

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JULY 22, 2024

1 **REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL**

2 **MONDAY, JULY 22ND, 2024, 11:30 AM**

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE
5 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS
6 BEING BROADCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND
7 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM AND WISHING TO
8 SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE,
9 AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

10 TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR
11 DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. SO, WITH THAT INTRODUCTION,
12 MADAM CLERK, COULD WE DO ROLL CALL AND SEE IF WE HAVE A QUORUM
13 HERE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR POWERS?

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR CHAN?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BOUCHARD?

24

25 **MICHELLE BOUCHARD:** HERE.



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHURCHILL? FREMIER?

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GONOT?

7

8 **CAROLYN GONOT:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HURSH?

11

12 **MICHAEL HURSH:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MULLIGAN?

15

16 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MURPHY?

19

20 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TUMLIN?

23

24 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SULLIVAN FOR WHELAN?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. I WANT TO THANK
8 WALLY AND YOUR TEAM FOR HOSTING US HERE ON THIS MONDAY MID-
9 MORNING GOING INTO THE AFTERNOON. I THINK WE HAVE A FEW
10 MEETINGS HERE. I KNOW IT'S A LOT OF WORK TO PUT THESE MEETINGS
11 ON AND GET THE AV STUFF UP AND ROLLING. THANK YOU FOR THAT,
12 WALLY. OKAY. FOLKS, WE HAVE ONE ITEM IT'S AN ACTION ITEM,
13 CONSENT, THEN A FEW INFORMATIONAL ITEMS THAT WE ARE GOING TO
14 GET BRIEFED ON THROUGH MELANIE'S TEAM, DIRECTOR CHOY. SO, BUT
15 LET'S FIRST START WITH OUR CONSENT ITEM. THIS IS AN ACTION
16 ITEM. DO WE HAVE A MOTION ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

17

18 **MICHAEL HURSH:** MOVE APPROVAL, HURSH.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** SECOND SERGEANT.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** MOTION HURSH, SECOND SERGEANT. PUBLIC
23 COMMENT EITHER VIRTUALLY OR ON IN AM ROOM ON THIS ITEM?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE.



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. COUNCIL MEMBERS AT
3 THE DAIS, COMMENTS, QUESTIONS, CONCERNS ON CONSENT? NOT SEEING
4 ANY. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR SAY AYE? AYE. OPPOSED? MADAM CLERK FOR
5 THE RECORD CONSENT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO
6 AGENDA ITEM 3A. THREE -- DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT THERE?
7 WALLY? OR IS THAT THERE -- ON THIS ITEM?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WHICH ONE? TWO OR THREE A?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THREE A.

14

15 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WE'LL GET TO IT IN A MOMENT. LET'S GO TO
16 PRESENTATION, MAC MAPPING AND WAYFINDING IS OUR UPDATE PILOT
17 PROGRAM HERE I'M TURNING THIS OVER TO YOU MELANIE? OR GORDON
18 ARE? LET ME GO STRAIGHT TO GORDON. THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

19

20 **GORDON HANSEN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR POWERS. I'M ONE OF
21 MANY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERTS IN THE ROOM TODAY. GOOD AFTERNOON
22 TO YOU CHAIR POWERS AND VICE CHAIR CHAN AND THE REST OF THE
23 RNM COUNCIL MEMBERS. I'M GORDON HANSON REGIONAL MAPPING AND
24 WAYFINDING PROJECT MANAGER. AND WITH ME IS JUMANA NABTI OF
25 BART, THE PROJECT TRANSIT OPERATOR LIASON. FOLLOW UP TO OUR



JULY 22, 2024

1 LAST MEETING IN MAY WE'RE PROVIDING UPDATE TODAY ON THE
2 WAYFINDING PILOT PROJECTS WHICH ARE EXPECTED TO BEGIN IN 2025.
3 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ARE REMINDERS OF THE BASICS OF THE PROJECT.
4 MORE INFORMATION FOUNDATION IN OUR PREVIOUS PRESENTATION IN
5 MAY. AGAIN, THE GOAL OF THIS PROJECT IS TO DEVELOP A NEW SET
6 OF WAYFINDING SIGNS AND MAPS FOR USE BY ALL 27 BAY AREA
7 TRANSIT AGENCIES. THE VISION IS TO PROVIDE A HARMONIZED
8 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR RIDERS ACROSS THE REGION. SO SOMEONE
9 CAN QUICKLY UNDERSTAND AND NAVIGATE TRANSIT, WHETHER AT A
10 LOCAL BUS STOP IN WALNUT CREEK OR ON AN ELEVATOR AT POWELL
11 STATION IN SAN FRANCISCO. AS DISCUSSED AT OUR MAY MEETING
12 WE'RE WORKING TO TEST DRAFT WAYFINDING SIGNS AT THE EL CERRITO
13 DEL NORTE SANTA ROSA MALL SMART STATION AS PART OF THE
14 PROTOTYPES BEING INSTALLED LATER THIS YEAR. WE'LL USE FEEDBACK
15 FROM RIDERS AND STAFF TO SET A DESIGN OF STANDARDS. THE PILOTS
16 ALLOW US TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE NEW WAYFINDING SYSTEM WORKS
17 UNDER THE HOOD, IF YOU WILL, AGREEMENTS AMONG AGENCIES AND THE
18 MTC FOR ONGOING OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. SO WE HAVE A
19 STRONG BUT FLEXIBLE PLAN FOR EXPANDING THROUGH THE ALL OF NINE
20 COUNTIES. THE PILOT PROJECTS INCLUDE THREE MAIN COMPONENTS,
21 BEGINNING IN 2025, TESTING AT A SET OF REGIONAL TRANSFER HUBS,
22 AND THAT'S THE FOCUS OF OUR PRESENTATION TODAY, NEXT, AFTER
23 THAT, BEGINNING IN 2026, TESTING AT A SET OF END TO END BUS
24 LINES IN THE NORTH BAY, AND ALSO ALLOWING AGENCY LED SIGNAGE
25 PROJECTS TO MOVE FORWARD AS SOON AS NEXT YEAR. NEXT SLIDE



JULY 22, 2024

1 PLEASE. LET'S TALK A BIT MORE ABOUT THE 2025 PILOT PROJECTS.
2 WE ASK FOR YOUR PATIENCE THIS IS A REPEATED SLIDE FROM MAY,
3 BUT THE CONTEXT IS IMPORTANT ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE FOLLOWING
4 FROM HOME. WE HEARD FEEDBACK FROM YOU AND YOUR AGENCIES THAT
5 THE PILOTS SHOULD BE MORE REPRESENTATIVE OF REGIONAL TRANSIT
6 NEEDS, SUCH AS SOUTH BAY SERVICE AREAS AND COMPLEX STATIONS.
7 THIS NEW PILOT APPROACH WILL ALLOW US TO EXPAND THE PROJECT'S
8 VISIBILITY AROUND THE REGION, DEMONSTRATE THE VALUE OF
9 INCREASED COORDINATION AMONG TRANSIT PROVIDERS TO MORE
10 CUSTOMERS AT KEY LOCATIONS. OUR GOAL, SINCE MAY, WAS TO
11 IDENTIFY SEVEN NEW LOCATIONS FOR PILOTS, BEYOND THE SANTA ROSA
12 AND EL CERRITO PROTOTYPES, WHICH AUTOMATICALLY BECOME PILOTS
13 DUE TO PRIOR INVESTMENT AND STAY ON AN EXPEDITED TIME FRAME TO
14 KEEP PROJECT MOMENTUM GOING. FOR MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THE
15 PROCESS, I WILL HAND IT OVER TO JUMANA.

16

17 **JUMANA NABTI:** THE CORE PROJECT TEAM DEVELOPED A SCREENING
18 PROCESS TO ENSURE THAT THE NEW REGIONAL PILOT LOCATIONS WOULD
19 APPROPRIATELY ADDRESS CURRENT WAYFINDING NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE.
20 GETTING AHEAD OF MYSELF. ALL RIGHT. IDEALLY, AT A SIGNIFICANT
21 HUB STATION IN EACH COUNTY. THE PROJECT TEAM BEGAN WITH THE
22 REQUIREMENT THAT A PILOT LOCATION SHOULD BE MULTIMODAL AND
23 STARTED WITH A LIST OF MORE THAN 120 TRANSIT CENTERS AS LISTED
24 ON THE 511 WEBSITE. THE FIRST STREAM WAS CONDUCTED BY MTC
25 PROJECT STAFF AND NARROWED DOWN TO THREE LOCATIONS BASED ON



JULY 22, 2024

1 AVAILABLE RIDERSHIP DATA AND NUMBER OF AVAILABLE OPERATORS
2 SERVING THE STATION. THE PROJECT TEAM ALSO CONVENED AN AD-HOC
3 WORKING GROUP CONSISTING OF STAFF FROM TRANSIT AGENCIES IN
4 EACH COUNTY. THIS WAS ESSENTIALLY OUR TAC PLUS ALL
5 REPRESENTATIVE FROM EVERY AGENCY THAT WAS NOT ALREADY
6 REPRESENTED ON THE TAC FOR THE PROJECT. AND SEEKING THEIR
7 FEEDBACK ON THE SELECTION PROCESS AND ASKING FOR INPUT ON
8 VARIABLES FOR FURTHER ANALYSIS. NEXT SLIDE. SECOND SCREEN
9 CONDUCTED BY PROJECT STAFF MTC WESTCAT SANTA ROSA CITY BUS AND
10 BART. THE TEAM REVIEWED AVAILABLE DATA AND ASSIGNED A PROJECT
11 BENEFIT SCORE FOR EACH OF THE LOCATIONS WITHIN A COUNTY. WE
12 CONSIDER THE STATION'S POTENTIAL FOR MAJOR WAYFINDING CHARGES,
13 FOR BLIND OR LOW VISION FOLKS OR FOR PEOPLE WITH LOW ENGLISH
14 PROFICIENCY. WE ALSO CONSIDERED WHETHER THE STATIONS HAD OTHER
15 CUSTOMER INFORMATION ARE PROJECTS THAT WE COULD BUILD ON OR IF
16 THERE WAS ANY UPCOMING CONSTRUCTION THAT COULD UNDERMINE ANY
17 NEW INVESTMENT IN WAYFINDING IN COMING YEARS. WE THEN
18 CONSIDERED SEVERAL FACTORS TO DEVELOP OUR FINAL
19 RECOMMENDATIONS, INCLUDING MAXIMIZING THE NUMBER OF AGENCIES
20 AND MODES INVOLVED IN A PILOT LOCATION REPRESENTING THE
21 GEOGRAPHIC DIVERSITY OF THE REGION. HALF OF THE LOCATIONS
22 SERVE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND COMPLEX ON-SITE
23 CONDITIONS SUCH AS MULTIPLE RAIL SERVICES. AND NOW, DRUM ROLL,
24 PLEASE, FOR THE LIST OF SITES.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **GORDON HANSEN:** YES DRUM ROLL PLEASE. FOR LIST OF SITES HERE IS
2 OUR SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS. FROM THE TOP, DURING OUR
3 ENGAGEMENT WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AS PART OF OUR AD-HOC
4 WORKING GROUP, NAPA VALUE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OR NVTA,
5 THE VINE, STAFF SUGGESTED THAT WE CONSIDER LOCATING THE NAPA
6 COUNTY SITE AT A MULTI-MODAL HUB IN SOLANO COUNTY BECAUSE OF
7 POTENTIAL FOR MULTIMODAL CONNECTIONS BETWEEN VTA CUSTOMERS AND
8 REGIONAL PROVIDERS. AFTER DISCUSSING THIS WE ARE RECOMMEND TWO
9 LOCATIONS IN SOLANO COUNTY. LET'S START CLOCKWISE FROM SONOMA
10 COUNTY. WE START WITH THE SANTA ROSA TRANSIT MALL AND SMART
11 STATION, AGAIN, THIS IS OUR EXISTING PROTOTYPE SITE. IN SOLANO
12 COUNTY, WE HAVE THE SYSTEM FAIRFIELD STATION, WHICH IS THE
13 NAPA COUNTY SELECTION, BUT LOCATED IN SOLANO COUNTY, AGAIN
14 SERVED BY THE VINE SERVICE AND OPERATING CONNECTIONS BETWEEN
15 CAPITAL CORRIDOR, SOLTRANS, FAST, AND THEN NAPA COUNTY. AND
16 THEN FOR SOLANO, ITS LOCATION IS AT THE VALLEJO FERRY TERMINAL
17 AND TRANSIT CENTER. NEXT IS EL CERRITO DEL NORTE STATION IN
18 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY WHICH IS THE OTHER PROTOTYPE SITE. AFTER
19 THAT DUBLIN PLEASANTON STATION IN ALAMEDA COUNTY WHICH IS AN
20 IMPORTANT TRANSFER FOR TRAVELERS WITHIN EASTERN ALAMEDA
21 COUNTY. IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, IT'S SAN JOSE DIRIDON STATION
22 WITH MULTIPLE RAIL TO RAIL CONNECTIONS. IN SAN MATEO COUNTY,
23 IT'S MILLBRAE STATION AN IMPORTANT RAIL CONNECTION SITE AND
24 GATEWAY TO THE PENINSULA. SAN FRANCISCO IT'S THE POWELL
25 STATION ONE OF THE MOST COMPLEX TRANSIT FACILITIES WEST OF THE



JULY 22, 2024

1 MISS SIPPY RIVER AND FINALLY LARKSPUR SMART STATION AND FERRY
2 TERMINAL IN MARIN COUNTY. KEY POINTS, THESE STATIONS ARE
3 SIGNIFICANT MULTIMODAL CONNECTIONS AROUND THE REGION, 2/3 OF
4 THEM ARE IN OR NEAR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND AGENCIES
5 SERVING THESE LOCATIONS CARRIED OVER 97% OF REGIONAL RIDERSHIP
6 IN 2022. ONE LAST THING TO NOTE IS BASED ON LATE BREAKING NEWS
7 WE'RE WORKING ON VTA TO BETTER UNDERSTAND UPCOMING
8 CONSTRUCTION AT SAN JOSE DIRIDON AS PART OF THE BART SILICON
9 VALLEY PHASE TWO PROJECT AND HOW THAT COULD AFFECT NEW
10 WAYFINDING INSTALLED AT THAT LOCATION. 96 SLIDE. WHAT'S NEXT.
11 BEHIND THE SCENES OF THE PROTOTYPE IMPLEMENTATION THIS FALL WE
12 ALSO BEGIN TO PULL TOGETHER STAFF FROM AGENCIES AT THE NEW
13 PILOT SITES TO BEGIN PLANNING. BEYOND THAT WE WILL CONDUCT ALL
14 NECESSARY WORK TO BEGIN IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NEW PILOTS AT
15 THE REGIONAL LOCATIONS NEXT YEAR. WE LOOK FORWARD TO PROVIDING
16 MORE UPDATES AS WE MOVE FORWARD. AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME
17 TODAY.

18

19 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION GORDON
20 AND JUMANA. AT A HIGH-LEVEL, THANK YOU FOR ALL THAT YOU DO FOR
21 PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA IT'S VERY IMPRESSIVE. YOU CAN
22 JUST TELL THE CARE AND CONCERN AND WHAT YOU PUT INTO IT WITH
23 THAT PRESENTATION THERE. SO, JUST THANK YOU FOR ALL OF THAT.
24 MADAM CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE WE HEAR FROM THE BOARD ON
25 THIS ITEM?



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE TWO SPEAKER CARDS. THERE IS NO ONE
3 ONLINE, AND WE ALSO RECEIVED ONE COMMENT IN WRITING FROM ALETA
4 DUPREE. SHE HAD ENTERED THAT, AND WE HAVE IT IN THE AGENDA
5 ALREADY.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GO AHEAD AND --

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** LET'S GO TWO MINUTES ON PUBLIC COMMENT,
12 MADAM CLERK.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS AND COUNCIL MEMBERS.
15 MY NAME IS HILARY BROWN. ACTUALLY I'M USING THIS PUBLIC
16 COMMENT TO DO A REPORT AMONG THE WAYFINDING GROUP, I'M ONE OF
17 THE MEMBERS. I BELIEVE I'M ONE OF THE MEMBERS THAT LIVE IN SAN
18 FRANCISCO COUNTY. SO I'M DOING MY PART TO SPREAD THE FACT THAT
19 I COMMUNICATE WITH THE BART TASK FORCE, AS WELL SFMTA ADVISORY
20 COMMITTEE ABOUT RECRUITING MEMBERS TO JOIN THIS PROJECT AND
21 THEY GET COMPENSATED. I JUST WANT TO SHARE MY PART. AND I
22 ALSO, I EXPRESSED INTEREST TO JOIN THE SANTA ROSA AND EL
23 CERRITO PROTOTYPES COMING OUT THIS SUMMER AND FALL. SO I'M
24 LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT TO DISCOVER HOW THOSE ACCOMMODATE MY
25 DISABILITY, BECAUSE PEOPLE MAY NOT KNOW THAT I'M LEGALLY



JULY 22, 2024

1 BLIND, BUT I'M STILL ABLE TO NAVIGATE THE REGION. BUT I
2 SUPPORT THE PROTOTYPES WHICH I FIND INTERESTING. AND I'M GLAD
3 I WAS ABLE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I'M GLAD I LIKE THIS
4 PANEL, AND THEY KNOW ME. AND I APPRECIATE PARTICIPATING IN THE
5 WAYFINDING GROUP. THAT'S ALL.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER ALETA DUPREE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND
10 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM
11 FOLDS. HOPEFULLY YOU GOT TO READ MY LETTER. IT WAS VERY SHORT.
12 PROBABLY NOT MY BEST WRITING. BUT I SHARE BEING AN ORDINARY
13 USER OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MY PHOTO DEPARTMENT GO THROUGH
14 WHEN I MENTIONED ABOUT STEEPED IN TRADITION, MINDFUL OF
15 HISTORY AND RELEVANT TO THE FUTURE. I PUT UP A PICTURE OF
16 GRAND CENTRAL SUBWAY STATION WITH THE NEWER SIGNAGE, WITH THE
17 PLAQUE AND WHITE STANDARD LETTERING THAT GOES BACK TO THE
18 '60s, I THINK, AND THE OLD MOSAICS THAT SAY GRAND CENTRAL
19 THAT, GO BACK TO THE STATION'S OPENING IN 1918. I BELIEVE. SO,
20 I HAVE NOTICED, IN SOME STATIONS THAT SOME OF THE OLD SIGNAGE
21 HAS BEEN TAKEN AWAY. I THINK AT MACARTHUR WE LOST SOME OF THE
22 SIGNAGE AND AT POWELL I'M SEEING SOME OF THE POWELL SIGNS WITH
23 THE LOWER CASE LETTERING. THAT'S DISAPPEARING. SO, I'M IN
24 SUPPORT OF CONSISTENT WAYFINDING MESSAGING THROUGHOUT THE
25 SYSTEM FOR OUR BASIC NAVIGATIONAL NEEDS. THAT MUST CONTINUE.



JULY 22, 2024

1 BUT, HOW CAN WE MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE NOT INDISCRIMINATELY
2 REMOVING THE NON-OBTRUSIVE HISTORICAL ELEMENTS FROM THE
3 STATIONS? SO, CERTAINLY, IN THE GRAND CENTRAL SUBWAY STATION,
4 4, 5, AND 6 LINES. THEY HAVE BEEN ABLE TO PRESERVE THIS,
5 BECAUSE THE SIGNAGE DOES NOT CONFLICT WITH EACH OTHER. SO, I
6 BELIEVE THAT BOTH CAN COEXIST, AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT
7 EVERYBODY IS INCLUDED IN WAYFINDING. WE ALSO WANT TO REMEMBER
8 OUR TRADITION IN HISTORY. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE ONE MORE SPEAKER
11 ONLINE. HOWARD WONG, YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO
12 MINUTES TO SPEAK.

13

14 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU. HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY
15 ADVISORY COUNCIL SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. I THINK WE SHOULD
16 ALSO CONSIDER THE NEED FOR A HIGH VISIBILITY TRANSIT -- [
17 SILENCE]

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOWARD, WE CANNOT HEAR YOU ANYMORE. MAYBE
20 YOU ARE MUTED?

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WELL, MADAM CLERK, WHY DON'T WE GO TO
23 DISCUSSION HERE AT THE BOARD, AND IF YOU ARE ABLE TO RECONNECT
24 WITH HOWARD, WE WILL CERTAINLY RECEIVE HIS PUBLIC COMMENT
25 BEFORE WE CLOSE THIS ITEM OUT.



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OF COURSE. WHY DON'T WE GO TO COMMENTARY
5 FROM OUR COMMISSIONERS HERE. WHY DON'T WE START WITH MICHAEL
6 HURSH, AC TRANSIT.

7

8 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. I DON'T WANT TO SOUND
9 NEGATIVE. AWESOME REPORT. LOVE THE PROGRESS. BUT DO I HAVE A
10 COUPLE OF CONCERNS. IN THE PRESENTATION TALKED ABOUT THE
11 EXPANSION POLICY, HAVING TOP THREE RIDERSHIP REQUIREMENT. I
12 THINK THAT'S A MISTAKE. AND I'LL JUST BE BLUNT, I THINK UNION
13 CITY SHOULD BE ADDED TO THE LIST. I THINK NAPA DEMONSTRATED
14 SMART THINKING BY PARTNERING AND IDENTIFYING SOLANO COUNTY AS
15 AN OPPORTUNITY. I WOULD RATHER SEE US PUT THESE NEW RIDERS,
16 UNION CITY IS A GOOD EXAMPLE, DUMBARTON EXPRESS PALO ALTO AS
17 WELL AS AC TRANSIT BART, PLEASE ADD UNION CITY. IT'S A HUGE
18 SWATH OF POPULATION IF YOU KNOW WHERE PEOPLE LIVE, I THINK WE
19 HAVE LEFT A WHOLE BUNCH OF PEOPLE OUT OF THE OPPORTUNITY TO
20 PARTICIPATE. I DID GET A BRIEFING FROM STAFF I AM TOLD THE
21 STOP SIGNAGE WILL NOT HAVE MAPS. AND THAT'S SOMETHING COMING
22 LATER WITH THE TECHNOLOGY IMPROVEMENT. I'LL GO THROUGH MY
23 QUESTIONS. I UNDERSTAND THERE WILL BE NO FOREIGN TRANSLATION
24 FOR THE PILOTS. I HOPE I'M WRONG. WHERE ARE WE ON SALESFORCE
25 TRANSIT CENTER WAYFINDING. I THINK THESE PILOTS HAVE A HUGE



JULY 22, 2024

1 OPPORTUNITY TO LURE PEOPLE BACK OR ON TO PUBLIC TRANSIT. I
2 HOPE WE WOULDN'T LEAVE SALESFORCE OUT OF THIS. I HOPE WE DO
3 HAVE FOREIGN LANGUAGE TRANSLATIONS, AND PLEASE ADVOCATE THAT
4 YOU ADD UNION CITY TO THE LIST. THANKS CHAIR.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, MIKE. JUMANA AND
7 GORDON, JUST A BRIEF RESPONSE TO MIKE HURSH, AC TRANSIT?

8

9 **GORDON HANSEN:** SURE. I CAN RESPOND TO SOME OF THAT. I PULLED
10 UP OUR ANALYSIS WE USED TO DETERMINE THE SITES AND WE DID IN
11 ALAMEDA COUNTY WE CONSIDERED COLOSSEUM, DUBLIN AND PLEASANTON
12 AND UNION CITY AS OPTIONS SO AS PART OF THE SCREENING PROCESS
13 WE LOOKED AT THEM IN TERMS OF THEIR PROJECT BENEFIT AND FOUND
14 THAT, ON THE WHOLE, THERE WERE SOME POSITIVE ELEMENTS OF UNION
15 CITY, FOR THE REASONS THAT YOU DESCRIBE, BUT THE DUBLIN
16 PLEASANTON MET SOME OF THE REQUIREMENTS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT.
17 SO IT WAS DEFINITELY A CONSIDERATION FOR US, AND WE LOOKED AT
18 IT CLOSELY. THE OTHER QUESTION YOU HAD WAS ABOUT, YEAH, MAPS
19 ON STOP SIGNAGE. SO, I THINK YOU'RE REFERRING TO THE PROTOTYPE
20 SIGNAGE THAT WILL GO ON THE BUS STOP POLES. THAT'S STILL IN
21 ACTIVE DEVELOPMENT. IT -- THE -- THIS IS MORE INFORMATION THAN
22 I CAN REALLY SHARE, BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T MADE A LOT OF THIS
23 INFORMATION PUBLIC OUTSIDE OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY GROUPS AND
24 WORKING GROUPS. BUT LET ME JUST SAY WE ARE CONSIDERING OUR
25 OPTIONS IN TERMS OF WHAT MAKES -- WHAT WOULD PROVIDE THE MOST



JULY 22, 2024

1 BENEFIT TO RIDERS ON A BUS STOP POLE, INCLUDING THE INCLUSION,
2 POTENTIAL INCLUSION OF A MAP OR A SEGMENT OF A MAP. WHILE WE
3 MAY NOT HAVE THAT IN TIME FOR THE PROTOTYPES, IT'S SOMETHING
4 THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING FOR THE STANDARDS AND WILL CONTINUE TO
5 KEEP IT TOP OF MIND FOR CONSIDERATION. YOUR LAST QUESTION WAS
6 A CONCERN ABOUT NO FOREIGN LANGUAGE TRANSLATION FOR THE
7 PILOTS. THIS ALSO IS AN ONGOING DISCUSSION. WE HAVE BEEN --
8 WELL, I WILL SAY, IN TERMS OF THE SIGNAGE, OUR GOAL IS TO
9 REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF OPPORTUNITIES FOR CONFUSION AS MUCH AS
10 POSSIBLE BY REDUCING THE AMOUNT OF TEXT AND WORDS THAT GOES ON
11 THE SIGNS. SO, AS MUCH AS WE CAN GET TO SYMBOLS THAT ARE
12 UNIVERSALLY UNDERSTOOD, OR, I GUESS THE ADAGE AND THE JOKE IS
13 MORE UNIVERSALLY MISUNDERSTOOD -- THE IDEA IS TO FIND THINGS
14 THAT WILL BE EASILY UNDERSTOOD WITHOUT THE NEED FOR TRANSLATED
15 TEXT. HOWEVER, THERE ARE PLACES THAT IT'S REQUIRED. FOR
16 EXAMPLE, WE HAVE WHAT WE CALL SYSTEM INFORMATION UNIT WHICH IS
17 WHERE THE MAPS WILL BE PLACED INSIDE ON THAT WE'LL HAVE TEXT
18 TRANSIT INFORMATION AND BELOW THAT WE'LL HAVE TRANSLATION IN
19 SPANISH AND CHINESE WHICH ARE MTC'S REQUIRED TRANSLATIONS. ON
20 THE MAP ITSELF ALSO FOLLOWING THE SAME APPROACH TO THE EXTENT
21 WE RELY ON SYMBOLS ON THE MAPS AND LEGENDS TO PROVIDE
22 TRANSLATIONS THE WE'RE DOING THAT AS WELL AND THE TRANSLATIONS
23 WILL AGAIN BE IN SPANISH AND CHINESE. THIS WILL BE IMPORTANT
24 FOR US PART OF THE PILOT AND PART OF THE STANDARDS THERE. ARE
25 A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS THAT WE STILL NEED TO TALK ABOUT. THERE



JULY 22, 2024

1 ARE CERTAIN REGIONS AND THAT MAY HAVE OTHER TRANSLATIONS SUCH
2 AS VIETNAMESE OR TAGALOG, TO THE EXTENT THAT WE CAN
3 ACCOMMODATE THOSE BUT IT'S THE CURRENT AND TOP OF MINDS FOR
4 US.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU GORDON. ON THE DAIS I'M GOING
7 TO DO A SCAN IF I DON'T SEE ANYBODY. JEFF?

8

9 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** FIRST OF ALL, I THINK AS YOU ALL KNOW MUNI
10 OFFERED A LOT OF CRITICISM OF THIS PROJECT EARLY ON I WANT TO
11 THANK STAFF FOR LISTENING AND THINKING ABOUT HOW STANDARDS
12 WORK ACROSS THE SPECTRUM OF GEOGRAPHIES IN THE REGION. I DON'T
13 HAVE ANY SPECIFIC COMMENTS ABOUT THE WORK BUT DO I HAVE A
14 CERTAIN ABOUT THE NUMBER OF SITES WE'RE PILOTING AND MAKING
15 SURE THAT YOU HAVE THE CAPACITY TO DELIVER. SO, ONE THING THAT
16 WE STRUGGLE WITH HERE IS THE NEED TO BUILD TRUST WITH POLICY
17 MAKERS IN THE ELECTORATE, THAT WE'RE CAPABLE OF DELIVERING AND
18 DELIVERING ON TIME. SO, I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS
19 PROJECT IS -- THAT SCOPE AND RESOURCES ARE MATCHED AND IF
20 THEY'RE NOT, WE EITHER NEED MORE RESOURCES OR LESS SCOPE.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. GOOD COMMENTS, JEFF. BILL
23 CHURCHILL, COUNTIES CONNECTION.

24



JULY 22, 2024

1 **BILL CHURCHILL:** BILL AND JUMANI A THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT
2 PRESENTATION. I ALSO WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE
3 ENGAGEMENT CORPORATELY AND INDIVIDUALLY WITH THE SMALL
4 OPERATORS. IT WAS VERY EFFECTIVE. I APPRECIATE YOUR
5 WILLINGNESS TO SPENDS TIME WITH THE GROUP, AND I THINK IT WAS
6 REALLY VALUABLE IN HELPING TO SHAPE AND CRAFT WHAT YOU
7 PRESENTED TODAY. SO, FIRST OF ALL, JUST A SIGNIFICANT THANK
8 YOU FOR THAT. SECONDLY, I NOTICED ON ONE OF YOUR EARLIER
9 SLIDES, THERE WAS A REFERENCE TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. AND I
10 DO WANT TO MAKE SURE, AS WE HAVE ALL THESE VARYING EFFORTS
11 THAT WE'RE MAKING WITHIN THE REGION THAT, WE ARE MAKING SURE
12 THAT THERE IS CONNECTIONS BETWEEN THEM. AND, SO, I JUST WANTED
13 TO UNDERSTAND WHETHER OR NOT THE COSTING AND ANY OF THE
14 FRAMEWORKS THAT YOU ARE BUILDING, ARE ADEQUATELY REPRESENTED
15 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ SO THAT WE UNDERSTAND THE COSTING OF
16 THE 2050+ PROJECTS AS WE MOVE FORWARD. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** DENIS MULLIGAN GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE.

19

20 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE WORK AND COLLABORATION.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** SEAMUS? CAROLYN VTA.

23

24 **CAROLYN GONOT:** THANK YOU FOR TAKING A LOOK AND HEARING US ON
25 THE EXPANDING. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT WHAT JEFF SAID DO WE HAVE



JULY 22, 2024

1 THE CAPACITY TO DELIVER. WHICH MAY MEAN, REALLY USING THE
2 RESOURCES IN THE OTHER AGENCIES. SO, I DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW
3 THAT'S WORKING AND MAYBE YOU'RE DOING THAT, BUT HOW ARE YOU
4 USING THE RESOURCES WITHIN OUR AGENCY LIKE CALTRAIN, OTHERS TO
5 DO SOME OF THE WORK THAT MIGHT BE IN THE SOUTH BAY. I WANT TO
6 RESPOND A LITTLE BIT TO -- I KNOW YOU HAVE THE QUESTION ABOUT
7 DIRIDON AND NOW LOOKING AT PALO ALTO, AND I'M ALSO THINKING,
8 OKAY, PALO ALTO MAY BE UNDER CONSTRUCTION, BECAUSE THEY MAY
9 FOOT THROUGH QUARRY ROAD, WHICH YOU DON'T KNOW, BUT THAT WILL
10 ALSO CHANGE THE DYNAMICS OF HOW WE SERVE THAT AREA AND THE
11 ROUTING THERE. BUT THEY ARE AN INTERESTING -- IT IS
12 INTERESTING TO SEE IN TERMS OF HOW YOU DEAL WITH WAYFINDING.
13 AND THE REASON WHY -- AND THE REASON WHY I HAVE ALWAYS HAD
14 THIS CONCERN, PARTICULARLY, BECAUSE I'M, SORT OF, THE -- I
15 HAVE BEEN, SORT OF, ANTI-STANDARD COLORS FOR A NUMBER OF
16 REASONS. AND BECAUSE OUR BUS -- I THINK THERE IS AN ASSUMPTION
17 THAT COLORS DON'T GIVE DISTINCTIONS THAT, IT'S MORE IMPORTANT
18 ABOUT THE SYMBOLS, AND THAT THE COLOR IS JUST ONE REGIONAL
19 NETWORK. BUT I THINK BECAUSE BUSES DON'T ALL COME IN THE SAME
20 WAY, PEOPLE THINK THAT THE TRANSIT CENTER, ALL OF THE BUSES IN
21 THE SAME AREA, THEY AREN'T, THEY AREN'T AT PALO ALTO,
22 INTERMODAL OR DIRIDON OUR BUS RAPID TRANSIT RUNS ALONG THE
23 STREET SO I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU MAKE THE DISTINCTION, VERSUS
24 OUR BUSES FOR VTA THAT END THERE, OR IN A TRANSIT CENTER, AND
25 THE CRUISE BUSES WHICH AREN'T EVEN IN OUR REGION END IN A



JULY 22, 2024

1 CERTAIN AREA, AND AMTRAK BUSES GO SOMEWHERE ELSE. THEY'RE NOT
2 ALL IN THE SAME AREA, SO HOW DO YOU DO A BUS AND WHERE ARE
3 THEY GOING. SO THERE IS INTERESTING DYNAMIC IN TERMS OF THAT.
4 AND CONCERNED ABOUT CONCERN, AND I UNDERSTAND THAT SOUNDS
5 STUPID, I'M NOT GREAT IN INTO THE BLUE AND GOLD EVERYTHING
6 GOES BLUE AND GOLD BECAUSE I THINK THE COLOR DOES LINK TO THE
7 AGENCY. IT'S GOING TO BE A CHALLENGE AND I THINK IT'S
8 INTERESTING THAT'S THE REASON DIRIDON AND PALO ALTO ARE
9 INTERESTING FOR US. AGAIN I'M NOT SURE ABOUT THE CONSTRUCTION,
10 BECAUSE WE MIGHT BE IN CONSTRUCTION PALO ALTO WORSE THAN WE
11 WOULD BE FOR DIRIDON, AND THE IDEA THAT YOU'RE ALSO CALTRAIN,
12 CAPITAL CORRIDOR AND VTA LIGHT RAIL AND ALL IN THERE AS WELL
13 ALONG WITH THE OTHER BUS MODES. IT WILL BE CHALLENGING AND
14 INTERESTING BUT IT'S THE WAY WE DO IT. THE OTHER THING ABOUT
15 WAYFINDING, A BIG PORTION ALSO IS TO UNDERSTAND WHICH WAY TO
16 GO TO HIT A MAJOR GENERATOR. FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN YOU COME OUT,
17 WHICH WAY IS SAP? NOW, YOU CAN, SORT OF, SEE IT BUT CAN'T
18 NECESSARILY IT SOMETIMES WHERE YOU'RE AT AND ALSO HOW DO YOU
19 GET TO THE DOWNTOWN WHICH DIRECTION IS DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE. I
20 GUESS THOSE ARE THE QUESTIONS TOO. SO DOES THE WAYFINDING EVER
21 HELP YOU WITH MAJOR GENERATORS WHEN YOU COME OUT OF THE
22 STATIONS? AND THAT'S SOMETHING ELSE THAT I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT.
23 BECAUSE THAT'S ACTUALLY CRITICAL TOO. BECAUSE I NOTICE WHEN I
24 COME OUT OF BART STATIONS I'M ALWAYS TRYING TO FIGURE OUT,
25 OKAY, WHICH -- I DON'T KNOW WHICH WAY TO GO OUT TO GET TO THE



JULY 22, 2024

1 -- I HAVE TO REMEMBER WHICH WAY THE TRAIN COMES SO I KNOW
2 WHICH DIRECTION THE FERRY TERMINAL IS SO I KNOW WHICH
3 DIRECTION THE TRAIN COMES OUT. YOU FIGURE IT OUT BUT THERE'S
4 NOT THAT IDEA OF THE SIDES. SO THOSE ARE GENERAL COMMENTS.
5 THINKING ABOUT THE MAJOR GENERATORS MIGHT SOMETHING TO THINK
6 ABOUT AND THEN LAST THING HOW WOULD YOU RUN UP TO THE PILOT
7 PROGRAM?

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GORDON WHY DON'T YOU TAKE THAT LAST
10 QUESTION, JUMANA AND THEN THE OTHER ONES.

11

12 **CAROLYN GONOT:** ARE MORE INFORMATIVE.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** DIRECTOR CHOY WILL MAP THIS OUT. THE
15 COMMENTARY, WE'RE NOT IGNORING IT. THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE IT
16 BACK, SIFT THROUGH AND POST PROCESS. SO YOU DON'T NEED TO
17 RESPOND TO EVERY SINGLE THING.

18

19 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YOU DON'T NEED TO ANSWER. I GUESS THE HOW LONG
20 IS ONE.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THAT'S LEGIT. GO AHEAD, GORDON, AS BEST
23 YOU CAN.

24



JULY 22, 2024

1 **GORDON HANSEN:** CERTAINLY. THIS PERTAINS TO THE PROTOTYPES IS
2 THAT THE IDEA IS WE'RE PUTTING NEW SIGNS IN THE GROUND, AND
3 THEY WILL BE THERE PERMANENTLY. NOW, THERE MAY BE ADJUSTMENTS
4 THAT WE MAKE AND THE PROTOTYPES FOR SURE BECAUSE THEY'RE FIRST
5 DRAFT, BUT THE IDEA WITH THE PILOT SIGNAGE IS THEY WILL BE IN
6 THE GROUNDS. WE WILL HAVE DONE ALL THE WORK WITH STAFF TO
7 ADDRESS A LOT OF THE QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS THAT YOU'RE
8 BRINGING UP THAT WE DON'T HAVE TO TALK ABOUT TODAY. WE'LL BE
9 TALKING ABOUT THAT IN ADVANCE. WE'LL BE USING STANDARDS WHICH
10 WILL BE BASED ON CONVERSATIONS AND COLLABORATION WITH YOU AND
11 YOUR STAFF TO BE CREATING REALLY WHAT WE FEEL WILL BE THE NEXT
12 GENERATION OF SIGNAGE. SO, IT'S REALLY 2025 INTO THE FUTURE,
13 SAME WITH THE END TO END BUS ROUTES, STARTING IN 2026, INTO
14 THE FUTURE, UNTIL THE NEXT TYPE THAT WE NEED TO PROVIDE
15 UPDATES, WHENEVER THERE IS A SERVICE CHANGE, OR MAKE
16 ADJUSTMENTS IF THERE IS NEW SERVICES. DOES THAT HELP?

17

18 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YEAH. THAT ACTUALLY DOES HELP. SO THERE ISN'T
19 AN END THERE MIGHT BE CHANGES OVER TIME WITH THE SIGNAGE.

20

21 **GORDON HANSEN:** YES.

22

23 **CAROLYN GONOT:** AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE WHERE WE HAVE SYSTEMS
24 THAT TOUCH UPON LIKE OUR VRT RUNS RIGHT AT THE DIRIDON AT THE



JULY 22, 2024

1 STREET IT SERVES DIRIDON, THAT THOSE SERVICES ARE COUNTED AS
2 WELL.

3

4 **GORDON HANSEN:** YES DEFINITELY.

5

6 **CAROLYN GONOT:** AS THE ONES THAT, SORT OF, GO INTO A TRANSIT
7 CENTER.

8

9 **GORDON HANSEN:** DEFINITELY. THAT'S ONE OF THE BIG QUESTIONS
10 THAT WE HAVE. WE'RE ACTUALLY STARTING TO ENCOUNTER IT WITH OUR
11 MINI PROTOTYPE AT POWELL THAT WE'RE WORKING ON NOW. AND THAT
12 IS WHERE'S THE STATION ENVELOPE. AND IT ACTUALLY, YOU COULD
13 CONSIDER IT TO EXTEND TO WHERE THOSE CONNECTIONS ARE, WHERE
14 THE TIME POINTS ARE, OR WHERE THERE ARE MAJOR CONNECTIONS
15 BETWEEN RAIL SERVICES AND BRT. SO, I THINK AT DIRIDON WE WOULD
16 ABSOLUTELY CONSIDER THAT A STATION MAY BE STOPPING FOR DIRIDON
17 BUT MAYBE ABOUT A HALF MILE OR FULL BLOCK AWAY. I THINK WE
18 WOULD -- WELL, WHAT I WOULD SAY FOR SURE IS WE WOULD CONSIDER
19 AND CONSULT WITH YOUR STAFF TO ENSURE WHAT SHOULD BE PART OF
20 THE PILOT AND WHAT SHOULD NOT.

21

22 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, GORDON. LET'S GO
23 OVER TO MY LEFT HERE, KATHLEEN SULLIVAN OF MARIN TRANSIT, THEN
24 WE'LL DOUBLE BACK TO VICE CHAIR CHAN AT THE END.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** ECHO ALL THE GREAT WORK. I KNOW YOU HAVE WORKED
2 CLOSELY WITH ALL OF US AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU
3 ON THE PILOT AT LARKSPUR ALTHOUGH SMART AND FOR MENTIONED
4 THERE IS A LOT OF BUS STOPS THAT NEED TO BE INTEGRATED, OF
5 COURSE. YEAH.

6

7 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ALL RIGHT. SAM SARGENT, CALTRAIN.

8

9 **SAM SARGENT:** JUST QUICKLY, THANKS TO JUMANA AND GORDON.
10 CALTRAIN IS APPRECIATIVE OF HOW YOU HAVE BROUGHT ALONG OUR
11 STAFF DURING THIS PROCESS, IN CONCURRENCE WITH POLICY MAKERS
12 AND COMMUNITY LEADERS, AND WE'RE GOOD WITH THE LOCATIONS THAT
13 WERE SELECTED, BUT WE DO WANT TO BE MINDFUL OF ANY CONCERNS
14 THAT VTA MIGHT HAVE AT DIRIDON. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ANDY FREMIER, MTC.

17

18 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I, TOO, APPRECIATE
19 THE PRESENTATION AND REALLY ALSO APPRECIATE HOW MUCH REACHING
20 OUT TO ALL OF THE AGENCIES YOU HAVE DONE. THESE DON'T HAVE TO
21 BE ANSWERED TODAY, BUT MY QUESTIONS ARE AROUND PROJECT
22 DELIVERY ELEMENT AND MAKING SURE WE'RE NOT MAKING TOO -- WELL,
23 I ASSUME THAT AGENCY PERMITTING PROCESS IS GOING TO BE A
24 CHALLENGE UNDER ALL CIRCUMSTANCES, ESPECIALLY WITH THE LOCAL
25 CITIES INVOLVED IN SOME PLACES, AS WELL. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 KNOW MORE ABOUT WHAT WE'RE DOING TO MAKE SURE PERMITTING
2 DOESN'T BECOME CRITICAL PATH. AND THEN, ALSO, SOME OF THE
3 LESSONS WE LEARNED AROUND THE HUB SIGNAGE PROGRAM BEFORE. I
4 THINK ARE IN -- I GUESS THEY'RE EULOGIZED AT THE TRANSIT
5 CENTER HERE, WHERE WEREN'T ABLE TO KEEP UP WITH THE PROJECTS
6 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE FOLLOWING THE DESIGN GUIDELINES AND
7 SUPPORTING THAT EFFORT. AND THE SAME THINK WILL HAPPEN AS
8 SIGNS GET TAKEN OUT. I'M INTERESTED IN MAKING SURE WE'RE SET
9 UP TO DEAL WITH PROJECT DELIVERY PROPERLY AND SUPPORT ALL OF
10 THE INDEPENDENT PROJECTS THAT ARE GOING ON. AND I THINK IT'S
11 SIMILAR TO JEFF'S QUESTION, IT MAKES ME NERVOUS THAT WE'RE NOT
12 QUITE RESOURCED OR PREPARING FOR IT PROPERLY.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS.
15 ANDY. VICE CHAIR CHAN.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** THANK YOU GORDON AND JUMANA. ECHO
18 EVERYONE'S THANKS. IT'S A COMPLICATED PROJECT. I'M GOING TO BE
19 REPEATING SOME OF THE COMMENTS FROM MAY BUT MAYBE IN A
20 DIFFERENT LIGHT. IN TERMS OF THE RESOURCE, WHEN WE HAVE
21 EXPANDED AND ADD ANOTHER SEVEN LOCATIONS, PRESUMABLY THERE IS
22 THE FUNDING THAT HAS BEEN SET ASIDE AND THAT CAN BE
23 ACCOMMODATED, BUT THAT'S PRIMARILY ON THE CAPITAL SIDE, AND I
24 KNOW WE TALKED ABOUT THE RESOURCES SO ONCE THESE PROJECTS ARE
25 IMPLEMENTED OR PUTS IN PLACE AT THE STATIONS, WHO IS GOING TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 BE OPERATING AND MAINTAINING THEM? IS THAT THE AGENCIES THAT
2 WILL BE LOCATED AT THESE VARIOUS LOCATIONS IF THE CUSTOMERS
3 HAS ISSUES OR PROBLEMS? DO THEY CONTACT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
4 OR CONTACT MTC? WOULD LIKE TO KIND OF HEAR ABOUT THAT. AND
5 SOME OF THE STATIONS ARE NOT SELECTED, BUT LET'S SAY WE ARE
6 INTERESTED IN CHANGING OUT THE SIGNAGE FOR WHATEVER REASON,
7 I'LL JUST SAY MAYBE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, IF I AM LOOKING AT
8 SOMETHING OVER AT PALO ALTO, IT'S NOT ONE WAS THE SELECTED
9 STATIONS RIGHT NOW K WE GO AHEAD AND DO SO, AND DO SO IN
10 ACCORDANCE WITH THE CONCEPT THAT'S PUT IN. SO, WHAT'S THE --
11 HOW DO WE HANDLE THAT WHEN IT'S NOT NECESSARILY ONE OF THE
12 PILOT PROJECTS, BUT THAT WE MAY BE LOOKING AT IMPROVING OR, AT
13 LEAST, UPDATING SOME OF THE SIGNAGES? THOSE ARE MY PRIMARY
14 QUESTIONS AND QUESTIONS I HAVE. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JUMANA NABTI:** REGARDING WHO OPERATES AND MAINTAINS SIGNAGE
17 AFTER IT'S INSTALLED THE SIGNAGE WOULD BE OWNED BY THE
18 OPERATOR THAT OWNS THAT HUB SO THE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE
19 OF THAT WOULD BE WITH AGENCY. AS CURRENTLY IS THE CASE. SO
20 BASICALLY WOULD NOT BE ADDING RESPONSIBILITY BUT CHANGING THE
21 GRAPHICS AND TYPES OF SIGNAGE POSSIBLY BUT WOULD REMAIN WITH
22 THE OPERATOR. GORDON HAS AN ADDITIONAL POINT HE WANTS TO MAKE.

23

24 **GORDON HANSEN:** YES. THAT CERTAINLY IS THE LONG-TERM VISION
25 WHICH IS TO SAY THAT MTC IS MAKING A SIZABLE INVESTMENT IN A



JULY 22, 2024

1 NEW REGIONAL SET OF SIGNAGE STANDARDS. ONE OF THE PURPOSES OF
2 THESE PILOT PROJECTS IS TO FLESH OUT AND ANSWER THE VERY
3 QUESTIONS THAT YOU ARE ARTICULATING NOW. WHICH IS WHAT ARE THE
4 AGREEMENTS REQUIRED FOR OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. WHAT ARE
5 ANY LEGAL IMPLICATIONS, IF ANY. WHAT IS THE ROLE OF MTC IN
6 THAT? AND THE REAL QUESTION THAT WE HAVE, AND IT'S A QUESTION
7 AT THIS POINT, IS ON A PLACE WHERE, ON A -- LET'S JUST TAKE A
8 BUS STOP POLL THAT CURRENTLY HAS THREE AGENCIES SERVING IT.
9 WELL, RIGHT NOW, EACH ONE OF THEM HAS THEIR OWN SIGN THAT THEY
10 INDEPENDENTLY MAINTAIN. WELL, UNDER OUR NEW WAYFINDING
11 STANDARD, THE IDEAS IS TO CENTRALIZE AND HAVE ALL THAT
12 INFORMATION IN ONE SIGN. AND THAT HAS NOT BEEN DONE BEFORE.
13 SO, WE DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER QUITE YET AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE
14 ACTIVELY TALKING ABOUT NOW AS PART OF THE PROTOTYPES IN EL
15 CERRITO AND SANTA ROSA AND IT'S WHAT WE'LL CONTINUE TO DO AND
16 HAVE CONVERSATIONS AROUND IN THE PILOT STAGE AS WELL.

17

18 **JUMANA NABTI:** AND I'LL ADD THAT PART OF THE PROJECTS WILL BE
19 LOOKING AT TOOLS TO MAKE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE EASIER FOR
20 EXAMPLE, DEVELOPMENT OF AN AUTOMATED ART WORKING TOOL LOOKING
21 AT ASSET MANAGEMENT AND REALLY HOW TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR AN
22 OPERATOR IF A SIGN GETS VANDALIZED OR NEEDS TO BE CHANGED PULL
23 UP THE GRAPHIC FILES AND MAKE EDITS AS NEEDED, HAVE THE
24 SPECIFICATIONS READY SO THAT CAN BE QUICKLY ORDERED AND
25 REPLACED.



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **GORDON HANSEN:** ONE MORE THING?

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** LET'S HOLD UP GORDON. IF I LET THE TWO
5 OF YOU GOING WE'D BE HERE ALL AFTERNOON GOING BACK AND FORTH.
6 LET'S HOLD OFF. WITH THAT YOU'RE THE SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT
7 HERE. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD ON THIS. THIS IS AN
8 INFORMATIONAL ITEM. YOU HAD SOME GOOD COMMENTS HERE AND YOU
9 HEARD THEMES WHETHER IT WAS PROJECT DELIVERY, OR OVERPROMISE
10 UNDER-DELIVER FIGURE THAT STUFF OUT RIGHT. I GUESS MY COMMENTS
11 ARE TO MELANIE, DIRECTOR CHOY, YOU CAN SENSE THERE IS A LOT OF
12 ENERGY, AT THE DAIS BACK AND FORTH MY SENSE IS BECAUSE THIS IS
13 OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY DO TWO THINGS IMPROVE CURRENT CUSTOMER
14 EXPERIENCE AND DRIVE RIDERSHIP IN THE FUTURE. THERE IS
15 APPETITE HERE LET'S FIGURE OUT WHAT THE CADENCE IS ON BRINGING
16 TOPICS BACK. CERTAINLY ONE IN THE NEAR FUTURE ON DELIVERY, AND
17 YOU HAVE HURSH YOU SHOULD ADD UNION CITY, AND TUMLIN NEXT TO
18 HIM SAYING YOU KNOW LET'S NOT OVEREXTEND OURSELVES MAYBE
19 GORDON, JUMANA, YOU ALREADY KNOW. LET'S NAVIGATE, AGAIN,
20 GORDON YOU AND JUMANA YOUR COMMIT TO THE BAY AREA PUBLIC
21 TRANSPORTATION IS SECOND TO NONE. THANK YOU FOR THAT. OKAY.
22 THANK YOU. AND, MADAM CLERK, I BELIEVE THAT'S GOING TO CLOSE
23 US OUT ON ITEM NUMBER 3A, THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. GORDON,
24 AGAIN. THANKS, JUMANA, THANK YOU. BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3B
25 WHICH IS TRANSIT 2050+. AND THIS IS OUR DRAFT PROJECT



JULY 22, 2024

1 PERFORMANCE AND DRAFT NETWORK. AND, SO, KARA AND ANDY ARE
2 GOING TO LEAD OUR DISCUSSION HERE. AGAIN COUNCIL MEMBERS HERE
3 AT THE DAIS, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM AND WE'LL HAVE A
4 NICE DISCUSSION WITH CARA AND ANDY. WITH THAT, MELANIE ARE YOU
5 KICKING THIS OFTEN OR STRAIGHT TO KARA?

6

7 **KARA VUICICH:** GOOD AFTERNOON REGIONAL NETWORK COUNCIL MEMBERS
8 AND CHAIR POWERS AND VICE CHAIR CHAN. I'M KARA VUICICH,
9 PRINCIPLE PLANNER, HERE AT MTC ABAG AND COPROJECT MANAGER
10 ALONG WITH ANDY METZ.

11

12 **ANDY METZ:** I'M ANDY METZ PRINCIPLE PLANNER AT AC TRANSIT AND
13 CO PM ON THIS PROJECT.

14

15 **KARA VUICICH:** GREAT. WE'RE HERE TODAY TO PRESENT ON THE
16 PROJECT PERFORMANCE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+. SO, IF WE COULD GO TO
17 THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS MOST OF YOU WILL RECALL, TRANSIT
18 2050+ IS A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
19 TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS. AND IT RESPOND TO ACTION
20 NUMBER 18 FROM THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO
21 FUNDS, DEVELOP, AND ADOPT A BAY AREA CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN.
22 AND THIS REALLY REPRESENTS A MAJOR CHANGE FROM THE WAY THAT WE
23 HAVE APPROACHED TRANSIT STRATEGY AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT IN
24 PRIOR PLAN CYCLES. IN LARGE PART BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
25 VERY CLOSELY WITH A PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM, MADE UP OF STAFF



JULY 22, 2024

1 FROM THE SEVEN LARGE OPERATORS AND THE FOUR SMALL TRANSIT
2 OPERATORS. AND WE BEGAN, YOU KNOW, WORKING WITH PROJECT
3 MANAGEMENT TEAM AND OUR COPROJECT MANAGER, ANDY, ANDY METZ. IN
4 2023 WE DEVELOPED A SET OF GOALS FOR TRANSIT TRYST PLUS WHICH
5 ARE TO DEVELOP AN INTEGRATED WELL CONNECTED NETWORK TO RECOVER
6 AND GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP TO IMPROVE TRANSIT RELIABLE AND
7 SPEED AND REDUCE BARRIERS TO USING TRANSIT. PRESENTED TO THE
8 RNM COUNCIL THE INITIAL FINDINGS FROM THE NEEDS GAPS AND
9 OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS WHICH FOCUSED ON ASSESSING REGIONAL
10 POST-PANDEMIC TRAVEL PATTERNS IN ORDER TO IDENTIFY WHERE
11 ADDITIONAL INVESTMENTS MAY BE NEEDED IN THE NEAR-TERM MOST
12 GAPS ARE FILLED BY CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN
13 IDENTIFIED WE HAVE WORKED WITH MANAGEMENT TO DEVELOP NEW
14 PROJECT CONCEPTS IN PARTICULAR FOR THE SAN MATEO AND DUMBARTON
15 BRIDGE CORRIDORS. THE NEAR TERM NEEDS AND GAPS ASSESSMENT AS
16 WELL AS RESULTS TO THE PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT ARE USED TO
17 DEVELOP THE DRAFT TRANSIT 25 NETWORK PRESENTATION TODAY.
18 FIRST, SOME FURTHER DETAIL ON THE DRAFT PROJECT PERFORMANCE
19 ASSESSMENT. JUST TO START, THE TRANSPORTATION -- BECAUSE THE
20 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA IS REQUIRED TO BE
21 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED, WE USE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT TO
22 UNDERSTAND THE RELATIVE BENEFITS OF LARGER SCALE
23 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS, WHICH WE DEFINE AS THOSE WITH
24 TOTAL LIFE CYCLE COST OF \$250 MILLION OR MORE UNDER A WIDE
25 RANGE OF POTENTIAL FUTURE CONDITIONS. WE MAINTAINED AND USED



JULY 22, 2024

1 THE SAME PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY THAT WAS
2 USED FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN 2019. WHICH ASSESSED PROJECT
3 BENEFITS UNDER THREE VERY DIFFERENT POTENTIAL 2050 FUTURES.
4 AND THESE ARE THE THREE FUTURE WHAT IF SCENARIOS ON THE SLIDE.
5 THE RISING TIDES FALLING FINANCES FUTURE REPRESENTS CONDITIONS
6 MOST LIKE THE CURRENT POST-PANDEMIC FUTURE TRAJECTORY WHEREAS
7 THE TWO OTHER FUTURES CLEAN AND GREEN AND BACK TO THE FUTURE
8 REPRESENT 2050 FUTURES WITH DIFFERENT TYPES OF DEMANDS FOR OUR
9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM DUE TO RESPECTIVE DIFFERENCES IN
10 EXTERNAL FORCES. AND THEN LASTLY IN TERMS OF THE THREE CORE
11 COMPONENTS OF THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT FIRST IS
12 BENEFIT-COST ASSESSMENT THAT COMPARES CAPITAL OPERATING AND
13 LIFE CYCLE COST OF A PROJECT TO A SET OF MONETIZED BENEFITS
14 FOR ALL THREE 2050 FUTURES, AN EQUITY ASSESSMENT THAT SEEKS TO
15 UNDERSTAND WHICH INCOME GROUPS MIGHT BENEFIT FROM MOST
16 PROJECTS ACROSS ALL 2050 FUTURES, AS WELL AS WHETHER A PROJECT
17 WOULD DIRECTLY SERVE AN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY AS CURRENTLY
18 DEFINED IN 2024. THEN, LASTLY, INCLUDES QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT
19 TO IDENTIFY WHETHER A PROJECT ALIGNS WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA
20 GUIDING PRINCIPLES OF CREATING AN AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERSE
21 HEALTHY AND VIBRANT. SO, I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THE PROJECT
22 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IS ONE COMPONENT THAT WE USED TO
23 DEVELOP THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. AND, IN PART, BECAUSE
24 IT HAS SOME LIMITATIONS, IT LOOKS AT INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS AS
25 OPPOSED TO GROUPS OF PROJECTS OR ENTIRE TRANSIT NETWORK AS A



JULY 22, 2024

1 WHOLE. AND FOR SOME TYPES OF PROJECTS SUCH AS MAJOR
2 TRANSFORMATIVE RAIL INVESTMENT TYPE OF PROJECTS, FOR EXAMPLE,
3 IT DOESN'T FULLY ACCOUNT FOR SOME TYPES OF SOCIETAL BENEFITS
4 SUCH AS POTENTIAL IMPACTS ON LAND USE ECONOMIC BENEFITS OR
5 OTHER TYPES OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BENEFITS. IN ORDER TO
6 ADDRESS THE FACT THAT THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT LOOKS
7 AT INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS WE'LL BE CONDUCTING A NETWORK
8 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE FINAL PLANNED
9 BAY AREA 2050+ PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE
10 INTEGRATED NETWORK OF TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS
11 IMPROVES PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES COMPARED TO FUTURE BASELINE. AND
12 WE'LL LOOK AT THINGS LIKE ACCESS TO JOBS, OVERALL
13 ACCESSIBILITY FOR ALL TRAVELERS TO ALL DESTINATIONS ACROSS THE
14 REGION ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS FOR EQUITY PRIORITY
15 RESIDENTS, INCREASES IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND MODE SHARE,
16 REDUCTIONS IN VMT, AND LOOKING AT TRANSIT VERSUS AUTO TRAVEL
17 TIMES ON SELECT ORIGIN AND DESTINATION PAIRS. NEXT SLIDE
18 PLEASE. HIGHLIGHTS FROM OUR FINDINGS FROM THE PROJECT
19 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. FIRST IS THE EXTERNAL CONDITIONS,
20 THINGS LIKE ECONOMIC GROWTH, LEVELS OF REMOTE WORK, THE
21 GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION OF JOBS AND HOMES LEVELS OF AUTONOMOUS
22 VEHICLES HAVE EFFECTS ON PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES, AND CREATE
23 HEADWINDS IN TERMS OF ACCOMPLISHMENTS FOR OUR FUTURE
24 TRANSPORTATION GOALS. GENERAL LOWER COST TRANSIT ARE MOST
25 RESILIENT ACROSS THE FUTURES AND TEND TO BE EQUITABLE IN TERMS



JULY 22, 2024

1 OF WHICH INCOME GROUPS BENEFIT FROM THEM. RAIL MEGA PROJECTS
2 PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT BENEFITS PARTICULARLY IN THE 2050 FUTURE
3 SCENARIOS WITH ROBUST GROWTH AND ALSO HAVE SIGNIFICANT COST
4 AND COSTS CONTINUE TO GROW AND ARE IMPACTED BY EFFECTS OF
5 INFLATION. WE FIND THAT SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS THINGS LIKE
6 FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS ON EXISTING TRANSIT LINES AND EXPANSION
7 TRANSIT SERVICE THAT CURRENTLY HAVE LIMITED EXISTING TRANSIT
8 SERVICE GENERALLY PERFORM BETTER ACROSS A RANGE OF FUTURES AND
9 LASTLY PRICING WE HAVE A NUMBER OF PRICING PROJECTS WE
10 ASSESSED THOSE DO HAVE AN IMPACT ON TRAVEL BEHAVIOR AND DO
11 HAVE AN AFFECT ON CONGESTION AND THEY GENERALLY PERFORM BETTER
12 HOWEVER WHEN THEY INCLUDE THINGS LIKE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS
13 THAT PROVIDE ADDITIONAL MOBILITY OPTIONS PARTICULARLY FOR LOW-
14 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, AS I MENTIONED
15 PREVIOUSLY, THE PLANNED BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT WHICH
16 SERVES AS OUR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN IS REQUIRED TO BE
17 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED ANTICIPATED REVENUES. AND THE DRAFT
18 REVENUE ESTIMATE STARTS WITH EXISTING ANTICIPATED REVENUES
19 FROM ALL LOCAL REGIONAL STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING SOURCES.
20 THESE ARE REPRESENTED BY THE LARGE PORTION OF THE PIE CHART
21 AND TOTAL APPROXIMATELY \$409 BILLION. THIS PLAN INCLUDES
22 SIGNIFICANT NEW REVENUE SOURCES IN ADDITION TO ANTICIPATED
23 REVENUE SOURCES OVER THE PLAN HORIZON REPRESENTED BY THE
24 SMALLER PORTION OF THE PIE CHART TOTALING APPROXIMATELY \$86
25 BILLION THESE INCLUDE A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, ALL



JULY 22, 2024

1 LANE TOLLING ON FREEWAYS, PARKING PRICING AND ALL GROWTH
2 GEOGRAPHIES REGIONAL MILEAGE BASED USER FEE AND FUTURE FEDERAL
3 OR STATE STIMULUS FUNDING BILL. ANDY WILL PRESENT THE NEXT
4 SLIDE FOR THE PRESENTATION. THESE REVENUES ENABLE US TO PUT
5 FORWARD A DRAFT SET OF TRANSIT STRATEGIES INVESTMENTS THAT NOT
6 ONLY MAINTAIN EXISTING TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS BUT ALSO MAJOR
7 IMPROVEMENTS ON TRANSIT NETWORK INTEGRATION SAFETY AND
8 SECURITY, SPEED AND FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY AND EXPANSION OF
9 THE SYSTEM TO SERVE NEW OR GROWING TRAVEL MARKETS. I'LL TURN
10 IT OVER TO ANDY.

11

12 **ANDY METZ:** ON THIS SLIDE WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF
13 THINGS, BOTH FOR OUR TRANSIT STRATEGY AND THE AMOUNT OF
14 FUNDING WE'RE ASSUMING FOR NEW TRANSIT PROJECTS. SO FAR
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AT \$496 BILLION WE HAD IN OUR PRIEST
16 PLANNED BAY AREA CYCLE THAT ALSO DOES IMPACT THE \$74 BILLION
17 THE AMOUNT WE HAVE FOR THE NEW TRANSIT STRATEGIES SO IT'S
18 ABOUT THE NUMBER HALF OF WHAT WE HAD IN THE PREVIOUS PLANNED
19 BAY AREA CYCLE. FROM THAT \$74 BILLION IS ON THE LEFT HERE. OF
20 COURSE, WE HAVE THE MTC LONG-STANDING FIX IT FIRST POLICY
21 THAT'S PART STRATEGY T-1, THE LION'S SHARE OF THE FUNDS. THEN
22 THE ALLIANCE STRATEGY ON THE LEFT, SIMILAR TO THE TRANSIT
23 STRATEGIES IN THE LAST PLANNED BAY AREA CYCLE. TRANSIT
24 STRATEGY T-2, WHICH IS IMPROVING RIDER EXPERIENCE THROUGH
25 TRANSIT NETWORK INTEGRATION INVOLVES A LOT OF OUR REGIONAL



JULY 22, 2024

1 PROJECTS. ONE THAT JUST PRESENTED AND ONE THAT'S ABOUT TO
2 PRESENT THAT INCLUDES MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PARATRANSIT THEN
3 ALSO COORDINATED FARE. SO, THAT'S WHERE THAT 8 BILLION COMES
4 FROM. TRANSIT STRATEGY 3-T IS AROUND THE RIDER EXPERIENCE
5 THROUGH TRANSFER TIMING AT KEY REGIONAL HUBS. THAT WOULD
6 INCLUDE BOTH THE RESOURCES TO BE ABLE TO DO THAT RESEARCH AND
7 THEN ALSO OPERATIONAL AND CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS AT THOSE KEY
8 HUBS. T4 WHICH IS NOT A TRANSIT STRATEGY THAT WAS INVOLVED IN
9 THE LAST PLANNED BAY AREA CYCLE, BUT BECAUSE OF THE VARIOUS
10 COMMITTEE MEETINGS THAT WE HAVE HAD OVER THE LAST YEAR ON
11 TRANSIT 2050+, INCLUDING THIS ONE, AS WELL AS FEEDBACK FROM
12 OUR LAST ROUND OF PUBLIC OUTREACH AND FROM OUR OPERATOR LED
13 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM, WE HAVE DECIDED TO INCLUDE ENHANCED
14 SECURITY, SAFETY, AND CLEANLINESS ON TRANSIT AS A NEW AND KEY
15 STRATEGY FOR THIS CYCLE. AND THEN STRATEGY T10 AND T11, WHICH
16 ARE ENHANCED TRANSIT FREQUENCY AND EXPAND TRANSIT SERVICES
17 THROUGHOUT THE REGION ARE WHERE YOU'RE GOING TO FIND THE
18 MAJORITY OF THE PROJECTS IN ATTACHMENT D, WHICH WE WON'T GO
19 OVER IN THIS PARTICULAR PRESENTATION, BUT, AGAIN, IS INCLUDED
20 IN THE MATERIALS, ENHANCED TRANSIT FREQUENCY WHERE YOU FIND
21 MOST OF THOSE FREQUENCY BOOST TYPE PROJECTS AND EXPAND TRANSIT
22 SERVICES WHERE YOU SEE MORE OF THOSE LARGER CAPITAL COST
23 PROJECTS LIKE RAIL EXPANSIONS AND BRT EXPANSIONS. THAT
24 DISTINCTION THERE WAS REALLY SPEARHEADED BY OUR OPERATOR LED
25 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM, AND IT REALLY FITS NICELY INTO OUR



JULY 22, 2024

1 NEXT SLIDE. WHICH IS OUR ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES FOR TRANSIT
2 2050+. SO, IN THE NEAR-TERM, TALKING ABOUT OUR QUICK AND
3 IMPACTFUL UPGRADES, THESE ARE PROJECTS THAT PLAN TO OPEN 2035
4 OR SOONER, AND THEN OUR LONG-TERM EXPANSION FOR FUTURE
5 GENERATION TYPE PROJECTS WHICH WILL BE IN OPENING YEAR 2036
6 THROUGH 2050. NOW ONE THING I WANT TO STATE BEFORE WE GO INTO
7 A FEW MAP SLIDES THAT SHOW THE NEW PROJECTS WE HAVE AND THE
8 DIFFERENCES BETWEEN OUR CURRENT NETS WORK AND OUR TRANSIT
9 2050+ NETWORK, IS THAT THESE ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES ARE JUST
10 ONE FACTOR OF MANY THAT GO INTO DECIDING WHAT PROJECTS GO INTO
11 OUR DRAFT NETWORK. SO, KARA HAS ALREADY ALLUDED TO A FEW OF
12 THESE COMPONENTS BUT OF COURSE WE HAD NEEDS GAPS AND
13 OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS TO IDENTIFY THOSE SPEED AND FREQUENCY
14 GAPS. WE HAD OUR PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT TO TALK ABOUT
15 HOW PROJECTS SERVE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, AS WELL AS
16 THEIR BENEFIT-COST RATIO, DISCOVERING AND WORKING WITH
17 AGENCIES TO KNOW THEIR NEEDS, AS WELL AS GEOGRAPHIC SPREAD,
18 AND OF COURSE REALIZING THAT COMPARED TO OUR LAST ROUND OF
19 PLANNED BAY AREA, WE ARE WORKING WITH SIGNIFICANTLY LESS
20 FUNDING. SO, ON THE NEXT SLIDE, THIS HIGHLIGHTS ALL OF THE NEW
21 PROJECTS WITHIN OUR DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. I'LL ORIENT
22 YOU A LITTLE BIT TO THIS PARTICULAR SLIDE. THE -- BECAUSE
23 YOU'RE GOING TO SEE IT A FEW MORE TIMES SO YOU MIGHT AS WELL
24 GET TO KNOW IT. THE WHITE CIRCLES, TOWN AND NEIGHBORHOOD
25 NAMES, THOSE REFERENCE A LARGER TRAVEL SHED AND ALL THE LINES



JULY 22, 2024

1 IN BETWEEN THOSE DON'T NECESSARILY REPRESENT A SINGLE CORRIDOR
2 BUT POTENTIAL LINKS IN BETWEEN THOSE TRAVEL SHEDS. THIS MAP
3 SHOWS A STYLIZED MAP OF THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA AND THEN
4 HIGHLIGHTS THE LOCAL BUS PROJECTS, THAT'S YOUR HIGHLIGHTED
5 LIGHT YELLOW. YOUR BRT, LRT AND RAPID, ORANGE, EXPRESS BUS
6 FERRY IN BLUE, AND DOTTED LINE ARE SPECIFICALLY THE FERRIES,
7 AND YOUR BLACK LINE IS THE HEAVY RAIL. AGAIN THIS IS
8 REPRESENTING ALL NEW PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE LIFE OF THE PLAN.
9 NOW, ON THE FOLLOWING SLIDES, IT'S -- I THINK REALLY IMPORTANT
10 TO MAKE THAT DISTINCTION IN WHAT WE ARE SEEING BETWEEN THE
11 CURRENT NETWORK AND THE DRAFT NETWORK. SO IF WE CAN GO TO THE
12 NEXT SLIDE? WE'RE GOING TO APPROXIMATE GO OVER TWO DIFFERENT
13 SLIDES. THIS FIRST ONE IS SHOWING ALL MODES THROUGHOUT THE BAY
14 AREA, AND, AGAIN, THROUGHOUT THE LIFE OF THE PLAN, THROUGHOUT
15 THE MIDDAY. AND WHAT THIS IS SHOWING IS THE FREQUENCY THAT WE
16 SEE ON THE DOMINANT SEGMENT BETWEEN TRAVEL SHEDS, GOING FROM
17 YOUR DARK GREEN OF EVERY FIVE MINUTES OR BETTER. ALL THE WAY
18 DOWN TO RED, WHICH IS OVER HALF AN HOUR FREQUENCIES. SO, ON
19 THE LEFT WE HAVE OUR EXISTING NETWORK. AND ON THE RIGHT, WE
20 HAVE OUR EXISTING NETWORK PLUS THE DRAFT NETWORK. ALL THE
21 LINKS THAT ARE HIGHLIGHTED, SPECIFICALLY, ARE THE ONES THAT
22 ARE IMPROVED WITH PROJECTS FROM THE DRAFT NETWORK. SO YOU CAN
23 SEE THAT THROUGHOUT THE REGION, AREAS MUCH SAN FRANCISCO ARE
24 GOING FROM LIGHT GREEN TO DARK GREEN, MEANING THEY'RE LOOKING
25 AT A FREQUENCY OF FIVE MINUTES OR BETTER. YOU SEE THOSE SAME



JULY 22, 2024

1 TYPES OF CHANGES THROUGHOUT THE PENINSULA AND DOWN TO SAN JOSE
2 AND THROUGHOUT THE EAST BAY AND NORTH, AS WELL. AND IF WE CAN
3 GO TO THE FOLLOWING SLIDE, YOU CAN SEE THIS DISTINCTION EVEN
4 MORE THROUGHOUT THE PM PEAK. SO, SAME IDEA HERE SHOWING
5 FREQUENCY ON THE DOMINANT SEGMENT, BUT THIS IS SHOWING THE
6 EXISTING NETWORK VERSUS THE EXISTING PLUS THE DRAFT NETWORK IN
7 THE PM PEAK. AND, AGAIN, YOU SEE MOST LINKS BETWEEN TRAVEL
8 SHEDS ARE HIGHLIGHTED HERE INDICATING THAT THERE IS A NEW
9 PROJECT THAT WILL HELP INCREASE THE FREQUENCY ON THE DOMINANT
10 SEGMENT BETWEEN THESE TRAVEL SHEDS. ALL RIGHT. THIS NEXT SLIDE
11 IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, IS SPECIFICALLY ABOUT TRANSIT
12 PRIORITY FEATURES. OF COURSE, A KEY COMPONENT FOR PLANNED BAY
13 AREA 2050+, AS WELL. THIS IS SHOWING NEW PROJECTS FOR RAPID
14 BUS IN ORANGE AND FOR MAGENTA BRT OR LRT. AND AGAIN, WE'RE
15 HIGHLIGHTING THE REGIONS THAT ARE IMPROVING. THE ONE THING
16 WANT TO POINT OUT ABOUT THIS SLIDE BECAUSE IT DOES LOOK LIKE
17 CERTAIN REGIONS DON'T HAVE AS MUCH IN TERMS OF TRANSIT
18 PRIORITY FEATURES THEY ACTUALLY DO WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS SLIDE
19 AT CORRIDOR LENGTHS IMPROVEMENTS BUT ALSO SPOT IMPROVEMENTS
20 THROUGHOUT THE REGION AS A PART OF BAY AREA FORWARD ESPECIALLY
21 CERTAIN AREAS ALONG THE BRIDGES THOUGH THEY ARE NOT INCLUDED
22 AS PART OF THE SLIDE THEY ARE PART OF TRANSIT 2050+ AS WELL.
23 IN THIS NEXT SLIDE, THIS IS KIND OF A SUMMARY OF SOME
24 IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT FOR THE DRAFT
25 NETWORK FOR TRANSIT 2050+. I MENTIONED FOR THE CUSTOMER



JULY 22, 2024

1 EXPERIENCE, SOME TRANSIT STRATEGIES INVOLVED IN THAT IN
2 IMPROVING REGIONAL COORDINATION, TRANSFER TIMING AND OF COURSE
3 SAFETY AND SECURITY, AND CLEANLINESS, THAT'S WHERE A LOT OF
4 THOSE ASPECTS COME IN THEN JUST A SUMMARY OF THE IMPROVED
5 TRANSIT FREQUENCY, IMPROVED TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY THAT YOU SAW
6 ON THE SLIDES AS WELL AS TRANSIT SPEED AND RELIABILITY
7 IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT BACK TO
8 KARA TO GO OVER OUR SCHEDULE AND UPCOMING NEXT STEPS.

9

10 **KARA VUICICH:** ALL RIGHT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. GREAT. THANKS
11 ANDY. SO, WE ARE -- WE CURRENTLY JUST -- WE'RE HERE TODAY TO
12 PRESENT THE DRAFT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND DRAFT TRANSIT
13 2050+ NETWORK. 2050+ HAS ESSENTIALLY PARALLEL TRACK WITH
14 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. BUT AS WE APPROACH THE END OF THE
15 CALENDAR YEAR TWO EFFORTS ARE GOING TO MERGE. AS WE'RE MOVING
16 TOWARDS END OF 2025 AND DEVELOPING THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
17 BLUEPRINT THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS REPRESENTED
18 IN THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK FINAL BLUEPRINT WE'LL BE
19 BRINGING THAT WE'RE PLANNING TO BRING THE FINAL SET OF TRANSIT
20 STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS BACK TO THE RNM COUNCIL IN NOVEMBER
21 OF THIS YEAR THEN IT WILL GO TO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE,
22 ABAG COMMISSION AND MTC ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR ACTION ALONG
23 WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ BLUEPRINT AS PART OF THE
24 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ BLUEPRINT IN DECEMBER. ALSO COMING THIS
25 FALL ANOTHER ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT IN CONJUNCTION WITH PLANNED



JULY 22, 2024

1 BAY AREA 2050+ TEAM WE HAVE WORKED CLOSELY WITH MANAGEMENT AND
2 THEY PROVIDED IT'S OF FEEDBACK FOR THE LOCATION AND PROVIDED
3 VALUABLE FEEDBACK ON CONTENTS OF THE MATERIALS THAT WE'LL BE
4 USING AT THOSE POP-UP LOCATIONS, IN ADDITION TO IN-PERSON POP-
5 UP EVENTS WE'LL ALSO CONDUCT ONLINE WEBINARS FOR STAKEHOLDERS.
6 THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION WE'RE HERE TO TAKE QUESTIONS
7 AND FEEDBACK.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT KARA AND ANDY. VERY
10 THOUGHTFUL, THOROUGH PRESENTATION. MADAM CLERK LET'S FIRST
11 TURN TO PUBLIC COMMENT. FIRST IN THE ROOM THEN VIRTUAL,
12 PLEASE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. WE ALSO HAVE RECEIVED PUBLIC
15 COMMENTS IN WRITING ON THIS ITEM. AND LETTERS CAME FROM BAY
16 AREA COUNCIL, BAY PLANNING COALITION, BERKELEY FERRY, BAY
17 PLANNING COALITION, REDWOOD CITY FERRY, BERKELEY CHAMBER OF
18 COMMERCE, BERKELEY COMMONS, CHAMBER SAN MATEO COUNTY, CITY OF
19 REDWOOD CITY, HIGH AMBITION CLIMATE COLLECTIVE, ODINE PALIN,
20 PACIFIC ENVIRONMENT, PORT OF REDWOOD CITY, PORT OF SAN
21 FRANCISCO BERKELEY FERRY, SAN MATEO COUNTY ECONOMIC
22 DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION, SEAPORT INDUSTRIAL ASSOCIATION. AND
23 THOSE LETTERS WERE ALSO COMBINED IN THE AGENDA. AND THEN WE
24 HAVE THREE ONLINE, AND WE HAVE ALSO THREE SPEAKERS HERE IN THE
25 ROOM. HOW MUCH TIME?



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WHY DON'T WE GO AHEAD WITH TWO MINUTES,
3 THEN START WITH THE SPEAKERS IN THE ROOM, MADAM CLERK.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. STARTING OUT WITH ALETA DUPREE, AND
6 THEN ADINA LEVIN.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN. GOOD AFTERNOON NOW. CHAIR, BOB POWERS
9 AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH
10 TEAM FOLDS. THIS IS HEAVY. A LOT OF PEOPLE WRITE IN ABOUT
11 THIS, BECAUSE IT BRINGS PEOPLE OUT OF THE WOODWORK AND INTO
12 THE ROOM. I DON'T KNOW, I NEED MY CLOCK HERE. I DON'T KNOW
13 WHAT TRANSPORTATION IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE IN 2050. I WOULD
14 HOPE TO SEE MORE RAIL. BUS RAPID TRANSIT HAS A PLACE, BUT BUS
15 RAPID TRANSIT DOESN'T EXCITE ME UNLESS WE'RE USING ELECTRICITY
16 OR RENEWABLY PRODUCED HYDROGEN. BECAUSE, OTHERWISE, WE'RE JUST
17 WANT SPINNING OUR WHEELS. AND WE'RE NOT GOING ANYWHERE. HOW DO
18 WE BRIDGE ALL THESE GAPS? YOU KNOW? LIKE NEW YORK, WE'RE
19 DIVIDED BY WATER. AND WE STRUGGLE WITH INCOMPATIBILITY AMONG
20 SYSTEMS. BECAUSE 60 YEARS AGO, THE PLANNERS WHO BUILT BART
21 CHOSE TO USE DIFFERENT TRACK GAUGE. AND I HAVE HEARD ABOUT THE
22 POSSIBILITY OF GEARY SUBWAY. I'M INTRIGUED BY THAT. MAYBE IT
23 COULD BE A FOUR TRACK SUBWAY LIKE WHAT WE SEE IN NEW YORK
24 CITY. BUT, WHERE WILL THE MONEY COME FROM THIS? HOW DO WE GET
25 THE BIG MONEY? IT COSTS A LOT TO KEEP A CAR IN THE BAY AREA,



JULY 22, 2024

1 WHICH IS ONE REASON I DON'T HAVE ONE. I TOOK AN AUTONOMOUS
2 VEHICLE HERE TODAY. I PAID \$0.32 IN A SAN FRANCISCO CONGESTION
3 TAX. THAT'S NOT VERY MUCH. I WOULD BE FINE IF I PAID A DOLLAR.
4 BUT EVEN IF WE HAVE MILLIONS OF THESE RIDES, IT'S STILL ONLY
5 GOING TO BE A DROP IN THE BUCKET. I THINK THE BIG MONEY HAS TO
6 COME FROM UNLOCKING WHAT IS NOW STRANDED CAPITAL. MILLIONS OF
7 AUTOMOBILES THAT PEOPLE ARE MOSTLY FINANCING AT HIGH RATES OF
8 INTEREST. THERE WILL BE SEEN CHANGES DOWN THE ROAD, BUT WE
9 MUST NOT IGNORE THE POSSIBILITIES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING. SO, THE TRANSIT 2050+, ON THIS
14 LATEST ITERATION IS REALLY A STEP FORWARD IN WHAT WE ARE
15 PLANNING AS A REGION, HOW WE'RE PLANNING, WHAT WE ARE
16 POTENTIALLY PROMISING TO THE COMMUNITY, AND WHAT WE ARE
17 SELLING TO THE COMMUNITY AS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HOW TO BRING
18 THE MONEY INTO DO THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT THINGS. A FEW COMMENTS
19 ON WHAT -- HOW THE PLANNED BAY AREA, THE TRANSIT EXIST IS
20 WORKING. ONE IT'S GREAT TO SEE THOSE MAPS THAT ARE STARTING TO
21 SHOW IMPROVED SERVICE IN DIFFERENT PLACES AROUND THE REGION
22 AND HOW THIS VERSION OF THE MAP IS OVERLAYING THINGS THAT THE
23 AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON IN DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES ALONG
24 THE CENTRAL PLANNING, AND IT'S GOOD TO SEE THAT NETWORK OF THE
25 TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS. I'M GLAD THAT IT WAS MENTIONED THAT



JULY 22, 2024

1 THE FORWARD PROJECTS ARE NOT IN HERE. THEY SHOULD BE ON THE
2 MAP. AND HAVING THOSE MAPS, HAVING THAT PICTURE, IS REALLY
3 VALUABLE FOR THE COMMUNITY AND THE PUBLIC TO SOLICIT MORE
4 FEEDBACK, LIKE, WHAT WE'RE GETTING TODAY, AND WHAT IS,
5 HOPEFULLY, WE'LL BE GETTING FROM THE COMMUNITY GOING FORWARD.
6 ALSO VERY MUCH LOOKING FORWARD TO WHAT IS NOT IN HERE QUITE
7 YET, BUT WILL BE BY THE END OF THE YEAR, IS INFORMATION ABOUT
8 THE OUTCOMES. THE OUTCOMES FOR RIDERSHIP, THE OUTCOMES FOR
9 CLIMATE, THE OUTCOMES FOR MOBILITY, YOU KNOW, THE NUMBER OF
10 PEOPLE THAT ARE WITHIN A SHORT WALK OF FREQUENT TRANSIT, THE
11 OUTCOMES FOR HOUSING, AND PEOPLE OF DIFFERENT INCOMES THAT ARE
12 ABLE TO LIVE WITH LESS CARS, ALL OF THAT IS GOOD TO DO, AND
13 GOOD TO COMMUNICATE TO THE PUBLIC TO GET THE SUPPORT FOR DOING
14 IT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER DAN SEVILLE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. IT'S NICE TO BE HERE FOR SOMETHING
19 THAT'S FOR SOMETHING OTHER THAN SB1031. MY NAME IS JOB CECIL,
20 I'M REPRESENTING CMC SAN MATEO COUNTY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT
21 ASSOCIATION I'M HERE WITH A MIXTURE OF EXASPERATION
22 FRUSTRATION AND IRRITATION I'M THE VOICE OF THE FOR TERMINAL
23 IN THIS PLAN. CMC HAS SUPPORTED THIS PLAN AT EVERY LEVEL, CITY
24 OF REDWOOD CITY, PORT OF REDWOOD CITY, WETA, I AM NOT SURE WHY
25 THIS IS AN ISSUE, BUT I WOULD IMPLORE YOU TO READ THE LETTERS



JULY 22, 2024

1 THAT ARE BETTER WRITTEN THAN MY PUBLIC COMMENT THIS MORNING.
2 HOW WE GET REDWOOD CITY AND SAN FRANCISCO REDWOOD CITY AND
3 EAST BAY BACK INTO THIS PLAN. IT'S BEEN REMOVED AND I'LL THROW
4 IN BERKELEY LETTERS TOO BECAUSE THAT SEEMS LIKE A GOOD DEAL AS
5 WELL SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. WENDI KALLINS. PLEASE UNMUTE
8 YOURSELF.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** WENDI KALLINS, WITH SUSTAINABLE MARIN, AND I'M
11 A MEMBER OF THE MTC CITIZEN ADVISORY COUNCIL, REPRESENTING
12 MARIN COUNTY. FIRST OF ALL, I'M THRILLED TO BE SEEING THIS
13 INFORMATION. I THINK THE NETWORK CONNECTION IS REALLY THE KEY
14 TO IMPROVING RIDERSHIP AND RIDERSHIP EXPERIENCE. I HAVE BEEN
15 ASKING ABOUT THIS FOR A LONG TIME. SO THIS IS WELL-RECEIVED BY
16 ME. I DO WONDER WHY THE NORTH BAY SEEMS TO BE NEGLECTED IN ANY
17 IMPROVEMENTS. IT'S NICE TO SEE THAT THERE IS A CONNECTION
18 BETWEEN NOVATO AND VALLEJO THAT'S VERY NEEDED. I REALLY THINK
19 THAT WE NEED IMPROVED SERVICE BETWEEN SAN RAFAEL AND THE BART
20 STATION IN RICHMOND, ESPECIALLY CONSIDERING THE BACKUPS THAT
21 ARE ON THE BRIDGE. AND I THINK THE -- YOU KNOW, THE
22 CONNECTIONS BETWEEN THE REGIONAL PROVIDERS, OF COURSE, IS
23 EXTREMELY IMPORTANT, BUT PLEASE DON'T FORGET THE LOCAL
24 PROVIDERS. BECAUSE OFTENTIMES WHAT RUINS THE RIDER EXPERIENCE
25 IS YOU GET OFF A LOCAL OR REGIONAL BUS OR TRAIN, AND SOMETIMES



JULY 22, 2024

1 THERE IS A HALF HOUR WAIT, OR MORE, IN ORDER TO MAKE YOUR
2 CONNECTIONS EAST AND THEN WEST. SO, AND OF COURSE I'M TALKING
3 ABOUT THE NORTH BAY IN THAT ONE. SO, PLEASE TAKE A LOOK AT
4 THOSE CONNECTIONS, AND NETWORK ALLIANCES BETWEEN THE REGIONAL
5 NETWORK AND THE LOCAL PROVIDERS. WE HAVE REALLY GOOD LOCAL
6 PROVIDERS IN THE NORTH BAY, BUT THEY REALLY NEED TO BE
7 COORDINATED REALLY WELL WITH SMART AND GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT.
8 THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER, ROBERT ROGERS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR POWERS, VICE CHAIR CHAN,
13 AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL. MY NAME IS ROBERT ROGERS, AND I AM
14 SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF THE BAY PLANNING COALITION, OR BPC --
15 EXCUSE ME -- IN LINE WITH OUR EMISSION TO PROMOTE THE REGION'S
16 ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT. BPC IS
17 CONCERNED ABOUT THE EXCLUSION OF THE BERKELEY FERRY SERVICE
18 AND THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY SERVICE FROM THE CURRENT REGIONAL
19 TRANSPORTATION PLAN, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. BOTH PROJECTS
20 WERE INCLUDED IN PREVIOUS VERSIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA, HAVE
21 RECEIVED MILLIONS OF DOLLARS IN FUNDS AND OTHER CURRENTLY IN
22 DETAILED DESIGN AND ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STAGES. PROJECTS CAN
23 BE EXCLUDED FROM PLANNED BAY AREA IF THEY DUPLICATE OTHER
24 TRANSIT SERVICES OR ARE NOT COST EFFECTIVE. HOWEVER, THIS IS
25 NOT THE CASE FOR BOTH OF THOSE PROJECTS. WE BELIEVE THEIR



JULY 22, 2024

1 EXCLUSION IS AN OVERSIGHT AND WE URGE THIS COUNCIL TO ENSURE
2 THESE PROGRAMS ARE INCLUDED IN THE NEXT DRAFT OF THE DOCUMENT.
3 FROM A COST EFFICIENCY PERSPECTIVE, SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY
4 OPERATING AT A COST PER PASSENGER MILE COMPARABLE TO OTHER
5 TRANSIT MODES CARRYING PASSENGERS ON SIGNIFICANT LONG DISTANCE
6 TRIPS MANY OF WHICH OTHERWISE WOULD BE COMPLETED BY CAR
7 INCREASING CONGESTION AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS. IN FACT IT
8 HAS THE SIXTH LOWEST COST PER PASSENGER MILE AMONG THE
9 REGION'S 20 PLUS TRANSIT OPERATORS. WE RECOGNIZE THAT PLANNED
10 BAY AREA 2050+ IS FISCALLY CONSTRAINED HOWEVER BERKELEY AND
11 REDWOOD CITY FERRY SERVICES WILL BE FUNDED THROUGH SOURCES
12 DEDICATED EXCLUSIVELY TO FERRY TRANSIT PROJECTS AND NOT DIVERT
13 FUNDING FROM OTHER REGIONAL PROJECTS IN CONCLUSION WE
14 RESPECTFULLY REQUEST THAT THE BERKELEY AND REDWOOD FERRY
15 SERVICES BE INCLUDED IN THE NEXT VERSION OF PLANNED BAY AREA
16 2050+. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK TODAY.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS LORIANA CASTRO.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR POWERS, VICE CHAIR CHAN, AND
21 REGIONAL COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS LORIANA CASTRO. I'M CHAIR
22 OF THE REDWOOD CITY PORT COMMISSION I'M HERE TO ASK YOU TO
23 RESTORE THE TERMINAL PROJECT TO THE REGIONAL PLAN AS IT HAS
24 BEEN IN THE PAST. I HAVE WORKED DILIGENTLY FOR 17 YEARS ON
25 BEHALF OF THE CITIZENS OF SAN MATEO COUNTY TO FULFILL THEIR



JULY 22, 2024

1 SELF-IMPOSED TAX EARMARKED DESIRE FOR REDWOOD CITY FERRY
2 SERVICE LEAVING THE PROJECT OUT WILL LIMIT THE ABILITY EVER
3 REDWOOD CITY AND SF BAY FERRY TO LEVERAGE LOCAL REGIONAL FERRY
4 ONLY FUNDING TO SECURE FEDERAL FERRY DOLLARS. PLEASE DO NOT
5 LIMIT OUR ABILITY TO BRING ONLY FEDERAL FERRY ONLY TRANSIT
6 INVESTMENTS TO OUR REGION. THE PROJECT DOES NOT DUPLICATE
7 OTHER TRANSIT SERVICES THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY PROJECT WOULD
8 PROVIDE THE ONLY CONVENIENT TRANSIT CONNECTION BETWEEN THE
9 EAST BAY AND PENINSULA IT WOULD ALSO PROVIDE THE ONLY WATER-
10 BASED EMERGENCY RESPONSE CONNECTION TO THIS AREA WHICH IS
11 CRITICAL FOR REGIONAL PREPAREDNESS. AND POPULATION GROWTH NEAR
12 -- LEAVING REDWOOD CITY FERRY SERVICE OUT OF PLANNED BAY AREA
13 2050 WILL FORCE TRAVELLERS FROM OUTSIDE OF THESE AREAS INTO
14 THEIR CARS. SF FERRY OPERATES AT THE COST PER PASSENGER MILE
15 THAT'S SIMILAR TO OTHER TRANSIT MODES ESPECIALLY ALONG
16 IMPORTANT CORRIDORS. SF BAY FERRY WAS THE FASTEST GROWING
17 TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE REGION BEFORE THE PANDEMIC AND HAS BEEN
18 FASTEST AFTER THE PANDEMIC. DONE SO IN EQUITY FOCUSED
19 RIDERSHIP INCENTIVIZING WAY WHILE PRIORITIZING CLEAN FUEL
20 TECHNOLOGY INNOVATIONS. PLEASE KEEP THIS DESIRABLE SERVICE
21 GROWING IN OUR REGION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER CHRISTINA SARTMAM.

24



JULY 22, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** HELLO FELLOW COUNCIL MEMBERS MY NAME IS CHRISTINE
2 SARTMAN. I AM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AT PORT OF REDWOOD CITY WE'RE
3 CONCERNED THAT THIS ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AS
4 OMITTED THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL WE AS A REGION CANNOT
5 AFFORD TO LIMIT OUR ABILITY TO SECURE FEDERAL INVESTMENTS INTO
6 OUR ASSETS AND INFRASTRUCTURE. THIS OMISSION WILL IMPACT SFA
7 FERRIES ABILITY TO BUILD FEDERAL INVESTMENT INTO ITS FINANCIAL
8 STAFF ADDITIONALLY THROUGH OUR PARTNERSHIP WITH SF BAY FERRY -
9 - IN 2017, THE PORT INVESTED OVER \$20 MILLION IN ITS
10 INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH GOT THE ATTENTION OF FEMA AND WE WERE
11 DESIGNATED A FEDERAL STAGING AREA. THAT ALLOWS US TO BE ABLE
12 TO DEPLOY FIRST RESPONDERS AND RESOURCES TO THE ENTIRE SOUTH
13 BAY REGION AND THE PENINSULA. WETA IS A PARTNER IN THAT AND
14 WILL BE ABLE TO DO ALL THAT SERVICE FOR US VIA THE WATER. THIS
15 OMISSION SEVERELY IMPACTS OUR ABILITY TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER TO
16 OUR RESIDENTS AND OUR CITIZENS, SHOULD A CATASTROPHIC EVENT
17 OCCUR. WE'RE URGING YOU TO PUT BACK REDWOOD CITY FERRY INTO
18 THE PLAN. THE BAY AREA DESERVES ANOTHER TRANSIT ALTERNATIVE IN
19 SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO AND YOUR SUPPORT IS GREATLY APPRECIATE.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. LAST SPEAKER, DIANE HOWARD. YOU
23 MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



JULY 22, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. MY NAME IS DIANE HOWARD. I'M CITY
2 COUNCIL MEMBER FROM THE CITY OF REDWOOD CITY. I'M ALSO A
3 MEMBER OF THE ORIGINAL BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, TASKED IN 1998
4 TO FORM A PLAN FOR THE FUTURE OF FERRY SERVICE IN THE BAY
5 AREA. AND I'M HERE TO ADVOCATE TO INCLUDE THE REDWOOD CITY
6 FERRY TERMINAL PROJECT IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. REDWOOD CITY
7 FERRY TERMINAL PROJECT WAS INCLUDED IN THE LAST REGIONAL PLAN
8 AND SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN THIS ONE. ADDING THE PROJECT TO THE
9 PLAN WILL NOT AFFECT THE OVERALL FISCALLY CONSTRAINED PLAN,
10 SINCE THE PROJECT WILL BE FUNDED WITH INVESTMENTS THAT ARE
11 ONLY AVAILABLE FOR FERRY PROJECTS. LEAVING THE PROJECT OUT
12 WILL LIMIT THE ABILITY OF REDWOOD CITY AND SAN FRANCISCO BAY
13 FERRY TO LEVERAGE LOCAL AND REGIONAL FERRY ONLY FUNDING TO
14 SECURE FERRY ONLY FEDERAL PROGRAMS. THESE FUNDS CANNOT BE USED
15 FOR ANY OTHER TRANSIT EXPANSION PROJECT IN THE DRAFT PLAN. THE
16 REGION SHOULD BE PROVING A PLAN FOCUSED ON MAXIMIZED --
17 MAXIMIZING FEDERAL INVESTMENT IN THE REGION, NOT LIMITING IT.
18 THE PROJECT DOES NOT DUPLICATE OTHER TRANSIT SERVICES. THERE
19 IS NO CONVENIENT TRANSIT CONNECTION BETWEEN THE EAST BAY AND
20 THE PENINSULA. THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY PROJECT WOULD PROVIDE
21 THIS CONNECTION. THERE IS ALSO NO WATER-BASED EMERGENCY
22 RESPONSE CONNECTION TO THIS AREA. WHICH IS A HUGE GAP IN THE
23 REGION'S EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS. THIS PROJECT IS ESSENTIAL,
24 FILLING THAT GAP. I THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME. I HOPE YOU WILL
25 STRONGLY CONSIDER OUR REDWOOD CITY REQUEST. THANK YOU.



JULY 22, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE SPEAKERS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK. AND
5 THANK YOU TO ALL THE PUBLIC COMMENTERS HERE. KARA AND ANDY,
6 THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. THERE WAS SOME VERY CONSISTENT
7 THEMES THERE THAT I'M SURE YOU'RE GOING TO TAKE BACK AND
8 NAVIGATE, AND WITH THAT, LET ME JUST GO TO THE DAIS HERE AND
9 WHY DON'T WE START ON THE OPPOSITE SIDE, AND GIVE MIKE A BREAK
10 HERE, AND NOT TO PUT ON YOU THE SPOT KATHLEEN, BUT KATHLEEN
11 SULLIVAN MARIN TRANSIT. COMMENTS, CONCERNS, ADVISE?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. THANKS KARA AND ANDY. I KNOW THIS WAS A VERY
14 LARGE AND SPEEDY LIFT TO GET TO THIS POINT. MIGHT NOT FEEL
15 SPEEDY. BUT I KNOW THE TIME CONSTRAINTS THAT YOU HAVE BEEN
16 UNDER, AND THE ANALYTICAL CONSTRAINED TRYING TO GET THIS INTO
17 PLANNED BAY AREA. THANKS FOR ALL THE WORK YOU HAVE PUT IN
18 GETTING TO THIS POINT. I DO WANT TO -- I HAVE A COMMENT
19 BETWEEN THE CONNECTION IN THE GAPS ANALYSIS AND PROJECTS THAT
20 ENDED UP IN THE LIST. IT WAS A VERY -- IT WAS A NOVEL AND
21 USEFUL PART OF THIS PROCESS THAT SETS IT APART FROM HOW THE
22 PROJECT LIST HAVE BEEN GENERATED IN PAST PLANNED BAY AREA, AND
23 MARKET GAPS I DON'T KNOW IN THERE IS ANALYSIS OF REMAINING
24 GAPS THAT THE PROJECTS DON'T FULLY MEET AND I THINK THAT
25 KEEPING THAT GAPS ANALYSIS AND THOSE GAPS AT THE FOREFRONT AS



JULY 22, 2024

1 YOU PUT TOGETHER THE FINAL MATERIALS FOR THIS PLAN IS
2 IMPORTANT. BECAUSE I THINK IT WAS A BIG LIFT TO DO THAT
3 ANALYSIS AND ALSO WANT TO CONTINUE TO DO SERVICE PLANNING
4 GROUNDED IN POST PANDEMIC MARKET ASSESSMENT. I KNOW EACH OF
5 OUR AGENCIES ARE TRYING TO DO THAT INDEPENDENTLY, BUT NONE
6 HAVE DONE THAT GLOBAL LOOK. BETWEEN MARIN AND SONOMA COUNTY.
7 THERE WERE A FEW GAPS IDENTIFIED AND THE PROJECTS DON'T FULLY
8 MEET THOSE GAPS. THERE IS A SONOMA FREQUENCY PROJECT IN THE
9 SHORT-TERM BUCKET AND THERE IS A GOLDEN GATE FREQUENCY IN THE
10 LONG-TERM BUCKET. MARIN TRANSIT COULD ALSO POTENTIALLY --
11 FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS ON MARIN TRANSIT MIGHT ALSO MEET THOSE
12 GAPS. ALTHOUGH WE DIDN'T SUBMIT THE \$250 MILLION PROJECT. WE
13 ARE ENGAGED IN A MULTI-AGENCY PLANNING EFFORT IN PARTNERSHIP
14 WITH GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HIGHWAY TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT, AS
15 WELL AS SONOMA COUNTY OPERATORS AND SMART, TO RECONSIDER
16 SERVICE IN THE 101 CORRIDOR AND LOOK AT WHAT IS THE RIGHT
17 SERVICE LEVELS, FREQUENCIES. YOU KNOW, WHO SHOULD DELIVER
18 WHICH SERVICES, BECAUSE THERE IS OVERLAP AND REDUNDANCY TODAY
19 THAT, SORT OF, WAS JUST A RESULT OF THE PANDEMIC AND SMART
20 COMING ONLINE RIGHT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC SO WE ACTUALLY ARE
21 ENGAGED IN A REALLY ROBUST EXERCISE RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU TO
22 MTC USING THE MARKET ANALYSIS THAT YOU DID AND WE'RE GOING TO
23 TAKE A DEEPER DIVE TO DO A FINE GRAINED ANALYSIS TO TRY TO
24 UNDERSTAND WHERE THE SPECIFIC GAPS ARE. SO BRINGING ME BACK TO
25 THE REQUEST IS THAT WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO EXPAND



JULY 22, 2024

1 THE PROJECTS THAT ARE INCLUDED TO POTENTIALLY HAVE SOME
2 FLEXIBILITY TO FUND OUTCOMES OF THE -- WE HAVE BEEN CALLING IT
3 THE MASK ON THE'S EFFORT THE MARIN SONOMA COORDINATED TRANSIT
4 SERVICE PLAN TO FUND OUTCOMES OF THAT EFFORT. IT COULD
5 POTENTIALLY BETTER MEET POST-PANDEMIC DEMAND IN THE CORRIDOR
6 TO LOOK AT -- WELL WE'LL HAVE FREQUENCY RECOMMENDATIONS COMING
7 OUT OF THAT PROJECT AND IF THERE IS ANY WAY -- I KNOW IT'S
8 OUTS OF THE CONVENTIONAL PLANNED BAY AREA PROCESS WHERE
9 PROJECTS ARE SUBMITTED AND EVALUATED AND GET IN THE PLAN IF
10 THERE IS ANY FLEXIBILITY TO THOSE TWO PROJECTS, WHETHER IT'S
11 SHORT-TERM [INDISCERNIBLE] BUCKET OR LONG-TERM [INDISCERNIBLE]
12 BUCKET, IF MARIN COULD BE ADDED TO SOME OF THOSE WE WOULD
13 APPRECIATE THAT CONSIDERATION. HAPPY TO WORK WITH YOU, ON
14 WHATEVER THE RIGHT SOLUTION IS. BUT THE EFFORT WE'RE MAKING IS
15 ALIGNING TO PROVIDE BETTER SERVICE TO THE CUSTOMERS AND I
16 THINK POTENTIALLY MAKING THIS ALTERATION IN ALIGNMENT WITH
17 WHAT TRANSIT 2050+ HAS INTENDED TO DO DIFFERENTLY THAN WHAT
18 PLANNED BAY AREA HAS TRADITIONALLY DONE. SO, WE'RE HOPING SOME
19 ACCOMMODATIONS MIGHT BE MADE.

20

21 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS FOR THOSE COMMENTS, KATHLEEN. SAM
22 SARGENT, CALTRAIN.

23

24 **SAM SARGENT:** ON BEHALF OF CALTRAIN, I WANT TO EXPRESS OUR
25 THANKS TO ANDY AND KARA FOR REALLY INCLUDING US THROUGHOUT



JULY 22, 2024

1 THIS PROCESS. WE'RE SATISFIED WITH WHERE THINGS STAND FROM THE
2 CALTRAIN VANTAGE POINT WITH NOTE THERE IS ADDITIONAL WORK TO
3 BE DONE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS. ANDY FREMIER, MTC? NOTHING.
6 LET'S GO TO VTA, AND THEN WETA.

7

8 **CAROLYN GONOT:** JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. THANKS FOR THE GOOD
9 PRESENTATION I WAS TRYING TO DECIPHER ALL OF IT. I HAVE A
10 QUESTION ABOUT THE -- SOME OF THE STUFF IN SOUTH COUNTY OR IN
11 THE SOUTH BAY. AND I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT, DOES THE MTC MODEL
12 INCLUDE, LIKE, THE AMBAG REGIONS?

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DAVE VAUTIN, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS,
15 MTC ABAG. SHORT ANSWER IS NO. OURS IS A NINE COUNTY MODEL, BUT
16 DOES INCORPORATE INTER-REGIONAL TRAVEL VOLUMES.

17

18 **CAROLYN GONOT:** DOES THIS INCLUDE FROM THE SOUTH THEN FROM
19 MONTEREY? SALINAS OR AREAS LIKE THAT? I KNOW IT DOES FROM THE
20 VALLEY.

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH. IN TERMS OF THE INTER-REGIONAL ASPECT OF
23 THE MODEL, IT CAPTURES INTER-REGIONAL TRAFFIC VOLUMES AT KEY
24 GATEWAYS, INCLUDING SAN BENITO, SANTA CRUZ, ET CETERA, WE DO
25 SOME ADDITIONAL INTER-REGIONAL MODELING WITH REGARDS TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 SYSTEMS LIKE HIGH SPEED RAIL THAT ARE GOING TO CUT ACROSS THE
2 STATE. THERE ARE SOME LIMITATIONS, AS WELL, IN TERMS EVER
3 INTER-REGIONAL VOLUMES. BUT GIVEN THE VAST MAJORITY TRAVEL IS
4 BY CAR AND TRUCK.

5

6 **CAROLYN GONOT:** IS HIGH SPEED RAIL ASSUMED BY 2050? OR --

7

8 **DAVE VAUTIN. YES. THE PLAN IN THE MOST RECENT ITERATION OF THE**
9 **HIGH-SPEED RAIL BUSINESS PLAN.**

10

11 **>>CAROLYN GONOT:** ONE OF THE THINGS, I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT THIS
12 BECAUSE ONE WAS THE AREAS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT HAS BEEN ALONG
13 STEVEN'S CREEK, BECAUSE I HAVE A BIG PUSH TO LOOK AT PODS AND
14 OTHER TECHNOLOGIES, BUT OUR FIRST EFFORT IS LOOKING AT OUR
15 BUSES AND BUS FREQUENCIES AND TRANSIT PRIORITY. AND I KNOW
16 THAT IT'S ACTUALLY HIGHLIGHTING CUPERTINO QUITE A BIT LIKE
17 THAT AREA GOING FROM DOWNTOWN INTO THERE. IT GOES INTO A MAJOR
18 COMMUNITY COLLEGE FOR US. BUT FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY IT WAS NO
19 LONGER HIGHLIGHTED. I WAS CURIOUS WHY THAT WENT AWAY FOR
20 TRANSIT PRIORITY. AND SO IF YOU COULD LOOK AT -- YOU DON'T
21 HAVE TO ANSWER IT TODAY. I WAS CURIOUS ABOUT THAT TO
22 HIGHLIGHT. I WAS HAPPY TO SEE IT IN THERE. IT'S LISTED IN
23 MAJOR CORRIDORS IN OUR SALES TAX MEASURES. IF YOU COULD LOOK
24 AT THAT? I WOULD LOVE TO SEE SOME OF THIS WORK COME TO VTA, TO
25 OUR BOARDS OR TO ONE OF OUR COMMITTEES TO BE DISCUSSED. THE



JULY 22, 2024

1 ONLY THING I WOULD ASK IS -- AND THE REASON I ASK ABOUT SOUTH
2 COUNTY IS GILROY HAS A HUGE ISSUE WHEN THEY'RE NOT ON THE MAPS
3 OF MTC. [LAUGHTER] THAT'S A CONCERN OF THEIRS. AND I HAVE TO
4 SAY THAT IS A BIG DEAL. BECAUSE THEY SAY THEY'RE IGNORED AND
5 WHEN THEY'RE NOT ON THE MAP, AT ALL, THEY LOOK EVEN MORE
6 IGNORED. SO EVEN THOUGH THEY DON'T HAVE THE SERVICE AND MAY
7 HAVE SERVICE IN THE FUTURE, THEY DO GET RAIL, OVER 31 MINUTES.
8 BUT THEY DO HAVE IT. SO, I THINK IT'S SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY
9 CRITICAL TO THEM. AND TO NOT BE ON THE MAP AT ALL IS A BIG
10 DEAL. THANKS.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS FOR THOSE COMMENTS CAROLYN.
13 SEAMUS MURPHY, WETA.

14

15 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** THANKS TO STAFF FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER A LOT
16 TO LIKE IN HERE ESPECIALLY THE FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS ON THE
17 EXISTING NETWORK ARE REALLY EXCITING AS WE ALL KNOW FROM OUR
18 DISCUSSIONS AT THE STATE LEVEL WITH THE TRANSIT
19 TRANSFORMATION, THROUGH THE PANDEMIC WE KNOW THAT FREQUENCY IS
20 JUST PROBABLY THE BEST OPPORTUNITY THAT WE HAVE TO MAXIMIZE
21 RIDERSHIP WHEN IT COMES TO EXPANSION PROJECTS THE CHOICES ARE
22 DIFFICULT ESPECIALLY DEALING WITH A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED
23 SITUATION THAT'S MORE CONSTRAINED THAN IT WAS A WHILE AGO. I
24 ECHO COMMENTS THAT WE HEARD ABOUT THE FERRY PROJECTS. I THINK
25 THAT, YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY THOSE PROJECTS ARE USING FUND THAT'S



JULY 22, 2024

1 BEEN DEDICATED TO FERRY PROJECTS APPROVED BY VOTERS IN AN
2 EXPENDITURE PLAN AND RM3 OUR EXPENDITURE PLAN WAS BASIS POWER
3 THAT EXPENDITURE PLAN IT INCLUDES BOTH REDWOOD CITY AND
4 BERKELEY FERRY TERMINAL PROJECTS THOSE ARE PROJECTS THAT WE
5 CAN MOVE FORWARD WITHOUT NEEDING TO EXPAND WITH THE FISCALLY
6 CONSTRAINED SITUATION THAT THE REGION FACES, THERE IS REALLY
7 NO EXPENSE TO ADDING THOSE PROJECTS YOU DON'T NEED TO REMOVE
8 OTHER PROJECTS BECAUSE WE'LL BE LEVERAGING FEDERAL FUNDING
9 THAT IS ALSO FOR ONLY FUNDING TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THOSE
10 PROJECTS HAPPEN. IF WE DON'T INCLUDE THOSE PROJECTS THERE ARE
11 IMMEDIATE EXPENSES IT'S GOING TO LIMIT OUR ABILITY TO PROCEED
12 WITH SECURING THOSE FUNDS. IT WILL, I THINK, CALL INTO
13 QUESTION FROM A PUBLIC SUPPORT STANDPOINT, THE PUBLIC VOTED
14 FOR THESE MEASURES AND THEY EXPECTED THESE PROJECTS TO BE
15 INCLUDED. AND WE'RE TALKING ABOUT A NEW REGIONAL
16 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE. WE OUGHT TO BE MOVING FORWARD
17 WITH THE PLANS AND EXPENDITURES THAT WE HAVE ALREADY APPROVED
18 IN A WAY THAT WAS EXPECTED. AND MOST IMPORTANTLY, I JUST DON'T
19 THINK WE SHOULD BE LEAVING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP OR LEVERAGING
20 FUNDING FOR THE REGION OVERALL ON THE TABLE. I ENCOURAGE YOU
21 TO HOPEFULLY FIND A WAY TO -- I KNOW YOU DIDN'T LOOK AT COLOR
22 OF MONEY NECESSARILY WHEN COMING UP WITH THE FISCAL
23 CONSTRAINTS FOR THE REGION, OVER THIS VERY LONG AMOUNT OF TIME
24 AND IT'S A HIGH-LEVEL PLANNING EXERCISE BUT IF THERE IS A WAY



JULY 22, 2024

1 TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT THESE ARE FERRY ONLY FUNDS THAT WOULD
2 DEFINITELY HELP THE SITUATION.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS SEAMUS. GOING DOWN THE LINE,
5 ANYBODY, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE.

6

7 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE WORK I WILL CONCLUDE THAT
8 IT'S FERRY ONLY FEDERAL FUND THAT WE'LL BE COMPETING FOR IT'S
9 A CONSTRAINED POT OF MONEY. I SUPPORT WHAT SEAMUS SAID.

10

11 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** BILL?

12

13 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU AT THE RISK OF SOUNDING REDUNDANT. I
14 AGREE THERE IS A LOT TO LIKE IN THIS PLAN. SECONDLY WANTED TO
15 THANK YOU AGAIN, YOU HAVE DONE IT INDIVIDUALLY, CORPORATELY SO
16 JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE I PUT A SHOUT OUT TO BOTH OF YOU FOR
17 THAT EFFORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THANK YOU TO MTC STAFF FOR DOING MORE BUSINESS
20 CASE ANALYTICS. WE REALLY LIKE SEEING CAREFUL ANALYSIS THAT
21 SUBJECTIVE RATHER THAN POLITICALLY DRIVEN TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE
22 CAN BEST PRIORITIZE OUR LIMITED RESOURCES FOR THE HIGHEST
23 PUBLIC GOOD. I WOULD ENCOURAGE TO YOU LOOK AT THE BUSINESS
24 CASE ANALYTICS PROCESSES FOR REGIONS LIKE LONDON, AUTISTIC
25 LAND, NEW GEE LAND AND VANCOUVER, CANADA AS AN EXAMPLE HOW



JULY 22, 2024

1 THOSE REGIONS HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DEPOLITICIZE FINANCIAL
2 ALLOCATION PROCESS AND ACHIEVE MUCH GREATER PUBLIC BENEFITS
3 AND PUBLIC TRUST BY HAVING TRANSPARENT ANALYTICAL PROCESSES
4 ALSO HELP UNDERSTAND HOW TO DEAL WITH PROJECTS LIKE RAIL THAT
5 HAVE EXPANSION THAT HAVE 50 YEAR RETURN ON INVESTMENT AS
6 OPPOSED TO TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS THAT SHOULD HAVE A MUCH
7 FASTER RETURN ON INVESTMENT AND IN ADDITION HOW TO EVALUATE
8 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE UPGRADES IN A
9 WAY THAT IS FAIR AGAINST EXPANSION AND NEW SERVICE PROJECTS.
10 OTHERWISE, I THINK THIS IS A GREAT START AND WE WOULD LOVE TO
11 SEE MORE BUSINESS CASE ANALYTICS INCLUDING HAVING THE
12 OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK UNDER THE HOODS.

13

14 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I CAN ALMOST SAY DITTO TO JEFF. HE TOOK MY MAIN
15 COMMENT BUT I'LL AMPLIFY A BIT, IF I COULD ASK THIS CHART IN
16 THE FUTURE HAVE A COLUMN INDICATE WHETHER THE PROJECT IS NEAR-
17 TERM OR NOT. GREAT JOB BY THE WAY THIS IS AN IMPOSSIBLE
18 ASSIGNMENT. I GET NERVOUS WITHOUT CALLING ANYBODY OUT OR
19 PICKING I SEE TWO COMBINED PROJECTS AT \$45 MILLION AND I CAN'T
20 GET MY DEAL AT 1.8 BILLION RAPID NETWORK PROJECT MOVED UP TO
21 NEAR-TERM. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO SEND YOU A LETTER ON THAT.
22 THE PART I WANTED TO AMPLIFY WHERE I DON'T SEE ACCOMMODATION,
23 IF YOU WILL, OR FACTORING THIS IS THE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR,
24 THE FACILITY, I THE FOUR BUS DIVISIONS THAT ARE LARGELY FROM
25 1970, 1980 AND ON TOP OF THAT UNFUNDED 0-EMISSIONS FLEET



JULY 22, 2024

1 TRANSITION MANDATE I WORRY IF WE DON'T HAVE THE FACILITIES TO
2 MAINTAIN -- THIS IS A LOT OF STUFF A LOT OF CHRISTMAS TREE, I
3 WORRY THAT TELLS THE PUBLIC WE HAVE A LOT OF GOOD THINGS
4 COMING BUT THEY DON'T UNDERSTAND WE NEED TO MAINTAIN AND
5 REHABILITATE SYSTEMS WE DO HAVE. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE
6 LANGUAGE ABOUT HOW STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND UNFUNDED ZERO-
7 EMISSIONS NEED UPGRADE IS HANDED OUT IN THE PLAN.

8

9 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. WHY DON'T WE GO TO OUR VICE
10 CHAIR APRIL CHAN SAMTRANS.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN:** THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR PUTTING THIS
13 TOGETHER. MAYBE A CLARIFICATION, I WANT TO ADD SOMETHING TO
14 THE FERRY PROJECT. I WANT TO BE SURE I UNDERSTAND THE FISCALLY
15 CONSTRAINED LIST DOES DEPEND ON -- AND I SEE IN ONE OF YOUR
16 SLIDES, YOUR SLIDE BULLET POINTS, DOES IT ASSUME ALL OF THESE
17 FUNDING SOURCES COMING ONLINE IN ORDER TO FULLY FUND ALL OF
18 THESE? OF COURSE, YOU KNOW, I KNOW THIS IS MORE OF A PLANNING
19 DOCUMENT, IT TALKS ABOUT TALK ABOUT IN ORDER OF PLANNING --
20 ALSO TO WHAT DENIS SAID THIS IS ABOUT THE REDWOOD CITY
21 PROJECT, THE OTHER ORGANIZATION I RUN IS THE SAN MATEO COUNTY
22 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. I DO WANT TO SAY THE FERRY PROJECT
23 IS INCLUDED IN TWO OF THE MEASURES THAT WE HAVE. THIS IS A
24 PROJECT THAT HAS LOCAL FUNDING. I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE
25 IMPLICATION IS, IF THE PROJECT IS NOT INCLUDED IN THIS LIST.



JULY 22, 2024

1 THIS IS A PROJECT THAT THE PENINSULA IS VERY MUCH INTERESTED
2 IN MAKING SURE WE MOVE FORWARD AND GIVEN IT DOES HAVE LOCAL
3 FUNDING I WANT TO BE SURE IT HAS ABILITY TO CONTINUE TO MOVE
4 FORWARD AND WANT TO PUT IN A PLUG FOR THAT. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** ANDY AND KARA I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
7 BEING HERE. I THINK YOU HAVE HEARD A LOT OF GOOD COMMENTS HERE
8 TODAY, BOTH FROM THE PUBLIC WITH SOME CONSISTENT THEMES THAT
9 YOU SHOULD TAKE BACK AND THINK THROUGH, AS WELL AS CONSISTENCY
10 FROM THE COMMISSION UP HERE. AGAIN, I GOT A LOT GOING ON WITH
11 BART AND OUR FISCAL CLIFF AND EVERYTHING GOING ON. BUT THE
12 COMMENT MURPHY MADE, I DON'T KNOW WHO MADE -- SOMEBODY --
13 THERE IS A LOT TO LIKE HERE, SOMETHING TO BUILD ON, AND SO I
14 APPRECIATE THE WORK. AND I REALLY DO APPRECIATE HOW IT WAS
15 PRESENTED HERE. IT WAS VERY THOUGHTFUL AND IT WAS EASY TO
16 FOLLOW. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. SO W THAT, MADAM CLERK, WE'RE
17 GOING TO CLOSE THIS ITEM, WHICH WAS 3B. AND WE'RE GOING TO
18 MOVE TO ITEM NUMBER 3C. WE'RE AT ABOUT -- WHAT TIME? IT'S
19 PUSHING 1:10 HERE. ITEM 3C IS OUR TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,
20 ACTION 25. THIS IS THE PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY DRAFT REPORT,
21 AND WE ARE JOINED HERE WITH DRENNEN SHELTON FROM MTC. DRENNAN,
22 NICE TO SEE YOU AGAIN. AND JOHN SANDERSON, NICE TO SEE YOU, AS
23 WELL, AGAIN, JOHN. AND BILL FROM YOUR SHOP HERE, HAPPY TO BE
24 REPRESENTED HERE. AND I WOULD REMIND THE COMMISSIONERS AT THE
25 TABLE HERE, THIS IS THE THIRD TIME -- THE THIRD ITEM -- THAT



JULY 22, 2024

1 THE ITEMS WILL BE PRESENTED BY MTC STAFF AND STAFF FROM THE
2 OPERATOR, YOU KNOW, FOLLOWING THE BACON EISEMAN MODEL THAT WAS
3 DEVELOPED YEARS AGO AND VERY SUCCESSFUL. SO, DOES NOT GO
4 UNNOTICED. AND THANKS FOR THAT, DIRECTOR CHOY. WITH THAT I'M
5 GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO MELANIE TO KICK US OFF.

6

7 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I WANT TO GIVE A BRIEF
8 INTRODUCTION TO DRENNAN IN THE SENSE FOR THOSE OF WHO YOU HAVE
9 NOT WORKED WITH HER. SHE IS NO STRANGER TO MTC, AND THIS IS
10 HER FIRST TIME PRESENTING TO THE RNM COUNCIL. HOWEVER, SHE'S
11 BEEN WITH MTC FOR OVER 14 YEARS. SHE HAS WORK ON PROGRAMS FOR
12 IMPROVING -- FOCUSED ON IMPROVING TRANSPORTATION FOR OLDER
13 ADULTS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS.
14 AND SOME OF THE PROGRAMS SHE HAS MANAGED IS LIFELINE, NEW
15 FREEDOM, SECTION 5310, CLIPPER START AND THE COORDINATED PLAN.
16 SHE IS A PART OF DIRECTOR JASON'S LEE'S TEAM. HIS TEAM IS
17 FOCUSED ON NAVIGATION AND ACCESSIBILITY. AND WE ARE MOST
18 IMPORTANTLY HAPPY TO ALSO CO-PARTNER WITH COUNTY CONNECTION,
19 WHICH IS REALLY FANTASTIC, ON THIS PROGRAM. ONE OF THE THINGS
20 WITH ACCESSIBILITY IS THAT THERE IS SO MUCH WORK TO BE DONE IN
21 THIS SPACE AND WE CANNOT DO IT ALONE AND WE ARE VERY EXCITED
22 THAT WE CAN WORK WITH OPERATORS TO LEVERAGE RESOURCES AND
23 EXPERTISE FROM ALL OF YOU. SO WITH THAT I'M GOING HAND IT OVER
24 TO DRENNAN AND JOHN.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** GLAD TO BE HERE WITH YOU TODAY. I WANT TO
2 OFFER A BIT OF BACKGROUND ON THIS EFFORT. SO, MTC AND THE
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS FOR OVER A YEAR
4 NOW. WORK IS FOCUSED ON TWO DIFFERENT PROGRAMS FOR DISABLED
5 RIDERS FIRST ONE IS ELIGIBILITY. THE REGIONAL TRANSIT
6 CONNECTION CLIPPER PROGRAM RTC CLIPPER START PROGRAM AND ADA
7 PARATRANSIT. ROTC PROGRAM PROVIDES DISCOUNTS FOR FIXED ROUTE
8 DISABLED TRANSIT RIDERS AND ELIGIBILITY CHANGES MADE TO THE
9 ROTC PROGRAM WERE SIMPLE STRAIGHT FORWARD AND SIGNIFICANT HE
10 STREAMLINED PROCESS FOR THE PARATRANSIT RIDER. ANY PARATRANSIT
11 RIDER WHO JOINS THE ROTC PROJECT NEED ONLY TO OPT IN INSTEAD
12 OF GOING THROUGH THE ENTIRE PROCESS THAT CHANGE WAS MADE
13 THROUGH THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD AND ROLLED OUT LAST MAY.
14 THE VAST MAJORITY OF WORK DONE UNDER THIS EFFORT IS FOCUSED ON
15 ELIGIBILITY FOR PARATRANSIT THIS WORK FELL INTO THREE MAIN
16 PARTS DOCUMENTING AND UNDERSTANDING PROCESS BY WHICH ALL OF
17 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY RESEARCHING
18 INDUSTRY WIDE BEST PRACTICES AND LESSONS LEARNED FROM AROUND
19 THE COUNTY AND THEN STUDYING FRICTION POINTS BOTH FROM THE
20 RIDER PRINCIPLE AND AGENCY PERSPECTIVE TO DEVELOP
21 RECOMMENDATIONS. EARLY ON OUR WORK RECOGNIZED FULL
22 STANDARDIZATION WOULD REQUIRE LARGE INVESTMENT OF NEW FUNDING
23 SO INSTEAD WE CONSIDERED SIGNIFICANT VARIATIONS BETWEEN THE
24 TRANSIT AGENCIES WE WORKED TO EMPHASIZE UNIVERSAL PRACTICES
25 AND REDUCE THE BURDEN TO APPLICANTS AND AGENCIES WE LOOK TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 REGIONIZE SOME FUNCTIONS AND WANTED TO MINIMIZE LEVEL OF NEW
2 INVESTMENT AND ALSO ENSURING CONTINUED FEDERAL COMPLIANCE.
3 DRAFT RECOMMENDATIONS WERE DEVELOPED THROUGH THREE DIFFERENT
4 STAKEHOLDER GROUPS FIRST IS BAY PAC, PARTNERSHIP ACCESSIBILITY
5 COMMITTEE THAT'S A WORKING GROUP OF YOUR STAFF AND MTC.
6 MEMBERS OF THE NINE COUNTY PARATRANSIT COORDINATING COUNCILS,
7 THESE ARE MEMBER GROUPS WHO ADVISE TRANSIT AGENCIES ON
8 ACCESSIBILITY AND PARATRANSIT MATTERS. AND THEN LAST WAS
9 SPECIFIC OUTREACH AND ENGAGEMENT TO PARATRANSIT RIDERS THROUGH
10 THE COORDINATED PLAN UPDATE. NEXT SLIDE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. BEFORE WE DIVE INTO WHERE WE'RE GOING, A QUICK
13 RECAP ABOUT WHERE WE ARE NOW. JUST TO REVIEW, ADA PARATRANSIT
14 MUST OPERATE WITHIN THREE QUARTERS OF A MILE OF ANY ACTIVE BUS
15 ROUTE DURING THE SAME DAYS AND HOURS AS THE RIDE IS RUNNING
16 RIDERS HAVE ON GO THROUGH AN ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION PROCESS
17 WHICH IS WHAT THIS PROJECT IS FOCUSED ON AND SERVICE TYPICALLY
18 IS ALWAYS PROVIDED ON NEXT DAY BASIS FARE IS CAPPED AT NO MORE
19 THAN TWICE FIXED ROUTE AND TRIPS CAN'T BE DENIED OR
20 PRIORITIZED. IMPORTANTLY PARATRANSIT IS STRUCTURED AS CIVIL
21 RIGHTS ENTITLEMENT UNDER ADA SO ENFORCEMENT OF REGULATIONS IS
22 UP TO DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE RATHER THAN DEPARTMENT OF
23 TRANSPORTATION IN MOST CASES AND THAT HAS DEFINITELY AFFECTED
24 OUR PLANNING PROCESS OVER THE YEARS. NEXT SLIDE.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** SO NOT ALL PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
2 REQUIRED TO PROVIDE PARATRANSIT SPECIFICALLY, COMMUTER, BUS,
3 RAIL, INNER CITY RAIL SERVICES AND ARE EXEMPT, AND THERE ARE
4 SEVERAL CITIES IN BAY AREA THAT OFFER PARATRANSIT LIKE
5 PROGRAMS BUT FOR THE PURPOSE OF THIS WORK WE'RE DEALING WITH
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT SERVICES THAT ARE MANDATED BY ADA TO PROVIDE
7 PARATRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. RIDERS BECOME ELIGIBLE FOR
8 PARATRANSIT SERVICE THEY'RE UNABLE TO USE FIXED ROUTE SYSTEMS.
9 ELIGIBILITY TRANSIT AGENCIES CONSIDER A NUMBER OF FACTORS
10 INCLUDING ABILITY TO WALK AND WHEEL TO AND FROM TRANSIT STOPS
11 ABILITY TO ENTER AND EXIT TRANSIT STATIONS ABILITY TO SIGNAL
12 FOR A STOP WHEN RIDING THE BUS AND ABLE THE TO HANDLE ANY
13 NUMBER OF UNEXPECTED SITUATIONS THAT ARISE WHEN YOU ARE USING
14 THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. WHILE ADA PROVIDES CRITERIA FOR
15 DETERMINING ELIGIBILITY IT DOESN'T PROVIDE THE PROCESS FOR
16 DETERMINING ELIGIBILITY. SO, AS YOU CAN IMAGINE, EACH TRANSIT
17 AGENCY HAS THEIR OWN APPROACH TO THIS. IN OUR REGION, YOU CAN
18 FIND EVERYTHING FROM LIKE A SIMPLE PAPER BASED APPLICATION ALL
19 THE WAY TO A PROCESS THAT INVOLVES THE PAPER PROCESS AND IN-
20 PERSON INTERVIEW, AND EVEN A TRANSIT SKILLS ASSESSMENT.
21 UNIQUELY, THOUGH, IN OUR REGION, IF YOU ARE DETERMINED TO BE
22 ELIGIBLE UNDER ONE TRANSIT AGENCY, YOU'RE ELIGIBLE UNDER ALL
23 OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND ONCE YOU ARE DETERMINED TO BE
24 ELIGIBLE FOR PARATRANSIT EVEN WITH A PERMANENT DISABILITY,
25 RIDERS MUST GO THROUGH A RECERTIFY PROCESS EVERY THREE YEARS.



JULY 22, 2024

1 AND THEN, IMPORTANTLY, SOME AGENCIES EDUCATE RIDERS ON THEIR
2 MOBILITY OPTIONS BEYOND PARATRANSIT, AND PROVIDE TRAVEL
3 TRAINING REFERRALS IN THEIR COMMUNITY. SO, OUR NEXT TWO SLIDES
4 ARE THOSE WITH OUR RECOMMENDATIONS. WE FEEL THAT THE
5 RECOMMENDATIONS ON THIS NEXT SLIDE CAN BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE
6 NEXT YEAR WITH EXISTING RESOURCES. AND THESE ARE FOCUSED ON
7 IMPROVING CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. STARTING AT THE TOP. FIRST IS TO STANDARDIZE
10 APPLICATION FORMS MAKE THEM AVAILABLE ONLINE AND INCLUDE
11 TRANSLATED VERSIONS TO MEET TITLE SIX REQUIREMENTS. OF COURSE,
12 THEY ALSO NEED TO BE COMPLIANT WITH THE CURRENT CONTENT WEB
13 ACCESSIBILITY GUIDELINES THAT CAME OUT ALMOST A YEAR AGO. THE
14 IDEA HERE IS TO HAVE A UNIVERSAL APPLICATION FORM THAT ALL
15 AGENCIES CAN START WITH AND THEN ADD LOCAL SUPPLEMENTS AS
16 NEEDED FOR SPECIAL PROGRAMS OF DIFFERENT AGENCIES. WE ALSO
17 WANT TO MAKE IT AS EASY AS POSSIBLE FOR PEOPLE TO ACCESS IT.
18 WE DID WORK OUT A MOSTLY COMMON APPLICATION ABOUT 15 YEARS
19 AGO, I WANT TO SAY IT WAS, BUT THERE HAVE BEEN A LOT OF
20 CHANGES SINCE THEN, AND IT'S JUST TIME FOR A MAJOR OVERHAUL.
21 NEXT UP, WE WANT TO STANDARDIZE THE ELIGIBILITY INTERVIEW
22 PROTOCOLS FOR AGENCIES THAT ARE USING IN-PERSON PHONE AND
23 PAPER BASED ASSESSMENTS. BASICALLY THE IDEA IS TO MAKE SURE
24 THAT THE SAME QUESTIONS ARE BEING ASKED OF THE APPLICANT NO
25 MATTER WHERE THEY'RE APPLYING AND THE SAME INFORMATION IS



JULY 22, 2024

1 BEING CAPTURED NO MATTER WHO IS CONDUCTING THE ASSESSMENT.
2 THIRD WE WANT TO STANDARDIZE THE APPEALS PROCESS. THERE IS
3 SOME FEDERAL GUIDANCE ABOUT THIS. BUT, AGAIN, IT SPEAKS MORE
4 TO THE OUTCOME THAN THE PROCESS. SO, WHEN AN APPLICATION IS
5 FOUND INELIGIBLE OR AN APPLICATION -- THE APPLICANT IS ONLY
6 GIVEN LIMITED ELIGIBILITY, THEY HAVE A LEGAL RIGHT TO APPEAL
7 THAT DECISION. CURRENTLY THE AGENCIES USE PROCESSES TO HEAR
8 AND DECIDE APPEALS RANGING FROM, ESSENTIALLY, NO PROCESS, AT
9 ALL, TO VERY SOPHISTICATED SEMI-JUDICIAL ARRANGEMENTS WITH A
10 FULL PANEL OF EXPERTS AND DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDER GROUPS THAT,
11 KIND OF THING. THE IDEA IS TO PROMULGATE BEST PRACTICES THAT
12 AGENCIES CAN USE TO MAKE SURE THEIR PROCESSES ARE FULLY
13 COMPLIANT AND ALSO TO OFFER A SMALLER AGENCIES THAT MAY NOT
14 HAVE THE RESOURCES OR THE INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY TO CONVENE
15 THESE HEARINGS, TO GIVE THEM SOME OPTION THAT THEY CAN, SORT
16 OF, RENT THE PANEL AS NEEDED. WE WANT TO STANDARDIZE
17 DEFINITIONS OF ELIGIBILITY CATEGORIES AND RENEWAL TIMELINES.
18 THIS ONE WE ALREADY D WE WORKED WITH PARATRANSIT STAFF FROM
19 AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. WE HAD MONTHS AND MONTHS OF
20 BAY PAC MEETINGS ABOUT IT. TOOK US CLOSE TO A YEAR BUT WE DID
21 HASH OUT THE DETAILS AND NOW WE HAVE A STANDARD SET OF
22 DEFINITIONS FOR THE VARIOUS ASPECTS OF ELIGIBILITY, SUCH AS
23 CONDITIONAL, UNCONDITIONABLE, PERMANENT, TEMPORARY, AND SO
24 FORTH. WE ALSO MADE THE SWITCH FROM PERMANENT ELIGIBILITY
25 TERMS OF THREE YEARS BETWEEN RECERTIFICATIONS TO FIVE YEARS.



JULY 22, 2024

1 THAT SEEMS LIKE A SMALL SWITCH. BUT THAT'S ALREADY PAYING
2 MAJOR DIVIDENDS IN TERMS OF THE COMFORT AND CONVENIENCE OF OUR
3 CUSTOMERS AS WELL AS SAVING A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF STAFF TIME
4 AND RESOURCES FOR THE OPERATORS. IT'S A WIN, WIN, AND IT'S
5 VERY WELL WORTH CELEBRATING. NEXT, WE WANT TO EXPLORE NON-IN-
6 PERSON ASSESSMENTS FOR SOME ELIGIBILITY CATEGORIES THAT ARE
7 NOT NECESSARILY CONDUCIVE TO IN-PERSON INTERVIEWS. FOR THOSE
8 AGENCIES CONDUCTING IN-PERSON ASSESSMENTS IT DOESN'T ACTUALLY
9 MAKE SENSE TO DO SO IN EVERY CASE. FOR EXAMPLE, IF THE
10 APPLICATION IS SUBMITTED BY A SOCIAL WORKER AT AN ADHC, AND
11 THE APPLICANT IS 90 YEARS OLD AND THERE IS DEMENTIA THERE IS
12 NO INFORMATION TO BE GAINED FROM BRINGING THEM IN FOR AN
13 INTERVIEW, SO REMAINING HUMAN AND MORE COST EFFECTIVE NOT TO
14 DO THAT.

15

16 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** SIX IS TO IDENTIFY PROMOTE PARATRANSIT
17 ALTERNATIVES INCORPORATE TRAVEL TRAINING REFERRALS I MENTIONED
18 ALL AGENCIES ARE NOT INTEGRATING MOBILITY MANAGEMENT WITH
19 THEIR ELIGIBILITY PROCESS WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE THIS HAPPEN
20 GIVING CUSTOMERS OTHER OPTIONS. NEXT ACTION PLAN TO DESIGNATE
21 MOBILITY MANAGERS IN EACH COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THESE
22 RECOMMENDATIONS WE FEEL CAN ALSO BE IMPLEMENTED WITHIN THE
23 NEXT YEAR WITH SMALL AMOUNT OF INVESTMENT. SO, SEVEN IS
24 RECOMMENDING THAT MTC HOST ANNUAL PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY
25 TRAININGS TO ENHANCE EVALUATOR SKILLS, TRAINING WILL IMPROVE



JULY 22, 2024

1 OUR CONSISTENCY AND OVERALL QUALITY AND WE ESTIMATE THIS TO BE
2 LESS THAN \$10,000 A YEAR. EIGHT IS TO LEARN ABOUT NEW
3 ELIGIBILITY VENDORS THIS CAN BE DONE WITH SUPPORT FROM MTC,
4 MTC AGENCY STAFF WOULD RESEARCH NEW VENDORS AND MTC COULD ADD
5 THIS INFORMATION TO OUR EXISTING VENDOR DATABASE AND AGENCIES
6 COULD TAP INTO THAT RESOURCE WHEN THEY'RE HOLDING PROCUREMENT.
7 NINE IS TO EXPLORE TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS TO ENHANCE ELIGIBILITY.
8 THE PROMISE OF THESE TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS IS THEY WILL ENHANCE
9 ACCURACY AND CONSISTENCY AND WE SHOULD BE INVESTIGATING THESE
10 OPTIONS. THEY COULD ALSO INTEGRATE WITH UPDATING SCHEDULE AND
11 DISPATCHING SOFTWARE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** TEN, WE WANT TO DEVELOP ONGOING MONITORING STRATEGIES
14 FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE. THIS IS ALREADY HAPPENING ON THE FIXED
15 ROUTE TRANSIT SIDE WITH THE GREAT WORK THAT DIRECTOR CHOY'S
16 TEAM HAS BEEN DOING AND WE THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO BRING THE
17 SAME TRANSPARENCY TO THE PARATRANSIT NETWORK AS WELL. THAT
18 SAID, PARATRANSIT OPERATIONS ARE VERY DIFFERENT FROM FIXED
19 ROUTE BUS OPS SO SETTING METRICS IN A TARGET KPI SPECIFIC TO
20 PARATRANSIT ARE NEEDED AND THAT'S WHERE WE WANT TO GO WITH
21 THAT. LAST BUT NOT LEAST, WE WANT TO EXPLORE THE INCREASING
22 THE APPLICATION OF TRIP CONDITIONAL ELIGIBILITY. THIS IS GOING
23 TO BE A TOUGH ONE. TRIP BY TRIP ELIGIBILITY IS COMPLICATED
24 IMPLEMENTING THROUGHOUT THE REGION WOULD BE SUBSTANTIAL
25 INCREASE IN COST OF LABOR ELIGIBILITY ASSESSMENTS RESERVATIONS



JULY 22, 2024

1 DISPATCHING TECHNOLOGY TO SAY NOTHING OF OPERATIONAL COST TO
2 BRING PEOPLE TO APPOINTMENTS. THE GOAL HERE IS TO REALLY STUDY
3 THE ISSUE IN A RIGOROUS AND SYSTEMATIC WAY AND TO FIGURE OUT
4 WHAT THOSE PROBABLE COSTS ACTUALLY ARE AS WELL AS DEVELOPING A
5 SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS, BEST PRACTICES, FOR AGENCIES THAT DO
6 WANT TO IMPLEMENT, SO THAT EVERYBODY CAN MOVE FORWARD ON THE
7 SAME PAGE.

8

9 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WE DO HAVE RECOMMENDED
10 NEXT STEPS. WE REALLY WOULD LIKE TO HEAR YOUR FEEDBACK AND
11 THEN WE'RE AIMING TO TAKE THE REPORT TO THE RNM COMMITTEE IN
12 THE FALL. AND BASED ON WHAT WE HEAR FROM YOU ALL TODAY, MTC
13 AND BAY PAC WILL CONTINUE TO COORDINATE ON POLICY CHANGES AND
14 IMPLEMENTATION FROM THESE RECOMMENDATIONS. AND THEN WE'LL
15 REPORT BACK TO YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.

16

17 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS FOR THAT, DRENNAN, AND JOHN, VERY
18 THOROUGH PRESENTATION. BEFORE WE GO TO COMMISSION MEMBERS
19 HERE. DENIS, I SEE YOU HAD YOUR LIGHT ON HANG ON JUST ONE
20 SECOND. MADAM CLERK WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT AND CHECK IN
21 WITH THE PUBLIC ON THIS TOPIC.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS HERE IN THE ROOM.
24 ALETA DUPREE FIRST, AND THEN ADINA LEVIN, PLEASE.

25



JULY 22, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA
2 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. WE DON'T
3 TALK ABOUT PARATRANSIT VERY MUCH AND WE SHOULD. WE REALLY
4 SHOULD. EVERY AGENCY SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT PARATRANSIT. IT
5 IS AN INTIMIDATING PROCESS. I AM NOT A PARATRANSIT QUALIFIED
6 USER. BUT I KNOW SOME WHO ARE. AND I'M GOING TO SPEAK ABOUT
7 PROCESS TODAY. I THINK I HEARD SOMETHING ABOUT THAT -- I DON'T
8 KNOW, PARATRANSIT DOESN'T APPLY TO COMMUTER RAIL, I THINK LONG
9 ISLAND AND METRO NORTH PAY INTO THAT I THINK NEW JERSEY
10 TRANSIT PAYS INTO THAT, CALTRAIN PAYS INTO THAT, BART DOES. I
11 AM GOING TO HAVE TO REPLAY WHAT WAS SAID. I WAS THINKING ABOUT
12 ALMOST 11 CONDITIONAL TRIP. THE WORDS CONDITIONAL TRIP WHAT
13 DOES THAT MEAN? IT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THAT THE TRIPS CANNOT BE
14 CONDITIONED ON THE PURPOSE OF THE TRIP. WHETHER YOU WANT TO GO
15 TO THE STORE, OR PHARMACY, OR TO THE ART MUSEUM OR TO VISIT
16 YOUR MOTHER, I DON'T THINK IT MATTERS. BUT THERE SHOULD BE
17 STANDARDS. IT WOULD BE NICE IF WE HAD A NATIONAL STANDARD
18 THAT'S PORTABLE SO THAT PEOPLE WHO GO TO OTHER CITIES CAN USE
19 PARATRANSIT INSTEAD OF HAVING TO RECERTIFY WITH EACH AGENCY.
20 BUT HOW DO WE LEARN MORE ABOUT PARATRANSIT? THEY TALK ABOUT
21 PARATRANSIT A LOT IN NEW YORK. THEY TALK ABOUT IT A LOT IN LAS
22 VEGAS. WE SHOULD BE TALKING ABOUT IT HERE, AND NOT JUST
23 TALKING ABOUT IT, BUT DOING SOMETHING ABOUT IT. THANK YOU.
24
25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. s



JULY 22, 2024

1
2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. IT'S GOOD TO SEE THESE PROPOSED
3 IMPROVEMENTS HERE AS PART OF THE PARATRANSIT AND ACCESSIBLE
4 TRANSPORTATION IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND SEAMLESS
5 SUPPORT, SEE BAY AREA ACROSS DISABILITY TRANSIT, I CAN'T GET
6 OUR OWN ACRONYM RIGHT, BUT WITH A BACK STACK WITH SET OF
7 GROUPS OF PEOPLE WITH LIVED EXPERIENCE REPRESENTING
8 ORGANIZATIONS SUPPORTING SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES
9 WHO ARE COMMENTING ON THEIR OWN BEHALF SOME OF THESE FOLKS WHO
10 GAVE COMMENTS ARE NOT HERE IN THE ROOM, BUT I'M GENERALLY
11 REPORTING COMMENTARY IN TERMS OF VERY MUCH SUPPORTING THESE
12 DIRECTIONS. THE IMPROVING THE CONVENIENCE OF PARATRANSIT
13 ELIGIBILITY IS SOMETHING THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO PROVIDE
14 ACCESS TO SERVICE FOR PEOPLE WHO VERY MUCH NEED IT, AND SEEING
15 THE MOBILITY MANAGEMENT BEING PART OF THE TRANSFORMATION
16 ACTION PLAN IN HAVING PARATRANSIT ACCESSIBLE TRANSPORTATION
17 BEING EASY TO USE AND ACCESS IS JUST CRITICAL FOR PEOPLE AND
18 SUCH A GREAT FIT AS CONSIDERING IT AS PART OF THE OVERALL
19 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO MAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
20 EASIER TO USE FOR PEOPLE AND PROVIDE MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE,
21 ESPECIALLY PEOPLE WHO FULLY DEPEND ON THIS TRANSPORTATION. AND
22 LASTLY, AS THE CONVERSATION GOES INTO FUNDING, IT'S REALLY
23 IMPORTANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE IS FUNDING TO DELIVER THESE
24 IMPORTANT INITIATIVES AND AS IT GOES INTO FUNDING MEASURES,
25 THINK ABOUT POLLING. BECAUSE THE GENERAL PUBLIC THINKS THAT



JULY 22, 2024

1 PROVIDING SERVICES FOR PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON TRANSIT IS GOOD,
2 AND THAT CAN HELP BRING THE SUPPORT THAT WE NEED TO GET THE
3 FUNDING, DELIVER THE SERVICE, PROVIDE MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE WHO
4 NEED IT. THANK YOU

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS.

7

8 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU MADAM CLERK. COMMISSIONERS,
9 WHY DON'T WE GO AND START WITH DENIS MULLIGAN.

10

11 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** THANKS MY COMMENT IS SIMILAR TO ALETA'S AND
12 THAT IS FOCUS ON 11. THAT IS STUDY. IF YOU'RE GOING TO STUDY.
13 I DO WANT TO RAISE SOME CAUTION. I THINK TRIP BY TRIP
14 ELIGIBILITY FOR SOME INDIVIDUALS MAY GO BEYOND BEING EXCESS I.
15 IT MAY BE A SOURCE OF INCREDIBLE FRUSTRATION FOR THOSE
16 CUSTOMERS THAT USE PARATRANSIT A LOT. SO IF YOU ARE GOING
17 STUDY IT, I ENCOURAGE TO YOU LOOK AT THE PROS AND CONS OF
18 BLANKET ELIGIBILITY AS OPPOSED TO -- WITH RESPECT TO
19 CUSTOMERS, AS OPPOSED TO TRIP BY ELIGIBILITY. I THINK THAT
20 WOULD BE QUITE PROBLEMATIC FOR SOME OF OUR USERS AND IT WOULD
21 CREATE ADDITIONAL STAFF NEEDS THAT I THINK COULD BE EXCESSIVE
22 TO AGENCIES AND THINK OF THE COST OF IT. IF 11 WASN'T ON THE
23 LIST I WOULD BE OKAY WITH IT. BECAUSE IT SAYS STUDY. I'M OKAY
24 WITH IT, BUT I THINK THE STUDY IS SOMETHING WE'LL WANT TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 CLOSELY REVIEW THE RESULTS. CONCERNED HOW IT COULD AFFECT OUR
2 CUSTOMERS WHO USE THESE SERVICES.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS, DENNIS. CAROLYN THEN BILL.

5

6 **CAROLYN GONOT:** YEAH. I APPRECIATE THE REPORT. TWO QUESTIONS.
7 ONE WAS ON NUMBER 11. I WORKED FOR UTAH TRANSIT AUTHORITY,
8 WHICH WAS SIX COUNTIES, BUT THE MAIN COUNTY THAT HAD THE
9 PARATRANSIT THAT UTA RAN, WHICH WAS IN-HOUSE, WAS SALT LAKE
10 COUNTY, OF COURSE. AND THAT WAS THE AREA THAT WE HANDLED, AND
11 I THINK WE DID DAVIS AND WEAVER COUNTIES, AS WELL. WHAT WAS
12 INTERESTING TO ME IS WE DID CONDITIONAL, BUT WE WERE VERY WELL
13 AWARE. IT'S A LOT OF WORK, BUT IT WAS CONDITIONAL IN THE SENSE
14 OF IT WASN'T CONDITIONAL BY TRIP TYPE, BY PURPOSE OF TRIP, IT
15 WAS TRIP TYPE. SO, IT DEPENDED. SO BUT THERE WAS A LOT OF WORK
16 THAT NEEDED TO BE DONE. THE PROBLEM WAS IT WAS MEASURED BY THE
17 RULE THAT THEY WERE GOING TO TAKE AS TO WHAT KIND OF TRIP,
18 WHETHER THEY NEEDED PARATRANSIT OR NOT, OR THEY ONLY NEEDED
19 PARATRANSIT TO TAKE THEM TO THE RAIL STOP THEN THEY BEING GET
20 ON THE RAIL OR IF THEY DIDN'T OR IF THEY WERE A PERSON WHO
21 COULD NEVER GET ON TO THE RAIL CAR WHETHER RIGHT RAIL OR
22 COMMUTER THAT WAS THE CONDITION IF THEY COULD WALK FAR ENOUGH
23 TO GET TO THE BUS STOP THAT NEEDED TO BE THERE OR WAS WALKING
24 LIMITED. THOSE THINGS. DEPENDENT ON THE ROUTE IT'S DIFFICULT I
25 DON'T KNOW WE WOULD EVER SEE THOSE SAVINGS AND PARTICULARLY TO



JULY 22, 2024

1 BE ABLE TO DO THAT ACROSS THE REGION YOU WOULD HAVE TO KNOW
2 ANOTHER OF OTHER OPERATORS. SO, I WOULD SAY IT WAS GREAT FOR
3 UTA, BECAUSE WE WERE DOING IT MOSTLY IN ONE COUNTY AND WE
4 OWNED IT, AND THAT'S WHAT WE DID AND WE HAD A FANTASTIC
5 PROGRAM. IF ANYONE WANTS TO SEE A GREAT PROGRAM, UTAH HAS IT.
6 I HAVE NEVER SEEN ANYTHING LIKE IT. BUT IT WAS REALLY
7 DIFFICULT. SO TO STUD THE AND UNDERSTAND IT, ACTUALLY IT WAS
8 AMAZING AND IT KEPT COST DOWN I WILL SAY THAT. THE OTHER THING
9 I WANTED TO KNOW AND I WANT TO MIKE SURE EVERYBODY UNDERSTANDS
10 EVERYBODY ONE OF US GENERAL MANAGERS CARE ABOUT PARATRANSIT
11 IT'S ON OUR MINDS A LOT WE HEAR ABOUT IT A LOT. I'M FOCUSED ON
12 IT A LOT AND I DO CARE ABOUT, LIKE, THE ELIGIBILITY ISSUES,
13 ALSO, DO WE HAVE THE RESOURCES TO BE ABLE TO DO IT, ARE OUR
14 PROVIDERS -- MOSTLY CONTRACTORS, ARE THEY PROVIDING WHAT WE
15 NEED FOR OUR USERS. SO, I GUESS THE QUESTION IS HOW HAVE THE
16 TRANSIT AGENCIES BEEN ENGAGED IN THIS EFFORT? BECAUSE I WAS
17 HEARING ADINA TALK USER ABOUT USERS OF THE SYSTEM. IT'S
18 EXPENSE 55 SERVICE, BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE ARE REAL
19 THOUGHTFUL WAYS, AND I SEE ALL THE DIVERSITY OF ALL THE
20 DIFFERENT AGENCIES AND THOSE THAT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO PROVIDE
21 SERVICE AND COST SAVINGS I UNDERSTAND HOW THE TRANSIT AGENCIES
22 WERE ENGAGED.

23

24 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** WHY DON'T WE DO THIS. I HAVE BEEN IN
25 CONTACT WITH DIRECTOR CHOY. WE'RE GOING TO BRING THIS ITEM



JULY 22, 2024

1 BACK. THERE ARE GOOD COMMENTS. CAROLYN I WANT TO MAKE SURE I'M
2 RESPECTFUL TO YOU AND YOUR QUESTIONS. THIS ITEM IS GOING TO
3 COME BACK DRENNAN AND JOHN SOME GOOD COMMENTARY ESPECIALLY ON
4 ITEM 11 AND DIRECTORS WE'LL BRING IT BACK AND TACKLE THAT
5 QUESTION AT THAT. BILL.

6

7 **BILL CHURCHILL:** I STRONGLY AGREE THAT ELIGIBILITY AND
8 CONSOLIDATION IS AND STREAMLINING MAKING IT SIMILAR IS
9 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT TO THE REGION SO VERY STRONG SUPPORT OF
10 THAT. COUPLE OF THINGS WANT TO POINT OUT THAT COULD BE
11 POTENTIAL COLLISIONS, ACTION 21 FOR EXAMPLE, WHEN IT WENT TO
12 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, DESIGNATED MOBILITY MANAGER PER
13 COUNTY. I THINK WE LEARNED OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS THAT
14 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT IS NOT SOMETHING THAT LIVES WITHIN THE
15 BORDERS OF A COUNTY. FOR EXAMPLE, COUNTY CONNECTION IS DOING
16 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT ACROSS COUNTY BORDERS. SO, I'M NOT SURE
17 THAT A 1-TO-1 DESIGNATION AS IT WAS SUGGESTED IN THE ORIGINAL
18 ACTION ITEM IS PROBABLY THE RIGHT THING ANYMORE. THINGS
19 EVOLVE. SO, I WOULD STRONGLY URGE TO YOU CONSIDER THAT AND
20 THINK ABOUT WHAT THAT REALLY MEANS IN THE LARGER REGIONAL
21 SCALE SECONDLY UNDER YOUR RECOMMENDATION NINE, EXPLORE
22 TECHNICAL SOLUTIONS, WHEN I READ THROUGH THE STAFF REPORT, AND
23 I RECOGNIZE THAT DID NOT COME FROM EITHER OF YOU, BUT THERE
24 WAS A RECOMMENDATION TO EMPLOY CONTINUOUS DYNAMIC OPTIMIZATION
25 SCHEDULING TOOLS, THAT IS ACTUALLY LIMITING THE NUMBER OF



JULY 22, 2024

1 VENDORS TO SOMETHING VERY SPECIFIC. SO, IT'S ACTUALLY WITHIN
2 THE STAFF REPORT CALLING OUT A RECOMMENDATION TO A TYPE OR A
3 VENDOR WITHIN SCHEDULING, WHICH I DO NOT BELIEVE HAS A ROLE OR
4 IS APPROPRIATE WHEN LOOKING AT ELIGIBILITY. SO I WANTED TO
5 MAKE SURE THAT WAS PUT OUT THERE AND THIRDLY I AGREE WITH
6 CAROLYN AND DENIS THAT CONDITIONAL ELIGIBILITY IS A PANDORA'S
7 BOX, IT CAN BE A GOOD THING, I CAN SUPPORT THAT BUT RECOGNIZE
8 IT CAN BE A CHALLENGING THING FOR ALL OF US WHERE WE PUT A LOT
9 OF MONEY, EFFORT, AND GET NO REAL GAIN OUT OF IT AT THE END OF
10 THE DAY. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANKS BILL. ANDY?

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANKS JOHN AND DRENNAN. I APPRECIATE THE FACT
15 THESE ITEMS ARE PRESENTED. MY QUESTION IS AROUND THE
16 RECERTIFICATION CERTIFICATION PROCESS AND RECERTIFICATION. I
17 APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORTS TO STREAMLINE AND MAKE IT EASY ON
18 THE CUSTOMER BUT WITH REGARDS TO CHALLENGE WE HEARD ABOUT
19 PERIODICALLY POTENTIALLY DEAD TIME BETWEEN RECERTIFICATION AND
20 TRAVEL. ARE WE ABLE TO DO ANYTHING WHAT'S THE REASON FOR
21 HAVING TO RECERTIFY EVERY TIME.

22

23 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** UPKEEP YOU'RE STILL IN TOUCH WITH THE
24 CUSTOMER, YOU DON'T HAVE TO GO IN-PERSON, YOU'RE JUST
25 PROVIDING UPDATES TO YOUR MOBILITY. I HAVEN'T HEARD ABOUT DEAD



JULY 22, 2024

1 TIME RECENTLY BUT IT'S CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT EVERYONE
2 THINKS ABOUT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** THANK YOU. JEFFREY TUMLIN SFMTA.

5

6 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** YEAH THANKS FOR THE GREAT WORK HELPING US
7 REMOVE BARRIERS ACROSS THE REGION I HAD A QUICK QUESTION
8 NUMBER THREE STANDARDIZES APPEALS PROCESS MY STAFF TELL ME
9 THIS IS ABOUT UPLIFTING SMALLER OPERATORS UP TO A CONSISTENT
10 SET STANDARD RATHER THAN BRINGING DOWN ORGANIZATIONS LIKE
11 MUNI? OKAY. JUST WANTED TO CONFIRM THAT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. JOHN, YOU HAVE HEARD, AGAIN, SOME
14 CONSISTENT THEMES FROM THE DAIS HERE. AND FROM THE PUBLIC
15 COMMENT HERE. DIRECTOR CHOY WILL NAVIGATE, YOU KNOW, BRINGING
16 THIS BACK HERE AND UPDATING US HERE AT A FUTURE MEETING,
17 DIRECTOR CHOY, SO, DRENNAN, TO YOU AND JOHN, THANKS FOR BEING
18 IN FRONT OF THIS COMMISSION. THANK YOU. OKAY. WITH THAT, I
19 THINK THAT WILL CLOSE THIS ITEM, MADAM CLERK. THREE. AND THIS
20 WAS ITEM 3C. ITEM NUMBER FOUR, A LONG TIME IN COMING HERE,
21 DIRECTOR CHOY, BUT THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

22

23 **MELANIE CHOY:** I'LL BE BRIEF. TWO THINGS THERE IS A QUARTERLY
24 REPORT THAT WE POSTED TO OUR WEB SITE REGARDING THE RNM
25 COUNCIL WORKPLAN WE WANT TO MAKE SURE YOU ALL GET THAT.



JULY 22, 2024

1 SOMETHING NOT CONTAINED IN THE QUARTERLY REPORT THAT HAS
2 HAPPENED, LATER THIS WEEK MTC COMMISSION WILL BE SCHEDULED TO
3 TAKE ACTION ON FIVE AGREEMENTS TO EXPAND THE CLIPPER BAY PASS
4 PILOT PROGRAM SO WE WILL BE ADDING FIVE ADDITIONAL EMPLOYERS
5 AND BUSINESSES, OR ORGANIZATIONS TO CLIPPER BAY PASS. AND THEN
6 THE SECOND THING I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT IS THAT IN, EARLIER
7 THIS MONTH, CALTRANS AWARDED A GRANT TO MTC ON BEHALF OF THE
8 ONE-SEAT RIDE PILOT WORK AND IT'S TO DO AN EVALUATION IN TERMS
9 OF OUR INVESTMENT IN THE ONE-SEAT RIDE PILOT. SO, THAT'S
10 FORTHCOMING IN TERMS OF THE PILOTS. BUT WE RECEIVED A GRANT TO
11 EVALUATE AND SEE WHAT REALLY WORKS. SO, I JUST WANT TO
12 HIGHLIGHT THOSE TWO THINGS. BUT IN CLOSING, WHAT I REALLY ALSO
13 WANTED TO COMMENT ON IS A LOT OF THESE THINGS WE'RE FOCUSED ON
14 ARE REGIONAL INITIATIVES BUT IT REALLY GOES HAND-IN-HAND WITH
15 ALL THE WORK THAT YOU ARE DOING, AND REALLY THESE THINGS
16 COORDINATE BE DONE IF THERE WASN'T AN UNDERLYING SYSTEM AND
17 SERVICE THAT YOU ALL ARE WORKING ON. SO, IT'S EVIDENT IN THE
18 NEWS THAT WE SEE AROUND US, AND, FOR EXAMPLE, SFMTA HAD A
19 CUSTOMER SATISFACTION SURVEY THAT WAS EXTREMELY POSITIVE
20 RECENTLY, AND IT'S HIGHEST SINCE 2001 BUT THERE IS A LOT OF
21 THINGS HAPPENING, THERE IS BART'S ROLE IN THE REGION MALL
22 REPORT AND AGENCIES ARE TESTING OUT MICRO TRANSIT LOOKING AT
23 NEW THINGS. SO, I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT THAT WHILE WE ARE
24 DISCUSSING ALL OF THE REGIONAL INITIATIVES THAT IS UNDERLYING



JULY 22, 2024

1 ALL THE WORK THAT IS BEING DONE AT YOUR AGENCIES. AND WITH
2 THAT, I WILL CLOSE MY REPORT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, DIRECTOR CHOY.
5 I'M GOING TO MOVE THIS MEETING ALONG A LITTLE BIT HERE. LET ME
6 GO TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON
7 ANY OTHER ITEMS THAT WERE NOT ON THE AGENDA FOR THIS
8 AFTERNOON?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE IS NO
11 ONE ONLINE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO SPEAKER CARDS IN THE
12 ROOM.

13

14 **CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS:** GOING TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SEVEN WHICH
15 IS ADJOURNMENT AND THE NEXT MEETING. IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE ALL
16 SCHEDULED HERE FOR MONDAY, AUGUST 26TH AT 11:30 OVER AT BART
17 HEADQUARTERS. AND IF THAT GETS CHANGED, WE'LL CERTAINLY NOTIFY
18 MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION AND THE PUBLIC. AND WITH THAT, MADAM
19 CLERK, THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

20



NTT

Broadcasting Government