

**ASSOCIATION OF BAY
AREA GOVERNMENTS
Meeting Transcript**

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 11TH, 2024, 9:40 AM

CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC: I WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND CALL THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. AND THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEB SITE COMMITTEE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND WE WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION TODAY. FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS FOR US IS THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. EDDIE, WOULD YOU LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE? [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC: THANK YOU. PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL CALL FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR SPERING?

2

3 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?

22 IS ABSENT. RABBITT?

23

24 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

2

3 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS THE MTC
4 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
7 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
8 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
9 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
10 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
11 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THE NEXT
14 ITEM IS THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS
15 AGENDA ITEM 5A IS ON CONSENT, AND IS THERE A MOTION TO APPROVE
16 CONSENT?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THE ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** EDDIE, DO YOU WANT TO SECOND
21 THAT? [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, EDDIE. OKAY. I HAVE A MOTION AND A
22 SECOND. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? IS THERE ANY WRITTEN
23 COMMENTS?

24

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
2 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
3 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

4

5 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. IS THERE ANY MTC
6 COMMISSIONERS ON REMOTE THAT'S VOTING?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE STILL HAVE TO DO ROLL CALL BECAUSE
9 THERE IS --

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** NO. I KNOW THAT. BUT I WAS
12 JUST ASKING --

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO ONE ON ZOOM OR IN THE
15 BOARDROOM.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ROLL CALL.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR SPERING?

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

24

25 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND THE CONSENT CALENDER PASSES

19 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO

22 HAND THE MEETING OFF TO PRESIDENT RAMOS AND SHE'LL WALK US

23 THROUGH THE ABAG PROCEDURES.

24

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. CALL TO
2 ORDER THE ABAG ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. A ROLL CALL WILL BE
3 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE
4 PARTICIPATION TODAY. WE'LL ESTABLISH QUORUM FIRST. SO I WOULD
5 ASK THE CLERK TO CONDUCT -- TO CHECK OUR PARTICIPATION HERE IN
6 THE ROOM AND ALSO REMOTELY. THANK YOU MISS SUTHERLAND.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. CHAIR RAMOS?

9

10 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT, AT MY NOTICED VIDEO
15 CONFERENCE LOCATION, 2180, MILL [INDISCERNIBLE] BERKELEY
16 CALIFORNIA.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ANDERSEN?

19

20 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** PRESENT IN DANVILLE AT MY OFFICE HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU. MEMBER ECKLUND?

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? ROMERO?

2

3 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** SILVA?

6

7 **CINDY SILVA:** PRESENT AT THE COUNTY SUPERVISORS'S OFFICE,

8 PLEASANT HILL.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WILLIAMS?

11

12 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HERE.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A REQUEST FOR

15 REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FOR MEMBER LEE.

16

17 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT RAMOS. I AM REQUESTING TO

18 PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB2449 JUST CAUSE DUE TO BUSINESS

19 NEED. THERE IS NO ONE IN THIS ROOM OVER 18 YEARS OLD. AND I AM

20 PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. NOTING MEMBER LEE AS

23 PRESENT. NEXT ITEM WILL BE FOR OUR CLERK TO READ OUT OUR

24 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
2 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG
3 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE
4 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$150 AND PER DIEM IS
5 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
6 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT WE DO
9 HAVE OUR CONSENT CALENDAR UNDER AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, AND WE HAVE
10 ONE MATTER FOR OUR CONSIDERATION, 8A, WHICH ARE OUR MINUTES.
11 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE ABAG CONSENT
12 CALENDAR?

13

14 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** SO MOVED BY SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.

15

16 **PAT ECKLUND:** AND SECOND BY, UHM, ECKLUND. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE HAVE A
19 MOTION BY WILLIAMS AND SECOND BY ECKLUND. THANK YOU FOR
20 REMEMBERING YOUR NAMES. ARE THERE ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHO
21 WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? DO WE HAVE ANY ONLINE?
22 SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK IS THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

23

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
2 WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WITH THEIR HAND
3 RAISED AND NONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO PROVIDE COMMENT.

4

5 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ROLL CALL
6 VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ABSOLUTELY. PRESIDENT RAMOS?

9 [SILENCE]

10

11 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** -- YES, THAT'S ME. [LAUGHTER] I
12 FORGOT MY NAME.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** -- [LAUGHTER] VICE PRESIDENT
15 ARREGUIN?

16

17 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ANDERSEN?

20

21 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ECKLUND?

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LEE?

3

4 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? MEMBER ROMERO?

7

8 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER SILVA?

11

12 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WILLIAMS?

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

19 MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT ITEM, 9A.

22 THIS IS A CONTRACT FOR BAYREN, BAY AREA REGIONAL ENERGY

23 NETWORK FOR SINGLE-FAMILY PROGRAM DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

24 WITH FRANKLIN ENERGY. AND IT IS AN -- IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 EXCEED 22,100,000. JANE ELIAS, WOULD YOU PLEASE PROVIDE THE
2 REPORT FOR US TODAY?

3

4 **JANE ELIAS:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD
5 MEMBERS. JANE ELIAS DIRECTOR OF ENERGY PROGRAMS. THIS IS AN
6 ABAG ITEM. SINCE 2013, THE BAY AREA REGIONAL ENERGY NETWORK,
7 OR BAYREN, IMPLEMENTED PORTFOLIO. OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY
8 PROGRAMS. THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION APPROVED
9 BAYREN'S STRATEGIC BUSINESS PLAN FOR 2024 THROUGH 2031 AND 4-
10 YEAR PROGRAM PORTFOLIO FROM 2024 THROUGH 2027 WITH
11 ACCOMPANYING BUDGET OF APPROXIMATELY \$157 MILLION. WHILE
12 SINGLE-FAMILY PROGRAM HAS BEEN AROUND SINCE 2013 AND HAS
13 SUCCESSFULLY REACHED MANY CUSTOMERS OVER THE YEARS, FROM DATA
14 COLLECTED SURVEYS PERFORMED IN THE RECENT YEARS BAYREN
15 REALIZED ITS GOAL OF PRIMARILY REACHING THE UNDERSERVED
16 AUDIENCE OF MODERATE INCOME RESIDENTS WAS FALLING SHORT.
17 BAYREN INITIATED A REDESIGN PROCESS IN 2022 TO BETTER ACHIEVE
18 THE GOALS OF THE HEALTH, COMFORT, SAFETY, AND SAVINGS THROUGH
19 ENERGY UPGRADES FOR THESE RESIDENTS. BAYREN DECIDED TO
20 SOLIDIFY THE DIRECTION BY RECLASSIFYING THE SINGLE-FAMILY
21 PROGRAM AS CPUC EQUITY PROGRAM AND CPUC APPROVED BUSINESS PLAN
22 FOR 2024 THROUGH 2031. A LITTLE DETAIL NEW PROGRAM DESIGN THE
23 LAST TWO YEARS BAYREN CONDUCTED EXTENSIVE RESEARCH TO
24 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT TO IDENTIFY GAPS IN THE ENERGY
25 LANDSCAPE AND PROGRAM DESIGN. INCLUDED SIX WORKSHOPS WITH

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 LOCAL GOVERNMENT REPRESENTATIVES FROM NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES
2 35 FOCUS GROUPS DISCUSSIONS LISTENING SESSIONS ENGAGING 70
3 COMMUNITY-BASED NON-PROFITS ACROSS NINE COUNTIES FOR PROGRAM
4 DESIGN FEEDBACK AND PHONE SURVEY REACHING 1,000 HOUSEHOLDS
5 INCLUDING SAMPLE MODERATE INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND 12 IN DEPTH
6 INSTALLING CONTRACTOR INTERVIEWS. FINDINGS VERIFIED THAT
7 MODERATE INCOME RESIDENTS FAMILIES WHO EARN TOO MUCH TO
8 QUALIFY FOR THE LOW-INCOME PROGRAMS BUT DON'T HAVE ENOUGH
9 CAPITAL UPFRONT COST AND ENERGY UPGRADES ARE UNDERSERVED.
10 WHILE THERE IS RISE IN ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAMS WE FOUND THERE
11 IS STILL SHORTAGE OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAMS AVAILABLE TO
12 THIS SEGMENT OF THE POPULATION. THE NEW PROGRAM KNOWN AS
13 BAYREN'S ENERGY AND SUSTAINABLE ENERGY, EAS SETTLEMENT HOME
14 PROGRAM WILL DELIVER LOW-COST HEALTHY HOME RETROFITS WITH
15 FOCUS ON WEATHERIZATION AND ENERGY EFFICIENCY UPGRADES
16 IMPROVED INSULATION AND AIR SEALING TO QUALIFYING MODERATE
17 INCOME RESIDENTS TO IN THE BAY AREA AND INCOME QUALIFICATIONS
18 WILL BE BASED ON COUNTY AREA MEDIAN INCOME FOCUS ON NON-
19 ENGLISH SPEAKING HOUSEHOLDS AND THOSE THAT LIVE IN THE
20 POLLUTION BURDEN AREAS AS WELL AS PROVIDE PARTICIPANTS WITH
21 ONE-ON-ONE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FROM DEDICATED PROJECT
22 COORDINATOR AND LEVERAGE REBATES FROM PROGRAMS MANAGED BY THE
23 PROJECT COORDINATOR DIRECTLY INSTALLED BY TRUSTED EXPERTS EASE
24 HOME AIMS TO REACH OVER 2700 MODERATE INCOME HOUSEHOLDS OVER
25 THE NEXT THREE YEARS AND OVER \$18 MILLION OF 22,001,000

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CUSTOMERS IN THE FORM OF INCENTIVES. LASTLY EASE HOME WILL
2 INCLUDE WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT CRITERIA IMPORTANT AND OFTEN
3 OVERLOOKED ASPECT OF RESIDENTIAL DECARBONIZATION SECTOR
4 WORKFORCE ELEMENTS INCLUDE PREVAILING WAGE STANDARDS
5 REQUIREMENTS FOR INSTALLING FACTORS TO BE BASED IN THE BAY
6 AREA TARGETED HIRING STRATEGIES TRAINING PROGRAMS AND MORE
7 THEY RAN POSTED RFP AUGUST 24TH, 2024 AND ABAG RECEIVED THREE
8 PROPOSALS BASED ON RFP PROCESS WE SELECTED FRANKLIN ENERGY I
9 RESPECTFULLY ASK FOR YOUR APPROVAL ON THIS ITEM AND JILIAN DU
10 BAYREN'S SINGLE-FAMILY PROJECT PROGRAM MANAGER IS ONLINE AND
11 AVAILABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. THIS IS EXCITING AND
14 GOING TO FULFILL A NEED VERY CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE HAVE BEEN
15 WANTING TO DO FOCUSING ON MEANINGFUL INVESTMENTS. ANY
16 QUESTIONS?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** MOVE APPROVAL.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THE WORK
25 AND THE DATA AND EVERYTHING. AND AS THIS PROGRAM MOVES FORWARD

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 WITH THE INCENTIVES FOR THOSE INDIVIDUALS OF MODERATE INCOME
2 LEVELS, ONCE IT'S PASSED, HOW WILL THIS INFORMATION GET OUT TO
3 THE COMMUNITIES? WILL BAYREN BE WORKING VERY CLOSELY WITH THE
4 CITIES AND COUNTIES TO HELP OR PUT TOGETHER A PROGRAM TO HELP
5 GET THIS INFORMATION OUT TO THE COMMUNITY SO THEY CAN TAKE
6 ADVANTAGE OF IT?

7

8 **JANE ELIAS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION. BAYREN IS A COALITION
9 OF THE NINE COUNTIES. SO, OUR NINE COUNTY MEMBERS WILL BE
10 WORKING INDIVIDUALLY WITHIN THEIR JURISDICTIONS AND WITH THE
11 CITIES WITH WHATEVER COALITIONS THEY HAVE BUILT. AND TO GET
12 THE WORD OUT, THEY HAVE RECEIVED FUNDING FOR THE MARKETING AND
13 OUTREACH PORTION AND THEY WILL BE WORKING CLOSELY WITH
14 FRANKLIN, WHO IS THE IMPLEMENTER FOR THIS, TO IDENTIFY THE
15 NEIGHBORHOODS AND TARGET SEGMENTS OF THE POPULATION THAT WE'RE
16 SPECIFICALLY GOING AFTER. EACH COUNTY MAY LOOK AT THIS A
17 LITTLE BIT DIFFERENTLY, AS WELL, AND CITIES. SO THEY WILL WORK
18 TOGETHER TO FOCUS ON POLLUTION BURDEN OR IF IT'S NON-SPEAKING
19 ENGLISH, OR WHATEVER TARGETS OF POPULATION THAT MIGHT BE
20 IMPORTANT WITHIN THEIR JURISDICTIONS.

21

22 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THAT'S GOOD TO HEAR. I JUST WANTED TO MAKE
23 SURE. AND WITH THAT, CHAIR RAMOS, I'LL SECOND BOARD MEMBER
24 ECKLUND'S MOTION.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LEE, I DID SEE
2 YOUR HAND UP FOR A BIT. OH, YOU'RE ON MUTE.

3

4 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WAS GOING TO SECOND IT,
5 ACTUALLY. SINCE I [INDISCERNIBLE] -- I'M GLAD MEMBER WILLIAMS
6 DID THAT. AND MY QUICK COMMENT, OR QUESTION, REALLY, IS IT
7 SEEMS LIKE THIS IS BASICALLY A WAY FOR US TO HELP THESE TYPE
8 OF ENERGY EFFICIENCY PROGRAM BUT PREVIOUSLY OUR TARGET
9 AUDIENCE WAS NOT ABLE TO BENEFIT, SO WE'RE REDESIGNING IT SO
10 THAT THE INCOME LEVEL MIGHT BE HIGHER SO WE WILL HAVE MORE
11 FAMILIES THAT WILL BE ABLE TO BE ELIGIBLE. THAT'S MY TAKEAWAY.
12 IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **JANE ELIAS:** YES, THAT'S CORRECT WE HAD INTENDED THE SINGLE-
15 FAMILY TARGET MODERATE INCOME DATA SHOWED, IT WAS ABOUT 40% OF
16 THE PROJECT THAT WERE DONE COMPLETED IN MODERATE HOUSEHOLDS
17 THAT WAS NOT ENOUGH OF OUR GOAL AND REALLY TRYING TO PUT THE
18 EMPHASIS ON EQUITY AND RECLASSIFY THIS WE'RE GOING 100%
19 EQUITY.

20

21 **OTTO LEE:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WOULD LIKE TO COMPLIMENT JANE FOLLOWER THE
24 GREAT EXPLANATION ON THE PROGRAM AND I WOULD LOVE A COPY OF
25 WHAT YOU READ BECAUSE I'M GOING TO PUT IT IN MY WRITTEN ABAG

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 REPORT THAT I DISTRIBUTE TO ALL ELECTED OFFICIALS IN MARIN
2 COUNTY. BECAUSE YOU ACTUALLY SAID SOME VERY IMPORTANT THINGS
3 IN THERE THAT WERE NOT NECESSARILY IN THE STAFF REPORT AND I
4 THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT FOR ME TO GET THAT INFORMATION OUT
5 TO FOLKS IN MARIN COUNTY AND ACTUALLY MY REPORTS DO ALSO GO
6 OUT TO SONOMA COUNTY FOR PEOPLE AND OTHER ELECTED OFFICIALS
7 THAT HAVE REQUESTED COPIES. THANKS.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. IS NO OTHER
10 MEMBER COMMENTS? I'LL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE ARE PUBLIC
11 COMMENTS?

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON IN THE ZOOM
14 SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE.

15

16 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** TWO MINUTES PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTN Y SUTHERLAND:** VINAY PIMPLE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
19 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I'M VINAY PIMPLE FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
22 COUNCIL, I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT BACK IN THE DAY, OUR FINANCES
23 WEREN'T THAT GREAT WE DID MAKE USE OF THE STRUCTURED PROGRAM
24 IT WAS HELPFUL IT ALSO HAD ADDED COMPONENT OF LOCAL YOUTH WHO
25 -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH OUR PROGRAM, AND YOUNG PEOPLE FROM

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DISADVANTAGED BACKGROUNDS, GET INTO THE WORKFORCE. THAT WAS A
2 COMPONENT OF IT THAT WAS SUPER GOOD. I ALSO WANT TO EMPHASIZE
3 MY EXPERIENCE IN TERMS OF THE OUTREACH ISSUE. A LOT OF TIMES
4 THESE PROGRAMS -- [INDISCERNIBLE] MORE POLITICALLY AWARE, THE
5 KIND OF WHO GET E-MAILS FROM THEIR LOCAL COUNCIL MEMBERS OR
6 FROM SUPERVISOR AND STUFF LIKE THAT. OUTREACH IS IMPORTANT NOT
7 JUST FOR PEOPLE WHO TEND TO BE MORE POLITICALLY AWARE, BUT
8 IT'S A GREAT PROGRAM. AND I JUST WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY.
9 THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT FOR
12 THIS ITEM.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WELL, THAT WAS
15 A GREAT PROPS TO STAFF AND TO THE PROGRAM ITSELF. SO WITH THAT
16 IF THE ABAG CLERK WOULD PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL VOTE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THANK YOU MOTION BY ECKLUND SECOND
19 BY MEMBER WILLIAMS. RAMOS?

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN?

24

25 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

17

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** ANDERSEN?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** LEE?

7

8 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** RABBITT? MEMBER ROMERO? HAS STEPPED
11 OUT. MEMBER SILVA?

12

13 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND MEMBER WILLIAMS?

16

17 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
20 MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WILL NOW
23 PASS IT OVER TO MY COLLEAGUE TO INTRODUCE OUR PLANNED BAY AREA
24 AMENDMENT ITEM.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT RAMOS.
2 NEXT ITEM IS 9B, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AMENDMENT, THE SONOMA-
3 MARIN AREA RAIL TRANSIT TO HEALDSBURG, AND DAVE VAUTIN ARE YOU
4 GOING TO PRESENT?

5

6 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YES, I AM, CHAIR SPERING. GOOD MORNING
7 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. DAVE VAUTIN ASSISTANT
8 DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS PRESENTING THIS MORNING ON BEHALF OF
9 MY COLLEAGUE ADAM NOELTING WHO LED THIS IMPORTANT EFFORT OVER
10 THE LAST THREE MONTHS. ALSO JOINED BY AMY HAGUERA OF DOWNEY
11 BRANDS OUR CEQA LEGAL CONSULTANT ON PROJECT. THIS MORNING
12 WE'RE ASKING MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG
13 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE
14 AMENDMENT TO THE EXISTING REGIONAL PLAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
15 TO INTEGRATE SMART RAIL EXTENSION TO HEALDSBURG WHICH WOULD
16 UNLOCK FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES AT STATE LEVEL FOR THAT PROJECT
17 IN THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD. PLAN AMENDMENT REQUIRES SUITE
18 OF UPDATED DOCUMENTS TO BE APPROVED BY MTC ABAG AND TODAY'S
19 ACTION INCLUDES DOCUMENTS AS WELL AS THREE RESOLUTIONS TO BE
20 REFERRED TO THE OCTOBER COMMISSION AND TWO RESOLUTIONS TO BE
21 REFERRED TO THE NOVEMBER ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING.
22 BACKGROUND, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED IN OCTOBER 2021
23 AND INCLUDED ROBUST INVESTMENTS IN THE NORTH BAY IN PARTICULAR
24 IN THE SMART RAIL CORRIDOR THAT CURRENTLY CONNECTS NORTH SANTA
25 ROSA AND LARKSPUR INCLUDED ONE STATION EXTENSION FURTHER NORTH

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TO HEALDSBURG SLATED TO OPEN NEXT YEAR OR SO AND STATION IN
2 NORTH PETALUMA ALSO IN A SIMILAR TIME FRAME INVESTMENTS IN THE
3 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN CORRIDOR PARALLELING THE RAIL LINE IN
4 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS FOR SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS
5 NECESSARY TO KEEP THE SYSTEM OPERATIONAL THROUGH 2050.
6 HOWEVER, NORTH OF HEALDSBURG -- SORRY. NORTH OF WINDSOR, IT
7 ONLY INCLUDED PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL STUDIES. AND EARLIER
8 THIS YEAR REQUESTED MTC AND ABAG CONSIDER AMENDING THE PLAN TO
9 INCLUDE AN ADDITIONAL ONE-STATION EXTENSION TO NORTH
10 HEALDSBURG. STAFF PRESENTED UPDATE TO MTC PLANNING AND ABAG
11 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEES IN JULY 2024 REGARDING REQUEST,
12 UNDERSCORING THAT INTEGRATION OF EXTENSION INTO THE FISCALLY
13 CONSTRAINED TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN WOULD NEED TO
14 COMPLY TO STATUTORY OBLIGATIONS UNDER FEDERAL AND STATE LAW.
15 TO ADDRESS LIMITATIONS, STAFF CONSULTED WITH THE SONOMA COUNTY
16 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY STAFF TO IDENTIFY AN EQUIVALENT
17 AMOUNT OF COUNTY ROADWAY PROJECTS IN THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED
18 PLAN THAT COULD BE REMOVED TO OFFSET THE COST OF THE SMART
19 EXTENSION. AS A RESULT, THIS ACTION ITEM WOULD NOT ONLY ADD
20 THE ONE-STATION SMART EXTENSION BUT CONCURRENTLY REMOVE THE
21 101 RAILROAD AVENUE INTERCHANGE AND THE FARMERS LANE EXTENSION
22 IN SANTA ROSA FROM THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED PLAN. THESE
23 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE LATEST DRAFT
24 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND TRANSIT 2050
25 PLUS, THE NEXT GENERATION PLAN AROUND ACTIVE DEVELOPMENT.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS, IN PARTICULAR, WILL BE RETURNING TO THIS
2 COMMITTEE FOR ACTION IN JANUARY. SINCE THE PRIOR STAFF UPDATE
3 ON THIS PLAN AMENDMENT WAS BROUGHT FORWARD IN JULY, STAFF HAVE
4 ADVANCED THE NECESSARY TECHNICAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE STEPS ON A
5 VERY RAPID TIMELINE, INCLUDING AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY AND
6 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS SOLICITATION OF
7 PUBLIC COMMENTS BY A 30-DAY PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. TECHNICAL
8 ANALYSIS FOUND THAT THE AMENDMENT WOULD HAVE MINIMAL IMPACT ON
9 REGIONAL TRAFFIC AND WOULD NOT AFFECT THE REGION'S ABILITY TO
10 MEET GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS OR ACHIEVE A POSITIVE
11 AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY DETERMINATION. THE PUBLIC COMMENT
12 PERIOD GENERATED MORE THAN 50 RESPONSES, AND WHILE SOME
13 COMMENTS INDICATED OPPOSITION TO THE AMENDMENTS, THE MAJORITY
14 OF FEEDBACK SUPPORTED ADDING THE PROJECT TO PLANNED BAY AREA
15 2050. MANY LETTERS ALSO ADVOCATED FOR FURTHER EXTENSION TO
16 CLOVERDALE WHICH IS BEYOND THE SCOPE OF THIS AMENDMENT. MORE
17 DETAILED RESPONSES TO COMMENT THEMES CAN BE FOUND IN THE PLAN
18 AMENDMENT ITSELF UNDER COMMENTS AND RESPONSES. GIVEN THE
19 STRONG SUPPORT FOR AMENDING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO INCLUDE
20 AN ADDITIONAL STATION IN HEALDSBURG, AND THE ABILITY TO DO SO
21 IN A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED MANNER THAT DOES NOT WORSEN
22 ENVIRONMENTAL OR AIR QUALITY IMPACTS, STAFF RECOMMENDED
23 ADVANCING ALL THREE APPROVAL ITEMS, FIRST STAFF RECOMMEND
24 FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4465 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL,
25 THAT'S THE AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ASSESSMENT. SECOND, STAFF

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 RECOMMEND FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4466 TO THE COMMISSION AND
2 ABAG RESOLUTION 0924 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. WHICH IS THE
3 EIR ADDENDUM. AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST STAFF RECOMMEND
4 FORWARDING MTC RESOLUTION 4467 TO THE COMMISSION AND ABAG
5 RESOLUTION 1024 TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD, WHICH WOULD
6 FORMALLY AMEND THE PLAN. THANKS FOR YOUR TIME THIS MORNING AND
7 WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. COMMITTEE MEMBERS, ANY
10 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? PAT? PAT FIRST.

11

12 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M KIND OF CURIOUS WHETHER IS CLOVERDALE STILL
13 IN THE PLAN TO HAVE A STATION? BECAUSE FROM IS A LOT OF
14 SUPPORT FOR CONTINUING IT. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S
15 STILL PART OF THE PLAN.

16

17 **DAVE VAUTIN:** CLOVERDALE HAS NOT BEEN PART OF PRIOR PLANNED BAY
18 AREA OVER COURSE THERE IS PLANNING FOR ENVIRONMENTAL WORK IN
19 THE NORTHERN PART OF THE CORRIDOR AND THAT'S AS A RESULT OF
20 FOUR FISCAL CONSTRAINTS IN THE PLAN AS MENTIONED IN THE
21 EARLIER ITEM THE LAST PLAN INCLUDED EXTENSION UP TO WINDSOR
22 THIS WOULD MOVE ONE STATION FURTHER NORTH THE CONSIDERATION OF
23 THE CLOVERDALE IS A CONTINUING CONVERSATION IN THE CONTEXT OF
24 OUR NEXT UPDATE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+.

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** ARE THEY PAYING THE TAX?

2

3 **DAVE VAUTIN:** MINDING IT'S A BY COUNTY TAX.

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVE DID YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBITT:** I JUST WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR BRINGING THIS
10 FORWARD VERY MUCH I THINK THE GOOD THING THAT WE HAVE TO
11 UNDERSTAND THE FISCAL CONSTRAINTS BUT AT THE SAME TIME
12 UNDERSTAND THE PROJECTS WITHIN EACH INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES OR
13 JURISDICTION GETS ANALYZED WITHIN THOSE JURISDICTIONS IN THIS
14 PARTICULAR CASE THE TWO PROJECTS THAT WE'RE INCLUDING OR
15 SWAPPING OUT, I CAN HONESTLY SAY AS SITTING ON THE SONOMA
16 COUNTY CONSERVATION -- OR SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
17 AUTHORITY THAT NEITHER ONE WILL PROBABLY EVER WOULD BE BUILT.
18 LAST GENERAL PLAN, 20 SOMETHING YEARS AGO, WAS THE DIVERTING
19 TRAFFIC WHICH ALSO THAT'S THE RAILROAD 101 INTERCHANGE. AND TO
20 MAKE THAT PROJECT SUCCESSFUL WOULD INCLUDE A WIDENING TO THREE
21 LANES, SOMETHING THAT I DO NOT THINK IS -- ANY OF US WOULD
22 SUPPORT TODAY, PROBABLY A COUPLE OF MILES' SECTION OF COUNTY
23 ROAD, WHICH WOULD ALSO PROBABLY HAVE EQUIVALENT DOLLAR AMOUNT
24 TO THE WORK AT THE INTERCHANGE. AND IT'S JUST SOMETHING THAT'S
25 NOT GOING TO GO FORWARD. FARMERS LANE EXTENSION HAS BEEN ON

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 THE BOOKS FOREVER. AND IT'S ANOTHER ONE OF THOSE THINGS. I
2 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT WE CAN SWAP OUT THE PROJECTS AND I
3 KNOW OUR GENERAL MANAGER FROM SMART IS HERE TO SAY A FEW WORDS
4 AS WELL. SOME DECADES AGO, NOW, SONOMA AND MARIN COUNTIES GOT
5 TOGETHER TO HELP US TO MOVE ON THE 101 CORRIDOR. IT WAS AGREED
6 THAT A COMMUTER TRAIN WOULD BE MORE BENEFICIAL THAN
7 CONTINUALLY WIDENING THE FREEWAY. SO, WE GOT THAT DONE. WE
8 WERE CONTINUING TO MOVE. AND WHILE BUS TRANSIT SERVICE IS
9 GREAT, RIDERSHIP NUMBERS WERE DECLINING PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC
10 AND SMART'S RIDERSHIP NUMBERS CONTINUE TO GROW AND SET NEW
11 RECORDS. AND FOR ME, PERSONALLY, I LOVE THESE PROJECTS THAT
12 ARE GENERATIONAL IN NATURE. AND WHEN WE'RE LONG GONE IN OUR
13 ROCKING CHAIRS BACK HOME WE CAN LOOK BACK AT THE DECISIONS WE
14 MADE SITTING ON THE DAIS KNOWING THAT WE'RE IMPROVING THINGS
15 FOR OUR KIDS, THEIR KIDS, AND FUTURE GENERATIONS AND A LOT OF
16 THOSE THINGS TAKE TIME TO BUILD IN. BUT TO HAVE THIS
17 PARTICULAR PROJECT SET IN MOTION REALLY MAKES ME FEEL GOOD,
18 ESPECIALLY THESE DAYS WHEN THERE IS NOT A LOT OF GREAT STUFF
19 HAPPENING WORLDWIDE. TODAY IS A DAY TO CELEBRATE, AND I
20 APPRECIATE THE FACT STAFF BROUGHT THIS FORWARD. REALLY
21 APPRECIATE IT AND DAVE THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK AS WELL.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVE, THANK YOU FOR THOSE
24 COMMENTS AND CLARIFICATION. ANY OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS? EDDIE

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DO YOU WANT TO COME FORTH, EDDIE CUMMINS WITH SMART? AND,
2 EDDIE, DON'T TALK US OUT OF IT. OKAY? [LAUGHTER].

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** TWO MINUTES. HE CAN BE
7 SUCCINCT.

8

9 **EDDIE CUMMINS:** I CAN. HELLO, MY NAME IS EDDIE CUMMINS. I'M THE
10 SMART TRAIN GENERAL MANAGER. I'M JUST HERE TODAY TO SPEAK IN
11 SUPPORT OF THIS AMENDMENT. FIRST, I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF. I
12 KNOW A LOT OF WORK GOES INTO THESE TYPES OF THINGS, AND JUST
13 REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK AND THE EFFORT. I ALSO WANT TO
14 THANK THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION OF THIS
15 VERY IMPORTANT PROJECT. YOUR EFFORTS ARE PAVING THE WAY FOR A
16 CONNECTED, SUSTAINABLE, EQUITABLE BAY AREA, AND SMART IS PROUD
17 TO CONTRIBUTE TO THIS MISSION. THE INCLUSION OF HEALDSBURG IN
18 THE PLANNED BAY AREA MARKS A SIGNIFICANT MILESTONE FOR THE
19 NORTH BAY AND THE BROADER REGION. IT OPENS THE DOOR FOR VITAL
20 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES POSITIONING US TO SECURE REGIONAL,
21 STATE, AND FEDERAL RESOURCES REQUIRED TO BRING PASSENGER RAIL
22 TO HEALDSBURG. THINGS ARE GOING VERY WELL AT SMART RIGHT NOW.
23 OUR RIDERSHIP IS 30% HIGHER THAN PRE-PANDEMIC, AND WE
24 CURRENTLY HAVE THE WINDSOR EXTENSION, THE PETALUMA NORTH
25 INFILL STATION AND OVER NINE MILES OF PATHWAY UNDER

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CONSTRUCTION, AND WE ANTICIPATE HAVING ALL THESE PROJECTS
2 COMPLETED AND OPEN TO THE PUBLIC WITHIN THE NEXT SIX MONTHS.
3 THE INCLUSION OF HEALDSBURG INTO THE PLAN WILL ALLOW SMART TO
4 CONTINUE TO MAKE PROGRESS ON THE SYSTEM VOTERS IN MARIN AND
5 SONOMA COUNTY APPROVED IN 2008. ONCE AGAIN, I WANT TO SAY
6 THANK YOU. THIS PROJECT IS IMPORTANT TO THE COMMUNITIES WE
7 SERVE, AND I TRULY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT WENT INTO THIS
8 AMENDMENT. ON BEHALF OF THE VOTERS AND THE COMMUNITIES WE
9 SERVE, I RESPECTFULLY REQUEST YOUR FAVORABLE CONSIDERATION OF
10 THIS ITEM. AGAIN, THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU, EDDIE.
13 MARTHA IS THERE ANY OTHER SPEAKERS?

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE
17 PUBLIC IN ZOOM OR THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I'M ASSUMING THIS WILL
20 BE A MOTION BY COMMISSIONER RABBITT AND SECOND BY
21 [INDISCERNIBLE].

22

23 **SPEAKER:** INDEED.

24

25 **DAVID RABBITT:** INDEED, YOU ARE RIGHT. MAKE THE MOTION.

26

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MICROPHONE.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THIS WILL INCLUDE RESOLUTIONS
5 4665. DO I NEED TO READ THEM, SINCE DAVID READ THEM?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PLEASE AND THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER]

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. [LAUGHTER] 4665
10 TRANSPORTATION AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR THE AMENDED
11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THE 2025 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT
12 PROGRAM. MTC RESOLUTION 4666 ADDENDUM TO THE FINAL
13 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND MTC
14 RESOLUTION 4667 AMENDMENT TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AND I
15 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. AND IF THE CLERK WILL TAKE THE
16 ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR SPERING?

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

23

24 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25

27

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

10

11 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER NOACK IS ABSENT.

14 COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ALL THE RESOLUTIONS AS PREVIOUSLY

19 STATED MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

22 PRESIDENT RAMOS.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME, WE'RE

25 GOING TO CONSIDER TWO RESOLUTIONS. ABAG RESOLUTION 09-24

28

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 ADDENDUM TO THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT FOR PLANED
2 BAY AREA 2050 AND ABAG RESOLUTION 10-24 AMENDMENT TO PLANNED
3 BAY AREA 2050. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND?

4

5 **OTTO LEE:** SO MOVED.

6

7 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** SECOND, WANDA WILLIAMS.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WE LOVE YOU, STEPHANIE. BUT NO.

10 [LAUGHTER] ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONER -- ARE THERE ANY MEMBER
11 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

12

13 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING
14 FOR THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE OR BOARDROOM
15 WISHING TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** WILL DO. PRESIDENT RAMOS.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ANDERSON?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ECKLUND?

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER LEE?

11

12 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER RABBITT?

15

16 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER ROMERO?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** MEMBER SILVA?

23

24 **CINDY SILVA:** AYE.

25

30

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** AND MEMBER WILLIAMS?

2

3 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, BRITTNY SUTHERLAND:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
6 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

7

8 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** EXCELLENT. NEXT ITEM. THANK YOU
9 SO MUCH. AND THANK YOU SO MUCH, SUPERVISOR RABBITT FOR YOUR
10 HELP AND MAKING THAT POSSIBLE IN THAT LAST ITEM WHICH SEEMS
11 LIKE IT'S GOING TO BE A DEFINITE IMPROVEMENT OVERALL. NEXT
12 ITEM, AGENDA ITEM 10A, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, THE FINAL
13 BLUEPRINT INITIAL RECOMMENDATION. JOINING US TODAY TO GIVE US
14 THE REPORT IS CHIRAG RABARI. HANDING IT OVER.

15

16 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT RAMOS. GOOD MORNING
17 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. CHIRAG RABARI WITH MTC ABAG
18 STAFF AND REPRESENTING THE BROADER PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
19 TEAM. SO, WE MOST RECENTLY CAME TO THIS BODY IN LATE SPRING
20 AND EARLY SUMMER SHARING OUTCOMES FROM OUR DRAFT BLUEPRINT
21 ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS APPROACH FOR SECOND ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT.
22 LAST MONTH THE TRANSIT 2050+ TEAM CAME WITH THE DRAFT NETWORK
23 STRATEGIES. SO, THIS ITEM IS FOCUSED ON FINANCIAL NEEDS AND
24 REVENUE FORECAST FOR THE LONG RANGE PLAN, AS WELL AS INITIAL
25 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES. THIS IS THE

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 PROVERBIAL FIRST BITE OF THE APPLE IN TERMS OF FINAL BLUEPRINT
2 IN ADVANCE OF THE ANTICIPATED ACTION ITEM IN 2025. NEXT SLIDE.
3 SO, AS OF EARLY FALL 2024, WE HAVE COMPLETED OUR SECOND AND
4 MOST EXPANSIVE ROUND OF OUTREACH FOR THE PLAN AND ARE ENTERING
5 THE HOMESTRETCH FOR THE PLANS BLUEPRINT PHASE. TWO SIGNIFICANT
6 ACTION ITEMS ARE COMING UP FOR THE COMMISSION AND EXECUTIVE
7 BOARD. FIRST WILL BE THE APPROVAL OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
8 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER STUDY IN EARLY 2025,
9 AND THEN WE'LL BE ADVANCING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT INTO CEQA IN
10 EARLY SPRING OF '25. INITIAL WORK HAS BEGUN ON THE PLAN'S
11 FINAL PHASE, WHICH WILL INCLUDE THE DRAFT PLAN ITSELF, THE
12 EIR, AND THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. BUT THE BULK OF THAT WORK
13 WILL CONTINUE OVER THE COURSE OF 2025 WITH ANTICIPATED
14 ADOPTION OF THE PLAN IN LATE 2025. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED,
15 WE JUST COMPLETED AN EXTENSIVE ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT THAT
16 BROUGHT US ALL ACROSS THE NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA. THE PRIMARY
17 GOALS OF THIS ENGAGEMENT ROUND WERE TO SHARE THE FINDINGS FROM
18 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND GET FEEDBACK ON HOW TO ADDRESS
19 IDENTIFIED CHALLENGE AREAS AS WELL AS SHARING THE DRAFT
20 TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK AND STRATEGIES. WE'RE IN THE PROCESS OF
21 COMPLETING OUR ANALYSIS AND COMPILING OUR FINDINGS FROM THESE
22 ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES WHICH WILL COME BACK TO THIS BODY NEXT
23 MONTH. BUT JUST TO SHARE A COUPLE OF HIGHLIGHTS. THE
24 ENGAGEMENT ROUND DID INCLUDE 50 PLUS EVENTS, INCLUDING 26 POP-
25 UPS, 18 THAT WERE CONVENED BY MTC AND ABAG, AS WELL AS EIGHT

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 THAT WERE LED BY CBO PARTNERS. THERE ARE 21 DISCUSSION GROUPS,
2 SIX PRESENTATIONS, A CBO WORKSHOP, A WEBINAR, AND AS WELL AS
3 TWO ALL-DAY IN-PERSON WORKSHOPS AT 375 BEALE THAT BROUGHT
4 TOGETHER OVER 115 OF OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING
5 LOCAL JURISDICTION AND AGENCY STAFF, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
6 AGENCIES, ADVOCATES, AND NON-PROFITS, AMONG OTHERS. THERE IS
7 ALSO AN ONLINE SURVEY AND EXTENSIVE DIGITAL PROMOTION. NEXT
8 SLIDE. AS A BRIEF REFRESHER ON THE ARCHITECTURE OF THE PLAN,
9 OUR LONG RANGE PLAN'S VISION AS ADOPTED BY MTC ABAG IS TO
10 ENSURE THAT BY THE YEAR 2050 THE BAY AREA IS AFFORDABLE,
11 CONNECTED, DIVERSE, HEALTHY, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL. THE PLAN IS
12 DIVIDED INTO FOUR INTERRELATED ELEMENTS OF TRANSPORTATION,
13 HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. THOSE FOUR ELEMENTS
14 ARE IN TURN SPLIT INTO 11 KEY THEMES, AND THEN NESTING UNDER
15 THOSE 11 KEY THEMES ARE THE PLAN'S 35 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE.
16 SO, IN TERMS OF THE KEY ELEMENTS OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, THERE
17 ARE REALLY TWO TRACKS OF WORK. ON THE FIRST SIDE ARE THE
18 PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSUMPTIONS, THESE INCLUDE THINGS LIKE
19 EXTERNAL FORCES, WHICH ARE ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT THE FUTURE YEAR
20 CONTINUES THAT ARE INDEPENDENT OF THE PLAN, THINGS SUCH AS
21 ANTICIPATED WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS OR THE AMOUNT OF SEA LEVEL
22 RISE THAT WE EXPECT, AS WELL AS THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST
23 OF HOW MUCH WE EXPECT THE BAY AREA TO GROW IN TERMS OF
24 POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSEHOLDS BETWEEN NOW AND 2050. AND
25 THAT WORK IS LARGELY COMPLETE AND WAS THE FOCUS OF EARLIER

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 PRESENTATIONS TO THIS BODY, BUT WE WILL PROVIDE A REFRESHER IN
2 JANUARY DURING THE ACTION ITEM. THE PLANNING AND TECHNICAL
3 ASSUMPTIONS ALSO INCLUDE THE FINANCIAL NEEDS AND REVENUE
4 ANALYSIS. WE PRESENTED DRAFTS OF THOSE FORECASTS LAST YEAR,
5 AND TODAY WE'LL BE FOCUSED ON THE REVISED FINAL FORECAST
6 PENDING ANY FINAL TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS THAT WILL, AGAIN, COME
7 BACK EARLY 2025. THE OTHER TRACK OF WORK ARE THE PLANS'
8 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES. AND AS A REMINDER, STRATEGIES ARE
9 PUBLIC POLICIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED AT A
10 STATE, REGIONAL, OR LOCAL LEVEL OVER 25 YEARS PLAN PERIOD. AND
11 THESE ARE HEART OF THE PLAN. A REMINDER, THE STRATEGY IS NOT
12 NEAR-TERM ACTION, A MANDATE FOR A JURISDICTION OR AGENCY OR A
13 LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL. BY CONTRAST, GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ARE A
14 MIX OF LOCALLY NOMINATED AND REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED PLACES TO
15 FOCUS FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH. NOW, THERE ARE
16 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN. BUT SOME OF
17 THE KEY NUANCES ARE THE HOUSING AND ECONOMY ELEMENTS INCLUDE
18 THOSE GEOGRAPHIES FOR FUTURE HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH, WHILE
19 THE TRANSPORTATION AND ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS INCLUDE PROJECT
20 LIST. SO, THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST NESTS UNDER ALL
21 ELEMENTS' STRATEGIES. BUT THIS PLAN WILL INCLUDE FIRST EVER
22 RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST THAT IS A PORTION OF THE ENVIRONMENT
23 ELEMENTS ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE STRATEGY. SO, AGAIN, THE
24 FOCUS OF THIS ITEM IS ON THE REVISED NEEDS AND REVENUE
25 ANALYSIS, AS WELL AS PRELIMINARY REVISIONS TO STRATEGIES. BUT

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 EARLY 2025, THE COMMISSION AND EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL TAKE
2 ACTION TO APPROVE THOSE STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER
3 STUDY AND WILL INCLUDE DETAIL ON THE PLANS PROJECT LIST
4 RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. AS PART OF THE BLUEPRINT PROCESS,
5 WE DEVELOPED FORECASTS OF ANTICIPATED REVENUES AS WELL AS
6 IDENTIFY NEEDS, WHICH ARE ESSENTIALLY WHAT SPECIFIC STRATEGIES
7 MIGHT COST. ONLY THE PLANNED TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS SUBJECT
8 TO FISCAL CONSTRAINT PER FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING
9 REQUIREMENTS. THIS MEETING IS NOT ONLY DO WE HAVE TO INVENTORY
10 EXISTING REVENUE SOURCES, WE ALSO HAVE TO BE SPECIFIC ABOUT
11 OTHER POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES THAT ARE REASONABLY EXPECTED
12 TO BE AVAILABLE OVER THE PLANNING HORIZON. THESE ARE NEW
13 SOURCES. ALL PROPOSED INVESTMENTS NEED TO FIT INTO THAT FISCAL
14 ENVELOPE. BY CONTRAST, THE HOUSING ECONOMY AND ENVIRONMENT
15 ELEMENTS ARE VISIONARY FORECASTS OF WHAT IT WOULD TAKE TO
16 ACHIEVE THE KEY REGIONAL GOALS. IN THE HOUSING AND ENVIRONMENT
17 ELEMENTS, WE DO INVENTORY EXISTING REVENUES AS A BEST
18 PRACTICE, BUT WE ARE NOT REQUIRED TO BE SPECIFIC ABOUT WHAT
19 THOSE NEW REVENUE SOURCES ARE TO ADDRESS FUNDING GAPS. THAT
20 COULD REFLECT MIX OF SOURCES FROM VARIOUS LEVELS OF
21 GOVERNMENTS. REVENUES IN ENVIRONMENT ECONOMY ELEMENT ARE NOT
22 INVENTORIED. NOW, IN TERMS OF THE REVISED FORECAST, BOTH THE
23 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING ELEMENTS INCLUDE ABOUT \$500 BILLION
24 IN ANTICIPATED INVESTMENTS. SOME NOTABLE CHANGES INCLUDED IN
25 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT, THERE WERE VARIOUS TECHNICAL

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CORRECTIONS AND POLICY CLARIFICATIONS ON NEW AND ANTICIPATED
2 SOURCES, BUT THE DISCRETIONARY REVENUE PICTURE ONLY CHANGE
3 MODESTLY BETWEEN THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT. OVERALL THERE
4 IS \$75 BILLION LESS FOR EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT COMPARED TO
5 THE PREVIOUS PLAN. IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT BIGGEST CHANGE WAS
6 OF THE SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION OF NEARLY \$77 BILLION IN
7 ANTICIPATED UNDER COST UNDER THE SPUR HOUSING PRODUCTION THEME
8 AND WE'LL TALK MORE ABOUT HOW THAT REDUCTION WAS ACHIEVED
9 LATER IN THE SLIDE. IN ECONOMY ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS WHICH ARE
10 ROUGHLY \$230 BILLION IN SIZE. MOST NOTABLE CHANGES THAT WE'LL
11 DISCUSS ARE GREATER PROPOSED INVESTMENTS IN THE PLAN'S JOB
12 LOCATION STRATEGIES, AS WELL AS SHIFTING INVESTMENT LEVELS IN
13 PARKS AND OPEN SPACE, AS WELL AS REFINED ESTIMATES FOR SEA
14 LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION. FINALLY, A QUICK REMINDER, JUST TO
15 CONTEXTUALIZE THE BIG NUMBERS, THESE ARE ALL IN YEAR OF
16 EXPENDITURE DOLLARS, SO THEY ARE ADJUSTED FOR ANTICIPATED
17 INFLATION GOING FORWARD. SO A DOLLAR IN 2025 IS NOT THE SAME
18 AS A DOLLAR IN 2050. SO, THERE IS A LOT MORE INFORMATION IN
19 THE FORECAST IN THE ATTACHMENTS. NEXT SLIDE.

20

21 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? I HAD A QUICK QUESTION. IS
22 IT FEASIBLE TO ASK QUESTIONS NOW? OR AFTER THE PRESENTATION.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** HOW WOULD YOU PREFER? FINISH?

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, IF YOU DON'T MIND?

2

3 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** FOUR MORE SLIDES, SUPERVISOR.

4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO, YEAH, SHIFTING GEARS INTO THE PROPOSED
7 STRATEGY REFINEMENTS. AS MENTIONED TRANSIT 2050+ CAME TO THIS
8 BODY LAST MONTH, AND THE BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES NOW REFLECT
9 THOSE INITIAL RECOMMENDATIONS. MANY CHANGES AND ADJUSTMENTS
10 REFLECT RESHUFFLING AND RESCOPING PLAN STRATEGIES TO EMPHASIZE
11 COST EFFECTIVE INVESTMENTS TO GROW AND RECOVER RIDERSHIP,
12 INCLUDING SERVICE FREQUENCIES, SPEED, NETWORK INTEGRATION, AND
13 STRATEGIC EXPANSION. NOTABLE CHANGE I DO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IS
14 THAT A BRAND INCLUDE RESPONSIVE OVERWHELMING PUBLIC AND
15 PARTNER FEEDBACK FOCUS SPECIFICALLY ON SAFETY AND SECURITY.
16 THE PLAN PROPOSES \$4 BILLION FOR STATION STOPS, VEHICLES,
17 LIGHTING, CAMERAS, SECURITY, POLICING, AS WELL AS NON-
18 [INDISCERNIBLE] STAFF. SHIFTING TO PLANS FISCAL CLIMATE
19 REALITIES, WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT THE FISCAL PICTURE AND PLANS
20 GHG GAP WHICH HAS NECESSITATED FOCUS ON HIGH IMPACT LOWER COST
21 STRATEGIES SUCH AS PRICING SAFETY ENHANCEMENTS REDUCED SPEED
22 LIMITS ELECTRIFICATION AND TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT.
23 OTHER NOTABLE CHANGE IS STRATEGY TO FURTHER HONE OUR APPROACH
24 FOR FREEWAY AND HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS. AGAIN IN LIGHT OF THE
25 FACT THAT THERE IS LESS MONEY AND CERTAIN PROJECTS CAN PUSH US

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 IN THE WRONG DIRECTION GHG. SO FOR THE FIRST TIME WE ARE
2 PROPOSING TO DISTINGUISH BETWEEN MODERNIZATION OF FREEWAYS AND
3 INTERCHANGES THROUGH NEW TECHNOLOGIES AND OTHER ENHANCEMENTS,
4 AS WELL AS ON THE OTHER HAND INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND FREEWAYS
5 AND INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, AS WELL AS ACCOUNTING FOR
6 POTENTIAL MITIGATION COSTS. SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS ON
7 PROJECTS BEING REFINED, MORE INFORMATION WILL BE SHARED IN THE
8 COMING MONTHS INCLUDE REGION'S EXPRESS LANES. IN TERMS OF
9 PRICING, WE HAVE STRATEGY IN TERMS OF HELPING TO MEET GHG
10 WHICH IS INCLUDED IN THE LAST PLAN ABOUT WE CONTINUE TO
11 EXPLORE WAYS IN THIS STRATEGY TO REFINE AND OPTIMIZE THE
12 STRATEGY IN LIGHT OF THE MANY COMPLEX TRADEOFFS THAT ARE
13 ASSOCIATED WITH PRICING BUT WE HOPE TO INCORPORATE
14 RECOMMENDATIONS ON FROM THE PARALLEL NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY
15 STUDY LATER THIS YEAR. IN TERMS OF HOUSING ECONOMY ONE OF THE
16 BIG DISCUSSION ITEMS THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAD BACK IN JANUARY
17 WAS NEED TO DRIVE FURTHER REDUCTIONS IN THE COST OF PRODUCING
18 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IN RESPONSE WE UNDERTOOK A SIGNIFICANT
19 EFFORT IN PARTNERSHIP WITH STAFF AT BAHFA TO REVIEW RECENT
20 PROJECTS AND PRO FORMA CASE STUDIES AND VALUATION TO
21 UNDERSTAND THE PROMISING APPROACH APPROACHES HOW THEY COULD BE
22 APPLIED FUTURE SANCTIONS AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT FINAL
23 BLUEPRINT CONSIDERS PRODUCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCLUDING
24 EFFICIENT DESIGN AND DELIVER STREAMLINED REVIEW AND TARGETED
25 FREE REDUCTIONS ACCESS TO LAND SITES AS WELL AS SIMPLIFIED

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 FINANCING WE DETERMINED POTENTIAL COST RANGES POTENTIAL
2 REDUCTIONS AND DETERMINED HOW THESE DIFFERENT APPROACHES COULD
3 BE STACKED TO ACHIEVE EVEN GREATER SAVINGS. ULTIMATELY
4 CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS WE WERE ABLE TO SEE 25% REDUCTION IN
5 AFFORDABLE HOUSING COST ESTIMATED \$77 BILLION REDUCTION. IN
6 TERMS OF EXPANDING HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES, THIS ESSENTIALLY
7 DESCRIBES HOW AFFORDABLE HOUSING COST REDUCTION IS INTEGRATED
8 AND INFORMED SOME OF THE OTHER POLICY BASED STRATEGIES IN THE
9 PLAN, INCLUDING MIX OF HOUSING AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES,
10 COMMERCIAL REUSE AS WELL AS PUBLIC LANDS. AND ON THE -- IN
11 TERMS OF BETTER ALIGNING JOBS AND TRANSIT ONE OF THE
12 CHALLENGES WE IDENTIFIED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WAS A
13 POSSIBILITY TO ACHIEVE A MORE EFFICIENT CONCENTRATED JOB
14 GROWTH PATTERN. WE EXPLORED WHETHER IT WOULD BE FURTHER
15 POSSIBLE TO FOCUS IN-PERSON JOBS NEAR FREQUENT TRANSIT IN
16 ORDER TO EXPAND JOB ACCESS FOR LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ARE FOR
17 DOWNTOWN RECOVERY AND REDUCE CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND ADJUSTMENTS
18 TO THE PLAN'S STRATEGY EC FIVE DOES SEEK TO USE INCENTIVES AND
19 INVESTMENT TO FOCUS CERTAIN INDUSTRIES IN PLACE WITH FREQUENT
20 TRANSIT SERVICE AND LOW VMT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, ONE THING THAT WE
21 HAVE HEARD CONSISTENTLY FROM OUR MEMBERS OF OUR POLICY
22 ADVISORY COUNCIL OVER THE YEARS IS THE NEED TO BETTER RESPOND
23 AND ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF RESIDENTS WITH DISABILITIES. SO, WE
24 HAVE PROPOSED TO UPDATE SOME OF OUR STRATEGIES TO ALIGN WITH
25 THE RECENT AGEING IN PLACE CODE UPGRADES, AND ALSO ASSUME A

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 NEW COMPONENT OF THE STRATEGY TO MAKE ACCESSIBILITY AND SAFETY
2 IMPROVEMENTS TO APPROXIMATELY 200,000 EXISTING BAY AREA HOMES.
3 OUR PARKS STRATEGY WAS ALSO UPDATED TO REFLECT A NEW AND
4 UPDATED PARKS SHOULD BE BUILT WITH ADA STANDARDS AND DESIGNED
5 FOR ALL AGES AND ABILITIES WITH CORRESPONDING COSTS
6 INCORPORATED. IN TERMS OF URBAN INVESTMENT IN PARKS, WHAT WILL
7 HAPPEN TO THE REGIONS' PARKS AND OPEN SPACE, GIVEN PROJECTED
8 GROWTH. AND THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS REVEALED THE RATIO OF
9 URBAN PARK ACRES PER THOUSAND RESIDENTS WILL DROP PER CAPITA
10 BASIS. IMPACT FELT IN OUR REGIONS' EQUITY PRIORITY
11 COMMUNITIES. SO, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE ARE PROPOSING TO
12 EXPAND OUR URBAN GREENING STRATEGY TO ADDRESS DECLINE WITH
13 FOCUS ON EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ADDITIONAL FUNDS ARE
14 BEING DIRECTED TO GROW PUBLIC AND PARK SPACES AS PART OF THE
15 LARGE-SCALE REDEVELOPMENT PROJECTS ENSURING THAT AREAS WITH
16 NEW DEVELOPMENT ALSO SEE ADDITIONAL PARKS. FINALLY, IN TERMS
17 OF SEA LEVEL RISE IN SPRING 2024, MTC, ABAG AS WELL AS BCDC,
18 REENGAGE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS FROM ACROSS THE REGION TO UPDATE
19 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION PROJECT ADAPTATION DETAILS AND 85%
20 OF PROJECTS WERE REVIEWED AND RESULTED IN UPDATED DETAILS. SO,
21 THERE ARE NOW HIGHER -- SLIGHTLY HIGHER RESILIENCE PROJECT
22 COST ESTIMATES. AND YOU KNOW, THIS WILL INCLUDE POTENTIALLY
23 OVER 400 PROJECTS, TOTALING \$95 BILLION, BUT WE HAVE TRIED TO
24 ORGANIZE THAT ESTIMATE SO THAT WE'RE DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN
25 NEAR-TERM RISK AND LONGER TERM RISK AS WELL AS LOCALLY

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 IDENTIFIED PROJECTS VERSUS PLACE HOLDER PROJECTS. NEXT AND
2 FINAL SLIDE, SO, WE WILL COME BACK NEXT MONTH TO SHARE OUR
3 ROUND TWO ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS, WE'LL ALSO BE PROVIDING THIS
4 BODY WITH UPDATE ON OUR 2024 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.
5 AGAIN, WORKING WITH PARTNERS RESPONDING TO FEEDBACK THAT WE
6 RECEIVED FROM THE PUBLIC, AS WELL AS FROM THIS BODY, TO
7 FINALIZE PROJECT LISTS AND MAKE FINAL REVISIONS TO THE FINAL
8 BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES, AND AGAIN WE'LL BE BACK IN EARLY '25 TO
9 SEEK APPROVAL FOR STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES INCLUDING PROJECT
10 LISTS. WITH THAT HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY
11 HAVE.

12

13 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. LET'S START
14 WITH MEMBER WILLIAMS.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** WELL, I WANT TO FIRST START WITH A THANK YOU
17 FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY INFORMATIVE. AND, YOU
18 KNOW, THIS IS MY SECOND MEETING, SO, I AM GOING TO HAVE A LOT
19 OF QUESTIONS. I JUST WANT STAFF TO KNOW, [LAUGHTER] --
20 QUESTIONS ARE COMING. BUT, I WANT TO GO BACK TO THE SLIDE THAT
21 HAD THE PIE CHARTS. AND I WANT TO ADDRESS, ON THE VERY FIRST
22 SLIDE THAT DIVIDES UP SOME EXPENDITURE DOLLARS. ARE YOU ABLE
23 TO PULL IT BACK UP? SO YOU KNOW WHAT I'M REFERENCING? THANK
24 YOU. I DIDN'T KNOW WHAT NUMBER. THANK YOU SO MUCH. SO,
25 STARTING WITH THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGY, AND I JUST WANTED

41

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 TO UNDERSTAND, IN REFERENCE TO THE HEALTHY AND SAFE STREETS,
2 IN THIS PIE CHART, WHY -- AND GRANTED I UNDERSTAND THE COST
3 THAT GOES INTO MAINTENANCE AND OPTIMIZING EXISTING SYSTEMS,
4 BUT WHY IS SUCH A LOW PIECE OF THIS PIE CHART IS SET ASIDE FOR
5 HEALTHY AND SAFE STREETS? AND I ASK THIS BECAUSE THE GOAL,
6 RIGHT, IS TO KEEP WALKABILITY, IF PEOPLE ARE OUT WALKING,
7 BEING ABLE TO GET TO RESOURCES, TO WORK, THOSE THINGS. BUT, IF
8 YOU SIDEWALK, AND YOUR STREETS, IT'S HARD TO MANAGE. AND WHY
9 WOULD YOU WANT TO USE IT, AND YOU TAKE TRANSPORTATION WHEN YOU
10 CAN JUST GET IN YOUR CAR?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER WILLIAMS FOR THAT QUESTION.
13 ONE IMPORTANT THING TO REMEMBER WITH TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS
14 THAT MTC DOES HAVE A FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY. SO, ALMOST 75% OF
15 THAT PIE CHART GOES, SIMPLY, TO MAINTAINING AND OPERATING OUR
16 EXISTING TRANSPORTATION AND ROADWAY SYSTEM. SO, JUST
17 MAINTAINING THAT SYSTEM TAKES UP A VERY, VERY SIGNIFICANT
18 AMOUNT OF REVENUE. SO, THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT IS THEN
19 AVAILABLE FOR IMPROVEMENTS AND ENHANCEMENTS IS RELATIVELY MORE
20 LIMITED. AND THERE -- YOU KNOW, THERE ARE A LOT OF NEEDS IN
21 THAT SPACE, AND PARTICULARLY WITH THE MORE CHALLENGING FISCAL
22 CONSTRAINTS THAT WE HAVE IN THIS PLAN WITH LESS MONEY, THERE
23 ISN'T AS MUCH TO GO AROUND. BUT WITH THAT SAID, YOU KNOW, THE
24 \$10 BILLION THAT DOES GO TOWARDS CREATING HEALTHY AND SAFE
25 STREETS, THAT AMOUNT OF MONEY IS SUFFICIENT TO BUILD-OUT A

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 10,000 MILE, YOU KNOW, NETWORK FOR A REGIONAL ACTIVE
2 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. IT DOES INCLUDE VISION ZERO
3 INVESTMENTS TO, YOU KNOW, IMPROVE STREET DESIGN AND MAKE
4 COMMUNITIES SAFER. AND, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A LARGE CATEGORY OF
5 EXPENDITURES THAT, AGAIN, DO GO TOWARDS, YOU KNOW, MAINTAINING
6 OUR EXISTING STREETS THAT RECEIVE QUITE A BIT OF MONEY. SO,
7 YOU KNOW, EVEN THOUGH THAT -- THAT AMOUNT MAY SEEM SMALL IN
8 THE GRAND SCHEME OF THE OVERALL FISCAL ENVELOPE, IT IS A
9 SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF THE DISCRETIONARY FUNDING THAT'S
10 AVAILABLE TO ENHANCE OF TRANSPORTATION NETWORK.

11

12 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I WOULD LIKE TO REQUEST, IS -- WELL, LET ME
13 ASK THIS, IS THIS FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY ONLINE FOR ME TO READ?
14 OR DO I NEED TO REQUEST TO SEE WHAT THAT REALLY MEANS? IS
15 SOUNDS GOOD, BUT BECAUSE I'M NOT ON THE MTC, I DON'T KNOW WHAT
16 THE FIX-IT-FIRST POLICY IS. AND I'M SPEAKING, NOT JUST FROM
17 LOOKING AT YOUR DATA, BUT FROM LIVED EXPERIENCE, COMING FROM
18 RICHMOND CALIFORNIA, NOW IN SOLANO COUNTY, I UNDERSTAND WHEN
19 YOU TALK ABOUT THESE PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, HAVING FIRSTHAND
20 LIVED IN THEM, SO FOR ME, I UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF
21 HAVING GOOD WALKABLE STREETS, OR -- AND ROADWAYS, FOR CHILDREN
22 AND PEOPLE LIVING IN THESE AREAS, SO, I WOULD JUST LIKE TO
23 PRESS UPON STAFF AND MTC, AS YOU CONTINUE TO THINK THROUGH
24 THESE THINGS, THAT, THAT PARTICULAR ELEMENT IS ALSO TAKEN INTO
25 CONSIDERATION. AND EVEN IF THAT MEANS HAVING LITTLE WORKSHOPS

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 OR SOME MORE SURVEYING ABOUT HEALTH, THE QUALITY OF STREETS,
2 AND HOW SAFE AND HEALTHY THEY ARE, FOR THE COMMUNITIES THAT
3 YOU'RE SERVING. SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S BROUGHT
4 FORWARD. NOT TO SAY THAT IT'S NOT TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION,
5 BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US LEAN A LITTLE BIT HEAVIER, ALSO,
6 TOWARD MAKING SURE THAT WE HAVE -- CREATE HEALTHY AND SAFE
7 STREETS. THAT WAS MY FIRST QUESTION.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** JUST A MOMENT, MEMBER WILLIAMS,
10 I'M GOING TO LET DIRECTOR MALONEY CHIME IN HERE.

11

12 **MATT MALONEY:** THANK YOU MATT MALONEY DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND
13 POLICY. BOARD MEMBER WILLIAMS IT'S A GREAT QUESTION. I
14 DEPARTMENT TO POINT YOU TO ITEM 10A WE HAVE A BUNCH OF
15 ATTACHMENTS IN THIS ITEM, SO I WOULD POINT TO YOU ATTACHMENT B
16 WHICH IS OUR DRAFT TRANSPORTATION NEEDS AND REVENUE
17 ASSESSMENT. SO, WHAT WE DO EVERY PLAN CYCLE, EVERY FOUR YEARS,
18 IS WE GO THROUGH A FAIRLY ROBUST EXERCISE OF QUANTIFYING WHAT
19 THE MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS NEED IS FOR THE ROADWAY SYSTEM
20 AND FOR THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. SO, THERE IS A LOT OF DETAIL ABOUT
21 THAT IN THE ITEM. I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT IN TERMS OF JUST
22 FEDERAL AND STATE AND STATUTORY TILES, THAT WE HAVE A
23 RESPONSIBILITY IN THESE PLANS TO ENSURE WE ARE MAINTAINING THE
24 SYSTEM NOT ALWAYS IN AN IDEAL STAYED OF GOOD REPAIR BUT AT
25 LEAST MAINTAINING AND OPERATING IT AND KEEPING IN SIMILAR

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CONDITION THAT IT IS TODAY AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN WITH THE
2 FINANCIAL RESOURCES WE CAN MOVE THAT UP A NOTCH. I WOULD ALSO
3 SAY TO ECHO CHIRAG'S COMMENT THAT THE 10 BILLION ON THE PIE
4 CHART IN TERMS OF ANALYSIS DOES CREATE 10,000 ADDITIONAL MILES
5 OF COMMITTEE STREETS AROUND THE REGION SO IT'S VERY
6 SIGNIFICANT AND IN THE ATTACHMENT E WHICH IS ALL OF THE 35
7 STRATEGIES IT MIGHT BE A BETTER WAY TO ALSO LOOK AT THE
8 RELATIVE SIZE OF THAT INVESTMENT VIS-À-VIS OTHERS INVESTMENTS
9 IN THE PLAN I THINK A LOT IS BURIED IN THIS PIE CHART BUT FOR
10 EXAMPLE, JUST LOOKING AT INVESTMENTS EXPANDING FREEWAYS IN THE
11 PLAN WE HAVE GOT 3 BILLION IN TERMS OF THAT SO WE HAVE TRIPLE
12 THE INVESTMENT IN COMPLETE STREETS RELATIVE TO EXPANDING
13 FREEWAYS I THINK THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT IT'S NOT
14 CAPTURED IN THIS GRAPHIC.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT RESPONSE I'LL REACH OUT AND
17 E-MAIL YOU JUST SO I CAN UNDERSTAND MORE WHAT WAS ALREADY IN
18 THE PACKET. OKAY? THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR ANSWERING MY QUESTION
19 AND HELPING ME UNDERSTAND CONTEXT OF WHAT'S HERE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **MATT MALONEY:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. AND I WILL NOTE TO
24 STAFF, I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE OVERSIGHT WAS HERE, BUT THE MTC
25 AGENDA HAS THE ATTACHMENTS. THE ABAG AGENDA DOES NOT. SO, THAT

45

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 DEFINITELY NEEDS, I THINK, SOME ATTENTION, TO MAKE SURE THAT
2 ON BOTH SIDES, BECAUSE WHEN WE ARE ON THE ABAG SIDE, WE ARE
3 GETTING THE ABAG AGENDA, THAT DOES NOT HAVE ANY ATTACHMENTS.
4 AND, ALSO, DOES NOT HAVE THE PRESENTATION ATTACHED TO EITHER.
5 AND WHEN YOU GO TO THE ABAG WEB SITE AND LOOK AT THE AGENDA,
6 IT'S NOT -- THE LINKS ARE NOT ON THERE EITHER. SO WE NEED TO
7 MAKE SURE WE HAVE CONSISTENCY ON THE AGENDAS. THANK YOU SO
8 MUCH. NEXT I'LL RECOGNIZE MEMBER ECKLUND.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM PRESIDENT. FOLLOWING
11 UP ON -- YEAH, I -- WE'RE NOT COMMISSIONERS, BUT ANYWAY --
12 BOARD MEMBER WILLIAMS. YOU SAID THAT THIS 10 BILLION INCLUDES
13 10,000 MILES OF STREETS AND ROADS. IS THAT WHAT YOU SAID?

14

15 **MATT MALONEY:** FOR ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION FOR COMPLETE STREETS.
16 SO, DESIGNING, YOU KNOW, STREETS FOR ALL AGES AND ABILITIES.
17 INCLUDES EMPHASIS ON BICYCLING AND PEDESTRIAN.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** RIGHT. AND, SO, WHAT ABOUT MAINTAINING LOCAL
20 STREETS?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** THAT WOULD BE IN THE LARGER SECTION OF THAT PIE
23 CHART. SO I MENTION THAT WE DO A NEEDS ASSESSMENT WHICH
24 INCLUDES ALL OF THE HIGHWAYS, BUT WE LOOK AT ALL LOCAL ROADS
25 IN THE BAY AREA. THAT IS PART OF THE MAINTENANCE AND

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 OPERATIONS NEEDS ASSESSMENT SO THAT IS CAPTURED IN THAT VERY
2 LARGE PORTION OF THAT PIE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I GUESS BASED ON MY SERVICE TO DATE WHICH IS OVER
5 TWO DECADES, THE CITIES, AT LEAST IN NOVATO AND OTHERS, THAT I
6 KNOW ABOUT, SAN RAFAEL AND OTHERS, WE REALLY STRUGGLE TRYING
7 TO KEEP OUR STREETS, OUR LOCAL STREETS MAINTAINED. AND SO, WE
8 DON'T HAVE THE FUNDS. YOU KNOW, NOVATO IS A POOR PROPERTY TAX
9 CITY. WE DON'T GET THE FULL AMOUNT OF PROPERTY TAX THAT OTHER
10 CITIES GET IN MARIN COUNTY, OR THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE WE HAVE
11 THIS SEPARATE FIRE DISTRICT IS SEPARATE, SANITARY DISTRICT IS
12 SEPARATE, WATER DISTRICT. SO, THAT PIE CHART GETS PRETTY
13 NARROW OVER TIME. SO, I JUST -- I WOULD WANT TO REITERATE, I
14 SUPPORT THE NEED, NOT ONLY FOR BIKES AND PEDESTRIANS, BUT ALSO
15 FOR LOCAL ROADS. AND I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN SEEING,
16 PROBABLY A LITTLE BIT MORE BREAK OUT. BUT I WANTED TO FOCUS A
17 LITTLE BIT ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE. I'M VERY EXCITED THAT YOU
18 HAVE TRIED TO CAPTURE WHAT THE ESTIMATE FOR NOT ONLY MAYBE
19 REPLACING JOBS AND REPLACING HOUSING, BUT THERE IS NO MAPS
20 INCLUDED IN THIS REPORT ABOUT WHAT -- WHAT YOU'RE ANTICIPATING
21 IN TERMS OF SEA LEVEL RISE. AND I'M VERY INTERESTED IN HAVING
22 SOME VISUAL OBSERVATIONS OF WHERE DO WE THINK THE SEA LEVEL
23 RISE IS GOING TO BE, WHICH COUNTIES ARE MORE AFFECTED THAN
24 OTHERS, AND WHAT ARE THE PROJECTED NEEDS IN EACH OF THE
25 COUNTIES, BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO BE DIFFERENT, OBVIOUSLY,

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 BECAUSE OF THE GEOGRAPHY. SO -- SO, DO WE HAVE ACCESS TO A
2 MAP? IS IT ONLINE? AND IF YOU DO HAVE IT ONLINE, IS IT
3 POSSIBLE FOR YOU TO SEND THAT LINK OUT TO ALL OF US?

4

5 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND, WE WILL SHARE THAT
6 WITH THIS BODY AT A FORTHCOMING UPDATE. YOU KNOW, THE DETAILED
7 LIST OF PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS, AS WELL AS A MAP THAT, YOU
8 KNOW, DISPLAYS WHERE THERE ARE LOCALLY IDENTIFIED PROJECTS,
9 WHERE THERE ARE PLACE HOLDER PROJECTS, WHAT THE ANTICIPATED
10 LEVELS OF INUNDATION ARE. WE'LL SHARE THAT IN A FORTHCOMING
11 UPDATE.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH BUT THIS FORTHCOMING UPDATE, IS IT THIS YEAR
14 OR NEXT YEAR? [LAUGHTER] YOU'RE STILL WORKING ON IT. YOU KNOW,
15 YOU COULD SAY VERSION ONE, OR WHATEVER, MORE UPDATES COMING AS
16 YOU DEVELOP IT. BUT I'M REALLY ANXIOUS TO SEE THAT, ESPECIALLY
17 BEING ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE COMMITTEE FOR MARIN COUNTY. I
18 WOULD LIKE TO SEE, AT LEAST SOME ESTIMATES OF WHICH CITIES ARE
19 GOING TO BE AFFECTED THE MOST. AND, SORT OF, START HAVING THAT
20 DISCUSSION. BECAUSE A LOT OF CITIES ARE, YOU KNOW, UPDATING
21 THEIR OWN GENERAL PLANS. SO, WE DON'T HAVE, NECESSARILY,
22 ACCESS TO THAT, AT LEAST THAT I'M AWARE OF. SO, DO YOU KNOW
23 WHEN WE MIGHT BE GETTING SOME VERSION OF IT EVEN IF IT IS
24 DRAFT?

25

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** FIRST OF ALL, WE'RE HAPPY TO POINT YOU TO THE
2 BASELINE DATA ON, YOU KNOW, SEA LEVEL RISE. WE WORKED VERY
3 CLOSELY WITH BCDC STAFF AND WE HAVE ADVISED ON ASSUMPTIONS. WE
4 CAN POINT TO YOU ONLINE TOOLS FOR THIS JUST WHERE THE SEA
5 LEVEL RISE IS WHAT CHIRAG IS REFERRING TO IS HOW DOES THE PLAN
6 ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE WHERE IT BREAKS DOWN THE MONEYS BY
7 COUNTY AND SUCH AND THAT PART WILL BE IN JANUARY WE'RE WORKING
8 HARD TO GET THAT TOGETHER BUT AS YOU MENTIONED INCLUDING NOT
9 ONLY THE MAPS BUT WHERE THE INUNDATION IS BUT WHERE PROJECTS
10 ARE WHERE THEY'RE LOCATED. ALL THAT SORT OF BREAKDOWN. IT IS
11 COMING SOON. SO, IT IS COMING SOON?

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** IT IS COMING SOON. OKAY. GREAT. THE OTHER
14 QUESTION IS THAT THE ESTIMATES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES ON
15 SLIDE NUMBER SIX, THAT'S ALMOST LIKE -- I MEAN, 30 BILLION
16 EXISTING REVENUES, BUT NEW REVENUES 185 BILLION? TO ME THAT'S
17 A HUGE JUMP IN TERMS OF WHAT THE NEEDS ARE. WHAT ARE SOME OF
18 THE THOUGHTS OF HOW WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO START FILLING THAT
19 HUGE GAP?

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND. SO, I WILL SAY IN
22 TERMS OF THAT GAP, THE BIG DRIVER OF THAT IS THE NEED TO ADAPT
23 TO SEA LEVEL RISE. THAT'S --

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** RIGHT. EXACTLY.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** HIGHEST COST. AGAIN, AS I MENTIONED WE DON'T
3 MAKE ANY ASSUMPTIONS IN THE PLAN ABOUT WHAT THOSE SOURCES
4 MIGHT BE I THINK IT'S REALLY INTENDED TO HELP THE REGIONAL
5 CONVERSATION AS TO THE SCALE OF THE NEEDS OVER THE LONG 25-
6 YEAR PERIOD, AND SHARED POLICY CONVERSATION IN PARTNERSHIP
7 WITH ORGANIZATIONS AS TO WHAT THE BEST POSSIBLE APPROACH MIGHT
8 BE TO ADDRESS THOSE NEEDS.

9

10 **PAT ECKLUND:** THIS IS SUCH A HUGE GAP. I THINK WE MIGHT WANT TO
11 START HAVING DISCUSSION EARLIER RATHER THAN LATER. BUT I
12 REALLY APPRECIATE THE INCREDIBLE PRESENTATION THAT YOU DID.
13 THE OTHER QUESTION IS ON PAGE -- SLIDE NUMBER EIGHT. AND, SO,
14 YOU INDICATED THAT THERE WAS TARGETED DEVELOPMENT, FEE
15 REDUCTIONS, RESULT IN COST SAVINGS AND EXPANDED OPPORTUNITIES
16 FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION. THE FEE REDUCTIONS, ARE YOU TALKING
17 ABOUT WHAT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS CHARGE? WHAT -- WHAT KIND OF FEE
18 REDUCTIONS ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT?

19

20 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, I MEAN, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE INVENTORIED
21 MANY DIFFERENT PROJECT TYPES ACROSS MANY DIFFERENT LOCATIONS.
22 SO, IT'S REALLY LOOKING AT, YOU KNOW, KIND OF -- I WOULDN'T
23 NECESSARILY SAY AN AVERAGE, BUT, YOU KNOW, TYPICAL FEE LEVELS
24 THAT ARE APPLIED TO PROJECTS AND BEING THOSE FEES BE REDUCED

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 AND WHAT COULD THE POTENTIAL IMPACT BE IN TERMS OF REDUCING
2 THOSE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY AND THAT'S PRIMARILY BECAUSE OF STATE
5 LEGISLATION WHICH REALLY CONSTRICTS LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN
6 DECISIONS ON HOW HIGH AND THE HOUSING AND STUFF. OKAY. AND
7 THEN YOU SAID THAT, ON SLIDE EIGHT, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT SEEKS
8 A GREATER CONCENTRATION OF FUTURE IN-PERSON JOBS NEAR FREQUENT
9 TRANSIT. WHAT I'M SEEING, AT LEAST IN MARIN, IS THAT THERE --
10 A LOT OF BUSINESSES ARE CLOSING. AND THOSE BIG OFFICES ARE
11 REALLY TURNING TO HOUSING. SO, I SEE MORE HOUSING BEING
12 FOCUSED AROUND TRANSIT, NECESSARILY MORE SO THAN JOBS. SO, YOU
13 HAVE ACCOUNTED FOR ALL THE ONLINE JOBS, NOW, THAT PEOPLE ARE
14 DOING? AND, SO, JUST KIND OF CURIOUS ON YOUR COMMENT ON THAT?

15

16 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YES, WE HAVE ALIGNED WITH THE DATA FROM THE
17 CENSUS IN TERMS OF ARE CURRENT, THE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS WE
18 HAVE MADE PROJECTIONS OUT TO THE FUTURE BASED UPON THE BEST
19 AVAILABLE INFORMATION WHAT THOSE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS WILL BE
20 AND WE THINK THEY'RE LIKELY TO BE RELATIVELY CONSISTENT WITH
21 WHERE THOSE LEVELS ARE NOW, BUT WE DO BELIEVE THAT THERE IS AN
22 OPPORTUNITY FOR CERTAIN INDUSTRIES THAT STILL DO RELY ON IN-
23 PERSON WORK TO USE POTENTIAL INCENTIVES TO TRY TO TARGET THOSE
24 INDUSTRY TYPES OR SECTORS NEAR FREQUENT TRANSIT TO, AGAIN,

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 HELP US ACHIEVE SOME OF THE DIFFERENT POLICY GOALS THAT WE DO
2 HAVE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I WANT TO THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR A GREAT
5 PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY, PROBABLY MORE TRANSPARENT AND
6 INFORMATIVE THAN WHAT I HAVE SEEN IN THE PAST. SO, I JUST WANT
7 TO COMPLIMENT YOU VERY MUCH. GREAT JOB.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU MEMBER ECKLUND. I WAS
10 GOING TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA BUT I BELIEVE YOUR QUESTION WAS
11 ASKED AND ANSWERED. I'LL TURN TO MEMBER ROMERO.

12

13 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU. I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE ATTACHMENT E
14 WHICH LAYS OUT IN TABULAR FORM WHAT YOU CHANGED AND WHAT WAS
15 BEFORE AND AFTER. SO I -- AGAIN, IT WAS EASY, THANK GOODNESS
16 FOR WI-FI ON THE TRAIN BECAUSE I WAS ABLE TO READ THIS ON THE
17 WAY UP FROM THE CITY [LAUGHTER] AND I DO CONCUR WITH
18 CHAIRWOMAN RAMOS. I -- I NOTICED THAT MY PACKET DID NOT HAVE
19 ANYTHING. AND YOU GUYS HAVE LEGISTAR, WHICH IS GREAT IT
20 ALLOWED ME TO GO AND LOOK AT THE BIG THING. I THINK IT'S AN
21 OVERSIGHT BECAUSE IN THE PAST I HAVE SEEN BOTH. BUT ANYWAY, I
22 GUESS A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. ONE COMMENT ON THE ISSUE OF
23 TRYING TO CREATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, OR HOUSING IN GENERAL,
24 AND REDUCE THE COST. THERE WAS A RECENT STUDY, I MEAN, VERY
25 RECENT, I WOULD SAY, PROBABLY RELEASED YESTERDAY, BY THE JOINT

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 CENTER FOR HOUSING STUDIES, AND I BELIEVE THE CITY OF BOSTON -
2 - LOOKING AT THE CITY OF BOSTON AND OTHER, KIND OF,
3 INTERNATIONAL ARCHITECTURAL GUIDELINES AROUND SINGLE STAIR
4 WELL CONSTRUCTION AS OPPOSED TO DOUBLE STAIR WELL. AND IT
5 MAKES A BIG DIFFERENCE IN TERMS OF LOT CONFIGURATION AND WHAT
6 YOU CAN ACTUALLY DO ON A SITE. NOW, THERE ARE PLENTY OF
7 ARCHITECTS I TALKED TO RECENTLY IN THE LAST COUPLE OF DAYS WHO
8 SAID I DON'T KNOW IF CALIFORNIA WANTS TO DO THIS. CANADA DOES
9 IT, JAPAN DOES IT STOCKHOLM, LOOKING AT THOSE OPPORTUNITIES
10 AND POTENTIALLY DRIVING THAT LEGISLATION, RIGHT, SO WE CAN
11 INDEED, ONE, HAVE KIND OF MORE URBANLY PLEASING DESIGNS, BUT
12 AT THE SAME TIME GET AWAY FROM THE DOUBLE LOADED CORRIDOR THAT
13 REALLY ALLOWS BETTER UTILIZATION OF THE SMALLER SITES,
14 INCLUDING UP TO FIVE STORY, YOU KNOW, 30 UNIT KIND OF PROJECTS
15 WHICH ARE KIND OF A SWEET SPOT WITHIN A LOT OF THIS URBAN
16 INFILL WORK WE'RE DOING SO I WOULD HOPE AND I CAN CERTAINLY
17 FORWARD, BECAUSE I THINK IT'S SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. I CAN
18 SEND THAT TO STAFF AND STAFF CAN SEND IT OUT TO EVERYBODY.
19 [LAUGHTER] IT'S ACTUALLY NOT THAT DENSE. YOU DON'T HAVE TO BE
20 AN ARCHITECT TO UNDERSTAND IT. AND YEAH JUST ONE COMMENT, AND
21 THANK YOU FOR CATCHING IT MISS ECKLUND TO THE ISSUE OF
22 REDUCING -- AND I HAVE TALK TO THIS BEFORE I KNOW THERE IS
23 SOME COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES ON THIS
24 BUT I THINK THERE ARE PLACES INDEED WE CAN REDUCE SOME OF THE
25 LOCAL FEES MANY OF THE LOCAL FEES ARE ACTUALLY NECESSARY TO,

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 YOU KNOW, COMPENSATE FOR THE TRAFFIC, SOME OF THE OTHER
2 IMPACTS, I KNOW YOU WERE KIND OF GASPING SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS
3 WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THE REDUCTION OF POTENTIAL PARKS, RIGHT,
4 WE COULD DO CHARGE THESE PARK FEES SO WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE
5 WE'RE CALIBRATING THEM CORRECTLY, NOT ABUSING THEM. AND I
6 THINK A LOT OF THE STATE LEGISLATION KIND OF GETS US TO THAT
7 DIRECTION. BUT I DO WANT TO BE VERY CAUTIOUS ABOUT AT THE
8 LOCAL LEVEL SAYING WE NEED TO WIPE OUT SOME OF THESE FEES
9 WHICH ARE NECESSARY FOR US TO CREATE A LIVABLE ENVIRONMENT,
10 AND ALSO KIND OF ADDRESS -- I HAVE TO ADMIT, HOUSING HAS
11 IMPACTS ON OUR COMMUNITIES. I SUPPORT HOUSING 100%, SO, IT'S
12 JUST A CAUTIONARY. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, MEMBER ROMERO.
15 AT THIS TIME WE'RE GOING TO TURN TO PUBLIC COMMENT, ALSO
16 PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE BOARDROOM. ADINA LEVIN FROM SEAMLESS BAY
17 AREA.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THREE MINUTES, PLEASE.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. AND I WANTED TO
24 COMMEND STAFF FOR ALL THE GOOD WORK AT PUTTING TOGETHER THIS
25 LONG RANGE PLAN HELPING TO GUIDE OUR REGION FOR OUR HOUSING

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1 AND CLIMATE AND TRANSPORTATION AND EQUITY GOALS. AND WANTED TO
2 HIGHLIGHT THE POTENTIAL CONNECTION BETWEEN A FEW DIFFERENT
3 THINGS THAT WE'RE DOING AT THE SAME TIME. SO, ON THE
4 TRANSPORTATION SIDE, THE TRANSIT 2050+ COMPONENT, WHICH WAS
5 OVERVIEWED HERE, COMING BACK IN DETAIL IN THE NEXT MONTH, HAS
6 A NEW APPROACH TO THIS LONG LANGUAGE PLAN, AS A NETWORK,
7 LOOKING AT SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS, LOOKING AT MORE COST
8 EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES, IN A MORE CONSTRAINED FUNDING
9 ENVIRONMENT FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY IN A WAY THAT WILL GET US
10 RELIABLE, MORE RELIABLE AND FASTER SERVICE. COMMUNITY AND
11 POPULAR. WHEN WE POLL ON THEM, THE PLAN OBSERVES ONE OR MORE
12 CONSTRAINED FUNDING ENVIRONMENT AND A SET OF MULTIPLE FUNDING
13 STRATEGIES. AT THE SAME TIME THAT MTC AND AGENCIES ARE WORKING
14 TOGETHER ON A POTENTIAL REGIONAL FUNDING APPROACH, AND THAT
15 COULD EITHER WORK ON HELPING DELIVER THIS PLAN THAT WE'RE
16 WORKING IN THE LONG-TERM, OR DO SOMETHING, YOU KNOW,
17 POTENTIALLY MUCH SMALLER AND WOULD REALLY URGE YOU FOR THE
18 RIGHT HAND AND LEFT HAND TOGETHER TO HAVE THE FUNDING TO
19 DELIVER THE VISION. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. NOT SEEING ANY OTHER
22 PUBLIC COMMENTS IN THE BOARDROOM. DO WE HAVE ANY ONLINE?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
25 ONLINE AND THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

OCTOBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT WAS
3 SIMPLY AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM FOR US. AT THIS TIME, WE'LL MOVE
4 ON TO AGENDA ITEM 11. AND THAT IS PUBLIC -- GENERAL PUBLIC
5 COMMENT.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
8 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
9 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

10

11 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE'RE NOW MOVING ON TO
12 ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
13 WILL BE HELD FRIDAY NOVEMBER 8TH, 2024 AT 9:40 AT THE BAY AREA
14 METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA ANY
15 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE IS
18 ADJOURNED AND OUR NEXT MEETING IS NOVEMBER 8TH AT 9:40 A.M.
19 HERE AT THE METRO CENTER. MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

20



NTT

Broadcasting Government