

1	BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
2	WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER $11^{\text{TH}}$ , 2024, 9:35 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: MY APOLOGIES FOR NOT BEING PRESENT, I
6	WOULD ASK THE VICE CHAIR TO TAKE OVER IF SHE SHOWS UP IN
7	PRESENCE, I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. AT THIS TIME, I WILL CALL
8	TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT
9	COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON MTC WEB SITE.
10	COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM
11	WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL
12	STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
13	SO, WITH THAT IF WE COULD HAVE ROLL CALL?
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CERTAINLY. CHAIR GLOVER?
16	
17	CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: PRESENT.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA IS EXPECTED, BUT NOT
20	PRESENT. NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY?
21	
22	DINA EL-TAWANSY: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
25	



1	VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY? PAPAN?
4	
5	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN? NON-VOTING SCHAFF? WE HAVE A
8	QUORUM.
9	
10	CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU. PLEASE JOIN ME FOR THE
11	PLEDGE. I KNOW THAT THERE IS A FLAG THAT WE HAVE IN THE ROOM.
12	SO. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG
13	OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH
14	IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND
15	JUSTICE FOR ALL."
16	
17	CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME CAN WE GET THE
18	COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CERTAINLY. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I
21	AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD
22	HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING
23	ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS
24	AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR
25	WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

1

DECEMBER 11, 2024

CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU. NEXT IS THE CHAIR'S 2 3 REPORT. AS WE NEAR THE END OF THE YEAR, I WANT TO REMIND THE COMMITTEE THAT THE LAST SB1 MEASURE REGION MEASURE THREE IS 4 5 SCHEDULED TO GO INTO EFFECT JANUARY 1ST, 2025, THAT HAS BEGUN UPDATING SIGNAGE AT THE BRIDGE NOTIFYING THE PUBLIC SO THAT 6 CUSTOMERS ARE PREPARED FOR THE CHANGE. AS A REMINDER, THE 7 8 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE LAST REGIONAL MEASURE \$3 TOLL IS SEPARATE AND APART FROM THE TOLL INCREASE THAT IS 9 10 CONTEMPLATING NOW, TO FUND THE OPERATIONS, MAINTENANCE, AND PRESERVATION OF THE BRIDGE THEMSELVES. THE MEASURE THREE WAS 11 APPROVED BY VOTERS IN 2018 TO FUND COMPREHENSIVE SUITES OF 12 HIGHWAY TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AROUND THE REGION. LAST MONTH 13 BATA RECEIVED RM3 ANNUAL REPORT TO THE LEGISLATURE 14 15 HIGHLIGHTING TRANSIT, TRAILS, AND INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENTS 16 THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ADVANCE WITH THIS FUNDING. SO THAT, IS MY ANNOUNCEMENT. AT THIS TIME, WE WILL MOVE TO THE CONSENT 17 CALENDAR. WHICH IS ITEMS 5A THROUGH 5H. DO ANY COMMISSIONERS 18 HAVE AN ITEM THAT THEY WOULD LIKE TO PULL? 19

20

21 COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I'M SORRY. I JUST
22 WANT TO NOTE THAT ITEM 5B, WHICH IS THE ADDENDUM TO THE
23 MITIGATED, 2023 MITIGATED DECK FOR THE REVISED WEST OAKLAND
24 LINK PROJECT THAT'S ACTUALLY GOING TO REAPPEAR IN JANUARY WITH



SOME SMALL REVISIONS. SO, THAT'S NOT PART OF THIS CONSENT 1 2 CALENDAR MOTION. 3 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU. SO IF THERE IS NO 4 5 COMMISSION --6 7 GINA PAPAN: I MOVE APPROVAL OF EVERYTHING BUT 5B ON THE 8 CONSENT CALENDAR. 9 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY WE HAVE A MOTION. DO WE HAVE A 10 11 SECOND? 12 13 VICTORIA FLEMING: SECOND FLEMING. 14 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT OR 15 16 RECEIVED ANY ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS? 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST WE RECEIVED A WRITTEN CORRESPOND ON 19 ITEM FIVE C FROM MARK BAKER SOFT LIGHT FOUNDATION AND WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME 20 WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE? 21 22 23 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: TWO MINUTES. 24



3

DECEMBER 11, 2024

CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. ALETA DUPREE, IF YOU WOULD UNMUTE
 YOURSELF YOUR TWO MINUTES BEGINS NOW

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR GLOVER AND MEMBERS 4 5 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS EVERYTHING IS LOOKING GOOD WITH THIS CONSENT CALENDAR. I WAS 6 AT THE LAST MEETING, VERY SHORT I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THE 7 8 WORK WITH THE LED LIGHTS I HAVE HEARD PRESENTATIONS WHEN THINGS GET OLD YOU HAVE GOT TO FIX THEM. I THINK THOSE LIGHTS 9 SERVE THE PURPOSE OF HELPING TO GIVE GREATER ILLUMINATION TO 10 THE AREA AND TO ENHANCE OUR BRIDGE EXPERIENCE. THE SAN 11 FRANCISCO SFCTA, THIS IS THE TREASURE ISLAND FUNDING IS ALSO 12 VERY IMPORTANT AND NEAR AND DEAR TO ME BECAUSE WHILE I HAVEN'T 13 BEEN TO TREASURE ISLAND IN QUITE A WHILE, THAT CAN --14 15 [INDISCERNIBLE] TRYING TO TOGGLE BACK AND FORTH, THAT IS 16 CERTAINLY BE HELPFUL. BECAUSE I WANT FUTURE WAYS TO GET TO TREASURE ISLAND SO THAT'S \$750,000 THAT WE CAN USE FOR THIS. 17 AND THERE'S SOME RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE IMPROVEMENT AND 18 DUMBARTON. WHILE I'M NOT REAL FAMILIAR WITH THOSE, ANYTHING 19 THAT CAN ENHANCE THOSE FACILITIES I'M CERTAINLY FOR IT. SO, 20 OVERALL I'M IN SUPPORT OF OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. I THINK WE 21 HAVE SOME GOOD THINGS. SO, THANK YOU. 22

23

24 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY OTHERS?25



```
1
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE.
2
3
    CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: THANK YOU. REMIND ME, MOTION AND
    SECOND?
4
5
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: FIRST COMMISSIONER PAPAN SECOND BY
6
7
    COMMISSIONER FLEMING.
8
9
    CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU. ROLL CALL VOTE,
10
    PLEASE.
11
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR GLOVER?
12
13
    CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: YES.
14
15
16
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT AT THE
    MOMENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
17
18
19
   VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE.
20
    CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
21
22
23
    GINA PAPAN: YES.
24
```



CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN? THE ITEM PASSES
 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW MOVE TO ITEM 4 5 6A WHICH IS THE TOLL INCREASE AND CHANGE TO HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLE POLICIES FOR BATA BRIDGES. THIS REQUEST IS FOR 6 REFERRAL TO BATA, RESOLUTION NUMBER 184, TO SCHEDULE FOR THE 7 8 STATE OWNED TOLL BRIDGES IN THE BAY AREA TO THE AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL. THIS RESOLUTION WOULD INCREASE TOLL RATES OVER FIVE-9 YEAR PERIODS STARTING IN JANUARY 1ST, 2026 TO FUND THE BRIDGES 10 OPERATIONS AND PRESERVATION AND ESTABLISH A UNIFORM THREE-11 PERSON TOLL REQUIREMENT FOR A DISCOUNT TOLLS ON ALL BRIDGES. 12 THE AUTHORITY SHALL CONSIDER ALL PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED 13 THROUGH THE END OF PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD ON DECEMBER 18TH. 14 15 BEFORE DETERMINING WHETHER TO PROCEED WITH THE TOLL INCREASE 16 AND HIGH-OCCUPANCY VEHICLES AND POLICY CHANGES. DEREK IS GOING TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. 17

18

ANDREW FREMIER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR GLOVER, ANDY FREMIER,
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I'M GOING TO OPEN IT UP THEN BASS IT OFF
TO DER FORENSIC THAT'S ALL RIGHT WITH YOU.

22

23 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: THAT'S FINE.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

ANDREW FREMIER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AS THE CHAIR 1 MENTIONED REQUESTING THIS COMMITTEE TO REFER THE TOLL INCREASE 2 3 TO THE FULL YOU AUTHORITY FOR APPROVAL NEXT WEEK AS YOU KNOW THE INCREASE IS DUE TO THE NEED FOR ADDITIONAL TOLL REVENUES 4 5 TO SUPPORT ONGOING OPERATIONS MAINTENANCE AND REHABILITATION OF THE SEVEN STATE OWNED TOLL BRIDGES. TODAY'S REQUEST COMES 6 AFTER MONTHS OF CONSIDERATION BY BATA AND AFTER SUBSTANTIAL 7 8 PUBLIC COMMENT PROCESS. THE BOARD AND THE PUBLIC HAVE ASKED GOOD OUESTIONS ABOUT BRIDGE NEEDS, TRANSPARENCY ON USE OF 9 10 REVENUE, BRIDGE USE DATA AND A PLAN TO MAKE FASTRAK MORE ACCESSIBLE AND STAFF HAS RESPONDED ACCORDINGLY. THE BRIDGES 11 ARE WELL MAINTAINED AND WE WANT TO KEEP THEM THAT WAY. THAT 12 REQUIRES SUBSTANTIAL INVESTMENT, BATA'S 10-YEAR CAPITAL 13 IMPROVEMENT PLAN CALLS FOR ABOUT \$2 BILLION OF INVESTMENT OVER 14 15 THE NEXT TEN YEARS. THE LIFECYCLE ASSET MANAGEMENT WORK WE'RE 16 DOING WITH CALTRANS AS A PARTNER WILL ADD TO THESE COSTS, BUT WILL EXTEND THE LIFE OF THE EXISTING FACILITIES AND DEFER 17 REPLACEMENT OF THE STRUCTURES, A COST THAT WOULD BE A LOT MORE 18 SIGNIFICANT THAN WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY. 19 UNFORTUNATELY, BRIDGE TOLL REVENUE THAT CAN BE USED FOR 20 21 OPERATIONS AND PRESERVATION HAS NOT KEPT PACE WITH THE NEEDS. THE LAST TOLL INCREASE ON BRIDGE PURPOSES, FOR ON BRIDGE 22 PURPOSES WAS NEARLY 15 YEARS AGO AND INFLATION HAS WHITTLED 23 AWAY THE PURCHASING POWER OF THOSE TOLLS. OVERALL, BRIDGE 24 TRAFFIC HAS RESET TO A LOWER LEVEL THAN BEFORE THE PANDEMIC, 25

DECEMBER 11, 2024

THE CONVERSION TO ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLING HAS HAD THE SAME 1 EFFECT ON OUR BRIDGES THAN IT HAS HAD NATIONALLY IT MAKES TOLL 2 3 PAYMENT EASIER AND OPERATIONS BETTER BUT IT MAKES IT HARD TORE COLLECT TOLLS AND MAKES IT MORE EXPENSIVE. WE ALSO MUST 4 5 ACKNOWLEDGE IT'S BATA'S RESPONSIBILITY TO FUND BRIDGE OPERATIONS AND PRESERVATION AND BRIDGE TOLLS ARE THE 6 7 OVERWHELMING ONLY SOURCE OF FUNDING FOR THIS REASON THE BATA 8 PLAN OF FINANCE HAS LONG INCLUDED A ONE THERE TOLL INCREASE THAT WAS ANTICIPATED TO BE EFFECTIVE BY JULY 1ST, 2026. IN 9 DEVELOPING THE TOLL INCREASE RECOMMENDED TODAY WE HAVE TRIED 10 11 TO STRIKE A REASONABLE COMPROMISE BETWEEN THE FINANCIAL REQUIREMENTS ASSOCIATED WITH KEEPING THE BRIDGE SYSTEM IN A 12 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND THE VERY LEGITIMATE CONCERNS OF OUR 13 TOLL PAYERS WHO ALSO FACE SIGNIFICANT COST ASSOCIATED WITH 14 LIVING IN OUR REGION IT'S PROPOSED AS A PHASED INCREASE TO 15 16 MINIMIZE THE ANNUAL BURDEN. THE TOLL INCREASE IS COUPLED WITH A BATA WORKPLAN TO MAKE FASTRAK MORE ACCESS AND I BELIEVE 17 18 INCREASE FASTRAK USAGE AND COMMITMENT TO IMPROVE BRIDGE 19 OPERATIONS THROUGH PROJECTS LIKE OPEN ROAD TOLLING. AS MTC AND BAHFA YOU'RE ALSO MAKING CRITICAL COMMITMENTS TO THE REGION'S 20 TRANSIT AND TO OTHER FUND SOURCES UNDER CONTROL AND WORKING 21 22 HISTORICALLY TO REDUCE COST OF TRANSPORTATION HOUSING THROUGH 23 PROGRAMS LIKE CLIPPER START DOORWAY PREDEVELOPMENT GRANTS AND RENTAL ASSISTANCE. WITH THAT I'M GOING TURN IT OVER TO DEREK 24 25 FOR THE ACTUAL PRESENTATION. THANK YOU.

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

DECEMBER 11, 2024

DEREK HANSEL: GREAT. THANKS ANDY. SO, GROUNDHOG DAY, GROUNDHOG 2 3 DAY, GROUNDHOG DAY. WE HAVE BEEN BEFORE YOU SEVERAL TIMES AT THIS POINT. I APPRECIATE YOUR PATIENCE. CERTAINLY WE THING HAS 4 5 BEEN AN IMPORTANT PROCESS WE RECOGNIZE THIS HAS BEEN A SUBSTANTIAL ASK AND CONTINUES TO BE A SUBSTANTIAL ASK THERE 6 REALLY WAS A GREAT NEED FOR GOOD DISCUSSION WITH THE BOARD AND 7 8 THE COMMITTEE BUT ALSO PRESENTATION OF THIS INFORMATION SO THAT THE PUBLIC COULD UNDERSTAND WHY STAFF IS RECOMMENDING 9 THIS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TODAY WE'RE SEEKING OVERSIGHT 10 COMMITTEE APPROVAL FIRST TOLL INCREASE PROPOSAL. THIS HAS BEEN 11 DISCUSSED WITH YOU PREVIOUSLY AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL, THE 12 BOARD LEVEL, AND WAS THE SUBJECT OF THE NOVEMBER 20TH PUBLIC 13 HEARING. SINCE JULY WE HAVE BEEN ADDRESSING FEEDBACK FROM THE 14 15 COMMITTEE AND THE BOARD ON THE NEED, THE OUTCOMES FOR BRIDGE 16 USERS, DATA BRIDGE USAGE, THE IMPORTANCE EVER THE TOLL DIFFERENTIAL BETWEEN FASTRAK AND NON-FASTRAK CUSTOMER AND THE 17 COLLECTIVE AGENCIES SUPPORTIVE EQUITY. WE HAVE ALSO CONDUCTED 18 A PUBLIC WEBINAR PUBLIC HEARING AND RECEIVED PUBLIC COMMENT AS 19 NOTED BY THE CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE, THE PERIOD FOR WHICH 20 21 CONTINUES THROUGH THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD AT NEXT WEEK'S ITEM. NEXT SLIDE. BATA WORKS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH CALTRANS 22 UNDER STATE LAW REQUIREMENTS TO MAINTAIN THE BRIDGE SYSTEM WE 23 ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR ADMINISTERING THE TOLL REVENUES FOR STATE 24 OWNED BRIDGES AND ARE REQUIRED UNDER STATE LAW TO FUND THOSE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DECEMBER 11, 2024** 

PROJECTS NECESSARY FOR THE PRESERVATION AND PROTECTION OF THE 1 BRIDGES. IN SUPPORT OF THIS MISSION WE HAVE ALREADY ISSUED 2 3 APPROXIMATELY \$9.8 BILLION OF DEBT TO FUND THE EAST SPAN OF THE BAY BRIDGE, THE SEISMIC RETROFIT PROGRAM AND OTHER CAPITAL 4 5 NEEDS INCLUDING THOSE ASSOCIATED WITH THE TWO REGIONAL MEASURES, REGIONAL MEASURES 2 AND 3. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, 6 AGAIN, AS NOTED, ON JANUARY 1ST THE BRIDGE TOLL IS GOING TO 7 8 INCREASE TO \$8. OF THAT AMOUNT \$4 IS ASSOCIATED WITH A VOTER APPROVED REGIONAL MEASURES 2 AND 3. \$4 OF THE BRIDGE TOLL HAS 9 BEEN ADOPTED SPECIFICALLY FOR THE PURPOSES OF SUPPORTING ON-10 BRIDGE PURPOSES. SO, REGIONAL MEASURE ONE AND THE THREE 11 SEISMIC DOLLARS. AGAIN, THAT HASN'T BEEN INCREASED SINCE 2010. 12 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE TOLL BRIDGES ARE CRITICAL TO THE 13 REGION'S ECONOMY AND THERE ARE A LOT OF IMPORTANT PROJECTS 14 15 THAT HAVE TO BE DONE IN ORDER TO MAINTAIN THESE IN A STATE OF 16 GOOD REPAIR. THE PROJECTS SHOWN HERE ARE PART OF THE AUTHORITY'S \$1.9.10 YEAR PLAN, THAT WILL BE BROUGHT BEFORE THE 17 COMMITTEE AND BOARD EARLY NEXT YEAR AND THAT IS LIKELY TO 18 INCREASE THE AMOUNT NORTH OF \$2 BILLION. AS WE HAVE DISCUSSED 19 PREVIOUSLY IT'S ALSO THE CASE THAT THE AUTHORITY IS WORKING 20 21 ACTIVELY WITH CALTRANS ON A LIFECYCLE ASSET MANAGEMENT PROGRAM WHICH WILL LIKELY LEAD TO INCREASED COST BOTH WITHIN THE TER 22 23 YEAR CIP TIME FRAME BUT BEYOND THAT AS WELL. WE HAVE SHOWN YOU PICTURES BEFORE BUT THERE ARE SOME PRETTY CRITICAL PROJECTS WE 24 ARE WORKING ON ACROSS THE BRIDGE SYSTEM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE 25

**DECEMBER 11, 2024** 

HAVE DELIVERED PROJECTS ACROSS THE ENTIRE REGION. THIS PAGE 1 NOTES WORK WE HAVE DONE AT EACH OF THE CROSSINGS, INCLUDING 2 3 SEISMICALLY RETROFITTED BRIDGES AND REPLACEMENTS, OUR FORWARD COMMUTE INITIATIVES AT DUMBARTON, THE BAY BRIDGE AND RICHMOND 4 5 SAN RAFAEL AND THOSE ARE PRESERVATION PROJECTS THAT WE SHOWED YOU IN THE PICTURES ON THE PRIOR PAGE. WE'RE ALSO WORKING 6 ACTIVELY AS ANDY NOTED ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE OAKLAND ROAD 7 8 TOLLING BRIDGE CROSSINGS WHICH WILL PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT USER BENEFITS INCLUDING IMPROVED SAFETY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AGAIN, 9 WHAT ARE WE RECOMMENDING TO YOU TODAY FOR REFERRAL TO THE 10 BOARD NEXT WEEK? NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE RECOMMENDING A FIVE-11 YEAR PHASED IN APPROACH OF TOLLS BEGINNING JANUARY 26TH, THIS 12 WOULD INCREASE THE TOLLS ON TWO AXLE VEHICLES BY \$0.50 PER 13 YEAR FROM JANUARY 1, 2026 THROUGH JANUARY 1ST OF 2030. MULTI-14 15 AXLE VEHICLES WOULD PAY AN ADDITIONAL \$0.50 PER AXLE PER YEAR. 16 SO, WE WOULD ESSENTIALLY TREAT MULTI-AXLE VEHICLES IN THE SAME WAY THAT WE HAD THROUGH RM1, THE SEISMIC DOLLARS IN RM2. RM3 17 IS JUST A PER VEHICLE CHARGE. WE'RE ALSO PROPOSING, AS WE HAVE 18 DISCUSSED NOW, FOR QUITE SOMETIME, TIERED PRICING BASED ON THE 19 METHOD OF PAYMENT. WE'RE PROPOSING THAT THOSE RELATIVELY FEW 20 21 ACCOUNTS WHO USE OUR LICENSE PLATE ACCOUNT METHODOLOGY WOULD PAY AN ADDITIONAL \$0.25 PER TRANSACTION AND THOSE CUSTOMER WHO 22 IS CHOOSE TO PAY BY INVOICE WOULD PAY AN EXTRA DOLLAR. WE'RE 23 PROPOSING THAT THIS BE EFFECTIVE JANUARY 1, 2027 TO GIVE US 24 ADDITIONAL TIME TO CONTINUE TO PUSH FASTRAK INTO AS MANY 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

HANDS, AS MANY VEHICLES, AS WE CAN GET IT, FRANKLY, BECAUSE 1 THAT'S CERTAINLY OUR LOWEST COST OF HANDLING TRANSACTIONS. 2 3 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THIS SCHEDULE JUST SHOWS YOU WHAT THOSE INCREASES ARE. AND WE DO NOTE, AGAIN, THAT ADJUSTMENT, 4 5 PARTICULARLY IN 2027 WHERE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE THOSE ADDITIONAL CHARGES FOR THE LICENSE PLATE ACCOUNTS AND THE 6 INVOICE ACCOUNTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. EXCUSE ME. SO, I WANT TO 7 8 TURN QUICKLY TO ANOTHER PIECE OF THE TOTAL SCHEDULE, WHICH DEALS WITH HOV, ARE THE CARPOOL POLICY CHANGES, BECAUSE THAT 9 DOES HAVE IMPACTS ON THE TOLL SCHEDULE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS 10 WE HAVE DISCUSSED BEFORE, WE ARE PROPOSING SOME NOTABLE 11 CHANGES TO THE CURRENT HOV POLICY. RIGHT NOW, WE HAVE REDUCED 12 TOLLS AND RESTRICTED ACCESS TO THE HOV 3 PLUS LANE ON FIVE OF 13 OUR BRIDGES. SO, SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, AND NORTH, WE HAVE A 14 15 REDUCED TOLLING RESTRICTED ACCESS ON THE TWO PLUS ON THE 16 DUMBARTON SAN MATEO HAYWARD BRIDGES SO THAT'S THE CURRENT POLICY. WHEN WE'RE PROPOSING IS THAT HOV THREE PLUS WOULD BE 17 REQUIRED FOR ALL TOLL BRIDGES TO GET A DIS-- TO GET A DISCOUNT 18 ON THE TOLL. BUT THAT HOV-2S COULD USE THE HOV LANE FOR TIME 19 SAVINGS. SO, THEY WOULD BE ABLE TO USE THE LANE BUT WOULD NOT 20 21 GET THE DISCOUNT THE TOLL ON ALL OF THE BRIDGES EXCEPT THE BAY BRIDGE WHERE THAT WOULD STILL BE RESTRICTED TO HOV-THREE PLUS. 22 AGAIN AS HAS BEEN DISCUSSED IN PRIOR PRESENTATIONS, THIS IS 23 REALLY RELATED TO DIMINISHED CAPACITY ON THE BAY BRIDGE, 24 WHICH, REALLY, YOU KNOW, DOES HAVE THOSE CHALLENGES. BUT 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

EXCESS CAPACITY ON THE OTHER BRIDGES WHERE WE CAN GET BETTER 1 2 FLOW BY USING THE TWO-PLUS METHOD. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, 3 AGAIN, THOSE DEDICATED HOV LANES APPROACHING THE TOLL BRIDGES WOULD PROVIDE ADDITIONAL TIME SAVINGS. THIS IS PARTICULARLY 4 5 IMPORTANT AS WE'RE MOVING TOWARD IMPLEMENTATION OF CHANGES AT RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL, AND, AGAIN, YOU HAVE SEEN THAT IN PRIOR 6 PRESENTATIONS WHERE IT KIND OF INTERLINKS WITH THE HOV LANES 7 8 ON THE APPROACHES AND WELL BEFORE THAT. IN THAT AREA, LEADING UP TO THE BRIDGE. THIS WOULD ALSO ENHANCE REGIONAL CONSISTENCY 9 BY OFFERING A TOLL DISCOUNT ONLY TO HOV-THREE PLUS VEHICLES. 10 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, LET'S CIRCLE BACK TO PUBLIC OUTREACH 11 THAT WE HAVE DONE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE HAVE HAD A VERY 12 EXTENSIVE PUBLIC OUTREACH CAMPAIGN RELATIVE TO THE TOLL 13 INCREASE IN THE HOV POLICY CHANGES. MULTIPLE ANNOUNCEMENTS AND 14 15 NEWS ITEMS ON OUR OWN WEB SITE, PRESS RELEASES, SOCIAL MEDIA 16 POSTS, REQUIRED PUBLIC LEGAL NOTICES IN MULTIPLE LANGUAGES, AND A WEBINAR AND PUBLIC HEARING THAT WE DID CONDUCT IN 17 NOVEMBER. AND, AGAIN, I KEEP SAYING IT, BUT THE PUBLIC COMMENT 18 PERIOD DOES NOT END TODAY. IT ENDS NEXT WEDNESDAY AT THE 19 CONCLUSION OF PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THE ITEM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. 20 21 THROUGH DECEMBER 3RD WHICH IS WHEN WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO COMPILE COMMENTS FOR THE ITEM TODAY. WE HAVE RECEIVED 172 22 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC. MOST COMMENTS WERE OPPOSED TO THE 23 TOLL INCREASE. THOUGH THERE ARE SOME COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN 24 PROVIDED IN SUPPORT OF THE TOLL INCREASE. AND SOME THAT WERE 25

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

UNDECIDED AND SOME THAT JUST KIND OF REFERENCED OTHER THINGS 1 AROUND THE IDEA OF A TOLL INCREASE. THERE ARE SEVERAL THEMES 2 3 THAT RUN THROUGH THESE COMMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. A MAJORITY OF THE COMMENTS DEMONSTRATE CONCERN WITH THE ECONOMIC BURDEN 4 5 OF THE INCREASE. WHILE STAFF IS CERTAINLY SENSITIVE TO THOSE CONCERNS WE HAVE BEEN CLEAR AS TO OUR REOUIREMENTS FOR BRIDGE 6 MAINTENANCE AS AN AGENCY AND NOTE THAT THE TOLLS ARE THE ONLY 7 8 RELIABLE FUNDING SOURCE FOR THESE PURPOSES. SEVERAL COMMENTS CALL FOR TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY. WE NOTE THAT THE KEY 9 DOCUMENTS THAT PROVIDE TRANSPARENCY AND ACCOUNTABILITY 10 RELATIVE TO THE BRIDGE OPERATIONS, MAINTENANCE, FINANCES, ARE 11 ALREADY PROVIDED ON OUR WEB SITE, INCLUDING OUR AUDITED 12 FINANCIAL STATEMENTS, THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PLAN AND BOTH 13 CAPITAL AND OPERATING BUDGETS. MANY COMMENTS NOTED DESPERATE 14 IMPACT ON LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES, THAT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE 15 16 TRIED TO ADDRESS PRETTY SIGNIFICANTLY OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS. AGAIN, WE AGREE, BUT IT IS ALSO THE FACT THAT, AGAIN, 17 TOLLS ARE OUR METHOD FOR BEING ABLE TO FUND THOSE BRIDGES. WE 18 HAVE ALSO NOTED THAT IN THE PAST MTC PROPER, WITH SOME OF WHAT 19 IT CAN DO, HAS PROVIDED SUPPORT FOR OTHER EQUITY PROGRAMS, 20 21 INCLUDING CLIPPER START, AND AT BAIFA LOOKING AT EXPRESS LANES START, THE PILOT PROGRAM THERE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SOME OF THE 22 COMMENTS ASK FOR EXPLORATIONS OF ALTERNATIVES TO TOLL 23 INCREASES. STAFF NOTES THAT STATE LAW IS VERY CLEAR AS TO THE 24 BATA RESPONSIBILITY TO FUND THE OPERATIONS MAINTENANCE AND 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

REHABILITATION OF THE BRIDGE SYSTEM. THIS IS WHAT WE CAN DO AS 1 AN AGENCY. SOME COMMENTS TAKE ISSUE WITH THE GEOGRAPHIC 2 3 DISPARATE FOR RESIDENTS OF THE EAST BAY AND SOLANO COUNTY. BATA DOES PROVIDE PURSUANT TO STATE LAW, A DISCOUNT ON A 4 5 PORTION OF REGIONAL MEASURE THREE TOLLS FOR THOSE DRIVERS WHO USE MULTIPLE VEHICLES IN A MANNER CONSISTENT WITH STATE LAW. 6 SO, THEY'RE USING MULTIPLE BRIDGES WITHIN A COUPLE -- WITHIN 7 8 THE COMMUTE HOURS, THEY'RE DRIVING ON THE SECOND BRIDGE, THEY GET A DISCOUNT ON THE SECOND RM3 PORTION OF THE TOLL. NEXT 9 SLIDE, PLEASE. AND AGAIN SOME NOTE SUPPORT, FOR SOME OF THE 10 COMMENTS, DO SUPPORT THE TOLL INCREASE. AND REALLY FOR THE 11 REASONS THAT HAVE BEEN PRESENTED BY STAFF, YES THEY HAVE 12 ACKNOWLEDGED THAT WE HAVE MADE THE CASE ON THE NEED FOR BRIDGE 13 SUPPORT OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE, PRESERVATION. THERE ARE 14 15 THOSE WHO DO NOTE THAT. SOME COMMENTS HAVE NOTED A WISH FOR 16 HIGHER TOLLS THAT COULD SUPPORT MORE PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND, FINALLY, A FEW COMMENTS, VERY FEW, SUPPORT THE IDEA THAT TWO-17 PERSON CARPOOL SHOULD RECEIVE THE TOLL DISCOUNT. SO WE DID GET 18 THREE FOLKS WHO NOTED THAT AS A DESIRE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, 19 THIS BRINGS US BACK TO WHERE WE ARE TODAY. WE HAVE BEEN IN 20 FRONT OF YOU FOR A LONG TIME. YOU'RE PROBABLY TIRED OF HEARING 21 ME TALK. SO, I'LL STOP, OTHER THAN TO SAY WE WELCOME ANY 22 QUESTIONS. 23

24

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

## DECEMBER 11, 2024

CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. THANK YOU, MR. FREMIER AND DEREK, 1 2 THANK YOU, BOTH, FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WOULD SAY THAT I 3 THINK THIS IS A PROCESS THAT I HAVE HAD MUCH HEARTBURN WITH, BUT AT THE SAME TIME, I DO UNDERSTAND THE RESPONSIBILITY OF 4 5 THIS AUTHORITY AND LOOKING AT WHERE RESOURCES COMES FROM. I KNOW THAT IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE TO DO, BECAUSE WE DO 6 HAVE A FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY, AND IN TERMS OF THAT, AND IN 7 8 A REGIONAL RESPONSIBILITY TO MAKE SURE THAT WE KEEP THESE BRIDGE UP AND OPERABLE AND SAFE FOR THE COMMUTERS THAT'S USING 9 THEM. SO, WITH THAT I'M GOING TO ASK IF THERE IS A MOTION FOR 10 THIS OR ANY PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY COMMENT FROM MY COLLEAGUES? 11 12 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN HAS A COMMENT. 13 14 DINA EL-TAWANSY: EL-TAWANSY HAS COMMENT. 15 16 17 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: OKAY. 18 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO STAFF. YES, 19 WE ALL HAVE HEARTBURN OVER THIS, MAJORLY. WHAT I'M NOT SEEING 20 21 IS IN ORDER TO BE TRANSPARENT WITH, LIKE, THIS LOVELY SLIDE SHOW, AND I ALMOST HAD TO GIGGLE AT THE RAINBOW PICTURE. 22 [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE A LOT OF PEOPLE ARE NOT GOING TO BELIEVE 23 THAT'S THE SUNNY SIDE UP HERE. I KNOW YOU HAVE MENTIONED THIS 24



BEFORE, BUT THE AUTOMATION WHERE WE DO AWAY WITH THE TOLL 1 2 GATES IS WHEN? 3 DEREK HANSEL: THERE IS A MULTI-YEAR PROCESS FOR WHICH THAT'S 4 5 GOING TO BE STAGED. I THINK THE LAST OF IT ENDS? 2028. 6 LISA KLEIN: LISA KLEIN FROM MTC. THE FIRST ONE WILL BE IN 2026 7 8 AT THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE AND WE WILL PROCEED THROUGH THE BRIDGES WITH THE LAST ONE SCHEDULED IN 2028 AT THE SAN 9 10 FRANCISCO OAKLAND BAY BRIDGE. 11 GINA PAPAN: OKAY. SECONDARILY AND I THINK WE HAVE DISCUSSED 12 THIS, THE OUTREACH, AS FAR AS PROVIDING THE TRANSPONDERS, WE 13 SET A PLAN. I DON'T SEE THE PLAN, OR WHAT -- YOU KNOW, I THINK 14 IT MIGHT BE NICE FOR THE PUBLIC TO SEE THAT WE'RE GOING TO GET 15 16 OUT BEYOND THE COSTCOS, BEYOND THE -- THAT'S KIND OF IMPORTANT. BECAUSE I UNDERSTAND WHY EVERYBODY IS UNHAPPY WITH 17 THIS, AND I UNDERSTAND THE NECESSITY FOR IT, BUT IF THE PUBLIC 18 COULD SEE WHERE YOU'RE GOING TO MAKE IT MORE ACCESSIBLE TO 19 20 THEM, THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, I THINK. 21 22 DEREK HANSEL: WE AGREE. WE HAVE PROVIDED IN A PREVIOUS PRESENTATION, A HIGH-LEVEL TIMELINE OF WHEN WE INTEND TO DO 23 THAT AND WE'RE GOING TO BE COMING BACK WITH MORE SPECIFICS TO 24 25 THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE NEXT YEAR, NOT LATE NEXT YEAR, EARLY



YEAR NEXT YEAR, WITH MORE SPECIFICS, THE DETAILS OF THE PLAN
 ARE BEING FLESHED OUT BUT OUR TEAMS ARE WORKING ACTIVELY ON
 THAT RIGHT NOW INCLUDING VERY SPECIFIC OUTREACH WITH THE
 NUMBER OF DIFFERENT RETAILERS AMONG OTHER THINGS.

5

GINA PAPAN: OKAY. I DO APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORTS HERE BUT
WHEN SOMEBODY SAYS A PLAN AND WE'RE MOVING AHEAD WITH THIS WE
REALLY LIKE TO SEE WHEN RESULTS CAN HAPPEN BECAUSE THAT WOULD
BE HELPFUL.

10

11 DEREK HANSEL: AGREE. I DON'T DISAGREE WE DID PROVIDE THAT 12 HIGH-LEVEL DISCUSSION BACK IN OCTOBER AND AGREED WITH THAT 13 MORE DETAILS NEED TO COME.

14

GINA PAPAN: I REMEMBER THAT, LOOKED AT IT WALGREENS, WAY OUT 15 16 HERE AND ONE OVER -- SO REALLY NOT A LOT OF ACCESS LOCALLY, AND I GET IT JUST DON'T WANT US TO HAVE DELAYS FROM PLANNING 17 DOESN'T MAKE US LOOK GOOD THE IDEA WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT 18 DIRECTION, THE SOONER WE CAN GET RESULTS SO THAT THE COMMUNITY 19 IS FEELING LIKE -- JUST KIND OF LESSENS THE BLOW HERE SHALL WE 20 21 SAY. AND TO WHAT ONE OF THE COMMISSIONERS PREVIOUSLY NOTED HERE, THIS IS GOING TO GET US INTO A LOT WHEN WE'RE IN A LOT 22 OF DEBT ALREADY AS YOU STATED UNDER THE LAW WE HAVE TO KEEP 23 THE BRIDGES UP, I GET ALL THAT. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE TOO 24 IS JUST A SLIDE ON THE AVERAGE COST OF PAINTING. LIKE WHAT'S 25

DECEMBER 11, 2024

YOUR YEARLY COST SHEET HERE? BECAUSE I THINK THE PUBLIC NEEDS 1 TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE UPKEEP IS. AND IT IS OUTRAGEOUS. I LOVE 2 3 THE PHOTOS. THAT'S GOOD, OF WHERE -- YOU KNOW, WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE UNDERNEATH. BECAUSE NOBODY SEES THAT. BUT IF YOU COULD 4 5 PUT IN THE IMPORTANCE EVER INSPECTIONS ALL THESE THINGS WE'RE REQUIRED TO DO KIND OF IN A NUTSHELL, THESE BIG CHARTS -- IF 6 THERE WAS A FACT SHEET IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR PEOPLE TO GO, 7 8 OH, THAT'S WHAT WE HAVE TO DO HERE. AND, AGAIN, I'M JUST MAKING THESE SUGGESTIONS SO THAT -- THIS IS REALLY HARD TO 9 DIGEST. ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO COMMUTE THEY'RE NOT 10 GOING IT TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT. THEY'RE GOING TO GO ACROSS A 11 COUPLE OF BRIDGES. COSTS ARE REALLY OUTRAGEOUS HERE. SO, THANK 12 YOU FOR THAT. I APPRECIATE IT, AND I DO -- I AM CONCERNED 13 ABOUT THE -- WHAT -- I MEAN, IF WE'RE GOING INTO THE DEBT 14 15 SERVICE HERE IF WE CAN GET SOME KIND OF UNDERSTANDING, IS THAT 16 EVER GOING TO -- ARE WE EVER GOING TO GET AHEAD OF THAT?

17

18 DEREK HANSEL: YEAH. THANK YOU. ON THAT LAST POINT,

PARTICULARLY, YOU KNOW, THAT'S REALLY, FRANKLY, ONE OF THE BIG
GOALS OF THIS TOLL INCREASE IS TO ALLOW US TO FUND THE
SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF THE CAPITAL NEEDS OF THE BRIDGE SYSTEM
ON A PAY AS YOU GO BASIS AS OPPOSED TO ISSUING MORE DEBT. YOU
KNOW? WE HAVE HAD TO FUND ALL OF THE REHAB BUDGET SINCE 2020,
OFF BORROWED FUNDS. THE NEEDS ARE GREATER. BUT PANDEMICRELATED TRAFFIC REDUCTIONS, YOU KNOW, THE CONVERSION TO ALL

DECEMBER 11, 2024

ELECTRONIC TOLLING, WHICH HAS HAD SOME IMPACT ON COSTS AND 1 REVENUE, REALLY HAVE PUT US IN A CASE WHERE, AGAIN, WE HAVE 2 3 HAD TO BORROW FUNDS FOR THAT AND CONVERTING OVER TO A MUCH LARGER SHARE OF PAY GO, IS REALLY THE INTENT. 4 5 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. 6 7 8 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: CHAIR, I AM HERE, IF YOU WOULD LIKE ME TO HELP IN FACILITATING? 9 10 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: I THINK WE'RE OKAY. IF YOU COULD JUST 11 CALL ON THE NEXT SPEAKER? 12 13 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY GREAT. I BELIEVE IT WAS 14 COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY, AND I SEE OUR CHAIR, ALFREDO 15 16 [LAUGHTER] 17 DINA EL-TAWANSY: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I WANT TO 18 TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE -- IT'S NOT ON? OKAY. I'LL MOVE 19 IT CLOSURE. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION DEREK. I WANT TO 20 21 TAKE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE A FEW COMMENTS. I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO THE STAFF FOR THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT YOU HAVE PUT INTO 22 THIS. I KNOW IT'S OUITE A LOT TO TRY TO MAKE THE PICTURE 23 CLEARER IN TERMS OF THE NEEDS THAT WE HAVE. DEREK, IN YOUR 24 PRESENTATION, YOU TALK ABOUT THE ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN, AND I 25

**DECEMBER 11, 2024** 

THINK THIS IS A CRITICAL STEP. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT 1 ACCOUNTABILITY, IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE PUBLIC SEE WHAT THE 2 3 NEEDS ARE. WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO DEMONSTRATE THAT NEEDS IN SUCH A CLEAR AND CONCISE MANNER THAT ALLOWS THE PUBLIC TO ASK 4 5 OUESTIONS AND ALLOWS ALSO TO CLARIFY WHERE WE ARE SPENDING THESE FUNDINGS. THE ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN WILL SERVE IN THAT 6 SPACE, AND IT WILL ALSO ALLOW US TO PROJECT OUR LONG-TERM 7 8 NEEDS FOR THESE BRIDGES. IT'S INEVITABLE THAT WE HAVE A LIFECYCLE FOR ALL OF THOSE STRUCTURES AND WE ARE APPROACHING 9 THAT LIFECYCLE HERE AND THERE. WE NEED TO GET READY FOR THAT. 10 AND I RECOGNIZE IT IS A VERY HEAVY LIFT. BUT THERE IS ALSO A 11 COST THAT THE TAXPAYERS PAY WHEN WE DON'T DO THOSE MAINTENANCE 12 IN A TIMELY MANNER. AND I THINK THOSE KIND OF COSTS ARE 13 IMPORTANT TO KEEP IN MIND. WHEN WE ARE UNDER EMERGENCY 14 15 CONTRACTS, WHAT ENDS UP HAPPENING IS -- AN EMERGENCY CONTRACT 16 HAPPENS WHEN WE HAVE TO ADDRESS A SITUATION FAST IN ORDER FOR US TO KEEP OUR PROJECTS IN GOOD STATE OF REPAIR. SO WHEN WE GO 17 UNDER EMERGENCY CONTRACTS, WHAT HAPPENS IS TAXPAYERS END UP 18 PAYING MULTIPLE FOLD OF WHAT THEY WOULD HAVE PAID IF WE WERE 19 ABLE TO DO THE MAINTENANCE IN A TIMELY MANNER. I THINK THIS IS 20 A VERY IMPORTANT POINT THAT WE NEED TO DEMONSTRATE IN OUR 21 22 CONVERSATION WITH THE PUBLIC AS WELL. I DO RECOGNIZE IT'S A FINANCIAL BURDEN, I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THAT ECONOMICALLY. IT'S 23 A LOT OF MONEY FOR A LOT OF PEOPLE. I HAVE TO SAY MY OWN STAFF 24 SOMETIMES WORKING ON PAINTING THOSE BRIDGES ARE FEELING THE 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

BURDEN OF CROSSING SOMETIMES TWO BRIDGES TO GET TO WORK. I 1 THINK IT'S CRITICAL FOR US TO CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION WITH 2 3 EQUITY ALSO CONTINUE LOOKING AT WHAT WE CAN DO IN THE NEXT YEAR BEFORE THIS TAKES EFFECT TO HELP THOSE THAT ARE GOING TO 4 5 BE BURDENED MOST WITH THIS. ONE OF THOSE THINGS IN PARTICULAR THAT COMES TO MY MIND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WHEN WE TALK 6 ABOUT HAVING TRANCE RESPONDERS AND CERTAIN LEVEL OF FUNDING ON 7 8 THOSE TRANCE RESPONDERS, FOR EXAMPLE, WE REPLENISH THAT FOR PEOPLE THAT CANNOT AFFORD LOOKING AT THESE OPPORTUNITIES 9 10 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, WE NEED MORE ACCESSIBILITY EASY TO OBTAIN EASY TO MAINTAIN SO THESE ARE SOME OF MY THOUGHTS AND I WANT 11 TO ADD MY VOICE OF THE STAFF HERE THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT FOR 12 OUR BRIDGES UPKEEP WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO MAINTAIN GOOD STATE 13 OF REPAIR OR BRIDGES ARE SAFE AND NEED TO CONTINUE BEING SAFE. 14 THANK YOU FOR DOING THIS WORK. AND ONE MORE THING I'M NOT 15 16 GOING TO BE ABLE TO ATTEND THIS NEXT COMMISSION MEETING BUT DAVID AMBUEHL OUR CHIEF DEPUTY FOR THE DISTRICT WILL BE HERE 17 TO ANSWER ANY OUESTIONS THE COMMISSION OR PUBLIC MAY ASK. 18 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 19 20 21 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: CHAIR PEDROZA?

22

ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR. LOOK DEREK, WE HAVE
HEARD THIS PRESENTATION MULTIPLE TIMES AND I AGREE WITH
CONCERNS THAT FOLKS HAVE EXPRESSED BUT I ALSO WOULD LIKE TO

DECEMBER 11, 2024

REMIND FOLKS OF THE TOTALITY OF WHAT WE DO IS NOT JUST BRIDGES 1 AS PUBLIC TRANSIT AND FOCUS WE HAVE IN THE REGION CROSSING 2 3 BRIDGES AND TAKING TRANSIT LOOK AT MEANS BASED PROGRAMMING, WHETHER EXPRESS LANES OR PUBLIC TRANSIT PART OF WHAT WE DO 4 5 TRYING TO MAKE PEOPLE'S LIVES BETTER BRIDGE INCREASES DO HURT 6 THEY'RE REAL, THERE ARE OTHER OPTIONS WE CAN CONTINUE TO PROVIDE TO RESIDENTS WITH BARRIERS APPRECIATE YOUR STEADFAST 7 8 COMMENT, THE EMERGENCY CONTRACTING THAT WAS SAID, I AGREE WITH THAT IF YOU IGNORE YOUR ROOF IT'S GOING TO BECOME MORE 9 EXPENSIVE OVER TIME AND YOU DON'T WANT TO CALL THEM ON THE 24-10 HOUR CALL. REALLY HUMANIZES THE REALITIES OF WHAT WE'RE 11 FACING. SO, DINA THANK YOU FOR THAT PERSPECTIVE. THANK YOU 12 13 COMMISSIONERS.

14

V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I JUST WANT TO SAY A FEW THINGS I 15 16 DEFINITELY APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS AND OF COURSE WE'RE ALL CONCERNED ABOUT THE IMPACTS ESPECIALLY FOR OUR LOW-INCOME 17 FOLKS. I WANT TO SHARE THAT I WAS LISTENING TO 94.9, MORNING 18 SHOW, AND THIS TOPIC CAME UP. SO, ON ONE HAND, I THOUGHT THIS 19 IS GREAT THAT THIS IS BEING ADVERTISED AND THAT FOLKS ARE 20 AWARE OF IT AND TALKING ABOUT IT, AND I WOULD SAY THAT THE 21 COMMENTS ARE MOSTLY, YOU KNOW, NOT POSITIVE, OBVIOUSLY THE 22 INCREASED COST. YOU KNOW, FOLKS ARE SAYING, YOU KNOW, HOW MUCH 23 DOES PAINT REALLY COST. AND THE OTHER ONE I THOUGHT WAS 24 INTERESTING WAS THAT, YOU KNOW, WHY IS IT THE SAME AMOUNT 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

INCREASE ON, LIKE, THE BAY BRIDGE, VERSUS ONE OF THE SMALLER 1 BRIDGES, AND SHOULDN'T THE SMALLER SHORTER BRIDGES -- YOU 2 3 KNOW, IT SHOULD BE TIERED BASED ON THE LENGTH OF THE BRIDGE. THAT ONE I THOUGHT WAS INTERESTING AND MAYBE SOMETHING TO 4 5 THINK ABOUT. BUT, YOU KNOW, CLEARLY -- AND THEN I WAS CONCERNED, BECAUSE I APPRECIATE I'M GLAD THIS IS BEING 6 DISCUSSED BUT ONE OF MY COLLEAGUES ON A DIFFERENT 7 8 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY HAD NO CLUE THAT THIS WAS HAPPENING. SO JUST THIS LITTLE OUESTION ABOUT WHO IS GETTING THE INFORMATION 9 AND WHO ISN'T AND THAT WE STILL HAVE SOME WORK TO DO IN MAKING 10 SURE FOLKS KNOW WHAT'S HAPPENING. I KNOW IT'S A NECESSITY. I 11 AGREE, LIKE, A FREOUENT SHEET OR SOMETHING THAT, YOU KNOW, 12 REALLY QUICKLY LAYS OUT WHY WE NEED TO DO THIS WOULD BE 13 HELPFUL, I THINK, AND THEN JUST MAKING SURE ALL OF OUR 14 15 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY FOLKS AND THE BOARDS ARE -- KNOW WHAT'S 16 HAPPENING SO THAT WE CAN ALSO BE ABLE TO HELP SPREAD THE WORD, IS MY THOUGHTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 17 18

19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE RECEIVED WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE. SO I 20 WILL FIRST START WITH THAT. EMILY VICE PRESIDENT OF PUBLIC 21 POLICY FOR BAY AREA COUNCIL, LINDA WATERS, DAVID SEAN BROWN 22 PRESIDENT OF TRANSPORTATION SOLUTIONS DEFENSE AND EDUCATION 23 FUND. NOW I'LL MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU 24 LIKE TO PROVIDE?

25



V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HOW MANY FOLKS DO WE HAVE? 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AT THE MOMENT WE HAVE THREE. 4 5 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: TWO MINUTES. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. 8 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. 9 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: ALETA DUPREE. TWO MINUTES BEGIN NOW. 11 12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE 13 RECORD SHE AND HER REPRESENTING TEAM FOLDS. THIS IS VERY 14 IMPORTANT IT'S NOT EASY. RAISING TOLLS IS FARES IS NEVER. BUT 15 16 WE HAVE TO DO THIS. AND BATA IS NOT THE ONLY TOLL AGENCY THAT I SPEAK AND WRITE TO. I'M A USER OF THE BRIDGES BECAUSE I RIDE 17 BUSES OVER THEM. AND OCCASIONALLY, RIDE-SHARES WITH CARPOOLS. 18 AND I KNOW THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING SAFE BRIDGES. AND WE HAVE 19 SAFE BRIDGES, BUT WE HAVE TO KEEP THEM SAFE. I HAVE PROBABLY 20 21 BEEN TO MORE PRESENTATIONS ABOUT THIS THAN ANYBODY. AND I REMEMBER IN THE SPRING WE HAD A LOT OF PRESENTATIONS ABOUT THE 22 BASICS OF BRIDGES. AND HEARING TERMS LIKE FENDERS AND BRIDGE 23 SKIRTS. I THINK I WAS AT THAT MEETING, BRIDGE SKIRTS, SKIRT --24 [INDISCERNIBLE] ET CETERA. THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. SOME OF 25

DECEMBER 11, 2024

THESE BRIDGES ARE ABOUT 80 YEARS OLD. AND I REMEMBER BRIDGE 1 COLLAPSES UP IN THE NORTHEAST, ON THE THRUWAY, AND 2 3 CONNECTICUT, AND THE BALLOT MORE BRIDGE COLLAPSE THAT HAPPENED EARLY THIS YEAR WE DON'T WANT THAT HAPPENING HERE IN THE BAY 4 5 AREA SO WE'RE IN ONE OF THE MOST SEISMICALLY ACTIVE REGIONS IN THE WORLD AND I KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE WHEN THINGS AREN'T FUNDED. 6 I REMEMBER IN THE 1970S THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY WAS COVERED 7 8 WITH BROKEN EXPECTATIONS ALL KINDS OF OTHER PROBLEMS, THEY MOVED PAST THAT AND BUILT A SYSTEM, EVEN WITH CHALLENGES WE 9 HAVE TO DO THIS I SUPPORT THE TIERED PRICES. I WANT THE SAFEST 10 BRIDGES WE CAN HAVE. THANK YOU. 11

12

13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OLIVIA E, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M 15 16 TALKING TO YOU FROM THE HAYWARD BART STATION BECAUSE I'M ON THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ON THE EQUITY AND ACCESS 17 SUBCOMMITTEE AND THE SUBCOMMITTEE LOOKING AT THE OPEN ROAD 18 TOLLING. I AM TRYING TO COMMUTE TO WORK WITH PUBLIC 19 TRANSPORTATION. AND IT COSTS ME \$86 A WEEK TO DO THAT IF I 20 21 MAKE ALL MY CONNECTIONS AND I DON'T ACTUALLY HAVE TO CALL A LYFT OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. AND THIS, I WAS JUST LIKE OKAY 22 I'M JUST DOING THIS WITH NO STANCE AT ALL. SO IN THEORY, I 23 SHOULD BE ABLE TO GET FROM MY HOUSE TO WORK IN AN HOUR AND A 24 HALF EVEN THOUGH IT'S A 24 MINUTE DRIVE ON PUBLIC 25

DECEMBER 11, 2024

TRANSPORTATION. BUT I CONSISTENTLY HAVE ISSUES WITH THE 1 CONNECTIONS. SO, I'M NOW GOING TO BE OVER AN HOUR LATE BECAUSE 2 3 EVEN -- I HAD TO WALK 20 MINUTES BECAUSE A CONNECTION DIDN'T HAPPEN RIGHT AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I I'M PHYSICALLY 4 5 CAPABLE OF DOING, AND NOT EVERYONE IS, AND THEN I GOT OFF THE BART, AND I'M HERE AND MY BUS DIDN'T COME, SO NOW I'M TRYING 6 TO AT THIS MOMENT FIGURE OUT IF I SHOULD WALK, WHICH IS 7 8 ANOTHER HALF HOUR OF WALKING UP A PRETTY IMPRESSIVE LITTLE BRIDGE, OR IF I NEED TO BE EVEN LATER AND WAIT FOR THE BUS. 9 10 SO, YOU AREN'T GIVING PEOPLE ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING, AND EVEN THOSE OF US WHO ARE TRYING REAL HARD TO DO IT, AND LOOKING AT 11 OTHER REVENUE SOURCES, BECAUSE YOU HAVE TO FIX THE BRIDGES, 12 THAT'S JUST THE REAL THING, LOOKING AT OTHER SOURCES, I THINK, 13 IS SOMETHING THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED MORE SERIOUSLY. 14 15 LOOKING AT EMPLOYERS WHO MAKE PEOPLE COME TO WORK IF THEY 16 HAVE, LIKE, INTO THE OFFICE WHEN THEY HAVE JOBS THAT CAN AND 17 SUCCESSFULLY HAVE BEEN PERFORMED REMOTELY OR OTHER THINGS. I JUST THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU. 18

19

20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU CALLER. NEXT WE HAVE VINAY
21 PIMPLE. IF YOU CAN PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TWO MINUTES
22 BEGINS NOW.

23

24 VINAY PIMPLE: HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, I SERVE ON THE POLICY
25 ADVISORY COUNCIL. I THINK THIS MAY HAVE BEEN DISCUSSED AT AN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

EARLIER MEETING. BUT I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE EXTRA 1 COST OF INVOICING, ET CETERA, IS ACTUALLY JUST PASSING THE 2 3 COST ON OF ADMINISTERING IT, AND IS NOT A FORM OF A FINE FOR NOT USING THE FASTRAK. AND THE SECOND THING IS, AND YOU KNOW, 4 5 AS SOMEBODY WHO HAS LIVED ELSEWHERE, WHAT HAS ALWAYS STRUCK ME ABOUT THE BAY AREA, AND ITS TRANSPORTATION STUFF, IS THAT WE 6 DON'T REALLY HAVE ANY SEASON PASSES. LIKE, YOU JUST BUY A 7 8 SEASON PASS FOR A MONTH, IN BOMBAY WHERE I COME FROM, THERE ARE REALLY HEAVY DISCOUNTS FOR MONTHLY PASSES. AND, AGAIN, 9 WITH THE BRIDGE, IT'S REALLY A TRICKY THING, BECAUSE ON THE 10 ONE HAND WE DON'T WANT PEOPLE TO USE THEM VERY MUCH BECAUSE WE 11 WOULD RATHER THEM USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. BUT ON THE OTHER 12 HAND WE ACTUAL ALSO FEEL BAD ABOUT CHARGING THEM STUFF THEY 13 MIGHT NOT BE ABLE TO AFFORD, BUT YOU DON'T EVEN HAVE SEIZE AN 14 TICKETS FOR BART OR FOR THE BUSES. SO JUST LIKE START 15 16 SOMETIMES TO CONSIDER, OR MAYBE THERE ARE REASONS WHY THOSE --WHY STAFF DOESN'T CONSIDER THOSE -- OR HAVE CONSIDERED THEM 17 AND NOT CONSIDER THEM ANYMORE? SO THAT -- I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW 18 THAT AT SOME POINT. THANK YOU. 19

20

21 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU CALLER. THERE IS NO FURTHER
22 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM
23 WISHING TO SPEAK.

24



V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. I'LL CLOSE PUBLIC 1 COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR A MOTION AND A 2 3 SECOND. [LAUGHTER] 4 5 HILLARY RONEN: I MOVE TO SEND THE ITEM TO THE FULL BOARD. 6 7 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. 8 9 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECONDS. 10 11 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: MOTION BY COMMISSIONER RONEN. SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. IF THERE IS NO FURTHER 12 DISCUSSION, DO WE NEED TO DO A ROLL CALL VOTE? THANK YOU. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I'LL GO AHEAD AND CALL THE ROLL CALL VOTE 15 16 CHAIR GLOVER. 17 18 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: YES. 19 CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA? 20 21 22 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: FLEMING? 24

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



VICTORIA FLEMING: YES. 1 2 3 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY? 4 5 NATHAN MILEY: YES. 6 7 CLERK OF THE BOARD: PAPAN? 8 9 GINA PAPAN: YES. 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN? 11 12 HILLARY RONEN: YES. 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 15 16 PRESENT. 17 18 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. MOVING 19 TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER BUSINESS. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON A NON-AGENDAIZED 20 21 ITEM? 22 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK. ALETA DUPREE, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. 24 YOUR TWO MINUTES BEGINS NOW. 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

1

DECEMBER 11, 2024

2 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, CHAIR MARGARET ABE-KOGA. ALETA DUPREE, FOR 3 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER REPRESENTING TEAM FOLD. GOOD MEETING TODAY. AS I WATCH WHAT'S GOING ON THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY, 4 5 OKLAHOMA, I HAVE READ HAS NOW MADE ALL ITS TURNPIKES, I THINK THERE ARE 12 OF THEM, THEY'RE ALL -- ALL OF THOSE TURNPIKES 6 ARE NOW ALL ELECTRONIC TOLLS. THAT'S -- [INDISCERNIBLE] AND 7 8 THERE IS TOLL BOOTH DEMOLITION THAT IS HAPPENING IN THE NEW YORK AREA ON THE NEW JERSEY SIDE, FOR THE PORT AUTHORITY 9 CROSSING THAT'S AN ONGOING PROJECT. AND HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE 10 INTERESTED IN NEW THINGS? CERTAINLY TIERED PRICING HELPS. 11 BECAUSE I THINK IN NEW YORK, FASTRAK, THEY CALL THESE EASY 12 PASSES, OVER 90%, AND THEY HAVE PRETTY GOOD RECOVERY IN NEW 13 YORK, BOTH FROM INCENTIVES AND ALSO FROM ENFORCEMENT. AND 14 15 USING THE BRIDGES, AS WITH ANY PUBLIC HIGHWAY, IS NOT A RIGHT, 16 BUT IT IS A PRIVILEGE. PART OF THAT PRIVILEGE COMES FROM PAYING TOLLS, ALONG WITH FOLLOWING ALL THE APPLICABLE SECTIONS 17 OF VEHICLE AND TRAFFIC LAWS. HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE INTERESTED 18 IN DOING FASTRAK? IF I HAD A CAR, I WOULD BE DOING IT. I DID 19 IT WHEN I LIVED IN OKLAHOMA. IT'S CALLED PIKE PASS, THIS WAS 20 IN 1991 IT WAS ONE OF THE FIRST PROGRAMS TRANSPONDERS IN THE 21 UNITED STATES PAYING TOLLS DIDN'T HAVE TO CARRY MONEY ANYMORE 22 AND IT REQUIRES ENFORCEMENT EVEN BACK IN THE DAYS WHEN YOU HAD 23 HUMAN COLLECTIVE TOLL EVASION IN NEW YORK AND NEW JERSEY, ALL 24 THE TIME THAT'S WHY THEY TOOK THEM THOSE OUT. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU CALLER. THERE IS NO FURTHER 2 3 PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM SPACE NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED. 4 5 V. CHAIR, MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. NEXT MEETING OF THE 6 7 BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE 8 HELD AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN 9 FRANCISCO WEDNESDAY JANUARY 8TH, 2025 ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED. 10 THANK YOU. THANK YOU, CHAIR. 11 12 13 CHAIR, FEDERAL GLOVER: THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED] 14

