METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE
2	FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 3RD, 2023, 9:45 AM
3	
4	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL
5	TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION
6	COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.
7	COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING REMOTELY
8	SHOULD USE THE ZOOM RAISE HAND FEATURE, AND YOU WILL BE CALLED
9	UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. EVERY SPEAKER VIRTUALLY AND
10	HERE WILL BE ALLOCATED A MINUTE. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDS WILL
11	BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
12	DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION A ROLL CALL WILL
13	BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS TODAY. WILL THE CLERK CONDUCT
14	ROLL CALL
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CANEPA?
17	
18	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CARLSON?
21	
22	SPEAKER: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?



1	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK OF THE BOARD: GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?
4	
5	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK OF THE BOARD: HAHN IS ABSENT. NOACK?
8	
9	SUE NOACK: HERE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?
12	
13	DAVID RABBIT: HERE.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAMOS GOT DELAYED BUT HER TELECONFERENCE
16	LOCATION IS STILL OPEN. MEMBER SPERING?
17	
18	JAMES P. SPERING: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIEDEMANN?
21	
22	AARON TIEDEMANN: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE A QUORUM.
25	



1	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. MAY I HAVE A MOTION TO APPROVE
2	THE CONSENT CALENDAR.
3	
4	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: I'LL MAKE THAT MOTION. MONUMENT ON
5	PETERS.
6	
7	DAVID RABBIT: SECOND.
8	
9	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: ROLL CALL PLEASE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
12	THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
13	AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
14	PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME. CHAIR CANEPA?
15	
16	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: RYU.
17	
18	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ARREGUIN?
19	
20	V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?
23	
24	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
25	



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CARLSON?
2	
3	SPEAKER: AYE.
4	
5	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CARLSON HOW WOULD YOU LIKE TO VOTE ON THE
6	CONSENT CALENDAR?
7	
8	SPEAKER: AYE.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MEMBER EKLUND?
11	
12	PAT EKLUND: HERE. PRESENT.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: HOW WOULD YOU LIKE TO VOTE ON THE CONSENT
15	CALENDAR?
16	
17	PAT EKLUND: AYE. SORRY.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?
20	
21	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NOACK?
24	
25	SUE NOACK: YES.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?
3	
4	DAVID RABBIT: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RAMOS IS ABSENT. SPERING?
7	
8	JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.
9	
10	CLERK OF THE BOARD: TIEDEMANN?
11	
12	AARON TIEDEMANN: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
15	PRESENT.
16	
17	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: I THINK YOU SKIPPED ME. I DON'T REMEMBER
18	SAYING AYE.
19	
20	CLERK OF THE BOARD: YOU DID.
21	
22	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: DID I? MY MEMORY IS GETTING BAD.
23	
24	CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM THREE A REGIONAL
25	TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE UPDATE. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN



- 1 AND DAVE VAUTIN. FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF. WE'LL START WITH
- 2 REBECCA LONG TO DO THE INTRODUCTION. I UNDERSTAND THIS IS
- 3 GOING TO BE A ROBUST DISCUSSION WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT.
- 4 AND WE'RE LOOKING FOR STRONG DIRECTION TO OUR STAFF. WITH
- 5 THAT, REBECCA.

- 7 REBECCA LONG: REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
- 8 AFFAIRS. I'LL GAVE AN OVERVIEW OF THIS ITEM, THEN HAND IT OVER
- 9 TO MY COLLEAGUES, GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN AND DAVE VAUTIN. WE
- 10 GAVE YOU A HIGH-LEVEL UPDATE ON STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK WE
- 11 RECEIVED ON THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO ADDRESS THE
- 12 TRANSIT FUNDING FISCAL CLIFF AND OTHER TRANSPORTATION
- 13 PRIORITIES AND SHARED OPTIONS WE HAVE BEEN PRESENTING FOR
- 14 FEEDBACK. TODAY WE'RE BRINGING A REFINED PROPOSAL RECOGNIZING
- 15 THE LEGISLATION WILL BE A HEAVY LIFT OUR DRAFT PROPOSAL IS
- 16 INFORMED BY EXTENSIVE PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER OUTREACH AND WE
- 17 BELIEVE IT'S ALIGNED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WE'RE MOVING
- 18 FORWARD WITH THE NEXT PLANNED UPDATE BUT MUCH IS DIRECTED
- 19 TOWARDS THE SAME GOALS WE BELIEVE IT REFLECTS PRIORITIES OF
- 20 BAY AREA VOTERS BASED ON POLLING WE HAVE DONE BACK IN MARCH
- 21 BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA OUTREACH AND ON
- 22 CONSENSUS FROM KEY TRANSPORTATION STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING
- 23 EXECUTIVES, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, GENERAL MANAGERS
- 24 OF TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, ET CETERA. AND ALL OF THAT SUPPORT
- 25 AND KIND OF COALITION BUILDING IS GOING TO BE CRITICAL BOTH IN



- 1 SACRAMENTO AND ULTIMATELY ON THE BALLOT. WE'RE ALSO IN THE
- 2 MIDST OF MEETING WITH MEMBERS OF THE BAY AREA LEGISLATIVE
- 3 DELEGATION WHO CERTAINLY WILL WANT TO HAVE A SAY ON WHAT THIS
- 4 LOOKS LIKE AND DOING ANOTHER ROUND OF POLLING WHICH WILL HAVE
- 5 THE RESULTS OF BEFORE WE COME TO YOU NEXT MONTHS. BUT TODAY IS
- 6 REALLY ABOUT GETTING YOUR FEEDBACK AS WE PREPARE TO BRING
- 7 FINAL OUTLINE OF THE LEGISLATION FOR ACTION IN DECEMBER. AND
- 8 THERE REALLY -- THERE ARE ABOUT FIVE ITEMS. I'M GOING TO RUN
- 9 THROUGH SO YOU CAN FOCUS IN ON THESE AS DAVE AND GEORGIA
- 10 PRESENT THAT, WE'RE LOOKING FOR YOUR FEEDBACK ON, THE PROPOSED
- 11 GOAL FOCUS AREAS AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR THE MEASURE.
- 12 PROPOSED EXPENDITURE CATEGORIES, PROPOSED INTENTIONS TO HOW
- 13 LEGISLATION SHOULD BE STRUCTURES MORE FLEXIBLE SIMILAR TO
- 14 ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR COUNTY SALES TAXES OR SHOULD IT BE
- 15 TIGHTLY DEFINED. MENU OF REVENUE OPTIONS AND LAST BUT NOT
- 16 LEAST WHAT POLICY CHANGES YOU WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOMETIMES
- 17 REFERRED TO AS REFORMS OR ACCOUNTABILITY AIMED AT ACCELERATING
- 18 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FOR INCLUSION IN THE MEASURE ITSELF.
- 19 WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO ASSISTANT DIRECTORS DAVE VAUTIN
- 20 AND GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN.
- 22 DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. DAVE VAUTIN WITH
- 23 OUR REGIONAL PLANNING TEAM. AS REBECCA SAID, OUR PRESENTATION
- 24 TODAY BUILDS ON WHAT WE SHARED IN SEPTEMBER 2023 WITH THIS
- 25 COMMITTEE. I'M GOING TO BREEZE THROUGH SOME OF THE EARLY



- 1 CONTEXT SETTINGS WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSED ON CHANGES MADE SINCE
- 2 SEPTEMBER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE THIS EFFORT BUILDS UPON PLANNED
- 3 BAY AREA 2050 AND THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WHICH
- 4 BOTH UNDERSCORE THE NEED FOR NEW REGIONAL MONEYS TO IMPROVE
- 5 THE FINANCIAL PICTURE FOR TRANSPORTATION WHILE ALSO
- 6 INCENTIVIZING KEY POLICY GOALS. NEXT SLIDE. NOW OUR EFFORTS
- 7 THIS YEAR HAVE REALLY FOCUSED ON LISTENING AND LEARNING FROM
- 8 THE PUBLIC AND FROM STAKEHOLDERS. IN ADDITION TO CONTINUED
- 9 STAKEHOLDER DIALOGUES WHICH WE CONTINUE TO WORK ON THROUGHOUT
- 10 THE FALL AND OUR POLL IN THE SPRING TIME, WE HAVE COMPLETED
- 11 POP-UP WORKSHOPS AND AN ONLINE SURVEY OVER THE COURSE OF THE
- 12 SUMMER THAT HELP US BETTER UNDERSTAND THE PUBLIC'S PRIORITIES
- 13 AND HOW THEY WOULD LIKE US TO INVEST NEW TRANSPORTATION
- 14 MONEYS. ON THE RIGHT SIDE SHOWS KEY THEMES THAT HAVE EMERGED
- 15 THROUGH THE THIS PROCESS INCLUDING SEEING INTEREST IN MULTI-
- 16 MODAL INVESTMENTS HAVING FLEXIBILITY TO MODIFY PRIORITIES OVER
- 17 TIME AND EMPHASIS AT MAINTAINING THE STATUS QUO IS NOT
- 18 SUFFICIENT. AS REBECCA MENTIONED WE'RE CURRENTLY CONDUCTING A
- 19 SECOND ROUND EVER STATISTICALLY VALID POLLING THAT WE'LL BE
- 20 ABLE TO BRING FORWARD AT THE NEXT MONTH JOINT LEGISLATION
- 21 COMMITTEE TO BUILD UPON THESE ENGAGEMENT THEMES. NEXT SLIDE.
- 22 SIMILAR TO WHAT WE SHARED IN SEPTEMBER WE SEE THIS MEASURE AS
- 23 A PRIME OPPORTUNITY TO IMPLEMENT SOME OF THE PRIORITIES
- 24 IDENTIFIED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WITH GOAL MEASURES DEFINED
- 25 AS CREATING A CLIMATE FRIENDLY TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT'S



- 1 SAFE, ACCESSIBLE AND CONVENIENT FOR ALL. WITHIN THAT GOAL ARE
- 2 THREE FOCUS AREAS WHILE MINOR REVISIONS SINCE WE PRESENTED TO
- 3 YOU, THE CORE ESSENCE REMAINS THE SAME PROTECTING AND
- 4 ENHANCING TRANSIT SERVICE MAKING TRANSIT FASTER, SAFER, AND
- 5 EASIER TO USE AND ENHANCING MOBILITY AND ACCESS FOR ALL. NEXT
- 6 SLIDE. EQUALLY IMPORTANT TO THE GOAL ARE GUIDING PRINCIPLES
- 7 THAT SHAPE THE SPECIFICS OF THE EXPENDITURE PLAN. THESE
- 8 PRINCIPLES HAVE HAD BROAD SUPPORT IN DISCUSSIONS TO DATE AND
- 9 WE HAVE MADE NO MAJOR CHANGES HERE IN RECENT MONTHS AGAIN
- 10 THESE PRINCIPLES UNDER SCORE MEASURES INTENT TO ADVANCE EOUITY
- 11 IN EACH FUNDING CATEGORY TO PRIORITIZE CLIMATE FRIENDLY
- 12 INVESTMENTS AND TO ENSURE AN ADAPTABLE COHESIVE EXPENDITURE
- 13 PLAN IS CRAFTED. NEXT SLIDE. NOW ONE AREA THAT WE HAVE MADE
- 14 REFINEMENTS IN RECENT WEEKS ARE THE PROPOSED FUNDING
- 15 CATEGORIES STARTING WITH THE TRANSIT MERGING TOGETHER TRANSIT
- 16 OPERATIONS AND TRANSFORMATION INTO A SINGLE CATEGORY HELPS
- 17 EMPHASIZING SUSTAINING TRANSIT SERVICE FOUNDATIONAL
- 18 TRANSFORMING OUR SYSTEM AND CONTINUES TO INCLUDE ACCELERATION
- 19 TRANSFORMATION INVESTMENTS FOR THINGS LIKE TRANSIT PRIORITY
- 20 FARE DISCOUNTS COMMUNITIES AMBASSADOR PROGRAMS MAKING
- 21 SUBSIDIES IDENTIFIABLE CATEGORIES IN THE ATTACHMENT CREATED
- 22 REBRANDED MAIN STREETS, SAFE STREETS REFLECTING OVERARCHING
- 23 THEME OF ENSURING SAFETY FOR PERSONS OF ALL AGES AND ACTIVE
- 24 TRANSPORTATION ROADS THROUGH THE OUR REGION FURTHERMORE GIVEN
- 25 THE LOWER LEVEL PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR THE TERMINOLOGY OF PRIORITY



PROJECTS WE HAVE REBRANDED PROJECTS REPLANNED THEM AS 1 2 CONNECTIVITY, CONTINUING TO INCLUDE SIMILAR SUITE OF ELIGIBLE 3 INVESTMENTS SPANNING FROM RAIL MEGA PROJECTS EXPRESS LANES INTERCHANGES LAST BUT NOT LEAST RETAINED THE CLIMATE 4 5 RESILIENCE CATEGORY AND MADE SURE TO INCLUDE OTHER HAZARDS BEYOND SEA LEVEL RISE GIVEN DIVERSITY OF OUR NINE COUNTY 6 REGION THINGS LIKE FLOODING WILDFIRES EXTREME HEAT NEXT SLIDE. 7 8 BEFORE I TURN IT OVER TO GEORGIA I WANT TO UNDERSCORE CRITICAL WORK OF OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT TEAM LED BY LESLIE E. MAIN 9 STREETS CATEGORY WE REFER TO AS SAFE STREETS HAD HIGHEST LEVEL 10 11 OF PUBLIC INTEREST IN POP-UP WORKSHOPS IN THE ONLINE SURVEY FOLLOWED BY TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION CONVERSELY CLIMATE 12 RESILIENCE PRIORITY PROJECTS CATEGORY KNOWN AS CONNECTIVITY AT 13 LESSER LEVELS OF THE PUBLIC SUPPORT INTEREST AND AS WE DO OUR 14 SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC POLLING WE'LL GET A BETTER SENSE OF HOW 15 16 THESE CATEGORIES FARE WITH THE BROADER GENERAL PUBLIC. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO GEORGIA TO TALK ABOUT THE 17 UPCOMING TOPICS INCLUDING LEGISLATION NEXT YEAR AND THE POLICY 18 ON THE REVENUE SIDE. 19 20 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: GOOD MORNING. DAVE WAS ABLE TO 21 22 EMPHASIZE WHAT WE HEARD FROM THE PUBLIC, PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS ON THE WHY WHAT'S THE NEED FOR A REGIONAL 23

MEASURE, WHAT GOALS WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE AND NOW WE COME TO

CORE ELEMENTS OF ENABLING LEGISLATION WHICH IS THE PATH FOR

24



- 1 HOW WE'RE GOING TO GET THERE. WHAT YOU SEE HERE IS A, SORT OF,
- 2 OUTLINE OF WHAT THE KEY QUESTIONS ARE THAT ANY ENABLING
- 3 LEGISLATION WOULD NEED TO ANSWER. SO, WHERE, WHAT'S THE
- 4 GEOGRAPHIC AREA OF THE TAX, WHEN, WHAT'S THE TIMING OF A
- 5 BALLOT MEASURE. HOW, WHAT ARE THE TAX OPTIONS REVENUE OPTIONS
- 6 AND THE AMOUNT. AND THEN, REALLY, LIKE TO WHAT END, OR FOR
- 7 WHAT. AND SO THAT'S THE LAST TWO, EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES, AND
- 8 THE FUNDING DISTRIBUTION. WHAT WE HAVE AIMED TO DO HERE IS
- 9 PULL TOGETHER SOME INITIAL STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR WHAT A
- 10 STRAW MAN'S PROPOSAL FOR AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION COULD LOOK
- 11 LIKE AND ANSWERING SOME OF THE QUESTIONS, CORE QUESTIONS THAT
- 12 IS INTENDED TO ADVANCE THE WHY, THE GOALS THAT WE HEARD ABOUT
- 13 FROM PARTNERS ON THE GROUND. I'M GOING WALK THROUGH THE FIRST
- 14 TWO ON THERE, THE WHERE AND THE WHEN ARE PROBABLY THE MOST
- 15 STRAIGHT FORWARD. THEY'RE LOOKING AT AUTHORIZING MTC TO PLACE
- 16 A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT EITHER IN ALL NINE COUNTIES OR A
- 17 SUBSET OF COUNTIES. YOU SEE HERE WE'RE REFERENCING OR
- 18 SUGGESTING WE DO NO FEWER THAN FIVE COUNTIES. THIS IS REALLY
- 19 PRECEDENT. IT'S WHAT THE PRIOR AND EXISTING AUTHORIZED
- 20 REGIONAL TAX MEASURES ALLOW FOR MTC TO, SORT OF, MAKE THAT
- 21 DECISION. WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT HERE IS THINKING ABOUT FIVE
- 22 COUNTIES. BECAUSE ANYTHING THIS'S REALLY FOCUSED ON TRANSIT,
- 23 TRANSIT OPERATIONS, IT MAKES SENSE TO BE THINKING ABOUT THE
- 24 FIVE COUNTIES THAT TOUCH BART. ON THE TIMING OF A BALLOT
- 25 MEASURE, WE WOULD ALSO RECOMMEND AT HEAT, SORT OF, COMING IN



- 1 WITH AN INITIAL PROPOSAL OF ALLOWING MTC TO HAVE THE
- 2 DISCRETION ABOUT WHEN TO PLACE A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT AND THE
- 3 DURATION OF THE MEASURE. AND THEN THE LAST THREE ON HERE ARE,
- 4 AGAIN, PROBABLY HAVE A LOT MORE THAT I THINK WE WOULD LIKE TO
- 5 PRESENT TO YOU AND SOME OF THE INFORMATION THAT WE HAVE PULLED
- 6 TOGETHER OVER THE LAST YEAR AND A HALF TO INFORM YOUR
- 7 DECISION-MAKING. BUT IN SHORT, ON THE TAX OPTIONS, WHEN WE
- 8 WOULD RECOMMEND IS THAT WE, AT LEAST IN OUR INITIAL PROPOSAL,
- 9 COME IN WITH A SUGGESTION THAT WE HAVE A MENU OF OPTIONS SO WE
- 10 DON'T PICK ONE PARTICULAR REVENUE MECHANISM, BUT FOLLOW WHAT
- 11 THE PRECEDENT WAS WITH THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY
- 12 TO AUTHORIZE SEVERAL DIFFERENT REVENUE MECHANISMS AND THEN
- 13 ALLOW FOR MTC TO DO MORE WORK, DO MORE POLLING AND MAKE A
- 14 DECISION AS WE GET CLOSER TO PLACING A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.
- 15 AND ON THE LAST TWO, EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES AND FUNDING
- 16 DISTRIBUTION. WHAT WE WOULD RECOMMEND FOR EXPENDITURE
- 17 PRIORITIES WE SPECIFY WHAT THE GOALS ARE OF THE MEASURE AND
- 18 THE GENERAL TYPES OF ELIGIBLE INVESTMENTS THAT ARE MEASURED TO
- 19 BE ABLE TO INNUENDO WE THINK IT'S REALLY TOO EARLY TO GET INTO
- 20 THE SPECIFICS RIGHT NOW OF HOW TO DIVVY UP THE RESOURCES
- 21 PRETTY SIMILAR ON FUNDING DISTRIBUTION YOU KNOW THAT TOUCHES
- 22 ON QUESTIONS LIKE RETURN TO SOURCE AND GEOGRAPHIC BALANCE AND
- 23 IT'S AGAIN JUST SEEMS TOO EARLY TO COME OUT WITH SOMETHING
- 24 SOLID ON THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO HAVE MORE TIME FOR CONSENSUS
- 25 BUILDING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF AN



- 1 EXPENDITURE PLAN CONCEPT THAT COULD -- WOULD BE HOW WE COULD
- 2 SHAPE SOMETHING THAT'S MORE, SORT OF, FLEXIBLE EXPENDITURE
- 3 PRIORITY PROPOSAL. SO THE CONCEPT WOULD BE THAT THE
- 4 LEGISLATURE WOULD IDENTIFY EXPENDITURE CATEGORY, YOU KNOW,
- 5 WHAT TYPES OF THINGS CAN WE FUNDS, IT WOULD SPECIFY A MINIMUM
- 6 SHARE FOR EACH SPENDING CATEGORY AND ALLOW FLEXIBILITY AND
- 7 ADAPTABILITY OVER TIME. THE OTHER, SORT OF, BIG ELEMENT OF
- 8 THIS PROPOSAL, YOU SEE THE FLEXIBLE PIECE OF FUNDING PIECE
- 9 THERE, IT'S THE GRAY HATCHED PART. CHART, THAT IDEA WOULD BE
- 10 TO RESERVE A PORTION FUNDS FOR THIS FLEXIBLE CATEGORY THAT
- 11 WOULD ALLOW US TO REALLY OVER TIME BE RESPONSIVE TO NEEDS. AND
- 12 THIS IS DEFINITELY DIFFERENT THAN WHAT PREVIOUS REGIONAL
- 13 MEASURE HAD PROPOSED -- LIKE, HOW PREVIOUS REGIONAL MEASURES
- 14 WERE STRUCTURED. THOSE REALLY LISTED VERY SPECIFIC PROJECTS
- 15 ARE OR PROGRAMS WITH THERE AMOUNTS. THE IDEA HERE IS THAT THIS
- 16 IS A DIFFERENT THING THAN WE HAVE DONE IN THE PAST, LOOKING AT
- 17 SOMETHING THAT'S MUCH LARGER SCALE AND ALSO OVER MUCH LONGER
- 18 PERIOD OF TIME. IF WE LEARNED ANYTHING FROM COVID IT'S THAT WE
- 19 NEED TO LEARN TO BE ADAPTABLE AND FLEXIBLE TO CHANGES ON THE
- 20 GROUND. AND LAST YEAR THIS IS A BIG QUESTION THAT GETS A LOT
- 21 OF ATTENTION I WANT TO REITERATE SHARES SHOWN HERE ARE FOR
- 22 ILLUSTRATION PURPOSES ONLY AND WE RECOMMEND ANY, SORT OF,
- 23 DRAFT LEGISLATIVE PROPOSAL HOLDS OFF ON SPECIFYING MINIMUM
- 24 PERCENTAGES OF HOW MUCH WOULD GO TO EACH CATEGORY SO WE CAN,
- 25 SORT OF, HAVE MORE TIME TO CONSENSUS BUILD. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.



- 1 IN ORDER TO HELP INFORM THE OUESTION OF HOW, YOU KNOW, WHAT
- 2 THE REVENUE MECHANISM MIGHT BE, MTC REALLY DID ANALYZE A RANGE
- 3 OF POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES. WE LOOKED AT THINGS, ASKED QUITE
- 4 A FEW QUESTIONS, WHAT ARE POLICY IMPACTS, EQUITY OTHER AND
- 5 POLICY IMPACTS AND THEN ALSO HOW PRACTICAL IS IT. AND WHAT WE
- 6 DID TO MAKE SURE WE COULD COMPARE APPLES TO APPLES IS WE
- 7 LOOKED AT WHAT RATES WOULD NEED TO BE, SORT OF, ON THE BALLOT
- 8 IN ORDER TO GENERATE A BILLION DOLLARS A YEAR. AGAIN, THAT'S
- 9 JUST APPLES TO APPLES IN A SENSE OF SCALE. I THINK IN SHORT,
- 10 WE DIDN'T FIND THAT THERE WAS ANY SILVER BULLET PERFECT
- 11 ANSWER. AND SO THAT'S WHY WE'RE LEADING TO THIS IDEA THAT
- 12 PROVIDING A MENU OF OPTIONS VERSUS AUTHORIZING A SINGLE
- 13 REVENUE APPROACH IS THE PREFERRED APPROACH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 14 WE PRESENTED THIS SLIDE BEFORE, SO I'M NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH
- 15 ALL OF THE DETAIL ON IT. BUT, AGAIN, THIS IS -- THE SUMMARY OF
- 16 THE TAX REVENUE OPTIONS THAT WE ANALYZED. WE LOOKED AT SALES
- 17 TAX, INCOME TAX, PAYROLL TAX, CORPORATE HEAD TAX A PARCEL TAX
- 18 AND ROAD USAGE CHARGE AND WHAT STAFF IS RECOMMENDING TO WE
- 19 PROCEED WITH IS KEEP MOST OF THESE OPTIONS ON THE TABLE REMOVE
- 20 THE CORPORATE HEAD TAX FROM SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD CONTINUE
- 21 TO LOOK AT MAKE A TWEAK TO THE PARCEL TAX 467 PER PARCEL IS A
- 22 LOT OF STICKER SHOCK ON ANY BALLOT AND SO WE WOULD RECOMMEND
- 23 THAT WE SWITCH TO LOOKING AT VEHICLE REGISTRATION FEE BASED ON
- 24 FEEDBACK FROM A LOT OF OUR PARTNERS. AND WE CAN SKIP TO THE
- 25 NEXT SLIDE. KEEP ONGOING, PLEASE. AND THEN, YOU KNOW, THIS IS



9

13

NOVEMBER 3, 2023

- 1 A REALLY IMPORTANT COMPONENT THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO GET YOUR
 2 FEEDBACK ON TODAY. SO WHAT POLICY REFORMS, AND ACCOUNTABILITY
 3 MEASURES SHOULD ACCOMPANY LEGISLATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND
 4 ON THE WHAT'S NEXT, YOU KNOW, JUST EXPECT AN ITERATIVE
 5 DROCESS CONTINUE STAKEHOLDER ENCACEMENT WORKING WITH THE
- 5 PROCESS, CONTINUE STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WORKING WITH THE
- 6 PUBLIC AND LEGISLATIVE OUTREACH TO MAKE SURE WE MOVE IN ORDER
- 7 WHEN WE ARE BRINGING AND PROPOSING TO YOU SOMETHING THAT WOULD
- 8 BE. AND WITH THAT I WILL OPEN FOR QUESTIONS.

10 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: COLLEAGUES BEFORE WE TAKE QUESTIONS I

- 11 WOULD LIKE TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT FIRST I'LL START WITH ADINA
- 12 LEVIN AND IAN GRIFFITHS.

14 ADINA LEVIN: ADINA LEVIN, SEAMLESS BAY AREA, BAY AREA FRIENDS

- 15 EVER CALTRAIN PARTS OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION THANK
- 16 YOU VERY MUCH FOR CONSIDERING THIS REALLY IMPORTANT TOPIC
- 17 WANTED TO STRONGLY SUPPORT STAFF SUPPORT APPROACH OF HAVING
- 18 THAT FLEXIBILITY TO ALLOW FOR TIME CONSENSUS BUILDING AND
- 19 HAVING SPECIFIC EXPENDITURE LATER IN THE DAY. WE SUPPORT A
- 20 RANGE OF FUNDING INCLUDING SOMEWHERE BETWEEN 2 BILLION ENOUGH
- 21 MONEY TO KEEP TRANSIT RUNNING AND REASON TRANSFORM TRANSIT AND
- 22 REVENUE MECHANISMS TO ALLOW TIME FOR CONSENSUS BUILDING AND IN
- 23 TERMS OF POLICIES HAVING POLICIES THAT STRENGTHEN NETWORK
- 24 MANAGEMENT TO ENSURE THAT WE GET THE COOPERATED SERVICE THAT
- 25 VOTERS EXPECT OUT OF THIS MEASURE. THANK YOU.



1 2 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. 3 IAN GRIFFITHS: GOOD AFTERNOON IAN GRIFFITHS WITH SEAMLESS BAY 4 5 AREA. THE POLLING YOU HAVE SEEN, YOU KNOW, POLLING IN THE NEWS LATELY, YOU'RE GOING TO RECEIVE MORE POLLING BEFORE YOUR NEXT 6 MEETING. THE POLLING IS REALLY CHALLENGING RIGHT NOW FOR 7 8 TRANSPORTATION. IF WE HAVE ANY HOPE OF MEETING ANYTHING CLOSE TO THE NEED THAT WE HAVE -- THAT YOU HAVE HEARD ALL MORNING 9 10 ABOUT, HOW GREAT THE NEEDS ARE, WE NEED A TRANCE -- NOT ONLY DO WE THESE A TRANSFORMATIVE VISION IN THIS MEASURE BUT WE 11 NEED TO HAVE REFORMS THAT CAN DELIVER THAT VISION AND GIVE THE 12 PUBLIC THE CON IF I DENIES AND SHOW THEM THAT WE'RE GOING TO 13 DO THINGS DIFFERENTLY AND THAT REQUIRES STRENGTHENING NETWORK 14 15 MANAGEMENT AND MAKING SURE WE CAN PUT REQUIREMENTS ON THIS 16 MONEY THAT WILL DELIVER RESULTS OUICKLY WHETHER INTEGRATING FARES PROVIDING SERVICE MAKING SURE BUSES DON'T GET STUCK IN 17 TRAFFIC INVESTING IN OPERATIONS ENSURING BUSES MOVE OUICKLY 18 AND EFFECTIVELY. LASTLY THERE IS A LOT OF INTEREST IN RECENT 19 CONVENTIONS AROUND CONSOLIDATION, MTC NEEDS TO TAKE THE NEXT 20 21 STEP AND STUDY THAT IN THE NEXT SIX MONTHS. 22 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE VIRTUAL SPEAKERS, 23 FIRST UP IS DARYL YIP FOLLOWED BY JANICE LI. UNMUTE YOURSELF. 24 25 YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.



1 2 SPEAKER: HI CHAIR CANEPA, BOARD MEMBERS AND COMMISSIONERS. I'M 3 DARYL YIP, SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO I'M A PROFESSIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLANNER SPEAKING AS MYSELF I'M THRILLED TO 4 5 MEASURE ADVANCES ON PROGRESSIVE PRIORITIES ON EOUITY AND ENVIRONMENT I WANT TO REMIND ONE OF THE REASONS WE GOT INTO 6 TRANSIT FUNDING IS BECAUSE OF HOW MUCH MTC FUNDING GOODS 7 8 TOWARDS HIGHWAYS WHICH MAKE EASIER TO DRIVE AND SHIFTS PEOPLE AWAY FROM TRANSIT. STATE DEPARTMENTS ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR THIS 9 MESS BUT YOU AS MTC AND THE COMMISSION AND ABAG BOARD SAID 10 POLICY DIRECTION FOR WHERE FUNDS GO, ALL FEDERAL STATE DOLLARS 11 ARE FLEXIBLE THAT GO TOWARDS HIGHWAY PROJECTS THAT HURT THE 12 CLIMATE AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR OR TRANSIT PROJECTS THAT 13 SUPPORT THE CLIMATE COMMUNITIES OF COLOR I URGE MTC ABAG TO 14 AFFIRM THAT NOT A SINGLE MTC OR ABAG -- WE CAN'T LET TRANSIT 15 16 SUFFER. THANK YOU. 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT IS JANICE LI. 18 19 SPEAKER: JANICE LI. I WISH COULD BE THERE IN-PERSON I WANT TO 20 21 THANK STAFF FOR CONTINUED LEADERSHIP FOR A REGIONAL 22 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. ON BEHALF THE BART I WANT TO EXPRESS URGENCY FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE FOR BART AND THE PUBLIC WE 23 REMAIN STEADFAST IN PUTTING ENERGY ANY DEVELOPING A REGIONAL 24

MEASURE. IF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS CANNOT CONTINUE TO OPERATE, WE



- 1 WILL HAVE TO CUT SERVICE AND THERE IS NO COMING BACK FROM THAT
- 2 AND WE WILL NEVER BE ABLE TO BUILD ENOUGH HIGHWAYS SAFE
- 3 STREETS OR PROTECTED BIKE LANES TO RECAPTURE MODE SHIFT.
- 4 LASTLY I TALKED AT LENGTH AT THE BART BOARD BUDGET WORKSHOP
- 5 HOW WE AS A REGION AT MTC AND OUR 27 TRANSIT OPERATORS WE NEED
- 6 TO HAVE A MARKETING CAMPAIGN OF NEW PROGRAMS AND INITIATIVES
- 7 THAT BENEFIT RIDERS FROM BAY PASS TO CLIPPER START FARE PASS
- 8 AND OPEN DISCOUNTS AND MORE. I WORKED ON A VARIETY OF
- 9 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURES AND PITCHED CAPITAL PROJECTS
- 10 AS A REASON VOTERS SHOULD SAY YES. THIS TIME IF WE WANT
- 11 MEASURE -- IF WE WANT A MEASURE FOCUS ON TRANSFORMATION WE
- 12 HAVE TO SHOW PROGRESS WE'RE MAKING PROGRAMS WE LAUNCH AND WHY
- 13 WE NEED TO HAVE FUNDING TO CONTINUE PROGRAMS AND CONTINUE
- 14 EXPANDING THEM. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND LEADERSHIP
- 15 BUILDING A BETTER FUTURE FOR OUR REGION.
- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU MEMBER LI. NEXT UP IS CYRUS HALL
- 18 FOLLOWED BY BOB ALAN.
- 20 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON, CYRUS HALL. I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO
- 21 I'M DEPENDING ON MTC TO WORK ON THE MEASURE A THAT CAN FULLY
- 22 MAINTAIN EXISTING SERVICE TO CONTINUE TO MOVE AROUND THE
- 23 REGION. I RECENTLY ATTENDED A WEDDING IN LOS GATOS ON THE
- 24 WEEKEND AND THE FASTEST CONNECTION WAS THREE AND A HALF HOURS.
- 25 I URGE MTC TO LOOK AT A LARGER MEASURE THAN 1 BILLION SINCE WE

16



- 1 CANNOT MAINTAIN CURRENT LEVELS OF SERVICE BUT GROW AND
- 2 TRANSFORM REGIONAL SERVICE COMPETITIVE DRIVING NEW REVENUE
- 3 SHOULD BE PROGRESSIVE. REGIONAL MEASURE SHOULD SUPPORT FUNDING
- 4 REGIONAL PLANNING REFORM PLEASE SUPPORT INCLUSION OF POLICY
- 5 REFORMS THAT STRENGTHEN REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WITHIN
- 6 ENABLING LEGISLATION. THANK YOU.

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS BOB ALLEN FOLLOWED

9 BY MIKE SHIRE.

10

7

- 11 SPEAKER: GOOD AFTERNOON BOB ALAN URBAN HABITAT VOICES FOR
- 12 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I'LL ECHO COMMENTS MADE BY MY
- 13 COLLEAGUES, FOCUS ON SOURCES LOOKING AT 1487 LEGISLATION TO
- 14 GIVE US FLEXIBILITY TO MEET THE BALLOT IN 2026, URGENCY TO DO
- 15 THIS TO MAKE EXPENDITURE INVESTMENT PLANS AND FOCUS ON TRANSIT
- 16 OPERATIONS AND SERVICE RESTORATION THAT CONTAINS COMPONENTS
- 17 WE'RE GOING TO BE DISCUSSING OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS MAKING
- 18 SURE WE RAISE ENOUGH REVENUE WITH WHATEVER PROGRESSIVE
- 19 MECHANISM WE COME UP WITH TO MEET THE NEEDS. WE KNOW TRANSIT
- 20 SERVICE WASN'T SUFFICIENT BEFORE THE COVID PANDEMIC WE NEED TO
- 21 GET THERE TO TRANSFORM THE SYSTEM BUT WE NEED IT LOOK AT
- 22 SHIFTING MONEY AWAY FROM HIGHWAYS AND OTHER SOURCES. THANK
- 23 YOU.

24

25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. MIKE SHIRE FOLLOWED BY LAUREL.



1 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA, AND MEMBERS OF STAFF MIKE, 2 3 CURRENTLY SERVE ON THE SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY CITIZEN ADVISORY COMMITTEE AS WELL AS CCAG BICYCLE 4 5 PEDESTRIAN ADVISORY COMMITTEE MY WORDS TODAY ARE MY OWN I'M CALLING TO ASK THE COMMITTEE TO PROHIBIT HIGHWAY EXPANSIONS 6 WIDENING AND ALL FUTURE REVENUE MEASURES BECAUSE SURVEY SHOWS 7 8 THAT PEOPLE DO NOT BELIEVE IN HIGHWAY EXPANSION AND ARE A WASTE OF MONEY HIGHWAY EXPANSION ENCOURAGES MORE PEOPLE TO 9 DRIVE RETURNING CONGESTION TO PREVIOUS LEVELS. THEY LARGELY 10 BENEFIT THE WEALTHY WHILE INCREASING POLLUTION AND TRAFFIC 11 VIOLENCE IN THE LOW-INCOME COMMUNITY LIVING ADJACENT TO THE 12 HIGHWAY. THE LINK TO THE PUBLIC VOTED AGAINST THE MANAGED 13 LANES ABSOLUTELY CALTRANS IS UNDER INVESTIGATION FOR 14 MISAPPROPRIATING MONEY AND SKIRTING ENVIRONMENTAL SAFEGUARDS. 15 16 PLEASE PROHIBIT WIDENING. THANK YOU. 17 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS LAUREL, FOLLOWED BY SARAH GREENWALD. 19 20 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS LAUREL WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES VOICES FOR 21 22 PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE WANT TO THANK MTC AND STAFF FOR TAKING THE 23 LEAD ON THIS REGIONAL MEASURE NECESSARY TO KEEP TRANSIT SYSTEM OPERATING. PROPOSING LEGISLATION NEXT MONTH MEASURING MOVE TO 24 OUR TRANSIT SERVICE FROM SURVIVE STAGE WE ARE CURRENTLY INTO 25



7

9

NOVEMBER 3, 2023

- 1 THE THRIVE, OUR REGION NEEDS [INDISCERNIBLE] WE SUPPORT THE
- 2 APPROACH OF MULTIPLE REVENUE OPTIONS IN ENABLING LEGISLATION
- 3 NOT SUPPORTIVE OF SALES TAX IT'S AGGRESSIVE AND
- 4 OVERSUBSCRIBED. SUPPORTING PARCEL TAX SQUARE FOOT BASIS
- 5 FINALLY LEGISLATION DID NOT SET MINIMUM RATES FOR THE FREE TAX
- 6 OPTIONS IT AUTHORIZED.

8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS SARAH GREENWALD.

10 SPEAKER: HI I'M SARAH GREENWALD REPRESENTING 350 BAY AREA

- 11 WE'RE GLAD TO SEE YOU MOVING STRONGLY TO HELP PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 12 NOT JUST PULLING THROUGH THESE TIMES BUT TO HELP GROW PUBLIC
- 13 TRANSIT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE THAT
- 14 WILL ENHANCE OUR FREEDOM MOVEMENT CREATE GOOD PAYING UNION
- 15 JOBS, HEALTHY ENVIRONMENT REDUCING CAR TRIPS AND CARBON
- 16 EMISSIONS AND PARTICULATE POLLUTION WE ASK YOU TO PRIORITIZE
- 17 PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES TO STABILIZE EXPAND AND IMPROVE
- 18 SERVICE STRUCTURE TO MAKE SURE THE BURDEN OF PAYING FOR
- 19 IMPROVED TRANSIT IS BORN EQUITABLY THROUGHOUT THE REGION.
- 20 EXPANDING AND IMPROVING TRANSPORTATION THROUGHOUT THE REGION
- 21 TO HAVE A TRANSFORMATIVE IMPACT ON OUR REGIONAL NETWORK.
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MARIO FOLLOWED BY JAMES.

24



- 1 SPEAKER: MY NAME IS MARIO WITH TRANSFORM WE'RE GRATEFUL TO
- 2 STAFF FOR CREATING THIS CONCEPT FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
- 3 MEASURE AND PRIORITIZING TRANSIT OPERATIONS. WE'RE A COLEADER
- 4 IN VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION A GROUP OF 30
- 5 ORGANIZATIONS INCLUDING LABOR DISABILITY JUSTICE AND ACTIVE
- 6 TRANSPORTATION ADVOCATES UNITING AROUND SUSTAINABLY FUNDED
- 7 FREOUENT RELIABLE TRANSIT AROUND THE BAY AREA VOICES CALLING
- 8 FOR THE REGIONAL GOING TO A PROGRESSIVE MECHANISM, SUCH AS
- 9 PARCEL TAX, PAYROLL TAX, OR INCOME TAX. DELIVERING
- 10 TRANSFORMATIVE [INDISCERNIBLE] IS TOP PRIORITY. THE OPERATORS
- 11 FISCAL NEED \$825 MILLION IN 2028 IS TO RUN TRANSIT SERVICE AT
- 12 2019 LEVELS TO EXPAND SERVICE AND IMPLEMENT THE TRANSIT
- 13 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AS WELL AS OFFER THE BENEFIT WE
- 14 WILL NEED OF. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR HEARING OUR REQUEST TO
- 15 AUTHORIZE THE MECHANISM AND STUDY POLL TO RAISE TWO BILLED TO
- 16 DELIVER TRANSFORM TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA.

17

18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NEXT UP IS JIM PEREZ.

- 20 SPEAKER: HI, I WORK WITH EAST BAY ASIAN LOCAL DEVELOPMENT
- 21 CORPORATION KNOWN AS E SOLVE 50-YEAR-OLD DEVELOPMENT
- 22 CORPORATION -- WE HAVE UNIQUE UNDERSTANDING. IMPORTANCE OF
- 23 HAVING A SAFE RELIABLE AND EQUITABLE PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM IN
- 24 OUR COMMUNITIES TO UPLIFT OUTCOMES FOR RESIDENTS IF AFFORDABLE
- 25 HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS. [INDISCERNIBLE] STAFF AND LEADERSHIP ARE



- 1 WORKING DILIGENTLY IN PREPARATION FOR THE 2024 REGIONAL
- 2 HOUSING BOND INVESTMENT HAS POTENTIAL TO TRANSFORM AFFORDABLE
- 3 HOUSING [INDISCERNIBLE] THOUSANDS OF UNITS. IT'S CRITICAL HOW
- 4 WE SUPPORT VOICE FOR THE TRANSIT BOND AS HOUSING AND
- 5 TRANSPORTATION ARE TWO SIDES OF THE SAME COIN AND
- 6 [INDISCERNIBLE] FUNDING FOR THE REGION WE LOOK FORWARD TO WINS
- 7 FOR OUR REGION IN 2024 AND 2026.

8

- 9 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. AND WE RECEIVED WRITTEN
- 10 CORRESPOND FROM TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGERS. STRATA INVESTMENT
- 11 GROUP AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND SPUR. THEY WERE POSTED ONLINE
- 12 AND DISTRIBUTED TO ALL MEMBERS.

13

- 14 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU CLERK AND PUBLIC SPEAKERS. WITH
- 15 THAT ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE BOARD? DIRECTOR SPERING.

- 17 JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW, I'M A LITTLE DISAPPOINTED THAT
- 18 THERE HAS BEEN NOTHING IN THIS PRESENTATION TO TALK ABOUT THE
- 19 INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES. YOU KNOW, THE ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM IS
- 20 27 OPERATORS. AND I THINK MTC IS SQUANDERING AN OPPORTUNITY
- 21 THAT YOU RARELY GET IN A POLITICAL LIFETIME AND THAT IS TO
- 22 LEVERAGE THIS OPPORTUNITY. AND IF MTC IS GOING TO SUPPORT A
- 23 MEASURE, I THINK THERE OUGHT TO BE THINGS THAT WE SAY WHAT WE
- 24 WANT FIRST. YOU KNOW? THIS PRESENTATION, THE FIRST THING IS
- 25 WHAT? WHAT IS IT WE WANT, AND THEN THE WHAT IS THE WHY IT'S



- 1 IMPORTANT AND THEN THE HOW IS THIRD. WE'RE PRESENTING THE HOW.
- 2 WE'RE GOING TO RAISE ALL THIS MONEY BUT WE'RE NOT REALLY
- 3 OFFERING ANY REAL INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES. AND I THINK THAT WE
- 4 NEED TO BE REALLY SPECIFIC. DO WE WANT THE NETWORK MANAGER TO
- 5 HAVE WHAT AUTHORITY? I THINK THAT'S A FUNDAMENTAL OUESTION.
- 6 WHAT AUTHORITY DOES MTC HAVE? AND WHAT AUTHORITY DOES MTC
- 7 NEED? AND THEN I THINK WE NEED TO BE TALKING ABOUT THE NUMBER
- 8 OF TRANSIT OPERATORS. YOU KNOW? YOU HAVE HAD THAT RAIL
- 9 PARTNERSHIP STUDY, AND, YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT EVEN TALKING ABOUT
- 10 HOW WE CONSOLIDATE RAIL AND HOW WE DEAL WITH THAT. I THINK WE
- 11 HAVE TO REALLY START THERE. WE HAVE TO TALK ABOUT WHAT IS IT
- 12 WE WANT. AND I DON'T THINK MTC IS GOING HAVE THIS OPPORTUNITY
- 13 AGAIN. I REALLY DON'T. I THINK THAT IF YOU RAISE THIS MONEY
- 14 AND YOU'RE FUNDING A SYSTEM THAT WAS ALREADY STARTING TO FAIL
- 15 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. AND, SO, WHAT YOU'RE GOING TO DO IS SAY,
- 16 WELL, WE'RE GOING KEEP FUNDING THE WAY THAT WE'RE DOING
- 17 BUSINESS. AND I THINK THAT HAS TO CHANGE. AND I THINK MTC HAS
- 18 TO BE REALLY BOLD, AND I THINK WE HAVE TO BE AGGRESSIVE AND WE
- 19 HAVE TO CLEARLY UNDERSTAND WHAT CHANGES WE WANT AND WHAT
- 20 CHANGES WE NEED TO PROFESS. I THINK WE HAVE TO GET MTC, WE
- 21 HAVE TO GET THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY AND GET SOME OF THE
- 22 ADVOCATES AND WE NEED TO DEVELOP A SET OF GOALS OR OBJECTIVES
- 23 THAT WE WANT OUT OF THIS MEASURE. WE SHOULDN'T BE JUST
- 24 SUPPORTING IT AND ALL THE OPERATORS GOING WELL, I GOT ALL THIS
- 25 MONEY, GOING TO KEEP A LOW PROFILE. THAT'S WRONG. AND WE NEED



- 1 TO HAVE THIS DISCUSSION. MR. CHAIR, I WOULD SUGGEST THAT YOU
- 2 AND THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, IF YOU CAN MEET AND REALLY START
- 3 TALKING ABOUT HOW DO WE HAVE THIS DISCUSSION ABOUT THE
- 4 STRATEGY TO HOW WE CHANGE TRANSIT IN THE REGION. AND YOU KNOW,
- 5 IF WE CAN COME OUT TO A CONSENSUS AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO
- 6 HAVE LEGISLATIVE CHANGES, FOR SURE, AND SO WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
- 7 TO HAVE PARTNERS IN LEGISLATURE. YOU KNOW, I -- YOU KNOW, THE
- 8 -- AND THIS IS PROBABLY THE WRONG THING TO SAY AT THIS
- 9 SETTING, BUT I'M GOING SAY IT ANYWAY, YOU CAN'T HAVE THE LARGE
- 10 TRANSIT OPERATORS DRIVING THIS PROCESS. WE'RE GOING TO RAISE
- 11 MONEY TO HELP THEM RUN THEIR OPERATIONS, BUT THEY CAN'T BE
- 12 TELLING US NO CHANGES, CAN'T DO THIS, CAN'T DO THAT WE OUGHT
- 13 TO HAVE A NO CONSTRAINT CONVERSATION ABOUT WHAT IT IS WE WANT
- 14 IN THIS REGION, WHAT LEVEL OF TRANSIT, DO WE WANT A WORLDWIDE
- 15 SYSTEM? IF THE ANSWER IS YES, THEN WHAT IS IT IT'S GOING TO
- 16 TAKE TO DO THAT. I JUST GET CONCERNED THAT STAFF KEEPS GOING
- 17 DOWN THIS ROAD ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WHAT TYPE OF MEASURE IT WOULD
- 18 BE, HOW MUCH MONEY WE'RE GOING TO RAISE, YOU KNOW, DOING ALL
- 19 THE HOW, BUT WE REALLY HAVEN'T DISCUSSED THE WHAT OR THE WHY
- 20 AND I THINK WE HAVE TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION. YOU'RE NOT GOING
- 21 TO MAKE A LOT OF FRIENDS, I'LL TELL YOU THAT RIGHT NOW, BUT
- 22 STAFF SEEMS LEERY ABOUT SAYING CONSOLIDATION, LEERY ABOUT
- 23 SAYING HOW THE SYSTEM FUNCTIONS. AND I THINK IF YOU NEED TO
- 24 HAVE US TELL YOU, THAT'S WHAT WE WANT YOU TO DO -- I'M
- 25 SPEAKING FOR MYSELF -- SO IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HEAR FROM MY



- 1 COLLEAGUES. WE NEED TO GIVE YOU DIRECTION AND WHEN WE HAVE
- 2 THESE OUTSIDE PRESSURES, I'M SORRY, THE COMMISSION HAS US
- 3 DOING THIS. BUT I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET
- 4 EVERYTHING WE WANT, BUT THERE IS A LOT OF THINGS THAT WE
- 5 SHOULD NOT SUPPORT THIS MEASURE IF WE DON'T GET IT. AND THAT'S
- 6 THE LEVERAGE WE HAVE. IF WE KEEP GOING DOWN THE ROAD SAYING
- 7 WE'RE GOING TO DO MEASURE, MEASURE, MEASURE, AND NOT REALLY
- 8 IDENTIFY. I THINK IT'S SHORTSIGHTED AND I THINK IT'S THE
- 9 RESPONSIBILITY OF THIS COMMISSION TO TAKE A LEAD ON THESE
- 10 ISSUES. BECAUSE NO OTHER ORGANIZATION IN THIS REGION HAS BOTH
- 11 THE STAFF OR THE ABILITY TO REALLY LEAD THIS EFFORT. AND YOU
- 12 KNOW, SO I -- I'M JUST TELLING YOU MY FRUSTRATION. I KIND OF
- 13 VOICED THAT LAST TIME. I TALKED TO A COUPLE OF COMMISSIONERS,
- 14 AND I THINK PEOPLE KIND OF AGREE, AND WE HAVE TO IDENTIFY WHY
- 15 WE'RE DOING THIS. AND I'M NOT HEARING IT IN ANY OF THESE
- 16 PRESENTATIONS. I'M NOT HEARING THE WHY, THE WORD POLICY
- 17 CHANGE. THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF COMP MIGRATION BUT WE
- 18 DON'T HAVE VISION WE'RE MOVING THIS FORWARD WITHOUT VISION ON
- 19 HOW TO CHANGE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. AND YOU KNOW, IT'S JUST
- 20 SHORTSIGHTED THE APPROACH WE'RE TAKING. SO, MR. CHAIRMAN, I
- 21 WOULD -- I REALLY THINK THAT WE HAVE TO HAVE THIS CONVERSATION
- 22 AS TO HOW DO WE START MOVING FORWARD AND HAVE DISCUSSIONS
- 23 ABOUT WHAT IT SHOULD BE, OR WHAT WE WANT.



- 1 ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER SPERING, I ECHO YOUR COMMENTS
- 2 AND I'M REMINDED OF HOW WE GOT HERE, WE HAD THE PANDEMIC, WE
- 3 HAD A FISCAL CLIFF, WE'RE UP IN SACRAMENTO ASKING FOR MONEY
- 4 AND PART OF THAT DISCUSSION WAS, WHAT ARE YOU GOING TO DO FROM
- 5 A REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE AND I THINK THAT'S HOW WE GOT HERE ON
- 6 THIS TRACK, NOR PUN INTEND BUT TRYING TO FIGURE OUT A
- 7 SUSTAINABLE SOLUTION. WE'RE ALL SEEING THIS IN A LIGHTENING
- 8 MOMENT OF WHAT WE WANT AND NOT WHAT WE HAD BEFORE. IT'S
- 9 ENVISIONING A NEW FUTURE BUT IT'S MOVING SO QUICKLY, WHEN WE
- 10 WERE HAVING DISCUSSIONS, ARE TRANSIT OPERATORS GOING FAIL.
- 11 THAT WAS BEFORE US. WE DIDN'T KNOW. AND I THINK WE APPRECIATE
- 12 WHAT OUR STATE LEGISLATORS DID IN FINDING FUNDING TO STABILIZE
- 13 BUT THIS IS IMPORTANT FOR US AS A REGION TO TALK ABOUT THE
- 14 FUTURE AND HOW MANY OPERATORS THAT LOOKS LIKE AND FOR ME THIS
- 15 IS NOT ABOUT THE OPERATORS THIS, IS ABOUT THE RIDERS. THIS IS
- 16 ABOUT OUR REGION AND ENVISIONING WHAT WE SEE AS A SUSTAINABLE
- 17 TRANSIT SYSTEM TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS. YOU KNOW, THE PREVIOUS
- 18 PRESENTATION WE TALKED ABOUT ALL OF THESE BILLIONS OF DOLLARS
- 19 AND HERE IS AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY TO MAYBE BE A LITTLE BIT
- 20 MORE EFFECTIVE WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. SO, I DO AGREE
- 21 THAT IT IS AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY THAT I DO THINK MTC DOES
- 22 HAVE TO PLAY A LEADERSHIP ROLE ON. AND I KNOW THAT WITH THE
- 23 EXECUTIVE TEAM, WE HAVE HAD CONVERSATIONS AROUND THIS VERY
- 24 TOPIC OF HOW DO WE DO IT. AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE OUR STATE
- 25 LEGISLATORS, MYSELF AND THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WENT UP TO MEET



- 1 THE BAY AREA CAUCUS, THEY WERE ALSO INTERESTED IN THIS TOPIC
- 2 OF ASKING HOW AND WHAT TO YOUR QUESTIONS, COMMISSIONER
- 3 SPERING. SO I THINK THIS IS THE RIGHT TIME TO HAVE THIS
- 4 CONVERSATION. AND I WANT TO HEAR FROM OTHER COMMISSIONERS, AS
- 5 WELL. BECAUSE THIS IS US PROVIDING DIRECTION TO STAFF. AND I
- 6 DO BELIEVE IT IS THE RIGHT TIME --

7

- 8 JIM SPERING: I JUST WANT TO RESPOND. I THINK WHAT STAFF'S
- 9 RESPONSIBILITY IS TO CHALLENGE THIS COMMISSION. YOU NEED TO
- 10 FORCE THIS COMMISSION TO TAKE A POSITION ON THESE ISSUES. AND
- 11 MAYBE THE COMMISSION SAYS WE LIKE IT THE WAY IT IS, LET'S HEAR
- 12 THAT. IF THEY'RE NOT HAPPY WITH THE WAY IT IS, LET'S HEAR THAT
- 13 AND THEN WE TALK ABOUT WHAT TYPES OF CHANGES SHOULD BE
- 14 DISCUSSED AND BROUGHT FORWARD. YOU KNOW, I REALLY WOULD HOPE
- 15 THE STAFF WILL CHALLENGE THIS COMMISSION ON THESE REFORMS AND
- 16 CHANGES THAT I THINK ARE NECESSARY AT THIS TIME. THANK YOU,
- 17 MR. CHAIRMAN. I DIDN'T MEAN TO --

- 19 ALFREDO PEDROZA: IT'S OKAY. PART TO THAT, WE NEED TO
- 20 UNDERSTAND WHAT RESOURCES WE NEED TO ACCOMPLISH THAT VISION
- 21 AND THAT'S PART OF THE DISCUSSION. WE CAN TALK ABOUT THE
- 22 WHAT'S, RIGHT? AND THE HOW. BUT I THINK WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT
- 23 WHAT WE WANT BEFORE THE HOW, TO YOUR POINT. AND THAT'S WHAT I
- 24 REALLY HOPE OUR FELLOW COMMISSIONERS CAN PLAN ON TO MAKE SURE
- 25 THAT STAFF HAS DIRECTION ON WHERE WE WANT TO GO. BUT I AGREE



- 1 WITH THE COMMENTS COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS SHARED IT'S AN
- 2 INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY BEFORE US NOW. THANK YOU.

3

- 4 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANT TO COMMENT
- 5 BEFORE WE GO TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US
- 6 TODAY, AND I THINK YOU STARTED THAT, MR. SPERING, WE HAVE TO
- 7 GIVE DIRECTION, CLEAR DIRECTION TO OUR STAFF. AND I THINK IT'S
- 8 GREAT PUBLIC POLICY. IT MAKES SENSE. I THINK THEY HEAR US LOUD
- 9 AND CLEAR. WHAT I SOMETIMES GET WORRY BODY -- WORRIED ABOUT,
- 10 THIS IS THE PROCESS, STAFF GETS AHEAD OF THE COMMISSION. WHAT
- 11 WE'RE TRYING DO TODAY IS TO MAKE SURE THAT WE GIVE CLEAR
- 12 DIRECTION. YOU'RE STARTING TO HEAR IT, AND MY COMMENTS ALIGN
- 13 WITH YOU AND THE CHAIR, MY HOPE IS WITH THIS FEEDBACK AND
- 14 CLEAR DIRECTION, THEY KNOW WHERE WE NEED TO GO MOVING FORWARD.
- 15 AND SO, WITH THAT, WE'LL GO TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ.

16

- 17 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I, UNFORTUNATELY
- 18 HAVE TO LEAVE AFTER THIS. I WILL LISTEN TO EVERYONE'S
- 19 COMMENTS. WHEN WE GET THE POLLING BACK, WHAT WE HAVE SEEN IN
- 20 THE BAY AREA NEWS GROUP ELSE AND WHERE INDICATES THAT THERE NO
- 21 REAL TAX APPETITE IN THIS REGION ESPECIALLY FOR A
- 22 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. IF WE GET POLLING BACK AND IT DOESN'T
- 23 GIVE US A GOOD SHOT ARE WE GOING TO CONTINUE WORKING ON THIS?
- 24 WHAT'S THE VISION HERE?



1	REBECCA LONG: REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
2	AFFAIRS WE HAVE SEEN POLLING PARTICULARLY IN THE SOUTH BAY THE
3	WAY THE QUESTIONS WERE WORDED WAS NOT NECESSARILY FAVORABLE TO
4	SEEING A POSITIVE OUTCOME. I WANT TO REMIND FOLKS BACK IN
5	MARCH WHEN WE POLLED ON A TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, I'M PULLING
6	IT UP, IT WAS CLOSER TO 50 CERTAINLY WAS ABOVE 50%, IT
7	WASN'T I DON'T BELIEVE CLEARING 2/3 BUT IT WAS CERTAINLY
8	WELL ABOVE 50% AND THERE ARE STRATEGIES THAT WE HAVE DISCUSSED
9	BEFORE AROUND POTENTIALLY AUTHORIZING THE VOTERS TO PETITION
10	SOMETHING ON TO THE BALLOT. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE THINK
11	SHOULD BE POTENTIAL INCLUDED IN THE ENABLING LEGISLATION. AND
12	WHILE WE HAVE TALKED A LOT ABOUT 2026 AS THE OPTIMAL TIME TO
13	GO TO THE VOTERS THAT MAYBE WE THAT THERE ISN'T A PATH
14	FORWARD WITH THAT. I THINK STAFF WOULD RECOMMEND EVEN IF THE
15	APOLOGY COMES IN, WHICH FRANKLY WE EXPECT IT WILL NOT CLEAR
16	TWO THIRD'S VOTE THAT WE WOULD STILL TRY TO GET THE ENABLING
17	LEGISLATION NEXT YEAR SO WE STILL HAVE THE OPTION IN THE
18	FUTURE AND WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE VOTE THRESHOLD WILL BE BUT
19	WE WILL BE SITTING HERE ESPECIALLY AFTER THIS MORNING'S
20	MEETINGS THAT THE REGION NEEDS SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN FUNDING
21	FOR TRANSPORTATION AND THAT WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET THAT LEVEL
22	THAT WE NEED STRICTLY FROM SACRAMENTO OR FROM WASHINGTON, D.C.
23	
24	NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I APPRECIATE THAT. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, THAT
25	THE POLLING COMES BACK AND IT DOESN'T SEEM LIKE WE HAVE A



- 1 VIABLE PATH FORWARD TO PASSING THIS, I THINK WE SHOULD REALLY
- 2 CONSIDER WHETHER WE WANT TO SPEND A LOT OF OUR TIME AND
- 3 POLITICAL ENERGY ON SOMETHING WHICH WE MAY NOT, WHICH IS
- 4 LIKELY NOT GOING TO HAPPEN, OR WILL NOT HAPPEN FOR A VERY LONG
- 5 TIME. AND I THINK AT THE SAME TIME, WE HAVE -- YOU KNOW, AS WE
- 6 SAW LAST MONTH, WE STILL HAVE A VERY URGENT FISCAL CLIFF NEED,
- 7 NOT NECESSARILY IN THE NEXT SIX MONTH, BUT CERTAINLY IN THE
- 8 VERY NEAR FUTURE, AND I DON'T THINK WE CAN HAVE SOMETHING LIKE
- 9 THIS, SORT OF, DISTRACT US FROM PUTTING TOGETHER A PLAN B IN
- 10 CASE THIS DOESN'T MOVE FORWARD TO BE ABLE TO KIND OF KEEP
- 11 TRANSPORTATION -- KEEP OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS SOLVENT. SO, I
- 12 THINK, YOU KNOW, I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THE POLLING BUT
- 13 IF WE DON'T HAVE A VIABLE WAY FORWARD I THINK WE SHOULD THINK
- 14 ABOUT WHETHER WE WANT TO BE SPENDING OUR TIME AND POLICE MEN
- 15 ENERGY ON THIS AND TWO IF WE MOVE FORWARD WITH IT IT'S GOING
- 16 TO BE DICEY AND WE NEED A PLAN B FOR HOW WE'RE GOING TO
- 17 CONTINUE FUNDING OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS. SO, I HAVE TWO
- 18 COMMENTS ON THE, SORT OF, SPECIFICS. THE FIRST ONE IS, I --
- 19 AND I AGREE WITH EVERYTHING THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING SAID,
- 20 FIRST OF ALL. I THINK WE NEED TO ARTICULATE A VISION NOT JUST
- 21 HOW MUCH MONEY WE CAN RAISE FOR ALL THE GOOD THINGS. I SAID
- 22 THIS BEFORE LAST TIME WE NEED TO HAVE A, SORT OF, ROBUST
- 23 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT PLAN IN THIS MEASURE. IT'S A
- 24 CORE PART OF BAY AREA, WE WILL NOT MEET ANY OF OUR GOALS PER
- 25 PLANNED BAY AREA PROJECTIONS ON TRANSIT RIDERSHIP ON CLIMATE



REDUCTION, CONGESTION REDUCTION. I ALSO AGREE WITH THE 1 COMMENTERS WHO SPOKE ABOUT THE MEASURE \$10 BILLION INTO 2 3 WIDENING HIGHWAY PROJECTS IT MAKES AIR POLLUTION WORSE REDUCE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP WHEN I READ THE CONNECTIVITY BULLET CLOSE 4 5 GAPS THAT'S AUTOMOTIVE MICHELLE FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING, BOTTLES NECKS, HIGHWAY WIDENING RAIL GRADE SEPARATIONS, CAPACITY 6 EXPANSION, ANOTHER FOR HIGHWAY WIDENING. ANOTHER ONE WE'RE 7 8 TALKING ABOUT IN THIS MEASURE IS SO LARGE IF WE HAVE 20% OF FUNDING GOING TO THIS IT'S BILLIONS AND DOLLARS MAKING OUR 9 PROBLEMS WORSE AND WE CANNOT AFFORD TO DO THAT. THANK YOU VERY 10 MUCH FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO TALK. LOOKING FORWARD TO WHAT 11 EVERYBODY ELSE SAYS ON THE VIDEO. 12 13 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. 14 15 16 CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU. I GUESS THERE'S A TIME LIMIT ON THESE LIGHTS MINE GOES OUT AFTER A WHILE. BUT IN ANY CASE, 17 I THINK THIS IS GREAT CONVERSATION, AND I DO AGREE WITH 18 COMMISSIONER SPERING'S COMMENTS ABOUT WHAT ARE WE DOING. AND 19 AS WE WERE HAVING THIS CONVERSATION, I EVEN HAD TO GO BACK AND 20 LOOK AT THE TITLE OF WHAT WE WERE TALKING ABOUT FOR OUR NEW 21 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE BECAUSE IN THAT, WHEN I WAS THINKING 22 ABOUT IT, IT WAS HAPPENING BECAUSE OUR OPERATORS, OUR MASS 23 TRANSIT WAS HAVING FISCAL DIFFICULTIES, NOT ABOUT WHAT WE'RE 24

GOING TO DO FOR THE ROADWAYS. SO I REALLY DO THINK THAT THIS



- 1 MEASURE SHOULD NOT BE TALKING ABOUT, AS WAS ALREADY SAID,
- 2 WIDENING ROADWAYS. THAT MAKES NO SENSE. IT'S ABOUT GETTING
- 3 PEOPLE INTO THEIR VEHICLES. WHAT I DID HEAR THOUGH, AS PART OF
- 4 THIS, IF THIS IS BEING THOUGHT ABOUT, COMMISSIONER
- 5 JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS, I THOUGHT I HEARD HIM SAYING SOMETHING
- 6 ABOUT GRADE SEPARATION FOR RAILROADS. I THINK THE FACT IS,
- 7 VEHICLES ARE GOING CONTINUE TO EXIST WHETHER THEY'RE BATTERY,
- 8 HYDROGEN, GAS, WHATEVER, AND I THINK PUBLIC SAFETY IS KEY SO
- 9 THAT IF WE CAN SEPARATE ROADWAYS AND KEEP CARS AWAY FROM
- 10 TRAINS, I THINK THAT IS STILL VERY IMPORTANT AND MUCH NEEDED.
- 11 THAT BEING SAID, GOING FORWARD WITH THIS AS WE TALKED ABOUT
- 12 EARLIER TODAY ABOUT HOUSING, THAT WAS ANOTHER POINT THAT WAS
- 13 MADE THAT I DO WANT TO EMPHASIZE AGAIN THAT WE JUST CAN'T FIND
- 14 MORE MONEY FOR HOUSING THE CONVERSATION AROUND IMPACT FEES,
- 15 DEVELOPER FEES. IT'S HOW DO WE DO THINGS SMARTER. AND I THINK
- 16 IN TRANSPORTATION, THAT DOES PUT IT BACK ON THE OPERATOR. IT'S
- 17 NOT JUST, WE'RE GOING GIVE YOU MONEY, IT'S, WHAT ARE YOU GOING
- 18 TO DO TO IMPROVE THE COST -- COST CONTROL. AND THERE WAS
- 19 ANOTHER POINT. LET ME LOOK ON MY PIECE OF PAPER HERE. OH, THE
- 20 VOTERS. OH MY GOODNESS. THE VOTER FATIGUE. IN UNION CITY, WE
- 21 JUST DID OUR OWN POLLING FOR SOMETHING LOCAL WITHIN OUR TOWN,
- 22 AND THE VOTERS DON'T WANT TO SPEND THE MONEY. SO IT SUPPORTS
- 23 THE POLLING RESULTS YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT. SO THAT CERTAINLY
- 24 IS MY CONCERN THAT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THESE DIFFERENT MEASURES
- 25 OR THE SUMMARY HERE ON PAGE 11 OF THE DIFFERENT OPTIONS, JUST



TO THROW IT OUT THERE, WHEN WE DO GET DOWN THAT POINT, THE 1 2 INCOME TAX AND PAYROLL TAX OPTION THAT I'M LOOKING AT, I AM 3 SELF-EMPLOYED, I DO NOT HAVE A W2 FOR ANY KIND OF TAX TO COME OUT OF. SO, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THOSE KIND OF TAXES, IT NEEDS 4 5 TO BE FAIR TO ALL. I DON'T NECESSARILY LIKE IT, BUT IT NEEDS TO BE FAIR AT ALL THE PARTNERS ARE NOT -- AND PARTNERSHIPS 6 AREN'T ON W2S, SO PROPRIETORS AREN'T ON W2S SO THAT NEEDS TO 7 8 BE THOUGHT B THE INCOME TAX HERE IT LOOKS LIKE IT SAYS THAT INCOME IS ABOVE A SPECIFIED THRESHOLD IT MAKES SENSE BECAUSE 9 10 WE CAN'T KEEP -- AS WE TALK ABOUT EQUITY, WE CAN'T KEEP TAXING THOSE LOW-INCOME FOLKS THAT CAN'T BARELY AFFORD FOOD AND 11 HOUSING LET ALONE FUNDING OTHER ITEMS. AND I THINK, ON THE 12 PARCEL TAX, I LIKE IF WE DID GO DOWN THAT ROAD, PER SQUARE 13 FOOT, BECAUSE SOMEBODY CAN ONLY AFFORD A SMALL HOME, IT'S MUCH 14 15 MORE FAIR THAT THEY PAY LESS THAN SOMETHING WHO HAS AN I 16 DIDN'T HOME. SO, IN ANY CASE, THANK YOU, CHAIR. THOSE ARE MY

18

17

- 19 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MISS NOACK AND THEN
- 20 MR. RABBITT.

COMMENTS.

- 22 SUE NOACK: I WANT TO -- WE'RE TALKING ABOUT POLLING, BUT GOING
- 23 BACK TO JIM'S COMMENTS, I THINK THE PUBLIC IS LOOKING FOR
- 24 SOMETHING INNOVATIVE AND TRANSFORMATIONAL IN THE TRANSIT
- 25 WORLD. AND I THINK WE'RE MORE LIKELY TO HAVE SUCCESS ON A



- 1 MEASURE IF WE ACTUALLY DO SOMETHING TRANSFORMATIVE IN TRANSIT.
- 2 TRANSFORMATIVE ALSO EXPANSIVE SO THAT MORE PEOPLE CAN ACTUALLY
- 3 USE IT IN A BENEFICIAL WAY. AND I THINK DOING POLLING WITH,
- 4 SORT OF, THE SAME OLD TAX MEASURES, YOU KNOW, I KNOW PEOPLE IN
- 5 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY THAT -- I CAN TELL YOU WHAT THOSE RESULTS
- 6 ARE GOING TO BE. THAT'S NOT GOING TO BE PRETTY UNLESS THEY
- 7 REALLY SEE THIS IS GOING TO TRANSFORM AND NOT JUST CONTINUE TO
- 8 FUND OPERATIONS AS THEY ARE CURRENTLY. AND SO I THINK, GOING
- 9 TO JIM'S POINT, WE REALLY NEED TO DO THIS TRANSFORMATIONAL
- 10 WORK AND THEN GO TO THE PUBLIC AND SAY, THIS IS WHY WE NEED
- 11 MONEY TO DO THESE THINGS THAT WE'RE ACTUALLY GOING TO DO. AND,
- 12 YOU KNOW, AT SOME POINT, YOU'RE RIGHT, WE NEED TO HAVE
- 13 DISCUSSION ON WHAT THAT TRANSFORMATION LOOKS LIKE. WHERE IT
- 14 COMES FROM. YOU KNOW, EVERY COUNTY HAS UNIQUE THINGS GOING ON
- 15 IN SOME OF THIS WORK. IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HEAR ALL THE THINGS
- 16 THAT ARE BEING DONE CURRENTLY IN ORDER TO SPUR IDEAS ON HOW WE
- 17 CAN DO THIS ACROSS THE REGION. SO, I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS.
- 18 I'LL JUST SWITCH GEARS. I AGREE WITH THE COMMENTS ON, YOU
- 19 KNOW, SALES TAX, MOST EVERYBODY IS UP TO THEIR LIMIT ON SALES
- 20 TAX. AND IT IS REGRESSIVE. SO, I THINK WE NEED DO SOMETHING
- 21 PROGRESSIVE. THE SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX SEEMS TO RING
- 22 POSITIVELY IN MY MIND. BUT, AGAIN, I DON'T THINK IT WILL PASS
- 23 UNLESS WE ACTUALLY DO SOMETHING TRANSFORMATIVE FIRST. SO,
- 24 THANK YOU.



CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: COMMISSIONER RABBITT? 1 2 3 DAVID RABBIT: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL PROBABLY ECHO SOME OF MY COLLEAGUES. I THINK VOTERS ARE SAVVY ENOUGH TO WANT TO KNOW 4 5 WHAT THEY WANT TO GET FOR THE ADDITIONAL DOLLARS. YOU CAN'T GO IN AND SAY WHAT YOU ALREADY HAVE, BECAUSE THAT'S, IN MY MIND, 6 JUST DEAD-ON ARRIVAL. SO IT HAS TO BE A BOLD INITIATIVE. AND I 7 8 AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING IN THAT REGARD. I DO THINK THAT THERE IS A SHELF AND TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ, I AGREE 9 10 THERE'S A SHELF LIFE NOW ON EXPENDITURE PLANS AND HOW MUCH WORK WE WANT TO PUT INTO THIS GETTING INTO 2026 WHAT'S THE 11 NEXT YEAR HOLD FOR TRANSIT. NO ONE KNOWS. WHEN WE SETTLE DOWN 12 WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND WE NEED TO PAY 13 ATTENTION TO THAT. IN MY EXPERIENCE, IT'S ALWAYS BEEN TO 14 15 FOLLOW THE POLLING, BECAUSE -- AND EVEN THEN, IT'S A SNAPSHOT 16 IN TIME AND LOOK FOR THOSE TRENDS AND SEE WHAT YOU CAN DO TO 17 EDUCATE FOLKS BUT YOU HAVE TO ANSWER THE QUESTION IF I'M GOING PAY MONEY WHAM I GETTING FOR IT AND THAT VARIES THROUGHOUT THE 18 BAY AREA, FOR SURE, AND I WAS THINKING TO, COMMISSIONER 19 JOSEFOWITZ, TALKING ABOUT FREEWAYS OR HIGHWAYS VERY ADAMANTLY 20 21 BUT I'LL ALSO SAY BUSES TRAVEL ON HIGHWAYS SOME OF WHICH ARE NOT MOVING VERY FAST SO NO ONE IS GETTING ON THOSE BUSES IF 22 YOU ARE LOOKING INTO THE OUTER BAY AREA THAT'S GOING TO BE 23 SOMETHING -- IS THERE SOMETHING THERE THAT WE CAN DELIVER. SO 24 I THINK THERE AGAIN LOOKING AT THINGS A LITTLE BOLDLY. I LIKE 25



- 1 THE IDEA OF THE MENU OF OPTIONS ON WHERE TO GO. I DON'T KNOW,
- 2 ON THE PARCEL TAX, AND EVEN THE SQUARE FOOTAGE, IS THAT
- 3 DEVELOPED SQUARE FOOTAGE? OR IS THAT RAW LAND SQUARE FOOTAGE?
- 4 BECAUSE YOU WILL TELL YOU THAT'S A NON-STARTER IN A COUNTY
- 5 LIKE MINE WHERE YOU HAVE DAIRY FARMS, FOR INSTANCE THAT MAY
- 6 MAKE 6 TO 10 PARCELS ON THE PROPERTIES. THAT'S JUST NOT GOING
- 7 TO WORK. SO IF IT'S PER RESIDENTS, WHICH IS SOMETHING I WOULD
- 8 THINK COULD BE SUPPORTIVE, IT MAY FLY. BUT IF IT'S SOMETHING
- 9 ELSE, LIKE A, YOU KNOW, THAT NUMBER, EVEN IF YOU SPREAD IT
- 10 OUT, I IMAGINE THAT YOU'RE STILL TRYING TO ACHIEVE THE SAME
- 11 OVERALL AMOUNT SO YOU'RE GOING TO JUST SPREAD IT OUT A
- 12 DIFFERENT WAY IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT THOSE PARCELS ARE
- 13 NECESSARILY WORTH TEN TIMES MORE THAN THEIR ADJACENT
- 14 NEIGHBORS. THANK YOU.

15

- 16 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO MISS EKLUND.
- 17 ON YOU CAN PLEASE TURN ON YOUR MICROPHONE, MISS EKLUND.

- 19 PAT EKLUND: I HAD IT ON MUTE. I'M SORRY. I WASN'T SURE IF YOU
- 20 COULD HEAR ME. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING ME THE
- 21 OPPORTUNITY TO TALK. I AGREE WITH MOST OF THE COMMENTS THAT
- 22 HAVE BEEN MADE BY THE COMMISSIONERS SO FAR. I WANT TO SHARE
- 23 SOME RECENT INFORMATION THAT I HAVE COME INTO -- I JUST HAVE
- 24 BEEN MORE AWARE. MY MOM IS 96 AND SHE'S BEEN IN AND OUT OF THE
- 25 HOSPITAL THE LAST FEW MONTHS AND I HIRED CAREGIVERS. ONE OF



7

9

NOVEMBER 3, 2023

- 1 THE CAREGIVERS ACTUALLY COMES FROM VALLEJO TO COME; MY MOM
- 2 LIVES IN SAN RAFAEL. SO IN TALKING WITH HER, I ASKED HER WHY
- 3 DO YOU COME TO MARIN TO WORK AND SHE SAID WELL BECAUSE WE GET
- 4 A HIGHER FEE. AND I SAID BUT YOU HAVE TO DRIVE ALL THAT WAY
- 5 AND BE IN THE TRAFFIC, AND SHE GOES BUT WE STILL GET MORE
- 6 MONEY. SO I'M REALLY CONCERNED.

8 V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: YOU HAVE MUTED YOURSELF.

- 10 PAT EKLUND: I'M SORRY. I DIDN'T TOUCH ANYTHING. BUT SO ANYWAY
- 11 I'M REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE REGISTRATION INCREASE. AND I
- 12 DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS A WAY TO EXEMPT LOW-INCOME AND SENIORS.
- 13 OR EVEN THOSE WHO ARE HANDICAPPED THAT ARE DEPENDENT UPON
- 14 THEIR VEHICLES IN ORDER TO GET TO DOCTORS APPOINTMENTS FOR
- 15 EXAMPLE. IF WE'RE GOING TO LOOKING AT REGISTRATION FEE
- 16 INCREASE FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS, I THINK THERE SHOULD BE SOME
- 17 EXEMPTIONS. AND I DON'T EVEN KNOW IF IT'S POSSIBLE DO THAT AND
- 18 I TOTALLY AGREE. WHEN THIS CAME ON -- WHEN THE CONVERSATION
- 19 STARTED, SAID WELL HOW ARE WE GOING TO USE THESE FUNDS AND I
- 20 KEPT LOOKING BACK AND SAYING, WELL, I DON'T THINK WE HAVE
- 21 IDENTIFIED EXACTLY HOW THESE MONEYS ARE GOING TO BE USED AND
- 22 WHETHER IT'S REALLY NEEDED. AND I THINK WE NEED TO IDENTIFY
- 23 THOSE FIRST. AND I DON'T EVEN KNOW HOW MUCH WE'RE LOOKING TO
- 24 DO IN 2026. AND I'M ASSUMING THAT IF THE 2024 GO BOND DOES NOT
- 25 PASS FOR HOUSING, THAT WE WOULDN'T PURSUE SOMETHING IN 2026



- 1 BECAUSE I THINK THAT GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND FOR HOUSING IS OF
- 2 UTMOST IMPORTANCE FOR US TO BE ABLE TO GET THE MONEY TO BE
- 3 ABLE TO HELP DO, ESPECIALLY MORE LOW-INCOME HOUSING. WITH THE
- 4 PARCEL TAX, YOU KNOW, FRANKLY, WE HAVE SO MANY LOW-INCOME
- 5 FOLKS AND SENIORS THAT ARE JUST TRYING TO STAY IN THEIR HOME
- 6 NOW, THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE SHOULD BE SOME EXEMPTIONS THERE.
- 7 YOU GOT AGING SENIORS, BUT DON'T FORGET ALL THE LOW-INCOME
- 8 FOLKS THAT ARE STILL TRYING TO STAY IN THEIR HOMES. AND THEN,
- 9 ESPECIALLY THOSE WHO ARE RENTING TO LOW-INCOME FOLKS. SO, I
- 10 THINK THAT THERE NEEDS TO BE A LITTLE BIT MORE REFINEMENT ON
- 11 SOME OF THESE OTHER ISSUES. A ROAD USAGE FEE, AGAIN, YOU'RE
- 12 HITTING THE LOW-INCOME. MOST OF THE LOW-INCOME HAVE TO DRIVE
- 13 THEIR CARS TO GET TO THEIR EMPLOYMENT. THEY CANNOT TAKE
- 14 TRANSIT. EITHER THEY HAVE TO BRING THEIR MACHINERY WITH THEM
- 15 OR WHATEVER. BUT THIS ROAD USAGE CHARGE, I JUST THINK THAT
- 16 THAT'S AN ISSUE NOT ONLY FOR LOW-INCOME BUT FOR SENIORS, AS
- 17 WELL. I DON'T KNOW WHAT IS JUSTIFYING -- AND THESE ARE A BUNCH
- 18 OF OUESTIONS I WOULD LOVE TO GET ANSWERED BUT I KNOW THIS MAY
- 19 NOT BE THE TIME TO DO THIS. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHAT IS
- 20 JUSTIFYING THE MATH THAT'S BEING REQUESTED. AND IN ENABLING
- 21 LEGISLATION IN ORDER TO DO THIS, I THINK PURSUING THAT BEFORE
- 22 IDENTIFYING WHAT WE NEED AND HOW MUCH WE NEED, AND WHETHER OR
- 23 NOT IT'S GOING TO BE SUSTAINABLE OVER TIME, I JUST THINK THAT
- 24 YOU'RE BARKING UP THE WRONG TREE, ONLY BECAUSE THERE IS SO
- 25 MANY OTHER THINGS THAT WE NEED TO GET DONE. SO, ANYWAY, I'M



- 1 REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THIS APPROACH AND THE WAY IT'S
- 2 PRESENTED TODAY, I MEAN, I WOULD NOT SUPPORT IT AT ALL.
- 3 BECAUSE I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE IS NO PUBLIC TRANSIT
- 4 BETWEEN VALLEJO AND MARIN COUNTY OR SONOMA COUNTY OR NAPA
- 5 COUNTY. WELL, I'M NOT SURE ABOUT NAPA COUNTY, BUT THERE IS NO
- 6 PUBLIC TRANSIT. SO PEOPLE DON'T HAVE AN OPTION. ESPECIALLY THE
- 7 LOW-INCOME. BUT YOU KNOW, THEN AGAIN, AS WE ARE ALREADY
- 8 EXPERIENCING, AND PEOPLE HAVE ALREADY TESTIFIED TO THE FACT
- 9 THAT WHEN YOU DO USE TRANSIT, YOU CAN'T GET THERE IN TIME IN
- 10 ORDER TO MEET YOUR -- GET YOUR MEETING -- OR GET EMPLOYED. SO
- 11 JUST, I FEEL VERY UNCOMFORTABLE.

12

- 13 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: WE'LL GO TO MOULTON-PETERS FIRST THEN
- 14 JESSE.

- 16 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: I'M GOING TO AGREE WITH MY
- 17 COLLEAGUES. WE NEED A VISION. IT'S INCUMBENT UPON THE BOARD TO
- 18 PROVIDE A VISION I'M LISTENING TO ALL THESE GOOD THOUGHTS
- 19 SAYING OKAY HOW DO WE DEVELOP A VISION. I THINK WE DIVE DEEPER
- 20 INTO THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND LOOK AT STRATEGIES THAT
- 21 ARE FARTHER OUT TIME WISE AND SEE WHAT WE WANT TO INCORPORATE
- 22 INTO THIS MEASURE. I THINK WE HAVE GOT TO COME UP, MAYBE DO
- 23 SOME SCENARIO PLANNING SO THAT WE HAVE GOT TWO OR THREE
- 24 SCENARIOS OF CHANGE THAT HAS DIFFERENT IMPLICATIONS FOR URBAN
- 25 TRANSIT PROVIDERS AND SUBURBAN FOR LARGE AND SMALL OPERATORS.



- 1 IN OTHER WORDS, IT WOULD GET SOME BROAD CHOICES THAT WE CAN
- 2 LOOK AT AND SEE, SORT OF, WHERE THE GOLDILOCKS SOLUTION IS IN
- 3 ALL OF THIS. BECAUSE WE HAVE GOT TO HIT A LOT OF DIFFERENT
- 4 MARKERS TO KEEP OUR DIFFERENT INTEREST GROUPS AND CITIES AND
- 5 COUNTIES HAPPY. I THINK WE NEED TO HAVE A PLAN B, FOR SURE,
- 6 AND I THINK THAT WAS WISE. AS FAR AS THE FUNDINGS MECHANISMS,
- 7 I DON'T HAVE A STRONG FEELING. WE HAVE HEARD THE PROS AND CONS
- 8 OF EACH OF THEM AND AT SOME POINT WHEN THAT SHAKES OUT AND WE
- 9 LOOK AT VARIOUS MEASURES AND HOW THEY PULL AT DIFFERENT PRICE
- 10 POINTS, IN THE END BEFORE WE GO OUT AND DO POLLING BECAUSE I
- 11 DON'T THINK WE HAVE SOMETHING CLEAR ENOUGH TO POLL AGAINST
- 12 RIGHT NOW. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS

14 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: JESSE?

- 16 V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: I AGREE WITH ALL OF COMMISSIONER
- 17 SPERING'S COMMENTS. I THINK THAT THIS IS, SORT OF, ONCE IN A
- 18 GENERATION OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO TRANSFORM THE TRANSIT SYSTEM
- 19 IN THE BAY AREA. AND I THINK THE VOTERS, WHEN WE DID THAT
- 20 SURVEY, SAID THEY'RE NOT PREPARED TO SUPPORT A REGIONAL
- 21 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE UNLESS THERE ARE MAJOR CHANGES, NOT
- 22 JUST IN TERMS OF SAFETY, BUT IN TERMS OF RELIABILITY AND
- 23 EFFICIENCY. AND, SO, THIS HAS TO ADVANCE THOSE GOALS. SO, I
- 24 THINK WHEN WE LOOK AT GUIDING PRINCIPLES, REALLY LIFTING THAT
- 25 UP AS A GUIDING PRINCIPLE, AN OVERARCHING GUIDING PRINCIPLE,

13



- 1 CERTAINLY EQUITY IS IMPORTANT, HOW WE'RE ACHIEVING CARBON
- 2 NEUTRALITY, BUT HOW WE'RE TRANSFORMING AND IMPROVING THE
- 3 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA, INNOVATING IT, I THINK
- 4 THAT'S GOT TO BE A GUIDING PRINCIPLE. JUST A FEW COMMENTS. I
- 5 AGREE THAT KIND OF SETTING WHAT ARE THE GOALS THAT WE WANT TO
- 6 ACHIEVE I THINK IS REALLY CRITICAL. AND THE OVERARCHING GOALS
- 7 TO MAKE SURE WE CAN KEEP OPERATIONS GOING BALLS IN THE PROCESS
- 8 OF DOING THAT, HOW ARE WE IMPROVING. AND I DO AGREE THAT, YOU
- 9 KNOW, ENGAGING OTHER STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING BUSINESS, I THINK
- 10 IS GOING TO BE REALLY CRITICAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT BECAUSE
- 11 IT'S GOING TO TAKE A BROAD COALITION TO PASS THIS IN 2026 AND
- 12 THE OPERATORS ARE AN EXTREMELY IMPORTANT PART OF THE
- 13 CONVERSATION SO THAT WE UNDERSTAND WHAT THE NEED IS SO WE CAN
- 14 RIGHT SIZE WHATEVER MEASURE TO ADDRESS THAT BUT AT THE SAME
- 15 TIME, I HAVE HEARD SOME CONCERNS ON THE PART OF BUSINESS
- 16 LEADERS AROUND DOING A MEASURE UNLESS WE ARE LOOKING AT
- 17 CONSOLIDATION, LOOKING AT NETWORK MANAGEMENT, LOOKING AT HOW
- 18 WE'RE ADDRESSING SAFETY. AND SO I THINK GETTING THEIR INPUT
- 19 ALSO WILL BE IMPORTANT, AS WELL. SO, I THINK THE QUESTION YOU
- 20 RAISED AROUND IS THIS GOING TO FULLY CLOSE THE GAP OR NOT IS
- 21 AN INTERESTING QUESTION. I THINK THAT GETS TO THE POINT OF,
- 22 WELL, THE DIFFERENT REVENUE SOURCES, WHAT EACH ONE COULD
- 23 GENERATE, AND THEN IF THIS IS NOT GOING TO FULLY CLOSE THE
- 24 GAP, WHAT IS THAT MENU OF SOLUTIONS TO HELP CLOSE THE GAP IS
- 25 THAT SOME PORTION OF REALLOCATING OR REPROGRAMMING MONEY, IS



- 1 THE STATE PROVIDING SOME AMOUNT OF OPERATING FUNDS, ARE WE
- 2 ASSUMING A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF INCREASE IN FAREBOX REVENUE. LIKE
- 3 WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE. AND I THINK WE PROBABLY NEED TO
- 4 ASSUME SCENARIOS, ONE IF THIS CLOSES THE GAP AND TWO WHAT ARE
- 5 OTHER OPTIONS TO CLOSE THE GAP IF IT DOES NOT FULLY CLOSING
- 6 THE G WITH RESPECT TO STRUCTURE OF LEGISLATION, I AGREE THAT
- 7 HAVING A VERY DETAILED EXPENDITURE PLAN AT THIS TIME UNTIL
- 8 SUCH TIME THAT WE'RE DOING THAT ROBUST OUTREACH PROBABLY IS
- 9 NOT THE BEST APPROACH BUT MINIMUM PERCENTAGES GOING TO THOSE
- 10 CATEGORIES AND BUILDING FLEXIBILITY IS IMPORTANT. AND YES,
- 11 HAVING FLEXIBILITY TO ENSURE THIS COULD BE DONE THROUGH
- 12 SIGNATURE GATHERING IS ALSO IMPORTANT IF THE POLLING DOES
- 13 DEMONSTRATE THAT GETTING 2/3 MAY NOT BE A VIABLE PATH. AND I
- 14 THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, WE DO NEED A STUDY OF SALES TAX. BUT I
- 15 THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE A LOT OF RESISTANCE TO THAT. AND,
- 16 SO, I KNOW WE HAVE LOOKED AT VARIOUS DIFFERENT OPTIONS OF HOW
- 17 WE KIND OF ESTIMATED -- I MEAN THAT'S IN PROGRESS, WHAT THE --
- 18 WELL, I GUESS, WHAT IS IT THE TOTAL NEED THAT WE NEED TO
- 19 GENERATE IS? SO THAT THERE IS OPERATIONS BUT IF WE'RE DOING
- 20 OPERATIONS PLUS RESILIENCE, PLUS, YOU KNOW, TRANSFORMATION,
- 21 WHAT IS THAT NUMBER, AND THEN WORKING BACKWARDS LOOKING AT HOW
- 22 MUCH WOULD EACH OF THESE REVENUE SOURCES GAIN, I THINK WE'LL
- 23 PROBABLY WANT TO GO WITH WHATEVER WILL GENERATE THE MOST
- 24 REVENUE, BUT WE ALSO HAVE TO BE MINDFUL OF THE POLITICAL
- 25 FEASIBILITY OF SOME OF THESE DIFFERENT REVENUE OPTIONS. SO,



HAVE WE -- HAVE THERE BEEN ANY ESTIMATES OF WHAT DIFFERENT 1 2 SOURCES COULD RETURN? 3 REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR, COMMISSIONER -- OR RATHER, 4 PRESIDENT ARREGUIN, YES, SO, ON SLIDE 11 OF THE PRESENTATION 5 6 WHERE IT SHOWS THE DIFFERENT MENUS OF REVENUE OPTIONS, THOSE ARE ALL -- THOSE RATES CORRESPOND WITH A BILLED PER YEAR. SO 7 8 WE KIND OF STANDARDIZED IT THERE. AND THE REASON WE CHOSE A BILLION DOLLARS IS, AS YOU ALL KNOW, IT'S DIFFICULT TO PREDICT 9 10 EXACTLY WHAT THE NEED IS GOING TO BE FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS, AS ONE EXAMPLE. RIGHT NOW, LOOKING AT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS 11 FORECAST, THE GAP ONCE ALL COVID RECEIVE STATE FUNDING RUNS 12 OUT IT'S NORTH OF \$700 MILLION PER YEAR. SO WE WANTED TO 13 PROVIDE SOME ROOM, YOU KNOW, BACK TO YOUR COMMENTS A MOMENT 14 AGO, YOU KNOW, WHAT'S A'S SCENARIO FOR CLOSING THAT GAP, WE 15 16 WANT TO HAVE FOR SOME FUNDING PRIORITIES AND BASED ON A 17 BILLION DOLLARS SEEMS LIKE A REASONABLE PLACE TO START POLLING WOULD NEED TO INFORM THAT BUT THESE ARE THE RACE THAT WE HAVE 18 POLLED ON SO WHAT THE POLLING IS GOING TO EXPLORE IS SALES 19 TAX, INCOME TAX, AND PAYROLL TAX AT THESE RATES AND THAT WILL 20 21 HELP GIVE US SOME DIRECTION. 22 V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: AGAIN LASTLY I'LL JUST SAY THAT 23 LOOKING AT ALL NINE COUNTIES, HAVING FLEXIBILITY TO DO IN '26, 24

OR SOME LATER DATE, IF YOU DECIDE NOT -- IF MTC DECIDES NOT TO



GO AHEAD AND THEN HAVING PRIORITIES, CATEGORIES, BUT ALSO 1 BUILDING IN FLEXIBILITY TO DEVELOP THAT EXPENDITURE PLAN, I 2 3 THINK IS THE RIGHT APPROACH. THANK YOU. 4 5 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: MR. TIEDEMANN? 6 AARON TIEDEMANN: THANK YOU. I AGREE WITH A LOT OF THE PREVIOUS 7 8 COMMENTS. I'LL TRY NOT TO REPEAT ANY OF THEM TOO MUCH. WE ALL SEEM TO AGREE ON THE IDEA THAT WE SHOULD BE THINKING 9 TRANSFORMATIONALLY AND TAKING A LEADERSHIP ROLE HERE. WE'RE 10 DOING A LOT ABOUT TALKING ABOUT TALKING ABOUT IT WHICH IS OUR 11 ROLE TO SOME EXTENT. BUT I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER MOULTON-12 PETERS REFERENCING THE SPECIFIC PLAN OF SOMETHING WE COULD 13 LOOK AT OF WHAT THAT TRANSFORMATIONAL THINKING COULD LOOK LIKE 14 15 ACCORDING TO THE PLAN WE HAVE. THAT MAY NOT BE COMING UP WITH 16 ALL THE IDEAS TODAY BUT INCUMBENT ON US TO FIGURE OUT IF WE TRANSFORMATIONAL WHAT DOES THAT LOOK LIKE, AND I DON'T KNOW 17 EXACTLY WHAT THAT IS RIGHT NOW. ON SPECIFICS OF THE PLAN I 18 AGREE WE SHOULD FOCUS ON PUBLIC TRANSIT EXPAND BEING RATHER 19 THAN INDIVIDUAL VEHICLE EASE NOT WIDENING HIGHWAYS OR THINGS 20 21 LIKE THAT. I ALSO AGREE IF WE'RE GOING FOR EQUITY, WE HAVE TO HAVE AN EQUITABLE REVENUE STRUCTURE THAT MEANS NOT HAVING ANY, 22 SORT OF, PROGRESSIVE FLAT TAXES BUT PROGRESSIVE ONES, I THINK 23 THE BEST ONE IS PROBABLY GOING TO BE THE PROGRESSIVE VERSION 24

OF THE PARCEL TAX BASED ON SQUARE FOOTAGE WITH PROBABLY SOME



- 1 LOCATION AND SENIOR EXEMPTIONS. I'M HAPPY TO HAVE US KEEP
- 2 EXPLORING ALL OF THOSE. THOSE ARE ALL ON THERE AS
- 3 POSSIBILITIES BUT IS PROBABLY THE ONE THAT'S GOING TO WORK
- 4 BEST OVERALL. I THINK, YOU KNOW, MAXIMUM FLEXIBILITY IS
- 5 DEFINITELY A GOOD IDEA AND NOT HAVING EXPENDITURE PLANS IN THE
- 6 ENABLING LEGISLATION. CAVEAT AS SOMEONE WHO IS TRYING NOW TO
- 7 BUILD SUPPORT FOR THE BAHFA BOND THAT MEANS IT'S HARD TORE
- 8 SELL THAT UNTIL YOU HAVE THE EXPENDITURE PLAN BECAUSE THE IF
- 9 YOU HAVE QUESTION EVERYONE ASKS IS WHAT ARE YOU GOING TO DO
- 10 WITH IT WHAT'S THE EXPENDITURE PLAN AND YOU SAY IT'S NOT HERE
- 11 YET BUT HERE ARE SOME GENERALS. IT'S AN APPROACH BUT OUR JOB
- 12 BECOMES MORE DIFFICULT UNTIL WE ACTUALLY PASS THAT PLAN SO WE
- 13 SHOULD BE AWARE OF THAT. AND THEN JUST LASTLY ON THE POLLING
- 14 ISSUE, YOU KNOW, I WOULD RATHER HAVE THE TOOL AVAILABLE TO US
- 15 IN OUR BACK POCKET THAN NOT EVEN IF WE DON'T USE IT FOR A
- 16 LITTLE WHILE. HAVING THE FLEXIBILITY TO NOT DO IT IN 2026 I
- 17 THINK IS PROBABLY THE RIGHT APPROACH ESPECIALLY WHEN IT'S OUR
- 18 TIME TO STRIKE IN LEGISLATURE, EVEN IF IT'S NOT THE RIGHT TIME
- 19 TO SELL A TAX INCREASE TO VOTERS. SO IT MAY BE THE RIGHT TIME
- 20 TO GET US THE ABILITY TO DO THIS AND WRITE THE ENABLING
- 21 LEGISLATION EVEN IF WE NEED TO DO SOME MORE WORK EXPANDING
- 22 WHAT'S POSSIBLE IN TERMS OF VOTERS AND WHAT THEY'RE WILLING TO
- 23 VOTE FOR IN TERMS OF TAXES. THAT'S IT THANK YOU.



CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: AHN? AHN ANNE I HAVE A CONFIRMATION WITH 1 2 STAFF FIRST OF ALL DO YOU GO BACK AND FORTH WITH THE POLLING 3 FIRM ON HOW QUESTIONS ARE WORDED ON THE POLL? 4 5 REBECCA LONG: ABSOLUTELY. 6 7 EDDIE AHN: IT'S ALREADY UNDERWAY IT SOUND LIKE? 8 REBECCA LONG: YES THE CURRENT POLL IS IN THE FIELD. 9 10 EDDIE AHN: WHAT I WAS THINKING BASED ON COMMISSIONER COMMENTS 11 WAS CREATING QUESTIONS LIKE IF WE WERE ABLE TO DO X WOULD YOU 12 BE WILLING TO VOTE FOR Y. QUESTIONS THAT ARE IMPORTANT TO YOU, 13 SECURITY VERSUS GREATER EFFICIENCY IN TRANSIT, ET CETERA, ET 14 15 CETERA. BUT I THINK PART OF WHAT I HAVE A LOT IN TODAY'S 16 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS IS WE HAVE TO TREAT THIS LIKE A TRANSACTION OF VOTERS. AND IF THE POLLING -- DO POLLING 17 QUESTIONS REFLECT THAT TOO. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, RIGHT NOW. 18 19 REBECCA LONG: CERTAINLY THE POLLING OUESTIONS REALLY TRY TO 20 DRILL DOWN AS WE DID IN MARCH BUT EITHER FURTHER ON WHAT ARE 21 YOUR PRIORITIES. RIGHT? SO WE ASK A LOT OF QUESTIONS RELATED 22 TO TRANSFORMATION AND THE TYPE OF CONNECTIVITY THAT THE 23

TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN DRIVING US TOWARDS, SO I THINK



WE'RE GOING TO GET A LOT OF THAT TYPE OF FEEDBACK THAT WE HAVE 1 2 HEARD TODAY. 3 SPEAKER: OKAY. I'LL BE READING THOSE CLOSELY. 4 5 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: MR. SPERING. 6 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: I'LL BE BRIEF. NO MATTER WHAT THE POLLING IS TELLING US. THERE ARE THINGS WE CAN DO WITHOUT THE MEASURE. 9 STRENGTHEN THE NETWORK MANAGER, LOOKING AT EFFICIENCIES IN THE 10 SYSTEM. YOU KNOW, WHAT AUTHORITY MTC NEEDS. THERE IS A LOT OF 11 THINGS THAT WE COULD BE DOING AND IT'S SHORTSIGHTED A LOT CAN 12 CHANGE BETWEEN NOW AND NOVEMBER OF '26. A LOT. IF WE COME 13 FORWARD WITH DOING THESE IMPROVEMENTS THAT DON'T REQUIRE THIS 14 LEGISLATION, OR THE MEASURE, THE PUBLIC WILL BUILD CONFIDENCE, 15 16 AND THEY WILL SAY THEY'RE SERIOUS ABOUT WHAT THEY'RE DOING THEY WILL MAKE CHANGES THEY CAN MAKE BUT THEY NEED ADDITIONAL 17 RESOURCES TO MAKE THE BIG FUNDAMENTAL CHANGES. I ENCOURAGE MR. 18 CHAIRMAN THAT WE GO THROUGH THIS EXERCISE FOR THE REASON I 19 THINK THERE IS BENEFITS OTHER THAN WHAT YOU WILL GET ON THE 20 21 MEASURE. 22 23 ALFREDO PEDROZA: I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONERS LEANING IN ON THIS DISCUSSION IT'S WHAT WE NEEDED TO HAPPEN FROM YOU ALL. YOU 24

PROVIDED GOOD FEEDBACK I WANT TO SIT DOWN WITH OUR TEAM AND



TALKS ABOUT NEXT STEPS. THIS IS AN EXCITING TIME TO DECIDE 1 WHERE WE WANT TO GO AND PROVIDE VISION MAKING SURE WE'RE 2 3 WORKING WITH PARTNERS AND COLLEAGUES HOW WE GET THERE. YOU HAVE MY COMMITMENT AS CHAIR OF MTC TO CONNECT WITH STAFF AND 4 5 COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION AND TALK ABOUT PLATFORM PROCESS AND PATHWAY TO GET TO WHERE WE WANT TO GO. 6 7 8 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: I'LL CLOSE AND WE'LL GET IT TO ANDY. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S IMPORTANT FOR ME GOING THROUGH THE LINE 9 ITEMS IS WHAT WE'RE DOING AROUND BAHFA AND THE EXPENDITURE 10 PLAN CONCEPT AND MAKING THAT ADAPTABLE AND BUILDING THE 11 FLEXIBILITY, ESPECIALLY AROUND THE FUNDING IS KEY. SO I DO 12 HOPE STAFF MOVES FORWARD IN THE DIRECTION. WE HAVE HEARD 13 DIVERGENT VIEWPOINTS ON REVENUE OPTIONS, JUST LISTENING TO ALL 14 15 THE COMMENTS. SO, I WOULD ENCOURAGE STAFF TO REALLY LOOK AT 16 KEEPING ALL OPTIONS OPEN AND BEING ABLE TO STUDY. I DO THINK THIS IS A ONCE IN A LIFETIME, SORT OF, OPPORTUNITY IN TERMS OF 17 BEING INNOVATIVE AND TRANSFORMATIVE. AND I DO THINK THERE IS 18 AN ACCOUNTABILITY PIECE. AND I THINK YOU HAVE HEARD FROM THE 19 BOARD. AT THE END OF THE DAY, AND I THINK IT WAS CHAIR PEDROZA 20 21 WHO MENTIONED IT OUR RESPONSIBILITY IS TO THE END USER, TO THE

RIDER. WE CAN'T LOSE FOCUS OF THAT. I DO WANT TO THANK STAFF,

IT'S A COMPLICATED ISSUE. THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO MAY BE GIVING

YOU DIFFERENT FEEDBACK, AND TO AGGREGATE THAT, I THINK TODAY

WHAT WE HAVE ACCOMPLISHED IS THERE IS CLEAR DIRECTION. I HOPE

22

23

24



- 1 MOVING FORWARD MY UNDERSTANDING IS THIS COMES BEFORE US AGAIN
- 2 ON DECEMBER 8TH. THAT WE'RE ABLE TO WORK, ON A STAFF LEVEL,
- 3 OBVIOUSLY WITH THE CHAIR, TO MAKE SURE THAT WE BRING SOMETHING
- 4 BACK THAT THIS BOARD CAN ACCEPT AND BE SUPPORTIVE OF. WITH
- 5 THAT, DIRECTOR FREMIER?

- 7 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA ANDREW F, EXECUTIVE
- 8 DIRECTOR. THERE WAS A LOT OF GOOD FEEDBACK. THAT WAS THE
- 9 PURPOSE OF BRINGING IT FORWARD. I THINK PROBABLY THE MOST
- 10 PROVOCATIVE PART STARTED WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING I'LL TRY TO
- 11 DIRECT IMMEDIATE RESPONSE TO THAT. FIRST OF ALL I'M COMMITTED
- 12 TO WORKING WITH CHAIR PEDROZA TO FIGURE OUT A WHY AND HOW WE
- 13 GO ABOUT DOING THAT AND I ACCEPT THAT CHALLENGE DIRECTLY. I
- 14 ALSO WANT TO SAY I DIDN'T EXPECT TO HAVE ANY FRIENDS HERE JUST
- 15 BECAUSE I GOT THE JOB I'M NOT WORRIED ABOUT THAT PART OF THE
- 16 ADVICE AND I WANT TO REFLECT ON DIRECTOR ROMERO'S POINT IN THE
- 17 LAST MEETING THAT THIS IS THE THIRD EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR THAT'S
- 18 BEEN ASKED TO KIND OF RUN UP THIS HILL A LITTLE BIT SO MAYBE I
- 19 WILL BE GOLDILOCKS AND FIND A WAY THROUGH IT. I WANT TO REMIND
- 20 FOLKS A LITTLE BIT THOUGH ABOUT THE WORK THAT HAS BEEN TAKING
- 21 PLACE AND IT'S SOMETHING WE NEED TO REFLECTS ON IN TERMS OF
- 22 BUILDING A FOUNDATION. YOU KNOW, MOST RECENTLY WE REALLY WENT
- 23 -- WELL, SEVERAL YEARS AGO WE WENT THROUGH THE EFFORT OF THE
- 24 BLUE RIBBON TRANSFORMATION PLAN AND IT CREATED A
- 25 TRANSFORMATION PLAN THAT ASKED FOR SOME RELATIVELY LOW-HANGING



- 1 FRUIT THAT ARE ALL COMPLICATED PROJECTS. FIRST OF ALL I WOULD
- 2 LIKE TO REMIND US THAT WE'RE MAKING TREMENDOUS PROGRESS IN
- 3 THAT SPACE. CLIPPER TWO IS ON SCHEDULE TO BE DELIVERED IN 2024
- 4 PROVIDES OPEN PAYMENT BENEFITS AND TOOLS THAT ARE AVAILABLE TO
- 5 MOVE INTO THE NEXT GENERATION OF FARE INTEGRATION. WE'RE
- 6 MOVING INTO THE SECOND PHASE OF THE BAY PASS PROGRAM WHERE
- 7 WE'RE STARTING TO NOW ENGAGE WITH THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY ABOUT
- 8 CREATING A PRICE STRUCTURE THAT WORKS FOR BRINGING RIDERS AND
- 9 REVENUE INTO THE SYSTEM. AND, ALSO, IN THE SUMMER OF '24,
- 10 WE'LL BE DELIVERING SOME OF OUR FIRST BUS PRIORITY PROJECTS
- 11 APPROACHING THE BAY BRIDGE. THEY WILL BE IN CONSTRUCTION. AND
- 12 SO, I THINK THOSE ARE THINGS TO REFLECT ON. I ALSO WANT TO
- 13 REMIND THE FOLKS THAT THE BLUE RIBBON PANEL WAS REALLY
- 14 ADDRESSED ON CONSENSUS. AND IT WAS A LONG SLOG TO GET TO THAT
- 15 POINT. WHAT YOU'RE ASKING IS A LITTLE BIT MORE AGGRESSIVE THAN
- 16 THAT, QUITE A BIT MORE AGGRESSIVE THAN THAT, AND THAT ALSO
- 17 NEEDS TO BE REFLECTED IN HOW HARD THE WORK IS TO KEEP
- 18 CONSENSUS GOING ON THE WORK WE'RE DOING WHILE MAYBE ADD SOME
- 19 CHALLENGES TO THE STORY LINE. IN TERMS OF REFLECTING HARD WORK
- 20 BEING DONE BY THE COMMISSION AND THE REGION IN THE SPACE I
- 21 THINK YOUR EXECUTIVE STAFF THROUGHOUT THE ORGANIZATION THAT
- 22 MORE EFFICIENT GOVERNANCE WOULD MAKE SOME SENSE. WHAT THAT
- 23 MEANS IS AN OPEN OUESTION BUT I DON'T THINK YOU GET PUSH BACK
- 24 FROM THAT IN PARTICULAR AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ HAS REMINDED US
- 25 AROUND FARE PRODUCTS AND SCHEDULING. THAT'S A PLACE WHERE WE



1	COULD SPEND SOME ENERGY. IN ADDITION STUDIES HAVE SHOWN
2	SIGNIFICANT ADVANTAGES IN PROCUREMENT CHALLENGES BY MAYBE
3	BUYING THE SAME KINDS OF EQUIPMENT AND BUSES AND RAIL CARS.
4	THAT CERTAINLY IS AN AREA I THINK WE CAN DO A LOT BETTER AND
5	REALLY TRY TO PROVIDE SOME EFFICIENCIES. THE MOST MEANINGFUL
6	ITEM TO TACKLE IS THE HARDEST AND THAT IS THIS QUESTION AROUND
7	RAIL GOVERNANCE AND I THINK THAT IS SOMETHING THE BART BOARD
8	BROUGHT FORWARD AS A POTENTIAL IT TALK ABOUT I THINK WE HAVE
9	DANCED AROUND THAT SUBJECT FOR MANY YEARS THAT'S A PLACE WHERE
10	WE WOULD LIKE TO OFFER SOME PLACES TO INVESTIGATE WHAT THE
11	CHALLENGES WOULD BE AND NAVIGATING A DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF
12	THAT AND ARE LOOKING FORWARD TO BRINGING THAT BACK NOT ONLY TO
13	THE LEGISLATURE, BUT THROUGH THE COMMISSION, OF COURSE. LAST
14	THING WANT TO MENTION MAYBE ABOUT WHAT'S GOING ON IS WE'RE IN
15	THE PROCESS OF FOLLOWING SB125, AND PRODUCING THE SHORT-TERM
16	FINANCIAL PLAN FOR NAVIGATING THE NEXT THREE YEARS WE HAVE A
17	LOT OF REQUIREMENTS FROM THE STATE IN ORDER HOW TO SUBMIT THAT
18	INFORMATION AND WE HAVE WORKED TIRELESSLY WITH THE OPERATORS
19	TO DO SO. YOU HAVE ALSO STARTED TALKING ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT
20	YOU AGREE WITH THE DISTRIBUTION PLANS THAT WE BROUGHT FORWARD.
21	ONE THING I WANTED TO MENTION IS WE'RE GETTING PRETTY GOOD
22	CONSENSUS FROM THE OPERATOR THAT IS WHAT WE'RE RECOMMENDING
23	MAKES SENSE AND WE'RE PUTTING STRINGS ON TO THOSE COMMITMENTS
24	THAT ARE DESIGNED TO BRING MEASURABLE RESPONSES BACK TO THIS
25	COMMISSION AROUND CUSTOMER SERVICE AND EFFICIENCY ENHANCEMENT.



SO, MORE OF THAT IS COMING. AND I GUESS I JUST WANTED TO CLOSE 1 BY SAYING, YOU KNOW, TO ME IT'S THE TOTAL PICTURE HERE WE'RE 2 3 TALKING ABOUT AND THE CHALLENGES AREN'T GOING TO STOP COMING BECAUSE CHARGES WE TALKED ABOUT IN THE REVENUE MEASURE AND 4 5 MONEY AND SOLUTIONS, AND THE RICHMOND SAN RAFAEL BRIDGE WHAT IS POTENTIALLY CAPACITY INCREASING PROJECT ON A HIGHWAY SYSTEM 6 SO THE PROBLEMS THAT ARE ACKNOWLEDGE FORWARD I THINK HOW WE 7 8 FIGURE OUT NAVIGATE IT'S GOING TO BE A LOT OF WORK FOR US. I'M COMMITTED TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL TO BE SUCCESSFUL AND FIGURE 9 10 HOW WE MANAGE. ONE COMMENT I WOULD MAKE ABOUT PLAN B I THINK WE HAVE TO BE CAREFUL. WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT AUTHORITY WE HAVE 11 AND IDENTIFY WHAT KIND OF ADDITIONAL AUTHORITY WOULD BE 12 HELPFUL IN BEING SUCCESSFUL HOWEVER FAR DOWN THE SPECTRUM 13 GOLDILOCKS GETS INTO THE PORRIDGE. 14 15 16 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I THIS WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM I APPRECIATE STAFF'S WORK ON THIS ONE. THIS 17 BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM 3B DRAFT 2024 MTC ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY 18 PROGRAM. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN. 19 20 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN MTC ABAG STAFF 21 THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM IT'S A DRAFT OF A PROPOSED 22 ADVOCACY PROGRAM WE WILL BE SEEKING YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY WE'LL 23 INTEGRATE FEEDBACK INTO WHAT WE BRING BACK TO YOU IN DECEMBER 24 WHICH WOULD BE A FINAL PROPOSED ADVOCACY PROGRAM SO YEAH 25



1	HOPING TO GETS YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY. JUST FOR THE SAKE OF TIME
1	HOFING TO GETS TOOK FEEDBACK TODAT. SOST FOR THE SAKE OF TIME
2	I WANT TO WALK THROUGH A TEN PAGE DOCUMENT THE WAY THAT THE
3	DOCUMENT IS STRUCTURED IT'S STAFF CAPACITY ITEMS WE THINK MTC
4	AND ABAG ARE GOING TO LEAD ON AND PLAY A SIGNIFICANT ROLE IN
5	SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON, D.C. IN THE STATE OF NEGOTIATIONS.
6	IT'S TRY TO PULL OUT THE FIVE CORE THINGS ON THE STATE LEVEL
7	FIRST IS AROUND TRANSPORTATION FUNDING, YOU KNOW, THE ITEM WE
8	JUST DISCUSSED THE PREVIOUS ITEM AROUND TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
9	MEASURE THERE ARE ALSO GOING TO BE CONVERSATIONS WE NEED TO BE
10	INVOLVED IN RELATED TO NEAR-TERM TRANSIT FUNDING ABOUT
11	MAINTAINING RESOURCES THAT THE STATE PROVIDED IN LAST YEAR'S
12	TRANSIT OPERATING PACKAGE THEN, TWO, YOU KNOW, INVOLVED IN ANY
13	NEGOTIATIONS OR CONVERSATIONS ABOUT POTENTIAL ADDITIONAL NEAR-
14	TERM RESOURCES THAT MIGHT BE NEEDED TO BRIDGE THE GAP BETWEEN
15	THE STATE RESOURCES RUNNING OUT AND A POTENTIAL 2026 REGIONAL
16	MEASURE SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE IN THE THICK OF THOSE
17	CONVERSATIONS THEN THE SECOND BIG ITEM I THINK WE'RE GOING TO
18	BE INVOLVED IN REALLY RELATING TO A LOT OF THE CONVERSATION IN
19	THE PREVIOUS ITEM ABOUT SUPPORTING TRANSIT SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS
20	ENHANCED COORDINATION IMPROVE RIDER EXPERIENCE AND CERTAINLY
21	TO DO THAT THROUGH THE REGIONAL MEASURE DISCUSSIONS BUT WANT
22	TO MAKE SURE WE CONTINUE TO KEEP AN EYE OUT AND SUPPORT OTHER
23	OPPORTUNITIES THAT MIGHT BE OUTSIDE OF THAT REVENUE MEASURE
24	CONVERSATION. THIRD BIG ITEM HOUSING SIDE SO THE HOUSING, SORT

OF, PRIORITIES SUPPORTING PRODUCTION PRESERVATION AND



1	PROTECTION. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DO EVERYTHING WE CAN UP IN
2	SACRAMENTO TO TEE UP THE 2024 REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN THE
3	BAY AREA FOR SUCCESS. SO THAT ITEM THAT'S GOING TO BE THE
4	BIGGEST ITEM UP TO SACRAMENTO THIS YEAR IS TWEAKS TO ASSEMBLY
5	CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT ONE WHICH PASSED LAST YEAR THAT WILL
6	LOWER THE VOTE THRESHOLD OR PUT TO THE VOTERS A QUESTION ABOUT
7	LOWERING THE VOTE THRESHOLD FOR REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE OR
8	OTHER LOCAL INFRASTRUCTURE MEASURES FROM 55% TO 2/3. THAT
9	MEASURE PASSED THROUGH LEGISLATURE QUICKLY LAST YEAR. THERE'S
10	DEFINITELY A SENSE THAT CLEAN UP MIGHT BE NEEDED TO MAKE IT
11	MORE POWERFUL TO VOTERS. WE EXPECT THAT TO BE SOMETHING WE
12	SPEND A LOT OF TIME ON THIS YEAR. I'M GOING TO JUMP DOWN FROM
13	FOUR ABOUT SUSTAINABLE AND EQUITABLE TRANSPORTATION KNOW AND
14	LAND USE, AND THIS TOUCHES ON THE MEAT AND CORE OF WHAT THESE
15	BODIES DO RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE PLANNING. WE
16	EXPECT THIS YEAR THERE ARE GOING TO BE A LOT OF CONVERSATIONS
17	ABOUT REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION REFORM. AND YOU MIGHT
18	BE THINKING WE'RE JUST FINISHED WITH OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS WHY
19	IN THE WORLD WOULD WE BE TALKING ABOUT THIS IN SACRAMENTO
20	AGAIN. AND IT'S BECAUSE THE CYCLES, IT'S BECAUSE SOUTHERN
21	CALIFORNIA CYCLE IS GEARING UP, THEY'RE IF AN EARLIER CYCLE
22	THAN US, SO FOR ANY LEGISLATION TO IMPACT THEIR UPCOMING RHNA
23	CYCLE BILLS NEED TO PASS IN 2024 SO IT'S GOING TO BE SOMETHING
24	AGAIN THAT'S DEFINITELY GOING TO COME UP AND WE HAVE TO SPEND
25	TIME MAKING SURE WE'RE ENGAGING ON THAT. THOSE ARE THE MOST



- 1 IMPORTANT ITEMS ON THE STATE LEVEL THAT I WANTED TO CALL YOUR
- 2 ATTENTION TO, THE REST OF THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM LOOKS SIMILAR
- 3 TO WHAT WE BROUGHT TO YOU LAST YEAR. THEN ON THE FEDERAL SIDE,
- 4 MAJOR CHANGE IS NOW IS ABOUT THE TIME THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO
- 5 START THINKING ABOUT FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION REAUTHORIZATION
- 6 PRIORITIES. THE CURRENT TRANSPORTATION LAW WILL EXPIRE IN 2026
- 7 IT'S ALWAYS STRATEGIC TO START COMING UP WITH OUR POLICY ASKS
- 8 AND COALITION BUILDING A COUPLE OF YEARS IN ADVANCE SO WE CAN
- 9 BE POSITIONED TO BE SUCCESSFUL IN ADVOCATING AROUND
- 10 REAUTHORIZATION. SO WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT BACK OVER TO THE
- 11 CHAIR.

12

- 13 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU GEORGIA. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM
- 14 FOUR PUBLIC COMMENT.

15

- 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THIS IS GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THE
- 17 LAST ITEM GEORGIA JUST PRESENTED.

18

19 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: GO AHEAD.

- 21 SPEAKER: ONE WAS ON THE LAST SESSIONS THAT I'M NOT SEEING HERE
- 22 UNLESS I'M READING IT INCORRECTLY IS ON SOMETHING ON
- 23 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT BUILDING ON WHAT COMMISSIONER
- 24 JOSEFOWITZ SAID IN THE PREVIOUS FUNDING CONVERSATION I'M
- 25 WONDERING IF THERE MIGHT BE ANY IDEAS THAT COULD BE BROUGHT TO



7

9

12

14

17

20

- 1 RIPENESS IN TERMS OF HAVING TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT
- 2 AND EMPLOYER SUPPORT FOR TRANSPORTATION THAT COULD HAVE A
- 3 VARIETY OF GOOD OUTCOMES IN TERMS OF GETTING CARS OFF THE ROAD
- 4 AND IMPROVING OUR ENVIRONMENT AND FUNDING PUBLIC
- 5 TRANSPORTATION IF THERE IS ANYTHING THAT COULD BE READY TO GO
- 6 THIS YEAR. THANK YOU.
- 8 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU SO MUCH.
- 10 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
- 11 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. NO ONE IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.
- 13 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: JESSE?
- 15 V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: ON THE RHNA REFORM THERE WAS HCD
- 16 PROCESS TO GET INPUT HAVE THERE BEEN ANY OUTCOMES FROM THAT?
- 18 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: A REPORT HAS NOT BEEN RELEASED YET BUT
- 19 WE EXPECT THAT TO INFORM A LOT OF THE CONVERSATION NEXT YEAR.
- 21 V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN: I SUGGEST WHEN WE GET THAT REPORT,
- 22 SCHEDULE A CONVERSATION AT ABAG ABOUT THIS. WE HAVE HAD A
- 23 COUPLE OF CONVERSATIONS SUBSEQUENT TO THE RHNA PLAN PROCESS
- 24 WHERE WE IDENTIFIED A NUMBER OF POLICY AREAS WE THINK THAT THE
- 25 STATE SHOULD CONSIDER AS THEY'RE DISCUSSING CHANGES TO THE



RHNA STATUTE, AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE AT THE 1 2 COG. 3 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. IS THERE ANY OTHER PUBLIC 4 5 COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. OH, MISS EKLUND. I'M SORRY MISS EKLUND. 6 7 PAT EKLUND: IT'S OKAY. I WAS JUST GOING TO REINFORCE PRESIDENT 8 ARREGUIN'S COMMENT ABOUT RHNA REFORM. I HAVE BEEN ON TWO OF THE THREE RHNA COMMITTEES SINCE I HAVE BEEN ELECTED AND WE 9 10 DEFINITELY NEED TO HAVE SOME MORE DISCUSSION. SO, THANK YOU. 11 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. WITH THAT IT BRINGS US TO AGENDA 12 ITEM FOUR. PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 13 14 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE WAS THE NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 15 16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO 17 18 SPEAK. 19 CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. ITEM FIVE. THE 20 21 NEXT JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MEETING IS SCHEDULED 22 TO BE HELD AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET ON FRIDAY DECEMBER 8TH, 2023. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE 23 DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WITH THAT, WE'RE ADJOURNED. 24

25

[ADJOURNED]







Broadcasting Government