METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 24TH, 2024, 9:45 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M GOING TO
6	CALL TO ORDER THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. MY
7	NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR, ALONG WITH NICK JOSEFOWITZ,
8	OUR VICE CHAIR. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE.
9	LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL, PLEASE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?
12	
13	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. ABE-
16	KOGA
17	
18	SPEAKER: [INDISCERNIBLE] IS HERE.
19	
20	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. LET ME JUST CORRECT MY NOTES.
21	THANK YOU, GENERAL COUNSEL. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
22	
23	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
24	
25	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?



1	
2	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
5	
6	DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?
9	
10	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
13	
14	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I'M HERE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
17	FLEMING?
18	
19	VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GIACOPINI?
22	
23	DOREEN GIACOPINI: HERE.
24	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GLOVER?
	,



1	
2	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
5	
6	NATHAN MILEY: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON PETERS? COMMISSIONER NOACK?
9	
10	SUE NOACK: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
13	
14	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?
17	,
	DAVID RABBITT: HERE.
19	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN?
	CHERRY RIFIDEREIT WARD. ROWEN:
21	HILLARY DOMEN. HERE
	HILLARY RONEN: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SCHAFF?



LIBBY SCHAFF: HERE. 1 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING? 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING: HERE. 6 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER THAO? IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A 8 OUORUM. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO 10 11 PROCEED TO ITEM TWO, CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. AND WE DO HAVE A RESOLUTION, 4628 APPRECIATION FOR LEAH ZIPPERT ON HER OCCASION 12 OF RETIREMENT FROM MTC ABAG AFTER 23 YEARS OF SERVICE. WE 13 DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO RECOUNT ALL OF LEAH'S 14 15 ACCOMPLISHMENTS FROM OUR COMBINED TIME WITH ABAG AND MTC. BUT 16 I DO WANT TO SHARE A FEW PASSAGES FROM THIS RESOLUTION. WHEREAS LEAH IS RETIRING AFTER 20 YEARS OF DEDICATED AND 17 OUTSTANDING SERVICE TO THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION 18 COMMISSION AND ABAG AS COMMUNICATIONS PUBLIC INFORMATION 19 LANGUAGE LOGISTICS EXPERT WHEREAS LEAH BEGAN WORKING AT ABAG 20 21 IN 2000 AS A COMMUNICATIONS OFFICER, WAS PROMOTED TO SENIOR COMMUNICATIONS OFFICER IN 2015, THEN JOINED MTC AS A SENIOR 22 23 PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER IN 2017. WHEREAS AN ORGANIZER AND ORCHESTRATOR OF ABAG GENERAL ASSEMBLY MEETINGS FOR OVER 20 24

YEARS -- THANK YOU -- LEAH PLANNED AND SEAMLESSLY EXECUTED



- 1 OVER THERE 30 ASSEMBLIES, DURING WHICH TIME SHE ESTABLISHED AS
- 2 THE VOICE OF ABAG COMMUNICATION. I JUST WANT TO UNDERSCORE
- 3 COMMUNICATIONS DURING THE ERA OF SOCIAL MEDIA WAS SO CRITICAL.
- 4 SOMETIMES WE JUST GO, GO, AND FORGET HOW CRITICAL IT IS THAT
- 5 PEOPLE LIKE YOU IN THAT VOICE OF COMMON SENSE AND CLARITY WHEN
- 6 IT'S NEEDED FOR PUBLIC CONSUMPTION. NOT ON THE SCRIPT. JUST
- 7 WANTED TO SAY THAT. WHEREAS IN THE COURSE OF ORGANIZING THE
- 8 ABAG AWARDS PROGRAM AT MANY ABAG EXECUTIVE RETREATS LEAH HONED
- 9 HER SKILLS IN BOARD MEMBER COMMUNICATIONS, EVENT PLANNING,
- 10 WRITING SPEECHES, NAVIGATING AD-HOC COMMITTEES -- WHICH WE DO
- 11 THAT OFTEN -- SCOUTING VENUES, CATERERS, REVIEWING
- 12 APPLICATIONS, WORKING WITH LOCAL PHOTOGRAPHERS AND SO MUCH
- 13 MORE. SO, NOW WE RESOLVE STAFF AND THE COMMISSION THANK LEAH
- 14 FOR HER 23 YEARS OF SERVICE TO THE AGENCY AND THE PEOPLE OF
- 15 THE BAY AREA AND HEREBY AUTHORIZE HER TO INTEGRATE TO THE
- 16 OXFORD, BLOCK INTO WRITING, WE WISH LEAH AND HER HUSBAND CHRIS
- 17 AND CHILDREN ANDREW AND CATHERINE ARE VERY HEALTHY, HAPPY, AND
- 18 WELL DESERVED NEXT CHAPTER INCLUDING TRAVEL TO THE WEST COAST
- 19 AND TO WASHINGTON, D.C., HOUSE PROJECTS AND NOTIONS OF ENSUING
- 20 RELATED TO ENJOYING TIME TOGETHER WITH HER FAMILY. SO,
- 21 CONGRATULATIONS. [APPLAUSE] THE FLOOR IS YOURS.
- 23 LEAH ZIPPERT: THANK YOU. AND AS YOUR AGENDA IS PACKED, I'LL
- 24 TRY TO KEEP IT SHORT. AND MY NOTES ARE DISAPPEARING ON ME. SO
- 25 REALLY, REALLY SHORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THIS



- 1 RECOGNITION. AS THE RESOLUTION SAYS, MY FIRST JOB OUT OF
- 2 COLLEGE WAS AN UNPAID INTERNSHIP WITH ABAG'S ESTUARY PROJECT
- 3 WRITING A FACT SHEET ABOUT THEIR GOVERNMENT PARTNERS. WHO KNEW
- 4 THAT WOULD SHAPE THE REST OF MY LIFE? CERTAINLY NOT ME. I WENT
- 5 ON TO DO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON DEPARTMENT OF TOXIC
- 6 SUBSTANCES CONTROL CLEAN-UP PROJECTS AND ON TO CALTRANS
- 7 HIGHWAY WORK, THEN DOING MARKETING AND PR FOR ARCHITECTS AND
- 8 ENGINEERS. WHEN I STARTED AT ABAG IN NOVEMBER OF 2000 WITH AN
- 9 ACTUAL PAYCHECK, I HAD NO IDEA I WOULD BE HERE IN EARLY 2024
- 10 RETIRING. IT WAS GOING TO BE A GOING BACK TO MY ROOTS JOB. BUT
- 11 I DIDN'T KNOW THAT IT WOULD BE MY CAREER. ONE OF THE VERY
- 12 FIRST PROJECTS AT ABAG WAS TO EDIT AND GET THIS HANDBOOK
- 13 ENTITLED "BLUEPRINT FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN IMPLEMENTING THE
- 14 HOUSING" -- YOU WOULD THINK AFTER 23 YEARS I WOULD HAVE THAT
- 15 ACRONYM DOWN PAT. "REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION" --
- 16 PRINTED AND DISTRIBUTED TO LOCAL GOVERNMENTS. AND HERE WE ARE,
- 17 23 YEARS LATER, AND I'M STILL EDITING DOCUMENTS ON HOW TO
- 18 IMPLEMENT RHNA, WITH THE VERY SAME CONSULTANTS. AT LEAST NOW
- 19 WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DO MUCH MORE TO ASSIST LOCAL GOVERNMENTS
- 20 WITH THE REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL NEEDS -- IT, AGAIN,
- 21 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. PROJECTS SUCH AS THE 23 TECHNICAL
- 22 ASSISTANCE WEBINARS THAT I HELPED PRODUCE OVER THE PAST THREE
- 23 YEARS NOW DRAW PLANNERS FROM AROUND THE STATE AS WELL AS OUR
- 24 REGION. ALONG THE WAY, I HAVE WORKED WITH 11 ABAG PRESIDENTS,
- 25 AND ELECTED OFFICIALS FROM THROUGHOUT THE REGION, SIX



- 1 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, AND MANY, MANY AMAZING PEOPLE ON A
- 2 VARIETY OF PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE AGENCIES. MORE RECENTLY, I
- 3 HAVE BEEN COLLABORATING WITH THE BAHFA TEAM WHICH YOU HEARD
- 4 FROM EARLIER THIS MORNING IN YOUR WEARING OF YOUR OTHER HAT.
- 5 FOR THOSE OF YOU THAT SERVED ON ABAG YOU WILL MOST LIKELY BE
- 6 FAMILIAR WITH THE GA GENERAL ASSEMBLY. I WORE A PRODUCERS HAT
- 7 ON 36 OF THOSE GENERAL ASSEMBLIES, PLUS SPECIAL ONES. AND WE
- 8 DISCUSSED ALL SORTS OF TOPICS, RELEVANT TO THE BAY AREA,
- 9 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, WATER AND LAND USE PLANNING, PLANNED BAY
- 10 AREA ENERGY EFFICIENCY, AND, OF COURSE, HOUSING, MANY, MANY
- 11 TIMES. OTHER EVENTS HAVE INCLUDED ABAG 40TH, JOINT ABAG 50th,
- 12 MTC 40th, AND THE ABAG 60th, WHICH MAKES IT SEEM LIKE I HAVE
- 13 BEEN HERE FOR MUCH, MUCH LONGER THAN I ALREADY HAVE. WHEN I
- 14 STARTED, MY HUSBAND AND I HAD BEEN MARRIED FOR SIX YEARS AND
- 15 WERE DINKS. LIVING IN A CUTE APARTMENT OFF PIEDMONT AVENUE, A
- 16 [INDISCERNIBLE] AREA IN OAKLAND. WE WILL BE CELEBRATING OUR
- 17 30th ANNIVERSARY LATER THIS YEAR AND NOW HAVE TWO CHILDREN,
- 18 ONE IS A JUNIOR IN COLLEGE AND THE OTHER A JUNIOR IN HIGH
- 19 SCHOOL. WE GAINED OUR OWN FAMILY AND LOST OUR PARENTS ALONG
- 20 THE WAY. WE WERE VETTED BY MY WORK COLLEAGUES FOR THE GOOD AND
- 21 SUPPORTED DURING CHALLENGING TIMES. IN PARTICULAR, THE MTC
- 22 PAID FAMILY LEAVE POLICY MADE IT POSSIBLE FOR ME TO BE THERE
- 23 TO HELP MY MOTHER THROUGH HER PANCREATIC AND LUNG CANCER
- 24 JOURNEY TREATMENT IN 2020 AND 2021. I AM VERY, VERY GRATEFUL
- 25 FOR THE POLICIES THAT SUPPORTED ME, AND OTHERS, DURING THE



- 1 CHALLENGES TIMES LIKE THAT, AND I AM NOT SURE WHAT ME AND MY
- 2 FAMILY WOULD HAVE DONE WITHOUT THAT OPTION. THANK YOU VERY
- 3 MUCH FOR SUPPORTING YOUR STAFF. WHILE I AM LOOKING FORWARD TO
- 4 SPENDING MY DAY TODAY A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENTLY, I WILL FONDLY
- 5 REMEMBER MY TIME HERE AND THE PEOPLE I WORKED WITH. THANK YOU
- 6 VERY MUCH. [APPLAUSE]

7

- 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS. AND WHAT
- 9 I JUST REALLY WANT TO TAKE NOTE IS HOW YOU HUMANIZE THIS
- 10 ORGANIZATION AROUND NOT JUST THE WORK OUTCOMES, BUT HOW WE
- 11 SUPPORT PEOPLE AND THE JOURNEY WE'RE ON TOGETHER. SO THANK YOU
- 12 FOR BRINGING LIGHT TO THAT. IT'S NOT SOMETHING WE SPEND A LOT
- 13 OF TIME ON BUT IT'S CRITICAL TO THE PEOPLE THAT MAKE
- 14 ORGANIZATION WORK. WE UNFORTUNATELY DO HAVE TO ACCEPT THIS
- 15 MOTION FOR THE RESOLUTION. LOOKING FOR A MOTION.

16

17 JAMES P. SPERING: SPERING MOVES.

18

- 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY SPERING AND SECOND BY GLOVER.
- 20 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

21

- 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I
- 23 SEE NO ONE IN THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND NO ONE
- 24 HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION BY SPERING
2	FOR RESOLUTION 4628, SECOND BY GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?
5	
6	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?
9	
10	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AYE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
13	
14	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
17	
18	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
19	
20	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
21	
22	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?
25	



1	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
4	
5	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
8	
9	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GLOVER?
12	
13	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
16	
17	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON PETERS?
20	
21	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?
24	
25	SUE NOACK: YES.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN? 3 GINA PAPAN: YES. 4 5 6 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? 7 8 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN? COMMISSIONER SPERING? 10 11 COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 12 13 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO 14 PROCEED TO ITEM THREE, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. RANDI. 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU ARE MUTED, RANDI. 17 18 RANDI KINMAN: OKAY. WE HAVE GOTTEN THE MUTE, UNMUTE RESOLVED 19 HERE. THIS REPORT IS A SECOND REPORT FROM OUR LAST MEETING. WE 20 21 HAVE NOT MET AGAIN SINCE I LAST SAW YOU. IT'S BROKEN DOWN INTO 22 SOME BULLET POINTS FOR REFERENCE SO THAT YOU CAN UNDERSTAND OUR CONCERNS AND OUR COMMENTS ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA AS WE SAW 23 IT, AND POTENTIAL REVENUE MEASURES THAT WERE COMING UP 24 REGARDING TRANSIT. WE ESPECIALLY DID NOT WANT TO HEAR THE



- 1 WORDS THAT IMPLY THAT WE ARE LOOKING AT ONLY GOING BACK TO
- 2 BASELINE SERVICES. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THE COMMUNITY
- 3 ACTUALLY JUST DOES NOT WANT TO HEAR. THE ONE THING I DID WANT
- 4 TO HIGHLIGHT, HOWEVER, IS THAT THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
- 5 SUBCOMMITTEE HAD A REALLY ROBUST DISCUSSION ON THE ONE-SEAT
- 6 RIDE PROGRAM. THEY LISTENED TO A PRESENTATION REGARDING THE
- 7 PROGRAM THAT IS IN ACTION IN ANOTHER CAMP -- I'M SORRY. I HAVE
- 8 GOT THE HICCUPS. AND WHAT THAT CAME OUT OF IT WAS THAT THIS IS
- 9 AN EXAMPLE FOR THE HOW TO DO ONE-SEAT RIDE EQUITABLY AND
- 10 BROUGHT OUT THE ISSUES THAT ONE-SEAT RIDE IS A REALLY -- IS A
- 11 REALLY COMPLICATED THING, BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT PARATRANSIT
- 12 USERS NEED TO HAVE ESPECIALLY WHEN LOOKING AT ACCESS TO SAN
- 13 FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, SAN JOSE, AND OTHER REGIONAL AIRPORTS. IT
- 14 MAKES IT REALLY DIFFICULT WHEN YOU HAVE TO SWITCH RIDES IN
- 15 BETWEEN AND YOU'RE LEADING FROM YOUR HOUSE TO AN AIRPORT
- 16 THAT'S OUT OF YOUR AREA. COMMITTEE MEMBERS ALSO REQUESTED MORE
- 17 DETAILS ABOUT WHAT MTC'S PLANS ARE FOR INFORMING COMMUNITY
- 18 MEMBERS ABOUT THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT
- 19 WOULD LOOK LIKE AND WE HOPEFULLY WILL HAVE A MARK UP OF THAT
- 20 IN THE VICINITY SO THAT EVERYBODY CAN SEE WHAT THE NEW PROGRAM
- 21 LOOKS LIKE. THAT WRAPS UP MY REPORT SINCE IT'S A DUPLICATE
- 22 FROM MY LAST PRESENTATION, AND YOU WILL SEE SOMEBODY NEW NEXT
- 23 MONTH.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU RANDI. DO WE HAVE ANY 1 QUESTIONS FOR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT? I DO NOT SEE 2 3 ANY. TO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. WE HAVE A COUPLE OF MEMBERS FROM THE PUBLIC. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE? 6 7 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ONE MINUTE. IS THIS FOR THE POLICY 9 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT? 10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AS FAR AS I KNOW. FIRST IS NAOMI 11 SHIPLAP. 12 13 SPEAKER: I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS THE RIGHT TIME TO TALK. 14 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THIS IS FOR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING. REPORT. 17 18 SPEAKER: I WAS LOOKING AT 3B, YOUR AGENDA. 19 20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I THINK YOU MIGHT BE ON THE WRONG AGENDA 21 22 WE'RE ON THE COMMISSION AGENDA ITEM 3A WHICH IS THE POLICY 23 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. 24

SPEAKER: OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON 3B.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE IS NOT A 3B ON THIS AGENDA.
3	
4	SPEAKER: OKAY. THANK YOU.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SO, THE NEXT SPEAKER IS WARREN C. GO
7	AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
8	
9	SPEAKER: HELLO EVERYBODY WARREN CUSHMAN COMMUNITY RESOURCES
10	INDEPENDENT LIVING HAYWARD. I WANT TO ELUCIDATE THE IMPORTANCE
11	OF THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY AND PARATRANSIT. AND THE
12	IMPORTANCE OF THE ONE-SEAT RIDE PROCESS. AND THE PARATRANSIT
13	REFORMS THAT OUR MTC STAFF IS MOVING FORWARD WITH, AND ALSO
14	THE WAYFINDING PROJECT AS IT RELATES TO PEOPLE WITH
15	DISABILITIES. AND THEN THE WHOLE DISABILITY PACKAGE. IT'S KEY
16	THAT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES CONNECT WITH THESE PROJECTS, AND
17	I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT THE COMMISSION IS HEARING ABOUT THEM. I
18	AM INVESTED IN THEM, AND AS WE MOVE FORWARD, PARATRANSIT
19	REFORM AND A CRISP WAYFINDING PROCESS THAT HELPS PEOPLE WITH
20	DISABILITIES IS NECESSARY. THANK YOU.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
23	RAISED.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU RANDI FOR YOUR 1 2 REPORT. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR, THE EXECUTIVE 3 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. MR. FREMIER, TAKE IT AWAY. 4 5 ANDREW FREMIER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR PEDROZA AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. REAL QUICKLY, 6 I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT WE CONTINUE TO BRING MORE 7 8 PEOPLE INTO THE BUILDING THAN WE LOSE. WE HAVE FIVE NEW APPOINTMENTS TO INTRODUCE HERE. I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT 9 SANDY GUERRA, IN PARTICULAR, SHE'S JOINING OUR EXECUTIVE TEAM 10 AS ADMINISTRATIVE SUPPORT SUPERVISOR. SHE'LL BE ASSISTING YOU 11 GUYS A LOT WITH THE WORK THAT YOU ALL NEED TO DO WITH US. ONE 12 OF THESE DAYS HOPEFULLY WE'LL GET HER INTRODUCED TO YOU 13 PERSONALLY, AND I THINK YOU WILL FIND HER A GEM. I ALSO WANT 14 15 TO ACKNOWLEDGE LOSING LEAH IS A TOUGH ONE. SHE REPRESENTS SOME 16 OF THE BEST THINGS ABOUT THE CONSOLIDATION WITH ABAG STAFF. WE WORKED IN THE SAME BUILDING FOR TEN YEARS OVER IN OAKLAND, AND 17 I DIDN'T REALLY GET THE CHANCE TO INTERFACE WITH HER. BUT THE 18 FIVE YEARS SHE'S BEEN HERE, SHE'S BEEN AN INCREDIBLE, VALUABLE 19 TOOL AND REALLY TO REALLY KIND OF BOND AT TWO AGENCIES IS 20 REALLY REPRESENTED BY THAT, AND LEAH'S DEPARTURE IS A BIG ONE. 21 SO, WE'RE SORRY TO SEE THAT. MOVING ON TO ACTIVITIES. THERE 22 WERE SOME GOOD ONES THIS MONTH. COMMISSIONERS EL-TAWANSY AND 23 SPERING AND I, ALONG WITH OUR STAFF AND THE WETA STAFF, TOOK 24

ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE CHAIR LORI WILSON ON A BOAT



- 1 TOUR, PRIMARILY TO GET HER TO SEE THE BRIDGES FROM UNDERNEATH,
- 2 REALLY TO GET HER TO UNDERSTAND HOW COMPLICATED AND HOW
- 3 IMPORTANT THE STRUCTURES ARE. I CONTINUE TO BE IMPRESSED WITH
- 4 HER ENGAGEMENT IN THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING AND HER INTEREST
- 5 IN BEING A SUPPORT FOR US. THAT CONTINUED DEVELOPMENT OF A
- 6 RELATIONSHIP IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. ON JANUARY 9TH, REBECCA
- 7 AND I HAD OPPORTUNITY TO GET A TOUR OF THE HIGH SPEED RAIL
- 8 WORK THAT'S GOING ON IN THE CENTRAL VALLEY. UNFORTUNATELY AS
- 9 WE HAVE ALL HEARD BRIAN KELLY HAS DECIDED TO FIND GREENER
- 10 PASTURES WHICH I THINK IS A BIG LOSS BUT IT WAS NICE TO SEE
- 11 THE FACT THAT THEY ARE MOVING FORWARD AND ANTICIPATE AT LEAST
- 12 REVENUE SERVICE IN THE VALLEY BY 2030. THEY HAVE A LOT OF
- 13 CHALLENGES STILL AHEAD OF THEM AND THE PACHECO PASS LOOKS
- 14 DAUNTING. BUT MORE TO COME. WE TALK ABOUT THE EXPANSION OF THE
- 15 CLIPPER START PILOT PROGRAM WHICH IS INCLUDES VTA AND ALSO A
- 16 COMMON UNIFORM 50% DISCOUNT FOR RIDES ON THE SYSTEM THAT
- 17 CREATES ONE OF THE BEST THINGS WE CAN DO IN TERMS OF SEAMLESS
- 18 WORK CREATING A REAL SIMPLE STORY TO TELL THE PUBLIC AND SO
- 19 GETTING VTA ON BOARD GETTING ALL THE REST OF THE OPERATORS TO
- 20 GOAT TO A STANDARD DISCOUNT WAS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT BUT JUST
- 21 AS A REMINDER IT'S ONLY FUNDED THROUGH JUNE OF 2025. SOMETHING
- 22 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO KEEP AN EYE ON TO CONTINUE THAT WORK. A
- 23 GOOD NEWS STORY, THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE NORTHERN CAM
- 24 CAL CHAPTER OF THE CONFERENCE MINORITY TRANSPORTATION
- 25 OFFICIALS COMTO SELECTED OUR VERY OWN DENISE BLAKE WHO RUNS



- 1 THE BUILDING FOR US HERE AND ALL OF OUR GENERAL SERVICES AS
- 2 THEIR INTERIM PRESIDENT AND SO SHE'LL TAKE ON THAT ROLE IN
- 3 2024 WE'RE PROUD TO HAVE HER IN THAT PLACE AND SHE HAS
- 4 CONTINUED TO REPRESENT THE AND THE INDUSTRY. WE'RE PROUD OF
- 5 THAT. MONDAY CHAIR PEDROZA AND MYSELF AND REBECCA ATTENDED THE
- 6 WORKSHOP WITH THE BAY AREA CAUCUS SUPPORTED SENATOR WIENER
- 7 AROUND THE LEGISLATION THAT WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT SHORTLY IT
- 8 WAS ATTENDED BY CAUCUS MEMBERS AND A LOT OF GOOD INPUT
- 9 PARTICULARLY ANOTHER PLACE WHERE COMMITTEE CHAIR LAURIE WILSON
- 10 WAS THERE AND CONTINUES TO SUPPORT EFFORTS. FINALLY I WANT TO
- 11 ADVERTISE THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP HOSTING STATE
- 12 OF THE ESTUARY CONFERENCE MARCH 12TH AND WEDNESDAY MARCH 13TH
- 13 OVER IN OAKLAND. CAITLIN AND HER TEAM DO A GREAT JOB THEY HAVE
- 14 A STAR STUDDED GROUP OF SPEAKERS. WE LOOK FORWARD TO THAT
- 15 WORK. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY OUESTIONS.

16

- 17 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.
- 18 COMMISSIONERS ANY OUESTIONS. I DO APPRECIATE SENATOR WIENER IN
- 19 THE FOR KINDNESS IN THE OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE TO HAVE THIS
- 20 DISCUSSION WORKING COLLABORATIVELY ON FINDING WAYS TO ADDRESS
- 21 THE ISSUES FACING OUR TRANSIT RIDERS. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC
- 22 COMMENT ON OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?

- 24 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
- 25 FOR THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC



1	COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED
2	HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: PROCEEDING TO OUR NEXT ITEM,
5	COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. COMMISSIONERS, ANY COMMENTS? ALL RIGHT
6	WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS INCLUDES
7	ITEM 6A THROUGH 6H. IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS FROM
8	COMMISSIONERS? I DO NOT SEE ANY. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE PUBLIC
9	COMMENT ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I
12	SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.
13	
14	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT IF THERE IS
15	NO DISCUSSION I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE OUR CONSENT
16	CALENDAR.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SORRY MR. CHAIR. SOMEONE RAISED THEIR
19	HAND AS I WAS SPEAKING.
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: LET'S TAKE THE COMMENT.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JORDAN ARE YOU ASKING TO SPEAK ON THE
24	CONSENT CALENDAR?



1	SPEAKER: IS ITEM 7A ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NO IT'S NOT.
4	
5	SPEAKER: THEN SORRY ABOUT THAT H.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU.
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: BRING IT BACK LOOKING FOR A MOTION.
10	
11	SPEAKER: MOVE CONSENT.
12	
13	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I HEARD SOMEONE OVER HERE.
14	
15	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: MOULTON-PETERS.
16	
17	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MOULTON-PETERS. SECOND CHAVEZ.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PEDROZA?
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ? ABE-KOGA?
24	
25	MADCADET ARE-KOCA · AVE



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
3	
4	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
7	
8	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?
11	
12	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
15	
16	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
19	
20	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GLOVER?
23	
24	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY? 1 2 3 NATHAN MILEY: YES. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS? COMMISSIONER NOACK? PAPAN? COMMISSIONER RABBITT? COMMISSIONER RONEN? COMMISSIONER 6 SPERING? COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES 7 8 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. 10 WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO OUR COMMITTEE REPORTS. FIRST UP IS 11 ITEM SEVEN. THIS IS A JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. 12 I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA, AND I'LL 13 NOTE WE HAD A ROBUST CONVERSATION DISCUSSED AT THE COMMITTEE 14 LEVEL AS WELL. TURNING IT OVER TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA. 15 16 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR PEDROZA. THE JOINT MTC 17 ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET JANUARY 12TH, 2024 AND REFERRED 18 TWO ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION AS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AGENDA 19 ITEM 7A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, ENABLING LEGISLATION 20 21 PROVIDES AN OUTLINE OF PROPOSED LEGISLATION ENABLING MTCS TO PLACE A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE ON THE 22 BALLOT. I BELIEVE STAFF HAS A PRESENTATION OUEUED UP TO RECAP 23 THE LEGISLATION THE COMMISSION IS BEING ASKED TO SPONSOR 24

TODAY. AND HAS ALSO PREPARED A HANDOUT TO INFORM OUR



- 1 DISCUSSION OF USE OF MEASURE PROCEEDS FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING.
- 2 THIS ITEM GARNERED HEALTHY DEBATE AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING AND
- 3 STAFF COMMITTED TO BRING IT BACK TO THIS FULL BODY FOR MORE
- 4 DISCUSSION. AT THIS TIME I'LL TURN IT OVER TO REBECCA LONG TO
- 5 PRESENT THIS ITEM.

- 7 ANDREW FREMIER: CHAIR CANEPA IF YOU DO NOT MIND, I WOULD LIKE
- 8 TO DO A FEW OPENING COMMENTS ANDREW FREMIER. I WANT TO BE
- 9 CLEAR ON WHAT YOU JUST DESCRIBED AND WHAT WE'RE ASKING TODAY.
- 10 WE DO HAVE A HANDOUT THAT WE PUT OUT LATE LAST EVENING THAT
- 11 TRIES TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE DISCUSSION THAT WAS HAPPENING AT
- 12 THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE IT IS NOT NECESSARY TO MOVE FORWARD
- 13 THIS ITEM AS THE HANDOUT STATE THE ITEM YOU WILL GET A
- 14 PRESENTATION AND BREAK DOWN FROM REBECCA ON IS REALLY
- 15 SOMETHING THAT I THINK IS IMPORTANT FOR US TO MOVE FORWARD AND
- 16 IT'S THE COMMITMENT TO SUPPORT THE WIENER LEGISLATION THAT IS
- 17 IN THE EARLY STAGES OF DEVELOPMENT BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SPEND A
- 18 MINUTE ON THE HANDOUT BEFORE REBECCA GOES INTO THE
- 19 PRESENTATION. WE TRIED TO BRACKET THE CONVERSATION WITH THREE
- 20 OPTIONS THAT REALLY GO FROM YOU CAN BUILD WHAT YOU NEED TO
- 21 BUILD THAT YOU THINK IS IMPORTANT TO REALLY YOU SHOULDN'T
- 22 BUILD ANYTHING ON THE HIGHWAY SYSTEM. A LITTLE BIT OF
- 23 GOLDILOCKS IN OUR ANSWER IS TO TRY TO COME UP WITH SOMETHING
- 24 THAT WE THINK ALLOWS FOR KEY INVESTMENT IN MOBILITY CORRIDORS
- 25 THAT ARE IMPORTANT AND THEY INCLUDE PROJECTS LIKE STATE ROUTE



37. THEY ALSO INCLUDE A LOT OF THE INVESTMENTS WE HAVE TALKED 1 ABOUT IN THE EXPRESS LANE NETWORK. WE DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT 2 3 TO MAKE SURE THESE PROJECTS REPRESENT OUR CLIMATE GOALS, VERY SPECIFICALLY, AND THAT WILL BE A CHALLENGE. WE DO THINK THAT 4 5 THEY NEED TO BE VETTED VERY CLOSELY AND THAT HAVING NEW GENERAL PURPOSE LANES IS NOT WHERE WE'RE TRYING TO GET TO, BUT 6 TO GET INTO PRICE AND BUS OR HOV TYPE INVESTMENTS. SO THAT'S 7 8 WHAT IT TRIES TO JUST PUT ON THE TABLE FOR YOU. I DO RECOMMEND THAT SECOND OPTION, BUT IT'S CLEARLY UP FOR YOU ALL TO 9 DISCUSS. THE MAIN POINT, AND MAIN SHOW, WHICH I'LL TURN OVER 10 TO REBECCA, IS TO TALK ABOUT THE WIENER LEGISLATION, THE FACT 11 WE WOULD LIKE TO SPONSOR IT AND WOULD LIKE YOU TO RECOMMEND 12 THAT AND ALLOW US TO GET GOING ONSET YOU THINK THE SUPPORT 13 EFFORTS BOTH IN COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT AS 14 15 WELL AS CONTINUED LEADERSHIP INPUT SO THAT AS THAT BILL MOVES 16 THROUGH ITS COURSE FROM FEBRUARY TO JULY, WE'RE IN GOOD SHAPE FOR PUTTING THAT ON THE MEASURE, ON THE BALLOT, IN NOVEMBER. 17 SO, WITH THAT, 26 -- REBECCA, GO AHEAD. THANK YOU, ALIX. 18 19 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU, ANDY. REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF 20 LEGISLATION PUBLIC AFFAIRS. THANK YOU FOR PULLING UP THE 21 SLIDES. IN YOUR PACKET YOU HAVE A LOT OF MATERIAL. THERE IS 22 SOME UPDATED ITEMS AS EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR JUST DESCRIBED AS FAR 23 AS THE HIGHWAY ELEMENT. THEN A SUMMARY SHEET SPECIFIC TO TODAY 24

AND THEN MATERIALS FROM THE LEG COMMITTEE. I'M GOING TO KIND



- 1 OF REVIEW SOME OF THE THINGS MENTIONED IN THE SUMMARY SHEET
- 2 FOR TODAY, BUT AGAIN THE ACTION ITEM THAT WE'RE ASKING IS FOR
- 3 YOU TO ENDORSE STAFF PURSUING, THE AGENCY PURSUING SPONSORSHIP
- 4 OF THIS REVENUE MEASURE THAT SENATOR WIENER IS GOING TO
- 5 AUTHOR. AND HE'S ALREADY GOT A SPOT BILL IN PRINT JUST TO
- 6 TRACK IT IT'S SB 925. THAT WON'T BE AMENDED UNTIL SOMETIME IN
- 7 MID-TO LATE FEBRUARY. SO, WITH THAT, LET'S TURN TO THE NEXT
- 8 SLIDE, PLEASE. WE HAVE STASHED WHY WE NEED A NEW
- 9 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. THIS ITEM ON OUR VISION STATEMENT I'LL
- 10 OUICKLY READ AND HIGHLIGHT THAT WE HAVE MODIFIED IT SLIGHTLY
- 11 TO ARTICULATE THAT WE NEED THIS WORLD CLASS SYSTEM. WE DON'T
- 12 HAVE IT TODAY. AND SO THE VISION THAT THIS MEASURE IS REALLY
- 13 STRIVING TOWARD IS A WORLD CLASS RELIABLE, AFFORDABLE,
- 14 EFFICIENT, CONNECTED TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT MEETS THE
- 15 NEEDS OF THE BAY AREA'S RESIDENTS AND BUSINESS AND VISITORS
- 16 WHILE ALSO HELPING COMBAT THE CLIMATE CRISIS. A PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 17 NETWORK THAT OFFERS SPACE CLEAN FREQUENT ACCESSIBLE EASY TO
- 18 NAVIGATE RELIABLE SERVICE I'M GOING TO SKIP A BIT LOCAL ROADS
- 19 WELL MAINTAINED TRANSIT BIKING WALKING AND WHEELING AS PEOPLE
- 20 WITH DISABILITIES ARE SAFE, CONVENIENT COMPETITIVE
- 21 ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING WHICH WILL ENHANCE ACCESS TO
- 22 OPPORTUNITY LOWER GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS STRENGTHEN THE
- 23 REGION AND IMPROVE OUR OUALITY OF LIFE REALLY WHAT WE ARE
- 24 STRIVING TO ACHIEVE THROUGH THIS MEASURE. I WOULD EMPHASIZE
- 25 THAT YOU KNOW THIS SPONSORSHIP THAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO TAKE



- 1 TODAY THIS IS A BROAD DIRECTION WITH THIS VISION STATEMENT IN
- 2 MIND WE'RE GOING TO BE NAVIGATING THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS IN
- 3 SACRAMENTO WE HAVE MANY STAKEHOLDERS WHO HAVE DIFFERENT
- 4 ASPECTS OF THIS VISION AND THEY'RE KEY INTO BRINGING BACK THE
- 5 DETAILS IN NEGOTIATION AND GETTING FURTHER DIRECTION FROM THIS
- 6 BILL AS WE MOVE THROUGH THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE,
- 7 PLEASE? OKAY. THERE WE GO. SO, IN TERMS HOW THE FUNDING WOULD
- 8 BE USED, KIND OF BUILDING ON THE VISION STATEMENT, THESE ARE
- 9 THE FOUR CATEGORIES THAT WE'RE PROPOSING. AND THE WAY TO THINK
- 10 ABOUT THESE, YOU KNOW, FOR THE INITIAL LEGISLATION IS THEY ARE
- 11 BUCKETS THAT WOULD BE IDENTIFIED BY THIS NAME AND THAT THEY --
- 12 SO, FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, THIS IS INCORPORATING BOTH
- 13 EXISTING, OPERATING, AS WELL AS EXPANDING TRANSIT SERVICE, AND
- 14 IMPLEMENTING THE KEY PRIORITIES OF THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION
- 15 PLAN. PHASE THREE WOULD INCORPORATE IMPROVEMENTS FOR BIKE PED
- 16 ACCESS, AS WELL AS IMPROVEMENT TO THE PAVEMENT. WE KNOW THAT
- 17 THE CONDITION OF LOCAL ROADS IS SOMETHING THAT VOTERS REALLY
- 18 CARE ABOUT, AND IT AFFECTS EVERY COMMUNITY. AND SO IT'S
- 19 SOMETHING THAT THIS MEASURE CAN REALLY HELP ACROSS THE BOARD.
- 20 THE CONNECTIVITY CATEGORY IS REALLY WHAT'S MOST RELEVANT TO
- 21 THIS HIGHWAY CONVERSATION DISCUSSION. HERE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
- 22 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE MOBILITY RELATED, AS
- 23 HIGHLIGHTED, THAT CLOSE AND RELIEVE BOTTLENECK IN EXISTING
- 24 NETWORK AND THAT COULD BE RAIL AS WELL AS ROADWAY. AND AGAIN
- 25 EXAMPLES ARE EXPRESS LANES, GRADE SEPARATIONS, RAIL SAFETY,



- 1 INTERCHANGE MODERNIZATIONS, AND EXACTLY HOW THAT PROGRAM WOULD
- 2 BE STRUCTURED, YOU KNOW, WOULD IT BE RETURN TO SOURCE, WOULD
- 3 IT BE ADMINISTERED COMPETITIVELY, LIKE WITH THE OBAG PROGRAM
- 4 AND OTHER PROGRAMS MTC HAS CONTROL OVER. YOU KNOW, THAT'S
- 5 SOMETHING THAT, AGAIN, WE'LL BE BRINGING BACK TO YOU AND
- 6 DISCUSSING FURTHER. I JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE INTENT OF
- 7 THIS PROGRAM IS MULTI-MODAL INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS. AND
- 8 THEN FINALLY CLIMATE RESILIENCE, WHICH WOULD PRIMARILY BE ON
- 9 THE PLANNING AND DESIGN SIDE GIVEN THE RESOURCES AVAILABLE.
- 10 NEXT SLIDE. HERE IS THE LIST THAT WE HAVE LANDED ON IN TERMS
- 11 OF THE REVENUE OPTIONS THAT THE MEASURE WOULD AUTHORIZE. I DO
- 12 ANTICIPATE THAT THIS WILL BE SUBJECT TO FURTHER REFINEMENT IN
- 13 THE LEGISLATURE. WE'RE NOT PROPOSING ANY CAP ON THESE RATES AT
- 14 THIS TIME. AGAIN, WE ANTICIPATE THE LEGISLATURE MAY WANT TO,
- 15 YOU KNOW, CURTAIL THAT. BUT THE REAL LIMITING FACTOR ON WHAT
- 16 TYPE OF TAX RATE WOULD WE PURSUE IS GOING TO BE WHAT WOULD THE
- 17 VOTERS APPROVE, BASED ON POLLING, WHEN WE GET CLOSER TO 2026
- 18 OR WHATEVER YEAR THIS IS PROPOSED. SO, THAT IS, REALLY, THE
- 19 KEY THINGS TO NOTE THERE. AND THEN LASTLY, THE LAST TWO ITEMS,
- 20 THE REGISTRATION SURCHARGE AND THE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED FEE.
- 21 THESE ARE WHAT I AM REFERRING TO AS NEXT GENERATION IDEAS.
- 22 THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE READY FOR PRIME TIME UNTIL 2030 OR
- 23 LATER. SO ONE OF THE CONCEPTS THAT WE WOULD LIKE IN THE BILL,
- 24 IF WE CAN GET APPROVAL FOR THIS, IS HAVE THIS BE A MENU WHERE
- 25 WE CAN APPROVE AND TAKE TO THE VOTERS SUCCESSIVE MEASURES. SO,



- 1 IF WE'RE SUCCESSFUL ON ANY OF THE ONES ABOVE, THEN WE COULD
- 2 MAYBE GO BACK AND HAVE A MUCH MORE MODEST INCREASE IN A TAX
- 3 RATE DOWN THE ROAD. AND THE REGISTRATION SURCHARGE, IT'S
- 4 BASICALLY A DMV CONSTRAINT, AS WELL AS THE RATE WOULD NEED TO
- 5 BE SO HIGH THAT IT DOESN'T SEEM VIABLE. AND WE REALLY NEED TO
- 6 BE LOOKING AT MECHANISMS THAT CAN DELIVER AT LEAST A BILLION
- 7 DOLLARS A YEAR IS OUR ASSESSMENT AT THIS TIME, AND A VEHICLE
- 8 REGISTRATION SURCHARGE DOES NOT SEEM LIKE A CANDIDATE FOR
- 9 THAT. AND THEN WITH THE VMT FEE THIS IS SOMETHING THAT REALLY
- 10 WOULD NEED TO PIGGYBACK ON THE STATE TRANSITION FROM GAS TAX
- 11 TO ROAD USAGE CHARGE AND THAT'S ALSO NOT GOING TO HAPPEN ANY
- 12 TIME SOON. NEXT SLIDE. HIGHLIGHTING AGAIN SHOULD BE FAMILIAR
- 13 WITH WHAT WE PRESENTED LAST MONTH KEY ELEMENTS OF THE
- 14 LEGISLATION WE ALREADY TALKED ABOUT THE A NUMBER OF THEM. I'LL
- 15 HIGHLIGHT ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISION HERE IS THE VERY IMPORTANT
- 16 TO THIS BODY TO STAFF AND REALLY THIS IS HOW WE MAKE SOME
- 17 CHANGES TO STRENGTHEN MTC'S AUTHORITY IN ITS NETWORK MANAGER
- 18 ROLE. WE HAVE ARRIVED AT THE CONSENSUS I THINK IN THE REGION
- 19 ABOUT WHAT ARE MOST IMPORTANT OUTCOMES THAT WE NEED TO DELIVER
- 20 FOR THE BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDERS AND RESIDENTS WHO WE HOPE TO
- 21 BECOME FUTURE TRANSIT RIDERS AND TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER THOSE
- 22 FASTER AND MORE EFFECTIVELY WE BELIEVE MTC NEEDS A STRONGER
- 23 HAND HERE AND WE WOULD LIKE THE LEGISLATION ITSELF TO PROVIDE
- 24 THAT STRONGER AUTHORITY. MAYBE THERE IS SOME PROVISIONS OF
- 25 THAT, THAT WOULD TAKE EFFECT WITH VOTER APPROVAL, BUT WE WOULD



- 1 LIKE TO SEE SOME TAKE EFFECT UPON ENACTMENT OF THE
- 2 LEGISLATION. TRAVEL DEMAND MANAGEMENT ITEM IS KIND OF A WORK
- 3 IN PROGRESS, BUT THE IDEA IS TO REALLY BRING THE PRIVATE
- 4 SECTOR INTO THE FOLD IN TERMS OF REDUCING SINGLE OCCUPANT
- 5 VEHICLE TRAVEL AND MANDATING SOME KIND OF A SUBSIDY FOR
- 6 TRANSIT OR OTHER ALTERNATIVES. LET'S SEE. I THINK WE HAVE KIND
- 7 OF HIGHLIGHTED ALL OF THE OTHERS AT THE LAST MEETING. SO, I'LL
- 8 GO ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS JUST IS RELATED TO REINFORCE THE
- 9 RATIONALE FOR THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGER REFORM PROVISIONS.
- 10 YOU CAN SEE FROM THE 2021 POLL, THIS IS BAY AREA RESIDENTS,
- 11 JUST HOW STRONG VOTERS, SORT OF, FEEL ABOUT THIS IDEA OF
- 12 HAVING A MORE SEAMLESS TRANSIT SYSTEM. THEY THINK ALL OF THESE
- 13 THINGS ARE INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. AND THESE ARE REALLY THE
- 14 ITEMS THAT THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE ARTICULATED IN OUR
- 15 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. AND THEN I'LL JUST NOTE FROM OUR
- 16 MOST RECENT POLL, 80% SUPPORT STRONGER OVERSIGHT AND
- 17 ACCOUNTABILITY TO ENSURE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT MANAGEMENT OF
- 18 TRANSIT THAT WAS THE HIGHEST RANKED PRIORITY THAT VOTERS SAID
- 19 THEY WANT TO SEE IN A MEASURE. 61% SUPPORTED ONE REGIONAL
- 20 AGENCY WITH BEING RESPONSIBLE FOR SETTING TRANSIT FARES,
- 21 COORDINATING SCHEDULES, ET CETERA. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS
- 22 ITEMIZES THE KEY ELEMENTS THAT WE SEE AS CRITICAL TO BE
- 23 INCORPORATED INTO A STRONGER NETWORK MANAGER ROLE. WE'LL
- 24 CERTAINLY BE WORKING WITH THE COMMISSION ON THE FINE PRINT
- 25 HERE AND WORKING WITH OUR TRANSIT OPERATOR PARTNERS AND OTHER



- 1 STAKEHOLDERS ON THIS LANGUAGE AND BRINGING THAT BACK TO YOU AS
- 2 WE ALSO WORK WITH SENATOR WIENER ON THIS. NEXT SLIDE. SO JUST
- 3 WHERE WE ARE RIGHT NOW. ASSUMING THAT YOU TAKE ACTION TODAY TO
- 4 SPONSOR THE BILL, IT WILL BE AMENDED IN MID-TO LATE FEBRUARY.
- 5 WE ANTICIPATE THAT THE FIRST HEARING WOULD BE IN THE SENATE
- 6 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE IN EARLY MARCH. AND, YOU KNOW, WE'RE
- 7 -- AS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DESCRIBED, WE'RE HAVING A LOT OF
- 8 BRIEFINGS AND MEETINGS WITH BAY AREA LEGISLATORS. SENATOR
- 9 WIENER IS REALLY COMMITTED TO THIS BEING A BAY AREA CONSENSUS
- 10 BILL, WHICH IS GREAT. BECAUSE WE HAVE TO GET IT APPROVED BY
- 11 THE ENTIRE LEGISLATOR. SO WE NEED A STRONG SUPPORT ACROSS THE
- 12 BAY AREA. WE'RE CONVENING REGULAR TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
- 13 MEASURE WORKING GROUP MEETINGS. AND WE'LL BE FOLLOWING UP WITH
- 14 IDEAS OF A STEERING COMMITTEE THAT CAN REALLY HELP GUIDE THE
- 15 LEGISLATION, AS WELL. AND LASTLY, WE'RE GOING TO BE LAUNCHING,
- 16 WITH YOUR ACTION TODAY, A WEB PAGE, AND KIND OF MECHANISM FOR
- 17 ANY BAY AREA RESIDENT TO STAY INFORMED THROUGH THIS PROCESS.
- 18 AND WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE AND JUST LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR
- 19 QUESTIONS AND FEEDBACK. THANK YOU.

- 21 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, REBECCA, AND THANK
- 22 YOU, ANDY. YOU KNOW, LET ME MAKE A MOTION. I'M GOING TO MOVE
- 23 THE RECOMMENDATION FOR MTC TO SPONSOR THE REGIONAL
- 24 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION AS DETAILED BY
- 25 REBECCA, IN ATTACHMENTS B AND C. I KNOW WE'RE GOING TO HAVE



DISCUSSION. BUT LET ME JUST PUT THAT MOTION ON THE TABLE. IS 1 2 THERE A SECOND? 3 SUE NOACK: SECOND. 4 5 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. THANK YOU. SECOND FROM NOACK. WITH THAT, 6 IF WE CAN HAVE A DISCUSSION FROM COLLEAGUES, IF ARE THERE ANY 7 8 COMMENTS? I THINK THIS IS THE THIRD TIME THIS WAS BROUGHT BEFORE THE BOARD. I THINK WE'RE PRETTY MUCH FAMILIAR WITH THE 9 SUBJECT AREA. IF THERE ARE ANY COMMENTS OR DISCUSSIONS FROM 10 OUR COLLEAGUES? MISS PAPAN? COMMISSIONER PAPAN. 11 12 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CANEPA. THANK YOU FOR ALL 13 THE HARD WORK AND EFFORTS THAT WENT INTO THIS, AND 14 15 PARTICULARLY THE VISION STATEMENT. I THINK, ABSOLUTELY, WE CAN 16 GET BEHIND THIS. AND IT TOOK A LITTLE WORK AND TWEAKING AND 17 ALL OF THAT. SO, I APPRECIATE THAT LEAD. AND I AM ALWAYS HESITANT WHEN WE SAY WE ARE SPONSORING LEGISLATION, 18 PARTICULARLY GIVEN YOUR POLL RESULTS HERE, BECAUSE IF WE DON'T 19 HAVE THE ACCOUNTABILITY, THIS IS -- THE PUBLIC IS NOT GOING TO 20 21 BE HAPPY. AND WE NEED TO GET THEM ON BOARD WITH THIS. SO, I

SUGGEST, IF WE CAN, BE COMPLETELY -- KEEPING US ALL UP-TO-

WHAT THIS BODY -- SOME COMMISSIONERS REALLY THINK WILL BE

BENEFICIAL. SO, IT DOES HAVE TO BE A GROUP EFFORT HERE. I

DATE. BECAUSE SOMETIMES THE SENATORS PROPOSALS ARE NOT REALLY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

22

23

24



- 1 REALLY WANT TO FOCUS ON TO YOUR OUTREACH TO WORKING GROUPS.
- 2 BECAUSE THAT NEEDS TO INCLUDE THE REPRESENTATION AT THIS
- 3 BOARD. SOMETIMES WORKING GROUPS DON'T REALLY SEE WHAT'S HERE.
- 4 SO, CAN WE JUST TRY TO GET AN UNDERSTANDING? BECAUSE HOPEFULLY
- 5 WE ARE REPRESENTING ALL OF OUR INDIVIDUAL JURISDICTIONS TO THE
- 6 BEST ABILITY. AND SOMETIMES INDIVIDUAL GROUPS ARE NOT SEEING
- 7 THE BIG PICTURE AND WE JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT IS
- 8 CLEAR MOVING FORWARD. BECAUSE WE DO WANT THIS TO HAPPEN. WE
- 9 REALLY DO WANT TO MAKE SURE TRANSPORTATION IS BETTER. WE NOTED
- 10 HERE, TOO, A LOT OF THE BLUE RIBBON GOALS. AND IF YOU COULD,
- 11 FOR OUR ACCOUNTABILITY HERE, NOTE FOR US WHEN -- I MEAN, THE
- 12 BLUE RIBBON RECOVERY PLAN WAS THREE YEARS AGO. SO, KIND OF
- 13 GIVING US STATUS? BECAUSE I THINK ANY LEGISLATION LIKE THIS OR
- 14 ANY FUNDING, THE PUBLIC WANTS TO SEE WHAT WE HAVE DONE. AND WE
- 15 HAVE HAD THESE THINGS ON OUR LIST FOR A VERY LONG TIME. SO WE
- 16 NEED TO SHOW THEM, HEY ACCIDENT THIS IS WORKING -- HEY, THIS
- 17 IS WORKING. AND THE PUBLIC WOULD LOVE IT. MAYBE THIS IS A
- 18 DREAMWORLD. WHEN DO YOU GET THIS FUNDING WHEN CAN WE GET THOSE
- 19 THINGS. WHEN WILL THEY SEE FARE INTEGRATION, I MEAN SCHEDULING
- 20 COORDINATION. I DON'T THINK THAT SHOULD BE HARD. [LAUGHTER] I
- 21 MEAN, THE PUBLIC WOULD LOVE TO SEE WHEN YOU HAVE ESTIMATED
- 22 COMPLETION DATES. WE'RE STARTING MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. THAT
- 23 IS FANTASTIC. BUT HOW LONG IS IT REALLY GOING TO TAKE TO GET
- 24 OUT THERE FOR THE PEOPLE TO SEE IT? SO, I'M JUST -- I'M MAKING
- 25 THESE SUGGESTIONS, BECAUSE WE LOOK AT THE POLL RESULTS AND WE



- 1 SEE THEM, AND THEY WANT RESULTS. SO, AGAIN, I THINK MY FINAL
- 2 NOTE IS, YES, IF IT COMES TO MTC TO MAKE THIS A REALITY, THERE
- 3 CAN'T BE LEEWAY. THE ACCOUNTABILITY HAS TO BE IF YOU DO THIS,
- 4 YOU GET REWARDED. IF YOU DON'T, IT'S AUTOMATIC THAT THERE HAS
- 5 TO BE CONSEQUENCES. BECAUSE TOO MANY TIMES WE GET IN, OH,
- 6 WELL, THEY'RE TRYING, AND WHAT -- AND WE NEED TO BE A LITTLE
- 7 STRONGER. BECAUSE THERE IS FISCAL IRRESPONSIBILITY OUT THERE.
- 8 AND THE PUBLIC SEES IT. SO I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU DO THAT. BUT
- 9 WE NEED TO REALLY MAKE THINGS AUTOMATIC TO MAKE THOSE
- 10 CONSEQUENCES A REALITY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AGAIN. I REALLY
- 11 APPRECIATE EVERYTHING THAT WENT INTO THIS. SO LET'S JUST BE
- 12 CAREFUL. WHEN WE DO OUR SPONSORSHIP, I HOPE YOU KEEP THIS
- 13 BOARD INFORMED SO WE KNOW. THANK YOU SO MUCH.
- 14
- 15 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. I WANT TO RECOGNIZE YOU MISS PAPAN. I
- 16 MEAN FROM THE BEGINNING OF THIS PROCESS YOUR LEADERSHIP ON
- 17 ACCOUNTABILITY YOU REALLY HAVE BEEN LASER FOCUSED I THINK
- 18 MEMBERS OF THE BOARD RECOGNIZE THAT THANK YOU FOR YOUR
- 19 LEADERSHIP. ARE THERE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? JOSEFOWITZ?

- 21 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND WHAT
- 22 WE'RE VOTING ON. THE MOTION WAS FOR B AND C, AND THERE ARE
- 23 UNFORTUNATELY 2B'S ATTACHMENTS. SO, ARE WE VOTING ON THE
- 24 ATTACHMENTS WHICH ARE KEY PROVISIONS AND PROPOSED VISION
- 25 STATEMENTS?



1 DAVID CANEPA: LET ME DO THIS. I THINK THAT'S A FAIR QUESTION. 2 3 I'M GOING TO DIRECT MY COMMENTS TO MISS BOCKELMAN, TO EXPLAIN THAT. IN HER THOUGHTS. 4 5 ALIX BOCKELMAN: TRYING TO GET THE ATTACHMENTS OPEN MYSELF. 6 BUT, YES, I THINK THAT IS TRUE. KEY PROVISIONS OF THE VISION 7 8 STATEMENTS THOSE ARE THE B AND C THAT WE'RE REFERRING TO. 9 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THAT HELPS ME. SO, I AM SUPPORTIVE 10 11 OF THAT. I THINK IT IS -- YOU KNOW, I -- I -- I BELIEVE WE NEED THIS REGIONAL MEASURE. AND I BELIEVE WE NEED THIS 12 REGIONAL MEASURE FOR ALL THE RENALS THAT WERE PUT UP AND THAT 13 WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT, SUPPORTING TRANSIT, MAKING IT 35, MAKING 14 15 TRANSPORTATION SAFER, SO NO ONE IS KILLED ON THE ROADS OR 16 MARKED ON A BUS MOBILITY AND THOSE DISADVANTAGED SUPPORTING JOBS HELPING CLIMATE GOALS. I THINK THE VISION AND KEY 17 STATEMENTS HELP CONTINUE THE MOMENTUM WE HAVE TO MAKE THIS 18 MEASURE A REALITY. AND I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT AND I 19 WANT TO BE SUPPORTIVE OF THAT. ON THE ISSUE OF HIGHWAY 20 21 WIDENING, WHICH IS OBVIOUSLY SOMETHING THAT THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVE HAD THE JOY OF COME TO THE LAST MEETING APPRECIATED THE 22 DIFFERENCES ON AND I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE MORE DISCUSSION 23 ABOUT THIS. I THINK THIS IS A VERY IMPORTANT TOPIC, AND I 24

APPRECIATE STAFF TRYING TO RUSH SOMETHING OUT TO TRY AND



- 1 INFORM THIS DISCUSSION, BUT I THINK WE NEED MORE THAN JUST A
- 2 HANDOUT THE NIGHT BEFORE THE MEETING WITH SOME OPTIONS. I
- 3 THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A DATA INFORMED DISCUSSION NOT JUST WITH
- 4 OURSELVES, BUT ALSO WITH KEY STAKEHOLDERS, LIKE THE -- YOU
- 5 KNOW, WHO HAVE DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES ON THIS, WHETHER IT'S
- 6 THE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMUNITY OR LABOR OR BUSINESS. AND I THINK
- 7 WE ALL NEED TO KIND OF GET IN A ROOM INFORMED BY DATA
- 8 UNDERSTANDING WHAT PROJECTS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT WHAT PROJECTS
- 9 WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT, WHAT ARE THE IMPACTS OF THOSE
- 10 PROJECTS, GOOD AND BAD. AND I WANT -- I WOULD LIKE TO
- 11 PARTICIPATE IN THOSE DISCUSSIONS. I WOULD LIKE TO -- I DON'T
- 12 THINK THERE IS ANYTHING THAT I HAVE HEARD THAT LEADS ME TO
- 13 BELIEVE THAT WE WILL NOT BE ABLE TO FIND A WAY FORWARD WHERE
- 14 WE CAN ALL GET BEHIND THIS MEASURE AND GIVE IT THE BEST SHOT
- 15 OF PASSING. SO, SO, I JUST WANTED TO -- SO, I'M GOING TO -- IF
- 16 THIS IS THE MOTION, I AM A YES. AND I'M EXCITED US -- ABOUT
- 17 TRYING TO GET THIS MEASURE, A GOOD MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.
- 19 DAVID CANEPA: BEFORE I GO TO MR. RABBITT, LET ME GO TO MR.
- 20 SPERING.

18

- 22 JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW THIS -- AND I APPRECIATE YOUR
- 23 COMMENTS -- THE -- THIS MEASURE, I COMPARE IT TO RM3. WE BUILT
- 24 THE STRONG COALITION, WITH THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY AND
- 25 ENVIRONMENTAL. THIS MEASURE IF WE HAVE ANY OF OUR INTERNAL,



- 1 YOU KNOW, THE TRANSIT ADVOCATES, LABOR, ELECTED OFFICIALS, IF
- 2 WE HAVE ANY FRAGMENTATION AMONG OURSELVES, THIS MEASURE, THERE
- 3 IS NO NEED TO EVEN GO FORWARD. OKAY? AND I DON'T BELIEVE
- 4 YOU'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO MOVE THIS MEASURE FORWARD UNLESS WE
- 5 ADDRESS SOME OF THESE ISSUES. I THINK WE HAVE TO AGREE THAT
- 6 OUR PRIMARY GOAL HERE IS TO MAKE SURE TRANSIT, AND ESPECIALLY
- 7 WE FOCUS ON BART AND MUNI, THAT THEY ARE ADEQUATELY FUNDED TO
- 8 PROVIDE THIS WORLD CLASS SERVICE. AND I AGREE WITH THAT 100%.
- 9 BUT TO MAKE THIS STATEMENT THAT THERE IS NO INFRASTRUCTURE
- 10 IMPROVEMENTS, THE MEASURE WILL NOT PASS. AND, SO, YOU KNOW,
- 11 I'M NOT -- I'M UNCOMFORTABLE HAVING A PERCENTAGE THAT
- 12 GUARANTEES TRANSIT, AND THEY CAN PLAN ON THAT, BUT I DON'T --
- 13 I'M FLEXIBLE ON WHAT THAT PERCENTAGE IS. I'M CONCERNED WE HAVE
- 14 INDIVIDUALS THAT ARE STARTING TO SCRUTINIZE OUR PROJECTS THAT
- 15 WE HAVE SPENT MILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO GET PROJECTS ADVANCED
- 16 THEY'RE MEETING ALL OF THE EXISTING POLICIES STATE GREENHOUSE
- 17 GAS GOALS VMT WE'RE DOING ALL OF THAT. AND YOU BING FORTH A
- 18 PROJECT THAT'S GOING TO VIOLATE ALL OF THOSE, I THINK IT'S NOT
- 19 ACCURATE. AND I READ THIS OPTION TWO, WHERE IT TALKS ABOUT
- 20 ELIGIBLE PROJECTS. I DO NOT HAVE PROBLEMS EXCLUDING FREEWAY
- 21 WIDENING FOR NEW GENERAL PURPOSE LANES. I AGREE WITH THAT. WE
- 22 SHOULDN'T BE DOING THAT. BUT IT SHOULD BE MEETING ALL OF OUR
- 23 CLIMATE GOALS AND THERE ARE SO MANY RESTRICTIONS ON THESE
- 24 PROJECTS NOW. BUT I DON'T WANT TO LOSE SIGHT OF WHAT OUR
- 25 OBJECTIVE IS HERE, BUT I ALSO DON'T WANT TO SELL THIS THING



1	SHORT TO WHERE WE'RE NOT MEETING SOME OF THE OTHER INTEREST
2	THAT THESE OTHER GROUPS HAVE. AND, SO, I'M VERY CAUTIOUS TO
3	SAY, YOU KNOW, I WANT TO LIMIT THE MONEY GOING TO TRANSIT, OR
4	NO MONEY GOING TO HIGHWAYS, IMPROVEMENTS, I JUST THINK THAT WE
5	HAVE TO ALL WORK TOGETHER, FIND THAT BALANCE, DON'T LOSE FOCUS
6	OF WHAT THIS MEASURE IS FOR, IS TO SHORE UP THE REVENUE STREAM
7	FOR TRANSIT. BUT DON'T PRECLUDE SOME OF THE PARTNERS THAT CAN
8	HELP THIS MEASURE GET OVER THE FINISH LINE. SO, I AGREE WITH
9	YOUR COMMENTS ABOUT BRINGING EVERYBODY TOGETHER. LET'S FIND
10	OUT. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE MAKE SURE EVERYBODY HAS
11	THAT SAME COMMON GOAL. WE WANT TRANSIT TO BE WORLD CLASS IN
12	THE BAY AREA REGION, AND THIS IS A FUNDING SOURCE THAT CAN
13	HELP US DO THAT WE NEED TO HAVE THAT COMMON GOAL. AND, SO, I
14	JUST AM CONCERNED. YOU KNOW, THAT AND I'LL AND I MAY BE
15	IN THE MINORITY HERE, BUT I'M REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT, ONE, WE
16	JUST START OFF AT OPTION TWO, EXCLUDE HIGHWAY CAPACITY WE HAVE
17	SO MANY CONSTRAINTS ON IT NOW, EXCLUDE THE FREEWAY WIDENING I
18	AGREE WITH THAT GENERAL PURPOSE NEXT STATEMENT ON ELIGIBLE
19	PROJECTS IT'S VERY RESTRICTIVE I THINK THAT'S A VERY GOOD
20	PARAGRAPH THAT OUTLINES WHERE WE SHOULD BE BUT THE POLITICAL
21	SIDE OF THIS THING IS YOU GOT TO FIND SOME BALANCE IN THIS
22	PLAN. WE HAD TO DO WITH RM3, I KNOW A LOT OF STAFF WORKED
23	REALLY HARD TO FIND THAT CONSENSUS THROUGHOUT THE REGION WE

MADE A LOT OF CONCESSIONS AND I THINK WE DID THE RIGHT THING



AND SO THAT MODEL I SHOULD BE FOLLOWED HEALER BUT NOT LOSE 1 SIGHT OF WHAT THE PURPOSE IS OF THIS MEASURE. 2 3 DAVID CANEPA: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? 4 5 LIBBY SCHAFF: I DON'T FEEL LIKE I HEARD A CLEAR ANSWER TO VICE 6 7 CHAIR, CAN WE HAVE AN ANSWER JUST SO THE QUESTION AND ACTION 8 BEING TAKEN TODAY DOES NOT INCLUDE RECOMMENDATION OF OPTION 9 TWO? 10 ANDREW FREMIER: THAT'S CORRECT. THE HANDOUT IS A SEPARATE 11 DISCUSSION PURPOSES OF DOCUMENT BASED ON THE DIRECTION WE 12 RECEIVE BUT IT'S NOT RELATED TO THE MOTION THAT WAS PUT ON THE 13 14 HANDOUT. 15 16 LIBBY SCHAAF: SO THAT ISSUE IS SOMETHING THAT CAN BE A DECISION THAT CAN BE MADE ANOTHER DAY. THAT'S HELPFUL TO KNOW. 17 I WILL PIGGYBACK ON COMMISSIONER SPERING'S COMMENTS BUT MAYBE 18 WITH A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE. 19 20 JAMES P. SPERING: [INDISCERNIBLE] 21 22 LIBBY SCHAAF: [LAUGHTER] ALWAYS WITH LOVE AND RESPECT FOR ALL 23 OF YOUR WISDOM. ONE CHALLENGE WILL BE GETTING THIS BODY ALL ON 24

THE SAME PAGE, A BIGGER CHALLENGE I'M THINKING POLLING RESULTS



- 1 THAT WE HAVE SEEN RECENTLY ABOUT VOTER APPETITE FOR REVENUE
- 2 MEASURES IS GOING TO BE THE SUPPORT OF VOTERS, AND REGARDLESS
- 3 OF WHAT ANYONE PERSONALLY FEELS -- AND I HAVE MY OWN PERSONAL
- 4 FEELINGS, SINCE I'M NOT A VOTING MEMBER I DON'T KNOW IF
- 5 THEY'RE IMPORTANT -- BUT IF THE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMUNITY OF
- 6 CALIFORNIA OPPOSES OUR MEASURE I BELIEVE THAT WILL LEAD TO A
- 7 DEFEAT ON ELECTION DAY AND THE ISSUE OF HIGHWAY WIDENING IS A
- 8 VERY IMPORTANT ISSUE THAT WE SHOULD DIG INTO MORE AND IT IS
- 9 NOT THE ONLINE CAPITAL EXPENDITURE IN HIGHWAY OR
- 10 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENT OPTION. THERE IS SO MUCH SAFETY
- 11 WORK. THERE IS SO MUCH RESILIENCE WORK. THERE IS SO MUCH
- 12 CLIMATE ADAPTING A WORK THAT HAS TO BE DONE, ALL OF WHICH ARE
- 13 GOING TO REQUIRE CAPITAL INVESTMENTS THAT ARE NOT NECESSARILY
- 14 HIGHWAY WIDENING. SO, I WOULD DISH AM HOPEFUL THAT,
- 15 PARTICULARLY THE LABOR COMMUNITY -- YES, I'M LOOKING AT YOU --
- 16 AND THE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMUNITY GET TOGETHER AND FORGE SOME,
- 17 SORT OF, SHARED VISION FOR THIS MEASURE. BECAUSE IF THERE IS
- 18 ANY WELL ORGANIZED OPPOSITION, REGARDLESS OF HOW UNIFIED THIS
- 19 BODY IS WE WILL NOT WIN IN NOVEMBER. I KNOW THIS IS A LONG
- 20 WAYS OFF. BUT I JUST ADD THOSE WISHES AND HOPE FOR A UNIFIED
- 21 VISION, NOT JUST FOR THIS BODY, BUT ALSO FOR THE KEY
- 22 STAKEHOLDERS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO THINK THAT HIGHWAY WIDENING
- 23 WILL NOT BE THE PATH TO THAT VISION. EVEN OPTION TWO, AND I
- 24 APPRECIATE YOU TRIED TO GOLDILOCKS IT, BUT WITH A GREAT QUOTE,
- 25 I'M GOING TO USE THAT, BUT THERE ARE OTHER CAPITAL INVESTMENTS



THAT COULD BE LESS CONTROVERSIAL AND MORE BENEFICIAL. THANK 1 2 YOU. 3 DAVID CANEPA: COMMISSIONER RABBITT AND NOACK. 4 5 DAVID RABBITT: I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION AND ALL DISCUSSIONS 6 THAT HAVE TAKEN PLACE PRIOR. IT'S INTERESTING, WE ALL COME 7 8 FROM DIFFERENT SPREAD OUT REGIONS OF THE COUNTY WITH DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES. FOR SONOMA COUNTY REALLY ONE OF THE HINTER LANDS 9 UP NORTH THAT HAS MORE SUBURBAN AND VERY RURAL IN SOME AREAS, 10 AND THE HIGHWAY ISSUE, I RESPECT THAT, AND I AGREE WITH 11 COMMISSIONER SPERING, BUT WE SHOULD ALSO REMEMBER, WE'RE STILL 12 WIDENING A HIGHWAY THAT WAS AN UNSAFE HIGHWAY THAT HAD 13 DRIVEWAYS, LEFT TURN LANES, COULD YOU IMAGINE IF 80, 580, 680, 14 15 WAS A TWO LANE HIGHWAY WITH LEFT TURN DRIVEWAYS THAT RESULTED 16 IN DEATHS AND DESTRUCTION THAT TOOK PLACE. WE CAME LATE TO THE GAME. AND I PUT THAT OUT THERE BECAUSE THE SAME DISCUSSIONS 17 WERE BEING HAD AT THAT TIME WHEN WE WERE LOOKING FOR FUNDS 18 THAT'S WHY IT TOOK 25 YEARS AND A BILLION DOLLARS INTO 19 COUNTIES TO FIGURE OUT THAT PATH FORWARD. AND WHAT WE HAVE IS 20 21 NOT NECESSARILY A MEGA HIGHWAY BUT WHAT WE HAVE IS A SAFE FREEWAY WITH INTERCHANGES, NO CROSS TRAFFIC DIVIDERS AND 22 EVERYTHING ELSE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT PEOPLE THROUGHOUT 23 IN THE DIFFERENT REGIONS OF THE COUNTY IF YOU ARE GOING OUT 24

FOR A MEASURE YOU NEED TO MAKE SURE YOU KNOW WHERE YOUR VOTES



- 1 ARE. AND IF THE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMUNITY OPPOSES CAPITAL
- 2 PROJECTS THEY'RE NOT GOING TO GET PUBLIC TRANSIT FUNDING.
- 3 [LAUGHTER] AND SO THIS IS WHERE WE ALL HAVE TO GET TOGETHER
- 4 AND FIGURE OUT A PATH FORWARD. BECAUSE AT THE SAME TIME, THERE
- 5 ARE PEOPLE IN SONOMA COUNTY WHO WILL NEVER TAKE BART, WHO WILL
- 6 NEVER TAKE MUNI, BUT I THINK THEY ALL UNDERSTAND THE
- 7 IMPORTANCE OF THAT, TO THE CITIES AND THE REGION AS A WHOLE.
- 8 AT THE SAME TIME WE ASK THAT PEOPLE UNDERSTAND THAT THE OTHER
- 9 SIDE OF THAT EQUATION IS THOSE FOLKS SHOULD ALSO LOOK AT THAT
- 10 MEASURE AND SAY, YEAH, THIS IS A GOOD THING. SUN AND WHAT? I
- 11 HATE TO SAY IT, BUT PEOPLE LOOK AT MEASURES ABOUT WHAT'S IN IT
- 12 FOR ME, AND HOW AM I GOING TO BENEFIT AND WHERE IS MY MONEY
- 13 GOING TO GO AND DO I TRUST THIS ORGANIZATION. SO, I AGREE WITH
- 14 COMMISSIONER SPERING. WE NEED TO FIND THAT SWEET SPOT AND WE
- 15 KNOW IT'S OUT THERE GOING FORWARD BUT I DON'T THINK WE
- 16 NECESSARY SERIOUSLY SHOULDN'T PRECLUDE. I WILL TELL YOU
- 17 PERSONALLY IN MY DISTRICT RIGHT NOW TRAFFIC SIGNALS THAT ARE
- 18 THE BIG NEED FOR SAFETY SAKE. YOU GOT TOO MANY CARS ON SMALL
- 19 ROADS TRYING TO ENTER A COLLECTOR AND WHAT NOT SO CONNECTIVITY
- 20 I'M HOPING THE CONNECTIVITY AND SAFETY MEASURES CONTINUE TO GO
- 21 FORWARD AND INCREASE THE SAFETY FACTORS AND TRY TO GET PEOPLE
- 22 WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO GO SAFELY AND SO ON. SO, I APPRECIATE
- 23 DISCUSSION BUT I THINK WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE KEEP THOSE
- 24 -- KEEP THE -- DON'T PUT THE BLINDERS ON BUT WHO WE HEAR LAST



- 1 BUT MAKE SURE WE LOOK BROAD AND WIDE ABOUT WHOSE ACTUALLY
- 2 GOING TO BE VOTING ON THIS.

3

- 4 DAVID CANEPA: MISS NOACK, CHAVEZ AND ABE-KOGA. WE'LL GO
- 5 MARGARET AFTER THEN EDDIE. ALL RIGHT.

- 7 SUE NOACK: I JUST WANTED TO CONCUR WITH A LOT OF THE COMMENTS
- 8 HERE. I'M NOT QUITE IN THE HINTER LANDS, BUT I'M NOT QUITE IN
- 9 THE CITY EITHER, IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY. BUT WE HAD SOME
- 10 UNIQUE ASPECTS AS WELL, AND I THINK BALANCE IS GOING TO BE
- 11 REALLY IMPORTANT GOING FORWARD. THE ONE THING I WANT TO GET
- 12 DOWN THE HIGHWAY PATH SUNS I SPENT ENOUGH TIME TALKING ABOUT
- 13 THAT AT THE LAST MEETING, BUT I WANT TO TALK ABOUT
- 14 ACCOUNTABILITY I THINK REBECCA MADE THE POINT OF GETTING SOME
- 15 ACCOUNTABILITY PRIOR TO THE MEASURE COMING OUT AND SOME
- 16 AUTHORITY THERE. THAT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT. PEOPLE
- 17 LOOKING AT A MEASURE IN 2026 ARE LOOKING TO SEE THAT
- 18 IMPROVEMENT IS HAPPENING IN OUR TRANSIT AND TRUMP AREA. AND
- 19 THAT KIND OF AUTHORITY, PRIOR TO 2026, WILL HELP US SHOW THE
- 20 PUBLIC THAT THAT ACTUALLY IS HAPPENING. AND I THINK THAT'S
- 21 GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT IF WE WANT PEOPLE TO SUPPORT A
- 22 MEASURE IN 2026. AND, SO I I DON'T WANT TO LOSE SIGHT OF THAT
- 23 ASPECT OF IT. AND I DON'T KNOW, REBECCA, IF YOU CAN COMMENT ON
- 24 MORE DETAIL AS TO WHAT THAT ACCOUNTABILITY IS THAT MIGHT BE IN
- 25 THE LEGISLATION TO ALLOW MTC OR -- TO HAVE MORE AUTHORITY



EARLIER ON TO MAKE SOME OF THE CHANGES NECESSARY THAT THE 1 2 PUBLIC MIGHT BE LOOKING FOR? 3 REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR? THANKS FOR THAT QUESTION, 4 5 COMMISSIONER NOACK. IN YOUR PACKET, AND MAYBE IF THE TECH TEAM COULD PULL UP SLIDE NINE, WE ENUMERATE, RIGHT, THE KEY ISSUES 6 THAT WE THINK ARE OF MOST IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF ATTRACTING 7 8 MORE TRANSIT RIDERS AND IMPROVING THE EXPERIENCE YOU KNOW, FARE PAYMENT FARE INTEGRATION SCHEDULE COORDINATION MAPPING 9 10 WAYFINDING REALTIME TRANSIT INFORMATION. SO I THINK FOR THE MORE IMMEDIATE STRENGTHENING OF AUTHORITY WE WOULD LOOK AT 11 AUTHORITY WITHIN THOSE CATEGORIES WHERE THERE WOULD BE SOME 12 NUANCE WHERE IT WOULD DEFINITELY NEED MORE CONVERSATION, 13 NEGOTIATION, IS, FOR EXAMPLE, CLIPPER BAY PASS, RIGHT, THAT IS 14 15 A VERY POWERFUL OPTION THAT WE'RE SEEING DELIVERS SIGNIFICANT 16 INCREASES IN RIDERSHIP, BUT IT ALSO IS CHALLENGING TO OPERATORS. THEY VIEW IT AS A RISK, RIGHT? IF THEY'RE CURRENTLY 17 GETTING FARES, PER PASSENGER, AND NOW THEY'RE SHIFTING TO A 18 MODEL WHERE, BASICALLY, THERE IS A SAID AMOUNT, A USER HAS 19 PASS THAT'S PROVIDED BY THEIR EMPLOYER, MAYBE IN THE FUTURE 20 21 THEY COULD JUST BUY THE PASS, THEY WANT TO MAKE SURE THEY'RE NOT LOSING NET REVENUE. SO IN THAT EXAMPLE, WE NEED MORE 22 REVENUE IN ORDER TO PROVIDE THAT TYPE OF GUARANTEE. RIGHT? SO, 23 I THINK THERE ARE CERTAIN PROVISIONS IF THE MEASURE IS LARGE 24

ENOUGH AND WE CAN MAKE THIS HAPPEN, MAYBE OFFERING A CLIPPER



- 1 BAY PASS KIND OF REQUIREMENT WILL BE SOMETHING THE VOTERS CAN
- 2 PASS WE COULDN'T DO THAT NEXT YEAR BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE
- 3 RESOURCES FOR SOMETHING LIKE THAT BUT WE COULD SAY ALL
- 4 OPERATORS NEED TO BE ON BOARD WITH THE POLICY THAT WE'RE
- 5 ACTUALLY GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTING WITH NEXGEN CLIPPER SO NO-
- 6 COST TRANSFERS AND DISCOUNT BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL
- 7 OPERATORS. THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE, AGAIN, HOPING TO DEPLOY
- 8 THIS FALL. BUT THE STRENGTH OF OUR ABILITY TO DO SO, AND HOW
- 9 WE NAVIGATE A POTENTIAL OPERATOR SAYING THEY DON'T WANT TO DO
- 10 THAT, IT, YOU KNOW, MAY BE A CHALLENGE, AND WE COULD HAVE
- 11 POLICIES THAT PREVENT THAT FROM STANDING IN THE WAY.

13 **SUE NOACK:** THANKS.

12

14

16

22

15 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. MISS ABE-KOGA?

17 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU, CHAIR. JUST ALONG THAT LINE, I

- 18 HAVE A OUESTION, OR JUST THE CLARIFICATION. IS THE PLAN WITH
- 19 THE BAY PASS GENERATING ENOUGH REVENUE TO BE ABLE TO BACKFILL
- 20 THE LOSSES OF MORE LOCAL AGENCY PASSES BECAUSE I HAVE HEARD
- 21 THAT'S A BIG CONCERN
- 23 REBECCA LONG: THAT WOULD BE AN EXAMPLE WHERE WE NEED TO DO
- 24 MORE ANALYSIS OUR CLIPPER BAY PASS TEAM IS WORKING ON PRICING,
- 25 STRUCTURE, YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON WHERE THE EMPLOYEE IS



LOCATED, CERTAINLY THE OVERALL GOAL OF THE MEASURE IS TO 1 2 PROVIDE BETTER SERVICE FOR BAY AREA RESIDENTS TODAY, AND 3 THIS'S GOING TO REQUIRE OVERALL MORE REVENUE FOR ALL OPERATORS BUT THE DEVIL IS IN THE DETAILS ON EXACTLY HOW THAT WOULD 4 5 WORK. 6 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO THAT AND THE CORE ELEMENTS THERE IS THE 7 8 TDM ITEM, I HAVE HEARD FROM FOLKS WHO ARE CONCERNED, AND THE OUESTION IS, COULD WE RECEIVE THIS AS INPUT STRONG ENOUGH TO 9 BE ABLE TO INCLUDE THIS IN THE LEGISLATION? BECAUSE WHEN WE 10 TALK ABOUT COALITION BUILDING ON THE CAMPAIGN, WE WANT TO MAKE 11 SURE THAT WE HAVE THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY ON OUR SIDE. 12 13 REBECCA LONG: YES, THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. GREAT QUESTION. THE 14 15 BAY AREA COUNCIL AND THE SILICON VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP ARE 16 PART OF OUR WORKING GROUP, AS WELL AS [INDISCERNIBLE], AND 17 NORTH BAY LEADERSHIP COUNCIL ET CETERA, SO WE'RE DEFINITELY BRINGING THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY INTO THE FOLD HERE AS YOU 18 RECALL THE REVENUE OPTIONS THAT ARE ON THE TABLE INCLUDING 19 PAYROLL TAX WOULD TAX AND I WOULD SAY THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY 20 21 IS MUCH MORE FAVORABLY INCLINED WITH SOME KIND OF BENEFIT THAT THEY WOULD BE REQUIRED TO EMPLOYEES THAN A TAX THEY'RE GOING 22 TO BE PAYING UNIVERSALLY. SO YOU KNOW THERE IS CERTAINLY 23 PREFERENCE THERE THE OTHER THING THAT WE HAVE HEARD 24

SPECIFICALLY FROM THE BAY AREA COUNCIL IS THEY PREFER



SOMETHING THAT'S MORE FLEXIBLE TRANSIT SUBSIDY MANDATE BECAUSE 1 SOME EMPLOYEES THEY'RE JUST NOT LOCATED NEAR EFFECTIVE TRANSIT 2 3 AND MAYBE A BIKESHARE SUBSIDY. I THINK THEY LIKE THAT FLEXIBILITY. 4 5 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. IN REGARDS TO THE GEOGRAPHIC 6 AREA OF TAX. MENTIONS SUBSET. HOW DOES THAT WORK? DOES EACH 7 8 COUNTY GET TO WEIGH IN AND SAY YES OR NO, WE WILL JOIN? OR NOT? 9 10 REBECCA LONG: SO THE WAY THAT'S BEEN STRUCTURED IN PRIOR 11 REGIONAL MEASURES, AND THIS INCLUDES OUR REGIONAL GAS TAX, 12 WHICH NOT EVERY COMMISSIONER MAY KNOW WE HAVE THAT AUTHORITY. 13 WE HAVE NEVER PURSUED IT BECAUSE THERE'S NEVER BEEN A PATH. 14 JOIN OR NOT. SO THE WAY THAT'S BEEN STRUCTURED, GAS TAX, 15 16 CHOOSING SUBSET DECISION RESTS WITH MTC LIKEWISE BAHFA THERE IS THE OPTION YOU HAVE THE MEASURE ON THE NINE COUNTIES BUT 17 THE DECISION DOES REST WITH BAHFA NOT THE COUNTIES WE DON'T 18 THINK WE WANT TO BE OUT THE GATE OFFERING OPT OUT. 19 20 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: FINALLY YOU THE LETTER FROM VTA, THOSE 21 ITEMS, RETURN TO SOURCE, THE VTA IS THE LIMIT POTENTIAL LIMIT 22 OR NOT HAVING A LIMIT OF RENEWING LOCAL MEASURES? IS THAT 23

LANGUAGE -- ENABLING LEGISLATION OPEN ENOUGH FLEXIBLE ENOUGH



THAT THOSE ITEMS WILL BE ADDRESSED LATER? OR IS THAT SOMETHING 1 2 THAT WE SHOULD BE CHANGING NOW? 3 REBECCA LONG: THE ACTION STAFF IS ASKING THE COMMISSION TO 4 5 APPROVE TODAY REALLY DOES HAVE A LOT OF FLEXIBILITY BUILT INTO IT. WE'RE COGNIZANT OF THE NEED TO ENSURE A BALANCED 6 EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT IS BALANCED ACROSS THE REGION AS WELL. 7 8 SO, I THINK THERE IS NOTHING IN THE ACTION TODAY THAT PRECLUDES FURTHER CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT. AND ENSURING THAT, 9 10 YOU KNOW, SANTA CLARA CAN'T FEELS LIKE IT'S GETTING A REASONABLE APPROACH IN THE WAY THAT LEGISLATION IS CRAFTED. 11 12 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. 13 14 15 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. GREAT QUESTIONS. COMMISSIONER AHN? 16 EDDIE AHN: YES. I WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE COMMISSIONER SCHAFF'S 17 COMMENTS. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THEM FOR THEIR NUANCE. AND 18 PART OF WHAT I HAVE BEEN THINKING THROUGH AS A COMMISSIONER 19 BOTH ON THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS, THAT HAD A HUGE HEARING ON 20 21 THIS LAST TIME, AND TODAY IS REALLY THE COALITION LETTER THAT HOPEFULLY YOU HAVE BEFORE YOU TODAY, CLOSE TO 40 GROUPS HAVE 22 TALKED ABOUT AND I'M NOT GOING REHASH ALL ARGUMENTS ON HIGHWAY 23 WIDENING ITSELF, BUT TALKED ABOUT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF 24

THIS MEASURE. PART OF WHAT I'M THINKING THROUGH IS THE



- 1 FOOTNOTE ABOUT THE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR ON ROADS. THE NUANCE
- 2 ABOUT CAPITAL INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS I APPRECIATE IT AND
- 3 I WANT TO REMIND THE ADVOCATES THERE IS CLEAR LEGISLATURE
- 4 GOING BACK TO THE VOTERS ANOTHER CHALLENGE, MANY WAYS REVENUE
- 5 RAISING MEASURE IN MIND AT LEAST INTEREST WHAT'S IN THEM SO
- 6 THAT'S GOING TO BE SOMETHING AROUND ROADS BUT HOW MUCH WILL
- 7 REALLY BE THE QUESTION WE'RE MEASURING.

8

9 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER AHN. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

- 11 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. I WAS GOING TO SAY THAT'S THE POINT
- 12 AND DROP THE MIC RIGHT THERE. THAT'S A GOOD JUMPING OFF POINT.
- 13 I DON'T KNOW WHO THIS QUESTION IS MOST SUITED FOR, BUT ONE OF
- 14 THE THINGS REBECCA YOU JUST TALKED ABOUT IS THE LEVEL OF
- 15 ANALYSIS THAT'S REQUIRED TO MAKE NEXT STEPS DETERMINATIONS.
- 16 AND ONE THING I GENERALLY DON'T UNDERSTAND ALL OF THE DETAILS
- 17 OF IS ALL OF THE DIFFERENT SOURCES OF FUNDING THAT COME
- 18 THROUGH MTC NOW, AND WHAT THEY'RE ABLE TO BE USED FOR RELATIVE
- 19 TO WHAT WE WOULD WANT TO USE A SALES TAX FOR. AND I'M GOING TO
- 20 USE SALES TAX BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE THE CORPORATIONS AREN'T
- 21 GOING TO SUPPORT ANYTHING ELSE. I FEEL LIKE THAT WHOLE LIST
- 22 IS, FRANKLY, A LITTLE BIT DISINGENUOUS JUST GIVEN THE
- 23 FEEDBACK, AT LEAST I HAVE GOTTEN ALREADY ABOUT WHAT THE
- 24 OPTIONS ARE. BUT ALL SAID THAT, WITH WE STARTED TALKING ABOUT
- 25 THIS INITIATIVE, I THOUGHT THAT A BIG PIECE OF IT WAS THE NEED



FOR RESOURCES FOR OPERATIONS. BECAUSE WE KNOW THAT WE HAVE TO 1 FIGURE OUT A WAY TO SUBSIDIZE THOSE OPERATIONS. SO, WHERE --2 3 YOU KNOW, I GUESS WHAT I'M ASKING IS, WHEN WILL WE SEE ALL THE LAYERS THAT THIS IS WHAT WE USE OBAG FOR, THIS IS WHAT WE GET 4 FROM THE FEDS ANNUALLY, FROM THE STATE, AND THEREFORE WHAT 5 6 WE'RE RECOMMENDING FOR THE SALES TAX IS X AND Y. 7 8 REBECCA LONG: SO, I -- THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. THERE IS TWO KIND OF OUESTIONS THERE; WHAT IS THE ELIGIBILITY OF ALL THE 9 EXISTING RESOURCES THAT MTC CONTROLS THAT SUPPORT TRANSIT 10 OPERATIONS. AND WE CAN CERTAINLY PROVIDE THAT FOR YOU. YOU 11 KNOW, THERE IS ACTUALLY NOT THAT MANY STATE OR FEDERAL FUNDS 12 THAT SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS. AND WE HAVE SOME FLEXIBILITY 13 14 CINDY CHAVEZ: IT'S NOT JUST OPERATIONS, REBECCA. LIKE, WHAT --15 16 LET ME JUST SAY THIS TO COLLEAGUES. WE SENT A LETTER AND ONE OF IT DEMONSTRATES THAT IN OUR COUNTY WE ARE GENERATING ALMOST 17 \$900 MILLION A YEAR THROUGH SALES TAX. WE TAX OURSELVES TO 18 DEATH OVER TRANSPORTATION -- WE'RE JUST -- WANT BART SO BADLY 19 AND WE WANT ALL THESE -- WE WANT ALL THE TOYS -- [LAUGHTER] --20 AND BECAUSE WE, FRANKLY, HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO GET ACCESS TO 21 RESOURCES -- THAT I'M SURE YOU ALL STRUGGLE WITH TOO -- IS WE 22 HAVE TAXED OURSELVES PRETTY HEAVILY TO ADDRESS THAT. AND IN 23 OPERATIONS, ANNUALLY, OUR OWN LOCAL TAXES GENERATE ALMOST 400 24

MILLION IN OPERATIONS. AND, SO, THERE ARE TWO INPUTS, TO ME,



- 1 THAT ARE REALLY SIGNIFICANT. WHAT ARE -- WHAT ARE WE
- 2 ACCESSING, NATIONALLY AND STATEWIDE, IN ALL THE LAYERS, AND
- 3 THEN WHAT ARE WE DOING LOCALLY, SO THAT WHATEVER IT IS THAT
- 4 WE'RE TAXING OURSELVES FOR, WE CAN HAVE A ROBUST HONEST
- 5 DISCUSSION ABOUT WHAT IT IS THAT WE NEED THE REVENUE FOR. AND
- 6 I THINK, COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID, LOOK, WE RECOGNIZE THAT
- 7 BART, MUNI, AC TRANSIT, LIKE, ALL -- LIKE, WE'RE TRYING TO
- 8 MAINTAIN THE LEVEL OF SERVICE AND KEEP THE LEVEL OF SERVICE,
- 9 AND I THINK THE POINT THAT MARGARET RAISED IS RIGHT ON, IF WE
- 10 WANT ONE PATH WE KNOW WE NEED IT AND WE'RE GOING TO REQUIRE A
- 11 LEVEL OF SUBSIDY, WHERE DOES THE MONEY COME FROM? TO ME IT'S
- 12 LIKE A HAMBURGER QUESTION, WHAT IS THE TOP BUN, WHAT ARE WE
- 13 DOING LOCALLY, AND WHAT ARE WE TRYING TO ACHIEVE HERE AND IT
- 14 WOULD HELP ME ANSWER ANOTHER QUESTION. I WANT TO REINFORCE
- 15 WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING JUST SAID, AND I NEVER -- I DON'T
- 16 THINK ABOUT SANTA CLARA COUNTY ALWAYS AS HAVING AS MUCH RURAL
- 17 LAND, FOR EXAMPLE, AS YOU ALL IN SONOMA AND NAPA. WE HAVE OUR
- 18 OWN LITTLE WINE TRAIL, BY THE WAY. I'LL INVITE YOU DOWN. VERY
- 19 LITTLE THERE. [LAUGHTER] BUT MY POINT IS THAT WE'RE ALSO
- 20 DEALING WITH ROADWAYS THAT ARE VERY SIMILAR TO WHAT
- 21 COMMISSIONER RABBITT TALKED ABOUT. THE THING I'M NOT SURE
- 22 ABOUT IS DOES IT MAKE SENSE TO HAVE THAT IN THIS POT OF MONEY.
- 23 AND I CAN'T ANSWER THAT OUESTION BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW HOW ME
- 24 WHEN THE NEEDS OF THIS BROADER COMMUNITY. AND THEN THE LAST
- 25 THING I'LL SAY, COMMISSIONERS IS THAT WE -- AT SOME POINT, WE



- HAVE TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THIS DECISION WITH BEING ABLE TO SEE 1 THE WHOLE PICTURE. BECAUSE THE AREA I THINK WE'RE HAVING THE 2 3 HARDEST TIME WITH, IT'S NOT JUST CAPITAL, IT REALLY IS OPERATING. AND, SO HOW DO WE HAVE THAT DISCUSSION? SO MY FEAR 4 5 ABOUT MOVING FORWARD TODAY -- FEAR IS A STRONGER WORD THAT I MEAN IT TO BE, LOOKING AT THE BOTTOM OF THE BUN AND THE TOP OF 6 THE BUN -- I DON'T KNOW WHAT I'M VOTING ON FOR THE MIDDLE, IS 7 8 IT AN IMPOSSIBLE BURGER, WHAT IS IT? WHAT ARE WE SHOWING ON HERE. I THINK WE DO NEED TO MOVE FORWARD AND REQUEST ANALYSIS 9 THAT ANSWERS THE QUESTION ABOUT HOW ARE CAPITAL NEEDS GOING TO 10 BE MET INCLUDING ROADWAY NEEDS AND I APPRECIATE VERY MUCH THE 11 CONCERN WHAT HAPPENS IN THIS GROUP DEALING WITH SOURCES OF 12 FUNDS WHAT DOES THIS ALLOW US TO DO OR NOT DO 13 14 ANDREW FREMIER: ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, I THINK 15 16 IT'S A FAIR QUESTION IT'S COMPLICATED BECAUSE EACH OF THE REGION DOES HAVE DIFFERENT FUND SOURCES, GOLDEN GATE GETS MOST 17 OF THEIR FUNDS ON TOLLS, MUNI HAS PARKING AUTHORITY, TAX YOU 18 MENTIONED SANTA CLARA SOLANO RELIES ON SOME WORK ON THAT AREA 19 TO HELP YOU AND I'M SURE ALIX HAS A LOT MORE BACKGROUND ON 20 21 FUNDING SOURCES.
- 22
- 23 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THROUGH THE CHAIR. I WOULD BE GLAD TO SPEND
- 24 MORE TIME ON THE ATTACHMENTS B AND C AND THERE WAS SOME
- 25 CONFUSION ON THAT I WANTED TO NOTE I WANTED TO FIRST



- 1 ACKNOWLEDGE THE QUESTION YOU'RE ASKING AND UNDERSTAND, WITH
- 2 ATTACHMENT B TALKING ABOUT THE COMMISSION TODAY FEELING
- 3 COMPANY WITH THE GOAL OF THE MEASURE AND EXPENDITURE
- 4 CATEGORIES BUT ALLOWING MORE TIME TO HAVE MORE CONVERSATION
- 5 ABOUT THE MINIMUM SHARE OF THE CATEGORIES I THINK THAT'S YOUR
- 6 OUESTION YOU WANT THAT WRAP AROUND TO ALLOW FURTHER
- 7 STAKEHOLDER LEGISLATIVE ENGAGEMENT AND WE ARE RECOMMENDING A
- 8 FLEXIBLE CATEGORY BECAUSE WE KNOW THINGS DO CHANGE. THOSE ARE
- 9 THINGS THAT CAN COME BACK IN THE COMING MONTHS AND GIVE YOU
- 10 THE FULLER PICTURE AND WRAP AROUND. WE'RE IN THE MIDST OF
- 11 UPDATING PLANNED BAY AREA, WHICH IS GOING TO TACKLE SOME OF
- 12 THE OUESTIONS ON THE NEEDS ON SOME OF THE PROJECTS AND
- 13 OBVIOUSLY THE WORK WE HAVE DONE WITH YOU ON STATE MONEY WE'RE
- 14 CONTINUING TO LOOK AT TRANSIT OPERATING NEEDS AND THE LETTER
- 15 FROM VTA MENTIONED THE OPERATING NEEDS FOR THE BART EXTENSION
- 16 FROM SILICON VALLEY. WE CAN CERTAINLY COME BACK ON THAT. WE'RE
- 17 ASKING YOU TO TAKE AN ACTION ON CERTAIN PARAMETERS OF THE
- 18 ENABLING LEGISLATION BUT ALSO SAYING THERE IS MORE WORK TO DO
- 19 AND I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT WAS CLEAR. AND I PART OF THAT
- 20 IS WRAPPED IN THE OUESTION YOU'RE FRAMING?
- 22 CINDY CHAVEZ: ARE I THINK THIS DOCUMENT WITHOUT THAT
- 23 INFORMATION IS A LITTLE BIT CHALLENGING AT LEAST FOR ME. I'LL
- 24 JUST SAY, I KNOW THAT YOU ALL -- AND I WANT TO DEFER TO THE
- 25 LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE, BECAUSE I'M NOT ON IT AS HAVING HAD



- 1 THIS DISCUSSION FOR A WHILE, I DON'T WANT TO GIVE THE
- 2 IMPRESSION THAT I OR ANYBODY IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY DOESN'T
- 3 UNDERSTAND WE HAVE A NEED FOR RESOURCES. BUT EVEN THOSE
- 4 CATEGORIES ARE A LITTLE CHALLENGING. BECAUSE, IF, FOR EXAMPLE,
- 5 WHAT WE SAID IS THAT, THAT FOR RM3, AND I KNOW WE HAD ACTIONS
- 6 ON THAT EARLIER, WE ANTICIPATE WE'RE GOING TO BE SPENDING Y
- 7 AMOUNT ON BRIDGES, ROADS, SO IN A WAY, FOR SOME NUMBER OF
- 8 YEARS, ARE WE COVERED THERE? SO SOME NUMBER OF YEARS ARE WE
- 9 REALLY GOING TO BE LOOKING AT LEANING IN HEAVY ON OPERATIONS.
- 10 FRANKLY, A LITTLE BIT OF THE ROAD INVESTMENT COMING OUT OF
- 11 THIS POT, BECAUSE, FRANKLY, IN COMMUNITY, THE ONLY WAY WE GET
- 12 STUFF LIKE THIS, REALLY PEOPLE GET EXCITED ABOUT IT IS WHEN
- 13 THEY THINK THEY'RE NOT GOING TO BE KILLING THEMSELVES IN A
- 14 POTHOLE. SO, FROM A -- IF WHAT YOU'RE SAYING IS -- AND AGAIN,
- 15 I'M GOING TO LOOK TO THE LEADERSHIP OF THE COMMISSION HERE TO
- 16 SAY, YOU KNOW, WE -- THIS IS THE BEGINNING OF A CONVERSATION.
- 17 THAT'S NOT WHAT THIS IS. THAT'S WHY I'M ASKING FOR THIS
- 18 ANALYSIS. IT'S ISN'T EVEN TO SAY THAT -- AND I LOOK TO MY
- 19 COLLEAGUES -- IF YOU THINK THERE IS ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY IN HERE
- 20 TO GET THOSE QUESTIONS RESPONDED TO AND IF THE LEG COMMITTEE
- 21 WOULD LOOK AT ALL THE DIFFERENT LEVELS OF FUNDING AND FRANKLY
- 22 THE REASON I INSISTED THAT THE COUNTY OR VTA WRITE A LETTER
- 23 TODAY IS THAT I RECOGNIZE EACH OF OUR COUNTIES HAS DONE REALLY
- 24 DIFFERENT THINGS TO TRY TO MEET THE LOCAL NEEDS. SO THEY'RE A
- 25 LITTLE BIT JENGA. I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THIS MEANS.



- 1 AND I'M GOING SAY THIS OUT LOUD. WE DON'T HAVE A CHOICE BUT TO
- 2 KEEP EXTENDING SOME OF OUR LOCAL SALES TAX AND THERE WOULD BE
- 3 NO WAY THAT THIS REGIONAL MEASURE GENERATES ENOUGH MONEY FOR
- 4 US NOT TO DO THAT WE ACTUALLY CAUSING SOME OF OUR LOCAL
- 5 JURISDICTIONS TO HAVE MORE PRESSURE ON MTC TO BE ABLE TO FUND
- 6 ALL OF THIS. THOSE ARE THE OPERATIONAL QUESTIONS I WANT TO
- 7 UNDERSTAND I'M GOING TO DEFER LEADERSHIP TODAY I DON'T WANT
- 8 STAFF TO COME BACK AND SAY OH MY GOD IT WAS UNANIMOUS YOU
- 9 TOTALLY AGREED TO EVERYTHING. I'M NOT -- BUT WHAT I'M SAYING I
- 10 WANT TO SUPPORT I THINK WE SHOULD NOT MOVE WITHOUT GETTING
- 11 THIS INFORMATION.

12

- 13 DAVID CANEPA: SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ BECAUSE I THINK YOU'RE HONING
- 14 IN ON THE DETAILS IT'S SO IMPORTANT AND ONE THING THE LEG
- 15 COMMITTEE WAS LOOKING AT IS REALLY THE, SORT OF, BIGGER
- 16 PICTURE. BUT I THINK YOU HAVE SHED A LIGHT AND HOPEFULLY
- 17 WORKING WITH ALIX, WORKING WITH REBECCA, WE REALLY NEED TO
- 18 KIND OF FIGURE THIS OUT AND WE NEED TO HAVE A DETAILED PLAN.
- 19 SO, I THINK YOUR OBSERVATION, YOUR PERCEPTION, IS SPOT ON. AND
- 20 TO STAFF, I THINK WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO. AND, SO, I
- 21 THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS. AND MISS FLEMING?

- 23 VICTORIA FLEMING: THANK YOU. I'M COMING IN A LITTLE BIT LATE.
- 24 I HAD NOT BEEN ON THE LEGISLATE YOU COMMITTEE, AND HAVING



MISSED THE LAST APPARENTLY GRAND DEBATE OVER THIS. I HOPE I 1 DIDN'T MISS TOO MUCH. BUT IT SOUNDS LIKE IT WAS --2 3 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] 4 5 VICTORIA FLEMING: WELL, USUALLY WHEN YOU MISS SOMETHING ON 6 THAT LEVEL YOU'RE LUCKY TO HAVE DONE SO. THANK YOU EVERYBODY 7 8 FOR THE ROBUST CONVERSATION THAT REALLY HELPS ME HAVE A BETTER SENSE OF WHAT I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHICH IS REALLY WHAT THE BILL 9 IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE AND I THINK THAT MIGHT BE WHAT THE 10 TREPIDATION IS UNDERNEATH ALL THIS WE WANT TO SUPPORT 11 SOMETHING BUT WE DON'T WANT TO SUPPORT SOMETHING THAT WE DON'T 12 KNOW WHAT IT IS AND THERE IS NO DOING ONE WITHOUT THE OTHER 13 IT'S RAY CHICKEN AND EGG THING AND WE WANT TO GO BACK TO OUR 14 COMMUNITIES AND BE ABLE TO SAY WHAT IT IS THAT WE'RE STANDING 15 16 BEHIND THIS PUTS US IF A POSITION NEEDING TO SAY YES WITHOUT KNOWING HOW WE'RE GOING TO COMMUNICATE THAT. WHICH BRINGS ME 17 TO THE POINT OF WHEN WE DO HAVE MORE INFORMATION -- WHICH I 18 HOPE IS FORTHCOMING -- THAT WE ARE GIVEN THE TOOLS -- AND I 19 KNOW YOU GUYS ARE GREAT ABOUT THIS -- TO COMMUNICATE WITH OUR 20 21 COMMUNITIES ABOUT WHAT IS IN IT FOR THEM, TO COMMISSIONER 22 AHN'S POINT. BECAUSE IF WE DON'T DO THAT AND WE DON'T HAVE CONSENSUS, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET ANYWHERE, AND WE ALL 23 DESPERATELY KNOW WE NEED TO GET SOMEWHERE. AND THEN, I DO HAVE 24

A QUESTION ABOUT THE SUBSETS AND ABOUT BAHFA. IT WAS SAID THAT



BAHFA HAS THE AUTHORITY DO THIS. IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT 1 2 ACRONYM IS THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, AND SO THIS TRANSIT BILL WOULD FALL UNDER OUR HOUSING FINANCE? 3 4 5 REBECCA LONG: APOLOGIES, COMMISSIONER. NO. THAT WAS IN REFERENCE TO THE QUESTION ABOUT COULD COUNTIES OPT OUT AND HOW 6 WOULD THIS BE STRUCTURED. SO, IN THE CASE OF BAHFA, TOTALLY 7 8 SEPARATE, NOTHING TO DO WITH THIS MEASURE. 9 10 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] [LAUGHTER] 11 VICTORIA FLEMING: ON A LEVEL THAT I HAD NOT YET -- I WAS 12 TRYING TO PUT THAT TOGETHER IN MY MIND. THANK YOU FOR THE 13 CLARIFICATION. I HAVE SPOKEN TO MY TRANSIT PROVIDER IN THE 14 COMMUNITY THAT I REPRESENT AND THERE IS SOME TREPIDATION ABOUT 15 16 THE NOTION OF A SUBSET AND THOSE OF US WHO -- COMMISSIONER RABBITT SAYS WE LIVE IN A SUBURBAN AREA. HE MIGHT LIVE IN A 17 SUBURBAN AREA. I LIVE IN A SMALL URBAN AREA. [LAUGHTER] BUT 18 ANYWAY, TO THAT POINT THAT WE -- THAT WE WANT TO MAKE SURE 19 WE'RE NOT LEFT BEHIND. AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE DON'T WANT 20 21 TO TAINT IT; WE DON'T WANT TO GET LEFT BEHIND AND WE WANT TO 22 FIND A WAY TO GET EVERYONE TO GET WHERE THEY NEED. THANK YOU. 23 DAVID CANEPA: MAYOR? [LAUGHTER] 24



- 1 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: [LAUGHTER] OKAY. I DO HAVE A NAME. THANK
- 2 YOU. IT'S MAYOR, EXACTLY. YEAH. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. IN ANY CASE.
- 3 I APPRECIATE THIS CONVERSATION. AND FOR THOSE THAT WEREN'T
- 4 ABLE TO GO BACK AND TAKE A LOOK AT THE LEG MEETING, IT REALLY
- 5 WAS, AS THEY SAY, A ROBUST CONVERSATION ON ALL POINTS. IN
- 6 TERMS OF PROCESS, WE HAVE BEEN TOLD THAT SENATOR WIENER'S
- 7 BILL, THERE WILL BE AN AMENDMENT MID-TO LATE FEBRUARY. AND I'M
- 8 TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, BECAUSE WE'RE BUILDING IN THIS
- 9 FLEXIBILITY, BUT HOW DOES THAT WORK IN TERMS OF THIS TIMELINE?
- 10 AND RELATION TO THIS BILL? ARE THEY TWO SEPARATE THINGS. HE
- 11 JUST SAYS PUT FORTH THE BILL, GO FORTH MTC, AND THEN WE TAKE
- 12 THE TIME UNTIL WHAT POINT IN TIME TO COME UP WITH THE LEVEL OF
- 13 DETAIL THAT GIVES FOLKS COMFORT AS TO WHETHER THEY WANT TO
- 14 BUY-IN OR NOT?

- 16 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. THE WAY I WOULD FRAME IT
- 17 IS THE DIRECTION THAT WE'RE ASKING FOR TODAY IS REALLY THE
- 18 SCAFFOLDING OF THE LEGISLATION. IT'S THE VISION, IT'S THE
- 19 EXPENDITURE CATEGORY. IT'S THE REVENUE OPTIONS, ET CETERA. SO
- 20 WE WOULD BE WORKING WITH SENATOR WIENER'S OFFICE AND
- 21 LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ON DRAFTING LEGISLATION THAT ALIGNS WITH
- 22 THAT, AND THEN THE BILL WILL BE SUBSTANTIVELY AMENDED MULTIPLE
- 23 TIMES, I WOULD PREDICT. A.B. 1487, THE BAHFA BILL WAS AMENDED
- 24 ABOUT SEVEN TIMES. RIGHT? SO WITH EACH OF THOSE IMPORTANT
- 25 JUNCTURES WHERE WE'RE GRAPPLING WITH SOME OF THESE KEY



- 1 OUESTIONS, WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO THIS BODY. AND IF YOU
- 2 ENDORSE US BEING SPONSORED,, I THINK SENATOR WEINER
- 3 APPRECIATES THAT IS REALLY -- IT IS OUR NAME ASSOCIATED WITH
- 4 THIS BILL, AND HE'S GOING TO GIVE A LOT OF DEFERENCE TO THE
- 5 COMMISSION ON WHAT SPECIFIC LANGUAGE WE WANT TO SEE IN THE
- 6 BILL.

7

- 8 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I APPRECIATE THAT. BECAUSE AS YOU WERE
- 9 SPEAKING, I JUST REMEMBERED, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET THIS BILL
- 10 ON THIS NOVEMBER WE'RE TALKING NOVEMBER. WE'RE TALKING A
- 11 COUPLE OF YEARS OUT. SO, THERE IS PLENTY OF TIME FOR
- 12 CONVERSATION.

13

- 14 REBECCA LONG: SORRY, JUST TO FOLLOW UP ON THAT. WE ARE
- 15 PURSUING LEGISLATION IN 2024. WE WANT THE LEGISLATION TO BE
- 16 ENACTED BUT WE DON'T ANTICIPATE -- WE'RE NOT SEEKING TO PUT IT
- 17 ON THE BALLOT THIS YEAR. BUT WE WANT THE TOOL IN THE TOOLBOX.

18

19 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: RIGHT. OKAY. THANK YOU.

20

- 21 DAVID CANEPA: I'M GOING TO GO TO MOULTON-PETERS, THEN NOACK,
- 22 THEN WE'LL CONCLUDE WITH CHAIR PEDROZA.

- 24 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: THANK YOU, CHAIR. FOR THOSE OF YOU
- 25 WHO ARE NOT ON THE LEG COMMITTEE, I WANT TO OFFER SOME PROCESS



- 1 INSIGHTS THAT MIGHT BE HELPFUL. THIS IS THE BEGINNING. IT IS
- 2 THE FRAMEWORK AND SCAFFOLD; THAT'S HOW WE TALKED ABOUT IT AT
- 3 THE LEG COMMITTEE. AND OVER TIME THERE IS WORK TO BE DONE TO
- 4 CRAFT A WORK PLAN WITH OUR PARTNERS THAT WOULD BE SUPPORTED BY
- 5 ADVOCATES. AND I THINK, AND WOULD LOVE CONFIRMATION, DAVID,
- 6 BECAUSE I THINK YOU AND I TALKED ABOUT THIS, AS WELL AS
- 7 ALFREDO, THERE WILL BE CHECK POINTS FOR US TO LOOK AT HOW IS
- 8 IT ALL COMING TOGETHER. WE'LL BE DOING SOME ADDITIONAL
- 9 POLLING. WE'LL HEAR FROM THE VOTERS, WHAT DO THEY THINK. SO
- 10 THERE WILL BE TIME TO TUNE IT TO COME UP WITH A PROPOSAL THAT
- 11 IS -- AS COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID -- THAT HAS THE BEST CHANCE
- 12 OF WINNING. SO, IT'S ITERATIVE. THIS ISN'T THE END. IT'S THE
- 13 BEGINNING. AND MY UNDERSTANDING IS THERE IS GOING TO BE CHECK
- 14 POINTS FOR US TO ASSESS HOW WE'RE DOING ON THIS. IS THAT A
- 15 FAIR CHARACTERIZATION?

- 17 DAVID CANEPA: VERY FAIR, I THINK. WE HAVE LEARNED A LOT. OUR
- 18 LEGISLATIVE STAFF HAVE LEARNED THAT -- AND WE HAVE ALL
- 19 LEARNED, RIGHT, IN OUR ROLES -- THAT THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS,
- 20 YOU KNOW, DOESN'T ALWAYS RUN STRAIGHT. THERE IS GOING TO BE
- 21 DIFFERENT CHANGES THAT TAKE PLACE. I THINK REBECCA HAD
- 22 REFERENCED THE NUMBER EIGHT TIMES. SO, I THINK ONE OF THE
- 23 THINGS THAT WE HAVE HAD BUILT IN FROM THE BEGINNING, AND YOU
- 24 COULD SEE IT THROUGH THIS ROBUST CONVERSATION, THIS
- 25 FLEXIBILITY HAS ALLOWED US TO MOVE FORWARD. AND YOU KNOW, LET



ME JUST SAY, ONE PIECE, I THINK, YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER SCHAFF 1 2 WAS RIGHT WHEN SHE TALKED ABOUT THE ENVIRONMENTAL PIECE. THE 3 ENVIRONMENTAL PIECE. BUT IF WE DON'T HAVE OUR BUSINESS AND LABOR PARTNERS, AS WELL, THIS WILL DIE. IT WILL DIE. AND THE 4 5 REASON IT WILL DIE IS BECAUSE WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE NUMBERS OF PEOPLE WHO ACTUALLY USE TRANSPORTATION, WE'RE LOOKING THE 6 TOTAL BAY AREA. THAT TOTAL PICTURE. THAT NUMBER IS VERY 7 8 NOMINAL. AND I THINK WHAT THIS COLLECTIVE BODY HAS DONE TODAY, OR WE'RE GETTING TO, IS REALLY SAYING, YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT 9 GOING TO SILO IN, SORT OF, THE LABOR CAMP, OR WE'RE NOT GOING 10 TO SILO IN THE BUSINESS, OR SILO IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL. WE'RE 11 TRYING TO FIND A BILL THAT MAKES IT EASIER FOR THE BAY AREA 12 DELEGATION TO REALLY KIND OF COME TOGETHER ON. SO YOUR 13 OBSERVATION ABOUT THE FLEXIBILITY AND THE GAME PLAN MAY CHANGE 14 15 IS REALLY SPOT ON. IT'S FACTUAL, COMMISSIONER. YES? 16 SUE NOACK: STEPHANIE AND I ARE THINKING ALIKE EVERYBODY'S GOT 17 A LOT OF GREAT POINTS ON DETAILS THAT ARE GOING TO HAVE BE TO 18 BE PURSUED OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS IN ORDER ON GET A 19 MEASURE PASSED. I WAS PLEASED TO SEE THE AMOUNT OF FLEXIBILITY 20 IN THIS LEGISLATION IN ORDER TO GIVE US THE FLEXIBILITY OVER 21

THE NEXT TWO YEARS TO GET THE RIGHT MEASURE DONE IN TWO YEARS.

AND I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. I THINK TO TRY TO SAY,

YEARS FROM NOW IS PUTTING THE CART WAY BEFORE THE HORSE. SO,

only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TODAY, WHAT THAT ACTUAL MEASURE IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE TWO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience

22

23

24



- 1 FOR ME IT WAS REALLY IMPORTANT TO HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY IN THIS
- 2 MEASURE TO MAKE FURTHER DISCUSSIONS, TO LOOK AT CHANGES AS
- 3 THEY HAPPEN OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS. BECAUSE WE'RE STILL
- 4 SETTLING IN AFTER THE PANDEMIC, RIGHT? THERE IS GOING TO BE
- 5 SOME CHANGES THAT ARE GOING HAPPEN OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS. SO
- 6 FOR THE LEG COMMITTEE I THINK THE KEY FACTOR WAS GETTING
- 7 FLEXIBILITY IN HERE TO GET WHAT WE NEED DONE IN 2026 BUT GIVE
- 8 US FLEXIBILITY TO HAVE A LOT MORE ROBUST CONVERSATIONS TO GET
- 9 TO THE MEASURE THE WAY WE WANT IT TO BE IN 2026 OR WHATEVER
- 10 THAT DATE IS. THANK YOU.

11

- 12 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR GLOVER THEN SUPERVISOR
- 13 SPERING THEN COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND THEN MR. PEDROZA TO
- 14 FINISH.

- 16 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S COMMENTS
- 17 TODAY BECAUSE TEAR ALL RIGHT ON SPOT. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I
- 18 DETERMINED BECOMING CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS THIS
- 19 YEAR IS THE COMMON THING AND I THINK YOU HAVE HIT ON ALL THOSE
- 20 THINGS AND THAT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF THE
- 21 MEASURE PASSING BECAUSE YOU HAVE SO MANY INTERESTS. I
- 22 FINISHING WE HAD A CHECKLIST THAT CONSISTED OF DIVERSITY,
- 23 EOUITY, INCLUSION, AND ACCESS, IT HITS ON EVERYTHING THAT'S
- 24 BEEN TALKED ABOUT AROUND THIS TABLE. AROUND THIS DAIS. SO, IF
- 25 WE'RE ABLE TO REALLY CHECK OURSELVES ON ALL OF THOSE POINTS AT



- 1 EVERY DECISION THAT'S BEEN MADE WITH ALL THE VARIOUS
- 2 INTERESTS, WE'LL COME UP WITH A MEASURE THAT'S WORKABLE AND
- 3 THAT COULD BE SUPPORTED BY ALL ENTITIES. SO, AGAIN, I'M GOING
- 4 ON SAY, DIVERSITY, EQUITY, INCLUSION, AND ACCESS FOR ALL PARTS
- 5 OF THE REGION WILL MAKE A DIFFERENCE IN PASSING THE MEASURE.

6

7 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

8

- 9 JAMES P. SPERING: WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL WHEN WE TALK ABOUT
- 10 FINDING THIS BALANCE. YOU KNOW, OPERATING FUNDS ARE EXTREMELY
- 11 DIFFICULT TO COME BY. CAPITAL FUNDS COME FROM A LOT OF OTHER
- 12 SOURCES. SO, I THINK THERE HAS TO BE A FUNDAMENTAL AGREEMENT
- 13 THAT OPERATING FUNDS IS A VERY IMPORTANT PIECE OF THIS
- 14 MEASURE. AND THAT IS A PRINCIPLE THAT WE ALL HAVE TO AGREE ON.
- 15 THE OTHER STUFF THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, AS I SAID, I THINK
- 16 CAN BE FUNDED FROM A LOT OF DIFFERENT SOURCES. BUT YOU CAN'T
- 17 JUST PRECLUDE THEM BECAUSE WE WENT GET THE PUBLIC SUPPORT THAT
- 18 WE NEED. BUT OUR FOCUS HAS GOT TO BE ON THOSE OPERATING FUNDS.
- 19 AND I HOPE THAT, COLLECTIVELY, WE CAN ALL AGREE ON THAT.

20

21 DAVID CANEPA: CHAIR PEDROZA?

- 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. AND I REALLY
- 24 LIKE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S COMMENTS ABOUT A HAMBURGER RIGHT
- 25 BEFORE LUNCH. [LAUGHTER] YOU KNOW, AND TO ME, YOU KNOW, LOOK,



- 1 I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE COMMENTS, AND I APPRECIATE
- 2 COMMISSIONERS LEAN INTO THIS AND GETTING UNCOMFORTABLE,
- 3 BECAUSE WE HAVE TO. SLIDE FIVE ILLUSTRATES THE CATEGORIES OF
- 4 WHAT'S ON THE MENU, AND TO ME THERE HAS TO BE CONSENSUS. AND
- 5 CHAIR CHAVEZ ASKING THE PARTNERS TO GET TOGETHER AND FIND
- 6 CONSENSUS IS ABSOLUTELY APPROPRIATE. AND I LOOK AT A COUPLE OF
- 7 COMMISSIONERS, WE HAVE TO GET UNCOMFORTABLE AND WE CAN'T LET
- 8 THE PERFECT GET IN THE WAY OF AN OUTCOME THAT WE KNOW WE
- 9 DESPERATELY NEED AND WE NEED PARTNERS TO NOT JUST BE SELF-
- 10 INTEREST THAT YOU HAVE TO LOOK AT SHARE WITH EVERYONE WHERE
- 11 THERE IS ENOUGH FOR EVERYONE TO GET WHAT THEY WANT THEN THERE
- 12 IS THE PUBLIC WHO MATTERS MOST WHO VOTE AND THAT'S WATERED
- 13 DOWN THAT'S THE MA'AM BURGER THEY DON'T LIKE. WE'RE DEALING
- 14 WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA, INTERSECTION OF HOUSING, CLIMATE,
- 15 AND TRANSIT, AND THEY DIDN'T ALL PULL IN THE SAME DIRECTION,
- 16 BUT WE FIND COMPROMISE THAT WORKS FOR US AND ALLOW US TO GO
- 17 BACK INTO OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES AND SUPPORT THE MAP OF WHAT WE
- 18 WERE TRYING TO BUILD. IT'S GOING TO GET PROGRESSIVELY HARDER,
- 19 BECAUSE WE'RE DEALING WITH MORE INTEREST THAT ARE BEING PULLED
- 20 UP BY THE PUBLIC SO JUST ASK THE COMMISSION AS WE GO FORWARD
- 21 TO DON'T BECOME POSITIONAL. TALKING ABOUT INTEREST, WE HAVE TO
- 22 LOOK AT THE PROPOSED FUNDING CATEGORIES. I APPRECIATE YOU ALL
- 23 LEAN INTO THIS AND DOING YOUR HOMEWORK SO WE'RE PREPARED. I
- 24 KNOW STAFF HAS BEEN WORKING VERY HARD. WE HAVE HAD LATE
- 25 CONVERSATIONS AROUND THIS. BUT YOU'RE TRYING TO FIND THE



BALANCE. BUT I DON'T WANT US TO GET TOO CAUGHT UP IN TRYING TO 1 FIND A BALANCE THAT DOESN'T DELIVER THE OUTCOMES THAT WE NEED 2 3 FOR OUR REGION. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA FOR LEADING THIS CHARGE. 4 5 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. IT JUST MAKES ME WANT TO HAVE A 6 7 DOUBLE-DOUBLE. SO, WITH THAT, WE'LL GO INTO PUBLIC COMMENT. 8 ANDREW FREMIER: CHAIR CANEPA, ONE POINT, I THINK THIS 9 ADDRESSES A FEW OF THE OUESTIONS AND GETS TO THE POINT CHAIR 10 SPERING AND PEDROZA MENTIONED. THE PRIMARY GOAL IS REALLY TIED 11 TO THE OPERATIONS WHOLE THAT WE ANTICIPATE. AND YOU APPROVED A 12 REPORT THROUGH SB125 TO SACRAMENTO THAT ANTICIPATES IN THE 13 14 NEIGHBORHOOD OF \$700 MILLION A YEAR, AS NECESSARY, TO KEEP TRANSIT OPERATING, AT JUST THE CURRENT LEVELS. THE THING WE'RE 15 16 TALKING ABOUT NOW ARE THE WAY TO GET CONSENSUS TO BRING THAT FORWARD. SO, I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE DON'T FORGET, 17 FIRST PRINCIPLE IS TRYING TO KEEP THE BUSES, TRAINS, FERRIES 18 RUNNING. THAT'S AN OPERATIONAL WHOLE THAT WE DON'T HAVE A REAL 19 GOOD SOLUTION FOR IN THE FUTURE, UNLESS WE GET A MEASURE 20 21 PASSED, NOW WHAT CAN WE DO TO GET CONSENSUS TO MAKE IT PASS 22 THAT IS THE PRIMARY PART OF WHAT I THINK YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY. SO, I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION A LOT. THANK YOU. 23



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF WRITTEN 1 2 CORRESPONDENCE. SO, I'LL ADDRESS THOSE FIRST THEN WE'LL GO TO 3 OUR IN-HOUSE PUBLIC COMMENTS, FOLLOWED BY THE NUMBER OF ZOOM COMMENTS. BEFORE I DO THAT, I JUST WANT TO ASK THE MEMBERS OF 4 5 THE PUBLIC, WOULD YOU PLEASE MAKE SURE THAT YOU RAISE YOUR HAND IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK SO THEY ARE NOT MISSED AND 6 ANYONE IN THE BOARDROOM, PLEASE FILL OUT A SPEAKER CARD SO 7 8 YOU'RE NOT OVERLOOKED. WITH THAT, WE HAVE RECEIVED CORRESPONDENCE FROM CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FROM JOBS, DOROTHY 9 10 BERINGER, LINDSAY HADDIX, KRISTEN BARRED, KARL STEIN, DARYL YIP, NINA RIZZO, ELIZABETH STAFFE, ASHLEY ELLIOTT, WALLY 11 LAZRETH, JOINT COALITION, LEON CHICNAK, CHICACO CHANG, 12 MARJORIE ALVORD, DR. CAROL WEED, STALEY CHEN, AND VTH 13 CHAIRPERSON CHAVEZ AND MEMBER ABE -- KOGA. WITH THAT WE'LL 14 15 TURN IT OVER TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN-HOUSE, CLAUDIA 16 BERGLES FOLLOWED BY SEAN MCMILLAN. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. 17 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS CLAUDIA, 18 DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS AT AC 19 TRANSIT. I WANT TO THANK OF THE COMMISSION AND THE STAFF FOR 20 21 CONTINUING THE IMPORTANT WORK TO ADVANCE THE REGIONAL MEASURE. SAFETY TRANSIT LIKE MANY OTHER OPERATORS IN THE REGION 22

CONTINUES TO BE IMPACTED BY ONGOING EFFECTS OF THE PANDEMIC

PANDEMIC. WE RECOGNIZE POLLING INDICATES THAT IN ADDITION TO

RIDERSHIP HAS RETURNED TO 73% OF WHAT IT WAS BEFORE THE

23

24



TRANSIT VOTERS SUPPORT OTHER EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES WE URGE 1 YOU TO NOT LOSE SIGHT OF THE IMPENDING FISCAL CLIFF THAT 2 3 TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE FACING AND THE FACT THAT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE OF COLOR WOULD BE MOST IMPACTED BY ADDITIONAL CUTS TO 4 5 SERVICE. WE DO SUPPORT INCORPORATING RIDER FOCUSED OUTCOME LANGUAGE IN THE BILL AS IT MOVES FORWARD. AS THE MEASURE 6 7 CONTINUES TO TAKE SHAPE WE ASK THAT YOU PUT EQUITY FRONT AND 8 CENTER AND WE ALSO ASK. 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU --10 11 SPEAKER: AS THE CONVERSATION REGARDING FUNDING DISTRIBUTION 12 MOVES ALONG --13 14 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 15 16 SPEAKER: SEEKING -- CHANGES THAT OPERATORS HAVE MADE. THANK 17 18 YOU. 19 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 20 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT IS SEAN MCMILLAN FOLLOWED BY EMILY 23 LOPER.



1

2

JANUARY 24, 2024

SPEAKER: HI. MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, NOT WITH AN AGENCY. I CAME

TODAY TO SUPPORT REVENUE SOURCES. THIS IS AMAZING. I LOVE TO

3 SEE THIS. I TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE LAST YEAR, MY TRANSIT HAS INCREASED 15 MINUTES PER DAY BOTH WAYS DUE TO HITTING THE 4 5 BASELINE WHICH IS UNFORTUNATE I'M EXCITED TO SEE MOVEMENT ON THIS AND MORE SOURCES OF REVENUE POSITIONS. I WOULD SUPPORT 6 STRONG LANGUAGE AROUND MINIMUM OPERATION SPENT I UNDERSTAND 7 8 IT'S COMPLEX. MINIMUM OPERATIONS ARE DEFINITELY GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT'S IMPORTANT IN THE CORE URBAN AREA. WE HAVE ALL 9 SEEN OVER THE LAST YEAR WE SPENDS A LOT OF MONEY ON HIGHWAYS 10 AND WE CAN'T FIND MONEY FOR TRANSIT SO THAT'S WHAT WE WANT TO 11 BE SEEING FROM THIS THING. THANK YOU. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EMILY LOPER. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: WE ARE SUPPORTIVE OF MTC STAFF RECOMMENDATION, IT'S A COMMON SENSE SOLUTION THAT WILL HELP INCENTIVIZE HIGHER 17 OCCUPANCY MODES OF TRAVEL WHILE ALSO ACHIEVING CONGESTION 18 RELIEF ON OUR ROADS AND HIGHWAYS FOR THE MANY RESIDENTS WHO 19 DEPEND ON CARS TO MOVE AROUND THE REGION. WE ALSO THINK IT 20 21 MAKES SENSE TO KEEP THE EXPENDITURE PLAN CATEGORY FLEXIBLE FOR 22 PURPOSES OF ENABLING LEGISLATION BUT WANT TO REITERATE WE 23 THINK THE EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT GOES TO THE BALLOT MUST BE

BALANCED THAT INCLUDES SIGNIFICANT FUNDING FOR TRANSIT TO

SUSTAIN STRAIGHT AND TO IMPROVE IT IN THE FUTURE AND ALSO ROAD

24



AND HIGHWAY IMPROVEMENTS. IN ORDER TO HAVE OUR BEST PASSING A 1 MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. CALL OUT SUPPORT FOR THE REVISED TDM 2 3 LANGUAGE. WE THINK THAT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE FOR THE EMPLOYERS. FEASIBLE FOR THE EMPLOYERS AND THAT ACHIEVES OUR 4 5 SHARED GOAL OF GETTING COMMUTERS. 6 7 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. 8 SPEAKER: OUT OF SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES. LOOK FORWARD TO 9 10 WORKING WITH YOU. 11 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT IS MANNY LEONE FOLLOWED BY CHARLIE 14 15 LAVERY. 16 SPEAKER: MANNY LEONE CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS WE ENCOURAGE 17 18 THE DEVELOPMENT OF A REGIONAL MEASURE TO SUPPORT STAFF RECOMMENDATION OF OPTION TWO WITH FEW CAVEATS WE CONTINUE TO 19 THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ANY ITEMS 20 21 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AT 22 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD OR IF YOU'RE PHONING IN 23 PLEASE DIAL STAR NINE. FOR DISCUSSION ON THE SCENARIO TWO WE

WANT TO CONTINUE THE DISCUSSION SPECIFICALLY TO INCLUDE GOODS

MOVEMENT FUNDING INTO THE SCENARIO BUT THIS IS A GOOD

24



DIRECTION FORWARD THE ALLIANCE HAS CONDUCTED EXTENSIVE POLLING 1 AND IN FACT THE IMBALANCED MEASURE WILL NOT PASS WE INTEND TO 2 3 CARRY OUT ADDITIONAL POLLING LATER THIS YEAR. THE ALLIANCE WILL SUPPORT THE REGIONAL MEASURE THAT ALLOCATES 1/3S ROADS TO 4 5 CAPITAL PROJECTS INCLUDING TRANSIT CAPITAL PROJECTS AND 1/3 TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY STANDS HERE TODAY 6 WILLING TO REQUEST WORK WITH COMMISSION STAFF IN DEVELOPING 7 8 REGIONAL MEASURE AS THE PROPOSAL MOVES THROUGH THE LEGISLATIVE 9 PROCESS. 10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHARLIE LAVERY. 11 12 SPEAKER: CHARLIE LAVERY ARE OPERATING NEARS LOCAL. WE 13 REPRESENT INFRASTRUCTURE CONSTRUCTION WORKERS NO NORTHERN 14 CALIFORNIA ON BEHALF OF 40,000 MEMBERS I WANT TO URGE 15 16 COMMISSIONERS TO ADVANCE THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND ADOPT OPTION TWO WITHOUT DELAY. WE'RE EXCITED AT THE PROSPECT OF A 17 ROBUST FUNDING MEASURE THAT BALANCES MAINTENANCE OF OPERATIONS 18 WITH INVESTMENT IN CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT WILL INVEST IN THE 19 MULTI-MODAL TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM WE NEED FOR ALL BAY AREA 20 21 RESIDENTS. OPTION TWO WILL DELIVER THE GREATEST EQUITY AND 22 CONNECT THE GREATEST DIVERSITY OF BAY AREA COMMUNITIES TO ECONOMIC ACADEMIC AND SOCIAL OPPORTUNITY I'M LOOKING FORWARD 23 TO CONTINUED ENGAGEMENT OF CONSIDERATION OF GOODS MOVEMENT AND 24

SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES AND RALLYING THE PEOPLE POWER AND



RESOURCES OF OPERATING ENGINEERS LOCAL THREE INDUSTRY AND 1 2 COMMUNITY PARTNERS TO GETTING BEHIND A BALLOT MEASURE THAT 3 WILL PASS. THANK YOU. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. SEAN McGARRY FOLLOWED BY JOSH BORED. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS SEAN OF THE 6 NORCAL CARPENTERS UNION REPRESENTING 37,000 CARPENTERS HERE IN 7 8 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. WE ASK YOU LOOK AT AND PAY ATTENTION TO SCENARIO TWO HERE TODAY. WHILE IT FEELS WITH HOV HIGH-9 OCCUPANCY VEHICLE LANES WE ASK YOU CONSIDER ADDING MOVEMENT OF 10 GOODS OPTION AS DOING SO WOULD PROVIDE UPGRADES TO THE ENTIRE 11 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AS A WHOLE. THIS WILL ALSO PUT 12 CONSTRUCTION WORKERS TO WORK IN WELL PAYING CONSTRUCTION JOBS 13 WHILE MAKING THE MUCH NEED THE IMPROVEMENT IN SAFETY AND 14 15 OUALITY FOR EVERYBODY UTILIZING THE TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. 16 THANK YOU ON BEHALF OF ALL WORKING CARPENTERS. THANK YOU. BYE-17 BYE. 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JOSH ARCY FOLLOWED BY ZACK. 19 20 SPEAKER: THANKS. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. JOSH ON BEHALF OF 21 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA LABORERS AND OUR 30,000 MEMBERS. JOINING 22 OUR PARTNERS IN THE BASIC CRAFTS ALLIANCE, CHAIR PEDROZA AND 23 THE COMMISSION AND PARTICULARLY LEGISLATION CHAIR CANEPA AND 24

COLLEAGUES WORKING WITH GREAT MTC STAFF TO GET TO THIS



- 1 BALANCED APPROACH TO THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. WE
- 2 ALL SUPPORT THE VERY SIGNIFICANT NEED FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS
- 3 TO AVOID THE FISCAL CLIFF. WE HAVE SEEN POLLING THAT SAYS THE
- 4 TRANSIT OPERATIONS ONLY MEASURE WON'T PASS TO THE BALLOT.
- 5 ADDING TO THE JOB GENERATING INFRASTRUCTURE THAT VOTERS ITS
- 6 ESTIMATED BY MTC AS MUCH AS INCONSISTENCIES% OF BAY AREA
- 7 COMMUTERS AREN'T CURRENTLY RELYING ON PUBLIC TRANSIT HELPS GET
- 8 THEM ON BOARD SAN JOSE USING RETURN TO SOURCE WHO WANTS TO
- 9 HELP INVEST IN BART TO SAN JOSE AND NORTH BAY VOTERS WHO HAVE
- 10 HIGHWAY 37 WHICH IS PROBABLY UNDERWATER RIGHT NOW TOP OF MIND
- 11 THE POTENTIAL FOR BUS TRANSIT FROM SOLANO TO CONTRA COSTA TO
- 12 NAPA SONOMA-MARIN FOR THE FIRST TIME LET'S PROCEED TO GET IT
- 13 DONE IN THE LEGISLATURE TO COME BACK WITHIN A YEAR.
- 15 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS.
- 17 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS I'M THE
- 18 POLICY DIRECTOR AT TRANSFORM A MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
- 19 TRANSPORTATION WE SPENT OVER TWO DECADES WINNING REGIONAL
- 20 LOCAL MEASURES FOR CLIMATE EQUITY WE OPPOSE MEASURES THAT
- 21 DON'T MEET THOSE WE SUPPORT FRAMEWORK MOVING FORWARD TODAY FOR
- 22 THE REGIONAL MEASURE. I WANT TO MAKE CLEAR THE EXPENDITURE
- 23 CATEGORIES ALREADY INCLUDE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS, PROGRAM
- 24 IMPROVEMENTS, SAFER STREETS, LIGHT REPAIRS FOR MOTORISTS AND
- 25 TRANSIT RIDERS WE SUPPORT THESE THINGS. I HOPE WE CAN MOVE

14



FORWARD WITH CONSENSUS INCLUDING THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE 1 COMMUNITY TRANSIT RIDERS AND ACTIVISTS ALIKE BUT FOR US THAT 2 3 SUPPORT INCLUDES NO HIGHWAY WIDENING. THANK YOU. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. SO NOW TO OUR ZOOM SPEAKERS. THE FIRST UP IS --6 7 8 DAVID CANEPA: MISS WARD, HOW MANY ZOOM SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE? 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE ARE NOW AT 44 AND CLIMBING. 10 11 DAVID CANEPA: SO WE HAVE 44 ZOOM SPEAKERS. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK 12 THE SPEAKERS JUST, IF THEY COULD BE AS BRIEF AS POSSIBLE. WHY 13 DON'T WE ALLOCATE A MINUTE FOR SPEAKERS. MAYBE YOU COULD 14 EDUCATE ME ON MTC POLICY WE HAVE 41 SPEAKERS. IS THAT FIRM OR 15 16 CAN PEOPLE JUMP ON? 17 KATHLEEN KANE: OUR PROCESS HAS BEEN AS PEOPLE ARE ADDED TO THE 18 19 QUEUE THEY GO TO THE BOTTOM IT'S APPROPRIATE THE CHAIR MAKE THE REQUEST THAT PEOPLE BE BRIEF ALSO IF SECONDING COMMENTS 20 FROM OTHER SPEAKERS THEY COULD JUST SAY THAT TO KEEP THE ITEM 21

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

22

23

MOVING.



1

JANUARY 24, 2024

DAVID CANEPA: IT'S GREAT TO HAVE LEGAL COUNSEL. IF YOU ARE

LISTENING VIRTUALLY WHAT OUR COUNSEL LAID OUT IS GOOD 2 3 DIRECTION. WITH THAT, MISS WARD. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WITH YOUR APPROVAL, AS WE KNOW SOMETIMES SPEAKERS ARE NOT MINDFUL OF THE CLOCK, I WILL, AT YOUR 6 7 REQUEST, MUTE SPEAKERS IF THEY GO BEYOND A MINUTE. 8 DAVID CANEPA: I THINK YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO, JUST BECAUSE WE 9 HAVE SO MANY PEOPLE. 10 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JUST MAKING SURE WE'RE ON THE SAME PAGE. 12 AND WE ARE NOW AT 49 SPEAKERS. FIRST UP IS NAOMI SCHIFF. GO 13 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. A COUPLE OF THINGS, SALES TAX IS PRETTY REGRESSIVE. I WORRY ABOUT THAT SINCE I LIVE IN ALAMEDA COUNTY 17 WITH 10.25% SALES TAX NOW. SECOND, I'M A RETIRED GRAPHIC 18 DESIGNER. I NOTICED THE CONNECTIVITY ITEM IS ILLUSTRATED WITH 19 A PIECE OF PUZZLE. YOU MIGHT WANT TO PUT A CAR THERE, BECAUSE 20 21 THAT ITEM IS ACTUALLY ABOUT CARS. WHEN I SEE RELIEVE OF

BOTTLENECK IN THE INTERCHANGE MODERNIZATION, I'M NOT SURE

THAT'S ABOUT TRANSIT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR CONSIDERING

EVERYTHING. I WANT TO SEE THIS IS NOT A REGRESSIVE TAX MEASURE

22

23



AND I THINK HIGHWAY EXPANSION SHOULD BE AT THE ABSOLUTE BOTTOM 1 OF YOUR PRIORITY LIST. THANK YOU. 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ALAN, FOLLOWED BY 4 5 TOMASO BOGIA. 6 SPEAKER: I'M A LIVERMORE RESIDENT, I OPPOSE USING FUNDS FROM 7 8 THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO WIDEN FREEWAYS, CONTINUING TO EXPAND UNSUSTAINABLE CAR INFRASTRUCTURE IN A 9 10 CLIMATE CRISIS IS AN EXERCISE OF MADNESS, RUNNING FASTER AND FASTER GOING BACKWARDS. CARS EPITOMIZE WASTEFUL MASS 11 CONSUMPTION ENDANGERS THE PLANET WE CAN NO LONGER AFFORD 12 INEFFICIENCY. TO TRULY REDUCE CONGESTION EMISSIONS WE MUST 13 INVEST IN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION PERHAPS EVEN MAKING IT FREE 14 CARS ARE DEAD END TECHNOLOGY AND BEING FORCED TO RELY ON THEM 15 16 IS KILLING EVERYONE. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS TOMASSO. FOLLOWED 18 19 BY JORDAN. 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR LETTING US SPEAK ON THIS. MY 21 NAME IS TOMASSO I'M A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO DOESN'T OWN A 22 CAR. CALTRANS, LIKE POLICE DEPARTMENTS [INDISCERNIBLE] LIKE 23 AGENCIES SEEM TO HAVE A BOTTOMLESS BUDGET. NORTH AMERICAN 24

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATORS AND POLICY MAKERS ARE IGNORING EVIDENCE



FROM EVERY GLOBAL METROPOLITAN AREA THAT HAS SUCCESSFULLY 1 REDUCED VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. YOU HAVE TO MAKE IT HARDER FOR 2 3 PEOPLE TO DRIVE THAT'S HOW YOU GET PEOPLE TO STOP DRIVING. CLASSING EXPRESS LANES IMPROVES THE DRIVING EXPERIENCE. MOST 4 5 OF OUR PROBLEMS ARE NOT ZERO SUM BUT WE MUST FACE THE REALITY THAT MOBILITY ISSUES ARE YOU CANNOT GET PEOPLE TO DRIVE LESS 6 WITHOUT MAKING WORSE EXPERIENCE IN TRANSIT. DON'T BE A JOE 7 8 MANCHIN ON THIS INVEST IN BETTER TRENDS EVEN IN OUR RURAL 9 AREAS. THANK YOU. 10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU NEXT UP IS JOE MALL DON ADD 11 OWE. 12 13 SPEAKER: JORDAN, SAN JOSE, I ENCOURAGE TO YOU SPEND THE MONEY 14 ON THIS MEASURE ON OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL INVESTMENTS IN 15 16 REGIONAL TRANSIT, NOT FREEWAYS. ALL OF LAST YEAR EVERYONE WHO WAS A TRANSIT RIDER WAS REALLY WORRIED ABOUT IF OUR TRANSIT 17 SYSTEMS WERE JUST GOING TO COLLAPSE WITHOUT FUNDING. HIGHWAYS 18 ARE JUST GOING TO BE THERE. THEY DON'T NEED TO BE EXPANDED 19 ANYMORE. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT FREEWAY WIDENING NO ONE IS ASKING 20 FOR GENERAL LANES BUT THERE ARE PROCESSES ADDING AUXILIARY 21 22 LANES AND BRAND-NEW EXPRESS LANES WITHOUT DECREASING GENERAL 23 LANES AND THAT'S STILL GOING TO INCREASE VMT DESPITE WHAT THE

ENGINEERS SAY AND THAT'S GOING TO WORSEN CLIMATE CHANGE. SO



PLEASE INVEST IN PUBLIC TRANSIT AND BICYCLING AND NO MORE 1 FREEWAY WIDENING OF ANY VARIETY. 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SCOTT MACE 4 5 FOLLOWED BY Y AND STRONG. 6 SPEAKER: I AM A RESIDENT OF THREE OF THE NINE BAY AREA 7 8 COUNTIES AND CONTINUE FREQUENT VISIT. BUILDINGS NEXT CONTRIBUTE TO BOTTLENECK SOMEWHERE ELSE. GARY RICHARDS 9 ESTIMATED IMPROVING A SINGLE INTERCHANGE 101 TO 880 WOULD COST 10 11 A BILLED. WHAT WOULD THE COST BE NOW AND HOW WOULD THESE MULTI-BILLION DOLLARS INTERCHANGE IMPROVEMENTS -- MANY 12 WIDENING PROJECTS TRADITIONALLY HAVE BEEN CHARACTERIZED AS A 13 SAFETY IMPROVEMENT. EVEN IF WE ALL DRIVE ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN 14 2035 LAST WEEK TRANSIT IS NOT A TOY I SUPPORT REGIONAL MEASURE 15 16 THAT TREATS IT MORE SERIOUSLY THAN THAT. THANK YOU. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP HOAI-AN TRUONG. 18 19 SPEAKER: HI. I AM HOAI-AN TRUONG WITH MOTHERS FOR SILICON 20 21 VALLEY AND TURN OUT FOR TRANSIT. THERE IS A 30 YEAR LAG 22 BETWEEN WHEN GREENHOUSE GAS IS EMITTED AND WHEN THE EFFECTS 23 ARE FELT. CATASTROPHIC WILDFIRES DROUGHT AND FLOODS WE'RE EXPERIENCING TODAY ARE LARGELY DUE TO EMISSIONS FROM 30 YEARS 24

AGO. I WAS IN THE TUBS FIRE AND SEE HOW WE'RE GOING TO HAVE



- 1 BIGGER FIRES COSTING BILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN DAMAGE AND
- 2 RECOVERY. MTC OWE POLICY SAID THAT 50% OF BAY AREA VOTERS
- 3 OPPOSE WIDENING FREEWAYS. WE CAN'T REACH OUR CLIMATE GOALS IF
- 4 WE CONTINUE POURING MONEY INTO WIDENING FREEWAYS. WE MUST TAKE
- 5 ACTION TO FUND PUBLIC TRANSIT TO FINALLY MAKE IT WORLD CLASS.
- 6 THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE.

7

- 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. DAVID WATSON FOLLOWED BY
- 9 PETER STRAUSS.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: DAVID WATSON FROM MOUNTAIN VIEW FROM MOUNTAIN VIEW.
- 12 WE NEED MORE MONEY FOR TRANSIT DON'T DIVERT THAT MONEY TO
- 13 WIDENING FREEWAYS. THAT'S IT. THANK YOU.

14

- 15 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT UP PETER STRAUSS FOLLOWED PIE EMILY
- 16 WHEELER.

- 18 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING PETER STRAUSS FROM SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT
- 19 RIDERS AND PART OF VOICES. I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF WITH
- 20 EXCEPTIONS. IN PARTICULAR I SUPPORT THE RAISING OF THE REMOVAL
- 21 OF UPPER LIMIT ON THE AMOUNT OF FUNDS GENERATED BECAUSE 7
- 22 MILLION FOR TRANSIT IS NOT SUFFICIENT WE ALSO ARE GLAD TO SEE
- 23 PROGRESSIVE SOURCES INCLUDED. IN PARTICULAR AS COMMISSIONER
- 24 SPERING REMINDED US IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THAT THIS MONEY
- 25 IS PRIMARILY FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND MUST REMAIN SO. WE



- 1 STRONGLY OPPOSE THE APPROVAL OF ANYTHING FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING
- 2 TODAY. WE APPRECIATE WHAT STAFF IS TRYING DO WITH OPTION TWO
- 3 BUT IT'S NOT THE ANSWER AND THIS PROBABLY REQUIRES FURTHER
- 4 DISCUSSION BUT SHOULD GO FORWARD TODAY WITHOUT ANY PROVISIONS
- 5 FOR A HIGHWAY WIDENING, WHICH WAS STRONGLY OPPOSED. THANK YOU.

6

- 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. EMILY WHEELER FOLLOWED BY.
- 8 WARREN C.

9

10 SPEAKER: HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

11

12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES.

- 14 SPEAKER: HI. MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER. I AM HERE WITH PUBLIC
- 15 ADVOCATES AND I AM A MEMBER OF THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
- 16 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. I WOKE UP TODAY TO LEARN THAT MOST
- 17 OF MY BUS ROUTES ARE GOING TO BE SLASHED ON TIME WHICH IS
- 18 GOING TO MAKE IT DIFFICULT FOR ME TO GET ANYWHERE I NEED TO
- 19 GO. I ASK MTC TO REMEMBER THAT THIS MEASURE WAS ENVISIONED AS
- 20 A MEASURE TO SUPPORT THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF WHICH WE KNOW IS
- 21 COMING. WE NEED SIGNIFICANT TRANSIT OPERATION FUNDING IN ORDER
- 22 TO MAINTAIN AND EXCEED SERVICE ONCE THE SHORT-TERM STATE
- 23 FUNDING RUNS OUT. I'M ASKING MTC TO PRIORITIZE THE ORIGINAL
- 24 INTENT OF THE MEASURE AND SUPPORT FUNDING, ABUNDANT FUNDING
- 25 FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. THANK YOU SO MUCH. HAVE A GREAT DAY.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS WARREN CUSHMAN,
3	FOLLOWED BY HELEN MARIE GORDON.
4	
5	SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.
8	
9	SPEAKER: GREAT. HI, THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN AT COMMUNITY
10	RESOURCES LIVING IN HAYWARD. I AM A TOTALLY BLIND TRANSIT
11	USER. I SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND I SUPPORT ENABLING
12	MOVING FORWARD. I THINK THE HIGHWAY COORDINATION NEEDS MORE
13	DISCUSSION. I WOULD HOPE THAT THE COMMISSIONERS MOVE THAT DOWN
14	THE ROAD AND ENCOURAGE STAKEHOLDERS TO TALK TO ONE ANOTHER,
15	ALONG WITH STAFF AND THAT THE HIGHWAY PIECE IS AMONG THE
16	DIFFICULT PIECES BROUGHT UP IN FUTURE MEETINGS ENDEAVORS AND
17	THAT WE AS A REGION COME TOGETHER AS MUCH WITH CONSENSUS AS
18	POSSIBLE. THERE IS A LOT TO DO AND WE ALL NEED TO WORK
19	TOGETHER. THANK YOU.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. HELEN MARIE GORDON FOLLOWED
22	BY BRIAN CULBERTSON.
23	
24	SPEAKER: [AUDIO DISTORTION]
25	



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MISS GORDON, YOUR CONNECTION IS -- WE 1 2 CAN'T HEAR YOU. [AUDIO DISTORTION] MISS GORDON, WE CAN'T 3 HEAR YOU. 4 5 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW? 6 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE CAN HEAR YOU NOW. GO AHEAD. 8 SPEAKER: YES. HELLO. THANK YOU SO MUCH. MY NAME IS HELEN MARIE 9 10 GORDON. I'M FROM -- [INDISCERNIBLE] CALIFORNIA. 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE CAN'T HEAR YOU MISS GORDON. YOUR 12 CONNECTION IS VERY -- WE'RE GOING TO GO TO OUR NEXT SPEAKER. 13 14 BRIAN CULBERT SON FOLLOWED BY DARYL OWENS. 15 16 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS BRIAN CULBERT SON I'M A FULL-TIME TRANSIT RIDER IN OAKLAND. WE NEED ABUNDANT TRANSIT CALL FOR CLIMATE 17 CHANGE PLEASE NO MORE FUNDING FOR HIGHWAYS. THERE ARE BILLIONS 18 IN FUNDING AVAILABLE FROM THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT FOR 19 HIGHWAYS BUT ONLINE A TINY AMOUNT AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT. WITH 20 21 ABUNDANT HIGHWAY FUNDING AVAILABLE ALREADY, THE TRANSIT MEASURE SHOULD FOCUS ON FIXING THE LACK OF TRANSIT FUNDING. 22 SURVEYS DEMONSTRATE THIS PRIORITY OF TRANSIT OVER HIGHWAYS IN 23 THE 2023 MTC SURVEY HIGHWAY ELEVATIONS AND LANE EXPANSIONS 24

WERE RANGED LOWEST OF ALL CATEGORIES. ALL CATEGORIES INCLUDING



7

9

JANUARY 24, 2024

- 1 SONOMA COUNTY INCLUDED LANE AND HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS LOWEST. WE
- 2 ALSO NEED EQUITABLE FUNDING FOR THIS MEASURE THAT INCLUDES
- 3 PROGRESSIVELY TAXING THREE WEALTHIEST COUNTIES IN CALIFORNIA
- 4 WHICH INCLUDE IN ORDER SANTA CLARA, SAN MATEO, AND MARIN.
- 5 ALAMEDA HAS 10.25 SALES TAX WHILE THE WEALTHIEST COUNTY IN
- 6 CALIFORNIA HAS 9%. PLEASE PURSUE EQUITABLE PROGRESSIVE --
- 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT DARYL OWENS.
- 10 SPEAKER: SO IN THE LAST 20 YEARS AC TRANSIT HAS LOST ABOUT 20
- 11 MILLION RIDERS I AM BAFFLED TO UNDERSTAND THAT PEOPLE WOULD
- 12 OFFER TO FUND THE FREEWAYS WHEN OAKLAND'S BUS SYSTEM IS
- 13 FALLING BART. SOLANO VOTERS WANT BETTER SOLTRANS SERVICE SO
- 14 THEY CAN GET TO DEL NORTE BART WHAT YOU'RE DOING IS MAKING IT
- 15 IMPOSSIBLE FOR LOCAL TRANSIT TO COMPETE WITH ALREADY FEDERALLY
- 16 SUBSIDIZED HIGHWAYS AND ESSENTIALLY DESTROYING THE PUBLIC
- 17 TRANSIT IN THE PROCESS NO FREEWAY EXTENSION OR EXPANSIONS OR
- 18 RELATED MEASURES WHATSOEVER ONLY BECAUSE MOST PEOPLE WANT TO
- 19 TAKE TRANSIT THEY JUST CAN'T DO IT.
- 21 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. GEORGE SPIES FOLLOWED BY
- 22 MONIQUE WEBSTER.
- 24 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS GEORGE, TRAFFIC SAFETY ADVOCATE IN
- 25 OAKLAND WE'RE TRYING TO SOLVE HOUSING LAND USE ISSUES THROUGH

20



- 1 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT DEPENDENCE FOR WORKING PEOPLE TO
 2 COMMUNITY TO MARIN IN SOLANO WHEREAS WE SHOULD BUILD THE
 3 HOUSING SO THAT COMMUTE DOESN'T HAVE TO HAPPEN WIDENING
- 4 FREEWAY WE'RE BACKING THE MODE OF LIFE THAT'S BODY FOR PEOPLE
- 5 BAD FOR THE ECONOMY AND BAD FOR CLIMATE. MANY SEE THIS AS AN
- 6 ENFORCEMENT ISSUE WE KNOW INFRASTRUCTURE SOLUTIONS ARE FAR
- 7 MORE CONSISTENTLY SUCCESSFUL. SUCH PROJECTS WOULD BE WELCOME
- 8 AND VALUABLE IN ALL CORNERS OF THE REGIONS LET'S BE SHUT WE
- 9 PUT STRONG EMPHASIS ON SAFETY UPGRADES AS WE MOVE FORWARD.
- 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MONIQUE WEBSTER FOLLOWED BY
- 12 CARTER LEVIN.

10

- 14 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING MONIQUE WEBSTER WITH SAN FRANCISCO
- 15 MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY NEARLY HALF A MILLION TRIPS
- 16 TAKEN ON MUNI EVERY DAY AND WE'RE PROUD THAT DESPITE OUR
- 17 FINANCIAL CHALLENGES WE'RE BRINGING BACK RIDERS WITH 2/3 OF
- 18 OUR CUSTOMERS CURRENTLY RIGHTING TRANSIT SERVICE IT'S GOOD AND
- 19 EXCELLENT. TRANSPORTATION IS NEEDED SO WE DON'T FACE CUTS IN
- 20 YEARS THAT WILL HURT VULNERABLE POPULATIONS AND UNDERMINE
- 21 REGION'S ECONOMIC GROWTH OF THE THANK YOU TO THE COMMISSION
- 22 DOES STAFF FOR ONGOING PARTNERSHIP AND LEADERSHIP WE URGE TO
- 23 YOU ADVANCE THE PROPOSAL BEFORE YOU TODAY AND TAKE THIS
- 24 IMPORTANT STEP TO A THRIVING BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION NETWORK.
- 25 THANK YOU.



1

JANUARY 24, 2024

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CARTER LAVIN FOLLOWED BY 2 3 SARAH GREENWALD. 4 5 SPEAKER: CARTER, I'M WITH TRANSBAY COALITION GRASSROOTS ADVOCACY GROUP SUPPORTS TRANSPORTATION ACROSS THE NINE COUNTY 6 BAY AREA HIGHWAY WIDENING AND ADDING LANES IS CLIMATE ARSON 7 8 ALSO ADDS TO COSTLY MAINTENANCE LOAD. WE CANNOT AND SHOULD NOT WIDE HIGHWAYS OR ADD LANES WE SHOULD TRANSFORM EXISTING 9 GENERAL PURPOSE LANES TO HOV TOLL LANES BUS LANES. COMMISSION 10 TO THE POINTS ABOUT RURAL COMMUNITIES SMALL URBAN AREAS I LOVE 11 THE CLASSIFICATION. THEY DESERVE GREAT ABUNDANT TRANSIT. 12 THAT'S GREAT. LIKE TRANSFORM WE SUPPORT MOVING AHEAD ON THIS. 13 14 THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. SARAH GREENWALD FOLLOWED BY 17 JORDAN BURN. 18 SPEAKER: HI. I'M SARAH GREENWALD WITH 350 BAY AREA WITH THE 19 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AS OUICK AS I CAN. PUBLIC 20 TRANSIT IS ONE OF THE MOST EFFECTIVE CLIMATE SOLUTIONS WE HAVE 21 22 NO WIDENING. PEOPLE WANT SOMETHING BETTER NOT MORE OF THE SAME 23 THAT NEEDS \$2 BILLION A YEAR WE SUGGEST A MEASURE PROVIDE LARGELY OPERATIONAL FUNDING CAPITAL ELEMENTS BUT GOOD RELIABLE 24 WIDESPREAD TRANSIT SYSTEM IS THE FOUNDATION. I SUPPORT 25



PROGRESSIVE OPTIONS FOR FUNDING. I SOUND ANGRY MAKING 1 EVERYBODY TALK AS FAST AS THEY CAN IT'S THOUGHTLESS TO THE 2 3 ELDERLY AND THOSE WITH SPEECH DISORDERS. GOODBYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JORDAN BURNS. 6 7 SPEAKER: JORDAN BURNS PUBLIC TRANSIT ADVOCATE FROM BERKELEY. 8 EXCITED ABOUT A TRANSIT MEASURE INCLUDING OPERATION FUNDS. I'M WILLING TO MAKE PHONE CALLS TO GET PEOPLE TO VOTE FOR A 9 10 MEASURE LIKE THIS, NOT A BILL FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING. ADDING 11 INCLUDING LANGUAGE ABOUT INCREASING HIGHWAY CAPACITY IN THE MEASURE IS GOING TO DISAPPOINT A LOT OF FOLKS. THESE ARE THE 12 FOLKS THAT REALLY HELP DRIVE VOTE FOR THESE MEASURES. FIXING 13 POT HOLES ADDING SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS TO ROADS INCLUDING 14 15 LANGUAGE LIKE RELIEVING CONGESTION WITHOUT FREEWAY WIDENING 16 CAN TOTALLY GET BEHIND THAT, BOTTLENECK, I DO NOT SUPPORT THAT. THANK YOU. 17 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS HOWARD WONG 19 FOLLOWED BY HANNAH KRUEGER. 20 21 22 SPEAKER: HELLO. HOWARD WONG. I WANTED TO FOCUS ON THE PART OF 23 THE OVERALL PICTURE. I THINK THERE ARE MANY DIFFERENT INTEREST

GROUPS AND STAKEHOLDERS BUT FROM THE PUBLIC AND VOTERS

PERSPECTIVE, THEY'RE A DELUGE GREAT DEAL OF INFORMATION AND

24



- 1 DIFFERENT MEASURES THERE NEEDS TO BE A HOLISTIC APPROACH FROM
- 2 WHICH WE HEARD TODAY FROM THE COMMISSIONERS THIS'S THE OVERALL
- 3 RECENT LOOK AT THE PICTURE OUR VOTERS HAVE TO UNDERSTAND
- 4 THAT'S HAPPENING THERE'S FEDERAL CONGRESSIONAL PROPOSED BILLS
- 5 FOR TRANSIT, STATE BALLOT FUNDING, REGIONAL TRANSMISSION AS
- 6 LOCAL BOND MEASURES LOCAL TAX THERE HAS TO BE OVERALL PICTURE
- 7 IN THE GOALS OF WHATEVER WE DO. THANK YOU.

8

9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. IS HANNAH KRIEGER.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: HI THIS IS HANNAH KRIEGER WITH THE GREEN LIVING
- 12 INSTITUTE I OPPOSE USING FUNDS FROM THE REGIONAL
- 13 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO WIDEN FREEWAYS THIS WILL NOT HELP
- 14 THE MEASURE PASS BECAUSE MTC'S OWN POLL SAYS 50 PERIODS OF BAY
- 15 AREA VOTERS OPPOSE WIDENING HIGHWAYS. THERE ARE BILLIONS OF
- 16 DOLLARS IN STATE AND FEDERAL FUND TO ALREADY WIDEN HIGHWAYS
- 17 BUT THERE ARE LIMITED INSUFFICIENT SOURCES FOR TRANSIT
- 18 OPERATIONS. IT'S TRUE THAT CURRENTLY SMALLER PROPORTION OF BAY
- 19 AREA RESIDENTS USE TRANSIT THAT'S BECAUSE IT'S BEEN MASSIVELY
- 20 UNDERINVESTED IN. THIS WILL ENCOURAGE MORE BAY AREA RESIDENTS
- 21 TO BECOME REGULAR TRANSIT USES AND WILL BRING US INTO A MODERN
- 22 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM LIKE WE SEE IN EUROPE AND JAPAN RATHER
- 23 THAN OUR DYSFUNCTIONAL UNSAFE UNHEALTHY CAR IT DEPENDENT
- 24 SYSTEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TAKE CARE.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU CHELSEA. 1 2 3 SPEAKER: CHELSEA PRUITT OAKLAND RESIDENT TRANSIT COMMUTER MEMBER OF BIKE EAST BAY WHO REPRESENTS 4,000 RESIDENTS WORKING 4 5 TOWARD ACCESSIBLE PUBLIC TRANSIT I JOIN MANY VOICES WHO OPPOSE MEASURE FUND BEING USED FOR HIGHWAY EXPANSION AND HOV 6 EXPANSION. WE DON'T NEED MORE HIGHWAY CAPACITY BECAUSE TRANSIT 7 8 MOVES PEOPLE MORE EFFICIENTLY THAN PRIVATE CARS MORE FREEWAYS MORE CONGESTION POLLUTION AND INVEST IN PUBLIC TRANSIT WALKING 9 AND BIKING WE NEED MORE EFFICIENT TRANSPORTATION NOT MORE 10 MILES OF ASPHALT. THANK YOU. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS LAUREN GILL LARDY 13 14 FOLLOWED BY CHANCE. 15 16 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING LAUREN, SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY VTA URGES SUPPORT OF THIS REVENUE MEASURE RECOGNIZING STAKE THE 17 FINISH LINE. IMPROVING TRANSIT SYSTEMS PROVIDING CRITICAL 18 TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDS FOR THE REGION'S BIGGEST TRANSIT 19 AGENCIES IS ESSENTIAL TO EVERYONE IN THE REGION INCLUDING OUR 20 21 REGIONAL FERRY SYSTEM WHOSE FIRST AND LAST CONNECTIONS RELY 22 ON. WE LOOK FORWARD TO STAKEHOLDERS ENSURE OUR REGION CAN FUND 23 RELIABLE AFFORDABLE SEAMLESS TRANSPORTATION THAT PROVIDES FREQUENCY THAT PEOPLE NEED TO MAKE THIS TRANSIT MORE 24 COMPETITIVE THAN DRIVING. THANK YOU.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CHANCE. 3 SPEAKER: CHANCE, WITH EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE MEMBER OF 4 5 ORGANIZATION OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. OUR STANCE IS SIMPLE, NO NEW LANES. WE CANNOT TRUST CALTRANS AT THIS 6 POINT LANGUAGE OF AN EVENTUAL BALLOT MEASURE ALONG THE LINES 7 8 OF CONGESTION RELIEF NEW LANES THAT ARE MARKETED TO LANES IS INEVITABLY GOING TO LEAD TO WIDENING PROJECTS. NOTHING IN A 9 MEASURE SHOULD CONTRIBUTE TO INCREASING VMT IT GOES AGAINST 10 CLIMATE COMMITMENTS AND STATUTORY OBLIGATIONS AT THE COUNTY 11 LEVEL IT'S COUNTERPRODUCTIVE AND GRIDLOCK IN FIVE YEARS. LET'S 12 PUT THE BUSS ON THE ROADS LET'S DELIVER A MEASURE THAT'S GOING 13 TO IMPROVE THE TRANSIT SITUATION RATHER THAN HAVING MORE OF 14 THE SAME IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 15 16 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CYRUS HALL. 18 SPEAKER: I'M, SORT OF, CONTROLLING MY RANGE TODAY ADOPTING 19 SPENDING POLICY THAT FUND HIGHWAY WIDENING IS ENVIRONMENTAL 20 21 ARSON. AND I THINK COMMISSIONERS KNOW THAT. THIS WILL LEAD TO MORE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. WE'RE STUCK IN A RUT. MTC NEEDS 22 TO WORK WITH LABOR AND BUSINESS REPRESENTATIVES TO CREATE A 23 VISION NECESSARY TO MOVE AWAY FROM CAR ECCENTRICITY THAT MEANS 24 A JUST TRANSITION FOR LABOR A DISCUSSION THAT'S BEEN MISSING 25



8

10

JANUARY 24, 2024

- 1 IN THIS DISCUSSION. IT'S NO SURPRISE. -- HIGHWAY WIDENING IS
- 2 IRRESPONSIBLE PLANNED BAY AREA ESTIMATES A LARGE 24 BILLED
- 3 SHORTFALL IN MAINTAINING EXISTING ROADWAYS THIS WILL ADD TO
- 4 IT. I SUPPORT MOVING FORWARD WITH THE MEASURE BUT IT MUST BE
- 5 FOCUSED ON OPERATIONS FOR TRANSIT. IF WE ALLOW TRANSIT
- 6 OPERATIONS TO COLLAPSE IT WONT MATTER HOW MANY HIGHWAYS YOU
- 7 BUILD YOU WILL BE SITTING IN YOUR CARS ALL DAY. THANK YOU.
- 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS JAMES LINDSAY.
- 11 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS JAMES LINDSAY
- 12 INTERNATIONAL VICE PRESIDENT FOR THE AMALGAMATED TRANSIT UNION
- 13 REPRESENTING MOTOR COACH OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE STATE OF
- 14 CALIFORNIA. I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING IN HIS REMARKS
- 15 THAT THERE IS VERY LITTLE OPERATIONAL FUNDING WHICH IS WHY ALL
- 16 THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA ARE GETTING READY TO
- 17 FALL OFF THIS CLIFF. IF WE DO NOT PUT MONEY INTO THE TRANSIT
- 18 OPERATORS, WHERE IT NEEDS TO BE, THERE IS NO NEED TO BUILD
- 19 CAPITAL PROJECTS FOR TRANSIT. THERE WILL BE NOBODY TO OPERATE
- 20 THEM. SO, PLEASE GET THE FUNDING TO THE OPERATIONS WHERE IT'S
- 21 NEEDED. BECAUSE THE STATE IS NOT COMING THROUGH, AND THIS IS
- 22 WITH WE NEED TO KEEP THE BAY AREA MOVING. THANK YOU.
- 24 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. HAIL CURRIER FOLLOWED BY
- 25 ADINA.



1 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. THIS IS HAYLEY CURRIER, POLICY MANAGER 2 3 WITH SAVE THE BAY AND MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WE SUPPORT THE FRAMEWORK MOVING FORWARD. WE 4 5 OPPOSE HIGHWAY WIDENING AND IN ADDITION TO MONEY FOR HIGHWAYS WE NEED MONEY FOR TRANSIT, COMPLETE STREETS AND SAFER STREETS. 6 7 THANK YOU. 8 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ADINA FOLLOWED BY VINAY 10 PIMPLE. 11 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA, 12 FRIENDS EVER CALTRAIN, VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. 13 SUPPORTING THE OVERALL DIRECTION AND ADVANCING THIS PROPOSAL 14 15 TO THE STATE LEGISLATURE AND WANTING TO SEE A MEASURE CENTER 16 TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO MAINTAIN AND IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT VOTERS DEMAND AND THAT 17 18 IS SHOWING UP IN THE POLLS. AND SPENDING AND THAT UPHOLDS OUR CLIMATE GOALS, AND DOES NOT UNDERMINE THOSE CLIMATE GOALS BY 19 EXPANDING HIGHWAYS AND VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. THANK YOU. 20 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE, FOLLOWED BY SAM 23 SERGEANT.



SPEAKER: HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY 1 COUNCIL. I WANT TO SPEAK TO THE ACCOUNTABILITY ISSUE. WITHOUT 2 3 ACCOUNTABILITY, THOSE OF US WHO NEED PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION OR THOSE FOLKS WHO WANT IT WILL CONTINUE TO GET BASICALLY PRETTY 4 5 BAD SERVICE. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, IF MOST OF YOU ON THE COMMISSION DO NOT KNOW WHAT THE DELAY STATISTICS ARE FOR BUSES, BECAUSE 6 THAT IS THE MAIN REASON WHY FOLKS DON'T TAKE BUSES, THAT WOULD 7 8 BE A HUGE PROBLEM. FOR EXAMPLE, MANY BUS OPERATORS AROUND 30% OF DRIVERS DON'T SHOW UP FOR WORK ON ANY GIVEN DAY. IF YOU 9 DON'T KNOW WHAT SOLUTIONS ARE BEING IMPLEMENTED TO BRING THOSE 10 NUMBERS DOWN, THAT IS A HUGE PROBLEM. SAME GOES FOR SAFETY. IF 11 YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT THE STATISTICS ARE AND WHAT IS BEING DONE 12 TO GET THE SITUATION RESOLVED THAT IS A HUGE PROBLEM. 13 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THAT IS YOUR TIME MR. PIMPLE. 15 16 SAM SERGEANT. 17 SPEAKER: SAM SERGEANT DIRECTOR OF STRATEGY AT CALTRAIN. 18 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS PRIORITIZATION IF A FUTURE 19 REGIONAL MEASURE WE RECOGNIZE THE NEED FOR REGIONAL MODAL 20 BALANCE IN A REGION DIVERSITY, AND WITH THE DYNAMICS IN THE 21 BAY AREA WE APPRECIATE THE WORK SO FAR BY MTC AND STAFF AND 22

THE COMMISSION, CALTRANS SURVIVED THE PANDEMIC. STATE AND

FUNDS IS CRITICAL AND WE HOPE THAT WE CAN COME TO A GOOD

FEDERAL FUNDING HAS BOUGHT US TIME, BUT THE NEED FOR OPERATING

23

24



CONCLUSION WITH THE DISCUSSION THAT STILL KEEPS A WORLD CLASS 1 TRANSIT NETWORK INTACT. THANK YOU TO THE COMMISSION, AGAIN. 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. IAN HAD YOU ET, FOLLOWED BY 4 5 CRISSA. 6 SPEAKER: HELLO COMMISSIONERS. HELLO COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS 7 8 IAN HEWETT, I AM A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC AND A PUBLIC TRANSIT 9 RIDER AND A STUDENT FROM SAN FRANCISCO. I'M A STUDENT AT SAN FRANCISCO STATE UNIVERSITY. I STRONGLY OPPOSE ANY USE OF 10 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDS FOR ANY FORM OF HIGHWAY 11 WIDENING. I WANT TO REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT WE WON'T SOLVE 12 OUR CONGESTION PROBLEMS WITH THE SAME APPROACH THAT CREATED 13 THEM. SOME COMMISSIONERS SUGGEST THE CONGESTION PROBLEMS 14 CREATED BY HIGHWAY WIDENING, AUTO ORIENTED COULD BE -- PUSHING 15 16 CHANGE FROM A POLICY THAT CREATED THE CONGESTION AND IMPOSSIBILITY CHALLENGES WE FACE TODAY. HIGHWAY EXPANSION 17 WON'T HELP GET A TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE PASSED. SOME 18 COMMISSIONERS ARGUABLY CAN'T GET A BALLOT MEASURE WITHOUT 19 HIGHWAY WIDENING IS AN OUTDATED PERSPECTIVE. PLEASE DO NOT 20 VOTE FOR ANY MORE HIGHWAY WIDENING. THANK YOU. 21 22 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CRISSA, FOLLOWED BY VINITA.



- 1 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS CRISSA, I'M THE DIRECTOR OF COMMUNICATIONS
 2 AT THE SAN FRANCISCO BICYCLE COALITION CALLING REPRESENTING
- 3 ADVOCACY TEAM I'M CALLING TO ASK THE COMMISSION VOTE TO REMOVE
- 4 THE HIGHWAY EXPANSION FROM THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
- 5 MEASURE. OUR ORGANIZATION JOIN THE WORKING GROUP TO ENSURE THE
- 6 MEASURE AND ITS FUNDING GO TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND
- 7 INFRASTRUCTURE CHANGES THAT PRIORITIZE HUMAN SCALED WILL NOT
- 8 GET THIS TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE PASSED MTC'S OWN POLL
- 9 HAVE SAID IT SHOWS 50% OF BAY AREA VOTERS OPPOSE WIDENING OF
- 10 HIGHWAYS. PLEASE RECONSIDER THE ADDITION OF THIS MEASURE, AND
- 11 THE PURPOSE OF THIS MEASURE IS TO FINANCIALLY SUPPORT ACTIVE
- 12 TRANSPORTATION NOW AND IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS.
- 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. VINITA.
- 16 DAVID CANEPA: HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?
- 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: 23.
- 20 DAVID CANEPA: OKAY. THANK YOU.
- 22 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING. VINITA GUERRE, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AT
- 23 TRANSIT RIDERS. WE ARE PART OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
- 24 TRANSPORTATION. WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE LATEST STIPULATED
- 25 CONSIDERATION FROM MTC DIRECTING SCARCE INFRASTRUCTURE DOLLARS

13

15

17

19



- 1 TOWARDS HIGHWAY EXPANSION TAKING CRITICAL RESOURCES THAT WOULD
- 2 BE OTHERWISE SPENT ON PUBLIC TRANSIT INFRASTRUCTURE AND
- 3 OPERATIONS. TODAY WILL BE RESTATING WHAT I HAVE SAID BEFORE
- 4 MTC -- ANY OTHER GROUP WHO CANNOT DRIVE WHO WOULD PREFER TO
- 5 USE ALTERNATIVE MODES. FOR MUNI RIDERS, WE HAVE 57% OF PEOPLE
- 6 OF COLOR AND 70% OF THE INCOMES LESS THAN 50,000. THAT WILL BE
- 7 IMPORTANT PUBLIC AND WE CANNOT ALIENATE THEM. WE STRONGLY
- 8 SUPPORT THE REDIRECTION OF FUNDS PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND
- 9 WORK ON MADAM CLERK CALIFORNIA A LEADER IN THE ASPECT. THANK
- 10 YOU.

11

12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: LAUREN FOLLOWED BY PAUL BICKMORE.

13

- 14 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS LAUREN. NOT PART OF ANY ORGANIZATION JUST
- 15 A RESIDENT I WANTED TO TANNED TODAY TO SAY THAT I'M A TRANSIT
- 16 RIDER, WHO USES ALL AVAILABLE MODES OF TRANSPORTATION IN THE
- 17 AREA IT'S CLEAR TO ME THAT TRANSIT NEEDS AS MUCH FUNDING AS
- 18 POSSIBLE AND I OPPOSE USING FUNDS FROM THE REGIONAL
- 19 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO WIDEN FREEWAYS. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
- 20 TIME.

21

22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. PAUL BICKMORE.

- 24 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS PAUL BICKMORE, CALLING TO OPPOSE ANY
- 25 INCLUSION OF FUNDS FOR EITHER INTERCHANGES HIGHWAY WIDENING



- 1 HOV LANES, EXPRESS LANES, ET CETERA, WE KNOW THAT EXPANDING
- 2 ROADS CAPACITY JUST RESULTS IN THE EXACT SAME LEVEL OF SERVICE
- 3 IN THE LONG RUN AS BEFORE THE EXPANSION, EXPRESS LANES AND
- 4 WHAT NOT ARE JUST, YOU KNOW, HIGHLY REGRESSIVE WAY OF GIVING
- 5 WEALTHIER PEOPLE JUST A FASTER WAY TO GET PLACES, WHERE
- 6 EVERYONE ELSE WHO IS STUCK IN TRAFFIC CAN'T USE THIS, AND WE
- 7 MUCH BETTER -- RATHER THAN WASTING OUR MONEY ON ROAD, WE NEED
- 8 TO FOCUS ON TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. IGOR TREGU FOLLOWED BY JOSIE
- 11 AARON.

- 13 SPEAKER: THANK YOU SO MUCH, MR. CHAIR AND MEMBERS OF THE
- 14 COMMISSION. I'M IGOR, FOR IDENTIFICATION PURPOSES, THOUGH
- 15 SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL TODAY, I'M CHAIR OF THE CALIFORNIA
- 16 DEMOCRATIC PARTIES ENVIRONMENTAL CAUCUS. I WISH TO ECHO THE
- 17 MANY VOICES YOU HAVE ALREADY HEARD TO IMPLORE YOU TO PASS A
- 18 MEASURE THAT HAS NO NEW LANES. NINE YEARS AGO, I WAS PROUD TO
- 19 STAND REPRESENTATIVES OF THE LABOR MOVEMENT, ENVIRONMENTAL
- 20 JUSTICE, AND IN WITH CLIMATE LEADERS AND WITH BUSINESS LEADERS
- 21 IN SUPPORT OF ALAMEDA COUNTY MEASURE B. BUT EVEN THERE WE HAVE
- 22 TO TELL THE MEASURE THERE WAS A CONTENTION OF 8 TO 9 MILES OF
- 23 POTENTIAL LANE EXPANSION. EVEN THOUGH I WOULD ARGUE IT WASN'T
- 24 THAT. THIS IS 2024. PLEASE MOVE THIS FORWARD WITHOUT LANE
- 25 EXPANSIONS. PERIOD. THANK YOU.



1 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JOSÉ AARON FOLLOWED BY BIKE 2 3 EAST BAY. 4 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME SAN JOSÉ AARON, A TRANSPORTATION 5 PLANNER AND COMMISSIONER FOR THE CITY OF OAKLAND AND I'M 6 SPEAKING TODAY AS SOMEONE WHO RIGHTS AC TRANSIT DAILY. THERE 7 8 IS MUCH IN THE MEASURE THAT WOULD ADVANCE SAFE CONNECTED SEAMLESS RESILIENT TRANSIT FOR THE BAY AREA AND I WANT TO 9 THANK STAFF FOR THAT. I OPPOSE USING FUNDS TO WIDEN FREEWAYS. 10 11 WE NEED MORE EFFICIENT PUBLIC TRANSIT NOT MORE MILES OF ASPHALT. MTC IS CHARGED WITH USING THE MOST UP-TO-DATE 12 RESEARCH AND DATA TO INFORM ITS DECISIONS. WE KNOW THAT 13 CURRENT STUDIES SAY FREEWAY WIDENING IS BAD FOR CLIMATE AND 14 15 HEALTH AND WILL FURTHER RACIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUITIES. 16 FOLLOWING THE DATA AND RESEARCH WE KNOW HIGHWAY WIDENING WILL HINDER AND UNDERMINE MTC'S OTHER EFFORTS. WE NEED TO MOVE 17 FORWARD TOWARD A SUSTAINABLE FUTURE AND ANY HIGHWAY WIDENING 18 CANNOT BE PART OF THAT. 19 20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. BIKE EAST BAY, FOLLOWED BY 21 22 ZACK ACARDI. BIKE EAST BAY? 23 SPEAKER: HELLO? CAN YOU HEAR ME? THIS IS MANAGER AT BIKE EAST 24 BAY. I WANT TO SAY THAT HIGHWAY EXPANSION ENTICES PEOPLE TO



- 1 STAY WITH PRIVATE VEHICLE TRIPS WHO WOULD OTHERWISE CHOOSE
- 2 DIFFERENTLY. LET'S LOOK INTO CONGESTION PROBLEMS WITHOUT
- 3 HIGHWAY EXPANSION WITH INVESTMENTS IN MORE ACTIVE AND
- 4 INCLUSIVE TRANSIT OPTIONS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

5

- 6 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ZACK ACARDI, FOLLOWED BY
- 7 JONATHON KASS.

8

- 9 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. ZACK AT NRDC,
- 10 NATURAL RESOURCE DEFENSE COUNCIL, ALSO CALLING AS A
- 11 CONSTITUENT IN THE EAST BAY. THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE NOTE
- 12 THAT HIGHWAY CENTRIC COUNTY BALLOT MEASURES IN SACRAMENTO
- 13 FRESNO, MADERA COUNTIES EACH FAILED IN 2022. THAT'S CALLED
- 14 POLITICAL REALITY. UNACCEPTABLE CLIMATE, ENVIRONMENTAL
- 15 JUSTICE, ECOSYSTEM HARM, TRAFFIC SAFETY AND FISCAL
- 16 CONSEQUENCES OF HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS PAST AND PRESENT. IT IS
- 17 WITH CONTEXT IN MIND THAT NRDC ECHOES THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC
- 18 TRANSPORTATION COALITION SUPPORT FOR THE ENABLING LEGISLATION,
- 19 WHILE REOUESTING THAT MTC EXCLUDES PROJECTS THAT EXPAND THE
- 20 FOOTPRINT OF THE REGION'S HIGHWAY SYSTEM FROM THE LOCAL
- 21 FUNDING ELIGIBILITY. THANK YOU.

22

- 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JONATHON KASS FOLLOWED BY
- 24 STEVE BIRDLEBOUGH.



- 1 SPEAKER: JONATHON KASS. I AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES ON THE NO
- 2 HIGHWAY EXPANSION COALITION LETTER WHICH IS CALLING FOR OPTION
- 3 THREE. JUST FOCUSING ON ONE SPECIFIC CONCERN MTC REFERENCES
- 4 CLIMATE NEUTRAL HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS. IN RESEARCH
- 5 DEMONSTRATES THAT THIS IS A FANTASY. RESEARCH SUMMARIZING
- 6 HUNDREDS OF PROJECTS ACROSS THE COUNTRY SHOWS INDUCED TRAFFIC
- 7 IS OFTEN GREATER BY FACTOR OF TEN PREDICTED BY TRADITIONAL
- 8 TRAVEL DEMAND MODELING. PROJECTIONS REDUCED CONGESTION AND
- 9 MINIMAL GHG GROWTH ARE CONSISTENTLY WRONG BY A LOT. SO WE NEED
- 10 TO GET THE FACTS STRAIGHT ABOUT THE RESULTS OF HIGHWAY
- 11 EXPANSION.

12

14

13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. STEVE.

- 15 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. THIS IS STEVE WITH THE TRANSPORTATION AND
- 16 LAND USE COALITION OF SONOMA COUNTY. WE -- CARB IS ASKING THAT
- 17 WE DOUBLE THE AMOUNT OF TRANSIT AVAILABLE AND THAT WE REDUCE
- 18 DRIVING BY 25% BETWEEN NOW AND 2030. WIDENING HIGHWAYS DOESN'T
- 19 MAKE ANY SENSE AT THIS POINT. WE NEED TO HAVE CONSTRUCTION OF
- 20 BRIDGES OVER THE EXISTING FREEWAYS TO CONNECT COMMUNITIES. SO,
- 21 I SUGGEST THAT THE MEASURE SHIFT FROM WIDENING ROADS TO
- 22 CONNECTING COMMUNITIES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MICHELLE GRAY FOLLOWED BY 1 MARK SAWCHUK. MICHELLE GRAY? OKAY. WE'LL MOVE ON. MARK SAWCHUK 2 3 FOLLOWED BY RICHARD ANTONIO. 4 5 SPEAKER: HI. MY NAME IS MARK, I'M A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN SAN FRANCISCO. I SUPPORT REMOVING THE UPPER LIMIT ON FINALIZED 6 RAISED FOR THIS MEASURE BUT I DO NOT SUPPORT ANY OPTION THAT 7 8 WOULD DIVERT FUNDS FROM THIS MEASURE TO HIGHWAYS. AND ESPECIALLY OPPOSE ANY HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECTS. THEREFORE, I 9 10 OPPOSE OPTION ONE, AND I ALSO DO NOT SUPPORT OPTION TWO. THIS IS A TRANSIT MEASURE. OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEMS ARE STARING 11 DOWN IN ABYSS. AC TRANSIT HAS JUST PROPOSED A PLAN FOR 12 DRACONIAN SERVICE CUTS THAT WOULD LEAVE THE EAST BAY WITH 13 SCHEDULE TALL BUS SERVICE IT IS LONG PAST TIME TO FUND OUR 14 TRANSIT SYSTEMS TO THE EXTENT THAT THEY SHOULD BE THEREFORE I 15 16 SUPPORT OPTION THREE IN THE PLAN. THANK YOU. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RICHARD ANTONIO. 18 19 SPEAKER: RICHARD ANTONIO VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, 20 21 WHICH INCLUDES A COALITION OF FIVE BAY AREA LABOR UNIONS AND THREE LABOR COUNCILS. MOST OF YOU RECALL IN YOUR MEETING JUNE 22 2022 YOU ADOPTED STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION TO MOVE AHEAD TO 23

ADDRESS THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS FISCAL CLIFF BOTH MOVING AHEAD

WITH THE REGIONAL MEASURE AND BY SEEKING THE INTERIM BRIDGE

24



- 1 FUNDING THAT WE WON LAST YEAR IN THE LEGISLATURE FISCAL CLIFF
- 2 CONTINUES TO LOOM AND THIS REGIONAL MEASURE IS THE ONLY
- 3 SOLUTION ON THE TABLE. ALTERNATIVE IS LITERALLY THE
- 4 DEVASTATION OF THE BAY AREA TRANSIT OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS
- 5 THAT LEAVES ROOM FOR MANY OTHER KIND OF EXPENDITURES PROVIDED
- 6 THEY USE A SMALL MINORITY OF THE REVENUE IT DOESN'T LEAVE ROOM
- 7 FOR MAJOR HIGHWAY PROJECTS. THANK YOU.

8

9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ALEXANDER HERDJI.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: CALLING TO SUPPORT OPTION THREE THAT PROHIBITS USE OF
- 12 FUNDS FOR HIGHWAY EXPANSION. USING HIGHWAY EXPANSION IS A WAY
- 13 TO TRY AND WIN MORE SUBURBAN COUNTIES, IT'S A FAILED 1950'S
- 14 WAY OF THINKING. IF WE PROMOTE THE VISION TO THE VOTERS OF A
- 15 TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR THEM, OF A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT
- 16 COULD EVOLVE, EXPAND, AND GROW, AND A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT
- 17 COULD BE USABLE WITHOUT THE THREAT OF THE TRANSIT SYSTEM
- 18 CONSTANTLY COLLAPSING THAT'S WHAT WILL WIN THE SUPPORT AT THE
- 19 POLLS. THAT'S ONE IN MTC'S INITIAL POLLING AGAINST HIGHWAY
- 20 EXPANSE ALREADY SHOWN TO WIN AND CONTINUING THAT IN SUPPORTING
- 21 ACTUAL TRANSIT INSTEAD OF SUPPORTING FAILED THINGS LIKE
- 22 HIGHWAY EXPANSION, IS SOMETHING I WOULD URGE YOU TO DO WITH
- 23 THAT TO SUPPORT OPTION THREE. THANK YOU.

24

25 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAJ SINGH.



1 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS RAJ SINGH PRESIDENT OF BUSINESS AGENT 2 3 LOCAL 265 I REPRESENT 1600 FRONTLINE TRANSIT WORKERS SANTA CLARA TRANSIT VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY WE ASK THAT A 4 5 SIGNIFICANT EMERGE OF THE FUNDS IN THE REGION MEASURE BE DEDICATED TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS OUR CITIES AND COUNTIES HAVE 6 GROWN PUBLIC TRANSIT HAS FAILED TO MEET THE INDIANA FUNDING IS 7 8 THE MAIN CAUSE OF IT. VTA HAS RECENTLY REACHED OUTPUT LEVELS EOUAL TO PRE-PANDEMIC BUT GUESS WHAT? THOSE LEVELS ARE 9 EOUIVALENT TO WHAT THEY WERE RUNNING IN THE EARLY '90S. AGAIN 10 WE ASK THAT YOU DEDICATE THIS FUNDING SPECIFICALLY TOWARDS 11 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CHRIS LEE EGAN FOLLOWED BY 14 15 GABRIELLE GOFFMAN. 16 SPEAKER: TALK PERSONALLY AS AN OUTRAGED PRIVATE CITIZEN. I 17 SUPPORT OPTION THREE. AND THAT DOESN'T GIVE CONSIDERATION TO 18 ANY OTHER OPTIONS AS WE HAVE LOST THE PLOT HERE. IMPETUS IS 19 TRANSIT FUND DISCIPLINING HOW IT'S COLLAPSED. WE SHOULD BE 20 21 SUPPORTING TRANSIT NOT JUST FOR EQUITABLE REASONS BUT WITH A 22 CLEAR VIEW ABOUT THE ENVIRONMENT AND THE CLIMATE CATASTROPHE 23 WE'RE FACING. OPTION THREE ALLOWS FOR NON-CAPACITY INCREASING PROJECT. THAT'S FINE. WE SHOULD NOT BE INCREASING VMT, 24 ESPECIALLY WHEN WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE TRYING TO AFFORD OUR



TRANSIT PROJECTS. LET'S MOVE FORWARD WITHOUT HIGHWAY WIDENING. 1 2 THANK YOU. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. GABRIEL GOFFMAN FOLLOWED BY 4 5 COMMISSIONER GORDON. 6 SPEAKER: HELLO. YES, I'M ALSO ECHOING THE POINT PEOPLE HAVE 7 8 MADE. WE CAN'T SOLVE OUR CONGESTION PROBLEMS WITH THE SAME APPROACH THAT CREATED THEM. AND HIGHWAY EXPANSION WONT HELP 9 GET A TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE PASSED. HIGHWAY EXPANSION 10 CAUSES MANY HARMS. THERE WAS A TRAGIC DEATH OFF AN EXIT OF A 11 HIGHWAY IN SAN FRANCISCO JUST LAST YEAR NOT TO MENTION 12 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND JUTTING FURTHER CONGESTION AND 13 ALSO SPIRALING COST. IT'S HIGHLY PHYSICALLY IRRESPONSIBLE 14 ESPECIALLY WHEN YOU LOOK INTO CLIMATE CHANGE, AND COST OF 15 16 MAINTAINING HIGHWAYS, WILL ESCALATE RAPIDLY. YOU KNOW, NDC SHOULD SHOW THE STATE THAT WE CARE ABOUT GRANT SUBMISSION WE 17 SHOULD NOT INCLUDE THIS IN THE MEASURE. THANK YOU. 18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GORDON FOLLOWED 20 21 BY SHANE WEINSTEIN. 22 23 SPEAKER: HELLO, THIS IS HELEN MARIE COMMISSIONER GORDON, CALIFORNIA. I WOULD LIKE TO PUT THE BOARD MEMBERS AND 24

COMMISSIONERS STATING TRANSPARENCY NEEDS TO BE COMMUNICATED TO



- 1 YOUR PARTNERS WHO SERVE ON THE VARIOUS COMMITTEES AND
- 2 COMMISSION BOARDS WITHIN THEIR OWN CAN'T. THIS IS THE FIRST I
- 3 HAVE HEARD ABOUT THIS AND I LIVE DEEP IN TRANSPORTATION. WHERE
- 4 I LIVE WE HAVE WON BUS RUN EVERY HOUR BUT HOWEVER WE CANNOT
- 5 OVERSIGHT WHETHER YOU WANT TO WIDEN OR NOT WIDEN, IF YOU DON'T
- 6 WIDEN THE HIGHWAYS, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE SIX BUSES, DIESELS,
- 7 AND WHAT NOT. AND WE'LL BE STUCK. I HAVE A SON WHO IS DISABLED
- 8 WHO HAS SERVICES FROM SACRAMENTO TO SAN FRANCISCO AND WE USE
- 9 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. HOWEVER WE NEED TO GET THERE. WITH
- 10 VEHICLE I GOT THERE WITH MUCH LESS STRESS HOWEVER WE NEED TO
- 11 CONSIDER EVERYBODY IN THIS CONCERN I ALSO ENCOURAGE YOU TO DO
- 12 A SURVEY BECAUSE WE HAVE --
- 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAT'S YOUR TIME. WE HAVE SHANE
- 15 WEINSTEIN FOLLOWED BY CINDY.
- 17 SPEAKER: HELLO MY NAME IS SHANE WEINSTEIN, PRESIDENT BUSINESS
- 18 AGENT OF 1517 REPRESENTING 150 FRONTLINE TRANSIT WORKERS, I
- 19 FIND IT IRONIC THE CLIMATE POLLS MTC HOLDS THIS IS EVEN A
- 20 CONVERSATION. WIDENING HIGHWAY. SIMPLY ISN'T AN OPTION. THERE
- 21 ARE SOURCES OF EXTRA FINISHING DEDICATE TO CAPITAL PROJECTS.
- 22 THE COMMISSIONER NEED TO BE MR. FOR MOST VULNERABLE THOSE THAT
- 23 DEPEND ON TRANSIT SERVICE. HOW WOULD YOU FEEL IF YOUR ONLY
- 24 MODE OF TRANSPORTATION WAS TAKEN AWAY? IBEW1575 STRONGLY
- 25 SUPPORTS OPTION THREE. THANK YOU.

13



1 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CINDY FOLLOWED BY NOLANI. 2 3 SPEAKER: HI CALLING TO SECOND COMMENTS MADE BY TRANSFORM AND 4 5 OTHERS. I USE ALL SORTS OF TRANSIT, I BIKE, WALK, AND DRIVE ALTHOUGH I'M DOING LESS OF THAT GIVEN ALL THE PROBLEMS: 6 REGARDING CONCERN ABOUT JOBS WE HAVE SO MANY CAPITAL NEEDS 7 8 OUTSIDE OF HIGHWAY WIDENING ROAD WELTED IN THE FORM OF 9 TRAFFIC, RAIL PROJECTS, ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FACILITIES LIKE PROTECTED BIKEWAYS AND BIKE OR PEDESTRIAN ONLY BRIDGE IMPROVE 10 HUGE GAPS IN CONNECTIVITY. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THIS AS AN 11 OPPORTUNITY OF WIN-WIN FOR EVERYONE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 12 CONSIDERATION. 13 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU: MAYHANI. 15 16 SPEAKER: HI MY NAME IS MALANI VIXLER, VICE CHAIR OF 17 18 TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE COMMISSION CITY OF BERKELEY AND HERE ON BEHALF OF MYSELF AND EAST BAY FOR EVERYONE PLEASE 19 PRIORITIZE THE ORIGINAL INTENT OF THE MEASURE TRANSIT ACCESS 20 21 IMPROVES EQUITY WHEREAS ADDING MORE HIGHWAY CHANGE DOES NOT 22 CURRENTLY. BILLIONS OF DOLLARS IF FUNDING ARE AVAILABLE FOR 23 HIGHWAYS.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. WARREN WELLS FOLLOWED BY 1 2 SEBASTIAN PETTY. 3 SPEAKER: HI, WARREN WELLS. IT'S WORTH REMEMBERING THAT FUNDING 4 5 TRANSIT BENEFITS EVEN DRIVERS THAT DO NOT RIDE IT, THE RESULT IF OUR TRANSIT PRAYERS FALL OFF A FISCAL CLIFF. WIDENING 6 HIGHWAYS WHEN STREETS ARE FALLING APART IT'S LIKE PLANNING AN 7 8 ADDITION TO YOUR HOUSE WHILE YOU'RE ROOF IS CAVING IN. WE SUPPORT SPENDING MONEY ON ROADS. THE ROADS WE ALREADY HAVE. 9 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION. 10 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. SEBASTIAN PETTY FOLLOWED BY 12 BOB ALAN. 13 14 SPEAKER: SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR, SUPPORTING MOVING FORWARD 15 16 WITH FLEXIBLE REGIONAL MEASURE FOCUSED ON SUSTAINING TRANSFORMING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WE ARE NOT SUPPORTIVE 17 HOWEVER OF MAKING FURTHER INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND HIGHWAY 18 CAPACITY INCREASE VMT AND TAKE US FURTHER AWAY FROM ACHIEVING 19 OUR DAUNTING CLIMATE GOALS. WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO 20 21 WORK WITH YOU TO SHAPE A FUTURE MEASURE THAT CAN SUCCEED AT 22 THE BALLOT AND BENEFIT OUR COMMUNITIES, REGION AND OUR PLANET. 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. BOB ALAN FOLLOWED BY MIKE 24 25 SWIRE.



1 2 SPEAKER: BOB ALAN VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, I WANT TO 3 ECHO COMMENTS OF THE MEMBERS THAT WE NEED A MEASURE -- WE HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THIS AT MTC FOR 15 YEARS. I HAVE BEEN 4 5 WORKING WITH THE COMMISSIONS. THAT'S GOING TO BE OPERATIONS FOCUSED WILL NOT EXPAND HIGHWAYS. WE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO 6 DO THAT WITHOUT GETTING DISTRACTED. I HOPE THE COMMISSION WILL 7 8 MOVE FORWARD WITH SOMETHING THAT IS A STRONG SIGNAL ON CLIMATE. WE'RE NOT GOING TO EXPAND HIGHWAYS THAT ADDRESS THE 9 OPERATIONS CRISIS BY LIFTING THE CAP ON REVENUE GENERATION 10 WITH REVENUE SOURCE. THANK YOU. 11 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MIKE SQUIRE FOLLOWED BY ANTHONY. 14 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. FIRST, I WANT TO 15 16 THANK SUPERVISOR CANEPA AND THE OTHER ELECTED OFFICIALS WHO OPPOSE HIGHWAY WIDENING. I'M A MEMBER OF CITIZEN ADVISORY 17 COMMITTEE. THIS IS NOT JUST A MATTER ABOUT ENVIRONMENTAL 18 PRUDENCE. LOOK AT SAN MATEO COUNTY, JUST SPENT \$6 MILLION ON A 19 PROJECT THAT WIDENED HIGHWAY 101; DRIVERS ARE ALREADY 20 COMPLAINING THE HIGHWAY IS FULL, LEADING TO CALLS TO FUND 21 22 WIDENING. MORE HIGHWAYS LEAD TO MORE POT HOLES TO FILL. MORE 23 HIGHWAYS LEADS TO MOREOVER TIME FOR ENFORCEMENT. CALTRAIN WHICH IS IN COMPETITION WITH ONE VERY ONE FOR SAN MATEO 24

COMMUTERS AND SITS ADJACENT TO THE HIGHWAY, REPRESENTS THE



WORST PANDEMIC RIDER RECOVERY OF ANY TRANSIT AGENCY IN THE BAY 1 2 AREA. GIVEN THIS DROP --3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAT'S YOUR TIME. NEXT UP IS ANTHONY 4 5 FOLLOWED BY JORDAN -- PARDON ME. JORDAN GRIMES FOLLOWED BY 6 MICHELLE GRAY. 7 8 SPEAKER: YES. YES. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS JORDAN GRIMES WITH GREENBELT ALLIANCE WE'RE EXCITED TO SEE THE MEASURE 9 MOVING FORWARD BUT JOIN OTHERS IN CONCERN FOR POTENTIAL 10 HIGHWAY WIDENING. THIS IS FRANK HE IRRESPONSIBLE IT WASTES 11 TREMENDOUS AMOUNTS OF MONEY ON A SOLUTION THAT'S 12 COUNTERPRODUCTIVE TO ITS PURPOSE. LEADS TO MORE CARS ON THE 13 ROAD AND MORE TRAFFIC. WE HAVE SPENT DECADE AFTER DECADE 14 15 BUILDING MORE AND MORE LANES AND IT HAS INCREASED TRAFFIC ON 16 OUR ROADS. THE ONLY WAY TO GET RID OF TRAFFIC IS GET PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS, OFF OF THE ROADS AND ON TO TRANSIT. WHICH 17 WILL HAPPEN IF WE PROVIDE A FAST, EFFICIENT FREQUENT SYSTEM. 18 WE NEED TO MAKE THAT CASE TO THE VOTERS. LET'S DO SO AND MOVE 19 FORWARD WITH OPTION THREE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR TIME 20 21 TODAY. 22 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MICHELLE GRAY. THANK YOU FOR

CORRECTING. HOPEFULLY WE CAN HEAR YOU THIS TIME. YOU WILL BE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

24

25

FOLLOWED BY JEFF SCHAFFER.



1 2 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES OKAY THANK YOU. MY NAME IS MICHELLE 4 5 GRAY P I AM PRESIDENT BUSINESS AGENT OF ATU LOCAL 1605. WE NEED MORE TRANSIT DOLLARS. OPERATIONS IS WHAT MOVES OUR 6 PUBLIC. I AM A CURRENT OPERATOR THAT DRIVES EVERY DAY. AND IF 7 8 I HAD A DOLLAR FOR EVERYBODY THAT COMPLAINED FOR MORE SERVICE OR NEEDED MORE SERVICE OR THE PEOPLE THAT GOT STUCK OUT THERE 9 BECAUSE THERE WEREN'T SERVICE TO PROVIDE TO GET THEM WHERE 10 THEY NEEDED TO GO. WE NEED MORE MONEY FOR OPERATIONS. SO I 11 APPRECIATE YOUR TIME. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JEFF SCHAFFER FOLLOWED BY 14 15 MARTIN MUNOZ. 16 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS JEFF SCHAFFER, I AM PRESIDENT OF THE ATU 17 LOCAL 1277 IN LOS ANGELES I'M ALSO CALIFORNIA CONFERENCE BOARD 18 CHAIRMAN REPRESENTING 13 LOCALS IN CALIFORNIA, NINE UP NORTH, 19 FOUR DOWN SOUTH. I'M CALLING TO ECHO SOME OF THE COMMENTS MADE 20 21 EARLIER OPTION THREE IS THE WAY THAT NEEDS TO MOVE FORWARD AND THIS, I BELIEVE SAYING THAT SERVICE CUTS WOULD BE DEVASTATING 22 23 AND THERE'S ALREADY ENOUGH FUNDING IN THE INFRASTRUCTURE BILL. TRANSIT IS WHAT NEEDS OF MOVES THE PEOPLE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 24

25

TIME.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MARTIN MUNOZ FOLLOWED BY 3 CAROLE TAYLOR. 4 5 SPEAKER: MARTIN MUNOZ SPEAKING ON BEHALF. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE OPPOSITION FROM TRANSIT ADVOCATES ACROSS THE BAY 6 AREA. THIS WAS ORGANIZED AT THE VERY LAST MINUTE. IT WOULD 7 8 TAKE ME 45 MINUTES TO DRIVE DOOR-TO-DOOR. IT TAKES TWO HOURS WHEN USING MUNI AND CALTRAIN. THIS IS UNACCEPTABLE TRANSIT 9 SHOULD BE THE OBVIOUS CHOICE. WHY WOULD WE WIDEN HIGHWAYS WHEN 10 ALREADY THAT IS A PREFERENTIAL FORM OF TRANSPORTATION BETWEEN 11 OUR METRO REGION. I OPPOSE FUNDS WE USE FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING 12 AND SUPPORT THE MEASURE TRANSIT AND MORE TRANSIT ONLY. THANK 13 14 YOU. 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CAROLE TAYLOR FOLLOWED BY 17 ANTHONY. CAROLE TAYLOR, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. OR WE'LL MOVE ON. NEXT SPEAKER IS ANTHONY. 18 19 SPEAKER: HELLO. I'M AN ALAMEDA COUNTY RESIDENT CALLING FOR 20 21 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION TO PROVIDE FOR A FOCUSED CLEAR MEASURE 22 THAT FUNDS EXPANDED TRANSIT OPERATION AND REGIONAL GOVERNMENT 23 REFORM. MTC'S 2050 PLAN WILL BE THE VISION AND SHOULD FOLLOW THE EXAMPLE OF SEATTLE WHICH PASSED THE TRANSIT MEASURE IN 24

2016. THE LANGUAGE FOR OPTION TWO CLAIMS STATE ROUTE 37



- 1 EXPANSION WHICH WOULD TOTAL A 11 BILLED PRESENTLY COULD BE
- 2 FUNDED ORDER THE MEASURE THESE HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS ARE
- 3 IN DIRECT COMPETITION WITH THE TRANSFORMATION THAT WE NEED TO
- 4 MAKE TO A TRANSIT FORWARD GREEN FUTURE. THEY WOULD BE IN CLEAN
- 5 CONFLICT IN A REGIONAL MEGA MEASURE THAT WASTES MONEY ON
- 6 HIGHWAY EXPANSION. PLEASE PROVIDE FOR OPTION THREE AND DO NOT
- 7 FUND HIGHWAY EXPANSION.

8

9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. CAROLE TAYLOR.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. CAROLE TAYLOR, GENESIS. AS I UNDERSTAND IT
- 12 WHAT WE'RE SAYING IS THIS MASH WONT PASS WITHOUT SUPPORT FROM
- 13 THE BUILDING TRADES. HIGHWAY EXPANSION SHOULD BE OFF THE NAP.
- 14 BUT I RIDE A BUS THAT'S ON A REALLY ROTTEN ROAD. AND MY BUS
- 15 TRADITION TRANSPORTATION WOULD BE IMPROVED IF THIS ONE ROAD
- WERE REPAIRED. SO I'M WONDERING IF WE CAN PUT A LIMIT, 1%, 2%,
- 17 FOR SAFETY AND ROAD RECONSTRUCTION. NO HIGHWAY FUNDING. BUT IN
- 18 TERMS OF LOCAL ROADS. BECAUSE THAT IS MY SUGGESTION. BUT YES
- 19 HIGHWAY EXPANSION IS JUST A KNEE GENERIC GAME STOPPER. I HATE
- 20 TO INTRODUCE A TROJAN HORSE WITH THE PHRASE SAFE ROADS BUT IF
- 21 IT NEEDS TO BE DONE IT NEED TO BE DONE. LET'S THROW THEM SOME
- 22 MORE DOLLARS IF IT GETS US MORE DOLLARS.

- 24 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THAT WAS OUR FINAL SPEAKER,
- 25 MR. CHAIR.



1	
2	DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THERE WAS A MOTION
3	THERE WAS A SECOND ON THAT MOTION. CAN I HAVE A ROLL CAL
4	PLEASE, MISS WARD?
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WITH A MOTION PIE CANEPA, SECONDED BY
7	COMMISSIONER NOACK? CHAIR PEDROZA?
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
12	
13	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES AND I WANT TO THANK ALL THE
14	PUBLIC COMMENTERS. THAT WAS A LOT OF THOUGHTFUL COMMENT. SO,
15	THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
18	
19	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN?
22	
23	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?



1	
2	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?
5	
6	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
9	
10	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
11	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
13	NICESCOTA DI DATAG. NEC
14	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GLOVER?
17	Canal Mac Cacvar.
18	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
19	
20	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?
23	
24	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?
2	
3	SUE NOACK: YES.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
6	
7	GINA PAPAN: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? SPERING? THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION
10	PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
11	
12	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:
13	
14	DAVID CANEPA: WASN'T THAT PRETTY SIGNIFICANT. THAT BRINGS US
15	TO NOT TO LET THE OTHER BOARD MEMBERS DOWN. BRINGS US TO
16	ITEM 7B WHICH IS THE PROPOSED FINAL 2024 MTC ABAG JOINT
17	ADVOCACY PROGRAM. THERE IS NO REPORT AT THIS TIME GEORGIA?
18	
19	GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: IT'S IN YOUR PACKET.
20	
21	DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU GEORGIA.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M SORRY. THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND
24	REQUIRED FOR THAT ITEM.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I THINK WE COULD JUST PASS IT ON. DO 1 WE HAVE A MOTION FOR THE JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM? 2 3 DAVID RABBITT: SO MOVED RABBITT. 4 5 6 DAVID CANEPA: SECOND. 7 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE ONE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND 10 RAISED. JORDAN MALL DON ADD OWE. 11 12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. CONTINUING THE PREVIOUS DISCUSSION, I 13 THINK THERE ARE POLICIES THAT MTC COULD ADVOCATE FOR AT THE 14 15 STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL THAT WOULD, SORT OF, MAKE THE PREVIOUS 16 SET OF DISCUSSIONS UNNECESSARY. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE LEGISLATION THAT ALLOWS GENERAL PURPOSE LANES TO BE CONVERTED 17 TO HOV OR EXPRESS LANES OR BUS ONLY LANES AND FORBIDS ADDING 18 AUXILIARY LANE OR ANOTHER KIND OF LANES TO HIGHWAYS WITH THE 19 PREFERENCE EVER MAKING USE OF ALL THE LANES THAT WE CURRENTLY 20 21 HAVE. I THINK YOU SHOULD ALSO HAVE A POLICY TO EXPLORE ALL LANES POLLING ON ALL OF THE HIGHWAYS IN THE AREA AS A METHOD 22 OF CONGESTION MANAGEMENT AND FUND-RAISING. IN JUDICIAL. POLICY 23

WIDE THERE IS MORE WE CAN DO TO CLAMP DOWN ON FIGHTING AGAINST



1	CLIMATE CHANGE AND ACTUALLY HAVING TEETH TO THE POLICY THAT WI
2	CLAIM WE HAVE THAT KIND OF DANCE AROUND ACTUALLY
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAT IS YOUR TIME. THANK YOU. THERE ARE
5	NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED.
6	
7	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: BRINGING IT BACK. MOTION BY RABBITT,
8	SECOND CANEPA. ROLL CALL VOTE.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PEDROZA?
11	
12	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ? ABE-KOGA?
15	
16	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
19	
20	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?
23	
24	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
25	



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
2	
3	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?
6	
7	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES FLEMING?
8	
9	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?
12	
13	NATHAN MILEY: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?
16	
17	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?
20	
21	SUE NOACK: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? SPERING?
24	
25	JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.



1 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES 2 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 3 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. MOVING TO ITEM 6 EIGHT, THIS IS THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION MOP 7 CERTIFICATE REVIEW OVERVIEW. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM 8 ONLY. 9 ALIX BOCKELMAN: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I'M GOING TO DO A 10 QUICK INTRODUCTION. ALIX BOCKELMAN, MTC'S ROLE AS THE 11 METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION OR MPO FOR THE BAY AREA WE 12 UNDER GO A CERTIFICATION REVIEW EVERY FOUR YEARS AND JASMINE 13 COMMUNITY PLANNER WITH THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION IS 14 HERE TO GIVE A QUICK OVERVIEW OF THE CERTIFICATION PROCESS AND 15 16 WE APPRECIATE HER PATIENCE AND HAVING TAKEN THE TRAIN ALL THE WAY DOWN FROM SACRAMENTO EARLY THIS MORNING. 17 18 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: WELCOME. 19 20 SPEAKER: I'M GOING TO DO MY BEST TO KEEP THIS BRIEF. WHAT I 21 LACK IN BREVITY, I HAVE IN EXCITEMENT. I'M REALLY EXCITED TO 22 TALK TO YOU ABOUT THE 2024TMA CERTIFICATION REVIEW THAT WE 23 HAVE FOR MTC. I WILL GO INTO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I'M 24 GATHERING ONE OF THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY PUTTING US ON TASK, 25



- 1 STARTING WITH INTRODUCTION, I MIGHT BE BY MYSELF BUT THERE ARE
- 2 MANY PEOPLE BESIDES ME. WE'RE GOING TO HOP INTO THE FEDERAL
- 3 REVIEW PROCESS WHAT WE'RE DOING ON THE FEDERAL SIDE WHEN WE
- 4 ARE DOING THESE CERTIFICATION ROUGHS TALK ABOUT MPO PLANNING
- 5 PROCESS WHICH IS SOMETHING I KNOW YOU ARE FAMILIAR WITH AND
- 6 WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT HOW WE CAN GET INVOLVED IN THE
- 7 PROCESS. I AM INVOLVED WITH THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION
- 8 AND COLEAD ON THIS EFFORT WE LEAD THIS EFFORT WITH FTA SO THAT
- 9 IS A PART OF OUR STEWARDSHIP AND OVERSIGHT RESPONSIBILITY. SO,
- 10 WITH FEDERAL HIGHWAY, WITH ME, I HAVE THERESA HUTCHINS COMING
- 11 FROM OUR FEDERAL HIGHWAY HEADQUARTERS IN DC WE HAVE FTA A
- 12 NUMBER OF REPRESENTATIVES ON THE TEAM, ALEXANDER SMITH, COLEAD
- 13 ON THIS EFFORT. WE HAVE MERVIN ACEBO, MARY NEWLIN JOINING US
- 14 FOR THIS REVIEW. WITH FEDERAL LANDS WE HAVE CENTRAL FEDERAL
- 15 LANDS, ELIJA HENLEY AND FRIENDS RIGHT NEXT DOOR WITH ETA
- 16 MICHAEL DURANTA. ALL RIGHT. WE'RE MOVING. SO, WHY ARE WE HERE?
- 17 IF YOU'RE WONDERING WHO I AM AND WHY WE'RE HERE? EVERY FOUR
- 18 YEARS MTC AND ALL MPOS THAT ARE CONSIDERED TMAS GO THROUGH A
- 19 CERTIFICATION PROCESS. SO, IT IS FEDERALLY REQUIRED UNDER
- 20 23USC, 134, AND 49USC 5303, IF YOU ARE LOOKING FOR SOME
- 21 FRIENDLY READING, THAT WE DO THESE CERTIFICATION REVIEWS WE DO
- 22 THEM JOINTLY WITH OUR PARTNERS AT FEDERAL TRANSIT
- 23 ADMINISTRATION IF YOU ARE WONDERING WHAT TMA IS, TMA IS WHERE
- 24 YOU ALL ARE; IT'S THE TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT AREA HOW WE
- 25 DEFINE IT THOSE AREAS SERVE POPULATION OF OVER 200,000 WHICH



- 1 MTC CLEARLY DOES. KEY PART OF OUR PROCESSES IS SEEKING PUBLIC
- 2 INPUT. WE WANT TO HEAR FROM YOU AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. WE
- 3 WILL PROVIDE OPPORTUNITIES FOR YOU ALL TO GET INVOLVED IN THE
- 4 PROCESS. WE CAN MOVE ON TO THE NEXT SLIDE. ALL RIGHTY I'M
- 5 GOING TO TRY TO SIMPLIFY OUR FEDERAL REVIEW PROCESS INTO THREE
- 6 EASY STEPS. WE START OFF WITH A DESK REVIEW WHICH WE HAVE
- 7 RECEIVED ALL INFORMATION FROM THE TEAM HEALER WE HAVE ALSO
- 8 BEEN DOING SOME FRIENDLY READING OF ALL OF THAT INFORMATION.
- 9 SECONDLY, WHAT WE HAVE COMING UP IN FEBRUARY IS A SITE VISIT.
- 10 SO WE WILL BE ON-SITE WITH YOUR TEAM HERE TALKING THROUGH YOUR
- 11 METROPOLITAN PLANNING PROCESS, ASKING ALL THE QUESTIONS THAT
- 12 WE HAVE GATHERED FROM OUR DESK AUDIT AND THAT'S OUR
- 13 OPPORTUNITY ALSO TO HAVE OUR PUBLIC INPUT SESSIONS. SO WE'RE
- 14 HAVING AN OPPORTUNITY FOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD
- 15 LIKE TO COME SPEAK TO US, OF COURSE MEMBERS OF THE BOARD THAT
- 16 WOULD LIKE TO COME AND SPEAK TO US. WE WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM
- 17 YOU JUST ABOUT YOUR PROCESS ENGAGING WITH THE PROCESS HERE AT
- 18 MTC. LASTLY ALL OF THIS WE COMPILE OUR DESK SITE VISIT AND
- 19 ISSUE OUR FINAL REPORT. NEXT SLIDE. OUTCOME OF THIS REVIEW WE
- 20 HAVE THREE POSSIBLE OUTCOMES. I'M GOING TO FOCUS ON THE FIRST
- 21 TWO I DON'T THINK THE THIRD IS GOING TO BE A PROBLEM. FIRSTLY,
- 22 THE FIRST OUTCOME IS WE ARE CERTIFIED. THIS MEANS THAT YOU
- 23 CONTINUE RECEIVING THE FEDERAL FUNDING THAT YOU ALL ALREADY
- 24 RECEIVE. EVERYTHING IS GOOD. PRETTY BOW. YAY. CERTIFIED.
- 25 SECOND OPTION IS CERTIFIED SUBJECT TO CORRECTIVE ACTION. THIS



- 1 IS ALSO GOOD. IT DOESN'T -- YOU KNOW -- SOUNDS KIND OF ROUGH,
- 2 BUT THAT JUST MEANS THERE ARE AREAS THAT WE CAN IMPROVE UPON.
- 3 THESE AREAS, YOU KNOW USUALLY CORRECTIVE ACTION MEANS WE HAVE
- 4 A FEDERAL REGULATION THAT'S IN DIRECT CONFLICT WITH A PRACTICE
- 5 HERE SO WE CAN -- WE NEED TO ADDRESS IT IT'S TIME BOUND WITHIN
- 6 A CERTAIN TIME LIMIT USUALLY INVOLVES ALL PARTIES WORKING
- 7 TOGETHER WITH CALTRANS FEDERAL HIGHWAY AND MTC AND WE USUALLY
- 8 COME TO A GREAT CONCLUSION WITH THAT. LASTLY NOT CERTIFIED.
- 9 I'M NOT WORRIED ABOUT MTC FOR THAT SO WE CAN KEEP ON PUSHING.
- 10 ALL RIGHT. SO, REALLY I'M GOING TO KEEP THIS EVEN SHORTER. THE
- 11 METROPOLITAN PLANNING PROCESS, THAT IS THE WORK THAT YOU ALL
- 12 DO EVERY TIME THIS BODY MEETS. SO WE'RE TALKING, THIS PROCESS
- 13 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT LONG RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING, SHORT
- 14 RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING, YOUR OVERALL WORK PROGRAM,
- 15 WE'RE LOOKING AT HOW YOU ALL MAKE DECISIONS AS A BODY. AND
- 16 THIS IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE THAT DETERMINES HOW A LARGE
- 17 PERCENTAGE OF THE FEDERAL FUNDING IS SPENT IN THE REGION. AND
- 18 IT LAYS OUT THE FUTURE FOR YOUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. THAT
- 19 PROCESS INVOLVES NOT JUST MTC IT INVOLVES CALTRANS, US, ON THE
- 20 FEDERAL SIDE, IT INVOLVES LOCAL CITIZENRY, INTEREST GROUPS, A
- 21 LOT OF PEOPLE WE HEARD FROM TODAY. IN-HOUSE, SO WE A NUMBER OF
- 22 APPROACHES, WE TALK ON THE FEDERAL SIDE ON THE 3C APPROACH,
- 23 PLANNING SHOULD BE CONTINUING COOPERATIVE COMPREHENSIVE MEET
- 24 HAPPENING ON A CYCLE, INCLUDING ALL OF THE NECESSARY BODIES
- 25 AND YEAH WE CAN KEEP PUSHING. SO, THESE ARE JUST A FEW



PRODUCTS THAT YOU ALL MIGHT BE FAMILIAR WITH THAT COME OUT OF 1 YOUR BODY, YOUR TEAM HERE AT MTC. WE DON'T HAVE TO SPEND MUCH 2 3 TIME HERE, WE CAN KEEP PUSHING. THANK YOU. SO, HOW ALL THESE PRODUCTS FIT TOGETHER, AS I MENTIONED, THESE ARE ALL ON A 4 5 CYCLE. SO WHAT IT FEELS LIKE WE DO ONE TRANSPORTATION PLAN YOU'RE DOING THE NEXT PLAN NOT THAT LONG AFTER BUT ALL OF 6 THESE CYCLES OF PLANNING SHOULD INFORM EACH OTHER. AT THE 7 8 CENTER IS -- SORRY, AT THE CENTER IS GETTING THE PUBLIC ENGAGED SO THE PUBLIC SHOULD BE AWARE OF WHAT'S GOING ON AT 9 EVERY STAGE OF THE PLANNING PROCESS. ALL RIGHTY. LAST BUT NOT 10 LEAST, HOW TO GET IN CONTACT WITH US. SO, AS I MENTIONED, WE 11 ARE GOING TO BE ON-SITE IN FEBRUARY. WE'RE WORKING WITH THE 12 TEAM HERE TO FIGURE OUT ALL OF THE LOGISTICS FOR OUR PUBLIC 13 INVOLVEMENT SESSION WHICH, WHEN WE HAVE THOSE LOGISTICS WE'LL 14 15 SHARE THEM. WE HOPE TO SEE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC COME OUT AND 16 TALK TO US. WE WILL BE REALLY EXCITED TO HEAR FROM YOU. AS

21

17

18

19

20

22 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YOU WERE TRUE TO

TO GO, THAT'S ALL RIGHT. WE'LL BE BACK. THANK YOU ALL.

WELL, YOU CAN E-MAIL US AT CERT.REVIEW@DOT.GOV, OR BY SNAIL

MAIL AND WE'LL BE HAPPY TO ENGAGE. WE'RE HAPPY TO HEAR FROM

MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. IF TODAY IS TOO SOON, AND YOU'RE READY

- 23 BEING BRIEF. AND IT'S APPRECIATED. SO, AT THIS POINT,
- 24 COMMISSIONERS ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY. DO
- 25 WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.



1 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES, WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC. 2 3 JANE KRAEMER PLEASE STEP TO THE PODIUM. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. 4 5 SPEAKER: COMMISSIONER RABBITT IS CORRECT. YOU KNOW WHERE THE 6 VOTES ARE. HOWEVER, THERE ARE TIMES WHEN YOU HIT GLITCHES IN 7 8 YOUR PLANNING PROCESS, AND YOU START SCRATCHING YOUR HEAD AND YOU'RE NOT SURE WHERE TO GO BECAUSE YOU DON'T KNOW THINK YOU 9 HAVE THE VOTES. IT MEANS THAT YOU NEED TO BEGIN TO THINK 10 INCLUSIVELY ABOUT THOSE WHO DON'T AGREE WITH THE MAJORITY. 11 THAT MEANS THE PUBLIC CAN, AT TIMES, CHANGE ITS MIND IF GIVEN 12 GOOD REASON. AND IT'S UP TO YOU TO GIVE THEM THE GOOD REASON. 13 14 THANK YOU. 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU MISS KRAEMER. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENTS. 17 18 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THIS WAS JUST AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM ONLY. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE 20 YOU COMING AND JOINING US TODAY. ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT 21 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM NINE, CLOSED SESSION. ITEM 9A IS 22 CLOSED SESSION PUBLIC COMMENT. CLERK IS THERE ANYONE THAT 23 WISHES TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION BEFORE CLOSED SESSION? 24



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE NO RAISED HANDS FOR THIS ITEM AND 1 2 HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: PROCEEDING TO ITEM B CONFERENCE WITH 4 5 LEGAL COUNSEL ANTICIPATED LITIGATION. 6 KATHLEEN KANE: SORRY TO INTERRUPT, CHAIR, THIS IS ACTUALLY THE 7 8 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S PERFORMANCE EVALUATION AND YOUR CLOSED 9 SESSION. 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I SHOULD HAVE BEEN MORE PERCEPTIVE 11 THAN JUST TO READ WHEN'S PRINTED. 12 13 KATHLEEN KANE: MY APOLOGIES. 14 15 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THE COMMISSION WILL BE IN CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO PUBLIC EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION 17 GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54957 WITH RESPECT TO THE EXECUTIVE 18 DIRECTOR AND EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR COMPENSATION RANGE NON-19 REPRESENTED EMPLOYEES EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR SHOULD NOT BE PRESENT 20 21 FOR THIS DISCUSSION ON COMPENSATION COMMISSIONERS JOIN US IN 22 THE CLAREMONT ROOM ON THE FIFTH FLOOR. 23 KATHLEEN KANE: I BELIEVE WE WERE GOING TO MEET IN YOUR NORMAL 24

25

LOCATION HERE.



1 2 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I CAUGHT MYSELF THIS TIME. WE'RE GOING TO THE CLAIR METROPOLITAN ROOM THERE AND COME BACK IF THERE IS 3 ANY REPORTABLE ACTION. 4 5 KATHLEEN KANE: RIGHT. THANK YOU. [CLOSED SESSION] [CLOSED 6 SESSION CONTINUES] [CLOSED SESSION CONTINUES] [CLOSED 7 8 SESSION CONTINUES] 9 10 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS, WE ARE LIVE, AND IF YOU ARE SOMEWHERE NOT SITTING DOWN AT THE DAIS. IF YOU 11 COULD MAKE YOUR WAY OVER, PLEASE? I'LL REMIND EVERYONE, WE ARE 12 LIVE. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS. I KNOW IT'S BEEN A LONG DAY. 13 ALL RIGHT. SO, AS COMMISSIONERS MAKE THEIR WAY BACK. THE 14 15 COMMISSION DID MEET IN CLOSED SESSION. WE APPRECIATE OUR 16 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR JOINING US, AND WE ARE CONTINUING THIS ITEM TO OUR NEXT MEETING WHERE WE'LL CONTINUE THE DISCUSSION AROUND 17 EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION. AT THIS POINT WE'RE BACK AT 18 ITEM TEN, OPEN SESSION, WHICH WE ALREADY REPORTED. THERE IS NO 19 REPORTABLE ACTION. I WILL GO TO ITEM 11. IS THERE ANY GENERAL 20 21 PUBLIC COMMENTS? 22 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE IS ONE PERSON WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. I'LL CALL ON THEM MOMENTARILY. WE DID RECEIVE ONE 24 LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE FROM GUILIANO THAT HAS BEEN POSTED TO 25



THE ONLINE AGENDA, AND WE HAVE ONE INDIVIDUAL TO SPEAK. THAT 1 2 IS JORDON MALDALE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE 3 ONE MINUTE. 4 5 SPEAKER: JORDAN MALDALE, SAN JOSE. I WANTED TO ECHO THE E-MAIL PUBLIC COMMENT THAT YOU RECEIVED CLIMATE CHANGE IS A BIG ISSUE 6 THAT WE NEED TO PUT ALL OF OUR EFFORTS AND RESOURCES INTO, ALL 7 8 BIKES 2024 PEOPLE FIRST MOBILITY BUDGET CALIFORNIA IS A GREAT PROPOSAL I THINK WE NEED PROPOSALS LIKE THAT TO BE ENACTED AT 9 ALL LEVELS OF OUR GOVERNMENT I HOPE THAT IF THERE IS ANY ROOM 10 AT ALL FOR MTC TO CONSIDER THIS FOR ITS OWN BUDGET FOR THIS 11 YEAR I THINK THAT WOULD BE FANTASTIC I THINK WE NEED TO REALLY 12 SPEND ALL OF OUR MONEY AND EFFORT ON IMPROVING ACTIVE 13 TRANSPORTATION AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND BESIDES THINGS 14 LIKE REPAVING AND FIXING POTHOLES, WE REALLY NEED TO KEEP OUR 15 16 ROAD SYSTEM AS IT IS WITHOUT TRYING TO CONSTANTLY CHANGE IT BECAUSE THE ROAD SYSTEM WILL NEVER BE GOOD ENOUGH. THERE WILL 17 ALWAYS BE SOMETHING ELSE. WE ALL NEED TRANSIT AND ACCESS --18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL 20 21 RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR. 22 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM 12; THIS IS ADJOURNMENT. OUR NEXT MEETING 24

WILL BE FEBRUARY 28TH AT METRO CENTER. MEETING ADJOURNED.



- 1 THANK YOU TO THE PUBLIC FOR STICKING WITH US, AND TO THE
- 2 COMMISSION FOR A LONG DAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [ADJOURNED]





Broadcasting Government