WE CAN LOOK BACK AT THE DECISIONS WE  
14 MADE SITTING ON THE DAIS KNOWING THAT WE'RE IMPROVING THINGS  
15 FOR OUR KIDS, THEIR KIDS, AND FUTURE GENERATIONS AND A LOT OF  
16 THOSE THINGS TAKE TIME TO BUILD IN. BUT TO HAVE THIS  
17 PARTICULAR PROJECT SET IN MOTION REALLY MAKES ME FEEL GOOD,  
18 ESPECIALLY THESE DAYS WHEN THERE IS NOT A LOT OF GREAT STUFF  
19 HAPPENING WORLDWIDE. TODAY IS A DAY TO CELEBRATE, AND I  
20 APPRECIATE THE FACT STAFF BROUGHT THIS FORWARD. REALLY  
21 APPRECIATE IT AND DAVE THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK AS WELL.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVE, THANK YOU FOR THOSE  
24 COMMENTS AND CLARIFICATION. ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS? EDDIE



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DO YOU WANT TO COME FORTH, EDDIE CUMMINS WITH SMART? AND,  
2 EDDIE, DON'T TALK US OUT OF IT. OKAY? [LAUGHTER].

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** TWO MINUTES. HE CAN BE  
7 SUCCINCT.

8

9 **EDDIE CUMMINS:** I CAN. HELLO, MY NAME IS EDDIE CUMMINS. I'M THE  
10 SMART TRAIN GENERAL MANAGER. I'M JUST HERE TODAY TO SPEAK IN  
11 SUPPORT OF THIS AMENDMENT. FIRST, I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF. I  
12 KNOW A LOT OF WORK GOES INTO THESE TYPES OF THINGS, AND JUST  
13 REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK AND THE EFFORT. I ALSO WANT TO  
14 THANK THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION OF THIS  
15 VERY IMPORTANT PROJECT. YOUR EFFORTS ARE PAVING THE WAY FOR A  
16 CONNECTED, SUSTAINABLE, EQUITABLE BAY AREA, AND SMART IS PROUD  
17 TO CONTRIBUTE TO THIS MISSION. THE INCLUSION OF HEALDSBURG IN  
18 THE PLANNED BAY AREA MARKS A SIGNIFICANT MILESTONE FOR THE  
19 NORTH BAY AND THE BROADER REGION. IT OPENS THE DOOR FOR VITAL  
20 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES POSITIONING US TO SECURE REGIONAL,  
21 STATE, AND FEDERAL RESOURCES REQUIRED TO BRING PASSENGER RAIL  
22 TO HEALDSBURG. THINGS ARE GOING VERY WELL AT SMART RIGHT NOW.  
23 OUR RIDERSHIP IS 30% HIGHER THAN PRE-PANDEMIC, AND WE  
24 CURRENTLY HAVE THE WINDSOR EXTENSION, THE PETALUMA NORTH  
25 INFILL STATION AND OVER NINE MILES OF PATHWAY UNDER



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CONSTRUCTION, AND WE ANTICIPATE HAVING ALL THESE PROJECTS  
2 COMPLETED AND OPEN TO THE PUBLIC WITHIN THE NEXT SIX MONTHS.  
3 THE INCLUSION OF HEALDSBURG INTO THE PLAN WILL ALLOW SMART TO  
4 CONTINUE TO MAKE PROGRESS ON THE SYSTEM VOTERS IN MARIN AND  
5 SONOMA COUNTY APPROVED IN 2008. ONCE AGAIN, I WANT TO SAY  
6 THANK YOU. THIS PROJECT IS IMPORTANT TO THE COMMUNITIES WE  
7 SERVE, AND I TRULY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT WENT INTO THIS  
8 AMENDMENT. ON BEHALF OF THE VOTERS AND THE COMMUNITIES WE  
9 SERVE, I RESPECTFULLY REQUEST YOUR FAVORABLE CONSIDERATION OF  
10 THIS ITEM. AGAIN, THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU, EDDIE.  
13 MARTHA IS THERE ANY OTHER SPEAKERS?

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
17 PUBLIC IN ZOOM OR THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I'M ASSUMING THIS WILL  
20 BE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER RABBITT AND SECOND BY  
21 [INDISCERNIBLE].

22

23 **SPEAKER:** INDEED.

24

25 **DAVID RABBITT:** INDEED, YOU ARE RIGHT. MAKE THE MOTION.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MICROPHONE.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THIS WILL INCLUDE RESOLUTIONS  
5 4665. DO I NEED TO READ THEM, SINCE DAVID READ THEM?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PLEASE AND THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER]

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. [LAUGHTER] 4665  
10 TRANSPORTATION AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR THE AMENDED  
11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE 2025 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT  
12 PROGRAM. MTC RESOLUTION 4666 ADDENDUM TO THE FINAL  
13 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND MTC  
14 RESOLUTION 4667 AMENDMENT TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND I  
15 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. AND IF THE CLERK WILL TAKE THE  
16 ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR SPERING?

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

23

24 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER NOACK IS ABSENT.

14 COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ALL THE RESOLUTIONS AS PREVIOUSLY

19 STATED MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

22 PRESIDENT RAMOS.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME, WE'RE

25 GOING TO CONSIDER TWO RESOLUTIONS. ABAG RESOLUTION 09-24



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 ADDENDUM TO THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR PLANNED  
2 BAY AREA 2050 AND ABAG RESOLUTION 10-24 AMENDMENT TO PLANNED  
3 BAY AREA 2050. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND?

4

5 **OTTO LEE:** SO MOVED.

6

7 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** SECOND, WANDA WILLIAMS.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WE LOVE YOU, STEPHANIE. BUT NO.

10 [LAUGHTER] ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONER -- ARE THERE ANY MEMBER  
11 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING  
14 FOR THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE OR BOARDROOM  
15 WISHING TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WILL DO. PRESIDENT RAMOS.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ANDERSON?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ECKLUND?

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEE?

11

12 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ROMERO?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER SILVA?

23

24 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND MEMBER WILLIAMS?

2

3 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
6 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** EXCELLENT. NEXT ITEM. THANK YOU  
9 SO MUCH. AND THANK YOU SO MUCH, SUPERVISOR RABBITT FOR YOUR  
10 HELP AND MAKING THAT POSSIBLE IN THAT LAST ITEM WHICH SEEMS  
11 LIKE IT'S GOING TO BE A DEFINITE IMPROVEMENT OVERALL. NEXT  
12 ITEM, AGENDA ITEM 10A, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, THE FINAL  
13 BLUEPRINT INITIAL RECOMMENDATION. JOINING US TODAY TO GIVE US  
14 THE REPORT IS CHIRAG RABARI. HANDING IT OVER.

15

16 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT RAMOS. GOOD MORNING  
17 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. CHIRAG RABARI WITH MTC ABAG  
18 STAFF AND REPRESENTING THE BROADER PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+  
19 TEAM. SO, WE MOST RECENTLY CAME TO THIS BODY IN LATE SPRING  
20 AND EARLY SUMMER SHARING OUTCOMES FROM OUR DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
21 ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS APPROACH FOR SECOND ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT.  
22 LAST MONTH THE TRANSIT 2050+ TEAM CAME WITH THE DRAFT NETWORK  
23 STRATEGIES. SO, THIS ITEM IS FOCUSED ON FINANCIAL NEEDS AND  
24 REVENUE FORECAST FOR THE LONG RANGE PLAN, AS WELL AS INITIAL  
25 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES. THIS IS THE



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 PROVERBIAL FIRST BITE OF THE APPLE IN TERMS OF FINAL BLUEPRINT  
2 IN ADVANCE OF THE ANTICIPATED ACTION ITEM IN 2025. NEXT SLIDE.  
3 SO, AS OF EARLY FALL 2024, WE HAVE COMPLETED OUR SECOND AND  
4 MOST EXPANSIVE ROUND OF OUTREACH FOR THE PLAN AND ARE ENTERING  
5 THE HOMESTRETCH FOR THE PLANS BLUEPRINT PHASE. TWO SIGNIFICANT  
6 ACTION ITEMS ARE COMING UP FOR THE COMMISSION AND EXECUTIVE  
7 BOARD. FIRST WILL BE THE APPROVAL OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT  
8 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER STUDY IN EARLY 2025,  
9 AND THEN WE'LL BE ADVANCING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INTO CEQA IN  
10 EARLY SPRING OF '25. INITIAL WORK HAS BEGUN ON THE PLAN'S  
11 FINAL PHASE, WHICH WILL INCLUDE THE DRAFT PLAN ITSELF, THE  
12 EIR, AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. BUT THE BULK OF THAT WORK  
13 WILL CONTINUE OVER THE COURSE OF 2025 WITH ANTICIPATED  
14 ADOPTION OF THE PLAN IN LATE 2025. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED,  
15 WE JUST COMPLETED AN EXTENSIVE ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT THAT  
16 BROUGHT US ALL ACROSS THE NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA. THE PRIMARY  
17 GOALS OF THIS ENGAGEMENT ROUND WERE TO SHARE THE FINDINGS FROM  
18 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND GET FEEDBACK ON HOW TO ADDRESS  
19 IDENTIFIED CHALLENGE AREAS AS WELL AS SHARING THE DRAFT  
20 TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK AND STRATEGIES. WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF  
21 COMPLETING OUR ANALYSIS AND COMPILING OUR FINDINGS FROM THESE  
22 ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES WHICH WILL COME BACK TO THIS BODY NEXT  
23 MONTH. BUT JUST TO SHARE A COUPLE OF HIGHLIGHTS. THE  
24 ENGAGEMENT ROUND DID INCLUDE 50 PLUS EVENTS, INCLUDING 26 POP-  
25 UPS, 18 THAT WERE CONVENED BY MTC AND ABAG, AS WELL AS EIGHT



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 THAT WERE LED BY CBO PARTNERS. THERE ARE 21 DISCUSSION GROUPS,  
2 SIX PRESENTATIONS, A CBO WORKSHOP, A WEBINAR, AND AS WELL AS  
3 TWO ALL-DAY IN-PERSON WORKSHOPS AT 375 BEALE THAT BROUGHT  
4 TOGETHER OVER 115 OF OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING  
5 LOCAL JURISDICTION AND AGENCY STAFF, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION  
6 AGENCIES, ADVOCATES, AND NON-PROFITS, AMONG OTHERS. THERE IS  
7 ALSO AN ONLINE SURVEY AND EXTENSIVE DIGITAL PROMOTION. NEXT  
8 SLIDE. AS A BRIEF REFRESHER ON THE ARCHITECTURE OF THE PLAN,  
9 OUR LONG RANGE PLAN'S VISION AS ADOPTED BY MTC ABAG IS TO  
10 ENSURE THAT BY THE YEAR 2050 THE BAY AREA IS AFFORDABLE,  
11 CONNECTED, DIVERSE, HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL. THE PLAN IS  
12 DIVIDED INTO FOUR INTERRELATED ELEMENTS OF TRANSPORTATION,  
13 HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. THOSE FOUR ELEMENTS  
14 ARE IN TURN SPLIT INTO 11 KEY THEMES, AND THEN NESTING UNDER  
15 THOSE 11 KEY THEMES ARE THE PLAN'S 35 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE.  
16 SO, IN TERMS OF THE KEY ELEMENTS OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, THERE  
17 ARE REALLY TWO TRACKS OF WORK. ON THE FIRST SIDE ARE THE  
18 PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSUMPTIONS, THESE INCLUDE THINGS LIKE  
19 EXTERNAL FORCES, WHICH ARE ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT THE FUTURE YEAR  
20 CONTINUES THAT ARE INDEPENDENT OF THE PLAN, THINGS SUCH AS  
21 ANTICIPATED WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS OR THE AMOUNT OF SEA LEVEL  
22 RISE THAT WE EXPECT, AS WELL AS THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST  
23 OF HOW MUCH WE EXPECT THE BAY AREA TO GROW IN TERMS OF  
24 POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSEHOLDS BETWEEN NOW AND 2050. AND  
25 THAT WORK IS LARGELY COMPLETE AND WAS THE FOCUS OF EARLIER



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 PRESENTATIONS TO THIS BODY, BUT WE WILL PROVIDE A REFRESHER IN  
2 JANUARY DURING THE ACTION ITEM. THE PLANNING AND TECHNICAL  
3 ASSUMPTIONS ALSO INCLUDE THE FINANCIAL NEEDS AND REVENUE  
4 ANALYSIS. WE PRESENTED DRAFTS OF THOSE FORECASTS LAST YEAR,  
5 AND TODAY WE'LL BE FOCUSED ON THE REVISED FINAL FORECAST  
6 PENDING ANY FINAL TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS THAT WILL, AGAIN, COME  
7 BACK EARLY 2025. THE OTHER TRACK OF WORK ARE THE PLANS'  
8 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES. AND AS A REMINDER, STRATEGIES ARE  
9 PUBLIC POLICIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED AT A  
10 STATE, REGIONAL, OR LOCAL LEVEL OVER 25 YEARS PLAN PERIOD. AND  
11 THESE ARE HEART OF THE PLAN. A REMINDER, THE STRATEGY IS NOT  
12 NEAR-TERM ACTION, A MANDATE FOR A JURISDICTION OR AGENCY OR A  
13 LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL. BY CONTRAST, GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ARE A  
14 MIX OF LOCALLY NOMINATED AND REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED PLACES TO  
15 FOCUS FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH. NOW, THERE ARE  
16 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN. BUT SOME OF  
17 THE KEY NUANCES ARE THE HOUSING AND ECONOMY ELEMENTS INCLUDE  
18 THOSE GEOGRAPHIES FOR FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH, WHILE  
19 THE TRANSPORTATION AND ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS INCLUDE PROJECT  
20 LIST. SO, THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST NESTS UNDER ALL  
21 ELEMENTS' STRATEGIES. BUT THIS PLAN WILL INCLUDE FIRST EVER  
22 RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST THAT IS A PORTION OF THE ENVIRONMENT  
23 ELEMENTS ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY. SO, AGAIN, THE  
24 FOCUS OF THIS ITEM IS ON THE REVISED NEEDS AND REVENUE  
25 ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS PRELIMINARY REVISIONS TO STRATEGIES. BUT



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 EARLY 2025, THE COMMISSION AND EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL TAKE  
2 ACTION TO APPROVE THOSE STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER  
3 STUDY AND WILL INCLUDE DETAIL ON THE PLANS PROJECT LIST  
4 RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. AS PART OF THE BLUEPRINT PROCESS,  
5 WE DEVELOPED FORECASTS OF ANTICIPATED REVENUES AS WELL AS  
6 IDENTIFY NEEDS, WHICH ARE ESSENTIALLY WHAT SPECIFIC STRATEGIES  
7 MIGHT COST. ONLY THE PLANNED TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS SUBJECT  
8 TO FISCAL CONSTRAINT PER FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING  
9 REQUIREMENTS. THIS MEETING IS NOT ONLY DO WE HAVE TO INVENTORY  
10 EXISTING REVENUE SOURCES, WE ALSO HAVE TO BE SPECIFIC ABOUT  
11 OTHER POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES THAT ARE REASONABLY EXPECTED  
12 TO BE AVAILABLE OVER THE PLANNING HORIZON. THESE ARE NEW  
13 SOURCES. ALL PROPOSED INVESTMENTS NEED TO FIT INTO THAT FISCAL  
14 ENVELOPE. BY CONTRAST, THE HOUSING ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT  
15 ELEMENTS ARE VISIONARY FORECASTS OF WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO  
16 ACHIEVE THE KEY REGIONAL GOALS. IN THE HOUSING AND ENVIRONMENT  
17 ELEMENTS, WE DO INVENTORY EXISTING REVENUES AS A BEST  
18 PRACTICE, BUT WE ARE NOT REQUIRED TO BE SPECIFIC ABOUT WHAT  
19 THOSE NEW REVENUE SOURCES ARE TO ADDRESS FUNDING GAPS. THAT  
20 COULD REFLECT MIX OF SOURCES FROM VARIOUS LEVELS OF  
21 GOVERNMENTS. REVENUES IN ENVIRONMENT ECONOMY ELEMENT ARE NOT  
22 INVENTORIED. NOW, IN TERMS OF THE REVISED FORECAST, BOTH THE  
23 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING ELEMENTS INCLUDE ABOUT \$500 BILLION  
24 IN ANTICIPATED INVESTMENTS. SOME NOTABLE CHANGES INCLUDED IN  
25 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT, THERE WERE VARIOUS TECHNICAL



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CORRECTIONS AND POLICY CLARIFICATIONS ON NEW AND ANTICIPATED  
2 SOURCES, BUT THE DISCRETIONARY REVENUE PICTURE ONLY CHANGE  
3 MODESTLY BETWEEN THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT. OVERALL THERE  
4 IS \$75 BILLION LESS FOR EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT COMPARED TO  
5 THE PREVIOUS PLAN. IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT BIGGEST CHANGE WAS  
6 OF THE SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION OF NEARLY \$77 BILLION IN  
7 ANTICIPATED UNDER COST UNDER THE SPUR HOUSING PRODUCTION THEME  
8 AND WE'LL TALK MORE ABOUT HOW THAT REDUCTION WAS ACHIEVED  
9 LATER IN THE SLIDE. IN ECONOMY ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS WHICH ARE  
10 ROUGHLY \$230 BILLION IN SIZE. MOST NOTABLE CHANGES THAT WE'LL  
11 DISCUSS ARE GREATER PROPOSED INVESTMENTS IN THE PLAN'S JOB  
12 LOCATION STRATEGIES, AS WELL AS SHIFTING INVESTMENT LEVELS IN  
13 PARKS AND OPEN SPACE, AS WELL AS REFINED ESTIMATES FOR SEA  
14 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION. FINALLY, A QUICK REMINDER, JUST TO  
15 CONTEXTUALIZE THE BIG NUMBERS, THESE ARE ALL IN YEAR OF  
16 EXPENDITURE DOLLARS, SO THEY ARE ADJUSTED FOR ANTICIPATED  
17 INFLATION GOING FORWARD. SO A DOLLAR IN 2025 IS NOT THE SAME  
18 AS A DOLLAR IN 2050. SO, THERE IS A LOT MORE INFORMATION IN  
19 THE FORECAST IN THE ATTACHMENTS. NEXT SLIDE.

20

21 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? I HAD A QUICK QUESTION. IS  
22 IT FEASIBLE TO ASK QUESTIONS NOW? OR AFTER THE PRESENTATION.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** HOW WOULD YOU PREFER? FINISH?

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, IF YOU DON'T MIND?

2

3 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** FOUR MORE SLIDES, SUPERVISOR.

4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO, YEAH, SHIFTING GEARS INTO THE PROPOSED  
7 STRATEGY REFINEMENTS. AS MENTIONED TRANSIT 2050+ CAME TO THIS  
8 BODY LAST MONTH, AND THE BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES NOW REFLECT  
9 THOSE INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS. MANY CHANGES AND ADJUSTMENTS  
10 REFLECT RESHUFFLING AND RESCOPING PLAN STRATEGIES TO EMPHASIZE  
11 COST EFFECTIVE INVESTMENTS TO GROW AND RECOVER RIDERSHIP,  
12 INCLUDING SERVICE FREQUENCIES, SPEED, NETWORK INTEGRATION, AND  
13 STRATEGIC EXPANSION. NOTABLE CHANGE I DO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IS  
14 THAT A BRAND INCLUDE RESPONSIVE OVERWHELMING PUBLIC AND  
15 PARTNER FEEDBACK FOCUS SPECIFICALLY ON SAFETY AND SECURITY.  
16 THE PLAN PROPOSES \$4 BILLION FOR STATION STOPS, VEHICLES,  
17 LIGHTING, CAMERAS, SECURITY, POLICING, AS WELL AS NON-  
18 [INDISCERNIBLE] STAFF. SHIFTING TO PLANS FISCAL CLIMATE  
19 REALITIES, WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT THE FISCAL PICTURE AND PLANS  
20 GHG GAP WHICH HAS NECESSITATED FOCUS ON HIGH IMPACT LOWER COST  
21 STRATEGIES SUCH AS PRICING SAFETY ENHANCEMENTS REDUCED SPEED  
22 LIMITS ELECTRIFICATION AND TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT.  
23 OTHER NOTABLE CHANGE IS STRATEGY TO FURTHER HONE OUR APPROACH  
24 FOR FREEWAY AND HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS. AGAIN IN LIGHT OF THE  
25 FACT THAT THERE IS LESS MONEY AND CERTAIN PROJECTS CAN PUSH US



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 IN THE WRONG DIRECTION GHG. SO FOR THE FIRST TIME WE ARE  
2 PROPOSING TO DISTINGUISH BETWEEN MODERNIZATION OF FREEWAYS AND  
3 INTERCHANGES THROUGH NEW TECHNOLOGIES AND OTHER ENHANCEMENTS,  
4 AS WELL AS ON THE OTHER HAND INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND FREEWAYS  
5 AND INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, AS WELL AS ACCOUNTING FOR  
6 POTENTIAL MITIGATION COSTS. SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS ON  
7 PROJECTS BEING REFINED, MORE INFORMATION WILL BE SHARED IN THE  
8 COMING MONTHS INCLUDE REGION'S EXPRESS LANES. IN TERMS OF  
9 PRICING, WE HAVE STRATEGY IN TERMS OF HELPING TO MEET GHG  
10 WHICH IS INCLUDED IN THE LAST PLAN ABOUT WE CONTINUE TO  
11 EXPLORE WAYS IN THIS STRATEGY TO REFINE AND OPTIMIZE THE  
12 STRATEGY IN LIGHT OF THE MANY COMPLEX TRADEOFFS THAT ARE  
13 ASSOCIATED WITH PRICING BUT WE HOPE TO INCORPORATE  
14 RECOMMENDATIONS ON FROM THE PARALLEL NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY  
15 STUDY LATER THIS YEAR. IN TERMS OF HOUSING ECONOMY ONE OF THE  
16 BIG DISCUSSION ITEMS THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAD BACK IN JANUARY  
17 WAS NEED TO DRIVE FURTHER REDUCTIONS IN THE COST OF PRODUCING  
18 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IN RESPONSE WE UNDERTOOK A SIGNIFICANT  
19 EFFORT IN PARTNERSHIP WITH STAFF AT BAHFA TO REVIEW RECENT  
20 PROJECTS AND PRO FORMA CASE STUDIES AND VALUATION TO  
21 UNDERSTAND THE PROMISING APPROACH APPROACHES HOW THEY COULD BE  
22 APPLIED FUTURE SANCTIONS AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT FINAL  
23 BLUEPRINT CONSIDERS PRODUCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCLUDING  
24 EFFICIENT DESIGN AND DELIVER STREAMLINED REVIEW AND TARGETED  
25 FREE REDUCTIONS ACCESS TO LAND SITES AS WELL AS SIMPLIFIED



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 FINANCING WE DETERMINED POTENTIAL COST RANGES POTENTIAL  
2 REDUCTIONS AND DETERMINED HOW THESE DIFFERENT APPROACHES COULD  
3 BE STACKED TO ACHIEVE EVEN GREATER SAVINGS. ULTIMATELY  
4 CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS WE WERE ABLE TO SEE 25% REDUCTION IN  
5 AFFORDABLE HOUSING COST ESTIMATED \$77 BILLION REDUCTION. IN  
6 TERMS OF EXPANDING HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES, THIS ESSENTIALLY  
7 DESCRIBES HOW AFFORDABLE HOUSING COST REDUCTION IS INTEGRATED  
8 AND INFORMED SOME OF THE OTHER POLICY BASED STRATEGIES IN THE  
9 PLAN, INCLUDING MIX OF HOUSING AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES,  
10 COMMERCIAL REUSE AS WELL AS PUBLIC LANDS. AND ON THE -- IN  
11 TERMS OF BETTER ALIGNING JOBS AND TRANSIT ONE OF THE  
12 CHALLENGES WE IDENTIFIED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WAS A  
13 POSSIBILITY TO ACHIEVE A MORE EFFICIENT CONCENTRATED JOB  
14 GROWTH PATTERN. WE EXPLORED WHETHER IT WOULD BE FURTHER  
15 POSSIBLE TO FOCUS IN-PERSON JOBS NEAR FREQUENT TRANSIT IN  
16 ORDER TO EXPAND JOB ACCESS FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ARE FOR  
17 DOWNTOWN RECOVERY AND REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND ADJUSTMENTS  
18 TO THE PLAN'S STRATEGY EC FIVE DOES SEEK TO USE INCENTIVES AND  
19 INVESTMENT TO FOCUS CERTAIN INDUSTRIES IN PLACE WITH FREQUENT  
20 TRANSIT SERVICE AND LOW VMT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, ONE THING THAT WE  
21 HAVE HEARD CONSISTENTLY FROM OUR MEMBERS OF OUR POLICY  
22 ADVISORY COUNCIL OVER THE YEARS IS THE NEED TO BETTER RESPOND  
23 AND ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF RESIDENTS WITH DISABILITIES. SO, WE  
24 HAVE PROPOSED TO UPDATE SOME OF OUR STRATEGIES TO ALIGN WITH  
25 THE RECENT AGEING IN PLACE CODE UPGRADES, AND ALSO ASSUME A



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 NEW COMPONENT OF THE STRATEGY TO MAKE ACCESSIBILITY AND SAFETY  
2 IMPROVEMENTS TO APPROXIMATELY 200,000 EXISTING BAY AREA HOMES.  
3 OUR PARKS STRATEGY WAS ALSO UPDATED TO REFLECT A NEW AND  
4 UPDATED PARKS SHOULD BE BUILT WITH ADA STANDARDS AND DESIGNED  
5 FOR ALL AGES AND ABILITIES WITH CORRESPONDING COSTS  
6 INCORPORATED. IN TERMS OF URBAN INVESTMENT IN PARKS, WHAT WILL  
7 HAPPEN TO THE REGIONS' PARKS AND OPEN SPACE, GIVEN PROJECTED  
8 GROWTH. AND THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS REVEALED THE RATIO OF  
9 URBAN PARK ACRES PER THOUSAND RESIDENTS WILL DROP PER CAPITA  
10 BASIS. IMPACT FELT IN OUR REGIONS' EQUITY PRIORITY  
11 COMMUNITIES. SO, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE ARE PROPOSING TO  
12 EXPAND OUR URBAN GREENING STRATEGY TO ADDRESS DECLINE WITH  
13 FOCUS ON EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ADDITIONAL FUNDS ARE  
14 BEING DIRECTED TO GROW PUBLIC AND PARK SPACES AS PART OF THE  
15 LARGE-SCALE REDEVELOPMENT PROJECTS ENSURING THAT AREAS WITH  
16 NEW DEVELOPMENT ALSO SEE ADDITIONAL PARKS. FINALLY, IN TERMS  
17 OF SEA LEVEL RISE IN SPRING 2024, MTC, ABAG AS WELL AS BCDC,  
18 REENGAGE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS FROM ACROSS THE REGION TO UPDATE  
19 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION PROJECT ADAPTATION DETAILS AND 85%  
20 OF PROJECTS WERE REVIEWED AND RESULTED IN UPDATED DETAILS. SO,  
21 THERE ARE NOW HIGHER -- SLIGHTLY HIGHER RESILIENCE PROJECT  
22 COST ESTIMATES. AND YOU KNOW, THIS WILL INCLUDE POTENTIALLY  
23 OVER 400 PROJECTS, TOTALING \$95 BILLION, BUT WE HAVE TRIED TO  
24 ORGANIZE THAT ESTIMATE SO THAT WE'RE DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN  
25 NEAR-TERM RISK AND LONGER TERM RISK AS WELL AS LOCALLY



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 IDENTIFIED PROJECTS VERSUS PLACE HOLDER PROJECTS. NEXT AND  
2 FINAL SLIDE, SO, WE WILL COME BACK NEXT MONTH TO SHARE OUR  
3 ROUND TWO ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS, WE'LL ALSO BE PROVIDING THIS  
4 BODY WITH UPDATE ON OUR 2024 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.  
5 AGAIN, WORKING WITH PARTNERS RESPONDING TO FEEDBACK THAT WE  
6 RECEIVED FROM THE PUBLIC, AS WELL AS FROM THIS BODY, TO  
7 FINALIZE PROJECT LISTS AND MAKE FINAL REVISIONS TO THE FINAL  
8 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES, AND AGAIN WE'LL BE BACK IN EARLY '25 TO  
9 SEEK APPROVAL FOR STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES INCLUDING PROJECT  
10 LISTS. WITH THAT HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY  
11 HAVE.

12

13 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. LET'S START  
14 WITH MEMBER WILLIAMS.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** WELL, I WANT TO FIRST START WITH A THANK YOU  
17 FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY INFORMATIVE. AND, YOU  
18 KNOW, THIS IS MY SECOND MEETING, SO, I AM GOING TO HAVE A LOT  
19 OF QUESTIONS. I JUST WANT STAFF TO KNOW, [LAUGHTER] --  
20 QUESTIONS ARE COMING. BUT, I WANT TO GO BACK TO THE SLIDE THAT  
21 HAD THE PIE CHARTS. AND I WANT TO ADDRESS, ON THE VERY FIRST  
22 SLIDE THAT DIVIDES UP SOME EXPENDITURE DOLLARS. ARE YOU ABLE  
23 TO PULL IT BACK UP? SO YOU KNOW WHAT I'M REFERENCING? THANK  
24 YOU. I DIDN'T KNOW WHAT NUMBER. THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO,  
25 STARTING WITH THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGY, AND I JUST WANTED



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TO UNDERSTAND, IN REFERENCE TO THE HEALTHY AND SAFE STREETS,  
2 IN THIS PIE CHART, WHY -- AND GRANTED I UNDERSTAND THE COST  
3 THAT GOES INTO MAINTENANCE AND OPTIMIZING EXISTING SYSTEMS,  
4 BUT WHY IS SUCH A LOW PIECE OF THIS PIE CHART IS SET ASIDE FOR  
5 HEALTHY AND SAFE STREETS? AND I ASK THIS BECAUSE THE GOAL,  
6 RIGHT, IS TO KEEP WALKABILITY, IF PEOPLE ARE OUT WALKING,  
7 BEING ABLE TO GET TO RESOURCES, TO WORK, THOSE THINGS. BUT, IF  
8 YOU SIDEWALK, AND YOUR STREETS, IT'S HARD TO MANAGE. AND WHY  
9 WOULD YOU WANT TO USE IT, AND YOU TAKE TRANSPORTATION WHEN YOU  
10 CAN JUST GET IN YOUR CAR?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER WILLIAMS FOR THAT QUESTION.  
13 ONE IMPORTANT THING TO REMEMBER WITH TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS  
14 THAT MTC DOES HAVE A FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY. SO, ALMOST 75% OF  
15 THAT PIE CHART GOES, SIMPLY, TO MAINTAINING AND OPERATING OUR  
16 EXISTING TRANSPORTATION AND ROADWAY SYSTEM. SO, JUST  
17 MAINTAINING THAT SYSTEM TAKES UP A VERY, VERY SIGNIFICANT  
18 AMOUNT OF REVENUE. SO, THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT IS THEN  
19 AVAILABLE FOR IMPROVEMENTS AND ENHANCEMENTS IS RELATIVELY MORE  
20 LIMITED. AND THERE -- YOU KNOW, THERE ARE A LOT OF NEEDS IN  
21 THAT SPACE, AND PARTICULARLY WITH THE MORE CHALLENGING FISCAL  
22 CONSTRAINTS THAT WE HAVE IN THIS PLAN WITH LESS MONEY, THERE  
23 ISN'T AS MUCH TO GO AROUND. BUT WITH THAT SAID, YOU KNOW, THE  
24 \$10 BILLION THAT DOES GO TOWARDS CREATING HEALTHY AND SAFE  
25 STREETS, THAT AMOUNT OF MONEY IS SUFFICIENT TO BUILD-OUT A



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 10,000 MILE, YOU KNOW, NETWORK FOR A REGIONAL ACTIVE  
2 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. IT DOES INCLUDE VISION ZERO  
3 INVESTMENTS TO, YOU KNOW, IMPROVE STREET DESIGN AND MAKE  
4 COMMUNITIES SAFER. AND, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A LARGE CATEGORY OF  
5 EXPENDITURES THAT, AGAIN, DO GO TOWARDS, YOU KNOW, MAINTAINING  
6 OUR EXISTING STREETS THAT RECEIVE QUITE A BIT OF MONEY. SO,  
7 YOU KNOW, EVEN THOUGH THAT -- THAT AMOUNT MAY SEEM SMALL IN  
8 THE GRAND SCHEME OF THE OVERALL FISCAL ENVELOPE, IT IS A  
9 SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF THE DISCRETIONARY FUNDING THAT'S  
10 AVAILABLE TO ENHANCE OF TRANSPORTATION NETWORK.

11

12 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST, IS -- WELL, LET ME  
13 ASK THIS, IS THIS FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY ONLINE FOR ME TO READ?  
14 OR DO I NEED TO REQUEST TO SEE WHAT THAT REALLY MEANS? IS  
15 SOUNDS GOOD, BUT BECAUSE I'M NOT ON THE MTC, I DON'T KNOW WHAT  
16 THE FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY IS. AND I'M SPEAKING, NOT JUST FROM  
17 LOOKING AT YOUR DATA, BUT FROM LIVED EXPERIENCE, COMING FROM  
18 RICHMOND CALIFORNIA, NOW IN SOLANO COUNTY, I UNDERSTAND WHEN  
19 YOU TALK ABOUT THESE PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, HAVING FIRSTHAND  
20 LIVED IN THEM, SO FOR ME, I UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF  
21 HAVING GOOD WALKABLE STREETS, OR -- AND ROADWAYS, FOR CHILDREN  
22 AND PEOPLE LIVING IN THESE AREAS, SO, I WOULD JUST LIKE TO  
23 PRESS UPON STAFF AND MTC, AS YOU CONTINUE TO THINK THROUGH  
24 THESE THINGS, THAT, THAT PARTICULAR ELEMENT IS ALSO TAKEN INTO  
25 CONSIDERATION. AND EVEN IF THAT MEANS HAVING LITTLE WORKSHOPS



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 OR SOME MORE SURVEYING ABOUT HEALTH, THE QUALITY OF STREETS,  
2 AND HOW SAFE AND HEALTHY THEY ARE, FOR THE COMMUNITIES THAT  
3 YOU'RE SERVING. SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S BROUGHT  
4 FORWARD. NOT TO SAY THAT IT'S NOT TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION,  
5 BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US LEAN A LITTLE BIT HEAVIER, ALSO,  
6 TOWARD MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE -- CREATE HEALTHY AND SAFE  
7 STREETS. THAT WAS MY FIRST QUESTION.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** JUST A MOMENT, MEMBER WILLIAMS,  
10 I'M GOING TO LET DIRECTOR MALONEY CHIME IN HERE.

11

12 **MATT MALONEY:** THANK YOU MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND  
13 POLICY. BOARD MEMBER WILLIAMS IT'S A GREAT QUESTION. I  
14 DEPARTMENT TO POINT YOU TO ITEM 10A WE HAVE A BUNCH OF  
15 ATTACHMENTS IN THIS ITEM, SO I WOULD POINT TO YOU ATTACHMENT B  
16 WHICH IS OUR DRAFT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS AND REVENUE  
17 ASSESSMENT. SO, WHAT WE DO EVERY PLAN CYCLE, EVERY FOUR YEARS,  
18 IS WE GO THROUGH A FAIRLY ROBUST EXERCISE OF QUANTIFYING WHAT  
19 THE MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS NEED IS FOR THE ROADWAY SYSTEM  
20 AND FOR THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO, THERE IS A LOT OF DETAIL ABOUT  
21 THAT IN THE ITEM. I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF JUST  
22 FEDERAL AND STATE AND STATUTORY TILES, THAT WE HAVE A  
23 RESPONSIBILITY IN THESE PLANS TO ENSURE WE ARE MAINTAINING THE  
24 SYSTEM NOT ALWAYS IN AN IDEAL STAYED OF GOOD REPAIR BUT AT  
25 LEAST MAINTAINING AND OPERATING IT AND KEEPING IN SIMILAR



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1    CONDITION THAT IT IS TODAY AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN WITH THE  
2    FINANCIAL RESOURCES WE CAN MOVE THAT UP A NOTCH. I WOULD ALSO  
3    SAY TO ECHO CHIRAG'S COMMENT THAT THE 10 BILLION ON THE PIE  
4    CHART IN TERMS OF ANALYSIS DOES CREATE 10,000 ADDITIONAL MILES  
5    OF COMMITTEE STREETS AROUND THE REGION SO IT'S VERY  
6    SIGNIFICANT AND IN THE ATTACHMENT E WHICH IS ALL OF THE 35  
7    STRATEGIES IT MIGHT BE A BETTER WAY TO ALSO LOOK AT THE  
8    RELATIVE SIZE OF THAT INVESTMENT VIS-À-VIS OTHERS INVESTMENTS  
9    IN THE PLAN I THINK A LOT IS BURIED IN THIS PIE CHART BUT FOR  
10   EXAMPLE, JUST LOOKING AT INVESTMENTS EXPANDING FREEWAYS IN THE  
11   PLAN WE HAVE GOT 3 BILLION IN TERMS OF THAT SO WE HAVE TRIPLE  
12   THE INVESTMENT IN COMPLETE STREETS RELATIVE TO EXPANDING  
13   FREEWAYS I THINK THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT IT'S NOT  
14   CAPTURED IN THIS GRAPHIC.

15

16   **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT RESPONSE I'LL REACH OUT AND  
17   E-MAIL YOU JUST SO I CAN UNDERSTAND MORE WHAT WAS ALREADY IN  
18   THE PACKET. OKAY? THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR ANSWERING MY QUESTION  
19   AND HELPING ME UNDERSTAND CONTEXT OF WHAT'S HERE. THANK YOU.

20

21   **MATT MALONEY:** THANK YOU.

22

23   **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. AND I WILL NOTE TO  
24   STAFF, I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE OVERSIGHT WAS HERE, BUT THE MTC  
25   AGENDA HAS THE ATTACHMENTS. THE ABAG AGENDA DOES NOT. SO, THAT



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DEFINITELY NEEDS, I THINK, SOME ATTENTION, TO MAKE SURE THAT  
2 ON BOTH SIDES, BECAUSE WHEN WE ARE ON THE ABAG SIDE, WE ARE  
3 GETTING THE ABAG AGENDA, THAT DOES NOT HAVE ANY ATTACHMENTS.  
4 AND, ALSO, DOES NOT HAVE THE PRESENTATION ATTACHED TO EITHER.  
5 AND WHEN YOU GO TO THE ABAG WEB SITE AND LOOK AT THE AGENDA,  
6 IT'S NOT -- THE LINKS ARE NOT ON THERE EITHER. SO WE NEED TO  
7 MAKE SURE WE HAVE CONSISTENCY ON THE AGENDAS. THANK YOU SO  
8 MUCH. NEXT I'LL RECOGNIZE MEMBER ECKLUND.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM PRESIDENT. FOLLOWING  
11 UP ON -- YEAH, I -- WE'RE NOT COMMISSIONERS, BUT ANYWAY --  
12 BOARD MEMBER WILLIAMS. YOU SAID THAT THIS 10 BILLION INCLUDES  
13 10,000 MILES OF STREETS AND ROADS. IS THAT WHAT YOU SAID?

14

15 **MATT MALONEY:** FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FOR COMPLETE STREETS.  
16 SO, DESIGNING, YOU KNOW, STREETS FOR ALL AGES AND ABILITIES.  
17 INCLUDES EMPHASIS ON BICYCLING AND PEDESTRIAN.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** RIGHT. AND, SO, WHAT ABOUT MAINTAINING LOCAL  
20 STREETS?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** THAT WOULD BE IN THE LARGER SECTION OF THAT PIE  
23 CHART. SO I MENTION THAT WE DO A NEEDS ASSESSMENT WHICH  
24 INCLUDES ALL OF THE HIGHWAYS, BUT WE LOOK AT ALL LOCAL ROADS  
25 IN THE BAY AREA. THAT IS PART OF THE MAINTENANCE AND



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 OPERATIONS NEEDS ASSESSMENT SO THAT IS CAPTURED IN THAT VERY  
2 LARGE PORTION OF THAT PIE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I GUESS BASED ON MY SERVICE TO DATE WHICH IS OVER  
5 TWO DECADES, THE CITIES, AT LEAST IN NOVATO AND OTHERS, THAT I  
6 KNOW ABOUT, SAN RAFAEL AND OTHERS, WE REALLY STRUGGLE TRYING  
7 TO KEEP OUR STREETS, OUR LOCAL STREETS MAINTAINED. AND SO, WE  
8 DON'T HAVE THE FUNDS. YOU KNOW, NOVATO IS A POOR PROPERTY TAX  
9 CITY. WE DON'T GET THE FULL AMOUNT OF PROPERTY TAX THAT OTHER  
10 CITIES GET IN MARIN COUNTY, OR THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE WE HAVE  
11 THIS SEPARATE FIRE DISTRICT IS SEPARATE, SANITARY DISTRICT IS  
12 SEPARATE, WATER DISTRICT. SO, THAT PIE CHART GETS PRETTY  
13 NARROW OVER TIME. SO, I JUST -- I WOULD WANT TO REITERATE, I  
14 SUPPORT THE NEED, NOT ONLY FOR BIKES AND PEDESTRIANS, BUT ALSO  
15 FOR LOCAL ROADS. AND I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN SEEING,  
16 PROBABLY A LITTLE BIT MORE BREAK OUT. BUT I WANTED TO FOCUS A  
17 LITTLE BIT ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE. I'M VERY EXCITED THAT YOU  
18 HAVE TRIED TO CAPTURE WHAT THE ESTIMATE FOR NOT ONLY MAYBE  
19 REPLACING JOBS AND REPLACING HOUSING, BUT THERE IS NO MAPS  
20 INCLUDED IN THIS REPORT ABOUT WHAT -- WHAT YOU'RE ANTICIPATING  
21 IN TERMS OF SEA LEVEL RISE. AND I'M VERY INTERESTED IN HAVING  
22 SOME VISUAL OBSERVATIONS OF WHERE DO WE THINK THE SEA LEVEL  
23 RISE IS GOING TO BE, WHICH COUNTIES ARE MORE AFFECTED THAN  
24 OTHERS, AND WHAT ARE THE PROJECTED NEEDS IN EACH OF THE  
25 COUNTIES, BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO BE DIFFERENT, OBVIOUSLY,



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 BECAUSE OF THE GEOGRAPHY. SO -- SO, DO WE HAVE ACCESS TO A  
2 MAP? IS IT ONLINE? AND IF YOU DO HAVE IT ONLINE, IS IT  
3 POSSIBLE FOR YOU TO SEND THAT LINK OUT TO ALL OF US?

4

5 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND, WE WILL SHARE THAT  
6 WITH THIS BODY AT A FORTHCOMING UPDATE. YOU KNOW, THE DETAILED  
7 LIST OF PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS, AS WELL AS A MAP THAT, YOU  
8 KNOW, DISPLAYS WHERE THERE ARE LOCALLY IDENTIFIED PROJECTS,  
9 WHERE THERE ARE PLACE HOLDER PROJECTS, WHAT THE ANTICIPATED  
10 LEVELS OF INUNDATION ARE. WE'LL SHARE THAT IN A FORTHCOMING  
11 UPDATE.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH BUT THIS FORTHCOMING UPDATE, IS IT THIS YEAR  
14 OR NEXT YEAR? [LAUGHTER] YOU'RE STILL WORKING ON IT. YOU KNOW,  
15 YOU COULD SAY VERSION ONE, OR WHATEVER, MORE UPDATES COMING AS  
16 YOU DEVELOP IT. BUT I'M REALLY ANXIOUS TO SEE THAT, ESPECIALLY  
17 BEING ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE COMMITTEE FOR MARIN COUNTY. I  
18 WOULD LIKE TO SEE, AT LEAST SOME ESTIMATES OF WHICH CITIES ARE  
19 GOING TO BE AFFECTED THE MOST. AND, SORT OF, START HAVING THAT  
20 DISCUSSION. BECAUSE A LOT OF CITIES ARE, YOU KNOW, UPDATING  
21 THEIR OWN GENERAL PLANS. SO, WE DON'T HAVE, NECESSARILY,  
22 ACCESS TO THAT, AT LEAST THAT I'M AWARE OF. SO, DO YOU KNOW  
23 WHEN WE MIGHT BE GETTING SOME VERSION OF IT EVEN IF IT IS  
24 DRAFT?

25



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** FIRST OF ALL, WE'RE HAPPY TO POINT YOU TO THE  
2 BASELINE DATA ON, YOU KNOW, SEA LEVEL RISE. WE WORKED VERY  
3 CLOSELY WITH BCDC STAFF AND WE HAVE ADVISED ON ASSUMPTIONS. WE  
4 CAN POINT TO YOU ONLINE TOOLS FOR THIS JUST WHERE THE SEA  
5 LEVEL RISE IS WHAT CHIRAG IS REFERRING TO IS HOW DOES THE PLAN  
6 ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE WHERE IT BREAKS DOWN THE MONEYS BY  
7 COUNTY AND SUCH AND THAT PART WILL BE IN JANUARY WE'RE WORKING  
8 HARD TO GET THAT TOGETHER BUT AS YOU MENTIONED INCLUDING NOT  
9 ONLY THE MAPS BUT WHERE THE INUNDATION IS BUT WHERE PROJECTS  
10 ARE WHERE THEY'RE LOCATED. ALL THAT SORT OF BREAKDOWN. IT IS  
11 COMING SOON. SO, IT IS COMING SOON?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** IT IS COMING SOON. OKAY. GREAT. THE OTHER  
14 QUESTION IS THAT THE ESTIMATES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES ON  
15 SLIDE NUMBER SIX, THAT'S ALMOST LIKE -- I MEAN, 30 BILLION  
16 EXISTING REVENUES, BUT NEW REVENUES 185 BILLION? TO ME THAT'S  
17 A HUGE JUMP IN TERMS OF WHAT THE NEEDS ARE. WHAT ARE SOME OF  
18 THE THOUGHTS OF HOW WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO START FILLING THAT  
19 HUGE GAP?

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND. SO, I WILL SAY IN  
22 TERMS OF THAT GAP, THE BIG DRIVER OF THAT IS THE NEED TO ADAPT  
23 TO SEA LEVEL RISE. THAT'S --

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** RIGHT. EXACTLY.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** HIGHEST COST. AGAIN, AS I MENTIONED WE DON'T  
3 MAKE ANY ASSUMPTIONS IN THE PLAN ABOUT WHAT THOSE SOURCES  
4 MIGHT BE I THINK IT'S REALLY INTENDED TO HELP THE REGIONAL  
5 CONVERSATION AS TO THE SCALE OF THE NEEDS OVER THE LONG 25-  
6 YEAR PERIOD, AND SHARED POLICY CONVERSATION IN PARTNERSHIP  
7 WITH ORGANIZATIONS AS TO WHAT THE BEST POSSIBLE APPROACH MIGHT  
8 BE TO ADDRESS THOSE NEEDS.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** THIS IS SUCH A HUGE GAP. I THINK WE MIGHT WANT TO  
11 START HAVING DISCUSSION EARLIER RATHER THAN LATER. BUT I  
12 REALLY APPRECIATE THE INCREDIBLE PRESENTATION THAT YOU DID.  
13 THE OTHER QUESTION IS ON PAGE -- SLIDE NUMBER EIGHT. AND, SO,  
14 YOU INDICATED THAT THERE WAS TARGETED DEVELOPMENT, FEE  
15 REDUCTIONS, RESULT IN COST SAVINGS AND EXPANDED OPPORTUNITIES  
16 FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION. THE FEE REDUCTIONS, ARE YOU TALKING  
17 ABOUT WHAT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS CHARGE? WHAT -- WHAT KIND OF FEE  
18 REDUCTIONS ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT?

19

20 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, I MEAN, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE INVENTORIED  
21 MANY DIFFERENT PROJECT TYPES ACROSS MANY DIFFERENT LOCATIONS.  
22 SO, IT'S REALLY LOOKING AT, YOU KNOW, KIND OF -- I WOULDN'T  
23 NECESSARILY SAY AN AVERAGE, BUT, YOU KNOW, TYPICAL FEE LEVELS  
24 THAT ARE APPLIED TO PROJECTS AND BEING THOSE FEES BE REDUCED



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 AND WHAT COULD THE POTENTIAL IMPACT BE IN TERMS OF REDUCING  
2 THOSE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY AND THAT'S PRIMARILY BECAUSE OF STATE  
5 LEGISLATION WHICH REALLY CONSTRICTS LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN  
6 DECISIONS ON HOW HIGH AND THE HOUSING AND STUFF. OKAY. AND  
7 THEN YOU SAID THAT, ON SLIDE EIGHT, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT SEEKS  
8 A GREATER CONCENTRATION OF FUTURE IN-PERSON JOBS NEAR FREQUENT  
9 TRANSIT. WHAT I'M SEEING, AT LEAST IN MARIN, IS THAT THERE --  
10 A LOT OF BUSINESSES ARE CLOSING. AND THOSE BIG OFFICES ARE  
11 REALLY TURNING TO HOUSING. SO, I SEE MORE HOUSING BEING  
12 FOCUSED AROUND TRANSIT, NECESSARILY MORE SO THAN JOBS. SO, YOU  
13 HAVE ACCOUNTED FOR ALL THE ONLINE JOBS, NOW, THAT PEOPLE ARE  
14 DOING? AND, SO, JUST KIND OF CURIOUS ON YOUR COMMENT ON THAT?

15

16 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YES, WE HAVE ALIGNED WITH THE DATA FROM THE  
17 CENSUS IN TERMS OF ARE CURRENT, THE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS WE  
18 HAVE MADE PROJECTIONS OUT TO THE FUTURE BASED UPON THE BEST  
19 AVAILABLE INFORMATION WHAT THOSE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS WILL BE  
20 AND WE THINK THEY'RE LIKELY TO BE RELATIVELY CONSISTENT WITH  
21 WHERE THOSE LEVELS ARE NOW, BUT WE DO BELIEVE THAT THERE IS AN  
22 OPPORTUNITY FOR CERTAIN INDUSTRIES THAT STILL DO RELY ON IN-  
23 PERSON WORK TO USE POTENTIAL INCENTIVES TO TRY TO TARGET THOSE  
24 INDUSTRY TYPES OR SECTORS NEAR FREQUENT TRANSIT TO, AGAIN,



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 HELP US ACHIEVE SOME OF THE DIFFERENT POLICY GOALS THAT WE DO  
2 HAVE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WANT TO THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR A GREAT  
5 PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY, PROBABLY MORE TRANSPARENT AND  
6 INFORMATIVE THAN WHAT I HAVE SEEN IN THE PAST. SO, I JUST WANT  
7 TO COMPLIMENT YOU VERY MUCH. GREAT JOB.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND. I WAS  
10 GOING TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA BUT I BELIEVE YOUR QUESTION WAS  
11 ASKED AND ANSWERED. I'LL TURN TO MEMBER ROMERO.

12

13 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE ATTACHMENT E  
14 WHICH LAYS OUT IN TABULAR FORM WHAT YOU CHANGED AND WHAT WAS  
15 BEFORE AND AFTER. SO I -- AGAIN, IT WAS EASY, THANK GOODNESS  
16 FOR WI-FI ON THE TRAIN BECAUSE I WAS ABLE TO READ THIS ON THE  
17 WAY UP FROM THE CITY [LAUGHTER] AND I DO CONCUR WITH  
18 CHAIRWOMAN RAMOS. I -- I NOTICED THAT MY PACKET DID NOT HAVE  
19 ANYTHING. AND YOU GUYS HAVE LEGISTAR, WHICH IS GREAT IT  
20 ALLOWED ME TO GO AND LOOK AT THE BIG THING. I THINK IT'S AN  
21 OVERSIGHT BECAUSE IN THE PAST I HAVE SEEN BOTH. BUT ANYWAY, I  
22 GUESS A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. ONE COMMENT ON THE ISSUE OF  
23 TRYING TO CREATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, OR HOUSING IN GENERAL,  
24 AND REDUCE THE COST. THERE WAS A RECENT STUDY, I MEAN, VERY  
25 RECENT, I WOULD SAY, PROBABLY RELEASED YESTERDAY, BY THE JOINT



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CENTER FOR HOUSING STUDIES, AND I BELIEVE THE CITY OF BOSTON -  
2 - LOOKING AT THE CITY OF BOSTON AND OTHER, KIND OF,  
3 INTERNATIONAL ARCHITECTURAL GUIDELINES AROUND SINGLE STAIR  
4 WELL CONSTRUCTION AS OPPOSED TO DOUBLE STAIR WELL. AND IT  
5 MAKES A BIG DIFFERENCE IN TERMS OF LOT CONFIGURATION AND WHAT  
6 YOU CAN ACTUALLY DO ON A SITE. NOW, THERE ARE PLENTY OF  
7 ARCHITECTS I TALKED TO RECENTLY IN THE LAST COUPLE OF DAYS WHO  
8 SAID I DON'T KNOW IF CALIFORNIA WANTS TO DO THIS. CANADA DOES  
9 IT, JAPAN DOES IT STOCKHOLM, LOOKING AT THOSE OPPORTUNITIES  
10 AND POTENTIALLY DRIVING THAT LEGISLATION, RIGHT, SO WE CAN  
11 INDEED, ONE, HAVE KIND OF MORE URBANLY PLEASING DESIGNS, BUT  
12 AT THE SAME TIME GET AWAY FROM THE DOUBLE LOADED CORRIDOR THAT  
13 REALLY ALLOWS BETTER UTILIZATION OF THE SMALLER SITES,  
14 INCLUDING UP TO FIVE STORY, YOU KNOW, 30 UNIT KIND OF PROJECTS  
15 WHICH ARE KIND OF A SWEET SPOT WITHIN A LOT OF THIS URBAN  
16 INFILL WORK WE'RE DOING SO I WOULD HOPE AND I CAN CERTAINLY  
17 FORWARD, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. I CAN  
18 SEND THAT TO STAFF AND STAFF CAN SEND IT OUT TO EVERYBODY.  
19 [LAUGHTER] IT'S ACTUALLY NOT THAT DENSE. YOU DON'T HAVE TO BE  
20 AN ARCHITECT TO UNDERSTAND IT. AND YEAH JUST ONE COMMENT, AND  
21 THANK YOU FOR CATCHING IT MISS ECKLUND TO THE ISSUE OF  
22 REDUCING -- AND I HAVE TALK TO THIS BEFORE I KNOW THERE IS  
23 SOME COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES ON THIS  
24 BUT I THINK THERE ARE PLACES INDEED WE CAN REDUCE SOME OF THE  
25 LOCAL FEES MANY OF THE LOCAL FEES ARE ACTUALLY NECESSARY TO,



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, COMPENSATE FOR THE TRAFFIC, SOME OF THE OTHER  
2 IMPACTS, I KNOW YOU WERE KIND OF GASPING SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS  
3 WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THE REDUCTION OF POTENTIAL PARKS, RIGHT,  
4 WE COULD DO CHARGE THESE PARK FEES SO WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE  
5 WE'RE CALIBRATING THEM CORRECTLY, NOT ABUSING THEM. AND I  
6 THINK A LOT OF THE STATE LEGISLATION KIND OF GETS US TO THAT  
7 DIRECTION. BUT I DO WANT TO BE VERY CAUTIOUS ABOUT AT THE  
8 LOCAL LEVEL SAYING WE NEED TO WIPE OUT SOME OF THESE FEES  
9 WHICH ARE NECESSARY FOR US TO CREATE A LIVABLE ENVIRONMENT,  
10 AND ALSO KIND OF ADDRESS -- I HAVE TO ADMIT, HOUSING HAS  
11 IMPACTS ON OUR COMMUNITIES. I SUPPORT HOUSING 100%, SO, IT'S  
12 JUST A CAUTIONARY. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, MEMBER ROMERO.  
15 AT THIS TIME WE'RE GOING TO TURN TO PUBLIC COMMENT, ALSO  
16 PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM. ADINA LEVIN FROM SEAMLESS BAY  
17 AREA.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THREE MINUTES, PLEASE.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. AND I WANTED TO  
24 COMMEND STAFF FOR ALL THE GOOD WORK AT PUTTING TOGETHER THIS  
25 LONG RANGE PLAN HELPING TO GUIDE OUR REGION FOR OUR HOUSING



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 AND CLIMATE AND TRANSPORTATION AND EQUITY GOALS. AND WANTED TO  
2 HIGHLIGHT THE POTENTIAL CONNECTION BETWEEN A FEW DIFFERENT  
3 THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING AT THE SAME TIME. SO, ON THE  
4 TRANSPORTATION SIDE, THE TRANSIT 2050+ COMPONENT, WHICH WAS  
5 OVERVIEWED HERE, COMING BACK IN DETAIL IN THE NEXT MONTH, HAS  
6 A NEW APPROACH TO THIS LONG LANGUAGE PLAN, AS A NETWORK,  
7 LOOKING AT SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS, LOOKING AT MORE COST  
8 EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES, IN A MORE CONSTRAINED FUNDING  
9 ENVIRONMENT FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY IN A WAY THAT WILL GET US  
10 RELIABLE, MORE RELIABLE AND FASTER SERVICE. COMMUNITY AND  
11 POPULAR. WHEN WE POLL ON THEM, THE PLAN OBSERVES ONE OR MORE  
12 CONSTRAINED FUNDING ENVIRONMENT AND A SET OF MULTIPLE FUNDING  
13 STRATEGIES. AT THE SAME TIME THAT MTC AND AGENCIES ARE WORKING  
14 TOGETHER ON A POTENTIAL REGIONAL FUNDING APPROACH, AND THAT  
15 COULD EITHER WORK ON HELPING DELIVER THIS PLAN THAT WE'RE  
16 WORKING IN THE LONG-TERM, OR DO SOMETHING, YOU KNOW,  
17 POTENTIALLY MUCH SMALLER AND WOULD REALLY URGE YOU FOR THE  
18 RIGHT HAND AND LEFT HAND TOGETHER TO HAVE THE FUNDING TO  
19 DELIVER THE VISION. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. NOT SEEING ANY OTHER  
22 PUBLIC COMMENTS IN THE BOARDROOM. DO WE HAVE ANY ONLINE?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
25 ONLINE AND THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.



OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT WAS  
3 SIMPLY AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM FOR US. AT THIS TIME, WE'LL MOVE  
4 ON TO AGENDA ITEM 11. AND THAT IS PUBLIC -- GENERAL PUBLIC  
5 COMMENT.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
8 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR  
9 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

10

11 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE'RE NOW MOVING ON TO  
12 ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE  
13 WILL BE HELD FRIDAY NOVEMBER 8TH, 2024 AT 9:40 AT THE BAY AREA  
14 METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA ANY  
15 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE IS  
18 ADJOURNED AND OUR NEXT MEETING IS NOVEMBER 8TH AT 9:40 A.M.  
19 HERE AT THE METRO CENTER. MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

20



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*