

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 8<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 9:40 AM,**

**JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** WELL, GOOD MORNING. IT'S 8:40? IS THAT A CONFIRMATION?

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** 9:40.

**JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** 9:40 GOSH DARN.

**SPEAKER:** YOU DID NOT MAKE THE TIME CHANGE?

**JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** NO. I DIDN'T. I'M HERE, HUH? GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON MTC AND ABAG WEB SITES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD DIAL STAR NINE AND MARTHA OR MYSELF WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION. DO WE HAVE PARTICIPATING MEMBERS? MTC, FIRST -- OH ITEM TWO IS CONFIRMATION OF QUORUM. WOULD THE CLERK PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL CALL OF THE COMMITTEE



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN? >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN:  
7 PRESENT.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** PRESENT.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER BE GIACOPINI?

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.  
22 MOULTON-PETERS?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK? RABBITT?

2

3 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MTC HAS A QUORUM.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM THREE IS THE MTC  
8 PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. IT INCLUDES AGENDA ITEMS  
9 3 AND 3B. IS THERE ANY -- DO I HAVE A MOTION? IS THERE A  
10 MOTION?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IS THERE ANY WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
15 OR ANYONE WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
18 RECEIVED ON THE MTC CONSENT CALENDAR, AND THERE IS NO ONE IN  
19 THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. DO YOU WANT TO TAKE THE ROLL.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR SPERING?

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES.



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN? >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN: YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.

13 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER NOACK?

18

19 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO PASS THE  
5 MEETING OFF TO MY WINGMAN HERE -- OR WING WOMAN. [LAUGHTER]  
6 BELIA RAMOS.

7

8 **BELIA RAMOS:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. THAT ONE GOT ME. GOOD MORNING.  
9 NOW WE'RE GOING TO GET BACK TO BUSINESS. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL  
10 THIS MEETING TO ORDER OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE  
11 ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO  
12 REMOTE COMMITTEE PARTICIPATION. TODAY, CLERK, PLEASE TAKE ROLL  
13 AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GOOD MORNING. AND THANK YOU. CHAIR RAMOS?

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

20

21 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

24

25 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE?

3

4 **OTTO LEE:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

7

8 **DAVID RABBITT:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

11

12 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA IS ABSENT. WILLIAMS?

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CLERK. PLEASE READ THE  
21 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE  
24 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG COMMITTEE IN  
25 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 AMOUNT OF \$150 AND PER DIEM IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF  
2 CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO  
3 COLLECT PER DIEM.

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM SIX,  
6 WE HAVE TWO ITEMS ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR APPROVAL. THE  
7 FIRST BEING OUR MINUTES. AND THE SECOND, THOSE ARE MINUTES OF  
8 OCTOBER 11TH. AND THE SECOND IS OUR PLANNED BAY AREA 20502024  
9 ANNUAL PROGRESS UPDATE. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

12

13 **BELIA RAMOS:** MOTION BY ECKLUND, SECOND BY RABBITT. ARE THERE  
14 ANY MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?  
15 SEEING NONE. I'LL OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT. WE DO NOT HAVE ANY  
16 PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE CHAMBERS DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT  
17 ONLINE?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO HANDS RAISED ONLINE AND NOTICE WRITTEN  
20 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PLEASE CONDUCT ROLL CALL  
23 VOTE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER ANDERSEN?





1

2 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARREGUIN? >JESSE ARREGUIN: YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE?

11

12 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT? RAMOS? SHOULD.

15

16 **BELIA RAMOS:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA IS ABSENT. WILLIAMS?

23

24 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
2 PRESENT.

3

4 **BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND WINGMAN TO MY RIGHT?

5 [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO ON  
8 TO ITEM SEVEN, I'LL INTRODUCE OUR NEW PLANNING DIRECTOR. IS  
9 THAT CORRECT? TITLE? DAVID VAUTIN. MOST OF YOU KNOW HIM. I  
10 ASKED IF YOU COULD THINK OF A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS FOR YOUR  
11 FIRST MEETING. HOPEFULLY YOU'RE PREPARED. DAVID HAS A  
12 TREMENDOUS TRACK RECORD, GOOD PERSON IN THIS POSITION AND WE  
13 ALL LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH HIM. WITH THAT, WE'LL MOVE TO  
14 AGENDA ITEM 7A PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA GRANT PROGRAM, 2024  
15 GRANT AWARDS RECOMMENDATIONS, VARIOUS APPLICANTS FOR A TOTAL  
16 AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 8.5 MILLION. WITH THAT, DAVID, I'LL TURN  
17 IT OVER TO YOU.

18

19 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING AND THANK YOU  
20 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING  
21 WITH YOU ALL IN THIS ROLE. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO BEN  
22 BOTKIN OUR SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP STAFF WHO IS  
23 PRESENTING VIA ZOOM THIS MORNING. BEN?

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, DAVE. GOOD MORNING CHAIR SPERING AND CHAIR  
2 RAMOS AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'M BEN BOTKIN PRIORITY  
3 CONSERVATION AREA GRANTS MANAGER I APOLOGIZE FOR NOT BEING  
4 ABLE TO BE THERE IN-PERSON TODAY. I HAD TO TRAVEL FOR A  
5 WEDDING. TODAY WE'RE EXCITED TO SHARE OUR RECOMMENDATIONS FOR  
6 THE THIRD ROUND OF PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA GRANTS PCA GRANT  
7 PROGRAM ONE OF MTC'S PRIMARY TOOLS SUPPORTING PLANNED BAY  
8 AREA. URBAN DEGREE AND BAY AREA COMMUNITIES PROJECTS EMBODY SO  
9 MUCH OF WHAT MAKES OUR REGION AN INCREDIBLE PLACE TO LIVE AND  
10 WORK AND PLAY. YOU AUTHORIZED SPLITTING OBAG PCA FUNDS INTO  
11 TWO PHASES AND RELEASING FIRST PHASE IN AN EIGHT YEAR AND A  
12 HALF MILLION DOLLARS CALL FOR PROJECTS SECOND PHASE \$8 MILLION  
13 PLANNED FOR RELEASE IN SPRING OR SUMMER FOLLOWING NEW ROUND OF  
14 PCA DESIGNATIONS BY ABAG BOARD. FOR THIS FIRST PHASE GUIDANCE  
15 WE DEVELOPED A GRANT PROGRAM GUIDELINES AND RELEASED CALL FOR  
16 PROPOSALS IN MARSH GRANT GUIDELINES WERE LARGELY CONSISTENT  
17 WITH PRIOR PCA GRANT PROGRAM ROUNDS AND INCLUDED GRANTS  
18 SCORING CRITERIA APPLICATION PROCESS GUIDELINES NOTED  
19 COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS FUNDING TARGETS REGARDING PROJECT  
20 LOCATION AND TYPES INCLUDING MINIMUM 50% FUNDS TO BE AWARDED  
21 PROJECTS IN THE FOUR NORTH BAY COUNTIES FIRST STEP APPLICANTS  
22 HAD TWO MONTHS TO SUBMIT, OVERVIEW OF PROPOSED PROJECT  
23 ALIGNMENT WITH GOALS BUDGET SCHEDULE AND BENEFITS IN THE  
24 PROCESS WE RECEIVED 24 LETTERS OF INTEREST FOR OVER \$21  
25 MILLION SIGNIFICANT INTEREST IN THIS GRANT PROGRAM STRONG NEED



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 FOR THIS TYPE OF FUNDING. EVALUATED BASED ON SCORING CRITERIA  
2 15 PROPOSALS ADVANCED PREPARATION APPLICATIONS FULL AWARD  
3 REQUEST OF \$12 MILLION APPLICATIONS PROVIDED ADDITIONAL  
4 DETAILS ABOUT PROPOSED PROJECTS PARTNERSHIPS EQUITY BENEFITS  
5 AND ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION. TODAY WE'LL PRESENT THE 13  
6 PROJECTS THAT WE ARE RECOMMENDING FOR AWARD. NEXT SLIDE. I  
7 WANT TO PROVIDE DETAIL ON THE EVALUATION AND STAFF  
8 RECOMMENDATION PROCESS DETAILED IN THE GRANT GUIDELINES. THE  
9 EVALUATION COMMITTEE WAS COMPRISED OF STAFF FROM MTC, SAN  
10 FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP, STAFFED OF MTC AND CALIFORNIA  
11 STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY KEY PARTNER IN THIS GRANT PROGRAM  
12 PROJECTS WERE SCORED BASED ON KEY FACTORS, GOALS INCLUDE  
13 RESTORE HABITATS OPEN SPACE PROTECTING AGRICULTURAL LANDS  
14 SUPPORTING AGRICULTURAL ECONOMY ENHANCED BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN  
15 INFRASTRUCTURE AND REGIONAL TRAILS AND PROVIDING ENHANCED  
16 GREEN SPACES IN URBAN AREAS WE INCLUDED PARTNERSHIPS AND  
17 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY BENEFITS REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE,  
18 LIKELIHOOD OF SUCCESS, MULTIPLE BENEFITS, ABILITY OF THE  
19 PROJECT TO SUPPORT MULTIPLE BENEFITS AS WELL AS OPERATIONS AND  
20 MAINTENANCE ENSURING BENEFITS ARE MAINTAINED OVER TIME. BASED  
21 ON THE CRITERIA PROJECTS WERE SCORED OUT OF 100 POINTS. AGAIN  
22 WE RECEIVED A LOT OF QUALITY PROPOSALS AND MADE THIS  
23 RECOMMENDATION PROCESS CHALLENGING. DUE TO THE HIGH NUMBER OF  
24 QUALITY APPLICATIONS WE RECOMMENDED SEVERAL PROJECTS FOR  
25 PARTIAL AWARDS TO ALLOW FOR FUNDING OF A BROADER SUITE AND



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 NUMBER OF ELIGIBLE PROJECTS. AS A RESULT, THE TOP SCORING  
2 SEVEN PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR FULL AWARDS ONES RECEIVED OVER  
3 85 POINTS NEXT SIX PROJECTS APPROXIMATELY 75% OF AWARDS LOWEST  
4 SCORING PROJECTS NOT RECOMMENDED FOR AWARD FOR A TOTAL OF 13  
5 PROJECT RECOMMENDATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT TWO SLIDES  
6 WILL INCLUDE RECOMMENDED PROJECTS. WE'RE REALLY EXCITED ABOUT  
7 THESE SUITE OF PROJECTS REALLY JUST AN EXCELLENT -- A RANGE OF  
8 PROJECT TYPES AND ACROSS THE REGION. SO, WE DID HIT THAT  
9 FUNDING TARGET OF OVER 50% OF FUNDS IN NORTH BAY COUNTIES. IT  
10 ENDED UP ABOUT BEING 53% OF FUNDS AND THEY ARE SHOWN HERE.  
11 PROJECTS ARE LISTED HERE ACCORDING TO THE PROPOSED AWARD  
12 AMOUNT. SO, AGAIN, THE BROAD VARIETY. I WON'T GET INTO A LOT  
13 OF DETAIL ON EACH ONE OF THESE PROJECTS, THOSE ARE INCLUDED IN  
14 ATTACHMENT B, BUT JUST TO NOTE SOME HIGHLIGHTS, THE TIDE WATER  
15 PROJECT WILL BRING URBAN GREENING TO EQUITY PRIORITY  
16 COMMUNITIES IN OAKLAND, AND FEE ACQUISITION IN NAPA COUNTY  
17 WILL CONNECT 9,000 ACRES OF ALREADY PROTECTED OPEN SPACE  
18 INCLUDING SENSITIVE HABITATS AND INCLUDE SEGMENT OF THE  
19 RICHMOND TRAIL SOLANO COUNTY FARM TO MARKET PROJECT WILL  
20 CONTINUE TO ENHANCE MULTI-MODAL ACCESS AT THE SUISUN VALLEY  
21 UGH CULTURAL ECONOMY NEXT SLIDE. EVOLVING SHORELINES PROJECT,  
22 MARSH SUPPORT NATURE-BASED CLIMATE RESILIENCE BAY TRAIL  
23 ALIGNMENT MULTIPLE WILL REGIONAL TRAIL PROJECTS INCLUDE BAY  
24 TRAIL, RIDGE TRAIL, KEY CONNECTOR TRAILS THEN PLANNING STUDY  
25 IN COYOTE VALLEY TO ENHANCE WILDLIFE TO NAH GAVE THE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 INFRASTRUCTURE BARRIERS AS THEY MOVE BETWEEN SANTA CRUZ  
2 MOUNTAINS AND DIABLO RANGE IN THIS WILDLIFE CORRIDOR. NEXT  
3 SLIDE. IN CONCLUSION I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR SUPPORT OF  
4 THIS IMPORTANT PROGRAM AND REQUEST APPROVAL OF EIGHT AND A  
5 HALF MILLION DOLLARS FOR THESE RECOMMENDED GRANTS TO ADVANCE  
6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STRATEGIES. UPON APPROVAL WORK WITH  
7 SELECTED ATTENDEES TO FINALIZE SCOPES OF WORK, BUDGETS AND  
8 TIMELINES THROUGH THE THIS WINTER THEN PRESENTATION IN SPRING  
9 WE'RE ANTICIPATING MOVING FORWARD WITH PHASE TWO OF OUR OBAG  
10 3PCA GRANTS UPON CONCLUSION PCA CALL FOR NEW DESIGNATIONS AND  
11 ADOPTION BY THE ABAG BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THAT THANK YOU  
12 FOR YOUR SUPPORT OF THIS IMPORTANT GRANT PROGRAM. I WOULD BE  
13 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE. OF THE

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** COMMITTEE MEMBERS, QUESTIONS OR  
16 COMMENTS? PAT?

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR A GREAT PRESENTATION. IT'S  
19 ALWAYS DIFFICULT, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE SO MANY GOOD  
20 APPLICATIONS. IT WAS HARD TO FIGURE OUT WHICH ONES ARE THE  
21 BEST. I JUST KIND OF WOULD LIKE TO GET A SUMMARY OF WHY YOU  
22 DIDN'T CHOOSE FOR PARTIAL FUNDING THE TIBURON RIDGE  
23 ACQUISITION OR EVEN THE MILL VALLEY BAYLANDS PUBLIC ACCESS  
24 PROJECT. I'M KIND OF CURIOUS WHY THOSE TWO WEREN'T PARTIALLY  
25 FUNDED.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, YOU BET. AND, AGAIN, A LOT OF GREAT PROJECTS. I  
3 WISH WE HAD MORE FUNDING TO SUPPORT THESE TYPES OF PROGRAMS.  
4 BUT FOR THOSE TWO SPECIFICALLY, OF THE TIBURON RIDGE WAS ONE  
5 WHERE THEY HAD LARGELY IDENTIFIED A LOT OF FUNDING ALREADY. SO  
6 THIS WAS ALMOST, SORT OF, A BACKUP PLAN FOR FUNDING FOR SOME  
7 OF THAT ACQUISITION, AS WE UNDERSTOOD IT FROM THEIR PROPOSAL.  
8 AND THEY ALSO MADE A REQUEST FOR \$3 MILLION. WE HAD PUT A CAP  
9 OF \$1 MILLION AS THE TOP END, JUST GIVEN THE LIMITED AMOUNT OF  
10 FUNDING. WE DID SAY, YOU KNOW, FOR PROJECTS OF EXTRAORDINARY  
11 REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE WE WOULD CONSIDER A SLIGHTLY HIGHER  
12 AMOUNT. BUT THAT WAS THE REASON BEHIND TIBURON RIDGE. AND FOR  
13 THE MILL VALLEY PROJECT, IT WAS NOT WITHIN A DESIGNATED PCA.  
14 IT DID HAVE BENEFITS TO AN ADJACENT PCA WHICH IS ALLOWED  
15 WITHIN THE CRITERIA BUT GIVEN THE COMPETITIVE OF THIS GRANT  
16 PROGRAM CYCLE WE DECIDED TO MOVE FORWARD WITH PROJECTS THAT  
17 WERE, SORT OF, MORE DIRECTLY BENEFICIAL TO EXISTING DESIGNATED  
18 PCAS.

19

20 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS OR WRITTEN  
23 COMMENTS?

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FOR  
2 THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WITH THEIR HAND  
3 RAISED, AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO PROVIDE PUBLIC  
4 COMMENT.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THIS IS AN MTC ACTION ITEM. I  
7 WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION FROM MTC PLANNING. >V. CHAIR, EDDIE  
8 AHN: AHN SECONDS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** MOTION AND A SECOND. IS THERE FURTHER  
11 DISCUSSION? PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN? >V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN: YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

24

25 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER  
3 MOULTON-PETERS? COMMISSIONER NOACK?

4

5 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
12 PRESENT.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, I JUST  
15 WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE COMMITMENT YOU MADE OF THE NORTH  
16 BAY COUNTIES. AS MOST PEOPLE KNOW, A LOT OF PEOPLE FROM THE  
17 BAY AREA COME TO THOSE COUNTIES FOR RECREATION, AND A PARK  
18 THAT'S BOTH IN WANDA AND MY OLD DISTRICT, ROCKVILLE PARK,  
19 THERE ARE A LARGE NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT USE THAT PARK ARE FROM  
20 THE BAY AREA. APPRECIATE IT. AND SO STAFF SAID THEY WOULD PUT  
21 EMPHASIS ON THE NORTH BAY MEETING THAT DEMAND AND IT LOOKS  
22 LIKE THEY HAVE DONE THAT. SO, THANK YOU. SO, WITH THAT, MOVE  
23 ON TO AGENDA ITEM 8A, DID YOU WANT TO TAKE THIS ONE?

24

25 **BELIA RAMOS:** YOU'RE DOING A GREAT JOB.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OH, THANK YOU. YOU'RE THE ONLY PERSON  
3 THAT HAS SAID THAT IN THE LAST THREE MONTHS. [LAUGHTER]

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** MARK THE DAY ON YOUR CALENDAR.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I WOULD YOU CAN COUNT ON THAT. THIS  
8 IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, ENGAGEMENT FINDING. AND I JUST WANT  
9 TO COMMENT, IF YOU READ THROUGH ALL THE STAFF HANDOUTS, STAFF  
10 HAS DONE AN OUTSTANDING JOB WITH THIS. AND I DON'T THINK I  
11 HAVE SEEN THIS EXTENSIVE OUTREACH ALL THE YEARS I HAVE BEEN  
12 SERVING ON THE COMMISSION. SO, I THINK THERE IS, BOTH FOR ABAG  
13 AND MTC, I THINK THIS IS A TREMENDOUS ACCOMPLISHMENT THE WAY  
14 THIS WAS HANDLED. WITH THAT, DAVID, WHO IS GOING TO KICK THIS  
15 OFF?

16

17 **DAVE VAUTIN:** VERONICA CUMMINGS FROM OUR PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT TEAM  
18 WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM AND CHIRAG RABARI WHO IS PROJECT  
19 MANAGER FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IS ALSO HERE TO TAKE  
20 QUESTIONS.

21

22 **VERONICA CUMMINGS:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS VERONICA CUMMINGS  
23 RECENTLY JOINED MTC AS THE PRINCIPLE PUBLIC INFORMATION  
24 OFFICER TO LEAD PLANNED BAY AREA ENGAGEMENT. SALUDE. TODAY  
25 I'LL BE PRESENTING OUTCOMES OF THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT STAFF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 CONDUCTED OVER THE SUMMER FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND  
2 TRANSIT 2050+. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS PAST SUMMER STAFF  
3 ENGAGED IN ROBUST DIALOGUE WITH RESIDENTS AND PARTNERS ACROSS  
4 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES TO SEEK INPUT THAT WILL HELP  
5 ADDRESS THE REMAINING CHALLENGES STAFF NEED TO TACKLE AND  
6 COMPLETE THE PLAN'S FINAL BLUEPRINT OUR EXTENSIVE SUMMER  
7 ENGAGEMENT EXCEEDED 50ED PLUS EVENTS INCLUDED 18 POP-UP  
8 WORKSHOPS ONLINE SURVEY THAT WAS AVAILABLE IN CHINESE ENGLISH  
9 SPANISH AND VIETNAMESE OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS INCLUDED  
10 PARTNERSHIPS WITH 17 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS OR CBOS  
11 THAT WERE CRUCIAL. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT HOW BENEFICIAL IT  
12 WAS TO PARTNER WITH CBOS. BECAUSE OF OUR WONDERFUL CBO  
13 PARTNERS, WE WERE ABLE TO EXPAND OUR OUTREACH AND INCLUSIVITY  
14 BY COLLABORATING, OUR ENGAGEMENT REACHED OVER 21,000  
15 INDIVIDUALS DIRECTLY AND MORE THAN 31,000 THROUGH THEIR  
16 NETWORKS. THIS EXTENSIVE OUTREACH ENSURED THAT DIVERSE VOICES,  
17 INCLUDING LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS, TRIBAL COMMUNITIES, NON-  
18 ENGLISH SPEAKING POPULATIONS, SENIORS, YOUTH, PEOPLE WITH  
19 DISABILITIES, COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, AND INDIVIDUALS  
20 EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS ARE INCLUDED IN OUR PLANNING  
21 PROCESS. AND, FINALLY, WE ENGAGED IN DIGITAL PRODUCTION -- I'M  
22 SORRY -- DIGITAL PROMOTION THAT WE PAID FOR. AND SO IN SHORT,  
23 THIS SUMMER WAS SOME OF THE MOST EXTENSIVE ENGAGEMENT THAT WE  
24 HAVE CONDUCTED TO DATE FOR THE PLAN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE  
25 ENGAGED WITH OUR TECHNICAL PARTNERS AND HOSTED A WEBINAR TO



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 INTRODUCE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES AND DRAFT 2050+  
2 NETWORK. WE ALSO CONDUCTED TWO ALL DAY TECHNICAL WORKSHOPS ON  
3 SEPTEMBER 12TH AND 18th AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, AND  
4 THESE FULL DAY IN-PERSON WORKSHOPS BROUGHT TOGETHER OVER 115  
5 OF OUR PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING LOCAL JURISDICTION  
6 AND AGENCY STAFF, CTAS, ADVOCATES, AND NON-PROFITS. LOOKING  
7 AHEAD, OUR STAFF PLANS TO HOST OFFICE HOURS THIS FALL TO OFFER  
8 FURTHER OPPORTUNITY FOR ENGAGEMENT AND DISCUSSION. NEXT SLIDE  
9 PLEASE. OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS WERE DRIVEN BY THREE GOALS.  
10 FIRST, WE WANTED TO SHARE THE OUTCOMES FROM THE DRAFT  
11 BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS AND THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK SO THAT  
12 BAY AREA RESIDENTS COULD MAKE INFORMED CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE  
13 PLANNING PROCESS. SECOND, WE SOUGHT FEEDBACK ON THE CHALLENGES  
14 IDENTIFIED THROUGH THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS AND GATHERED  
15 INPUT ON THE INITIAL TRANSIT 2050+ RECOMMENDATIONS. AND,  
16 LASTLY, WE WANTED BAY AREA RESIDENTS TO IDENTIFY EARLY  
17 PRIORITIES FOR IMPLEMENTATION TO INFORM THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE  
18 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. NEXT SLIDE,  
19 PLEASE. THE FOLLOWING SLIDES INTEGRATE THE RESULTS FROM OUR  
20 EXTENSIVE SUMMER ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS. AND THROUGH THAT,  
21 PARTICIPANTS PROVIDED INPUT ON PROPOSED SOLUTIONS TO MEET THE  
22 PLAN'S CLIMATE TARGET, PROPOSE TRANSIT FREQUENCY AND SAFETY  
23 IMPROVEMENTS, POTENTIAL TRANSIT FUNDING PRIORITIES, AND,  
24 FINALLY, EARLY PRIORITIES FOR IMPLEMENTING THE FULL SUITE OF  
25 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ STRATEGIES. NOW, LET'S LOOK AT THE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 RESULTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. RESPONDENTS WERE ASKED TO RATE  
2 THEIR LEVELS OF SUPPORT FOR EACH OPTION TO REACH OUR CLIMATE  
3 EMISSIONS REDUCTION GOAL. AND YOU CAN SEE AT THE BOTTOM WHAT  
4 THE FIVE OPTIONS WERE THAT PARTICIPANTS CHOSE FROM. INVESTING  
5 IN TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS RECEIVED THE HIGHEST LEVEL OF SUPPORT,  
6 AND THERE WAS SIGNIFICANT SUPPORT FOR TRANSIT EXPANSION, AND,  
7 LASTLY E INVESTMENTS IN EV INFRASTRUCTURE ALSO GARNERED  
8 CONSIDERABLE SUPPORT. WHEN IT CAME TO PRICING STRATEGIES,  
9 OPINIONS WERE MORE DIVIDED. WHILE THERE WAS SOME SUPPORT,  
10 OPPOSITION WAS SLIGHTLY HIGHER, WHICH SUGGESTS THAT SOME  
11 RESPONDENTS DO SEE PRICING AS A NECESSARY TOOL FOR MANAGING  
12 DEMAND AND FUNDING IMPROVEMENTS, BUT, UNSURPRISINGLY, THIS  
13 YIELDED THE HIGHEST OPPOSITION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ASKING  
14 PARTICIPANTS TO CHOOSE WHICH IMPROVEMENTS THEY LIKED, RELATED  
15 TO TRANSIT FREQUENCY, HIGHLIGHTED DISTINCT PRIORITIES AMONG  
16 THE DIFFERENT GROUPS OF TRANSIT USERS. AGAIN, YOU CAN SEE THE  
17 OPTIONS THAT PARTICIPANTS WERE GIVEN ON THE X-AXIS. AMONG ALL  
18 RIDERS, THE TOP PRIORITY WAS ACHIEVING 15-MINUTE FREQUENCIES,  
19 AND ON THE OTHER HAND, OCCASIONAL RIDERS AND THOSE WHO NEVER  
20 RIDE PRIORITIZED NEW AND/OR IMPROVED EXPRESS BUS SERVICE  
21 BETWEEN SUBURBS, COMPARED TO FREQUENT RIDERS. NEXT SLIDE,  
22 PLEASE. RELATED TO TRANSIT SAFETY AND SECURITY, PARTICIPANTS  
23 WERE ASKED WHAT WOULD MAKE THEM FEEL SAFER WHILE TAKING  
24 TRANSIT AND HAD TO SELECT NO MORE THAN THREE OUT OF THE SIX  
25 OPTIONS. IMPROVING CLEANLINESS BOTH ON BOARD AND AT TRANSIT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 STATIONS AND STOPS, WAS THE TOP PRIORITY FOR ALL TYPES OF  
2 RIDERS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND, REALLY, WITH REGARD TO  
3 TRANSIT INVESTMENTS, PARTICIPANTS WERE ASKED TO CHOOSE FROM  
4 TWO OPTIONS, EXPANDING REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORKS OR UPGRADING  
5 EXISTING TRANSIT SERVICE. THERE WAS A CLEAR PREFERENCE AMONG  
6 ALL TRANSIT RIDERS FOR INVESTMENTS THAT EXPAND, RATHER THAN  
7 MERELY OPTIMIZING THE EXISTING TRANSIT NETWORK. HOWEVER IT'S  
8 IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT PARTICIPANTS OFTEN DEFINED EXPANSION AS  
9 ENHANCING SERVICE WITHIN THEIR OWN COMMUNITIES RATHER THAN  
10 FUNDING LARGE-SCALE TRANSIT MEGA PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
11 WITH REGARD TO NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION, WE ASKED PARTICIPANTS  
12 TO SELECT THEIR TOP THREE BIG-PICTURE PRIORITIES FROM 11  
13 OPTIONS. AND WHEN WE ZOOM OUT TO THE BROADER PLANNED BAY AREA  
14 2050+, THE TOP PRIORITY FOR IMPLEMENTATION IN THE NEXT FOUR  
15 YEARS CONTINUES TO BE HOUSING PRODUCTION AT ALL INCOME LEVELS.  
16 THIS REFLECTS A STRONG DEMAND FOR ADDRESSING HOUSING  
17 AFFORDABILITY AND AVAILABILITY ACROSS THE REGION. CLOSELY  
18 FOLLOWING HOUSING, PARTICIPANTS PRIORITIZED TRANSIT EXPANSION,  
19 WHICH ALIGNS WITH OUR EARLIER FINDING. AND, FINALLY, ROAD  
20 SAFETY FOR ALL MODES EMERGED AS THE THIRD PRIORITY. NEXT  
21 SLIDE, PLEASE. PARTICIPANTS WERE ABLE TO OFFER COMMENTS BOTH  
22 AT THE POP-UPS AND THROUGH THE SURVEY, AND THE OVERARCHING  
23 THEMES THAT EMERGED WERE TRANSIT. RESPONDENTS DON'T WANT  
24 TRAVEL TIME TO TAKE TWICE AS LONG AS THAT OF DRIVING. HOUSING  
25 AND LAND USE, BUILD MORE HOUSING AND IMPROVE TRANSIT TO REDUCE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LONG COMMUTES AND POLLUTION. BIKE/PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE,  
2 INVEST IN COMPLETE STREETS, AND SAFER BIKE ROUTES FOR ALL  
3 AGES, ROADS AND PRICING FIX IT FIRST, AND LASTLY, EQUITY, STOP  
4 SUPPORTING PROJECTS THAT ONLY BENEFIT THE RICH. HELP THE POOR  
5 AND MIDDLE CLASS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. GOING BACK TO OUR CBO  
6 ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS. THE KEY ISSUES THAT EMERGED WERE CLIMATE  
7 EMISSIONS. RESPONDENTS WANTED TO PRIORITIZE MAINTAINING  
8 HIGHWAYS, INVEST IN TRANSIT AND EVS, AND ENSURE THAT  
9 ENVIRONMENTAL GOALS DON'T HARM MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES.  
10 SECOND, TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS, IMPROVE TRANSIT FREQUENCY AND  
11 RELIABLE, EXPAND TO UNDERSERVED AREAS, AND ENHANCE SAFETY WITH  
12 BETTER CLEANLINESS, LIGHTING, AND SECURITY. YOUTH, YOUTH SAID  
13 THAT THEY NEED CLEARER AND SAFER TRANSIT OPTIONS. AND, LASTLY  
14 E IMPLEMENTATION. INTEGRATE SUSTAINABLE TRANSIT AFFORDABLE  
15 HOUSING AND JOB CREATION. PRIORITIZE UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES  
16 AND ENSURE RURAL HIGH SPEED INTERNET ACCESS. NEXT SLIDE,  
17 PLEASE. NEXT STEPS INCLUDE MTC ABAG PLANNING STAFF WILL  
18 CONSIDER ALL FEEDBACK THAT WE RECEIVED TO INFORM REFINEMENTS  
19 TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. AND MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG  
20 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEES ARE ANTICIPATED TO CONSIDER APPROVAL  
21 OF FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES IN JANUARY 2025. A THIRD ROUND  
22 OF ENGAGEMENT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WITH PARTNERS AND  
23 STAKEHOLDERS IS IMPLEMENTED IN EARLY 2025, AND, LASTLY, FINAL  
24 ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT ON THE DRAFT PLAN, DRAFT EIR AND DRAFT  
25 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORTS ARE ANTICIPATED IN THE SUMMER OF 2025. IN



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 CONCLUSION, OUR COMPREHENSIVE ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS HAVE PROVIDED  
2 INVALUABLE INSIGHTS THAT WILL SHAPE THE PLANNED BAY AREA  
3 2050+. AS WE MOVE FORWARD, THESE INSIGHTS WILL HELP US AS WE  
4 WORK TOWARDS A MORE AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE, HEALTHY,  
5 AND VIBRANT BAY AREA. STAFF WILL PROVIDE MORE SPECIFIC  
6 INFORMATION AS TO HOW THESE FINDINGS HAVE INFORMED FINAL  
7 REVISIONS TO THE BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES AT THEIR JANUARY  
8 PRESENTATION ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR  
9 YOUR ATTENTION. I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY  
10 HAVE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VERONICA CUMMINGS. THIS IS  
13 A TREMENDOUS OUTREACH JOB. WELL DONE. COMMITTEE MEMBERS,  
14 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? GO AHEAD, STEPHANIE.

15

16 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JUST ONE. THANK YOU FOR THE  
17 PRESENTATION. VERY INFORMATIVE. I WONDER IF YOU HAVE  
18 DEMOGRAPHICS WITH THE OUTREACH YOU DID. I KNOW THAT'S PROBABLY  
19 HARD TO DO BUT I WOULD JUST BE CURIOUS, PARTICULARLY AGE  
20 DIFFERENCES IN THE RESPONSES?

21

22 **VERONICA CUMMINGS:** WE DON'T HAVE THAT FROM THE POP-UPS WE DID  
23 INCLUDE THE OPTION IN THE SURVEY BUT BECAUSE IT'S OPTIONAL TO  
24 PROVIDE IT WE CAN'T ENSURE THAT IT'S REFLECTIVE OF THE  
25 RESPONDENTS AT-LARGE.





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ONE  
3 RECOMMENDATION. I REALLY THINK THE 880 CORRIDOR SHOULD HAVE  
4 BEEN A LOT MORE DETAIL ON THAT CORRIDOR. YOU HAVE A LARGE  
5 NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY THAT COMES IN THAT  
6 CORRIDOR.

7

8 **DAVE VAUTIN:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, 580 CORRIDOR.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** I'M SORRY. 580. THANK YOU, DAVID.  
11 SEE. THAT'S WHY HE'S THE NEW PLANNING DIRECTOR. I MEAN A LARGE  
12 NUMBER OF PEOPLE COMING FROM SAN JOAQUIN. IS THAT CORRECT? IF  
13 WE COULD DO OUTREACH IN THAT CORRIDOR I THINK IT WOULD SERVE  
14 US WELL SO WE GET BETTER INFORMATION. VERY GOOD WORK,  
15 VERONICA. VERY EXTENSIVE. THANK YOU.

16

17 **VERONICA CUMMINGS:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THIS WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM. OH, I  
20 LOOKED AND DIDN'T SEE ANY LIGHTS ON. WAN WANDA, GO FIRST.

21

22 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. WHEN YOU WERE DOING THIS  
23 WORK AND DOING THE POP-UPS, AND THINGS IN SOLANO COUNTY, I  
24 WANTED TO ASK WERE THERE OPPORTUNITIES TO HAVE THOSE POP-UPS  
25 AT LEAST ONE IN THE CITY OF VALLEJO?



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **VERONICA CUMMINGS:** THE CITY OF VALLEJO WAS INCLUDED AS  
3 RESEARCH WAS DONE ON THE POTENTIAL POP-UP LOCATION,  
4 ULTIMATELY, THE POP-UP DID NOT OCCUR IN VALLEJO. AND THIS --  
5 IT WAS NOT.

6

7 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** OKAY. THAT'S ONE OF OUR CITIES THAT HAS HIGH  
8 POPULATION OF LOW-INCOME, OF NEED.

9

10 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** IN THE FUTURE F WEEKEND MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE  
11 ONE IN THOSE LOCATION, AS WELL, IT IS REALLY BENEFICIAL AND  
12 HELPFUL IN OUR WORK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** IF I MAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR. SO, MTC AND ABAG  
15 HOSTED A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT POP-UPS, WE ALSO PARTNERED WITH  
16 COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. I WANT TO MENTION THAT WE REFER  
17 TO PAGE SEVEN OF THE PACKET, WE PARTNERED WITH COMMUNITY-BASED  
18 ORGANIZATION WHICH HELD ONE AT THE VALLEJO FARMERS MARKET ON  
19 AUGUST 24TH. SO, WE REALLY TRIED TO KIND OF HOLD EVENTS  
20 OURSELVES, BUT ALSO PARTNER WITH CBOS TO FILL IN THE GAPS  
21 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO JUST WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT.

22

23 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT ACKNOWLEDGMENT. I  
24 APPRECIATE IT. THANK YOU.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CARLOS ROMERO:** OKAY. YOU HAD YOUR LIGHT ON. BUT I'LL MAKE IT  
2 REALLY QUICKLY. I WANTED TO THANK STAFF ON THE EXECUTIVE SIDE  
3 FOR REALLY ENGAGING THE CBOS AS THOUGHTFULLY AS DID YOU. I  
4 KNOW WHEN I ASKED, AND YOU PROVIDED US ALL WITH THE NUMBER OF  
5 CBOS AROUND THE BAY AREA THAT PARTICIPATED IN THIS PROCESS, I  
6 THINK THAT IS KIND OF THE NEXT LEVEL OF ENGAGEMENT REALLY  
7 NEEDED TO CONTINUE FORWARD WITH. IT'S REALLY HARD TO GET SOME  
8 OF THESE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND THE CBOS KNOW HOW TO  
9 DO THAT SO WHATEVER WE CAN DO IN THE FUTURE TO IMPROVE -- NOT  
10 ACTUALLY IMPROVE -- BUT ENHANCE ON WHAT YOU GUYS HAVE ALREADY  
11 DONE, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. AND I WANT TO SAY THE LIST OF ITEMS  
12 THAT THOSE CBOS AND THOSE THAT CAME OUT OF THE EQUITY PRIORITY  
13 COMMUNITIES IS VERY INTERESTING AND I HOPE THAT IT WILL HELP  
14 US INFORM THIS PLAN GOING FORWARD. BECAUSE ACTUALLY SOME OF  
15 THESE THINGS AREN'T REFLECTED NECESSARILY IN SOME OF THE  
16 TRANSIT DISCUSSION. VERY MUCH APPRECIATED THIS INFORMATION.  
17 I'M GOING TO KEEP THIS ONE SHEET BECAUSE IT DOES SHOW STRONG  
18 SUPPORT FOR CERTAIN THINGS THAT PERHAPS WE MIGHT WANT TO THINK  
19 ABOUT HOW WE INTEGRATE INTO THE NEXT PLAN. THANK YOU ALL VERY  
20 MUCH FOR TREMENDOUS WORK. THANKS TO YOU, ANDY, FOR YOUR STAFF  
21 WORKING ON THIS AND GLAD TO HAVE YOU HERE AND LOOK FORWARD TO  
22 GREATER ENGAGEMENT. THANK YOU.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PAT?

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. I WANT TO  
2 FOLLOW UP ON COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETER'S QUESTIONS ABOUT THE  
3 DEMOGRAPHICS. MARIN IS AN AGING -- OR IS AN AGE -- WE HAVE A  
4 LOT OF SENIORS, BASICALLY, AND, SO, SENIORS MAY NOT  
5 NECESSARILY GO TO POP-UPS. OR THERE IS NOT TOO MANY CBOS THAT  
6 I KNOW THAT REALLY FOCUS ON REACHING OUT TO SENIORS. SO, I  
7 WOULD REALLY LIKE TO HAVE A LITTLE BIT MORE INFORMATION. WHAT  
8 DID YOU DO IN MARIN?

9

10 **VERONICA CUMMINGS:** FIRST, I WOULD LIKE TO CLARIFY THAT THE --  
11 IN MARIN COUNTY, THE EVENT THAT WAS DONE WAS THE EMBER STOMP  
12 EVENT. AND AT THE TOP OF MY HEAD, I CAN'T RECALL THE SECOND --

13

14 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** DOWNTOWN SAN RAFAEL FARMERS MARKET.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** VERONICA CUMMINGS: THANK YOU.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** SENIORS DON'T REALLY GO TO. WAS THERE ANY OTHER  
19 OUTREACH BY MAIL OR OTHER -- LIKE, SENIOR ORGANIZATIONS?

20

21 **DAVE VAUTIN:** HAPPY TO TAKE THAT QUESTION. MAYBE I SHOULD  
22 ACKNOWLEDGE, I PERSONALLY WAS ASKED AT MAT RIDDEN POP-UP,  
23 EMBER STOMP FESTIVAL, WE DEFINITELY HEARD FROM A LOT OF OLDER  
24 ADULTS AT THAT EVENT TALKED TO A LOT OF RETIREES ABOUT HOW  
25 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS ARE SOMETIMES DIFFERENT WHEN YOU'RE NO



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 LONGER COMMUTING. SO WE ACTUALLY HAD ROBUST ENGAGEMENT AT THAT  
2 EVENT. THE DOTS FILLED THE BOARD. IT WAS VERY SUCCESSFUL. AND  
3 AS VERONICA CUMMINGS MENTIONED WE ALSO HAD THE EVENT AT THE  
4 FARMERS MARKET. WE PAIRED THAT -- OUR ENGAGEMENT IS PAIRED  
5 WITH ONLINE SURVEYS, DIGITAL, YOU KNOW, PROMOTIONS, WHERE WE  
6 CAPTURE PEOPLE WHO AREN'T MAYBE SEIZE THOSE ADVERTISEMENTS ON  
7 SOCIAL MEDIA, WE POLLED THEM TO FILL OUT THOSE SURVEYS. TAKEN  
8 A COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH TRYING TO GET FEEDBACK AS YOU  
9 MENTIONED FROM THOUSANDS OF RESPONDENTS IN THIS ROUND OF  
10 OUTREACH. THERE IS MORE ENGAGEMENT ROUNDS NEXT YEAR WE WELCOME  
11 FEEDBACK FOR OUR 2025 ENGAGEMENT AS WELL. I HEARD FROM A  
12 NUMBER OF FOLKS IN MARIN ABOUT THE UNIQUE NEED.

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. I'LL GIVE YOU SOME NAMES OF SENIOR  
15 ORGANIZATIONS THAT YOU MIGHT WANT TO REACH OUT TO BECAUSE  
16 THEIR NEEDS ARE DEFINITELY DIFFERENT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M  
17 GLAD YOU GOT SOME SENIORS ENGAGED. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. COMING AROUND. SEEING NO LIGHTS  
20 OVER. THERE IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS OR ANY WRITTEN?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** HOW MANY DO YOU HAVE?

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE ONLINE, AND ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE, THIS IS  
8 WARREN CUSHMAN COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING IN  
9 HAYWARD. I WANT TO TALK ABOUT SETTING EXPECTATIONS OF THINGS.  
10 I'M SURE MTC IS FULLY ADJUSTED TO THE REALITY OF THE PANDEMIC  
11 FOUR YEARS AGO. THE PANDEMIC WAS SUCH A POWERFUL MESSAGE TO  
12 ALL OF US IN THE BAY AREA, AND WE ALWAYS HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND  
13 THAT THINGS ARE DIFFERENT NOW THAN THEY WERE FOUR YEARS AGO.  
14 ALSO AS OF TUESDAY WE'RE GOING TO HAVE ANOTHER ADJUSTMENT IN  
15 THIS REGION AND WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DO IT FAST. IT'S  
16 IMPORTANT AS WE MOVE FORWARD TO 2025 AND WE THINK ABOUT  
17 PLANNED BAY AREA, TO HAVE THOSE EXPECTATIONS GROUNDED IN WHAT  
18 IS ACTUALLY HAPPENING. NOT ONLY IN 2050, BUT RIGHT NOW. AND I  
19 JUST HOPE THAT STAFF, AND EVEN THE COMMISSION THINK ABOUT HOW  
20 FOLKS ARE GOING TO HAVE TO PIVOT TO NEW WAYS OF THINKING.  
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT IS ADINA LEVIN. ADINA GO AHEAD AND  
2 INTRODUCE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. ADINA? STILL CAN'T  
3 HEAR YOU. WE'LL LOOP BACK AFTER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT IF YOU  
4 STILL WANT TO SPEAK.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THIS WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM.  
7 I'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 8E, THIS IS THE MTC ABAG ADVISORY COUNCIL  
8 STRATEGY. AND KY-NAM MILLER, IS HE GOING TO PRESENT THIS?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** KY-NAM.

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR SPERING, I'M STEPPING IN FOR MY RIGHT  
13 HAND TODAY WHO IS UNFORTUNATELY WITH HER FATHER WHO IS HAVING  
14 SOME SIGNIFICANT HEALTH ISSUES. I'M GOING TO STAND IN FOR  
15 ALIX. AS OPENING OVER THE PAST DECADE MTC AND ABAG HAVE  
16 SUCCESSFULLY CONSOLIDATED STAFF AND CERTAIN COMMITTEES  
17 FOSTERING A COHESIVE EFFICIENT APPROACH TO THE REGIONAL  
18 PLANNING GOVERNANCE. THE COLLABORATION HAS STRENGTHENED OUR  
19 ABILITY TO ADDRESS THE COMPLEX CHALLENGES OF THE BAY AREA AND  
20 TODAY WE'RE EXCITE TO RECOMMEND THE NEXT STEP IN THE JOURNEY  
21 THROUGH THE INTEGRATION OF ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE  
22 AND MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. INTEGRATION AIMS TO ENHANCE  
23 OUR COMMITMENT TO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND EQUITY ENSURING  
24 THAT WE CONTINUE TO PROVIDE MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT POINTS THAT  
25 POLICY DECISIONS REALLY REFLECT INPUT FROM DIVERSE VOICES AND



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PERSPECTIVES OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS. WITH THAT I WOULD LIKE TO  
2 HAND IT OVER TO MY COLLEAGUE KY-NAM MILLER TO WALL THROUGH THE  
3 KEY CONSIDERATIONS AND IMPORTANT INITIATIVES.

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU ANDY. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS KY-NAM  
6 MILLER, ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR ACCESSIBILITY CULTURE AND  
7 RACIAL EQUITY AT THE ACRE OFFICE AT ABAG AND MTC ALSO STAFF  
8 LIAISON FOR MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND HAD THE PRIVILEGE  
9 OF PREVIOUSLY SERVING ON THE COUNCIL WHICH GIVES ME UNIQUE  
10 PERSPECTIVE ON THE VALUE AND IMPACT OF OUR ADVISORY BODIES.  
11 TODAY'S INFORMATIONAL ITEM IS A PROPOSED INTEGRATION OF THE  
12 MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING  
13 COMMITTEE. TOWARDS GREATER COORDINATION SHARED DECISION-MAKING  
14 STRUCTURES LIKE STAFF CONSOLIDATION AND INTEGRATION  
15 PROGRESSION OF EFFORTS STRIDES IN INTEGRATING COMMITTEES  
16 FOSTERING GREATER COORDINATION AND COMMUNICATION. THIS  
17 HISTORICAL CONTEXT HIGHLIGHTS OUR ONGOING COMMITMENT WITH  
18 COHESIVE APPROACH IN REGIONAL POLICY AND DECISION-MAKING  
19 SETTING STRONG FOUNDATION FOR THE PROPOSED ADVISORY COUNCIL,  
20 INTEGRATION. BOTH ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE AND MTC  
21 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL BRING STRENGTHS TO REGIONAL PLANNING  
22 POLICY EFFORTS ARE. MTC COUNCIL 27 MEMBER BODY FOCUSES ON  
23 TRANSPORTATION RELATED ISSUES DRAWING ON EXPERTISE OF ITS  
24 MEMBERS FROM VARIOUS SECTORS MEANWHILE ABAG RPC INCLUDES  
25 ELECTED NON-ELECTED MEMBERS PROVIDING DIRECTION ON BROADER





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PLANNING TOPICS CREATING COMPREHENSIVE INCLUSIVE FRAMEWORK.  
2 THIS INTEGRATION WILL STRENGTHEN POLICY COORDINATION BETWEEN  
3 MTC ABAG ALLOWING MEMBERS TO ADDRESS COMPREHENSIVE ISSUES  
4 INCLUDING TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING.  
5 BY CREATING A SINGLE INCLUSIVE ADVISORY COUNCIL WE CAN IMPROVE  
6 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT MAKING IT EASIER FOR RESIDENTS TO UNDERSTAND  
7 AND PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL PLANNING PROCESSES. MAKING A  
8 HOLISTIC APPROACH TO ADDRESSING INTERCONNECTED REGIONAL  
9 CHALLENGES AND ENHANCING ABILITY TO DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT  
10 POLICIES THAT ARE EQUITABLE, INCLUSIVE AND RESPONSIVE TO NEEDS  
11 OF ALL BAY AREA RESIDENTS ENSURING BROAD AND DIVERSE  
12 REPRESENTATION FROM ACROSS THE REGION WILL BE CRUCIAL STAFF  
13 WILL WORK DILIGENTLY TO MAINTAIN GEOGRAPHICAL DIVERSITY  
14 INCLUDING AT-LARGE APPOINTMENTS FROM VARIOUS SECTORS. THE  
15 REFASHIONED ADVISORY BODY IS PROPOSED TO MAINTAIN GEOGRAPHIC  
16 UNIVERSITY COUNTY APPOINTED REPRESENT TIFS INCLUDING AT-LARGE  
17 APPOINTMENTS FROM BUSINESS LABOR ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS THE BODY  
18 IS SIMILAR AS THE CURRENT POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AT 27  
19 MEMBERS STRUCTURE AIMS TO BALANCE DIVERSE REPRESENTATION. IT  
20 WOULD NOT INCLUDES ELECTED OFFICIALS MAXIMIZING COMMUNITY  
21 VIEWPOINTS AND THOSE VIEWPOINTS ARE LIFTED UP AS ABAG AND MTC  
22 POLICY MAKERS AS CONSIDERATION OF POLICIES AND INVESTMENT  
23 DECISIONS IN CONCLUSION STAFF IS SEEKING INPUT ALONG WITH  
24 INTERESTED PARTIES TO THE PROPOSAL IN COORDINATION WITH THE  
25 ABAG MTC LEADERSHIP AHEAD OF FORMAL ADOPTION IN 2025 TIME FOR



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THE NEXT TERM'S RECRUITMENT PERIOD. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME  
2 AND CONSIDERATION. I LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR QUESTIONS WORKING  
3 WITH YOU ALL TO MAKE THIS INTEGRATION A SUCCESS.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PAT?

6

7 **WENDY WATANABE:** WHY ARE YOU NOT INCLUDING ELECTED OFFICIALS TO  
8 SERVE ON THAT COMMITTEE? BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS A GOOD  
9 DISCUSSION THAT YOU HAVE WITH ELECTED AS WELL AS NON-ELECTED'S  
10 AND THAT'S ONE OF THE REASONS WHY WE HAVE THE REGIONAL  
11 PLANNING COMMITTEE FOR ABAG. SO I'M CURE WHY.

12

13 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THERE IS DEFINITELY PROS AND CONS OF INCLUDING  
14 ELECTED'S, AND WE CONSIDERED THE TRAIT OFFS AND THIS IS THE  
15 PROPOSAL. I THINK THE FIRST BASIC TRADEOFF, YOU ARE AWARE THAT  
16 WHEN AN ELECTED PERSON ENTERS THE SPACE THEY HAVE A CERTAIN  
17 GRAVITAS AND IT IMPACTS THE CONVERSATION AND CONTRAST OF TWO  
18 BODIES ON THE COUNCIL ALLOWING FOR FREER KIND OF ORGANIC  
19 DISCUSSIONS THAT EMERGE IN POLICY CONVERSATIONS. I WOULD TO  
20 BRING MY COLLEAGUE REBECCA LONG LEGISLATURE WHO HAS SHAPED  
21 THIS RECOMMENDATION AS WELL.

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU KY-NAM. CONSIDERATIONS ARE THAT WE  
24 HAVE A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT POLICY COMMITTEE THAT IS THE BOARD  
25 MEMBERS SIT ON AND THEY RECEIVE PRESENTATIONS FROM THE STAFF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THAT ARE ALSO PRESENTATIONS THAT GO TO THE POLICY ADVISORY  
2 COUNCIL SO THERE'S A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF REPETITION THAT  
3 WOULD BE OCCURRING FOR THE ELECTED OFFICIALS THEMSELVES BY  
4 SERVING ON THE RPC, OR THE RECONSTITUTED MERGED ADVISORY BODY.  
5 BUT I THINK KY-NAM'S KEY POINT THEREABOUT THE PURPOSE REALLY  
6 OF THESE ADVISORY BODIES -- THESE ADVISORY BODIES IN OUR MIND  
7 IS TO BRING NEW VOICES OF THE BAY AREA BOTH JUST GENERAL  
8 RESIDENTS AS WELL AS WHAT WE THINK ARE SOME OF THE FEATURES OF  
9 THE RPC THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO BRING INTO THIS NEW BODY ARE  
10 PEOPLE WHO ARE ACTUALLY ON STAFF TO ORGANIZATIONS THAT HAVE A  
11 REGIONAL VIEW. FOR EXAMPLE, EFFECTIVE TO HAVE LEAGUE OF WOMEN  
12 VOTERS, BAY AREA COUNCIL, OTHER ORGANIZATIONS, GREENBELT SO WE  
13 WOULD LIKE FOR SOME PORTION OF THE NEWLY CONSTITUTED BODY TO  
14 HAVE THOSE BE FROM ORGANIZATIONS LIKE THAT THAT ARE ENGAGED IN  
15 OUR WORK. WE HEARD FROM OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THEY  
16 REALLY APPRECIATE COMMISSIONERS THAT COME AND SPEAK WITH THEM  
17 THEY APPRECIATE HAVING THE DIALOGUE AND OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGE  
18 WITH MTC LEADERSHIP, AND ON THE FLIP SIDE WE HAVE HAD A NUMBER  
19 OF CONVERSATIONS WITH REPRESENTATIVES OF THE RPC WHO HAVE SAID  
20 THEY VALUE THE HAVING THE OPPORTUNITY TO MEET INFORMALLY WITH  
21 ELECTED OFFICIALS. SO IF THIS PROPOSAL DOES MOVE FORWARD WE  
22 THINK IT WOULD BE GREAT SOMETIMES TO HAVE ABAG AND MTC  
23 COMMISSIONERS WHO WANT TO COME AND BE PART OF THAT  
24 CONVERSATION BUT IN TERMS OF OFFICIAL MEMBERSHIP WE DO THINK  
25 IT WOULD BE MORE SUCCESSFUL IN THIS NEW FORMAT.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** MY OTHER QUESTION IS HOW WOULD MEMBERS BE  
3 SELECTED? WOULD ABAG SELECT HALF AND MTC SELECT HALF?

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** TO BE DETERMINED. IT DEPENDS ON FEEDBACK THAT  
6 WE GET FROM YOU ALL AND VARIOUS CONSTITUENCIES. THE COUNCIL  
7 PRACTICE IS TO HAVE THE COUNTY BASED COMMISSIONERS MAKE  
8 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THOSE, 2/3 OF THE REPRESENTATIVES ON THAT  
9 BODY ARE FROM COUNTIES AND THEN THE OTHER 1/3, THE CHAIR NAMED  
10 AT-LARGES. SO I THINK THAT'S ONE POINT BUT I THINK AS THE TWO  
11 BODIES REPRESENT MTC AND ABAG THERE WOULD NEEDS TO BE  
12 DISCUSSION ABOUT HOW THAT'S DOLED OUT.

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M GOING TO TELL YOU HOW I FEEL. I FEEL AS  
15 THOUGH ABAG IS A STEP CHILD NOW. EVEN, LIKE, ON THE EARLIER  
16 ITEM, ABOUT THE PRIORITY CONVERSATION AREAS, I DIDN'T  
17 UNDERSTAND WHY ABAG DIDN'T VOTE ON THAT. ONLY THE MTC  
18 COMMISSIONERS. SO, I FEEL THAT ABAG IS BEING PUSHED OUT. SO, I  
19 DON'T THINK THE COMMISSIONERS SHOULD BE DOING ALL THE  
20 APPOINTMENTS. I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE SHARED BETWEEN THE ABAG  
21 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS, AS WELL AS THE MTC. SO, I REALLY  
22 THINK THAT THE CONCEPT OF ABAG HAS BEEN LOST.

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** YEAH. GO AHEAD.

2

3 **REBECCA LONG:** I JUST WANT TO REALLY ACKNOWLEDGE THOSE  
4 COMMENTS, DIRECTOR ECKLUND. AS KY-NAM MENTIONED, WE DON'T HAVE  
5 A PROPOSAL TODAY FOR WHAT THAT EXACT APPROVAL PROCESS SHOULD  
6 BE, BUT WE TOTALLY AGREE IF IT'S GOING TO BE A MERGED BODY  
7 THAT ABAG SHOULD BE HAVING A SAY ON ALL OF THE APPOINTMENTS. I  
8 THINK ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WITH USING THE GEOGRAPHIC MODEL  
9 THAT WE HAVE BEEN USING FOR APPOINTMENTS IS THAT ABAG IS SUCH  
10 A LARGER BODY AND IT'S DIFFICULT TO HAVE APPROVAL FROM, LET'S  
11 SAY, EVERY REPRESENTATIVE OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY ON ABAG. SO  
12 ONE IDEA WOULD BE TO CONSIDER HAVING ABAG LEADERSHIP REVIEW  
13 AND VET ALL OF THE APPOINTMENTS, AS OPPOSED TO INDIVIDUAL ABAG  
14 DIRECTORS. BUT WE AGREE WITH YOU. WE ARE NOT, BY ANY STRETCH,  
15 TRYING TO MARGINALIZE ABAG IN THIS PROPOSAL.

16

17 **PAT ECKLUND:** I THINK THAT AS STAFF DEVELOP SOME OF THESE  
18 RECOMMENDATIONS, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO TALK TO PEOPLE WHO ARE  
19 SERVING ON THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. I DO NOT FEEL THAT WE'RE  
20 GETTING QUITE THE IMPACT, OR THE ABILITY TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK  
21 ON SOME OF THE PROPOSALS.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** CARLOS?

24

25 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YEAH --



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **BELIA RAMOS:** JUST A SECOND.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

5

6 **BELIA RAMOS:** I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THOSE COMMENTS, DIRECTOR  
7 ECKLUND. I HAVE BEEN SPEAKING WITH STAFF ABOUT THIS. I WILL  
8 SAY THAT ON BEHALF OF ABAG, I AM HAVING COGNIZANT OF THE FACT  
9 THAT OUR REPRESENTATION, ALTHOUGH GEOGRAPHICALLY, IT IS  
10 EXACTLY THE SAME AS MTC MEMBERSHIP, IT IS DIFFERENT. AND SO  
11 ACKNOWLEDGING THAT RPC HASN'T WORKED AS EFFECTIVELY FOR ABAG  
12 AS WE REALLY CAN IN THE FUTURE. LOOKING AT THE INTEGRATION  
13 HERE, CERTAINLY FROM -- THROUGH THE ABAG LENS, WE NEED TO  
14 ACKNOWLEDGE WHERE WE'RE AT WITH MTC AS A PARTNER AT THIS  
15 POINT, HAVING GONE THROUGH THE CONSOLIDATION, THESE  
16 COMMITTEES, SOME EXISTED BEFOREHAND, AND THEN WE HAVE JUST  
17 BEEN ADDING COMMITTEE -- I DON'T KNOW ABOUT YOU GUYS, BUT I  
18 FEEL LIKE I'M HERE QUITE A LOT, AND I RESIDE IN NAPA COUNTY.  
19 AND I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT ACKNOWLEDGMENT AS WE LOOK AT  
20 THE WORK AND HOW WE WRAP OUR ARMS AROUND THE ENTIRETY OF THE  
21 WORK AND OUR WORK PORTFOLIO, THAT IT BE EFFECTIVE. WHILE WE  
22 ARE GOING TO WORK THROUGH, YOU KNOW, PLANNING MONEYS, I HEAR  
23 THE PCA PART. RIGHT? WE HAVE HAD THOSE PRESENTATIONS. IT'S  
24 COME BEFORE US, BUT THE PLANNING DOLLARS ARE RUNNING THROUGH  
25 MTC. AND, SO, WE ARE IN A -- IN A PLACE WHERE POLICY-WISE, WE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 HAVE A SAY. AND PERHAPS MONEY WISE, WE DON'T, WHICH IS EXACTLY  
2 WHY THE TIME IS NOW TO HAVE THESE DISCUSSIONS OF HOW WE MERGE  
3 THOSE TWO SO THAT WE'RE NOT FEELING ON THE OUTS OF THE  
4 COMMITTEE WORK THAT WE DO. AND, SO, THAT -- THAT REALLY IS, NO  
5 DECISIONS HAVE BEEN MADE. THIS IS AN INFORMATIVE WAY TO TELL  
6 ALL OF US, ABAG AND MTC, WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT A MORE  
7 INTEGRATED PATH OF POLICY THAT CAN BE MORE EFFECTIVE FOR  
8 EVERYONE. AND, SO, I THINK THOSE TYPES -- THAT TYPE OF  
9 FEEDBACK IS INSTRUCTIVE. AND, ALSO, ILLUSTRATIVE OF THE  
10 AWKWARDNESS THAT IS TRYING TO BE ADDRESSED THROUGH THIS VERY  
11 NEXT STEP.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** WELL, I -- I ALWAYS FELT THAT THE REGIONAL  
14 PLANNING COMMITTEE WAS REALLY EFFECTIVE. AND WE HAVEN'T BEEN  
15 MEETING FOR A LONG TIME. AND -- BUT I WANT TO REEMPHASIZE,  
16 AGAIN, I THINK THAT SOME OF THE VALUE OF ABAG HAS BEEN LOST.  
17 BUT -- SO I JUST -- IF SOMEONE WANTS TO TALK OFFLINE, THIS'S  
18 GREAT.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** CARLOS?

21

22 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SO, AT THE PRESENT VICE CHAIR OF THE RPC,  
23 POSSIBLY TALKING MY WAY OUT OF A JOB [LAUGHTER] WHICH MIGHT BE  
24 FINE -- AND SOMEONE WHO ACTUALLY SERVED ON THE MINORITY  
25 ADVISORY COMMITTEE SOME 15 -- MAYBE 17 YEARS AGO, FOR THREE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 YEARS -- I HAVE KIND OF MIXED EMOTIONS, A NUMBER OF CONCERNS  
2 ABOUT WHAT IS PRESENTLY AN EMBRYONIC PROPOSAL. I MEAN, LET'S  
3 BE CLEAR, THIS IS NOT FULLY BAKED. RIGHT? STAFF IS THINKING  
4 ABOUT THE INTEGRATION OF THE MEMBERS FROM ONE GROUP TO THE  
5 OTHER. I WOULD CONCUR WITH MISS ECKLUND THAT THERE WERE INDEED  
6 SOME VERY ROBUST AND INSTRUCTIVE DISCUSSIONS THAT OCCURRED AT  
7 THE RPC. I ALSO THINK THOSE SAME DISCUSSIONS WHEN I WAS ON THE  
8 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, WHICH WAS CALLED THE MINORITY POLICY  
9 ADVISORY COMMITTEE, WERE JUST AS ENGAGING AND ROBUST AND  
10 PROVIDED THE MTC ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE A LOT OF  
11 INFORMATION THAT I THINK EVENTUALLY WAS TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT.  
12 THE INTEGRATION OF THOSE TWO BODIES -- AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE  
13 THAT THE BAY AREA COUNCIL IS THERE. I DON'T ALWAYS GET ALONG  
14 WITH THEM OR AGREE WITH THEM BUT HAVING THEM IN THE ROOM AND  
15 CREATING THAT ROBUST DISCUSSION WHICH SOMETIMES GETS HEATED,  
16 IS IMPORTANT. HAVING LABOR THERE IS VERY IMPORTANT. HAVING THE  
17 ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS AND THOSE KIND OF FOLKS WHO REPRESENT  
18 SOCIAL JUSTICE COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, RIGHT? FIGURING OUT WHAT  
19 THAT MIX IS -- AND HAVE SAID THIS TO STAFF, PERHAPS YOU GO TO  
20 AN UNRULY 31 MEMBERS FROM 27. I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU GET THERE -  
21 - BUT I CERTAINLY WILL BE LOOKING AT THAT INTEGRATION BECAUSE  
22 I ASSUME YOU'RE GOING TO COME BACK TO US. WE'RE GOING TO  
23 INTEGRATE THIS GROUP. I HAVE SOME CONCERNS ABOUT HOW THE RHNA  
24 PROCESS WAS GOING, BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY WE'RE USING THE RPC AS A  
25 SOUNDING BOARD MAKING SURE WE UNDERSTAND HOW THAT'S GOING TO





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 WORK PRIOR TO MOVING IN AND MOVING ON WITH THIS PROPOSAL.  
2 STAFF SAID THEY THOUGHT IT WAS POSSIBLE TO ACCOMMODATE BUT  
3 LET'S JUST MAKE SURE WE DON'T SOMEHOW BREAK THAT LINK. AND  
4 MISS ECKLUND, PAT, I THINK YOU'RE RIGHT ABOUT THE APPOINTMENTS  
5 PIECE, I HADN'T THOUGHT OF THAT. AND I DO THINK ABAG PLAY SOME  
6 ROLE. I THINK THAT'S VITALLY IMPORTANT. SO I WOULD SAY STAFF  
7 CONTINUE TO DEVELOP THIS PROPOSAL AND BRING IT BACK TO US. WE  
8 HAVE BEEN WORKING TOWARDS INTEGRATION AS ABAG AND MTC FOR SOME  
9 SEVEN YEARS AND THERE WAS A LOT OF BAD BLOOD WHEN THIS  
10 INITIALLY HAPPENED AND TO DATE, WE HAVE MADE INCREDIBLE STRIDE  
11 IN BRINGING THE TWO ORGANIZATIONS TOGETHER IN A WAY WHERE WE  
12 TRUST EACH OTHER. AND BECAUSE OF THAT TRUST, I THINK I CAN SAY  
13 AT THIS POINT, WE'RE GOING TO GET TO A POINT WHERE THIS  
14 INTEGRATION COULD WORK. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. YOU KNOW, I -- I CERTAINLY  
17 DISAGREE WITH YOU ON THE STEP CHILD. YOU KNOW, WHEN I LOOK AT  
18 THE WORK THAT MAYOR ARREGUIN MADE, YOU KNOW, BRINGING MTC ABAG  
19 TOGETHER, I THINK IT'S JUST BEEN A TREMENDOUS ACCOMPLISHMENT.  
20 AND I SEE THE TWO ORGANIZATIONS WORKING CLOSER TOGETHER THAN  
21 EVER. THE VERY FACT THAT YOU'RE SITTING AT THIS TABLE MAKING  
22 THE COMMENT THAT YOU'RE MAKING AND MAKING THE RECOMMENDATIONS  
23 THAT STAFF IS SAYING YES, THEY WILL CONSIDER, IS AN EXAMPLE OF  
24 THAT. SO, I DON'T WANT TO DIMINISH THE STRIDES IN EFFORTS THAT  
25 WE MAKE. ONE THING THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, MTC IS THE MPO FOR



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THE REGION, AND WE HAVE STATUTORY, AND WE HAVE, YOU KNOW,  
2 FEDERAL LEGISLATION THAT MTC CAN ONLY VOTE ON, NOT ABAG. AND,  
3 SO, I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD IF WE CLARIFY THAT. BECAUSE SOME  
4 OF THESE VOTES, YOU KNOW, ABAG, LEGALLY CAN'T BE VOTING ON.  
5 AND SO HAVE TO -- I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO MAKE THAT  
6 SEPARATION. IF THERE IS AREAS OF DISCRETION ON THE MONEY, I  
7 THINK BOTH SHOULD VOTE ON IT. AND I THINK STAFF AGREES WITH  
8 THAT. MY MEETING WITH STAFF IS I FELT WE SHOULDN'T HAVE  
9 ELECTED OFFICIALS ON IT, THAT WAS MY INPUT. AND ANY OTHER  
10 COMMENT THAT I HAD IS I WOULD LIKE TO SEE A WHOLE LOT OF NEW  
11 FACES. WE SEEM TO HAVE THE SAME PEOPLE ROTATING THROUGH THESE  
12 COMMITTEES ALL THE TIME AND I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD TO REALLY  
13 TRY TO GET PEOPLE WITH FRESH IDEAS AND SEE THIS A LITTLE BIT  
14 DIFFERENTLY THAN WE DO. AND THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. I HOPE  
15 THAT'S A STRIDE THAT STAFF CAN MAKE TOO. BUT I AGREE WITH  
16 BOARD MEMBER ECKLUND, I THINK ABAG DEFINITELY PLAY A ROLE WHO  
17 GETS APPOINTED TO THESE COMMITTEES. THEY PLAY A MUCH DIFFERENT  
18 ROLE IN THE REGION. I SAW WHEN I WAS AN ABAG MEMBER THAT'S THE  
19 ONLY ORGANIZATION THAT TALKS TO ALL THE CITIES AND COUNTIES,  
20 AND THAT'S A FORUM THAT'S VALUABLE. I WOULD HATE TO SEE THAT  
21 FORUM LOST. I MEAN THAT WOULD BE LOSS TO THE REGION. COUNCIL  
22 MEMBERS AND SUPERVISOR ALL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO VOICE THEIR  
23 OPINION UNDER THESE IMPORTANT ISSUES. THIS WAS AN INFORMATION  
24 ITEM. STAFF IS GOING TO TAKE COMMENTS. OH. WANDA?  
25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** YOU HAVE TO START LOOKING MY WAY, JIM. THANK  
2 YOU FOR ACKNOWLEDGING ME. FIRST AND FOREMOST -- I DIDN'T GET  
3 TO DO THIS AT THE LAST, I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE WORK  
4 THAT YOU'RE DOING IN BRINGING THIS FORWARD. AND OF COURSE,  
5 INTEGRATION IS VERY IMPORTANT. I BELIEVE IN THAT. AND I DON'T  
6 WANT TO IN ANY WAY DISCREDIT BOARD MEMBER ECKLUND'S COMMENTS.  
7 HOWEVER, I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT ABAG  
8 HAVE AT LEAST SOMEONE AT THE TABLE. AND I KNOW THIS IS IN  
9 INFANCY AND YOU'RE DEVELOPING THIS OUT, SO IT GIVES  
10 OPPORTUNITIES TO GIVE YOU SOME SUGGESTIONS AND IDEAS THAT WE  
11 WOULD LIKE TO SEE AS PART OF THIS PROCESS. BUT I DID GET AN  
12 OPPORTUNITY TO LISTEN INTO MY OTHER COLLEAGUES BEING A NEWER  
13 MEMBER HERE, I HAVE TO TAKE THOSE THINGS INTO CONSIDERATION AS  
14 I PUT TOGETHER MY THOUGHTS ON THIS, BUT I WANTED TO MAKE SURE  
15 AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS THAT WE'RE USING AN EQUITABLE  
16 LENS SO THAT THOSE WHO ARE SITTING ON ABAG WHO DOESN'T AGREE  
17 WITH THIS INTEGRATION, FEEL THAT THEY ARE A PART OF IT, WE  
18 DON'T WANT TO MAKE THOSE INDIVIDUALS ON ABAG WHO HAVE GIVEN  
19 THEIR TIME AND EFFORT FEEL DEVALUED. AND SO THAT'S ALL I  
20 REALLY WANTED TO SHARE ON THIS. BUT I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO  
21 THIS WORK. AND AS WE LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING ON THE NEW CBOS  
22 AND THE DIFFERENT ORGANIZATIONS THAT WILL BRING A DIVERSE  
23 VOICE TO THIS PARTICULAR BOARD, I -- BECAUSE I HAVEN'T SEEN  
24 THIS PROCESS BEFORE, HOW DO THE MEMBERS -- HOW ARE THE MEMBERS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1   SELECTED? WHAT PROCESS -- WHAT IS THE PROCESSES THAT WE  
2   UTILIZE TO MAKE THOSE DETERMINATIONS?

3

4   **KY-NAM MILLER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I COULD BRIEFLY RESPOND TO  
5   DIRECTOR WILLIAMS. THE PROCESS IS EARLY NEXT YEAR WE WOULD  
6   HAVE AN OPEN NOMINATION, WHICH, IF IT PASSES PRELUDE TO THIS  
7   NEW BODY, IT WOULD BE SPREAD THROUGH SOCIAL MEDIA, THROUGH  
8   COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG BOARD MEMBERS, TO ALL MEMBERS OF THE  
9   COMMITTEE. WE ALSO DO SPECIFIC OUTREACH ACROSS GEOGRAPHIES AND  
10   WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. WE AIM TO GET HUNDREDS OF  
11   APPLICATIONS SO THAT WE HAVE A REAL DIVERSITY OF ALL TYPES,  
12   FROM ACROSS THE REGION, AND THE END RESULT IS WE HAVE TWO  
13   MEMBERS FROM EVERY COUNTY. AND THEN, SO THAT'S 18 OF THOSE AND  
14   THEN I'M SPEAKING ONLY ABOUT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I'M  
15   NOT DEEPLY FAMILIAR WITH THE RPC APPOINTMENT PROCESS. BUT,  
16   ESSENTIALLY, WE WOULD DO AN OPEN CALL FOR NOMINATIONS NEXT  
17   SPRING AND AIM TO HAVE INTERVIEWS AND SELECTIONS IN THE FALL.  
18   AND THEN APPROVAL BY THESE BODIES BY THIS TIME NEXT YEAR. THE  
19   NEXT TERM ENDS DECEMBER 2025 SO THE NEW BODY IS DUE TO BE  
20   SWORN IN, IN JANUARY 2026.

21

22   **WANDA WILLIAMS:** ALL RIGHT. SO THAT GIVES US TIME TO DO A  
23   THOROUGH RECRUITMENT PROCESS. ALL RIGHT. I WANT TO THANK YOU  
24   FOR ANSWERING THOSE QUESTIONS FOR ME AND GIVING ME MORE



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 CLARITY. THANK YOU. THANK YOU, CHAIR, FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO  
2 ASK MY QUESTIONS.  
3  
4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** JESSE, THEN YOU. >JESSE ARREGUIN: I  
5 DON'T WANT TO BELABOR THIS, BUT I AGREE WHOLEHEARTEDLY WITH  
6 COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO'S COMMENTS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I  
7 CONVEYED TO STAFF WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THIS CONCEPTUALLY, AND  
8 I DO SUPPORT EXPLORING, THIS I THINK IT MAKES SENSE, IS MAKING  
9 SURE THAT WE HAVE DIVERSITY OF STAKEHOLDER PERSPECTIVE, AND  
10 THAT INCLUDES BUSINESS, THAT INCLUDES LABOR, ALSO INCLUDES THE  
11 EQUITY GROUPS, AS WELL. THAT'S ONE OF THE BENEFITS OF THE  
12 REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE IS THAT IT'S -- IT WAS MORE  
13 FOCUSED, MORE BROADLY REPRESENTATIVE OF THE REGION'S  
14 STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING LABOR AND BUSINESS. AND I THINK HAVING  
15 THEM AT CBIA WITH THE COUNCIL, THIS COULD PROVIDE OPPORTUNITY  
16 LOOK AT THE CURRENT COMPENSATION WHERE CERTAIN VOICES THAT  
17 AREN'T REPRESENTS THAT SHOULD BE REPRESENTED. I WANT TO  
18 EMPHASIZE THE PURPOSES OF, YES WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE --  
19 WE CENTER EQUITY IN HOW WE APPOINT REPRESENTATIVES BUT ALSO  
20 MAKE SURE WE HAVE CERTAIN INSTITUTIONAL STAKEHOLDERS AT THE  
21 TABLE. I THINK THAT MAKES FOR GOOD CONVERSATION AND GOOD  
22 OUTCOMES. AND WOULD ALSO SECOND THE REQUEST THAT ABAG  
23 LEADERSHIP HAVE A ROLE IN MAKING RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE  
24 APPOINTMENT OF SOME OF THESE SEATS AS WELL. THANK YOU.  
25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. GINA?

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** REAL QUICK. AND THIS IS AN AMAZING ADVISORY GROUP,  
4 FIRST AND FOREMOST. THEY REALLY PUT IN THE TIME AND EFFORT.  
5 WHAT ARE -- I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN ISSUES WITH THE BROWN ACT --  
6 DON'T HAVE TO ADDRESS THEM NOW AS TO HOW -- WELL, NOT BROWN  
7 ACT, BUT ACTUALLY RECEIVING QUORUM, BECAUSE IT'S SUCH A LARGE  
8 BODY PRESENTLY. AND THEN SECONDARILY, THE EQUITABLE  
9 DISTRIBUTION OF APPOINTMENTS EVEN AT THE MTC LEVEL IS LIMITED.  
10 YOU WILL NOTICE THERE ARE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES OF PEOPLE THAT  
11 CAN BE ASSIGNED. SO, I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU WOULD APPROACH THAT,  
12 IF IT'S THIS BODY IS EXPANDED. BECAUSE SOMETIMES THERE ARE  
13 THREE JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE AN EXTRA VOTE. AND THEN THE  
14 CHAIR GETS MAJORITY OF THESE APPOINTMENTS HERE. SO HOW DO YOU  
15 -- BECAUSE YOU HAVE OLDER ADULTS, PEOPLE OF COLOR, LOW-INCOME,  
16 ARE THOSE RESTRICTION SAYS STILL GOING TO APPLY? OR YOU'RE  
17 GOING TO EXPAND ON THAT? AND, AGAIN, WE AT THE MTC LEVEL,  
18 SOMETIMES OUR APPOINTMENTS ARE JUST LIMITED TO CERTAIN  
19 CATEGORIES, BECAUSE OF THE WAY THIS IS CURRENTLY SET UP. SO,  
20 AS THIS PROGRESSES, AND IN THE INFANT I'LL STAGE, OR WHATEVER  
21 [LAUGHTER] MY COLLEAGUE SAID HERE, THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED  
22 IN ORDER TO MAINTAIN EQUITY, AND TO BUILD ON THIS GROUP TO  
23 MAKE IT STRONGER. AGAIN, THIS IS A FABULOUS GROUP, AND THE  
24 WORK THAT THEY PUT THIS IS, I THINK, IMMEASURABLE HERE. IT  
25 REALLY HELPS US ALL. SO, I HOPE THE PROCESS INCLUDES ALL OF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THAT. BECAUSE WE ADOPT THEM TO BE PRODUCTIVE AND THE MOST  
2 BENEFICIAL TO THE REGION. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD  
5 MEMBERS THIS IS WHAT STAFF WAS LOOKING FOR WITH THIS TYPE OF  
6 INPUT. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL THOSE COMMENTS. WARREN  
7 CUSHMAN DO YOU WANT TO COME FORWARD FOR PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

10

11 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. SO, WARREN CUSHMAN. COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR  
12 INDEPENDENT LIVING. I ATTEND THESE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
13 MEETINGS AS OFTEN AS POSSIBLE. FIRST OF ALL, THERE ARE,  
14 ESSENTIALLY, NINE SPOTS FOR PEOPLE OF COLOR AND NINE SLOTS FOR  
15 SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. SO, THOUGH 18 SLOTS, A  
16 BIG QUESTION IS WHETHER OR NOT SOME OF THOSE SLOTS ARE GOING  
17 TO GO AWAY. OBVIOUSLY IF SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES  
18 ARE GOING TO GO AWAY, YOU KNOW I'M GOING TO BE RIGHT BACK  
19 HERE. SO WE HAVE GOT TO BE CAREFUL WITH THIS, BECAUSE THERE  
20 ARE EXPECTATIONS IN THE COMMUNITY, ESPECIALLY FROM THE EQUITY  
21 COMMUNITIES AND THE SENIOR AND DISABILITY COMMUNITIES THAT  
22 WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO WEIGH IN AT THE LEVEL WE HAVE  
23 ALWAYS BEEN WEIGHING N I MEAN, THIS IS HISTORICAL. THIS HAS  
24 BEEN GOING ON FOR QUITE A WHILE. SO, THE MESSAGE HAS TO BE  
25 CLEAR IF WE'RE GOING TO ADD THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND SOME OF



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 THESE OTHER FOLKS AND TAKE SLOTS AWAY FROM PEOPLE WITH  
2 DISABILITIES THAT'S NOT GOING TO WORK FOR ME P THANK YOU VERY  
3 MUCH.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY OTHER  
6 SPEAKERS, MARTHA?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. YES. WE HAVE THREE PEOPLE IN ZOOM  
9 WISHING TO SPEAK. FIRST UP IS GOING TO BE PAMELA CAMPOS.

10

11 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** HELLO. GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU FOR THE  
12 OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. MY NAME IS PAMELA CAMPOS.  
13 I AM A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND AM CURRENTLY  
14 REPRESENTING AS CHAIR ON THAT COUNCIL. I HAVE HAD THE  
15 OPPORTUNITY TO HEAR FROM STAFF WITH OUR COUNCIL MEMBER  
16 LEADERSHIP ABOUT THIS POTENTIAL CHANGE. AND IT'S DEFINITELY  
17 SOMETHING THAT WE'RE VERY INTERESTED IN. WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
18 HEARING THIS ITEM WITH THE FULL POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL SOON.  
19 AND I JUST WANT TO SHARE MY SUPPORT FOR THIS CHANGE, BECAUSE  
20 IN MANY OF OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETINGS, WE HAVE HEARD  
21 OVER AND OVER AGAIN FROM COUNCIL MEMBERS ABOUT THE DESIRE TO  
22 LEARN MORE AND PROVIDE INPUT ABOUT HOUSING, ECONOMICS,  
23 CLIMATE, AND OTHER ISSUES THAT ARISE IN RELATION TO PUBLIC  
24 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING. AND, SO, TO ME, THAT DEMONSTRATES A  
25 NEED FOR STRONGER UNITY TO, HOPEFULLY, LEAD TO A STRONGER





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 IMPACT ON BEHALF OF THESE OF COMMUNITY VOICES. AND, SO, I JUST  
2 WANT TO, AGAIN, SHOW THAT I AM IN SUPPORT OF LEARNING MORE  
3 ABOUT HOW WE CAN CREATE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR THIS CHANGE TO  
4 HAPPEN AND ENSURING THAT WE CONTINUE TO HAVE STRONG  
5 GEOGRAPHICAL REPRESENTATION FROM THE NEXT BAY AREA COUNTIES  
6 MAKING SURE THAT WE ARE HEARING, ALWAYS, FROM FOLKS IN THE  
7 NORTH BAY, SOUTH BAY, PENINSULA, EAST BAY, AND EVERYWHERE IN  
8 BETWEEN. AND THAT WE ALSO AS COUNCIL MEMBERS HAVE  
9 OPPORTUNITIES TO ENGAGE WITH ELECTED LEADERS ON MTC AND ABAG  
10 OUTSIDE OF THESE MEETINGS. BECAUSE I BELIEVE THAT THAT IS ALSO  
11 EQUALLY AS IMPORTANT. SO, THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, PAMELA. NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE  
14 ROMA DAWSON, FOLLOWED BY WENDI KALLINS. ROMA GO AHEAD.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I'M ROMA DAWSON, COPRESIDENT OF THE LEAGUE OF WOMEN  
17 VOTERS BAY AREA. UNFORTUNATELY WE DIDN'T REALIZE THIS WAS ON  
18 THE AGENDA TODAY OR WE WOULD HAVE PREPARED A LETTER. HOWEVER,  
19 I WOULD VERY MUCH LIKE TO OFFER SOME PERSONAL COMMENTS. I HAVE  
20 HAD THE PRIVILEGE OF WORKING FOR A NUMBER OF ELECTED OFFICIALS  
21 BASED HERE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, GOING ALL THE WAY BACK TO  
22 THE 1980s. ONE, A FORMER PRESIDENT OF ABAG IN THE MID-1990S,  
23 AND SEVERAL MEMBERS OF MTC. SO I JUST WANT TO PICK UP ON  
24 SOMETHING THAT STAFF COMMENTED ON, I BELIEVE IT WAS KAI, THAT  
25 COMMENTED THAT THE SPACE CHANGES WHEN AN ELECTED OFFICIAL IS



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PRESENT, PARTICULARLY IF THAT ELECTED OFFICIAL HAS A POWERFUL  
2 ROLE. SO I JUST WANT TO ADD MY THOUGHTS AS SOMEONE WHO WAS A  
3 POLICY AID FOR MANY YEARS, THAT I WOULD LIKE TO SUPPORT  
4 STAFF'S COMMENTS THAT THE SPACE CHANGES DRAMATICALLY, AND WHEN  
5 YOU ARE WORKING ON THIS ISSUE, I HOPE YOU WILL TAKE THAT INTO  
6 CONSIDERATION. AND NOW JUST TO QUICKLY GO BACK AND PUT ON MY  
7 LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTER'S HAT, I DO WANT TO SAY THAT LEAGUE OF  
8 WOMEN VOTERS VERY MUCH WANT TO WORK WITH THIS BODY, WITH MTC  
9 AND ABAG, IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING THIS JOINT COMMITTEE AS IT  
10 MOVES FORWARD. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM STAFF ON  
11 THAT. AND, AGAIN, TO CHAIR SPERING, I WANT TO THANK YOU SO  
12 MUCH FOR YOUR TIRELESS HOURS. I ACTUALLY THOUGHT I WAS TUNING  
13 IN TO FOLLOW UP ON THE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION BOND MEASURE.  
14 BUT I'M GOING TO TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
15 HEROIC EFFORTS IN THAT REGARD. THANK YOU.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS WENDI KALLINS,  
20 FOLLOWED BY GREG GREENWAY. WENDI, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
21 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

22

23 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. HI. WENDI KALLINS, A MEMBER OF THE  
24 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO  
25 COMMENT AND I ALSO LOOK FORWARD TO HAVING THIS BROUGHT TO OUR



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 COMMITTEE FOR DISCUSSION. I HAVE A COUPLE OF CONCERNS. WORN IS  
2 THAT OUR MEETINGS ARE USUALLY PACKED WITH AGENDA ITEMS. WE  
3 RARELY ARE ABLE TO GET OUT AT THE END OF THE MEETING, MUCH THE  
4 SAME AS YOUR MEETING P SO I'M CONCERNED IF WE START HAVING TO  
5 TALK ABOUT BOTH ABAG AND MTC, HOW ARE WE GOING TO DECIDE WHAT  
6 IS THE PRIORITIES, AND, YOU KNOW, IS HOUSING GOING TO GET A  
7 SHORT SHRIFT? IS TRANSIT GOING TO GET A SHORT SHRIFT? I THINK  
8 THESE ARE THINGS THAT NEED TO BE THOUGHT THROUGH AS WE COMBINE  
9 THE COMMITTEE. AND THE OTHER THING THAT HAS BEEN A CONCERN OF  
10 OUR COMMITTEE FOR A LONG TIME IS HOW CAN WE COMMUNICATE WITH  
11 THE ELECTED OFFICIALS ABOUT WHAT OUR ADVISORY IS. IT GOES TO  
12 THE STAFF, AND THE STAFF HAS BEEN GREAT ABOUT LISTENING AND  
13 ABSORBING THE INFORMATION THAT WE GIVE THEM. BUT, I THINK IT  
14 WOULD REALLY BE ADVANTAGEOUS TO HAVE MORE OPPORTUNITIES TO BE  
15 ABLE TO COMMUNICATE BETWEEN THESE COMMITTEES OR IF IT'S ONE  
16 COMMITTEE, AND THE ACTUAL ELECTED OFFICIALS TO MAKE THE  
17 DECISION. SO, THESE ARE A COUPLE OF THE THINGS THAT I THINK  
18 NEED TO BE CONSIDERED. THANK YOU.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OUR LAST SPEAKER IS GOING TO BE GREG  
23 GREENWAY. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. I'M GREG GREENWAY WITH  
2 SEAPORT INDUSTRIAL ASSOCIATION. WHICH IS AN ORGANIZE OF  
3 INDUSTRIAL BUSINESSES AT THE PORT OF REDWOOD CITY AS WELL AS  
4 THE PORT OF REDWOOD ITSELF. SPEAKING ABOUT ITEM 8A, THE  
5 COMMUNITY OUTREACH FOR PLANNED BAY AREA.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS IS ACTUALLY -- 8B.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SORRY, YEAH, EIGHT -- SORRY. 8A, I THINK IT IS JUST  
10 THE REPORT ON THE COMMUNITY OUTREACH EFFORTS OVER THE SUMMER.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** MAKE IT BRIEF, BECAUSE WE HAVE  
13 ALREADY COVERED THAT ITEM.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. I'M SORRY. I DIDN'T KNOW THAT I WAS SUPPOSED TO  
16 SPEAK AT THAT TIME. SO, WE SUBMITTED COMMENTS THAT AREN'T  
17 INCLUDED IN THE REPORT. SO, I'LL MAKE SURE I SEND THEM TO  
18 STAFF. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THOSE ARE IN THE RECORD. WE SPOKE  
19 AT THE MEETING OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL ON  
20 JULY 22ND. OUR REQUEST IS TO CONSIDER THE REDWOOD FERRY  
21 SERVICE AS UNCONSTRAINED PROJECT AS OTHER DESERT REQUEST. AND  
22 SO I'M URGING YOU ON THE COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT FLOOR, FOR  
23 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT, TO REACH OUT TO THE PORT OF REDWOOD CITY  
24 TO TALK ABOUT THAT PROJECT, BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T SEEN HOW STAFF  
25 IS CONSIDERING IT OR RECEIVED ANY FEEDBACK. THANK YOU.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IS THAT OUR LAST SPEAKER?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SOMEONE ELSE JUST RAISED THEIR HAND. WOULD  
5 YOU LIKE TO -- YES? THE NEXT SPEAKER IS 350 SAN FRANCISCO.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IS THIS -- IS THIS THE LAST SPEAKER?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE CAN CLOSE COMMENT IF WE ANNOUNCE IT.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** DO YOU HAVE OTHER HANDS RAISED?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. THIS IS THE LAST SPEAKER.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** IF THEY DON'T RAISE THEIR HAND --

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IF THEY DON'T RAISE THEIR HAND NOW, THEN  
18 WE'RE CLOSED OUT?

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THAT'S CORRECT. YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. 350, SAN FRANCISCO.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M SORRY TO WEAR YOUR PATIENCE BY CLICKING IN  
25 LATE. MY NAME IS SARA GREENWALD, I'M WITH 350 BAY AREA.



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 PERSONALLY, I DEPEND ON BART, CALTRAIN, AND MUNI --  
2 ALPHABETICAL ORDER, WITH FRIENDS AND FAMILY WHO ALSO DEPEND ON  
3 TRANSIT BECAUSE THEY DON'T HAVE THE OPTION TO DRIVE, OR THE  
4 MONEY FOR TAXI. 350 BAY AREA'S CONCERN IS THAT WE HAVE ONLY A  
5 FEW YEARS TO MOVE FAST TO GET OUT OF CLIMATE CRISIS PUBLIC  
6 TRANSPORTATION IS ONE OF THE MOST HOPEFUL WE HAVE ELECTIONS  
7 HAVE SHOWN OUR REGION UNDERSTANDS. THIS OUR REGION ALSO KNOWS  
8 THAT THE ELECTION --

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** EXCUSE ME, ARE YOU SPEAKING ON ITEM  
11 8B?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I THOUGHT PUBLIC COMMENT. YES?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. GO AHEAD AND FINISH. BECAUSE  
16 I'M GOING TO PUBLIC COMMENT AS SOON AS YOU FINISH. AND SO YOU  
17 WILL BE DONE WITH IT. GO AHEAD.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. YEAH, SO, I WAS TALKING ABOUT THE ELECTIONS.  
20 AND OUR REGION KNOWS THE ELECTIONS SHOWS FEDERAL FUNDING MAY  
21 WITHER UP. AND THE VOTERS WANT TO SEE OUR REGION WITH FUNDING  
22 TO MAINTAIN AND IMPROVE SERVICE WITH FREQUENT WELL  
23 COORDINATED, AFFORDABLE SERVICE FOR AS MUCH OF THE REGION AS  
24 POSSIBLE. THEY KNOW, THE WAY THE VOTE GOES, THEY KNOW THAT



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 TRANSIT IS ONE OF OUR BEST CLIMATE HOPES. SO, IT'S UP TO US TO  
2 SAVE THIS HOPE. AND THAT'S WHAT'S UP TO YOU. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FOR AGENDA ITEM 3B WE DID RECEIVE  
7 CORRESPONDENCE FROM PRADEEP GUPTA, AND IT WAS POSTED ONLINE  
8 AND DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. PUBLIC COMMENTS. ALETA  
11 DUPREE AND THEN ADINA LEVIN.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, CHAIR JIM SPERING AND  
14 MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM  
15 FOLDS. I'M A LITTLE TIRED BUT I MADE IT IN-PERSON. I'M GOING  
16 TO SPEAK ABOUT PLANNING. WHY IS PLANNING IMPORTANT? I CAN'T  
17 CALL MYSELF AN EXPERT ON PLANNING. I DORM MEETING OF A NUMBER  
18 OF PLANS, GRANT PLANS, FROM THE REGIONAL PLANNING -- I THINK  
19 IT'S CALLED THE REGIONAL PLANNING ASSOCIATION OF NEW YORK. AND  
20 I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK YOU DO WITH PLANNING. BECAUSE WHAT  
21 PLANNING DOES IS IT HELPS ME WHEN I DON'T HAVE A PLAN. I FOUND  
22 MYSELF ON MARKET AND POWELL, AND I WAS GOING TO GO DOWNSTAIRS,  
23 AND TAKE BART FOR TWO STOPS, TO EMBARCADERO. BUT I SAW A MUNI  
24 F, HISTORIC STREETCAR, L IT CHANGED MY PLAN, GOT ON IT AND IT  
25 GOT ME OVER HERE A LITTLE QUICKER. BECAUSE I HAVE ISSUES, AND



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 SOMETIMES IT'S HARD FOR ME TO PLAN. I WOKE UP WEDNESDAY  
2 MORNING, AND I TOLD MY ROOMMATE, I SAID, YOU KNOW, I'M GOING  
3 TO GET ON A PLANE TO OAKLAND. I DIDN'T REALLY PLAN IT. BUT I  
4 THOUGHT ABOUT IT. BUT PLANNING IS ABOUT THINGS THAT ARE GOING  
5 TO BE HERE FOR ME, LIKE MUNI, BART, CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS, ET  
6 CETERA. BECAUSE I NEVER KNOW WHAT A DAY WILL BRING FORTH. AND,  
7 SO, PART OF WHAT I DO IS NOT JUST SHARE, PERHAPS, ABOUT  
8 TECHNICAL ASPECTS, AND ACADEMIC EXPOSITIONS BUT MORE SO I CAN  
9 ONLY RELATE TO MY EXPERIENCES AND I CAN DESCRIBE THEM TO YOU  
10 THROUGH MY MANY SERMONS AND LETTERS BECAUSE YOU'RE OFTEN NOT  
11 THERE TO SEE THEM. IT'S HARD FOR ME TO PLAN SOMETIMES, BUT  
12 THANKS FOR HELPING BY DOING IT FOR ME. APPRECIATE IT.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALETA. ADINA THIS IS OUR  
15 LAST SPEAKER.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO THE CHAIR FOR ALLOWING ME  
18 TO SPEAK FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING WHEN I WAS ON ZOOM. ADINA  
19 LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA, WANTED TO EXPRESS THANKS TO  
20 STAFF FOR ALL THE OUTREACH ON PLANNED BAY AREA AND TRANSIT  
21 2050+, AND WANTED TO SHARE THAT SEAMLESS BAY AREA WORKS WITH  
22 MANY PARTNERS TO DO SOME OUTREACH THAT WAS COMPLEMENTARY TO  
23 OUTREACH THAT MTC DID, ASKED SOME QUESTIONS AND PROVIDED  
24 MATERIALS AT A HIGH-LEVEL, BUT IT DIDN'T GIVE THE INFORMATION  
25 IN A WAY THAT PEOPLE COULD REALLY ZOOM IN AND DRILL DOWN ABOUT





NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1    WHATEVER BEING PROPOSED FOR THEIR AREA WHERE THEY LIVE. SO  
2    WHAT WE DID WAS TOOK MTC'S MATERIAL AND ZOOMED IT OUT AND  
3    ALLOWED PEOPLE TO LOOK AT THOSE PARTS OF THE MAP AND LISTED  
4    PROJECTS ORGANIZED SO THAT SOMEONE CAN SEE HOW DOES THIS  
5    AFFECT ME. WE REACHED ABOUT 240 PEOPLE. WE HELD SIX WORKSHOPS  
6    TWO, IN ZOOM, THE REST IN-PERSON. SEVERAL OF THEM WERE UNTIL  
7    ENGLISH AND SPANISH, AND ONE SIGNIFICANT SET OF PEOPLE WHO  
8    SPEAK KHMER AND IMMIGRANTS AND REFUGEES IN SEVEN OF THE NINE  
9    AREAS, AND WHAT PEOPLE SHARED AND PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON TRANSIT  
10   SUPPORT, REALLY WANT THE ENHANCED LOCAL SERVICE FROM TRANSIT  
11   2050+ FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY AND IMPROVED CONNECTIONS TO  
12   HELP PEOPLE HAVE FASTER TRAIL OF TRAVEL TIMES AND MAKE THOSE  
13   FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECTIONS. THE MISSING LINKS THAT WERE  
14   IDENTIFIED IN THE TRANSIT 2050+ AND INTEGRATED AFFORDABLE  
15   FARES, PEOPLE DIDN'T KNOW BUT TALKED TO IN ADVANCE ABOUT THE  
16   FREE TRANSFERS THEY WERE ABOUT TO GET AND THE FARE CAPPING,  
17   ALTHOUGH THEY DIDN'T USE THAT TERM, AS WELL AS CLEANLINESS,  
18   BUS STOP IMPROVEMENTS FOR SAFETY AND RELIABILITY. SO, THE  
19   POPULATION WANTS NOT ONLY TO SOLVE THE FISCAL CLIFF AND KEEP  
20   THINGS FROM GETTING WORSE, BUT TO GET THINGS BETTER WHICH I  
21   THINK SHOULD BE HELPFUL FOR OUR NEXT TOPIC TODAY.

22

23   **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM  
24   TEN. I'LL HAND IT BACK OVER TO PRESIDENT RAMOS.

25



NOVEMBER 8, 2024

1 **BELIA RAMOS:** AT THIS TIME WE'LL BE ADJOURNING OUR MEETING. THE  
2 NEXT MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD  
3 ON DECEMBER 13TH, AT 9:40 A.M. AT BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375  
4 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL  
5 BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THE PLANNING COMMITTEE WE WILL MEET  
8 FRIDAY DECEMBER 13TH AT 9:40 WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS  
9 ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

10



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*