

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION 1 WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 22ND, 2025, 9:35 AM 2 3 4 5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HELLO MY NAME IS NICK JOSEFOWITZ, I'M THE VICE CHAIR OF MTC. AND I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS 6 MEETING TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB 7 8 SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR 9 DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE 10 TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST 11 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE 12 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. AGENDA ITEM ONE, WILL THE CLERK 13 CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM, PLEASE? 14 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GOOD MORNING. 17 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AND BEFORE YOU DO THAT, I WOULD 18 LIKE TO WELCOME CANDACE ANDERSEN TO THE COMMISSION BEFORE WE 19 CALL THE ROLL. BEFORE YOUR NAME IS CALLED. 20 21 CANDACE ANDERSEN: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. I'M JUST 22 SITTING HER IN THE CORNER BY MYSELF BUT I FEEL LIKE IT'S GOING 23 TO FILL IN AROUND ME. THIS ISN'T LIKE THE NEW PERSON 24 INITIATION. JUST A LITTLE BIT FURTHER AWAY. 25



1 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: EVERY MEETING YOU COME TO, YOU GET 2 3 TO MOVE ONE SEAT FURTHER IN, AND THEN --4 5 CANDACE ANDERSON: I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO IT. SOMEDAY I'LL BE ONE OF YOU. THANK YOU. [LAUGHTER] 6 7 8 V. CHAIR, NECK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND YOU ALSO 9 MAYOR ASHCRAFT, IS THIS YOUR FIRST MEETING, AS WELL? 10 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: THIS IS MY SECOND MEETING. 11 12 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I MISSED THE FIRST ONE. 13 14 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: SO, I'M A LITTLE FURTHER IN. [LAUGHTER] 15 16 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WELL, THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR 17 18 JOINING. 19 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: DELIGHTED TO BE HERE. THANK YOU. 20 21 22 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ARE THERE ANY OTHER? AM I MISSING 23 ANYBODY ELSE? COMMISSIONER CANEPA HAS BEEN HERE FOR A WHILE. LET'S CALL THE ROLL. 24 25



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ALL RIGHT. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: HERE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA? MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN? EDDIE AHN: HERE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSEN? **CANDACE ANDERSEN: HERE.** CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: HERE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: HERE



```
1
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
2
3
    VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.
4
5
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?
6
7
    DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
8
9
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN? MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MILEY? IS
    PRESENT BUT STEPPED AWAY. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?
10
11
    SUE NOACK: HERE.
12
13
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
14
15
    GINA PAPAN: HERE.
16
17
18
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?
19
    DAVID RABBITT: HERE.
20
21
22
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SCHAFF? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SPERING?
23
    JAMES P. SPERING: PRESENT.
24
25
```



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER -- THAT IS ALL. WE HAVE A 1 2 QUORUM. 3 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: GREAT. SO, COMMISSIONER SPERING? I 4 5 THINK YOU DESERVE THE HONOR OF LEADING US IN THE PLEDGE OF 6 ALLEGIANCE ON THIS MEETING. 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, 9 10 AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL." 11 12 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO WE'RE GOING TO -- WE HAVE A 13 HEALTHY ITEM FOUR, BUT I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT WE GET 14 THROUGH ITEM FIVE FIRST, THE AD-HOC NOMINATING COMMITTEE 15 16 REPORT. 17 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BEFORE WE DO MR. CHAIR? 19 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YEAH? 20 21 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BEFORE WE DO, I WOULD LIKE TO DO THE 22 23 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. 24 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ALL RIGHT. 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING
THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT. THANK YOU.

8

1

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. SO, I -- AS -- I JUST 9 WANTED TO LET EVERYBODY KNOW THAT I DID NOT PUT MY NAME 10 FORWARD TO BE CHAIR OF THE COMMISSIONS. I HAVE TAKEN A NEW JOB 11 WHICH REQUIRES A FAIR AMOUNT OF TRAVEL AND IT DID NOT GIVE ME 12 -- IT WOULD NOT GIVE ME THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE HERE PRESENT 13 EVERY WEDNESDAY AND FRIDAY THAT WOULD BE NECESSARY. AND, ALSO, 14 15 TO SPEND ALL THE TIME THAT A CHAIR NEEDS TO SPEND TO REALLY, 16 SORT OF, MAKE THIS COMMISSION SUCCESSFUL, AND TO -- AND TO MAKE THIS -- TO, SORT OF, ALLOW THIS REGION TO THRIVE. IT WAS 17 NOT AN EASY DECISION. BUT, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE REALLY 18 GREAT LEADERSHIP. SO THAT IS SUPER EXCITING TO ME. SO, 19 COMMISSIONER SPERING? 20

21

22 JAMES P. SPERING: I WONDERED --

23

24 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THE NOMINATING COMMITTEE REPORT.
25

JANUARY 22, 2025

JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. THE NOMINATING 1 2 COMMITTEE MET AND THE COMMITTEE COMPOSED OF MYSELF, 3 COMMISSIONER NATE MILEY, AND COMMISSIONER LIBBY SCHAAF. WE INTERVIEWED SEVERAL APPLICANTS AND WOULD LIKE TO FORWARD TO 4 5 THE COMMISSION, AT THEIR FEBRUARY MEETING, THE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION. THE COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION IS SUE NOACK AS 6 CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION. AND FOR VICE CHAIR, STEPHANIE 7 8 MOULTON-PETERS FOR VICE CHAIR. AND BEFORE I CLOSE THE NOMINATION, IS THERE ANY OTHER NOMINATIONS OR DISCUSSION? AND 9 10 MR. CHAIRMAN, WE'LL ENTERTAIN ANY -- BEFORE I ASK TO CLOSE NOMINATIONS OR DISCUSSIONS. YES? 11

12

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU TO THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE. AND IT'S VERY 13 EXCITING. I WOULD -- I DO HOPE WE, IN THE FUTURE, WE CAN 14 REALLY BE A LITTLE MORE FORMAL IN THE STRUCTURE AND 15 16 TRANSPARENCY AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE. BECAUSE WE HAVE DONE IT 17 THIS WAY FOREVER, AND I AM VERY EXCITED ABOUT THE NEW LEADERSHIP HERE. BUT IF WE COULD, IN THE FUTURE, REALLY 18 FORMALIZE THE PROCESS AND, ALSO, THE RECOMMENDATIONS. I THINK 19 IT'S A LOT MORE TRANSPARENT, AND PEOPLE CAN REALLY UNDERSTAND 20 21 WHO PUT THEIR NAMES IN AND JUST ENCOURAGING EVERYBODY IN THEIR PARTICIPATION HERE. SO, IT'S VERY EXCITING, AND I LOOK FORWARD 22 TO THIS. BUT I DO HOPE WE CAN -- WE CAN ALWAYS BE BETTER. AND 23 I DO THINK THAT HAPPENS. [INTERRUPTION - AI UNSOLICITED 24

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1	ASSISTANCE RESPONSE] "AI: OKAY. MEDIA WILL PLAY SOFTER"
2	[LAUGHTER]
3	
4	SPEAKER: SIRI.
5	
6	GINA PAPAN: THANKS FOR THAT AGREEMENT. THAT'S AWESOME!
7	
8	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YEAH. [LAUGHTER].
9	
10	GINA PAPAN: FANTASTIC! OKAY! AND THAT'S IT. THANK YOU TO THE
11	AD-HOC COMMITTEE AND MOVING FORWARD HERE. VERY EXCITED. THANK
12	YOU.
13	
14	JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW, JUST A LITTLE BIT. YOU KNOW. WE
15	ASKED FOR NOMINATIONS. PEOPLE CONTACTED US AND GAVE US THE
16	INFORMATION. WE HAD A SERIES OF QUESTIONS THAT WE ASKED TO
17	ALL. AND SO I FELT THE PROCESS WAS TRANSPARENT AND PEOPLE KNEW
18	WHAT WE WERE DOING. I'M HONORED TO REPRESENT THE COMMITTEE AND
19	NOMINATE THESE TWO INDIVIDUALS. SO, MR. CHAIRMAN, IF THERE IS
20	NO FURTHER COMMENTS OR DISCUSSIONS, I WOULD MOVE THAT WE CLOSE
21	THE NOMINATIONS AND FORWARD THESE TWO, CHAIR?
22	
23	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YEAH.
24	
25	NATHAN MILEY: SECOND.



2 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SECOND BY COMMISSIONER MILEY, AND
3 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

4

1

5 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. I VERY MUCH SUPPORT THE NOMINATIONS AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONER SPERING FOR 6 ALL OF YOUR WORK. I DO AGREE, I THINK THAT AS AN ORGANIZATION 7 8 WHERE WE'RE BIG ENOUGH, AND I THINK I CONTINUE TO HEAR FROM FOLKS AND THE IMPORTANCE OF TRANSPARENCY. I DON'T KNOW HOW OR 9 10 KNOW WHAT WE DO TO MOVE FORWARD BUT I DO APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS. YOU KNOW, JUST 11 TO MAKE IT I THINK IT I MIGHT HAVE MISSED A MEETING OR TWO, 12 SO, I DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT THE CHANGES, I EXPECTED YOU, NICK, TO 13 BE CHAIR, BUT I TOTALLY UNDERSTAND. BUT IN MOVING FORWARD, I 14 15 WAS HOPING THAT WEEKEND FOLLOW A LITTLE BIT MORE FORMAL 16 PROCESS WHERE THERE IS A CALL FOR INTEREST, ANYONE INTERESTED COULD PUT IN A LETTER OF INTEREST, OF THEIR QUALIFICATIONS, A 17 SIMPLE LETTER. JUST TO MAKE IT MORE FORMAL AND TRAPS PARENT 18 BECAUSE TO BE FRANK I DID NOT KNOW WHAT WAS HAPPENING AND WHO 19 IS GOING TO BE NOMINATED AND I DON'T THINK THIS NEEDS TO BE A 20 SECRET OR VOTE OR ANYTHING, SO I WOULD ASK FOR A MORE FORMAL 21 PROCESS NEXT TIME AROUND. THANK YOU. 22

23

24 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENTS. MOTION
25 AND SECOND. DO WE NEED TO VOTE ON THIS?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. 3 COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE: WE NEED TO KNOW IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC 4 5 COMMENT. 6 7 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT. 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I 9 SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. MICHAEL 10 MONTGOMERY. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD 11 YOU LIKE TO GIVE? 12 13 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ONE MINUTE. 14 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MICHAEL UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. 17 18 SPEAKER: HI. I WOULD LIKE TO START MY PUBLIC COMMENT OFF WITH 19 A BIT OF AN OPEN OUESTION THAT MORE SURPRISED THAT THERE ISN'T 20 21 ANY BUSES BETWEEN HAYWARD AND SAN MATEO RIGHT NOW. 22 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT 23 YOU'RE -- THE PUBLIC COMMENT IS ABOUT THE CHAIR AND THE VICE 24



1	CHAIR NOMINATIONS. YOU WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE PUBLIC
2	COMMENT BOTHER THINGS LATER IN THE MEETING.
3	
4	SPEAKER: OKAY NO THIS IS NOT ABOUT THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR
5	THEN.
6	
7	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR
8	PARTICIPATING. AND IF I WILL HOLD ON THERE WILL BE A MOMENT
9	FOR YOU TO DO THAT. IS THERE ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I SEE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENT.
12	
13	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: LET'S TAKE A VOTE.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ.
16	
17	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
20	
21	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
24	
25	EDDIE AHN: AYE.



JANUARY 22, 2025

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON? CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EZZY ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN? **REBECCA KAPLAN: YES.** CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? 1 2 3 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK? 6 7 SUE NOACK: YES. 8 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? 10 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING? 13 14 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 17 18 PRESENT. [APPLAUSE] 19 JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN -- CONGRATULATIONS, AND I THINK 20 WE HAVE GOOD LEADERSHIP. I WANT TO TELL OUR COMMISSIONERS ON 21 THE END THAT 38 YEARS AGO, I WAS ON THE END, AND IT TOOK 38 22 YEARS TO GET THERE. [LAUGHTER] SO, WORK HARD AND YOU WILL END 23 UP HERE. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. [LAUGHTER] 24 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I THINK WE HAVE REALLY TOP NOTCH 1 LEADERSHIP SECURED FOR THE FUTURE OF THIS ORGANIZATION, SO 2 3 THAT IS EXCITING. AND WE GO FROM THE FUTURE TO THE PAST, NO? I DON'T KNOW. TO THE NEXT TIME. GOING BACK TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, 4 5 AND WE'RE GOING TO START WITH MTC RESOLUTION 4690, APPRECIATION TO SENATOR BILL DODD, FORMER STATE SENATOR, STATE 6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER, NAPA COUNTY SUPERVISOR, MTC COMMISSIONER AND 7 8 COMMISSION CHAIR. 9

10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M SORRY TO INTERRUPT YOU. I DON'T 11 BELIEVE SENATOR DODD HAS ARRIVED. SO, MAYBE WE CAN STEP TO 12 NEXT --

13

ANDREW FREMIER: WE GOT A NOTE. HE'S STUCK IN TRAFFIC ON THE
BAY BRIDGE [LAUGHTER] I WOULD LIKE TO SAY THAT PART OF THE
REASON THERE WAS A TRAFFIC DELAY IS THERE WAS SOMEBODY WALKING
AROUND ON THE BAY BRIDGE AND THAT TENDS TO CAUSE PROBLEMS.
IT'S NOT DOING GOOD THINGS.

19

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. THEN, AGENDA ITEM 4B
RESOLUTION APPRECIATION FOR COMMISSIONER DAVID RABBITT ON HIS
OCCASION OF DEPARTURE. DAVID RABBIT. I HAVE LIKE THREE
SECONDS. I WANT TO SHARE A BIT OF THE RESOLUTION ON THE
CONSIDERATION. WHEREAS SONOMA COUNTY SUPERVISOR DAVID RABBIT
IS STEPPING DOWN FROM MTC OFFICE AFTER SIX YEARS OF COMMITTED

JANUARY 22, 2025

SERVICE REPRESENTING THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS. 1 AND WHEREAS DAVID WAS MAJOR CONTRIBUTOR TO THE DEVELOPMENT AND 2 3 THE 2013 ADOPTION BY BOTH MTC AND ABAG THE ORIGINAL PLANNED BAY AREA AS WELL AS SUCCESSIVE ITERATIONS. AND DURING HIS TIME 4 5 AS VICE PRESIDENT OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD PLAYED ROLE IN CONSOLIDATION OF MTC AND ABAG STAFF. AND WHEREAS IN HIS DUAL 6 ROLE AS COMMISSIONER AND MEMBER OF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE 7 8 DISTRICT BOARD OF DIRECTORS DAVID HELPED DELIVER LONG LASTING SUICIDE DETERRENT AT GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, A LANDMARK 9 TRANSPORTATION SAFETY PROJECT, IT WAS A LONG TIME PRIORITY FOR 10 BOTH AGENCIES AND ONE THAT HAS SAVED LIVES AND WILL SPARE THE 11 AIR COUNTLESS FAMILIES FROM THE HEARTBREAK OF SUICIDE IN THE 12 YEARS AHEAD. AND WHEREAS DAVID LONG TIME SERVICE AS A MEMBER 13 OF THE SMART BOARD OF DIRECTORS SERVICE THROUGH SYSTEM 14 CONSTRUCTION AND TESTING REFINEMENT SINCE THE 2017 OPENING OF 15 16 THE INITIAL OPERATING SEGMENT BETWEEN SANTA ROSA AND SAN RAFAEL 2019 COMPLETION OF TWO MILE LONG EXTENSION TO LARKSPUR 17 AND THIS MONTH'S GRAND OPENING OF THE PETALUMA STATION, AND 18 NAVIGATION OF CHARGES CREATED BY THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND 19 ONGOING WORK TO EXTEND THE SYSTEM OF THE NORTH OF SONOMA 20 21 COUNTY AIRPORT STATION TO WINDSOR AND BEYOND. NOW THEREFORE THE COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF OF MTC THANK DAVID FOR OUTSTANDING 22 WORK TO THE BAY AREA AND COMMEND HIS EFFORTS TO FIND CREATIVE 23 SOLUTIONS TO REGIONAL CHALLENGES AND LOOK FORWARD TO MANY MORE 24 YEARS OF COLLABORATION AS HE CONTINUES HIS SERVICE AS A SONOMA 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

COUNTY SUPERVISOR, AS A MEMBER OF THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD,
 AND AS A DIRECTOR OF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HIGHWAY AND
 TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT, THE SONOMA-MARIN AREA RAIL TRANSIT
 DISTRICT, THE SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY -- LET IT
 BE KNOWN THERE ARE NOT ENOUGH TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THIS BAY
 AREA AND OTHER PARTNER AGENCIES. [LAUGHTER] COMMISSIONER
 RABBITT? THANK YOU.

8

DAVID RABBITT: THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE 9 THAT. AND I CAN'T SAY THAT I'M -- I WISH I COULD STAY. BUT I -10 - YOU KNOW, ORIGINALLY I DID WHATEVER EVERY OTHER ABAG 11 PRESIDENT HAD DONE FOR, I GUESS, MANY YEARS WAS TO APPOINT 12 THEM SELF R THEMSELVES TO THIS POSITION AS LIAISON TO MTC. I 13 GOT TO STAY A LITTLE LONGER BECAUSE OF A CAP ON THE NUMBER OF 14 COMMISSIONERS FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY WHEN THE MAYORS WERE ADDED 15 16 WAY BACK WHEN, AND OUR NEW SENATOR ARREGUIN WAS FROM ALAMEDA 17 COUNTY SO THAT MEANT I STAYED IN THIS SEAT. SO, I WAS HAPPY ABOUT THAT. BUT I JUST WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO MY COLLEAGUES. 18 IT'S BEEN WONDERFUL SERVING ON THIS COMMISSION. IT'S GREAT TO 19 GET NEW FRIENDS AND HAVE THE ACOUAINTANCES THAT WE HAVE HAD 20 21 OVER THE YEARS. EXCELLENT CHOICE ON OUR NEW LEADERSHIP GOING FORWARD. I WANT TO SAY CONGRATULATIONS TO YOU BUT REALLY IT'S 22 CONGRATULATIONS TO US FOR HAVING GREAT LEADERSHIP GOING 23 FORWARD. AND TO THE -- AS AN ARCHITECT AS SOMEONE THAT FIRST 24 25 GENERATION, BECAUSE I WE'RE MY DAD'S ROWING PIN AS I TOLD

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 22, 2025

NICK, I THINK IT'S REALLY ABOUT MAKING SURE WE IMPROVE THE 1 OUALITY OF LIFE OF ALL OF OUR CONSTITUENTS EACH AND EVERY DAY 2 3 AND I THINK IT'S ALSO ABOUT BUILDING FOR THE FUTURE AND INVESTING IN THE INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDED. THAT'S WHY I TEND TO 4 5 BE ONE THAT LIKES THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS. THE INFRASTRUCTURE TYPES OF PROJECTS STARTING WITH HIGHWAY 101 WIDENING WHICH HAS 6 BEEN OVER THE YEARS NEAR AND DEAR TO ME AS I HEAR FROM MY WIFE 7 8 EVERY NIGHT SHE CAME HOME FROM COMMUTING FROM SAN FRANCISCO WE'LL SEE THAT COMPLETE IN THE MARIN SONOMA NARROWS, STARTING 9 SMART WAS A TREMENDOUS OPPORTUNITY. AND AN EXCITING ADVENTURE 10 TO BUILD A BRAND-NEW TRANSIT COUNTY TRANSIT SYSTEM AND TO SEE 11 SUCCESS GOING FORWARD AND TO SEE THE EXCEPTIONS WE HAVE BEEN 12 ABLE TO PUT FORWARD INCLUDING THE 500 PEOPLE THAT SHOWED UP 13 FOR THE PETALUMA NORTH GRAND OPENING STATION WHICH WAS REALLY 14 15 A GREAT EVENT. THEN THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE WHICH I SHARE WITH STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS, JUST TO BE, YOU KNOW, PART OF AN 16 ICONIC BRIDGE PROTECTING, ICONIC WORLD-RENOWNED BRIDGE. ALL MY 17 RELATIVES IN IRELAND COULDN'T CARE LESS THAT I'M A SUPERVISOR 18 THEY LOVE THAT I'M A GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DIRECTOR. BUT THE 19 CHANGES WE HAVE MADE AT GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE IS REALLY 20 21 INSTRUMENTAL. BECAUSE WHEN I WORKED IN SAUSALITO YOU HEAR THE SIRENS EVERY AFTERNOON WHEN AN, OCCURRED THOSE DON'T HAPPEN 22 ANYMORE. MADE GREAT STRIDES THERE AND ON THE TRANSPORTATION 23 SIDE, THE LOCAL ROADS, I WAS TELLING MY COLLEAGUES NO ONE GOT 24 VOTED OUT OF OFFICE FOR PAVING A ROAD. FOR THE LAST TEN YEARS 25

IN SONOMA COUNTY, WHEN I STARTED WE WERE SPENDING \$2 MILLION A 1 YEAR ON PAVING WE HAVE 130068.89 MILES OF ROADS WE TAKE CARE 2 3 OF A SINGLE ROAD FROM HERE TO OKLAHOMA CITY IT'S A LOT OF ROADS SPENDING \$2 MILLION TODAY WE'RE SPENDING 10 TO 20 TIMES 4 5 AS MUCH AND OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS WE HAVE PAVED 560 MILES OF ROADS SOMETHING I'M PROUD OF AND WE NEED TO KEEP GOING FORWARD 6 BASIC CORE OF GOVERNMENT THINGS I THINK ARE SO IMPORTANT FOR 7 8 FOLKS. BUT THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SAY A FEW WORDS BUT THANK YOU REALLY FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SERVE ON THIS 9 COMMISSION. MOST OF ALL THANK YOU TO THE STAFF WHO KEEPS 10 TOGETHER THE WILEY BUNCH. IT'S THE REGION VERSUS THE 11 INDIVIDUAL HATS WE ALL WEAR. I KNOW IT'S ALWAYS A CHALLENGE. 12 AND THE BALANCING OF THE TWO. BUT SOMEHOW YOU ALWAYS MANAGE TO 13 DO IT REALLY WELL, AND I REALLY DO SALUTE YOU AND THINK 14 15 NOTHING BUT THE BEST OF ALL THE WORK THAT GOES ON HERE. SO, 16 THANK YOU TO EVERYONE. [APPLAUSE]

17

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

18 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: DO I HAVE -- WOULD ANYBODY LIKE TO
19 -- OKAY.

20

JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW, DAVID, I PERSONALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR SUPPORT ON THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES. YOU'RE ONE COMMISSIONER THAT FOUND THAT BALANCE WITH DEALING WITH REGIONAL ISSUES AND THE UNIQUE CHALLENGES THAT THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES HAD. AND OUT OF ALL THE COMMISSIONERS YOU HAVE BEEN

JANUARY 22, 2025

VERY ARTICULATE. YOU HAVE A WAY OF FOCUSING ON THE VERY ISSUE
 BEFORE US. AND THE WHAT SOME OF THE CHALLENGES ARE WITH THOSE
 DECISIONS WE'RE MAKING. I WANT TO PERSONALLY THANK YOU. YOU
 HAVE BEEN A GOOD FRIEND AND A GREAT FRIEND OF THE NORTH BAY
 COUNTIES.

6

7 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER NOACK?

8

SUE NOACK: I WANT TO THANK DAVID FOR BEING CO-CHAIR OF THE 9 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. DAVE AND I HAD TO START OUT AS 10 11 CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THAT COMMITTEE. IT'S BEEN GREAT GETTING TO KNOW YOU THROUGH THAT AND GETTING THAT KICK-12 STARTED. AND I JUST WANT TO SAY, IF ANYBODY WANTS TO SAY 13 PERFECTLY WRITTEN NOTES, YOU NEED TO SIT NEXT TO DAVID. 14 15 [LAUGHTER] I HAVE NEVER SEEN SUCH METICULOUS WELL-WRITTEN 16 NOTES IN MY LIFE. I JUST -- I DON'T EVEN TRY. I JUST WATCH HIM. BUT THANK YOU SO MUCH. 17

18

19 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YOU SAID WHAT I WAS GOING TO SAY.
20 [LAUGHTER] I KNOW. I HAVE HAD THE PLEASURE OF SITTING NEXT TO
21 COMMISSIONER RABBITT MANY MEETINGS. I HAVE REALLY ENJOYED IT.
22 AND WE HAVEN'T ALWAYS AGREED, BUT I HAVE ALWAYS ADMIRED YOUR
23 HANDWRITING. [LAUGHTER]



DAVID RABBITT: -- ALL YOUR COLLEAGUES -- [INDISCERNIBLE]. 1 2 [LAUGHTER] 3 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WELL. COMMISSIONER FLEMING? 4 5 VICTORIA FLEMING: I THINK WHAT WAS SAID ABOUT COMMISSIONER 6 RABBITT STRIKING THE BALANCE BETWEEN DIFFERENT BODIES THAT HE 7 8 SITS ON AND REALLY BEING ABLE TO ACT IN THE INTEREST OF VARIOUS CONSTITUENCIES IS REALLY SPOT ON. AND I GET TO SERVE 9 WITH DAVID ON OUR LOCAL HOUSING FUND WHICH SERVES MY 10 JURISDICTION IN SANTA ROSA. AND HE'S FROM PETALUMA, DOESN'T 11 BENEFIT PERSONALLY FROM ANY OF IT AND HE BRINGS HIS EXPERTISE 12 AND HISTORY AS AN ARCHITECT AND ALL HIS INTELLECT AND 13 EXPERIENCE TO BEAR FOR THE BENEFIT OF MY CITY IN SONOMA 14 15 COUNTY. YOU KNOW, DAVID RABBITT'S COMMITMENT TO NOT ONLY HIS 16 OWN LITTLE PATCH BUT BEYOND THE REGION I THINK IS REALLY WHAT SERVES US WELL HERE AT MTC. 17 18 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER ANDERSON? 19 20 CANDACE ANDERSON: I HAD THE PRIVILEGE OF SERVING WITH DAVID ON 21 ABAG. IF I WERE TO SUMMARIZE WHAT I THOUGHT OF YOU, IT WAS 22 ALWAYS A VOICE OF REASON. YES, YOU REPRESENT THE NORTH BAY, 23 BUT YOU HAVE THE INTEREST OF THE ENTIRE GREATER BAY AREA IN 24 THE WAY YOU APPROACH ISSUES, THE WAY YOU RAN MEETINGS. AND I 25



REALLY WILL MISS YOUR LEADERSHIP IN ALL OF THESE REGIONAL 1 2 BODIES. SO, THANK YOU, DAVID. 3 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: ONE MORE? 4 5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SORRY. YES? SORRY. COMMISSIONER 6 7 MOULTON-PETERS. 8 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: I WANT TO CHIME IN TOO. DAVID YOU 9 HAVE BEEN A GREAT PARTNER WE FIRST MET ON SMART 10 -- 12, I 10 DON'T KNOW HOW MANY YEARS AGO, AND THEN HAVE GONE ON TO SERVE 11 THIS BOARD AND GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT. SO, I CAN ATTEST YOU KNOW 12 HOW TO CHANGE HATS AND TAKE A DIFFERENT POINT OF VIEW AND 13 ARTICULATE WHAT'S NEEDED AT THE RIGHT TIME AND PLACE. THANK 14 YOU FOR YOUR PARTNERSHIP. YOU'RE NOT GOING FAR AWAY THOUGH. SO 15 16 WE'RE GOING TO KEEP IN TOUCH. [LAUGHTER] 17 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: DO -- SORRY, COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT? 18 19 MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT: OH. YOU KNOW WHAT? I HADN'T TURNED MY 20 21 MICROPHONE OFF. I HAVE MET COMMISSIONER RABBITT OVER THE YEARS

22 AND I LOVE HEARING THESE STORIES ABOUT YOU AND I WISH ALL THE 23 BEST AND NEXT.

24



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A 1 2 SECOND? COMMISSIONER SPERING MOVES IT. 3 GINA PAPAN: I'LL SECOND. 4 5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: PAPAN SECONDS IT. IS THERE ANY 6 7 PUBLIC COMMENT. 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR 9 THIS ITEM AND I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE 10 11 TO SPEAK. 12 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: GO AHEAD. 13 14 15 SPEAKER: YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. 16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU AND GOOD MORNING, VICE CHAIR NICK 17 JOSEFOWITZ AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND 18 HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I NEED MY CLOCK HERE. I'M VERY GRATEFUL. 19 I JUST THINK ABOUT THE MANY TIMES THAT DAVE HAS WELCOMED ME 20 21 INTO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETINGS AND 22 GETTING TO HEAR ALL OF YOU SPEAK ABOUT THAT. IT'S ABOUT SEVEN 23 YEARS AGO I GOT TO USE SMART FOR THE FIRST TIME. I ACTUALLY RODE IT TO PETALUMA AND TOOK THE CITY BUS TO GO TO A SMART 24 MEETING. I DON'T REMEMBER IF YOU WERE THERE. I WAS THERE. AND 25



1	I REALLY ENJOYED SMART. BUT THIS IS A REALLY GREAT RAILWAY.
2	SO, DAVE, I'M GOING TO MISS YA. BUT, THANK YOU, MOST OF ALL,
3	FOR YOUR HOSPITALITY. I WISH YOU WELL.
4	
5	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS FOR
8	THIS ITEM.
9	
10	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: GREAT. SO LET'S DO A ROLL CALL VOTE
11	AND THEN WE'LL TAKE THE PHOTO.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT.
14	
15	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WE CAN'T LEAVE THE COMMISSION
16	WITHOUT A PHOTO.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?
19	
20	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSION ARE ABE-KOGA?
23	
24	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
25	



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN? EDDIE AHN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON? CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN? **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS?



1 2 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: AYE. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 4 5 6 GINA PAPAN: YES. 7 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? 9 10 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 12 PRESENT. 13 14 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. SHOULD WE TAKE A PHOTO? OKAY. 15 16 MOVING ON TO RESOLUTION 4692 IN HONOR OF COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING WHO IS RETIRING -- OH. HE WAS HIDING. HE DOESN'T 17 USUALLY HIDE. OKAY. BUT WE'RE GOING DO YOU FIRST. WE HAVE GOT 18 TO STAY FOR COMMISSIONER SPERING. OKAY? THAT'S THE RULE. THAT 19 IS TRUE. OKAY. RESOLUTION 4690 IS APPRECIATION OF FORMER STATE 20 SENATOR ASSEMBLYMEMBER NAPA COUNTY SUPERVISOR MTC COMMISSIONER 21 22 AND COMMISSION CHAIR BILL DODD. THERE IS -- IT IS -- AS IS 23 CUSTOMARY IN CASES WHERE THE DEPTH OF THIS COMMISSION'S APPRECIATION IS SO VAST AND ACCOLADES CITED SO NUMEROUS I WILL 24 SAVE ALL OF YOU FROM HAVING TO LISTEN TO ME READ THE ENTIRE 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

RESOLUTION. BUT IT'S IMPORTANT SOME OF THESE WORDS BE READ 1 INTO THE PUBLIC RECORD. SO HERE WE GO. WHEREAS DURING HIS 14 2 3 YEARS ON THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS WHICH INCLUDED WINNING REELECTION WITHOUT OPPOSITION, THREE STRAIGHT TIMES, SENATOR 4 5 DODD ALSO REPRESENTED NAPA COUNTY AND ITS FIVE CITIES ON MTC AND SERVED WITH DISTINCTION AS CHAIR FROM 2007 TO 2009 AND 6 WHEREAS SENATOR DODD DURING HIS TIME IN THE STATE LEGISLATURE 7 8 ESTABLISHED HIMSELF AS ONE OF THE MOST PROLIFIC LAW MAKERS IN SACRAMENTO AUTHORING 100 BILLS WHILE SERVING AS CHAIR OF THE 9 SENATE GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATION COMMITTEE AND CO-CHAIRING THE 10 SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE ON CALIFORNIA'S WINE INDUSTRY. AND 11 WHEREAS WHILE SERVING AS COMMISSION CHAIR CATALYZED 12 DEVELOPMENT OF THE MOU BETWEEN MTC, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE AND 13 HIGHWAY TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT AND THE SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY 14 15 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY TO FINANCE THE REPLACEMENT OF THE 16 AGEING AND SEISMICALLY VULNERABLE DOYLE DRIVE WITH THE NEW PRESIDIO PARKWAY, AND MAY I ADD CREATED THE MOST BEAUTIFUL 17 PARK, I THINK MAYBE, IN THIS COUNTRY WITH A FABULOUS 18 19 PLAYGROUND. WHILE SENATOR DODD DURING YEARS ON THE COMMISSION ON SPEARHEADED CREATION OF A PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN MTC AND 20 21 METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATIONS IN THE SACRAMENTO REGION AND THE SAN JOAQUIN VANE TO MOUNT A SUCCESSFUL CAMPAIGN FOR 22 GOODS MOVEMENT PROJECTS TO INCLUDE IN THE 2006 PROPOSITION ONE 23 D BOND PROGRAM THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT STAFF AND 24 COMMISSIONERS MTC THANK SENATOR DODD FOR MANY YEARS OF SERVICE 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

TO THE PEOPLE OF NAPA COUNTY OF BAY AREA AND STATE OF 1 CALIFORNIA CELEBRATE THE GENEROUS SPIRIT OF BON AMI -- WHO 2 3 WROTE THAT? -- OF WHICH HE PURSUES PUBLIC LIFE, SAVORS HIGH STANDARDS OF -- WHAT IS THIS WORD? [LAUGHTER] SAVOR THE HIGH 4 5 STANDARDS OF SOMETHING TO DO WITH WINE OUALITY HE ESTABLISHED MTC FESTIVITIES, WHICH STARTS WITH AN O AND E, AND I THINK 6 ONLY PEOPLE IN NAPA CAN PRONOUNCE IT ANYWAY. AND GIFT GIVING 7 8 THROUGH HIS ENERGETIC SUPPORT FOR LOCAL AGGREGATE CULTURE AND EXTEND BEST WISHES TO HIM, HIS WIFE MARY, THEIR EXTENDED 9 10 FAMILY FOR MORE GOOD FOOD, GOOD WINE, AND GOOD HEALTH FOR YEARS TO COME. SENATOR DODD, WE ARE DELIGHTED AND HONORED THAT 11 YOU HAVE CHOSEN TO BE HERE THIS MORNING FOR THIS APPRECIATION, 12 AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, ARE THERE ANY COMIT -- UNLESS WE 13 CLAP NOW? LET'S CLAP NOW. SENATOR DODD WILL HAVE TWO ROUNDS OF 14 15 CLAPPING. [APPLAUSE] SENATOR DODD, PLEASE, THE MICROPHONE IS 16 YOURS.

17

BILL DODD: OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS, THIS IS HOPEFULLY THE LAST 18 ONE BECAUSE THIS IS THE ONE I REALLY WANT TO REMEMBER, FOR MY 19 14 YEARS ON MTC, WAS AMAZING 14 YEARS JUST THE ORGANIZATION 20 21 AND PEOPLE BRINGING TOGETHER THE REGION ON SO MANY IMPORTANT PROJECTS THAT WE HAD DURING THOSE TIMES, AS YOU ALL HAVE DONE 22 IN SUBSEQUENT YEARS, EXCEPT FOR, YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER 23 SPERING WHO HAS PROBABLY OUTLASTED THE LAST FINAL NAPA 24 25 COMMISSIONERS, NO MATTER HOW LONG WE HAVE DECIDED TO SERVE.

JANUARY 22, 2025

BUT, NEVERTHELESS, I ALSO WANTED TO TIP MY HAT TO ONE OF THE 1 REASONS I TRULY BELIEVE THAT I WAS SUCCESSFUL DURING MY TERM 2 ON MTC OVER 14 YEARS, AND MY TWO YEARS AS CHAIR, AND, ALSO, 3 WHY WE GOT SO MANY THINGS DONE IS THE HIGH CALIBER OF PEOPLE 4 5 THAT WE HIRE AT MTC. DURING MY TENURE, AFTER MY TENURE, WHICH YOU HAVE ALL DONE, AND IT SEEMS THAT IS A BEACON OF 6 CONSISTENCY WITH THIS ORGANIZATION THAT I REALLY, TRULY, 7 8 APPRECIATE, AND THANK YOU VERY, VERY MUCH. SO THANKS. HATS OFF TO STAFF FOR THE WONDERFUL JOB THAT YOU DO. AND YOU KNOW I 9 COULDN'T DO THIS WITHOUT TOOTING THE HORN OF MY OWN DAUGHTER 10 WHO IS ALSO A MEMBER OF THIS GREAT STAFF AS WELL. WE'LL LET IT 11 GO AT THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH IT'S AN HONOR TO BE HERE AND 12 RECOGNIZED BY SO MANY WONDERFUL PEOPLE IN THIS ROOM AND THANKS 13 FOR THE HARD WORK THAT YOU DO FOR THE REGION AND THAT YOU DO 14 15 FOR YOUR INDIVIDUAL ORGANIZATIONS THAT YOU REPRESENT. 16 APPRECIATE IT. [APPLAUSE]

17

JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW, I DON'T THINK ANYBODY COULD ASK 18 FOR A BETTER FRIEND THAN BILL DODD. YOU KNOW, MOST OF THE 19 YEARS THAT YOU SERVED ON THE COMMISSION, I SAT NEXT TO BILL 20 21 AND I STRUGGLED THROUGH A LOT OF CHALLENGES. AND YOU KNOW, IT -- YOU NEVER LOST SIGHT OF THE PEOPLE WE WERE SERVING CLIPPER 22 IS A GOOD EXAMPLE ALL THE PRESSURE WE HAD NOT MOVING FORWARD 23 WITH THAT SPENDING HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS YOU STOOD 24 TALL AND I DON'T KNOW OF A SINGLE THING MTC HAS DONE TO MAKE 25



THE SYSTEM SEAMLESS AND CLIPPER A LOT OF THAT IS THROUGH YOUR 1 LEADERSHIP AND THIS BUILDING WE'RE SITTING IN BILL YOU HAD A 2 3 LOT TO DO WITH THAT. THE LIST GOES ON, AND YOU KNOW FOR ME PERSONALLY, JUST AN ABSOLUTE FRIEND THAT YOU PRAY FOR, YOU ARE 4 5 ONE OF THOSE INDIVIDUALS. SOMEONE I HAVE TREMENDOUS RESPECT FOR. I SAW YOU MOVE FROM SUPERVISOR TO THE ASSEMBLY AND 6 SENATE, AND TO SEE THAT GROWTH IN YOU AS A POLITICIAN AND YOU 7 8 NEVER LOST SITE OF THE PEOPLE YOU SERVED. BILL, I JUST WANT TO PERSONALLY THANK YOU. GREAT WORK HERE AT THE COMMISSION AND 9 SOMETHING YOU SHOULD BE VERY PROUD OF. 10

11

12 SPEAKER: THANK YOU, JIM.

13

14 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

15

16 DAVID RABBITT: BILL I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR FRIENDSHIP IT'S GREAT TO HAVE A FRIEND WHO IS ALSO A SENATOR ESPECIALLY 17 WHEN YOU'RE A COUNTY SUPERVISOR. WE HAVE BEEN SO FORTUNATE TO 18 HAVE YOU HERE AT MTC OBVIOUSLY DOING THE GOOD WORK BUT ALSO 19 CONTINUING THAT GOOD WORK IN SACRAMENTO. THANK YOU FOR ALL 20 THOSE TIMES AND THANK YOU FOR THE FRIENDSHIP AND THE TITLE 21 HAVE CONVERSATION THAT WOULD GET RIGHT TO THE HEART OF THE 22 MATTER HOW WE MOVE FORWARD AS MY COLLEAGUE SAID FOR THE 23 BETTERMENT OF ALL OF OUR CONSTITUENTS, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR 24



THAT I APPRECIATE THAT AND LOOK FORWARD TO OUR CONTINUING 1 2 FRIENDSHIP. 3 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER NOACK? 4 5 SUE NOACK: I WANT TO ADD A COUPLE OF WORDS. I GOT TO KNOW 6 BILL, JIM AND I WERE TALKING ABOUT PEOPLE YOU SERVE, PLANET 7 8 HILL WAS THE MOST SOUTHERNMOST TIP OF BILL'S AREA. IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY WHICH ONLY HAD A SMALL PART OF BUT YOU STILL TOOK 9 THE TIME TO GET TO KNOW US AND KNOW ME WHICH I APPRECIATE AND 10 WHEN PEOPLE TALK ABOUT YOU REALLY FOCUS ON THE PEOPLE YOU 11 SERVE THAT TO ME IS GREAT INDICATION OF HOW WELL YOU FOCUSED 12 ON THE PEOPLE YOU SERVED SO I APPRECIATE GETTING TO KNOW YOU 13 AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE. 14 15 16 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? 17 LIBBY SCHAFF: SENATOR DODD'S ACCOMPLISHMENTS AS, YOU KNOW, A 18 LIFTING GENIUS, A GIANT, AS KIND OF A POLICY MAKER IS WELL-19 KNOWN, AND I ALSO WANT TO JUST TAP ON THE OUALITY THAT YOU 20 21 HAVE BROUGHT TO PUBLIC SERVICE. MY DAD WAS ONE OF BILL DODD'S CONSTITUENTS. HE SPENT HIS LIFE AS A MEMBER OF THE OTHER 22 POLITICAL PARTY, AND I KNEW I WAS MAKING SOME PROGRESS WITH 23 HIS THINKING WHEN HE SAID, YOU KNOW, THAT BILL DODD GUY, HE'S 24

A DEMOCRAT, BUT I REALLY LIKE HIM. AND YOU NEVER LOST THAT

JANUARY 22, 2025

CONNECTEDNESS WITH THE PEOPLE YOU SERVED. AND IT'S REALLY YOUR 1 CALLING CARD. IT'S SOMETHING THAT, I THINK ALL OF US IN THIS 2 3 MOMENT OF POLITICAL UNCERTAINTY, NATIONALLY, HAVE TO RECOMMIT OURSELVES TO, WHICH IS HAVING TRUST ACROSS DIFFERENCES, BEING 4 5 THAT HUMAN CONNECTION BETWEEN GOVERNMENT AND THE PEOPLE. AND ONE OF MY PROUDEST ACCOMPLISHMENTS IS ACTUALLY THE LAST THING 6 MY DAD LEFT -- SO I'M THINKING OF HIM TODAY -- ONE OF MY LAST 7 8 ACCOMPLISHMENTS IS MY DAD DID ACTUALLY PASS AWAY AS A DEMOCRAT. [LAUGHTER] I THINK THAT WAS YOUR DOING. SO JUST ON A 9 VERY PERSONAL LEVEL, THE WAY THAT YOU CONNECTED WITH YOUR 10 CONSTITUENTS CANNOT BE UNDERSCORED AND IS AN INSPIRATION TO 11 ALL OF US. THANK YOU. 12

13

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AND, YOU KNOW, WE -- WE -- I KIND 14 15 OF CAME TO THE COMMISSION A LITTLE BIT AFTER YOU HAD LEFT, 16 AND, BUT -- AND I -- WE DIDN'T GET AN OPPORTUNITY TO WORK THAT CLOSELY E BECAUSE WHENEVER ANYBODY WOULD TALKED TO SENATOR 17 DODD IT WAS ALWAYS, LIKE, JIM WHO WOULD GET THE PLEASURE OF 18 DOING THAT. BUT I REMEMBER THE FIRST TIME I WENT TO NAPA, ON 19 HOLIDAY THE SIZE OF YOUR CAMPAIGN SIGNS WERE OUT OF CONTROL 20 21 [LAUGHTER] AND THE CITY WE JUST DON'T HAVE IT LIKE WE DON'T HAVE THE BIG CAMPAIGN SIGNS. I WILL ALWAYS REMEMBER THE SIZE 22 OF YOUR CAMPAIGN SIGNS, APPRECIATION FOR ALL YOU HAVE DONE FOR 23 THIS COMMISSION AND FOR THE REGION AND THE STATE. THANK YOU 24 25 VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

JANUARY 22, 2025

GINA PAPAN: SENATOR DODD, SPEAKING OF FATHERS, YOUR 2 3 REPRESENTATION IN SACRAMENTO, I KNOW WHEN MY FATHER WAS THERE, REALLY PRECEDES YOU. THE CHARACTERISTIC WHICH HAD YOU 4 5 LEGISLATED, YOUR ABILITY TO WORK WITH SO MANY PEOPLE AS MY DAD SAID PARTICULARLY IN THIS ASSEMBLY YOU GOT TO WORK WITH SO 6 MANY TO GET SOMETHING PASSED YOU WERE AN ARTIST AT THAT AND 7 8 AGAIN PEOPLE NEED TO LEARN FROM YOU WHAT WE'RE ABLE TO DO YOUR ACCOMPLISHMENTS ARE AMAZING THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL YOU 9 HAVE DONE YOU LEFT BEHIND THE WAY TO WORK WITH OTHERS ACROSS 10 PARTY LINES TO GET THINGS DONE YOU DID THAT. IT'S AMAZING 11 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR SHARING THAT WITH ALL OF US YOUR 12 EXPERIENCE HERE FROM SUPERVISOR, MTC, FROM THE ASSEMBLY TO THE 13 SENATOR. IT'S ALL REALLY WONDERFUL. SO, THANK YOU ON BEHALF OF 14 15 EVERYONE HERE IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

16

17 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SUPERVISOR?

18

19 SPEAKER: BILL, YOU WILL BE MISSED IN MANY ROLES YOU HAVE HAD.
20 WHEN I BECAME A COUNTY SUPERVISOR 12-AND-A-HALF YEARS AGO,
21 THAT'S WHEN I GOT TO KNOW YOU WHEN YOU WERE MAKING CAREER
22 CHARGES FROM SUPERVISOR TO ASSEMBLY ON TO SENATE WHAT I
23 ADMIRED BUT IS YOU'RE REALLY TO ME AN EPITOME AS A PUBLIC
24 SERVANT AREN'T FULL OF YOURSELF YOU'RE FULL OF THE PEOPLE
25 YOU'RE THERE TO SERVE INDIVIDUALS YOU'RE HELPING PEOPLE WHEN

JANUARY 22, 2025

YOU'RE RAISING MONEY IT'S NOT JUST FOR CAMPAIGN IT'S TO GIVE 1 BACK TO THE COMMUNITY SO I WILL MISS YOUR PUBLIC SERVICE BUT I 2 3 KNOW YOU'RE STILL GOING TO BE OUT THERE DOING A LOT OF AMAZING THINGS FOR OUR GREATER COMMUNITY. THANK YOU. 4 5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: DO I HAVE A MOTION. 6 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: HONORED TO MOVE THIS RESOLUTION. 9 SUE NOACK: SECOND. 10 11 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: MOTION AND SECOND. COMMISSION ARE 12 RABBITT. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT? 13 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING I SEE 15 16 NO ONE ONLINE WANTING TO SPEAK. IN THE ROOM NOT RECEIVED ANY SPEAKER CARDS. HOWEVER I DO KNOW THERE IS A GEORGIA IN THE 17 HOUSE THAT WOULD LIKE TO HAVE COMMENT. 18 19 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: [LAUGHTER] DO WE ALLOW FAMILY TO 20 21 GIVE PUBLIC COMMENT? 22 23 GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN: HI. I'M GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, I HAVE NOT BEEN NERVOUS TO SPEAK IN PUBLIC IN A VERY LONG TIME. BUT 24 I'M NERVOUS TODAY. I WANT TO SAY I THINK A LOT OF FOLKS UP 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

HERE HAVE ALREADY SAID, YOU ARE AN EXAMPLE OF PUBLIC SERVICE. 1 YOU KEEP PEOPLE AND IMPROVING LIVES FOR PEOPLE AT THE HEART OF 2 3 WHAT YOU DO, AND I THINK IT'S REALLY BEAUTIFUL THAT EVERYBODY UP HERE HAS SHARED THAT THAT'S THEIR IMPRESSION OF YOU, AND I 4 5 CAN TELL YOU AT HOME THAT'S MY IMPRESSION OF YOU. YOU ALWAYS ALSO HAVE STUCK WITH YOUR PRINCIPLES BUT YOU HAVE BEEN WILLING 6 TO LEARN AND TO GROW. YOU DON'T ALWAYS HAVE TO BE RIGHT, SO 7 8 YOU LISTEN TO THE OTHER SIDE, AND YOU CHANGE YOUR MIND WHEN THE FACTS ALIGN WITH YOUR PRINCIPLES AND THAT HAS ALSO JUST 9 10 HELPED ME IN MY PERSONAL LIFE AND MY CAREER, AND I -- THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS I VALUE MOST ABOUT ALL OF THE ELECTED 11 OFFICIALS I HAVE WORKED WITH THROUGHOUT ALL THE YEARS OF MY 12 CAREER. I ALSO WANTED TO SAY, PERSONALLY, INSPIRE ME TO DO 13 GOOD, AND YOU INSPIRE ME TO GET INTO PUBLIC SERVICE. YOU 14 15 TAUGHT ME THAT YOU COULD MAKE CHANGE THROUGH SERVING THE 16 PUBLIC. AND, SO, YEAH, I JUST APPRECIATE YOU FOR YOUR LESSONS ON WHAT WE CAN DO WE CAN STICK WITH IT, ABOUT LOYALTY E AND 17 ALSO THAT IT'S POSSIBLE TO BE THERE FOR YOUR FAMILY AND YOUR 18 COMMUNITY. AND, SO, THANK YOU. I LOVE YOU. [APPLAUSE] 19 20 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. SO I'M GLAD NO ONE HAS TO 21

22 23

24 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: TRYING TO PUT MYSELF TOGETHER. VICE 25 CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

SPEAK AFTER THAT. LET'S VOTE.



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES COMMISSION ARE ABE-KOGA? MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN? EDDIE AHN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON? CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE. SPEAKER: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA, THANK YOU. EZZY ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN?



REBECCA KAPLAN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY? NATHAN MILEY: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS? STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK? SUE NOACK: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN? GINA PAPAN: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? DAVID RABBITT: AYE SPERING? JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. [APPLAUSE] [APPLAUSE]

3

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO, AS WE CONTINUE TO HONOR THOSE 4 5 WHOSE TERMS OF SERVICE ON MTC ARE COMING TO AN END WE ALSO CONSIDER RESOLUTION 4692? HONOR OF COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING 6 WHO IS RETIRING FROM THE COMMISSION AFTER AN INCREDIBLE 380 7 8 YEARS -- WAIT -- [LAUGHTER] IS THAT AN INTENTIONAL TYPO? --INCREDIBLE 38 YEARS OF SERVICE OUTSTANDING SERVICE 9 REPRESENTING SOLANO COUNTY, IN A CHARACTERISTICALLY MODEST WAY 10 JIM ASKED THIS MEETING PROCEED WITHOUT CITATIONS FROM THE 11 RESOLUTION BUT JIM IS NOT GOING TO BE HERE NEXT MEETING SO WE 12 DON'T HAVE TO DO WHAT HE WANTS ANYMORE. BUT WE'RE GOING TO 13 HAVE A WORLD PREMIER VIDEO FEATURING COMMISSIONER SPERING 14 15 HIMSELF AS HAD AS JUST A FEW OF THE MANY HUNDREDS OF PEOPLE 16 WHO HAVE WORKED WITH HIM OVER THE DECADES. LET'S ROLL IT. 17 [VIDEO PLAYING] [MUSIC]

18

JAMES P. SPERING: I STARTED IN 1987 AND I DIDN'T KNOW ANYTHING ABOUT MTC. I DIDN'T KNOW WHAT AN MPO WAS, OR WHAT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WAS. AS YOU SERVE ON THE COMMISSION, YOU KIND OF MATURE INTO THE ROLE. YOU START TO UNDERSTAND THAT YOU REALLY WEAR TWO HATS. YOU WEAR ONE FOR THE CONSTITUENTS THAT YOU REPRESENT IN YOUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, AND THEN YOU HAVE A ROLE FOR THE REGION. YOU'RE GOING TO BE DEALING WITH

JANUARY 22, 2025

SOME LARGE ISSUES THAT REALLY AFFECT MILLIONS OF PEOPLE, AND 1 AFFECT ALL NINE COUNTIES. IT'S NOT JUST, YOU KNOW, SHOWING UP 2 AT A MEETING MAKING A DECISION. IT'S HAVING A RELATIONSHIP 3 WITH YOUR FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, REALLY UNDERSTANDING WHAT'S 4 5 IMPORTANT TO THEM AND WHAT'S GOING ON IN THEIR COUNTIES AND THEN YOU HAVE TO REALLY LOOK AT WHAT ARE THE LARGE ISSUES THAT 6 AFFECT ALL NINE COUNTIES AND THAT WE HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER. 7 8 AND SOMETIMES YOU REALLY STRUGGLE ON BALANCING, YOU KNOW, WHAT'S GOOD FOR YOUR LOCAL JURISDICTION, AND WHAT'S GOOD FOR 9 10 THE REGION. I'M JUST AN ORDINARY GUY, BUT I HAVE BEEN SURROUNDED BY EXTRAORDINARY PEOPLE AND I HAVE BEEN BLESSED THE 11 PEOPLE I HAVE BEEN ABLE TO WORK WITH. IF YOU ARE AN EFFECTIVE 12 COMMISSION YOU HAVE TO COMMIT AND DO YOUR HOMEWORK IT'S A LOT 13 OF WORK I AM FORTUNATE THAT I HAVE A FAMILY THAT HAS THEIR OWN 14 15 INTERESTS AND ALL, AND UNDERSTOOD THE ROLE THAT I WAS PLAYING, OR THE IMPORTANCE IT WAS TO ME. I MEAN, I FELT THAT, YOU KNOW, 16 I WANTED TO TRY AND MAKE A DIFFERENCE IN THE REGION AND DO 17 WHAT I COULD. 18

19

20 SPEAKER: COLLEAGUES SAY JIM SPERING HAS ALWAYS BEEN A21 VISIONARY.

22

JAMES P. SPERING: JUST LOOK AT THE NEW CLIPPER CARD HERE. I'M GOING TO BE ABLE TO GET ON A BUS IN SOLANO COUNTY AND BE ABLE TO GET OFF BART IN SAN FRANCISCO JUST BY USING ONE CARD.



1

JANUARY 22, 2025

2 SPEAKER: JIM WAS VERY MUCH INVOLVED IN THAT. HE JUST CAPTURED 3 THE ESSENCE OF MTC. 4 5 SPEAKER: LARRY DOM IT TOOK A DOZEN YEARS TO DEVELOP AND 6 IMPLEMENT CLIPPER AND ITS ORIGINAL INCARNATION TRANSLINK. 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: CLIPPER CARD, WE GOT A LOT OF OPPOSITION FROM TRANSIT OPERATORS AND THERE WAS A HANDFUL OF 9 10 COMMISSIONERS, JUST A FEW WHO FELT THIS WAS IMPORTANT, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I MEAN WE SPENT HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF 11 DOLLARS ON THE CUM, BECAUSE WE REALIZED THAT CLIPPER CARD IS 12 PROBABLY THE MOST IMPORTANT THING MTC IS GOING TO DO TO MAKE 13 THE SYSTEM SEAMLESS. ONE OF THE MOST SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS THAT 14 15 WE HAD. 16 SPEAKER: JIM IS THE VETERAN THERE, THE GO-TO-GUY WHEN YOU 17 FIRST CAME ON THE COMMISSION. 18 19 SPEAKER: JIM SPERING HAS HIS FINGERPRINTS ON SO MANY FANTASTIC 20 PROJECTS. THAT FOURTH BORE OF THE CALDECOTT TUNNEL, PARTS OF 21 THE SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT, JAMESON CANYON 22 PROJECT IN NAPA AND SOLANO COUNTY, BART TO SANTA CLARA WAS 23 FIRST STARTED BECAUSE OF JIM'S DEAL THAT HE MADE ON THE PROP 24



1B, BOD. SO, HE HAS TOUCHED SO MANY GREAT TRANSPORTATION 1 2 PROJECTS. 3 SPEAKER: WELL, HE WAS THE DEAL MAKER ON THE BOARD. AND 4 5 WHENEVER ANYONE ASKED ME WHO IT WAS I DIDN'T HAVE ANY PROBLEM IN SAYING IT'S JIM SPERING, HE'S THE GUY TO GO SEE. 6 7 8 AMY R. WORTH: SOME PEOPLE APPROACH PROBLEMS LIKE THERE IS A WINNER AND LOSER AND JIM'S VIEW AND SUCCESS WAS THAT IN 9 10 BRINGING PEOPLE TOGETHER, EVERYBODY WON. EVERYBODY WON. I THINK HE FEELS GREAT PRIDE IN WHAT THE REGION HAS DONE. AND 11 WITHOUT SAYING, I DID THIS, OR I DID THAT, IT'S REALLY WHAT 12 THE REGION HAS DONE. 13 14 THERESE MCMILLAN: JIM WAS A PUBLIC SERVANT. BUT HE BELIEVES IN 15 16 THE PUBLIC GOOD. IT WASN'T JUST MTC. HE WAS ON ABAG. HE WAS ON 17 THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT. HE WAS QUIETLY MOVING THE CHESS PIECES ON THE BOARD. >JESSE ARREGUIN: HE WAS 18 ALWAYS THE PERSON THAT WAS TASKED WITH STEPPING IN TO LEAD AND 19 PROBLEM SOLVE VERY COMPLEX ISSUES AND HAS REALLY HELPED FOSTER 20 21 A SENSE OF REGIONALISM IN THE BAY AREA.

22

23 SPEAKER: JIM, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL YOU HAVE DONE, YOUR
24 FRIENDSHIP, YOUR LEADERSHIP ON THE TRANSPORTATION FOR LIVABLE
25 COMMUNITIES OF WHICH CONTRA COSTA HAS BEEN A BENEFICIARY OF.



I'LL ALWAYS REMEMBER MANY LONG HOURS ON THE EASTERN SPAN OF
 THE BAY BRIDGE, "LARRY KING AND TRANSIT MAN" VERY FEW PEOPLE
 REMEMBER THAT, PERIOD. YOU'RE AN EXAMPLE OF DEDICATED LOCAL
 ELECTED OFFICIAL WHO DID ALL THE RIGHT THINGS FOR THE RIGHT
 REASONS. THANKS SO MUCH, JIM.

6

7 SPEAKER: CONGRESSMAN DESAULNIER'S REFERENCE TO THE NEW EAST
8 SPAN OF THE BAY BRIDGE WAS ONE OF THE MOST CONTENTIOUS
9 PROJECTS OF JIM SPERING'S CAREER.

10

SPEAKER: AND I WILL TELL YOU WHEN I BROUGHT THAT ONE HOME TO THE COMMISSION, I THINK JIM SPERING COULD HAVE KILLED ME, BECAUSE HE KNEW THE TROUBLE WE WERE BRINGING. BUT ALSO KNEW IN HIS HEART OF HEARTS THAT IT WAS A JOB THAT NEEDED TO GET DONE AND WE WERE THE AGENCY THAT WAS BEST POSITIONED TO DO IT.

16

JAMES P. SPERING: YOU HAD A TRANSITION GOING FROM CALTRANS TO MTC, TAKEN ON A LOT OF THESE RESPONSIBILITIES, THE DELAYS, THE OVERRUNS AND. I THINK MTC BROUGHT THAT STABILITY TOGETHER. AND THERE WAS A LOT OF CRITICISM IN THE ROLE THAT MTC WAS PLAYING, BUT I THINK THE ROLE THAT MTC PLAYED WAS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT OR I DON'T THINK THAT BRIDGE WOULD PROBABLY BE BUILT TODAY.

24 SPEAKER: JIM IS ONE OF THE MOST GRATEFUL PEOPLE I HAVE EVER
25 BEEN AROUND IN PUBLIC SERVICE. HOW COULD SOMEBODY BE THAT

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 22, 2025

GRATEFUL ABOUT A JOB THAT PAYS A COUPLE HUNDRED BUCKS, OR
 WHATEVER IS THE STIPEND, BEEN DOING IT FOR ALL THESIS YEARS
 SINCE 1987. HE'S, OBVIOUSLY, NOT DOING IT FOR ANY PERSONAL
 GAIN IN ANY WAY, SHAPE, OR FORM. HE'S NOT SOMEBODY WHO HAS
 BEEN ON THE MARCH TO BECOME THE NEXT GOVERNOR OR SOMETHING;
 HE'S JUST TRYING TO MAKE A BETTER BAY AREA. HE'S IN IT BECAUSE
 HE HAS AN ABIDING BELIEF IN GOOD GOVERNMENT.

8

9 SPEAKER: ONE OF THE THINGS HE FOCUSED ON WHEN IT COMES TO 10 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION, HAS ALWAYS BEEN THE UNDERSERVED, 11 UNDER REPRESENTED, PEOPLE WHO ARE MARGINALIZED AND PEOPLE OF 12 COLOR, MAKING SURE THEY'RE NOT LEFT BEHIND. YOU DID SO MANY 13 THINGS THAT WERE DEFINITELY ON THE FOREFRONT THAT PEOPLE CAN 14 SEE. BUT I'M REMEMBERED OF ALL THINGS I'M AWARE OF THAT YOU 15 DID BEHIND THE SCENES THAT PEOPLE DIDN'T GET TO SEE.

16

SPEAKER: SO, JIM, THANKS FOR YOUR SERVICE. AND I'LL TELL YOU, WHEN I LEFT MTC TEN YEARS AGO TO GO TO THE LEGISLATURE, AT THAT POINT IN TIME, IN MY MIND YOU WERE THE MOST EFFECTIVE LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIAL THAT I HAD EVER MET IN MY LIFE. AND I CAN HONESTLY SAY TODAY, AS I LEAVE THE LEGISLATURE AFTER TEN YEARS, I STILL BELIEVE YOU WERE THE MOST EFFECTIVE LOCAL ELECTED OFFICIAL I HAVE EVER KNOWN.

JANUARY 22, 2025

1	SPEAKER: JIM AND I ARE MILITARY BRATS. I'M AIR FORCE; HE'S
2	ARMY, AND THAT'S WHERE WE MET WAS IN HIGH SCHOOL. AWW, HONEY,
3	I LOVE YOU. I HOPE YOU CAN NOW CALM DOWN AND ENJOY
4	[LAUGHTER] YOU KNOW, THE PROJECTS THAT YOU WANT TO DO
5	BECAUSE YOU WON'T HAVE THESE OTHER PRESSURES ON YOU. YOUR
6	WHOLE FAMILY LOVES YOU. YOU'RE GREAT. YOU'RE WONDERFUL, AND
7	YOU'RE MUCH, MUCH MORE THAN WHAT YOU THINK OF YOURSELF AS.
8	
9	SPEAKER: THANK YOU, JIM SPERING, FOR YOUR NEARLY FOUR DECADES
10	OF PUBLIC SERVICE TO THE ENTIRE BAY AREA. [END OF VIDEO]
11	[APPLAUSE]
12	
13	JAMES P. SPERING: WE'RE GOING TO LIMIT COMMENTS TO 30 SECONDS.
14	[LAUGHTER].
15	
16	SPEAKER:
17	
18	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WOULD YOU LIKE TO SAY SOMETHING,
19	JIM?
20	
21	JAMES P. SPERING: I'M OVERWHELMED. THE INDIVIDUALS IN THAT
22	VIDEO WERE PEOPLE WHO MEANT SO MUCH TO ME. AND YOU HEARD ME
23	SAY IT. IT'S SOMETHING I REALLY BELIEVE, I'M JUST AN ORDINARY
24	GUY SURROUNDED BY EXTRAORDINARY PEOPLE IN EXTRAORDINARY
25	ORGANIZATION. I'M HAVE BEEN BLESSED. THE LIVES THAT HAVE

JANUARY 22, 2025

CROSSED MY PATH HAVE ENRICHED ME AND MY FAMILY, AND I CAN'T 1 THANK YOU ALL ENOUGH. SENATOR ON THERE AND MY GOOD FRIEND BILL 2 3 DODD HIS COMMENTS. BILL YOU DON'T KNOW HOW MUCH THAT MEANT TO ME, YOUR COMMENTS, SO I WANT TO THANK YOU. AND TO JUST BE PART 4 5 OF SOMETHING THAT YOU CAN BE PROUD OF, AND NEW COMMISSIONERS YOU'RE EMBARKING ON A JOURNEY THAT REALLY MAKES A DIFFERENCE 6 AND IF YOU ALL WORK TOGETHER AND STAY FOCUSED YOU FIND THE 7 8 BALANCE BETWEEN WHAT'S IMPORTANT TO YOUR JURISDICTION AND THE REGION, THIS AGENCY WILL ALWAYS BE SUCCESSFUL. AND I DON'T 9 THINK YOU WILL EVERY SERVE ON AN AGENCY THAT HAS BETTER STAFF 10 THAN MTC IN ALL MY EXPERIENCE IN 36 YEARS AS AN ELECTED 11 OFFICIAL, THE VERY BEST HAVE ALWAYS BEEN HERE AT MTC THEY'RE 12 KNOWLEDGEABLE PEOPLE GOOD AT WHAT THEY DO, FRIENDLY PEOPLE 13 THEY'RE PEOPLE YOU CAN GO HAVE A BEER WITH AND SIT DOWN I MEAN 14 15 IT'S A QUALITY THAT YOU REALLY DON'T SEE VERY OFTEN AND SO 16 THANK YOU. I'M JUST OVERWHELMED. THAT VIDEO -- I WANTED TO KEEP THIS LOW KEY. [LAUGHTER] I DON'T THINK YOU DID THAT. BUT 17 YOU KNOW, MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, I JUST CAN'T THANK ALL OF 18 YOU -- YOU ALL HAVE PLAYED A PART IN MY SUCCESS, AND I REALLY 19 AM SO ENCOURAGED ON THE LEADERSHIP THAT WE HAVE THAT'S GOING 20 21 TO MOVE THIS COMMISSION FORWARD. AND THE COMMISSIONERS THAT WE HAVE, IT'S JUST A GREAT GROUP OF PEOPLE THAT I THINK YOU'RE 22 GOING TO BE VERY SUCCESSFUL. BUT, THANK YOU. THERE'S SO MANY 23 PEOPLE THAT -- YOU KNOW, I JUST DON'T WANT TO START NAMING 24 25 NAMES, BUT I THINK YOU ALL KNOW WHO YOU ARE, AND HOW MUCH I



APPRECIATE IT. SO, AGAIN, THANK YOU. I JUST PLAYED A VERY
 SMALL ROLE IN WHAT HAS HAPPENED OVER THE YEARS. THANK YOU.
 [APPLAUSE]

4

5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER KAPLAN?

6

REBECCA KAPLAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING. I'M SO 7 8 PLEASED TO BE ABLE TO GET HERE, COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND TO BE ABLE TO GET TO OVERLAP WITH YOU, AND IN FACT THAT WAS ONE 9 10 OF THE EXCITING POINTS ABOUT JOINING MTC AT THIS MOMENT IS TO GET TO COME BE HERE WHILE YOU WERE STILL HERE. MY FIRST MTC 11 MEETING THAT I ATTENDED, NOT AS A COMMISSIONER, BUT ATTENDED, 12 WAS IN 1998, AND WHILE THAT WAS OVER 25 YEARS AGO, AT THE 13 TIME, YOU WERE ALREADY THE OG ON THE BOARD AT THAT TIME, 25 14 15 YEARS AGO. AND IN FACT, YOU WERE CHAIR, I BELIEVE, OF THE 16 FIRST MTC MEETING I EVER ATTENDED. YOU WERE CHAIRING, AND I WAS THERE AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF 17 PUBLIC TRANSIT FUNDING. AND IT HAS BEEN SUCH A PLEASURE SEEING 18 YOUR DEDICATION, YOUR SENSE OF HUMOR, AND REALLY YOUR 19 COMMITMENT TO THE BAY AREA AS A REGION AND THE UNDERSTANDING 20 21 THAT WE NEED TO FUNCTION TOGETHER, AND WE SERVED TOGETHER ON THE BAY AREA AIR DISTRICT, WHERE YOU SAT OVER HERE AND I SAT 22 OVER THERE AND WE WERE THE TWO CORNERS OF THE ROOM. AND THEN 23 TO BE BACK HERE WITH YOU ON MTC, AS WE WORK OUT THE REGIONAL 24 25 MEASURE, AND OTHER IMPORTANT ITEMS FOR OUR FUTURE, THAT YOUR



IMPACT AND YOUR LEGACY WILL BE FELT HERE FOR DECADES TO COME.
 THANK YOU SO MUCH.

3

4 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER MILEY?

5

NATHAN MILEY: YEAH, THANK YOU. JIM, WE'RE GOING TO MISS YOU. 6 YOU KNOW, I HAVE SERVED FOR ABOUT 34 YEARS, TEN YEARS ON THE 7 8 CITY COUNCIL, 24 YEARS AS A COUNTY SUPERVISOR, AND YOU HAVE BEEN A PILLAR. YOU HAVE BEEN A TOUCHSTONE. YOU HAVE BEEN 9 SOMEBODY TO ADMIRE. I COULD ALWAYS REST ASSURED KNOWING MTC IS 10 DOING THE RIGHT THING WHILE YOU WERE HERE. SUPERVISOR HAGGERTY 11 WAS HERE, AND OTHERS. I DON'T KNOW WHO IS GOING TO FILL YOURS 12 SHOES. ALL THE SUBTLE DIPLOMACY YOU HAVE DONE. I MEAN, YOU 13 HAVE BEEN TO ALAMEDA COUNTY SO MANY TIMES FOR SO MANY 14 15 MEETINGS, WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, WITH OUR BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, YOU KNOW, TALKING TO US ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE 16 17 OF THESE PROJECTS, AND TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT WE PLAY BALL. I JUST DON'T KNOW WHO IS GOING TO DO THAT. I KNOW I'M NOT 18 GOING TO DO THAT. [LAUGHTER] SO, I ADMIRE YOU. I APPRECIATE 19 YOU. I VALUE YOU, AND YOU HAVE JUST BEEN FANTASTIC, AND IT'S 20 21 BEEN GOOD TO WORK WITH YOU OVER THE YEARS AND TO GET TO KNOW YOU. SO, THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE, MY FRIEND. 22

23

24 SPEAKER: TRULY, THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING, JIM. I HAVE GOTTEN 25 TO KNOW YOU BETTER AS A PERSON. YOU KNOW, FOR ALL YOUR

JANUARY 22, 2025

LEADERSHIP, PARTICULARLY IN ORGANIZING THE NORTH BAY AND
 TRANSLATING OUR NEEDS INTO EFFECTIVE POLICY THAT WORKS FOR THE
 WHOLE REGION, WE REALLY -- I -- LIKE NATE SAID, I DON'T KNOW
 WHO IS GOING TO FILL YOUR SHOES. BUT I WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW
 HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE YOU AND, YOU KNOW, I REALLY ISSUE I HAD
 LONGER TO LEARN FROM YOU.

7

8 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OUR FIRST ENCOUNTER WAS ON THE AIR DISTRICT. WE SAT ON THE BENCH TOGETHER, AND I THOUGHT --9 10 [LAUGHTER] OH WOW, YOU'RE A REALLY NICE UNASSUMING GUY. [LAUGHTER]. LITTLE DID I KNOW UNTIL I GOT TO MTC WHAT A 11 POWERHOUSE YOU ARE, AND IT'S REALLY AN HONOR. I HAVE LEARNED A 12 LOT FROM YOU. I APPRECIATE YOUR WISDOM, VISION, FOR 13 REGIONALISM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR TAKING THE TIME TO TRAVEL 14 15 THE ENTIRE BAY AREA MANY TIMES, BUT I'LL ALWAYS REMEMBER THE 16 TRIP YOU TOOK TO OUR PART OF THE BAY, AND REALLY TAKING THE TIME TO UNDERSTAND WHAT OUR AREA IS ABOUT. BUT I WISH I HAD 17 MORE TIME WITH YOU, BUT I KNOW YOU WILL BE AROUND, AND I JUST 18 WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 19 20 LEADERSHIP.

21

GINA PAPAN: JIM, I'M SORRY. I KNOW HOW UNCOMFORTABLE THIS MAKES YOU -- [LAUGHTER] -- BUT IT IS ALL TRUE. AND WHAT PEOPLE DON'T REALIZE IS THAT YOU HAVE MENTORED SO MANY PEOPLE THAT COME ON TO THIS COMMISSION, AND WHEN THEY ARRIVE, YOU REACH

JANUARY 22, 2025

OUT TO THEM AND REALLY TRY TO GET TO KNOW THE PEOPLE YOU WORK 1 WITH HERE. AS WAS NOTED HERE, YOUR ABILITY TO LISTEN, YOUR 2 3 RESPONSIVENESS. THAT'S WHY PEOPLE LOOK TO YOU. IT'S, LIKE, CALL JIM. ASK JIM. [LAUGHTER] GIVING FEEDBACK AND HELPING US 4 5 ALL GROW. THE ACCOMPLISHMENTS YOU HAVE DONE ARE JUST SPECTACULAR, AS IS NOTED HERE, PARTICULARLY CLIPPER. AND HOW 6 LONG THAT HAS TAKEN. [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR 7 8 EVERYTHING. AND, AGAIN, AS WAS NOTED HERE, YOUR ABILITY TO REALLY LISTEN TO PEOPLE FROM EACH REGION, GO THERE, TALK TO 9 THEM, PUT THE PIECES TOGETHER, BRINGING US TOGETHER TO BE 10 BETTER AND BRINGING THE REGION TOGETHER. THANK YOU SO MUCH. 11 I'M NOT GOING IT ON GO ON. I'LL WRITE IT DOWN BECAUSE YOU'RE 12 VERY UNCOMFORTABLE ABOUT THIS, I KNOW. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH 13 FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE, AND THANK YOU TO STAFF, THAT 14 15 VIDEO WAS GREAT.

16

DAVID RABBITT: AS MY COLLEAGUES ARE TALKING, I'M NODDING ALONG 17 AND WANT TO SAY DITTO TO EVERYTHING. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, JIM. 18 YOU ARE A HUGE MENTOR, I THINK, TO EVERYONE WHO JOINS THIS 19 BODY. IT'S UNBELIEVABLE THAT YOU SERVED 38 YEARS ON ONE BOARD. 20 21 THAT IS SO RARE AND EXTRAORDINARY, BUT THIS BOARD HIS BEEN WELL SERVED BY THOSE YEARS AND THE COMMISSION ALONG THE WAY 22 HAS LEARNED SO MUCH FROM YOU AND I APPRECIATE THAT SO MUCH. 23 AND THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR ALL THE NORTH BAY -- OUR LITTLE 24 NORTH BAY CABAL, GETTING TOGETHER, AND TALKING ISSUES THAT ARE 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

IMPORTANT TO DIFFERENT REGIONS. BUT, ALSO, THE KIND OF THOSE
 TWO HATS THING THAT WE TALKED ABOUT EARLIER IS SO IMPORTANT. I
 THINK I HAVE KNOWN YOU A LITTLE LONGER THAN 15.8% OF TIME THAT
 I HAVE SERVED IN YOUR 38 YEARS. BUT IT'S BEEN A GREAT RIDE.
 THANK YOU.

6

SPEAKER: JIM SERVING AS YOUR VICE CHAIR ON THE PLANNING 7 8 COMMITTEE I HAVE PICKED UP A TRICK OR TWO FROM YOU OVER THE YEARS NOW. IT'S BEEN GREAT TO SEE NOT ONLY YOUR UNDERSTATEMENT 9 WHAT PEOPLE TALKED ABOUT YOUR RESTRAINT OVER EXERCISING POWER 10 BUT THE GIVE-AND-TAKE YOU ALWAYS ENGAGE OVER POLICY I HAVE 11 APPRECIATED YOUR REGIONAL PERSPECTIVE. AND AT THE END OF THE 12 DAY ONE OF MY FAVORITE STORIES IN POLITICS IS THE LEGEND OF --13 [INDISCERNIBLE] IDEA OF ROMAN FARMER GOES OFF AND SAVES THE 14 REPUBLICAN WHEN CALLED UPON TO SAVE AND GIVES IT BACK AT THE 15 16 END OF THE DAY THOSE WHO MIGHT NOT KNOW I HOPE YOU DON'T MIND ME SHARING JIM IS LITERALLY A MAN OF LETTERS YOU KNOW, CALLING 17 I FEE ALSO BUILD HOUSES EVERY TIME YOU LIKE WORK IN THE SUN IN 18 SO MANY WAYS, A MODERN DAY CINCINNATUS. I HOPE YOU'RE ABLE TO 19 RETIRE, AS YOUR PARTNER IS PRESSING YOU TO. BUT SHOULD COME 20 21 BACK [INDISCERNIBLE] ABATEMENT AS A RESULT. [LAUGHTER]

22

23 SPEAKER THANK YOU FOR YOUR SERVICE.

24

>>DAVID CANEPA: JIM, I WANT TO THANK YOU. WE SERVED ON THE BAY 1 2 AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT BUT I WANTED TO TALK 3 ABOUT EIGHT YEARS AGO I BROUGHT MY STAFF OVER TO YOUR OFFICE AND WE SPENT FOUR HOURS TALKING ABOUT OLDER AMERICANS IS AND 4 5 WHAT SOLANO COUNTY WAS DOING AROUND MOBILITY ISSUES AND TO ME BACK ON THAT A LOT OF THINGS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT WE 6 IMPLEMENTED IN SAN MATEO BUT FOR A SUPERVISOR TO SPEND FOUR 7 8 HOURS REALLY TALKS ABOUT YOUR COLLABORATION BUT MOSTLY YOUR COMPASSION I WAS REALLY -- THAT STORY REALLY STUCK WITH ME, 9 10 BUT TO HAVE SOMEONE LIKE YOURSELF DO THAT AND TAKE THE TIME MEANT A LOT TO ME AND BEING ON THIS BOARD AND DEALING WITH THE 11 REGIONAL MEASURE, AND HOW YOU HANDLED THAT, THE UNANIMOUS 12 VOTE, JIM, NO, WE DON'T FORGET, UNANIMOUS VOTE. I THINK THE 13 WAY YOU COMMUNICATED GOING FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY AND HOW YOU 14 WERE ABLE TO MOVE THOSE PIECES, I DON'T THINK ANYONE WHO WAS 15 16 IN THAT POSITION COULD HAVE ACCOMPLISHED WHAT YOU HAVE ACCOMPLISH. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 17

18

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

Meeting Transcript

COMMISSION

19 SUE NOACK: I'LL SAY DITTO TO WHAT A LOT OF PEOPLE HAVE TALKED 20 ABOUT YOUR ACCOMPLISHMENTS. I HAVEN'T KNOWN YOU THAT LONG 21 HONESTLY BUT I FEEL LIKE I HAVE DEVELOPED SUCH A CLOSE 22 RELATIONSHIP WITH YOU AND THAT TALKS ABOUT THE QUALITY OF 23 PERSON YOU ARE, HOW YOU CAN BE A PERSON THAT I FEEL LIKE I 24 HAVE KNOWN FOR A LONG TIME AND HOW YOU CAN RELY ON FOR A LONG 25 TIME IN SUCH A SHORT PERIOD OF TIME AND I WANT TO FOCUS ON

JANUARY 22, 2025

THAT OUALITY OF YOURS VERSUS ALL THE OTHER ACCOMPLISHMENTS 1 BECAUSE I WASN'T AROUND FOR MANY OF THOSE BUT JIM AND I 2 3 USUALLY MEET BEFORE THESE MEETINGS ABOUT 8:30 AT PHIL'S COFFEE AND HAVE A COFFEE JUST THAT LITTLE TIME TO CHAT AND GET TO 4 5 KNOW EACH OTHER A BIT BETTER JUST MENTAL HEALTH THE WORLD TO ME AND GIVES ME A LOT MORE CONFIDENCE IN GOING FORWARD ON MTC 6 KNOWING THAT YOU HAVE BEEN THERE TO MENTOR ME THE LAST COUPLE 7 8 OF YEARS AND I STILL HAVE YOUR CELL PHONE NUMBER AND I CAN 9 CALL YOU. THANK YOU, JIM.

10

STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: I'M GOING TO SAY DITTO AND ADD MY 11 THANKS FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND THE WAY YOU HAVE APPROACHED THE 12 WORK YOU HAVE DONE AND TRUE PUBLIC SPIRIT AND CONFIDENCE AND 13 BALANCING REGIONAL LOCAL NEEDS AND DESIRES AND BRINGING 14 EVERYBODY TOGETHER TO WORK TOGETHER ON THIS COMMISSION. I 15 16 APPRECIATE YOUR CONFIDENCE, FOR SUE AND ME TAKING THE REINS AND WORKING WITH THIS BOARD AND WE WILL CARRY ON IN YOUR 17 18 SPIRIT. AND IT'S A LITTLE UNNERVING IT ME TO HEAR YOU SAY YOU PLAYED A SMALL PART IN THE SUCCESS OF MTC BECAUSE IF YOU 19 PLAYED A SMALL PART I DON'T KNOW WHAT A LARGE PART LOOKS LIKE. 20 21 THANK YOU VERY MUCH, JIM F EVERYTHING.

22

23 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SCHAFF?

JANUARY 22, 2025

LIBBY SCHAFF: I'M A RECOVERING MAYOR. I THINK THIS WEEK MARKS 1 A DECADE THAT WE HAVE WORKED TOGETHER. AND I REMEMBER WHEN I 2 3 FIRST GOT ON MTC, JUST BY CHANCE OF BEING THE MAYOR OF OAKLAND, I WAS TOLD THE FIRST PERSON YOU NEED TO MEET WITH IS 4 5 JIM SPERING. AFTER THAT, STEVE HEMINGER. [LAUGHTER] AND I JUST -- I'M GOING TO FOREWARN MY COLLEAGUES, THAT WE HAVE TO 6 CONTINUE TO INVOKE YOUR SPIRIT. BECAUSE THE SPIRIT OF 7 8 REGIONALISM IS SOMETHING THAT YOU EMBODY. THIS IDEA THAT WE'RE HERE AS VESSELS, YOU KNOW, AS -- AS STEWARDS, NOT JUST FOR 9 10 PEOPLE THAT WE REPRESENT TODAY, BUT FOR THIS WHOLE REGION, BOTH TODAY AND LONG INTO THE FUTURE. AND THAT EXPANSIVE VIEW 11 OF WHAT OUR PUBLIC SERVICE TRULY MEANS HAS REALLY BEEN YOUR 12 HALLMARK. YOU HAVE BEEN SOMEONE WHO HAS ALWAYS BEEN A JOY TO 13 HAVE THOSE OFFLINE CONVERSATIONS WITH. YOU ARE SOMEONE WHO 14 15 CREATES A SENSE OF PSYCHOLOGICAL SAFETY THAT YOU CAN TEST OUT 16 DIFFERENT IDEAS WITH. LIKE, THIS IS WHAT A LEADER IS. THANK YOU FOR BEING A LEADER THAT WE CAN ALL FOLLOW AND WHO I HOPE 17 WE ALL CONTINUE TO EMULATE. THANK YOU. I JUST LOVED KNOWING 18 YOU. YOU KNOW THAT. I SEE DOREEN. 19

20

21 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. YOU COULD SAY SOMETHING. I'M
22 GOING TO KEEP ON CALLING ON YOU.

23

24 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE LEARNING ABOUT
25 YOUR LEGACY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR EVERYTHING.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 2 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: --3 SPEAKER: I WOULD HAVE TURNED ON MY MIC. JIM AND I HAVE NOT 4 5 SERVED AT THE SAME TIME ON MTC OR ABAG BUT HE HAS BEEN AN INSTRUMENTAL PART TO ALL OF US AS A COUNTY SUPERVISOR INVOLVED 6 7 IN TRANSPORTATION. 8 CANDACE ANDERSEN: AND HE'S JUST BEEN THERE. HE FELT LIKE HE 9 WAS PART OF YOUR COMMUNITY, HE'S PART OF EVERY MAJOR PROJECT 10 THAT TOOK PLACE, AND IT WAS A COLLABORATIVE NATURE. AND I 11 THINK LIBBY SAID IT VERY WELL, WE DON'T WANT TO LOSE THAT 12 SPIRIT ON ANY BODY. AS A REGION WORKING AS WORKING TOGETHER TO 13 ACCOMPLISH SOMETHING IT'S NOT ABOUT OUR OWN LITTLE AREAS IT'S 14 15 ABOUT HOW WE'RE GOING TO SOLVE PROBLEMS IN THE AREA AND 16 IMPROVE THE ENTIRE BAY AREA. SO THANK YOU JIM FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP IN ALL THESE YEARS IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE, INFORMALLY 17 HANGING OUT WITH YOU, LOTS OF DIFFERENT PLACES. THANK YOU. 18 19 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: DOREEN. 20 21 DORENE M. GIACOPINI: JIM, I THINK THE FIRST TIME I MET YOU WAS 22 AT AN EVENT IN SUISUN CITY, HONORING VICK FAZIO, AND I WAS A 23 20-SOMETHING-YEAR-OLD STAFF MEMBER FOR NORMAN MINETA AT THE 24 25 TIME. WE BECAME -- I BECAME -- WE BECAME COLLEAGUES ON MTC

JANUARY 22, 2025

PRETTY MUCH 30 YEARS AGO, AND SINCE THEN I HAVE BEEN WAITING 1 FOR YOU TO RETIRE SO THAT I COULD BE THE LONGEST SERVING 2 MEMBER OF MTC, AND YOU HAVE BEEN MAKING ME WAIT. [LAUGHTER] 3 JIM, THERE IS NOTHING THAT I CAN SAY THAT EVERYONE HASN'T 4 5 ALREADY SAID. IT'S ALL TRUE, WHETHER YOU WANT TO HEAR IT OR NOT. I REALLY ENJOYED GETTING TOGETHER WITH YOU DURING LONG 6 MEETINGS AND CONFERENCES AND THAT, SORT OF, THING, AND HASHING 7 8 OUT POLITICAL DIFFERENCES AND, AND I JUST WANT TO SAY THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR YOUR FOCUS ON REGIONALISM, YOUR LASER FOCUS ON 9 10 REGIONALISM IN THIS -- FOR THIS COMMISSION, FOR ALL THE YEARS THAT I HAVE OBSERVED YOU. YOU'RE A TRUE PUBLIC SERVANT, AND 11 THANK YOU. 12

13

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TALKED A LOT 14 15 ABOUT HOW MUCH JIM LIKES TRAINS AND BUSES. BUT, LIKE, THE 16 TRANSPORTATION VEHICLE THAT I HAVE ALWAYS IDENTIFIED WITH JIM IS THE PLANE. BECAUSE WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE BACKGROUND OF HIS -17 - YOU KNOW, HIS SCREEN SAVER, IT'S NOT A TRAIN, IT'S A PLANE. 18 AND IT'S NOT JUST ANY -- IT'S USUALLY PLANES THAT DROP BOMBS 19 AND STUFF LIKE THAT. AND HE'S GOT -- LIKE, SUCH -- I WAS 20 21 THINKING WHEN'S THE TRANSPORTATION VEHICLE THAT MIGHT MOST, SORT OF, THAT TO ME SPEAKS MOST TO WHO JIM IS. AND I'M NOT AN 22 EXPERT, BUT IT SEEMS TO ME LIKE IT MIGHT BE THE B-52 BOMBER, 23 NOT JUST BECAUSE THAT'S BEEN IN SERVICE SINCE 1952, AND WE 24 KEEP THINKING IT MIGHT GET RETIRED BUT THE AIRFORCE JUST KEEPS 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

JANUARY 22, 2025

EXTENDING ITS SERVICE LIFE. BUT IT'S A PLANE THAT BASICALLY 1 JUST GOES UP INTO THE AIR AND KEEPS AMERICA SAFE. IT KEEPS THE 2 3 INSTITUTION SAFE. AND JIM, I FEEL LIKE WE DON'T ALWAYS SEE YOU YOU'RE LIKE -- BUT YOU JUST KEEP THIS INSTITUTION SAFE AND 4 5 IT'S EASY FOR AN ORGANIZATION LIKE MTC WHICH REALLY ITS POWER IS -- SO EASY FOR US TO MISSTEP AND FOR THIS ORGANIZATION TO 6 FALL APART AND FOR PEOPLE TO LOSE TRUST IN IT AND FOR US TO 7 8 LOSE TRUST IF OURSELVES AND YOU HAVE FOR THE EIGHT YEARS I HAVE BEEN ON THIS COMMISSION ALWAYS PUT THIS COMMISSION FIRST 9 BECAUSE YOU KNOW HOW IMPORTANT IT IS FOR US TO HAVE A BODY 10 LIKE MTC IN THIS REGION AND THERE ARE SO MANY TIMES OVER THE 11 YEARS WHERE I FEEL IF IT WASN'T FOR YOU BEING UP HERE KEEPING 12 US ALL SAFE THIS COMMISSION WOULD HAVE FALLEN APART AND IT 13 WOULDN'T BE HERE TO SERVE FUTURE GENERATIONS. SO, JIM, WE'RE 14 GOING TO BE MISSING YOU. SO I'M GOING TO MAKE THE MOTION TO 15 16 ADOPT THIS AND WOULD SOMEONE LIKE TO SECOND IT? SOMEBODY?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** EVERYBODY.

19

20 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: EVERYBODY IS GOING TO SECOND IT SO
21 WE'LL PUT EVERYBODY DOWN AS A SECOND IF THAT'S POSSIBLE
22 INCLUDING COMMISSIONER ABBOT IF WE NEED THAT. AND LET'S GO TO
23 PUBLIC COMMENT. IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

JANUARY 22, 2025

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I DO HAVE A NUMBER OF PUBLIC COMMENTS.
 WE'LL START WITH THOSE IN THE ROOM. ACTUALLY, WE'LL GO TO THE
 ZOOM SPACE. THERE IS ONE. ADINA LEVIN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

5

JAMES P. SPERING: IF THEY'RE SAYING NICE THINGS CAN THEY HAVE7 MORE TIME?

8

9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE WOULD BE HERE ALL DAY. [LAUGHTER]

SPEAKER: ADINA LEVIN SERVING ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL 11 AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE CHAIR, SPEAKING FOR 12 MYSELF, AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA, AND WITH ALL OF THOSE HATS WHO 13 WANT TO REALLY EXPRESS TREMENDOUS GRATITUDE FOR COMMISSIONER 14 SPERING'S SERVICE TO THE REGION, FOR THE THINGS THAT I SAW 15 16 MOST CLOSELY WAS LEADERSHIP ON THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TASK FORCE, YOU KNOW, BRINGING PARTS OF THE REGION TOGETHER ON HOW 17 TO RECOVER FROM TRANSIT FROM COVID BY MAKING THE SYSTEM MORE 18 COORDINATED AND SEAMLESS AND DILIGENT LEADERSHIP SEEKING TO 19 MAKE A REGIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING SOLUTION, ALL OF THOSE THINGS 20 21 BRINGING PEOPLE TOGETHER FOR A REGION WHERE THE WHOLE IS GREATER THAN THE SUM OF THE PARTS WHICH IS A TREMENDOUS 22 EFFORT. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THOSE YEARS OF SERVICE. 23



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO THOSE IN THE 1 2 BOARDROOM. FIRST UP, WE HAVE KATE MILLER. 3 KATE MILLER: I HIT THE BUTTON. OKAY THERE WE GO. I ONLY HAVE 4 5 ONE MINUTE. I'LL GO FAST. 6 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YOU CAN HAVE AS LONG AS YOU WOULD 7 8 LIKE. 9 KATE MILLER: I'M THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THE NAPA VALLEY 10 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY -- DON'T TEMPT ME ON THAT. 11 COMMISSIONER SPERING WAS ON THE COMMISSION WHEN I WAS A 12 YOUNGISH PLANNER HERE AT MTC AND OVER THE PAST 25 YEARS I HAVE 13 OBSERVED COMMISSIONER SPERING MASTERFULLY MANUFACTURE THE 14 BALANCES OF POWER BETWEEN THE FIVE BIG COUNTIES AND FOUR SMALL 15 16 NORTH BAY COUNTIES BUILDING COALITIONS AND DEMONSTRATING COLLABORATION ESPECIALLY WHEN THERE ARE CONFLICTING OPINIONS, 17 POLITICAL POLARITY AND SOMETIMES GENERAL STUPIDITY. WHEN I 18 WORKED FOR AC TRANSIT, WHICH OPERATES IN BOTH ALAMEDA AND 19 CONTRA COSTA COUNTIES, I DIDN'T ALWAYS AGREE WITH HIS 20 21 POSITIONS BUT ALWAYS RESPECTED HIS APPROACH. AND SINCE WORKING IN THE NORTH BAY, HE WILL SAY I ALMOST NEVER AGREE WITH HIS 22 POSITIONS AND OFTEN OUESTION HIS APPROACH. THAT SAID, I HAVE 23 AN IMMENSE AMOUNT OF RESPECT AND A HUGE SOFT SPOT FOR 24 COMMISSIONER SPERING. HE HAS A KNACK FOR FINDING COMMON GROUND 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

EVEN WHEN IT'S APPARENT THERE IS NO WAY FORWARD. DEMONSTRATING 1 LEADERSHIP ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE RECENTLY AND THE 2 3 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. HIS LEADERSHIP ON STATE ROUTE 37 BRINGING REGIONAL STATE AND FEDERAL ATTENTION TO A LARGELY 4 5 IGNORED CORRIDOR WAS MASTERFUL. AND I CAN FEEL CONFIDENT IN SAYING THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS GAINED UNIVERSAL RESPECT 6 FROM TRANSPORTATION STAFFERS FROM AROUND THE REGION. HE IS A 7 8 GREAT LISTENER, CURIOUS, DEFERENTIAL, AND SUPPORTIVE OF THE WORK WE DO. COMMISSIONER SPERING, I WILL SINCERELY MISS 9 WORKING WITH YOU I WILL MISS YOUR SENSE OF HUMOR -- OOH I'M 10 GOING TO START BREAKING UP HERE, YOUR CONGENIALITY AND YOUR 11 GENERAL WAY OF BEING IT'S BEEN A REALLY FUN RIDE AND MOSTLY 12 BECAUSE YOU HAVE BEEN HERE FOR THAT JOURNEY ON BEHALF OF THE 13 NAPA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AND BOARD AND STAFF, 14 15 THANK YOU, SIR, FOR YOUR SERVICE.

16

17 JAMES P. SPERING: YOU LEFT OUT THAT I WAS USUALLY RIGHT.

18

19 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: [LAUGHTER]

20

21 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT UP IS OUR FORMER CHAIR, ALFREDO
22 PEDROZA.

23

24 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. AND NICE TO BE BACK IN THE 25 ROOM. I PUT A SPORTS COAT ON FOR THE FIRST TIME IN A WHILE, Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION

COMMISSION

JANUARY 22, 2025

JIM. BUT YOU KNOW, LOOK, TO ME, WHEN I THINK ABOUT YOU, WHEN I 1 SAW THAT VIDEO THERE IS NOTHING ORDINARY BUT, JIM. AND I THINK 2 3 FOR ANYBODY THAT WANTS TO BE IN PUBLIC OFFICE, THE EXAMPLE OF WHAT YOU DID FOR THIS REGION IS SO VISIBLE. AT A TIME WHEN 4 5 THERE IS SO MUCH ABOUT BRAND POLITICS, OR PEOPLE WANTING TO BUILD THEIR OWN BRAND YOU DID THE OPPOSITE. YOU CREATED THE 6 OUTCOMES THAT ATTRACTED PEOPLE TO YOU. AND I CAN TELL YOU AS 7 8 SOMEONE WHO HAS CHAIRED THIS COMMISSION FOR, YOU KNOW, FOUR YEARS, I SOMETIMES WAITED FOR YOU TO CALL, BECAUSE I THOUGHT, 9 JIM NEEDS TO APPROVE OF THIS. BUT YOU KNEW HOW TO INFLUENCE 10 WITHOUT BEING SO INVOLVED. BUT YOU ALSO -- THAT TESTAMENT OF 11 LEADERSHIP IS SO CRITICAL AND SOMETHING WE NEED MORE OF. SO 12 IT'S UNFORTUNATE THAT YOU'RE LEAVING BUT THE BODY OF WORK YOU 13 HAVE DONE JIM, I HAVE HAD THE CHANCE TO TRAVEL WITH YOU FROM 14 15 SACRAMENTO TO DC, AND YOU ARE RESPECTED IN EVERY CORNER, 16 WHETHER LOCAL, STATE, OR FEDERAL, BUT YOU EARNED THAT THROUGH DOING HARD WORK AND WHEN WE APPOINTED YOU TO SO MANY THINGS 17 THAT NO ONE ELSE WANTED BUT YOU WERE THE RIGHT PERSON, YOU 18 WOULD DELIVER. BUT I GOT TO SEE THE HARD WORK YOU DID TO MEET 19 WITH PEOPLE IN THEIR COMMUNITIES IN THEIR CORNER WHERE IT 20 WASN'T ABOUT THE CAMERA BEING THERE OR AUDIENCE BEING THERE, 21 IT WAS YOU KNEW THAT WAS NECESSARY WORK TO CREATE THE OUTCOME 22 THAT THIS REGION AND THE PEOPLE NEEDED. AND I THINK WE'RE 23 GOING TO MISS THAT. WE'RE GOING TO MISS CARPOOLING WITH YOU 24 HEARING THE TALKS AND ALL THE STORIES. BUT AT THE TIME WHEN WE 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

NEED MORE LEADERSHIP, I THINK I'M GLAD YOU DID THIS VIDEO 1 2 BECAUSE WE CAN POINT, TO IT'S GOING TO LIVE THERE, WHERE WE 3 CAN KEEP SHOWING IT AT THE END OF THE DAY, MAN, ALL THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE, THE IMPACT, IT'S THERE, WE SEE IT. THANK YOU, 4 5 JIM. THANK YOU FOR GIVING YOURSELF TO THIS REGION AND FOR MENTORING US ALONG THE WAY TO BE BETTER LEADERS. YOUR IMPACT 6 IS NOT JUST YOU, AS YOUR WIFE SAID, YOU ARE A LOT MORE THAN 7 8 THAT. SO, THANK YOU, JIM. [APPLAUSE] 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT WE'LL HEAR FROM RANDI RENTSCHLER. 10 11 SPEAKER: WHEN YOU GO LAST, ALL THE FANCY WORDS YOU THOUGHT OF 12 HAVE BEEN SPOKEN SO I WON'T REPEAT THEM. EVEN IN MY COMIC WHEN 13 RAN THE CHRONICLE WHEN THEY HAD EDITORIAL CARTOONIST MARK 14 JONES GOT FOR HIS FANTASTIC VIDEO THANK YOU MARK ONLY ONE 15 16 THING THAT HASN'T BEEN SAID IS THE COMMISSIONERS MAY FIND THIS FUNNY BUT ALWAYS REFERRED TO HIM AS THE EXTENDIBLE 17 COMMISSIONER BECAUSE WHEN THINGS GOT TOUGH JIM WAS OFTEN TOLD 18 TO LEAD AND I THINK FOR THAT REASON JIM WAS REALLY 19 MISPRONOUNCING WHAT HE REALLY IS WHICH IS THE INDISPENSABLE 20 21 COMMISSIONER. SO, THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE] 22

23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT UP IS RICK RAMACIER SEER FOLLOWED
24 BY JANE KRAEMER AND STAN MANTON.

25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 22, 2025

SPEAKER: CONGRATULATIONS JIM WHETHER ALL THESE ACCOLADES 1 WHETHER YOU LIKE THEM OR NOT ARE EXTREMELY WELL -- FOR THIS 2 3 VIDEO WAS NIBBLE AND AS SOMEONE WHO SUGGESTED, I THINK FORMER CHAIR PEDROZA, THIS AUDIT TO BE USED TO SHOW PEOPLE HOW TO GET 4 5 ELECTED FOR OFFICE FOR THE FIRST TIME. WHEN I FIRST MET YOU WE WERE TALKING IN A CAB IN DC, GOING UP TO CAPITAL HILL WITH A 6 BUNCH OF OTHER FOLKS FROM THE BAY AREA TO GET THAT MONEY FOR 7 8 BART SFO, WE WERE ALL GOING FOR A BIG SLUG OF MONEY. WHEN WE GET BACK HOME; WE DIDN'T COORDINATE AS WELL AS WE DID TODAY. 9 10 IT TOOK A LONG TIME TO GET CLIPPER, THEN WHEN WE HAD THE PANDEMIC YOU CALLED FOR THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE FOR TRANSIT 11 AND THAT WAS INSTRUMENTAL. AND NOW WE HAVE RNM REGIONAL 12 NETWORK MANAGEMENT IT'S BEEN GOING FOR 5 TO 6 YEARS. IT'S NOT 13 GOING AWAY AND THE LEVEL OF COORDINATION BETWEEN THE OPERATORS 14 15 IS TEN TIMES AS HIGH AS IT WAS WHEN I CAME INTO THIS REGION IN 16 1989 THAT'S BECAUSE OF YOU SPURRING US ON, NEVER GIVING UP, ALWAYS THERE COULD FOR A GM TO CALL WHEN THEY WERE FRUSTRATED, 17 BEING REDIRECTED. EVERY GM I TALKED TO ABOUT YOU HAS HAD A 18 CONVERSATION WITH YOU OVER THE LAST 6 TO 8 YEARS THAT'S BEEN 19 INSTRUMENTAL TO THIS PROCESS, AND NOW OUR ATTEMPT TO TRY TO 20 21 KNIT A VERY COMPLEX NINE COUNTIES WITH VERY DIFFERENT LOCAL NEEDS INTO A REGION ONE MORE TIME TO FUND OUR TRANSIT. WELL 22 DONE, SIR, WELL DONE. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [APPLAUSE] 23 24

25 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JANE KRAEMER.

JANUARY 22, 2025

2 SPEAKER: JAMES SPERING, OF THE MANY WAYS THAT I THINK ABOUT 3 YOU, I COULD CHARACTERIZE YOU AS PATIENTLY NOT BASHFUL, TRANSLATED, THAT MEANS AT THE END OF THE MEETING YOU CAN 4 5 ALWAYS BE COUNTED ON TO SAY WHAT WASN'T SAID. THANK YOU FOR THAT. I THINK, ALSO -- I THANK YOU, ALSO, FOR THE CLARITY OF 6 YOUR INSIGHT AND THE CLARITY OF YOUR ETHICS. AND I THINK THE 7 8 GLUE IS YOUR OPENNESS TO WHEN'S GOING ON AROUND YOU AND WHAT'S BEING SAID AROUND YOU. AND I THINK THAT RESOLVES INTO 9 10 SOMETHING VERY DEAR, CALLED "TRUST." THANK YOU.

11

1

12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DAN MANTON. THERE WE GO. OH, PARDON ME.
13 I'M SORRY. SO EXCITED, I THOUGHT EVERYONE WAS HERE FOR
14 COMMISSIONER SPERING. [LAUGHTER] WE'LL TAKE ALETA DUPREE NEXT.
15

16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ AND MEMBERS. A 17 LITE D FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I'M VERY GRATEFUL. I'M SURPRISED. I WAS HOPING WE WERE GOING TO HAVE A 18 40th ANNIVERSARY PARTY FOR JIM HERE. [LAUGHTER] AND I THINK 19 BACK, A WHILE BACK, IT'S HAPPENED A NUMBER OF TIMES, I WOULD 20 21 COME IN THE ROOM AND JIM WOULD ALWAYS SAY, "WELL, WELCOME BACK IN-PERSON." THANK YOU FOR THAT. HOSPITALITY, AS I SAID BEFORE 22 ABOUT FELLOW COMMISSIONER DAVID RABBITT, THANK YOU FOR THE 23 HOSPITALITY, ALL OF THESE DEEP THINGS YOU HAVE DONE, AT 24 25 CLIPPER, AND PLANNING, PLANNING IS HARD. HARD FOR ME TO DIGEST



PLANNING. BUT YOU BREAK DOWN PLANNING FOR ME, SO IT'S MORE 1 EASILY UNDERSTANDABLE. SO, YEAH, JIM, I'M GOING TO MISS YOU. 2 WE SHOULD DO A 40TH ANNIVERSARY PARTY ANYWAY. THANK YOU. 3 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU. 6 7 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NEXT UP IS AMY WORTH. 8 AMY R. WORTH: WELL, JIM SPERING, MY DEAR FRIEND. YOU KNOW, 9 THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF TALK IN THE LAST FEW WEEKS ABOUT THE 10 CHALLENGES OF LOCAL AND REGIONAL GOVERNMENT, WITH THE BAY AREA 11 AS 101 CITIES, NINE COUNTIES, 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES, IT TAKES A 12 LEADER LIKE YOU TO BRING EVERYBODY TOGETHER, WHICH YOU HAVE 13 TRULY DONE OVER THE DECADE. AND AS -- HAVING HAD THE HONOR OF 14 15 WORKING WITH YOU AS A COMMISSIONER, AND THIS HAS BEEN SAID BY 16 YOUR COLLEAGUES, IT'S SUCH A JOY AND HONOR TO WORK WITH YOU, 17 AND I WILL NEVER FORGET THE FIRST VOTE I CAST, THE FIRST DAY ON THE COMMISSION, WAS TALKING TO JIM SPERING, TO VOTE FOR 18 SENATOR DODD FOR CHAIR, AND IT WAS A GREAT DAY. AND IT WAS --19 BUT I JUST THINK -- CANNOT THANK YOU ENOUGH. AND I THINK THE 20 21 OTHER PART OF YOUR WARMTH AND CARING OF ALL YOUR COMMISSIONERS AND ALL THE PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA IS YOUR SENSE OF HUMOR. AND 22 OFTENTIMES YOU PLAY IT STRAIGHT AND COME ACROSS AS THE SERIOUS 23 COMMISSIONER, BUT UNDERLINE THAT, IS THIS WONDERFUL LOVE OF 24 PEOPLE AND CARE AND RESPECT FOR PEOPLE AND HUMOR. AND, ALSO, 25

METROPOLITAN
 TRANSPORTATION
 COMMISSION
 Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 22, 2025

YOUR COMMITMENT TO OUR STAFF. WHEN I LOOK AT THE PHOTOS OF 1 YOUR TRIP TO WASHINGTON AND ALL THE INNOVATIONS YOU HAVE BEEN 2 3 RESPONSIBLE AND FOR HAVING MAKING THOSE TOUGH CLIMBS UP THE MOUNTAINS TO MAKE THEM HAPPEN, WE ARE TRULY BLESSED TO HAVE 4 5 YOU IN 38 YEARS OF SERVICE TO THE BAY AREA. BECAUSE, TRULY, YOU ARE AN AMAZING LEADER, A GREAT INSPIRATION, AND WE ARE SO 6 FORTUNATE. AND ALL OF US THAT HAVE WORKED WITH YOU ARE REALLY 7 8 TRULY BLESSED TO HAVE BEEN PART OF YOUR LIFE AND HAVING YOU PART OF OUR LIVES AND TO MAKE THE REGION BETTER AND THIS 9 COMMISSION IS SO MUCH A RESULT OF YOUR PERSONAL AND 10 PROFESSIONAL COMMITMENT TO THIS WHOLE WONDERFUL PROCESS AND 11 WONDERFUL EXISTENCE OF REGIONAL GOVERNMENT. SO, 12 CONGRATULATIONS. ENJOY RETIREMENT. THE IT'S A GREAT THING TO 13 DO AND THANK YOU, AGAIN. 14 15 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC SPEAKERS. 17 18 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. SO, JIM IS VERY GRATEFUL FOR 19 THAT. SO, THANK YOU. LET'S TAKE A VOTE. WE'RE ALL GOING TO COME DOWN, GOING TO TAKE A PHOTO OF THE COMMISSION WITH FORMER 20 COMMISSIONERS AS WELL. THANK YOU FOR WEARING YOUR SUIT JACKETS 21 TO BE IN THE PHOTO. IT'S GOING TO BE BEAUTIFUL. SO WHY DON'T 22 23 WE CALL THE ROLL

24



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT. WITH A MOTION BY JOSEFOWITZ, SECOND BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN? EDDIE AHN: AYE. SPEAKER: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: UPON COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?



```
1
    VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE.
2
3
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN?
4
5
    REBECCA KAPLAN: AYE.
6
7
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS? ON.
8
9
    STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: AYE.
10
11
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?
12
13
    SUE NOACK: AYE.
14
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
15
16
    GINA PAPAN: YES.
17
18
19
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?
20
21
    DAVID RABBITT: AYE.
22
23
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING?
24
    JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.
25
```



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
PRESENT.

4

1

5 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO COMMISSIONER SPERING WILL BE
6 GETTING BOTH HIS RESOLUTION AND COMMEMORATIVE GAVEL BECAUSE
7 APPARENTLY HE DID NOT GET THAT WHEN HE WAS CHAIR IN THE -- I
8 DIDN'T KNOW -- SO HE GETS BOTH. SO COMMISSIONERS, IF YOU
9 WOULDN'T MIND COMING DOWN TO THE PHOTO, SENATOR, ANDY, AMY.
10 [STAND BY] [STAND BY] [STAND BY] [MEETING WILL RESUME
11 SHORTLY].

12

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY EVERYBODY. PARTY'S OVER. TIME 13 TO GET DOWN TO SOME -- TIME TO GET DOWN TO SOME WORK. AND BY 14 15 WORK, I MEAN LISTENING TO STAFF REPORTS AND VOTING. THIS IS 16 THE AUTHORITY OF THE CHAIR AT WORK HERE. DO I GET THE GAVEL? NO. I'M NOT. YEAH. EXACTLY. I GOT A SHINY GAVEL. 17 CONGRATULATIONS. OKAY. WELL, THAT WAS WONDERFUL. I AM -- SO, 18 IT IS NOW 110 -- IT'S LIKE 11:05 AND WE HAVEN'T EACH GOTTEN 19 STARTED. SO, I'M GOING -- I THINK WE'RE GOING TO, MAYBE, WITH 20 RESPECT TO VICE CHAIR BALDINI, IF IT'S OKAY, MAYBE JUST, SORT 21 OF, TAKE THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL'S REPORT IN WRITING. IS 22 23 THAT OKAY? OKAY. VICE CHAIR BALDINI. YES. OKAY.

JANUARY 22, 2025

1	MICHAEL BALDINI: WITH THAT, I ALSO HAVE A GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO
2	SENATOR DODD AS KIND OF LIKE EXTENDED FAMILY, ITS
3	CONSTITUENCIES. AND I HAVE SERVED WITH HIS HIS SON, JEFF,
4	ON THE NAPA COLLEGE BOARD, I WAS THERE FOR 20 YEARS. JUST COME
5	UP WHEN YOU HAVE TIME, WE'LL TEACH YOU ALL ABOUT ANALOGY.
6	
7	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ANALOGY. THERE WE GO.
8	
9	GINA PAPAN: THAT'S THE WORD.
10	
11	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THAT'S THE WORD. WHY DOES IT HAVE
12	AN OHM? EITHER GREEK OR SOMETHING THEY PUT OHM THERE. GINA,
13	WHAT'S GOING ON? OKAY.
14	
15	GINA PAPAN: HEY. YOU'RE ONE OF US. COME ON.
16	
17	V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: VICE CHAIR BALDINI, THANK YOU VERY
18	MUCH FOR YOUR UNDERSTANDING. OKAY. LET'S DO A QUICK EXECUTIVE
19	DIRECTOR'S REPORT.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M SORRY. BEFORE WE DO, I HAVE RECEIVED
22	NOTHING IN WRITING AND NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HAS RAISED
23	THEIR HAND FOR THIS ITEM.
24	



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: GREAT. GOOD JOB, PUBLIC. EXECUTIVE
 DIRECTOR, ANDY. CAN WE DO A QUICK EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT?
 3

ANDREW FREMIER: SURE, THANK YOU VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND 4 5 MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. LOOK, I DO WANT TO SPEND ONE SECOND AS REPRESENTING A BUNCH OF STAFF THAT DO ALSO REALLY 6 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT SENATOR DODD AND COMMISSIONER RABBITT 7 8 HAD TO COME IN SECOND FIDDLE TO COMMISSIONER SPERING. BUT, YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER SPERING IS CERTAINLY ONE OF THOSE 9 COMMISSIONERS THAT REALLY DID ENGAGE WITH OUR STAFF. WE HAD AT 10 THE OPPORTUNITY AT THE CHRISTMAS PARTY TO CELEBRATE HIM AND HE 11 MADE THE EFFORT TO COME DOWN FOR THE AFTERNOON AND REALLY 12 ACKNOWLEDGED AS HE SAID THIS IDEA THAT HE THINKS HE'S A SMALL 13 PLAYER AND IT'S REALLY THE STAFF DOING THE WORK AND WE 14 15 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT HE REALLY TOOK JIM'S ADVICE AND I KNOW 16 PERSONALLY I HAVE MANY STEPS OF THE WAY I THINK ALIX WOULDN'T BE HERE WITHOUT JIM'S SUPPORT AND I THINK JIM HAD SOMETHING TO 17 DO WITH MY LAST THREE JOBS AND SO I PERSONALLY WANT TO THANK 18 YOU, JIM FOR YOUR TIME BUT I WANT TO SAY A COUPLE OF THINGS 19 THAT I THINK ARE IMPORTANT IN THIS REPORT AND IT'S CARRYING ON 20 THE DEPARTURE THEME, WE HAVE LOST ANDREA VISVESHWARA, AND KATE 21 H AS YOU KNOW, THEY WERE BOTH VERY INSTRUMENTAL IN THE WORK 22 THAT WE DID IN HOUSING WE WANT TO THANK THEM FOR REALLY 23 BECOMING VERY INTEGRAL PARTS OF THE MTC TEAM THEY WERE MUCH 24 BROADER THAN JUST IN THE HOUSING SPACE AND WE'RE GOING TO MISS 25

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

JANUARY 22, 2025

THEM BUT OUR LOSS. GAIN FOR ANDREA AND KATE WILL CONTINUE TO 1 WORK WITH US DIRECTLY IN RETURNING ROLE IN THE HOUSING 2 3 ENVIRONMENT. BUT WE HAVE CONTINUED TO REPLACE FOLKS, AND WE HAVE GOT A COUPLE OF NEW APPOINTMENTS, ONE WE TOOK ONE FROM 4 5 CITY OF OAKLAND, TONY, ONE WE TOOK FROM CALTRANS, DAVID MANN WE ALSO HAVE GENERAL COUNSEL OR SENIOR COUNSEL -- [LAUGHTER]. 6 -- REPLACEMENT SCOTT, FROM BURLINGAME SOMEWHERE ON THE 7 8 PENINSULA, WE CONTINUE TO BRING PEOPLE FROM ALL OVER THE REGION AND PART OF THE TEAM THAT KEEPS THE NEW CAR SMELL IN 9 THE BUILDING. JOSEPH WHITE WILL ALSO HERE. ONE MORE SAD PIECE 10 OF NOTE DONNA FLETCHER WHO IS ONE OF OUR STAFF AND CONTRACTS, 11 ONE OF THE HARDEST WORKING, FRIENDLIEST PEOPLE THAT I EVER MET 12 IN MY ENTIRE LIFE, NOT ONLY PROFESSIONALLY, PASSED AWAY AFTER 13 A LONG ILLNESS. WE'RE GOING TO MISS HER. BUT I DID WANT TO 14 15 ACKNOWLEDGE THAT IN THIS DISCUSSION. WE ALSO WANTED TO TALK 16 ABOUT SOMETHING I MENTIONED LAST MONTH, AND ALIX BOCKELMAN EXECUTED FOR ME WHERE WE SIGNED OFF WITH A BUNCH OF TRANSIT 17 OPERATORS ON THE INFRASTRUCTURE EOUITY INFRASTRUCTURE AND 18 PROJECT PLEDGE UNLIKE THE ADMINISTRATION WE ARE FOCUSED IN 19 THIS SPACE IT WAS SIGNED OFF BY MANY MEMBERS IN FACT MOST OF 20 21 THE MEMBERS IN OUR TRANSIT COMMUNITY AS WELL AS THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA CONFERENCE OF MINORITY TRANSPORTATION OFFICIALS 22 LOTS OF FOLKS SPOKE AT THE EVENT AND WE MEAN TO STICK UP WITH 23 WHAT ITS GOALS ARE WHICH IS REALLY TO MAKE SURE THAT WE PAY 24 ATTENTION TO HISTORICALLY UNDERUTILIZED BUSINESSES AND REALLY 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

MAKE SURE THAT WE ARE IN OUR CONTRACTING TO HELP THEM BE A 1 PART OF A VERY IMPORTANT COMMUNITY. I ALSO WANT TO MENTION 2 3 THAT COMMISSIONER RABBITT ALONG WITH FORMER COMMISSIONER DAME SON CONNOLY AND CONGRESSMAN JARED HUFFMAN HOSTED THE 4 5 CELEBRATION OF THE OPENING OF THE NORTH PETALUMA SMART STATION IT'S ALSO TIED TO WORK THAT MTC HAS DONE ALONG WITH ABAG IN 6 BRINGING SOME AFFORDABLE AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY MONEYS TO 7 8 THAT PROJECT TO BUILD 131 UNIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECT NEAR THE STATION. WE ALSO SUCCESSFULLY ADDED REGIONAL MEASURE THREE 9 10 FINAL TOLL, AND WE ARE, DEREK ASSURES ME, COLLECTING THAT 11 DOLLAR AND LOOK FORWARD TO PUTTING IT TO SOME GOOD WORK. FINALLY, I JUST WANTED TO MENTION THAT I'M HONORED TO HAVE 12 BEEN APPOINTED TO THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION 13 FEDERAL SYSTEM FUNDING ALTERNATIVE ADVISORY BOARD THAT WAS 14 ACTUALLY A REQUIREMENT OF THE BILL ACT, AND I'M HONORED TO 15 16 REPRESENT TOLL OPERATORS AND OWNERS AND ALSO REPRESENT THE COMMISSION IN THAT SPACE. IT'S REALLY DESIGNED TO HELP THE 17 NATION MOVE FORWARD IN HOW WE DEAL WITH THE CHANGE IN THE 18 AMOUNT OF ENERGY THAT THE GAS TAX COULD BRING TO OUR 19 INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT AND COME UP WITH ALTERNATIVE METHODS 20 TO KEEP OUR SYSTEM STRONG. AND WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER 21 22 ANY QUESTIONS.

23



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD ENJOY 1 THAT BILL COMMITTEE WHILE IT LASTS. ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? 2 3 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 4 5 COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE: I DON'T SEE ANY IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND 6 THERE IS NO ONE WHO HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM. 7 8 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: GREAT. SO, AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. AGENDA ITEM NINE. CONSENT 9 CALENDAR, ITEMS 9A THROUGH 9F. DO I HAVE A MOTION? 10 11 REBECCA KAPLAN: SO MOVED. 12 13 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER KAPLAN. 14 15 SECONDED, COMMISSIONER RABBITT. PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? 16 SEEING NONE. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? NO. TERRIFIC. SO -17 _ 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WAIT. WAIT. YES, THERE ARE. 19 20 21 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OH THERE ARE? 22 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JUST ONE. NICE TRY. NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING. AMY SIMPSON HAS HER HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. GO 24 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



1 SPEAKER: JUST TO CLARIFY, DOES THIS INCLUDE 9B, THE MTC --2 3 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES. 4 5 SPEAKER: YES? 6 7 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. 9 SPEAKER: YEAH, I'M CALLING TO VOICE SUPPORT FOR ADDING BUS 10 11 SERVICE ACROSS THE SAN MATEO -- BETWEEN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND ALAMEDA COUNTY ACROSS THE HIGHWAY 92 BRIDGE. THAT'S ALL I HAVE 12 TO SAY. IT'S SOMETHING THAT I FEEL PASSIONATELY ABOUT, AND I 13 HOPE THAT THIS WILL BE ADDED BACK TO THE PRIORITY, AND THAT WE 14 CAN FOLLOW SONOMA COUNTY'S EXAMPLE OF, YOU KNOW, DIVERTING 15 16 MONEY TO FUND IT. 17 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU, AMY. 18 19 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. 20 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CASS CHIANG, AND, 23 AGAIN, THIS IS FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR. 24 SPEAKER: YES, HELLO, THIS INCLUDED 9B, CORRECT? 25



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAT IS CORRECT. 3 SPEAKER: THAT'S MY KID'S ENGAGEMENT. MY NAME IS ALLISON 4 5 CHIANG, I LIVED IN SAN FRANCISCO FOR MANY YEARS. MY FAMILY IS A ONE CAR HOUSEHOLD WE HAVE TO CAREFULLY PLAN OUR TRAVEL MANY 6 LOCATIONS WE CAN'T WALK TO. PUBLIC TRANSIT OPTIONS ARE 7 8 GUARANTEED FREEDOM FOR FOLKS WHO CAN'T OPERATE A MOTOR VEHICLE OR WHO CAN'T AFFORD TO OWN A PRIVATE CAR THEREFORE I SUPPORT 9 THE MTC ORIGINAL PLAN TO EXPAND BUS SERVICE BETWEEN ALAMEDA 10 AND CAN MAT COUNTIES ALONG THE HIGHWAY 92 CORRIDOR. REDUCING 11 AIR POLLUTION, LAST THING WE SHOULD DO IS PIT GREEN SOLUTIONS 12 AGAINST EACH OTHER I THINK SPECIFICALLY THE SUGGESTION THAT WE 13 DIVERT FUNDS FROM THE ESSENTIAL HILLSDALE FREMONT BUS ROUTE TO 14 REDWOOD CITY FERRY SERVICE WHEN THE REGION CLEARLY NEEDS 15 16 INVESTMENT IN BOTH SERVICES I ASK YOU TO THINK STRATEGICALLY AND PRIORITIZE MASS TRANSIT OPTIONS SO ALL COMMUNITIES HAVE 17 EOUAL ACCESS TO TRANSIT ALL AROUND THE REGION AS WELL AS CLEAN 18 AIR TO BREATHE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. 19 20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED 21 22 FOR THIS ITEM. 23 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. ROLL CALL. 24 25



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION KAPLAN SECOND RABBITT. JOSEFOWITZ. V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN? EDDIE AHN: AYE CANEPA? DAVID CANEPA: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EZZY ASHCRAFT? MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? VICTORIA FLEMING: YES. CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN? **REBECCA KAPLAN: YES.** CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?



NATHAN MILEY: YES MOULTON-PETERS? COMMISSIONER NOACK? PAPAN? 1 2 3 GINA PAPAN: YES . 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT? 6 7 DAVID RABBITT: YES. 8 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING? 10 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 13 14 PRESENT. 15 16 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ITEM TEN PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT. 17 COMMISSIONER SPERING? 18 JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN. I WANT TO THANK 19 EDDIE AHN MY VICE CHAIR THIS WILL BE MY LAST REPORT FROM THE 20 PLANNING COMMITTEE. THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE MET 21 22 JANUARY 10TH, 2025 AND REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR 23 APPROVAL ITEM TEN MTC RESOLUTION 4687 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR ACTION BY THE COMMISSION. TODAY THIS 24 ACTION ITEM IS A KEY MILESTONE SECOND OF FOUR APPROVAL 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

MILESTONES AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ 1 REGIONAL PLAN FOR TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND ECONOMY AND THE 2 3 ENVIRONMENT IT REPRESENTS 18 MONTHS OF WORK TO DATE THAT HAS ENGAGED THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS, PUBLIC AGENCIES, NON-4 5 PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS, THE VARIOUS COMPONENTS OF THIS ACTION ITEM HAVE BEEN BEFORE THE PLANNING COMMITTEE REGULARLY AND 6 DURING THIS TIME DURING THAT TIME PERIOD, INCLUDED IN THE 7 8 ACTION ITEM ARE THE 35 STRATEGIES AT THE CORE OF THE PLAN, AS WELL AS THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, 9 RESILIENT PROJECTS ALL OF WHICH REFLECT POST-PANDEMIC 10 CONDITIONS AND TIGHTER FISCAL CIRCUMSTANCES. DESPITE THE LOWER 11 FUNDING ESTIMATES, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ INTEGRATES A NEW 12 VISION FOR THE BAY AREA TRANSIT AND PUTS RIDERS FIRST AND 13 FOCUSES ON FREQUENCY, RELIABILITY, AND SAFETY, EXPANDING 14 15 CLIMATE STRATEGIES CRAFTED TO HELP US MEET EVEN MORE DIFFICULT 16 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS IN HOUSING AND HAND USE STRATEGIES THAT HELP TO ADVANCE EQUITY, AFFORDABILITY, AND SUSTAINABILITY 17 18 GOALS. LAST WEEK THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVED A PARALLEL RESOLUTION DIRECTING STAFF TO STUDY AND ANALYZE THE FINAL 19 BLUEPRINT AND REPORT BACK TO -- ON THE OUTCOMES AND FINDINGS 20 THIS SPRING. MTC RESOLUTION 4687 WOULD PROVIDE THE SAME 21 22 DIRECTION. THIS SPRING THE COMMISSION AND BOARD WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO REVIEW THE PLAN AND PERFORMANCE INCLUDING ON 23 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS PRIOR TO TAKING ANY ACTION TO ADVANCE 24



INTO THE CEQA PROCESS. MR. CHAIRMAN, I MOVE APPROVAL OF 1 2 RESOLUTION 4687. 3 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. DO 4 5 I HAVE A SECOND? COMMISSIONER KAPLAN? 6 JAMES P. SPERING: MR. CHAIRMAN, I JUST WANT TO THANK MATT AND 7 8 DAVE VAUTIN, AND THEIR WHOLE STAFF. I MEAN, THIS IS A MAJOR EFFORT AND ACCOMPLISHMENT, AND I JUST WANT TO THANK THE STAFF 9 FOR THEIR GOOD WORK ON THIS. AND THE ONE THING THEY DID 10 DEMONSTRATE IS THEY DID LISTEN AND THEY HAVE INCORPORATED A 11 LOT OF THE SUGGESTIONS THAT COMMISSIONERS HAVE MADE. SO, THANK 12 YOU, STAFF. 13 14 15 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 16 GINA PAPAN: BEFORE WE GO THROUGH THE VOTE HERE, THANK YOU TO 17 STAFF FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK AND EFFORT, AND PARTICULARLY WITH 18 MANY OF THE PROJECTS REGIONAL SPEAKING, I KNOW WE HAVE HAD 19 MAJOR DISCUSSIONS MOVING FORWARD. SO, THANK YOU FOR WORKING 20 21 WITH US, PARTICULARLY ON THE REDWOOD CITY PORT AND CONNECTING US TO OAKLAND THERE. STRATEGY T5 IS IMPLEMENTED, I UNDERSTAND. 22 IT'S A 30-YEAR PLAN TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES HERE. THE 23 IMPLEMENTATION OF ADDITIONAL HIGHWAY PRICING STRATEGIES THAT 24 WILL REQUIRE A LOT, I THINK, OUTREACH AND ANALYSIS BEFORE THE 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

RECOMMENDATION IS BROUGHT TO THE COMMISSION HERE. I WOULD HATE 1 TO SEE THIS IMPACT OUR REGIONAL EFFORTS FOR FUNDING 2 3 TRANSPORTATION. CAN I GET SOME CONFIRMATION FROM THE STAFF HERE THAT THIS STRATEGY IS BEING INCLUDED FOR PLANNING 4 5 PURPOSES, AND THAT THE COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS HERE 6 WILL HAVE AMPLE TIME TO RECONFIRM THAT MOVING FORWARD HERE? BECAUSE, AGAIN, WE'RE TRYING TO PUT TOGETHER A REGIONAL 7 8 MEASURE HERE. THIS STRATEGY T5 CLEARLY STATES ADDITIONAL HIGHWAY PRICING THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO IF WE CAN REALLY 9 10 WORK TOGETHER HERE IF WE CAN CONFIRM THAT THIS IS FOR PLANNING PURPOSES, AND THAT IT WILL COME BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE BEFORE, 11 I THINK, MANY OF THE ELECTED PEOPLE ARE -- YOU CAN IMAGINE, 12 THIS COMMISSION TELLING EVERYONE THAT YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE 13 TOLL ROADS IN ALL OF YOUR JURISDICTIONS. SO, I GET WHY WE HAVE 14 15 THIS, AND THE MAJOR PURPOSE HERE, BUT CAN I GET SOME 16 CONFIRMATION FROM STAFF THAT IT WILL COME BACK TO THE 17 COMMITTEE?

18

ALIX BOCKELMAN: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ALIX BOCKELMAN, I
CAN CERTAINLY START. THIS IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, SO IT IS
A LONG RANGE PLAN. YOU KNOW, WHETHER IT'S THE TRANSPORTATION
LIST OR THE STRATEGIES, THERE IS A LOT OF IMPLEMENTATION STEPS
AND FUNDING STEPS THAT ARE NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT THE PLAN. SO,
YES, THIS IS A PLAN, AN IMPORTANT PLAN, BUT THERE WOULD BE A
LOT OF -- YOU KNOW, BEFORE BEING ABLE TO IMPLEMENT A NEXT

JANUARY 22, 2025

GENERATION FREEWAY PRICING, THERE WOULD BE A LOT MORE
 APPROVALS NEEDED AT A LOT OF DIFFERENT LEVELS. SO CERTAINLY
 THE TEAM CAN ADD TO THAT IF THEY WOULD LIKE. BUT THAT'S THE
 PLAN.

5

GINA PAPAN: I THINK THIS'S SUFFICIENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY
JURISDICTION, THE PEOPLE I REPRESENT, A LOT OF PEOPLE GREATLY
APPRECIATE THAT AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH EVERYONE
AS THIS PLAN MOVES FORWARD. THANK YOU.

10

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO I'M GOING TO BE CHAIR FOR A 11 SECOND. SO I GET TO SAY THINGS NOW, EXCITING. I JUST WANT TO, 12 FIRST PIGGYBACK ON WHAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENT. I THINK 13 THE POINT OF THIS PLAN IS TO TRY AND PRESENT A REALISTIC BUT 14 15 AMBITIOUS VISION FOR THE FUTURE OF THE BAY AREA AND THE IDEA 16 OF ADDING TENS OF BILLIONS OF DOLLARS OF NEW REVENUE FROM TOLLING, HIGHWAY PRICING, PARKING, VMT CHARGES IN ADDITION TO 17 THE VMT CHARGES ARE GOING TO BE PUT ON BY THE STATE, EVEN IF 18 THOSE ARE THINGS THAT SOME OF US ON THIS DAIS MAY THINK ARE 19 GOOD, IS NOT REALISTIC. IT JUST DOESN'T PASS THE SMELL TEST. 20 21 THAT IS NOT THINGS THAT ARE GOING TO HAPPEN IN A WAY THAT'S NOT LIKE A WAY THAT GENERATES NEW REVENUE MAYBE IF THEY'RE 22 REVENUE NEUTRAL MAYBE LIKE WE'RE GOING TO TOLL THE HIGHWAY BUT 23 WE'RE GOING TO REDUCE YOUR SALES TAX OR WE'RE GOING TO CHARGE 24 YOU FOR PARKING BUT WE'RE GOING TO REDUCE YOUR SALES TAX BUT I 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

JUST DON'T SEE HOW WE CAN STAND BEHIND THIS PLAN AND THIS IS A 1 CENTRAL ELEMENT OF THIS PLAN THE NEW REVENUE THAT'S GENERATED 2 3 BY THIS AND SAY THAT THIS IS A REALISTIC PLAN FOR THE BAY AREA AND SO I KNOW WE'RE NOT APPROVING THE PLAN TODAY BUT I REALLY 4 5 HOPE THAT AS WE GO FORWARD WE CAN CONSIDER THIS NEW REVENUE GENERATION BECAUSE I THINK IT'S MEANINGFULLY UNDERMINES THE 6 PURPOSE OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. AND WE SPEND SO MUCH TIME 7 8 ON THIS PLAN WE SPEND NOT ONLY OUR TIME BUT EVERY TIME WE GET A PRESENTATION ABOUT THIS IT'S LIKE 10,000 HOURS OF PUBLIC 9 OUTREACH AND EVERY SINGLE CITY AND EVERY COUNTY AND EVERY 10 TRANSIT AGENCY IS PUTTING IN THEIR TIME INTO THIS AND I THINK 11 WU THE OBLIGATION TO NOT JUST -- BUT TO EVERYBODY IN THIS 12 REGION TO PUT FORWARD OUR BEST GUESS AT WHAT IS REALISTIC AND 13 AMBITIOUS SO I HOPE THAT WE RECONSIDER THAT. AND THE SECOND 14 THING I WANT TO SAY WE RECEIVED THIS LETTER FROM TRANSFORM 15 16 ABOUT THE AMOUNT OF HIGHWAY WIDENING THAT'S IN THIS PLAN AND I THINK A LOT OF US KNOW THAT IS OBVIOUSLY -- STAFF KNOWS THAT 17 BUT ONE OF THE THINGS I WANTED TO ASK ABOUT IS THAT IT SAYS 18 THERE ARE A NUMBER OF HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECTS CAPACITY 19 ADDITIONS WHICH ARE CLASSIFIED AS INTERCHANGES SO NEED TO BE 20 ACTUALLY CALLED OUT AS HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECTS BECAUSE OF 21 22 SOME TECHNICALITY AROUND EPA CONFORMITY ANALYSIS GIVING THEM A PASS AND TO QUOTE TRANSFORM'S LETTER WHEN THEY ARE INCLUDED IN 23 IT WOULD QUADRUPLE THE AMOUNT OF HIGHWAY CAPACITY INVESTMENTS 24



IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SO CAN I ASK STAFF TO COMMENT ON THAT
 LETTER? IS.

3

DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. DAVE VAUTIN PLANNING 4 5 DIRECTOR. YES. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO CLARIFY A COUPLE OF THINGS. THE PLAN INCLUDES FUNDING FOR HIGHWAY PROJECTS. 6 HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS ACCOUNT FOR .7% OF ALL 7 8 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING EXPENDITURES. NOW THE TRANSFORM LETTER SPEAKS TO SOME OTHER PROJECT TYPES THAT ARE ALSO IN THE 9 HIGHWAY INVESTMENT CATEGORY, SUCH AS INTERCHANGE 10 MODERNIZATION, OR SHORT LENGTH AUXILIARY LANES. BOTH THE 11 FEDERAL AND STATE GOVERNMENT IDENTIFY THESE PROJECTS AS VMT 12 AND GHG NEUTRAL. WE ALIGNED WITH THAT GUIDANCE IN OUR 13 PLANNING, AND CHARACTERIZE THEM IN THE SAME MANNER. THESE ARE 14 15 PROJECTS WHERE THERE MAY BE AN INTERCHANGE, PERHAPS A RAMP HAS 16 EITHER -- IS REDESIGNED OR PERHAPS HAS AN ADDITIONAL LANE ADDED ON JUST THE RAMP WITHOUT ANY, SORT OF, THROUGH CAPACITY, 17 THROUGH THE INTERCHANGE BEING ADDED. UNDER THOSE GUIDELINES, 18 THAT PROJECT IS CONSIDERED A NON-CAPACITY PROJECT, BECAUSE 19 IT'S NOT INDUCING ADDITIONAL THROUGH TRAVEL ALONG THE FREEWAY 20 21 CORRIDOR. SO, I THINK WE WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THOSE PROJECTS 22 ARE IN THE LIST. THEY'RE REFLECTED IN A SECOND FREEWAY CATEGORY FOR PROJECTS THAT ARE OF THAT NON-CAPACITY STATUTES. 23 AND EVEN THOSE PROJECTS ONLY ACCOUNT FOR ANOTHER 1.4% OF 24 25 EXPENDITURES, RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION.

1

JANUARY 22, 2025

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. 2 3 WHICH, ARE INFORM, DO I NOT FIND VERY CONVINCING THAT ADDING HIGHWAY LANES CAN INTERCHANGE CONTEXT AND WOULD EXPECT THAT 4 5 WOULD NOT INDUCE DEMAND EVIDENCE SHOWS THAT IT WOULD AND I HOPE WE TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT REGARDING WE DON'T PUT THOSE 6 PROJECTS IN THE PLAN BUT THAT BEING HONEST WITH OURSELVES WITH 7 8 THE REGION ABOUT WHAT THE IMPACT OF FUNDING HIGHWAY 9 INTERCHANGE EXPANSIONS WOULD BE. YES? 10 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: MR. CHAIR, I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH YOUR 11 REMARKS BY THE WAY I WANTED TO APOLOGIZE TO EVERYONE I HAVE TO 12 LEAVE I HAVE GOT TO BE ON A BUS TO A TRAIN TO SACRAMENTO BUT 13 IT WAS A PLEASURE TO HEAR ALL THE WONDERFUL COMMENTS WE HAD 14 15 TODAY. TO THANK YOU, THANK YOU. 16 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER 17 18 RABBITT? 19

20 DAVID RABBITT: I APPRECIATE THAT VERY MUCH I APPRECIATE YOUR 21 COMMENTS. COMING FROM A COUNTY THAT WAS PROBABLY 101 HIGHWAY 22 WHEN NOT THAT LONG AGO WITH LEFT TURN LANES AND DRIVEWAYS AND 23 THAT MEANT THAT WAS INCREDIBLY DANGEROUS AND OF COURSE NOW 24 WE'RE AT THE TAIL END OF HIGHWAY WIDENING PROJECT IN MY MIND 25 THAT WIDENING IS STRICTLY A SAFETY ISSUE BECAUSE I KNOW WE'RE

JANUARY 22, 2025

ALLEVIATING VERTICAL CURVES, THE HORIZONTAL CURVE, I CAN POINT 1 OUT A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT INTERCHANGES THAT ALSO REQUIRE 2 3 AUXILIARY LANES OR INTERCHANGES THAT DUE TO THE DEVELOPMENTS THAT WE'RE ALL TRYING TO PUSH FORWARD AND CREATE DIFFERENT 4 5 DEMANDS ON THOSE INTERCHANGES THAT WERE NOT ORIGINALLY BUILT FOR NEEDING PERHAPS A TWO LANE RAMP INSTEAD OF A ONE LANE RAMP 6 THAT IS WIDENING IN MY MIND NOT THAT'S NOT AT ALL BUT I THINK 7 8 IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT WE CONTINUE TO PUSH FORWARD ON SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS THAT WE DON'T LOSE SIGHT OF MAKING SURE 9 THAT WE'RE PROVIDING FOLKS THE BEST POSSIBLE TRAVEL EXPERIENCE 10 IN TERMS OF SAFETY OUT THERE ANOTHER QUICK COMMENT ON THE PLAN 11 I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE LISTENING AND INCLUDING SMART 12 EXTENSION IN THERE AND KNOW THERE ARE SOME OTHER EXTENSIONS I 13 REALLY DO APPRECIATE THAT AND I THINK IT PUTS SMART IN A GOOD 14 15 PLACE GOING FORWARD AND OF COURSE ULTIMATELY THE FUNDING OF 16 THAT PROJECT WILL RISE AND FALL ON ITS OWN BUT AT LEAST WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO GO AFTER THAT AND LASTLY BROUGHT UP ABAG 17 MEETING AND I VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE RESILIENCY PROJECTS A 18 LOT OF RESILIENCY WE HAVE IN THE PLAN TODAY IS REALLY ABOUT 19 RISE AND OF COURSE THAT'S HUGE THREAT BUT IN OUR COUNTY IN 20 21 LIGHT OF WHAT'S HAPPENING IN LOS ANGELES AND PACIFIC PALISADES AND ALTADENA, AND WHAT HAPPENED IN SANTA ROSA. WHEN WE TALK 22 ABOUT RESILIENCY IT'S ALMOST ALWAYS TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF 23 THE FIRE RISK. AND I KNOW THAT WE, YOU KNOW WE'RE -- THE OPEN 24 SPACE ACQUISITIONS. AND I THINK AS WE GO FORWARD, WE'RE GOING 25

JANUARY 22, 2025

TO HAVE TO PUT HIGHER EMPHASIS ON OPEN SPACE BUT ALSO HOW 1 WE'RE DEALING WITH VEGETATION WITHIN THAT AND HOW WE'RE 2 3 SAFEGUARD OUR COMMUNITIES GOING FORWARD WITH [INDISCERNIBLE] BREAKS. YOU NAME IT IT'S AN EXPENSIVE PROPOSITION BECAUSE 4 5 APPARENTLY VEGETATION GROWS BACK EACH AND EVERY YEAR. [LAUGHTER] WE HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO. I WANT TO SAY THANK 6 YOU FOR THAT. THANK YOU FOR THE PLAN. AND REMINISCING THE 7 8 FIRST TIME WE PASSED THE PLANNED BAY AREA WE DID SO IN THE OAKLAND CONVENTION CENTER, DID SO IN A PACKED HOUSE AND HERE 9 WE ARE IN AN UPDATE AND WHO ISN'T STAFF OUT THERE YOU KNOW I 10 THINK IT GOES TO SHOW YOU THAT THE UPROAR OVER PLANNING 11 SOMETIMES UNCALLED FOR AND THE UNIQUE EXPERIENCE JUST 12 APPROXIMATE DIFFERENT DAY-TO-DAY AS WE GO FORWARD. 13 14 15 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER CANEPA? 16

DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO THANK STAFF 17 REALLY WITHIN THIS PLAN AND THANK YOU TO MATT AND YOUR TEAM, 18 CHIRAG, REALLY ACHIEVING BALANCE AND I THINK THE BALANCE IN 19 THE PLAN PUTS US IN GREAT POSITION, I MEAN THERE ARE DIFFERENT 20 21 STAKEHOLDERS THERE IS A LOT OF OUTREACH THAT YOU HAVE DONE BUT THIS COLLECTIVE PLAN COMING TOGETHER HAS REALLY BEEN 22 INCLUSIVE. IT'S NOT EASY TO DO. YOU KNOW, I REALLY WANT TO 23 ADDRESS SOME OF THE COMMENTS. I THINK, ABOUT THE REDWOOD CITY 24 25 FERRY, AND RELATION TO ALAMEDA AND SAN MATEO COUNTY, RELATIVE

JANUARY 22, 2025

TO THE BUS SERVICE. YOU KNOW, MY THOUGHTS CLEARLY ON THE 1 2 REDWOOD CITY FERRY IS THAT IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE FOR A LOT 3 OF REASONS THE PROJECT IS REALLY FAR ALONG AND IT'S RIPE IT'S REALLY IN A SWEET SPOT TO RECEIVE FEDERAL FUNDING. I DON'T 4 5 WANT TO GET TOO WONKY HERE, BUT THE TERMINAL HAS ALREADY BEEN FUNDED. WE'RE LOOKING AT SERVICE, SERVICE DELIVERY. THE SAN 6 MATEO TO ALAMEDA COUNTY PORTION IS REALLY DEFICIT IN TERMS OF 7 8 THE SAN MATEO BRIDGE. DEFICIT OF AN EFFECT THAT REALLY HAVEN'T BEEN A PROJECT SPONSOR THAT'S COMMENT -- AT ONE TIME AC 9 10 TRANSIT, MY UNDERSTANDING, HAD PROVIDED SERVICE. THE OTHER ISSUE, AND FOR THE PUBLIC TO KNOW AND TO REALIZE IS THAT IT'S 11 JUST -- IT'S JUST NOT THERE. THAT THE PLAN, CHIRAG, AND IF YOU 12 CAN ANSWER THIS QUESTION, MY UNDERSTANDING IS THE PLAN, OR AN 13 ITERATION OF THE PLAN WOULD COME BACK IN -- IS IT FOUR YEARS? 14 15 YOU CAN SPEAK TO THAT A LITTLE?

16

CHIRAG RABARI: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. CHIRAG RABARI PLANNED 17 BAY AREA 2050+ PROJECT MANAGER. YES, WE ANTICIPATE THIS PLAN 18 WOULD BE ADOPTED EARLY NEXT YEAR AND WE WOULD GO RIGHT INTO 19 THE PLANNING PROCESS OR THE NEXT PLAN. AND YOU KNOW, WOULD 20 21 ANTICIPATE APPROVAL OF THAT PLAN IN ABOUT ANOTHER, YOU KNOW, FIVE YEARS FROM TODAY. AND I WOULD ALSO ADD WITH RESPECT TO 22 THAT BUS PROJECT, YOU KNOW, IT IS -- THAT BUS PROJECT, 23 CURRENTLY DOES NOT HAVE A SPECIFIC SPONSOR. IT IS ELIGIBLE TO 24 MOVE FORWARD WITH PROJECT DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES. IT IS 25

> This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

1

JANUARY 22, 2025

ELIGIBLE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH INITIAL, YOU KNOW, ENVIRONMENTAL

PLANNING AND WE DO SPECIFICALLY CALL IT OUT IN ONE OF OUR 2 3 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT CATEGORIES AS A PRIORITY PROJECT. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT PROJECT CAN TAKE THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS TO, YOU 4 5 KNOW, FIGURE OUT HOW IT'S GOING TO MOVE FORWARD AND WHEN 6 CIRCUMSTANCES CHANGE WE'LL CERTAINLY BE ELIGIBLE TO BE 7 INCLUDED AS A NAMED PROJECT IN THE NEXT PLAN. 8 DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. AND I WANT PEOPLE TO REALIZE -- AND I 9 10 THINK THE BOARD REALLY HAD A REALLY GOOD PRACTICE ON THIS, AND I THINK DAVID RABBITT, AND SONOMA, THERE ARE -- MY 11 UNDERSTANDING IN TERMS OF THIS PLAN, IS IT \$80 BILLION AND 12 LESS REVENUE, IS THAT CORRECT, CHIRAG? 13 14 CHIRAG RABARI: THAT IS CORRECT, COMMISSIONER. WE HAD ROUGHLY 15 16 \$80 BILLION LESS COMPARED TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN TERMS OF 17 MONEYS AVAILABLE FOR EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT INVESTMENTS, WHICH DID, YOU KNOW, REQUIRE, YOU KNOW, MANY DIFFICULT CHOICES 18 ABOUT PRIORITIES TO INCLUDE. 19 20 DAVID CANEPA: AND SO I THINK, MY UNDERSTANDING IN TERMS OF THE 21 PHILOSOPHY, AND I THINK STAFF WAS CORRECT AND THIS COMMISSION 22 WAS CORRECT IS THAT IF WE TOOK FROM ANOTHER COUNTY OR ANOTHER 23 AREA, THAT JUST -- THAT WASN'T, SORT OF, THE BEST WAY TO GO 24 ABOUT IT, I THINK WHAT WE HAD, SORT OF, TALKED ABOUT IS REALLY 25



LOOKING INWARD AND FIGURING OUT WITHIN OUR COUNTY WHAT
 PROJECTS WE COULD, YOU KNOW, LOOK AT. THAT'S CORRECT, RIGHT
 CHIRAG?

4

5 CHIRAG RABARI: THAT'S CORRECT COMMISSIONER, ONCE WE GOT TO THE POINT OF HAVING DONE QUITE A LOT OF ENGAGEMENT TO GET TO A 6 DRAFT PROJECT LIST THAT WE PRESENTED TO YOU ALL IN DECEMBER, 7 8 THERE WAS NO REMAINING FISCAL CAPACITY, SO, AS WE HEARD COMMENTARY ABOUT OTHER PROJECTS, WHETHER THERE WAS INTEREST, 9 IN ADDING THEM, YOU KNOW, BASED UPON DIRECTION FROM THE 10 COMMITTEE, IT WAS DEEMED TO BE APPROPRIATE TO FIND WITHIN 11 COUNTY PRESENTLY SWAPS THAT WOULD HAVE MINIMAL NET COST AND 12 NET GHG IMPACTS AND THAT WAS THE PROCESS WE PURSUED IN 13 COORDINATING WITH SPONSORS AND OTHER INTERESTED PARTIES WITHIN 14 15 THE COUNTIES.

16

DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE REALLY APPRECIATE ALL
YOUR EFFORTS AND HOW WE'RE MOVING FORWARD. THIS IS BESIDES
RECOGNITION OF THOSE WHO HAVE SERVED US TODAY, THIS IS A
PRETTY SIGNIFICANT DAY FOR US AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND YOUR WORK
IS REALLY MEANINGFUL AND APPRECIATED. SO, THANK YOU, CHIRAG.

23 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

JANUARY 22, 2025

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. THANK YOU, AGAIN, AND THANK YOU, AGAIN, 1 WORKING WITH STAFF ON THIS, AND HOPEFULLY LOOKING AT SOME 2 3 SPECIFIC FERRY MONEY MOVING FORWARD. WE APPRECIATE THAT. I AGREE WITH THE VICE CHAIR ON THE OVERALL VISION AND REALITY 4 5 HERE. BECAUSE WHEN THE PUBLIC GETS AHOLD OF SOME OF THIS, I THINK THERE COULD BE SOME CONCERNS, BUT I DO WANT TO 6 EMPHASIZE, AS COMMISSIONER RABBITT SAID, THE SIGNIFICANCE, THE 7 8 SAFETY CONCERNS OF THE INTERCHANGES CANNOT BE UNDERESTIMATED HERE. WE NEED THEM. WE HAVE TO HAVE THEM. THEY ARE CRITICAL. 9 LIVES ARE BEING LOST. SOME OF THESE SPAGHETTI MESSES OF 10 INTERCHANGES NEED TO BE FIXED. SO, I'M GLAD THEY'RE IN THE 11 PROJECT LIST. BECAUSE I THINK THAT WILL SHOW SIGNIFICANCE IN 12 REALLY THE WHOLE SYSTEM AROUND US WORKING BETTER, AND 13 SIGNIFICANT HE MORE SAFELY. SO, I GET THE CONCERN THERE. BUT 14 WE CANNOT UNDERESTIMATE THE CONCERN OF IMPROVING THESE 15 16 INTERCHANGES. THANK YOU.

17

18 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: IF THERE IS NO OTHER COMMISSIONER
19 COMMENT, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

20

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. I DO HAVE A NUMBER OF PUBLIC
COMMENTS. I'LL FIRST READ INTO THE RECORD THE ITEMS WE
RECEIVED IN WRITING. TWO LETTERS FROM SEAMLESS BAY AREA ADINA
LEVIN, CITY OF FREMONT RAJ SALWAN, CALTRAIN MICHELLE BOUCHARD,
AND TRANSFORM ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS. ALL HAVE BEEN POSTED TO THE



ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED TO YOU VIA E-MAIL. WE'LL FIRST
 GO TO OUR IN-HOUSE SPEAKERS, FIRST UP IS STAN MASPEN FOLLOWED
 BY KRISTEN ZORTMAN. PLEASE APPROACH THE PODIUM. ONE MINUTE.

4

5 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND COMMISSIONERS I WANT TO START OFF BY SAYING I'M KIND OF DISAPPOINTED I DIDN'T 6 COME UP FOR COMMISSIONER SPERING'S ACCOLADES. THERE ARE SO 7 8 MANY I FEEL I SHOULD HAVE COME UP. I AM CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF PORT OF REDWOOD CITY WE WOULD LIKE 9 TO THANK COMMISSIONERS FOR THEIR DILIGENCE INCLUDING A FEW 10 FERRY TERMINAL AT THE PORT OF REDWOOD CITY BUT PLANNED BAY 11 AREA 2050+. WE APPRECIATE STAFF'S EFFORTS AND ANALYSIS FOR THE 12 INCLUSION OF THIS SITE IN THE PLAN. THE PORT HAS ENVISIONED 13 THE FERRY TERMINAL FOR NOT ONLY COMMUTERS AND RESIDENTS BUT AS 14 15 A REGIONAL ASSET ADDRESSING CATASTROPHIC EVENTS SUCH AS 16 EARTHOUAKES AND DISASTERS TO DEPLOY FIRST RESPONDERS AND RESOURCES VIA WATER FROM OUR PORT THIS IS AN OBLIGATION WE 17 HAVE PURSUANT TO OUR FEMA FEDERAL STAGING AREA DESIGNATION 18 WHICH WE RECEIVED IN 2017 AFTER INVESTING \$21 MILLION IN 19 INFRASTRUCTURE TO WITHSTAND 8.9 MAGNITUDE EARTH OUICK IF FIVE 20 FEET OF SEA LEVEL RISE WITH INCLUSION OF FERRY TERMINAL IN THE 21 PLAN THE REGION WILL BENEFIT IN OUR COMPETITIVENESS FOR 22 23 FEDERAL FUNDING VERSUS OTHER SEAPORTS IN THE NATION THIS WILL FURTHER STRENGTHEN THE PORT'S REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE AND 24 TRANSPORTATION AS WELL AS EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS. THANK YOU. 25



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KRISTINE ZORTMAN. 3 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND FELLOW 4 5 COMMISSIONERS. I'M KRISTINE ZORTMAN EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WITH PORT OF REDWOOD CITY. SPECIAL THANKS YOU FOR YOUR 6 CONSIDERATION TODAY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDES FUTURE 7 8 FERRY TERMINAL AT THE PORT OF REDWOOD CITY. SPECIAL THANKS TO COMMISSIONERS CANEPA AND KAPLAN, AS WELL. THE PORT OF REDWOOD 9 CITY IS AN ECONOMIC ENGINE, REGIONAL ASSET. PORTS ARE ABOUT 10 TRANSPORTATION, PEOPLE, CARGO OR RESOURCES, PROVIDING REGIONAL 11 OPPORTUNITY FOR RESIDENTS IN THE EAST BAY INCLUDING SOME OF 12 OUR EJ COMMUNITIES TO SECURE JOBS ON THE PENINSULA WHILE STILL 13 BEING ABLE TO AFFORD LIVING WITHIN RESPECTIVE MEANS IN THE 14 EAST BAY THE FUTURE FERRY TERMINAL PROVIDING AVENUE TO COMMUTE 15 16 TO WORK WITHOUT TRAFFIC CONGESTION BRIDGE TOLLS AND DRIVER FATIGUE. THIS FURTHER STRENGTHENS CONNECTIVITY VIA THE WATER 17 DECREASING WEAR AND TEAR ON ROADWAYS AND FROM BRIDGES AND 18 TRAFFIC. MORE IMPORTANTLY, FEDERAL FUNDING THAT THE FUTURE 19 FERRY TERMINAL CAN SECURE IS ONLY AVAILABLE TO PUBLIC FERRY 20 SYSTEMS OPERATORS ACROSS THE NATION, WHICH MEANS THAT WE AS A 21 REGION WANT TO REMAIN COMPETITIVE AND BRING THE LARGEST AMOUNT 22 OF FEDERAL ALLOCATED DOLLARS TO OUR REGION. THANK YOU FOR YOUR 23 CONSIDERATION. 24



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. 1 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JOSHUA ARCE. 4 5 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. JUST A OUICK THANK YOU TO ALL YOUR YEARS OF SERVICE TO COMMISSIONER SPERING AND RABBITT 6 YOU'RE GOING TO BE SORELY MISSED. MY NAME IS JOSHUA, NORTHERN 7 8 CALIFORNIA LABORERS UNION MEMBERS OF THE CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS INCLUDES ONE HUNDREDS THOUSAND PLUS UNION MEMBERS 9 2000 CONSTRUCTION EMPLOYERS ADVOCATES FOR FUTURE OF 10 CALIFORNIA'S INFRASTRUCTURE AND CONGRATULATIONS TO OUR CHAIR 11 AND VICE CHAIR TO BE VERY SOON WANT TO EXPRESS STRONG SUPPORT 12 FOR THE PLAN AND PARTICULARLY SINCE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE 13 REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL WE GOT THE CHANCE TO THANK 14 15 COMMISSIONER CANEPA AND STAFF FOR WORKING WITH THE PORT OF REDWOOD CITY, AND I GET TO THANK MTC COMMISSIONER GINA PAPAN 16 FOR HER YEARS ADVOCACY ROUND THE CLOCK WHEN WE WEREN'T SURE IF 17 THIS PROJECT WAS GOING TO BE IN OR OUT OR IF IT WAS GOING TO 18 MISS THE BOAT ON ALL THAT FEDERAL FUNDING. [LAUGHTER] THANKS 19 FOR GETTING IT DONE. WE'RE EXCITED TO MOVE FORWARD TODAY. 20 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ALETA DUPREE. 23 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: MORE PUNS IN PUBLIC COMMENT, 24

25 PLEASE. [LAUGHTER]

JANUARY 22, 2025

2 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN, VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ AND MEMBERS. 3 ALETA ADMIT FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THERE IS A LOT TO THIS PLAN. BUT I HEARD TWO WORDS THERE, THAT ARE 4 5 VERY MEANINGFUL. I HAVE HEARD THEM BEFORE IN VARIOUS PLACES, "INDUCED DEMAND" HOW DO WE INDUCE DEMAND FOR PUBLIC 6 TRANSPORTATION? IT'S TRUE WHEN YOU ADD MORE LANES OF HIGHWAY, 7 8 YOU ATTRACT MORE VEHICLES. I WOULD SAY THAT IT'S TRUE THAT IF YOU REDUCE THE NUMBER OF LANES OF HIGHWAY, YOU WILL HAVE FEWER 9 10 VEHICLES. I EXPERIENCED SOME CONGESTION COMING OVER HERE, RIDING IN AN AUTOMATED CAR. BUT A COUPLE HUNDRED AUTOMATED 11 CARS ARE NOT THE PROBLEM. IT'S ALL THE SINGLE OCCUPANCY CARS 12 THAT ARE TAKING UP SPACE IN THE CITY. DON'T GET ME WRONG. I 13 LOVE CARS. I ENJOY DRIVING THEM FAST ON THE HIGHWAY, WITHIN 14 15 THE SPEED LIMIT. THANK YOU.

16

1

17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE.
18 THERE ARE ABOUT FOUR HANDS AT THIS TIME. FIRST UP, WE HAVE
19 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE
20 MINUTE.

21

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED.
I AM ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I'M ALSO A PUBLIC
TRANSPORTATION COMMUTER. AND I GUESS THERE ARE TWO BIG THINGS.
ONE IS, THANK YOU FOR CALLING OUT THE ISSUE WITH THE ALL-LANE

JANUARY 22, 2025

TOLLING. IF YOU COULD PLEASE DIRECT STAFF TO INCLUDE AN 1 2 ANALYSIS OF INTERNAL DISPLACEMENT AND THE AFFECTS ON THOSE WHO HAVE BEEN DISPLACED THAT HAS NOT BEEN INCLUDED IN THE EQUITY 3 STUDY THAT'S HAPPENED AND IF WE WERE TO DO A DISPARATE STUDY I 4 5 THINK IT WOULD NOT COME OUT WELL. AND THE SECOND PIECE, I'M RENTING -- I'M ACTUALLY AT A CAR RENTAL PLACE RIGHT NOW I'M 6 RENTING A CAR TODAY BECAUSE IT'S FIVE AND A HALF HOURS FASTER 7 8 AND \$20 CHEAPER FOR ME TO RENT-A-CAR TODAY THAN TO RIDE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FOR THE ERRANDS I HAVE TO DO FOR MY JOB AND FOR 9 10 MY -- AND FOR -- LIKE, MY LIFE, TODAY, BECAUSE I HAVE TO GO TO PLACES THAT ARE NOT DIRECTLY ON A BART ROUTE. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THAT IS YOUR TIME. 13 14 15 ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN. 17 18 ADINA LEVIN: HELLO. ADINA LEVIN, SERVING ON POLICY ADVISORY 19 COUNCIL AND NETWORK MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP, SPEAKING FOR 20 MYSELF, AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA, SPEAKING TO LETTERS SENT, AND 21 WORKED WITH A COUPLE OF DOZEN COMMUNITY GROUPS GETTING 22 FEEDBACK ON TRANSIT RIDERS ON THE TRANSIT 2050+ PLAN WITH A 23 LOT OF SUPPORT FOR THE APPROACH TO IMPROVE SERVICE TO MAKE 24 25 TRANSIT FASTER AND MORE RELIABLE AND HAVE A CONNECTING NETWORK

JANUARY 22, 2025

INCLUDING FILLING IN SOME OF THE MISSING LINKS. AND WITH THAT, 1 2 WE WANTED TO EXPRESS CONCERN AND DISMAY. SO, WE'RE HAPPY TO 3 SEE THE FERRY PROJECT INCLUDED, BUT THE REMOVAL OF THE 92 BUS, WHICH IS A KEY MISSING LINK IS PROBLEMATIC. WE DO SEE THAT 4 5 THERE IS ALSO THE -- THAT'S NAMED THE PROJECT THIS'S ELIGIBLE IN THE SAMTRANS REGIONAL TRANSIT CONNECTIONS AND WE DO HOPE TO 6 7 CONTINUE TO WORK WITH MTC AND WITH AGENCIES TO GET THE PROJECT 8 MOVING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

9

10 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. JORDAN MOLDOW.

11

SPEAKER: JORDAN CITY OF SAN JOSE I'M CONCERNED WITH HOW 12 COMPLETE STREETS PROJECTS HAVE BEEN LISTED IN THIS PLAN 13 GROUPED INTO JUST ONE PROJECT COMPLETE STREETS WITHOUT 14 ACTUALLY LISTING THE SUBCOMPONENTS IN COMPARISON TO HIGHWAY 15 16 PROJECTS WHICH ARE METICULOUSLY LINKED OUT. I'M CONCERNED THAT ANY SPECIFIC COMPLETE STREETS PROJECT IN THIS PLAN IS GOING TO 17 BE SEEN AS AN INDICATION THAT THESE PROJECTS JUST AREN'T AS 18 19 IMPORTANT AND DON'T NEED TO BE PRIORITIZED FOR FUNDING OR FOR IMPLEMENTATION I ALSO LOOKED AT THE LIST OF COMPLETE STREETS 20 PROJECTS IN THE LIST 2050 LIST AND SOME DO ABOUT \$4 MILLION 21 22 WHICH IS 42% OF MTC'S ALLOCATION FOR COMPLETE STREETS I DOUBT 23 THAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY IS GOING TO BE RECEIVING FROM% OF ALLOCATION WHICH MEANS A BUNCH OF OUR PROJECTS ARE GOING TO BE 24 UNFUNDED WITHOUT ACTUALLY KNOWING WHAT'S THE INTENTION FOR 25



FUNDING SO I THINK COMPLETE STREETS PROJECTS WHICH ARE THE
 THING THAT'S GOING TO ACTUALLY HELP US REDUCE GREENHOUSE
 GASSES NEEDS TO BE PRIORITIZED BY LISTING THEM OUT AND GIVING
 THEM PRIORITY. THANK YOU.

5

6 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DYLAN FINCH.

7

8 SPEAKER: HELLO. DYLAN FINCH I'M ON THE REDWOOD CITY PLANNING COMMISSION AS WELL AS SAMTRANS CTC JUST SPEAKING FOR MYSELF 9 TODAY. I WANT TO SAY I WAS ALSO SAD THAT THE SAN MATEO BRIDGE 10 11 WAS REMOVED FROM THE PROJECT LIST I WANT TO SEE THE BUS GET FUNDING AT THE EXPENSE OF THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL BUT 12 I THINK THE BUS IS CRITICAL LINK WITHOUT THE LINK 1.5 HOUR 13 PUBLIC TRANSIT TRIP WITH THREE TRANSFERS FROM CALTRAIN TO THE 14 RED LINE OF BART TO A DIFFERENT LINE OF BART TO GET FROM SAN 15 16 MATEO CALTRAIN STATION TO HAYWARD BART STATION. TO HAVE TO GO ALL THE WAY AROUND THE BAY IT WOULD BE MORE ACCESSIBLE FOR 17 PEOPLE TO HAVE A OUICK JUMP ACROSS THE BRIDGE. SO I WOULD LOVE 18 TO SEE THE BUS INCLUDED IN A FUTURE PROJECT LIST. THANK YOU. 19 20

21 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
22 RAISED HANDS.



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, IF THERE 1 IS NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENT OR COMMENT FROM COMMISSIONERS, 2 3 WE'LL GO TO A ROLL CALL VOTE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? 6 7 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES. 8 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA? 10 11 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN? 14 15 EDDIE AHN: AYE. 16 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN? 17 18 19 CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE. 20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? 21 22 23 DAVID CANEPA: YES.



```
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EZZY ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
1
    FLEMING? IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER KAPLAN?
2
3
    REBECCA KAPLAN: YES.
4
5
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSION ARE MAHAN IS ABSENT.
6
7
    COMMISSIONER MILEY?
8
9
    NATHAN MILEY: YES COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS? IS ABSENT.
10
    COMMISSIONER NOACK? PAPAN?
11
    GINA PAPAN: YES.
12
13
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
14
15
16
    GINA PAPAN: AYE.
17
18
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?
19
    DAVID RABBITT: YES.
20
21
22
    CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING?
23
    JAMES P. SPERING: YES.
24
25
```



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
 PRESENT.

3

4 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY AGENDA ITEM 11 LEGISLATION
5 COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER CANEPA.

6

DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH VICE CHAIR. THE JOINT MTC 7 8 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE COMMITTEE MET JANUARY 10TH, 2025 REFERRED TWO ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION 9 ONE OF WHICH WAS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR THE OTHER IS AGENDA 10 ITEM 11 FINAL 2025 MTC ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM FINAL JOINT 11 2025 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM FOR MTC AND ABAG AGENCY STATE AND 12 FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES I MOVE APPROVAL FOR THE FINAL 13 2025 MTC ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM. 14

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

17

18 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
21 THIS ITEM. I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
22 RAISED. AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

23

24 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE. I'M SO SORRY.
25 I DIDN'T SEE --

1

JANUARY 22, 2025

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. SO, YES, MY QUESTION HAS TO DO 2 3 WITH THE CAP-AND-TRADE PROGRAM. I HAVE HEARD DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHETHER WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT EXTENDING IT IN PERPETUITY OR 4 5 UNTIL IT SUNSETS, AND WANTED TO ASK YOUR THOUGHTS ON THAT VERSUS TALKING ABOUT PASS 2030 AT THIS POINT? 6 7 8 ANDREW FREMIER: ANDREW FREMIER EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR I'LL START TO MY LEFT WE HAVE A LOT OF FOLKS THAT MIGHT BE AWARE WHAT'S 9 GOING ON WITH IT WE AGREE IT'S IMPORTANT PROGRAM SO FAR HASN'T 10 RISEN TO THE LEVEL YOU NEED TO DEAL WITH IT TODAY IN 11 SACRAMENTO BUT PART OF OUR ATTENTION WE ARE DEFINITELY 12 COORDINATING NOT ONLY WITH THE REST OF THE MPOS IN THE STATE 13 IN PARTICULAR THE FOUR LARGE ONES BUT ALSO HIGH SPEED RAIL AND 14 15 OTHERS THAT ARE INTERESTED IN THE PROGRAM I THINK THE FEAR IS 16 YOU OPEN IT UP AND THERE IS A WHOLE BUNCH OF DISCUSSION AROUND WHAT IT MIGHT ACTUALLY LOOK LIKE IN THE FUTURE BUT WE 17 RECOGNIZE IT'S THE CURRENT AND ARE CERTAINLY GOING TO PURSUE A 18 LOT OF ENERGY MOVING IT FORWARD. 19

20

21 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU AND THE OTHER QUESTION IS FROM
22 BATA COMMITTEE SIDE TALKING A LOT ABOUT FASTRAK AND
23 TRANSPONDERS AND WAYS TO GET IT INTO MORE PEOPLE'S HANDS AND
24 SO I WAS WONDERING IS THERE OPPORTUNITY OR ACTION PLAN OR



3

JANUARY 22, 2025

WORKPLAN TOGETHER TO BE ABLE TO ADVOCATE FOR SECURING STATE
 FUNDING TO HELP US EXPAND THIS PROGRAM?

ANDREW FREMIER: I DON'T KNOW THAT I HAVE A DIRECT ANSWER TO 4 5 THAT OTHER THAN JUST AN ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY IS RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL COST ASSOCIATED WITH THE 6 BRIDGES AND THAT'S PART OF THE DEAL THAT WAS CUT TO BUILD THE 7 8 BRIDGE. HOWEVER, WE ARE CONTINUING TO LOOK AT DIFFERENT WAYS TO GET TOLL TAGS INTO FOLKS'S HANDS. THERE IS OPPORTUNITIES TO 9 10 USE CHEAPER METHODS. WE HAVE CHOSEN TO KEEP THE AVAILABILITY OF THE SWITCHABLE TAG WHICH IS THE MOST EXPENSIVE IN OUR 11 PACKET AS THE RIGHT SOLUTION. WE HAVE ALSO PROVIDED FREE TOLL 12 TAGS FOR THE REGION WHETHER YOU ARE AN EXPRESS LANE OPERATOR 13 THAT WE CONTROL, OR WHETHER YOU'RE ONE OF THE COUNTIES WITH 14 15 IT, WE HAVE AGAIN FELT THAT'S THE BEST WAY TO GET TOLL TAGS 16 INTO PEOPLE'S HANDS, BUT WE WILL CONTINUE TO WORK AT DIFFERENT WAYS TO BRING DOWN THE COST OF OPERATIONS AND ARE CERTAINLY 17 SUPPORTIVE OF TRYING TO DO SO. I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT TO 18 RECOGNIZE THAT ONE OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE IS WE HAVE 19 SUCH BIG PENETRATION TODAY WITH THE NUMBER OF ACCOUNTS AND 20 TOLL TAGS IN PEOPLE'S HANDS, THAT IT TAKES A LARGE AMOUNT TO 21 ACTUALLY MOVE THE NEEDLE AND PERCENTAGE POINTS THAT MATTER. IT 22 REALLY REFLECTS, I THINK, A SUCCESSFUL OPERATION OF MAKING 23 SURE THAT THE PEOPLE DO HAVE TOLL TAGS AND YOU SEE THEM, LIKE 24 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ SHOWED ME THE ROBOTAXIS HAVE FASTRAK 25



IN THEM. SO IF NOBODY CAN FIND OUT HOW TO GET THEM, A ON 1 PERSON WE'LL CONTINUE TO SUPPORT EFFORTS OF DOING SO. 2 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: WE HAD CONVERSATION AT OUR COMMITTEE ABOUT 4 5 WAYS TO MARKET IT AND BRAINSTORMING SESSION. ALONG THE LINES I WAS THINKING HOW DO WE IMPROVE OUR MARKETING, HOW DID WE 6 IMPROVE ACCESS OTHER THAN HAVING TO GO TO COSTCO. SO, I THINK 7 8 SOME OF THAT WILL REQUIRE SOME FUNDING TO DO THAT, AND THAT WAS MY INQUIRY IS CAN WE ASK THE STATE. 9 10 ANDREW FREMIER: WE'RE COMMITTED TO COME BACK AND WE WILL. IT 11 DOES TAKE TIME TO PUT ALL THESE ACTIONS TOGETHER AND THAT 12 FALLS UNDER THE SEQUENCE OF EVENTS BUT WE'LL COME BACK WITH 13 IDEAS AND CERTAINLY TOOK THE ADVICE OF COMMISSIONERS. 14 15 16 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO THERE IS NO STATE WHERE WE CAN'T GO TO THE STATE FOR ADVOCATE HELPING US. 17 18 ANDREW FREMIER: WE ALWAYS CAN THERE COULD BE WAYS TO CUT SOME 19 DEALS BUT RIGHT NOW AS A REMINDER, THEY'RE THE BAY AREA TOLL 20 21 AUTHORITY RESPONSIBILITY. 22 23 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. THANK YOU. 24



V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: NO OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? NO 1 OTHER -- THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT, I THINK. SO -- IS THAT 2 3 RIGHT? WE ALREADY DID THIS? NO? 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M STILL -- YEAH, NO PUBLIC COMMENTS HAVE -- NO ONE HAS THEIR HAND RAISED, I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING 6 7 IN WRITING, AND YES WE DID DO THIS. IT'S ALL COME BACK TO ME 8 NOW. [LAUGHTER] 9 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE. 10 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. 12 13 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES ABE-KOGA? 14 15 16 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN? 18 19 EDDIE AHN: AYE. 20 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: UPON ANDERSON? 23 CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE. 24 25



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? 1 2 3 DAVID CANEPA: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT IS ABSENT. FLEMING? 6 7 VICTORIA FLEMING: YES. 8 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN? 10 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS IS 13 14 ABSENT. NOACK? PAPAN? 15 16 GINA PAPAN: YES UPON RABBITT? 17 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING? 20 21 22 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 24 25 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



1 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. AGENDA ITEM 12 PUBLIC COMMENT 2 3 OTHER BUSINESS. IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT? 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. THAT IS CLAIR MORGAN. GO 6 7 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. THIS IS FOR GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. 8 SPEAKER: HI. I'M CALLING BECAUSE I KNOW YOU GUYS TALKED ABOUT 9 THIS EARLIER, BUT I WAS CURIOUS ON WHO WAS SELECTED FOR CHAIR 10 AND VICE CHAIR. THE I MISSED WHEN THOSE WERE NOMINATED AND 11 SELECTED. 12 13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SURE, CHAIR WOULD BE SUE NOACK, VICE 14 15 CHAIR WOULD BE STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS. THEY WILL BE 16 APPOINTED --17 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THANK YOU. 18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AT THE FEBRUARY 26TH COMMISSION MEETING. 20 21 THERE WILL BE A VOTE AND TURNOVER AT THAT TIME. THANK YOU. 22 V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: OKAY. SO THAT'S THE END OF THIS 23 MEETING. [ADJOURNED] 24 25

