



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



JUNE 25, 2025

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 25TH, 2025, 9:35 AM

CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. SPEAKERS WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS ROLL CALL THE CLERK WILL CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK.

CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?

V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

4

5 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT IS ABSENT. GIVE ME JUST ONE MOMENT,
12 PLEASE. COMMISSIONER CANEPA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY
13 IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN? MANFREE?



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASH BURP? MELGAR IS ABSENT. MILEY?

5 ABSENT. PAPAN? RAMOS?

6

7 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAFF IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. EVERYBODY WHO IS ABLE PLEASE
12 STAND AND JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. [PLEDGE OF
13 ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED
14 STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS,
15 ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE
16 FOR ALL."

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WOULD THE CLERK PLEASE PROVIDE THE
19 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM
22 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD
23 HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING
24 ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR
2 WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ITEM FOUR IS THE CHAIR'S REPORT.
5 I HAVE NOTHING TO REPORT. I DON'T KNOW HOW I DON'T HAVE
6 ANYTHING TO REPORT. BUT I DON'T. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. THAT'S NOT A
7 GOOD START FOR ME. ITEM FIVE, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT.
8 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR, CARINA LIEU, WILL YOU PLEASE
9 GIVE YOUR REPORT? NOTE THAT NATE MILEY HAS JOINED US.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NOTED COMMISSIONER MILEY HAS
12 JOINED US, AND I DON'T SEE CARINA LIEU. I SEE HER ONLINE.
13 CARINA, WOULD YOU PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF AND GIVE YOUR REPORT.

14

15 **CARINA LIEU:** I'M HERE. GIVE ME ONE SECOND. I'M HERE TO GIVE
16 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT FROM LAST MONTH'S MEETING
17 LAST MONTH WE COVERED THREE ITEMS LEGISLATIVE UPDATE PREVIEW
18 OF THE UPCOMING ACCESSIBLE FUTURE CONFERENCE AND PRESENTATIONS
19 ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
20 REGARDING LEGISLATIVE UPDATE WE TALKED ABOUT THE CAP-AND-TRADE
21 HIGH SPEED RAIL TRANSIT FUNDING COUNCIL MEMBERS HAD QUESTIONS
22 ABOUT THE STATE USING CAP-AND-TRADE MONEY ESPECIALLY THE \$1
23 BILLION A YEAR GOING TO HIGH SPEED RAIL SOME WONDERED IF THIS
24 WAS REQUIRED BY LAW OR JUST THE GOVERNOR'S DECISION THE
25 GOVERNOR WANTS NOW TO MAKE THIS AMOUNT MANDATORY SO PEOPLE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 WERE WORRIED ONLY UP TO 10% MONEY IS PLANNED FOR IMPROVING
2 LOCAL TRANSIT WHICH COULD MEAN NO MONEY FOR GUARANTEED MINIMUM
3 AT LEAST 5% ESPECIALLY THE PLAN INCLUDES MAKING FARE
4 AFFORDABLE PROVIDERS REGARDING HOUSING ENVIRONMENT, CONCERNS
5 THAT 9,000 FAMILIES IN ALAMEDA COULD LOSE THEIR HOUSING
6 SUPPORT SECTION EIGHT VOUCHERS DUE TO FEDERAL CUTS SOME
7 MEMBERS ALSO TALKED ABOUT HOW HARD IT IS TO GET FIRE INSURANCE
8 IN CERTAIN AREAS MAKING IT TOUGH FOR PEOPLE TO SELL OR MOVE
9 HOMES FOR THE ENVIRONMENT BILL AB 697 WILL PROTECT CERTAIN
10 ANIMALS NEAR HIGHWAY 37 WHICH IS IMPORTANT BECAUSE THAT AREA
11 IS BEING CONSIDERED FOR GROWTH EXPANSION STILL A BIG FUNDING
12 GAP ABOUT \$10 BILLION TO MAKE THAT PROJECT HAPPEN REGARDING
13 TRANSIT PLANS ELECTIONS AND PUBLIC INPUT COUNCIL DISCUSSED A
14 \$55 MILLION PLAN TO IMPROVE PUBLIC TRANSIT INCLUDING BETTER
15 FARE SYSTEMS MAPS BUS LANES AND PROGRAMS TO HELP PEOPLE WITH
16 DISABILITIES THEY SAID THESE UPGRADES SHOULD BE A TOP PRIORITY
17 THIS IS ALSO A CALL TO MAKE THE LEGISLATION INSPIRING NOT JUST
18 ANOTHER TAX MEASURE SO THE PUBLIC SUPPORT, NEW BALLOT MEASURE
19 COULD BE VOTED ON IN NOVEMBER 2026 BUT IT WOULD BE NEARLY
20 200,000 SIGNATURES FIRST COUNCIL MEMBERS WANT THEIR INPUT
21 HEARD AND USED AS A PROCESS PUSHING FOR STRONG FUNDING FOR
22 BOTH TRANSIT AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND WANT MTC TO KEEP
23 WORKING CLOSELY WITH PARTNERS AND COMMUNITIES REGARDING THE
24 ACCESSIBLE FUTURES SUMMIT COUNCIL MEMBERS EXPRESSED
25 GRATIFICATION THE SUMMIT IS FINALLY HAPPENING AND THAT MTC PUT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 RESOURCES INTO IT. AND, OF COURSE, IT WENT WELL AND IT WENT --
2 AND MANY COUNCIL MEMBERS YESTERDAY ALSO SPOKE TO HOW SUCCESS.
3 IT WAS. I'M GOING TO JUMP OVER TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
4 BLUEPRINT FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOME. SEVERAL COUNCIL MEMBERS
5 RAISED CONCERNS ABOUT WHETHER THE PLAN CAN ADJUST TO FUTURE
6 CHANGES LIKE A NEW FEDERAL ADMINISTRATION, OR BUDGET CUTS
7 OTHERS ASK IF MTC CAN MATCH NEW PRIORITIES. COUNCIL MEMBERS
8 ASKED WHETHER FARMLAND COUNTS AS OPEN SPACE IT DOES ANOTHER
9 SHARED NEW HOUSING LAWS MIGHT HURT LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES BY
10 PUSHING THEM OUT OF THEIR NEIGHBORHOODS AND PLANS SHOULD DO
11 MORE TO PROTECT AND PRESERVE THOSE COMMUNITIES SEA LEVEL RISE
12 WAS ANOTHER CONCERN ESPECIALLY PLACES LIKE SAN FRANCISCO THERE
13 WERE QUESTIONS ABOUT HOW THE PLAN MEASURES RISK WHERE THE
14 MONEY COMES FROM ONE COUNCIL MEMBER SAID THE JOB IN POPULATION
15 GROWTH FORECAST IS UNREALISTIC NOW ESPECIALLY AFTER COVID
16 SUGGESTED LOOKING AT LOOKING BEYOND THE BAY AREA WHEN SETTING
17 IMPACTS ON TRAFFIC AND AIR POLLUTION OTHERS ASKED FOR
18 IMPROVEMENTS IN TRANSIT CONNECTIONS SUGGESTING REOPENING
19 TUNNELS PROTECTING RENTERS WHILE STILL ENCOURAGING HOUSING
20 DEVELOPMENT CONCERNS WERE RAISED ABOUT PLAN'S FOCUS ON
21 BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN NEW GROWTH AREAS WITH ONE
22 COUNCIL MEMBER ASKING HOW THAT DOESN'T CREATE NEW GHETTOS AND
23 FORCE PEOPLE TO BE FARTHER FROM JOBS, GIVING PEOPLE MORE
24 OPTIONS, PROTECTING THOSE WHO WANT TO STAY CLOSER TO
25 OPPORTUNITY QUESTIONS ABOUT REBATE PLANS, HOW THE PLANS WORK,



JUNE 25, 2025

1 WITH THE STATE'S AIR BOARD AND MEMBERS ASK FOR MORE DETAILS ON
2 HOW THE PLAN WOULD REDUCE EMISSIONS AND WHETHER CONSIDERATIONS
3 ARE REALISTIC FOR CAR USAGE, COUNCIL MEMBERS PROMISED WE NEED
4 BETTER TO DEFINE OPEN SPACE ESPECIALLY WHEN IT'S PRIVATE LAND
5 OR SCHOOL PROPERTY THAT THE PUBLIC CAN'T USE FINALLY COUNCIL
6 MEMBERS WANT TO KNOW HOW THEIR FEEDBACK WILL BE USED ON THE
7 PLANNING PROCESS, TRAFFIC REPORTS WILL COME OUT IN SEPTEMBER
8 AND PROMISE TO KEEP WORKING WITH THE COUNCIL AND PROVIDE
9 WRITTEN ANSWERS ESPECIALLY ON BIG ISSUES ALSO YESTERDAY THE
10 COUNCIL MEMBERS WANTED TO PROVIDE SUGGESTIONS TO THE GUIDING
11 FRAMEWORK FOR SB63. SO I WOULD LIKE TO SUMMARIZE THAT
12 DISCUSSION AND ACTION. THE COUNCIL WAS DISAPPOINTED TO SEE
13 REDUCTION IN PROPOSED FUNDING FOR RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS
14 BUT APPRECIATES INCREASED FUNDING FOR ACCESSIBILITY AND
15 SUPPORTS THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH AN AMENDMENT TO MODIFY
16 THE EFFICIENCY STUDY PROVISIONS IN THE BILL TO REQUIRE THAT
17 THE STUDY BE INTER-AGENCY WITH FOCUS ON REDUCING DUPLICATION,
18 IMPROVING CONNECTIONS AND MASK SERVICE TO DEMAND TO INCREASE
19 RIDERSHIP. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOUR MICROPHONE IS NOT ON, CHAIR.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THERE IS A PROBLEM. ANY COMMISSIONER WANT TO
24 COMMENT OR HAVE A QUESTION ON THE REPORT? NO. OKAY. IS THERE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS OR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK
2 ON THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
5 THIS ITEM HOWEVER THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
6 HANDS RAISED, THAT IS -- BEFORE THAT, HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU
7 LIKE TO GIVE?

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT COULD BE A LONG DAY, LET'S DO ONE MINUTE,
10 PLEASE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. SO, ONE MINUTE FOR -- SORRY, MY
13 MOUSE IS NOT WORKING. THE THERE WE GO. ADINA LEVIN FOLLOWED BY
14 RANDI KINMAN. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE POLICY
17 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ADDING A LITTLE BIT OF COLOR TO THE
18 DISCUSSION YESTERDAY THE CHAIR JUST REPORTED ON. WITH REGARD
19 TO THE FUNDING FOR THE RIDER FOCUSED INVESTMENT, WE ALSO
20 WANTED TO SEE THAT FUNDING TO BE PROPORTIONAL SO THAT IF MORE
21 COUNTIES JOIN AND BRING IN MORE REVENUE, THEN THAT WILL
22 INCREASE THE AMOUNT THAT WILL GO TOWARDS THESE EXPENDITURES
23 THAT OUR VOTERS HAVE SHOWN TIME AND TIME AGAIN, THAT IS REALLY
24 APPEALING TO HELP A MEASURE PASS AND THAT HELP MAKE TRANSIT
25 MORE AFFORDABLE AND RIDER FRIENDLY, AND ACCESSIBLE. ONE OF THE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THINGS THAT PEOPLE BROUGHT UP IN THE PROPOSED SPENDING WAS
2 THAT WAYFINDING, WHICH IS PROPOSED FOR SIGNIFICANT REDUCTION
3 IS ACTUALLY SOMETHING REALLY IMPORTANT FOR PEOPLE WITH
4 DISABILITIES AND SENIORS SO THAT THE COMMISSION REALLY VALUES
5 ACCESSIBILITY AND WAYFINDING IS IMPORTANT TO ACCESSIBILITY.
6 THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN, IS YOUR -- I
9 CAN'T TELL -- PARDON ME, JUST ONE MOMENT. RANDI KINMAN, GO
10 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE FOLLOWED BY
11 VINAY PIMPLE.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
14 COUNCIL I WANT TO SECOND ADINA'S COMMENTS ABOUT SIGNAGE AND
15 WAYFINDING ESPECIALLY CONSIDERING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE AND
16 INPUT WE RECEIVED FROM THE DISABILITIES CONFERENCE LAST
17 WEEKEND. SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING ARE THE FIRST THINGS THAT ARE
18 NEEDED FOR ANYBODY WHEN THEY'RE USING TRANSIT. I WANTED TO
19 JUMP BACK THOUGH TO PLANNED BAY AREA AND OPEN SPACE, AND OUR
20 GENERAL LOOK AT OPEN SPACE. BECAUSE I'M ONE OF THE ONES THAT'S
21 CONCERNED ABOUT THE FACT THAT WE DON'T DIFFERENT BETWEEN
22 FARMLAND, WHICH IS CONSIDERED OPEN SPACE, INSTEAD OF FARMLAND,
23 AND/OR RANGE LAND, OR ANYTHING ELSE THIS'S BEING COMMERCIALY
24 USED THAT WAY, OR SCHOOL PLAY GROUNDS WHICH WE'RE LOCKED OUT
25 OF. SO BEING ABLE TO LOOK AT A MAP AND DIFFERENTIATE THOSE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 TYPES OF SPACES WOULD BE EXTREMELY USEFUL FOR FUTURE PLANNING.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE, PLEASE GO AHEAD

5 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

6

7 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, I ALSO SERVE ON THE POLICY

8 ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND I ALSO WANT TO SECOND AND THIRD WHAT

9 ADINA SAID. AND I THINK THE PROPORTIONAL THING IS REALLY

10 IMPORTANT BECAUSE OTHERWISE WHAT HAPPENS IS THE MORE COUNTIES

11 JOIN THE ACTUALLY IMPROVEMENTS TO POWER TRANSIT WILL ACTUALLY

12 BE LESS BECAUSE THE SAME AMOUNT OF FUNDS WILL BE DIVIDED 40%

13 MORE PEOPLE OR 50% MORE PEOPLE AND I HOPE THAT'S NOT WHAT

14 ANYBODY WANTS. PLEASE MAKE IT PROPORTIONAL. AND I ALSO SUPPORT

15 WHAT BOTH RANDY AND ADINA HAVE SAID ABOUT MAPPING AND

16 WAYFINDING. I ACTUALLY WORK AS PART OF THE ACCESSIBILITY

17 WORKING GROUP. WE HELP MAKE SURE THAT THE MAPPING AND

18 WAYFINDING DOES ACCOMMODATE THE NEED THAT PEOPLE WITH

19 DISABILITIES HAVE THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS

22 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. BACK TO YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ITEM SIX EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT, ANDREW

25 PREMIER WILL GIVE THE REPORT.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK GOOD MORNING

3 COMMISSIONER ANDREW F, COUPLE ITEMS SENATOR WIENER THE STATE

4 SENATE BUDGET FISCAL REVIEW COMMITTEE ANNOUNCED THE GOVERNOR

5 HAS AGREED TO RETAIN PUBLIC TRANSIT FUNDING THAT HAVE BEEN

6 PROPOSED FOR THE ELIMINATION IN THE MAY REVISE AS WELL AS

7 SUPPORTING A LOAN OF \$750 MILLION TO BAY AREA TRANSIT AREAS,

8 ESPECIALLY SB63. AS A REMINDER, THAT LOAN IS INTENDED TO SERVE

9 AS BRIDGE FUNDING SO THAT CAN COVER THE GAP BETWEEN WE

10 ANTICIPATE A SUCCESSFUL BALLOT BRINGING IN REVENUE TO SPEND ON

11 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. THE SECOND ITEM, AND MAYBE THAT'S WHY

12 COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY IS NOT HERE, SHE'S PROBABLY WORKING ON

13 HER NEW JOB. BUT WE WANT TO CONGRATULATE COMMISSIONER EL-

14 TAWANSY WHO HAS BEEN A COMMISSIONER SINCE 2020. FOR THOSE THAT

15 DON'T KNOW SHE IS NOW THE NEW DIRECTOR FOR CALTRANS. AND WE

16 DID HAVE -- STATEWIDE DIRECTOR FOR CALTRANS -- AND WE DID HAVE

17 A DEBATE ABOUT HOW MANY WOMEN HAVE BEEN THERE; SHE MIGHT BE

18 THE FOURTH. THERE MAY BE MORE THAN WE REMEMBER AT TIMES. BUT

19 WE WISH HER WELL. IT WAS, SORT OF, A TRADE, THE PREVIOUS

20 DIRECTOR TONY TAVARES WHO WAS OF THE PREVIOUS COMMISSIONER HAS

21 COME DOWN TO WORK AS THE NEW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR THE

22 ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. SO WE SHOULD HAVE

23 GOOD STATEWIDE INPUT FOR A WHILE NOW. I WANT TO MENTION WHAT

24 WAS A SUCCESSFUL TWO-DAY CONFERENCE THAT MTC AND ABAG, HOSTED

25 HERE IN THE BUILDING, CALLED "ACCESSIBLE FUTURES" SHARING



JUNE 25, 2025

1 LISTENING AND LEARNING THE EVENT BROUGHT TOGETHER ALL KINDS OF
2 RESIDENTS WITH DISABILITIES FROM THE NINE COUNTIES AND PROVIDE
3 OPPORTUNITY FOR THEM TO NETWORK, TO HEAR ABOUT WHAT WE'RE
4 DOING, BUT PRIMARILY TO SHARE THEIR LIVED EXPERIENCE WITH THE
5 POLICY MAKERS AND HELP US REALLY DEVELOP OPPORTUNITIES AND
6 PARTNERSHIPS FOR COLLABORATION. I HAVE UPDATED NUMBERS FROM
7 WHAT I PUT IN MY WRITTEN REPORT. IT WAS ATTENDED BY 182 PEOPLE
8 IN-PERSON AND 229 REMOTE PARTICIPANTS, CHAIR NOACK AND
9 COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI OPENED THE EVENT AND WE ALSO HAD A NICE
10 OPENING KEYNOTE ADDRESS FROM EAST BAY CONGRESSWOMAN LATEEFAH
11 SIMON WHO IS LEGALLY BLIND AND REALLY, I THINK, PROVIDED SOME
12 REALLY VERY IMPORTANT OPENING COMMENTS. THE NEXT ITEM IS JUST,
13 SORT OF, A RECOGNITION OF OUR WAYFINDING, AND HOW WE'RE MOVING
14 INTO SOME OF THE MORE COMPLICATED STATIONS. IF YOU MANAGED TO
15 GO INTO THE POWELL STREET BART MUNI STATION YOU WILL SEE SOME
16 TEMPORARY SIGNS THAT ARE UP, THEY'RE REALLY DESIGNED TO GIVE
17 THE PUBLIC AN IDEA OF WHAT THAT WORK WILL BE, AND AS WAS
18 MENTIONED BY SOME OF THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS, WE DO THINK IT'S AN
19 IMPORTANT ITEM WE HAVE ALSO BEEN PUTTING OUT BUS STOP SIGNS ON
20 MARKET STREET SO IT'S OUR MOVE INTO A MUCH MORE DIRECTLY URBAN
21 ENVIRONMENT. AND AS WELL YOU WILL HEAR AS WE PRESENTED TO THE
22 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL EARLIER THIS WEEK WE ARE
23 GETTING POSITIVE FEEDBACK FROM THE WORK BEING DONE AT DEL
24 NORTE AND SANTA ROSA. MAYBE I'LL FINISH WITH A BIT OF GOOD
25 NEWS, AND I BELIEVE COMMISSIONER FLEMING, ON JUNE 3RD -- JUNE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 13TH WAS AMONG THE LOCAL LEADERS CELEBRATING THE OPENING OF
2 THE SMART WINDSOR STATION JUST LOCATED WEST OF THE WINDSOR
3 TOWN GREEN INTO THAT JUST, SORT OF, SETS THE SITES ON
4 HEALDSBURG WHICH IS UP FOR SOME SB1 GRANTS TOTALING \$81
5 MILLION THAT CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION LATER THIS
6 WEEK. I'M SURE YOU GOT NICE SWAG. I'LL CLOSE WITH THE SAVE THE
7 DATE REMINDER THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP IS PLANNED FOR OCTOBER
8 22ND AND 23rd AT THE EMBASSY SUITES IN WALNUT CREEK, WHICH IS
9 CLOSE TO THE PLEASANT HILL BART STATION AND IT WILL FOLLOW THE
10 REGULAR COMMISSION MEETING HERE, THEN THERE. HAPPY TO TAKE
11 QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. LET ME ADD MY CONGRATULATIONS TO DINA
14 EL-TAWANSY, THAT'S A FANTASTIC PROMOTION FOR HER. SECOND THINK
15 I WANT TO NOTE, WHICH I LEARNED AT ACCESSIBILITY, IS THAT
16 DOREEN GIACOPINI IS ACTUALLY THE DEAN OF THE COMMISSION,
17 RIGHT, DOREEN? [LAUGHTER]. THAT CAME UP IN THE INTRODUCTION
18 REMARKS, AND I DIDN'T KNOW THAT. SO, NOW I ASSUME THE REST OF
19 YOU PROBABLY DIDN'T KNOW THAT, AS WELL. SO, ANYWAY NOW WE CAN
20 CALL HER DEAN GIACOPINI, RIGHT? SHE'S -- SHE'S ANYWAY. AND I
21 GOT TO RIDE SMART. SO THAT WAS VERY FUN. YES, ABSOLUTELY. THAT
22 WAS FUN. I PROBABLY SHOULD HAVE HAD THAT ALL IN MY CHAIR'S
23 COMMENTS. BUT DO IT LATER. ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY COMMENTS OR
24 QUESTIONS ON THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS? NOPE. OKAY GREAT. LET'S
25 SEE.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SORRY.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BEFORE WE DO PUBLIC COMMENT LET THE
7 RECORD REFLECT THAT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF AND MELGAR HAVE JOINED
8 US. PLEASE PUT YOUR NAME PLATE IN THE FRONT, COMMISSIONER.

9 THANK YOU. AND THEN ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT. WE HAVE ONE IN THE
10 BOARDROOM AND THEN A COUPLE IN THE ZOOM SPACE. SO, FIRST UP IS
11 ALETA DUPREE. ONE MINUTE MISS DUPREE, AND I WILL SHARE THIS.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR
14 THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. GET MY CLOCK UP HERE.
15 GOOD REPORT ALWAYS ENJOY ANDY'S MEANINGFUL AND HELPFUL
16 REPORTS, WE'RE GETTING STATE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT I WOULD LIKE
17 TO SEE HOW THIS LOAN PAYS OUT, DOESN'T CUT INTO THE GRANTS SO
18 I THINK WE'RE LOOKING AT \$2 BILLION SO WE WANT TO HAVE THAT
19 MONEY IN PLACE AND HOPEFULLY GET THIS MEASURE PASSED SO WE CAN
20 FUND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND WAYFINDING IS VERY IMPORTANT TO
21 ME I RIDE THE CIRCUIT A LOT NOT JUST IN OUR AREA ACTUALLY KEEP
22 A WAYFINDING PICTURE BUT I ALWAYS HAVE A PICTURE WAYFINDING IN
23 THE GRAND CENTRAL SUBWAY STATION THAT THE SIGNAGE THAT WE HAVE
24 SHOULD -- WE WANT TO MAKE SURE IT COEXISTS AND NOT ERASE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 HISTORICAL FEATURES SO WE CAN PRESERVE THE HISTORY AND FUTURE
2 OF OUR SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, MISS DUPREE. NEXT UP IN THE
5 ZOOM SPACE IS VINAY PIMPLE, I'LL LET YOU WHEN YOU HAVE 15
6 SECONDS LEFT. MR. PIMPLE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

7

8 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. VINAY PIMPLE, AGAIN. I SERVE ON THE POLICY
9 ADVISORY COUNCIL. I JUST REALLY WANT TO EXPRESS MY DEEP THANKS
10 TO ALL OF YOU BECAUSE MTC SPONSORED THE ACCESSIBILITY FUTURES
11 CONFERENCE. DIRECTOR FRIEMER SAID THAT A LOT OF PEOPLE SHARED
12 THEIR LIVED EXPERIENCES; I THINK THAT WAS VERY MEANINGFUL FOR
13 A LOT OF PEOPLE. ALSO, WE ALL MADE A LOT OF CONNECTIONS WITH
14 PEOPLE WHO CAN HELP MOVE THE ACCESSIBILITY SERVICES FORWARD.
15 SO, THAT WAS ALSO VERY HELPFUL. I CAME AWAY WITH A FEW THINGS
16 THAT I THINK I SHOULD DO, AND PROBABLY BE A BETTER PERSON ON
17 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SERVICE, AND HELPFUL FOR ME,
18 PERSONALLY, TOO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. ADINA LEVIN. I SERVE ON THE POLICY
23 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND CHAIR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER
24 ADVISORY GROUP, WHERE YESTERDAY THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP
25 GOT AN UPDATE ON SOMETHING THAT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FRIEMER



JUNE 25, 2025

1 MENTIONED IN HIS REMARKS ABOUT THE RESULTS AND THE FEEDBACK
2 AND THE DATA FROM THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROTOTYPES, AND
3 THAT DATA IS SHOWING A 20 TO 40% IMPROVEMENT ON PEOPLE BEING
4 ABLE TO FIND THEIR WAY TO THE BUS CONNECTION THAT THEY'RE
5 TRYING TO MAKE, FOR EXAMPLE, EL CERRITO DEL NORTE. THIS IS
6 REALLY A MEANINGFUL IMPROVEMENT IF SOMEONE IS, YOU KNOW, LESS
7 FAMILIAR WITH A STATION, AND YOU KNOW, BEING ABLE TO FIND AND
8 MAKE YOUR CONNECTION, THIS IS REALLY IMPORTANT FOR PEOPLE WHO
9 DEPEND ON TRANSIT TO GET TO WHERE THEY'RE GOING, AND PEOPLE
10 WHO ARE NEW TO TRANSIT TO TAKE THE RISK IF THEY'RE GOING TO
11 GET TO WHERE THEY'RE GOING. ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE, SENIORS AND
12 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU'RE WELCOME. THAT'S ALL WE HAVE FOR
15 PUBLIC COMMENT BACK TO YOU MADAM CHAIR.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU ITEM SEVEN IS COMMISSIONER
18 COMMENTS IS THERE ANYONE WHO HAS COMMENTS OR ANNOUNCEMENTS
19 THEY WOULD LIKE TO MAKE? NO. GREAT. ITEM EIGHT IS PUBLIC
20 HEARING ASSEMBLY BILL 2561 REPORT TO COMMISSION. I WOULD LIKE
21 TO TAKE UP AGENDA ITEM 8A PUBLIC HEARING ON ASSEMBLY BILL 2561
22 MTC VACANCY RATES RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION THE PUBLIC HEARING
23 IS NOW OPEN IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY PLEASE SUBMIT A SPEAKER
24 CARD, IF ON ZOOM USE THE RAISED HAND FEEL THE OR DIAL STAR
25 NINE AND PLEASE WAIT TO BE CALLED UPON WE ASK EACH SPEAKER TO



JUNE 25, 2025

1 BE BRIEF AND CONCISE AND KEEP COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO
2 MINUTES. THE PURPOSE OF THE HEARING IS TO RECEIVE COMMENTS ON
3 THE STATUTES OF MTC VACANCY RATES RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION
4 I'LL ASK MTC STAFF TO PRESENT THE STATUS OF MTC VACANCY RATES
5 RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION. MIKE.

6

7 **MIKE AYCOCK:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND MEMBERS OF THE
8 COMMISSION I'M MIKE AYCOCK, HEAD AT HR HERE AT MTC, AND I'M
9 HERE TODAY TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT A NEW LEGISLATIVE ACTION
10 ASSEMBLY BILL 2561 AND PROVIDE RELATED INFORMATION. NEXT SLIDE
11 WE'LL GO OVER LEGISLATIVE REQUIREMENTS OF THE NEW LAW
12 REVIEWING ACTUAL VACANCY DATA AND DISCUSS SOME RECRUITMENT
13 RETENTION PROPOSE IN INTER-AGENCY WE HAD A PLACEHOLDER ON OUR
14 AGENDA FOR PRESENTATIONS BY LABOR REPRESENTATIVES WHO
15 REQUESTED TO PRESENT TODAY BUT NONE ELECTED TO DO SO. I'LL
16 EXPLAIN MORE ABOUT THE THAT IN COMING SLIDES. AB2561 BECAME
17 EFFECTIVE JANUARY 1ST OF THIS YEAR THE BILL AROSE FROM CONCERN
18 REGARDING HIGH VACANCY RATES IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT AGENCIES
19 ACROSS OUR STATE THE GOAL OF THE BILL IS TO INTRODUCE GREATER
20 TRANSPARENCY AND PUBLIC SECTOR STAFFING BY MANDATING ANNUAL
21 DISCLOSURES OF WORKFORCE DATA. THE BILL ADDED TO THE
22 ADDITIONAL GOVERNMENT CODE TO THE MEYERS MILIAS BROWN ACT,
23 ALSO KNOWN AS MMBA. I'M CREATING OBLIGATIONS FOR PUBLIC
24 AGENCIES, SUCH AS OURS, TO TRACK AND PRESENT INFORMATION ON
25 JOB VACANCIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE KEY REQUIREMENTS UNDER



JUNE 25, 2025

1 AB2561 INCLUDE OUR RESPONSIBILITY TO TRACK JOB VACANCIES FOR
2 US TO PRESENT THE STATUS OF OUR VACANCIES AND RECRUITMENT AND
3 HE TENSION EFFORTS IN A PUBLIC HEARING BEFORE THE COMMISSION
4 ON AN ANNUAL BASIS BEFORE THE FINAL BUDGET IS ADOPTED NOTED
5 PRESENTATIONS CAN INCLUDE PRESENTATIONS FROM LABOR
6 REPRESENTATIVES IF THEY DESIRE TO DO SO FOR THE BILL. AND THIS
7 IS OUR FIRST ANNUAL PUBLIC HEARING ON THIS TOPIC IN ADDITION
8 PART OF THIS HEARING WE IDENTIFY ANY RECRUITMENT RETENTION
9 POLICIES PROCEDURES AND ACTIVITIES THAT MAY PRESENT OBSTACLES
10 IN OUR HIGHER AND RETENTION EFFORTS AND IDENTIFY POTENTIAL
11 CHANGES TO ALLEVIATE SUCH OBSTACLES ADDITIONALLY IF THE
12 VACANCY RATES IN OUR AGENCY FOR ANY BARGAINING UNIT BOO 20%
13 THE BORROW GAINING UNIT MAY REQUEST ADDITIONAL INFORMATION BE
14 PRESENTED TO YOU IN THIS PUBLIC HEARING I'M PLEASED TO NOTE
15 THAT WE DON'T HAVE VACANCY RATES AT OR ABOVE 20% OR BELOW THAT
16 THRESHOLD. NEXT SLIDE. LOOKING AT MTC'S DATA WE CURRENTLY HAVE
17 426 AUTHORIZED FTE, 37 OF WHICH ARE VACANT THIS RESULTS IN
18 OVERALL VACANCY RATE OF 8.7% IN THE AGENCY OUR REPRESENTED
19 BARGAINING UNITS UNDER THE MBA HAVE VACANCY RATES OF 8.9% AND
20 8.0% RESPECTIVELY NOT REACHING THAT VACANCY THRESHOLD I
21 ALLUDED TO EARLIER. CONTEXT ON THIS DATA HEALTHY VACANCY RATE
22 FOR ANY AGENCY IS TYPICALLY BETWEEN 5 AND 10% OUR AGENCY FALLS
23 WITHIN THAT RANGE AND WE'RE PLEASED TO REPORT THAT TO THE
24 COMMISSION TODAY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ADDITIONALLY WE'RE
25 PLEASED TO SHARE DATA ON REACCUMULATE AND RETENTION TO THE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 COMMISSION, SHOWING POSITIVE TRENDS OVER THE PAST 12 MONTHS WE
2 HAVE RECRUITED AND HIRED MORE PEOPLE THAN HAVE SEPARATED FROM
3 MTC ENABLING US TO KEEP PACE WITH ATTRITION AND GROWING
4 POSITIONS IN THE FISCAL YEAR AVERAGE LENGTH OF SERVICE AT MTC
5 IS 8.6 WHICH IS HIGHER THAN AVERAGE IN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE
6 SECTORS AVERAGE PUBLIC SECTOR WORKER STAYS WITH THEIR EMPLOYER
7 FOR A LITTLE OVER SIX YEARS AND PRIVATE SECTOR THREE AND A
8 HALF YEARS RIGHT NOW ON THIS RECRUITMENT RETENTION DATA SHOWS
9 WE'RE IN A HEALTHY POSITION COMPARED TO OUR PEERS. NEXT SLIDE.
10 A LITTLE BIT ON OUR RECRUITMENT RETENTION EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE.
11 ALTHOUGH OUR VACANCY RECRUITMENT RETENTION DATA ARE IN
12 POSITIVE POSITIONS FOR MTC IT DOESN'T DISTRACT US FROM BEING
13 FOCUSED ON CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT. THERE ARE SEVERAL
14 INITIATIVES AND APPROACHES UNDER WAY AIMED TOWARDS MAINTAINING
15 HEALTHY WORKFORCE DATA AND IMPROVING WHERE WE WANT TO. ON
16 RECRUITMENT WE'RE REVIEWING INTERNAL RECRUITMENT PROCESSES AND
17 PROCEDURES WITH GOAL OF HAVING EQUITABLE EFFICIENT RECRUITMENT
18 PROCESSES WE REGULARLY ACCESS OUR OUTREACH METHODS TO
19 DETERMINE WHERE WE'RE GETTING CANDIDATES AND TRY TO ATTRACT
20 QUALIFIED DIVERSE CANDIDATE POOL MODIFYING OUR PROGRAMS AROUND
21 PIPELINE DEVELOPMENT AND LOOKING TO BUILD BRIDGE FROM INTERN
22 EMPLOYMENT AS AN EXAMPLE EXPANSION OF OUR COLLEGE INTERN
23 PROGRAM THIS SUMMER. IMPLEMENTING CLASSIFICATION PLAN CHANGES
24 SOME OF WHICH ARE ON YOUR AGENDA TODAY WHICH WILL RESULT IN
25 GREATER FLEXIBILITY RESULTING IN EQUITABLE SCREENING



JUNE 25, 2025

1 RECOGNIZING PEOPLE FROM A VARIETY OF BACKGROUNDS AND
2 EXPERIENCE. ON RETENTION WE OFFER SEVERAL THINGS IN PLACE FOR
3 MANY YEARS WITH THE AGENCY AIDED RETAINING TALENT INCLUDING
4 COMPREHENSIVE BENEFITS FLEXIBLE WORK ARRANGEMENTS AND TRAINING
5 ALSO BEEN IN PROCESS OF UPDATING WORKFORCE ORIENTED POLICIES
6 AND CLASSIFICATION PLAN TO MEET CURRENT NEEDS OF OUR AGENCY
7 WORKFORCE CREATE OPPORTUNITIES TO COLLECT ANALYZE DATA FROM
8 OUR EMPLOYEES AS THEIR FEEDBACK IS IMPORTANT IN DETERMINING
9 RECRUITMENT AND TRENDS PRIORITIES WITHIN THE AGENCY THIS
10 CONCLUDES INFORMATION I HAVE PREPARED FOR YOU THANK YOU FOR
11 YOUR TIME

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU WE WILL RECEIVE ORAL TESTIMONY,
14 ONCE AGAIN IF YOU WISH TO TESTIFY PLEASE SUBMIT A SPEAKER CARD
15 OR IF IN ZOOM USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE WE ASK TO YOU BE
16 CONCISE AND KEEP COMMENTS TO NO MORE THAN TWO MINUTES. CLERK
17 ARE THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
20 THIS ITEM THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM
21 ALETA DUPREE APPROACH THE PODIUM AND YOU WILL HAVE TWO
22 MINUTES.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
25 FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. THIS IS NEW TO ME



JUNE 25, 2025

1 BUT THANK YOU FOR THE TRANSPARENCY HERE. FROM THE NUMBERS, IT
2 LOOKS LIKE WE'RE COMPETITIVE, WHAT WE'RE GOING THROUGH, 3,000
3 SOMETHING PEOPLE TO GET 60, THAT SHOWS THAT WE'RE REALLY ABLE
4 TO PICK FROM THE CREAM OF THE CROP AND IN MY YEARS OF ENGAGING
5 WITH YOU, I KNOW THAT HERE AT MTC WE HAVE A LOT OF REALLY GOOD
6 PEOPLE. I REMEMBER DAYS WHEN PEOPLE WOULD STAY LONGER JOBS. I
7 SEE OUR AVERAGE SERVICE IS ABOUT EIGHT AND A HALF YEARS. AND
8 THAT'S GOOD. I CAN'T -- I THINK I HAVE ONLY HAD ONE JOB IN MY
9 LIFE WHERE I EXCEEDED THAT. AND WE WANT TO ASK OUR, THE PEOPLE
10 WE LOSE, BECAUSE ABOUT HALF ARE RESIGNATIONS, ARE THEY GOING
11 ON TO OTHER PUBLIC AGENCIES, AND AS GOOD AS WE ARE, WHAT ARE
12 OTHER PUBLIC AGENCIES DOING AND HAVE THAT EXCEED WHAT WE DO,
13 AND ARE THESE ALSO PEOPLE WHO MAY BE MOVING TO OTHER PLACES.
14 BECAUSE IT'S PRETTY EXPENSIVE TO BE HERE IN THE BAY AREA. AND
15 I THINK A LOT OF THE BENEFITS, PENSIONS AND HEALTH CARE, ET
16 CETERA, IS PRETTY UNIFORM ACROSS THE BOARD WITH PUBLIC
17 AGENCIES HERE IN CALIFORNIA. AND SO THE QUESTION IS, IS THE
18 GRASS GREENER ON THE OTHER SIDE. AND I HOPE WE'LL CONTINUE TO
19 GET GOOD PEOPLE, BUT CAN WE GET TO THE POINT WHERE MAYBE SOME
20 DAY THE AVERAGE TENURE HERE WILL BE 25 YEARS, PEOPLE STAY HERE
21 AND RETIRE AND LOOK BACK ON A REALLY LONG GREAT CAREER HERE AT
22 MTC. THE TURNOVER DOESN'T WORK TOO GOOD FOR US.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
25 RAISED HANDS.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. THIS HEARING IS CLOSED. IS THERE
3 COMMISSIONER COMMENT? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** AT THE END THERE YOU SAID YOU GET FEEDBACK FROM
6 THE EMPLOYEES HOW IS THAT HANDLED? OR WHO REVIEWS THAT?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YES, WE REGULARLY ENGAGE STAFF FOR FEEDBACK, JUST
9 THROUGH NORMAL CHANNELS WITHIN SUPERVISORS AND INDIRECT
10 MEETINGS WE ALSO DO PERIODIC SURVEYS OF STAFF ON A VARIETY OF
11 TOPICS TO UNDERSTAND WHERE THEY ARE WITH OUR AGENCY AND
12 PERSPECTIVES ON OUR AGENCY.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** ARE THE SURVEYS CONFIDENTIAL.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** NO THE SURVEYS ARE PROVIDED TO STAFF THE RESULTS ARE
17 PROVIDED TO STAFF SO THEY'RE AWARE OF WHERE WE STAND THEY'RE
18 ENORMOUS EXCUSE ME THEY'RE ENORMOUS SURVEYS STAFF IDENTIFIED
19 GENERAL RESULTS ARE PROVIDED TO STAFF.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANYBODY ELSE? WE'LL CLOSE THAT ITEM.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM MADAM CHAIR.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT IS?



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY. I MOVE THAT WE MOVE
3 UP ITEM 12B --

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OH 8A. SORRY. INFORMATION? JUST WANT TO
6 MAKE SURE?

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES I DON'T HAVE ANY --

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. SECOND GUESSING MYSELF. PARDON ME.

11

12 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** JUST FOR CLARITY IS JUST TO HAVE THE
13 HEARING IN CASE ANYBODY WANTED TO SPEAK THERE IS NO ACTION
14 REQUIRED FROM THE COMMISSION AS A RESULT.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** APOLOGIES FOR THAT.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY THANK YOU FOR TRYING TO KEEP US ON THE
19 STRAIGHT AND NARROW. NOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM
20 12 A, SENATE BILL 63, TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE ENABLING
21 LEGISLATION. STAFF WILL PROVIDE A PRESENTATION ON THE ADVOCACY
22 FRAMEWORK TO GUIDE THE MEASURE'S FUNDING OF RIDER FOCUSED
23 IMPROVEMENTS BACKGROUND COMMISSIONERS REQUEST REGIONAL NETWORK
24 MANAGEMENT STAFF WILL ALSO REPORT ON PROGRESS OF VARIOUS
25 COMPONENTS OF THE BAY AREA TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.



JUNE 25, 2025

1 ACTION PLAN RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS ARE DIRECTLY INFORMING
2 THE PROPOSED INVESTMENT STRATEGY FOR SB63, I'LL TURN IT OVER
3 TO GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN AND MELANIE CHOY FOR THIS ITEM.

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR NOACK IF YOU DON'T MIND I WOULD LIKE TO
6 OPEN THIS.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** NOPE. PLEASE GO AHEAD.

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I WANT TO
11 KICKOFF THIS ITEM WITH HISTORICAL CONTEXT RELATED TO THE RIDER
12 FOCUSED INVESTMENT THAT STAFF ARE RECOMMENDING FOR INCLUSION
13 IN THE MEASURE TODAY SINCE THE PANDEMIC THE ADOPTION OF THE
14 BAY AREA TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IN 2021, MTC AND
15 BAY AREA OPERATORS HAVE STOOD UP THE REGIONAL NETWORK
16 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK WITH VARIOUS COMMITTEES THAT INCLUDE
17 TRANSIT AGENCY LEADERSHIP AS WELL AS CUSTOMERS. THE SO-CALLED
18 RNM WORK HAS PRIORITIZED FOUR INITIATIVES THAT THE BLUE RIBBON
19 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE RECOMMENDED AS EARLY ACTION ITEMS,
20 NAMELY FARE COORDINATION, ACCESSIBILITY, MAPPING AND
21 WAYFINDING, AND TRANSIT PRIORITY. COLLECTIVELY THESE FOUR
22 INITIATIVES AIM TO DELIVER A TRANSIT SYSTEM THAT'S FASTER MORE
23 AFFORDABLE MORE ACCESSIBLE AND EASY TO NAVIGATE. INITIATIVES
24 ARE BEARING FRUIT ALREADY AND HAVE POTENTIAL TO GROW RIDERSHIP
25 ON THE SCALE OF MULTI-BILLION DOLLARS CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 INVESTMENTS. WHEN IT COMES TO THE RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENT
2 CATEGORY I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT IT'S NOT ABOUT FUNDING FOR
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES VERSUS MTC THESE FUNDS WILL BE INVESTED TO
4 BENEFIT THE RIDER EXPERIENCE SO THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL
5 HAVE EVEN MORE RIDERS WHICH IN TURN WILL HELP STABILIZE THEIR
6 FINANCING OVER THE LONG-TERM. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
7 MELANIE AND GEORGIA WHO ARE GOING TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE
8 WORK TO DATE.

9

10 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU ANDY. MELANIE CHOY DIRECTOR OF
11 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS FOR
12 REQUESTING THIS UPDATE ON THE AGENCY'S TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
13 WORK AND IT'S A PLEASURE TO BE HERE WITH YOU TODAY. CAN I --
14 THERE IS A SLIDE DECK, CAN I HAVE THAT PULLED UP? A LITTLE BIT
15 OF HISTORY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AS A REGION, WE HAVE HAD A
16 LONG HISTORY OF WORKING TOGETHER ON TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY SINCE
17 1970S, AND THIS HAS NEVER BEEN AN EASY UNDERTAKING AND IN PART
18 IT'S DUE TO HOW WE HAVE HISTORICALLY FUNDED AND PRIORITIZED
19 TRANSIT IN THE REGION AND HOW AGENCIES WERE CREATED. WE ARE
20 FAMILIAR WITH REFERENCE TO THE 27 AGENCIES BUT IT'S NOT JUST
21 THE SHEER NUMBER OF AGENCIES THAT MAKES THIS WORK COMPLEX IT
22 REALLY IS THAT WE HAVE MULTIPLE MAJOR TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE
23 REGION BUT ALSO HAVE A MIXED SET OF MODES THAT WE HAVE IN OUR
24 EXPANSE I NETWORK. MTC IS ENTRUSTED WITH THE RESPONSIBILITY TO
25 COHESIVELY LINK THESE PIECES TOGETHER TO SERVE AS ONE BAY AREA



JUNE 25, 2025

1 NETWORK. DELIVERING CLIPPER WAS A FOCUS OF OUR TRANSIT
2 COORDINATION EFFORT SUPERVISOR IT TOOK ABOUT 20 YEARS GIVEN
3 THE COMPLEXITY OF FARE POLICIES AND TRANSIT AGENCY'S DEMANDS
4 BUT WE GOT THERE AND WE ALSO LAUNCHED 511 AND WE CONTINUE TO
5 PROVIDE THE BACK END API DATA ON TRANSIT SCHEDULES THAT FEEDS
6 INTO THE GOOGLE MAPS AND MANY OTHER APPS OUT THERE THAT ARE
7 BEING USED FOR TRANSIT PLANNING AND NOW THAT CLIPPER IS
8 OPERATIONAL ON ALMOST ALL SYSTEMS WE ARE SEEING ALL KIND OF
9 PROGRESS IN THE FARE PAYMENT SPACE MOST RECENTLY ON CLIPPER
10 START WE MOVED FROM PILOT ON FOUR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO ALL 22
11 CLIPPER AGENCIES IN A LITTLE MORE THAN FIVE YEARS. NEXT SLIDE
12 PLEASE. SO, THE SET OF RIDER FOCUSED INITIATIVES WE'RE WORKING
13 ON TODAY WAS GUIDED BY THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK
14 FORCE WHICH SOME OF YOU ALSO SAT ON AND OUR CURRENT JOURNEY
15 STARTED IN 2020, WHEN THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE WAS
16 ESTABLISHED AT THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC WHEN TRANSIT
17 RIDERSHIP DROPPED OVERNIGHT IT WAS CREATED FOR INDUSTRIES AND
18 RECOVERY IDENTIFY ACTIONS TO SHAPE TRANSIT MORE CONNECTED
19 RIDER FOCUSED NETWORK TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP APPROXIMATELY A
20 YEAR LATER IN 2021 THE TASK FORCE UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED THE
21 ACTION PLAN WHICH IS THE SET OF NEAR-TERM FOCUSED INITIATIVES
22 THAT ARE LISTED ON THE SLIDE TODAY AND WE ARE FOCUSING ON
23 DELIVERING KEY PROGRAMS ALCOHOL BE HIGHLIGHTED IN LATER SLIDES
24 TO FORMALIZE THIS WORK WE RECOGNIZE THAT A NEW GOVERNANCE
25 STRUCTURE WAS NEEDED TO GUIDE PRIORITIES AND DECISIONS SO WE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 TOOK ON THIS EFFORT IN 2022 WITH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
2 BUSINESS CASE EVALUATION AND THEN IN 2023, THE RNM WAS STOOD
3 UP AND IT HAS BEEN OPERATIONAL FOR ALMOST TWO YEARS. NEXT
4 SLIDE, PLEASE. STEMMING FROM THE BUSINESS CASE IN 2023, THE
5 FRAMEWORK ON THIS SLIDE THAT YOU SEE IS THE FRAMEWORK THAT WAS
6 ADOPTED FOR THE RNM FOR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. AND I'M
7 NOT GOING TO REVIEW THE STRUCTURE NOW, BUT SUFFICE TO SAY
8 THERE IS EXTENSIVE OPPORTUNITIES FOR FEEDBACK AND INPUT AT ALL
9 LEVELS AND THE GENERAL CONSENSUS IS WORKING QUITE WELL. THE
10 RNM ROLE IS UNIQUE, AND AS THE DIRECTOR, I AM AN MTC EMPLOYEE
11 BUT I'M EQUALLY RESPONSIBLE TO ALL THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND
12 ALSO FOR ALL OF OUR INITIATIVES THAT WE'RE FOCUSED ON IN THE
13 SUITE OF PROGRAMS, WE ARE JOINTLY LEADING THESE PROJECTS AND
14 PROGRAMS IN PARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF UNDER A
15 COPROJECT MANAGEMENT MODEL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, IN 2021,
16 THE COMMISSION ALSO APPROVED A ONE TIME COMMITMENT OF 85
17 MILLION FROM COVID RELIEF MONEY AND THESE INVESTMENTS WERE
18 SEEDING THE FUNDING -- WERE THE SEED FUNDING TO KICK START
19 THESE PROGRAMS. SO SOME OF THESE REQUIRE ONGOING ANNUAL
20 FUNDING AND OTHERS REQUIRE EXTENSIVE CAPITAL INVESTMENTS. SB63
21 FUNDING COULD ACCELERATE THEIR COMPLETION IN THE CASE OF
22 CAPITAL PROJECTS AND EXTEND THEM IN THE CASE OF OPERATIONAL
23 PROJECTS THAT WE HAVE LISTED IN THE PROGRAM. OVER THE PAST
24 FIVE YEARS CUSTOMER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS HAVE BEEN PRIORITIZED
25 REPEATEDLY THESE ARE TRANSIT NETWORK PROGRAMS AND NOT MTC'S,



JUNE 25, 2025

1 AND WHAT OUR ROLE IS FOCUSED ON IS DRIVING TOWARDS OUTCOMES
2 FOR A HARMONIZED CONVENIENT RELIABLE TRANSIT NETWORK FOR
3 RIDERS WITH THESE INITIATIVES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, I'M
4 GOING TO SEGUE INTO SPEAKING TO SOME OF THE INITIATIVES. THE
5 FIRST IS SIMPLIFYING FARES. UNDER THIS AREA, WE HAVE THREE KEY
6 PILOTS CURRENTLY THAT WE ARE PURSUING, TWO OF THESE HAVE
7 ALREADY BEEN TESTED THROUGH PILOT PROGRAMS AND THE THIRD ONE
8 WHICH IS THE DISCOUNTED AND FREE TRANSFERS THIS WILL GO LIVE
9 WITH THE LAUNCH OF CLIPPER NEXT GENERATION, AND ALSO BACK IN
10 MAY, OUR CLIPPER START PILOT MOVED FROM THE PILOT TO THE
11 ONGOING DISCOUNT PROGRAM. AND SO A FEW KEY THINGS WE'RE
12 SEEING, SINCE CLIPPER START OVER 6 MILLION TRIPS HAVE BEEN
13 TAKING BY CLIPPER START RIDERS AND THE ONGOING PROGRAM IS
14 MAKING TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE TO ELIGIBLE BAY AREA ADULTS AND
15 HAS GROWN BY ABOUT 2,000 RIDERS PER MONTH AROUND CLIPPER BAY
16 PASS WHICH IS THE UNLIMITED UNIVERSAL TRANSIT PASS THAT WORKS
17 ON ALL TRANSIT AGENCIES PHASE ONE STUDENTS WITH ACCESS TO
18 CLIPPER BAY PASS TOOK 30% MORE TRIPS AS COMPARED TO PEERS THAT
19 DID NOT HAVE CLIPPER BAY PASS. IN PHASE TWO OVER 2 MILLION
20 TRIPS TAKEN IN THE LAST YEAR AND PHASE TWO EXTEND TO EMPLOYER
21 GROUPS CLIPPER BAY PASS IS TRULY A GAME CHAMBER IN TERMS OF
22 DRIVING UP TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND WHAT IS UNIQUE ABOUT THIS IS
23 OTHER THAN STAFF ADMINISTRATION TO HELP ENROLL MORE
24 INSTITUTIONS THE PROGRAM IS SELF-FUNDED WITH AN INSURANCE
25 MODEL WHERE THE INSTITUTION OR WHOMEVER IS PAYING FOR THE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 PASSES PAYS A FLAT RATE TO COVER THE WORKERS OR STUDENTS, AS
2 THE CASE MAY BE. FINALLY, OUR LAST PILOT IS THE FREE
3 DISCOUNTED TRANSFER PILOT AND THAT IS SET TO LAUNCH SOON. IT
4 PROJECTED TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP BY UP TO 30,000 RIDES
5 PER DAY WHICH IS TWICE AS MANY PEOPLE THAT FIT INTO THE CHASE
6 CENTER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SECOND AREA I WANT TO FOCUS ON IS
7 CUSTOMER INFORMATION AND THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT.
8 SO, WE ARE, ON THIS PROGRAM WE'RE WORKING COLLABORATIVELY WITH
9 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND THE PUBLIC TO STANDARDIZE THE CUSTOMER
10 INFORMATION AT OVER 200 STATIONS AND 21,000 BUS STOPS AROUND
11 THE REGION. IN '20 AND '21, 90% OF RESIDENTS TOLD US THIS WAS
12 IMPORTANT THAT'S BECAUSE EACH AGENCY PORTRAYS ITS SERVICE
13 DIFFERENTLY SO NEW RIDERS MUST LEARN HOW TO READ SIGNS MAPS
14 AND SCHEDULES FOR A SECOND OR THIRD TIME SIGNAGE CAN MAKE
15 PEOPLE FEEL LOST CONFUSED AND LEADING THEM TO MISSING THEIR
16 BUS, TRAIN, OR CONNECTION AND ENOUGH TO TURN AN ANGRY RIDER
17 AWAY FROM TRANSIT BUT WITH UNIFIED REGIONAL WAYFINDING
18 STANDARDS AND FOCUS ON ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS WE'RE
19 LOWERING BARRIERS TO TAKE TRANSIT AND ENABLING PEOPLE TO RIDE
20 WITH CONFIDENCE AND INCREASE RIDERSHIP, TODAY WE HAVE
21 DELIVERED THREE PROTOTYPES, ONE EL CERRITO, AND SANTA ROSA, TO
22 COLLECT POWELL IN SAN FRANCISCO -- TO COLLECT FEEDBACK FROM
23 RIDERS ON THESE INITIAL DESIGNS SO AFTER THESE NEW SIGNS AND
24 MAPS WERE INSTALLED NEARLY 90% OF SURVEY TAKERS SAID IT WAS
25 EASY OR VERY EASY TO FIND THEIR WAY AROUND THE STATION THIS IS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 AN INCREASE OF UP TO 32% POINTS FROM BEFORE THE SIGNS WERE
2 INSTALLED STARTING IN 2026 WE PLAN TO EXPAND THE REMAINING
3 REGIONAL HUB PILOT SITES IN EACH OF THE STATIONS WILL BE FULLY
4 RETROFITTED WITH PERMANENT SIGNS AND MAPS TO FURTHER REFINE
5 THE STANDARDS. AROUND TRANSIT PRIORITY THE FOCUS OF OUR
6 PROGRAM IS ABOUT MAKE BUSES FASTER AND MORE RELIABLE THROUGH
7 ROADWAY DESIGN TRAFFIC SIGNAL TIMING AND OTHER INVESTMENTS
8 ACROSS CALIFORNIA THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY IMPROVING RELIABILITY
9 OF THE SPEED OF TRANSIT UNIVERSALLY RECOGNIZED AS ONE OF THE
10 HIGHEST PRIORITIES IN THE LAST YEAR WE ESTABLISHED A NEW GRANT
11 PROGRAM THAT AWARDED \$22 MILLION ACROSS 14 PROJECTS OUTS OF
12 THESE PROJECTS WE'RE EXPECTING TO IMPROVE TRANSIT SPEED AND
13 RELIABILITY BY UP TO 10 TO 40% SO TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS
14 CAN BE CHALLENGING TIME CONSUMING BECAUSE THEY FREQUENTLY NEED
15 APPROVAL FROM A LOT OF AGENCIES INCLUDING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
16 CALTRANS WHO OVERSEE LOCAL ADJUSTMENTS TO ROADS AND STAY
17 HIGHWAY SYSTEM OUR WORK HERE IS TO BRIDGE THE GAP AND MAKE
18 STRATEGIC INVESTMENTS THAT WILL IMPROVE TRANSIT RELIABILITY IN
19 KEY LOCATIONS IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ON
20 ACCESSIBILITY, THIS IS OUR LAST AREA OF FOCUS TODAY, OUR
21 ACCESSIBILITY WORK MAKES IT EASIER FOR OLDER ADULTS AND PEOPLE
22 WITH DISABILITIES TO GET AROUND THE REGION SENIORS ARE THE
23 FASTEST GROWING SEGMENT OF THE BAY AREA'S POPULATION FOR THE
24 LAST THREE YEARS WE HAVE DEVELOPED A MORE CONSISTENT
25 ELIGIBILITY PROCESS FOR ADA PARATRANSIT AND RTC CLIPPER ACCESS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 PROGRAM WE'RE MAKING IT EASIER FOR PARATRANSIT RIDERS TO PAY
2 FARES THROUGH CLIPPER AND WE'RE ALSO CURRENTLY NARROWING DOWN
3 OUR CANDIDATE ONE-SEAT RIDE PARATRANSIT PILOTS AND MAKING
4 EASIER FOR RIDER WHO ARE CROSSING SERVICE BOUNDARIES AND
5 LASTLY WE'LL WORK WITH EACH COUNTY TO DESIGNATE A MOBILITY
6 MANAGER WHICH WILL PROVIDE TRAVEL TRAINING CUSTOMIZED
7 INFORMATION AND REFERRAL SERVICES, TRIP PLANNING ASSISTANCE TO
8 RIDERS AND HELP TRANSIT COMMUNITY-BASED PROGRAM COOPERATE AND
9 OPERATE MORE EFFICIENTLY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND IN LOOKING
10 FORWARD, WE HAVE A NUMBER OF HIGHLIGHTS THAT I HAVE SHOWCASED
11 OR HIGHLIGHTED IN THE LAST FEW SLIDES SO I'M NOT GOING TO
12 RECAP SOME OF THESE THINGS HERE IN THIS SLIDE. THE RNM HAS
13 BEEN UP AND RUNNING FOR ABOUT TWO YEARS AND WE HAVE BEEN
14 WORKING TO DELIVER IMPROVEMENTS TO THE RIDERS, THERE STRUCTURE
15 ENABLES MTC TO IMPLEMENT ITS TRANSIT COORDINATION
16 RESPONSIBILITIES IN PARTNERSHIP WITH TRANSIT AGENCY WHO IS
17 HAVE TECHNICAL EXPERTISE ON THE PROGRAMS OPPORTUNITY TO
18 PROVIDE EARLY UPDATE TO YOU AS YOU CONSIDER HOW TO FUND THE
19 COMMISSION ADVOCATE FOR DELIVERING THESE IMPROVEMENTS IN THE
20 NEW REGIONAL MEASURE FUNDING AND THESE PROGRAMS COULD TAKE
21 DECADES BUT WE HAVE BEEN MAKING GOOD PROGRESS AS YOU CAN SEE
22 THERE IS A HANDOUT ALSO IN THE PACKET THAT HAS MORE DETAILS
23 AND SPECIFICS ABOUT OUR WORK AND THESE ARE ADEQUATELY
24 RESOURCED AND IF MTC AND OPERATORS CONTINUE TO PRIORITIZE THEM



JUNE 25, 2025

1 WE CAN HOPEFULLY MAKE SOME SERIOUS PROGRESS IN THIS DECADE
2 WITH THAT CHAIR NOACK I'M AVAILABLE TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS.
3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU MELANIE AND GEORGIA WAS GOING TO
5 GO AFTER THAT, RIGHT? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** REAL QUICK DO WE HAVE A SET TIME FRAME ON HOW LONG
8 IT TAKES THESE PILOTS AND HOW WE GET BEYOND THEM?
9

10 **MELANIE CHOY:** IN PARTICULAR THERE ARE PILOTS IN MANY OF THE
11 FARE PROGRAMS CATEGORY SO FOR THAT WE HAVE DONE A TWO YEAR
12 PILOT PERIOD 1 TO 2 YEARS WE'RE PILOTING IT THEN ASSESSING AT
13 THE END OF TWO YEARS THE CHOICE TO CONTINUE ADDITIONAL PILOTS
14 OR TO SWITCH TO AN ONGOING PROGRAM IN TERMS OF THE MAPPING AND
15 WAYFINDING PROGRAM WE'RE ALSO DOING PILOTS AND THE PILOTS IN
16 THAT AREA ARE SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT IN THE WAY WE'RE REFINING
17 STANDARDS, GETTING THE SIGN AM AGE OUT THERE AND SHE HOW WE
18 FUNCTION HOW WE SCALE MOBILIZE WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES SO
19 THE PILOTS FOR THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROGRAM IS SET TO
20 TAKES 2026 AND INTO 2027 BECAUSE WE'RE ROLLING OUT INTO SOME
21 OF THE OTHER COUNTIES ABOVE AND BEYOND PILOTS FOR THE NINE
22 COUNTIES.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** SO IT DEFINITELY DEPENDS ON WHICH AREA YOU'RE
25 PILOTING THERE. SO, YEAH, IT'S THE FRUSTRATION WITH THE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, A TWO-YEAR PILOT DOESN'T REALLY SEEM -
2 - IT SEEMS WAY TOO LONG, CONSIDERING OTHER PLACES IN THE WORLD
3 JUST DO IT ALL THE TIME, AND [LAUGHTER] IT'S JUST -- THAT PART
4 IS FRUSTRATING TO MANY OF US. SO, IF YOU, AND AS WE PROGRESS
5 HERE, IS THERE A WAY TO STREAMLINE CERTAIN PILOTS? LIKE THIS
6 ONE, WHICH MANY OF US CONSIDER A NO-BRAINER [LAUGHTER] THAT
7 WOULD BE HELPFUL IN THAT IT REACHES THE CUSTOMER SOONER. SO,
8 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** JUST TRYING TO SEE WHO WAS IN BETWEEN
11 COMMISSIONER FLEMING SORRY.

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU CHAIR. THANK YOU MELANIE. GREAT
14 REPORT. I HAVE A QUESTION FOR YOU, WHEN YOU SAY THAT YOU'RE
15 EQUALLY RESPONSIBLE TO THE COMMISSION AND THE TRANSIT AGENCY,
16 I ASSUME YOU MEAN THE 27 OPERATORS NOT THE COUNTY -- THE
17 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION -- BUT WHAT I'M CURIOUS TO KNOW IS THAT
18 A FORMAL STRUCTURE AND IF SO HOW IS THAT DESIGNATED?

19

20 **MELANIE CHOY:** THE FORMAL STRUCTURE IS THROUGH THE RNM COUNCIL
21 WHICH IS A BODY ON THAT SLIDE AS WELL AND THAT BODY IS MADE OF
22 TEN GENERAL MANAGERS AND MTC'S EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AS WELL AND
23 IN TERMS OF THAT BODY THERE IS A BY LAW, OR SET OF --
24 EFFECTIVELY, BYLAWS UNDER THAT GROUP, THERE IS
25 RESPONSIBILITIES OF THIS ROLE RESPONDING AND REPORTING ALSO TO



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THE RNM COUNCIL AND THE TRANSIT OPERATOR GM'S THROUGH THAT
2 BUILD SO IT'S FUNCTIONALLY THROUGH THE RNM COMMITTEE PROCESS,
3 OR COUNCIL PROCESS.

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YEAH, I SEE IT ON HERE. I'M JUST -- MY
6 WHEELS ARE TURNING JUST ABOUT -- IT'S UNUSUAL DESIGNATION BUT
7 THANK YOU FOR EXPLAINING. I APPRECIATE IT.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES, A FEW QUESTIONS. FIRST OF ALL, CAN YOU GIVE
12 US A LITTLE BIT MORE INFORMATION ON THE FREE DISCOUNT TRANSIT
13 PILOT?

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** ADDITIONAL INFORMATION IN TERMS OF FUNCTIONALLY?
16 WHEN WE PLAN TO ROLL IT OUT IN TERMS OF THE FREE DISCOUNT
17 TRANSFERS CURRENTLY, SO IF YOU ARE TRAVELING AS A PATRON FROM
18 ONE SYSTEM TO ANOTHER SYSTEM AND YOU WANT TO TRANSFER IN A
19 SYSTEM FUNCTIONALLY HOW IT WORKS IS YOUR TRIP ON THE SECOND
20 RIDE WILL BE FREE UP TO \$2.85. AND, SO, YOUR FIRST RIDE IS THE
21 RIDE YOU PAY, SO IF YOU TAKE AC TRANSIT AND TRANSFER TO BART,
22 YOU WILL GET A \$2.85 DISCOUNT ON YOUR WHOLE TRIP SO
23 EFFECTIVELY CALCULATIONS WILL BE DONE AFTER YOUR TRIPS ARE
24 DONE BUT ESSENTIALLY IT'S EMBEDDED INTO YOUR CLIPPER CARD
25 TRANSACTIONS.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY. THEN ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
3 STRUCTURE, THE THREE SMALL TRANSIT OPERATORS WHO IS ON THERE
4 NOW? THE THREE?

5

6 **MELANIE CHOY:** CURRENTLY COUNTY CONNECTION, MARIN TRANSIT, AND
7 WETA, THE WATER EMERGENCY TRANSIT AUTHORITY AS THE
8 REPRESENTATIVES FOR THE THREE SMALL TRANSIT AGENCIES.

9

10 **NATHAN MILEY:** OKAY. THE 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE BAY
11 AREA, I'M SORRY, I WASN'T HERE WHEN THIS WAS SET UP, BUT HOW
12 IS IT DETERMINED THAT ONLY THREE SMALL OPERATORS WOULD BE ON
13 THIS BODY?

14

15 **MELANIE CHOY:** THAT WAS DETERMINED THROUGH THE NETWORK
16 MANAGEMENT BUSINESS CASE AND THAT WAS THROUGH THE PROCESS IN
17 2022. IT WAS NOT DETERMINED BY THIS COMMISSION. IT WAS --
18 WELL, THE COMMISSION ADOPTED THE FRAMEWORK, BUT THE
19 RECOMMENDATION DID COME THROUGH THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE
20 BUSINESS CASE ANALYSIS. AND IT WAS DETERMINED IN TERMS OF THE
21 BALANCE OF THE OPERATOR AND TO BE EFFECTIVE, THAT THE SIZE OF
22 THE GROUP, THOSE WERE SOME OF THE FACTORS THAT WENT INTO THAT
23 RECOMMENDATION AND DECISION-MAKING.

24



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** I SEE. ARE THERE EVER VOTES TAKEN OR ANYTHING
2 LIKE THAT?

3

4 **MELANIE CHOY:** AT THE COUNCIL YES THE COUNCIL DOES TAKE ACTION
5 ON SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS AND WE HIGHLIGHT THE ACTIONS THAT
6 ARE TAKEN BEFORE THEY GO TO THE RNM COMMITTEE THEY DON'T TAKE
7 ACTION ON EVERY SINGLE ITEM THAT GOES TO THE RNM COMMITTEE
8 SOME OF THE ITEMS ARE AT THE PURVIEW OF THE COMMISSION AND SO
9 TO THE DEGREE THAT THE COUNCIL DOES TAKE ACTION THOSE ARE
10 BROUGHT FORWARD TO THE RNM COMMITTEE IN TERMS I WANT TO
11 HIGHLIGHT IN TERMS OF THE SMALL OPERATOR REPRESENTATION THE
12 COUNCIL ITSELF HAS A TWO-YEAR TERM AND SO THOSE THREE
13 AGENCIES, IT'S NOT A FIXED SET IN TERMS OF THOSE AGENCIES, AND
14 AS THE TERMS END FOR THAT PERIOD OF TIME, THE THREE AGENCIES
15 IS ALSO UP FOR DISCUSSION, AND THAT IS BY THE COORDINATION AND
16 THE PURVIEW OF THE SMALLER AGENCIES IN TERMS OF DETERMINING.

17

18 **NATHAN MILEY:** AND IS THERE ANY -- THE VOTING THAT TAKES PLACE,
19 IS IT WEIGHTED? OR IS IT ONE AGENCY PER VOTE?

20

21 **MELANIE CHOY:** ONE-SEAT; ONE VOTE.

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** AND THE ALARM AGENCIES AND THE SMALL TRANSIT
24 PROVIDERS, WHAT -- IS THERE ANY FRICTION? HOW DID WE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 DETERMINE, YOU KNOW, EFFICACY, AND PERFORMANCE METRICS AND
2 THINGS OF THAT NATURE?

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, ALIX BOCKELMAN, CHIEF
5 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, I DID WANT TO NOTE THAT ONE OF THE
6 IMPORTANT THINGS ABOUT THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
7 FRAMEWORK IS THAT IT DOES CALL FOR EVALUATION AFTER TWO YEARS
8 AND WE'RE KIND OF IN THAT PROCESS RIGHT NOW TO SEE WHAT WAS
9 WORKING WHAT MIGHT NEED TO BE ADJUSTED TO BE MORE EFFECTIVE.
10 ON THE POINT OF THE SMALL OPERATORS, YOU KNOW, THE THREE THAT
11 ARE SERVING NOW AND AS MELANIE NOTES, IT CHANGES, THE SMALL
12 OPERATORS DO GET TOGETHER AND PROVIDE INPUT TO THE SELECT
13 SMALL OPERATOR REPRESENTATIVES AND I BELIEVE THAT THE SMALL
14 OPERATOR REPRESENTATIVES THAT SIT ON THE COUNCIL ARE SPEAKING
15 FOR THE SMALL OPERATOR SUPERVISOR THERE ARE OTHER VENUES WHERE
16 THEY GET TOGETHER AND GET GREATER INPUT AND I THINK SOMETIMES
17 MELANIE ATTENDS THOSE VENUES I WANT TO NOTE THAT WRAP AROUND
18 AND ONE THING THAT WAS STATED ON THE FREE AND REDUCED FARE
19 JUST TO MAKE SURE IT'S CLEAR, OBVIOUSLY IT'S CUSTOMER FOCUSED
20 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE RIDER CAN TRANSFER BETWEEN SYSTEMS AND
21 NOT BE PENALIZED BUT THE FUNDING THAT THE COMMISSION HAS SET
22 ASIDE FOR THAT REALLY HELPS TO MAKE SURE THAT THE OPERATOR
23 DOESN'T SEE A LOSS BECAUSE OF THAT. SO, THE MONEY WOULD GO
24 BACK TO AC TRANSIT OR BART IN WHATEVER PROPORTION, SO THEY CAN



JUNE 25, 2025

1 OFFER THAT BENEFIT AND NOT HAVE A FINANCIAL LOSS TO THEM. JUST
2 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S THERE.

3

4 **NATHAN MILEY:** THE REASON I'M ASKING ABOUT SMALL OPERATORS
5 VERSUS LARGE, ALL THE TIME, BART. BUT LAFTA IS IN THE TRI-
6 VALLEY, AND JUST NEED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE COGNIZANT OF THE
7 SMALL OPERATORS. NOW, PROBABLY SHOULDN'T ASK IT, BUT WHAT IS
8 THE THINKING AROUND CONSOLIDATION? IS THAT JUST SOMETHING
9 THAT'S BEEN PUSHED WAY OUT INTO THE FUTURES AT SOME UNKNOWN
10 DATE, TIME, PLACE, CIRCUMSTANCE, WHEN, YOU KNOW, THE WORLD HAS
11 COME TO AN END?

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** DO YOU WANT TO TRY THAT. I'M HAPPY TO
14 ADDRESS IT AS WELL.

15

16 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I'M HAPPY TO YOU HAVE ADDRESS IT.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO, THE CONSOLIDATION THAT WAS INVOLVED IN
19 THE 1031 THAT WAS REQUESTED AGAIN AND THE AUTHORS, YOU KNOW,
20 DIDN'T WANT TO PUT IT IN THEIR BILL, AND THAT HAS REMAINED.
21 THAT HAS NOT BEEN PUT IN THE BILL. THE EFFICIENCY STUDY THAT'S
22 IN THERE IS SUPPOSED TO BE LOOKED AT OVER TIME AND MIGHT GIVE
23 SUGGESTIONS TO COORDINATION, OR COLLABORATION, OR EVEN
24 CONSOLIDATION, BUT THEY'RE NOT REQUIREMENTS, THE STUDY JUST
25 THE REQUIREMENT. NOW, PART OF THAT IS SENATOR WAHAB DID HAVE A



JUNE 25, 2025

1 REQUEST TO THE AUDIT COMMITTEE, JOINT LEGISLATIVE AUDIT
2 COMMITTEE, THAT THE FOUR -- CHRISTY IS NODDING IN THE BACK,
3 ARE THE FOUR SMALL AGENCIES IN THE EAST BAY, BE AUDITED AND
4 THERE IS A SERIES OF QUESTIONS. IT'S REALLY AN AUDIT TO TAKE A
5 LOOK AT WHERE THERE MIGHT BE EFFICIENCIES, WHAT THE NUMBERS
6 LOOK LIKE. IT'S NOT MEANT TO BE A CRITICAL, YOU KNOW, "WHAT
7 DID YOU DO WRONG" IT'S A STUDY TO LOOK AT OPPORTUNITIES AND
8 WHETHER TO CONSOLIDATE AND WHAT THOSE NUMBERS LOOK LIKE THAT
9 WAS APPROVED AT THE AUDIT COMMITTEE AND I BELIEVE THEY'RE
10 SUPPOSED TO START THAT PROCESS IN THE FALL. AND IT COULD TAKE
11 A WHILE TO GET THROUGH, BECAUSE THERE IS QUITE A FEW AGENCIES
12 TO LOOK AT. BUT THAT'S -- THERE IS NO CONDITION IN SB63 FOR
13 CONSOLIDATION, JUST SUFFICIENTLY STUDY.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** ALSO TO ADDRESS YOUR ISSUE NATE WITH THE
16 COORDINATION. SUE AND I SIT ON THE COUNTY CONNECTION AND THE
17 EAST BAY SMALL OPERATORS MEET REGULARLY, WITH SUE AND ME
18 REGULARLY TO TALK ABOUT ISSUE THERE IS A LOT OF COORDINATION
19 WITH THEM AND WHILE BILL CHURCHILL IS THE REPRESENTATIVE FROM
20 COUNTY CONNECTION WHO SITS ON THIS HE IS VERY MUCH
21 REPRESENTING A VERY CONSISTENT UNIFIED VOICE OF ALL THE
22 OPERATORS PARTICULARLY BECAUSE WE'RE ALREADY DOING A LOT OF
23 THINGS IN COORDINATION LIKE THE ONE-SEAT RIDE WITH LAVTA SO
24 THERE IS A LOT THAT'S ALREADY IN PLACE, AND SUMMER WE'RE DOING



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THE FREE SUMMER BUS RIDES SO IT'S NOT LIKE COUNTY CONNECTION
2 IS ALONE OUT THERE.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THEY COORDINATE SCHEDULES AND THE LIKE I
5 THINK THIS AUDIT WILL REFLECT THE AMOUNT OF COOPERATION THAT'S
6 ALREADY GOING ON IN THOSE FOUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO, YEAH.

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH, NATE, I WANTED TO ADD, THE
9 DIRECTOR OF MARIN TRANSIT, NANCY WHELAN, HAD HER OWN TRANSIT
10 CONSULTING BUSINESS HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO FOR MANY YEARS,
11 SHE'S CONSULTED WITH NEARLY EVERY TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE BAY
12 AREA AND LOS ANGELES. SO COMING FROM MARIN TRANSIT, I THINK
13 SHE HAS A GOOD BEAD, AS DOES EAST BAY COUNTER PART ON SMALL
14 TRANSIT AGENCY SHE DID FINANCIAL AND REVENUE STUDIES FOR THESE
15 AGENCIES. MARIN TRANSIT WAS CREATED, WHOLE CLOTH AS A SINGLE
16 PROVIDER IN MARIN COUNTY SO IT'S NEVER HAD TO GO THROUGH
17 CONSOLIDATION BUT IT DOES POSITION THEM WELL TO BE PART OF THE
18 MARIN SONOMA STUDY ON 101 COORDINATION OF TRANSIT SERVICES.
19 WHICH IS COMING UNDER THE NAME "MASCOT" JUST TO SAY I THINK
20 YOU HAVE GOOD REPRESENTATION FOR SMALL TRANSIT PROVIDERS AND
21 IF IT'S TIME TO CHANGE IT UP THE NEXT TIME WE RENEW, THAT'S
22 FINE TOO. BUT I WANTED TO GIVE SOME -- THAT IT ISN'T MARIN
23 CENTRAL OVER THERE.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MELGAR.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **MYRNA MELGAR:** JUST TO TALK ABOUT RESPONSE TO SOME OF THE
3 COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS ABOUT EVALUATION SO I APPRECIATE THAT
4 WONDERING I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE STANDARDIZED WAY TO
5 LOOK AT WAYFINDING AND MAPPING I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT AND I'M
6 WONDERING THE TWO YEAR EVALUATION THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT
7 HOW DOES THAT FEEDBACK MECHANISM HAPPEN WITH THE LOCAL AGENCY.
8 I'M WONDERING IF WE HAVE EVALUATED WHETHER IT'S FASTER MORE
9 EFFECTIVE TO JUST HAVE THE LOCAL AGENCIES DO IT WITH YOUR
10 GUIDANCE AND STANDARDS IF THAT DATA IS GOING TO BE SHARED WITH
11 LOCAL AGENCIES THAT'S ONE PART OF THE QUESTION THE OTHER
12 QUESTION IS I'M A BIG FAN OF CLIPPER START AND THE BAY PASS. I
13 HAVE THREE LARGE INSTITUTIONS IN MY DISTRICT, SAN FRANCISCO
14 STATE, UCSF, AND CITY COLLEGE THAT ARE INTERESTED IN ALL THIS.
15 WHEN WE MADE MUNI FREE FOR KIDS IN SAN FRANCISCO, WE SAW A
16 COUPLE OF THINGS TRUANCY RATES AT SFUSD NUMBER OF TRIPS MIDDLE
17 SCHOOL HIGH SCHOOL KIDS TAKING MUNI WENT WAY UP, EVALUATE
18 SOMETHING LIKE THAT YOU HAVE TO SHARE WITH THE LOCAL AGENCIES
19 NOTES INIALLY JUST TRANSIT AGENCIES BUT I'M WONDERING WHAT IS
20 THE FEEDBACK MECHANISM YOUR EVALUATION TO PROCESS TO
21 INCORPORATE THOSE KINDS OF DATA POINTS TO SEE WHETHER THOSE
22 THINGS ARE WORKING AS INTENDED. THANK YOU.

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I'LL LET MELANIE SPEAK TO THE EVALUATION
25 PROCESS, BECAUSE IT'S ONGOING AND WHO WE'RE TOUCHING BASE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 WITH. BUT WE'RE TRYING TO GET A LOT OF INPUT. MANY
2 COMMISSIONERS HAVE BEEN ASKED TO PROVIDE INPUT, BUT ALSO THE
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES, LOCAL PARTNERS, STAKEHOLDERS. BUT I DID WANT
4 TO SPEAK TO THE POINT ABOUT THE, YOU KNOW, THE AGENCIES --
5 WHETHER IT'S BETTER FOR THE AGENCIES TO DELIVER. I DID WANT TO
6 NOTE THAT FOR THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT, WE JUST GAVE
7 AN UPDATE TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL ON
8 MONDAY, SO IT'S FRESH IN MY MIND. ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE
9 DOING WITH THE STANDARDS ET CETERA WE'RE GOING TO BE AT A
10 POINT WHERE THE AGENCIES ARE GOING TO LEAD SOME OF THE PILOTS
11 AS WELL SO WE CAN EVALUATE KIND OF THE YOU KNOW THAT'S GREAT
12 AND WE WANT MORE OF THAT SO WE'LL BE ABLE TO EVALUATE THAT BUT
13 WE HAVEN'T DONE IT YET SO I DON'T KNOW THAT WE CAN EVALUATE
14 THE DELIVERY MECHANISM BECAUSE WE'RE STILL EARLY AND I THINK
15 THAT'S IMPORTANT AND MAYBE I'LL LET DIRECTOR CHOY ADD TO THAT
16 TO THE VALUING PROCESS.

17

18 **MELANIE CHOY:** TO EXPAND IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE EVALUATION,
19 THERE IS EVALUATION BEING DONE ON A NUMBER OF FRONTS, JUST TO
20 HIGHLIGHT. THERE IS EVALUATION ON EACH OF THE PROGRAMS WHICH
21 IS, FOR EXAMPLE, THE FARE PROGRAMS, EACH OF THE FARE PROGRAMS
22 AND THEN THERE IS EVALUATIONS ON THE PROJECT, THE CAPITAL
23 PROJECT, THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT AND THEN OVERALL
24 ON STRUCTURE AND HOW WE'RE FUNCTIONING ON THE FRAMEWORK THIS
25 OTHER EVALUATION ALL HAPPENING IN THIS TWO YEAR TIME FRAME OF



JUNE 25, 2025

1 US STANDING ALL THIS WORK UP. IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT, I'LL
2 TAKE THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT IN PARTICULAR, IN
3 TERMS OF PROVIDING INPUT ON THAT, ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE
4 DOING WITH THE PILOT IS FIGURING OUT HOW DO YOU MOBILIZE AND
5 SCALE THIS WORK. SO ONE OF THE KEY THINGS WE'RE LOOKING TO DO
6 IS GET THAT INPUT FROM THAT -- OUR PILOTS, AND THEN TURN THAT
7 OVER AND DEVELOP AN IMPLEMENTATION AND SCALABILITY PLAN THAT
8 ALSO APPLIES TO THE FARE PROGRAM AS WE'RE EVALUATING THE
9 PROGRAM TO FIGURE OUT WHAT WORKS AND MECHANICS OF HOW YOU
10 DESIGN IT, BUT IT'S ALSO HOW YOU MOBILIZE IT AND IMPLEMENT TO
11 THE SCALE OF THE REGION. BECAUSE ONE WAS THE THINGS WE'RE NOT
12 LOOKING TO DO IS TAKE ON ALMOST ANOTHER ENTITY TO MOBILIZE WE
13 WANT TO LEVERAGE ALL RESOURCES WE HAVE OUT THERE WITH TRANSIT
14 SO WE'RE NOT DOUBLE-DOING THE EXPERTISE BUT CAPITALIZING ON
15 THE RESOURCES FOR EFFICIENCY. AND THE SECOND PIECE OF
16 EVALUATION IS ONGOING AND WE PLAN TO COME BACK TO THE RNM
17 COMMITTEE IN THE FALL OR LATER THIS YEAR AT THE END OF THE
18 CALENDAR YEAR WITH RESULTS ON EVALUATION BUT IN TERMS OF THE
19 EVALUATION OF PROJECTS AS RESULTS COME THROUGH WE'RE COMING TO
20 THE RNM COMMITTEE WITH UPDATES. THE.

21

22 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THROUGH THE CHAIR I WANT TO ASK -- THANK YOU FOR
23 THE ANSWERS, WAS I HOPING YOU COULD TALK ABOUT THE AT THAT
24 TIME SHARING NOT JUST, SORT OF, INPUT. BECAUSE INPUT SOUNDS
25 LIKE TELL ME WHAT YOU THINK AS OPPOSED TO HERE IS THE DATA WE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 HAVE COLLECTED, YOU KNOW, HOW DOES AFFECT YOU AND HOW CAN WE
2 MAKE SURE THAT WE IMPROVE TOGETHER. SO IT'S -- THAT WAS MORE
3 MY QUESTION. IS THAT SOMETHING THAT'S HAPPENING THROUGH YOUR
4 EVALUATION PROCESS? ESPECIALLY AS YOU DESCRIBED IT BEING A
5 VERY SHORT TIME FRAME?

6

7 **MELANIE CHOY:** YEAH THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION OF THE
8 QUESTION. ONE THING EMBEDDED INTO OUR PROGRAM OR PROJECTS IS
9 WE HAVE WORKED WITH AGENCIES TO DO WORKING GROUPS ON EACH OF
10 THE PORTFOLIOS OF WORK ON EACH WORKING GROUP WE DID MAPPING
11 AND WAYFINDING COPM STRUCTURE ONE OF THE WAYS WE'RE WORKING
12 WITH AGENCIES IS TO HAVE THIS JOINT EFFORT SO THE LIAISON FROM
13 THE COPM FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ALSO COMMUNICATOR TO
14 THE TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF AND WE HAVE SHARING PLATFORMS OF
15 INFORMATION WE'RE CONVENING TO BE TIGHTLY LINKED AT SOURCE
16 WHERE ALL INFORMATION SUCCESS DEVELOPED AND GENERATED SO WE'RE
17 STRUCTURALLY TRYING TO EMBED SO IT'S SEAMLESS AND NOT FORCED
18 AFTERTHOUGHT.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

21

22 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** I JUST HAVE A QUICK CLARIFICATION QUESTION. MY
23 EARS PERKED UP WHEN YOU SAID COST COVERING. AND YOU WERE
24 TALKING ABOUT HOW BAY PASS IS COVERED, DID YOU SAY INSURANCE?
25 COULD YOU ELABORATE A BIT ON HOW THAT COST COVERING IS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 HAPPENING? BECAUSE IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR US TO THINK WHETHER
2 THAT MIGHT APPLY TO OTHER AREAS. I MEAN, COMMISSIONER MELGAR'S
3 SHARING THAT THERE MAY BE A CORRELATION BETWEEN ATTENDANCE
4 THAT COULD BE A FUNDING SOURCE FROM SCHOOLS FOR PASSES.
5 BECAUSE THERE IS NO LOSS TO THEM. SO, ALTHOUGH THAT MIGHT BE A
6 HARD TOTAL LINE TO SHOW [LAUGHTER] BUT, ANYWAY, I'M JUST
7 INTERESTED IN HOW THIS COST COVERING WORKS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **MELANIE CHOY:** YEAH, AND TO THE POINT OF THE ATTRITION IT IS
10 ONE WAS THE GREAT BENEFITS THAT WE ARE SEEING SOME -- WE CAN'T
11 LINK CAUSATION OF IT HOWEVER SEEING FOR MANY OF THESE FARE
12 PROGRAMS WE SEE THROUGH THE REGARDLESS OF WHAT IT WAS PROGRAMS
13 THAT WE DID OR IF IT'S PROGRAMS THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE
14 DOING THEMSELVES JUST A HUGE SOCIAL BENEFIT TO THE POINT
15 REGARDING INSURANCE MODEL THE WAY THAT IT WORKS IS ESPECIALLY
16 BULK PRICING ONE PRICE IS PAID FOR THE PASSES BUT IT'S OFFERED
17 TO ALL EMPLOYEES AND SO REGARDLESS OF WHETHER OR NOT THAT
18 EMPLOYEE USES TRANSIT OR NOT THAT PASS SUCCESS PAID FOR FOR
19 THAT INDIVIDUAL SO OUR CALCULATION DOES AN ESTIMATE OF HOW
20 MANY ARE LIKELY TO BE TAKEN AND AVERAGE IS PART OF THE
21 INSURANCE MODEL SOME USE THE TRANSIT SYSTEM SOME DON'T IN
22 TERMS OF HOW WE ARE REIMBURSING TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR TRIPS
23 TAKEN SO OUR ESTIMATE IS REALLY TO TRY TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE
24 CAN MAKE SURE WE'RE FINANCIALLY SET IN TERMS OF THIS AND AT
25 LEAST COVERING TRIPS TAKEN.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** FORGIVE ME I'M STILL NOT UNDERSTANDING THE
3 INSURANCE MODEL.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I CAN TRY THE INSURANCE MODEL. SO, YOU HAVE
6 10,000 PEOPLE PAYING INSURANCE AND ONLY 5,000 HAVE SERIOUS
7 SURGERIES AND THE PREMIUM YOU GET FROM THE 10,000 PENAL
8 BASICALLY PAY FOR THE 5,000 PEOPLE'S SURGERY YOU COLLECT A FEE
9 FROM ALL STUDENTS BUT ONLY A PORTION OF THEM USE TRANSIT
10 THAT'S THE INSURANCE MODEL.

11

12 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** WHEN YOU ARE SAYING IT'S FREE THAT THERE IS NO-
13 COST THAT IT IS COST COVERED.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT'S COST COVERED BY THE INSTITUTION.

16

17 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** IT'S COST COVERED FOR US NOT COST COVERED FOR
18 THE EMPLOYER. THE EMPLOYEES IS STILL PARTICIPATION. THAT WAS
19 THE CLARIFICATION I WAS SEEKING I WAS THINKING THERE IS A
20 MODEL WHERE WE CAN PROVE TO THEM THEY SOMEHOW ARE NOT PAYING
21 FOR THIS. SO. DARN.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THAT WOULD BE INTERESTING -- THAT IS
24 DEFINITELY NOT AN INSURANCE MODEL. OKAY. I HAVE GOT TO MOVE
25 ALONG TO GEORGIA. DO WE HAVE A COUPLE OF QUICK POINTS? BECAUSE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 I WANT TO MOVE ON TO THE SECOND PIECE BEFORE WE HAVE A COUPLE
2 OF PEOPLE LEAVING ESPECIALLY MAYOR MAHAN.

3

4 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** NOTE IF YOU LOOK BACK AT THE
5 RECOMMENDATION STATE LAW FROM 1989, YOU REFERENCED IN THIS
6 LONG PATH WE HAVE BEEN ON IT TALKS BOTH ABOUT FARE INTEGRATION
7 AS WELL AS SERVICE PLANNING INTEGRATION AND THE SERVICE
8 PLANNING COMPONENT OF WHERE WE ARE HEADED WITH THIS IS LARGELY
9 MISSING FROM WHERE WE'RE FOCUSED ON OTHER THAN A CONNECTION
10 POINT WITH SOME REGIONAL PRIORITIZATION OF TRANSIT PRIORITY OR
11 ARTICULATING WHAT THAT REGIONAL NETWORK LOOKS LIKE. I KNOW
12 THAT MTC IS INVOLVED IN TRANSIT 2050+. I THINK THAT THESE TWO
13 THINGS ARE SUPER CLOSELY RELATED AND FOUNDATIONAL TO THE WORK
14 OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORT AND I WOULD LIKE TO
15 SUGGEST THAT WE HAVE MORE INTEGRATION INTO THIS TOPIC FROM
16 THAT EFFORT BECAUSE IT'S THE SECOND PILLAR OF WHAT WE HAVE
17 KNOWN POWER NOW FOR DECADES WE NEED TO DO IN ORDER TO MAKE
18 TRANSIT THE CHOICE THAT PEOPLE WILL CHOOSE. THANKS.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES COMMISSIONER EZZY ASHCRAFT?

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. I WANT TO GO
23 BACK -- AND THANK YOU, THAT WAS AN EXCELLENT INFORMATIVE
24 REPORT. I WANT TO FOE BACK TO THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
25 STRUCTURE AND I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER MILEY FOR RAISING THE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 COMPOSITION. I DIDN'T SEE WETA ON THE BOARD. I UNDERSTAND
2 THEY'RE AMONG THE THREE SMALL OPERATORS. WHAT I'M WONDERING
3 IS, I SEE THAT GOLDEN GATE FERRY AND HIGHWAY, WHATEVER THEY
4 CALL THEMSELVES, IS ON THE COUNCIL. SO, WHAT I KNOW ABOUT SF
5 BAY, WETA FERRY IS THAT THEY HAVE -- THEY TAKE RIDERS TO AND
6 FROM ALAMEDA, SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, SOUTH SAN FRANCISCO,
7 VALLEJO RICHMOND AND EXPANDING HOPEFULLY TO BERKELEY REID WOOD
8 CITY AND OTHER AREAS, WHEREAS FROM GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE WEB SITE
9 THEIR FERRIES GO TO SUNNY SAUSALITO, TIBURON, ANGEL ISLAND,
10 AND OR IN MARIN COUNTY; AND WE LOVE MARIN COUNTY. BUT THE
11 POINT BEING THAT FERRY RIDERS ARE TAKING CARS OFF THE ROAD.
12 THESE ARE CLEAN TRIPS, THE FERRIES ARE GETTING INCREASINGLY
13 CLEAN AND GREEN WE HAVE PILOTS GOING ON WITH OF COURSE
14 FERRIES, AND THE SMALL OPERATORS CHANGE EVERY TWO YEARS AND
15 EVEN IF THEY COMMUNICATE WITH EACH OTHER I THINK WATER TRANSIT
16 ESPECIALLY AN AGENCY AS LARGE AS WETA SHOULD HAVE A DIFFERENT
17 CLASSIFICATION IS THAT SOMETHING BEING LOOKED INTO? PERHAPS
18 BOCKELMAN WANTS TO ADDRESS THAT? THANK YOU.

19

20 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I THINK THE COMMENT IS GOOD FOR KIND OF THE
21 CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT IN EVALUATION OF THE STRUCTURE SO I
22 GUESS WE'LL PUT IT IN THAT BUCKET. SO, THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GEORGIA, YOU'RE UP.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** HI. GOOD MORNING. GEORGIA GANN
2 DOHRMANN. COULD SOMEBODY PLEASE BRING UP -- THERE WE GO. SO ON
3 TOP OF IT. SO, I JUST WANT TO GIVE A LITTLE BIT OF CONTEXT. WE
4 CAME TO YOU IN MAY, AT YOUR LAST COMMISSION MEETING, TO GIVE
5 YOU A DRAFT PROPOSAL FOR WHAT AN EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR RIDER-
6 FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS COULD LOOK LIKE. YOU DIRECTED US IN MAY
7 TO COME BACK TO YOU IN JUNE. FIRST GO TO THE LEGISLATION
8 COMMITTEE TO GET FEEDBACK TO INFORM A MORE SOLID ACTION ITEM,
9 THEN COME BACK TO YOU IN JUNE. SO, HERE WE ARE IT'S BEEN AN
10 INTENSE MONTH I WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE WHAT HAPPENED LAST
11 MONTH. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE IS TO GIVE A SENSE OF A REMINDER
12 ON CONTEXT AND TIMING. HERE IS WHERE THE BILL STANDS RIGHT NOW
13 IT'S A 10 TO 15 YEARS HALF CENT SALES TAX ACROSS AT LEAST
14 THREE CORE COUNTIES WITHIN SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO HAVING
15 ABILITY TO OPT IN VARIABLE RATE AUTHORITY IS STILL ON THE
16 TABLE AND THE PIECE THAT'S BOLDED IS SIMPLY BECAUSE TODAY --
17 SO THE BILL RIGHT NOW SAYS UP TO 10% OF THE REVENUES MAY BE
18 SET ASIDE EACH YEAR FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION INVESTMENTS,
19 AND THAT'S THE TOPIC WE WANT TO GET YOUR FEEDBACK ON TODAY. A
20 TIMING UPDATE ARE THAT SENATORS WEINER AND ARREGUIN THE
21 AUTHORS OF THE BILL ARE EXPECTED TO CIRCULATE A DRAFT
22 EXPENDITURE LETTER SOMETIME VERY SOON AND THERE IS AN AUGUST
23 11TH STATUTORY DEADLINE TO AMEND THAT EXPENDITURE PLAN INTO
24 SB63. SO, THE NEXT TWO MONTHS ARE REALLY A KEY WINDOW FOR THE
25 COMMISSION TO SHAPE THE RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENT STRATEGY



JUNE 25, 2025

1 BEFORE THAT LANGUAGE IS LOCKED. AND I THINK THE LAST BIT OF
2 CONTEXT IS JUST A REMINDER THAT THE AUTHORS REALLY ASKED THAT
3 THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES TAKE THE LEAD ON
4 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR DEVELOPING THE VERY BIG PICTURE
5 EXPENDITURE PLAN. AND THAT THEY HAVE ASKED US FOR SOME
6 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON WHAT THE COMMISSIONS PRIORITIES ARE,
7 IF IT RELATES TO THIS, SORT OF, PIECE OF THE PIE THAT'S IN THE
8 RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENT SO AGAIN THAT'S WHY WE'RE FOCUSING
9 ON THAT TODAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS JUST A QUICK
10 REMINDER WITH A LOT OF INFORMATION ON WHERE WE STARTED. I
11 THINK THE HIGHLIGHT IS THAT SECOND, YOU KNOW, THAT BIG BOLDED
12 PROPOSED EXPENDITURES FROM A 55 MILLION ANNUAL INVESTMENT.
13 WHERE WE STARTED IN MAY WHERE STAFF OUTLINED WHAT COULD BE
14 DELIVERED WITH 10% OF A HALF CENT SALES TAX. WE USED A FOUR
15 COUNTY EXAMPLE BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT WE -- YOU GUYS HAD DIRECTED
16 TO US POLL. SO, AGAIN THIS IS AN EX-PLAN -- YOU KNOW, A
17 POTENTIAL INVESTMENT STRATEGY BASED ON 10% OF HALF-CENT SALES
18 TAX MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE WHEN WE WENT TO THE
19 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WHAT WE REALLY -- WE GOT A LOT OF REALLY
20 HELPFUL AND GREAT FEEDBACK THERE, I THINK THE TOP PRIORITY
21 THAT THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE CONVEYED TO US WAS THAT, YOU
22 KNOW, THE BILL MUST PREVENT MAJOR SERVICE CUTS AND BALANCE
23 THAT WITH DELIVERING REAL IMPROVEMENTS FOR RIDERS. THERE WERE
24 REALLY MIXED VIEWS ON THE 10% SET ASIDE. MANY FELT THAT WAS
25 FAR TOO HIGH AND OTHERS MENTIONED TOO LOW BUT ALL ACKNOWLEDGED



JUNE 25, 2025

1 AGAIN THE REAL NEED TO BALANCE PRIORITIES. WE GOT DIRECTION TO
2 COME TO INFORM THIS ITEM, TO PRIORITIZE RIDER FOCUSED
3 IMPROVEMENTS TO HAVE A CLEAR BENEFIT TO RIDERS THAT REALLY
4 DRIVE RIDERSHIP INCREASE AND THAT REQUIRE BOTH COORDINATED
5 ACTION AND REGIONAL FUNDING TO BE EFFECTIVE. SO IT WOULD, SORT
6 OF, SHRINK IN AND FOCUS ON THOSE THINGS. I'LL LASTLY SHARE
7 THERE WAS ALMOST UNANIMOUS SUPPORT FOR REALLY PRIORITIZING
8 FARE PROGRAMS AND ACCESSIBLE AND THEN THERE WAS ALSO SUPPORT
9 FOR MAKING IT EASIER AND FASTER TO MOVE THROUGH THE SYSTEM.
10 BUT AGAIN, THERE WAS THIS REALLY EMPHASIS ON REALLY FOCUSING
11 IN ON WHERE SHOULD THE COST BURDEN FALL ON LOCALS AND WHERE
12 SHOULD IT BE SOMETHING THAT IS THE REGION IS INVOLVED IN
13 HELPING RESOURCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, GIVEN THE TIME I'M
14 NOT GOING TO WALK THROUGH ALL OF THESE, BUT THE -- YOU KNOW,
15 WE TRIED TO TRANSLATE THAT DIRECTION INTO SOME OBJECTIVE FOR
16 HOW WE COULD COME BACK TO YOU WITH A REVISED PROPOSAL FOR
17 EXPENDITURE PRIORITIES. AND, REALLY, IT'S HOW CAN WE, SORT OF,
18 CRACK THAT BALANCE, DELIVERING TANGIBLE PUBLIC BENEFIT TO THE
19 RIDERS AGAIN THAT WAS REALLY PERSONALITY TO THEM. SECOND WAS
20 BALANCING SCALE AND IMPACT. SO, WHAT COULD REALISTICALLY BE
21 DELIVERED, WHAT REAL CONCRETE OUTCOMES COULD BE DELIVERED
22 WITHIN A SPECIFIC REVENUE ENVELOPE. THE NEXT PIECE WAS AROUND
23 TARGETING RIDER FOCUSED FUNDS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
24 MEASURE WHERE THE REGIONAL INVESTMENT IS NEEDED. AND THEN THE
25 FOURTH ELEMENT WAS REALLY FOCUSING IN ON TAXPAYER BENEFIT ON



JUNE 25, 2025

1 ENSURING THAT INVESTMENT FROM A MEASURE, GO BACK TO PROVIDE
2 DIRECT BENEFIT TO TAXPAYERS THAT ARE CONTRIBUTING WITH THE
3 MEASURE, AND THAT'S AGAIN ALL CONSISTENT WITH MTC'S ADOPTED
4 PRINCIPLES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHERE AM I? SO, I'M GOING TO
5 START WALKING THROUGH THE FOUR BUILDING BLOCKS OF WHAT WE ARE
6 PROPOSING FOR A STAFF RECOMMENDATION THAT THE COMMISSION
7 DIRECT US TO PRIORITIZE. SO, THIS FIRST, SORT OF, COMPONENT IS
8 AROUND THE FARE PROGRAMS THAT MELANIE WALKED THROUGH. THE TWO
9 PROGRAMS WE'RE PROPOSING THAT MAKES SENSE FOR THE REGIONAL
10 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE TO HELP FUND OUR FREE AND
11 REDUCED COST TRANSFERS, AGAIN MELANIE WALKED THROUGH WHAT THAT
12 IS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE MIDDLE COLUMN OF RIDER BENEFIT
13 THIS COULD HAVE MASSIVE RIDERSHIP GROWTH IMPACTS BECAUSE IT
14 REMOVES COST BARRIER TO TAKING TRANSIT IT'S ABOUT 30,000 NEW
15 TRANSIT RIDES A DAY. THAT'S AN INCREDIBLY COST EFFECTIVE
16 INVESTMENT FOR TRANSIT. THE SECOND PIECE ON THAT IS IT COULD
17 HAVE A MAJOR AFFORDABILITY COMPONENT. SO, IT COULD SAVE
18 CERTAIN RIDERS AROUND \$1,500 PER YEAR, WHICH, AGAIN, IS PRETTY
19 SUBSTANTIAL. THE NEXT PIECE OF THE TRANSIT FARES IS A
20 RECOMMENDATION TO DOUBLE CLIPPER START CAPACITY, THAT WOULD
21 MEAN PROVIDING RESOURCES TO, SORT OF, COVER THE FARE SUBSIDY
22 FOR OPERATORS TO REDUCE THE COST FOR ADULTS -- LOW-INCOME
23 ADULTS THAT ARE RIDING TRANSIT, AND TO BE ABLE TO EXPAND THAT
24 TO POTENTIALLY ANOTHER 100,000 RIDERS. I THINK TO THE
25 QUESTION, AND THE, SORT OF, COMMENTS BEFORE, ON BENEFITS THAT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 CAN HAVE ON THE GROUND I THINK WHAT'S IMPORTANT IS, ONE, BASED
2 ON SOME FEEDBACK FROM THE INITIAL PILOT, 64% OF CLIPPER START
3 USERS HAVE REPORTED THAT IT ALLOWS THEM TO TAKE MORE TRANSIT
4 AND 2/3 OF THEM HAVE ALSO SAID IT ALLOWS THEM TO BE ABLE TO
5 PAY THEIR REGULAR HOUSEHOLD EXPENSES SO THAT'S, AGAIN, REALLY
6 IMPACTFUL FOR PEOPLE. NEXT SLIDE. ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS,
7 YOU KNOW, WE HAD COME TO THE COMMISSION, TO THE LEGISLATION
8 COMMITTEE WITH A \$5 MILLION PER YEAR RECOMMENDATION AND
9 RECEIVED QUITE A BIT OF FEEDBACK THAT SEEMED REALLY
10 PERSONALITY TO MAKE SURE THAT INVESTMENTS AND ACCESSIBILITY
11 WERE ACTUALLY GOING TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER MEANINGFUL
12 IMPROVEMENTS SO THE MAIN DIFFERENCE HERE IS A BUMP UP. JUST
13 WANT TO -- NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THEN THE THIRD, SORT OF, I
14 GUESS THIS IS THE OTHER REALLY MAJOR CHANGE THAT WE MADE IS WE
15 REALLY TRIED ON MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AND TRANSIT PRIORITY ON
16 THESE BUCKETS WE SHRINK THE NUMBER AND BUCKETED THEM TOGETHER
17 AND OUR RECOMMENDATION IS ESSENTIALLY TO REALLY FOCUS THE
18 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE INVESTMENTS THAT COME TO THE
19 REGION ON THOSE INFORMATION UPGRADES AND GET IMPROVEMENTS ON
20 GETTING BUSES OUT OF TRAFFIC ARE THINGS THAT ARE REALLY HARD
21 FOR AN INDIVIDUAL OPERATOR TO BEAR THE COST OF ON THEIR OWN OR
22 FOR AN INDIVIDUAL COUNTY TO BEAR THE COST ON THEIR OWN SO
23 REALLY FOCUSING ON SAYING YOU KNOW IT MAKES SENSE FOR REGIONAL
24 RESOURCES TO BE USED ON INTERMODAL STATIONS WHERE AGAIN THE
25 CHALLENGE HAVING ONE INDIVIDUAL BUS OPERATOR PRIORITIZE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 INVESTING IN INTERMODAL STATION WHEN THERE ARE FIVE BUS
2 OPERATORS SERVING IT AND RAIL STATION YOU KNOW SO THAT THE
3 OTHER PIECE AGAIN WAS FOCUSING ON TRANSIT PRIORITY CORRIDORS
4 THAT CROSS COUNTY LINES WE DON'T HAVE MUCH ON THIS BUT THERE
5 WAS A SUITE OF WORK THAT MELANIE'S TEAM HAS DONE A WHOLE LIST
6 OF INTERMODAL HUBS THERE IS A PRIORITY TRANSIT HOTSPOTS WHERE
7 THERE REALLY ARE SUBSTANTIAL NEEDS, \$10 MILLION A YEAR WE
8 THINK COULD MAKE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS ON COVERING SOME OF THE
9 COSTS TO IMPLEMENT THOSE IMPROVEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO
10 THIS IS THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION THAT WE'RE SEEKING YOUR
11 ACTION ITEM ON. SO, IT WOULD BE TO INVEST -- DIRECT US TO, IN
12 NEGOTIATIONS, ADVOCATE FOR \$5 MILLION A YEAR FOR THIS SUITE OF
13 INVESTMENTS THAT, AGAIN, WE THINK BALANCE DELIVERING REALLY
14 MEANINGFUL IMPROVEMENTS, AND ENSURING THAT THERE ARE
15 SUFFICIENT -- YOU KNOW, THAT THERE ARE REALLY RESOURCES THAT
16 CAN BE SUFFICIENT TO ADDRESS THE OTHER, SORT OF, MYRIAD
17 PRESSURES AND PRIORITIES ON THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE
18 FUND. SO, WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO TURN IT OVER.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? [LAUGHTER]

21

22 **MATT MAHAN:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WAS GOING TO CALL ON YOU EITHER WAY.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **MATT MAHAN:** YEAH, I APPRECIATE IT. REBECCA AND GEORGIA, THANK
2 YOU FOR THE WORK AND MELANIE, ALL THE WORK YOU HAVE DONE
3 TOGETHER, STAKEHOLDERS AND UPDATE THE FRAMEWORK I APPRECIATE
4 HOW RESPONSIVE YOU HAVE BEEN TO FEEDBACK MANY OF US GAVE,
5 ESPECIALLY ON THE INITIAL 10% PROPOSAL. OVERALL, I SEE THIS AS
6 PROGRESS AND LARGELY SUPPORT WHERE WE'RE HEADING. I WANTED TO
7 FLAG A COUPLE OF THINGS AND MAYBE ASK A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS,
8 ONE IS, IT FEELS TO ME, GIVEN THE ACTIVE CONVERSATIONS AROUND
9 THE REGIONAL MEASURE, AND THE FACT THAT WE ARE, OVER THE NEXT
10 QUITE A FEW WEEKS HERE DETERMINING WHO IS IN, WHO IS OUT AND
11 HOW IT WILL COME TOGETHER AND THAT IT WOULD BE PREMATURE TO
12 SIGN EXACT CONTRIBUTIONS AT THIS POINT, I WANT TO CLARIFY THAT
13 THIS UPDATE DOESN'T LOCK US INTO PERCENTAGES OR A TOTAL
14 CONTRIBUTION AMOUNT YET, DOES IT? IT'S A PROPOSED PLAN, I SEE
15 THE \$45 MILLION NUMBER BUT WE NEED TO BE CLEAR THAT WE'RE NOT
16 CLEAR ON YET EVEN HOW MANY COUNTIES ARE IN.

17

18 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** YES. CORRECT.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER]

21

22 **MATT MAHAN:** SO, THE COUNTY CONTRIBUTION LEVELS WILL REMAIN
23 SUBJECTIVE FOR THEIR NEGOTIATION ON THE REGIONAL MEASURE. IS
24 THAT FAIR TO SAY?

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** YES, AND I THINK THE COMMISSION CAN
2 CERTAINLY GIVE DIRECTION ON WHAT YOU THINK MAKES THE MOST
3 SENSE FOR A SPLIT. SO, I GUESS I'LL JUST LEAVE IT AT THAT.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YOU KNOW, ONE WAS THE DISCUSSION POINTS IS
6 ALSO A HARD AND FAST NUMBER. BECAUSE, OBVIOUSLY, IT VARIES
7 DRASTICALLY BETWEEN A THREE AND A FIVE, BUT IN ORDER TO
8 ACHIEVE WHAT WE DO NEED TO ACHIEVE, THERE HAS GOT TO BE A
9 MINIMUM DOLLAR AIM THAT MIGHT BE PART OF THE DISCUSSION TODAY
10 IS A HARD DOLLAR AMOUNT RATHER THAN STRICTLY PERCENTAGES
11 WHETHER IT'S A THREE OR FIVE COUNTY MEASURE.

12

13 **MATT MAHAN:** OKAY THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. I WANT TO
14 NOTE FOR VTA AND MY UNDERSTANDING, I'M NOT THE CHAIR, NOT
15 NECESSARILY SPEAKING ON BEHALF. AGENCY BUT BASED ON
16 CONVERSATIONS I HAVE HAD WITH FELLOW BOARD MEMBERS AND AGENCY
17 STAFF, IF VTA WERE TO OPT IN, I THINK IT WOULD BE IMPORTANT TO
18 US THAT THERE WAS FLEXIBILITY AROUND TRANSIT SIGNAL
19 PRIORITIZATION AND NOT HAVING IT ACTUALLY BE LIMITED TO INTER-
20 COUNTY CORRIDORS IN A COUNTY AS LARGE AND REGIONALLY
21 SIGNIFICANT TO SANTA CLARA, WE THINK THERE COULD BE REAL VALUE
22 TO THE OVERALL REGIONAL SYSTEM TO INTERCOUNTY TSP IMPROVEMENTS
23 WE WANT FLEXIBILITY FOR US TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION OBVIOUSLY
24 THERE SHOULD BE OBJECTIVE SCORING, WE SHOULD BE FAIR TO
25 EVERYONE I WOULDN'T WANT TO CREATE A STRAITJACKET IF THERE ARE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 COUNTIES SYSTEMS THAT ARE MAJOR FEEDERS THAT COULD ACTUALLY
2 UNLOCK VALUE FOR THE REGION. I WANT TO GET A BETTER
3 UNDERSTANDING THE PROCESS BY WHICH THE PROGRAM WOULD BE
4 UPDATED ON AN ANNUAL BASIS TO UNDERSTAND HOW SPENDING CHANGES.
5 YOU'RE ASSUMING, SAY, 45, I DON'T KNOW WHAT IT IS NUMBER \$45
6 MILLION A YEAR, EVERY YEAR, SOME OF THE UPGRADES TO THE
7 SYSTEM, CERTAINLY CAPITAL UPGRADES, MAYBE ONE TIME, SOME WILL
8 REQUIRE MAINTENANCE, SOME ARE JUST SUBSIDIES THAT MAY BE
9 PRETTY FLAT ACROSS THE BOARD, BUT I WOULD LIKE TO BETTER
10 UNDERSTAND THAT BREAK DOWN AND HOW THE PROGRAM EVOLVES OVER
11 TIME OR HOW WE WOULD BE AWARE OF THAT EVOLUTION.

12

13 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ALL OF US ARE DECIDING WHO IS GOING TO ANSWER
14 THAT. THE ONGOING, SORT OF, OPERATING WHICH IS REALLY MORE OF
15 THE FARE SUBSIDY THAT RETURNS TO THE OPERATORS REALLY TO
16 OFFSET LOSSES, I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY THERE WOULD
17 BE REGULAR REPORTING, I THINK THAT WOULD, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, BE
18 A LITTLE MORE STRAIGHT FORWARD WITH REPORTING AND I THINK
19 PEOPLE WOULD UNDERSTAND THAT. I THINK ON THE CAPITAL
20 COMPONENTS, I THINK THERE, YOU KNOW, COULD BE -- THROUGH THE
21 RNM FRAMEWORK, IF THAT'S THE RIGHT APPROACH, KIND OF LOOKING
22 AT KIND OF A MULTI-YEAR PERIOD AND THEN REPORTING. JUST
23 BECAUSE CAPITAL PROJECTS CAN BE LUMPY AND [LAUGHTER] YOU WANT
24 TO BE ABLE TO MOVE ON THINGS THAT MAKE SENSE AT THAT MOMENT
25 THINKING ABOUT OVER THE TEN-YEAR PERIODS MAKING SURE THAT YOU



JUNE 25, 2025

1 PIT THE VARIOUS INVESTMENTS BUT ONE OF THE THINGS WE HAVE COME
2 ACROSS WITH RESPECT TO THE PROTOTYPE AND PILOT DEPLOYMENT IS
3 YOU KNOW WE WERE GOING TO DO A STATION THEN THE OPERATOR SAID
4 WELL WE SHOULDN'T DO THAT STATION RIGHT NOW BECAUSE WE HAVE
5 OTHER CONSTRUCTION GOING ON RIGHT THERE SO LET'S DO THIS OTHER
6 AREA. CERTAINLY I THINK THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
7 FRAMEWORK AND THE COMMISSION THERE WILL BE REGULAR REPORTING
8 AND I THINK YOU WOULD NEED TO KIND OF THINK ABOUT THINGS OVER
9 A MULTI-YEAR PERIOD FOR THE CAPITAL INVESTMENTS MAKING SURE
10 YOU'RE BEING EFFICIENT WITH USE OF FUNDS AND GETTING
11 IMPROVEMENTS OUT TO RIDER AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE.

12

13 **MATT MAHAN:** THINKING ABOUT THE CATEGORIES FARE INTEGRATION
14 PROGRAMS BEING FAIRLY CONSISTENT MORE LIKE OPERATING DOLLARS
15 OVER TIME WHEREAS SOME OF THE THINGS WITH ACCESSIBILITY
16 IMPROVEMENTS MAPPING WAYFINDING TRANSIT PRIORITIZATION WOULD
17 BE PROJECT BASED MAYBE MULTI-YEAR BUT MAY NOT BE AT A GIVEN
18 THERE AMOUNT FOR TEN OR 15 YEARS THAT'S THE DISTINCTION I
19 DON'T KNOW IF IT'S QUITE AS SIMPLE AS OPERATING VERSUS CAPITAL
20 BUT WANT TO UNDERSTAND WITHIN BUCKETS WHAT THE CONTOURS OF
21 THAT WERE AND HOW IT WOULD CHANGE OVER TIME BUT I GET HOW
22 YOU'RE THINKING ABOUT IT AND I GET IT. ANDY DID YOU WANT TO
23 JUMP IN?

24



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I WANT TO POINT TO SLIDES 7 AND 8 JUST AS A
2 REMINDER SHOWS HOW THE DIFFERENT PRIORITY PROJECTS HAVE BEEN
3 ESTABLISHED TODAY ALREADY WORKED ON IN THE REGION SO YOU CAN
4 SEE HOW IT FITS IN THE MODEL.

5

6 **MATT MAHAN:** PART OF THE DISCUSSION NEGOTIATION WE'RE HAVING, I
7 THINK I'M GOOD.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT'S GOING TO GO UNTIL AUGUST 10TH.

10 [LAUGHTER]

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** 11:59 P.M.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] YEAH, EXACTLY. ANYBODY ON THIS
15 SIDE? I'LL START ON THIS SIDE THIS TIME.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** CHAIR?

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. SHE'S GOING TO DEFER TO HER FELLOW
20 COMMISSIONER.

21

22 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU. I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THE
23 APPROACH. SO, I UNDERSTAND THE, SORT OF, THE -- OKAY, THE 45
24 MILLION IS WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO GET TO AND BACK INTO IT SO
25 WHETHER AUTO A THREE CAN'T OR FIVE CAN'T MEASURE, OR WHETHER



JUNE 25, 2025

1 IT'S 5%, YOU KNOW, FIVE CANDIDATES OR 10% THREE COUNTIES I
2 MEAN I GET IT BUT IT OCCURS TO ME A COUPLE OF THINGS, TWO
3 PARTS, WITH THE EQUATION PRIORITIES AND WHAT YOU SPENT I'M
4 WONDERING IF IT'S FIVE COUNTIES DOES THAT MEAN IF IT'S A
5 STATIC NUMBER IT SHRINKS FOR EACH INDIVIDUAL COUNTY IN TERMS
6 OF WHAT YOU SPEND, THEN I'M ALSO WONDERING AS SOME OF US ARE
7 TRYING TO WOO SOME OF THE COUNTIES TO BE IN RATHER THAN OUT,
8 HOW DO WE CONVINCE THEM THAT, YOU KNOW, WHAT THEY GET FOR THIS
9 CONTRIBUTION IS ACTUALLY SIGNIFICANT IF WE -- IF IT'S A STATIC
10 NUMBER?

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** LET ME TAKE A QUICK -- THE 25 MILLION THAT'S
13 FOR THE FARE TRANSFERS GOES RIGHT TO THE OPERATORS THAT ARE
14 INVOLVED IN THOSE TRANSFERS. SO IT GOES RIGHT BACK TO THE
15 OPERATORS. SO THERE IS NOT A LOT OF DECISION-MAKING POINT WITH
16 THAT. I THINK THE OTHER ONES ARE A LITTLE BIT MORE FLEXIBLE,
17 ACCESSIBILITY WILL PROBABLY BE PROJECT DRIVEN, AS WOULD
18 TRANSIT PRIORITY, AND I THINK THAT WILL BE, YOU KNOW, TAKEN --
19 LOOKING AT IN EVALUATION PROCESS ON WHERE YOU GET THE MOST
20 BANG FOR YOUR BUCK IN MANY OF THOSE SITUATIONS ON A REGIONAL
21 BASIS NOT NECESSARILY WE HAVE TO COMMIT TO, YOU KNOW, A CAN'T
22 BY COUNTY, BECAUSE AS WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT IN TRANSIT
23 PRIORITY, IT COULD GO -- VERY WELL MAY BE BEST BANG FOR THE
24 BUCK GOING THROUGH TWO COUNTIES NOT JUST ONE SO IN
25 ACCESSIBILITY THE SAME THING I'M THINKING THAT WOULD BE, SORT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 OF, AN ONGOING PROCESS, ANOTHER THING NOT SET AT 45 MILLION
2 KIND OF MINIMUM IN ORDER TO ACCOMPLISH SOMETHING IN ALL FOUR
3 AREAS IT MAY BE A FLAT NUMBER THEN PERCENTAGE INCREASE ABOVE
4 THAT, THAT STILL HAS TO BE DECIDED AND IF THERE ARE OTHER
5 COMMENTS ON HOW WE CAN LOOK AT THAT WE JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
6 THERE IS MINIMUM THERE SET TO MAKE SURE WE GET DELIVER TO THE
7 VOTERS WHAT WE'RE GOING TO PROMISE THEM I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S
8 AS HARD AND FAST AS WE'RE MAKING OUT. DID YOU WANT TO SAY
9 ANYTHING DIFFERENT THAN THAT? TELL ME I'M WRONG OR A SCREW
10 SAID THAT UP.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ONE CLARIFICATION STAFF RECOMMENDATION WOULD
13 BE A \$45 MILLION INVESTMENT WITHIN THESE CATEGORIES GOING BY
14 THE PRINCIPLES WE TALKED ABOUT I THINK YOU SAID SOMETHING OF A
15 MONEY MUM, I THINK WE WERE THINKING THIS IS WHERE YOU WOULD
16 HAVE SCALE AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL OBVIOUSLY COUNTIES HAVE MONEY
17 THAT COMES BACK TO THEM THEY COULD PUT MORE INTO THESE TYPES
18 OF INVESTMENTS, BUT ESPECIALLY THE PROJECTS THE MINIMUM THE
19 WAY YOU JUST CHARACTERIZED IT.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** MAYBE I WILL BUILD ON MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS
24 COMMENTS.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** MY STAFF IS LOOKING FOR DIRECTION IN
2 TERMS OF KIND OF WHERE WE GO AS WE CONTINUE TO NEW YORK THE
3 EXPENDITURE PLAN WITH THIS I THINK BUILDING ON COMMISSIONER
4 MELGAR'S COMMENTS, THE UNDERSTANDING THIS NUMBER IN THE KIND
5 OF THE ENVELOPE OF A FIVE-COUNTY MEASURE UNDERSTANDING THE
6 NUMBER WITHIN A THREE COUNTY DISCUSSION IS SOMETHING ELSE. I
7 THINK THAT I HAVE APPRECIATED STAFF HAS, SORT OF, CLEARLY
8 HEARD THE CONCERNS FROM AT LEAST SOME OF US ON THE COMMISSION
9 THAT THE SINGLE MOST IMPORTANT THING THAT THIS MEASURE NEEDS
10 TO DO, SB63 MEASURE IS TO STAVE OFF CATASTROPHIC SERVICE CUTS
11 IN ADDITION TO THAT WE HAVE HEARD A LOT OF FEEDBACK FROM
12 STAKEHOLDERS THAT MAKING THE RIGHT FACING IMPROVEMENTS IS
13 ACTUALLY IMPORTANT AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND SO FINDING THE RIGHT
14 BALANCE I THINK IS CRITICAL FROM MY PERSPECTIVE IT REMAINS
15 PRIORITY NUMBER EACH, AND SERVICE CUTS WHAT'S BEING PROPOSED
16 AS A \$45 MILLION SUITE OF INVESTMENTS WITHIN FIVE COUNTY
17 MECHANISM MAKES SENSE I LIKE THE PRIORITIZATION OF FARE
18 INTEGRATION WE HAVE A CLEAR UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT FUNDING
19 TRANSFERS AND OTHER FARE PROGRAMS DOES IN TERMS OF DRIVING
20 RIDERSHIP AND IMPROVING AFFORDABILITY THAT MAKES SENSE AS,
21 SORT OF, TOP PRIORITY WITHIN THOSE CATEGORIES IF WE FIND
22 OURSELVES IN A THREE COUNTY SCENARIO I WOULD WANT TO REVISIT
23 WHAT THAT NUMBER LOOKS LIKE I DON'T THINK THE 45 NECESSARILY
24 APPLIES IN THE SAME WAY FROM 5 TO 3 NOR IS IT NECESSARILY THE
25 RIGHT NUMBER IF WE GO FROM 5 TO 3 SO WOULD WANT TO HAVE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 ANOTHER KIND OF CONVERSATION ABOUT THAT BEFORE WE MOVE
2 FORWARD. WITH THAT BEING SAID, ONE OF THE ELEMENTS OF THIS
3 DISCUSSION HAS BEEN, SORT OF, HOW DO WE UNDERSTAND WHAT
4 EVERYBODY GETS FROM THIS AND I WOULD, SORT OF, ENCOURAGE US AS
5 COMMISSIONERS TO TAKE A STEP BACK AND LOOK AT THE BROADER
6 QUESTION OF AS A RIDER, YOU CARE A LITTLE BIT LESS ABOUT
7 WHAT'S GOING TO EACH OPERATOR THAN YOU DO ABOUT HOW IT IMPACTS
8 YOU AND SO IF WE CAN HOLD THE PERSPECTIVE OF FROM A RIDER
9 STANDPOINT, WHAT IS THE BENEFIT THAT'S BEING SECURED THROUGH A
10 REGIONAL SCALE INVESTMENT, I THINK THAT WILL ULTIMATELY SERVE
11 OUR COLLECTIVE AIM. WOULD BE MY TWO CENTS. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. OTHERS? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ONE -- I LIKE KIND OF THE
16 DIRECTION THIS IS HEADING IN HERE BECAUSE THE RESPONSE TO MTC
17 JUST GETTING 10% REALLY IS NOT GOING WELL, WE HAVE GOTTEN A
18 LOT DIFFERENT FEEDBACK IN OUR JURISDICTION WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
19 SOMETHING LIKE IF YOU STICK TO A PERCENTAGE WHICH I DON'T
20 THINK WE'RE DOING RIGHT NOW, GOOD OKAY I'M GOING TO AVOID THAT
21 SO THAT MAKES IT A LOT EASIER, THERE WAS A DISCUSSION ABOUT
22 THE LEG COMMITTEE ABOUT ADMIN COST THAT'S IN ADDITION TO THE
23 45, WE HAVE ASKED FOR DETAILS ON WHAT THOSE ADMIN COSTS WOULD
24 ENTAIL SO WE CAN PROPERLY EVALUATE THEM AND AS OUR DISCUSSIONS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 GO ON WITHIN THE COUNTY. SO, WHEN CAN WE ANTICIPATE GETTING A
2 DESCRIPTION OF THEM?

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WHICH ONE OF YOU WOULD LIKE TO TAKE THIS? I
5 CAN DO THE GENERAL BUT I DON'T DO THE NUMBERS.

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YOU CAN START CHAIR AND WE CAN ADD.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WILL START INITIALLY LOOKING AT ADMIN COST
10 IN TWO BUCKETS ONE IS ACTUAL COST OF ADMINISTERING THE FUNDS
11 EVERY YEAR, THE ACCOUNTING, AUDITS, DISTRIBUTION, ALL THAT
12 STUFF, AS AN ONGOING ANNUAL AMOUNT, AND IT'S 1.8, 2.4, DID I
13 GET THAT NUMBER RIGHT.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT'S OUR ESTIMATE.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THEN THERE WERE ONE TIME COSTS THAT THIS
18 BILL COULD POTENTIALLY PUT ON -- ON MTC. AND THOSE WOULD
19 INCLUDE ELECTION COSTS. IT WOULD INCLUDE THE EFFICIENCY
20 REPORT, HAVING TO PAY FOR THE EFFICIENCY REPORT. THESE ARE
21 ONE-TIME EXPENSE. EFFICIENCY REPORT, AND THIRD ONE WOULD BE
22 LITIGATION RISK. AND, SO, THOSE -- THE ELECTION NUMBERS WOULD
23 BE PRETTY FIRM RIGHT AT THE BEGINNING WHAT THOSE ARE. BUT THE
24 EFFICIENCY REPORT, OF COURSE, WILL VARY, BASED ON WHAT'S GOING
25 TO BE REQUIRED OUT OF THAT. AND THEN THE LITIGATION RISK IS,



JUNE 25, 2025

1 WHO KNOWS WHAT NUMBER THAT COULD BE IF A SUIT IS FILED AGAINST
2 THE MTC COMMISSION. AND MTC SHOULD NOT BE SUBJECT TO BURDENING
3 THAT ENTIRE COST OF THAT LITIGATION. SO LOOKING AT TWO
4 BUCKETS; ONE IS ANNUAL ONGOING COST OF JUST ADMINISTERING
5 FUNDS AND ONE TIME POTENTIAL COST WHICH ARE OBVIOUSLY GOING TO
6 BE EARLY ON, AND THAT'S THE ELECTION COST, THE EFFICIENCY
7 REPORT, AND THE LITIGATION COST. SO.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. IF WE CAN GET A ONE-PAGER EXPLAINING THAT.
10 THAT'S 1.8 MILLION, AND THE OPERATORS -- I MEAN THE PRIMARY
11 GOAL HERE IS OPERATIONS. SO IT IS PART OF AN ACTIVE
12 DISCUSSION, IF SOMEBODY COULD WRITE THAT UP FOR US THAT WE CAN
13 COMMUNICATE THAT WOULD BE GREAT. AND I LIKE THE WE ARE
14 COMMONLY ORIENTED HERE, ESPECIALLY WITH THE FARE COORDINATION,
15 THAT IS HUGE FOR MANY OF US. WHAT OUR JURISDICTION IS LOOKING
16 AT, AND I THINK WE'RE KIND OF MISSING IN THIS WHOLE DISCUSSION
17 HERE IS THAT THIS IS GOING TO THE ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION ON
18 JULY 7TH.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** UH-HUH.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** AND AMENDMENTS ARE GOING TO BE PRESENTED AT THAT
23 TIME. SO, YOU CAN TALK AUGUST ALL YOU WANT, BUT WE NEED TO BE
24 FOCUSED ON THE ASSEMBLY SIDE HERE. AND WHAT IS GOING TO HAPPEN
25 THERE. THAT IS WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO, THOSE OF US WHO ARE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 EVALUATING THIS AND TRYING TO MAKE IT WORK FOR OUR VOTERS.
2 ANOTHER THING THAT WE ARE SERIOUSLY LOOKING AT IS THAT
3 REPORTING IS NOT GOOD ENOUGH. WE HAVE BEEN REPORTING FOR
4 DECADES WE ALL KNOW. SIGNAGE, ALL THINGS ARE PERSONALITY HERE,
5 J SO JUST TO PUT IN THIS BILL THAT THEY WOULD REPORT TO MTC
6 AND THE LEGISLATURE IS NOT GOING TO GET US THE RESULT THAT IS
7 OUR COMMUNITIES WANT. WE'RE LOOKING TOWARDS ACCOUNTABILITY
8 FOR, I THINK INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES HERE. SO, ESTABLISHED
9 STANDARDS AS FAR AS SCHEDULING, COORDINATION, STATION CARE,
10 AND EVEN AT THIS POINT IN TIME, WE'RE DONE TALKING ABOUT
11 JURISDICTIONS WORKING WITH BART ON RETAIL OR COMMERCIAL. WE
12 WANT SET STANDARDS HERE. THE COMMON AREA, YOU'RE GOING TO DO
13 WHAT THE JURISDICTION WANTS THERE. IT'S JUST, WE'RE NOT GOING
14 TO TALK ANYMORE. WE NEED REAL RESULTS. AND THAT MEANS ALSO
15 TIMELINES HERE. SO, FOR ACCOUNTABILITY, IF YOU DON'T MEET
16 SPECIFIC STANDARDS, THEN THE JURISDICTION IS GOING TO WITHHOLD
17 IN ESCROW A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF MONEY, IF IT'S CALTRAIN OR BART,
18 WHATEVER OUR PERCENTAGE, WE HAVE TO ENSURE THAT KIND OF
19 ACCOUNTABILITY BECAUSE WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT REGIONAL EFFORTS
20 HERE. WE GET THAT BUT MANY OF US HAVE NOT BEEN TREATED
21 REGIONALLY BY THE OPERATORS. SO IN ORDER TO ENSURE THAT FOR
22 THE TAXPAYERS THAT IS WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT HERE AND I THINK
23 IT WAS TOUCHED ON TOO THE BIG GOAL IS THAT THEY BECOME HUGE
24 SUCCESSFUL AND EFFICIENT, SO IF THIS IS 10 TO 15 YEARS THERE
25 WHAT HAPPENS -- AND WE DO HOPE THEY'RE SUCCESSFUL HERE, THAT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 FUNDING SHOWS THAT THEY CAN BE MORE EFFICIENT THAT THEY GET
2 MORE RIDERSHIP, SO IN EVALUATION OF THE FUNDING HERE, AND
3 REALLY TRANSPARENCY, AND I COMPLIMENT MTC, THAT REVIEW YOU DID
4 WAS REALLY EYE OPENING FOR MANY OF US HERE, BUT WE WANT TO
5 ENSURE, HEY, BART, YOUR NEW FARE GATES WENT UP, WHAT IS YOUR
6 INCREASED REVENUE? WHAT'S HAPPENING? THESE THINGS SHOULD ALL
7 ARE PART OF THE PROCESS NOT HIDDEN BELOW, YOU KNOW THAT'S OUR
8 SECRET MONEY HERE WE'RE GOING TO GET SO THAT'S KIND OF WHAT
9 WE'RE LOOKING AT WE HAVE TO SELL OUR VOTERS IS ACCOUNTABILITY
10 THE REAL CHANGE IS COMING AND AGAIN THIS IS GOING TO BE
11 DIFFICULT FOR SAN MATEO COUNTY IN PARTICULAR EVERY CITY IS
12 SERVICED BY BART. SO, WE HAVE TO GET THE BUY-IN THAT YOU ARE
13 GOING TO GET RETURN TO SOURCE WHETHER IT'S HALF CENT OR
14 QUARTER CENT THAT THAT IS GOING TO BE PUT TO USE. THEY CAN SEE
15 IT RIGHT AWAY. AND, AGAIN, I'M GOING TO EMPHASIZE THE
16 WAYFINDING AND SIGNAGE, I KNOW YOU DON'T KNOW THIS, BUT MY GOD
17 WHEN I FIRST GOT ON THE MILLBRAE CITY COUNCIL, THE BART
18 STATION DIDN'T EVEN HAVE A MAP OF MILLBRAE. COMMON SENSE.
19 [LAUGHTER] THEY KNOW WHAT THEY SHOULD BE DOING, WE ALL KNOW
20 THEY CAN MAKE SIGNS, CITIES MAKE SIGNS OPERATORS MAKE SIGNS WE
21 SHOULD BE MOVING THAT AHEAD JUST AS A PLUS TO SAY, HEY THIS,
22 MEASURE IS ALREADY WORKING FOR YA. AND YOU CAN HELP US NOW.
23 AND IT WAS GREAT TO HEAR FROM ALIX THAT THE OPERATORS ARE
24 STEPPING UP DOING THEIR OWN PILOT PROGRAMS. THESE ARE THE KIND
25 OF THINGS THAT ARE WORKING. THAT'S WHERE WE'RE LEARNING HERE,



JUNE 25, 2025

1 I DO LIKE THE FACT THAT'S YOU'RE FOCUSED AND IT'S NOT A
2 PERCENTAGE.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WANT TO REMIND US WE'RE FOCUSING ON THE
5 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PIECE TODAY AS PART OF THE MOTION --
6 YOU KNOW, THE PROPOSAL STEPS, INSTEAD OF THE ACCOUNTABILITY
7 MEASURES WHICH I'M SURE WE'LL BE ADDRESSING AT SOME POINT BUT
8 RIGHT NOR WE'RE DOING THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.

9

10 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I WANT TO APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENTS
11 ALSO WANT TO APPRECIATE THAT SAN MATEO COUNTIES IN PARTICULAR
12 HAS LARGE CHALLENGE GIVEN THE NUMBER OF TRANSIT OPERATORS YOU
13 HAVEN'T THOUGHT ABOUT AND TODAY ON THE DAIS SOME OF US DON'T
14 FACE THAT CHALLENGE BECAUSE WE HAVE CONSOLIDATED OPERATORS IN
15 MARIN AND VTA SO ALL THESE MACHINATIONS ABOUT COORDINATION AND
16 SIGNAGE AND ALL THIS SIGNAGE EVEN TRANSFERS ARE A DIFFERENT
17 DEAL BECAUSE WE HAVE A SINGLE SYSTEM SO THAT IS UNIQUELY I
18 THINK SAN MATEO'S CHALLENGE AND IT'S YOUR CHALLENGE TO MANAGE
19 ALL YOUR MULTIPLE OPERATORS WITH MTC'S HELP BUT OTHER BAY AREA
20 COUNTIES ARE NOT IN THAT POSITION.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I KNOW CONTRA COSTA IS [LAUGHTER]

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I KNOW BUT I'M FINALLY UNDERSTANDING
25 WHAT IS THE FRICTION IN PART THAT WE'RE EXPERIENCING ON THIS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 DAIS BECAUSE IT'S VEXING THAT WE KEEP TALKING ABOUT THIS OVER
2 AND OVER. SO WE'RE DIFFERENT AND I THINK WE'RE TRYING TO GET
3 MORE UNITY IN HOW WE APPROACH TRANSIT. SO, I THINK CERTAINLY
4 TRANSPARENCY, ALL OF THAT IS IMPORTANT, AND ACCOUNTABILITY,
5 YES, AND IT IS MORE CHALLENGING DISTRICTS THAT ARE MANAGING
6 MORE TRANSIT DISTRICTS SEPARATELY. SO, WITH THAT, I'M READY TO
7 MOVE THE STAFF PROPOSAL FOR A NUMBER TO, AND WITH COMMISSIONER
8 JOHN-BAPTISTE'S COMMENT, 45 MILLION, AND IT COMES BACK TO BE
9 REVISITED ONCE WE UNDERSTAND WHO'S IN AND WHO'S NOT IN.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ESPECIALLY IF IT'S A THREE-COUNTY MEASURE
12 IT'S VERY DIFFICULT TO GET 45 MILLION FOR THREE DISTRICTS.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO YOU'RE MAKING THE MOTION?

15

16 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I DID MAKE THE MOTION.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OOPS. NOW I HAVE REALLY DONE SOMETHING.
19 SURE.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** WE HAVE HAD DISCUSSIONS HERE TOO, THE
22 PARTICIPATING COUNTIES, I THINK CONTROL FOR THEM, FOR THIS
23 BOARD, IS IMPORTANT. AND WE ARE EXPRESSED THAT WE, WITH ALL
24 RESPECT TO MY COLLEAGUES -- [LAUGHTER] WHO MAY NOT BE IN THOSE
25 COUNTIES, THAT SOMEHOW THE DETERMINATION WITH THE TRANSIT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 TRANSFORMATION ACTIONS, THAT THERE IS SOME PRIORITY TO THOSE
2 PARTICIPATING COUNTIES IS THAT, BY GOING FORWARD HERE, DO WE
3 HAVE ANY CLARIFICATION ON THAT POINT WHICH WE HAD DISCUSSED
4 PREVIOUSLY?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** WELL, AS LONG AS IT'S NOT EXCLUSION
7 BUT MAYBE PRIORITIES, I'M INTERESTED. WE'RE ALL PART OF A
8 SYSTEM.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I THINK WE TALKED ABOUT THE FACT THAT THIS -
11 - WE DON'T WANT TO CREATE ANOTHER COMMISSION OR COMMITTEE AND
12 THAT DEPENDING ON THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN A MEASURE, IT WILL
13 STILL BE A CONTROLLING MAJORITY VOTE BY -- CERTAINLY OF A
14 FIVE-COUNTY MEASURE, IT WILL BE A MAJORITY OF THOSE CANDIDATES
15 WILL REPRESENT ON MTC. SO EVEN IF THE WHOLE NORTH BAY WANTED
16 TO REBEL ON ONE OF OUR POINTS, EVERYBODY IN THE FIVE DISTRICTS
17 -- AND I'M ASSUMING WE HAVE GOT A VERY THOUGHTFUL
18 CONSCIENTIOUS MTC COMMISSIONERS THAT THEY'RE NOT GOING TO VOTE
19 JUST AGAINST WHAT THE COUNTIES ARE THERE IN THE MEASURE JUST
20 TO ANNOY US. I'M LOOK AT THEM ALL.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** I HAVE NO PROBLEM WITH THE COMMISSIONERS BECAUSE I
23 KNOW WHERE WE STAND HERE SOMETIMES IT'S A STAFF DECISION THAT
24 DOESN'T NECESSARILY BENEFIT.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** REMEMBER WE'RE ALSO NOT THE AUTHORS OF THIS
2 BILL. WE'RE JUST HERE, WE'RE GOING TO BE THE -- WE'RE GOING TO
3 BE THE ADMINISTRATORS OF IT, AND BUT THE DECISIONS OF THE
4 AUTHORS ARE GOING TO BE THEIR DECISIONS, AND WE DON'T HAVE
5 CONTROL OF THAT. WE CAN SUPPORT OR NOT SUPPORT, OR SUPPORT
6 WITH AMEND AT ANY POINT IN TIME, BUT WE'RE NOT THE AUTHORS
7 EITHER. SO WE'RE NOT CREATING THIS BILL AND SAYING THIS IS THE
8 WAY IT GOES. ONCE THE BILL IS PASSED AND WE HAVE TO MOVE ON TO
9 THE NEXT PARTS OF IT -- I'M MAKING A LOT OF ASSUMPTIONS THERE
10 ON PASSAGE OF BILLS AND SO ON YOU KNOW, THEN HOW WE ADMINISTER
11 IT AND GO FORWARD WE'LL STILL HAVE THE TP TO LOOK AT AND
12 COMMENT ON BUT WE'RE NOT THE AUTHORS.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** BUT WE'RE SPEAKING TO LEGISLATORS.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** FREQUENTLY I KNOW THAT ROUTE TO SACRAMENTO
17 BLIND FOLDED AT THIS POINT.

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IF I COULD SHARE A COUPLE OF QUICK THINGS? WE
20 ANTICIPATED THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IS GOING TO BE WELL DEFINED
21 THAT'S WHERE THE BULK OF THE MONEY GOES THAT WILL HAVE LITTLE
22 DISCRETION FOR THE COMMISSION NOW TALKING ABOUT WHAT'S IN THE
23 REMAINDER OF THIS AND WE TALKED ABOUT THE ADMIN OFF THE TOP TO
24 COVER ACTUAL ONE TIME EXPENDITURES AT A PRETTY REASONABLE
25 APPROACH TO HOW TO DEAL WITH ADMIN AGAIN LITTLE DISCRETION IN



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THAT. THE PIECE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE WE HAVE ALSO BEEN
2 CLEAR THAT THE FARE TRANSFERS AND SMART DON'T SPLIT WELL, AND
3 THEY'RE REGION-WIDE, AND THAT IS ONE THAT WILL MANAGE THROUGH
4 AGAINST SUBSIDIZED, BACK TO THE OPERATOR THAT PROVIDED THE
5 SERVICE. AND THEN, I THINK IN THE VERY, VERY SMALL NUMBERS OF
6 WAYFINDING AND MAPPING AND BUS PRIORITY, WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT
7 CONTINUING WHAT HAS BEEN HISTORICAL SUCCESS FOR THE REGION,
8 HAVING SCORING MECHANISMS AND IT WOULD ONLY GO TO THE COUNTIES
9 THAT ARE PARTICIPATING IN THE MEASURE. OTHER FUND WOULD HAVE
10 TO BE USED TO DO OTHER GOOD THINGS THAT WE THINK ARE STILL
11 TIED TO SEAMLESSNESS. BUT THAT'S A WHOLE DIFFERENT KETTLE OF
12 FISH.

13

14 **MATT MAHAN:** CHAIR YOU HAD A MOTION ON THE FLOOR. I WANT TO
15 SECOND IT, AND IF I COULD I WOULD ASK FOR A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT
16 THAT WE ACCEPT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH THE CLARIFICATION
17 THAT THE CONTRIBUTION LEVELS ARE STILL SUBJECT TO NEGOTIATION
18 AND FINAL DECISIONS ABOUT INCLUSION IN THE MEASURE. IS THAT
19 OKAY WITH THE MAKER OF THE MOTION?

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** AND MAKE A CHANGE IF IT GOES TO THE THREE
22 COUNTY.

23

24 **MATT MAHAN:** CORRECT. OKAY THANK YOU.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. DID YOU --
2 MARGARET?

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THAT WAS THE CLARIFICATION I WAS LOOKING
5 FOR, BUT, ALSO, JUST WANT IN TERMS OF TIMELINE, WHAT -- HOW
6 DOES THIS AFFECT THE JULY 7TH DATE I'M HEARING? IT DOESN'T?
7 OKAY. SO THIS GOES TOWARDS YOU'RE THINKING AND NODDING YOUR
8 HEAD. JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND THE TIMELINE AND ALL DECISIONS
9 OF THE PERCENTAGE AND TIMELINE BASED ON 3, 4, 5 COUNTIES.

10

11 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, YOU KNOW, WHAT
12 COMMISSIONER PAPAN WAS REFERENCING WAS THAT THE BILL HAS BEEN
13 REFERRED TO THE ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE AND IT'S SET
14 FOR A JULY 7TH HEARING. THE ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE
15 CHAIR HAS EXPRESSED A REALLY STRONG INTEREST IN HAVING, YOU
16 KNOW, DETAILS ON HOW THE FUNDS WOULD FLOW TO BE, SORT OF, AT
17 LEAST INITIALLY HAMMED OUT BY THE TIME IT GOES TO HER
18 COMMITTEE THERE IS DEFINITELY A CHALLENGE WITH THE TIMELINE
19 AND A TIMELINE ON THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE THAT THE COUNTY
20 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES HAVE BEEN LEADING, SO, I THINK IT'S
21 GOING TO BE OVERALL, THAT WE'RE ALL JUST TRYING TO GET AS
22 MUCH, SORT OF, INFORMATION OUT AS POSSIBLE AND AS MUCH
23 DIRECTION AS POSSIBLE BEFORE THAT JULY 7TH MEETING. BUT IT
24 SEEMS, YOU KNOW, ONE THING THAT THE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE
25 CHAIR SHARED WITH US THE OTHER DAY WAS, JUST AN ACKNOWLEDGMENT



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THAT A LOT OF THIS IS MOVING AND NEGOTIATING, AND THAT IT'S
2 VERY LIKELY THAT LEGISLATIVE LANGUAGE WOULD ACTUALLY GET
3 WRITTEN AFTER IT -- AFTER HER COMMITTEE TIMELINE. SO, I THINK
4 IT'S ALL MOVING, RIGHT? AND I THINK THE OTHER PIECE COMING
5 BACK TO THE COMMISSION, YOU KNOW, WE CERTAINLY COULD -- THERE
6 IS JUST -- THERE IS TIME TO BE ABLE TO COME BACK AND TO BE
7 ABLE TO REFINE.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU, CHAIR.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY? OH, I HAVE TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I
12 LOOKED AT -- [LAUGHTER] OH, SORRY.

13

14 **BELIA RAMOS:** I DID -- FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
15 THEIR ENGAGEMENT IN THIS PROCESS AND TO ACKNOWLEDGE CHAIR
16 NOACK, WHO AT THIS MOMENT, WE'RE NOT CONSIDERING THE NORTH
17 BAY, REVOLTING AGAINST YOU, JUST TO CONFIRM WE'RE NOT
18 CONSIDERING THAT AT THIS TIME. I WANT TO BE CAUTIOUS ABOUT,
19 YOU KNOW, THREE VERSUS FIVE, TO COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE'S
20 COMMENT, THAT IS A VERY BIG DIFFERENCE. YOU CAN'T GET MORE OUT
21 OF LESS. YOU CAN'T GET THE SAME OUT OF LESS. AND, SO, I -- I
22 THINK THAT FROM -- FROM THE -- LOOKING AT THIS FROM A -- FROM
23 A GOAL STANDPOINT, BEST CASE SCENARIO, 45 SOUNDS GOOD. BUT WE
24 NEED TO BE MINDFUL OF THE FLEXIBILITY FOR THE NEED OF THAT TO
25 CHANGE. ADDITIONALLY, I THINK WE NEED TO STRIVE TOWARDS



JUNE 25, 2025

1 UNDERSTANDING THAT IF SOMETHING WERE TO CATASTROPHICALLY
2 HAPPEN, YET AGAIN, THAT WOULD AFFECT OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS,
3 THAT THAT IS THE CUSHION MONEY. AND -- AND I THINK WE NEED TO
4 HAVE FLEXIBILITY IN THAT. WE HAVE BEEN IN THIS POSITION MANY
5 TIMES BEFORE, AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT OPERATIONS
6 ARE, IN FACT, THE PRIORITY. SO, I JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT
7 THERE. NEXT, I APPRECIATE, GEORGIA, YOU SAYING WE HAVE TIME.
8 AT THE SAME TIME, I FEEL LIKE WE HAVE TOLD OURSELVES MANY
9 TIMES BEFORE THAT WE HAVE TIME AND THEN WE RUN UP AGAINST
10 TIME. BUT I THINK BEYOND JUST BELIEVING THAT WE HAVE TIME, I
11 THINK WE NEED TO GIVE VALUE AND DUE RESPECT TO THE PROCESS
12 THAT'S OUTSIDE OF THIS BUILDING IN SACRAMENTO AND TO BE AHEAD
13 OF IT. WE HAVE A NUMBER OF REPRESENTATIVES THAT SERVE ON THE
14 ASSEMBLY TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE THAT ARE WITHIN MTC
15 JURISDICTION, AND WE NEED ENGAGEMENT ON THAT. WE CAN'T SIMPLY
16 JUST BE CONVERSING THROUGH THE CHAIR. AND I THINK THAT THERE
17 NEEDS TO BE SOME COORDINATED EFFORT OF, YOU KNOW, WHETHER
18 IT'S, YOU KNOW ACCIDENT NORTH BAY PEOPLE REACHING OUT TO
19 ASSEMBLYMEMBER ROGERS AND BEING LIKE, HERE IS WHERE WE'RE
20 HEADED AND HERE IS WHY, AND TO HAVE THOSE LESS THAN FORMAL
21 LETTER AND POSITION STATEMENTS CONVERSATIONS SO THAT JULY 7TH
22 DOESN'T SHOCKS AND YOU DOESN'T SHOCK THEM, AND AT SOME POINT,
23 I JUST WANT TO SAY WE NEED TO BE WILLING TO COMMIT, EVERYBODY.
24 WE NEED TO BE WILLING TO COMMIT. WE HAVE BEEN HAVING A LOT OF
25 FEELINGS DISCUSSIONS FOR MANY MONTHS. AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THAT WE ARE ABLE TO PRIORITIZE OUR OPERATORS AND THE BAY
2 AREA'S MOVEMENT OF PEOPLE GOING FORWARD, AND IT'S -- THAT IS
3 COMING CLOSER AND CLOSER AS WE INCH TOWARDS THE END OF JULY.
4 SO, THAT'S IT.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS. DO I JUST WANT TO RESPOND A LITTLE
7 BIT ABOUT, THAT'S THE CUSHION FOR OPERATORS I THINK WE'RE
8 GOING TO HAVE TO BALANCE THAT. BECAUSE PEOPLE ARE EXPECTING
9 RIDER IMPROVEMENTS AND WE CAN'T JUST STOP THE FARE TRANSFER
10 PROGRAM IN THE MIDDLE, RIGHT? SO I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE
11 TO BALANCE THAT WHERE I THINK THE OPERATORS, WHAT'S GOING
12 THERE, WHAT ARE THEY DOING THEMSELVES, AND THEN WHAT WE HAVE
13 TO DELIVER TO THE VOTERS, AS WELL AS FAR AS RIDER IMPROVEMENT.
14 SO THAT'S GOING TO BE A QUESTION. ANYBODY ELSE? WE WILL GO TO
15 PUBLIC COMMENT. [LAUGHTER]

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. WOULD YOU LIKE TO STICK WITH
18 ONE MINUTE?

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES I WOULD.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE HAVE THREE IN THE BOARDROOM AND A
23 NUMBER IN THE ZOOM SPACE FIRST UP IN THE BOARDROOM IS HILARY
24 BROWN FOLLOWED BY ALETA DUPREE, AND THEN CHRISTY WEGENER.
25 APPROACH THE PODIUM. I'LL TURN IT ON.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS HILARY BROWN
3 ACTUALLY I'M CONFUSED ABOUT THE MEETING I'M LEGALLY BLIND, BUT
4 THE PURPOSE OF ME DOING PUBLIC COMMENT IS DOING MY REPORT BY
5 THE WAY I'M PART OF THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP AS WELL AS THE
6 WORKING GROUP, AND ACTUALLY I DID TEST JOURNEYS TWICE FOR BOTH
7 PROTOTYPES, AND I'M GLAD I WAS PART OF THAT PROCESS TO HELP
8 THE TEAM. AND ALSO ENJOY MELANIE CHOY'S PRESENTATION, AND I'M
9 GLAD THAT I WAS ABLE TO WITNESS, AND I'M GLAD I'M HERE TO DO
10 PUBLIC COMMENT TO YOU ALL COMMISSIONERS. BYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ALETA DUPREE
13 FOLLOWED BY CHRISTY WEGENER.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND
16 HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS HERE REALLY ENJOY
17 THESE HELPFUL PRESENTATIONS. TRANSIT HAS TO BE TRANSFORMATIVE.
18 THIS ISN'T NEW. GO BACK TO 1904 IN NEW YORK CITY WHEN THEY
19 OPENED UP A BRAND-NEW RAIL TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM THAT WE NOW
20 KNOW IS THE SUBWAY. THIS IS OUR TIME TO ADAPT TO NEW CHANGES
21 AND I'M GOING TO SPEAK MOSTLY ABOUT FARES. BECAUSE WE HAVE
22 THIS ECOSYSTEM THAT'S MADE OF 27 DIFFERENT OPERATORS. IT'S
23 KIND OF LIKE HONEYCOMB, I GUESS. WE ALL HAVE DIFFERENT FEES
24 AND RATES. IT COSTS DIFFERENT AMOUNTS TO GO WITHIN SAN
25 FRANCISCO. IN NEW YORK IT'S ALL THE SAME, UNLESS YOU'RE ONE OF



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THE RARE FEW THAT RIDES THE PATH OF MANHATTAN. TRANSIT SHOULD
2 BE COMPLEMENTARY, NOT COMPETITIVE. BUT SOMETIMES IT SEEMS LIKE
3 LOW-COST PROVIDERS ARE THE ONLY ONE THAT WINS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHRISTY WEGENER.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION MY NAME IS
8 CHRISTY WEGENER I'M THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF LIVERMORE AMADOR
9 VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY KNOWN AS LAVTA, ALAMEDA COUNTY IS
10 EXPECTED TO CONTRIBUTE THE MOST TOWARDS REGIONAL SALES TAX THE
11 \$45 MILLION A YEAR SET ASIDE FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
12 PRIORITIES IS NOT A GREAT DEAL FOR THE QUARTER MILLION
13 RESIDENTS OF EASTERN ALAMEDA COUNTY WHO HAVE BEEN CLAMORING
14 FOR YEARS FOR BETTER ACCESS TO REGIONAL TRANSIT IT REMAINS
15 UNCLEAR HOW SMALLER OPERATORS LIKE LAVTA WOULD BE SUPPORTED
16 UNDER THIS MEASURE OR HOW COMMUNITIES WITH LESS ACCESS TO THE
17 REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK WILL BENEFIT BY PAYING INTO IT
18 SUBSIDIZING IS IMPORTANT HOWEVER WHEN YOU ASK RIDERS WHAT THEY
19 WANT IN TERMS OF FARE DISCOUNTS VERSUS MORE SERVICE; MORE
20 SERVICE IS ALMOST ALWAYS FAVORED. I URGE THE COMMISSION TO
21 QUANTIFY MORE CLEARLY THE RETURN ON INVESTMENTS RELATIVE TO
22 MAINTAINING OR IMPROVING EXISTING LEVELS OF TRANSIT AND ALL
23 THE COMMUNITIES THAT YOU INTEND TO ASK TO SUPPORT THIS
24 MEASURE. THANK YOU.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** IN THE ZOOM SPACE WE HAVE ADINA LEVIN.
2 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES, ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. WANT TO
5 GIVE THANKS TO STAFF FOR STEPPING UP THE COMMUNICATION ABOUT
6 WHAT THE BENEFITS WILL BE WITH REGARD TO OUTCOMES OF THESE
7 INVESTMENTS. AND TO THE COMMISSIONERS FOR THE FOCUS ON FARE
8 INTEGRATION AFFORDABILITY AND ACCESSIBILITY. THE MAIN POINT
9 THAT I WANT TO MAKE TODAY IS ABOUT THE PROPOSED REDUCTIONS IN
10 THE CURRENT PROPOSAL FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY AND MAPPING AND
11 WAYFINDING WHICH HAVE GONE FROM 25 TO 10 MILLION. FOR THOSE
12 COMMISSIONERS THAT ARE REALLY EAGER FOR RESULTS, FOR OUTCOMES,
13 FOR DELIVERY, HAVING THAT SMALLER AMOUNT OF MONEY WILL RESULT
14 IN A SLOWER DELIVERY, A SLOWER ROLL OUT, THAT WILL BE AND ON
15 TRANSIT PRIORITY FOR THOSE THAT WANT COST EFFECTIVENESS
16 TRANSIT PRIORITY IS THE MOST PERMANENT INVESTMENT TO BE ABLE
17 TO GET MORE RIDER BENEFIT OUT OF EACH THERE EXPENDED. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANTHONY WITH TRANSBAY COALITION.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI CAN YOU HEAR ME.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANTHONY, I AM REPRESENTING
2 TRANSBAY COALITION TODAY WE WANT TO REMIND EVERYONE THAT MANY
3 OF THE COMMISSIONERS SAT ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE WHERE THIS
4 10% WAS DECIDED UPON WE SUPPORT THE FRAMING OF THIS 45 MILLION
5 AS A MINIMUM NOT FIXED AMOUNT IT'S GOING TO NEED TO SCALE UP
6 THE MORE COUNTIES OPT IN. THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, THE FREE
7 TRANSFERS, TRANSIT PRIORITY THAT ALL SCALES WITH SIZE MTC IS
8 DEVELOPING A TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY FOR ROADWAYS WHICH
9 IDENTIFIES LACK OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY AS MAJOR
10 REGION FOR THE CURRENT STASIS IN TRANSIT PRIORITY
11 CONSTRUCTION. I WANT TO ECHO COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S COMMENT NEED
12 FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY IS NOT JUST INTERCOUNTY ROUTES IF WE
13 REDUCE THIS FROM 25 MILLION TO 10 MILLION, IT'S GOING TO
14 PERMIT MEANINGFUL PRIORITY WORK. THERE WERE CONCERNS. WE CAN
15 HAVE A LARGER REGIONALLY MEASURE WE CAN NEW YORK FOR THAT
16 VOTERS ALL POLLS SAY VOTES COME IN THE SAME AND WE CAN HAVE
17 MORE MONEY AND COVER THESE AMOUNTS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS EMILY LOPER.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS. EMILY
22 LOPER WITH BAY AREA COUNCIL. I WANT TO EXPRESS OUR STRONG
23 SUPPORT FOR THIS FRAMEWORK FOR THE RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS
24 TODAY. AS WE LOOK AHEAD TO THE CAMPAIGN WE KNOW THESE
25 IMPROVEMENTS ARE CRITICAL TO GENERATING VOTER SUPPORT FOR A



JUNE 25, 2025

1 MEASURE. VOTERS ARE UNLIKELY TO SUPPORT A TAX INCREASE THAT
2 ONLY FUND THE STATUTES QUO OPERATIONS. SO, WE APPRECIATE THE
3 WORK STAFF HAS DONE HERE TO PRIORITIZE WHICH IMPROVEMENTS WILL
4 DELIVER THE GREATEST RETURN ON INVESTMENT GIVEN THE LIMITED
5 AMOUNT OF FUND AND THESE RECOMMENDATIONS WILL TANGIBLY IMPROVE
6 THE RIDER EXPERIENCE, DRIVE RIDERSHIP GROWTH AND DELIVER CLEAR
7 BENEFITS TO THE TAX PAYERS IN THE TAX COUNTIES. WE'RE
8 IMPRESSED BY THE IMPACT THAT THE FARE PROGRAMS WILL HAVE AND
9 ALSO SUPPORT THE ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS AND THE MAPPING
10 AND WAYFINDING PROGRESS. WE ENCOURAGE YOUR SUPPORT FOR THE
11 STAFF RECOMMENDATION TODAY. THANKS SO MUCH.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE. I'LL
14 LET YOU WHEN YOU HAVE 15 SECONDS LEFT.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS VINAY PIMPLE. I JUST WANT TO REFER A
17 COUPLE OF THINGS. YESTERDAY AT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, WE
18 WENT WITH WHAT CHAIR NOACK SAID INITIALLY, WHICH IS THAT 45
19 MILLION WOULD BE A MINIMUM, AND SINCE 45 MILLION REPRESENTS
20 ABOUT 8% OF 550 MILLION, THAT IF OTHER COUNTIES WERE ADDED, IT
21 WOULD GO UP TO 8% OF WHAT WHATEVER THE FINAL NUMBER WAS, WHICH
22 WAS A SIGNIFICANT CUT FROM 10%. SO, I'M REALLY DISAPPOINTED TO
23 SEE HERE THAT YOU HAVE DONE 45 MILLION FROM MINIMUM TO
24 MAXIMUM, IF YOU ADD COUNTIES, YOU EVEN CUT DOWN FURTHER. THE
25 OTHER THING I WANT TO SAY IS THE SERVICE CUTS, AND JOBS, IF



JUNE 25, 2025

1 YOU'RE GOING TO PUT MORE THAN 45% OF TRANSIT MEASURE INTO
2 TRANSIT JOBS IT'S NOT GOING TO LOOK LIKE A TRANSIT MEASURE
3 IT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE A JOBS MEASURE AND IT STARTED --
4 [INDISCERNIBLE] PERCEIVE IT. THANK YOU. THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS
5 PAT.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS PAT BURT. BASED ON GUIDANCE FROM THE
8 BOARD SECRETARY, I'M PARTICIPATING AS A MEMBER OF PUBLIC DUE
9 TO TRAVEL. I WOULD LIKE TO EMPHASIZE WHAT ANDY STATED ABOUT
10 THE FARE TRANSFER PRESIDENCY ARE NOT COMPLAINT AMONG THE
11 COUNTIES AND VTA, SANTA CLARA COUNTY DOESN'T HAVE THE SAME
12 PROPORTION OF FARE TRANSFERS THAT OTHER COUNTIES AND OUR
13 PARTICIPATION IN THE MEASURE WOULD NEVERTHELESS BE HAVING A
14 VERY LARGE CONTRIBUTION TO THE MEASURE. WE WOULD -- WE'RE GOOD
15 WITH THE PROPOSAL, AS THE AMENDMENT THERE, CONTINGENT ON THE -
16 - REALLY, THE RESOLUTION OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION -- OR
17 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN I SHOULD SAY, AND WHETHER THE TOTAL
18 EXPENDITURES RETURN TO SOURCE OVER THE LIFE OF THE MEASURE IS
19 WHAT IS CRITICAL TO US. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ABA RAMAN DAVIES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS ABBY. I'M THE TRANSPORTATION POLICY
24 ADVOCATE WITH TRANSFORM IN OAKLAND BASED NON-PROFIT THAT'S
25 FOCUSED ON TRANSPORTATION POLICY AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND



JUNE 25, 2025

1 CLIMATE CHANGE I'M A FREQUENT RIDER OF AC TRANSIT, BART AND
2 MUNI. WE HAVE BEEN HEAVILY WORKING ON THE REGIONAL MEASURE
3 WITH THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND IN ORDER TO PASS
4 THIS MEASURE WE'RE GOING TO NEED EVERY PERCENTAGE POINT WE CAN
5 GET AT THE BALLOT BOX, ESPECIALLY BECAUSE IT'S CURRENTLY
6 FUNDED BY A SALES TAX, TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS CRITICAL FOR
7 THAT AS PEOPLE WANT TO SEE MORE FASTER AND RELIABLE TRANSIT,
8 STATIONS THAT ARE EASIER TO NAVIGATE AND AFFORDABLE MULTI-
9 AGENCY FARES AND MORE ACCESSIBLE TRANSIT FOR OUR OLDER ADULTS
10 AND DISABILITY COMMUNITY MEMBERS. WITH THIS IN MIND, WE
11 SUPPORT THE ORIGINAL EXPENDITURE PLAN WHICH ALLOCATED 15
12 MILLION FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY INITIATIVES AND 10 MILLION FOR
13 INTEGRATED MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CATHERINE DUMONT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. CATHERINE DUMONT, I LIVE IN MENLO
18 PARK, I TAKE CALTRANS, CALTRAIN ACCIDENT BART, AND SAMTRANS, I
19 HAVE ALSO USED VTA SHUTTLES TO GET TO WORK AND THE AIRPORT,
20 AND I KNOW WANT TO CONGRATULATE THE AGENCY ON THE CLIPPER CARD
21 SUCCESS. IT'S -- IT'S POSSIBLE TO DO HARD THINGS AND DO GOOD
22 THINGS. AND IT'S ENCOURAGING TO HEAR THAT RIDERSHIP IS GOING
23 UP FOR STUDENTS, AS COMMISSIONER MELGAR MENTIONED. I'M ALSO
24 SEEING EMPLOYEES IF OUR AREA GETTING TO WORK, LIKE, THE TRADER
25 JOE'S EMPLOYEE THAT I TALKED TO LIVES IN REDWOOD CITY AND



JUNE 25, 2025

1 TAKES CALTRAIN. BUT IN GENERAL JUST RELIABLE COORDINATED
2 TRANSIT ACROSS THE BAY AREA IS SOMETHING I HAVE SPENT MY
3 ENTIRE LIFE LIVING IN THE BAY AREA, WORKING IN THE BAY AREA,
4 WISHING FOR TO MAKE THIS A MORE LIVABLE, EQUITABLE, AND
5 CLIMATE CONFERENCE BAY AREA. SO, LET'S FUND THE THINGS THAT --
6 THAT WE ARE -- HAVE STARTED, LIKE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AND
7 TRANSIT PRIORITY. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS AARON POSTERNAK.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN EVERYONE HEAR ME?

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE CAN HEAR YOU.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** EXCELLENT. HELLO, MTC BOARD. THANK YOU FOR GIVING ME
16 THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. BEFORE I DO SPEAK, I WOULD LIKE TO
17 MAKE IT CLEAR THAT ANY AND ALL OPINIONS THAT I WILL BE
18 SPEAKING OF ARE MY OWN AND MY OWN ONLY. THIS BEING SAID, I
19 WOULD, PERSONALLY, LIKE TO EXPRESS MY STRONG SUPPORT FOR THE
20 RIDER-FOCUSED AND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, PARTICULARLY THE NEW
21 WAYFINDING. I STRONGLY SUPPORT REVERTING BY ADDING MORE MONEY
22 TOWARDS THE WAYFINDING PROJECTS BECAUSE WE WANT TO SEE BETTER
23 RESULTS AND WANT TO BE ABLE TO SEE THEM SOONER AND BEING A
24 RIDER OF CALTRAIN, BART, SOMETIMES MUNI HAVING INTEGRATED
25 FARES WOULD MAKE THE INTEGRATED FARES AND SCHEDULING MAKE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 TRIPS TO THE CITY EASIER AND WOULD ALSO MAKE THESE TRIPS A LOT
2 LESS EXPENSIVE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS HOWARD WONG.

5

6 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SPEAKING
7 AS AN INDIVIDUAL. THE MONEY IS A REALLY GOOD START IN
8 INVESTMENT ON ONGOING WORK, DIRECTOR CHOY, MTC LEADERSHIP,
9 OBVIOUSLY WILL CONTINUE TO PUSH FOR COORDINATION AMONGST THE
10 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES, EVEN THE 151 TRANSIT RELATED
11 ORGANIZATIONS TO GO BEYOND WHAT THE FUNDING WILL FUND. THE MTC
12 ACCESSIBLE FUTURES CONFERENCE HAD INTERESTING CONCEPTS, LIKE
13 REGIONAL PARATRANSIT, THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT. ALSO
14 LOOK AT WHAT'S HAPPENING IN CHICAGO AND ILLINOIS STATE
15 LEGISLATURE WITH THIS REFORM BILL AND THEIR NO FUNDING WITHOUT
16 REFORM MOVEMENT, INCLUDING THE INTEGRATION OF ILLINOIS'S
17 TRANSIT AGENCY. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CYRUS HALL.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, THIS IS CYRUS HALL SF
22 PRESIDENT I FREQUENTLY RIDE BART CALTRAIN AND MUNI, I WANT TO
23 MENTION TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION IS HOW AGENCY ARE GOING TO
24 BUILD SUCCESS IN THE FUTURE IT'S HOW MTC AND THE REGION ARE
25 GOING TO SHOW VOTERS NEXT YEAR THEY'RE SERIOUS ABOUT MORE



JUNE 25, 2025

1 CHANGE I WANT TO SEE FASTER SERVICE, FARE INTEGRATION, TIME
2 TRANSFERS CUTTING FUNDING FOR THOSE SORTS OF TRANSFORMATIONS
3 IS NOT PRODUCTIVE, WHAT'S TRANSFORMATIONS ARE GOING TO MAKE
4 TRANSIT MORE EFFICIENT THAT ARE GOING TO MAKE TRANSIT MORE
5 APPEALING TO RIDERS THINGS LIKE MAKING FASTER SERVICE REDUCE
6 OPERATIONAL COST PER MILE, SOMETHING WE ALL AGREE ON SO I CALL
7 YOU TO KEEP THE 10% TARGET BUT ALLOW FLEXIBLE USE OF SOME
8 FUNDS BUT IT BECOMES NEEDED CLEARLY SAYING SERVICES ARE
9 PRIORITY BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE BETTER SYSTEMS AND WE HAVE TO BE
10 ABLE TO GO TO VOTERS AND BE ABLE TO ASK THEM TO VOTE FOR
11 CHANGE NOT JUST MORE OF THE SAME. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS CODY VAUGHN.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** HELLO.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS CODY VAUGHN AND I RIDE BART
20 MUNI AND AC TRANSIT I'M HERE TO BECAUSE I RELY ON TRANSIT I
21 KNOW WE NEED A SYSTEM THAT WORKS FOR RIDERS I SUPPORT TRANSIT
22 TRANSFORMATION BECAUSE IT FOCUSES ON WHAT RIDERS CARE ABOUT,
23 FASTER MORE RELIABLE SERVICE EASY TO NAVIGATE STATIONS
24 ACCESSIBLE DESIGN AND AFFORDABLE FARES ACROSS AGENCIES I
25 SUPPORT FARE INTEGRATIONS AND URGE YOU TO KEEP THE ORIGINAL



JUNE 25, 2025

1 EXPENDITURE PLANNED INCLUDING AT LEAST 15 MILLION FOR TRANSIT
2 PRIORITY AND 10 MILLION FOR INTEGRATED WAYFINDING. THESE
3 INVESTMENTS MAKE SERVICE BETTER AND MORE COST EFFECTIVE. IF
4 TIMELINES ARE TOO LONG RIDERS CANNOT WAIT YEARS WE NEED
5 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS ON THE GROUNDED NOW. LASTLY, I WOULD URGE
6 THE MTC TO TAKE A STRONGER ROLE ON REGIONAL NETWORK
7 MANAGEMENT, INCLUDING AGENCY COORDINATION AND CONSOLIDATION
8 RIDERS EXPERIENCE ONE SYSTEM NOT PATCHWORK OF AGENCIES. WE
9 NEED A UNIFIED LEADERSHIP SYSTEM.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS LIZ HENRY.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M LIZ HENRY, I'M A WHEELCHAIR USER. I LIVE AND
14 WORK IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND I TAKE MOSTLY MUNI, BART, AC
15 TRANSIT, BUT ALSO WHEELCHAIR VAN SERVICES I REALLY WANT TO
16 SUPPORT THE COMMITTEE'S PLAN AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN VOTE FOR
17 THIS FUNDING. WAYFINDING MAPPING, ACCESSIBILITY, VERY
18 IMPORTANT. I THINK TRANSIT PRIORITY IS ALSO GREAT FOR
19 EFFICIENT TRAVEL IT'S BEEN NIGHT AND DAY ON VAN NESS MISSION
20 MUNI CORRIDORS FOR ME. WAYFINDING, I WANT TO SPEAK UP FOR THAT
21 BECAUSE I THINK PEOPLE PUT TIME RIDING A SYSTEM LEARNING THE
22 SYSTEM THEY SHOULDN'T HAVE TO LEARN SEVERAL IT'S GOING TO MAKE
23 A BIG DIFFERENCE IN PEOPLE'S RIDERSHIP INCREASE LEGIBILITY OF
24 HOW TO USE THE SYSTEM AS WELL AS MAKING EVERYTHING MORE
25 ACCESSIBLE TO A BROADER SPECTRUM OF PEOPLE. THANKS.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BARBERRY.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M A, SAN JOSE RESIDENT USER OF VTA CALTRAIN
5 BART MUNI. I'M ALL OVER THE PLACE IN THE BAY AREA WE DON'T
6 OPERATE AS ONLY ONE AGENCY WE OPERATE, AGAIN, AS A SYSTEM. I'M
7 DISAPPOINTED VTA IS NOT VTA -- SORRY -- MTC IS BACKTRACKING
8 IT'S ORIGINAL PROPOSAL FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY. AS SOMEONE
9 ADVOCATING FOR MORE BRT AND TRANSIT DOWN HERE IN SANTA CLARA,
10 THIS IS ESSENTIAL FOR US TO GET BETTER SERVICE IT'S
11 TRANSFORMATIONAL. SEEING OUR RAPID BUSES ON EAST SIDE OF SAN
12 JOSE TO SPEED UP OUR SERVICE RIDERSHIP VTA NEEDS THIS MONEY
13 AND I STRONGLY URGE VTA TO JOIN THIS MEASURE AS WELL. THANK
14 YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. BOB ALAN?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. BOB ALAN
19 WITH URBAN HABITAT AND THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
20 COALITION. JUST WANT TO ECHO COMMENTS TO PRESERVE CRITICAL
21 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND MAINTAIN FLEXIBILITY WE
22 NEED TO ADDRESS SOME MORE OF THE SERVICE IMPACTS WE HAVE
23 SYSTEM WIDE. BUT I THINK THIS IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT. A BUNCH
24 OF US WERE UP IN SACRAMENTO YESTERDAY MEETING WITH LEGISLATORS
25 FOR THE BAY AREA FORWARD INITIATIVE FIGHTING FOR THE REGIONAL



JUNE 25, 2025

1 MEASURE LEGISLATION THAT WE NEED TO GET SOMETHING ON THE
2 BALLOT AND ONE THING IS CLEAR AMONGST THE RIDERS TODAY, AND IN
3 GENERAL, ACROSS THE LEGISLATURE, ANYONE YOU CAN TALK TO, IS
4 THAT PEOPLE WANT TO SEE IMPROVEMENTS THEY WANT TO SEE THE
5 SYSTEM WORK BETTER AND THIS IS AN IMPORTANT SERIES OF
6 INVESTMENTS. SO, HOPE THAT YOU WILL CONTINUE TO SERVE THE
7 ORIGINAL INTENT OF THIS INVESTMENT, MAINTAIN FLEXIBILITY AND
8 HELP US CONVINCE LEGISLATORS AND VOTERS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT IN
9 THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP RUBEN KAGANEL. RUBEN
12 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. I'LL MOVE ON TO THE NEXT CALLER. RUBEN
13 ARE YOU THERE?

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CAN YOU MAKE SURE THAT ANYBODY THAT WANTS TO
16 SPEAK HAS THEIR HAND RAISED AND CUT THAT OFF AT THIS POINT.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I WILL. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK
19 PLEASE GO AHEAD AND RAISE YOUR HAND SO THAT WE DON'T OVERLOOK
20 YOUR OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. WE CAN HEAR YOU.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU'RE MUFFLED, WE CAN'T UNDERSTAND WHAT
4 YOU ARE SAYING.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES, I SPEAK DIFFERENT. SO, I WOULD LIKE MORE TIME.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GO AHEAD.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** -- WE SUPPORT THE ORIGINAL RIDER TRANSFORMATION
11 FUNDING. I WANT TO SEE, STRONGLY ENCOURAGE FUNDING FOR
12 WAYFINDING AND ACCESSIBILITY. WE WANT ACCESSIBLE TO HAVE MORE
13 COMFORT IN RIDERSHIP AND THE ABILITY TO TRAVEL MORE
14 EXTENSIVELY WITHIN THE STATE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

15

16 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THANK YOU, AND IF I COULD JUST NOTE
17 FOR PROCEDURAL PURPOSES HERE THAT, THAT PRIOR CALLER WAS GIVEN
18 EXTENDED TIME DUE TO AN ACCOMMODATION BUT THE REMAINDER OF THE
19 CALLERS WILL STILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. ADDITIONALLY IF ANYONE IN
20 THE ZOOM SPACE WISHES TO PARTICIPATE PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND
21 NOW AS WE WILL NOT BE ACCEPTING ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS AFTER THE
22 NEXT FOUR MINUTES SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND WITHIN THE NEXT
23 FOUR MINUTES.

24



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU COUNSEL. LIAM GO AHEAD AND
2 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME LEANN CHIANG. I LIVE AND WORK IN SAN
5 FRANCISCO AND I RIDE MUNI, BART AND SOMETIMES CALTRAIN. I
6 SUPPORT THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION FUNDING AS ORIGINALLY
7 ALLOCATED WITH FLEXIBILITY TO USE FUNDS FOR SERVICE IF
8 NECESSARY I HAVE ACTUALLY WORKED ON A COUPLE OF ELECTORAL
9 CAMPAIGNS IN SAN FRANCISCO OVER THE PAST YEAR OR VOTERS WANT
10 TO KNOW THEIR EXPERIENCE IS TAKEN SERIOUSLY AND THAT AGENCIES
11 AND GOVERNMENTS ARE WORKING HARD ON INNOVATING AND THAT'S
12 EXACTLY WHAT THIS MONEY FUNDS IN TERMS OF WAYFINDING TRANSIT
13 PRIORITY, AND SO ON. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, I'M ON THE
18 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND PRIMARILY, I WANT TO SUPPORT AND
19 ECHO A BUNCH OF THE COMMENTS AROUND SUPPORTING WAYFINDING AND
20 ITS IMPORTANCE IN HOW IT RELATES TO ACCESSIBILITY ISSUES. BUT,
21 ALSO, AT OUR MEETING YESTERDAY, WE SPENT A LOT OF TIME TALKING
22 ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF A ONE-TIME EXPENDITURE THAT INCLUDES
23 REGIONAL EFFICIENCY AS PART OF THE FUNDED STUDY, THAT WAS
24 SOMETHING THAT WAS BROUGHT FORTH BY A CHAIR, AND I JUST WANT
25 IT TO NOT GET LOST IN THIS IMPORTANT DISCUSSION. SO, WE DO



JUNE 25, 2025

1 ENCOURAGE TO YOU LISTEN TO THAT RECOMMENDATION AND UNDERSTAND
2 HOW IMPORTANT INTER-AGENCY AND REGIONAL EFFICIENCY IS FOR
3 THESE EFFORTS. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. BEN MANGIFICO.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MY NAME IS BEN, I'M A RESIDENT OF SAN CARLOS
8 HIGH SCHOOLER AND MEMBER OF SAMTRANS CAC BUT SPEAK AS AN
9 INDIVIDUAL I STRONGLY SUPPORT THESE REGIONAL MEASURES
10 INCLUDING THE ORIGINAL REGIONAL FUNDING PLAN AND THE ORIGINAL
11 EXPENDITURE PLAN -- SORRY -- AND I REALLY THINK THAT SAMTRANS
12 AND VTA SHOULD OPT IN. I'M TRYING TO FIGHT FOR THAT. AND I
13 THINK THAT THESE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT PLANS TO ENSURE THAT
14 TRANSIT CONTINUES OPERATING SMOOTHLY IN OUR COMMUNITY. THANK
15 YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MATT MALONEY C.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU BATA AND MTC I'M AN ENTREPRENEUR TRYING TO
20 CONDUCT RESEARCH ON SOLUTIONS TO REDUCE FASTRAK CARPOOLING
21 VIOLATIONS ON BAY AREA BRIDGES AND FREEWAYS OF THE I'M SORRY
22 IF THIS IS OFF TOPIC BUT I COULDN'T TELL WHEN I WAS SUPPOSED
23 TO SPEAK OR NOT. COULD I HAVE SOMEBODY TACT ME FOR QUESTIONS
24 AND HELP ME ENGAGE IN RESEARCH MY E-MAIL WOULD BE CARPOOL



JUNE 25, 2025

1 VIOLATION@G-MAIL.COM. AGAIN, THAT'S CARPOOLVIOLATION@G-
2 MAIL.COM. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN IS OUR FINAL
5 SPEAKER.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY
8 COUNCIL I WANT TO REITERATE A LOT OF THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE
9 BEEN MADE HERE. I'M NOT JUST ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, I
10 SAT ON THE SANTA CLARA COUNTY BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, THE
11 PRIORITY SET FOR THE TASK FORCE IS IMPORTANT TO CONTINUE IN
12 THE MANNER THAT THEY WERE, ESPECIALLY FOR WAYFINDING, AND
13 ESPECIALLY FOR BUMPING UP OUR DISABILITY ISSUES THAT WE HAVE
14 ACROSS THE BOARD. I DID WANT TO TOUCH ON THE FINDING AND ALL
15 OF REST OF THIS. I'M A SCHOOL BOARD TRUSTEE AND WHEN YOU SEE
16 RIDERSHIP RISE BECAUSE YOU HAVE MADE IT EASIER, THAT MEANS
17 THAT WE HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE GETTING JOB TRAINING, WHO ARE
18 GETTING AN EDUCATION AND WHO ARE BECOMING MORE ABLE TO SUPPORT
19 THEMSELVES IN THIS ECONOMY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
22 SPEAKERS MADAM CHAIR.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE DO HAVE A MOTION AND A
25 SECOND. CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABSOLUTELY. [ROLL CALL VOTE]

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT? BURT IS ABSENT. CANEPA IS
5 ABSENT. FLEMING?

6

7 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

10

11 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?

14

15 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN?

18

19 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR?

22

23 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** BEFORE I VOTE I WAS OUT OF THE ROOM WHAT'S THE
3 MOTION?

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THE MOTION IS TO APPROVE THE REQUEST -- THE
6 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION RECOMMENDATIONS OF A \$45 MILLION NUMBER
7 WITH AN INDICATION THAT THERE IS NO ALLOCATION OF THOSE MONEYS
8 YET, AND THAT THERE MAY BE AN AMENDED NUMBER IF IT ENDS UP
9 JUST BEING THREE COUNTY MEASURE.

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I'M SORRY. THAT WAS AYE? THANK YOU.
14 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** ABSTAIN.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER RAMOS IS ABSENT.
19 COMMISSIONER -- THAT IS ALL. THE MOTION PASSES WITH 12 AYES,
20 ONE ABSTENTION AND FOUR ARE ABSENT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE WILL NOW GO BACK TO ITEM NINE
23 WHICH IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND INCLUDES ITEMS 9A THROUGH
24 9H. DOES ANYBODY WANT TO PULL ANY OF THOSE ITEMS? OKAY. CAN I
25 HAVE A --



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** EZZY ASHCRAFT SECONDS.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE PUBLIC
11 COMMENTS? OR COMMISSION QUESTIONS ON THIS? OKAY. NO. PUBLIC
12 COMMENT.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
15 FOR THIS ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
16 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT ROLL CALL VOTE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION BY PAPAN SECOND ASHCRAFT. NOACK.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA? ANDERSEN?

4

5 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT? BURT IS ABSENT. CANEPA IS

8 ABSENT. FLEMING?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BAPTIST?

13

14 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE? IS ABSENT.

17 MASHBURN?

18

19 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER

22 PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

2 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO COMMITTEE

5 REPORTS. AGENDA ITEM TEN, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS REPORT.

6 COMMISSIONER FLEMING, WILL YOU GIVE THE REPORT?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR. THE PROGRAMMING AND

9 ALLOCATIONS MET ON JUNE 11TH AND REFERRED SEVEN ITEMS TO THE

10 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL, SIX OF WHICH YOU JUST VOTED FOR ON

11 CONSENT. AND THE OTHER IS AS FOLLOWS: IT'S MTC RESOLUTIONS

12 4677 REVISED 4707, 4709, 4710 THROUGH 4713, 4717, AND 4718.

13 IT'S AN ALLOCATION OF 822.3 MILLION TO 8 TRANSIT OPERATION

14 OPERATORS, AS WELL AS TJPA AND MTC, TO SUPPORT TRANSIT

15 OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION. AND I'LL MOVE

16 APPROVAL OF THIS ABOVE RESOLUTION. MISS KANE, DO I NEED TO

17 READ THAT AGAIN? GREAT. AND ASK FOR A SECOND?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE A SECOND AND MULTIPLE -- A MOTION

22 AND MULTIPLE SECONDS. ANY COMMISSIONERS WHO WANT TO --

23 [LAUGHTER] NO, NO, WE STILL NEED TO VOTE. BUT I NEED PUBLIC

24 COMMENT FIRST OTHERWISE KIMBERLY WILL GET ME.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE
2 PUBLIC THAT HAVE RAISED THEIR HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO
3 ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, I WAS GOING TO ASK FOR A PAUSE
4 AS QUORUM IS NOT AT THE DAIS, SO IF YOU ARE IN THE KITCHEN
5 AREA.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT EVERYBODY COME BACK FROM THE BREAK
8 ROOM. HOW MANY DO WE NEED? SO I CAN JUST --

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NINE. WE'RE THERE NOW.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH HERE THEY COME.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ALL RIGHT.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY NOW CAN WE HAVE --

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** NOW CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU GOT IT, WITH A MOTION BY FLEMING,
23 SECONDED BY AHN. CHAIR NOACK?

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

15

16 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

19

20 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT IS ABSENT. CANEPA IS ABSENT.

23 FLEMING?

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE? MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT WAS A MOTION ON MTC RESOLUTIONS 4677

5 REVISED 4707, 09, 10, THROUGH 13 THROUGH 17, 18 FROM

6 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE.

7

8 **AMBER MANFREE:** THANK YOU. AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN?

11

12 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY?

15

16 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

23 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY THANK YOU. I WILL MOVE ON TO ITEM 11,
2 PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER AHN WILL YOU PLEASE
3 GIVE YOUR REPORT?

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** HAPPY TO, THE JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE MET JUNE
6 13TH, 2025 REFERRED ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AS
7 FOLLOWS THIS IS MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4715 UNDER AGENDA ITEM
8 11A ADVANCING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ FINAL BLUEPRINT INTO
9 ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE FOR ACTION BY THE COMMISSION TODAY. NOW ON
10 JANUARY 2025 THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE COMMISSION
11 APPROVED THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ FINAL BLUEPRINT AFTER AN
12 18 MONTH DEVELOPMENT PROCESS WITH SIGNIFICANT PUBLIC AND
13 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT DIRECTING STAFF TO ANALYZE PERFORMANCE
14 AND EQUITY OUTCOMES ASSOCIATED WITH STRATEGIES GEOGRAPHIES AND
15 PROJECTS STAFF PRESENTATION EARLIER THIS MONTH HIGHLIGHTED KEY
16 FINDINGS OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS CONDUCTED IN WINTER
17 AND SPRING WHICH DEMONSTRATED THAT THE PLAN AND ITS 35
18 STRATEGIES MADE SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS TOWARDS ENVIRONMENTAL AND
19 AFFORDABILITY GOALS. HAPPY NEWS THERE HAPPIER NEWS STAFF
20 ANALYSIS DEMONSTRATE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT SHOULD BE ON TRACK TO
21 MEET THE STATUTORY GHG TARGET CONTINGENT UPON THE CALIFORNIA
22 AIR RESOURCES BOARD APPROVAL NEXT YEAR THIS RESOLUTION
23 RECOMMENDS ADVANCING THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ FINAL
24 BLUEPRINT INTO THE ENVIRONMENTAL CEQA PROCESS CONCURRENT WITH
25 DEVELOPMENT OF A FIVE-YEAR TERM IMPLEMENTATION PLAN THROUGH



JUNE 25, 2025

1 THE REMAINDER 2025. AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL ALSO
2 CONSIDER A SIMILAR RESOLUTION AT ITS NEXT MEETING ON JULY
3 17TH, 2025. I MOVE TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4715 AND
4 WOULD WELCOME A SECOND DISCUSSION VOTE.

5

6 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** SECOND, JOHN-BAPTISTE.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS, COMMENTS ON THIS
9 FROM ANYONE? NO. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO
12 HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES MOTION BY AHN SECOND JOHN-BAPTISTE.
17 CHAIR NOACK?

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS? IS ABSENT.
22 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

23

24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?

6

7 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

10

11 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT IS ABSENT. CANEPA IS ABSENT.

14 FLEMING?

15

16 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

19

20 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

23

24 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY? PAPAN? RAMOS IS ABSENT.

2 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE'LL SKIP 12. SINCE WE HAVE ALREADY

5 DONE THAT. AND WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 13A. THIS IS MTC

6 RESOLUTION 4703 PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026 OPERATING AND

7 CAPITAL BUDGET. DEREK HANSEL.

8

9 **DEREK HANSEL:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. THE STAFF --

10 DETAILED STAFF REPORT AND PRESENTATION, ALONG WITH ALL THE

11 ATTACHMENTS ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET. THIS INCLUDES

12 DISCUSSION OF ALL THE CHANGES FROM THE DRAFT BUDGET THAT WERE

13 SHOWN TO YOU IN MAY, NOT SUBSTANTIAL CHANGES, AGAIN THAT'S ALL

14 DETAILED, AND WE'RE AVAILABLE FOR ANY QUESTIONS.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO, I ACTUALLY HAVE A QUESTION. SO, WE'RE

17 DIPPING INTO THE RESERVES BY 8.2, IS THAT WHAT IT WAS?

18

19 **DEREK HANSEL:** THAT'S ON THE CAPITAL SIDE.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ON THE CAPITAL SIDE.

22

23 **DEREK HANSEL:** RIGHT. AND APOLOGIZE, ARE YOU LOOKING AT MTC OR

24 BAHFA? OR BAHFA, RATHER.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I HAVE MY COMPUTER, THERE WAS ONE, IF THAT -

2 -

3

4 **DEREK HANSEL:** BAHA IS A SIGNIFICANT.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THAT'S THE ONE I HAVE A QUESTION FOR. I

7 DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS ON MTC IT'S JUST THAT ONE I HAVE SOME

8 QUESTIONS ON AND I'LL GET TO THAT QUESTION WHEN WE GET THERE.

9

10 **DEREK HANSEL:** SOUNDS GOOD.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY IS THERE A SECOND.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** ABE-KOGA.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN

23 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, AND

24 THERE ARE NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND
2 SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I'M SORRY. WOULD YOU PLEASE RESTATE THE
5 MOTION AND SECOND? I MISSED THEM.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** CANDACE AND ABE-KOGA. I'M MIXING FIRST NAMES
8 AND LAST NAMES AND COMMISSIONS.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ALL GOOD. NOACK.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

15

16 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

2

3 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT IS ABSENT. CANEPA IS ABSENT.

6 FLEMING?

7

8 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BAPTIST?

11

12 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE? MASHBURN?

15

16 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY? PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

23 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM
2 14 WHICH IS CLOSED SESSION. CLERK, ARE THERE ANY ITEMS
3 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AND IF
4 ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM USE
5 THE RAISED HAND FEAR THE OR DIAL STAR NINE IN-PERSON MEMBERS
6 OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK
7 WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
10 FOR THIS ITEM, AND THERE NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM
11 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE'LL MEET IN CLOSED SESSION PURSUANT TO
14 GOVERNMENT CODE SECTION 54956.9A AND PARAGRAPH TWO OF
15 SUBDIVISION D PARAGRAPH ONE SUBDIVISION, TO CONFER WITH
16 COUNSEL REGARDING SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO LITIGATION, TWO
17 CASES. COMMISSIONERS PLEASE JOIN ME IN THE CLAREMONT
18 CONFERENCE ROOM FOR THIS CLOSED SESSION AT THE END OF CLOSED
19 SESSION WE'LL RETURN TO THE BOARDROOM IN OPEN SESSION.

20

21 [CLOSED SESSION]

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WANT TO DO THE REPORT-OUT FROM CLOSED
24 SESSION.

25



JUNE 25, 2025

1 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** KANE THE COMMISSION MET IN CLOSED
2 SESSION, THERE IS NO REPORTABLE ACTION TODAY.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. WE'LL GO TO ITEM 15 PUBLIC COMMENT.
5 ALETA, YOU HAVE BEEN HANGING AROUND THIS WHOLE TIME?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YEAH KEEPING MYSELF BUSY. I'M NOT ALONE. HOW ABOUT
8 THAT?

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JUST ONE MOMENT. THERE WE GO.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR SUE NOACK AND MEMBERS. ALETA
13 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. DO I LOOK
14 TIRED TODAY? I THINK I AM. GOOD MEETING TODAY, I DID GET TO
15 SHARE A LOT ABOUT MTC WHEN WE HAD OUR COMMITTEE MEETINGS TWO
16 WEEKS AGO. AND FOR ME, YOU KNOW, I THINK THE BIGGEST THING ON
17 MY MIND RIGHT NOW IS CLIPPER, ESPECIALLY CLIPPER2.0, AND THE
18 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING WAS CANCELED. I DON'T KNOW
19 WHEN WE'RE GOING TO HAVE CLIPPER2.0. I KNOW THEY'RE WORKING
20 VERY, VERY HARD AT IT, IT'S A VERY, VERY COMPLEX PROJECT. I
21 DON'T KNOW THAT ANYONE HAS EVER DONE ANYTHING LIKE THIS.
22 CERTAINLY SEEMS MY COMPLEX THAN OMNI IN NEW YORK WHEN YOU HAVE
23 27 OPERATORS BUT I ASK IF YOU ALL BE ENGAGED WITH CLIPPER2.0 I
24 PROBABLY WANT IT MORE THAN ANYONE ELSE BUT WE ALSO HAVE TO
25 MAKE SURE WE GET IT RIGHT.



JUNE 25, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS AND NO
3 ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ITEM 16 IS ADJOURNMENT, THE NEXT REGULAR
6 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS
7 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE
8 STREET SAN FRANCISCO WEDNESDAY JULY 23RD, 2025. ANY CHANGES
9 WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. [ADJOURNED]

10



Broadcasting Government